

**THE STOCK MARKET  
AND SOUTH AFRICA'S ECONOMIC  
DEVELOPMENT**

by

**ASHLEY GAVIN FRANK**

submitted in accordance with the requirements  
for the degree of

**DOCTOR COMMERCII**

in the subject

**BUSINESS MANAGEMENT**

at the

**UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA**

**PROMOTER: PROF. DR. E. BEGEMANN**

**JUNE 2004**

Just let me say how much I love you,  
let me speak of your mercy and grace.  
Just let me live in the shadow of your beauty,  
let me see you face to face.  
And the Earth will shake as your word goes forth.  
And the heavens can tremble and fall.  
But let me say how much I love you,  
O my Saviour, my Lord and Friend.

Just let me hear your finest whisper,  
as you gently call my name.  
And let me see your power and your glory,  
let me feel your Spirit's flame.  
Let me find you in the desert,  
'til this sand is holy ground.  
And I am found completely surrendered,  
to you my Lord and Friend.

So let me say how much I love you,  
with all my heart I long for you.  
For I am caught in this passion of knowing,  
this endless love I've found in you.  
And the depth of grace, the forgiveness found,  
to be called a child of God:  
Just makes me say how much I love you  
O my Saviour, my Lord and Friend.

## **Preface and Acknowledgements**

Capital market theory is currently a "hot" topic on both sides of the Atlantic with much interest (from both the academic community as well as practitioners) being focused on the channels and impact of financial intermediation on the real economy. Because of its implications for development policy, South African researchers too need to become engrossed in the relationship between financial development and economic growth, so that we can make informed choices about strengthening our financial system. Thus we need to go to the very heart of how capital should be allocated in the economy, examining the relative emphasis that should be placed on stock markets, banks and other financial intermediaries.

First however, we need to acknowledge that the fields of economics and finance are interrelated. In fact many would define finance as a sub-field of economics dealing with intertemporal and portfolio decisions. Yet there appears to be two cultures developing, with researchers in economics examining questions involving financial markets, in ways which seem, to researchers in finance, to be hopelessly misguided. Equally economists regard much finance research as doctrinaire or trivial. Even critical comment by each group of the other's work is not terribly common and parallel literatures regarding the same questions, with literally no points of contact, seem to have developed. [For instance, consider the vast unconnected literature in both finance and economics about the effects of inflation on interest rates or, see the different ways industrial organisation and financial economists treat the phenomenon of mergers and acquisitions]. Summers (1985) observes that "most researchers operating in one tradition are almost entirely ignorant of basic concepts in the rival tradition".

Neither the finance approach to financial markets nor that taken by general economists has a unique claim on virtue. Rather they complement each other, with both having the potential to increase our understanding of how the economy operates. It may therefore be lamented that researchers in economics pay so little attention to finance and that financial-economists are so reluctant to accept any research relating asset prices to fundamental values.

It is this separate development paradigm that allows eminent scholars like Jeffrey Sachs (2002) to posit that, being poorly trained in economics, the job of the financial analyst is simply to say something clever for the television cameras. He holds that analysts "do not trade on fundamental information but on the latest gossip and fads". And that in our public pronouncements we provide nonsense rather than knowledge.

Being a financial analyst myself, when I initially set out to obtain my doctorate I was immediately aware that the disjunction between economics and finance is inefficient. It is my opinion that the diversion of intellectual effort stems in large part from a lack of reading and keeping abreast of the various research methodologies available to those of us who wish to study the major questions arising at the interstices of finance and economics. I believe that we can do better and this study of causality using recently developed time series techniques is but a first step at bridging that divide. I trust that it will be received in that same spirit.

\*\*\*\*\*

There are several people to whom I owe a debt of appreciation for assisting me along my path to doctorate. First, there are those who responded efficiently to my requests for data, both primary and secondary: Leon Brummer (University of Pretoria), Anneline Dalais (BFA-McGregor) and the library staff at UNISA's Durban regional office.

Then there are those who responded positively to my initial ideas for research into this area: Mike Page (Erasmus University), Colin Firer & Haim Abrahams (University of Cape Town) and Mike Ward (Wits Business School).

Others were kind enough to discuss with me their personal experiences and views of the study at various stages of its development: Stephan Malherbe (Genesis Analytics), Shafiur Rahman (University of Oxford), Keith Yeomans &

Mike Bendixen (University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg), Chris Brooks (University of Reading) and Willem Naudè (Potchefstroom University).

There are four people to whom I wish to say a special emphatic thank you. Primary among these is my promoter Egbert Begemann (University of South Africa) who was immediately supportive of my research proposal and showed unflinching belief in my abilities to successfully complete the study (even when I doubted those abilities myself). Then, to Jurgens van Tonder (University of Pretoria) who kindly served as a *pro bono* consultant, helping me to use the econometric tests central to the data analysis presented here. Considering the constantly progressive nature of this field and the scarcity of people skilled in it, the study would not have been possible without such an unselfish contribution. I have received a great deal of encouragement and support throughout this project, as along my development in academia, from Narendra Bhana (Regent Business School). I am deeply honoured that a person of his calibre has taken to me as his own protégé. Rounding off these considerable influences is Abbot-Bishop Robert Dittler (who holds an earned doctorate himself). By guiding me through the novitiate experience whilst I read for my degree, he ensured that I gained not only knowledge but grew in wisdom as well.

Finally, I dedicate this study and the achievement of my goal of "becoming a Doctor" to my mother, Mildred. Simply being able to deliver on my promise to her means more to me than any title I can earn.

## **Summary**

Financial liberalisation, through increasing investment as well as the average productivity of capital, should stimulate economic growth, or so the theory goes. Bank lending unfortunately suffers adverse selection and moral hazard effects, to which the establishment and expansion of stock markets has been offered as a remedy. However, research from developing country stock markets have shown that in many cases these markets did not complement the effects of credit market liberalisation but in rather important aspects subverted them. Countries that implemented credit market liberalisation and raised real interest rates only increased the price of debt capital rather than all capital. This caused a share price boom in many of them. When the price of equity capital fell it seriously undermined and indeed allowed large private corporations to skip altogether the main channel of high interest rates through which the theoretical McKinnon-Shaw effects were to operate.

This study asks the research question of what effect the expansion of the South African stock exchange has had for its economic development. It makes use of a general empirical model to explain the relationship between financial development and real output. The model comprises indicators for growth, banking system development, stock market volatility; and, stock market development through a conglomerate index that accounts for market size, liquidity and integration with world capital markets. Quarterly data from 1989 to 2001 is analysed based on the null hypothesis that, as far as financial architecture is concerned, the development of the JSE Securities Exchange has stimulated the country's economic growth.

This study found a negative and statistically significant relation between stock market development and economic growth. It suggests that while the JSE Securities Exchange is a relatively large stock market it is the presence of thin trading that prevents the proposed benefits of market development from accruing to the economy. Thus the hypothesis is rejected. However, since the only stable

cointegrating vector is between growth and banking sector development, it recommends that by expanding their universal banking functions, the present banking structure, though oligopolistic, may be better suited to act as a catalyst for growth.

**Key terms:**

Financial liberalisation; De-repression; McKinnon-Shaw thesis; Savings; Real interest rates; Johansen cointegration; Granger causality; Financial intermediaries; Market failure; Liquidity; Group-banking; Cost of capital.

## Contents

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
List of Tables	xii
Table of Figures	xiv
Chapter 1	Overview
1.1	Introduction
1.2	Importance of the Study
1.3	Problem Formulation
1.3.1	Sub-Problem
1.4	Research Objectives
1.5	Methodology
1.5.1	Research Design
1.5.2	Model Specification
1.5.3	Data Collection and Time Frame
1.6	Data Analysis
1.7	Plan of the Report
Chapter 2	Repression and Liberalisation
2.1	Introduction
2.2	The Classical Monetary Growth Models
2.2.1	Tobin's Monetary Growth Model
2.2.2	Restriction and Repression
2.2.3	McKinnon-Shaw Development Models
2.2.4	Dualism: A Danger for Developing Countries
2.3	Steady State Models of Repression
2.3.1	Working Capital as a Constraint
2.3.2	The Case of Fully Utilised Fixed Capital
2.3.3	Repression and Average Investment Efficiency
2.3.4	Empirical Insights
2.4	Extensions to the McKinnon and Shaw Models
2.4.1	Dynamic Extensions

2.4.2	Open Economy Extensions	89
2.5	Effects on Saving, Investment and Growth	99
2.5.1	Saving Rates	101
2.5.2	Investment (Quantity and Quality)	106
2.5.3	The Rate of Economic Growth	109
2.6	Institutions, Instruments and Markets	113
2.6.1	Financial Intermediation	113
2.6.2	Measuring Efficiency	116
2.6.3	Financial Sector Development	120
2.6.4	Underdeveloped Primary Markets	123
2.7	New Generation Growth Models	126
2.7.1	The Diamond-Dybvig Model	127
2.7.2	Information for Investment	129
2.7.3	The Stiglitz Controversy	132
2.7.4	Liberalisation: More Recent Empirical Evidence	134
2.8	Summary	143
Chapter 3	Intermediation and Stock Markets	
3.1	Introduction	145
3.2	Why Liberalisation needs Stock Markets	145
3.2.1	Capital Allocation under Uncertainty	147
3.2.2	Equity Capital and Allocative Efficiency	153
3.3	Intermediation and Development	155
3.3.1	Modelling Intermediation and Productivity	157
3.3.2	Economic Activity and Financial Development	167
3.3.3	Economic Activity and Intermediation	173
3.3.4	The Role of Public Policy	180
3.4	Stock Markets and Resource Allocation	180
3.4.1	Traditional Analyses	190
3.4.2	The Checking Role of Stock Markets	193
3.4.3	Why Commercial Banks Aren't Enough	203
3.4.4	The Role of Government	205
3.5	Equity Investment in Developing Countries	207

3.5.1	Amounts and Motivations	209
3.5.2	Why Investors Should Invest in Emerging Markets	211
3.5.3	Do Developing Countries need Stock Markets?	216
3.5.4	Barriers and Volatility in Developing Markets	220
3.6	Markets and Economic Growth	223
3.6.1	Stock Markets and Economic Development	225
3.6.2	Developing Markets and Markets in Development	233
3.6.3	Developing Markets and Long-Run Growth	235
3.6.4	Developing Markets and Corporate Capital Structure	236
3.7	The Counter-Thesis Explored	239
3.7.1	Developing Markets and Portfolio Capital Flows	241
3.7.2	Funding Firm Growth	245
3.7.3	Important Macroeconomic Issues for Developing Countries	252
3.8	Summary	262
Chapter 4	Methodology	
4.1	Introduction	267
4.2	The Supporting Theoretical Base	270
4.3	Model Specification	274
4.3.1	An Index of Stock Market Development	278
4.4	Empirical Framework	284
4.4.1	Approach for Causality Testing	289
4.5	General Limitations of Causality Testing	293
4.6	Summary	296
Chapter 5	Results and Analysis	
5.1	Introduction	298
5.2	The Arguments Thus Far	298
5.3	Descriptive Statistics	304
5.4	Inferential Statistics	310
5.5	Discussion	319
5.6	Summary	321

Chapter 6	Conclusions and Recommendations	
6.1	Introduction	324
6.2	Repression and Liberalisation	325
6.3	Intermediation and Stock Markets	328
6.4	Methodology	332
6.5	Results and Discussion	333
6.6	Recommendations	336
6.7	Implications for Further Research	343
	References	345
	Candidate Profile	402
	Preface and Acknowledgements	iii
	Summary	vi

## List of Tables

<u>Table</u>	<u>Page</u>
Chapter 1	
1.1            The 1965 Korean Financial Reform	5
Chapter 2	
2.1            Kapur's Model in the Steady State	47
2.2            Mathieson's Model in the Steady State	53
2.3            Galbis' Steady State Development Model	59
2.4            Fry's Steady State Development Model	75
2.5            Economic Growth and Interest Rates in 22 Developing Countries, 1971-1980	110
2.6            A System of Financial Distortions	139
Chapter 3	
3.1            Financial Development and Real GDP in 1970	168
3.2            Financial Development and Real GDP in 1985	170
3.3            Financial Development and Contemporaneous GDP Growth, 1960-1989	174
3.4            Initial Financial Development and subsequent <i>per capita</i> GDP Growth, 1970-1989	177
3.5            London Stock Exchange – Securities Quoted, 1853-1913	181
3.6            New York Stock Exchange – All Listed Stocks as at December 1949	182
3.7            Number of firms covered by analysts by country	187
3.8            Portfolio Flows to Developing Countries, 1989-1993	210
3.9            Changes in Stock Market Variables following Capital Market Liberalisation in 14 Countries in the 1980s	234
3.10          Annual Average Capital Flows to Developing Countries	242
Chapter 4	
4.1            Market Capitalisations for selected African Stock Markets	268
4.2            Selected Emerging Market Development Indicators	279

Chapter 5		
5.1	Structure Indices for South Africa	307
5.2	Financial Development Indices for South Africa	308
5.3	Selection of the Order of the VAR: Economic Growth	314
5.4	The Johansen Test for the Number of Cointegrating Relationships: Economic Growth	315
5.5	Tests applied to the ECM equation	316
5.6	Granger Causality Test Probabilities	316

## Table of Figures

<u>Figure</u>		<u>Page</u>
Chapter 2		
2.1	Harrod-Domar Growth in a Nonmonetary Economy	25
2.2	Harrod-Domar Growth in a Monetary Economy	26
2.3	Growth in Tobin's Portfolio Allocation Monetary Economy	28
2.4	Saving and Investment under Interest Rate Ceilings	33
2.5	Choice of Technique with and without Borrowing Possibilities	41
2.6	Market Borrowing/Lending Line with Identical Individuals	42
2.7	Life-Cycle Patterns of Income, Consumption and Saving	62
2.8	Short and Long Run Phillips Curves in the Three Financial Development Models	89
2.9	Effects of Financial Intermediation on Borrowing and Lending	115
2.10	Annual Growth and Real Interest Rates, 1971-1995	138
2.11	Effects of Real Interest Rates on National Savings Ratios	141
Chapter 3		
3.1	Expected Return of the Bank	152
3.2	Accumulation and Economic Development in the Solow model	160
3.3	Accumulation and Development in the Comprehensive Model	165
3.4	Financial Size and Real <i>Per Capita</i> Income, 1970	169
3.5	Financial Size and Real <i>Per Capita</i> Income, 1985	171
3.6	Average Financial Size and Growth, 1960-1989	175
3.7	Initial Financial Size and Subsequent <i>Per Capita</i> Growth	176
3.8	Net Financing of Private Physical Investment by Enterprises in France, Germany, Japan, the UK and US, 1970-1985	183
3.9	Percentage of Total Business Funds Raised through Securities And Bank Loans, 1965-1989	184
3.10	The Relationship between Value and Actions	192
3.11	Financial Structure in Low-, Middle- and High Income	

	Economies, 1990	226
3.12	Evolution of Financial Structure in Low-, Middle- and High Income Economies, 1970, 1980 and 1990	227
3.13	Average Total Firm Debt-Equity Ratios for Thirty Economies, 1980-1991	237
3.14	Median Values – Internal and External Financing of Corporate Growth	246
3.15	Gross Sources of Finance for the Corporate Sector	247
Chapter 4		
4.1	SA Capital Markets Growth of R1, 1925-1999	278
Chapter 5		
5.1	Economic Development in South Africa	304
5.2	Credit Extension Ratio	305
5.3	Stock Market Development	306
5.4	Stock Market Volatility	310
5.5	The Generating Function and its Residual	313
5.6	Growth and Credit Extension	318