'DOING HOPE'

MENTORING WITH PEOPLE DOING CARE, WORKING AND DEALING WITH TRAUMA IN A TOWNSHIP IN SOUTH AFRICA.

by

CHRISTINE McLACHLAN

submitted in part fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF THEOLOGY

in the subject

PRACTICAL THEOLOGY – WITH SPECIALISATION IN PASTORAL THERAPY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: DR JOHAN MYBURG
CO-SUPERVISOR: PROF JPJ THERON

FEBRUARY 2007

ABSTRACT

Working in a township is a challenging but also rewarding way of living. In this dissertation the researcher, in collaboration with the co-searchers, explore ways to mentor one another as they learn how to deal with trauma, either by experiencing trauma directly or witnessing secondary trauma. This leads to new ways of being 'in the moment', coping with trauma, forming a community of care and learning to be in an aware and empowered position. The responsibility of practical theology and the commitment to pastoral care are explored in the context of theology, and spesifically feminist theology, contributing to 'do hope' in Mamelodi.

Key terms: practical theology, G/god/dess, trauma, witnessing, pastoral care, feminist theology, community of care, co-searchers, mentoring, doing hope, township, ethics, education, music, research, post-modern discourse.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thank you to:

Dr Johan Myburg, for being my mentor, sharing your wisdom and knowledges and guiding me in so many aspects;

Prof Jacques Theron, for your input and guidance, I could learn from your wisdom;

Dr Elmarie Kotzé, my mentor that always believed in me, your support and care carried me through many difficult days;

Prof Dirk Kotzé, you taught me so much about ethical ways of being, you challenged me through sharing your wisdoms;

Prof Kaethe Weingarten, for sharing wisdoms;

Euodia Swanepoel, a wonderful supervisor and mentor that passed away in December 2006, you will always be in my heart;

Juliana McLachlan, for many hours of reading and supporting me on this fascinating roller coaster ride;

Betsie Meyer; you saved my life by protecting me when the community wanted to kill me, you are a wonderful friend;

Lynn, Hans-Jurgens, Pindele, Betsie and Graham, my family in Mams; we could 'do hope' with 'our children' in Mams;

My friends and family; without you this research journey would not be possible.

LIST OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 3: IS THERE A PLACE FOR g/GOD/DESS/THEOLOGY IN A TOWNSHIP?

CHAPTER 4: MENTORING AS WE WITNESS HOPE/DESPAIR

CHAPTER 5: 'DOING HOPE'

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSION

'Doing hope'

Mentoring with people who care, work and deal with trauma in a township in South Africa.

Researcher: Christine McLachlan

Supervisor: Dr Johan Myburg

Co-supervisor: Prof J P J Theron

Chapter 1

An introduction to this research

1.1 Introduction

South Africa is a diverse country with an estimated population of 46.9 million (http://www.stassa.gov.za/census01/html) with most people living in townships. South Africa is a nation dealing with Aids, poverty, hunger, a high crime rate, high unemployment figures, different ethnic groups and so much diversity. The 'New South Africa' is also a country living with newfound freedom, new opportunities, a new government and new challenges.

South Africa is also part of Africa, the world's poorest continent. As Edwin Cameron (2005:44) states: 'In the last five hundred years it (Africa) has suffered the ravages of slavery, colonialism and exploitation. It continues to be crippled by debt and the exclusionary policies of the world trade system, enforced by wealthy countries.' Africa is faced with many challenges.

Living and working in South Africa can be very traumatic. Living in a country with some of the highest crime statistics in the world, murder, rape, high jacking, armed robbery and so much more confront people on a daily basis. Trauma is part of South African life. Reading through reports of health care professionals leaving the country, is shocking. Listening to friends and colleagues as they struggle to 'do hope' (Weingarten 2000:389) with their clients makes me aware of how many of these people are traumatized by the stories that they listen to. Kaethe Weingarten (2003:6) coins the term 'common shock' as the shock people could experience when witnessing violence and violation. She claims that 'people witness when they see, hear or are told about interpersonal or structural violence and violation' (Weingarten internet witnessing project).

With the high crime rate, Aids, poverty, poor living conditions, despair and hopelessness are centralized in the townships. People from areas outside the townships are becoming more involved in township life either by working in the communities or through 'outreach projects'. This influx was created by more work opportunities that presented itself in the townships after 1994, the birth of the New South Africa. More people realized the plight of people in the townships (one could also wonder about the influence of apartheid's guilt). Others were relocated to placements in the townships as previously disadvantaged areas received more services. Teachers, social workers, people from medical professions, police personnel, ministers and others became part of this working team. In the group, consisting of educators at a school in Mamelodi, one educator was relocated to the township, four educators left fulltime positions either because they 'wanted to make a difference' in the township and/or better remuneration and one accepted this new position as it was the only fulltime position he could apply for in music at the time.

Other educators that work or worked in Mamelodi conveyed that for them the working conditions in Mamelodi were worse than ever before. They have experienced more direct trauma these last three years either by life threatening situations or criminal acts and victimization. But professionals are not only traumatized and shocked by living in this country or by experiencing criminal acts directly, they also need to deal with secondary trauma through the stories of their clients/ learners/ patients and by witnessing daily living. This presents the challenge of working with people being traumatized on a daily basis in their area where they live but also experiencing trauma themselves. Professionals (care-do-ers) now need to deal with primary and secondary trauma. Primary trauma being trauma that is experienced directly by the care-do-er, where as secondary trauma is where a care-do-er is 'exposed to another person's trauma' (Weingarten 2000:102).

I met educators through this research who decided to leave or received transfers from the township because they could not cope with the trauma any more. As one of them conveyed - listening to the life stories of the learners, especially the girls' narratives, became for her too much and when she found herself in a life threatening situation, it was the last straw and she needed to leave the township. She was a well-loved educator that worked for more than fifteen years in the township and had to leave the township because her life was threatened. She believed that teaching was her 'calling' and that was her way in which she could serve God.

The co-searchers and I were listening to the narratives of other professionals, their experiences of life threatening situations, but also listening to the trauma narratives of learners and witnessing the poverty, Aids, trauma, despair in the township created the question: Could mentoring with one another as people doing care, could create better working conditions and enable the educator to deal with the witnessing and impact of trauma?

This dissertation focuses on mentoring with the care-doers working in the townships, people doing care that need to deal with common shock (Weingarten 2003:6) in the area of their work. Weingarten (2003:3-13) uses the term common shock as she believes that this

is a widespread occurrence, it is collective and it happens often to people in every community. Witnessing violation and violence creates a response of common shock and the more a person witnesses the less they register, as shock affects our mind, spirit and body (Weingarten 2003:4).

1.2 The inspiration to this study

According to Judith Plaskow and Carol Christ (1989:12) 'we must recognize that we cannot each make all issues our priority, and those that seem most urgent to us will likely be connected to our own histories and identities'. Although I have lived and worked my whole life in South Africa I have not been able to come to terms with the pain, sorrow and hurt that is prevalent in our communities, seeing the pain but also listening to other people's stories.

This topic woke me up early on a Saturday morning and I just knew, by the way that I felt the topic in my body that I had to do this study. It felt like the study came to me, invited itself into my life. But I was reminded of the following: 'Western scientific methods of research display disembodied knowledge' (Heshusius & Ballard 1996:4). How could I feel it in my body that I had to research this topic?

Heshusius and Ballard (1996:4) are of the opinion that in adulthood and through professional training 'we learn to separate what has come to be seen as rational ways of knowing from non-rational ones, to separate disembodied ways of knowing from embodied ones, assigning an epistemologically privileged status to the former'. It becomes part of our way of being and acting, part of our making choices to rather work from the 'disembodied ways of knowing', knowing that is more detached and non-participatory. Knowing that works with 'not intuition, not imagination, not feelings, not spiritual knowing, not knowing through connecting, participation, and identification; not qualitative subtleties; and surely not the knowledge that the body holds' (Heshusius and Ballard 1996:5).

Dirk Kotzé (2002:22-23) questions the ethicality of disembodied knowledge that silences 'ethical reflection'. Feminist ethics, on the other hand, 'is rooted in the integration of body and mind…. The importance of feelings must be affirmed, not as ends in themselves, but as part of moral actions… A feminist moral theology welcomes feeling for what it is: the basic ingredient in our relational transaction with the world' (Jakobsen 1994:151).

As a researcher through my years of training I came to a point where I would prioritize disembodied knowledge as this is centralized in the majority of courses. The courses taught that 'it was necessary to place one-self in a detached, non-participatory relation to that which one wanted to know, including towards oneself. The knower was no longer allowed to be enchanted in the act of knowing, that is, to fully participate at the spiritual, emotional, and somatic levels' (Heshusius & Ballard 1996:4). By this disembodiment the researcher was separated from the situation and detached from others that were part of the research. This led to a separation from the knowledges that were investigated, creating disembodied knowledge. Objectivity became the norm and an outsider approach was used.

It was for me important to deconstruct, to take apart, this perception. It became important to find a weaving of rationality and somatic-emotive knowing. Or as Heshusius and Ballard (1996:5) advocate that somatic-emotive knowing is a different form of rationality. Embodied practical theology 'accepts that all perceived reality and all knowledge are mediated through our bodies' (Ackermann 1998:87). It becomes thus a holistic participation of the person in the research. This is how I see that morning when I was woken by the topic that evoked energy in me to start writing. I realized through embodied knowledge that this topic was the one that I would investigate. But through the months it was also the somatic-emotive knowing of despair and frustration that made it sometimes very difficult to continue writing on this specific topic.

The question then arose: But why did it move me in the beginning of the research and why with so much energy? I think there are a number of reasons.

Accepting a new position at a school in Mamelodi, a township near Pretoria, put me in a situation of working full time in a township, a township called Mamelodi that means the

'mother of all melodies' (what better name for a place where we teach music as a form of 'doing hope'). I have been working in townships since 1988 but always as part of 'outreach projects' (and how patronizing can it be to assume we are reaching out to a certain community…) and would only be teaching once a week in the township. Over many years I had the opportunity to witness the transformation of a nation and the township from the apartheid regime to a 'New South Africa'.

The difference at Mamelodi was that I was accepting a position where I would work five days a week in difficult circumstances with children and young people who have experienced so much trauma first hand. The challenge was and is to look for ways of teaching music literacy, teaching the recorder and using music from their context to 'do hope' in the community. But nothing could have prepared me for working full time in a community struggling with poverty, Aids, child headed households, rape, sexual abuse, physical abuse, emotional abuse, illness, hunger, aggression, hopelessness, the sense of no future and so much more. Trauma is part of their way of living and became part of the teachers' way of living.

As teachers we were submerged in a community where stories of trauma were the dominant narrative. Over the years I have seen teachers, participating in our school's 'outreach projects', reaching a point where they were unable to continue to teach in Eersterust, a mixed-race area north-east of Pretoria, as the stories of pain that they witnessed became unbearable. The teachers heard of the trauma that children experience: they learnt about pupils who were shot in gang related violence, children being burnt with gasoline stoves, children in pain by living in broken, abusive homes, seeing Aids killing children and their families and so much more. This became too much to bear. Most teachers preferred to return to their houses in the city and tried to shut the pain of the children out. They never returned to Eersterust. I was and am scared that I might find myself in a similar situation and would loose more colleagues, people who are now willing to work in a community that is exposed to daily trauma, in the same way. The question arises: When will we become unable to cope with the pain and struggle? Will we also become 'hard' and ignore the pain or will we try to shut out the trauma at night when we lock our doors and security gates? Will we be able to 'do hope' with people in six months' time?

Ministering/pastoring in church communities also led me to question the role of believers in communities. Church politics and internal affairs take a lot of 'person-power' hours. Working towards care in a community I found that the church and its members were centralized, with the people outside of this community marginalized and I also wondered what our responsibility was as church towards the broader community in the context of care.

Furthermore studying in the field of practical theology, working from within a feminist theology context inspired me to investigate ways in which the believer/church could become more praxis orientated. Feminist theology is practical through 'prayer, worship, in relationship with others, struggling for equality, and being as one with the poor and the oppressed' (Oduyuye 1994:38). The church needs to be committed in taking responsibility for the oppressed and the people living in difficult areas, but also in the supporting and mentoring of the 'care-do-ers'.

These experiences and interests inspired me to do research on how to 'do hope' with care-workers facing trauma in their work and life, especially those working in townships in South Africa. Sharing with other care-do-ers in similar situations I felt that the way in which the group was mentoring each other was an important concept to investigate and research.

I decided to use the terms care-do-ers or care-workers rather than caregivers. Caregivers can be seen as people giving care to others. It could be understood that caregivers are coming from a more empowered or privileged position and thus being able to care for others. It can also create a power imbalance. Where the caregiver is in the position to decide where and to whom care is given, and in what form the care would be given. The recipient of the care has thus less power, if any power, and furthermore is placed in the receiving position that could lead to dependence and not being enabled to take ownership of the care. Being a care-do-er places the person doing the care in the situation, becoming part of the community to the extent that it is possible. By participating in the process, power is distributed between the parties that are involved and power can be shared. It also

enables the participants to be actively involved in creating an opportunity to share but also becoming one through the sharing of the responsibility of doing care.

Mentoring in turn is the process where people support one another, care for the person, be in the moment with the other and share knowledges. According to the website http://www.rcr.emich.edu/module7/g2_definitions.html (n.d.) the definition for the word mentor is as follows:

> Mentor: The word comes from the Greek mythical character, Mentor, who was the guardian and teacher of Odysseus's son, Telemachus. A mentor is a person who takes a special interest in helping another developing into a successful professional. This relationship may involve academic advising, assistance in socializing in the disciplinary culture, or help in finding employment. A mentor is an adviser, a supporter, a tutor, a sponsor, a role model.

Mentoring is mostly seen between the teacher/educator and student. In Mamelodi mentoring was not a one-way directed action. It was more sharing in the role of mentor and being mentored. But we also became co-searchers. 'Co-searchers refer to a participatory search in which the 'researcher' and the 'subjects' of research become participants in co-searching for new knowledges about which all participants have a say' (Kotzé 2002:25).

The co-searchers / mentors included in this research are predominantly my colleagues at Mamelodi High School working in the music department. They are Betsie, Lynn, Graham and our newest members Hans-Jurgens and Pindele. These care-do-ers had prior experience working as teachers/educators or lecturers in the field of music although none of them was based fulltime in a township prior to their appointments to Mamelodi. The co-searchers shared experiences, stories, ideas and wisdoms through conversations and as I made progress in the writing up of the research some of the group gave feedback after they read drafts of this research.

We as educators in turn form part of a larger 'participatory consciousness' (Heshusius 1996:131) in the townships. 'Participatory consciousness is when we see the self and the other as belonging to the same consciousness' (Heshusius 1996:131). Thus I also invited participation from other care-do-ers (teachers, students, social workers) in the townships. Moving away from the objective self/other distinction towards a position 'where the self and other are seen, not as separate entities, but (rather) as an ontological and epistemological unity' (Heshusius 1996:131). This participatory consciousness did not only include the educators and learners but also people that formed part of the community in Mamelodi.

I think this study became even more relevant when I heard that my mentor, a person and student supervisor that played an important part in my life was leaving the country, partly because she felt overwhelmed by what was happening in the country.

1.3 Research curiosity

Sometimes I wish I could shut out the reality of what is happening in our country. That suffering will miraculously vanish, that Aids will be a word that we do not even know the meaning of, that we could say that we have not experienced crime first hand, that this is not the reality we live in. We open our newspapers and we read one after the other story about death, pain, suffering and a community that forgot how to care. In the *Pretoria News* 27 July 2005 on page 10 is an article about Mamelodi being the hotspot for serious crime. The article by Patrick Hlahla begins with the following paragraph: 'Mamelodi has been singled out as a hotspot when it comes to serious contact crimes such as murder, attempted murder and rape.' The article mentions that poor social conditions and unemployment aggravate these circumstances and lead to serious crimes being committed. The following page states: 'South Africa has 5,3 million people living with HIV' (*Pretoria News* July 27 2005:11).

But sometimes we read of this one person caring, doing hope and getting involved in the challenges of our country. In the book *Witness to AIDS* Edwin Cameron shares his life story living with Aids. And through this narrative hope is created as he witnesses how

Aids is affecting South Africa, reflecting on the despair but also creating hope and doing hope with others as he challenges his readers to take responsibility searching for healing. Cameron (2005:215) states: '[H]ealing lies within the power of our own actions…AIDS beckons us to the fullness and power of our own humanity'. And through this book and interviews, Edwin Cameron is making a difference in this country.

I wondered if it could be possible to create a circle of care that would enable care-do-ers to 'do hope' in a country where hopelessness seems to steal so many of our professionals? A country where 'daily encounters with suffering, hunger, malnutrition, unemployment, rage and anger, crime attacks, violence, rape – all these issues are not extraordinary but ordinary to many counsellors, caregivers and pastoral therapists' (Kotzé & Kotzé 2001:2).

As Busisiwe, a grade 12 recorder learner wrote: 'South Africa is a country which is suffering from a lot of problems like poverty, hunger and HIV/Aids. These things are caused by South Africans themselves because they are lazy to think of ways to make ends meet. I live in a community where there is a lot of unemployment mainly caused by laziness.' She ends her essay with 'Every person who doesn't have a job can also do things for themselves if only they put their minds to it. It's not that difficult.' For Busisiwe there is hope although she lives in very difficult circumstances. She gives suggestions and challenges certain aspects in the community.

Although many of the young people want to leave South Africa when they have completed their school career, others want to stay and make South Africa a 'better place'. For people from different cultures and backgrounds Africa is their home and they see and experience the positive aspects in South Africa. For them there is still hope for a possible 'better' future in this country. Believers also find through their faith in God hope for the future. 'The realisation that God is ultimately in control, gives human beings a new measure of hope' (McLachlan 2000:121).

Furthermore I wondered by forming this 'community of care' (White 1995:55), if this group could also celebrate the challenge of ambivalence, the ambivalence that is created between the struggle of hope versus despair (Carmody 1995:31). Although South Africa is

struggling with so many narratives of despair there also exists a spirit of hope and wonder. Victor Frankl believed that by living with hope means that a person can believe that there is something he can do with his life (Nicolson 1996:210-211). And through this challenge of creating hope and meaning a new energy is formed enabling the group to do even more hope.

In the school where we teach we witnessed so many instances of 'doing hope' together. Not only by creating music together or sharing in listening for example to an international renowned violinist (and then sharing in the cake that he brought with – I can not decide if the violin performance ought to be the cherry on the cake or could the cake be the cherry on the violin playing?) but also in the day to day caring for one another. We saw how gangsters started attending music lessons rather than to commit crime. How one of the learners saved a puppy and cared for it because she saw one of the teachers caring for the dogs that live on the school grounds. Learners that were sick became stronger when Betsie started bringing in fruit. When a street child became part of the project we found that certain learners also became involved in the caring for him, and when he left, the sadness it caused was also experienced by some of the learners. But we also saw the reality of the fights that existed to be part of the music project. When the project started we had many more learners that were differently abled but these learners did not return after a while. It was only later that we discovered that some of the stronger learners worked them out. The stronger learners would tell the differently abled learners that they were not welcome. They also did not give them any opportunities to play the instruments in the group and would convey to the teachers that the differently abled children were not interested. In Mamelodi we learned what it meant – the survival of the fittest.

I listen to other care-do-ers and I wonder how we could do hope together in the short and long term? Is there a way in which we can support and mentor one another, forming a community of care? Is there a way in which we can stand together against burnout? Might that lead to more people getting involved in 'doing hope'? If therapists and counsellors were not as burnt out and flooded by the trauma would it be showing in their work, community life and in their own perception of themselves?

I also wondered if we as care-do-ers could 'do hope' with one another, would it at all influence the way in which we 'do hope' with the traumatized people. Would it be possible to create a circle of care with a small group of people and would that then extend into our communities and benefit the larger community? 'How we respond to common shock has significant effects on our own lives and our individual responses have ramifications for the society as a whole' (Weingarten 2003:17). If we as care-do-ers come to a point where we cannot continue our work, what would be the ramifications in our society?

Furthermore what is the church's role, being the body of Christ? How are we supporting the people who are doing care in the community? Are we as ministers so focused in dealing with the trauma that we experience that we are also blinded to our colleagues in need, even our own need? Do we include the care-do-ers, even ourselves in our pastoral care?

I also wonder if we as care-do-ers are aware or unaware of the witnessing positions, and if we are empowered or disempowered? (Weingarten 2003:30). The witnessing grit, developed by Weingarten consists of four positions:

The first position is the aware and empowered position. In this position the care-do-er is aware of the suffering or trauma experienced by the self, or with others, or by others. The care-do-er also has the ability to do something about the situation. Part of being aware Weingarten (2003:27) reminds us that: 'an aware witness may suffer'. Even if the witness is empowered it does not safeguard the person from experiencing a wide range of feelings and emotions. Additionally Weingarten (2003:35) reminds us that witnessing takes a toll. But this position makes it possible to be a 'compassionate witness' (Weingarten 2003:33). For example we could see that the young learners were malnourished. We could see that they were hungry and that they could not concentrate during lessons as their energy level was very low. We as care-do-ers could do something about this given situation; we were empowered to bring in 'pap' (a thick maize porridge, staple food for many in Southern Africa) and 'langsous' (sauce). 'A professional who witnesses violence or violation in the course of his work and feels aware and empowered in relation to it is likely to be someone who is practicing effectively and competently (Position 1). This position is positive for all

concerned' (Weingarten 2004).

The second position is when one is unaware of the meaning but empowered. In this position the care-do-er is not aware of the trauma or suffering although able to do something about this situation and is witnessing it. According to Weingarten (n.d.): 'Witness position 2 represents the most toxic condition for others, since a person in this position is unaware of the meaning and significance of what she is witnessing but is empowered in relation to the situation. A person in this witness position is most likely to do harm, where 'do' refers to omissions as well as commissions.'

Position three is where the witness is disempowered but also unaware of the significance and meaning of the act being witnessed. The care-do-er is thus unaware of the situation and does not have the skill or ability to do something about the situation.

According to Weingarten (2004) position four was the most problematic position of the research project. In this position the care-do-er is aware of the meaning of what the person is witnessing but feels disempowered thus helpless and ineffective. This in turn could lead to empathic stress reactions experienced by the care-do-er. 'There are three kinds of empathic stress reactions that may have significant consequences personally and for one's job and clients: burnout, secondary traumatic stress reactions, and vicarious traumatisation.' One of the experiences in Mamelodi was when children 'stormed' me in order to get some of the 'pap' that I was carrying in the pot and I became acutely aware of the need for food in Mamelodi, not only during the times we were there but also other times and I realized the extent to which we could not help.

What is significant about these positions are that it is possible to move from one position to another. Witnessing positions also tend to change over time (Weingarten 2004:30). But in pastoral care we have a commitment to strive to find ourselves in the first position. A position in which we can form an active part in witnessing with compassion and caring for one another. The church/community of believers also needs to become the witness in society, not just 'aware' of suffering, trauma and common shock but also empowered as a community of faith.

1.4 Research question

What can we as a community of care do to mentor one another as care-do-ers, when working in an area where trauma is experienced by the people we work with on a daily basis, but also where we become the witnesses to the trauma? We as mentoring partners share certain experiences in this new situation and will experience trauma as well as witness trauma together. Is there a way of mentoring that will create a community of care, linking us to a participatory consciousness?

Furthermore practical theology being 'a theological operational science which is concerned with the critical theological reflection on the theory-praxis dialectic' (Ackermann 1993:21), has a definite amount of input to share in our community. 'Practical theology includes many aspects of pastoring activity, and traditionally in South Africa, training in practical theology has focused on liturgy and worship, preaching or homiletics, communication, Christian education and pastoral counselling … more broadly, by practical theology we mean that disciplined, reflective theological activity which seeks to relate the faith of the Christian community to its life, mission and social praxis' (Cochrane, De Gruchy & Peterson 1991:2). The pastoral activity in South Africa should include the care and mentoring of one another. The question arose whether we could enable ourselves and one another to be better pastoral carers in our context through mentorship practices in Mamelodi.

1.5 My commitment to this study

Living in South Africa I have a commitment to this country and our people. Loving this country and the people inspire me to work with the people towards a future where we can stand closer together, being compassionate witnesses (Weingarten 2003:33), building a future and 'doing hope' together as a community of care. I see South Africa as a country with so much potential, a country with a rich but also sad history, a country where courageous and caring people live. Where ubuntu (Tutu 2004:25) is a word that we can

still find and where we are able to build together the 'New South Africa'.

It saddens me to see that the people in Africa are loosing the struggle against despair. It saddens me to see people suffering, including those who work to build a community. It saddens me to realize that so many of us are experiencing that we are slipping against the power of poverty, Aids, violence and crime – that ubuntu is not visible in all the townships in South Africa, and that we struggle to live ubuntu. Ubuntu is the word taken from the Nguni languages that speaks of interdependence, interdependence between humans and the rest of God's creation (Tutu 2004:25). It means literally 'a person is a person through persons' (Shutte 1994:29). Ubuntu has the ability to transform communities and to do hope in the community.

This makes me even more committed to this study thinking how this country will look if care could become stronger and the hopes of ubuntu could become more visible. I do wonder what we would see if there is no hope left, if we as care-workers and we as people that love this country were all so burnt out that we could not 'do hope' together any more? The question arises what would happen if ubuntu was completely removed from South Africa, from Africa?

I hope that we can build a community of care standing together as compassionate witnesses, 'doing hope' together. A community where we can take action, transforming despair into hope (Carmody 1995:31) and work towards a future where there seemed to be none. Listening 'to the voices of the marginalized, acknowledging their points of view as diverse-but-equal, and inspiring the marginalized to realize their potential, use their talents and come into the centre' (Bons-Storm 1996:27).

But to be a compassionate witness we need to be aware and take action for the purpose of transforming violence and violation (Weingarten 2003:33). Further more we need to acknowledge our needs, remembering: 'wounded helpers can still be competent ones' (Weingarten 2003:116).

As a pastoral therapist I am committed to transformation. One needs to position 'oneself on the side of those suffering and against oppressive or exploitive discourses and practices' (Kotzé & Kotzé 2001:3). I am aware of the situations in which some care-do-ers are, that they are suffering as witnesses to trauma, and this places me in the position that I need to commit to this study. Witnessing suffering and oppression or exploitive discourses / practices does not mean that I must take responsibility for changing it but by becoming aware of it places me in a frame where I need to react to my witnessing of the discourse or practice (Weingarten 2003:116). A community where we can take action transforming despair into hope (Carmody 1995:31) and work towards a future where there seemed to be none.

As researcher I am also bound to ethics, transparency and accountability (Kotzé 2002:25-30).

Researchers need to be accountable in their research, not only in the community where the research is conducted but also in the writing up of the research. 'We are accountable because we have moral agency' (Ackermann 1998:91). Kotzé (2002:26) states that as researchers we construct realities and therefore need to acknowledge the moral implications of the realities that were constructed. White and Epston (1990:29) suggest that one needs 'to establish conditions that encourage us to critique our practices….' To review and critique the process, as well as the way in which one conducted this research, forms part of accountability. To be accountable is also to challenge one's own notions and discourses and ideas. It is not always possible to identify discourses as it is mostly only when discourses shatter that one is able to recognise the discourse. The researcher needs to be open to the notion that discourses shape one's life and aware that discourses present themselves through interactions and in our thoughts but also through the creation of social constructions. Doehring (1999:99) states:

> Accountability included acknowledgement of my context and the power afforded by my position. The importance of such self-reflexivity is part of feminist perspectives that emphasize both the situatedness of knowledge and the interrelatedness of the knower and what is known.

In our communities we need to strive towards accountability as this is a step towards healing (Ackermann 1998:91). For example focusing on the Apartheid experience in South Africa we as moral agents need to be accountable for the events. Even as witnesses to the events entail that we share responsibility in the actions that were taken.

Being bound to ethical ways while participating in research, binds the researcher to a set of principles. Ethics are a 'reflection on what ought to be and how we can be liberated and motivated to bring it about' (Nürnberger quoted by Kretzschmar 1994:3). It is a 'conscious reflection on ethos... the explicit process of accounting for moral choices' (Botha 1994:37). Kretzschmar (1994:3) defines Christian theological ethics as 'an understanding of what ought to be, willingness on the part of individual believers to be saved and to become disciples of Jesus Christ, and a commitment on the part of both individual believers and communities to preach and practise their faith with reference to human, social and physical reality'. Christian theological ethics are thus not only concerned with research and research methodology but also with theology in praxis.

'The Christian ethic is also normative in the sense that it considers certain values and actions as inherently right or good and their opposite as wrong or evil' (Kretzschmar 1994:3). That suggests that if Christian ethics are seen as a normative discourse it then has the possibility of marginalizing non-Christians and their ways of being. On the other hand it needs to be acknowledged that ethics are social constructions. Christian ethics are mainly constructed by middleclass, Christian heterosexual men. It thus becomes the researchers responsibility to take apart these constructions (deconstruct the discourses) and find a way in which participatory ethics can emerge.

Kotzé (2002:21) suggests that pastoral carers need to move away from ethics to 'ethicising'. He states that 'if we choose to *ethicise* (or act in an *ethicising* manner), the dynamic process of *"doing ethics"* becomes more participatory and transparent'.

Using participatory action research as the main research methodology I had to recognise that 'all research methodologies are implicitly political in character, defining a relationship of advantage and power between the researcher and the researched' (McTaggart 1997:1).

A crucial feminist theology insight is that 'the personal is the political' (Jakobsen 1994:151). Participatory action research challenges these power relationships striving to distribute the power amongst the participants.

Commitment must also have a practical theological input. Villa Vicencio (1994:186) states: 'Constructive political theology has to do with Christians being prepared to soil their hands with others in constructing political, socio-economic and other initiatives that better serve the poor – to whom the Scriptures require us to show a preferential option.' As church and as believers we have a responsibility towards the community, especially those who have been marginalized.

Furthermore 'we have lost the sense that this earth is our true home, and we fail to recognize our profound connection with all beings in the web of life' (Christ 1989:314). We have forgotten that we are part of all humankind and that we are part of one creation. 'The preservation of the earth', and thus humankind 'requires a profound shift in consciousness: a recovery of more ancient and traditional views that revere the connection of all human beings in the web of life and a rethinking of the relation of humanity and divinity to nature' (Christ 1989:314). Desmond Tutu (2004:28) states that '… the world is discovering that we are made for interdependence not just with human beings; we are finding out that we depend on what used to be called inanimate nature'. 'The feminist principle of relationality and the connectedness of all things have broadened the focus of debate on ethical issues to include ecological concern'. (Jakobson 1994'155). We need to 'seek new knowledges to bring about alternative ways of living in which all, including our ecology, can participate in life in a mutually respectful, caring and collaborative manner' (Kotzé 2002:25-26). Feminist theology opens up the possibility to investigate the intertwined character of all creatures, nature and G/god/dess. 'We need to recognise that the cosmos and our whole planet form an interdependent ecosystem in which all our actions have consequences for the environment that are reflected back to us.' (Jakobsen 1994:155-156). The earth is not only a creation but also a re-creation as G/god/dess is actively involved in it as creator, sustainer and renewer (De Gruchy & Field 1994:204).

But nature's reflection can also indicate and expose the people's struggles in their context.

Mamelodi is an area with not a lot of trees and even less green grass and plants. It is an area where one does not see a lot of gecko's or birds, but it is rather an area where rats are very visible. Dust forms part of the township and an inadequate water supply exists. This forms part of the communities' needs and thirst. For the learners trees were a sign of a better life.

1.6 Purpose of this study

As I have stated I hope to create a community of care for people living and working in a society where the prevalence of the experience of trauma is very high, furthermore sharing some of the music teachers in Mamelodi and other care-workers working in a township's experiences.

I hope to create a situation where people can mentor one another. Where the mentors can support one another, share knowledges and ideas, care for one another, experience with one another and to be role models for one another. Where mentoring is praxis based and can become part of practical theology. Where believers can share their wisdoms, ethicise (Kotzé 2002:21) with one another and be able as a community of care to share in the experience of the research but also in a larger context being able to connect and live the ideals of ubuntu as well as the Christian notion of caring with the other.

Furthermore I would want to question with the group the major social constructed discourses regarding caring and the way we conduct professionalism. 'Discourses according to Foucault, refers to not only the abstract idea, but to a group of particular persons and their practice of writing and speaking' (Thomas Widdershoven, in the preface to the Dutch translation of *L'ordre du discourse* 1988:14). In *The Order of Things* (1971) Foucault argued:

> that there are several discourses
>
> that the battle for power and domination characterizes the relationships between these discourses;
>
> that each discourse applies certain procedures to maintain its

domination' (Bons-Storm 1996:63).

I will investigate the ways in which the discourses influence our ways of care giving and receiving of care.

It is necessary that the group will be able to put forth their needs and ideas for purpose of this study and as I stated earlier that I hope that the co-searchers will benefit directly. That the research will treat the co-searchers as 'autonomous, responsible agents who participate actively in making their own histories and conditions of life' (McTaggart 1997:39).

1.7 Structure of the dissertation

As this is a dissertation of limited scope I decided that I would rather work on a more 'easy to read' writing style and structure as I hope that this research would be more accessible to researchers but also to non-academic readers. I also worked from experiences and wisdoms that we as co-searchers were able to share but also from my own experiences and wisdoms.

Research needs to benefit not only the participants of the research (see chapter 2) but also have the possibility to benefit the reader of the research. As participatory action research comprises the experience of the co-searchers, as well as the struggle of 'doing hope' and finding ubuntu, it becomes possible for the non-academic readers to participate in the research by the reading of it and the forming of their own ideas and wisdoms. The knowledge that was gathered in this research, acknowledging that this knowledge was one of the possible knowledges that can be investigated in this research, can hopefully contribute in the broadening of 'doing hope' in the townships. Kotzé (2002:28) states that 'participating in an ethicising searching allows for a collaborative and continuous process of interpretation and re-interpretation (deconstruction)…' This kind of research opens up the possibility for re-interpretation and that enables research to be dynamic. The readers could thus broaden their own perspective but also that of the research by adding their own wisdoms and ideas. The readers' participation with the research could also lead to critique and that could broaden the knowledges that are shared in this research.

Furthermore research is necessary to be available for non-academic readers, as it is mostly non-academics that work in the field. Research is not only an intellectual challenge or a sharing of knowledges (or perceived knowledges) in the academic world, but also needs to be available for the people working and even living in the field. By enabling co-searchers to participate and by using more inclusive language, knowledge can be shared but knowledge can also be communicated and created through a community of care. This enables research to be more transparent and accountable as it can be scrutinized by all the participants but also used by all if people so choose. However, it still needs to be acknowledged that restrictions and limits are set by using language and although a conscious effort was made to use inclusive language practices certain people will inevitably be marginalized as they use different ways of 'languaging' (Kotzé, Myburg & Le Roux 2002:x).

I decided to weave some of the narratives of our (my colleagues and my own) work in Mamelodi into the dissertation as I reflect on the different aspects of this research. I believe that research is both scientific as well as a form of art. Research needs to be based on a scientific model in order to be accountable. But as we research it becomes an art not only in the writing up of the data and narratives but also as we share in a creative way with our co-searchers and readers.

Chapter 2, 3 and 4 consists of the different aspects of this research. I decided to share with the reader general concepts that I used in this research and sharing with the reader the ideas that presented themselves. I have also woven Mamelodi's stories into these chapters.

Chapter 2 focuses on the research models that had the most influence on this research.

Chapter 3 deals with theology and its contribution to this study.

Chapter 4 investigates some of the challenges that could be experienced in pastoral care and in the mentoring with care-workers.

The final chapter deals with ideas that presented themselves during the research, some of the ideas that came to mind and new questions that presented themselves. It is also a chapter in which I will be evaluating the research and present further ideas in the area of this research. This chapter also contains critical self-reflection. Ballard (1996:30) states: 'Critical self-reflection requires that we rigorously challenge our motivations, ideas and assumptions from alternative perspectives'. In this research but also in my work and in my life I need to critically do self-reflection. I need to challenge concepts of ideology, power and purpose and 'be open to a range of interpretations, constructions and reconstructions' (Ballard 1996:30).

Chapter 2

Research in a township

The first time Betsie and I drove into Mamelodi we knew we wanted to work there. The people were friendly and it felt like a homecoming. As Lynn said 'It is the best place that she ever worked'. We drove through streets looking at the small houses, the reddish dust and cars driving over the only red light in Mamelodi. People were driving differently than in town. It was a new experience, with challenges and newness beckoning. Working for so many years in a predominantly white privileged school this was different. We sat in the headmaster's office. We felt at home. The three of us knew that we wanted to work in Mams (as we now call Mamelodi). One week later Graham joined us.

We started with only a couple of learners joining us in the first few days. But by week two we saw about 140 children a day, learners from the age of three to 19 years. Some could speak English but the 'young ones' struggled with the English and thus communicating with us. It was overwhelming. Especially the young children were malnourished, wore torn clothes and one could see that some were ill.

We started bringing in food and old clothes. Some of us tried to learn words in their language. But it was so exhausting. And three weeks into the first term I found myself crying uncontrollably after the children stormed me to have some of the pap that I was carrying in the pot.

I experienced with my colleagues frustration and hopelessness. We were overwhelmed and tried to care for one another amidst the stories of abuse and hunger and illnesses, witnessing together the trauma and experiencing common shock. And even while we were together in this experience we were coping differently and dealing with the trauma differently. And sometimes I just felt totally alone in this overwhelming situation.

This is where I worked but it also became the topic of my research as we as teachers and fellow care-do-ers became mentors for one another.

2.1 Introduction to research

Neuman (1994:1) describes research as 'a way of going about finding answers to questions'. Social research focuses on the social world, the community and individuals. It is 'a collection of methods people use systematically to produce knowledge' (Neuman 1994:2).

The two main ways of doing research are either through the qualitative or quantitative approach. As I was not working with any measuring tools and working with the narrative of Mamelodi and its care, the qualitative approach was the method to incorporate. This kind of research needs to include transparency, ethicality and accountability.

2.2 Research method

Dane (1990:5-9) identifies five different goals that enable us to develop the research method. The goals he identifies are exploration, description, prediction, explanation and action. Where as exploratory research attempts to determine whether a phenomenon exists and descriptive research examines and describes a phenomenon more fully, prediction speculates about one thing by identifying the relationship of another phenomenon. The goal of explanation is an attempt to find a cause-effect relationship. Action research on the other hand 'refers to research conducted to solve a social problem' (Lewin 1964 as quoted by Dane 1990:8). According to Neuman (1994:22) this kind of research is not value-neutral as it seeks to promote change.

The research's aim was to investigate the mentoring with one another, people working in a difficult and traumatic situation. Furthermore I researched the way in which the group

supported and cared for one another. It is thus more a description of what happened.

The research model I mostly incorporated in this work is participatory action research. 'Participatory action research might be described as a broad church, movement, or family of activities…. The word church probably connotes community, solidarity, and commitment… The term church also evokes questions of ethics, morality, values, and interest…' (McTaggart 1997:1). Movement is connected with the notion that research is political in character and 'family' is used in this description 'for the humanistic and political reasons the term evokes' (McTaggart 1997:1).

Using a qualitative method also entailed that rich descriptions of the social world were regarded as valuable (Denzin & Lincoln 1994:6). I also included the aim of feminist research in which 'self-reflexiveness is seen as an essential aspect of transformative research, requiring an awareness of one's own position. Emancipatory feminist research aims at being reciprocal, encouraging deeper self-reflection and understanding on the part of the researched and the researcher in a relationship of mutual subjectivity' (Ackermann & Bons-Storm 1998:5).

Feminist research has a dual mission. The first aim is to create social change, for example by transforming gender relations. But this kind of research also focuses on the advancement of knowledge (Reinharz 1992:252). This research mission in Mamelodi was to create social change by creating with the co-searchers but also the community an opportunity for social change where we could 'do hope' as people sharing in the same participatory consciousness. But by the writing of this dissertation it also became a means to contribute to the possible advancement of knowledge. Feminist research challenges the researcher to place her/himself in the first position of Weingarten's witnessing grit where the witness is aware and empowered and thus can become a compassionate witness. Furthermore 'ethicising research practices' does not only imply the self reflecting of the researcher or the taking on of responsibility of the knowledges that was created by the research, it is also the knowing with the community that is involved in the research (Kotzé 2002:26-27).

I did not work on a basis of formal interviews but rather encouraging open conversations. This method created problems as we were challenged with conflict within the group and this tend to silence the participants. As the focus also shifted sometimes more to own issues and issues between group members it became very difficult to gather data and narratives. On the one side I was an insider part of the growth and experience but also became an outsider when conflict existed. I was also working at the school as an educator and this placed a further burden on the research as I was bound by certain structures and codes. But even if a researcher is posed with these restrictions it still necessitates ethicality, accountability and transparency.

'Theory needs to be informed by action, and action by theory' (Kretzschmar 1994:3). Research is also informed by action in Mamelodi, by the witnessing and experiencing of trauma in Mamelodi but also in the way we as care-workers dealt with the experiences. On the other hand research also informs action as we shared knowledges that we gathered through education and research. This was not a clear-cut process as research and action informed one another.

2.2.1 Co-searchers

Through this participatory action research methodology there is no 'functional distinction between the researcher and researched. They are all defined as participants' (Stringer 1999: xii). Kotzé (2002:25) describes co-search as a 'participatory search in which the 'researcher' and the 'subjects' of research become participants in co-searching for new knowledges about which all participants have a say.' Research reflects thus not only the class, gender, culture, history, race and world view assumptions of the researcher (Hess 1998:55) but also those of the co-searchers, broadening the possibilities of different truths and knowledges being reflected in the research.

Working with co-searchers enables one to work with more perspectives but it causes also difficulties especially when friction develops in the group. As a group we had to be involved in negotiations in which each participant experienced a 'good life'. 'To live is to participate in an ethicising manner' (Kotzé 2002:21). This became a tremendous challenge

as people's personalities clashed and visions differed.

The notion that each participant needs to benefit from the research was also challenging as people benefited in different ways. It was also difficult to measure how the person benefited as people value things differently and there does not exist a measuring scale that can measure the amount of benefits that each person received. There were also times that some people benefited more than others.

The research was conducted through the sharing of stories, experiences and wisdoms. It became more difficult to share as the group went through challenging times. The aim in this research was to portray some of the different wisdoms and experiences.

2.3 Research ethics

Paul Rabinow (1994: xxv-xxvi) relates that one of Foucault's working premises concerning ethics is that ethics is the practice of freedom. Another premise formulated from Foucault's work is that 'ethics is not just a theory – it is equally a practice, an embodiment, a style of life'. Whereas research tends to focus on disembodied knowledge in this research paper the researcher focuses on embodied knowledge. Knowledge is not just a mere detached, non-participatory gathering of information. The researcher is involved in the research even on a somatic-emotional level.

'Prescriptive ethics' is 'ethics resulting from a process of deductive reasoning grounded in systems of 'truth' that are mostly embedded in scientific and/or religious discourse. This form of ethics allegedly has objective or transcendent 'truth' status and is not bound by time or context, thus assuming prescriptive status' (Kotzé 2002:13). But knowledge does not constitute the ultimate truth as more than one truth can and is most likely to exist. Furthermore knowledge is socially constructed entailing that the knower and knowledge are interdependent (Anderson 1997:36). There exists thus a movement away from 'generalizable truths toward a new emphasis on local context' (Stringer 1999: xi). 'A post-modern discourse ethic is committed to universal participation, and it intentionally expands

the number of voices and a variety of forms of knowing in its moral and religious deliberations' (Hess 1998:65).

An 'external reference point to help differentiate between right and wrong' (Kotzé 2002:17) does not exist. Ethics can not be boxed into a certain way of thinking or living since ethics are dynamic. It changes in different contexts, groups of people, time frames, religions, cultures, experience and understanding. Ethics need to be created as a dynamic vision – and not as a stagnated set of rules – striving towards an inclusive celebration of 'doing hope' with one another, questioning practices that marginalize certain people and excludes them from the participatory consciousness. If we aspire to being ethical, 'participation of all' becomes a primary commitment (Kotzé 2002:18).

In Mamelodi we found that the co-searchers had similar but also different views and experiences. Although certain truths did become part of the group, other truths were not shared by all the participants. For example some members would wonder if the system was sometimes exploited by some of the participants where others did not share in these concerns. Through the participation of the co-searchers more truths and knowledges could be included in the research. An 'ethical consciousness' can only be formed if one, in this situation the researcher and co-searchers in Mamelodi, aspires to the inclusion of all, especially those who are silenced and marginalized, forming a participatory consciousness. Careful attention had to be given 'to ensure that otherwise unheard voices are given expression' (McTaggart 1997:14).

Being part of the participatory consciousness as co-searchers became problematic at times when issues such as bickering and conflict crept into the group. As researcher, I experienced that being more an insider, more subjective, created areas where it became difficult to assess the research. During these times when silence dominated our being together, when it was safer to rather be quiet because opinions, questions and ideas could cause further imbalances and frictions in the group, it became difficult to retrieve and share opinions and thoughts from the co-searchers. This kind of research also challenged the researcher to 'initiate and validate alternative ways of knowing' (Hess 1998:64). But even through silence, knowledge could be shared, as silence also formed its own voice and

meaning.

'Ethics and morality are inscribed as essential features of human inquiry – not simply as standards to be met in the interest of humanity but as standards that determine the very nature of study outcomes' (Stringer 1999:xiii). Theological ethics is a process in which theologians (believers) 'seek to provide answers to the real questions people are asking about their faith and its application to their personal and social existence' (Kretzschmar 1996:3-4). But if one moves away from 'ethics to ethicising' all the co-searchers are enabled to participate, but it also challenges the participants to live in 'ethical ways of being' (Kotzé 2002). In this study it became for some of the co-searchers a way of living.

Kotzé (2002:11) created ethical political questions to challenge paradigms, truths, doctrines and knowledges. These questions can also be used in the reflection and the process through which research is conducted namely: Who benefits from the research? Who suffers from the research? In this research it became one of the main tools to evaluate the action and plan the action as the research was conducted. But these questions also evaluated the ethical viewpoints that influenced the research.

Furthermore the researcher needs to be aware that the account presented in this research 'is just one among several defensible accounts that might be presented' (McTaggart 1997:14). This particular research and the writing of the research are in a specific context, time and space and are conducted by a certain group of participants and co-searchers.

Embodied knowledge challenged the researcher 'to do research' that prioritised ethicising and invited participation (Kotzé 2002:23). As researcher I found it sometimes difficult to enable all the co-searchers to participate in the research at all times. Working in Mamelodi also made me wonder if research is more a flow that is created through action and motion. These events and ideas then created situations and communication between the co-searchers, which one could then investigate, realizing that the voice and interpretation of the action then again created new constructions. Research became an interaction between action and interpretation.

2.4 An immersed researcher

An immersed researcher is a researcher that becomes part of the research. Participatory action research 'is not research done on other people (McTaggart 1997:39). It is research where the researcher becomes part of the research project and can 'organize the conditions under which they can learn from their own experience and make this experience accessible to others (McTaggart 1997:27-28).

By being an immersed researcher one can form part of the research, the process, the action and the search for meaning. But it could also cause friction and sometimes difficulty when a group of co-searchers move through difficult times. Being part of the process resulted in the situation that it was not always possible to discuss all aspects as one is actively involved in tension-filled situations. To stay ethical and accountable as well as transparent became a real challenge. Furthermore, silence became part of the experience. Its voice silenced other voices and as a somewhat immersed researcher, left me also silenced at times in its wake.

To be part of the process, becoming immersed in the research also included being part in the experiences. Gaining new knowledges through the participation but also experiencing the emotional ups and downs in the project. Being immersed created the possibilities of experiencing trauma, witnessing trauma from the different witnessing positions and being vulnerable to burnout.

In Mamelodi the care-givers tried to become part of the township, to belong. Betsie is of the opinion that she knew she had knowledge to share with the learners. She wanted to give something to the community, to become part of the community, but she did not know how to convey this knowledge and even after these two years she still does not know how. The 'belonging' into the community is a process – a process that we are still participating in, although we also realize that we will never be completely immersed in this township. We will always be outsiders but also have the privilege to be part of this group. Through this movement between these two positions we experienced growth and gathered understanding of being part of a participatory consciousness. As care-givers we have also experienced

being immersed in the group but also times when we could only observe interactions. As researcher I also experienced these fluctuations. 'Inquirers do not discover knowledge by watching nature do its thing from behind a thick one-way mirror; rather, it is literally created by the interaction of inquirers with the object (construct) inquired into' (Stringer 1999: xii). As pastoral counsellor/believer it also enabled me to become involved in the ethical-political practice of being part of the process of creating knowledge (Kotzé 2002:6). 'The feminist maxim that the personal is political' became part of this study (Isherwood & McEwan 1996:173).

2.4.1 Empathy and compassion

'Most writing and research on empathy has acknowledged the complexity of this phenomenon and specifically the existence of both cognitive and effective components of the empathy experience' (McLeod 2002:377). Empathy is the stepping out from one's own comfort zone, engaging with the other and sharing in the experience, not only cognitively but also on an emotional and spiritual level. The methodology of participatory action research enables the researcher to have empathy in the research process with the co-searchers as well as in our situation, with the learners.

Weingarten (2002:48-49) is of the opinion that 'compassion is much more a process of entering into the experience of another and being simultaneously in one's own and the other's life space. It is suffering *with* another. Collaborative communication is the means through which compassion operates.' The process of forming a participatory consciousness enables the participants to share life space. As feminist theology promotes equality and questions patriarchal influences in our communities we found in Mamelodi that empathy and compassion was not being pressurised or hindered by hierarchical influences.

Tutu (2004:136) shares that compassion and empathy only become meaningful the moment where the action in the situation can also be conducted in a callous and indifferent way to the suffering of others. It poses thus a choice where praxis can be based on empathy/compassion or where the person can be indifferent. The witnessing positions of Weingarten also under scribe this choice where one can be aware and be in the moment

(position 1) or aware but not able to partake in the situation (position 4). The witnessing position of being aware and empowered (position 1) does not necessary entail a dramatic way of dealing with the situation and miraculously providing a solution but through compassion and care the witness partakes in the process of 'doing hope' with the person/community. Suffering with another does not entail that a person needs to be hindered or depleted by this kind of suffering but rather sharing in the moment and being in the moment with the other.

Western culture "stresses individuality at the expense of community, and independence at the expense of connection" (White & Denborough 1998:13). Through empathy and compassion mentors can deconstruct these beliefs.

2.4.2   Becoming overly involved?

For the co-searchers the limit before over involvement transpired was for each participant unique and different. For some of the participants it was essential to provide food and clothes for the learners, others reckoned that this was not the responsibility of the educators. Some of the educators committed themselves to the caring for the dogs that lived on the school grounds where others found the care for the children as the focus and were not willing to include the animals in the care. Although the co-searchers differed on these aspects we could still participate in the caring for the learners. When a care group was formed (Hands and Feet for Christ) by a doctor who heard of the learners' plight and began to provide the food and clothes on a daily basis, the responsibility of searching for food was alleviated. As the community of care's scope widened, more people could be invited to participate in the caring for the learners.

As mentors we also tried to support one another in the different ways of caring for the learners, although it sometimes entailed discussing sensitive issues. At first we tried to take the learners to their homes after a competition/exam but experienced that this was too unsafe. We realized that it was not worth risking our own safety in order to participate in events. But although we decided that we could not provide transport at night, the learners were able to find ways of organizing their own transport.

The provision of food and clothes also created difficult circumstances. As carers we tried not to discriminate in the division of food but found that the secondary schools' learners would grab the best food first and leave the 'young ones' with the dry bread and without fruit. In 2004 when the project was in its infant shoes we found ourselves also standing behind the 'pap-pot' figuring out how to create 'langsous' out of two carrots, one potato and three instant soup packets. We were ill equipped but we tried to teach and listened to 'Twinkle, Twinkle little star' while stirring the sauce. But after a year we did see a difference. The 'young ones' looked in better physical condition and could concentrate more. Were we overly involved? Did we compensate for the 'apartheid-guilt'? I believe these are questions that can be asked. But as Betsie wondered: 'Could we ignore the children's plight?'

In certain areas we did agree that we went overboard for example when we tried to provide a home (Betsie's home) for a street child. Lynn and I saw a street child living next to a privileged school in Tshwane. We approached him and he communicated that he just longed for a mother and father and a house. We took him to a social worker but we could not find a house of safety that could take him in that was not an institution. He begged us to go with us. Betsie agreed to take him in. A lot of self-sacrifice went into the care of this child. In Weingarten's witnessing grit we were mostly part of the aware/disempowered position. The social worker said that we could try with this child but she did not have hope. We could see that he was in need of care but we did not know how to deal with for example the sniffing of glue dependence and the fact that he was stealing from Betsie and her family. All three of us were on an emotional roller-coaster, feeling high and low, hoping for a miracle, feeling the pain of seeing a 12 year old sleeping under a shrub on the pavement, searching for more care-do-ers and support. People donated clothes; we even organized for a possible school which he could join. We were exhausted on many levels – emotionally as well as physically. Looking back on that month I wonder what drove us to try to save the child? Was it only care or guilt or maybe a combination of these factors?

Christina Landman (1994: vii) claims that '…Afrikaans women are socially and politically enslaved by piety'. Afrikaans women are known for their self-sacrifice, the piety that involves pleasing a male god and men. Women are viewed as being 'Eve and therefore

guilty of the misery of all society…' (Landman 1994:viii; McLachlan 2000:105). Furthermore 'women have been socialised to believe that in order to be "good Christian women" it is necessary to sacrifice oneself for others' (Jakobsen 1994:157). Self-sacrifice has become for some women an important moral principle where they first of all 'seek the good of others before themselves' and this has become part of a 'justification for the exploitation and mistreatment of women in society' (Isherwood & McEwan 1996:123).

When this child showed up three months later at Betsie's house with the police she explained why she could not help him anymore. Two weeks later he showed up at our home in the middle of the night. I felt guilty to show him away and saddened because I did not know how to help. I struggled with the issue of taking responsibility. We did take him in but he walked away. We tried to find a place of safety for him but he did not want to live in a group home. To what extend do I need to take responsibility for him? In the end, was it fair to this street-child to try to help him? We are left with a feeling of failure. But this experience also changed us as carers towards others. As Betsie said she realized that she had to place her family before caring for others. For Lynn it was very sad not to be able to find an alternative for this young boy. She was shocked in the reaction of some people in the community that just did not care about street children and their plight.

The care that we tried to offer this street child overshadowed self-care and even care for our own families. We experienced that the guilt that we shared with society, of not caring for 'our children' overshadowed choices and decisions. Ubuntu states that each child is our child (Tutu 2004:29), that we share in the responsibility of care for children. Through Christianity we learned that Christ said that his apostles needed to show the children to him and not to send them away as the dominion of G/god/dess belongs to them (Luke 10, Matthew 19 and Mark 10)

But through caring a person can also experience the neglect of care for others. When people become overly involved or even just very involved in their care for others the possibility exists that their care for their immediate family could be neglected. But this becomes a greater problem when care-workers experience burnout. 'People with burnout feel emotionally drained by the work that they do. In most instances burnout occurs in a

healthy person who has had no psychological problems beforehand and who has been drawn to her line of work out of the desire to help others…. Burnout consists of physical, emotional, behavioural, relationship, and work-related difficulties' (Weingarten 2000:101-102).

Posttraumatic stress disorder on the other hand is 'an anxiety disorder that develops in response to an extreme psychological or physical trauma … these events may involve a threat to one's life or to a spouse or family member' (Sue, Sue & Sue 1994:189). According to Sue, Sue and Sue (1994:164) posttraumatic stress disorder's symptoms includes:

>Re-experiencing a traumatic event through recurrent and intrusive memories and dreams.

>Attempts to avoid thoughts of event; tries to remain emotionally detached from the event.

>Increased arousal manifested by sleep disturbances, temper outbursts, concentration difficulties, and exaggerated startle responses.

Burnout and posttraumatic stress disorder could cause 'changes in the person's relationships. The helper may become irritable with people in his personal life, lash out or withdraw' (Weingarten 2000:104). In Mamelodi the group found it more and more difficult to communicate about their own feelings with one another. This became an area where we could not share with the whole group although some of us could confide with one another in which way the witnessing of trauma also adversely influenced our relationships even at our home.

2.4.3   Responsibility to self-care

Weingarten (2003:40) suggests that we need to do a kind of self-monitoring at all times. Common shock can affect us not only psychologically but also biologically/physiologically. Care-workers dealing with primary and secondary trauma could become prone to burnout or even posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) if enough

self-care does not exist.

Weingarten (2003:79) is of the opinion that 'witnesses need witnesses'. And although we could witness one another's stories we also found that we needed witnesses outside of Mamelodi. This caused sometimes further distress as some of the care-workers realized people did not always understand what the care-workers were talking about. People struggled relating to the different narratives. Narratives about joy and celebration were just as incomprehensible as narratives about pain and trauma. But for the different care-do-ers it was a process finding witnesses outside the situation.

Working in an environment where there are always needs and trauma one can become enmeshed in the plight. It became important for some of the group to be barometers for one another to indicate when we became too enmeshed. Also through embodied knowledge, through illness and tiredness we became aware of our own needs. Dreams and nightmares also taught some of the participants to be more aware of self-care.

In the Bible we find through Christ's teaching that he demonstrated self-care through his own actions. Although he fed the crowds he also took time off to rest and to connect with G/god/dess. When suffering with his own anguish before the crucifixion one reads that he prayed and spent time alone with G/god/dess.

2.5 Research as play

I do wonder if researchers sometimes forget that research also opens up an aspect of play, not devaluating the research process or working outside ethical boundaries, but more the possibility of searching for the unexpected. Centralizing certain aspects and then again putting the marginalized aspect in the centre. Watching fascinated what transpires through praxis and 'doing hope'.

In this research I sometimes experienced it as a roller-coaster ride, the preparation before the free fall, experiencing the highs and lows with my co-searchers. I went through times when the pace was so fast that I was not even aware if I was still strapped in the research. Times when I felt more lost without any answers wondering if the research made sense at all (I still do question myself on this aspect). And even in the process of completing this research project, I wonder if I could not read more, research more, experience more. I wonder if it could be possible to add more ideas and experiences.

But research also has the ability to teach the people that are immersed in the research. It opens up new experiences and possibilities (it also closes other doors – for example thinking that one's class needs to be cleaned by a cleaner). Research also challenges one's own ideas, narratives, ethics and discourses. But the possibility to leap from one thought to another is also opened up. The researcher can play with ideas that one finds through experience, action, wisdoms and reading.

Action-research focuses on the here and now, the experience of the researcher and co-searcher in a particular context, situation and time. It consists of a certain number of people with their characteristics. It can not be duplicated ever again and the research is linked to this context. This kind of research method responded well in the Mamelodi situation as Mamelodi is a vibrant, ever changing situation. The 'doing hope through music' project is a fast moving situation with many highs and lows. For example we would perform for dignitaries from the Spanish embassy and experience a connection between different people, but minutes later see the hunger when children scramble and fight each other for bread. Mamelodi is vibrant but also impacted by despair.

This research left a smile on my face but also at times eyes filled with tears as I learned to let go of the objective safety position and experiencing research through embodiment. Writing on the research also created the possibility of play and art. Working with words, wondering and evaluating their meanings and finding ways in which I thought I could describe this rich narrative to the best of my abilities.

Chapter 3

Is there a place for G/god/dess/theology in a township?

I had to accompany Bafana (not his real name) to their home one day to fetch his indemnity form in order for him to participate in a concert. Bafana is 15 years old and lives with his grandmother and younger sister. He finds himself in a better financial position as both his parents are working. While driving off we saw a child playing with a condom and I mentioned that I hope it has not been used. Thinking back to this incident I am ashamed to say that I didn't think of stopping the car and making sure that it was an unused condom.

Bafana was amazed. 'But they say you are a muruti?' he asked. 'Yes, I am' I answered. 'But you can't be' he retorted. 'Why' I asked. 'Because you are a woman, women can't be murutis. You also do not talk like a muruti. They do not talk about condoms and sex and Aids. They are better than us, they are not like people they are holy.'

I wondered if we as church could not talk about Aids, what then our role in this pandemic is. If we as believers can't question sexual abuse and deconstruct gender issues, who will? Bafana shared with me that he believes AIDS can be contracted by holding a person with Aids' hand and stated that he does not care then to have unprotected sexual intercourse because he will in any case get Aids. His best friend has been raped twice and he has nearly been raped. She has Aids and he think he might also have it but he doesn't know. No he hasn't had sexual intercourse with her but he has held her hand.

Betsie was chatting to her students the other day when the topic turned to God. Lerato (not her own name) claimed that God is dead in Mamelodi. She believes that he (in her perception God is a he) can't be there because they suffer as they experience hunger and abuse. She told Betsie that the church speaks about a loving God but also that they (the children) had to adhere to God's rules otherwise they won't be blessed. She had tried her best but God was still not there.

Sms from Betsie: 'Sometimes I wonder if God brought us together that we could make a difference in other people's lives'.

3.1 Introduction

Working cross-culturally, in difficult circumstances, dealing with trauma, experiencing common shock, being questioned about beliefs, striving to live in an ethical way and 'doing hope' in our work, invites our spirituality into this research. Furthermore working from a framework that includes practical theology as part of its basis influenced the research.

Feminist theology is a theology of praxis (Ackermann 1998:78). Kretzschmar (1994:2) describes praxis as being 'the ongoing critical and creative interplay between reflection and action (or theory and practice)'. Furthermore praxis means 'that the theology is practical through a loving notion in prayer, worship, in relationship with others, the struggle for equality, and being as one with the poor and the oppressed. Feminist theology contains a solidarity component. Moreover, it allows for the expression of compassion in various forms, and for action through the diversity of culture and religious thought, bound by love' (Oduyuye 1994:38; McLachlan 2000:66). 'A feminist theology of praxis arises from the need to reflect on Christian praxis in specific contexts for the sake of a better and more adequate praxis mediated through changed theories' (Grobbelaar 2001:174). In order to strive towards that goal all research, opinions and analysis have to be subject to critique and revision (Hogan 1995:84). Furthermore in order to claim that feminist theology is praxis based, this theology's actions needs to be seen in the world (Hogan 1995:64).

This chapter focuses on the theology that influences this research and my work in Mamelodi. It investigates the contribution that feminist theology made to this research. But as feminist theology is praxis based, research and analysis need to be subject to constant critique and revision (Hogan 1995:84).

In order to focus on the influence of feminist theology we need to investigate more in depth what practical theology is?

3.2 Practical theology

Practical theology in the academic context is one of the study fields in theology. This section of theology focuses on action, action through spirituality in the context of community and church (Heyns & Pieterse 1990:7). Riet Bons-Storm (1998:14) explains that the main focus of practical theology is of 'faith lived in context'. Heitink (quoted by Heyns & Pieterse 1990:8) is of the opinion that whereas in other theological disciplines the Bible is used as text, in practical theology the believer is used as text. Ackermann (1998:80) prefers to use a 'feminist theology of praxis' rather than a 'feminist practical theology'.

Practical theology consists mainly of liturgy and worship, preaching or homiletics, education, care, counselling and service (Cochrane, De Gruchy & Peterson 1991:2; Heyns & Pieterse 1990:19). In this research care, education, counselling and service came more to the forefront than the other aspects.

The debate whether practical theology could be included as science is an ongoing debate. Heyns and Pieterse (1990:11) are of the opinion that it forms part of the sciences as it uses theological theories as well as scientific methods. In this dissertation scientific research methods were used as well as feminist theology as foundation.

The question may arise: Can the educators working in Mamelodi, of whom only two studied theology, be involved in participating in practical theology? Gert Otto (quoted in Bons-Storm 1998:14) sees practical theology 'as a critical theory of a religiously transmitted praxis in society'. For him praxis is much broader than just the actions of the church leaders and theologians, it also 'reflects on the practices of all members of a community of faith … who live their faith in society'. Practical theology is more than just an academic discipline.

Hess (1998:51) is of the opinion that 'it is also a phenomenon rooted in communities of faith … practicing persons of faith bring theological convictions, cultural wisdom, practical experience, and the realities of life to their religious expression'.

3.3 Defining feminist theology

'Feminist theology is primarily about two disciplines reflecting upon and complementing one another' (Isherwood & McEwan 1993:9). The first discipline is feminism, which is defined as 'a socio-political movement whose objective is equality of rights, status and power for men and women … struggles for women's political emancipation … which has led feminists to challenge both sexism and the capitalist system which is said to encourage patriarchy … not necessary 'anti-men', but against any social system which produces female subordination' (The Chambers Encyclopaedia 1990:438). Or as bell hooks (2000:1) defines it: 'Simply put, feminism is a movement to end sexism, sexist exploitation, and oppression.' 'Feminism is a liberating praxis grounded in the lived experience of women' (Jakobsen 1994:148).

The other discipline is theology. Theology is 'the ordered faith discourse about God and all things in relation to God' (Martin 1994:1). Heyns and Pieterse (1990:4) further claims that it is a science that investigates beliefs, writings and understanding of God by people who use scientific methods, truths and disciplines. De Gruchy (1997:233) presents a different view on the theological research process and the participants of this discipline. He asserts that 'theology has by and large been written by "free" heterosexual men and it is their own experience which has been taken as normative for discussion on human nature. They are the subjects who do theology.' Research was thus mainly done by this group and there findings were influenced by the discourses that they lived by.

Feminist theology can be seen as a branch of feminism and according to Keane (1998:122) it draws its experience from the Secular Feminist Movement. It 'is involved in a twofold task: it is criticizing patriarchal theology and it is complementing traditional theology so as to safeguard the understanding of everybody as equal and equally suited to take his or her life experience as the starting point from which to interpret theology' (Isherwood & McEwan 1995:92). For others it is the experiences of women that are centralized. In this

research, by incorporating feminist theology it was important to acknowledge the policy of inclusivity (McLachlan 2000:65). hooks (2000:7) states: 'feminists are made, not born … like all political positions one becomes a believer in feminist politics through choice and action'.

'Feminist theology is a combination of experience, life as it is being lived, and which the theologian is still experiencing, struggling with, and celebrating, but also the intellectual effort which consists of among other things creative thinking, reasoning, questioning ideas, re-examining hypotheses, and creating as well as formulating new hypotheses (King 1996:16; McLachlan 2000:61). Gebara (1994:48) states that feminist theology is informed by shared experiences and the sharing of life. But theology still tends to be written by 'educated' people usually from a certain background and/or intellectual capacity that experience the benefits from studying through universities or colleges.

Theological research, although being more praxis based in the sphere of feminist theology, mostly conveys the thoughts and research of the theologian or theology student. This leads to participants becoming veiled through the experiences, thoughts, education, notions and discourses of the researcher. Feminist theology acknowledges that it is contextual. 'It recognizes that all theology is historically and culturally conditioned and that theologians act from within a specific context as well as react to it' (Ackermann 1993:22).

Furthermore 'feminist Biblical hermeneutics' also put praxis (Ackermann 1996:32) and experience before text and tradition. For me feminist theology is practical theology for it is praxis orientated. It is a critical theory of praxis (Heyns & Pieterse 1990:13), but it is also a transforming theology and a growing theology (Hogan 1995:7). 'Feminist theology is dynamic and inclusive; it is not a closed system. Thus the formulation of theological theories is an ongoing process and feminist perspective in practical theology will endeavour to contribute new insights to this process' (Ackermann 1993:22).

3.3.1   Spirituality versus theology

Kotzé & Kotzé (2001:1) describe spirituality as 'more inclusive, focusing on any of our experiences including theological ideas and narratives about the Other whom some call

Friend/God /Goddess/Divine and so forth'. But although I prefer the term spirituality, as theology means literally the study of G/god/dess, I will work from the term feminist theology being part of discourse from which I conducted the research. Acknowledging that 'to know anything is to know in terms of one or more discourses' (Niehaus 2001:39).

Feminist theology being part of the backbone of this research includes certain aspects for example being praxis based and the main pillars that will be investigated later in this chapter, but it also excludes other ideas for example the acceptance of the notion of Father God. Certain aspects become centralized while others become marginalized establishing once again dualism.

Oduyoye (1994:13) describes feminist theology as a theology of relationships, not only the relationship between God and humans but also the relationship with oneself and with others, as well as the relationship with the creation. 'Christian feminist scholarship tries to recover the centre of Christian community' (McLachlan 2000:62). It questions the foundations of relationships that are oppressive to individuals as well as groups (Purvis 1993:13). In Mamelodi we found that most of the learners experienced that they were marginalized. Poverty in the community influences the learners that they see themselves as unimportant citizens. The learners also experienced that who they are, is not acknowledged in the township. Most of them wanted to leave the community.

Working in Mamelodi and doing the research through the feminist theological viewpoint creates the situation that certain aspects will also be centralized in the writing of the research. Feminist theology further more influences the way I work in the township. For example, when learners question me that it is not possible for a woman to become a muruti (pastor/minister), I work from the premise that women and men are equal. I use inclusive language and query sexist language as 'male monotheism reinforces the social hierarchy of patriarchal rule…' (Reuther 1989:151). This in turn has an impact on the learners.

Our theological disposition has a direct impact on the research, research in action, the writing of the research, the ideas we use and create, the way in which we conduct the research and even our retelling of the narratives and critique. It is thus necessary to question the theological viewpoint that the researcher is using. I believe it is necessary to be accountable in the way we use our theological discourses and viewpoints. 'Feminist

theology needs to avoid the pitfall of developing exclusively in the interest of only one particular group, e.g. white heterosexual women. On the contrary, it consciously needs to put into place an explicit policy of inclusivity' (McLachlan 2000:65). In feminist theology women's experience becomes thus integrated in the research process and enables the research to be praxis based (Hogan 1995:64).

The care-workers in Mamelodi consisted of different genders, races, age groups, social economical groups, belief systems and sexual orientations. In order to be accountable through the research it was important not to centralize any given voice or voices. Although I found that even through research conversations some participants shared more than others.

3.3.2   Becoming praxis orientated

As mentioned, praxis literally means practice. 'Praxis has in critical theory come to mean practice or action which is subject to critical reflection and which is engaged in social transformation towards the human good' (Cochrane, De Gruchy & Peterson 1991:24). And praxis is just as important as theory as a source of truth (Ackermann 1998:80).

Ackermann's (1998:79) view of feminist theologians is that they 'generally prefer to orient their theologies towards particular issues which are rooted in experience and illuminated by systematic analysis'. For the educators in Mamelodi it was centred on 'doing hope through music' in the community.

Feminist theologians need to be involved in socio-political action, questioning the power relationships and imbalances in society (Bons-Storm 1996:25). Striving towards the ideal that people are 'diverse-but-equal, and inspiring the marginalized to realize their potential, use their talents, and come into the centre' (Bons-Storm 1996:29). Furthermore, 'joining with people to name injustice, to question cultural understandings and their effects on people's lives, and to participate in the re-authoring of preferred ways of living, is a political undertaking' (White & Denborough 1998:14) This is part of the praxis in feminist theology.

'Participatory action research is [also] political because it is about people changing themselves and their circumstances and about informing this change…' (McTaggart 1997:7). Furthermore action research is also praxis based. 'Participatory action research seeks the development of theoretical informed practice for all parties involved' (McTaggart 1997:30). The research is not only focused on an investigation of certain research questions but has a component that focuses on participation, praxis and action being taken within the research. This type of reseach can even 'incorporate actions that attempt to resolve the problem [challenges/questions] being investigated' during the research (Stringer1999:5).

3.3.3 The main pillars of feminist theology

Carmody (1995:12-39) investigates five pillars of feminist theology namely the search for: justice, meaning, beauty, love and the choice between despair and hope. I suggested in *Fear or freedom: a feminist theological perspective on the Book of Revelation* (2000:109) that the following could also be incorporated as pillars: the search for truth, equality, identity, empowerment, unity and freedom.

These quests form part of the educators and learners work in Mamelodi.

3.3.3.1 The search for justice

Social injustices occur when structural violence is part of the community. Structural violence being 'when the social system itself exploits some people to the benefit of others' (Weingarten 2003:5). South Africa's history is marred by social injustices. But social injustices can not only be linked to the political context. Social injustices occur within our society where certain people or groups of people are seen as inferior. Even in the New South Africa we still see that marginalization occurs for example in many sectors of our community women, homosexual people and people in a lower income group are seen as inferior. In Mamelodi children's voices tend not to be heard by the community and the township as such is many times marginalized within the broader community. The wisdoms

of the township are seen as inferior and women are mostly regarded as inferior to men.

'Feminist theology recognizes as one of its tasks the overcoming of old dichotomies and the ushering in of an understanding of pluralism which gives speech to the speechless, which empowers the powerless and which lets outsiders participate' (Isherwood & McEwan 1993:91). It is the search for justice in which feminist theology, being ethical in character, strive towards inclusivity calling for justice for not only women but for every person (Jakobsen 1994:148). Celebrating that in Christ's ministry equality formed part of the foundation of Christ's teaching, action and narratives that he shared with the community.

Concerning the political justice in South Africa, Terry Bell (2001:3) questions the viability of the country's 'political miracle'. He also questions if truth and justice were sacrificed in order to establish reconciliation (Bell 2001:1). James Baldwin (quoted in Bell 2001:7) states: 'Not everything that is faced can be changed, but nothing can be changed until it is faced.' And although South Africa went through a process of truth and reconciliation there was never a process of restitution, a process that was suggested by Tutu but never made viable to the society. If social justice did occur, with the end of Apartheid and in the new South Africa's political sphere, can be debated by many role-players.

Carol Hess' (1996:57) claims that justice begins when a community can recognize, affirm and understand differentness. In order to achieve this it demands an engagement of difference through conversations. Toleration of differences is merely not enough. A dispersing of power is required through these different groups and this creates communicative justice which 'engages the varieties of difference within the community' (Hess 1996:58-59). Difference does not need to be seen as a negative concept in our world but rather a complementation and broadening of life and possibilities.

After the reconciliation process in South Africa there was not a distribution of power to all marginalized as well as previously centralized groups and this created further anger. Lapsley (2002:4) states: 'Our anger and moral outrage can mobilize us but it needs our vision of social healing motivated by compassion to keep us in the struggle for justice.'

Discussing racism and racist attitudes with learners and co-mentors in Mamelodi is a difficult topic. Even ten years of democracy have not lifted the silencing of these topics. Society struggles to be mobilized as the anger is being silenced and ignored and justice being shunned as we still try to live in a utopia of the 'New South Africa' concept. In Mamelodi we try to shift the boundaries, that is social constructions (Ackermann 1997:426) that society has created, open the possibilities to conversation where silence is dominating the territory and sharing power. But the search for justice also confronts us as educators coming from our own histories and beliefs. It became important to create 'ethics of justice', not only feeling with the learners but also to express it 'in praxis by engaging in actions' (Jakobsen 1994:150) searching for justice within the community. As we were confronted by stories of injustices in Mamelodi it angered the care-do-ers. Some of these narratives placed us in position 4 where we became aware of the injustice but disempowered to do anything. For example one of our students was raped. We heard this terrible news through other learners but were unable to find the student. We listened to the social injustice as she was marginalized by certain sections of the community but as educators we were unable to do anything and had to deal with our own inability to support this young woman.

But there were also stories of hope where we could contribute in creating social justice with the learners. Situations existed where we could integrate different communities through music and then to 'do hope' through the action of finding justice. There were also opportunities where reparative justice were visible as older people that lived through the Apartheid-era and that was marginalized by the system, experienced forms of healing as they listened and witnessed the music that was binding the communities together. Betsie had a wonderful experience that while teaching the one day an old black man walked into her class. And as the group of learners played the violin music he stood there crying. At the end of the piece he walked towards Betsie and hugged her as they cried together. There was justice in that all could now participate freely and benefit from the creation of music in this music centre context. Where as for years it was mostly the white people that could benefit from music tutoring this opportunity became available to most sections of the society.

The search for justice forms part of practical theology as it entails not only our ethical-political commitment in research and praxis but also our calling as believers. 'The Christian vision (of justice) is of an end to the powers of oppression and exploitation, when all those suffering will have their rights restored as equal children of God and a new human community of justice and peace will be born. However, while the Bible offers final justice as an act of God, it does not relieve humans of the responsibility of striving for that justice' (Isherwood & McEwan 1996:115).

3.3.3.2 The search for equality and empowerment

Society uses power/knowledge relations as the way of creating order. Although we live in the 'New South Africa' the patriarchal influences are still part of our society. The government is making a visible effort to challenge this discourse, for example by the choice of instating a woman as the deputy president, but the country still experiences the remnants of the patriarchal discourse. Tutu (2004:21) claims that 'equality is essential to human life and well-being…' Without equality a country can not develop sufficiently.

The one thing in Mamelodi that was encouraging to us was that the discourse - music is an activity in which mostly women and gay men participate - did not exist as in so many predominantly white, Afrikaans-speaking schools where most of us had previously worked. This entailed that the teachers and learners were not labelled according to these discourses. But we did find that some of the learners were ridiculed by peers for being part of the music program that had so many white educators. They were labelled as coconuts (referring to being brown outside but white inside) as they chose to attend the music school where predominantly white educators worked.

In modernism it is claimed that knowledge is power. Kotzé (2002:9) is of the opinion that 'knowledge no longer represents the world as it is, but is now taken as referring to our interpretations, resulting in realities that are socially constructed by people in specific contexts, with specific purposes and with very real political and ethical effects'. Finding knowledge, the 'what is', is 'an ethical-political process, co-constructed in the course of relating with others in a specific context or situation, at a specific moment in time' (Kotzé

2002:6). Or as White reflects (1997:20): 'I understand that all knowledges are socially constructed and constitutive or potentially constitutive of life, and that power and knowledge are inseparable – all knowledges are associated with and inform practices of power'. The challenge becomes to find local knowledges and question the global knowledges that contradict the local knowledges. In Africa, through colonisation, most local African knowledge was marginalized as European and 'first world' knowledges were centralized. Examples can be seen from the law that subscribed to the Roman Dutch system rather than African law, to teaching and educational methods. The question arises to what extent do the formal and specialized knowledges 'contribute to a dismemberment of person's lives through the disqualification of the local knowledge of personal history, and the extent to which they inform monographic accounts of life? (White 1997:20). In Mamelodi we did not only see the shame of many learners when discussing their culture, heritage and local wisdoms, but we as educators experienced it first hand as we learnt that certain knowledges that we have gained, knowledge that were centralised in our education, were not applicable in the townships. Some of the educators experienced that group teaching worked better in the township rather than individual lessons. Working cross culturally we also had to learn to teach in ways that used less language skills and more communication through action skills.

White (1997:20) argues that local knowledges on the other hand must not be idealized or romanticised. It needs to be investigated and incorporated through action. Knowledges need to be praxis based, gather through experience and action, but it also needs to be re-evaluated and be opened up to critique.

3.3.3.3   The search for truth

Truth claims are 'claims that are ascribed to an objective reality status and that are considered to be universal, speaking to 'facts' about nature of life that can be discovered in all persons, regardless of culture, circumstances, place, era, and so on' (White1997:119). 'Truth can be described as a set of ultimate values, whose importance for the life of a community in its context cannot easily be denied. These ultimate values are often made inevitable and plausible by the assumption that they are a deity's will. This deity, the God

of the Bible for instance, represents the truth' (Bons-Storm 1996:84). Although these truths sometimes enabled to form structures based on it, for example church communities being constituted by truths and dogmas, it can also inhibit and marginalize 'others'. Certain people as well as certain communities become centralized. Kotzé (2002:14) counters these centralized truths by asking who benefits from these truths. Bons-Storm (1996:84) ask in who's interest is these truth? Furthermore she asks: 'Who has the power to impose her or his truth upon others? In modernity only one truth can be dominant, the truth of the dominant group and its discourse.'

Anderson and Hopkins (1991:18, 112) is of the opinion that feminist theologians must be willing to let go of 'authoritative truths' from the past and rather speak the truth from their own experiences. But through post-modern thinking one is challenged to be 'suspicious of every truth that claims to be universal, even universal for women' (Bons-Storm 1996:85) as post-modern thought claims that there does not exist one final, ultimate truth. It would be unethical to claim that the notions put forth in this research paper constitutes universal truths as it is bound to context, questions being asked in the research and the experience of a certain group of mentors in a specific time-frame. The truths we found is thus based on our praxis and needs to be redefined and opened up for change as we grow and change in our situation and as our context change.

White (1997:13) states:

> To know that we know what we know, and to consciously embrace this knowledge as we live our lives, it is necessary for us to experience a degree of authenticity in our knowledge claims, whatever these claims might be. This sense of authenticity is not something that is achieved by referring to "factual grounds" or "objective data", but is instead something that is the outcome of process of authentication. These processes of authentication require social arenas or forums in which persons might express or perform their knowledge claims before an audience that witness this performance, an audience that responds in ways that are acknowledging of such claims. It is through such processes of authentication that persons experience being at one with such knowledge claims.

'Knowledge no longer represents the world as it is, but is now taken as referring to our interpretations, resulting in realities that are socially constructed by people in specific contexts, with specific purposes and with real political and ethical effects' (Kotzé 2002:9). In theology one finds that truth is constructed in a certain context, history and reality. But one also needs to acknowledge that as knowledge is influenced by history, 'historical descriptions are necessarily ordered by the present state of knowledge' (Foucault 1969:5).

In Mamelodi we found as a group that our experiences differed from people teaching in an environment with less trauma and poverty. Some of the group experienced that they became outsiders from the rest of the privileged society. For Betsie it was as if she was living in two different worlds and Lynn wondered how people could be blind to the joy and despair that one could experience teaching in Mamelodi. Through communication as a group we could validate one another's experiences. But sometimes it also became a challenge as we also had different reactions to experiences. This created tension and unease and we as a group had to work through difficult times where we could not understand one another's feelings, thoughts and reactions. It became a challenge to incorporate different truths and not demean any person as we differed in opinion. Coming from different religions, cultures, genders, histories and sexualities also influenced this search for truth. But as care-do-ers the biggest challenge was to focus on caring and not bickering with our own issues.

Each co-searcher had to challenge truths and authoritative truths in order to be able to work in Mamelodi. For most of the group we had to move away from fundamental ideas of teaching music. But as authoritative truths in religion for example: that God will help the needy; we had to rethink new concepts. Being challenged by learners where G/god/dess is when they need help, easy answers were not available. We had to formulate our own truths which became a point of orientation to our endeavours to give meaning to our own experiences (Bons-Storm 1998:18). But we also had to learn, and is still learning, 'how to share our truths with one another' (Kübler-Ross & Kessler 2000:71). We had to find ideas and truths together in order to create meaning in the dust of Mamelodi.

3.3.3.4 The search for meaning

Meaning can only be established and the understanding of our lives created, through interactions and relationships with others. 'Meanings are born of co-ordinations among persons – agreements, negotiations and affirmations' (Gergen 1999:48). But life stories that shape people's lives and relationships also 'give meaning to their experiences' (White & Denborough 1998:3). 'Multiple meanings' (Mann 2006:11) are possible in our work or life as only searching for one ultimate meaning can obscure other meanings that could enrich the narrative of our life story.

According to Weingarten (2003:6) 'violation disrupts our sense of meaning'. But 'distress does not occur by chance… it often reflects some new learning, or realisation that has occurred through hearing particular stories about abuse and trauma. Therefore, feelings of distress can provide an opportunity to put a name to and to reflect upon what it is that a therapist may be noticing differently. This could include a new awareness about certain understandings about life… these feelings of distress can be opportunities to develop, revise and think more about our ideas about the world and about the sorts of lives we wish to lead' (Mann 2006: 15-16). New meanings can thus be created through being confronted by traumatic situations.

On the other side the meaning of a stressful event could also be a notion that is searched for by people that experienced the event and/or a person witnessing the others that experienced the traumatic event. Pearlin and Schooler (quoted by Klingman 2002:254) is of the opinion 'that the meaning of a stressful event could be controlled in several ways, e.g. by positive comparisons (I am not alone, others are experiencing the same stressful events), selective ignoring (I can look at the better things in life instead), and devaluing the importance of the event.' Other strategies are 'downward comparison' - where the people compare themselves as better off than others that are in more difficult circumstances, 'positive reinterpretation' - that there is something good in every problem, 'cognitive disengagement' - where the person decides that the problem is not important enough to think about, optimism - where the person believes that everything would work out for the best, 'faith in support' - in which the person acknowledges that there are others to support him through the difficult time, denial - where a person does not acknowledge that an event ever happened and 'perspective taking' - where a person believes that if the other aspects

are fine in my life then s/he can cope with the trauma (Klingman 2002:254). These strategies can be used by a person after a traumatic event or being in a witness position where the person is aware of a certain trauma or event (witnessing position 1 and 4 on the witnessing grit created by Weingarten). These strategies create different outcomes after the trauma but also influence the meaning that is put forth by the witness connected to the trauma.

In Mamelodi different strategies were used in different circumstances by different care-workers. The meanings ascribed to events also became different as different strategies were incorporated. The safety issue for example was met by some members of the group by ignoring the gang members that were sitting outside the classes (cognitive disengagement or selective ignoring or denial). Hans-Jurgens on the other hand tried to find ways in constructively dealing with the security aspect. When young people broke into Lynn's car some commented that she needed to be glad as they could have stolen the car, as other cars were stolen (downward comparison) and devaluating the importance of the event. Listening to the life story of a rape survivor was met by shock that later led to some members not talking about the situation at all (denial).

Sometimes it was possible to deconstruct the events and to create a richer narrative. By deconstructing events together as mentors, narratives changed from being problem-orientated to being multi-storied (Morgan 2000:8) and creating a 'solutions-friendly' environment. Problems could then be 'rephrased and re-evaluated to promote an attitude of multiple options and solutions that are rich in opportunities and choices' (Klingman 2002:255).

Weingarten (e-mail 2006. Appendix B) states: 'Managing in the world today requires great ingenuity to constantly stay in Position 1' of the witnessing grit. 'Work with children is all about helping them move from square 3 to square 1. Adults tend to think that the best way to protect children is to move them into or back into unawareness, but that never works for long.' In Mamelodi we as educators were challenged to work towards empowering the

students to become more aware and empowered and by this action creating new or broader meanings with the students. It is still challenging to create meaning with the co-mentors and learners as 'meanings are not permanently fixed but are continuously influenced, constructed and reconstructed over time' (Anderson 1997:42).

One of theology's aims is to find meaning through Christ and religion. In Mamelodi the feminist theology input of praxis orientated the co-searchers to establish meaning rather through action than fixed or set beliefs and dogma. This created openness towards difference as the mentors reflected there own backgrounds and beliefs into the situation but still worked and cared together as mentors.

3.3.3.5　The search for identity

White (2006:27) states: 'identity can be thought of as the "territory of life"'. Identity is how we perceive ourselves, the group we belong to, even the country in which we live. Identity is a way in which we can understand ourselves and the world we live in.

But 'normalising' is one of the ways society uses to create order in the society (Michel 1999:14). Internalised controls are put forth by the society to control the people. In Mamelodi we found that there existed no directive in order to direct us how we ought to work and be as music educators and care-workers. It was new territory and we rather found that people were looking at us to see how we did establish our identity. We had a number of very negative groups that questioned our actions but we found wonderful support from the principal of Mamelodi High as well as the department of education and friends and colleagues from other schools. But even in a more open environment certain controls existed coming from our own up-bringing, histories, education and social structures.

As a group we found resonance in Thomas's ideas (quoted by Russell & Carey 2004:118) that we 'are informed by poststructuralist understandings of identity and particularly the idea that our identities are multi-storied … the poststructuralist idea of identity being something that is not fixed but dynamic and constantly constructed'. Johan Myburg (2000:111) states 'the process of identity creation seems to be more important than its structures'. He proposes the term 'narrative self' as an ongoing process of creating the

identity rather than an 'existing, given and fixed structure', thus removed from its stasis to an ongoing, dynamic development. Identity is furthermore shaped by relationships and as relationships are ever-changing, one's identity is 'continuously emergent, re-formed, and redirected' (Gergen 1991:139).

Mamelodi created the opportunity to find a way to understand that identity was not a fixed way of being. For us as care-do-ers we found that not only our individual identity could be multi-storied and constantly constructed but also the group's identity as care-do-ers and as music educators. Focusing in this research more on the mentorship of the care-workers we found that mentorship could also translate into multi-storied identities. This contributed to the way in which we interchanged the roles of mentoring and receiving mentorship. Through this openness to multi-storied identity we found a greater freedom in supporting one another. We did not have the experience that one person needed to be the only carer of the group or needed to be always strong in every situation.

Communities also have unique identities which relate to the possibility that the community's identity could become stagnated. Communities also need to be in the process of creating there identity in an ongoing, dynamic development. But in turn communities also shape our identities and theologies through 'transmission' of traditions, norms, cultures, customs, ritual, myth, social mores (Ackermann 1998:91) and cultural narratives. But even through participating in activities it is to be noted 'life is about being, not doing' (Kübler-Ross 2000:32). Identity forming becomes thus an ongoing process of growth and creation.

3.3.3.6   The search for unity

Tutu (2004:34) states: 'The capitalist culture places a high premium on success, based as it seems to be on unbridled, cutthroat competitiveness. You must succeed. It matters little in what you succeed as long as you succeed.' In this era we have put a lot of emphasis on individuality. Success is related to oneself as individual. There are emphasises on self-possession, self-containment and self-actualisation (White & Denborough 1998:13). According to Foucault 'society became focused on the individual at the same time that it

became a normalizing society' (Fillingham 1993:145). 'Collective identity' (Spargo 1999:33) was marginalised as individuality became the centre.

But according to Antjie Krog (1998:110), 'in the African Weltanschauung a person is not basically an independent, solitary entity. A person is human precisely in being enveloped in the community of other human beings, being caught up in the bundle of life. To be… is to participate.' Tutu (2004:27) reminds us that 'we need each other. We can not survive and thrive without one another.'

Kübler-Ross (2000:24) is of the opinion that many people need to first see the 'outer-edge' of life, namely death, before they can see how human beings are connected with one another, but also the connection with the universe - that the power of the universe is within our selves. One of the purposes of loss is that it unifies us. 'It helps deepen our understanding of each other. It connects us to one another… When we are joined in the experience of loss, we care for one another and experience one another in new and profound ways' (Kübler-Ross 2000:83).

Feminism as a political stance envision a society 'in which men and women of different colour, ethnicity, class, age, and sexual orientation can live together without oppression and marginalization – a healed society, celebrating difference-in-equality' (Bons-Storm 1996:25). Through feminist theology the notion in western society is challenged and deconstructed that individuality is the ultimate way of being.

Practical theology also needs to be community orientated. Cochrane, De Gruchy and Peterson (1991:2) state: 'We assume that the person who carries out the practical theology work… is not an isolated individual being not a mere soul separated from his or her body, but a being-in-community, a social being who, if separated from or communal existence, would cease to be human.'

Through the music in Mamelodi we found that the participatory consciousness was

reflected. Betsie described a situation where she performed with the group at a prize-giving of a competition. A lady walked up to her afterwards and exclaimed that it was wonderful for her to witness how this group played as one, the way in which their bodies moved, the energy that they shared and the sound that made them one. For this woman it was if they were breathing together as one. Betsie stated that it was being part of one consciousness. This being one created opportunities for healing. When people witnessed the group playing together it moved people to tears. Performing at a shopping centre an older white women watched crying as the children performed Christmas carols. When her emotions were more under control she started singing with the group. Through witnessing and experiencing trauma on a daily basis these learners and educators could still choose for hope versus despair.

For Betsie these experiences of being one, sharing in a participatory consciousness was like magic. This 'magic' had the ability to connect communities and to transform them. But for her it was essential that people were willing to 'let go' in order to become part of this community of care. The participatory consciousness made it very difficult for people to become part of it if they tried to dictate the situation and when they wanted their truth or knowledge or power to be centralized.

In Mamelodi we found that to care together made our caring stronger. Where Ecclesiastes 4 made more sense that we could help one another up when the one was weak and the other strong. When I was going through a difficult time after the accident my colleagues and co-searchers supported me and when Lynn went through a difficult time with her health we could support her in turn. But although a community of care was built we also found that it became very difficult to sustain this community as personality differences and difference of opinion on care and the work formed new challenges. The role players own ideas and issues created separation and even caused that the care of the learners was sometimes put aside and 'doing hope' forgotten as we struggled with one another through difficult times.

Kotzé (2002:4) claims that a connective understanding is about two (or more) 'people daring to dance in the silence of dark – no movement to be seen or music to be heard – a search for a participatory consciousness that will create their own music and become a

healing movement'. In Mamelodi we experienced very dark times in which we were not even always certain in which relation we as educators stood with one another. It was the learning of the dance through our own compositions, dancing to a different rhythm and beat than we were used to, stepping on one another's toes but still dancing, that became the challenge. This dance included the learners, community and G/god/dess, and through these new challenges we also learned more about ourselves and mentoring.

3.3.3.7   The choice: hope or despair?

Bons-Storm (1998:15) is of the opinion that hope forms the basis for the courage to love. For her 'faith is fundamentally trust (the Greek 'pistis') in something or somebody that encompasses our despair and dread in the wider context which we call 'the Divine' or God/dess'. 'Hope trust and faith give people courage to look at themselves and the world critically, honouring the values as ascribed to the Divine in the Christian tradition and living accordingly'.

Kübler-Ross and Kessler (2000:78) state that 'life is loss and loss is life'. They furthermore claim that one loses eventually everything 'yet what ultimately matters can never be lost' (Kübler-Ross & Kessler 2000:78). This realization can lead to the choice between hope or despair or hope and despair.

Situations create the possibility to either hope or despair or even have a combination of these two feelings/experiences. As we walked the path together as mentors in Mamelodi many occasions arose where despair invited itself to take over the situation. To 'do hope' as a community became essential. Betsie's shared wisdom is the realization that hope could mostly not be created by an individual. It took a community to 'do hope' together. It was experienced that despair sometimes came more naturally to the group thus it also became most of the time essential to acknowledge the experience of despair.

Despair can mostly be linked to distress. '[D]istress might say something about what is important to the counsellor (care-do-er). It might indicate that certain values, wishes and hopes that s/he has about the world have been transgressed in some way' (Mann 2006:16).

Acknowledging distress or despair in the situation enables the co-searcher to explore the context in which these emotions are experienced. By sharing these values, hopes and wishes, these narratives can be more richly storied (Mann 2006:16). One of the many incidents where despair, distress and even helplessness were experienced was when the children stormed in order to collect a marshmallow. The despair on the side of the students, the way in which they slammed into one another to try and grab this sweet, caused distress on the side of the care-do-er.

But events can also be shaped into 'narratives of hope' through language, communication, story telling and praxis (Freeman, Epston & Lobovits 1997:xv). Re-membering and re-telling of narratives forms part of the basis for hope. Elize Morkel and Elmarie Kotzé (2002:5) furthermore reminds caregivers that another way to overcome despair is to 'call on friends inside and outside the country to support us, to do hope for and with us'.

3.3.3.8   The search for freedom

Freedom is a concept that can have different meanings for different people. 'The freedom of the one group of people could mean suppression for another group or an individual human being' (McLachlan 2000:133). But the cry, and even the struggle for freedom is universal (Moltmann-Wendel & Moltmann 1974:15).

Gandhi (Settel 1995:63) is of the opinion that 'non-violence in its dynamic condition means conscious suffering. It does not mean meek submission to the will of the evildoer, but it means the putting of one's whole soul against the will of the tyrant. The force of non-violence is infinitely more wonderful and subtle than the material forces of nature, like electricity.' Simone de Beauvoir (quoted in Hogan 1995:24-25) believes that it is necessary to be active and not passive in order to live freely. As pastoral care-do-ers it becomes necessary to be actively involved in the search for freedom, questioning oppressive forces and elements and searching for new ways where the oppressed can find freedom.

Feminist theology is a 'critical theology of liberation' (Schüssler Fiorenza 1989:37). In

praxis it is a 'searching for salvation as a journey towards freedom' (Russell 1974:21). This salvation is for all humankind and thus it necessitates that freedom needs to be for all. Structures that marginalize certain groups of people need to be questioned by the feminist theologian as an act of resistance. But this act of resistance also needs to be praxis based and not just an intellectual feat or a theological debate. As a pastoral carer one needs to actively be involved in the quest for freedom. But it also entails that one needs to be aware and empowered (Weingarten position 1) in order to participate in the quest for freedom.

In Mamelodi we also became part of the quest for freedom; searching with the learners for freedom from fear, poverty, abuse and so much more. Sometimes it was through material answers, for example when one of Hans-Jurgens' students struggled to read the notes he realized that this 16 year old needed glasses. Lynn put out this need through a radio interview and two weeks later this young man received glasses that gave him new freedom to see. But many times we could only listen and be in the moment with the young people and this lifted the boundaries of the issues that could not be spoken of. Listening to the stories of abuse also lifted the power of abuse. As mentors to one another we also needed to search for freedom as individuals and as a group. Finding our own individuality but also connecting as a group.

3.3.3.9 The search for beauty

Carmody (1995:21) is of the opinion that the human spirit tends to move naturally towards beauty. She gives as example the movement towards colour and art by people. She believes that through this creation of beauty G/god/dess is revealed. This statement becomes very difficult to acknowledge when working in a township where dust is more part of the scenery and less colour exist than in more financially stable communities. But when one starts searching for beauty it becomes possible to find it in Mamelodi.

The small flower garden that the school keeps is an example of beauty in the township. Nature, according to Carmody (1995:22), is an expression of G/god/dess's beauty. The blossoming of a rose stands in stark contrast to the dust in Mamelodi but it was also interesting the response to the rose by the care-workers as well as the learners. Sharing in

the bodily experience of smelling a rose together made it possible for some of the mentors to connect in a very stressful time when words were not enough for comfort. Celebrating G/god/dess's creation also enabled some of the co-searchers to find hope as a way to connect with G/god/dess. In these two years we also learned to look in fresh new ways to things. When the learners participated in concerts in areas where there were gardens and trees they refocused our attention on G/god/dess's creation. They would marvel at the greenness and how large the trees were and that reminded us to look at things in a more appreciative and respectful way.

Human beings are also the reflection of G/god/dess's beauty (Wilson-Kastner 1983:58). In Mamelodi we found the joy of seeing G/god/dess's reflection in these children although some might be sticky and dirty. But for the group beauty became much more than clothes and being clean as we shared smiles and stories about our students and their experiences and our relationships with the learners that were growing stronger. Boundaries were challenged and broken by connecting with these young people through our interaction with them.

For us as a group, the one aspect that stood out in the search for beauty was the making of music as a group. It formed always the main aim to make music in the most beautiful possible way. And in those times of creating participatory consciousness we witnessed in all its splendour, as the boundaries between us as individuals blended into one unity. As Betsie describes it, the times when we could not even determine whose arm was whose. When be could become one (maybe as the body of Christ?). And in those times I could understand the claim made by Carmody that human beings move naturally towards beauty.

3.3.3.10   The search for love

Elizabeth Kübler-Ross and David Kessler (2000:57) state:

> Love is always present in life, in all our wonderful experiences – and
> even in our tragedies. Love is what gives our days their deep meaning,
> it is what we are truly made of. Whatever we may call it – love, God,

soul – love is alive and tangible, living within us all. Love is our
experience of the divine, of sacred holiness. Love is the richness all
around us.

The Bible asserts in 1 John 4:8 that G/god/dess is love (The New Testament and Psalms:
An inclusive version 1995:376). In essence G/god/dess is love, G/god/dess' being is love.
'God's creative love is (called) agapic love… Agape has been characterized as the love that
gives, and as such it belongs with the gift of life, creation' (McFague 1989:143). The
search for love entails the search for unconditional love. A love that creates, energizes and
reflects G/god/dess in this world. But not only reflects, also celebrates the connection that
is formed between humans and the world of nature through this creative love. '…[L]ove is
the most divine transforming force in human experience – the best evidence the Spirit of
God moves in our spirit…' (Carmody 1995:27). But love is not a feeling but an action, it is
praxis based (Rae 1994:2).

Carter Heyward (1989:295) is of the opinion that 'love is justice'. 'Love cannot exist if
there is no justice' (McLachlan 2000:120) but justice cannot exist if there is no love. 'To
love you is to advocate your rights, your space, your self, and to struggle with you, rather
than against you, in our learning to claim our power in the world' (Heyward 1989:300). In
Mamelodi we learned many life lessons about love and care. The challenge that even in
times that we did not feel like loving the other co-searchers our actions, our praxis had to
be founded on love. This challenge led to spiritual and emotional growth as we walked
together as a community of care.

Villa-Vicencio (1994:76) names the six positions in which Joseph Fletcher sees love as the
basis of ethics:

* 'only one thing is ultimately good, namely love'

* 'the ultimate norm for Christian decision-making is love'

* 'love and justice are the same, for justice is love distributed'

* 'love wills our neighbours' good whether we like them or not'

* 'only the end justifies the means'

* 'decisions ought to be made situationally and not prescriptively.'

But what is feminist theology's ethics?

3.4 Feminist theology and ethics

'Traditionally, individuals are seen as independent moral agents, able to make moral choices by themselves independent of other realities or decisions. But normative Christian ethics are created by predominantly heterosexual white middle class men. Feminist ethics in contrast, emphasises the connectedness of all people and things' (Jacobson 1994:149), celebrating the notion of participatory consciousness and acknowledging that every person have moral agency. Because people have moral agency they have to take responsibility for their ethicising as they form part of a community of care.

In feminist theology the following important principles exists in feminist ethics:

'The starting point is always women's experience.

Patriarchal history and theology are rejected.

The analysis of Scripture and tradition is done from a woman's perspective.

The dualisms which are part of Western male thought-systems are rejected.

Relationality is emphasised as central to all that feminist theology attempts to do' (Jakobsen 1994:148).

Furthermore in feminist theology an ethic of responsibility needs to exist (Villa-Vicencio 1994:86). Where ethicising (Kotzé 2004:6) is not connected to normative values or moral principles or ethical rules, but rather to 'the act of self-giving love for the benefit of one's neighbour' (Fletcher quoted by Villa-Vicencio 1994:76).

In this study as researcher I questioned some of the principles stated by Jakobsen (1994:148). Working with women and men as co-searchers I worked with the experiences and perspectives of both sexes. I questioned why women's experiences and perspectives were in turn centralized in feminist theology's ethics. The search for equality forms part of the basis of feminist theology, thus women and men's experiences and perspectives need to be valued as equal. 'Participation of all is a primary commitment if in any way we aspire to being ethical' (Kotzé 2002:18). Ngwane (quoted by Kotzé 2002:18) states: '…ethics is not a set of systematic standards for the judgement of rightful behaviour. It is a form of praxis, life and commitment.'

Situations in Mamelodi arose where new ways of ethicising were created in order to benefit the learners. These challenged the educators (women and men) to live in new responsible but also creative ways of 'doing ethics'. 'To ethicise is to do everything in participation with the others, or rather, with everyone participating' (Kotzé 2002:21). In Mamelodi we had to learn to ask the question: who is benefiting from the action, rather than what is right and wrong. We had to move away from prescriptive ethics and learn to ethicise.

Trevor Hudson (2002:288) states:

> Perhaps the most important thing I learnt from co-journeying towards an ethical spirituality, is that neither life, nor spirituality, nor ethics is neat and tidy. Instead they are complex, messy and untidy. Co-authoring a life-giving and ethical spirituality, as a result, does not mean working with a new set of principles, abstractions and generalisations, nor with big ideas, grand visions and sweeping eternal truths. Rather, it involves our immersing ourselves in the details of our lives, and the stories of our faith, and then improvising after the manner of Jesus, in our place, our city, our country, a life of faith, hope and compassionate caring (Dawn & Peterson 2000:vii-x).

3.5 Pastoral care

Jeanne Stevenson Moessner (quoted by Bons-Storm 1996:27) is of the opinion that 'pastoral care is an act of cooperation, of compassion' – compassion being 'a process of entering into the experience of another and being simultaneously in one's own and the other's life space. It is suffering *with* another' (Weingarten 2002:48-49). But pastoral care also consists of pastoral communication between the pastoral carer and the person/people s/he is caring for as well as a communication between their self narratives. 'The pastor or pastoral counsellor has his or her own life to live, his or her own gendered identity to construct. Both pastor/counsellor and counselee live in the realm where the patriarchal socio-cultural narrative offers mandatory parameters for acceptable self-narratives' (Bons-Storm 1996:91). Pastoral care consists of the negotiation of care between two (or more) parties with their own set parameters and self-narratives. Pastoral care in Mamelodi, as with mentoring one another, had to be negotiated between the different parties. This was an ongoing process as people change and different experiences required different involvement through pastoral care.

Furthermore, pastoral care tends to be influenced by psychology and theology but as both these two disciplines are based on mostly the experience of Western, white, well-educated, middle class men it becomes necessary to question androcentric influences on pastoral care as such (Bons-Storm 1996:16). When working in a township, and most other places in life, it becomes thus essential to wonder when the discourses imbedded in pastoral care silence the participants involved in this process. It did not only silence the participants, the discourses also influenced the way in which care was put into action.

But who could become a pastoral carer? A person who studies theology or studied theology, or a person that is part of a community of care, immersed in participatory care and whose mission is to contribute to the community through love and care? And is pastoral care exclusive to members of the Christian faith? Through feminist theology one finds that pastoral care is not exclusive to a certain group of people. Pastoral care is inclusive in faith and education. It can be practiced by any believer as pastoral care leads to

pastoral theology where a religious response is given in the context where human suffering evokes such a response (Miller-McLemore 1998:183).

'Doing hope' is a term Weingarten (2000:389) coined to describe her therapeutic process. This notion resonates within myself, as giving hope to another through pastoral care, is for myself a limiting way of practice but 'doing hope' with the person/the other, gives the person the opportunity to use her/his own power/knowledge to construct her/his life (White & Epston 1990:22).

But even through pastoral care for others, Weingarten (2003:6) reminds the reader that 'witnessing violence and violation can produce common shock'. She used the word common in order to indicate that this experience is widespread. And by being a widespread phenomenon it is possible that educators do not deal with the common shock by self-care or by mentoring one another and thus become vulnerable to the consequences of common shock. Pastoral care thus involves taking responsibility to self-care and monitoring oneself regarding own wellbeing.

Pastoral care also includes socio-political action and awareness (Pattison 1993:88). As mentors and as teachers we hold the responsibility of standing up against oppressive actions and discourses. For feminists, the personal and the political cannot be separated. As pastoral carers we need to not only take responsibility for the healing of the self but also the quest for the healing of a nation (Ackermann 1998:81). Caring is thus also a political stance standing up against abuse and non-care in the community. 'Doing hope' is political for whereas we can 'do hope' together we also need to stand up against practices that can jeopardise the act. We need to stand up against violence, abuse and corruption. 'Doing hope' is a political act, as well as pastoral care and practical theology.

3.6 Challenging the boundaries

'Boundaries are human constructions' (Ackermann 1997:426). These constructions are formed to order society. The social-cultural narrative defines the roles in society and mirrors the values of the society (Bons-Storm 1996:50). Through social constructivism, lenses are created through which we interpret the world (Freedman & Combs 1996:16).

According to Landman (1984:8) feminist theology criticises and questions a patriarchal society, the use of the Bible in which it dehumanise women, sexist language, religious symbols that only satisfies the religious needs of men, theologies that polarise men and women, historiography that neglects women's history and a white patriarchal theology and society.

Working together as people from different races, genders, sexual orientations and classes posed new challenges. Working in an area where most of us were working across cultural differences posed further challenges. But this offered also new and unique outcomes when faced with new and different situations, than those we were used to. For example when Betsie and I faced a death threat from the community, being shocked by the anger, Pindele shared with us wisdom and truths that we were not aware of. We needed the experience of having the 'lenses' shattered through our experiences to be able to see some of the boundaries we have placed and discourses we were holding onto.

From certain areas in the music circle we experienced the notion that we as teachers were failures because we were teaching in a township. But even more, we found that we would participate with our learners at a music festival and the learners would be shunted to the side. One such experience happened in the first year when we participated in a music festival at a church-school. The learners were directed into the church's room for babies and mothers during services. As we sat there we realized that the learners from more affluent areas were sitting in the church listening to the others play. Even on the day of the

prize giving when some of the learners had to play once more they had to sit outside and wait while the others sat in the church at tables sharing in a meal. What does one do with the discrimination experienced by the group? What does a person do with the pain experienced?

Sometimes we tried to joke around it, other times we cried or became angry. We realized for so many in the communities we come from this would be 'normal' practice. To face these boundaries with the learners placed the focus on deconstruction of dominant discourses, trying to challenge boundaries by not alienating the group. It challenged some of our own preconceived ideas. By sharing as care-do-ers with one another we found some solace. By sharing in learners' experiences and with them some of experiences we could form stories of resistance. The educators also started sharing stories of Mamelodi with the communities we reside in. And through the sharing of the narratives, the sharing of alternative stories (Morgan 2000:9), mediating the alternative story with the predominant stories in the community, we found more people getting involved in the project. As Michel (1999:18) suggests 'storytelling reflects our changing life experiences.' Working with other young students that came to teach music with us in Mamelodi I found that their perceptions were also shattered and a new inclusive way of thinking formed. It thus became a co-construction of the alternative story (Freedman & Combs 1996:88).

Life is multi-storied. There are not only many narratives occurring simultaneously but different narratives can also be told concerning the same event or experience. (Morgan 2000:8). Certain boundaries and discourses can also shape the way in which we convey these narratives. The challenge lies in the identifying these discourses and challenging the boundaries in order to create a multi-storied thick description of events and the different realities.

3.7 Being church, reflecting G/god/dess

'Dominant scientific and religious truths marginalize all other possible realities that tend to diverge from the dominant truths. The dominant power/knowledges are not innocent – they privilege those they serve whilst oppressing those who differ or resist' (Kotzé 2002:15). The church tends to use 'authoritative truth' (Freedman & Combs 1996:21) in the form of

doctrine to regulate people's behaviour. 'Normalizing judgement' (Foucault 1977:183) practices became a way of differentiating and distancing people in the church and from the church. This in turn lead to an 'alienated consciousness' where people are not only alienated from each other but also from nature and even themselves (Heshusius 1994:16).

Working in an environment where the care-givers come from different religious backgrounds, but also living with different belief systems created a further milieu of diversity. A belief system 'is a system of meanings believed to be true by a group in society' (Bons-Storm 1996:48).

Where the church could be seen as a caring supporting community we on the other hand were coming from diverse religious backgrounds and some of the mentors had such a negative connotation towards churches that we moved away from the dominant construction of what church means. We found an area where we were all comfortable as believers, sharing the ideas of love and care and respect and by that we constructed for us a meaningful reality. But the moment one constructs together a group one is excluding others and marginalizing again others. We found that we were struggling with being too protective and sometimes just not able to open up this group to others. This created conflict internally and externally.

Furthermore, being educators as well as pastoral carers, we were not in Mamelodi in order to convert the learners to certain religious notions. But being believers placed the calling of caring in our lives. To be church does not mean to convert people to certain faiths but rather the responsibility of love and care. To be church is to be Christ and to live in a way that reflects G/god/dess as we understand G/god/dess.

3.8 Loosing G/god/dess

Working in the township lead to some of the educators starting to question G/god/dess. Witnessing the hunger, disease, poor health, poverty, pain and despair led to questioning G/god/dess. As with the learners some of the educators wondered if G/god/dess was alive

in Mamelodi. The educators come from backgrounds where they did not experience hunger. Where if they became ill they could go to a doctor and afford medicine. Most of the teachers have never been confronted by all these needs. As one of them exclaimed: 'I feel guilty every night I return to my house in the city. I look at my house and realize that each person of my family has their own room and there are even rooms that no-one lives in.' And together with this guilt some of the teachers also experienced shame.

The question arose if the shame and guilt also contributed to the amount of effort that was put into working with the learners?

Questioning G/god/dess and wondering if G/god/dess cares or loves the world, or even if G/god/dess is still alive or ever existed, brought with it religious dilemmas. The churches the educators attended thought that G/god/dess was a caring and loving being. Churches that claimed that G/god/dess is a Father that cares for his children (all the educators came from churches that used androcentric language). These discourses portrayed an image that G/god/dess had to act in a certain way to be a caring and loving G/god/dess.

3.9 Finding G/god/dess?

Working in a township confronts one's believes and trust in G/god/dess. The children's tribulations confronted us as educators on many different levels. Experiencing compassion as Weingarten states as an entrance into the experience of another, while still being in one's own experience, created in some of the educators a loss of their way of believing in G/god/dess but also finding new ways of acknowledging another being/G/god/dess / higher being / energy/ love / the great care-do-er.

For Betsie it was finding G/god/dess's love through dreams of her father that died just before she started her work in Mamelodi. She began to listen to his wisdom and acting according to his guidance. She shared it with us and the learners this new found way of believe. It seemed that the learners accepted this way of believe as part of life where some of the educators found it difficult to understand and accept this kind of wisdom. But

although some of the educators wondered about this way of believe, it was listened to in a respectful manner. And for Betsie the 'others' guidance came through her dreams about her father and this drew her nearer to the higher being.

For another educator the way to finding strength and connect with G/god/dess was to immerse into her church. Although she was always very involved in her church she started speaking more about her connection to the church and what she found in her faith.

For myself I realized that I moved more away from the structures of the church. And although I am still involved in the ministry I see my place at this stage being more involved in the community. Although I can not always relate to the G/god/dess of my childhood I found that my way of understanding became much more praxis based. I found a connection with the higher being through caring.

The educators found new ways of believing and doing theology through their care and work. Although some of us had a background in theological studies our theology became much more praxis based. But finding G/god/dess was also in the small miracles, crying with learners, asking the higher being and receiving. The centre needed food and a group called 'Hande en voete vir Christus' (Hands and Feet for Christ) was formed by a doctor and provided food on a daily basis. The centre needed a piano and when a lady donated it, Lynn claimed that it was provided by God's miracle.

Furthermore we found G/god/dess through being together, mentoring one another through the good and difficult times. Reminding one another of hope and 'doing hope' together. Finding G/god/dess is thus praxis based that is in turn linked to feminist theology. Through the different pillars of feminist theology namely the search for justice, love, hope, unity, meaning, beauty, equality, truth, empowerment and freedom, the believer also becomes connected with G/god/dess. And through the hope that was created through mentorship, our learners' care and the communities' support we still see the pain and despair. But there exists an alternative story of hope, reminding us that although we see and experience suffering we have witnessed miracles and hope.

Chapter 4

Mentoring as we witness hope/despair

After the holidays I am filled with anticipation. Waiting and hoping that each and every learner would return. Sometimes I needed to wait ten days before they were all back at school. And then I could breathe again. When I would ask learners at schools in more privileged areas if they had enjoyed their holidays they would answer most of the time that they had a good or wonderful holiday. They would share their travels, movies they had seen, the amount of times they went ice skating and so on. When I asked the learners in Mamelodi their answers were mostly negative. When I returned after the Easter holiday this year they started sharing with me how many funerals they attended. Most attended at least one. Lindiwe (not her real name) had to attend four funerals, one was a family member being killed walking across the road, the other being stabbed, one person died of Aids and the other died in hospital being sick but nobody wanted to say why. I listened to these stories. The pain that was shared, the fear that they will also die young. There is such a difference in the stories shared by the learners in the privilege areas versus the learners in Mamelodi. But the dreams for the students correlate in so many ways. They tend to dream about living in a nice house, driving a beautiful car, some dream of having a family but many of my children in Mamelodi want to leave Mamelodi, where the other children prefer to stay in their community. In Mamelodi most of the learners tend to laugh about the children that drop out of school or become pregnant. For them it is the killer of the dream to leave hopelessness and Mamelodi behind. For them failure lies in staying part of the community into which you were born. Their dreams centre mostly on money and leaving the township for good.

I walked into one of the classrooms the other day. One of my colleagues was sitting there. I asked her what was wrong. She read one of the learners' diaries. It consisted of the learner's life story, her pain and sadness were revealed in this book. My colleague started crying and again we wondered what we could do to help? Was it at all possible to change the circumstances? Could we ever do enough?

Friday afternoon: I have to go to a concert where pupils need to perform and I have to represent one of Mamelodi's learners winning a prize as she will not be able to attend the

concert. I drive through the streets. It is very congested and traffic is moving slowly and haltingly. Just after the speed bump a child rushes from behind a taxi in front of my car. I slam on the brakes. Still I hear the bump as the boy runs into my car. He jumps up and starts running. I stop on the dusty side of the road. A lady stops him and I go over to him to see if he is okay. He just says he is sorry over and over. I am filled with shock and concern. A passing ambulance stops. A crowd gathers around us. The slow moving taxis' drivers start screaming: 'I will kill you'. They are shouting at me. The crowd becomes emotional and filled with anger. They became more and more aggressive. I am reminded when I was nearly hi- jacked a year ago when the man vowed to kill me if I hurt one of Mamelodi's children. I stand next to the road crying. I see Betsie's car approaching and I wave to her to stop. She is frightened. Anger and aggression are accumulated in the voices of some of the community as they shout: 'kill the white woman'. The one ambulance person shouts at her why did she hit the child with her car. I tell a woman that confronts me that he ran in front of my car. I convey that I am a teacher in Mamelodi. This knowledge seems to have a calming effect. The ambulance crew says the boy is okay. I leave to go to the police station. One of my colleagues sees me passing and he follows to make sure I am okay. But even now when I am writing this life story I still experience the intimidation from the people. Mr Sebata, the principal of Mamelodi joins us to try and speed up the process but we still have to wait four hours before I can leave to go home. Although it was a night filled with victimization, fear at having to point out exactly what happened at the accident scene in the dark with only one police officer standing there and people looking at us in surprise: what is a white woman doing in Mamelodi at night next to the road? During this timw in which I experienced a lot of stress I found a community of care. My colleagues supported me. Lynn and Pindele phoned. My colleagues sent sms's, my pupils found out and started phoning and sms'ing. People from different communities supported. I was booked off for twelve days with posttraumatic stress, not knowing if I would return to teach in Mamelodi. My Mamelodi learners started sending sms's

'When God gave us teacher he tried to b fair but when we got u we got more than our share!'

'Oh! How I wish u would come back cause music is no longer what it used to b.'

'I just wanted u to know that whatever u decides we will always care about u.'

4.1 Introduction

'At the beginning of the third millennium, many countries are enduring the ordeal of violent political conflict. Mental health providers (as well as educators) in these countries must live under the same stress-inducing circumstances as the general population, increasing their vulnerability to over-involvement, compassion fatigue and burnout, phenomena often observed among helping personnel in these circumstances (Fiegly 1996). Thus 'these caregivers are at high risk for severe stress responses and burnout.' (Klingman 2002:247).

Although currently in South Africa we do not deal with radical political conflict, violence, trauma, despair, underlying political unease, anger, frustration and much more form part of our daily living. For the pastoral carer it forms part of her/his life experiences but also the witnessing of others' experiences. To cope in these circumstances becomes a challenge to many care-workers, thus from there the notion of the use of mentoring as a way to alleviate burnout and prevent burnout.

4.2 Mentoring versus leading

Power imbalances can influence the way in which we care. Feminist theology questions the power relations among people. Furthermore it reveals that the imbalance of power creates suffering (Bons-Storm 1996:27). The negative use of power can thus lead to further suffering and anger. It can also lead to an inability to care and do hope. Addy (1993:84-85) is of the opinion: 'Any hierarchy can force people into silence.'

Alternatively mentoring becomes an option where people can share knowledge and wisdom with one another without forming a top down approach. According to Murphy and Wong (http://hcd.uiuc.edu/grad/appendix4.html) the following aspects present themselves in the mentoring process: respectfulness, commitment, being demanding in the sense where the mentor lives according to a high standard and thus striving with mentoring partner for excellence, adaptable by acknowledging that the mentoring partners have different needs, strengths and knowledge, available, encouraging, pro-active, nurturing, holistic and influential by being positive role models for one another.

Mentoring one another held the possibility to be a mentor and to receive mentorship. This created a space for care and support. As none of us had ever worked fulltime in a township before Mamelodi we found that by sharing wisdoms, ideas, knowledges, emotions, thoughts and intuition we could weave all these aspects in to a much broader 'database' from which we could learn. But we also found together a cultural resonance. 'The more familiar people are with the situation described, the higher the cultural resonance will be and the more likely that others will be able to participate with the person whose narrative it is in a way that supports, endorses and elaborates the story the person has to tell.' (Weingarten 2001:114)

4.3 Research as mentoring partner

Through reading and researching one finds that thin descriptions of events during the research is able to transform into thick descriptions of the event. 'A thick description of an action is one that is inscribed with the meanings of the community of persons to which this action is directly relevant' (White 1997:15). A thick description of an event is still bound to a certain event, but through the knowledge/wisdom gained through this thick description further events can be enriched through previous events. Through the narratives and alternative narratives that were formed in our community of care later events could be enriched by the experience gained. For example when Betsie was first questioned why, according to the learners, God did not care for the them, alternative narratives could be investigated in this context. Not demeaning the question but including the wonder if G/god/dess could be present in other ways that were not visible yet. This created a thicker description that could be incorporated when learners were confronted with death of a family member.

Through research we sometimes try to find solutions for problems. Stringer (1999: xii) reminds the reader that 'it ought to be apparent by now that generalized, one-size-fits-all solutions do not work'. He suggests that through the intimate knowledge of local context can solutions only be devised for local problems. I do wonder if asking research to provide answers for local problems is not unfair towards the research and the focus of the research. When research is placed in a mentoring partner position, research becomes an active part

of the process and not the ultimate possible outcome of the research. To ask of research to give answers to the problems limits the research to a certain timeframe in a certain context, whereas the context and experience in Mamelodi is very erratic which limits the research when used for providing certain answers, furthermore acknowledging the post-modern notion that there does not exist one ultimate truth, thus any definite answers.

As mentoring partner, communication between participants and written research can become interactive as the parties not only influence, but also support one another. Research can share wisdom and knowledges that could then be used in other contexts and timeframes as wisdom can be shared and does not need to become a truth. Being praxis based in research extends the research to other action based situations but also relates to the purpose of feminist theology.

'A narrative approach expresses its ethical concern by providing space for critical reflection on the effects of our choices and actions on the lives of those around us' (Hudson & Kotzé 2002:272).

4.4 Feminist theology as a participant in the mentoring process

Feminist theology becomes praxis based when it becomes a partner in mentorship. Feminist theology teaches the theologian about the different searches put forth by Carmody (1995) and opens the researcher to identify binding discourses but it also challenges the participants to be praxis based. In turn the researcher, the co-searchers can inform feminist theology on their experience through their praxis based living.

Christ can also be seen as a mentor. As a mentor to his disciples he established a close relationship to them through 'fellowship, modelling, advice, encouragement, correction, practical assistance and prayer support' (Krallmann 1992:122). Jesus' praxis was both political and social in nature, working towards liberation of the marginalized and 'breaking through social, religious and cultural barriers' (Isherwood & McEwan 1996:184) .

Feminst theology furthermore 'emphasise our connectedness with ourselves, with each

other and with creation' (Jakobsen 1994:151). Through this connectedness we can mentor one another. We have a social responsibility as pastoral care-do-ers to 'do hope' with another and to care for our community and ourselves. Mentoring form part of this process as we teach but also be in the moment with the 'other'.

4.5 Mentoring as pastoral care

Pastoral care is an action / participation of people within the community. Pastoral care as part of the sphere of theology can sometimes lead to the assumption that it needs to be based in a religious or Christian context. It can even be perceived to be part of church interactions or being the 'duty' of certain people (for example ministers/ pastors) within the church community. But pastoral care is inclusive; its participant's forms part of the community of care and strive towards living ubuntu. Pastoral care goes beyond the boundaries of religious institutions.

Pastoral care has the vision of compassion. Mentoring also has the element of compassion. Mentoring can not exist outside the boundaries of compassion as compassion enables the mentor to 'be with' the other person in the moment. To mentor entails that one needs to be in one's own and the other's life space.

Both mentoring and pastoral care have a socio-political commitment and as care-do-ers, pastoral carers, mentors, theologians, believers and as human beings we hold the responsibility of standing up against oppressive discourses and actions.

Mentoring and pastoral care become intertwined as mentoring is an aspect of pastoral care, although pastoral care is also composed of other aspects that do not necessarily involve mentoring. But pastoral care is also one of the components of mentoring although other components exist in mentoring that is not necessarily bound to pastoral care.

Chapter 5

'Doing hope'

A week after the accident I was missing my community so much in Mamelodi. Betsie offered that I could drive in with her. The learners were not there when I arrived. I felt devastated. But as the afternoon progressed Lindiwe walked in. She did not greet at all but just walked out. A half an hour later I heard recorders playing and when I looked out of the window my junior students were walking in a row playing their recorders. Lindiwe was carrying a baby on the hip. They walked into my class greeting me with big smiles and we played their old and new pieces. A bit later one of the girls came to me and said: 'Phutsane will be here soon' I still do not know how she knew but 15 minutes later Phutsane walked in beaming. He left to call Bongani and decided that I needed another pupil (as if 84 were not enough yet). Some of the senior school pupils started arriving and they were hugging me and shouting out of gladness. I felt part of the community. Where I felt as such an outsider, too white, the day of the accident I felt the care and acceptance of the learners and my colleagues. When we drove out of Mamelodi later the afternoon three learners that could not attend music as they had to learn for their biology exam were standing next to the street. Close by to where the accident happened. They shouted and jumped up and down and waved. I was so overwhelmed with all the care, their joy with me being back and my joy returning to Mams.

It is our annual Mamelodi concert. We invited the colleagues, learners' parents, learners from advantaged areas, government officials and others. There will be a video made and our learners are all excited. We have solos and small groups playing. And the audience applauds each and every child. We came to the last item for the day. Lynn sits at the piano and starts playing with the marimbas, glockenspiels and drums and then the door opens. The recorders walk in playing 'when the saints go marching in', young black, white and brown learners between 6 and 18. They are followed by the violins and then all the 'young ones' playing drums and triangles and rattles. And we play together. We do African, European and American work. The audience claps with the beat and we play. It ties us as a

community, as people speaking a new language, a language that is found in music. We experience becoming one as a group and for a few minutes despair has vanished as we make music together. We can not think of difference as we play the same tune. It is a celebration of music, of being, of becoming. We end once more with 'when the saints...' and we walk out. We are so elated. We shout and cry and hug and laugh. What a blessing to share in ubuntu.

We have done this same program many times in different competitions and settings and concerts. And each and every time we felt as being one. Coming together to share our music, our hopes and dreams and through this sharing and giving we receive once more hope. 'Doing hope' becomes receiving hope.

5.1 Creating ubuntu

Menkiti (quoted by Shutte 1994:29) states that African thought 'asserts an ontological independence to human society, and moves from society to individuals rather than, in the manner of European thought, from individuals to society'. As stated earlier in the research African thought consists of the notion that 'a person is a person through persons' (Shutte 1994:29). People form part of the same consciousness.

This participatory consciousness in turn is a freeing of oneself of categories and discourses that was imposed by notions of subjectivity and objectivity. It is a 're-ordering of the understanding between the self and the other to a deep kinship of 'selfother', between knower and known' (Kotzé 2002:5). Through participatory consciousness an attitude of openness and receptivity are formed (Heshusius 1994:15).

The moment 'when the self and the other (are) seen as belonging to the same consciousness, all living becomes moral' (Heshusius 1996:133). When we can accept that all human beings belong, how can we then tolerate abuse and exclusion of other people or groups? In Mamelodi we faced being shunned by some in the music fraternity that we as teachers failed and thus 'landed up' in a township. On the other side we became one of the

projects that people wanted to visit coming from overseas. People in the South African community wanted to become part by donating food, instruments, clothes, sponsoring a Christmas party, sending Easter eggs at Easter time and so much more. Some of my students from privileged areas offered to come and teach in Mamelodi but as they taught they also learned, as we as educators learned every day when we were in Mamelodi.

Tutu (2005:26) sees this searching for ubuntu as one of God's dreams. But 'for healing praxis to be truly restorative, it has to be a collaborative and sustained action for justice, reparation and liberation, based on accountability and empowered by love, hope and passion' (Ackermann 1998:83).

Working together in a township, creating hope together with one another as care-workers also created the opportunity in doing compassionate witnessing together (Weingarten 2003:37). We were sharing some of the weight of the traumatic stories shared by learners but also sharing our own traumatic experiences. This created a situation of trust and respect between the caregivers but also caused a rift where care was not experienced. The notion of 'helping tends to promote helping' (Weingarten 2003:36) also reflected the other side of the coin where unhelpfulness tended to create exclusion and even marginalization of parties.

Through the sharing of experiences we once more realized that 'our 'extended family' includes the whole human community' (Lapsley 2002:4).

5.2 Questioning discourses

Kotzé (2002:15) states that 'when post-modern thinking is applied to discourses of faith and religion, no-one has privileged knowledge based on external religious or scientific sources… Even the assumption that one has a source of 'truth' such as the Bible or the Koran still calls for the interpretation of the source.' More and more Christians are coming to a point where they start deconstructing their faith (Jamieson 2002:15). 'People engaged in the deconstruction of their faith remove each article of the belief and value system of

their perceived faith and submit it to a process of ongoing reflection' (Jamieson 2002:69). The discourses that have been established through their faith and believe system are thus questioned but also scrutinized. And through this process believers could come to a point where they could retain certain beliefs but also let go of the others. Deconstruction is an ongoing process as these believers need to challenge the new constructions and discourses. It is a process of self-reflection but also a process in which new wisdoms could be found.

In Mamelodi one of the discourses that was challenged was that of person centred problems. Where most of us with a psychology and/or education studies background tend to place the problem many times as part of the person and even so far as part of the person's identity. Through the idea of 'the problem being the problem' (Russell & Carey 2004:115) taken from the input of narrative therapy we could challenge this discourse. 'When persons learn to separate from problems, they may come to challenge other practices, cultural in origin, that are 'objectifying' or 'thingifying' of persons and their bodies' (White & Epston 1990:65). Objectification of people is a way in which social control is established. For example when 'Depression' visits one of us, together we could stand up against Depression and thus support our colleague. The colleague thus becomes not an object and the problem was not seen as part of the person that ultimately could 'disable' the person to be in control of her/his world.

5.2.1 Working interracially, intercultural, interclass

Krog (1998:111) is of the opinion that President Thabo Mbeki sees reconciliation as an act taking place between all black with white people and thus insuring a peaceful coexistence.

Jakobsen (1994:149) speaking from the South African context in 1994 states that 'a predominantly affluent lifestyle for whites promotes individualistic tendencies, while a predominantly poor lifestyle for blacks promotes more communal tendencies. This has a profound influence on the way in which moral decisions are made and how they are viewed.' Since the establishment of the 'New South Africa' this situation still exists in many respects. Classism and the difference in classes contribute now more than race to these differences in these tendencies. In Mamelodi the learners with which we work comes

predominantly from a poor community, as with the care-do-ers most of the educators come from an affluent lifestyle. Difference in worldviews was very visible. Not only in the way in which the different groups lived in the different areas and communities but also in the way that the opinions were formed on certain aspects.

Bongani Alison Mazibuko, a theologian that left a significant legacy in Christian education (Kumalo 2005:105) argued 'that mission must be transformed from one that imposes itself on communities to one that incarnates and takes on the form of those communities' (Kumalo 2005:113). In Mamelodi, working as pastoral care-do-ers this notion resonated with us. Although we did not participate in the field of missiology we as care-do-ers had to learn that we could not impose our own ideas on the group or the children. We had to become part of the township to the extend that it was possible. We had to acknowledge that we could not become completely part of the community and its ways but we had to learn not to see our own ideas and beliefs as the only way or the best way. We had to learn from the community how to do care and hope with them. This caused frustrating times and times filled with irritation and even times that we just could not understand and felt totally lost. But working inter-rationally and inter-culturally places the challenges with the participants to learn with and from the 'other'.

5.3 Coping with trauma

According to the website The Trauma Centre 'many people, particularly those involved in the helping and service professions, are exposed to trauma in the course of their daily work. Some witness traumatic or life-threatening incidents, while others work with people who have been severely traumatized by violence' (Trauma centre). In Mamelodi we deal with trauma directly but we also witness trauma. According to Weingarten (2003:54) the common shock that is witnessed can lead to the 'shutting down' of a person. In our work some of us experienced being silenced by our witnessing of trauma, either by denying what happened, trying to ignore it in order to continue in our work capacity, not being able to reveal our experiences as we were challenging the discourses of the community where we lived, or just being too exhausted to deal with the trauma.

Witnessing and experiencing trauma led to experiencing symptoms of posttraumatic stress

and being booked off work by a doctor for more than a week. I experienced nightmares and was too frightened to return to Mamelodi after the second death threat incident.

What was especially hard to accept for myself and a colleague was the shattering of assumptions (Weingarten 2003:56). Meaning was for us destroyed as we witnessed the racial hatred and tension that existed in the township.

'No two people will ever have the same reaction to witnessing an act of violation or violence, and no two people will ever be a perfect fit for helping each other with their responses to it' (Weingarten 2003:57). And through the process of coping with the trauma as care-do-ers we found ourselves sometimes feeling very alone, distanced from other care-do-ers, family and friends. We experience difference as we dealt with different situations that caused witnessing trauma. 'Being alone' was sometimes intensified as trauma seemed to visit in the quiet times of the care-do-er's life, times when we tried to rest or sleep. Some of us also experienced that we could not always share with the other co-searchers as we had different ways of coping and surviving. Misunderstandings followed and the co-searchers sometimes struggled not only to support one another but not to become involved in arguments.

But even through these trying times we tried to stay connected as part of a community of care.

5.4 The voice of silence

Silencing is a way in which domination exists in communities. Becoming voiceless disempowers the silent group and empowers the group with a voice. But listening to silence can give the researcher new ways of understanding.

In difficult and stressful times silence can be the only tool to communicate. When one is

left without words, when words are unable to describe a situation, silence becomes a means to communicate. Being with the 'other' in the moment, although the moment is filled with silence, could be a way to connect and understand. Heshusius (1994:16-18) is of the opinion that 'when one merges, one can come to know even from silence.' When a participatory consciousness is formed one can even communicate through silence. Through embodied knowledge, as described by Heshusius and Ballard (1996), 'knowledge of the other becomes knowing with the other' and not the 'Western perspective of knowing the other or about the other' (Kotzé 2002:6). And this knowing with the other does not need language in order to form knowledges.

Kotzé (2002:6) is of the opinion that these knowledges are very different from knowledges discovered 'as the product of applying our theories to uncover an understanding of what 'is'.' Knowledge within a participatory consciousness is 'co-constructed in the course of relating with others in a specific context or situation, at a specific moment in time' through 'an ethical political process' (Kotzé 2002:6). But silence can also have a voice of its own and through silence one can create meaning.

5.5 Taking responsibility

To take responsibility is not only part of research ethics but also a way of life for the believer. As care-do-ers we are committed to taking responsibility for our actions and caring for the learners. But we also have a responsibility towards one another as mentoring partners and to ourselves. Being in a mentoring partnership entails that there needs to be a balance in giving and receiving. We found through the year that when one person tends to be depleted the other were strong. Through difficult times we supported one another with caring words, gestures (fetching a cup of tea), notes, sms's, calls and many other ways. We supported one another when a person went through stressful times. We encouraged one another and reclaimed hope through narratives when we could not find hope in the current situation. Some of us prayed for one another. We shared wisdoms, ideas and knowledges.

But 'we cannot escape the baggage of culture. To be part of culture is to bear one's share of beliefs, prejudices and biases (Myburg, Alice & Kotzé 2002:59). Being part of a certain

group entails that we need to share responsibility for the actions of the group. To be part of a certain society, being part of a group that is privileged, also entails that one needs to be politically accountable for our actions and words, acknowledging that pastoral care also has a socio-political awareness (Pattison 1993:88) and this needs to be lived through praxis.

Furthermore to work in difficult circumstances also places the responsibility of self-care on oneself, challenging oneself to listen to one's body's wisdom. Enjoying sitting in the sun or reading a book. Sometimes just taking 'ant-steps' through difficult times.

hooks (2000:7) states that feminists had to change themselves by raising their consciousness before they could change and challenge patriarchy. To care for one another also took the courage of the carers in Mamelodi to change in themselves and to implement self-care. But also working on own issues and the experiences that influenced these issues challenged our own ideas, beliefs and ways of living. Furthermore hooks (1989:21) states that 'it is necessary to remember that it is first the potential oppressor within that we must resist – the potential victim within that we must rescue – otherwise we cannot hope for an end to domination, for liberation…'

Taking responsibility can also include taking responsibility for apathy. Ackermann (1998:90) writes that although we are born innocent we are also born accountable. One of the prime examples of this kind of taking responsibility was an application for amnesty received by The Truth and Reconciliation Commission's Amnesty Committee. In this application 'a group of young black people applied for amnesty for apathy.' This group of young people believed that we all should be held accountable by history for not doing all we could, in this example in the anti-apartheid struggle (Lapsley n.d.: 4).

As pastoral carers we needed to take responsibility without becoming over involved. We needed to become open to be able to see the areas where equality and justice were shunned. And we had to learn how to take action as a community of care. This became a challenge but also a way of living.

Chapter 6

Conclusion?

Is it possible to find a conclusion in an ever changing research project? Working in a community that is experiencing growth as well as a sense of hopelessness at a given time can only be described within that given context. Through my study it was indicated that the idea that only one ultimate truth exists is not part of the way of thinking or praxis in the post-modern framework. More than one truth always exist.

I decided to finish this dissertation, for now, with two possibilities. Not conclusions but two different perspectives that made sense to me at the time of writing. The conclusions are not what I envisioned when I started with the research two years ago. The project did not yield the outcomes that I hoped for. At this stage I do not believe that we as co-searchers were able to maintain a community of care. But it nonetheless changed us as participants.

6.1 Possible 'realistic' perspective 1

It's a winter Friday afternoon in Mams. The dust has found ways into my clothes, covering my shoes and settled between my teeth. The red sun is setting as we drove off waving goodbye to the learners. It's weekend. Each one of us is taking a bit of Mams with us, not only the dust but the rare gifts we have received from our learners and from one another as mentoring partners. We have been changed by Mams.

Most of the teachers have been involved in the township for two years on a fulltime basis. We have grown as individuals but also as being part of a participatory consciousness; we have mentored and cared for one another. We have witnessed the hardships, experienced the trauma directly and indirectly. We have received wonderful gifts by working in Mamelodi but have also lost the ability of 'not-knowing'. We are humbled by the needs

and pain and we speak a lot of the realization that there is still so much to learn.

Furthermore I am humbled by the realization and thought: how could I ever have called any project in the township an outreach project. The township is a place not to only give but also to receive so much in return and maybe even more than is ever possible to give. Ubuntu is an intrinsic part of the community of care and in the township I was taught about care between care-do-ers and the participants of the 'Doing hope through music' group.

As the mentoring has also been woven into the care for and with the students it has become difficult to always separate the mentoring with one another as colleagues and care-do-ers from the 'doing hope' with the learners. The learners became active participants in the research. Their contribution is not reflected through research conversations with the learners but rather the valuable input in our lives. The way we as co-searchers were shaped and formed.

I found it sometimes also depleting during the writing up of the research to realize that I could not capture the energy, the miracles, the embodied experiences and research in words. To experience mentoring in Mamelodi is to be immersed in the experience. To find the value of the experience lies much more in the joy we as care-do-ers experience through the hardships in the township and the smiling faces of the learners. As Betsie asked: 'Mams is rou emosie. Kan dit ooit in taal bestaan?' (*Mams is raw emotion. Could it ever exist in language?)*

But there is also another side, the struggle to stand up against despair and hopelessness. The co-searchers experienced by the end of each school term that they were drained. That witnessing trauma on a daily basis took a big toll. And that even while we supported one another we also found ourselves sometimes depleted and negative about the future of South Africa. As we drew much closer as a group, than in other work settings we found ourselves in, we found new dimensions in our working relationships. As Lynn often said, we are much more like a family. But this family had emotional squabbles and friction that also drained more energy. Betsie and myself often experience a let down during the holidays. On the one side we did not want to return to but also longed to be back in Mamelodi. This

ambivalence became even more accentuated the longer we were part of Mamelodi. For us it was as if the difference between living in a privileged suburb and township became bigger every time we left the township for a while.

One of the aspects that I did not consider in the beginning of this study as having a big impact on the experience of trauma was racism and the legacy of Apartheid in the research. When I described factors that would contribute towards the experience of shock and trauma I never considered this aspect. Only after experiencing hatred and anger from part of the community towards myself as a white woman I realized that Apartheid's voice is still not only a remnant in out society but plays an active part in the life in South Africa.

In the process of communicating with other white educators working in townships, they expressed their concern relating to the fact that they are white and according to them it makes them more vulnerable. During the time that I was busy with the research I met educators that left education, being burnt out and/or unable to return to the townships after experiencing racial hatred. I listened to educators that were victims of death threats and even more violent situations. I do wonder what this Anger and Violence is saying about our community. Tutu (2005:57) questions the fact that people were never compensated for the atrocities that happened in the Apartheid regime. Although the Truth and Reconciliation commission was formed in order to remember and heal, as we as a country decided, as a people decided, 'we couldn't take the historical option of forgetting and forgiving', (Lapsley 2005:2 interview) new problems arose. Terry Bell (2001:3) describes the amnesia that was established in South Africa about what has gone before but also the denial of what exists in the present. Where as 'gross human rights violations … were a norm' (Bell 2001:15) in the apartheid era these violations have never been in full investigated or victims acknowledged or compensated. Mamphela Ramphele (2002:162) suggests that we need to accept the full extent of apartheid on society's needs and the legacy of apartheid and its socioeconomic consequences. She calls on concrete action to eradicate poverty but also the acknowledgement of the social crises. To voice the social crises would break the silence. Healing is still needed in South Africa as the trauma of victims has not been acknowledged in its entirety (Ackermann 1998:93).

Speaking to a black woman at the time when I considered leaving the township, she spoke of the difference between the 'educated' and 'uneducated'. She was of the opinion that the 'uneducated' hated the white people. That their anger are influenced by the feeling that they are still in the same situation as before the New South Africa was formed now over ten years ago. She stated that the hatred is inflamed as they experience that they are even worse of than before. This creates again a situation of us and them. Creating new boundaries and another kind of –ism brought forth by education. Ramphele (2002:163) counters this separation by calling on black people to accept that most black people 'had not been accorded the opportunities to get the high-quality education and exposure to experiences that facilitate the honing of the critical skills needed at many levels in a modern society. They need to accept that lack of education and experience is not equivalent to an inferior intellect.' Only through acknowledgement and acceptance can healing be created.

One of the white teachers that left the township opinion was that the hatred and anger are worse than even in the times of the riots. Lapsley (2005:5) states that the Truth and Reconciliation Committee did not leave a legacy of reconciliation but rather of a community of angry and bitter people as no reparation was done acknowledging the suffering and inequalities suffered during the Apartheid years.

Furthermore Lapsley (n.d.:4) states: 'It is important to see that while the apartheid system benefited some and deprived the majority, it also damaged the moral fibre and integrity of the entire nation… Widespread contempt for the law was brought about… Privilege gained, directly or indirectly, through exploitation and suffering in most cases became the natural way of life and an accepted 'right' for those of us who were born white…damage done to the youth…' We are 'not sharing common guilt but common responsibility' (Lapsley 2005:4). With this legacy we are building the New South Africa.

'A feminist perspective has a contribution to make to the development of practical theology, in regard both to the formation of its theological theories and to theological praxis' (Ackermann 1993:23). In this research project (if one could call it at all a project, rather maybe a way of living or even a roller-coaster ride) feminist theology gave new

ways of doing and living research. As feminist theology is praxis based it has the possibility to benefit the co-searchers as well as the community through the research action. It is not a looking at, or the investigation of a certain community, but rather a doing with the community. Feminist theology furthermore sensitises the researcher to some of the possible discourses that could be blinding the researcher, but also challenges the researcher as well as the co-searchers to search for the main pillars namely: the search for justice, meaning, beauty, love, truth, equality, identity, empowerment, unity, freedom and the choice between despair and hope. Feminist theology being praxis based has opened up practical theology to the community as feminist theology strive towards equality and enabling people to speak with their own voice their narratives and wisdoms.

The one thing that stood out for me in this study is echoed in Antjie Krog's book *Country of my skull* (1998:110) where she quotes John Mbiti as follows:' I am because we are, and since we are, therefore I am.'

6.2 My more personal perspective

It's a winter Friday afternoon in Mams. The dust has found ways into my clothes, covering my shoes and between my teeth. The red sun is setting as we drove of waving goodbye to the learners. It's weekend. Each one of us are taking a bit of Mams with us, not only the dust but the rare gifts we have received from our learners, from one another as mentoring partners. We have been changed by Mams. The sun is saying its goodbyes and is bright red through the lenses filled with Mamelodi dust. I am happy. It's a week in which we as mentors could have cared for ourselves, one another and the learners. We all participated in 'doing hope' and contributing in 'doing hope' in the' New South Africa'.

I decided to use the heading – my personal perspective – as this is my preferred reality. A reality in which we are caring for one another, a reality in which I am not scared when darkness awakens me and I wonder when I will be killed. A reality in which I do not need to keep looking towards my bedroom door at night and wonder when 'they' would walk in to threaten me and then murder my family, where I do not need a sleeping pill to enable me to have some rest.

A reality where I could drive into Mamelodi, not being afraid to be behind the steering wheel of the car, not looking around searching for would be hijackers.

In this reality ubuntu is a concept that forms part of life in South Africa. Participatory consciousness is an intrinsic part of our community and theology is praxis based. But that might be a leap to far.

Maybe the reality could only witness that care changes communities. Could we as South Africans stand up together against Aids and poverty, that a child's welfare becomes our responsibility, the community's responsibility?

You might ask why I am writing this chapter, why a conclusion not based on the research, and I will have to answer, I need this conclusion at this stage in my life. A conclusion that gives hope and enables me to keep on 'doing hope through music' in Mamelodi. Re-telling myself the story when we all played together; the different instruments, ages, cultures, sexes, 'When the saints'. The way we looked at one another and laughed together (even if this made squeaky noises through the flutes) and became one as a community. I need a conclusion that will motivate me to return to Mamelodi after the school holidays, a conclusion that will enable the feeling of security and safety to return in my life (and hopefully a good nights rest).

I wish this dissertation was handed in before the day of the accident. Before that day I believe lenses were still intact that the 'New South Africa' was a much better place (I am not so sure anymore). I could share in Betsie's dream that we were going to take with us the children to the stars. Some of us as teachers became overly involved in trying to provide an alternative to a street child's life. I had a belief that we could form part of the Mamelodi community. Betsie even considered moving to Mamelodi with her family.

I would rather share with this research the spirit of Mamelodi when we as a group made music together, when we celebrated life and creation together. For me that was the

celebration of G/god/dess and hope and care and love.

I wonder how much we ignored the voices of colleagues at other schools. I remember a day when Lynn and I listened to a woman warning us about Mamelodi and our involvement in the community. She ended the conversation with her wisdom that one day we would come back and acknowledge that everything was in vain, that we have wasted our time. I remember how Lynn answered that one day this women would realize that it did make a difference. I believe it did make a difference but I am not sure it was the difference we envisioned.

I would have preferred a conclusion in which I could motivate young teachers to join us in townships, where there is such a need for more caring educators. But even now I do not know if it is wise to bring my young students from the more privileged communities with me to Mamelodi.

I would have loved to write a final conclusion on this research where it would have been inspirational to all that might read it to become involved in mentoring. That mentoring would be a way to insure more participation of people in communities where the needs are so great. Where life was not so messy but more structured. Where one made progress in leaps and bounds and did not need to sit sometimes just in the sun not to feel so cold and drained. Where one could take elephant steps most of the time and not just ant steps.

I prefer a utopia; I think it is the only way for me at this stage to return to Mamelodi, even to stay in South Africa. Experiencing disillusionment, loosing meaning, trauma through attempted hijacking, a group of people that shouted that they wanted to kill me, more than one occasion when I was robbed in Mamelodi make it difficult to continue working in Mamelodi. Ambivalence created by living in nearly two different worlds that of the township and the neighbourhood where I live have created times when I experienced guilt and shame. The ambivalence that was created by the hate of the certain part of the community and the care of the learners make it very difficult to decide if I am going to stay in Mamelodi or leave. Mamelodi is a place living with extremes, the highs of care and making music and having an impact on learners' lives but also the lows of witnessing

despair and the trauma. Creating a utopia could be a form of 'doing hope' when one is drained and struggles standing up against despair.

Denise Ackermann (1998:88-90) advocates that a 'feminist theology of praxis is essentially imaginative'. She gives me hope when she states: 'When it dares to dream its utopian dreams for a better world and when it hopes are translated into actions for healing and wholeness, imagination remains a vital ingredient. Daring and imaginative praxis was at the heart of the struggle for liberation in South Africa: defiance campaigns, marches, innovative methods of protest. The kind of imaginative praxis which is effective and constructive is one which calls for the creative convergence of the poetic and the ethical. To be ethically imaginative is to be prepared to stand alongside 'the others', the suffering and the marginalised, to hear the cry of need and then, compelled by the ethical demands of imagination, to respond to need with healing praxis.' Furthermore Ackermann claims that 'feminist theology of praxis is characterized by risk and requires stamina … it is an exercise in vulnerability'.

The one thing that stood out for me in this study is echoed in Antjie Krog's book *Country of my skull* (1998:110) where she quotes John Mbiti as follows: 'I am because we are, and since we are, therefore I am.'

References

Ackermann, D M 1993. Critical theory, communicative actions and liberating praxis: Views of a feminist practical theologian. *Journal of theology for South Africa* 82, 21-36.

--- 1996 Engaging freedom: a contextual feminist theology of praxis. *Journal of Theology for South Africa* 94, 32-49.

--- 1997. Tales of terror and torment: Thoughts on boundaries and truth-telling. *Scriptura* 63, 425-434.

--- 1998. 'A voice was heard in Ramah': a feminist theology of praxis for healing in South Africa, in Ackermann & Bons-Storm 1998:75-102.

Ackermann, D M and Bons-Storm, R (eds) 1998. *Liberating faith practices: feminist practical theologies in context.* Leuven: Peeters.

Addy, H 1993. *Life Cycles: Women and pastoral care*. London: SPCK.

Anderson, H 1997. *Conversation, language, and possibilities: A postmodern approach to therapy.* New York: Basic Books.

Anderson, S R & Hopkins, P 1991. *The feminine face of God: the unfolding of the sacred women.* New York: Bantam Books.

Ballard, K 1996. Paradigm lost and regained, in Heshusius & Ballard 1996:26-31.

Bell, T 2001. *Unfinished business: South Africa Apartheid & Truth.* Observatory: RedWorks.

Bons-Storm, R 1996. *The incredible woman. Listening to women's silences in pastoral care and counselling.* Nashville: Abingdon Press.

--- 1998. Putting the little ones into the dialogue, in Ackermann & Bons-Storm 1998:9-26.

Botha, J 1994. The Bible and ethics, in Villa-Vicencio & De Gruchy 1994:36-47.

Cameron, E 2005. *Witness to AIDS.* Cape Town: Tafelberg.

Carmody, D L 1995. *Christian feminist theology.* Oxford: Blackwell.

Census 2001 [Online] n.d. Available: http://www.statssa.gov.za/census01/html. [Accessed 1 July 2005].

Christ, C P 1989. Rethinking Theology and Nature. In Plaskow & Christ 1989:314-325.

Cochrane, J R, De Gruchy, J W & Petersen, R 1991. *In word and deed: Towards a practical theology of social transformation.* Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications.

Crystal, D 1990. *The Cambridge encyclopedia.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Dane, F C 1990. *Research methods.* California: Brooks/Cole Publishing Company.

Dawn, M & Peterson, E 2000. *The unnecessary pastor: Rediscovering the call.* Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.

De Gruchy, J 1994. Ecology, in Villa-Vicencio & De Gruchy 1994:203-209.

--- 1997. Human being in Christ: resources for an inclusive anthropology, in Germond & De Gruchy 1997:233-269.

Denborough, D (ed) 2006. *Trauma: Narrative responses to traumatic experience.* Adelaide: Dulwich centre publications.

Denzin, N K & Lincoln, Y S 1994. *Handbook of qualitative research.* London: SAGE.

Doehring, C 1999. A method of feminist pastoral theology, in Miller-McLemore & Gill-Austern 1999:95-112.

Dudley-Marling, C 1996. Stories of Inner Change, in Heshusius & Ballard 1996:108-114.

Fillingham, L A 1993. *Foucault for beginners.* New York: Writers and Readers Publishing.

Foucault, M 1969. *Archaeology of knowledge.* London & New York: Routledge.

--- 1977. *Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison.* London: Penguin books.

Freedman, J & Combs, G 1996. *Narrative therapy: The social construction of preferred realities.* New York: Norton Company.

Freeman, J, Epston, D & Lobovits, D 1997. *Playful approaches to serious problems: Narrative therapy with children and their families.* New York: Norton.

Gebara, I 1993. The face of transcendence as a challenge to the reading of the Bible in Latin America, in Schüssler Fiorenza 1993:172-186.

Gergen, K J 1991. *The saturated self: Dilemmas of identity in contemporary life.* New

York: Basic Books.

Gergen, K J 1999. *An invitation to social construction.* London: SAGE.

Germond, P & De Gruchy, S (eds) 1997. *Aliens in the household of God. Homosexuality and Christian faith in South Africa.* Cape Town: David Phillip.

Gold, V R, Hoyt, T L, Ringe, S H, Thistlethwaite, S B, Throckmorton, B H & Withers, B A (eds). *The New Testament and Psalms: An inclusive version.* New York: Oxford University press.

Grobbelaar, R, Kotzé, E & Kotzé, D 2001. Stories of mothers with differently abled children: A research proposal, in Kotzé & Kotzé 2001:163-196.

Heshusius, L 1994. Freeing ourselves from objectivity: Managing subjectivity or turning towards a participatory mode of consciousness? *Educational Researcher, 23(3), 15-22.*

--- 1996. On tending broken dreams, in Heshusius & Ballard 1996:128-135.

Heshusius, L & Ballard, K (eds) 1996. *From positivism to interpretivism and beyond: Tales of transformation in education and social research.* London: Teacher College Press.

Heshusius, L & Ballard, K 1996. How do we count the ways we know? Some background to the project, in Heshusius & Ballard 1996:1-16.

Hess, C L 1998. Becoming mid-wives to justice: a feminist approach to practical theology, in Ackermann & Bons-Storm 1998:51-74.

Heyns, L M & Pieterse, H.J.C. 1990. *Eerste tree in praktiese teologie.* Pretoria: Gnosis.

Heyward, C 1989. *Touching our strength: The erotic power and the love of God.* New York: Harper & Row.

Hogan, L 1995. *From women's experience to feminist theology.* England: Sheffield Press.

hooks, b 2000. *Feminism is for everybody: passionate politics.* London: Pluto Press.

Hudson, T & Kotzé, D 2002. Journeying a life-giving, ethical spirituality, in Kotzé, Myburg, Roux, & associates 2002:269-290.

Isherwood, L & McEwan, D 1993. *Introducing feminist theology.* Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press.

--- 1996. *An A to Z of feminist theology.* Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press.

Jakobsen, W 1994. Ethics in Feminist Theology, in Villa-Vicencio, & De Gruchy, 1994:148-161.

Jamieson, A 2002. *A churchless faith: Faith journeys beyond the churches.* London: SPCK.

Keane, M 1998. Feminist and womanist theology, in Maimela & König 1998:121-136.

King, U (ed) 1994. *Feminist theology from the Third World.* New York: Orbis Press.

Klingman, A From supportive-listening to a solution-focused intervention for counsellors dealing with political trauma. *British Journal of Guidance & Counselling, 30(3), 247-259.*

Kotzé, D 2002. Doing participatory ethics, in Kotzé, Myburg, Roux & Associates 2002:1-34.

Kotzé, D, Myburg, J, Roux, J & Associates (eds) 2002. *Ethical ways of being.* Pretoria: Ethics Alive.

Kotzé, E & Kotzé, D (eds) 2001. *Telling narratives.* Pretoria: Ethics Alive.

Kotzé, E & Kotzé, D 2001. Telling narratives, doing spirituality, in Kotzé & Kotzé 2001:1-14.

Kotzé, E, Morkel, E & Associates 2002. *Matchboxes, butterflies & angry foots. Narratives of therapy with children & young people of South Africa.* Pretoria: Ethics Alive.

Krallmann, G 1992. *Mentoring for mission: A handbook on leadership principles exemplified by Jesus Christ.* Germany: Jensco.

Kretzschmar, L 1994. Ethics in a theological context, in Villa-Vicencio & De Gruchy 1994:2-23.

Krog, A 1998. *Country of my skull.* Johannesburg: Random House.

Kübler-Ross, E & Kessler, D 2000. *Life Lessons: How our Mortality can Teach us about Life and Living.* UK: Simon & Schuster.

Kumalo, S R 2005. Doing Christian education at the edges in South Africa: A review of the work of Bongani Mazibuko as a Christian educator and missiologist. *Studia Historiae Ecclesiastica,* Oct 2005, Vol XXXI, No 2, 105-127.

Landman, C 1984. A Profile of Feminist Theology, in Vorster 1984:1-29.

--- 1994. *The piety of Afrikaans women: Diaries of guilt.* Pretoria: UNISA.

Lapsley, M n.d. *Moral arguments for reparations in South Africa* [Online]. Available: http://www.healingofmemories.co.za/artticles/Moralarguments.htm [Accessed 21 June 2005].

--- 2002. *So much pain, so much hope* [Online]. Available: http://www.healingofmemories.co.za/index.php?Somuchpain.htm [Accessed 21 June 2005].

Martin, F 1994. *The feminist question: Feminist theology in the light of Christian tradition.* Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company.

Mann, S 2006. 'How do you do this work?' Responding to questions about the experience of working with women who were subjected to child sexual abuse, in Denborough 2006:1-24.

McLachlan, C 2000. Fear or freedom: a feminist theological perspective on the Book of Revelation. MA (Biblical studies: New Testament) unpublished thesis, Rand Afrikaans University, Johannesburg.

McLeod, J 2002. A narrative social constructionist approach to therapeutic empathy. *Counselling Psychology Quarterly*, Vol. 12, No. 4, 377-394.

McFague, S 1989. God as Mother, in Plaskow & Christ 1989:139-150.

McTaggart, R 1997. *Participatory action research, International contexts and consequences.* Albany: State University of New York.

Mentoring/ Trainee Responsibilities [online], n.d. Available: http://www.rcr.emich.edu/module7/g2_definitions.html [Accessed 30 June 2005].

Michel, F 1999. Beyond happy endings: Identity politics, bisexuality, narrative. *Dulwich centre Journal (1), 13-21.*

Miller-McLemore, B J 1998. The subject and practice of pastoral theology, in Ackermann & Bons-Storm 1998:175-198.

Miller-McLemore, B J & Gill-Austern, B L (eds) 1999. *Feminist and womanist pastoral theology.* Nashville: Abingdon.

Moltmann-Wendel, E & Moltmann, J 1974. Foreword, in Russel 1974:11-15.

Morgan, A. 2000. *What is narrative therapy?* Adelaide: Dulwich Centre Publications.

Murphy, L R & Wong, G 1997. *Mentorship.* [Online]. Available: http://hcd.uiuc.edu/grad/appendix4.html [Accessed 30 June 2005].

Myburg, J L 2000. Deconstructing identity in a landscape of ideology, culture, belief and power. DTH unpublished thesis, University of South Africa: Pretoria.

Myburg, J L, Alice & Kotzé, D 2002. A door to Alice's wonderland, in Kotzé, Myburg, Roux & Associates 2002:55-76.

Neuman, W L 1994. *Social research methods. Qualitative and Quantitative approaches.* Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Nicolson, R 1996. *God in AIDS? A theological enquiry.* London: SCM Press.

Niehaus, E 2001. Narratives of relationships/marriages. MTH unpublished thesis, University of South Africa: Pretoria.

Oduyoye, M E 1994. Reflections from a Third World women's perspective: women's experience and liberation theologies, in King 1994:23-44.

Pattison, S 1993. *A Critique of Pastoral Care.* London: SCM Press.

--- 1994. *Pastoral care and liberation theology.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Plaskow, J & Christ, C P 1989 (eds). *Weaving the visions. New patterns in feminist spirituality.* San Francisco: Harper.

Purvis, S B 1993. *The power of the cross: foundations for a Christian feminist ethic of community.* Nashville: Abingdon Press.

Rabinow, P 1994. *Michael Foucault: Ethics, essential works of Foucault 1954-1984.* London: Penguin Books.

Rae, E 1995. *Women, the earth, the Devine.* New York: Orbis Books.

Ramphele, M 2002. *Steering by the stars, being young in South Africa.* Cape Town: Tafelberg.

Reinharz, S 1992. *Feminist methods in social research.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Ruether, R R (ed) 1974. *Religion and sexism: images of women in the Jewish and Christian traditions.* New York: Simon & Schuster.

Russell, L M 1974. *Human liberation in a feminist perspective: a theology.* Philadelphia:

Westminster Press.

Russell, S & Carey, M 2004. *Narrative therapy.* Adelaide: Dulwich Centre Publications.

Schüssler Fiorenza, E 1989. In Search of women's heritage, in Plaskow & Christ 1989:29-38.

Schüssler Fiorenza, E (ed) 1993. *Searching the scriptures, vol 1: A feminist introduction.* London: SCM Press.

Shutte, A 1994. Philosophical Ethics, in Villa-Vicencio & De Gruchy 1994:24-35.

Settel, T S 1995. *The wisdom of Gandhi.* New York: Kensington Publishing Corp.

Spargo, T 1999. *Foucault and queer theory.* Cambridge: Icon Books.

Stringer, E T 1999. *Action research, second edition.* London: SAGE Publications.

Sue, D, Sue, D & Sue, S 1994. *Understanding Abnormal Behavior.* Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Tutu, D 2004. *God has a dream: A vision of hope for our time.* London: Rider.

Villa-Vicencio, C 1994. Ethics of Responsibility, in Villa-Vicencio & De Gruchy 1994:75-88.

Villa-Vicencio, C & De Gruchy, J (eds) 1994. *Doing ethics in context, South African perspectives.* Johannesburg: David Phillip.

Vorster, W S (ed) 1984, *Sexism and feminism in theological perspective*, 1-29. Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Weingarten, K n.d. *Witnessing Project* [Online]. Available: http://www.witnessingproject.org/posit.html [Accessed 1 July 2005].

--- 2000. Witnessing, wonder and hope. *Family Process* 39(1), 389-402.

--- 2001. Making sense of illness narratives: Braiding theory, practice and the embodied life, in White 2001:112-121.

--- 2002. Immersed in America, in Kotzé, Myburg, Roux, & Associates 2002:35-54.

--- 2003. *Common shock: witnessing violence every day.* New York: Dutton.

--- 2004. Common shock: Witnessing violence in clients' lives. *Counsellor, The Magazine for addiction professionals,* Feb 2004, Vol 5 nr.1, 70-74.

White, C (ed) 2001. *Working with the stories of women's lives,* 112-121. Adelaide: Dulwich Centre Publications.

White, C & Denborough, D 1998. *Introducing narrative therapy: A collection of practice-based writings.* Adelaide: Dulwich Centre Publications.

White, C, Speedy, J & Denborough, D 2002. *The healing of memories: An interview with Michael Lapsley* [Online]. Available: http://www.healingofmemories.co.za/index.php?interviewdulwichpub_20020703.htm [Accessed 21 June 2005].

White, M 1995. Schools as communities of acknowledgement. A conversation with Michael White. In White, C Schooling and education. Exploring new possibilities. *Dulwich Centre Newsletter (2&3),* 51-66.

--- 1997. *Narratives of therapists' lives.* Adelaide: Dulwich Centre Publications.

--- 2006. Working with people who are suffering the consequences of multiple trauma: A narrative perspective, in Denborough 2006:25-86.

White, M & Epston, D 1990. *Narrative means to therapeutic ends.* Adelaide: Dulwich Centre Publications.

Wilson-Kastner, P 1983**.** *Faith, feminism and the Christ.* Philadelphia: Fortress Press.

Appendix A

The doing hope through music project

Goals

1. Doing hope – This term has been coined by Kaethe Weingarten as a way of creating hope together – hope instead of despair. Doing hope in a community faced with poverty,

2. Doing hope through music – Providing the chance to learn a musical instrument. Through music, being a universal language, we find that we can communicate although we can't speak one another's language. Music becomes the bridge between different communities, cultures and languages, forming a 'community of care' (1). Currently recorder, violin, clarinet, voice and piano are being taught as part of the Department of Education's music satellite at Mamelodi High School. We aim to create more centres in townships and underprivileged communities where music can be taught and hope can be created together with more teachers and narrative therapists.

3. Linking different communities together – This is a way of doing hope and care binding different communities and disciplines together in the New South Africa, our Rainbow Nation. Bringing children but also adults together from different communities and cultures is one of our main aims. Working against discrimination and marginalisation towards equality for all. Inviting active participation and sponsorships from different benefactors but also creating opportunities where communities can make music together, learning from one another, caring for one another and creating hope together. We would like to celebrate the following caregivers: Mr Sebata and teachers at Mamelodi high, the Unisa music foundation, Suzuki Europe, Dr Meyer and his project 'Hande en voete vir Jesus' for providing daily food and clothes for our children in Mamelodi, Polliacks, Notation music, Musica,

Cornwall Hill College, Hyperama Menlyn, Barnyard theatre and all other care givers.

4. Doing hope by providing in the basic needs of all our children – We support the notion of Ubuntu that each child is our child. We should participate in taking care of their basic needs as a community. We aim to provide food, clothes and shelter for those in need, those that form part of our project.

5. Aiming towards the dream that each participant in the project can have his or her own instrument.

Dreams

1. To create more music and care centres in more townships and previous disadvantaged communities.

2. Creating more sponsored teaching and therapy opportunities to enable more people to work with these communities.

3. Establishing scholarships for learners for further studies.

4. To link different nations and providing learners with opportunities to learn more about different countries/cultures and providing them with the opportunity to study with other specialist teachers and to perform in different communities and countries.

General

At this stage we are in the process off establishing a non-profitable organization to enable us to reach all our goals and to work towards our dreams. 'Doing hope' through music has benefited our learners by providing care, food, clothes and learning opportunities. This enabled them to grow, experience new and challenging opportunities by performing at the Beeld Eisteddfod, as well as various competitions and concerts.

Furthermore providing an opportunity for new student teachers to learn the art of music teaching and doing hope with the community.

Appendix B

E-mail communication with Kaethe Weingarten.

Dear Christine:

Unfortunately the copy of the dissertation that you have sent me is cut off along the right hand margin by about one inch. Can you please re-send the dissertation?

As for your questions: it is certainly the case that the positions shift in relation to that which you are witnessing and it is also the case that even within one situation, positions may change. Much of the dramatic effect of film and theatre comes from the movement between witness positions. The movie Casablanca for instance, or the ending of Madame Butterfly.

Managing in the world today requires great ingenuity to constantly stay in Position 1. Work with children is all about helping them move form square 3 to square 1. Adults tend to think that the best way to protect children is to move them into or back into unawareness, but that never works for long. It is harder to figure out how to empower a child who is aware but that is the task. Always.

I do feel that I have worked very hard to find ways of doing that. As you know I see that as part of what it means to do hope together. I think my book is full of personal examples of my doing that.   I guess because I do it daily, it is hard to think of examples that might be useful to you in your context.

The four steps I go through are these: **select a focus** (easing children's hunger was yours); **identify a proxy measure of your focus** (this is where it becomes tricky. You have to not only select a target that is an approximation of the large goal, but must emotionally accept that you alone cannot solve the BIG problem. You cannot end hunger in the township; just feed the children you work with directly.) **Design the response. Implement it with others**. I do find that these four steps work in most situations to move me into aware and empowered. However, it requires a great deal of humility to accept that I cannot do all that I would want to be able to do. And it requires acceptance to let myself feel good about doing something inevitably small. However, small is not trivial.

I am now away until July 3.

Take good care.

 Kaethe