WOMEN IN A LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT CONSTRUCTING A LEADERSHIP IDENTITY

by

KERRINA NAIDOO

submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF COMMERCE

in the subject

INDUSTRIAL AND ORGANISATIONAL PSYCHOLOGY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: PROF. H.A. BARNARD
DECLARATION

I, Kerrina Naidoo, student number 58546294, declare that

“Women in a leadership development context constructing a leadership identity”

is my own work, and that all the sources that I have used or have quoted from have been indicated and are acknowledged by means of a complete reference list.

Signature......................................................... Date..............................................
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Firstly, I would like to thank my beloved Lord Muruga for carrying me through some of the most difficult times in my life and providing me with hope, faith & love in the form of relationships in my life.

My special thanks to the following people who supported and encouraged me throughout this journey, without whom I could not possibly have made it:

- My supervisor, Prof. H.A. Barnard, whose positivity, passion, support, academic insight, guidance and encouragement were essential for this study;
- My parents Lee & Sue for always believing in me and helping me fulfill my every dream and wish throughout my life;
- My brother Prenten for keeping me grounded throughout my studies;
- My mentors and coaches especially Vanisha Balgobind, Hemuna Bhola & Frans Cillie for their support throughout my dissertation;
- My uncles, aunts and cousins who have continually propelled me to pursue my dreams;
- My friends who became family and for the roles they played in motivating me, keeping me focused and supporting me throughout many years of friendship;
- My work colleagues who quickly became friends and such a powerful source of inspiration;
- The participants in this study who shared their personal narratives and views on the topic.

Lastly, I want to dedicate my dissertation to my hometown Lenasia South and I would like to quote South Africa’s Zozibini Tunzi (Miss Universe, 2019): “I think the most important thing we should be teaching young girls today is leadership. It’s something that has been lacking in young girls and women for a very long time, not because we don’t want to, but because of what society has labelled women to be. I think we are the most powerful beings in the world, and we should be given every opportunity”.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

- **COVER PAGE** ..............................................................................................................................................................................
- **DECLARATION** ...........................................................................................................................................................................i
- **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** ..................................................................................................................................................................ii
- **LIST OF TABLES** ..........................................................................................................................................................................vii
- **LIST OF FIGURES** .........................................................................................................................................................................vii
- **SUMMARY** ..................................................................................................................................................................................viii

## CHAPTER 1.........................................................................................................................................................................................1

### SCIENTIFIC ORIENTATION TO THE RESEARCH .........................................................................................................................1

#### 1.1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................................................................................1

#### 1.2 MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY ..................................................................................................................................................2

##### 1.2.1 Research rationale .................................................................................................................................................................2

##### 1.2.2 My evolving interest in the study ......................................................................................................................................4

#### 1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT ...............................................................................................................................................................10

#### 1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS ..............................................................................................................................................................12

#### 1.5 AIM AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY ..................................................................................................................................12

#### 1.6 ANTICIPATED VALUE/CONTRIBUTION OF THE STUDY ......................................................................................................12

#### 1.7 THE DISCIPLINARY CONTEXT ....................................................................................................................................................13

##### 1.7.1 Industrial and organisational psychology ..........................................................................................................................13

##### 1.7.1.1 Organisational psychology and development ..............................................................................................................13

##### 1.7.1.2 Career psychology .........................................................................................................................................................13

#### 1.8 THE UNDERLYING PSYCHOLOGICAL PARADIGM ....................................................................................................................14

##### 1.8.1 Humanism .............................................................................................................................................................................14

##### 1.8.2 Meta-theories relevant to the study ..................................................................................................................................14

##### 1.8.2.1 Social identity theory and Identity theory ...................................................................................................................14

##### 1.8.3 Meta-theoretical constructs relevant to the study ............................................................................................................15

##### 1.8.3.1 Identity work ..................................................................................................................................................................15

##### 1.8.3.2 Leadership development context ................................................................................................................................15

##### 1.8.3.3 Leadership identity ......................................................................................................................................................16

##### 1.8.3.4 Women in leadership ...................................................................................................................................................16

##### 1.8.3.5 Career advancement ...................................................................................................................................................16
## 1.9 RESEARCH PARADIGM

> 1.10 RESEARCH DESIGN

### 1.10.1 Type of research: Qualitative study

### 1.10.2 Research approach: Hermeneutic phenomenology

### 1.10.3 The approach to theory

## 1.11 RESEARCH METHOD

### 1.11.1 Research setting

### 1.11.2 Sampling and participants

### 1.11.3 Entrée and establishing research roles

### 1.11.4 Data collection

### 1.11.5 Data capturing and storage

### 1.11.6 Data analysis

### 1.11.7 Strategies employed to ensure credible and quality data

#### 1.11.7.1 Credibility

#### 1.11.7.2 Transferability

#### 1.11.7.3 Dependability

#### 1.11.7.4 Confirmability

#### 1.11.7.5 Reflexivity

## 1.12 ETHICAL CONSIDERATION

## 1.13 OUTLINE OF CHAPTERS

### CHAPTER 2

**2.1 INTRODUCTION**

**2.2 THE UNIQUE EXPERIENCES OF WOMEN IN MINING**

### 2.2.1 Barriers that women experience in their quest for leadership

#### 2.2.1.1 Socio-cultural influence

#### 2.2.1.2 Work-life balance

#### 2.2.1.3 Organisational support

### 2.2.2 Coping strategies women adopt to overcome barriers to leadership

#### 2.2.2.1 Expanding traditional worldviews

#### 2.2.2.2 Achieving work-life integration

#### 2.2.2.3 Relationship building
4.3.2.2 Linguistic and cultural issues................................................................. 122
4.3.2.3 Leadership development context limited to the specific company........... 122
4.3.2.4 Researcher subjectivity .......................................................................... 122
4.3.2.5 Semi-structured interviews .................................................................... 122
4.3.2.6 Cross-sectional study ............................................................................. 122
4.4 RECOMMENDATIONS .................................................................................. 123
  4.4.1 Recommendations for future studies ......................................................... 123
  4.4.2 Recommendations for organisational application ..................................... 123
4.5 CHAPTER SUMMARY .................................................................................. 124
4.6 PERSONAL REFLECTIONS ....................................................................... 125

References ......................................................................................................... 126
Appendix A: INFORMED CONSENT FORM ..................................................... 148
Appendix B: SAMPLE OF QUESTIONS PARTICIPANTS WERE ASKED ............ 151
Appendix C: ETHICAL CLEARANCE ................................................................. 153
LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER 2
Table 2.1: Integration of social identity theory and identity theory ........................................... 49
Table 2.2 Summary of bases of identity, verification processes, outcomes, self-esteem dimensions and examples................................................................. 50

CHAPTER 3
Table 3.1 Biographical description of research participants...................................................... 64
Table 3.2 Overview of main themes with description of each theme ........................................ 70
Table 3.3 Overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘the impact of life spheres’ .............................................................................................................. 71
Table 3.4 Overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘integrating personal and professional roles’ ........................................................................... 76
Table 3.5 Overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘the role work facets play’ ........................................................................................................... 80
Table 3.6 Overview of the sub-themes obtained from ‘the changing self’ .............................. 84

LIST OF FIGURES

CHAPTER 2
Figure 2.1: Identity formation process ....................................................................................... 44
Figure 2.2: The identity verification feedback loop................................................................. 45

CHAPTER 3
Figure 3.1: Women’s Leadership Identity Development Model (WLID Model) ................. 89
SUMMARY

Female managers in the mining industry face unique challenges not experienced by their male counterparts. They need to perform identity work to overcome these barriers successfully so that they can create a leadership identity. Leadership development contexts may foster identity construction. To enhance employment equity in historically male-dominated professions and environments, an understanding of women’s leadership identity construction in leadership development contexts is beneficial.

The purpose of this research was to explore the identity work of female managers working in a leadership development context in the mining industry, to determine how they construct a leadership identity. This was an exploratory and descriptive qualitative study conducted within the hermeneutic phenomenological research paradigm. A purposive sample consisting of five women working in a mining company was used. Semi-structured interviews were conducted, and data were analysed using the phenomenological hermeneutical method. The main findings indicate that four main identity bases influence how female managers in a leadership development context create a leadership identity. These include: (i) the impact of life spheres, (ii) integrating personal and professional roles, (iii) the role work facets play and (iv) the changing self. Moreover, four leadership identity work strategies are used to counter the effects of the identity bases. These are: (i) being guided by personal philosophies, (ii) balance and negotiation between personal and professional lives, (iii) building relationships both personally and professionally, and (iv) assuming ownership for careers and lives using career management strategies. Based on these findings, a conceptual framework was developed. The findings may guide organisations in developing and implementing effective and well-informed policies, strategies and initiatives geared at the attraction, retention, development and appropriate support of women who are or who wish to be employed as female managers in the mining industry. This study contributes to the knowledge base concerning female leadership in the mining industry in South Africa.

Key words: identity work, leadership development context, leadership identity, women in leadership.
CHAPTER 1

SCIENTIFIC ORIENTATION TO THE RESEARCH

1.1 INTRODUCTION

Globally, reports accentuate that despite the striking increase in the number of women in the workplace, women are under-represented in positions of responsibility, governance, power, academic excellence, sport, directorship and executive leadership (Burton, 2019; Carter & Peters, 2016; Howe-Walsh & Turnbull, 2016; Seo, Huang & Han, 2017; Yousaf & Schmiede, 2016).

The above trend has also been apparent in South Africa in the face of the growing number of women entering the workforce (Hicks & Myeni, 2016; Kele & Pietersen, 2015; Steyn, 2015). Despite equity legislation post-1994, women’s representation in the workplace remained low well into the first decade of the new millennium. According to Lewis-Enright, Crafford, and Crous (2009), in South Africa, although women constituted 52% of the adult population, they held 41% representation in the workforce, and they had a comparatively small percentage of high-ranking positions. Seven percent of directors were women, merely 3% of chairs of boards were female, and 2% of chief executive officers (CEOs) were women (Lewis-Enright et al., 2009). More recent statistics provided by StatsSA (2017) show that women constitute 51% of the South African population, yet they still remain relatively unrepresented in positions of authority and power. In nearly ten years female representation in the workplace has only grown by 3% to 44% (StatsSA, 2017). Although South Africa has made great strides, gender representivity is still below the 50% mark for positions that come with a great deal of influence (StatsSA, 2017). Furthermore, women comprised 32% of Supreme Court of Appeal judges, 31% of advocates, 30% of ambassadors and 24% of heads of state-owned enterprises (StatsSA, 2017). Even when briefly examining the Top 40 Johannesburg Stock Exchange-listed companies, only one company had a female CEO (StatsSA, 2017).

In South Africa the leadership development of women has become a legal and organisational priority (Hills, 2015). In order to address gender inequality in the workplace and positions of power, South Africa has introduced the National Policy Framework for Women Empowerment and Gender Equality legislation. Although such legislation seems to support the advancement of women in the workplace, women
continue to fail in climbing the corporate ladder because their under-developed skills prevent them from participating (De la Rey, Jankelowitz, & Suffla, 2003; Dlodlo, 2009; Hills, 2015).

A leadership development context (LDC) is a working context that provides various developmental opportunities to enhance, grow and develop leadership capacities. An LDC is effective in improving an individual’s leadership abilities (De la Rey et al., 2003; Mitchiner, 2000), quality and efficiency (Butler, 2008), building connections, enhancing professional skills and gaining access to new opportunities (Black & Earnest, 2009; Shera & Murray, 2016). These contexts are utilised to foster the development of leadership identity through specific leadership-focused development interventions and programmes (Moorosi, 2014). The development of leadership may then lead to growth or increased productivity in an organisation (Kraus & Wilson, 2012).

Influenced by the conception that leadership development is essentially about facilitating an identity transition (Komives et al., 2005; Lord & Hall, 2005; Moorosi, 2014), this qualitative study explored the identity work of women in an LDC, specifically how they construct a leadership identity.

In the first chapter I provide an introduction, background, motivation, and the problem statement of the study. Additionally, I provide the aims, paradigm perspective, research design, and the research methods I applied in the study.

1.2 MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY

In the following sections I outline the motivation for my study by discussing the research rationale and my evolving interest in the study.

1.2.1 Research rationale

There has been an abundance of research into the lack of females in leadership positions, not only in the South African context, but also in other countries, such as United States of America, Australia, Canada (Marcus, as cited in Chiloane-Tsoka, 2012) and Indonesia (Dewi & Rachmawati, 2014).

Various reasons for the small percentage of women in leadership roles have been noted. The White Paper entitled Women in Leadership, Chartered Management Institute and Women in Management (2013) highlights that possible reasons may be that some women have low aspirations to reach the top or lack of confidence in their
ability, and experience lack of flexibility in terms of work arrangements. It is further noted in the paper that women lack the necessary leadership skills required to assume leadership roles.

Other inhibiting factors pertain to competition dynamics (Mutiso, 2012; Ogweng, 2016). Upon entry of other women in the workplace, female leaders may feel threatened and attempt to block the progress of these new entrants up the proverbial ladder (Johnson & Mathur-Helm, 2011). Mugweni (2014) highlights that women do not like competing with men for higher posts and some men do not support them. Moreover, some women do not support other women (Chabaya, 2009); in fact, they attempt to exhibit masculine tendencies so as to seem tougher and unemotional or emotionally neutral (Opengart, 2003). In this way they attempt not to be perceived as the weaker sex (Mugweni, 2014).

Women’s self-efficacy and self-esteem are also among the reasons cited for their lower representation in leadership roles. Women generally lack confidence and self-esteem and avoid challenging male leadership norms (Parsaloi & Steyn, 2013). Women’s exclusion has to do with the women themselves and their own fear of failure rather than with gender stereotypes (Jowah, 2014; Mugweni, 2014). Still, gender stereotypes also play a role. Women in the workplace often report having experienced negative workplace behaviour, such as workplace bullying (Okurame, 2013), discrimination (Bryant-Anderson & Roby, 2012) and even sexual harassment (Berdahl & Moore, 2006).

Central to female managers’ leadership identity is the roles they assume in their personal and professional lives. Women experience several personal and professional barriers when trying to balance their work and family lives (Kuschel & Salvaj, 2018; Parsaloi & Steyn, 2013).

It is evident that strategies are required to increase the number of women in leadership roles (Bryant-Anderson & Roby, 2012; Kuschel & Salvaj, 2018). Dewi and Rachmawati (2014) propose that networking, reward and recognition, being a role model, job rotation and special assignments, as well as mentoring, can improve the statistics. Organisations should support women by introducing coaches, mentors, networking opportunities and flexible working arrangements (Women in Leadership, Chartered Management Institute and Women in Management, 2013).
Much research focussed on barriers to women advancing in the workplace, and as a result, organisations have continued to invest more in the leadership development of women. Establishing an LDC in an organisation can enhance both leadership effectiveness and organisational performance (Amagoh, 2009). Leadership development entails identity work and contributes to the development of a leadership identity (Carroll & Levy, 2010; Moorosi, 2014). It is valuable to understand how women construct a leadership identity in an LDC in order to create LDCs that can enhance leadership identity, behaviour and confidence. Through LDCs that encourage and motivate women to succeed in leadership roles, more women will be inspired to take on leadership roles and they will be driven to succeed in these roles, as they will be able to think of ways around the technical and interpersonal challenges they face.

Organisations need to hire more women in leadership roles (Jogulu & Wood, 2006), as studies have shown that the 21st century world of work is characterised by global competencies (Steven Terrell & Rosenbusch, 2013), high-involvement work teams, democratic and participative decision-making (Jogulu & Wood, 2006; Zulu, 2011), and empowerment (Zulu, 2011). Therefore, organisations can actually benefit from the leadership styles that women already exhibit (Jogulu & Wood, 2006; Steven Terrell & Rosenbusch, 2013). Female managers are viewed as more transformational (Chandler, 2011; Eagly & Johannesen-Schmidt, 2001; Solansky, 2014) than their male counterparts — a leadership style that has been shown to have a strong positive impact on individual, group, and organisational performance (Bass & Avolio, 1994; Cheung & Halpern, 2010; Kitada, 2017). The training of women for leadership roles is a critical component of the development of communities as a whole (De la Rey et al., 2003).

Therefore, developing an understanding of women’s leadership identity development is critical in broadening how we define leadership and create in organisations LDCs that are conducive to facilitating women’s career advancement.

1.2.2 My evolving interest in the study

It is important to reflect on my evolving interest in the study, as this study is rooted in phenomenology. Phenomenologists bridge the gap between objectivism and subjectivism by seeking understanding of phenomena in context and combining this with the insight of the researcher’s subjectivity; this is acknowledged by understanding
that she is born in a world of meaning and subject to enculturation processes, shaping thoughts and behaviour throughout life (Crotty, 2005).

According to Crotty (2005), critical reflection and phenomenological reduction are used to address the dilemma of the objective-subjective dichotomy. Thinking about my evolving interest in how women in an LDC create their leadership identity is a form of phenomenological reduction that involves critical reflection on the taken-for-granted everyday experience and meaning of phenomena. This process also involves questioning my culturally predispositioned view of the world (Crotty, 2005).

Even as a young Indian girl, my fondest memories are of my parents working extremely hard to give my brother and me everything they could. At that stage my parents owned a restaurant in Braamfontein called The Green Pastures and they would leave for work at sunrise and return only at sunset. Being a career woman as head chef in the restaurant, my mother still came home after dark and cooked and cleaned every single night. She would also spend her weekends cleaning and entertaining family and friends. I saw my mother’s passion for cooking, as it was when she was cooking that she felt happiest. I even remember playing with cooking toys and utensils as a child, so I too could feel that happiness.

By my pre-teens I was made aware of societal assumptions that men were leaders and women followers. Hailing from a small town called Lenasia South, my position in society would depend on me being a “good Indian girl”. Being a “good Indian girl” meant being submissive to one’s male counterparts and assuming household duties such as cooking and cleaning regardless of whether one was working or not. It was then when I started to understand that regardless of passion, Indian women were expected to cook and clean. They had to be the primary caregiver, even if it meant giving up their career aspirations. For this reason, many of my friends’ mothers were stay-at-home mothers.

Once I hit my teen years, there was even more pressure on me to be a “good Indian woman”, one who knew how to cook and clean. I struggled because my passion did not involve cooking as it did not make me happy. Instead, I preferred studying and observing other people’s behaviour. Society as a whole and even my family could not understand why I did not know how to cook and clean by this time. I myself felt conflicted between feelings of inadequacy and unfairness. I felt that it was highly unfair
that my older brother did not need to learn to cook and clean, while I had. The tough reality is that in my community women are expected to be mothers and wives rather than career women and women often sacrifice their career advancement for their husbands. Consequently, most of these women have never been exposed to leadership development opportunities.

I was blessed because although society dictated to me what it meant to be a “good Indian girl”, my parents often assumed a liberal view and from high school onwards they motivated me to pursue my studies and my career.

Being in a position to attend university afforded me the opportunity to gain exposure to a different type of thinking and a world where freedom of choice was encouraged. I was surrounded by like-minded people who did not just view me as a role I assumed, such as being a “good Indian woman”; rather my identity differed significantly from that of other women to whom I was compared who had a similar upbringing.

Defining moments shape the direction of an individual’s life. These moments include trigger moments and moments that matter (Dahlvig & Longman, 2010). When reflecting on my past, I realise how defining moments and experiences in my life have shaped my view of being a leader, or in other words, of leadership identity. In my first year at university I was so moved by a lecture on the difference between leadership and management that I somehow knew that one day I would centre my study on that focus area. I was particularly interested in various leadership styles that leaders assume and whether a leader is born or made.

Long before I heard of the word feminism I was very interested in the advocacy of women’s rights on the grounds of the equality of the sexes. My interest in the topics of women in leadership, work-life balance and identity work stemmed from my honours studies. I was primarily interested in how women experience quality of work life, how women have grown throughout the various eras in leadership roles and the mediating role of work-family conflict between work-role fit and job stress. At this stage the identity concept was very difficult to understand. If I did not know who I was, how could I know what the term identity meant?

I spent two years trying to find myself through job changes and while a lot had changed, the one constant was that I still wanted to be a psychologist. In the UNISA master’s selection interview, I mentioned that my topic would focus on women in
leadership. After receiving my acceptance letter into the programme, I came across a SIOPSA event titled, “Time to get off the bandwagon? A review of the business case for women leaders” with Prof Jenny Hoobler (University of Illinois, Chicago and University of Pretoria). Madsen, Longman and Daniels (2012) posit that conferences can serve as sources of leadership development. Bearing this in mind I decided to attend the conference.

In the coursework for the master’s degree one of my sub-modules was about personal and professional leadership. Even though I was initially excited at the challenge of creating my own personal development plan, I found this module very difficult to relate to; in retrospect, I believe that I was not emotionally ready for it at the time. Therefore, I concur with Harris and Cole (2007) on the importance of a leader’s readiness and willingness to undergo a developmental experience.

Although I had a workable personal development plan and fulfilled most of the plans I had put in place and even presented my topic to the best of my ability, I knew within myself that I had never really addressed my areas of growth to the level I knew I could have done. These areas included writing and reporting, persuading and influencing and action orientation.

Towards the end of the year the puzzle came together, and my lecturer and I brainstormed an LDC that may shape a women’s identity. Thereafter, I realised what growth really meant to me and how personal development plans and peer mentors had actually pushed me out of my comfort zone.

McDermott, Kidney and Flood (2010) studied leader development by considering the developmental journeys of individual leaders. Similarly, I grew interested in how leaders such as Sheryl Sandberg not only climbed the corporate ladder but managed to stay on top. Ironically, two of my master’s degree peers had each gifted me with Sheryl Sandberg’s *Lean In*, because they both knew how passionate I was about this “women in leadership” topic. I found it amazing to read about the challenges she faced, the support factors she credited, as well as her personal strategy to become successful. Additionally, I watched countless tedTalks and read many journal articles on women leaders and women in leadership.

Soon after my coursework was completed, I resigned from my human resource (HR) officer position at a banking company upon landing my dream job as a professional in
training, which would allow me the opportunity to qualify as an industrial organisational (I-O) psychologist while completing my study at the company.

This mining company fostered leadership development and represented an LDC. It opened my eyes to a world I had not experienced before, and I was afforded many opportunities. Similar to Koen, Van Vianen, Klehe and Zikic (2016), through whose work serendipitous events led to participation in the leadership development programme, by chance I was selected for a three-month leadership development programme, which showed me the value of reflection, having a peer mentor and compiling a personal development plan. I credit finding the evolving answers to both the who I am and the why I am questions to being on this self-leadership programme. It is here where I discovered that my identity is driven by my purpose. Much like Richard Grant, I have found that “the value of identity of course is that so often with it comes purpose.” Similar, to what Bonebright, Cottledge and Lonnquist (2012) describe, the programme on which I was did not focus on fostering specific leadership skills, but rather a leadership identity.

Leadership development programmes claim to transfer a participant from one point to another and assume that everyone started at the same place (Andersson & Tengblad, 2016). Therefore, it would seem naïve of me to say that I grew merely as a result of being placed on the three-month programme and I must also acknowledge that apart from the programme, I was provided with a transformational space to engage in identity work (Carden & Callahan, 2007; Ely, Ibarra & Kolb, 2011; Sugiyama, Cavanagh, van Esch, Bilimoria & Brown, 2016) within my company. Maxwell (2009) suggested that effective formal mentoring can improve a female’s career development. I was assigned a formal mentor (Yeager & Callahan, 2016) who challenged me to be the best version of myself and owing to my interest in female leadership, the HR director herself encouraged me to be part of a women’s forum (Madsen et al., 2012). Through my involvement in the forum I had the privilege of meeting strong women such as Judy Dlamini (Wits Chancellor, 2018). Gibson (2008) suggests that developmental relationships foster leader development that extends beyond companies. I formed developmental relationships with colleagues both in the I-O psychology field as well as engineers and researchers.
Community development has been a long-standing passion in my life and as such I work with a non-profit organisation to assist the youth with curriculum vitae writing and mock interviews. Through my company I was afforded a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity of attending the 2018 African Youth Network Summit where I met Ms Graca Machel. Lovell (2013) suggests that community leadership development programmes attract and develop individuals and provide them with networking opportunities.

Thomas, Bierema and Landau (2004) recommend that in addition to organisational strategies, individual women should manage their career development actively by formulating career strategies and becoming more fluid. I realised that as a leader of my own career, with my self-directed proactive approach (Knipfer, Shaughnessy, Hentschel & Schmid, 2017), I was able to have regular feedback sessions (Gipson, Pfaff, Mendelsohn, Catenacci & Burke, 2017; Karp, 2012) with my mentor and managers respectively. For my own self-development I have even completed a time management course. I have committed to frequent reflective journaling, which Collay (2014) suggests combines personal, professional and cultural experiences to foster leadership identity development. I have critically reflected on defining moments, as Skinner (2014) asserts that reflection on these types of experiences allow women to crystallise their leadership identity.

My interest in women and leadership has led me on a path in which I realised the inevitable existential questions that come with leadership development. Much like Zheng and Muir (2015), I am interested in the identity work that individuals do in order to transform their identity to one that incorporates a leadership identity, because I have experienced such identity tensions in my own life. To this day, regardless of what I achieve academically or in my career, on a personal level my success is continually questioned because I am not married, engaged or assuming a parental role. Furthermore, in the eyes of many, the fact that I refrain from undertaking domestic duties such as cooking, and cleaning proves that I am not a “good Indian woman”. I believe my journey illustrates the real value that an LDC can add in constructing a leadership identity (Dalakoura, 2010; Ely et al., 2011; Ghosh, Haynes & Kram, 2013; Mpehle & Kanjere, 2013; Swensen, Gorringe, Caviness & Peters, 2016).
1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT

Women may experience difficulties in creating a leadership identity owing to conflicting gender norms and leadership characteristics (Ely et al., 2011; Sugiyama et al., 2016), because a leadership identity is the product of gender, ethnicity and context (Barkdull, 2009), as well as of personal, professional and cultural experiences (Collay, 2014; Floyd & Fuller, 2016; Suh, 2007). Female leaders consequently experience identity tensions throughout their lives and must successfully navigate between their gender and leader identities (Sims, Gong & Hughes, 2016; Sugiyama et al., 2016).

Subtly or directly, women are told from an early age that they are not the prototype of leaders and that they cannot be developed accordingly (Ely et al., 2011; Mutiso, 2012). When they try to imagine their possible selves, women are often surrounded with images of male leaders (Ibarra & Petriglieri, 2016; Kerka, 2000). Furthermore, they may find it difficult to find a female role model in the field of science, technology and mathematics and may settle on a career in social science instead of pursuing careers in male-dominated industries (Coger et al., 2012). Although more females are likely to graduate from university than their male counterparts and enter the market at a similar rate to them, something occurs at the middle career stage and these women often do not reach management levels (Women in Leadership, Chartered Management Institute and Women in Management, White Paper, 2013).

At the middle career stage women are usually at a life stage where they are married and in the process of expanding their families and because they are the primary caregivers to their children and parents, they may decide to either leave the workforce completely or attempt to balance their personal and professional roles while prioritising the needs of their families (Kuschel & Salvaj, 2018; Mahasha, 2016; Ogweng, 2016).

For the few women who decide to continue to climb the corporate ladder, it may be difficult to move up the ladder owing to their lack of skills or leadership identity. When women move from technical and specialist roles to managerial or leadership roles, different skills sets are required from them (Kuschel & Salvaj, 2018). It is not sufficient for leaders to be qualified and knowledgeable; effective leaders must have global leadership competencies (Clerkin & Ruderman, 2016; Steven Terell & Rosenbusch, 2012). Women may also lack the education and experience required for senior
leadership roles (Eagly & Carly, 2007) and even when educated, they may still not be viewed as leaders (Bierema, 2016; Walker & Aritz, 2015).

Creating a leadership identity involves a multifaceted process of coming to view oneself and being viewed by others as a leader (Ely et al., 2011; Zheng & Muir, 2015). Furthermore, a leadership identity is a result of women’s efforts being validated and recognised by key people and endorsed collectively. The benefits of the creation of a leadership identity include higher satisfaction and lower burnout (Swensen et al., 2016), greater leadership development experiences (Day & Harisson, 2007), greater self-confidence and self-efficacy (Dahvig & Longman, 2016); thinking as a leader (Ligon, Wallace & Osburn, 2011), networking and career advancement (Harris & Leberman, 2012; Knipfer et al., 2017).

In order to be viewed as leaders and view themselves accordingly, women may need to engage in identity work. Identity work increases leaders’ self-awareness, self-regulation and self-motivation (Gipson et al., 2012; Karp, 2012). The identity work women perform is functional to address the second generation bias they experience as women in society and the workplace. According to Ely, et al (2011), women experience second generation bias in the form of the following: gendered career paths and work roles, access to networks and sponsors, and cultural stereotypes. Ely et al (2011) recommend strategies to address each of these issues. In order for new selves to emerge, the old selves must be discarded (Koen et al., 2016; Kyriakidou, 2011).

Although companies have begun investing in flexible work policies, women’s networks, mentoring programmes and women’s leadership programmes, these initiatives do not necessarily translate to women creating the leadership identity necessary for attaining and maintaining such management roles (Ibarra, Snook & Ramo, 2008). Leadership identity development is not simply the result of traditional training programmes; rather it is the result of multiple well-coordinated efforts aimed at developing individuals (Dalakoura, 2010; Mpehle & Kanjere, 2013).

From the discussion of factors affecting women in leadership, the research question underlying this study is, “How do women in an LDC create a leadership identity?”
1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS
The research questions are as follows:

- What are the experiences of women in a leadership development context?
- How do women in a leadership development context perform identity work and construct a leadership identity?

1.5 AIM AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY
In light of the problem statement, the general aim of this study was to explore and describe how women in an LDC perform identity work in order to construct a leadership identity.

The specific objectives related to the overall aim of the study were

- To explore the identity work women in an LDC perform
- To explore how women construct a leadership identity
- To develop a framework that describes women’s leadership identity construction

1.6 ANTICIPATED VALUE/CONTRIBUTION OF THE STUDY
This study intended to contribute to the body of knowledge regarding women in leadership, by exploring how women perform identity work and construct a leadership identity.

The study further intended to contribute to leadership identity development theories in the field of leadership development. Such theories should consider women’s career advancement. The contribution to leadership development theories includes an input on the advancement of women who face barriers that differ from those of men. The findings of the study provide a basis for other studies in the same field to take place.

The study also provided a platform for female leaders to reflect on their career experiences and further provided insight into what constitutes a context that reinforces the leadership development and career advancement of women.

The study results are intended to assist organisations, I-O psychologists and human resource professionals in deciding on the best time to adopt leadership development
programmes and how to structure policies to optimise performance outcomes and minimise potential threats and negative influences.

1.7 THE DISCIPLINARY CONTEXT

The study was conducted within the discipline of I-O psychology and relates to the sub-disciplines of organisational psychology and development, as well as career psychology.

1.7.1 Industrial and organisational psychology

I-O psychology is the scientific study of human behaviour in the workplace and applies psychological theories and principles to organisations and individuals in the workplace. Studying how women in an LDC create a leadership identity is important to the field of I-O psychology, as it can assist organisations to optimise both the leadership development and the career management of women in the workplace (Saari, 2017). This in turn will build confidence, self-esteem and leadership skills and ultimately lead to more women in leadership positions (Saari, 2017; Silzer, Church, Rotolo & Scott, 2016).

1.7.1.1 Organisational psychology and development

I-O psychologists are trained in the scientist practitioner model (Jex & Britt, 2014; Rupp & Beal, 2007). I-O psychologists contribute to an organisation’s success by improving the performance, motivation and job satisfaction of employees (Barnard & Fourie, 2007). This study was aimed at fostering leadership identity through identity work performed in an LDC. The study will be used to create a framework explaining the leadership identity construction of women managers in an LDC, which may be used for further development of women leaders (cf. Saari, 2017; Silzer et al., 2016).

1.7.1.2 Career psychology

Career psychology is the study of career development and career behaviour, which forms an integral part of human development and applies to individuals’ work- and career-related problems and decisions and helping them to resolve conflicts between work and non-work interests (De Villiers, 2009; Muchinsky, 2006). This study explored how women in an LDC perform identity work in order to construct a leadership identity. This will be used to understand the unique career development needs of female
leaders, which may produce personal development plans that may further support
talent management planning through the enhancement of career management and
counselling (Leutner & Chamorro-Premuzic, 2018; Mandelke, Shoenfelt & Brown,
2016).

1.8 THE UNDERLYING PSYCHOLOGICAL PARADIGM

In this section I discuss humanism as the underlying paradigm of my study. I also
explain the meta-theories (identity theory [IT] and social identity theory [SIT]) and the
meta-theoretical constructs relevant to the study.

1.8.1 Humanism

Humanists conceptualise human nature as positive and acknowledge their subjective
experiences and conscious processes as they play an active role in determining one’s
behaviour (Mguqulwa, 2008). As humans are integrated beings, they actively strive
towards self-actualisation (Kaur, 2013; Maslow, 1971; McLeod, 2007; Ngokha, 2008).

Interviews were conducted on the basic conviction that women are effectively able to
decide on how to prioritise their daily tasks, and which behaviour to display when
working with conflicting demands in the integrated work-home environment. Self-
actualisation is congruent to women’s subjective interpretations of success and may
also be congruent in balancing work and family demands (Kaur, 2013; Maslow, 1971;
McLeod, 2007). This study aims to enhance the self-actualisation of women regardless
of their background, position or race and is therefore consistent with the humanistic
paradigm.

1.8.2 Meta-theories relevant to the study

Meta-theories relevant to the study were identified in order to explore how women in
an LDC construct their leadership identity. The following theories will be explored in
chapter 2: (i) SIT, and (ii) IT.

1.8.2.1 Social identity theory and Identity theory

While SIT is concerned with the meanings associated with being a member of a social
category, IT focusses on the meanings attached to performing a specific role (Bothma
et al., 2015; Burke & Stets, 2009). Both streams provide a link through identities,
between social structures, processes and the self (Brewer & Roccas, 2001). In both
SIT and IT, the self is reflexive in that it views itself as an object. As such, it categorises,
classifies or names itself in particular ways in relation to other social categories or classifications.

SIT is relevant to the study, as women in the workplace may subscribe to a specific social identity relating to being women or the racial group to which they belong. Furthermore, IT is relevant, as the managerial role that the women assume is also important for the study of leadership identity. It is the combination of both streams of theories that leads to the creation of a leadership identity.

Hogg, Terry and White (1995) suggest that although there are similar perspectives in IT and SIT, they occupy parallel but separate universes. As such, each stream has differing application opportunities. However, Stets and Burke (2000) posit that SIT and IT have much more in common and may be combined by integrating the role, person and group bases of identity (Deaux & Burke, 2010).

1.8.3 Meta-theoretical constructs relevant to the study

Below I define meta-theoretical constructs that are relevant to the study. These include identity work, LDC, leadership identity, women in leadership and career advancement.

1.8.3.1 Identity work

Identity work refers to the interlinked activities by which individuals actively create, maintain, repair, display, revise and discard social, personal and role identities (Adams & Crafford, 2012; Alvesson, Lee Ashcraft, & Thomas, 2008; Brown, 2017; Saayman & Crafford, 2011). The resultant outcome is that individuals achieve a sense of “coherence and distinctiveness” (Sveningsson & Alvesson, 2003, p. 1164).

1.8.3.2 Leadership development context

An LDC involves a number of coordinated activities that result in the formation of a leadership identity. These activities include among others training and leadership development, mentorship and coaching, and attending conferences. An LDC can therefore be reflected in an organisation that facilitates leadership development by fostering such activities with the purpose of developing leadership skills and competencies across its workforce.
1.8.3.3 Leadership identity

The leadership identity model proposed by DeRue and Ashford (2010) suggests that leadership identity should be constructed at three different levels: the personal identity level, relational identity level and the collective identity level. These levels are also advanced by other theorists (e.g. Debebe & Reinert, 2012; Ibarra & Barbulescu, 2010; Lord & Hall, 2005), who are all driven by the conception that sees leadership identity construction akin to a relationship construction (DeRue & Ashford, 2010). In this sense construction and internalisation of a leader identity is perceived to be central to the process of becoming a leader (Ely et al., 2011).

1.8.3.4 Women in leadership

The term women in leadership refers to women in a senior position in the workplace, which also indicates a leadership role that an individual has taken (Molotsi, 2016). The concept of women in leadership also considers women in various managerial and specialist roles.

1.8.3.5 Career advancement

Career advancement is a lifelong process that involves career growth (Molotsi, 2016). It occurs when individuals move from one level or position to a higher level in the workplace. Career advancement can also be viewed as a change in roles in terms of scope and definition. This may be viewed as a requirement for success in the postmodern world of work. In order for women to advance in their careers, they must create a leadership identity.

1.9 RESEARCH PARADIGM

A research paradigm represents the philosophical intent or motivation for undertaking a study (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 1994). A paradigm is founded on the philosophical assumptions, concepts or propositions about truth and reality. This denotes one’s ontological and epistemological stance, which ultimately determines one’s general paradigm or orientation to research and the generation of scientific knowledge (Bogdan & Biklen, 1998).
The ontology, epistemology and methodology form a framework of interrelated practice and thinking that defines the nature of a researcher’s enquiry (Nel, 2007). The study is grounded in critical realism ontology and social constructivism epistemology.

The research was conducted in a manner consistent with critical realism, as it is my ontological belief that the nature of reality is based on power and identity struggles, privilege or oppression, as experienced by women in the study (Lincoln, Lynham & Guba, 2011). The main assumptions of critical realism as an ontology take into consideration both culture and power struggles in an attempt to understand the historical, social and political macro-contexts (Lincoln et al., 2011). Furthermore, critical realism focuses on achieving social justice and equality (Lincoln et al., 2011). Nel (2007) suggests that researchers must determine their ontology before their epistemology.

Epistemology is the assumptions we hold about how we can know reality. Thus, a specific epistemological position (e.g. objectivism or subjectivism) is representative of specific assumptions (beliefs) about how to access knowledge (Nel, 2007). Moreover, epistemology aims to apply natural sciences principles to study social phenomena. The epistemological beliefs that stem from social constructivism is that reality is co-constructed between the researcher and the researched and shaped by individual experiences (Lincoln et al., 2011). Social constructivism involves social actors that have both an active and a social role to play in the construction of social reality. As such, the research aimed to explore how women in an LDC construct their leadership identity.

Methodology is concerned with how knowledge is discovered, and analysed, and ontological and epistemological assumptions guide how that knowledge should be gathered. Based on the critical realism ontology and social constructivist epistemology, an emic approach is assumed, which will involve interacting with women in an LDC to find out what the research phenomenon means to them and how it is experienced by them.

The paradigm and research question should determine data collection and analysis methods (Creswell, Plano Clark, Gutmann & Hanson, 2003; Mertens, 2005). Mackenzie and Knipe (2006) posit that for the social constructivist paradigm, qualitative methods predominate. Within the social constructivism framework, use of
an inductive method of emergent ideas (through consensus) is obtained through data collection methods such as observations and interviewing (Creswell et al., 2003; Mertens, 2005). The data analysis that follows collection will include an analysis of texts and visual data analysis (Creswell et al., 2003; Mertens, 2005). Constructivists do not generally begin with a theory; rather they “generate or inductively develop a theory or pattern of meanings.” Inductive reasoning was used to build theory once participants had been spoken to, patterns had been found and tentative hypotheses had been generated.

1.10 RESEARCH DESIGN

In order to answer the research question “How do women in a leadership development context perform identity work and construct a leadership identity?” a qualitative, exploratory and descriptive design incorporating a hermeneutic phenomenological approach was followed. The main reason for conducting this type of research was that it would help me understand how women construct a leadership identity in an LDC. This approach was appropriate for my study, as it allowed for the study of phenomena such as leadership identity construction in a leadership-specific context.

1.10.1 Type of research: Qualitative study

The primary purpose of qualitative research is to explore and understand the meaning of people (Creswell, 1998), experiences (Polkinghorne, 2005), cultures (Marshall & Rossman, 2014) situations or a particular phenomenon (Gill, Stewart, Treasure, & Chadwick, 2008). Therefore, the qualitative research question is exploratory in nature. In each study more than one kind of data are collected. Furthermore, data are in the form of words, unlike quantitative data, which are in the form of numbers (Polkinghorne, 2005). Typically, data collection occurs in the participants’ natural settings (Creswell, 1998). Data collection methods include the use of interviews, documents, observations and audio-visual materials (Gill et al., 2008; Hennink, Hutter, & Bailey, 2010; Polkinghorne, 2005). The researcher is acknowledged as a primary instrument for both data collection and data analysis in the study (Creswell, 1998; Morrow, 2005). Furthermore, the researcher’s reflexivity and subjectivity are considered (Morrow, 2005).

Morrow (2005) posits that in qualitative research an emergent design is followed, and methods can sometimes change during the study. Qualitative research is typically
inductive in nature (Frankel & Devers, 2000) and data are used to build theories, which is in contrast to the deductive nature of quantitative research, which is used to test existing theories. Stenbacka (2001) argues that whereas quantitative research uses measures to determine the quality of data, such as reliability and validity, qualitative research requires quality concepts of its own. To determine the quality of data, verification is used rather than internal validity (Morrow, 2005), transferability rather than generalisability (Lincoln & Guba, 2008), the dependability of the researchers account (Marshall & Rossman, 1995; Marshall & Rossman, 2014) and the confirmability of findings (Marshall & Rossman, 1995; Marshall & Rossman, 2014). The final report takes the form of a narrative and is often written in the first person (Starfield, 2015). Qualitative research is often interpretative in nature and involves a lot of narrative writing and direct quotations from participants (Corden & Sainsbury, 2006).

Exploratory studies such as the present study is best conducted by using qualitative data, as the research requires richness of information. It also enhances interaction among respondents, as they depend on the comments, perceptions, views, opinions and ideas of people (Creswell & Poth, 2016). Furthermore, it is more interactive than a structured survey, as it uses dynamic processes such as interviews and group discussions (Creswell & Poth, 2016). Different approaches to qualitative research are found; in this study, I followed a hermeneutic phenomenological approach.

1.10.2 Research approach: Hermeneutic phenomenology

Social constructivism as an epistemology/research paradigm and hermeneutic phenomenology (as a methodology or research approach) are congruent, complementary and can be used in harmony (Higgins et al, 2015; Loftus & Higgs, 2010; Standing, 2009). According to Bu and Paré (2018, p. 143), whose social constructivist study used a hermeneutic approach, “it reflects the understanding — echoed in social constructionism — that we cannot solicit another’s experience without being actively implicated in an interpretive process. The findings are inescapably co-constructed; they cannot be severed from the researchers’ pre-understandings, and they are the product of an interpretive process.”

Contrary to the positivist paradigm, the naturalistic paradigm proposes that reality is not fixed and is rather based on individual and subjective realities. The philosophy of
Phenomenology relates to the naturalistic paradigm and is congruent with the philosophical beliefs of qualitative research. Phenomenologists believe that knowledge is gained through interactions and engagement between researchers and participants (Reiners, 2012).

Hermeneutic phenomenology is concerned with the subjective experience of individuals and groups (Kafle, 2011). It is an attempt to unveil the world as experienced by the subjects through their life-world stories (Reiners, 2012). Phenomenological methodology represents approaches ranging from pure description to those more strongly informed by interpretation (Davidsen, 2013). Pure phenomenologists, such as Husserl, viewed human consciousness as intentional and proposed a worldview based on openness to knowing or describing the world (Davidsen, 2013; Kafle, 2011). Both Husserl and Heidegger refer to a world that differs from the objective, outer world (Lindseth & Norberg, 2004). However, Heidegger’s interpretive phenomenology regards human existence as about being-in-the-world and emphasises meaning-making of everyday experiences (Laverty, 2003; Lindseth & Norberg, 2004; Reiners, 2012). Gadamer extended the interpretive or hermeneutic phenomenology approach of Heidegger in order to practicalise it and posited that the method is not totally objective, separate or value-free from the researcher and therefore biases and prior engagement in the topic cannot be bracketed from it (Laverty, 2003). Bracketing, which is typical to pure phenomenology, occurs when researchers put aside their repertoires of knowledge, beliefs, values and experiences in order to describe participants’ life experiences accurately (Chan, Fung, Chien, 2013). However, in the hermeneutic phenomenological approach, it is acknowledged that pre-understanding cannot be eliminated or “bracketed” (Koch, 1995). Hermeneutic phenomenology implies that one cannot remove the self from the meanings extracted from the text and the researcher rather becomes an integral part of the research inquiry (Reiners, 2012). Hermeneutic phenomenology is appropriate to this study, as I am intent on exploring the lived experiences of women engaging in an LDC. Yet, as I have already acknowledged, my predisposition was to study the phenomenon of leadership identity construction. Rather than bracketing myself, I believe that being transparent about my preconceived notions, rooted in my own leadership developmental experiences as a young Indian woman, is pivotal to my way of approaching and executing this study.
Inevitably, my prior knowledge and experience have had an impact on my entry into the research field and how I interpreted the data.

Hermeneutic phenomenology is pertinent to the study because I am interested in how women in an LDC have experienced their journey to becoming female leaders. Because of the nature of the study, I conducted interviews, therefore a text interpretation method is required (Lindseth & Norberg, 2004). The phenomenological hermeneutical approach can be applied to interpret narrative interviews, as they produce scripts or text through the recordings and text (Lindseth & Norberg, 2004).

Hermeneutic phenomenology allowed me to bring myself into the study and to apply certain “lenses” through which meaning-making was derived (Lindseth & Norberg, 2004). According to Boell and Cecez-Kecmanovic (2010), the hermeneutic circle can be used as a framework for literature search and review. In my study I applied SIT, IT and leadership theories as my “lenses” through which I interpreted the data.

1.10.3 The approach to theory

If the qualitative project is designed to be mostly exploratory in nature and theory-building, then starting with a bottom-up approach is best. If the qualitative project is designed to be theory-testing, then a top-down approach is probably needed (Creswell & Clark, 2007). Some qualitative analysis approaches suggested iterating between the two, and to some extent the top-down and bottom-up distinction can be seen as a continuum between two extremes, but qualitative researchers should consider where they are going to start and what they are going to spend most of their time doing (Soiferman, 2010). I decided to use a combination of a bottom-up and top-down approach to gather information about how women perform identity work in order to construct a leadership identity in an LDC. Firstly, I read relevant social identity and identity theories. Using the knowledge I had gained I then conducted field-work research and following an iterative process, I then went back to understand leadership identity development theories. This process of iterating between the data and existing theory helped me create a leadership identity development model.

1.11 RESEARCH METHOD

The research method section explains the sampling method followed, entrée and establishing research roles performed, data collection method used, data capturing
and storage methods, as well as the data analysis approach and strategies used to ensure quality data.

1.11.1 Research setting

The research setting included women managers in different fields of specialisation and managerial levels from a mining company based in Gauteng. Each of the women had different leadership development needs and as such they were exposed to an LDC with various leadership activities. These activities included both in-house and external courses aimed at building and broadening their intrapersonal and interpersonal skills. Based on management discretion, these women were also able to attend seminars, workshops and conferences hosted by universities and industry experts. The company furthermore provided formal mentorship for a period of 12-18 months to women who had been nominated by the succession planning committee, based on their performance and potential.

1.11.2 Sampling and participants

A non-probability purposive voluntary sampling strategy was selected to ensure inclusion of typical cases and information-rich cases (Terre Blanche, Durrheim, & Painter, 2007). The primary sampling parameters were that women would need to be managers working in the mining company and engage in the LDC of the company.

The study involved five female managers working in a completely corporate environment. Only women based in the Gauteng area were involved, because of resource constraints, namely time, access and money (Terre Blanche et al., 2007). They needed to be between the ages of 30 and 65 to ensure focussing on women from the middle career stage onwards. Furthermore, they were exposed to an LDC that consisted of activities such as training, seminars, workshops, conferences, mentorship and leadership development programmes. Focussing on how women in an LDC perform identity work in order to construct a leadership identity enabled me to gain in-depth knowledge of the experiences of women in this specific context.

1.11.3 Entrée and establishing research roles

As I am employed by the organisation, I know both the HR Director and the Group Manager personally, which made it easier to obtain permission to perform the study. Permission was obtained from the Group Manager, Talent Management to conduct
the study on women in an LDC. This manager identified potential participants who were based in the headquarters at the time of the interviews. Potential research participants were contacted via e-mail, since this was the communication mode most suitable to this population. Although six female leaders were contacted, only five accepted the invitation to participate. The context and purpose of the study were clearly explained, and voluntary participation was requested. Interviews were set at a convenient place and time for both parties.

1.11.4 Data collection

In this study, I collected data through the use of semi-structured interviews. Blandford (2013) suggests that interviews are best suited for understanding people’s perceptions, experiences and opinions. Furthermore, interviews are used in almost all kinds of qualitative research (positivist, interpretive, or critical) and are the technique of choice in most qualitative research methods (Tong & Craig, 2007). Moreover, interviews allow researchers to gather rich data from people in various roles and situations. Because of the nature and complexity of the research topic, one type of interview was held, namely semi-structured interviews. Whereas some interviews are completely structured, using questionnaires, and others are unstructured, which makes them more conversational, semi-structured interviews lie somewhere in the middle (Blandford 2013; Zorn, 2008). Zorn (2008) asserts that semi-structured interviews offer topics and questions to the interviewee; however, the interview is carefully designed to elicit the interviewee’s ideas and opinions as opposed to leading the interviewee toward preconceived choices.

Cohen and Crabtree (2006) list the following characteristics of semi-structured interviews: formal interview, interview guide and topical trajectories. Similarly, Arthur and Nazroo (2003) emphasise the importance of creating interview guides. Cohen and Crabtree (2006) assert that semi-structured interview guides provide both reliable and comparable qualitative data.

Female leaders and managers were first asked the following question: “Tell me your story of becoming a leader?” Based on participants’ responses I then followed up with pre-planned questions as per the attached Appendix B. I used mirroring, flexibility and openness when conducting the interviews.
**1.11.5 Data capturing and storage**

Interviews were recorded with the permission of interviewees, and interview notes were taken during each interview.

**1.11.6 Data analysis**

Polkinghorne (2005) suggests that data analysis involves the use of detailed descriptions and researchers sort through the data using text analysis to organise it according to themes. Furthermore, the analysis of qualitative data can be very time-consuming and requires skill (Polkinghorne, 2005).

Heidegger (1927) developed the concept of the hermeneutic circle to envision a whole in terms of a reality situated in the detailed experience of the everyday existence of an individual (the parts). The hermeneutic circle describes the process of understanding a text hermeneutically. It refers to the idea that one's understanding of the text as a whole is established by reference to the individual parts and one's understanding of each individual part by reference to the whole. Neither the whole text nor any individual part can be understood without reference to one another, and hence, it is a circle (Boell & Cecez-Kecmanovic, 2010; Hasanpur, Keyhanpour & Nourozitalab, 2017; Heidegger, 1927). However, this circular character of interpretation does not make it impossible to interpret a text; rather, it stresses that the meaning of a text must be found in its cultural, historical, and literary context (Boell & Cecez-Kecmanovic, 2010; Hasanpur et al., 2017; Heidegger, 1927). Therefore, the hermeneutic circle is about establishing real relationships between reader, text, and context. Gadamer (1975) reconceptualised the hermeneutic circle as an iterative process through which a new understanding of a whole reality is developed by means of exploring the detail of existence.

For data analysis I chose the phenomenological hermeneutical method. Lindseth and Norberg (2004) suggest that the method involves the following process: Firstly, the researcher gains a naïve understanding of the text. Secondly, themes are constructed from the data, based on sections of meaningful text. While themes are being constructed, a comparison is made with the original naïve understanding of the data. Thereafter, a reflection on the naïve understanding and the constructed themes, which have been related to literature on the topic, occurs. Lastly, comprehensive understanding is gained.
1.11.7 Strategies employed to ensure credible and quality data

One of the most prominent criteria against which qualitative studies can be assessed is the trustworthiness of the inquiry (Schwandt, Lincoln, & Guba, 2007). Lincoln and Guba (1985) proposed four constructs, which are believed to reflect the trustworthiness of a study, namely credibility/authenticity, transferability, dependability and confirmability. In addition, reflexivity was employed as a strategy to ensure credible and quality data.

1.11.7.1 Credibility

Credibility as quality criterion in qualitative research rather deals with internal validity (Holloway & Wheeler, 2002; Macnee & McCabe, 2008). Guba and Lincoln (1982) assert that the credibility emanating from the four constructs is seen as one of the most important factors in ensuring the trustworthiness of research.

To ensure the credibility of this research, I adopted the following strategies:

a) Prolonged engagement in research site

Qualitative data collection required me to immerse myself in the participants’ worldview (Bitsch, 2005). Adopting this approach helped me to understand the context of the study and minimise the distortions of information that may have arisen from my presence on the site. By extending the time I spent in the field, I improved trust in respondents and also extended understanding of participants’ leadership identity construction and LDC (Onwuegbuzie & Leech, 2007).

b) Use of peer debriefing

During the research processes I sought support from other professionals who were willing to provide scholarly guidance, such as the research supervisor, a professional mentor and other topic specialists. These included members of academia (Bitsch, 2005). The peer debrief investigator (supervisor) considered background information, data collection methods and processes, data management, transcripts, data analysis procedure and research findings (Pitney & Parker, 2009).
c) Triangulation

Triangulation “involves the use of multiple and different methods, investigators, sources, and theories to obtain corroborating evidence” (Onwuegbuzie & Leech, 2007).

Triangulation serves two purposes. Firstly, it reduces systematic bias and secondly it cross-examines the integrity of participants’ responses. There are two major triangulation techniques that researchers can employ, namely investigator triangulation and the use of different informants (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005; Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Phillimore & Goodson, 2004). Below is a description of how I employed each of these strategies in this study: Investigator triangulation: My supervisor served as a co-analyst to corroborate the information gathered for the same phenomenon - how women in an LDC construct their leadership identity.

1.11.7.2 Transferability

Transferability is a construct that relates to external validity and generalisability. (Bitsch, 2005; Tobin & Begley, 2004).

In a qualitative study, generalisability is quite impossible, as findings are context-defined. Yet, findings may be able to serve as an example within a broader group or different people in a similar context. This is why the notion of transferability of data is considered in a qualitative inquiry. To ensure transferability, the provision of background data to establish the context of the study clearly and a detailed description of the phenomenon in question may allow for comparisons to be made. According to Bitsch (2005), the “researcher facilitates the transferability judgment by a potential user through ‘thick description’ and purposeful sampling”.

a) Thick description

Thick description refers to the detailed account of field experiences in which the researcher makes explicit the patterns of cultural and social relationships and puts them in context (Holloway, 1997). Li (2004) posits that “to enable judgments about how well the research context fits with other contexts, thick descriptive data (i.e. a rich and extensive set of details concerning methodology and context) should be included in the research report”. In the study, I used thick description by including verbatim
excerpts from the data to explain and substantiate the interpretations I made when I described the themes (i.e. the results) that I constructed from the data.

b) Purposive sampling
Purposive sampling is the technique mainly used in naturalistic inquiry studies and is defined “as selecting units (e.g. individuals, groups of individuals, institutions) based on specific purposes associated with answering a research study’s questions” (Teddle & Yu, 2007).

Because of the purpose of the study, women from an LDC were selected to discuss how they constructed their leadership identity. This type of sampling helped me to study key informants. These women were predominantly familiar with the issues under investigation (Ary, Jacobs, Razavieh, & Sorensen, 2010).

1.11.7.3 Dependability
The construct of dependability focusses on the reliability of research (Bitsch, 2005). This refers to whether, if the research should be replicated in the same context, using the same methods and the same participants, similar results would be obtained. To increase the dependability, I needed to ensure that the study was recorded in detail so that if repeated in future, it may be done in a similar manner. This in-depth practice allows readers to see that correct research practices have been followed.

Dependability was established by using the following strategies: an audit trail and code-recode strategy (Chilisa & Preece, 2005; Krefting, 1991; Schwandt et al., 2007).

a) Audit trail
An audit trail is followed when the primary researcher accounts for all research decisions and activities to show how data were collected, recorded and analysed (Bowen, 2009; Li, 2004). In the study, I ensured that all information regarding the collection and analysis of the data had been thoroughly recorded.

b) Code-recode strategy
In using this strategy, the researcher codes the same data twice by allowing at least one- or two-weeks’ gestation period between each coding. The findings from the two codings are then compared to see if these are the same or different (Chilisa & Preece, 2005). This helps the researcher to understand deeply the patterns of the data; and
also to improve knowledge of the participants’ narrations. I made use of the code-recode strategy by coding the same data twice after allowing a two-week gestation period between each coding, I then compared the findings of the codes.

1.11.7.4 Confirmability

Confirmability of research deals with the objectivity of a research study (Tobin & Begley, 2004). This is where steps must be taken to help ensure that the findings of the study are a result of the experiences and ideas of the subjects/informants rather than the characteristics and preferences of the researcher.

I addressed the confirmability of this study by making use of an audit trail, reflexive journal and triangulation (Bowen, 2009; Lincoln & Guba, 1985). In terms of establishing an audit trail, an in-depth methodological description was provided in the discussion of the research methods to allow for the integrity of the research findings to be scrutinised. I also made use of a reflexive journal, in which I used key insights in the introductory and concluding sections. In the section below I will provide a thorough explanation of reflexivity. It is believed that a key criterion for confirmability is the extent to which the researcher admits his or her own beliefs and assumptions (Tobin & Begley, 2004). In the study I made a note of shortcomings of the methods and their potential effects in the limitations and recommendations section.

1.11.7.5 Reflexivity

Reflexivity is a strategy to ensure quality criteria by addressing the objectivity of the study. It makes the preconceptions of the researcher transparent – this aligns with the hermeneutic phenomenological stance that preconceptions cannot be bracketed, but should be acknowledged and made explicit (Spence, 2017; Whitehead, 2004).

Wilkinson (1988) suggests that reflexivity is a potentially powerful agent for change within psychology, as it can be self-consciously applied to advance the feminist challenge. Reflexivity is the open acknowledgement of the influences of the researcher, the research topic and subjects on the research results (Haynes, 2012; Kitto, Chesters & Grbich, 2008). Furthermore, it is about an honest exploration of whether aspects of self-identity lead to bias (Reay, 1996). Whereas Frank (1997), asserts that “the challenge is not to eliminate ‘bias’ to be more neutral, but to use it as a focus for more intense insight” (p. 89), Lynch (2000) suggests that reflexivity is often
associated with operational efforts to root out sources of bias. Reflexivity ensures the quality (Morrow, 2005), trustworthiness (Morrow, 2005) and rigour (Bashir, Afzal, & Azeem, 2008; Houghton, Casey, Shaw, & Murphy, 2013; Kitto et al., 2008) of the data.

Reflexivity is achieved through a reflexive research diary and Rolfe and Gardener (2006) posit that all published research reports should include this. Researchers must show awareness of the sociocultural position they assume and how their value systems might affect the entire research process (Kitto et al., 2008). Furthermore, the researcher must demonstrate awareness of the social setting of the research and of the wider social context in which it is positioned (Kitto et al., 2008). Similarly, Macbeth (2001) suggests that positional reflexivity leads the researcher to examine place, biography, self, and others to understand how they shape the study. Mruck and Breuer (2003) provide empirical examples that illustrate the way in which (sub-) cultural, social, professional, biographical, and personal characteristics influence what is perceived, interpreted and published. Similarly, Berger (2015) addresses how the researcher's social position, personal experiences, and political and professional beliefs may potentially affect his/her reflexivity.

Mruck and Breuer (2003) posit that by highlighting subjectivity in the research process the researcher will achieve new levels of understanding through reflexivity. Guillemin and Gillam (2004) suggest that reflexivity can help researchers understand the nature of ethics in qualitative research and how ethical practice in research can be obtained. Similarly, Kitto et al. (2008) suggest that researchers should reconsider their actions and interactions in the research process to ensure a true portrayal of the construction of their findings.

I applied reflexivity at the beginning of this chapter by stating my evolving interest in the study. I discussed my background and experiences, and I also explained how my worldview was shaped by my parents as well as other people with whom I interacted throughout my life. My philosophy of science was furthermore explicitly presented in this chapter.

1.12 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Prior to conducting the study, I applied for and was granted ethical clearance by the UNISA research ethics review committee. The reference number is 2017_CEMS/IOP_016.
I obtained permission from the appropriate manager in the research organisation to conduct the research. As interviews were conducted, the participants were also asked for their informed consent in writing beforehand.

I gave a presentation on the proposed research rationale and procedures to the participants and obtained their permission to incorporate the research in a research report. I committed to maintaining the privacy of the participants, as well as the transparent representation of data, regardless of the study’s findings.

I ensured that the golden rule of research was followed by not subjecting participants to unethical treatment. The participants were enabled to give their informed consent to participate freely and were advised that they could terminate their involvement for any reason at any time.

I consulted a wide range of I-O psychology literature that informed the ethical considerations of my study and my dissertation (Aguinis & Henle, 2002; Dekas & McCune, 2015; Lefkowitz, 2017). In addition, as an intern industrial psychologist registered with the Health Professions Council of South Africa (HPCSA), I have also followed the following guidelines throughout my research process: The Code of Professional Ethics of the HPCSA and the Professional Board for Psychology, Industrial and Organisational Psychology Oath, Ethical and Professional Rules of the HPCSA as promulgated in Government Gazette R717/2006 and General Ethical Guidelines for the Health Care Professions.

1.13 OUTLINE OF CHAPTERS

The research structure and chapter layout are as follows:

Chapter 1: Introduction and scientific orientation

This chapter presents the research topic and provides the background and motivation for the research, which considers how women in an LDC construct their leadership identity. Chapter 1 also considers meta-theoretical constructs relevant to the study. Furthermore, I explain my research paradigm, research design and research method. Chapter 1 also describes the ethical considerations that I followed.
Chapter 2: Literature study

In this chapter a review of the most relevant and provoking literature regarding women in leadership in terms of the barriers they experience and the strategies they adopt in order to overcome them are discussed. Identity theories such as SIT and IT are considered. Additionally, an exploration of the nature and importance of work/role identity is provided. Lastly, leadership identity is positioned as a type of work/role identity and the development of leadership identity is explored.

Chapter 3: Empirical study (research article)

This chapter presents the research purpose, motivation for the study, research design, approach and method I used. The data were analysed according to the phenomenological hermeneutic method and the findings were presented as my naïve understanding and structural thematic analysis. I presented the comprehensive understanding I gathered in my discussion section. Lastly, I presented my conclusions, recommendations and the limitations of the study.

Chapter 4: Conclusions, limitations, and recommendations

The last chapter will provide a summary of the study. This chapter also provides the conclusions that are drawn as a result of the study and the potential limitations of the study. Recommendations are made on the basis of the findings and future directions for research in LDCs are proposed. Furthermore, I provide evidence of my self-reflection by means of a reflective self-assessment.
CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

Many authors have highlighted the importance of conducting a literature review when undertaking a research study (Terre Blanche & Durrheim, 1999; Veiga, 2009). The primary aim of conducting a literature review is to consider the existing body of knowledge regarding the topic on which one will be conducting the study (Veiga, 2009). As such, the literature review contextualises the research (Marshall & Rossman, 1999) and provides a conceptual framework that creates order in thinking about the above context and background (Leshem & Trafford, 2007).

Studies report an increase in the number of women in the workplace yet highlight the consistent need for women in leadership roles. This study aimed to explore how women in an LDC perform identity work to construct a leadership identity. This chapter aims to provide a literature review of the relevant meta-theory and constructs regarding women in leadership and identity theories.

In the context of a research project, a literature review can be approached from either of two approaches (Terre Blanche & Durrheim, 1999; Veiga, 2009). First, literature may be written up thematically, by focusing on the themes. Or, second, it can be analytically documented chronologically, beginning with the earliest research first and pointing out major advances in research on the topic (Terre Blanche & Durrheim, 1999; Veiga, 2009). Because of the longstanding and extensive literature available on both women in leadership and identity theories, I structure my literature review thematically. I start the chapter by discussing barriers women in the workplace face. Thereafter I consider the importance of identity theories in leadership, specifically SIT, social categorisation theory and IT in the construction of leadership identity. Lastly, I integrate identity theories with women leadership development. I do this by considering how females’ leadership identity is developed in the context of theory explicating the bases of identity, factors influencing leadership identity development, the process of identity construction and the principles of creating an LDC that will foster leadership identity.

Given the importance of attracting, retaining and motivating more women to assume leadership roles, it is pertinent to understand the challenges that women in the
workplace face while attempting to advance in their careers. As such, I commence the discussion in the following section by highlighting the barriers that women in the workplace face in their quest for leadership, as well as the coping strategies that they adopt in order to overcome those specific barriers.

2.2 THE UNIQUE EXPERIENCES OF WOMEN IN MINING

In the South African context, male-dominated industries such as mining have been known for enforcing both a patriarchal and a militaristic culture (Benya, 2016; Martin & Barnard, 2013). It often becomes difficult for women to succeed because of the very nature of the mining culture in itself, which denies women any work-life balance (Benya, 2016; Martin & Barnard, 2013). Furthermore, in the mining industry most women are appointed in non-core areas and as such are not granted the same acceptance or power as their male counterparts (Botha & Cronje, 2015; Martin & Barnard, 2013).

Moreover, women in the mining industry do not feel that their voices are heard. On 26 August 2017, the Women Structure of the National Union of Mineworkers (NUM), embarked on a national march to the Chamber of Mines, Eskom and South African Federation of Civil Engineering Contractors, to hand over a memorandum of grievances related to transformation and women empowerment at various workplaces. They argued that gender discrimination still prevailed in the mining industry, with women comprising a mere 10.9% of the entire workforce.

According to Phumeza Mgengo (NUM Women's Structure National Secretary, 2017), in the mining industry it is common practice for the primary focus to be on production. Women are often subject to issues relating to maternity benefits (Zungu, 2011), transformational challenges (Botha, 2016), sexual harassment (Botha, 2016) and improper protective personal equipment (Botha, 2016).

Three years later, on 10 August 2020, according to an eNCA report, women were protesting in various towns in Gauteng, Mpumalanga, Limpopo and others to highlight the injustices they faced in the mining sector. The women said that they would no longer tolerate mining companies excluding them and they called for more women to be hired by mining groups.
When attempting to reach leadership positions in the mining industry, women encounter unique barriers that inhibit them from reaching these levels. However, they adopt several coping strategies to overcome the barriers they face. In the sections to follow, both the barriers and coping strategies will be discussed in detail.

2.2.1 Barriers that women experience in their quest for leadership

Research has proven that women experience unique barriers when attempting to advance in their careers. These barriers include socio-cultural influence, work-life balance and organisational support. Each of these will be discussed below.

2.2.1.1 Socio-cultural influence

Women are influenced by a host of socio-cultural expectations (Atewologun & Singh, 2010; Domingue, 2015; Kyriakidou, 2011), which may lead to gender stereotyping (Mutiso, 2012; Proches, 2013; Steyn, 2015) and discrimination (Bonebright et al., 2012; Lukaka 2013) in the workplace.

According to Ogweng (2016), key findings on competition from male counterparts and performance of women in leadership roles in non-governmental organisations indicated a strong effect, since women are constrained to behave in accordance with their stereotypes. Women are expected to be dependent, compliant, emotional, careful and prudent. This poses a challenge in a work environment that requires the opposite of its leaders. Gender stereotypes women experience often result in low self-esteem and low self-confidence (Atewologun & Singh, 2010; Proches, 2013; Steyn, 2015).

This is especially common in historically male-dominated environments such as the mining industry (Martin & Barnard, 2013). Because of these socio-cultural expectations even from an early age, women may not be encouraged to gain the necessary qualifications (Gipson et al., 2017; Proches, 2013) and experience (Hora, 2014; Moshupi, 2013; Yeager & Callahan, 2016) required to enter such male-dominated environments.

2.2.1.2 Work-life balance

Whitehead and Kotze (2003) concluded that life balance is a life process with a cyclical nature. Life balance is therefore not “one, single ultimate experience”, but a series of
individual experiences unfolding over time, which could be better described as “life-balance moments”.

Similar to Whitehead and Kotze (2003), Potgieter and Barnard (2010) suggest that work-life balance is conceptualised as a continuous, subjective and holistic valuation of satisfaction derived from multiple roles in relation to the importance to the individual at a given point in time.

Women in the workplace are uniquely challenged in balancing their work and family lives (Jaga, Bagraim, & Williams, 2013). According to Mahasha (2016), in the South African context, women in management positions face conflict between their work role and family responsibilities.

In their personal lives women assume roles such as mother, wife, daughter and sister, among others (Super, 1980). Furthermore, women serve as primary caregivers to their children and parents and they still assume domestic responsibilities in their homes, such as cooking and cleaning (Super, 1980).

Moreover, in their professional lives, in addition to their daily jobs, women assume the roles of among others mentor and coach in the workplace. In both these arenas they assume various roles and each role has specific requirements in terms of their time, energy and effort, which could result in further identity conflict (Bierema, 2016) when their gender and leadership identity collide.

2.2.1.3 Organisational support

Females who wish to tackle the above-mentioned challenges may find that they lack the necessary skills (Proches, 2013), competencies (Andersson & Tengblad, 2016; Steven Terrell & Rosenbusch, 2012) or leadership style (Proches, 2013) required to succeed in a leadership role.

This often results in low self-esteem (Brenner, Serpe & Stryker, 2018; Stets & Burke, 2014) and lack of confidence (April, Ephraim & Peters, 2012; Karp, 2012; Zulu, 2013), which leads to women not being ready to accept a developmental experience (Brenner et al., 2018; Harris & Cole, 2007; Steven Terrell & Rosenbusch, 2012) or use proactive personal strategies (April et al., 2012; McDermott, Kidney & Flood, 2010) to overcome these challenges.
Women require organisational support to overcome the barriers to leadership they face. However, they may not be sufficiently supported by their organisations (Cohen, 2019). Ellemers (2014) suggests that there are consistent gender differences in career development and payment and women who feel undervalued at work will re-evaluate their priorities and be tempted to “opt out”.

The following may prevent women from making the same career choices as men: (a) implicit bias decreases the odds that women will enter male-dominated job levels or organisations and perform well in them; (b) glass cliff effects make career development less attractive for women, (c) Queen Bee effects prevent women in leadership from acting as role models for other women, and (d) some work-family approaches imply that women have to give up family life to be successful in their professional careers (Ellemers, 2014).

Similarly, Hoobler, Lemmon and Wayne (2014) argue that some authors have explained the dearth of women leaders as an “opt-out revolution” — that women today are making a choice not to aspire to leadership positions. Furthermore, Hoobler et al. (2014) hypothesise that day-to-day managerial decisions involving allocating challenging work, training and development, and career encouragement mean women accrue less organisational development. This could be one explanation for their lower managerial aspirations.

Discourses on the above-mentioned barriers prevent women from working in mining or pursuing leadership positions (Botha & Cronje, 2015). For example, women in mining are told that mining is a man’s world, they need to work 12-hour shifts and often have to live in a different province than their families, which is not conducive to achieving work-life balance. Furthermore, organisational policies do not support their family planning goals and do not offer day-care facilities or flexible working hours (Koekemoer & Downes, 2011; Mahasha, 2016; Ogweng, 2016). The practices ultimately lead to gendered behaviour, which influences the opinions of women regarding the workplace and women in leadership (Benya, 2016; Jenkins, 2014). According to Lee (2000, cited in Benya, 2016), women are viewed as problematic biologically and emotionally. This is due to their menstruation cycles and pregnancy impacting on their performance and ultimately production and to their nurturing nature;
they are regarded as unable to cope with accidents or deaths on the mine (Benya, 2016).

Because of these “mining practices” women feel that they are not equipped to work in core areas of mining, let alone apply for leadership positions that seem to be more suitable for men who are already viewed as natural-born leaders and who do not necessarily require a higher level of work-life balance, as they are not viewed as the primary caregivers of their children (Benya, 2016; Martin & Barnard, 2013). Men also exhibit higher confidence (Parsaloi & Steyn, 2013), authority and power (Benya, 2016; Schwanke, 2013; StatsSA, 2017) and may not require the same level of organisational support as women who are viewed as nurturers. For women, to move beyond the mindset that they are not made for mining or leadership positions, they must engage in identity work to work through and counter these discourses/opinions (Benya, 2016; Jenkins, 2014). In negotiating their leadership identity, women need to navigate between often conflicting demands and tensions that construct and position their sense of identity (Benya, 2016; Jenkins, 2014).

2.2.2 Coping strategies women adopt to overcome barriers to leadership

Women in the workplace need to employ coping strategies that will both create and foster their leadership identity. The strategies can be in the form of expanding traditional worldviews, achieving work-life integration and building relationships.

2.2.2.1 Expanding traditional worldviews

Expanding traditional worldviews is particularly important for women’s leadership identity development, as these particular worldviews help women overcome many struggles that arise from their life spheres.

Personal philosophies are a form of worldviews and are defined by Adams and Crafford (2012, p. 5) as “strategies people follow to make sense of their world and cope with difficulties in their work lives”. When women enter leadership roles they enter with a gender-leader frame of reference or lens through which they view the world (Humberd, 2014). If women are unable to create suitable and positive personal philosophies, they may find it difficult to cope with and overcome socio-cultural influence (which breeds stereotypes and prejudice concerning women in a mining environment).
According to Mutiso (2012), women should be motivated to take up leadership positions by encouraging them to apply for the positions when these are available. There is also a need to educate the community on the potential of women in leadership. This would help in changing the perception of the community on female leadership.

Outdated cultural beliefs such as male chauvinism should be done away with in order to encourage more women to assume leadership positions. According to Ogweng (2016), gender competition must be strictly regulated by organisational management, to ensure that it is positive and healthy, and this should also be done by fostering collaboration as a better choice.

Similar to Ogweng (2016), Mutiso (2012) recommends that men in leadership positions should support and appreciate their female counterparts and treat them as equal partners. Kuschel and Salvaj (2018) suggest that the following organisational factors facilitate and promote female talent in senior management: formation, recruitment and hiring practices, evaluation, promotion, mentorship and sponsorship and relocation.

Moreover, the organisational culture should foster positive attitudes to women in leadership positions. Burke, Koyuncu and Fiksenbaum (2006) found that women reporting more supportive organisational experiences and practices were more engaged in their work, more satisfied in their jobs and careers, and indicated greater levels of psychological well-being.

2.2.2.2 Achieving work-life integration

Achieving work-life integration is important for women who are undergoing leadership identity development, as they are constantly faced with conflicting demands in their personal and professional lives.

Negotiating balance refers to the interplay between balancing the demands of work and personal life and denotes the strategies people use to manage the impact of their work identities (Adams & Crafford, 2012).

When female leaders enter leadership roles, if they are unable to negotiate balance through the use of strategies (such as managing boundaries and work-life integration), they may feel overwhelmed by the responsibilities associated with the various roles
they play and in turn they may experience stress, depression and burnout. When they are able to negotiate balance, they will navigate their personal and professional lives better.

Kuschel and Salvaj (2018) posit that the following individual factors have an impact on persistence and retention of women in senior management: career being viewed as an important role, time-flexibility negotiation, support from partner and extended family, delegation, focus on strategic tasks and time management.

Koekemoer and Downes (2011) suggest that the benefits of flexi-time vary from work-life balance to employee loyalty and commitment. It is therefore necessary for organisations to consider allowing women in leadership to negotiate balance through the use of flexible work policies. Similarly, in the South African context, Mahasha (2016) found that women adopt the following coping strategies: careful structuring and planning of their activities, prioritising their responsibilities and delegating some of their duties.

Moreover, women need support from spouses, families, employers, supervisors and colleagues to cope with their multiple roles. According to Mahasha (2016), in the South African context it is recommended that organisations (employers) develop policies that enable women in management positions to achieve work-life balance. Such policies may include career breaks, job sharing, flexible working arrangements and childcare policies. Similar to Mahasha (2016), Ogweng (2016) argues that organisational policies regarding work hours, roles, responsibilities and flexibilities such as part-time work schedules, among others, must be made clear to all staff, including regular refresher training on work-family balance.

2.2.2.3 Relationship building

According to Adams and Crafford (2012), relationship building is a strategy that people use to reinforce their work identities. Relationship building is key in creating and fostering leadership identity for women. This is partly due to women’s innate need to create and build meaningful relationships. It is also partly due to their leadership style, which is transformative in nature.
Moreover, women prefer to learn through experience and relationships (Kuschel & Salvaj, 2018). If women do not have relationships in the workplace, it is difficult for them to overcome leadership identity conflict.

Furthermore, development relationships often serve as an identity space that allows for the creation of leadership identity. If women do not enjoy numerous relationships in the workplace with their managers, peers and colleagues, it will be difficult for them to learn both technical and interpersonal competencies (Kuschel & Salvaj, 2018). It will also be difficult for women because they would be lacking emotional support (Mahasha, 2016).

Lastly, they would be disadvantaged, as they would not be engaging in networking (Kuschel & Salvaj, 2018). However, if women adopt relationship building and maintenance, they would be engaging in leadership identity construction both within and outside the organisation, they would gain emotional support and an array of leadership skills and expertise (Kuschel & Salvaj, 2018). They may also be able to gain confidence and apply for managerial positions they would otherwise not have considered (Kuschel & Salvaj, 2018).

2.3 IDENTITY THEORIES

IT and SIT are two similar streams that view the socially constructed self by considering the interaction between individual behaviour and social structure (Hogg et al., 1995). SIT and IT are therefore discussed further below.

2.3.1 Social identity theory

SIT is a prominent theoretical stream that aims to explain identity formation (Hogg & Ridgeway 2003; Tajfel, 1981). Self-categorisation theory (SCT) is an extension of SIT (Turner, 1987) and is therefore also discussed.

SIT has evolved throughout multiple disciplines (Stets & Burke, 2000; Stryker & Serpe, 1982). SIT views an individual’s social identity as being derived from group membership. Moreover, the foundation of identity is rooted in collective self, group and intergroup processes (Bothma, Lloyd & Khapova, 2015), in which the group is regarded as consisting of similar people (Stets & Burke, 2000). SIT assumes that by virtue of group membership, each member of the specific group holds similar views
(Bothma et al., 2015) and based on the thinking process, all members will behave in a similar manner (Stets & Burke, 2000).

SCT is considered to be an expansion of SIT. While categorisation-based differentiation (stereotyping and discrimination) between individuals is covered in SIT, SCT also expands to include the self. SCT aims to explain the phenomenon where a person, based on perceived criteria, tends to place himself or other people cognitively in the same grouping (Turner, 1987). Similarly, in support of the old adage that birds of a feather flock together, McPherson, Smith-Lovin and Cook (2001) posit that similarity breeds connection and this principle — the homophily principle — structures network ties of every type, including marriage, friendship, work, and advice. SCT posits that as a result of social categorisation, individuals within groups are motivated to perceive, think, feel and behave as group members (Abrams & Hogg, 2004). According to Bothma et al. (2015), members of the in-group adopt the norms, beliefs and behaviours of that group, while they distance themselves from the norms, beliefs and behaviour of out-groups. Individuals strive to become members of higher social groups while behaving in a discriminating and even hostile manner towards perceived lower groups.

Haslam and Turner (2014) applied social identity and self-categorisation theories to leadership. The authors identified among others the following core lessons for the application of the social identity approach in the organisational context: groups and social identities matter because they have a critical role to play in organisational and health outcomes and self-categorisations matter because it is people’s self-understanding in a given context that shapes their psychology and behaviour (Haslam & Turner, 2014). This notion about the self is supported by other researchers (Berkman, Glass, Brissette, & Seeman, 2000; Hogg, 2001).

Although the SIT stream has been useful in explaining identity formation, it has not been able to account for the effect that social structures have on identity and how identity influences social behaviour or how the internal dynamics of the self may affect social behaviour (Bothma et al., 2015). IT, on the other hand, explains the effect that social structures and the internal dynamics of the self, have on identity, as well as how these affect social behaviour.
2.3.2 Identity theory

According to Stets and Serpe (2013), an identity is defined as “a shared set of meanings that define individuals in particular roles in society (for example, mother, daughter, spouse role identity), as members of specific groups in society (for example, a church, baking or cooking club group identity), and as persons having specific characteristics that make them unique from others (for example, a creative or caring person identity). At any given point in time people have many identities (Burke, 2003; James, 1890).

The structure of identity can be thought of as consisting of three main components, namely identity bases, identity salience and identity hierarchy. Each of these will be explained below.

2.3.2.1 Bases of identity

IT has identified three bases of identity: role, group and person identities. This is important, as it helps us to view the individual as part of a social structure while simultaneously recognising an individual’s uniqueness.

A role refers to “shared expectations attached to social positions in society” (Stets & Serpe, 2013, p. 38). Examples of the roles that women assume in society include parent, daughter and wife, among others. According to Stets and Serpe (2013, p. 38), role identity is defined as “a set of internalised meanings associated with a role”. From the earliest era people have defined themselves according to the roles they assume.

According to Stets and Serpe (2013, p. 38), “group identities are those meanings that emerge in interaction with a specific set of others like our family, work group or clubs.” While group identities derive from how an individual chooses to define himself or herself, social identities refer to the meanings that an individual derives from automatically being part of a certain social category by virtue of existence (Hogg & Abrams, 1988). Examples of social identity include those elements that are linked to genetics, such as race and gender, and how society classifies these groupings.

Person identities have been defined by Burke and Stets (2009) as meanings that differentiate the person as a unique individual. Examples of person identities include defining people according to traits or qualities they display, such as caring, studious, ethical, and hardworking.
It is important to point out that the bases of identity often overlap and cannot be separated easily in particular situations (Stets & Serpe, 2013).

2.3.2.2 Identity salience

Given that women possess multiple identities, it is of interest to know which ones they will display in a given situation. The term identity salience refers to the likelihood that one will invoke a specific identity across situations (Stryker, 2002). The more salient an identity, the more likely that it will be brought into varying situations through varying responses. The relative level of identity salience across a set of identities makes up the identity salience hierarchy (Serpe, 1987; Stryker, 2002). For identities that have higher salience, individuals may actively seek out opportunities to introduce that identity. For example, if a woman is giving a presentation at a professional organisation, and the presentation does not focus on issues related to the family, the person may work into her presentation the fact that she has become a mother for the first time, invoking the mother identity in the context of the professional identity. This demonstrates that her mother identity is salient in her hierarchy of identities. The greater the commitment to an identity, the greater the identity salience (Serpe, 1987; Stryker, 2002; Stryker & Serpe, 1994). Commitment to an identity may be fostered through building relationships, broadening experiences and investing time, energy and effort in identities (Stets & Serpe, 2013).

2.3.2.3 Identity prominence

Identity centrality is a term used to describe identities in relation to their importance to an individual (Rosenberg, 1979). The terms centrality and prominence have been used interchangeably. An identity ranking based on prominence represents the importance of the identity to individuals and characterises their desires and values, and how they want others to see them (McCall & Simmons, 1978). The more prominent an identity, the more it will be invoked in a situation (Stets & Serpe, 2013). For example, a female manager may consider herself a mentor to other women. As such, being viewed as a supporter and guide may be very important to her. Therefore, she may want to be seen as a coach or mentor. Knowing this, she will be motivated to display behaviour that depicts what a mentor should do or say.
2.4 PROCESSES OF IDENTITY

Pertinent to the process of identity construction are identity formation, identity verification, identity assimilation, accommodation, and evaluation.

2.4.1 Identity formation

According to Bothma et al. (2015), the identity formation process involves sub-processes that address (i) criteria, (ii) identity activation and (iii) resulting behaviour.

![Diagram of identity formation process](image)

**Figure 2.1: Identity formation process (Bothma et al., 2015)**

Figure 2.1 depicts the identity formation process as proposed by Bothma et al. (2015). The three sub-processes, (i) criteria, (ii) identity activation and (iii) resulting behaviour, will be explained below.

**Criteria** are meanings, norms, expectations, beliefs and core values derived from specific social and role foci. These are cognitively stored in the self as prototypes (according to SIT) and identity standards (from an IT perspective), hierarchically in order of importance, ready to serve as behaviour guides. In SIT, the prototype is the category membership that individuals use as the category standard to compare themselves with (Burke & Stets, 2009). In IT the identity standard refers to criteria that individuals associate with their identities.

**Identity activation** occurs in response to a particular event or situation that challenges the prototype or identity standard. Prototypes or identity standards are activated through categorisation in reaction to a particular event to guide perceptions, self-conception and behaviour. In reaction to the social event and its content, new prototypes are formed, and existing ones are modified (Hogg, 2001).
The resulting behaviours for SIT focus more on cognitive outcomes, while IT focuses more on behavioural outcomes. When activating an identity, there are certain cognitive outcomes that become active. For SIT, the core cognitive process is depersonalisation and the motivational process is self-esteem (Stets & Burke, 2000). For IT, the core cognitive process is self-verification and the motivational process is self-efficacy (Stets & Burke, 2000).

2.4.2 Identity verification

A central process in IT is identity verification. Identity verification implies individuals perceiving that others see them in a situation in the same way they see themselves, thus their identity is verified through others (Burke & Stets, 2009; Stets & Serpe, 2014). This is important for leadership identity, because in order for a female to develop her leadership identity she must view herself and be viewed by others as a leader (Day & Harrison, 2007). According to Burke and Stets (2009), identity verification occurs as a result of a feedback loop with five components: identity standard, perceptual input, comparator, emotion and output.

![Figure 2.2: The identity verification feedback loop (Burke & Stets, 2009)]
The identity verification feedback loop and its five components are depicted in Figure 2.2 above. When an identity is activated in a situation, a feedback loop is established according to the perceptual control model. This loop has five major components, and each will be described below by way of example.

**The identity standard** refers to criteria that individuals associate with their identities. For example, female leaders may include authenticity in their identity standard, which means that at their core they will want to remain ethical and genuine.

**Perceptual input** refers to how female leaders perceive a situation that challenges either their ethics or authenticity, how they view themselves as a result in the situation, as well as the feedback that they receive from others.

**A comparator** is a process that compares the perceptual input meanings with the identity standard meanings. For example, the female leader may think of herself as an ethical or genuine leader and this view is also held by her subordinates, team members and peers.

**Emotion** refers to the leader’s response after making a comparison. A correspondence in meanings between the identity standard and perceptual input results in positive emotion, while non-correspondence in meanings results in negative emotions.

**Output** refers to the environment in the form of behaviour that carries meaning. The female leader may continue displaying the same behaviour. However, if the leader experiences negative emotion, she may change her behaviour and perceptual input according to her standards.

As individuals we assume multiple role, group and personal identities and any of these may be activated at any point in time based on a situation that triggers meanings (Deaux, 1992; Stets, 1995; Stets & Serpe, 2014). For example, for female leaders a mother identity and a leader identity may emerge in a situation, as they both share meanings of nurturing, care and transformational leadership. Therefore, enacting the mother identity facilitates the expression of a leader identity. More generally, multiple identities are conceptualised within the self as organised into hierarchies of salience (Stryker, [1980] 2002), centrality or prominence (McCall & Simmons, 1978), and levels of control (Burke & Stets, 2009).
2.4.3 Identity assimilation, accommodation and evaluation

Identity process theory involves the processes of identity assimilation (maintaining self-consistency), identity accommodation (making changes in the self), and identity balance (maintaining a sense of self but changing when necessary) (Piaget, 1975; Sneed & Whitbourne, 2003).

The major tenets of Piaget’s cognitive development theory are the process of coming to know and the stages we move through as we gradually acquire this ability. Initially a child is granted reflexes at birth to adapt to the environment and over time these reflexes are quickly replaced with constructed schemes. According to Piaget (1975), one must strive to achieve a balance between one’s schemes and the environment in a quest to adapt to the environment.

Piaget described three processes used by an individual in an attempt to adapt to the environment: assimilation, accommodation and evaluation. Each will be described in detail below.

**Assimilation** is the process of using or transforming the environment so that it can be placed in pre-existing cognitive structures (Piaget, 1975). An example of assimilation in the workplace may be when women create LDCs to match their leadership identity by forming an identity space inclusive of coaching, mentorship and forums. It can also happen when a female leader believes that open and honest relationships with employees are important and she may then institute an “open-door policy” to encourage employees to feel free to share thoughts, concerns and ideas with her. Therefore, assimilation may be viewed as a change in the physical environment itself, as well as the ergonomics.

**Accommodation** is the process of changing cognitive structures in order to accept something from the environment (Piaget, 1975). An example of accommodation is the way in which women transform their mindset after receiving signals from the environment. A manager may provide a female with critical feedback and in order for her to advance in her career she must accept the feedback and take the necessary steps to develop the necessary intrapersonal and interpersonal competencies. Therefore, accommodation may be viewed as a transformation in the mindset of a person as a result of a stimulus in the environment.
**Evaluation** consists of allocating value to particular identity content and establishing subjective indices of worth for potential additions to identity (Breakwell, 1983).

Identity correspondence may occur where the environment and schemas align. When identity-discrepant experiences occur, these are first processed through identity assimilation. For example, in an attempt to develop her leadership identity, the female leader may surround herself with mentors and coaches and she may still not yield positive results. After numerous attempts at success and being constantly faced with failure, the female leader may decide that she must do more identity work. Only when identity assimilation fails is identity accommodation utilised. In the example above the female leader may then begin an internal process of self-discovery, self-reflection and acceptance of feedback.

Assimilation and accommodation processes are used simultaneously and alternatively throughout life. As schemas become more complex, they are termed structures and in turn, as structures become more complex, they are organised in a hierarchical manner.

**2.5 INTEGRATION OF SOCIAL IDENTITY THEORY AND IDENTITY THEORY**

Both SIT and IT streams provide a link through identities, between social structures, processes and the self (Brewer & Roccas, 2001). In both SIT and IT, the self is reflexive in that it views itself as an object. As such, the self categorises, classifies or names itself in particular ways in relation to other social categories or classifications.

Hogg et al. (1995) suggest that although there are similar perspectives in IT and SIT, they occupy parallel but separate universes. The streams differ in terms of level of analysis, the role of intergroup behaviour, the relationship between roles and groups, and salience of social context and identity. These differences may be attributed to the psychological roots of SIT and the microsocial roots of IT. As such, each stream has differing application opportunities. Therefore, it may be inadvisable to integrate these different theories. Table 2.1 below is adapted from Deaux and Burke (2010) and summarises the critique of SIT and IT by Hogg et al. (1995).
Table 2.1: Integration of social identity theory and identity theory

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Social identity theory</th>
<th>Identity theory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Level of analysis</td>
<td>Considers socio-cognitive processes of individuals</td>
<td>Considers the connection between the individual and the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>broader society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intergroup behaviour</td>
<td>Focusses on the processes related to the group as well as</td>
<td>Focusses on roles an individual assumes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>intergroup</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship of groups and</td>
<td>Ignores roles within the group</td>
<td>Views roles as pertinent to the identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>roles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salience of social contexts</td>
<td>Emphasises the impact of social context on identities</td>
<td>Views identities as stable across contexts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

However, Stets and Burke (2000) posit that SIT and IT have much more in common than Hogg et al. (1995) suggested. Furthermore, integration of the streams is not only possible, but also necessary. Moreover, they argue that all identities work in a similar manner, but depending on the bases (role, group/category or person) of identity, the consequences may differ; by viewing the development of identities as bases, they suggest that integration of the two streams is possible (Deaux & Burke, 2010).

For each of the bases of identity, the verification process differs and as such the resulting self-esteem outcomes differ accordingly. Taking the above into account, I have summarised the bases of identity according to the verification process and resultant self-esteem outcomes as adapted from the work of Brenner et al. (2018) and Stets and Burke (2014). This summary is presented in Table 2.2 on the next page.

Bothma et al. (2015) assert that individuals are tied organically through social identities to their groups and mechanically within their groups through their role identities. An illustration of how these theories may be used in conjunction is evident when considering the role of a female manager. The female manager may attach specific meaning to being female; the same female leader will also attach meaning to performing the leadership role that she assumes.

As can be viewed in the argument above, identity theories matter, as they have important applications for individuals, organisations and society as a whole. Moreover, identity theories can be applied to the leadership context. As such, it is important to
understand how female leadership identity is developed in order to elicit leadership identity construction in organisations. In applying identity theories to leadership, it is valuable to note that leadership refers to a work or role identity.

Table 2.2 Summary of bases of identity, verification processes, outcomes, self-esteem dimensions and examples.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Group identity</th>
<th>Role identity</th>
<th>Person identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Definition</strong></td>
<td>A set of meanings that a person claims given his or her category and group membership.</td>
<td>A set of meanings individuals attribute to themselves while taking on a role that is attached to a position in society.</td>
<td>The set of meanings people claim as individuals that sets them apart from others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Verification process</strong></td>
<td>Members help maintain the principles and distinctions of the group and they maintain the distinctions and separations from other groups.</td>
<td>Fulfilling the expectations and standards of a role, which in turn allows the occupants of counter-roles to carry out their duties and obligations.</td>
<td>Occurs when one’s true self is revealed and verified in a situation (includes aspects such as morals, values etc).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcome</strong></td>
<td>An individual receives recognition, approval, and a sense of value and acceptance from other group members.</td>
<td>Roles require specific performances to meet the expectations of the position. Increases feelings of competence when performance standards are met.</td>
<td>Allows people to be who they truly are as individuals and to feel as if their “real” selves are acknowledged.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self-esteem dimension improved</strong></td>
<td>Self-worth</td>
<td>Self-efficacy</td>
<td>Authenticity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Example</strong></td>
<td>A female may be a member of a women’s network and as such may attach meanings to holding such membership. Owing to her membership she may feel a sense of purpose and acceptance.</td>
<td>A female may assume a management role in an organisation and as such may have to deliver certain outputs. She may gain rewards and recognition as a result of performing her role.</td>
<td>A female may be considered an informal leader and as such may attach meaning to being considered a leader; she may exhibit characteristics aligned to being an authentic leader.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.6 NATURE AND IMPORTANCE OF WORK/ROLE IDENTITY

Work identity refers to how an employee defines himself/herself in the workplace and focusses on who a person is at work (Adams & Crafford, 2012; Alvesson, 2001; Kirpal, 2004; Sveningson & Alvesson, 2003). Furthermore, according to Smith, Crafford and Schurink (2015), work identity involves the following components: daily tasks, social and relational elements and exploring alternative paths.

Work identity may be viewed as the product of both personal and social identities (Adams & Crafford, 2012; Ashmore, Deaux & McLaughlin-Volpe, 2004; Hogg et al., 1995). In both spheres women are expected to fulfill a number of roles and each has its own expectations and demands; this may lead to a feeling of incongruence or congruence.

If there is congruence between their work and personal lives, women may experience positive outcomes. For example, much like a self-fulfilling prophesy, the more congruence, the higher people’s confidence in their ability to perform a role, the more they will value that role, increasing the likelihood of role performance and, back to the beginning, increasing confidence in their ability to perform the role.

Because women enact their identities, if there is no congruence between person and work role identities (such as leadership) they experience discomfort (identity threat) and this can affect self-esteem (Brenner et al., 2018; Stets & Burke, 2014). Therefore, a threatened identity seems to be concerned with conflict between different personal needs and also, as often happens, between personal needs and social expectations (Brygola, 2011).

In an attempt to reduce the discomfort, an individual may engage in identity work such as negotiating identity. According to Saayman and Crafford (2011), negotiating identity often involves resolving tensions between personal and social identities (and their associated responsibilities and limitations).

Identity can be linked with organisational commitment (Walsh & Gordon, 2008), loyalty (Walsh & Gordon, 2008), the display of more cooperative and supportive behaviour (Walsh & Gordon, 2008), employee engagement and productivity (Adams & Crafford, 2012).
2.7 LEADERSHIP IDENTITY AS A WORK ROLE IDENTITY

Identity is gained through knowing, doing and being (Snook, Ibarra & Ramo, 2010; Yeager & Callahan, 2016). Leadership identity is a form of work role identity, as it relates to who a person is at work and is a product of a combination of social and personal roles. Leader identity is defined as the “sub-component of one's identity that relates to being a leader or how one thinks of oneself as a leader” (Day & Harrison, 2007, p. 365), while leadership identity is the process of coming to see oneself as a leader and being recognised as such (Ely et al., 2011). Furthermore, a person’s efforts to lead are recognised and validated by others (Ely et al., 2011).

Constructing a leadership identity is important, because it improves the likelihood that an individual will undergo development opportunities, gain leadership experience and leadership expertise and pursue and retain leadership or managerial positions (Day & Harrison, 2007; Lord & Hall, 2005).

A woman’s construction of her identity in relation to her leadership may have important implications for how she takes on, and sees herself within, the organisational leadership role and ultimately how others view her as a leader. Women may experience difficulties in creating a leadership identity owing to conflicting gender norms and leadership characteristics (Ely et al., 2011; Sugiyama et al., 2016). Therefore, female managers must successfully navigate between their social (e.g. gender) and work role (e.g., leader) identities (Sims et al., 2016; Sugiyama et al., 2016).

The benefits of the creation of a leadership identity include higher satisfaction and lower burnout (Swensen et al., 2016), more leadership development experience (Day & Harrison, 2007), greater self-confidence and self-efficacy (Dahvig & Longman, 2016); expanded thinking (Ligon et al., 2011), networking and career advancement (Harris & Leberman, 2012; Knipfer et al., 2017).

There has been limited empirical research showing what leader identity looks like in an individual’s experience (Humberd, 2014). According to Humberd (2014), women leaders’ identity consists of five key dimensions, namely subjective certainty, identity aspirations, perceived credibility, efficacy and authenticity as developing leaders. Each of these core dimensions are discussed below.
Subjective certainty refers to a core element of identity and considers how sure an individual is of a particular identity.

Identity aspirations suggest that how we view our current selves in terms of identity is in part derived from how we view our future selves and the extent to which we feel that we are able to achieve those desires.

Credibility is a key dimension of leadership identity, as it is used as a form of validation in which others also confirm identity claims in a particular context.

Efficacy is a strong belief that individuals have regarding their own internal capabilities.

Authenticity refers to the degree to which an individual acts in a manner that is aligned to his or her true self.

Leadership identity development is not simply the result of traditional training programmes; rather it is the result of multiple well-coordinated efforts aimed at developing individuals (Dalakoura, 2010; Mpehle & Kanjere, 2013) such as in an LDC.

Leadership identity develops through interaction between an individual (personal identity) and specific social or work-related identity (Bothma & Roodt, 2012). Given the importance of the creation of a leadership identity, it is important to understand how female managers construct their leadership identity. Next, I will provide an overview of the development of leadership identity.

2.8 DEVELOPMENT OF A LEADERSHIP IDENTITY

There has been limited research depicting the identity work that women in an LDC undergo in order to create a leadership identity. However, the leadership identity development model as proposed by Komives et al. (2005) presents a valuable framework for understanding how individual college students develop the social identity of being collaborative, relational leaders interdependently engaging in leadership as a group process (Lucas, Komives & McMahon, 1998; 2007).

According to Komives et al. (2005), the leadership identity development process consists of five stages. Each will be briefly discussed below.

- Awareness (Stage One): becoming aware that there are leaders “out there” who are external to the self;
• Exploration/engagement (Stage Two): a period of immersion in group experiences, usually to make friends; a time of learning to engage with others;

• Leader identified (Stage Three): viewing leadership as the actions of the positional leader of a group; an awareness of the hierarchical nature of relationships in groups;

• Leadership differentiated (Stage Four): viewing leadership also as non-positional and as a shared group process;

• Generativity (Stage Five): a commitment to developing leadership in others and having a passion for issues or group objectives that the person wants to influence; and,

• Integration/synthesis (Stage Six): acknowledging the personal capacity for leadership in diverse contexts and claiming an identity as a leader without having to hold a positional role (Komives et al., 2005).

2.9 CONCLUSION
In this chapter I explored the phenomenon of women's leadership identity construction. I first examined the barriers that shape leadership identity for women and the coping strategies they adopt in the workplace. Thereafter, I considered the importance of identity theories in leadership, specifically SIT and IT. Then I considered key processes of identity, such as identity formation, identity verification, identity assimilation, accommodation and evaluation. Lastly, leadership identity development was explored by considering the content of leadership identity, as well as the development of leadership identity.
CHAPTER 3

ARTICLE

WOMEN IN A LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT CONSTRUCTING A LEADERSHIP IDENTITY

ABSTRACT

Orientation – Female managers in the mining industry face specific barriers and the nature of these have an impact on their leadership identity construction.

Research purpose – To explore the identity work of female managers working in a leadership development context in the mining industry, to determine how they construct a leadership identity.

Motivation for the study – To enhance gender equity in the mining industry; an understanding of female managers’ leadership identity construction in such a context is beneficial. This will enable developmental strategies geared towards women who pursue management roles in the mining industry.

Research design, approach and method – This exploratory, descriptive qualitative study was conducted from a hermeneutic phenomenological perspective and is philosophically rooted in social constructivism and critical realism. A purposive sample consisting of five female managers working in a mining company was used. Semi-structured interviews were conducted, and data were analysed using the phenomenological hermeneutical method.

Main findings – The findings indicate that there are four core identity bases influencing how female managers in a leadership development context create a leadership identity. There are also four identity work strategies that are used to counter the effects of the identity bases.

Practical/managerial implications – The Women’s Leadership Identity Development Model proposed may guide organisations in developing and implementing effective identity work strategies to overcome the identity tensions that female managers in the mining industry encounter.

Contribution/value-adding – This study contributes to the knowledge base concerning female leadership in the mining industry in South Africa.

Key words: identity work, leadership development context, leadership identity, women in leadership
3.1 INTRODUCTION

Despite a remarkable increase in the number of women in the workplace, their representation in leadership roles remains limited (Schwanke, 2013; Teasdale, Fagan, & Shepherd, 2012; Yousaf & Schmiede, 2016). This global challenge is also evident in South Africa, despite its notable gender equity policy framework (Matsaba, 2011; Moalusi & Jones, 2019). Under-representation of women in leadership is especially prevalent in historically male-dominant professions and environments such as the mining industry (Botha, 2017; Martin & Barnard, 2013).

Women’s lagging hierarchical career progression have been variously attributed to a combination of personal and professional barriers (Maseko & Proches, 2013; Parsaloi & Steyn, 2013). In the work context women face a host of hampering inter-personal experiences, such as bullying (Okurame, 2013), discrimination (Bryant-Anderson & Roby, 2012) and sexual harassment (Berdahl & Moore, 2006). In her personal life, a woman experiences gender and cultural stereotyping (Chiloane-Tsoka, 2010; Kubu, 2018; Maseko & Proches, 2013) and she is more exposed to physical and emotional abuse than men (Hooker, Theobald, Anderson, Billet, & Baron, 2017). Women are said to be uniquely pre-dispositioned to work-life conflict while attempting to balance their personal and professional responsibilities (Bierema, 2016; Booysen, 2007; Women in Leadership, Chartered Management Institute and Women in Management, 2013). Personal responsibilities stem from traditional gender stereotypical roles through which women are regarded as being the primary caregivers to their children and parents, ensuring that their households are run and catering to their spouses’ needs (Franks, Schurink & Fourie, 2006; O’Neil, Hopkins, & Bilimoria, 2015).

On the intra-personal front women’s unsatisfactory progress into leadership has been attributed to lack of confidence (Parsaloi & Steyn, 2013), self-esteem (Mugweni, 2014) and the required leadership skills and abilities (De la Rey, Jankelowitz, & Suffla, 2003). Leadership development has therefore become a key strategy to address women’s leadership representation and success, because it fosters the necessary leadership skills (Black & Earnest, 2009; McKenzie, 2018; Shera & Murray, 2016; Sugiyama, Cavanagh, van Esch, Bilimoria & Brown, 2016) and abilities (De la Rey et al., 2003; Mitchiner, 2000), and triggers the creation of a leadership identity (Moorosi, 2014).
The leadership identity development process for women in the work context differs substantially from that of their male counterparts (Komives et al., 2009; Kyriakidou, 2011). Women face unique challenges in their career trajectories and require a particularly supportive leadership development context (LDC) (Bonebright, Cottledge, & Lonnquist, 2012; Lovell, 2013; Mpehle & Kanjere, 2013). Some women actively seek developmental feedback and criticism, yet others may not be ready to encounter a developmental experience (Gibson, 2008; Gipson, Pfaff, Mendelsohn, Catenacci, & Burke, 2017; Karp, 2012; Zheng & Muir, 2015). In an attempt to attain balance in their work and family lives, some women may also choose to lose, change or transform their identity in the leadership identity development process in order to satisfy family, friends, work colleagues and managers (Alvesson & Gabriel, 2016; Collay, 2014; Ely, Ibarra & Kolb, 2011; Kapasi, Sang & Sitko, 2016; Skinner, 2014; Yoonkyeong, 2003; Zheng & Muir, 2015).

It is pertinent that women are both empowered and supported to conquer their predispositions in order to build the resilience required to establish a leadership identity (Barkdull, 2009; Clerkin & Ruderman, 2016; Davis & Maldonado, 2015). Organisations have a role to play in acknowledging the unique challenges that each woman faces and have a responsibility to offer LDCs (including training, networking and mentorship opportunities) that address the specific barriers they face (Mpehle & Kanjere, 2013; Swensen, Gorringe, Caviness, & Peters, 2016). This study therefore focuses on women’s experiences in an LDC, specifically in relation to developing a leadership identity.

3.2 RESEARCH PURPOSE AND VALUE

Research on women in the South African workplace focusses predominantly on barriers and challenges (Chiloane-Tsoka, 2010; Steyn, 2015; Mpehle & Kanjere, 2008), describing their unique leadership styles (Kessler, 2014; Maseko & Proches, 2013), attitudes and values (Gouws & Kotze, 2007; Jowah, 2014). Very few studies have explored the identity work that women perform (Ely et al., 2011; Kapasi et al., 2016; Yoonkyeong, 2003). In the South African context, a qualitative approach to the identity work that women in an LDC perform contributes to understanding female advancement in leadership roles (Booysen & Nkomo, 2010; Moorosi, 2014).
This study explores how women in a historically male-dominated organisation perform identity work in order to create a unique leadership identity. The study considers the stories of female leaders and their journey to becoming successful in the organisation embedded within the mining industry.

I begin this article by explaining the conceptual framework that guided my study, then I discuss my research design and research methods. Thereafter I delve into the findings of my study and conclude with limitations and recommendations.

3.3 IDENTITY THEORIES AND LEADERSHIP IDENTITY

Social identity theory (SIT) and identity theory (IT) are two parallel streams that focus on the socially constructed self by studying the interaction between social structure and individual behaviour (Hogg, Terry & White, 1995). Different processes of identity construction flow from an understanding of SIT and IT.

3.3.1 Social identity theories

SIT is regarded as a prominent theoretical stream that explains identity formation and its key tenet is that an individual's social identity is derived from group membership (Hogg & Ridgeway, 2003; Tajfel, 1981). SIT posits that by virtue of group membership, members of the same group will think (Bothma, Lloyd & Khapova, 2015) and act (Stets & Burke, 2000) similarly. Self-categorisation theory is an extension of SIT and posits that because of group membership, members are motivated to think, feel and behave as group members (Abrams & Hogg, 2004). Bothma et al. (2015) state that while members of the in-group think, feel and behave as group members, they distance themselves from members of out-groups and may even behave in a hostile manner towards them.

3.3.2 Identity theory

Stets and Burke (2014, p. 412) define identity as “a shared set of meanings that define individuals in particular roles in society, as members of specific groups in society and as persons having specific characteristics that make them unique from others. These role, social and person classifications of the self are referred to as bases of identity (Stets & Burke, 2014). According to James (1890), people have many identities at any given point in time, which they value and enact to differing levels. The level of importance of a particular identity is determined by the principles of identity salience
and identity prominence. Identity salience refers to the likelihood that an individual will invoke a specific identity across situations (Stryker, 2002). Identity prominence refers to the importance of the identity to individuals and characterises their desires and values and how they want others to view them (McCall & Simmons, 1978).

3.3.3 Processes of identity construction

Key processes central to identity construction are identity formation, identity verification, identity assimilation, identity accommodation and identity evaluation.

3.3.3.1 Identity formation

According to Bothma et al. (2015), the identity formation process involves subprocesses that include criteria, identity activation and resulting behaviour.

Criteria are meanings, norms, expectations, beliefs and core values derived from specific social and role foci. These are stored as prototypes (SIT) and identity standards (IT). Identity activation is triggered by a particular event, which challenges the prototype or identity standard. Resulting outcomes may be either cognitive (SIT) or behavioural (IT).

3.3.3.2 Identity verification

Identity verification is key to sustaining an identity, as it refers to the degree to which individuals perceive themselves as others perceive them in a given situation (Burke & Stets, 2009: Stets & Serpe, 2014).

3.3.3.3 Identity assimilation and accommodation

According to Piaget (1975), individuals use two processes to integrate with their environment: assimilation and accommodation.

While assimilation is the process of using or transforming the environment so that it can be placed in pre-existing cognitive structures, accommodation is the process of changing the cognitive structures in order to accept something from the environment (Piaget, 1975).

3.3.3.4 Identity evaluation

After an identity has been formed, verified and either assimilated or accommodated, it constantly goes through a process of identity evaluation. According to Breakwell
(1983), identity evaluation consists of allocating value to particular content and establishing subjective indices of worth for potential additions to identity.

### 3.3.4 Leadership identity

Empirical research showing what leader identity looks like in an individual’s experience is limited (Humberd, 2014). According to Humberd (2014), women’s leader identity consists of five key dimensions: subjective certainty, identity aspirations, perceived credibility, efficacy and authenticity as developing leaders. Subjective certainty is a central part of identity that considers a woman’s certainty of a leader identity. Identity aspirations on the other hand suggest that how females view their leader identities currently is derived in part from how they view their future leader identities and their beliefs in their abilities to achieve those aspirations. Credibility is a core dimension of female leaders identity which serves as validation as others also confirm female leaders identity claims in a leadership context. Efficacy is a core component of female leader identity and refers to a strong belief that females have regarding their own internal capabilities. Authenticity is the degree to which women behave in a manner that is aligned to their true selves.

Leadership identity is important, as it involves a process of viewing oneself and being viewed by others as a leader (DeRue, 2010). Grøn, Bro and Andersen (2019) found that managers need to think like leaders if their subordinates and team members are to follow them. Furthermore, the more one believes and views oneself as a leader, the more one will seek leadership development experiences (Day & Harrison, 2007).

It is often difficult for women to create a leadership identity, as men inherently have certain traits that make it easier for them to assume leadership positions in the first place. According to Epitropaki (2018), personality traits such as dominance characterise people who are attracted to leadership positions. Feingold (1994) posits that males were found to be more assertive and had slightly higher self-esteem than females.

Furthermore, cultural prescriptions make it difficult for women to construct a leadership identity. Ibarra and Petriglieri (2016) introduce the term ‘impossible selves’ to describe cultural prescriptions for leadership identity and behaviour that many junior women have found unattainable. Similar to Epitropaki (2018), Ibarra and Petriglieri (2016) found that cultural prescriptions for a leader’s identity were associated with a
traditionally masculine demeanour. Ibarra and Petriglieri (2016) argued that second
generation gender bias — cultural beliefs about gender, as well as workplace
structures, practices, and patterns of interaction that inadvertently favour men —
inhibited women from engaging in leadership image and identity work that would align
them with these cultural prescriptions.

Leadership development is linked to and important for developing a leadership identity,
as leadership development requires re-creation of identity (Davis, Levy & Parco, 2016;
Grøn et al., 2019; Humberd, 2014; Ibarra, et al., 2010). Identity work is central to
women’s leadership identity construction. According to Ibarra and Petriglieri (2016)
women engage in image and identity work to craft a leader identity that allows them to
feel authentic and avoid disapproval from clients and colleagues. Women’s efforts to
remain authentic, however, undermine their ability to craft identities that are congruent
with the kind of professional they aspire to become.

According to Campbell, Shollen, Egan, and Neilson (2019), leader identity is a
construct located across space, time, and people. Therefore, organisations should
foster the creation of a leadership identity in women through LDCs that include
leadership assessment, training and development programmes (Davis et al., 2016;
Epitropaki, 2018).

3.4 RESEARCH DESIGN

A research design refers to the strategy that is employed to combine various elements
of a study in a coherent and logical way (De Vaus, 2001). This is done to ensure that
the researcher addresses the research problem. Therefore, the research problem
essentially determines the type of research design to use and the data collection
methods and analysis. In this section I describe the research design I used in this
study in order to understand how women in an LDC construct a leadership identity. I
first discuss my research approach, aligned to my ontological and epistemological
viewpoint. Thereafter I explain the research strategy and data collection methods
employed in my study. I then discuss the data analysis method I chose to analyse the
data. Furthermore, I discuss the importance of assuring quality and the strategies I
applied to achieve this. Lastly, I explain how I reported the data I gathered.
3.4.1 Research approach

This study employed a hermeneutic phenomenological approach. Hermeneutic phenomenology is appropriate to the ontology and epistemology espoused in this study. From an ontological stance, the research was conducted in a manner consistent with critical realism. I believe that the nature of reality is based on power and identity struggles, privilege or oppression as experienced by women in the study, as well as the agency they exhibit to overcome these struggles (Fleetwood, 2005; Lincoln, Lynham, Guba, 2011). Critical realism does not view agency and structure as polar opposites; rather, both have an impact on an individual's life (Fleetwood, 2005; Fletcher, 2017; Schiller, 2016). The main assumptions of critical realism consider both culture and power struggles in an attempt to understand the historical, social and political macro-contexts (Fleetwood, 2005; Fletcher, 2017; Schiller, 2016). Furthermore, critical realism focuses on achieving social justice and equality (Fleetwood, 2005; Fletcher, 2017; Schiller, 2016).

From an epistemological stance, the research was conducted in a manner consistent with social constructivism. As my belief is that reality is co-constructed between the researcher and the researched and shaped by individual experiences (Kafle, 2011; Lincoln et al., 2011; Reiners, 2012). Hermeneutic phenomenology is commensurate with a social constructivist orientation, as it is concerned with understanding how the world is experienced by the subjects through their life world stories and it acknowledges meaning making between researcher and researched (Kafle, 2011; Reiners, 2012).

3.4.2 Research strategy

The leadership identity work of women in a mining company was accessed through semi-structured interviews. Because of the nature of the study, the unit of analysis in this study was the individual, namely female managers working in a mining company. Phenomenological hermeneutic data analysis ensued and involved gaining a naïve understanding of the text, compiling themes through structural analysis and constantly comparing the theme construction to the initial naïve reading. Thereafter, the researcher reflected on the naïve reading, the resulting themes from the structural analysis and relevant literature. Once this process had been completed,
comprehensive understanding of the research phenomenon was gained (Lindseth & Norberg, 2004).

3.4.3 Research method

In this section, a discussion on the techniques and procedures I used to conduct my study follows.

Research setting

The women selected for the study are managers in the same mining company. However, they have different fields of specialisation, and they function on different levels of management. They also have different intrapersonal and interpersonal needs and as such they are exposed to various leadership activities. This mining company offers an LDC, which is a context fostering specific developmental activities aimed at leadership development. The women’s leadership development needs for current and future roles are usually discussed with their manager and are then put on their individual development plan for the year, which is reviewed yearly. The process is governed by the guidelines for the nomination, approval, administration and payment of courses and seminars document. Activities the managers may be exposed to include in-house courses aimed at improving soft skills and external courses provided by universities, including first-line management and the management development programme. At the discretion of management, women are also able to attend seminars, workshops and conferences. The company furthermore provides formal mentorship for a period of 12-18 months to women who have been nominated by the succession planning committee, based on their performance and potential. The succession planning committee consists of line managers and the talent manager.

Entrée and establishing researcher roles

As I was employed by the company, permission was obtained from the group manager responsible for leadership development to conduct the study on women who engaged in the LDC. The group manager suggested potential research participants and I identified other suitable participants while being immersed in the research setting. Participants were contacted via e-mail. The context and purpose of the study were clearly explained to all the research participants who willingly signed a detailed consent form outlining all relevant parameters of the study and ultimately indicating
their willingness to participate. Please refer to Appendix A for a sample of the informed consent form. Voluntary participation was requested, and confidentiality of participation was ensured. Prior to conducting the study, I applied for and was granted ethical clearance by the UNISA research ethics review committee. The reference number is 2017_CEMS/IOP_016 (see Appendix C).

**Sampling**

The sampling strategy selected was that of non-probability purposive voluntary sampling, which was used to ensure inclusion of typical cases and information-rich cases (Terre Blanche, Durrheim, & Painter, 2007). The primary sampling parameters were that women would need to be managers working in the mining company and be exposed to and engage in the LDC of the company. The women needed to be exposed to leadership development activities such as training, seminars, workshops, conferences, mentorship and leadership development programmes. For practical purposes, all the participants were based in Gauteng, South Africa. I selected individuals as they purposefully informed an understanding of leadership identity construction (Babbie & Mouton, 2001). Six women were targeted to participate in the interviews. After the fifth interview and consecutive analysis, the data became saturated as the same issues were repeated across the data sets. The research sampling aligned to a recommendation of Babbie and Mouton (2001, p. 287) who state that an appropriate sample size for a South African master’s level qualitative study is between five and 25 participants. A biographical description of the research participants is tabulated in Table 3.1 below.

**Table 3.1**: Biographical description of research participants.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Participant</th>
<th>Management Level</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Child/Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P1</td>
<td>Middle manager</td>
<td>Marketing &amp; Logistics</td>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P2</td>
<td>Senior manager</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P3</td>
<td>Senior manager</td>
<td>Legal</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P4</td>
<td>Middle manager</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P5</td>
<td>Middle manager</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data collection methods

Semi-structured qualitative interviews were used as the main method of data collection. Qualitative researchers study phenomena in their natural settings and interpret these in terms of the meaning that people bring to them (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011). Therefore, qualitative researchers have an interpretive and naturalistic approach to the world. In this study semi-structured interviews were used because they allow researchers to gather rich data from participants (Rubin & Rubin, 2005). They also allow for the in-depth study of phenomena (Merriam, 2009) and are relatively inexpensive (Dingwall, 1997; Lottering, 2015). The duration of each interview was between 60 minutes and 90 minutes. The central research question was, “tell me your story of becoming a leader”. Thereafter I asked various semi-structured probing questions. Please refer to Appendix B for a sample of the questions that participants were asked.

Similar to Davis (2002) I used the combination of social constructivism and hermeneutic phenomenology to study identity development. I used semi-structured interviews, which is an appropriate data collection method in hermeneutic phenomenology (Lauterbach, 2018). Because of the nature of the interview process and the discourse that followed, I observed a reflexive process. In this process, participants were able to engage with the phenomenon in ways that did not rely on only memory and reflection (Lauterbach, 2018). In the reflexive process participants became aware of their own stories, thereby becoming an object of their own observation. This enabled participants to make shifts in their own perspectives, view themselves from a different perspective, and question the meaning of their own descriptions of themselves (Bu, & Paré, 2018). The process of meaning making between myself and the participants were therefore of an evolving nature, already observed during the narratives they provided in the interviews and how these narratives took on a self-reflective nature wherein the participants thought about the self and how their identities developed.

Recording of data

In order to capture the essence of the interviews, the data were recorded using a digital voice recorder as well as notes taken manually during the interviews. The voice recorder removed the challenge of having to listen to every spoken word, while
simultaneously capturing the words and still being present in the moment. Field notes were taken during and after the interviews to capture non-verbal cues and observations. I employed a professional transcriber who recorded data into Microsoft Word (she signed a confidentiality agreement). I then populated data into Excel to make the data more manageable for the analysis process.

**Data analysis**

Data analysis for the study was conducted using the phenomenological hermeneutical method (Dale, Soderhamn & Soderhamn, 2012; Lindseth & Norberg, 2004), based on the phenomenological hermeneutic orientation of Ricoeur (1976). An integral part of hermeneutics is the hermeneutic circle, which refers to understanding the meaning of a text as a whole, as well its individual parts. In order to complete a hermeneutic cycle, the researcher has to move to and fro between the whole text and the parts of the text (Dale et al., 2012; Gadamer, 1976). Interpreting the text involves understanding the hidden meaning in the apparent meaning of the text (Dale et al., 2012; Ricoeur, 1976). This suggests that data were not merely analysed at face value; rather there was a strong focus on the deeper meaning behind text.

The phenomenological hermeneutical method entails three analytic phases during which the iterative movement of the hermeneutic circle is constantly applied: the naïve reading, structural analysis and comprehensive understanding (Lindseth & Norberg, 2004). The naïve reading phase involved reading the text obtained from the women in the LDC several times in order to gain a holistic understanding of how they constructed a leadership identity (Dale et al., 2012; Lindseth & Norberg, 2004). The second phase involved explaining their leadership identity construction in a structured thematic manner and re-assessing the naïve understanding obtained in the first phase of the analysis (Dale et al., 2012; Lindseth & Norberg, 2004). The third phase involved re-interpreting their leadership identity construction as a whole, basing this on the pre-understanding of the researcher, the naïve reading and the thematic analysis, as well as literature on women in LDCs and their leadership identity (Dale et al., 2012; Lindseth & Norberg, 2004). This culminated in a new, deeper understanding of how women in an LDC construct their leadership identity.
Strategies employed to ensure quality data

One of the most prominent criteria against which qualitative studies can be assessed is the trustworthiness of the inquiry (Schwandt, Lincoln, & Guba, 2007). In this study, the quality of data were assessed using trustworthiness criteria such as credibility, transferability, dependability and confirmability (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). The credibility of the study was safeguarded by ensuring that information-rich participants were adequately identified and described through a process of purposive sampling (Guba & Lincoln, 1994; Holloway & Wheeler, 2002; Macnee & McCabe, 2008). The transcripts were checked against the live recordings by the transcriber and myself several times to ensure the credibility of the data (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). Furthermore, as I was employed by the company, I was granted prolonged engagement at the research site and peer debriefing by the research supervisor and two psychologists at the research site (Bitsch, 2005; Guba & Lincoln, 1994). Transferability was ensured by the use of purposive sampling and a thorough description of the context of the study, along with presenting thick verbatim excerpts from the data (Bitsch, 2005; Tobin & Begley, 2004). Confirmability, whereby the findings of the study can be established by the findings of other studies, was pursued by constantly comparing and integrating the findings with relevant literature (Bowen, 2009; Tobin & Begley, 2004). Dependability was employed in the form of an audit trail in which I accounted for all research decisions and activities to show how data were collected, recorded and analysed (Chilisa & Preece, 2005; Guba & Lincoln, 1994; Krefting, 1991; Schwandt et al., 2007). Reflexivity addressed the credibility of the study by making my preconceptions transparent. This is aligned with the hermeneutic phenomenological stance that preconceptions cannot be bracketed, but should be acknowledged and made explicit (Haynes, 2012; Kitto, Chesters & Grbich, 2008). Another strategy that was employed to ensure the quality and rigour of the research process and the data analysis was frequent research supervisor review throughout the process.

Reporting

Because of the richness of the data collected during the interviews, the data analysed were first grouped into three main themes according to my naïve understanding, as discussed in the findings section. Thereafter, upon following structural analysis, four major themes consisting of several sub-themes were found. Each theme and
subsequent sub-themes and categories are discussed in the findings section below. In order to gain comprehensive understanding, relevant literature was integrated during data analysis and is reflected in the discussion of themes and sub-themes. Verbatim extracts from the data collected ground the findings in the data and provided credibility to the results. With reference to the verbatim extracts in the text, the research participants were allocated numbers: P1, P2, P3, P4 and P5. The findings are followed by a discussion and the development of a conceptual framework.

3.5 FINDINGS

The findings of the study are presented according to my naïve reading and structural analysis, as prescribed by the phenomenological hermeneutical method.

3.5.1 Naïve reading

In the first phase of the interpretation process, the transcriptions were read through, focussing on how women in an LDC create their leadership identity. I read the text several times in order to attain a sense of each individual interview, as well as of the phenomenon in its entirety as experienced by the women in this particular LDC.

This naïve reading presents the first superficial understanding of the data. At this point, no sub-themes were extracted, as the purpose was simply to gain overall understanding of the data. From an initial overview, it was clear that the participants in the LDC were consistently engaged in identity work and in the process of constructing a leadership identity. It appeared that all the women both consciously and involuntarily performed identity work in order to create their leadership identity. From an overview of the interviews, it seemed evident that the identity work process began with the women experiencing identity tensions due to various shaping factors, which included socio-cultural influence, work-life balance and organisational support. Experiencing the tensions in the self with regard to becoming a leader resulted in them engaging in various identity construction processes. Among others they were making changes to themselves. An event or interaction that occurred in any of the above areas seemed to propel the women to undergo a process of identity construction (identity work).

Participants in the study discussed the impact of socio-cultural influence and how they experienced gender stereotypes and discrimination as women in a male-dominated
industry. Most of these women grew up in an underprivileged background and they felt that their only option was to become successful. Female leaders went on to explain the personal philosophies they adopted and support they gathered to overcome the socio-cultural conflicts they experienced in relation to becoming a leader. Socio-cultural stereotypes and gender role beliefs created an identity struggle between being a woman and being a leader.

All the women in the study reported that they needed to balance their personal and professional roles, as each of the roles required time, energy and effort. Depending on their life stage or the spousal support they received, some struggled and others thrived in their leadership development journey. The tension experienced in the work-life role conflict dynamic seemed akin to identity tension because women were constantly addressing the issue of work-life balance. Female leaders used negotiating balance as a strategy to overcome the struggle associated with their conflicting personal and professional roles.

Women participating in the study experienced discomfort with the title of leader. They had a heroic view of what a leader does and who a leader is. They consequently experienced conflict between their gender identity and their perception of leadership yet felt that becoming a leader was something they aspired to in the future. Women in the study felt that their organisation served as an identity-developing space by providing them with managers, peers and support, thus allowing them access to resources such as coaches, mentors and formal training. Female leaders described how they used relationships to overcome the struggles they experienced in taking up a leadership role in their organisation.

All the women described experiencing an identity transformation on their developmental path to becoming a leader. Part of the transformation involved experiencing conflict, which resulted in them performing identity work during which they used career management techniques to build their self-esteem and self-confidence and broaden their intrapersonal and interpersonal competencies.

3.5.2 Structural analysis

The structural analysis of the data resulted in four themes, each of which consisted of four or five sub-themes, which are presented in Table 3.2 below and discussed thereafter. Through the use of thick description, verbatim extracts from the data
grounded the findings in the participants' narrative and provided credibility to the results. With regard to the verbatim extracts in the text, the research participants were allocated pseudonyms: P1, P2, P3, P4 and P5. The findings are followed by a discussion integrating relevant literature with the findings and reflecting comprehensive understanding in the form of a conceptual framework aimed at enhancing understanding of how women managers construct a leadership identity.

**Table 3.2: Overview of main themes with description of each theme.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Description of Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The impact of life spheres</td>
<td>Life spheres refer to how a participant is affected by: (i) socio-cultural influence, (ii) their life’s purpose, (iii) the role of family, (iv) growing up in underprivileged circumstances and (v) their worldviews and leadership definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrating personal and professional roles</td>
<td>This refers to the way a female leader is shaped by her personal and professional roles. It may also relate to how she may experience role identity conflict and work-life interface. It furthermore considers the role that formative experience and qualifications play in shaping a women’s leadership identity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The role work facets play</td>
<td>Work facets refer to the way in which work aspects shape a leader’s identity. These include: (i) identity space, (ii) leadership identity conflict, (iii) developmental experiences and relationships, (iv) manager’s leadership style and (v) career strategies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The changing self</td>
<td>The changing self revolves around the female leader’s self-leadership in terms of her: (i) self-esteem and confidence, (ii) intra-personal and interpersonal competencies, (iii) readiness, (iv) personal strategies and (v) authentic and ethical leadership.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**3.5.2.1 Theme 1: The impact of life spheres**

The impact of life spheres describes how female managers engage in identity work as a result of the tension created by their social identities or group membership as women in a male-dominated industry. These tensions came to the fore when women reflected on their view of the capabilities of women, the male-dominated nature of the mining industry, as well as being discriminated against purely because of their gender. The theme focusses on how they resolve these tensions in order to integrate/combine/balance the competing demands of being a woman and working in the mining industry as a manager. When a female manager is able to overcome the tension she experiences as a result of the impact of life spheres, she receives
recognition, approval, and a sense of value and acceptance from other group members. Furthermore, by upholding a group identity of being a female manager she increases her self-worth. Alternatively, if a female manager is unable to overcome the above tensions, she will not receive recognition, approval and a sense of value and acceptance from other members. Therefore, her self-worth will be hindered.

The impact of life spheres was selected as the first theme to present itself, as the identity tension resulting from different life spheres was experienced by all the female managers in the study. In the context of the study, based on the responses from the participants, the impact of life spheres refers to how a participant is affected by: (i) socio-cultural influence, (ii) their life’s purpose, (iii) the role of family, (iv) growing up in underprivileged circumstances and (v) their worldviews and leadership definition. An overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘the impact of life spheres’ is depicted in Table 3.3 and a discussion of each sub-theme with verbatim data follows thereafter.

Table 3.3: Overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘the impact of life spheres’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-themes</th>
<th>Description of Sub-themes</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural influence</td>
<td>The participant experienced socio-cultural influence in the form of either stereotypes or discrimination in the workplace.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(stereotypes and discrimination)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life’s purpose</td>
<td>The participant is driven by a higher purpose and as a result may want to make a difference in others’ lives.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The role of family</td>
<td>Family members often play a supportive role in equipping female leaders to achieve success.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growing up in underprivileged circumstances</td>
<td>As a result of the participant having grown up in an underprivileged background, she feels strongly about needing to achieve success either to make her parents proud or to attain wealth.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worldviews and leadership definition</td>
<td>Whereas some leaders define leadership as positional, others define it as personal or situational. Therefore, the definition of leadership may be derived from one’s worldview.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Socio-cultural influence.** Socio-cultural influence may be defined as the female manager being exposed to either stereotypes or discrimination in the workplace or in society in general. These gender stereotypes and discrimination could either lead to feelings of low self-esteem that diminish female managers' self-confidence, or it could motivate women to rise to the challenge and prove themselves to be equal to men. In the context of the study, social cultural influence was obtained through the following categories: (i) societal views about the capabilities of women, (ii) the male-dominated nature of the mining industry, and (iii) being discriminated against based on arbitrary grounds such as age and gender.

Two participants alluded to being competent in their roles, but still having to gain support from male colleagues and counterparts in order to believe in their own abilities, as societal norms suggest that women are not equal to men in the workplace. The category societal views refer to women having to prove themselves in the workplace based on gender stereotypes and discrimination, although they are competent in their roles. “It’s the industry and the make-up of our society, in the mining industry. In South Africa, it’s still very male dominated culturally” (P3); “You’re extremely capable but because of the stereotypical society we live in sometimes it’s very difficult for women to achieve some of the stuff that they do in leadership positions” (P1). They feel compelled to prove themselves to their male counterparts in order to build motivation and confidence in their leadership identity. “And that I think alone sort of motivated you to prove yourself amongst the male folk that you are just as good as them from an analytical point of view, from working hard to putting in the hours and all of that so what they could do, we could do the same” (P2).

Most women experienced the male-dominated nature of the mining industry. The category ‘male-dominated industry’ refers to the way in which the mining industry is still dominated by men because of the nature of mining. This trend has proven that there is a lack of women in mining and in leadership specifically. “And even when we went into the personal world or into the business world, you notice that it was a man dominated working environment” (P2); “One of the things she said is that never underestimate how different the work environment is for a woman as it is for a man and we were in steel hey so steel was always quite rough mining is rough” (P1); “Oh my gosh, we work in a male-dominated environment, very much so here, very
chauvinistic and I say that with tongue in cheek, but once you accept that then you can work with them” (P3); “at the mines it’s a real man’s work” (P4).

It seems that female leaders experienced discrimination as a result of being females in the mining industry. “People came to me and said you know we really feel bad for what’s happened, and we feel that you were unfairly treated” (P2); “There is still some oppression against blacks and females” (P4). Contrary to popular views, one participant claimed that being a woman may be used to yield positive work outputs. “Not trying to become a man in a man’s world, try to remain a woman in a man’s world and try to use those aspects of being a woman in order to achieve your goals” (P3).

**Life’s purpose.** Most participants mentioned a strong need to fulfil their life’s purpose. In the context of the study, life’s purpose refers to leaders having a positive impact on others around them and wanting to serve as a role model. Most participants of the study knew their life’s purpose and aimed to achieve it: “… impact the people that are around us positively” (P1); “Be able to motivate the people around you and be a role model for people that are coming after you” (P2); “… it’s a drive to purpose … effecting positive change while you’re at it” (P3). “I’m looking forward to making a difference in their lives” (P4).

**The role of family.** In the context of this study, the role of family can lead to both positive and negative outcomes, depending on how the manager attends to these relationships. All participants stated that their families had played a supportive role in their journey to becoming female leaders. “Before anyone else believed, a parent believed ... My parents, my siblings, I have an incredibly supportive family” (P1); “I was lucky, my husband was very supportive and still is.” (P2); “I think my marriage to my husband has a lot to with it because we shape each other, I’m very blessed to have an absolutely fantastic husband, we are really soul mates” (P3); “And my sister was with me that support got me through” (P4); “My husband … motivated me to just do it” (P5).

Although participants shared how their parents, children and spouses served as support structures, they also shared how some of these relationships had been very difficult to maintain while they were employed in senior roles. “Bringing up three kids is a challenge you know, having two professional people in the house is a challenge” (P3); “And I’m a single parent now and I rely on my mom to babysit every now and
then” (P4); “I think one of the challenges was because my husband and I were working at the same company; many times we had to move for his career and it set me back because there wasn’t always the same position available so a few times I had to take a lower position” (P5).

**Growing up in underprivileged circumstances.** In the context of this study, participants who had grown up in underprivileged circumstances claimed to be appreciative and humble because of having overcome the socio-economic barriers characteristic of their upbringing. In a sense, growing up in these circumstances had in fact equipped them with the resilience required to become leaders. It provided them with the motivation to become successful in order to achieve success and either make their parents proud or to attain wealth. “I was born in Chatsworth to a house wife and a factory worker, if we had to decide what my life was going to look like based on where I grew up, we would be on a very different path you can make your own fate or destiny at any given point in your life” (P1); “With the upbringing we always said the only thing that’s going to get you out of poverty is education and being successful” (P2); “During my life there were some hard times and hardship in our family and I just felt that I didn’t have a choice really in terms of taking charge and ensuring that we get through stuff that even at the sight of adversity that we fulfil our purpose in life” (P3).

One participant went as far as stating that growing up in an underprivileged environment propelled her to construct a particular leadership identity:

> So that is leadership not through desire but just because you had no other option and I suppose you know that makes you stronger in life if you realise that you have to be humble and that you have to be grateful and that life has challenges and it’s not always easy. I think the biggest lesson I learnt from a very young age was that life certainly comes with its fair bits of challenges and that it’s not easy and that life is not a walk in the park and I think that sort of shapes you into becoming a very purpose-driven person so I would say those things shaped me into becoming a leader (P3).

**Worldviews and leadership definition.** In the context of this study, worldviews and leadership definition refer to the way that leader’s worldviews shape their leadership definition. Whereas some leaders define leadership as positional, others define it as personal or situational. Therefore, the definition of leadership may be derived from
one’s worldview. “I think leadership is defined differently depending on where you are in your career and role etc” (P1); “let’s go from my youth days” (P2); “I would almost want to compartmentalise that into different types of leadership events in my life” (P3); “My story of becoming a leader, I would say it started four years ago almost officially where I would say that’s the time that I started having people reporting to me, the first three years I would say it was informal” (P4); “There was a position in the mining head office at the time and I applied for it and I got the job. So, that was my first real leader position” (P5).

3.5.2.2 Theme 2: Integrating personal and professional roles

Integrating personal and professional roles describes how women engage in identity work as a result of the tension between their personal and professional roles. The theme highlights the interface between these roles and how women respond to and resolve the conflicts and demands occurring in this interface. It is about how they resolve these role conflicts in order to integrate/combine/balance the competing role demands to construct a leadership identity in which they can function comfortably. Leadership roles require specific performance to meet the expectations of the position and there are increased feelings of competence when performance standards are met. Self-verification thus occurs while carrying out expectations and standards of a leadership role, and this in turn allows the occupants of counter-roles to carry out their duties and obligations. As a result of the above-mentioned process women may feel a sense of self-efficacy, knowing that they have met performance standards or lack of self-efficacy when they fail to meet those performance standards.

In the context of the study, based on the responses from the participants, integrating personal and professional roles refers to how a participant is influenced by: (i) personal roles, (ii) professional roles, (iii) role identity conflict, (iv) work-life interface and (v) qualifications and formative experience. All participants discussed how they managed their personal and professional roles. An overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘integrating personal and professional roles’ is depicted in Table 3.4.
Table 3.4: Overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘integrating personal and professional roles’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-themes</th>
<th>Description of Sub-themes</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal roles</td>
<td>Personal roles refer to the roles women assume in their personal lives (e.g. mother, wife, daughter, sister etc.)</td>
<td>P1, P2, P3, P4, P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional roles</td>
<td>Professional roles refer to roles that women assume in the workplace (e.g. manager, mentor, coach etc.)</td>
<td>P1, P2, P3, P4, P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role identity conflict</td>
<td>Role identity conflict refers to a conflict between the personal and professional roles a woman assumes.</td>
<td>P1, P2, P3, P4, P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work-life interface</td>
<td>Work-life interface refers to the integration between a woman’s personal and professional lives and how this leads to either work-family conflict, or work-family enrichment.</td>
<td>P1, P2, P3, P4, P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualifications and formative experience</td>
<td>Qualifications and experience refer to how women have been shaped by a combination of qualifications and formative experience.</td>
<td>P1, P2, P3, P4, P5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Personal roles.** In the context of the study, personal roles refer to the roles women assume in their personal lives, for example, mother, wife, daughter, and sister.

The first participant explained how she and her ex-husband spent much of their personal time working: “*We didn’t have kids so we had our jobs, which is great, but I have no issues as a woman or a wife or a man for that matter to leave the office at 4 o clock, go home have dinner, spend some time together and work*” (P1).

Three participants shared the importance of the motherly role they play in their personal lives, two of whom expressed the guilt they felt about not spending enough time with their family: “*Being a woman sometimes is tough…it’s more the maternal instinct that you want to be the mom and you want to do all the mom things you know so it’s something I think you have to deal with internally to get that balance to say okay the fact that I’m not home to bath my baby today doesn’t mean I’m not a good mother*” (P2); “*I am a grandmother, and I have a good relationship with all my children and we do spend time together*” (P5); “*I’m a single parent … it is really difficult and I always thought that the fact that I am earning a comfortable salary … I thought that was enough but guess what it’s more the emotional side*” (P4). 76
Professional roles. In the context of the study, professional roles refer to roles that women assume in the workplace, for example, manager, role model, motivator, mentor, and coach.

Women in the study described their professional roles of role model and motivator as follows: “And I think for me that was what shaped what I wanted to do…you have to be a role model and a motivational person” (P2); “I have been doing it informally because I see myself as a natural leader whenever I am in a team set up I end up taking leadership even without the role being assigned to me” (P4).

Role identity conflict. This refers to conflict between the roles a woman assumes personally and professionally. Two participants shared how the demands of their personal and professional roles caused internal conflict: “You need to accept from an early age that if you have kids and you have a career and you’re a woman, life’s not fair. I have to accept that as a fact that you are going to do more than your husband” (P3); “I was still struggling to figure out my role at the same time I was going through depression … so I had to now move to a foreign place, foreign language where they speak Venda and I was not familiar with the language I was in a new role, not familiar with my role, the environment there is very hot so it was a lot of adjustment at the same time” (P4).

Work-life interface. Work-life interface refers to the integration between a woman's personal and professional lives and how this leads to work-family conflict, work-family enrichment or work-life balance.

Depending on their life stage, spousal support and personal characteristics, each participant had reported a different level of work-life balance: “Different phases of our lives require that work-life balance to be different. I’m fully aware and I’ve done it when I was married … even now if I’m going out on weekends or dates or whatever it may be the work gets done but the timing is different” (P1); “I am prepared to work very hard during the week, very long hours if need be but then the weekend is mine … and I think that helped with the work life balance” (P2); “I wouldn’t say I have a system yet … Since my pregnancy I haven’t been to the movies, something as simple as that, I’m not dating, I don’t even know how I’m going to go back into the game” (P4); “I would study from the early hours of the morning, knock off early and continue studying for two hours a day and then I realised that I could also work and study” (P5).
Qualifications and formative experience. In the context of the study, qualifications and formative experience refer to how women have been shaped by a combination of qualifications and formative experience in their earlier years leading up to tertiary education and beyond.

Two participants shared how their formative experience had shaped their leadership identity: “I would say what shaped it would be all my learnings, formal learning in terms of my education, my tertiary qualification” (P4); “Even when I was in school, I went on some leadership camp. I was really young and learning to take the lead and when I just started working, I was also involved in some sport activities and I think even there you start to develop your leadership” (P5).

Two participants shared how experiencing failure served as a defining moment that prompted them to perform identity work. A participant expressed her disappointment when dealing with failure at university and how this influenced her confidence: “It was part time through UNISA, in the first year I didn’t pass a single subject and I felt like a failure and I was 40 at the time, how was I going to do this? But then my husband said to me you know what, you don’t stop something once you start; you continue till you pass” (P5).

When describing her experience of failure, another participant stated:

I failed thermodynamics at varsity; that was an actual failure. I deserved to fail, there’s no doubt in my mind, so there’s two types of failures; there’s the one where you tried everything and it didn’t work out because there were crossed wires somewhere and there’s the times in your life where you fail because you just did not put enough effort or any effort.” She went on to say that the experience taught her: “You’re not invincible you’re not as smart as you may think you are and there are things that you are going to have to work at and you need to put the time in” (P1).

A participant narrated her experience and the identity work she engaged in after being selected for a master’s programme in Germany. She stated:

“I learnt so much being involved because it was a very tough course, so I mean we were intimately involved in each other’s lives, I forged great friendships, but it also opened my life and my point of view”. She further explained how she
received an average of eighty percent in order to get a bursary and gain acceptance into the master’s programme with a philosophy of: “I had a very strong sense of you need to put effort in” (P3).

Two participants shared how qualifications were used to make them more marketable in the business world: “I was the first one that actually now got a degree”. She went on to illustrate: “So, it sounded wonderful only to realise that when you’re in the business world everybody has a degree so now how are you going to differentiate yourself from others” (P2). Another participant reported that gaining her qualification helped her climb up the corporate ladder: “It created opportunity to climb up the corporate ladder” (P5).

3.5.2.3 Theme 3: The role work facets play

The theme ‘the role work facets play’ concerns whether a female manager’s work environment or organisational culture serves as an LDC, thus creating an identity space for the female worker to transition into a leadership identity. The self-verification process involves women maintaining the values of the organisation and maintaining the distinctions and separations from other organisations. This results in a female manager receiving rewards and recognition for living the company values and upholding a positive organisational culture. The outcome of having an LDC is that it fosters a strong organisational identity and activates increased self-worth, self-efficacy and authenticity. Alternatively, the lack of creation of an LDC may result in lack of self-worth, self-efficacy and authenticity.

In the context of the study, based on the responses from the participants, the role work facets play refers to how a participant is influenced by (i) identity space, (ii) leadership identity conflict, (iii) developmental relationships and experiences, (iv) managers’ leadership style and (v) career strategies. An overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘the role work facets play’ is depicted in Table 3.5.
Table 3.5: Overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘the role work facets play’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-themes</th>
<th>Description of Sub-themes</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identity space</td>
<td>An identity space is a space in which women are transformed into female leaders.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership identity conflict</td>
<td>Similar to role conflict; however, here leadership identity is in conflict with a female leader’s identity.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developmental experiences and relationships</td>
<td>Refers to the experiences, defining moments and relationships through mentorship and coaching that women receive while on the job.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manager’s leadership style</td>
<td>Refers to the way in which a leader’s management style affects a female leader. In the case of a transformational manager, the female may be inspired and in the case of a transactional/difficult manager, the female leader may decide never to be that type of leader.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career strategies</td>
<td>Strategies that women employ in order to climb up the corporate ladder. These include hard work and perseverance.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Identity space. In the context of the study, an identity space is an LDC in which women managers are transformed into female leaders.

Three participants in the study shared how their organisation provided them with an LDC with various elements, ranging from support to time off: “I always had the time to study” (P2); “Sometimes you’re in a forum or a conference or a meeting or whatever and it doesn’t have to be formal training or anything of the sort but you learn” (P1).

A participant explained her experiences while on a leadership development programme and how it shaped her leadership identity:

"I actually enjoy doing things like that because they [are] there to shape your leadership because it doesn’t always come naturally. Sometimes you need some help to develop that in order to become a good leader and in the end if you have done a few that has motivated you and know what they want you to do and can look to then you have a good framework" (P5).
A participant shared how her leadership identity was constructed over a period of a number of years at the company. She stated: “I have learnt a lot in the 10 years that I have been here, so I’ve matured over the years.” She went on to say that the previous CEO enjoyed that about her: “And I think he would laugh at me now because I have changed” (P3).

**Leadership identity conflict.** In the context of the study, leadership identity conflict occurs when the leadership identity is in conflict with the female gender identity; therefore, the participant does not view herself as a leader or the leader’s subordinates do not view her as a leader, thus creating conflict.

Most participants found it difficult to define themselves as leaders, because they seemed to view the term leader as both ideal and heroic. In response to a question on defining her leadership, participant one stated: “What’s it like to be a woman in a leadership position and it always sounds weird to me because I don’t think I see myself that way” (P1). In another case, a participant reported: “I really don’t like the word leader because it sounds sort of to me egocentric” (P3).

Two participants were challenged by their subordinates who did not view them as leaders; while explaining a conflict situation with a subordinate, a participant stated: “I had to decide if I had to be two different leaders” (P5).

Another participant shared: “I think one of the biggest things for me in the work context was when I had just become manager of an engineering team and I was a very young manager. It was difficult for the one guy to accept that I was a woman, his boss, that he would have to listen to what I was saying; for some people that can be quite a stumbling block” (P1).

**Developmental experiences and relationships.** In the context of the study, these refer to the experiences, defining moments and relationships through mentorship and coaching that women receive while on the job. All participants in the study shared how developmental experiences and relationships shaped their leadership identity: “I have had great examples of managers, bosses, leaders and just people who have opened me up” (P1); “Somebody that’s gone through all the experiences to mentor you to either try to prevent you from making some of the same mistakes but also sort of advising you on how to read the situation and how to behave professionally and what do you need to do to be successful in whatever field you chose to” (P2); “Relationships
are a journey I have learnt a lot in the 10 years that I have been here” (P3); “I was part of a formal mentorship programme where I was assigned a mentor, where I chose a mentor for myself and it was a woman, a female leader as well. She coached me, she mentored me and guided me, we don’t only focus on the business side of things she also touched on my personal life” (P4); “When I started off in a leadership position, it was then that I got along with and learnt from other people in the department and my team was very supportive, which makes it easier … And that really shaped me to become a leader that people could look up to” (P5).

A participant shared how her leadership identity was constructed through developmental relationships and experiences:

I had my own way of doing things and I know it was not always right from my side because I was still a new graduate, chip on my shoulder, thinking that I know it all and all of that and I have grown since then.” She went on to describe her growth: “I would say the experience that I gained I grew, I grew up emotionally on the personal side and I got to realise that this is not how things work in a corporate environment.” She further credited developmental relationships for the creation of her leadership identity: “All the people that have supported me, coached me and mentored me along the way, that is what shaped my leadership” (P4).

Manager’s leadership style. In the context of the study, ‘manager’s leadership style’ refers to the impact of the women’s managers’ leadership style on female managers. In the case of a transformational manager, the female may be inspired and in the case of a transactional manager, the female manager may decide never to be that type of leader.

Three participants shared how their managers’ transformational leadership styles had given them confidence in their abilities: “My boss currently is a star, there’s never a day that goes by where I think that I don’t have his support … I don’t have to second-guess myself” (P1); “I think through my career I’ve always been mentored by good managers and that’s part of the teaching of how to deal with other people” (P2); “Um the previous CEO, he loved it because it was such a breath of fresh air so he always said to me never change” (P3).
Two participants reflected on past transactional leadership at a previous company and how these bad experiences had inspired them to become better leaders: “It was a challenge of working for a lady boss but very demanding, extremely demanding for me to the extent of being unreasonable” (P2); “Looking at some of the people that I would classify as some of the bad leaders sort of inspired me to say I don’t want to be like that and all the hardship I went through when I was being led” (P4).

**Career strategies.** In the context of this study, these are strategies that women employ in order to climb up the corporate ladder, for example hard work and perseverance. Interestingly, none of the participants engaged in networking and opportunity-seeking activities. When asked about career strategies she adopts, a participant stated: “So it’s not a deliberate strategy in terms of career advancement, I do the best that I can with everything that I have every day that I can.” She added: “But a specific strategy of networking or meeting the right people or of ensuring you’re around the water cooler at the same time a manager is, I don’t have one of those” (P1).

When answering the same question, another participant reported: “My experience has always been if you do well you will be recognised. It wasn’t looking around the company and seeing where the higher graded jobs were and then job hunting to get to that next level.” She continued: “With regard to networking, I am very poor at it, but I do think there’s also value there” (P2).

**3.5.2.4 Theme 4: The changing self**

The changing self is a theme used to describe the tensions female managers experience when their leadership role conflicts with their values, beliefs or moral code. It is about how they perform identity work to resolve these role conflicts by integrating/combining/balancing the competing role demands to construct a leadership identity in which they can function comfortably. Self-verification occurs when one’s true self is revealed and verified in a situation. The elements of the self include morals and values that allow people to be who they truly are as individuals and feel as if their real selves are acknowledged. This builds an authentic leadership identity. Alternatively, a female manager may experience leadership identity conflict if her personal identity does not align with her leadership identity.
The changing self revolves around the female leaders’ self-leadership in terms of her (i) self-esteem and confidence, (ii) intra-personal and interpersonal competencies, (iii) readiness, (iv) personal strategies, and (v) authentic and ethical leadership. An overview of the sub-themes obtained from the theme ‘the changing self’ is depicted in Table 3.6.

**Table 3.6** Overview of the sub-themes obtained from ‘the changing self’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-themes</th>
<th>Description of Sub-themes</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Self-esteem and self-confidence</td>
<td>Refers to how low self-esteem and lack of self-confidence lead to female managers doubting their own abilities. Women must build their self-esteem and self-confidence in order to create a leadership identity.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intra-personal and interpersonal</td>
<td>These are competencies that female managers need to build in order to form a positive leader identity or climb up the corporate ladder.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>competencies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Readiness</td>
<td>Refers to the female manager’s readiness to accept a developmental experience.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal strategies</td>
<td>These strategies refer to personal strategies or mottoes women adopt in order to climb up the corporate ladder.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authentic and ethical leadership</td>
<td>Each female manager adopts different levels of transformational and transactional leadership; however, the common thread is their need to exhibit ethical and authentic leadership.</td>
<td>P1 P2 P3 P4 P5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Self-esteem and self-confidence.** In the context of the study, self-esteem and self-confidence refer to how low self-esteem and lack of confidence lead to female managers doubting their own abilities. It also illustrates that women must improve their self-esteem and self-confidence in order to create or foster a leadership identity.
In a discussion about self-esteem and confidence, it became evident that these qualities lead to women reaching both professional and personal goals. A participant mentioned: “One of the defining moments for me, and it always has been, is the support from my colleagues and from my managers in terms of me growing and believing in my own ability to get things done”. She went on to state the role that family play in building that confidence as follows: “So, there are things that help us build our confidence; we have these triggers and when I say support at home” (P1).

Another participant discussed the role that her manager played in fostering both self-confidence and self-esteem: “I think for me that was motivational because somebody believed in me and really motivated me to carry on studying” (P2).

A participant explained how female managers should move from a space of low self-confidence and self-esteem to a place of ownership: “It doesn’t help to sort of sit in the corner and feel sorry for yourself and say ‘no, this has happened, how am I now going to get out of this” (P3).

**Intra-personal and interpersonal competencies.** In the context of the study, intra-personal and interpersonal competencies refer to competencies that female managers use in order to manage their emotional intelligence and social intelligence respectively. These may, furthermore, be used to form a positive leader identity or climb up the corporate ladder.

When explaining if emotional intelligence and social intelligence are real constructs, a participant explained: “They are, they really are, I would have liked robots because you know they don’t get upset and stuff but no it becomes very important, I realised the importance of it, this whole thing on EQ.” She also emphasised the importance of social intelligence in her field as follows: “In this day and age in this sort of digital space we’re in also the space of where business is in very few jobs require you do to things on your own” (P1).

Another participant credited the company for developing her both personally and professionally and stated: “In terms of formal training I think we’ve always been on leadership courses so your management development programmes, how to deal with difficult situations, conflict situations, how to motivate people to be with you and not leave them behind” (P2).
In the 21st century world of work a number of competencies are required to become a leader. A participant explained that part of building intra-personal competencies involves adopting certain strategies as follows: "First of all a positive attitude; I mean that to me will take you a long way, positive attitude, a strong sense of purpose, creativity and hard work, those four things, if you have that then you can flex between jobs. Maybe the other one is flexibility, creativity and innovation" (P3).

**Readiness to accept a developmental experience.** In the context of the study, readiness refers to female managers’ readiness to accept a developmental experience.

When explaining the role of development programmes, a participant stated: “The development programmes we go on are great, but you have to be in a place where you accept what you’re hearing or in a place to make changes” (P1).

**Personal strategies.** These refer to the strategies or mottoes women adopt in order to climb up the corporate ladder.

Participants shared the personal strategies they adopt in the workplace. A participant explained the importance of active listening, adaptability, and introspection as follows: “I have had to learn adaptability and I have had to learn to listen and to actively listen to hear what you’re saying. It’s a big practice of mine to take stock of the day and realise what happened, what didn’t happen and try and learn from it” (P1). Similarly, another participant explained how she grew through practising active listening: “So I’ve really matured over the years and I’ve become much more diplomatic, calmer, becoming a better listener, really hearing people, hearing their point of view so even when I joined this company I was still very opinionated but I’ve now learnt to really listen to people more” (P3).

In another case, a participant explained why she needed to become more vocal: “It’s a personal challenge, if you are not vocal enough you are sometimes seen to be soft and unable to command yourself in a bigger meeting or a board meeting” (P2).

**Authentic and ethical leadership.** In the context of the study, although each female leader adopted different levels of transformational and transactional leadership, the common thread was their need to exhibit an ethical and authentic leadership identity.
When discussing ethical and authentic leadership, a participant stated: “I learnt this from someone a few years ago; it was doing the right thing even when no one is watching.” She added: “It’s not about the popular vote.” She further explained: “You still have to stay true to yourself and who you are, which I think is part of authentic leadership” (P1).

Another participant also discussed values-based leadership, which forms part of ethical leadership, as follows: “I think there’s a lot of truth in the saying treat people how in the way that you would like to be treated”. She added: “Always be honest, never compromise on your integrity, if you made a mistake you need to admit to it, don’t try to cover it up”. Furthermore, she stated: “Ethics was very high on my agenda”. She also described how she practised elements of felt leadership: “So what I do on a daily basis or I try to do is walk down because I like to greet people and not only because I feel it’s my duty to but because I genuinely care about how people are feeling today” (P2).

When describing her leadership, a third participant stated: “I care too much about my people, so I mean they go through a tough time and it’s rough on them, it’s almost like I go through it with them”. Furthermore, she explained how she led by example: “I don’t expect them to work their butts off and go the extra mile if I don’t set that example” (P3).

A fourth participant stated: “I would say I’m a democratic leader; I want everybody to feel like they are part of the family, they did contribute to the goal” (P4). When describing her leadership identity, a participant stated: “I think sometimes you must sit down and ask yourself: am I doing the right thing? What do people think of me as a leader? Do they follow because they have to or because they want to?” (P5). She further explained: “I think I’ve got a very relaxed leadership style but being in payroll there’s a lot of things where there is no in between its either/or” (P5).

3.6 DISCUSSION

The general aim of this study was to explore and describe how women in an LDC perform identity work in order to construct a leadership identity, and from that understanding to develop a conceptual framework of leadership identity construction of female managers in a South African mining context. The framework developed from the data is based on integrating the related themes and sub-themes, as illustrated in
Figure 3.1, and as such reflects the comprehensive understanding phase in the phenomenological hermeneutical analysis process.

The framework gives an illustration of the constructed central themes depicting the identity bases that female managers experience in managerial professions in the mining industry. Identity bases propel women to engage in identity work, and the resultant outcome is the creation of a leadership identity. The conceptual framework developed in this study aims to convey a story about how women in an LDC create their leadership identity through a process of identity construction. Insights gained in the framework illustrate how different identity bases engage with one another, and through a process of identity construction a leadership identity is formed. The framework illustrates the process in a sequential manner. It firstly depicts the identity bases by which women are influenced and with which they interact throughout their lives from their formative years until they have matured. These identity bases include: (i) the impact of life spheres, (ii) integrating personal and professional roles, (iii) the role work facets play and (iv) the changing self, and give rise to group identity, role identity, organisational identity and person identity respectively. Women undergo the process of identity construction in such a way that they create or construct a leadership identity that is based on a unique combination of their group, role, organisational and person identities.

### Figure 3.1: Women’s Leadership Identity Development Model (WLID Model)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IDENTITY BASES</th>
<th>IDENTITY TENSIONS</th>
<th>IDENTITY WORK STRATEGIES</th>
<th>LEADERSHIP IDENTITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Impact of Life Spheres</td>
<td>• Socio-cultural influence</td>
<td><strong>Personal philosophies</strong></td>
<td>Identity Formation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Group Identity)</td>
<td>• Life’s purpose</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The role of family</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Growing up in underprivileged circumstances</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Worldviews and leadership definition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrating Personal &amp; Professional Roles</td>
<td>• Personal roles</td>
<td><strong>Negotiating Balance</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Role Identity)</td>
<td>• Professional roles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Role identity conflict</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Work-life interface</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Qualifications &amp; formative experience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Role Work Facets Play</td>
<td>• Identity space</td>
<td><strong>Relationships</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Organisation Identity)</td>
<td>• Leadership identity conflict</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Developmental experiences &amp; relationships</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Managers leadership style</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Career Strategies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Changing Self</td>
<td>• Self-esteem &amp; Self confidence</td>
<td><strong>Career Management</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Person Identity)</td>
<td>• Intra-personal &amp; interpersonal competencies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Readiness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Personal strategies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Authentic &amp; ethical leadership</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**LEADER IDENTITY**
- Subjective certainty
- Authenticity
- Identity aspiration
- Efficacy
- Credibility

**IDENTITY BASES**
- Personal philosophies
- Negotiating Balance
- Relationships
- Career Management

**IDENTITY TENSIONS**
- Identity formation
- Identity verification
- Identity assimilation, accommodation & evaluation
Identity bases

There are various ways in which the four identity bases have been evident in the study, which both influence the need for identity construction and interact with female leadership identity development. The first that prevails from a young age is the impact of life spheres; women in the study have all been affected by socio-cultural influences through either gender-based stereotypes or discrimination and this has spilled over into the workplace. Gender, ethnicity and place intersect to form one's identity and also drive the construction of a leadership identity (Barkdull, 2009). Women's identity is shaped by family as well as societal norms (Suh, 2007) and these social and cultural issues also influence LDCs (Floyd & Fuller, 2016). From a young age qualifications and formative experience played a key role in teaching women in the study life lessons, building their confidence, and giving them exposure to cross-cultural paradigms they would have otherwise not have been introduced to (Karagianni & Montgomery, 2017). The use of mentors is appropriate for professional identity construction (Barkdull, 2009; Kyriakidou, 2011); however, the lack of female managers in the engineering industry poses a challenge, as there may not be enough women in leadership to serve as mentors (Kyriakidou, 2011).

Moreover, the male-dominated nature of the mining industry still prevails. The achievement of gender equality in the male-dominated mining sector remains one of the biggest equity challenges in the country (Botha & Cronjé, 2015; Martin & Barnard, 2013). According to Martin and Barnard (2013), women in male-dominated professions and environments face experiences that are different from those of their counterparts in more gender-balanced and female-dominated professions. The nature of these experiences affects women’s integration and potential success in male-dominated professions.

However, women in the study have decided to use their life’s purpose as a compass guiding them through difficult times, such as growing up in underprivileged circumstances (Davis & Maldonado, 2015; Saifuddin, 2017). According to Davis and Maldonado (2015), women still perform well although they face barriers and challenges of inequity and negative assumptions. Women who have grown up in underprivileged circumstances must be able to perform identity work to create a positive work-related identity (Koen, Van Vianen, Klehe & Zikic, 2016). Furthermore,
women display resilience and tenacity when facing barriers and this shows their perseverance (Davis & Maldonado, 2015).

Women may understand their life’s purpose as contributing and making a positive difference in the world at large (Sorensen, McKim, & Velez, 2016). The identity work that is required to form a leadership identity may be signalled by commitment to a larger purpose and concern for individuals’ core organisations, including the desire to mentor others in the leadership process (Kapasi et al., 2016; Komives et al., 2005; Sorensen et al., 2016).

Participants in the study acknowledged the role of family in being both supportive and motivational. As such they constructed their gender and leadership through the lens of their personal values and family, much like other women in leadership (Kapasi et al., 2016). Furthermore, findings suggest that investment in the family role as spouse and/or parent can enhance employees’ display of valuable leadership behaviour in the workplace (Dumas & Stanko, 2017).

They also tend to depend on the support of family to counter the effects of the impact of life spheres (Bowers, Rosch, & Collier, 2016; Grint, Jones, Holt, & Storey, 2016). Furthermore, based on their background, they define a leadership worldview. Depending on their worldview, participants in the study associated leadership with a managerial position or asserted that it was not dependent on a managerial position. Furthermore, they all stated that leadership is a multi-faceted and ongoing process. Grint et al. (2016) proposed that leadership is a broad concept that encompasses the following elements: person, result, position, purpose and process.

Women in the study experienced integration of personal and professional roles. On the personal front, women participating in the study engaged in a multiplicity of roles, which for some included being a mother, wife, daughter and sister. Although the only role remaining uniquely gender-specific is childbearing, women and men are still socialised to perform their traditional roles (Johnson & Mortimer, 2000). Women spend much more time than men on parent–child activities, and they are more responsive to the spouse’s work hours. Men are substantially more active than women in non-family leisure, considering both individuals’ and their spouses’ work schedules (Chesley & Flood, 2017; Gracia & Kalmijn, 2016). Furthermore, women perform both housework and paid work (Sofer & Thibout, 2016). Moreover, women also fulfill the obligation of
playing the role of wife and although husbands support wives taking on multiple roles, this does not necessarily translate into equal sharing of domestic and childcare chores (Brink & De la Rey, 2001). On the professional front, in addition to their management roles the women in the study assumed a number of the following roles: role model, motivator, mentor and coach (Carden & Callahan, 2007; Chesley & Flood, 2017; Maxwell, 2009). Because of the above, women either rely on organised childcare facilities or rearrange their personal employment style.

In addition to the personal and professional roles the women in the study assumed, they also needed to satisfy academic requirements associated with being a scholar. However, because of the multiplicity of roles women assume both personally and professionally, they often experience role overload, which leads to both intrapersonal and interpersonal conflict (Nelson & Burke, 2002; O'Neil et al., 2015; Sugiyama et al., 2016). Intra-personally, they often experience role identity conflict and interpersonally they experience both work-family conflict and work-family enrichment, as they have made a conscious decision to construct work-life balance in differing ways. Similar to the experiences of some of the subjects in the study, O'Neil et al. (2015) found that the primary factors affecting women's leadership development include challenging work-life integration and career/life stage concerns. According to Women in Leadership, Chartered Management Institute and Women in Management (2013), women feel conflicted when having to choose between being a stay-at-home mother and pursuing a career and often leave their career to fulfil their parental duties. In the South African context, participation in all the above roles may threaten women's physical and mental health (Franks et al., 2006). In order to overcome role identity conflict, Sugiyama et al. (2016) proposed a framework for leadership development that aims to combine achievement of organisational goals with relational goals. Pedersen, Minnotte, Kiger, and Mannon (2009) found that companies that offer family-friendly benefits will receive positive organisational outcomes. Therefore, organisations should support female leadership by introducing flexible working arrangements, offering day-care facilities and promoting wellness.

All women in the study alluded to the role work facets play in the construction of their leadership identity. Some researchers argue that developmental experience of a few days is unlikely to change behaviour (Van Rooyen & Whittle, 2011; Mpehle & Kanjere, 2013). In contrast, women leadership development programmes deal with women's
identity work by providing a transformational space for women (Ely et al., 2011; Sugiyama et al., 2016). However, Dalakoura (2010) asserts that leadership development is not simply the result of traditional training programmes; rather it is the result of multiple well-coordinated activities aimed at developing individuals. Similarly, Vinnicombe and Singh (2002) propose that in addition to mentoring, coaching, on-the-job training and leadership courses, women-only training will foster women's leadership ambitions, strengths and access to leadership positions. Therefore, it may be recommended that organisations create LDCs and not merely leadership development programmes (Carden & Callahan, 2007). All the participants alluded to the fact that that the organisation they were working for served as an LDC for them (Swensen et al., 2016). Moreover, they illustrated how the organisation provided coordinated activities, which assisted in their transition to becoming female leaders. They also credited forums, conferences and leadership development programmes and the role that these played in fostering their leadership identity (Carden & Callahan, 2007; Harris & Leberman, 2012; Sugiyama et al., 2016).

Furthermore, they all believed that they had more identity construction to perform before they could actually consider or view themselves as good leaders. They had all experienced some form of leadership identity conflict when the leadership role they assumed conflicted with their gender identity. Congruent with the experiences of some of the participants, Bierema (2016) found that although women are well equipped in terms of educational level and will, they may still not be viewed as ideal leaders. This view could prevail both internally and externally: internally, where they do not view themselves as leaders, and externally when others may not view them as leaders.

Sugiyama et al. (2016) state that women may find that their gender identities and leadership identities conflict; however, if they view both positively, they are more likely to navigate well as leaders (Ely & Meyerson, 2000; Sugiyama et al., 2016). To overcome the conflict that female managers experience, they must successfully navigate or negotiate between their gender and leader identities to fit into a new leadership identity (Ely & Meyerson, 2000; Sims, Gong & Hughes, 2016; Sugiyama et al., 2016). To accomplish this, they need to find synergies among these identities through reflection on their identity, values and formation of a positive self-definition (Sims et al., 2016).
To overcome the conflict, these women often turn to developmental relationships that they had formed within the organisation, be these through coaches, mentors, managers or co-workers. According to Ghosh et al. (2013), companies should invest in building high-quality developmental relationships, as this supports continuous learning and development. Skinner (2014) posits that executive coaching may also create and foster developmental relationships and experiences, as well as leadership identity. Executive coaching efforts should consider the negotiation between women's self-concept and their role. By reflecting on these experiences, women will be able to crystallise their leadership identity (DeRue et al., 2010; Skinner, 2014; Yeager & Callahan, 2016). Developmental relationships have the potential to foster leader development that extends beyond companies (Gibson, 2008) and communities (Lovell, 2013). Similar to the participants in the study, females may need assistance from external sources to create a leadership identity. Zheng and Muir (2015) were interested in the identity work that individuals do in order to transform their identity to one that includes a leadership identity. The study included participants and mentors and a model of how leadership identity evolves. According to Zheng and Muir (2015), leader identity development is a multifaceted process that involves expanding boundaries, recognising interdependencies and discerning purpose. Furthermore, these dimensions, along with a broadening understanding of leadership, lead to a more salient leader identity.

Regardless of their managers’ leadership styles, all the participants’ leadership identities were shaped by their managers in different ways. For some it meant aspiring to be just like their managers, while for others the opposite was true. Similar to the participants in the study, regardless of the gender of their managers, in the 21st century world of work, collaborative and participative styles are valued most by female managers (Vongalis-Macrow, 2016).

Although some of the participants in the study acknowledged the role of networking in the 21st century world of work, none of them engaged deliberately in networking activities, as they all credited climbing up the corporate ladder to their hard work. Moreover, they all claimed that they felt they were recognised and rewarded in the company and never needed to pursue other opportunities, either within or outside the company. Similar to participants in this study, Maxwell (2009) found that participants did not adopt career strategies such as networking. Instead they said they had been
spontaneously recognised and supported by the organisation because of their hard work and the core competencies that they exhibited (Maxwell, 2009).

Based on the study, it is evident that organisations should create an LDC to enable females to create their leadership identities (Carden & Callahan, 2007; Dalakoura, 2010; Sugiyama et al., 2016; Swensen et al., 2016). In the South African context, networking should be promoted so that women can form relationships outside of the organisation in order to share their experiences with other women. According to Women in Leadership, Chartered Management Institute and Women in Management (2013), organisations should support female leadership by introducing coaches, mentors and networking opportunities. In addition, Vinnicombe and Singh (2002) propose that supplementary to mentoring, coaching, on-the-job training and leadership courses, women-only training will foster women's leadership ambitions, strengths and access to leadership positions.

Findings suggest that leadership development should be viewed as identity construction, owing to the nature of its emergence as interaction between people in which they recognise and are recognised (Karp & Helgo, 2009). The women in the study all alluded to some form of identity transformation. For some the transition was seamless, while for others it was difficult. The identity construction that these women needed to perform involved a few mega-shifts through which they needed to build their self-confidence and self-esteem (Brenner, Serpe & Stryker, 2018; Stets & Burke, 2014). This is similar to the recommendations of Clerkin and Ruderman (2016), who argue that leader development must include emphasis on both well-being (neurophysiological and subjective) and intra-personal competence (self-awareness, self-regulation and self-motivation). Women in the study engaged in a number of activities that enabled them to construct their intrapersonal and interpersonal competencies and they balanced their personal and professional lives (Clerkin & Ruderman, 2016). According to Clerkin and Ruderman (2016), it is not sufficient for leaders to be qualified and knowledgeable; effective leaders have to be adaptable, focused and resilient. Similar to participants in the study, female managers' readiness for a developmental experience is a prerequisite for women not merely to engage in developmental experiences, but to internalise them (Harris & Cole, 2007). Reichard at al. (2017) assert that leader developmental efficacy (belief in one's ability to develop leadership skills and knowledge) predicts successful leader development. A leader's
development efficacy predicts both intentions to self-develop and actual implementation of behaviour (Reichard et al., 2017). Women in the study also acknowledged that they adopted personal strategies such as adaptability, introspection, building relationships and active listening (Reichard et al., 2017). Becoming a leader goes beyond adopting techniques; it involves identity work and experience in a role; therefore, leader development should be viewed as an ongoing process (Andersson, 2012; Karp, 2012). Interestingly, regardless of their background, positions or professions, all the women in the study exhibited elements of authentic and ethical leadership (Modisane, 2017). Emphasis on authentic leadership may cultivate both integrity and ethics in leaders; authentic leadership practices enhance both innovation and networking (Beal, 2017; Modisane, 2017). The authenticity of female leadership resides in women’s emphasis on not being perfect (Beal, 2017), which makes it difficult for them to engage in identity work.

**Strategies of identity work**

There is a strong link between the above-mentioned identity bases and identity work strategies. Furthermore, identity work strategies may be viewed as strategies used to overcome the tensions (Adams & Crafford, 2012; Kreiner, Hollensbe & Sheep, 2006; Saayman & Crafford, 2011) of the various identity bases, which include the impact of life spheres, integrating personal and professional roles, the role work facets play and the changing self, in order to create an optimal balance (Kreiner et al., 2006; Saayman & Crafford, 2011) that will create and foster a leadership identity.

Women in the study employed four primary identity work strategies to overcome the different identity bases they experienced, namely (i) being guided by personal philosophies, (ii) balance and negotiation between personal and professional lives, (iii) building relationships both personally and professionally and (iv) assuming ownership for careers and lives through the use of career management strategies. The identity work strategies selected by women in the study were aligned to the findings of Adams and Crafford (2012) on identity work performed in the manufacturing industry in South Africa.

Participants in the study often adopted personal philosophies to make sense of their world and cope with difficulties in their work lives (Adams & Crafford, 2012). For example, some women described how they grew up in underprivileged circumstances
and how that shaped them in wanting to follow a purpose. They also explained how their purpose had fostered the development of their leadership identity.

In order to address the challenge of integrating personal and professional roles, women in the study often engaged in strategies that allowed for negotiating balance (Adams & Crafford, 2012; Kreiner et al., 2006; Saayman & Crafford, 2011). For example, women in the study described that they engaged in a number of personal and professional roles and at times experienced a sense of role conflict. However, most of the women in the study set boundaries to facilitate a work-life balance and this facilitated their leadership identity development.

Forming and building relationships was a strategy commonly used by participants to reinforce their identities. This strategy was also used to address challenges that arose from work facets (Adams & Crafford, 2012; Brown, 2017; Saayman & Crafford, 2011). Women in the study commended their organisation as an LDC and stated that it served as an identity space (Brown, 2017). Furthermore, they enjoyed the support of developmental experiences and relationships. Some even praised their managers’ leadership style for allowing them to flourish in their respective roles (Saayman & Crafford, 2011).

Career management refers to strategies women in the study followed to enhance the growth of their professional and vocational lives and this strategy facilitated the development of changing selves for women through personal and professional means (Adams & Crafford, 2012; Kirpal, 2004; Saayman & Crafford, 2011). Women in the study engaged in a number of activities to form or develop a leadership identity. For example, they improved their self-esteem and confidence, built intra-personal and interpersonal competencies, and engaged in other personal strategies. They also exhibited an authentic and ethical leadership identity.

According to Kirpal (2004b), as cited in Bothma and Roodt (2012), there are three processes in identity development: identity formation, identity activation and resulting behaviour. For women in the study, leadership identity developed through the interaction between an individual with a distinctive self, self-concept and personal identity and specific social foci such as the identity bases mentioned above. Through engagement with the identity bases, certain meanings, norms, expectations, beliefs and core values were derived and these were stored as either prototypes or identity
standards. By means of the identity work strategies mentioned above, women may use certain behaviour guides. A work identity may be constructed; this identity may encompass elements of a leadership identity. In response to perceptions about a specific social situation, the most appropriate identity (behaviour guide) is selected and activated to guide behaviour. As mentioned previously, when faced with ethical dilemmas, women in the study often exhibit both authentic and ethical leadership.

Furthermore, women in the study engaged in processes such as identity verification to validate their identity (Burke & Stets, 2009; Stets & Serpe, 2014), identity assimilation and accommodation to integrate with their environment (Piaget, 1975) and constant identity evaluation (Breakwell, 1983).

**Leadership identity**

This study revealed that in spite of the background women come from, the work-life conflict they experience, and the dynamics of working in a male-dominated environment, they were still able to perform identity work. Furthermore, they were able to form a leadership identity in which purpose, balance, relationships, ownership and authenticity were all inclusive of their unique leadership identity. Findings suggest that leadership development should be viewed as identity construction (Davis et al., 2016; Grøn et al., 2019; Humberd, 2014; Ibarra, et al., 2010), because of the nature of its emergence as interaction between people in which they recognise and are recognised (Karp & Helgo, 2009). Leadership is the ability to mobilise the work necessary to develop one’s self by reflecting on identity in different contexts and then applying the necessary acts of leadership (Karp & Helgo, 2009; Komives, et al., 2005).

Women in the study were all driven by a greater purpose of contributing to a better society for all (Komives, et al., 2005). Zheng and Muir (2015) were interested in the identity work that individuals do to transform their identity to one that includes a leadership identity. According to Zheng and Muir (2015), leader identity development is a multifaceted process that involves expanding boundaries, recognising interdependencies and discerning purpose. Furthermore, these dimensions, along with a broadening understanding of leadership, lead to a more salient leader identity.

Participants also discussed how they negotiated and balanced their personal and professional identities. For some it meant integrating their work and personal lives and for others it meant establishing boundaries between their work and personal lives.
According to Karp (2012), leadership identity does not happen as a result of leadership training programmes or quick-fix self-help books, but rather occurs when a leader engages in a deep process that builds self-awareness, relational strength and environmental capabilities and qualities needed to act and take leadership in a dynamic organisational environment.

Moreover, women in the study engaged in relationship building both in their personal lives and in their professional lives. Executive coaching efforts should consider the negotiation between women's self-concept and their role; by reflecting on these experiences, women will be able to crystallise their leadership identity (DeRue et al., 2010; Skinner, 2010).

Subjects of the study also took ownership of their careers and engaged in a number of activities that resulted in both personal and professional growth. Day et al. (2008) posit that the act of leadership requires a commitment to develop oneself. Women in the study displayed readiness to engage in leadership development activities. Leadership identity development entails a process of viewing oneself and being seen by others as a leader (Dahlvig & Longman, 2016). According to Day and Harrison (2007) the more one believes and views oneself as a leader, the more one will seek out leadership development experiences. Much like a self-fulfilling prophesy, individuals who view themselves as leaders may actually start to think like leaders (Ligon, Wallace & Osburn, 2011).

Lastly, all the participants in the study displayed forms of ethical and authentic leadership. According to Carden and Callahan (2007), when creating leadership development programmes, one should look beyond creating better leaders and succession plans and also create identity spaces where identity construction can occur that supplements an authentic leadership identity.

3.7 CONCLUSION

In conclusion, female managers in the mining organisation were influenced by the impact of life spheres, integrating personal and professional roles, the role work facets play and their changing self. Any of these factors in isolation, as well as the combination of multiple factors, lead to a process of identity construction or identity work, which involves progression of phases that include identity formation, identity verification, identity assimilation, identity accommodation and identity evaluation.
During the identity construction process a leadership identity is constructed, although this seems to be a continuously evolving process.

3.8 RECOMMENDATIONS

Organisations that are increasingly attempting to attract, retain and motivate women into managerial positions must create or foster their leadership identity through the creation of an LDC. This LDC should include various activities and initiatives to cater for the women’s specific needs, such as fostering leadership skills and competencies, crystallisation of their life’s purpose and work-life balance. The LDC should also promote both mentorship and networking, as well as fostering ethical and authentic leadership.

In conjunction with the creation of an LDC, organisations should revise their policies to cater for the needs of women and the workforce as a whole by including either day-care facilities for minor children or allowing flexible working hours. Both men and women must be given an opportunity to attend to their personal lives, as physical, spiritual, emotional and financial dimensions of wellness often remain neglected.

In an attempt to counter the effects of socio-cultural influence and more specifically gender stereotyping and discrimination, gender-sensitivity training should be included as mandatory training for all employees to attend. The supportive role of men in this journey will be critical and may be achieved through how they lead women as well as men, providing women with opportunities for cross-mentorship and promotion.

Through the use of a women’s forum, regardless of their age or position, women within an organisation should form a support group where they support and empower one another on pertinent issues. Focussing on building these types of relationships would eradicate Queen Bee behaviour.

3.9 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

Because the research is qualitative in nature, limitations of the study include the sample size being limited to five female managers. Furthermore, the concept of leadership has been understood to include people who are not in management roles as well. However, owing to limited resources and time constraints, I was unable to include other female employees from the mining organisation or women from other mining organisations. The sample of women was also only spread in Gauteng, South
Africa and participants were selected for their ease of accessibility. These participants were, however, confirmed to be information-rich on the phenomenon under study, as they exhibited strong leadership identity and the organisation under study was viewed as an LDC. Because of the nature of the study, men were not included in the study. Lastly, the study followed a cross-sectional approach because of time constraints. However, it may have been a better idea for it to have been more longitudinal in nature in order to identify younger females and explore how they perform identity work to create a leadership identity.

3.10 FUTURE RESEARCH

Future research should aim to explore how young females perform identity work to create a leadership identity. This type of study will be crucial in identifying, attracting, retaining and motivating young females in the mining industry as a whole, which will lead to positive outcomes for mining companies that need to increase the number of women in leadership positions or the number of women in mining.

Future research should also compare how men and women perform identity work to create their leadership identities to establish if a women-only approach to leadership development is appropriate in this modern world, where traditional roles may no longer be assumed by the sexes.

A comparison must be made between LDCs that foster leadership identity development and contexts that do not promote leadership identity in order to establish the role of LDCs.

Lastly, the Women’s Leadership Identity Development Model produced in this study should be tested across genders, races and cultures to determine if it may be applicable to the South African context as a whole.
References


Reiners, G. M. (2012). Understanding the differences between Husserl’s (descriptive) and Heidegger’s (interpretive) phenomenological research. *Journal of Nursing & Care, 1*(5), 1-3.


CHAPTER 4

CONCLUSIONS, LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The study explored the experiences of female managers working in an LDC in the mining industry, to determine how they constructed a leadership identity. The objective of this chapter is to discuss the research conclusions, limitations and recommendations.

4.2 CONCLUSIONS

Based on the research study, I discuss the subsequent conclusions. First, I will summarise the literature conclusions; thereafter I will present the conclusions that derived from the empirical part of the study.

4.2.1 Conclusions from the literature review

In order to attain the first aim stated in chapter 1 I compiled a literature review on women in the workplace considering barriers they face and coping strategies they adopt. I also considered identity theories relevant to my research topic such as social identity theory and identity theory. Thereafter, I presented literature on women's leadership identity.

In the literature, both locally and internationally, there are a few major trends relating to women in leadership roles. In South Africa, since the mining industry is recognised as a primarily male-dominated industry, it is no surprise that there is a shortage of women in leadership roles (Martin & Barnard, 2013).

From the earliest life stage, women experience the force of socio-cultural influence and this has a negative impact on how females interpret their gender roles (Davis & Maldonado, 2015; Saifuddin, 2017). Women often experience conflict because society tells them either directly or indirectly that they are not meant to be leaders. Gender stereotypes they often encounter result in low self-esteem and low self-confidence (Atewologun & Singh, 2010; Proches, 2013; Steyn, 2015). Furthermore, they bear the brunt of negative societal views about the capabilities of women (Atewologun & Singh, 2010; Proches, 2013; Steyn, 2015). Women in the mining industry are also affected by the male-dominated nature of the mining industry (Martin & Barnard, 2013).
Oftentimes they experience discrimination based on arbitrary grounds, such as age and gender (Bonebright et al., 2012).

Even as young adults, women experience attaining and maintaining work-life balance as a challenge. In their personal capacity, women assume roles such as mother, wife, daughter and sister, while professionally women assume the roles of student, coach, mentor, manager and coordinator, among others (Carden & Callahan, 2007; Chesley & Flood, 2017). Each role women assume places demands on them in terms of time, energy and effort. The combination of personal and professional roles often leads to both role identity conflict and work-family conflict (O'Neil et al., 2015; Sugiyama et al., 2016).

Organisational support plays a key role in facilitating leadership identity development. For example, an organisation may provide an LDC to counter the effects of leadership identity conflict (Carden & Callahan, 2007; Sugiyama et al., 2016). Furthermore, LDCs highlight the respective roles of leadership development programmes, networking and mentorship in fostering or crystallising leadership identity development (Abalkhail & Allan, 2015; Ghosh et al., 2013; Maseko & Proches, 2013).

There are many possible reasons for the lack of women in leadership roles and it is evident that women may need to perform identity work to overcome the effects of various facets of their lives and attain leadership roles (Zheng & Muir, 2015). Once females assume leadership roles, in order to create a leadership identity where they view themselves and are viewed by others as leaders, they must undergo further identity construction/work to maintain the role (DeRue & Ashford, 2010).

According to both SIT and IT, the self is reflexive in that it views itself as an object. As such, the self categorises, classifies or names itself in particular ways in relation to other social categories or classifications (group, role or personal). Identity construction involves a process of identity formation, identity verification, identity assimilation, identity accommodation and evaluation (Breakwell, 1983; Brenner et al., 2018; Lloyd et al., 2011; Piaget, 1975; Stets & Burke, 2014). Successful completion of the identity construction process results in leadership identity formation (Komives et al., 2009).
4.2.2 Conclusions from the empirical study

In the section below, conclusions from the empirical study will be discussed according to identity bases, identity work strategies and leadership identity.

4.2.2.1 Identity bases

Female managers in the mining industry have experienced the impact of a number of different identity bases on their leadership identity. These bases act as a guiding force propelling female managers to address the tensions they experience and in turn women undergo identity work, which results in the creation of a leadership identity. The theme ‘identity bases’ encompasses the following sub-themes: (i) the impact of life spheres, (ii) integrating personal and professional roles, (iii) the role work facets play, and (iv) the changing self. Each of the sub-themes will be discussed below.

a) The impact of life spheres

The impact of life spheres is evident in female managers’ narratives. All women taking part in the study described their struggle with overcoming socio-cultural influence and the male-dominated nature of the mining industry. Furthermore, some described their experiences of discrimination and stereotypes. Women in the study also stated that they were driven by life’s purpose, which often involved effecting positive change and making a difference in others’ lives. Participants in the study also credit the supportive role of family for their success. Whether the support emanated from their spouses, parents, siblings or children, all of the women cited the importance of this supportive role. Most women in the study also discussed how growing up in underprivileged circumstances propelled them to achieve success. The motivation was either to make their parents proud or to attain a certain level of wealth. Lastly, participants in the study described how their worldviews shaped their leadership definition. Whereas some leaders defined leadership as positional, others defined it as personal or situational.

b) Integrating personal and professional roles

Based on the life stories of women participating in the study, it is evident that they engage in fulfilling a number of roles simultaneously. Participants in the study assume the following primary personal roles, among others: mother, wife, daughter, sister. From each of these roles certain demands arise for women to fulfil. These expectations include caregiving, cooking and cleaning and providing financial support,
among others. In addition to the personal roles, women assume a number of professional roles in the workplace. The professional roles that women assume including those of manager, mentor and coach. Because of the number of conflicting roles women assume, they often experience role identity conflict in which one or more roles conflict with another in terms of values, beliefs or time allocation. To deal with the role identity conflict described above, women must manage their work-life interface. The outcome of the work-life interface often equates to work-family conflict or work-family enrichment. Women participating in the study have moved away from the above notion to a view of maintaining work-life balance. They highlighted how their role as students and attaining their qualifications and formative experiences shaped them. The benefits of qualifications and formative experience ranged from learning technical and leadership skills and acquiring knowledge, gaining inspiration, learning from failure and career advancement.

c) The role work facets play

Through their narratives, women participating in the study highlighted their exposure to work facets, specifically the LDC that their organisation provides. According to the female managers’ stories gathered in the study, women projected that they viewed their current workplace as an identity space. An identity space is a place in which women are transformed into female leaders. For women taking part in the study, this space was not viewed in the literal sense; rather it comprised time, support, and leadership development programmes. The women stated that they had experienced some form of leadership identity conflict. Similar to role conflict, however, in this case leadership identity is in direct conflict with the managerial role the female assumes. In the study, most women did not view themselves as leaders. Some women also struggled with the contrast between what they believed a leader ought to do and what they were actually doing. This leadership identity conflict exposed the women to developmental experiences and relationships. Developmental experiences and relationships to which women were exposed refer to the experiences, defining moments and relationships through mentorship and coaching that women received while on the job. In addition to the above, women acknowledged the effects of their managers’ leadership style. This sub-theme refers to the impact of her manager’s leadership style on the participant. In the case of a transformational manager, the female may be inspired and in the case of a transactional/difficult manager, the female
manager may decide against becoming that type of manager. Career strategies are tactics that women employ in order to climb up the corporate ladder. These may include networking and opportunity seeking. In terms of career strategies adopted by women participating in the study, they did not follow the career strategies of networking and opportunity seeking; instead they believed that they were recognised and rewarded for their ethic of hard work.

d) The changing self

Participants in the study all attested to the fact that leadership identity development involves a process of change. Women participating in the study reported that they initially experienced both low self-esteem and lack of confidence, which led to female managers doubting their own abilities. The most substantial change women claimed they all had to undergo involved activities and relationships to build confidence and self-esteem. These activities and relationships gave them a sense of validation of their abilities. Moreover, the female managers underwent a process of broadening intra- personal and interpersonal competencies, for example emotional intelligence and social intelligence respectively. Readiness denotes female managers’ readiness to accept a developmental experience. One participant spoke volumes when she stated that in order to undergo a developmental experience, one must be ready to accept it. Women in the study also adopted personal strategies or mottoes to climb up the corporate ladder. They had to accept that their listening skills needed to be enhanced and that they also needed to perform daily introspection in order to grow. For the women taking part in the study, introspection and adopting listening skills appeared to be personal strategies they adopted in their leadership journey. A crucial component of creating a leadership identity for women participating in the study has been developing both authentic and ethical leadership. Each female manager adopts different levels of transformational and transactional leadership; the common thread is their need to exhibit ethical and authentic leadership.

4.2.2.2 Identity work strategies

In an attempt to address the tensions experienced in various identity bases, women participating in the study adopted the following identity work strategies: (i) personal philosophies, (ii) negotiating balance, (iii) relationships and (iv) career management. The effect of the identity work they performed was the creation of a leadership identity.
a) Personal philosophies

For women in the study, personal philosophies were particularly important for their leadership identity development, as these particular philosophies helped them overcome many struggles that they faced, which arose from the impact of life spheres. When women in the study entered managerial roles, they entered these with a gender-leader frame of reference or lens through which they viewed the world. When these women were unable to create suitable and positive personal philosophies, they found it difficult to cope with and overcome socio-cultural influence (which breeds stereotypes and prejudice concerning women in a mining environment) and growing up in poverty. Furthermore, female managers needed to perform identity work to expand their worldview and leadership definition. On the other hand, when women managers could create relevant personal philosophies, they were able to act against socio-cultural influence; they also educated family and friends on how to remove themselves from a poverty mindset. Furthermore, women in the study were able to expand their leadership definition and in turn their worldview to one where they could begin to view themselves as leaders.

b) Negotiating balance

Negotiating balance was important for women in the study who were undergoing leadership identity development, as they were constantly faced with conflicting demands in their personal and professional lives. They assumed various personal roles (mother, wife, daughter, sister etc) and professional roles (manager, mentor, coach etc). Each of these roles had its own requirements and demands regarding women’s energy, effort and time and some of these roles were in direct conflict with one another. When some female managers in the study entered managerial roles, they were unable to negotiate balance through the use of strategies (such as managing boundaries and work-life integration); some felt overwhelmed by the responsibilities associated with the various roles they played and in turn they experienced stress, depression and burnout. Women who were able to negotiate balance navigated their personal and professional lives better. It is therefore necessary for organisations to consider allowing women in management to negotiate balance through the use of flexible work policies.
c) Relationships

Relationship building was key in creating and fostering leadership identity for women participating in the study. This was partly due to women’s innate need to create and build meaningful relationships, as well as to their leadership style, which tends to be transformative in nature. Moreover, women preferred to learn through experience and relationships. When women in the study did not form relationships in the workplace, it was difficult for them to overcome leadership identity conflict. When women did not enjoy a variety of relationships in the workplace with their managers, peers and colleagues, it was difficult for them to learn both technical and interpersonal competencies. It was also difficult for some women because they were lacking emotional support. However, when women adopted relationship building and maintenance, they engaged in leadership identity construction both within and outside the organisation. They also gained emotional support and a host of leadership skills and expertise. They were thus able to gain confidence and apply for managerial positions they would not otherwise have applied for.

d) Career management

Career management was an essential component of leadership identity development for women in the study, as it allowed them to gain self-confidence and self-esteem, broaden their interpersonal and intrapersonal competencies, and fast-track their leader development readiness. Most importantly, career management strategies that focused on personal identity enabled female managers to foster both ethical and authentic leadership. When women did not adopt an appropriate career management strategy, they did not gain self-esteem; they also found it difficult to broaden their interpersonal and intrapersonal competencies or fast-track their leader development readiness. Moreover, they were unable to develop and maintain an ethical or authentic leadership identity successfully.

4.2.2.3 Leadership identity

Most participants in the study found it difficult to define themselves as leaders, as they tended to have a heroic view of leadership and who a leader is (Epitropaki, 2018). All the participants were able to form a leadership identity in which purpose, balance, relationships, ownership and authenticity were part of their unique leadership identity. This is similar to the view of Humberd (2014), who posits that women’s leadership
identity consists of the following core characteristics: subjective certainty, identity aspirations, credibility, efficacy and authenticity. Women in the study were all driven by a greater purpose of contributing to a better society for all (Komives, et al., 2005). Participants also discussed how they negotiated and balanced their personal and professional identities (Adams & Crafford, 2012). Moreover, women in the study engaged in relationship-building in both their personal and their professional lives (DeRue et al., 2010; Skinner, 2014). Participants in the study also took ownership of their careers and engaged in a number of activities that resulted in both personal and professional growth (Day & Harrison, 2007; Day et al., 2008). All the participants in the study displayed forms of ethical and authentic leadership (Carden & Callahan, 2007). To enable the women taking part in the study to create their leadership identity, they were propelled by identity tensions to undergo extensive identity work (Ibarra & Petriglieri, 2016). This identity work was fostered through leadership development efforts provided by their organisation, as well as these participants’ commitment to continuous leadership development (Davis, Levy & Parco, 2016; Grøn, Bro & Andersen, 2019; Humberd, 2014; Snook et al., 2010).

4.3 LIMITATIONS

A discussion on the limitations of the literature review and empirical study will follow.

4.3.1 Limitations of literature review

Even though much research has been done on women in leadership in the global context, in the South African context little qualitative research has been undertaken on how women in LDCs create their leadership identity through the use of identity work. This therefore posed a challenge of providing a solid background that could facilitate understanding the research question in the South African context.

4.3.2 Limitations of the empirical study

A number of challenges were associated with conducting a qualitative empirical study.

4.3.2.1 Sample size

The five female managers who formed part of the sample in this study constituted only a small fraction of the women working in male-dominated professions. The sample of women was also limited to one province in South Africa and participants were selected
for their ease of accessibility. Other females in other mining companies, as well as other employees in male-dominated professions, were difficult to access and therefore not included in this study.

4.3.2.2 Linguistic and cultural issues

English was the language medium used in the data collection interviews because of my language limitations as a researcher. For participants whose first language was not English, this may have affected their ability to express themselves freely and eloquently. South Africa has 11 official languages; only two of the participants’ first language was English.

4.3.2.3 Leadership development context limited to the specific company

The study was limited to one mining company and the LDC provided by that specific company. The results may only be generalisable to other organisations with a similar LDC.

4.3.2.4 Researcher subjectivity

As the study followed a hermeneutic phenomenological research approach, the data are subjective, and it is difficult to establish the validity of the information. There may also be researcher subjectivity.

4.3.2.5 Semi-structured interviews

Interviews provide information reflecting the views of interviewees, but do not provide information about the interviewee in her natural setting. The researcher’s presence may bias responses and participants may not provide an accurate picture of events or may exaggerate experiences and events.

4.3.2.6 Cross-sectional study

The study was conducted at a specific point in time rather than over a period of time. Great insight would have been gathered if the study had been done over a period of years because the researcher could have seen the impact of what women experience when transitioning through various life stages and life roles.
4.4 RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations are made for future studies in the field of I-O psychology, as well as for organisational application in the human resources field.

4.4.1 Recommendations for future studies

Future research should explore how women in different industries and contexts create their leadership identity. The research should be conducted across South Africa and beyond to account for cultural differences and linguistic preferences. Longitudinal research should be conducted to include women of various ages to document identity construction through various life stages and role transitions. This research should also be conducted among women in various roles and not only management roles.

Future studies may wish to study more specific participants regarding more similar personal identity markers in terms of mother and spouse roles that have an impact on leadership development in the workplace, as well as how these identity markers shape work-life balance differently for women leaders. For example: Do mothers experience the workplace differently in terms of leadership from women who do not have children?

The concept of agency has been pertinent in exploring and highlighting identity construction (Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty, 2016; Shanahan, 2009). Agency may be viewed as the reflexive process and adoption of different perspectives that allow participants to take agency in the construction of themselves in relation to others (Healy, 2014; Tao & Gao, 2017). According to Healy (2014), agentic action is facilitated by the ability to imagine a credible new self, which in turn is associated with agency, coping and well-being. This was echoed by Tao and Gao (2017), who found that identity commitment led to agency, which led to further professional development.

In my study, the data revealed dominant discourses and the proactive agency demonstrated by women in integrating counter-discourses. As the concept of agency is an important construct to discuss in identity studies, I recommend that agency be addressed in further studies on women in leadership.

4.4.2 Recommendations for organisational application

Organisations in male-dominated industries, such as the mining industry, will need to make a great effort to attract, retain and motivate women in such industries. Changes
should be made to organisational policies, HR practices and the LDC. Each of these recommendations will be discussed below.

a) Organisational policies

In order for mining companies and male-dominated industries to attract and retain more women in their operations, they must cater for women’s work-life balance needs. Organisational policies must be reviewed to ensure that they allow for flexible working hours, day-care facilities for young children, as well as personal days for both men and women to attend to their children’s or parents’ needs. Furthermore, policies should cover aspects such as discrimination, sexual harassment and abuse in the workplace. This will ensure that negative socio-cultural influence is negated.

b) HR practices

HR practices should be transformed in such a way that women are attracted to male-dominated professions and motivated to stay in these. This may be achieved through organisations’ strategies and processes regarding recruitment and selection, remuneration, performance management, wellness, recognition and reward, leadership development, succession planning and culture.

c) Leadership development contexts

Organisational support is key in the success of female managers; therefore, organisations must create LDCs that provide mentorship, coaching and networking opportunities for women. Furthermore, organisations should provide training, leadership development programmes and a women’s forum as a platform for women who are struggling with balancing their personal and professional lives, their life spheres and transforming themselves according to organisational requirements.

4.5 CHAPTER SUMMARY

In this chapter, I presented conclusions from the literature review and empirical study. The process through which women in an LDC create a leadership identity was found to consist of identity bases, identity work and leadership identity. The limitations of the study were delineated and recommendations for future studies and application in organisations were outlined.
4.6 PERSONAL REFLECTIONS

Looking back on my experience through the project, I have been blessed to meet five leaders whose leadership journeys are motivational, inspirational and powerful. Through the interviews I conducted, I have been privileged to understand these women on a deeper level rather than merely on the basis of the managerial roles that they assume. Though it is difficult to compare journeys, I found certain patterns relating to how women in an LDC construct their leadership identities and I frequently strongly identified with aspects in their stories. All the women who participated in my study had experienced tension in various areas of their lives that compelled them to perform identity work and it is this identity work that has resulted in the formation of a leadership identity. The research objective not only allowed me to engage with the leaders, but also enabled me to look deep within myself. As a researcher, I found myself relating to the participants, as I also experienced the influence of various identity bases, ranging from the impact of life spheres, integrating personal and professional spheres and the role work facets play to the changing self. As a result of the tensions I experienced in various identity bases, as well as my engagement with female leaders taking part in my study and the LDC provided by my organisation, I found myself undergoing identity work. I also gained appreciation for these women and the unique journeys that have led them to create and crystallise their leadership identities. Furthermore, I still engage with these women, as they have become both mentors and coaches to me. Through adopting identity work strategies such as personal philosophies, negotiating balance, creating and maintaining relationships and engaging in career management, I know that someday I will make a great leader.
References


Berger, R. (2015). Now I see it, now I don’t: Researcher’s position and reflexivity in qualitative research. *Qualitative Research, 15*(2), 219-234.


Frankel, R. M., & Devers, K. J. (2000). Study design in qualitative research--1: Developing questions and assessing resource needs. Education for Health, 13(2), 251.


Phillimore, J., & Goodson, L. (2004). *Progress in qualitative research in tourism: Epistemology, ontology and methodology*. In Qualitative research in tourism (pp. 21-23). Routledge.


Reiners, G. M. (2012). Understanding the differences between Husserl’s (descriptive) and Heidegger’s (interpretive) phenomenological research. *Journal of Nursing & Care, 1*(5), 1-3.


APPENDIX A:

INFORMED CONSENT DOCUMENT
Dear (Name of Person)

You have been identified as a participant who would be able to provide information-rich data for this research and I hereby request your approval to participate in this research process.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of the study is to collect data on how women in a leadership development context construct their leadership identity. This information will be useful to both human resource practitioners and industrial psychologists as it aims to improve both the leadership development contexts as well as women’s experiences within such contexts and programmes. This in turn will increase the number of women in leadership roles.

Process of Research

• This is an exploratory study and involves the use of semi-structured interviews.
• Using Company X, a sample of 5-8 female managers from Exxaro will be invited to participate in a semi-structured interview. Thereafter participants will after gaining more information about the study decide if they will be willing participants.
• They will then engage in an interview where they will discuss how they have performed identity work to construct their leadership identity. Notes will be taken, sessions will be recorded and a thematic analysis will be conducted to identify specific themes.
• This will allow the researcher to get valuable insight on the topic. Strategies will be implored to ensure valid and quality data.
Data / Research Requirements

- The researcher requests your permission to conduct semi-structured interviews with you as a willing participant.
- You have the right to withdraw at any stage during the process
- There is no penalty or loss of benefit for non-participation.

Confidentiality

- No personal data will be made available in the publishing of this research.
- All names will be changed and aliases will be used when reporting on findings.
- Only the researcher and fieldworkers will collect the data for this study and this data will not be shared with any other person.
- All data will be stored in a secure location and will only be accessible by the researcher.
- All data (both electronic and hard-copies) will be destroyed on completion of this research project. It is estimated that this research will be completed by completion date.

Access to Data

- Only the researcher will have access to the provided data. Any further authorisation for other persons to have access to the data will require further written consent. The data will be retained and secured such that only the researcher will have access to.

Use of Information

- The dissertation will be submitted to the University of South Africa (UNISA) for evaluation. All actual data relevant to the study will be retained by the researcher and will not be shared with UNISA. However, the qualitative analysis and findings will be included in the dissertation.

Reporting of Findings

- The findings of the research will be shared with you in a report format and presentation.
Anticipated and Known Risks

- All attempts will be made to ensure that this research does not cause the participants any undue harm and emotional distress.

To thank you for your contribution and to provide you with feedback on the research, a copy of the published journal article will be sent to you.

Informed Consent:

I, (name of person)____________________________________________________

have read, understood, agree and consent to the above conditions of research as stated above.

Should you have any additional questions or concerns, please feel free to contact me.

Name of Researcher : Kerrina Naidoo

HPCSA Registration Number: PSS 0135623

Category: Student Psychologist

Qualifications: Masters Student (Industrial & Organisational) Psychology

Contact Details: 0842499508/ 0817814660

kerrinanaidoo@gmail.com

Supervisor: Prof Antoni Barnard

Signature: ________________________

Place: ____________________________

Date: ____________________________
APPENDIX B:

SAMPLE OF QUESTIONS PARTICIPANTS WERE ASKED

Central Interview Question
1) Tell me your story of becoming a leader?
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
_________________________________________________________

Probing Questions

a) What shaped your leadership development context?
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________

b) What significant developmental interventions (e.g. LDPs, training, networking, mentorship etc) have you undergone and how did you experience these interventions?
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________

b) What were some of the defining moments in developing your leadership?
   How did this effect your thoughts and feelings?
   How did this effect your relationships?
d) How would you describe your personal leadership style?

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________

e) What are some of the challenges and support that you experienced toward career advancement?

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________

f) What have been some of your personal strategies toward career advancement?

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________
APPENDIX C:

ETHICAL CLEARANCE APPROVAL

UNISA CEMS/IOP RESEARCH ETHICS REVIEW COMMITTEE

24 October 2017

Dear Kerrina Naidoo,

Decision: Ethics Approval from 17 October 2017 to 17 October 2020

Researcher(s): Name: Kerrina Naidoo
Address: 16 Starling Street, Extension 1, 1820
E-mail address, telephone: kerrinanaidoo@gmail.com, +27842499508

Supervisor(s): Name: Prof HA Barnard
E-mail address, telephone: barnaha@unisa.ac.za, (012) 4294217

Constructing leadership identity: identity work of women in a leadership development context.

Qualification: Post graduate degree

Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa CEMS/IOP Research Ethics Review Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for Three years.

The low risk application was reviewed by the CEMS/IOP Research Ethics Review Committee on the 17th October 2017 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and the Standard Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision was approved on 17th October 2017.

The proposed research may now commence with the provisions that:

1. The researcher(s) will ensure that the research project adheres to the values and principles expressed in the UNISA Policy on Research Ethics.
2. Any adverse circumstance arising in the undertaking of the research project that is relevant to the ethicality of the study should be communicated in writing to the Unisa CEMS/IOP Research Ethics Review Committee.
3. The researcher(s) will conduct the study according to the methods and procedures set out in the approved application.

4. Any changes that can affect the study-related risks for the research participants, particularly in terms of assurances made with regards to the protection of participants’ privacy and the confidentiality of the data, should be reported to the Committee in writing, accompanied by a progress report.

5. The researcher will ensure that the research project adheres to any applicable national legislation, professional codes of conduct, institutional guidelines and scientific standards relevant to the specific field of study. Adherence to the following South African legislation is important, if applicable: Protection of Personal Information Act, no 4 of 2013; Children’s Act no 38 of 2005 and the National Health Act, no 61 of 2003.

6. Only de-identified research data may be used for secondary research purposes in future on condition that the research objectives are similar to those of the original research. Secondary use of identifiable human research data require additional ethics clearance.

7. No field work activities may continue after the expiry date (17th October 2020). Submission of a completed research ethics progress report will constitute an application for renewal of Ethics Research Committee approval.

Note:
The reference number 2017_CEMS/IOP_016 should be clearly indicated on all forms of communication with the intended research participants, as well as with the Committee.

Yours sincerely,

[Signatures]

Signature
Chair of IOP ERC
E-mail: grohls@unisa.ac.za
Tel: (012) 429-8272

Signature
Executive Dean: CEMS
E-mail: mogulmt@unisa.ac.za
Tel: (012) 429-4805