

THE SEARCH FOR A NEW LIBERATING CONSCIOUSNESS AND A
SPIRITUALITY OF HEALING IN THE CONTEXT OF BLACK
CHRISTIANS JOINING WHITE LED CHARISMATIC CHURCHES: A
CRITICAL DISCOURSE ON PUSH AND PULL FACTORS.

By

CARL HENDRICKS

Submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Theology

In the subject

Missiology

At the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: Professor Nico Botha

Date: August 2019

DECLARATION

Name: Carl Johan Hendricks

Student number: 374 644 18

Degree: PhD Theology

THE SEARCH FOR A NEW LIBERATING CONSCIOUSNESS AND A
SPIRITUALITY OF HEALING IN THE CONTEXT OF BLACK
CHRISTIANS JOINING WHITE LED CHARISMATIC CHURCHES: A
CRITICAL DISCOURSE ON PUSH AND PULL FACTORS.

I declare that the above is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

I further declare that I submitted the dissertation to originality checking software. The digital receipt is enclosed on the next page.

I further declare that I have not previously submitted this work, or part of it, for examination at Unisa for another qualification or at any other higher education institution.

SIGNATURE

DATE

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

ABSTRACT

For quite some time now the phenomenon of black Christians joining white charismatic churches has been prevalent. The extent to which this has happened has been reflected in some of these white-led churches showing a majority of black members. The study is about investigating both the push and pull factors causing the movement. In an attempt at developing a balanced and critical academic understanding of the reality under discussion in the thesis.

Data has been gathered from divergent categories of black Christians. These categories include young black Christians from Rhema North Bible church, members from Christians such as the Christian Revival Church, black charismatic Christians who joined white led charismatic churches but returned to the black-led churches and a sizable number of black pastors. The world café as a distinct research methodological instrument is used for the gathering of data.

The thesis is however not only a technical study and interpretation of push and pull factors, but also a serious investigation into mentalities and pathologies resulting from colonialism and apartheid. Based on an analysis of whiteness and blackness, a proposal is made for a new liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing. To achieve this the pastoral or praxis circle is called into service as a vehicle of social and pastoral analysis, theological reflection and strategic planning.

KEY TERMS DESCRIBING THE TOPIC OF A DISSERTATION/THESIS

KEY TERMS: LIBERATING CONSCIOUSNESS, SPIRITUALITY OF HEALING, PUSH AND PULL FACTORS. WHITE LED CHARISMATIC CHURCHES

TITLE OF THESIS

THE SEARCH FOR A NEW LIBERATING CONSCIOUSNESS AND A SPIRITUALITY OF HEALING IN THE CONTEXT OF BLACK CHRISTIANS JOINING WHITE LED CHARISMATIC CHURCHES: A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ON PUSH AND PULL FACTORS.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to express most sincere appreciation to my supervisor Prof. Nico Botha. For guiding and finalisation of this PhD -thesis. This is a true milestone in my life, thanks to you.

It is with deep appreciation and love to thank my wife Joan for a pillar of strength, my children, Xavier, Anka, Ashley, Evangelique, and Jesse, who have supported me in this endeavour.

I wish to thank Crystal Ministries, who accepted me as their pastor to study for this degree.

I wish to thank Bishop Mosa Sono, Apostle Jerome Liberty, Reverend Moss Nthla, the Pastors of Cape Town, Pastors of Johannesburg, leaders in Eersterust Pretoria, Ps Wayne Cheff, and Father Allie for your availability and support.

I wish to thank, Linda Bledig, who supported me with the typing of the manuscript in her usual excellent way.

Above all, I wish to praise God through Jesus Christ, who guided me in my whole life also to attain this landmark.

Contents

ABSTRACT	3
KEY TERMS DESCRIBING THE TOPIC OF A DISSERTATION/THESIS	4
TITLE OF THESIS.....	4
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	4
1.1 Introduction: Statement of problem and research question.	10
<i>1.1.1 The broad field of the study</i>	<i>10</i>
1.2 Missiology.....	11
<i>1.2.1 A critical reflection on Missiology.....</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>1.2.2 The missiological theoretical framework</i>	<i>16</i>
1.3 The research question	19
1.4 Research design and methods	23
<i>1.4.1 Research methodological instruments</i>	<i>25</i>
1.5 Literature review and provisional bibliography	29
<i>1.5.1 Biko: I write what I like</i>	<i>32</i>
<i>1.5.2 Fanon</i>	<i>33</i>
<i>1.5.3 Boesak.....</i>	<i>36</i>
<i>1.5.4 Ashimolowo</i>	<i>38</i>
<i>1.5.5 McKaiser.....</i>	<i>38</i>
<i>1.5.6 Kirtzinger, Snyman and Melissa Steyn</i>	<i>39</i>
1.6 Rationale for the research	40
1.7 Demarcation of scope	41
1.8 Ethical considerations.....	42
1.9 Summary of the chapters	42
1.10 Provisional bibliography	44
1.11 Addenda.....	46
<i>1.11.1 A survey form</i>	<i>46</i>
<i>A form relating specifically to the Research Project will be part of the Addenda</i>	<i>46</i>
<i>Letter of in introduction and informed consent</i>	<i>47</i>
BREAKDOWN	50
Informed consent form (A).....	51
An Informed consent form (B).....	52
Chapter 2	54
Introduction: Pew members identifying push and pull factors behind the exodus of black Christians joining white led Charismatic churches	54
2.1 Introduction.....	54
2.2 Research gathering	55
<i>2.2.1The questions posed to participants</i>	<i>55</i>
<i>2.2.2 Methodology</i>	<i>56</i>
2.3 The push factors	57
<i>2.3.1 Church leadership</i>	<i>57</i>
<i>2.3.2 Community and mission</i>	<i>59</i>

2.3.3 Liturgy	60
2.3.4 Stewardship	62
2.4 The pull factors	63
2.4.1 Leadership	63
2.4.2 Liturgy	64
2.5 Data from Rhema North	64
2.5.1. Push factors	64
2.5.1.1 Leadership	64
2.5.1.2 Liturgy	66
2.5.2 Pull factors	67
2.5.2.1 Leadership	67
2.5.2.2. Liturgy	68
2.5.2.3. Community and mission	71
<i>There is a friendly and positive approach to welcome one to the Church:</i>	71
2.5.2.4. Stewardship	73
2.6 Research sample	73
2.6.1. Question 1	74
<i>Why is there resistance to go back to black pastored churches?</i>	74
2.6.2. Question 2	75
<i>Why do we prefer to go to a church where the leadership is made up of white people?</i>	75
2.6.3. Question 3	77
<i>What are the negatives against the traditional churches in the townships?</i>	77
2.6.4. Question 4	78
<i>What are the positives in the white pastored churches?</i>	78
Chapter 3	81
Charismatic pastors reflecting on Push and Pull factors behind the exodus of black Christians towards White Charismatic Churches.....	81
3.1 Introduction	81
3.2 Cape Town Pastors (Crystal Towers)	81
3.2.1 The push factors	81
3.2.2 The pull factors	85
3.3 Cape Town Pastors South	87
3.3.1. Push factors	87
3.4 JHB South Senior Pastors	89
3.4.1. Push factors	89
3.4.2. Pull factors	92
3.5. Cape Town pastors	93
Chapter 4	108
Underlying assumptions and pathologies in the discourse on black Christians joining white led Charismatic churches	108
4.1 Introduction	108
4.2. Recapturing on data analysis	109
4.2.1 Responses from pew members in general.....	109
4.3. Responses from Rhema North	111
4.4. Responses from Pastors	115
4.5. Towards a counter argument	118
4.6. Case study	120

.....	122
4.6.1.1. <i>Statement of faith</i>	122
4.6.1.2. <i>Social responsibility</i>	122
4.6.1.3. <i>Leadership</i>	123
4.6.1.4. <i>Stewardship</i>	123
4.6.1.5. <i>Practical matters</i>	124
4.6.1.6. <i>Self-criticism</i>	124
4.6.1.7. <i>Multimedia</i>	124
4.6.2. Victory Ministries International	125
4.6.2.1. <i>Statement of faith</i>	125
4.6.2.2. <i>Social responsibility</i>	126
4.6.2.3. <i>Leadership.</i>	128
4.6.2.4. <i>Stewardship</i>	129
4.6.2.5. <i>Self-criticism</i>	130
4.6.2.6. <i>Practical matters</i>	131
4.6.2.7. <i>Multimedia</i>	131
4.6.3. <i>Grace Bible church</i>	132
4.6.3.1. <i>Statement of faith</i>	132
4.6.3.1. <i>Social responsibility.</i>	133
4.6.3.2. <i>On leadership</i>	134
4.6.3.3. <i>Stewardship.</i>	134
4.6.3.4. <i>Practical matters</i>	135
4.6.3.4. <i>Self-criticism</i>	136
4.6.3.5. <i>Multimedia.</i>	137
4.7 <i>Reflection on the interviews</i>	137
4.8 <i>Interview with Reverend Moss Nthla</i>	141
4.9. <i>Reductionist nature of data on white controlled Charismatic churches</i>	144
4.9.1 <i>Leadership and congregational structure</i>	145
4.10. <i>Looking at white pastors</i>	147
4.10.1 <i>Christian Revival Church</i>	148
4.10.2. <i>Rivers Church</i>	151
<i>Farewell to innocence</i>	154
<i>Farewell to ignorance</i>	155
<i>Farewell to arrogance</i>	156
4.10. <i>Hillsong International</i>	157
4.11 More than meets the eye in white pastored Charismatic Churches: Anecdotes and symptoms	158
4.11.1. Christian Revival Church	159
4.11.2. Rhema Bible Church	161
4.11.3. Hillsong Church	162
4.11.4. Rivers Church	163
4.12. <i>Responses to perceived racism in churches</i>	164
4.12.1. <i>Blackness</i>	169
4.12.2. <i>Whiteness</i>	171
Chapter 5	173
Towards a new liberating and transforming consciousness and spirituality of healing and transforming consciousness.....	173

5.1 Introduction	173
5.1 The praxis circle	175
5.1.1 Insertion	176
5.1.2 Social analysis	176
5.1.3 Theological reflection	177
5.1.4 Pastoral planning	178
5.2 Adaptations of the pastoral circle	178
5.2.1 J. R. Cochrane, J.W. de Gruchy and R Petersen's adaptation	178
5.1.2 JNJ Kritzingher's adaptation	179
1. Agency.	180
2. Context analysis	180
3. Ecclesial analyses	180
4. Theological reflection	181
5. Spirituality	181
6. Practical projects	181
7. Reflexivity	182
5.1.3 Richard Osmer	182
5.2 Choice of the praxis circle	184
5.3 My personal approach to the praxis circle.	185
5.4 Insertion	186
5.5 The signs of the times	190
5.6 Understanding whiteness and blackness	192
5.7 Racism	198
5.7.1 Acknowledging racism	198
5.7.2 Institutional racism	202
5.8 A new liberating consciousness	205
5.8.1 Toward a new liberating consciousness	205
5.8.2 Theological reflection on a new humanity	209
5.8.1 Luke 4:16-21	209
5.8.1.2 Ruth Anne Reece	212
5.8.1.3 Pastor Frank Thomas	213
5.8.2.4 George flattery	215
5.9 Luke 4: 16-24 in context	217
5.9.1. Luke's Gospel in the context of Empire.	217
5.9.2 The Spirit is the movement	218
5.9.3 Good news for all, but in particular for the poor	220
5.9.4 The Spirit of healing and restoration	221
5.9.5 The Spirit of liberation	222
5.9.6 The spirit of Jubilee	224
5.10 Strategic planning towards a new liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing.	227
Chapter 6	229
Findings and recommendations.....	229
<i>Towards a liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing</i>	229
BIBLIOGRAPHY	234

Chapter 1

1.1 Introduction: Statement of problem and research question.

1.1.1 The broad field of the study

The research proposal presents the contents of the detailed plan or “blueprint” of the research, briefly and summarily. This plan would guide and direct the conception process of the research academically and systematically, and also continuously, as this is a detailed writing plan. The proposal is a guideline procedural document with organisational status. As this is a new field of knowledge, the independent growth of black churches within the framework of the gospel, combining with their independent culture, the missiological plan or proposal may be adapted since one is not sure how the study will turn out; the research may generate new knowledge to be incorporated. The wide-ranging field of the research is the issue of the black Christians moving to and joining the white-pastoring charismatic churches. Determining the underlying assumption of the "push and pull" factors while looking into the possibility of developing the black churches by way of spiritual and cultural church growth and renewal. The thesis endeavors to bring into the light of the gospel the phenomenon of black charismatic Christians joining white pastored charismatic churches in such large numbers.

The focus of the thesis is on missiology. Before one can participate in the missiological conversation, one has to listen carefully to the missiological discussion, what people are saying, who is speaking, how they talk about it, what they write about it. Missiology is a critical reflection on the practice of mission, constructing it as a scholarly and academic enterprise.

The thesis researches analytically and methodically an aspect of the mission of God, in this case, the spiritual growth and cultural development of the black

churches in their concrete contexts of being threatened by dwindling participation and commitment. The main focus of the thesis is not Crystal Ministries International, where the researcher worked for many years; however, the interpretation of church and mission from this perspective would play a role in the study. It is called into service in the thesis in response to the research question, summarised as, what are the reasons for people leaving black churches to join white-pastoring churches, and importantly, how church growth and black independent culture development could stifle this movement.

Missiology, however, is not only a specific discipline, as one has to characterise it also as an interdisciplinary domain or realm of research and study. This missiological thesis is, therefore, a blending of methods from different human sciences, aiming to assimilate them into a comprehensible missiological and theological enterprise. In this research prophecy, philosophy, psychoanalysis, and liberation construct the thesis as an actual interdisciplinary missiological project: ideas from Biko on the Political Philosophy of his book on Black Consciousness, Kritzinger's scripts on Prophecy and Liberation, Fanon's Psychoanalysis from his book, entitled Black Skin White Masks and Bosch's Transforming Mission on Mission and Culture are also explored and used as a function in the study necessary also to indicate from the onset that insights from disciplines like philosophy, culture, liberation, and psychiatry are relevant for this missiological endeavour.

To start, we include an outline of a working understanding of the discipline of missiology.

1.2 Missiology

To begin with, a few general remarks on Christian mission might assist in showing how one is not to understand mission and the discipline of missiology: it is a long-standing twisted understanding of mission which is about a

movement from the West to the rest, or as something carried out by white Christians in South Africa to black people. Furthermore, notions like "winning souls for the Lamb" and "evangelisation" are not necessarily invalid, but hugely reductionist. Mission and consequently, missiology, is dealing with the whole of life and with all contexts, everywhere.

During the 1950s, there was a church-centric emphasis on mission, which found its sturdiest and most energetic application in the Church Growth Movement and the mega-church missiology (cf. Kritzinger, J J Dons, 2004:169). This emphasis was corrected during the 1960s by the theology of the *Missio Dei*, a Theo-centric emphasis that mission belongs not primarily to the church, but God with his initiative –not the church, but God, his kingship, kingdom and his justice should be in the center. During the 1970's *Missio Dei* became the fundamental and dominant model and paradigm for missiology. Bosch, in his book *Transforming Mission*, espoused this approach comprehensively and showed how it developed in different directions over a few decades. Bosch followed Karl Barth, who "...may be called the first clear exponent of a new theological paradigm which broke radically with an Enlightenment approach to theology...", turning away from the modern paradigm (Bosch 2003:390). This new paradigm also indicated the end of "missions": "The age of missions is at an end; the age of mission has begun" (ibid: 391). It meant that our missionary activities are only authentic insofar as they reflect participation in the mission of God, according to his will and action:

"The church stands in the service of God's turning to the world" (ibid: 391). It was a drastic, far-reaching, and radical transformation in missiology and the calling of Christians in the world, and also implicates the black Christians in the black churches towards liberation theology, socio-political and economic transformation.

The main issue in this thesis, namely the "flocking" of black Christians to white-pastoring Charismatic churches, for example, is as much missiological as the proclamation of the gospel itself. Importantly the thesis avoids as much as possible any church-centric understanding of mission -mission does not belong to the church, but God.

1.2.1 A critical reflection on Missiology

As the emphasis of the thesis is on the main issue, "BLACK CHURCH GROWTH AND AN INDEPENDENT BLACK CHRISTIAN CULTURE," the research must deal with the complicated problem of church growth in a missiological framework. Church growth is described by C A Schwartz (1988:38-39) in terms of quantitatively and qualitatively criteria for growth, but immediately he acknowledges that there was no "...reliable procedure for measuring qualitative growth..." Instead, he claims that there is an assumption within the church growth movement that "growing congregations" are automatically "good churches".

He proceeds to describe qualitative growth in terms of research in the growth or diminishing church worship attendance, empowering leadership, gift-oriented leadership, passionate spirituality, functional structures, inspiring worship services, small holistic groups, need-oriented evangelism, and loving relationships (ibid:32-34).

This approach, however, is the same as the general growth approaches of the description of growth in churches in general, namely the strategies to increase the numbers in churches, albeit indirectly with more "spirituality" or better organisational structures in churches.

C P Wagner (1986:13 &14) stated that D McGavran founded the growing movement in 1955 and has '...declared...that God wants His lost sheep found and brought into the fold. Those who...identify with McGavran's movement,

have chosen as their biblical rallying point Jesus' Great Commission to 'go therefore and make disciples of all the nations...' They have focused almost exclusively on the spread of the gospel. Wagner queries the assumption that "growing congregations" are automatically "good churches" as he makes a distinction between qualitative and quantitative church growth but acknowledges that qualitative growth criteria were not available. It means that the leaders of the growing movement importantly, for example, McGavran, Wagner, Jenson, and Pointer, worked generally and mainly with the concept of church growth as numerical growth, justifying it with the spiritual task to make disciples of all nations.

Despite controversies, for example, that the "social ethics" of the church growth approach was weak, and church growth was labeled "church growth numerology," and "...the Bible tells me to feed the sheep, not to count them." The mainline churches widely adopted this kind of church growth movement.

Church growth in general and the Church Growth Movement, in particular, do not approach the fundamental question of liberation of the Christians in their basic needs as human beings. It leads to the argument that people's socio-political and economic complications and life struggles are sacrificed in favor of counting the number of people in the church. Unintentionally people are then seen as numbers and not persons.

Black Christian church growth in the first place indicates liberation through the gospel and a new consciousness of cultural independence of humanness and autonomy.

In academic research, missiology is generally understood and informed by exposure to the academic discipline of missiology. In broad terms, missiology is understood as the theological discipline described as a critical reflection on diverse mission practices or patterns of mission praxis. Bosch (1991:181-507)

identifies thirteen elements as part of what he sees to be an Emerging Ecumenical Paradigm in mission.

If one stays with the logic of understanding missiology as critical reflection, and if applied to Bosch, it means that the elements of missiology should constantly be scrutinised. Others in the discipline at Unisa, for example, Botha and Kritzinger interpret mission and missiology in terms of prophecy, liberation, and "encounterology", or the art of encountering or meeting people. More and more, Saayman's interpretation of mission and missiology in terms of dimensions becomes strikingly appealing: based on Luke 4:16-21, which contains the manifesto of Jesus; here Jesus pronounced it in the synagogue by citing Isaiah 61:1-2. Saayman identified and combined the dimensions of evangelisation, healing, and liberation in mission and missiology. Of particular importance is his reference, from the beginning of missiology and the mission task to the anointing of the Holy Spirit.

Based on the discussion on what missiology is understood to be in the thesis, the study informed by a particular understanding of Christian mission consistently and continuously aimed at liberation, change, and transformation. This means that mission is not understood without the church and the church without mission.

This thesis would investigate the "push and pull" factors, informing the relocation of black Christians to white-pastoring Charismatic churches, and importantly, a part of the question is what implications this has for the Charismatic church and for Christian mission. Is it as simple as saying that the church is supposed to be non-racial? Is a movement constituting a one-way-traffic from black-pastoring to white-pastoring Charismatic churches typical, ordinary, usual, sane, rational, commonplace, standard, customary, and unexceptional?

Is an ordinary non-racial church possible in the context of an abnormal society or situation, created by the legacy of "colonial apartheid"? Missiology is all about the context of the situation and, therefore, this context also has to be explored.

To suggest that mission is not to be understood without the church is not to advance an argument for a church-centric view of mission. Bosch is perhaps right in stating that mission is, in a way, "undefinable" and that we can only work with "approximations". However, what we can say with a great deal of certainty is that mission is God's mission.

It is the Father who sends the Son, The Son who sends the Spirit and the Father, Son, and Spirit who send the church. Whether the term *Missio Dei* is too technical or not, the idea it expresses about the mission is not ours, but God's, it is valid and appropriate. Profoundly, the theological basis and concept for the perception that mission is God's mission were laid at the mission conference at Willingen in Germany in 1952, describing the mission as emanating from the heart of God.

In light of the reaches, ranges, and influences of missiology, it is crucial to clarify the research question and sub-questions meticulously to be able to focus on the relevant topic of the thesis.

1.2.2 The missiological theoretical framework

The theoretical framework of a thesis is one of its most important components as it determines the fundamental aim, context, construction, background, and the outline of the research. This frame supplies support for the whole of the research. It is vital to determine what theories and ideas exist concerning the chosen subject. The setting, positioning and calibrating of the topic determines the ultimate heart of the problem and challenge of the research; the outline assists to verify and establish the fundamental concepts, theories, and models

that correlate with the topic. The selected paradigms provide direction to the research, facilitating the development of these missiological and hermeneutical choices in different stages of the research project. This theoretical framework also provides justifying reasons for the approach and that the research is based on and grounded in missiological theory – it is not just coming "out of the blue".

The central problem of the research is, why is it such a serious and disastrous problem and dilemma that many black Christians do not support and assist in liberating and building up their black churches and communities, but decide to join the white-pastoring Charismatic churches? The missional theoretical framework is that the black Christians, despite their middle-class status and privileges of democracy, still struggle to start living as "liberated," self-conscious and independent, dignified human beings – they wish to become part of the "white" community, the Charismatic church being their entry point.

The thesis assumes that the black church is in dire need of church growth but a different type of church growth, however, not the type of extensive numerical growth that was rife in the 1950s.

"The new emphasis on the kingdom, and not the church, swept the carpet from underneath those for whom (numerical) church growth was important. In the kingdom of God, the arithmetic works differently, it was said. God is not interested in numbers. Maybe the (growing) church is not the solution" (Kritzinger, J J Dons, 2004:169). Even if evangelism is described as "the heart of mission," mission entailed much more. Especially from the 1970s, a "new holistic understanding of mission" came to the fore.

This definition of the mission was a far cry from the "old one-dimensional kyrugmatic understanding" (ibid:170).

The framework of the research is that the message of Black Liberation Theology and Black Consciousness is still relevant and valid today, albeit in a

modern 21st-century context: Black Theology and Black Consciousness contain their independent conceptual framework towards liberation and independence, as well as its own autonomous theoretical, Christian and missiological hermeneutical foundations. They think and live within their "own" world. Theology, in general, reacts against the legacies of colonialism, neo-colonialism, and apartheid. Black theology and liberation theology have their terms and thought forms of liberation and humanness and do not conform to and operate according to the white, western theological, political, epistemological, and scriptural hermeneutical frameworks.

Black Liberation Theology has not accepted life and the struggle for life on the terms of the "white" West. They have stopped their self-wounding, brokenness, and pain by stepping out of the western cloud of poisonous thought forms, epistemology, and biblical hermeneutics. They have stepped out of being a "non-person," facing a secular "non-believer" and their overwhelming world and riches. In the unfolding of the thesis, it will be shown that the ideals of liberation and black theology are not yet fully embodied in the lived experience and contextual reality of black Christians in South Africa

The Oxfam Report, 2016 says:

“The richest 1% now have more wealth than the rest of the world combined.”

Eight of them own as much as half of the world. They are all-white men.

“Today Black Liberation Theology is bound to grasp the spiritual essence of the tragic obstinacy of the West to wake up to the pain of the black person”

(ibid:2017:9).

It is striking to recall the last approximately 500 years of Western-centric, Colonial World-systems: We went from:

- the 16th century: 'CHRISTIANISE OR I SHOOT,' to the 19th century: 'CIVILISE, OR I SHOOT,' to
- the 20th century: 'DEVELOP OR I SHOOT,' to
- the 21st century: 'DEMOCRATISE, OR I SHOOT.'" (Vellem, V S, 1917:7).

This framework of Liberation Theology that will be combined in the research with church growth as liberation would be espoused, informed by the scripts of V S Vellem, 2013 & 2017, Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2013 and Kritzing, 1988. This liberation, interpreted in the 21st-century paradigm, is the concept of not transforming the West or changing their thought forms, but of "un-thinking" the West, following their liberation thinking.

1.3 The research questions

One of the striking events to be observed since the onset of democracy in South Africa in 1994, and the concomitant opening up of the situation as far as human "migration" is concerned, is the "flocking" of township dwellers and those who have relocated from the township to historically white suburbs to white-pastoring or white-established churches.

Dramatic photographic and video material abound on how the complex of these white-pastoring mega Charismatic churches have changed. The black members, including Coloured and Indian members, of these churches, have formerly belonged to either a "mainline" church, a Pentecostal or Charismatic church in the township. On a Sunday, it is no longer strange to see busloads of black Christians being transported to churches elsewhere. This reality of black Christians showing a preference for white-pastoring Charismatic churches induces a plethora of questions and queries. The fundamental question is, what are the "push and pull" factors of this movement?

A subsequent principal aim of the thesis is spiritual, cultural, and liberating consciousness as essential aspects of church growth. African scholars are adamant that Black Theology is still appropriate in our society where racism has not only left its mark but is still prevalent in its individual and institutionalized forms. The development aim in the black churches is to be people-centered, program-driven, disciplined, reconstructive, inclusive, complementary, integrative, deed-oriented, participatory, regenerative, future-sensitive, co-operative and consultative (cf. Molobi, V S, 2014:494-506).

The main aim of the thesis is to investigate - by way of gathering data – the push and pull factors triggering the "flocking" of black Christians from their churches to white-pastoring Charismatic churches, for example, the Christian Revival Church, Rivers Church, Hill Song church and Rhema Bible Church. Also, and importantly, to research the possibility of church growth and the creating of a black liberated, independent culture as a formation between the gospel and black culture.

The context of this "liberation movement" of church growth and independent black culture is the continuing effects of "colonial apartheid." Do black Christians have to take responsibility for their own lives and situation in a new, more suitable democratic situation with the power of the gospel?

The study is not interested in the phenomenon of Christians in general changing churches from time to time. In South Africa, there are numerous examples of people, mainly from some "mainline" churches, relocating to Charismatic churches. Historically, Crystal Ministries itself, for example, drew Christians from places such as Eldorado Park and Riverlea, joining Crystal Ministries even when it moved out of the township into Aeroton, Johannesburg South.

It, however, is not the focus of the thesis, but rather the very particular context of black Christians leaving their churches to join white-pastored Charismatic churches and the possibility of developing a new liberating consciousness through church growth and an independent Christian culture to empower the black churches towards absolute freedom, creativity, and independence.

In the study, the following breakdown of the research question, as stated above, will be lined up:

What are the “push” factors informing the “migration” from the township church to a white-established mega-church? Cognisance is taken of the fact that quite a few of the black Christians referred to are no longer residing in a township but have relocated to a historically white suburb.

What are the “pull” factors? What are the issues the black Christians find attractive in the white-pastored Charismatic churches that resulted in the decision to move there?

Is this not constituting a considerable contradiction and controversy to refer, nevertheless, to white-pastored Charismatic churches almost a quarter of a century into a democracy? In the context of this question, the pertinent issue to be raised in the thesis is whether people such as Biko and Fanon, as well as Black Liberation Theology, might still have relevance for South Africans - twenty-five years into a democracy?

Consequently, the question to be dealt with is whether the “migration” of black Christians to white-pastored Charismatic churches is a symptom of the prevailing internalized oppression and racism amongst black people based on the assumption that “what is white is right”? Or is this question too controversial or too complex to encounter? Apart from the “pushing and pulling” factors unearthed in the ethnographic research, an in-depth investigation will be taken into underlying factors such as whiteness and

blackness. For those reasons, respondents and participants in the research project will also be tested on whether the relocation is merely a matter of practical choice, or whether there are other underlying, uncomfortable issues, causing the shift.

What can the black-pastoring Charismatic churches do to halt the migration of black Christians to white-pastoring Charismatic churches? What can be done to strengthen the ministries of the township churches, which aim at the uplifting of black South Africans? Is there perhaps deficient discipleship and a lack of Christian cultural growth, which does not speak to the comprehensive spiritual, cultural, and socio-economic needs of black Christians? Would liberation through a new liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing facilitate authentic church growth by black Christians transcending the present status quo resulting from past deprivation through appropriating the benefits of a new identity and mission emanating from Gospel values?

Is the kind of approach suggested here not detrimental to the unity of the church, and should greater integration between black and white not be encouraged in the ongoing quest for a united, non-racial, non-sexist church and society?

The sub-questions would be organized in terms of a survey form to be completed by participants and co-researchers in the project. The third question in the survey regarding the socio-political context of the independent black Christian culture and possible church growth might differ between charismatic pastors. The aim is to involve pastors and congregants from black charismatic churches and congregants that are currently part of white pastored charismatic churches in world café group sessions. Efforts are made to include as far as possible white pastors and white congregants from white pastored charismatic churches.

1.4 Research design and methods

Primary material on the topic under investigation is non-existent, except material on aspects of the topic, for example, liberation theology and church growth. For that reason, the study is based on thorough going empirical or field research. Aspects of grounded theory and narrative research feature in the thesis, but the main thrust of the research design is an ethnographic study in the sense of a systematic study and description of people and cultures with their customs, habits, and mutual differences. For this purpose, world cafés and focus groups as research instruments are called into service.

The first characterisation of Harris and Johnson offers the following clarification:

Ethnography means 'a portrait of a people.' An ethnography is a written description of a particular culture - the customs, beliefs, and behavior- based on information collected through fieldwork.

The study aims to construct a picture of why black Christians join white-pastoring Charismatic churches, and its problems and challenges. This is done by describing and analysing the behaviour of the participants and by using fieldwork instruments, for example, world cafés, focus groups, and personal interviews.

The second characterisation to be looked at equally contains elements quite relevant to the study: Van Maanen, 1996 contends that an ethnographic study, "...typically refers to fieldwork (alternatively, participant observation) conducted by a single investigator who 'lives with and lives like' those who are studied, usually for a year or more."

The researcher, as a senior pastor of a Charismatic church, is not a participant-observer who comes in from outside to research for a while and then leaves.

The profile of a "participant-observer" fits the extent that not only the church where he works is investigated, but also white-pastoring Charismatic churches. Following the character of ethnographic research, the study is aimed at "...identifying significant categories of human experience up close and personal." What is hoped for is that "...new analytic insights by engaging in interactive, team exploration of often subtle arenas of human difference and similarity" ("A synthesis of ethnographic research," M. Genzuk, internet, accessed Nov. 2017).

Ethnographic methods are a means of drawing out local points of view, "funds of knowledge," from households and communities (Moll & Greenberg, 1990, internet, accessed Nov. 2017). It is a means of identifying significant categories of human experience up close and personal. Ethnography enhances and expands "top-down" views and enriches the inquiry process. It uses "bottom-up" insights and perspectives of influential policymakers "at the top," and generates new analytic insights by engaging in interactive, team exploration of subtle arenas of human difference and similarity.

Through these findings, ethnographers inform others of their discoveries with an attempt to derive policy decisions or instructional innovations from such an analysis, intended for teaching and providing detailed information about how something should be done.

Since ethnography has its roots in the social sciences of anthropology and sociology, a concerted effort is to be undertaken to develop the thesis into an inter- and multidisciplinary study. Typically, the Charismatic churches under investigation in the thesis are identified as "human arenas," and much as the framework of missiology is the discipline in focus, insights from other human and social sciences are taken into consideration.

The above would be done, importantly, in the framework of authentic spiritual church growth informed by a new liberating consciousness and a spirituality of

healing and restoration. An important outcome envisaged in the thesis is the proper understanding of the responsibility of black Christians in their emancipation and future spiritual growth.

1.4.1 Research methodological instruments

The main instruments for gathering data from amongst black members of the four charismatic churches mentioned are world cafés and focus groups.

Growing bodies of literature and information on the nature and understanding of the world café and the focus group are emerging. These are instruments in the framework of what has become known as action research. On each of the three, namely the world café, focus group, and action research, some reflection is necessary for terms of clarifying the methodological approaches and instruments in the thesis.

First, the world café as a research instrument has indeed resulted in the production of quite some literature and internet sources, for example, Elliot, Heesterbeek, Lukensmeyer and Slocum (2005), Liteman, Campbell, and Liteman (2006), Bache (2008), Gurteen (2008) and Allee (2003). The world café is understood to be “...a structured conversational process for knowledge sharing in which groups of people discuss a topic at several tables periodically and getting introduced to the previous discussion at their new table by a ‘table host’” (en.m.wikipedia.org, accessed 19 November 2017).

The world café takes the form of a workshop lasting a few hours. During this time, a group of approximately thirty participants is divided into smaller groups of not more than five, i.e., about six small groups in total. Each group is set around a table with a specific topic for discussion. A group host is chosen. There is no scribe since everybody around the table must write down what

comes to mind concerning the issues under discussion. Typically, very pertinent questions are "brainstormed" and "workshopped".

In this study, it is questions relating to the "push and pulls" factors, and "black identity in Christian culture," informing the "flocking" of black Christians to white-pastoring Charismatic churches. The small groups do not stay at one table, but rotate a few times, except the table host, who stays behind, to enlighten the new group about what was discussed by the previous group. At some stage, there is a report back session where the six groups are afforded an opportunity to share with the other groups. Five or more salient issues or commonalities between the groups are crystallised, to provide a definite or concrete form out of the reports. In this way, substantial data would be gathered.

Crystallizing, providing concrete form, from the literature and internet sources would be suggested that the following five components could be suitable as a structure for the world cafés (www.theworldcafe.com, accessed 19 November 2017):

- Setting: This is about creating a "special" environment, modeled after a social, public café.
- A word of welcome and introduction. The researcher warmly greets the participants. He then sets the scene or context for the discussion as well as putting participants at ease.
- Small group rounds: Those seated around the table – in small groups of not more than five participants – indulge in a conversation of about twenty minutes at a time before moving to a different table.
- Questions: Each round is prefaced with a question put forward for the specific context and desired outcomes of the world café. As far as the current research project is concerned, the questions would deal concretely with relation to the research question and sub-questions.

- A “harvest”: The harvesting exercise is the opportunity to share insights and questions from their conversations with the larger group.

Second, the focus group would have resulted, equally or even more than the world café, in the emergence of a large body of literature and internet sources. As a method of testing the opinions of a small group of people on an issue, the focus group is used, particularly in market research and political analysis. It also functions suitably in other areas of research, including theology.

The focus group is “...a gathering of deliberately selected people who participate in a planned discussion that is intended to elicit consumer perceptions about a particular topic or area of interest...”

(<https://www.thebalance.com>. What is a market research focus group? Accessed 19 November 2017).

The definition speaks to the area of market research. An enriching understanding of the focus group is to see it as a "form of qualitative research, consisting of interviews in which a small group of people is asked about their perceptions, opinions, beliefs, and attitudes towards a product, service, concept, advertisement, idea or packaging" (en.m.wikipedia.org. focus group, accessed 19 November 2017). In using the focus group in the thesis, the small group discussion is hoped to reveal important perceptions about why black Christians choose to leave the churches where they previously belonged in favour of white-pastoring Charismatic churches. The research focus group sessions, emanating from the world cafés, are envisaged to deepen the discussion that would have taken place in the larger groups.

Each of the participants in the world café is required to complete a survey form that warrants more data. The survey form or questionnaire consists of several questions, informed by the statement of the problem and the research question and sub-questions.

To date, several world café and focus group sessions were planned and conducted. At Crystal Ministries International, a world café is planned to take place, to be attended by 31 young black Christians belonging to Rhema Bible Church. These are students studying at institutions, for example, the Universities of Johannesburg and the Witwatersrand (Wits). A second world café is to be conducted in the township of Eersterust with ten participants from the Christian Revival Church and a white-pastoring Apostolic Faith Mission church in Sunnyside, Pretoria. An in-depth world café is to be conducted with "high profile" pastors from Charismatic churches from the Johannesburg area and Pretoria. A distinct difference between the other two world cafés, and this one is that the third question for discussion is to be formulated differently. Pastors would be asked pertinently whether they can record experiences of losing members to white-pastoring Charismatic churches and whether they think it would be possible to create a non-racial church in a society that is still very much divided and fragmented on racial lines. The question would even be more specific on whether a healthy church would be possible in an abnormal society.

A focus group session would be conducted in Cape Town with black pastors who have had experiences of church members leaving the black-pastoring church to join a white-pastoring Charismatic church. The data emanating from the three world cafés should be rich in terms of responding to the questions on "push and pull" factors, whereas the data that would be coming from the session with black pastors in Cape Town should reveal intriguing underlying assumptions on why black Christians leave the township churches. The investigation would be done not in terms of creating a sizeable sample but would instead be based on qualitative interviews with participants by using the world café as a methodological instrument.

Two more world cafés would be planned for Cape Town and Pretoria. In these world cafés, there would be a mix of black Christians from Christian Revival Church and Hillsongs.

This, however, would not be easy to achieve, and already there were quite negative responses from Hill Song in the Cape and River Church in Johannesburg, who heard about the research. A world café with about thirty black pastors is also in the planning stage at Crystal Ministries International. The data extracted would be quantified in the main body of the thesis.

1.5 Literature review and provisional bibliography

Generally, the literature review is about identifying data sources relevant to the study undertaken, and it is to contribute to the specific field of research with the view of advancing or extending the research. There are in the main two issues involved in a literature review, namely to show what came before the research, and more importantly, to indicate academically what worked and what did not work in other studies in such a type of research (University Library of the American University in Washington DC, accessed on Internet, Nov. 2017).

A significant challenge is that there are no basic primary sources to access, dealing specifically with the question under discussion in the thesis, except on church growth and Christian liberation and Black Christian culture.

Consequently, a difficulty is that there is no primary material available that speaks directly to this area of research of "push and pull" factors.

Material on the migration of Christians from one church to another as a general phenomenon, however, is presumably available, though it is not the intention of the thesis to go there. This research, however, does not warrant, document, or authorize any primary sources. The most significant part of the research is empirical in the mode of ethnographic exploration and will populate at least

three chapters in the thesis. The gathered data sources or interpretation literature are to be factored mainly in chapters 2&3, which deals with a hypothesis on underlying assumptions on why the phenomenon under discussion in the study occurs. A proposal on developing a new liberating consciousness and a new spirituality of healing are formulated based on the data gathered. This is envisaged within the context of authentic church growth where black Christians take responsibility for their lives and churches.

The focus of the research would be on the extracted data. The proper and extensive treatment of the data in terms of description, analysis, and evaluation would be done in chapters 2 & 3.

The review of written sources is focused on what is to go into chapters 4 and 5 of the thesis. The two sets of literature to be reviewed here, speak to the following two issues as hypotheses or theories:

First, they speak to the hypothetical investigation into possible underlying reasons for the phenomenon of black South African Christians giving preference to white-pastoring Charismatic churches.

Second, they speak to the proposal of a new consciousness and spirituality overcoming the division and fragmentation of the church; spiritual church growth as liberation, as well as inculcating a new Christian political, socio-economic, and cultural consciousness.

As far as the first issue is concerned, a hypothesis is understood to be a supposition or proposed explanation made based on limited evidence as a starting point for further investigation. The hypothesis or theory to be shown in chapter 4 is that apart from factors revealed in the data gathering through world cafés and focus groups, there are other underlying assumptions which inform the migration of black South African churches to white-pastoring Charismatic

churches, for example, the continuing influence of consequences of "colonial apartheid."

The first set of sources, including Biko, Fanon, Kritzinger, Bosch, Boesak, McKaiser, and Asomolowo, are used to explore the issue of consciousness and culture on different levels. In chapter 4, these authors are to be engaged in terms of critical discourse. Clearly showing the elements of continuity and discontinuity between them and the matter under discussion. The questions to be explored in dealing with these sources are as follows:

First, arguments are to be advanced to the effect that Biko's notion of the most potent weapon in the hands of the oppressor is the mind of the oppressed.

Fanon's notion of psychopathology is still making a severe impact on the lives of people even after liberation, and Boesak's socio-analytical tool of innocence are continuous with the hypothesis offered.

Second, arguments, however, are to be developed that we cannot uncritically fall back on the three mentioned, but that new avenues of consciousness and interpretation are to be explored. In this context, the ideas offered by McKaiser and Asomolowo, and other sources are to be engaged, and it might present fresh interpretations of racism, racial oppression, and, socio-economic deprivation.

A serious question to consider, however, is what will guarantee the missiological or religious nature of the study. In this regard, the second set of sources is to be drawn from the body of black theological works with specific reference to the issues of consciousness and spirituality.

As is the case with the set of sources alluded to earlier, the literature on a Black Theology of Liberation will come in for critical and extensive engagement in chapters 4 & 5.

The body of literature regarding both American and South African Black Theology of Liberation is vast. Close scrutiny of several sources reveals that the

scripts mentioned now warrant further engagement in terms of their relevance for essential aspects of the thesis alluded to. The sources are enumerated here and followed by a brief note on their potential relevance for chapters 4 and 5 of the thesis.

None of these sources speak, however, not even remotely so, to the specific investigation into factors informing the relocation of black South African Christians from the churches they belonged to previously, to white-pastoring Charismatic churches. This will be formulated and conceptualised from the comprehensive sets of data gathered.

All of the issues enumerated would be relevant in the quest for a new Christian consciousness and culture and a new spirituality, coalescing the gospel, church growth, and black culture. Precisely for that reason, the engagement with these sources cannot merely be collusion or agreement but would be critically engaged in attempting to open up new avenues of interpretation and understanding. The measure of continuity and discontinuity between the sources and the envisaged objective of creating the contours of a new Christian consciousness and cultural spirituality for radical discipleship in South Africa are to be worked out.

1.5.1 Biko: I write what I like

Much as there will be no argument advanced in the thesis for the resuscitation of Black Consciousness, Biko remains relevant for black and white South Africans even forty years after his tragic death at the hands of the apartheid regime. The issue for theology and the church is Biko's critical engagement with Christian mission, black pastors, and white liberals.

Of great importance is Biko's reflections on the quest for a South Africa with a human face as the ultimate synthesis emerging from white supremacist apartheid - in the mode of racial oppression and economic exploitation and the

antithesis of the black anti-apartheid and anti-racist struggle. The question confronting black Christians in South Africa in general, and from the perspective of the research perspective, black Charismatic Christians in particular, is whether their behaviour towards “church unity” brings us closer to, or takes us further away from church growth as a liberated Christian and cultural consciousness, achieving Biko’s dream.

1.5.2 Fanon

One of the most basic assumptions of the thesis is that South Africans have not even begun to deal decisively with the legacy of "colonial apartheid" in the form of racism and racial oppression. Several racist incidents since 1994 have destroyed the myth that racism is over and done with, having miraculously disappeared from the scene.

The incidents include blatant acts of racism, such as the Waterkloof four, killing an unidentified black male, the Reitz four subjecting black workers at the University of the Free State to deeply humiliating racist acts. Twitter and Facebook postings such as those of Penny Sparrow, Chris Hart, and Helen Zille, to mention just a few. We are not forgetting the racist utterances in a sermon of a senior pastor of River Church, Pastor Oliver. The real danger of enumerating these incidents, abhorrent as they might be, is to think that if only these incidents could be avoided, we would be living in a society healed of racism. In the process completely overlooking the institutionalised nature of racism, despite democracy, it might be overlooked entirely.

More often than not, the real issue about racism is not incidents here and there, but its material basis and how this is continuously making an impact on the lives of people.

We ask the question: Are the black majority government and by far the majority of South African citizens, claiming to be Christian, not able or capable during

25 years of democracy to create and construct a new liberated cultural consciousness of humanness in unity, other than institutionalized racism? It is in this context that Fanon and Biko emerge to be as relevant as ever.

In her summary and analysis of Fanon's book *Black Skin, White Masks* Rachele Dini observes that for Fanon, racism has psychopathological effects, fostering mentally disturbed behavior. One of his key points refers to the process of cultural assimilation, a process that occurs when the culture of the colonial power replaces the native culture of a colonised people. A seriously compounding factor in the case of South Africa is that unlike other colonised countries, South Africa has a history of colonisation by a Dutch regime and a British empire and was subjected to "colonialism" of a particular type as well as neo-colonialism (technology). The damage to colonised people, to which Fanon refers, would, in certain respects, be more severe in South Africa than elsewhere, particularly when the period of three hundred and thirty years is taken into account. Fanon tells us that the damage is felt both collectively and individually and manifests in a diversity of ways:

First, colonialism prevents the colonised from developing an independent sense of identity. In South Africa, however, it would be fair to say that *Black Consciousness* has gone some way in instilling in people - who were racially oppressed and economically exploited - a sense of self-affirmation.

Second, Fanon addresses himself to the equation of whiteness with goodness and blackness with evil quite often captured in expressions that "white is right," "white is bright," "white is pure," and contrary to that, "as black as the night," "black market," "riding black" when someone boards a train without a valid ticket. Examples are numerous.

In South Africa, the question remains whether black people themselves have not internalised these expressions and descriptions, resulting in a situation where

black people would always be striving to be "white." It is on this basis that Fanon introduces his understanding of alienation, emanating from severe psychological repercussions.

Third, perhaps the real depth of what Fanon presents is his piercing analysis of the real essence of colonial racism, which is the socio-economic issue.

The high value, but simultaneously, the scary part of Fanon's thinking in *The Wretched of the Earth*, is his focus on the violence which goes with decolonisation, affecting both the colonisers and the colonised. He discusses the nature of colonisation and its effect on both the colonisers and the colonised. He painstakingly works out how the struggle in decolonisation is essentially a struggle for the innate or essential equality between the oppressors and the oppressed, and how much tension plays out in the quest for freedom, order, and renewal. It is in this respect that Fanon is still vitally relevant for the ongoing struggles in a country such as South Africa. His thoughts do not only apply to the immediate context that he is addressing himself to situations worldwide and locally. A further example of his thinking is the fundamental dichotomy of the colony, which, to his mind, is manifested in the perceived radical difference in race between black and white. Through this examination, Fanon focuses on the violence that inevitably comes with decolonisation and the drawbacks of spontaneous rebellions and actions. Fanon argues for the innate or inborn qualities of the relationship between the oppressors and the oppressed. He points out how this tension plays out in the struggle for freedom and order. His points are unusual in that they apply not only to specific instances in history but to international and local relationships in general.

By identifying and isolating qualities of a major-minor situation, Fanon allows his audience to understand the dynamics, which he argues about, are present throughout history on both small and large scales. This fundamental difference gives rise to conflict, even violent conflict, for that matter.

What remains as perhaps Fanon's sharpest analytical achievement is to point out that even in a context where gallant struggles for liberation have been waged, we may end up with the world once again becoming a dichotomous regime of the poor and the rich, the proletariat and the educated political figures, clashing violently.

1.5.3 Boesak

Boesak is called into service for his creative use of the notion of innocence as a potent analytical tool in his 1976 book, entitled, *Farewell to Innocence*. He offers an analysis of innocence on the part of white people who accept situations as they are on the assumption that this is the natural scheme of things and black innocence, accepting abnormal situations as normal.

In his contribution to a book on globalisation, *The Politics of Empire, Justice, and the Life of Faith* (Boesak and Hansen, 2005), he re-appropriates the tool, innocence, in the context of globalisation or more accurately,,, global capitalism. The pertinent question in chapter 4 of the research would be: is there an element of innocence in black Christians uncritically joining white-pastoring Charismatic churches? What is the meaning of shedding innocence in this context that will not be feeding into further division and fragmentation, but rather contribute to a more non-racial and just society, irrespective of whether black Christians leave their churches or stay on?

Apart from his book, which goes back a good forty years, some of his more recent publications, for example, *Running with horses* (2009) and the book, co-authored with DeYoung (2012), titled *Radical Reconciliation*, are quite handy in showing the continuity between the situation under apartheid and the contemporary one. As far as *Running with horses* (2009) is concerned, Boesak in some chapters, laments the betrayal of the poor and the reproduction of apartheid racial categories for purposes of political expediency. If this is not

forcing the issue too much, the question needs to be answered by middle-class black South Africans whether life can go on, as usual, particularly concerning the way that Christianity is practiced.

A rather intriguing aspect of the discussion in *Radical Reconciliation* is the unavoidability of Biko and Fanon, albeit in a cursory or superficial fashion. The appropriation of both in a conversation on reconciliation eighteen years into the South African democracy, assuming that they are as relevant as before, should be regarded as significant.

Boesak's (2017) most recent publication, entitled, *Pharaohs on Both Sides of the Blood-Red Waters* exposes further the problematic nature of South African reconciliation. If at all reconciliation has been achieved, the name of such reconciliation is an "elite pact." In using the "Pharaoh" metaphor Boesak offers an analysis of the equation between the apartheid regime and the black elite currently ruling the roost. Black Christians can hardly avoid the very pertinent issues raised by Boesak in a context where some might have thought they are off the hook and can now return to business as usual.

It is in this context that Bosch's treatment (1991:302-313) of the intertwinement between mission and colonialism is quite illuminating. In a very compact but revealing fashion, Bosch deals with what colonialism - in deep spiritual terms - was aimed at. As it extends way into our day and age in the mode of neo-colonialism as technological advancement. Bosch shows that virtually the intermingling of mission and colonialism was about the three C's, namely Christianity, commerce and civilisation. Mission was aimed at securing the inward servility of the "natives." In a word, it was geared towards creating an "inner colonisation". In the thesis, the pertinent question is whether black people and black Christians, in particular, have started the introspective process

of dealing decisively with internalised racism and oppression, or whether the measure of liberation achieved makes them accept that such a process is done with.

1.5.4 Ashimolowo

Ashimolowo's book entitled, *What is Wrong with Being Black? Celebrating our heritage, confronting our challenges*, (internet accessed, Nov. 2017), helps identify what he calls conformations and pathologies. The list is quite extensive and includes issues such as idolatry, slavery, economic impoverishment challenged, racism, and apartheid.

In dealing with the matter of conformation, he follows the New International Dictionary of the English Language Encyclopedia Edition, (internet, accessed Nov. 2017), in pointing to elements such as, "...to make like or similar in form or conformation."

Black people, more often than not, cannot escape the mold, and in order to survive, they have to conform to and comply with norms and standards set by others. He contends that amongst all the issues, forcing black people to conform, is idolatry as a severe pathology. He argues that ultimately the burden of black people is that they find themselves in a world shaped by certain things for hundreds of years and consequently find it nigh impossible to break out of the mold.

1.5.5 McKaiser

The motivation for using McKaiser in the thesis is multi-layered:

First, he succeeds in going beyond mere racist incidents, like a person being beaten up in the street by a white person or by white people using the "k-word,"

to mention only two examples. As one commentator on his book observes, he journeys into the heart of racism, the so-called "non-bloody racism." McKaiser also ventures into the more hidden and institutionalised racism.

Second, perhaps the most profound aspect of *Run Racist Run* is how his own identity is interrogated.

Third, any black reader of McKaiser's, *Run Racist Run*, (internet accessed, Nov 20`17), would hope in vain that he is only dealing with white racism. On the contrary, he engages critically with black on coloured and coloured on black racism.

Fourth, although he points to the awkwardness of identifying himself as ideologically black and socially coloured, he does not shy away from the matter. In looking at factors informing the flocking of black Christians to white pastoring Charismatic churches, the book poses challenges both to black and to white, which renders any recourse to being a non-racial church problematic. One commentator remark that McKaiser is chipping away at our notion of the "rainbow nation." The importance of his very uncomfortable engagement with racism is that it is centralised on the conversation of reconciliation.

1.5.6 Kirtzinger, Snyman and Melissa Steyn

In an attempt to avoid a one-sided approach, some white authors, who have mustered the courage to engage whiteness critically from a diversity of perspectives, are looked at. These authors include Kirtzinger (2016) with particular reference to his response to the racist utterances of Pastor Oliver of River Church; Snyman in his understanding of an epistemic vulnerability; Steyn in her engagement with whiteness in her book, *Whiteness Just Is not What it used to be*.

1.6 Rationale for the research

Negative responses from Hill Song in the Cape and River Church in Johannesburg, who heard about the research, unfortunately, indicated a complete misunderstanding of the nature of the study. It suffices to say that in the case of Hill Song, the argument seems to be, "We are a non-racial church, and we are unaware of the issues in South Africa, but please do not come and disturb us by creating racial division through your research."

The rationale for the research is to get a grip on why black Christians exercise the option of joining a white-pastoring church, at a time when building up the township church might be more important than their own spiritual needs. The thesis is not only aimed at stifling this from happening, nor is it feeding into the divisions created by the legacy of "colonial apartheid."

These go much deeper than racial or ethnic division and have given rise to the grossest socio-economic discrepancies and inequalities worldwide. The thesis does not shy away from pertinent questions relating to whether white-pastoring Charismatic churches have not intentionally or unintentionally become new captivities. It is resulting in a situation where black Christians are continuously feeding into perpetual domination and subjugation, searching for a theological and moral justification for their newly found middle-class status.

On a much deeper level, the question is whether there is not a severe problem with the claim made by white pastored churches that their church communities are not influenced by racism. These white pastors do not agree that there are racism and racial tension in their church communities. They will have nothing to do with the discussion on whether or not it is possible to have a church devoid of racism in all its forms within a country riddled with very public instances of racism and its legacy.

The most significant value of the thesis might be, hopefully, to stimulate debate on these matters on an informed basis, i.e. in terms of getting a slight grip on why black Christians behave the way they do. The history of the last twenty-five years in South Africa has shown that attempts at letting bygones be bygones and carry on with life at home, in the community, in the church, in society at large based on "business as usual" have not been constructive. If the only achievement of the thesis were to get the conversation going amongst the churches on the issues raised, it would be worthwhile to have embarked on the project.

1.7 Demarcation of scope

In a study such as this, the continued temptation would be to escalate the number of issues for investigation. A serious attempt has been made, in consultation with the supervisor, to create a focus that will assist not to over-capitalise - as far as objectives are concerned - and not making too many promises, which might be challenging to deliver on in the thesis. The scope of the research is demarcated as follows:

First, instead of lining up numerous white-pastoring Charismatic churches for investigation, a deliberate choice would be made to confine the research mainly to the Christian Revival Church, Hill Song Church, and Rhema Bible Church North and South.

Second, a further issue is that a choice is made for qualitative field research by using the instruments of the world café and focus groups, instead of sampling. Great care has been taken not to formulate too many objectives or sub-questions. The research is limited to questions relating to "push and pull" factors, as well as creating hypotheses or theories of the underlying assumptions of these factors, and church growth renewal regarding black Christian cultural independence.

In consultation with the supervisor on the length of a thesis, it was explained to me that it is no longer a requirement that a thesis consists of more than 250 to 300 pages, including appendices and references. This is a good guideline that would assist in the allocation of the number of pages per chapter, although, naturally, the first and the final chapters would be shorter than the rest.

1.8 Ethical considerations

No interviews with vulnerable individuals, such as children and the elderly, are to be conducted. The research data is gathered from black middle-class Christians who are mostly well educated, holding some qualifications. The regular ethical requirements of the university, for example, obtaining ethical clearance and having participants in the world cafés and focus groups sign a letter of consent would be adhered to. The ethical clearance form is to be submitted simultaneously with the research proposal.

Plagiarism is very difficult in a study based quite heavily on field research with no primary written sources to access. In the case of chapters 4 and 5 where written sources would be used, the specific nature of such sources regarding Fanon and Biko, for example, renders any form of plagiarism difficult. Care is taken, however, to avoid reproducing sources even when they are properly referenced – this is a commitment of the research against plagiarism.

1.9 Summary of the chapters

To a large extent, the division of chapters in the study is informed by the objectives of the thesis. The chapters dealing with these objectives logically form the most significant part of the study. Attempts were made to have the thesis evolving developmentally and systematically, i.e., to make sure that chapters are not isolated from one another. Instead, the aim is to construct them to align with the research question and the sub-questions consistently. In this

way, guarantee the logical coherence of the script, as well as the envisaged outcomes.

Chapter 1 sets the scene on what is to be expected and typically deals with the broad field of research, research question and objectives, research design, methodology, chapters, timeframes, budget, findings, and recommendations.

Chapter 2 deals with the factors that have "pushed away" black Christians out of the churches where they previously belonged. The discussion is structured in terms of looking at situating the research and setting the focus and methodology of the research leading into the push and pull factors, as found in the research involving pew members from different groups of black Christians who joined white pastored churches.

Chapter 3 Looks at the push and pull factors from the perspective of the different pastors of black pastored churches with particular reference to the underlying reasons and the impact of this phenomenon on their churches in particular and the identity and consciousness of the church in South Africa.

Chapter 4 is the most challenging aspect of the thesis and deals with the rather complex issue of whether black Christians join white-pastoring Charismatic churches as a response to the political developments in the country since 1994; or whether the underlying question remains the legacy of "colonial apartheid." Looking at white and black pastored churches and how the legacy of racism in shaping the argument with particular reference to the misconceptions of the concept of non-racialism in the white led churches.

Chapter 5 is on the further significant and imperative issue to be dealt with extensively as the reflection and introduction of a new liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing as the main thrust of the research question. We are proposing the use of the praxis circle as the primary tool for social and pastoral analysis incorporating the insights of various reflections into the prophetic

mission and message of the church in the context of a racially divided society. The chapter offers a proposal of a new liberating consciousness and spirituality of healing and offers concrete ways of implementing this proposal through effective pastoral planning.

Chapter 6 is on findings and recommendations. The chapter draws brief conclusions and shows whether outcomes have been achieved, and the research question answered, as well as indicating issues for further research.

1.10 Provisional bibliography

Biko, SB. 2002. *I write what I like*. 40th Anniversary Edition. Johannesburg: Picador.

Boesak, AA. 2008. *The Tenderness of Conscience: African Renaissance and the Spirituality of Politics*. Glasgow: Wild Goose Publications.

Boesak, AA & DeYoung C P. 2012. *Radical Reconciliation: Beyond Political Pietism and Christian Quietism*. Maryknoll: Orbis.

Boesak, AA. 2014. *Dare We Speak of Hope: Searching for a Language of Life in Faith and Politics*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans.

Boesak, AA. 2017. *Pharaohs on Both Sides of the Blood-Red Waters. Prophetic Critique on Empire: Resistance, Justice, and the Power of the Hopeful Sizwe – A Transatlantic Conversation*. Eugene, Oregon: Cascade Books.

Bosch, DJ. 1991. *Transforming Mission. Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission*. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books.

Botha, NA. Mission as Prophecy: Reading the Apocalypse as forth-telling rather than foretelling, *Missionalia*, vol. 33, 315-328, 2005.

- Fanon, F., 2001. *The Wretched of the Earth*. London: Penguin Books.
- Fanon, F., 2017. *Black Skin, White Masks*. London: Pluto Press.
- Harris, M and Johnson, O. 2000. *Cultural Anthropology*. Oxford: Alta Mira Press.
- Kritzinger, JNJ. Faith to Faith – Missiology as encounterology, *Verbum et Ecclesia*, vol. 29 (3), 764-790, 2008.
- Kritzinger, J J (Dons). A Century of doing Missiology in South Africa. An Overview, *Missionalia*, vol. 32, no.2, August 2004.
- Masango, MJ and Steyn, TH. The theology and praxis of practical theology; in the context of the Faculty of Theology, *HTS Theological Studies*, vol. 67 no. 2, 2011.
- McGavran, D A. 1970. *Understanding Church Growth*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.
- McKaiser, E. 2015. *Run Racist Run. Journeys into the heart of racism*. Cape Town: ABC Press.
- Molobi, VS. 2014. The Black Church and family empowerment in South Africa; in *Studia Hist. Ecc.* vol.40 suppl. 1, Pretoria, Sep.
- Osmer, RR. 2008. *Practical Theology. An Introduction*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.
- Osmer, RR. Practical Theology: A current international perspective, in *HTS Theological Studies*, vol. 67, no.2, Pretoria, 2011.
- Saayman, WA. 1991. *Christian Mission in South Africa: political and ecumenical*. Pretoria: Unisa Press.

Simmons, M and Thomas, FA. 2010. *Preaching with Sacred Fire. An Anthology of African American Sermons, 1750 to the Present*. New York, London: W W Norton Company.

Steyn, ME. 2001. *Whiteness Just Isn't What It Used To Be: White Identity in a Changing South Africa*. New York: State University of New York Press.

Steyn, ME. 2014. *Unveiling Whiteness in the Twenty First Century: Global Manifestations*. New York: Lexington Books.

Schwartz, C A. 1988. *Natural Church Development. A guide to Eight Essential Qualities of Healthy Churches*. Carol Stream IL: Church Smart Resources.

Van Maanen, J. 1996. *Tales of the Field: On Writing Ethnography*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Van Wyngaard & White G J. Theology in dialogue with White theology in dialogue with Black Theology: Exploring the contribution of Klippiess Kritzinger, *HTS Theological Studies*, vol. 72, issue 1, 2016.

Vellem, V S. Un-thinking the West: The spirit of doing Black Theology of Liberation in decolonial times, *HTS Theological Studies*, 73 (3) 2017.

Wagner, C P. 1986 *Leading your church to growth*. Middlesex UK: MARC Europe and the British Church association.

* * *

1.11 Addenda

1.11.1 A survey form

A form relating specifically to the Research Project will be part of the Addenda

What is shown here is the letter of introduction and a survey form relating to the research project? Also displayed is the standard or preformatted informed

consent form of the Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology at Unisa, which would be utilised for the world café and focus group sessions.

Letter of in introduction and informed consent

FOR PARTICIPATION IN ACADEMIC RESEARCH

Project leader: Rev Carl Hendricks of Crystal Ministries International

Promoter: Prof Nico A Botha, Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology, School of Humanities, College of Human Sciences, Unisa

You are hereby cordially invited to participate in the research project, titled

BLACK CHURCH GROWTH AND AN INDEPENDENT BLACK
CHRISTIAN CULTURE

IN A MISSIOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE – “PUSH AND PULL” FACTORS
TOWARDS JOINING WHITE-PASTORING CHARISMATIC CHURCHES

You are chosen for your experience and knowledge in the research field as a committed member of your church. We believe that you can add tremendous value to the project by speaking freely and openly on your experiences in the church where you belong and by doing so in a very positive fashion and as a witness to the ministry of your church. We hope to create an atmosphere that is friendly and safe. This is not an inquisition, but a friendly conversation amongst sisters and brothers in Christ. From this perspective, it is hoped that what might be perceived to be difficult and controversial questions will also be discussed in a friendly atmosphere. In clarifying the two terms at the beginning of the title of the research project, the following must suffice:

First, the term missiological is perhaps a strange academic concept, but in essence, it is a technical term for the academic discipline that is involved in Christian mission. The discipline in question is called Missiology. The task of Missiology is to reflect critically on what Christians are doing practically and why that would identify particular activities as mission.

There are some Christians who regard evangelisation as at the heart of mission. Evangelisation has to do with the proclamation and spreading of the good news that salvation has been wrought in Jesus Christ. Others see, for example, the provision of medical services to people in a particular context as mission, and still, others are convinced that their participation in struggles for the liberation of people and the transformation of society is a form of mission. Theologically, mission is God's mission. It springs from the loving, merciful, gracious heart of the Triune God, Father, Son and Holy Spirit. In a nutshell, therefore, the research project is an attempt at unearthing, uncovering and discovering the factors which have resulted in black Christians leaving church A and joining church B, which is in terms of the project, a white-pastoring or white-established church. What triggered this is the question, what motivated black Christians to join churches such as the Christian Revival Church, Hatfield Christian Church, Hill Song church and the Rhema Bible Church?

Having clarified the two concepts, what is Missiology and the type of research questions, to some extent, we can now proceed to clarify the specific question to be researched. The study is an investigation into factors behind black Christians, joining of white-pastoring Charismatic churches. The hypotheses with which we approach the project is that there are "push" factors as well as "pull" factors, informing such relocation.

Over the years, a movement of black Christians from particularly the so-called mainline churches to white-pastoring mega or Charismatic churches has been observed. We are keenly interested in why that has been happening. Were there factors "pushing" them out of the churches they belonged to before joining a white-pastoring Charismatic church, and were there specific factors "pulling" them towards these churches? It is hoped that the responses would not be too general but would take the past as well as existing sensitivities relating to race, class, and gender into consideration. A very tricky and controversial, but a pertinent question, for example, is, why is the relocation almost entirely one-way traffic in terms of black Christians joining white-pastoring Charismatic churches, but hardly ever the other way round?

If you graciously agreed to participate in the project, please respond to the following questions in your own words:

1. If you had previously belonged to another church and had left that church to join a white-pastoring church, please tell us about the factors or reasons behind your leaving your former church. What were the "push" factors, triggering your departure from your previous church? Please write a few full sentences by elaborating as much as you like.
2. What are the "pull" factors or reasons? What did you see in your current church that made you want to be part of it? What were the major attractions? Please write a few full sentences on this and elaborate on them as much as possible.

3. Have you ever thought critically as a black Christian of the repercussions in your church when you chose to leave and join a white-pastoring church? If you reside in a historically white suburb, would you consider to continue supporting your township church?

4. How would you respond to the suggestion that black Christians join white-pastoring Charismatic churches based on the old assumption that “what is white is right, is better and by definition superior”? (Please feel free not to respond to this question).

5. Have you encountered in your ministry the situation of members leaving the church to join a white-pastoring Pentecostal or Charismatic church? Describe the reactions such a move triggered if any.

6. Do you regard a relocation from a black-pastoring to a white-pastoring church where members might have moved from one residential area to another, as a typical practical issue?

7. Have you ever thought about the plausibility of underlying assumptions; for example, black Christians still think that a white-pastoring church is superior? Or, in general. Do you think we have been able to work through the legacy of "colonial apartheid" in terms of finding forgiveness and reconciliation with justice?

BREAKDOWN

Having dealt with the push, pull, and identity factors in the context of black Christians relocating to white-pastoring Charismatic churches, what would your response be to the following questions:

-Are there perhaps underlying assumptions, for example, "white is right" or "white is superior to black," informing the relocation?

-Is a typical white-pastoring church meaningful for blacks in a society that has not dealt decisively with racism and the legacies of apartheid?

-How have you, as a pastor, been affected by members leaving your church for a white- pastoring one?

Informed consent form (A)

Dear Sir/Madam

As supervisor of the DTh project of Carl Hendricks, I hereby affirm that he is a bona fide postgraduate student of the University of South Africa, who is conducting a research project, entitled as follows:

BLACK CHURCH GROWTH AND AN INDEPENDENT BLACK CHRISTIAN CULTURE

IN A MISSIOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE – “PUSH AND PULL” FACTORS TOWARDS

JOINING WHITE-PASTORING CHARISMATIC CHURCHES

In his research, he aims to examine I commend him to you, with the request that you assist him in pursuing this important research topic.

His contact details are from (physical address) and he can be contacted at (telephone numbers)

If you have any questions about this research project, you are welcome to contact me at the departmental address above or by telephone at (012) 429-4078 or 0823343739 (mobile)

Yours sincerely

(Supervisor)

An Informed consent form (B)

I, the undersigned, hereby give consent thata DTh (Missiology) student at the University of South Africa (UNISA), may use the information that I supplied to him in an interview for his doctoral thesis. I declare the following:

Statement Agree Do not agree

1. I have been informed by the researcher of the objectives of the intended research
2. The researcher supplied me with his name, address and contact details, as well as the details of his research supervisor
3. I was informed why I was selected as a communication partner for the research project
4. I give this consent willingly, under no coercion and without inducement or enticement
5. I was assured to receive satisfactory answers to any question that I might have about the research

6. I was informed on the estimated time that the questionnaire would take
7. I retain the right to refrain from answering any question(s) posed by the researcher
8. I have agreed that the questionnaire might be recorded
9. I agree that the researcher may quote my views in his thesis and in any subsequent publications that may flow from it
10. I require that he should present me with the record that he has made of any interview(s) for my approval, before including it in his thesis
11. I agree that he may refer to me by name when quoting my views in his thesis and possible subsequent publications
12. I accept that he would store the record of my interview(s) and questionnaires safely and that he would destroy it not later than two years after his thesis has been accepted
13. I understand this information and its implications
14. I understand that I may withdraw this consent at any time in writing, without the necessity to provide reasons.

Full names.....

Place.....

Date.....

Signature.....

Chapter 2

Introduction: Pew members identifying push and pull factors behind the exodus of black Christians joining white led Charismatic churches

2.1 Introduction

In our endeavour to address the research question, this chapter will be explicitly based on the research carried out among respondents who are currently

worshipping in white-pastoring Charismatic churches after having left traditional or so-called mainline Churches. What as prompted by our keen interest in why this has been happening. We are trying to understand the phenomenon and its value to the development of a deeper understanding of ecclesiology and mission. The aforementioned is also crucial in developing a clearer understanding of the identity of the Church and its growth in the South African situation, taking into consideration the development of the national consciousness through the periods of colonialism, postcolonialism, apartheid, and post-apartheid. We endeavor to ask if there were factors "pushing" the respondents out of the churches they belonged to before joining a white-pastoring Charismatic church, and were there specific factors "pulling" them towards these churches?

This chapter will deal with the so-called push and pull factors and the factors that will be a barrier to return to previous worshipping communities. This chapter will focus on the reaction from respondents in focus groups conducted by the world café movement. The respondents in these focus groups come from young black South Africans who worshipped at previously black and coloured townships and who have subsequently joined Rhema and Christian Revival Church (CRC) communities in predominantly in white areas.

2.2 Research gathering

2.2.1 The questions posed to participants

The responses are based on the following questions posed to the respondents;

1. If you had previously belonged to another church and had left that Church to join a white- pastoring church, please tell us about the factors or reasons behind your leaving your former Church. What were the "push" factors, triggering your

departure from your previous Church? Please write a few full sentences by elaborating as much as you like.

2. What are the "pull" factors or reasons? What did you see in your current Church that made you want to be part of it? What were the major attractions? Please write a few full sentences on this and elaborate on them as much as possible.

3. Have you ever thought critically as a black Christian of the repercussions in your Church when you chose to leave and join a white-pastoring church? If you reside in a historically white suburb, would you consider to continue supporting your township church?

4. How would you respond to the suggestion that black Christians join white-pastoring Charismatic churches based on the old assumption that "what is white is right, is better and by definition superior"? (Please feel free not to respond to this question).

5. Have you encountered in your ministry the situation of members leaving the Church to join a white-pastoring Pentecostal or Charismatic Church? Describe the reactions such a move triggered if any.

6. Do you regard a relocation from a black-pastoring to a white-pastoring church where members might have moved from one residential area to another, as a typical practical issue?

7. Have you ever thought about the plausibility of underlying assumptions, for example, black Christians still think that a white-pastoring church is superior? In general, do you think we have been able to work through the legacy of "colonial apartheid" in terms of finding forgiveness and reconciliation with justice?

2.2.2 Methodology

The research was conducted among younger segments of the coloured and black population; some moved out of the townships where they previously resided while others still have some form of residence in the townships but work and live outside of the townships.

Looking at the raw data analytically, we endeavoured to use the same questions and in the same setting directed to the respondents while encouraging the honest and open engagement of the participants.

The questions are geared towards addressing the personal reasons why individuals chose to leave their traditional worship communities and what led them to decide to leave. Furthermore, the respondents were asked to reflect on the reasons why they felt attracted to their new worship communities where they are pastored to by predominantly white church leadership.

The overall feeling among respondents pointed to the existential questions raised by all of humanity trying to make sense of who they are and where they belong.

2.3 The push factors

Regarding the push factors here are some of the main responses grouped together

2.3.1 Church leadership

The overall feeling among respondents is that what made them leave was the leadership in the communities they come from. Their experience was negative, and this largely influenced their decision to move to white lead worship communities.

The overall regard for pastoral leadership in the township communities where they came from was that the leadership lacked proper education and vision. Furthermore, respondents felt a general lack of transparency, an openness to dialogue, and a general lack of vision.

Short of saying there was an actual lack of leadership, the responses pointed to an intrinsic lack of effective leadership. Some of the respondents pointed to the perceived hero-worship that pushed them away from their traditional worship communities. The leaders are seen as people who had to be obeyed and whose authority was never to be questioned.

Continuing on the subject of leadership, respondents felt that the leadership model was also not geared towards action, and therefore the lack of vision and difficulty in reaching a consensus on a pastoral plan meant there was very little to no execution of any significant vision.

Leadership in these black-led churches was perceived to be unplanned and erratic at best, uninformed and uninspired at worse. Respondents felt that there was more emphasis on being perceived to have been called to minister than to be educated and equipped to minister adequately.

The relational issue challenge is prevalent throughout the responses; respondents felt that there was not a proper relationship between them and the leadership.

They wanted to relate to the leaders, not as inferior to superior but as brother and sister being taught by their leaders and not being oppressed or abused by them.

Leadership was based on a person, and the lack of vision lead to the perception of hero worship. This was clearly demonstrated when the term false prophecy was used by respondents, referring to the mentality of the church leadership. Leaders were chosen or appointed by age or seniority or even social standing

within the townships. A lack of openness to the dialogue leads to a sense of disinterest and apathy among the respondents.

The perceived prevalence of cliques in these churches meant that the respondents felt they did not belong and did not have any hope to influence decisions or how the faith communities are governed. Cliques also lead to gossip and discrimination. Respondents felt that there was no growth in these worship communities.

The overall feeling was that leaders abused their power and did not use it to empower others or facilitate change and, indeed, succession. The reasons above left the respondents feeling they should vote with their feet as it were and leave in order to avoid the conflict with the *status quo*.

2.3.2 Community and mission

One of the major factors that pushed respondents away from their traditional worship communities was how they perceived themselves as part of the church community and how the community participated in the mission of spreading the gospel of Christ.

The overarching response was that the lack of leadership and vision made these communities closed in on themselves. One of the responses was that respondents felt like they were in a box and kept in a box. Uniform was something that was perceived to be a source of oppression and division. The insistence on uniforms was perceived to encourage cliques and the persecution of those who did not conform. The sense of community lacked and pushed respondents to seek a sense of belonging somewhere else.

The lack of vision also led to a lack of outreach. Respondents shared a perceived lack of connection. Yes, there was an apparent need to connect with the leadership and be connected as part of those in the inner sanctum but the

congregants, and in this case, the respondents felt there was a disconnect, the hierarchical and mostly male dominant leadership structure did not allow the respondents to self-actualise. This lack of connection facilitated their exit from these communities.

There was also no apparent outreach to other communities and other causes. The feeling expressed was that of a community closed in on itself.

Respondents mention that they were discouraged from criticising the church leadership and from visiting other faith communities. They expressed this as fear-mongering, a fear they perceive to be the cause of this resistance to change and closure to new ideas and reaching out to other communities and involvement in projects outside of the purview of the church leadership.

This leads to the argument that one of the most crucial push factors perceived by respondents was that of feeling trapped and in need of getting free from what they call close-mindedness and the restrictive sense of community they felt in their traditional worship communities.

The sense of negativity is prevalent in the respondents' reflection on the sense of community in their previous worship communities. They felt judged and condemned, and they felt like they had to conform, and we are not free to question the authorities in the Church. They also experienced a lot of fear and guilt as it was used to keep them in check as it were.

The lack of succession planning and the growing of the community resulted in them feeling that they had to make a choice not to belong to the negativity they perceived and experienced in these communities.

One of the more significant indictments on their previous worship communities was the perceived lack of love in the communities.

2.3.3 Liturgy

First of all, respondents felt that the preaching was uninformed and not based on sound education and training. The phenomenon of screaming at the congregants was also presented as one of the major push factors.

In their previous worship communities, respondents felt that they were not heard but also that they were not ministered to and preached in a way in which they felt uplifted. Services were long and not particular to the different groups in the congregation. The general feeling was that the services showed a lack of vision and pastoral education.

There was also apparent favour towards the Old Testament that slotted in with the negativity and in the preaching that left the congregants not feeling engaged.

Liturgical spaces were not comfortable and built for purpose. The buildings were generally old and in need of renovation.

The language used during the liturgies was not inclusive but traditional and legalistic leaving many respondents feeling left out and not engaged. Traditional languages used were seen to foster divisions and suspicion.

The liturgical celebrations were perceived to be old fashioned and lacking in participation. The liturgical celebrations also were not geared towards the different segments of the congregants. Children and youth were not included in services, and there were no ministries geared towards catering for these groups adequately. Liturgies and pastoral ministry were perceived to be out of touch and lacking in relevance to the congregants. The ministries were perceived to be disjointed and insignificant, even if there were many diverse activities.

The ineffectiveness of the coordination of these activities led to the respondents feeling cynical about the pastoral ministry experienced at their previous faith communities.

The general response was that lack of education led to sermons being poorly prepared and even worse delivered. Some respondents felt that in many instances, the pulpit was used to settle personal differences. This, coupled with other negative experiences, led respondents to feel that these liturgical celebrations were unacceptable.

2.3.4 Stewardship

The general sense from the respondents is that they did not feel included in how the financial stewardship of their previous worship communities was organized.

There is the perceived reality that the forced tithing and lack of transparency were barriers to participating in contributing financially. The idea is that the message on responsible stewardship started and ended negative.

The invitation to give was negatively delivered, and the lack of concrete results meant that there was a disconnect that led them not only to stop giving but also physically remove them from the situation and leave.

The lack of concrete projects funded by their previous worship communities and the apparent increase in the financial situation of church leaders at the expense of the outreach projects led the respondents to feel that their financial contributions could be better utilised elsewhere.

Respondents also raised the prevalence of what they call a poverty mentality. This points to an extension of the restrictive and negative tone of the communities they previously belonged to. The poverty mentality speaks to the restrictions the leadership places on the congregants. With this comes discrimination and limiting beliefs regarding who can grow and who cannot. The lack of generosity experienced in their previous churches also influenced them in their capacity, the experienced judgment and discrimination, and a continued lack of openness. Where pastors preached prosperity, it was

perceived to have been at the expense of the message of deliverance and forgiveness. When pastors focused on financial prosperity, this is seen as favouring the elect few at the expense of the mission to improve the whole community.

The respondents also acknowledged racial divides that led to discrimination and the continued lack of openness to accept others and grow the community.

2.4 The pull factors

2.4.1 Leadership

Leadership in their new worship communities is fresh, inspired, educated, collaborative, open, accommodating, innovative, and relevant.

Respondents feel that the leadership in their new communities allows them to grow in their experience and expression of their belief and witness. They feel that their new communities are organised and run like businesses that make use of various and diverse personnel that are educated and growing.

They feel that their new leadership is acknowledging them and that there are different levels of growth meticulously organised and that work. They do not feel left behind by the leadership because the leadership caters for their particular situations.

The general sense is that they do not have personal baggage and that personal issues are not allowed to influence the experience of the Church negatively. The leadership structure lends itself to growth in that different groups within the more massive church structure are led by leaders who connect with the people in these smaller groups. Leadership is open to life experience and the ability to assist congregants in growing within the church community. Through practical and visionary leadership, the Christian experiences Christian life within a

church community aptly situated within their particular context and life situation.

2.4.2 Liturgy

One of the central themes in the responses is that the spiritual offering available at the new worship communities is that it is open, warm, current, relative, to mention but a few.

The preaching and the singing are different from what respondents are used to in their previous communities, but the language is English, and the message is well accepted.

Communication is effective and multifaceted. There are many different platforms on which people are informed and educated. The preaching is not only done from the pulpit but also in small groups called cell groups.

The liturgical space is new, modern, and built to purpose. The effective use of technology in the services and how the buildings are set up and incorporate multimedia plays an integral role in the liturgical offering.

The general feeling is that people feel accommodated and catered for during the services. New members feel welcomed and engaged.

2.5 Data from Rhema North

The following information was collated from extensive research through the world café concept with members of the Rhema North church community.

2.5.1. Push factors

2.5.1.1 Leadership

The pastors were unqualified to conduct proper sermons and lacked proper Bible knowledge to build up a congregation. Consequently, some pastors branded as false pastors and prophets. The shock in the Church was that some immoral leaders guided the Church: the data claimed that some slept with younger girls, and they justified it spiritually. In a sense, all leadership problems would continue out of the above as a lack of salvation, liberation, forgiveness, and spiritual depravity.

Despite the above, pastors were glorified "to the detriment of Jesus." Some pastors were regarded as a "demi-god," a so-called mythological being with more power than a mortal human, but less than "a god." Some pastors were idolised, e.g., with gifts, with the consequences that the community suffered. The pastors focused on prosperity and making money, as opposed to sin and deliverance, and serving the community. Despite the above, some pastors were judgemental and autocratic. The congregation was run as a family business. There was an inward focus with the emphasis on status, concentrating on their agendas. The consequences were that the leadership was unapproachable, and claimed that the uneducated black pastors had no vision for the Church.

Respondents generally shared a dissatisfaction with the sermons preached by black pastors in these traditionally black-led churches. The pastors emphasised the law rather than the teaching of the grace of God towards forgiveness of sins and salvation and liberation. There was no emphasis on the Holy Spirit and relying on his guidance. There was no endeavour to train the congregation through thematic preaching.

Respondents felt that the pastors did not serve Christ nor the needs of the congregation.

Leadership policies pushed people away. The problem with the elders was that age determined their appointment, ignoring anointing or leadership qualities. The congregation monitored the private lives of members to control them. On the other hand, the congregation was seen as not "trustworthy."

There were no leadership opportunities as a strict hierarchy of autocratic rule was maintained by the leaders. The leadership "undermined" the members' serving contributions.

2.5.1.2 Liturgy

There was a lack of Bible knowledge in the Church. The sermons did not contain a proper exposition of the gospel. The spiritual focus was mainly on the Old Testament, with the New Testament virtually ignored. Consequently, no valuable spiritual information taught to the members. More importantly, the emphasis was not on the relationship with God through Jesus Christ.

The Church was a ritual only for Sundays, and the Bible as the basis of Christian knowledge was not honored. Black Africans brought ancestral beliefs into the Church and mixed them with the gospel - the result was that they interpreted the Bible to suit themselves.

The Church, in all its aspects, was not led by the Holy Spirit. It was legalistic, human rules controlled the Church, and there was a lack of spiritual freedom to serve the Lord. Consequently, there was no spiritual growth, and false prophecies were discerned. With no real spiritual church, there was only a "playing of the church," and members were forced to submit themselves to the leadership.

Without spiritual discernment, there was discrimination against members, e.g., women. In general, the Church was not managed spiritually. The church

"embraced" poverty as there was a lack of vision: the result was that the Church did not teach or practice social responsibility. Cliques were formed in the church and gossip spoiled fellowship. The Church had wrong priorities, not following the guidance of the Spirit.

There was a general feeling of dissatisfaction with the sermons in the Church. The pastors emphasised the law rather than the grace of God, the forgiveness of sins and salvation, and liberation. There was no emphasis on the Holy Spirit and relying on his guidance. There was no endeavour to train the congregation in terms of topics in series.

Black pastors were not educated and only followed the rules and their "white" masters. A general problem was that some pastors interpreted the Scriptures to glorify themselves. There was no emphasis on the truth or prophetic teaching in the Church, only a superficial focus on the numbers of attendance in the Church. Salvation through Christ was not emphasised, and some pastors only preached condemnation.

2.5.2 Pull factors

2.5.2.1 Leadership

The leadership makes ample room for improvements every year in the Church. The leadership enhances the practice of "teamwork"; they even allow "input" from other churches. There is not a feeling of being threatened. The behaviour of the leaders towards "secular" people is positive, and they welcome them. Gay and lesbian people are welcome to attend church services.

The congregation experienced the “heart” of God, as opposed to the leaders showing you how sinful you are. The leaders create opportunities for everyone to participate. The pastors make something special regarding “water baptism”. There is an exposure to “excellent speakers”, an introduction to the best talents. “Revelation “from God comes through the pastors.

The leaders organise Annual General Meetings where church affairs are shared with the congregation. The leaders do not concentrate virtually exclusively on material wealth, health, and the pastors need as in the "black churches." The leaders "run with ideas" and are innovative.

The pastors emphasise "grooming" the youth spiritually. Their leadership is perceived to be dynamic. They show fantastic leadership through genuine love and affection with excellent and healthy communication. The leaders have "succession planning" for the congregation. The Church is orderly and not "noisy." The leadership is based on the anointing and not "age." Leadership reaches out to everybody.

There are specialists in various ministries, and they create teamwork. The leaders develop an atmosphere of freedom where you can be what you are, yourself. They create a sense of mission and vision for the members, which most of us have not experienced before.

There is a healthy interaction between the leaders and the people. The “success” of members draw more people to the Church.

2.5.2.2. Liturgy

The sermons concentrate on spiritual growth. It is easy to relate to the preaching style. The worship services are shorter and, consequently, more accessible. The "white pastor" is not "racially biased": They do not judge other denominations, but try to cater to every denomination in Christianity.

The emphasis of the preaching is "to come as you are" to Christ. The preaching is more on love than on "hell and demons." There is no condemnation in the preaching. The consequence is that you feel to be open to accepting and following "a calling." Sermons encourage you to serve other people.

There is enough diversity in the services to reach everyone. Sermons and events are recorded and live-streamed and used in other situations. The overwhelming effect is that the Church has a vision and follows a specific direction.

Sometimes preaching is done in a series of topics, which is meaningful for your life; this is supported by a bookshop on Christian topics to guide you. The order and professionalism of the preaching attract one. Some people have never experienced alter calls, and it is a new involvement to experience such spirituality.

The credibility and relevance of the senior pastor is an essential factor for both the Church and the country. Usually, the preaching is complete without judgment. The church service is attractive to non-members, for example, that they can receive communion. The sermons are a real weekly "upliftment." The pastors themselves portray a relaxed atmosphere by not having rules to wear suits. The pastors usually speak naturally and adequately. The youth pastors are fully involved with the youth and students.

The "white churches" offer practical approaches through their sermons to life and real situations facing Christians. There is "amazing leadership," which is a real example to follow. The pastors handle prayer requests. A spirit of fellowship is enhanced in the services, which creates "a sense of family

."

The central aspect of the sermons is that Jesus is fully acknowledged. The people experience full "acceptance" through preaching; consequently, people

are willing to "grow" spiritually. The impression of the pastors is that they are genuine and "real."

The presence of the Lord is experienced in the services. Different types of preaching are presented, but they have a "holistic doctrinal" approach.

Preaching is more about the love of Jesus. Usually, the sermons are individually unique, and it is not the same old story. Youth services and youth camps form part of these churches' youth ministry, and outreach programs are. Intricate and ultra-modern screens project messages and display lyrics of songs and hymns, keeping congregations engaged — service times and convenient for everybody, ensuring maximum attendance.

The service is the "fantasy" of experiencing something seen on the TV screen. The focus is on the particular individual, and you feel special. The sermons are more "transformation" by grace than by "the law." There are less hypocrisy and pretense, and consequently, less "sabotage" of the spirituality of the gospel.

Worship music draws people to Church. Some people, however, do not enjoy it so much. The sound system is suitable for the church building. Concerts with celebrities are arranged, which people enjoy. The Church is well advertised with ample creativity. "white" music is a new experience. The praise and worship atmosphere is very youth-inspired and "freeing." There are excellent worship leaders with functional sound systems. There are opportunities for you to read and study for yourself.

There are several possible positives. A good LED screen; toilets are clean; buses taking people to Church; in a large church one can easily hide if one wishes to do; there are suitable instruments for singing; seats are comfortable; lights in the Church are sufficient; there is no "clutter"; no "uniforms are required in the church; "tattoos" are viewed as usual; the Church supplies free

coffee and food the Church has a great deal of fun, and one can easily relate to it.

2.5.2.3. Community and mission

There is a friendly and positive approach to welcome one to the Church:

There are many platforms and ways to keep congregants connected to the Church; the Church provides free transport for university students. The Church is very generous and assists the needy with necessities, for example, through the "Hands of Compassion Project"; they supply food for those in need.

There is ample room in the Church for black student leaders. Many parts of the Church are specialised, which make everybody feel welcome, the Kid's Church, campus ministry, and social media. The children are well catered for; the Sunday school is conducted during the services.

There is an opportunity towards exposure for everyone: a specific platform that fits everyone to receive exposure. There is ample access to events through CDs, DVDs, as well as other available literature in the Church.

The Church aligns with the workplace and university life, which makes the Church relevant to members. The Church has time for everyone and their circumstances and makes time available for members. Everyone is well-connected to the Church and takes the diversity of people into account.

What is essential is that there is gender equality in the Church, which makes an immense difference. The development of members is taken into account by way of ample free conferences. One is allowed to make personal progress, despite mistakes.

An essential aspect of being the Church is that every "type of race" is accommodated. There is freedom in the Church to act and to interact with everybody; it is a "world of its own."

Being part of a relevant and "leading" church causes people to experience success in what they are doing. Personal growth is experienced "all-around ."

An essential aspect of life is that the possibility of a life partner is available, that is, "to find and keep" life partners. Events are organized to address the needs of young people, for example, dating, relationships, and marriage. The Church's attitude extends to life outside the Church – consequently, the Church is not only on Sundays but also during the week. The Church is also about "having fun ."

The Church has a proper structure in place, causing a set way of accomplishing aspects of life. There is also an "on-campus fellowship." The Church feels "like home" as we grew up in a similar atmosphere of a church.

An "urban culture approach" makes the Church relevant and makes the Church relevant for "millennials," born after the year 2 000. There is ample opportunity for interaction with pastors. There is freedom to support one to voice one's own opinion. There is liberty regarding no "dress codes"; freedom exists to be unique, and not to conform to everybody else. There is, however, a feeling of "aspiring to whiteness," which is not necessary. The Church provides a platform that "you can be yourself"; this facilitates the introduction and induction into the Christian way of living

Those who go to whit led churches are liberated from restrictive rules of "black churches" to allow life to be "real." Genuine hospitality is in the order of the day. There is no attitude of the aged old saying that some are more important than others; consequently, people that go to these churches form friendships easier. The respondents refer to a new kind of life energy they discovered in these churches that makes them see life differently. One is stimulated by being

surrounded or immersed in a church community that supports and encourages creativity.

One can notice "the work of God" in people's lives. With flourishing fellowship and spiritual growth, there is "abundant resources" in the Church.

There are "outreach programs" with excellent facilities, which accommodate everyone. Everyone feels at home as there is no interference in one's personal life, only support groups to assist you.

There is a variety of types of teaching and media of instruction which is inclusive for everyone. Technologically they move with "the times." Everything is put in perspective of the Church and modern life, but the approach is not stifling – there is freedom to be you, and you feel socially significant.

To participate in the Church brings about synergy, interaction, and cooperation. One is inclined, however, to "idolise" a "white pastor," for the single reason to see how well "he does things." There is no pressure to become a member. In general, there is an atmosphere of feeling welcome.

2.5.2.4. Stewardship

The congregation is not made to feel guilty if they do not present offerings. What is most responsible is that there is proper "financial accountability." There is an "abundance of resources" in the Church: you know and can see where your offerings go to. Wealth and prosperity are encouraged in the Church.

2.6 Research sample

Here are some of the responses from respondents when asked the questions in the world cafés. I add these here in order to give some perspective on the type

of responses received to the research questions conducted during the world café in particular concerning the respondents from Rhema North church focus group.

2.6.1. Question 1

Why is there resistance to go back to black pastored churches?

Some people wish to go back to black churches because young children need proper information. It is the duty of "the blacks" to support the ones left behind. The reason for the resistance is that they are not free in the black churches to live out their religion; they are living under the law. The black churches instill cultural practices, controlling them. They think that what they know is the truth. You have to go back to teach them the truth. You should use your knowledge to "give back" assistance to them in the townships; white churches do things "better." We also need to see whites going to churches in Soweto.

There is resentment among black people, also within themselves. They are wounded and need upliftment, enforcing conversation, and finding self-love. There should not be superiority between "black" and "white."

Personal culture in black people is influenced by western culture unconsciously and in a subliminal way. The above questions suggest that a white church has inherent traits that a black church does not have, which is not valid. We should not view the black churches as "black," but rather as "our church."

White churches have westernised "blacks." Consequently, black people have become apologetic and try to fit into white churches. Education is an essential factor; it exposes us, and blacks tend to think "white is better than black". We need decolonisation. Personal growth is needed and not white superiority.

Whites are open to creativity, but so are blacks.

We have to recognise that blacks are "stuck" because of past oppression. Blacks still have feelings and thoughts that "white is better than black". History has

played an essential part as racism has made black people feel inferior. Blacks are hesitant with new ideas as it feels like a "crime": your ideas are always "shot down". Many black people are "stuck," and their dreams are defeated.

It is essential to realize that joining white churches sometimes makes us forget our cultural roots. On the other hand, however, white churches allow us and make room for black cultures.

2.6.2. Question 2

Why do we prefer to go to a church where the leadership is made up of white people?

The issue of race or racism is irrelevant in the Church

Many of us do not acknowledge "racial differentiation" anymore. We do not regard the "question of race," the race and culture of a person, as good thought, idea, or issue to pursue anymore. In the real Church of Christ, race does not play a role.

The boundaries between black and white have to be freed to experience "white churches"; white churches are due to historical "apartheid." The issue is not about race anymore, but about demographics, the statistical details of the population where blacks are essential. The real issue regarding the Church is to be led "by the Holy Spirit," over against particular "political views" or ideologies, where personal political convictions are made absolute to be maintained as so-called truth.

We have to make our service and money contributions to the Church as the Holy Spirit leads us. Some of us see race as an "ideology," an absolute truth, but basically, "there is no black or white in the Church. The Christian must "just go"

where the Holy Spirit leads. It is the "same God" in the white Church; God will bless us wherever we are.

The reasons to move away from the "black" churches should not be based on race. We are not looking for "white pastored churches," we are looking for "urban churches." It is just by chance that the majority of urbanised churches are "white" dominant. Racial segregation is almost irrelevant to millennials. It should not matter what colour my pastor is, as "we are all the same before God."

If we are "growing" Christians and participate in the Church, it is reason enough to stay in that specific Church, whether it be in the suburb or township. In some things, white people are superior, and some black people are superior. As long as you are "equipped", no one is "superior to the other." There should be no "barriers" between people.

In the Church, it does not matter which "race is more dominant than the other". "White privilege" is seen as "progressive" in the eyes of black people. To move to white pastored churches is not a bad idea as it is "not a matter of race," but of "spiritual growth." "Church is the church," and the race is not the "biggest motivation." We have a generation that is not bothered by race as much as "20 years ago".

What is important is that we should not support a "washed-down gospel to fit the race." We should not reject the Word if a foreign person preaches it: 1 Cor. 14:21, "The Lord says, I will speak to my people. I will speak through the lips of foreigners..."

As a young "generation," the way we are wired makes it impossible "to gel" in our communities or environment as it is limiting us because of a lack of progress. We do not care about "colour", it is about the content of the Church. It is not about colour, but about "what is happening." The Bible says there is "no Jew or gentile," so there is no issue of culture, based on what Jesus has done.

2.6.3. Question 3

What are the negatives against the traditional churches in the townships?

There was a great deal of negative feedback data regarding the reasons why it was not possible to stay in the township churches:

"Black people" do not give support. Black people are not equipped; they just start churches. We are not "loud and proud" of black churches, and of traditional rules; there is no variety; there is no innovation or renewal, the children have to follow their parents. The people are ignorant and not critical about life and try to be "super-spiritual."

There is no education of the congregation, which would force pastors to study and adapt their preaching to the intellectual level of the congregation.

There is seldom financial accountability. The serious problem is that the township churches are poor; consequently, there is no development. Their focus is more on money than on the Word of God. There is no real in-depth Bible knowledge, and the church "picks and chooses" what to follow. They are afraid of change. Black people use "vernacular songs" and cannot adapt. They do "traditional things" that do not "align" with the Bible; even regarding the clothing, the outfit is traditional.

There is not much "Bible truth" in the Church. There are too many old "laws and principles" without development. You are "caged-in," and they are "self-focused." They are "divisive" and not progressive, and members are not valued. Black pastors "piggy back" on the prosperity of white churches, rather than to develop their own black communities. Black people cannot work together.

Younger people and children are "seen and not heard." "Limitation barriers" remain as elders stick to the "old ways." In these black pastored churches, your views are not considered unless you are financially able to contribute.

Christianity is treated as an "ideology," to believe what they prefer – they have not learned to follow the Holy Spirit. Black church leaders need "exposure." The churches have to learn to be relevant. Black people are not willing to listen, as they think they are "perfect."

Insecurities in leadership hamper growth. They are too focused on sin. People who are being judged stop going to Church. It is "boring" in black churches. Black churches tend to be "prophetic," but they take "advantage" of the people. They are not interested in "growing" and to expand as they are complacent.

Is not the Church's focus supposed to be on other people? Black people's focus is on themselves and not God; the Church is changed into a human institution, and they forget "people want Jesus" and not humans and their problems. There is no room to make development contributions.

Biblical leadership is not "fully followed," and so people leave the Church; they are also leaving because of their churches' "stubbornness." We leave because of the non-progressing nature of their "doctrine" – they do not apply the Scriptures in the contemporary culture.

2.6.4. Question 4

What are the positives in the white pastored churches?

There were many positive aspects of why it is vital to move to the white pastored churches:

White people are open-minded, and they can do what they wish to do. They have "time-management skills," whereas black people think that if they spend more time in the Church, they are more spiritual. We have to "listen" to one

another and respect each other's decisions. Black churches are supporting different classes according to status, which is against the gospel.

There is no point of reference or an objective standard that white-pastoring churches are not right. The white-pastoring churches do not discriminate against us. In the traditional churches, the blind leading the blind as they have blind loyalty to tradition. There is an intellectual gap; once a person is educated, they cannot relate anymore. We outgrow the pastors because of their reluctance to improve and make progress. The white Church is structured correctly.

There is no white supremacy in the white pastored churches – the Church is driven by their needs and circumstances: Jesus is not white, but Jewish/Hebrew. We could not build up the traditional Church as we had "no voice" there; we cannot "give back" there as our ideas are foreign to them.

We do not think of the churches as "white," but rather as "modern"; modern does not indicate colour or race. "White people" attend institutions to learn about the Bible and about life and people; there is a variety of people in the Church, which is enriching.

The white pastored churches are financially "better off" to develop. They have a platform to serve in other ways than financially. They "shepherd" the people spiritually. We worship in English, which we understand, and which is not possible in the townships. It is better to read the Bible in English as we come from model C schools.

People are organised. The teaching is that black or white does not matter; God will guide you. With problems, the blacks know-how "to stand up" to white people. We believe the Holy Spirit "has led" us to white-pastoring churches. "White privilege" is attractive to black people, and they want to be like them.

There is a "broader spectrum." They focus more on Jesus, and they welcome positive contributions.

The environment is what matters, rather than "personal views." Practical facilities matter and are better, for example, toilets. The white Church says there is "room to learn." Progressive culture is "always attractive."

Chapter 3

Charismatic pastors reflecting on Push and Pull factors behind the exodus of black Christians towards White Charismatic Churches.

3.1 Introduction

The following chapter focuses on the push and pull factors as experienced and reflected on by pastors at Crystal Towers Hotel in Cape Town, Cape Town South pastors, Rhema North, and Johannesburg South.

Here I would endeavor to collate the responses by the individual groups and identify some of the factors the pastors in these different church communities identify as reasons why people move from historical township churches to white pastored church communities.

3.2 Cape Town Pastors (Crystal Towers)

The pastors reflect on what they think the factors are that push people out of their traditional congregations and into white pastored congregations and also at the factors that pull people and make them stay in their traditional congregations.

3.2.1 The push factors

Pastors start with what they call the engineering of slavery. They put this down as one of the fundamental causes of the exit of their congregants to join white pastored churches. The pastors express a deep-seated mistrust and fear that makes people move from what they consider to be an inferior church and a move to a superior church in the white pastored churches. The white person is seen as a symbol of success and achievement. There is this perceived limiting belief that is identified as a trust in the person who is white. The white person

can be trusted with money, whereas the black person is less so. The slavery mentality is what leads people to believe that it will be better with them in a community lead by white leadership.

Prosperity and advancement have somehow in the collective consciousness of the black population been identified and associated with being white. The image of white as better than black is central to the pastor's response to the question, “why do people choose to leave your congregation and join a white led church?”

The deep-seated distrust expressed by the pastors is a clear indication that this is what they identify as a significant push factor that leads their people to believe it will be better with them if they join a church lead by a white leadership.

The pastors refer to a perceived complex of inferiority on the side of black members of their church, which leads them to see their geographical, educational, demographical situations as almost in a way confirming their inferiority to white people. The pastors refer to this as something of a sickness suffered by both black and white people.

The slavery mentality is once again accentuated by seeing the townships as places you go into, like a prison or a zoo, whereas you would go to a suburb or town where the white people stay — thus identifying the geographical places of residence for black people as areas of captivity. This then is seen as one of the factors pushing people from the townships to go to a church where they would be free.

The culture of trust and the mentality of empowerment is also one of the factors the pastors identify as a strong push factor. The perceived reality is that black people would instead give their money to the white led churches as opposed to their local pastors in the townships.

The pastors ascribe the apparent successes of the white lead mega-churches to the ability to raise capital easier because white people have the money, and black people will trust them with their money because they are white.

In the black communities, there is a sense of the poverty mentality that results in an extreme risk aversion and outright distrust resulting in them moving their money out of the townships and into white-led churches.

Pastors also identify the apparent inability and the fear of the unknown in their communities. There is an apparent lack of vision and an attachment to the traditional. This leads to the exodus of the millennial; young people leave because they cannot handle being stuck in the past.

Pastors refer to what they call an apartheid complex that people in the townships suffer. This is understood as the effects of apartheid, limiting the black church members and making them believe that whites are better despite political equality. There is still the need for redress in the socio-economic and on a more individual level, the emotional spheres.

The socio-economic situation in the townships are influenced by the changes associated with the new dispensation in 1994. Affirmative action and the changes that it brought to the country is seen as having accentuated the deep-seated political, socio, and economic divides there existed and still exist within the townships and the people who were raised there.

The white person is seen to be superior. There is the lingering limiting belief that black people cannot manage themselves and that the white person is better equipped to lead and manage.

The lack of skilled leadership is identified as a push factor. Pastors feel that they are not sufficiently skilled in leadership, so they feel inept to lead their own.

This leads to emotional responses to challenges that could have been much better approached and resolved if the pastors had the leadership capabilities.

Pastors admit that they are unable or find it very challenging to deal with the problems and challenges millennials face. In the absence or the lack of appropriate leadership, the pastors use tradition as something they cling to and use to very little success in their leadership strategy.

Concerning money and contributing to the church and its efforts, there is an apparent unwillingness to contribute to the local township church but an apparent willingness to contribute to the white pastored churches.

The main reason for this, as identified by the pastors, is that the congregants feel obliged to give in the township parish whereas in their new churches, they are not obliged, or they do not feel obliged. This makes them give because they see they do not have to but want to.

Involvement in the traditional churches is mandatory and enforced as opposed to the freedom to choose whether or not to be involved in the new churches. In these new churches, people are made aware of their spiritual discipleship and their commitment to active discipleship.

Another push factor is that people feel they have to conform, and there is no apparent separation from church and private or social life, whereas, in the new churches, they have this way of separating the church from social life. The question of judgment is also very central to the decision to leave the township churches.

The preaching and teaching and rules of life have a fair amount of judgment. In the new churches, the preachers make sure that their messages are free from judgmental expressions and are inclusive.

The township pastors pride themselves in calling a spade a spade. Black churches are expressive, and this is evident in pastoral action.

The pastors admit that they are strict, and they see themselves as fathers who have to maintain their traditions. The approach of teaching and preaching in the new churches is different, more relevant, and open to the prevailing trends and cultures.

The general feeling of a lack of openness and an apparent inability to bring about the change in themselves is evident in the responses. The pastors even reflect on why the white church leadership do not engage with them and assist them in acquiring the skills necessary also to do what they do in their churches. The challenges are mostly with dealing with the past. They struggle to bring themselves and their communities out of the past into the present. They also need to adopt a future-facing approach to being the church. There is a sense of openness to the need for growth and change on the part of the pastors.

3.2.2 The pull factors

The pastors reflect on their ministry and how they can help bring people back to their township communities. The first factor that raised is the need for genuine introspection and the realisation that there is a real need for change. There is a need to stop complaining and being a victim and start learning and applying new information about self and the current situation in order to move forward.

In order for the situation to be remedied, it needs a move towards the future and an openness to change.

There is agreement that the pastors in these township churches can be agents of change but that the core inequalities and the burden of past oppressive systems

need to be acknowledged and incorporated into changing and becoming more open and visionary as a church.

Cultural sensitivity and authentic integration are some of the issues that are strongly considered. The reality that culture influence who we are and how we understand ourselves makes it paramount to growing a new sense of the church in the township.

Worship also needs to be carefully considered because it is one of the most critical factors that cause people to move to their new church communities. It is agreed that it is difficult to change the way churches in township worship.

In an attempt to remedy the situation, should there be a general drive towards renewal and change, or should there be new churches established in the townships that would be geared to the needs of the millennials?

On the other side, there are the existing township churches where people have been worshipping in their traditional way. There should be a process that includes both these responses. On the one hand, the needs of the millennials need to be recognised and ministered to, but on the other hand, those who are still looking backward need to be assisted and their limiting beliefs addressed and worked through in order to allow them also the ability to be in a church community that is visionary and open to change. The deep-seated issues of cultural insensitivity, racism, persecution, and abuse are to be acknowledged and healed.

The long walk to freedom is used as an analogy of the process and approach needed to look at the problems facing these church communities and walking together towards freedom and a better celebration of the church.

Pastors argue that people leave their churches, and this process takes a long time, they do not just leave. Pastors are asking what makes people decide to leave after being part of their church for so long.

The observation is made that those who leave are members of status and upwardly mobile members of society. The pastors feel a sense of loss in that they feel these members have been in their churches for so long and then leave.

Is the world following the church or in the church following the world? People are associating with the crowds of their choice and want to be seen as progressive and moving up.

Some of the answers would be to concentrate on the young people and walk the journey with them and make them part of the journey through productive mentoring and investment to ensure the continuation of the faith communities they belong to.

Some stay despite the apparent exodus. They stay because they identify with the ministry and feel that it is relevant to them. The message speaks to the effects of apartheid and how it is still experienced in society today. Those who stay identify with the message that this suffering that is still shared and experienced by many. The message is reinforced by the fact that these people still identify their white leadership at work with the remnants that apartheid left them with.

The next steps should include cross-pollination between the township churches and the white-led churches; there could be growth in accepting that there can be an exchange and mutually beneficial relationship between the two. The future depends on it.

3.3 Cape Town Pastors South

3.3.1. Push factors

The general indication from respondents is that they moved from coloured pastored churches to white pastored churches.

Socio-political and financial considerations.

Respondents did not know where they fitted in, and when they were invited to go to white pastored churches, they felt comfortable and moved there. Their previous churches are described as very traditional, religious, and even dead. The lack of fulfillment and purpose lead people to seek a church where they would feel accommodated and engaged. There was also a hunger for more spiritual nourishment, and this was lacking in their previous church.

Respondents that mentioned they came from the Methodist and Catholic churches felt that they were not satisfied with their experience of the church and then went out in search of what they call a more profound spiritual experience. The push factor here was a perceived lack of spiritual nourishment that led them seeking for it elsewhere.

What is called the charismatic experience in the white pastored churches led them away from their previous faith communities because they felt there was a lack of liveliness in the worship experience.

Respondents acknowledged that the effects of apartheid had a lot to do with their decision to move to white pastored churches. They felt that the administration and management of their coloured churches were not so proper, and on the other hand, the white pastored churches had a more professional and sophisticated feel.

In their previous church, they did not feel catered for, but in the white pastored churches, they felt wanted.

The coloured pastors they had in their previous churches are seen as problematic and an essential factor in respondents making a move to white pastored churches. Coloured pastors also lacked education and training. Communication was also not very useful in their previous communities. Coloured pastors were also seen to add to the division in the church by starting new churches on their own.

There are also clear indications of the old colonial and apartheid mentality that sees white people as superior to others, and thus the white pastored churches were seen as better than the coloured ones.

3.4 JHB South Senior Pastors

3.4.1. Push factors

One of the responses shows that there might be a discrepancy between the preaching in the black Charismatic churches and white-pastoring churches as far as the quality is concerned including the preparation of sermons

The feeling is that white-pastoring churches have better facilities for called: "chill vibes," i.e., fellowship and socialising after church. People feel that the church spaces in black churches are not adequate; they meet in old buildings or other cases, buildings that are not fit for worship, like private homes, school classrooms, or garages.

Practical issues like security and accessibility also push them to decide in favour of leaving. They feel they do not have to wait and build the church that is fit to purpose in the township if they can leave and go to a white pastored church that is new and built to purpose.

White-pastoring churches are event-driven or are catering for specific categories like singles and married couples. In black charismatic churches, people feel overlooked. They feel indifferent to the pastor.

White-pastoring churches use well known and famous international brands like Hillsong, for example. The lack of effective brand management in black charismatic churches is seen as one of the factors pushing people to leave.

The colonial concept that was reinforced by the system of apartheid that argues that the white race relates to excellence and is better than local cultures and its abilities. The congregants would, therefore, rather be led by a white pastor and feel entitled and overly familiar with pastors of their ethnic group and background. There is still the image of Christ and the angels depicted as white.

Another push factor would be the people leaving black charismatic churches because they want to be free from the apparent familiarity in their historic communities. They would rather prefer to be part of a vast community where they remain anonymous or not that familiar with the pastor.

Continuing on cultural and social factors, people who leave black charismatic churches feel that they have been constricted and limited by the cultural need for uniformity and strict control. They feel that once they leave, they break free from the overly controlled and policed communities.

The black pastor is also seen in many instances as concentrating more on advancing himself than pastoring the community. The church has become institutionalised, and the worship experience is uniform.

The herd mentality influences the interpersonal dimension within the black charismatic churches. This mentality includes a lot of suspicion and jealousy on the part of the members and the leadership. As was mentioned by one of the respondents: "Black people have serious trust issues, we treat each other with suspicion." The prevalence of cliques is also one of the reasons people feel left out and push to go elsewhere. Some people feel that preferential treatment is given to other people, and they are discriminated against. The cliques bar new people from getting in and taking part in the activities of the church.

The inferiority complex, on the one hand, and the assumption that white is, by definition, better creates different expectations between black and white Charismatic church members. Double standards are applied in judging a black

or white church. White pastored churches are seen to encourage excellence and upward mobility as opposed to black charismatic churches that are in maintenance mode.

The power dynamic and possibility of abuse is also a robust deciding factor because, in most cases, white church leaders are seen to be more accountable to church councils, whereas in the case of black charismatic churches, it appears that the pastor could fire the board of the church. The conflict resolution mechanisms are therefore considered better in white churches than in black churches.

The mentality of the black charismatic churches is said to be more geared towards maintaining the traditions and the *status quo*. The liturgical and general pastoral theme is that of stability and traditional uniform practice.

There is very little openness to trying new music or worship styles. There is also an apparent lack of contemporary ministry in that there is only one service; the ministry does not cater to different age and interest groups.

The look and feel of the pastoral offering in the black charismatic churches are no longer appealing to the people who decide to leave. They feel they would instead go if their views are not acknowledged and valued.

The apparent lack of structured management in historical black charismatic churches seems to be a strong push factor.

It is also thought that the black charismatic churches are not as relevant as far as issues in society are concerned

Demographics show that the younger generation has better access to education and are mobile and connected. The younger generation does not have a history of colonialism and apartheid but wants to advance and be part of the trend. They tend to move away from the traditional formats and values that they find in the

black Charismatic church and make the switch to the white-pastoring churches easier because it is trendy and more comfortable to identify with.

They also identify with the business model and the value proposition offered in the white-pastoring churches as opposed to the black charismatic churches that do not necessarily speak to them in the same jargon. They feel more comfortable to relate to the people where they reside now that have the same social status and lifestyle. As the black church meets operational needs, the white church is project-driven.

In the black church, they do not feel motivated to give, whereas in the white church, they feel they are contributing to a particular clearly defined project with measurable results.

There is also an upper-middle-class migration that sees people physically moving away from the townships to the suburbs where most of these white-pastoring churches are located. They then prefer to go to the local church rather than to commute to the church in the township. Their new church fits in with their new look and is integral to their brand.

3.4.2. Pull factors

The white-pastoring churches are seen to be progressive, innovative, organised, driven, diverse, and on time. The main pull factors are that of inclusivity, upward social, financial, and cultural mobility. People feel drawn to these communities because they are seen to be current and relevant.

People feel that the sermons are well prepared, and the pastors are well equipped with education and experience. The sermons are also not judgemental or overly religious. The music and sound arrangement are of a very high standard. The church buildings and services are accessible and cater to everyone, including people with disabilities.

There is a sense of respect and value for the leadership and the congregation. The leadership is educated, and the pastoral offering is diverse and inclusive. People feel that they are valued and catered for. The organisation of these churches is seen to be transparent and well organised. People employed in these churches are educated and experienced.

The interpersonal dimension is both warm and private. People feel that they are acknowledged and catered for but that they are not policed. They can both be part of a community and be lost in a crowd. People feel safe at these churches because there are security and integrity.

The churches are built for purpose, ensuring a seamless integration of various forms of worship while making excellent use of multimedia. Communication happens at various levels and is very useful, giving people a feeling of being connected and willing to contribute to the discussion.

The organisation of the white-pastoring churches encourages the youth to be part of the pastoral life of the church. There is mentoring and leadership training.

3.5. Cape Town pastors

Apartheid transformed the minds of the people and resulted in the black population identifying with white people as the authority in particular where teaching is concerned. Historically education was led by white people in all levels of the education cycle. Access to tertiary education was heavily monitored, and black students were limited in their access to education. The system of Bantu Education employed by the white apartheid regime was geared to ensure that white people received superior education to the rest of the population. This practice has been taken up by the church too. Black teachers teach an inferior education in townships while white teachers do the opposite in white schools. This left the black population of this country with the legacy of

white supremacy over black inferiority. It was thought that one could only learn from a white person. The exodus of many black people from township black pastored churches to suburban white pastored churches could be understood in this context.

The severely traumatic situation of coloured South Africans damaged by the systematic abuse and degradation of the apartheid regime lends itself to a tendency to associate with white people as superior and, therefore, also the assumption that white pastored churches are superior. The idea of upgrading your status by associating with white people is also a powerful element.

Previously people of colour dreamed of doing what white people did in apartheid, living in their areas, and attending their schools, going to white pastored churches would, therefore, be part of this tendency.

The inferiority complex that the current generation inherited has left them feeling the need to go to the more significant churches with the perceived better pastoral offering found in the white churches. What also pushes people away from black pastored churches is the traditional mentality that limits progress and makes these churches stagnate while the mega-church buildings flourish in white areas. The white pastored churches are seen as better resourced and open to change and progress not only in mentality but also in the size of the churches.

There are, however, people who made a move back to their previous black pastored churches because they realised that these churches had raised the level of pastoral offering and impact. The white mega-churches in Cape Town have shown some decline because people of colour are starting to return to their traditional and historical communities. A change is starting to be seen as a result of black charismatic churches. Younger people who are in township churches tend to move towards embracing who they are in their present churches. They

do not feel the need to go because their churches also have what the white pastored churches have

Another respondent remarked that the traditional methodology in the black pastored churches acted as a push factor in favour of more progressive white pastored churches. The conservative adherence in coloured churches pushed many educated socially upward-moving people of colour in the Western Cape to join white pastored churches.

Pull factors include the progressive and liberal practices in the white pastored churches. The liberal and affluent image of white pastored churches also draws people away from more traditional and poorer township churches. Another pull factor could be that people see white pastored churches as being in touch with the needs of the contemporary young person.

A reflection by a youth pastor introduces the crisis of identity that the younger generation suffers. The pastor puts young people into two categories; those who passively accept and those who aggressively oppose the present situation. There is also a lack of knowledge about the full extent of the injustice of apartheid, and this leaves younger people not knowing how to respond. The lack of definitive leadership among black South Africans further complicates the situation. The youth pastor asks the question that other than Allan Boesak, who could be seen as a leader in the identity and consciousness of the coloured population in the Western Cape? The respondent continues to argue that if the full extent of the injustice is not laid bare, there could not be healing. The need for a prophetic voice and effective leadership is identified as a real danger that could lead to younger people resorting to unrest and even violence.

Another respondent continues the need for a prophetic voice within the church. The uniqueness of the situation of the church in Cape Town needs to be taken

into consideration and in the context of South Africa. There is also the need to see the challenges the church face as particular and not to be confused with the political situation and the emancipation struggle in the United States of America because the civil rights movement is different from the struggle against apartheid. The respondent refers to the struggle in South Africa as the struggle for a South African dream and not the American dream.

This is a call for the church to return to its prophetic obligation to justice and restoration. The white American missionary has brought the message of salvation with his own bias. The respondent calls for a middle way between capitalism and socialism to what he calls self-determination for the local people. There needs to be a move away from the bitterness that the previous dispensation has left the people with. The need to stay relevant and prophetic is central to the message that needs to be preached. The Bible needs to be returned to its central place in the mission of the church. The love of God should be the driving force behind the transformation that is so sorely needed in the present society. Those who leave will return.

Another respondent accentuated the need for our stories of abuse and societal suffering under the oppressive regime of apartheid to be documented and shared so as to grow the societal consciousness. The idea of white is right needs to be unpacked, and throughout this process, it needs to be humanised with actual stories of abuse so that the story is given a face, and identity. This will help the people from previously disadvantaged communities take their place and find their voice.

The current leadership owes the upcoming generation the benefit of a record of what has happened so they can make decisions based on information. We need

to grow our identity. The younger generation leaves to go to white pastored churches because they have a specific brand and identity.

The need for effective change is also put forward as a factor that pushes people out of traditionally black pastored communities in favour of the faster changing white pastored communities.

The cyclic nature of the change in the world and our own country calls for the church to lead. Even as an agent of change. The church needs to come up with a fresh approach to the issues in our society. The feeling of being stuck in traditional and archaic expressions' of the gospel message needs to be acknowledged and changed.

Leadership needs to be equipped to deal with the changing demands of its membership, and the gospel message needs to be proclaimed in the current language and trend.

Individual responses of pastors

The following summary refers to an interview conducted with a very successful black South African pastor at a Charismatic church community in South Africa.

The main questions posed to the respondent were: "What pushes people out of churches, what attracts people into white-pastoring churches, and has the legacy of colonialism left us with a superior/inferior complex when it comes to black versus white-pastoring churches."

The pastor reflects on these questions in the context of the church in South Africa with particular reference to the legacies of colonialism and starts the argument by stating that there cannot be a meaningful reflection on this topic without acknowledging that the start of the charismatic movement was driven and led by white people. The perceived reality that white people are closer to

God goes beyond the surface of colonialism but speaks to the very acute lived reality that the gospel was brought to the South African church by white people.

In the '70s and '80s the charismatic movement in the United States of America was led by white people and seeing as a lot of the content of local charismatic churches came from there it meant that from the start, this was very integral to the development of the Charismatic church in South Africa. The very makeup of the message preached, and the experience of worship was therefore influenced by the white people who brought the movement here.

The responded holds the opinion that it is impossible for the way in which the church came to be, how the church understood itself and how the church functioned not to be influenced by the people who brought it here. The cultural understanding of the missionaries influenced how the church started and developed.

The perception that white leaders are considered to be more efficient, better preachers, and reflective of success and progress come from the very beginnings of the church in South Africa.

In the way history is recorded, more is written of the white people. More emphasis is given to their importance in the history of the church. White people recorded the history of the church. The history of the church reflects their narrative. History and its record gravitate towards the role and importance of white people. They are both the authors and the main characters. So white people set the trends of how the church should be. They became like the barometers for the success of the church.

The pastors describe the start and development of the charismatic Christian community as a church in a classroom with a pastor walking on foot.

Black people who start out in these churches stay until they become economically upward mobile and then as soon as they leave the townships they choose the white church. This is choice-driven. It is determined by factors other than practicality because they have the means to commute between where they stay in the suburbs and the townships where their black pastored churches are. They choose the white churches because they feel the black pastor does not deserve them; the black pastor is not deep enough and cannot reach them. This then pushes them to join the white pastored church.

In the respondent's opinion, the push factors have no basis in reality for in his opinion there is no difference in the theological offering found in the black churches and the white churches, on the contrary, the respondent feels that the level of exegesis found in the black pastored churches could even be superior. Respondents concluded that the white pastored church is superior to black pastored churches. This is as a result of the effects of colonialism and the deep-seated bias towards the perception of white superiority. There is a concept that black is seen as negative and shallow. This is seen during significant events where the white pastor who pastors a smaller church as the black pastor is preferred to the black pastor. Still reinforcing the false notion that white is better and superior to black.

There is a so-called "madame" mentality suffered by blacks who made it out of the townships. The respondent refers to the peculiar trend among black people in affluent areas.

The black people in these white churches identify so much with their fellow white members to the point that they look down on poor blacks. They would refuse to do menial tasks but would hire poorer black people and pay them.

Their involvement in social outreach projects by white pastored churches in black communities is more from a perspective of superior acting towards an

inferior. They risk over-identifying with their fellow white church members to the point where they become the madame or the boss. This is a strange problem, seeing as many of these white pastored churches are in very close proximity to very poor informal settlements. This can soon become a genuine crisis. Black people are becoming like white people.

The respondent goes on to describe his astonishment at the apparent inability of those black people who have the resources to go back and uplift the churches where they come from. They seem to be unable to bring themselves to uplift the pastor, who still uses the classroom as a church. Instead, they choose to compare the pastor, who has his church in a classroom with the white pastor. This, despite their intimate awareness of the socio-political situation in South Africa. The white pastor is favoured and preferred over his black counterpart.

The respondent continues to explain the historical bias and disadvantage between the histories of the black and white churches referring to a particular church. The white church was allowed to buy land in areas where black people were not allowed to own property. The black church was disadvantaged by the financial and municipal system as white people and blacks controlled this were discriminated against and bogged down with administrative red tape.

The historical disadvantage is often and conveniently left out in the historical account. The respondent refers to this historical disadvantage as unfortunate. Apartheid favoured the white churches and perpetuated the false notion that white is better than black, and this notion comes as a result of a multifaceted disadvantage suffered by black people.

The respondent introduced another essential aspect that he illustrates with a concrete example. In the case of a funeral and the black people that are members of white churches experience crisis, they approach the black pastor in

the township because they need someone who understands their African culture and could minister to them in their moment of crisis. The black pastor is sourced for this reason and employed for this particular job but is not good enough to lead. The black pastor cannot be elevated to the position and stature of his white counterpart. He is not judged worthy.

People who choose white pastored churches after they have become more resourced have been raised in the black pastored churches. They are beneficiaries of the investment of black pastored church communities. In some instances, the black pastored churches have directly invested in their education and training.

Now that they are financially in a position to contribute to the previous church communities, they prefer to spend their resources in the white pastored churches. The reasons given for this are often not valid or based on truth.

If black people who join white pastored churches were asked would they return to poorer churches and uplift them is a myth. The respondent had these observations to make: The answer differs according to generational groupings.

The person who comes to the black pastored church early in life and then becomes affluent are more likely to stay in the black church than those who come to the black pastored church later in their life and then become affluent. The latter group tends to leave the black pastored church more readily.

Another reason put forward by the respondent could be the context and focus of the black pastors. They are often wired to have the mind of a builder or rebuild. The church in the township requires the pastor to either start the church or rebuilt it. This makes the life of the pastor in the township to be focused on setting up the structure, actual and organisational. There is no talk of settling but a constant drive to construct and establish. The black pastor has to

invest and share. The people do not necessarily want to be part of this process but want rather sit back and be a member.

In the respondent's opinion, the white pastors are using the black pastors to authenticate or affirm them. Their motivation for assisting black pastors and communities is to validate them and even to lure black people to their churches. There is no real appreciation for the gifts of the black pastor, he or she is not seen as an equal, but a means to an end. Even in their churches, the trend is to use affluent black members of white pastored churches to attract other affluent black people to these churches. The concrete example is that in white pastored churches, affluent black people are put in the front rows and given token roles of importance just to get other black people to join.

The respondent refers to an apparent targeting of influential black people by white pastored church leadership. These black people are then used to validate the white church.

They are used to prove that these white churches are credible in a society with a black majority, they are used to demonstrate the impact these white churches have in a majority-black society and also to attract other affluent black people to these white pastored churches. The treatment and importance given to ordinary black people as opposed to affluent and influential black people are remarkably different in practice.

Another observation made by the respondent is that these white pastored churches are misunderstanding the sense of success and achievement in the Christian sense and its prophetic mission. Success for the Christian should include finances, education, and social standing, but it should be more. It should also be in line with the preferential option for the poor, as found in the Gospel and the servant leadership taught by Jesus to the apostles. There should be a

Christian indifference to rank and social standing, and this should be evident in the prophetic ministry of the church.

Another perspective raised by one of the respondents is that of mixed families, where parents migrate for the sake of their children while their parents are from different ethnic groups. They want their children to grow up in a situation that speaks to their current situation.

One of the respondents introduces the view that Christianity seems to be used as a license for white arrogance. A reference is made to the incident at the Rivers church, where a white pastor delivered a racist charged sermon. After public opposition, the pastor apologised on the public forum. This could assist in understanding the presence of white arrogance exercised in their church communities. The black middle class that goes to these churches located in the suburbs are sacrificing their racial ideology in favour of their continued membership of these white pastored churches.

This incident is in the public domain and has enjoyed some publicity. The pastor in question apologised for his remarks and continues to serve as a leader of his church what this incident shows us that racism continues.

The relationship between colonialism and the early missionaries to Africa and the rest of the world can be connected. The missionaries brought the gospel as white Europeans. Coming from their cultural situations in Europe, they were part of the push into Africa, bringing along with them the idea that they are serving the local church from a position of authority and hence introducing this white superiority over the local people.

There cannot be the talk of the church in church without talking about apartheid and its legacy. There is a class struggle between those who have and the have nots. The whites are those who have and the blacks who move to white pastored

churches either have or are beginning to get. In a country with a fast-growing active group of black people who have become rich after 1994, this is becoming an increasingly alarming phenomenon. This group is now the haves, and they associate with the whites who have always been the haves. This is evident in the resurgence of local black pop culture because of the resurgence of black people with means. The white Nederduitse Gereformeerde churches have been historically white and remain so, the black affluent do not go to the historically white NG churches, and they go to white pastored mega-churches led by exclusively white leadership. This demonstrates that it is not only a white/black issue but also a class issue because the blacks who move from the black churches do not go to historically white NG churches, but the new white pastored charismatic churches

White is still seen as better or the ideal. White Christmas, white Father Christmas, white Jesus, and white angels. This image of white makes right needs changing. One of the respondents remarks that the white pastored churches support one another and ensure their continuation, whereas black pastors seem to be incapable of mutual support and the enhancement of their ministry. The defeatist mentality leads to black people undermining one another in favour of white advancement. Blacks tend not to support one another, and when they have the resources, they tend to support the white brands because of the perceived notion that white is better. Whites, therefore, advance at the cost of blacks because of the mentality of self-destruction. There is a definite need to address the mindset of the black pastors and their communities in order to address the perceived inability to see white and black as not superior and inferior.

The challenge is also with the media cycle and what has been reported regarding the church and by whom. The news media chooses what to put on the

news cycle. The owners of news outlets control the narrative. What needs to happen is for open discussion on who controls the narrative. As far as the church is concerned, there should be an open discussion on racism and other social ills. Clear direction should be given so that we not only share the bad but also celebrate the good that is being done and experienced in and through the church.

The racial narrative has been started and is developing. We, as the church, need to address it and allow for open discussion around it. In the words of Nelson Mandela: "No child is born racist." Parents should control the narrative at home in the same way and thus teach their children to be active members of a non-racial society.

The various incidents reported on the television showing people in Spur and KFC committing and suffering incidents of racial violence are not to be seen in isolation but part of a racially charged society in need of intervention.

One of the respondents recounted a real instance of racial prejudice when he asked his white personal assistant to secure an interview with a radio station.

The interview was secured, but the tone of the person in charge at the radio station changed when he realised that the pastor was not white. The respondent continues to highlight that white people control the narrative, and this needs to change.

It is generally agreed among respondents that apartheid and its legacy have negatively impacted the self-consciousness and self-worth of the black population in South Africa, and when black people feel that they have somehow achieved in life, they tend to identify with their previous white masters and now worship together. It is not that the church back home is not what they want anymore; it is because they have arrived, and the church back home does not fit in with their image. They now identify with those who previously oppressed

them. The problem of white superiority and black inferiority can be traced back to colonialism and apartheid, but its continuation can be attributed to the negative self-image suffered by black people as a result of it. As black South Africans, it is difficult for us to celebrate each other and our successes.

We feel the intrinsic need to compete and be better than so our self-worth and self-image are kept intact. When allowed to choose to support the white or the black church project, the black will go past their local churches and support the white church project because they perceive them to be better.

The abuse suffered by previous generations of leaders is negatively impacting the present generation of leaders, and this needs to be addressed.

The deep-seated deprivation of South African society led to the current problems with interpersonal relationships. Racism has brought a breakdown in the ordinary relations of human beings.

The colour of skin has, for a long time, been the determining factor in the tone of relationships, and this needs to be addressed. The creation of white and non-white zones has physically segregated the people of South Africa for too long. This segregation has been used to divide and rule the majority of the population. People's treatment of one another has been defined by the colour of their skin for too long. Now it is difficult to do away with it or have meaningful progress without dealing with the deep-seated issues it has resulted in. White privilege has been the order of the day for too long and needs to be addressed. In order to redress the deprivations of the past, we need to acknowledge it and then have meaningful exchange and move forward.

The issues below the surface are not only that white is right or better or more advanced or excellent, but it is also the black/coloured-ness in those who are not white. In order for the situation to change, there needs to be an in-depth look at

the racial question in South Africa at an intrapersonal level, looking at the self-conscious, the fundamental concept of self.

The argument is made that the black pastored churches see and speak about the exodus of black people to join white pastored churches as a race issue, and the white pastors reportedly see their churches in the context of their strategy.

Maybe the strategies employed by the different pastors should be looked at.

The question is posed: "What will happen if on a Sunday at the main service at Rhema church, you replace Pastor Ray with a black pastor?" If skin colour is said not to be an issue in these white pastored churches, why do they not have black pastors? The same white pastored churches have churches in black townships led by black pastors. These are some of the questions posed by respondents. The issues of racism in the church, in particular, should be something that needs to be addressed aggressively from the pulpit, and there needs to be a general introspection into the intrapersonal consciousness. We do say we are all one in Christ, but are we all the same because, from the looks of it, there is still white supremacy with blacks looking for a reason why they cannot be regarded as the same.

Dealing with the millennials, we have acknowledged that they have been born into a post-apartheid South Africa and a democratic dispensation. The argument is that they are not as burdened with the baggage of the apartheid experiment. Millennials are influenced by the legacy of apartheid and are therefore not exempt from the discussion and the way forward. The church has to speak on the issues of race and its subsequent effects on society. The church in South Africa should take up its prophetic mission and address the issue.

Chapter 4

Underlying assumptions and pathologies in the discourse on black Christians joining white-led Charismatic churches

4.1 Introduction

The chapter is organised in the following way. First, there is a recapturing of some results of the data analysis based on the world cafés with responses from pew members in general. Then responses from Rhema North and responses from the pastors.

Second, in the light of the negative results emanating from the responses from congregants and students, a counter-argument is constructed by lining up the responses from pastors in charge of three black Charismatic Churches, which are quite successful.

Third, a description, analysis, and evaluation of four white pastors pastoring at white Charismatic churches with specific references to their lifestyle, structures of power, theology, attitude towards tithing, and social responsibility.

Fourth, a hypothesis is introduced on underlying factors, spoken and unspoken, hidden or public, that in all probability triggered the exodus from black pastored churches in favour of white pastored churches.

We proceed from the hunch that the crux of the problem there is a dichotomy between the lived reality and the underlying pathologies regarding the migration of black Christians to white-led churches. This hunch is the origin of an investigation understanding the identity and consciousness of the church in our present society. Dealing with and growing out of the demons of our collective and individual past. This is done by looking at the reality of white pastored churches with a large body of black congregants living within the post-apartheid democratic dispensation of South African society.

The question we pose is: "Could there be a need for a radical transformation in mentality among black and white South Africans in the Charismatic churches, and is there a need for a new spirituality of liberation?"

4.2. Recapturing on data analysis

4.2.1 Responses from pew members in general

In recapturing the sentiments expressed by members who left black pastored churches and joined white pastored churches, there is an overall feeling that their move was influenced by factors that pushed them out of the black pastored churches and factors that pulled them to white pastored churches. The overall response from the participants were that their move away from the black pastored churches were not only because of practical reasons but that it is more motivated by aspects of the black pastored churches that they felt pushed them out and aspects of the white pastored churches that pulled them in.

We attempted to group these responses into four main categories, namely leadership, community and mission, liturgy, and stewardship.

Concerning leadership, the overall feeling was that leadership in the black pastored communities was uninspired and uneducated. Their work was perceived to be compromised by abuse of power and lacked the vision to empower others or facilitate change and succession. This left the respondents feeling they should vote with their feet as it were and leave in order to avoid the conflict with the *status quo*.

The respondents expressed their dissatisfaction in the leadership at black pastored church communities because they felt that the pastoral offering was not current or relevant.

They were prepared to leave their historically black pastored churches in favour of pastoral leadership that, in their opinion, is more educated and that delivers superior pastoral care.

Concerning community and mission, the respondents felt that the strict enforcing of cultural and narrow-minded social constructs and the insistence on uniformity and archaic cultural practices made them feel out of place and not catered for.

The result was that they decided to leave and go to communities led by white pastors where they felt included and free to be part of a big church community where they can get lost in the crowd but where they also were included in smaller groups that catered for specific age groups and segments of the community. The effective use of multimedia and other forms of communication also made them feel included and informed.

As far as liturgy goes, the respondents felt that the preaching was uninformed and not based on sound education and training. The phenomenon of screaming at the congregants was also presented as one of the major push factors.

Liturgical space in the black pastored churches is considered of inferior quality and not built for purpose with a large number of churches gathering in makeshift buildings or tents, classrooms, and individual homes. The liturgical offering in black pastored churches was seen as inferior and uninspiring, pointing to the lack of adequate education and training.

What pulled them to white pastored churches was the superior quality of the preaching and the liturgical spaces being current and laid out in a way that catered for multimedia and connected experience. The sermons preached by white pastors in these new churches are also considered to be of superior quality and seem to be better prepared and inspiring.

Concerning stewardship, there is an overwhelming feeling among the respondents that they would easier contribute to white pastored churches for the following reasons in the main:

- They feel that they are not being pushed to give monetary contributions like in their black pastored churches
- They are more inclined to give in the white pastored churches because they feel that their money is being spent well and they contribute to the projects of the church
- Their main reason not to contribute to black pastored churches is that there are no proper structures of management and no vision for the projects of the church.
- Personally, respondents feel that the church leadership benefits disproportionately from the finances of the church.

4.3. Responses from Rhema North

An important observation to be considered here is that the respondents from the Rhema North church community did not indicate which churches they previously attended or whether Rhema North was the first Charismatic church they joined. Generally, the argument or understanding of the historical situation relating to colonialism and apartheid among young South Africans or millennials is that they should not be burdened with what has happened in the past.

There was a great deal of negative feedback in the data regarding the reasons why it was not possible to stay in the township churches:

"Black people" do not give support. Black people are not equipped; they start churches. We are not "loud and proud" of black churches, and of traditional rules; there is no variety; there is no innovation or renewal, the children have to follow their parents. The people are ignorant and not critical about life and try to be "super-spiritual."

There is no education of the congregation, which would force pastors to study and adapt their preaching to the intellectual level of the congregation.

There is seldom financial accountability. The serious problem is that the township churches are poor; consequently, there is no development. Their focus is more on money than on the Word of God. There is no real in-depth Bible knowledge, and the church "picks and chooses" what to follow. They are afraid of change. Black people use "vernacular songs" and cannot adapt. They do "traditional things" that do not "align" with the Bible; even regarding the clothing, the outfit is traditional.

There is not much "Bible truth" in the church. There are too many old "laws and principles" without development. One is "caged-in," and they are "self-focused." They are "divisive" and not progressive, and members are not valued. Black people cannot work together.

Younger people and children are "seen and not heard." "Limitation barriers" remain as elders stick to the "old ways." Views are not considered unless the congregant is financially "stable."

Christianity is treated as an "ideology" to believe what they prefer – they have not learned to follow the Holy Spirit. Black church leaders need "exposure." The churches have to learn to be relevant. Black people are not willing to listen, as they think they are "perfect."

Insecurities in leadership hamper growth. They are too focused on sin. People who are being judged stop going to church. It is boring in black churches. Black churches claim to be prophetic, but they take advantage of the people. They are not interested in growing and expand because they are complacent.

Most of the factors that draw black people to white-pastoring churches as per the respondents from Rhema North is as a result of the difference in the approach of black and white pastored churches. Respondents feel the need for a church that is led by the Holy Spirit over and above particular political views or ideologies, where personal political convictions are made absolute to be maintained as so-called truth.

There needs to be a sentiment that makes service and money contributions to the church motivated by the Holy Spirit. Some see race as an ideology, an absolute truth, but basically, there is no black/white in the church. Church members go where the Holy Spirit leads.

White people are perceived by respondents to be open-minded and able to do what they wish to do. They have time-management skills, whereas black people think that if they spend more time in the church, they are more spiritual.

Respondents feel that there is a definite need to respect each other's decisions. They feel that black pastored churches are supporting different classes according to the status which is against the gospel.

There is no point of reference or an objective standard that white-pastoring churches are not right. The white-pastoring churches are perceived to not discriminate against people from other ethnic groups. The traditional churches are referred to as the blind leading the blind as they have blind loyalty to tradition. There is an intellectual gap, once a person is educated, you cannot relate any more. Respondents feel that they have outgrown the pastors because

of their reluctance to improve and make progress. The white church is perceived to be properly structured.

There is no white supremacy in the white pastored churches – the church is driven by their needs and circumstances: Jesus is not white, but Jewish/Hebrew.

There is the notion expressed that in white pastored churches, there is no need to think of colour or race. White pastored churches are not perceived to be "white" because there is no discrimination on the grounds of colour and race. The modern expression does not indicate colour or race. White people attend institutions to learn about the Bible and about life and people. Respondents feel that in white pastored churches, there is a variety of people in the church, which is enriching.

The white pastored churches are financially in a better position to develop. They have a platform to serve in other ways than financially. They shepherd the people spiritually. The liturgical language is English, which respondents understand, and which is not possible in the townships.

Respondents relate better to reading the Bible in English than Afrikaans. They find this better because they have been to model C schools.

People are organised. The teaching is that black or white does not matter; God will guide you. With problems, the blacks know how to stand up to white people. Respondents believe the Holy Spirit has led them to white-pastoring churches. White privilege is attractive to black people, and the black member who attends these white pastored churches identify with the other white members. There is a broader spectrum. They focus more on Jesus, and they welcome positive contributions.

The environment is what matters, rather than personal views. Practical facilities matter and are better than those in the black-led churches; for example, toilets in white pastored churches are more helpful. In the white pastored churches, there is room to learn. Progressive culture is perceived to be the key to their decision to opt for white pastored churches.

4.4. Responses from Pastors

Concerning the responses from several pastors who took part in focus groups and individual interviews, the following responses came through:

- The respondents see the effects of colonialism and apartheid as one of the main factors that influence the current state of the Church. It also accounts for the push and pull factors leading black South Africans to leave their historical church communities led by black pastors and go to churches lead by white pastors.
- The argument that black pastored churches are inferior and white pastors superior is not based on fact, and even in the instances where white pastors are considered to be more educated than black pastors, it can be directly correlated to the discrimination suffered through apartheid.
- The white pastored churches are benefiting unfairly from the large black membership that came from black pastored churches where they were beneficiaries of the black pastored churches investment.
- The accusation that the behaviour of black pastors is morally questionable and that they are under investigation or accused of moral impropriety in the public forum is not a true reflection of the majority of the body of black spiritual leadership. White pastors are seemed to be given a free pass on moral issues, and even when it comes to instances of financial impropriety, they are

left off the hook and are not seen to be held to the same standard as is expected of their black counterparts.

Pastors that were part of the research process agree on the very important part that colonialism and apartheid have in the understanding of the present exodus of black congregants in favour of white pastored churches.

They put this down as one of the primary causes why congregants leave their historical church communities to join white pastored churches. The pastors express a deep-seated mistrust and fear that makes people move from what they consider to be an inferior church to what they perceive to be a superior church in the white pastored churches.

The white person is seen as a symbol of success and achievement. There is this perceived limiting belief that lends itself to see white people as superior to black people, and that white is right and good and black is to be mistrusted and seen as inferior.

The white person can be trusted with money, whereas the black person is less so. The slavery mentality is what leads people to believe that it will be better with them in a community lead by white leadership.

Pastors agree that an attempt at answering the question of why people leave to go to white pastored churches are complex and multilayered. They agree that the historical situation needs to be looked at first and foremost if one would attempt an answer. The deep-seated psychosocial and economic legacy of apartheid and colonialism cannot be underestimated in the quest for an understanding of the phenomenon. The pastors argue that the effects of colonialism and apartheid have left both the pastors and congregants to believe that white is superior and black inferior.

The beginnings of the missionary effort in South Africa is to be seen in context because it came to the local population as part of the colonial system and was

entrenched in the system of apartheid. The impact on the local society is far-reaching, and the current situation is indicative of deep-seated suffering that continues within the consciousness of South Africa.

The pastors reflect on their ministry and how they can help bring people back to their township communities. The first factor that is raised is the need for genuine introspection and the realisation that there is a real need for change. There is a need to stop complaining and being a victim and start learning and applying new information about self and the current situation in order to move forward.

There is a perceived negative judgment regarding their ministry. They agree that the judgment is unfair and unfounded and that even though there are differences, the ministry is the same. They expressed their disappointment with the fact that they have invested in these members who are now moving over to the white pastored churches.

These members are contributing to the success of the white pastored churches while the black pastors are still left to keep investing in the upcoming generation in the township communities. That they are not as educated or not as gifted as their white counterparts are disputed and in many instances, not true. They feel that there is an inherent inequality resulting from the previous and present disadvantage the black pastors suffer on account of the resources at the disposal of the white pastor as opposed to the disadvantage of the black pastor.

The system has been discriminatory and the discrimination is tangible, the access to education and training, the access to resources and financial aid, the access to land and the general frustration suffered by the blacks on account of the bureaucracy that was geared towards favouring the white minority population

In order for the situation to be remedied, pastors express the need to move towards the future be open to change. It is agreed that the pastors in township churches have the ability to be agents of change but that the core inequalities and the burden of past oppressive systems need to be acknowledged and incorporated into changing and becoming more open and visionary as a church.

4.5. Towards a counter argument

The first question is that of millennials who were part of the world cafés who argued that they are not to be involved in this question of race and the effects of apartheid.

They argue that those who were born after the democratic dispensation in South Africa came into being, and especially those who were born in the new millennium do not see skin colour and are not influenced by it.

The following statistics were presented to the group of young students:

According to Statistics South Africa, 55% of all South Africans are living below the Poverty datum Line, meaning that the total household is not able to generate an income of R920. 00 per month. The reality is that 23-25% of South Africans have to survive, if at all they survive, on less than R30.00 per day.

It was pointed out that youth unemployment stands at 37%, including those who are holding a formal qualification or are skilled for particular jobs. When presented with the statistics, the students and young people did not have a reply or counter-argument.

Even though they argue that they are not being directly affected by the oppressive systems of the past, they face statistics showing how they are directly affected.

The question of race, according to the students and youth that formed part of the world café research argues that they are not influenced by race in the same way as the older people are, they see themselves neither as black or white but as South Africans and people.

If this as ground zero for establishing an investigation into the identity and consciousness of the South African society and in particular, the identity and consciousness and indeed mission of the Church in South Africa, we need to look at what our understanding of the concepts of multi-racialism and non-racialism is. Multi racialism is merely a way of saying that in terms of our construction of race, there is more than one race in South Africa.

Non-racialism, on the other hand, is a conceptual attempt at capturing the ideal of national unity and the quest for a South African identity. To be non-racial is to be fundamentally anti-racist and to be campaigning radically for greater socio-economic equality. Non-racialism contradicts and exposes any move to hide behind colour blindness, which is a treacherous and hypocritical tactic of those who have and are still benefiting from racial oppression and economic exploitation.

The church is always to be understood in the context of the inspired word of God. It is furthermore to be understood as functioning within the very concrete context of the society in which it is located and situated in.

If the church is not understood to be an enclave existing in splendid isolation from the rest of society, there can be no escape from the urgent question of whether a typical church is possible in an abnormal society. The question of race influences this question. It calls for a deeper look at what is going on in both the black and white led churches. The question of race in the church should

be looked at. We are particularly looking at how the race issue has developed in the democratic dispensation in South Africa.

The perceived reality that white pastored churches are led by exclusively white leadership while their church communities are made up of large crowds of black South Africans is therefore in need of critical research and study.

The question begs for an investigation of the facts and the lived reality. Is white pastored churches superior to black pastored churches?

4.6. Case study

The next part of the chapter looks at three very successful black Charismatic churches: Crystal Ministries International, Grace Bible Church, and Victory Church. We are also looking at an interview with Rev Moss Ntla, the general secretary of the Evangelical Alliance of South Africa (TEASA).

Developing a counter-argument on the harmful data and responses on black unidentified Charismatic churches by introducing an analysis of interviews held with a few black Charismatic churches that are doing very well, but that does not necessarily result in black Charismatic Christians flocking there. As much as these black charismatic churches, that form part of this study, draw substantial numbers of black Christians, there are still a much larger number of black middle-class Christians flocking to white pastored churches. A further issue is that there is one-way traffic of black Christians joining white led charismatic churches but not vice versa. There is no significant movement of white Christians to black charismatic churches.

These three churches have been selected because they are well established and well attended. Their stories are lined up to advance the point that as much as

they are very successful churches in themselves, they are not considered by many black Charismatic Christians who might conveniently use the excuse or argument of proximity to white pastored churches as the deciding factor for them going there for worship.

The fact of the matter is that a sizeable number of these black Christians have to drive some distance to church or be picked up by transport provided by the white pastored churches.

The profiles of the three black pastored Charismatic churches we will be looking at in our research will be based on the following themes, namely spiritual issues, leadership, congregational structure, fellowship, worship, and financial contributions.

The thesis proceeds as follows. Three prominent leaders of black Charismatic churches have been extensively interviewed to get a sense of the successes they might have achieved as well as concerns and self-criticisms they identify. For several reasons, but mainly for purposes of speaking for themselves, the full grid of the interviews is shown, and the interviews containing substantial input from Hendricks, Sono, and Liberty are included in the thesis as they stand.

An analysis and evaluation are offered with reference to each of the questions in the grid. In an attempt to cover the author of the thesis members of the board of Crystal Ministries International have been requested to respond to his answers in the interview critically. There is an acknowledgment that his position constitutes a "participant observant of a special type" and is not fully covered by the emic-etic equation in participant observation. The emic-etic scenario arises when the researcher is an insider and the etic scenario is when the researcher comes from outside. It is acknowledged that the thesis writer, a senior pastor, in fact, with his wife, the founders of the church and chairperson of the board is different from any member of the church

4.6.1.1. Statement of faith

The church holds firm to the following articles of faith

- The Eternal Godhead as revealed in the three persons of Father Son and Holy Spirit.
- The church affirms the final authority of the Bible in matters of faith and conduct.
- Jesus as saviour.
- Salvation by grace through repentance and faith
- Water baptism and baptism of the Holy Spirit
- The gift of the Holy Spirit
- Holy communion
- Creation of human beings as men and women as equals
- Marriage between one man and one woman
- Membership of separated or divorce members under the authority of the Bible in matters of faith and conduct.
- The Bible occupies a central role in the life and ministry of the church community
- Worship is based on the personal experience of the presence and work of God in and through those engaged in the ministry of praise and worship
- Liturgical experience includes and serves all different generations and age groups striving to be relevant and current through the effective use of media.

4.6.1.2. Social responsibility

Concerning social responsibility, the church has an extensive program of social justice and includes a multi-leveled involvement in social upliftment programs

inspired by the needs of the people and the direction of the Holy Spirit. The Church's social outreach program is called REACH, an acronym for Relief, Education, Awareness Cultivate, and Help. This program is a multifaceted approach to community involvement and outreach that is part of the DESTINY vision of Crystal Church that seeks to fulfill the call for social justice.

4.6.1.3. Leadership

The church's leadership style is based on the F1 concept. The concept is inspired by the Formula one concept that works on the function of each person and their gifts being employed to ensure the success of the formula one pit stop. The leadership style is based on teamwork. Each person functions according to their specific gift. This ensures each person grows and functions optimally, ensuring their triumph and that of the vision and mission of the church.

The functional leadership of the church is based on different levels of decision making or function.

The different levels of function and decision making is based on the vision of dreaming big as an organisation, establishing strong families, social justice, training and equipping members, and society. While introducing others to Christ as part of the divine commission to evangelism, navigating towards building a nation that is conscious of its identity and mission in the world, being yoked to Christ in a personal relationship of faith and witness. The church values people and encourages and supports the development of the whole person.

4.6.1.4. Stewardship

The church as part of the county and as a non-profit organisation operates within a disadvantaged community. The church needs to be in touch with the hardships people face. It includes the economic situation that both the country and the world have faced over the last years but looks forward to hope. The

Church relies solely on the congregation for its financial income and tithing is a vital part of the church's income. The church developed a strategy to encourage tithing. Sponsorships are occasional.

The process for the taking up of offerings during church services is meticulously managed and documented. The operational disbursement of funds happens according to an audited process and structure. Regular financial updates and reports ensure transparency.

4.6.1.5. Practical matters

The church has a beautiful high tech building that serves the community. This includes a four thousand seater auditorium, side halls, boardrooms, and a world-class audio-visual system.

4.6.1.6. Self-criticism

One area of concern is that the church could improve in its ministry to millennials and more effectively incorporate them into the church community according to their strengths. There is also scope for improvement on volunteer management in an attempt to get more members actively involved in the life and ministry of the church. Questions on delegating and empowering people more in trusting their abilities are to be addressed.

4.6.1.7. Multimedia

The Church effectively uses social media as part of its communication and mission strategy. *One team, one dream*, is a book written by the senior pastor that both encapsulates and inspires the organisational model and ministry of the church by focusing on the skills of the individual members and harnessing their

strength to benefit the value proposition of the church. The next step would be to divide the book into smaller books or pamphlets that can be used by individuals to grow in their spiritual journey.

4.6.2. Victory Ministries International

4.6.2.1. Statement of faith

There is great importance to teach solid doctrine, not heresies, fantasies, human-made ideologies, but faith in the triune God, who is Father Son and Holy Spirit. The church holds fast to full dependence, trust, and confidence in God with the explicit mandate based in the word of God free from error caused by emotions, personal ideologies, without exaggeration or playing to the crowds.

The pastor seeks to live and minister based as closely as possible on the Word of God. Preaching based on scripture with as little as possible added.

The focus of services should be moving away from the person of the preacher and be more focused on Scripture. The church's ministry needs to be rooted in the Word of God and return to the primacy of scripture.

In the church, there is a scribe that records and compiles notes and illustrations of every sermon delivered in the church. This recording is then used by cell leaders within connected groups where the message is worked at and broken down into more easily understood language and context. The message from every Sunday is distributed and shared on various media platforms.

Regarding worship teams, there has been challenges with the development of the true understanding of the role and importance of worship teams and their significance. Worship teams determine the tone and culture of the whole

meeting, it determines the flow of the message, the atmosphere in which the message is delivered.

People decide on whether or not they want to stay for preaching based on how they experience worship. The respondent argues that there should not be worship teams, that the spirit of true worship has been diminished by the reliance on worship teams and the instruments and décor associated with worship teams, as is found in its present form. Worship should return to the original sense of worshipping in spirit and truth. The idea is that worship is to be culturally correct and influenced by the cultural perspective. The idea that the worship and the songs sung by the worship team set the tone is to be revisited. Worship teams need to take into consideration cultural sensitivity and be inclusive and foster inclusivity and participation.

There is a need to find a new identity in Christ, and individual cultures need to see the importance of the identity it has in Christ. Right worship should be a unifying element, which binds the identity of the assembly in Christ.

4.6.2.2. Social responsibility

The church's involvement in social upliftment projects started with the AIDS pandemic when it started a mobile clinic. The vision is that the church has to be visible in the community. The church needs to meet the needs of its community. Some of the critical areas identified is that of health care services and education. There should be schools at every church, no matter the size of the church.

The collaboration of the government is vital in realising the vision of social upliftment because this is the reality in which the church operates and fulfills its social outreach mission. So little can be done by the church in the form of effecting actual social justice concerning corruption in government, but the church can influence and educate the next generations and thus also form the

social consciousness and morality. The church is looking at introducing a postgraduate or tertiary education program that would be funded by the church and supported by the congregation. The church should endeavour to assist those who are struggling to get a decent education. The vision is to give hope to children and the future.

The war on drugs requires principals and teachers to be educated on the nature of drugs and its various shapes and forms and how it is distributed and circulated among youth and vulnerable members of the community. In an actual encounter with school principals, it was discovered that there is a significant lack of information regarding drugs on the part of the educators.

With the help of the police, the educators were informed about drugs and their effects. Educators were equipped to deal with the epidemic among the vulnerable in society. The idea was to identify vulnerable youth before they are deep into addiction.

This education and skills transfer help parents and other community leaders. There were also instances where the church facilitated a meeting with gang lords and leaders.

To be real as a church, the church needs to be able to respond to the social ills in communities, and this cannot only be done on a Sunday from the pulpit. The rest of the week needs to be utilised also.

In feeding the people, the church buys the best quality fruits in order to change the culture, the eating habits, and lifestyle of fast food into a healthy food lifestyle. Facilitating positive changes in people's habits and lifestyles allows them to fight off diseases and infections and live longer, healthier lives.

To discourage the habit of slothfulness and the mentality of waiting for handouts, the church is looking at upskilling people of teaching them trades that could be used to help themselves. The church was built by bricklayers taught

the skills through the assistance of the church. The church used local people, upskilled them, and used their skills to build and outfit the church, and run its multimedia and other systems. This is as a result of the vision the church has that believes in creating a new trend of feeding the people by teaching them to feed themselves. This idea was employed by getting people to clean up streets and use the litter and plastic collected as recycling that got the people who needed help the money they needed to feed themselves. In this way the pollution was stopped, the area beautified and the people fed.

4.6.2.3. Leadership.

The respondent tried to model his leadership style on other pastors or churches that seemed to be successful. After trying to follow books on leadership and trying to copy world trends on leadership, the respondent got the inspiration to develop leadership on the model of Jesus.

After printing the dialogue of Jesus in the gospels, the respondent identified themes of leadership as taught and practiced by Jesus.

The respondent identified the model of servant leadership as the main thrust of Jesus' approach. The themes of compassion, forgiveness, and submission to the Father's will are key elements identified and practiced by the respondent as a result of looking at the model of leadership found in the Gospels. The respondent sees the ministry of the church not only in the church but to the city and the move from city to city until it reaches Jerusalem.

The respondent recounts the ministry of appreciation to the community leaders that started with services for the police officers in the province. The services included praise and worship, preaching and anointing and praying for those who have lost loved ones. This practice has since grown to include other groups in

the communities. This ministry is in answer to the call of Jesus to come and follow Him.

The church envisions to build an eighty-meter high cross that will be a unique landmark in Port Elizabeth, a cross that will be more than a landmark but will lead people to focus on the Cross and receive a blessing. A critical aspect raised by the respondent is an inclusive and empathetic tone to leadership, one that includes the divine imperative to deny oneself and follow Christ.

The size of the team needs to match the dream. Teamwork is essential to the successful establishment of the vision and dream. The hearts of leaders should share the preferential option for the poor that Jesus has. Leadership teams ought to be built on solid ground. Leaders need to be tested, and their motives purified so that their ministry is not to be tainted with self-interest. Leadership is to be visionary, based on the principle of servant leadership and teamwork that evaluates the unique qualities and gift of team members and work to the strength of the individual team members in order to ensure the implementation of the vision.

The roles of each team member should make for the building up of the member and the congregation. The success of leadership would not be based on numbers but rather on the quality of the members and the ministry. The character of the leadership team should be right because this cannot be taught. Leadership is not functional or administrative but should be in contact with the people.

4.6.2.4. Stewardship

The church did not have the funds to pay salaries at the start of the ministry; the respondent paid salaries and was responsible for other church expenses, and because of this, it fell on the respondent to be in charge of all the administration and financial practice of the church.

After an encounter with a church member, the respondent saw the need for a board to help with the administration and management of the church. When members are part of the administration, they readily contribute to the financial success of the church.

Over time, the respondent is no longer personally involved in the financial administration of the church. There is an independent outside auditing company charged with financial compliance and reporting.

The respondent started to receive a salary recently, and there is a compensation structure adhered to concerning those employed by the church.

The church ascribes to an attitude of discipline, obedience and consistency when it comes to offering. Worship is seen as obedience unto the Lord, offering that represents your level of faith and what you believe God for. Offerings are also focused and tied to specific projects and people in the congregation can give towards specific projects

The infrastructure includes the school, auditorium, and fellowship hall encompassing just over 6000 square meters of infrastructure. The church owns four church structures and one church building that is rented.

4.6.2.5. Self-criticism

The respondent came from a business background. He had to negotiate his idea of measuring success in the world of business with that in the church. The respondent continues to recount that when he started out in the ministry there was a lot of self-doubt that was shared by others who commented on the difficult task he faced. The ultimate challenge was to distinguish the call to ministry and to clarify the proper motive for entering into it. The respondent believes that if the call was from God, then the ministry will succeed.

One of his biggest self-criticisms is that he expected the same attitude to performance levels in the church as he was used to in the corporate sector. In the beginning, the respondent had produce or perish attitude to the ministry and the work that needed to be done. During the mind shift from the corporate attitude to the unique mentality of working in the church, the respondent admits that people did get hurt. The respondent is thankful that he has grown to a place where he does not have to win every battle and that he truly wants to work in a way that does not hurt others. In his dealings with others, he has resolved to work and to allow people to act according to their conscience because, in the end, he will be vindicated by God. Through time he has learned to trust the process and to respect that not everything can be done now. Placing value on the value of people is something that came at a great learning curve and is something that has formed the respondent's attitude to ministry.

4.6.2.6. Practical matters

One area that needs improvement is that of the children's church. The vision of the church is to grow and built the next generation of billionaires. The best place to start is the children's church. Through the introduction and nurturing of a value system that changes the attitude towards finances and values. Building leaders with a kingdom mentality.

4.6.2.7. Multimedia

The respondent prefers radio to television. He prefers the level of engagement on the side of the audience that listens to radio broadcasts. The respondent finds that after being on the radio for a long time, people tend to recognise him by his voice. The church manages a community radio station and utilises it as a powerful medium to make God known in the city. There is some resistance

from pastors to take part in radio broadcasts because they have difficulty in seeing the worth of radio as an effective means of evangelisation.

The respondent has published a few books, starting with leadership and finances, setting the basis for relating in the professional and private lives of those in leadership while addressing the lack of discipline concerning money and the willingness to seek help.

The first book addresses the issue of money and properly relating to finances and how to develop understanding and wisdom. The title of the book is the: man, his lady, and his money.

The title of the second book is: From Problems to Promotions. The books deal with how the most significant problem in one's life is possibly the most exceptional opportunity. The book speaks about facing and overcoming the Goliaths in one's life like David. The problems that are overcome leads to the promotions that come after.

The last book is about the life lessons that can be learned from Peter and the values that can be derived from his relationship with Jesus including the lessons and instructions Jesus gave to Peter with particular reference to Jesus's instruction to Peter to cast the nets into the deep and the instruction to come walking toward Jesus across the water. The book calls for people to go beyond what is on the surface. To test their faith like Peter, who is sometimes referred to as the one of little faith but stepped out in faith. The title of the book is: Life lessons from the life of Peter.

4.6.3. Grace Bible church

4.6.3.1. Statement of faith

The church believes in God as the Father, originator, creator, and Jesus Christ as the son of God sent by the Father to die for our sins and the Holy Spirit who confirms what Jesus has done and who comes into the believers' life to help them in their walk with God.

The Bible is the basis and the authority of the right teaching and right practice in the church. The church steers away from sensational doctrines and endeavours to stay true to the original meaning and teaching of faith based on the Bible.

The church believes in personal conversion and the inspired life with God in the Christian community. The message and experience of salvation change people.

The Church has a strong praise and worship team that is personal, vibrant, active, and engaging. The praise and worship include and cater to a wide variety and broad spectrum of the population and age groups in the congregation.

The praise and worship are mixed and include acapella. The worship experience is upbeat and joyful throughout and centered around praising and worshipping God.

4.6.3.1. Social responsibility.

The church's social involvement is based on the parable of the who fell among thieves. Only the Samaritan came to help him. The church's social outreach ministry is based on the belief that we are all God's Children and that it is not us and them scenario, and we should demonstrate God's love for us all in concrete and practical ways. One of the projects is the "achievement awards" where the church takes time and special effort to reward students and young people who achieve against resounding odds. Another social outreach of the church is by going to a school that needs help and providing whatever is needed.

This is done during the “Grace uMusa Campaign”. The Zulu word umusa means a kindness or a kindness we show. The church carries out programs that have to do with helping children with their studies or career awareness.

Volunteers offer their expertise and help people with basic and expert services like primary and specialist healthcare. The church has outreach programs that involve people from churches located as far as eight hours away who live and work among people in need. The church has a food and clothing bank that provides people in need with good quality food and clothing. In a bid to help with the housing crisis, the church has built homes for people in informal settlements. All this is done following Jesus's example, who identified and embraced the people amongst whom he worked and lived.

4.6.3.2. On leadership

The pastor describes his leadership style as visionary and involved. The church does not only have a vision but is involved in building a vision that involves leaders and beneficiaries. Leadership that is visionary and involved brings about change in society. Membership in church is based on the vision of active membership, meaning that the members are involved and own the vision and its implementation. The mode of leadership being practiced and espoused to is that of servant leadership in the mode and modeled on the leadership taught by Jesus Christ.

The type of leadership that is practiced in the church rewards excellence and those involved in leadership are held to very high standards.

4.6.3.3. Stewardship.

First and foremost it needs to be understood that the church is mostly located in under-resourced communities. Membership consists mostly of blue-collar

workers. This does not take away from the reality that the church has been doing well despite the challenges it face every day. The church could always do better, but in the main, there is an encouraging level of generosity and investment.

The primary source of income for the church is through voluntary offerings and tithing. There are no unique campaigns, and people are never forced to give. The church teaches spiritual discipline and emphasises freedom in giving. No real record is kept of who gives and to what measure. This does not influence the way in which members are treated.

Tithing is discussed in training on discipleship, and there is short encouragement during services and annual full teaching on tithing. The process of collecting, counting, banking, record keeping, and reporting on the finances are done by a team of people who are accountable and overseen by senior leadership. There are regular audits and reports on finances. The whole financial process is governed by sound financial best practices based on transparency and accountability.

4.6.3.4. Practical matters

The structure of the church is based on cell groups and special interest groups that function like departments. The church functions with a strong alignment to the structure it finds in the society that it is situated in.

The church's main focus areas are demonstrated in the acronym DREAMS. Discipleship focuses on the call to follow Christ. The restoration looks to actively restoring and healing the brokenness and loss people suffer. The church spreads the gospel through its various evangelisation structures. Articulation is strongly based in prayer and being a voice for the voiceless. Missions refer to

the outreach programs through which the church reach out to other communities to assist.

Grace Bible Church has sixty churches now with twenty church buildings and other communities gathering in schools and other structures in Gauteng with the motherboard situated in the mother church.

The mother church is fully equipped for the services with a state of the art multimedia system operated by a team of professional technicians. Several buildings on the main campus serves various purposes and can be used for even more as the vision and the need requires.

4.6.3.4. Self-criticism

One of the main concerns is that as the church becomes bigger and grows in numbers, there is no real look at having a strategy for when people leave. To follow up on why and where they are going and how we need to support them. There is a need for greater awareness of the danger of complacency regarding members and numbers with particular reference to self-criticism and growth. The other issue is that of the millennials referring to young people born around the turn of the twenty-first century.

These are the young people who have just graduated from tertiary institutions and who are leaving not only the townships but leaving the church. The church needs to engage in a robust and open discussion with the millennials in order to find the right flavour of ministry that will engage and involve them.

Another self- criticism is focusing on church growth and expansion at the cost of those who are around me. There is a need to balance all the activities and involvement on different levels of organisation and structure. The respondent sees the need to return to focusing his energies on those who need the presence of their leader in their midst.

4.6.3.5. Multimedia.

There is an imminent release of a book early this year on pastoring; it is called "Pastoring" it is really based on the journey I have walked and of course, learning from other people, and it focuses on how to run a church as a pastor.

There are other books that are in the process of being published; most of these are on leadership. The church is using all the different media to spread the message; the church is on television and will be looking at expanding its media offering. Personally, the respondent is involved in the training and development of church leadership in other provinces.

4.7 Reflection on the interviews

The pastors that interviewed are pastoring at churches that have shown growth and success in attracting large numbers and having stable and increasing membership. Their spiritual leadership has clearly defined statements of belief and is well developed and communicated.

They have well-developed strategies and implementation of leadership principles that are employed in their church organisations. They have developed their understanding and practice of effective leadership, and they are engaged in leadership development that transcends their church communities. They operate and administer large budgets. Their churches have built for purpose infrastructure that includes state of the art multimedia systems that are operated by professional technicians. Their church communities have been in operation for long periods and have grown exponentially over the years.

They are also well-financed and employ financial and organisational best practices and hold themselves to high standards concerning governance and oversight.

The pastors are accomplished professionals that use multimedia infrastructure in their value proposition. These programs include radio, television, printed media, and social media platforms. These churches have well developed social outreach programs that include large operations with multifaceted approaches. They are leaders of large teams who administer large operations in a constantly changing society.

These churches appear to have a very sound Biblical basis informed by faith in the Triune God, Father, Son, and Holy Spirit. There is no tolerance for false doctrine or heresy. The authority of Scripture is upheld and as could be expected from Charismatic churches, there is a strong emphasis on the gifts of the Spirit. At Crystal Ministries International there is an insistence on experiential praise and worship. In the case of Victory Ministries International, they had a challenge with the praise and worship in that they have had to depose two teams. All three churches are more than well-equipped as far as infrastructure is concerned.

In the instance of Grace Bible Church, there is an auditorium where between 3500 and 4000 people could be seated. This single black Charismatic church has 35 branches with a total number of 50000 members. They are quite excellent in church planting by having developed different models for different contexts. This explains why congregations among shack dwellers, the so-called "*makuku*" church, a church for miners, and congregations of Grace Bible Church in middle and upper-middle-class areas could be established.

The other two, namely Crystal Ministries International and the Church of Pastor Jerome Liberty, are equally well equipped with good solid building infrastructure and auditoriums.

The auditoriums are equipped with state of the art sound systems and specifically in the case of Crystal Ministries International LED screens, making it extremely convenient for members to follow everything that is happening in front. On a Sunday at Crystal, a full camera crew is on duty. Victory Ministries International has a school, an auditorium, and a fellowship hall, all in all, 6000 square meters of buildings. Third, all three exercise good social responsibility by having found diverse ways of community involvement.

Pastor Jerome Liberty is clear about the visibility of the church in the community and the attending to social needs. His church runs a mobile clinic where about a hundred patients are treated daily. The mobile clinic is taken to seven locations where people can come for treatment.

The church is also involved in housing and education. Particularly impressive is the school under the auspices of the church, with about 400 learners attending currently. The aim is to have 1000 learners at the school. The understanding of the church is that this is a very profound way of "building a new generation." The church funds teachers. The ultimate goal is to establish a Christian university.

Crystal Ministries International has a Department taking care of the social responsibility of the church. The Department has developed a system for identifying the needs in the community and for working out sustainable solutions. Two families have been adopted consciously for the care of the church.

Homeless people are being clothed, and those who have suffered loss in fires are attended to through emergency relief. On top of this, the church has 65 adopted senior citizens; it is taking care of. Fourth, as far as leadership is concerned, it will be safe to suggest that the typical model of Paul from Ephesians 4 is followed in the light of the size of the three churches under discussion and the extent of their ministries.

Informed by the diversity of charismata enumerated in Ephesians 4:11, including pastors and ministers, Paul concludes that their task is the equipment of the people of God, and their ministry of service is the building up of the body of Christ. At Crystal, this is understood in terms of the Formula One motor racing concept.

Different people are allocated for different functions when the racing car needs attention at the pit stop. The interview with Pastor Jerome Liberty makes it clear, however, that the leadership issue is not always as clear cut as hoped for. He has bought numerous books on leadership and has gravitated from the one model to another before finding his way into servant leadership.

The switch from a business where particular values prevail was also not easy. The notion of "produce or perish," which characterises the world of business, cannot be transferred to the church so easily.

Other concerns and challenges are emerging from the interviews, which in themselves reveal the willingness and openness to self-criticism. Both the pastors of Crystal and Grace Bible Church own up to the difficulty of understanding and working with millennials. The pastor of Crystal goes as far as to acknowledge that he is not serving the current generation of millennials.

The reason for this is that it is hard to understand how they think, and therefore it is equally hard to bring them into the kingdom of God. The same goes for what has become known as generation Z.

The central thesis based on the data from the interviews is that we are dealing with highly successful black Charismatic churches that if there were to be a direct comparison between the successful white and black pastored churches, these three black pastored churches will be on the same level with white-pastoring Charismatic churches.

It begs the following questions, among others: can the gravitation of black Christians to white pastored churches only be explained in terms of geographical and other practical considerations or is there more than meets the eye. With the movement of black people from the townships to formerly white residential areas, is the consideration only the issue of being closer to the white pastored church or the practical consideration relating to the infrastructure and length of services?

A very complicated but unavoidable question is the following: if indeed the South African democracy is unfolding positively and society is opening up, how is the one-way traffic of black Christians joining white pastored Charismatic churches with no real movement of white Christians to predominantly black Charismatic churches to be explained.

A simple assumption of the thesis is that there are deeper-seated factors patterned on colonialism and apartheid or put differently, after effects and pathologies emanating from the collective societal consciousness that people in South Africa have not acknowledged or dealt with.

4.8 Interview with Reverend Moss Nthla

This interview was conducted concerning push and pull factors regarding the migration of black Christians to white pastored churches; it is singled out because it introduces another dimension to the research. In discussions with

Rev. Nthla, he speaks extensively about the issue of acceptance. He introduces the issue of life on both sides of the divide of superiority and inferiority. He asks that we check if white people also suffer as a result of their superiority as black people suffer because of their inferiority. The Reverend Nthla agrees that various factors push black people out of traditionally black-led churches in favour of white pastored churches. These factors include practical issues like language and proximity, but it goes deeper than just this.

He recalls the realities of individuals who were policemen in the apartheid regime; black police officers were ruthless in their treatment of blacks during the suppression of the uprising. Another story he relates is of a white man with a coloured skin colour who had to also be crueler to black people because he needed the acceptance of the other white people. Reverend Nthla agrees that there is this need for acceptance, black people will leave their churches and go to white pastored churches and accept a lesser position in leadership just because they want to be accepted, and they need to be associated with the image of the white pastored church. Being a member of the white pastored churches allow these black Christians to associate with white people and be able to network with them, seeing as the modes of production and opportunity to access financial resources are still owned and controlled by white South Africans. Blacks are then in a better position to improve their social and financial situation by going to the white pastored churches. Black South Africans want to live in white suburbs, go to white schools, almost like they want to live the lives of white people, and going to white pastored churches is just one of how this is demonstrated. In this way, they want to maximise their opportunities.

Reverend Nthla touches on the argument that racism did not end with democratic elections in South Africa, he uses the analogy of Barack Obama being elected as president of the United States as this did not mean the end to racial violence and conflict. He calls for a change in strategy on the fight against

racism, the enemy is no longer the nationalist government and their racist laws, the enemy looks different now, it is more subtle and even trying to hide in plain sight.

We need a new approach to the fight against racial prejudice and oppression. We need to address racism in all its forms and brought into the open and dispensed with before we can move forward as a people and more especially as a church. White people need to be made to understand that the systematic oppression of the majority of the population in this country has caused historical disadvantage and resulted in white people being privileged and advantaged. The scales were and are still not balanced but still favours the white population because they have a historical advantage that did not naturally come to an end at the polls in 1994.

Reverend Nthla continues to argue that the church does not have a counter theological argument for the trend that is evident in black leaders also seemingly conforming to this need to be accepted by white people by moving to stay where the white people stay and do as white people have done. We need a new consciousness consideration all races, but that brings our current situation into the light of the gospel and the inspiration of the Holy Spirit so we can be healed and restored.

The church needs to understand itself within context, there are things that white people are better at than blacks, but we need to develop a way in which we see the different gifts the Spirit gives and relate to God and each other within a new consciousness that takes into consideration our own unique identity. White people do not necessarily understand black culture and tradition, but these are very close to the identity of the black person who is a member of their church, for instance, blacks and funerals. Do the white pastored churches necessarily understand all that goes with the process of grieving and traditions regarding

funerals? Can the white pastored churches minister to the individuals in their churches accordingly?

The church has the challenge of becoming relevant to the present generation. It needs dialogue and training in order to get a better understanding of the uniqueness of the narrative of cultural diversity. The church is called to assist in developing a new identity and a new consciousness that will help people answer their existential questions in the light of the gospel as disciples of Christ.

The reverend speaks in the capacity of leader of the evangelical churches and supports the main argument in the thesis that there is more than meets the eye regarding black Christians moving in large numbers to white pastored Charismatic churches. In the interview, the reverend supports the idea for the need for a new liberating consciousness that would bring us into a situation where we can bring this situation into the light of the gospel so that there can be healing and transformation. The reverend agrees with the main argument of the thesis in that he suggests that why black Christians move to white pastored churches point to the apparent pathologies resulting from apartheid and colonialism. The black Christians that move to white pastored churches have an inherent need to be accepted, and this need for acceptance almost abrogates their need for justice and redress. They feel that when white people accept them in these churches that this will elevate their social standing and add to their upward social mobility.

4.9. Reductionist nature of data on white controlled Charismatic churches

Far from trying to interfere with the research data that is painting a very positive picture of the compelling white-pastoring Charismatic churches, there is substantial evidence to the contrary. The monetary power of these churches

enables them to keep up a positive image of themselves by using the social and other modes of media intelligently. In these white led churches, there are images projected of their multiracial nature and the glittering ministries they run. Media coverage for impressive building projects costing millions of rand is secured.

What will, however, never be covered in the media is the salary packages of these pastors and their lavish lifestyles. The spectacle that is created and the fantasy world that is portrayed in front of the members of these churches explains why the data from the world cafés are so positive. Once again, the authenticity of the data is not called into question. We do not accuse the respondents in the world café with millennials from Rhema Bible Church of conspiring to react similarly to the questions.

What is clear though is that whereas the respondents were quick to expose the deficits in the black churches they have not alluded to a single disturbing instance or development in the white-pastoring churches.

The examples which will come in for some discussion here are so glaring that they can hardly be overlooked.

They are fairly and squarely in the public domain and in some instances, grossly insulting and dehumanising to black people that for black people to ignore them would amount to self-hatred.

4.9.1 Leadership and congregational structure

The top structure of the white-pastoring churches mentioned in the thesis reflects the perpetuation of a white supremacist attitude in white-pastoring Charismatic churches. We agree that these churches are growing the past decade exponentially. As far as black Christians are concerned, the hierarchy or top structure of these churches do not reflect diversity. In the world café with

members from Rhema Bible Church, it emerged that it is only now that a single black pastor has mobilised upwardly into the board of the church.

In all of these churches, the most important decisions relating to financial matters are made almost exclusively by white boards or committees. That there is no serious black representation on these boards perpetuating intentionally or unintentionally the notion that some are more capable of handling these matters than others. Alternatively, to formulate this more bluntly, the evil of white supremacy is allowed to carry on, virtually suggesting that white pastors and their cohorts have a right to this because the church belongs to them as their private property.

These white led churches are missing a real opportunity to start moving towards a genuinely non-racial church not only in terms of membership but also in terms of the decision making.

The situation is of course aggravated by black Christians not speaking out against the *status quo* in the church, let alone revolting against it.

The fact that black Christians are not on record as having voiced their opposition to some of the racist practices in the white-pastoring churches can only be construed as a silent approval of such practices.

In the process, once again, intentionally or unintentionally, they buy into the existing racist structure of white superiority-black inferiority, succumbing to a form of internalized racism or internalised oppression. There seems to be a psychosis of fear in operation. The hegemony of a very powerful clique in most of the white-pastoring Charismatic churches led by the senior pastor is such that members of these churches are afraid to speak out even in private.

Some members of Hill Song and a black pastor were approached for a conversation on the main question and sub-questions of the thesis. They declined not so much out of loyalty to the church, but more out of fear for the

repercussions of this would come to the notice of the church hierarchy. However, in a world café with congregants of a Charismatic church in the southern suburbs of Cape Town who had returned to the church after a period at Hill Song, a few very pertinent issues were revealed. A story is told of how the senior pastor would pitch at the weekly meeting of the Finance Committee, and his only interest would be how many cars were in the parking lot of the church and what the income for the Sunday was. A further issue raised was the unavailability of senior pastors in situations of bereavement. The story was related of an old lady from the church who passed on, but family members tried in vain to get the senior pastor involved when, in fact, the older woman was a very regular churchgoer as well as being faithful in tithing from her monthly pension. Stories are also being told of how senior pastors respond very quickly to celebrities and those who contribute big money.

Quite often, senior pastors would boast about their friendship with such celebrities or contact with members who give substantial amounts of money.

A senior pastor at Christian Revival Church (CRC) boasted about how, after a gym session, a gentleman from his church who happened to be at the gymnasium at the same issued a cheque of R100000.00 there and then. At one of the services, he also boasted about having carried the belt of a boxing celebrity at a boxing match.

4.10. Looking at white pastors

What follows now are a few concrete examples called into service as illustrations of how the very positive assessment emerging from the data is contradicted by concepts, interpretations, and practices in the white-pastoring churches that can hardly withstand the witness of the Bible.

4.10.1 Christian Revival Church

Adam “At” Boshoff is the senior pastor of Christian Revival Church (CRC)

The first instance regarding Pastor Boshoff is a notice sent to the congregation on 16 November 2010. The notice entitled “honour God” was addressed to the members of the church and undersigned by Pastor Boshoff. A critique of the text by Dion Knoesen highlighted the questionable application of biblical interpretation and a lack of exegesis. Here are some of the concerns raised in the critique.

That money is the answer to everything, and this is used to encourage people to give money is out of context. The text has to do with the mentality of the foolish who rely on their money instead of on God. The critique shows two possible explanations of why the church would use the text in their appeal for people to give towards the finances of the church.

This includes doctrinal ignorance or the purposeful exploitation of the biblical text to get people to contribute.

The reference to the two most important books in the life of the Christian being the Bible and the checkbook as the revelation of God's love and the love of the Christian towards God. The critique questions the biblical basis for the statement that the Bible expresses God's love for us and the checkbook our love for God.

The next question is regarding the importance of the cheque book in the statement as elevated to the same importance of the inspired Word of God.

With reference to the Israelites suffering defeat because of its tampering with the devoted things, the silver and gold that belonged to God the critique is that the incident does not recount the actions of the nation but the act of one man named Achan the son of Camri who had stolen some of the spoils of looted

booty of Jericho. The biblical text refers to the punishment of Israel in relation to the act of Achan and not as the punishment of the Israelites in their individual capacities because they lacked generosity.

With regard to the understanding of the tithing in the biblical context, the critique is of the opinion that there is a definite lack of understanding or the distortion of the true message and context of tithing, as is found in sound doctrine and scripture.

A reflection on some of the text used by pastor Boshoff in the notice seems to be quoted out of context misconstruing and distorting the original context. The reason for the apparent inappropriate application of the texts is open for interpretation.

Three specific texts are used to demonstrate the argument of why the texts were misused. It is argued that there is room for further investigation into the intention of the Church and the pastor.

The pastor uses Ecclesiastes 10:19 as the introduction to his explanation on tithing that refers to money as the answer to all things. The text as used by the church do not speak to the original context that draws attention the foolish and their philosophy regarding money and its use. The text refers to their attitude to money as the answer to all things being a sign of vanity and foolishness.

(<https://www.discerningtheworld.com/2010/12/16/at-boshoff-from-crc-church-shows-us-how-pharisees-went-about-honoring-god/>)

The critique is very sharp and shows in detail how the specific verses used in the statement beg the question whether it is because of a lack of skill in exegesis or a deliberate attempt at misleading the congregation and just using scripture to get people to contribute to the financial cause of the church.

Another instance is that of a sermon delivered by pastor Boshoff on the occasion of the opening of the new church building in Johannesburg. The Pastor speaks extensively about the church's stance on race and how essentially he does not see himself as white because he is born of the same blood as are his brothers and sisters who are born in Christ. He speaks of his history and the struggles he had, which included racism. The Pastor continues to present the church's stance on how the church is home to all people of different colour and social standing.

The pastor continues to state that there is no difference in the way rich and poor are viewed and related to by the church. The pastor teaches about race and non-racialism, referring to skin colour in that all people should really be coloured and that he is not white but pink.

The teaching on race seems to be influenced by the pastor's idea that race does not matter; he moves from multi-racialism to non-racialism in his description of the church's racial policy.

The reference to hate and anger that the pastor uses in describing why people treat each other the way they do starts with his personality that he describes as type a or a plus.

He mentions the time when his father walked out on him, and he reacted with self-destructive and even suicidal tendencies that included racial anger and rage. By giving his life to Jesus, the pastor identifies healing from these tendencies and a mentality of embrace and love. However, in reacting to the idea that Christianity is to make one docile and non-reactive to provocation, he does admit that his response will be to react with physical force, hence he does not have bodyguards, but the bodyguards are there for the protection of those who would attempt at provoking him.

Reflecting on this sermon, one gets the idea that the notion of non-racialism or multi-racialism is a kind of color blindness or, as the pastor says, mixing up skin color, his being pink. Another reflection would be that of the nature and identity of the person who is saved by the blood of Jesus. Is racism something that one can be cured of or is the miraculous power of salvation in Christ all that is needed for a racist to be changed into someone who no longer sees race and is no longer influenced by it. In the last instance, there is the question of whiteness and blackness. Are we truly all to be considered as the pastor does as coloured in the cause of discovering our new identity and developing a new consciousness as Christians having been redeemed in Christ and positively worked through the legacy of colonialism and apartheid.

4.10.2. Rivers Church

The senior pastor of the Rivers Church in Sandton André Olivier has said in a sermon, which some have criticised as being racist, that white people never took anything from anyone else.

Following the backlash over the sermon, the church issued a statement saying that for "clarity and to avoid possible legal recourse," the media should listen to the pastor's sermon to "avoid misinterpretation or disregard of what was actually said."

"Where applicable, defamation cases will be opened," the church said.

The pastor greets the congregants and starts the discourse by highlighting the problem he has with the notion that white people are portrayed in the media as the problem in South Africa, he disagrees with this notion and repeats his disagreement and states that white people helped this nation. He continues to state that white people took nothing from no one, but on the contrary, white

people worked for what they have. Very important to our argument is that he concedes that maybe the law favoured white people, but they worked for what they have and should not be required to give their property away.

Church 'deeply saddened.'

The church said in its statement that it was "deeply saddened by the damage that has prevailed from this message. The content in question and expression thereof was not meant for harm. Upon review, we believe there is not a view that reflects an anti-biblical or racist sentiment from the message preached."

The message was about overcoming abandonment, and Pastor André addressed and challenged all communities and encouraged relationships across all races," it said.

Rivers Church neither ignores nor condones the atrocity of apartheid or the scars it has left on our nation. With that in mind, preaching and teaching are aimed at repairing and preventing further racial division. The Rivers Foundation also addresses the damage of our history daily and is our constant expression that the past will not easily be corrected.

The following critical academic review of the sermon by professor JNJ Kritzinger is included here:

It is to be appreciated that Pastor Olivier apologized for the statements he made in a sermon on Sunday, 26 June 2016. It is crucial, though, not merely to forgive him and move on, since his words were not only "poorly chosen" (as he says in his Twitter apology), but reveal deep-seated attitudes and approaches that keep on bedeviling relationships between black and white people in this country.

The short clip from his sermon, circulated by News24, was an "aside" during the course of his sermon. He digressed from the prepared text and "spoke from

the heart". This is clear when, at the end of the clip, he says: "Back to the message." This incident reveals something typical about the life of many white people in South Africa: we have learned to be "politically correct" most of the time, mainly when we are speaking in public or the presence of black people. We do this to "avoid trouble" or to prevent being accused of racism. However, sometimes, when our guard drops, we reveal what we really think and who we are. And then our untransformed mindsets emerge into the open.

This usually happens when we are angry or disgusted at a specific incident, like Penny Sparrow's experience on a Durban beach, or Vicki Momberg's tirade after the smash and grab incident.

It also happens around the *braaivleis* fire, when we let our inhibitions go and say what we think about black people (and about ourselves).

Pastor Olivier lowered his guard during his sermon on Sunday and revealed his real feelings and thinking about the history of South Africa and the nature of the relationship between black and white people. That is what we need to address, not his unfortunate choice of words.

There are six underlying assumptions or thinking patterns evident in Pastor Olivier's personal aside during his sermon:

God uses people who are different from us to "speak into our lives;" we should therefore not "drive them away," but listen to them and let them be "God's voice" to us;

White people took nothing from black people; whoever says that is lying;

White people have the right to get annoyed when such lies are repeated in public;

White people have money because they work; black people are poor because they are lazy;

Because white people worked (and are still working) for their wealth, thereby earning it rightfully, there is no need for them to share it with anyone or to "give away some of it."

White people are not "the problem" in South Africa; perhaps the law favoured them, but they worked hard to "build this nation."

Some time ago, we suggested that white people who want to overcome racism need to bid farewell to innocence, ignorance, and arrogance – in order to embrace and be embraced by black South Africans and to join the movement to overcome racism. Let me show how that applies to Pastor Olivier.

Farewell to innocence

Pastor Olivier's denial of responsibility for anything wrong in South Africa is baffling. When he says, "Maybe the law favoured us," he is revealing a false innocence as well as dishonesty, because the apartheid laws favoured white people (there is no maybe about that).

However, he is also unhistorical: where did "the law" come from? Did it drop from the sky? Who made those laws that favoured white people and humiliated black people? Who passed the Land Acts of 1913 and 1936 that determined that white people would own 87% of the land? Who passed the Group Areas Act, which forced millions of black people into homelands or racially exclusive townships with matchbox houses, outside the cities and towns of South Africa? One could go on like this for a long time since there are more than 150 laws that were passed by an all-white parliament between 1948 and 1990 that deliberately "favoured us" and thereby harmed and oppressed black people.

Moreover, there are even more laws and policies that Dutch and British colonial authorities enacted on this soil since 1652 to give shape to the particular kind of

racialised and divided society that we are today. How can any white South African honestly say: “We took nothing from no one”?

In a way, this has already been *Farewell to ignorance*

addressed in the previous section. Perhaps Pastor Olivier really does not know South African history. Perhaps his only sources are the history textbooks of the apartheid education system or possibly the ideological indoctrination he underwent as a military conscript in the old South African Defense Force (SADF).

However, as the "senior pastor" of an obviously successful church in upmarket Sandton, he owes his congregation (and South Africans as a whole) more than that.

His view that wealth is produced by hard work and (by implication) that poverty is caused by laziness is something he will begin to qualify when he understands more about South African economic history. There is too much evidence of prosperous black farmers who lost their land in the late 19th and early 20th centuries due to various taxes that were imposed on them, forcing them to become underpaid workers in white-owned farms, mines, and factories. The destruction of African family life through the migrant labour system, with its humiliating pass laws, is well documented for anyone willing to read.

Pastor Olivier needs to turn away from his pseudo-innocence about the role of white people in South African history, by allowing black South Africans to be God’s instruments to speak into his life the truth about the things that white people have done.

And then to admit complicity in all that, acknowledging all the benefits that he has enjoyed since birth, which has given white people a considerable head start economically, academically and in every other way.

Farewell to arrogance

Following on directly from the previous section, if Pastor Olivier can acknowledge complicity in the racist policies and practices that have divided our nation and oppressed the majority of its citizens for more than 360 years, then he may be able to find the humility not to be annoyed when black fellow South Africans keep on pointing out just how broken and unhealed our society still is.

It is, therefore, not merely a question of an unfortunate choice of words; but of the underlying political, economic, and cultural assumptions that are revealed in his words. While everyone appreciates his public apology, he can only be forgiven if he admits that he was wrong in his fundamental assumptions, not only in his choice of words. That is the only way to genuine reconciliation and transformation.

Then the discussion can begin about how he, along with other white Christians who benefitted from 360 years of colonial rule and 46 years of apartheid, can follow the example of the early church in the Book of Acts by sharing their possessions with the poor.

If we follow this way, we will stop identifying anybody or any group as "the problem." We will be able to identify the problems that we have as a society, analyse them, and commit ourselves to address them together.

We do not want to shame or humiliate Pastor Olivier; we invite him into this shared journey. We trust that he will receive this intervention – from people who are different from him – like the way that God is “speaking into his life” at

this point. (<https://www.kathradafoundation.org/2017/02/09/response-to-pastor-andre-olivier-of-rivers-church-sandton/>)

The thesis moves from the hunch that there is more than meets the eye regarding the move of black Christians to white pastored churches. Professor Kitzinger's review of the alleged racist sermon of Pastor Olivier from River's church confirms this and leads the argument for further investigation into why black people join white led charismatic churches in such large numbers. Writing as a white man in South Africa professor Kirtzinger puts into perspective the argument that when white people say racist things, it is not always a slip of the tongue but more the evidence of deeper underlying problems with race and racism. Professor Kirtzinger points out several pertinent arguments that we are pursuing in the thesis, first among these would be that there is a case to be argued against the claim of these white pastors who claim that their churches are free of racism and that they are not racist. When the professor calls into question the innocence and ignorance of Pastor Olivier there is a further argument for a closer look at more churches where the leadership is made up of white pastors with large numbers of black members of their congregations. Personally, I feel that this is one of the most significant aids in the continuation of the search for a new conscious and spirituality of healing in South Africa. In the light of this review by a white academic and fellow servant of God, I am positive that the thesis will go a long way in assisting dialogue and fellowship and, indeed, a more human face to our present and future society. The church has a very prominent role to play, and the incident with Pastor Olivier and others less publicized can be an opportunity for reconciliation, healing, and justice.

4.10. Hillsong International

In the course of conducting research at various church communities, we addressed a request to Hillsong to research their campus with some of their members and leadership. Initially the church expressed openness and willingness to form part of the research. Before the research could begin they communicated that they will no longer be able to take part in the research. The reason they gave was that the line of questioning and the scope of the research would not be helpful to their congregation members. They added that their church is non-racial and open to all South Africans. They do not wish to divide their members along the lines of race and culture and do not wish their members be put in a position where they have to answer questions on the basis of race.

They furthermore present their church as a non-racial church that welcomes all South Africans and see themselves as representative of the many different cultures present in South Africa.

Their objection to participating in the research is that it would not be in line with their vision of creating unity in their church and that the research would promote thinking that created divisions in South Africa and also in many churches. They admit that they are not blind to the differences or challenges in South Africa but as a church, they desire to focus on that which unites.

4.11 More than meets the eye in white pastored Charismatic Churches: Anecdotes and symptoms

Before proceeding to a slightly more substantial engagement with issues in white pastored churches, which indicate that something is amiss, a few random anecdotes are shown as symptoms of what I refer to with the expression "more than meets the eye." Two or more such anecdotes about each of Christian Revival Church, Hill Song, Rhema Bible Church, and River Church will be lined up. The term anecdote is used not to suggest that there is an element of "gossip" or uncertainty relating to these examples. On the contrary, they are all

in the public domain and would therefore not necessarily need any further substantiation.

4.11.1. Christian Revival Church

What can, of course, not be missed is the helicopter used by the pastor in chief of Christian Revival Church. All manner of modernist argument will of necessity be used to justify the use of a very sophisticated means of transport like a helicopter. The standard argument is to say that all manner of information and communications technology is to be utilised for spreading the Gospel of Jesus Christ. As much as there is a strong element of truth in the argument, there is also ambivalence. Apart from the fact that the helicopter is a symbol of a very lavish lifestyle, call it a consumerist lifestyle, serious theological questions are to be posed. Does it constitute a superficial theological argument to refer to the incarnation of Jesus Christ, His suffering and death on the cross, and the fact that he enters Jerusalem on the back of a donkey? Even when the resurrection, the ascension, and the power of the Holy Spirit are called into service to justify the prosperity gospel, the fact remains that one cannot have these without the cross. Does a helicopter riding pastor not expose the glaring discrepancies between the material prosperity of the pastor and the struggle of members of his church to make ends meet daily even further? Where does the money come from to afford a helicopter? Here we add that in the interviews with pastors from historically black charismatic churches, there is the startling difference in that they can hardly have anything that seems expensive without their congregations and others in the community criticising them. It was mentioned that a black pastor in a black township driving an entry-level luxury vehicle is always met with criticism and apprehension, leading to extra scrutiny. Congregants will question why the pastor drives a luxury car and will go as far as to leave the church because, in the minds of many congregants, this would

spell mismanagement of church funds and will lead to separation. Whereas in white led charismatic churches, they do not question the super-luxury enjoyed by the pastors.

There are smaller examples still on the overemphasis on material things. In a service, worshippers are entertained with a story relating to a congregant met by the head pastor at a gymnasium. The story goes that the said congregant issued the pastor with a check of R100 000.00 on the spot. In critical scrutiny of the anecdote, one could positively suggest that this is a mark of excellent stewardship on the part of a member of the Christian Revival Church. One could also argue that the generous offering results from the excellent ministry of the pastor. There is, however, more than meets the eye. The question could be asked, for example, in which black Charismatic church would any of its members be in a position to write out a check for such an amount? The other reality is equally important, that of accountability. If we as pastors in black churches receive gifts and donations, there is a very high degree of accountability and transparency expected from our congregants. There are, of course, such members in some of the black Charismatic churches, but they are few. In the South African context the following question cannot be avoided: what situation has given rise to the reality where some are able to contribute substantially to the ministry resulting in churches with vast amounts of money and extensive resources when others can hardly have the leaking roof of the dilapidated church building repaired? In all honesty, the question can only be answered with integrity if the reality of white privilege and black deprivation is engaged critically. From this perspective, the flocking of black Christians to white pastored Charismatic churches is rendered more glaring in the light of the resource drain from black Charismatic churches. Instead of working towards the empowerment and development of black Charismatic churches, these Christians take their gifts, talents, and money to where power already resides.

No wonder that the pastor in chief can donate 1000 pairs of shoes. The most conservative estimate would be about R200 per pair amounting to R200000, which is substantially more than the budget of some smaller black Charismatic churches.

4.11.2. Rhema Bible Church

The issue on Rhema Bible Church is introduced with a measure of hesitancy because of its very sensitive nature. It relates to the question of morality and church discipline regarding the fact that the senior and head pastor has been through a divorce, not once, but twice. The story is that due to a somewhat problematic marriage with his first wife, he divorced her, got married to his second wife, ran into trouble once more, divorced, and remarried his second wife. The issue is not raised on the basis of being judgmental, but as a serious question of morality and church discipline. In most churches divorce of a priest, a minister or a pastor would be viewed in a serious light, resulting in church discipline in one way or another. In some instances, it may even result in suspension or expulsion. All indications are, however, that the head pastor of Rhema Bible Church escaped unscathed to the extent of being able to continue with his ministry without any consequence. The argument here can never be that he should have been dealt with harshly and severely.

It brings up serious questions, however, on morality and the example of pastors, particularly in a church that prides itself on being a "Bible Church." As much as diverse interpretations might be given on what Jesus meant when he spoke against divorce. Compounding factors in the specific case are the very close affinity between the head pastor and former president Zuma who is currently under scrutiny for severe forms of state capture, ranging from money laundering to racketeering. If the lavish lifestyle of the head pastor is anything to go by, his close relationship with Zuma should not be a surprise. Of course, the main

interest of the thesis is trying to understand why some black Christians prefer to join Rhema Bible Church despite these rather severe issues around the head pastor. If, for example, the argument about the generality of sin, weaknesses, and shortcomings among human beings is raised in defense of the head pastor, the situation becomes even more glaring since the same is not granted, black Charismatic pastors. If this happened to a leader of a black Charismatic church or any other denomination for that matter, the result would not have been so favourable. That there was no real backlash from within the Rhema Church over this leaves much room for interpretation and extrapolation. At least not as far as the research data from the very Rhema Bible Church reveals.

4.11.3. Hillsong Church

In a few instances, attempts at interviewing members from Hill Song emerged to be virtually impossible. One example is talking to a young male member of Hill Song, who, with his wife, forms part of a ministry for young married couples.

To the question of whether a focus session relating to the research and sub-questions of the thesis with a few couples would be possible, the response was in the negative, almost categorically so. He clarified that the adverse reaction is not about fear, but more about the culture of submissiveness in Hillsong Church. The issue is perhaps even more clearly illustrated by the attempt to set up a focus group session with a black pastor of Hillsong church. Initially, he agreed, albeit tentatively, to some conversation relating to the issues of the thesis, but ultimately reneged on the idea.

Once again, it was perhaps not so much a question of fear, but the symptom of a distorted understanding of submissiveness. The danger of such responses degenerating into cultic pathologies is genuine. How free is the Gospel, and how free is the church if congregants and pastors for that matter cannot

formulate independent opinions on matters in church and society? This is, of course, to be differentiated from the order and discipline required in all churches. Are members of Charismatic churches allowed only to chant amen and hallelujah, memorise several Biblical verses, repeat a few clichés, or should they be allowed to formulate their understanding of issues? Have the white led Charismatic churches to become enclaves where the minds of people are being captivated and manipulated in new ways and where the critical capacity of Christians as people liberated by Christ and the Holy Spirit gets blunted? Alternatively, perhaps the submissiveness of congregants and pastors should not come as a surprise in a situation where the head pastor seems to be more concerned about the number of cars in the parking lot and the income on a Sunday.

4.11.4. Rivers Church

Elsewhere in the thesis, the racist sermon of pastor Oliver is dealt with critically. The issue here is a comparison between the consequences for the pastor based on the sermon and those for a politician like Zille based on her tweet in which she suggested that colonialism was not only or not all that bad. In the case of the pastor, some black members of his church were offended, but after an apology from him, he was not only applauded but was exonerated and could continue his ministry virtually unhindered. Not so for Zille. She was severely reprimanded by her party and seriously curtailed in her work as a politician. One-way or another, unless this would be dismissed as mere speculation, the tweet has landed her in some dangerous political hot water. What is the argument here? Of course not that the racist sermon is worse than the tweet on colonialism, both are equally offensive and despicable, but the

glaring discrepancy is that the church pastor comes away unscathed while the politician is severely punished. On a personal note and for clarification, we am not a member of any political party.

4.12. Responses to perceived racism in churches

It is peculiar that the leadership of Hillsong had a complete turnabout on their initial willingness to be part of the research. The fact that they could do this and the reasons they gave for refusing to take part in the research calls for further investigation.

We mention this in the thesis to open the cause for the argument that there is more than meets the eye. These white pastored churches portray themselves as non-racial or even color-blind despite the legacy and continued manifestations of colonialism and racism in South Africa.

In an article written by Pontsho Pilane called Rivers Church pastor's bigotry exposes SA's big black Christian whitewash, she looks at the multiracial evangelical churches and how it deals or not deals with race and racism. In the article, she engages various different pastors on the issues of racism in the church. Pastor Xola Skosana stresses that transformation and Christianity are irreconcilable. In the article, she highlights the Pastor's struggle to come to the apparent capturing of the Bible by white power. He believes that black Christians are enslaved by Christianity and keep believing because they are afraid of going to hell. He argues that Christianity is the license of white arrogance and that it is good that Pastor Olivier talked about his politics on the pulpit because it revealed his white privilege and racism.

On the phenomenon of black middle class people joining the large congregations of wealthy mega-churches mostly situated in the suburbs she includes the following from reverend Moss Ntlha, the general secretary of the

Evangelical Alliance of South Africa. The reverend Moss Ntlha holds the opinion that members of the rising black middle class found spiritual homes in these churches and flock to them while sacrificing racial ideology for spirituality.

He argues that black people will continue to go to these multiracial evangelical churches because their personal spiritual needs supersede their racial ideologies.

Black people have learned to make excuses for racism. He believes that churches need to talk about the issue of race and racism and that white people need to find a way to repent for the sin of apartheid.

There needs to be a continuation of the conversation started during the truth and reconciliation commission, where many churches acknowledged that Christianity had tangibly collaborated with apartheid.

In the article, Pilane also quotes Elizabeth Peters, the executive director of the South African Faith and Family Institute, who said: "We have all been trained under the same oppression of white supremacy and patriarchy, and that Christians need to acknowledge this transformation to begin in churches. Dismantling these notions should be our point of entry into a decolonized Christian faith." (Pontsho Pilane Rivers Church pastor's bigotry exposes SA's big black whitewash 2016)

As part of the research, Mohamed Dawjee contributed the following in answer to research questions posed to her. When asked why black people in general and black religious people in particular instead feed into the structure of white supremacy and black inferiority Haji Mohamed Dawjee replies in the light of Fanon and Biko dealing decisively with pathologies emanating from colonial apartheid she replied:

At a book festival late last year where the topic was black excellence (in a nutshell), and the focus on recent movements and protests for access to

education as well as the messaging we as brown and black writers offer readers to get discourse moving forward I was severely disappointed to see that instead of talking about ourselves, our achievements and growth and successes we focused more on white people white spaces, white standards. We need to move past this every time we do this; without thinking, we make whiteness the benchmark. Something we need to compare ourselves to, reach, and strive for.

We need to move past this regressive thinking and start to empower and entitle ourselves to spaces and places that we have established and built and lived off whether they are cultural or scientific or philosophical – and it begs to say – these have existed long before apartheid, so we need to start looking way back, at least 3 to 400 years and start to know who we are so we can be whom we want to be.

In the thesis, we endeavor to make the argument that there cannot be a church that is not influenced by racism in a country still coming to terms with the legacy of our collective past.

The pastors serving as leaders of black pastored churches overwhelmingly call for an informed reflection on the reasons why black South Africans flock to white pastored churches. They reflect on the need for the interrogation of the facts relating to how the past oppressive regimes of colonialism and apartheid have favoured white people and thus put white pastored churches at an unfair advantage.

On the other side of the divide, there is the white pastored churches who against all indications to the contrary hold fast to their innocence regarding the unfair advantage they are enjoying concerning their race and how this favoured them in the past and resulted in them not being on the same footing as their black counterparts.

The instances referring to pastor Boshoff, Pastor Olivier, Pastor Ray McCauley, and Hillsong South Africa are examples of the trend there exists in South Africa of white pastored charismatic churches with sizeable black membership.

According to the world cafés held with black members of these churches, we have found a resounding negative criticism of black pastors and black pastored churches in favour of very positive regard for the white pastored churches.

Looking at three very successful black pastors with very well established churches that flourish, we have shown that the criticism of black pastored churches is not to be accepted without investigation. A look at the incidents in the public domain with reference to four white pastors of charismatic churches, we saw that the positive image portrayed by the respondents also warrant some investigation.

These white pastors would like us to believe the problems with race, and its effects somehow do not enter these churches. As long as they keep to the innocence and ignorance, they are not affected nor influenced by the reality and the effects of racism. Is there truly a possibility that these churches can exist within a racially charged society that is suffering from the effects and inequalities that resulted from the oppressive systems of colonialism and apartheid?

A further question can be posed in this regard: Is it possible, after twenty-five years of democratic government in South Africa that white pastored churches led exclusively by white people with a substantial church membership of black South Africans are to be taken at face value without looking at the obvious questions this phenomenon raises.

Mathew Ashimolowo writes about apartheid (Mathew Ashimolowo 2007; pp 281 283)

It is colonial racism carried to an extreme when the colonial powers allowed South African independence this gave rise to a new reality that led to the institutionalized and legalized system of apartheid which degraded blacks in every way possible. Laws were passed by the nationalist government that governed, restricted and discriminated against blacks in every way possible; they were classified into different race groups, were told where they can live, what they can own, what they can learn, who they can marry, how they must be governed, what type of work they can do. Any form of dissidence was discouraged and severely punished. The reality of apartheid and its cruelty is well documented and in the public domain. The legacy of this oppressive system destroyed people morally, physically, psychologically, generationally, and geographically.

(What is wrong with being black celebrating our heritage, confronting our challenges; Matthew Ashimolowo 2007.)

Article 11 of the International Convention of the Suppression and punishment of the crime of Apartheid issued by the General Assembly of the United Nations refers to apartheid as "The Crime of Apartheid."

Steve Biko writes about the white community as a homogeneous community, who enjoy a privileged position they do not deserve and that they are aware of and spend their time trying to justify.

The integration or non-racialism the white community talks about is, first of all artificial because it is a conscious maneuver rather than the dictates of the inner soul. He continues to say that the talk of integration is a one-way course, with whites talking and blacks listening. (Biko 1979, pp 20, 21)

Biko continues to describe black-white mixed circles as static with no direction nor programme; he uses the example of how black people have been made

inferior so long that the simple act of drinking tea or beer with white people make black people feel slightly superior to those black people who do not have the opportunity to get the same treatment from white people.

Biko continues to lament the sadness of material depravity that apartheid brought but states that the spiritual poverty that blacks are suffering is of the kind that makes black people believe that they are inferior. (Biko 1979 pp 25, 30)

Frantz Fanon in his book *The Wretched of the Earth* talks about the pitfalls of national consciousness as an empty shell. A crude and fragile travesty of what it might be in part as a result of the mutilation suffered by those who have been colonised.

4.12.1. Blackness

The middle class that takes over from the colonisers are weak and underdeveloped, and in its weakened state it will endeavour to fall back into the old ways under which it suffered, and when allowed to serve its true calling to revolution it will fall into the trap of narcissism and self-enrichment. (Fanon 2001 pp 119 121)

Frantz Fanon writes extensively about the black man seeing himself as just a man, the image of the black man, himself an object amid other objects, we cannot be black unless we are black in relation to a white man. The white man determines the ontological existence of the black man. (Fanon 1967 pp 89, 90)

Where are we on our definition of self? Can we be black without being told how to be so by white people?

Like Biko we too have to come to an understanding of who we are. Who we are free from the image of self that we have been and are been given by white people. White people who say that there is no such thing as colour in their

churches. They claim that we are all coloured according to pastor Boshoff and he is pink.

That the white man has not taken anything from us, and we cannot take anything from them because they have worked hard for it even though they tacitly agree that in a way, the system has favoured them.

Our black churches do not have moral leadership, but white pastors can have very public multiple divorces and associate openly with politically questionable characters without being seen as challenging them in their politically, morally, legally, and financially questionable lives.

Our argument is for a renewal of our identity and then a move towards a new national consciousness in speaking the truth about the legacy of our past and the challenges of our present situation. Like the black members of the congregation present at the sermon delivered by Pastor Olivier, we have to free ourselves from the effects of apartheid and oppression and find out what truly makes us tick, transcending the guilt our complicity in the drama of our oppression under the crime of apartheid. We need to heal ourselves from the depravities of the apartheid we suffered and its effects both materially and spiritually, we need to acknowledge the Stockholm syndrome-like effects that our powerlessness and the intrinsically evil designs of white oppression has left us with. We need to acknowledge the temptation we have to fight that makes us consider ourselves just a little better than other blacks who do not have what we have or do not have access to white people like we do.

Then we can proceed to a Black Consciousness that is inward-looking in the spirit of those who went before us like Steve Biko who calls for a South African society that has a more human face, a consciousness that is inward-looking and authentic in its self-actualization. There should not be anything wrong with being black.

In the concluding arguments of our thesis we will endeavour to look at a way forward. In this part of the thesis we look at the latent question of racism as the undercurrent and the unresolved issue in the migration of black Africans to white pastored faith communities with the expressed negative critique of black pastored faith communities as inferior to white pastored churches.

On the side of white pastored churches, we are looking at the claim that these churches are not seeing colour and that race is not an issue even to the point of a white pastored church expressing unwillingness to partake in the research because it does not want to create a situation where their members or leaders are made to feel uncomfortable.

4.12.2. Whiteness

A lot has been said about the role of the white population in the crime of apartheid and colonialism. Let us look at white identity and consciousness in South Africa.

Dyson writes that whiteness is not a genetic attribute or is not limited to skin tone or one of the features people inherit when they come forth from the womb, it is a social inheritance that is part of a particular group. He continues by saying that this whiteness is killing black people and killing white people too. He says that whiteness is an advantage and privilege because it has been made so by white people. He acknowledges that white people came from different parts of the world but that it all pulverised together into whiteness. Even the historical differences that used to separate different European white people were set aside when they teamed up to bring into existence whiteness. He goes on to argue that whiteness has privilege and power connected to it.

Whiteness has so much invested into it that it is difficult to let go. He also agrees that whiteness is often defensive, resentful, and full of denial and

dementia. Whiteness has only two modes: it either converts or destroys. (2017 pp 43, 46, 49)

Towards a clearer understanding of the research question, we look at blackness and whiteness and the need for conversion, the need for healing, and the need for a new identity and consciousness.

Kritzinger joins Archbishop Tutu and calls for black and white liberation. He goes as far as saying that there needs to be an openness to conversion and a process of liberation from whiteness. In this, he does not limit this need for liberation to the white Afrikaans speaking population but all those who are part of the white community in South Africa. He calls for a new identity, one that transcends the compact delineated cultural frameworks that are used to euphemise the actual situation that persists regarding the need for liberation from whiteness. There is a need to talk about and grow through the pains of blackness and whiteness in order to arrive at liberation. This is in direct convergence with what Dyson speaks of that whiteness hurts blacks but also whites. Kritzinger continues to call for a farewell to innocence, the temptation to regularise the atrocities of apartheid under a theology that served universalism and orthodoxy. He calls for the first step towards freedom that starts with owning up to where white people are as a race and the class they occupy in society. There needs to be a theological reflection, too, one that would bring the white people in touch with their identity as human beings and as Christians. This liberation needs to be owned by people in order for it to become a reality.

As Christians, the words of John 16: 8-11 need to bring us into a situation where we become acutely aware of our sin as the Holy Spirit makes us aware and calls us to repentance. Not a repentance that is a once of confession but a continual deepening of Christian witness and discipleship. (1990 pp 54, 57)

Chapter 5

Towards a new liberating and transforming consciousness and spirituality of healing and transforming consciousness.

5.1 Introduction

In this chapter, we look at a way forward towards a new identity and consciousness. To facilitate the process, we are using the praxis circle as our method of pastoral reflection and action; we will also use as our biblical text Luke Chapter four. -

We will look at the praxis circle in its original form, as was introduced by Holland and Henriot, briefly looking at various adaptations from Cochrane, De Gruchy, and Kritzinger. A parallel will also be drawn between the praxis cycle and Osmer's four steps in Practical Theology.

Then we look at a new spirituality in the context of insertion, identification, and agency: What are the choices we make and the values we espouse and embrace? Here I introduce my account at insertion.

I will also be looking at a new spirituality as socio-analytical mediation or context analysis. The question is asked whether a new Kairos is emerging in the charismatic churches and the country. What are the "signs of the times"?

I will endeavor to demonstrate a new understanding of whiteness and blackness, understanding diversity in the context of the quest for a common identity. I am ultimately looking at a South African identity to appropriately locate the reality of whiteness and blackness in the Charismatic Churches.

I will then look at a new spirituality as a radical discipleship that opens the way to a new consciousness and a new spirituality.

Then I look at radical discipleship based on Luke 4:16-21 with particular emphasis on mission in FOUR dimensions:

1. Energised, anointed by the Spirit
2. Mission as radical evangelisation: good news to the poor;
3. Mission as Healing: how do we deal with our difficult past as Charismatic churches and as South Africans?
4. Mission as liberation: which are the sacrificed and as yet not liberated zones of South Africa? How free or liberated is the church?
5. Mission as Jubilee: a specific focus on the land question. Is reconciliation with justice feasible?

I will then look at a new spirituality as the development of new strategies for mission:

1. Planning for re-evangelisation and decolonisation;
2. Planning for conscientisation;
3. Planning for "dangerous preaching"- how to construct a sermon aimed at the inculcation of new spirituality and action;
4. Planning for making inroads into the media: TV, radio, and social media platforms.

5. Planning for workshops, world cafés, seminars, and publications aimed at equipping people for mission in terms of the quest for a new consciousness and a new spirituality.

Chapter four shown that there is more than meets the eye concerning whiteness and blackness and a new identity and new consciousness.

Looking towards making inroads into the underlying issues that fuel the rapid migration of black South Africans to white pastored churches, I propose the use of the praxis circle to facilitate the process of coming to a new identity and developing a new consciousness.

5.1 The praxis circle

The praxis circle is proposed as a tool for pastoral action and is geared towards social action. It is described by its chief proponents as academic in that it studies a particular social situation in its abstract in order to understand its elements while it is also pastoral in as much as it looks at reality from a level of profoundly personal involvement, historically committed discernment for action. (Holland and Henriot, SJ. 1983 p 7)

The first proponents of the praxis cycle are clear in their introduction to the second edition of the Social analysis, that how we see a problem determines our response to the particular problem. They go into substantive lengths in describing the various ways in which one can respond to specific problems in society. Their approach based on seeing the broader picture and initiating action that affects more profound societal change. (Holland and Henriot, 1983 pp 1, 3)

The following section is a summary of the praxis circle as found in the second edition of Social Analysis Linking faith and Justice by Joe Holland and Peter Henriot, SJ (Holland and Henriot, 1983 pp 12,13)

The pastoral cycle in its essence look at the experience of the pastoral reality in four distinct stages that make up the pastoral circle; here we look at the four stages of the pastoral cycle :

5.1.1 Insertion

This first step is critical as it shapes the questioning we do and the judgments we make. Insertion is about making explicit who we are and what our fundamental beliefs and primary values are. At the stage of insertion we look at conversion as the first step in analyzing society from the perspective of theological reflection, social justice and transformation in a practical way. This conversion is to a particular set of values that will provide us with a primary point of interpretation in our understanding of the world today.

At insertion, we ask the questions, whose experiences are considered? Where and with whom are we locating ourselves throughout the process of decision and action?

5.1.2 Social analysis

This is the second step in the circle the arena of social analysis. It examines the causal factors and looks at the results or consequences with particular emphasis on how the different factors interact, the agents and instigators of societal change; all of this are done in order to facilitate making sense of experience by putting them into a broader picture and drawing the connections between them.

At this point in the process, we look at what traditions and theological arguments followed. We look at the various presuppositions in the analysis and whether or not they need testing.

Here we connect our reflection to include our values, the significant events in our life, the structures, systems, and ideologies that influenced our self-actualization. It looks at the origins and consequences of the events, issues, and systems that influence us. In step two, we look at what causes societal change, we examine the results and how it affected society, and what the common denominators are that shape our experience and ability to make choices free from pressure and coercion. This analysis into society and the pressures surrounding decision making and the freedoms attached to them allows us to become persons who go beyond just accepting the status quo but to reach out into the unknown and ask pertinent questions informed by reflection into why there is human suffering and injustice. We learn to look deeper into what caused societal change and trying realities. We critically examine structures and strive to come to deeper understanding of what causes the problems we face in society with the aim of understanding and changing the status quo into something better.

5.1.3 Theological reflection

This part of the cycle endeavors to get a deeper understanding of the experiences that were analysed in the preceding steps, to bring these experiences into the context of the lived reality of the Christian. This is to understand the lived reality in the context of faith and social teaching as found in scripture, Christian dogma and tradition. When we bring the darkness of of societal problems and pathologies into the light of the word of God we receive new perspective, we gain new insights and can engage the problems with new fervor.

Here we look at the relationship between social analysis and theology. We ask if the relationship is complementary or subordinate. Another crucial question is, how close is theology linked to the existing social situation?

5.1.4 Pastoral planning

The fourth step in the circle looks at how individuals and communities deal with the results of their reflection and analysis of the realities they face as Christians and members of society and how they interact as individuals and communities.

At this stage, we look at the role players in the pastoral planning. We look at the implications of the process that was used in determining our response or action.

The different steps in the praxis circle cannot be isolated; theology is not restricted to the step called theological reflection; in a wider sense, all the moments of the circle are part of an expanded definition of theology; in this way all the steps are linked and does overlap. (Holland and Henriot, 1983 p 13)

5.2 Adaptations of the pastoral circle

5.2.1 J. R. Cochrane, J.W. de Gruchy and R Petersen's adaptation

J. R. Cochrane, J.W. de Gruchy, and R Petersen add four additional elements to the original praxis circle of Holland and Henriot. These include faith-commitment, ecclesial analysis, and retrieval of the tradition, spiritual formation, and empowerment.

They describe the whole process as:

1. Prior Commitment (Faith) a direction towards the 'kingdom' of God
2. The moment of insertion
3. Social analysis
4. Ecclesial analysis
5. Theological Reflection or retrieval of the tradition

6. Spiritual formation and empowerment
7. Pastoral planning or praxis

The four elements that they added are as follows

The faith-commitment is the pre-understanding and perspective brought to the task and which precedes the moment of insertion.

The ecclesial analysis, which is a form of social analysis locates the church and its ministry within its social context as part of the overall social dynamics of that context.

Retrieval of the tradition forms part of the theological reflection but does so in a particular way.

Spiritual formation and empowerment is a vital moment which relates theological reflection to pastoral planning and praxis.

They also argue that it is vital to locate the pastoral circle within an eschatological framework determined by the biblical concept of the Kingdom of God. For them, the point of departure of the pastoral circle is the confession of Jesus Christ as redeemer, liberator, and Lord and the Kingdom of God the end to which the circle moves.

5.1.2 JNJ Kritzinger's adaptation

JNJ Kritzinger adapts the pastoral circle into seven dimensions that he calls Agency, context analysis, ecclesial analysis, theological reflection, spirituality, practical projects, and reflexivity. (Kritzinger 2008: 771)

These dimensions he develops from the formal logical language that Lochhead uses to describe the actual practice of a person concerning people of another faith tradition, namely the major premise, which is the person's theory of

salvation and the minor premise being the person's ideology. (Lochhead 1988:90)

The basic outline of the seven dimensions proposed by Kritzinger

1. Agency.

This is where the person or the group asks a question regarding their identity concerning other people with particular reference to their socio-economic position. It is also a look into how the person or group understand themselves and how they share the same social space as the people that they differ from. How do our differences influence the way we encounter one another.

2. Context analysis

This is a look at the different factors that influence the society within which the different people or groups encounter one another. How is the context analysed by different people or different groups? How is their encounter influenced through their encounter? When people interact, they encounter each other on different levels and are influenced by this in different ways. We all bring our own experiences to our encounters with other people and these encounters take on their own dynamics and have the potential to grow and transcend the individual experience.

3. Ecclesial analyses

How does Christianity and other faith orientations relate historically? How has the interaction been, and how is it at present? How can we describe the concrete and organizational makeup of the different faith formations and how they interact with the society in which they are situated?

4. Theological reflection

How are the Bible and individual theological traditions interpreted in the light of the previous three dimensions? How is the theological interpretation experienced when interrogated in the light of the previous three dimensions? What is the unique message of the Christian faith that emanates in this context?

How do our different religious sources and authority structures influence our theological reflection of our situation and encounter?

5. Spirituality

The following questions are used in this section: what is the nature of the spirituality exercised by the people involved in the program? How could the main thrust of the spirituality be described? What can the people who practice the spirituality be transformed by the new insights they gain from their reflections. In other words, the people reflect on their spirituality and they grow and adapt through the process of reflection and introspection. The aim of the exercise is on reflection and growth.

How can the new insights be utilised to make the experience and expression of the people's spirituality and worship grow deeper and be renewed? How are relationships between people of different religions influenced by the new insights? Does knowledge of different spiritualities help people of different spiritual practices relate better, and does it influence their encounter?

6. Practical projects

What concrete projects are the participants involved in with particular reference to people of other faith and cultural practice? What are the participants planning

in order to strengthen their particular positions or their relations with other communities? How is the encounter between people of different faith and cultural practices influenced by concrete faith projects? Are our different projects parallel, or are they opposed?

How can the new theological insights be better utilised to translate into projects that will enhance the faithful observance of participants and call to justice in a particular context and dialogue between different faith and cultural practices?

7. *Reflexivity*

Here we look at the integration of the previous dimensions into the people's experience and practice of faith and worship?

Is there education and growth throughout the process and interfaith encounter?

Are there lessons learned from mistakes?

Is there a true openness to dialogue? Does the reflection facilitate renewed commitment to the cycle and the dimensions mentioned above?

5.1.3 *Richard Osmer*

Osmer's four dimensions are close in similarity to the steps of the praxis circle of Holland and Henriot, and it might make for some fascinating reading when both these are used in disciplines other than theology.

In his book on Practical Theology in the introduction, Osmer proposes a model of practical theological interpretation with four tasks:

1. The descriptive-empirical task asks, 'What is going on?'
2. The interpretive task asks, 'Why is it going on?'

3. The normative task asks, 'What ought to be going on?'
4. The pragmatic task asks, 'How might we respond?'

Osmer uses the concept of the hermeneutical circle or the hermeneutical spiral to clarify the relationship between the four tasks. Although the four tasks are distinct, they are also connected. The interpreter must continuously move between tasks, which leads to an interpretive spiral. (Osmer, Richard R. 2008)

The first task is the descriptive-empirical task. Practical theology begins with episodes, situations, or contexts that call for interpretation.

Therefore, practical theology invites 'students to interpret the texts of contemporary lives and practices, "living human documents." The descriptive task seeks to answer the question, what is going on? (Osmer. 2008, 32)

He uses the term "spirituality of presence" to refer to the activity of priestly listening. 'It is a matter of attending to what is going on in the lives of individuals, families, and congregations' (32). He sees this as interpreting the texts of contemporary lives and practices, this he refers to as "living human documents" (34)

The second or interpretive task asks: "why is it going on?" Here Osmer refers to the application of what he calls "sagely wisdom" in seeking reasons for what has been proposed as the answer to the question in the first task. Here the leader of the inquiry. In this stage, we look at the issues embedded within the episodes, situations, and contexts in the discourse.

Osmer refers to this process as applying 'sagely wisdom'. Sagely wisdom requires the interplay of three key characteristics: thoughtfulness, theoretical interpretation, and wise judgment. Theoretical interpretation is the ability 'to

draw on theories of the arts and sciences to understand and respond to particular episodes, situations, and contexts' (83).

The third task asks the question, "What ought to be going on?" At this task, the process calls for a review of present realities in the light of God's will. This is the prophetic discernment.

The term "prophetic discernment" is intended to capture 'the interplay of divine revelation and human response as prophetic discernment. The prophetic office is the discernment of God's Word to the covenant people in a particular time and place' (133).

'Prophetic discernment involves both divine disclosure and the human shaping of God's word' (134-135).

In the fourth task, we ask the question: "How might we respond?" Osmer explores various aspects of leadership (e.g., task competence, transactional leadership, and transformational leadership). He proposes the model of servant leadership. In this task, leaders learn how to guide their congregations through the process of change.

5.2 Choice of the praxis circle

It is crucial to situate the pastoral circle within this part of the thesis because we believe it is the vehicle that will bring about the desired change in identity and consciousness that will result in social change and healing within the church in South Africa and beyond.

It will enable us to engage in a meaningful conversation with Charismatic churches with the aim of bring about meaningful discourse and reflection on the

deep-seated issues of racial inequality and oppression that resulted in the current situation and then working towards concrete actions that will bring about social justice, healing, and peace. We start this section with the words of John Chapter 16: 8 that speaks of the effects of the coming of the Holy Spirit, making us aware of sin and righteousness.

The praxis cycle as it originated with Holland and Henriot, the adaptations it has undergone, and the comparison between the cycle and the four practical theological dimensions of Osmer, reveal a very distinct hermeneutic. They divert radically from a linear hermeneutic in terms of which a direct line between the Bible and the contemporary context is drawn. This is the typical explanation-application interpretation of Scripture. Scripture is explained and then applied to any given situation. The distinct hermeneutic revealed by the praxis cycle, its adaptations, and the approach of Osmer, identify the current context, the context, and text of the Bible as equally important sources of theology and therefore as equally important for the creation of theological knowledge. The movement is not linear, but circular. Put differently, the attempt at understanding the own insertion or agency and the context enhances the interpretation of the Bible, which interpretation serves, more often than not, as a correction to our agency and our analysis of context.

5.3 My personal approach to the praxis circle.

I am a celebrated Charismatic preacher and leader of a well-established church community that has been in existence for more than twenty-five years. In my pastoral experience, through my ministry and community involvement I learned

that our individual and collective realities have to be brought under the authority and inspiration of the Holy Spirit.

My life long struggle against all forms of discrimination and oppression lead me to this research into the social injustices associated with white pastored churches in South Africa and the large crowds of black people choosing to leave black churches in favour of these exclusively white led church communities.

The praxis circle is dated in its origin, it was adapted and revised over the years by its original proponents and many other contributors over the year. It has been used widely in theological research. Coming from a mainly protestant background and now being a leader in the Charismatic church I am acutely aware of the origins of the praxis circle and I believe that this can be used to assist us in looking at the underlying issues of race and racism in our society and how we can come to a new identity and consciousness.

5.4 Insertion

At this point, I would like to situate myself in the first level of the praxis circle, namely insertion. Here I will endeavour to show how I have experienced racism, and it has influenced the choices I have made and the values I have ascribed to over the years, including my own experience of healing from the effects of the past and to a great extent a present affected by racism. The thesis aims to look at the missiological context, an investigation into racism and the need for a new identity and consciousness.

Like I said earlier, I come from a mainly Dutch Reformed protestant Christian past. My road to my present state as a founding pastor of an independent Charismatic church started as a young man who promised to work for God in His church after a very traumatic episode of physical violence and the genuine danger of death that could very well have played out.

As a boy, I lived very close to the Church, looking back over the trajectory of my life and ministry, I can almost point to the exact moment where I felt the call to ministry. After all I lived and experienced I always felt a deep desire for justice and the upliftment of the less fortunate in our communities. This desire brought me to the call for an end to apartheid and its legacy. An end to the unfair advantage that this oppressive system has brought to the collective consciousness of our beautiful land and its beautiful people.

I was blessed to be part of the establishment of a church community that started with eight members that grew by the grace of God and the hard work and commitment of many to a large body of very committed members of Chrystal Ministries international. At this moment, we stand on the brink of our twenty-first celebration. Throughout the years, I fought great odds and overcame many challenges. In this thesis, I look at one of those questions that have been with me from the beginning.

Are we as the Church of God faithful to our prophetic call to bring justice and peace to the broken world that we need to bring under the authority of the Gospel of Christ?

Over the years, I came across many personal incidents of apartheid and discrimination. One such incident I include here to illustrate the deep-seated pathology of racism and white privilege that is evident and in operation to this day. I was in England visiting with a lifelong friend. He is also in the ministry, and we have collaborated on many occasions. I considered myself a personal friend, and we frequented each other's homes and had the openness associated with the family.

On occasion, I accompanied him to a conference for pastors. During the course of the day, an opportunity given for anyone to speak on any topic.

The floor was opened, and the program director encouraged participants to take advantage of this opportunity. I went to announce myself to the program director and asked to have my name added to the list of speakers. The program director told me that I was not supposed to speak.

I would not be allowed to speak. I was distraught and shocked at the total unwillingness to allow me the opportunity that was seemingly afforded to all. After returning to my seat my friend and the person I shared a special fraternity confessed to me that it was him, he told the program director not to allow me to speak. He expressed his sincere regret at what he had done and the hurt he had caused me and confided that he could not help himself, against all that was there between us up to that moment he still could not allow himself to see me as his equal or that I could contribute to their discussion.

During the ride back to his home after the conference there was very little said and I made arrangements for me to stay with someone else. The wounds were deep and the blood that flowed was that of brothers in Christ but the division and the discrimination were real. The sin of racial prejudice and white supremacy was laid bare. I had no other choice than to refuse his hospitality. The openness disappeared, and all that we could share was the knowledge that racism and its effects were real.

I know that there will be a time that we will be healed of this brokenness, but then we need to choose to allow the Holy Spirit to address the ugliness of all that apartheid and oppression brought to us.

I own my part in the tragedy not only as a victim of apartheid and racial segregation, and all that came with colonialism and apartheid. I acknowledge that I have been influenced by the evil I suffered.

I have felt the deprivation that these oppressive systems have left us with. I have felt the resentment that the knowledge of my unequal and disadvantaged status has left me with.

It has made me choose to be this man I became now, who knows what decisions I would have made if I had the same opportunities as my white confreres and fellow South Africans. I chose the road to excellence through hard work and great personal sacrifice, but I sometimes check the cost and realise that it came at a price. Now I live for the day when there can be restitution and making sure that there are opportunities for my children and grandchildren and other children, they share this life with. I see my children grow up in this new South Africa that still reels from the effects of its past, and it compelled me to work harder for justice, ask difficult questions and work towards shaping the new identity and consciousness that our beautiful land is in such great need of.

Growing up on the mining town of Carltonville I saw my siblings all became teachers except for my one brother who is involved in the mining sector. He also runs a successful evangelical ministry with an active social outreach program. I see how apartheid has shaped the decisions we have made over the years and the values we have come to ascribe to.

Working on the mines in South Africa offered a unique situation where we could have employment and be in positions that favoured our growth just in as much as the white people who were in charge of us were protected and kept in their positions of superiority. Breaking this mold was very difficult and usually came at too high a price. On the other side of the coin, there was the stereotype employment for people of colour in apartheid South Africa, either become a teacher or a nurse. We did well for ourselves, but the script was written, and there were very few of us who escaped the mould.

Going off to Cape Town to study photolithography and photography was a far cry from the dreams my parents and mentors had for me taking on the mantle of theological studies and becoming a Dutch reformed minister of religion.

My subsequent move to the Pentecostal church was an even more significant blow to my family's aspirations for me and left its mark on my family relationships, especially with my father who only spoke to me at the occasion of the dedication of our son Xavier. Looking back on the choices I made and where it led me I realise that if anyone would have asked me about the life I led until about ten years ago, I would say that I had no regrets and would do it the same. Now, however, I would not do it the same way, the lessons I take from my older self is that I would have started my team earlier and shared my vision and built an equipped team earlier and perhaps made a more significant impact, but we live the lives we do and work with the gifts and the grace we have been given.

We aim to consolidate on lessons learned and work on the big picture where I always take my cue from. The mission is still to bring the gospel and our society together and allow the light of God's spirit to shine light into our society and show us the wrong we do and the path to the confession of sin and the divine life of grace. I look with more urgency on the call for social justice now more than ever. There needs to be an honest investigation into the role of race and its effects on our society. We need an honest and open discussion on the effects and deep-seated pathologies of colonialism and apartheid in our society but more so in the local church here at home, the continent and rest of the world.

The need for a new identity and consciousness still runs true, and we owe it to ourselves and generations to come to allow healing and restoration.

5.5 The signs of the times

As we move along with our reflection on the underlying pathologies and the perceived realities, we look at a new liberating consciousness and a new spirituality. This should happen in the light of a socio-analytical mediation or context analysis interrogating the possibility of the emergence of a new Kairos moment in the Charismatic churches and the country, looking at the "signs of the times

."

Twenty-five years after the dawn of a democratic dispensation in South Africa after the negotiated settlement reached at the Convention of a Democratic South Africa (CODESA) and the subsequent adoption of the new constitution there is still the feeling that what happened in 1994 was not a true liberation of the people who suffered oppression and institutional racism on all levels of society for the longest time.

The exodus of large crowds of black Charismatic congregants from their traditional township churches that are led by black pastors is one of these signs that maybe we have not dealt with the issues of apartheid. When we see that the black congregants are still being bussed in by exclusively white led Charismatic churches I ask myself how this can be normal. How after twenty-five years of democracy, we can have a situation where there exist Charismatic churches whose leadership is exclusively white, and they have large crowds of black congregants who choose to go to white pastored churches rather than to go to churches led by black pastors.

I raise the red flag cautioning against the claim that there is nothing wrong with this situation because these Churches exist and operate within the society of South Africa, a society that is dealing with the aftermath of apartheid and its structures of evil. The Church needs to re-evaluate how it sees itself and how it represents the society in which it is called to continue the prophetic mission of Jesus Christ.

Are we perhaps missing a Kairos moment? Should not the Church return to its original intention to be those who make a difference in the world through its witness to the values of Christ? How do we explain the white leadership with the token involvement of black congregants in lower levels of management and influence? How do we explain the message of prosperity and the apparent wealth of these churches and their white leadership? How do we explain the willingness of the large crowds of black congregants who join these churches and who are not allowed or encouraged to become part of the leadership structures and upper spheres of influence? How do we accept the claims that these white led Charismatic churches have not benefited from the privilege they derived from their race and the advantage this has given them over their black counterparts?

Is it not the time for a renewed look at these churches, and the message they convey that it is still true that as of old, white is right and black is wrong. White is superior and black inferior.

Looking at a new liberating consciousness calls for deep introspection and a new spirituality that will bring the church to re-evaluate itself and how it represents Christ to the world.

5.6 Understanding whiteness and blackness

We are continuing the investigation into whiteness and blackness with particular reference to the realisation that the liberation we celebrated with the elections in 1994 and the subsequent arrival of democracy was taken for granted without seriously engaging and dealing with the underlying effects and pathologies that persisted after the elections and the new tendencies and dangers that lurked behind the scenes soon to be revealed. The very atmosphere of black on black

violence and black people vilifying each other, coercing one another into violence and corruption almost violently getting rid of and marginalising those who tried to uphold excellent and ethical standards in defense of the new and fragile democracy. The racial undertones and the whispers of third force activities and the treat of white *boeremag* and Afrikaner Resistance Movement (ARM) retaliation all add to the idea of our new won democracy being born on a powder keg laden with racial undertones and public threats of violence.

For too long have we played the whiteness blackness game and white people made the rules.

Melissa Steyn, in her book *white identity in a changing South Africa*, returns to the earliest understanding of colonialism and how Europeans created what they called the black race because of the white man's lack of self-knowledge and ignorance of the true nature of the people they were creating as black. This led to a picture of whiteness and blackness that was never based in reality. It was a reality as perceived by the Europeans who did not understand or did not know how to relate to people from Africa whom they were unfamiliar with. (Steyn, 2001, 9)

In other words, the first colonisers looked at the people from Africa, and they defined them from their subjective point of view, from their privileged point of view and what resulted are the systemic misconceptions that we are all faced with to this day.

In the book, she acknowledges that whiteness is not what it used to be and that we need to look at what happened after the elections in 1994, how the social personalities of South African society have changed.

The first ever democratic elections in south Africa in 1994, which brought about the end of apartheid and the start of a new dispensation and a move away from legally enforced institutionalisation of whiteness, presented South Africans on

both sides of the colour divide with a new reality. A reality that brought them to a totally new dispensation. Black and white people in this country were faced with something they were not accustomed to because of the way in which the brutal laws of apartheid was enforced. In one foul sweep the whole apple card was upset, the tables were turned on a cultural and psychological reality that was the lived experience of both oppressor and oppressed for centuries. As South Africans we are still in the process of renegotiating our social contract. The last word in our transformation has not yet been spoken. Apartheid has and is still a reality for many in the world, not only in South Africa but we have had democratic elections and a new constitution that recognized apartheid as evil and something that had to be done away with. We are still in the process of defining our identity as South Africans in the new dispensation.

Quoting Brantlinger in her treatment on the development of whiteness concerning how white people saw themselves in contrast to the people from Africa, they developed anthropology that places Africans on a lower level on the evolutionary development of the human species. "Evolutionary thought seems almost calculated to legitimize imperialism. This they used to legitimise their theory of white supremacy and the subsequent inferiority of those they called black Africans. (Brantlinger 1985 quoted in Steyn 2011, 18)

Mellisa Steyn further situates the systematic move towards the creation of the apartheid laws in South Africa, as seen within the context of the white Afrikaner's quest to establish a place for them within history. The creation of separate dominions for the different tribal African groups and the coloured and Indian population shows that the white Afrikaner wanted to establish themselves within the nations of the world.

They wanted to validate their rights among the nations of the world as a people who belonged, that they existed independently of the imperial forces of Britain who sought to wipe them from the earth. (Steyn 2011, 39)

The birth of apartheid seen against the backdrop of the white Afrikaner's quest to establish themselves while denying the local inhabitants the very right to their place of birth puts the prophetic call for justice and restitution in the forefront of the church's prophetic mission.

In his book, *Tears we cannot stop*, Michael Eric Dyson writes about inventing whiteness and not only the division and pain it brings but also the privilege that whiteness brings. Here is what he says about whiteness:

Beloved, let me start by telling you the ugly secret: there is no such thing as white people. And yet so many of them, so many of you, exist. Please hear me out. I know you're flesh and blood. I know that you use language and forks and knives. I'm not talking about your bodies or your garages or your grocery stores. I'm talking about the politics of whiteness. I'm talking about an identity that exists apart from the skin you are born in. I'm talking about a meaning of race that supersedes the features you inherit when you come out of the womb. You don't get whiteness from your genes. It is a social inheritance that is passed on to you as a member of a particular group. And it is killing us, and, quiet as it's kept, it is killing you too. (Dyson 2017,44)

What the research has left me with personally is that this whiteness and the privilege it brought to white people in South Africa, the innocence they plead at the barbarism of apartheid and its evil, the arrogance that they demonstrate when confronted with the unfair advantage their privilege has bestowed on them but even more their new conversion and now colour blindness.

As if racism is something that you can repent and be forgiven and renewed by the blood of Christ and transformed into someone that does not see colour and does not have to repair the damage your participation and benefit from the oppressive system of apartheid has brought you.

I include the following quote from Eric Dyson as he writes to the American situation. I feel it is apt as part of our treatment of whiteness in our own particular situation. He writes:

My friends, I know reading this frightens many of you. It may even anger you. Please bear with me. Until you make whiteness give up its secrets, none of us will get very far. Whiteness has privilege and power connected to it. No matter how poor you are. Of course, the paradox is that even though whiteness is not real it is still valid. I mean true as a force to be reckoned with. It is true because it has the power to make us believe it is real and to punish those who doubt its magic. Whiteness is slick and endlessly inventive. It is most effective when it makes itself invisible when it appears natural, human, American.(Dyson 2017, 45)

I include the following as part of my argument for the existence of white privilege in the South African situation. It is not exhaustive but rather an instance that shows a trend.

In a very public social media incident, Helen Zille from the Democratic Alliance made the remark that South Africans should stop stigmatising whiteness and should instead look at black privilege. On May 16, 2019, she tweeted: "Well, you clearly do not understand black privilege. It can loot a country and steal hundreds of billions and get re-elected. If people want permanent poverty for the masses, they are going about it the right way."

In a tweet to advocate Tuli Madonsela Hellen Zille writes this about white privilege: Dear @ThuliMadonsela The era to which you refer has ended. 2day "whiteness" is a swear-word used to stigmatise and marginalise. I thought we struggled to judge each INDIVIDUAL on their merits irrespective of race. I will not replace one form of racism with another. Sorry.

This highlights the divide that exists and the extent people are still willing to go in the cause of not looking at the underlying issues. As shown in this instance, white people are unwilling to look at the issues of whiteness and blackness. They prefer to divert from the real issue and instead focus on black privilege.

There are various reasons why there should be a debate about the ideas expressed by Helen Zille in this instance, but another tweet by Herman Wasserman shows some direction on where the argument could go. Here is a tweet from Mr. Wasserman on the subject:

She equates corruption with blackness while denying that white privilege continues to result from structural racism & history. Plus, she implies that black people are 'privileged' by corruption and do not resist. Her view is not 'unpopular' or 'brave.' It is confusing and racist.

For the thesis, I would like to state that the presence of public arguments concerning whiteness and blackness on social media and in the news shows the need for social analysis and the subsequent need for a closer look at identity and a new consciousness in order to start the process of addressing the deep-seated underlying pathologies in our society.

In answer to an interview with Haji Mohamed Dawjee on the issue of whiteness and white privilege and how she feels concrete everyday examples in society on how "whiteness" plays itself out, she replies:

As a person of colour, you do not have to seek out whiteness in everyday life. We buy the norms of whiteness every day. We find it in the workplace where white people are favoured over us for promotions, or we have to question our talents and employment because we are part of a system of false representation. For example, Corporations are forced to ask themselves: Do I have enough people of colour employed in my institution to comply with BEE certification? This leaves us asking

ourselves if we are beans to be counted or if we are being recognised for our skills. This integral psychology does not stem from thin air. It is a learned cognitive response that is adopted from the implicit bias we face every day. We are faced with several judgements. White people are assumed to be more intelligent than us; standards of beauty conform to what makes white beautiful, for example fair skin and straight hair. We assume that our white friends have more money than us and so, therefore, are treated better at banks or malls, whereas we have almost to prove that we deserve to be there. These instances are concrete evidence of the privilege of whiteness and implicit bias in societies.

5.7 Racism

5.7.1 Acknowledging racism

As a nation, we need to acknowledge the past and the long shadows it is casting on our future development. There is the notion that we need to be an acknowledgement of our past and the shadows it casts on our present and our future. Alan Boesak speaks of this as a joke that is shared in black political circles.

It is jokingly remarked that the Nile is not just a River in Egypt. In this, he talks of the denial of the existence of racism, our failure to acknowledge it and the resultant failure to deal with it.

He argues that this is not a joke and should be discussed with the seriousness it deserves (Boesak, 2009, 261) he continues to argue that the mechanism used to forget the past is selective forgetfulness, and the excuse used for this is the need for reconciliation.

He goes on to mention specific incidents of racial violence, namely the incident where a white farmer punished his black worker by dragging him behind his

tractor until he died, and the magistrate only imposed a fine of R30 00. Another incident is of a young boy who was shot because it was thought he was a baboon.

There are many other instances I can add but what Boesak argues is that there is a tendency that is found amongst certain sections of the white community that when faced with instances such as these, of white people abusing black people the reaction from these white communities is not outrage and condemnation but denial and justification. (:264)

Boesak's introduction to *Black Theology* Black power begins by situating the main thrust of the book firmly within the consciousness of the black person and black Christian within the context of the reality they find themselves in as black and Christian living in an oppressive system and struggling for liberation.

It is the question that black people grapple with that looks into what it means to black people having faith in Christ while living in a world controlled by white racists and these white racists being Christians too. (Boesak 1978, 2)

He continues in his statement in *Farewell to Innocence* that in their quest to keep the *status quo*, whites must keep on believing that they are innocent.

Keep on believing that they are serving their divine calling to be the superior and the safeguard of western Christian civilisation and that Christians justify even apartheid because it serves the true community and avoids friction, which is a sin. (Boesak 1978, 4)

After the dawn of the democratic dispensation in South Africa, there has been this tendency to deny apartheid and deny the remnants and the deep-seated roots it has in our society. Looking back at the parts of this thesis that speaks of how white pastored churches are led by pastors who seem to still live in this state of innocence, even denying that they have been beneficiaries of a corrupt and utterly corrupt system that dehumanised people of colour in favour of the

supremacy of the white race. That there continue to be incidents and instances of racism in our country is public knowledge and indeed well documented.

McKaiser introduces another dimension that is very critical to our investigation seeing how so many of the white pastors in charge of these charismatic churches argue that they are not racist. They see themselves as those who speak out against racism on behalf of black people.

In their churches, they are indeed literally standing up against racism and believe in their churches there is no racism because it is a non-racial space. McKaiser talks of the difference between act-based accounts of racism and attitude based on racism. McKaiser. He states that: "Racism can be hard to detect in all its guises and we need to see the reach of racism in our institutions, in our interpersonal relations, in our attitudes and characters, and not only in overt public acts." (McKaiser 2015, pp 12-13)

He goes on to highlight the equal importance of spotting racist acts, and the racism that he says goes under the skin as it were the racist attitudes, beliefs, dispositions, and character traits. He says that white liberals fancy themselves morally unproblematic allies of black people. He advocates for a project that requires black people to be in control of dismantling racism. He speaks about white liberals as the menace in the fight to dismantle the vestiges of our racist past. (McKaiser 2015, 14) The white liberal is often not made aware of their racism, which may not announce itself as boldly and bluntly as the most violent kinds of racism but is nevertheless there. (McKaiser 2015, 113) McKaiser continues to argue that racism is not only to be measured in the acts that can be seen, but is something that is internalised, because if racism affects us on the inside-our entire being- then we are very naïve to think that racism is a term that should only be reserved for intentional actions. Racism is, therefore, not only manifested in acts of racism that can be recorded but slightly more so in the inner disposition of the racist or the attitude towards black people.

Here I include a few incidents of racism that were in the news cycle in the last few months. This is for the many instances of racism that cannot be videotaped or recorded through other media; this is for the many black church members who go to church at these white pastored churches. Where they encounter liberal whites, who make them feel better than their black brothers and sisters who do not have the opportunity to interact with them. The innumerable instances of racism that goes undocumented but are suffered by so many in this country every day.

1. In March 2018, former real estate agent Vicki Momberg received a three-year prison sentence with one year suspended for *crimen injuria*. Part of the evidence against her was a video recording showing her verbally abusing a black police officer who was busy trying to assist her after she was involved in an alleged smash and grab incident. In response to a television interview, she replied that she was temporarily insane and that the media had further traumatised her.

2. In July 2018, a Springs farmer and his 27-year-old son allegedly forced a farmworker to drink feces. The matter that was brought to the equality court is whether the conduct of the farmer and his son infringed the farm worker's right to dignity and whether the language they used during the incident amount to unfair discrimination. A man was allegedly forced to drink feces.

3. In October 2017, Theo Jackson and Willem Oosthuizen assaulted Victor Mlotshwa and forced him into a coffin while threatening to put a snake in the coffin and set it alight. They were found guilty and were handed down prison sentences.

4. In July 2017, a teacher at St. John's College in Johannesburg was found guilty of numerous racist remarks directed at learners and was forced to resign. Some of the racist remarks included telling black students that they only do well when they sit next to white students. When a black student would score high marks,

he would tell them they are beginning to think like a white student. He also called foreign students aliens.

The teacher in question was forced to step down from the positions he held at the school.

These are some of the incidents in the public domain, well documented and reported on in the media.

Responding to the incidents of racism that have been on social media and on the news cycle, the Achmed Kathrada foundation suggests that racism needs to be fought with more excellent dexterity and with increased commitment from all sectors of society.

It needs to be fought in the boardrooms as well as in the classrooms.

Government and ordinary citizens; churches, mosques, and temples, the sports fraternity; popular art and textbooks, social and traditional media must all be geared towards eradicating the evil of racism. It agrees that the roots of racism spread far and wide and include discrimination, apartheid, colonialism, slavery, racist policies, structural racism, prejudiced mindsets, fear, religion, language, culture, science, a skewed economy, and inequality. The Foundation identifies these factors as the underlying factors contributing to the manifestation of racism. (Why we should be rooting out racism 2018)

5.7.2 Institutional racism

An article by the Democracy Works Foundation that looks at institutional racism I draw on the following arguments in this part of the thesis to show that the problem is indeed systemic, and as the church, we also need to look at racism as it is institutionalised in our society.

‘Institutional racism assaults the dignity of black people in an organisation undermines their health and causes anger and poison the affected employees personal relations, outside their jobs as well’ (Gumede 2018)

The systems of colonialism and apartheid were all-encompassing, involving not just individuals, but throughout institutions, professions, public and private sectors, infecting them with institutional racism. Institutional racism was deeply entrenched in housing, banking, mining, education, arts, farming, churches, the media. (Gumede 2018) That these systems were meticulously enforced and reinforced through the different apparatus of the apartheid government was something best experienced and lived, and this could not be given a fair demonstration in written form.

From personal experience, I agree that institutional racism was a monster that was experienced in the day to day systems that made up the apartheid government and society.

In the article, Gumede puts it so well when he says in short: ‘ a big part of institutional racism are the routine ways in which organizations treat black people’. (Gumede 2018)

The argument I am making here is that institutional racism did not just grind to an all stop with the elections in 1994. This could not happen as it has been such an integral part of how society understood itself and operated within the confines of the laws that undergirded the apartheid system of government.

The culture of the corporate world and the government in South Africa were not immune to the system of apartheid practiced for hundreds of years. This systemic and institutionalised discrimination on the bases of race became part and parcel of the South African lived reality. Apartheid was practised at all levels of society, and it was legitimised through the legal system and enforced by the police and very specialised police and paramilitary forces.

This system of institutionalised apartheid has been embedded in society and has become part of the collective experience and memory of the nation in this way, making it the starting point of any serious discussion on social justice.

Gumede also touches on whiteness and white privilege in institutions. There is the perceived reality that view white people as automatically better qualified and more competent than black people just because of the skin colour. In contrast, black employees are seen as less competent or have to prove themselves before they receive recognition is, therefore, a living sign and symbol of the ever-present reality of institutionalized racism.

The disparity in the remuneration of white and black employees is a further manifestation of institutionalised racism in that even if blacks do get senior positions in companies they are usually paid less, or they enjoy less benefits than whites who are on the same level as blacks in the company's organogram. This is also an impediment to empowering black employees in the workplace. (Gumede 2018) This phenomenon, widely entrenched in South

African organisations speak to the deep-seated underlying societal pathology that must be acknowledged if we are to move forward with the new identity and new consciousness or more human face of the new society that we want to build.

The whole concept of blackness and whiteness is the creation of the Europeans who did not know the true identity of the people they labeled as black. This ignorance led to the creation of the concepts of white and black people. What made it worse in South Africa was that the white people who chose to stay in Africa and fight their imperial masters had to create and subjugate the blackness they created. This gave them control and superiority. Colonialism and apartheid were systems and resulted in the systemic oppression of the local inhabitants.

Whiteness and white privilege come from these systems developed and aimed at suppressing the local inhabitants. The thesis deals with the question of whether or not it is possible to have a church free of racism in a country suffering from the systemic effects of colonialism and apartheid. We need to look at white liberals who try and hide in plain sight by pleading innocence and ignorance but who are still benefitting from the history of their whiteness and subsequent favorable treatment and advantage on every level of society and in all institutions. The church has specific and deep-seated questions to investigate. Christians practice apartheid. The church played a pivotal role to play in the creation of apartheid and should now also be called upon to play its role in addressing the issues associated with it. Apartheid cannot be argued away because it is part of the lived reality of the people who live in this country. What matters is how we as a church are going to address it and ensure the birth of a new consciousness and a spirituality of healing and transformation

5.8 A new liberating consciousness

5.8.1 Toward a new liberating consciousness

To gain some perspective on this part of the thesis, I add some sentiments expressed by McKaizer on possible next steps.

In an earlier publication called, *A Bantu In My Bathroom*, McKaizer speaks on how divided we are as a nation along many different lines, but most of all, linguistic, cultural, and ideological, to name but a few. In his own words, he expresses his empathy with the situation we as South Africans find ourselves in: "Sometimes I feel sorry for us. We have an almost pathological yearning as South Africans to be Archbishop Desmond Tutu's infamous rainbow nation. The image that propelled us into the new South Africa." (McKaizer 2012, 155) He situates this desperate need for this oneness that the rainbow nation

represents in the fear that this deep disagreement will perpetuate historical division. He suggests the following:

The sooner we abandon the myth of a rainbow nation, a united nation, the better for our democracy.

A national identity is neither necessary nor possible: we live in a diverse country with individuals and communities that have profoundly different beliefs, attitudes, habits, and ideological convictions. Why insist on a shared national identity? We should instead accept that we are deeply divided and reflect on how we might live in each other's space while disagreeing profoundly with each other. (McKaizer 2012, pp164-165)

In a second book called, *Run Racist Run*, he asks the question: “what are the solutions to racism and poor or impaired race relations in South Africa?” he argues that the solution should not be our primary focus, he cautions against the rush to engage the race debate in the form of solution-seeking.

This is demonstrated in the following quote:

There are deep disagreements about what the past consisted of, how the past affected the present, what the nature and scope of racism's nasty presence are, or are not, in contemporary South Africa. Complete consensus on history and complete consensus on the contemporary social challenges are not preconditions for making progress in chipping away at structural, institutional, and interpersonal problems. What is required is an overlapping consensus about the nature and the extent of our problems with racism. Then maybe we can have some consensus about what an ideal South Africa looks like. (McKaizer 2015, 75)

Looking at the philosophical basis of the societal problem in South Africa, Steve Biko argues that liberal whites have not been unbeaten in their logical argument on the problem faced in South Africa.

He explains it thus: The white liberals identified apartheid to be the problem in South Africa, they propose that the problem be combatted with non-racial groups and that the ideal situation lies in between apartheid and non-racial groups.

He calls apartheid the thesis, non-racial groups he calls the antithesis, and he argues that the synthesis is not clearly defined. Biko introduces the argument of Black Consciousness, the thesis is white racism, and the antithesis is strong solidarity among blacks. He proposes the synthesis to be some kind of balance, true humanity, where power politics will have no place. (Biko, 2012, 99)

Biko argues that black people and black people in South Africa have had enough experience as the objects of racism. Black people must not focus the quest on a preoccupation with black concerning white. As a way forward, he proposes we must focus more on our own development than to focus on white people. He proposes we set out in search of a true humanity and that this should be our objective.

This is demonstrated in this quote from, I write what I like:

“Let us march forth with courage and determination, drawing strength from our common plight and our brotherhood. In time we shall be in a position to bestow upon South Africa the greatest gift possible- a more human face.” (Biko 1978, 108)

This is also strongly expressed in the following quote from Fanon in his book the wretched of the earth:

It is a question of the third world starting a new history of man, a history which will have regard to the sometimes prodigious thesis which Europe has put forward, but which will also not forget Europe's crimes, of which

the most horrible was committed in the heart of man and consisted of the pathological tearing apart of his functions and the crumbling away of his unity. Let us not pay tribute to Europe by creating states, institutions, and societies which draw their inspiration from her.

Humanity is waiting for something from us other than such an imitation, which would be almost an obscene caricature.

If we want to turn Africa into a new Europe and America into a new Europe, then let us leave the destiny of our countries to Europeans. They will know how to do it better than the most gifted among us. But if we want humanity to advance a step farther, if we want to bring it to a different level than that which Europe has shown it, then we must make discoveries for Europe, for ourselves and humanity, comrades, we must work out new concepts, and try to set afoot a new man (quoted in decolonization and empire John S Paul 2008, 173)

Even though they speak from two different vantage points, Biko and Fanon have so much in stock because they speak of colonialism and apartheid and how they shaped the consciousness and identity of Africans. Both of them suggest that the answer to the problems and challenges Africans suffer because of colonialism and apartheid is the new man or new humanity.

This, among other sources, is the basis of the thesis and the inspiration of the argument and the quest of a new liberating consciousness. There is merit in looking at the underlying pathologies associated with the peculiar phenomenon of black people joining white pastored churches in large numbers despite the very challenging situation we find in our society with regard to the societal pathologies, the economic woes and the crisis in the political arena.

In our quest for a new humanity or a new man, a liberating consciousness and spirituality of healing within the context of the current trend within the

charismatic churches in post-apartheid South Africa, we next look at the theological reflection on a new humanity.

5.8.2 Theological reflection on a new humanity

Our theological reflection on a new humanity is based on the biblical text of Colossians 3:11, Galatians 3:28, and Ephesians 2:14 that speaks of the new humanity that does away with the former divisions.

God does not merely save isolated individuals but instead saves specific people. He called Israel out of bondage, not Moses alone (Ex. 3:7–8). Christ died to purchase a church made up of multiple people, not just one person. When God purposed to save His people, He also purposed to create a new humanity.

We saw in Colossians 3:9–10 how God in Christ takes off the old self (mankind in Adam) from His people and puts on the new self (mankind in Christ).

This new self is humanity that transcends all of the distinctions between human beings without obliterating them. We see in this passage, wherein Paul speaks of the new self as a corporate body in which there are no ethnic or class distinctions (3:11). He indwells everyone who trusts Jesus alone through His Spirit — He "is all, and in all." Therefore, no one in the church is closer to Him than anyone else.

From the most miserable slave to the richest free man, from the most cultured Greek to the most uncouth barbarian, from the most observant Jew to the formerly rankest pagan, all are on equal footing in the new humanity God is building in Christ. (<https://www.ligonier.org/learn/devotionals/new-humanity/>)

5.8.1 Luke 4:16-21

For the theological reflection, I will focus on Luke 4: 16-21

In this part of the thesis, we will look at the biblical text in different parts with focus on the work of the Holy Spirit. The parts that I have identified are:

1. Luke's Gospel in the context of empire
2. The Spirit is the movement
3. Good news for all, but in particular for the poor
4. The Spirit of healing and restoration
5. The Spirit of Liberation
6. The Spirit of jubilee.

I am looking at the text and the commentary of Jeremiah Wright, Ruth Anne Reese, Frank Thomas and George Flattery.

Pastor Jeremiah Wright speaks at a two-day symposium on C Span on the African American religious experience and historical, theological and political context. Speaking on the text of Luke 4:16-24 he places the text within the context of God's desire for a radical change in a social order that has gone sour. He situates the text within the prophetic theology of the black church as a theology that is more than just a theology of liberation but also a theology of transformation.

The Text that Jesus reads is from the prophet Isaiah 61, and it speaks of God's desire for God's people. God desires for positive, meaningful, and permanent change. God does not want one people to see themselves as superior to another. God intends to not only act on the side of the poor, the powerless, and the marginalised but there is the intention to bring about positive change to transform the situation in society that led to inequality.

God declares restitution, transformation, and jubilee. The transformation that God is declaring is not cosmetic but real and all-encompassing. God desires changed lives, changed minds, changed laws, changed social orders, and changed hearts in a changed world.

Pastor Jeremiah Wright indeed speaks of the situation as is found in the society of North America, and he speaks with particular reference to the Prophetic theology of the black church. However, he speaks from an intimate understanding of the evil of slavery and racism, as is found in North American society. The lived reality in a society where it is evident that some are more equal than others.

He addresses the tendency to believe that because of the way black Americans do things, and white Americans are different, it does not mean that it is deficient; it just means that it is different. (Wright 2008)

This can be seen in the following segment on the text of the speech:

This principle of transformation is at the heart of the Prophetic Theology of the Black Church. The Prophetic Theology of the Black Church, in our day, is preached to set African Americans and all other Americans free from the misconceived notion that different means deficient. Being different does not mean one is deficient; it merely means that one is different.

Like no two snowflakes are ever the same, so too no two people are ever the same. This diversity points to the effects of the Love God has for each of us created in God's image and likeness. Black music is different from European music. It is not deficient; it is just different.

Black worship is different from European and European American worship; it is not deficient; it is just different. Black preaching is different

from European and European American preaching; it is not deficient; it is just different. It is not bombastic; it is not controversial; it is different.

5.8.1.2 Ruth Anne Reece

She places the work of the Spirit at the center of the text. The Holy Spirit accompanies the works that Jesus does. The Holy Spirit is the force that leads, fills, and empowers the prophetic work of Christ. The Holy Spirit accompanies Jesus' work. Such characters as Zechariah (Luke 1:15, 67-79), his wife, Elizabeth (1:41), Simeon (2:25-32), and John (3:16) experience the Spirit and proclaim truth through the filling of the Holy Spirit.

Jesus himself is filled with the Holy Spirit (3:22), who then leads him into the wilderness for a time of fasting and testing. So, when we see Jesus being led by the Spirit (4:14), we should not be surprised to encounter guidance, empowerment, and prophetic words.

The prophetic message of social justice and liberation is a message that is for the poor and other marginalised groups in society.

Along with the poor, the good news is proclaimed to specific groups of people: prisoners, the blind, and the oppressed. All of whom might also be described as "poor." What is this good news? It is news that this is the "year of God's favour." The year of God's favour describes the Jubilee year when God will restore Israel.

(www.workingpreacher.org/preaching.aspx?commentary_id=2741)

5.8.1.3 Pastor Frank Thomas

In his unpublished piece on Luke's working gospel: The prophetic messiah Frank Thomas refers to Luke 4: 16-24 as a dangerous sermon. Dangerous because it is based on the preacher's moral imagination that upends and challenges the dominant moral hierarchy operative in the church and cultural context of the preaching event.

He goes on to situate the Gospel of Luke within the context of the Gospels of Mark and Matthew; in contrast with the other two Evangelists, Luke adds the dimension of Jesus' inclusion of the Gentiles into the economy of salvation. Luke uses this text to introduce Jesus's prophetic ministry, and it is a ministry that includes the Gentiles in the tradition of the prophet Isaiah, Elijah and the widow at Zarepath, and Elisha and the leper Naaman. These are examples of God's intent for the inclusion of Gentiles in the plan of salvation.

Situating Jesus's ministry in the context of this dangerous sermon, Luke presents Jesus's ministry as prophetic. The text includes the refusal of the people to accept Jesus as the prophetic messiah, but Luke introduces Jesus as the prophetic messiah proclaiming the jubilee.

This has particular significance and is expounded on by Frank Thomas in the following quotation:

What did this declaration of the coming of the Messiah mean? How would the synagogue audience interpret the messianic declaration? What kind of messiah is Jesus? One scholar convincingly argues that by quoting Isaiah, Jesus builds on the imagery of the Jubilee year mandated in Leviticus 25:23-55. Every 50 years, Israel was to declare a "year of

liberty," based upon God's prior action of liberation in freeing them from slavery and hard labour in Egypt. The year of liberty was marked by four types of rest or relief:

- a) the land be granted a year of rest; a "fallow" year when no crops would be sown,
- b) debts were to be canceled;
- c) any Indentured servant would be set free, and
- d) any ancestral lands that were sold out of financial necessity (the only conceivable way that you would sell ancestral lands) would be returned to those to whom God had originally allocated them when the Israelites entered the land.

The far-reaching financial and social effects in that it was almost like hitting the refresh button on a computer and resetting everything to factory settings. This would be good news for the poor and bad news for those who owned the means of production and whose financial and social standing depends on the proceeds it derives from collecting on debts and the benefit of buying from those desperate to sell at prices under market value because they are in need.

Imagine how this message would be received by those in attendance and beneficiaries of the current socio-political and financial situation. Taking it to our context, we see how the text turns the table on the benefits derived from corrupt systems that benefited some of the citizens at the cost of those less fortunate or discriminated against by the system.

These words from Isaiah in both the time of the Exile during Isaiah's ministry and Jesus' time of Roman occupation in Palestine, were

tremendous comfort and promise. God has a future that has good news for the poor, healing, and release from various and all forms of captivity. In Jesus preaching the year of Jubilee, the new order has taken on human flesh and is been fulfilled, “today.” (Luke’s Working Gospel: The Prophetic Messiah Frank Thomas)

The people’s refusal to accept the declaration that the prophecy has been fulfilled does not deter Jesus from announcing it. He does not attempt to pacify them. He makes clear the declaration that the text has been fulfilled is true, but the results will not be what the people might expect. Jesus refers to the Elijah and Elisa prophetic traditions (I Kings 17:8-9; 2 Kings 5:14). These prophets perform their healing acts among Gentiles and not for Israelites alone who are in need.

The healing work of Elijah and Elisha touched Israel, but it began outside the Jewish community. (Luke’s Working Gospel: The Prophetic Messiah Frank Thomas)

5.8.2.4 George flattery

The following are reflections on the text by George Flattery on the mission of Christ in Luke 4: 14-21. The text outlines the mission of Jesus Christ and declares it fulfilled by the power of the Spirit. The influence and presence of the Kingdom of God are made known in our lives now. The work of the Holy Spirit is central to the movement in the text. The Spirit empowers Jesus to bring the benefits of the kingdom of God into life on earth. Jesus was set apart and sent by the Holy Spirit to free those downtrodden and bruised. The call to social justice and transformation then is central to the prophetic messiah.

There is a definite call to freedom from oppression and restoration of dignity. The Good news and the announcement of the year of the Lord’s favour is

central to the text and goes along with the theme that it is good news for all but in particular for the poor. There is a definite preference for the poor and the downtrodden.

<https://globalchristiancenter.com/sermons/dr-g-flattery-sermons-on-what-jesus-said/26115-the-mission-of-christ>

The thesis calls for a new liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing and transformation. In the light of this context, the four commentaries on the text leads us in the following and strengthens our call for a look into the movement of black Christians to white led Charismatic churches in South Africa with particular emphasis on the possibility of a church free of racism in a country struggling with the effects of colonialism and apartheid. Jeremiah Wright calls for a renewed focus on liberation and transformation that faith in Christ brings, the proper regard for one another. A focus on white and black as not inferior or superior but just different, where theology looks at not only liberation but also transformation. Frank Thomas calls the text dangerous preaching, preaching that challenges the socio-economic status quo. He calls for a vision of a world free of oppression and oppressive systems. Ruth Reece identifies the holy spirit leading Jesus in the text, also calling us to look at a society under the leadership of the Holy Spirit on the side of the poor and the oppressed. The themes of liberation and transformation are taken up by the commentary by George Flattery on the text; he calls for freedom from oppression and restoration of dignity. Looking at the present situation, taking into consideration what happens in chapters one and two of the thesis concerning the push and pull factors, the responses of congregants and pastors, we see that there is a need for a liberating consciousness. We need a new identity emanating from our coming to life in Jesus and accepting His mission to the poor and marginalized under the inspiration of the Holy Spirit. Who are the poor in our society, black South Africans.

5.9 Luke 4: 16-24 in context

5.9.1. Luke's Gospel in the context of Empire.

The context of the Gospel of Luke is a situated story. Tiberius is emperor, Pontius Pilate governor of Judea, Herod tetrarch of Galilee, and in the infancy section Caesar Augustus, Quirinius, and Herod the King are all mentioned.

(Mathews, Shailer. "Introduction to the Gospel of Luke. II. The Historical Details of the Gospel." *The Biblical World*, vol. 5, no. 6, 1895, pp. 448–455. JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/3135500.)

The context of the thesis is the liberating consciousness and spirituality of healing and transformation within our country. I reiterate the question on the current state of the exodus of black Christians from historically black churches in favour of exclusively white led charismatic churches and how this could be possible within the context of the post-apartheid era in a population that has an overwhelming black majority. How is this possible in the context of the evil of apartheid and the oppressive structures of racism and an exclusively white minority rule? Reading the text within this context calls for sober reflection and ongoing study. The prophetic action of Jesus compels the church to look at what is portrayed as a situation utterly normal within a society grappling with the legacy of colonialism and apartheid and the depraved structures of an all-encompassing oppressive system. As was referred to earlier in this chapter Jeremiah Wright calls the society that Jesus addresses as a society that has gone sour. Looking at the dynamics of our society, we demonstrated the instances of racism vividly documented on all multimedia platforms.

These instances form the basis for the conviction that there are genuinely underlying pathologies that need to be uncovered and brought into the open so that there can be healing and transformation.

As far as it pertains to the church, is it possible that we can still argue that within the church, that constitutes large groups of the population, there are no remnants of apartheid or racism? That the oppressive systems that favoured the white minority in South Africa have no bearing on the status of exclusively white led Charismatic churches and that the overwhelming black membership in these churches is not to be questioned?

Can there be a church that is free of racism and the legacy of apartheid within a country and society with a demonstrated problem with institutionalised and individual traces of racism and racial discrimination? In other words, can there be a church with a majority black membership led by exclusively white leadership twenty-five years into post-apartheid South Africa?

5.9.2 The Spirit is the movement

The universality of the Spirit's economy in the creation and the particularity of the Spirit's work in redemption have to be understood together as the mission of the Spirit for the new heaven and earth when God finally will be "all in all" (1 Cor. 15:24-28). The Holy Spirit works in the world often in mysterious and unknown ways beyond our imagination (Luke 1:34-35; John 3:8; Acts 2:16-21).

Biblical witness attests to a variety of understandings of the role of the Holy Spirit in mission. One perspective on the role of the Holy Spirit in mission emphasises the Holy Spirit as wholly dependent on Christ, as the Paraclete and the one who will come as Counselor and Advocate only after Christ has gone to the Father.

The Holy Spirit is seen as the continuing presence of Christ, his agent, to fulfill the task of mission. This understanding leads to missiology focusing on sending out and going forth.

The Spirit leads Jesus and anoints Jesus to bring good news to the poor. Who is the poor in our society? What is the church's continued mission as the body of Christ under the leadership and in step with the Holy Spirit?

With reference to the claim made by several of the respondents from the world cafés that the Holy Spirit did not lead their previous black-led church, was legalistic, controlled by human-made rules and had a general lack of spiritual freedom resulting in stunted spiritual growth of congregants there is a definite cause for an investigation of these observations.

Looking at how the sample of three very successful black-led charismatic churches see and celebrate the Holy Spirit at the center of their worship and church life there is cause for further investigation into the perceived absence of the Spirit in the life and action of black-led charismatic churches

In the text of Luke 4:16-24, we see that there is a definite movement that is led by the spirit. There is a definite call for recognition of the work of the Holy Spirit and its primary place in the church and the mission of the church as is described by the World Council of Churches on the work of the Holy Spirit in the church:

The Holy Spirit is the Spirit of wisdom (Is. 11:3; Eph. 1:17) and guides us into all truth (John 16:13). The Spirit inspires human cultures and creativity, so it is part of our mission to acknowledge, respect, and cooperate with life-giving wisdom in every culture and context.

We regret that mission activity linked with colonisation has often denigrated cultures and failed to recognise the wisdom of local people. Local wisdom and culture, which are life-affirming, are gifts from God's Spirit.

We lift testimonies of peoples whose traditions have been scorned and mocked by theologians and scientists, yet whose wisdom offers us the vital and sometimes new orientation that can connect us again with the life of the Spirit in

creation, which helps us to consider how God is revealed in creation. (Together towards Life, Mission, and Evangelism in Changing Landscapes, 2013)

The council argues for the centrality of the Holy Spirit in the mission of the Church. It calls for a new reflection on the part that the Holy Spirit plays in bringing about the mission of the Church of God within the changing landscapes of the world in which the Church is active.

5.9.3 Good news for all, but in particular for the poor

The concrete implication of this element of the text has a particular reference to the questions raised throughout the thesis. Historically there is a vast difference between the rich and the poor in South Africa and in the continent. In the text, Jesus proclaims good news for the poor. In the 8th Annual Desmond Tutu International Peace Lecture, President Cyril Ramaphosa speaks on the divide between rich and poor in South Africa.

He says that "We cannot speak of true freedom when ten percent of the population has more wealth than the remaining 90 percent combined; when women are discriminated against at their places of work and abused in their homes; and when privilege and poverty follow the same racial contours of a colonial past." (<http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/speeches/eighth-annual-desmond-tutu-international-peace-lecture-delivered-president-cyril-ramaphosa%2C>)

He continues to speak on the historical situation in South Africa and its effects on the present-day situation: "We will not be able to say we have achieved freedom for all our people until we have corrected the historical injustice of accumulation by a minority based on the dispossession of the majority."

Yes, there is good news for all, but the argument that the white minority in South Africa has not benefitted from the discrimination of colonialism and

apartheid opens the gap for the prophetic declaration of good news to the poor in particular.

As the Church, we have a prophetic mission in that we need to continue the message of Jesus Christ as we find it and base it in the scriptural account of this declaration of Good news to the poor.

5.9.4 The Spirit of healing and restoration

At the appointment of Archbishop Desmond Tutu as the chair of the TRC this is what he said about the work of the commission concerning its focus:

The Truth and Reconciliation Commission's mandate is to assist and facilitate the process of healing and reconciliation. The Commission needs to be geared towards the victims of human rights abuses rather than the perpetrators. I would like us to concentrate on the rehabilitation of victims and restoration of their dignity, emphasizing restitution rather than retribution and reprisal.

Can we still debate the need for healing and reconciliation; can we still deny that we need to look at our identity and consciousness as South Africans? Can we afford to go without transformation and reconciliation? In the thesis, I propose that we look at the work of the Holy Spirit in the whole question of black Christians exiting their traditionally black Charismatic churches to join exclusively white led Charismatic churches.

The need for healing and transformation of the hearts and lives of all parties concerned remains paramount. I refer to the black members of Rivers Church who were present at the racist sermon preached by Pastor Olivier as just one instance of how this is to be seen in practice.

While pastor Olivier preach the racist sermon there are many black people in the congregation, there is a palpable awkward silence. the black people in the

audience do not react. The reality of that moment is that the white man talks to the black man and says I have not stolen anything from you, if I am better off than you it's because I work and you don't. The black people in the audience represent the black people in the country. They choose to say nothing and do nothing. We need an intervention where we look at bringing the same sermon under the power of the Holy Spirit and start the process of healing and restoration. The church needs to allow both the pastor who delivered the sermon and the black congregants having who sat through the experience receiving an opportunity at grace through the action of the Holy Spirit. Are we ready to bring the whole messy situation with racism in our country out into the light of the Holy Spirit?

In the text, Jesus acts prophetically under the anointing of the Holy Spirit. About the anecdotes relating to the white pastors in chapter four of the thesis, I continue to argue that there is cause for an investigation of what I believe to be a false judgment against black-led Charismatic churches that claim that the white-led charismatic churches are more Spirit orientated as opposed to black-led churches.

5.9.5 The Spirit of liberation

The prophetic message of Jesus calls for a radical liberation from the bondage and limitations that include liberation in all aspects of the human condition. The radical image of freedom for everyone is unique to the mission of the church. At this juncture, I include a reference to what Alan Boesak wrote on the work of the reformed church in establishing apartheid.

I do this deliberately to introduce the question of whether the Church is not still promoting apartheid and indeed whether the church could see the need for a return to its prophetic mission of not only proclaiming liberty but being the very agents of liberation in society.

Apartheid is not unique because of the inherent violence of the system, the inevitable brutality without which the system cannot survive, the dehumanisation and contempt for black personhood, or even in the tragic alienations and the incredible cost in terms of human dignity and human relationships.

According to the proponents of Apartheid, this philosophy is unique because of its original basis is the Bible and its exponents being the Reformed churches in South Africa.

Apartheid was born out of the Reformed tradition, it is, in a genuine sense, the brainchild of the Dutch Reformed Churches. It is reformed Christians who have split the church based on race and colour, and who now claim that racially divided churches are a precise reformed understanding of the nature of the Christian Church.

Apartheid is not unique because of its because of the wrong assumptions based on the Bible, while it violates the biblical interpretations of justice and God's concern for the poor, oppressed and downtrodden. That this interpretation constitutes a heresy as declared by the World Alliance of Reformed Churches (WARC) in Ottawa (1982).

In the instance of Pastor A Boshoff, who in a sermon mentions that the blood of Jesus saved him from racism and he is a new creation through the blood of Christ, I continue to propose that there is more than meets the eye.

The prophetic mission of the church is as relevant today. It was lacking and utterly contrary to the ideal and the design of God concerning its role in the establishment and justification of institutionalised racism, but now the church can be the agent of change and transformation.

There is cause for an investigation into the underlying pathologies that give rise to these outbreaks of racist slips as it were and as exemplified in the racist sermon of Pastor Olivier.

The present tendency of a church with an all-white or exclusively white top management structure with a majority black membership in a country trying to pull itself up from the devastation of institutionalised racism can be a unique Kairos moment for the Charismatic church in South Africa. This can be an opportune moment for the church to open itself up for academic study. The church can examine the present situation under the leadership and inspiration of the Holy Spirit. The Church can play an instrumental role in bringing about a new identity and a liberating consciousness.

5.9.6 The spirit of Jubilee

I start this section with a reference from an unpublished scholarly reflection by Frank Thomas titled the Prophetic Messiah in reference to the text of Luke 4:16-24.

Jesus builds on the imagery of the Jubilee year mandated in Leviticus 25:23-55. Every 50 years, Israel was to declare a "year of liberty," based upon God's prior action of liberation in freeing them from slavery and hard labour in Egypt. The year of liberty was to be marked by four types of required rest or relief:

- a) The land be granted a year of rest; a "fallow" year when no crops would be sown,
- b) Debts were to be canceled;
- c) Any Indentured servant would be set free, and
- d) Any ancestral lands that were sold out of financial necessity (the only conceivable way that you would sell ancestral lands) would be returned to those to whom God had originally allocated them when the Israelites entered the land.

The implementation of the year of Jubilee would result in periodic and vast economic disruption and upheaval. Practically, the Jubilee laws would have prevented the accumulation of wealth, particularly capital in the form of land from accumulating in any one single family's hands. Instead, once in a lifetime, the entire economy would be given a fresh start. History gives no evidence that a Jubilee year ever was celebrated.

This is truly prophetic and relevant to our present socio-political and economic situation in South Africa. The church, in its prophetic mission, has a pivotal role to play in this regard. Is it not the time to declare this year of the lord's favour, the jubilee year of restoration and reparation?

In a short sermon entitled, *Poverty and Privilege*, preached at the Dutch Reformed Church in Africa in Pretoria on 9 February 1992 Beyers Naudé says the following:

As far as South Africa is concerned, the policy of apartheid has been one of the leading causes of the economic injustice, which over many decades, has been inflicted on millions, especially of our black (African) community. God, therefore, demands all Christians who have been involved and approved in principle and practice the injustice of apartheid should admit their wrong and prove their sincerity by some form of restitution.

("Poverty and privilege": Re-hearing sermons of Beyers Naudé on religion and justice; STJ vol.4 n.2 Stellenbosch 2018)

In the light of the government's broad-based black economic empowerment policy, the national development plan, and the current highly publicised talk about land expropriation without compensation, the prophetic mission of the church in our socio-political situation is imperative.

The concept of jubilee, as understood in the Jewish tradition and as part of the text Jesus read from the prophet Isaiah has particular relevance to the need for a new liberating consciousness.

Some of the underlying pathologies that presents itself in the incidents mentioned above of racially motivated violence can be seen as the result of the inequalities in society. This can be traced back to whites unfairly benefitting from apartheid laws and its oppressive structures and the systematic disadvantage of people of colour in South Africa.

Imagine if we could have a new liberating consciousness in our country modeled on the concept of jubilee, as is found in the Jewish tradition.

a) No crops are sown, and the many reserves held by the big cooperatives and other big corporations in the country shared with those who do not have. A year in which the farmworkers in our country who are perhaps the least paid workers in the land get to benefit from the produce.

b) The very high percentage of interest collected on basic things like houses and study loans, among other crucial services to be cancelled.

c) Practices like the “*dop* system” where farmworkers are paid with cheap alcohol are to be banished. The laborers on the mines and other lucrative industries to be given a share in the dividends of these industries.

d) The fundamental issue of the land and the return of ancestral land are central to addressing the inequalities that can be traced directly to apartheid and the very specific laws that governed the dispossession of the land from its original owners.

I am not advocating that we implement the text as it is, but I am advocating for a closer look at whiteness and blackness, the oppressive historical ideologies of colonialism and apartheid, the systematic and structured enforcing of racist laws

that benefited only the white people who made the rules. Critically looking at why black Christians leave their historically black churches to join white churches that they believe is better than the churches led by black pastors and all of this after we have gained democratic rule and started a new dispensation. All this is crucial in the quest for a new liberating consciousness.

5.10 Strategic planning towards a new liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing.

In this stage of the Praxis circle, we ask the following questions:

1. Who participates in the pastoral planning?
2. What are the implications of the process used to determine appropriate responses?
3. What is the relationship between groups who serve and those who are served?

Here is what I propose as the elements that could go into the strategic planning towards a process of inculcating a new liberating consciousness and spiritual healing.

A) Dangerous preaching; constructing sermons on a new liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing. This would include seminars and training in using sermons and other public engagement to bring across the prophetic message in the context of post-apartheid South Africa.

Inviting guest preachers who are thought leaders on homiletics and liberation theology to engage the participants in these seminars to establish a base for a resource manual and a list of books and other material that would equip preachers to be able to preach dangerous sermons.

B) Workshops on the praxis circle in conjunction with charismatic churches and institutions of education and thought leadership. This include a workbook based on the findings of this thesis. Special consideration will be given to the extensive research conducted and went into formulating the main thrust of the thesis. These workshops will be open to both black and white led Charismatic churches. Invitations will be addressed to churches across the broad spectrum of the so-called mainline churches, Pentecostal churches, and Charismatic churches.

The feedback received through these workshops will be collated and published in order to encourage further interactions.

C) Multimedia platforms. With this, I envision a large multimedia presence that will stretch the entire spectrum, and the content will mainly center on the workbook, the preaching, the workshops, and seminars. Different churches will be invited to make contributions to these different forums.

D) Print media: pamphlets, journal articles, research papers, books. I envision the publication of a workbook that will include questions and exercises for further reading and reflection. The workbook will be the first of many in a series of updates resulting from the various workshops and other forms of engagement. Interviews and reports on the progress of the various forums will be published in different media.

E) I will endeavour to reach out to Charismatic church leadership, including those from white lead church communities and those who indicated their hesitation to be part of the research. I will propose pulpit exchanges and participation in workshops on the different levels of leadership and participation.

Chapter 6

Findings and recommendations.

Towards a liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing

In this chapter, I offer some concluding comments and introduce broad outlines for the way forward.

The aim of this thesis transcends merely reflecting on the push and pull factors of the exodus of black Christians towards white pastored churches. It transcends the mere reflection on black church growth and the impact this exodus has had. It endeavors to go beyond the veneer of a colorblind church trying to brush over the overt presence and genuine issues of racism and to have to deal with a democratic revolution that did not address the legacy of racial discrimination and oppression. This thesis is a look at the prophetic mission of the church of God in an actual situation; it finds itself in South Africa. Within the context of whiteness and blackness and the need for a new liberating consciousness and spirituality of healing, the thesis is forward-looking in hope; it is about concrete steps towards healing and restoration. The thesis suggests a pastoral reflection with an evident process and concrete steps towards social analysis and action.

The study is significant and can be a unique catalyst for a new liberating consciousness and a new spirituality of healing in our country and beyond. As our country is closely associated with the oppressive regime of apartheid and its systematic structural approach and implementation of the so-called separate development, we are in a unique position to also make a significant contribution in addressing the social ills resulting from it.

The research has involved many congregants who have started the initial process of reflecting on their spiritual journey towards liberation and healing. Many pastors and leaders of faith communities faced difficult questions and shared from their hearts the stories of oppression and suffering with an ever-present and bright hope for a renewal and a recommitment to the prophetic mission of the church.

The data that has been collected through world cafés and individual interviews with respondents must always be seen in context and understood within the broader context of the thesis and the critical question of whether there can exist a church that is not affected by racism while it is part of a society that is struggling with real incidences of racial intolerance and violence. The research conducted with congregants indeed paints a very bleak picture of the black pastored churches that they left on the one hand and a very rosy picture that borders on the opposed, but even this should be interrogated and the underlying pathologies and deprivations unearthed. The thesis endeavoured to demonstrate that on the sophisticated level of awareness and consciousness, there is something more profound than merely accepting that it is a matter of choice for black Christians flocking to join white pastored churches. There is more than meets the eye.

The thesis has shown that there is an argument for the theory that both white and black in South Africa are still stuck in the limiting beliefs of colonialist apartheid identities. This is why we are as divided and fragmented as ever along colour lines but also gender and social standing. Much more needs to be done to assist South Africans to deal with the atrocities perpetrated and suffered throughout colonialism and apartheid. There is a need to find a new way that will lead to true liberation and healing.

The thesis suggests that the pastoral circle can be employed as a tool to bring about change and deal with the underlying issues that have bogged down the

growth of the church and the exercising of its prophetic mission. Calling for a new liberating consciousness and a spirituality of healing is an attempt at finding a middle way between living in denial about the past and present inequalities and or manipulating the situation opportunistically by exercising one of the extremes when it is politically expedient to do so.

The method to be used as the basis for the next steps in the missiological study and journey towards a new liberating consciousness and spirituality of healing is the praxis circle. Particular emphasis is to be given to the importance and systematic importance of the insertion step. The narrative needs to be appropriated and recounted in the first person, allowing people and communities to tell their stories, not for amnesty or necessary forgiveness but liberation, restoration, transformation, and renewal. We have seen throughout the world cafés how participants grew in their understanding of just how deeply they have been affected by the reality they live.

We propose the Pastoral circle as the primary vehicle towards a transformative discourse. We propose the pastoral circle as the method and the basis on which the workshops and other interactions are to be based. The social analysis will be adapted to the analysis of the underlying issues concerning the push and pull factors in the phenomenon of the mass migration of black Christians to white pastored churches. In the practical implementation, the praxis circle, as initially designed and improved upon by Holland and Henriot will be used. Particular emphasis will be given to the step of insertion.

The thesis also highlights the need for a new consciousness that transcends Black Consciousness and to embark on a quest for a new South African identity that is liberating and transformative and a church that is genuinely non-racial. To start showing the CONTOURS of this new quest around questions like Who I am? Who are we? How do we relearn the reading of the "signs of the times"? How do we sharpen our sense of analysis by probing deeper and by discerning

in a more thoroughgoing fashion? How do we respond to the following questions: Where is God in South Africa after twenty-five years of democracy? Who is Jesus Christ for us today? Who is the Holy Spirit for us today, and to what transformation is it leading us?

I agree that the thesis warrants more extensive research on the push and pull factors. There needs to be more action research or research for freedom or emancipation.

The lack of participation in the leadership of white pastored churches in the research is another limitation and an essential aspect that needs to warrants further exploration.

There is clear evidence that there is a definite need for more work to be done in the area of social analysis from the perspective of the church and how the church participates in the social contract of the present and evolving social construct.

The thesis proposes concrete steps and actions to be implemented as a result of the initial study. The research must be augmented with input and participation from the leadership of white pastored churches. The development of a large body of work that includes academic study, personal and community reflection is paramount to the process of developing a new liberating conscious and spirituality of healing. The thesis also highlights the need for publications based on the construction of sermons, world cafés, workshops, symposia, and seminars, all aimed at equipping people as change agents in church and society. The participation of members and leaders of white pastored churches will be integral to the development of this new consciousness and spirituality.

A significant difficulty in constructing a thesis of this nature is the lack of primary sources. Not even sources dealing with Charismatic churches help deal with the specific research question and sub-questions. Ultimately a very

substantial part of the thesis had to be based on data gathered through empirical research by using the world café as a methodological research instrument. A further compounding factor has been the difficulty of gaining access to white led Charismatic churches on the questions of the thesis. The Hillsong experience is a case in point. The refusal of Hillsong to grant a world café and a very abrupt reaction from Rivers Church is, in a sense, ironic if the responses from congregants of Rhema North, young university, and college students, are anything to go by. These responses are very harsh on some black Charismatic churches and extraordinarily positive and uncritical on white led Charismatic churches. We hope that the process envisaged for the inculcation of a new liberating consciousness and spirituality of healing will gradually open up space for a more honest and robust confrontation with issues in church and society.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ahmed Areff. (2016) 'LISTEN: Whites took nothing from no one - Pastor Andre Olivier' *News 24*; <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/listen-whites-took-nothing-from-no-one-pastor-andre-olivier-20160628> (Accessed October 2019)
- Allee, V., (2003) *The Future of Knowledge: Increasing Prosperity Through Value Networks*. Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Ashimolowo, M., (1017) *What Is Wong With Being Black?* Destiny Image: Shippensburg, United States.
- Bache, C., (2008) *The living classroom, Teaching and collective consciousness*. Albany. NY: State University of New York Press.
- Biko, SB. 2002. *I write what I like*. 40th Anniversary Edition. Johannesburg: Picador, Africa.
- Boesak, A. A., (1976) *Farewell to Innocence: A Socio-Ethical Study on Black Theology and Black Power*, Maryknoll: Orbis Books
- Boesak, AA. 2008. *The Tenderness of Conscience: African Renaissance and the Spirituality of Politics*. Glasgow: Wild Goose Publications.
- Boesak, AA & DeYoung C P. 2012. *Radical Reconciliation: Beyond Political Pietism and Christian Quietism*. Maryknoll: Orbis.
- Boesak, AA. 2014. *Dare We Speak of Hope: Searching for a Language of Life in Faith and Politics*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans.
- Boesak, AA. 2017. *Pharaohs on Both Sides of the Blood-Red Waters. Prophetic Critique on Empire: Resistance, Justice, and the Power of the Hopeful Sizwe – A Transatlantic Conversation*. Eugene, Oregon: Cascade Books.

Bosch, DJ. 1991. *Transforming Mission. Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission*. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books.

Botha, NA. 2005. Mission as Prophecy: Reading the Apocalypse as forth telling rather than fore telling, *Missionalia*, vol. 33, 315-328.

CRC Pastor At Boshoff, (2019) *CRC Johannesburg Grand Opening / Pastor At Boshoff / 17 February 2019* https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=afXpAds_gw
Accessed October 2019.

Dawjee, M. (2017) *Sorry, Not Sorry: Experiences of a brown woman in white South Africa*, Penguin Books.

Dyson, M. E., (2017) *Tears We Cannot Stop: A Sermon To White America*, St. Martin's Press

Elliot, Heesterbeek, Lukenmeyer & Slocum (2005). *Handbook of Research on Methods and Tools for Assessing Cultural Landscape*, IGI Global

Genzuk, M., (2003) "A synthesis of Ethnographic research" University of Southern California. Los Angeles.

Gurteen (2008). *Knowledge Management 2.0: Organizational Models and Enterprise Strategies*, IGI Global

Fanon, F. 2001. *The Wretched of the Earth*. London: Penguin Books.

Fanon, F. 2017. *Black Skin, White Masks*. London: Pluto Press.

Flattery, G. Luke 4:16-21 - The Mission of Christ;
<https://globalchristiancenter.com/sermons/dr-g-flattery-sermons-on-what-jesus-said/26115-the-mission-of-christ>. Accessed September 2019.

Genzuk, M., "A synthesis of Ethnographic research"

Harris, M and Johnson, O. 2000. *Cultural Anthropology*. Oxford: Alta Mira Press.

Kritzinger, JNJ. 2008. Faith to Faith – Missiology as encounterology, *Verbum et Ecclesia*, vol. 29 (3), 764-790.

Kritzinger, J J (Dons) 2004. A Century of doing Missiology in South Africa. An Overview, *Missionalia*, vol. 32, no.2, August.

Liteman, Campbell and Liteman (2006). What I see for me, in retreats that work, everything you need to know about planning and leading great offsites. San Francisco, Pfeiffer.

Masango, MJ and Steyn, TH 2011. The theology and praxis of practical theology; in the context of the Faculty of Theology, *HTS Theological Studies*, vol. 67 no. 2.

McGavran, D A. 1970. Understanding Church Growth. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.

McKaiser, E. 2015. *Run Racist Run. Journeys into the heart of racism*. Cape Town: ABC Press.

Molobi, VS. 2014. The black church and family empowerment in South Africa. *Studia Hist. Ecc.* vol.40 suppl. 1, Pretoria, Sep.

Osmer, RR. 2008. *Practical Theology. An Introduction*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.

Osmer, RR. 2011. Practical Theology: A current international perspective. *HTS Theological Studies*, vol. 67, no.2, Pretoria. add page numbers.

Ramaposa C. <http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/speeches/eighth-annual-desmond-tutu-international-peace-lecture-delivered-president-cyril-ramaphosa%2C> (Accessed October 2019.)

Reece, R. A. (2016) *Commentary on Luke 4:14-21*https://www.workingpreacher.org/preaching.aspx?commentary_id=274. Accessed September 2019.

- Saayman, WA. 1991. *Christian Mission in South Africa: political and ecumenical*. Pretoria: Unisa Press.
- Shailer, M. "Introduction to the Gospel of Luke. II. The Historical Details of the Gospel." *The Biblical World*, vol. 5, no. 6, 1895, pp. 448–455. JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/3135500. Accessed September 2019
- Simmons, M and Thomas, FA. 2010. *Preaching with Sacred Fire. An Anthology of African American Sermons, 1750 to the Present*. New York, London: W. W. Norton Company.
- Steyn, ME. 2001. *Whiteness Just Is not What It Used To Be: White Identity in a Changing South Africa*. New York: State University of New York Press.
- Steyn, ME. 2014. *Unveiling Whiteness in the Twenty First Century: Global Manifestations*. New York: Lexington Books.
- Schwartz, C A. 1988. *Natural Church Development. A guide to Eight Essential Qualities of Healthy Churches*. Carol Stream IL: Church Smart Resources.
- Thomas, F. *Luke's Working Gospel: The Prophetic Messiah* Frank Thomas. With permission of the author.
- Van Maanen, J. 1996. *Tales of the Field: On Writing Ethnography*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Van Wyngaard & White G J. 2016. *Theology in dialogue with White theology in dialogue with Black Theology: Exploring the contribution of Klippiers Kritzinger*, *HTS Theological Studies*, vol. 72, issue 1.
- Van Diemen, E. (2019) *News 24* 'Zille digs in her heels as Madonsela asks her to apologise for 'black privilege' tweet'
<https://m.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/zille-digs-in-her-heels-as-madonsela-asks-her-to-apologise-for-black-privilege-tweet-20190517> (Accessed August 2019.)

Vellem, V S. 2017. Un-thinking the West: The spirit of doing Black Theology of Liberation in decolonial times. *HTS Theological Studies*, 73 (3).

Wagner, C P. 1986 *Leading your church to growth*. Middlesex UK: MARC Europe and the British Church association.

Wright J. (2008) CQ Transcriptions. *New York Times* “Reverend Wright at the National Press Club” <https://www.nytimes.com/2008/04/28/us/politics/28text-wright.html> Accessed September 2019.

World Council Of Churches. (2012) *Together Towards Life: Mission and Evangelism in Changing Landscapes*.
<https://www.oikoumene.org/en/resources/documents/commissions/mission-and-evangelism/together-towards-life-mission-and-evangelism-in-changing-landscapes> Accessed August 2019.

WARC Ottawa 1982. Proceedings of the 21st General Council, Geneva:
WARC, 1983, 176-180; cf. Called to Witness to the Gospel Today, Studies from the World Alliance of Reformed Churches 1, Geneva: WARC, 1983, 26-30. Available: <http://www.warc.ch/dcw/bs25/11.html>. 1983. (Accessed 20 July 2019.)