

AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE EXPERIENCES OF FEMALE VICTIMS OF  
TRAFFICKING IN ETHIOPIA

by

ASEFACH HAILESELASSIE REDA

submitted in accordance with the requirements for  
the degree of

MASTERS OF ARTS

in the subject

PSYCHOLOGY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: Dr. MAPULA MOJAPELO –BATKA

JOINT SUPERVISOR: PROF P. KRUGER

JUNE 2012

## DECLARATION

Student Number: 4400-247-5

I declare that **AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE EXPERIENCES OF FEMALE VICTIMS OF TRAFFICKING IN ETHIOPIA** is my own work, and that all sources that have been used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged through complete references.

## ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to tell the story of female victims of human trafficking from Ethiopia. It pertains to the cause of trafficking and how it affects their social and emotional wellbeing. The study is conducted in light of constructivist framework and involves in-depth interviews with five returnees whose experiences as victims are explored. This is done to get insight into the challenges faced by the wider population. Themes evident in the stories are discussed in line with relevant literature. The study shows lack of job opportunities, limited income and false promises made by brokers as the major factors drawing women into human trafficking. The findings also show that even after return, the victims experience further difficulties due to post-traumatic psychological factors. Looking at the significance of the research outcome, the gleaned information could be of value for organizations working on migration and countering human trafficking.

**Keywords:** Female, Human trafficking, Migration, Migrant workers, Psychosocial and victims of trafficking.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

I wish to thank God for giving me the strength to undertake this study. I am sincerely grateful to my supervisors Dr Mapula Mojapelo Batka and joint supervisor, Professor P. Kruger, University of South Africa (UNISA), Department of Psychology, for their continuous support and guidance throughout my study. I would also like to express my deepest gratitude to Prof. Habtamu Wondimu for his enriching support and encouragement since the initial development of my research proposal.

My sincere appreciation goes to Mr. Charles A. Kwenin and to the staff of International Organization for Migration (IOM) Counter Trafficking Unit, for their cooperation and support. My deepest appreciation goes to MoFA staff in the Community Service and Support department for providing valuable information. My deepest gratitude goes to Abebe Haile, MoLSA, Employment Service Promotion Directorate, for his cooperation and assistance.

I would also like to acknowledge Rakeb Mesele, Blen Asemrie and Yohannes Tekle for their enlightening discourse and advice during the study. I am particularly thankful to my family, friends and everyone who has made my life easier in some way, enabling me to pursue my study. A special thanks also goes to the women who participated in this study: I appreciate their willingness and openness in sharing their personal experiences and stories with me.

## **DEDICATION**

This study is dedicated to all trafficking victims.

In memory of my mother Zewditu; without her dedication I would not have been where I am today. She inspired me and taught me what it means to love and care for others.

## ACRONYMS

CCFDRE: Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

CRC: Convention on the Rights of the Child

DICAC: Development Inter Church Aid Commission

EOC: Ethiopian Orthodox Church

EWLA: Ethiopian Women Lawyers Association

FDRE: Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

FSCE: Forum for Street Children Ethiopia

GEA: Gemenaye Ethiopia Association

GTZ: Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit

HRW: Human Rights Watch

ILO: International Labor Organization

IOM: International Organization for Migration

IOM/SLM: International Organization for Migration Special Liaison Mission  
Addis Ababa

MCDP: Multi Purpose Development Program / Current name: MCD- Mission for  
Community Development /

MoFA: Ministry of Foreign Affairs

MoLSA: Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs

NGOs: Non-Governmental Organizations

PCI: Project Concern International

PEAP: Private Employment Agency Proclamation

RRAD: Refugees and Returnee Affairs Department

TIP: Trafficking In Persons

TTTM: Tsotawi Tekat Tekelakay Mahber, recently named 'Association for Women's Sanctuary and Development (AWSAD)

UN: United Nations

UAE: United Arab Emirates

UNICEF: United Nations Children's Fund

UN CE DAW: Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination  
Against Women

UN RMWF: UN International Convention on the Right of Migrant Workers and their  
Families

UNWW: United Nations Women Watch

US State Department: United States State Department

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration	ii
Abstract	iii
Acknowledgment	iv
Dedication	v
Acronyms	vi
Acronyms	vii
Table of Contents	viii
<b>CHAPTER 1: RATIONAL OF THE STUDY</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1.Statement of the Problem	1
1.2. Objective of the Study	3
1.2.1. General Objective	3
1.2.2. Specific Objectives	4
1.3. Significance of the Study	5
1.4. Limitation and Scope of the Study	6
1.5. Overview of Chapters	7
<b>CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	<b>9</b>
2.1. Definition of Terms	10
2.1.1. Human Trafficking, Definition and Overview	11
2.1.2. Distinction between Trafficking and Smuggling	15
2.2. Historical Development of Human Trafficking	16
2.3. Global Overview of Trafficking	19
2.3.1. Trafficking of Women and Children	20

2.4. Trafficking in Ethiopia	20
2.4.1. Internal Trafficking	22
2.4.2. External Trafficking	22
2.4.3. Recruitment, Transportation and Trafficking Routs	24
2.5. Causative Factors of Trafficking	25
2.5.1. Push Factors	25
2.5.2. Pull Factors	27
2.6. Consequences of Trafficking	27
2.6.1. Abuse and Exploitation	28
2.6.2. Dehumanize Women and Young Girls	28
2.6.3. Physical and Psychosocial Health	28
2.7. International and National Instruments and Efforts to Combat Trafficking	29
2.7.1. International Instruments	29
2.7.2. National Instruments	30
2.7.2.1. The Constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia	30
2.7.2.2. The Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia	31
2.7.2.3. The Private Employment Agency Proclamation, 1998	32
2.7.3. National Efforts to Combat Trafficking	34
2.8. Conclusion	37
<b>CHAPTER 3: METHOD</b>	<b>38</b>
3.1. Definition of Constructivism	38
3.2. Theory of Constructivism	39
3.3. The Core Assumption of Constructivist Epistemology	39
3.4. Conclusion	40

3.5. Methodology and Design	40
3.6. Source of Data	41
3.6.1. Interview Guide	41
3.6.2. Validation of Interview Schedule	43
3.7. Sampling	43
3.8. Data Collection	45
3.8.1. Ethical Considerations	46
3.9. Data Processing and Analysis	47
3.9.1. Data Interpretation Approach	48
3.10. Conclusion	48
<b>CHAPTER 4: RESULTS</b>	49
4.1. Case Study One	49
4.2. Case Study Two	54
4.3. Case Study Three	57
4.4. Case Study Four	60
4.5. Case Study Five	63
4.6. Categories for Analysis	66
4.6.1. Reason for Leaving	67
4.6.1.1. Plans and Expectations	67
4.6.1.2. Decision-making and the Role of Others	68
4.6.2. Recruitment and Travel Arrangement	69
4.6.2.1. Means of Contact with Brokers	69
4.6.2.2. Negotiation with Brokers	70
4.6.3. Travel, Arrival and Means of Placement	71

4.6.3.1. Travel Arrangement	71
4.6.3.2. Conditions at Arrival	72
4.6.3.3. Means of Placement	74
4.6.4. Working and Living Condition	74
4.6.4.1. Overwork and Forced to Work without Breaks	75
4.6.4.2. Withholding, Denial and Deduction of Wages	76
4.6.4.3. Restriction of Movement, Food Deprivation and Denial of Medical Treatment	77
4.6.4.4. Physical and Emotional Mistreatment and Sexual Harassment	79
4.6.5. Means of Return	81
4.6.5.1. Moments of Understanding of being Deceived	81
4.6.5.2. Ways and Means Utilized to Resolve their Problems	83
4.6.5.3. The Actual Process of Leaving the Working Place	84
4.6.6. Aftermath	86
4.6.6.1. Physical and Psychological Health	86
4.6.6.2. Responses from Family and Others	87
4.6.6.3. Dealing with Aftermath	88
4.6.6.4. Looking for Assistance	90
4.7.7. Emotional Experiences	91
4.7.7.1. Feeling of sadness, Frustration and Helplessness	92
4.7.7.2. Feeling of Loneliness and Isolation	93
4.7.7.3. Feeling of Regret and Disappointment	94
4.7.7.4. Fear of being Rejected and Stigmatized	95
4.7.7.5. Expectations on how family and the community should respond	97
4.8. Conclusion	98

<b>CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION</b>	<b>99</b>
5.1. Discussion	99
5.2. Conclusion	106
5.3. Evaluation of the Study	107
5.3.1. Contribution of the Study	107
5.3.2. Limitation of the Study	108
5.4. Recommendation	108
5.4.1. Research	108
5.4.2. Combating Trafficking and Support for Victims	109
5.5. General Conclusion	110
References	111
Appendices	118
Appendix A - General Information for Participants	118
Appendix B - Informed Consent Form	120
Appendix C – Interview Guide	121
Appendix D – Literal Transcription of Interviews	123

## **CHAPTER 1: RATIONALE OF THE STUDY**

This research is about migrant women who were trafficked from Ethiopia to Middle Eastern countries and have returned back to their homeland. It explores experiences of female victims of human trafficking who are currently residing in Addis Ababa. In this Chapter, some introductory issues will be addressed by giving a clear background and context of the study. It starts by discussing the statement of the problem, followed by the specific objectives and importance of the study. Issues are narrowed down to specific questions to be addressed in the research. Furthermore, the overall structure of this dissertation shall be discussed in this section.

### ***1.1. Statement of the Problem***

According to Central Intelligence Agency (2011), Ethiopia – with an area of approximately 1, 104,300 Sq km and a population of 90, 873, 739 inhabitants – is one of the countries known as major exporters of labor to the Middle East. According to Kebede (2002), being one of the most populated countries in Sub Saharan Africa, three-quarters of the general population of Ethiopia consists of women and children that are exposed to widespread poverty. Due to existing cultural values that are common mainly in rural Ethiopia, women have limited access to education and training opportunities. Hence, as compared to men, women have lesser access to employment opportunities. Research findings show that women and children in Ethiopia experience serious challenges that affect their survival and development as a result of socio economic, political and cultural factors (Bezabih, 2008).

According to Tekle and Belayneh (2000) women have no right to negotiate on the condition of their employment, and in cases of such negotiation, it is often done between the agent of the women and the employer. The above study further indicate that where there is a contract, it is

written in Arabic, a language which the Ethiopian migrants cannot understand a word of it. The women do not have any right to complain when conditions are breached by their employers as they are not cognizant of the terms agreed upon.

A research finding indicate that women and young girls who migrate to Lebanon, Egypt, Yemen and Saudi Arabia has also revealed that these women experienced various types of human right abuses (Agrinet, 2004). Another research finding show that a large number of Ethiopian women and children who migrate to Middle East countries to work as housemaids are victims of trafficking and are exposed to different kinds of abuse and exploitation. The most common form of abuse and exploitation faced by women and young girls working as domestic workers in the Middle East are sexual abuse, overwork, confinement, physical abuse, insult, belittlement, and withholding of salary. Moreover, their movement is restricted by the employers and illegal agents, and they are also expected to work between nine and nineteen hours a day with limited hours for rest (Belayneh, 2003).

The aim of this research is to find out the underlying factors that expose women and young girls to be trafficked and further identify the major psychosocial challenges they face during the course of trafficking. Hence, this study aims at exploring the driving factors that expose women and young girls to be victims of the trafficking. The study looks into the personal experience and the process they had undergone to achieve their expectations and related psychosocial challenges they have faced in the process. With this objective in mind, the research is set to answer the following major questions:

- What are the driving factors that expose women to be trafficked to the Middle East?
- What major social and psychological challenges do women face in the different stages of the trafficking process?

- At the country of origin/ pre-departure stage
- During transit and travel
- At the destination country
- Upon return to their home country

## ***1.2. Objective of the Study***

### ***1.2.1. General Objective.***

Few studies have been carried out to investigate cross-border trafficking in Ethiopia. Studies revealed that a large number of women who migrate to the Middle East to work as a domestic worker are victims of trafficking and face a wide range of abuses and exploitation (Agrinet, 2004; Tekle and Belyneh, 2000). On the other hand, available studies in Ethiopia focus on gathering of information to determine the extent and character of trafficking, identifying existing gaps in policy and legislation, and allowing for capacity building to combat trafficking (Endeshaw, Gebeyehu & Reta, 2006). Literature tends to focus specifically on trafficking of women for the purpose of the sex industry. Furthermore, there are studies, such as Belayneh's (2003) which focus on assessing available information and on identifying the kind of information potential migrants require for effective communication.

This particular study aims to contribute to the understanding of trafficking of women from Ethiopia to Middle Eastern countries for domestic work. The study will explore the major factors that influence this practice and the psychosocial effects that are attributed to it, as evidenced from the stories of victims who have managed to return. It is presumed that this will contribute to the understanding of the psychosocial challenges faced by trafficked women, thereby adding to body of existing research about human trafficking in Ethiopia.

### ***1.2.2. Specific Objectives.***

The specific objectives of this research include:

- Exploring the major causes of trafficking in women and young girls from Ethiopia for domestic work purposes,
- Investigating the psychosocial aftermath of trafficking on the victims, and
- Suggesting possible recommendations to be applied by government and non-governmental organizations.

The trafficking of women and children from Ethiopia, especially to countries in the Middle East, is considered as a significant problem. According to Agrinet (2004), about 84 percent of women who had migrated for employment in domestic work were trafficked and most of them do not envisage the prospect of leading a good life locally. Furthermore, International Organization for Migration/ Special Liaison Mission in Addis Ababa show that a little less than 91 percent of the hotline counseling service beneficiaries was young women from Ethiopia looking for information on working in the Middle East (IOM/SLM Addis Ababa, 2004). The above report clearly shows that the majority of migrants are female. Hence, the reason why this issue has been chosen for study is to reveal the extent of the problem of trafficked female Ethiopian migrants are facing by bringing their personal experiences to be heard.

### ***1.3. Significance of the Study***

According to IOM (2003) the trafficking of women and children has developed into one of the most disastrous features of contemporary global migration in which as many as two million people are estimated to be trafficked every year, lured by promises of well paying jobs. Many

victims, willingly, but unknowingly, accept the services offered by traffickers without realizing the full implications of future employment or the conditions under which they will work.

According to Human Right Watch (2010), Lebanese families employ an estimated of 200,000 migrant domestic workers primarily from Ethiopia, Sri Lanka, the Philippines and Nepal, who are not protected by law. Furthermore, Sayah (2011) shows among 42,900 refugees, asylum seekers and migrant workers, over 36,000 were Ethiopian domestic workers seeking help as they were exposed to various abuse and exploitation. According to Human Right Watch report (2007) labor laws of Lebanon, Saudi Arabia, Kuwait, and the United Arab Emirates (UAE) give minimal legal protection to migrant domestic workers. The report further indicated that women domestic workers in an unregulated and undervalued job sector are at high risk and face abuse and various forms of exploitation. As it is indicated in the general objective and pointed out by Tekle and Belyneh, the travels of female migrants are often arranged in such a way that it exposes them to challenging situations at the different stages of their journey, as well as to risks of becoming victims of human trafficking, which may well lead to permanent psychological damage (Tekle & Belayneh, 2000).

In view of the above background, the present study is expected to have the following contributions:

1. It may provide valuable information for concerned governmental and non-governmental bodies, as well as service providers, about the seriousness of the problems faced by survivors of trafficking;
2. It may contribute to creating awareness and shed more light on the social and psychological challenges female victims are facing. Stakeholders might also be encouraged to develop intervention programs to address victims' needs;

3. It may serve as an initial reference for researchers and stakeholders who might be interested in conducting research at a larger scale on the area of psycho-social wellbeing of trafficked women.

#### ***1.4. Limitation and Scope of the Study***

According to the study done by Endeshaw, et al., (2006) even though human trafficking is a crime under the Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (CCFDRE), the awareness of the public and the law enforcement officials on human trafficking is limited. The study also indicated that there is a substantial lack of awareness among many law enforcement officials about the particulars of all the important provisions dealing with trafficking. The study further shows that there was a tendency amongst some law enforcement officials in not considering the trafficking of women and children as a crime by itself, unless it is accompanied by other acts, like rape, bodily injury and the like. Due to social stigma, victims are reluctant to report their complaint to authorities or share their problems to families; rather, they prefer not to reveal their problem and the suffering they have faced. Moreover, the above study indicated that victims of trafficking are kind of 'hidden' that they are difficult to access. This is not only true for victims still living in exploitative situation, but also for returnees who were victims. Due to this difficulty of access, the study samples are limited to five participants who are returnees residing in the capital city, Addis Ababa.

The study targets returnees from Lebanon and UAE, the major destinations for a large number of migrant workers from Ethiopia. Thus, the research results cannot be generalized to the entire population of women affected by human trafficking. Cognizant of this fact, however, the

research may serve as a valuable entry point into the consideration of the extent and nature of the problems these victims faced.

### ***1.5. Overview of Chapters***

This study is about Ethiopian female labor migrants trafficked to the Middle East and later returned back to their home. It explores the major factors that drive the processes affecting these women and investigates the aftermath - the psychosocial effects and experiences that resulted from trafficking.

This dissertation will contain five chapters, including this introductory chapter. In chapter two, the definition of key terms as well as definition of human trafficking and its distinction from human smuggling will be discussed. The chapter will also highlight the theoretical background and literature review, explains the concepts and theories that are important in explaining and interpreting the findings later in the dissertation. The selected theories and concepts are categorized into a pattern which will be of relevance later, when analyzing and interpreting the findings. Chapter two will also focus on historical development of trafficking, its global dimensions, causes and consequences, the international and national laws with regards to trafficking, and national effort in combating trafficking to enable the reader understand the context of the study. The economic, social, and cultural situations will be highlighted, showing the roles and status of women and children in different parts of the country. Definition and overview of constructivism (a guiding model in this study) shall be discussed in chapter three. Chapter three further focuses on the research design, participants of the study, method of data collection and data analysis. In chapter four, the background information and a summary of every woman's story will be presented. Chapter four will also discuss the descriptions of the

major categories that were identified, comprising examples in verbatim from the data collected. In chapter five, findings on the major factors that expose women to trafficking and its effect on psychosocial health of participants will be discussed. In this chapter, the contributions and limitations of the study will also be presented. The conclusion derived from the collected data and notable recommendations will be provided to concerned organizations in the last section, chapter five, of this dissertation.

## CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

The available literature on human trafficking mainly consists of reports, studies, assessments and surveys conducted by international, governmental and non-governmental organizations. The last decade has seen a remarkable increase in the transnational and internal trafficking of women and children in Ethiopia (Agrinet, 2004; Eshetu, 2003; Kebede, 2002; Tekle & Belayneh, 2000). Ethiopian women and children are trafficked between regions, from rural parts to major cities in the country and from Ethiopia to Middle Eastern countries (Endeshaw et al., 2006). In addition, according to US Department of State (2011), Ethiopia is a source country for men; women and children trafficked for forced labor and sexual exploitation. The above information further shows that Ethiopian women are also trafficked largely to Lebanon and Saudi Arabia, as well as to some other destinations like Bahrain and United Arab Emirates (UAE), for domestic service.

The aim of this review is not merely to recapitulate the literature about trafficking of women and girls for domestic work. Generally, trafficking comes in many different forms of criminal activity: it is dynamic, adaptable and constantly changing and outsmarting efforts by law enforcement bodies attempting to avert it. The responses to the problems are also rapidly developing, particularly since an internationally agreed upon definition was adopted by the United Nations in November 2000. International cooperation is essential to the success of most interventions against women and child trafficking. Hence, the literature review looks into the features of the existing documents with regard to human trafficking in general and trafficking of women and children in particular.

This chapter starts by defining some of the important terms and concepts that are relevant to this study including, female, migration, migrant worker and victims of human trafficking. The researcher has defined migration as the larger practice of regular (migration frequently masks the

trafficking process). Hence, the researcher will give the definition of both migration and trafficking and it will clarify that all migration is not trafficking but human trafficking is the negative side of migration. The terms ‘migrant worker’ and ‘victims of human trafficking’ have also been defined to clarify the difference between migrant worker and victims of human trafficking, as all migrant workers may not be victims of human trafficking, but some, like the ones in this study, are migrant workers. Furthermore, the differences and similarities between trafficking and smuggling will also be clarified due to the overlapping nature of both concepts. Moreover, the concepts of female and psychosocial have been defined as they are relevant to this study.

### **2.1. Definition of Terms**

*Female, Human trafficking, Migration, Migrant worker, Psychosocial, Victims of trafficking and human smuggling.*

#### **Female**

*A female person: a woman or a girl (Webster 2003, p. 462).*

#### **Migration**

*A process of moving, either across international border, or within a state. It is a population movement, encompassing any kind of movement of people, whatever its length, composition and causes; it includes migration of refugees, displaced persons, uprooted people and economic migrants (IOM, 2004, p. 41).*

## **Migrant worker**

*A person, who is to be engaged, is engaged or has been engaged in a remunerated activity in a state of which he or she is not a national (United Nations, 1990, p. 262).*

## **Psychosocial**

*(Psychology) (Sociology) of or relating to processes or factors that are both social and psychological in origin (Collins, 2003, p.1).*

## **Victim of human trafficking**

*An individual who is a victim of the crime of trafficking in persons (IOM, 2004, p. 69).*

### ***2.1.1. Human Trafficking: Definition and Overview.***

Every rational explanation begins by definition. However, some concepts are hard to define to the gratification of the greater part of the reader. According to Kempadoo and Doezema, (1998) no unanimously accepted definition of human trafficking exists even if several definitions are impelled and adopted by governments, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and regional bodies. The researcher has assessed some of the definitions forwarded by governments and NGOs, including the definition endorsed by the Netherlands Advisory Committee of Human Right and Foreign Policy, the United Nations General Assembly (1997) and Foundation against Trafficking of Women. However, Kempadoo and Doezema have confirmed that, the absence of a clear and precise definition has resulted in government and NGOs adopting strategies and policies that are not coordinated globally to direct to the same vulnerable population.

Hence, for the purpose of this study, the researcher used the definition of human trafficking, which is provided by the UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish

## Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children.

The UN Protocol on trafficking in ‘persons’, usually referred to as the ‘Palermo Protocol’, defines human trafficking in Article 3 as follows:

*(a) “trafficking in persons” shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other means of the abuse of power of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery, servitude or the removal of organs; (UN, 2000a, p. 2).*

*(b) The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used; (UN, 2000a p. 2).*

*(c) The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered “trafficking in persons” even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article*

*(UN, 2000a, p. 2).*

The rationale behind considering the UN Protocol definition in this study is mainly because it offers a more comprehensive definition and the elements of trafficking that reflects the recruitment, transportation and the exploitation of victims in the trafficking process. The definition also illustrates how the trafficking process is so intricate and how the victims fall prey to the traffickers through deception, coercion and other means through which it shows the process and helps the reader to understand human trafficking in the context of the study. Moreover, the UN Protocol definition harmonizes with the trafficking elements as recruitment, transportation and exploitation that are present in the process of trafficking and criminalizes the different activities that are present in the process of trafficking of persons, without requiring the three elements present and connected. The UN Protocol definition also clearly states in sub paragraph (a) of Article 3 on the consent of victims that the intended exploitation shall be irrelevant where any defined terms of recruitment, transportation or exploitation have been used.

The elements that are identified in the UN definition clearly shows what trafficking includes, its purpose, its scope, issue of the consent of victims and the vulnerable groups for trafficking which is highly explanatory in nature and helpful to understand. However, according to Doezema (2001), it criticizes the little aid offer by the UN Protocol (2000a) on the protection of victims. On the other hand, based on the definition provided by the UN Protocol (2000a), the study conducted by Endeshaw et al., (2006) has identified six elements that includes the process, the consent of the victims, the purpose of trafficking, where and how trafficking occurs and emphasis of the vulnerability of women and children to trafficking. This can be summarized as follows:

1. *Trafficking as a process of recruitment, transportation and transfer of victims:*

Trafficking swathe the entire process of movement of persons at initial point to the point of

destination. In addition, processes associated to transit are also regarded as part of the trafficking practice.

2. *The consent of the victim is not a defining feature of trafficking:* The consent of the victim at conscription or at latter stages does not avert the act from being trafficking as far as consent was obtained through fraud, coercion and deception. Furthermore, the misuse of lawful power over the victim, exploiting the helplessness of the victim and obtaining the consent of a person having power over the victim through the giving or promise of benefits, including financial benefits, do not prevent the episode of an act of trafficking.

3. *Exploitation as a purpose of trafficking is exploitation:* An important aspect of trafficking is its intention that is the exploitation of the victim for gain of traffickers. The UN definition further elaborates on the forms of abuse as composing, at least, forced labor, slavery or similar practices such as sexual exploitation or removal of organs.

4. *Trafficking can occur within national or across borders:* Although not specifically pointed out in the Palermo definition, the trafficking of persons may possibly occur within national borders of a country or across international borders.

5. *Trafficking may not necessarily involve illegal movement of persons:* The Palermo definition does not make the use of illegal migration routes and processes a defining element of trafficking in persons. Trafficking may not even be concealed; it may utilize lawful processes and measures the movement and migration of persons; pervert traditional institutions and practices; or, use legal and accepted employment and other means that are not satisfactorily protective of the victim.

6. *Women and children are more vulnerable to trafficking*: In line with the UN Protocol definition, the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), published in 1979, highlights the vulnerability of women and children to trafficking. It is understandable from the title that the trend centers on trafficking of people, “especially women and children”.

According to Eshetu (2003) the UN Protocol definition does not specify for the existence of trafficking during crossing international boundaries as it is anticipated to supplement the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, and intends to address the problem of human trafficking across borders. Consequently, the above study shows that there is no perfection in defining human trafficking other than focusing on moderately acceptable elements of trafficking.

### ***2.1.2. Distinctions between Human Trafficking and Human Smuggling.***

Another aspect of the problem in defining trafficking is its similarity with smuggling of persons across borders. The UN Protocol (2000b) *Against the Smuggling of Migrants* defines smuggling of migrants as follows:

*...the procurement, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly a financial or other material benefit, of the illegal entry of a person into a state party of which the person is not a national or a permanent resident (UN, 2000b, p. 2).*

A research finding indicates that often, international trafficking involves smuggling of deceived women and children across international borders. The study further shows traffickers resort to illegal entry into a transit or destination country to cut off and distance their victims from their socio-cultural circumstances, thereby making them more vulnerable to exploitation,

abuse and easy control. The above study also stated, due to the historical development of the issue and overlapping natures of trafficking and smuggling of migrants, there is confusion on how to demarcate both trafficking and smuggling (Martens, Pieczkowski & Van Vuuren-Smyth, 2003).

For the purpose of this study the researcher referred the United Nations (2000b) *Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air* to clarify the distinction between trafficking and smuggling. According to United Nations (2000b), trafficking and smuggling are overlapping concepts with some differences. One of the major differences lies on the fact that trafficking is a crime committed against an individual through deception, coercion, repeated exploitation, restricted movement and other means, whereas smuggling is a crime committed against a state through illegal border crossing. According to IOM and UN (2000), migrant smuggling is the facilitation of unlawful border crossing, whereas trafficking is a situation that goes beyond unauthorized crossing of a border where lawful ways might have been used to bring migrants into a destination for the purpose of labor exploitation. Both trafficking and smuggling are, however, profitable businesses involving human beings and criminal networks or groups that benefit out of the business.

## ***2.2. Historical Development of Human Trafficking***

Mariek Kalp, et al., (as cited in Endeshaw et al., 2006) stated that acknowledgment of the problem dates back to the Paris Conference on Trafficking in 1895. According to Natalie Kautamn and Hevener (cited in Endeshaw et al., 2006) the Conference on Trafficking was followed by the Convention Against 'White Slavery' (1904), the International Convention for the Suppression of White Slave Trafficking (1910), the Convention for the Suppression of

Trafficked Women and Children (1921), and the United Nations Convention for the Suppression of Persons and the Exploitation of Prostitution of Others (1949).

According to Doezema (2001), the reappearance of slavery, nowadays called trafficking of women, as a political issue for human right activists, feminists and others at national and international levels can be dated back to the beginning of the 1980s. According to Bruckert and Parent (2002), Barry and Jeffreys (cited in Bruckert and Parent, 2002) indicated that exploitation of women resurfaced in the late twentieth century in a globalized and industrialized form. Bruckert and Parent further show that the sufferers are still innocent young girls who are seduced and strained into exploitation and sex trade: a form of cruelty against women. Analysts in the field campaign a forceful struggle against this new form of oppression of women.

Feingold indicated that news headlines make trafficking seem like recent phenomenon. However, he has stated that:

*...the coerced movement of people across borders is as old as the laws of supply and demand. What is new is the volume of the traffic-and the realization that we have done little to stem the tide. We must look beyond our raw emotions if we are ever to stop those who trade in human lives (Feingold, 2005, p. 26).*

A research finding indicate that during the Beijing Conference of 1995, the issue of human trafficking was not a serious concern for Africa and the problem was considered as a phenomenon existing mainly among that of the Latin American and Asians people. The above finding also stated that it took almost ten years after the Beijing conference to show that human trafficking is prevalent in the continent and most West African countries have been found to be source, transit and destination for women and children trafficking. The study further show that

although there are no exact figures and data on the number of trafficked women and children in the continent, there are indicators to show the trend is increasing in an alarming rate (Bezabih, 2008).

The study done by United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund, UNICEF's Innocenti Research Center (cited in Agrinet, 2004) show that in fifty-three countries, eighty nine percent of African countries are affected by trafficking flows to and from other countries within Africa. The above study further pointed out that thirty-four percent of African countries flow to Europe, and twenty six percent are directed to Middle East. The report also indicated that trafficking of women and children affects every country in Africa, either as a country of origin, transit or destination.

According to Pearson (2003), Middle Eastern countries such as Bahrain, Lebanon, Saudi Arabia and United Arab Emirates are the main destinations for women and young girls trafficked from East Africa for domestic labor. Furthermore, Pearson puts it as follows: "*There is wide scale trafficking of women especially from Ethiopia to the Gulf – in Lebanon alone, there are an estimated 20,000 to 25,000 Ethiopian domestic workers, a significant number of whom are trafficked*" (2003, p. 4). The study by Pearson also shows women trafficked to Middle Eastern countries for domestic work might go through illegal or legal agencies and those illegal agencies are usually familiarized to agents through friends or family. The women are usually charged a fee by agents, or a fee is deducted from their wages once they start working. The study indicates that migrant domestic workers were often deceived about the working conditions, the type of jobs they were to perform and on the size of their salaries. The study further indicated that trafficked women are often forced to work an average of eighteen hours a day with no break;

their wages are denied or lower than what was offered, and; they are exposed to rape, mistreatment and confinement.

In one of the first studies of the trafficking phenomenon in South Africa, published by a Cape Town-based NGO, Molo (cited in Martens et al., 2003) indicate that victims trafficked into South Africa involve women and children from every corner of the African continent and overseas. A research finding indicate that looking into the situation in Ethiopia, it is not surprising that long history of prostitution, slavery and bonded labor in the country have contributed to a tolerant attitude towards trafficking of women and children (Endeshaw et al., 2006).

### ***2.3. Global Overview of Trafficking***

According to US State Department (2006), an estimated of 600,000 to 800,000 men, women and minors are trafficked across global borders every year, and of this number, around eighty percent of the women and girls are exposed to exploitative situations. The report also added that the figures quoted above do not include millions who are victims of trafficking *within* their nations.

A study shows that all East African countries have been recognized as source, transit and destination for trafficked women and children. The study also shows that trafficking occurs both internally and across borders to other countries in the East and Southern Africa, and trans-continentially to Europe and the Middle East.

Endeshaw et al. (2006) revealed that trafficking is not a new phenomenon, but it has recently reemerged globally. Global March (cited in Allais, 2004) show that the trafficking of persons

leaves no country untouched and the widespread global nature of the practice is on the rise. The author listed Ethiopia among countries affected by the practice.

### ***2.3.1. Trafficking of Women and Children.***

According to IOM (2003, p.61) trafficking of persons, especially women and children, has evolved into one of the most tragic features of contemporary global migration and the situation of victims is described as follows: “victims of trafficking are exposed to physical and psychological violence and abuse, denied labor rights, are illegal before the law and are often found in a forced and unwanted relationship or dependency with their traffickers”.

According to US Department of State (2006), trafficking of humans spawns an estimated of \$9.5 billion income annually to traffickers and is closely connected to crimes such as drug trafficking, document falsification and human smuggling, where organized crime thrives, the rule of law are undermined. A study indicate that though trafficking affects hundreds of thousands of people every year, getting accurate figure for persons trafficked in is not easy to obtain and estimate (Endeshaw et al., 2006). In addition, According to UN (2000a), these difficulties may be attributed to the complexity of the problem, the ambivalence of decision makers and a lack of resources to ensure adequate legislation to permit vigorous strategic interventions for the fight against trafficking of women and children. Due to these and other related reasons, there are no accurate statistics on the extent of the problem and estimates are unreliable.

### ***2.4. Trafficking in Ethiopia***

A research finding show that in search of job opportunity or income is not detrimental by itself, for many countries gain significantly as a result of remittances of citizens working abroad. Nevertheless, what is unacceptable is that, migrants are trapped into a situation where they

become victims of trafficking during the migration process and are made to suffer abuse and exploitation. The research further comments on the complexity of migration becoming trafficking as follows: “*while all trafficking involves migration, not all migration is trafficking*” (Agrinet, 2004, p.1).

According to United Nations Women Watch (2008), migration in Ethiopia is increasing both in magnitude and significance. As it is stated in the National Action Plan of Ethiopia, about twenty seven million people are living in poverty, with women comprising a majority of those living in absolute poverty. This is due to the gender differentials that persist at all levels of society, as reflected by social indicators. The action plan also shows that though education has been given attention by the government and factors such as the early marriage of girls diminish the prospect of women gaining admission to higher education. The action plan further states that the rate of student dropouts among girls is higher than boys by a large margin, and girls are furthermore usually held responsible for a multitude of tasks in the household, which may interfere with their education.

According to Kebede (2002), in Ethiopia, women are seen as the “natural” providers of domestic service including cooking, cleaning, and care taking and general household maintenance. This is coupled with the biological role of childbearing and resultant responsibilities. In addition to the above, many Ethiopian women are engaged in paid labor in factories, homes or restaurants to supplement the household income and are often exposed to rigorous and labor-intensive work environments. A study shows that most victims of external trafficking have either completed high school or only are school dropouts. Consequently, due to the unfavorable circumstances existing in the country, women and young girls are exposed to trafficking through their hope to improve their lives and support their families (Belayneh, 2000).

#### ***2.4.1. Internal Trafficking.***

According to FSCE (2004) internal trafficking of women and children is widespread throughout the country and even seems to be tolerated by the society. The main purposes of internal trafficking are to engage women and children as domestic workers and/or as weavers in the ‘*shema*’ industry. The report further shows, a large number of women and children suffer from different types of inhuman abuses and exploitations as a result of trafficking within Ethiopia. Existing studies such as Bezabih, 2008; Eshetu, 2003 and Endeshw et al., 2006 pointed out that trafficking of women and children from rural to urban areas is a prevalent and steadily increasing practice in the country. Endeshaw et al. (2006) however show reliable and comprehensive data on the emergence and development of trafficking or the number of women and children who have fallen victim to trafficking in the country are not available in their communities. A study indicates that a substantial proportion of women and children are working as prostitutes, domestic workers, beggars, weavers in the traditional weaving industry. The study also noted that children living on the streets are also victims of trafficking (FSCE, 2004).

#### ***2.4.2. External Trafficking.***

Studies show that trafficking of women from Ethiopia to countries in the Middle East is currently recognized as a major problem. Studies have revealed that women are mainly trafficked for the purpose of domestic service and at other times for the purpose of prostitution. The above studies also indicated that widespread poverty, unemployment and the unfavorable economic and social position of women are the major push factors. The above studies have further shown that a large number of Ethiopian women who migrate for work to Middle Eastern countries are victims of trafficking (Agrinet, 2004; Eshetu, 2003; Tekle & Belayneh, 2000).

According to Pearson (2003), Ethiopia is mainly a source country for trafficking and young Ethiopian women are trafficked to Djibouti, Lebanon, the United Arab Emirates, Saudi Arabia, and Bahrain for domestic labor. According to local Amharic newspaper (cited in Agrinet, 2004) there are around 130,000 Ethiopian males and females residing in the Gulf States, and all of them are labor migrants. The above news paper further notes, even if Ethiopian women wish to migrate for work purposes, many of them become victims of trafficking, lured by false promises of good job, high salaries and an easy life. According to the study done by Agrinet (2004) trafficking of women is almost inevitable, whether the mode is legal or illegal, and in both modes intermediaries are involved in the process. The same study also expresses surprise that only a small proportion of migrants went through legally registered employment agencies, as compared to those who traveled through local brokers. The study further shows that from the small number of respondents it can be inferred that the majority of the migrant women were trafficked. The study concludes that this is a cause of concern, and the contribution of legal employment agencies in curbing the trafficking of women and children should be investigated. Moreover, the study further found that eighty five percent of migrant women who were received by brokers at the destination countries were trafficked.

According to Human Right Watch (2010), the current Lebanese law does not permit domestic workers to leave their job without the consent of their employers. The report further shows the restrictive visa policies in Lebanon dissuade many domestic workers from pursuing grievances against their employers.

The study by Tekle and Belayneh (2000) indicate that most victims of external trafficking are from the capital city, Addis Ababa. This is due to the fact that Addis Ababa is a metropolitan city and large numbers of people migrate there from different corners of the nation, mainly in search

of jobs within and outside the country. Similarly, Agrinet (2004) points out that about seventy-five percent of trafficked women to the Middle Eastern countries were from urban areas of Ethiopia.

#### ***2.4.3. Recruitment, Transportation and Trafficking Routes.***

According to Terfassa (2004) the recruitment of women and children for internal trafficking can take different forms. In most cases, traffickers use intermediaries who are known to the potential victim, and use promises of employment and education at the destination to deceive the victim or her/his family. The above study shows that traffickers may be local brokers, friends, relatives or even family members. The study further indicated cross-country bus drivers also recruit women and children for domestic labor and sexual exploitation and irrespective of who does the recruitment, the process involves deception, misrepresentation, and even force.

A study show that the typical recruiter for external trafficking is a person who has returned from the country of destination, has relatives living in the country of destination, or frequently travels abroad for legitimate purpose. The study further shows that the person is either known to the victim's family or works through a facilitator known to them (Agrinet, 2004). The study conducted by Tekle and Belayneh (2000) also shows that most recruiters have some connection or businesses with countries in the Middle East and have either lived there or continue to travel there for work purposes.

According to Endeshaw et al. (2006) internal trafficking routes more often overlap with ordinary routes for migration from rural to urban areas within the country. The study also shows the process of in-country trafficking of women and children is mostly not an organized activity, involving players entirely involved in trafficking. The same study further shows that a typical case of internal trafficking entails a person traveling to a rural area, ostensibly for local holiday

or other purposes, and then recruiting and transporting an associate or a relative to a town where he or she lives. The above study added that mostly, the only general pattern that can be discerned relates to the movement of women and children from rural to urban centers and from one urban center to another, more often to larger urban centers.

## ***2.5. Causative Factors of Trafficking***

The root causes of trafficking are complex and often interrelated. Poverty, weak governance, armed conflict or lack of effective protection against discrimination and exploitation are some examples. It is important to understand that each country presents specific factors or a combination of multiple factors that are unique to each situation. The causes are generally grouped into “push factors” (that drive people away from their home country) and “pull factors” (that attract people to migrate to another place).

The following are some of the major pushing and pulling factors that fuel trafficking in Ethiopia. According to Endeshaw et al. (2006) a large number of women and children are trafficked for all types of exploitation, including domestic labor, industrial and agricultural labor, begging, false marriage etc. This study will, however, maintain its focus specifically on the experiences of female migrants trafficked for the purpose of domestic work to the Middle East.

### ***2.5.1. Push Factors.***

According to Human Right Watch report (2007) women and young girls in other parts of the world, for example Indonesia, Philippines and Sri Lanka, experience various forms of gender-based violence and gender inequality, including discrimination in economic activity the report also shows this gender inequality profoundly influences their access to education and employment and drives many to migrate to survive.

A research shows that poverty is the most frequent explanation cited for the involvement of large numbers of women and girls in domestic works. While it is usually the first answer to this question, as poverty may be a principal catalyst, it cannot solely explain trafficking. The research also indicates in most societies, women get the negligible share of resources. When incomes are constrained, it is the women who undergo most of the suffering first. The study further shows men are forced to look for jobs outside agricultural labor, but women are left without any job at all. Consequently, women are sidelined to an increasing degree. When they enter the highly cutthroat labor market they are forced to compete with the prevailing male labor force. The study further revealed that women are left with little choice but to take extremely low paid, exploitative work as domestic servants, clothing factory workers, prostitutes, etc. (Bezabih, 2008). Hence, another study shows that the search for jobs or economic need seems to have great pressure on women and young girls to succumb to traffickers (Agrinet, 2004).

According to Bezabih (2008) in Ethiopia, the scope for employment opportunities and skill development, particularly for rural women, is minimal. Women have traditionally worked as unpaid family laborers in the society. Employment opportunities, access to land and credit facilities have traditionally been limited for women. The above study further added that there have been, however, increasing demands for the labor of women and young girls in the urban informal sector in recent years and a growing number of young women are involved in the workforce and as domestic servants in the urban areas. The study concluded that this trend of migration places women and young girls in vulnerable conditions and provides opportunities which traffickers can exploit.

### ***2.5.2. Pull Factors.***

According to Bezabih (2008) the increasing demand of women and young girls in urban areas for domestic work is the major pull factor. With the ever-increasing poverty and limited access to services in the rural areas, women and children are migrating to cities expecting better opportunities. On the other hand, another study states that large numbers of women have been deceived by false promises of traffickers of attractive jobs, towering salaries as well as promises of marriage and comfortable life and this numbers among the major pulling factors for trafficking (Kebede, 2002).

### ***2.6. Consequences of Trafficking***

According to Bezabih (2008) when an individual falls prey to a trafficker, the consequences for the person are extremely serious. During the process of trafficking, a victim's basic human rights are violated: they may be beaten, raped and/or threatened. The above study also added that when victims fall under the control of the traffickers, they are mostly too scared to seek help and often do not know where to go for assistance. Sometimes victims who do escape traffickers are re-victimized by authorities who expel them back home due to their irregular traveling status, instead of granting to them the protection they deserve. Even after they come out of the process of victimization, the physical and psychological impact related to the trauma and abuse they experienced continues to affect their physical and psychosocial well-being. Moreover, the above study further indicated that one of the recurrent consequences of human trafficking is stigmatization and victims are often ashamed of what they have been forced to do. They often endeavor to keep their experiences undisclosed, fearing rejection by their families and

communities. Another study shows that trafficking victims are rejected by families and local communities and depend on others' assistance (PCI, 2010).

### ***2.6.1. Abuse and Exploitation.***

The study done by Bezabih (2008) shows that although abuse typically occurs at the endpoint of the migration, victims also subjected to different forms of abuse during the process of travelling to their destinations. The study also point out that after they arrive, victims are usually kept hidden in the community and they are often abused in many ways. The abuse mostly includes physical abuse, labor exploitation, as well as sexual and emotional abuse. The physical and emotional abuse of victims includes forced labor in an effort to 'discipline' them and deprivation of food, with constant pressure, intimidation and threat. The study further describes the relationship of the victim and the employer as follows: "The relationship between the victim and the employer is not that of an employer and employee but rather that of a master and servant" (Bezabih, 2008, p. 27).

### ***2.6.2. Dehumanize Women and Young Girls.***

A research shows that one of the main mechanisms traffickers use as a means of controlling the victims is to confiscate their travel documents. This leaves the women in a vulnerable position, especially if they did not enter the country legally. Survivors usually report that their documents were taken by immigration officers at destination countries and handed over to traffickers or employers (Agrinet, 2004).

### ***2.6.3. Physical and Psychosocial Health.***

There are numerous reports which relate to cases where clandestine migration put victims at risk of death, starvation, suffocation, accidents and other harmful conditions. For example, 'The Reporter' (cited in Tekle and Belayneh, 2000) refers to sixty-seven deceased women coming

from Arab countries in the years 1997-1999, which can be attributed to clandestine migration. Another research has shown that trafficking of women and young girls is accompanied by potentially lifelong and/or life-threatening health problems and that victims often express the wish to return home safely, even if it entails leaving their wages behind (Agrinet, 2004).

## ***2.7. International and National Instruments and Efforts to Combat Trafficking***

### ***2.7.1. International instruments.***

A study shows that Ethiopia has ratified many of the basic human right conventions and instruments on the rights of women and children. The study also refers to a number of UN conventions, the ILO (International Labor Organization) and regional instruments ratified by Ethiopia that directly deal with trafficking problem including the UN Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others of 1949 (No.97); the UN Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), 1979; The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1986; the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), 1989, and; ILO Convention No. 105, (1957) on the Abolition of Forced Labor (Endeshaw et al., 2006).

Ethiopia has yet to ratify the most recent and comprehensive global instrument, which is the UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Person, Especially of Women and Children (2000a) as well as its parent Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. Other instruments that are not ratified by Ethiopia comprise the Migrant for Employment Convention (revised), 1949 (No.97); the Convention on the Promotion of Equality of and Opportunity and Treatment of Migrant Workers, 1975; and the UN International Convention on the Right of Migrant Workers and their Families, 1990. According to Eshetu (2003) the importance of Part III of the Migrant Workers Convention is emphasized, which establishes the values of equal

treatment with all migrant workers, whether they are in regular (legal) or irregular (illegal) status. According to UN RMWF (cited in Eshetu, 2003, p.42) article 25 of the Convention states that: “migrant workers shall enjoy treatment not less favorable than that which applies to nationals of state of employment in respect of remuneration”. The above also indicated that such working situations includes working hours, weekly rest, holidays, overtime, as well as measures for safety and health. Moreover, UN RMWF (cited in Eshetu, 2003) further shows Article 21 of the migrant workers convention also prohibits confiscation of travel and identity documents of migrant workers, which is vital in ensuring their protection. According to Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (FDRE) (cited in Endeshaw et al., 2006, p. 87) regarding integration of the international law with the National law of Ethiopia has indicated in Article 9(4) of the Ethiopian Constitution as follows: “all international agreements ratified by Ethiopia are considered as part of the law of the land”. In line with this, UN Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) (cited in Eshetu, 2003, p. 39) indicated in Article 6 as follows: “State parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women”. This stresses that Police and Immigration officers of a country have a constitutional duty to enforce observance to the law in to preventing trafficking and protect victims of human trafficking.

### ***2.7.2. National Instruments.***

As it has been indicated in the previous section, Ethiopia is a country highly affected by in-country and external trafficking of women and children, and the existing policy framework does not include a comprehensive national policy on trafficking of women and children. However, it is vital to discuss the relevant national instruments regarding trafficking.

**2.7.2.1. The Constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia:** According to the Constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (1995) article 32 guarantees the right of every citizen of Ethiopia to move and reside within the country, to leave the country whenever the individual wishes and to return to his country. The Constitution under article 35 (3) further assures women's rights to special treatment through affirmative measures to bring about practical equality of women with men. Conversely, Article 36(d) strictly prohibits exploitative child labor, while under article 35(4), laws, customs and practices that oppress or cause bodily or mental harm to women are prohibited. Apart from these, the Constitution has specifically addressed the issue of trafficking under article 18(2), which reads as follows: "No one shall be held in slavery or servitude. Trafficking of human beings for whatever purpose is prohibited" (FDRE, 1995, p. 12). According to Agrinet (2004) the wording of this article makes it clear that trafficking in persons for whatever purpose is prohibited and this is considered as huge advancement from the Penal Code, 1957.

**2.7.2.2. The Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, 2005:** The Criminal Code does not include a single and clear definition of trafficking; only Articles 597 and 635 of the Criminal Code deal with trafficking of women and children. These articles read as follows:

Article 597

*(1) whoever by violence, threat, deceit, fraud, kidnapping or by the giving of money or other advantage to the person having control over a women or a child, recruits, receives, hides, transports, exports or imports a woman or a minor for the purpose of forced labour, is punishable with rigorous imprisonment from five years*

*to twenty years, and fine not exceeding fifty thousand Birr;*

*(2) Whoever knowingly carries off, transports or conducts, whether by land, by sea or by air, the victim mentioned in sub-article (1), with the purpose stated therein, or conducts or aids such traffic, is liable to the penalty prescribed under sub-article (1) above*

(CCFDRE, 2005, p. 346).

#### Article 635

*Whoever, for gain, or to gratify the passions of another:*

*(a) traffics in women or minors, whether by seducing them, by enticing them, or by procuring them or otherwise inducing them to engage in prostitution, even with their consent;*

(CCFDRE, 2005, p. 370).

**2.7.2.3. The Private Employment Agency Proclamation, 1998:** According to Endeshaw et al. (2006) Proclamation No. 104/1998 defines the right and responsibilities of private employment agencies in their role of facilitating offers of application for domestic and foreign employment. The study further points out that although the Private Employment Agency Proclamation No.104/1998 does not openly define trafficking, one of its objectives is combating labor trafficking which flourishes in Ethiopia and results in the violation of the rights, safety and dignity of Ethiopians employed abroad. The above study added the proclamation attempts to protect the rights and dignity of Ethiopians where they can participate in the employment services as individuals and as private entities. According to Proclamation No. 104/1998 (cited in Endeshaw et al., 2006, p. 98) article 18 (1) (a) stipulates the penalties listed below in cases where

an individual or entity performs employment services without having obtained a license in accordance with the law:

*1. without having obtained a license in accordance with this Proclamation;*

*(a) who performs employment services in Ethiopia, is punishable with imprisonment for a term of not less than three years and not exceeding five years and a fine Birr ten thousand.*

*(b) who sends an Ethiopian national abroad for work, is punishable with imprisonment for term of not less than five years and not exceeding ten years, and a fine Birr twenty five thousand.*

*3. Where the human rights, and physical integrity of an Ethiopian sent abroad for work have been injured, the punishment may be increased from five to twenty years rigorous imprisonment and a (c) fine up to Birr fifty thousand.*

According to Endeshaw et al. (2006) the two provisions are similar both in terms of content and punishment. Both provisions (article 18 of the Proclamation and article 597 of the Criminal Code) define the type of incident which is to be identified as a case of the unlawful sending of Ethiopians for work abroad, and indicate that the existence of two elements, i.e., recruitment and transportation, involving exploitation that can increase the severity of the punishment (articles 597 (2) of the Criminal Code of 2005 and article 18(3) of the PEAP No, 104/1998).

According to the Criminal Code of Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2005) article 599(1) shows a situation where trafficking is undertaken for the purpose of slavery, even in a disguised form of forced labor and an association or band is formed to engage in slave trade, no

matter what form, such band or association shall be punishable with a fine not exceeding one hundred thousand Birr and its closure shall be ordered.

According to Endeshaw et al. (2006) Ethiopia has ratified most of the UN conventions and needs to ratify remaining notable others such as the Palermo Protocol and the other relevant international instruments. Mechanisms of international cooperation should be used to facilitate collaboration with the international community, and also with transit and destination, countries concerning cross border trafficking of Ethiopian women and children. However, another study shows that the international, regional and national instruments for preventing trafficking and protection of victims are not effectively put into effect due to limitations which can be attributed to poor law enforcement as well as a variety of economic factors (Agrinet, 2004).

### ***2.7.3. National Efforts to Combat Trafficking.***

According to US Department of State (2007), although the Ethiopian government does not fulfill the minimum standards of eradicating trafficking, some progress have been made over the past years on the area of law enforcement relating to trafficking, through investigating and prosecuting a number of trafficking crimes. The US report notes that the effort of establishing a National Task Force composed of different governmental and non-governmental bodies can be regarded as one-step ahead in the process of countering trafficking. The report also refers to two awareness workshops which were organized by the Task Force in Addis Ababa and in one of the regional cities which was attended by over one hundred participants, including high court judges, national labor bureau personnel and police commissioners. The report further indicated to IOM's weekly anti-trafficking program, transmitted at the national radio, and a documentary film aired at the Ethiopian National Television to highlight the problem of trafficking as some of the efforts made for countering trafficking in Ethiopia. The above report also pointed out to a pre-departure

orientation program which is initiated by Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA) with the assistance of IOM to inform prospective migrants on the risks of irregular migration. The report further indicated that MoLSA offered orientation for 8,359 potential migrants on the dangers of irregular migration, and, in an arrangement with the Ethiopian Consulate in Lebanon, verified labor contracts for about 8, 200 workers.

It is confirmed that repatriation assistance of stranded migrants in the Middle East is usually facilitated by the Ethiopian Consular Mission in the host countries through discussion with the relevant bodies of the government in the destination countries, such as labor office, police and courts. (J. Seid, personal communication, September 16, 2010). J. Seid added, due to budget constraints, the Consular Mission usually organizes fundraising from the Ethiopian community in the destination countries and staff of the Consular Mission to cover the travel cost of the stranded migrants. According to J. Seid, in those cases where migrants are alleged to have run away from their employers and end up in detention centers: the stranded migrants are usually assisted to return back home after the Ethiopian Consular Office has checked their cases and whether they are accused of being involved in criminal activities. The other precondition for repatriation is checking their citizenship and verifying their documents. If the stranded migrants have no travel documents, the Mission usually checks their citizenship status by contacting their families in Ethiopia (J. Seid, personal communication, September 16, 2010).

The amendment of the Private Employment Agency Proclamation No.104/1998 has been finalized and published in the Federal Negarit Gazeta of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia as Proclamation No.632/2009 (A. Adewo, personal communication, March 8, 2011). It is also confirmed that the Employment Exchange Proclamation No 632/2009 particularly endeavors to further protect the rights, safety and dignity of Ethiopians going abroad for

employment in pursuance to their qualification and skills. The proclamation (2009) redefined the role of employment agencies and focuses on monitoring and regulating domestic and overseas employment exchange services and article No 9 indicated that a license will not be issued if the applicant was punished for his engagement in an illegal activity or for human trafficking. According to A. Adewo, personal communication, March 8, 2011, the proclamation further indicates under article 31 that the government is responsible in facilitating the resettlement of citizens who wish to return to their home country after deployment abroad. The proclamation also added under article 36 that Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA) shall deploy a labor attaché in consultation with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs after acquiring the permission of the higher authority, to ensure the protection of the rights, safety and dignity of workers deployed abroad (Employment Exchange, Proclamation No 632/2009).

A. Adewo, stated that regulations are being developed relating to the functionality of proclamation No 632/2009, including reestablishing the National Committee and these will play a significant role in countering trafficking in Ethiopia. A. Adewo also mentioned that those employment agencies licensed in proclamation 104/1998 will be required to reregister with the new proclamation No 632/2009 and that since the amendment of the proclamation; about 71 out of 120 employment agencies have reregistered so far.

Outside the formal sphere of action by the government, there are also certain governmental and non-governmental organizations involved in reintegration of victims of human trafficking in Ethiopia. For example, Afework and Habte refers to organizations namely Ethiopian Orthodox Church (EOC), Development Inter Church Aid Commission (DICAC), Refugees and Returnee Affairs Department (RRAD) and Agar Ethiopia that are working on assisting returnees from the Middle East to reintegrate with their families (Afework & Habte, 2011).

## **2.8. Conclusion**

The literature review illustrates that, despite all the effort made so far by international, governmental and non-governmental organizations, trafficking of women and children within the country and across border is growing in Ethiopia. It would seem that a more comprehensive effort is required to address the problem. Hence, the aim of this study is to contribute to this process by gathering valuable information on the major driving factors that expose women and young girls to human trafficking to the Middle East and the psychosocial aftermath they face during the course of the trafficking process. This research will focus on the personal stories of some of the victims, something that has not yet been adequately addressed as per existing literature. Furthermore, the study will focus on trying to understand the repercussions faced by victims even after repatriation, There is no or very little attention given in the existing literature to the serious psychological and social challenges which the victims have to face during the events and on their return. This study is an attempt to initiate an exploration of these issues.

## CHAPTER 3: METHOD

This chapter provides an overview of the theory of constructivism that has been selected as the epistemological framework: a guiding model for this research. The model refers to the views individuals actively construct their own realities as indicated in the definition of constructivism which is provided below. In this chapter the research design, the sample, the method of data collection and analysis will be discussed. The issue of the validity of the study will also be discussed.

The research follows qualitative methods. To this end, the participants have been selected using a purposive sampling method. Data was collected from primary sources which consisted of women residing in Addis Ababa using in depth interviews. The methods of sampling and data collection procedures will also be discussed in detail. The chapter will further provide data method of analysis and a brief overview of social constructivism as the epistemological framework of data analysis.

### *3.1. Definition of Constructivism*

Fuks (cited in Macliam, 2003) explains constructivism as the way individuals create their own 'realities'. In this occurrence the word realities is placed in inverted commas to accentuate that from a constructivist point of view there are no absolute truths or realities, just interpretations. Every person attaches meaning to her /his observation and interprets the world from her/his own unique point of view. The assumption is each person makes sense of her/his own world in terms of one's own unique perspective.

For the purpose of this study, the researcher will attempt to comprehend the participants' world from their own perspective and interpret such views accordingly.

### ***3.2. Theory of Constructivism***

According to Heylighten (1993), in constructivism information is seen as largely independent of a hypothetical 'external reality' or surroundings. On the other side, Maturana and Varela (cited in Heylighten, 1993) argue, the nervous system of human being cannot in any absolute way distinguish between a perception (caused by an external phenomenon) and a hallucination (a purely internal event). Maturana and Varela further concluded that the only basic criterion is that different mental entities or processes within or between individuals should reach some kind of equilibrium. While these constructivist approaches emphasizes the changing and relative character of understanding more, they are still absolutist in the dominance they give to either social consensus or internal coherence, and their explanation are incomplete. Heylighten (1993) further explained that more broadly as a viewpoint offered by different schools of epistemology with an assumption that knowledge is constructed by the subject or group of subjects in order to adapt to their environment. Maturana and Varela (cited in Heylighten, 1993) also showed that sensory knowledge goes through stages of several transformations as it is received by each person. Furthermore, Keeney (cited in Macliam, 2003) noted that knowledge is not passively received whichever it comes through the senses or by way of communication; it is actively built up by the cognizing subject. That means, each individual interprets and constructs a reality based on her/his understanding and interactions with her/his surrounding environment.

### ***3.3. The Core Assumptions of the Constructionist Epistemology***

According to Hoffman (cited in Macliam, 2003) in the last decades, a growing body of research in psychology were stimulated by developments of disciplines such as biology, physics,

mathematics and the cognitive discipline recognized due to the general insufficiency of objectivism to be functional to the study of human beings.

### ***3.4. Conclusion***

In maintaining the constructivist view of this study, the assumption is that, the researcher and each participant has a different outlook for viewing one's world and making sense of it. According to Crosby (cited in Macliam, 2003) although each participant's experience is a personal construction of the self, the possibility of reality or interpretation that is shared by a participant and the researcher is not prohibited. Hence, the principle of constructivism underlines that the researcher may influence the story during narration and interpretation process.

Constructivist model is particularly relevant to this study where the experience of trafficked women is told from their own perspective or view. The reality of participants holding back their stories come out in their own way of expression: stories were told through the conversation with the researcher. The focus is more on the content or description of each participant.

### ***3.5. Methodology and Design***

The researcher has employed qualitative techniques with the belief that it provides the most appropriate way of investigating the research questions. According to Denzin and Lincoln (cited in Fouché & Delport, 2011) qualitative research can be regarded as a broad approach which specifies the close connection between the researcher and the subject. For Valentine (cited in Meshesha, 2007) qualitative methodologies explore the feelings, understandings and knowledge of others through interviews and discussions and reward the researcher by offering an in-depth understanding of a particular problem, rather than presenting one with mere numerical

representation of the fact. Hence, it is not the aim of the study to reach one specific conclusion that works for all trafficked victims. However, by depending on first hand information, the study aims to bring into light the untold stories of participants by exposing the major causes and psychosocial aftermath of trafficking.

### ***3.6. Sources of Data***

According to Meshesha (2007) primary data bases are those that have original, unevaluated information containing firsthand knowledge. Another study shows that in the human sciences measurement, instruments can be inter alia, observation of behavior, questionnaires, interviewing schedules and psychological testing. Hence, with regard to the source of data, the primary one will be information gathered from the research participants through face to face interviews (Mouton, 2001).

#### ***3.6.1. Interview Guide.***

According to Denzin and Lincoln (cited in Fouché & Delport, 2011) though there are a variety of techniques that are available for collecting information from primary sources, interview is considered as the most suitable instrument used in qualitative research. Denzin and Lincoln further stated that interview is a rich source of data on people's experience, views, aspirations and thoughts. In this study, interview can be described primarily as a discussion, consisting of a face to face verbal interchange in which the interviewer attempts to draw information or expressions of opinions or beliefs from the interviewee.

According to Kvale (cited in Meshesha, 2007) qualitative research interview strives to comprehend the world from the subjects' point of view, open up the meaning of peoples' experiences and discover their lives prior to the particular situation or events. Holstein and Gubrium (cited in Greeff, 2005) also note that telling stories is important in the meaning making

process, every word that people use in telling their stories is a microcosm of their experience. Holstein and Gubrium further show that all interviews are interactional events and interviewers are deeply and unavoidably implicated in creating meanings that ostensibly reside within participants.

Hence, the researcher has chosen to use in-depth interviews which are highly appropriate to address research questions. To this end, an open-ended interview guide was developed to outline questions which makes sense to participants and is easy to respond to in their own terms, thereby allowing for a cross reference to past studies available in the area of migration (such as Agrinet, 2004; Bezabih, 2008; Meshesha, 2007; Tekle & Belayneh, 2000). The open-ended interview guide was first developed in English and then translated to Amharic, the official language of Ethiopia and the language in which all the participants are comfortable of speaking. A professional proof reader who understands both English and Amharic languages has edited the translation to ensure accuracy. The guide focused on exploring the driving factors that exposes women to trafficking and the related psychosocial aftermath they have faced through the process. Hence, the interview guide encompassed the following main categories:

- Reason for leaving
- Recruitment and travel
- Travel, arrival and means of placement
- Living and working condition
- Means of return
- Aftermath
- Emotional experiences

### ***3.6.2. Validation of Interview Schedule.***

Seidman (cited in Greeff, 2005) points out that the importance of a piloting venture that enables the researcher to evaluate the interviewing process before actual data collection begins. Seidman also shows interviews should first be conducted with a small number of participants to enable the researcher to test the interview schedule and to evaluate any foreseeable problems that may occur, including access, making contact with potential participants and becoming alert to the skills needed during the interviewing process. Hence, after the face validity of the interview guide was considered by dissertation advisors, it was amended and translated to Amharic and then it was tested in one participant. After this pretesting interview the interview guide and the responses from the pilot participant were submitted to the dissertation advisors and final comments and amendments were made on the interview guide. Due to the changes in the final interview guide, the interview with the pilot participant was not included in the analysis of the data.

### ***3.7. Sampling***

Kerlinger (cited in Daleen & Venter, 2002) explains sampling as selecting a number of persons from the population in which the researcher is interested to act as representatives of that population. According to Graziano and Raulin (cited in Daleen & Venter, 2002) the importance of understanding the idea of being representative of a sample and the importance of the researcher's assumption what the researcher observed in the sample would as well be observed in other collection of subjects from the population.

As indicated in the purpose of the study in chapter two, the target population of the study comprises female migrant returnees who first migrated to work as housemaid to Middle East countries who were required to return back to their home for various reasons. The purpose of

their migration was to earn better wages so that they can send remittances to their families in Ethiopia, and hoping that a foreign country would provide them with a better quality of life. According to Endeshaw et al. (2006) there are Ethiopian migrant women who find themselves abroad in exploitative situations where they are abused and ill-treated, in working conditions almost comparable to modern day slavery. The study further noted that these migrants are likely to want to return home by any means possible and in conditions similar to those who are expelled from a particular country.

The specific target population of this study is migrants who fit the description above and can therefore be regarded as victims of human trafficking. There is no exact figure that indicates the number of returnees that have been trafficked and are now residing in Addis Ababa. However, according to an estimation given by T. G. Darge, personal communication, May 10, 2010, about 350 of these victims of trafficking are residing in Addis Ababa.

Purposive sampling was utilized to select appropriate participants. According to Singleton (cited in Daleen & Venter, 2002) this kind of sampling technique is based on a deliberate decision of the researcher and the sample is selected to include the main representative characteristics or distinctive features of the general population. Seidman (cited in Greeff, 2005) recommend that researchers need to consider two criteria for “enough” number of participants. The first one is *sufficiency* when the researcher tries to enquire the number of participants sufficient enough to reflect the assortment of participants that make up the general population, the population represented in the sample might have a chance to connect to the experience of those participating in the research. The second criterion is *saturation* of information in which the researcher reaches the point of having the sense of hearing the same information repetitively and has no longer expects to learn something new. Hence, the researcher has used the principle of

saturation by adding new subjects until the point is reached where the researcher feels that no longer encounters any new information. As a result, the researcher has kept on interviewing participants up to the point where she felt she learn nothing new and five participants were interviewed and the saturation level has been continually evaluated. The research participants were identified from a list of victims of trafficking in Addis Ababa who were identified by International Organization for Migration (IOM) as a result of their applications for assistance between the years 2004 to 2008. Furthermore, the researcher set the following criteria to identify participants of the research within the given period of time:

- The participants need to be all women over the age of eighteen and above.
- Those victims assisted by IOM and involved in group or individual business activities were selected to be involved in the research.
- The researcher approached the women and enquired whether they would be willing to participate in the research. Following the advance confirmation by the women, consent forms were prepared which were signed by all participants.

### ***3.8. Data Collection***

Firstly, the researcher informed the potential participants on the objective of the study and the purpose for which their participation in the study was required. Participants were briefed on the issues of anonymity and confidentiality of the information they would be providing during the interview. Following confirmation of their willingness to participate, participants were requested to sign consent forms. During the interviews that followed, data were recorded on tape. After each interview the information was transcribed. Field notes of the interviews were also made by the researcher during and after the interviews.

The transcribed information was organized into seven main categories. After it was organized into categories the information was translated in to English. Data analysis of this text was performed by using content analysis. Where required, follow up interview interviews were conducted to clarify some information from participants.

### ***3.8.1. Ethical Considerations.***

According to Williams et al., (cited in Strydom, 2005) ethical issues are pervasive and complex for researchers in the social sciences, since data should never be obtained at the expenses of human beings. Similarly, another study recommend the need to consider the ethical principles such as informed and voluntary participation, privacy, anonymity as well as the possibility of feedback on important research findings afterwards for samples of human research participants (Kruger, De Vos, Fouché & Venter, 2005).

Hence, the data collection was carried out in line with research ethics that mainly includes the following:

- Adequate information and explanation was given to all participants about the research, its objectives, methodologies, Actual and potential benefit to various bodies including the institution carrying out the research;
- The informed consent of all participants involved in the research was obtained;
- All participants were informed that they have the right not to take part or withdraw from the research at any stage without any implied deprivation or penalty for their rejection;
- All participants were informed on their right to anonymity and confidentiality of the personal information they give during the interview and the information they give will

be insured by using a code system to refer to the data of specific participants, and not personal names;

- Participants were informed that they have the right to be notified of the research findings;
- In case the participants might need some kind of psychological assistance as the result of their participation in the research, they were informed about the availability of assistance by a local humanitarian organization in Addis Ababa '*Tsotawi Tekat Tekelakay Mahber*' (TTTM), recently renamed 'Association for Women's Sanctuary and Development' (AWSAD) by providing the contact address. AWSAD is an organization working against gender based violence and provides psychosocial support for women in difficult circumstances.

### ***3.9. Data Processing and Analysis***

Babbie (cited in Delport & Fouché, 2005) points out that field oriented study, observation, processing and analyzing data are entwined processes. Karval (cited in Meshesha, 2007) also shows that qualitative methods of analysis focus on the stories told during the interview and works out their structures and their plots which contain a temporal sequence, patterning of happenings. Thus, the researcher has tried to explore the feeling, understanding and experience of participants through in depth interview to determine that it satisfies the research questions and the general purpose of the study. This approach allowed the researcher to explore untold stories of why migrant women end up getting trafficked which hopefully will give new insights and open original ways of understanding the causes and aftermath of trafficked women from Ethiopia.

The data (i.e., the transcribed and translated text) were analyzed and interpreted using content analysis. Based on the text, the data were organized to work out their structures into categories and sub categories of patterns of responses collected including the events and emotional experiences of participants. The script of participants was read and re read a number of times until preliminary categories surfaced.

#### ***3.9.1. Data Interpretation Approach.***

The data in text will be interpreted under the assumption of social constructivism. The researcher is interested in the perception of the victims and how they made sense of their situation and not concerned in what ‘really’ happened.

#### ***3.10. Conclusion***

Generally in this chapter, the researcher has strived to demonstrate the total research process starting from the techniques of data collection, sampling method, data sources and data analysis used in this study.

## CHAPTER 4: RESULTS

The research findings are presented in this chapter. The first part provides the background information of every woman who participated in this study, and in each case this will be followed by a summary of the woman's story. The second part provides descriptions of the major categories and subcategories of themes that were identified, and will comprise examples from the data in verbatim. These examples should be interpreted relative to a caution by Bacvar and Bacvar (cited in Macliam, 2003) to the effect that all aspects of individual experience can only be seen from the point of view of the subject who has experienced the circumstances. Maturana and Varela (cited in Heylighten, 1993) indicated that the construction of reality of each individual is based on the understanding and interaction with his/her surrounding environment. As similar events or experiences may be interrelated in different occurrence, the same examples of verbatim statements might be repeated in different categories.

### *4.1. Case Study one*

This research participant is from the Amhara region, in the central part of Ethiopia and she was living with her parents in Addis Ababa before migration. Her parents had no income, except the monthly pension funds of her father which was less than USD 15 at that time. Her rationale for leaving was to improve her life by taking care of her financial problems. To this end, she travelled to Dubai, the United Arab Emirates, at the age of twenty four. Currently, this woman is twenty six and the interview was conducted after about ten months from her return.

#### **The woman's story**

The interviewee said she used to do a job, earning major income, before her employer moved out of Addis Ababa. Since then she faced a problem: she was unable to pay her school fee. She

dropped out of 9<sup>th</sup> grade and planned to go abroad to get sufficient income to enable her to continue her education and support her parents.

She said she contacted a friend of her mother who had sent her daughter to one of the Arab countries, and she was introduced to the same broker. According to the interviewee, the broker works with her brother who has a private travel agency and he has contacts with individuals in Arab countries.

The woman mentioned that the broker took her passport to process her visa and promised her that she would be working as a waitress in one of the big hotels in Dubai and would receive a generous salary. She added that the broker asked her to pay 7000 Birr (USD 557) in cash as soon as possible. She said, though she wished to ask questions on the legality of the employment, it was not possible for her as she felt intimidated by the broker. She added that there was no chance to negotiate on the amount as the broker wanted the money urgently. She said she obtained the money by borrowing from relatives. Immediately after the payment was made, the broker told her to take a medical exam so that she will be able to fly to Dubai as soon as possible; that is, within few days.

She said the broker arranged her flight from Addis Ababa to Dubai via Djibouti but she was not ready to travel in such a short notice. Nevertheless, the broker convinced her to pack her things get ready for travel in two days.

The interviewee stated that upon her arrival in Dubai, an agent was waiting for her at the airport to pick her up. The agent at the airport then confiscated her passport and transferred her to another agent who took her to a place where migrant women from different countries stayed when they had problem with their employers. She remembered that there was young Ethiopian woman among the group who had been pushed off from the sixth storey of a building by her

employer. The girl sustained a broken leg and the interviewee described how shocked this story was for her. The following morning, she was transferred to a third agent who took her to the house of her new employer.

She said prior to her employment she had not signed any contractual agreement but suspected that she was placed with her employer merely because the employer has asked for a housemaid. She thought that the broker had connection with agents in Dubai and it was not clear to her what kind of agreement the agent in Addis Ababa has with this group of individuals.

In her first day at work, her employer seemed nice and gave her working clothes and a clock. She said in the next morning her employer became very rude, and she was very frightened by the situation in which she found herself. She said that she was expected to do an enormous amount of work, including cooking, making up beds, cleaning many bathrooms and washing the cars parked in the compound. She also noted that she went to bed every day at 3 a.m. in the morning and woke up at 5 a.m. She mentioned that she was given food only once a day and was locked in a room every day after 3:00 p.m. because her female employer was mentally ill. She often acted abnormally, holding a dagger and shouting around for hours. She also recounted that the mentally ill employer beat her up recklessly on her head which caused her to fall down many times. She always asked her employer (the husband) to take her to the agent's office. She said she was then taken to the agent by her male employer, but the agent who placed her with her employer was not there. She said an Ethiopian lady in the office was willing to translate as she could not explain her problem in English. However, the agent was not willing to accept her grievance and sent Case 1 back to her employer.

She added that she was also knocked on her head and soaked by blood from her head which resulted in her fainting. She said she was taken to the agent for the second time; however, the

agent who placed her at her current employer's house was not there again. She noted that the agent in the office has sent her with a new employer, who realized that she was bleeding and took her back to the agent stating that she needs medication before work. She asked the agent to send her home, but the agent refused to let her go home. Instead, the agent threatened her saying, "...if you stop working, you will be arrested due to your illegal status and the debt you owe". Then, she said, he took her to her first employer's house for a third time, after which she was beaten almost every day.

She indicated that the condition was unbearable. Moreover, her employers refused to pay her salary and forced her to continue working regardless of her pain. She lost her appetite due to overwork and lack of proper sleep. She said on the other side, the broker in Addis Ababa kept persuading Case 1's family to convince her to keep working. She stated that she knew that she was deceived when she realized the real living and working condition were utterly different from the promises given by the broker.

The woman frightened her all the time and that convinced her that her life was in danger and she might die any time. She said she was depressed and felt helpless and lonely as she felt there was no one that can help and rescue her from the situation.

She insisted to her employer (the husband) to take her to the agent's office so that she would be sent back to her home. That was a futile attempt as the agent was not available in the office. But she said by the time she was sent back to her employer's house for the fourth time, she was fortunate enough to get a call from her parents from whom she asked for help. Accordingly, prior to that she never had any contact with the Ethiopian Community, Consulate or any other humanitarian organizations there.

Case 1 said that the agent in Dubai finally bought her air ticket and she managed to return home after a lot of suffering due to her continues effort and follow up from her parents. She recalled her family not being happy about her situation as they were expected her to succeed. She said her health was deteriorated and was also worried about the money she owed. The woman described that she had to deal with different issues such as opening a file in court and charging the agent with the legal support from IOM. She mentioned that the broker tried to convince her family to drop the case as they were very poor. She (the agent) even tried to bribe them with money. Case 1 said her family suggested to the broker to cover her medical expenses and pay her compensation for the damage caused. However, she said the broker kept on insisting upon giving her parents 2000 Birr (USD 120) if they drop the case.

However, despite difficulties she faced, she moved ahead with the court case. When ordered to appear before the court, she noted, the broker tried to disappear but was later arrested. But after appearing before court, she recounted, the broker was released on bail. The next time the accused was called upon by the court for a hearing, the person who bailed her (the broker/agent) out appeared and reported that the defendant is dead. But Case 1 knew that she was still alive and well. Case 1 recalled mentioning during the court hearings that the broker always said "...as long as I have my money, I will be safe". Case 1 said it seemed true, and further asked, 'who can protect or stand for the poor?' She said the court proceeding is still underway and stated that she is tired of the process.

She said she has prolonged health problems and was diagnosed with high blood pressure. Due to the serious injuries she suffered on her head and back, her medical expenses were increasing from time to time. She indicated before migration she was concerned about her education and financial problems, but after her return, her life has become complicated as she

has to deal with her health and emotional problem that emanated from her prior overseas' experience.

After her return, she felt hopeless and lonely and do not want to meet her friends and other people she knew before. She was worried about her life. She said she considers herself unfortunate as she was not able to meet expectations of both her parent's and her own.

#### ***4.2. Case Study Two***

She is from Amhara region, central part of Ethiopia. She is from a poor family with her parents still living in the rural area where she was born. She has completed grade 12 and was living with her uncle in Addis Ababa before migrating. She migrated to Abu Dhabi at the age of twenty-nine. Now, she is thirty-four, single and jobless. The woman was interviewed two and half years after her return.

##### **The woman's story**

After completing 12<sup>th</sup> grade, she could not find a job. Therefore, as promised by her cousin, she planned to go to Dubai. She mentioned considering migration as a better opportunity to improve her life and support her parents. She said she expected to work as a baby sitter with a good salary.

She said her cousin had told her that she would get her a job in Dubai, so she had to get a passport and get ready to travel. She got her passport ready and started waiting for her cousin to send her air ticket and process her visa. She said her cousin had promised her that she would be working as a baby sitter in Dubai. She recounted her direct flight to Dubai and her cousin telling her someone will be waiting for her at the airport.

Upon her arrival, she noticed that no one had shown up. She said after waiting for hours, she became worried and called her cousin for help. Her cousin still insisted that someone would be there to pick her up. She was haunted with the thought that no one would come to pick her up. Later, however, an employer came and took her to Abu-Dhabi without any formal process undertaken.

She arrived at her employer's house and started her job which often lasted until mid night. She said when things were not done as perfectly as requested, her employer (the wife) would shout at her. She mentioned that although she tried to work fast and finish early assuming she would have more rest, she was always given additional work to do. Her employers forced her to stay all night long and serve them with food and drink. She said, "My employer thought that I can work like a machine that functions 24 hours". She also mentioned that after she served for ten months, the agent in Dubai told her that her cousin had become seriously sick and was expelled back home. In addition to the work she had at her employers', she was then forced by her agent to cover her cousin's place.

Although she started serving two employers, she says both her employers refused to pay her salary. After this time she realized that everything has gone wrong. She noted that she was not expecting such things to happen to her. At that time, she only thought that the work might be too much but it never crossed her mind that she would be forced to work for two employers for nothing. She stated she was confused and did not know what to do as she realized that her employer and the agent will not help her. She also had no contact with any humanitarian organization.

Case 2 said when both her employers refused to pay her salary; she got depressed, became unhappy, felt helpless and used to cry every day. She noted that she was worried about the health

condition of her cousin and started to fear that she might also get like her. Case 2 recalls that by the time her cousin got sick and as her condition did not improve, her employer started beating her up, as she was not able to work. After some time her cousin became extremely sick and was not able to eat and speak and that resulted in her deportation.

Case 2 mentioned that she asked her employer to give her passport back, a request to which the employer refused. Instead, her employer took her passport to the Immigration Authority in Abu-Dhabi, and that made her travel difficult. Case 2 said by the time she was puzzled on how to get help, she dared to ask her employer to let her call her brother living in the United States. She said her employer was willing to call her brother who then gave her the contact address of an Ethiopian woman living in Dubai who would help her to return home.

She said the Ethiopian woman bought a ticket and sent it to her through a member of the Ethiopian Community in Dubai. She noted that the person from the Ethiopian Community acted as if he was actually from the Ethiopian Embassy in Saudi Arabia (at that time there was no Ethiopian Embassy in Dubai). Because of that the employer allowed Case 2 to leave with the delegate. As soon as she arrived in Dubai airport, the Ethiopian woman who came with her explained the situation to the immigration officials at the airport and she (the woman) gave the officials her own passport as a guarantee that Case 2 would board a plane.

Case 2 recalls that everything was even frustrating after her return. She said she felt that her relatives and the people in the neighborhood might not understand what kind of hardship she had gone through. She was also worried about the attitude of some people in the community based on certain assumptions that they have about what some migrants might have been doing in the Arab countries. She felt that people might think she was engaged in prostitution and became worried that her social interaction would be affected. She noted that she has seen many women run away

from their employers for different reasons, become prostitutes and send money to their families. However, she said they never tell anyone how they got the money fearing the stigma. Thus, she stated they all pretend as if they are doing well.

The woman described that things were difficult for her to start her life again. She explained that before migration, her main challenge was financial problem, but after her return, she said she needed financial and emotional support and she stated that she was looking for help. She said she even thought of re-migrating, but she has now changed her mind. She mentioned contacting Gemenaye Association Ethiopia (GAE) which referred her to IOM for assistance. She said she was provided with financial grant, counseling and medical assistance. She said she was working in a private enterprise for some time but has no job at the moment.

### ***4.3. Case Study Three***

She is from Addis Ababa and she used to live with her parents before migration. Her father had no job and her mother was working as a petty trader. She migrated to Beirut at the age of twenty-six. Currently, she is thirty-one, single and working as a baby sitter. The interview with this respondent was conducted about two years after her return.

#### **The woman's story**

The woman said, after she completed 12<sup>th</sup> grade, she was not able to find a job. So, to improve her life and support her mother who was working on the street as a petty trader, she had to leave the country. Beside her own interest, the promise given by the broker and seeing that her friend's sister sending money to her parents from abroad were enough encouragements. She said her friend has introduced her with the same broker that her sister has gone through to one of the Arab countries.

She said that she was convinced by a broker who promised that she would get a good job and attractive salary and she considered that it was an opportunity that should not be missed. To process the travel, she was asked by the broker to pay 14,000 Birr in two phases. She said that she agreed to pay 6000 Birr (equivalent to USD 478) first and pay the remaining 8000 Birr (equivalent to USD 637) from her salary. She paid the money which her parents have borrowed. She mentioned that the broker wished to get the money in cash and no receipt was given in return as the agent insisted that she has to trust him. The broker took her passport and told her to get ready travel at any time.

She indicated that her trip to Beirut was arranged via Egypt and there were other Ethiopian women traveling with her who had arrangements with agents as she did. After her arrival, an agent was waiting at Beirut airport. He took her passport and the other's. She recalled being taken by the agent with the group of women to a place that looks more like a prison with a bad smell. In the waiting place, there were many Ethiopians crying and shouting. They were not allowed to go out and it was a situation which she recalls as shocking. In the waiting place, she added, employers came and discussed with the agent and took someone among the women. The next day, an employer came and took her to his house without any written or verbal agreement. But, she presumes that as the agent and her employer were discussing they might have agreed on certain conditions regarding her employment.

She said she was not expecting such a heavy workload. And as it turned out, she noted she was not able to cope with the work and the weather condition. Few weeks later, she asked her employer to take her to the agent's office, a request which her employer accepted. However, the agent refused to send her home claiming that she owed him some money. So, he (the agent) took her to a new employer. She recalled that her new employer had a large family: her new employer

had many children but no wife. She said he constantly tried to sexually harass her while his daughter beat her for no reason. She found it difficult to convince both not to mistreat her. After some time, she stated she was sick due to the overload she was bearing and lack of rest. She recalls that she was tempted to run away, but refrained due to fear of being caught by police or end up in detention center, something that might be worse than the life she had with her employer. Months later, she asked her employer for her wage, but he refused. She kept working for three years, being tolerant to the excessive work she was expected to do and obedient to every order she was given.

She said she was worried of being sexually assaulted by her employer and being beaten by the daughter of her employer, a situation which made her unhappy and emotionally unstable. Case 3 said that at this stage she tried to connect her situation to the first scene she had at the airport, when many distressed migrant workers were shouting for help. She recalls considering that she has then realized something had gone wrong from the very beginning. One day, she got the opportunity of going to a mall with her employer, in which time she called the agent via public phone and asked him to send her home. The agent then asked the employer to buy her a return ticket. Her employer, however, responded that he would pay for her air ticket only if she reimbursed him the medical expense he has paid for her. She said she agreed on his idea and her employer bought her air ticket and gave her only her one-year salary but refused her payment for her two-year service.

In addition to the frustration and emotional problems she already experienced, she stated that the death of both her parents caused her so much grief. She said she was confused and did not know what to do. Her sisters and the neighborhood were expecting money from her, but she was still indebted. Hence, she said, she looked for assistance and contacted Gemenaye Ethiopia

Association (GEA), an organization that helps victims of human trafficking. With the reference letter she was given by GEA, she was able to get financial support and counseling service from IOM. She indicated that before migration, she had no income but had never been exposed to such emotional and health problems. She said had she not got the assistance from IOM, her life could have been worse than the present. She is currently working as a baby sitter.

#### ***4.4. Case Study Four***

Case 4 is from Tigray region, the northern part of Ethiopia. She is married and has two children. Case 4 and her husband were forced to leave Eritrea and come to Addis Ababa after the country broke away from Ethiopia in 1991. She has completed grade 12 and migrated to Beirut at the age of twenty-seven. She is thirty five, divorced and jobless. The woman was interviewed three and half years after her return.

##### **The woman's story**

She said both she and her husband had no income to support themselves and their children after they were displaced from Eritrea. She looked for a job, but she found it hard to get any. She said it was her husband who proposed to her the idea of her going abroad like other women and she accepted the idea as the best option. She thought this will change her life and enable her to raise her children and buy her own house. She was also planning of sending money to her husband regularly to accomplish her mission. All communications regarding her travel arrangements were done by her husband and his friend. She said she had no contact with the broker and claimed that she had not even seen him.

The broker asked her husband if they could pay him 7000 Birr (equivalent to USD 1000 at that time) to process her travel. She noted that the agent had told her husband that he would get

her a good job where she would work only eight hours a day and earn USD 150 per month. Her husband paid half of the total amount by selling their household stuffs and borrowed some money from relatives. Her husband agreed to pay the remaining amount starting from the first month of her salary.

The broker took her passport to get her a visa and a direct flight from Addis Ababa to Beirut was arranged. Upon arrival, an employer was waiting at the airport. She confiscated her passport and took her without any written agreement. She suspected there might have been some kind of agreement between her employer (a female) and the broker in Addis Ababa.

She said the working condition and the relationship with her employer were very bad right from the beginning. The working hour was not as promised by the broker: she ended up working 18 to 20 hours a day. Her employer was not willing to pay USD 150 as promised by the broker. She decided to accept what her employer had to offer her (USD 100 per month) and kept quiet for years. She was afraid of being deported without having her salary. Her employer was forcing her to work day and night restlessly. During weekends, her employer took her to her own friends and relatives so that she would work for them too. When she asked for her salary, her employer insulted and harassed her.

She said she did not realize that she was deceived until she saw her working condition and the broken promises. Her employer paid her three-years salary and deducted USD 500 claiming, she broke some equipments. She continued working for another five years and her employer said to her, 'I will give you your salary when you are ready to go home'. She then called the broker in Addis Ababa without the consent of her employer and asked him for help. The broker said he was only responsible for the first three years. She further contacted the Ethiopian Consulate in Beirut but failed to get help. She finally realized that she had no other option other than waiting

until the end. Sometime later, she got seriously ill. She was distressed and felt hopeless and with no one to the rescue.

She got sick and was admitted to hospital for free medical service, but there was no improvement on her health condition. She stated that she was not able to move her legs and her right hand. She was told by the doctor that she had heart problem. She noted that she does not really know what had happened to her in the medical center as she was unconscious. She still suspects that something had happened to her in the hospital. She also rose about the experience of other migrant women in the Arab countries who were victims of organ removal. She could not remember on how she returned back home as she was not fully conscious and was occupying a space that would have been a seat for 3 people in the aircraft. She presumed her employer had possibly contacted the Ethiopian Consulate in Beirut to send her home.

She said upon her arrival, her husband got angry when he looked her condition and said to her: 'Get out of my house and I don't know who you are'. From that day on, Case 4 said she wished if she could hide for some time so that she would not to see any human being. She also expressed her fear of being killed by her husband. She said the response of her husband has made her develop negative attitude towards any human being.

She mentioned she was in need of support. She then heard about IOM's assistance and she was screened as a victim of human trafficking. She said she has been provided with medical, counseling and financial assistance. She felt better and has now opened a small cultural dress shop and started leading a normal life; however, she stated that her husband frequently come to her shop and threatens to kill her. She expressed that one day he came out of nowhere and threw an iron rod but missed her and hit the wall. Since then, Case 4 has become frustrated by the

aggression of her husband and she took the matter to the court with the help of the Ethiopian Women Lawyers Association /EWLA/. She now has her divorce paper after a long process.

She explained that she has now stopped working because her shop got robbed and she was not able to pay the rent. The challenges she had faced after her return are enormous than the financial problem she had before migration. She said she has lost what she had and ended up with health, social and emotional problems. She said currently, she is not able to work due to health problems. She said she is separated from her kids and is living alone in a rented tiny room with no income for her living and to pay her house rent.

#### ***4.5. Case Study Five***

Case 5 is from the Oromiya region, South West of Ethiopia. She is from a poor family and dropped out of 8<sup>th</sup> grade due to financial problem. She was living with her parents in Addis Ababa before migration. She migrated to Beirut at the age of nineteen. She is now twenty-three, single and on process to re-migrate to Kuwait. The woman was interviewed about two and a half years after her return from Beirut.

#### **The woman's story**

She mentioned she was supporting her parents since childhood by selling roasted beans on the street as her father has retired and her mother is a housewife. She attended school in the evening while working at the daytime. She remembers that it was difficult for her to handle both her job and her education. She then realized this will not change her life and she decided to stop her education and started working as daily laborer with a plan of saving money for her travel. Thus, she planned to go abroad to improve her life and support her parents. She said though she

knows women who were working abroad, the promise given by the broker influenced her more to decide working abroad.

Case 5 explained that she processed her travel through a broker, a man she met on her way who pledged to help her get work abroad. But, she said she did not know the broker before and where he lives. Sometime later, she met him again in her working area and he asked her to pay him 4000 Birr (equivalent to USD 318) to process her travel. She further added that the broker had also asked her to sign an agreement stating that he is her uncle. She mentioned that he said if she was not willing to sign, she would not get the job he promised her. Also, after she signed the agreement, the broker promised her that he will escort her to the destination country. She explained she did not negotiate on the amount and merely accepted everything he said as she presumed going abroad was the best option for her. She paid him 4000 birr (USD 318 at that time) in cash, taking loan with high interest rate which was in addition to what she had saved.

The broker arranged her travel (direct flight from Addis Ababa to Beirut), but he did not escort her as he promised. Upon arrival, she said the son of her employer picked her up from the airport and took her to his house. She mentioned she had made no agreement with her employer, but the arrangement she had with the broker in Addis Ababa was binding.

When she arrived at the house of the employer, she realized that the house was very big and people came from different places for worship or witchcraft kind of activities. She noted that her working condition was completely different from what she has expected.

She described her daily routine as preparing coffee and tea for all the guests and facilitating everything needed by her employer (a woman). She had to stay all night long while her employer does the witchcraft to the guests. She stated that her employer forced her to stay until 2:00 am in the morning, given small rice with cup of milk a day and was expected to serve day and night.

She remembers taking some acidic substance wishing to kill her, but fainted for some time. Her weight and health was deteriorating day after day and she was 60 Kg when she left Ethiopia and became 35 Kg during her stay with her employer. She served her employer for seven months with no payment. After looking at the situation she was in, Case 5 realized that she was deceived by the broker. She said she understands that the trafficker was only concerned about his own advantage and did not really care about her.

She was very frightened with her employer's practices, which Case 5 states as very unusual and intolerable. At the end, she felt sad and hopeless when she knew her employer was not willing to pay her salary. She was confused and did not know what to do as she has no contact of any humanitarian organization or the Ethiopian Consulate in Beirut. She stated she felt hopeless and sad on the situation and regretted of her decision of migrating.

She said she cannot remember what happened in the last days of her stay with her employer. The only thing she knew was her serious illness. She described that due to her sickness and being underweight, her employers might have gotten frightened in case she would die in their house. Due to the anticipated reason, the son of her employer might have possibly contacted the Ethiopian Consulate in Beirut to send her home.

She said she felt very sad and hopeless and her life got worse than before her migration. She said she felt disappointed as her plans did not come true and was not able to meet her expectations. She mentioned, when she tried to explain to her parents about the suffering she had been through, they said it would have been better if she kept working by being patient and tolerating everything. Moreover, she said she was worried and frustrated as the people in her neighborhood have heard that she has mental problem. A few days later, her parent took her to a church for treatment and rest.

Case 5 said she started thinking of how to live her life and has thought of asking the broker to give her money back. However, she said she later dropped the idea as she does not know the whereabouts of the broker and does not have evidence that shows she gave him the money. Case 5 further stated that the problem she had before migration was financial constraint, but now she has even more problems: she said she has lost her money, her health and emotional stability and needs some help. She mentioned the financial support provided by IOM has helped her to work in a joint business undertaking of distributing soft drinks. However, after a year and eight months, the business closed down due to lack of space. Currently, she has no job and is on process to re-migrate to Kuwait.

#### ***4.6. Categories for Analysis***

The transcribed interviews with the five women and field notes made during and after the interviews were used as raw materials for the process of identifying specific themes. Working from the overall research question, significant units of meaning were identified and grouped into seven categories or themes. The categories were created in terms of the major aspects explored in this study, namely:

- Category one: Reason for leaving
- Category two: Recruitment and travel
- Category three: Travel, arrival and means of placement
- Category four: Living and working condition
- Category five: Means of return
- Category six: Aftermath
- Category seven: Emotional experiences

The above assigned categories will further be subdivided into subcategories. For each of these, the criteria used in creating the subcategories will be listed. It will indicate what is included within each subcategory and this will be followed by a descriptive account that reflects the data as well as verbal examples from the same source to show how the conclusions were derived from the recorded data. In some cases, the examples might be recurring in different categories since the occurrence may be related to diverse phenomena.

#### ***4.6.1. Reasons for Leaving.***

The following subcategories were identified concerning the reason why the research participants left their country, their plans, perceived expectations and the role of others in decision making:

- Plans and expectations
- Decision making process

##### ***4.6.1.1. Plans and expectations.***

**Criteria:** Any remarks given as a reason for leaving the country and reasons indicated as the three subsequent alternatives are included in this subcategory: financial problem, lack of job opportunity, seeking for better opportunity to support oneself and family.

**Description:** All the women in the study mentioned that when they faced financial problem and lack of job opportunity, then they were thought of migrating and mentioned these as the core factors for leaving. All women in the five cases indicted that they had plans and expectations of improving their life, support their family and were expecting things to go according to their plans.

The following verbatim examples show how the women expressed their plan for leaving:

“I was not able to pay my school fee as my parents did not have the financial capacity to support me. I had no choice! I had to work abroad and earn some money to continue my education” (Case 1).

“Since I have completed 12<sup>th</sup> grade, I could not find a job and then I decided to go to one of the Arab countries to improve my life and support my parents” (Case 2).

“I have decided to work abroad because; I want to support my mother who works on the street as a petty trader” (Case 3).

“My husband and I had no income after we were displaced from Eritrea during the war between Ethiopia and Eritrea in 1991. I have tried to get a job but did not find any, it is hard!” (Case 4).

“So, I was supporting my parents since my childhood by selling roasted beans on the street and attending school at the evening class. ...then, I realized this will not change my life and decided to work abroad to improve my life” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.1.2. Decision Making Process.***

**Criteria:** This category refers to statements regarding the role of other people in the women’s decision to migrate. This includes promises given by brokers, friends, family members and relatives working abroad and within Ethiopia.

**Description:** All women in the five cases indicted that the false promises of brokers of attractive jobs has influenced them to decide to work abroad. The woman in Case 1 has indicated that she was influenced by the promising words of the broker. Case 2 and Case 3 mentioned that beside their own interest of migrating, relatives, women they know and friends who are working abroad

have encouraged them to decide upon migrating to the Arab nations. Case 4 stated that her husband and his friend had significant role in her decision on working abroad.

For example:

“...The broker has promised me that I will work as a waitress in one of the big hotels in Dubai ...” (Case 1)

“My cousin has promised me that I will work as a babysitter in Dubai” (Case 2).

“...The broker has persuaded me how my life will be changed if I work abroad and I thought it is an opportunity that should not be missed” (Case 3).

“The broker has told my husband that he will get me a good job with monthly payment of USD 150” (Case 4).

“...The promise given by the broker has influenced me to decide to go abroad in shorter period of time” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.2. Recruitment and Travel Arrangement.***

The following subcategories were identified concerning the means of contacts with brokers or agents and negotiation made with agents on money transfer and arrangement for travel.

Means of contact with brokers

Negotiation with brokers

##### ***4.6.2.1. Means of contact with brokers.***

**Criteria:** Any comment indicating means of contact with brokers that includes cases where brokers were contacted by friends, family, relatives and by oneself.

**Description:** Cases 1, 2, 3, 4 of the women in the study have contacted brokers through friends, relatives and family members. Case 5 said she met a broker who sends people abroad.

The following verbatim examples show how the women contacted the brokers or agents:

“The friend of my mother has introduced me to the broker that her daughter had used to go abroad” (Case 1).

“My cousin living in Dubai has arranged my travel” (Case 2).

“My friend has introduced me with the broker who sends people abroad” (Case 3).

“The friend of my husband has told my husband that he will arrange my travel if we are able to pay 7000 Birr...” (Case 4).

“One day, I met a broker who sends people to Arab Countries...”  
(Case 5).

#### ***4.6.2.2. Negotiation with brokers.***

**Criteria:** Any comment that refers to the process of negotiation with brokers and explanation given for this process. The following three alternatives are included in this subcategory: promise given by brokers, money transfer from the women to brokers and reasons for transferring the money.

**Description:** All the five women in the study mentioned that they were given false promises of attractive jobs and good payment by the brokers and/or relatives. Case 1 indicated that a broker was working with her brother who has a legitimate travel business enterprise. Cases 1, 3, 4 and 5 paid money in cash to brokers who claimed that the money would be used to cover the women’s travel costs.

For Example:

“...the broker has promised me that I will be working as a waitress in one of the big hotels in Dubai and asked me to pay 7000 Birr equivalent to USD 557 in cash” (Case 1).

“My cousin has promised me that I will work as a babysitter in Dubai” (Case 2).

“Then the broker asked me to give him 14000 Birr in two phases to process my travel and I had paid him 6000 Birr equivalent to USD 478 at that time as a first payment and agreed to pay the rest from my salary on monthly bases” (Case 3).

“The broker has told my husband that he will get me a good job with monthly payment of USD 150 and I will be working only eight hours a day” (Case 4).

“After I paid him the money, he asked me to sign an agreement that he is my uncle and warned me if I refused to sign, I will not get the job he has promised me” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.3. Travel, Arrival and Means of Placement.***

The following subcategories were identified concerning ways of travelling to the destination, conditions at arrival and means of placement to employment:

- Travel arrangement
- Conditions at arrival
- Means of placement

##### ***4.6.3.1. Travel arrangement.***

All the five women traveled by air with a valid passport to show.

**Criteria:** Any explanations given as expression of travel arrangement by brokers or relatives are included. Explanations include the four alternatives: direct travel to the destination, travel by transit, and travel with a group of others and promised to be escorted.

**Description:** All the five women in the study mentioned that they traveled by themselves. The women in Cases 2, 4 and 5 traveled by direct flight to destination countries and the women in Cases 1 and 3 traveled with transit via Djibouti and Egypt respectively with special arrangement of the brokers. Case 3 said she traveled via Egypt with other group of migrants to Beirut. Case 5 stated that the broker promised her that she would be escorted to the destination but she said the broker has changed his mind.

For Example:

“A Few days later, the broker arranged my trip to Dubai through Ethiopian airlines via Djibouti” (Case 1).

“My travel was arranged with a direct flight to Dubai (Case 2).

“My trip to Beirut was arranged via Egypt and that was the only stopover. There were other migrant women traveling with me to Beirut” (Case 3).

“My travel was arranged with direct flight to Beirut” (Case 4).

“After I signed the agreement, I thought the broker would be going with me as promised but he didn’t” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.3.2. Conditions at arrival.***

Lebanon and United Arab Emirates UAE are the destination countries where the research participants were placed as migrant workers.

**Criteria:** Any explanation given that shows how the women were received upon arrival at the airport, transferred to another agent, their passport had been confiscated and condition of airport pickups are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the five women mentioned that their passports were confiscated by immigration officers, agents or employers upon their arrival. Regarding reception, Case 3 has stated the agents had taken her to a place that looks like a prison filled with migrant women crying for help but not being allowed to go out. Case 1 further indicated that she was transferred from one agent to another. Case 2 stated that she was picked up from the airport after long hours of stay by an agent through the contact of her cousin. Case 4 and Case 5 were picked up by anticipated employers directly from the airport.

For Example:

“After I arrived at the airport, an agent was waiting for me. He took my passport and transferred me to another agent who took me to a place where migrant women stayed when they have conflict with their employers. I remember one young Ethiopian thrown from the sixth floor by her employer and her leg was broken. The next morning, I was transferred again to a third agent who took me to my employer’s house” (Case 1).

“... After my arrival at Dubai air port, I have expected my cousin has arranged someone to pick me up but there was no one. I was worried...” (Case 2).

“As soon as we arrived at Beirut airport, the agent took our passport. I saw many Ethiopians were crying and shouting and the

whole situation was shocking for me. Then, we were taken to a dreadful place which looks like a prison and we were not allowed to go out” Case 3).

“... An employer was waiting at the airport and as soon as she met me, she took my passport and we went together to her house” (Case 4).

“Up on my arrival in Beirut, the son of my employer picked me up from the airport and kept my passport with him” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.3.3. Means of placement.***

**Criteria:** All the comments about the actual placement of women with employers, any anticipated agreement between employers and agents and women’s perception of placement are included in this category.

**Description:** All the five women expressed that they had no formal agreement with employers before their departure or upon their arrival. All the women had the perception that the brokers in Addis Ababa had some kind of connection and agreement with the agents or employers in the country of destination, about which they had not been aware of. The women in Case 1 and Case 3 thought that the agents in the destination merely placed women upon the request from employers. Case 2 indicated that her cousin had contact with the broker in Abu-Dhabi. The women in Case 4 and Case 5 stated that they were placed based on an arrangement made between the broker in Addis Ababa and the employer in the destination.

#### ***4.6.4. Working and Living Condition.***

The following subcategories were identified concerning the living and working condition of the women: overwork, withholding wages, deduction of wages, restriction of movement,

communication, food deprivation, denial of medical treatment, physical and emotional mistreatment and sexual harassment.

#### ***4.6.4.1. Overwork.***

**Criteria:** Any comments given by the women indicating overwork, being forced to work without a break, being forced to work for another (additional) employer such as employers' friends and relatives are included in this subcategory:

**Description:** All the five women complained that they were expected to work without a break and were forced to stay in the work environment until after midnight. They also had to get up early and were obliged to finish all the housework without having a break. Case 1 stated the house chores that she was expected to do was enormous and she had to stay overnight. Case 2 mentioned that she was forced by her agent to serve two employers living in different locations and she said she had no rest at all. Case 3 mentioned that her right hand started to get numb due to overwork. Case 4 stated that she was forced to work between 18-20 hours a day without a break and she also indicated that her employer was taking her to work for her friends and relatives as well. Case 5 expressed she was serving her employers day and night without a break.

For Example:

“I was forced to work the entire house chores including cooking, making up beds, cleaning many bathrooms and washing cars. Every day I went to bed at 3 a.m. in the morning and woke up at 5:00 a.m. and I had little time to sleep and rest” (Case 1).

“...The agent forced me that I should work for the family my cousin used to work for in addition to the work I was already doing. Their house was a walking distance from my first

employer's house. And I was expected to go and work every day. In this way, I have served both my employers for about five months..." (Case 2).

"I had no rest at all and after some time, my right hand started to get numb and I had difficulty washing clothes..." (Case 3).

"... I was working 18-20 hours a day and my employer takes me to her friend's and relatives' house so that I get to work for them during weekends. I was asking myself 'how can a person survive working like this without rest for many years?'" (Case 4).

"My employer has forced me to work the whole day and until 2 a.m. after mid night and I was not allowed to take a break during the weekends or even in a month time" (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.4.2. Withholding, denial and deduction of wages.***

**Criteria:** Any comments given by the women reflecting denial of their salary, working without payment, salary being withheld and partial deduction of amounts not agreed upon from their salaries are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the five women mentioned that employers withheld their salaries as a means of keeping them working. Case 1, 2 and 5 mentioned that though they regularly reminded their employers to give them their salaries, the employers refused to pay their wages. The research participant referred to as Case 3 also indicated that she had worked for three years, but her employer paid her for a single year only and was not willing to pay the remaining, claiming the rest as reimbursement of medical expense made to the woman. Case 4 indicated that her salary was reduced from USD 150 to USD 100 and she claimed that USD 500 was deducted from her

salary over three years as a compensation for broken equipments. She also said that her employer had denied her five years worth of her salary after withholding it for years.

For Example:

“...I had never imagined this will happen to me. I had a plan to continue my education, but I have wasted almost three years for nothing...” (Case 1).

“...You can imagine what I feel; I was exploited for a year and two months serving two employers for nothing!” (Case 2).

“All in all, I didn’t get what I expected. No money, no improvement but now it is too late” (Case 3).

“...When I asked my employer to pay my salary, she always says: ‘I will give you all your money when you are ready to go home’” (Case 4).

“After working day and night without rest and enough food for seven months they were not willing to pay my salary” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.4.3. Restriction of movement, food deprivation and denial of medical treatment.***

**Criteria:** Any remarks given by the women implicitly or explicitly indicating a restriction of movement, confinement, a lack of communication with agents and families, deprivation of sufficient food and the denial of health treatment are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the five women reported that employers restricted their movement and forced them to remain confined in the houses of their employers. They were not allowed to communicate with their families or seek help from agents or from other sources. The women in Cases 1 and 5 said that their employers denied them adequate food and medical treatment and

that they experienced health problems. The research participants claimed that they were denied medical treatment when they were sick and in some cases health treatment was delayed until they collapsed. For example, the women in Cases 1, 4 and 5 reported that they did not get medical treatment on time. Case 3 stated that her health treatment was greatly delayed. For example, the woman in Case 1 said that she was beaten by her employer and although she was bleeding, she did not get any assistance, neither from her employer nor from the agent. She said the agent gave her a tablet that had not been prescribed by a physician and was not helpful at all. The woman in Case 4 said she became ill but had to remain without medical assistance for more than four years. The woman in Case 5 said she was not given any medical assistance by her employers until she experienced a loss of weight and finally fainted.

For Example:

“I had pain in my head and was unable to pick up things from the ground. I had no medical treatment and not enough food to eat. After that they took me to the agent for the second time, the agent who placed me to my employer was not there and the agent in the office decided to send me with new employer without getting me medical treatment. But, the new employer have seen that I am bleeding and took me back to the agent and explained that I need medication before being hired. Imagine! It has been three days without food and then the Ethiopian agent came and tried to convince me that my employer’s behavior would improve and gave me a tablet which was not prescribed by a physician and I was getting weaker day after day (Case 1).

“... I have faced such a horrifying thing behind the closed doors of my employer’s house and nobody knew...I missed my family and didn’t communicate with any one since I came to Abu-Dhabi” (Case 2).

“...The only way I could get out of the house was if I went with them on Sundays to visit their friends and relatives” (Case 3).

“Finally, due to lack of rest and sleep, I was seriously sick and admitted to hospital. But, there was no improvement on my health and was not able to move one of my legs and my right hand...I was suffering! ... I was not allowed to go home” (Case 4).

“I was serving day and night without rest and had no sleep at all. My employers did not give me enough food to eat. I was given a small amount of rice and a cup of milk a day and nothing more and I was getting weaker and weaker...I had no contact with any one, my parents, Ethiopian Embassy, no one!” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.4.4. Physical and emotional mistreatment and sexual harassment.***

**Criteria:** Any comments given by the women reflecting physical abuse (e.g. beating), being shouted at, being pressured to work harder as well as sexual harassment are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All five women reported that they were beaten and /or insulted and experienced being shouted at or had been pressured to work harder by employers or family members of the employers. Case 1 reported that she was beaten by her employer and Case 2 said her employer had frequently shouted at her and pressured her to work harder. Case 3 has reported that she was

repeatedly exposed to sexual harassment by her employer. Case 4 has mentioned that her employer had shouted at her and insulted her on a regular basis.

For example:

“...I was beaten by my employer almost every day...I was humanly incapable of taking any more of the beating” (Case 1).

“My employer expected me to work until midnight and sometimes even later than that. When everything is not done perfectly, she shouts at me and pushes me to work harder. She thinks that I am like a machine that can work 24 hours” (Case 2).

“It was terrible! My male employer used to frequently come to where I sleep in the middle of the night and ask me to have sex with him. He would try to convince me and constantly bothered me by saying ‘if you have sex with me, you can call your family and I will provide you with everything you need’. However, no matter what he said, I refused to have sex with him” (Case 3).

“When I asked for my salary, they used to insult and harass me and then I accepted the situation and became silent for years. I was frustrated and was feeling helpless. I feel that I am less than normal; I do not feel that I am normal” (Case 4).

“When I asked for my salary, no one was responding and my employer just ignored me” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.5. Means of Return.***

The following subcategories were identified concerning the moment when the participants became aware that they had been deceived, their means of being enabled to leave and the actual process of leaving the working place.

- Awareness of being deceived
- Ways and means utilized to convince employers and agents to send them
- Home or contact their families for help
- The actual process of leaving the working place

##### ***4.6.5.1. Awareness of being deceived.***

**Criteria:** Any comment given by the women showing insight that they had been deceived by the false promises including instances where the women had been forced by the agent to work for more than one employer; where they found that their existing situation had become confusing and they ended up with no assistance; when employers had not been willing to pay wages; and, when they had realized that brokers work for their own advantage are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the five women reported that at some point they had realized that they had been deceived by the brokers. Some of the women realized that they were deceived when they saw that their working and living condition were not what they had been led to expect. The point in time when they realized that they had been deceived varies from one case to the other. For example, Case 1 realized that something was wrong when the agent refused to acknowledge the problem she had with her employer. Case 2 recognized that something was wrong when the agent in Dubai forced her to work for two employers and her employers refused to pay her wage. Case 3 indicated that her working conditions confirmed her suspicions which had been aroused

by what she had seen at the airport, where many distressed migrant workers had been shouting for help. Case 4 mentioned that she had been deceived because her working hours was extended to more than 8 hours a day and her salary had been reduced from USD 150 to USD 100. Case 5 realized that she had been deceived by the broker when she saw her workload and living conditions.

Examples:

“Imagine! It has been three days without food and then the Ethiopian agent came and he tried to convince me that, my employer’s behavior will improve...” (Case 1).

“I was promised to work as a baby sitter but I ended up doing . . . all other house chores” (Case 2).

“I remembered the situation I saw at the airport, where many distress migrant workers were shouting for help that was similar with my situation and I thought something had gone wrong at the beginning” (Case 3).

“The broker in Ethiopia had promised me that I will be working eight hours a day which was not true. But, I was working 18-20 hours a day and my employer took me to her friend’s and relatives’ house to work for them during weekends. ....then I realized the promises given by the broker were not true and full of deception” (Case 4).

“But what I faced was completely different from what I have expected. ... I now understand that the trafficker was running after his own advantage and did not really care about me” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.5.2. Ways and means utilized to resolve problems.***

**Criteria:** Any comments given by the women reflecting the ways and means that were utilized to resolve their problems. Asking the agents to send them home, begging employers to give their salaries, asking for help from employers to contact family members, looking for help from Ethiopian Embassies in the country of destination and being unable to seek help are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the five women reported that they had been in need of help and had wished to get some kind of assistance from agents, employers, family members and Ethiopian Embassies in the counties of destination.

For example, the woman in Case 1 was fortunate to get a call from her parents at the time the agent had refused to send her home and she said she asked her parent over the phone to send her an air ticket. Case 2 explained that she had dared to ask her employer to help her in calling her brother living in the United States (US). She said she had asked her brother to send her an air ticket and her brother had given her the contact number of an Ethiopian women living in Dubai to facilitate her return. Case 3 indicated that she had made use of the opportunity when she went to a mall with her employer and called the agent to ask sent her home. Case 4 had asked the broker in Addis Ababa for help but with no success. She said she had also contacted the Ethiopian Embassy in Beirut but had received no help. Case 5 mentioned that she was confused with the condition she found herself in. She said she had not been able to look for help as she had

no contact address of any humanitarian organization nor that of the Ethiopian Consulate in Beirut.

#### ***4.6.5.3. The actual process of leaving the working place.***

**Criteria:** Any comments given by the women reflecting how they managed to return, received assistance and faced challenges with employers and agents are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** Cases 1, 2, 3 and 4 reported that they had tried their best to leave but, the employers and agents had resisted their request to send them home. Employers and agents had utilized different means to prevent the women from leaving. The women indicated that the major challenge was that their salaries had been withheld. Case 1 has expressed that her continued appeals to the agent to send her home and the follow up by her parent had helped her to leave. Case 2 has mentioned that the Ethiopian woman whom her brother has given her contact number had sent her an air ticket through a delegate of the Ethiopian community in Dubai and this delegate had acted as if he was from Ethiopian Embassy in Saudi Arabia. She said that for this reason her employer had allowed her to leave with the delegate to Dubai suspecting that the delegate was a high official. When she arrived at Dubai airport, the Ethiopian woman explained the situation to the immigration officials at the airport and the women gave them her own passport as a guarantee for Case 2 to board to plane. Case 2 said that the immigration office had kept the passport of the Ethiopian woman until they had made sure that Case 2 had boarded to plane. Case 3 has explained that her employer had only been prepared to pay her travel cost if she was reimbursed with the medical expense paid for her. She said, she agreed and bought her return ticket. Case 4 mentioned that she was very sick and admitted to hospital for free treatment. She said she could not remember how she had returned. She said she presumed her employer had

contacted the Ethiopian Consulate in Beirut. Case 5 claimed she had been unable to get help. She said she couldn't remember what has happened in the last days of her stay with her employer.

For Example:

“One day, my parents called me and I have told them that I am in a very bad condition and need help. Then, my parents asked the agent in Ethiopia to bring me back home. But, the agent said to my parents that I will be Ok and will gradually adapt with my working condition” (Case 1).

“Then I dared to ask my employer to help me in calling my brother who was living in the US so that I can ask my brother to buy me a return ticket. Then, my employer allowed me to contact my brother and my brother said an Ethiopian woman living in Dubai will help me to return” (Case 2).

“...Then, my employer was willing to buy me a ticket, if I reimbursed him the medical expenses he paid and I have agreed to do so” (Case 3).

“I did not clearly remember how I returned since I was sick and was not conscious. I was laying occupying space that would have been a seat for 3 people in the aircraft...I really don't know what happened to me in the medical center I admitted to for free treatment” (Case 4).

“I am not sure of what happened to me since I was not conscious. I guess my employers got scared that I might die in their house and decided to send me home” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.6. Aftermath.***

The aftermath of the experiences of the research participants relates to issues concerning physical, social and emotional health, responses from families as perceived by the participants and assistance that was required from friends and the community and these are described in the following subcategories:

- Physical and psychosocial health
- Responses from family and others
- Dealing with aftermath
- Looking for assistance

##### ***4.6.6.1. Physical and psychosocial health.***

**Criteria:** All expressions or comments reflecting subsequent physical, emotional and social health problems faced after their return as a result of the working and living conditions that had been experienced are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the women expressed that they had experienced or were experiencing physical, social and/or emotional health problems due to the overwork and emotional mistreatment which they had encountered. Cases 1, 2, 3, 4 and Case 5 described that they had faced serious injury and required regular medical follow-up and emotional support. Case 5 further indicated she was mentally disturbed and her parents took her to a church for holy water treatment and was worried about what her neighbors would say about her mental disturbance.

For Example:

“My health was deteriorating; I was socially isolated and psychologically hurt...and diagnosed with high blood pressure” (Case 1).

“I was also thinking about my cousin and started fearing that I might get sick like her” (Case 2).

“I don’t think I am in a good condition emotionally because of the high stress I had to go through” (Case 3).

“As you can see me, I lost my health, my money; my morale and I feel very inferior and shameful” (Case 4).

“But what I faced was completely different from what I have expected. I have lost everything my money, my physical and mental health and I feel disappointed...” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.6.2. Responses of families and others.***

**Criteria:** All comments related to the challenges which participants faced from families, friends and the communities are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the five women mentioned that their parents or family members did not understand the challenges they had experienced. The women mentioned that the financial expectations of parents, family members and neighbors had become an additional burden to them. Case 1 mentioned that her parents were displeased with her. Case 2 described her family were expecting money from her and she said they did not understand the challenges she has gone through. She said she was also worried about the attitudes of some people in the community, based on certain assumptions they had about what some migrants had been doing in the Arab countries. She said she thought that some people might believe that she had been engaged in

prostitution and she was concerned that this may affect her friendships and social interaction. Case 3 stated that her parents had passed away which exposed her to much grief. She said her sisters and the people in her neighborhood were expecting money from her. Case 4 explained that her husband had rejected her when he became aware of her condition at arrival. Case 5 indicated that she tried to explain about the suffering she has gone through but said that her parents had responded that it would have been better if she had continued working.

#### ***4.6.6.3. Dealing with aftermath.***

**Criteria:** All comments reflecting to the type of problems faced upon return including dealing with laying charges in court against a broker, dept payment, family and neighbors' expectations and problems related to mistreatment by family members as well as looking for a new means of living are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the five women reported that they had faced challenges in handling issues related to the aftermath of trafficking. All the women implicitly or explicitly expressed worries further about their means of living and expectation of families and neighbors. Cases 1, 3, and Case 5 mentioned they were worried about the dept they had to pay that was incurred to cover travel expenses and family expectations that they would return with a lot of money. Case 1 said she has opened a file in court to bring an action against the broker. Case 4 stated that she had become frustrated due to the aggression displayed by her husband and that she had brought an action against him and was able to obtain her divorce paper after a long process. Case 5 said she had thought of asking the broker to give her money back. However, she said she later dropped the idea as she did not have his full name, address or any evidence showing that she had given him the money.

For example:

“As soon as I returned, I went to court and brought an action against the broker. As soon as I did that the broker started trying to convince my parents to drop the case by bribing them with money” (Case 1).

“After my return, everything was frustrating. My family and the people in my neighborhood were expecting money from me and they had no idea of what kind of hardship I went through” (Case 2).

“When I arrived in Addis I heard that my mother has passed away and I was very sad more than one can imagine because my mom was the reason for my going abroad...I don't even know what to do for my living” (Case 3).

“I have sent all the money I have got to my husband to raise my children. But when I arrived home sick, my husband has got angry and said to me, get out of my house and I don't know who you are” (Case 4).

“I returned home very sick and mentally disturbed. I was worried about the feeling of my neighbors towards my sickness as my neighbors started talking about my mental disturbance and this causes me more stress. Sometime later, I felt better and began thinking about what I can do for my survival and support my parents” (Case 5).

#### ***4.6.6.4. Looking for assistance.***

**Criteria:** All comments reflecting on how their life compared to the situation before migration, support needed upon return, plans and current means of living are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the five women implicitly or explicitly expressed that they had been in a better situation before their migration. All the women reported that life was now more difficult for them as they needed to deal with various issues which had emerged upon their return. They explained that before migration, their main challenges were financial problems but after their return, they need financial, medical and emotional support due to the challenges they had faced. All the women were looking for some kind of assistance to cope up with the challenges they had to face after their return. Hence, the women mentioned they had contacted IOM for financial, medical and counseling support. IOM had provided financial assistance, counseling and basic business skills training and participants were organized to form mini-businesses. But they had found that the individual and group businesses were not functional after certain period of time. Hence, Case 1 is currently working as a janitor in a hotel in Addis Ababa; Case 2 had been working as a cashier in a private company but has no job at the moment. Case 3 is working as a babysitter after returning home. Case 4 has opened a cultural dress shop with financial assistance given by IOM. She proceeded to describe how her husband used to frequently come to her shop and threatened to kill her. She had subsequently brought an action against him with the help of IOM and the Ethiopian Women Lawyers Association EWLA. She said she has now her divorce paper. She said that after she had worked for some time, her shop was robbed and she had to stop working as she had not been able to pay the rent. Currently, she is physically disabled, has no job and is living alone in a tiny rented room. Case 5 said she started to work in a group business with the financial assistance given by IOM. She explained that after a year and eight months, the

business had failed due to a lack of working space. Currently, she said she has no job and is on process to re- migrate to Kuwait.

For Example:

“...I have wasted almost three years for nothing and my parents are not happy about my situation...” (Case1).

“You can only imagine how difficult it is for a person to go somewhere with such high expectation and hope and then find the reverse to be the reality” (Case 2).

“But weeks later, I have contacted Gemenaye Ethiopia Association (GEA) and the association referred me to IOM to get reintegration assistance” (Case 3).

“After I got assisted by IOM, I have opened small cultural dress shop selling and my husband used to frequently come to my shop and threaten to kill me” (Case 4).

“Oh! What can I say? I have seen the problem over there and I know the problem here. Let me tell you something: I am planning to go to Kuwait...” (Case 5).

#### ***4.7.7. Emotional experiences.***

The main emotional experiences expressed which were associated to the challenges faced during recruitment, placement, in the destination and upon return attached to trafficking are described in the following sections.

- Feeling of sadness, frustration and helplessness
- Feeling of loneliness and isolation

- Feeling of regret and disappointment
- Fear of being rejected and stigmatized
- Expected responses from family and the community

***4.7.7.1. Feeling of sadness, frustration and helplessness.***

**Criteria:** All statements or events reflecting feeling of sadness, frustration, hurt and helplessness are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** Based on observations by the researcher, all the women in the study were feeling sad and helpless when they talked about their experiences. Case 1, 2 and 4 cried when they remembered their experiences. Cases 4 and 5 stated that they had been highly frustrated and had a fear of death. They had been concerned that their lives had been in danger and had thought that they may not be able to return home alive. Case 5 mentioned due to her frustration, she has taken an acidic fluid substance, wishing to commit suicide.

For example:

“All of the sudden, she hits me on my head and I fell down and bleeding and my cloth were soaked with blood. I felt very sad and frustrated and was asking to myself ‘for how long am I going to continue like this ’?’” (Case 1).

“...I have served both my employers for about five months and when I asked my salary, they refused to pay me. Then, I become depressed, sad and used to cry every day” (Case 2).

“I was getting stressed and was feeling helpless and used to cry continuously” (Case 3).

“When I asked my employers for my salary, they used to insult and harass me and I have accepted the situation and become silent for years. I was frustrated and was feeling helpless” (Case 4).

“...I was frightened in the kind of witchcraft activities that my employer was practicing which was very unusual for me and cannot tolerate it. At the end, I felt sad and hopeless when I knew my employer was not willing to pay my salary” (Case 5).

#### ***4.7.7.2. Feeling of loneliness and isolation.***

**Criteria** All comments and expressions reflecting feeling of loneliness and physical and social isolation implicitly or explicitly are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the women expressed that they had been feeling lonely and had been physically and socially isolated as they had no communication with their families and friends. Cases 1, 3 and 4, tried to seek help from agents and Ethiopian Embassies, but could not find the support they had required at the time they needed it and they had felt isolated and lonely. Cases 1, 2, 3 and Case 4 expressed that they were feeling lonely and socially isolated even after they returned.

For Example:

“...I feel hopeless and lonely and don’t want to meet my friends and other people that I knew before” (Case 1).

“Look at me! I have faced such a horrifying thing behind the closed doors of my employer’s house and nobody knew” (Case 2).

“...this make me feel helpless and fear that I may not able to maintain the relationship I had before and I felt there was no one who can understand my problem” (Case 3).

“My employer was not willing to send me home or pay my salary.

I was distressed and felt hopeless as there was no one to rescue me from the condition I was in” (Case 4).

“At the end, I felt sad, lonely and become hopeless...” (Case 5).

### ***5.7.7.3. Feeling of regret and disappointment.***

**Criteria:** All expressions reflecting feeling of regret and disappointment—implicitly or explicitly—are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the women reported that they had felt regret and had been disappointed as their plans and expectations did not come true. Case 1, expressed she had been expecting to work as a waitress in one of the big hotels in Dubai with attractive salary. But she said her plans were not met. Case 2 mentioned that she had anticipated to work as a babysitter with a good salary. However, she said her expectations were not met at all and it was a big loss not to get the type of job and salary she had expected. Case 3 said she regretted that she had not tried to find work in her own country. Case 4 indicated that the type of job promised by the broker did not emerge and what happened was just contradictory to her plans and she had never expected things will turn out this way. Case 5 mentioned that her plans had not come true and she did not get the type of job and payment she had expected.

For example:

“Everything went wrong...I had never imagined this will happen to me. I had a plan to continue my education but I have wasted almost three years for nothing...” (Case 1).

“...I wasn’t expecting such things to happen to me. I only thought that the work load would be too much but it never crossed my

mind that I would be forced to work for two employers for nothing and be mistreated like I was. You can only imagine how difficult it is for a person to go somewhere with such high expectation and hope and find the reverse to be the reality” (Case 2).

“Oh my God! What happened once I got there was just the opposite of what I have expected before I left. I regret that I didn’t try to work in my country before trying to leave even though I would not be able to make much money I could have spared myself of the suffering I went through” (Case 3).

“...I had such high expectations before I left and I had never imagined such things and was not prepared to face such kinds of disappointment. I had a plan to improve my life and raise my kids and buy my own house. But what really happened was just the opposite (Case 4).

“I was expecting that I will be able to work for some time and get a good income to accomplish my plans. But, what I faced was completely different from what I have expected. I have lost everything; my money, my physical and mental health and I feel disappointed as my planes were not come true” (Case 5).

#### ***4.7.7.4. Fear of being rejected and stigmatized.***

**Criteria:** All expressions reflecting losing social acceptance by family members, neighbors and the community at large are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the women implicitly or explicitly expressed that they had fears regarding losing social acceptance of their family, friends and the community at large. Case 1 expressed that she always thinks about what her family will feel and say. Case 2 described the fear of being stigmatized by some people in the community, who have assumptions about migrant workers that they may be engaged in prostitution. Case 2 said she felt that people might think she was engaged in prostitution and this attitude affects her friendships and social interaction. Case 3 mentioned that she was worried about her relationship with her sisters and neighbors as they were expecting money from her. Case 4 has expressed that when her husband has rejected her, she wished to hide herself where she cannot see any human being. Case 5 explained that she was worried about the response of her neighbors towards her as they were talking about her mental disturbance.

For example:

“...My parents are not happy about my situation because they were expecting me to succeed. But that’s not what happened and the feeling they have towards me affects my emotion and I felt hopeless and lonely and don’t want to meet my friends and other people ...” (Case 1).

“...Some people might think I was engaged in prostitution and their attitude can affect my friendships and social interaction” (Case 2).

“...My sisters and the neighborhood were expecting money from me and this made me feel helpless and fear that I may not able to maintain the relationship I had before...” (Case 3).

“...I was scared and felt very bad and wish to hide myself for some time not to see any human beings” (Case 4).

“I returned home very sick and mentally disturbed. I was worried about the feeling of my neighbors towards me as my neighbors started talking about my mental disturbance and this causes me more stress” (Case 5).

***4.7.7.5. Expectations on how family and the community should respond.***

**Criteria:** All comments reflecting to thoughts and expected responses from family, friends and the community are included in this subcategory.

**Description:** All the women reported that they had thought that their family would understand the type of challenges they had experienced abroad but had found that things were not as they expected. Case 1 said that she felt that her parents were unhappy with her. Case 2 indicated that she had thought her family would understand the kind of hardship she had gone through. Case 3 expressed her disappointment with the responses of her sisters and the people in the neighborhood, as they were expecting money from her. Case 4 explained that her husband became angry and had refused to accept her. She said she felt rejected. Case 5 indicated that her parents did not understand the suffering she has gone through. They told her that it would have been better if she had been able to tolerate the situation and had continued working abroad.

For Example:

“I was also worried about what my family will feel and say”.

(Case 1)

“...My relatives and people in my neighborhood were expecting money from me” (Case 2).

“Soon after my return, I have observed that my sisters and the people in my neighborhood were expecting money from me...”

(Case 3).

“But, when I arrived home, my husband has got angry and said to me, get out of my house and I don’t know who you (Case 4).

“When I explain to my parents about the kind of suffering I have been through they said, it would have been better if I kept working by being patient and tolerating everything” (Case 5

### ***5.8. Conclusion***

The participants claim that they were deceived about the work that they were promised; they felt they had been exploited in the work situation; they encountered impediments when they tried to return; they difficulties to adjust to their return and had to cope with a lack of acceptance.

## **CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION**

In this chapter, the information that was extracted from the interviews will be evaluated in light of the research questions. As stated in Chapter one, the general objective of the research is to investigate the major causes of trafficking from Ethiopia to the Middle East as well as the psychosocial aftermath on victims who have managed to return home. Hence, the major factors that expose women to trafficking, the trafficking process and its effect on the emotional and social health of participants will be discussed in light of the theories and concepts discussed in the previous chapters. Utilizing a qualitative methodology certain categories were identified based on the collected data. These categories will allow for the drawing of certain conclusions which will be presented in this chapter. In this concluding chapter, the study will be evaluated in terms of its contributions and limitations. Finally, based on the results obtained, recommendations for concerned governmental and non-governmental organizations will be provided.

### ***5.1. Discussion***

As indicated in chapter two, Trafficking has been defined by the (UN, 2000a) as recruitment and transportation process in which victims fall prey to traffickers through coercion, deception and other means. Although the research subjects left with the intention of being migrant workers, they become victims of trafficking (i.e., they realized that they have been deceived and were forced to do the work they did not want to do).

The study shows that one of the major factors pushing the women to seek work in other countries is lack of job opportunity. Most of them had envisaged no prospect of leading a normal and productive life in their country. The women had no job and in some cases they have been

unemployed, had very limited income and were forced to take any opportunity of working abroad. Thus, this is an indication that the factors exposing women to trafficking in Ethiopia are interrelated with poverty being the pressing issue as in other parts of the world (Agrinet, 2004; Human Right Watch, 2007 & UN Women Watch, 2008).

The study further indicated that the false promises of brokers that draws attractive picture of life in the destination countries has influenced the women to fall for the stories and become trafficked (Kebede, 2002). The study further shows that victims are influenced by friends, relatives or other women they know who claim to know people who work in certain Arab countries. They heard through their families or from brokers that these people are doing well, thereby influencing the participants to do the same (Countering Human Trafficking, 2004).

As evident in the study, brokers were recruiting participants through contacts with families, friends and relatives. In one of the cases, the concerned woman had a direct contact with a broker. In another case a woman whose cousin lives in Dubai had her travel facilitated through the intervention of a broker in Addis Ababa. This shows that traffickers do not follow a consistent type of recruitment or means of contact but utilize all available means (UN, 2000).

All the women in the study had processed their travel arrangements through brokers or through relatives who have connections with agents in the destination countries. It is clear that none of the participants had followed the legal procedure or had made use of legitimate enterprises. This finding confirmed a related study conducted by Kebede (2002).

The study shows that brokers work privately through facilitators to provide the women with travel documents. They were also making easy-money as most of the women had paid cash as demanded by the brokers who claimed that the money would cover the cost of travel (Endeshaw et al., 2006). The study also indicated that most women usually make contact with brokers in

different locations, and they usually do not know the exact addresses of the brokers. This makes them vulnerable to the deception of the brokers, a case which is also attested by a similar study done by (Endeshaw et al., 2006; Tekle and Belayneh, 2000). The study revealed that during recruitment, the women were not in a position to negotiate the amount of payment and travel arrangements mainly due to lack of information and the high pressure the brokers have put on them. In one case, the broker asked one of the women to pay him half of the total amount and persuaded her to pay the remaining installments from her salary which put her in debt. In another case, a broker convinced the woman to sign a statement that he is her uncle and warning her she would not get the job he had promised her otherwise. This shows the level of fraud the brokers usually utilize to convince their potential victims and get them to agree to their plans similar to observations made by (Endeshaw et al., 2006; IOM, 2003; Tekele and Belyneh, 2000). The study found one case where the broker had a connection with legitimate travel agents which were commercial business enterprises which could avail a travel document to the woman and this has also observed by Kebede (2002).

The study shows that during transportation, the women traveled by themselves and in some cases, brokers use transit to neighboring countries such as Djibouti (where entry visas are usually not required). Although direct air transport from Addis Ababa to the destinations are available, brokers choose to do otherwise to avoid government requirements set at that time which would require filing out travel arrangements for the women (Endeshaw et al., 2006). The study also revealed that though the women were not forced during the recruitment and transportation, the process involved abuse of power and deception related to the amount of payment and the conditions of employment. The research participants attested that they lacked access to reliable information and brokers had exploited their vulnerability. This confirms that while the

recruitment process may not have involved force, a certain level of exploitation was nonetheless involved (UN, 2000a).

As it is evident from this study, the women's passports were confiscated. They were also ill informed as to what would happen to them, partially due to language problem and absence of a body to help them understand the situation. This study confirms that human trafficking does not necessarily involve illegal or underground movement, but it can be the product of a whole system which encompasses an entire movement process through the existence of trafficking network extending from source to destination (Endeshaw et al., 2006 & UN, 2000a).

It was also found that none of the woman had obtained any formal agreement with their future employers before departure or upon their arrival in the country of destination. However, most women assumed that the brokers in Addis Ababa had some kind of agreement with the agents or employers in the destination about which they were not aware. This shows how trafficking does not occur in a single event or step; rather, it entails a series of organized acts and circumstances with an extensive range of actors involved and exposing the women to various kinds of abuse and exploitation which is difficult to prevent (Agrinet, 2004 & Kebede, 2002).

Agrinet, (2004) and Beydoun, (2006) found that most victims were kept isolated by traffickers to prevent them from contact with others and then transferred or sold to employers. Similarly, the study shows a case where a woman was taken to a place where a prospective employer came and had verbal agreement with the agent (the payment or working condition was not communicated to the woman). In another case, the woman was transferred from one agent to the other and finally ended up to work for a mentally sick employer. There, she was beaten recklessly and was in a situation where she could not find the agent for help and was totally exposed to extreme frustration and distress.

The study revealed that the heavy work load, deprivation of food and sleep and restriction of movement by employers led to various physical and psychological problems for the women (see also Bezabih, 2008 & Kebede, 2002). In spite of the risk that she may encounter (which she has already witnessed before), the research participant referred to as Case 5 has again decided to re-migrate and this time in a legal way and this shows that due to socio-economic conditions the trafficking of women is almost unavoidable (Agrinet, 2004 & “Countering Human Trafficking,” 2004).

The women in the study had been threatened by employers and had experienced deprivation of food and sleep, denial and withholding of salaries and sexual harassment. In addition, they had been imprisoned and confined and had been threatened by employers that they would be sent back home without receiving their salaries. In one case, a participant had been forced by the agent to work for two employers (to replace her cousin who was sick and had been sent home). It had been required of her to work like a machine with no breaks ‘as if she was not human’ with any payment. This led her to become worried that she might become sick like her cousin and would be sent home with nothing (Bezabih, 2008; Kebede, 2002; Tekle & Belayneh, 2000).

The study shows that at a particular point after arrival, all of the women had realized that they had been deceived by brokers. However, when and how they realized the deception differed from one woman to another. Some had realized it only after they saw their working and living conditions. The study further revealed that all the women had experienced physical, social and/or emotional abuse due to the overwork and emotional mistreatment inflicted by employers (Agrinet, 2004; Tekele & Belyneh, 2000).

The study revealed that all participating women experienced feeling of sadness, frustration and helplessness. Some of them have experienced fear of death and the thought of not being able

to return home alive crossed their mind as they felt their life was in danger. The study shows in one case the woman had ingested an acidic fluid substance, wishing to kill herself. This happened as she was unable to cope with her frustration due to the type of job she was doing—serving people who came to her employer's house for witchcraft activities day and night which is a situation that caused her to mental disturbance (see also Bezabih, 2008 & Human Right Watch, 2010).

The study further shows that the women have experienced feeling of loneliness and isolation due to strict control by their respective employers. They also had no protection from abuse and exploitation and it is a case that agrees with studies conducted by Bezabih (2008); Doezema (2001) and IOM (2003).

In addition, Kebede (2002); Tekle and Belayneh (2000) found that migrant workers are reluctant to return even after suffering abusive conditions (until they have made enough money). The same was true for the participants of this study who found themselves caught in the dilemma of experiencing hardships as they tried every means available to them to return back home and at the same time trying to stay as they had not been paid their salary. They had felt that it would have been unacceptable for them to return home with nothing.

It was found that the process of returning to their home country was made possible for the women as a result of family support and the women themselves who were constantly complaining to their agents and employers. In one case, it was found that the technical and financial assistance of Ethiopian Community in the destination country had facilitated the return of a participant. The study indicated in some cases that the women were forced by their employers to work until they had become critically ill. This had caused them to finally collapse and lose their consciousness. The study further revealed that in such cases women had assumed

their employers have contacted the Ethiopian Consulate to send them back home (Agrinet, 2004).

All the women reported that they had experienced difficulties in handling issues related to opening a case in court against the trafficker, paying their debts and looking for a means of living. It was often noted in the study that most of the women were worried about the debt they have to pay. In one case it was found that the woman has opened a file in court to persecute the trafficker but not easy to handle the prolonged court process with the health problems she had and this has also observed by a report by the US Department of State (2007).

The study further shows that all the women had been expecting their family and friends to understand the challenges they have gone through. On top of the physical and emotional abuse they have suffered, the study shows that the financial expectations of families had subsequently become an additional burden. In one case, it has noted in the study that a woman was rejected by her husband and this is similar case to the findings of Bezabih (2008).

Most of the women indicated that they were worried and felt insecure about the responses of families and neighbors and were afraid of rejection. An assumption by the community that ‘migrants could be engaged in prostitution activities’ was referred as it led to fear of stigma which has effect on friendship and social interaction. This point is similar to that was found in the studies on the recurrent consequences of trafficking by Bezabih (2008) and PCI, (2010).

The study also shows that since their return, the women had experienced feeling of regret and disappointment in relation to their original plans and expectations that had been thwarted. They also had to explain why they had forced themselves to stay in the abusive situation. In their response, it was noted that they were expecting things would improve even if it entails health problems and leaving their wages behind were among others (see Aginet, 2004). As is evident

from the study, the participants reported that life had become very difficult for them and in some ways even worse than before migration and that they had no choice other than looking for some kind of assistance (Kebede, 2002).

## **5.2. Conclusion**

Based on the study, the following conclusions can be drawn:

- Lack of opportunities and limited income are the common reasons to migrate. Moreover, the false promises by brokers which draws an attractive image of life in the destination countries was a driving factor that exposed women to trafficking. In addition, family members, friends and relatives had played a significant role in the decision making process.
- The confiscation of passport by immigration officers, agents or employers, and in some cases to be taken and kept in prison-like waiting places was a very traumatizing experience for the women.
- The actual experience of heavy workloads, long working hours, serving more than one family even though they were hired for one, restriction of movements, deprivation of food and sleep, denial and withholding of salaries and sexual harassment had exposed the women to physical and /or social or emotional health problems.
- It was evident from the study that due to the emotional problems, the women had experienced the requirement for financial assistance and emotional support during the process of return.
- The study found that the experiences of the victims of trafficking had a profound social and psychological impact which prevented the women from working and earning their

living after they had returned back home. Furthermore, the expectations from their family and others and the financial losses they had suffered exposed them to regret, disappointment, frustration, fear of being rejected and stigmatized. They feel that they have failed as they had not been able to earn the income they were promised and were left with unpaid debt. Because the women presumed they were stigmatized by their social environment, their reintegration into society had been hindered. Hence, the same circumstance of unemployment and a lack of prospects that had led to their original vulnerability await them on their return coupled with social and psychological distress. What is heart breaking is that despite the hardship and the unfavorable conditions they have experienced, some of them are still looking for possibilities of undergoing the same experience again, thereby making trafficking too hard to stop.

### ***5.3. Evaluation of the Study***

#### ***5.3.1. Contribution of the Study.***

This study, which has been in line with the qualitative methodology, has presented a description of detailed participants' story constructed by the researcher. In a nut shell with constructivist approach, this research has put emphasis on understanding the world of the participants.

The research is investigative and exploratory in which it gives the participants a 'voice', thereby allowing them to communicate their experiences through their stories. This was made so with the need to understand the subjective world of the participants. Hence, a deeper insight into such perspective and experience was made possible.

### ***5.3.2. Limitation of the Study.***

As qualitative research is labor and time intensive, it was not feasible to use larger sample size. Thus, only five participants were studied. A larger sample that allows more diversity of experiences would have increased the possibility to generalize the findings— a case that was missing in the sample size used for this study. Perhaps the experience of additional participants would have allowed an identification of greater meaning and experience.

### ***5.4. Recommendations***

There is no easy solution to the problems of trafficking women in Ethiopia. Although there are efforts on drafting new laws or revising laws on employment and migration issues, including opening consulates in some of the destination countries, more effort is needed on the enforcement of the existing laws to effectively combat trafficking and protect the rights, safety and dignity of Ethiopians working abroad. Hence, governmental, non-governmental and civil society members— including researchers – must play an important role in countering trafficking as well as in protecting and supporting traffic victims. More specifically, the following suggestions need to be considered:

#### ***5.4.1. Research.***

- It is suggested that similar studies need to be done on trafficking of women focusing also on jobs other than domestic work.
- The link between brokers and the legitimate travel agents or commercial business enterprises availing a travel document to participants become visible in the study. For more understanding of the link between trafficking and legitimate travel business enterprises in Ethiopia, further research is a prerequisite.

#### ***5.4.2. Combating Trafficking and Support for Victims.***

- As it is mainly problems that are related to economic issues that expose young women to trafficking, the Government of Ethiopia in collaboration with concerned civil societies needs to come up with workable ways of opening up job opportunities for young women to provide them with options other than migrating.
- Civil societies and non-governmental organizations should be encouraged to participate in creating awareness on human trafficking and support victims to secure acceptance and reintegration.
- It is suggested that ongoing training programs to law enforcement bodies such as judges and prosecutors on human trafficking is highly crucial as they could understand trafficking cases and avail timely justice to victims when they appeal to court.
- To make people more aware of the risks and consequences of trafficking including empowering potential migrants to make informed decisions on migration issues, information campaign should be conducted within the communities.
- It is suggested that relevant government bodies with the assistance of non-governmental organizations should create complaint-handling mechanisms to traffic victims which they can turn to upon their return as victims have difficulties in getting relevant information to get assistance. The suggestion is made in relation to the revised Employment Proclamation 632/2009 under article 31 that

shows the government is responsible in facilitating the resettlement of citizens to their home country.

- In light of the physical and emotional trauma faced by victims it is suggested that the Ethiopian embassies and consulates should provide assistance to mentally traumatized victims facing crises and initiate a universally accessible emergency hotline with the support of NGOs focusing on migrant service.
- Relevant non-governmental and civil society organizations need to avail social support and reintegration assistance for victims of trafficking such as safe houses, legal support, medical help, counseling services and financial aid for basic necessities. As indicated in the study, the victims had mentioned the importance of the assistance provided by IOM. It is obvious that without such support, it would have been more difficult for them to survive. However, such support should be sustainable and reintegration assistance should be tailored with special attention to the victims' needs.

### ***5.5. General Conclusion***

Through the four stages of the trafficking process, all the stories of the women clearly indicate how women fall prey to traffickers and are exposed to social and psychological traumas. Based on these findings, the researcher was able to set forth certain future research areas and recommendations.

In conclusion, the study shows how important it is to see the world of human trafficking through the eyes of the victims. If one aims to assist victims and combat trafficking, it is of utmost importance to understand their world of experience.

## References

- Afework. H. & Habte. N. (2011). *Labor Migration of Ethiopian Women to the Middle East*. (pp.7-13). Ethiopia: Stichting DIR, Nederlandse-Ethiopische ontwikkelingsorganisatie.
- Agrinet, (2004). *Assessment of the magnitude of women and children trafficked within and outside of Ethiopia*. (pp. 1-46). Ethiopia: International Organization for Migration.
- Allais, C. (2004). Human trafficking. *The international journal of humanities*, 2 (1), 543-547.
- Belayneh, T. (2003). *Research and communication strategy definition, Be informed: Counter trafficking through information*. (10-27). Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: International Organization for Migration.
- Beydoun, K. A. (2006). Examining the experience of trafficking from the vantage-point of the trafficked domestic workers. The trafficking of Ethiopian domestic workers in to Lebanon. *Berkeley Journal of International Law*, 24(3), 1022-1025.
- Bezabih, T. (2008). *Trafficking of women and children to Alert area in Addis Ababa for Sexual Exploitation*. Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- Bruckert, C. & Parent, C. (2002). The Matter of definitions: Trafficking in human beings and organized crime. *Research and Evaluation Branch, Community, Contract & Aboriginal Policing Services Directorate, Royal Canadian Mounted Police*. 3-28. Retrieved on August 15, 2009 from <http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca>
- Central Intelligence Agency, (2011). *The World Fact Book: Information on Ethiopia*. 1. Retrieved on June 10, 2011 from <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/et.html>
- Collins, H. (2003). *Collins English Dictionary complete and unabridged*. 1. Retrieved on August 10, 2011 from <http://www.thefreedictionary.com/psychosocial>

- Countering Human Trafficking. (2004), December 24). *Addis Ababa Sub-Saharan Informer*, pp. 3, 4.
- Daleen & Venter. (2002). Sampling and sampling methods. In A.S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C. B. Fouché, & C. S. L. Delpont (Eds.), *Research at grass roots level: For the social sciences and human service* (2nd ed., pp. 198-207). Pretoria, South Africa: Van Schaik.
- Delpont, C. S. L. & Fouché, C. B. (2005). The qualitative research report. In A.S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C.B. Fouché, & C. S. L Delpont (Eds.), *Research at grass roots Level: For the social sciences and human service profession.*(3rd ed., pp. 350-354). Pretoria, South Africa: Van Schaik.
- Doezema, J. (2001). 'White slavery to trafficking in Women: *The re-emergence of the myth of 'white slavery 'in contemporary discourses of 'trafficking in women', Institute of Development Studies University of Sussex.* 10-26. Retrieved on December, 23, 2009 from <http://www.walnet.org/csis/papers/doezema-loose.html>
- Endeshaw, Y., Gebeyehu, M., & Reta, B.(Eds.). (2006). *Assessment of trafficking in women and children in and from Ethiopia.* (pp. 11-120). Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: International Organization for Migration.
- Eshetu, M. (2003). *Women and children trafficking within and from Ethiopia*, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- Feingold, D. A. (2005 September-October).Think again: Human trafficking. *Foreign Policy*, 26-32. Retrieved on June 30, 2009 from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30048506>
- Fouché, C. B. & Delpont, C. S. L. (2011). Introduction to the research process. In A.S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C. B. Fouché, & C.S.L. Delpont (Eds.), *Research at grass roots level: For the*

*social sciences and human service profession* (4th ed., pp. 61-78). Pretoria, South Africa: Van Schaik.

FSCE, (2004). *Base line survey report on child trafficking in Addis Ababa*. (pp. 23-24). Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Forum on Street Children - Ethiopia.

Greeff, M. (2005). Information collection. In A. S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C. B. Fouché, & C. S. L. Delport (Eds.), *Research at grass roots level: For the social sciences and human service profession*, (3rd ed., pp. 286-313). Pretoria, South Africa: Van Schaik

Heylighten, F. (1993). Epistemology. 2. Retrieved on May 29, 2010 from

<http://pesmcl.vub.ac.be/EPISTEM1.html>

Human Rights Watch. (2007). *Exported and Exposed: Abuses against Sri Lankan domestic workers in Saudi Arabia, Kuwait, Lebanon and the United Arab Emirates* 19(15) (C). (pp. 9-20). New York: Human Right Watch.

Human Rights Watch. (2008). Asian Women's labor Migration to Saudi Arabia: Asian Women's Status and Reasons for Migration. *Abuses Against Asian Domestic Workers In Saudi Arabia*. 9. Retrieved on December 22, 2009 from

[http://humanrightswatchhrw\\_08\\_human\\_0708.pdf](http://humanrightswatchhrw_08_human_0708.pdf)

Human Rights Watch. (2010). Background: Migration to Lebanon for Domestic Work. *Human Rights Report on Abuses Against Migrants*. 11. Retrieved on July 21, 2011 from <http://www.hrw.org/sites/default/titles/reports/wrd2010webwcover.pdf>

IOM & UN. (2000). Regional migration Issues: Trafficking of migrants. *World Migration Report, by the International Organization for Migration and the United Nations, 2000*. 181. Retrieved on August 12, 2011 from

[http://publication.iom.int/booksstore/free/wmr\\_2000.pdf](http://publication.iom.int/booksstore/free/wmr_2000.pdf)

- IOM. (2003). World Migration. *Managing migration: Challenges and responses for people on the move*. (p.61). Geneva, Switzerland: International Organization for Migration.
- IOM. (2004). *International migration law, Glossary on migration*. (pp. 41-69). Geneva, Switzerland: International Organization for Migration.
- IOM. (2006). *Breaking the cycle of vulnerability: Responding to the health needs of trafficked women in East and Southern Africa*. (pp.21-43). Pretoria, South Africa: International Organization for Migration.
- IOM/SLM Addis Ababa. (2004). *Hot line survey activity report, January-December*. Unpublished manuscript, International Organization for Migration, Special Liaison Mission, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- Kebede, E. (2002). Introduction: Overview of socio-economic context. *An assessment of the International Labor Migration situation: The case of female labor migrants, (Genprom working paper No. 3)*. 1-11. Retrieved on June, 2010 from [www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/download/swmeth.pdf#search=%22kebede%20ilo%22](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/download/swmeth.pdf#search=%22kebede%20ilo%22)
- Kempadoo, K. & Doezema, J. (1998). *Global sex workers: Right, resistance, and redefinition*. (p. 17). New York N.Y & London England: Rutledge.
- Kruger, D. J, De Vos, A. S, Fouché, C. B. & Venter, L. ( 2005). Qualitative data analysis and interpretation. In A. S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C. B. Fouché, & C. S. L. Delport (Eds.), *Research at grass roots level: For the social sciences and human service profession*, (3rd ed., (pp. 217-225). Pretoria, South Africa: Van Schaik
- Macliam, J. K. (2003). Constructivism: *An exploration of the experience and effects of trauma counseling on lay counselors*. 52- 68. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/10500/1558>

Martens, J. Pieczkowski, M. & Van Vuuren-Smyth, B. (Eds.). (2003). *Seduction, sale and slavery: Trafficking in women and children for sexual exploitation in Southern Africa*, (pp.1-15). Pretoria, South Africa: International Organization for Migration.

Meshesha, M. B. (2007). *Looking back at migration, Female labor migration to the Middle East: The case of returnees in Ethiopia*. Norwegian University of Science and Technology, Trondheim, Norway.

Mouton, J. (2001). Conducting field work. *How to succeed in your Master's & Doctorial studies: A South African guide and resource book*. (pp.102-111). Pretoria, South Africa: Van Schaik.

PCI. (2010). *Resource manual on trafficking in persons*. (pp. 3-4). Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Project Concern International.

Pearson, E. (2003). *A general overview of trafficking in women and girls in East Africa (Ethiopia, Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda)*. 4-5. Retrieved on June 12, 2009 from <http://www.gtz.de/traffickinginwomen>

Sayah, M. H. (2011, May 11). *Experience of the migration center in Lebanon in view of domestic migrant workers*. Paper presented at the Annual Coordination Conference of the Ethiopian Catholic Church in Ethiopia, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

Strydom, H. 2005. Writing the research report. In A. S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C. B. Fouché, & C. S. L. Delport (Eds.), *Research at grass roots level: For the social sciences and human service Profession*, (3rd ed., pp. 246-259). Pretoria, South Africa: Van Schaik.

Tekle, A. & Belayneh, T. (2000). *Trafficking of women from Ethiopia*. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Women's Affairs Sub –Sector in the Prime Minister's Office & IOM, (pp. 1-5). Addis Ababa.

- Terfassa, E. (2004). *Base line survey on child trafficking in Chencha Woreda of Gamo Gofa Zone*. (p. 62). Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Multi Purpose Community Development Project.
- UN. (1979). Part 1: Article 6. Convention on the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women. *United Nations General Assembly*. 1. Retrieved on August 10, 2011 from <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cedaw/convention.htm>
- UN. (1990). Article 2. International convention on the protection of the rights of all migrant workers and members of their families. *United Nations' 69<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting*. 1. Retrieved July, 23, 2011 From [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/United\\_Nations\\_Convention\\_on\\_the\\_protection\\_of\\_All\\_Migrant\\_Workers\\_a](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/United_Nations_Convention_on_the_protection_of_All_Migrant_Workers_a)
- UN. (2000a). General Provision: Article 3, Use of Terms, *UN. Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*. 2. Retrieved August 10, 2011 from [http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final\\_docum/htm](http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_docum/htm)
- UN. (2000b). General Provisions: Article 3 (a), Use of Terms, *UN. Protocol against the smuggling of migrants by land, sea and air, Supplementing the UN convention against transitional crime, by UN general assembly*. 2. Retrieved December, 23, 2009 from [http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/convention/dcatoc/final\\_documents\\_2/convention\\_smug\\_eng.pdf](http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/convention/dcatoc/final_documents_2/convention_smug_eng.pdf)
- UN Women Watch. (2008). *The national action plan by the United Nations Women Watch*. 3. Retrieved on August 25, 2009 from <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/confer/beijing/national/natplans.htm>

US Department of State. (2006). The 2006 Trafficking in persons report: Its purpose.

*Trafficking in persons report by the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons.*

1-5. Retrieved on August 10, 2011 from <http://state.gov/documents/organization/66086.pdf>

US Department of State. (2007). *Learning More: The Forms and Impact of Human Trafficking.*

*Trafficking in Persons Report by the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons.*

100-101. Retrieved on August 10, 2011 from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2007/82809.htm>

US Department of State. (2011). *Trafficking in persons report.* 16. Retrieved on August, 18,

2011 from <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/1644454.pdf>

Webster's, M. (2003). *The Original Merriam Webster's Collegiate Dictionary.* The Original

Webster: An Encyclopedia Britannica Company. (11th ed., pp. 461, 1141). Delhi, India:

GOYAL.

## **Legislation**

Constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia. (1995), Addis Ababa, Ethiopia:

Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.

Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia. (2005). Addis Ababa, Ethiopia:

Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.

Federal Negarit Gazeta. (2009). *A proclamation to provide for employment exchange services*

*No. 632/2009.* Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.

## **Appendices**

### **Appendix A: General Information for Participants**

**Welcoming Message:** The researcher welcomes and appreciates the participant for giving their time for the study.

**Introducing the purpose and topic of study:**

“An Investigation in to the experience of female victims of trafficking in Ethiopia”

The study aims to identify the major causes of trafficking and psychosocial challenges trafficked women are facing and come-up with possible recommendations.

**Sample Composition:**

The sample composition was selected from Ethiopian migrants returned from Middle Eastern countries and residing in Addis Ababa.

**Guarantee of Anonymity and Confidentiality:**

I would also like to assure you that, the information you gave during the interview will be confidential and will be coded, and there is no need to mention your name. Moreover, you are not going to be responsible for the research outcome.

**In case of Discomfort during the Interview:**

In case you feel some discomfort during the interview, you are free to withdraw the interview.

**In case you need Help:**

In case you need any assistance as the result of your participation in the interview, a humanitarian organization named by ‘Tstotawi Tekat Tekelakay Mahber’ (TTTM) is available in Addis Ababa that provides psychosocial support for women in difficult circumstances. I encourage you to feel free to say anything concerning the topic.

**Signing Consent Form:** Your willingness of participation in the study will be confirmed by signing the consent form of participation.

## Appendix B: Informed Consent Form

### For the participant:

I hereby confirm that the interviewer has informed me about the nature, conduct, risks and benefits of the study. I have read (or have had someone read to me) the above information regarding this study, and have had enough opportunity to ask questions. I declare myself willing to participate in the study.

Name of participant: \_\_\_\_\_

Participant's signature: \_\_\_\_\_

**Date:** \_\_\_\_\_

### For the Researcher:

I hereby confirm that I have informed the above participant about the nature, conduct, and risks of this study.

**Interviewer's name:** \_\_\_\_\_

Interviewer's signature: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

## **Appendix C: Interview Guide**

The interview guide for participants has four parts and a total of thirteen items. The interview guide is open-ended, thereby allowing for allowing participants to freely tell their stories.

### **Interview guide Part I**

- Could you tell me your age, religion and which region you are from?
- What were your educational background, marital status and employment status before migration, and your current status?
- Tell me about your family situation. Are they living together? What do you say about their income?

### **Interview guide Part II**

- Why did you leave your country?
- Tell me about your travel: who was involved? How was payment made?
- Tell me the role of other people in your decision.

### **Interview guide Part III**

- Tell me about your work experience.
- Tell me about your relationship with your employers.
- How did you manage to return home?
- Tell me any challenges and advantages you have experienced.

**Interview Guide Part IV**

- What were your expectations before you migrated? What actually did happen?
- Could you tell me your views and attitude towards human trafficking?
- What is your advice to potential migrant women?
- Can I call you if I need to ask you further questions?

Thank you for your cooperation.

## Appendix D: Literal Transcription of Interviews

The transcribed interviews were translated from Amharic, the official language of Ethiopia (which all the participants are comfortable speaking in), in to English.

### Case 1

R: Why did you leave your country?

P: Oh! It is a long story! I had a small job with a monthly income of Birr 150, equivalent to USD 11 at that time. However, the people I work with moved from Addis Ababa to another area, and since then, I was not able to pay my school fee as my parents did not have the financial capacity to support me. I had no choice! I had to work abroad and earn some money to continue my education.

R: Tell me about your travel. Who was involved? How was payment made, etc?

P: First, my aunt promised to take me to one of the Arab countries and had taken a copy of my passport for that purpose. But, after some time, she told me that she has changed her mind. From that day on, I was looking for other options as I was determined to go abroad for work. So, I started talking to a friend of my mother because her daughter had gone to one of the Arab countries. My mother's friend introduced me to the broker that her daughter had used to go. She stated that the broker works with her brother, who had a private travel enterprise and has contacts with individuals in the Arab countries. Following my introduction, the broker took my passport and promised that she will get me a visa and I had to pay her Birr 7000 equivalent to USD 557 at that time. As soon as I paid her the money I borrowed from my relatives, she told me that I should take medical examination as soon as possible as I would be traveling to Dubai in a few days time. Though I wished to ask questions on the legality of the employment, it was not

possible for me due to much pressure from the broker and there was no chance to negotiate on the amount as the broker wanted the money urgently. Moreover, the broker had promised me that, I would be working as a waitress in one of the big hotels in Dubai because I had told her that I am trained in cooking and catering. A Few days later, the broker arranged my trip to Dubai through Ethiopian airlines via Djibouti. When I arrived, an agent was waiting for me at the airport. The agent took my passport and transferred me to another agent, who took me to a place where migrant women stayed when they have conflict with their employers. I remember one young Ethiopian thrown from a six-storey building by her employers: her leg was broken. The next morning, I was transferred again to a third agent who took me to my employer's house. The agreement and connection between the broker in Addis and the group of individuals in Dubai was not clear for me.

R: Tell me the role of other people in your decision.

P: Though it was my decision to go abroad, my mother's friend had significant role in facilitating my travel.

R: Tell me the challenges you faced during travel, at transit, upon arrival in the final destination, etc.

P: I had no problem at the transit stage. The challenge was upon my arrival at the final destination.

R: Tell me about your experience at your workplace.

P: My employer used to hit me and at the same time acted as if she was kidding, but after some time I realized that she was mentally ill. One day, my parents called me and I told them that I am in a very bad condition and needed help. Then my parents asked the broker in Ethiopia to bring me back home. But the broker said to my parents that I will be 'ok' and would gradually adapt

with my working condition. But, my employer continued to beat me, insult me and shout at me. One day she beat me so severely that I started bleeding from my mouth and nose, so they took me to the agent. When I arrived at their office, an Ethiopian lady tried to help me in translation as I did not understand English. However, the Filipino agent in the office was not willing to accept the assistance of translator; rather, he insisted on taking me back to my employer's house and so did I return back to the house.

Sometime later, as I was when I was taking the trash out of the house, an Ethiopian domestic worker in the neighborhood told me that my employer (the women) was mentally sick person. The husband used to lock me up inside a room every afternoon after 3:00 p.m. so that I would not see my employer acting abnormally, holding out a dagger and shouting around for hours. But, before having this information, I used to think that they were locking me inside to prevent me from escaping.

Some days later, my employer saw her husband giving a laptop to his kids. She got very angry. She then called me and ordered me "throw the laptop." Then, I replied 'you mean put it down'? I went to the next room and put the laptop down. She then shouted at her husband and kids and followed me outside while I was on my way to take the trash out. All of a sudden, she hit me on my head and I fell down and started bleeding: my clothes were soaked with blood. I felt very sad and frustrated and asked myself, 'For how long am I going to continue like this'? After that they took me to the agent for the second time. The agent who placed me to my employer was not there and the one in the office decided to send me with to a new employer even before getting medical treatment. But, the new employer saw that I was bleeding and took me back to the agent and explained that I needed medication before being hired. Imagine! It had been three days without food. Then, the Ethiopian agent came and tried to convince me that my employer's

behavior will improve. The agent gave me a tablet which was not prescribed by a physician, so I started to get weaker day after day

R: Tell me about your work relationship with your employers.

P: When I first arrived at the house, my employer gave me my work cloths and a clock (watch) to check on time. She was nice to me at first. But the next morning, she became very rude and I became so afraid of her.

R: How did you manage to return back home?

P: Finally, the agent bought me air ticket, as he realized that I am adamant to return and my parents were pushing for it. During the flight back, there were other Ethiopians on the plane from Bahrain, Syria and other countries, who faced similar difficulties with their employers. And I saw that, some of the returnees were crying and shouting due to mental illness and injuries. In any way, coming back home empty handed, with health problems and a debt to pay is a big loss, but it is still good to be backing home alive.

As soon as I returned, I went to court and brought a legal case against the broker. As soon as I did that, the broker started trying to convince my parents to drop the case by bribing them with money. But my parents took a firm stand and told her that she has to cover my medical expenses and pay me compensation because I was checked and confirmed to be healthy before I left for the Middle East but now completely sick and diagnosed with high blood presser. Due to the serious injury I did suffer, my medical expense was increasing from time to time and the agent was not willing to cover it. Rather she kept on trying to convince my parents that she would give them Birr 2000 (USD 200) if they were to drop the case. However, I continued with the court case with the legal assistance of IOM. But, sometimes the broker disappeared when she was

ordered to appear before court, but she was finally arrested and sent to jail and was released on bail after some time.

Then the court started calling the person who paid for the bail to appear for hearings. It was then claimed before the court that that the person had died. But I knew that she was alive. During the court hearings the trafficker always said, "...as long as I have my money, I will be safe," and I realized that it works for her because who can protect or stand for the victim? I think the law is not strict enough when it comes to trafficking and I am tired of the process.

R: Tell me any challenges and advantages you have experienced

P: Ahhh! (Big sigh) Do you think there is an advantage? Like I told you before there is no advantage at all. (She was in tears as she started talking about this.) I was forced to work the entire house chores: including cooking, making up multiple beds, cleaning many bathrooms and washing cars. Every day, I went to bed at 3 a.m. in the morning and woke up at 5:00 a.m., and I had little time to sleep and rest. I always had enough work to last until 12:00 am and I might sometimes continue working until 3:30 a.m. I was not given enough food to eat. I was eating once a day and on top of that I had lost my appetite due to the long hours I work.

I was beaten by my employer almost every day, and everyone I talked to said 'please be patient and continue working'. However, it was getting unbearable and I was no more humanly capable of taking any more of the pain. I had pain in my head and was unable to pick up things from the ground. I had no medical treatment and did not have enough food to eat. I also felt there was no one that can help and understand my problem and rescue me from the situation I was in. Finally, the broker in Ethiopia kept on trying to persuade my family so that they can convince me to keep working in such conditions. On the other hand, the agent in Dubai was threatening me by saying that, if I stopped working I will be arrested due to my illegal status and the debt I have not paid.

R: What were your expectations before you migrated and what actually happened?

P: My expectation was very high but things were not as I expected. Everything went wrong. My health was deteriorating, I was socially isolated, and psychologically hurt and even my attitude towards people have been distorted. I don't know whom to trust and I was worried about the debt I still had. I was also worried about what my family will feel and say. I had never imagined this would happen to me. I had a plan to continue my education, but I have wasted almost three years for nothing and my parents were not happy about my situation because they were expecting me to succeed. That is not what happened and the feeling they have towards me affects my emotion. I felt hopeless and lonely and don't want to meet my friends and other people that I knew before.

R: Could you tell me your views and attitude towards human trafficking?

P: I think the Ethiopian government has to do something on this because this is about human beings not about commodities. People, especially women are suffering and the government has to protect its citizens in every way possible. And it has to be very soon since each day matters for such migrants who are suffering. During my stay in the waiting place in Dubai, upon my arrival, I have seen Ethiopian women suffering due to abuse by their employers or agents, and they were exposed to various diseases. I have also seen many women, who traveled with me back home, and some of them were physically injured and some had lost their minds. So, this is a huge problem that needs due attention from the government.

R: What is your advice to potential migrant women?

P: From my experience, I know it is not easy but, if it is possible, migrants have to try to get clear information on the prospect of their work abroad before departure. I know the agents will not let them know the truth about their job and stress them out until they get the money they want from them. But, it is good to get reliable information from different organizations as it will

help for preparation and on what to decide .On the other side, trying to do something in their country such as starting small business is also an option.

R: Can I call you if I need to ask you further questions?

P: Yes of course

R: Thank you so much for your time. You have been extremely helpful.

## **Case 2**

R: Why did you leave your country?

P: Where should I start from? My parents were very poor and lived in a rural area. Since I have completed grade 12 and I could not find a job, I decided to go to one of the Arab countries to improve my life and support my parents.

R: Tell me the role of other people in your decision

P: My cousin was working in Dubai as a domestic worker at that time. She was the one who arranged my travel.

R: Tell me about your travel. Who was facilitated or made the payment?

P: My cousin living in Dubai has arranged my travel. My cousin has promised me that I will work as a baby sitter in Dubai.

R: Tell me about the challenges you faced during travel and upon arrival etc.

P: My travel was arranged with a direct flight to Dubai, and I did not face any challenge during my travel. But after my arrival at Dubai airport, I expected my cousin had arranged someone to pick me up. However, there was no one to pick me up. I had to stay for hours until someone showed up. I was worried, so I called my cousin and told her that I had arrived and was waiting at the airport. My cousin told me that she would call the agent in Dubai and will arrange

someone to pick me up. After three hours or so, an employer came took me to his house in Abu Dhabi without any agreement. I was then realized that, my cousin was living in Abu Dhabi.

R: Tell me about your relationship with your employers.

P: I was promised to work as a baby-sitter but I ended up doing cleaning, cooking, washing clothes and all other house chores. My employer expected me to work until midnight and sometimes even later than that. When everything was not done perfectly, she shouted at me and pushed me to work harder. She thought that I was like a machine that functions 24 hours. I believe I was so good and obedient to my employers but they were not good to me. I had no rest and sleep, and if I work faster thinking I would have extra hours to rest, it would not work because I would be given additional tasks to do. The place was very hot and my employers usually stayed up all night and I had to serve them with whatever they needed.

After I worked for about ten months, the agent told me that my cousin got seriously ill and was expelled back to Ethiopia. So the agent forced me to work for the family my cousin used to work for, in addition to the work I was already doing. Their house was a walking distance from my first employer's house. And I was expected to go and work every day. In this way, I have served both my employers for about five months and when I asked for my salary, they refused to pay me. Then, I become depressed, sad and used to cry every day. I missed my family and did not communicate with anyone since I came to Abu-Dhabi. I was also thinking about my cousin and started fearing that I might get sick like her.

You know! ...my cousin got sick and was taken to the hospital but her condition did not improve and her employer started beating her up because she was not able to work. After some time my cousin became extremely sick, unable to eat and speak and was finally deported back home.

R: How did you manage to return back home?

P: I was in a bad situation with my employer. I work day and night but she was not happy. But my employers were not willing to give me my passport instead he took it to the concerned government authority which made it difficult for me to travel back home. Then, I dared to ask my employer to help me in calling my brother who was living in the US so that I can ask my brother to buy me a return ticket. Then, my employer allowed me to contact my brother, who told me that an Ethiopian woman living in Dubai would help me to return. At that time, there was no Ethiopian Embassy, so and the woman contacted the Ethiopian Community in Dubai. Then, the women bought a ticket and sent me through a member of the Ethiopian Community in Dubai. The person from the Ethiopian Community acted as if he was from the Ethiopian Embassy in Saudi Arabia and my employer allowed me to leave with the person as he thought that the delegate was a high official. As soon as I arrived in Dubai airport, the Ethiopian women explained the situation to the immigration officials at the airport and she gave them her own passport as a guarantee for me to board to plane. The Immigration Office kept the passport of the Ethiopian woman until they made sure that I had boarded to plane

After my return, everything was frustrating, especially, as my relatives and the people in my neighborhood were expecting money from me and they had no idea of what kind of hardship I went through. The other challenge was the negative attitude of some people based on certain assumptions they have about what I have been doing there some people might think I was engaged in prostitution and their attitude affected my friendship and social interaction.

R: What were your expectations before you migrated and what actually happened?

P: You can imagine what I felt. I was exploited for a year and two months, serving two employers for nothing! I felt hopeless and discouraged and life was tiresome for me. I still feel the pain of exploitation that happened to me.

I was not expecting such things to happen to me before my departure. I only thought that the workload would be too much but it never crossed my mind that I would be forced to work for two employers for nothing and be mistreated like I was. You can only imagine how difficult it is for a person to go somewhere with such high expectation and hope to find the reverse to be the reality.

R: Could you tell me your views and attitude towards human trafficking?

P: Hmmm! I see the problem is very huge and that I am not the only one who had faced this problem; there are many people like me. Something has to be done by all concerned organizations. Look at me! I have faced such a horrifying thing behind the closed doors of my employer's house and nobody knew. Something has to be done to stop this.

R: What is your advice to potential migrant women?

P: Oh my God! What can I say to them? I believe working as house-Maid abroad will not bring significant change in someone's life. I have seen some women who have sent all their money to their families back home and their family spent all the money. These women will be empty handed when they return back home and so they want to go back again. I have seen many women run away from their employers for different reasons and being a prostitutes and send money to their families. But they will never tell anyone how they got the money because they are afraid of the stigma from the society and pretend as if they are doing well. By doing this, they may get much money but will have a big problem on their self-image. In any case, I say that it is better to stay in your own country as I have seen it and I have learned a great lesson for my life and I advice them not to go.

R: Can I call you if I need to ask you further questions?

P: Yes of course

R: Thank you so much for your time. You have been extremely helpful.

### Case 3

R: Why did you leave your country?

P: I decided to work abroad because I wanted to support my mother who weighed down by working on the street as a petty trader. I was the youngest of my siblings and my sisters were married and left to live their own life. But I had the desire to support my mother for I loved her very much and I always feel sorry that she was working on the street.

R: Tell me the role of other people in your decision

P: Although I decided to work abroad due to the economic problems of my family, the reality of my friend's sister who went abroad before me and the promise given to me by the broker on how working abroad could change my life have encouraged me to migrate.

R: Tell me about your travel arrangement. Who was involved? How was payment made etc.?

P: My friend introduced me to the broker who sends people abroad and my friend's sister had already gone through his arrangement. And I thought that if I go and work like my friend's sister, I could improve my life. So, I was introduced to the broker through my friend and the broker persuaded me how my life would change if I go and work abroad. And I thought it was an opportunity that should not be missed. Then the broker asked me to give him Birr 14000 in two phases to process my travel and I had paid him Birr 6000 equivalent to USD 478 at that time as a first payment and agreed to pay the rest from my salary on monthly bases.

R: Tell me about challenges you faced during travel and upon arrival to your final destination.

P: My trip to Beirut was arranged via Egypt, and that was the only stop-over. There were other migrant women traveling with me to Beirut. As soon as we arrived at Beirut airport, the agent

took our passport. I saw a lot of Ethiopians were crying and shouting and the whole situation was shocking for me. Then, we were taken to a dreadful place which looked like a prison, and we were not allowed to go out. For some of the Ethiopians who were with me, their employers came and took them. In my case, my employers were said to be out of town and came the next day. I suspected the agent and my employer have agreed with something regarding my employment. Then, I went with my employer without written or verbal agreement.

R: Tell me about your working experiences, working situation etc.

P: The work was too much. It was beyond my capacity. So, few weeks later, I asked my employers to send me back home, but they said they could not send me back because, I had a lot of debt to pay back to them. But I kept insisting that I needed to go back home and begged them to take me to the agent. Finally, they took me to the agent, who told me that I could not go back home. Then, the agent decided to take me to a new employer.

The new house I was taken was owned by a big family with many children and grand children and my male employer has no wife. After I served them for about four months they were not willing to pay my salary. Despite that I continue to work there tolerating the excessive amount of work I was expected to perform and always obeyed every order given to me.

One day, my employer's daughter tried to beat me up and I strongly said to her 'You cannot beat me with no reason as our deal is very clear. I will work for you and you will pay me that is it'. I also added what I have heard about the news on the Ethiopian domestic worker who had killed her employer due to the continuous abuse her employer was inflicting upon her. I said this, thinking that she would stop abusing me for fear of the consequence of her action. When things got worse, I even considered running away but I was afraid of being caught by police or end up in detention center, and might get into the worst than the life I had with my employers.

R: Tell me about your working relationship with your employers.

P: It was terrible! My male employer used to frequently come to where I sleep in the middle of the night and ask me to have sex with him. He would try to convince me and constantly bothered me by saying ‘...If you have sex with me you can call your family and I will provide you with everything you need’. However, no matter what he said, I refused to have sex with him. However, I was being stressed and was feeling helpless and used to cry continuously. I had no rest at all and after some time, my right hand started to get numb and I had difficulty washing clothes, as my employers would not allow me to use the washing machine. The only way I could get out of the house was if I went with them on Sundays to visit their friends and relatives. However, it was not a break but another workload waiting for me. I cannot explain in words how much pain and frustration I passed through. I remembered the situation I saw at the airport, where many distress migrant workers were shouting for help that was similar with my situation and I thought something has gone wrong at the beginning.

When I informed my employers that I want to go back home, they told me that they had spent money to cover for my medical expenses and that I am the one that owes them money to pay back that amount. That meant I had no money left to be paid as salary. The only thing they were willing to do was buy me a return ticket once I reimburse them the amount for the medical expenses. Finally, they paid me only one year of my salary and refused to give me any money for the other 2 years I worked for them.

R: How did you manage to return back home?

P: One day, I went to a mall with my employers and I found a public phone and called the agent’s office. The agent asked my employer to buy me a return ticket. My employer was willing to buy me a ticket, if I had reimbursed him the medical expenses he paid for me from my salary

and I agreed to do so. When I arrived in Addis, I heard that both my parents have passed away and I was very sad—sad, more than one can imagine.

When I arrived in Addis, I heard that my mother had passed away and I was very sad more than one can imagine, because my mom was the reason for my going abroad and realized my entire plan had gone upside down. Soon after my return, I observed that my sisters and the people in my neighborhood were expecting money from me and this made me feel helpless and fear that I may not be able to maintain the relationship I had before and I felt there was no one who can understand my problem. I don't even know what to do for my living. But weeks later I contacted Gemenay Ethiopia Association (GEA), and the association referred me to IOM to get reintegration assistance.

R: Tell me challenges and advantages you have experienced.

P: Hmm! You mean gain? I am sorry, there is nothing I can consider as a gain, and instead I lost everything.

R: What were your expectations before you migrated and what was actually happened?

P: Oh my God! What happened once I got there was just the opposite of what I had expected before I left. I regret that I did not try and work in my own country before trying to leave though I would not make much money I would, at least, have spared myself of the suffering I went through. When I left my country I was normal except minor hearing and sight problems. I do not think I am in a good condition emotionally because of the high stress I had to go through. All in all, I didn't get what I expected. No money, no improvement but now it is too late. What can you do once things go wrong and you cannot do anything to reverse it?

R: Could you tell me your views and attitude towards human trafficking?

P: I do not think this is something happening to Ethiopians only. People are suffering around the world. I did not have much information before I left my country and the only thing I could do was to simply trust what the agent was telling me. It turned out that what he told me was not true. I think something has to be done by the government and other organizations such as the IOM and Gemenaye Association Ethiopia to protect Ethiopian women working as domestic workers.

R: What is your advice to potential migrant women?

P: I do not think it is about going there through legal or illegal means but about meeting your expectations. I also know many women have faced horrible things like me even though they traveled in a legal way. I cannot say there will not be problem if you travel legally as migrants cannot escape the risk of being abused. So, my advice for potential migrant women is that, if they are adamant to go, they have to look for the right information from a reliable source. Another option I suggest is that, instead of going over there and losing your mind and coming back with many health problems like I did, staying in your country and working what is available is better and safe.

R: Can I call you if I need to ask you further questions?

P: Yes, of course.

R: Thank you so much for your time. You have been extremely helpful.

#### **Case 4**

R: Why did you leave your country?

P: My husband and I had no income after we were displaced from Eritrea during the war between Ethiopia and Eritrea in 1991. I tried to get a job but did not find any; it was hard! Later on, my husband came up with the idea that I needed to go to Beirut as other women are doing

and work for some years. I accepted his idea thinking that it is a good option to support our selves and raise our children. I also did not have any other option.

R: Tell me the role of other people in your decision

P: Actually, the initiative came from my husband. My husband thought working abroad as the best option to improve our life. After we both agreed on the idea, my husband's friend played a big role in facilitating my trip.

R: Tell me about your travel arrangement. Who was involved, how was payment made, etc.?

P: After we decided that I was going, the friend of my husband told my husband that he would arrange my travel if we were able to pay Birr 7000 which was equivalent to USD 1000 at that time. Then we sold our equipments and borrowed some money from our relatives and managed to pay half of the amount, and agreed to pay him the rest from the salary I would get. The broker told my husband that he would get me a good job with monthly payment of 150 USD and I would be working only eight hours a day. The broker got the visa for me visa in a month time.

R: Tell me the challenges you faced during travel, at transit and upon arrival at the final destination.

P: My travel was arranged with a direct flight to Beirut. After my arrival, an employer was waiting at the airport. And, as soon as she met me, she took my passport and we went together to her house.

R: Tell me about your experiences at work.

P: When I asked for my salary, they used to insult and harass me and I accepted the situation and became silent for years. I was frustrated and was feeling helpless. I felt that I was less than normal. I do not feel that I am normal now; as you can see me, I am not physically fit for work. I feel that I am suffering from mental problems due to the challenges I faced through the years. I

have health problems and when I was in the hospital in Beirut, they told me that I have a heart problem. But I have heard that some girls were driven to insanity and admitted to hospitals for the purpose of taking out their kidneys for sale. There are many Ethiopian who lost their life due to such type of organ removal and I really do not know what had happened to me when I was admitted to hospital over there. After the agent refused to help me get back home, I reported to the Ethiopian Embassy in Beirut stating that I was suffering! I was not able to get my salary and was not allowed to go home and I could not get any help from the embassy which was very disappointing to me.

R: Tell me about your working relationship with your employers

P: The working relationship was not good. At the beginning, she told me that she would pay me. Although I felt that my salary was very small, that is USD 100 per month, I continued working without complaint as I was afraid she might deport me without paying me salary, which would have been worse for me. The broker in Ethiopia had promised me that, I would be working eight hours a day, which was not true. But, I was working 18 to 20 hours a day and my employer took me to her friend's and relatives' house to work for them during weekends. I was asking myself: 'How can a person survive working like this without rest for many years? Even though I worked there, they did not even provide me some food to eat and as soon as I returned to my employer's house I had to work the house chores as usual. Then I realized the promises given by the broker were not true and full of deception.

After I worked for three years, my employer paid me my three years salary and deducted about USD 500, claiming that I have broken some equipment, which was not true. After that, I continued working for another five more years. My employer was not willing to send me home or pay my salary. I was distressed and felt hopeless as there was no one to rescue me from the

condition I was in. When I asked my employer to pay my salary, she always said: I will give you all your money when you are ready to go home. In the mean time, I called the broker in Addis Ababa without the knowledge of my employer and asked him for help and he said he was only responsible for the first three years. Then, I realized that I had no option other than waiting until the end. Finally, due to lack of rest and sleep, I was seriously sick and admitted to hospital. But, there was no improvement on my health and was not able to move one of my legs and my right hand.

R: How did you manage to return back home?

P: I did not clearly remember how I returned since I was sick and was not fully conscious. I was laying down occupying a space that would have been a seat for three people in the aircraft. I think my employer might have contacted Ethiopian Embassy in Beirut. However, the Embassy was not of much help when I was complaining that I was having problems in my job. I really do not know what had happened to me in when I was admitted to the medical center for free treatment. What I know for sure is that, as my screening medical report confirms, I was in a good health when I left my home country.

I have sent all the money I got to my husband to raise my children. But, when I arrived home, my husband got angry and said, "Get out of my house; I don't know who you are". From that day on, I got scared and wished that I could hide myself for some time not to see any one. After I got assistance from IOM, I opened a small cultural dress shop. My husband used to frequently come to my shop and threaten to kill me. Once, he came out of nowhere and charged at me with an iron rod, but missed me and hit the wall.

I brought a legal action against him with the help of the Ethiopian Women Lawyers Association /EWLA/ and now have my divorce papers after a long process. In the mean time, my shop got

robbed and I stopped working because I was not able to pay the rent. Now, as you can see me, I am not able to work due to my health problems. I am separated from my kids and am living alone in a tiny room. I have no income for daily food and to pay house rent.

R: Tell me any challenges and advantages you have experienced

P: Yes, I have faced so many challenges as I told you, but there is no advantage at all. I have just lost what I had before.

R: What were your expectations before you migrated and what actually happened?

P: I had such high expectations before I left and I had never imagined such things. I was not prepared to face such kinds of conditions. I had a plan to improve my life and raise my children and to buy my own house. But what really happened was just the opposite. As you can see me, I lost my health, my money, my morale and I feel very inferior and shameful.

R: Could you tell me your views and attitude towards human trafficking?

P: This is a big challenge happening every day to many women like me but is hidden from everyone. I think the government and Ethiopian Embassies in the destination countries have to do their job seriously. If the Ethiopian government has no budget to help the women suffering, then what is the use of having an embassy there? Believe me: Ethiopian women are suffering in closed doors for months or even years. Something should be done. For me it is very late, but my horrific life experience can be a wakeup call to help others.

R: What is your advice to potential migrant women?

P: Ahhh!!! (Big sigh) In my opinion, I say it is better for them not to go. Look at me! What did I benefit from going? Nothing! Some women have their good health and earning their living as daily laborers is much better than mine. So, from my experience my message for potential migrant women is to first give a try to all the means available to live and work in their country.

Although work opportunities are very limited it is good to try that first before migrating. For those deciding to go, they should not have high expectations and should know that the worst could happen to them.

R: Can I call you if I need to ask you further questions?

P: Yes of course

R: Thank you so much for your time. You have been extremely helpful.

### **Case 5**

R: Why did you leave your country?

P: The Financial problem of my parents was a challenge for me. My father was retired and my mother was a house wife. So, I was supporting my parents since my childhood by selling roasted beans on the street and attending school at the evening class. Later on, it became difficult for me to work on the street and at the same time continue my education. Then I realized this would not change my life and decided to work abroad and improve my life. So I dropped out of school and started working as a full time daily laborer in construction sites, aiming to save some money and migrate to one of the Arab countries.

R: Tell me about the travel arrangements: who was involved and about payments made etc.

P: One day, I met a broker who sends people to Arab countries and the promise given by the broker influenced me to decide to go abroad in a shorter period of time. I paid him Birr 4000 (USD 318 at that time) in cash by taking debt with high interest, which was in addition to what I have saved. After I paid him the money, he asked me to sign an agreement that stated he was my uncle and warned me; if I refused to sign, I would not get the job he promised me. He also promised me that he would escort me to Beirut. So, I signed the agreement and accepted

everything he said as I considered going abroad was the best option for me. He arranged my travel with direct flight from Addis Ababa to Beirut. After I signed the agreement, I thought the broker would go with me as promised, but he didn't. Upon my arrival in Beirut, the son of my employer picked me up from the airport and kept my passport with him. I was placed as per the arrangement of the broker in Addis Ababa, but I had no agreement with my employer about my salary. Later on, I discovered that my transport expense was covered by the employer.

R: Tell me about your experience working as a house maid

P: The son of my employer took me to a big house where people came from different places for worship or witchcraft activity. My job was to prepare coffee and tea and facilitate everything while they did the witchcraft to other people. I was serving day and night without rest and had no sleep at all. My employers did not give me enough food to eat. I was only given a small amount of rice and a cup of milk once a day, and nothing more, so I was getting weaker and weaker.

I was frightened in the kind of witchcraft activities that my employer was practicing which was very unusual for me and could not tolerate it. At the end, I felt sad, lonely and became hopeless when I knew my employer was not willing to pay my salary. One time, I took some acidic substance wishing to kill myself and fainted for some time. I worked for seven months with no pay. I was 60 kg when I got there, but when I came back, I was weighing less than 35 kg. I do not remember how I came back home since I was unconscious.

My employer used to force me to work the whole day and until 2 am after mid night and I was not allowed to take a break during the weekends or even in a month time. I had no contact with people in the neighborhood or with my parents. I cannot go out of the house nor move outside of the compound. I remain confined in the house. I was not allowed to have any communication

with my family. When I asked for my salary, No one was responding and my employer just ignored me.

R: How did you manage to return back home?

P: I felt very sad and hopeless and that my plans have turned upside down. The money I saved working as a daily laborer is already gone. After working day night without rest and enough food for seven months, my employer was not willing to pay my salary. I had no contact with any one, my parents, Ethiopian Embassy, no one! I am not sure of what happened to me since I was not conscious. I guess my employers got scared that I might die in their house and decided to send me home. But I say that I am more fortunate than those Ethiopian women who are suffering in prison in Beirut. They wish to come back but were unable to come. Some of them are in prison because they have to pay a fine and I know there are many women who are facing problems.

I returned home very sick and mentally disturbed. I was worried about the feeling of my neighbors towards my sickness as my neighbors started talking about my mental disturbance and this caused me more stress. Then my family took me to church for holy water treatment and I stayed for weeks in a quiet place in a church compound. Sometime later, I felt better and I began thinking about what I could do for my survival and support my parents.

R: What were your expectations before you migrate and what actually happened?

P: I was expecting that I would be able to work for some time and get a good income will be able to accomplish my planes. But what I faced was completely different from what I have expected. I have lost everything; my money, my physical and mental health and I feel disappointed as my planes were not come true. As I looked for help, I heard about IOM. What could I do? Life is full of crises and challenges and I just came back to zero. I now understand that the trafficker was running after his own advantage and didn't really care about me. I cannot even ask him to

give me my money back since I don't know his full name and address. Besides I have no evidence showing that I gave him the money.

R: Could you tell me your views and attitude towards human trafficking?

P: It is a big problem but nobody knows about it. When I explain to my parents the suffering I have been through they said it would have been better if I kept working by being patient and tolerating everything. I guess people say this because whatever is happening happens somewhere else and in secret. So I believe people need awareness because the problem is beyond understanding.

R: What is your advice to potential migrant women?

P: Oh! What can I say? I have seen the problem over there and I know the problem here. Let me tell you something I am planning to go to Kuwait through a legal agent, if possible, because our group business established through the assistance of IOM does not exist and I am unemployed right now and so I decided to try again what can I do? Now I have learned a lesson and will at least ask more questions this time when I talk to the agent and try to get as much information as I can. Therefore, maybe I can advise them to get as much information as they can about the kind of job, salary etc before they go there. It might help...I guess.

R: Can I call you if I need to ask you further questions?

P: Yes of course

R: Thank you so much for your time. You have been extremely helpful.