

**HOW THE TVET STUDENTS ARE TRAINED AND PREPARED FOR  
JOB ENTRY IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN INDUSTRIES**

**by**

**Seanokeng Lydia Thakalekoala**

**Student no: 64062317**

**submitted in accordance with the requirements**

**for the degree of**

**MASTER OF EDUCATION**

**in the subject**

**EDUCATION MANAGEMENT**

**at the**

**UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA**

**SUPERVISOR: Prof VT ZENGELE**

**October 2021**

## DECLARATION

I declare that “How the Technical and Vocational Training (TVET) students are trained and prepared for job entry in the South African industries” is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.



Signature: 

Date: 30/11/2021

Seanokeng Lydia Thakalekoala

Student number: 64062317

## DEDICATION

This study is dedicated first to God the Almighty who made it possible for me to embark on this journey. I would like to give a special dedication to my loving and supportive husband thank you for believing when I didn't believe in myself, you're a true inspiration in my life and lastly, I would like to thank my family and friends for their unwavering support and encouragements, that cannot be measured. To my little two princesses, Reitumetse and Reabetswe, may this study be an inspiration to you.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author would like to convey her sincere gratitude and appreciation for the assistance, guidance and support rendered by the following people:

- My supervisor Professor V.T Zengele for his courageous support and constructive criticism throughout the study.
- My special vote of thanks goes to the lecturers, HoDs and support staff who made it possible for me to collect data on their campuses.
- To Motheo TVET College management for granting permission to conduct the study in various campuses.
- Most importantly to all the students in the campuses and who also completed their studies participating in the study and for meaningfully contributing towards the fulfilment of its aims and objectives.
- To my friends and family for their understanding, support, and encouragement and patience, your calls, texts and study packages meant so much during this time.
- Dr Joseph Mutangadura for the professional editing and formatting of my thesis.
- Last but not least, my sincere appreciation goes to my husband Ntate Katleho Abram Thakalekoala and our children Reitumetse and Reabetswe who stood by me during hard times in the completion of this study. Let this study be a source of inspiration to you all.

## ABSTRACT

The study intended to establish how TVET students are trained and supported for South African industries. South Africa is still struggling to develop a system of education that is skills-oriented. The TVET sector is still producing programs that are not skills-oriented, adding to the enormous number of unskilled graduates, as argued by (McConnell, 2009). The motivation to conduct this study is based on experience as a TVET lecturer who has trained TVET students but realised that they struggle to get job entry in the South African industries. This problem is highlighted by research studies that state that South African TVETs have to ensure higher education is of high quality and delivers the right skills to drive growth. Cooperation between industry and TVET may enable TVET students to be trained and developed in the relevant curriculum content. Many firms are uncertain of the current purpose of TVET colleges and its relevance to the value of skills produced by the TVET system. The research intended to answer the questions on the industry expectations concerning TVET graduates, the challenges experienced by students about TVET training and entry into the industry, and formulate recommendations for TVETs in training as preparation of students for job entry into the South African workplaces? Literature from varied sources helped define the research gap with a particular focus on the identified TVET campuses in the Free State. Industrial development in the late 1800s increased the demand for technical education to be made available to the youth. The demand was spurred by the evolving mining industry and railways, harbours and small engineering workshops in urban centres (Gamble, 2003). "Historians note that technical education referred to a type of education which had reference to manufacturing and industrial pursuits and the scientific principles underlying these" (Smuts, 1937:97). Major findings revealed several issues. There is a real gap between the functioning of the TVETs and the industry that later absorbs the graduates. Regarding this aspect, most of the staff and labour representatives established a common characterisation of attributes, knowledge, and intellectual capability elements that are expected from TVET graduates. In addition, combinations of transferable skills were also deemed particularly relevant. Career guidance offices do exist on campuses, but there is very little collaboration with the industry. The need to change the curriculum was another critical finding. For this curriculum to function, the two parts need to come together and populate the syllabuses. It was concluded that the industry and TVETs were not in constant consultation. Yet, the purpose and mission of South African TVET colleges have always been to respond to the country's human resource needs for personal, social, civic, and economic development. A transformed, high quality, responsive TVET system is a significant investment in the future of South Africa and all its people. Recommendations were that employability measures need to be systematic and embedded into departmental and faculty practice: otherwise, they are vulnerable to changes in personnel. It was also recommended that TVETs and employers should continue to promote and expand opportunities for students to access work-based learning.

**Keywords:**

Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET), Industry Expectations, Career Guidance, Curriculum development

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<b>TVET :</b>	Technical Vocational Education and Training
<b>DHET:</b>	Department of Higher Education and Training
<b>UoTs:</b>	Universities of technology
<b>CATE:</b>	Colleges of Advanced Technical Education
<b>NDP:</b>	National Development Plan
<b>NEPAD:</b>	New Partnership for Africa's Development
<b>UNESCO:</b>	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
<b>NATED:</b>	National Accredited Technical Education Diploma
<b>SSACI:</b>	Swiss-South African Cooperation Initiative
<b>OECD:</b>	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
<b>NQE:</b>	National Qualification Framework
<b>SETA:</b>	Sector Education and Training Authorities
<b>FET:</b>	Further Education and Training

## Table of Contents

DECLARATION.....	ii
DEDICATION .....	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....	iv
ABSTRACT .....	v
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	vi
CHAPTER 1 .....	1
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 The Research Problem and Purpose.....	4
1.3 Rationale .....	5
1.4 Aim and Objectives.....	6
1.4 The Research Question.....	6
1.4.1 The sub-questions are:.....	7
1.5 Definitions of Key Terms, Concepts and Variables.....	7
CHAPTER 2 .....	9
2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW .....	9
2.1. INTRODUCTION .....	9
2.2 Overview and history of TVET colleges in SA.....	9
2.3 Theoretical framework .....	11
2.4 The industry expectations from TVET graduates.....	14
2.4.1 The concept of Vocational Education .....	16
2.4.2 Graduate employability and skills.....	17
2.4.3 The Skill .....	18
2.5 The role of TVET in the context of human development.....	19
2.5.1 Enhancement brought by ICT training for TVET job market relevance ....	21
2.6 Challenges to TVET internship in SA.....	23
2.5.1 Role of internship in skills development .....	23
2.5.2 Lack of work integrated learning Exposure .....	24
2.5.3 Role that SETAs play in placing students in the work place.....	25
2.5.4 Training and mentorship programmes for lecturers in partnership with employers.....	26
2.5.5.The importance of career guidance to students at TVET Colleges .....	26
2.6 TVET training recommendations for innovative learning and employment .....	28
2.6.1 The TVET Curriculum.....	30
2.6.2 Enhancement of Lecturers' Industry Knowledge and Skills.....	32



2.6.3	The need for wide synergies in TVET graduate skills development .....	34
2.7	Chapter summary .....	36
CHAPTER 3	.....	37
3.0	RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY .....	37
3.1	Introduction .....	37
3.2	Research design.....	37
3.3	Population of the Study.....	38
3.4	SAMPLING AND SAMPLING PROCEDURES .....	40
3.4.1	Sampling .....	40
3.4.2	Sampling procedure .....	41
3.5	Data Collection instruments .....	42
3.5.1	Semi-structured interviews .....	42
3.5.2	Focus group interviews .....	43
3.6	Criteria of Trustworthiness.....	44
3.6.1	Credibility .....	44
3.6.2	Validity.....	45
3.6.2	Transferability.....	45
3.6.4	Conformability .....	45
3.6.5	Dependability .....	45
3.7	DATA ANALYSIS.....	46
3.8	Ethical Considerations .....	47
3.8.2	Permission .....	47
3.8.3	Consent letter.....	47
3.8.4	Harm and risk.....	48
3.8.5	Voluntary participation.....	48
3.8.6	Honesty and trust.....	48
3.9	Chapter Summary.....	48
CHAPTER 4	.....	50
4.0	DATA PRESENTATION AND INTERPRETATION .....	50
4.1	Introduction.....	50
4.2	Data presentation and analysis.....	50
4.2.1	Thematic analysis method.....	50
4.2.2	The classification of South African qualifications and position of TVET qualification .....	51
4.3	Industry expectations from TVET graduates.....	52

Question 1. What are the industry expectations from TVET graduates?.....	53
Discussion .....	57
4.5 The challenges experienced by students regarding TVET internship and entry into the industry .....	58
Discussion .....	61
4.6 Research question 3: Recommendations for TVETs training and preparations of students for job entry into the South African workplaces .....	62
Discussion .....	67
4.7 Chapter Summary.....	68
CHAPTER 5 .....	70
5.0 SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....	70
5.1 Summary .....	70
5.2 Conclusions .....	73
5.2.1 Conclusion 1 .....	73
5.2.2 Conclusion 2 .....	74
5.2.3 Conclusion 3 .....	75
5.3 Recommendations.....	75
5.3.1 Recommendation 1 .....	75
5.3.2 Recommendation 2 .....	76
5.3.3 Recommendation 3 .....	77
5.4 Focus for further study.....	78
5.5. Conclusion.....	79
References.....	80

## LIST OF TABLES

3.1 Sample Composition

4.1 SA Qualifications and Weighting

## CHAPTER 1

### 1.1 Introduction

The (TVET) Technical Vocational Education and Training colleges provide a broad range of careers in different disciplines from office administration, tourism, and hospitality to primary agriculture, primary health, transport and logistics, information technology and computer sciences. They also provide different courses in the engineering fields such as electrical, motor mechanics, industrial and mechanical engineering. These are amongst many scarce jobs requiring specific skills that are not at the university level. Many of them are ideal for people with practical skills or good with people but not academically gifted. In South Africa, many vocational programmes exist, such as five occupational qualification types N or Nated programmes, NCV programmes, higher certificates and NSC with technical subjects, and leadership and shorter development programmes Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET, 2013).

Technical Colleges of South Africa in the 1920s shaped the foundation of universities of technology (UoTs). Colleges evolved into Colleges of Advanced Technical Education (CATE) in the 1970s, which then grew into Technikons in the 1980s (Pittendrigh, 1988) and then later into UoTs ten years ago. The Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) sector is an important institution for the economy because of the high demand for artisans and technicians on the ground than university graduates. The strategic outlook for the National Development Plan (NDP) in 2030 is to produce 30 000 artisans by the year 2030, providing lifelong learning to complement post-school education and building the capacity of the TVET colleges to become preferred institutions for Vocational and Training. Education and skills are pressing problems. South Africa needs to take urgent action to combat unemployment (Ho and Keese, 2018). South Africa has one of the highest youth unemployment rates in the world (at 55.9%) and a decreasing labour absorption rate which has fallen from 45.8% in 2001 to 43.3% in 2017, and currently, 55% of the population (30.4-million people live below the poverty line (Ho and Keese, 2018).

The TVET system was mainly created for the purpose of economic productivity and with the idea to focus on skills development by preparing those who have completed their studies more directly to meet labour force necessities in employment (Tickly, 2013). The theoretical subjects introduced and implemented over the years do not include practical work or skills required in the industry, and industries have difficulty absorbing graduates who do not have sufficient practical work. Combining the skill and content of the subjects can help in terms of making students ready for the job market. This could eliminate the number of graduates with a qualification but do not have the required job skills. Vocational training is a critical piece of the skills puzzle as it can help to deliver key skills required by the labour market (PMG, 2016).

TVET comprises education, training and skills development relating to a wide range of occupational fields, production services and livelihoods. It empowers individuals, organisations, and enterprises communities. It fosters employment, and lifelong learning with decent work, thereby promoting sustainability of inclusive economic growth and competitiveness, environmental sustainability, and social equity (UNESCO, 2017). With TVET and skills being at the centre stage of the global and continental development agenda, it becomes necessary to transform, expand and enhance TVET training and support in the national, regional and environmental context of the communities and societies they serve (Bedürftig, Hieronimus and Klier, 2015).

South Africa, like other emerging economies, struggles with high unemployment, inequality and slow economic growth. This is characterised by a disconnect between unfulfilled job vacancies, especially at the semi-skilled and skilled levels and a substantial proportion of young people between the ages of 18 -24 who are not in any form of employment, education or training (Reddy et al., 2016; Perold et al., 2012).

The latest TVET qualifications are defined by learning outcomes used to reform and expand training. Educational provision, subtilizing ways that could elevate skills levels, better productivity of market labour and contribute to the development of skills sustainably (DHET, 2013: 12). However, the fragmented nature of TVET delivery in South Africa has led to the multiplicity of qualifications and professional certificates, many of which are of dubious quality, which in turn undermines the image of TVET Colleges (NEPAD, 2016).

The implementation of systematic quality assurance processes is paramount in any TVET qualifications system. Quality assurance of the assessment and qualification processes should ensure that the assessment meets the required occupational standards, raising the likelihood that a qualification is a valid and reliable testament to a learner's knowledge, skills, and broader competencies (Kraak et al.;2013). Teachers and trainers in TVETs should guide the learners in their transition from education to the world of work. Therefore, the quality of teaching directly impacts the learners' success in acquiring the necessary skills to meet labour market needs. TVET systems can only be sustained if financial resources are mobilized (NEPAD, 2016). If a young workforce can be offered a good education as well as productive jobs, both the people and the state will have a prosperous future. Therefore, it makes a lot of sense to investigate how TVET students are trained and supported for South African industries to create better future prospects for the youth.

Other concerns were on curriculum relevance as students in some programmes graduated with qualifications that were not accepted in the industry. Participation in higher education is essential for SA as it seeks to tackle its skills challenges. However, participation is not sufficient; discussions need to include how to ensure higher education is of high quality and delivers the right skills to drive growth. Based on the White Paper (DHET, 2013) recommendations that colleges engage more with experts from the industry for training, some TVET colleges were identified as resourceful enough to become nodes of training collaboration between industry experts and other TVET colleges.

The Report 191 (NATED) programmes have been created in TVET colleges; however, many of our graduates have been without jobs or learnerships after semesters of schooling. The existing Curriculum has added to a number of qualified graduates being without any employment over the years, especially in Business Studies, e.g. Marketing, Business Management, and Management assistant, to name a few (HRDC, 2014). This study aims to explore how the TVET students are trained and prepared for job entry in the South African industries in order to be able to decrease the number

of unemployed graduates in this country. Therefore, SA needs to bring vocational training into the spotlight as part of the higher education debate.

## **1.2 The Research Problem and Purpose**

South Africa is still struggling to develop a system of education that is skills-oriented. The TVET sector is still producing programs that are not skills-oriented, adding to the enormous number of unskilled graduates, as argued by (McConnell, 2009). There are many skills gaps in critical areas of the economy, and the TVET sector was developed or created to address these gaps by producing highly skilled graduates (Du Toit, 2003). The growing problem of youth unemployment and underemployment is one of the main socio-economic development concerns of the South African government. Without job-related skills, youth and adults cannot benefit from the employment opportunities that offer a decent income. Evidence from previous labour-market crises suggests that a rocky start for young job seekers puts them at a higher risk of unemployment and lower wage expectations for the rest of their lives (McConnell, 2009).

In many countries, one of the key elements of development strategies is to support young people to acquire professional skills through Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) programmes (McConnell, 2009). Some TVET Colleges operating in this country are based in rural areas, which are poverty and disease-stricken, and can only improve their lives and that of their families by enrolling themselves in the TVET Colleges. Van Wyk (2009) notes that rural areas are different from urban areas concerning infrastructure and industries. Therefore, the courses offered at rural Colleges should be geared toward the needs of the rural community they serve. With this in mind, it is important for the policy makers to remember that it is essential to secure and uphold sustainable development in our rural TVET colleges.

Workplace learning should be included in an initial professional qualification as required by the policy for TVET training (Van der Bijl and Taylor, 2016). A requirement that students complete workplace training (internship) regarding industry-based learning element as an addition; thus, this approach also assists with promoting entrepreneurship in industries (McConnell, 2009). It is stipulated by the TVET

professional qualification policy that the requirement for industry-related workplace learning it's unclear on how it is to be completed. One might ask how this can be a reality while the country is still producing graduates that are not skilled and ready for the job market.

The economy of South Africa is in great need of highly skilled graduates. Therefore, the TVETs will not only be helping to improve the current employment crisis and improve the working industry while empowering our youth in the process. Cooperation between industry and TVET may enable TVET students to be trained and developed in the relevant curriculum content. Many firms are uncertain of the current purpose of TVET colleges and their relevance to the value of skills produced by the TVET system (McGrath, 2015; Petersen, 2015). There are specific competencies or 'inputs' required for colleges to produce good outputs, including adequate facilities for practical training, quality teaching and relevant Curriculum and programmes. Good graduates possess both quality theory and practical training. Colleges can provide their students with practical training in-house or through opportunities for workplace-based exposure (Toner, 2011).

Amongst many intentions is to expose lecturers to professional development within the college system by providing industry-based workplace training. It became a purpose to research and develop a process in the service industry. There were ten (10) South African TVET colleges that participated in the Swiss-South African Cooperation Initiative (SSACI) between the years 2012 and 2013 which executed its Lecturer Workplace Exposure (LWE). "The overall goal was to enhance lecturer industry knowledge and skills and thereby improve the links between what is taught at college and the requirements of industry" (Van der Bijl and Taylor, 2016).

### **1.3 Rationale**

According to Maree (2010), the rationale refers to a statement in which a researcher states how she developed an interest in a specific topic and the researcher's belief that the study is worth conducting. The motivation to conduct this study is based on experience as a TVET lecturer who has trained TVET students but realised that they struggle to get job entry in the South African industries. This problem is also indicated by the media and research studies which state that South African TVETs have to



ensure higher education is of high quality and delivers the right skills to drive growth (Ho and Keese, 2018; Van der Bijl and Taylor, 2016).

In his doctoral thesis, Msukwini (2017) further empathises that employers stated that students are adequately prepared to enter the world of work after going through work readiness workshops. However, the TVET sector offers limited, if not no, support to college students to prepare them for industry absorption.

According to the Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET, 2013), one of the major problems in placing students in a different industry training is because of a historically growing and confusing mix of overlapping systems and qualifications. This makes it difficult for young adults to choose a clear path for example, there are multiple artisan routes and, therefore, several ways to become an electrician (OECD, 2014). The DHET (2013) prioritised establishing a sound artisan training system that could produce 30000 artisans per year by 2030.

#### **1.4 Aim and Objectives**

The study aims to identify how TVETs could train and prepare students for job entry in the South African workplace industries.

##### ***The study's objectives are:***

- To identify the “employer’s expectations regarding the TVET graduates.
- To determine the challenges experienced by TVET students concerning industry internships.
- To determine the recommendations for TVETs in training and preparations of students for job entry into the South African workplaces.

#### **1.4 The Research Question**

How could TVET students be trained and prepared for entry into the South African workplace?

#### **1.4.1 The sub-questions are:**

- What are the industry expectations with regard to TVET graduates?
- What are the challenges experienced by students with regard to TVET training and entry into the industry?
- What are the recommendations for TVETs in training and preparations of students for job entry into the South African workplaces?

#### **1.5 Definitions of Key Terms, Concepts and Variables**

**(TVET)** Technical and Vocational Education and Training comprises education, training and skills development relating to a wide range of occupational fields, production services and livelihoods.

**SAQA** - SAQA develops and implements policy and criteria after consultation with the QCs for the development, registration and publication of qualifications and part-qualifications, which must include the following requirements:

- The relevant sub-framework, a distinct nomenclature for its qualification types which is appropriate to the relevant sub-framework and consistent with international practice;
- Registration of qualification or part-qualification recommended by a QC if it meets the relevant criteria and;
- Policy and criteria development, after consultation with the QCs, for assessment, recognition of prior learning and credit accumulation and transfer

**NQF** - The NQF is a comprehensive system approved by the Minister of Higher Education and Training for the classification, registration and publication of articulated and quality-assured national qualifications and part-qualifications. The South African NQF is a single integrated system comprising three co-ordinated qualifications Sub-Frameworks for General and Further Education and Training, Higher Education and Trades and Occupations.

**NEPAD** - The New Partnership for 'Africa's Development (**NEPAD**) is an economic development program of the African Union. **NEPAD** was adopted at the 37th session of the Assembly of Heads of State and Government in July 2001 in Lusaka, Zambia.

**Parliamentary Monitoring Group (PMG)** - The Parliamentary Monitoring Group, an information service, was established in 1995 as a partnership between Black Sash, Human

Rights Committee and Idasa with the aim of providing a type of Hansard for the proceedings of the more than fifty South African Parliamentary Committees for these three advocacy organisations. This was because there is no official record publicly available of the committee proceedings - the engine room of Parliament - and this type of information is needed by social justice organisations to lobby the Parliament of South Africa on pieces of legislation, matters of democratic processes and parliamentary oversight of the executive.

**Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD)** - OECD uses its wealth of information on a broad range of topics to help governments foster prosperity and fight poverty through economic growth and financial stability. We help ensure the environmental implications of economic and social development are taken into account OECD's work is based on continued monitoring of events in member countries as well as outside OECD areas and includes regular projections of short and medium-term economic developments. The OECD Secretariat collects and analyses data, after which committees discuss policy regarding this information, the Council makes decisions, and then governments implement recommendations

## **CHAPTER 2**

### **2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW**

#### **2.1. INTRODUCTION**

The previous chapter presented the background of the study, the research objectives, research questions and the problem statement. The first chapter also outlined the scope of the study and its limitations. This current chapter presents the literature review that focuses on the TVET colleges as a concept and as a system for manpower development. The chapter presents literature related to the expectations of employers' skills requirements and the TVET curriculum. It also discusses literature related to the challenges of student internship and placement after completion of their studies. The study values this section of the literature review because it provides a foundation of knowledge on this topic of TVET graduates and the employer expectations. It also assists in identifying areas of prior scholarship to prevent duplication and give credit to other researchers. The same literature review shall allow this research to identify inconsistencies and gaps in the topic under research, conflicts in previous studies, and open questions left from other research. Lastly, the literature review shall place this study within the context of existing literature, making a case for why further study is needed.

#### **2.2 Overview and history of TVET colleges in SA**

The definition of Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) has eluded many authors such that there is no one unitary definition for the concept (Powell, 2014; Maclean & Lai, 2011). This is mainly because TVET as a concept has been applied to a range of delivery methods, targeting different age groups. It also has been operating formally and informally since it can be provided by public, private or non-governmental organisations (Powell, 2014). Technical and vocational education, as a system, has been evolving over the years worldwide. Various terms, such as “apprenticeship training, vocational education and training (VET), career and technical education (CTE), and workforce education have been used for this type of education” (UNESCO, 2012).

The industrial development that happened in the late 1800s increased the demand for technical education to be made available to the youth. The demand was spurred by the evolving mining industry and the development of railways, harbours and small engineering workshops in urban centres (Gamble, 2003). “Historians note that technical education referred to ‘a type of education which had reference to manufacturing and industrial pursuits and the scientific principles underlying these’” (Smuts, 1937:97).

According to Gamble (2003:11),

“a historical development perspective shows that, from its earliest beginnings, technical and vocational education has included three forms of educational provision”. Firstly, technical education referred to science instruction as found in general education, where it functioned as a foundation for practical knowledge. Secondly, vocational education refers to forms of compensatory education with a practical disposition. Finally, industrial education focused on imparting skills in some form of handicraft, as well as the inculcation of discipline, obedience, and regular work habits.

Although these forms of provision served their purpose within particular historical eras, the current demands of a dynamic and complex work environment necessitate a re-evaluation of the purpose and mechanisms of vocational education, as well as of the policies that support this educational environment in light of the demand for ready-made employees coming out of the training grounds as in TVET, in South Africa.

The purpose and mission of South African TVET colleges are to respond to the human resource needs of the country for personal, social, civic and economic development. A transformed, high quality, responsive TVET system is a very important investment in the future of South Africa and all its people, according to the White Paper 4 of the Department of Education (1998a). The paper opines that a successful TVET system has to provide diversified programme offerings that promote the knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values required by South African individuals and citizens, as lifelong learners and as economically productive members of society. “Such a system could provide the vital intermediate to higher-level skills and competencies the country needs to chart its own course in the globally competitive world of the 21st century” (DoE, 1998a; RSA, 2016: iii).

The South African Department of Education (2001) reported that the rationale for restructuring the institutional landscape in the TVET college sector (then still called the FET college sector) was informed by the National Human Resource Development Strategy (HRD), labour market needs as identified in the Provincial Skills Plan 2001 of the Department of Labour (DoL), the FET Act 98 of 1998, and educational needs as identified in the Situational Analysis Report for Colleges in the nine provinces (National Business Initiative, 2000).

In a UNESCO report (2015), it has been highlighted that education is key to effective development strategies. According to the report, “technical and vocational education and training (TVET) must be a master key that can alleviate poverty, promote peace and conserve the environment”. This includes improving the quality of life and assisting in achieving sustainable development (Marope, Chakroun, & Holmes, 2015). Barnes (2004), furthermore states that FET colleges were tasked with the role of assisting the alleviation and eradication of poverty, to create employment for the unemployed and to assist in economic stimulation. Powell (2012) further argues that education and training hold the key to economic competitiveness and the answer to addressing social inequalities and increasing the levels of unemployment, particularly youth unemployment. Powell (ibid) goes on to say that TVET colleges have contributed to economic development by providing skills required to compete in challenging and evolving global markets and national economic contexts.

### **2.3 Theoretical framework**

The focus on human capital as a driver of economic growth for developing countries has led to undue attention on Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET). The study adopted human capital theory as a theoretical lens through which the study is embedded. Human capital theory (Becker, 1993) assumes the positive relationship between education and training, and “workers’ productivity and lifetime income has been considered one of the main theories that support’ education’s economic thought. The human capital theory has influenced and shaped education and training systems across the globe. Especially, the human capital theory has been

proved proven in its impact on education and return of investment in under-developing countries and East-Asian countries that experienced rapid economic growth. Consequently, the South African context's vocational education and training programmes encourage or are rather inspired by the human capital approach to human progress and development. Through this theory, investment in the education of individuals is regarded as the solution to all the structural problems of the economy and the labour market (Baptiste, 2001).

Furthermore, the proponents of human capital theory argue that this concept of human capital originally refers to knowledge, attitudes and skills primarily developed and valued for productivity in the economy (Baptiste, 2001). He further explains this notion that education is the most important single determinant of economic growth, which was initially advanced through the work of the human capital theorists Gary Becker and Theodor Schultz in the 1960s and 1970s (Baptiste, 2001). Again, Becker and Schultz believed that well-educated persons are more productive and are likely to get well-paying jobs (Baptiste, 2001). In this instance, the researcher's use of human capital theory has been selected as the theoretical framework because the current vocational education and training and its application in South Africa advance the failed approach to human development.

In recent decades, the defining characteristic of economic debates is the importance to which neo-classical economics have attached human capital as a determining factor of economic success and competitive advantage (Brown, Green & Lauder, 2000). They further explain that it is a naïve argument that education is the most important and only single determinant of economic growth, which was initially advanced through the work of the human capital theorists Gary Becker and Theodor Schultz in the 1960s and early 1970s (Brown et al., 2000). Again, these theorists have reduced human behaviour to calculation rationality, wherein human beings are seen as purposeful and goal-oriented individuals who will, with no option, invest in education to maximise their employment status (Brown et al. 2000). As a consequence, Brown (1999) argues that human capital theory, which brought about new economies that needed highly skilled and qualified personnel, has thus proven to be a failure in relation to human development. Accordingly, Motala and Treat (2014) also support this critique, as they argue very strongly that the assumption that markets satisfy the pre-existing desires of consumers completely ignores the obvious ways in which markets manufacture

needs and desires as opposed to merely responding to them. For Motala and Treat, this proposition has since been severely criticised in a growing body of research, and the limitations of human capital theory have become even more obvious because of the global economic crises. The growing critique of this narrowly conceived notion of education in relation to social human development has been exposed for what it is, not only with an advanced and well-grounded argument against it and its failures but decry human beings being regarded on the same plane as machines or technological advancements.

Human capital theorists construe social inequalities not as injustice or the results of exploitation and oppression but rather as the natural and inevitable outcomes of a competitive, free market (Baptiste, 2001). To them, free markets are the most legitimate social institutions; that is, they are the only institutions that can adequately and justly govern, regulate and explain human behaviours and achievements and the definition of human capital as knowledge, attitude and skills that are developed and valued primarily for economically productive potential (Baptiste, 2001). For human capital theory, investment in education accounts for economic growth; the rationale here is for education to be regarded as an investment in human beings, no different from investment in land or machines, as they all represent an enhancement of an economy (Ashton, Brown & Lauder, 2012). Thus, this human capital theory model advances the following:

- Education should be regarded as a private good that is a tradable commodity in the market place for money and status.
- Private return on human capital investment (education) provides an incentive to progress to further education.
- Further education should be oriented towards the labour market (supply and demand).
- More education can be translated into higher productivity, which results in higher earnings.

In this instance, Motala and Vally (2014) point out that despite a body of knowledge critiquing human capital theory, it remains central to skills formation policies in most countries. In this regard, the researcher argues for a need for alternatives instead of a



continuous and uncritical adoption of human capital theory prescripts in our education for development. There has to be this new alternative to education given the wide-ranging critique of human capital theory, including its one-dimensional view of human beings; narrow understanding of skills and labour; its exacerbation of social inequalities; the development of 'underdevelopment'; blaming of the victims; and the privatisation of social problems (Baptiste 2001)

#### **2.4 The industry expectations from TVET graduates**

Skills development works as an imperative within an institution (Mopeli, 2014). In addition, it is a significant management tool that is used to improve the full effectiveness of the organisation's most important resource. Nevertheless, for skills development to be fully efficient, (the) results must be measured in alignment with the firm's skills development and training requirements.

Organisation for Economic Corporation and Development (OECD) argues that both employers and graduates are ill-prepared for world work, and it further states that TVET can prepare young people for the skills needed to access world work, including entrepreneurship. The main objective of TVET education is to deal with growing youth unemployment and promote a broader career management competency in order to acknowledge that achieving decent work is essential (Brewer & Comyn, 2015: 14)

Mopeli (2014) stated that skills development is a crucial element in ensuring that employees perform their tasks to the level that the job requires. As such, skills development echoes individual training or instruction in the workplace. According to Maimela (2006), the drive for skills development in South Africa is a crucial priority.

The TVET colleges are supposed to prepare learners for the world of work and could be manifested in different ways:

1. in programmes for youth yet to enter the labour market, aimed at both formal and informal sector employment and self-employment;
2. in courses targeted at employed workers seeking new or improved skills in response to technological changes;
3. or in retraining programmes for those who have become unemployed.

Such programmes require the development of relevant skills and knowledge for the current, and potential future the shape of the economy. McGrath (2005:139) suggests

that “some TVET curricula are outdated, while some infrastructure is even older and more worn-out”. The TVET provision is costly, yet many graduates do not get formal employment. The range of programmes often appears to have little to do with existing and potential labour market opportunities (McGrath, 2005).

The significance of the TVET band lies in the coherence of its four subsystems and its external linkages to higher learning and work.

TVET systems worldwide are fundamentally shaped and judged by the effectiveness of their articulation with the world of work and the extent to which they grant meaningful access to further and higher education. In South Africa, the current TVET system has probably failed on both counts (Badroodien & Kraak, 2006: 20).

There is a powerful sense of failure within the system with regard to the quality and relevance of TVET programmes, resulting in inadequate preparation for higher levels of education. “The TVET sector has also failed to link many young learners to real employment prospects in the world of work and to provide a meaningful learning pathway for employed adult workers to return to formal study so as to improve their overall skills and competencies” (Badroodien & Kraak, 2006: 20).

Stark and Lattuca (1997: 28) point out that “in the vocational realm, student demands for specific career majors tend to reflect society’s demand more quickly than the colleges’ response”. Colleges thus frequently seem to lag behind in changing curricula to meet student interests. Middleton *et al.* (1991) also assert that public training institutions face pressures to increase their flexibility in responding to economic change and uncertainty to develop the skills needed to facilitate change and growth. Vocational and technical education and training are supposed to change as economies change. Still, Badroodien and Kraak (2006:49) label FET college provision as “too narrow, offering in many instances, obsolete specialisations with little underpinning general education”. Badroodien and Kraak (2006:181) also cite that curriculum development for vocational education is a national competency, allowing minimal room for institutional innovation and curriculum customisation.

Middleton *et al.* (1991) maintain that centrally determined and rigidly administered curricula prevent institutions from responding to locally identified training needs and reducing training length to lower costs. “Responsiveness and efficiency have been hampered by rigid planning and management, weak linkages to employers,

inappropriate objectives, and inadequate financing” (Middleton et al., 1991:50). When training institutions develop specialised expertise for institutional links with different skills markets, responsiveness improves. If skills are not developed, productivity will not increase, and the benefits to society and individuals will not materialise.

TVET has excellent potential to generate growth by empowering and enhancing the capacities of individuals to be employed. Professional instructors with good technical and pedagogical skills are central to quality, while adequate maintenance of facilities and equipment is essential for good training (Middleton et al., 1991; Ziderman, 1997; Descy & Tessaring, 2001; Papier, 2010; RSA, 2013a). In agreement, Siriwardene and Qureshi (2009) add that positioning TVET to the needs of the world of work is essential for economic, social and sustainable development.

#### **2.4.1 The concept of Vocational Education**

Clarke and Winch (2007:10) suggest that “in the Anglo-Saxon world, vocational education is confined to preparing young people and adults for working life, a process often regarded as of a rather technical and practical nature”. This type of vocational education embraces both elements of civic and academic education. In contrast, the Dutch vocational education and training (VET) system, as described by Westerhuis (2007), is all about civic education and is seen as a means for productive labour (workers and trades people) to become productive citizens. Hence, vocational education in the Netherlands is not about practical training alone but about personal development and rising above the narrow confines of a trade. Vocational education, thus, seems to be both a complex and varied concept.

According to Biernacki (1995), there has long been an opposed and no less vigorous tradition that sees vocational education as concerned with personal emancipation as much as economic development. In this sense, vocational education is more closely associated with the German ‘Arbeitskraft’, or labour-power (Kumar, 2014). In most Anglo-Saxon countries, however, vocational education is considered training for particular jobs to serve the needs of current employers. Moodie (2008) is in agreement with this view when defining vocational education as the development and application of knowledge and skills for middle-level occupations needed by the industry from time to time. “Vocational education is, thus, closely engaged with industry and the economy

and changes as industries change, whilst higher education is engaged more closely with academic disciplines and changes as the disciplines change” (Moodie, 2008:172).

Descy and Tessaring (2000: 21) states that “vocational education and training refers to all organised forms of initial and continuing or further vocational education and training, independent of location, age of participants, or their level of qualification”. Hence, the purpose of TVET is to prepare for a certain occupation or certain employment and could also include an element of general education, for example, the development of basic skills. Vocational Education and Training (VET) is a broad field that includes initial vocational training, continuing vocational training, and work-based learning (Descy & Tessaring, 2000). Ellström (1999) also adds the view that VET is often characterised as a complex social system because it is located on the edge of two basic human activities; that of learning and working.

Clark and Winch (2007:6) suggest that “the aim of VET is to improve the productive capacity of society on the assumption that the greater the effort and investment put into this, the more productive the labour”. For the individual, VET is about preparing for working life and entering into and progressing in the labour market. On the other hand, the employer has more immediate concerns regarding vocational education as a means of skilling labour to meet the immediate needs of the particular firm. These are conflicting interests, and, as a result, the VET system represents a compromise, reflecting the power attached to each of these different interests. Furthermore, Clarke and Winch (2007:63) describe vocational education and training as the social development of labour, nurturing, advancing and re-producing particular qualities of labour to improve the productive capacity of society.

#### **2.4.2 Graduate employability and skills**

The term ‘employability’ refers to a category of skills that are demanded from an individual to effectively participate in the current world. Employability has its bearing on both those engaged with any kind of job who need improvement in their jobs. According to Rees, Forbes and Keble (2006), these skills and other related attributes that enrich a person’s employability are, in most cases, those which form the foundation of learning and application of the subject area. They went further to remark

that these skills – the ability to analyse data, solve multifaceted problems, and communicate outcomes effectively, are frequently applied in both academic and employment processes. Harvey (2003) notes that employability is beyond getting a job, developing the attributes or experience just to enable a student to secure a job or progress within the current career. Employability, according to Harvey, is all about learning, and the emphasis is less on ‘employ’ and more on ‘ability’. The implication is that more focus should be laid on developing critical, reflective abilities, with the understanding of endowing and enriching the student (Harvey, 2003).

### **2.4.3 The Skill**

The ability of an individual to perform an intellectual or physical task is referred to as skills (Ivancevich, Konopaske & Matteson as cited in Kreiner et al., 2009). This is a terminology used to refer to specific components of competencies, which include knowledge, values, attitudes, and motivations, among others (Allen & van der Velden as cited in Kreiner et al., 2009).

The words employability and skills play a major role in ensuring that students are properly inducted or trained to work, and, in most situations, employers look at different values and attributes that students possess. York (2004:410) describes employability as “a set of achievements, skills, understanding and personal attributes, that make graduates more probably to acquire employment and be successful in their occupation, which benefits themselves, workforce, the neighbourhood and the economy”. The purpose of work-integrated learning (WIL) is to improve employability and develop competence, i.e., the ability to apply knowledge and skills to the demands of the workplace.

In her review, Catherine Curtin (2018) states that the South African labour market is hostile to younger graduates, partially because of the scarcity of work opportunities. Skills shortages in South Africa have become one of the biggest problems for the country's economy and resulting in a high youth unemployment rate. SETA (2005: 42) points out that “scarce competencies in the parlance of Department of Sectoral Education, Training and authorities refer to as occupation in which there is a shortage of certified and skilled humans reachable, this shortage can arise either due to an absolute shortage of these competencies or a relative scarcity”.

The use of skills shortages as an explanation for unemployment and slow financial increase in South Africa and as a critique of the unresponsive post-school institution (Wedekind, 2014) is pervasive to the extent that major authorities' policy documents and initiatives make addressing acute competencies shortages a core intention of training policy (DHET, 2013:12). As Wedekind (2016: 2) points out, employers refer to a lack of employability related in massive measure to, poor basic education. In the past, TVET colleges have been regarded to be of inferior education, given the background of how the colleges have come about. It is further suggested that the origins of shortfalls in employability among many TVET job seekers appear in employers' minds, who associate these graduates with shortcomings in their school education (Wedekind, 2016: 10).

As Jones & Killick (2013) points out, industries expect graduates to possess high levels of skills. Magnus, Prinsloo, Bird and Singh (2013) further suggest that graduates should be flexible and adaptive; and show an excessive level of competence and a commitment to excellence. Similarly, Bester (2014) argues that it is well-known that TVET colleges seem to be assigned the obligation to develop students' employability. TVET colleges should mainly focus on the problems of ethics, global sustainability and fairness, and the aspect of intercultural sensitivity.

Easa, (2013) highlights that TVET colleges need to be cognisant of aligning their curricula with the expectations of the place of business in retaining the employability of their graduates. In turn, this method would allow academics to interact with the system of graduate attributes development in recognition of their responsibility to equip graduates with relevant abilities wanted for life-long getting to know in a swiftly converting industry.

Employability is understood as an individual's ability to gain initial employment, maintain employment, move between roles within the same organisation, obtain new employment if required and (ideally) secure suitable and sufficiently fulfilling work. (Hillage & Pollard, 1988: 2). Over time, 'employability' has been approached from different perspectives.

## **2.5 The role of TVET in the context of human development**

According to the human development approach, as operationalized in the human development index, education is one of the key indicators of human development

(Lowden, Hall, Elliot & Lewin, 2011). Human development is an approach that has shifted development measurements from gross domestic product or income to a focus on well-being or the ability to increase the chance of individuals to realise their potential as human beings. This can be achieved by giving them opportunities, such as education and health care, to enhance their ability to live the lives they have reason to value (Cremin & Nakabugo, 2012). From a human development perspective, TVET education should not only result in graduates being employed and earning an income, it should also be about adding to the quality of human life (McGrath and Powell, 2016). TVET should also help one to become a 'flourishing person' (Bonvin and Farvaque in McGrath and Powell, 2016:279). Thus, work should be seen in the line of its contribution to human development. In this view, TVET education should be seen to develop the person more than only the worker. Tikly (2013) is of the same opinion and argues that the aims of skills development should not only be economical but contribute to social, cultural and political development as well. Human development would view TVET as a means of enabling the development of capabilities, conceived as opportunities to develop what the CA terms 'functionings' that individuals, their communities and society at large have reason to value (Tikly, 2013). Nussbaum (2000: 78) adds that "education develops capabilities such as literacy and numeracy and the ability to apply acquired scientific knowledge". Thus, this research intends to contribute to human development knowledge by means of the research findings with the aim of expanding relevant concepts and, thus, developing a conceptual framework through which the role of TVET in women's empowerment can be viewed. This contribution may change current perceptions of TVET, the meaning of which has been minimised to that of an 'exclusive acquisition of relatively narrow band of employment-related job-specific skills and competencies' (Anderson, Brown & Rushbrook, 2008:234). This narrow perception of TVET, which most countries, organisations and theorists hold, calls for an engagement with learning outcomes that are broader than a purely economic one (Baatjes, Baduza & Sibiya, 2014).

Historically, TVET has been founded on the process of industrialisation and economic development, and, therefore, its policies have often been informed by economic and equity perspectives (UNESCO, 2012). However, McGrath (2012) argues that this approach to TVET is grounded in an outdated model of development. In fact, Pavlova (2013) and Psacharopoulos (1997) postulate that conceptualising TVET in terms of

human capital theory means that colleges have to focus on skills development for employability, which may be confusing. This is because the acquisition of some form of training may not necessarily guarantee a job, although it increases the chances. The belief in investing in human capital has been widespread in South Africa, and, therefore, the TVET sector has been expected to fill this gap through skills development. However, Vally and Motala (2014:40) postulate that if human capital theory continues to frame the TVET sector, it will lead to seeing the sector as pivotal in solving 'a problem that is not primarily an educational problem'. What needs to be emphasised instead is the role of TVET in 'deepening knowledge, developing capabilities (including hard and soft skills required to work) and strengthening (occupational and wider social) identities that enable learners to become both workers and citizens' (Wedekind, 2014:77). Abu Raihan (2014) further adds that there is a problem when an educational system uses academics with no or little understanding of industry prerequisites.

Vocational Education plays an important role in highlighting the need for high skills development and practical training of graduates from the TVET Colleges. The high demand for skilled graduates such as technicians and artisans has increased over the years, and education and skills have become more pressing problems in South Africa due to lack of employment. Therefore, education and training hold the key to economic competitiveness by effectively training and supporting TVET College students for South African industries (Mabeba, 2019) to address social inequalities and increase unemployment levels. This refers particularly to youth unemployment, but we first need to look at the TVET Colleges teaching methodologies and their impact on preparing students for the world of work.

### **2.5.1 Enhancement brought by ICT training for TVET job market relevance**

The rapid technological development causes a significant change in skill requirements. Furthermore, it speeds up new jobs being created, and the teaching and learning process becomes more dynamic and changes faster. Information and communication technologies (ICTs) are referred to as the varied collection of technological gear and resources that are used to communicate ICT as a technological power that has changed many aspects of our way of life (Khivilon & Patru, 2002). It needs to be fully integrated into all parts of TVET to avoid easy additions to learning programmes. The



use of ICTs as a tool to effectively improve the management of education, teaching and education encompasses the entire spectrum of education, from early childhood to primary, secondary, higher education, and basic and sustainable education (UNESCO, 2019: 50).

The formation of ICTs permits an increase in teaching and learning everywhere, but a lack of resources in some colleges can cause problems in delivering quality instructional learning programmes. The ICT framework for TVET is being strengthened to help improve the quality of education through sophisticated teaching methods, improve learning outcomes, and enable better education system reform or governance (UNESCO, 2019). “It enables higher education providers to tailor ‘students’ specific needs in terms of speed, place and time of study and to serve different audiences and new and local niche markets, both locally and globally” (Tripular, 2012: 40).

The TVET college is expected to prepare its graduates to offer products and services not only in modern import technology but also for local needs. TVET colleges can rise to the challenge of educating and empowering young people to become more familiar with their own values in terms of work that is associated with increased work capacity. Some college programmes already have curriculum components that address such topics, a programme like NCV, whilst NATED does not have. This creates an opportunity to contribute to curriculum development (Sarkar, 2012).

The educational institution needs to have skills that enable students to be successful in the world of work and the use of appropriate and safe technology. The component of ICT should ideally be taught in all courses that promote Technology and work, especially when students have online access to the material. Furthermore, the TVET colleges need to be responsive to this change (Zurina & Hussein, 2014). Students indicated that TVETs and functional ICTs development of social capital and careers are more successful in providing job creation, employability and sustainable economic growth. Researchers believe that all the above skills must be taught in the TVET program to ensure students are ready to work. “Introduction of ICTs in the TVET classroom has always aimed at improving the reaching and quality of teaching by identifying which of the different types of technologies are available and ready to use teaching and learning” (Sakar, 2013:2)

## **2.6 Challenges to TVET internship in SA**

Industrial training is an avenue to equip students for the workforce as “work-ready” graduates. It is a place where theories acquired in educational/ training institutions are being put to practice in the industrial setting, and technical and employability skills are developed in the process as well. Industrial training gives students ample opportunity to deal with real-life situations as it exposes them to challenges in the real world of industry. It equips students with practical and work experience in their chosen careers.

### **2.5.1 Role of internship in skills development**

Skills development is a process of empowering graduates with skills to prepare them for the work environment. “Skills development can also be explained as the process of developing a graduate or intern so that they can be able to execute tasks assigned to them in the work environment, through training and mentorship programme” (Hirschsohn, 2008:82). Practical skills development is the core activity of any given profession (public administration, education, health) and for that profession's survival, growth, and sustainability. However, institutions face the criticism that their graduates go to workplaces unable to perform (Okello-Obura & Kigongo-Bukenya, 2011). It is on the basis of this understanding; that graduates must be granted an opportunity to go through internships as part of a skills development programme to capacitate and prepare them for future work environments.

Skills development programme positively impacts the intern and the institution, industries, economy, and the neighbouring countries in the long run. Lack of skills can negatively impact the economy in terms of production, service delivery, and innovation (Abrahams, 2018).

According to Griesel & Parker (2009), graduate internship programmes are optional as one of the job training opportunities. Interns do not get a salary but receive a stipend paid by the Sector Education and Training Authorities (SETA). Unlike student interns who are placed, graduate interns have to apply for the advertised internship opportunities and go through the normal recruitment and selection processes such as interviews (Gryn, 2010). The intention is to afford them opportunities to transform the theoretical knowledge gained from the institutions of higher learning into practical experience acquired in the dynamic world of work (Harms & Crede, 2010). In both types of internships, interns sign a contract and operate on a structured competency development programme (Harms & Credé, 2010). They are assigned mentors to

supervise their work, assess their competency levels and work performance, and provide periodic evidence of their progress (Department of Labour, 2005).

The purpose of an internship is to address the lack of practical work experience and exposure to the realities of the world of work as well as reduce youth unemployment, although on a temporal basis (DHET, 2012). Internship or placement programs allow students the chance to combine theory and practice in a subject, apply theoretical concepts to a work environment, and induce new knowledge from practical activities (Garcia, 2008). During the internship, interns are given administrative activities such as preparing formal reports (Chambers, 2015).

### **2.5.2 Lack of work-integrated learning Exposure**

The intent of workplace exposure is to educate and measure the student's competency in the completion of tasks allocated. Students are enrolling in different institutions of higher learning with the purpose of acquiring an academic qualification and hoping to find employment. In support of this, Wheeler (2015) is of the view that work-integrated learning is a process mainly implemented in higher education to give students exposure to the working environment and, therefore, enhance their employability. According to Moletsane and Moloji (2015: 26), they elaborate that “the youth of today is independent with the complex world which emphasises on the preparation of men and women for assertive competency through cooperative with work-integrated education”.

Forbes (2012) also highlights the philosophy and principles of work-integrated learning (WIL) in educational partnerships between an educational institution and external stakeholders in the industry. However, Blom (2013) argues that even though improving the working skills of young people is a priority, comprehensive training is primarily for learning, not for work. Scarcity of skills has become the most prominent problem facing the youth of South Africa; this shortage of skills can occur due to either relative or absolute scarcity. Absolute scarcity refers to suitably qualified people who are not available in a new profession or who have just emerged and whilst relative scarcity refers to appropriately skilled individual who exists but does not meet the other job criteria (SETA, 2017: 29).

The skills employers are looking for are primarily linked with the services they offer. They particularly consider a specific candidate who not only is good at

their job but also possesses certain personality traits and essential qualities that will distinguish you from other candidates. They are categorised as follows: self-management skills, transferrable skills and technical skills; these types of competencies relate to our work, personalities and they form a great deal of abilities and knowledge in a specific industry or occupation (SETA, 2017: 29)

It is essential for graduates to prepare themselves for the world of work by researching the labour market, opportunities available, and resources that can help in getting the job they desire.

### **2.5.3 Role that SETAs play in placing students in the work place**

Work-integrated learning (WIL) is an umbrella term for any purposefully designed learning programme that integrates theoretical knowledge with authentic practice in the workplace. The Sector Education and Training Authority (SETA) was established by section 9(1) of skills development act no 97 of (1998) (SETA, 2005). This took effect to prioritise crucial skills for growth with the main goal of stimulating quality training, promoting employability and sustainability development, assisting new entrants into labour markets, and improving quality and relevance of training and learning (Steyn, 2004). This serves as a link between industries and the education sector, and it also provides opportunities for development for scarce skills. At its inception, though, it was never made clear on the active role of SETA in the enhancement of graduates' placement in different workplaces.

Colleges have sought external assistance in responding to the high unemployment crisis of college graduates by increasing the collaboration of colleges and workplaces. These measures consist of developing and reinforcing institutional capacity to supply professional preparation and work placement and forming nearer relationships with employers with support from Sector Education and Training (SETA). Curtin (2018) further adds that little interest is given to preparing school students for their transition into the world of work. SETAs are seen as the central mechanism for mediating the relationship between training (supply-side) and financial and social necessities (demand side) and are central to interpreting the competencies requirements in the

context of economic demand. However, they do now not create demand (Harrison-Train, et al., 2008).

One of the capabilities of SETA is to increase learnership programmes. These learnership programmes are geared toward supporting new entrants into employment by means of imparting them competencies and enhancing their possibilities of locating or creating things (Smith et al., 2005:540). According to SETAs (2017), these learnership programmes are derived from apprenticeship in other nations (inclusive of United Kingdom, Australia and Germany), while in South Africa, they became known as learnership.

Over the years, SETAs have established a platform whereby the transfer of competencies, know-how, and practices is a prerequisite to the exploitation of possibility and the redress of threats to successful enterprise operations (Moloko, 2017). Partnerships between SETAs and TVET colleges have proven to be successful thus far; however, there are still many improvements to be made with regards to the proper placing of students in their respective fields.

#### **2.5.4 Training and mentorship programmes for lecturers in partnership with employers.**

Lecturers are central to the TVET college system as they are responsible for transferring skills to learners. Learners require practical teaching from employers in order for them to provide learners with programme specific lectures. This will ensure that employers receive the adequate skills they require from students. The following supporting actions can be taken to enhance the mentorship and partnership of this nature:

- Use of specialists in the industry as advisory members.
- Increase lecture capacity and skills.
- Align curriculum with industry needs.

#### **2.5.5. The importance of career guidance to students at TVET Colleges**

Career guidance, as a profession, has recently been seen as an important tool to keep graduates updated about new careers, new skills and attitudes that are constantly

evolving and changing. “Customarily, career guidance arrangement was based on talent- matching approaches such as measuring person capacities and coordinating them to the demands of distinctive occupation” (Grubb, 2002:11).

According to Watts and Fretwell (2004: 24), there are numerous challenges that coordinating ought to not only be concerned with individuals’ capacities and aptitudes but also with their needs and values. Watts and Fretwell further argue that career direction ought not to be seen as a skill to create decisions for individuals but maybe to assist individuals in making choices for themselves.

Different educational institutions regularly have formal provisions planned to assist students in their career-related choices. Provisions may incorporate career instruction programs that frame a portion of the core curriculum during the study and on exit from the institution. However, some countries incorporate work visits, exploratory work experience and nearby work shadowing. All of these programs tend to be more profoundly created in high-income countries (Watts & Sultana, 2007).

In South Africa, a career helpline has been created, which comprises a multi-channel career advancement benefit open to different platforms (including phone, content messages, e-mail, Twitter and Facebook). This helpline is connected to a career data and career assets site, media exercises (such as a national radio campaign), and linkages with teach giving career development administrations, such as community colleges (Flederman, 2011). Sultana and Watts (2007) point out that there is a broader role of guidance/school counsellor (or school psychologist), which covers not only the students’ social but also personal problems.

Similarly, Watts and Fretwell, (2004) established that there is consistent evidence that proves career direction tends to be marginalised in two regards. At first, career guiders tend to spend much of their time on the learning and behavioural issues of a minority of understudies, at the cost of the assistance required by all students in connection to their instructive and professional choices. Secondly, direction on such choices tends to focus on quick educational decisions instead of on occupational and longer-term career choices.

Tertiary education institutions pro-careers administrations are well-established in such nations as Australia, Ireland, the United Kingdom, the USA, and a few other developing nations. They may incorporate job-placement administrations within TVET

colleges. In extension to that, career guidance components may be included to get courses for those returning to formal instruction after a significant disparity, and in the process, for the evaluation and recognition of prior learning (Watts & Fretwell, 2004: 9). There is a vast need to plan career guidance related to the work objectives and ways to develop job searching abilities. This consists of recognising potential managers, planning CVs and planning for interviews (Getachew et al., 2016).

## **2.6 TVET training recommendations for innovative learning and employment**

The purpose and mission of South African TVET colleges are to respond to the human resource needs of the country for personal, social, civic and economic development. A transformed, high quality, responsive TVET system is a vitally important investment in future of South Africa and all its people (White Paper 4: Department of Education, 1998a). A successful TVET system has to provide diversified programme offerings that promote the knowledge, skills, attitudes and values required by South Africans as individuals and citizens, as lifelong learners and as economically productive members of society. Such a system could provide the important intermediate to higher-level skills and competencies the country needs to chart its own course in the globally competitive world of the 21st century (DoE, 1998a; RSA, 2016: iii). The new TVET system, as envisaged in White Paper 4 (Department of Education, 1998a), involves a new governance framework: a new framework for programmes and qualifications, a new quality improvement and assurance institution, and a new funding system, envisaged as a key lever for system change (also see RSA, 2016: iv). This governance framework is envisaged to drive the development of the new system and to ensure its responsiveness to the education and training needs of the people of South Africa. Since the publication of White Paper 4, TVET colleges have been moved from the further education and training (FET) sector to the higher education and training sector (RSA, 2012), which has created new challenges, among others, challenges regarding the college curriculum.

The national curriculum framework for the TVET band (DoE, 1998d) suggested that the government's key reason for introducing new policies had been to address the weaknesses and deficiencies of the TVET college curriculum. These weaknesses and

deficiencies included TVET qualifications and programmes offered by colleges that fail to adequately prepare students for further learning, productive employment, or social, economic and cultural change. A further concern related to the inefficiencies of TVET curricula included the separation between theory and practice, poorly articulated TVET programmes, and programmes that differed widely with respect to quality, standards of provision, outcomes and curriculum implementation (DoE, 1998d). These challenges also prompted the Department of Education (DoE, 2006a) to promulgate some measures (Government Gazette number 28677) on 29 March 2006 to repeal policy in terms of a number of documents. This included the Norms and Standards for Instructional Programmes and the examination and certification thereof in technical education (Report 190 [92/04]), as well as formal technical college instructional programmes (RSA, Report 191 [97/07]). In the same Government Gazette, the Minister announced the new National Certificates (Vocational) qualification implementation dates at levels 2 to 4 to be introduced and sequentially replace the Report 191 (97/07) old technical college programmes per level as from January 2007. This meant that the old national accredited technical education (NATED) N1 to N3 qualifications were to be phased out systematically over three years, and the new National Certificates (Vocational) qualifications would subsequently replace them, starting with level 2 from January 2007 and ending with the implementation of level 4 in 2009. The promulgation of Government Gazette number 31711 (12 December 2008) followed suit where the Department (DoE, 2008a) also announced the phasing out of the National N Certificates N4 to N6 and the National N Diploma qualifications offered at TVET colleges (see Report 191 [97/07] and Report 190 [92/04] respectively). The phase-out dates would have commenced from January 2009 with N4, ending in January 2011 with N6 national certificates. The last date to award National N Diplomas would have been by December 2014. Although the new NCV level 2 to 4 qualifications were introduced in 2007, the funding norms (Government Gazette number 32010) were only promulgated on 16 March 2009. The late promulgation of the funding norms in 2009 meant that colleges had to implement the NCV qualifications from 2007 until 2009 without full state subsidy, which caused severe financial challenges.



### 2.6.1 The TVET Curriculum

This study is concerned with the expectations of employers from new graduates of TVET colleges. The graduates are a result of the curriculum that produces them. According to Du Toit (2011:59) and Albashiry, Voogt and Pieters (2015), there is no common understanding of the concept 'curriculum'. The viewing, interpretation and implementation of curricula within the same field in different ways are prevalent among academics at higher education institutions. Barnett and Coate (2003:5), for instance, describe curriculum as an "organised set of educational experiences" and pedagogy as the act of teaching brought about by the curriculum, while Koen (2011:26), Diamond (2008) and Taba (1962) all refer to a curriculum as a "plan of action" that organises learning activities.

In countries worldwide, the curriculum is at the heart of the education and training system. In South Africa, in particular, the past curriculum has perpetuated race, gender and ethnic divisions (Mabeba, 2019). It has emphasised separateness rather than common citizenship and nationhood. Little wonder that the South African Department of Education remarked in 1994 that "... it is, therefore, imperative that the curriculum be restructured to reflect the values and principles of our new democratic society" (ANC, 1994:3). Amidst the numerous strategic areas to be led by college principals, one of the major challenges facing TVET colleges was improving the quality of teaching and learning programmes through sustainable curriculum change. The DoE (2007) has pointed out earlier some of the negative features of the then technical colleges they have been trying to overhaul since 1995.

The Department of Education (DoE, 2001) and Gewer (2002) point out that the old FET colleges were (and TVET colleges are still) functioning in an environment with little institutional and curricular change. Naidu, Joubert, Mestry, Mosoge and Ngocobo (2008:1-2) claim that, contrary to public schools, leadership in South African TVET colleges was "a new phenomenon", because in the past, colleges were not autonomous and self-managing, while principals were administrators in highly regulated environments. This was especially, the case in the so-called 'state governed' colleges.

The technical and vocational education and training sector would be expected to offer a curriculum that is relevant to the industry's needs. Sterling (2010:47) states that “educational institutions need to offer subjects or classes that are suitable for real life situations and partner with industry companies to make graduates more relevant to industries” He further suggests that educational institutions can keep updated on industry changes and alterations in terms of job requirements.

The TVET curriculum and workplace training are a chance to achieve industry participation, and a steady response from the industry is elementary to giving input to updating the curriculum together with the graduate's input (Kumar, 2014). The improved and updated teaching and learning methodologies would be possible if lecturers were the creators of those methodologies and techniques of teaching. Curriculum relevancy plays a major role in determining what industry stakeholders are expecting from graduates. In addition (Martin & Fleming, 2010), emphasises that future employers are simultaneously increasingly demanding enhanced graduate capabilities on their entry into the profession.

The complex world of work within each profession becomes a focus during the students' study (Daniel, 2010). The Curriculum is a focal point for the functioning of the vocational system by defining the National framework and quality standards for the education system. The South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA) is responsible for the implementation of the National Qualification Framework (NQF). These quality counsels set standards of curricula and assessments, amongst which is Umalusi (DHET, 2013). Therefore, there are various participants in the curriculum design phase. This ensures the improvement of curriculum alignment to the workplace training activities required by the employer.

There is a need to develop a curriculum syllabus and lesson plans that are future-oriented and aid college students in exploring the world of work and future pathways (Mabeba, 2019; Kumar, 2014). Anderson (2013) is convinced that this can assist in linking education, learning, and curriculum to the actual world. The improved and updated teaching and learning methodologies would be possible if lecturers were creators of those methodologies and techniques of teaching. The curriculum relevancy plays a major role in determining what industry stakeholders are expecting from

graduates. This makes the improvement of curriculum alignment to the workplace training activities as required by the employer. (Lowden, Hall, Elliot & Lewin, 2011).

It is essential that every student who enters and exits the TVET College should be prepared and equipped with basic employable skills which employers will require in work industries. With the right level of pliability, training establishments and schools can extra successfully companion with local employers, organisation associations, region organisations, neighbourhood government and local improvement boards to decorate the relevance and quality of TVET programmes. “Concerned organisations and industry fields can accumulate useful information on whether curriculum aligns well with the needs of industry and neighbourhood activities as well facilitate the engagement of different employers” (World Bank, 2016:20).

The transition from TVET College to the world of work requires graduates to proactively think about how to be employable by understanding the process of how qualifications fit into the sectors and industries of the country. The Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) always primacy their programmes on the basis of how the graduate will benefit the industry and self. “Work readiness training allows graduates to engage in job training programmes to acquire real-life experience and to perfect their work abilities and knowledge” (DHET, 2016:8).

A new TVET curriculum potentially offers multiple entries and exit points and a diversity of learning programmes and qualifications to meet the varied needs of students in different fields and at different stages of their lives. Furthermore, a new curriculum might overcome the outdated divisions between ‘academic’ and ‘vocational education’, and between ‘education’ and ‘training’. Thus, the curriculum would not be characterised by the ‘vocationalisation’ of education but by a sound foundation of general knowledge combined with practical relevance.

### **2.6.2 Enhancement of Lecturers’ Industry Knowledge and Skills**

Lecturers in TVET colleges are very much a part of the final product they produce for the job market. Most lecturers have TVET related qualifications, but not all of them are professionally qualified teachers. Buthelezi (2016) is convinced that older lecturers exist within the setup and have, for many years, worked as artisans, trainers and

facilitators and bring to the vast sector industry and workplace experience. The majority of new lecturers come from the world of education rather than from the workplace and often have either diploma or degree-level qualifications.

According to Kahn (2017), a limited amount of TVET Colleges are staffed by lecturers with appropriate teaching, technical skills, and industry experience. The management of TVET Colleges is also not efficient. The merger of 152 small technical colleges into 50 TVET colleges in 2002, along with the demand to increase student numbers and implement new curriculums, has placed a huge strain on their management structures, which have often proved unequal to the task. Apart from the lack of sufficient lecturers and mismanagement of tasks, TVET Colleges fail to provide the career support which learners require. One of the ways that innovation is withheld is due to the standard of teaching. In many cases, lecturers may be qualified. However, they lack experience in the field of study. This is considered a disadvantage, as these lecturers need to educate learners on work and prepare them for the world of work. One of the most important issues to address with regard to academics and management is the type of lecturers within the system of TVET Colleges. These lecturers can be referred to as lecturers who practise internal locus of control and lecturers who use external locus of control.

The goal of the industry in integrating teacher training is to improve TVET skills by developing knowledge and experience in the industry (Van der Bijl & Taylor, 2016). The current qualification routes for becoming a vocational teacher in South Africa involve a diploma in vocational education, a national professional diploma, and education and advanced certificates in education as a national professional diploma (OECD, 2014). The fact that the proportion of quality lecturers has increased with low student learning outcomes raises questions about the importance of qualification as a measure of the competence of TVET lecturers (SAQA, 2016:132).

The teachers/trainers at TVET must be professionals with modern knowledge application and experience in their current industries, and this allows them to identify skills needed to complete certain training (Barber, 2016). In South Africa, TVET college lecturers did not receive training; again, there was no new qualification framework. Thus, it meant that lecturing staff came from different lecturing norms as well as different skills (Taylor, 2011). The TVET subsector report for the 2019 skills

plans extensively synthesised on continuous professional development to ensure that workers meet the relevant requirements in the discipline needed to improve their knowledge. All lecturers at TVET, regardless of their status, require continuous professional development. The SETA works with key stakeholders such as DHET, and other research partners to explore the possibilities of developing career strategies for TVET lecturers (TVET Skills Plan, 2019)

The educational background of TVET lecturers plays an important role in determining the type of lecturer that can deliver a vocational pedagogy in achieving occupational outcomes within the vocation education system. The adequacy of a specialised and professional training framework depends on the nature of educating and learning in classes, workshops, and experiment facilities (Lucas, Spencer & Claxton, 2012). The genuine responses to improving results from professional training lie in classes, in understanding the numerous choices lecturers take as they communicate with students. The background understanding can better equip lecturers to achieve high employability of students (Lilly & Efajemue, 2011). The same authors are of the view that “if we want to add to the shift of technical and vocational training in all its parts, we need to learn and clearly understand our own teaching methodologies and best reiterate relevant teaching and learning material for the various course and different students” (Lilly & Efajemue, 2011: 67). This is thought to enable the best competencies and proficiencies for the modern world of work.

Amedorme and Fiagbe (2013) stated that the Universities of Technology offering specialised and professional training should empower students to procure practical knowledge and skills suitable for the job market. It can be achieved by allowing TVET lecturers to update abilities and competencies through related placements, Workplace exposure or enterprise training.

### **2.6.3 The need for wide synergies in TVET graduate skills development**

Vocational training assists young people prepare for work; this represents the special needs of teachers in the professional programmes (Yonemura, 2011). There is a need to facilitate consultation among stakeholders of TVET, labour and employment,

including teacher/trainer development experts, to enhance the socio-economic relevance of TVET to economic development.

The standard of skills at TVET Colleges is set based on a traditional curriculum. These curriculums are outdated and lack the economy's labour needs due to the lack of re-evaluation and innovation. Learners are often theoretically examined and lack the required needs for employment. The economy is underdeveloped due to the lack of skills supply. Industry must set the standards, and TVET intuitions must develop strong links with the industry. In order to be able to offer skills that meet the standards of the industry. Northlink College is a TVET College located in the Western Cape province of South Africa. This college has implemented a Centre of Specialisation in which to encourage industry and TVET Colleges to work together. This project was the initiative of the Department of Higher Education and Training. The aim of the project is to develop and implement 13 new trades. Northlink aims to strengthen its relationship with the industry and use this engagement to help guide its curriculum (Northlink College, 2016).

According to Janine Myburgh, President of the Chamber of Commerce and Industry,

“Business and industry need to ensure active partnerships in the Post School Sector for the development of skills. These partnerships include healthy relationships with the relevant SETAs, the Department of Higher Education and Training, and our TVET Colleges. By ensuring an integrated ecosystem, the industry is of the opinion that this will contribute to the skills level of the country as a whole”. (Northlink College, 2016)

According to Reddy (2017), there is a lack of engagement between stakeholders in the sectors and industries. A large proportion of the TVET College graduates who do find jobs are not working in the industry but in finance or the government. According to Kahn (2017), the apparent lack of communication can be seen in the repercussions for industry and society. For example, Chinese construction company CBMI Construction recently imported welders from China, invoking the ire of COSATU, which organised a march on Cape Town's docks. TVET Colleges fail to produce enough technicians and artisans. According to the Skills Development Plan (2018), hard to fill vacancies include technicians, security and artisans due to the lack of skills, knowledge and experience.

Inspiration and innovation refer to the gaps in the employment market, which are referred to as hard to fill. Innovation can be maintained by means of engagement. The Department of Higher Education and Training has always encouraged the development of TVET Colleges. For example, the Centre of Specialisation at Northlink TVET College is a DHET initiative which encourages the development of new trade and partnerships with stakeholders (Northlink College, 2016).

## **2.7 Chapter summary**

This chapter has managed to review relevant literature on TVET college education in South Africa and how much prospective employers expect from such new graduates. The review also looked at the basic concept of technical, vocation education and training as a crucial component for job creation in the country. The type of curriculum and the qualification of trainers/teachers in TVET colleges have also been discussed. The next chapter is focused on research methodology and will present an outline concerning this study. The research aim, sub-objectives, and design shall be outlined. The chapter will also summarise and justify the methods and instruments used for data collection and analysis.

## **CHAPTER 3**

### **3.0 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY**

#### **3.1 Introduction**

The main research question driving this study is: How could TVET students be trained and prepared for entry into the South African workplace? The primary purpose of this chapter was to present the methods used in the study to investigate how TVET students from Motheo College are trained and prepared for employment. The methodology, therefore, started by spelling out the aim of the study, and main objectives, followed by the research design. The chapter also presents the population of the study, the sample and the technique for selecting it, as well as the data collection and analysis procedure. In the end, issues of validity and ethical concerns are addressed.

The sub-questions are:

- What are the industry expectations with regard to TVET graduates?
- What are the challenges experienced by students with regard to TVET training and entry into the industry?
- What are the recommendations for TVETs in training and preparations of students for job entry into the South African workplaces?

#### **3.2 Research design**

Sileyew (2019:2) defines a research design as a plan or protocol for carrying out or accomplishing something, especially a scientific experience (Sileyew, 2019:2). Kothari (2008:55) describes a research design as the glue that holds the research project together, implying it is an integral part of the research process. This study adopted a qualitative research design. Qualitative research is mainly associated with gathering and analysing the information presented. According to Mason (2002), qualitative research engages people with what matters and in ways that matter to enable the researcher to explore wide dimensions of social, and everyday life, their



understandings, experiences and imaginations of research participants. McMillan and Schumacher (2010) further examine it as a bounded system or a case over time; it uses in-depth interviews generated from the topic.

According to Mack et al. (2005:5), qualitative research is relevant because it seeks to understand a problem from the people studied. Creswell (2009: 193) also states that qualitative research refers to a methodology in which researchers explore and understand the meaning that individuals or groups attribute to a social problem.

The qualitative approach was appropriate as it enabled the researcher to obtain detailed descriptions in the form of words through interaction with TVET College lecturers in their natural context (Johnson & Christenson, 2009). The researcher's decision to utilise the qualitative research approach was based on understanding how TVET students are trained and prepared for job entry in the South African corporate industries.

In carrying out this study, the researcher assumes that the only way to reach truth (whether assigned or socially constructed) is through social constructions such as language, consciousness, and shared meanings. Hermeneutics and phenomenology are key philosophical foundations of interpretive science (Puller & Carter, 2018:12). Interpretivism is an attempt to explore the meaning behind human behaviour, their interactions, and society (Puller & Carter, 2018:12). In this investigation, the researcher attempts to develop an in-depth subjective understanding of people's lives based on their experiences. 'However, it should be highlighted that those interpretive experiments do not assume that people's behaviour and communication can be predicted (Crossman, 2020).

The study used semi-structured interviews to solicit data from the lecturers, career guidance officers and the recruitments officers, while focus group interviews were employed on student participants.

### **3.3 Population of the Study**

The research objectives guided the selection of the study population. A study population refers to a subset of the population with the condition or characteristics of interest defined by the eligibility criteria (Furberg, DeMets, Reboussin & Granger (2015:23). Polit and Hungler (1999:43, 232) add that a study population is the totality

of all subjects that change to a set of specifications, comprising the entire group of persons that are of interest to the researcher and to whom the analysis results will be generalised. The target population for this research included the lecturers, representatives from recruitment industries and the students from different faculty and courses in the Motheo TVET College since these are participants within the researcher's reach.

In accordance to Sugiono (2010:117), a population is a geographic generalisation such as a subject that has the quality and certain characteristics that are set by the researcher to learn then conclude. The researcher's idea for selecting the target population supports Sugiono sentiments of selecting a population for the study that best suits what the researcher requires in the data.

The research population for this study consisted of students, lecturers, DHET, and the Department of Labour. Students' inclusion criteria were age; eighteen (18) to thirty – five (35) years, and also students were both male and female at exit level from the identified faculties of Motheo TVET. In this study, the participants were still waiting for relevant placements from their respective campuses.

In addition, lecturers were considered appropriate for the study population because they constitute curriculum experts in teaching methodologies at colleges. These lecturers possess several years of teaching and learning. Therefore, they are in the best position to furnish the researcher with the information needed to answer the research question of this study. The following table shows the composition of the sample.

**Table 3.1 Sample composition**

<b>Area of Specialisation</b>	<b>Lecturers</b>	<b>Students (18-35)</b>	<b>Industry Specialist</b>	<b>CGO Career guidance</b>
Business management N6	2	3	1	1
Marketing management N6	2	3	0	0
HR Management N6	1	2	0	0
Educare Management N6	1	1	0	0
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>06</b>	<b>09</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>

### **3.4 SAMPLING AND SAMPLING PROCEDURES**

#### **3.4.1 Sampling**

Creswell (1998:110) describes sampling as the process of finding people or places to study; gaining access to study; to establishing rapport so that participants provide relevant data. A population that is studied is called a sample of the population (Nworgu 1991:69). The researcher's sample consisted of nine student participants with five (5) males and four (4) females between the ages of eighteen (18) and twenty-five (35) who are TVET college students. In this study, the participants were exit students from Marketing Management N6, Human Resources N6, Business Management N6 and EDUCARE.

Further, a total of 8 Lecturers from the above-named specialities were also selected. The lecturers' relevance is contained in their ability to give opinions and experiences about the challenges and advantages of teaching the TVET curriculum.

A member from the Career Development section in the college was also added, and an officer from industry recruitment in the Department of labour was selected too. The researcher chose the sample as it best characterised the sample required in order to analyse data accumulated.

In summary, the sample included (09) nine students from the TVET college campuses, doing N6 Marketing Management, N6 Business Management, N6 Human Resource Management, and N6 Educare Management. All students were at the exit level as they were more affected by job entry and unemployment statistics. The second group of participants was the Career Guidance Officer (CGO's), who is knowledgeable about the policies and placements of students in different jobs, eight (8) academic staff who teach the TVET students daily and lastly, a specialist from the Department of Labour.

### **3.4.2 Sampling procedure**

There are two sampling methods, namely: probability sampling and non-probability sampling. Probability sampling assumes that each member has a non-zero probability of being selected (Sharma, 2017:749). Non-probability sampling is a technique in which participants are chosen from the population in a non-random way (Taherdoost, 2016:20).

#### ***3.4.2.1 Non-probability sampling***

This study adopted non-probability sampling as it allowed the researcher to understand how students are trained and prepared for job entry in South African industries (Sharma, 2017:749). Using non-probability sampling, the researcher was able to dig deeper to understand the perceptions of lecturers and students and why they hold these perceptions (Taherdoost, 2016:20). There are different types of non-probability sampling: convenience sampling, judgment sampling, quota sampling, and snowball sampling.

#### ***3.4.2.2. Purposive sampling***

This study employed purposive sampling to select the study population. According to Benoot, Hannes and Bilsen (2016:5), in purposive sampling, the researcher relies on judgement to choose a sample. In this case, the researcher may decide to draw the entire sample from a representative population. This method was selected for its cost-effectiveness, allowing the researcher to understand the whole based on a chosen

representative population (Benoot et al., 2016:5). As discussed earlier, a total of 27 participants were purposively selected for this study. They were distributed as follows: nine students from TVET colleges, six enrolled on Marketing Management, six for Business Management, six for Human Resource Management, and six for Educare Management.

### **3.5 Data Collection instruments**

A research instrument is a data measurement and analysis tool used in a particular study (Steph, Ger, Gaast, Keesstra, and Koenders 2021:128). The data collection tools used included a series of semi-structured interviews, one-on-one interviews and focus group discussions. Using a series of probing interview questions allowed the researcher to be more flexible in conducting interviews and gave more depth to responses to ensure no items were overlooked (Carpenter & Streubert, 2003:18). The following instruments were selected for the study:

#### **3.5.1 Semi-structured interviews**

The semi-structured interview was administered to the lecturers, career guidance officers and the recruitments officers. Jackson, Drummond and Sakile (2017:6) define semi-structured interviews as a conversation with a purpose. According to Steph et al., (2021:128), this style of the method is also known as a depth interview it is designed to provide in-depth detail. The semi-structured style was chosen because it offered the participants ample time and scoped to present their views and permitted the researcher to react to and follow informed rising concepts (Nohl, 2009). Semi-structured interviews not only enabled the assessment of the “participants’ opinions, statements, and convictions but also allowed eliciting narratives concerning their personal experiences (Bell & Waters, 2014).

The instrument was administered to six lecturers, one career guidance official and one recruitment specialist. Each interview was between twenty and thirty minutes long.

Prior to the interview, the researcher gave the participants a consent form that informed them about their role in the research and their rights. The researcher ensured the participants that their views were to be treated with strict confidentiality, and should they wish to discontinue the interview at any point, they were free to do so. When the participants were satisfied, they signed the consent form.

The deductive approach was used for data collection and to analyse the focal point of the message and opinions. Creswell and Poth (2018) empathised that data can be coded into categories of meaning which eventually can be developed into themes and sub-themes as answers to specific research questions. Appointments were made, and all interviews were recorded and later transcribed so that no amount of relevant data would be lost.

De Vos et al. (2002) identify several advantages of making use of a tape recorder because the researcher can concentrate on what was said in the interviews so that s/he could think about this way, it assists the researcher to record fully and accurately what is said rather than taking notes during interviews. The assumption was that the responses and results acquired from the interviews might reveal how TVET students are trained and supported for South African industries. Creswell (2013) further maintains that data can be in a systematic way, selecting and categorising them according to the level of importance to the study at hand. In this study, key points are identified that are related to unemployment, job market, curriculum review, qualification framework, industry needs, academic staff knowledge and role players in TVET.

### **3.5.2 Focus group interviews**

The Focus group method was also employed on student participants. All the students took part in the focus group interview since they were affected by the job search and hiring in almost a similar fashion. They were interviewed according to their area of study and level. This method assisted the researcher in facilitating and observing the participant's perceptions and opinions about the topic and how it affects them personally.

The participants for the focus group interviews were three from Business Management, three from Marketing Management, two from Human Resources Management and one from Educare Management. After assuring the participants that their views were to be confidential and were free to discontinue the interviews at any given time, the researcher asked them to sign consent forms. The group participants chose a convenient venue where the discussion was to take place. As the facilitator of the discussion, the researcher ensured that each participant was given a chance to make contributions and probed participants to extract more information.

In the hope of accurately capturing the information, all the interviews were tape-recorded and analysed. Greeff in DE Vos (2002:309) accepts that focus groups are essential for getting insights into the perceptions and attitudes of individuals in an environment of dynamic group interaction. It is additionally a way that encompasses verbal and nonverbal means of communication, and, therefore, the exchange of perceptions and opinions of the participants. Wilkinson's study (2000:15) asserts that focus teams are often accustomed to gaining data regarding how individuals assume and clarify perceptions of certain events.

### **3.6. Criteria of Trustworthiness**

The measure of a research's trustworthiness is these qualities: transferability, credibility, dependability, and conformability (Smith & Noble, 2015:35).

#### **3.6.1 Credibility**

According to Aspers and Corte (2019:140), credibility refers to the question of whether the study is repeated by multiple researchers or the same researcher at a different location will produce credible results. This is a difficult question to answer since the results generated are a result of time and position. Since the results are a contextual social fact, achieving credibility in qualitative research is particularly difficult.

In order to ensure the credibility of this study, the researcher ensured that the participants' contributions during the data collection remained subjective and could not be challenged (Silverman, 2006:50). As Silverman (2006) suggested, the researcher ensured credibility by demonstrating clarity on the study methodology and their theory selection so that everyone could observe, understand, and replicate the steps.

Transcribing interview answers and using direct quotes were also considered to ensure credibility, as Silverman (2006) indicated.

### **3.6.2 Validity**

A research's validity is the extent to which the measure used by the researcher is true to its intended purpose (Middleton, 2016:1). To ensure validity, the researcher selected the most appropriate research instrument and ensured that the sample of 27 participants significantly represented the population.

### **3.6.2 Transferability**

Transferability is defined as the ability of research findings to be re-produced in a different context, situation, time and population (Roller & Lavrakas, 2015:217). In order to ensure transferability, the researcher used a thick description of the phenomenon. Thick description allows readers to make an informed judgement about whether they can transfer the findings to their own situation. They will be able to take into account differences between the situation described by the researcher and their own circumstances.

### **3.6.4 Conformability**

According to Ravich and Carl (2016:77), the goal of confirmability is to acknowledge and explore interpretations of data to mediate these interpretations as much as possible through a structured process. An audit trail is one of the methods to ensure confirmability (Grey, Grove & Sutherland, 2017:66). The researcher will make use of an audit trail, keeping records and evidence of processes that took place during the collection process.

### **3.6.5 Dependability**

Dependability refers to the extent to which the research findings are consistent and reliable through clarity and documentation of research procedures (Grey, Grove & Sutherland, 2017: 66). This allows someone outside the research to follow, audit and critique the research process. The researcher used an inquiry audit which, according to Middleton (2016:2), provides a detailed description of the procedures that have been followed and provides the basis for judging the extent to which they are dependable. The researcher defined the research procedures, which is open to scrutiny by external researchers.



### 3.7 DATA ANALYSIS

This research used thematic analysis to analyse the results. Thematic analysis is a collection of research methods used to investigate a phenomenon by systematically coding and interpreting it (Kim and Kuljis, 2010:35). In this scenario, we look at the texts themes and key concepts as primary material" (Mayring, 2000:2). The gathered data can be broken down into specific themes to investigate the" employees' views of the performance assessment scheme in the IT department of a chosen bank. Thematic interpretation helps the researcher to see and make sense of collective or common concepts and perceptions by reflecting on context through a dataset (Braun & Clarke, 2019:591). Qualitative analysis that is good must be able to draw conclusions and be compatible with the data gathered. Thematic analysis can detect and classify stimuli or variables that affect any problem raised by participants, for this study, the researcher uses an inductive approach to data coding and processing for this research. The 'bottom up' method is guided by the results, according to Braun and Clarke (2019:591). This indicates that the codes and themes are derived directly from the data's material.

For this study, the transcribed data were converted into analysable themes in order to gain a more accurate understanding. A coding agenda was used to identify and clarify preliminary types, which included variables. Coding rules were created to help distinguish the divisions. The researcher then read the text and underlined any statements that seemed to be significant at first glance. The content of the transcript was organised using a colour scheme after reconsidering the identified categories (Braun & Clark, 2019:591). Statements, views, and quotations were sorted into categories based on the order in which they were made. The effect of performance appraisals on employee morale, for example, was shown in blue, making it easier for the researchers to find similar codes during the study. The researcher created additional definitions if the contents did not fit into existing ones. Any remarks were expressly cited, but the majority were paraphrased and outlined in the ' researcher's

own terms. The recorded comments were analysed and translated after all of the interview answers were coded.

### **3.8. Ethical Considerations**

Ethical considerations in all research need to be followed (Burton, 2000) in order to protect the participants and ensure the integrity of the study. Ethical considerations are about aspects that address the confidentiality and anonymity of the participants of the study. The research presented risks to participants; thus, the researcher had to confirm that their well-being was being safeguarded throughout the research (Polit & motion, 2010). Safeguarding participants involved adhering to the standard ethical principles that embrace respect for the participants' autonomy, protecting participants from hurt, confidentiality, consent and voluntary participation (Scott, 2013).

#### **3.8.2 Permission**

This study involved the institution of higher learning. The researcher was compelled to request permission from the college to conduct a research study, and a letter of application was drawn to request permission to conduct various interviews with the academic staff, management and students. The researcher also needed to apply for Ethical Clearance from the University of South Africa (UNISA). The importance of requesting permission to conduct research was to assist the researcher in having the flexibility to acquire data without restrictions made by colleges, as the participants were not always permitted to engage in open discussions.

#### **3.8.3 Consent letter**

The consent letter was given to the participants; this letter indicated their willingness to participate in the research by signing a confidentiality agreement. It was the responsibility of the researcher to uphold and respect the participant's wishes throughout the study. The participants were given a consent letter that outlined that they agreed to partake in the study and to have them recorded during interviews and observations.

### **3.8.4 Harm and risk**

Avoiding harm is another basic human right to be thought about once researching people in general. Burns and Grove (1997:206) note that risks that will be countered in research include physical, psychological, emotional, social, and financial ones. The researcher ensured that participants were not harmed or abused in any way or form by maintaining a calm and comfortable environment.

### **3.8.5 Voluntary participation**

It was made clear to the participants that the research was for academic purposes, and their participation was strictly voluntary. They could withdraw from the study at any time if they wished to (Holloway, 2005:292). It allowed the researcher to inform participants they could withdraw or participate in the study of their own will.

### **3.8.6 Honesty and trust**

Trustworthiness is one of the elements of transferability, which refers to the likelihood that what was found in one contact by a piece of qualitative research is appropriate to another perspective (Lincoln and Guba, 1985). The credibility and trustworthiness of the study were shown through the quality of the participants' responses during the interviews. The research results obtained from the triangulation were recited through the interviews and the multiple sources and documents utilised during the collection of data (Schwandt, 2007:299).

## **3.9 Chapter Summary**

The purpose of this chapter was to present and explain the research methods and answer the research questions that were used in the study. The qualitative research approach was used to explore and understand youth unemployment, the impact of student placements after completion of the qualification, and how they affect their standard of living and the country's economy.

Interviews were conducted with lecturers, CGOs, students and industry participants to grasp their understanding and also allow them to share their own experiences in their natural setting. They discussed the procedure, study participants, data collection, and interview questions. It also outlined the specifics of how the study was conducted and who the study participants were.

The participants were chosen based on their own expert knowledge and past experiences with student job entry and students' job placements. The next chapter presents the analysis of the data collected and discusses the results of the study.

## **CHAPTER 4**

### **4.0 DATA PRESENTATION AND INTERPRETATION**

#### **4.1 Introduction**

The previous chapter (3) discussed the methodology used in collecting and analysing data for the study. The purpose of the study was to identify the expected employability skills that TVETs graduates should possess when entering the workplace. No research study could be found focusing on the Free State Province regarding the TVET graduate employability as required by employers. This study could be seen as an attempt to address the gap in knowledge on employer expectations from the TVET training system with a focus on Free State, South Africa. This chapter presents the results obtained during the survey conducted through interviews and focus group discussions with the identified participants. Results are presented in terms of the study's main research questions as revealed in the discussion questions, and the results are further presented in terms of the emerging issues related to the study's objectives.

#### **4.2 Data presentation and analysis**

##### **4.2.1 Thematic analysis method**

The thematic analysis method is the identification of themes that form part of categories used for the analysis of data. This method occurs through six coding phases used to identify meaningful patterns within data. The findings and discussion presented below address questions provided in the focus group discussions and the interviews with staff from the Career Development, Department of Labour and lecturers. The findings are presented and clustered in terms of the aims and objectives of the study, as outlined in chapter one. It is worth noting, at this stage, that responses provided by the participants may overlap in some instances. Hence, data presentation will be outlined and clustered to capture the themes identified in this study. That being said, three major themes have been identified in line with the objectives and research questions thus:

1. The employer expectations from TVET college graduates
2. The challenges experienced by TVET Interns
3. TVET training recommendations for innovative learning and employment

#### 4.2.2 The classification of South African qualifications and position of TVET qualification

**Table 4.1 SA Qualification and weighting**

NQF level	NQF band	Qualification type	Institutions			Occupational qualifications	
			Universities	General primary and high schools	TVET colleges		
10	Higher Education and Training	Doctoral Degree	PhD				
9		Master's Degree	Masters Degree				
8		Bachelor Hons Degree; Post Graduate Diploma; Bachelor's Degree	Hons Degree			OC8	
7		Bachelor's Degree; Advanced Diploma	Bachelors Degree		NATED N6	OC7	
6		Diploma; Advanced Certificate	Dip		NATED N5	OC6	
5		Higher Certificate	H Cert		NATED N4	OC5	
4	Further Education and Training	National Senior Certificate (NSC)		NSC Grade 12	NCV 4	NATED N3	OC4
3				Grade 11	NCV 3	NATED N2	OC2
2				Grade 10	NCV 2	NATED N1	OC1
1	General Education and Training			Grades 3-9			

} Intermediate  
- 4, 5, 6, 7, 8

The government of South Africa has introduced a single unified national qualification framework for education in the country that applies to all Higher Education institutions and improves the ability of students to move quickly and more effectively from one qualification to the next and between and between institutions. These changes were guided by the Revised Higher Education Qualifications Sub-Framework (HEQSF) as published in the Government Gazette on 2 August 2013. As a result, all public and private higher education institutions in the country, including Universities of Technology, were required to revise and align existing qualifications or develop new

qualifications that meet the requirements of the new sub-framework. Most Universities of Technology and Technical and Vocational Colleges have already introduced some the revised and aligned qualifications or new qualifications. As guided by law, all higher education institutions were allowed to register new students for the last time in non-aligned qualifications in January 2019 for year courses and July 2019 for semester courses.

### **4.3 Industry expectations from TVET graduates**

This section presents and discusses all responses to the first major research question regarding what the industry expects in TVET graduates for the purposes of hiring and offer of employment. Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) colleges are a central component of South Africa's skills development system. They provide vocational and occupational training programmes to prepare students for employment or for higher education. The question of expectation and employability concept is best understood as being subjective and individual, fortified by concepts of identity and practices (Paterson, 2017). It appears that individual experiences shape the work outcomes of graduates. A previous study by Tomlinson (2007) of final-year undergraduates highlighted that students developed individualised narratives of their future career progression. Concerning individual perceptions of employability, this shows that students constructed individual identities. Thus, the perceptions of students can be explained as their beliefs or attitude in line with what they would expect employers to look for in them. According to Harvey et al. (1997 cited in Holden and Jameson, 2002), most employers are looking for proactive graduates who can use higher-level skills including 'analysis, critique, synthesis and multi-layered communication to facilitate innovative teamwork in catalysing the transformation of their organisation'. A study by Buthelezi on TVET lecturer profiles revealed that the government has now approved a framework for new qualifications aimed at helping lecturers to become qualified educators progressively and not just have work-oriented qualifications (Buthelezi, 2018). One of the unintended consequences is the existence of a risk that Colleges may decrease their connections to the world of work through the increasing focus on education over work-based qualifications. Wedekind (2016)

argues that lecturers who do not wish to become lecturers may leave the TVET Colleges and increase the flow of skills out of the sector

The main research question driving this study is: How could TVET students be trained and prepared for entry into the South African workplace?

### **Question 1. What are the industry expectations from TVET graduates?**

The question of expectations focused on what constitutes employability in TVET graduates. Indeed, the significance placed on graduate employability and its stated inherent link to economic progress was mainly discussed, as revealed by the interview findings. The interviews with lecturers confirmed that there is a challenge with TVET graduates' employability. The interviews revealed that students produced by TVET colleges do not easily find employment, and very few are entrepreneurial. Part of non-employability is due to the non-acceptance of the NCV by industries that are the potential employers of the TVET college product. One lecturer stated that:

*The change to a new curriculum was unpopular due to insufficient communicability with industries, lack of familiarity with the programme and scepticism about the type of human capital that it would yield, leading to a loss of confidence in skills training provided by the TVET colleges. Joblessness after millions of rands have been spent to revitalise the sector to contribute to the economy of the country is an unintended consequence.*

Overall, the lecturers were unanimous in their support for the alignment of studies to industry expectations. The list of expectations given by the lecturers and industry representative is thus summarised as follows:

- The student's academic performance and engagement in his/her studies
- The student's confidence in his/ her skills and abilities
- The student's ambition
- The student's perception of the strength of the TVET brand
- The reputation the student's TVET has within his/her field of study



- The status and credibility of the student's field of study
- The student's awareness of opportunities in the job market
- The student's perception of the state of the job market
- The employer's demand for graduates in the student's subject field

Lecturers and labour representatives agreed that available evidence-based studies have moved towards a more complex understanding of graduate employability and proposed a number of inter-related attributes, skills, and competencies that help individuals secure and perform well in employment.

Department of labour representative added:

*It is very vital that our TVET colleges produce the graduates that our economy needs, with the skills that employer's value. The global economy is rapidly evolving, and if the country is to retain its position as one of the largest economies on the continent, we need highly skilled graduates who are able to respond to these developments.*

The interview responses recorded from the industry representative and Career development officer confirmed that employers want graduates who can adapt to the workplace culture, use their abilities and skills to evolve the organisation and participate in innovative teamwork. Employers also value critical thinking (reflection), which is required for innovation and anticipating and leading change. They both emphasised that graduates possessing a positive attitude as a critical factor underpinning their employability; whether the individual has "a 'can-do' approach, a readiness to take part and contribute, openness to new ideas and a drive to make these happen". They noted that employers value graduates who can demonstrate an entrepreneurial and innovative approach and creative thinking, bringing fresh perspectives and challenging assumptions. The career development officer stated:

*The bottom line, in this case, is that TVETs need to equip graduates with 'deep' intellectual capabilities and a battery of applied practical skills, which make them more 'work-ready.*

The interview responses recorded from the industry representative and Career development officer confirmed that employers want graduates who can adapt to the workplace culture, use their abilities and skills to evolve the organisation and participate in innovative teamwork. Employers also value critical thinking (reflection), which is required for innovation and anticipating and leading change.

They emphasised on graduates possessing a positive attitude as a key factor underpinning their employability; whether the individual has “a ‘can-do’ approach, a readiness to take part and contribute, openness to new ideas and a drive to make these happen”. They noted that employers value graduates who can demonstrate an entrepreneurial and innovative approach and creative thinking, bringing fresh perspectives and challenging assumptions. The views were aptly echoed by the Career development officer, who stated:

*The bottom line, in this case, is that TVETs need to equip graduates with ‘deep’ intellectual capabilities and a battery of applied practical skills, which make them more ‘work-ready’.*

On the other hand, lecturers seemed to be over-occupied with technical and academic skills in their teaching. They seemed to all agree that:

*“We take employability skills to be the skills almost everyone needs to do almost any job. They are the skills that must be present to enable an individual to use the more specific knowledge and technical skills that their particular workplaces will require.”*

There are certain attributes that are expected by industry from graduates. Regarding this aspect, most of the staff and labour representatives established a common characterisation of attributes. They all picked skills and knowledge and intellectual capability elements that are required for specific roles. In addition, combinations of transferable skills were also deemed particularly relevant. These were:

- Team working
- Problem solving
- Self-management
- Knowledge of the business
- Literacy and numeracy relevant to the post

- ICT knowledge
- Good interpersonal and communication skills
- Ability to use own initiative but also to follow instructions
- Leadership skills where necessary

In addition to these, the participants highlighted the need for particular attitudes and outlooks, including motivation, tenacity, and commitment. A further similarity with the literature reviewed was that employers and their representative organisations thought that specific definitions of expectations were less important than an agreed focus on how to promote employability skills and attributes. Work experience, internships and extra-curricular activities while at TVET college was seen by employers and graduates as particularly helpful in developing these transferable skills.

The student focus group discussion did not pick many attributes. They, however, were similar to the ones identified by the lecturers and industry representatives. Students only picked:

- Team worker,
- Self-management,
- ICT Knowledge,
- Leadership skills and
- innovativeness

The need for employability skills is important in preparing TVET graduates to enter the labour market. Suggested employability skills are verified into two class skills considered important by respondents: foundation skills; (basic skills, thinking skills, and personal quality) and workplace competencies; (resources, interpersonal, information, system, and technology). The findings showed that some indicators of employability attributes are significant for TVET graduates. The industry representatives considered that the most desirable graduate attributes are social skills, knowledge in the fields of Management, communication skills, technology and information skills, creativity and innovation, problem-solving and critical thinking. This

indicates that TVET graduates, in addition to having educational qualifications in their respective fields, must also still have a social nature and interpersonal abilities.

The above sentiments expressed by most of the participants highlight the industry has a perception that TVET graduates are now well prepared with the required skills, competencies and character that will allow them to thrive within an organisation.

## **Discussion**

The study establishes that graduate employability is becoming a dominant discourse within the South African labour market. TVET graduates are generally perceived to be less equipped with skills and knowledge that best fit the highly sought-after job opportunities. A study by Archer and Davison (2008), considering employers' perspectives on graduate employability, provides a contrast between what some TVET colleges are promoting and what is required by the industry. This is true, supported by Glass et al. (2008), who established that a minority of employers, in their case study, recruit individuals from TVETs specifically for the technical skills that they hope will bring to the organisation. Rather, most employers see a diploma/certificate as a proxy for achieving a certain level of competence that represents the minimum standard they seek in a new recruit. In short, the findings, as supported by these other studies, reveal that employers expect well-rounded graduates with both technical and soft skills to be industry-ready.

Lecturers and labour representatives agreed that available evidence-based studies have moved towards a more complex understanding of graduate employability and proposed a number of inter-related attributes, skills, and competencies that help individuals secure and perform well in employment. In the research report 'How much does higher education enhance the employability of graduates?' by Mason *et al.* (2003), the concept of employability centred on the development of communication, numeracy, information technology, and learning how to learn. Rothwell and & Arnold (2007) proposed an approach for understanding employability that was based on interrelated components, which included broader contextual factors.

The general interviews with staff and labour representatives established a common characterisation of what the industry expects from graduates. They all picked skills and knowledge, and intellectual capability elements required for specific roles. In

addition to these, the interviewees also highlighted that the industry was looking for candidates with particular attitudes and outlooks, including motivation, tenacity, and commitment. A further similarity with the literature reviewed was that employers and their representative organisations thought that specific definitions of expectations were less important than an agreed focus on how to promote employability skills and attributes. Work experience, internships and extra-curricular activities while at TVET college was seen by employers and graduates as particularly helpful in developing these transferable skills. The perceived lack of appropriate skills negatively affects TVET graduates as the recruiters may share these perceptions. According to Chinyamurind and Mjoli (2018), the employability of TVET graduates may be internal as it involves the academic performance and confidence of graduates and external in that institutional reputation and credibility are considered by recruiters. Therefore, the need for employability skills is significant to prepare TVET graduates to enter the labour market. Suggested employability skills are verified into two class skills that were considered vital by respondents, namely, foundation skills; (basic skills, thinking skills, personal quality) and workplace competencies; (resources, interpersonal, information, system, technology) (Paterson, 2017).

#### **4.5 The challenges experienced by students regarding TVET internship and entry into the industry**

The first challenge regarding internship and entry into the industry was a lack of experience. Most of the participants agreed that students are entering the job market without knowledge and industry experience, and this is due to a lack of exposure through organised internships. This general lack of dynamic and sustained linkages and collaborative partnerships represents the most critical difficulty to colleges in performing their strategically mandated role and responsibilities as agents for economic growth and skills development. Often, it appeared that employer-TVET partnerships were people-dependant rather than system-dependant. The labour department representative highlighted this:

*Unfortunately, they kind of changed some of the ways of working at TVETs and the lecturer as well. We had an excellent relationship with the lecturer. That was quite a good model because they had enough time in TVETs to have actually added value,*

*and they had enough time then to come into the industry. I think it was very much like an extended interview.*

The Career Development Officer added:

*The TVETs should be doing workshops on that. You rarely have to be interviewed to get into college now. Therefore, students are not probably doing a formal interview until their first job interview, and they are falling flat on their faces. This is the first step in which the graduate is unable to market his/her employability according to the expectations of the industry.*

Graduates and employers, in general, recognised that the TVET institutions were doing a very good job teaching theoretical content but the actual experience was necessary across most courses to acquire a wider repertoire of employability skills and attributes.

Another challenge faced by TVET graduates when seeking employment is a mismatch between the needs of the industry and the structure and focus of many of the certificates/diplomas offered. There were many students seeking courses for which there were few current or future opportunities. The Career Development officer commented thus:

*From an engineering point of view, the TVETs need to be realistic about the qualifications they are sending people out with. What is the point of giving someone an engineering certificate which is not accredited or relevant to the demands of the industry out there?*

Department of Labour Representative also expressed the following views:

*I would say that is one thing that has always surprised me. We have taken in a number of intern students [on placements]. The contacts have all been done through [careers officer], but there has been no contact whatsoever from anyone from the courses. No one from the management or Engineering departments has ever approached us. They seem completely unaware of what the careers service is doing... There doesn't seem to be any contact with the subject leaders, and I find that a disappointment.*

Most of the participants also expressed that there was no effort to build links between TVET institutions and the industry. Most of the participants indicated that entry into the industry was facilitated by links, which was lacking and even discouraged in some TVET institutions. Lecturer 2 said:

*I was being criticised for building links with industry rather than writing research papers. I haven't done enough research output and am being discriminated against for that, rather than recognising the links I am building up with the industry.*

Lecturer 1 added:

*The industry sort of feels that they can dictate to us how things should run, whereas sometimes we feel it should be more of a two-way process. I think once you've got the relationship with the institutions, then it definitely works. Building up that relationship sometimes does take time, but I think from our perspective, we usually start at the beginning of the year. We've just had our careers services date, so we invite all of the career's services in from our prospective employers and basically let them know our strategy and what's going to be happening and what our strategy is. I think the more open we are with them, the better the relationship, and I think the more open they are with us, it's definitely the reverse. It's a growing relationship, and it's not something you can really walk into, and just to be able to get them on your side straight away.*

Interviews with the Career development officer also showed the importance of TVETs' careers services as a catalyst for employer engagement cannot be underestimated. The officer suggested that *'without the careers service, partnerships simply would not happen'* because the *'academic and employer communities are separate'*. The career services act as a conduit between these communities, with academics and employers bringing their own complementary expertise. The Career development officer stated:

*Some careers services would meet with departmental/faculty staff to develop employability measures such as a careers module and embedding employability-related activities into workshops and seminars. However, the scope for 'real' partnership was often limited and seen by some career personnel as 'hard work'. Despite the efforts of TVETs' careers services and employability units, there were*

*usually different levels of relationships with employers across the various academic departments in each institution. Even where a careers service or centre was quite systematic in its approach to promoting links with employers and stressed the importance of employability in its policies, individual faculties and departments did not uniformly reflect this in their practice.*

The study establishes that the TVET institutions have failed to create important linkages with employers to bond between the institutions and the employers. As a result, TVET graduates are released into a job market without industry experience and positive perceptions from employers.

## **Discussion**

The study established three key findings on the challenges experienced by students regarding TVET internship and entry into the industry. These are lack of exposure, lack of partnerships between TVET institutions and industry and mismatch between industry needs and the skills and knowledge that the TVET institutions are providing. A study by Archer and Davison (2008), considering employers' perspectives on graduate employability, provides a contrast between what some TVET colleges are promoting and what is required by the industry.

The lack of exposure for TVET graduate students to get industry experience has been linked to financial challenges confronting the TVET institutions (King & McGrath, 2004). The findings reveal that TVET institutions have the potential to integrate young people into the industry, but the lack of resources forces them to reduce the volume of training provided. The impact of these inadequacies can be reflected in the poor quality of training, and these inadequacies also affect the skills and competencies demanded by the industry (Dasmani, 2011).

The mandate of TVET institutions is to produce capable graduates who can compete in the job market, but the unavailability of jobs generates a negative perception among TVET graduates (Gewe, 2009). Recent studies have linked the lack of employment opportunities for TVET graduates to the type of placement they get in colleges. Gewe (2009) argues that TVET colleges are not the appropriate platform for granting graduates the placement opportunities that fully prepare them for employment. Placement opportunities are the most important opportunity for the TVET graduates



to prove that they possess the required experience; but, as established by the study, the industry is currently sceptical about the capabilities of TVET programme.

The industry perceives TVET graduates as lacking in critical skills. In the research report 'How much does higher education enhance the employability of graduates?' by Mason *et al.*, (2003), the concept of employability centred on the development of communication, numeracy, information technology, and learning how to learn. Rothwell and & Arnold (2007) proposed an approach for understanding employability based on interrelated components that included wider contextual factors.

#### **4.6 Research question 3: Recommendations for TVETs training and preparations of students for job entry into the South African workplaces**

The participants gave their views regarding what could be done for TVET graduates to meet industry expectations. Firstly, they indicated that there is a need for a robust policy change.

If students are afforded the opportunity to debate and formulate their own work-based values while at college, when they are employed, they will be better equipped to achieve their potential by learning from, working with and relating on a personal level to other people at work. Accordingly, students need to become conscious of the workplace as a context where, in addition to the requisite knowledge, skills and competencies, the expression of particular work values is appreciated, not only by employers but by co-workers and supervisors. Achieving this would involve providing young people with the opportunity to digest the issues, understand values they do not necessarily subscribe to and, upon reasonable reflection, internalise values that will guide their choices and behaviour as individuals and as work-seekers.

An overwhelming majority of respondents proposed that legislation must ensure regular updates and reviews of the curriculum to improve the standard of vocational programmes. Industry involvement during the curriculum review process is a critical factor in ensuring responsiveness to industry needs, as indicated by one respondent:

*“Policies to ensure the regular revision of curricula to bring it in line with the needs of industry and the students. Look at admission requirements”.*

Another respondent wrote:

“A policy to ensure that the entire curriculum of the N4 - N6 programmes are reviewed and updated - funding, etc., must be allocated in the process must get started ASAP – that will only happen with a direct directive from the president (it seems!)”.

Yet another lecturer held the view that:

*“NCV requires three-yearly review and needs industry input in curriculum content and design”.*

One lecturer also proposed that policy changes were needed in terms of curriculum alignment. It was stated as follows:

*“...minimum pass percentages of vocational subjects should be aligned to matric subjects since both are pitched on the same national qualifications framework (NQF) level”.*

Legislation is thus required to regulate the articulation of college programmes between schools and TVETs. Another lecturer respondent also remarked:

*[We need] “[C]lear articulation from the school sector with recognised credit transfer and recognition of the qualifications for articulation into higher education”.*

In order to provide more time for learning and acquisition of skills, it is recommended that TVET institutions introduce part-time and foundation classes in collaboration with local businesses that can give employer input to the design of courses. In some courses, employers can have a supervisory role for project work, making comments and providing feedback to students. Still, there is limited involvement of them in assessing students. Unfortunately, not all academic staff interviewed saw the participation of employers in the course and curriculum design as desirable or appropriate.

*[This] TVET is an academic institution focusing on teaching and research. It's not a funded training ground for specific companies that we would allow them to drive our courses and diplomas as they would wish.*

Lecturer 5

Their approach, therefore, was 'employer informed' rather than 'employer-led, with the TVETs taking on board the insights, comments and suggestions of the employer representative groups but not necessarily allowing the employer to dictate and change TVET programmes. Lecturer 6 from the chosen departments elaborated on this:

*There is space for having a particular relationship with employers. However, it should be acknowledged that TVETs are different; they have various missions and brand themselves differently. Some are more academic, and some align themselves more to (vocationally-based approach) produce technical graduates. Therefore, it is to be expected that TVETs focus and do things differently.*

Despite the differing views regarding the role that business leaders should play; the study establishes that curriculum review is necessary to transform the employability of TVET graduates. Without the input of business players, the current trend where the institutions produce graduates whose skills and competencies do not match industry expectations may continue.

As one might expect, where TVETs courses were linked to particular professional qualifications such as Business Management, there appeared to be a far closer association between relevant professional and employer bodies. For example, lecturers from the Business and Management departments stressed that they were very much aware of the needs of the employers and had a clear picture of what is required of its graduates.

Therefore, the liaison between TVETs courses and the receiving industry was 'continuous' and 'interwoven' in this case. The labour representative opined that other than at the careers services level, there were rarely any approaches made to the industry from course leaders looking for partnerships and to reflect employers' needs in their courses. The Department of Labour Representative stated:

*I would say that is one thing that has always surprised me. We have taken in a number of intern students [on placements]. The contacts have all been done through [careers officer], but there has been no contact whatsoever from anyone from the courses. No one from the management or Engineering departments has ever approached us. They seem completely unaware of what the careers service is doing... There doesn't seem to be any contact with the subject leaders, and I find that a disappointment.*

According to the Industry representative, there is a need for imagination, initiative and flexibility concerning the design of more valuable and responsive higher education courses. Graduates and employers, in general, recognised that the universities were doing a very good job teaching theoretical content, but the actual experience was necessary across most courses to acquire a wider repertoire of employability skills and attributes.

The Career Development Officer felt TVETs could do more to prepare graduates for interviews in which they are able to sell their skills and employability: These views were echoed by Career Development Officer:

*The TVETs should be doing workshops on that. You rarely have to be interviewed to get into college now; therefore, students are not probably doing a formal interview until their first job interview, and they are falling flat on their faces. This is the first step in which the graduate is unable to market his/her employability according to the expectations of the industry.*

The service industry is particularly active in targeting TVETs to encourage recruitment and usually has relatively close links with careers services in South African TVETs institutions. This suggests that employers should also be more active in seeking partnerships with TVETs and exploring approaches to improve employability. For example, the labour representative stressed that industries were looking to work more closely with TVETs to help introduce a practice that promoted employability and skills relevant to their company and sector: Expressing industry expectations, the industry representative stated:

*[We don't shape the courses directly] No, not in the formal curricula, and I would say one of the areas we were working in a lot more is with the TVETs and departments trying to get across what we're looking for. One of the things we are going to do is to put in place consultants who are tasked purely with interfacing with TVETs. Some of that will be at fairs and all that sort of thing, but more in depth ... they will go and talk to departments, talk to people about what employability skills we need, [conduct] skills sessions etc.*

*We get a lot of approaches around research funding, but I would have expected more approaches from TVETs regarding industrial placements. I would expect universities to have a kind of industrial placement liaison officer if they do sandwich [courses], who would be ringing up people like ourselves saying “Do you have places and could you guarantee a number of places?”*

*and I would be quite happy to discuss that ... We had a very good relationship with one lecturer, and we built up that relationship, but he left, and nobody actually came in and replaced him.*

Some of the lecturers suggested that academic performance and esteem indicators were operating against efforts to develop links with businesses to promote employability. One lecturer said;

*I was being criticised for building links with industry rather than writing research papers. I haven't done enough research output and am being discriminated against for that, rather than recognising the links I am building up with the industry.*

Lecturers highlighted the importance of building relationships with key people in higher education in order to have an impact. Lecturer 1 stated:

*The industry sort of feels that they can dictate to us how things should run, whereas sometimes we feel it should be more of a two-way process. I think once you've got the relationship with the institutions, then it definitely works. Building up that relationship sometimes does take time, but I think from our perspective, we usually start at the beginning of the year. We've just had our careers services date, so we invite all of the career's services in from our prospective employers and basically let them know our strategy and what's going to be happening and what our strategy is. I think the more open we are with them, the better the relationship, and I think the more open they are with us, it's definitely the reverse. It's a growing relationship, and it's not something you can really walk into and just to be able to get them on your side straight away.*

While our research focus was on graduate employability, it was also stressed by the labour and TVET lecturers that the contribution of both primary and secondary education should not be underestimated in the development of employability skills. Lecturer 2 added:

*There is a big gap between the employer, further and higher education and schools. Job fairs are not the answer. It's more fundamental. There has to be input, and I lay the blame as much at employers' doors because they're only looking for what they need for that moment in time, not five/ten years down the road and in five/ten years, there is going to be panic for certain job placements because people won't be there.*

The recommendation suggested by the participants underscored the need for a seismic shift in the way TVET institutions are preparing students for employment by deepening collaborations with industry, widening the curriculum to increase more time for skills acquisitions, and providing internships in the industry.

## **Discussion**

The study recommended policy changes to ensure regular updates and reviews of all college programmes every three to five years. More substantial industry involvement during the curriculum review process and development of new curricula is a critical factor in ensuring responsiveness to industry and to uplift standards. These actions could improve opportunities for work place experience and job readiness of students, which could lead to future employment. Articulation of college programmes between college qualifications and school curriculum and between college qualifications and university qualifications should be strengthened by legislation and through stakeholder engagement in the review and development of curricula on both sides. Admission requirements should also be adjusted to be more programme specific and not generic for all programmes due to the inherent differences between programmes such as Engineering and Business. This is in line with the objectives of TVET to develop a stronger and more cooperative relationship between TVET training institutions and the workplace (Mabunda & Frick, 2020). A post-school education and training system helps respond to individual citizens and employers (Mabunda & Frick, 2020).

The participants recommended the role of internships be seriously considered. In South Africa SASSETA is a training authority established in terms of Section 9 of Skills Development Act, 1998 (Act No. 97 of 1998 as amended). SASSETA is mandated to

promote and facilitate skills development for the safety and security sector. The purpose of -integrated learning (WIL) is to improve employability and develop competence, i.e., the ability to apply knowledge and skills to the workplace demands. There was an indication that the TVETs were increasingly using placements and internships to provide students with valuable experience and skills. Internships were very popular with students. These internships varied in nature and duration and included 10-week internships, gap year placements and an eight-week programme of learning and development activities that links the students to local businesses and community organisations. This employability programme is aimed at providing employability skills training and work-based experiences to students and an opportunity for local SMEs, charities and community organisations to access expertise.

The current study established that employers hold a perception that TVET graduates are not fully prepared for industry expectations because they are not given adequate time for learning theory as well as an application. The TVET students are also not adequately exposed to potential employers who can monitor them. Assigning lecturers to monitor TVET institutions without the support and scrutiny of potential employers may not yield the desired result for the industry at large. The study recommends that lecturers and TVET institutions follow the recommendations by the DHET Research Agenda (DHET, 2014) to create partnerships between government departments and industry players and employment stakeholders. Partnerships of this nature are also supported by the South African Department of Trade (DTI), whose growth strategy is hinged on broadening participation, equity, and access to redressing poverty alleviation for all citizens (DTI, 2007).

#### **4.7 Chapter Summary**

This chapter has managed to discuss in detail all the findings to the study questions which were used in both the focus group discussions and the interviews. Taken from the perspective of Kotter (1995), it seems that the DHET lacks a leadership direction setting, and hence the TVET college sector still offers NATED programmes. Offering these outdated programmes appears to be a waste of public funds because students fail to find jobs due to the lack of industry-related skills and knowledge. They also battle to gain access to other institutions of higher education, such as universities (Branson,

Hofmeyr, Papier & Needham, 2015:46-48). Badroodien and Kraak (2006:20) confirm this statement and remark that "... there is a powerful sense of failure within the system with regard to the quality and relevance of FET programmes in inadequate preparation for higher levels of learning". They continue by stating that "... the technical and vocational training sector has failed to link many young learners to real employment prospects in the world of work, and it has also failed to provide a meaningful learning pathway for employed adult workers to return to formal study so as to improve their overall skills and competencies".

The scoping interviews with all the respondents established that employers and TVETs are seen as having a complementary role to play in developing graduate employability. Whereas TVETs can organise high-quality careers services and provide career advice, employers can offer relevant work placements to students to provide valuable experience to pick up additional skills and awareness of that type of work.



## CHAPTER 5

### 5.0 SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### 5.1 Summary

This chapter responds to the aim, research questions and main objectives of the study. After briefly summarising the previous chapters of the thesis, some conclusions will be drawn based on the study's findings. Then a number of recommendations shall be drawn from the conclusions, the implications of the research related to theory shall be given, and finally, a few limitations of the study will be pointed out.

The main objective of this study was to determine the main expectations that employers would be looking for from the new recruits/graduates. The expectations were associated with industry needs and the challenges that relate to internship and ultimate placement for new graduates.

Chapter 1 dealt with the introduction and background to the study and highlighted the research problem, research questions, research objectives and research methodology. It thus sought to problematise the apparent challenge of TVET graduate employability in the eyes of employer expectations. Finally, it presented the study's main objective, which is to analyse the expectations of the employers of TVET college graduates when they enter the world of employment. The chapter further objectified the challenges faced by TVET interns when they seek work-integrated learning and the proposed changes that should be implemented in the TVET training programmes to make the graduates employable. The need for guidelines for producing competent TVET graduates rise to the primary research question for the study, which was stated as: Are the TVET students' training programmes appropriate for job entry into the South African industries according to employer expectations? Subsequently, that been said, three major research questions have been identified in line with the objectives, thus:

1. What are the employer expectations from TVET college graduates?
2. What are the challenges experienced by TVET Interns?
3. What are TVET training recommendations for innovative learning and employment?

Chapter 2 addressed the main theoretical perspectives and concepts within the context of the TVET training programmes and the main expectations of the employers from TVET graduates. The study adopted human capital theory as a theoretical lens through which the study is embedded. Human capital theory (Becker, 1993) which assumes the positive relationship between education and training and workers' productivity and lifetime income, has been considered one of the main theories that support education's economic thought. Especially, the human capital theory has been proven in its impact on education and return of investment in under-developing countries and East-Asian countries that experienced rapid economic growth. The human capital theory has influenced and shaped education and training systems across the globe. The chapter further presented the expectations of the industry in terms of skills and attributes from graduates seeking employment after completing their studies.

A broad conceptual understanding was developed regarding the key concepts of TVET education and employability, vocational training and education, graduate employability and skills, and the role of TVETs in the context of human development. This included an emphasis on the need for TVET programmes that are designed to produce the appropriate type of graduates for the industry. Moreover, better comprehension was promoted off the fact that a combination and integration of TVETs and industry might better bring out what is desirable to both stakeholders in the study context. The study further discussed the concept of -integrated learning, described here as an internship in developing TVET graduates and preparing them for employment. Chapter 2 thus mainly addressed important sub-themes as represented by the objectives of the study.

Chapter 3 outlined the research methodology that applied to the study. The research design for this study is the case study. A specific TVET college was identified, and its faculties/departments were used to gain data for the study. A case study is one of the most frequently used designs for qualitative research methodologies. The researcher used a multi-case study approach because the same case would be applied to Motheo TVET College on different campuses. The focus of the study was directed toward the following campuses, Botshabelo, Thabanchu, Hillside view, and Bloemfontein

campus. This study found a multi-case study to be relevant because it was able to explore in-depth knowledge of how the TVET students could be trained and prepared for job entry in Motheo District, Free State province.

The qualitative approach was found appropriate for this study since it enabled the researcher to obtain detailed descriptions in the form of words through interaction with TVET College students and lecturers in their natural context. The researcher's decision to utilise the qualitative research approach was based on the understanding of how TVET students are trained and prepared for job entry in the South African corporate industries. Creswell (2009: 193) also states that qualitative research refers to a methodology in which researchers explore and understand the meaning that individuals or groups attribute to a social problem. The population of the study incorporated students, lecturers, career development officers and labour representatives. In summary, the sample included (09) nine students from the TVET college campuses, doing N6 Marketing Management, N6 Business Management, N6 Human Resource Management, and N6 Educare Management. All students were at the exit level as they were more affected by job entry and unemployment statistics. The second group of participants was the Career Development Officer (CDO's), who is knowledgeable about the policies and placements of students in different jobs, eight (8) academic staff who teach the TVET students daily and lastly, a specialist from the Department of Labour.

Chapter 4 followed up on all the research questions with their sub-questions and expressed in the attached Appendix A. The chapter presented the views of the students and staff regarding the expectations of the industry from TVET graduates and what they all believed were desirable attributes for graduates to seek employment. There were a lot of agreements between the lecturers, students and career experts on most of the skills appropriate for employability. The question of expectations was focussing on what constitutes employability in TVET graduates. A study on employability defined employability skills as Positive attitude, Self-management, Team working, Business and customer awareness, Problem-solving, Communication and literacy, Application of numeracy and Application of information technology. The expectations, as listed and summarised from all the respondents, incorporated the following;

- The student's academic performance and engagement in his/her studies
- The student's confidence in his/ her skills and abilities
- The student's ambition
- The student's perception of the strength of the TVET brand
- The reputation the student's TVET has within his/her field of study
- The status and credibility of the student's field of study
- The student's awareness of opportunities in the job market
- The student's perception of the state of the job market
- The employer's demand for graduates in the student's subject field

The chapter also summarised the challenges that students face when seeking an internship. The challenges were quite broad, but a summary is given as lack of liaison between the TVETs and the employers, reluctance on the part of the employer in engaging TVETs because of the stigma they have, and poor infrastructure at TVETs, which makes them less competitive as compared to universities, and so on.

In the 3<sup>rd</sup> theme, responses emerged which showed that TVETs require a serious revamp in their overall operation plan, including its curriculum and the qualifications of the lecturers. TVET systems worldwide are fundamentally shaped and judged by the effectiveness of their articulation with the world of work, on the one hand, and the extent to which they grant meaningful access to further and higher learning, on the other. In South Africa, the current TVET system has failed on both counts.

## **5.2 Conclusions**

From the study's findings and in line with the major themes formed out of the research question, three major conclusions were derived for this study.

### **5.3.1 Conclusion 1**

The expectations of the students and the staff were not very different. The lecturers and the industry experts gave more on the list of expectations from graduates when they enter the industry whilst the student had fewer. The students had fewer

expectations for the mere reason that they have never entered the place of work to see how much is expected of them. While there were variations in the classification of employability, there was a broad understanding of what qualities, characteristics, skills and knowledge constitute employability both in general and specifically for graduates. When compared between employers and the academic staff, Employers expect graduates to have technical and discipline competencies from their diploma but require graduates to demonstrate a range of broader skills and attributes that include team-working, communication, leadership, critical thinking, problem-solving, etc. managerial abilities.

The findings also concluded that specific definitions are less important than an agreed focus on approaches to promote such expected skills and fostering attributes that enable graduates to find appropriate employment, progress in their work, and thus facilitate their success.

### **5.2.2 Conclusion 2**

The second conclusion is based on the 2<sup>nd</sup> major theme concerning the challenges experienced by TVET Interns. Perhaps and above all, the literature and our study findings have overwhelmingly highlighted that employers, students, graduates and TVET representatives value work-integrated learning (such as placements and internships) as particularly effective approaches to promote the employability of graduates. This needed to be the starting point before looking at the challenges, and that they all agreed it was important to further check on the challenges.

It was agreed that placements and internships not only offer an effective applied method of inculcating appropriate awareness, skills and abilities in graduates but can also promote productive collaboration and partnerships between TVETs and employers, building greater understanding between the stakeholders. The importance of placements and internships has been recognised by both government and industry policymakers but has not been supported by funding, and their value is therefore not quickly recognisable.

Within this same theme, it can also be concluded that beneficial partnerships have not been established between TVET institutions and employers. This has meant that the industry ended up focusing elsewhere on manpower development and funding. It was also concluded that attempts to form partnerships between institutions and employers

were always half-hearted such that no tangible results were registered to the disadvantage of the students. The loser has always been the graduates of these TVDET institutions, and the stigma continues.

### **5.2.3 Conclusion 3**

The third and last conclusion was based on the 3<sup>rd</sup> research question; what are TVET training recommendations for innovative learning and employment?

Many TVET programmes seem to lack credibility and are tainted with a poor public image. This situation is worsened by the poor articulation opportunities of TVET college graduates to find employment or enter higher education programmes. Badroodien and Kraak (2006:20) posit that the significance of the TVET band lies in the coherence of its four subsystems and its external linkages to higher learning and work.

The main conclusion in this regard, as revealed through respondents' findings, was that there is a lack of trust in the programmes and programme structure in TVET systems. The curriculum and the qualifications of the lecturing staff came under serious scrutiny. As a result, recommendations pointed towards revamping these two crucial pointers: the curriculum and staff qualifications.

## **5.3 Recommendations**

The economic context and labour market situation have seen an increase in graduate unemployment, and these issues, along with the ever-present challenge of global economic competition, mean that institutions cannot be complacent about the capacity of graduates to secure and maintain employment. It also means they cannot afford to ignore the development of graduates within a particular job and have the ability to move on to new sustainable employment if required. With this in mind, the findings of this research give rise to a number of issues for consideration under recommendations.

### **5.3.1 Recommendation 1**

Employability measures need to be systematic and embedded into departmental and faculty practice: otherwise, they are vulnerable to changes in personnel.

Technical and Vocational Training colleges should consider ways of reflecting and promoting the employability skills and attributes in funding mechanisms such as the research excellence frameworks. According to the findings, not much funding has placed employability at the centre of TVET's vision and strategic planning, and this seems certain to have influenced their behaviour. Funding streams, therefore, need to encourage an institutional culture supportive of employability skills. This could, perhaps, be matched by a parallel measure of the demonstrable benefits of TVETs' efforts to develop and support students' employability.

Developing graduate employability skills and attributes should be included in TVETs' strategic and faculty/departmental level planning. Colleges need to reflect the promotion of employability skills and attributes in their mission statements, learning and teaching strategies, course frameworks, strategic documents and practical guidance.

Employability also needs to be supported at the senior management level in TVETs and reflected in policies that are translated into action across all levels. The research findings reveal that while TVET careers development services will typically seek to promote students' employability, the scope and depth of such efforts varies greatly across faculties and departments. A factor in this is the attitude of some staff to explicitly address employability skills and attributes in their courses.

Staff should be encouraged to recognise that these objectives are compatible with promoting academic capacity and wider life skills. Appropriate incentives for TVET staff should be used as a driver for change in promoting employability measures at the faculty/ departmental level.

### **5.3.2 Recommendation 2**

TVETs and employers should continue to promote and expand opportunities for students to access work-based learning. One of the most crucial measures TVETs can adopt to promote employability is to include appropriate integrated placements, internships and work-based learning opportunities of significant duration into their courses. Some of the more 'vocational' and business-orientated courses already make

use of these approaches, but they should be sustained through visible working systems coordinated from the office of career development.

These experiential opportunities require careful planning, and time for reflection must be built-in if they are to be an effective way of providing TVET students with relevant employment skills, knowledge and awareness of employer expectations. They also call for effective, sustained and equitable partnerships between TVETs and employers.

Other systematic programmes to develop and accredit or recognise students' experiential and work-related learning are recommended. For example, the presence of graduate award programmes across many faculties of the TVET appears to be highly valued by graduates and employers. These programmes are seen as valuable because they facilitate students' access to work-related learning activities while still at college and work-based opportunities such as placements. However, placements and work integrated and work-based experiences need to be documented so that students can offer employers evidence of their capacities and skills

### **5.3.3 Recommendation 3.**

The main recommendation in this section is the revisit and revamp the TVET curriculum. In terms of curriculum content and design, the study clearly indicated that current curricula, especially the National Accredited Technical Education (NATED) Report 191 Engineering and Report 191 Business and General Studies, are outdated and need to be replaced with new and industry responsive qualifications. One may also conclude that the National Certificate Vocational (NCV) qualifications require revision and that curriculum leadership is needed in this respect. The study also indicated that some of the unit standards linked to occupational programmes are in need of revision, coupled with the current fragmented curriculum, which lacks coherence and appropriate knowledge components.

One may also conclude that improved vertical articulation possibilities between TVET and higher education programmes may require more urgent and substantial leadership in the TVET sector. This issue of poor articulation options may be addressed by developing one curriculum in conjunction with the higher education sector, which could better provide for student articulation, as well as by developing the



second curriculum in collaboration with industries from the various sectors of the economy that will path directly into the workplace. One cannot but conclude further that higher education institutions (such as universities of technology) probably need to be more sensitive to invest in new programmes that might broaden access for TVET college students to enter into higher certificates and diplomas.

Another critical conclusion that emerged stems from the poor academic qualifications of students entering into the high cognitive of vocational education programmes, which is a consequence of poor outcomes of basic education. It further seems that, based on the results of the study, a parallel- or two-stream curriculum may better address current and future TVET training needs. However, pertinent curriculum leadership will be needed to encourage this. Different pathways can be designed through which a dual system is instituted where training is conducted in both the workplace and the vocational school. Upon completion of their training in the dual system, the majority of participants take up employment as skilled workers, and after a while, many of them may make use of the opportunities for continuing vocational training, which can be obtained even from some universities that cater for vocational directed diplomas and degrees.

#### **5.4 Focus for further study**

The study pointed toward a number of possible future research topics that could add further value to this research. However, the topics are not limited to those suggested.

Studies in TVET colleges within the other eight provinces of South Africa should be considered. This could add value to the verification, credibility, and expansion of TVET and employer partnership for graduate employability. Such studies can also provide the need for a framework for facilitating curriculum change. The extension of the research to other provinces could ensure general support and acceptance of the need for such a framework and can strengthen the approval process for such a development by the relevant authorities.

On another level, further studies can also be done on the influence of TVET students in seeking placement/internship programmes within each TVET college in the rest of the South African Provinces. The results of such a study could influence the level and type of initiatives that each TVET would put in place to cater for its graduates at the

exit for each level and to ensure employability. That could lead to increased student success rates, career paths and articulation opportunities to higher education programmes or the work place.

In the third instance, further studies can be done in the area of TVDET graduate influence and the stigma associated with its products. Studying its impact on the South African economy should be investigated so that the value is ascertained and improvements are decided accordingly. Proper monitoring and evaluation of programmes could provide a return on investment since millions of rands are invested by the government on an annual basis to produce these TVET college graduates.

The current experience and view of the industry regarding TVET college programme offerings and graduates in their employment also need investigation. The results of the proposed future research could provide an insight into the needs of the industry that should be incorporated into the curriculum to ensure programme responsiveness, as well as enhancement of industry involvement and possible student employability and work readiness opportunities.

## **5.5. Conclusion**

The study's main objective was to determine the main expectations that employers would be looking for from the new recruits/graduates. The expectations were associated with industry needs and the challenges that relate to internship and ultimate placement for new graduates. In addition, the study managed to look at the challenges that students encounter when they seek internship opportunities in order to enhance their work experience. As its main contribution, the study postulates a better understanding of vocational and occupational training in general. More specifically, it highlighted key factors that can be sought to improve the graduates' employability in the increasing context of economic hardships. It is hoped that this study will make some modest contribution to research into the TVET college sector and its relationship with the employer, in particular in the Free State but also in South Africa at large.

## REFERENCES

- Adams, M. 2013. Personal Interview. E.I.P. Programme Coordinator. Environmental Resource Management Department. Pretoria: Van Schaik.
- Amoako, G. 2011. Application of Frederick Herzbergs Two- Factor Theory in Assessing & Understanding Employee Motivation at Work: A Ghanaian Perspective. *European Journal of Business & Management*, 3(9):2.
- Anane, C. (2013). Competency Based Training: Quality Delivery for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Institutions. *Educational Research International*. 2(2)
- Ashton, D. & Green, F. 1996. *Education, training and the global economy*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.
- Badroodien, A. & Kraak, A. 2006. *Building FET College responsiveness: The role of linkages and programmes*. Pretoria: Department of Education, Science and Skills Development.
- Bakah, M.A., Voogt, J.M. & Pieters, J.M. (2012). Professional development needs of polytechnic lecturers in a curriculum reform scenario. *International Journal of Training and Development*, 16:67-76.
- Baptiste, I., 2001, 'Educating lone wolves: Pedagogical implications of human capital theory', *Adult Education Quarterly* 3(55), 184–201. <https://doi.org/10.1177/074171360105100302>
- Barnes. C.F. (2004). The transformation of Technical Colleges into Further Education. *African Journal for Work-Based Learning*.3(1).
- Bartkus, K.R., & Stull, W.A. (1997). Some thoughts about research in co-op. *Journal of Cooperative Education*, 32(2), 7-16.
- Basow, R.R. & Byrne, M.V. 1993. Internship expectations and learning goals. *Journalism Educator*, 47(4):48-54.
- Bedürftig, M., Hieronimus, S. & Klier, J. (2015). *How business and government can bring young people into work*. McKinsey and Company: Public Sector.
- Becker, G. 1993. *Human Capital, 3rd edition*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Benoot, C., Hannes, K and Bilsen, J. (2016). The use of purposeful sampling in a qualitative evidence synthesis: A worked example on sexual adjustment to a cancer trajectory. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 16(21): 2-12.
- Blom, R. (2013). Editorial Comment. The Southern African Society for Co-operative Education. *The African Journal for Work-Based Learning. Work-Integrated Learning and Employability, Inaugural Edition* 1(1), vii-x.
- Bloom, B.S. (1956). *Taxonomy of educational objectives. The classification of educational objectives. Handbook 1: Cognitive domain*. New York: David Mckay.

- Bodkin, P. (2017). At-risk youth may be 'unemployable' after recession. *The journal.ie*. Wednesday 11 July, 2018.
- Bradley, K. (2014). Quasi-experiment Advantages and Disadvantages. Available at: [http://www.ehow.com/info\\_8614272\\_quasiexperiment-advantages-disadvantages.html](http://www.ehow.com/info_8614272_quasiexperiment-advantages-disadvantages.html).
- Braun, V. and Clarke, V. (2019). Reflecting on reflexive thematic analysis. *Qualitative Research in Sport, Exercise and Health*, 11 (4): 589-597.
- Brown, L. (2007). Virtual spaces for innovative pedagogical actions: Education, technology, and globalization. In M. W. Kenway, & M. Singh, *Globalizing education. Policies, pedagogies, & politics* (pp. 171-189). New York: Peter Lang.
- Brown, P., Green, and Lauder, H., 2000, *High skills: Globalization, competitiveness and skill formation*, Oxford University Press, New York.
- Chambers, S. (2015). Library and information science internship. The trustees of Indiana University. Available at: <https://soic.iupui.edu/careers/internships/lis-internships>. Accessed on 24/05/2019.
- Chonco, L. & Folscher, E. (2006). *Skills development Practice made Easy: Education, training & Development guidelines and resources*. Randburg: Knowres Publishing.
- Clarke, L. & Winch, C. (2007). *Vocational Education (International Approaches, Developments and Systems)*. London: Routledge.
- Cleary, M., Flynn, R. & Thomasson, S. (2006). *Employability skills: From framework to practice*. Melbourne: Commonwealth of Australia. Department of Higher Education and Training. 2011. National Qualification Framework. Pretoria: Government Printers.
- Coll, R.K. & Zegwaard, K.E. (2011). The integration of knowledge in co-operative and work-integrated education programs. In R.K. Coll & K.E. Zegwaard (Eds.). *International handbook for cooperative and work-integrated education: International perspectives of theory research and practice* (2nd ed., pp. 297-304). Lowell, M.A: World Association for Co-operative Education.
- Creswell, J.W. (2014). *A Concise Introduction to Mixed Methods Research*. United States of America: Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J.W. and Poth, C.N. (2018). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design Choosing among Five Approaches*. 4th Edition, SAGE Publications, Inc., Thousand Oaks.
- Crossman, A. 2020. *Understanding Purposive Sampling: An Overview of The Method and Its Applications*, s.l.: Thought.Co.
- Daniel, R. (2010). Career development and creative arts students: An investigation into the effectiveness of career theory and WIL experiences on practice. *Australian Journal of Career Development*, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/103841621001900203>.

Dasmani, A. (2011). Challenges facing technical institute graduates in practical skills acquisition in the upper east region of Ghana. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Cooperative Education*, 12(2):67–77.

Dean, B.A., Sykes, C., Agostinho, S. & Clements, M. (2012) Reflective Assessment in Work Integrated Learning: To Structure or Not to Structure, That Was Our Question, *Asia-Pacific Journal of Co-operative Education*, 13 (2),103-113.

Department of Education (DoE). (1997). *Report of the National Committee on Further Education. A framework for the transformation of Further Education and Training in South Africa*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Department of Higher Education and Training. 2012. Green Paper for Post-School Education and Training. Pretoria: Department of Higher Education and Training.

DHET (Department of Higher Education and Training). (2014). DHET Research Agenda together, turning every workplace into a training space. Pretoria.

DHET. (2013). *White-Paper for Post-School Education and Training - Building and Expanded, Effective and Integrated Post-School System*. Pretoria: Department of Higher Education and Training.

DHET. (2016). [www.dhet.gov.za](http://www.dhet.gov.za). Retrieved from [www.dhet.gov.za](http://www.dhet.gov.za): <http://www.dhet.gov.za/SiteAssets/Latest%20News/August%202016/The%20National%20Artisan%20Development%20Strategy%20Consultative%20Roadshows-1.pdf>.

Du Toit, R. (2003). *Unemployed youth in South Africa: Distressed generation? Paper presented at the Minnesota International Counselling Institute (MICI)*. 27 July – 1 August 2003.

Engelbrecht, L. V. (2003). Best practice of co-operative education. NRF Project Ref.: 15/1/5/2/000 44.

*Framework revised, January 2013, approved by the Minister of Higher Education and Training (Notice 1040 of 2012; Government Gazette No. 36003 of 14 December 2012)*. Pretoria: Government Gazette.

Fry, H., Ketteridge, S., & Marshall, S. (Eds.) (2000). *A handbook for teaching & learning in Higher Education. Enhancing academic practice*. London: Kogan Page Limited.

Gamble, J. (2003). *Curriculum Responsiveness in TVET Colleges*. Pretoria: Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) Press.

Garcia, J.G. 2008. Practice and academy, or working as learning: Internship course at the Universitat de Barcelona LIS Faculty. Challenges for the New Information Professional.

Gault, J., Leach, E. & Duey, M. 2010. Effects of business internships on job marketability: The employers' perspective. *Education+ Training*, 52(1):76-88.

Geertsema, A.J; Hendrick, R.M. & Groenewald, T. (2010). Cooperative education. Learning in Vivo. Retrieved May 5, 2021, from [www.psychsoma.co.za/learning\\_in\\_vivo/cooperative\\_education/](http://www.psychsoma.co.za/learning_in_vivo/cooperative_education/)

Gelb, M.J. & Caldicott, S.M. (2007). Thomas Edison's Secrets for Creating Innovative Leaders. Innovate Like Edison: "The Success System of America's Greatest Inventor."  
91.2045/lisatty9442/TU91\_2045\_innovate\_like\_edison\_preview.pdf

Gewer, A. (2009). Features of social capitals that enhance the employment outcomes of FET college learners. Available at: <https://accounts.google.com/Login?>> [Accessed: 12 September 2021]

Govender, C. & Taylor, S. (2013). Education and Training for Workplace: Workplace Readiness Skills. *The African Journal for Work-Based Learning*, 1(1), 14-22.

Green, M.E. 1997. Internship success. Real-world, step-by-step advice on getting the most out of internships. Chicago, IL: VGM Career Horizons.

Grey, JR., Grove, SK., Sutherland, S. 2016. *Burns and grove's the practice of nursing research appraisal, synthesis and generation of evidence*. 8<sup>th</sup> Edition. St. Louis: Elsevier.

Griesel, H. & Parker, B. 2009. Graduate Attributes: A baseline study on South African Graduates from the perspective of employers. Pretoria: Higher Education South Africa and South African Qualification Authority.

Gryn, M. 2010. The relationship between emotional intelligence and job performance of call centre leaders. Unpublished Master's Dissertation, Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Harms, P.D. & Credé, M. (2010). Remaining Issues in Emotional Intelligence Research: Construct Overlap, Method Artifacts, and Lack of Incremental Validity. *Industrial and Organizational Psychology: Perspectives on Science and Practice*, 3(2):154- 158.

Harry, T., Chinyamurindi, W. T & Mjoli, T. (2018). Perceptions of factors that affect employability amongst a sample of final year students at a rural South African university. *South Africa Journal of Industrial Psychology*, 44(1):1–10.

Hay, M. (2002). Strategies for survival in the war of talent, *Career Development International*, 6:52-55.

Heflin, K.L. & Thau, D.D. (1999). Workplace bias: The skills employers want Alexandria, VA: American Society for Training and Development. Ames, IA: Iowa State University Library. ERIC Document Reproduction Service, No.ED 298 463.

Heinemann, H.N., Defalco, A.A. & Smelkinson, M. (1992). Work experience enriched learning. *Journal of Cooperative Education*, 28:17-33.

Henderson, A. & Trede, F. (2017). Strengthening Attainment of Student Learning Outcomes During Work Integrated Learning: A Collaborative Government Framework Across Academia, Industry and Students. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Cooperative Education*, 18(1), pp.73-80.

Higher Education and Training. (2016). *Skills supply and demand in South Africa*. HSRC: Labour Market Intelligence Partnership (LMIP).

Hirschsohn, P. 2008. Regulating the Animal Spirits of Entrepreneurs. Skills Development in South African Small & Medium Enterprises. *International Small Business Journal*, 26(2):18.

Ho, H. & Keese, M. (2018). How education can meet the needs of the workplace. Online

<https://www.thoughtco.com/methodology/qualitative-qualitative-research> [Accessed 16 June 2021].

Hulley, S.B., Cummings, S.R., Browner, W.S., Grady, D.G. & Newman, T.B. (2013). *Designing Clinical Research*: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.

Human Resource Development Council for South Africa (HRDC). (2014). *TVET colleges in South Africa: Pathways workstream*. South Africa: HRDC.

Hunt, J. (2016). Why do Women Leave Science and Engineering? *ILR Review*, 69(1), pp.199-226. Jackson, D. (2013). Contribution of WIL to Undergraduate Employability. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Cooperative Education*, 14(2), 99-115.

International Labour Office. (2010). *A Skilled Workforce for Strong, Sustainable & Balanced Growth: A G20 Strategy*. Geneva: Switzerland.

Jackson, R., Drummond, D. K. and Sakile, C. (2017). What is Qualitative Research? *Qualitative Research Reports in Communication*, 3(2):21-28.

Johari, A. & Bradshaw, A.C. (2008). Project-based learning in an internship program: A qualitative study of related roles and their motivational attributes. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 56(3), 329-359.

Khalil, O.E. (2015). Students' experiences with the business internship program at Kuwait University. *The International Journal of Management Education*, 13(3):202-217.

Knight, K. (2008). Global workforce development through business internship program: Kevin's company at Kanda University of International Studies. *The Journal of Kanda University of International Studies*, 20:207-234.

Kolb, D. (1984). *Experiential learning: experience as the source of learning and development*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Kraak, A. & Hall, G. 1999. *Transforming further education and training in South Africa*. Pretoria: Human Sciences Research Council.

- Kraak, A., Jewison, R., Pillay, P., Chidi, M., Bhagwan, N. & Makgolane, M. (2013). *Review of the Current Skills Development System and Recommendations towards the Best Model for Delivering Skills in the Country*. Skills System Review Task Team. Report for Human Resource Development Council South Africa.
- Kraak, A., Paterson, A. & Boka, K. (2016). *Change Management in TVET Colleges: Lessons Learnt from the Field of Practice*. Cape Town: African Minds.
- Kruss, G. (2004). Employment and employability: Expectations of higher education responsiveness in South Africa, *Journal of Education Policy*, 19:673-689.
- Legoabe, R.S. (2010). An impact assessment of the Development Bank of Southern Africa/ South African Local Government Association ICT internship programme: Case study. Mini-dissertation. Available at: <https://vtechworks.lib.vt.edu/bitstream/handle/10919/71530/481>.
- Levine, M.F. & Guy, P.W. (2007). Activity based learning in a freshman global business course: Analyses of preferences and demographic differences. *Journal of College Teaching & Learning*, 4(8):27-38.
- Lowden, K., Hall, S., Elliot, D. & Lewin, J. (2011). *Employers Perceptions of Employability Skills of New Graduates*. London: Edge Foundation.
- Mabunda, N. O., & Frick, L. (2020). Factors that influence the employability of National Certificate (Vocational) graduates: The case of a rural TVET college in the Eastern Cape province, South Africa. *Journal of Vocational, Adult and Continuing Education and Training*, 3(1), 20.
- Maclean, R. and Lai, A. 2011. Future of Technical and Vocational Education and Training: Global Challenges and Possibilities. *International Journal of Training Research*, 9, 2-15.
- Magnus, P. (1888). *Industrial Education*. London: Kegan, Paul, Trench & Co.
- McGrath, S. 2005. "Building a Quality College Sector for the Twenty-first Century." *Southern African Review of Education* 9: 21–44
- Marope, P., Chakroun, B., & Holmes, K. (2015). *Unleashing the Potential*:
- Martin, A., & Fleming, J. (2010). *Cooperative education in outdoor education*. *Australian Journal of Outdoor Education, African Journal for Work-Based Learning*.3(1). Published by the Southern African Society for Cooperative Education.
- Martin, M. (2015). Enhancing best practice in co-operative and work-integrated education. Massey University, New Zealand.
- Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative Researching*. London, Thousand Oaks,
- McConnell (2009) youth and employment: *An analysis of South African government youth policy with a focus on eThekweni Municipality, Submission of thesis for a Master's Degree* Durban: University of KwaZulu Natal.



- McGrath, S. 2015. *Understanding interactive capabilities for skills development in sectoral*
- Middleton, F. 2019. Reliability and validity: What is the difference? Scribbr. <https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/reliability-vs-validity/> [Accessed 15 June 2021].
- Moletsane, A. (2013). Work Integrated Learning (WIL) Stakeholder Expectations in the Hospitality Industry. Co-operative Education Department. (Unpublished Report). Vaal University of Technology, South Africa
- Moletsane, A. and Moloi, C. K. 2015. *Application of academic learning. In: Brink, R.ed. The*
- Musungwini T, 2017. An Investigation into the Human Resource Capacity needs to facilitate learner support of Work Integrated Learning at a University of Technology. A Case Study of the Durban University of Technology. PhD Thesis, Durban University of Technology.
- National Planning Commission 2011. *National Development Plan 2030. Our future – make it work. Executive Summary. Pretoria: Government Printer. ISBN 978-0621-40475-3. RP270/201.*
- Neumann, W. F. (2000). *Social research methods: Qualitative and quantitative approaches. (4th Ed.)*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- OECD. (2014). *A Skills beyond School Review of South Africa*. OECD Publishing.
- Okello-Obura, C. & Kigongo-Bukeny, I.M.N. 2011. Library and Information Science Education and Training in Uganda: Trends, Challenges, and the Way Forward. *Education Research International*, 1-9. doi:10.1155/2011/705372.
- O'Neill, L. 2013. *Personal Interview. E.I.P. Service Provider. Environmental Resource Management Department*. Pretoria: Van Schaik.
- Orgill, C. 2007. The Implementation of Skills-Legislation in the Western Cape: A Case Study of the Naval Dockyard Simons Town. *Master's Thesis. Bellville: University of the Western Cape*.
- Oyedele, J.F. 1995. Cooperative work experience programmes for youths in business. *Business Education Journal*. 2(2):30-50.
- Papier, J., Needham, S. and McBride, T. 2012. Contemporary Issues in Public FET Colleges. Cape Town: Human Sciences Research Council, Labour Market Intelligence Partnership.
- Parliamentary Monitoring Group (PMG). (2016). *Technical & Vocational Education and Training (TVET) & Community Education & Training (CET) sectors*. DHET: [Higher Education and Training](#).
- Paterson, R. (2017). Lecturer and student perceptions of employability skills at a transnational university. *Qualitative Research in Education*, 6(3):241–275.

Petersen, I.H. (2015). *Understanding interactive capabilities for Skills development in sectoral systems of innovation: a case study of the sugarcane growing and milling sector in KwaZulu-Natal*. LMIP Report 8. Retrieved from [www.lmip.org.za](http://www.lmip.org.za)

Pittendrigh, A. (1988). *Technikons in South Africa*, Building Industries Federation of South Africa. South Africa: Halfway House.

Pulla, V and Carter, E. (2018). Employing interpretivism in social work research. *International Journal of Social Work and Social and Human Service Practice*, 6(1):9-14.

Rahman, A.I.M., Khatun, M. & Mezbah-ul-Islam, M. (2008). Library education in Bangladesh: Strengths, problems, and suggestions. *Library Philosophy and Practice*

Reddy, V., Bhorat, H., Powell, M., Visser, M. and Arends, A. (2016). *Skills Supply and Demand in South Africa*, LMIP Publication, Human Sciences Research Council, Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa, Department of Higher Education and Training, (2013). *White paper for post-school education and training. Building an expanded, effective and integrated post-school system*. Department of Higher Education and Training, Pretoria, South Africa.

Roller, M.R and Lavrakas, P.J. (2015). *Applied qualitative research design; a total quality framework approach*. New York, NY: Guilford Press.

Rothman, M. & Sisman, R. (2016). Internship impact on career consideration among business students. *Education+ Training*, 58(9):1003-1013.

Sharma, G. (2017). Pros and cons of different sampling techniques. *International Journal of Applied Research*, 3(7): 749-752.

Sileyew, K. J. (2019). Research design and methodology. *Intechopen*. 85731. <https://www.intechopen.com/books/cyberspace/research-design-and-methodology> [Accessed 26 May 2021].

Silverman, D. 2006. What Counts as qualitative research? Some cautionary comments. *Qualitative sociology Review*, 9 (2): 48-55

Siriwardene, P.L. & Qureshi, M.A. (2009). TVET in the Asian region: Issues, concerns and prospects. *International Handbook of Education for the Changing World of Work*. Dordrecht: Springer.

Smith, J. and Noble, H. 2014. Issues of validity and reliability bias in research. *Evidence Based Nursing*, 18 (2)

South Africa. (2011). *National Skills Development Strategy III (2011-2016)*. Progress Report 2011 – 2013. A skilled and capable workforce that shares in, and contributes to, the benefits and opportunities of economic expansion and an

- inclusive growth path. Pretoria: Government Printer. Stats SA. (2012). Unemployment rises to 25.2%. SAnews.gov.za, 8 May 2012. Statistics SA: Pretoria.
- South African Democratic Teachers' Union, 2011. *The impact of academic development programmes on the performance of lecturers in the classroom at public further education and training colleges*. Retrieved from <http://www.sadtu.org.za/>, January 2021.
- Statistics South Africa (Stats SA). 2012. Employment, unemployment, skills and economic growth. Available at: [https://www.statssa.gov.za/presentation/Stats%20SA%20presentation%20on%20skills%20and%20unemployment\\_16%20September.pdf](https://www.statssa.gov.za/presentation/Stats%20SA%20presentation%20on%20skills%20and%20unemployment_16%20September.pdf).
- Steph, M., Ger, P., Gaast, K., Keestra, M and Koenders, L. 2021. Making a research instrument. Chapters on Interdisciplinary research and research skills. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University press. pp.127-137.
- Taherdoost, H. 2016. Sampling methods in research methodology: How to choose a sampling technique for research. *International Journal of Academic Research in Management (IJARM)*, 5:18-27.
- Taylor, N., 2011. *Priorities for addressing South Africa's education and training crisis. A review commissioned by the National Planning Commission*. Retrieved from <http://www.jet.org.za/>, March 2014.
- Taylor, S. & Govender, C. (2013). Education and training for the workplace: workplace-readiness skills. The Southern African Society for Co-operative Education. The African Journal for Work-Based Learning. Work-Integrated Learning and Employability, Inaugural Edition, 1(1), 14-22.
- Taylor, S. & Govender, C. (2013). Towards a work- integrated learning partnership model for higher education and industry – a human resource-management pilot project. <http://www.waceinc.org/durban2013/Refereed%20Papers/South%20Africa/Susanne%20Taylor%20Cookie%20Govender%20University%20of%20Johannesburg.pdf>
- The New Partnership for Africa's Development NEPAD. (2016). *African Skills Portal for Youth Employment and Entrepreneurship (ASPYEE)*. South Africa. NEPAD.
- Thomas, M. (2016). Community college education abroad and business internship programs cultivation of competency in communicating, collaborating, and critical thinking? *International Education at Community Colleges* (pp. 323-335). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Toner, P. (2011). Tradespeople and technicians in innovation. In *Fostering enterprise: the innovation and skills nexus –research readings*, edited by Penelope Curtin, John Stanwick and Francesca Beddie, Australia, National Centre for Vocational Education Research (NCVER). Retrieved from <http://www.ncver.edu.au/publications/2367.html>

- Transforming Technical and Vocational Education and Training*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Tygerburger. (2013). An Outstanding Intern. Tygerburger-Bellville. Online Available.
- Van der Bijl, A. & Taylor, V. (2016). Nature and dynamics of industry-based workplace learning for South African TVET lecturers. *Industry & Higher Education*,
- Van Wyk AE (2009). *Challenges faced by a rural FET college: A case study of a FET college in northern KwaZulu-Natal. Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the Master's degree*. South Africa: University of Kwa-Zulu Natal.
- Velez, G. & Giner, G. (2015). Effects of business internships on students, employers, and higher education institutions: A systematic review. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 52(3):121-130.
- Wedekind, V. (2008). *Report on the research on Further Education and Training (FET) Colleges in South Africa*. Pietermaritzburg, South Africa: University of KwaZulu-Natal.
- Wheeler, A. (2015). *Central University of Technology students' perceptions of work integrated learning: An interactive qualitative analysis*. In: Brink, R. Ed. *The African Journal for Work-Based Learning*.39(1). Published by the Southern African Society for Cooperative Education.
- Ziderman, A. (1997). National programmes in Technical and Vocational Education: Economic and Education Relationships. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 49(3): 351-366.
- Zikmund, W.G. 2003. *Business Research Methods*. Bangalore: Thomson Learning Inc. Eastern Press.

## **APPENDICES**

### **Appendix B: Research Questions**

- What are the industry expectations regarding TVET graduates?
- What are the challenges experienced by students regarding TVET training and entry into the industry?
- What are the recommendations for TVETs in training and preparations of students for job entry into the South African workplaces?

## Appendix C

### Ethics Clearance



#### UNISA COLLEGE OF EDUCATION ETHICS REVIEW COMMITTEE

Date: 2021/02/10

Ref: **2021/02/10/64062317/21/AM**

Name: Mrs SL Thakalekoala

Student No.:64062317

Dear Mrs SL Thakalekoala

**Decision:** Ethics Approval from  
2021/02/10 to 2024/02/10

**Researcher(s):** Name: Mrs SL Thakalekoala  
E-mail address: slratshidi@gmail.com  
Telephone: 0842707279

**Supervisor(s):** Name: Prof V.T. Zengele  
E-mail address: tzengele@unisa.ac.za  
Telephone: 0846028634

**Title of research:**

**HOW THE TVET STUDENTS ARE TRAINED AND PREPARED FOR JOB ENTRY IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN INDUSTRIES.**

**Qualification:** MEd Education Management

Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the UNISA College of Education Ethics Review Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for the period 2021/02/10 to 2024/02/10.

*The **low risk** application was reviewed by the Ethics Review Committee on 2021/02/10 in compliance with the UNISA Policy on Research Ethics and the Standard Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment.*

The proposed research may now commence with the provisions that:

1. The researcher will ensure that the research project adheres to the relevant guidelines set out in the Unisa Covid-19 position statement on research ethics attached.
2. The researcher(s) will ensure that the research project adheres to the values and principles expressed in the UNISA Policy on Research Ethics.



University of South Africa  
Preller Street, Muckleneuk Ridge, City of Tshwane  
PO Box 392 UNISA 0003 South Africa  
Telephone: +27 12 429 3111 Facsimile: +27 12 429 4150  
[www.unisa.ac.za](http://www.unisa.ac.za)

