# NUCLEAR NON-PROLIFERATION: THE SOUTH AFRICAN EXPERIENCE IN GLOBAL CONTEXT

by

#### RIANNE VAN VUUREN

submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

in the subject

#### INTERNATIONAL POLITICS

at the

#### UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: PROFESSOR G S LABUSCHAGNE

DECEMBER 2003

I declare that "NUCLEAR NON-PROLIFERATION: THE SOUTH AFRICAN EXPERIENCE IN GLOBAL CONTEXT" is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

R van Vuuren

Date:

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my study leader Prof Gert Labuschagne, my sincere gratitude for his guidance and patience during the time of conducting this study.

To my wife, Lizelle, for her support and assistance. To my sons Renaldo and Estefan who had to do without my attention on many occasions.

To my employer for the financial assistance and other support.

To William Potter Director of the Non-Proliferation Centre and the individuals kind enough to let me conduct interviews with them providing me with the insight to finish this study.

Dedicated to the men and women who endeavour to make the world a safer place by promoting and strengthening the non-proliferation norm.

#### ABSTRACT

# NUCLEAR NON-PROLIFERATION: THE SOUTH AFRICAN EXPERIENCE IN GLOBAL CONTEXT

The objectives of the study were to demonstrate that South Africa's decisions to develop and destroy its nuclear weapon capability were influenced by reactions to domestic security and other issues unrelated to security. South Africa obtained a nuclear weapon capacity because of an incremental approach to the nuclear weapon decision. The threat perceptions in the mind of the decision maker were also dominant factors, especially when the final decision for a nuclear deterrent was taken. The decision to destroy the nuclear weapon capacity was not primarily influenced by the growing non-proliferation norm, but by the changing security environment regionally as well as globally and possibly a realisation that a nuclear weapon capability was a significant security and financial liability for South Africa in the end.

KEY TERMS: Nuclear Non-Proliferation, Nuclear Weapons, Norms, Incentives, Disincentives, South Africa, Nuclear Weapon Programme.

### CONTENTS

#### **CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTORY ORIENTATION**

1.1	General Introduction		1
1.2	Identification and Demarcation of the Research Problem		3
1.2.1	Background to the Research Problem	3	
1.2.2	The Research Problem	9	
1.3	Objectives of the Study		9
1.4	Structure of the Study	9	
1.5	Methodology		12
1.6	Sources		13
1.7	Previous and Related Research		14
1.8	Notes		17

# CHAPTER 2 :THE STRATEGIC IMPLICATIONS OF NUCLEAR WEAPONS: THE EFFECTS ON INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS

2.1	Introduction		22
2.2	Definition of Concepts Relevant to Proliferation and	25	

# Non-Proliferation Theory

2.3	Realist Tradition		29
2.3.1	Defining the Realist Tradition	29	
2.3.2	The Role of Deterrence		32
2.3.3	Nuclear Weapons Additional Utility		35
2.3.4	Realist Views on Proliferation and Non-Proliferation Theories	37	
2.4	Rationalist Tradition		38
2.4.1	Defining the Rationalist Tradition		38
2.4.2	The Role of International Law	41	
2.4.3	International Organisations		44
2.4.4	Regimes		45
2.4.5	Interdependence and Integration		47
2.4.6	Rationalist Based Views on Proliferation and Non-Proliferation Theories	. 49	
2.5.	Revolutionary Tradition		50
2.5.1	Defining the Revolutionary Tradition	50	

2.5.2	Revolutionary Based Views on Proliferation and Non-Proliferation 52		
	Theories		
2.6.	Conclusion	53	
2.7	Notes	55	

# CHAPTER 3: THE NUCLEAR WEAPON OPTION: INCENTIVES AND DISINCENTIVES FOR NUCLEAR WEAPONS

3.1	Introduction		65
3.2	National Prerequisites for Proliferation	65	
3.2.1	The Nuclear Weapon Decision	67	
3.2.2	Incentives and Disincentives		70
3.2.2.1	International Security Incentives		70
3.2.2.2	International Security Disincentives		72
3.2.2.3	International Political Incentives		73
3.2.2.4	International Political Disincentives		74
3.2.2.5	Domestic Security Incentives and Disincentives	75	
3.2.2.6	Domestic Political Incentives		75
3.2.2.7	Domestic Political Disincentives		77

3.2.2.3	Summary		78
3.2.3	Situational Variables		79
3.3	Cases		80
3.3.1	China		82
3.3.1.1	Introduction		82
3.3.1.2	National Prerequisites for Proliferation	82	
3.3.1.3	Incentives and Disincentives		83
3.3.1.3.1	International Factors		83
3.3.1.3.2	Domestic Factors		85
3.3.1.4	Summary		85
3.3.2	India		86
3.3.2.1	Introduction		86
3.3.2.2	National Prerequisites for Proliferation	86	
3.3.2.3	Incentives and Disincentives		87
3.3.2.3.1	International Factors		87
3.3.2.3.2	Domestic Factors		89

3.3.2.4	Summary		90
3.3.3	Israel		91
3.3.3.1	Introduction		91
3.3.3.2	National Prerequisites for Proliferation	91	
3.3.3.3	Incentives and Disincentives		92
3.3.3.3.1	International Factors		92
3.3.3.3.2	Domestic Factors		93
3.3.3.4	Summary		93
3.3.4	Sweden		94
3.3.4.1	Introduction		94
3.3.4.2	National Prerequisites for Proliferation	94	
3.3.4.3	Incentives and Disincentives		95
3.3.4.3.1	International Factors		95
3.3.4.3.2	Domestic Factors		97
3.3.4.4	Summary		98
3.4	Conclusion		98

#### CHAPTER 4: THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE NON-PROLIFERATION NORM

4.1	Introduction		112
4.2	Norm Creation		113
4.3	Historic Development of the Non-Proliferation Regime	115	
4.3.1	The First Period (1945 - 1970): Foundation of the Norm		116
4.3.1.1	Deterrence as Basis for the Arms Race	116	
4.3.1.2	Early Non-Proliferation Efforts	116	
4.3.1.3	Agents for the Development of the Non-Proliferation Norm	119	
4.3.1.4	Early Arms Control Efforts		120
4.3.1.5	Creation of the NPT		122
4.3.1.6	Summary		124
4.3.2	The Second Period (1971 - 1990): Strengthening of the Norm Creation of International Compliance Measures	and	125
4.3.2.1	Growing Support for the NPT	125	
4.3.2.2	Security Assurances		125

4.3.2.3	Regional Non-Proliferation Measures	126	
4.3.2.3	Arms Limitation and Disarmament		126
4.3.2.4	Verification and Compliance	129	
4.3.2.5	Export Control	130	
4.3.2.6	Terrorism		133
4.3.2.7	Physical Protection of Nuclear Material		134
4.3.2.8	Delivery Systems		134
4.3.2.9	Summary		135
4.3.3	The Third Period (Since 1991) Consolidation of Non-Prolifera Norm and Rules, Start of New Challenges	tion	135
4.3.3.1	Changed Global Strategic Security Outlook		135
4.3.3.2	Disarmament Agreements Concluded	137	
4.3.3.3	Challenges to Nuclear Safeguards		139
4.3.3.4	Export Controls Enhanced		140
4.3.3.5	NPT Indefinitely Extended		141
4.3.3.6	Nuclear Test Bans		142

4.3.3.7	International Law and Non-Proliferation		143
4.3.3.8	Nuclear Proliferation Rollbacks		143
4.3.3.9	Development of Non-Proliferation Measures	144	
4.3.3.10	Summary		146
4.4	Conclusion		147
4.5	Notes		150

## CHAPTER 5: SOUTH AFRICA'S NUCLEAR WEAPON PROGRAMME

5.1	Introduction		161
5.2	History of the South African Nuclear Weapon Programme		164
5.2.1	Early Establishment of the South African Uranium Mining and Nuclear Industry	164	
5.2.2	Start of Nuclear Explosive Programme	165	
5.2.3	From Explosive Device to Nuclear Weapon		169
5.2.4	Termination of the Nuclear Weapon Capability	176	
5.2.5	South Africa as Active Supporter of the Non-Proliferation Norr	n	178

5.3	Factors Influencing the Creation and Termination of the South African Nuclear Weapon Capability	182	
5.3.1	National Prerequisites for Proliferation	182	
5.3.2	The Nuclear Device/Weapon Decision	183	
5.3.3	"Peaceful" Nuclear Device Incentives	184	
5.3.3.1	Summary		188
5.3.4	Strategic Need for Nuclear Weapons		188
5.3.5	Situational Variables for Nuclear Weapons		190
5.3.6	Incentives for a Nuclear Weapon Capability		193
5.3.6.1	International Security Incentives		194
5.3.6.2	Domestic Political and Security Incentives		197
5.3.7	Incentives for the Rollback of the Nuclear Weapon Capability	199	
5.4	Conclusion		202
5.6	Notes		204

### **CHAPTER 6: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION**

6.5	Notes		226
6.4	Conclusion		224
6.3	Propositions		220
6.2	Sub-Problems Studied	215	
6.1	Introduction		215