

**The impact of educational policy on the National Senior
Certificate: Pre-1994 and Post-Democracy South African
Case**

By

MALAKIA SHERE MOROPA

Submitted in accordance with the requirements

for the Degree of

MASTER OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: MR B.C LEKONYANE

November 2016

Student Number: 30296226

Declaration

I, Malakia Shere Moropa declare that the *Impact of educational policy on the National Senior Certificate: Pre-1994 and Post democracy South African case*, is my own work and that all the sources that I used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references in the bibliography and that this dissertation was not previously submitted by me for a degree at any other university.

Signature.....

Date

Acknowledgements

I wish to express my sincere gratitude, firstly to God, through my ancestors, whose guidance, mercy and compassion made the completion of this research possible.

I also gratefully acknowledge my indebtedness and wholehearted appreciation to my supervisor, Mr B.C Lekonyane, for his keen commitment, encouragement, suggestions and patience throughout the course of this research.

My gratitude is also extended to the Unisa library staff, for providing me with the resources needed for this research.

Furthermore, I wish to thank the many other people who have had a share in the progress of this study. While it is impossible to list all their names, some must be recorded:

Sbonginkosi, Nja, Nitzi, Karabo, Meriam and Mogobe for helpful discussion on a number of issues.

I dedicate this work with solemn respect to my late father Mokubu and my mother Moshiane. It is their hard work that has instilled an inspiration and eagerness to learn in me.

Finally, I thank my wife, Sithokozile (Pebetsi), my children, Sibusiso, Oratile, Moshiane, Thabo, and Tshifhiwa and my nephew Mojalefa for their support and patience, and for putting up with an often absent student husband, father and uncle.

ABSTRACT

This study deals with the impact of educational policy on the National Senior Certificate: Pre-1994 and Post democracy South African case. The qualitative approach was used in this study, and the research findings were based on the analysis of documents. The transition from apartheid education to the present education system in South Africa has not been without challenges. In the past, South African education reflected the fragmented society in which it was based. Outcomes based education (OBE)/Curriculum 2005 (C2005), since its inception, was riddled with challenges. OBE/C2005 by its nature is complex. It is not user-friendly for developing countries such as South Africa. The aim of this study is to explore the impact of educational policies on the 2008 National Senior Certificate results.

Historical-educational research is undertaken with the view of putting the education phenomenon into proper perspective. Venter (1985) is of the opinion that historical education investigation refers to the systematic placing of historical education variables in the spotlight. The general, continual pedagogical and fundamental problems are accentuated against the multiplicity of historical detail. This then makes historical-educational research an orderly (systematic and controlled) process of knowledge enrichment (Venter & Van Heerden 1989:106). The National Senior Certificate was established in terms of National Education Act 27 of 1996. Curriculum 2005 has been described in policy documents as a “paradigm shift” because it represents a radical departure from the previous curriculum in terms of the following: theoretical underpinnings, structure and organisation, teaching and learning process, and assessment (South Africa, Department of Education 1997:1).

Pre-1994, the researcher discovered that the education of black people in rural areas in particular and South Africa in general was, in most instances, negatively impacted by policies of the previous government (1948-1953). The apartheid government used poor funding models to ensure that there were low teacher-pupil ratios and teacher qualifications were of unequal standard. Unequal pattern of spending continued well into the post-1994 democratic era.

This poor funding model which impacted negatively on rural schools made infrastructural provision in rural areas difficult.

Post -1994 democratic dispensation, the researcher discovered that the government have competitive legislative policies in place, but the challenges lay in the fact that those policies were impulsively implemented. Hence the many challenges. This is shown by the frequency of curriculum changes which took place in a very short space of time.

Stakeholders played a major role in insuring that schools received quality service by challenging some of the decisions the government was taking. The government has had to take the recommendations into account.

Key words: Assessment body, Cascade model, Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement, Department of education, Examination, National Curriculum Statement, Outcomes-based assessment, Outcomes-based education, Policy and Stakeholder

Contents

1. General Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Background of the Study.....	1
1.3 Scope of the study.....	9
1.3.1 Time dimension.....	10
1.3.2 Geographical dimension	10
1.4 Research problem.....	10
1.5 Research question	11
1.7 Purpose of study.....	12
1.8 Significance of study.....	12
1.9 Motivation for study	13
1.10 Research design and methodology.....	13
1.11 Research design	13
1.12 Research methodology.....	14
1.13 Data analysis	15
1.14 Ethical consideration.....	16
1.15 Terminology.....	17
1.16 Overview of research chapters	17
2. Theoretical framework of education policies and the role of stakeholders.....	19
2.1 Introduction.....	19
2.2 Theoretical framework of education policies and the role of stakeholders.....	20
2.2.1 Pre-education policy (apartheid).....	20
2.2.2 Educational policy after new dispensation.....	21
2.3 Funding and infrastructural educational policies of both systems pre- and after the new dispensation.....	28
2.3.1 Funding (Apartheid system).....	28
2.3.2 Infrastructures	29
2.4 The role of stakeholders in educational policy (unions, Umalusi and governing bodies)	30
2.4.1 Unions	30
2.5 Conclusion	32

3.	Comparison of different education policies: Pre-and Post Democracy period(1953-to date 2016	34
3.1	Introduction.....	34
3.2	Pre-democracy	35
3.2.1	Bantu education.....	35
3.2.2	Principles of Bantu education	35
3.2.3	Standardisation (Joint Matriculation Board – JMB) during pre-democracy till 1992)	39
3.2.4	The impact of Bantu education on the matric results certificate.....	43
3.3	Post-democracy.....	44
3.3.1	Outcomes-based Policy.....	46
3.3.2	Principles of Outcomes-based education	46
3.3.3	Standardisation of Umalusi matric (Grade 12)	48
3.3.4	The impact of OBE on matric results.....	50
3.4	Summary of all the policies	51
3.4.1	Discussion on two education policies (Bantu education and OBE).....	54
3.4.2	New statistics of pass rate	57
3.4.3	The effects of a Grade 12 certificate during intake at the Universities.....	57
3.5	Conclusion	58
4	Research design and methodology.....	59
4.1	Introduction.....	59
4.2	Research design and methodology.....	59
4.2.1	Research design.....	59
4.2.3	Research methodology.....	62
4.3	Data processing.....	64
4.4	Documents analysis	65
4.5	Conclusion	66
5	Data analysis and presentation of findings.....	67
5.1	Introduction.....	67
5.2	Pre – 1994 legislative policy (1939 – 1994)	67
5.2.1	Origin of Christian National Education (CNE) 1939.....	67
5.3	The Bantu Education Act 47 of 1953.....	69
5.3.1	Objectives	70
5.3.2	Curriculum.....	70

5.3.3	Funding	70
5.3.4	Infrastructure.....	70
5.4	Findings.....	71
5.5	New dispensation National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996.....	73
5.5.1	National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996	74
5.5.2	South African Schools Act 84 of 1996	74
5.5.3	Education Labour Relations Act 146 of 1993.....	75
5.5.4	School Education Act 6 of 1995 of Gauteng	75
5.6	Findings.....	77
5.7	Reports of role-players and stakeholders in education	81
5.7.1	Umalusi	82
5.7.2	Teacher unions	82
5.7.3	Parents.....	82
5.7.4	Governing bodies	83
5.7.5	Non-governmental organisations (NGOs)	83
5.8	Findings.....	86
5.9	Validity and reliability	87
5.10	Conclusion	87
6	Recommendations and conclusion.....	88
6.1	Introduction.....	88
6.2	Summary of findings and conclusion.....	88
6.2.1	Pre-1994 legislative policy (1939).....	88
6.2.2	Post-1994	89
6.3	The role of stakeholders in education	91
6.5	Recommendations of the study	93
6.6	Recommendations for further study.....	94
6.7	Conclusion	95
7.	Bibliography	96
	Annexure 1.....	97

Chapter 1: General Introduction

1.1 Introduction

The rationale of this study focuses on the widespread concern that The Basic National Department of Education and Umalusi (the Education Department's quality watchdog) are "fiddling" with exam results (Ramphela 2009:19). The General and Further Education and Training Quality Assurance Act 58 of 2001, which established Umalusi (Shepherd) legislates the quality assurance functions for which Umalusi is responsible. In terms of paragraph 16(2)(e) of this Act, Umalusi has the responsibility of issuing certificates for qualifications at the exit points in general and further education and training. Umalusi is mandated to ensure that these certificates are credible both nationally and internationally. Umalusi therefore, issues certificates to candidates as stipulated in the regulations for the issuing of certificates (Umalusi: Directives for Certification National Senior Certificate 2010:9).

The results of the 2008 Grade 12 examination have received negative publicity from the media and different sectors of South African communities: educationists, academics, individuals, political parties and also civil societies. This motivated the researcher to embark on this study.

It is the culmination of the first ever comprehensively revised national school curriculum and a national examination in South Africa. These curriculum changes were essential, but resulted in unintended consequences which will be dealt with under the relevant headings. The issue of negative publicity, following the delay in providing results for 56,351 candidates in the 2008 National Senior Certificate examination, including a large number of candidates who did not turn up to write ("no shows") (Report by Ministerial Committee 2009:3) . This will also be discussed in detail under the relevant headings.

1.2 Background of the Study

Historical-educational research is undertaken with the view of putting the education phenomenon into proper perspective. Venter (1985) is of the opinion that historical education investigation refers to the systematic placing of historical education variables under the searchlight. The general, continual pedagogical fundamental problems are accentuated against the multiplicity of

historical detail. This then makes historical-educational research an orderly (systematic and controlled) process of knowledge enrichment (Venter & Van Heerden 1989:106).

The National Senior Certificate was established in terms of the National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996). The National Senior Certificate is a qualification at level 4 on the national qualifications framework (NQF) that was to be awarded in 2008 for the first time to Grade 12 candidates who comply with the national policy requirements set out in the policy document. The said Act stipulates the policy and the rules that govern the whole education system. However, 2008 was a year with special changes emanating from the implementation of the first NSC examination for all Grade 12 learners. It is therefore necessary to highlight these challenges so that the findings of the investigation by the Ministerial Committee can be understood in the context of these challenges (Report by Ministerial committee 2009:10).

One of the challenges identified by the Ministerial Committee is the amendment of the examination time frames. In 2008 the Council of Education Ministers (CEM) and Heads of Education Departments Committee (HEDCOM) decided that the 2008 examinations commence later in the year in order to allow for more time for teaching and learning. This late commencement of the examination without the shifting of the originally planned date of the release of results led to the limited time period for the marking, capturing and processing of results (Report by Ministerial committee 2009:3). Normally it takes 47 days to furnish all the processes regarding results but in 2008 the time frame was reduced to 27 days.

Despite the fact that examinations were delayed by 18 days, the date for the release of the results remained 30 December 2008. The pressure of completion was left with examination administrators/officials. Finally, the results were released at the said date.

While the candidates and society in general were still in shock because of the problems surrounding the results, which was thought to be an administrative problem, they had heard about the “thing” called standardisation which is performed by the National Department of Education, Umalusi and other assessment bodies. The question that arises is the following: What is this standardisation and what did it have to do with the National Senior Certificate? In the introduction to this thesis where Umalusi is defined and its roles mentioned, precisely what was happening during the standardisation process was discussed. The fact remains that the marks had

been tampered with and the process was not taking place in the public arena. Hence the assumptions that the Department of Education and Umalusi were “fiddling” with the results.

There is no doubt that there is an education crisis in South Africa. This issue was eloquently articulated by Professor Kader Asmal in his first speech in Parliament in 1999 when he took up his education portfolio as the Minister of Education. He declared that the education system was in a crisis. Subsequent to that, the Minister wasted no time in promising to overhaul the system, launching his ambitious plan *Tirisano* with much aplomb, announcing the end of illiteracy in South Africa by 2004. The Minister also called for a review of Curriculum 2005 (Seepe 2004:114). It is called Curriculum 2005 because its implementation would only start in 2005. Curriculum 2005 was officially gazetted as a discussion document in June 1996.

Curriculum 2005 has been described in policy documents as a “paradigm shift” because it represents a radical departure from the previous curriculum in terms of its theoretical underpinnings, structure and organisation, teaching and learning processes, and assessment (South Africa, Department of Education 1997:1).

It is the outcome of protracted and complicated processes of curriculum development within the context of systematic education change and wider societal transformation.

Curriculum 2005 is the expression of a new curriculum for South Africa (Currim 1998:69). The implementation of education policy which emanates from the National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996 has some flaws which forced the policy-makers to review the policy; hence the issue of curriculum change.

Furthermore, the 2008 matric results which were the first results of examinations written under Curriculum 2005 and the National Curriculum Statement respectively were riddled with problems. Firstly, it caused the delay of the release of the National Senior Certificate Grade 12 examination results for 563 351 candidates in 2008.

Secondly, there were candidates whose School Based Assessment (SBA) (which form part of the overall examination marks) marks were outstanding on 30 December 2008 when the results were released. To be exact, SBA marks constitute 25% of the examination marks. Lastly, there was

confusion between the different language levels, that is, instead of learners registering for Home Language, they were registered for First Additional Language.

The case in point involves one particular case in Gauteng where the research for this study took place. A school registered approximately two hundred candidates for Afrikaans First Additional Language, only to realise that they should have registered the candidates for Home Language. Principals were not able to distinguish between First Additional Language, Second Additional Language and Home Language. This error was only detected when the results were released and the marks of the candidates were listed as incomplete (Report by Ministerial Committee 2009:18). The Committee charged with the review of Curriculum 2005 identified the following:

- Complex language and confusing terminology used in Curriculum 2005 documents. Three particular problems identified were: the use of meaningless jargon, vague and ambiguous language, the unnecessary use of unfamiliar terms to replace familiar ones and lack of a common understanding and use of Curriculum 2005 terminology (*The policy handbook of educators H-44*). Instead of language being helpful, it becomes an obstruction, bearing in mind that the language used to communicate to the “blacks” is still a struggle. By using complex and unfamiliar language and jargon the problem is exacerbated.
- The 2008 National Senior Certificate results are the reflection of C 2005/OBE and the product of the first examination written under the new education policy.

The theory that Professor Bengu emulates with regard to Outcomes-based Education was informed by the theory which was espoused by the scholar Paul Freire, in his book, *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (1993). He talks about two concepts of education, which are the “banking” concept of education and “problem-posing” concept (Freire 1993:72–83). The banking concept of education means that it is content-based while the problem-posing concept of education means one which is based on outcomes. Bengu’s idea was brilliant but the timing of execution was poor. One reason is that the implementers were not trained to teach the new education system. Other factors are the infrastructure and human resources in South Africa. The infrastructure (school buildings) does not allow room for the OBE system. A lack of class rooms, which should

accommodate twenty-five to thirty pupils per class, and the ratio of teachers to pupils are still far beyond reach. In some parts of the country learners are still being taught under trees.

The researcher's view is that poor planning and poor policy formulation constituted the error of judgement from the side of policy-makers. The following are examples of what the researcher sees as poor planning and poor policy formulation:

- The scrapping of corporal punishment in schools resulted in poor discipline of learners in most schools. According to Naong (2007:283), there is a direct correlation between (teacher) morale and (learner) discipline at school. Since the scrapping of corporal punishment, a sense of despair seems to prevail amongst teachers in South Africa (Naong 2007:283).
- Subject combination and certificate requirements led to the combination of high and standard grade subjects which was also a challenge. Name changes of subjects which in most cases confuse the educators were problematic as stated in the preceding paragraphs.
- The closure of teachers' training colleges led to the shortage of teachers and retrenchment packages led to well-qualified teachers leaving the profession which also posed a problem with regard to the education of the children.

Those are but a few of the problems that the researcher sees as poor planning and poor policy formulation. The then Gauteng Member of Executive Council (MEC) education, Barbara Greecy, made a call for retired teachers to step in to help pupils (Greecy 2010:03), as this was caused by a lack of experience and foresight from the ministry of education. The result was that the South African education system has become nothing short of a mockery.

The Department of Education embarked on the curriculum review in August 1995 and key stakeholders were part of the process (Bengu 1997:1). A counterargument is that, since his appointment as Minister of Education, he had however alienated most of his fractious constituency with his undemocratic and autocratic style as well as his refusal to take responsibility for a series of fiascos (Van Niekerk & Ludman 1999:65). The counterargument is backed by the statement that reads: "Education Minister Sibusiso Bengu has pushed ahead with Curriculum 2005, despite warning signs that it is too much too soon for the over-burdened

education system” (Van Niekerk & Ludman 1999:65). 2007 was the last year that matrics wrote subjects at higher grade and standard grade level. In the new curriculum subjects will be offered at one level only. This is a recipe for disaster.

It is an undisputable fact that there are average learners who were accommodated by standard grade and weaker learners who took lower grade levels. If the Education Department merges all grades, how are those average learners going to cope with the standard that is expected to accommodate both good and average learners. The new curriculum which was phased in at Grade 1 in 1998, will result in major changes to the present assessment practice and particularly to the role and structure of examinations.

However, the Senior Certificate Examinations in its present form (in 1998) would have to be maintained for the next five years at least, during which period the new approach to assessment will be phased in up to Grade 12 (National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996). The new curriculum certificate will be called the National Senior Certificate (NSC). Furthermore, one must bear in mind that new books and any other related materials have to be produced and printed. The answer to this disaster was loud and clear: parents, pupils, teachers, principals and textbook publishers called for the resignation of Bengu on a regular basis and at the end of 1998 he announced that he would retire at the end of his term.

Bengu stated that “The Outcomes-Based Education, will continue as it aims at equipping all learners with knowledge, competencies and orientations needed for success after they leave school or have completed their training” (Van Niekerk & Ludman 1999:65). This was despite the call for his resignation. The question that arose was the following: If the curriculum was as excellent as the Minister purported, why was it that matric marks obtained in subjects not taken in the learners’ home language were adjusted upward by 1,05% (Van Niekerk & Ludman 1999: 6)? Why was it that immediately after Asmal took office as the Minister of Education, he declared that education was in a crisis and promised to overhaul the system?

The question was who should the South African citizens believe? Kader Asmal’s first public pronouncement when he took up his education portfolio was a breath of fresh air. With characteristic boldness, he declared that the education system was in a crisis. He wasted no time in promising to overhaul the system, launching his ambitious plan, *Tirisano*, with much aplomb,

announcing the end of illiteracy in South Africa by 2004 (Seepe 2004:114).Like any other politician, he came with “new” ideas. He called for the review of Curriculum 2005 and indicated that an evaluation of the South African Qualifications Authority might also be undertaken. The Curriculum review brought a sigh of relief to those who had long questioned the viability of this ambitious project of the former Minister.

What was of concern was that there was no mention of meeting with or rather consulting the people who were there before to establish the facts of why it was that most of the people in general and the education sector in particular were calling for the resignation of his predecessor. For instance, the Association of Vice-Chancellors of Historically Disadvantaged Tertiary Institutions (Asahdi), the South African Democratic Teachers’ Union (SADTU), the Congress of South African Students (COSAS) and the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) to mention but a few, were up in arms. These were the people who were very vocal about the removal of the then Minister Bengu.

The review committee’s report vindicated those who had cautioned against the rushed implementation of Curriculum 2005.At the time they had been labelled counter-revolutionaries and prophets of doom. The Ministry of Education then, led by Asmal’s over-reliance on the task-teams, the composition of which was consistently problematic, marginalised both the already established policy processes and important roles of the education officials. This answers the concern of why it was that the Ministry of Education was not consulting the people that were there before. Then Minister of Education’s seemingly dismissive attitude led him to become involved in a war with influential groupings such as the South African Democratic Teachers Union, the Congress of South African Students and the Congress of South African Trade Unions. The Minister’s boldness may indicate an under-estimation of the task at hand (Seepe 2004:115).

The above paragraph states categorically that the attitude of the then Minister, was the same as of his predecessor. Minister Bengu also alienated most of his constituency while he was in the Office.

In the process the learners and the teachers suffered. It is disturbing to realise that ten years had been wasted without a well-articulated education system in South Africa. As it is shown that the Minister of Education has no idea about education issues, South African citizens are still

weighted down with the policies that were introduced by Bengu, who resigned because of the pressure from society about his education system around which it seemed nobody could get his or her head around.

The issue of reviewing Curriculum 2005 was only a political statement; there was no substance attached to it. This was supported by the statement that Curriculum 2005 meant that Curriculum 2005 was going to be operational from the year 2005, which was the same OBE but called by a new name. The review of Curriculum 2005 by that Ministerial Committee was followed by the Report of the Ministerial Task Team for the Review of the Implementation of the National Curriculum Statement, October 2009 which made several recommendations to improve the Curriculum. Key recommendations and decisions the Minister made include:

- decisions with immediate effect for implementation from 2010
- decisions with a longer term effect for implementation during the period 2012–2014.

Decisions with immediate effect for implementation from 2010 were:

- discontinuation of the Learner Portfolio Files
- requirements for a single teacher file for planning
- reduction of the number of projects required by learners
- the discontinuation of Common Task of Assessment (*Curriculum News*, Department of Education 2011:4).

The researcher will deal only with recommendations and decisions of immediate effect as the research period ends in 2012.

Ms Naledi Pandor took office in 2004 as the Minister of Education. She served as Minister of Education from 2004 until 2009. It was just a year before the implementation of C2005.

“Ms Pandor will be judged by the performance of this year’s intake of first-year students who wrote the first National Senior Certificate examination, which some critics said had low standards. She oversaw a complete overhaul of the education system under her tenure. Having observed the work of three education ministers since 1995 (Bengu, Asmal and Pandor), I believe that the “school marmish” Pandor is the best of the lot.”(Better the devil you know. 2009 *Mail & Guardian*). Pandor replaced the Senior Certificate with the National Senior Certificate in 2008.

Again, instead of using symbols to reflect the pass mark, they resorted to percentages. The issue of 30% as pass mark instead of 50% and above came into practise when Pandor was the Minister of Education.

In a crude analysis of the three Ministers of Education, one can safely say that the country increased the levels of illiteracy by an unimaginable percentage. Mbeki's period in office can be summarised in one word "catastrophic" (Pottinger2009:137). The above-mentioned statement is backed by the following "the national survey of performance in 2001 for Grade 3 pupils (class of 2010) showed that one third failed in the target for numeracy and half failed literacy" (Pottinger 2009:137). According to the topic, the Gauteng Department of Education is the main focus of the research. The performance of the ministers that followed them will be looked at when the research progresses. The question that arises is: What is to be done?

The role of Umalusi:

- Mark adjustments are made by Umalusi in conjunction with the Department of Education and assessment bodies.
- The data and evidence required for the standardisation of results are determined by Umalusi

The standardisation of marks is the responsibility of Umalusi and its decision is final in all cases (*Government Gazette*2008b:44).

In a concluding remark about the background to the study the researcher can assert that the government's poorly conceived and badly managed education policy was the beginning of its short-sightedness when it comes to grappling with education issues. Examination irregularities relating to Grade 12 examination results of 2008 will be the focus of the investigation because the results were the first product of the new education policy written after the apartheid era.

1.3 Scope of the study

The focus of the study is education, in the period following the democratic election (1994), regarded as a new dispensation, the introduction of a new education policy, OBE/C2005 and the impact of educational policy on the National Senior Certificate in general and in the case of Gauteng in particular. This study covers approximately a period of 15 years, from 1997 to 2012-

that is from the introduction of a new education policy, OBE/C2005 to the release of the implementation of Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement.

1.3.1 Time dimension

The scope of the study will cover the period of the history formation of the National Senior Certificate from 1997 to 2012, when the first Grade 12 examination results written under the new curriculum were released. The researcher deliberately didn't include the first three years of the new government assuming that the ruling party were still familiarising themselves with the processes of governance. From the period 1999 to 2008 they should have settled into meeting new expectations ahead.

1.3.2 Geographical dimension

The National Department of Education and Umalusi, which is based in Pretoria and institutions of higher learning in Gauteng, will be in focus. From the institutions of higher learning, the researcher will study the reports which discuss the effect of the new educational policy on the quality of the students at university level. The main reason for the choice of Gauteng as a case study in particular is that, in 2008 there was a delay in the release of Grade 12 examination results that caused an outcry.

1.4 Research problem

The researcher's problem is to establish to what extent education policy impacted on the National Senior Certificate Grade 12 examination results of 2008 and the role which Umalusi played, especially with regard to the 2008 results which were the first results based on the first set of rules of new subject combinations and requirements. Moreover, after the results were released, there was an outcry and uproar in the country regarding the results. When the researcher looks at the impact of education policy in South Africa today, he sees that the implementation of OBE/C2005 took place in an environment characterised by enormous infrastructural backlogs, resource limitations, inadequate supply of quality learning-support materials and an absence of common national standards for learning and assessment.

The following questions need to be dealt with in order to provide a brief overview of what to anticipate in the research. How did educational policy impact on the National Senior Certificate (NSC) examination results of 2008 and why did the 2008 examination results receive negative

publicity? What were the policy implementation challenges? New subject combinations and certification requirements were implemented in 2008, entailing a number of changes which had to be communicated to teachers and administrators. Based on this research problem, the following sub-problems can be formulated:

- What was the implication of education policy change by each Minister of Education who took up the Office?
- Was the uproar and outcry by the public, academics, individuals, educationists and interest groups to mention but a few after the release of Grade 12 examination results of 2008 justified or not?
- Was OBE/C2005 responsible for what happened concerning Grade 12 examination results of 2008?

1.5 Research question

What were the policy implementation challenges?

1.6 Research objectives

This research aims to investigate the extent to which the impact of the education policy changed and the impact of its implementation on National Senior Certificate relating to Grade 12 examination results from 2008 to date.

The objectives are as follows:

- To investigate how policy change and its implementation impacted on teaching and learning.
- To determine how policy change and its implementation impacted on National Senior Certificate examination results from 2008 to date.
- To gather information which indicates how society has responded to education in a democratic era (after the 1994 election), particularly OBE/C2005 examination results from 2008 to date.
- To provide guidelines and proposals for those who are responsible for education planning, with due consideration of the democratic era's developments.

Recommendations for reform will be made with a view to assist education planners with other alternatives for education to be established in future.

1.7 Purpose of study

The primary purpose of the study is to investigate challenges to education policy change and the implementation of OBE/C2005 with regard to the National Senior Certificate examination results of 2008. More specifically, the study will examine how the implementation of the education policy has impacted on the National Senior Certificate Grade 12 examination results of 2008 in Gauteng.

1.8 Significance of study

The study was intended to investigate the impact of educational policy on the NSC from the introduction of OBE/C2005 in 1997 to the release of Grade 12 examination results in December 2008. The point of departure is the widespread concern that the National Department of Education and Umalusi are “tampering” with the results. The focus of the investigation was on Gauteng in particular because the province received negative publicity from media and different sectors of South African communities such as, educationists, academics, individuals, political parties and also civil societies.

It is important to investigate the impact of educational policy on the NSC of this particular year (2008), because the release of many of the results was delayed to a factor which was linked to policy issues according to documents analysed. Furthermore, the Minister of Basic Education had to intervene and as a result of her intervention, the researcher realised the need for investigation. The Ministerial Committee was set up and the findings reflected the flaws of the educational policy.

“Many of the South African pupils who wrote their matriculation examination in 1983 will always recall that year as “the year of tears and disaster” (Mathonsi 1988:5). Similarly, those pupils who wrote their Grade 12 examinations in 2008 will also always recall that year as the year of tears and disaster. The above paragraphs outlined the reasons why they will always recall that year, hence the importance of the researcher undertaking this investigation.

1.9 Motivation for study

The current education policy, which is the bedrock of the new curriculum, has left the researcher with more questions than answers. It is worth mentioning that it is precisely because of these unanswered questions that the researcher chose the topic. Universities complain that the national examination is no longer a benchmark for admission (Gower, Dibetle & Mohlala 2010:11). The examination has become devalued and Umalusi (the Education Department's quality watchdog) "massages" results. Due to the Department of Education and Umalusi "fiddling" with the marks, Universities are compelled to compensate (Gower *et al* 2010:11).

The researcher is an employee of the Department of Education and as a result, he is constantly confronted with questions from some sectors of society in informal gatherings about the problems they have identified in our education system as ordinary citizens. It is for this reason that the researcher is duty bound to find out if the education system is "failing our young ones" as South African citizens normally put it. The National Department of Education as a custodian of our education is expected to answer questions posed by South African society. According to Taylor (1993:60) an influential body of work has emerged to suggest that the curriculum is a central arena in which the ideology of the state is both projected and contested. The curriculum is a source of conflict because it embodies the values, norms, interest, priorities and directions of society. The National Certificate Examination results of 2008 are the products of curriculum change in the South African education system.

1.10 Research design and methodology

In this chapter, the research design, population, instruments and methods used in data gathering, as well as data analysis are described. A qualitative approach was followed. Data was obtained through documents, such as books, journals, education policy Acts, speeches, minutes of the meetings and newspapers.

1.11 Research design

A research study design indicates the general plan of the research. This includes when and from whom the data will be obtained.

In this study a qualitative research strategy will be followed. The primary aim of qualitative studies is in-depth descriptions and understanding of actions and events and the research is

conducted in the natural setting of social actors (Babbie & Mouton 2001:270). A research design can be described as the map the researcher will use in order to answer the research question. Green and Thorogood (2009:42) refer to the design as the “logic of the study: the what, how and why of data production”. Yegidis and Weinbach (1996:89) talk about the research design as the plan of how the research will be conducted. According to Bless and Higson-Smith (1999:63) research design could be seen as the planning to guide the researcher in collecting, analysing and interpreting observed and collected data. In this study the case study on the impact of educational policy on the National Senior Certificate Grade 12 examination results of 2008 is qualitative and descriptive.

1.12 Research methodology

Documents and content analysis and literature reviews will be used to obtain information regarding the impact of education policy with specific reference to the NSC Grade 12 examination results of 2008. The methods used entail a literature review and document analysis. The literature review will consist of a review of articles, government gazettes, and electronic data of both published and unpublished documents. By means of inductive reasoning employed in the study, literature review, and document analysis will be analysed qualitatively so as to link the objectives with the findings used to investigate the challenges encountered by teachers and learners alike during the implementation of OBE/C2005. A detailed design methodology to be used in this study is outlined in chapter 2.

The researcher preferred to use the above research design and data methodology on the basis of its advantages viz: the greatest advantage of a case study is that it permits a researcher to reveal the way a multiplicity of factors have interacted to produce the unique character of the entity that is the subject of the research.

If we can assume that every person, group, organisation, or event is unique – unlike any other in its details – then the case study becomes a suitable vehicle for depicting that uniqueness (Thomas 2003:35). The researcher’s topic is suitable for case study as a comparable framework within which different policies will be analysed and compared. The policies in question are those of Christian National Education (CNE), Bantu Education and Outcomes-based education (OBE)/Curriculum 2005 (C2005). The other advantage of seeking secondary data which is

suitable in conducting a case study is that of time efficiency and saving on costs of acquiring information (Sekaren&Bougie2013:116).

1.13 Data analysis

In view of the qualitative research approach adopted for this research project, the approach to data analysis in this study was based on certain qualitative traditions. Qualitative data analysis is, as suggested by Creswell (2009:175), inductive in nature where the researcher's point of departure was to generate themes as they emerged from the data collected. Creswell (2009:183) refers to data analysis as a process of "meaning making" related to data collected. This is an on-going process of analytical reflection of the assembled data. Just as stories, without meanings attached to them, could be described as mere skeletons without substance, so too can research data be referred to without meaning being ascribed to the data.

The researcher acknowledges the complexity and dynamics of any system, so too with reference to this study. The study therefore did not set itself out to generalise or prove or disprove any casual relationships, but merely to explore and describe the experiences and perspectives implied in the experiences of the participants, in this case participants and different documents and literature analysed.

The value of the data analysis engendered by this study was to cultivate an in-depth understanding of the "participants'" view of the educational policies in South Africa, moving from Christian National Education (CNE), Bantu Education and Outcomes-based education (OBE)/Curriculum 2005 (C2005) and its continual amendments until 2012. In the aforementioned educational systems, Grade 12 results were at the centre of the investigation.

Document and data analysis was used as my main method of data collection and analysis. Prior (2003:4) has conducted extensive work on the use of documents in research and claims that "in most social scientific work, of course, documents are placed at the margins of consideration". The modern world is made through writing and documentation (Prior 2003:4). Prior takes Weber's assertions and provides insightful discussion regarding the nature of documents in organisations:

- Documents form a field for research in their own right, and should not be considered as mere props for action.

- Documents need to be considered as situated products, rather than as fixed and stable things in the world.
- Documents are produced in social settings and are always to be regarded as collective (social) products.
- Determining how documents are consumed and used in organised settings, that is, how they function, should form an important part of any social scientific research project.
- In approaching documents as a field for research we always keep in mind the dynamic involved in the relationship between production, consumption, and content (Prior2003:26).

The researcher has consciously taken note of the above issues when he opted to use documents as his method of data collection and analysis.

1.14 Ethical consideration

According to McMillan and Schumacher (2001:411), the progress of a study often depends on the relationship the researcher builds with the participants. De Vos (1998:25) and Strydom, in De Vos (1998:56) indicate that ethics can be described as a set of moral principles, which offers rules and behavioural expectations about the most correct conduct towards participants in research. Treating the information given by the respondent as strictly confidential and guarding his/her privacy is one of the primary responsibilities of the researcher. There should be absolutely no misrepresentation or distortion in reporting the data collected during the study (Sekaren&Bougie2013:162-163). Within qualitative research, ethics are closely linked to concepts of credibility, dependability and conformability.

Research projects are bound to raise ethical considerations. This is especially true when they involve people directly, but may also be the case if research is conducted entirely on documentary evidence. The researcher has opted to use the latter to conduct his research because of its convenience in terms of accessibility. Ethics in research involves getting the informed consent of those who are going to be interviewed, questioned, observed or from whom materials are collected (Fox & Bayat 2007:148).

1.15 Terminology

As was mentioned in the introduction, terms or key words will be defined. The following are terms or key words which will be used regularly in the research.

- **Department of Education:** refers to the national department of education responsible for education.
- **School:** refers to a public school or independent school which enrolls learners in one or more grades between Grade R and Grade 12.
- **Curriculum:** is everything planned by educators which will help develop the learner.
- **Outcome:** these are the results of learning processes and refer to knowledge, skills, attitudes and values within particular contexts.
- **Candidate:** indicates a learner who has registered for the National Senior Certificate final examinations.
- **Grade:** refers to that part of an educational programme that a learner may complete in one year, or any other education programme that the Member of the Executive Council (MEC) may deem to be equivalent thereto.
- **Examination:** refers to the National Senior Certificate examination conducted at the end of the year.
- **National Senior Certificate:** a qualification at level 4 on the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) that was awarded in 2008 for the first time to Grade 12 candidates who comply with the national policy requirements set out in the policy document.
- **Policy:** means a body of rules and regulations which is usually found in acts, ordinances, by-laws, circulars and memoranda.

1.16 Overview of research chapters

This section on the overview of chapters provides a summary of issues that will be dealt with in detail when the main research is undertaken. However, the chapters are not separate entities as information in one chapter may be linked and related to information in another chapter.

Chapter 1: General introduction

Chapter 2: Theoretical framework of education policies and role of stakeholders

Chapter 3: Comparison of different policies: Pre-and Post Democracy period (1953-to date 2016)

Chapter 4: Research design and methodology

Chapter 5: Data analysis and presentation of findings

Chapter 6: Recommendation and conclusion

1.17 Summary

This chapter of the dissertation explains the purpose of the study, describes the research design and methodology used, and paves the way for subsequent chapters 2 to 6 of the dissertation. Education planners and policy-makers may find the data contained in this dissertation relevant to situations where transformation in education is in progress. Educators and learners may find data contained in this dissertation worth reading for academic advancement and personal enrichment.

The contents of this chapter indicate that the focus of the dissertation is on the impact of educational policy on National Senior Certificate Grade 12 examination results of 2008 which caused an outcry after they were released on 30 December 2008. It is an undisputable fact that when there is a change in government, the education system also changes. With chapter 1 as the foundation, the next chapter will turn to literature review which provides a clear perspective on how educational policy was impacted on National Senior Certificate Grade 12 examination results of 2008.

Chapter 2: Theoretical framework of education policies and the role of stakeholders

2.1 Introduction

Education is regarded as an investment in human capital and therefore the education system is expected to be efficient and accountable to both the state and its citizenry (Mathibe1998:2). Mazibuko (2012:10) provides interesting observations on the issue of education as part of human capital: “education as a form of human capital is as fundamental to the development of a country as it is to the development of individuals in society”.

In 1996 a new curriculum, Outcomes-based Education (OBE) or Curriculum 2005 (C 2005) was introduced –following the advent of South Africa’s multiparty democracy in 1994. It was criticised for its abstract terminology, many subjects condensed into learning areas (8) and an overload of many specific outcomes (67) (Seale 2012:8). In 2002 the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) was introduced to make the curriculum easier to implement.

Much of the terminology was changed, for example, learning areas became subjects, specific outcomes and assessment criteria became assessment standards. Eighteen years since the advent of multiparty democracy, teachers are still grappling with the constantly changing curriculum as reflected in the Johannesburg daily newspaper with the heading: New curriculum same problems (Seale 2012:2). The research will ultimately prove or disprove the disastrous nature of the “new” curriculum. Merely to call for a policy review is to concede the possibility of failure. A review, by its very nature, carries the threat of exposure (Kraak & Young 2001:52). It is an undisputable fact that when there is a change in government, the education system also changes. South Africa was no exception.

In the light of the preceding statement it can be deduced that education in democratic South Africa faces various challenges and has specific functions to fulfil. It is these issues, evident in the current education system that aroused the interest of the researcher, prompting him to investigate the impact of the education policy on the National Senior Certificate (NSC) in Gauteng. The investigation took place in Gauteng precisely because in 2008, the release of NSC

results was delayed and this received negative publicity from the media. It is believed that an in-depth investigation of this issue will significantly enhance the understanding of the impact of education policy on NSC in the country's democratic era.

State control in education requires well-organised, good planners and efficient management which will ensure that the ultimate product will advance the interest of the society. This involves ensuring that education policy is based on norms, standards and values that are enshrined in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996. History has proved that for any education system to succeed it should have management teams comprising highly qualified personnel, the bureaucrats. These bureaucrats are selected on the basis of the specialised knowledge they have amassed in their chosen field which is useful to the state. Unfortunately in the South African situation, the researcher has observed a totally different scenario. For instance, former DG (2001-2005) was not an educationist.

2.2 Theoretical framework of education policies and the role of stakeholders

Politics and education cannot be separated. It is necessary to have an understanding of the political climate in the Republic of South Africa in order to understand the educational provision for its citizens.

2.2.1 Pre-education policy (apartheid)

In 1948 the National Party came to power and introduced the apartheid system of education, called Bantu Education. They had a ready and updated version of so-called Christian National Education (CNE), narrow in philosophy, more chauvinist and of wider applicability than the Transvaal version of fifty years earlier. The word Christian in this context was defined as "according to the creed of the three Afrikaner churches", nationalist as "imbued with the love of one's own, especially one's own language, history and culture"(Mathonsi 1988:11).

In order to justify the Christian national ideals scientifically, the nationalist government appointed the Eiselen Commission on Native Education in 1949 to formulate 'the principles and aims of education for natives as an independent race, in which their past and present, their inherent racial qualities, their distinctive characteristics and aptitude and their needs under the ever-changing social conditions are taken into consideration. "There is no place for him in the European Community above the level of certain forms of labour...for that reason it is of no avail

for him to receive a training which has as its aim absorption in the European Community...within his own Community, however, all doors are open...until now he has been subjected to a school system which drew him away from his own Community and misled him, by showing him the green pastures of European Society in which he was not allowed to graze (Mathonsi, 1988: 11-12).The 1953 Bantu Education Act 47 was one of apartheid's most offensive racist laws. It brought African education under control of the government and extended apartheid to black schools. Previously, most African schools were run by missionaries with some state aid. The white government made it clear that Bantu education was designed to teach African learners to be "hewers of wood and drawers of water" for a white-run-economy and society, regardless of an individual's abilities and aspirations.

The ideological framework for Bantu education had its origins in a manifesto crafted in 1939 by Afrikaner nationalists. Based on the racist and paternalistic view, the education of blacks was a special responsibility of a superior white race. The fundamental belief underlying C.N.E is that the whites are inherently superior and non-whites inferior. Education must assist the overall policy of apartheid by ensuring the continuation of the existing order. Hence education for them should be of the "inferior" type. This is the basis for Bantu education (Lorgat, 1962:41). It is important to state that National Senior Certificate is a stepping stone to a better future for the African children. But Bantu education policy thwarted their chances of reaching matric through its unequal funding policy. Africans were receiving low funding.

2.2.2 Educational policy after new dispensation

The ascendancy to power of the liberation movement in South Africa resulted in the recognition of education as a human right that is enshrined in the Constitution (chapter 2, Bill of Rights: 14).The observation of the right to education involves a person's ability to attain other rights. The relevance of this policy context in this study is two-fold:

- In the first instance, the policy environment reflects the distance we, as the people of South Africa, have travelled since the Kliptown Congress in 1955.
- Secondly, education policy generally impacted on National Senior Certificate examination results of 2008 in particular and beyond.

Education and politics cannot be separated. It is therefore appropriate to internalise the new educational policy and its impact on the national senior certificate's final examination results of 2008 and beyond. It is interesting to note that a country's type of government is mirrored in the pattern of control and administration of its education system. Apart from policy formulation, the government has control over matters such as compulsory education, types of schools, school buildings, curriculum and syllabus construction and teaching methods. "The authentic education of the African will start not just with changing the historical, cultural, political and economic history books of our schools. Rather it will start when already educated Africans abandon the easy way out by producing what they need rather than depending on Europeans and Caucasian Americans. All we have to do is copy what they already done and use it for our own benefit. We don't have to invent a new mousetrap; it has already been invented" (Onyeani 1990:146).

The source of innovation is knowledge, not new knowledge, but knowledge that is already available and which can be modified, adapted and applied to particular problems in the local context (Seepe 2004:190). The differences between the "old" and "new" approaches is that the old syllabus is content-based while with the new there is an integration of knowledge, learning which is relevant and connected to real-life situations. The National Senior Certificate examination results of 2008, however, painted a different picture about the new knowledge. The results generated a concern in the public arena. So far the researcher has noted that education policy-makers have re-invented the wheel. That is why there are so many challenges to get the education system right. There is OBE/C2005, Revised National Curriculum Statement and now currently Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS).

Policy failures often arise out of a variety of factors including both intrinsic and extrinsic sources (Jansen & Sayet 2001:32). For example, intrinsic factors may include the fact that implementation may be unsuccessful largely because the policy in question was poorly conceived and developed. On the other hand, the absence of resources, both human and financial, to support implementation of policy represents the operation of extrinsic factors (Jansen & Sayet 2001:32). The important lesson in all this- is that when statutory bodies fail in the execution of their mandates, delivery of goods and services is compromised (Jansen & Sayet 2001:32). The system of OBE failed because it warrants vast planning and preparation as well as frequent evaluation of pupils in the class and afterwards.

The question that arises pertains to the impossibility of doing frequent evaluation in classes of 50 and above. Ill-discipline is also a massive problem in all schools partly as a result of the abolishment of corporal punishment (Greecy2010:15). 2012 Annual National Assessment results written by Grades 6 and 9 is testament to the failure of educational policy. The national maths average of 13% is a cause for concern (Block 2012:01). In 1999 and 2003 respectively South African pupils were placed last internationally in maths and science (Block2012:14). This reflects the poor quality of educational policy decisions.

2.2.2.1 Outcomes-based education

“The South African position is rather like that of a climber who sets out on the north face of the Eiger and high up finds he has chosen a wrong route, a cul-de-sac. He has a lot of trouble relocating his pitons and re-slinging his ropes. He has to backtrack before he can go forward again” (Relly 1987: 1).

Outcomes-based education (OBE) reflects the above and was introduced by Professor Sibusiso Bengu, while Professor Kader Asmal championed it as an education policy. Yet from the beginning, its implementation created huge challenges. The core pedagogical problem, however, lies with the implementation of a process called outcomes-based education(OBE),which in South Africa is called a “statement”, on a fatally deficient educational platform (Pottinger2008:135). Already, there was a decrease in the number of older and experienced teachers, whose actual number decreased by 26% between 1991 and 1994 (Chisholm, Motala & Vally 1993–2000:419). Standards were falling – and things were going downhill. Even researchers and policy- makers who came into the spotlight were found wanting, ill-informed about what goes on in the classroom, and lacking in answers to the problems. Government was failing, education was failing. Individuals were failing. Society itself had failed (Chisholm *et al* 1993–2000:425).

The first five years under Prof Sibusiso Bengu as Minister of Education after the 1994 elections were of necessity years of setting in place “sound” policies, whereas the next five years from the time when Prof Kader Asmal took over would be a period of implementation. Instead Prof Asmal decided to overhaul the whole system and review C2005 in depth. During Prof Bengu’s era one could not talk of success or non-success because it was a time of policy formulation. When implementation was to take place, stakeholders had already called for his resignation. Some of the reasons were that teachers were not trained to teach the new curriculum and

textbook publishers were not ready to print new books. This affected learners who wrote matric in 1998.

The national matric pass rate was 49,3% (Greecy 2010:13). Despite Bengu's resignation, OBE continued. The country heard Asmal, when he took up his education portfolio in 1999 as the Minister of Education, declaring that the education system was in crisis. Subsequent to that, Asmal wasted no time in promising to overhaul the system. He launched his ambitious plan, Tirisano, with much aplomb, announcing the end of illiteracy in South Africa by 2004. He also called for a review of Curriculum 2005 (Seepe 2004:114) the review of Curriculum 2005 (C 2005) would be discussed fully under the relevant sub-heading. Current struggles over education policy provide insight into some of these questions. To understand them, they must be put into historical context according to Swain (2005:180–192). The country's challenges could not be wished away by turning a blind eye (Seepe 2004:282–283).

Jansen (1998:321–331), highlighted challenges that would be encountered by the implementation of OBE under the heading: *Curriculum reform in South Africa: a critical analysis of Outcomes-based education*. They are as follows: In the first instance the policy has been driven by political imperatives which have little to do with the realities of classroom life. The language of OBE is complex, confusing and at times contradictory.

OBE was based on the flawed assumptions about what happened inside schools, how classrooms were organised and what kinds of teachers existed within the system. Teachers as an important constituency had been limited in their participation regarding this important policy. A small elite of teachers, often expert and white, drove the learning area committees and other structures in which OBE had been developed. The sad reality is that the overwhelming majority of teachers simply did not have access to information on OBE or understand OBE in instances where such information might be available (Jansen 1998:321–331). OBE as outcomes does not define content, what policy bureaucrats call the actual learning programmes. Content matters.

The management of OBE would multiply the administrative burdens placed on teachers. For OBE to succeed, it required trained and retrained teachers and radically new forms of assessment. This has not happened. There is neither the fiscal base nor the political will to intervene in the education system at this level of intensity. As the result of the challenges

mentioned above, OBE as education policy was bound to be discontinued. During Prof Asmal's era, the National matric pass rate improved to 73,3% (Greecy 2010:13).

The harsh reality about OBE is that there are thousands of children whose futures were, for a period spanning 12 years, gravely compromised through the authorities experimenting with an ill-fated curriculum based on the ANC's pet interest. We should not let the education system degenerate into an apartheid-era "gutter education", as Dr Mamphela Ramphele stated (Ramphele 2012:8). Relly (1987) shares the same view with the author of the article in *The Star* newspaper (Ramphele 2012:08). According to Relly 1987... "The reality is that the life chances of future generations are being recklessly and relentlessly squandered through a policy whose historical track record of producing desired ends is dismal". "We have failed our children".

2.2.2.2 Introduction of Curriculum 2005

The structure and design of Curriculum 2005 was skewed. Many conceptual confusions, lack of clarity in policy documents and difficulties with the implementation of Curriculum 2005 stem from the defective basic structure and design flaws. Three main areas are identified as requiring attention:

The first is the complex language and confusing terminology used in 2005 curriculum documents (Report of Curriculum 2005 of Review Committee 2000:2). For instance, School Based Assessment (SBA), and the differences between first additional language, second additional language and home language were unclear or difficult to understand. The school principals assumed that they were similar to first and second languages, that is, similar to those in the previous curriculum.

Instead of language being helpful, it became an obstruction. Understanding what C 2005 was, varied with and between schools, as well as amongst and between teachers, trainers and officials (Report of Curriculum 2005 of Review Committee 2000:2). It is clear from all available evidence that although C 2005 generated a new debate on teaching and learning, teachers had a rather shallow understanding of the principles of C2005 (Report of C2005 of Review Committee 2000:2).

The second is the addition of subjects in the curriculum. The inclusion of eight learning areas in the (General Education and Training (GET) band, especially in the Foundation and Intermediate

Phases, meant insufficient time for the development of effective reading skills, foundational mathematics and core concepts in the sciences (Report of Curriculum 2005 of Review Committee 2000:2). This led to the other point that timeframes were unmanageable and unrealistic. The review report mentioned the following: There is widespread agreement that implementation has been too rushed and therefore inadequate. Curriculum 2005 was implemented before it was ready for presentation and without the foundation for good, inspiring training, effective monitoring and a meaningful on-going support process being in place(Report of Curriculum 2005 Review Committee 2000:4).

Unfortunately when all this was happening, teaching and learning was going on and Ramphele and others saw this coming and warned the department of education that proceeding with the implementation of this policy would be a national disaster. They were called counter-revolutionaries. The above paragraph is in line with the views expressed by Dr Mamphela Ramphele, an academic, businesswoman and an activist who is one of those few vocal individuals who from the outset warned the government that OBE/C 2005 would not work in the South African situation. She observed that “Tinkering with it and renaming it the National Curriculum Statement does not deal with fundamental gaps between what teachers know and what they are to teach (Ramphele 2009:18).

People like Dr Ramphele were labelled counter-revolutionaries and prophets of doom by the ruling African National Congress (ANC). In the theatre of ideas such labels are not helpful. Ideas should be judged on the basis of truthfulness, validity, logical sustainability and correspondence with or approximation to reality. In the absence of ideas failures are to be expected (Seepe 2004:282–283).

Pottinger (2009:137) shares the same view with Ramphele that the warning signs of the coming deluge were apparent very early. Not only was the OBE Revised Curriculum Statement failing to produce literate and numerate pupils, it was failing to even get them to think, which was the object of the exercise in the first place. However, this Revised Curriculum Statement is in contrast with the argument put forward by the protagonists of OBE, who insisted that the system was “excellent” and that its guiding vision is that of a thinking, competent future citizen (Bengu 1997:1, 2). These early warnings were ignored and the system remained relentlessly implausible until its young victims graduated from the formal schooling system in 2008. The full impact of

catastrophe is yet to be understood. A generation has very largely been lost. The weakness of the specific design features the promotion of sequence, pace and progression. Learners were not allowed to repeat a grade despite their performance (Report of Curriculum 2005 of Review Committee 2000:2).

It is unfortunate that this scenario happened mostly in government schools. The Curriculum 2005 design structure is strong on integration and weak on conceptual coherence. Conceptual coherence is relatively neglected. This is largely because curriculum designers have attempted to avoid prescribing content, leaving it to teachers to develop (Report of Curriculum 2005 of Review Committee 2000:2–3). “We have failed our children” asserted Ramphela. The South African Schools Act 84 of 1996 was based largely on the report of a commission headed by educationist Dr Peter Hunter, and on a white paper dealing with school organisation, governance and funding. It set the basis for a uniform system of education, which led to two categories of schools: government and private.

In 2004 Ms Naledi Pandor took the office as Minister of education. Curriculum 2005 had already been revised. There was nothing much that Pandor could do but accept to continue where Asmal had left. It was under the leadership of Pandor that the National Senior Certificate examinations results which were based on the first set of rules of new subject combinations were released. These were the first results under three different policies, OBE, Curriculum 2005 and the National Curriculum Statement. Unfortunately, in Gauteng which is a case study, the results were riddled with problems. As a result of the problems encountered, the Minister of Education instituted an investigation into the causes of delays in the release of the results. The causes will be discussed under relevant headings. During Pandor’s term of office, the National Senior Certificate examination results dropped to 62,2%. This was a cause for concern. Curriculum changes seem to have affected the examination results of this particular year. Angie Motshekga took the office as the Minister of Basic Education. In 2012 new curriculum policy was introduced, under the name Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS).

A summary of curriculum changes since 1994 is as follows:

- 1996 OBE (C 2005) introduced,
- 2002 NCS introduced

- 2012 CAPS introduced

These changes can be summarised in one word, namely “catastrophe”.

The Curriculum 2005 Review Committee had identified a lack of alignment between curriculum and assessment policy as an impediment to the National Senior Certificate. Another important element was that learning support materials were variable in quality and often unavailable. The availability of learning materials in schools for curriculum 2005 is uneven. The quality is variable as a result of design flaws in C 2005 and unreliability of the evaluation process (Report of Curriculum2005 Review Committee 2000:3).

2.3 Funding and infrastructural educational policies of both systems pre- and after the new dispensation

Since the apartheid era, many policy changes have occurred within education to try to rectify educational inequalities. The government attempts to deal with equalities through a funding plan that divides schools into five strata according to income levels in the community where the lower income level receives the higher funding per pupil. Distribution of funding across the five quintiles. Currently, the school funding Norms determine that 35-25-20-15-5 distribution of fund should be followed across 1 to 5. The quintiles are in a descending order, that is 1 is the poorest while 5 is the least poor (Department of education, 2003 June 14: 1).

2.3.1 Funding (Apartheid system)

Government funding of black schools became conditional on acceptance of a racially discriminatory curriculum administered by a new department of Bantu Education. Bantu education schools suffered terribly from government’s neglect. Suffice to say that the two social orders for which education is preparing white and black are not identical. The ends are different. The education of the White child prepares him for life in a dominant society and the education of the Black child for a subordinate society (Lorgat, 1962:10). The Bantu Education Account of 1955 made matters worse by mandating that African education be funded by the general poll tax collected from Africans rather than from the General Revenue Account used to fund white education. A central component of apartheid was an education system designed to create an African population that would serve as “hewers of wood and drawers of water” (Terreblanche 2002:47).

Since funding determines the amount and quality of learning materials, facilities, and teachers, disproportionate funding clearly created disparities in learning environments. It is alarming that per capita social spending (including spending on education) on Africans until 1975 was less than 12 per cent of that on whites, and that on Coloureds less than 40 per cent of that on Whites (Terreblanche 2002:389). The issue of funding is crucial in the sense that unqualified teachers were paid by the community while qualified teachers were paid by the state.

Still the funds were not enough to handle all the needs of the schools. Teachers were not prepared to go the extra mile because there were no financial incentives. Their counterparts were given extra money when they gave extra lessons. Even in this democratic era the parents of the learners in quintile four and five schools are paying teachers extra money for the work done after hours. All these issues are reflected in the educational policy and in the end affect the outcomes of National Senior Certificate examination results.

2.3.2 Infrastructures

Dilapidated school buildings, overcrowded classrooms, inadequate instruction, poor teacher training and a lack of textbooks plagued African education country wide. Students struggled to learn under such conditions. Because of a lack of enough schools to take care of all learners, learners used to share classes. There would be a morning class up to 11:00 and then learners would go home and other kids of the same grade would come after 11:00 up to 14:00, hence the teachers would then run two sets of classes...in some situations they would even use a tree in the schoolyard (<http://overcomingapartheid.msu.edu/sidebar.php?id:2>). The system described above was called the cartoon system. The cartoon system is a system whereby some learners start school in the morning and go home at noon while other learners start at noon up until five o'clock. Normally this is caused by lack of classrooms.

It is important to state that, the standard of service provided in the education system is determined mainly by two factors, namely the quality of the person being trained and the quality of the training being received.

As the research is divided into two major periods or phases viz: pre-1994 and post-1994, the researcher will identify the standard of service provided in the education system of both periods in relation to the training of teachers. In a nutshell, the quality of teachers operating in both

periods will be highlighted. As a result of the Afrikaner's unwavering commitment to this goal, more Africans were denied an opportunity to proceed beyond primary schooling. It is the devastating personal, political and economic effects of this discriminatory system continue to be felt and wrestled with today.

The researcher believes that the above information has given a brief account of the aims and objectives of Bantu Education Act 47 of 1953 and its related policies. Having said that, it is important to highlight that in African schools there are no libraries and laboratories. If it happens that there is a library, there are no books and as a result the space would be turned into a classroom. How does one expect a learner to learn subjects like physical science when there are no laboratories to provide practical experience of the subject? Information on the subject is purely theoretical. The policy impacted on the learning and teaching in the school. Ultimately the National Senior Certificate examination results would be affected, especially those from the disadvantaged schools (quintile one to three).

2.4 The role of stakeholders in educational policy (unions, Umalusi and governing bodies)

Stakeholders are defined as individuals or entities that stand to gain or lose from the success or failure of a system or an organisation (Cadora 2008:1). Examples of stakeholders in education are government, parents, students, alumni, administrators, educators, communities and teacher unions, to mention but a few.

2.4.1 Unions

United we stand, divided we fall is the basic idea of trade unionism. It is an idea which remains as true today as it was on the day it was first conceived. Workers only have one strength their collective ability to withdraw their labour and so bring the capitalist system to a halt (Callinicos 1995:7 & 13).

The labour unions today play a different role than in the past. In the past the labour unions aimed to fight for better benefits for the workers. They arranged for the workers to go on strike in order to achieve their aim. But the trade unions today recognise that job protection is their main duty. That is why the labour unions today change the approach from fighting for more pay to job

protection. They are willing to convince workers to accept lower salaries and cut fringe benefits in order to help the company weather the economic downturn.

Labour unions today have to look at the wider economy. They have to look at trends in the global economy. The labour unions today have to learn to see things from both the management's and workers' point of views. Changes in economic dynamics worldwide have resulted in shaping the workforce and led to new curriculum initiatives with serious consequences for teachers and learners. Unions are at work to support and defend public education, not destroy it as opponents argue (Bascia, N & Osmond, P, 2012:2 & 7).

Union Teach has a different view of the role of unions. Its views are that the union's role is to recruit new members, to represent members on local issues or grievances, to distribute union materials, organise meetings of union members at the workplace and attend central union meetings. The researcher's view on unions in South Africa currently is that the role of unions was bound to change to a more moderate approach to be in line with the ruling party, because they are aligned partners. Their militancy can only go to a certain point. As a result the interest of the workers is being compromised. Negotiations of policy formulations including class size are conducted through the Education Labour Relations Council (ELRC), whose members include representatives of the South African Democratic Teacher's Union and the National Professional Teachers' Organisation of South Africa as well as government. Many observers are concerned about the ELRC giving teacher unions too much power. Their observations seem to be true, hence they can strike when the examinations are about to be written, as is the case with SADTU. The strike in most cases affects matric results.

2.4.2 Umalusi

Umalusi is one of the core stakeholders when it comes to National Senior Certificate examinations. One of its responsibilities is to ensure that assessments and examinations of qualifications for which it is responsible are of appropriate standard and quality. The process is called standardisation. Its role in examination results was questioned by the general public when the results of 2008 were released. The concern was that Umalusi and National Department of Education were "fiddling" with the results.

The general public's concern emanates from the fact that Umalusi do make adjustments to the results, either up or down, based on their analysis. Moreover, that Umalusi has the final word before the results could be released. As a result their standardisation process is questionable. Hence it has a "negative" impact on the results and the education policy.

2.4.3 Governing bodies

The school governing body (SGB) must promote the best interest of the school and strive to ensure its development through the provision of quality education for all learners at the school.

The SGB it must:

- adopt a constitution
- develop the mission statement of the school
- adopt a code of conduct for learners at the school
- support the principal, educators and other staff of the school in the performance of their professional functions
- determine times of the school day consistent with any applicable conditions of employment of staff at the school
- administer and control the school's property, and buildings and grounds occupied by the school, including school hostels, if applicable, and encourage parents, learners, educators and other staff at the school to render voluntary services to the school (Brunton and associates 2003:B-12). Governing bodies in quintile four and five schools normally pay teachers extra money when they have worked overtime. As a result of these incentives, the performance of learners is good. The policy changes do not totally affect schools which are run under these conditions.

2.5 Conclusion

It is an undisputable fact that when there is a change in government, the education system also changes (Bantu Education Act 47 of 1953:1). Changes envisaged in the education system relate to an integrated approach to education and training, whereby educational outcomes are more important than the amount of information one can acquire. Outcomes-based education/Curriculum 2005 was designed to ensure that learners acquire skills, knowledge, attitudes and values necessary for effective functioning in a democratic era. So far OBE/C2005

has proved to be unsustainable and an unstable educational policy exists in South Africa. Eighteen years later, the country's education system is still in a trial- and- error situation. As Ramphela noted, "We have failed our children".

The next chapter deals with the comparison of different policies, namely: Bantu Education, OBE/C 2005, NCS and CAPS.

Chapter 3: Comparison of different education policies: Pre-and Post Democracy period (1953- to date 2016)

3.1 Introduction

To compare is a human activity as old as mankind itself. By way of comparison, Eve found the forbidden fruit more attractive and desirable than other fruits in paradise. Man makes use of comparison when he observes, analyses, evaluates, eliminates, differentiates, selects, sorts, arranges, and classifies objects or phenomena on the basis of similarities and differences (Vos, Barnard& Brits 1984:20).

The adoption of an Outcomes-based education (OBE) system referred to as Curriculum 2005 was intended to make a clear break with apartheid education (Ramphela 2008:177). There were shifts in the Education Policy from 1994 to 2012. In a bid to drive quality, there were several curriculum changes made since 1994. It started with Outcomes-based education through Curriculum 2005 (C2005). Curriculum 2005 was aimed at empowering teachers and was resource intensive, not very directive and too complex to implement in most schools. This was reviewed and changes were made to deal with its complexity. The Reviewed National Curriculum Statement (RNCS) envisages teachers who are qualified, competent, dedicated, and caring. Teachers are supposed to assume various roles and these include being mediators of learning, interpreters and designers of Learning Programmes and materials, leaders, administrators and managers, scholars, researchers and lifelong learners, community members, citizens and pastors, assessors and Learning Area or Phase Specialists (DoE 2002:3).

In this chapter the researcher is comparing different South African education policies: Bantu Education 1953, during the apartheid era and after 1994 in the democratic era, Outcomes-based education/Curriculum2005 (1996), the National Curriculum Statement (2002), Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement (2012), whose umbrella body since 2002 to date is Umalusi with regard to the impact on National Senior Certificate.

The National Curriculum Statement is not a new curriculum, but a streamlined and strengthened Curriculum 2005, which was introduced in our schools in 1998 (Department of Education 2002a:2). It is important to give the historical background of these education policies.

3.2 Pre-democracy

When the Nationalists came to power on the doctrine of apartheid in 1948, they had a ready and updated version of so-called Christian National Education (CNE)-narrower in philosophy, more chauvinist and of wider applicability than the Transvaal version of fifty years earlier. The CNE pamphlet advanced an extreme Calvinist and fundamental doctrine as the educational basis. The word Christian in this context was defined as “according to the creed of the three Afrikaner churches”; Nationalist was defined as “imbued with the love of one’s own, especially one’s own language, history and culture”. The fact that large numbers of white South Africans (let alone blacks) did not subscribe to Christian National ideals, or even to Calvinism, was ignored. It must be pointed out that the Christian National ideals are neither Christian nor National –nor truly educational, as can be deduced from Article 15 of the pamphlet (Mathonsi 1988:11). The researcher will deal with Article 15 in the following pages.

3.2.1 Bantu education

The 1953 Bantu Education Act 47 of 1953 was piloted by Dr HF Verwoerd, when he was the Minister of Native Affairs. He said: “When I have control of native education, I will reform it so that natives will be taught from childhood to realise that equality with Europeans is not for them...People who believe in equality are not desirable teachers for natives” (Mathonsi1988:12).

In sharp contrast, the Freedom Charter adopted at the Congress of the people in Kliptown on 26 June 1955 stated that, “the doors of learning and culture shall be opened” (Freedom Charter 1955). The adoption of the Freedom Charter by the African National Congress (ANC) in 1955 was realised by the people of South Africa when ANC took-over power in the 1994 democratic elections when they (ANC) immediately introduced Outcomes-based Education (OBE) as a way of transforming the education system and raising standards. A drastic new policy for the establishment of new curricula for schools was announced by Professor Sibusiso Bengu, Minister of Education on 24 March 1997 (Steyn, Steyn & De Waal 2001:97).

3.2.2 Principles of Bantu education

The National Education Policy Act39 of 1967 laid down the principles of education in South Africa. The specific Act introduced a new era in South African education. The Minister of

Education, Arts and Science (in the central government) was given the responsibility to determine general policy in respect of education in schools subject to consultation with the administrators of the various provinces and the National Advisory Education Council. The act laid down a number of principles which the Minister was obliged to take into account. The principles were as follows:

- The education in schools maintained, managed and controlled by a state department (including a provincial administration) was to have both a Christian and a broad national character. The religious conviction of parents and pupils had to be respected with regard to religious instruction and religious ceremonies.
- The mother tongue (assumed to be either Afrikaans or English) was to be the medium of instruction.
- Uniform requirements regarding compulsory education, school age limits, the conditions of service of teachers and teachers' salary scales were set.
- In schools maintained, managed and controlled by a state department, all education (including books and stationery) was to be provided free of charge to full-time pupils whose parents resided in the republic or were South African citizens.
- Education was to be provided in accordance with the ability, aptitude and interest shown by the pupil, and the needs of the country. Appropriate guidance in that regard had to be provided.
- Syllabi, programmes, examination standards as well as research, investigation and planning in the field of education were to be co-ordinated on a national basis.
- Parent communities were to be given an adequate say in the education of their children via the establishment of parent-teacher's associations, school committees, school boards or any other manner deemed to be fit for this purpose.
- The suggestions and recommendations of officially recognised teachers' associations had to be considered.

The principle of unity of policy was regarded as a cornerstone for future educational development (Booyse, Le Roux, Seroto & Wolhuter 2011:225-226).

In 1948 when the Nationalist party came to power they categorically stated that "Native education should be based on the principles of trusteeship, non-equality and segregation; its aim

should be to inculcate the white man's view of life, especially that of the Boer national, which is the senior trustee... Owing to the cultural infancy of the native, the state, in co-operation with the Protestant churches should at present provide native education. But the native should be fitted to undertake his own education as soon as possible, under control and guidance from the state. The famous speech of Dr HF Verwoerd when he was a Minister of Native Affairs, states categorically that "when I have control of native education, I will reform it so that natives will be taught from childhood to realise that equality with Europeans is not for them... People who believe in equality are not desirable teachers for natives"(Mathonsi 1988:12).

The above statement should be viewed by the researcher and the reader within the framework of how native education was going to be controlled and guided by the state and that the Boer was the senior trustee and the natives were culturally immature. It is on the basis of the above statement that native education had to be controlled and guided by the state. Furthermore, the Christian National Education (CNE) principle in article 14 and 15 stretches to cover all black pupils, as it stated succinctly: "the coloured man...must be educated according to Christian National principles..." (Mathonsi 1988:11).

The Bantu Education Act 47 of 1953 passed by the Nationalist Government in 1953 is one of the most contentious enactments in the whole history of Bantu education. It is based on the findings of the Report of the Commission on Native Education 1949 – 1951 (South African Union 1951) better known as the Eiselen Report. The views of the institute of CNE on the education of the natives are of special significance, as they form the basis of the Eiselen Commission Report on Native education, which in turn forms the cornerstone of the Bantu Education Act of 1953. It seems appropriate in all fairness, to give the relevant Article 15 of the Policy, unaltered and unabridged, so as to avoid all possibility of misrepresentation:

"We believe that the vocation and task of white South Africa with respect of the native is to Christianise him and to help him on culturally, and that this vocation task has already found its immediate application in the principles of trusteeship, not placing of the native on a level with the white, and in segregation. For this reason we believe that any system of teaching and educating natives should be based on these principles. In accordance with these principles we believe that the teaching and education of the native must be based on the Europeans' attitude to life and to the world, more particularly that of the Boer nation as the senior European trustee of

the native, and that the native should be led, *mutatis mutandis*, to an acceptance of the Christian and national principles in education as these principles are more fully described in Articles 1, 2 and 3, provided it be an independent acceptance.

We believe also that the mother-tongue is the basis of native instruction and education, but that the two official languages of the country should be learned as subjects, because they are official languages and constitute for the native the keys to that adoption of culture which is necessary for his own cultural advancement. Because of the cultural immaturity of the native we believe that it is the duty and the task of the state in co-operation with the Christian Protestant Churches to provide and superintend education for natives.

We believe however that the actual teaching and education of the natives and the training of the native teachers should be undertaken by the natives themselves as soon as possible, but under the control and guidance of the state; with the proviso that the financing of native education be placed on such a basis that it is not provided at the cost of European education. Finally we believe that instruction and education for natives must lead to the development of a native community on Christian-National lines which is self-supporting and provides for itself in all ways". (Lorgat 1962:47, 48 & 49).

In his policy speech on Bantu Education on 7 June 1954, in the senate, the Minister of Native Affairs, Dr HF Verwoerd stated: "... What is the use of teaching a Bantu child mathematics when it cannot use it in practice? ... that is absurd? Education is not after all something that hangs in the air; education must train and teach people in accordance with their opportunities in life... It is therefore necessary that native education should be controlled in such a way that it should be in accordance with the policy of the state". We know what that policy is. The policy is not to create 'Mens Sana in corpore Sano', but a sick mind in an otherwise healthy body (Lorgat 1962:52–53).

The Tomlinson Report of 1953 had this to say on Bantu Education: "Bantu Education is education of the Bantu by the Bantu and for the Bantu" (Lorgat 1962:53).

"Ever since the introduction of Bantu Education and the division of schools on racial grounds, black children have suffered an inferior education. Bantu Education is intended to keep the pass rate low so that blacks remain in lower paid, unskilled jobs (Mathonsi 1988:5). Standardisation

of a matric results certificate is one of the instruments used to make sure that the pass rate for blacks is kept low. The sub-heading that follows will articulate how the said instrument was used.

3.2.3 Standardisation (Joint Matriculation Board – JMB) during pre-democracy till 1992)

Standardisation is the mark adjustments done by Umalusi in conjunction with Department of education and assessment bodies (Government Gazette No. 8944 Vol. 518, 29 August 2008:44).

In an effort to deal with the issue of standardisation of NSC results, first the researcher had to ask a question: How are the matric results manipulated so as to correlate with or suit economic development? To answer such a question, it is important to give the historical background of the standardisation of matric examination results pre-democracy.

During the period 1918 to 1920, the JMB was the only examination body in the country. The matriculation certificate, which became the gateway to universities and to many professional careers, was soon established as the only school leaving certificate and also recognised by several foreign bodies. When eight new departmental examinations were established in 1921, they came under the jurisdiction of the JMB as the arbitrator of standards. The JMB's approach to maintaining standards was primarily through the control of syllabi and curricula as well as the moderation of question papers. The JMB had a particular view of standards which related to the validity or dependability of the examination. It strived to minimise the variations from one year to another. This is how standards were established and maintained.

These variations became a point of focus when the universities became concerned about the quality of first year students in higher education. The JMB's own examination was considered to be more difficult than the other examinations. Many learners who sat for JMB examinations and teachers found it impossible, and the standards set by the JMB were subject to criticism. As the public became more and more critical of the JMB standardisation, the JMB applied itself to perfecting its statistical techniques in order to improve the reliability of the matriculation examination.

Trumpelmann (1991) provides a detailed account of the problems with which the JMB had to contend. Of interest is that some of these problems persisted throughout the existence of the JMB. These included: the management of orals, dealing with irregularities; printing; dispatching

capacity; delays in announcing results; exam schedules; and the establishment of norms. In April 1920 De Unie dubbed the results in history as “almost scandalous” and the board was taken to task. However, history remained a contentious subject for many years while periodic problems arose with regard to other subjects. One such instance occurred in 1920 when De Unie referred to the “massacre” that had taken place in “History, Mathematics, Greek, Dutch, and in Latin”. In 1976 the paper on mathematics was condemned by *The Star* as a “stinker” and many schools reacted angrily to the difficult paper which also contained many errors. Nevertheless, the on-going criticism concerning history and also the dissatisfaction with language instruction, remained continuous sources of concern. The whole problem concerning standards and examinations remains bound up in this perplexing issue (Trumpelmann 1991:32–33).

The Joint Matriculation Board exercised quality control through the moderation of question papers, moderation of marking, standardisation of examination results, annual review of the right of any department to run the matric examination, and control of school syllabi. The JMB’s quality control of matric relied heavily on the standardisation of examination results.

From 1921 to 1953 the JMB granted permission to various provincial departments of education to run matric examinations and thus become examination bodies. However, the JMB kept a tight rein on these examinations to ensure that they were of comparable standard to those set by the JMB itself. This was done mainly through a statistical process of applying an obligatory standard distribution curve per subject to adjust the marks to a standard score before the comparative process could be applied. One of Umalusi’s values is innovation and creativity, that bind them to striving for new ideas, approaches, trends, improvements, methods and dealing with problems in an original way (Umalusi newsletter August 2004;3). This means statistical method will not be the only method applied during standardisation process.

According to Mathonsi (1988:37–38), there are two instruments which are used by the government (pre-1994) to control matric results, namely: the Carelessness Strategy and the Authoritative Decision Strategy. For the purpose of this research, the researcher will deal with the Carelessness Strategy as it is the one relevant to the research topic. The marking centres followed a carelessness strategy, which in the Department of Education and Training (DET), allowed deliberate mischievous acts to continue without devising any method for curbing them,

for these acts were benefiting the ruling class (whites) and put the working class (blacks) in a disadvantageous position.

The survey conducted by Mathonsi in 1984 about the black matric results reveals the following about the apparent anomalies and decline in matric results: There is no proper screening to ensure that the people who are invited are the actual people who are marking the scripts, and as a result the people who mark the scripts are sometimes not even qualified in the profession.

According to Mathonsi (1988) there was a report, which stated that “white pupils, some as young as 16, were used to mark black matric examination papers in December 1981”. In this research it was revealed that 85 percent of teachers around Johannesburg (who did not want their names to be revealed) agreed that the young whites were marking Form V (Grade 12) scripts. Ninety-seven percent agreed that usually during the “marking period” they saw young whites in the marking centres. Ten percent of the teachers thought that the young whites were employed to count the scripts or for other management services. Only three percent did not want to make a comment on all the issues.

Ninety-nine percent of the teachers agreed that the DET does not provide any recreational facilities in the marking centres. As a result, some teachers who are tired and bored after marking scripts for long hours eventually find their entertainment in the night-clubs, shebeens and bottle stores. The research revealed that 56 percent of the teachers had been seen marking scripts under the influence of alcohol. This meant that as long as the exam papers and money were hand in glove, the teachers would continue to mark under the influence of alcohol and moreover, mark the scripts throughout the whole night, even if they were sleepy. Under such conditions, no one can guarantee correctness and accuracy in the marking of scripts. Seventy-eight percent of the teachers believe that the marking of exam papers is a “clan issue”, that is, only those who are known as friends of the senior examiners would be invited to the marking centres. New teachers found it difficult to be accepted in these centres. This “clan issue” was clearly stated by Ms F, a teacher at the Soweto Teachers’ Training College and who has been marking the form V scripts for the past five years: She said: “In our case the senior examiner fills in the claim form for us and no-one ever questions him, for that will mean the end (sic) to the marking centres”.

It is left to be seen how the senior examiner can be fair in re-marking exam papers that were marked by his friend. How can the senior examiner question irregularities made in marking by the sub-examiner who does not question him about claim forms? Surely, friendship for the sake of money in the marking centres would not produce any good results and a number of irregularities would be indirectly permissible in the marking centres. Sixty percent of the sub-examiners agreed that the senior examiners usually take the exam papers along with them to their homes at night and the scripts are usually all marked the following day.

A senior examiner who can hardly finish 30 exam papers during the day can manage 100 to 150 scripts at night, according to the research. It is left to be seen who is actually marking the exam papers at night. Sixty percent of the sub-examiners believed that some teachers were not qualified in the subject they were marking. Thirty percent believed that all senior and sub-examiners were qualified people in the subject they were marking. Eight percent did not want to comment on the issue of qualifications. From discussion in chapter three, it was indicated that many teachers of Bantu Education were under-qualified (even principals and certain inspectors). In such a system where even the senior members are not qualified, it is left to be seen how all the senior and sub-examiners could be qualified.

These irregularities and cases of carelessness must not be misunderstood as inefficiency or lack of management knowledge, but must be viewed as part of the many instruments used by the government to manipulate the matric results according to the economic and political needs of the country. The government allowed these irregularities and carelessness to take place for the end products of these actions would not threaten the status quo. The above carelessness strategy is not due simply to misdirected aims of education, poor planning or poor management of schools. They exist because South Africa is a capitalist country, where there is no equal distribution of wealth and because its political life is structured on the basis of race (Mathonsi 1988:14).

In chapter 2 the researcher stated that education cannot be separated from politics. The carelessness strategy has justified the relationship between education and politics. The 1976 student uprising which started in Soweto ushered in a new dimension to the education debate in general and shifted the agenda in education. The question of common/uniform standards was not left untouched (Lolwana 2006:6). Between 1976 and 1992 discussions in the educational arena were ongoing on how the issue of standardisation should be handled. The South African

Certification Council Act 85 of 1986 was passed to establish South African Certification (SAFCERT). By the end of 1992 Joint Matric Board (JMB) ceased to exist and was replaced by Umalusi.

3.2.4 The impact of Bantu education on the matric results certificate

Many of the African pupils who wrote their matriculation examination in 1983 will always recall that year as “the year of tears and disaster”. No more than 9,8 percent of the 72 168 candidates who wrote their National Senior Certificate achieved a matriculation exemption, with only 7 108 qualifying for university admission. The African results generated a general outcry from different sectors of the South African community, especially within the black community. Reacting to the poor African matric results, Dr Nthato Motlana, chairman of the Soweto committee of ten, said, “This shows the inferior education which blacks are getting compared to other races” (Mathonsi 1988:5).

Dr Fabian Ribeiro, a medical practitioner said ‘The government is doing everything possible to stop blacks from getting any further in education. Every year there is an exam paper leakage in black schools but the students still fail hopelessly even after having had the papers well ahead of time’ (Mathonsi 1988:5).

As dissatisfaction with the matriculation examination grew, a difference of perspectives emerged between the JMB and institutions of higher education. The universities wanted a way of selecting students who would succeed in their academic careers, whilst JMB claimed that success in the examination was an indication that a student had attained a desirable standard of general education (Lolwana 2006:5–6). While JMB and the universities were at loggerheads, the students, in particular the black students were the ones that bore the brand of the education system that was not of their creation. A delay in announcing results which led to a delay in getting space at the universities was also a cause for concern. Some students ended up wasting the whole year staying at home because of the delay. The disparities between black and white schools’ performance, the product of enormous social inequalities, were harbingers of future social, economic and political problems for all South Africans (Mathonsi 1988:5).

3.3 Post-democracy

The adoption of an Outcomes-based education (OBE) system referred to as Curriculum 2005 was intended to make a clean break with apartheid education (Ramphela 2008:177).

Prof Sibusiso Bengu commented in the new curriculum as follows: It is a great honour for me to unveil Curriculum 2005 –our new national curriculum for the twenty-first century. I am aware that implementing the new curriculum will require considerable commitment from all participants in the learning process. Accordingly, much of our efforts will be focused on providing the necessary support in the form of in-service training, assessment, guidelines and student orientation. Essentially, the new curriculum will affect a shift from one which has been content-based to one which is based on outcomes. The new education and training system introduces a lifelong education system which is people-centred. For the first time ever, high quality education will be available for everyone –irrespective of age, gender, race, colour, religion, ability or language. At the heart of this change is the introduction of a new curriculum- Curriculum 2005 (Bengu 1997:1).

After the 1994 elections, when the ANC came into power, one education department was formed. The ministry of education, with the department of education as secretariat, is therefore the responsible agency for all educational provision in South Africa. In each of the nine provinces a Department of Education was also formed which presently serves as the executive arm of the central Department of Education. The South African education system can be described as a centralised education system with delegated responsibilities on provincial, regional and local level. The education system policy in the South African education system is primarily officialised in different acts and government notices on the central as well as provincial level (Steyn, Steyn& De Waal2001:56).

Post-democracy developed a number of education acts, comprising the following:

- National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996
- South African Schools Act 84 of 1996
- Education Labour Relations Act 146 of 1993

These are some of the education acts that have been developed post-1994. The Schools Education Act 6 of 1995 of Gauteng was also developed. The researcher will give a brief review of the aims and objectives of the above-mentioned acts.

National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996

The objectives of the National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996 are to provide for:

- the determination of national educational policy by the Minister in accordance with certain principles;
- guidelines for consultations to be undertaken prior to the determination of policy and the establishment of such bodies;
- the publication and the implementation of policy; and
- to provide for the monitoring and evaluation of education (Steyn *et al* 2001:60).

The South African Schools Act 84 of 1996

The purpose of the act is to:

- provide guidelines for the organisation, governance and funding of schools;
- establish minimum and uniform norms and standards for the provision of education at schools;
- ensure the provision of quality education across the school system;
- amend and repeal certain laws relating to school system; and
- provide for incidental matters (Steyn *et al* 2001:63).

The Education Labour Relations Act 146 of 1993

The aim of the act is to:

- promote and maintain labour peace;
- provide mechanisms for the resolution of labour disputes; and
- to regulate collective bargaining in education (Steyn *et al* 2001:65).

The last is the School Education Act 6 of 1995 of Gauteng. The aim of the Act is to make provision for the establishment and control of education in Gauteng within the guidelines of the national education policy (Steyn *et al* 2001:69).

3.3.1 Outcomes-based Policy

The post-1994 government has done a good job of transforming the fragmented, discriminatory and wasteful system of education from 14 departments into one national department with nine provincial branches (Ramphela 2008:176). The new education and training system introduces a lifelong education system which is people-centred. For the first time ever, high quality education will be available for everyone-irrespective of age, gender, race, colour, religion, ability or language. At the heart of this change is the introduction of a new Curriculum-Curriculum 2005 (Bengu, 1997:2). The question that arises is: How do both education principles and systems impact on matric results?

The answer to this question lies in a number of issues which were touched in chapter 1 and chapter 2 respectively which were: funding, teachers' training, and the ratio of teacher to pupils which links to infrastructure. In Bantu education in particular, there was a special curricular drawn up for Bantu schools (Lorgat1962:44) while in the new dispensation the gap in educational outcomes between rich and poor people persists, and is growing. Black people remain at the bottom of the skills pyramid (Ramphela 2008:180–181).

The self-consciously multiracial Model C schools which received some state subsidy and was run by a powerful governing body, with parents taking a leading role was the favoured model (Van Niekerk, P.*et al*, 1999: 61). Hence there is a trend toward discipline in the matric pass rate from the ordinary public schools, which were former model C schools even under the new dispensation. The kind of discipline displayed is still in place.

3.3.2 Principles of Outcomes-based education

After taking over government in 1994, the ANC spelled out an education policy based upon its ideals.

Clarity of focus: Bouslama, Lansari, Al-Rawi, & Abonamah (2003) state that learning outcomes are to be clear, observable demonstrations of student learning that occur after a significant set of learning experiences. This means that the outcomes should be spelled out clearly to give direction in the teaching-learning situation. Killen (2003:3) maintains that educators should be clear on what they want their learners to know, understand and be able to accomplish successfully. When educators clearly define the outcomes that learners should achieve, they will

choose suitable teaching strategies, and learning resources to help learners to achieve those outcomes. Educators will create a learning space to allow learners' participation in different activities. This OBE principle requires that educators choose outcomes learners should achieve before they choose content. The content they choose should help learners to achieve the desired outcomes.

Shelly, Nurss and Aithison (1997), point out that a clear statement of outcomes helps the learner to engage in effective self-assessment of learning. If the outcomes are clarified before learners engage in activities, learners will know what is expected of them in the learning activities and what progress they are making towards the outcomes. Clear outcomes can help learners to improve their performance because they know what output is expected from them.

The Department of Education *Educator guide* (2002:7) stipulates that teaching should be planned by first clarifying the outcomes. When the outcomes are clarified, the measurable evidence that educators want learners to demonstrate will be planned for in advance. The standards to be achieved are fully described at the beginning of the process so that the results to be achieved are clear.

Expanded opportunities: Educators acknowledge that learners differ in their capabilities and as such they learn at a different pace. Van der Horst and McDonald (1997) claim that learners cannot learn the same things at the same time. People differ in thinking and this influences their learning capabilities. Some people learn faster than others. Killen (2003:3) argues that all learners should be given appropriate opportunities to learn successfully. Learners should be given enough opportunity to learn at their different paces; but this may not be easy to apply in a practical situation. A number of factors may prevent educators from applying this principle effectively. Among other factors is overcrowding in classrooms. Educators may not be aware of the performance levels of all learners in their classrooms. If educators do not know how all learners perform, it implies that they may not help all the learners to learn and succeed. Educators work within a prescribed time. Learners should be promoted at the end of the year. Failure is unacceptable. Learners who do not meet the criteria for attaining a standard can apply for re-assessment. The learner will decide when he/she is ready for assessment (Bengu 1997:19).

High expectations: this principle means that standards of achievement should be high to challenge learners to do their best. Killen (2003:3) claims that high standards can encourage students to engage deeply in their learning. Mothapo (2003:133) claims that there is a contradiction between this principle and that of expanded opportunity. He cannot reconcile these two principles with the OBE premise “All learners can learn and succeed” ... if learners are given expanded opportunities, it means that they should be offered more assistance. If they are offered more assistance, this means that they cannot attain higher standards on their own.

If they attain high standards through the educator’s assistance, the implication is that those standards may no longer be high or challenging to learners. If learners attain high standards with little help from their educators, this principle can work very well in the classroom. This implies that educators may not have high expectations for all the learners because not all the learners may reach high standards on their own. Design down: According to Spady and Schlebusch (1999) “based” means “defined by”, so OBE is education that is defined by outcomes. This principle may be taken to be the main focus in OBE. All the educational activities should be organised around outcomes. The outcomes should be identified first and all the teaching and learning activities are planned and organised in line with the desired outcome.

Du Toit in Maree and Fraser (2004) argues that the educator should begin with what learners should demonstrate at the end of a learning experience. After the outcomes have been identified, the educator should go back to choose the appropriate learning content, teaching strategies and resources to help learners to achieve those outcomes. This is what Spady and Schlebusch (1999:32) refer to as backward mapping-thus, starting from the end and systematically tracing back the steps to help learners to achieve the outcomes. Educators should plan following a path from critical outcomes, to learning outcomes and then to the level of performance that they wish learners should demonstrate at the end of a learning experience.

3.3.3 Standardisation of Umalusi matric (Grade 12)

Post-democracy Umalusi largely carries on and attempts to improve the quality assurance regime it has inherited from the JMB and SAFCERT. Umalusi however has a wider mandate than its two predecessors. Its role is to maintain the integrity of and confidence in the system. The quality assurance measures used by Umalusi to ensure the validity, reliability and fairness of the Senior

Certificate Examination include moderating question papers, moderating marking, monitoring the conduct of the exam, monitoring continuous assessment and standardising marks.

In terms of paragraph 16(2) (e) of this Act, Umalusi has the responsibility for issuing Certificates for qualifications at the exit points in general and further education and training. Furthermore, Umalusi is mandated to ensure that these Certificates are credible both nationally and internationally (Umalusi, 2010: 9).

The above paragraph gives a picture of how pre-democracy and post-democracy standardisation of matric results was conducted. It is clear that all the different education systems were using similar tools to conduct standardising of the matric examinations, even though Umalusi has broadened its scope. The Umalusi phase began in 2002 with the promulgation of the General and Further Education and Training Quality Assurance Act 58 of 2001. Umalusi mandate has been overshadowed by the role of quality assuring the Senior Certificate Examinations (SCE) because of the immediacy and public presence of this examination. Umalusi's starting point was to continue with the approaches adopted by both SAFCERT and the JMB in quality assuring the SCE. However, it became increasingly evident that the terrain was constantly changing.

The introduction of the National Qualifications Framework in 1995, as the basis for a new vision of curriculum had triggered a series of changes that impacted even on the senior certificate curricula (Lolwana 2006:12). As the implementation of C2005 unfolded in the lower grades, it became clear that its influence was percolating upward to the matric syllabi. For example, the shifts that began to occur in the matriculation examination included:

- Language standardisation, whereby all languages were to be assessed in accordance with the same format, emphasising skills over knowledge.
- Emphasis on information application rather than content.
- De-emphasis of long essay-type questions that would require competencies in reading and writing, and emphasis on questions requiring application skills and resulting in single and short answers.
- The changes are not unrelated to the changes expected during the implementation of C2005, and the philosophy of the NQF (Lolwana 2006:12–13).

- Umalusi inherited its quality assurance function and its infrastructure from SAFCERT whose focus was purely on the quality assurance of exit examinations. There were concerns about the standards of the SCE and considerable work went into understanding the concept of standards in examinations and curricula. However, the National Senior Certificate (NSC), soon to be introduced into the schooling system, will benefit most (Lolwana 2006:15). Umalusi's certification function has expanded on the fragile system it inherited and progressed despite the changing policy environment and changes to the system itself. As the system develops, it is becoming clear that the organisational structures used by SARCERT will not be sufficient for the accreditation functions and new systems will need to be developed. With adequate resources, Umalusi is ready to take on its task (Lolwana 2006:20). In a nutshell Umalusi is performing its tasks and mandate.

3.3.4 The impact of OBE on matric results

Capacity constraints pose a major challenge to successful matric certificate results. Its success is hamstrung by weak capacity in the state, the teaching profession, governing body system and in parents to hold the system accountable for delivery of high-quality education to their children. There are teachers with inadequate training in Outcomes-based education (OBE) and the new Curriculum (RNCS) who continue to struggle to meet the high expectations placed on them. There are still unqualified and under-qualified teachers (Ramphele 2008:172). Widespread implementation problems have dogged the introduction of OBE since 1998. A lack of understanding of the subject matter and poor grasp of the teaching methods required have brought teaching and learning to a crisis point in poor schools (Ramphele2008:177).

The rules introduced in 2003 for pupils in grade 8 and 9 allowed pupils to proceed to the next grade even though they had failed English and mathematics. The required pass mark has also been lowered from 50% to 35% (Ramphele 2008:178). The Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) study which in 2005 found that teachers spent on average 3,3 hours a week teaching, with many hours spent on activities such as "continuous assessment" (Ramphele 2008:179). According to Jansen, (2011:71) what is not such an obvious form of damage to OBE is that already disadvantaged children were exposed to a curriculum that made a fragile learning environment worse.

Instead of learning those vital competencies of reading, writing and calculating, children were exposed to high-brow constructivist theories that kept many of them illiterate. Those effects pushed weaker and weaker students into universities where they again struggled to succeed (Jansen2011:75). Since more and more students are entering universities completely unprepared for the demands of higher education, universities have developed sophisticated programmes to bridge the gap between school under-preparedness and the demands of higher education (Jansen 2011:146).

A new terminology: The first difference is the terminology that will be used. The subjects as we know them will not appear in the present form. They have been absorbed into eight “learning areas”. These eight different learning areas are communication, literacy and language learning, numeracy and mathematics, human and social sciences, natural sciences, arts and culture, economic and management sciences, life orientation and technology. They are considered to be a balanced curriculum (Bengu 1997:13,14-15).*Assessment:* only at the end of Grade 9 and 12 will there be comprehensive external assessment (Bengu1997:19). The researcher believes that by this time a lot of damage would already have been done, and when universities feel the gap between high school and the institutions of higher learning.

The reader must remember that the matriculation certificate acts as a “ticket” in reproducing class membership across generations, such that the children of controllers (white and capitalist by and large) become controllers, children of the controlled (black and working class, by and large) become controlled (Mathonsi 1988:9).

3.4 Summary of all the policies

According to Freire (2006:72, 83), the old education system is referred to as “the banking” concept of education, in which the scope of action allowed to students extends only as far as receiving, filing and storing the deposits, while the new system is referred to as problem-posing education, people developing their power to perceive critically the way they exist in the world with which and in which they find themselves. They come to see the world not as a static reality, but as a reality in process, in transformation.

The following table represents the old and the new system of past and current curriculum structuring:

Table 3.1 Curriculum Development

Bantu education	OBE/Curriculum 2005
Pupils passively accept what they are taught without questioning	Pupils actively involved in finding and interpreting for themselves
Exam-driven	Learners are assessed on an on-going basis
Syllabus is content-based and broken down into subjects	An integration of knowledge, learning relevant and connected to real-life situations
Textbook/worksheet-bound and teacher centred	Learner-centred, teacher is facilitator, teacher constantly uses group-work and teamwork to consolidate the new approach
Syllabus is rigid and non-negotiable	Syllabus is seen as a guide, with teachers having to adopt innovative and create ways of helping their pupils to learn
Emphasis on what the teacher hopes to achieve	Emphasis on outcomes –what the learner becomes and understands
Subjects have to be learned within a specific period of time	Pupils are free to learn at their own pace
Syllabi stick rigidly to their subjects and do not deal with related fields of study	Emphasis on integrating the different types of knowledge relevant to how the pupil deals with real life

Sources: Bengu (1997); Steyn et al (2001)

The above table summarises some of the curriculum of the old and new education systems, specifically the Bantu Education system which represents the old. The new education system was to be built on the principles mostly diametrically opposite to those which had determined pre-1994 education. A new education policy, in the form of White Papers, acts and policy documents appear. However, this policy has run into many obstacles since it was implemented (Booyse, Le Roux, Seroto&Wolhuter2011:269). The obstacles will be discussed in the relevant chapter.

It is important to mention that all that the public views as curriculum changes from Outcomes-based education (OBE), National Curriculum Statement (NCS) and Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) is but a consolidation of existing policy documents which are supposed to make it easier for educators, learners, principals and district officials to get their job done. The following are changes apparent for the public eye: From 1996, OBE/Curriculum 2005(C2005) was introduced following the advent of multiparty democracy in 1994.

OBE/C2005 was criticised for its abstract terminology, many subjects condensed into learning areas (6) and too many specific outcomes (67). As a result of the criticisms, a new curriculum was developed or introduced. From 2002, NCS was introduced to make the curriculum easier to implement. Much of the terminology was changed, for example, learning areas became subjects at this point the department reverts back to JMB and Bantu Education terminology. Specific outcomes became learning outcomes and assessment criteria became assessment standards. This refers to what the previous education departments used to call tests. From 2012, CAPS was introduced in Grade 1,2,3 and 10, providing details of what content ought to be taught and what needs to be assessed on a grade-by-grade and subject-by-subject basis.

From what the researcher has read from the above paragraph, it is important to mention that the public has reason to question or rather criticise the current education system. Its “consolidation” as it is termed, is more complex than stakeholders can readily understand. The complexity involves the spontaneous introduction of the curriculum, for example, CAPS is introduced in Grade 1, 2, 3 and 10. In between these Grades, we have Grades 4,5,6,7, 8 and 9. This is cause for concern in any right-minded individual. To improve implementation, the National Curriculum statement was amended, with the amendment coming into effect in January 2012. The Department of Basic Education (DBE) is committed to ensuring that the education system at all levels is properly prepared for the introduction of the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statements (CAPS) in all grades –starting with the Foundation phase and Grade 10 in 2012 (Department of Education, may 2011:16).

3.4.1 Discussion on two education policies (Bantu education and OBE)

The researcher will give an overview of OBE and on the basis of that he will state which of the two policies is more effective.

Pupils are free to learn at their own pace (Steyn, H.J *et al* ,2001:102). The researcher is of the opinion that from a South African perspective, OBE has not worked because it was too heavily politicised and the core stakeholders were left behind when the initial processes were taking place. According to Olivier (2009), OBE has not worked because the actual teaching and education has been smothered by everything that a teacher is expected to do by way of preparation for every lesson, and archiving, recording or giving an account of what he or she has achieved in the teaching process.

“Pass one pass all policy” the 1980s slogan of Congress of South African Students Organisation policy, is clearly reflected in OBE. Bengu (1997:19), the former Minister of Education post-democracy, captured pass one pass all policy as follows: the learner’s progress is measured against these outcomes rather than against his/her performance. For this reason, there will be no passing or failing. Children do not fail easily nowadays. The introduction of modularisation in Grade 12 for the progressed learners was positive.

Group work: children with different abilities are thrown together in groups to work together on assignments and research projects. Everyone in the group gets exactly the same marks, even though some members of the group did all the work and others nothing. Learner centred, teacher is a facilitator, teacher constantly uses group-work and teamwork to consolidate the new approach (Bengu, 1997:7).

The researcher sees this practice as the promotion of mediocracy. The researcher’s view is based on the fact that the talented learners are “pulled down” to perform similarly to the average learners. *Text book:* In many learning areas learners are not supplied with text books anymore. Portfolios are compiled and notes (often in-cohesive and badly formulated) are provided as loose leaf pages to learners.

Paper work: Our education is carrying a huge administrative load, caused by OBE. There is the endless evaluation, the loads of forms that must be completed, portfolios that have to be compiled and research assignments that have to be marked. This transforms teachers into tired,

burnt-out administrative officers and impacts on their teaching performance. In other countries where OBE was applied, the average ratio of learners per teacher was normally between 9:1 and 6:1 (according to the type of class) and every teacher had an administrative officer that helped with the paper work and evaluation. In South Africa, in 2011, the national average learner education ratio in ordinary schools in the country was 29.2:1 (Department of Basic Education 2013: 6). Our teachers had no administrative officers.

“OBE education system produces confident illiterates” (Smith2009). According to Jansen, the language and concepts were too complex, confusing and often contradictory. He feared that OBE policy was based on flawed assumptions about what happens inside the average classroom. Van Niekerk (2008:1) in his open letter to the South African Minister of Education in the *Beeld* on April 17, echoes the same views as Jansen about the average ratio of learners per teacher when he demonstrates that the normal average ratio per teacher in other countries where OBE is applied is between 9:1 and 6:1 respectively depending on the type of class. In the South African situation, the picture displayed above takes on the aspect of nightmare because the normal ratio starts from 40:1 up to 60:1.

Adler locates the problem of OBE at the moment as the gap between a modernised curriculum and the realities on the ground. OBE is resource based. Most South African schools lack resources and as a result, the implementation of OBE is bound to fail. Is the experiment going to work with OBE education in South Africa? OBE is not without controversy elsewhere in the world. In many parts of the world its adoption was linked to a drop in standards and in the USA it has been widely rejected. Curriculum 2005 had disastrous consequences as implementation is meant for highly developed and first world country and definitely not for a developing country that tend to react with emotional implementation of structures and policies (Mouton, N, Louw, G.P & Strydom, G.L, 2012:1220).

According to Allais (2003), national research director of Umalusi, the statutory body charged with quality assurance in the school education system, outcomes-based qualifications are a “worse than unnecessary” addition to the South African education system. It is an educational model criticised in every country in which it was implemented. Taylor (1993), respected educationist and executive director of the Joint Education Trust Services, share the same views. He quotes a Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) study which in 2005 found that teachers

spend on average 3,2hours a week teaching, with many hours spent on activities such as “continuous assessment” (Ramphela 2008:178–179).

Quality: available evidence on both outcome quality and process quality paints a disturbing picture. Beginning with outcome quality, matric pass rates have steadily declined over the past six years (up to the time of writing, 2009) from 73,3% in 2003 to 62,5% in 2008. A mere 15% of matric candidates pass with exemption (i.e. qualify for university admission). Process quality is equally disturbing. As in the case of outcome quality, what is especially distressing is that poor quality is concentrated in the historically black schools –thus undermining any attempt at the equalisation of educational opportunity. A culture of teaching and learning continues to evade the historically black schools. In the wake of the course of the implementation of Outcomes-based education in South African schools, eventually two eminent educationists, Spady (2008) (internationally hailed as the father of Outcomes-based education) and Bloch (2009) (one of the architects of the system of Outcomes-based education in South Africa), counselled for the discontinuation of Outcomes-based education in South African schools. Such concerns were corroborated when the first cohort of learners who underwent Outcomes-based education wrote their matric examinations at the end of 2008, and the pass rates dropped compared to 2007. The National Benchmark Test Project found that those who did pass and made it to university in 2009 were very poorly equipped for university study (Booyse *et al* 2011:280–281).

Our house is on fire: The cumulative impact of what we have done to our education system post-1994 is shocking. Since then on average only 29% of pupils who start school end up with a matric certificate. Think about the 71% who go through school without getting a piece of paper that attests to their achievement. We have failed our children: “we need to let go of OBE and focus on the basis of education” (Ramphela 2009:18). That was Ramphela sharing the same views with Spady and Bloch, the father and the architect of OBE education system respectively.

In conclusion, the researcher is of the view that Bantu Education policy was better based on the deliberations of the authors mentioned in the overview of the content. The figures of post-democracy speak for themselves in terms of the average matric pass rate for the years in question.

3.4.2 New statistics of pass rates

	Transitional period	Post-democracy
Year	2002	2008
Pass rate	612849	334239
Year	2003	2009
Pass rate	1043597	334716
Year	2004	2010
Pass rate	340110	364147
Year	2005	2011
Pass rate	1341425	348117

The above table indicates the pass rate of a four years of transitional period and post-democracy.

3.4.3 The effects of a Grade 12 certificate during intake at the Universities

Our universities are at a crossroads. There is enormous pressure on them to open their doors to all students. This is desirable a university must, and should, be accessible to all students irrespective of their race, gender, disability or national origins (Jansen 2011:145). The major problem is that there are not enough students with academic foundations necessary to obtain and retain scholarship funding. The problem is that more and more students are entering universities completely unprepared and ill-equipped for the demands of higher education. In response, universities have developed sophisticated programmes to bridge the gap between school under-preparedness and the demands of higher education (Jansen2011:146).

The demand by governments for more highly skilled graduates has led to pressure being exerted on universities to expand their student intake. Universities already have their own complex of entrance tests and decisions that weigh them down. One reason for this is the lack of confidence in the school examinations alone as a predictor of success at universities (Jansen 2011:75). Most countries have access policies to assist in the “massification” of high education. But this has typically led to large number of under-prepared students being enrolled, which in turn, has led to a requirement for academic support programmes (Seepe 2004:187–188).

3.5 Conclusion

In conclusion, it is worth noting that modern challenges have roots in the past and the pragmatic use of historical evidence can throw light on present day questions. Practically the state of education in South Africa is more complex and problematic than ever before. That its implementation process proved to be problematic is a living testimony to the complexity of the problem. Frequent changing of Ministers of Education seems to add to the problem. So far the concept of a problem-posing type of education as espoused by Freire seems to be far-fetched. Eighteen years since the new era, education policy is still a thorn in South Africans' flesh.

The Soweto uprising of 1976 was sparked by language policy which was supposed to have been implemented then. The 1976 uprising was a catalyst in the history of South Africa's education system in particular and life in general. The question is: What is to be done? Successive curriculum reviews have added to the state of chaos and confusion in the education sphere.

Chapter 4: Research design and methodology

4.1 Introduction

The previous chapters (2 and 3) provided the literature review for this study and attempted to provide a broad overview of the content of the study. This chapter is a continuation of chapter 1 in terms of the outline of the research methodology adopted in the study, and attempts to provide a sound understanding of the qualitative research paradigm and how it is used in this study.

This chapter focuses on the research strategies and research methodology followed in this investigation. These will be discussed to give reasons why the specific strategies and methodology have been chosen. As research strategy and methodology vary, only those that have been followed in this investigation will be discussed. The data collection plan is also discussed to give information about the themes covered in the relevant documents. Collected data will be categorised to make the job of data analysis easier. Oosthuizen (2002:1) contends that it is impossible to obtain optimum academic results if you do not have sound discipline in the classroom, but that the abolition of corporal punishment in South African schools left a gap that has led to all kinds of disciplinary problems in schools.

4.2 Research design and methodology

Chapter 1 constituted an important background to the investigation contained in this study. While chapters 2 and 3 provided a framework for the study, Chapter 4, will deal with the following subjects: research design, research approach, research methodology, data processing and documents analysis.

4.2.1 Research design

This is a qualitative, explorative and descriptive study that aims at investigating the impact of educational policy on the National Senior Certificate (NSC). A case study is used, as the focus is on one phenomenon, namely the impact of educational policy on NSC. This will be studied in-depth, regardless of the number of sites or participants in the study (McMillan & Schumacher 2001:398). Creswell (1998:14) concurs with Denzin and Lincoln (1994) when they define qualitative research “as a multi-method in focus, involving an interpretative naturalistic approach

to its subject matter". Denzin and Lincoln (1994) believe that qualitative research is conducted in a natural setting, attempting to make sense of or interpret phenomena in terms of the meanings people ascribe to them. Instead of making use of calculations, words are used to analyse and interpret the results. The qualitative research paradigm has the following characteristics:

- research involves holistic inquiry carried out in a natural setting
- humans are the primary data gathering instrument
- purposive rather than random sampling is used
- there is utilisation of intuitive insights (Borg & Gail 1989:385).

Educational research, due to the complexity of its nature, requires a deep understanding of the issues and problems at hand, and therefore, requires a research methodology that can provide a broad and in-depth understanding. Qualitative research should be systematic, rigorous, strategically conducted, flexible and contextual, and produce social explanations that can be generalised in some way (Mason & Bramble 1989:15).

All of the above characteristics and features of qualitative research make it appropriate for this study. For example, the choice of the documents and literature analysis is purposeful in itself. In qualitative research, it is quite common to use the case study approach as it encapsulates all the requirements and characteristics of qualitative research.

A case study in simple terms concentrates on a study of a single bounded system where the focus is on one phenomenon, which the researcher selects to understand in an in-depth way. According to McMillan and Schumacher (1993:375), a case study provides some very useful methods in educational research because of its flexibility and adaptability to a range of contexts, processes, people and foci. Furthermore, in a case study, researchers are able to discover and pursue the important topics and issues in education in particular. According to McMillan and Schumacher (2001:395) qualitative research describes and analyses people's individual and collective social actions, beliefs, thoughts and perceptions. McMillan and Schumacher (2001:375) argue that researchers interpret phenomena in terms of the meanings people ascribe to them.

The interest of the researcher is focused on how national education policies that were meant to facilitate the single education system, were implemented for the purpose of realising good matric

results. A second point of interest is how the historical events in 1948 and 1994 affected the principles of education that were drafted, against a backdrop of the socio-economic issues in the country. The educational policies of this country revolve around the said two historical periods which were the watershed of matric results. The researcher has decided to collect data for this case study from documents and literature.

4.2.2 Research approach

In qualitative research, it is quite common to use the case study approach as it encapsulates all the requirements and characteristics of qualitative research. Dockrell and Hamilton (1980:33) provide an apt definition of the case study: “Case study is the examination of an instance in action. The study of particular incidents and events, and the selective collection of information on biography, personality, intentions and values, allows the case study worker to capture and portray those elements of a situation that give it meaning”.

A case study in simple terms concentrates on a study of a single bounded system where the focus is on one phenomenon, which the researcher selects to understand in an in-depth way. According to Macmillan and Schumacher (1993:375), a case study provides some very useful methods in educational research because of its flexibility and adoptability to a range of contexts, processes, people and foci. Furthermore, in a case study, researchers are able to discover and pursue the important topics and issues in education. In this case study, the 2008 National Senior Certificate examinations results in particular were the focus point of determining educational policy change and its implementation.

4.2.3 Research methodology

Document and literature analysis was used as the researcher's main method of data collection and analysis. Prior (2003:4) has conducted extensive work on the use of documents in research and claims that "in most social scientific work, of course, documents are placed at the margins of consideration". Yet as maintained by Weber, Roth & Wittich (1978) perspective analysis of bureaucracy in their work *Economy and society* (as noted by Prior), "The modern world is made through writing and documentation" (Prior 2003:4). Prior (2003:26) takes the assertions of Weber et al and provides an insightful discussion regarding the nature of documents in organisations:

- Documents form a field for research in their own right, and should not be considered as mere props for action.
- Documents need to be considered as situated products, rather than as fixed and stable things in the world.
- Documents are produced in social settings and are always to be regarded as collective (social) products.
- Determining how documents are consumed and used in organised settings (that is, how they function), should form an important part of any social scientific research project.
- In approaching documents as a field for research we should forever keep in mind the dynamic involved in the relationships between production, consumption, and content.

Advantages and limitations of document analysis

Caulley (1983:28) asserts, in alignment with Prior's similar claims about documents in research, that "though document analysis is routinely carried out in program evaluation, its full potential is rarely tapped and the resources and literature on the subject of document analysis is very meagre". In its most rudimentary form it is "analysis of documents to gather facts". However, gathering of facts through document analysis is not an easy endeavour. Caulley warns that "the facts of history and evaluation never come to us 'pure' since they do not and cannot exist in a pure form, they are always refracted through the mind of the recorder" especially since the facts found in documents "have been selected by the recorder". When the researcher entered the field to gather documents related to educational policy issues of 1948 and 1994 respectively, the

researcher was confronted with important decisions as to which documents were more important and/or relevant than others.

Caulley offers a few general rules/guidelines for selecting appropriate documents:

- Incomplete observation and faulty memory are reasons for inadequacy of testimony. The longer the time interval between the incident described and the writing of the document, the less reliable the document. Therefore, choose the document that is closer to the event described.
- Some documents are intended as aids to one's memory, some are reports to others, some as apologia, some as propaganda, and so on. So documents differ as regards their purpose. The more serious the writer's intention to make a mere record, the more dependable the document.
- The testimony of a schooled or experienced observer and reporter is generally superior to that of the untrained and casual observer and reporter (Caulley1983:23).

Caulley also cautions about "interested witnesses". An interested witness can be an author of a document where the document serves as a "perversion of the truth" in order to support or "benefit someone or some cause dear to himself or herself". For example, brochures that promote educational programmes are biased and usually do not provide balanced information about the effectiveness or credibility of the program. To complicate this matter further, "often the benefit to be derived from the perversion of the truth is subtle and may not be realised"(Caulley 1983:24). Murphy (1980:123), as cited by Caulley, recommends that when evaluating a program, the researcher should focus on records that report "about its origin, history, operation, and impact". More specifically, a researcher should seek "copies of law, rules, regulations, guidelines and legal interpretations" that help to "set forth the legal basis for the program". Other examples of important programme documents include annual reports, financial statements, newsletters, budget justifications, and especially "documents on the inner workings of programs". Documents of this kind can include minutes of meetings, organisational charts, staff reports, and, of particular importance to Caulley, memoranda. Memoranda are "a particular rich source of information since this is the primary means of communication for programme personnel". In addition, memoranda "reveal the information on which decisions are made, the arguments for

such decisions, and who is making the decisions”. A shrewd researcher will also pay particular attention to the distribution lists on memoranda as this often gives strong indications as to “who is important in making decisions and thus who might be interviewed for further information” (Caulley 1983:25).

4.3 Data processing

Once data arrives, it must be processed into a format that can be read by the analysis tools. Data processing mainly involves various manipulations necessary for preparing the data for analysis. The process (of manipulation) could be manual or electronic. It involves editing, categorising the open-ended questions, coding, computerisation and preparation of tables and diagrams.

- Coding of data

Coding is the process by which verbal data are converted into variables and categories of variable using numbers, so that the data can be entered into computers for analysis. Data for social science research are collected using self-administered questionnaires and questionnaires administered through telephone or face-to-face interviews, through observation, and from records, documents, movies, pictures, or tapes. In its original form, “raw” these data comprise verbal or written language or visual images (Sekaren & Bougie 2013:132).

The first step in data preparation is data coding. Data coding involves assigning a number of the participant’s responses so they can be entered into a database (Sekaren& Bougie 2013:276& 278). Coding is an essential of the many types of social research. Once data collection has been conducted, the researcher will need to begin to make sense of the data. Coding requires the researcher to interact with and to think about the data. Coding makes links between different parts of data that are regarded as having common properties (Lewis-Beck, Bryman & Liao2004:137).

- Post-coding

Code frames for some kinds of data simply cannot be set up as the data collection procedures are being finalised. Open-ended questions that have no predetermined list of answer categories are included in interviews for a reason, namely because the researcher

is unable to anticipate the kinds and amount of data that may be elicited or cannot create exhaustive, mutually exclusive codes that can easily be explained to and used by data collectors and data entry personnel.

In developing the code frame, a balance must be realised between too much detail and insufficient detail.

A coding frame, code frame or a codebook shows how verbal or visual data have been converted into numeric data for purpose of analysis. It provides the link between the verbal data and the numeric data and explains what the numeric data mean (Lewis-Beck *et al* 2004:135–136). The researcher is aware of what is expected of him based on what post-coding means and implies.

- Data entry

After responses have been coded, they can be entered into a database. Raw data can be entered through any software program (Sekaren& Bougie2013:278). After data has been entered into software programs, the researcher will start analysing it.

4.4 Documents analysis

The purpose of documents analysis is to determine how understanding of the premises and principles and policies in OBE has influenced the actual matric results. According to McMillan and Schumacher (2001:461), qualitative data analysis is an inductive process of organising data into categories and identifying patterns among the categories.

McMillan and Schumacher (2001:474) argue that it is impossible to interpret data unless one organises it. Organising data requires the use of the research questions and sub-questions, the research instrument, the categories found in the literature, the prior knowledge of the researcher, and the data itself. De Vos *et al* (2002:340) mention five steps which they maintain are used by researchers in qualitative data analysis, namely: collecting and recovering data, managing data, reading and writing memos, describing, classifying and interpreting data, and representing and visualising data.

Collecting and recording data: De Vos *et al* (2002:340) argue that the researcher should plan for the recording of data in an appropriate way that will facilitate analysis before the data collection commences.

Data analysis in qualitative research involves two approaches, one at the site during data collection, and the other away from the site after data collection. When conducting data analysis during data collection, this researcher will use methods such as triangulation and developing a working hypothesis, in order to ensure the trustworthiness of the study (De Vos *et al* 2002:341).

This is a non-interactive strategy for obtaining qualitative data with little or no reciprocity between the researcher and the participants. According to Glense and Peskin (in Hoberg 1999:105), documents corroborates one's observations and make findings trustworthy. Beyond corroboration they may raise questions about one's conclusions and thereby shape the directions about new observations and interviews.

For the purpose of this research, the following documents will be analysed: Constitution of South Africa of 1996, National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996, Report by Ministerial Committee 2009. The General and Further Training Quality Assessment Act 58 of 2001, The Development of Curriculum 2005(Currim 1998) and Curriculum 2005, lifelong learning for the 21st century (Bengu 1997).

4.5 Conclusion

This chapter covered the use of a qualitative approach to research in which the research design and methodology of the research study were presented. This is done with reference to data collections which include documents analysis/literature review and data processing.

The focus in the next chapter will be on the interpretation of the findings.

Chapter 5: Data analysis and presentation of findings

5.1 Introduction

The previous chapter focused on the research design and different methodologies used to obtain data for this study. This chapter is an analysis and interpretation of the data extracted from the following documents:

- Origin of Christian National Education (CNE) and its link with Bantu education
- Bantu Education Act 57 of 1953
- The Constitution of South Africa of 1996
- National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996
- South African Schools Act 84 of 1996
- Education Labour Relation Act 146 of 1993
- School Education Act 6 of 1995 of Gauteng
- Reports of role players/stakeholders in education

5.2 Pre – 1994 legislative policies (1939 – 1994)

The researcher will briefly discuss below various educational policies pre -1994.

5.2.1 Origin of Christian National Education (CNE) 1939

What is Christian National Education?

The chairman of the Federasie van Afrikaanse Kultuurverenigings (FAK), in his preface to the statement of policy, wrote:

It is a policy ... that ... can now stand as a guiding principle in our cultural struggle which has now also definitely become an educational struggle. ... Our culture must be brought into the schools. ... Our Afrikaans schools must be the places where our children are soaked and nourished in the Christian National Spiritual cultural 'stuff' of our nation (Lorgat 1962:20).

5.2.1.1. Objectives

The education of the white child prepares him or her for life in a dominant society and the education of the black child for a subordinate society. The former is to command and the latter is to serve (Lorgat 1962:10).

5.2.1.2. Curriculum

Where education is designed to follow a particular creed, where the mind is regimented to a set pattern, and where learning takes place without proper awareness, we have indoctrination or as Professor MacMillian has so aptly termed “dictatorship” of the mind (Lorgat 1962:11). Indoctrination is defined as the attempt to influence thought and behaviour so that the person influenced adopts opinions and behaviour without making any definite search for the reasons why they do so. In such an educational system the power is concentrated in the hands of the administration. It controls the preparation, training and employment of teachers, defines in detail the content and method of instruction. The education itself becomes uniform and stereotyped. The individuality of a person is destroyed through indoctrination and insistence on conformity. The state is supreme in all matters and the individual mere a pawn in its hands. The liberties of the individual are made subservient to the state’s requirements (Lorgat 1962: 12).

The curriculum was entirely weighted to the religious side. The school curriculum should embrace both nature and Scripture, with Scripture as the foundation and infusion of all knowledge. All CNE education is Scripture-orientated and therefore the limit of any subject is confined within the parameters of the Bible. There is no independent search for truth, there is no initiative on the part of the learner and there is no individuality, for knowledge has to conform with Biblical revelation and happenings (Lorgat 1962:21, 28–29).

5.2.1.3. Funding

The funding of schools, which operated under missionary auspices, was controlled by the Native Taxation and Development Act of 1925, which was later called South African Native Trust. The amount was transferred from the Consolidated Revenue Fund and it remained constant until 1944 (Horrel 1963:31).

The Government contribution per pupil for the education of white people was ten times larger than that for the education of black people (Report of the interdepartmental committee on Native education, The Welsh Commission, SA.U 1936:60). Between 1886 and 1903, the missionaries in the Transvaal administered, controlled and financed their schools.

During the nineteenth century the education of the blacks depended mainly on the voluntary efforts and funding of the missionary societies and churches (Steyn et al 2001:16). The annual cost of education per pupil between 1930 and 1945 indicates the disparities that existed for many years. It is important to indicate in this study that in South Africa on 14 February 1961, the rand replaced the South African pound as the South African monetary unit, where 2 Rand=1 South African pound. The exchange rate was expressed as South African pounds per dollar in 1928 to 1960 and rand per dollar from 1961 to 1999 (Officer 2007:2).

5.2.1.4. Infrastructure

Under this dispensation blacks did not have formal structures called schools. Churches were mainly used as schools. In the absence of the church, trees were used as schools. This on its own was already disadvantaging the black child because when it rained he/she could not go to school at all.

The objectives, curriculum, funding and infrastructure of the Christian National Education Policy displayed no interest in the black child at all. It would be an insult to the blacks to try to venture into Grade 12 as they were not regarded as matriculant material. What followed was Bantu education.

5.3 The Bantu Education Act 47 of 1953

In 1948 the Nationalist Party came to power and introduced the apartheid system of education, called Bantu education. After the enactment of the Bantu Education Act of 1953, education for black people came under the direct governance and control of the then Bantu Education Department.

5.3.1 Objectives

One of the main features of apartheid education from 1948 onward was institutionalised discrimination along racial lines. This observation is reflected in the establishment of eighteen separate education departments, which catered for racial groups in the “white” urban South Africa as well as the former rural homelands. A comprehensive picture of the education of black people during the period under review is reflected in the Report of the Commission on Native Education under the chairmanship of Dr WWM Eiselen, which was outlined in Article 15 in the preceding chapters. There can be no question that the Bantu Education Act is by far the most important and by far the most deadly in its effect (Huddleston 1956:160).

5.3.2 Curriculum

Syllabi were ethnic-oriented, since emphasis was placed on the special courses such as ethnic studies, civics and Bantustan geography (Report of the commission on Native education, The Eiselen commission, SA U, 1951(b) 140).

According to Mphahlele (1978:103), out of twelve supplementary examinations in 1940, four were in arithmetic, and in 1941, the same number applied out of a total of only seven supplementary examinations. The reason why many students did not perform well in arithmetic may be ascribed to the teachers, or with the content itself.

5.3.3 Funding

Black education was financed from the General Revenue Account, with funds generated by the general tax paid by black people and from black communities themselves (Horrel 1968:29). This is because the Government of the day felt that black education was too costly, and as a result it looked for ways in which savings could be made with regard to black education. It is important to state that very few blacks were employed and as a result the general tax did not cover the needs of the schools. The main aim was to systematically disadvantage the black learners.

5.3.4 Infrastructure

The building of schools was subsidised on a rand-for-rand basis (Horrel 1968:29). In the remarks that were made by one of the teachers in a quarterly return to the department of education in 1937, the following were mentioned: school buildings, as was the case on many missionary

stations, both in the Northern Province and South Africa at large were in an appalling condition (Botshabelo Training Institution 1937:2).

Unfortunately it is once more the objectives, curriculum, funding and the infrastructure in black schools that reveal that education was not designed for the black child. The annual cost of education per pupil between 1930 and 1945 as discussed above indicates that there is no way a black child could ever afford education let alone reach matric with that kind of meagre per capita funding per person (Officer 2007:2). It is on the basis of the above that 2008 National Senior Certificate Examinations caused uproar in all sorts of media. The ugly head of apartheid education was and still is within and around us.

5.4 Findings

From 1910 to 1948 a series of legislative measures were introduced to disadvantage the majority of the black South Africans. These included the 1913 Land Act and the 1936 Native Development Trust and Land Act. Both Acts were the brainchild of the Bantu Education Act 47 of 1953. The main purposes of the three above-mentioned Acts were to throttle the development of a black child in the early development phase.

- The education of the black people had to be differentiated on the basis of geographical orientation.
- Black people had to develop in the rural areas and their education was to be tailored in that direction.
- Under apartheid education, schools were divided according to race, and education enhanced the divisions in society.
- The British wanted to use education as a way of spreading their language and traditions in the colony and also as a means of social control.
- In all colonies, English was made an official language, and the church, government offices and schools were all anglicised.
- In the hidden curriculum of the British there was a need to educate the Africans so that they could take part in church activities.
- Mission education was also introduced so as to spread the Western way of life among the *backward* Africans and also to teach them certain work skills and values.

- Missionary education had an impact on the indigenes and while they were being anglicised, the Afrikaners started formulating their own education system.
- The Afrikaners then decided to establish their own schools based on Christian National Education (CNE).

The above objectives of education established by Afrikaner nationalists are very similar to those of the missionaries: the politicisation of education and the abuse of religion play a role in both instances. Apartheid was a practice of maintaining that status quo and of preserving the master-servant relationship between the Africans and the white people.

- Bantu education for black South Africans had been a means of restricting the development of the learner by distorting school knowledge to ensure control over the intellect of the learners and teachers. Black education in general continued to reflect serious drawbacks.
- The provision of funding for black education in South Africa remained inadequate.
- This resulted in a number of educational backlogs, namely poor provision of facilities, poor teacher-pupil ratio and a higher rate of unqualified and under-qualified teachers.
- Schools in the urban areas were much more advanced in many educational elements since funding was higher there than in the rural areas.
- The legislative policies which were introduced had negative impact on matric results both directly and indirectly.
- The financing of black education by the state was inadequate and a large portion was used for teacher remuneration, resulting in neglect of aspects such as the building of classrooms and provision of educational equipment for pupils mostly residing in rural areas.
- There was no proper screening of markers of matric scripts, as a result the people who marked the scripts were sometimes not even qualified in the profession.
- White people as young as 16 years were used to mark black matric examinations papers.
- Scripts were marked under the influence of alcohol and throughout the night even if the markers were sleepy.

Under such conditions no one could guarantee correctness and the accuracy of marks for scripts (Mathonsi 1988:37).

- Senior examiners invited their friends and families to undertake marking at marking centres.
- Senior examiners took exam papers to their homes at night and usually scripts were marked the following day.

It is important to mention that the more scripts one mark, the more money one received.

- A senior examiner, who could hardly finish 30 exam papers during the day, could manage to mark 100 to 150 scripts at night.

Determining who was actually marking the scripts at night became very problematic. It was not surprising as there were so many irregularities in black matric results. These irregularities and cases of carelessness must not be understood as inefficiency or lack of knowledge of management, but must be viewed as part of the many instruments used by the government to manipulate the African results according to the economic and political needs of the country (Mathonsi 1988:38). The hidden curriculum in the above educational systems was to create learners who did not question authority. This bleak history of South African education necessitated the introduction of OBE/Curriculum 2005.

5.5 New dispensation National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996.

The Constitution of South Africa of 1996 stipulates the following:

The Bill of Rights, included in the Constitution (article29), includes the following regarding education:

- Everyone has the right to receive education in their official language of choice in public educational institutions where reasonably practicable
- Everyone has the right, at their own expense, to establish and maintain own educational institutions, on condition that there is no discrimination on the basis of race, that those institutions are registered with the state and that the standards at those institutions compare equally with that of the state institutions.

5.5.1 National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996

The objectives of the National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996 are to provide for:

- The determination of National Education Policy by the Minister in accordance with certain principles
- The publication and the implementation of policies, and
- The monitoring and evaluation of education

The national education policy should provide the following:

- Facilities, finances and development
- The ratio between educators and students
- Compulsory schooling
- Co-ordination of curricula, core syllabi, standards, examinations and qualifications
- Language in education (Steyn *et al*2001:56–61).

5.5.2 South African Schools Act 84 of 1996

The purpose of the Act is to:

- provide guidelines for the organisation, governance and funding of schools
- ensure the provision of quality education across the school system
- amend and replace certain laws relating to schools

The content of the Act contains the following:

- For learners with special needs in education, provision is made regarding education and the function and responsibilities of the governing bodies for schools for learners with special needs

- As regards the funding of public schools, guidelines are provided, and also for the payment of school fees at public schools, the establishment of school funds and financial records of public schools (Steyn *et al* 2001:64).
- The introduction of quintiles, 1,2,3,4 and 5 are an example of how school fees are to be organised. These quintiles represent both the disadvantaged and advantaged communities.

Fish-Hodgson *et al* (2015), in an article called *Left in the dark*, dispel the above by stating that. “A root cause of the problem is that, so far as I can make out, by and large the government’s approach to inclusive education is based on the wrong and harmful premise that every person with a disability must be treated exactly like normal people in the education system”.

5.5.3 Education Labour Relations Act 146 of 1993

The aim of the Act is to achieve the following:

- Promote and maintain labour peace
- Regulate collective bargaining in education unions’ roles

The Act is not applicable to employers and employees of independent education institutions and the content includes the following considerations:

- The fundamental rights of the concerned parties
- Procedures for dispute resolutions in case of unfair labour practices, and the guidelines for collective bargaining
- Avoiding strikes during examination time (Steyn *et al* 2001:65).

5.5.4 School Education Act 6 of 1995 of Gauteng

The aim of the Act is to make provision for the establishment and control of education in the Gauteng Province within the guidelines of the national education policy. The content of the Act includes the following:

- Principles regarding the provincial education policy
- Everyone has the right to basic education and to equal access to educational institutions, zero tolerance of discrimination.

School

Stipulations regarding admissions to schools, compulsory school attendance, language policy, expulsion and discipline of pupils, right of information and the responsibilities of pupils regarding the school property are provided.

Teachers

The right and responsibilities of teachers are determined. Teachers are to be in class on time and engaged in teaching (Steyn *et al* 2001:69). It is called Triple T.

The aims and the functions of the Acts discussed above were to improve the education of the South African child in general and the black child in particular.

5.5.4.1 Curriculum 2005

The Curriculum is central to educational policy. It provides what learning and teaching might be, including what is to be learned, processes of learning, teaching and assessment, relationships, power and authority in the system and in schools.

The first reform moment was the construction and implementation of a new curriculum in 1998 for the post-apartheid nation, called Curriculum 2005. The second reform moment was a review of Curriculum 2005 two years later. The result of this review was the construction and implementation of a revised National Curriculum Statement (NCS) in 2002, which was highly criticised in academic and professional circles. The reasons for criticisms were highlighted in the previous chapters (South Africa, Department of Education 2000:22).

5.5.4.2 Funding

The South African Schools Act 84 of 1996 is the source of funding method and strategy for the new dispensation.

Education expenditures in South Africa account for almost six percent of GDP, and this falls within one of the highest rates of government investment in education (National Treasury 2000:South Africa,29) The introduction of National Norms and Standards for Schooling Funding (NNSSF) saw the start of pro-poor funding to public schools. This was based on the poverty

profile of the community serviced by the school, and schools were ranked and organised into quintiles.

This was later supported by a school fee exemption policy that allowed poor learners in well-funded schools to apply for exemptions from paying full fees (Mestry 2014:503). The NNSSF provides a statutory basis for school funding in that schools are now classified into wealth quintiles and subsidised accordingly (that is, schools serving poorer communities must receive more funds than schools serving better-off communities) (Mestry 2014:504).

5.5.4.3 Infrastructure

A shortage of classrooms makes it impossible for schools to use their teachers appropriately and this leads to unpleasant learning and teaching conditions, sometimes even conditions which make learning and teaching almost impossible. The problems related to infrastructural development were inherited from the apartheid era. In that system, all developmental issues related to African people in particular were either minimal or non-existent in many areas of life. Infrastructure is an integral component of the learning and teaching context. This is because the school's infrastructure enables students and teachers to access a wide range of tools, services and resources to support learning and teaching (Khumalo & Mji 2014:1522).

It is reported that on the one hand the lack of facilities and under-resourced schools are directly associated with failure of learners. On the other hand, factors affecting rural learners' academic success have been identified as poor infrastructure, poverty and lack of supportive academic discourse (Khumalo & Mji 2014:1522). This includes curriculum and funding because the two components cannot be separated from infrastructure.

5.6 Findings

As with the post-1994 educational policies, the democratic dispensation introduced many legislative policies in general and educational policies in particular. A number of education policies will be discussed below. According to Malada (2010) many previous systems had been efficient even though they might have had flaws and had room for improvement, however instead of assessing what was positive and building on the positives, the new approach was to discard tried and tested basic principles of education.

The researcher is of the view that this fact alone was disastrous to the policy-makers who tried to undo past systems. The demise of the apartheid government necessitated the introduction of an education system that was based on the foundations of democracy, non-racialism, non-sexism and justice. When countries opt for educational changes, they take cognisance of several other factors such as social, political and cultural issues.

- The introduction of Outcomes-based education (OBE) in South Africa was not only an attempt to change the educational system but also with the purpose of transforming society.
- The previous education system fell short of international standards in the field of mathematics and science.
- The new curriculum was developed in South Africa to ensure that education reflected the contemporary needs of society.
- The rationalisation and redeployment of teachers especially at the beginning of the introduction of the new education system (OBE/C2005) was a miscalculated move.
- The result was that teachers who left or were leaving the profession were generally often those with higher qualifications, skills and experience than those who were remaining.
- The exodus of these well-qualified teachers had serious implications on matric results.
- Both the rationalisation policy and the closure of colleges of education had fairly dramatic and lasting implications for 2008 matric results.

The impact of the rationalisation policy cannot be over-emphasised. Individual unions warned that teachers would need to be consulted before being moved. Privileged schools resisted the above policy.

Implementation of the rationalisation policy resulted in some of the following practical difficulties:

- Loss of skilled teachers through Voluntary Severance Packages
- Costs
- Resistance of teachers to redeployment
- Resistance by schools to hiring teachers from the excess lists

Without doubt the above factors have contributed negatively to the 2008 matric results. This is because when all these issues have been dealt with, whether successfully or not, teaching and learning continued.

- The new curriculum overburdened schools and teachers with policies and demanding outcomes when what was required were very simple elements such as a sufficient number of desks, competent teachers and clear timetables.
- The policy-makers failed to establish solid foundations for learning early in the school cycle, with the result that learners in the later grades found themselves in a constant state of “catching up” that was exacerbated by policies that demand that principals promote failing children to the next grade.
- This was called “progressed learners”. As with the education system post-1994, the National Senior Certificate is an important indicator of the quality of our education system.
- The original C2005 was formulated in complex language.
- Teacher training programmes were weak, sporadically presented and contained a fatal design flaw (Cascade model).
- The cascade model was too condensed, information driven, removed from classroom context.

The cascade model involves the training of a few who then train others (transfer of training). This is a brief explanation of the cascade model. The streamlined curriculum often co-exists with both the historical curriculum (NATED 550) and the original C2005 in the schools.

- The absence of organisations, shortage of new textbooks, and the lack of critical learning base for both teachers and learners was seen as affecting the matric results of 2008.
- Curriculum reforms lacked systemic focus in several ways.
- It did not link the different training levels in the cascade model together tightly with respect to what teachers were required to do in the classroom context.
- All schools were treated the same way, irrespective of the resources and expert levels.
- It did not demonstrate adequately how the new curriculum would handle the powerful legacy and orientations of the old curriculum.

- In many cases teachers even gained the impression that they were starting from scratch.
- The Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS) clearly states that educators and learners are to assume new roles.
- The RNCS envisaged teachers who are qualified in their field of teaching, are competent, dedicated and caring.
- Some of the roles include being mediators of learning, interpreters and designers of learning programmes and materials, leaders and managers, to mention a few.
- The curriculum seeks to create a lifelong learner who is confident and independent, literate, numerate, multi-skilled, compassionate, with respect for the environment and the ability to participate in society as a critical and active citizen.
- All the learning areas in the RNCS strive to redress past imbalances.
- One of the basic aims of the South African Schools Act (SASA) 84 of 1996 was to reverse the remnants of unfair discrimination as well as to redress past imbalances based on ethnicity and race.

There is now sufficient evidence that the significant growth in education expenditure did not necessarily impact deeply on the forms of teaching and learning in schools and the classroom.

- The National Senior Certificate examinations and Annual Assessment cannot tell us reliably how the education system is performing overtime –these tests are not designed to do so, and have important limitations.

This is in contrast with what the DOE says about NSC. The new Curriculum and training system introduces a lifelong education system which is people centred (Bengu, S.M.E, 1997:2). What is clear is that it does not say whether it helps the learners to pass. The mere fact that it has important limitations already exposes its weakness.

- There was a low level of reading and writing in the foundation phase which obviously continued to the higher classes, hence the matric results of 2008.

These results were a cause for concern to the South African public in general and academics in particular.

- Schools, classrooms and learner performances are the points at which we can measure how effective a Curriculum is. At present there are many constraints in the system. These are basic facilities, books and other learning materials, the number of schools, class sizes and the conditions of schools (Mahomed, H, 2004: 8).

This is surely a recipe for disaster, and certainly had a negative impact on the matric results of 2008.

- The abolition of corporal punishment has become a challenge to teachers.
- We have one of the world's highest teacher absenteeism rates.

This too is not helpful to the matric learners.

- More than 10 000 unqualified teachers are employed in our schools.

We still expect good results despite this kind of situation.

- In South Africa an extreme gap persists between well-off and poor public schools with regard to both learning conditions – that is school infrastructure facilities, school resources, socio-economic contexts and learning outcomes, and performance in standardised tests, proficiency, and post-schooling prospects.

In other words, the stakeholders assert that the disadvantaged will remain at the lowest levels of communities while the advantaged will continue enjoying the benefits of the country's economic situation. It is demonstrated from the study how the economic situation plays a role in learning and teaching conditions and performance.

5.7 Reports of role-players and stakeholders in education

A stakeholder is defined as an individual or entity which stands to gain or lose from the success or failure of a system or an organisation (Codora, 2008:1). It is important to state that the role-players in education are as important as the system itself.

The following role-players in education will be briefly discussed:

- Umalusi
- Teacher unions

- Parents
- Governing bodies
- Non-governmental organisations

5.7.1 Umalusi

Umalusi, Council for Quality Assurance in General and Further Education and Training was established by an Act of Parliament, the General and Further Education and Training Quality Assurance Act, 2001 (Act No. 58 of 2001) (the Genfetqua Act), in December 2001 (Lolwana, P, 2006:3).

The standardisation of marks is the responsibility of Umalusi and its decision is final in all cases (*Government Gazette* 2008:29–44, department of education). This explains why uproar followed the release of the 2008 results; the assumption was that the department of education had “fiddled” with the results. Umalusi was mentioned as an accomplice by academics, media and other interest groups.

5.7.2 Teacher unions

Teacher unions are the mouthpiece of its members in relation to labour relation matters. One of the difficult or rather thorny issues that affect teachers in the new era is that of teacher Rationalisation and Redeployment (R&R). From a teacher’s perspective the issue of relocation to another school, resistance by teachers to redeployment and worse resistance by schools to hiring teachers from the excess lists was problematic.

From the learner’s view point, the loss of skilled teachers through Voluntary Severance Packages (VSPs) cost them dearly (South Africa, Department of Education 1997:156). While all these disagreements raged, teaching and learning was “taking place”. This was happening in a volatile environment.

5.7.3 Parents

Parents too play a critical role in the educational context because they provide moral, financial and emotional support to their children. Parents are the safety net for their children, yet too many of them fail to realise this important fact. The greatest resource any classroom teacher can utilise is the parents. The learner’s success and failures also depend on the participation of the parents. In the same vein it is important to state that most parents in black communities are illiterate.

5.7.4 Governing bodies

The governing body must adopt a constitution, develop the mission statement of the school, and adopt a code of conduct for the learners at the school, support the principal, educators and staff of the school in the performance of their professional functions (Brunton and Associates 2003:B-12).

Members of the school governing bodies also experience some challenges as some members are not familiar with the constitution of governing bodies. As a result, implementing the policies of governing educators and learners in particular is not entirely successful. For example, the discipline of learners should be dealt with in a manner which will assist the teachers in running schools smoothly.

5.7.5 Non-governmental organisations (NGOs)

Non-governmental organisations such as Equal Education (EE), Equal Education Law Centre (EE Law) and Section 27 are some of the active participants in the education of the South African child in general and the black child in particular.

These organisations wrote an open letter to the Minister of Basic Education and Director-General raising pertinent issues such as the following:

- The appalling state of school infrastructure in townships and rural schools
- The failure to revise the national policy on learner pregnancies
- The non-delivery of workbooks and textbooks to thousands of learners across the country (City Press 2012:10).

These are just some of the issues that were raised with the education department by non-governmental organisations.

The standardisation of marks is the responsibility of Umalusi and its decision is final in all cases (Government Gazette 2008:44, department of education) Studies have reported strong associations of educational achievements with disciplinary applied to students measures and family background (Khumalo & Mji 2014:1523). Governing bodies in quintile four and five schools normally pay teachers extra money when they have worked overtime. As a result of these incentives, the performance of learners is good.

The fact that better qualified, more experienced teachers were applying for retirement/retrenchment packages would also explain the much higher than estimated costs of the process, costs in terms of money and also costs in terms of the failure rate of learners who, in most cases end up as drop-outs. We have already dealt with cost issues in the preceding paragraphs where Jansen supplied ten reasons why he believed OBE would fail.

A summary of the curricula and funding models of all the above education departments is supplied in the tables below from pre- to post-legislative policies.

Table 5.7 Shift from the traditional to the constructivist classroom

Traditional classroom	Constructivist classroom
Curriculum is presented part to whole with emphasis on basic skills	Curriculum is presented whole to part with emphasis on big concepts
Strict adherence to fixed curriculum is highly valued	Pursuit of learner questions is highly valued
Curricular activities rely heavily on textbooks and workbooks	Curricular activities rely heavily on primary sources of data and manipulative materials
Students are viewed as “blank slates” onto which information is etched by the teacher	Learners are viewed as thinkers with emerging theories about the world
Teacher generally behaves in a didactic manner, disseminating information to students	Educators generally behave in an interactive manner, mediating between the environment and learners
Teacher seeks the correct answer to validate student learning	Educators seek the learner’s point of view in order to understand learner’s present conceptions for use in subsequent lessons

Assessments of student learning is viewed as separate from teaching and occurs almost entirely through testing	Assessment of learner learning is interwoven with teaching and occurs through educator observations of learners at work and through learner exhibitions and portfolios
Students primarily work alone	Learners primarily work in groups

Source: South Africa, Department of Education (2000b:12)

Table 5.8 From content-based to an Outcomes-based approach

Old	New
Passive learners	Active learners
Exam-driven	Learners are assessed on an on-going basis
Rote-learning	Critical thinking, reasoning, reflection and action
Syllabus is content based and broken down into subjects	An integration of knowledge, learning relevant and connected to real-life situations
Text book Worksheet-bound and teacher bound	Learner centred, teacher is facilitator, teacher constantly uses group work and team work to consolidate the new approach
See syllabus as rigid and non-negotiable	Learning programmes seen as guides that allow teachers to be innovative and creative in designing programmes
Teachers responsible for learning, motivation depending on the personality of teacher	Learners take responsibility for their learning, pupils motivated by constant feedback and affirmation of their worth

Source: Bengu (1997:7)

5.8 Findings

- Many researchers have highlighted the fact that the challenges in the introduction of Outcomes-based education (OBE) in South Africa in 1997 were caused by the fact that many teachers were not part of the formulation process.
- Teachers often used to be criticised from all sides for inadequacies for which they were not to blame, for example, a lack of sufficient teaching materials.
- When unions take up their own reform initiatives they are seen as overstepping boundaries.
- When they raise concerns about the adequacy of support for teaching they are viewed as out of touch.
- A consequence of teachers' absence from the policy arena is that most government reforms lack consideration of conditions that shape the quality of teaching and learning.
- In many places, the news media and the public hold images of teacher organisations as militant, unprofessional, simplistic, and selfish in their priorities.

As a result it has become more difficult for union staff and officials to establish credibility and work proactively within the educational policy system. In contrast to the portrayal of self-serving unions advocating for teacher benefits at the expense of learning, some researchers paint an evolving picture of unions as organisations committed to strengthening the teaching profession and improving the quality of education.

- Teacher unions have not always fitted easily into the educational landscape.
- Changes in economic dynamics worldwide have resulted in reshaping the workforce and led to the new curriculum initiatives with serious consequences for teachers and students.
- Over the past fifteen years or so, criticism of some of the teacher unions in general and South African Democratic Teacher union in particular has increased.

At the same time, teacher unions themselves have been attempting to enhance their involvement in and influence over educational reform.

- The intensity of recent condemnations has caused teacher unions to take a number of different approaches: reacting defensively to criticism, accommodating some new reform

initiatives, developing partnerships with education officials, and forging new reform directions of their own. Schools need to see themselves as part of the community.

- The introduction of School Governing Bodies (SGBs) was seen as the answer to dealing with the needs of schools within the community.
- With the expanded powers of the parents and SGBs, the role of parents has ensured that schools do become accountable structures of authority in communities.

5.9 Validity and reliability

Validity in educational research, particularly in case study research has long been debated. While researchers with a positivist orientation have always questioned the validity of case study research, some are beginning to accept that it is possible to increase validity even in case study research.

5.10 Conclusion

South Africa has undergone a series of curriculum changes since the Government of National Unity in 1994. When Curriculum 2005 was introduced in 1998 it was seen as a departure from 1997 apartheid education through the introduction of Outcomes-based education (OBE). OBE was considered too cumbersome in design and too complex in language. With the recommendation of the review committee, the curriculum was streamlined.

The Review National Curriculum Statement (CAPS) with its simpler language and fewer outcomes was introduced in 2002. Still educators continued to experience implementation problems with RNCS which necessitated its revision, resulting in the Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement. CAPS is intended to improve teaching and learning but its success depends on the educator in the classroom. Educators therefore need to be supported in their roles through the provision of substantive training and resources in order to realise their potential.

Chapter 6: Recommendations and conclusion

6.1 Introduction

For over two decades, the state of education in South Africa has been abysmal. We are still faced with a lack of both human and infrastructural resources. We were promised by the ruling party that the “Doors of learning and culture shall be opened”. It is a dream deferred.

6.2 Summary of findings and conclusion

Politics and education cannot be separated. It is necessary to have an understanding of the political climate of the Republic of South Africa in order to understand the educational provisions available to its citizens. In this dissertation an attempt has been made to analyse the National Educational policy based on Christian National Education (CNE), Bantu Education Act 47 of 1953 and Outcomes-based education (OBE)/Curriculum 2005(C2005) to date.

6.2.1 Pre-1994 legislative policy (1939)

In 1948 the Nationalist Party came to power and introduced the apartheid system of education, called Bantu education.

- They had prepared an updated version of so-called Christian National Education (CNE), narrow in philosophy, more chauvinist and of wider applicability than the Transvaal version of fifty years earlier (Mathonsi 1988:11).
- Its aim was to prevent Africans from receiving an education that would lead them to aspire to positions they wouldn't be allowed to hold in society (Mathonsi 1988:12)
- The ideological entrenchment by means of education has this to say “The government regarded schools as an integral part of a specific community. Therefore, it argued that the responsibility for establishing schools rested with the community (Booyse, *et al*, 2011:245).

6.2.2 Post-1994

- The ascendancy to power of the liberation movement in South Africa resulted in the recognition of education as a human right that is enshrined in the Constitution (Chapter 2, Bill of Rights:14).
- Apart from policy formulation, the government has control over matters such as compulsory education, types of schools, school buildings, curriculum and syllabus construction and teaching methods.
- It was a mistake on the part of the government of the day to try to re-invent the wheel.

The above summarise the state of education in South Africa (OBE/C2005). According to Onyeani (1990:146)“we don’t have to invent a new mousetrap, it has already been invented”.

- Policy failures often arise out of a variety of factors including both intrinsic and extrinsic sources (Jansen *et al* 2001:32).

6.2.2.1 Curriculum

- The difference between the “old” and the “new” approaches is that the old syllabus is content-based while the new offers an integration of knowledge and learning which is relevant and connected to real-life situations.
- The National Senior Certificate examination results of 2008 however painted a different picture about the new knowledge.
- The results generated a concern in the public arena.
- There are number of statements regarding the education priorities of South Africa, viz: OBE/C2005, Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS), National Curriculum Statement (NCS) and now Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS).
- There were flaws in OBE/C2005 hence the formulation of the Revised National Curriculum Statement, which was also flawed.
- A new version called CAPS was introduced.

A summary of curriculum changes since 1994 is as follows:

- 1996 OBE/C2005 was introduced following the advent of multiparty democracy in 1994. It sets clear outcomes for learners at each stage of their education so that everyone

involved (learners themselves, teachers, parents, etc.) knows what is expected, this means that it becomes easy to measure a learner's progress against these outcomes (Seale 2012).

- 2002 NCS applies from Grade R through to Grade 9, and is not a new curriculum, but a streamlined and strengthened version of Curriculum 2005. The NCS states clearly what each learner should achieve in terms of learning outcomes and assessment standards by the end of each grade (Department of education, national curriculum statement Grade R-9 2006:6).
- 2012 CAPS was introduced in Grade 1,2,3 and 10, providing details of what content ought to be assessed on a grade –by grade and subject by-subject basis (Report of curriculum 2005 Review committee 2000:8).

6.2.2.2. Funding

- The Government contribution per pupil for the education of White people was ten times than that for the education of Black people. The contribution per head of White population was over forty times as much as per head of Black population (SA[U] 1936:60).
- Funding determines the amount and quality of learning materials, facilities, and teachers.
- Disproportionate funding clearly created disparities in learning.
- This is still a burning issue today, despite the fact that the government has introduced a funding model that promised to be fair.
- The advantaged are still enjoying the benefits of the past while the disadvantaged are still struggling with the aftermath of continuously revised policies and apartheid fall-out.

6.2.2.3. Infrastructure

- Dilapidated school buildings, overcrowded classrooms, inadequate instruction, poor teacher training, and a lack of textbooks still plague African learners.
- Libraries and laboratories are still a pipe dream in African schools. As a result of this, National Senior Certificate examination results have been affected.

6.3 The role of stakeholders in education

A stakeholder is defined as an individual or entity which stands to gain or lose from the success or failure of a system or an organisation (Callinicos 1995).

6.3.1 Umalusi

- Umalusi is one of the core stakeholders in education with specific regards to National Senior Certificate examinations.
- One of its responsibilities is to ensure that assessments and examination of qualifications for which it is responsible are of appropriate standard and quality.
- The process is called standardisation.
- Umalusi adjusts marks up or down based on their analysis.
- In this study it is contended that Umalusi adjusted the marks up and the views of the academics, professionals and other stakeholders were that this was done for political reasons.

Hence, the curriculum was revised after the review committee made its recommendations to the Basic Education Department.

6.3.2 Teacher Unions

- They were unhappy about the introduction of Voluntary Severance Packages (VSPs).
- Relocation of their members to other schools or provinces was a burning issue.
- Some of their arguments rang true, like the fact that they were already overburdened with overcrowded classrooms. The introduction of VSPs is aimed at removing some of their members.
- The new curriculum was also problematic despite the introduction of the cascade method.
- While the syllabus was undergoing changes, teaching and learning was going on.
- To say the least, it was a disaster.
- Hence the unions were up in arms.

6.3.3 Parents

- Parents too play a critical role in the educational system because they provide moral, financial and emotional support to their children.

6.3.4 Governing bodies

- A governing body must adopt a constitution, develop the mission statement of the school, and adopt a code of conduct for the learners at the school, support the principal, educators and staff of the school in the performance of their professional functions, determine times of the school day consistent with applicable conditions of employment of staff administering the school and control the school's property, and buildings and grounds occupied by the school, including school hostels if applicable, and encourage parents, learners, educators and other staff at the school to render voluntary services to the school (Brunton & Associates 2003:B–12).

6.3.5 Non-governmental organisations

- Non-governmental organisations identified issues of concern in the education sector and identified them to the leadership of the National Department of Education.
- The government's failure to listen to the above-mentioned stakeholders in most cases, if not all, led to the failure of learners, in particular Grade 12 learners.
- Grade 12 learners are the focus because Grade 12 is the culmination of 12 years of schooling within the system.

6.4 Achievements and failures of the post-1994 education system.

6.4.1 Achievements

- The introduction of one education department is a step in the right direction.
- Legislative policies are inclusive and accommodative.
- The introduction of modularisation in Grade 12 for the progressed learners was positive.
- The funding model, which is quintile-system related is progressive.

6.4.2 Failures

- It was not wise to throw out the old education system without retaining effective aspects.
- The closure of teacher training colleges was counter-productive.
- The introduction of Voluntary Severance Packages was a mistake.
- There was an inability to deal with the issues of blind learners in rural areas as their books/workbooks were not available. The funding model was still concentrated in urban areas.
- The introduction of 30% as pass mark was a mistake as it meant that learners were clueless about 70% of the work.
- The cascade model did not work.
- There were curriculum changes with every new Minister of Education.
- Instilling a culture of learning and teaching is difficult, since disciplining learners can be regarded as harassment.
- There was a failure to contain teacher strikes, especially when examinations were about to commence.

It is obvious that the failures outnumber the achievements. As a result it is important for the ruling party to take stock of the education system that our children are part of. The failure of Grade 12 learners during the first introduction of a new curriculum is a reflection of the failure of Education Department to keep in place what was working in the period pre-1994.

6.5 Recommendations of the study

- ❖ Policy-makers should view teacher unions more as collaborators than as adversaries.
- ❖ Re-conceptualising the role of teachers in the arena of educational decision-making requires a significant paradigm shift.
- ❖ Teacher unions must select and create reform initiatives that further their basic message regarding support for the education system.
- ❖ Schools should set expectations for learners that are possible to attain, both in respect of the academic and non-academic activities of the school.

- ❖ Educators should involve parents in all school activities, including learner disciplinary hearings, parents' evenings, school-book viewing, school-governing body activities, and individual meetings or interviews with educators.
- ❖ The Department of Education needs to rise to the challenges and allow dialogue on the effects, both positive and negative of the mechanisms that are used to increase access to education, such as pass requirements in the whole system in general and in the National Senior Certificate in particular.

It would also be interesting to investigate the disjuncture between policy and practice, and to explore ways of achieving national policy goals without strike action by educators and learners alike.

- Infrastructure should accommodate even visually impaired learners throughout the country.
- Braille books should be produced to enable learners with eyesight challenges to access education with ease like other abled learners.
- Policy regarding pregnant learners must be reconsidered.
- Teachers should be recognised and rewarded adequately by government.
- Government should ensure a good working environment, adequate resources and support as job satisfaction is multi-faceted.
- SGBs must be fully trained, especially in the areas of finance and policies of the Department of education.
- Drug awareness campaigns should be introduced at an early age and be part of the formal curriculum.

6.6 Recommendations for further study

It is recommended that researchers undertake studies to bring about more insight into educational matters. Such research could provide guidance and recommendations for policy-makers. Investigation should be conducted to ascertain the qualifications of educators and their relevance to the subjects which the educators are teaching, especially in schools that are not performing up to standard.

6.7 Conclusion

The reality of generational woundedness has not been adequately taken into account when we investigate the challenges faced by the education sector in South Africa. If we can reflect and look at the principal criticisms advocated by Jansen and others in general and the ten major reasons advocated by Jansen in particular on why OBE would fail, we will realise the extent of the damage done to our children. “We have failed our children” indeed. The fact that all children should receive high-quality education is incontestable.

OBE/C2005, RNCS, NCS and CAPS are not the way to achieve this. Back to basics is the answer. The answer is reading, writing and numeracy. The view that CAPS has been introduced to strengthen the National Curriculum Statement in order to improve the quality of teaching and learning in our schools is a fallacy. Advocates of the education system have acquired a keen appreciation of the need to gain the support of the real powers in society if they want their often ambitious plans to come to fruition. However, the lessons that have not been learnt about knowledge and commitments are still too great. Advocates of the education system always seem to have underestimated the fragility of their organisations, support bases and financial support. These lessons will have to be learnt very soon for a viable education to continue in a rapidly changing society. Most important, parents as the primary caregivers of the children must be actively involved in the education of their children.

7. Bibliography

- Allais, S.M, 2003, *The National Qualifications Framework in South Africa: a democratic project, trapped in a neo-liberal paradigm*. Journal of education and work, Vol. 16 No.3, Johannesburg: University of Witwatersrand.
- Babbie, E & Mouton, J. 2001, *The practice of social research*. (South African edition). Cape Town: Oxford University Press Southern Africa.
- Bascia, N & Osmond, P. 2012, *Teacher Unions and Educational Reform: A Research Review*. National Education Association Center for Great Public Schools Research Department. Washington, DC.
- Bengu, S.M.E. 1997, *Curriculum 2005, Lifelong learning for the 21st century*. Pretoria: National Department of Education.
- Better the devil you know... Belacqua. 2009,23 March.
- Bless, C. & Higson-Smith, C. 1999, *Fundamentals of social research methods: an African perspective* 3rd edition. Lansdowne: Juta.
- Block, G. 2012, *Schools crying out for help*, *Sunday Times*, 9 December.
- Booyse, J.J, Le Roux, CS, Seroto, J & Wolhuter, C.C. 2011, *A history of schooling in South Africa: method and context*. Pretoria: Van Schaik.
- Botshabelo Training Institution.1937,*Quarterly returns*. Botshabelo, Middelburg: Berlin Mission Society.
- Borg, W & Gail, M.D. 1989,*Education research: an introduction*. New York: Longman.
- Boslama, F, Lansari, A, Al-Rawi, A & Abonamah, A.A. 2003, *A novel outcomes-based education model and its effect on student learning, curriculum development, and assessment*. Abu Dhabi, UAE: Zayed University,
- Brunton, C & Associates.2003, *Policy handbook for educators* .Commissioned by the Educations Labour Relations Council (ELRC).

- Budhal, R.S. 2000, The impact of the principal's instructional leadership on the culture of teaching and learning in the school. Med dissertation. Pretoria: University of South Africa.
- Cadora, L. 2008, Educational role players/stakeholders:, Charlotte Mason Institute.
- Callinicos, A. 1995, *Socialists in the trade unions*. England: Cox and Wyman.
- Caulley, D.N. 1983, Documents analysis in program evaluation and program planning.*An International Journal* 6(1):19–29.
- Chisholm, L, Motala, M & Valley, S. 1993,*The South African education policy review 1993–2000*.Sandton, Gauteng: Heinemann
- City Press.2012. Masondo, S & Du Plessis C : Angie 's Big Lie: Motshekga never fired
Karodia24 June.
- Cohen, L & Marion, I. 1990, *Research methods in education*. London: Routledge.
- Cohen, L & Marion, L. 1994, *Research methods in education*.4th edition. London: Routledge.
- Cohen, L,Marion, L & Morrison, K.2000, *Research methods in education*. London. Routledge.
- Constitution of South Africa of 1996.
- Coughlan, F. 2000, *Work sheets prepared for research methodology for social work students*. East London: Rhodes University.
- Cresswell, J.W. 1994, *Research design: qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Cresswell, J.W. 1998, *Qualitative inquiry and research design: choosing among five traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Currim, N. 1998, The development of Curriculum 2005.A paper presented at the CIES World Congress, Cape Town, 12–17 July.
- De Vos, A.S. 1998, *Research at grass roots*. Cape Town: Van Schaik.

- Denzin, N.K. & Lincoln, Y.S. 1994, *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousands Oak, Calif; Sage.
- Dockrell, W.B & Hamilton, D.1980, *Rethinking educational research*. Suffolk: Chaucer Press.
- Fox.W. & Bayat, M.S. 2007. *A guide to managing research*. Cape Town :Juta.
- Freire, P. 1993, *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: Continuum International.
- Freire, P.2006, *Pedagogy of the oppressed*.30th Anniversary edition. New York: Continuum International.
- Fish-Hadgson, T.& Khumalo, S. 2015, *Left in the dark: Failure to provide access to quality education to blind and partially sighted learners in South Africa*. Cape Town: the earth is round.
- Glesne, C & Peshkin, A. 1992, *Becoming qualitative researchers: an introduction*. New York: Longman.
- Govender,P.2012, Errors blamed for maths test “disaster”, *Sunday Times*, 14 December.
- Government Gazette*, 2008a.No 8844, Vol. 518, August 29.Pretoria: Government Printers,
- Government Gazette*, 2008b.No 31337, Vol. 518, August 29. Pretoria: Government Printers.
- Government Gazette*, 2008. No.8944, Vol.518, August 29. Pretoria: Government Printers.
- Greecy, B. 2010, Retired teachers asked to step in to help pupils. *The Star*, 12 March.
- Green, J. & Thorogood, N. 2009, *Qualitative methods for health research*. Los Angeles London: Sage.
- Grinnel, R.M. 1988/1998, *Social works research and evaluation*.3rdedition. Illinois: Peacock.
- Gower P ,Dibetle, M & Mohlala, T.2010,Matric may become irrelevant: universities complain that the national exam is no longer a benchmark for admission. *Mail & Guardian*, 1 November.
- Harber, C. 1992, *Using documents for qualitative educational research in Africa*. New York: Garland.

- Hlongane, A.K. 2008, *Footprints of the “class of 76” : commemoration, memory, mapping and heritage*. Johannesburg: Hector Pieterse Museum.
- Hoadly, U & Jansen, J. 2002, *Curriculum: from plans to practices learning guide*. Cape Town: Oxford University press.
- Hoberg, S.A.1999, *Study guide for MEDEM 1,2,3,4 and 5. Education management: Research methodology*. Pretoria: University of South Africa.
- Holmes, M, 1992. *Educational policy for the pluralist democracy: the common school, choice and diversity*. Washington DC: Falmer Press.
- Horrel, M. 1963, *Legislation and race relations: a summary of the main South African laws which affect race relationships*. Johannesburg: South African Institute of Race Relations.
- Horrel, M.1968, *Bantu education to 1968*. Johannesburg: South Africa institute of Race Relations.
- Huddleston, T. 1956, *Naught for your comfort*. Johannesburg: Hardingham and Donaldson,
- Jansen, J. 1998, Curriculum reform in South Africa: a critical analysis of Outcomes-based education. *Cambridge Journal of education*
- Jansen, J. 2011, *We need to talk*. South Africa: Bookstorm and Pan Macmillan.
- Khumalo, B & Mji, A. 2014, *Exploring education's perspective of the impact of poor infrastructure on learning and teaching in rural South African Schools* .Rome-Italy: MCSER
- Killen, R. 2003, *Outcomes-based education: principles and possibilities*. Australia: University of Newcastle.
- Kraak, A & Young, M. 2001, *Education in retrospect: policy and implementation since 1990*. Pretoria: HSRC Press.
- Kvale, S. 1996, *Interviews: an introduction to qualitative research in interviewing*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Lewis-Beck, M.S, Bryman, A & Liao, T.F. 2004, *The Sage encyclopaedia of social science research methods*. Vol1. United Kingdom: Sage.

Lolwana, P. 2006, *Umalusi: a historical perspective council for quality assurance in general and further education and training*. Pretoria: Umalusi.

Lorgat, M.M. 1962, *A critical analysis of Christian National Education (CNE) and its impact on Bantu education, with special reference to the Bantu Education Act of 1953*. Johannesburg; A dissertation presented to the University of the Witwatersrand in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Bachelor of education.

Luthuli, P.C. 1985, *What Ought to be in black education*. Durban: Butterworth.

Mahomed, H. 2004, Fifth Annual Educationally Speaking Conference 15th -18th May 2004, Birchwood Hotel, Boksburg. Challenges in Curriculum Transformation in South Africa.

Malada, B.2010, We ignore proper education at our own peril. 19 September.

Maree, J.G & Fraser, W.J. 2004, *Outcomes-based assessment*. Park Lane: Sandown Heinemann.

Marlow, C. 1998, *Research methods for generalist social work*. Pacific Grove: Brooks/Cole.

Mason, E.J, & Bramble, W. 1989, *Understanding and conducting research: Application in education and social sciences*. New York, McGraw-Hill.

Mathibe, I.R. 1998, Development, character and effects of education in a technocratic age, M dissertation, Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Mathonsi, E.N. 1988, *Black matriculation results: a mechanism of social control*. Johannesburg: Skotaville.

Mazibuko, S. 2012, Community development. Available: <http://www.tandfonline.com/loi/rcod20> (accessed on 9 May 2012).

Mbanjwa, X. 2010, *The Star*. Crisis looms as teachers quit in droves, Monday, 7 June.

Mbeki, T, 1998, African National Congress 86th Anniversary. Popular mobilisation for the consolidation of peoples' power. Statement, 8 January.

- McMillan, J.H & Schumacher, S. 1993, *Research in education: a conceptual introduction*. New York: Harper Collins.
- McMillan, J.H & Schumacher, S. 2001, *Research in education*. 5th edition. Cape Town: Maskew Miller Longman.
- McMillan, J.H & Schumacher, S. 2006, *Research in education: a conceptual primer*. 3rd edition. Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall.
- Merriam, S. 1991. *Case study research in education: a qualitative approach*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Mestry, R. 2014, *Financing education in the Gauteng Province of South Africa: a twenty year analysis of using budgets to improve opportunities*. Rome-Italy: MCSER
- Milies, M.B & Huberman, A.M. 1994, *Qualitative data analysis: an expanded sourcebook*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Mothapo, M.A. 2003, A phenomenological evaluation of outcomes-based education with specific reference to South Africa. PhD thesis in Education. Pretoria, University of Pretoria.
- Mouton, J. 2001, *How to succeed in your master's and doctoral studies, South Africa: guide and resource book*. 1st edition. Pretoria: Van Schaik.
- Mouton, N, Louw, G.P & Strydom, G.L. 2012, International Business & Economics Research Journal-November 2012, Volume 11, Number 11. A Historical Analysis of The Post-Apartheid Dispensation Education in South Africa (1994-2011).
- Mphahlele, M.C.J. 1978, The development, role and influence of missionary teacher-training institutions in the territory of Lebowa 1903–1953. D.Edthesis, Sovenga, University of the North.
- Murphy, B.C & Dillon, C. 1998, *Interviewing in action: process and practice*. Pacific Grove: Brooks/Cole.
- Murphy, K.L. 1996, Reconstructing the nation: race, gender and restoration, the progressive era, DPhil dissertation, University of Minnesota.

Naong, M. 2007, The impact of the corporal punishment on teacher morale: 1994–2004. *South African Journal of Education* 27(2):283, 285.

National treasury.2000, Intergovernmental fiscal review 2000. Pretoria: South Africa.

Officer, L.H. 2007, *Exchangerates between the United States dollar and party-one currency*, Measuring Worth.com. <http://www.measuringworth.com/exchange/global/>.

Olivier , B. 2009, Why OBE has not worked in South Africa, 5, September

Onyaeni, C. 1990, *Capitalist nigger: the road to success, a spider web doctrine*. United States of America: Timbuktu.

Oosthuizen, I.J. 2002, Discipline at school under the microscope. *Pretoria News*, 2 May:2.

Outrageous outcomes.1997, *The Aida Parker Newsletter*. Issue 208July:17.

Patton, M.Q. 1990, *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*.2nd edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Pottinger, B. 2009, *Mbeki's legacy*. Cape Town: Random House/Struik/Zebra Press.

Powney, J & Watts, M. 1990, *Reporting interviews: a code of good practice, research intelligence*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Prior, L. 2003, *Documents in social research*. London: Sage.

Ramphela, M. 2008, *Laying ghosts to rest: dilemmas of the transformation in South Africa*. Cape Town: Tafelberg.

Ramphela, M. 2009, Another generation betrayed: for all the trumpeting of the matric pass rate, the real picture is one of failure, *Sunday Times*, 1 August:19

Ramphela, M. 2009, Our house is on fire: since 1994 most of us have cared only about me, myself and I. *Mail & Guardian*, 11–17 September.

Relly, G. 1987, Towards a non-racial democracy in South Africa. Address by the Chairman of Anglo American Corporation of South Africa, The Hague, Netherlands, 10 September.

Report by Ministerial Committee. 2009, Investigation into the causes of delays in the release of some National Senior Certificate (NSC) results 2008, 31 January. Pretoria : Department of education.

Rossouw, D. 2003, *Intellectual tools skills for the human sciences*.2nd edition. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Rubin, A &Babbie, E. 1997, *Research methods for social work*. Pacific Grove: Brooks/Cole.

Sayet, Y & Jansen, J. 2001, *Implementing education policy review: the South African experience*. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic.

Schofield, J.W. 2000, Increasing the generalisability of qualitative data. In *Case study method*, edited by R Gomm, M Hammerly& P Foster. London: Sage.

Schulze, S. 2002,*Research methodology. Department of further teacher education*. Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Seale, L. 2012, New curriculum, same problems, *The Star*, Monday, 2 July.

Seepe, S. 2004, *Speaking truth to power reflections on post-1994 South Africa*. Pretoria: Vista University and Skotaville.

Seepe, S. 2004. *Towards African identity of higher education*. Pretoria: Vista University and Skotaville.

Sekaren, U.& Bougie R. 2013, *Research methods for business, a skill-building approach*.6thedition.John Wiley & Sons.

Shelly, S, Nurss, J.R &Aithison, J.J.W. 1997, Uncertain outcomes. Pilot study for an investigation of the effects on teaching practice of the introduction of Outcomes-based education in adult basic education: two independent Examinations Board site case studies. www.adeanet.org/wgnfe/publications/aitchison2.html.

Sigh, B.R. 1994, *Improving gender and ethnic relations: strategies for schools and gender education*. London: Classes.

Saturday Star.2009, Thakali, T. *I do not know where else to go-system has failed my son: mom incredulous as case against six pupils is thrown out*, 15 August.

South African curriculum for the twenty-first century: Report of the review Committee on curriculum 20005, presented to the Minister of education, Pretoria, May 31st 2000.

South Africa, Department of Basic Education, 2001, General and further education and training quality assurance Act 58 of 2001.

South Africa, Department of Education. 1997. *South African race relations*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

South Africa, Department of Education.2000a, Revised national curriculum statement, Grades R-9 (school) overview, Pretoria: Department of education.

South Africa, Department of Education.2002b, Revised curriculum statement Grades R-9 (schools). Life orientation. Pretoria: Department of education.

South Africa, Department of Education.2000c, Criteria for a recognition and evaluation of qualifications for an employment in education based on the norms and standards for educators.

South Africa, Department of Education.2002a, Revised National Curriculum Statement Grade R-9 (schools) Policy, Arts and Culture. Pretoria: Government Printers

South Africa. Education Labour Relations Act 146 of 1993.Pretoria: Government printers.

South Africa. Education Statistics in South Africa, 2011, Department of Basic Education. Pretoria: Government Printers.

South Africa, 1955, Freedom Charter. 1955. Congress Alliance at Kliptown, 26 June.

South Africa, 1996, South African Schools Act 84 of 1996.

South Africa, 1953, Bantu Education Act 47 of 1953.

South African Union (SA.U). 1936, *Report of the Interdepartmental Committee on Native Education 1935–1936* The Welsh Commission. Pretoria: Government Printers.

South African Union (SA.U). 1951, *Report of the Commission on Native education* (The Eiselen Commission). Pretoria: Government Printers.

Spady, W &Schlebusch A. 1999, *Curriculum 2005: a guide for parents*. Cape Town: Renaissance.

Steyn, H.J, Steyn, S.C &De Waal, E.A.S. 2001, *The South African education system: core characteristics*. Pretoria: Kleurkopie.

Strydom, H. 1998, Ethical aspects of research in the caring professions. In *Research at grassroots: a primer for the caring professions*, edited by A.S.de Vos. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Swain, A. 2005, *Education as social action, knowledge, identity and power*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Taylor, N. 1993, *Inventing knowledge: contents in curriculum construction*. Cape Town: Maskew Miller Longman.

Terreblanche, S. 2002, *A History of Inequality in South Africa 1652-2002*. University of KwaZulu-Natal Press and KMM Review Publishing Company Pty Ltd.

Thomas, R.M 2003, *blending qualitative and quantitative research methods in theses and dissertations*, USA: Corwin

Trumpelmann, M.N. 1991, *The Joint Matriculation Board: seventy five years: achievement in perspective*. Goodwood, Cape Town: National book printers.

Tuckman, B.W. 1994, *Conducting educational research*. 4th edition. Texas: Harcourt Brace College Publishers.

Umalusi, 2010, *Directives for certification national senior certificate (Schools)*.

Van der Horst, H & McDonald, R. 1997, *Outcomes-based education: a teacher's manual*. Pretoria: Kagiso.

Van Niekerk, J. 2008, Save the OBE system in South African Schools urgently, *Beeld*, 17 April.

Van Niekerk, P & Ludman, B.1999, *A-Z of South African politics, the essential handbook*. South Africa: Penguin Group

Venter, I.S.J. 1985, *History of education*. Durban: Butterworth.

Venter, I.S.J & Van Heerden, S.M. 1989, *The grounding of history of education*. Durban: Butterworth.

Vos, A.J, Barnard, J.J & Brits, V.M. 1984, *Comparative and international education for student teachers*. 2nd edition. Durban: Butterworth.

Vundla, K. 1973,*The story of Phillip Vundla of South Africa*. Lansdowne, Cape Town: Citadel Press.

Weber, M, Roth, G &Wittich, C.1978, *Economy and society: an outline of interpretive sociology*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Yidigis, B.L & Weinbach, R.W. 1996, *Research methods for social workers*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.