The miners, the just wage and the mining company:
Perspectives of an Ubuntu response to the Marikana killings

by

JULIEKA BAYAT

submitted in accordance with the requirements
for the degree of

DOCTOR OF LITERATURE AND PHILOSOPHY

in the subject

PHILOSOPHY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR : PROF MB RAMOSE

FEBRUARY 2019
I declare that this thesis is my own, unaided work. It is submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Literature and Doctor of Philosophy at the University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa. It has not been previously submitted for any degree or examination at any other University.

_______________________________________

Julieka Bayat

Submitted on this _____ day of___________________2019 in ___________________
DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to the Rock Drill Operators who were killed on 16 August 2012, in their quest for a just wage, at Marikana in the North West Province in South Africa.
I hereby thank my supervisor, Professor MB Ramose, for his profound guidance and invaluable counsel during the time spent on this thesis. I would like to acknowledge my deceased parents, Dawood Mohamed Cassimjee and Ayesha (Vawda) Cassimjee who instilled in me that education is the weapon against domination and oppression and that education can uplift one from poverty and despair. This philosophy has been my driving force, even at this stage of my life. For instilling these values in me, I am very grateful. To, my husband, Ismail, I appreciate the environment that he provided that facilitated my growth as a person and enabled me to be the person that I have grown to be. To Nadira, Fiona, Aidan, Fred and my grandchildren Yasmina, Aisha and Adam, thank you for keeping me centred and providing me with the love that only my dearest family can provide. Finally to Albert and Madhurie, a big thank you for your invaluable presence through the years and for constantly encouraging me, when my energy flagged.
ABSTRACT

The miners, the just wage and the mining company:
perspectives of an Ubuntu response to the Marikana killings

This research focuses upon the killing on 16 August 2012, by the South African Police Service, of miners working in Marikana, in the North West Province, in their struggle for a just wage. This experience highlighted the ethical question of the relationship between the employee and the employer. This research investigates this question by reference to the evolution of the doctrine of the “just wage” and the “just price” in Western moral philosophy. The investigation shows that this Western doctrine is a significant basis for an ethical evaluation of the relationship between employee and the employer.

However, the doctrine does require expansion by taking the woman as an indispensable factor in labour relations. Also, it requires deepening by engaging in dialogue with other philosophies of the world, in this particular case, the philosophy of Ubuntu. The dialogue with Ubuntu is justified by the fact that the majority of the miners, the actual diggers of the mineral wealth, are born into and nurtured through the philosophy of Ubuntu, even if some may have reservations about it. The dialogue reveals a specific philosophical issue, namely, a clash of the epistemological and moral paradigms. The Ubuntu epistemological-ethical maxim of feta kgomo o tshware motho (if and when one must choose between the continual accumulation of wealth and the preservation of human life then one ought to opt for the latter) is fundamentally at odds with capitalism, an economic system that elevates wealth and money to the status of a deity. A resolution of this conflict is an ethical imperative.

Key words:

Marikana, Rock Drill Operators (RDOs), miners, Ubuntu, the “just wage”, the “just price”, trade unionism.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Title page</td>
<td>i.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>iii.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>v.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>vii.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ix.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>xi.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 1 - Introduction and Context                                    1

- Introduction                                                            1
- The roleplayers in the quest for a just wage                           5
  - The Miners                                                           6
  - The Mining Company                                                  6
  - The trade unions                                                    7
- A brief summary of the negotiations preceding the massacre            8
- Concerns regarding the trade unions                                     9
- Context of the study                                                   10
  - The move of the Black African women into the capitalist society     10
  - Ubuntu                                                               12
  - Economic and Social Theories                                         13
- The rationale for this study                                           13
- The focus area of the study                                            14
- The purpose of this study                                              16
- A note on the empirical aspect of the research                         16
- Contributions of this study                                            17
- Structure of this thesis                                               18
- Conclusion                                                            18

## Chapter 2 - The role and impact of trade unions on the Black African Workers 19

- Introduction                                                          19
Chapter 4 – The just wage and the just price ................................. 100

Introduction .................................................................................. 100
The economic context within which labour and its employer are situated ............................................................................ 101
Western philosophical approaches ............................................. 103
The evolution of the just price primarily in the West ................. 105
The Just Wage ............................................................................... 112
Did the ‘settlement’ at Marikana achieve a just wage? ............... 118
Marikana under the moral prism of the just wage and the just price ........................................................................................... 121
Did Lonmin place any relevance to human life? ....................... 123
Impact of the unjust economic system ........................................ 124
Conclusion ................................................................................... 126

Chapter 5 – A critique of the ethics of the just price and the just wage in South Africa ................................................................. 128

Introduction .................................................................................. 128
Critique of the just price and the just wage ............................... 129
Ubuntu, the just wage and the just price .................................... 132
Can management practices benefit from Ubuntu? ..................... 133
Did ethics feature as a consideration in Lonmin’s determination of the remuneration for the RDOs? ........................................... 136
Did Lonmin consider justice in the calculation of the remuneration for the RDOs? ................................................................. 138
Did Lonmin have any regard for the human rights of the RDOs? ................................................................................................. 139
What is the role of Government in upholding the social and economic human rights for workers? ........................................... 142
Conclusion ................................................................................... 145

Chapter 6 - Why were the trade unions not effective in Marikana .... 147

Introduction .................................................................................. 147