Dreaming, Embodiment and Perception in the Narrative Arts of the Hopi people

by

DEBORAH LEE KELLEY-GALIN

submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF LITERATURE AND PHILOSOPHY

in the subject

ART HISTORY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: Dr A U KRAJEWSKA

JANUARY 2019
DECLARATION

I declare that *Dreaming, Embodiment and Perception in the Narrative Arts of the Hopi people* is my own work and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

I further declare that I have not previously submitted this work, or part of it, for examination at Unisa for another qualification or at any other higher education Institution.

________________________________________
Deborah Kelley-Galin

Student number 576 353 66

26 January 2019

[Signature]
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The completion of this comprehensive work is owed to the inspiration, expertise, and dedication of my advisor, Dr Ania Krajewska, who helped me find my way. Thank you. In addition, I would like to thank Helen K. Crotty and Patricia Lacey for their constant support, enthusiasm for their subjects, and generosity in sharing their knowledge. I would also like to thank Armin W. Geertz, Sally Cole, and Dorothy Washburn whose individual writings and perspectives inspired this study. Finally, I would like to thank Barbara Shaw for her academic expertise, Taylor Larsen for her inspirations, and my husband, Robert Galin, for his knowledge, constant encouragement, and unwavering support.
SUMMARY

Dreaming, Embodiment and Perception in the Narrative Arts of the Hopi people

This study examines the symbiotic relationships between Hopi traditional arts, the use of art and narrative as mnemonic device, and embedded references to the Fourth World narrative that describes how the Hopi people climbed from a troubled Third World into the current spatio-temporal era, the Fourth World. (The original oral narrative was published by anthropologist Harold Courlander and anonymous consultants in 1971 as *The Fourth World of the Hopis: The Epic Story of the Hopi Indians as Preserved in Their Legends and Traditions*.) This study posits that the traditional arts of the Hopi and their forebears serve as visual and oral reiterations of the Fourth World narrative, including their emergence from an opening in the earth known as the *sipaapuni*. After promising to live a harsh but reverent life, the land’s guardian, *Maasaw*, made the arid southwestern North American land theirs. The Hopi people call these lands *Hopi Tutskwa*, the original home of the migrating “Ancestral Puebloan” predecessors. The Hopi consider objects, habitation sites, structures, and other sacred features to be these ancestors’ embodied “footprints.”

This study describes how diverse Hopi arts are both Ancestral Puebloan “footprints,” and what archaeologists define as “exographic” objects or mnemonic forms of “symbolic storage.” The use of mnemonic objects within the Puebloan culture has been documented as early as 1630 by Fray Alonso de Benavides who noted the use of “knotted strings” as a form of recording “sins” (Morrow, 1996:42). As they relate to mnemonic technology, Hopi arts and lifeways expand the boundaries of Western art history studies to include elements of archaeology and anthropology. Within these interdisciplinary contexts, objects and imagery are not simply “art” in the Western sense, but embodiments of cultural belief and visual reiterations of oral narratives which preserve intrinsic cultural knowledge and belief. This study suggests that what has previously been categorised as Hopi “art” within Western academic contexts is instead an extension of the West’s tradition of *ekphrasis*, or simply “writing about art.” Therefore, Western academia inappropriately emphasises chronological form, style, and development within Hopi arts rather than the significant cognitive role art plays within the *culture* of the people. As traditional metaphors for or reiterations of the Fourth World narrative, this study shows how content embedded within Hopi arts is most appropriately studied through iconological and mytholinguistic analysis as they best serve the Hopi people’s non-Western oracy-based tradition.

**List of Key Terms:** Hopi, Ancestral Puebloan, Corn Lifeway, Emergence, Symbolic Storage, Fourth World, Exographic Objects, *Ekphrasis*
Drome, Vergestalting en Persepsie in die Verhaalkuns van die Hopi-nasie

Hierdie studie ondersoek die simbiotiese verhoudings tussen die Hopi se tradisionele kunsvorme; hulle gebruik van kuns en narratief as mnemoniese middele; en ingebedde verwysings na die Vierdewêreld-narratief wat vertel hoe die Hopi-nasie bo ’n veelbewoë Derde Wêreld kon uitstyg en die huidige tydruimtelike era, die Vierde Wêreld, kon betree. (Die oorspronklike orale narratief, The Fourth World of the Hopis: The Epic Story of the Hopi Indians as Preserved in Their Legends and Traditions, is in 1971 deur die antropoloog Harold Courlander en anonieme konsultante gepubliseer.) Hierdie studie voer aan dat die tradisionele kunste van die Hopi’s en hul voorvaders dien as visuele en orale reiterasies van die Vierdewêreld-narratief, insluitende hulle verskyning deur ’n opening in die aarde wat as die sipaapuni bekend staan.Nadat hulle beloof het om ’n moeilike dog eerbiedige lewe te leef, het die bewaker van die land, Maasaw, die woestynagtige suidwesde van Noord-Amerika aan hulle gegee. Die Hopi-nasie het hierdie streek Hopi Tutskwa, die oorspronklike tuiste van die swerwende “Voorvaderlike Puebloaanse” voorgangers, genoem. Die Hopi beskou objekte, woonterreine, strukture en ander heilige elemente as vergestaltings van die voorvaders se “voetspore”.Volgens die studie is uiteenlopende Hopi-kunsvorme nie net Voorvaderlike Puebloaanse “voetspore” nie, maar ook die “eksografiase” objekte of mnemoniese vorme van “simboliese bewaring” wat deur argeoloë omskryf word. Die aanwending van mnemoniese objekte in die Puebloaanse kultuur is reeds in 1630 opgeteken deur Fray Alonso de Benavides. Hy het vermeld dat knope in toue gemaak is om van “sondes” boek te hou (Morrow, 1996:42). Die verband wat Hopi-kunsvorme en -lewenswyse met mnemoniese tegnologie hou, verbreed die grense van Westerse kunsgeeskiedenisstudie om ook elemente van argeologie en antropologie in te sluit. In hierdie interdisiplinêre kontekste is objekte en beelde nie net eenvoudig “kuns” in die Westerse sin van die woord nie; dit is ook ’n vergestalting van kulturele oortuigings en visuele reiterasies van orale narratiewe wat intrinsieke kulturele kennis en oortuigings bewaar. Hierdie studie voer aan dat dit wat voorheen in Westerse akademiese kontekste as Hopi-“kuns” gekategoriseer is, in werklikheid ’n verlenging is van die Westerse ekphrasis-tradisie, wat eenvoudig beteken “om oor kuns te skryf”. Westerse akademici plaas dus ’n onvanpaste klem op die chronologiese vorm, styl en ontwikkeling van Hopi-kuns in plaas daarvan om die kognitiewe rol wat kuns in die kultuur speel, te beklemtone. Hierdie studie toon hoe die ingebedde inhoud van Hopi-kunsvorme, as tradisionele metafore vir en reiterasies van die Vierdewêreld-narratief, op die mees gepaste wyse bestudeer kan word deur ikonologiese en mitolinguistieke ontleiding van die Hopi-nasie se nie-Westerse tradisie wat op geletterdheid van die gesproke woord (oracy) gebaseer is.

ISIFINGQO

Ukuphupha, Ukuhlanganiswa, Ukuqonda ebuCikweni
Obulandisayo babantu abangamaHopi


okungalungile ngendlela yokulandelana, isitayela nentuthuko ngaphakathi kobuciko bamaHopis esikhundleni sendima ebalulekile yokuqonda edlalwa ubuciko osikweni lwabantu. Njengamazwibela wendabuko wokungathhekisa noma ekulandiseni ngoMhlaba Wesine ngokuphindaphindiwe, lolu eweningo lubonis ukuthi okuqukethwe kufakwe kanjani ebucikweni bamaHopis okuyindlela efanelekile okufundwa ngayo kusetshenziswa ukuhlaziya ayikhonoloji kanye nesayensi ephathelene nolimi lwazinganekwane njengobabechaza abantu abangamaHopis olwakhelwe osikweni lokuxoxwa ngomlomo okungelona lwaseNtshonalanga.

**Amagama abalulekile:** AmaHopi, Okhokho bePueblan, Indlela Yokuphila eCasulayo, Ukuvela, Okuwuphawu Olugciniwe, Umhlaba Wesine, Izinto eziyi-Ekzografi, *Ubcuko bokuhulumu*
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE ............................................................................................................................. i
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS ........................................................................ iv
TERMINOLOGY ................................................................................................................... v
LIST OF FIGURES .............................................................................................................. xii

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCING THE STUDY ................................................................. 1

1.1 INTRODUCTION ....................................................................................................... 1
1.1.1 The Need for Non-Western Art History Methodologies ......................... 2

1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT .......................................................................................... 3
1.2.1 Aims .................................................................................................................... 8
1.2.2 Objectives ......................................................................................................... 8
1.2.3 Domain of the Study ....................................................................................... 10
1.2.4 Limitations of the Study ............................................................................... 11

1.3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY .............................................................................. 11
1.3.1 Worldview Paradigm .................................................................................... 12
1.3.2 Iconological Analysis ................................................................................... 13
1.3.3 Theoretical Background .............................................................................. 14

1.4 OUTLINE OF THE CHAPTERS ........................................................................... 14

CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE ......................................................... 18

2.1 INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................... 18

2.2 PERSPECTIVES AND METHODOLOGIES ..................................................... 18
2.3 CONSCIOUSNESS AND COGNITION IN THE WESTERN CANON ........ 21
2.4 LANGUAGE, ORAL NARRATIVE, AND CULTURAL IMAGERY ................... 22
2.5 INDIGENOUS STUDIES—ETHICS AND APPROACH .................................. 23
2.6 SCIENCE AND MYTH IN INDIGENOUS STUDIES ....................................... 24
2.7 ICONOLOGY: AN ART HISTORY APPROACH ............................................. 24
2.8 PUEBLOAN LIFEWAYS: HISTORICAL ACCOUNTS ..................................... 26
2.9 METAPHOR IN HOPI NARRATIVE AND ART .............................................. 26
2.10 MULTIDISCIPLINARY INFLUENCES: ARCHAEOLOGY AND SYMBOLIC STORAGE .......................................................... 27
2.11 NARROW SCOPE OF WESTERN DISCIPLINE OF ART HISTORY .......... 29

2.12 CULTURAL OBJECTS AS EXOGRAPHIC OBJECTS AND SYMBOLIC STORAGE .......................................................... 29
11.2 WESTERN SCIENCE OF DREAM: EARLY NATIVE AMERICAN EXPERIMENTATION .......................................................... 148
11.3 THE SCIENCE OF HUMAN “SOUL TRAVEL” .......................................................... 150
11.4 NON-WESTERN DREAMS AND THE SCIENCE OF SORCERY ............. 151
11.5 WESTERN SCIENCE: DREAM AS MNEMONIC EVENT ...................... 155
11.6 APPLICATIONS OF WESTERN SCIENCE: EGGAN’S HOPI DREAM STUDIES ................................................................. 155
11.7 DREAM, SELF AND SOCIETY FUNCTION ...................................................... 156
11.8 CONCEPTS OF THE SOUL AND SELF IN GENERAL PUEBLOAN DREAM STUDIES ............................................................... 158
11.9 DREAMS AND FLIGHTS OF THE DEAD ...................................................... 159
11.10 CONCLUSION ................................................................................................ 160

CHAPTER 12: CONCLUSIONS – THE ICONOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS OF NON-WESTERN ART HISTORY AS REFLECTED IN HOPI ART ................................................................. 161
12.1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................ 161
12.2 METAPHORS AND NARRATIVE IN HOPI ARTS AND LANDS ............. 163
12.3 COLONIAL INFLUENCE, CULTURAL CHANGE, AND RESTRUCTURED FORMS ............................................................... 164
12.4 DREAM IN HOPI NARRATIVE .................................................................... 164
12.5 APPLICATIONS OF MYTHOLINGUISTIC ANALYSIS WITHIN HOPI ARTS ........................................................................... 165
12.6 RESTRUCTURING IN HOPI ART AND NARRATIVE ................................ 166

APPENDIX A: A (HOPI FOURTH WORLD NARRATIVE AND MISSION STATEMENT) ............................................................... 167

APPENDIX B: BOOK REVIEW OF COURLANDER’S FOURTH WORLD OF THE HOPIS, 1971 .......................................................... 170

BIBLIOGRAPHY ..................................................................................................... 171
In recent decades, concerns regarding Western bias inherent in the discipline of art history have been raised. Chanda (1998), for example, called for new ways of teaching young students about the images and dimensional works of African peoples and adapted aspects of constructivist learning to the classroom setting. Dissanayake’s earlier writings identified the vast differences evident between “art” as it relates to both Western and non-Western traditions:

Unlike advanced Western society, the majority of preindustrial societies do not generally have an independent concept of (or word for) art—even though people in these societies do engage in making and enjoying one or more of the arts and have words that refer to carving, decorating, being playful, singing, imitating. (Of course, not having a word for something is not proof that the something does not exist; many societies have no words for ‘love’ or ‘kinship,’ yet those abstractions are evident to the outsider who names and then looks for them.) (1988:35).

As an educator working within the field of art history, Chanda’s writings and teaching methodologies directly addressed this issue. Many of her studies specifically identified the problems associated with the ways in which the arts of Africa were portrayed in the American educational system (1995; 1998; 2000; 2004; 2010). For example, according to Chanda, due to their overall complexity, the layers of meaning inherent in African Ndop sculptures were traditionally revealed to children in stages within the traditions of the Kuba people of central Africa. Adapting the non-Western tradition to the Western classroom, she demonstrated the efficacy of the techniques by providing students with a learning opportunity that emulated the traditional stages of learning through a modified constructionist methodology (Chanda & Basinger, 2000).

In later studies and writings, Chanda specifically identified Panofsky’s theories of iconology (1998) as an effective means of educating students about non-Western cultural beliefs and related art forms. In previous years, most non-Western art was addressed within a variety of Western disciplines, including history, anthropology, and archaeology, most of which were not emphasised within the basic curricula of primary grade students (generally ages six through 12 years as taught within the American school system). As a result, students within these early grade levels received little to no exposure to non-Western art forms nor to the ways in which social or cosmological concepts manifest themselves through imagery in oracy-based cultures.

As a student of art history myself, whose primary area of emphasis is Ancestral Puebloan and Hopi tradition, Chanda’s comprehensive writings posed important questions regarding how the arts of Native American peoples are perceived within the dominant European-American culture of the United States and how they are classified within its own tradition of Western academia. In particular, the specific
ways in which cultural knowledge and perspectives are integrated into Hopi and earlier Ancestral Pueblan arts raised concerns that the Western discipline of art history systematically excludes the significant achievements of indigenous cultures and peoples or, perhaps worse, defines them as they deviate from the Western world view. As an archaeological illustrator, I also felt recent movements within that field towards collaborative efforts, in particular those of Ferguson and Colwell-Chanthaphonh (2006), were inspiring a new awareness of the need for inclusive, interdisciplinary studies that break through the barriers of the West’s separate academic disciplines and open the door to more comprehensive studies of cultural arts and lifeways. I believe that this is particularly important as indigenous peoples across the globe are struggling to preserve their Native languages, arts, traditions, and lifeways—including storytelling traditions (Harrison, 2007). As a result, this study diverges from the traditional Western definition of art as

\[
\text{the expression or application of human creative skill and imagination, typically in a visual form such as painting or sculpture, producing works to be appreciated primarily for their beauty or emotional power (Oxford Living Dictionaries, 2019, sv ‘art’).}
\]

Instead, this study defines art in the broader sense in which it emphasises human creativity through literature, social life, and history (Oxford Living Dictionaries, 2019, sv ‘art’).

Recently, scholars working within the discipline of archaeology have developed new contexts within which to study the made objects of non-Western peoples. Donald (1993:747), for example, argues that specific occurrences in the evolution of the human mind contributed to the development of “new representational strategies” that impacted the “underlying ‘neuropsychological architecture’ of the human mind while also leading to the development of new forms of ‘memory representation’ including the “externalization of memory” (Thomas, 2004:194).

Rather than forms of “self-expression”, as in the Western art history sense of the word, this study interprets the arts of the Hopi as having a much broader cultural relevance. They are, instead, “symbolic” references to cultural knowledge or memory which may be embedded within imagery, ritual, and song. Further, the knowledge may be stored within two or three-dimensional “exographic objects.” In doing so, understanding that many of the significant meanings behind Hopi art are reiterated visually or symbolically within the works themselves and can therefore be identified by Western art historians whose own tradition relies upon writing about art, which is also known as the practice of “ekphrasis.”

Because this study places emphasis on themes relevant to the Hopi Fourth World emergence, a summary of the narrative recently published by the Hopi people's own natural resource department is provided within this study’s appendix. A mid-20th century book review of Courlander's version is also included and reflects the attitudes of the West and "other" that prevailed during the era in which the work
was written but which Courlander sought to address through literary collaboration albeit with cowriters who wished to remain anonymous.

The broad scope of this study necessitates that specific aspects of the Western academic canon—those which served to define the Hopi peoples and culture as “other”—be systematically deconstructed and reconstructed individually. The West’s stereotypical misinterpretations of Hopi arts and practices are addressed individually within this study’s specific chapters. These individual chapters themselves facilitate the learning process associated with many non-Western and oracy-based cultures in that knowledge is gained through increasingly complex layers of context, each of which contributes to wholistic wisdom. In each of the twelve chapters, this study intends to promote an in-depth understanding of specific aspects of the complex matrix of cosmographic beliefs on which individually organized thematic arts and practices are based.
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

**BCE:** Before Common Era

**CE:** Common Era

TERMINOLOGY

The terminology used in this thesis is interdisciplinary in nature, drawing upon accepted vocabulary used in art history, archaeology, anthropology, and linguistics as well as those terms specific to the Hopi language.

**Aesthetics:** The principles through which a culture defines aspects of beauty or other appreciable relevant characteristics in art.

**Ancestral Puebloan:** Ancestors of the present-day North American Puebloan people who lived in or near archaeological sites located primarily in southeastern Utah, northeastern Arizona, northwestern New Mexico, and the southwestern regions of Colorado. Ancestral Puebloans were once known as “Anasazi” which is a Diné (Navajo) word for “ancient enemies.”

**Clan:** Comprehensive families who share a common ancestor associated with their emergence. In Hopi culture, each clan is named after an event that took place on the pilgrimage that followed their emergence into this, the Fourth World. Clan symbols are among the images that dominate many rock art sites such as Tutuveni which is located west of the Hopi lands in Arizona.

**Cognition:** Process of processing, acquiring, and interpreting experience through perception.

**Condensed Memory:** The study employs the definition of condensed memory as it relates specifically to mythology and mytholinguistic contexts. As defined by Barber and Barber 2004, condensed memory refers to the practice of using the oral tradition as a means of preserving and transmitting important information, particularly that which ensures the survival of nonliterate societies.

**Constructal Law:** Theory of applied physics developed by engineer Adrien Bejan (Bejan and Zane 2012) which tracks the outcome of current and flow in nature which can also be applied to social structures and hierarchies.

**Covenant:** The sacred promise made to Maasaw by the Hopi people who promised to live in harmony in nature and assume the role of stewards of the lands.

**Culture:** Within this study, the term culture refers to the specific customs, traditions, beliefs, and worldview of a given peoples with an emphasis on the Hopi.

**Cyclic Phenomenon:** Phenomenon that occurs or is associated with a recurring cycle.

**Diné:** Also known as Navajo. Athabaskan-speaking Native America people currently living in New Mexico and Arizona on reservation lands located near those of the Hopi. They are formerly semi-nomadic peoples thought to have arrived from the North.
Dream: According to the Shorter Oxford Dictionary (2007, sv ‘dream’), the definition of “dream” is as follows:

A series of thoughts, images, sensations or emotions occurring in the mind during sleep.

Eco-philosophy: Philosophical studies that focus on the connection of human relationships with nature. In the Hopi and other Native American cultures, numerous artifacts depict the symbiotic relationship between nature and humans, particularly murals of corn, other crops and game animals.

Eidetic: This study employs the term as defined within the Shorter Oxford Dictionary (2007, sv ‘eidetic’):

Of, or pertaining to, or designating a recollected mental image having unusual vividness and detail as if actually visible; of a person capable of perceiving such images.

Eidetikers: The common name given to people who have “photographic memory” through which they preserve eidetic images such as external afterimages.

Emergence Myth: Mythic cultural story describing the emergence of a people into an inhabitable world. Works of art that relate to the Hopi emergence frequently emphasise themes of ascendance.

Ekphrasis: The Western academic literary tradition of writing about works of art.

Embodiment: The study generally defines embodiment as a material object in which an abstract principle, concept, cultural metaphor or analogy is manifest.

Emic: Aspects of anthropological contexts reflecting the shared internal views of the people or culture.

Ethnohermeneutics: A form of anthropological interpretation which promotes direct dialogue as primary source material in ethnographic studies as articulated by Geertz (1999; 2003).

Ethno-philosophy: This study refers to ethno-philosophical subject matter as defined as those studies of knowledge and belief relevant to an individual culture which are not strictly defined by the tenets of the broader Western Academic discipline of philosophy itself.

Etic: Aspects of anthropological contexts reflecting the external views or interpretations projected onto a given people or culture from “outside” groups or individuals.

Exographic Object: A cultural object known to serve as “symbolic storage”, an embodied, mnemonic device. The word is primarily used within the field of interdisciplinary archaeology in which things, as well as texts, are considered to be vessels which may contain “coded” information.
Flower World: A theme in the visual imagery of Uto-Aztecan language speakers which refers to a metaphysical parallel universe associated with images of flowers, butterflies, and forms of visual iridescence such as rainbows.

Fourth World: In Hopi mythology, the present world which was reached by ascending a reed with the help of Grandmother Spider after social discord afflicted the previous, or third world. The viability of the journey to the upper world was first determined by a series of birds who verified its existence. References to the ascension are evident in a variety of objects and archaeological features ranging from pottery vessels to ladders through which one exits a kiva. The Fourth World context manifests itself as a concept comparable to a fourth dimension incorporating the land and other aspects of the earth’s physical, metaphysical, and natural environment.

Grandmother Spider (Spider Woman, Koyangwuti, Gogyeng Sowuhti): Benefactor of the Hopi people who, in many versions of the creation story, created humans from clay and ultimately helped the people climb to the Fourth World.

Hisatsinom: Name for early “Ancestral Puebloan” peoples who lived in the location where the states of Colorado, Utah, Arizona and New Mexico converge until approximately 1250 CE.

Hopi: Members of the Puebloan culture who speak a language from the Uto-Aztecan group. The full name is Hopituh Shi-nu-mu or “Peaceful People.” The Hopi Tribe is a sovereign nation located within the United States of America.

Hopi Tutskwa (Aboriginal Hopi Lands). Lands given to the Hopi people following the emergence in response to a promise to migrate across the lands in the four directions. In pre-contact times, it was an approximately 15 million acres of land which was eventually reduced to 2.4 million acres per the 1882 U.S. Executive Order-instituting Hopi Indian Reservation.

Iconography: Consistent with Panofsky’s definition of iconography, the study defines iconography as subjects, imagery, and motifs in the visual arts.

Iconology: The study adopts and interprets Panofsky’s definition of iconology as the study of iconographical subject matter within a relevant cultural context.

Katsina (Katsinam-Plural): The Hopi word for spirits who play significant roles in narrative, ritual, and ceremony. The katsinam live on Arizona’s San Francisco Peaks (Nuvatukaovi), emerge in the summer growing season, visit the Hopi villages and return at the start of winter. They are also the spirits of ancestors who, as clouds, bring rain.

Katsina “Dolls”: Also known as Euro-American word “kachinas,” which includes a “ch” sound not present in the Hopi language; they are represented primarily in three-dimensional art and performance regalia, though there are some two-dimensional representations. Traditionally, katsinam representations are carved in cottonwood root to teach young children about the supernatural beings
who mediate between humans and nature. Infants are gifted with flat versions of the carved figures which are known as *tihu*.

**Kiva:** A traditional Puebloan subterranean room typically used for religious or clan ceremonies and practices or political meetings. The shapes of *kivas*, usually round but sometimes rectangular or keyhole shaped, vary by region. Features included in the architecture that are symbolic references to the cultural emergence or other narratives include the ladder from which one ascends, a fire pit, mural imagery, and a *sipapu*—a small symbolic hole alluding to the people’s arrival from the previous world of their ancestors. Additional features are an air deflector, a vent, and, as in the case of larger, deeper “great *kivas*,” sometimes foot drums. Hopi *kiva* murals are believed to represent religious events, creation stories, or other themes relating to Hopi belief and cosmology and are repainted for spiritual reasons resulting in multiple layers of art which, *en toto*, represent time.

**Linguistic Relativity Principle:** As referred to in this study, the Linguistic Relativity Principle is the theory proposed by American linguistics Edward Sapir and Benjamin Lee Whorf in the 1920s and 1930s which claims that language influences a speaker’s mental conceptualization processes and worldviews, thus necessitating the consideration of language’s influence on perceptual constructs in the study of speakers of all languages other than one’s own.

**Maasaw:** Hopi Earth Guardian also known as Masaw, Masauwu, Skeleton Man, and Lord of the Dead. Maasaw formed a sacred covenant with the Hopi people by giving them permission to live in the Fourth World upon their emergence in return for their promise to take care of the lands.

**Maasawtutskwa:** Original lands of Maasaw upon which the first Hopi people emerged.

**Material Culture:** According to the Oxford Dictionary (2019, sv ‘material culture’), the definition of “material culture” is as follows:

A term used to describe the objects produced by human beings, including buildings, structures, monuments, tools, weapons, utensils, furniture, art, and indeed any physical item created by a society. As such, material culture is the main source of information about the past from which archaeologists can make inferences. A distinction is often made between those aspects of culture that appear as physical objects and those aspects that are non-material.

**Migration:** In the Puebloan culture, the migration refers to the narrative journey from the past which is associated with *Palatkwaipi*, the ancestral land, to their current-era home on the Hopi mesas in the American Southwest.

**Mnemonic Device:** Objects or devices which may preserve knowledge and serve as aids to human memory.
Mnemotechnic Devices: As defined by Vansina (1985), mnemotechnic devices are objects, landscapes, and music which can contain cultural “cues” specifically used to recall a memory with precision, and, unlike static written documentation, could also yield new information.

Moiety: In Puebloan culture, a social system by which villages are divided into halves, generally considered the Summer People and the Winter People, each having their own kiva. In addition, each has their own clown society; the Kwirena society is associated with the Winter People whereas the Koshari are associated with the summer. The Hopi people do not currently have moieties although they may have other aspects of Ancestral Puebloan culture.

Mural: Painting on walls that are among the culturally and spiritually significant features of many Hopi and other Puebloan or Ancestral Puebloan ceremonial kivas. Murals often occur in layers as older imagery is replaced by new and therefore can be a measure of time and cultural emphasis used by modern Puebloan peoples and non-Hopi archaeologists, anthropologists, and art historians.

Mythology: According to the Shorter Oxford Dictionary (2007, Sv ‘mythology’), the definition of “mythology”) is as follows:

Mythological stories or traditional belief collectively, myth. A body or collection of myths, esp. related to a particular person or subject, or belonging to a particular religious or cultural tradition; a set of beliefs.

Mytholinguistic Theory: Tenets of Jan Vansina (1985), Elizabeth Wayland Barber and Paul T. Barber’s (2004) studies of the primary principles through which oral narratives preserve history and culturally relevant knowledge. The primary principles employed in this study and which relate to narrative-inspired visual arts are: silence, analogy, metaphor, conflation, compression, and restructuring.

Oraibi (Orayvi): Pueblo located in Arizona which is considered the oldest continuously occupied village in the United States. The pueblo is located on Third Mesa within the Hopi Reservation lands and is thought to have been settled sometime before 1100 CE. Political differences among the Hopi resulted in the splitting of the community into two separate entities with divergent views of the intervention of the US government in Hopi affairs. While one group stayed in the original village, one relocated to Hotevilla in 1906.

Origin Myth: Cosmogonic narratives that explain origins, particularly those of a culture.

Paalöloqangw: Name of mythical Hopi water serpent.
Palatkwapi: Known as the ancestral home of ancient times which may be located in the vicinity of northern Mexico and southern Arizona or which may be mythic in nature. In Hopi mythology, it is a place which fell due to the decline of morals.

Palulukon: Hopi katsina associated with the snake dance.

Panpsychism: The philosophy that all physical entities of the earth contain an element of mentality.

People of the Short Blue Corn: Name given to the Hopi people in Harold Courlander’s written summary of the Hopi Fourth World emergence narrative. Following the emergence, the people chose the smallest ear of corn offered by Maasaw for which they promised to live a difficult but rewarding life based on agriculture in the arid lands of Hopi Tutskwa.


A result of perceiving; a mental image, a conception (of a person or thing). Also the action of a mind.

Perception and Aesthetics: As used within this study, the culturally based interpretation of beauty or a system of principles relevant to artistic works consistent with a specific system of beliefs.

Petroglyph: Imagery or markings intentionally pecked into stone. For the Hopi people, petroglyphs often depict clan symbols left by members on their post-emergence migrations or those that are still done for ceremonial purposes across Hopi Tutskwa.

Pictograph: Intentional imagery or markings usually created on rock surfaces, with paints made from grinding non-organic pigments on a stone palette or from other pigments. Surviving works are generally found in caves or alcoves where the imagery has remained protected from weathering or desecration.

Pithouse: Habitation structure consisting of a dug earthen pit and roof. Pithouses were built by Ancestral Puebloan peoples from approximately 550 to 750 CE. Considered the predecessor of the kiva structures, pithouses also include a fire pit and air deflector and are entered from above.

Power Principle: According to Barber & Barber (2004:143), the mytholinguistic principle which states that “the bigger the force represented, the more major the deity to represent it.”

Pre-Contact Era: The era in time occurring between the original Hopi emergence and first contact with Spanish (generally 15th century CE), Mormon, and Navajo (Diné) peoples.

Puebloan Peoples: North American Native American peoples whose tradition includes the construction of “pueblos” which are permanent groupings of multi-level structures made of adobe and/or stone. As defined by the United States
federal government, there are 21 currently recognised Pueblos including that of
the Hopi. Within the Puebloan peoples, there are six primary language groups:
Hopi, Keres, Tewa, Tiwa, Towa, and Zuni.

**Quipu (or Khipu):** Typically considered an ancient Inka device for recording
information, consisting of variously coloured threads knotted in different ways
(Oxford Dictionaries, 2019, sv ‘quipu’). Among the Inca, they are said to be used
for recording statistics with knots appearing at locations similar to those of
Western numerals and decimals. Because they are mnemonic devices, the
meanings of the knots may vary depending on their specific use within a specific
context. Early Spanish records mention the use of *khipu* among the Puebloan
peoples.

**Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis** (also known as Whorf Hypothesis): Linguistic
hypothesis that claims language structure shapes the speakers’ perceptions and
cultural worldview.

**Sinom:** According to the Hopi government website, the *Sinom* are all
interdependent living things that sustain life. “The rabbits, prairie dogs and other
small animals eat the green plants. The eagle, coyote and fox eat the rabbits. We
eat our corn and the animals *that sustain us*” (The Hopi Tribe, 2018).

**Sipapu:** Hopi word denoting a hole located in the floor of a pithouse or *kiva* that
represents the emergence of ancestors into the current world from the earlier
world below. The Hopi term is also sometimes referred to in literature as
“*si’papu.*”

**Sipaapuni:** “Place of Hopi Emergence.” A location preserved in mythology
which is in Arizona’s Grand Canyon (*Öngtupqa* or Salt Canyon).

**Theoria:** A method of Western thinking and mental disconnect which obscures
the immediacy of experiential meaning or knowledge as defined by eco-
philosopher Freya Mathews.
## LIST OF FIGURES

### Chapter 3

**Figure 3.1.** *The Hopi Reservation.* (2008). Used with permission from AMNH Anthropological Papers of the American Museum of Natural History #86, Fig. 1:1, p. 2. Presented at Symposium “Sustaining Cultural and Biological Diversity in a Rapidly Changing World. Lessons for Global Policy” April 2-5, 2008. Center for Biodiversity and Conservation, American Museum of Natural History.  

### Chapter 4

**Figure 4.1.** *African Nkisi figure with deflecting mirror and nails.* (Late 19th-early 20th century). Wood, mirror, iron, plant fiber, cloth, leopard teeth, pigments, nails, resin, Dimensions: 13 7/16 x 7 5/16 x 4 15/16 in. Democratic Republic of the Congo. Smithsonian National Museum of African Art, Bequest of Eliot Elisofon. Object Number 73-7-297. Drawing by Deborah Kelley-Galin.  

**Figure 4.2.** *“Native” Tofa map of Siberian Uda River system.* (2007). Redrawn from Adler 1910 in Harrison 2007 and map of Uda River system created by modern Western cartographers. Redrawn from Harrison (2007:108) by Deborah Kelley-Galin.  

**Figure 4.3.** *Mountain lion fetish.* (A.D. 1629-1700). Pueblo, Mission Period. Fired clay zoomorphic image called “toho” or mountain lion. Harvard Peabody Museum No. 37-111-10/11883. Mission Church, Room 434, Burial 83. Drawing by Deborah Kelley-Galin.  

**Figure 4.4.** *Soup bowl from Giusewa Pueblo.* (Early 17th century). Jemez Black-on-white soup plate. Photo by Jack Ellis, courtesy of the Museum of Indian Arts and Culture No. 18519/11.  

**Figure 4.5.** *Earthenware chalice from Guisewa Pueblo.* (Early 17th century). Jemez Black-on-white chalice. Earthenware. Museum of Indian Arts and Culture, Museum of New Mexico (18531/11). Drawing by Deborah Kelley-Galin.  

**Figure 4.6.** *Hopi Puebloan bowl.* (19th century). Earthenware. 3.7 x 107 cm diameter. Brooklyn Museum. No. 43.98. Gift of Edith Walker Jackson. Drawing by Deborah Kelley-Galin, 2018.


Chapter 5

Figure 5.1. *Hopi First Mesa at Last Light.* (2018). Photograph ©Susan Silberberg-Peirce, Canyonlights Photography. Used with permission.

Figure 5.2. *Trilobite fossil.* (2018). Drawing by Deborah Kelley-Galin.

Figure 5.3. *Fossilised prehistoric-era reptilian skull (Phytosaurus).* (2016). Photo courtesy National Park Service, Petrified Forest National Park.

Figure 5.4. *Petroglyph.* ([Sa]). Photo courtesy National Park Service, Petrified National Park.

Figure 5.5. *Natashka Katsina Rattle.* (2016). Drawing by Deborah Kelley-Galin.

Chapter 6

Figure 6.1. *Diagram of annual Hopi Katsina and non-katsina ceremonial seasons.* ([Sa]). Image by Deborah Kelley-Galin from Hopi Calendar of the Seasons (https://www.peabody.harvard.edu/node/2026).

Chapter 7

Figure 7.1. *Chart: Metaphor for Impact of Embodied Arts.* (2018). Diagram showing forms of knowledge and self that radiate out from the central point of percussion, as in nature. Image by Deborah Kelley-Galin.

Figure 7.2. *Water: Point of Impact.* (2009). Image by Sergiu Bacioiu. Used with permission.
Chapter 8

Figure 8.1. *Screen for the 1934 Puppet-doll Dance at Hotevilla.* (1972). The “dolls” are Shalakmana (Shalako girl), at the left, and Palhikmana (Water-drinking girl), at the right. The figure of Muyingwa, an important germination deity, is painted on the central panel. At each corner kneels a Hechea *katsina*. Corn sprouts set in clay cones represent a cornfield in front of the screen. A sandpiper may be seen above the Muyingwa’s head (Titiev, 1972, Fig. 19).

Chapter 9


Figure 9.2. *Mural from Awatovi.* (2018). Excerpt of “Sand Altar Woman” who stands with metaphors associated with corn cultivation. Room 788, redrawn from Smith (1952, Figure 81b) by Deborah Kelley-Galin.

Figure 9.3. *Ancestral Puebloan mug with imagery associated with lightning and clouds.* (2018). Redrawn from Washburn (2012:481) by Deborah Kelley-Galin.

Figure 9.4. (Left) *Ancestral Puebloan bowls with imagery associated with clouds raining, watershields, and germinating corn.* (2012). After Washburn (2012:486, 491, 487), *Shared Image Metaphors of the Corn Lifeway in Mesoamerica ad the American Southwest.*

Figure 9.5. (Right) *Hopi Sio Humis Katsina “Doll” (Corn Standing in Rows God).* (Late 19th Century). Figurine: Wood, Feather, Pine needle, Cotton string, Pigment. From Arizona, USA. Dimensions: 37 x 13.8 x 19 cm. Peabody Museum, Harvard University Collected by Dr. Jesse Walter Fewkes. Drawing by Deborah Kelley-Galin.


Figure 9.8. *Snake hoto’mní prayer stick Chii’ a hoto’mní paho.* (1936). Redrawn from Stephen (1936) by Deborah Kelley-Galin.

Figure 9.9. *Bowl made of pottery with painted black and red geometric designs on the outside.* ([Sa]). Image courtesy Trustees of the British Museum AM1987,Q.22.

Figure 9.10. *Hovenweep “Castle” and Tower.* (1998). Photograph by Deborah Kelley-Galin. Used with permission.

Figure 9.11. “Sky Window” from Polacca Polychrome (Patterson, Keam & Holmes, 1994:70:1).

Chapter 10

Figure 10.1. *Hopi Red Ant Clan Petroglyphs at Tutuveni.* ([Sa]). Courtesy Cyark TUT 2011024_104807.


Chapter 11

Figure 11.1. *Desecration Panel, Utah.* (2018). Photograph by Randy Langstra. Used with permission.

Figure 11.2. *Ritually Desecrated Petroglyph, Sand Island, Utah.* (1999). Photograph by Deborah Kelley-Galin.

Figure 11.3. *Hopi Kachinas Drawn by Native Artists.* (1899). Published: Fewkes, Jesse Walter, (Nm, Nov 1899-Mar 1900); BAE 21st AR; Wash; 1903; Pl XXVI, P86. Manuscript 4731, National Anthropological Archives, Smithsonian Institution Repository Loc.: National Anthropological Archives, Smithsonian Museum Support Center, Suitland, Maryland.
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCING THE STUDY

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The focus of this study is the ways in which non-Western arts may serve as mnemonic devices and forms of symbolic storage, a context that has, until recently been primarily studied by Western academics working within the fields of archaeology and anthropology rather than art history. The primary emphasis of the non-Western arts discussed is on the arts of the Hopi people whose homelands lie within the southwestern United States. This study suggests the limited scope of Western art history excludes or misinterprets the meanings behind the arts of non-Western peoples due to the judgment of the arts of non-Western peoples by strictly Western standards. For example, in recent decades, professionals working within the traditional Western education system addressed the problems associated with teaching Western students about the non-Western contexts, such as those on which traditional Ndop figures (portraits of kings) made by the Kuba people of Central Africa were based, using the basic principles of Constructivist psychology rather than Western “Art” (Chanda & Basinger, 2000). At the same time, traditional Western art educators were raising the alarm that the traditional boundaries of art history were becoming so inclusive that the discipline’s customary areas of emphases were in danger of becoming so ill-defined that they were no longer relevant (Kraft, 1989:57). The narrow Eurocentric emphasis, which rose from the Renaissance tradition, continues to create problems for traditional Western art teachers, some of whom, such as Chanda and Basinger, were forced to search for an effective interdisciplinary means by which non-Western subject matter could be learned within their own modern-era classrooms (2000).

Simultaneously, the arts of colonised peoples, which were traditionally exhibited within natural history museums from which they were viewed, remained at those locations and, in most venues, continue to be viewed as “ethnographic” specimens. As educator Linda Tuhiwai Smith observes,

indigenous peoples were classified alongside the flora and fauna;

hierarchical typologies of humanity and systems of representation were fueled by new discoveries; and cultural maps were charted, and territories claimed and contested by the major European powers. (Smith, 2016:58)

Further, Ishii (2010:65) argues that the means by which Native American peoples and cultures, including the Hopi, have been portrayed in Western academia contributed to the development of an Imperialist canon which arose from “nineteenth-century Anthropological orientations”. For example, during a walk through New York’s Museum of Natural History, Harding and Martin (2017) noted the enduring effects of the “functionalist” approach taken by Western academics from the 1930s through the 1960s:
Functionalism gave the impression that most non-Western cultures were outside of history, unaffected by forces such as colonialism and capitalism, migration, conflict and war, and non-European networks. Functionalism decided beforehand what the importance of cultural practices was and seldom inquired of participants what they thought their practices were all about. Functionalism also presumed that cultures would persist unchanged forever were it not for European contact, signs of which were suppressed for the sake of creating the illusion of static traditional cultures. (2017)

This study argues that recent developments within Western archaeology can be employed within the field of art history to more accurately study non-Western works of art, particularly those of the Hopi, in which the influence of a particular worldview is evident in strong narrative content, particularly that of the people’s emergence in to the fourth, or current, world. When understood as forms of mnemonic “symbolic storage” or “exographic objects,” the broad concerns of Western arts educators, typified by Chanda, Kraft, Dissanayake as well as the specific weaknesses of the discipline itself, are directly addressed through this survey of Hopi arts and practice.

In addition, this study identifies aspects of Western art which are, in fact, relevant to the intent of non-Western art yet are themselves embodied in different ways. When the Hopi Fourth World narrative, for example, is represented in the imagery or form associated with a seed jar, the object itself presents a reminder to consider the “cue” to extend the iteration verbally through traditional oral storytelling. While it is not an example of ekphrasis as known within the Western tradition, the object does still serve to operate on multiple cognitive levels comparable to the practice of “writing about art”, first, as a storage device through which the important cultural narrative is retained, second, as a permanent record of the importance of the narrative and associated imagery or structure, third, as the inspiration behind an oral reiteration or recitation of the narrative itself and, fourth, as an opportunity to explain the traditional significance of the vessel or object itself and the ways its usage remains relevant to the mythological or narrative theme.

1.1.1 The Need for Non-Western Art History Methodologies

This study asserts that the importance of understanding the narrative content of non-Western mnemonic images or art forms can be effectively addressed through the iconological approach developed by Irwin Panofsky in the mid-20th century. In recent decades, Western archaeologists have increasingly employed the method which assesses the visual meaning of art on three basic levels. These include a

1 The practice of writing about works of art. As it is an emphasis of Western Art history, it may be considered a traditional means of elevating Western works while simultaneously ignoring the contrasting values of non-Western peoples for whom works hold divergent multicultural meanings.
first, or primary level in which the work may be immediately identified through personal knowledge or experience. Next, an iconological assessment that includes an analysis of a second “conventional” level of motifs and visual symbolism which may be recognised and associated with more complex, culturally-specific contexts. Last, a third level of “intrinsic” analysis that refers directly to the “basic attitude of a nation, a period, a class, a religious or philosophical persuasion—unconsciously qualified by one personality and condensed into one work” (Panofsky, 1972:7).

This study broadens traditional uses of Panofsky’s assessments of traditional Western art forms to include non-Western forms considered to be “art” within the traditional Western definition. Further, these non-Western works are considered within this study to be mnemonic objects or images employed as symbolic storage or those that specifically serve as “exographic” forms of external memory. For example, a Hopi *kiva* structure includes physical features that recall and thus “symbolically store” the meanings of specific details which relate directly to the Fourth World emergence story. Traditionally built below ground, these traditional *kiva* features include an underground symbolic point of entry (*sipapu*) located in the floor of the structure itself and a ladder to the land above. When an individual who is aware of the significant symbolism and metaphors inherent in the *kiva* associates specific features with the mythical emergence, it is possible for him/her to, in a sense, relive the initial mythological experience itself. Through the traditional features inherent in *kiva* structures, experiential references to the original emergence are “recreated,” albeit symbolically, on the present physical plane. Both symbolic representation and experiential recreation may be embodied within exographic forms of art that also function as forms of “symbolic storage” that preserve and repeat the significant cultural narrative.

1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT

Traditional Western art history studies of Native American peoples continue to reflect the dominant influence of the West and the Western worldview, particularly in the development of and continued emphasis on two-dimensional paintings and three-dimensional sculptures. As the name implies, Western art history is specifically relevant to the Western tradition’s emphasis on the development of European and European American styles and periods. The works of the Classical Greek era still exert influence over the Western viewer’s sensibilities and, until the advent of abstraction in the 20th century, the most popular forms of art were based on imitation and replication. In fact, traditional art schools encourage student copyist techniques which are often practised within the museums themselves where students have access to works deemed significant or even superior to those of laymen or women. Recently, however, the field of Western art history has been influenced by a better understanding and awareness of mnemonic devices or “external memory devices” that have been employed by humans throughout their stages of evolution and development. This awareness
has been arrived at through the collaborative efforts of archaeologists, anthropologists, and art historians. They have increasingly been called upon to work together on projects involving intellectual cultural property rights or, as in the example of contexts related to the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (1990), the accurate identification of modern peoples affiliated with prehistoric burials and grave goods. Cultural narrative has also played an important role in the repatriation efforts (Echo-Hawk, 2000).

This study addresses the need to understand the ways in which oracy-based cultures—in contrast to literature-based cultures—interpret life experience and metaphysical ideals or embed cultural knowledge and narratives in their own traditional art forms. In addition, as in the example of the Hopi, the land itself may be viewed as an embodied entity with historical or mythical landmarks which call to mind important eras or events which remain relevant to the Fourth World experience, whether it be the emergence, the reverence paid to the covenant made with Maasaw ensuring the Hopi’s role as Fourth World caretakers, or the significant role specific locations or features play in experiential recreations of mythic events, such as those associated with the seasons or specific practices such as traditional salt pilgrimages, as documented by Titiev (1937).

Focusing on the arts of the Hopi people of the American Southwest, this study posits that no clear understanding of the world’s non-Western cultures can be attained until the significance of embedded mnemonic features or characteristics is fully acknowledged and understood. Furthermore, the Western discipline of art history must be expanded to include direct references to non-Western mnemonic practices, particularly in how objects, ritual practices, and imagery have been isolated within the fields of anthropology and archaeology and therefore do not contribute to the West’s fuller understanding of the significance of art itself when considered within the broadest parameters of pancultural human experience.

This study asserts that the themes and imagery evident within some non-Western works of art centre upon the culture’s oral narrative tradition, necessitating a better understanding of mytholinguistic content, its varietal iconological representations, and a structured means by which they can be addressed. In fact, recent studies within the field of archaeology have emphasised, not only the role objects play in human societies, but the role they may play as forms of symbolic storage—works which preserve and function as “cues” or reminders of important cultural materials, especially traditional narratives (Hodder & Hutson, 2003; Vansina, 1985).

While oral communities have a past that is embedded in social relationships and performed in the reiteration of tradition, modern societies relocate the past as an externality (Lyotard, 1984:22 cited in Said, 1993). Taking this argument to its logical conclusion, only modern people would have an interest in ‘finding’ the past for, in a traditional society, the only past that matters is that which is recalled as myth. Elements of a past that are not already part of tradition are superfluous. Lyotard (as cited in Thomas, 2004:79) implies that this is partly attributable to the
social role of knowledge: in oral cultures, the retelling of traditional narratives and origin myths is in itself a source of authority. This is particularly true of that of the Hopi people who have closely guarded their traditions for centuries and continue to view themselves as conservators of the Fourth World, as was agreed to with Maasaw, the Earth Guardian, who permitted them to stay following their emergence from the troubled world below.

In many ways, Native American arts are still perceived to be those of “outsiders” within the Western academic tradition. The dominant Euro-American society falsely perceived oracy-based cultures and peoples as representations of their own distant, romantic past (Warburg, 1939:277). Ishii (2010) claims that mid-twentieth century interactions that took place between Western scholars and Native peoples contributed to the development of an Imperialist “canon of academic literature” largely based upon new scientific theories that served academic Western purposes and launched the careers of luminaries such as linguists Edward Sapir and Benjamin Whorf. Smith describes the ways in which Western universities have continued to perpetuate the belief that science is the preeminent focus of the modern era:

Underpinning all of what is taught at universities is the belief in the concept of science as the all-embracing method for gaining an understanding of the world ... How the colonized were governed, for example, was determined by previous experiences in other colonies and by the prevailing theories about race, gender, climate and other factors generated by “scientific” methods ...

The ethnographic “gaze” of anthropology has collected, classified and represented other cultures to the extent that anthropologists are often the academics popularly perceived by the indigenous world as the epitome of all that is bad with academics. (2016:60)

The pressures exerted upon Native American peoples and the treatment they endured first by Spanish colonists and subsequently by the United States government created a significant break in the traditional lifeways and practices upon the land’s Native peoples. Established in 1824 as a division of the United States War Department, the Bureau of Indian Affairs was assigned the duties of administering and managing of federal tribal trust lands.

Bureau of Indian Affairs initiatives were enforced, in part, through the creation of the boarding school system which separated children from their families, homes, and cultural lifeways. The system was also intended to desicnate the use of indigenous language thus inhibiting the perpetuation of time-honored cultural practices. The establishment of the Keams Canyon government Indian school in 1887 took children away from their homes posed a significant threat to the Hopi’s agrarian traditions from which their cultural worldview was formed. Rather than farm, the Hopi were expected to depend upon the Keams Canyon Trading Post, established by Thomas Keams in 1875, where families could buy ready-made goods. These changes created fissures in both traditional lifeways and the use of
the Hopi language. Subsequently, the Hopi people’s response to governmental control resulted in the development of social factions whose political divides split the population of “Old Oraybi” and necessitated the establishment of an entire new Oraybi village.

Although Native Americans who live on reservation lands are now considered to be members of sovereign nations, additional repercussions from the past governmental agendas remain. Nicholas (2009) notes the significant number of Hopi who follow the traditional lifeways but “just don’t speak” Hopi and how it affects the sense of identity present in the lives of Hopi youth. Nicholas also describes language itself as a means of “affective enculturation” which deepens the speakers’ commitment to the people’s traditional ideals (Nicholas, 2008:337). The present study argues that the interruption of the agrarian storytelling tradition which had previously flourished during the shorter, darker winter months are partly responsible. Consequently, the shift from a strictly agrarian lifestyle to one focused on winter schooling has affected the documentation of thematic mytholinguistic content which was traditionally preserved in cultural narrative and referenced or symbolised in imagery, ritual, and other mnemonic forms of art.

The reason that the knowledge of traditional language is imperative in the preservation of cultural tradition is most critically demonstrated within this study by a review of how a collaborative project between Washburn, Hill and Sekaquaptewa (2015) effectively reclaimed one aspect of Hopi culture that had been lost to time—that of the traditional “katsina songs.” As an integral part of the katsina cycle and the activities surrounding the annual visitations of the supernatural beings, katsina songs, memorised and sung in the traditional Hopi language, had fallen out of disuse following the United States government’s boarding school mandates. Many of the songs were assumed to have been preserved through the Hopi language in the memories of an increasingly small number of venerated elders. However, as a result of their dwindling numbers, the primary source materials used for the collaborative translation effort were, instead, century-old recordings stored in museum vaults, the transcription of which Sekaquaptewa came to dedicate his life.

As is evidenced by the lack of translations provided with the katsina songs at the time they were recorded, it took a century for Washburn and Sekaquaptewa to begin this project, the “cultural archive” described by Ishii (2010) that focused on scientific studies related to linguistics, anthropology, and ethnology, generally ignoring the mytholinguistic content of Native American narratives, spiritual beliefs, and rituals and the arts in which they were preserved. As a result of the disparity in value Western academia places on Western and non-Western belief, this study reinforces the need for modern scholars—from the Western and non-Western traditions—to begin to deconstruct the “Imperialist canon” that Western predecessors created. The basic premise of this study is that this need can be addressed in part by identifying the symbiotic relationship evident between
narrative or mytholinguistic content and the songs, objects, and rituals in which they were traditionally preserved.

The connections between the West’s lack of understanding of non-Western arts and traditions and the uncertain futures facing the languages themselves further emphasises the importance of maintaining the continuity of any oracy-based culture, including that of the Hopis. Without taking the proactive approach, this study identifies a means of assessing and restoring traditional language usage, especially in how relevant narrative themes are embedded within the visual arts. In this way, the younger generations will experience a “fogging” of essential mytholinguistic content stored within their culture’s lifeways, rituals, images, and objects. The diminishment of representations and their corresponding referents is especially likely to occur when there is a manifested disconnect between a people and their cultural knowledge or experience as in the example of the dwindling use of Native language.

Barber and Barber (2004:166) state, in their broader analysis of individual mytholinguistic principles, that there is a difference between a broad manifestation and the specific effects resulting from known causes, particularly if wilfulness is part of the process. Silence was historically used as a means of disassociating individual Native American people from their own cultures through the boarding school system and the disruption of the agrarian lifestyle. This study suggests that a sound knowledge of the connections evident between the oral tradition and the visual themes presented or preserved in traditional visual arts is crucial to maintaining vibrancy within any given oracy-based culture, including that of the Hopi.

The present analysis promotes the need for museums to re-evaluate their current collections of ethnographic materials, including material objects bearing imagery and other “creative works” based on mytholinguistic contexts. Whether the forms or associated imagery suggest they be considered as symbolic storage, mnemonic devices, or ritually significant exographic objects, their loss could be considered catastrophic to the people. While the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA) was enacted in 1990 to return significant funerary and sacred objects to the Native American peoples who claimed lineal descent, there remains no broad legal means by which the loss of culturally significant objects, including those preserving essential traditional intellectual property, may be fully established or enforced within the United States. If criteria can be developed to establish the cultural value of symbolic storage devices and exographic objects, Native American peoples, including the Hopi, will have an additional means through which historical or sacred objects, currently held in museum collections, can be legally reclaimed. This study, therefore, intends to demonstrate the links evident between important narratives essential to Hopi culture and the imagery and arts in which they are echoed and preserved.
1.2.1 Aims

The aims of this study are as follows:

- To identify the ways in which mid-20th century academicians perceived Native American peoples and cultures to be subjects relevant to the sciences rather than the humanities and the enduring effects of this long-term academic perspective.
- To establish the importance of examining forms of non-Western cultural mnemonic devices within the field of art history, which continues to maintain an emphasis on Western works and the perceived progression of successive styles.
- To specifically emphasise how repetitive ritual content, exographic objects, and symbolic storage devices promote and preserve traditional cosmography and lifeways within non-Western cultures with an emphasis on details relating to the Hopi people of the southwestern United States.
- To reevaluate works of visual art through mytholinguistic analysis and identify imagery which preserves and promotes essential cultural views of the Hopi people. This study strives to demonstrate how these mytholinguistic contexts are not strictly regarded as oral narratives but are also integral contexts reiterated and embedded within the visual arts. As such, this study aims to demonstrate how these aspects of art support, maintain, and perpetuate tradition ritual, language use, and lifeways.
- To demonstrate how the experience of colonialism had been incorporated into traditional Hopi art through the restructuring of its common characteristics and associated thematic imagery. In addition, the experience of revolt is shown to have led to the ultimate cessation of what was then believed to be the associated “contaminated” style.
- To contribute to the deconstruction of the West’s “Imperialist canon” of literature, which diminishes the significance of the non-Western tradition of oral history and associated arts.
- To describe the significance of mnemonic forms of art which serve as the traditional means of teaching cultural belief to Hopi children.
- To examine the ways human physiology contributes to the development of pan-human beliefs such as those concerning sorcery and witchcraft and how these experiences are related to ritual vandalism of Ancestral Puebloan or more recently created petroglyphic images.

1.2.2 Objectives

This study is undertaken to achieve the following objectives:

- This study seeks to promote the inclusion of mnemonic devices, dimensional forms of symbolic storage, and the cultural applications of devices to demonstrate how the art of the Hopi people expands upon the basic definition of Western art to include characteristics relating to human cognition, narrative reference, and cultural cosmography through the
employment of mnemonic techniques. As such, this study describes how the arts of the Hopi and other indigenous peoples strive to preserve important cultural beliefs and narratives—particularly that of their emergence into the Fourth World—through embedded forms of visual and ritual arts. While professional grade school educators called for this in the United States as early as two decades ago (Chanda & Basinger, 2000), the basic premise from which the works themselves could be studied—focusing on the importance of mnemonic exographic objects and symbolic storage devices—has not been a concern of Western art historians. As a result, for the purposes of this study, the identification and assessment of mytholinguistic or other traditional knowledge stored within cultural objects has been adapted from the discipline of indigenous archaeology and anthropology. Important aspects of non-Western art that traditional Western art historians have consistently de-emphasised within the discipline are generally relegated to disciplines, such as archaeology, where the subjects are addressed from a scientific perspective.

- To assess the inherent cultural content preserved in Hopi arts, imagery, ritual and oracy-based practices, specifically in terms of how they maintain the cultural belief systems through mnemonic practices. These art forms include those determined to be symbolic storage devices or exographic objects by their inherent references to cultural practices or narratives particularly that of the Fourth World narrative as represented in ethnographic records and in the collaborative effort of Courlander (1972; 1987) and multiple Puebloan co-writers.

- To assert the need for anthropologists and ethnologists to deconstruct the artificial “cultural archive,” referred to by Ishii (2010), by reassessing the mytholinguistic significance of materials currently held in museum or library ethnographic collections.

- To reinterpret oral narrative recording or transcript content via mytholinguistic analysis and find corresponding visual elements integrated into art forms, imagery, and ritual experience. Once identified, these important aspects of the arts should be introduced into the discipline of Western art history as subjects of discourse equal or superior in measure to those of traditional Western subjects.

- To demonstrate the ways in which the intrinsic knowledge inherent in Hopi visual arts and those of other oracy-based peoples can be effectively studied within the field of Western art history through the use of Panofsky’s methods of iconological analysis. This study suggests that the efficacy of the application is due in part to the scholars’ ability to identify and interpret both narrative and symbolic imagery.

---

2 School children enrolled in these grades generally range from ages 5 through 10.
• To inspire scholars to reassess early records of Native American narratives while Native speakers are still present to assist in the process. Harrison (2007) has established the need to interpret ethnographic materials—including those related to both oral narratives and dimensional objects or imagery—before the populations of Native speakers drop, ultimately leading to the extinction of the languages and the indigenous knowledge which is preserved therein.

• To establish connections between cognitive science as it relates to visualisation, dream experience, and historical memory to augment the resources available to those studying narrative content through a mytholinguistic analysis technique.

• To identify how modern cognitive science, particularly how it applies to dream and learning, can establish the meaningful relationships between Hopi imagery, arts, and narratives.

1.2.3 Domain of the Study

The domain of this study is the field of art history, as well as cognition, dream, narrative, and cosmology as they pertain to comprehensive Native lifeways. This study emphasises the significance of embedded mnemonic content in the visual arts, ritual objects, and associated traditions of the Hopi. In its assessments of narrative content, one major work, *The Fourth World of the Hopis* by Courlander (1972; 1987), is highlighted as it represents the collaboration between a Western anthropologist and mid-20th century Puebloan peoples. The collaboration reflects Tewa, Hopi, and Western perspectives on a fundamental emergence myth which is shared by multiple Puebloan peoples albeit with deviations in specific culturally related details. The narrative accounts of the Mennonite ethnographer and missionary, H.R. Voth (1905), are also periodically provided as supplemental evidence of the “restructuring” which occurs within the Western academic system itself. Further, Liebmann’s (2012) insights into the ways that changes in narrative affected the “restructured” arts found at Giusewa, a Puebloan site located near a 17th century Catholic church, are essential to the discussions of narrative and the transformation of imagery and forms.

The geographic and cultural domain of this study focuses on the Hopi people whose reservation lands within the present United States correspond with their traditional pilgrimage narrative. The Hopi lands are located primarily in northeastern Arizona and include Old Oraibi, which is the oldest continuously inhabited village in the country.

The academic domain to which this study belongs is that of the Western field of art history which, per this study’s perspective, would benefit from a broadening of scope to include the arts of non-Western peoples. This includes the use of exographic objects, symbolic storage, or meaning embedded within mnemotechnic devices among diverse non-Western peoples.
1.2.4 Limitations of the Study

This study is written by a non-Hopi author. As such, this study represents an effort not to speak on behalf of any cultural group such as the Hopi people themselves, but to draw attention to the ways in which Western academics have traditionally sought to define non-Western peoples and their traditional lifeways on Western terms. This study asserts that the discipline of art history, for example, as defined within Western academia, has contributed to the development of a Western Imperialist canon of literature that has served as a means of maintaining dominance over subjugated Native peoples.

Though I do not speak on behalf of indigenous peoples, this study intends to explain how non-Western cultures, such as of the Hopi people, have developed sophisticated methods of storing important cultural knowledge through metaphorical, visual, and mytholinguistic practices and embodied works of art, architecture, and site-specific assemblages or markings. This study borrows the concepts of exographic objects and symbolic storage from recent studies written by both Western and indigenous archaeologists who have actively pursued the development of new interdisciplinary cross-cultural methodologies within their own field.

1.3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research methodologies employed within this study are twofold: those reflecting new developments within the field of archaeology that relate directly to the traditional discipline of Western art history and those relating to the narrative cultural content embedded within mnemonic storage devices. Western academia traditionally separates non-Western arts, vessel forms, and any associated images from those produced by its own culture. As a result, the specific means by which art conveys important cultural narratives has not been acknowledged within the study of Western art history. Recent developments within archaeological theory, however, including those related to both exographic or symbolic storage as created and practised by literacy-based peoples, and the significance of narrative within indigenous studies have broadened the discipline’s emphasis to include art forms as well as their associated imagery. As such, this study integrates methodologies associated with current indigenous archaeological studies into those related to traditional Western approaches in art history, including its emphasis on ekphrasis, or writing about art. This study suggests that Western perceptions of non-Western arts, such as those of the Hopi people, more effectively reflect the intent of indigenous peoples when the methodologies associated with two separate Western disciplines—art history and archaeology—are blended into one inclusive discipline. Through the study of archaeological topics related to both art history and archaeology, the degree to which narratives and traditional knowledge are stored within Hopi visual arts and the ways the practice serves to perpetuate Hopi beliefs and lifeways becomes apparent.
Due to the significance of the Fourth World and emergence narratives as well as the covenant made to take care of the lands granted to them by the deity Maasaw, this study applies mytholinguistic analysis criteria to both Hopi narratives and the arts in which they are reflected (Barber & Barber, 2004). Barber and Barber’s work, in turn, is indebted to the mytholinguistic groundwork laid by Vansina’s *Oral Tradition and History* (Vansina 1985; Grele, Terkel, Vansina, Tedlock, Benison & Harris, 1991). The methodologies employed are focused upon what Erwin Panofsky’s (1939) theories of iconology and iconography define as *intrinsic* cultural knowledge, or “meaning or content constituting the world of ‘symbolical’ values.” To a much lesser extent, the principles of Adrien Bejan’s “Constructal Law” and Ulrich Neisser’s forms of “self-knowledge” are also applied to concepts related to the integration of Hopi belief into environmental and social systems.

The five principles of mytholinguistic analysis are based upon human cognitive abilities as they relate to the linguistic process. While they were developed for use with oral narratives, in a culture such as that of the Hopi where mythological content is reflected in or embedded within imagery, ritual, and architecture, they work equally well for the narrative contexts served by both the oral narrative traditions and a variety of art forms. As such, the five primary criteria of analysis used within this study for Hopi narrative and arts are: memory, silence, analogy, compression, and restructuring (Barber & Barber, 2004:245-251). Within each myth principle are multiple secondary principles which will also be applied within the relevant contexts when found in the pertinent subject narrative.

**1.3.1 Worldview Paradigm**

This study proposes that experience and knowledge are processed and stored by oracy-based peoples in ways that differ greatly from that of societies who record thoughts, information, and even art analyses through written language or scripts. The need to remember narratives is not the privileged domain of literate peoples who rely upon manuscripts and writings to document their history. Harrison (2007) explains the ways that knowledge is embedded within narrative. Recent studies in the field of archaeology have acknowledged the importance of recognising “exographic objects” that serve as symbolic storage (Thomas, 2004). The cultural knowledge that is “stored” in these various types of objects varies according to each relevant intent. Examples of exographic objects utilized among the peoples of the Southwest include Hopi or O’odham calendar sticks that are used for time reckoning as well as Diné and Puebloan sand paintings which play significant roles in ritual healings. Dolls, too, are traditional objects of knowledge as in the case of small wooden Hopi *tihu* which teach children the important roles supernatural *katsinam* will assume in life.

For oracy-based cultures, origin myths, such as the Hopi emergence, provide essential primary source material from which cultural imagery is drawn. In addition, peoples of multiple cultures may share stories with similar themes. Malinowski (1954) describes the emergence of the Trobriand islanders who, like
the Hopi, organised into groups shortly after the event identified by sociologists as “clans”:

The problem of rank which plays a great role in their sociology was settled by the emergence from one special hole, called Obukula, near the village of Laba'i. This event was notable in that, contrary to the usual course (which is: one original ‘hole,’ one lineage), from this hole of Laba'i there emerged representatives of the four main clans one after the other. Their arrival, moreover, was followed by an apparently trivial but, in mythical reality, a most important event. First there came the Kaylavasi (iguana), the animal of the Lukulabuta clan, which scratched its way through the earth as iguanas do, then climbed a tree, and remained there as a mere onlooker, following subsequent events ... (1954:112).

The essential origin myths of the Hopi, Trobriand Islanders, and other oracy-based peoples also influence themes that are repeated in ritual and the visual arts. As a result, imagery must not be considered “representational” in the same ways in which it would be thought of in the West. Instead, it is often “representational” in that it may depict the unseen metaphysical realities associated with the beliefs and narratives of the culture. Furthermore, visual representations of experiences gained through dreams or other forms of altered consciousness can also be articulated in visual imagery in much the same way as the human mind visualises aspects of metaphysical content associated with alternate experiences or dimensions. Within the Hopi culture, images that occur as the result of dreams or spiritual experiences are no less real and no less “representational” than those created within the Western artistic tradition.

1.3.2 Iconological Analysis

This study employs Panofsky’s methods of iconological analysis. Although originally intended for use in studies of Renaissance art, there is increasing interest in the analysis processes within the field of archaeology. The methodology was chosen because the intent of this study is to demonstrate ways in which the Western academic discipline of art history can be modified to assimilate non-Western contexts into the range of emphasis. Panofsky’s emphasis on primary, secondary and intrinsic meanings in imagery has been successfully employed within several recent archaeological studies, including those conducted at the White Shaman Cave in the southwestern United States (Boyd & Cox, 2016), at Nasca and Mocha sites in Peru (Nieves, 2015), and in a modified form by Schaafsma (2009) in an Ancestral Puebloan kiva located within the American Southwest. While not naming Panofsky specifically, Schaafsma’s work does name an anthropologist whose mid-20th century methods focused on a comparable emphasis on “nuclear” imagery (Turner, 1967).
1.3.3 Theoretical Background

The theoretical approach used in this study emphasises decolonising archaeological methodologies as articulated by Tuhiwai Smith in *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples* (2012) that provides basic guidelines which benefit all authors and students discussing topics related to decolonisation. The author specifically describes the effects of imperialism on indigenous peoples in the broad sense as well as appropriate terminologies for all researchers while also contributing specific insights into working within the field of “indigenous archaeologies.”

This study also emphasises the importance of applying mytholinguistic analysis to subject matter, visual or narrative, of the cultural works of non-Western oracy-based peoples. Within this perspective, imagery is viewed as an integral aspect of the narrative tradition which is customarily incorporated with storytelling, ritual, and the visual arts. The effective analysis of the relevant mytholinguistic content evident in the works of art is therefore essential to this study. While Vansina (1985) laid the early groundwork for the methods of analysis employed within this and other expanded studies relevant to indigenous archaeology, Barber and Barber (2004) expand upon the nature of narrative content embedded within the visual arts, particularly those which undergo a process of “restructuring,” and are therefore also used.

Developments within the field of archaeology have opened the discipline to include forms of “exographic objects” and “symbolic storage.” The ways in which these concepts relate directly to the field of archaeology and anthropology are effectively detailed by Thomas (2004). As a museum professional working in the American Southwest, my own personal perspectives coincide with those of Thomas. When used in combination with Barber and Barber and Tuhiwai Smith, a focused study of the arts of non-Western peoples, specifically the Hopi, and the ways in which such approaches can be addressed within Western academia, is effectively supported.

1.4 OUTLINE OF THE CHAPTERS

Chapter 1: Introduction of the Study

The introduction of this study describes both the shortcomings of Western art history as a discipline and the need to expand the area of emphasis to include the accomplishments of non-Western peoples. This study promotes the use of methodologies that acknowledge the important role visual imagery, iconology, metaphor, and narrative play in studies of the non-Western art forms of oracy-based peoples such as the Hopi.

Chapter 2: Review of the Literature

The literature employed within this study spans several aspects of knowledge that are separated within the Western academic discipline system but which are
viewed as integrated components of a more holistic approach to the arts and the ways in which they expand the customary boundaries of human cognition in the direction of the “extended mind” thesis (Clark & Chalmers, 1998). Within that area of study, Rowlands, for example, considers visual perception, memory, thought, and language as extended cognitive processes (Oxford Bibliographies, 2019). In particular, the works of Thomas (2004) explain how the field of archaeology has recently been broadened to include an awareness of artifacts which are and have been used as “symbolic storage” vessels relevant to the preservation of significant knowledge by humans within a variety of cultures throughout multiple eras.

Chapter 3: The Western Canon: Interpretations and Misinterpretations of Hopi Culture

Chapter 3 chronicles the ways in which the academic luminaries associated with the West’s prestigious east coast colleges utilised the Hopi people as a means of experimenting with their newly developed theories regarding science, linguistics, anthropology, and sociology. Perhaps the most widely known theory is the “Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis” which accelerated the careers of Edward Sapir and his student, Benjamin Lee Whorf within the discipline of linguistics. In their totality, the works of European American academics during this century and those before contributed to the development of a canon of Imperialist belief which served to subjugate colonised Native American peoples. Taking place shortly after the development of Einstein’s *Theory of Relativity*, Sapir, Whorf, and other East Coast academics emphasised the important role they believed science played in the study of indigenous peoples.

Chapter 4: Art history, *Ekphrasis*, and Exographic Arts

Chapter 4 highlights the restrictive boundaries of Western art history as an academic discipline which guides Western thinking in regard to the arts. Discussions include the frustrations of teachers working in elementary-level education within the United States, the emphasis Western art history places on “writing about art,” and the ways in which mnemonic as well as narrative function as the basis for arts of oracy-based or non-Western peoples.

Chapter 5: Hopi Lifeways and Historical Exographic Content

The specific ways in which the Hopi emergence story and related contexts influence the Hopi worldview, daily activities, and arts are discussed in Chapter 5. The discussion emphasises the significance of the “Fourth World” narrative to a variety of art forms including stone tablets, and the landscape in which specific features are used to recall detailed elements of the fundamental origin story.

Chapter 6: Indigenous Thought and Scientific Thinking

Chapter 6 examines the differences between Hopi traditional knowledge and the ways in which it is both preserved and delivered through the arts. Further, the
Chapter describes the important ways in which knowledge itself is defined differently within the Western and indigenous traditions. The specific ways the West views experience within dichotomic (divided in two parts) rather than synchronic contexts is contrasted with the Native American and indigenous people’s perspectives. Further, the chapter highlights the ways in which an endangered Hopi art form, the katsina song, was revived through the collaborative efforts of a scholar member of the Hopi people and a Western academic known for her studies in both archaeology and multidisciplinary cultural arts.

Chapter 7: Cognition, Culture and Self

Chapter 7 describes how the Hopi concept of self includes the successful integration of the individual into the broader culture of the Hopi people. The important roles cultural practices play in reminding members of the culture of the importance of being the “people of the short blue corn,” a concept which dates back to the people’s mythic emergence into the current Fourth World where they pledged to live a difficult but rewarding life as farmers who follow the “Corn Lifeway.”

Chapter 8: Iconology, Narrative Content, and Ekphrasis in Metaphorical Worlds

This chapter examines the ways in which metaphor, narrative, and traditional knowledge are embedded within the arts and “reiterated” as a form of oral ekphrasis within the Hopi culture. In addition, the specific ways in which the land itself is viewed as an embodiment of the experience of emergence into the current Fourth World, interactions with deities, clan development, and subsequent migrations are all examined from the lens of the art and anthropological perspective.

Chapter 9: Embedded Exographic Experience

Descriptions of how art forms and associated practices converge in experiential contexts are discussed in Chapter 9. Topics discussed include how the collective will may be represented through the embodiment of prayer, how both images and shape reiterate the people’s mythical emergence, and how a form of architecture provides the opportunity to re-experience both the sense of emergence and ascent—perhaps even towards a potential “fifth world.”

Chapter 10: Oracy-based Ekphrasis in Exographic Hopi Arts

Chapter 10 identifies specific cultural themes inherent in Hopi arts which are observed through iconological studies. Several of the themes discussed have potential origins in what is now considered to be Mesoamerica, a location contiguous to modern day North America and culture. In light of this possibility, the culture’s mythological themes and visual conventions may have significant relevance to our modern understanding of the Hopis’ emergence and subsequent migrations. It is thought that the migrations were not necessarily linear progressions but often circular movements instead. The connections between the
iconology relevant to migrating groups of Ancestral Puebloan people and what are now considered multiple separate cultures, including the Hopi, are considered within this theoretical framework.

Chapter 11: Dream and Place: Metaphysical Dimensions of Hopi Tutskwa

This chapter explains how dream experience is integrated within the worldview and experience of Hopi peoples as well as those with whom they interact, including the Diné (Navajo). The discussions highlight the science of the human dream as it takes place on a physiological level and the specific ways these effects may influence cultural beliefs, particularly those related to healing, sorcery, and witchcraft.

Chapter 12: Conclusions

Chapter 12 concludes this study and provides support for the thesis’s perspectives. The specific ways in which the arts of oracy-based peoples can be better understood within the field of art history, when the discipline itself broadens to include related methods of embodiment and narrative content, are summarised. The conclusion provides further support for the ways different cultural perspectives merit different definitions of “art” within Western academia.
CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The current study discusses topics concerning the Hopi culture and is written by a non-Hopi student. Although I have numerous years of experience working with both Native Americans and cultural object collections as a museum professional and archaeological illustrator, I understand the limits to which I or any other non-Native can grasp the philosophical beliefs of a culture as complex and enduring as that of the Hopi. While my profession has required a depth of knowledge on the subjects I write about, and I have lived for numerous years in the remote public lands adjacent to those of Hopi Tutskwa (Aboriginal Hopi Lands), I fully understand that there are limits to the knowledge and understanding outsiders can reach. My subject, however, focuses on the use of cultural objects as “exoteric” forms of symbolic cultural storage, and this necessitated that I focus on one specific culture whose narrative tradition has been both well documented and shared to a depth that has been deemed appropriate within the non-Native academic community. It is the premise of this study that Hopi art forms, including vessels, architecture, songs, and ritual practices, are the repositories of significant cultural beliefs and are a means by which these important intellectual and cultural beliefs, practices, or properties are traditionally passed down to future generations. The following works assisted me in conducting a study that fits within the ethical standards that befit such a project.

2.2 PERSPECTIVES AND METHODOLOGIES

This study is conducted with the understanding that the Western academic community has, in specific past instances, completed studies that are now considered historic in nature but have contributed to what Ishii (2010) has identified as an Imperialist “canon” of academic literature that promoted Western interests above and beyond those of the Native American subjects themselves. This study takes issue with some of the most well-known examples including literature generated in the development of what became known as the “Sapir-Whorf Theory of Linguistic Relativity” which claims the structure of a specific language influences the formation of the speakers’ cultural and conceptual worldviews.

The prospect of conducting field studies of the Hopi and their culture by European-American scholars inspired academic luminaries, including both Edward Sapir, a student of the famous anthropologist Franz Boas, and Benjamin Lee Whorf, one of Sapir’s most dedicated students. The studies they produced encouraged specific support for the Sapir-Whorf Theory of Linguistic Relativity which served for decades as the primary means by which Western academia viewed not only the Hopi, but also the majority of oracy-based cultures and peoples. The ultimate efficacy of the Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis has since been
questioned, first by Whorf himself who appeared drawn to the traditions of the east towards the end of his life and subsequently by linguists who contest Whorf’s claim that the Hopi language lacks verbs. Most recently Whorf’s work has been criticized by scholar, Jeremy Lent, who questions the supremacy of language in cognitive functions and suggests knowledge comes from a “form of understanding our place in the cosmos with embodied knowledge—knowledge that arises not just from the intellect but from our full experience that harmonizes intellection and intuition” (Lent, 2017).

This study views the research focusing on Hopi dreams conducted by Western academics, such as Dorothy Eggan and the United States Government itself (see Lemov, 2015), to be cultural artifacts in their own right in that they are programmes and projects that often provide more information about the cultural biases of the authors themselves than about the individuals or cultures under study. As such, they serve as examples of the application of an inappropriate ethnohermeneutical approach which fits the definition of the problems of cross-cultural understandings and research methodologies set forth by Geertz (1999).

My knowledge of the Hopi emergence narrative and other Fourth World contexts has been gathered from accounts attributed to Western ethnographers and anthropologists and to a complete collaborative work which was compiled and edited by Harold Courlander in the 1980s. While Courlander was a non-Hopi anthropologist working in the mid to late 20th century, his work, *The Fourth World of the Hopi* (1972) was written with the assistance of numerous Puebloan co-authors, many of whom requested anonymity out of respect for their families and for the continued privacy of each member of the enduring culture, as already discussed.

My own emphasis on working in the role of an outsider within appropriate ethical boundaries necessitated the formulation of and adherence to de-colonising methodologies as they relate to the academic disciplines of art history, archaeology, anthropology, Western science, and Western literature. Among my first and most important resources was the informative website set up by the Hopi people themselves. At the official website for the Hopi tribe, https://www.hopi-nsn.gov/, (The Hopi Tribe, 2018), the Hopi Tribe Department of Natural Resources provides a condensed narration of the Hopi emergence and the subsequent covenant made with Maasaw, the guardian of the earth and the original inhabitant of the Fourth World’s lands. While clearly a short summarisation, the story condenses the much more complex traditional oral narrative into a concise abbreviated form. The website also introduces the non-Hopi reader to key elements of the people’s philosophy and lifeways, particularly those which serve to protect the sacred lands. For a fuller account of the complete oral narrative, however, this study refers to Courlander’s work, *The Fourth World of the Hopis: The epic story of the Hopi Indians as preserved in their legends and traditions* (1987), because the publication remains well known, represents a collaborative effort between a Western academic and Hopi contributors in the late
20th century, and remains so widely read that readers of this study may already be familiar with the basic concept of the Hopi Fourth World through this popular work alone.

In addition to Hopi place names and other terms explained on the Hopi website, I examined the ways in which other Western scholars have effectively engaged with subjects pertaining to non-Western topics and peoples while maintaining strong ethical standards. Another particularly helpful website was BlackWords,3 created by Australia’s School of Communication and Arts, University of Queensland, as it provides basic guidelines for writers working with the arts and literatures of peoples of that country which are equally relevant to studies of additional oracy-based peoples and their traditional works. Among the most helpful perspectives the work provided for the research and writing conducted for this study was its emphasis on the need to use traditional vocabulary and place names whenever possible. This is particularly important because, for the indigenous peoples of Australia and other oracy-based peoples of the world, place names are often abbreviated mnemonic references or “cues” that represent entire cultural narratives of deep significance relevant to the specific locations in both time and space. The naming practice itself is compared within my study to the Western practice of method loci, a traditional mnemonic practice which aided early Western orators to remember extensive speeches through the use of imagery. Over time, the West came to rely on written texts rather than the capacity of the human mind itself, rendering the practice outdated. Thomas (2014a) provides in-depth insights into the practice, within “Mental Imagery,” an extensive entry provided within the Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy’s online publication. Similar practices associated with method loci are discussed in further depth as they relate to the Hopi perception of land and landmarks as the scenes or locations of deeply embedded cultural concepts which are themselves considered to be evidence of significant mythological events or contexts.

Among the basic premises of this study is the observation that some Western academic disciplines have more readily addressed the limits of their disciplines by developing more holistic knowledge bases which incorporate non-Western beliefs and perspectives into cross-cultural, multidisciplinary academic approaches. The ways cross-cultural contexts both affect and guide recent archaeological theory and methodologies are well stated by multiple authors whose works appear in recent anthologies and discipline-oriented handbooks (Schmidt, 2016; Vansina, 1985; Thomas, 2004; Valsiner, 2012, Smith, 2016;). As they directly address the meanings inherent in cultural objects, many of which are integrated with thematic cultural imagery, these resources are considered to be relevant support studies focusing on multicultural, inclusive, or specifically non-Western art history in

---

3 AustLit: The Australian Literature Resource
https://www.austlit.edu.au/specialistDatasets/BlackWords
general, and this study’s emphasis on Hopi narrative and relevant visual or mnemonic aspects embedded within the arts.

2.3 CONSCIOUSNESS AND COGNITION IN THE WESTERN CANON

Ishii (2010) provides substantial impetus for this comprehensive study. The author writes from the Hopi perspective, describing the ways in which the early archaeological research, completed by Jesse Walter Fewkes in the late 1800s, contributed to the compilation of an ethnographical and ethnological canon which has been “largely devoid” of the Hopi perspective and, early on, rejected Hopi epistemology, instead serving the Imperialist agenda of the West.

The work of Ishii (2010) identifies two main schools of academic approach that were employed between 1880 and 1925. Elsie Clews Parsons adopted a “historical particularist” approach while Alexander Stephen, Fewkes, Voth, and Robert Lowrie were unilineal “evolutionists.” According to Ishii (2010), unilineal evolutionists distorted research findings to fit their overall agenda while historical particularism, the approach taken by Franz Boas, asserted that specific cultures had specific traits that could be ordered in logical, developmental categories. Ishii (2010) explains that Boas equated the evolutionists with racism due to their assertions that some peoples were “inferior,” “savage,” or not yet “civilized.”

Traditional European educational systems paid homage to the elemental beliefs of the early Greeks and Romans, including those of Plato and Empedocles who believed in trans-soul migration. Further, the ancient West practised a variety of forms of augury, little of which was based on science as it is had come to be defined in the post-Einstein era. Whether the perceived connections between the ancient West and the Hopi were academically sound or not had yet to be proven, however, the early Roman philosopher, Aratus’s, claims that the gods’ presences in nature were evident by their “signs” could appear to be concepts not too far akin from panpsychism, theistic panpsychism, and animism. Indeed, scholar and ecophilosopher, Freya Mathews, claims that the influence of the Classical West did influence America’s academicians and continues to do so, not due to their similarities but in the West’s development of a dependence on theoria, a term she applies to the distancing process occurring between the immediacy of experience, and the Western mind’s reinterpretation of the same.

Until the publication of Edward Said’s Orientalism (1978) in which the author described the West’s belittling of “The East” (Asia, North Africa, and the Middle East), the majority of mainstream American Liberal Arts scholars paid little serious attention to the unique wisdom and perspectives associated with non-Western cultures, including those of North America’s indigenous people, particularly in their early mastery of mnemonic art forms, mnemotechnic devices, and symbolic storage objects that served as cues to memory, storytelling, and
utilised aspects of what is known in the West as cognitive psychology (see Neisser, 1967).

Among the most influential Western academicians who did attempt to learn from emic (insider) cultural experience was the Polish born scholar, Malinowski, who is known for his extensive 1922 studies on the Trobriand Islanders with whom he lived. Numerous decades earlier, Frazer (1890) established a theoretical hierarchy of cultural mythology within his extensive study, *The Golden Bough*. Aby Warburg studied the Hopi whose culture and peoples he believed provided a unique glimpse into the ancient past of early Western civilization. Such theories gave rise to literature such as Warburg’s *A Lecture on Serpent Ritual*, co-written with WF Mainland, in 1939. Written before Said’s concept of “orientalism” was introduced to mainstream Americans, these were the scholars who laid the early definitive grounds for how the Hopi and other Native Americans of the American Southwest came to be defined. It is therefore their contemporaneous perceptions, misconceptions and restructured primary source materials that reflect the influence of not only the contexts relevant to European classical education and the perceived “primitivism” of the Hopi peoples, but the works of evolutionist anthropologists by whom the Hopi people, their beliefs, and their traditions, came to be defined by elite Western academicians.

### 2.4 LANGUAGE, ORAL NARRATIVE, AND CULTURAL IMAGERY

Harrison’s (2007) *When Languages Die* provides an in-depth background on the current global crisis in which environmental and social pressures are leading to the extinction of languages and the cultures to which they belong. To quote the author, “When ideas go extinct, we all grow poorer” (Harrison, 2007:vii).

Harrison also surveys a wide variety of narrative forms, many of which take the form of verbal maps or other means of establishing spatio-temporal relationships between people, the environment and the cosmos to which they belong.

Cultural beliefs related to nature spirits, shared by the Hopi with cultures as diverse as Japanese Shinto and the Kongo speaking peoples of Africa, are similar to concepts of mindfulness common to both Buddhism and modern Western panpsychic philosophy yet were largely considered simply primitive and animistic. “Primitivism” was a term widely applied to the practices of oracy-based cultures that chose to reflect traditional wisdom through metaphor, ritual, embedded references in objects or narratives, and imagery. While a definitive Navajo dictionary was eventually compiled in the 1950s by Morgan and Young, it was not until the year 1998 that a comprehensive and much embattled Hopi Dictionary Project was undertaken and completed. Even now, few copies of the work are available to non-Hopi people. Following developments in the field of cognition established by Neisser (1965), the means by which knowledge is integrated and stored within the mnemonic art forms, narratives, and traditional Hopi rituals, the relevance of mytholinguistic analysis (Vansina, 1985; Barber &
Barber, 2004) is more easily recognised and identified as a viable starting point from which to study non-Western oral narratives and associated visual arts.

2.5 INDIGENOUS STUDIES—ETHICS AND APPROACH

Written language has come late to the oracy-based Native Americans of the Southwest, including the Uto-Aztecan language of the Hopis. One of the most contentious times in recent Hopi history was caused by the completion of a standardised dictionary in which the oracy-based language was intended to be and subsequently has been preserved by primarily non-Hopi scholars. The contentious nature of the publication sparked intellectual property concerns that fueled the need for a Hopi Cultural Preservation Office. As a result of copyright concerns of the Hopi, the book, which was published by the University of Arizona, was primarily sold to the Hopi people themselves. Subsequent to the completion of the project, the Hopi Cultural Preservation Office has set ethical boundaries within which Hopi and non-Hopi scholars should work if they are to receive Hopi support. In addition, the Hopi Tribe itself has published an informative website which includes specific vocabulary and terminology relevant to Hopi topics. These have been incorporated into the terminology utilised within the present study.

Additional ethical guidelines when utilising materials related to indigenous cultures have been identified within the online manuals prepared by Australia’s “BlackWords: Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Writers and Storytellers Project.” Although focusing on indigenous writers and cultural property relevant to those specific cultures, the protocols for contexts, such as the use of indigenous words in general and proper nouns specifically rather than Westernised substitutes, have been followed throughout this document whenever possible and as deemed applicable to Western and Hopi topics. When original source materials are quoted within the body of the work, however, the original word choice remains unchanged and may reflect the cultural approaches of the times in which they were originally completed.

Furthermore, recent movements relevant to the study of indigenous archaeology, arts, and other disciplines have led to the publication of several books relevant to those topics which also recommend specific protocols or methodologies. Among them, Linda Tuwahi Smith, author of Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples (2012) whose basic guidelines for the deconstructing of Imperialist perspectives in academia proved as useful in the study of Hopi art and narrative as they did in her works on Maori peoples and knowledge.

\[\text{\textcopyright{} 2020 AustLit: The Australian Literature Resource} \]

https://www.austlit.edu.au/specialistDatasets/BlackWords
2.6 SCIENCE AND MYTH IN INDIGENOUS STUDIES

Among the aspects of divergent worldviews evident between the West and those of non-Western indigenous cultures, including the Hopi, is the belief that science is “the all-embracing method for gaining and understanding of the world” (Smith, 2012b Loc. 1527). The science of anthropology led to the belief among Western academies that

[...]

As a result of the conventional historical bias of Western scholars, dichotomies of science vs. art were common premises upon which academic subjects, including archaeology, anthropology, and art history, were divided. When cultural belief is distanced from non-Western arts, objects, and other significant dimensional materials, scientific belief obscures the presence of mytholinguistic content. For example, among Barber and Barber’s most significant components of analysis is the concept of “conflation” in which a narrative’s contexts and subjects may become condensed, silenced, or abbreviated over time. In contrast, the traditional use of the word in the modern West relates directly to science. Conflation is derived from the Latin word “conflare” which is the process of “fusing” materials or to “blow them together.” Common synonyms include: confound, confuse, mistake, and mix (up) (Merriam Webster Dictionary, 2019, sv ‘conflate’).

2.7 ICONOLOGY: AN ART HISTORY APPROACH

Panofsky (1972:14) provides an inherent iconological basis for this study of the intrinsic cultural meanings significant to Hopi culture, world view, and practices. Originally published in 1939 by the University of Oxford Press, Iconology: Humanistic Themes in the Art of the Renaissance, the comprehensive analysis process involves identifying visual imagery that functions on specific cultural levels:

1. Primary or natural subject matter: Factual or expressional
2. Secondary or conventional subject matter: The world of images, stories, and allegories
3. Intrinsic images or content: The world of “symbolical values”

Panofsky’s theoretical framework for iconological studies was originally designed for the analysis of “humanistic themes” in Renaissance works, yet it has recently been adapted by Boyd and Cox (2016) whose work employs the methodology to interpret the pre-historic era rock art, White Shaman Mural, located in a rock alcove above Texas’s Lower Pecos River. Additional studies employing Panofsky’s principles have been done by Nieves (2015) and Boyd and Cox (2016) who claim that the analysis of a prehistoric-era visual work’s “intrinsic meaning”
can be challenging. It is the means by which one may identify the “basic attitude of a nation, a period, a class, a religious or philosophical persuasion—unconsciously qualified by one personality and condensed into one work” (Panofsky, 1972:7). Boyd and Cox (2016) adapted the method to suit the analysis of an oracy-based culture and known relevant narratives of the Huichol and Nahua, two Mesoamerican cultures that could provide insights into the imagery of the rock art of other local pre-Columbian peoples and cultures. The resulting study draws strong connections between the beliefs of existing cultures and the earlier prehistoric-era peoples to whom the work is attributed.

Boyd and Cox (2016) identify specific Mesoamerican “Core Concepts” that relate directly to the White Shaman Mural analysis, including the interpretation of some images as “pictographic” or “hieroglyphic” language (Gossen, 1986; Boyd & Cox, 2016):

1. Cyclical time as sacred entity
2. Delineation of the sky, earth, and underworld in the spatial layout of the cosmos, with mediation among these realms as a key intellectual, political, and religious activity
3. Supernatural and secular conflict as creative and life-sustaining forces
4. Principle of complementary dualism
5. Spoken and written language (both “pictographic” and “hieroglyphic”)

While Boyd and Cox (2016) convincingly identify recognisable signatory forms, the emphasis is on illustrational visual elements rather than embodied three-dimensional forms or reflective two-dimensional content. It does not document another important aspect of the current study which is the process of “restructuring” that takes place when a living culture, such as the Hopi, adapt their traditional arts and lifeways to meet the requirements of a non-indigenous dominant society like that of the Spanish, Euro-American immigrants, and later, emissaries of the United States Government.

Rather than focus upon illustrational representations of diverse narratives of historical or chronologically ordered events, this study identifies the use of mnemonic elements which are reflective and conceptual “cues” to remembering rather than strictly “illustrational” in the Western sense of the word. This study shows how the concept of emergence into the Fourth World is reflected or embedded within rather than illustrated by the visual arts of the Hopi. Through an examination of “restructuring,” this study identifies how the influence of Spanish, Christianity, and even modern American pop culture has led to the creation of “double” objects that have different meanings for both the original and affected peoples. Through the use of mytholinguistic analysis, this study shows that, as the Puebloan cultural narrative changes due to religious syncretism and language adaptations, so too do the arts. This aspect of the study’s emphasis on transformation is evident in narrative content, art forms, and imagery. These are benefits of the in-depth insights into Puebloan history under Spanish rule provided by Liebmann, including how the Pueblo Revolt of 1680 CE ultimately led to the
cessation of the Jemez Black-on-white pottery style which was characteristically used on the “double objects” such as the pottery chalice found in the vicinity of the ruins of Giusewa.

2.8 PUEBLOAN LIFEWAYS: HISTORICAL ACCOUNTS

Stephen’s (1929; 1936) detailed narratives of Hopi culture are based upon his experiences living with Thomas V. Keam, a local trader, as well as the documentation he produced on Hopi traditions and customs at the request of Jesse Walter Fewkes in conjunction with the Hemenway Southwestern Archaeological Expedition. His volume of work remains a standard reference for modern-day scholars. To this day, the works of Fewkes and Clewes-Parsons are considered to be relevant accounts of Native American lifeways as practised during the early 19th and 20th centuries and, although the works are primarily examples of early archaeological and anthropological studies of living peoples, references to the ancestors of the Hopi peoples remain highly relevant today to scholars working in a variety of Western disciplines including that of art history.

2.9 METAPHOR IN HOPI NARRATIVE AND ART

Washburn (2012) as well as Washburn and Sekaquaptewa (2004; 2009) play a particularly significant role in the completion of this study, for they were among the first anthropologists to ascertain the significance of oral narrative, metaphor, and mythical content to archaeological and anthropological research. Pottery forms and imagery are among the most significant of the contexts examined as they demonstrate the people’s dedication to the covenant made with Maasaw, “to live as peaceful and humble farmers respectful of the land and its resources” (The Hopi Tribe, 2018). Of the several mentioned in this study, Shared Image Metaphors of the Corn Lifeway in Mesoamerica and the American Southwest (Washburn, 2012) provides the basis for an understanding of how the Hopi concept of lifecycle is symbolised in the growth of that which provides them with both physical and metaphysical nourishment: corn. In this article, Washburn equates the Hopi culture’s metaphorical relationships with corn with similar, well documented practises of Mesoamerican peoples. The work is of particular import because these are the beliefs that are embedded in ritual art and artifacts associated with the cyclical nature of the seasons and thus rain, crops, and spiritual practices centred on the annual arrival and departure of the kachinas. Imagery and embodied content evident in Hopi art and objects illustrate the symbiotic relationship that defines and supports the people’s art, narrative, and corresponding ritualised lifeways.

Washburn’s extensive studies in design symmetry and patterning, as they specifically relate to Hopi pottery, textiles, and Ancestral Puebloan sandal designs, represent the continuation of visual studies relevant to Greenberg (1975) and Ruth Bunzel (1972). Correlations between the Hopi Corn Lifeway and that of the Mesoamerican maize lifeway are soundly posited within Brady and Prufer, In
The practices described lend additional support for the image analysis provided within Washburn and Sekaquaptewa’s work, particularly in how the northward movement of Mesoamerican culture affected and/or introduced mirrored practices among the Hopi and other Puebloan peoples of the American Southwest.

Hopi Katsina Songs represents the collaboration of Emory Sekaquaptewa, Dorothy Washburn, and Kenneth C. Hill (2015), the former having produced transcriptions, translations, and additional relevant perspectives on 150 katsina songs that had previously been recorded yet were not available to the academic community due to the lack of English versions of the works. As such, it also promotes the preservation of the culture itself by providing students of all cultures with the opportunity to better understand Hopi philosophy and worldview, particularly in how the people’s existence depended upon their relationships with the katsinam who, in the form of clouds, could affect rain.

2.10 MULTIDISCIPLINARY INFLUENCES: ARCHAEOLOGY AND SYMBOLIC STORAGE

This comprehensive study summarises the essential literature providing significant perspectives on the shortcomings of the discipline of art history as it relates to non-Western peoples within Western academia, beginning with elementary school and extending to higher education institutions such as colleges, universities, and often even museums. The examination focuses on the topic of mnemonic objects which may be employed within an oracy-based culture, such as that of the Hopi, to both store and remind individuals of important cultural knowledge. Developments in other fields of Western academia, however, have surpassed those taking place within the discipline of art history. These new ways of thinking about art as it relates to humanity and human cognition have been introduced within the field of archaeology and psychology, particularly when works reflect the priorities of indigenous peoples who were historically excluded from the Western academic canon. Indeed, Western academia served as a means by which Imperialist thinking, until developments in the mid-20th century, sought to empower colonised peoples across the globe. The movement was most widely reflected in literature concerning Native American and African people as noted within this study.

Because literacy was employed as means by which the West ascertained the degree of sophistication of a given people in the past, Western art history remains largely bereft of topics relating directly to non-Western art forms and the meanings they hold for members of the cultures. In recent years, Panofsky’s (1939) system of analysis has become increasingly relevant to cross-cultural interdisciplinary studies. Several of the archaeological studies referred to within this study have either identified this methodology as the primary means of inquiry used within their analyses or alternative methodologies associated with later professionals who adopted the relevant though perhaps unattributed
“interdisciplinary” analysis techniques. The connections evident between “intrinsic knowledge”, as identified by Panofsky, and the view that traditional art forms serve as “symbolic storage” for oracy based peoples, including the Hopi, have been recorded as early as 1630, when the Portuguese priest, Fray Alonso de Benavides, noted that the Indians prepared for confession “by studying their own sins, bringing them along recorded on a series of knotted strings” (Morrow, 1996:42). This is a direct reference to what would be the use of *quipu* (*khipu*)—knotted string recording devices still in use by the Inka people of South America—among the early Puebloan peoples at Giusewa at that time.

This study adapts the perspective that significant cultural meanings can be embodied within the visual, performance, and storytelling arts to the Western field of art history by focusing on mytholinguistic analysis as an important tool that should be employed when studying the arts of peoples who follow traditional lifeways. Among those who remain highly committed to these cultural practices are the Hopi people of the American Southwest. As a result, the literature that supports this study spans a variety of interdisciplinary topics, from those relating directly to the Hopi people through their own arts, including *katsina* songs and imagery, to those relating to the study of embedded or exographic cultural material as currently being explored within the field of Western archaeology. The literature presented within this brief review follows the order of import as it relates to the written transcription or summaries of traditional Hopi narratives. These mid-20th century works were employed by the West’s most prominent university programmes and scholars to promote scientific theories inspired by those of Darwin and Einstein and works which represent the most recent calls to “deconstruct” the Imperialist canon by which Western academia has been historically defined since the European contact era. Because conscious and subconscious experience is perceived to be a duality within the Western culture, scientific and anthropological aspects of dream studies are introduced to explain how both waking and dream experiences merge within the perceptions of non-Western peoples, including those of the American Southwest.

The following are brief summaries of the specific literature that proved most influential to this study.

---

1 Historic documentation does not specifically state if this was a traditional practice among the Jemez people or if it had been introduced to them by the European clergy. According to Lanning (1967:166), the knots created in the cordage represent numeral units similar to the western system of decimals. Spanish priests are said to have discouraged the use of quipu among the people of the Andes, and in 1583, they were decreed to be the “work of the devil” (Ohio State University: Quipu, 2014).
2.11 NARROW SCOPE OF WESTERN DISCIPLINE OF ART HISTORY

The literature employed within this study provides insights into the ways in which oral narrative serves as a mnemonic device within oracy-based cultures, such as the Hopi, and establishes the importance of viewing non-Western art forms from this perspective. It is the assertion of this study that the traditional scholarly discipline of Western art history has traditionally viewed art as a vehicle for the expression of Western belief and philosophy, and, as such, the significant roles art plays in non-Western cultures have been widely overlooked within Western academia in general and specifically in the discipline of art history (Blocker, 1993; 1997; Chanda, 1995; 1998; 2000; 2004; 2010; Chanda & Basinger, 2000). Because the ties that the oral narrative tradition has to non-Western arts have been historically diminished or ignored within the field of art history, this study introduces relevant methodologies currently developing within Western psychology, mytholinguistics, and archaeology that more directly address the fundamental philosophical, narrative, and cosmographic concepts that are relevant to and often incorporated within Hopi iconography, art forms, and practices as well as those of other non-Western peoples.

2.12 CULTURAL OBJECTS AS EXOGRAPHIC OBJECTS AND SYMBOLIC STORAGE

In recent years, some scholars working within the Western discipline of archaeology have begun to view “artifacts” as embodied objects or forms of “symbolic storage” (Thomas, 2004). These works and contexts are of essential importance to the current study. Within these particular archaeological studies, embedded objects are perceived to function on cognitive levels. While the West has traditionally considered these works as “art” when defined on Western terms, recent collaborations between archaeologists and Native peoples have provided sound support for the specific ways in which the art of non-Western peoples, including that of the Hopi, reflects cultural oral narrative tradition (Ferguson 2003, Ferguson et al., 2006). Hodder’s *Entangled: An Archaeology of the Relationships between Humans and Things* (2012) clearly articulates the reasons he believes humans have come to rely upon external storage devices, traditionally in the form of made objects, as extensions of cultural knowledge:

I argue that the source of transformation and constraint in human society is not in the material facts of existence but in the dependences between humans and things ... Whether these stimuli (of whatever heterogeneous origin) lead to change or transformation of entanglements depends not on the materials (or intentions) themselves but on the form and tautness of the entanglement. The interlacings of the web are composed of bundles of material, ecological, economic social, ideational, emotional and cognitive processes. Human movements to and away from things are made possible by, but are also
bounded or channeled by, these bundles of material and immaterial interactions and dependences. These bundles make up strings or cables in which both humans and things are enabled and constrained. It is these multiple, co-dependent strands that create the webs in which societies are formed, endure and fall apart (Hodder, 2012:97).

Hodder’s work is written from the perspective of an archaeologist whose primary focus is the study of how things and society “co-entangle.” Discussions concerning “extended mind theory” note the understanding shared by “Merleau-Ponty to Renfrew and Clark that humans think through material culture” (Hodder, 2012:35). Interestingly, Hodder notes the significance of the Russian culture-historical school of culture psychology (Vygotsky) and the concept that “the mind works through artifacts” (Hodder, 2012:35). Although working within the field of art history and education, Chanda (2000), too, adopts Vygotsky’s position that the mental structures children base thinking on can be “enhanced” through practices involving reasoning and relations. Both Hodder and Chanda apply the context of mental constructions to the study of objects, known within the respective fields as both “material culture” and art. While Hodder addresses the subject broadly and emphasises the application of the theory to archaeological contexts, Chanda demonstrates Vygotsky’s theory in a specific lesson on African Ndop art which introduced Western elementary school students to the significant role Ndop figures play in the Kuba culture and history as portrayals of the people’s powerful kings (Chanda & Basinger, 2000). As this study frequently states, Chanda’s writings fit within the discipline of traditional art history yet clearly identify Western art history’s exclusivity when its aesthetic criteria are applied to the works of non-Western peoples for whom art may instead reflect embedded social structures, cultural iconographies, and spiritual or cosmological beliefs.

2.13 ORAL NARRATIVE AND MNEMONIC TRADITION

Vansina (1985), a Western historian and anthropologist specialising in the oral tradition, studied the importance of mnemonics within both the narratives and made objects of African cultures. These concepts are found to be equally relevant to Hopi belief and thus provide foundational support for analyses of the relationships evident between worldview, mythology, imagery, and ritual within the Hopi culture. In particular, Vansina’s (1985; 1999) concepts of mnemotechnical contexts as they relate to oral narrative, music, and landscapes prove to be highly relevant to the ways in which the Hopi Fourth World narrative is referenced and comprehended on experiential levels within Hopi arts, including architecture, petroglyphic imagery, and cultural interpretations of the Earth’s natural features.

6 Democratic Republic of the Congo (Zaire)
In addition, this study demonstrates how the analysis theories employed by Vansina beginning in the 1980s and Barber and Barber (2004) in the early 21st century prove to be particularly relevant to the understanding of non-Western forms of art, particularly in how such works represent forms of narrative reiteration comparable to a visual approach to what the West refers to as *ekphrasis*, or writing about art. This study asserts that, for oracy-based cultures, the practice of reiteration may be visual, oral, or even experiential, as in the references to ascension in Hopi architecture, rather than written and therefore literary in nature.

The works of Liebmann (2012; 2015) and Morrow (1996) provide specific insights into the ways in which the narrative content of the Puebloan people have historically responded to the introduction of Western culture into their traditional North American lands. Both authors effectively describe the influence of the Spanish conquest and subsequent years of subjugation by the Catholic Church in texts that portray the ability of the Puebloan peoples to incorporate aspects of Christian narrative into their own traditional iconological practices as was demanded from them at the time. Liebmann (2015), for example, provides background into the creation of “double objects” which strived to both meet the demands of the Western religious or governmental authorities’ wishes in terms of handcrafted “Native-made” goods yet also continued the mnemonic and narrative traditions for which the works were initially intended. For example, the ways in which the traditional Jemez pottery style was adapted to reflect the clergy’s need for a chalice is clearly evident in a vessel recovered from Giusewa Pueblo (Figure 4.5).

### 2.14 INTERDISCIPLINARY APPLICATIONS OF PANOFSKY’S ICONOLOGICAL ANALYSIS

Finally, this study asserts the importance of understanding narrative or mnemonic content embedded within Hopi arts as aspects of “intrinsic” knowledge and thus is best understood through iconological analysis as defined by Erwin Panofsky in the mid-20th century (1939). The lack of understanding evident between Western academics and non-Western forms of art may essentially be viewed as conflicting beliefs regarding the definition of intrinsic knowledge essential to a culture and that which is purely visual or bears incidental similarities to the arts as they are traditionally studied and understood within the Western academic tradition. This study refers to recent studies in the field of archaeology in which either Panofsky’s theories have been identified as a primarily relevant methodology or which have relied upon Panofsky’s essential general process of analysis albeit referred to in general scientific terms (Schaafsma, 2009).
2.15 DREAM

This study’s emphasis on the use of metaphor in the Fourth World narrative, dreams, arts, and the basis of spiritual wholeness is supported with studies and perspectives published in Lakoff and Johnson (1980). The means by which imagery, such as petroglyphs located in the American Southwest and associated cultural metaphors, may be viewed by some Native American groups as works of sorcery is clearly established through historical accounts recorded by local anthropologists and historians including McPherson (2014).

Eggan (1956) worked extensively with anonymous Hopi “informant-friends” in studies that acknowledged the roles of “The Breath Body” and “The Mighty Something” in Hopi dreams with an emphasis on dreams concerning water serpents. This study draws upon both her publications and archived materials located in the library of the University of Chicago.

Lemov (2015) provides in-depth perspectives on the United States government’s dream studies which employed the era’s most advanced methodologies and focused on local Native Americans living near Ramah, New Mexico during the mid-20th century. Intended to be a major contribution to the canon of Western academic sociological and anthropological studies, the study was funded and headquartered deep within the American Southwest but technical issues resulted in the ultimate inaccessibility of the findings. In more recent years, Shulman and Stroumsa (1999) edited a comprehensive volume on the role dreams play in culture, including that of the Hopi. Within the work are chapters focusing on Amerindian dream sharing and interpretation as well as “double voicing” which Dennis Tedlock identifies as the ways dreams are told in later times by entities other than the dreamer themselves. Scientific perspectives on the process of dreaming, as it relates to cognition and perception, are derived from studies presented in Windt (2015), while Thompson (2017) elaborates on the science and eastern beliefs associated with “out of body” experiences which are themselves relevant to shamanistic healing practices, rock art images, and medicine bundles.

2.16 CONCLUSION

The literature employed in this study represents works written in several stages of the West’s scholarly approach to the studies of Native Americans in general, which is quite well documented in the Hopi studies sponsored by many of the most elite institutions of learning in the United States. Following on the heels of Einstein’s Theory of Relativity, the development of a theory of “Linguistic Relativity” which was also known as the Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis, or simply the Whorf Hypothesis, was both an earnest effort to further the “science” of linguistics and a means of managing what are now perceived to be the rightful intellectual properties of a vulnerable, colonised people. By the middle of the 20th century, the literature began to reflect new perspectives on the value of Native American mythology as a result of the publication of works by Eliade and a
growing awareness of the culture of oracy-based peoples as published by anthropologists such as Nancy Munn, who studied the culture, and rock art of the Walbiri7 (1986). In later years, anthropologist Dorothy Washburn published a series of works in collaboration with Emory Sekaquaptewa and Kenneth C. Hill8 including *Shared Image Metaphors of the Corn Lifeway in Mesoamerica and the American Southwest* (2012) which figures prominently in this study’s analyses of specific art objects and visual representations. While attempts to represent the Native American perspective were increasingly forthcoming, ethical questions continued to arise, particularly when materials considered sacred were exposed. As in the case of the Hopi, special clan knowledge was only shared within the clan itself. To publish sensitive cultural information not only represented a threat from outside the culture but also from within. The traditions and secrets were not meant to be pan-Hopi in nature and had been carefully guarded since their arrival and the subsequent migrations across Maasaw’s lands. Ironically, as Western scholars become more adept at understanding the basic principles of the human mind, particularly within the field of cognition, the literature has also taken a turn. Western academics have become increasingly aware that specific aspects of the human mind are shared by all; however, the West has been slow to recognise them and, arguably, even slower to find a means of articulating their findings.

Diverse perspectives from multiple disciplines are brought together through this study’s emphasis on disparate literature, studies of oral narrative, and both conventional and culturally based studies of art. The chosen resources support the focus of the study which is to not only emphasize the West’s imprecise perceptions of non-Western cultural objects, but to demonstrate how the artforms of a specific non-Western people—the Hopi—store and protect cultural knowledge within the arts, and how these works ensure the preservation of traditional lifeways, philosophy, spiritual beliefs, and comprehensive worldviews for future generations.

---

7 Romanized word for Australian Walpiri culture

8 Kenneth C. Hill was also among the collaborators who worked with Sekaquaptewa and others on the controversial Hopi Language Dictionary project sponsored by the University of Arizona which began in the mid-1980s.
CHAPTER 3: THE WESTERN CANON: INTERPRETATIONS AND MISINTERPRETATIONS OF HOPI CULTURE

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The cultures of indigenous peoples around the world became interpreted through Western standards from the time of first contact. The inexplicable had to be explained, but the explanations were based upon the European point of view which itself was based upon their own experience of knowledge that was clearly lacking. One aspect of the Hopi culture and of other indigenous people subject to the influence of colonialism was the meaning of the traditional arts to those who made or practised it. To understand the changes that took place as a result of European influence fully, one must understand the initial roles that art served within the culture and the changes that befell the people.

For example, from the time of the arrival of the Spanish in the 15th century, the Native American peoples they encountered were forced to convert to Christianity. As part of that effort, children were removed from their families to be made “American” (generally “white”), particularly in the mid- to late 1800s and the first half of the 1900s. At the behest of the United States government, Native children were sent to boarding schools. It was at these places their hair was cut, they were taught trades that were deemed productive for the non-European population, and their languages and practises were prohibited.

Eventually, aspects of their cultures, especially those deemed “the arts,” were appropriated or changed to meet the needs of tourists and collectors who were drawn to the perceived exoticism of the peoples and what were perceived to be their “primitive” (and by European standards “illiterate”) ways. Previously existing works of visual arts, ritual, and narratives (which were rarely accurately translated) were defined and valued according to European understandings and values. For example, what would have been considered to be an origin story to Native Americans, which was articulated orally or through representative images, was considered to be a curious “primitive myth” as deemed typical of “uneducated” peoples and what were considered to be their naïve “animist” ways. It was not until the mid-20th century when American academics launched well funded anthropological and linguistic studies that they began to look more closely at the “scientific” relevance of the people and their cultures and, thus, take them more seriously.
3.2 NATIVE AMERICANS AND THE WESTERN ACADEMIC CANON

During the mid-20th century, the prospect of conducting field studies of the Hopi and their culture inspired the careers of academic luminaries including linguist Edward Sapir, a student of the famous anthropologist Franz Boas, and Benjamin Lee Whorf, a student of Sapir as already noted. The literature and studies of the era led to the development of what became known as both the Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis and Sapir-Whorf Theory of Linguistic Relativity (1930) which stated:

Broadly, the belief that people who speak different languages perceive and think about the world quite differently, their worldviews being shaped or
determined by the language of their culture (Oxford Reference, 2019, sv ‘Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis’).

Though specific details of the theory have since been questioned, particularly those relating to Whorf’s perception of a characteristic “timelessness” and lack of tense in Hopi verbs (Pinker 1994, 2007), it remains among the dominant theories relevant to the linguistic and anthropological practices on which much of the mid-20th century Imperialist canon was based.

The research opportunities afforded by the University of Pennsylvania and other institutions during this era promised scholars opportunities to develop and implement seminal linguistic and anthropological theories that would serve as the basic foundations upon which future scholasticism within the fields of ethnographics, anthropology, and linguistics could build. In more recent decades, support for the theory has become discredited. Lent notes that the theory was “witheringly attacked” in the latter part of the century as studies revealed that people from various cultures were able to adapt “to culturally different ways of thinking even as adults” (Lent 2017:21). As stated by the Linguistic Society of America, Whorf himself became aware of the potentially negative impact of his own course of studies. He ultimately acknowledged how language could serve as a means of undermining the “worldview” of indigenous cultures:

> We cut nature up, organise it into concepts, and ascribe significances as we do, largely because we are parties [sic] to an agreement to organise it in this way—an agreement that holds throughout our speech community and is codified in the patterns of our language (Whorf, 1940:213-4).

And, in the words of Sapir:

> Human beings ... [are] very much at the mercy of the particular language which has become the medium of expression for their society... . The fact of the matter is that the ‘real world’ is to a large extent unconsciously built up on the language habits of the group (Sapir, 1929:162).

Pierce (1953) described Western academia’s discrediting of oral history in general as a reflection of savagism—“a deep-seated prejudice of modern Western social imaginary against tribal peoples” (as cited in Dykeman & Roebuck, 2008). Something of this may account, in part, for the fact that references to historical documents are far more frequent in the archaeological literature on the Navajo than are references to Navajo oral tradition. They explain how the notion still affects Western academia today.

The tendency of many theorists to give greater credence to written history over oral history explains the vigour with which some archaeologists (e.g. Schaafma, 1996; 2002) have attempted to make their theories of Navajo origin coincide with specific interpretations of ambiguous Spanish historical documentation in support of the refugee hypothesis, even in contradiction of Navajo and Pueblo oral accounts (Dykeman & Roebuck, 2008:13). The ultimate efficacy of the Sapir-
Whorf Hypothesis has since been questioned, not only by Whorf himself towards the end of his career as already stated, but more recently by Lent (2017:21) who debates the Whorf’s evidence suggesting a lack of “tense” in Hopi language, suggesting instead

a form of understanding our place in the cosmos with embodied knowledge—knowledge that arises not just from the intellect but from our felt experience that harmonizes intellection and intuition.

In contrast to Sapir-Whorf, Lent claims that one’s language “establishes structures of cognition that influence us to perceive, understand, and think about the world according to certain patterns. Or, in its simplest terms: language has a patterning effect on cognition” that can ultimately shape our perceptions of reality and of history itself. (Lent, 2017:21)

Current-day critics of the Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis such as Pinker and Lent question its assumption of Hopi concepts of space and time, particularly in how they appeared to be lacking and thus differed from those essential to Western language systems. A similar response is evident in academia’s response to Fred Kabotie’s mid-20th century art, as his plain white backgrounds failed to provide Western viewers with essential definitions of space, time, and context.

3.3 WESTERN PERCEPTION AND THE ART OF FRED KABOTIE

In addition to differing concepts relating to the depiction of space and navigation, representations of figures in space may also be “enunciated” differently, as is evident in the works of Hopi artist Fred Kabotie. After having run away from his first boarding school and finally completing boarding school in Santa Fe in the early 1900s, Kabotie chose to concentrate on art using the new techniques he had learned while under the tutelage of Western instructors. His paintings were ultimately exhibited in the prestigious US Pavilion of 1932 at the 54th International Art Exhibition of the Venice Biennale. As described by Horton (2015), the works surprised the viewers because they did not employ the conventions of traditional Western artists, nor did they portray the west as the dramatic landscape it had, for years, beginning with the campaigns of the Santa Fe Railroad, been portrayed to be. As Horton explains, their emphasis was entirely unexpected:

... constellations of Pueblo dancers in elaborate dress float on the surface of four sheets of otherwise unadorned paper. Delineated in gouache by some of the first professional Native American painters of the twentieth century, the figures contrast starkly with the saturated scenes on either side of the doorway. Unlike the Pueblo riders and Penitentes, the dancers are not fixed in an elsewhere by a glue of continuous detail. They do not recede into a distant American landscape (Horton, 2015:55).
Horton suggests the white space could be indicative of the need to show Hopi dances without revealing specific aspects of Hopi ceremonials in the manner that similar details are left out of ethnographic studies. The author suggests Kabotie’s dancers are surrounded by white space which “does not just appear beyond their crisp edges but persists as a stark, material expanse between them” (Horton, 2015:63).

The space, according to Horton, when understood diagrammatically, could be “unarticulated space” that is “neither a passive ground for figures nor a metaphysical void; it is a flexible material that invites the active participation of viewers” (Horton, 2015:64). Alternately, the space could be indicative of the eradication of cultural narratives consistent with the agenda of the Indian School Art Education programmes. Lentis (2016:180) quotes Kabotie who claimed the absence of imagery was directly related to his sense of personal loss and isolation:

> When you’re so remote from your own people, you get lonesome. You don’t paint what’s around you, you paint what you have in mind. Loneliness moves you to express something of your home, your background.

Expanding the perspective further, Wade and Evans (1973) identify and describe the potential symbolic references inherent in the culture itself:

> As Westerners, we tend to perceive reality as constituting of organized elements structured upon an unorganized or blank background. This is particularly true in the case of art. Our culture has taught us that a blank area is synonymous with being unfinished or part of the background or setting. Thus it did not first occur to us that the white portion of the sash would have any significance, and we did not inquire about it. We merely considered it to be an empty space. It was only when we were told that the red band (which we considered a “design”) was simply a boundary or separating device that we decided to ask whether the solid white upper portion of the sash had any symbolic significance. This proved to be the turning point in our whole research (Wade & Evans, 1973:11).

To the Western eye, Kabotie’s white spaces no doubt conflict with the expectations developed from viewing the studies of Native American peoples as depicted in natural history museum displays such as those included in the collections of the American Museum of Natural History. Stephens (2018:29) notes that such museum displays depicted Native Americans playing the role of the exotic “other” situated within an equally sensational natural and perhaps “extinct” world.⁹

---

⁹ Stephens (2018) describes the connections between colonialism and museum diorama displays as examined by Ravi Agarwal’s exhibit at the National Museum of Natural History in New Delhi in 2008.
3.4 WESTERN EDUCATION AND THE “COLONIZATION OF CONSCIOUSNESS”

The efforts of the United States government and its educational institutions were not limited to studying Native American language, theory, and practice. At New Mexico’s Albuquerque Indian School and the Sherman Institute in California, the government sought to methodically undermine the traditional Native American cultural practices within the boarding school system. Lentis (2016) describes how art education was specifically employed as a means of destabilising Native Americans, hypothesising the following:

The presence of arts and crafts in the Indian schools’ curriculum was sustained by the belief that these innocuous activities could teach a disposition of mind, appropriate Anglo-American work ethic, the ideal of self-sufficiency, and the value of time, money, and material goods. Native arts and crafts were re-conceptualized as one of the tools to prepare students to fit into the white man’s world (2016:23).

Lentis argues that Native American arts became a tool for the “colonization of consciousness” which aimed for the “total reformation of the heathen world” using a model first employed in the colonisation of the South African Tswana people by missionaries who sought to systematically “reshape” the culture through the school system (2016:21). The author further claims:

Art education was an instrument for the colonization of consciousness because it was approached in a manner that stressed this basic idea of mind-training: teaching in colors and forms developed the proper power of observation and preferred way of seeing; training in accuracy and precision eliminated elements of savagery, impulsiveness, and irresponsibility (2016:21).

In addition, President Ulysses S. Grant’s “Peace Policy of 1869 & 1870” required Indian boarding schools to adopt and promote Christian beliefs and practices. With an emphasis on the Christian Bible, traditional storytelling, which had served as a primary means of learning and cultural transmission for the oracy-based Native American cultures in the past, was prohibited from the curriculum of government boarding schools. Punishments, including “whippings, being jailed, food deprivation, psychological burdens and demands, death threats, unhealthy and unsanitary living conditions”, were given for practicing their cultural ways (Cheeseman & Gapp, 2012:24). Lentis explains the significant effect of the loss of narrative and visual arts traditions on the students at the Sherman Institute in New Mexico:

Generations of Native students attending Sherman Institute, Albuquerque, and many other schools were deprived of the familial and communal upbringing and denied instruction in aesthetic, design principle, and art-making processes that they would have received in their home communities.
This in turn, signified the impairment or loss of the ancestral knowledge embedded in traditional teachings, stories, songs, and imageries which constitute a core aspect of American Indian identity (2016:39).

Lentis further claims that the Indian school system was a means of “training the power of seeing” and was “successful in that it severed children from their Indigenous worldviews, art making traditions, and social practises and replaced them with Anglo-American utilitarian notions and consumption skills” (2016:521-522).

The ways in which Hopi children, in particular, were accustomed to a tradition of visual imagery are noted to have been evident within the classroom. Lentis describes how the Hopi children responded to the arts as they were presented within the curriculum of the Sherman School while making note of how the arts were a means of “visually representing the worldview and ancestral knowledge,” that related directly to the tradition of “telling stories through images”:

Of all the students in Mrs. Benavidez’s class, the Hopis showed the greatest interest in this activity as they were likely the ones with the strongest pictorial tradition, which included not only decoration of utilitarian objects but also wall painting. Kiva mural painting in particular was a long-established practice among the peoples of the Mesas and was a way of visually representing their worldview and ancestral knowledge. Kivas were the centers of men’s social and ceremonial life but were also places in which daily activities were carried out: men gathered there to hold ceremonies, councils, social gatherings, but also to tell stories, weave, work silver, repair tools, carve kachina dolls and other ceremonial paraphernalia. Mrs. Benavidez’s boys were certainly familiar with the environment of these sacred places, as Hopi children accompanied adult relatives in their daily chores and spent, particularly in winter, entire days in the kivas, playing and listening to stories. Their reaction to drawing—one of great interest—speaks to their eagerness to practice an activity that was well known, albeit in a different format and environment. They welcomed the opportunities to draw pictures because these exercises likely reminded them of their upbringing in the Hopi villages, their relatives, and their traditional stories told through images (Lentis, 2016:170).

3.5 NON-WESTERN APPLICATIONS OF ICONOGRAPHY AND ICONOLOGY: HOPI AND ANCESTRAL PUEBLOAN ART

In The Aesthetics of Primitive Art (1993), Blocker questioned the validity of applying Western art history techniques to “primitive art” contexts. In response, Chanda (2000:67) argued for the application of “empathetic” knowledge as a
means of properly identifying the relevant characteristics of non-Western cultural works as embodiments of cosmological or social ideals.

An understanding of art as metaphysical embodiments of intrinsic cultural beliefs, including that of cyclical time as it relates to human experience, narrative, and art, which are reflected in the ancient traditions of the Hopi and other traditional peoples whose philosophies and world views once dominated the globe, is essential for studies of non-Western art history. In contrast to the Western concept of linear developmental progress within the arts, the “non-Western” art of the Hopi, in particular, persists in embodying, in a non-literate form, what linguist Harrison (2007:23) describes as “sticky knowledge”—that which “persists and can be passed on, both across a longer time frame (after the original thinker is long dead) and to a wider audience”. As a means of forming conclusive determinations of the “sticky knowledge” relevant to a people and culture, such as the Hopi, this study employs Irwin Panofsky’s principles of iconological analysis to provide significant insights into the ways narrative, iconography, and sources, such as dreams, serve as the basis upon which art forms and related practices of non-Western approaches to art history can be built.

In recent years, studies within the academic disciplines of art, art history, anthropology, and archaeology have overlapped as more scholars employ the methodologies of Panofsky. As in the present broad study, Panofsky’s applications of primary, secondary, and intrinsic meaning have proven to be adaptable within contexts spanning multiple eras and cultures. Originally published in 1939 as Studies in Iconology: Humanistic Themes in the Art of the Renaissance, the major study addressed the importance of identifying three significant levels of iconological contexts relevant to the academic interpretation of visual representations.

In its time, Panofsky’s mid-20th century work was considered effective for the analysis of works relevant to the Renaissance; however, in recent decades, the approach has gained popularity within fields where cultural contexts demand a more inclusive interdisciplinary approach that can be applied to non-Western art historical contexts. Applications of Panofsky’s iconographic and iconological principles have been effectively used by the Shumla Archaeological Research & Education Center in recent surveys of the “White Shaman” mural pictograph panels located along the Pecos River in Southern Texas (Boyd & Cox, 2016). A similar focus on iconography is employed by Schaafsma (2009) in studies of kiva murals and related features located within an Ancestral Puebloan kiva, albeit with references to a similar methodology, anthropologist Victor Turner’s (1962) anthropological concept of “nuclear ritual symbol” analysis as proven effective in studies of African Ndembu imagery.

Chanda (1998) argued the need for the West to broaden the efficacy of conventional art history practices to include broader cultural contexts relative to the culture of the makers themselves. In response to that call and to the need to “deconstruct” the Imperialist canon of Western-centred historiographical thinking
while reconstructing more culturally and cognitively relevant approaches, the current study demonstrates how the integrative arts of the Hopi people serve as both reservoirs of knowledge and the facilitators of their oracy-based traditions and practices. In support of this perspective, the current art history study examines the art and artifacts of the Hopi and their predecessors, the Ancestral Puebloan people’s objects and imagery from significant narrative, visual, and cognitive contexts with an emphasis upon three essential cultural themes: the emergence, the pilgrimages and possible Mesoamerican contact as suggested by references to “Flower World” and the “Corn Lifeway.”

The merits of adapting these methods of analysis prove relevant when cultural works differ so greatly from traditional Western thinking. Among the narrative contexts relevant to the current study of non-Western work is the presence of non-linear methods of time reckoning. While Western concepts of progress are based upon a beginning, a middle, and an end, these ideologies are not necessarily shared within the non-Western world view and must be expressed within non-traditional art historical practice. In lieu of an emphasis on empirical development, non-traditional art history studies must reassert the import of natural cycles, which are not based upon art history paradigms but on aspects of nature and the human experience. For example, in an analysis of the meaning of iconographic elements evident within a Hopi ceremonial sash, Wade and Evans (1973:16) interviewed several collaborators who stressed the importance of viewing the work not as an individual piece but as a representation of an entire cosmos. This description of the imagery was contributed by “Informant E,” age 78, a former sash maker and member of the Bear Clan, at Shongopovi, Second Mesa:

> The sash altogether means the whole world. It tells of the black clouds on the horizon and the coming of a storm. The rain then comes down onto the world onto the plants and flowers. It should properly be viewed as a cycle. The designed portions should be thought to contain different levels, the central band being the lowest and the others being successively higher as one moves outward. (Wade & Evans, 1973:17)

### 3.5.1 Application of Panofsky’s Concepts to Hopi and Ancestral Puebloan Content, Art, and Imagery

Methodologies that incorporate both oral narrative and art shed light on Western misconceptions and misrepresentations that remain within the historical record. This is particularly true of imagery that holds intrinsic cultural meaning for a given people. For the Hopi, significant references to the emergence are evident in multiple aspects of life and are reiterated through both imagery, as forms of visual *ekphrasis*, and reenactment through ritual practice. Visual representations of these elements of Hopi arts and lifeways are of primary importance to the disciplines of art history, archaeology, and anthropology as they hold significant “intrinsic” meaning as defined by Panofsky’s tenets of iconology.
From the very start of life, individuals are immersed in their culture’s mythology and the significant life lessons it portrays. This immersion begins at birth when the child emerges into the world as part of the experience of the cycles of nature and of human life. From the perspective of outsiders who have no understanding of the cultural narratives that influence an individual’s decisions, concepts such as the intrinsic meaning behind imagery or even personal decisions in life can be misunderstood. The necessity of understanding Hopi arts within cultural narrative contexts is demonstrated in the example of Hopi birth rituals and the failure of government health facilities to understand why their own outreach did not succeed.

First published in 1940 by “Science Editions” in New York, social anthropologist, Wayne Dennis’s *The Hopi Child* (1965) was based on personal interactions with local Hopi and on direct communications he had with the residents of New Oraibi. He explained that there were hospital facilities at Keams Canyon and that the United States government encouraged the Hopi to use the facilities yet, despite the fact that they were free of charge, he noted that the Hopi “lacked confidence” in government doctors and felt that the light provided in hospital births was “injurious” to the child. In Hopi tradition, primipara women (those who have not given birth before) are required to remain indoors in seclusion for 20 days after which the formal naming ceremony can take place. The traditions echo both the essential Hopi Fourth World emergence theme (see Appendix A) and the story of their subsequent decision to become caretakers of the earth and follow the Corn Lifeway as “People of the Short Blue Corn”:

> During the first twenty days an ear of white corn is placed on either side of the infant when he is on the cradleboard. These ears must be perfect specimens. The father, when husking, watches for such ears and puts them aside for future use. It is said that one of the ears represents the mother, the other the baby. The corn is saved for planting during the subsequent spring ...

On this day, the house need no longer be kept dark (Dennis, 1965:31).

The names attributed to individuals within the culture of the “people of the short blue corn” are given equal importance: Whitely describes how Hopi personal names are, like works of visual art, embodiments of “dense meaning in poetic form” presented in a form similar to haiku. These personal names often combine a noun and a reference to action such as *Yoywayma*, which meant “rain walking” and refers to valley rain as viewed from above (2008:6). Personal names convey deeply significant themes relevant to the perpetuation of cultural belief in all aspects of life which are transmitted through the arts. The importance of choosing a child’s name is evident in the rituals surrounding birth. Dennis provides significant insights into the naming ceremony which includes direct references to agriculture and elements of the people’s “corn lifeways” including darkness, water, sun, and growth:
Before daybreak the mother and the sisters of the child’s father come to the house and each woman bathes the baby and gives it a name ... The child may receive as many as eight or ten names and an equal number of baths. Just at daybreak the child’s maternal grandmother, accompanied by the child’s mother, carries the infant toward the rising sun. When a certain point is reached, prayers are said, and the child’s names are repeated, and an offering of ceremonial corn is sprinkled toward the sun. The women then return to the house ... the blankets which have kept out the sunlight are now removed from the door and windows (Dennis, 1965:32).

Given the broad gulfs that exist between Western and non-Western ideologies and lifeways, it is essential that researchers consider the point of view of the chosen subject culture. A researcher’s failure to do so is to contribute to the Imperialist canon of literature which serves Western thinking to the detriment of Native peoples. Assessing the viability of Western art historical practices and methodologies for their potential viability as a means of developing effective non-Western approaches, Chanda (1998:19) notes the usefulness of Panofsky’s concepts of pre-iconographic analysis intended to identify conventional meaning and equates them to more contemporary studies of “semiology.”

Chanda’s description of the first step within the study process is focused on pre-iconographic assessment which entails the identification of the objects, motifs, and subject matter evident in the art:

The identification should be done through personal insights and imagination. If, however, personal experience does not allow us to recognize the object encountered, we must widen the range of our practical experience by consulting sources that will enable us to identify the object (Chanda, 1998:20).

In modern archaeological, anthropological, and art history studies, the central primary thematic is increasingly interdisciplinary in nature. As a result, contexts beyond those relating specifically to art history must be considered. In the case of assessing pre-historic era works, the oral traditions of the Ancestral Puebloan peoples (the ancestors of the modern Hopi) remain preserved in oral narratives today and are frequently mentioned within contemporary art histories written by modern Puebloan or Hopi peoples themselves. As a result, the pre-iconographic assessment may also be aided by the direct assessment of the art of contemporary living Hopi artists or makers.

The second step in applying iconographic analysis to non-Western art while using Panofsky’s iconographic analysis is the identification of imagery with known conventional meanings. Panofsky states that this material may include subject matter found in texts as well as other significant cultural content. As such, it is necessary to have knowledge of “literary sources, themes, and concepts that appear in other art works of the same time and place” (Chanda, 1998:20). Adjustments have been made within this study to accommodate the oral tradition
which is considered integral to an understanding of Hopi arts and ritual. As a result, the current study adapts this stage of analysis to include the assessment of recorded and transcribed oral narratives or those written by modern Hopi peoples. Additional concurrences of transcribed oral material are found in traditional Hopi art forms, including the collaborative translation of historic katsina songs (Sekaquaptewa, Hill & Washburn, 2015).

The third phase of iconographic analysis relevant to non-Western art historical concepts is

the interpretation of underlying philosophical ideas expressed through the composition, motifs, images, stories, or allegories found during the iconographic state. It is the synthesis of the information found in the previous two steps (Chanda, 1998:20).

In accordance, this study draws upon not only source materials published by Hopi authors and literary collaborators such as Albert Yava, Don Taleyesva, Harold Courlander, and Lee Simmons, but also by contemporary Native Americans working within the Western academic disciplines of anthropology, archaeology, and ethnology, many of whom are actively involved in current studies within those fields (Anyon, 1999; Ferguson et al., 2003; 2006). By necessity, this study employs narrative texts employed by both modern and historic-era Western ethnographers. Further assessment of oral narratives is based upon the principles of analysis developed within the mid- to late 20th century (Vansina & Wright, 1965; Vansina, 1985; Barber & Barber, 2004).

3.6 CONCLUSION

This chapter has demonstrated how the agenda of the West’s initial desire to subjugate non-Western indigenous people’s cultural identity contributed to a lack of knowledge and relevant context that persisted within Western academic studies. For the Hopi artists such as Fred Kabotie, the process of learning Western techniques was a process of removing embedded cultural belief from its visual form. Within the process, the non-Western artists were encouraged to create works relevant to the European tradition of documentation or the mere replication of superficial motif. Within recent decades, Western interpreters of the arts and cultures of the Hopi and other indigenous peoples have started to re-examine the values of traditional knowledge and worldviews. The resulting reinterpretations of essential content have become relevant across disciplines, not just art history, but ethnography, archeology, and others. The next chapter looks more deeply into how those disciplines function and how their interpretations of Native peoples have changed.
CHAPTER 4: ART HISTORY, EKPHRASIS, AND EXOGRAPHIC ARTS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

It is not unusual for experts in academic disciplines to see themselves as separate from other specialties, even when their scholarship overlaps. But increasingly, the study of indigenous art and cultures requires cross-discipline cooperation and understanding. In order to explain the changing multi-dimensional landscape of the study of Hopi and other indigenous art, this chapter delineates the converging tracks among the disciplines and how that convergence affects understanding of Native arts and cultures.

4.2 WESTERN SCIENCE AND ART HISTORY: APPLICATIONS OF PANOFSKY’S ICONOLOGY

Increasingly, American archaeologists and anthropologists are turning to multi-disciplinary means of studying the structures, images, and environmental factors relevant to the art, architecture, and cultural objects of non-Western peoples. In Hopi and Ancestral Puebloan sites and contexts, first and foremost, attention must be given to the complex meanings of interdisciplinary works, the culture of origin, and that culture’s worldview. When searching for an effective means of assessing imagery and narrative, common ground is found between Western perception and that of non-Western scholars, including art historians. In research conducted at Peru’s Nasca archaeological excavations, and at the White Shaman Mural site in the Pecos River Valley of Mexico and Texas, traditional archaeological practices are being addressed within the thematic framework set forth by Panofsky’s Studies in Iconology: Humanistic Themes in the Art of the Renaissance (originally published in 1939) as already stated. Panofsky’s methods of analysis—intended for the field of art history—differ from traditional archaeological strategies in that several levels of assessment are required, some of which refer to mytholinguistic elements including themes, allegory, and symbol:

First, the scholar must assess the object, feature, or image’s “primary or natural subject matter.” These aspects are associated with “factual” or “expressional” content, “constituting the world of artistic motifs.”

Second, the analysis must identify secondary or conventional subject matter, “constituting the world of images, stories, and allegories.”

Third, the feature, image, or artifact must be assessed for intrinsic meaning or content, “constituting the world of symbolical values.”

This study demonstrates the application of allegory, metaphor, and symbol as it is used in recent archaeological studies of Hopi narrative-driven objects and sites which are themselves based upon three specific themes: the Fourth World
emergence, the Corn Lifeway, and pilgrimages. In addition, there is another theme that may suggest contact with Mesoamerica on those earliest travels—“Flower World”—a concept associated with pre-historic era cultural imagery found in both the Southwest and in Mesoamerica (Evers & Molina, 1987; Hays-Gilpin & Hill, 1999). Because the specific sites and research discussed is collaborative in nature, involving both Hopi and Western archaeologists and other interdisciplinary scholars, this non-Western art history perspective discusses specific features, contexts, and relationships as they are interpreted and documented by Hopi scholars. In addition, this study augments earlier Western scientific analyses with more recent relevant perspectives and nomenclatures from published findings resulting from additional collaborative scholarship that adds dimension to the inherently broad Western academic categorisations of dream science and psychology. Perhaps, most importantly, this study focuses on how the images, architecture, artifacts, and ritual reflect and are visual embodiments of the essential narrative themes of the Hopi people and the ancestors they, through their stories of migration and later acculturations, lay claim as their own.

4.3 WESTERN MISAPPROPRIATION OF EXOGRAPHIC ART: PICASSO’S “AFRICAN PERIOD” AND OBJECTS OF BELIEF

Within the Western museum systems, Native Americans and their art are more likely to be shown as exhibits than as contributors to an oeuvre of international art history. The need for art history that effectively integrates non-Western peoples while aligning more fully with the discipline of history itself has been emphatically articulated by Chanda and Vansina since the 1980s, both of whom address the issues affecting the exclusionary academic discipline. In particular, Chanda’s series of critical essays examined the increasingly important need for non-Western contexts from which to approach the discipline of art history in the traditional Western classroom (1995; 1998; 2000; 2004; 2010). Vansina recognised music, landscape and objects as “mnemotechnic devices” in the previous decade (1985:44).

In the past, knowledge of art from non-Western cultures was primarily based on the analysis of the physical characteristics, which were interpreted from the perspective of “mainstream” or Euro-based cultures. For example, sculptural forms in African art were often described as aggressive, bulging, simple, primitively executed, and out of proportion, while wood statues were interpreted as “idols” and fetishes.”

When non-Western cultural beliefs inspire the development of new Western styles or developmental theories, the “intrinsic meanings” specific to the non-Western cultures are generally considered to be of much lesser consequence than the exotic appearance of the works themselves; in fact, the potentially relevant socio-cultural meanings of the imagery or objects were frequently completely unknown. An
example can be found in an evaluation of Picasso’s “African Period” exemplified by *Les Demoiselles Avignon* (1907). The Metropolitan Museum identifies the influence of an African Vili figure given to Picasso by Matisse who had purchased the wooden figure from what is now the Democratic Republic of Congo at a Parisian curio market (Murrell, 2018).

While these artists knew nothing of the original meaning and function of the West and Central African sculptures they encountered, they instantly recognized the spiritual aspect of the composition and adapted these qualities to their own efforts to move beyond the naturalism that had defined Western art since the Renaissance (Murrell, 2018).

![Figure 4.1](image)

**Figure 4.1. African Nkisi figure with deflecting mirror and nails (Late 19th-early 20th century).**

The practice of using symbolic figurative imagery for curse purposes is woven through the traditions of the BaKongo whose *minkisi* (plural form of *nkisi*) are examples of embodied objects upon which “medicines” are applied and through which nails are driven (Figure 4.1). Specific areas for the application of medicine are evident on the figure’s head and stomach. Other types of vessel *nkisi*, often

---

shaped like faces, are sometimes placed on graves. The practice may have been adapted by African American slaves who created “memory jars” which have been found on early 20th century graves in the state of Georgia within the United States (Princeton University Art Museum, 2015:1). The lack of understanding concerning such works was recently described by curator Victoria Hobbs of the Victoria and Albert Museum:

Nkisi figures are complex objects that offer an endless variety of interpretations within a framework of ideas. However, no definitive reading can be made of such figures, as many of them are undocumented. The rituals for which they were constructed are no longer performed. Therefore, most of the ritual—the words, songs, gestures, and costumes and the state of mind of the client—are no longer accessible to us. All that survives are the mute objects … (Hobbs, 1999:17).

During Picasso’s lifetime, such concepts linking visual works of art with embodied powers were no longer viewed as viable mimetic art forms originating within the traditions of not only non-Western peoples but also those of the West. Such concepts would have been relegated to the past within Winckelmann’s Enlightenment-era History of the Art of Antiquity (1764) and 19th century artists would have felt confident that their own works were representative of modern ideological and philosophical progress.

The influence replica images and objects can exert upon the represented individual are clearly demonstrated by practices associated with multiple cultures using instruments such as curse tablets and symbolic three-dimensional forms. Quoting a note utilised in a Sicilian tablet claiming, “I assign NN,” Faraone and Obbink (1997:9) suggest that the area that proves most effective in the West on the tradition of “binding” curses lies within the “divine sphere” which exerts control over the specially prepared objects. While the practice of binding is clearly intended to inhibit or punish the targeted entity, the power of objects and imagery to bring about positive change is equally well represented within a given people’s broader definition of material culture. According to the Oxford Dictionary (2019, sv ‘material culture’), “the study of material culture centres upon objects, their properties, and the materials that they are made of, and the ways in which these material facets are central to an understanding of culture and social relations.” It is the term used to describe “the physical objects, such as tools, domestic articles, or religious objects, which give evidence of the type of culture developed” (Oxford Dictionary, 2019, sv ‘material culture’). The use of curses and binding objects clearly represent a pan-human desire to influence nature and social conditions through the manipulation of physical matter.

More recently, the misinterpretation of cultural objects and their meanings has been addressed effectively through collaborative efforts between Native American peoples and non-Native researchers thus reducing the probability of improper representation of the materials within art history or other Western traditional
disciplines. Wade and Evans, for example, were informed of the significance of what they perceived to be “empty space” in a ceremonial sash through the process of direct interaction with Hopi weavers (Wade & Evans, 1973:11).

4.4 EXCLUSIVITY IN WESTERN ART HISTORY

The Bakongo are KiKongo speakers of the Republic of Congo, Cabinda, and northern Angola, whose lands and resources were exploited by the West through colonial expansion. As a result of the suppression of their own traditional systems of belief and practices while under Portuguese rule, the specific cultural meanings associated with the nkisi of these oracy-based people were silenced over time. For the West, however, they continued to remain valuable as artifacts that represented the extent of Western expansion. Vansina (1985:201) claimed,

the relevance of art history to history in general is of a double nature. At one level the use of art objects as sources for history must be assessed. At another the relevance of art history proper, that is, an account of the history of style, iconography and technology, must be considered in relation to history in general … Collections of art works should be as fruitful as collections of objects recovered from sites by archaeologists.

While Vansina, a historian known for his studies of Africa, called for the further integration of history, objects, and art, Kraft (1989), an art historian of the same era, bemoaned the broadening of the art’s emphasis, warning of what she perceived to be a crisis in art history in which works of art should be interpreted as representation of meaning:

Not only are methods and theories of disciplines other than art history being used in understanding art, art is being used as data for other disciplines ...
Does interdisciplinarity inevitably lead to the end of distinct academic disciplines? (Kraft, 1989:57)

The preservation of Western art history is problematic in that traditional Western imagery frequently contributes to the perception of Native American peoples as, what Edward Said termed, “The Other” (Said, 1978). This vision of “other” persisted throughout the West’s “institutions, vocabulary, scholarship, imagery, doctrines even colonial bureaucracies and colonial styles ...” (Smith, 2012b:Loc. 247). The desire to not only maintain the dominance of traditional Western art history but to teach it implies continual casting of non-Western peoples in the role of “other” within Western academia in a broad sense and art history within the context of the present study. As Smith notes,

the collective memory of imperialism has been perpetuated through the ways in which knowledge about indigenous peoples was collected, classified and

---

11 See Chapter 3, p. 199.
then represented in various ways back to the West, and then, through the eyes of the west, back to those who have been colonized (2012b:Loc. 245).

Rather than view art history as a means of perceiving colonial imagery as aspects of progressive development typified by works such as Benjamin West’s oil painting depicting the *Treaty of Penn with Indians*\(^\text{12}\) (ca. 1771-1772), this study asserts the importance of building a new art history methodology based upon the identification of cultural mytholinguistic content or references, a basic understanding of culturally relevant imagery and practice, a secondary level of understanding which demonstrates how the imagery proves meaningful to individual members of the culture as well as the people as a whole, and, finally, a third level of knowledge based upon the essential worldview and both the visual and philosophical components therein.

### 4.5 Imagery and the Oral Tradition

The difficulty in learning the Western art tradition for non-Western students was compounded by the inability to share traditional “teachings, stories, and songs” in addition to the required emphasis on imagery (Lentis, 2016:529). For non-Western peoples, storytelling remains a living tradition reflecting the age-old beliefs and knowledge of those who tell them. Often, storytelling is done in winter owing to the need to grow or tend crops and hunt in the summers. The Acoma people of New Mexico, a Puebloan culture, explain that winter solstice is

> the time of *haamaaha*, storytelling of the coyote, stories of heroes, stories of the animals, sharing of knowledge. My parents said that when you call *haamaaha*, people will arrive with piñon nuts gathered in the fall that are roasted and shared” (Zotigh, 2017).

Batala and National Museum of the American Indian Storycorp (2011) describe the role storytelling continues to play within the Hopi culture:

> Winter is the time for storytelling. Through storytelling in the Hopi language, values are passed on from generation to generation. History, clan migrations, destruction of ancient cities, when the deities came to humans, when the animals used to talk with humans and other information is passed on. It is a time for families to strengthen bonds, to learn important values of being Hopi and to have your imagination spurred beyond the limits!

> In my family, storytelling was a favorite of my childhood living on the reservation. My grandparents, who were the storytellers. My father, the intellectual, took us on hikes as small children to the places that seemed mystical in the story, but upon close examination brought to reality the ‘real’

---

story of a village and people who were no longer there. Along with teaching lessons of locations, place names, plant names, and important historical locations, my dad told us once, when we were complaining about being tired, ‘One day you might be in charge of this land; how are you to make good decisions about the land if you don’t know it?’ (NMAI.SI.Edu, 2011).

According to Harrison, stories that are written down are not the norm throughout the world, nor are they suited to the oral tradition which depends upon human gestures, facial expressions, and tempo for stories to “come alive” (2007:145). This is particularly evident in accounts of travel, mapping, and the naming of places. For example, Harrison describes how the storytelling perspective is incorporated into the mapping practices of the Siberian Tofa (2007:110). As apparent in Figure 4.2, the Tofa “Native” map (A) depicts their experiential knowledge of the terrain relevant to the Uda River, its mountains, trails, and the unique narrative memories it affords. In contrast, the cartographic map created with modern Western technologies (B) clearly emphasises the “accurate” reproduction of essential, seemingly permanent unchangeable points of measure. In the West, it is these conceptual ideal coordinates that are considered accurate rather than details referring to aspects of seasonal change or those that record relevant human experience (Figure 4.2).
Figure 4.2. "Native" Tofa map of Siberian Uda River system (2007).
4.6 WESTERN EKPHRASIS

A tradition of *ekphrasis*, writings focusing on a unique work of art, exists within the West. According to the Oxford Living Dictionaries (2019, sv ‘*ekphrasis*’), the word originated in the mid-17th century as the Greek “*ekphrasis*” or “description.” The first example of this within Western literature is said to be Homer’s description of Achilles’s shield (Yacobi, 1995:600). Since then, the Western genre has been practised on specific, unique works of art with which the readership is likely to be familiar. Yacobi (1995:601) quotes Leo Spitzer’s 1962 definition as that which is most commonly held by Western academics: “The poetic description of a pictorial or sculptured work of art” which “addresses a particular visual image.” The tradition of *ekphrasis* is indelibly intertwined with the canon of Western art history studies as well as that of the humanities.

The Western tradition embraces the distinctiveness of the unique piece, a singular accomplishment attributed to just one artist, as in *Ode on a Grecian Urn* by John Keats (1820). The writing itself is a form of reciprocity, celebrating the uniqueness of a piece that befits the uniqueness of the writer’s response:

Thou still unravish’d bride of quietness,

Thou foster-child of silence and slow time,

Sylvan historian, who canst thus express

A Flowery tale more sweetly than our rhyme.

In such works, individual writers celebrate the individuality of a unique creation and glorify its place in the history of Western art, whether it is known for its emotional content, as in the case of Guernica, or its representation of a unique aspect of Western history or literature, as in the example of *The Beheading of Saint John the Baptist*. (Caravaggio, 1608)\(^\text{13}\) A specific unique work of art may provide a representation of the glorified artist themselves, as in Rembrandt’s *Self Portrait with Two Circles*\(^\text{14}\). A recent article appearing in the *Guardian* describes the “10 greatest works of art ever,” each selected for its innovative, unique qualities within an approximately 32,000-year time frame (Jones, 2014):

1. The Foetus in the Womb (Da Vinci 1510-13)
2. The Beheading of Saint John the Baptist (Caravaggio 1608)
3. Self-Portrait with Two Circles (Rembrandt ca. 1665-9)
4. *Chauvet Cave Paintings* (ca. 30,000 years ago)
5. *One: Number 31, 1950* (Jackson Pollock, 1950)

\(^\text{13}\) Caravaggio, *The Beheading of Saint John the Baptist* (1608). Oil on canvas, 58.7 x 79.39 cm. St. John’s Co-Cathedral, Valetta, Malta.

6. Las Meninas (Velázquez, ca. 1656)
7. Guernica (Picasso, 1937)
8. Prisoners (Michelangelo, ca. 1519-34)
9. Parthenon Sculptures (447-442 BCE)
10. Mont Sainte-Victoire (Cézanne, 1902-4)

The recognition of such images as iconic representations of specific milestones in Western accomplishment to which the success of all other works may be compared reflects Mathews’s notion of “truth” as represented in the mental process called theoria (Skrbina, 2009:341-260). Mathews’s claims that the Classical West did influence America’s academicians and continues to do so, yet its self-reflecting nature also contributed to the development of a dependence on theoria, a term she applies to the distancing process occurring between the immediacy of experience and the Western mind’s reinterpretation of the same. Further, Mathews likens the concept to that of looking at the object in a mirror rather than seeing the object itself (2009:4).

Through the reflective lens of this cognitive process, Western works of art are remembered and valued for their emotive content which elicits a personal response, their impact upon the discipline, or their fame which may be associated with a unique societal context. The West’s interpretation of empirical “truth” employs a hierarchical scale of significance on which art, like other human mental constructs, is judged.

Underlying and structuring this secular approach was a new and sophisticated notion of truth—a notion that there is, in addition to the world itself, the truth about the world, a truth that we, as knowers, can discover. The seeker after truth engages in a particular mental or cognitive operation: he [sic] holds a mirror up to the world; he [sic] duplicates the world mentally, and when he finds in that mental double a picture which he regards as accurately reflecting the nature of things, he has found the truth. The truth about reality or some aspect of reality, is permanent. It is in fact eternal: the world changes, but the truth about the world does not change (Mathews, 2008:2).

Western thought devalues the inter-disciplinary significance of the integrated philosophies of non-Western peoples, thus relegating non-Western art to the subservient genre of “craft.” Significant problems associated with the West’s lack of understanding of the arts of so-called “primitive” peoples were brought to light by both Chandra (1993) and Blocker (1993).

Historically, Western ekphrasis celebrates unique reflections of Western culture which are thought to depict the truth of the Western civilization. These accomplishments are frequently reproduced, each image pays tributes through what Yacobi (1995:2) identifies as a practice of “interart” homage and mimesis. The very compilation of a “top ten” list of great Western works of art is itself a
reflection of the value the West places on innovation and unique vision within the larger “umbrella” of its accepted cultural norms.

The Western tradition of *ekphrasis* is itself focused on the unique experience of the Western viewer, which, when multiplied exponentially results in the culture’s overwhelming reverence for the work as it seems to convey the dominant cultural point of view and is continuously reproduced and referenced through time. When works are, however, reproduced in an overly vast quantity, the West deems them examples of “artistic cliché” which serve less as art than as a means of amplifying a “sentimental appeal to a whole generation” (Seznec, 1972:570) or an artistic cliché as described in Yacobi (1995:602). In the 20th century, the determination between what was genuinely important art, and what was cliché fell to the professional art critic who, in turn, promoted or perpetuated the iconic status of works of “fine art.” It is largely these works that fill volumes of Western art history books.

4.7 NON-WESTERN *EKPHRASIS* IN THE WORKS OF N. SCOT MOMADAY: A “CYCLE OF EXCHANGE”

In a study of Kiowa Pulitzer Prize-winning author and artist N. Scot Momaday’s written works, Krieger claims his writings aspire “toward the illusion that it is performing a task we usually associate with an art of natural signs” which serves as “an illusion that emerges when the poet attempts to represent in the imagery of language the images produced by the graphic or plastic artist or finds parallel words for the themes conveyed by images in paint, stone, or other visual medium” (as cited in Clements, 2001:136). Clements also explains how Rosand (1990) has, in fact, argued that “[t]he history of western art can be seen as a cycle of... exchange” between literary representations of visual art and visual art based on literary description (1990:61). Further, Rosand identifies Western *ekphrasis* as a “critical link in the great chain of artistic being”:

Renaissance painters might turn to descriptions of earlier, no longer extant works of visual art in the writings of classical authors for inspiration for their own efforts, re-creating on canvas or in marble what they believed, based on written depictions, those ancient artworks to have been (1990:66).

For the non-Western artist, however, Clements claims *ekphrasis* represents a constant interchange between visual and verbal traditions:

The pictorial and the literary might be points at the end of a channel that flowed both ways ... Through this older way of conceptualizing the relationship between visual and verbal art ekphrastically is not as widely known today as is the notion that ekphrasis simply translates the visual into the verbal, I suggest that the art of N. Scott Momaday has resurrected it. Furthermore, his view of a two-way connection between visual and verbal art finds parallels in Native American aesthetic heritages which provide a
more direct source for his idea than the practices noted by Rosand (2001:137).

4.7.1 Ekphrasis as Embedded Mnemonic Art and Practice

The current study equates embedded mnemonic arts of the Hopi and earlier Ancestral Puebloan peoples to be examples of oracy and ritual-based *ekphrasis* as shared within a variety of traditional cultural forms and practices by non-literate, non-Western peoples. While *ekphrasis* is defined as “The use of detailed description of a work of visual art as a literary device” in the West (Oxford Living Dictionaries, 2019, sv ‘*ekphrasis*’), reiteration takes other forms and serves other purposes in the arts of non-Western oracy-based peoples.

As such, the *ekphrasis* experience is, rather, a “two-way connection between visual and verbal” arts that is both embedded with narrative, and stored within mnemonic images, vessels, or objects. The connection moves from maker to learners who may then become the makers themselves for future generations. The visual reiteration serves as the origin of verbal reiteration or, as in the example of ritual and ceremony, is performed through movement. Hill suggests, for example, that Flower World iconographic metaphors referencing beautiful landscapes, shells, lights, flames, dawn, sunset, rainbows, and other iridescent “chromatic” natural phenomena iconography could be linked to the “passage from life to death” or be references to meditations and spiritual states in which chromatic visions are sought with the assistance of hallucinogenic drugs (Hill, 1992:117). Schaafsma finds parallels between the Hopi emergence into the Fourth World in the design and use of Hopi jars in *kiva* mural imagery. Van Dyke and King (2010) find reiterations of the Fourth World emergence and references to the layered cosmos in the architecture of Hovenweep *kivas* and towers which provide both the experience of rising from a sacred underworld to a better, higher level of human and environmental consciousness.

Van Dyke and King’s perspective is itself reflected in the Harvard Peabody Museum’s description of features characteristic to *kivas* (Peabody Museum, 2016). According to the Peabody Museum, several specific characteristics evident in *kiva* design appear to be simultaneous reiterations of the emergence as physical, metaphysical, and human experience:

The structure of the *kivas* symbolises the three other worlds that all beings, including the Hopi, passed through. Beneath the floor level is a small hole in the ground called *sipaapuni* which comes up from the first underworld of fire. The floor level represents the second world of air, the breath of life. A raised seating area is the third world, the world of water, the blood of life. A ladder goes up through the roof to the Fourth World (Peabody Museum, 2016).
In these and other forms of embodied art or practices, non-Western forms of *ekphrasis* are employed within experiential\(^{15}\) learning devices for the young as well as the means by which traditional knowledge can be reiterated throughout the lifetime of the individual, his/her families or clan systems, and future generations.

### 4.8 NON-WESTERN EXOGRAPHIC VISUAL ARTS

While the meanings and definitions of Western arts rely upon principles of composition and techniques that can be introduced and taught with immediacy within a classroom setting, traditional instruction in non-Western arts may contain layers of content that are observed and learned over time. The process is likened to those of constructionist psychologist Piaget, whose theories are based on the premise that learning in children takes place over time at four different levels of mental development when engaged in experiential rather than pedagogical activities. A similar methodology was employed by Chanda and Basinger (2000) in a lesson focusing on the culturally relevant features and meanings of Ndop statues from the Democratic Republic of the Congo. The premise of the study was that, when taught through constructivist methods within an art history context, third-grade Western children\(^{16}\) could also attain graduated levels of understanding about the non-Western works—three-dimensional images of specific royal Kuba rulers—in similar ways. First, a domain-specific inquiry process was required, and while such approaches had been established in science, history, and mathematics, the approach had not yet been fully established within the field of art history. Further, of the art historical works that have been published thus far, few emphasised “the contextual understanding of a work of art in the manner the culture that created it would understand it” (Chanda & Basinger, 2000:69).

When showing the works to the students, the authors explained that even African peoples needed to learn the meanings over time because such knowledge was meant to be taught in stages. Each new lesson focused on individual characteristics or social/cosmological contexts. Therefore, the objects were perceived to contain layers of meaning.

Chanda’s art history lesson introduced Western children to what was, for them, a new type of art object; it taught them a new way of understanding the traditional arts in the ways that oracy-based peoples do themselves. Within the field of cognitive-processual archaeology, cultural works such as the *ndop* figures are considered symbolic or “exographic” forms of storage in which the art is comparable to an embedded mnemonic device. Rather than embody and repeat comprehensive aspects of history in the manner the *ndop* figures do, the Hopi

---

\(^{15}\) Hopi traditional learning ways described in the study resembling those developed in the West by Piaget.

\(^{16}\) Approximately 8 years of age.
works discussed below perform as vessels upon which broader internalised spiritual beliefs regarding the emergence of the Fourth World may be projected. The concepts projected reflect broad cultural ideologies and the iconology which “cues” their symbolic meaning, as Valsiner (2012:134) explains:

Written texts and signs are well known forms of exographic storage, but things can be used for coding information as well. They help us remember past events, historical episodes, or myths, sometimes in a very explicit way, such as the decorated sticks of the Maori that allowed them to remember long genealogies ... Cognitive processual archaeologists have not been the only ones in exploring the capacity of things to transit meaning. Actually, it was post-processual or interpretive archaeologists who first drew attention to the fact that material culture is meaningfully constituted (Hodder, 1982, 1986) and, as such, can be decoded. Although cognitive processual archaeology relies on cognitive science, and interpretive archaeology is based on hermeneutics and semiotics (Hodder, 1994; Preucel, 2006), the truth is that differences are not as great as one might think. In both cases, material culture is perceived as something external that is loaded with meaning and manipulated by human actors (or minds).

They are not passive containers, thus, Gosden has noted that it is not necessarily the mind that imposes its form on material objects but very often just the opposite: things shape thoughts (Gosden, 2005:96).

When imagery and form are used to reflect significant cultural data, several significant points are revealed. As the present study focuses on the reflections of Hopi narrative in Hopi arts, metaphysical belief, and imagery, several points that Valsiner (2012:135-139) attributes to material culture objects prove most relevant to the analysis. Presented as responses to the question of whether or not archaeology can be of use to studies in cultural psychology, they are condensed and summarised here as they relate not only to cultural psychology but, in this study of Hopi art as exographic objects, cultural objects, images, and ritual practice. Following each relevant principle proposed by González-Ruibal, their most relevant applications to the present study of Hopi arts are summarised below.

1. “Material Culture is used to think ...” (González-Ruibal as cited in Valsiner, 2012:135).

Here, the author uses the example of mausolea which evoke memory and a sense of mourning while also conveying significant aspects about social classes. This study of Hopi art emphasises the important role narrative plays in Hopi arts. Essential to this study is the understanding that the Fourth World emergence theme is represented and referred to repeatedly in art forms because it both reminds those within the culture of both the reasons for leaving the third world—witchcraft and social upset—and the responsibility of assuming the role of conservators of the Earth as gratefully promised to Maasaw.

This perspective reflects the author’s claims that those who make “things” affect their sensorimotor skills in the process; thus, the potter makes not just a pot, but herself in the process. In the repetition of forms and thematic cultural imagery, Hopi arts, especially those associated with the annual *katsina* seasons and ceremonies encourage the development of wisdom and knowledge as new layers of meaning are understood annually by the child who’s understanding also grows each year.

3. “Material culture has agency” (González-Ruibal as cited in Valsiner, 2012:137).

This is the concept which the author believes to be most widely accepted in archaeology as well as psychology as it relates to “active externalism” which refers to how the environment shapes those within it. Objects “regulate” the activities of those who use them. Their forms require specific actions and intent. The agency of art forms, as they apply to this study, is inherent in the concept of “symbolic storage,” the content of which both invites and requires oral reiteration in the form of the necessary explanations children seek, which itself becomes internalised wisdom by both learner and learned.

4. “Sometimes material culture carries codified symbolic information, and it is often designed to be communicative and representational” (Hodder, 1994:395).

According to González-Ruibal, objects have inherent meanings that are constantly at play. Unlike stories or myths, they do not have to be “told” to be understood; they are inherent in the signs and symbols that are around. This aspect of material culture is particularly relevant to the metaphors of the Hopi Corn Lifeway. Just as the human life cycle is a subject to be learned, the ways it parallels in the life cycle of the corn that sustains the human are also portrayed in visual imagery in a manner similar to Western “personification” based on both human and plant growth and the similar traits inherent within each.

Further examples of this visual and conceptual relationship are evident in the forms of seed jars which are often shown with a large opening beneath which the viewer sees abbreviated aspects of birds such as wings or tails. These representations recall the viewer’s knowledge of the Fourth World emergence itself which, by adulthood, would be so familiar to the individual that the image recalls not so much the detailed narrative as the experiential meaning of the mytholinguistic context—itself embedded within the viewer’s mind since the time of his/her earliest memories.

5. “Most objects are not symbolic in the same way as a text: the relationship between material culture and meaning is seldom completely conventional or arbitrary” (Valsiner, 2012:138).
The key to this concept is illustrated by the use of “indices” rather than words. Using the example of Ethiopian Gumuz women and the granaries they decorate with breasts, González-Ruibal explains how there is a “blurred distinction” between the role fertility plays in each, thus creating a “blurring” of distinctions (Valsiner, 2012:138). The merging of object and intent can be noted in several of the Hopi or Ancestral Puebloan works discussed in this study. In the example of the combination of *kivas* and towers in some structures at Hovenweep, for example, we see one creative work—the structure—which also engages the visitor in the experience of ascension (as in the process of rising through the *sipapu* into the next “world” of a layered cosmos) and the act of descending into the *kiva* for the sacred rites and rituals themselves. Owing to the unusual combination of tower and *kiva* within one relatively small structure, Van Dyke and King (2010) propose that the social strife occurring within the Hovenweep area at the time these structures were built may have inspired the tower forms in that they offered yet another symbolic ascent from the present Fourth World to a new one beyond.

6. “Most of the time, material culture works through the evocation of sets of practices that are not discursively perceived and that, sometimes, cannot be put into words ... They are enmeshed in cultural practices and systems of meanings that involve other artifacts, ideas, memories, bodily gestures, speech acts and built spaces” (González-Ruibal in Valsiner, 2012:139).

Here, we are reminded of archaeologists who consider the use of an object in equal measure to that of the object’s physical attributes. It is, the author explains, the combination of object and human usage that conveys the full meaning of the “enmeshed” object within the greater (system) for which it was intended and by which its whole significance is fully understood.

4.9 EMBEDDED NARRATIVE CONTENT: MYTHOLINGUISTICS AND ICONOLOGICAL ART HISTORICAL ANALYSIS

The primary principles of mytholinguistic analysis are based upon human cognitive abilities as they relate to linguistic process. While they were developed for academicians to better understand cultural works where mythological content is embedded within traditional narratives, they work equally well for identifying and assessing the narrative contexts referenced or embedded within the visual arts. Barber and Barber (2004:245-251) identify five primary criteria of narrative mytholinguistic analysis: memory, silence, analogy, compression, and restructuring as noted earlier. When the art of an oracy-based culture is being analysed, scholarship benefits from an awareness of how art is perceived to reference and, in so doing, preserves important social and cosmological themes or concepts.
Types of mytholinguistic analysis have been proven valuable in the repatriation of Native American human remains and associated funerary objects because of NAGPRA (Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act) legislation passed by the United States government in 1990. In addition, it has been employed by several archaeologists and anthropologists whose works are discussed within this study (Sekaquaptewa & Washburn, 2004; Mayor, 2005; Cole, 2009; Hill, 2012; McPherson, 2012; Washburn, 2012). Opponents of the methodology, when used specifically for NAGPRA repatriations, include some members of the American Association of Physical Anthropologists who believe it should not be used as the sole criteria for tribal affiliation identifications due to the potential for misinterpretation and because it inhibits progress within the field of osteoanthropology. Weiss (2006:2) explains their perspective:

Whereas the AAPA’s mainstream judgment that repatriation is good for anthropology has some pragmatic merits, the case can also be made that repatriation of remains (especially when coupled with reburial) detracts from the ability of anthropologists to scientifically study humankind.

4.9.1 Colonial “Restructuring” in Hopi Art

The Tewa people, like the Hopi and other Puebloan people, share the belief in a dark underworld filled with strife from which they emerged. The revolutionary warrior Po’pay, a medicine man, shared this belief, yet he was also acutely aware of the suffering that Spanish rule was inflicting upon his people. Not only were the Tewa people being put into service to supply the settlers with labour, they were forcing them to convert to Christianity or run the risk of torture or execution. The question of whether Po’pay was a priest or war captain has been debated, but whatever position he held led to an encounter with spirits in the Taos kiva in which he is said to have interacted with Po’se yemu, a Tewa culture hero who brought rain. Liebmann (2012, Loc. 1260) describes how other witnesses claimed Po’pay met with three other fire-shooting spirits. One in particular, Po’se yemu, was said to have encouraged Po’pay to urge the Pueblo people to revolt against the Spanish, a decision which ultimately led to the destruction of Christian churches, among them, one which was located in the village of Giusewa near the village of Jemez. Today, the site is known not only for its violent end but for the specific ways in which the village’s Native peoples incorporated Christian use, forms, and imagery into what had traditionally been characteristic forms of Puebloan pottery and motifs. Among those created under Christian authority were chalices and soup bowls—Western forms which were combined with the traditional Jemez Black-on-white graphic style of two-dimensional design. The arts of colonised peoples are frequently affected by the need to “restructure” their original belief system and associated iconography to better fit that of the dominant culture. Whenever there is a significant cultural change, it is probable that at least some traditional patterns will be restructured or reinterpreted. Successive changes to a given pattern will render the original form of the pattern understandable to its users—it goes from a matter of logic to one of faith, and
finally to a matter of disbelief (Barber & Barber, 2004:139). The process by which visual arts reflect changing narratives described by Barber and Barber (2004) are dramatically demonstrated by both the imagery and historical accounts of Po’pay, the Pueblo Revolt of 1680, and the ultimate fall of the church itself.

Giusewa Pueblo is a Puebloan settlement located along the Jemez River in New Mexico which includes the remains of the 17th century Mission of San José de Los Jémez, itself built in approximately 1621 (National Park Service, 2012). Although its residents are a Towa-speaking culture rather than Hopi, excavations at the site revealed several obvious attempts, not necessarily to adopt the belief systems of the Spanish missionaries who came there, but to appease them through syncretic forms, imagery, and the adoption of ritual. Recent excavations at a Christian church at another location, Awatovi, for example, revealed a Puebloan man buried beneath the floor of the church with a small stone mountain lion effigy placed upon his heart (Figure 4.3). As of April 2018, the artifact resides in Harvard’s Peabody Archaeological Department. While the location of the burial suggests the devotion of the individual, the inclusion of the object and its spiritual or personal symbolism may represent a restructuring of both a traditional Puebloan art form’s usage and Christian biblical narrative. Individuals were, at the time, customarily buried with traditional grave goods such as fetishes—depending on the individual, perhaps a lion—but not, of course, within a post-contact era “church.” According to Bolgiano (1995), Leigh Jenkins, Hopi Cultural Preservation Officer, identifies the mountain lion as being “very sacred to the Hopi. He is a deity, a guardian of the tribe, to whom Hopis look for guidance during certain ceremonies ....”

Figure 4.3. Mountain lion fetish (A.D. 1629-1700).

The transference of one culture’s iconological values to another is observed in the creation of historic-era “double objects” which, by definition, embody divergent dichotomous references relevant to two cultures. The symbolic imagery associated with the double objects is “rewritten” or restructured accordingly to reflect the
new cultural narrative. The process is visible in the adaptation of Christian imagery on Jemez style Puebloan bowls and other objects at Giusewa. The bowl from Giusewa (Figure 4.4) employs traditional Puebloan pottery surface techniques although the low, rimmed shape itself is clearly of traditional European design rather than that of the Hopi. The Spanish/European influence can also be seen in a bowl with unidentified provenance currently in the collection of the Brooklyn Museum (Figure 4.6). While clearly conveying the “sacred” connotations of the Western Christian church, the non-traditional subject is incongruously paired with a Puebloan “spirit break” line drawn around the outer edge that traditionally creates an “exit trail of life or being” for the depiction that would not exist were the band completed in true European style (Dillingham & Elliott, 1992:95).

Among the many reasons for restructuring cultural narrative and the associated arts or rituals is syncretism. However, an additional cause could be related to the improper use of “ethnohermeneutics” as practised by Western entities in positions of control, whether this be administrators of the church, government, or academic researchers whose works ignore the world views of indigenous peoples and thus contribute to the canon of Euro-centric documentation or inject Western preferences into otherwise traditional art forms and methodologies. For example, “soup plates” (Figure 4.4) are not a traditional pottery form common to Puebloan peoples; however, soup bowls and other examples of “hybridity” or “reconstructed” forms reflecting Spanish culture were found in the excavations at Giusewa. Other examples of restructured forms include a pottery “chalice”—ca. 1601 which is clearly not a traditional Puebloan religious object—yet rendered in the traditional black on white Jemez pottery style (Figure 4.5). Liebmann (2012:132) also notes images of the “Greek cross” and “other European-derived design elements” on additional examples of Jemez artifacts from Giusewa. A similar incorporation of Spanish imagery is evident on a 19th century Hopi bowl in the collection of the Brooklyn Museum on which the image of a Spanish-style Christian church is painted (Figure 4.6).

---

17 A term developed by A. Geertz and first used in 1985 at the XVth Congress of the International Association for the History of Religions in Sydney, Australia. The term is relevant to studies that combine anthropological, linguistic, and historical methodologies in the interpretation of indigenous concepts of constructed reality. For more on the development of the term, see Geertz 1994:12.
Figure 4.4. *Soup bowl from Giusewa Pueblo* (Early 17th Century).

Figure 4.5. *Earthenware chalice* from Guisewa Pueblo (Early 17th Century).
Figure 4.6. *Hopi Puebloan bowl* (19th Century).

Figure 4.7. *Mouse figure* (After 1930).
The fluidity with which the Giusewa peoples restructured the narrative content and forms of their traditional arts is consistent with the tradition of employing visual arts within a mnemonic tradition which was first documented as such in the *Memorial* of 1630 written by Fray Alonso de Benavides. As Morrow (1996:42) states, the Indians of the Mission of San José de Los Jémez were “well taught in the doctrines of the church” and were “Christians” yet still employed a traditional mnemonic means of recording “sins.” According to Morrow (1996:42), Benavides claimed, “When we ring the bell for mass, they all come as well scrubbed and neat as can be. They enter the church to pray as though they had been Christians forever” and subsequently prepared themselves for confessions “by studying their own sins, bringing them along recorded on a series of knotted strings.”

Here, Morrow appears to be referring to the use of *khipu*, mnemonic devices considered today to have been the traditional means of record keeping employed by the Inca of present-day South America. While Benavides does not identify the devices as *khipu* or identify the origins of the tradition within the people of Jemez, their usage among the Andean peoples has been well documented. Though primarily identified as counting devices, their traditional use among the people of Meso or South America may have included forms of narrative or storytelling (see also “quipu” in Vansina, 1985:45):

There is much speculation as to whether or not quipus … represented some form of communication beyond numbers … there is a theory … that some quipus were read as a sort of binary code. There are also colonial documents that tell of Andeans using quipus to tell stories or memorize messages/prayers, though it is unknown how they did so. It has been suggested that the messages were not actually read from the quipus, but that the quipus served as a memory aid to already learned messages (The Ohio State University: *Quipu*, Archives, 2014).

The paternal attitude conveyed by Benavides would not last. Ultimately, Giusewa and numerous other Catholic churches were destroyed during the Pueblo Revolt. Led by Po’pay, the other Puebloans organised the uprising in which 8,000 well-coordinated warriors conquered the region’s 400 Spanish colonists. Again, knotted cords figured centrally in the effort:

August 11, 1680, was set as the date for the uprising. Runners were dispatched to all the Pueblos carrying knotted cords which signified the number of days remaining until the appointed day. Each morning the Pueblo leadership untied one knot from the cord; when the last knot was untied, it was the signal for them to rise in unison. On August 9, however, two runners were captured at Tesuque, north of Santa Fe. Their plan now compromised, Pueblo leaders decided to start the revolt a day earlier than originally planned. Runners were sent out with new instructions that the revolt would commence the morning of August 10 (Torrez, [sa]).
In earlier times, the Christian Church did perceive the use of quipu as a threat to the Spanish Crown. In fact, the concerns inspired efforts to annihilate the tradition in South America:

The church also saw quipus, along with many other aspects of Andean culture, as idolatrous and blasphemous. In 1583, a decree by the church council of Lima denounced quipus as the worked (sic) of the devil, and demanded they be destroyed. Though many quipus were destroyed and their used was discouraged, quipus did continue to be used for quite a while after. Eventually, though, as the native Andeans were assimilated into Spanish colonial culture, the use of quipus died out (The Ohio State University: Quipu, Archives, 2014).

Ultimately, it was the Puebloans themselves who ceased production of Jemez-style ceramics. Liebmann (2012) suggests:

Taking into account the effects of colonization on the production of traditional Jemez pottery, the termination of Jemez Black-on-white ceramics at Parokwa and Bolersakwa may have been motivated by a desire to expel all memory of the Franciscan missionaries, who had appropriated the local ware during their tenure in the region. After the Revolt, Jemez potters may have viewed Jemez Black-on-white pottery as a “contaminated” style (Liebmann, 2012:132).

The experience of absorbing Christian narrative and practise into the Puebloan tradition was itself thought to be embodied within the Jemez style. As such, the style and ecclesiastical forms served as painful reminders of the disruption of continuity in the Puebloan’s own creation beliefs, the agenda of the Catholic church, and ultimately the cruelty that defined Spanish rule. Through the abdication of the Jemez’s characteristic style, the historical narrative would itself fall silent.

4.9.2 Ethnohermeneutics: Culture and Context

The key roles knotted strings played in the destruction of Giusewawa and other Spanish sites reflects the inadequacies evident when applying Western academic, philosophical, or religious concepts to those of oracy-based peoples and the failure of scholars to develop and employ appropriate ethnohermeneutical approaches. As in three-dimensional arts as well as narrative, culturally-relevant contexts must be in place for the West to authentically identify and interpret the arts and narratives relevant to diverse non-Western cultures. While doing so, there is a need to unravel the myriad ways in which Western belief may not only be projected onto non-Western arts or narratives, but integrated into the forms themselves through syncretism or restructuring.

In some cases, recorded findings made by Western scholars represent the blended points of view of the interviewers themselves rather than that of the relevant subject. For example, in past decades, a Hopi informant claimed the place of his
people’s emergence—thus the location of the ancestral *sipaapuni*—was Jerusalem or another location in the “Old World” such as Egypt or India (Loftin, 2003:66). Whether this was a sincere example of confusion or a response designed to please the European-American interviewer is unclear. Without the assurance of the academic integrity within the discourse, it is always possible that such apparent instances of mytholinguisitc restructuring show the mirroring of Imperialist views or the interviewer’s own personal lack of academic integrity.

Since at least the mid-20th century, evidence of both syncretism and narrative restructuring are visible today in both syncretically blended artifacts and tourist-oriented goods. By the 1950s, the dominant European-American culture was in full control of most Native American people who were either living off their reservations with the help of a few programmes that encouraged assimilation or on the reservations where they attempted to regain control of their lives and cultural beliefs. By then, many had become members of the Christian churches that first sent missionaries like Voth to their remote locations and then built substantial outposts or additional missions such as Giusewa to attend to what were perceived to be Native America’s new spiritual “needs.” In the modern era, demand for imagery that appealed to the Euro-American buyers had risen to the extent that renderings of *katsinam*, which were traditionally carved from the roots of cottonwood trees, were being transformed into figurines influenced by Euro-American cultural heroes. A relatively recent example of the “restructuring” of both imagery and narrative is the adaptation of Mickey Mouse, a character representing the European-American works of Walt Disney (ca. 1950) to fit the form, stance, and presentation previously reserved for traditional *katsina* figures (Liebmann, 2015:17-18). Liebmann considers these works, like the chalice of Giusewa, to be “double objects.” In addition, as we can clearly see in the example of the culture hero Mickey Mouse, when presented in the traditional stance of a cottonwood *katsina*, can claim to serve doubled cultural narratives (Figure 4.7).

Figure 4.8 represents an object and image in which not a “doubling” of form, but rather a doubling of symbol and iconology is present. A “spirit band” is depicted around the inner circumference, yet a broken “exit line” is a very strong traditional feature of the work. However, rather than demonstrating the frequent Hopi emphasis on elements represented in “fours” which denote the four directions, the imagery appears to “represent” a traditional European landscape scene; however, the work itself dates to the pre-contact era and includes a traditional “exit line” which does not reflect the European tradition. The scene appears to describe waves of water as well as the rays of the sun, each rendered in Hopi design concepts. To identify the work as one reflecting European influence would then be impossible to substantiate; it is the projection of the European viewer. However, within the context of Puebloan people, the imagery could represent a symbolic combination of opposing social constructs such as two seasonal groups representing summer and winter “moieties”—the Puebloan ritual groups associated with the preservation and production of winter and summer ceremonies. In fact, should a modern Western observer identify the work as a
Puebloan work “restructured” to reflect a European landscape concept, it would then be the observer who restructured the associated narrative content through his/her own failed ethnohermeneutical methodology.

Figure 4.8. *Jeddito Black-on-yellow bowl* (ca. 1364-1400 CE).

### 4.9.3 Mytholinguistic content and analysis for narrative visual arts

While traditional archaeology acknowledges pottery images and forms as representatives of a period or locational style as it relates to the Pecos System, a “unified system of nomenclature” which defines different periods of Ancestral Puebloan culture (National Park Service, 2016), when works are defined instead as mnemonic devices or examples of embedded exographic objects, the physical embodiments of narrative content—both the form of a vessel and incorporated imagery—are suitable subjects for mytholinguistic analysis. As Hodder (2012:97) states, “entanglements” exist between people and things; we are dependent upon them. In oracy-based peoples, entanglements may include direct references to mythological or cosmological content. The objects, then, become mnemotechnic devices, or forms of symbolic storage. The objects themselves and the imagery they contain are, to Vansina (1985), “cues” that signal references to narrative meanings. The cultural materials and contexts to which these cues refer are not clarified by Western classification systems commonly used for archaeological analysis, nor are their meanings evident when viewed as “realistic representations” of subjects that, for Western academics, hold common intrinsic
meanings. Instead, an effective ethnohermeneutical approach to recognising embedded mythological or narrative content in such works of art requires mytholinguistic analysis.

The current study employs criteria either derived or inspired by both Barber and Barber’s mytholinguistic analysis process and Vansina’s (1985) earlier studies and principles as well as my own personal observations made while working in the field of museum curation. Some of the primary relevant principles considered within the current study include the following:

1. Condensed Memory

When all accumulated wisdom must be stored in the brain and transmitted orally (as in a nonliterate society), people reserve the formal oral tradition for transmitting the information they consider most important, often for survival (Barber & Barber, 2004).

2. Silence Principle

What everyone is expected to know already is not explained in so many words (Barber & Barber, 2004). Barber and Barber’s Silence Principle corresponds with the “hourglass” concept delineated by Vansina (1985) as it explains the effects of a lack of continuity within the narrative tradition.

3. Analogy Principle

If any entities or phenomena bear some resemblance, in any aspect, they must be related. (Points of resemblance include form, behaviour, cause, significance, name location, and so forth) (Barber & Barber, 2004).

4. Compressive/Conflationary Principles:

*Principle of Metaphoric Reality:* The distinction between representation and referent—and between appearance and reality—tends to become blurred (Barber & Barber, 2004). (The principle includes sympathetic magic and name magic.)

*Cyclic Phenomenon:* If events at two or more points in time resemble each other strongly, they must be related or even be “the same,” and therefore returning. If the “same” events are seen to return many times, the observers may conclude that time is cyclical rather than linear (Barber & Barber, 2004).

4.10 CONCLUSION

This chapter has demonstrated the ways important cultural narratives specific to a non-Western oracy-based people, the Hopi, are visually represented through their arts. As mnemonic representations, these images are both a visual means of reiterating the mythological theme albeit in abbreviated form, and an example of how the culture “stores” the knowledge in an external or “exographic object.” When compared to the Western tradition of *ekphrasis* within the discipline of art history, the arts of the Hopi are perceived to be works that function on cognitive
levels more attuned to storytelling and the preservation of cultural knowledge rather than on reproduction or mimesis.

In many ways, the practice of *ekphrasis* has served as the basis for Western art history since its earliest times when impressive works predated the invention of the press, and imagery was the focus of the West’s own early pre-literate oral tradition. As the practice of writing about art grew, the significance of “reading” the visual characteristics of a piece as one would a mnemonic device or image became diluted. Because cultures such as the Hopi who did not develop their own tradition of describing the experience of passive viewing, the West ignored or failed to see the ways in which traditional meanings were “stored” in objects and imagery and reiterated through use. Thus, their works were considered insignificant by Western academia. The advent of new methods of aligning mytholinguistic content with both intent and purpose of thematic art forms has proven especially relevant to the study of imagery that reflects narrative cultural concepts such as the emergence of the Hopi people. Just as important are the ways in which the oral tradition transitions and adapts to change. So, too, is this reflected in the visual reflections of the story.
CHAPTER 5: HOPI LIFEWAYS AND HISTORICAL EXOGRAPHIC CONTENT

5.1 INTRODUCTION

By first understanding the indigenous people’s own beliefs about the meaning and purpose of their arts, and secondly, by combining understandings across scholarly and research disciplines, including but not limited to art history, mytholinguistics, archaeology, and others, Hopi arts become more accessible to Western scholars and begin to reveal the intent and function of the works themselves. As such, these multidisciplinary contexts provide valuable insights relevant to both Western art history studies and the history of the arts of specific indigenous peoples. This chapter takes a closer look at the Hopi and how their understanding of themselves as well as their culture must be considered in the interpretation of their arts.

5.2 LIFE AND CYCLIC TIME

Cyclic time is the central concept relative to Hopi customs, philosophy, arts, and narrative and provides the basis of their perception of destruction and generation of “worlds” within the greater metaphysical cosmos. It not only echoes the seasons upon which the agrarian growing cycle is based, it echoes the human life cycle. These concepts and the continuums of energy which they symbolically reference, are embodied in art, narrative and ritual from birth, the experience of life itself, and the inevitability of death—a return to the living Earth. These metaphorical contexts, according to Cajete (2000:21), are the sources from which “the anthropologically defined, superficially understood, and ethnocentrically biased term used to categorize the indigenous way of knowing the world” came to define these beliefs as “animism”. Instead, Cajete (2000) explains how customs, such as those associated with birth, are instead ways of “being alive” in a world in which everything has energy and “its own unique intelligence” including microorganisms, rocks, mountains, and rivers. The forces of the living Earth are re-experienced and are particularly evident in rituals surrounding birth for both spiritual leaders and members of the culture.

The creation stories of many North American people have much in common with those of the East, particularly in the belief of cyclical time. Eliade (1954) describes how the Indian concept of “eternal return” and periodicity which, although Eastern themes, appear to be repeated within the creation myths of a wide variety of peoples including the Triobrand, Hopi, and Tewa. Eliade describes the Indian concept of “yuga” which translates into age, each of which is preceded and followed by both a “dawn” and “twilight.” Eliade also describes another theme common to both the East and many Native American origin stories:
To the progressive decrease in duration of each new yuga, there corresponds, on the human plane, a decrease in the length of life, accompanied by a corruption in morals and a decline in intelligence. Transition from one yuga to the next takes place, as we have seen, during twilight (Eliade, 1954:113).

Cajete provides the example of Colombia’s Kogi people who gradually acclimate a child who has been chosen to become a *mama* or spiritual leader whose experiences permit them to “become fully sensitive to the detail and subtle nuances of the natural world” before they enter the metaphorical and sensory light of daily life:

At birth a child who has been chosen to become a *mama* is taken from the mother and sequestered for the first nine years in a dark cave called the Womb of the Earth Mother. The child’s experience of the outer world is limited to only the sounds and environmental qualities of the cave. Other mamas, including the child’s birth mother and relatives, constantly keep the child company.

The *mamas* teach the child Kogi language, stories, prayers, and ritual philosophy. The *mamas* also describe the natural world in detail. But the child never really sees, hears or feels the natural world directly until the long initiation is completed. During the ninth year the child emerges from the “womb” for the first time and is introduced to the Earth Mother. This is an experience that cannot be described in words and that so influences such children it indelibly guides their perception of the natural world throughout their lives. (Cajete, 2000: 21-22)

While the Kogi practice permits the *mama* the opportunity to experience birth with the intelligence and emic wisdom of a fully acculturated individual, Hopi birth rituals reflect both the emergence of the individual—the child’s birth—and the Fourth World emergence of the people themselves. Both cultural practices are a means of gaining a knowledge of Native science ... “an echo of a pre-modern affinity for participation with the non-human world” that presents itself as an “unconscious memory, a myth, a dream” that is itself a way of being a meaningful participant in the non-human world (Cajete, 2000:23).

Lewis-Williams and Pearce (2005:128) say that “for communities that exist in a tiered cosmology with the possibility of interlevel travel, ‘birth’ is usually more than parturition. It involves notions about the cosmological origin of a child’s spirit.” Like the Kogi people, experiencing ritualised darkness as a child holds deep cultural and philosophical meaning. For the Hopi, ritualised darkness echoes the experience of the Hopi emergence as well as the ceremonial entry into the lifelong embrace of the matrilineal clan. Anthropologist Mischa Titiev’s extensive studies of the Hopi people provide insights into how the birth rites of the Hopi, which, as a matrilineal society, are primarily performed by women and which reflect the experience of the emergence. Because the births are a ritualised aspect of Fourth World metaphysics, homage is paid not only through reenactment, but
through the emphasis on the count itself. As such, the child is kept in darkness for 19 days of the 20-day ritual. Titiev describes the birth itself as follows:

To the mother it means a welcome relief from the pain and labor of a solitary childbirth, for custom decrees that a Hopi woman shall engineer her own delivery as best she can at the time of the child’s actual birth; and to the maternal grandmother it announces that she is now free to enter the delivery room, to sever and tie the umbilical cord, and to make mother and child as comfortable as possible ... Soon after the baby is born several other women may be summoned ... Chief among these are women from the child’s father’s clan, particularly the father’s mother or the father’s sister, who washes the tiny infant’s head and forthwith assumes the role of master of ceremonies during the twenty-day lying-in period which terminates with the baby’s naming rites and general feast (Titiev, 1944:7).  

The rituals surrounding childbirth and childhood are important because these are the contexts by which each member of the cultural clan finds his/her place within the community and comes to define the self. Further, Hopi is a matrilineal society thus young girls are gifted with their first katsina dolls by a katsina dancer as arranged by their father. Katsina dolls are representations of the katsinam themselves, a category of “beings.” The dolls are known in Hopi as “tihu.” Schlegel describes how the katsinam have the power to bring about abundant crops just as the Hopi women ensure the continuity of the people by giving birth. Hopi men, according to Schlegel (2008), also give birth within the actual katsina societies; they both “give birth” to new initiates and provide ceremonial katsina dancers with the sprinkled cornmeal—the food that symbolically sustains them.

… the kachinas as a class, a category of beings, do have certain features in common. They are all associated in some way with the world of the spirits and dead, when they dance they bring delight to the people, and as beings who inhabit the realm of the clouds, they bring rain. They are in fact the very embodiment of rain: it is said that one drop of their body moisture (paala) will make the crops grow. Thus, along with their individual characters and ceremonial roles, they are, as a group, bringers of fertility (Schlegel, 2008:130).

The vivid appearances and unexpected behaviours of the katsina impersonators, regalia, and brightly coloured carved cottonwood tihu dolls serve as vivid mnemonic devices through which the culture embodies its basic values within the minds of its children. Among their characteristic features are the feathers of sacred or exotic birds, including those not indigenous to North America. The significance of the Hopi’s use of brightly coloured Mesoamerican macaw (parrot) feathers will be discussed in further depth in Chapter 9 of this study. They were

---

18 See also Dennis’s relevant comments located in section 3.5.1 of this manuscript.
prized for their vividness and integrated into a variety of art forms. Because macaws are not indigenous to the American Southwest, they must therefore have been acquired through trade, presumably from the south to the potential destination of Casas Grandes (Paquimé). Located in Chihuahua, Mexico, the settlement is thought to have served as the hub between Mesoamerican culture and the Southwestern Puebloan peoples of America who lived to the north.

Evidence of domesticated macaws, including skeletons, has been found at the Ancestral Puebloan site of Chaco Canyon, New Mexico. Their bright red and orange plumage is, in Hopi culture, symbolically associated with the South (Messer 2015). Parsons (1939:365, 410) states that nadir (South) is considered to be the area represented by all colours. In addition to the use of feathers in prayer sticks, ritual dress, and tihu, they also appear in some forms of Ancestral Puebloan imagery including kiva murals at Kuaua, New Mexico and a petroglyph pecked into the patinated rock surface of a canyon boulder located at what is now Hovenweep National Monument in southwestern Colorado.

Because they are the future mothers within the matrilineal culture, the katsinam have a special significance for young Hopi girls as does the repetitive calendar of annual ceremonial events held in their honour. Archaeologists and anthropologists debate the origins of the katsina cult beliefs and practices which were not apparent in the Ancestral Puebloan culture yet are evident in those of the people who migrated southward from the Four Corners—where the states of Arizona, Utah, New Mexico, and Colorado meet—towards the Rio Grande River Valley areas of northern New Mexico.

The significance of cyclical time is also evident in the structure of the Hopi year which includes the annual arrival and departure of the katsinam. Daily Hopi life involves preparation for the arrival of the supernatural beings who stay for their ceremonial season months—roughly corresponding with mid-July through mid-December on the Western Gregorian Calendar—before returning to their home in Arizona’s San Francisco Peaks.
5.3 METHOD OF LOCI AND THE FOURTH WORLD NARRATIVE

The use of imagery-based mnemonics once proliferated amongst the West’s great ancient orators. By utilising the *method of loci*, both Cicero and Quintilian were able to memorise specific topics to be addressed and the order in which to address them. Thomas (2014b:97) explains the technique:

In one of the method’s more straightforward forms, the orator would prepare by committing the layout of a complex but familiar architectural space (e.g. the interior of a temple) to memory, so as to be able to vividly imagine its various regions and features. He would then imagine objects, symbolizing the points to be remembered ... placed at various *loci* (strategic landmark positions, such as the temple’s niches and windows) around the space. The points could then be recalled in their proper order, whilst making a speech, simply by imagining moving around the space along a predetermined route, “seeing” the objects by coming upon them in their appointed loci, and thereby being reminded, in sequence of the points they symbolized.

Harrison describes similar mnemonic practices among the Southern Yukaghir peoples of northeastern Siberia for whom songs narrated “the unfolding of a journey along a river” through the singing of lyrics mentioning “currents, notable rocks, tributaries, and ... prominent landmarks associated with myths ...” (Harrison, 2007:110).
The use of mnemonic speaking techniques among the Hopi is addressed in Whitely (1998), who identifies Qöyawayma (“War Chief”) of Oraibi’s Badger clan as the probable collaborator who helped Voth produce the written transcription of significant Hopi narratives and other ethnographic content. Whitely explains how the Hopis “place explicit sociolinguistic value on precise memory, and older Hopis are often able to repeat extended accounts without significant error” (Whiteley, 2012:605). Whitely also addresses the Hopi tradition of mnemonic objects in a description of how, when the US government contested the Hopi’s rights to their lands, Yukiwma of the Fire clan presented two stone tablets19 with significant “writings” on them which were said to assure the Hopi of their rights to their lands (Whiteley, 2012:601). Fewkes (1922:277) states that Yukiwma presented Lieutenant Colonel HC Corbin with a stone that was a “testament given to his ancestors by the gods securing to the clans of Oraibi control of all the country about their town.” Although Yukiwma could not read the “writings” on the stones himself, according to Lawshe (1910), he said he knew they “were a map and title to his lands, which, he innocently assured the government ... ‘reached from ocean to ocean’” (Whiteley, 2012).

5.3.1 The Hopi Tablets: Title to the Land

This section examines the circumstances surrounding historical accounts of the Hopi stone tablets which were said to prove the people’s conservatorship over the traditional lands in agreement with the Fourth World’s original inhabitant Maasaw. This land came to be known traditionally as Hopi Tutskwa. Further, the significant attempts of the Hopi people to explain them during successive negotiations which took place between the Hopi and the US Government are themselves examples of how restructuring may occur fluidly within an oracy-based people’s mnemonic record.

Barber and Barber (2004) explain the effects of change on narrative accounting:

> Whenever there is a significant cultural change, at least some patterns will get restructured or reinterpreted. Successive changes on a given pattern will render the form of the pattern un-understandable to its users—it goes from a matter of logic to one of faith, and finally to a matter of disbelief (Barber & Barber, 2004:139).

As history is itself a narrative, the Hopi people’s response to growing pressures exerted by the United States Government in the mid-to-late 19th century draws attention to the ways in which the people turned to visual arts as a means of defending themselves, their lands, and their traditional lifeways. Among these lifeways is a belief in prophecy.

Geertz (1994:169-170) describes how aspects of prophecy remain central to Hopi belief, particularly in both the coming of the end of the Fourth World and the

---

19 An expanded discussion of the tablets is provided in section 6.2.1.
circumstances that will signal its onset. An agreement purportedly took place with Maasaw following the emergence of the first people from the *sipaapuni*. Among these first people were two brothers—one White and one Hopi—who were given special stone tablets called *owatutuveni* (Geertz, 1994:170). The White brother was told to “keep an eye on” the Hopi and to intervene during his “hour of need” which would occur prior to the end of the Fourth World (Geertz, 1994:170). Upon this occasion, the White Brother would return, and his own stone tablet would serve as proof of his identity. According to Geertz, there have been various versions of the narrative which highlight their own disputes regarding “the number of stone tablets, who owns them, who gave them to the Hopis, what is incised on them, what they signify, and their import and use during the apocalypse” (Geertz, 1994:170). As was the custom in their oracy tradition, the Hopi first explained their conservatorship over Hopi lands as one which was arranged with Maasaw. The mytholinguistic inspiration behind the response is again customary within the tradition of oral narration:

**Power Principle:** The bigger the force represented, the more major the deity to represent it (Barber & Barber, 2004:143).

The presence of the stone tablet in the Hopi’s care is noted by Whiteley in his description of Yukiwma who presented them to the United States Government courts as proof of ownership of their traditional lands. As representative objects of the earliest days of Hopi life in the Fourth World, they represent the ways narrative content signals power through mytholinguistic practices in that “what belonged to earlier epochs is often viewed as more hallowed and entailing more power than what people do nowadays” (Barber & Barber, 2004:145). At the same time, however, such stories are also likely to become condensed down to forms with fewer characters (Barber & Barber, 2004:250). While the traditional story claims there are two tablets, research done by Geertz on specific native and non-native individuals who have mentioned the tablets in historical documents identified 35 accounts of the tablets of which there were approximately 22 “eyewitness accounts,” and another 13 based on hearsay (Geertz, 1994:170, chart b). The findings led to the conclusion that there could perhaps be as many as five tablets, however, it is generally agreed that there are probably only two which are known to be in the care of the Bear and Kookop clans (Geertz, 1994:170).

The stones are said to have been shown to Mormon residents and missionaries from the nearby state of Utah. These included Andrew S Gibbons and his sons who reportedly saw the “sacred stones” in Oraibi in 1871. Having located GK Gilbert’s notes and sketches of the tablets, Geertz (1994) provides a summarised description of the findings, including that the “stone was evidently squared by the eye and not by any instruments.” Further, there was an interior rectangular shape bordered by six nude figures. It was noted that some type of writing may have

---

20 Geertz explains that the word “Kookop” was incorrectly translated as “Fire” clan (1994:170).
filled the interior space at one time but was no longer there at that time. Mallery claimed:

On the other side are drawings of the sun, clouds, with rain descending therefrom, lighting, stars, arrows, foot-prints of the bear, and several other undeterminable characters. No history of the origin and import of this tablet has been obtained (as cited in Geertz, 1994:176-177).

The stories of the stones gain further complexity with mention of yet another stone tablet known to the chief of the Bear clan, Tawakwaptiwa, in the diaries of Mischa Titiev (Geertz 1994:179). The stone was said to have shown the image of a decapitated man. Although Titiev was told the artifact had been shown to Theodore Roosevelt, Geertz (1994:179) believes it was at a meeting with Taft in 1911. The alleged discovery of another example furthers the historical narrative through the principle of attraction:

Once the stories around something achieve sufficient mass, the thing (or whatever) attracts yet other stories to him/her/itself, via any ‘significant point of resemblance’. Points of attraction include the same type of event, same place, and same name or clan name (Barber & Barber, 2004:113).

The tradition of visual arts, including petroglyphs and markings on stone, was perhaps thought by the Hopi to be more acceptable as “proof” of the covenant made with Maasaw which was oral and intangible. It was perhaps assumed that the markings were indelible and were therefore just as official as Western documentation. Such a response would be firmly entrenched in the oral tradition that shapes Hopi traditional lifeways:

What belonged to earlier epochs is often viewed as more hallowed and entailing more power than what people do nowadays (Barber & Barber, 2004:145).

The interactions occurring between the Hopi elders, missionaries, and US government became a well-documented chronicle of events. In contrast to the ways Native American works were traditionally studied by Western academicians, anthropologists, and ethnologists, the process of defending Hopi culture itself took on the quality of myth. Each individual report of tablets is considered to be authentic, and some Western scholars or writers are purported to have seen them. Author Frank Waters is said to have been shown one in December of 1960. The tablet was then in the possession of the Bear Clan and was said to have been given to them by a deity named Soqomhonaw, who, according to Geertz (1994:184), helped them into the Fourth World. Within the oral tradition, the reference to Soqomhonaw and the emergence is an example of viewing the past as a “golden age.” In the oral tradition, “the past comes to be seen as different in an absolute sense” though, through myth, it still exerts major influence on the present (Barber & Barber, 2004:118).
As was the case with Yukiwma, who had hoped to prove the Hopi’s right to land with the objects, the stories of the tablets gained more significance as the need to provide proof of land ownership grew. As the powerful governmental entity of a literacy-based people, it was perhaps thought that the objects, their imagery, and their oracy-based history, would be enough to persuade those in power of a major significance in the meaning of the art form, imagery, and its powerful intent.

In a similar manner, the natural environment of the Grand Canyon, located within the state of Arizona, serves as a large-scale experiential “chart” interspersed with visual evidence of the Fourth World emergence, migrations, and the people’s mythic travels through metaphysical layers of both space and time. And, as in the case of early Western orators who used the method of loci to preserve narrative within memory, the Hopi Tutskwa oral history could be represented as an expansive “map” constructed with mnemonic aids in visual sequencing, each referred to in the story of the emergence, pilgrimages, and ultimate settlement of the dramatically layered geologic environment that characterises Northern Arizona’s culturally imbued lands.21

5.4 ONGTUPQA: HOPI SIPAPUNI

Ongtupqa is the geologic form the Hopi identify as the original Fourth World Sipaapuni (place of emergence). Located along the Little Colorado River within lands which are now preserved within the Grand Canyon National Park, it is a natural dome created by mineral deposits originating from an underground spring. It is said that the people emerged from the Third World through the hole at the top. It is the place where the first people in the Hopi Fourth World began their migrations. Each clan (defined by matrilineal lineage) which remains in existence today is said to have been named for a significant event or context that occurred on their journey. These stories are the special property of the clans themselves and, as such, they are narratives not shared with members of other clans. Each clan is the conservator of its part of the composite Fourth World narrative. In modern times, pilgrimages are made to the Sipaapuni and back to their ancestral home just as when they first arrived at the Hopi Mesas of Arizona. Today’s Hopi pilgrimages include the practices of obtaining clay from the Sipaapuni area and the continuation of their ritualised journey along the Salt Trail to gather salt (see Chapter 8, section 8.2).

5.4.1 “Insect-Like Creatures” of the First World

In the Fourth World narrative, as retold by Courlander (1972, 1987), the Hopi First World is a subterranean world. Void of people, it is inhabited instead by “insect-like” creatures “who lived in a dark cave deep in the earth” (Courlander, 1987:17) where, according to the Sun Spirit, they saw, but did not “comprehend” 21 For more on land as mnemonic “map,” see Chapter 10: “Dream and Place: Metaphysical Dimensions of Hopi Tutskwa” in this study.
The significance of life. He sent Spider Grandmother, Gogyeng Sowuhtl, to tell them they would leave. She helped them travel to yet another cave where they assumed other forms.

Figure 5.2. *Trilobite fossil* (2018).

The Colorado River runs through the Grand Canyon, which includes the geologic feature considered to be their place of emergence. Since ancient times, it has cut through the Earth, forming the deep abyss visible today. The steep red rock walls of the canyon expose layers of geologic time and preserve the fossilised remains of each ancient era’s diverse forms of life. Up until the 1930s, when the species was threatened with extinction and most had moved to the western coasts, California Condors with wingspans of up to 10 feet could be seen flying upwards through the canyons, seemingly into another cosmos. Recently, however, a few have been returned to the Colorado River corridors through a formal species restoration program sponsored by the National Park Service (2016).

One hundred million years ago, the Great Interior Seaway swept across the American Southwest, taking plants and animals with it. As a result, the enduring effects of ancient waters are still visible across the Colorado Plateau. Waves of sand resembling ripples are located near the Ancestral Puebloan site of Long House located in Colorado’s Mesa Verde National Park. At other sites within the park, archaeologists found fossilised seashells (brachiopods) that were drilled and worn as pendants. The fossilised gizzards of dinosaurs, gastropods, are still in use.
today as pottery burnishing tools as are the gizzard stones of modern-day wild turkeys. Parsons acknowledges the importance of fossils to the culture:

Stone and fossil have a place among Pueblo spirits. Fossilized wood is a fetish of the Hopi goddess of game animals ... Ancient stone hoes called chamahia by Hopi are altar fetishes (Hopi, Acoma). They represent the Stone people (Hopi), ‘people of the stone when it had speech and life’ (1939:194).

Among the fossils found in the Grand Canyon are trilobites: small, segmented anthropods with enormous eyes which look like those of insects. The oldest trilobites in the area date to between 525 and 400 million years ago and could have been perceived as records of the Hopi First World, a time inhabited by “insect-like creatures” (Figure 5.2). Adrienne Mayor (2015:154), historian of ancient science and geomythologist, notes that the resemblance could have been the inspiration behind the name “little water bug in stone.”

The river itself is mentioned in the Fourth World narrative. Courlander’s retelling of the Origins of the Snake Clan reads like an experiential map which records the mythic travels of a young man who hoped to fulfil Hopi prophecy and travel down the river to the sea. Historically, the Colorado River runs through the Grand Canyon to the Sea of Cortez in Northern Mexico although the construction of dams in the 20th century dramatically lessened those occasions. When the young man meets Hard Substances Woman, she lives in a house made of turquoise located on a steep coral butte much like those that surround the ongtupqa now (Courlander, 1987:86).

5.5 FOSSILS: ANCIENT LANDS, TRADITIONS, AND MYTHICAL BEINGS

The lands of the Hopi, Zuni, and other Puebloan peoples are characterised by vast exposures of layered geologic sediments dating back to the Cretaceous era which occurred in between 145 million and 66 million years ago. According to Mayor, the dramatic landscape, characterised by deposits of salt, clay, minerals, and fossilised remains, played a role in both the Zuni Twin Heroes myth, stalking “across the world, blasting with lightning all the land monsters—gigantic bears, enormous lions, and other immense creatures. Instantly immolated, the dangerous beasts shriveled and became stone” (Mayor, 2014).

The Puebloan people recognise the presence of ancient beings within the natural environment and accommodate them into both their daily lives and philosophical worldview. For example, Mayor notes that the Hopi consider another local fossil,
known locally as moqui²² marbles, to be brought by ancestors who come to earth to play with the marbles, leaving them behind as they return to “heaven” so that their relatives can be happy. As a result, the Hopi keep them in their homes to welcome the spirits (Mayor, 2005:157).

Mayor also explains how Hopi and other Puebloan potters use gastroliths (dinosaur gizzard stones) to smooth the sides of pottery. Special trips are made to collect the stones which can be in rivers or within the fossilised remains of dinosaurs where as many as 200 stones can be found within rib cages (Mayor, 2005:157).

The fossil dinosaur tracks found embedded in the eroded rock surfaces near Tuba City and the western Hopi village of Moenkopi were thought to have been made by Palulukon, who, like all katsinam, were associated with rain (Mayor, 2005:142). Mayor notes that, at the Hopi village of Moenkopi, large footprints are also found that may be replicated in sacred rain rituals associated with the Snake Dance which is known for its use of live rattlesnakes. Mayor notes that the Palulukon katsina associated with the Snake Dance is itself represented as a “giant underground reptile” (Mayor, 2005:141). In addition, the snake ceremony dancers wear kilts that bear the images of these large tridactyl tracks which are not only found near Moenkopi, but also at another Ancestral Puebloan home—what is now considered Colorado’s Mesa Verde National Park.

Additional visual similarities are evident between the fossilised remains of prehistoric-era life and ancient life, mythological beings, or ancestors. The significance of strong visual resemblance can be found between the fossil remains of a phytosaur, *smilosuchus*, found in the region of Arizona’s Petrified Forest National Park and the appearance and nature of the Hopi Natashka Katsina. The katsina is a frightening “bogey” or mischievous spirit who begs door-to-door and frightens children into behaving well. Within Hopi mythology, archaeologist Elsie Clews Parsons identifies the origins of the katsinam as “early monsters” (1996b:1161). These bogeys or monsters are thought to be represented in petroglyphs within areas in which the phytosaur remains were visible and in which early Puebloan people are known to have lived or traveled as in Figure 5.4 (National Park Service, 2015, personal correspondence).

---

²² A “tribal name” associated with the Hopi peoples. Although the origin of the name is assumed to be of outside origin, the word itself means “dead”, or as translated by Mayor, “dearly departed ones” in their own language.
Figure 5.3. Fossilised prehistoric-era reptilian skull (*Phytosaur*) (2016).

Figure 5.4. Petroglyph ([Sa]).
Figure 5.5. *Natashka Katsina Rattle* (2016).

Because the origins of the art form, the Natashka Katsina can be traced to the presence of local fossilised remains with some apparent certainty (Figure 5.3). The Natashka Katsina rattle, made of a painted gourd (with dried seeds within), wood, and feathers, can serve as an example of the relevance of Panofsky’s iconological analysis processes as applied to “artifacts” that are not considered representative of the Western tradition for which the theories were intended (Figure 5.5). When such contexts are known and relevant, the academic argument that art history and archaeology are totally separate fields of study seems to be a reflection of Western hierarchical academic thinking.

Based on Panofsky’s concept of primary subject matter, the rattle is clearly a work of art which assists individuals of the Hopi culture with an activity in which movement and sound are emphasised. The frightening features such as bulging eyes and sharply defined teeth suggest the appearance of a known cultural character which functions within a supernatural world. The being itself is clearly depicted as an entity that intends to frighten the viewer. The presence of what appears to be a dinosaur track, similar to those found on the kilts worn by the Snake dancers, also recalls an age of ancestors who walked the earth in ancient times. The image also recalls past layers of the Hopi “worlds,” of which this is the fourth. According to the *Fourth World of the Hopi* (1987) narrative written by Courlander and collaborators, the previous layer, the third world, was filled with
evil and strife; thus, the good people were compelled to move upwards to the lands they promised to preserve in the covenant with Maasaw (Courlander, 1987).

An assessment of secondary subject matter reveals connections between this object and other katsina imagery—that which holds spiritual meaning to the Hopi people. The ceremonial purposes the rattle may be used for could relate to rain, the sound of which is emulated by the shaking of the interior gourd seeds. The vivid imagery is meant to be memorable: the bulging eyes, sharp teeth and elongated snout recall monsters or other creatures capable of attacking and swallowing mammals. At the smaller scale, these features could just be replications, but, on a much larger, perhaps human scale, the character would leave an impression on young children. Fossilised phytosaur skulls are found within archaeological areas located near the Chinle Formation:

Archaeological sites in the area sometimes contain fossil materials, and phytosaur skulls, while not found within any site, are common in the Chinle Formation and were probably seen by the early Puebloan people who inhabited the area. Nataska is commonly depicted in petroglyphs as long snouted and having numerous sharp teeth. This is very common to a phytosaur skull. (NPS, 2013, Personal Correspondence, William Parker)

When evaluated on Panofsky’s concept of deeper, intrinsic meaning, we find correlations between this figure and the frightening supernatural “ogres” who do indeed frighten children and who were probably the subject of local petroglyphs perhaps replicating monstrous animals from the Third or earlier worlds. Courlander states that the people of the Third World themselves still had animal-like characteristics including fur, webbed fingers, and tails (Courlander, 1987:18). Considered “bogeys,” the monstrous forms are specific katsinam who descended on the village to inflict punishment on “uncooperative” young people. As such, they instilled a sense of the people’s interdependence and their responsibilities to their culture within the young:

There were bogey Kachinas who “might kidnap” bad children, and who visited the mesas sometimes when children were uncooperative; thus the ‘tranger’ joined effectively with the clan in inducing the ‘ideal’ Hopi behavior. But children shared this fear, as they also frequently shared other punishments. Dennis has called attention to the fact that a whole group of children often shared the punishment for the wrong-doing of one. (33). This method may not endear an individual to his agemates, but it does reinforce the central theme of Hopi belief that each person in the group is responsible for what happens to all, however angry or jealous one may feel toward siblings (Eggan, 1956:356).
5.6 CONCLUSION

By understanding how Hopi and other indigenous cultures understand themselves, and by using cross-discipline study, Western scholars studying non-Western arts have a better chance of gaining a true familiarity with primary cultural beliefs and practices. Researchers, including art historians, must try to set aside their natural biases and see their points of interest within the relevant non-Western contexts. The process is facilitated by comparing and contrasting indigenous thought with the scientific emphasis which influences Western belief and multiple Western academic disciplines.

As this chapter has shown, mythology and cultural narratives tie the Hopi people to the land. The Hopi worldview is informed by mythological contexts embedded within the landscape and the natural environment. As natural features of Hopi Tutskwa such as fossils are encountered, their presence is explained through aspects of the origin story. Subsequently these new elements are incorporated into a broadened or more precisely detailed aspect of the narrative itself.
CHAPTER 6: INDIGENOUS THOUGHT AND SCIENTIFIC THINKING

6.1 INTRODUCTION

A meaningful understanding of Hopi arts and culture requires a commitment to understanding the people themselves and their traditional lifeways. To accomplish this, it is necessary to develop an awareness of the differences between indigenous thought and scientific thought. It is also necessary to understand why scientific thought has been considered so important within the Western culture for so long. For Western scholars, including those working within the discipline of art history, a better understanding of indigenous thought may lead to greater “empathetic” awareness of the indigenous arts and the cultures themselves (Chanda & Basinger, 2000:42:1).

6.2 INDIGENOUS THOUGHT

In the earlier part of the 20th century, the belief in a universe with widespread mentality was considered within academia, usually with reference to “the other” rather than to their own culture’s Greek and Roman origins. In the *Intellectual Adventure of Ancient Man* (1946), Frankfort, Frankfort, Wilson and Jacobsen describe a time when the world’s myriad entities were perceived as “Thou” rather than “That.”

‘Thou’ has the unprecedented, unparalleled, and unpredictable character of an individual, a presence known only in so far as it reveals itself. ‘Thou,’ moreover, is not merely contemplated or understood but is experienced emotionally in a dynamic reciprocal relationship. For these reasons there is justification for the aphorism of Crawley: ‘Primitive man has only one mode of thought, one mode of expression, one part of speech—the personal.’ This does not mean (as is so often thought) that primitive man, in order to explain natural phenomena, imparts human characteristics to an inanimate world. Primitive man simply does not know an inanimate world. For this very reason, he does not ‘personify’ (1946:5-6).

The rise of panpsychic belief within Western academia can be attributed to the Greek Pre-Socratic philosopher, Thales (ca. 624-545 BCE), whose initial observations regarding magnets and amber concluded that each could move themselves therefore each must have a mind. Aristotle is known to have remarked “some say a soul is mingled in the whole universe—which is perhaps why Thales thought that everything is full of gods” (Goff, Seager, Allen-Hermanson, 2017). Dukor describes a similar belief system as it relates to African culture. According to Dukor, the spiritual experience of immersion in mythical time within the present world occurs regularly from a “theistic panpsychic” perspective view where “every thing or object has a divine spark but precisely panpsychic because
forces are venerated or worshipped in the same way God is adored” (Dukor, personal correspondence 11 August, 2017).

Morris Opler, who, with Harry Hoijer and three Native elders, produced a comprehensive study of Chiricahua Apache War-path vocabulary, recorded an emergence myth like that of the Hopi in which the people lived beneath the earth in darkness as if in a dream and, also like the Hopi, left because of sorcerers. According to his collaborators, the newer, mindful cosmos was described as follows:

Rocks are alive, just as much alive as trees or plants or animals or pollen. They are the bones of the world. Without them there would be no firmness to the world. All would be sticky mud. Your bones are part of your life, part of your body. You must then consider rocks to be alive as much as you consider your bones to be alive. If you treat rocks well they won’t injure you; but if you do not, some day you will fall on a rock and hurt yourself or be harmed by a rock in some way (Opler, 1994:110).

Harris explains that the belief that the universe is alive is among the foundational worldviews of indigenous peoples and further claims that it is thought to possess “power, will, and intelligence.” Western thinking, she claims, is however based upon dichotomies. Here she refers to the beliefs of Cowlitz philosopher, Rudolph Ryser who comments on the “fundamental Western mode of thought Progressivism”:

The holism of indigenous thought, according to Ryser, is characterized by conceptions of the interconnectedness of all life; perpetual movement of all through space and time; connection between past, present and future; and life and death as aspects of the same thing (1998:21). Western thought, on the other hand is often organized around dichotomies like animate and inanimate, natural and supernatural, man and nature, life and death, past and future, subject and object, observer and observed. These divergences in fundamental perceptions between archaeologists and indigenous people can result in serious misunderstandings ... (in Smith, 2016:64).

Early Western thinkers, such as Aratus of Soli (early 3rd century BC) shared similar beliefs about the omnipresent sense of mentality as portrayed by the Phaenomena of nature:

(819) To the Sun’s march at East and West give heed. His hints give even more pertinent warning both at setting, and when he comes from below the erge. May not his orb, whenever though desirest a fair day, be variegated when his first arrows strike the earth, and may he wear no mark at all but shine stainless together. If again thus all pure he be in the hour when the oxen are loosed, and set cloudless in the evening with gentle beam, he will still be at the coming dawn attended with fair weather. But no so, when he rises with seemingly hollow disk, nor when his beams part to strike or North
or South, while his centre is bright. But then in truth he journeys either through rain or through wind.

Aby Warburg studied the Hopi people whose culture and peoples he believed provided a unique glimpse into the ancient past of early Western civilization. Such theories gave rise to literature such as Warburg’s *A Lecture on Serpent Ritual* (1939) co-written with WF Mainland, in which he discussed a drawing provided to him by a Puebloan Indian for whom the universe was “conceived in the form of a house” which was united in the image with “an irrational animal conception, a serpent, which appears as an enigmatic and awe-inspiring demon” (Warburg, 1939:277). In the Puebloans themselves, Warburg saw unique glimpses of “pagan Europe”:

A glance at similar phenomena in pagan Europe will eventually bring us to the question: to what extent can these remnants of pagan cosmology still obtaining among the Pueblo Indians help us to understand the evolution from primitive paganism, through the highly-developed pagan culture of classical antiquity, down to modern civilized man? (Warburg, 1939:277).

Like many European and American academicians, Warburg believed the Puebloan peoples provided rare opportunities to view evolution in action—a chance to witness the “survival of the fittest”—a member of which he, as did most Western scholars, and indeed the audience for which the speech was intended—believed himself to be.

### 6.3 WESTERN SCIENCE

Bruchac, Hart and Wobst (2016:66) expressed concern that the West’s worldview is based on dichotomies. In support, the authors quote American Indian scholar, Vine Deloria’s 1997 claim that “[i]n America we have an entrenched state religion, and it is called science”. Harris expresses the concern that the Western view of defining reality in terms of dichotomy is fundamentally flawed and even dangerous:

A logical outcome of dichotomous thinking which places the researcher in one category and everything studied in the category of object leads, in the indigenous view, to racism, colonialism, environmental destruction and many other ills which have destroyed the natural balance between all the entities [that] make up the universe. Objectification precludes respect. It precludes considering others, whether they are animals, plants, artefacts, other humans or the earth itself as innately valuable and, therefore, places them in a category of things available for exploitation. Some Indigenous peoples believe that this objectifying attitude may bring about the end of the world as we know it (Bruchac et al., 2016:66).
6.4 NON-WESTERN SCIENCE: EMBEDDED TRADITIONAL KNOWLEDGE (NAVOTI) IN HOPI KATSINA SONGS

The Western scientific methods employed by Sapir, Whorf and other academics sponsored by America’s prestigious academic institutions, contrast sharply with the Hopi concept of traditional knowledge, or navoti, as does evolutionary thinking. In a 1995 study presented at the Hohokam, Salado, and Sinagua Consultation Meeting sponsored by the Bureau of Applied Research in Anthropology at the University of Arizona, Emory Sekaquaptewa described the significant role song plays in traditional learning within non-literate societies such as the Hopi. According to Zendo and Stoffle (1995), song is the medium through which Hopi navoti, is conveyed:

> Although words are important, words are uttered in the context of custom and usage where place becomes important, where form in a sense of ritual or performance is significant. It has its own message. Where song becomes more important because song, in a non-literate society, is the number one medium for expression, and particularly in the poetic expression. The literary, the creative expression is through song in any non-literate society, and it’s particularly so in Hopi. And where the combination of place, form, performance, song, leads to that element that is part of the most powerful educational tool, which is called drama. And along with the drama is that good feeling that one brings to his [sic] heart or mind. And it’s very easy, it becomes very susceptible of this spiritual feeling, a feeling of reverence. So reverence is one of these elements, a powerful element of oral tradition or traditional knowledge. It’s all of these elements that come together at the right time and right place throughout the season that make use or that uses all of our five senses. It affects all of our five senses in order to have a meaning for the people about their history, about their philosophy, about their destiny and their future (Zendo & Stoffle, 1995:81).

An understanding of navoti as well as natwani (practice) is essential to the translation and understanding of traditional Hopi cultural knowledge as it relates to the means by which it is preserved. Sekaquaptewa, Hill and Washburn (2015) collaborated on the translation of multiple ritual songs which are attributed to the katsinam, the supernatural beings who “come as rain to the Hopi people in return for their prayers and hard work of living the corn lifeway” (Washburn & Sekaquaptewa, 2009:196). According to the authors, the essential cosmological concepts preserved through navoti within the embedded works were identified through studies based on “twentieth-century Hopi ritual song, fifteenth-century Hopi kiva murals, and contemporaneous and earlier prehistoric Hopi ceramics” (Washburn & Sekaquaptewa, 2009:196). Among the outcomes of the study, the

---

23 Clemmer (1995:37) identifies navoti as “the knowledge of history held collectively by a clan” and wuk-navoti as “revealed knowledge” as in prophecy.
authors assert, was a new understanding of how the songs themselves provide insights into the links evident between “ritual and daily practice” and the objects in which they are embodied.

Figure 6.1. Diagram of annual Hopi Katsina and non-katsina ceremonial seasons ([Sa]).

Washburn and Sekaquaptewa identify the “method of learning the Hopi way through oral tradition of song and story as a four-fold process including “immersing self in ritual practices that sustain the community,” following the Hopi Life of Corn, “reaping benefits of good practices that bring one health, happiness and prosperity into old age,” and repeatedly practicing “life-sustaining practices” (2009:202, Figure 3). In addition, Hart and Wobst (2009:202) claim that the Hopi katsina songs assert the importance of maintaining ritual practices each year and by each generation as a means of ensuring the continuity of the Corn Lifeway.

After the songs are first performed in the plaza, Hopi individuals are supposed to sing these songs as they work in their homes and in their fields,
and in doing so, this constant singing reminds them of the ever present need
to follow the practices that sustain the Hopi lifeway.

The authors note other messages embedded within the *katsina* songs, many of
which would have been lost were it not for their careful collaborative effort to
transcribe recordings held in ethnographic collections of select museums within
the United States and funding from the National Endowment for the Humanities.
While specific cultural material, such as the 150 songs analysed, was traditionally
preserved and maintained through generations, the number of individuals who
were still familiar with them eventually diminished to the extent that they were no
longer committed to memory. Washburn and Sekaquaptewa’s additional studies
of Corn Lifeway imagery combined with the oral narratives work in conjunction
with the song interpretations to preserve these forms of embedded knowledge for
future generations (2009). The time between when the traditional songs were
primarily stored in the memory of individuals and when the collaboration took
place reflects Vansina’s observation that knowledge derived from oral traditions
may include what he deemed “hour-glass effects” in which the quantity of
memorised knowledge may, for a variety of reasons, dwindle only to be
rediscovered or revived in some form at a later date (1985:169). From a
mytholinguistic perspective, the *katsina* song collaboration represents an effort to
preserve not only the words of the *songs*, but the Corn Lifeway imagery to which
they frequently refer.

In his studies on the cultural use of mnemonic devices for the recording and
subsequent learning of traditional cultural knowledge, Vansina, too, made similar
observations of African peoples. He noted that royal tombs served as “historical
records carved into the landscape,” how trees were planted within a landscape to
reference long lines of gifted pigs between two leaders in New Guinea that
demonstrated their comparable wealth, how melody preserves rhythm, how tonal
drums also preserved “historical information” (Vansina, 1985:47) and how even
just the “melody of a sentence” could serve as a mnemotechnic device for the
conveyance of “tonal riddles” (Vansina, 1985:47).

### 6.5 CONCLUSION

Although origin myths such as those created by the Hopi people were in use far
earlier than the advent of the modern discipline of cognitive science, the findings
and theories of researchers such as Neisser mirror the traditional methods of
preserving *navoti* (Hopi knowledge) through ritual, repetition, dramatic
visualizations, narrative, and song. When viewed as such, these aspects of Hopi
traditional knowledge may then be described through the terminology created by
the scientists of the modern West.

When studying the embodiments of traditional knowledge, Western academicians
benefit from a familiarity with indigenous learning techniques, as they then are
more likely to realise the true meanings behind the art of Native cultures including
that of the Hopi. In fact, one of the biggest differences between indigenous thought and scientific thought is found within the understanding of self, including how Native cultures recognise who and what they are, the role that identity plays in their cultures and, ultimately, how art both embodies and preserves these concepts.
CHAPTER 7: COGNITION, CULTURE AND SELF

7.1 INTRODUCTION

The art that humans create is a result of cultural identity and their perceived place within the larger cosmos. By examining how indigenous peoples see themselves and by recognising the effect that has on the people’s culture and art, art historians can more accurately interpret indigenous art and artifacts. They will also better comprehend how contact with Western belief systems may affect the indigenous artistic traditions.

7.2 NON-WESTERN APPLICATIONS OF NEISSER’S CONCEPTS OF SELF

Ecophilosopher, Freya Mathews claims the influence of the Classical West influenced America’s academicians and continues to do so, not due to their similarities but in the West’s development of a dependence on theoría, a term she applies to the distancing process occurring between the immediacy of experience, and the Western mind’s reinterpretation of the same. As stated, Mathews likens the concept to that of looking at the object in a mirror rather than seeing the object itself (Mathews, 2009:4). In contrast, the immediacy of experience and the means by which it preserves traditional lifeways are highly emphasized in the arts, ritual practices, and narratives specific to Hopi culture.
7.2.1 Intrinsic Self-Knowledge

Neisser’s definitions of self-knowledge comprise a wholistic concept comprised of five separate elements: the conceptual self, the private self, the extended self, the interpersonal self, and finally, the ecological self. The dynamics of self and other are defining elements of human experience for any given culture, and that of the Hopi is no exception. When mnemonic forms of art are intentionally created to preserve, transmit, and reinforce cultural belief, Ulric Neisser’s five kinds of self-knowledge (Neisser, 1967:88) can reveal both how and why the object, imagery, use, and function impact the human mind on successive cognitive levels.

Historically, the West has viewed the works of non-Western peoples as less sophisticated than its own, particularly those associated with oracy-based cultures. The inability of Western scholars to recognise the traditional knowledge and narratives embedded within the arts of Native Americans is symptomatic of the complex relationship between the West and the “Other” which, Edward Said...
believed, pervaded their “institutions, vocabulary, scholarship, doctrines even colonial bureaucracies and colonial styles ...” (1978:2). A creative work is first and foremost a representation of the culture itself. As embodiments of the culture’s significant worldview, works of art serve as the starting point or impetus for further levels of effect that register upon the individual and his or her relational macrocosm. This is particularly true within contexts relating to the arts and imagery of oracy-based peoples and cultures whose traditions may have little in common with the Western traditions of perception and symbolic significance.


7.2.2 Ecological Self

Located within the outer ring on Figure 7.1, Neisser defines the ecological self as “the self as directly perceived with respect to the immediate physical environment” (2008:35). The broad context of ecology remains central to the Hopi belief system as well as that of other Native Americans. According to the Fourth World Emergence narrative, the early Hopi were granted permission to live in the new world if they would serve as the earth’s caretakers:

Since time immemorial the Hopi people have lived in Hopituskwa and have maintained our sacred covenant with Maasaw, the ancient caretaker of the earth, to live as peaceful and humble farmers respectful of the land and its resources (The Hopi Tribe, 2018).
The Fourth World emergence myth attributes the deterioration of the Third World to, in part, the deterioration of human behaviour, lack of conscience, witchcraft, and sorcery (Courlander, 1987:22). As the Hopi strongly believe that the place of emergence into the Fourth World is located within a specific area in the Grand Canyon, in the state of Arizona, their stories of clan migrations stretch back to that conceptual time. Because of their dedication to the land, they are considered a “locative” culture. As Carolyn Elaine Tate, author of Yaxchilan: The Design of a Maya Ceremonial City (1983), explained the concept, she noted that it is a belief often found among peoples who believe in the influence of ancestors upon the present world, multiple souls, a multi-layered universe with strong ties to the four directions, and what the author calls “permeable outer-ego boundaries”:

In many societies, the making and keeping of place is a unique and precious notion ... Persons living in cultures with fundamentally locative points of view consciously try to enact in their social, political, and physical surroundings those structures which reproduce the order of the cosmos as they perceive it. Many of those societies share the concept of the layered universe and four-directional cosmology, beliefs in the influence of ancestors on the living, multiple souls, and permeable outer-ego boundaries (Tate, 1983:27).

The concept of the ecological self therefore relates not only to individuals or clans, but to the entire Hopi culture. Owing to the Puebloan belief in cyclical time, concerns related to the dominant Western cultures’ desecration of sacred Native places suggests the end of a cosmological world. The Hopi concept of ecological self is referenced by eco-philosopher, Freya Mathews, in The Ecological Self (1994), who noted that archaeologist Laura Thomson believed their worldview was based on order, rhythm, unity, and repetition (Mathews, 1994:160). In keeping with this emphasis on symbiosis between humankind and nature, modern Hopi anticipate the coming of the “Yellow Comet” which will signal the end of the Fourth World. The recent use of waste water to make snow on the San Francisco Peaks, home of the katsinam, resulted in lawsuits which claimed that Hopi spiritual objects associated with pilgrimages to the site and other ritual practices would be subject to contamination (Cole, 2008). The Hopi concerns about the probable end of the Fourth World and the conditions which would bring it about entered the realm of American popular culture with Godfrey Reggio’s popular film, Koyannisqatsi (“Life Out of Balance”) (1982) which brought the detrimental significance of living “life out of balance” with nature and its elemental forces.

7.2.3 Interpersonal Self

As the rings of “selves” move inward (Figure 7.1), the next aspect of self is the “interpersonal self.” As explained by Neisser, the “interpersonal self is defined by “species-specific signals of emotional rapport and communication” (2008:35). The Hopi emergence story, life itself, the origins of clans, and the continued
respect paid to the seasonal *kachina* events relate directly to Neisser’s narrowing concept of the “interpersonal self.” A matrilineal society, the Hopi clan system is highly ritualised, and although members of each clan are responsible for understanding the roles they played in the emergence, these clan histories are held privately among the group and not shared with members of other clans as noted. Thus, a comprehensive knowledge of every clan is not the domain of all clan members but is limited to the Hopi village leader, the *kikmongwi*. The tradition reached a new level of significance when a non-Hopi scholar attempted to publish a manuscript on traditional salt trail pilgrimages which continue to be important aspects of men’s initiation ceremonies associated with secret societies (Anderson, McElgunn & Richland, 2017:190). Not only would the publication reveal culturally significant material to the public, it would also be made available to the initiates of the other societies to whom each other’s practices had never been disclosed.

### 7.2.4 Extended Self

Moving inward, Figure 7.1’s third ring of self is the “extended self.” Neisser defines the “extended self” as one based upon “memory and anticipation” (2008:35). It is possible to compare the personal experience of self with the efforts necessary to maintain strong clan systems and familial relationships. Within all cultures these are perceived of as holistic entities essential to both well-being and identity that should be nurtured and maintained. Neisser’s “extended self” serves as an efficient means of describing how everyone within the Hopi culture functions within their specific clan. In turn, the maintenance of the mythologies, ritual narratives, objects, and associated imagery contribute to the overall cohesiveness of the Hopi culture. For example, Geertz and Lomatuway’ma (1987:37) described the fate of puppets who must be cared for in the traditional ways despite the extinction of their clan as is further discussed in Section 8.3.

Puebloan social organisation often includes kinship-based moieties which are used to organise the villages into two separate categories. Whereas the organisation of Hopi villages are organised according to matrilineal order, those of the Tewa are divided into summer and winter (Ortiz, 1969). The Ancestral Puebloans, however, from whom the Hopi are descended, are noted to have had moieties in place at locations, such as Chaco Canyon which was divided into the Parrot and Crow/Katsina Clan according to Kuwanwiswma (2004:45).

### 7.2.5 Private Self

Nearing the center of Figure 7.1 is Neisser’s concept of the private self. According to Neisser, the “private self” emerges once an individual takes ownership of their own conscious experiences (2008:35). The “private self” provides a context within which the individual’s waking and dream experience serve to illustrate a healthy balance that has been struck between the needs of self and those of family and the core culture.
Dreaming is an individual experience highlighting self as well as the transitory nature of the soul. Although there is a tradition of sharing dreams within the Hopi culture, the actions of the individual private self are called into question in cases such as that of Don Talayesva. Talayesva, who wrote an autobiography titled *Sun Chief* with Yale anthropologist Leo Simmons (1942), also worked as a collaborator with anthropologist Dorothy Eggn’s projects on dream studies for the University of Chicago. It was widely thought that he revealed too much traditional knowledge to the academic community during his ten years of working with Western researchers. Although he returned to the traditional lifeways afterwards, his collaborations with these non-Hopi peoples is sometimes thought by other Native peoples to have resulted in personal misfortunes, including childlessness.

In his autobiography, Talayesva recounts how the deaths of his three children led to accusations of being a “Two-Heart” or witch, which threatened the wellbeing of others. Talayesva denied the claims and attempted to reverse the accusation by asking to be killed. His accusers refused, however, and shortly afterward he lost yet another child. He blamed the death upon a member of the Fire Clan whose identity had been revealed to him by his Guardian Spirit in a dream (Taleyesva, Simmons & Hine, 2013:422).

Eggan’s interviews with Talayesva and others revealed the strong connections felt between individual and the Hopi culture as well as and the responsibilities they entail:

> For, as *self* emerged for the Hopi, he was at the same time being taught to deny it, rather than to exercise it; he was taught that his emerging entity was an important part of the *group self*, past, present, and future. In other words, he was taught to achieve self-fulfillment only in group-fulfillment ... He was not merely told that Hopi beliefs were right or wise, he lived them as he grew, and in his *total environment* (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:241).

### 7.2.6 Conceptual Self

Finally, located at the center of Figure 7.1, Neisser’s “conceptual self” is derived from a “network of socially based assumptions and theories about human nature in general and ourselves in particular” (2008:35). When applied within this study, this aspect of self-knowledge finds meaning in the ways each Hopi individual embraces the shared “core” beliefs of the culture and the responsibilities they assume in maintaining its traditions. In the example of the Hopi people, we see the conceptual self and the social networks to which it subscribes referenced in metaphorical form throughout both the daily lives and ritual practices of the people themselves. For instance, this study explains how structures, such as *kivas* include references to the emergence through features such as *sipapu*. These small holes, located on the floors of round, subterranean ceremonial rooms—the “kivas” affiliated with clan ceremonies and practices—replicate the mythic place of emergence. Indeed, the experience of exiting a dark *kiva* through the
characteristic central ladder itself replicates the energy and experience of breaking through the darkness of the Third and entering the newer, better, manifestations of the Fourth World.

*Kivas* are the typically subterranean structures in which the specific sacred meetings of the male members of the clans take place. The features themselves remind the clans of the responsibilities they have, including the memorisation of their own clan’s migration stories, and the caretaking and creation of their sacred or ritual objects.

For the Hopi as a whole, life itself is a highly ritualised yet difficult existence which was taken on by choice following the emergence. Today, the Hopi are admired for their dry farming techniques which allow them to grow crops in the arid high desert terrain. The methods used were taught to them by Maasaw, the spirit leader who welcomed them to the Fourth World. For the Hopi, the human life cycle emulates that of the corn plants themselves, and cultural arts are embedded with metaphors referencing shared seasons of life. Each year, the *katsinam* come to the villages in the form of clouds and ceremonies and dances are held in their honour. At the end of each Hopi’s life, he/she too will join the “ancestors” in the form of the clouds that bring rain to their people.

When it was first published in 1967, Neisser’s seminal work, *Cognitive Psychology*, was not intended to focus on learning as it relates to cognition and oracy-based peoples. Indeed, many of the cognitive tests described involved Standard American English letters and numbers that would have had little relevance beyond the European American readership. However, specific aspects of the far-reaching work prove highly relevant to how traditional lifeways, such as those of the Hopi peoples, have relied heavily on sophisticated visual and auditory cognitive practices as works of embedded art function as “cues” to recall the ability to interpret visual imagery and associated narrative content simultaneously. Furthermore, the seasonal and cyclical calendars on which specific rituals are performed further strengthen the messages transmitted through associated forms of narrative, visual, and performance arts. Learning the specific meanings of the cultural elements requires a strong knowledge of the Hopi language. For example, Sekaquaptewa, Hill and Washburn (2015) witnessed the near extinction of seasonal Hopi *katsina* songs prior to launching an intensive effort to recover and save them. The project did not only preserve the *katsina* songs, but also saves the unique aspects of the Corn Lifeway rituals and practices that were recorded in the words, rhythms, and beats within them.

The change in emphasis from traditional learning to the adoption of Western educational methods contributes to an erosion of learning through cognitive practices including the interpretation of the mnemonic arts. In her studies of youth who “have their heart in the Hopi way of life” through dedication to the Hopi customs, Nicholas reports how, nonetheless, decreasing numbers of Hopi youth are learning the Native language. Of the three students upon which her studies were based, one’s earliest memories of the Hopi language were based
upon learning to plant corn by hand (2008:263). The author also describes how each of the students studied “remembered an abrupt linguistic shift upon entering school. According to one student, “before you go to school, that’s how they (family members) speak to you, in Hopi ... but when you go to school, it’s like it (Hopi) just stops ‘cuz you’re expected to learn English.” The second of the three students studied noted, “I would mostly speak it (Hopi) until I got into school (Head Start) ... In kindergarten (we) just dropped ... the Hopi language.” (2008:217). A third student expressed concern about the times when she had been questioned about knowing the Hopi language and feeling awkward because “… you know, most (tribal) people say if you don’t speak the language, then you’re not of that tribe” (2008:168).

Nicholas notes the connections between the loss of Hopi language fluency levels and the “pressure to live like the white man,” an attitude the author attributes to a Western educational agenda in which “generations of Hopi were subjected to compulsory Anglo-American education programmes with the goal of assimilation” (2008:217). In contrast, Nicholas also describes how the student’s grandparents still remembered a time when life was experienced “exclusively” in the Hopi language and how it was “through the Hopi language that their memories were elicited and expressed” (2008:215).

This study, therefore, describes how Neisser’s theories regarding auditory and visual cognition as well as movement relate to not only the sustainability of central Hopi cultural beliefs and practices, but also the ways in which the arts are employed as a means of introducing children to important cultural philosophies, customs, and traditions. The continued dedication to traditional Hopi ways, mnemonic practices, and applications of the arts is an essential aspect of learning that is clearly facilitated by original language and practices, including the Hopi’s seasonal events associated with the growing season and winter as well as the arts to which they are tied.

The Hopi emphasis on the “repetition of myth” is evident in the Fourth World narrative which, in turn, serves as the overriding focus and themes inherent in multiple traditional Hopi arts as reflections of the covenant made with Maasaw, the Earth Guardian, and are created in part as a form of respect and gratitude for the Fourth World lands he left in their care. The functionality of the objects ranges from those created for spiritual purposes to those that address practical aspects of day-to-day life. Consistent with the oracy-based traditions of the people, the culturally significant concepts embedded within Hopi images and artifacts are most effectively understood through mytholinguistic analysis. The means by which the oral tradition proves so effective and enduring can be explained by Neisser’s (1967) theories of cognition, specifically those associated with visual, auditory, and physical levels of human experience and memory; historically, these are among the primary areas of human cognition emphasised in the arts of oracy-based cultures and peoples.
7.3 ART AS LEARNING METHOD IN HOPI CULTURE: PALULUKON, PAALÖLÖQANGW, EMOTIVE VISUAL COGNITION

An awareness of the use of vivid imagery, repetition, and dramatic performances inspired Dorothy Eggan’s comprehensive studies of Hopi dreams. While her intent was to demonstrate the significance of the roles cultural projections play in the themes and images associated with dreams, the significance of perceiving objects, rituals, and imagery as cognitive instruments was largely overlooked. Hopi arts, imagery, and rituals convey important cultural concepts through significant mnemonics and experiential forms. As the repositories of cultural concepts significant to oral tradition and mytholinguistic content, these mnemonic devices and associated contexts provide the means by which significant knowledge is stored as narrative records through documentary evidence, imbued imagery, or conceptual and linguistic metaphors.

7.3.1 Traditional Learning

In addition to their fear-inspiring powers, the vivid markings and exotic appearance of Palulukon as well as the water serpent, Paalöloqangw, clearly affected the subjects of her study, resulting in the high number of dreams in which the supernatural being played a part. Once having seen representations of the beings in staged performances, young children would remember its fearful appearance and theatrical actions through visual memory as transient iconic memory in the form of what Neisser refers to as mental “snapshots.” While the impressions they left on adults were well documented in Eggan’s studies, modern cognitive science indicates that the transmission of cultural material through such vivid imagery and dramatic performances—which in the case of katsina performances may include whipping as in the case of the Sakwa hu (also known as Blue Whipper katsina) whose duty it is to act as guards at katsina ceremonies—have a particularly strong effect on the young within whom these experiences leave lifelong impressions:

Under normal conditions ... visual perception itself is a constructive act. The perceiver ‘makes’ stable objects, using information from a number of ‘snapshots’ together. Such a process requires a kind of memory, but not one which preserves pictorial copies of earlier patterns. Instead, there is a constantly developing schematic model, to which each new fixation adds new information. The individual ‘snapshots’ are remembered only in the way that the words of a sentence are remembered when you can recollect nothing but its meaning: they have contributed to something which endures (Neisser, 1967:132).

Neisser explains how the vivid “snapshot” imagery is not the same as what is experienced in a dream, which he notes as “an integrated visual event” (Neisser,
1967:143). Rather than dreams themselves, Neisser’s studies revealed remarkably vivid imagery in the pre-sleep phase of the “hypnagogic state.”

Perhaps most relevant to the early indoctrination of children into cultural practices were the outcomes of studies Neisser describes, particularly those which asked children to study and then recall a specific narrative image. A small percentage of children were considered “eidetikers” if, after viewing the image, they could stare at the easel on which it was placed and, though it was no longer there, see it well enough to describe the image in accurate detail. When following the instructions, twelve out of 151 students were considered eidetikers due to their ability to describe the images as positives rather than negatives, their ability to reconstruct and describe the scenes with accuracy, and the length of time the image lasted. As Neisser explained, the children had to understand the difference between remembering the image and actually having it. In addition, he noted the vividness and detail evident in the eidetic children’s reports. Although the outcome resulted in the identification of only 8% of “eidetikers,” it was noted that the percentage of adults who could demonstrate this ability was virtually zero (Neisser, 1967:140).

Kubler identified the 11th century works of Ibn-al-Haytham (also known as Alhazen) as the first documented studies centered upon human “after-images.” The studies were, according to Kubler, published in Latin as *Optical Thesaurus* (1987:79). Kubler claims these visual effects have long been considered within the academic domains of physiology and psychology and not those of the social sciences or humanities. He does, however, note that many anthropologists have been required to become “historians of art” so that they could best understand the relevance of the visual arts to the culture under study (1987:78). Clearly, the study of eidetic processes may bear relevance to cognitive learning and recall, particularly when these contexts are considered within the study of enduring non-Western art forms including both modern and ancient petroglyphs which appear, often side-by-side, across the ancient pilgrimage routes of Hopi Tutskwa. As such, these images can be considered embedded points of reference or culturally significant monuments which may play key roles in traditional narrative contexts.

Significant visual replications which may be derived from eidetic mental processes may be the basis of imagery found in both petroglyphs and pictographs. As they are described within the Western archaeological community’s conventional terminology, these pecked markings are frequently identified as “meanders” and “concentric circles.” Increasing numbers of scientists specialising in the field of optics and the human mind have recently expressed interest in the connections evident between mental imagery and traditional arts. The potential role eidetic imagery may play in some cultural practices—including art—can, in fact, be verified through scientific methods. The companion website to his book by the same name, Spivey’s *How Art Made the World* (pbs.org, 2006), described experiments in which the effects of darkness on perception and mental imagery were identified as a potential source of “entoptics” which could be the original inspirations of pictographic imagery among early prehistoric peoples.
These recent studies inspire questions regarding the extent to which both “real” and metaphysical visual experiences take place across the landscape and the degree to which they are reflected within the land. These potentially related topics are further addressed in Chapter 10 in which “rock art” and shrines are identified as human-made “monuments” which may visually mark sacred space as those places associated with spiritual or metaphysical practice or even witchcraft.24

7.4 KATSINA SONGS, AUDITORY COGNITION AND ECHOIC MEMORY

Neisser places significant importance on the role auditory cognition plays in learning techniques relevant to mnemonic contexts. At its most basic, Neisser identifies language as a “medium for temporary storage” that serves as part of a larger cognitive system. Within this larger auditory system, Neisser describes the brief memory of sound, generally measured in seconds, that remains after it has first been heard. Because Neisser’s studies were conducted on non-Native students in the 1960s, the length of time echoic memory is sustained in an oracy-based culture was not recorded.

The concepts of both auditory and echoic memory are of particular import as they potentially relate to ritual chanting and Hopi song. Neisser notes that, while subjects cannot effectively remember a simple series of unrelated numbers, memory is increased when these numbers are organised within subjective groups (Neisser, 1967: 220). In Neisser’s studies, rhythmic pattern is identified as a single structural unit, which, when presented in a structured, repetitive form, “does not take up room in the memory span—on the contrary, it creates room in an active memory which otherwise would hardly exist” (Neisser, 1967:221). The use of repetitive patterns with symbolic meaning in textiles, pottery images, and murals could, therefore, represent a conscious effort to reinforce the connections between forms and symbolic meaning throughout the daily lives of numerous oracy-based cultures, including that of the Hopi.

Neisser’s studies have significant implications for many forms of oral compositions, many of which have suffered as a result of the loss of practitioners of these forms of culturally-fragile, intangible mnemonic “vessels.” Traditionally, katsina songs are believed to be works created by immortal beings which use the language of the archaic-era Hopi ancestors (Sekaquaptewa, Hill & Washburn, 2015:19). In their compilation of katsina songs, Sekaquaptewa, Hill, and Washburn translated 150 early recordings, frequently relying upon Emory Sekaquaptewa’s own memory of the works as they were originally performed. Some remained in his mind as complete works and others were remembered as

24 See Chapter 11, Section 11.3 on the physical effects of dreams and the possible connections with belief in “sorcery.”
simple unfinished fragments. The skill of recall Sekaquaptewa demonstrated
drew attention to the deep impressions the performances made on him from the
time he was a small child. The impact of repetition in oral composition gains
further momentum within performance contexts when the human body is used as
a means of “marking” rhythm through ritualised movement or dance.

7.5 KATSINOM, REPETITION, AND CYCLIC PHENOMENON

If events at two or more points in time resemble each other strongly, they must be
related or even “the same” and therefore returning. If the “same” events are seen
to return many times, the observers may conclude that time is cyclical rather than
linear (Barber & Barber, 2004).

Hopi mastery of mnemonic technique and cognitive theory is most evident to the
Western scholar as it relates to the katsina seasons, activities, iconography, and
performances which are of the utmost importance and are repeated annually.
Having perfected timekeeping through the practices of the village Sun Watcher,
the timing of each event is of crucial import to the ceremonial calendar. The
concepts and practices associated with katsinom, as they exist today, were not
evident in the Ancestral Puebloan culture. It is thought that this happened
following the abandonment of sites such as Mesa Verde in the Four Corners area
and the apparent relocation of the peoples southward towards the Rio Grande
Valley. The migration of peoples has not been studied within the “energy and
flow” contexts emphasised in Constructal Law theory (Bejan, 2012), but a basic
overview of the social and environmental situation would, of course, suggest
lands near the waterways located to the South became crucial to the “flow” of life
or resources around 1200 CE.

Katsina events, like the seasons, are timed by the movement of the Sun and the
cycles of nature as they regularly occur and reoccur within the Fourth World. The
katsinom themselves are concurrently spirit beings and clouds who appear for the
ceremonial cycle and then return to their current home on the San Francisco Peaks
near Flagstaff, Arizona. As previously stated, they are also the clouds that bring
the rain on which the Hopi (“People of the Short Blue Corn”) depend annually. As
such, the messages the katsinom bring and the timing of both their arrival and
departure are crucial to the continuation of agricultural calendric cycles and
activities.

The conceptualisation of the role these nature spirits play in the traditional
lifeways begins at a young age. Because it is a matrilineal culture, the cultivation
of the land relates directly to each family’s mother. The concepts associated with
both katsinom and the corn itself, which are metaphors for life, are first introduced
to young girls whose uncle creates a small, flat tihu, or very simple katsina “doll.”
Rather than a plaything, the gift is taken quite seriously, for it represents just a
small part of the culture’s commitment to the annual agricultural cycles and the
spirits who work on the people’s behalf. In later years, the child will take care of more complex three-dimensional works.

The repetitive annual cycles are themselves a mnemonic technique that assists the young in understanding the intricacies of the Hopi lifeway. General studies in the field of cognition concur that repetition is the key to memorisation. This is a characteristic that receives particular emphasis within the oral tradition. The repetition of katsina cycles is not the only use of this concept, however. The dances and chants that accompany the ceremonies and rituals are themselves often based on repetitive vocalisation and physical movement. While young people may not immediately grasp the intricacies of the Hopi ways and conception of the cosmos, the annual repetitions prepare them for doing so.

The katsinom’s brightly coloured regalia and unexpected behaviours also make a strong impression on the young. Similar to the Kuba children described in Chanda’s Ndop lesson plan (Chanda & Basinger, 2000), the complexity of some imagery and abstract associations means it may take years for children to learn the depths of their meaning. The mystery of the iconography on their clothing, instruments, and bodies could sustain their curiosity and interest throughout their lifetime. The katsina dances create excitement and maintain the curiosity and respect of the young on deeply cognitive levels. The rituals reoccur regularly per the agriculturally-based calendar. Because of the dancers’ unique imagery and the narrative concepts they embody, the Hopi katsina cult helps to maintain the longevity of the culture itself. These memorable practices also reinforce the people’s ties to the lands of their ancestors as well as the “footprints” they have left behind.

7.6 CONCLUSION

Indigenous understandings of self, landscape, and environment directly affect the arts produced by indigenous peoples, including those of the Hopi. Some cultures may not even consider their art as a separate aesthetic work, as in Western cultures, but as purposeful accoutrements to their cultures and being; the arts are a means by which people perceive themselves to exist in the world and carry out their responsibilities. These central, shared understandings of cognition, self, and culture are reflected in the broad aspects of art—physical art is an integral part of a people’s “story.” As such, it is not separate from the narrative arts and language.

While the traditions of oracy-based cultures have long been taught and maintained by repetition and other techniques which enhance cognitive processing, the implications of these levels of understanding were not fully articulated within the literature of the West until the late 20th century. It was at this time when the growing discipline of cognitive psychology led to the development of theories such as the aspects of self knowledge conceived of by Neisser. As these became signifiers of how the human mind learns, they continue to prove relevant in
cultural art history studies. Cognitive science provides explanations for why traditional learning such as that demonstrated through narrative, visual imagery, and ritual performance have had and continue to have a great impact on the ability of individuals within a culture to learn. Studies in non-Western arts demonstrate how significant practical or sacred knowledge becomes embedded within an individual’s concept of both personal and cultural self. As in the example of Hopi arts and traditions, each individual’s own perceptions and knowledge reflect multiple facets “self” which surround the cultural nucleus.
CHAPTER 8: ICONOLOGY, NARRATIVE CONTENT, AND \textit{EKPHRASIS} IN METAPHORICAL WORLDS

8.1 INTRODUCTION

This study has emphasised the concern that, to understand Hopi art, one needs to recognise the interweaving of story, imagery, and cognitive learning practices. Much of Hopi narrative, particularly as expressed in the Fourth World emergence, takes place in what Western academia would consider to be a “metaphysical” realm where, in most cases, these entities cannot be known or touched in a practical sense. Much like Greek, Roman, Norse, and other mythologies, the Hopi find practical ways to experience their story in forms of art or within natural features of the environment that are imbued with narrative cultural significance. This chapter discusses how iconology, narrative and \textit{ekphrasis} explain the transition from metaphysical to “real-world” art and imagery in Hopi culture.

8.2 METAPHYSICAL DIMENSIONS OF THE HOPI FOURTH WORLD: EMBEDDED LANDSCAPE

While the Western culture recognises Hopi lands as a specific geographical location, Hopi Tutskwa remains a mythological metaphysical space to the people themselves. As a result, some works of art must be viewed within the context of the metaphysical plane. Titiev (1937) describes the spiritual significance of both landscape and landmarks as they were revealed during a Hopi salt pilgrimage which took place in 1912. The three participants are identified as the chief, Talasvuyauoma, of the Coyote clan, Duwanimpiwa of the Sand clan, the “common man,” and the “novice,” Don Talayesva, who also narrated the story.

According to Titiev, the salt expedition took the men to a salt deposit located near the Grand Canyon\footnote{The Grand Canyon is also the area in which the Ongtupqa, or point of emergence is located.} which required them to cross dangerous terrain known to the Hopi as “The Land of the Dead.” The pilgrimage was a necessary part of the men’s Wuwuticim initiation ceremonies which were required of all salt gatherers. As Titiev explains, the Wuwuticim prepares men for the afterlife; thus, only initiates are able to access the mythic counterpart to the physical location. Far from being empty of cultural contexts, the salt itself was known to be in the care of the Little War Twins, Pukonghöya and Palungahöya, grandsons of Grandmother Spider (Sowuti). In addition, they are said to have installed shrines along the inauguration route.

First, each participant would make prayer feathers which would be placed in the mud at the site where the special clay used for the Soyal ceremony, a winter ceremony associated with the solstice, is found. Those who would participate in...
the Soyal ceremony were required to have the special clay. The clay, according to Titiev, was paid for by prayer-feathers which were said to be “for the kacinas, clouds, and the dead who live in the underworld and who own pavisa” (Titiev, 1937:245). In addition, the salt-gatherers themselves created prayer-feathers which served as markers on the road from which they set out but which also enlisted the help of the Sun who could protect them against the Land of the Dead’s evil spirits. Titiev notes that the head of the party placed one with the “breath line” facing the direction the group would take. In response to his pronouncement that the men would travel with “happy hearts,” the men stepped upon the marker with both feet and began the journey (Titiev, 1937:245).

Having prepared the land for their presence, the men soon encountered a “sacred spring” where offerings were deposited. Soon afterward, they approached a shrine identified as Pan’kuku (Mountain-sheep Feet) where they stopped to pray to the mountain sheep for power. The site is identified by Titiev as having been established by the War Twins. Titiev suggests that the marks which signify the “feet” are probably “fossilized footprints” (Titiev, 1937:245).

The next mythological “landmark” encountered is what Titiev identifies as Tutuveni (writing), a shrine where each man carved his clan symbol in the “rocky face of the shrine” where the image would again be created on each successive journey to the left of the first “signature” (Titiev, 1937:246).26

Far from being a natural backdrop for the pilgrims themselves, Titiev’s account continued to describe how the three pilgrims encountered each physical feature known to be part of the historic journey across the lands marked by the loci mythic War Twins. At one point, the group visited the cave of Masau’u (Maasaw) where the men traditionally either find that the deity has been grinding corn on a milling stone—a bad omen for the coming future—or has not. As was the case in the journey Titiev describes, Maasaw had not stored much for the winter, thus indicating that the Hopi would themselves have a good growing season with plenty of corn.

Titiev’s account of the journey recalled not only the men’s encounter with additional places known for deities and mythic events, it also described the first experiences of the War Twins themselves as if these accounts were proof of the cultural significance of the customary journey and associated rites. For example, it is said that it was the War Twins themselves who began the tradition of carving their symbols in the rocks at Tutuveni. It was they who created the course for the modern day salt pilgrims:

They ... hurried on till they came to Pau’kuku, where they paused long enough to establish a shrine. ‘Now we are about to make a new settlement at

26 For more on Tutuveni and clan petroglyphs, see Section 10.3.1 “Petroglyphs and the Conflation of Time” in this thesis.
Salt Canyon,’ they said, ‘and we are preparing the shrines that the Hopi will use when they come this way for salt’ (Titiev, 1937:257).

When Western archeologists visit the sites, they see the records of human interactions with the lands. However, to the Hopi, it is a landscape from which the identity of their own people cannot be separated. The additions of temporary shrines, prayer feathers and both ancient and modern petroglyphs document their constant interactions with the mythical beings who, since the emergence, remain embodied within the conflated physical and metaphysical Fourth World terrain.

8.3 EMBEDDED OBJECTS

Geertz and Lomatuway’ma (1987) describe a narrative which acknowledges the presence of forms of consciousness within embodied works, including three-dimensional objects, how the Silence Effect impacts traditional rituals as well as the roles played by sacred objects. The concept of “silence” is evident in the historical account of two works that were displaced as a result of terminated ritual activity.

A significant responsibility for Hopi clans is the preservation and care of ceremonial objects. Because the clans are dependent on male descendance, however, some clans eventually become extinct. In this event, the care and preservation of ritual objects becomes problematic. Geertz and Lomatuway’ma (1987) provide an account of the Sa’ Lakwmanawayt Dolls, two ceremonial dolls who belonged with a clan which was active at the town of Old Orayvi. The town itself was involved in a political dispute between traditionalists who rejected the possibility of accepting US governmental policies and the more accommodating “friendlies” at the newer location settlement of lower Orayvi (Kyakatsmovi). As a result of the split, the dolls’ clan became extinct. Having lost their role in clan ceremonies, the two were separated and initially stored apart.

And it was not yet four days, it was about three days when [he] came to us. He told us that the little girl he had taken was constantly crying. She would cry day after day; she would cry all night. He noticed this. He had thought of waiting at least four days before bringing it here. But he evidently could not last that long. Therefore, he wanted to bring her over. What he had experienced was not good. The poor thing was constantly crying! It is quite evident that they were not meant to be separated, and he should not have done that (Geertz & Lomatuway’ma, 1987:27).

Although separated from both their clan and each other, proper care was required for these culturally significant works. The puppets needed to be fed; thus, they were invited to meals, and it was assumed they would accept. In return, the dolls were said to share their knowledge with their hosts and were protective of them. Should negative people come to the door, for example, they were known to lock it. The puppets are the embodiments of cultural memory, memories of a turbulent
time in Hopi history through which the people endured, embraced and reinvented their new reality.

Puppets and reenactments are an integral aspect of Hopi spiritual practice. “The puppets are also used as ritual objects, and every time they are used in a performance, they must receive a new heart” (Geertz & Lomatuway’ma, 1987:37). Kiva performances take place in front of specifically-designed settings and tableaus. Titiev (1972, Figure 8.1) illustrates a screen for a Puppet Doll Dance of 1934 featuring Shalako Girl and Water Drinking girl who are integrated into the scene on either side of a germination deity, Muyingwa, who is centrally located behind a symbolic cornfield.

Figure 8.1. Screen for the 1934 Puppet-doll Dance at Hotevilla (1972).

8.4 METAPHOR AND MYTHOLINGUISTIC ANALYSIS

As a linguistic convention, by definition, metaphor may be associated with but concurrently surpass the boundaries of physicality. This runs contrary to the expectations of daily Western life in which there are, typically, minimal liminal or highly spiritual experiences. As a result, the need to differentiate the physical from linguistic metaphors or metaphysical experience occurs infrequently. In oracy based cultures, by contrast, metaphor is among the primary mytholinguistic tenets that inform forms of art ranging from narratives to architecture and ritual performances.

The arid landscape of the agrarian peoples is itself embedded with analogy and metaphor, particularly in how features relate to the promise of the covenant with Maasaw. Colours, for example, are orientational devices that are associated with six cardinal directions. In addition, each clan is associated with its unique experience of the Fourth World migration. The presence of Maasaw and ancient
time is embedded within the ancestral Fourth World. Evidence of promises made to Maasaw and the value of maintaining the covenant is usually portrayed through narrative analogy which scholars in the field of narrative and mytholinguistic analysis claim is central to the evolution of myth (Barber & Barber, 2004:15). It is a means of understanding the ecosystem and the relationship evident between nature and humankind. As illustrated by Barber and Barber’s “Analogy Principle,” natural elements and their narrative cultural contexts are merged within the Hopi concept of landscape—merged within the land of Maasaw—and the inherent symbolic harmonies implied.27

8.5 CONCLUSION

Like many indigenous cultures, the Hopi did not have an original written language until relatively recently in historical terms. The effort was initiated and developed later after Europeans arrived and set down what they thought they were hearing. More recently, the need to preserve the language through a Hopi dictionary project that was completed by the Hopi themselves. Because of the original oral tradition of the people, the Hopi take their understandings of the metaphysical and natural worlds, turn them into narrative and, as a reflection of those embodied meanings, create what Western art historians would call “art.”

When art historians can better understand how the Hopi emergence narrative influences cultural practices and their associated arts, the significance of using objects as external repositories of traditional knowledge becomes clear. While the Western discipline of art history has been slow to incorporate these perspectives into its own essentially *ekphrasis*-based practices to date, archaeologists and anthropologists have more readily acknowledged the roles objects, imagery, and assorted ritual practices play as both the repositories of traditional knowledge and the means by which these concepts are taught. When these intrinsic contexts and metaphors are identified through mytholinguistic analysis, the relationships evident between use, cultural knowledge, and the objects through which it is stored and shared can and should be incorporated into the Western practice of art history.

27 See Chapter 4, Section 9.3 for the full definition of the analogy principle.
CHAPTER 9: EMBEDDED EXOGRAPHIC EXPERIENCE

9.1 INTRODUCTION

Like books, visual and physical art forms store information that a culture finds useful or essential in some way. Because the Hopi are an oracy-based culture, their art forms are just that—containers of knowledge and culture. This puts the “knowledge” outside of the person. In its externalized form, knowledge may be embodied within an “exographic” object or what Western archaeologists may deem a “symbolic storage” device. As an important embodiment of cultural belief, these objects allow that knowledge to be passed on to others in both current and future generations. The object’s use represents the degree to which the knowledge is sacred. For example, an object may represent some private aspect of a clan’s ritual practices. While the clan itself may become extinct, the knowledge embodied within the art and its various features or intended uses remains. The key to understanding the intrinsic characteristics of a culture’s artforms, imagery, and practices can be found in the recognition and identification of narrative content. It may be discovered through studies of specific works and their intrinsic cultural meanings.

9.2 ART HISTORY: APPLICATIONS OF PANOFSKY’S ICONOLOGICAL THEORY TO HOPI TRADITIONAL ARTS

Chanda (1998) identifies Panofsky’s iconological methodologies as a plausible means by which the Western academic discipline of art history can be broadened to expand into areas of non-Western art analysis. Developing greater understanding of non-Western works is particularly important for those which have been created by oracy-based peoples whose traditional lifeways are threatened by the environmental, social, and economic concerns of the 21st century. In the following analyses of Hopi and Ancestral Puebloan art, this study employs Panofsky’s levels of iconological assessment as a means of identifying and interpreting significant cultural contexts. In some instances, the relevance of the findings is discovered in part by the narratives provided by modern-era artists or their descendents; in others, particularly when the direct descendants of a culture are gone, the plausible identification of intrinsic meanings in art and imagery remains a matter of conjecture. An assessment of art based upon Panofsky’s methodology is essentially a three-step process.

- Pre-iconographic Assessment

In modern archaeological, anthropological, and art history studies, the potential meaning of iconographic content evident in art can be explained through the process of interdisciplinary collaboration. In the case of assessing pre-historic era works, the oral traditions of the Ancestral Puebloan peoples (the ancestors of the
modern Hopi) remain preserved in some of today’s cultural narratives and are frequently revealed through the process of collaboration among scholars, contemporary practitioners of traditional lifeways, and indigenous artists. In addition to these approaches, the essential meanings behind some imagery or objects may be theorized using an earlier era’s documented studies, museum collections, and archived materials.

- **The identification of “conventional subject matter, constituting the world of images, stories, and allegories” (Panofsky, 1974:40-41)**

The second step in applying iconographic analysis to non-Western art while using Panofsky’s iconographic analysis is the identification of imagery with known conventional meanings. In her research, Chanda states that this may include subject matter found in texts as well as other significant cultural content. As such, it is necessary to have knowledge of “literary sources, themes, and concepts that appear in other art works of the same time and place” (Chanda, 1998). The current study adapts this stage of analysis to include the assessment of recorded and transcribed oral narratives or those written by modern Hopi peoples. Additional concurrence is found in traditional Hopi art forms including the collaborative translation of historic Katsina songs (Sekaquaptewa, Hill & Washburn, 2015).

- **The assessment of the work for intrinsic meaning or content, “constituting the world of symbolical values”**

The third phase of iconographic analysis relevant to non-Western art historical concepts is

the interpretation of underlying philosophical ideas expressed through the composition, motifs, images, stories, or allegories found during the iconographic state. It is the synthesis of the information found in the previous two steps (Chanda, 1998).

In accordance, this study draws upon not only source materials published by Hopi authors and literary collaborators such as Albert Yava, Don Taleyesva, Harold Courlander, and Lee Simmons but by contemporary Native Americans working within the Western academic disciplines of anthropology, archaeology, and ethnology, many of whom are actively involved in current studies within those fields (Anyon, 1999; Ferguson & Colwell-Chanthaphonh, 2006). By necessity, this study references narrative accounts employed by both modern and historic-era Western ethnographers. Further assessments of oral narratives are based upon the principles of analysis developed within the mid to late 20th century (Vansina 1985; Barber & Barber, 2004).
9.3 HOPI ARTS: EMBEDDED METAPHORS AND RITUAL PRACTICE

Metaphor is among the most significant aspects of Hopi art and imagery as it is the way to communicate both with and about the metaphysical beings, *katsinam*, who are said to be the dead taking the form of clouds. Important aspects of life, such as ceremonies associated with the coming of rain, take place upon the metaphysical cultural plane. These relationships are embedded within the culture’s mnemonic arts.

![Figure 9.1. Traditional Wedding Sash Detail (ca. 1980).](image)

From the conventional perspective, Hopi ceremonial and wedding sashes resemble those of other peoples whether used for practical or ritual purposes. In the Hopi culture, these woven works bear specific characteristics that have symbolic cultural meanings. For example, the Hopi rain sash, which is a simple form of the wedding sash (Figure 9.1), is woven of natural colored cotton with fringes emanating from “knobs” formed from corn husks that, according to Joe Ben Wheat,
symbolize clouds, denote the rain and are also associated with the idea of fertility, which ... is spatial, temporal and ‘dynamic’ in nature ... The weavers make use of a simple from to help control the main strands during this type of braiding, known as sprang in Europe and America (Wade & Evans, 1973).

Wade and Evans note that the Hopi stressed the importance of the sash representing a specific “cycle”:

Although it is usually worn with the ends hanging down on the wearer’s right side we were told that these two ends should be thought of as joined. Thus the sash properly forms one continuous garment in which representations of winter and summer, snow and the fertile earth lead into each other in a never-ending cycle (Wade & Evans, 1973:8).

While conducting research in 1968 for The Kachina Sash: A Native Model of the Hopi World (1973), Wade and Evans compiled ethnographic information during visits to the Hopi Reservation. The researchers interviewed 20 weavers, former and current who were available at that time as they sought to describe how sashes would give them insights into both “the nature of ‘Hopiness’ or of a specific kachina” (Wade & Evans, 1973:3). The authors noted that, at that time, the only previous studies done on sashes were written by Alexander M. Stephen in the 1890s while studying the Hopi of First Mesa. They found that the exact significance of some designs had been forgotten (Wade & Evans, 1973:4); thus, any previous mytholinguistic contexts that were conflated into some imagery had already been “silenced” through time (Wade & Evans, 1973:4). Despite this, the authors found that their own collected data matched that of Stephen who claimed that “[t]he larger design is a convention of the Broad Face Kachina mask.” The authors note that the markings are relevant to “guardian” kachinas that typically protect the Hopis. These include the Ogre, Guardian Fasing, or Whiper Kachinas (Wade & Evans, 1973:5). The zigzag is his teeth mark (tamáadveata); the lozenges are eye marks (boshevéadta); the hooks are called angular marks (házrüveadta); and the straight white lines in the black band are called, indifferently, Puukonveadta or Taiowa. The presence of additional bands of green or blue colour are said to represent markings associated with the faces or bodies of specific additional kachinas (Wade & Evans, 1973:6).

For ceremonial contexts relevant to clan ceremonials as well as society initiations, the sash and kilt together represent the Hopi world and its “various dimensions.” Hopi sources were consulted and are listed by name in the work’s appendix.

---

28The authors explain that a significant religious leader described an incident in which a group of Navajo attempted to breech the boundary lines between Hopi and Navajo territory but were frightened off by two Guardian Kachinas. It is said that the Navajos were frightened by the kachina’s teeth and equate that with the present-day “teeth” designs that are still incorporated into the bands of ceremonial sashes.
While the kiva mural image (see Figure 9.2) shows a ceremonial sash through its depiction of coloured designs and patterns on the edge, Figure 9.1 shows a wedding sash woven from cotton with small globes at the end of the fringe.

Sashes are made by today’s Hopi weavers, who are men, just as in the past. Ceremonial sashes include brocade and/or embroidered details, and because modern Hopi use commercial yarns and colours, these have been adapted as necessary (Wade & Evans, 1973:1). Typically, the sash is worn on the waist and serves as a belt that maintains the position of the ceremonial “kilt.” According to the authors, initiates into the clans or societies wear it differently with half wrapping the waist and the other half draped over the left shoulder. In each position, the designs are worn outward. In contrast, the sash was worn as a belt on the priests and kachina dancers with the identical white ends of each half joined.

The authors also expressed their concerns over their own Western perceptions and how these influenced their ability to understand the traditional Hopi sash imagery:

Another problem we constantly encountered was the conflict between our Western ideas on the nature of space and those of the Hopis. As Westerners, we tend to perceive reality as consisting of organised elements structured upon an unorganised or blank background. This is particularly true in the case of art. Our culture has taught us that a blank area is synonymous with being unfinished or part of the background setting. Thus it did not at first occur to us that the white portion of the sash would have any significance, and we did not inquire about it. We merely considered it to be an empty space. It was only when we were told that the red band (which we considered a “design”) was simply a boundary or separating device, that we decided to ask whether the solid white upper portion of the sash had any symbolic significance. This proved to be the turning point in our whole research ... Originally we considered the black portions to be merely background, and only later did we learn that they should be interpreted as clouds. From such examples it can be seen that the Hopis, unlike ourselves do not see the designs on the sash as consisting of primary and secondary elements ... on the ceremonial kachina kilt that is worn as one continuous wrap-around skirt ... the solid white portion represents the winter and the designed portion the summer with its fertility (Wade & Evans, 1973:11).

Hopi wedding sashes include long fringes and round three-dimensional balls which appear at both ends of the long, woven textile. As a culture which depends on land ownership, expertise in dry-land corn farming techniques, and the need for rain in the arid environment, the joining of a couple in marriage includes metaphorical references to procreation. Like that shown on Sand Altar Woman, each wedding sash has three-dimensional balls of cotton and yarn which symbolise rain clouds from which a long fringe “pours.” In contemporary terms, the sash itself is a “shorthand” version of one of the most essential cultural
metaphors which, consistent with both Metaphoric Reality contexts and the Silence Principle of mytholinguistic analysis, need no lengthy or recurring verbal explanation, as it is presumed to be known to all. Just as petroglyphs recall the emergence and subsequent migrations, imagery and material culture, objects such as wedding sashes serve as silent abbreviations of specific concepts or the broader narratives such as the *People of the Short Blue Corn* in which they are referenced.

**Silence Principle:** What everyone is expected to know already is not explained in so many words (Barber & Barber, 2004). Barber and Barber’s Silence Principle corresponds with the “hourglass” concept delineated by Vansina (1985) in how it explains the effects of a lack of continuity within the narrative tradition.

Both the commitment to prosperity and the natural forces through which it must be achieved are evident in the Awat’ovi imagery, particularly in how the spirit is shown with lightning, corn, and a sash that recalls rain and, as such, appears to water the desert earth (Figure 9.2). Representations of rain are also consistently represented on pottery (Figures 9.3, 9.4).

![Mural from Awatovi (2018)](image)
Figure 9.3. *Ancestral Puebloan mug with imagery associated with lightning and clouds* (2018).

Figure 9.4. (Left) *Ancestral Puebloan bowls with imagery associated with clouds raining, watershields, and germinating corn* (2012).

Figure 9.5. (Right) *Hopi Sio Humis Katsina “Doll” (Corn Standing in Rows God)* (Late 19th Century).
9.4 COLLECTIVE WILL AND INTRINSIC MEANING

The means by which art can represent the intrinsic knowledge of the whole culture is clearly demonstrated by the concept of Hopi prayer feathers. Kennard (1937) describes the use of “magical devices” by the Hopi which project “collective will” (1937:492). The word, Na’wakna, the author notes, has a variety of meanings including “to want,” “to pray,” and “to will” although he notes that it is not necessary to speak prayers aloud because “mere willing or transfer of the wish by means of the breath to a prayer stick or prayer meal has the same effect.” The essential idea seems to be that, by concentration, the collective will is projected so that the powers are compelled to comply. Should there be even one whose “heart is not good,” the efficacy of the whole is destroyed (Kennard, 1937:492).

In 1894, Alexander Stephen described how the smaller prayer sticks, created to convey specific prayers to deities, are made inside a Hopi kiva with specific measurements made from the Hopi artist’s own individual hand. For example, the longer prayer sticks are measured from the “outside of the elbow to the second joint of the thumb” (Stephen, 1894:624-625). Prayer feathers act as embedded extensions of the self. They may include imported or domesticated Scarlet Macaw feathers. In the case of eagle feathers, white symbolises the clouds, and dark ends represent rain. As in other embedded devices, prayer feathers are intended to bring about specific results or conditions, whether personal, interpersonal, cultural, or environmental. They are frequently used to bring about rain.
Oblivious to the spiritual or extended mind contexts relevant to the use of prayer feathers, the editors of Columbia University Contributions to Philosophy, Psychology and Education (1896) section titled Institutional and Religious Life make light of their use: “Prayers are offered by the Pueblos to their deities on every possible occasion ... For special occasions their prayers are more elaborate”
(Ludlow Luqueer, 1896:63). The work claims the feathers are placed on sticks before “rude altars” where the feathers are said to be “emblematic of thought winging its way to the one addressed” (Ludlow Luqueer, 1896:63). In actuality, the practice is neither frivolous nor sentimental. Prayer sticks and feathers are clearly embodied constructs—physical extensions of the makers themselves designed to transcend the limits of physicality and interact on purely metaphysical planes.

9.5 SIPAPU: VESSEL AS ITERATION OF EMERGENCE

Physics supports the connections evident between the physical world and recognisable patterns or analogies. The physical foundation of many cultural analogies and metaphors is directly addressed in Bejan’s (2012) Constructal Law: “For a finite size flow system to persist in time (to live), its configuration must evolve in such a way that provides easier access to the currents that flow through it” (Bejan, 2012:3). The correspondences evident between form and flow are most recognisable in the similarities between the vascular systems found within the human body, the similar structures of river deltas, and the fan-like veins of colour that form in stones such as quartz.

Seed jars, with their wide bases, low profiles, and characteristically wide, slightly raised central openings, are among the most recognisable forms of pottery associated with the Hopi and earlier Ancestral Puebloan cultures. Used to store dry seeds, maize (corn), or herbs in the arid climates of Hopi lands, the wide, flat upper plane of the vessels leaves the lower plane in darkness and is characteristically used as the surface on which traditional imagery is painted. The wide opening is consistently the most prominent feature of the form and, as such, it not only contributes to the dehydration process of the materials stored inside, it is a design element that is intentionally integrated into the compositional and mytholinguistically relevant motif.

Embodiments of source-to-point flow are evident in significant social constructs as well as in nature. They range from migration and trade routes to political hierarchies and familiar moieties. With its emphasis on matriarchal lineage and clan descendence, such combinations of momentum and spread would be mental constructs readily recognised in Hopi society and lie at the heart of life experience.

Seed jar designs frequently include the presence of a top horizon line and bird or feather-like forms reminiscent of birds and wings. The shape appears to channel the vessel’s contained interior “energy” upwards through the lidless opening in the way that a plant rises from the ground above a broad system of roots, or in how the first peoples climbed up to the Fourth World through the sipapuni located at the site of emergence once the way was led by a bird.
9.6 EMERGENCE: TOWER AS AXIS MUNDI

While the Hopi are a living culture, their ancient ancestors, the Ancestral Puebloans, lived within the Southwest following their northward migrations which, according to traditional oral narratives, were from what we now know as the Grand Canyon area. Among these early Puebloan sites is a settlement located on the Utah/Colorado border which was inhabited during the Pueblo III period which roughly corresponds to 1150-1300 CE. The site is now preserved and maintained by the National Park Service and known as Hovenweep National Monument. In the spring of 2010, Ruth M Van Dyke and Anthony G King published the results of a study of architectural configurations and features entitled, Connecting Worlds: Pueblo III Towers in the Northern San Juan.

Among the architectural features the Pueblo II period sites of this area are known for are highly visible towers, some of which are connected to kivas, the round subterranean structures that are believed to have been used—like those of the modern Puebloan people—for clan-related or ritual and ceremonial purposes; just as they are today. The tower structures are atypical for the people of this geographic region and era and have inspired much speculation as to their intended purpose. The era is known to have experienced difficulties, some of which may have inspired the abandonment of the area, including large sites such as the cliff dwellings at Measa Verde, for lands to the south. This southward movement—
most often still referred to as an “abandonment” within contemporary Western studies—is thought to have occurred around 1280 CE. In addition, Van Dyke and King cite multiple instances of violence that occurred within the area, including the destruction of the Castle Rock Pueblo known to have occurred between 1280 and 1285 CE and other acts of violence (Van Dyke & King, 2010:354-355). The unsettled social conditions have led the general public and many archaeologists to assume the towers were built for defence purposes, however, Van Dyke and King believe these structures were reflections of mythological contexts described in the mythology of the modern Puebloans who claim descendance. The emergence theme is shared within separate Puebloan peoples that include the Keres, Tewa, and Hopi. For example, Courlander and Yava’s (of Hopi-Tewa ancestry) rendering of the Hopi creation myth describes the Hopi’s ascent from the Third World which, by then, was plagued by a depletion of natural resources and troubles caused by powakas (sorcerers or witches) to the Fourth World (Courlander, 1987:20):

In the beginning, life in the Third World had been good. But because people succumbed to the evil unleashed by the powakas, things began to change. The cornstalks in the fields withered before the ears formed. The flowing rivers moved more sluggishly, and the springs dried up. Clouds drifted over the fields but did not release their rain. Squash and melon vines stopped growing, and sickness came into many houses (Courlander, 1987:19-20).
Referencing Puebloan emergence narratives, Van Dyke and King claim the unusual tower structures located within the Hovenweep area could have been built due to the perceived need to relocate to a higher level of the metaphorical universe (Van Dyke & King, 2010:351). In addition, Van Dyke and King identified multiple types of liminal portals, including *kivas* and areas of water, near the towers which, based on mythological contexts, are thought to have been linked to the world below (Van Dyke & King, 2010:351). The underground *kiva* structures, which are connected to towers at these sites, may be a symbolic reference to the emergence from the *sipapu* (the mythological opening through which people emerged to the world above). Because the *sipapu* is a feature common to all Ancestral Puebloan *kivas* located throughout the region, the significance of the
kivas with connecting tunnels and towers is that they experientially replicate an ascent from the sipapu to the kiva to the world above.

Various interpretations regarding the symbolic and physical experience of ascent these features afford can be made. In one case, petroglyphs of small humanoid footprints, each bearing four toes, are located next to the tower (Van Dyke & King, 2010:365). According to Fewkes, Maasaw was the Earth God and owner of the Hopi world, the surface of the earth and the Underworld beneath the earth (United States Bureau of Ethnology, 1898). It was the sound of his footsteps that encouraged the Hopi of the Third World to attempt to enter the Fourth World (Courlander, 1987:20).

At Twin Tower at Hovenweep, the northwest room of the west tower has human footprints moulded into the floor—a feature reminiscent of the muddy footprints left by Puebloans emerging from the underworld onto the “unripe” or soft earth (Winter, 1977:211). According to Pueblo emergence stories, people living in lower worlds were not yet fully human. At Horseshoe Tower, another boulder-top tower on the Hovenweep drainage, four-toed humanoid footprints are pecked into the bedrock (Van Dyke & King, 2010:364).

When experiencing these sites, the Puebloan peoples would have been re-experiencing the spiritual mythological narrative. Rather than a line of demarcation, the axis mundi point at which the sacred and profane spaces meet becomes, arguably, the participants themselves. Such a condition runs contrary to the tenets of language by which the dominant non-Native American culture lives, thus, it is a hypothesis not likely to occur to European Americans. The conventional means by which Western language implies space is addressed through positional prepositions, adjectives or verbs. In time, the West began commonly employing these words within non-physical contexts. Lakoff and Johnson (2003:14) describe the West’s “orientational” and “spatialization” metaphors which assign directional parallels to otherwise unrelated ideas and thereby organise “a whole system of concepts with respect to one another”. The terms are substantiated by an implied original “physical basis” to which these concepts would have originally applied:

CONSCIOUS IS UP; UNCONSCIOUS IS DOWN: Get up. Wake up. I’m up already. He rises early in the morning. He fell asleep. He dropped off to sleep. He’s under hypnosis. He sank into a coma. Physical basis: Humans and most other mammals sleep lying down and stand up when they awaken (Lakoff & Johnson, 2003:15).

Ironically, Whorf (1939) himself had the same observations, also relating the practice to the West’s objectification of nonspatial concepts which are then placed within “imaginary” space. The context is discussed in The Relation of Habitual Thought and Behavior to Language (Whorf, 1939): “This has gone so far that we can hardly refer to the simplest nonspatial situation without constant resort to physical metaphors. I ‘grasp’ the ‘thread’ of another's arguments ....”
9.7 WINDOW AS METAPHOR

The implication of Van Dyke and King’s (2010) work could be that re-enacting and re-experiencing the metaphysical journey from one world to the next could be a “real” daily part of life. In Patterson et al.’s (1994) *Hopi Pottery Symbols*, an unpublished manuscript originally written in 1890, Alexander Macgregor Stephens refers to one unusual geometric shape found on a vessel associated with the salt ceremony as a “Sky Window” (Patterson et al., 1994:70-1). The concept is also evident in Courlander’s *The Fourth World of the Hopis* (1987) which was accessed through an “opening in the sky” that a succession of birds—each brought to life from clay—flew through in their attempts to reach the newer, better world above (Courlander, 1987:21-22). Such terminology applied to geometrically-shaped windows may also suggest another metaphysical connection between Puebloan architecture, narrative-based liminal experience, and the experience of physical/spiritual transcendence (Patterson et al., 1994).

Vansina’s studies of keyhole windows integrated into Ethiopian churches describe the differing perceptions of members of a culture, “emic” in anthropological terms, and outsiders, considered “etic,” which themselves serve as a memorable metaphor shared by Ancestral Puebloan builders at locations such as Mesa Verde:

The keyhole windows in monolithic Ethiopian churches make no immediate sense to the Western eye, yet they represent the opening of an arched window with pediment and corbelling. The Ethiopians did not “see” the arches, corbels, pillars and bases around the window, but they saw the space delimited by them as a unit. To the Western viewers, the effect is rather as if the background had become the motif, and the real motifs the background. In the rock-hewn churches, the shape of the space was reproduced: that is, the keyhole shape (Vansina, 1999:103).
Geertz and Lomatuway’ma (1987:137) describe an alternative explanation for the architectural features often called “T-shape doorways” which, according to one Hopi adviser, share an analogous relationship with the shape of a man’s head with hair cut in the traditional Hopi style (blunt bangs and hair on sides falling between chin and neck), and a cross-sectional view of the interior of a traditional ceremonial kiva. Anyon (1999:40) explains how the T-shape represents the embodiment of Maasaw who instructed the people to integrate his symbolic image into their structures as a symbol of their completed migrations. As such, these architectural forms and other arts are both a reflection and reminder of the covenant the Hopi have with Maasaw to “live as peaceful and humble farmers respectful of the land and its resources” (The Hopi Tribe, 2018) as already quoted. T-shape doorways are also a common feature of Ancestral Puebloan structures such as Spruce Tree House located at what is now Mesa Verde National Park, located in the state of Colorado.

In its broadest sense within oracy-based cultures, the axis mundi need not be attributed to one work of imbued communal architecture in which space is captured and worldview is shared though it may be framed and highlighted through art. Russell and Wright (2009:45) describe how the Hopi vision of the natural physical world is alive with the omnipresence of Maasaw, to whom the
emerging peoples promised to leave “footprints” across their lands. As the authors state, the people were “scattered to the winds as various clans”, but not before Maasaw set forth the provision that, wherever the Hopi went, they were to leave “footprints” in the form of petroglyphs, ruins and artifacts. Among the mysteries evident at sites, such as the Ancestral Puebloan cliff dwellings at Mesa Verde National Park, is the question of why the sites, complete with possessions, were seemingly “abandoned”, leaving art and artifacts in situ. Within this potential context, the structures and belongings not only please Maasaw but provide ample data for Western archaeologists to better understand past eras through their own scientific means:

While they did not develop a writing system, they left behind rich archaeological remains that, along with oral stories passed down through the ages, have inspired researchers to ‘reconstruct’ their lives (Jarus, 2017).

The process of exiting the underground ceremonial kivas represents the emergence, thus they are spiritual places where some sacred rituals are performed, and specific sacred objects or devices are made and sometimes kept there. As Eggan states (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:240), the Hopi conceptual universe is not “delimited” by traditional Western concepts of time and space. Human physicality also plays a role in the making and usage of prayer sticks. Just as the experience of entering and exiting the kiva has spiritual significance, the process of creating works within it adds an element of spirituality and communion to the process.

9.8 CONCLUSION

Physical art forms may be viewed as the embodied soul of a people and their culture. That is why many cultures consider certain art sacred. As is common with indigenous cultures, it is to be shared mostly with their own people—those who share an understanding of the iconological or symbolic meanings of the visual lexicon. In contrast, Western art is often used to convince others to join them in their beliefs, such as the religious art of the Roman Catholic Church which conveys cultural messages through paintings, frescoes, and traditional statuary. While originally, Hopi art would have been meant primarily for “internal” or, in anthropological terms, “emic” use, the Hopi, as with most of the Southwestern peoples, have, however, adapted some forms for the tourist trade. An infusion of Europeans and then European-Americans, especially as tourists, drawn to the US Southwest by new railroad systems, helped turn some modified arts into collectable works meant to hang on the walls and display cases of European-American collectors. However, traditional Hopi arts and those of their

29 Quoting Varien (1999:210), Anyon notes that Ancestral Puebloan “places” were not “abandoned” in the negative sense of the word and “remain a part of the social landscape today.”
ancient Puebloan ancestors remain a valuable source for understanding the cultural beliefs and spiritual lifeways of the people.

Through mytholinguistic analysis, too, new dimensions of meaning within Hopi art forms become apparent to Western academicians. In particular, the ways in which art and architectural features reiterate the people’s origin myth—The Fourth World of the Hopi—through metaphor and ritual reenactment, may be identified as characteristic features of art’s role in the “symbolic storage.” When art functions as symbolic storage, it conflates and “codes” and preserves important cultural traditions and concepts in “exographic” forms. In studies conducted by Western art historians, these embodied forms and the contexts coded within are aspects of intrinsic meaning including those reiterated in cultural narratives. In turn, these important images, iterations, or metaphors can be hypothetically identified and potentially understood using Panofsky’s iconological and iconographic methodologies.
CHAPTER 10: ORACY-BASED EKPHRASIS IN EXOGRAPHIC HOPI ARTS

10.1 INTRODUCTION

Many visual works of the Hopi people may be viewed as conceptual or oracy-based reiterations of the memorised cultural narrative. These narratives, including that of the Fourth World and the “people of the short blue corn” (Corn Lifeway), are embedded within the minds of the Hopi through the cognitive levels on which their art’s characteristics function. These characteristics include the use of repetition, colour, and dramatisation as evident within the performances of the katsinam. In addition, the cultural messages may be conveyed through the visual or physical characteristics of an embedded exographic object or a specific mnemonic device.

10.2 THE EMBODIMENT OF IDEAS

Vansina’s *Oral Tradition as History* (1985) describes the tradition of oral history as a “vast pool” that is “essential to the continuity of culture and the reproduction of society from generation to generation” (Vansina, 1985:147). He also acknowledges the “fleeting” characteristics of the medium which “dwell only in the minds of people” (1985:xii):

> The utterance is transitory, but the memories are not ... Whether memory changes or not, culture is reproduced by remembrance put into words and deeds. The mind through memory carries culture from generation to generation (Vansina, 1985:xii).

Prefaced by an Akan proverb from Ghana—“Ancient things remain in the ear”—Vansina’s early works begin to fully articulate the significance of oral histories and the mytholinguistic content evident in culture-specific oral traditions. In a description of a Burundi narrator performing historical accounts for a listening circle, he suggests the speaker’s quiet, subdued, and dignified voice “painted landscapes, persons, actions, and emotions all in words rather than in gesture or intonation” (Vansina, 1985:35). This is an example of the modern West’s use of metaphor which assumes literacy. When separated from the written words, however, the same can be said to be true: the arts of peoples from nonliterate cultures do serve as the mnemonic repositories of myth, proverb, and visual embodiments of concepts that preserve and perpetuate indigenous knowledge. These perpetuations can take the form of objects, rituals, and images that reflect the intrinsic meaning of the original narrative. While searching for the intrinsic meaning of imagery, therefore, it is necessary to seek out its illustrative or metaphorical references to narrative. The process of mytholinguistic analysis lends itself to both the analysis of traditional oral narratives and the reflections of those contexts reiterated visually through the arts. While academicians
consistently produce “bodies of work” which reference the significance of myth in non-literate cultures, the people of the cultures themselves continue to rely on storytelling traditions or collaborators from literate cultures to assist in their written documentation of a ‘body’ of work. McChesney and Charley (2011) challenge this notion, claiming: ‘body’ is a multivalent term.

On the one hand, it refers to a corpus of knowledge in the Western academic tradition. Dictionary definitions imply death or an un-animated entity, as in ‘all the writings of a particular kind or on a particular subject.’ This meaning appropriately refers to formally inscribed discourses about Hopi pottery. This body refers to the authoritative canon that sets the rules or standards for evaluating aesthetic and other dimensions of objects categorized as art. On the other hand, “body” refers to a living tradition for pottery’s practitioners, knowledge that becomes animated through human interactions and engagement in specific culturally configured contexts. This ‘body’ refers to the social body of a Hopi pot and its cultural construction, the manifestation and instantiation of particular kinds of knowledge, values, and beliefs ... As the embodiment of ideas, pots are considered to be articulating subjects, not objects (McChesney & Charley, 2011:22).

As “articulating subjects” and the “embodiment of ideas,” the cultural narratives and philosophical concepts embodied within the arts require a culture’s intrinsic knowledge of a shared worldview and the imagery used to remember, convey, and store the traditions for future generations. Vansina (1985:44) considers music, landscape, and objects to be “mnemotechnic devices” which, because of their dependence on human recall, can yield new information, unlike data recorded in writing. Scholars, particularly those whose own culture lies outside the culture of emphasis, may ascertain embedded narrative content with some degree of accuracy through mytholinguistic analysis whether it is conveyed through contemporary or historical sources.

Barber and Barber (2004) provide a system of concepts through which the mythic content of embodied works can be ascertained. Originally intended for the analysis of oral narratives, multiple concepts serve the visual arts equally well. When these criteria are applied to visual arts in tandem with an understanding of key cultural narratives—to include mythology, personal accounts, and ethnographic documentation—the multidisciplinary process reveals significant primary, secondary, and “intrinsic” meaning that may be identified within the visual arts with some degree of probability, if not certainty.

When assessing the mytholinguistic content of specific works of art, relevant social, cultural, and environmental conditions must be considered. The work is, by necessity, interdisciplinary. In studies of the Hopi people, for example, the scholar may draw upon traditional perspectives provided by the members of the culture themselves, as well as studies from archaeological, anthropological, ethnological, and art history sources. In turn, analyses of the arts of their
ancestors, the Ancestral Puebloan people, may be plausibly based upon the scholarship written by or on the Hopi and/or any additional modern people who claim descendance. In this study, Barber and Barber provide the guidelines for mytholinguistic analysis of the narrative content relevant to site-specific art and imagery pertaining to the Ancestral Puebloan and Hopi culture including the emergence narrative, the Corn Lifeway, and Flower World. As some aspects of these topics may lead to the distant past through visual and mytholinguistic connections with Mesoamerica, contexts relevant to the more recent past, including the influence of the West, are also considered through the perspective of “deconstructing” later influences rather than the more commonly utilised “restructuring” principle.

10.3 THE EMERGENCE: HOPI AND ANCESTRAL PUEBLOAN PORTALS TO THE UNDERWORLD

After the Emergence into the Fourth World, the clans that would one day comprise the Hopi people approached the Guardian Spirit, Masaw, in the region that is now northwest Arizona and asked his permission to settle there. Masaw recognized that the clan people’s former life, which they knew was not bringing them happiness, had been given over to ambition, greed, and social competition. He looked into their hearts and saw that these qualities remained, and so he had his doubts that the people could follow the way. “Whether you can stay here is up to you,” he told them.

Masaw warned the clan people that the life he had to offer them was very different from what they had before. To show them that life, Masaw gave the people a planting stick, a bag of seeds, and a gourd of water. He handed them a small ear of blue corn and told them, “Here is my life and my spirit. This is what I have to give you” (Wall & Masayesva, 2004:435-436).

Schaafsma (2009) published an extensive description of The Cave in the Kiva: The Kiva Niche and Painted Walls in the Rio Grande Valley which appeared in the October issue of American Antiquity, published by the Cambridge University Press. The article is of specific interest to art historians because the method of analysis used combines Panofsky’s concepts of conventional, secondary and intrinsic meanings under the umbrella of anthropologist, Victor Turner’s (1967) concept of “nuclear symbols.” Unlike Panofsky, Turner associates the contexts of visual imagery created by oracy-based peoples with components in English sentence structure as if the proper arrangement of images contributes to the success of the message. Schaafsma refers to Turner’s observations of the concept, “the nuclear symbol is nearly always found in regular association with other symbols, which, like adjectives in language, qualify or extend its meaning” (Turner, 1967:52; Schaafsma 2009). To further explain a cognitive connection between visual imagery and visual “literacy,” Turner continues:
The greater the symbol, the simpler its form. A simple form is capable of supplying associative links of a very generalized character; it displays a feature or features which it shares, literally or analogically, with a wide variety of phenomenon and ideas. Thus the whiteness of *mpemba* clay recalls the whiteness of milk and of cassava meal and, more than these, such abstract ideas as *freedom from* impurity, goodness ... etc. (Turner, 1967:56; Schaafsma 2009).

Schaafsma frequently alludes to mytholinguistic content or imagery yet avoids connecting specific forms to narrative in her analyses. For example, the thesis of her article focuses on the possible emphasis on emergence symbolism in *kiva* mural imagery as well as that of rain which is essential to the successful perpetuation of Corn Lifeway traditions. References to the Corn Lifeway may therefore be depicted in visual imagery, ritual practices, or referenced in an auditory form such as in the sound of a gourd rattle which imitates showers. Again, however, the perspective veers from an emphasis on either mytholinguistic or art historical content despite using the disciplines’ specific terminologies in such passages as:

**The niche paintings, along with the niche itself, incorporate ambiguity and conflation. They simultaneously allow for diverse and hence more powerful evocations of meaning, to communicate the precepts of Pueblo worldview to the initiated. Emerging from this study is recognition of the fundamental significance in Pueblo iconography ...** (Schaafsma, 2009).

While the comment appears to presage a knowledge of how imagery may function as an “adjective,” there is no mention of the potential narrative or “mythological” contexts consistent with Turner’s suggestion that the “nuclear ritual symbol” can both synthesise and focus meaning (Schaafsma, 2009). Mytholinguistic content, central to the scientific study, rises again when the author focuses on the wall niches which are compared to entries to the underworld, similar to the “sun’s house” as envisioned as a cave where “the sun sets and rises as it begins and ends its nightly journey to the underworld.” The author describes caves where offerings are made because of the essential role both the sun and rain play in agriculture.

Additional conclusions are drawn regarding the possible connections between the imagery and narrative albeit within the framework of archaeological discourse. Describing the practice of the Hopi placing jars in corn fields to attract rain, Schaafsma explains that they are known as “*sipapu*” as if representing the emergence (Schaafsma, 2009:684).

Connections are made to the belief that, for the Mesoamerican Maya peoples, offering bowls were considered to be world centres as well as conduits between worlds. The presence of macaws, parrots from the area of Mesoamerica, is observed as well, as are the potential connections between the stepped terrace clouds and the Mexican “*altepetl*” or “water mountain”. In keeping with the limited acknowledgement of the narrative content to which the imagery may
relate, the article concludes with further allusions to the images that are relevant to cosmological belief, yet the author is careful to emphasise descriptions of physical objects, imagery, and spatial relationships as would be consistent with a scientific study rather than one associated with the humanities. The meaning of the imagery is acknowledged to have been probably known to all. As the effects of the mytholinguistic concept of “silence” makes it possible to abbreviate meaning through form; however, in oracy-based traditions, this is because the meaning remains held in the minds of the participants and in each object’s or feature’s role in the story. As a scientific survey of images and forms separated from the mnemonic tradition, the emphasis is primarily on inventory with a few exceptions, the study remains void of the narrative threads—yet to be rediscovered—which once gave it meaning.

Within the constraints of anthropology, several relevant symbols are identified, though not placed into context, through a survey of potentially relevant ethnographic narrative materials. “Nuclear” images are identified as the “stepped cloud and niche.” In addition, the wall niches “assume the meaning of a portal or passageway to a supernatural underground realm within a ritually controlled space. While the spatial relationships of objects are of import, the relational connections between the mnemonic imagery of the narrative receive considerably less attention. This leaves the reader questioning how much longer the significant cultural and narrative contexts that art historians, familiar with non-Western narrative mnemonic traditions, would have addressed will remain distanced from their original oracy-based tradition. Rather than bringing the relevant content closer to resolution, Turner’s comments appear to forge a wedge between oral narrative and those more complex literacy-based Western cultures to whom a non-Western people’s need for “adjectives” forms the basis of another Western theory.

10.4 HOPI MIGRATIONS AND MESOAMERICAN FLOWER WORLD ICONOGRAPHY

10.4.1 Migrations: Petroglyphs and the Conflation of Time

To test the strength and character of the clans, Masaw instructed them to travel in the four directions, to make their way in a difficult world and face the hardships that would determine whether they might come back and follow the life he offered to them. He told the clan people that at some point he would signal them that it was time to return.

Thus began the Migration Period, marked now throughout the Southwest and beyond by stone ruins and other structures, by petroglyphs and pictographs, and on a more subtle level by the spirits of the people who lived and died along the way (Wall & Masayesva, 2004:439).

The Hopi reference a place of origin known as Palatkwapi which Mindeleff (1891) translated as “Red Land of the South,” but its exact physical location,
should there have really been one, remains a mystery. Attempts to definitively associate it with any specific sites such as Hohokom have been, to date, unsuccessful. Both Bernardini and fellow archaeologist TJ Ferguson suggest that *Palatkwapi* may be an epoch in time rather than a physical location (Bernardini, 2005). Courlander’s unnamed collaborators (1972, 1987) state that the original people of Palatkwapi were known as the Patki (dwelling-on-water) who arrived from across a vast sea on houseboats but whose bad behaviour brought on the wrath of Balolokong, the great water serpent and snake deity who ultimately destroyed the village (Courlander, 1987:56). Although its mythical contexts suggest that those who remained were the victims of natural disasters, the footsteps of those who moved on may yet be apparent.

![Figure 10.1. Hopi Red Ant Clan Petroglyphs at Tutuveni (Sa).](image)

The ancestors of the Hopi, the *Hisatsinom*, left petroglyphs along their migration routes, and through them, efforts have been made to estimate the site of this mythical location (Figure 10.1). They were instructed to leave their “footprints” on their journeys by Maasaw, who permitted them to stay after the Emergence. Recent petroglyph studies conducted by Russell and Wright (2009) and Bernardini (2005) suggest that the lands of *Palatkwapi* may, in fact, be located near Perry Mesa, within regions of Arizona’s Little Colorado River as evidenced by the pictorial records of the early migrations. The problems of following the ancient footsteps are compounded, according to Russell and Wright (2009), by traditional narrative’s lack of specific definition:

> Hopi clan histories do not describe migrations in the classical sense of finite episodes of resolute movement across the landscape along a predetermined
route to a geolocated destination. Rather, they are multi-generational accountings of where groups lived and what they did between emergence and reunion.

Many of the earliest clans are now extinct—their specific history and rites lost to time. The narratives of each clan are exclusive. These are preserved through traditional means: oracy, ritual, and ceremonial or metaphorical objects. While the material objects and symbols particular to a clan may survive extinction, the contexts that show significant meaning are no longer evident. The “silence” that follows results in a vacuum that surrounds imagery and artifacts that are specifically clan related or any element of culture that falls out of use. In mytholinguistic analysis, such lack of continuity is explained by the principle of silence:

When all accumulated wisdom must be stored in the brain and transmitted orally (as in a nonliterate society), people reserve the formal oral tradition for transmitting the information they consider most important, often for survival (Barber & Barber, 2004:5).

In the Hopi narratives, the silence associated with absent clans echoes and reverberates through to the present. As each clan is a keeper of history, Vansina equates the “silence” to a lack of narrative continuity—an “hourglass” effect:

Structuring is recognized when definite patterns appear in the subcorpus. One which exists nearly everywhere is the existence of a “floating gap.” There are many accounts for very recent times, tapering off as one goes farther back until one reaches times of origin for which, once again, there are many accounts. This profile has been compared to an hourglass. At the junction of times of origin and the very sparse subsequent records, there usually is a chronological gap. It is called “floating” because over time it tends to advance towards the present, that is, the oldest accounts of later times tend to be forgotten or else amalgamated with later or earlier materials (Vansina, 1985:168-169).

10.4.2 Migration of Culture: Palatkwapi, Flower World, and Mesoamerican Influence

Linguistic anthropologist Jane Hill’s (1992) studies of the Mesoamerican Flower World complex elaborate upon concepts described in Evers and Molina’s 1987 collection of Sonoran Yaqui deer songs. The narrative content of songs is meaningful within the context of mytholinguistic analysis because, among the modern Hopi, it has been identified as an important form in which to store navoti ((Zendo & Stoffle, 1995:81). As in the deer songs, Hill identifies an iconological emphasis upon the “Flower World” which is both referred to in Uto-Aztecan languages and presented visually in the art and architecture of Mesoamerica. Similarly, visual representations of the Flower World complex have been identified in specific sites located within the American Southwest. As described
by Evers & Molina, the Flower World is a cosmological concept in which flowers, fertility and life exist in a metaphysical parallel universe built upon three intertwined anias or “worlds: sea (flower), yo (ancient or enchanted), and huya (wilderness).

Located in the east, in a place “beneath the dawn,” the sea ania, flower world, is described as a perfected mirror image of all the beauty of the natural world of the Sonoran desert. It is filled with flowers, water, and natural abundance of all kinds. And it is home to the prototypical insects, birds, and animals of the Sonoran desert as well. Chief among these is the deer known to Yaquis as malichi or saila maso. There may be many deer in the sea ania, but only one is named in the stories and in the deer songs. During a pahko, the deer dancer takes on the spirit of that deer, giving him physical form even as the deer singers describe him with words and bring his voice from the sea ania through the deer songs. (Evers & Molina 1987:47)

The concept of Flower World was described by Hill (1992) as Southwestern and Mesoamerican cultural imagery “where flowers stand for the life force” and, as a result of which, specific beings and material objects are described as “flowery.” Hill explains how the visual and metaphorical references to Flower World are associated with locations spanning from 12th century Mimbres mortuary objects, wooden ritual works created from wood associated with both the Mimbres and Chaco Canyon regions, 13th century Kayenta Anasazi culture, and 15th century kiva murals of the Hopi and Rio Grande Puebloan cultures (Hays-Gilpin & Hill, 1999). The cultural complex is also significant within the cultural region, as, according to Hays-Gilpin and Hill (1999), it may have been both the predecessor and impetus for the development of later 12th century Puebloan katsina beliefs.

While Hays-Gilpin and Hill (1999) were not able to ascertain a specific single overriding Flower World narrative within the specific regions studied inside the Southwestern United States, they concurred with Evers and Molina in the identification of “song” as the primary means by which Flower World concepts were transmitted. Prior to that time, Western archaeologists generally ascribed to Sapir’s 1910 assumption that song forms or “recitatives” were merely used as punctuative aspects of narrative associated with winter-season performances (Hays-Gilpin & Hill, 1999:2). Further mytholinguistic analyses done within the parameters of archaeological practice led Hays Gilpin & Hill to the identification of significant iconographic imagery specific to the Flower World complex that were evident within both Mesoamerica sites and those located farther north within the American Southwest. These findings resulted in the following determinations:

1. The “Flower World” is the spirit land, the land where the dead go, and the land where living beings have their spiritual dimension.

2. The spirit land is a beautiful chromatic world that includes not only flowers but also colorful birds, butterflies, and rainbows.
3. The spiritual dimension of living beings and ritual objects can be evoked by associating them with flowers.

4. Flowers are metaphors for the soul and the heart.

5. Flowers are associated with fire.

6. While flowers are associated with female beauty and fertility throughout the Americas, as well as in most of the rest of the world, the Flower World complex specifically is often associated with male ritual practice (as in the Kachina religion) or male domains (such as Aztec warfare and Yaqui and Piman hunting) (Hays-Gilpin & Hill, 1999:55:1-2).

In the absence of a unique thematic narrative to which Flower World imagery related, Hays-Gilpin and Hill’s (1999) work emphasized the semiotic connections between imagery and metaphor, suggesting these relevant views of the natural world were generally portrayed in ephemera—songs and poems—rather than stored in dimensional object form. For example, a quote attributed to Hays-Gilpin (Hays-Gilpin, Sekaquaptewa & Newsome, 2010:122-125) explains how one Flower World concept, “water-flower-wings” refers to the concept of fluttering butterflies. The authors explain that the butterfly is an allegory specific to the iridescent Flower World located within “the land that shines forth” (2010:122-125). In subsequent years, additional studies comparing Mesoamerican and Southwestern Ancestral Puebloan archaeological sites and artifacts identified numerous consistently relevant themes. While the connections evident between the iconography of the two regions remain under active study, the most obvious visual references to the metaphysical complex have been found in Mesoamerican sites where Teotihuacan mural imagery of “flowery paradises, including multiple representations of flowering trees, birds, butterflies, many symbols of water, and images of divinities” appear on wall paintings (Hays-Gilpin & Hill, 1999:16).

Possible connections between the layered cosmology portrayed in both the Mimbres’ oral tradition and that of the Hopi Emergence Story (Hays-Gilpin & Hill, 1999:18) have been established by favourable comparisons of narrative contexts. The authors note that the presence of a parallel Flower World existing concurrently with this can be supported within the contexts of historical Puebloan cosmology. Explaining that the concept of a layered universe is shared by both Mesoamerican and Southwestern narrative traditions. They note further:

For example, the Hopi Emergence Story details passage of the people from successive lower to upper worlds. As each world nears destruction due to evil deeds, the people must find an opening in the sky through which they can pass to the surface of the next world. The Old World/Underworld then

30 The Mimbres were a prehistoric people associated with classic Mogollon culture living in what is now the southwestern state of New Mexico. They are thought to have primarily lived near the Mimbres River which is located in the Gila Mountains.

More recently, in a study of sites located on the Colorado Plateau within the Pureco and Little Colorado River watersheds, Jones and Drover (2017) expand their semiotic approach to include mytholinguistic concepts which, through imagery, may provide further relevant contexts from which to analyse the Flower World iconography. Referencing Taube (2010:84), the authors explain an image depicting how a “moist wind, or breath is exhaled from a cave into an environment of falling rain, and sprouting corn ... the breath depicted as a quatrefoil flower” (Jones & Drover, 2017:6). Using the “Flower World” imagery as the central focus of the study, the authors identify relevant comparisons between prehistoric-era petroglyphs which may imply connections to concepts of self and that of emergence. Among those discussed is the Hopi germination spirit who lives in an underworld with the deceased. The work includes a reference to archaeologist, Mindeleff (1891:17), who claimed that it is at “Muy’igwa’s command, or hand that the germ/spirit/life-spark of all living things are made and sent through the si’papu into the human world.”

Jones and Drover claim connections between Hopi altars and Flower Mounds created from sand, corn meal and corn pollen (Fewkes, 1892). The authors note that each mound has a feather set atop which is called a “hikwisi” which, according to both Fewkes (1892) and Taube (2010), represents the life force or “hi’ksi” spilling from its chest (Jones & Drover, 2017:38).

While the thesis posits the relationships apparent between imagery and the broader “Flower World” concepts (Hayes-Gilpin & Hill, 1999), the use of iconological methodologies augmented with mytholinguistic analysis may support the theory that the Hopi migrations took the people as far south as Mesoamerica. In a detailed assessment of imagery, the process and implications of conflation are explained more broadly. Unlike the earlier studies published by Hays-Gilpin and Hill (1999), Jones and Drover (2017) employ mytholinguistic analysis within their narrative-based research. Here, they identify possible evidence of “conflation” as it relates to less detailed imagery and its potential references to the much broader “Flower World” theme:

Regarding Flower World concepts in early Puebloan petroglyphs from the southern Colorado Plateau, it should be noted that while flowers are the dominate symbol of the Flower World complex, in Hopi perspective, flower images need not be drawn in a biologically correct manner. As synecdoche images, generalized, or conflated circular forms may be used to represent all
flowers. A dot is placed in their centers ... representing a seed, germ, or life-
spark to symbolize their essence, or potential to become flowers.

As a result, the more limited study goes beyond Jones and Drover’s (2017) mere
description to encourage a deeper understanding of how the narrative references
change over time. While there is a need for basic descriptions, identifications, and
measurements in the Western sciences, there is also a need to perceive sites
associated with ancient peoples as the less quantifiable but equally essential
“footprints” relative to both time and space that the Hopi claim these to be.
Rather than focus on the “linguistic,” or anthropological practices of “other
cultures,” a more inclusive cross-cultural awareness is encouraged by bringing
“mytholinguistic” concepts and “oracy-based intrinsic knowledge” to the Western
archaeologist’s or anthropologist’s “table.”

10.5 HOPI CORN LIFEWAY

During their journeys the clan people relied on corn as a primary means of
survival. The varieties of corn they carried and cultivated were uniquely
suited to the harsh, unforgiving environment in which they would eventually
settle. During their travels they learned how to plant, cultivate, and protect
the corn, how to use carefully developed techniques to sustain the plants, to
channel water and discourage pests. Along with these things they learned
precise methods of prayer and ceremony to ensure a harvest that might mean
the difference between survival and starvation. No one can fathom the
hardships they faced or which clans were left behind; those who were unable
to embrace Masaw’s way probably did not survive (Wall & Masayesva,

While many objects and images are devoted to the cultivation of corn in the arid
Hopi mesas, another significant context, that of the “Corn Lifeway,” is present
within Ancestral Puebloan archaeological sites and is thought to represent the
influence of early Mesoamerican contacts. The visual contexts related to the
tradition and practices have been studied within the field of archaeology. Due to
the significance of the shared motifs to which archaeologists are increasingly
turning (Schaafsma, 2009; Hill, 2001; Boyd & Cox, 2016), the context can
plausibly be understood in more depth through iconological analyses based on the
art historical theories and practices of Panofsky.

Archaeologist Dorothy K. Washburn who, with Emory Sekaquaptewa and
Kenneth C. Hill, co-authored a substantive collection of Hopi song translations,
found evidence that the concepts associated with the corn “lifeway”—associated
with both Mesoamerica and the Hopi peoples—are embedded in metaphorical
form in not only material culture and imagery but within the mythology associated
with the phases of human growth. List (1962) provides a concise description of
Hopi song:
Song is an integral part of the culture. It serves in religious ceremony; it cures the sick; it accompanies dance, game, and work; it soothes the infant; it is a didactic force. A Hopi song is rarely sung purely for entertainment. As the ceremonies and dances of which the songs form a part fall into disuse, these songs are often incorporated into the repertory which the older Hopis sing to their children and grandchildren, partly for their entertainment and partly to develop a loyalty to the culture. Or a song may be made to serve a new function. Old corn grinding songs for example, are now used as kachina dance songs (List, 1962:30).

The messages conveyed the concept of the “people of the short blue corn”:

There are many phases in life. I was conceived and planted, not I germinate and [in] so many days I pop up and pretty soon I’m a little child and began to push as I go on through life ... Women form into an ear of corn and they begin to go into this phase about tasseling [reaching puberty], and then the pollen germinates that (Washburn, 2012:476).

The metaphor is further illustrated in Song 38 of Hopi Katsina Songs (Sekaquaptewa, Hill & Washburn, 2015:104).

Hark.

The perfect ear of glossy-kerneled corn is my mother.

They (the perfect ears of corn) are nurturing us (all of the people) like children here.

Accordingly, a Corn Mother is placed with children at birth and continues to mark significant events throughout life including clan initiations, marriage, and death. During the Nimantikive dance, brides are dressed as white cloud maidens in traditional white wedding robes. The black and white checkerboard pattern tassels represent mature cobs while the long cotton strings echo falling rain (Washburn, 2012:477). Hopi Song 101 describes how the small kernels in the husk are called timoki, or “child bundle” and are said to resemble babies in blankets:

(Vocable.)

From over there,

From the southwest, the rain will be coming along descending.

Along your land it will lay down water.

How delightful it is,

When along the fields here, the yellow young corn plants and the blue/green young corn plant maidens
Make themselves grow with their corn ears in four places one above the other (vocables.)

How delightful it is,

While along the fields here, the yellow young corn plants and the young Blue/green corn plant maidens make themselves mature,

And make themselves grow with their young ears in four places one above the other

(Vocables.)

Listen, there is more.

You, my fathers,

Keep singing songs for rain.

(Vocables.)

(Sekaquaptewa, Hill & Washburn, 2015:227)
10.5.1 Maize Metaphors and the Corn Lifeways in Mesoamerica

Washburn (2012) notes the connections between the Hopi Corn Lifeway and similar metaphors specific to a similar belief system evident in Mesoamerica. Although it is generally thought that the beliefs originated in the south, the means by which the lifeway practices spread northward remain unknown. While the transference of belief from one region to another is generally traced through archaeological evidence, Washburn claims it is the metaphors themselves rather than the material objects in which they are embedded that provide the strongest evidence for a connection. In other words, shared belief systems do not necessarily mandate the same practices when it comes to embodied arts. While one culture may emphasise metaphor within imagery associated with symbolic storage objects such as pottery, another may choose to emphasise similar beliefs through an oracy-based rather than visual tradition. Here, she quotes Stoss (1994):

Mixtec children are conceptualized as ‘tender shoots’ that are cared for in ‘seed bed’ nurseries (Monaghan, 1995:51). The Tzeltal name thirteen stages of maize growth, linking the plant’s development to the growth of little boys (Stross 2006:581). In fact, these thirteen growth stages correspond to the thirteen 20-day intervals in the 260-day Mayan ritual year (Stross, 1994: Table 3 cited in Washburn, 2012).

Similarly, Hopis liken their stages of life from birth to old age to the maturation stages of a corn plant (Black, 1984). The metaphor is represented visually by the corn men images depicted upon the Sio Humis, or “Corn Standing in Rows God” katsina (See Figures 9.5 and 10.2) and through other traditional arts, including katsina songs (Sekaquaptewa, Hill & Washburn, 2015:227).31

10.6 CONCLUSION

The fluid characteristics of art are seen to reflect the living cultures of the peoples who have made them and often take the form of narrative or visual metaphor. In recent years, collaborations between Western and Hopi academics have produced significant studies relating to Ancestral Puebloan sites and the objects found within them. It is through these new collaborations that Western archaeologists, anthropologists, and art historians have begun to understand mythological or narrative content. In turn, this knowledge broadens their understanding of related iconography which often necessitates the blending of cultural and archaeological studies with those commonly associated with the discipline of art history. The resulting process extends the traditional Western definition of art history to include the non-Western perspective of art. These interdisciplinary and

31 See Page 178 in this document.
intercultural efforts nurture an increasing awareness of how non-Western forms of art such as those of the Hopi reflect the culture’s ingenuity in embuing multiple art forms with cultural knowledge. For the Hopi and other indigenous peoples, art is a means of preserving knowledge and cultural belief, rather than what early Western academicians considered to be “primitive” interpretations of deeply aesthetic forms of “beauty.”

While the metaphysical aspects of Hopi navoti play a prime role in Hopi arts, a more specific aspect of metaphysical experience—dreams—might, in some ways be even more important to the Hopi and the concepts expressed in visual form.
CHAPTER 11: DREAM AND PLACE: 
METAPHYSICAL DIMENSIONS OF HOPI TUTSKWA

11.1 INTRODUCTION

Dreams, as a part of the Western metaphysical world, are not unusual, but usually thought of as just that—representations of desires and thoughts. In the Hopi world, dreams are perceived as part of lived life rather than the workings of the subconscious mind. Thus, the metaphors and imagery that come from Hopi dreams are significant aspects of waking reality and are integrated into traditional narratives, ritual practices, and forms of visual imagery and arts. Conversely, culturally significant aspects of the arts play can play reciprocal roles in dream and healing. These contexts are particularly relevant to the subjects of rock art and sorcery.

11.2 WESTERN SCIENCE OF DREAM: EARLY NATIVE AMERICAN EXPERIMENTATION

Dorothy Eggan considered the academic fields of studies relating to both personality and culture as being intertwined and that this was “particularly true in the study of nonliterate groups” (1949:177). The stated basis of her studies was to discover “universal” symbols consistent with her belief that “primitive” people had a “widely noted” preoccupation with dreams and the levels of “fantasy” that, for nonliterate peoples, represented “varying degrees of reality” (1949:177). The significant degree to which dreams influenced the lives of the Hopi was, for Eggan, of particular interest, particularly in those instances in which dreams could induce physiological responses including “ears ringing, sweating, crying and trembling.” Though these responses are known to be present in the dreams of all humans, Dorothy Eggan’s particular interest was in the responses experienced by Hopi people as responses to Hopi cultural imagery.

When applying Neisser’s later concepts of self to Eggan’s mid-20th century studies of Hopi dream, the meaning of concentric rings of self again become apparent (Figure 7.1). Though not articulated in the later of later cognitive psychologists, Eggan’s research examined the ways in which the broad experience of reality could, hypothetically, instill itself first within the conceptual cultural, clan, or family identity and, ultimately within the individual psyche as, hypothetically, more distant responses to nuclear repurcussion. Further, Eggan sought to understand the ways in which cultural iconography, especially that reinforced regularly through mnemonic cultural practices, could imprint on the conscious mind and embed itself in dream.

Eggan’s Hopi dream studies sought to acknowledge the importance of dream experience within the culture while also making use of what she considered to be the Hopi’s “prodigious memories” on which both imagery and experience could
be imprinted. According to Eggan’s studies, her Hopi subjects dreamed frequently and remembered them well. She believed her subjects could produce dreams which would portray “intricate details of their social heritage” and sought to prove this claim through research (1949:177). For example, her studies describe specific actions that dreams were said to inspire, particularly when the dream was “bad”:

... dreams frequently exercise a varying but considerable influence in the lives of these people, and they have definite rules for the treatment of them. Of great importance in the recording of their dreams is a Hopi belief that they are significant, and that in order to negate the effects of a bad dream it must be told immediately on awakening, even though a reluctant listener must be aroused in the middle of the night; after this recital the dreamer must go outside and spit four times. On the other hand, if the dream is a good one, it must be remembered in detail but not told until it comes true (1949:179).

The specific ways in which dreams are integrated into the waking lives of non-Western peoples, including the Hopi, how dreams represent a metaphysical realm in which witchcraft may be both implemented and cured, and how dream events occur within the metaphysical planes of the Fourth World, as experienced within the physical landscape of Hopi Tutskwa, are addressed within this chapter. The significance of eidetic imagery, which occurs within the human mind, is also identified as an aspect of Hopi and Ancestral Puebloan art which deviates from the use of normative symbolic social imagery. It can represent the physical and mental experience of each individual as it occurs within the larger framework of the cultural worldview. First, it is necessary to understand the cultural beliefs surrounding dreams in the West because this is the perspective from which non-Western dreams, such as those of the Hopi, have been consistently judged within the 20th century academic settings of the dominant European American culture.

In the early 20th century, dreams themselves became the subject of scientific analysis, particularly when Fred Eggan, former director of the Philippine Studies Program at the University of Chicago, anthropologist, and former student of Edward Sapir, began his in-depth studies of the Puebloan peoples. In the 1940s and 1950s, Dorothy Eggan, Fred’s wife and an accomplished anthropologist in her own right, conducted extensive studies of dreams with a particular emphasis on those of a few select Hopi collaborators, including Don Talayesva. Additional dream studies focusing on Native Americans were underway by Harvard graduate student and former US Army psychologist, Bert Kaplan, who was, at the time, preparing his doctoral dissertation. With the support of another Harvard scholar, Clyde Kluckhohn—now best known for his Navajo/Diné studies—Kaplan’s efforts focused primarily on the administration of a series of psychological assessments which took place in their government-funded offices located within the Navajo lands near Ramah, New Mexico. The psychological theories of both
Freud and Jung dominated the era and, as a result, would have influenced the projects of all three.

While Dorothy Eggan conducted extensive interviews with specific collaborators, the project run by Kaplan employed a more cognitive approach involving the use of Rorschach inkblot tests despite the flaws discovered in previous cross-cultural studies of the Ojibwe conducted by Al Hallowell (Lemov, 2015:59). According to Lemov, these problems were related to cultural differences which had not been taken into consideration by the Euro-American scientists and staff. According to Lemov, Rorschach test administrators and staff took pains to assure their subjects, who often worried about performing poorly or making mistakes, that there could be “no right or wrong” answers on the test. And yet, among themselves, they freely discussed right and wrong, good and bad responses usually in terms of the quality of their own final reports. Good responses were those that made good data (Lemov, 2015:60).

In retrospect, the fundamental problems inherent in such studies appear abundant, for dreams and visions are integrated into the total life experience of those cultures that maintain a nature-based worldview. Indeed, the definition of “dream” itself can be called into question. For example, Steinmetz has described the role dream incubation—the specific use of dreams that are intentionally generated—plays in healing ceremonies conducted by the Native American Church (Steinmetz & Vecsey, 1990). Furthermore, in The Waking Dream in Ethnographic Perspective (1987), Douglass Price-Williams describes the process of dream cultivation, first noted by Adolphous P. Elkin in Aboriginal Men of High Degree (1977:56):

Do not play near him, because he is sitting down by himself with his thoughts in order to ‘see.’ He is gathering those thoughts so that he can feel and hear. Perhaps he then lies down, getting into a special posture, so that he may ‘see’ gets up and ‘looks’ for those he has ‘seen,’ but not seeing them, he lies down, getting into a special posture, so that he may ‘see’ when sleeping. He sees indistinct visions, and ‘hears’ persons talk in them. He gets up and ‘looks’ for those he has ‘seen,’ but not seeing them, he lies down again in the prescribed manner so as to see what he has ‘seen’ before. He puts his head on the pillow as previously so as to ‘see’ (have a vision) as before. Getting up, he tells his friends to strengthen the power (miwi) within them, so that when they lie down they will see and feel (or become aware of) people not present, and in that way they will perceive them (Elkin, 1977:56; Tedlock, 1987: 251; Price-Williams, 1987:56).

11.3 THE SCIENCE OF HUMAN “SOUL TRAVEL”

In contrast to the efforts of earlier scholars such as Dorothy Eggan, more recent advances in Western dream studies have less emphasis on the realm of personal narrative, metaphysics and philosophy than on the field of science. These changes
were inspired by studies taking place within the mid-20th century when paradoxical sleep and the concept of REM, or rapid eye movement sleep provided researchers with “objective criteria” with which to augment the practice earlier previous emphasis on dream “reporting” (Windt, 2015:17). Many of the dream elements noted in documents compiled by Eggan, however, remain relevant to multidisciplinary dream studies and cultural interpretation, particularly those which focus on sorcery and healing.

The concepts of soul travel and sorcery as often referred to in ethnographic literature, would, for example, logically appear to be related to dreams of flying. However, in recent studies by Domhoff and Schneider (2008), a comprehensive study of dream reports noted that only 4% of the participants reported experiences of flying or similar sensations and even fewer did so without the assistance of airplanes or other mechanisms. In non-Western cultures such as that of the Hopi, this small percentage of experienced individuals who can transcend “normal” experience may include those thought to be healers, shamans and witches.

According to the findings of modern science, the impact dreams may have on the human mind, however, is dependent upon the frequency of occurrence as well as the relevant physiological experience. Jennifer M. Windt proposes that the meaningfulness of some dreams—particularly those dreams described as “existential,” due to their emphasis on frustration, sadness, separation and loss, may be a result of “neuromuscular inhibition” related to the body’s orienting response. Thus, the dream’s meaningfulness could be perception imposing itself on the dream and promoting the carryover of dream-related emotions into wakefulness (Windt, 2015: 368).

Although they happen relatively infrequently, Windt notes that researchers such as Havelock Ellis, as long ago as 1931, noted that those involved in occult practices may view these types of flying dreams as excursions of the “astral body.” Windt (2015:368) quotes Ellis who suggests that these dream experiences could be the inspirations behind perceived spiritual experiences in which “intense bodily experiences” foster a belief in the supernatural.

In addition, quoting studies by Cheyne “and colleagues,” Windt explains that nightmares are generally known to fall into three categories: those involving “intruders” that involve a “sensed presence”, those involving “old-hag attacks” in which the dreamer experiences the sense that an evil “incubus” sits on the dreamer’s chest—creating a sense of being smothered—and a third type in which the dreamers believe they are flying, falling or seeing themselves after having left their bodies (Cheyne, Rueffer & Newby-Clark, 1999; Cheyne, 2005).

11.4 NON-WESTERN DREAMS AND THE SCIENCE OF SORCERY

Whether the emphasis is on context or process, the West places emphasis on the science of dreaming. Within non-Western traditions, dreams are reflections of
cultural belief. In the Hopi culture, for example, the word used for dreaming is shared with the concept of death. Tedlock (1999) notes the associations between dream and death are particularly evident in the variety of responses humans have towards dream “knowledge.” Similarly, out-of-body experiences are also associated with death (Kluckhohn, 1944; Von Grunebaum & Caille, 1966; Shulman & Stroumsa, 1999; McPherson, 2014; Thompson, 2015). Although Western culture considers dreams to be of a personal and private nature that one may choose to share but for which there is no obligation, the sharing of dreams is central to the cultures of many indigenous peoples. The significance of non-Western concepts of self is closely tied to the relationship of self to community, earth, and cosmos. The effects of globalisation threaten individual cultures whose lifeways are intertwined with the environment and who—until technological developments beginning with the West’s Industrial Revolution and philosophical contexts asserting humankind’s dominance over nature—learned to create a symbiosis between the environment, community, and self.

While the Hopi claim a tradition of recording clan symbols as petroglyphs during their migrations through sites such as Tutuveni, the Navajo (Diné) people interpret some Ancestral Puebloan petroglyphs as powerful forms of sorcery in need of mitigation. Robert McPherson explains how specific rock art images are thought to cause sickness for targeted individuals. Furthermore, his encounters with local Native peoples show how some of the marks caused by the desecration correspond with areas of the body associated with rituals in ceremonies such as the “Evil Way” in which “pain and evil” are addressed (McPherson, 2014:145). The following is his description of a conversation held with a Navajo medicine man from Comb Ridge, Utah, which refers to images created by the Ancestral Puebloan peoples who thrived within the region until approximately 1280 CE and who are commonly known by the name given to them by the Diné. In addition, “John” explained how a young woman’s hand was misshapen as a result of her mother having visited a pictograph where she placed her hand “in those prints of the Anaasazi” (McPherson, 2014:145).

When asked about an Anaasazi rock panel that had figures carefully defaced (dismembered) probably 100 to 200 years ago in a way that resembled certain ceremonial activities, John responded that it was possibly done to cure someone by killing him, removing his health, or losing his wealth. The marks cut across the base of the arms, legs, and neck. When asked what the defacing accomplished, John emphatically replied,

Look at me. I could have that done to me. I can’t walk well … It causes a person to be crippled or a quadriplegic or be totally paralyzed and shaky. That is how those types of witchcraft affect you. … Witches probably think Anaasazi artwork is more powerful and effective (than more contemporary rock art) (McPherson, 2014:146).
Of the types of witchcraft described, it is Kluckhohn’s (1944:31) references to sorcery or “enchantment by spell” that appear to be linked to the beliefs associated generally with imagery and illness and therefore potentially with curative forms of petroglyph desecration. In his studies of the Navajo (Diné), Kluckhohn explains that

```
sorcery is carried out against animals, grain, crops and other property as well as against persons. Even an automobile may be [be]witched! There is occasional reference to sorcery as directed against whole communities or groups of people rather than single individuals (Kluckhohn, 1944:33).
```

In addition, he notes the existence of “evil-wishing sandpaintings” that are associated with sorcery and are often located on the “top of a hill”. Such thoughts were also shared by McPherson’s source who suggested that a witch may have been in residence near the damaged site in question. Kluckhohn was also told that the sorcerer is believed to have powers, such as lightning, which is a notable danger present for those visiting rock art sites because they are frequently located on high rock promontories.

Basing his perspectives on the narratives provided by his unnamed Diné informants, Kluckhohn also states that “[s]ometimes it is said that the Sorcerer scratches a representation on stone” that he may put into the home or vehicle of his victim. According to the author’s consultants, sorcery was used to produce illness rather than to kill. In this respect, sorcery was thought to be “less violent, less catastrophic than Witchcraft or Wizardry” (Kluckhohn, 1944:33).

Kluckhohn’s descriptions of acts of sorcery that are tied to the use of imagery provide insight into the connections between powerful malevolent beings who manipulate imagery to achieve their magic and the illness and misfortune that befalls their seemingly helpless victims. For such beliefs to proliferate, there must be, not only a belief that one can be cursed, but also a belief that there are disembodied spiritual forces powerful and magical enough to do so. Surprisingly, the reasoning behind both concepts may be illuminated, not only by persistent cultural beliefs, but by modern dream science. Recent studies in dream science support the idea that a strong fear or preoccupation with the belief that one has been cursed by witches would be enough to reinforce the idea, almost as if the brain itself is capable of what musicians have long referred to as “memory muscle.”

Thompson (2015) provides a description of the physical processes by which all humans possess the opportunity for such magical experiences:

```
Far from showing the separability of the self from the body, out-of-body experiences reinforce the ultimate link between our body and our sense of self. Such experiences have specific neural correlates that overlap with the neural correlates of switching between first-person and third-person perspectives when we imagine and when we dream. Like dreams, out-of-
```
body experiences are mental simulations or creations of the imagination, but like lucid dreams, they’re subject to voluntary control, and you can know if you’re having one (Thompson, 2015:loc 456).

Figure 11.1. Desecration Panel, Utah (2018).

Figure 11.2. Ritually Desecrated Petroglyph, Sand Island, Utah (1999).
11.5 WESTERN SCIENCE: DREAM AS MNEMONIC EVENT

More recently, Hobson (1988) identifies the principle features of dreaming to be: sensory aspects that emphasise vision, motor imagery, the disorientation of people, time, and place, altered memory function including post-dream amnesia experienced upon wakening, delusional belief accompanied by loss of critical insight, thematic unity or narrative structure, and intense emotion.

The connection between dream, memory, and recall or even dream as mnemonic process has been clarified by scientific studies conducted by researchers including Schwartz (2003) who associates some forms of dreaming with learning and memory, showing that waking learning can be:

… reinforced through a post-learning ‘reprocessing of emotional or rewarded information’ that takes place within the circuits of the brain during ‘spontaneous replay of specific memory episodes’ that take place during sleep and dreaming and promote effective emotional regulation, performance improvement, and learning (2003:325).

Further studies in sleep and dreaming have described an activation of emotional and reward systems as well as the processing of internal information during these stages. Specifically, increased activity in the amygdala and across mesolimbic dopaminergic regions during REM sleep is likely to promote the consolidation of memory traces with high emotional/motivational value. Moreover, coordinated hippocampal-striatal replay during NREM sleep may contribute to the selective strengthening of memories for important events. Pergamvros, Dang-Vu, Desseilles and Schwartz (2013) suggest that, via the activation of emotional/motivational circuits, sleep and dreaming may offer a neurobehavioural substrate for the offline reprocessing of emotions, associated learning and exploratory behaviours resulting in improved memory organisation, waking emotion regulation, social skills and creativity.

Windt’s recent “Weak-Phenomenal-Embodiment Hypothesis” posits that, in the majority of dreams, bodily experience diverges from waking experience in not only the type and in the body’s representation, but also in the experience of disturbed or total absence of body integration (2015:296). Interestingly, both Tedlock (1991a) and Windt (2015) question the fidelity of dream reporting, a practice which was widely considered essential in the assessment of Native American Hopi psychological status studies during the mid-20th century (Eggan, 1943; 1949; Aberle, 1951; Lemov, 2015).

11.6 APPLICATIONS OF WESTERN SCIENCE: EGGAN’S HOPI DREAM STUDIES

While working for the University of Chicago, Dorothy Eggan produced a comprehensive study of dreams which served as a resource for her own ethnological studies and which remains a valuable asset for those studying within
the fields of anthropology, psychology, and psychoanalysis. Her resulting studies produced a new understanding of the ways, self, group self, and environment appeared to converge through dreams to form the “concentric walls of Hopi-ness” within which one was “first a learner and then a teacher” (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:240-241). Her studies are equally important for their relevance to art, embedded mytholinguistic contexts, and their implications for the development of effective criteria essential to applications of non-Western art history study.

Eggan perceived ritual to be a deeply significant aspect of culture which provided vibrant visual imagery, repetitive sound, and dramatic action through which the cultural traditions of the Hopi were taught, demonstrated, and remembered. As described by Eggan in her mid-20th century studies, Hopi children learned through seeing, understanding the concepts behind the ritual or other imagery, that is, signals of important cultural objects and concepts. This is done through participating in ritual performances either as a viewer or by playing an active role, by wearing or using the ceremonial clothing or associated objects, and by understanding the significance of the seasonal, annual, or perhaps life-changing event.

Further, she posited that the rich, repetitive ritual imagery operated on mnemonic levels of cognition that could affect patterns found in dreams while forming a foundation of understanding of Hopi cultural values interpreted by each individual.

It would thus seem to follow that when such a society conveys much religious and recreational experience through dramatic and richly satisfying ‘image,’ as Hopi society does, the self-world of individuals would be richly endowed with images, particularly since these images were consistently presented long before conscious thought began to catalogue the world of experience, and continued to be presented throughout one’s lifetime (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:241).

11.7 DREAM, SELF AND SOCIETY FUNCTION

Eggan’s studies also serve to delineate significant contexts relative to the balance of “self” and community through the concepts of hikwsi and himwu:

No matter how tightly the society is structured, nor how thoroughly individuals in it are integrated with the society, there is always an insistent whisper from self, a point beyond which an entity that the Hopi call hikwsi—the Spirit of the Breath or Breath Body—resists what they sometimes call himwu, ... the Mighty Something, which may be thought of as a god, but rather as their composite concept of divinity ... self-awareness in this interdependent household and society then becomes far more of a threat than it does among ourselves (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:241).
Eggan claimed that dreams are thought of as a form of “thought-action in which hikwsi explores the world within the world without, often bringing the two into closer alignment.

Figure 11.3. Hopi Kachinas Drawn by Native Artists (1899).

As published in The Dream and Human Societies, the participants in Eggan’s studies frequently dreamed of the Hopi katsina associated with the Snake Dance, “Palulukon” (male) and Palulukonti (female). The character lives, according to Eggan, in the interior of the Earth from where he controls the universal waters, including the large bodies of water on which we are floating. If displeased by the misconduct of humanity, particularly family, village, and tribal discord, and by sexual misconduct, he might turn over, thus causing earthquakes, landslides, and floods (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:255).

Eggan noted that Palulukon was still associated with a wide range of disasters including floods, earthquakes, and landslides as well as bubbling water rising from the earth or cliffs (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:255). According to Eggan, as one who dwells in his “house” within the waters, Palulukon judges the hearts of humans, rather than their actions (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:256). The serpent is the focus of the Hopi Palulukon ceremony, a dramatic
production involving an effigy of the serpent, complete with fearsome teeth and a red tongue which takes place in a subterranean kiva lit by fire.

This kiva performance is deeply etched in the memory of all who have seen it and, for the Hopi who know its sacred implications, and particularly for the uninitiated children who, in the dimly lit kiva, must certainly have believed that these were actually supernatural serpents, the impact of the entire ceremony must have been tremendous. And we again repeat that this was not an isolated, once-in-a-lifetime experience, but something that older Hopi have experienced repeatedly from infancy (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:259-60).

The cognitive and emotional effects of the vividness which appeared to characterise her collaborators’ Hopi dream experiences are evident within Eggan’s essay. Here she notes that disturbing dreams focusing on the Palulukon were both frequent within her collaborators and often times disturbing. In addition, however, the fear associated with these dreams was of a social rather than physical nature, and, according to Eggan, the result of such dreams being an accusation of either being kahopi (“not Hopi”) or having kahopi associates. Geertz equates this with a potential “social cancer” for individuals because the sense of belonging and working in cooperation with others was the key to success and happiness.

Not lightly would any Hopi voluntarily acquire the title Kahopi—“not Hopi,” and therefore not good. Throughout the Hopi life span, the word kahopi, kahopi, KAHOPI was heard, until it penetrated to the very core of one’s mind. It was said softly and gently at first to tiny offenders, through “Kahopi tiyo” or “Kahopi mana” to older children, still quietly but with stern intent, until the world sometimes assumed a crescendo of feeling as a whole clan or even a whole community might condemn an individual as Kahopi (Eggan, 1956:362-63).

Although Eggan does discuss the “maleness” inherent in many water serpent dreams as well as contexts related to dreams about the Snake Dance, it is clear that the preoccupation with Palulukon was a fear engrained in each Hopi individual from early childhood. When the prospect of ostracisation is combined with the frightening image of the serpent itself, the message of the importance of social acceptance is undeniably engrained in each adult from a very young age through mnemonic techniques and practices.

11.8 CONCEPTS OF THE SOUL AND SELF IN GENERAL PUEBLOAN DREAM STUDIES

Cultural anthropologist Barbara Tedlock’s studies on Native American nations describe several instances in which the safety of one’s own soul is put at risk through the occurrence of disembodiment in a dream (Tedlock, 1987), as it may be experienced as a metaphoric form of death. The author describes the Zuni of New Mexico, another Puebloan people of the Southwest, who believe that part of the individual’s “self” leaves the body through dreams where he or she may experience multiple times and places, including the future. However, the author
notes that there is also a contrasting belief within the same culture’s more highly acculturated members who hold a more materialistic view of a mind/body duality of opposition. Tedlock describes how members of the culture who are less knowledgeable in initiatory religious knowledge, yet also highly acculturated, argue that “if one’s wind or breath, which resides in the body, actually left during sleep, then one would simply die” (Tedlock, 1991a:89). The author observed that, as a result of this potential danger, the individuals who hold this belief reported residual fears about death through dreaming. Similar “class” distinctions are described in Whiteley (2012) which suggests that the Hopi differentiate between pavansinom who are considered to be important and powerful and soqavungsinom who are common people “lacking in ritual authorities and prerogatives” (Whitely, 2012:618).

11.9 DREAMS AND FLIGHTS OF THE DEAD

Eggan notes how the word for dream, dimoki, which means a bundle of thoughts, is also used in the descriptions of burials as was told to her by a Hopi “philosopher” (Eggan’s italics):

> It means a bundle of the dead body prepared for burial; it means a bundle of corn (corn being literally the staff of life for the Hopi) ready to carry on your back; and it means dream ... But anyway, all three have a deep meaning (Von Grunebaum & Caillois, 1966:242).

Here, we see that human death and its associated imagery are again, as in Tedlock’s Zuni studies, the sources of both fear and metaphor in dream.

The seemingly dualistic or oppositional attributes of body and spirit at the time of death are uniquely specific to each culture yet there are also strong, pancultural similarities expressed through narratives or visual metaphors. Washburn (2012) has provided evidence for a possible connection between the cultivation of maize in Mesoamerica and the use of metaphor in both that and the Hopi imagery, including its relevance to the “Corn Lifeway” which itself resembles the Mesoamerican “maize lifeway” traditions (see Chapter 4). Additional influence of Mesoamerican culture has been identified by archaeologists in the American Southwest, including the skeletal remains of scarlet macaws found at Chaco Canyon and other trade goods. It is logical, therefore to assume Mesoamerican beliefs and ideologies were also introduced to the early Ancestral Puebloan people. Specific Mesoamerican cultures do include accounts of soul departures and may also have been shared with northern peoples such as the Hopi. In her studies of ancient Mexico, Jill Leslie McKeever-Furst (1995:41) explains that “the heart-soul as bird or alate is a natural symbol whose formation and disappearance can be observed by anyone who prepares the corpse for its final journey.” Should the soul and body be perceived as lost at the moment of death, the process may be viewed as the soul’s flight as a butterfly or bird. The basis of this belief may be found in interpretations of the visual imagery that may well be shaped by the
symbolic wings that form on the deceased’s back as a result of lividity. In fact, the human heart, which ceases to beat at the time of death, also resembles a bird.

11.10 CONCLUSION

The seemingly mysterious references to mythic time evident in the traditional narratives of indigenous peoples present Western academicians with opportunities to speculate upon the role that dreams assume in the perception of Native reality. This chapter has described how Western developments in the field of psychology and anthropology inspired well-funded academic studies that are still considered seminal works today. Among those that have remained influential are those of Dorothy Eggan whose studies of Don Talayesva added additional dimension to the West’s knowledge of Hopi concepts of self, other, and the fear of ostracism.

In later years, the influence of Western science is again found in scientific analyses of dream experiences. However, as Windt explains, the emphasis turned to the much broader scope of human experiences which themselves reveal important aspects of human physiology which may be fundamental to supernatural experience which, once commonalities are repeated, begin to form the basis of cultural narrative. Through the study of dream states, the scientific bases on which supernatural experiences, whether achieved through dreams, trances, hallucinations, or the memories thereof can contribute to the formulation of new forms of imagery in which the conventions of art made in “waking time” are absent. These characteristics may, in turn lead to the perceived need of some individuals to destroy them and the “sicknesses” they are thought to cause. Tedlock claims that to dream is to travel to and perhaps leave one’s self in the Land of the Dead (Tedlock, 1991a:89).

The nature of experienced phenomena associated with dream states has been the subject of Western significant anthropological and scientific studies, some of which include laboratory experimentation or psychological analysis. The extent to which dreams represent the Hopi concept of self, culture, community, and environment within Dorothy Eggan’s mid-20th century studies, for example, can be effectively articulated through Neisser’s later concepts and the terminology relevant to cognitive psychology. Additional advances within Western science have provided new physiological explanations for human dream experiences including shamanic flight; thus, they provide a plausible basis for an understanding of both Puebloan and Dine healing techniques, ritual practice, and both the curative or detrimental characteristics of associated cultural iconography. It is within these contexts that Western science contributes insights into Hopi dreams and the embedded cultural and personal beliefs on which they have been based.
CHAPTER 12: CONCLUSIONS – THE
ICONOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS OF NON-
WESTERN ART HISTORY AS REFLECTED IN HOPI
ART

12.1 INTRODUCTION

The primary intent of this study has been to demonstrate the importance of
considering the mnemonic characteristics of non-Western art objects within the
field of art history in addition to those associated with the Western sciences—
archeology—where an awareness of the cognitive applications of art as
“symbolic storage” vessels has already been acknowledged. The use of made
objects and imagery as a means of both storing and disbursing important cultural
beliefs, including mythical narrative among non-Western oracy-based peoples, is
well established within the culture of the Hopi people. Traditional art forms
within the Hopi culture preserve basic concepts essential to the continuation of
Native belief, and frequently reference the people’s emergence into this, the
Fourth World. Hopi children are introduced to cosmogonic or cosmological
beliefs and contexts from an early age through art and imagery. Among the
primary agents of learning are small “tihu,” which are painted wooden
representations of the katsinam, or nature spirits who visit the village each year to
aid in the bringing of rain which assures the agrarian people of that year’s
successful corn crop. Children learn more about the katsina and other Hopi
traditions over time as the seasonal rituals and events surrounding them reoccur
each year.

In recent decades, Western educators working within the field of art history have
called for a similar approach to teaching Western children about non-Western arts.
For example, when implementing an experimental Constructivist approach to
teaching a Western third-grade art lesson to students of approximately eight years
of age, Chanda and Basinger (2000) identified the infrastructure needed to
courage students to, first, identify significant visual characteristics of a non-
Western art form and, second, to search for visual cues that may suggest symbolic
meanings or the intent of the peoples who made them. The study confirmed that
the Western students were capable of recognising the visual “cues” incorporated
into the Kuba works and, much in the way the Kuba children themselves do,
began to understand significant aspects of the culture that were incorporated into
each work. In this way, the educators confirmed that Western students were able
to “read” important visual characteristics that represent important aspects of Kuba
king portraits, the historical contexts in which they played a part, and the
significant differences evident between Kuba culture and their own. In reading
the “cues” and responding to the embodied contexts, these Western students
followed the path to a new way of learning through embodied art forms. In effect,
they followed in the footsteps of generations of Kuba children who had gone before and who had learned their own cultural history in a similar manner.

The success of the experimental approach employed by the educators, however, was the result of their own initiative. Then, as now, the education that elementary school students receive in the United States generally adheres to traditional Western disciplines. Typical subjects addressed in the third-grade art curricula within the United States focus directly upon explorations of mediums that include drawing, painting, and sculpture. As a result, Western works from these mediums, bereft of “anthropological” or “ethnographic” content, would be the traditional focus of a typical third grade class in art. Chanda and Basinger (2000) clearly demonstrated that the cultural knowledge stored in objects could be successfully taught to Western students as young as eight years of age. However, educators are required to step outside the confines of the traditional art history discipline to do so. Because the study of culturally-specific narratives and the experiential process of both reiterating and preserving them through art touches upon multiple Western disciplines, the art made with this intent typically falls within the broad Western concept of interdisciplinary studies. The present study, however, illustrates both how and why the West would benefit from examining the use of “art” as “exographic” or symbolic storage as it has been used by people such as the Hopi from the earliest stages of their development.

Ecophilosopher, Freya Mathews (1994:4), claims that Western thinking has itself developed into a process marked by mental detachment in which the individual cares more about the process of thinking than about the thought itself. A similar approach to studying the cultures of non-Western peoples has marked Western academia. What is, in effect, a fluid process of creating art that reflects a timeless narrative, such as that of the Hopi’s Fourth World, remains confined within the study of “other” peoples through the disciplines of archaeology, anthropology, and ethnography. As a result, contemporary Western academia continues to perceive itself as different, as more articulate in its command of the written word, and, erroneously, as in the example of colonialism, “best.” This study argues against this perspective and finds the ways in which Western academia continue to perpetuate these beliefs regarding non-Western art as symptomatic of the problem.

In an era when traditional cultures are becoming increasingly endangered, their languages threatened, and their environments at risk, art historians, cultural anthropologists and archaeologists can play a role in preserving, not only traditional lifeways, but perhaps the people themselves. Rather than relegate studies of “non-Western” peoples and their arts to the sciences where they contribute to the further dichotomising of the traditional Western academic paradigm, scholars can effectively pay heed to “intrinsic meaning” which, applied to individual cultures, reveals their unique characteristics.

In many ways, the tradition of conventional Western art history focuses exclusively on itself, mirroring its own self interests. Since the mid-20th century,
academics have argued for more inclusive forms of art history that begin to address the specific forms of cognitive sciences and environmental content that are inherent in the more “constructivist” cultural methodologies of indigenous peoples. With the consideration and integration of non-Western concepts regarding the integration of arts and lifeways, the disciplines of traditional Western art history may no longer be, as Kraft (1989) feared, threatened with its own extinction. With their emphasis on cultural and environmental longevity, mnemonic sciences, and conservation, the Hopi ways and practices are soundly based on a foundation of cognitive learning, cultural longevity, and environmental preservation. In an era of endangered languages and threatened peoples, it is art history’s responsibility to preserve the mnemonic traditions that have sustained the Earth and its people from the pre-literate past through to the oracy-based traditions of the present.

12.2 METAPHORS AND NARRATIVE IN HOPI ARTS AND LANDS

An additional focus of this study has been to identify and discuss cultural contexts and perspectives as they specifically relate to pottery, architecture, and rock art imagery. While the influence of mythological content, as it relates to the subjects of pottery and architecture has been discussed above, the significance of imagery represented on petroglyphs merits an individual discussion. Considerable Hopi sources, including living members of the culture, describe how petroglyphs occurring at sites such as Tutuveni in northern Arizona are significant cultural markings which are pecked into the patinated surfaces of natural rock formations. It was these formations on which the first Hopi people left their clan symbols and on which later era Hopi have continued to do so as part of their sacred pilgrimages. In the West, the study of petroglyphs customarily lies within the domain of archaeology rather than art history.

As at Tutuveni, archaeologists have been the traditional documenters of these works through the process of site surveys, recordings, and the eventual cataloging of images according to the formats required by their State Archaeologists who then place the records in their permanent files. Rather than symbol identification, this study has emphasised the role both natural features and human made features, such as petroglyphs, assume in traditional oral narrative. In particular, this study has described a specific mnemonic technique known in early Western civilization as method loci which is still employed by the Hopi people in the connections drawn between themselves and the lands on which they live. Through these narratives, the mythic characteristics of the environment are tied through the use of distinguishing features or imagery to specific actions or occurrences that serve as mnemonic devices for remembering lengthy oral narratives, such as those associated with the creation, with the creation of clans, with the historic pilgrimages, and with the origins of clan-based rituals.
12.3 COLONIAL INFLUENCE, CULTURAL CHANGE, AND RESTRUCTURED FORMS

This study places particular emphasis upon how the effects of colonisation under the Spanish influenced the culture, narratives, and art of the Hopi and other Puebloan peoples. The process of restructuring, for example, is particularly evident in art retrieved from the ruins of Giusewa, a 17th century site located near the village of Jemez. While under Spanish rule, the original Puebloan peoples were required to utilise their pottery skills in forms that would benefit the Catholic Church to which they were required to devote themselves. The “restructuring” of the images and forms present on pottery forms at this site clearly reflect the changing narratives to which the indigenous people were forced to conform. For example, under the strict rule of the Spaniards, the local pottery surface imagery style, now identified by archaeologists as “Jemez Black-on-white,” was used to embellish forms which were themselves non-Native. For example, this study includes images of a Catholic chalice created from clay and decorated in the characteristic style. Traditional Puebloan burial practices were also merged to a slight extent with the new forms of burial mandated by the Catholic priests. This study describes how one Puebloan individual, buried beneath a church floor, appeared to have been considered Christian despite the presence of a small stone mountain lion—in the tradition of Native “fetish objects”—laid upon his heart.

12.4 DREAM IN HOPI NARRATIVE

The strict separation of dream and waking life experiences is among the definitive characteristics of the Western scientific tradition. While the science of dreaming provides physiological evidence for a variety of human fears and nightmares, this study also addresses dreams as they relate to cultural contexts and beliefs relevant to the Hopi and Diné peoples. This study also examines the culture of mid-20th century Western academia, an environment which promoted the scientific study of non-Western peoples, including the Hopi, that were conducted by Eggan and others (Eggan 1943; 1949; 1956; Lemov, 2015). A particularly important focus of this study is its emphasis on the hypotheses that Dorothy Eggan developed for research on the ability of the human mind to sustain visual or symbolic imagery within the mind during sleep. Using numerous Hopi and Tewa-Hopi people as subjects, Eggan’s work revealed the fear that one particular “informant” felt about two primary topics: the threat of harm resulting from the menacing Hopi water serpent (1949), and even more, the damage to self that would occur from ostracism. The innate sense of potential fear inherent in some experiences may, according to the study, be influenced by the word for dream itself which is similar to that of death in the spoken language. Tedlock (1991a) also described the connections evident between fear of death, sleep, and dream in other Puebloan cultures, including that of the Zuni.
While cultural beliefs have greatly affected the Hopi people as well as the Western studies in which they are featured prominently during the mid-20th century, developments in cognitive science and dream science within the dominant Western culture have led to greater insights regarding the physical conditions which may lead to senses of both flying and eminent doom. This study establishes how the physical science of dreaming, which has been conducted by Western scientists, in part, explains the recurrence of fears of witchcraft, soul travel and the need for curing affecting both the Hopi culture, as it represents a threat to existing petroglyphic imagery which are perceived to be acts of witchcraft and are therefore subject to ritual desecration, and that of their ancestors who came before, leaving such imagery as “footprints” of their migrations. In the contexts discussed, it is the Diné (Navajo) who represent the biggest threat to Hopi imagery—current or ancestral; however, the conditions surrounding the occurrences are not limited to these two peoples, they are the focus of this study primarily due to the physical and geological proximity of both the people and their lands.

12.5 APPLICATIONS OF MYTHOLINGUISTIC ANALYSIS WITHIN HOPI ARTS

As Smith (2012a) explained, it was the intent of Western academics to utilise Native peoples as subjects with whom they could promote their own new scientific theories. Inspired by the achievements of Albert Einstein, Whorf and Sapir developed what became known as the theory of “Linguistic Relativity” which became the basis of numerous linguistic studies. Whorf, in particular, tried to explain how Hopi language shaped Hopi thinking. Further, this study explains how the Western tradition of considering Native peoples to be aspects of science continues today as major museums, such as the American Museum of Natural History, still include dioramas of Native Americans situated in natural environs, likening the people to aspects of nature similar to birds and mammals in terms of the display.

This study provides a sound argument for the human capacity to expand upon the processes of cognitive thinking, as the Hopi people have done, to further develop the use and understanding of mnemonic devices and symbolic storage which have, in recent years been a popular topic among philosophers, archaeologists, and anthropologists but not yet art historians despite the art forms in which such cultural knowledge is traditionally stored. Once these topics become an integral part of multi-cultural approaches to art history instruction, aspects of human cognitive potential, which have become latent as a result of modern humankind’s dependence on the written word, will again have channels through which to grow and expand. In doing so, new respect for the wisdom of oracy-based peoples, their lifeways, narratives, and art forms, will be garnered within multiple Western academic disciplines including art history which has maintained a Western
emphasis based on the tradition of *ekphrasis* (writing about art) since Vasari (1550) and its Renaissance origins.

**12.6 RESTRUCTURING IN HOPI ART AND NARRATIVE**

Finally, this study provides insights into specific ways in which Hopi arts and those of other nearby Puebloan peoples reflected the effects of colonisation within new forms of art and imagery which promoted the Spanish agenda, and which were intended to replace those of their own eradicated forms. This record of political and spiritual upheaval remains embedded within the surviving material culture. The experience of the people as they were forced to replace their own indigenous cultural narrative with that imposed upon them—that of the Spanish Catholic missionaries—is both recorded and reflected in the surviving visual record.

The primary objective of this study was to identify the need to change the narrow focus of art history as it is currently established within the Western tradition and to redefine itself through a more cross-cultural interdisciplinary approach. As this study has shown, the perceived separate emphases of art history and, for example, archaeology within the West, exclude fundamental aspects of the human experience in studies of the arts that any given people or culture creates. The significant aspects of art that are currently excluded in the emphasis of the discipline are shown to generally focus on the means by which art is employed in the preservation of cultural identity and tradition through practices that work directly through human cognition and learning.

As a means of demonstrating how complex human experiences are embedded within the arts, this study has focused upon the arts, culture, emergence narrative, and traditional lifeways of the Hopi people. In doing so, this study has shown how the spiritual beliefs extolled in the Fourth World narrative have sustained both the culture and its people since their origins in mythic time through oral narrative. An understanding of the multiple ways in which the externalisation of these beliefs takes place through the arts is essential in the study of these forms of “exoteric” mnemonic objects. In this light, narratives of the land itself and its various natural or human-made features can be viewed within the field of art history as forms of “symbolic storage.” The embodiment of basic cultural belief within objects, imagery and narratives thus extends to the people’s conception of the lands to which they belong. These, too, may be perceived to be the physical manifestations of cosmological belief to which an indigenous culture is inextricably bound. The Western discipline of archaeology has wakened to the need to view art and ritual as manifestations of a people’s overriding cosmological belief. The discipline of art history, as traditionally taught in the West, however, continues, for the most part, to promote its own positivist agenda in which art serves as a reflection of the culture’s triumphs over “the other.” This study
demonstrated the ways in which metaphysical belief and the traditional lifeways are reiterated daily in the traditional Hopi culture, experientially, through the arts. In this respect, it deviates from the norms expected from traditional studies performed within the discipline of Western art history. As such, it is hoped it will become inspiration for future scholars working within this discipline who follow the lead of increasing numbers of Western scholars who must address the deficient view of perceiving art as a tool through which Native ideologies may be changed and instead embrace the depth of cultural, environmental, and spiritual meaning that the arts of people, such as the Hopi, continue to provide.

As the narrative of the Puebloan people of the American Southwest changed from one of imposed servitude to that of revolt, the objects that were made became first, evidence of and, next, a record of a people’s effort to submit. The uprisings and revolts that followed inspired the Puebloan people’s perceived need to destroy these works of art, as they and the stories they told reflected a false reality reiterated and recorded within a multitude of dimensional, verbal, ritual, and written works. In this light, the history embedded within the historic works serves as a visual record of a story in which a suppressed people rose against the Western agenda, revolted, and reclaimed their traditional indigenous lifeways.

While focusing primarily on the use of art as a means of conveying and reiterating cultural belief within the Hopi culture, the intent of this study has been to explain why these, and other contexts are those on which the Western discipline of art history must expand upon and embrace. The means by which this must be done—through “interdisciplinary” approaches which better reflect both the intent and world view of the makers—requires the metaphorical breakdown of the borders of Western “art history” and the colonialist agenda the academic discipline continues to support. To this end, mytholinguistic analysis must play a fundamental role in the process of its own restructure and renewal.

APPENDIX A: A (HOPI FOURTH WORLD NARRATIVE AND MISSION STATEMENT)

Wildlife & Ecosystems Management Program

The Wildlife & Ecosystems Management Program is in charge of management of the Wildlife and the Ecosystems, which includes the Woodland/Forestry and Wetland Habitat on the Hopi Reservation.
When the Hopi and all the other People emerged from the Sipaapuni into this, the Fourth World, we chose an ear of corn to represent our way of life. Instead of a large ear of corn, we chose the smallest ear of corn. This ear represented what the Sinom knew would be their enduring struggle for existence. However, Maasaw, the guardian of the Upper and Lower Worlds, gave us a gift: if we would migrate across Maasawtutskwa in the four directions, then Maasawtutskwa would become Hopitutskwa (Hopi Land). Thus we formed a scared covenant with Maasaw to earn our land and to serve as its stewards. By completing our migrations, we fulfilled our first obligation to Maasaw: we left behind our footprints in the form of ruins, graves, ceremonial springs, trails, shrines, petroglyphs, and potsherds.

We must continue to fulfill our covenant with Maasaw by being worthy stewards for Hopitutskwa. We have reverence for all that is Hopi: the land, the sky, the rocks, the soil, the streams, the springs, the plants and the animals. The Sinom are a part of all living things that depend on each other for sustaining life. The rabbits, prairie dogs and other small animals eat the green plants. The eagle, coyote and fox eat the rabbits. We eat our corn and the animals that sustain us.

Each of us makes sacrifices that all may live in harmony. We make our sacrifices through the hard work of tilling our crops, performing our ceremonies, keeping our hearts pure, praying for moisture and aiding those that need our help.

We hold sacred obligation and responsibility to the plants and animals on our land. Being Hopi-Tewa means behaving properly. Our ancient traditions instruct us on how we should care for our children, the plants; and our brothers and sisters, the animals. When we hunt, we hunt with the knowledge that the animal has agreed to make a sacrifice for us. We must repay that sacrifice through our ritual and our offerings. If we do not do this, we have violated our covenant. It is our
obligation, day by day, to conduct ourselves in a manner that shows our respect for the land and all it contains. It is our obligation, day by day, to protect the plants and animals that need our help.

In keeping with our Mission Statement, the Wildlife & Ecosystems Management Program provides various services, provides assistance and establishes management practices and goals to fulfill our mission for the benefit of the Hopi People and Lands.

The Hopi Wildlife & Ecosystems Management Program (WEMP) is divided between the Wildlife Management Unit and Ecosystems Management Unit. Each Management Unit has different responsibilities, goal and objectives, but share a common goal to meet our Mission and Function.

The WEMP goals and objectives follow the 2011 Hopi Pötskwanait, revised November 2011 and comply with Hopi Tribal Ordinances #47 (Woodlands) and #48 (Wildlife), Integrated Resource Management Plan (IRMP-Adopted May 2001), Integrated Woodlands Management Plan (Adopted 2006), and other related Tribal and Department of Natural Resources Plans, Policies and Ordinance.

Wildlife Management Unit:

- Hunting Regulations – Deer and Elk, and Furbearers
- Fishing Permits – Beaver Dam (Pond)
- Game Surveys – Big Game, Furbearers, Predatory and Non-Game Surveys
  - Provide Hunter Education Classes
  - Public Information and Education on Wildlife Management

Ecosystems Management Unit:

- Wood Permits – Commercial and Non-Commercial
- Monitor Woodlands areas
- Inventory of the Woodlands
- Wood Harvests – New Lands
  - Provide Public Information and Education on Woodlands Habitat

Mills, Ontario: General Publishing, 1971. 239 pp., illustrations, map, notes, glossary. $6.95 (cloth).

Reviewed by EDWARD A. KENNARD
University of Pittsburgh

This is a collection of twenty myths and tales, collected from 1968 to 1970 from eleven informants—five from First Mesa including one Tewa, five from Oraibi and Moencopi, and one from Shungopavi. Mr. Courlander is an experienced folklorist and has wisely made no effort to reconcile variants in the tales, recognizing—as the Hopi do—that each narrator has his own interpretation (navot‘at), and each sees his own village as the center.

All the most frequently told myths, especially those that rationalize Hopi ceremonial life and its organization are included—the emergence, the wanderings, the acquisition of clan names, ceremonial knowledge, and power. The last six deal with historic events from the sixteenth century to 1906, but are told and conceptualized by the Hopi as later traditions, whose coming was foretold in the beginning and are conceived retrospectively as proof of the correctness of traditional prophecy.

To a great extent it is still a living folklore, for hardly any meeting, negotiation with representatives of the government, or the land claims dispute with the Navaho can be discussed without many speakers finding the sanction for what they advocate in their interpretation of this material.

To protect his informants, Mr. Courlander has assigned each a number and indicated in which village he lived. In the "Notes" for each tale he lists the four or five individuals who provided material, but there is no way for the reader to discover the variants.

Like Fewkes (1897) and Mindeleff (1886) he believes that these migration legends have more historic worth than most anthropologists and southwestern archaeologists would give them. Nevertheless, we are provided with a map, on which are located places such as Tokonave, Matovi, Homolovi, and others. While Courlander recognizes that myth, legend, and history are interwoven, his most pertinent observation is that they provide insight into values and motivations. And what are the most frequently recurring themes, responsible for the emergence, or for abandoning one or another of the villages from Palatkwapi to Awatovi? Ill-disposed people as witches, sexual transgressions, refusal to obey their proper leaders, failure to perform their ceremonies are cited repeatedly as the causes of their difficulties. And just as frequently, the chief seeks the leaders of other Hopi villages to come and destroy his people. In short, both tradition and the contemporary Hopi agree that they are their own worst enemy.

Students of the Hopi and other Pueblos will be able to compare this collection with those of H. R. Voth (1905), A. M. Stephens (1929), and Edmund Nequatewa (1936), to learn how much stability and variation has occurred during a period of more than seventy years.

It is an excellent and representative body of material, well presented in English. The book is nicely printed with handsomely decorated chapter headings by Enrico Arno.

References Cited


**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


Ferguson, TJ (Ed). 2003. *Yep hisat hoopq’yaqam yeesiwa (Hopi ancestors were once here)*. Kiqötsmovi, Hopi Cultural Preservation Office.


Grant, US. 1870. *Peace Policy of 1869 & 1870*.


Shorter Oxford Dictionary, 2007 Sv Dream

Shorter Oxford Dictionary, 2007 Sv Eidetic

Shorter Oxford Dictionary, 2007 Sv Dream


Tate, CE. 1983. *Yaxchilan: The design of a Maya ceremonial city*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.


Vasari, Giorgio. 1550. Lives of the Artists


Winckelmann, JJ. 1764. History of the Art of Antiquity.


