

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to extend my sincere thanks and appreciation to some special people who contributed to the successful completion of this dissertation.

My husband, Paulus and two kids, Carmen and Henri-John who continuously pray for me. I will not forget your loving support and patience in me using family time to complete this.

My mother, Eva Fisher-Maytham, brothers and sisters for support and faith in me for being able to complete this project.

My colleagues and friends for valuable inputs.

Prof. Cilliers for professional guidance and making available his expertise, but more importantly, enthusiastically talking about “us” and “we” really made the lonesome journey bearable.

Mrs. Burger at UNISA library for information on available sources.

Last, but not least, our Heavenly Father whose grace is sufficient for me.

Title of dissertation: The Application of Restorative Justice in the South African  
Correctional System

By: M F Plaatjies

Degree: Master of Arts

Subject: Criminology

Promotor: Prof C Cilliers

### **Summary**

This dissertation is the culmination of extensive literature study on the application of Restorative Justice in the South African Correctional System. International and national resources on the application of Restorative Justice both in Corrections and as pre-sentence option had been studied.

The background of the penal system and the development of Restorative Justice as part of the Criminal Justice System are investigated by looking at ancient practices, indigenous and modern practices. The study intends to draw on experience from other countries, while at the same time advocate for the development of a uniquely South African model or practice.

The role of the most important stakeholders, namely victim, offender and community is emphasized with reference to the challenges that offenders face in terms of reintegration and the lack of resources in communities to enable them to honour Restorative Justice agreements.

**Key terms:** Restorative Justice; Background of Restorative Justice in Corrections; addressing the harm; restoration; paradigm shift; Victim Empowerment; Overcrowding; International trends; Elevated role of different stakeholders; White Paper on Corrections 2005

# THE APPLICATION OF RESTORATIVE JUSTICE IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CORRECTIONAL SYSTEM

## Table of Contents

### Chapter 1 General orientation

1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Choice of subject matter	3
1.2.1	Necessity and desirability of the research	4
1.2.2	Availability of data	4
1.2.3	Interest of the researcher	5
1.3	Aims of the research	6
1.4	Rationale for the research	7
1.5	Methodology: Literature review	9
1.6	Demarcation of the study	9
1.7	Relevance of the study to Department of Correctional Services and South Africa in general	10
1.8	Definition of concepts	11
1.8.1	Restorative Justice	11
1.8.2	Retributive Justice	12
1.8.3	Crime	12
1.8.4	Justice cluster	13
1.8.5	Department of Correctional Services (DCS)	13

1.8.6	Prison / Correctional centre	14
1.8.7	Prisoner / Offender	14
1.8.8	Primary victims	15
1.8.9	Secondary victims	15
1.8.10	Victim empowerment	16
1.8.11	Victim Offender Mediation (VOM) or reconciliation	16
1.8.12	Parole	17
1.8.13	Correctional Supervision and Parole board	17
1.8.14	National Crime Prevention Strategy (NCPS)	18
1.8.15	Structure of the dissertation	18

## **Chapter 2    Background and Explanation of Restorative Justice**

2.1	Introduction	21
2.2	Imprisonment in South Africa: A Paradigm shift in Corrections	25
2.3	Inception of prisons	26
2.4	Relevant Acts, Legislation and Bills bringing about Transformation of Correctional Services	27
2.5	Prison Reforms	29
2.6	Constitution of South Africa (Act 108 of 1996)	30
2.7	Overcrowding, poor prison conditions and Restorative Justice	33
2.8	The National Crime Prevention Strategy (NCPS)	39
2.9	Biblical Background of Restorative Justice and Punishment	46

2.10	The Historical Development of victim compensation	48
2.10.1	Code of Hammurabi, around 1700 BC	50
2.10.2	Mosaic Law	51
2.10.3	Roman Law	52
2.10.4	Compensation/Restitution to the victim during the 19 <sup>th</sup> century	54
2.10.5	Compensation to victims during the 20 <sup>th</sup> century	54
2.11	The Historical and Philosophical development of different models of punishment	55
2.11.1	The medical model	56
2.11.2	The adjustment model	57
2.11.3	The Reintegration model	57
2.11.4	The Justice model	59
2.11.5	The neo-utilitarian model	60
2.12	Purposes of Punishment	62
2.12.1	Deterrence as purpose of punishment	63
2.12.2	Rehabilitation as purpose of punishment	64
2.12.3	Incapacitation as purpose of punishment	66
2.13	Restorative Justice and Corrections	67
2.14	The philosophy of Restorative Justice	68
2.15	The values of Restorative Justice	70
2.15.1	Encounter	71
2.15.2	Amends	76
2.15.3	Reintegration	79

2.15.4	Inclusion	80
2.16	Fundamental Principles of Restorative Justice	82
2.17	Differences between Restorative Justice and Retributive Justice	88
2.18	Signposts of Restorative Justice	98
2.19	Programmes usually associated with Restorative Justice	101
2.19.1	Victim Offender Reconciliation Program (VORP) & Victim Offender Mediation	101
2.19.2	Family Group Conferencing	103
2.19.3	Victim offender panels	103
2.19.4	Diversion	104
2.19.5	Community service	104
2.19.6	Restitution	105
2.19.7	Compensation	105
2.19.8	Support circles	106
2.20	Current Initiatives in South Africa on Restorative Justice influencing Corrections	106
2.21	The relationship between Moral regeneration, Restorative Justice and Corrections	112
2.22	Summary	117

### **Chapter 3 International trends: Restorative Justice in other countries**

3.1	Introduction	120
3.2	Background Information of the Criminal Justice System	124
3.3	Families of law	126
3.3.1	Civil law	126
3.3.2	Common law	126
3.3.3	Socialist law	127
3.4	NEW ZEALAND: Criminal Justice System	127
3.4.1	Political system	127
3.4.2	Legal system	128
3.4.3	History of Criminal Justice System in New Zealand	128
3.4.4	Objectives of the Criminal Justice System	128
3.4.5	Age of criminal responsibility	129
3.4.6	Prison system in New Zealand	129
3.4.7	Staff – offender ratio	130
3.4.8	Training of warders	130
3.4.9	Background Information on Restorative Justice in New Zealand	130
3.4.10	Education in New Zealand Corrections	131
3.4.11	Family Group Conferencing	133
3.4.12	Revised policy	133
3.4.13	Outcomes of the Act	134
3.5	CANADA	139

3.5.1	The Criminal Justice System in Canada	139
3.5.2	Legal system	139
3.5.3	History of Criminal Justice System in Canada	140
3.5.4	Age of responsibility	140
3.5.5	Prison system in Canada	140
3.5.6	Staff – Offender ratio	141
3.5.7	Training of warders	141
3.5.8	Mission statement of Correctional Services Canada	141
3.5.9	Background Information on Restorative Justice in Canada	142
3.5.10	Community conferences	142
3.5.11	Circles of Support and Accountability	143
3.5.12	Restorative Justice Coalition	143
3.5.13	Healing Lodges for Aboriginal offenders	144
3.5.14	Legal framework in Canada	145
3.6	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	146
3.6.1	Background of the Criminal Justice system of the United States of America	146
3.6.2	Restorative Justice in the United States of America	147
3.6.3	Prisons/Jails in the United States of America	150
3.7	BELGIUM	150
3.7.1	Restorative Justice in Belgium prisons	151
3.7.2	Purpose of the Restorative Detention project	152
3.7.3	Community Involvement	154



3.7.4	Prison conditions	154
3.8	SOUTH AFRICA	155
3.8.1	South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC)	157
3.8.2	South African Criminal Justice System	158
3.8.3	History of the South African Criminal Justice System	159
3.8.4	Age of criminal responsibility	159
3.8.5	Prisons/Corrections	160
3.8.6	Parole	160
3.9	How the Child Justice Bill 49 of 2002 relates to Restorative Justice in SA Corrections	161
3.10	Summary	165

## **Chapter 4 Restorative Justice in South African Corrections**

4.1	Introduction	168
4.2	Departmental Vision, Aim and Mission	171
4.3	Directorate: Correctional Programmes	173
4.3.1	Restorative Justice Expectations	175
4.3.2	The Draft Policy on Correctional Programmes	176
4.3.2.1	Policy Statement	177
4.3.2.2	Policy Objectives	178
4.4	The Role of Restorative Justice in the DCS	179

4.5	Achievements under the Branch Development and Care	179
4.6	Challenges in the Implementation of Restorative Justice	181
4.7	Current situation in South African Corrections:	
	Composition of the offender population	182
4.7.1	Juveniles in correctional centres	183
4.7.2	Age categories: Awaiting Trial Detainees (ATD's)	185
4.7.3	Age categories: Sentenced offenders & ATD's	187
4.8	Overcrowding in correctional centres	188
4.9	Possible solutions for overcrowding	191
4.10	Re-offending	194
4.11	Alternatives to Imprisonment	195
4.12	Rehabilitation Programmes available in correctional centres	196
4.12.1	Directorate: Social work services	197
4.12.2	Directorate: Psychological services	198
4.12.3	Directorate: Spiritual Care	199
4.12.4	Directorate: Education	201
4.13	External Partnerships: Societal Responsibility	203
4.14	Restorative Justice and Forgiveness	205
4.15	Restorative Justice programmes rendered internally by DCS	207
4.16	How the principles of Restorative Justice	
	could work in a correctional centre repairing the harm of crime	207
4.17	General content of Restorative Justice programmes	209
4.18	Training of Restorative Justice presenters/facilitators	210

4.19	Challenges experienced by staff in correctional centres	211
4.20	Restorative Justice in Private prisons in South Africa	212
4.21	South African Constitution (Act 108 of 1996)	213
4.22	Correctional Services Act (Act 111 of 1998)	214
4.23	White Paper on Corrections 2005	216
4.24	Judicial Inspectorate	220
4.25	Remission and Restorative Justice	221
4.26	Restorative Justice and Reintegration	222
4.27	The Sentenced offender as important Role player in Restorative Justice	224
4.28	Summary	226

## **Chapter 5 Victim Empowerment in the South African Public Service**

5.1	Introduction	229
5.2	Rights of victims	231
5.3	Victim compensation	232
5.4	Victim Empowerment programme in the South African Public Service	233
5.5	Victim Empowerment in the Department of Social Development	234
5.6	Victim Empowerment in the Department of Correctional Services	236
5.6.1	Victim Empowerment inside correctional centres	237

5.6.2	New parole policy: Correctional Supervision and Parole Boards	239
5.6.3	Service Charter for Victims of Crime in South Africa	241
5.7	Victim Empowerment in the South African Police Service	244
5.8	Resources/Services	246
5.8.1	Victim Friendly Facilities	246
5.8.2	Trauma Rooms	247
5.8.3	Community Based Victim Support centre	248
5.9	Summary	250

## **Chapter 6 Conclusions and Recommendations**

6.1	Introduction	252
6.2	Discussion	254
6.2.1	Restorative Justice as part of Correctional Programmes	254
6.2.2	Victim Offender Mediation	255
6.2.3	Involvement of communities	258
6.3	Possible challenges in the application of Restorative Justice in the SA Correctional system	259
6.4	Limitations	260
6.5	Recommendations	260
6.5.1	Recommendation 1: Restorative discipline as a way of dealing with offenses and violations in the correctional centres	261

6.5.2	Recommendation 2: Special selection and training of independent Restorative Justice practitioners	262
6.5.3	Recommendation 3: Restorative Justice in all Correctional programmes	265
6.5.4	Recommendation 4: Expanding of scope of the Restorative Justice Component	266
6.5.5	Recommendation 5: Enhance the Victim Empowerment Function/component	267
6.6	Recommendation for New research	268
6.7	Concluding Remarks	268

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## LIST OF TABLES

1.	Daily averages of sentenced offenders and Awaiting Trial Detainees between 1984 and 1994	36
2.	Imprisonment rates for the 10 years between and including 1995-2003/4	38
3.	Differences between Restorative Justice and Retributive Justice	89
4.	Organogram for Directorate: Correctional programmes	174
5.	Juveniles in Correctional Centres on 31 March 2003	183
6.	Awaiting trial detainees in Correctional Centres as at 31/3/2004	185
7.	Sentenced offenders and awaiting trial detainees in custody as at 31/3/2004	186
8.	Prison population as at 31/3/2004 including private prisons	188
9.	Sentence categories in Correctional Centres as at 31/3/2004	189