MISSION IN AN AFRICAN CITY: DISCOVERING THE TOWNSHIP CHURCH AS AN ASSET TOWARDS LOCAL ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IN TSHWANE

by

LUKWIKILU MANGAYI

submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF THEOLOGY IN MISSIOLOGY WITH SPECIALISATION IN URBAN MINISTRY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: PROF A VAN SCHALKWYK

CO-SUPERVISOR: DR S F DE BEER

SEPTEMBER 2016
A picture of Pietermaritzburg Central Business District with the adjacent informal settlement on the hill, this photo was taken by Rev Sakkie Kloppers in 2008.
Student number: 3376-318-6

I declare herewith that MISSION IN AN AFRICAN CITY: DISCOVERING THE TOWNSHIP CHURCH AS AN ASSET TOWARDS LOCAL ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IN TSHWANE is my own work and that I have indicated all sources that I have used by means of full references.

I further declare that I have not previously submitted this work, or part of it, for examination at UNISA for another qualification, nor at any other higher education institution.

SIGNATURE:

(Rev Lukwikulu Credo Mangayi)

Date: 16 SEPTEMBER 2016
This multidisciplinary, applied study investigated whether the township church can be re-positioned or re-discovered as an asset, which could be used to form strong community structures in local communities and in turn be the foundation for community development and Local Economic Development (LED) for Tshwane (specifically Soshanguve and Hammanskraal (S&H)). The concept of oikos is of central importance in the understanding of the ecological dimension of mission in relation to LED and was used in this thesis defined as oikomissiology which has a Christological basis and broadens the scope of mission by re-interpreting missio Dei and various socio-theological themes in order to realise the vision of collective wellbeing or shalom. Oikomissiology provided a framework / worldview for analysis, description, reflection and planning for action which releases the world, economics, the church and conventional Christian theology / missiology from the traps of anthropocentrism. A narrative approach enabled the “uncovering” of the voices of grassroots communities, giving grassroots participants (i.e. local church ministry representatives) freedom to tell their stories and share their experiences as far as LED is concerned, such that major economic concepts were spoken of in these stories in laymen’s language. The narratives were supplemented by interviews with experienced practitioners and church leaders, which resulted in gaining richer perspectives on LED and on how township congregations that participated in this research are attempting to respond to current socioeconomic crises in Tshwane (S & H). A literature study and a study of the physical space were performed in dialogue with narratives and interview findings. The findings of this applied study established that the township church, in relation to other community organisations and structures, is an asset that could play a number of vital roles towards improving LED in Tshwane (S & H),

KEY TERMS:

African city; Asset-based approach; City of Tshwane; Hammanskraal; Local Economic Development; Missio Dei; Oikomissiology; Oikos; Soshanguve; Sustainability; Township church
# LIST OF MAPS, FIGURES AND TABLES

## MAPS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Map of the City of Tshwane</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Map of Tshwane area indicating population density</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Map of Region 1 of the City of Tshwane</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Map of Region 2 of the City of Tshwane</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Impulses and scope of church’s involvement in integral mission</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>The interconnectedness of the four foundational relationships</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Elements of a transformative oikos-based LED ministry praxis</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Realms to consider in designing a multi-layered socioeconomic and theological vision of a sustainable future in Tshwane (S &amp; H)</td>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Theological insights for an alternative, oikos- inspired LED in Tshwane (S &amp; H)</td>
<td>555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>A proposed ethical value-based oikomissiology framework / worldview for LED</td>
<td>558</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Interconnectedness exists between oikomissiology and other socio-theological concepts</td>
<td>567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Assets of the local church which should be mobilised for the purpose of LED</td>
<td>570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>Proposed components of LED as related to the oikos concept and the ecological wealth of the area necessary for building sustainable communities</td>
<td>572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>A model of an oikos – based urban homestead</td>
<td>581</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>Roles that the church could play to support and develop urban homesteads</td>
<td>584</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLES

5.1 Uniting Reformed Soshanguve parish’s praxis matrix 249
5.2 ELCSA Soshanguve parish’s praxis matrix 255
5.3 Lethabile Baptist Church’s praxis matrix 260
5.4 Hammanskraal Gospel Centre’s praxis matrix 265
5.5 Body of Christ’s praxis matrix 269
6.1 Focus group participants: Hammanskraal 298
6.2 Focus group participants: Soshanguve 300
7.1 Focus group participants: Joint group 340
11.1 Key initial processes to be undertaken towards the establishment of CALED (S & H) 603
### ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AA</td>
<td>Affirmative Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABCD</td>
<td>Asset Based Community Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIDS</td>
<td>Acquired Immuno-Deficiency Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARMSCOR</td>
<td>Armaments Corporation of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANU</td>
<td>African National Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASGISA</td>
<td>Accelerated Shared Growth Initiative of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT</td>
<td>Appropriate Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEE</td>
<td>Black Economy Empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BHN</td>
<td>Basic Human Needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMS</td>
<td>Berlin Mission Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMW</td>
<td>Bavarian Motor Works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRT</td>
<td>Bus Rapid Transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BU</td>
<td>Baptist Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BUSA</td>
<td>Baptist Union of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CALED</td>
<td>Christian Action for Local Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>City Business District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoT</td>
<td>City of Tshwane</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COHRE</td>
<td>Centre on Housing Rights and Eviction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COP 17</td>
<td>17th Conference of Parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COP 21</td>
<td>21st Conference of Parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COTN</td>
<td>Church of the Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSIR</td>
<td>Council for Scientific and Industrial Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSOs</td>
<td>Civil Society Organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Dutch Reformed Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRCA</td>
<td>Dutch Reformed Church in Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRMC</td>
<td>Dutch Reformed Mission Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELCSA</td>
<td>Evangelical Lutheran Church of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESD</td>
<td>Education for Sustainable Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBOs</td>
<td>Faith Based Organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>Foreign Direct Investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FNER</td>
<td>Far North-Eastern Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEAR</td>
<td>Growth, Employment and Redistribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEGDS</td>
<td>Gauteng Employment, Growth and Development Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GVA</td>
<td>Gross Value Added</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>Hammanskraal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HD</td>
<td>Human Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDR</td>
<td>Human Development Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDI</td>
<td>Human Development Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEL</td>
<td>Household Effective Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>Human Immuno-deficiency Virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPI</td>
<td>Human Poverty Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRD</td>
<td>Human Resource Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSL</td>
<td>Household Subsistence Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information and Communication Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Integrated Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPE</td>
<td>International Political Economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISCOR</td>
<td>Iron and Steel Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KFC</td>
<td>Kentucky Fried Chicken</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LED</td>
<td>Local Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSDF</td>
<td>Local Spatial Development Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAYCO</td>
<td>Mayoral Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLL</td>
<td>Minimum Living Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>National Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP</td>
<td>National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPO</td>
<td>Non-Profit Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAR</td>
<td>Participatory Action Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEN</td>
<td>Participate, Empower, Navigate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLA</td>
<td>Participatory Learning and Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRA</td>
<td>Participatory Rural Appraisal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDP</td>
<td>Reconstruction and Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSV</td>
<td>Revised Standard Version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>Soshanguve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SABC</td>
<td>South African Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SABMS</td>
<td>Southern African Baptist Mission Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACN</td>
<td>South African Cities Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACLA</td>
<td>South African Church Leaders' Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SARS</td>
<td>South African Revenue Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SL</td>
<td>Sustainable Livelihoods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLL</td>
<td>Supplementary Living Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMMEs</td>
<td>Small Micro Medium Enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNEP</td>
<td>United Nations Environment Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNFPA</td>
<td>United Nations Population Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN-HABITAT</td>
<td>United Nations Human Settlements Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNRISD</td>
<td>United Nations Research Institute for Social Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URCSA</td>
<td>Uniting Reformed Church of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCC</td>
<td>World Council of Churches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCED</td>
<td>World Commission on Environment and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWAM</td>
<td>Youth-with-a Mission</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEDICATION

To my father, Alfred Poyambi Mangayi and Mama Souzanne Kapambu, my wife Esperance and my children, Credo (Junior), Paraclete and Gracia and each generation they represent.

In memory of my mother, Justine Loba Bikwakwa and of George Gileshe Matjeke, a local Christian who participated in this research and who daily made the connections between small business and advancing the Kingdom of God.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Lord, you establish peace for me; all that I have accomplished you have done for me (cf. Isaiah 26: 12) - To God be the glory!

A special thank you to those who have daily lifted me to God in prayer and have continually given me words of encouragement. Your prayers and support were essential in taking this thesis from vision to reality.

I am especially appreciative of:

Prof. Annalet Van Schalkwyk (Supervisor) and Dr Stephan de Beer (co-Supervisor) for your openness, critical engagement and commitment to see me through this academic journey

The University of South Africa and the authorities of the College of Human Sciences for generously giving me the Academic Qualification Improvement Programme Grant to afford me time and funds to complete this study

Colleagues in the Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology, University of South Africa, for your invaluable input to my academic development

Colleagues at the Science Campus Library in Florida, for professional and logistical support

The Baptist family in South Africa (especially staff at Baptist House) and abroad (especially Fellowship of Evangelical Baptists in Canada, Victoria Central Baptist Church, General Baptist Association of Virginia, Second Baptist Church in Richmond and Mrs Joan Tate) for your encouragement, prayer, logistical and emotional support during the early days of this academic journey

The Research Participants for your willingness to participate in this research project and for your inputs

Prof. David Levey and team for your professional editing services of this thesis

Rev. Edson Magoloi, Rev. Ana Kudivila, Rev. George Ngamlana, Mr Emery Bwanganga, Mr Archie Dirorimwe, Mr Aaron Tshikotshi, Dr Zuze Banda and your families for prayer support

Members and friends of Pretoria Central Baptist Church, Letlhabile Baptist Church (Stinkwater), Deo Gratias Baptist fellowship (Winterveld), Deeds of Love Ministry, Baptist Fellowship of Churches in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal (known as SOSHAHAMA) and
Berea Baptist Mission Church for giving me opportunities for missionary service – my training ground

My extended family “Kiamvu-ki-nzadi kuna Malaba” and siblings for your love and care

My wife Esperance and my children, Credo (Junior), Paraclete and Gracia, thanks for allowing this author 7 years of “relative” peace for this research. I love you dearly.

Jesus Christ, who is my life.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLES</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. Preface and My Motivation for this Study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. Research Problem</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1. Population explosion</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 The global socio-economic gap</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3 The socio-economic gap in South Africa</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.4 The economic imbalances are the essence of the research problem</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.5. A particular perspective on the research problem-</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>economic imbalances as manifested in church life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. Main Research Question</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.1 Research questions</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4. Hypothesis</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5. Aims of the research</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6. Demarcation of the study</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7. Clarification of key terms of this study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.1 The church as organism and the church as organisation</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.2 The church as a crucial asset</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.3 Practical expression of the Christian church</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.4 The meaning of local economic development (LED)</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.5 Relation between LED and sustainable economic development</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.6 Townships within Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.7 Mission and LED</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.8 Public theology and LED</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8. Sources and methodological considerations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.1 Epistemology and methodology (theoretical field)</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.2 Pastoral praxis cycle as a framework for this thesis</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.3 Introducing practical research methods</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.3.1 Focus group interview</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.3.2 One-on-one interview</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.3.3 Studying social space</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.3.4 Literature</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.4 Stories as a means to communicate experiences</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.5 Ethical aspects of research in the social sciences and human service professions</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9. Structure and outline of the content</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. DEVELOPMENT: A REVIEW OF LITERATURE

| 2.1. Introduction | 53 |
| 2.2. Development | 53 |
| 2.2.1 Facets of Development and Poverty Eradication Approaches | 55 |
| 2.2.2 Philosophies and Approaches to Development | 61 |
| 2.2.2.1 Needs-based approaches | 62 |
| 2.2.2.2 Exclusion-based approaches | 70 |
| 2.2.2.3 Assets-based approach | 73 |
| 2.2.2.4 Human Development Approach | 74 |
| 2.2.3 Measuring Development and Poverty Eradication | 77 |
| 2.2.4 Topical Debates and Issues related to Development | |
| 2.2.4.1 Political economy of global development | 83 |
2.2.4.2 Post-development and its critique of development 90

2.2.4.3 Development can be fictional and utopian 93

2.2.4.4 The current development trend is unsustainable 94

2.2.5 Understanding LED in relation to development discourse: A synthesis 97

2.3 Conclusion of chapter 104

3. THE CHURCH, MISSION AND DEVELOPMENT

3.1 Introduction 105

3.2 Church and Development project

3.2.1 Common overall goal in society 105

3.2.2 The church has social and spiritual capitals 107

3.2.3 Biblical impulses and scope of the church's involvement in development 111

3.2.4 God's presence with the poor and in development 112

3.2.5 Incarnation and development 113

3.2.6 Public theology and development 114

3.2.7 Transformation and liberation in relation to development 115

3.2.8 Development may be linked to Christian social ethics 116

3.2.9 Church as an alternative community for development 120

3.3. Church's perspective on development

3.3.1 Relational deprivation as the main cause of lack of development 123

3.3.2 Towards a theology of development (particularly LED) 129

3.3.3 Economic paradigm based on oikos 151

3.4 Conclusion of chapter 165
### 4. A PERSPECTIVE ON THE CITY OF TSHWANE (SOSHANGUVE & HAMMANSKRAAL)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Physical space and Population</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Physical space</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Population</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Urbanisation and Development of the CoT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 A historical development perspective</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Tshwane: Urbanisation and city development</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3. Current state of affairs of the CoT</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.1 Soshanguve in the CoT</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2 Hammanskraal in the CoT</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Economy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1 A brief historical overview of the economy of Tshwane</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Current features of the local economy of Tshwane</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.1 Broader policy background</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.2 CoT and Smart City strategy</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.3 Key economic information</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Political and administrative powers and systems</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Conclusion of chapter</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 5. A PERSPECTIVE ON THE CHURCH IN SOSHANGUVE AND HAMMANSKRAAL IN RELATION TO LED

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 A general historical background of the church in South Africa</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.3 The church in Tshwane: Nature, identity and characteristics 238
5.4 Faith and culture in relation to churches in Tshwane (S & H) 241
5.5 Participant church leaders' insights on their churches' praxes
  5.5.1 Uniting Reformed Church in South Africa - Soshanguve parish 246
  5.5.2 Evangelical Lutheran Church - Soshanguve parish 252
  5.5.3 Bethel Revival Church - Soshanguve 258
  5.5.4 Letlhabile Baptist Church - Refentse / Hammanskraal 258
  5.5.5 Hammanskraal Gospel Centre - Kanana / Hammanskraal 263
  5.5.6 The Body of Christ Ministry - Lepengville / Hammanskraal 268
5.6 Synthesis of the church leaders' views / interpretations on praxis matrixes of their churches 271
5.7 Participant church leaders' insights on their churches' mission orientations 276
5.8 Strengths, weaknesses and blindspots of the churches' mission orientations
  5.8.1 Strengths 280
  5.8.2 Weaknesses 281
  5.8.3 Blindspots 284
5.9 Contemporary relevance and ministry
  5.9.1 God's preferential option for the poor 288
  5.9.2 God acts in history to pull down the mighty and the rich 288
  5.9.3 Economic justice 288
  5.9.4 Biblical understanding of wealth 289
5.10 Resources and potential for community building 289
5.11 Conclusion of chapter 290
6. NARRATIVE ACCOUNTS OF LED IN THE CoT FROM SEPARATE FOCUS GROUPS

6.1 Introduction

6.1.1 Development of instrument and data collection 292

6.1.2 Data display / Presentation 295

6.2 Mini-consultation one

6.2.1 First session 296

6.2.2. Second session 314

6.3 Conclusion of chapter 337

7. NARRATIVE ACCOUNTS OF THE JOINT GROUPS ON LED IN THE CoT (S & H)

7.1 Second mini-consultation

7.1.1 First session 338

7.1.2 Second session 357

7.2 Third mini-consultation

7.2.1 First session 368

7.2.2 Second session 391

7.3 Concluding reflective feedback 407

7.4 Conclusion of chapter 411

8. INTERVIEW FINDINGS FROM SELECTED EXPERIENCED PRACTITIONERS AND LEADERS

8.1 Introduction

8.1.1 Development of instrument and data collection 413

8.1.2 Data display / Presentation 414

8.2 Interview findings per subthemes

8.2.1 What do you notice about our situation in Tshwane today? 415
8.2.2 How do you understand LED? 419
8.2.3 Which economic policies have impacted and are impacting on Tshwane's economy? 423
8.2.4 What are the successes, the failures, the benefits and disadvantages of these policies? Why? 426
8.2.5 What changes are necessary in terms of these policies and their implementation to benefit LED? 430
8.2.6 What changes have occurred in the economy in the past fifteen years? 433
8.2.7 What is the influence of money and capital in our situation in Tshwane? 438
8.2.8 Who makes the most important decisions in Tshwane? Why? Who benefit from it? 440
8.2.9 What are the most important relationships of influence and power that people have? 443
8.2.10 What are the most important traditions of the people and their contribution to LED? 446
8.2.11 What do people want most in life in Tshwane? Why? 449
8.2.12 What will things be like in ten years if the economy keeps going in the same way? Why? 451
8.2.13 What are the most important causes of the way the broader and local economy is today? Why? 453
8.2.14 How would you summarise, should LED be taken forward to benefit especially the poor? 457

8.3 Conclusion of chapter 461

9. DISCUSSION AND SUMMARY IN RELATION TO SIX CATEGORIES FOR ANALYSIS USED IN MINI-CONSULTATIONS AND INTERVIEWS

9.1 Introduction 466
9.2 Discussion, evaluation and conclusions

9.2.1 How did the economy of Tshwane come to this point? 466

9.2.2 Socioeconomic and political structures which have led to this situation 481

9.2.3 Most important relationships of influence and power that people have in Tshwane 486

9.2.4 Cultural resources of the people which are useful for LED 488

9.2.5 Important desires / wishes that people have in Tshwane 490

9.2.6 Sources of creativity and hope for the future 492

9.3 Elements of church's praxis towards LED 497

9.4 Summary and preliminary understanding of the oikos and oikos missiology praxis

9.4.1 Economic imbalances as manifested in the townships of S & H 502

9.4.2 Economic imbalances as manifested in the township church of S & H 503

9.4.3 Means of economic survival 504

9.4.4 Social development, LED, oikos and oiko-missiology in the CoT (S & H) 504

9.5 Conclusion of this chapter 510

10. OIKOMISSIOLOGY: REFLECTION AND CONCEPTUAL CONTRIBUTION FOR THE CHURCHES' CONTRIBUTION TO ALTERNATIVE LED IN TSHWANE (S & H)

10.1 Introduction

10.1.1 Unjust relationship between market economics and ecology result in poverty 512

10.1.2. Christological basis for Oikomissiology 514

10.2 Towards oikomissiology, a “new” Church, and LED in Tshwane (S & H)
10.2.1 Getting started: Constructing oikomissiology

10.2.2 Shalom for the whole community as the aim of oikomissiology

10.2.3 Church’s assets for oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.2.4 Biblical impulses and the scope of the church’s involvement in oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.2.5 God’s presence with the poor, oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.2.6 Incarnation, oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.2.7 Transformation and liberation in relation to oikomissiology and sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.2.8 Oikomissiology, LED and Christian social ethics in Tshwane (S & H)

10.2.9 Church as an alternative community, oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.3 Towards a new church’s perspective on development in Tshwane (S & H)

10.3.1 Oikomissiology, relational restoration and LED

10.3.2 Oikomissiology, participation in the planetary agenda and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.3.3 Role/s of ministers and lay leaders in the ecological and LED agenda of the churches in Tshwane (S & H)

10.3.4 Oikomissiology, sustainability and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.4 Towards a new economic paradigm based on oikomissiology in Tshwane (S & H)
10.4.1 Oikos values as guiding principles and goals for building Tshwane economy 542

10.4.2 Current signs of God’s economy and oikomissiology 543

10.4.3 Signs of hope and grace which open up the situation for an oikos economy in Tshwane (S & H) 544

10.4.4 Realities which hinder the realisation of oikos’ economic values and goals in Tshwane (S & H) 547

10.5. Oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.5.1 Ecological crisis and mission in Tshwane (S & H) in relation to salvation and LED 549

10.5.2 Repenting from sin in relation to LED and oikos 552

10.5.3 Building an oikomissiology framework for LED so as to counteract the realities of death in Tshwane (S&H) 554

10.5.4 Spirituality, oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H) 560

10.5.5 Public theology, LED and oikomissiology in Tshwane (S & H) 561

10.5.6 Theological education and oikomissiology 564

10.6 Conclusion of chapter 566

11. MISSION IN AN AFRICAN CITY: OIKOMISSIOLOGY’S INSIGHTS FOR REBUILDING LED IN TSHWANE (S & H) THROUGH AN INCARNATIONAL PRESENCE

11.1 Introduction 568

11.2. Elements of a transformed missional model and Praxis focussed on LED in Tshwane (S & H)

11.2.1. A new commitment to the city with a mission agenda focussed on oikos-based LED 573

11.2.2. Establishing a value-based incarnational presence 575

11.2.3. Nurturing (keep and cultivate) community through incarnational presence 586
11.2.4. Fostering a concrete spirituality of economic transformation, liberation and justice 587

11.2.5. Discovering and practising an oikomissiology 589

11.2.6. Proclaiming and sustaining life and shalom as central to oikomissiology focussed on LED in Tshwane (S & H) 589

11.2.7. A holistic church initiative for oikomissiology focussed on LED in Tshwane (S & H). 591

11.3 The action plan: A concept document for the proposed programme

11.3.1 Name of the programme: CALED (S & H) 594

11.3.2 Description of and rationale for the programme 594

11.3.3 Theological impulses, values and ethos for this initiative 595

11.3.4 Project structure and management 599

11.3.5 Beneficiaries / owners of CALED (S & H) 600

1.3.6 Methodology 601

11.3.7 Partners 602

11.3.8 Phased Project Plan 603

11.4 Conclusion of the chapter 605

12. CONCLUSION OF THE STUDY: SUMMARY

12. 1. The pastoral praxis cycle: A reflection 607

12.2. The mini-consultations (focus group discussions) and interviews:

A reflection 609

12.3. The oikos concept as the hermeneutic key: A reflection 609

12.4. Missiological and theoretical implications 610

12. 5 Praxis and policy implications 613
12.6. Key empirical findings 614

BIBLIOGRAPHY 620

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

Appendix A.1 (Focus group participants of Hammanskraal group) 653
Appendix A.2 (Focus group participants of Soshanguve group) 654
Appendix A.3 (Focus group participants of the joint group) 655

APPENDIX B (Profile of interviewees: experienced practitioners) 657
APPENDIX C (Profile of interviewees: Church leaders) 659
APPENDIX D (Sample of correspondence with participants and interviewees) 660
APPENDIX E (Informed consent form) 662
APPENDIX F (Ethical clearance letter) 663
Chapter One

INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY AND METHODOLOGY

1.1. Preface and My Motivation for this Study

When I approached Chris Rogerson¹ about resources and hints which could be useful to my research topic, he answered: “Interesting topic… sorry I am unaware of any work on such a topic”. His answer confirmed to me that a literature study alone would not give me the hints and inputs needed for this research, but would have to be supplemented by the personal narratives of people living in the townships. In this study, I have journeyed with the literature as well as the narratives, in an attempt to answer my research questions.

This study has an interesting history. My interest in the subject of local economic development (hereafter, LED) was aroused in the 1980s during my studies in rural development and subsequent involvement in community development teaching in the Democratic Republic of Congo². Having switched to theology and mission, my interest in LED was rekindled in 1992 when I became a pastor/community development officer in a struggling and poverty-stricken township in South Africa.

This motivation for studying mission in an African city, with particular emphasis on discovering the township church as an asset towards LED in Tshwane, intensified when I became the national leader for Deeds of Love Ministries of the Baptist Union of South Africa. In this position, I was confronted with poverty in the peri-urban church and encountered the dependency

² I earned a Bachelor of Science in Rural Development at the Higher Institute for Rural Development at Mbeo/Idiofa, Province of Bandundu in the Democratic Republic of Congo in 1987, a higher Diploma for Educators of Adults at Wits University, Johannesburg in South Africa in 1995, a Diploma in Theology at Nehemiah Bible Institute and Vista University, Pretoria in South Africa in 2000 and a Masters of Theology (with specialisation in urban ministry) at the University of South Africa in 2003. I have been involved in development work in various capacities including senior executive roles and a mentor for over 25 years in Central and Southern African regions. I have also been involved in teaching (i.e. community development education, adult education and theology / missiology education) for over 20 years in the Central and Southern African regions.
mentality and inability of communities to achieve economic development. I also struggled to find connections between my church community’s theology and LED.

As the leader of Deeds of Love Ministries, I engaged several church leaders on the alleviation and eradication of poverty and the transformation of the church to become a real “beacon of hope” in society. My focus on urban ministry, community development and the church's role in the transformation of society became widened through my participation in a number of national consultations on urban ministry where leaders like Dr Stephan de Beer and urban missiologists such as Ray Bakke of the Urban Associate Network gave their input. I also participated in South African Church Leaders’ Assembly (SACLA II) focusing on Christian leaders in civil society, social development as well as medicine and health.

I then wrote my Masters in Theology (with specialisation in Urban Ministry) dissertation, reflecting on the community development praxis of two local churches in the peri-urban areas of Tshwane (Pretoria). The abbreviated content of this dissertation was taught to grassroots development practitioners and managers within the Baptist Union circle and through the Desmond Tutu Centre for Lifelong Learning to leaders of the Baptist denominations from the Southern African Development Community.

Different encounters with various Baptist groups and other churches have made me realise that there is a need for the peri-urban (township) church to intentionally embrace economic development for the growth and sustainability that it holds for the community around it.

I am not an economist, but a missionary, a professional development worker, an adult educator and an urban missiologist. I would not exchange roles with the main line economist because I do not want to narrow my perspectives to purely economic grounds. I have chosen to embark on a more holistic approach and bring together economic and theological / missiological insights. I anticipate that this will entail a rethinking of some of the most cherished theological beliefs in Baptist circles and the wider church.
1. 2. Research Problem

By looking at the cities of our world, we become aware of the challenges facing the church today (cf. Hildreth 2014: 7). Conn and Ortiz (2010: 17, see also 2001:17) ask “But what are these challenges, and how is the church responding?” In examining the research problem, the following challenges are investigated:

- Population explosion
- The global socio-economic gap
- The socio-economic gap in South Africa
- The economic imbalances are the essence of the research problem
- A particular perspective on the research problem - economic imbalances as manifested in church life

1.2.1. Population explosion

The city is becoming more of everything: more people, more buildings and expanding neighbourhoods (Keith 2013: 2). The predictions of Rashmi Mayur (1985 cited in Conn & Ortiz, 2010:17, 2001:28), then president of the Global Future Network, are being realised, [that] ninety percent of the earth’s population will most likely be urbanised by the end of the twenty-first century and that the majority of this urbanisation will take place in “super cities” in Third World countries.

The recent State of the World Population report confirms that:

Both men and women migrate to cities in search of a better life, in terms of economic opportunities and access to services. Several gender-specific factors may push women to migrate to cities, ranging from forced eviction, to increased domestic violence, harmful practices such as child marriage, or health problems associated with HIV and AIDS (UNFPA 2015: 32).

While these large city populations are growing at a rate of three to four times more rapidly than the economic growth of such countries, the church seems to show little interest in these expanding urban centres.
Most of the world’s population now lives in urban centres (Tacoli 2012). Urban population growth has become increasingly concentrated in developing countries, where 1.2 million people are migrating to cities every week (UN-HABITAT 2013: 9). Sub-Saharan Africa and Asia are experiencing unprecedented levels of urbanization but are also the least developed regions and are most unprepared and ill-equipped to manage the influx. Rapid urbanization, inadequate planning and scarce land have forced poor and vulnerable populations to live in slums or informal settlements in areas with greater vulnerabilities to disasters. (UNFPA 2015: 31-32)

Urban growth in Africa is phenomenal, and it is the continent with the most rapid increase in urbanisation. According to Mandryk (2010: 40) “African’s urban population has rapidly risen from 130 million in 1990 up to 390 million in 2010”. Now, most African countries have experienced a massive exodus from rural to urban centres. Many of the Africans (especially women) who have left their rural area are now living in informal settlements, in abject poverty. According to Johnstone and Mandryk (2001) for example, 90% of the population of Addis Ababa and Yaoundé live in such settlements, 77% of the population of Mogadishu, 70% of the population of Nairobi and 61% of the population of Accra all live in these settlements. For this reason Ray Bakke (1987:35) (at that time) termed the “20th century as the century of homeless man [sic]”.

Sadly, most local churches have failed to recognise fully the tremendous needs of the multitudes that have left their homes in the rural areas and migrated to the cities. This indifference is evident in the inadequacy of the church as regards putting forward a consistent and a comprehensive vision for the urban world (cf. Keller 2012: 17, Smith 2011). Commenting on mission endeavour in Africa a Catholic observer remarks, “about 80% of missionary personnel in Africa are engaged in rural parish work, while there are very few actually involved in ministering to slum dwellers of the towns and cities” (Zanotelli 1988 in Conn & Ortiz 2010: 18, 2001: 18).

1.2.2 The global socio-economic gap

The global city is becoming identified with the poor (Satterthwaite 2014: 54). Practices of housing discrimination, for instance, have locked blacks and Hispanics into isolated urban neighbourhoods in the United States. Most of the First Nation’s neighbourhoods in Canada are
isolated, in a state of neglect and decay. In the meantime, factories spring up in industrial parks in the suburbs far from these urban communities. Conn and Ortiz (2010: 18, cf. 2001:18) observe that economically marginalised communities are finding more doors of occupational opportunity closed to them. They further explain that at the heart of the problem lies a decline in the number of manual jobs and the concentration of manual workers in the urban poor areas. The economic, political and social distance between the few rich and the masses of the poor is greatest in towns and cities of the Third World.

Third World economies, including those of African countries, were brought into the global competitive process at a low level of development, putting them at an obvious disadvantage when competing globally (The Oikos Journey 2006: 13).

1.2.3 The socio-economic gap in South Africa

South Africa's economy as analysed in The Oikos Journey: a theological reflection on the economic crisis in South Africa (Diakonia Council of Churches 2006: 16-19) and in the report, African Economic Outlook published by the African Development Bank (2007:487 and 2015)i, can be usefully described within the context of the inequalities of the global economy as this relates to similar realities in the region.

The following points sufficiently describe the socio-economic gap in South Africa:

- The majority of South Africans are affected by poverty in various ways, or they (particularly women, children, youth and old people) are confronted with ongoing vulnerability to becoming poor (Statistics South Africa 2014).
- There were high hopes when the newly-elected democratic government came into office in 1994. The assumption was that, despite the massively disadvantaged situation it had inherited, it would be able to put into place the pro-poor policies developed and advocated by its own economists and sociologists. These policies were designed to

---

ensure that first priority was given to redressing the grossly unequal economic order. The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) and Affirmative Action are two examples of such government policies and strategies, set in motion in 1994. However, the world imperative for a market economy prevailed. Within two years, economic policies were modified to fit in with the requirements of global capital (*The Oikos Journey* 2006: 17). The Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR) policy became the principal instrument for realising the RDP goals and affirmative action, as stated by the then Minister of Finance, Trevor Manual, in his 1998 budget speech to parliament. GEAR resulted in economic growth but failed to ensure redistribution of the wealth to the majority of the population.

- According to South Africa Survey 2004/2005, almost half the households in South Africa fall into the official government definition of being indigent: no regular income, no food, clothing, energy sources, resulting in them effectively being excluded from social participation (Kane-Berman 2006: 208). In 2012, the proportion of people living in relative poverty was 35.9% (van Heerden 2016: 293).
- Poverty affects more women than men in South Africa. Women are less likely to be able to find employment for decent wages. More women do unpaid jobs, the majority of them remaining on the margins of society economically.
- Many who once held full time employment with its benefits such as pension and medical aid schemes have had their job status converted to that of casual, temporary or part-time workers, with the associated loss of these benefits (Kane-Berman 2008: 250).

The City of Tshwane, together with other major cities, such as EThekwini, Mogale and Ekurhuleni, all aligned themselves with GEAR in relation to the RDP implications.

In response to these challenges highlighted in the previous section, the City of Tshwane in particular, formulated a development strategy in 2005, which would enable it to address the economic and other imbalances between different population groups and sectors of society. Based on Tshwane’s Integrated Development Plans (IDP) (2006 & 2011) the city put forward five-year strategic programmes which placed special focus on:

- Providing access to quality basic services and infrastructure throughout the city
- Promoting accelerated and shared economic growth and development
- Fighting poverty and building clean, healthy, safe and sustainable communities
• Promoting participatory democracy and applying the *Batho Pele* (meaning people first in SeTswana) principles through caring, accessible and accountable service
• Ensuring good governance, financial viability and optimal institutional transformation, and giving the institution capacity to execute its mandate.

The question arising is whether this strategy sufficiently influences the lives of the poor in Tshwane.

Due to the Apartheid system, South Africa’s urban areas are still extremely dysfunctional and do not yet serve the needs of the majority of the population. Women and girls in particular are disproportionately affected by poverty and gender-based inequality and injustice (UNFPA 2015: 32). Urban development strategies are confronted with a large and growing urban population, persistence of inequality and poverty, financial pressures on municipalities, lack of a vibrant and dynamic civil society and economic and financial potential for urban revitalisation.

### 1.2.4 The economic imbalances are the essence of the research problem

The dominant economic paradigm perceives the economic problem as regards scarcity and the necessity to make choices in terms of what is called “opportunity cost” (Nürnberger 1999: 278). As a result, this paradigm has a narrow and distorted concept of what the economic enterprise should try to achieve. The capitalist system is driven by the motive of amassing capital as a means of accruing wealth, which is motivated by the craving for prestige and power (Nürnberger 1999:278) at the cost of the majority of a country’s population. The consequence of the economic enterprise is therefore a concentration at all costs on economic growth. Paradoxically, the industry in the centre of the economy must grow so that the whole economy can grow because growth in the periphery depends on the capital provided by the centre.

---


5 The centre–periphery (or core–periphery) model is a spatial metaphor which describes and attempts to explain the structural relationship between the advanced or metropolitan ‘centre’ and a less developed ‘periphery’, either within a particular country, or (more commonly) as applied to the relationship between
Growth at all costs, as we are currently experiencing in South Africa, does not necessarily represent an increase in wellbeing and poverty alleviation for the majority of the population. Repercussions of the centre-periphery imbalance are obvious in a deterioration of living and economic conditions in the periphery, as stated by Blakely (1994: 27-28) and later by Nürnberger (1999:282):

- The peripheral population has immeasurable unfulfilled needs but it lacks the purchasing power to buy greater quantities of centre products.
- The meagre income of the periphery is spent on centre products, and as a result, peripheral producers lose their markets.
- Both the increase in needs and the decrease of productive potential increase the poverty gap of the periphery.
- The periphery is bound to sell its raw factors of production e.g. labour, to the centre to obtain an income.
- Technological advances make the centre less and less dependent on the factors of production offered by the periphery which in turn leads to growth of unemployment.

1.2.5. A particular perspective on the research problem: economic imbalances as manifested in church life

When one looks at churches in the periphery, the effects of these economic imbalances are noticeable. These imbalances are present in different ways:

- I have observed that many churches planted in struggling urban areas do not attain financial sustainability: they have no money to support their growth, neither do they substantially participate in building a community economy.
- I have also noticed that with the exception of a few, most of these churches’ members are poor and unemployed; thus their numerical growth does not translate into financial viability and they ultimately become dependent on outside assistance for their survival.
- Church planting missions have always emphasised the Three Selves Formula (Stott 1975: 45) as a framework for establishing indigenous communities of believers. This formula suggests that foreign agents of mission should aim at facilitating the
establishment of indigenous churches. We see these churches being certainly planted but most of them do not survive to become relevant and effective in their witness to the world. These churches can achieve self-governing status and some degree of self-propagation, but are hardly self-sustaining.

- According to Johnstone & Mandryk (2001: 176) church growth demographers have extrapolated that the church expansion would triple over the next ten years with 3.1 million new churches being started. This growth is now reality in city megaregions such as Rio de Janeiro – Sao Paulo which present new challenges with massive urban sprawl, vast inequalities and vast hunger for resources (cf. Mandryk 2010: 14). If we bear in mind the fact that rural South Africans are migrating to the city at a growing rate it is most likely that these churches are ‘planted’ in peripheral urban areas. These churches do require economic engines to sustain them.

1.3. Main Research Question

Firstly I needed to understand what is taking place in the economic arena of Tshwane; secondly, I attempted to analyse the impact this has on ordinary township people and on the church. This research project’s central question was thus: “What role/s could the township church play towards LED in Tshwane, in particular, in Soshanguve (S) and Hammanskraal (H)?

In other words, the question focused on what role/s could the church (which for the purposes of this study is defined as including specific ministries and faith-based organisations) play, in relation to other community organisations and structures concerning LED, which might lead to correcting different ills that affect struggling peripheral urban communities of Tshwane, especially S and H?

I envisioned the church to be a catalyst for LED by its presence and involvement in local communities. The church, committed to her mission, operating within her boundaries, is or should be, an important stakeholder and facilitator in the process of LED.

This central question, by implication, reflected on two essentials of the church’s presence in Tshwane (S & H): its “situatedness” within communities and its ethos of service. This, hopefully, could contribute to the development of contextual urban ministry praxis relevant to the area of Tshwane (S & H). These essentials can be traced back to Jeremiah’s call to “seek the peace of the city” (Jer. 29: 5-6). According to Villafane (1995:2), Jeremiah calls for “critical engagement”
or, to say it in another way, for presence. The church, including specific ministries and faith-based organisations, gathers to worship and to equip itself to impact on the polis (the city and/or its citizens/ community). It does not live for itself, but for the Kingdom of God (cf. Keller 2012). The church cannot be indifferent to the human needs in the city, be they physical, political, economic, or spiritual. It does not hide from nor does it integrate falsely in society. It does not hide its light (cf. Mat. 5:15).

1.3.1 Research questions:

- What economic forces marginalise Tshwane townships (S & H)?
- How do these forces manifest themselves in church life?
- Which approaches towards LED would be the most appropriate?
- What could be done to use the environment in a sustainable manner while local economic development is realised?
- How should economic agents relate to the environment, “natural resources” and to human communities to create a sustainable economy and future?
- What does a sustainable economy entail?
- How can a peripheral urban church engage in LED?
- Why should she engage in LED?
- What should she do to be involved in LED?
- Who should take the lead within the local churches in terms of participation in LED?
- What assets do a local church have, which may be used in LED?
- How can/ should local churches interact with other economic agents who may be geared towards LED?
- How would one motivate that the church’s involvement in local economic development is part of its missionary mandate?
- Which missiological and ecclesiological insights could be used as a framework for the church’s involvement in LED?
- How could a research project of this nature contribute to the widening and deepening of our understanding of mission and Missiology?
1. 4. Hypothesis

Struggling and peripheral urban areas are the most affected by poverty (Keith 2013:4). Our experience in South Africa has demonstrated that political freedom, in many respects, does not translate into economic equality and opportunity for the majority of the population, who mostly live in these areas.

Yet, within these peri-urban areas, the church is one of the institutions that has the strongest presence, is accepted and attracts local support. My hypothesis is that the church can be re-positioned or re-discovered as an asset which could be used to form strong community structures in local communities, which could again be used as a basis for community development and LED.

However, I share contentions similar to that of Oduyoye concerning the church in Africa. She states, “The African Church, if it is to respond to the questions of life and living, must engage theologically in ministries that are balanced, communal, realistic and biblically based enough to provide Christian responses to practical issues” (Oduyoye 2005 in Peters & Snulligan 2006:19).

South Africa will continue to witness many changes in the future “as the enforced rural poverty among Africans in the apartheid era transformed into continued poverty in shantytowns, squatter camps, slums and townships where conditions range range from poor to terrible. Over 60% [in 2010] of South Africans are urban dwellers, a figure set to rise by 2020 to as high as 75%" (Mandryk 2010: 761). A clear and positive vision of a desired future for South African cities and towns is essential to ensure that they sustain and improve their role, as cities of economic and social development and opportunity, in a sustainable manner.

This research intends to study or discover ways for the church in particular to be an asset to the community at large and to actively participate and contribute towards the realisation of this vision at the grass roots. The church, in terms of all its gifts and skills, has the potential to take the lead for the realisation of such a vision (see Keller 2012: 20 - 21).

One obvious reason for the church to assume this crucial role is because "it is there". Most other institutions have failed and some even have disappeared from city including township life. As Campolo (2000:57) points out, business and industry have followed the flight of the middle class to the greener grass of suburbia (….). While everybody and everything seems to have
moved to the suburbs (….) there are still a lot of churches left in the struggling parts of the city such as city centres and townships.

It is questionable whether the African church is thus far sufficiently meeting the challenge articulated by Oduoye. Nevertheless, the church does have the potential to make a strong contribution towards the realisation of a positive vision of balanced and sustainable economic growth and community wellbeing in South African cities, especially in Tshwane (S & H) (cf.Keller 2012).

1.5. Aims of the research

In response to the explosive growth of cities, there are indications that churches are beginning to find ways to become involved in urban mission and community development. From a global perspective of church’s urban ministry and outreaches Mandryk (2010: 7, 17) states; that over the past twenty years there has been an encouraging new emphasis on holistic urban ministries. Academics and practitioners in urban mission such as Roger Greenway, Harvie Conn, Ray Bakke, Ed Silvoso and many others have raised the profile of urban church planting and given both hope and workable models for ministry, which affect the multi-layered complexities of our cities.

According to Johnstone and Mandryk (2001:178-180) some of the salient aspects of strategy for urban ministry that had emerged at the time when Johnstone and Mandrik were writing include:

- Corporate prayer for the city with emphasis on reconciliation and unity for reaching the cities (promoted by Ed Silvoso)
- Doing city-wide research which highlights un-reached sections and areas for their evangelisation
- Initiating city-wide outreaches that bring together congregations and agencies across the denominational spectrum
- Linking up leaders of churches from every stratum of society, from rich to poor, for meaningful relationships, which will create conditions conducive to economic “upliftment” and the transference of skills for self-help among the poor
- Reaching ethnic minorities in the cities
• Forming incarnational mission teams to work together in needy areas with a specific vision to plant self-governing indigenous churches compatible with their surroundings
• Cooperating to change sinful structures of their society that degrade, impoverish and exploit the poor.

In many regards, what Johnstone and Mandryk highlighted then has been happening in major cities around the world. Love Pretoria East, a network of churches working towards spiritual and social transformation of the city of Tshwane, is one such example in our context here in South Africa. Nevertheless, to my knowledge, there is not a contextual theological articulation, which can inspire ministerial praxis specifically geared towards LED in the peripheral urban areas of South Africa.

It is for the above reasons that I aimed to:

• Contribute to a process of discerning the will of God for the church in struggling, peripheral urban areas where most of the members are poor and unemployed
• Challenge theological understandings of church teachings and religious practices that keep township churches from becoming real beacons of hope for their communities
• Envision a viable, biblical, relevant and contemporary urban ecclesiology committed towards church participation in LED
• Engage in a field of study – economic development – which is overlooked by the churches because of lack of expertise
• Extend a call to the Tshwane (S & H) church to redefine and re-appropriate, from Scripture and from the rich heritage of the church, a social spirituality which is consistent with the following of Jesus and which promotes the church's community participation
• Demonstrate that economic development should be part of the agenda for the urban church of Africa in ways that "provide a platform for the voices of those whose backs are bent in relations to the current socio-economic and political crisis facing the continent" (Oduyoye 2005 in Peters & Snulligan 2006:18).
• The growth of the church has now moved to the Southern hemisphere, that is, statistics are showing that Christianity is flourishing in the Global South. This necessitates, I believe, a development of a missiology that takes seriously the issues of countries in this hemisphere, especially in terms of North-South economic disparities and appropriate economic development models for the South

• Help remind the church of its personal and social ethical responsibilities. In the personal
realm, these include resistance to the sins of the flesh (Galatians 5). In the social realm,
this includes opposition to conflict and violence, poverty, corporate greed, corruption,
injustice, lack of concern for the poor, racism and human rights. (Amos 5).
• This is primarily an applied study, which should lead towards the development of an
urban mission strategy, which may facilitate economic development processes.

1.6. Demarcation of the study

This is as follows:

• Geographical focus: church groups in the peripheral areas of the Greater Tshwane
Metropolitan area, specifically Hammanskraal and Soshanguve
• Theoretical grounding: this study is a missiological study with a strong emphasis on
urban ecclesiological praxis and social ministry praxis
• This is an interdisciplinary study, which brings together missiology, ecclesiology,
development studies, economics and urban studies.

1.7. Clarification of key terms of this study:

1.7.1. The church as organism and the church as organisation

Pieterse (1993: 158) made the important distinction between the church as organism and the
church as organisation, in order to maintain both the theological and empirical dimensions of the
church. In this research, I reflected upon both these elements as they relate to LED.

Pieterse (1993:158) further distinguished between the pastoral and social functions of the
church. The pastoral functions ensure that the church lives up to its identity and vision as the
body of Christ, i.e. as an organism. The social functions are intended to ensure that the church
as a human institution can exist meaningfully in this world, i.e. as an organisation. The social
functions are important to facilitate the necessary impact of the pastoral functions. These two
sets of functions are integrally related to each other.
With regard to mission, Hoke\(^7\) (1974 in Grigg 1984: 100) had expressed a similar view, writing that the church of Christ endeavours internally to carry out pastoral care, Christian education, worship and stewardship; while its ultimate outward purpose is to be on a mission, with God, to the world.

In keeping with her different functions, the church in her journey of mission with God uses different modes of ministry aiming at a comprehensive or holistic approach (Steward 1994; Bosch 1991).

Christian mission is a comprehensive ministry of various dimensions, which can be distinguished, but never separated. Kritzinger et al believe, therefore, that the goal of mission can only be accomplished through a holistic approach (Kritzinger et al 1994: 36, see also Keller 2012: 291). Kritzinger et al (1994:36-39) further clarified that the various dimensions of this comprehensive approach were expressed in terms of the church’s task of *kerygma* (proclamation), *diakonia* (ministry of service) and *koinonia* including *leitourgias* (communion or fellowship) (cf. Keller 2012:291).

In the kerygmatic dimension, the church fulfils the ministry of the word in mission through preaching, witnessing, providing literature, theological education, etcetera. The diaconal dimension refers to the various forms of ministry and service in which the Christian community, in imitation of Jesus of Nazareth (who was among us as one who serves), puts itself at the service of the whole world (Kritzinger et al 1994: 36-39). The fellowship dimension ensures that the missionary church becomes church-with-others (Bosch 1991: 368-389) in incarnating *koinonia* in the body of Christ. Finally, the liturgical service is the expression of the Christian desire to praise and worship God for who He is (Kritzinger et al 1994: 38)

1.7.2 The church as a crucial asset

According to Nürnberger (1999:371), the church has important assets not easily attained by secular organisations in peripheral areas, such as:

- Spiritual and moral foundations which can be mobilised to generate vision, motivation and responsibility

---

\(^7\) Dr Don Hoke was a journalist, missionary, educator, pastor, and Evangelical leader. In 1974, he was the director of the International Congress on World Evangelization (also known as the Lausanne Congress).
• Access to the most deprived grass roots communities
• A traditional focus on the family as the most basic unit of society
• Members in all kinds of secular professions and primary groups with all kinds of spheres of influence spread throughout the fabric of society
• A potential network of cross-cultural relationships which can be activated relatively easily
• An international network of communications.

The word "church" in this research implies a resourceful body of believers, which include faith-based and ecumenical church organisations. "Township church" means a local church located in an area known as a township in South Africa. Most townships are located within the periphery of cities and towns.

1.7. 3 Practical expression of the Christian church

Humanity has been given an inborn moral faculty. While on the one hand, this supplies the standards for right and wrong, on the other hand, it struggles with humanity's sinful nature – both on a personal and a socio-economic level. In the midst of this complexity, the church of Christ is supposed to be a catalyst, which connects a person's individual need and God's resources. For example, when a person is spiritually struggling to live in harmony with God and creation, the church should therefore facilitate the person's connection with God's resources of fellowship and of spiritual and eternal life (Ephesians 2: 1-10).

In the social realm, humanity is alienated from itself and its Creator and therefore suffers injustice, oppression and domination. The church in Christ should facilitate the Christian community as well as the wider community's connection with God's resources of community, justice, brotherhood, and mutual submission (Ephesians 2: 11-22).

In the economic realm, humanity may be poverty-stricken and exploited, or plagued by materialism and selfishness. The church in Christ should facilitate humanity's connection with God's resources of food, employment, land and of the equal distribution and management of resources (Acts 2: 42-47, Psalms 37: 25-26). The Scriptural view of the church is kingdom-based. It is therefore, not internally focused as we (contemporary believers) often regard it. It is, rather, “outwardly” focussed on the realisation of God's kingdom in all spheres of life.
Kingdom-advancing churches are ones that congregate to worship, pray, learn from the teaching of the Word, receive the sacraments, and meet each other’s needs. Then, having been equipped for works of service, they disperse into the community where they proclaim the gospel, minister to the poor, and bring truth, beauty and goodness into every sphere of society by means of their vocations (Miller & Allen 2008:3).

The church is not the kingdom of God but it looks towards the kingdom of God, waits for it, or rather makes a pilgrimage towards it and is its herald, proclaiming it to the world (Küng 1968: 95).

1.7.4 The meaning of local economic development (LED)

The central thesis of this concept is that locally based economic development is more likely to be successful if initiated at the community level rather than elsewhere (Teixeira & Barros 2014: 143 – 144, see also Blakely 1994:19). LED is close to community development processes in that “...it scales development down to a process manageable by a local community” (Van Schalkwyk 1996: 49). It summons communities to use their current human, social, institutional, and physical resources to build a self-sustaining economic system. It is building a local economy from within.

The failure and ineffectiveness of large-scale development efforts in alleviating poverty has led development practitioners to give preference to community and local development as a strategy specifically as related to education and development (Szirmai 2015:266, cf. Mangayi 2003:15). The assumption is that development is possible if we can deal with an entire community in its local community setting.

The conceptual framework for LED theoretically emerges from what is known as an “asset-based approach to development” (Kreztman and McKnight 1993). The church / faith communities possess distinctive assets as presented in sections 1.7.1 to 1.7.3, which could be useful for LED. These focus on endogenous (or internal) development which may yield to two distinct and contrasting approaches: (1) one which places the emphasis on the development of urban real estate investment and capital growth; and (2) an alternative approach which attempts to steer economic development activities towards local disadvantaged residents (Blakely 1994:50). This thesis is more in line with the latter.
Local economic development is process-oriented. That is a process involving the formation of new institutions, the development of alternative industries, the improvement of the capacity of existing employers to produce better products, the identification of new markets, the transfer of knowledge, and the nurturing of new firms and enterprises.

The primary goal of LED is to "...increase the number and variety of job opportunities available to local people" (Blakely 1994:52). Assets for LED include neighbourhoods with active churches and neighbourhood organisations which work toward the constructive development of their community, and which act as beacons to developers and investors. Partners in LED include local government, community institutions and the private sector.

1.7.5 Relation between LED and sustainable economic development

A sustainable economy is one which provides us with a reasonably comfortable life style while operating in harmony with the natural world – that is sustainability (cf.Szirmai 2015: 8). A sustainable economy is an essential element of a sustainable society, "one which lives within its environmental income and nurtures capital – the earth and its biosphere" (Woods 1992: 1). I argue that an important LED goal should be a sustainable economy, an economy which does not destroy nor harm the earth, and which does not destroy those resources which future generations will depend on - with reference to the Brundtland Report8 of the World Commission on Environment and Development of 1987.

Some basic questions at the core of such a sustainable economy should be: what is an economy? What is its purpose? Whom does it serve? How? Most professional economists rarely address these questions from a Christian perspective (cf. Hay 2004, Hay 2007: 99 -124, Ritenour 2010). In order to establish a sustainable society in Tshwane, we must throw down the "golden calf" of growth and profit, and look to the welfare of human beings and the natural world as our economic guide (cf. Opp and Osgood. 2013: 10).

Local economic development geared towards a sustainable economy should not only be a blind pursuit focused on growing the Gross Domestic Product (Blakely and Leigh 2010). This research has promoted the concept that it should rather:

8 http://www.ace.mmu.ac.uk/eae/Sustainability/Older_Brundtland_Report.htm
• Begin with the survival, wellbeing and eventually prosperity of communities in mind.
• Be a means by which we work together to provide for ourselves and for each other, goods and services. The fulfilment of our human needs rather than consumerism should be its purpose.
• It should serve every member of society. Currently a few are served better than the many and at the cost of the many, largely due to the influence of traditional capital growth-orientatated economics. A sustainable economy, on the other side, avoids reliance on the traditional centres of economic growth (or a “trickle down” effect), but works towards a proliferation of smaller economic growth centres to spread the bounty of the country's economic wealth throughout society.
• What we need instead are radical economics, which empower the poor to look after themselves and to generate their own wealth. This creates a “trickle-up” effect, the spread of well-being from the bottom of the traditional economic pyramid to the upper layers of society, in the sense that these layers are the public and the shared dimension of a society’s economy (Woods 1992:4).

Such economy must adhere to the following principles for sustainable societies as formulated by Woods (1992) and Gardner (2003):

**Principle 1: Everything connects**

The earth and its biosphere is a single entity, “the totality constituting a feedback or cybernetic system which seeks an optimal physical and chemical environment for life on this planet” (Woods 1992: 4)

We should therefore work towards restoring harmony. Suderman (1998: 17) put it this way:

...harmony among human beings, harmony between the human and nature; harmony between the human and God, harmony between nature and God, ecological harmony, psychological harmony (…); the abundance of peace, the absence of suffering; the absence of evils, the absence of tears and sadness, the purpose is life in abundance.

**Principle 2: Beauty**

Beauty, of both the natural and the civilised world, is an essential element in achieving and maintaining a sustainable society. It encourages creativity in the way we live and produce our "bread".
Principle 3: Choosing an economy

Choosing an economy, therefore, is not limited to choosing between socialism and capitalism, but entails selecting the features of each and adding a few new ideas, to create something quite different from either. It also means evaluating the performance of the economy in terms of the long-term well-being of both human and other-than-human beings living in it, and not by abstract measures such as the growth rate of the Gross Domestic Product, or the strength of the Rand.

Principle 4: The economy as an organic process

The economy must be seen as a system of organic functions which is not only influenced from the outside, but in the first place must also be formed from the inside, through the actions of each one of us, to the benefit of all within a local economic system – especially the vulnerable and marginalised such as women and children.

It is not the economy per se which should be our concern, but those who suffer economically because of events beyond their control and who need assistance in regaining their economic equilibrium (Woods 1992:7)

Principle 5: Work

The cornerstone of an economy is work, not the fluctuation of financial markets. A local economy, which does not provide meaningful jobs for the people, as is currently the case in Tshwane, is unfit for purpose and undesirable. An economy based on sound work ethics and aimed at job creation brings about self-worth and self-development in people.

Principle 6: Co-operation

In a sustainable economy focussed on the organic nature of the local economy and society, co-operation would be emphasised over competition. The latter often wastes resources through the trivialisation of human needs, and does not take care of the whole organic “body” of society.

In order to evolve a sustainable society we must operate on sustainable values for pragmatic reasons. The churches in Tshwane (S & H) must address our civilisation’s challenge, which is, as Gardner (2003:153) puts it, "to reintegrate our societal heart and head, to re-establish spirituality as a partner in dialogue with science". I believe that the Christian church in Tshwane would do well to forge partnerships with other agents of change as it seeks to be a catalyst for LED.
1.7.6. Townships within Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality

Tshwane lies in the smallest of the country’s nine provinces, Gauteng (the Sotho word for The Place of Gold). Gauteng’s neighbouring provinces are the North West Province, Mpumalanga, and Limpopo. Gauteng encompasses an area of 17 010 km² (making up 1.4% of South Africa), while Tshwane covers an area of 2 198 km² (approximately 65 x 50 km). Tshwane includes Pretoria, Centurion, Laudium, Eersterust, Akasia and Soshanguve, as well as the surrounding areas of Atteridgeville, Crocodile River, Ga-Rankuwa, Mabopane, Winterveld, Hammanskraal, Temba and Mamelodi. The map of Tshwane on page 22 refers.
Map 1.1: Map of the City of Tshwane

According to the 2007/08 South Africa Survey, the city houses about ten inhabitants per hectare, a population of almost two million people.
The home language profile of Tshwane indicates that the most widely used home language is Sepedi (Northern Sotho), followed by Afrikaans, Setswana, Xitsonga, IsiZulu and English. According to the 2007/08 South Africa Survey, these six languages account for 84.68% of the population of Tshwane.

1.7.6.1 Townships within the city of Tshwane

Townships in South Africa are part of the Apartheid legacy. They were known as non-white settlements on the periphery of cities, with a local authority dependent on and subordinate to the white authority. A number of townships surround the city of Tshwane, previously known as Pretoria. The largest ones are Soshanguve, Hammanskraal and Mabopane to the north, Mamelodi to the east and Atteridgeville to the west of the city. As intimated, this study focussed on just two of the northern townships: Hammanskraal and Soshanguve.

1.7.6.2 Contemporary features of South African townships

The following features of townships and marginalised communities in South Africa and other parts of the world are also prevalent in Tshwane:

- Township communities and marginalised neighbourhoods lagged behind the nation in employment generation patterns (Blakely 1994: 19; Conn & Ortiz 2001: 69)
- Neighbourhood and community decline: economic restructuring result in very uneven spatial influences both nationally and within communities. The root cause of this problem is systematic disinvestment in these areas (Blakely 1994:20). This is not a new situation in S & H but now it is worse because since 1994 there was hardly any investment.
- The absence of local markets meant not only lost services but also lost income (Blakely 1994: 24)
- The rising underclass: manifested in teenage pregnancy (which leads to high dropout rates in the schools, reinforces family breakdown and prevents upward economic mobility) where in the majority of cases, the children are born into fatherless homes to under-aged and under-prepared parents. Women form the bulk of the new underclass for many reasons: female-headed households operate below the poverty line (the feminisation of poverty). It has been pointed out that "female poverty has been the most
striking feature of the social welfare system (...) these women cannot find a way out for themselves or their offspring" (Blakely 1994:25)

- Under-education and illiteracy are also central features of the so-called underclass.

### 1.7.7 Mission and LED

I view mission as Hoekendijk (1966:105) defined it: as God’s activity through the church for the establishment of His kingdom and the total salvation of humanity. It concerns participation in the movement of God's love toward the people, since God is a fountain of sending love (Bosch 1991: 390; Musasiwa 1996: 195). The ultimate aim of mission is the glory and manifestation of God's grace (Voetius⁹ 1643 in Kritzinger et al. 1994: 1).

Mission is thus regarded as a movement from God to the world and the church is viewed as an instrument for that mission (Bosch 1991:390). This implies that the scope of the church's mission is more comprehensive than has traditionally been the case. Local economic development fits reasonably within such an understanding of mission, because the aim (that is, to build a self-sustaining LED for the common good) as stated in section 1.7.4 demonstrates the love at the heart of the missionary God in economic and social terms. Our participation in the movement of God's love toward the world includes an evangelistic as well as a socio-economic responsibility (Stott 1975: 23; Bosch 1991: 405; Steward 1994). Such an understanding of mission embodies in word and deed that Christ died and rose from the dead, that he lives to transform human lives and to overcome death.

To this effect, the church should not be viewed in isolation any longer, but should find its identity in its close interaction with the world. In his Letters and Papers from Prison Bonhoeffer (1971: 382f) wrote, “The church is the church only when it exists for others….The church must share in secular problems of ordinary human life, not dominating, but helping and serving.”

In Transforming Mission Bosch (1991: 368-389) suggested that we become "the church with others" as this enhances the possibility of authentic co-existence. This church-with-others is a substantial instrument for God’s mission to the world. Its role towards LED will be inspired by its commitment to comprehensive or holistic mission. This church has to recognise that it cannot

---

exist outside of its relationship with the world. What is required in our time is “a dynamic, purposeful, world-directed ecclesiology” (Van Engen 1991: 160).

The conceptualised church that I have suggested here will not only be oriented towards the world, but will also seek to position itself on the margins of society to hear the suppressed voices of the poor and unemployed. It will promote the welfare of humanity but also the greater world community and will function in a holistic and integrated, incarnational, intentional, contextual, empowering and sustainable manner.

1.7.8 Public theology and LED

In his books Beliefs, values and policies: Conviction politics in a secular age (1989) and Christian justice and public policy (1997) Forrester aptly articulated the different faces of public theology. For Forrester, public theology is about acknowledging the fact that theology is not the preserve of the private domain. “Privatised” religion emphasises subjectivity, the spiritual realm, and a personal relationship with God, which may result in a withdrawal from the public engagement of theology; losing its prophetic edge (Forrester 1989:10). Without this prophetic edge, Christianity would justify the values of the society or would never question society when things went wrong.

In this research I concurred with Forrester and asserted the fact that the churches’ involvement in LED is a matter of interest for public theology, because religion does not only belong in the private realm but has a wider contribution to make in the public discourse and society (Forrester 1997; cf. Schreiter 2008: 168). The question is how to develop and support all that is good through LED while concurrently addressing a prophetic word to society.

As I attempted to interpret the meaning of LED from the perspective of faith in the Christian message, my theological thinking moved beyond mere interpretation to practical involvement, relating theology to the circumstances of the lives of communities of Hammanskraal and Soshanguve, which give the church an opportunity to engage with the public space.

The message of the prophet Jeremiah to “Seek the welfare of the city…” (Jeremiah 29:7) to the remaining Israelite community in Babylon may be interpreted as a call for the church to engage publicly with the issues that affect whole urban communities. One concern that emerges from this call, is that of “a church that has no mind for a holistic vision for the city” (Villafane 1995:1). Jeremiah’s words are instructive. They present a new challenge to God’s people in a reality of exile and marginalisation. They address the theological question concerning the role of the
people of God in the city. What is the role of the church in the city today? Jeremiah’s answer is an overarching, holistic vision for the city, one that can inspire our work in urban ministry. His paradigm for a holistic urban ministry stems from a theology of context (presence), a theology of mission (peace) and a theology of spirituality (prayer) (Villafane 1995:2). The people of God are called to live out their faith in an urban community, as in the time of Jeremiah. While our context is different from his, the social issues such as injustice, poverty, and marginalisation are still with us today. In this research, I have advocated for creativity in the way the church in mission engages issues in the public sphere of life.

Neither did Jesus’ disciples and the early church simply imitate Jesus. The early Christian communities handled the traditions about the life and the teaching of Jesus with creative but responsible freedom. Traditions were carefully retained, but they were also modified to meet new circumstances (Bosch 1985:530).

Hugo Echegaray (1984 in Bosch 1985: 531) makes a similar point:

Jesus has not left us a rigid model for action – rather, he inspired his disciples to prolong the logic of his own action in a creative way amid the new and different historical circumstances in which the community would have to proclaim the gospel…

I therefore propose that in our missionary involvement today, we need to do the same.

1. 8. Sources and Methodological Considerations

1.8.1 Epistemology and methodology (Theoretical field)

I faced a number of challenges in the use of the methodology known as the Pastoral Cycle, which forms the framework for this research and which also allows for the inclusion of aspects of other research approaches. Overall, this created a matrix of approaches with which to generate knowledge and research outcomes. First of all, while the area of economic development is generally considered the terrain of elitist specialists and business leaders talking about and planning for those on the margins, it was important that I listen to stories and experiences of grassroots leaders and let these be heard by others (Josselson 2010: 1). Such leaders are ordinary, caring Christians and not economically powerful figures. Apart from economically knowledgeable people and literature on economics, these ordinary people informed my economic investigation.
Secondly, I needed to develop a substantial economic, social-scientific and theological approach for the thesis, if it was to impact on the socio-economic ministry and outlook of the church in Tshwane (S & H).

I set out to operate within an interpretative and participatory approach (see Pieterse 1993) to research, working directly with experiences (stories), analysis and reflection. I endeavoured to understand and interpret these stories in order to “build knowledge around them” (Cohen & Manion 1990: 39, see also Josselson 2010: 1). The data thus yielded was glossed with the meanings and explanations obtained from scientific sources. Furthermore, the understanding generated needed to make sense to those to (the church (S & H)) whom it applies (Muller 1994: 26).

My choice of an interpretative perspective to research was justified for two reasons. First, by my choice of the blend of methodology: a literature review and consultation/focus group discussions as well as interviews enriched with emancipatory and participatory processes (see Freire 1990; Holland & Henriot 1983; Hope & Timmel 1995; Spradley 1979) were selected for this research. Muller (1994: 25) provided further guidelines in elaborating that narrative within emancipatory trends will allow the leaders from the research area to be reckoned with as contributors towards the research project, as opposed to traditional research approaches, which see them as objects (cf. Josselson 2010: 3). In this trend, their voices count. The idea of people as subjects of their own histories was important as the narrative in the participatory research approach allowed them to participate as resource people, instead of being considered peripheral. Together we engaged in action-reflection (praxis) to discover social, economic and political realities.

At the end (phase 6) of the research process, I facilitated one consultation event whereby we (researcher and research participants) had an opportunity to reflect on the findings of this research and discuss a way forward. In this way, this research could contribute directly to strengthening people’s resources and solving practical problems in relation to LED.

1.8.2 Pastoral praxis cycle as the framework for this thesis

I utilised the pastoral praxis cycle as the framework for the whole research project. This four-phase method is closely linked to the one developed by Holland and Henriot (1984) and adapted by Cochrane, De Gruchy and Petersen (1991) in the South African context. I used the
same four basic phases: insertion, analysis, reflection and planning for action, as they did, but developed its contents as required by this research project in the following manner:

(1) Insertion phase
In the insertion phase we (researcher and participants) referred to our present experiences and current actions as a response to the church’s presence in the economically marginalised townships of S and H in Tshwane. Starting with personal stories and experiences in the research context, we placed the emphasis on Christian praxis with the intention of developing a transformative praxis, i.e. "to facilitate growth from the present reality (where we are now) to the envisioned reality (where God wants us to be)" (De Beer & Venter 1998: 51). We continually entered the reality of the townships for the purpose of seeking understanding and of learning to show solidarity with the pain of the marginalised people in the Tshwane Metropolis. I had envisaged this to be an ever-deeper movement into Tshwane (S & H) and its realities. It meant a conscious effort of entering the community of Tshwane (S & H) and its culture, getting to know the people and the places. It involved meeting people and listening to their issues; developing relationships and networks; experiencing their joy and struggles; observing certain trends in the context and interpreting and or evaluating them as well as engaging with the issues around me and by acting in response to the challenges it poses. Apart from my own interaction with communities and individuals in Tshwane, this research includes the findings and evaluations of focus group sessions and individual interviews (see Chapters 6 and 7). The rest of the research continuously reflected on the insertion phase.

(2) Analysis phase
Based on insertion into Tshwane (S & H) and its experiences and activities, the next step in the method of Holland and Henriot (1984) was to analyse my own and peoples described experiences, in the context of the social reality of Tshwane (S & H). The broader social context in which these experiences have taken place were also analysed. In this phase, together we moved from the personal realm to the broader social realm (De Gruchy 1986: 88). Parts of Chapters 4 and 5 of this thesis focus on the analysis of socio-economic and ecclesial contexts as related to this research.

(3) Reflection phase
This social analysis was followed by the third phase, theological reflection. We considered the position of the church in relation to socio-economic realities and economic marginalisation in the city of Tshwane; we critically reflected on the church’s own values and praxis as it concerns economic activity and (dis-)empowerment and reflected on all of this in the light of the Biblical and theological concept, *oikos*. Through this reflection we also investigated current economic, cultural and socio-political issues, in particular as they manifest themselves within the church in Tshwane (S & H) (cf. Gutierrez 1971: 9). This was a shared reflection, drawing participants together around the table, allowing them to share in dialogue from their own experiences, insights, failures and observations; thereby learning from one another (De Beer & Venter 1998: 62). The research findings and evaluations of the theological reflections of the research participants in Chapters 6 and 7 refer, as do Chapters 8 and 9 of this research.

The reflection phase intended to explore God’s *oikos* vision (we later also used the term “God’s economy”) for the city of Tshwane and how this vision may unfold in terms of the church’s participation in LED. By using the *oikos* concept as the hermeneutic, we sought to articulate a position beyond “the limited understanding of welfare and development inherited from the historical church’s engagement with the poor as accomplices of economic and political forces of capitalism” (Van Schalkwyk 2012: 101; see also Swart 2006: 11-29). Thus, I set out to understand the role of township churches and LED within a sustainable framework (section 1.7.5) “so as to bring social regeneration and economic wealth into balance with ecological systems” (Van Schalkwyk 2012: 102).

(4) Planning for action

The final phase consisted of pastoral planning for action. Based on new insights gained from the previous phases, especially from the study of the concept *oikos*, I explored possibilities concerning what the church in Tshwane (S & H) could do to participate in LED and how this could broaden the church’s self-understanding in terms of its organic interconnectedness with the rest of society.

### 1.8.3 Introducing practical research methods

---

10 *Oikos* is a Greek word in the New Testament which literally means “house”, “household” or “home”. The word “economy” derives from two Greek words: *oikos-nomos* meaning the rules of the household (*The Oikos Journey* 2006: 24, see also Ritenour 2010: 1)
The research process was "a knowledge-building enterprise" (Bloom 1997: 190). The research process for this thesis included a combination of methods, i.e. documentary research as well as field research. The latter aspect involved leaders from churches, civil society and local government. The use of stories to incorporate life experiences of grassroots leaders enriched the collection of information. Partly structured interviews and research visits assisted in gathering views and examining models in existence. I used these methods in combination or separately, as the situation demanded.

Partly structured interviews were chosen in order to guide the dialogue while allowing the respondent flexibility and freedom. In our description of the research area, I utilised a survey of the social and physical space of Tshwane (S & H). Area maps gave us a pictorial representation of the research contexts.

This thesis made use of the following specific research techniques:

**1.8.3.1 Focus group interview**

Consultations/focus groups interviews and discussions with different church leaders in Tshwane (S & H) were conducted. Greeff (2005: 299) explains:

> Focus groups are a "...means of better understanding how people feel or think about an issue, product or service. Participants are selected because they have certain characteristics in common that relate to the topic of the focus group. The group is focussed in that it involves some kind of collective activity".

Focus group interviews were meaningful for this project because they can be adapted to new research topics. This was certainly the case for this study in that not many people have thought of researching the role of the church in society, local communities and local economies by means of this method. This specifically applies to the church’s role in LED in Tshwane (S & H). In order to understand how people experience and understand what impact LED can have on churches and communities, it was appropriate to allow opportunities for people in the focus group sessions to share some of their stories and experiences. This is where narrative was important (Section 8.4). I had expected that aspects that would not be likely to emerge in the one-to-one interviews would be more likely to do so in focus groups; as explained by Greeff,
"because group dynamics can be a catalytic factor in bringing information to the fore" (2005: 286).

I organised one mini-consultation for each of the two townships and two joint consultations towards the end of the research process. These group interviews reflected on different stories and experiences shared by the leaders and others concerning their ministry in Tshwane (S & H). They wrestled with the key question of this research, i.e. the role that the township church should play towards LED in Tshwane (S & H) by using the four phases of the Pastoral Cycle, as described in section 8.2 together with the oikos concept as a central hermeneutical tool in this whole process. This technique "encourage subjects to speak freely about behaviours, attitudes, and the opinions they possess" (Berg 2004: 123) concerning the theme under discussion. It also provides interactions among and between group members, which stimulate discussions in which one group member reacts to comments made by another. Each member of the group is “emancipated” to be in a position to contribute to, or to challenge the discussion, which is crucial for critical reflection.

1.8.3.1.1 Composition and profile of the group

Each focus group was intended to represent three congregations from different denominations, in terms of the following groups:

- One pastor from each congregation
- Three women’s group representatives, one from each congregation
- Three men’s group representatives, one from each congregation
- Three youth group representatives, one from each congregation
- One or two representatives of local business people
- One or two representatives of the community, who are not members of the congregation.

However, on the ground, during the first consultation for each focus group, 11 participants (i.e. three pastors, two women’s group representatives, three youth group representatives, one community member and two business people) representing three congregations and one businessman attended in Hammanskraal on 11th January 2014 (Appendix A.1 refers) while 10 participants (i.e. three pastors, two women’s representatives, three youth group representatives
and one community member) representing three congregations and one businessman attended in Soshangue on 12th January 2014 (Appendix A.2 refers). These focus group discussions took place from 9:30 – 13:30 at Hammanskraal and from 11:30 – 15:30 at Soshangue. A lunch break of 30 minutes was also provided to participants. Tea, cold drinks and water were available during the entire sessions so that participants could help themselves whenever they needed to.

The joint focus groups attracted 21 participants from churches (i.e. five pastors, six women’s group representatives, five men’s group representatives, five youth group’s representatives) representing six churches and three community members and three businessmen on 14 – 15th February 2014. In total, 27 participants attended the joint focus groups (Appendix A3 refers). The joint focus group discussions took place at Hammanskraal from 12:00 – 17:00 including a one hour lunch break on 14th February 2014 and from 9:00 – 14:00 including a one hour lunch break on 15th February 2014. The last session (phase 6) from 15:00 – 17:00 took place on 17th February 2014 and was attended by 10 participants (five pastors, two community members, two businessmen and one church elder) representing six churches.

The educational background of the group indicated that seven had a general education (up to grade 10), five had passed grade 12, ten possessed post-secondary education (diplomas), three had first university degrees, and two had received postgraduate education.

1.8.3.1.2 Conducting focus group interviews: practical process

I complied with the following steps suggested by Krueger (2002: 1-16) and Clark (1992) when conducting focus group interviews:

- **As a moderator:**

  - I was mentally prepared (alert and free from distractions so that I could listen and be prepared and focused for the line of questioning or “questioning route”)

  - I used purposeful small talk in order to create a warm and friendly environment and appropriate seating arrangements

  - I gave a “smooth and snappy” introduction of the topic and the purpose of the focus group. (The standard introduction included a word of welcome, a recap of previous discussions, an overview of the discussion topic, ground rules and guiding question.)
- I used pauses and probes to prompt participants to provide further explanation and illustrations regarding comments

- I recorded the discussion by means of a voice recorder and written notes taken by a research assistant

- I monitored verbal and nonverbal reactions of participants.

- I used appropriate summaries and conclusions of participants’ contributions; such as reflective rephrasing, confirmations, review purpose of discussion, asked if anything had been missed and thanked the group for their contribution before ending the session.

**Asking questions:**

- I used open-ended questions as stipulated earlier under the research questions section

- I avoided dichotomous questions that could be answered by a simple "yes" or "no"

- I used questions that involved participants by means of reflection, examples, choices, etc.

- I focussed the questions, proceeding from general to specific.

- I ended questions by making sure that I had confirmed and captured answers and by checking whether I had missed anything. At times, I played back the tape during the focus group in order to confirm that I had not missed any information.

**When analysing focus group data:**

- In keeping with the narrative logic I thought about both the actual words used by participants and the meanings of those words. (Chapters 6 & 7 provide details.)

- I also interpreted responses in the light of discussion by the tone and intensity of the oral comment

- When there was a shift in opinion in the course of the interview I traced the flow of the discussion to determine clues that might explain the change, which involved re-playing the recorded transcripts many times
- I took special note of topics discussed more by participants (extensiveness and frequency) and some comments made more often (frequency) than others. I understood that these topics were more important to participants.

- I gave more weight to responses that were specific and based on experiences than to responses that were vague and impersonal. I also paid greater attention to responses that were in the first person as opposed to hypothetical third person answers.

- I stepped back from discussions by allowing major ideas of the focus group interview to emerge from the group itself.

- **Notification procedure:**

  - In consultation with the leaders of congregations, I set meeting times for group interviews on the dates mentioned above.

  - With the help of church leaders I contacted participants by phone or in person on Sundays after their morning services.

  - I sent a written invitation to each church member at least six weeks before the actual date of the focus group (see Appendix D).

  - Through the pastor, I confirmed these appointments with phone calls by contacting each person two to three days before the focus group.

- **Transcribing focus group interviews:**

  - I used a good quality voice recorder to play back the conversations.

  - I typed transcripts in a retreat centre (i.e. Lefika Camp) which allowed for minimal interruptions.

  - I typed the name of each participant followed by his/ her comment. In this way each comment was directly linked to a participant (see Chapters 6 & 7). Each comment was separated by a double space.

  - I typed comments word for word; if some words were unintelligible I typed three periods (...) to indicate that words were missing from the transcript.
- I noted special or unusual sounds that could assist in the analysis, such as laughter, shouting and the like

- I allowed sufficient time to transcribe each session.

- Reporting focus group results:

  - I strove to communicate the participants’ inputs clearly and precisely. I respected the richness of their contributions and told their stories fluently and accurately (see Chapters 6 & 7)

  - I highlighted the meaning and the importance of the findings and additionally grouped some findings in categories as per subthemes.

1.8.3.1.3 Practical methodology in conducting focus group interviews

For this research I adapted the practical methodology outlined by Holland and Henriot (1984: 95-105) on how to undertake social analysis. The approach followed four phases: (1) insertion), (2) description, (3) analysis, and (4) conclusions, which loosely concur with the phases of the Pastoral Cycle as described in the previous section and as commonly known: insertion, analysis, theological reflection and planning for action. We (the participants and I) went through these phases in progression.

Mini-consultation one - including two sessions

(Mini-consultation 1 was conducted once in Soshanguve on 12 January 2014 and once in Hammanskraal on 11 January 2014)

FIRST SESSION

Phase one – Insertion

I began the social analysis using the focus group method, with certain theological presuppositions. I have values and biases that come from the Bible, my faith and the tradition of
my church community. I used a specific hermeneutic key to these faith resources, namely the oikos concept. I introduced the topic by quoting from The Oikos Journey (2006:22-23) that:

Churchgoers feel that the sphere of economics lies outside their competence. Even though Jesus spoke more about money than he did about prayer, we continue to propagate the error that the Christian faith does not deal with economics, but only with 'spiritual' matters. Yet we can and must think theologically about economics.

Together, we needed to gather the necessary biblical and theological resources to engage the Tshwane (S & H) economics from the perspective of the oikos concept, which can further be explained as “God’s economy”. This theological concept, oikos, formed our values and hermeneutical lens through which we looked at the Tshwane economy and LED. Drawing from the document The Oikos Journey: a theological reflection on the economic crisis in South Africa written by The Oikos Study Group of the Diakonia Council of Churches (2006: 23) we focussed on a Greek word in the New Testament, i.e. oikos which literally means “house”, “household” or “home”. The word “economy” derives from two Greek words: oikos-nomos meaning the rules of the household. To speak of God’s economy is therefore to speak of “the rules that God has established for our household, the world in which people live, work, struggle, flourish and die” (The Oikos Journey 2006: 24).

Through the lens of the household of God (oikos) we visualised recognition and restoration of relations between human and nonhuman inhabitants of the planet. The strength of the oikos lies in the fact that “although the earth does not provide a home for all yet, the yearning of Christian hope is that all God’s creatures will find a lasting home in God’s household” (Conradie 2006: 17). In this thesis, I recognised that there are a great number of human and nonhuman beings in Tshwane (S & H) that do not feel at home in this city because of poverty (including gender based poverty), marginalisation and abuse. I nonetheless, see this metaphor as expressing hope that, with concerted effort, the churches could work towards a local economic development which would provide all creatures with a lasting home in Tshwane. It could mean integrating the different concerns (such as welfare and relief, development, participation in social movements, etcetera) for the well-being of humans and nonhumans in Tshwane. Later, I will expand on my understanding of God's economy within an ecologically sustainable understanding of our life and economic activities on this earth (section 3.3.2.1).

We used the scriptural base outlined by The Oikos Journey (2006: 25 – 30) for a Bible study of “God's economy” which included texts such as:
- Psalms 24: 1 (pointing to the fact that the earth is full of grace and love)
- Genesis 2: 15 & Genesis 3: 17 (labour is both a blessing and a curse)
- Exodus 20: 8-10a and Leviticus 25: 8-17 (Sabbath is the fundamental rule of God's economy)
- Isaiah 58 & Amos 5 (Shared prosperity is the goal of God's economy)
- Exodus 20: 3 and Matthew 6: 24 (We cannot serve both God and Mammon)
- Matthew 19: 16-22 (God's economy is a matter of discipleship)
- Deuteronomy 5: 33; also 25: 13-16 and 30: 16-18 (We are called to live long in the land)

This Bible study gave contents and meaning to our understanding of the term oikos, and provided us with some quite concretely described values which guided us through these focus group sessions and the rest of the study.

In our focus groups, we started off by wrestling with the following questions:

- What does the term “economy” mean for ordinary church people in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal? How do they see it operating (functioning) and how do they participate in its operation?
- What are the church's basic beliefs and primary values in relation to the Biblical understanding of oikos and “God’s economy” - as these relate to the economy of Tshwane (S & H) and of society?
- How are these values foundational for the church’s praxis, which has a smaller or larger impact on the local economy and LED?
- What is currently happening to the people of Tshwane (specifically H and S) in terms of the broader and the local economy? What do you notice about our economic situation here today?
- What are the people experiencing? What is happening to the poor of Tshwane (H and S in particular)? What is happening to those who live on the margins or periphery of the city of Tshwane (S & H)?
- In the light of the above: How would the participants at this stage describe LED, as it applies to their live situations?
SECOND SESSION

Phase two – description of LED situation

We took an “impressionistic” approach to the task of description. We started to gather facts and trends through storytelling, sharing of experiences, and insights; to enable us to get in touch with people’s experiences. We dealt with the following questions:

- What do you observe is happening to the local economy of Tshwane (specifically H and S)? What changes have occurred in the past fifteen years?
- What have been the most important events influencing the economy?
- How would we talk about the most dominant events we see in the economy of Tshwane (S & H) – how do these events affect the economy in H and S?
- Who are the major and most powerful role-players in Tshwane’s (S & H) economy? Who are the moderately powerful role-players and who are the least powerful role-players?
- What are the major economic structures that determine how the city of Tshwane (S & H) organises its resources in terms of what to produce, distribute, exchange and consume? What influence does money have in our situation? Why?
- How does each of these groups relate to the important economic events, and how do these affect them?
- Are people suffering or prospering in Tshwane (S & H)? Explain in what ways?
- How, through what means, are people making a living and participating in the local economy? How do (some) people find a way to prosper?
- Where do they find the resources and assets, the values, the hopes and opportunities to make a living and to participate in the local economy?
- In the light of the above: how do ordinary and poor people see their role and participation in the economy?
- How do they understand their ability – or their inability – to participate in LED?

Second mini-consultation – including two sessions

(This mini-consultation was held with the joint group – including both the Soshanguve and Hammanskraal groups on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)
FIRST SESSION

Phase three – analysis

(This mini-consultation was held with the joint group – including both the S and H groups)

In this meeting, we attempted to obtain a more complete picture of the Tshwane (S & H) economy by exploring its historical and structural relationships. Concurring with Holland and Henriot (1984: 98), we worked through a series of six questions about the history, structures, values, and direction of LED in Tshwane (S & H).

We dealt with the following in our focus groups:

- How did Tshwane’s (S & H) economy come to this point? What brought it to this point?
- What are the major political structures that determine how the city of Tshwane (S & H) organises power? Who makes the most important decisions in Tshwane (S & H)? Why?
- What are the most important relationships of influence and power that people have in Tshwane (S & H)? Why?
- What are the major cultural resources of the people of Tshwane (specifically in S & H) in terms of
  - Religion, culture and traditions?
  - Traditional knowledge and skills?
- Most people have values about what is right and wrong, based on religious beliefs, cultural roots, family background and laws, organisational or political organisations to which they belong. What do people of Tshwane (S & H) want or value most in life? Why? What are the acceptable and accepted ways that guide the aspirations and expectations that people have? Why?
- What are the sources of creativity and hope for the future in the present situation?

SECOND SESSION

Phase four – Conclusion of analysis

In this phase, we were able to discern the most important elements in the Tshwane (S & H) economy. We reviewed the responses made to the six questions regarding the four analytical
categories of the third phase (history, structures, values, direction) and identified the most basic causes which create the realities of the current situation of Tshwane’s (S & H) LED.

To uncover these basic causes, Holland and Henriot (1984: 101) suggests that we must first prioritise or rank within each analytical category (history, structures, values, direction) the most significant factors influencing the situation.

In the focus groups, we discussed questions such as:

- Which one or two historical events most shaped the present local economy? (History)
- Which economic, political, social, and cultural factors (structure) most determine the operation of the city of Tshwane’s (S & H) economic system?
- Which one or two values have the most impact on how people of Tshwané (S & H) act and thereby on the Tshwane (S & H) economy?
- Which trends seems most likely for the future of LED in Tshwane (S & H)?

When the "various elements have been prioritised, we need to make a second effort at ranking and then drawing some conclusions" (Holland and Henriot 1984: 101). Our focus groups drew their conclusions by answering the following questions:

- What are the two or three basic causes (in terms of history; economic, political, social, and cultural structures; as well as values and trends most responsible for the current situation?
- In whose interests do these basic causes operate?
- What are those causes and conditions in terms of history, structure, values and trends, which create hope and opportunities for LED?
- What are some of those causes and conditions in terms of history, structure, values and trends, which help people to make a sustainable living and form part of LED?
- How do Christians/members of churches make a living and form part of LED? How can one take the best examples and expand on them?
Third mini-consultation – including two sessions

(This mini-consultation was be held with the joint group – including both the Soshanguve and Hammanskraal groups at Hammanskraal on 15 February 2014)

FIRST SESSION

Phase 5 - Theological reflection with the focus group

Drawing from Holland and Henriot (1984: 104), it was evident that the elements of scripture, questions and prayer were fundamental to theological reflection. I opened up the session by revisiting the basic causes of what had been summed-up in the analysis.

The group prayed for light to discern the presence of the Spirit in the midst of the situation in (S & H), to hear the call and the message, and to be open to the lessons.

As for specific questions for reflection, we discussed the following:

- What consequences (negative and positive) does this situation have for building a Christian community response in Tshwane (S&H)?
- We read scripture texts such as those used in The Oikos Journey to identify those principles and values which all together form the “blue print” of “God’s economy”. These, scripture texts were listed earlier, see under section on insertion phase.
- Which values of “God’s economy” would you identify here?
- What are those political and socio-economic realities, which hinder and destroy the realisation of these values in Tshwane (S & H)?
- What is sin in this situation?
- Which are the signs of “God’s economy” and the Oikos in this situation?
- Which are the signs of hope and grace, which open up the situation in Tshwane (H&S) for the realisation of God’s economy and the Oikos?
- What does salvation mean in this situation?
- What is the role of the church towards LED?
- Is it possible to put a Christian understanding of LED into practice? Is a Christian approach to LED appropriate to the situation in Tshwane (S & H)?
- What would such a Christian or “faith-based” practice of LED entail in terms of the example of one specific project? Define and describe some of its attributes, as it relates to the existing definition of LED used in Economics and Development Studies.
• What may the role of ministers and the laity be in such an example, in faith-based LED?
• What specific challenges do the values of “God’s economy” and the Oikos, as well as faith-based LED, hold for the rest of the local economic sector?
• What more do we need to strengthen a Christian approach to LED? Think in terms of the specific example. How may such a Christian approach benefit from LED partners in the civil society, economic and government sector?
• What type of spirituality is appropriate for Christian participation in LED?

SECOND SESSION

The last session (phase 6), from 15:00 – 17:00 took place on 17th February 2014 at Hammanskraal. It was attended by 10 participants (five pastors, two community members, two businessmen and one church elder) representing six churches.

Phase 6: The way forward

At the end, we prioritised some of the major lessons learned from reflection and noted the way forward in terms of action. The following questions guided us in formulating this path:

• What plans of action can we envisage, in the light of the above rankings and conclusions, for specific initiatives / projects / programmes to get churches in H and S involved in LED?
• What did we learn from this whole process? How does it change the way we think about the economy? How does it change the way we act and participate in LED?

1.8.3.2 One-on-one interviews

The interview is a short-term social interaction between two strangers with the explicit purpose of one person obtaining specific information from the other (Leedy & Ormrod 2013: 153, see also Neuman 2009: 370). This structured interview was organised around the role of the church in relation to the local economy.
I conducted two sets of interviews: with church leaders (see Chapter 5) and with practitioners (see Chapter 7). The latter were from local congregations and denominational structures; church-based non-profit organisations involved in social development in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal and or local government officials responsible for social and economic development. Through this, I gained more insight into different people's thinking and knowledge, as well as various government policies and strategy documents geared towards LED. My interaction with individual leaders of congregations assisted us in collecting information pertaining to the vision and strategy of the churches and denominations that participated in this research as related to Tshwane (S & H).

Interviewees and their profiles

In relation to interviews focussed on local churches’ mission orientations and praxes, interviewees included Rev. Aristorica Phiri (Hammanskraal Gospel Centre), Rev. Christian Rustof (Letlhabile Baptist Church), Pastor Stanley Mokone (Youth pastor at Lutheran Church / Soshanguve Block L), Rev. Maponya (Uniting Reformed Church of South Africa / Soshanguve) and Pastor John Megala (Body of Christ Ministry / Lepengville-Hammanskraal). With the exception of Pastor Megala (who has attained general education up to grade 12), three (Reverends Phiri, Rustof and Maponya) have received formal theological education, the minimum being three years post-secondary. Pastor Mokone is a student pastor and youth worker with secondary education plus two years theological training (see also Appendix C).

Expert and experienced practitioner interviewees included Ms M\(^{11}\) (City of Tshwane), Rev Reuben Mamatsinya (Love in Action empowerment ministries / Mabopane), Rev Philip Mogwera (Ebenhezer Bible Church and empowerment ministries), Rev George Ngamlana (Missions department / Baptist Union of South Africa) and Dr Buffel (former national executive member, Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa and scholar (practical theologian)) (see also Appendix B).

1.8.3.2.1 Practical process in conducting one-to-one interviews

\(^{11}\) This interview participant opted to remain anonymous; I have therefore referred to this person as respondent M throughout the rest of this thesis.
Gough (2005) highlighted the following practical steps to follow when a researcher conducts one-to-one interviews for collecting research data (see also Leedy & Ormrod 2013:154 – 157). I used the same steps:

- **Interview schedule:**
  - I used neutral questions
  - I stimulated thinking / recollection via particular questions and probes
  - I used familiar language rather than jargon
  - I used open questions
  - I brought the participants back to the topic if they were rambling

- **Conducting the interview:**
  - The interviews took place in a quiet and comfortable location
  - I ensured that the participant was as free as possible to direct the interview
  - My role was essentially that of a facilitator
  - I monitored the effects of the interview on myself and on the participants.

With regard to procedural recommendations for ethical practices as related to interviews:

- I described the general area of research. I provided enough information in a way which was not misleading and not so specific or detailed that I primed interviewees for the responses I sought
- I told the interviewee that the interview would last a maximum of 90 minutes
- I explained guarantees regarding anonymity and confidentiality such as either wiping the tape clean or giving it to them after the research project was finished, maintaining confidentiality although extracts from the transcript would be included in the report which would be read by the promoters/supervisors and external examiners
- I explained that participants had the right to withdraw at any time during the interview and were free not to answer a question if they did not wish to
- I asked for their signature on a consent form (Appendix E refers)
• I highlighted the fact that the responsibility for analysing interview data lay with the researcher
• I also highlighted that I had the responsibility to interpret the meaning of data within the bounds of evidence and relevant theory
• I assured the interviewees that the knowledge gained from the interviews would be used in an honest, appropriate manner and in line with the goals and aims of the research.

1.8.3.2.2 Practical methodology in conducting one-to-one interviews

In keeping with the main research question and ethics, I asked similar questions to those of the focus groups but in a simpler fashion. I also introduced the interview in a manner similar to that in phase one of the focus group, described earlier on section 1.8.3.1.3.

I kept the Oikos concept of God's economy and the Scriptural basis in the back of my mind; as a means of introduction. I shared and discussed this concept with the individual at the beginning of the interview. I posed the following questions to experienced practitioners:

• What do you notice about our situation in Tshwane (S & H) today? What are people experiencing in terms of the broader and local economy?
• How do you understand LED? Do you think that the government and private sector in Tshwane favours LED or not? Why?
• Which economic policies have impacted and are impacting on Tshwane’s economy?
• What are the successes, the failures, the benefits, and the disadvantages of these policies? Why?
• What changes are necessary in terms of these policies and their implementation, to benefit LED?
• What changes have occurred in the economy in the past fifteen years? What have been the most important events and influences?
• What influence does money and capital have in our situation in Tshwane (S & H)? Why? Who benefits from it?
• Who makes the most important decisions in Tshwane (S & H)? Why? Who benefits from it?
• What are the most important relationships of influence and power that people have? Why? Who benefits from it and who doesn’t?
- What are the most important traditions of the people? Why would you say so? How does this contribute to LED?
- What do people want most in life in Tshwane (S & H)? Why?
- What will things be like in ten years if the economy keeps going in the same way? Why?
- What are the most important causes of the way the broader and the local economy is today? Why?
- How, would you summarise, should LED be taken forward to benefit especially the poor in Tshwane?

In order to obtain information related to the churches’ mission orientations and praxes, I followed a grid provided by Kritzinger (2008) and put the following questions to church leaders:

- **Agency:** the power relations prevailing between them? How do these factors influence their approach? Who are their “interlocutors”, who help “set their agenda” and determine their priorities? How do all these factors shape their approach?

- **Contextual understanding:** What are the social, political, economic, cultural factors that influence the society within which they are working and witnessing? How do the change agents analyse that specific context? How do they “read the signs of the times?” How do these factors shape their approach?

- **Ecclesial scrutiny:** What were the practices of churches and Christians in the past in that particular community? Did these give the church(es) a good or a bad name in the community? Do churches have positions of power and privilege or influential public contacts? What are the physical and institutional structures of the churches and how are they utilised in or for the community at large? What are their leadership patterns and structures? How do these factors shape their approach?

- **Interpreting the tradition:** How do the change agents (re)interpret the Bible and their theological tradition in the light of the questions raised by the previous three dimensions? Is there a unique formulation of the Christian message that is arising in this context? How do these theological insights shape their approach?

- **Discernment for action:** What kind of concrete faith projects or organisations are they involved in, particularly in relation to the community at large? What kind of plans are they making to embody their theological insights in the community? How broad is the theological agenda and how does it actually shape their actions?
**Reflexivity**: Do the change agents consistently and honestly reflect on the impact and results of their work in the community? Do they learn from their experiences? How does this shape their approach in the community? Does this reflection lead to renewed and deepened agency, contextual understanding, interpretation of the tradition, spirituality and planning?

**Spirituality**: What type(s) of spirituality is/are practised by the change agents? What is the dominant spirituality among them? Is this a source of inspiration and encouragement to the group? How do these factors of spirituality shape their approach?

I made appointments with the interviewees, sent them the questions beforehand and then held interviews with them. Hopefully, this gave each interviewee the opportunity to focus on those questions to which he/she would most like to respond. In this sense, the interview session was open-ended. The questions were also posed in an open-ended manner so as to lead towards further discussion, where relevant.

The interviewees were invited to join (some of) the focus group sessions. With the exception of church leaders, the other interviewees unfortunately could not join the focus group sessions due to their working hours.

**1.8.3.3 Studying social space**

Through extensive research visits and maps, I studied the physical and social space of Hammanskraal and Soshanguve. This enabled me to formulate a distinctive perspective on the people, neighbourhoods and networks and the socio-economic assets and needs of this area (Chapter 4). Knowing the history of the neighbourhood helped me understand how the area began, and acquired its shape and name (Venter 1998: 20).

**1.8.3.4 Literature**

I gathered substantial data through literature, academic journals, seminar papers, and so forth. This helped me to maintain a constant intellectual dialogue with experts on the matter I was researching.
1.8.4 Stories as a means to communicate experiences

Ministry is far too important to be left only to professionals, just as theology or mission is too critical to be assigned only to scholars. Stories as communication provided an opportunity to ordinary leaders of the church to share any "expertise" they possessed in church and LED.

Narrative as grounded in the experience of the individual is a foundation for awareness of reality and truth. Narrative therefore, serves as an epistemological basis (Van Schalkwyk 1997: 623).

As Van Schalkwyk (1997b: 625) elaborated, within the broader theological community, there is a considerable body of theory on narrative theology, which may explain to an extent why narratives may be important experiential data for theologians and students of religion. Crites (1971 cited in Van Schalkwyk 1997b:623), for instance, claims that narrative is the closest one comes to experience and is the most complete communication of that experience\textsuperscript{12}. Through stories shared in the focus group sessions (see Section 8.3.1) I encountered the experiences of the research participants, which relate to LED, in the most concrete language that the latter could offer. The same was the case, where applicable, with the one-to-one interviews (Section 8.3.2).

This thesis is an attempt towards discovering the church as an asset towards LED in Tshwane (S & H). Grassroots leaders informed this effort. Stories allowed these leaders to contribute in the development of knowledge related to ministry praxis in their area. I therefore had to be very sensitive and receptive to the leader's own rendering of experience if I was to be able to render it in a written form. I also searched for narratives of these leaders' experience of economic imbalances, as well as experiences of economic empowerment and hope emerging from their stories. These positive stories were regarded as signs of hope and transformation. This was the missiological component in the leader's narratives.

Throughout the research process, I evaluated and made decisions about the study and data. This was based on material found in existing literature, as I moved back and forth between participatory processes and the reading of literature. Sometimes these evaluations and decisions "have arisen as a result of data as they are collected (based on observations in the fields, statement made during interviews, observations of patterns in various documents, etc)" (Berg 2004:39). Finally, conclusions drawn from the patterns apparent in the data needed to be

\textsuperscript{12} This is why in this thesis I chose not to deprive my readers from getting the original voices of participants from the townships of S and H. This meant including long and dense excerpts of narratives in the content (Chapters 6, 7 and 8 refers)
verified by the participants who were involved in the research to ensure that they were real and not merely “wishful” thinking on my side. For that reason, I gave the research participants copies of the transcripts of the focus-group sessions as well as the interviews and briefed them on the final outcome of this research, which hopefully will be useful for their praxis.

1.8.5 Ethical aspects of research in the social sciences and human service professions

In the practice of each of the methods specified in this section, I have consulted the research ethics policy of the University of South Africa and have seen to it that my research meets the criteria of this policy (see Appendix F). I had two basic categories of ethical responsibility: responsibility to those, both human and nonhuman, who participated in the project and responsibility to the discipline of missiological science, to be accurate and honest in the reporting of my research.

I opted for a more egalitarian relationship, where respondents are co-researchers (Strydom 2005: 57). Ethical principles were internalised in my personality to such an extent that ethically guided decision-making has become part of my lifestyle (Strydom 2005: 57).

I abided by eight of the most important ethical issues as highlighted by Strydom (2005: 58-69):

1. Avoidance of harm (physical or and emotional)

2. Informed consent: I informed and explained the process in clear and intelligible language because "Informed consent remains necessary even if the subjects do not listen to the explanation or are not really interested in knowing" (Strydom 2005: 60). All participants signed a consent form before they participated in this research (Appendix E refers). These forms are being safely stored by the researcher.

3. Avoiding deception of subjects and/or respondents

As Strydom insists, "No form of deception should ever be inflicted on respondents" (2005: 61). In order to comply with this, I neither disguised the real goal of the study nor hid the real function of the actions and experiences that the subjects would go through.
4. I was careful not to violate participants’ privacy/anonymity/ confidentiality. With exception to two, all the other participants gave consent to be named behind whatever contribution they made.

5. An ethical obligation, which was clarified at the outset of this chapter, rested on me to ensure that I was competent and adequately skilled to undertake the investigation I had in mind.

6. The final written report is accurate, objective, clear, and unambiguous and contains all essential information. All due recognition was given to sources consulted and people who collaborated.

7. The debriefing of respondents was carried out when necessary for the purpose of minimising possible emotional or trauma which, may have been brought to the surface and experienced in the process of the research, specifically when negative impacts of the economy on communities of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal were discussed.

1.9. Structure and Outline of content

The contents of this thesis include the following sections or chapters:

Chapter 1: Introduction. It provided the background, personally and academically, to the research and my motivation for undertaking it.

Chapter 2: Development: A review of literature. In this chapter I interrogated relevant literature related to development, development approaches, economic development and so forth to enrich my arguments and positioning. I engaged at a scholarly level with the literature, particularly contributions from authoritative sources, in order to add a new perspective to the topic of LED in Tshwane (S & H). The focus was on searching for answers to the questions: Which approaches towards LED would be most appropriate? And what economic forces marginalise the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal?

Chapter 3: Mission, church and development: In this chapter the focus was placed on how, why and what the church contributes as it participates in a development project. While the church’s perspective was presented, a particular accent was placed on the oikos concept as the
hermeneutic key chosen for this study. The *oikos* is discussed in relation to LED, sustainability and the economic paradigm.

**Chapter 4: A perspective on Tshwane Metropolitan**: In this chapter, a descriptive analysis of Tshwane reflecting particularly on urbanisation, economy, physical and social space, powers and systems in relation to socioeconomic, historical and political realities was provided. The chapter offers a special focus on highlighting assets and resources present in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal which could be used to improve LED.

**Chapter 5: A perspective on the church in Tshwane (S & H)**: In this chapter, I highlighted ecclesiastical characteristics, faith and culture, weaknesses and blind spots of the churches in general and in particular the churches that participated in this research. I also discussed the contemporary relevance and characteristics of township churches in terms of mission orientations and praxes and their potential for community building. I placed emphasis on the church phenomenon of twin cities (i.e. Pretoria and the townships) to highlight the realities of township churches and the motivation for involvement in LED.

**Chapter 6: Narrative accounts from separate groups**: Building on insights gained in chapters 4 and 5 concerning contextual socioeconomic, political and historical analyses as well as praxis matrixes and mission orientations of the churches as described by the church leaders, this chapter concentrates on the narrative accounts of participants from separate groups in relation to LED in the City of Tshwane (S & H).

**Chapter 7: Narrative accounts from the joint group**: In Chapter 6, I presented the narrative accounts of the separate focus group discussions. This chapter is a continuation of these; however, the accounts in it stem from the joint group mini-consultations, ranging from the analysis phase to the way forward phase of the praxis cycle.

**Chapter 8: Interview findings**. In this chapter the findings gathered from individual interviews are presented. Findings highlight perspectives and views of experienced practitioners and leaders about issues related to LED in the City of Tshwane (S & H). In addition, the roles that the townships churches could play are articulated.

**Chapter 9: Discussion, evaluation and theological reflection**: In this chapter, I build on the six aspects/questions for analysis used in the focus group (phase 4): economy, political structures, relationships of power, cultural influences, values, sources of hope; as well as an evaluation of the theological reflection and the plans for action in searching for answers as
articulated by participants pertaining to LED in relation to those six categories of analysis. Answers to the question: “how can / should local churches interact with other economic agents who may be geared towards LED?” are highlighted.

**Chapter 10: Oikomissiology: Reflection and conceptual contribution for the Churches’ contribution to alternative LED in Tshwane (S & H):** This chapter will focus on presenting and discussing, reflectively and conceptually, the ecological dimension of the Christian mission in relation to LED in Tshwane (S & H). The *oikos* concept will be used to challenge misconceptions in missiology so as to broaden the “scope” of the *missio Dei* and other theological concepts in relation to LED to include the whole inhabited world (the *oikumene*) and the entire cosmos.

**Chapter 11: Mission in an African city: Rebuilding local economy through a model project:** In this final chapter; I will propose a transformed mission model with LED as its focus. The model will also focus on presenting an action plan to address socioeconomic issues which affect the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal.

**Chapter 12: Conclusion.** In this chapter, I provided short summaries of each previous sections of the thesis. Some reflections on the praxis cycle, the focus group discussions and the *oikos* will also form part of this chapter. In keeping with the thesis’s goals and findings, this chapter will also include answers as to how the church could broaden its self-understanding and ecclesiology in relation to LED in Tshwane (S & H).
Chapter Two

DEVELOPMENT: A REVIEW OF LITERATURE

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter offers an integrated critical analysis and a summary of findings from a study of relevant literature related to this research. The purpose is: i) to survey, assess and summarise the discussions regarding the concept of development in general and in particular, the concepts of LED, so as to inform the development of this thesis, and ii) to draw on the extensive policy and academic literature to be able to suggest a synthesis sketch for this applied study, which should hopefully inform and lead towards the development of an urban mission strategy with a view to facilitating economic development processes in the City of Tshwane (CoT). Due to the inter-disciplinary nature of this study, I have chosen first to discuss development as a concept (including economic development) in this chapter and secondly, the concepts of church, mission and development in Chapter 3.

In this chapter the review covers development as we have come to understand it. It defines development, its practice and approaches, purpose and goals as well as measurement and concludes by discussing current topical debates and issues.

2.2 DEVELOPMENT

After six decades of circulation, development is a term regarded as a “weasel word”\(^\text{13}\). As mere lip service is paid to it, even at times being demagogically used, and while communities do not experience any tangible improvement in their wellbeing, the term “development” is demeaned. This continues to be a contested term, referring on one hand to the ideal of improvement in people’s wellbeing while, on the other, the reality on the ground is far from ideal, being often dystopian (Bhavnani 2009: 1, see also Szirmai 2015: 2). Schluter (2006) describes development as a journey of economic and social change, but it is often implicitly taken to define the

\(^{13}\) According to the *Cambridge International Dictionary of English*, a “weasel word” is speech intentionally used either to avoid answering a question clearly or to make someone believe something that is not true.
destination as well. Economic growth has been generally regarded as the purpose as well as the means of this change.

Until 1990, the term “development” was used almost exclusively to denote economic development and the factors and processes associated with economic growth. This understanding contends Alkire (2010) in her 2010/01 study, Report on Human Development, was reformed by the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) when Armatya Sen launched the first Human Development Report (HDR). This report unequivocally stated that the ultimate goal of development is to improve the wellbeing of humanity. Thus the term “Human Development” is increasingly becoming predominant in development discourses. Some of the chief reasons for this shift in thinking are, amongst others, what Bhavnani et al have articulated:

A number of development case studies by Munshi and Kurian (2005, 2007), Rowell (1996), Turner (1999) and Tsing (2005) have shown that development as a project that centres growth as its main goal has failed the most vulnerable people of the Third World because of displaced emphasis on varieties of top-down, elite devised “modernisation” strategies, a lack of attention to the central contributions of women and the people of colour, and a disregard for culture. (Bhavnani et al 2009: 2)

The point made above by Bhavnani et al implies that a narrow understanding of development is no longer in resonance with the understanding of many scholars and practitioners [emphasis here and below is mine]. For this reason, the Human Development Reports (HDR) chose to broaden the understanding of development by pointing out its interconnections with themes such as: increasing people’s choices (HDR 1991); people’s participation (HDR 1993); human security (HDR 1994); gender (HDR 1995); economic growth (1996); poverty eradication (1997); consumption (1998); globalisation (1999); human rights (2000); making new technologies work (2001); deepening democracy work in a fragmented world (2002); addressing the Millennium Development Goals (2003); cultural liberty in today’s diverse world (2004); international cooperation (2005); water scarcity (2006); climate change (2007-8) and migration (2009).

14 Human Development will be discussed later in this study as an approach in its own right.
15 Alkire (2010:2) states: “In 1990, the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) launched the first Human Development Report (HDR), and within it, the Human Development Index (HDI). Subsequently, HDRs have been produced nearly every year. The reports apply the concept of human development to diverse themes, such as the environment, gender, poverty, globalisation, cultural liberties and migration. The HDRs also include a statistical index with the HDI and other figures relevant to human development for many countries. The authors include leading academics and practitioners from around the world, as well as UNDP researchers”. See also http://hdr.undp.org/en
Besides HDRs, other scholars (Szirmai 2015, Castle 1995; Rogers 1992; Brookfield 1993; Alkire & Deneulin 2009) have also researched the complexity and multidimensional nature of development. They advocate that consideration should be given to social, political, and cultural factors, in addition to economic ones. There is also a concern with quality of life issues, and an extension of concern from the well-being of the nation, to include the individual’s well-being (Castle 1995: 6). Development has to include a “general upward movement of the social system” (Rogers 1992:93), the building of a “society in which members have equal rights, and equal opportunities, in which all have …a gradually increasing basic level of material welfare” (Szirmai 2015: 1, Brookfield 1993: 45; see also HDR 2000). Development is growth plus change; change in turn is social and cultural as well as economic, and qualitative as well as quantitative (United Nations Development Decade proposals for action 1992: 15). There is also the question of sustainability of growth-focused modernisation-based development which is raised by proponents of post-development and alternative development models (cf. Szirmai 2015:7). These views are addressed in more detail later in the text.

Against the backdrop of the complexity concerning development and its understanding of its meaning, this literature review of related literature examines material that has specific bearing on the topic, commencing with the different facets of development.

2.2.1 Facets\(^{16}\) of development practice and poverty eradication approaches

2.2.1.1 Korten’s four generations of voluntary development action

According to Korten (1990: 91-132) there is a “hierarchy of development” in a continuum of social development which could be described in terms of four generations, i.e. relief and welfare, community development (small-scale, self-reliant local development), sustainable systems development and social movements and global change. The hierarchy starts with local relief and ends with global social movements:

- Relief and welfare: the problem is defined as “shortages or deficiencies” experienced by the beneficiary population, such as food, health care or shelter. The time frame for intervention is “immediate”. The scope for intervention is usually “individual or family”. The chief actor is the “Non-Governmental Organisation (NGO)”. The role of the NGO is

\(^{16}\) I have chosen to use the term facet instead of generation of development, as Korten and Swarts have done, because I consider each one of these facets as being one of the parts of, or opinions regarding, development.
that of “doer”. The management orientation is focussed on “logistics management” and the development education theory which underpins the intervention is “help the starving children” (Korten 1990: 115 – 118)

- Community development: the problem is defined as “local inertia”. The time frame for intervention is the “project’s life”. The scope for intervention is the “neighbourhood or village”. The chief actors are the “NGO plus the community”. The role of the NGO is that of the “mobiliser”. The management orientation is focussed on “project management” while the development education theory which underpins the intervention is “community self-help” (Korten 1990: 118-120).

- Sustainable systems development: the problem is defined as “institutional and policy constraints”. The time frame for intervention is “ten to twenty years”. The scope of intervention is a “region or nation”. The chief actors are “all relevant public and private institutions”. The role of the NGO is that of a “catalyst”. The management orientation focusses on “strategic management”; the development education theory which underpins the intervention comprises “constraining policies and institutions” (Korten 1990: 120-123).

- Social movements and global change: the problem is defined as “inadequate mobilising vision”. The time frame for intervention is the “indefinite future”. The scope of intervention is “national or global”. The chief actors are “loosely defined networks of people and organisations”. The role of the NGO is that of an “activist/educator”. The management orientation focusses on “coalescing and energising self-managing networks”, while the development education theory which underpins the intervention is “spaceship earth” (Korten 1990: 123-125).

2.2.1.2 O’ Gorman’s categorisations

In more or less similar vein, O’ Gorman (1992: 80-81) speaks of five categorisations: Band-Aid, ladder, patchwork, beehive and beacon, of social change with the emphasis on transforming structures of oppression and building a world of justice and dignity for all humans. In the South African context, Swart (2006) endorses an understanding of strategic development involvement that was formulated and articulated first by Korten; yet he builds further on Korten’s views to present his perspectives on the contribution of the work of churches and faith-based
organisations to the development debate. I engage with Swart’s contribution in the second part of this chapter and discuss the interrelation of church and development. For the purpose of description and clarification of these facets I chose to use O’Gorman’s categorisation (1992: 80-81) spelled out above; I have also used her words to highlight the symbols, focus, facilitators’ roles, core actions, resources, responses of the poor, agency appraisal, strengths and weaknesses of each facet.

As O’Gorman (1992: 3-14) explains, the “Band-aid” facet is mainly about reaching out, symbolised by the phrase “if a person is hungry, give her/him a fish”. It focuses on prolonging the survival of the needy poor, held down by inertia and circumstances. Development facilitators in this facet are caring social workers, who give to the poor in a downward, no risk relationship. The core action is distribution of handouts of consumable material goods and relief. In this situation, the response of the poor is mainly that of dependency as non-citizens. Development appraises the success of the intervention by quantifying donations raised and distributed. The strengths of this Band-aid lie in temporarily salvaging communities that find themselves in dehumanising contexts and situations. However, it is weak in that it provides stop-gap solutions which certainly gratify the donor’s generosity but ignore or do very little about the causes of the problem (cf. Korten 1990: 115 – 118).

The “Ladder” facet, writes O’Gorman (1992: 15-26) is about “catching up”. It is symbolised by the phrase “if a person is hungry teach her/him how to fish and give her/him a rod”. It focuses on enabling the poor to accommodate the social and economic systems and overcome ignorance. Development facilitators are concerned facilitators who act in a one way horizontal, no risk relationship. The core action revolves at propagating information and teaching skills. Resources needed often consist of financial and technical aid which is applied to learning outcomes. In this case, the response of the poor leads to individual vertical mobility as second class citizens. This intervention is appraised by means of evaluating the impact of the information dispensed, attitude change and number reached by programmes. The strength of the ladder facet lies in the fact that it provides expanded access to means for productive human development. However, it could be paternalistic and may leave causes untouched (cf. Korten 1990: 118-120)
According to O’Gorman (1992: 27-40) the “Patchwork” facet is illustrated by the “upgrade of local fishing techniques and practices”. It focuses on providing opportunities for the poor for piecemeal modernisation within their context, where committed facilitators walk with the poor in a minimal risk leader-follower relationship. The core action is that of promoting self-help projects. Resources commonly used include credit, loans, seed funding and technical know-how applied to localised socioeconomic projects. The response of the poor is individual integration through projects as follower citizens. This intervention is commonly appraised through measuring the attainment of project goals. One of the key strengths of the patchwork is an improved living standard for segments of the population but it is still weak in that it results in localised patches of development, limited to specific sectors. It may also be uncritical of underlying causes of poverty (cf. Korten 1990: 118-120).

The “Beehive” (honeycomb) facet, contends O’Gorman (1992: 41-50), is symbolised by “supporting grassroots movements to claim the right to a fair share of fishing business”. The focus is on organising the marginalised poor to put pressure for reforms on the elite-controlled socioeconomic and political realities. The development facilitators’ role consists of walking with the poor, struggling for change in a potentially risky community relationship. The core action majors on fostering shared popular values, reflection and action. This facet mobilises local and external resources for community endeavours, which leads to a collective gain of socioeconomic and political space as participant citizens. The impact is appraised by looking at indicators of quality of life of individuals and of group empowerment for reformatory movements. The strength of this facet is that there is a noticeable community process building and bonding among the marginalised to influence social changes. Its weakness lies in the fact that local interest group reform bypasses structural causes (cf. Korten 1990: 120-123)

According to O’Gorman (1992: 52-60): The “Beacon” facet (Transform) strives to “find new basis for labour-life relationships beyond fisheries”. It urges the elite and institutions that control the world wealth and economy to radically shift the self-serving hub of society to new people-centred structures. Facilitators are creative and in covenant with the poor, standing up for a just society in a high risk, trail-blazing relationship. The core action is one of challenging society through confrontation and constructive action. Resources include all human, technical, material and financial assets channelled to the common good. The “Beacon” approach results in
mobilisation of the poor and marginalised, operating in networks for transformation as leadership citizens. It is appraised by evaluating signs of structural changes for just social relationships from the perspective of the impoverished. The strengths of this facet include accountability, stewardship, justice-oriented structures and conditions to choose life. The fact that the process to redirect structures may be uncharted and unfinished is regarded as a weakness of the beacon facet (cf. Korten 1990: 123-125).

Although a minor difference exists in that Korten speaks of four generations and O’Gorman of five facets, they both raise similar issues pertaining to the philosophy and praxis of social development in the world. Korten in his generations grouped together two of the continuum of what O’Gorman referred to as “ladder” and “patchwork”. Admittedly, there are theories and assumptions underlying organisations’ choice of intervention although they are “never made explicit” (Korten 1990: 114). These inform development approaches and strategies as discussed under 2.1.2. While Korten’s four generations speak in depth, and critically, to all sorts of voluntary organisations and people’s organisations involved in voluntary development action, in this thesis and given its focus on the church, I have opted to use O’Gorman’s facets because of her close association with a church-based organisation (i.e. World Vision International).

2.2.1.3 These facets in relation to LED in Tshwane (S & H)

These facets are not necessarily in opposition to one another. As Korten (1990: 113) observes, “each one aims to right a perceived wrong, but implicitly works from different assumptions regarding the nature of the development problem”. A myriad of projects falling into one or two facets of this social development continuum exists in the communities of Tshwane (S & H). What Korten (1990: 115) spoke about regarding the global perspective (when he points out that religious groups have been at the forefront of relief and welfare efforts) is a reality for Tshwane, as this thesis’s findings substantiate in Chapter five. The majority of the churches that participated in this research are involved in relief and welfare as they respond to immediate and visible needs in their communities. The problem with this, writes Korten (1990:118), is that “relief and welfare assistance offer little more than temporary alleviation of the symptoms of underdevelopment and should not be confused with development assistance”. Regardless of this fact, this problem is prevalent in our context.
For example, the Non-Profit Directorate\textsuperscript{17} database shows that there are about 274 Non-Profit Organisations (NPOs) operating in the township of Hammanskraal. Close observation made me realise that nearly 70\% of these fall in the sector of social service, health and religion organisations, majoring in relief and welfare with very little real community development focus. Furthermore, there are very few interventions from the NPO sector that are poised to foster sustainable systems development on the one hand while on the other participating meaningfully in social movements and global change.

Therefore, in this thesis I argue for the kind of LED which should include, depending on specific local realities, all elements of the continuum of social development in a sustainable manner. However, the focus should be on liberation and transformation as the ultimate goals. In the meantime, relief and social services should work to meet the basic needs of the people who are still languishing in poverty. Community development would act to strengthen social infrastructures in such a way as will enable Tshwane to address its own needs. Regarding advocacy and lobbying, the aim would be to create an enabling environment with appropriate policies that would ultimately lead to the formation of organised communities committed to improve and sustain the welfare of all people in Tshwane. As regards liberation and transformation, Tshwane LED has to be “glocal”\textsuperscript{18} by embracing and participating in broad-based and collective actions geared towards the realisation of the vision for healthy communities where services, infrastructures, institutions, leadership, vision, policies, organisations, communities, assets, agency and sustainable livelihoods are present in a practical manner (cf.Porter 2000: 15-34)\textsuperscript{19} which benefits localities. In this “Glocal” LED, the church of Tshwane and its ministries have an overwhelming responsibility in providing a platform for the voices of those who are most affected by the current socio-economic and political crisis facing the CoT. This will be a practical expression of the Christian church’s

\textsuperscript{17} This directorate is located in the Department of Social Development, Government of South Africa. It is responsible for registering non-profit organisations and enforcing compliance with statutory requirements. https://www.google.com/fusiontables/DataSource?docid=1Rpb7O0l7QJg695l6oySJV-FHi_HLo9q5nHLt_fI

\textsuperscript{18} “Glocal” refers to being simultaneously globally and locally-minded; the interests of both spheres are taken into account all the time.

\textsuperscript{19} Michael Porter (2000 15-34) highlights the fact that clusters, or geographic concentrations of interconnected companies, are a striking feature of virtually every national, regional, state, and even metropolitan economy, especially in more advanced nations. The prevalence of clusters reveals important insights about the microeconomics of competition and the role of location in competitive advantage. Porter’s insights resonate with our assumption, i.e. community economic development is possible if we can deal with an entire community in its local community setting (see chapter 1, point 1.7.4).
involvement in mission and LED, inspired by public theology aimed at holistic sustainable transformation and liberation.

Further, I deduce that: depending on the magnitude and nature of a development intervention, the purpose and goals would be one or a combination of relief (band-aid), community development (catch-up and patchwork), advocacy and lobbying (honeycomb) and transformation and liberation (transform). In my practice as a development worker, I have provided relief in disaster and famine relief situations across Southern Africa in South Africa, Mozambique, Zimbabwe, Zambia, Malawi and Lesotho. I have been involved in community development in the Democratic Republic of Congo and in a township called “Stinkwater” in Tshwane. From the year 2000 I became, in partnership with other development organisations and workers, very active in advocacy, lobbying and in strategic partnership for transformation in the global village.

As stated earlier, these facets are underpinned by different philosophies and approaches to development (cf. Korten 1990: 113), some of which are reviewed in the following section.

2.2.2 Philosophies and approaches to development

Rogers (1992) distinguishes two broad categories of approaches: needs-based and exclusion-based. Needs-based philosophy has been under scrutiny by scholars such as Kretzman and McKnight (1993: 14) who argued for an alternative aimed at correcting the perception (i.e. communities in need have nothing to contribute for their own development) embodied in the needs-based philosophy. Consequently, they articulated what is known as an assets-based approach. There is still another approach, which is essentially people-centred human development, pioneered by Sen (1990) since the launch of HDRs by the UNDP. I will now evaluate each one of these approaches in relation to this thesis.

---

20 Needs-based approaches depart from the premise that there are not enough resources (the human and material deficit); therefore these need to be increased. They also assume that the problem lies in poor communities themselves.

21 Exclusion-based approaches argue there are enough resources but some people are excluded from such resources by those who hold control over them. These approaches assume that the problem lies in the whole world and its systems.

22 An assets-based approach consists of building communities from the inside out. It is a path toward finding and mobilising community assets as this is the building block for development.

23 The basic objective of the human development approach is to enable all people to flourish in varied and creative ways. It makes people and their benefits central to development work. This approach was
2.2.2.1. Needs-based approaches

A needs-based approach embodies a number of variances, of which the most commonly used are 1) overcoming poverty by means of growth-focussed strategies and modernisation, social planning, human resource development and community development, and 2) meeting basic human needs (BHN). These approaches have been predominant in South Africa since 1994 within the framework of the RDP. One can observe tangible positive results of these approaches but there are also various weaknesses which this study discusses in the following sections.

2.2.2.1.1 Overcoming poverty through growth-focussed strategies and modernisation

Insights from Alan Rogers (1992), an adult education and development scholar, are helpful in unpacking possible taxonomies of development in this section. The assumption is that poverty is the “cause of backwardness, and so an increase in economic activity and productivity is needed” (Rogers 1992: 92, cf. Szirmai 2015: 2). In order to overcome poverty, strategies such as economic growth models, social planning, Human Resource Development (HRD) and community development are proposed. Each one of these is briefly described in the following lines. It is also argued that the major reason for poverty is lack of, or minimal, industrialisation which is held back by traditional patterns of production and thinking. Therefore, the main strategy to achieve economic growth is modernisation, of techniques and equipment, of attitudes and social structures. Hence the process of development focuses on “catching-up” with the richer communities. This is illustrated in the following sketch\textsuperscript{24}:

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{l|l|l}
\textbf{Problem} & \textbf{Process} & \textbf{Goal} \\
Poverty and backwardness & Growth & prosperity \\
& modernisation & \\
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

2.2.2.1.1 Economic growth models

**Economic growth models** of development focus on accumulating more capital and investment, more technical innovations, more modern forms of communication and transport, more produce to be sold in the market and abroad, more power supplies, more water and fertilisers, better farming practices and crop varieties, all of which will lead to an increased gross

\textsuperscript{24} I owe the insights about illustrating the following subsections in sketches to Rogers (1992).
domestic product (GDP). Accumulation of wealth is regarded as an end in itself (Rogers 1992: 93, see also Szirmai 2015: 4 - 5) while “science is seen as the saviour” of less industrialised communities (Szirmai 2015: 131 – 158). Consequently, economic growth models at national level in particular tend to be sectoral, rational and based on modern scientific processes and attitudes. At the local level, prosperity is the goal: the focus of the process is one of accumulation of wealth through upgrading of skills and moving from a traditional to a modern form of society. The main aim is economic improvement.

The distribution of this accumulated wealth is supposed to be distributed through “trickle down” or “bottom-up” effects. Through the first, it is believed that the process of economic growth through national planning would start from the centre and lead to a “trickling down” or “spreading out” effect. Through the second, it has been realised that designing certain economic sectors as key ones relegated other activities (such as concern for ecology, social justice and concern for social issues) to becoming marginal to development. As a result, in many parts of Africa we observe urbanisation without development – with serious implications for the environment and community health (Kwasi et al. 2005: 465–500). The neglect of these concerns undermined sustainable development which “advocates for increased human interactions in the areas of production, trade and commerce, and socio-cultural adaptations” (Kwasi et al. 2005: 466). The trickle down method was replaced by a bottom-up approach, developing regional economies rather than sectors. This has led to a growing awareness of the local and regional area as the best place for development, although the goal has still remained increased economic growth and the tool is central planning guided by a neo-liberal policy (Rogerson 2003: 54). Of importance and with regard to developing economies such as South Africa’s, the emphasis needs to be the “development of pro-poor LED interventions” (Rogerson 2003: 55).

According to the Growth and Development Strategy for the City of Tshwane (2005), the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality’s economy, as is the case with other metropolitan economies in South Africa, has adopted a bottom-up approach which is closely aligned to the national agenda (see Rogerson 2000: 398) The said approach is meant to place poverty alleviation at the centre of LED interventions. Nevertheless, I submit that the alignment to the national agenda renders these local economies powerless in addressing poverty in their areas. To my mind, this is limiting the potential really to express the aspirations of Tshwane in meaningful ways. In examining this strategy closely, I realised that the Tshwane LED model is more or less a replica of the national model, which has at the core of its strategy economic growth based on infrastructural development (cf. Toerien 2005: 1). I delve deeper regarding the
economic model and make-up of Tshwane in Chapter 3, where I draw a correlation between this model and poverty. The other growth-focused strategy used in both Tshwane and South Africa is social planning.

2.2.2.1.2 Social planning

According to Mengin (1988 cited in Rogers 1992: 97) social planning makes the whole planned development social, that is, directing it in such ways that it should bring about maximum improvement in the conditions in which people live. Variables expressing the conditions in which people live are put in place as regards the final aims of development plans (cf. Szirmai 2015: 5 – 6). Plans in turn then serve as criteria for the allocation of resources.

Social planning is one of the tools used in South Africa to add social goals to the economic goals of the overall National Development Plan (NDP) launched on 11 November 2011. Its use is supposed to be more consistent as it is being driven by the Office of the President. The implementation of and ways of thinking about social planning led to a correlation with HRD and community development approaches, described below.

2.2.2.1.3 Human Resource Development

Human Resources Development programmes refer to development initiatives focussed on capacity building of communities through training and continuous education (Szirmai 2015: 238 – 244). They fall within the community development generation. They are usually directed at three main objectives, i.e. 1) securing employment: initial employment for the unemployed or increased opportunities for the under-employed through vocational training, 2) increasing productivity of the employed: updating or more advanced courses but also with inputs from technology and 3) achieving economic self-reliance: equipping those who work with the necessary skills and knowledge to enable them to take full advantage of the resources available to them. In the context of adult education, HRD could cover almost any activity which would help “to make for an efficient and contented work-force, tapping and releasing their potential talents and innate initiative and innovativeness” (Rogers 1992: 95). HRD is closely connected to the notion of education for development, which is embedded in modernisation ideology (Szirmai 2015: 240). Education in the context of human resource development is there to serve the interests of progress. Korten (1990: 119) sums up, [to] “develop the economic resource value of the person, and the economic system will provide the needed opportunities for gainful employment”.

64
Nonetheless, there are a number of problems which can be associated with the HRD model. Firstly, on the one hand, people are regarded merely as a resource, a means to achieve an end and not as ends in themselves. In this sense, HRD could be “dehumanising, a dressed-up form of one set of people using another set of people for their own ends” (Rogers 1992:95). Korten (1990: 119) suggests that policy makers and authorities give little more than lip service to self-reliance and, in fact, build long-term dependence on the assisting organisation”. This is what President Julius Nyerere, President of Tanzania (1967)\(^ {25} \), objected to in his explanation about of what development is and what its aims are, i.e. done by humans and for humans. In short, Nyerere’s views are in support of the human community as being central to the notion of development. Sen’s views (1990, 1991, and 1992) concurred with his, as well as with the Human Development Reports’ position, in that the enhancement of capabilities, choices and wellbeing of communities is or should be the ultimate aim of development. Secondly, on the other hand, HRD could also become a slogan, a form of words or phrases that have come to mean everything and therefore ceased to mean anything.

Thirdly, I observed that HRD interventions focus narrowly on technological training in order to improve productivity and to realise economic goals, to the detriment of maintaining the social fibre and values essential for cohesion and collective humanity. A case in point in our context in Tshwane is that BMW workers who have acquired and continue to acquire advanced technological ability, which comes with significant financial benefits, have less time to invest in community, most likely due to their work commitment. In short, the HRD intervention which benefited an individual worker of BMW might not necessarily impact positively on the rest of the community. Generally, one of the negative consequences is the fact that people who are not capacitated with modern skills are further marginalised as they cannot access meaningful jobs because they do not have professional qualifications. As a result they are plunged into poverty and unemployment. Nevertheless, for a development project to be sustainable and effective, HRD is an important ingredient because a well trained and equipped labourer is important for sophisticated tasks. Therefore, what is needed is an integrated development project geared to HRD as well as eradicating poverty and unemployment on one hand and fostering self-reliance on the other as the goals for sustainable community development.

2.2.2.1.4 Community Development

Through the influence of social planning, community development initially emerged as an approach which should encourage whole communities to engage in self-reliant socioeconomic activities. During 1940s, “community development included citizens’ participation in decision making and problem solving” (Rogers 1992: 96). Community development is:

The process by which the efforts of the people themselves are united with those of government authorities to improve economic, social and cultural conditions of communities, to integrate those communities into the life of the nation and enable them to contribute fully to national progress. (UNESCO 1956: 1)

As time has passed, the UNESCO definition of community development has more general, especially as linked with governmental agencies and programmes. Community development became part of government portfolios, staffed by public servants with a background in social sciences and development studies as “bridge makers” between government programmes and local communities (cf. Szirmai 2015: 487 – 488). Faith based community development interventions have also tended to attract individual and private donors.

In many instances, this close association with government and donor structures meant that community development interventions become unable to confront local and global power relationships. As Korten (1990: 120) put it, “it has become evident…that local power structures are maintained by protective national and international systems against which even the strongest…organisations are relatively powerless”. I expand on this thought in relation to the international politics of global development later in the text.

2.2.2.1.5 Overcoming poverty through growth-focused development: As related to South Africa

In the light of international discussions, it is apparent that international systems which promote economic growth models have been the drivers of our development approach (cf. Szirmai 2015: 549 – 600). Generally, growth-focused approaches are embedded in modernisation, whether through central economic planning or through social planning or through HRD or community development. This has in many cases proved to be detrimental to the welfare of the (rural) poor, the argument being that it is not the lack of growth but its very occurrence that has led to deterioration in the conditions of the (rural) poor. Moreover, growth does not necessarily
alleviate or eradicate poverty. Furthermore, as Korten (1990: 120) remarks, “the organising efforts of most non-governmental organisations are too limited and fragmented to make any consequential or lasting impact on these large structures”, i.e. national and international power structures. Nonetheless, the economic growth model received “revived” support from the Brundtland Report (1987) on sustainable development which reasserted it as the goal of development but emphasised that it should be growth which respects limits to environmental resources. This seems to be the position of most countries that have opted for the economic growth model of development. At least, this is what is stipulated in policy documents.

With particular reference to post-apartheid South Africa, in 1994, the government launched the RDP with a dual mandate of a balanced economic growth and sustainable development; however, it faced numerous difficulties such as “incompetent public service managers, racially-tinged pessimism, a massive budget deficit and an enormous deficit in education, training and experience of black South Africans” (Jeffery 2010: 242). Arebghesola (2012: 253) adds other constraints which were largely influenced largely by globalising forces (i.e. the government’s inability to generate the necessary resources to finance the programme, its failure to establish an industrial policy and lack of compatibility between the political ideology of the ANC-led alliance and the adopted economic orthodoxy (mainly trade liberalisation and privatisation). Jeffery (2010: 245) further adds “A sudden collapse in the value of the Rand led to the RDP’s failure to stimulate growth and signalled the necessity for a change in policy direction”. Nevertheless, RDP implementation was carried out, especially in relation to meeting basic needs, as discussed in the next section.

The then Minister of Finance, Trevor Manuel, introduced the Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR) programme in 1996 as a strategy for rebuilding and reshaping the economy in “keeping with the goals set in the RDP” (Jeffery 2010: 245; Arebghesola 2012: 1254). The government assumed that GEAR would create the “needed enabling environment to facilitate Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) inflow” (Arebghesola 2012: 1254) for economic growth and poverty alleviation. The pursuit of FDI, coupled with policies that favour faster economic growth, were chief elements of GEAR and shaped the South African economy. After GEAR came more growth-focused policies to sustain expansion through new transformation legislation in support of free enterprise, aimed at the liberation of the poor. However, the unemployment crisis worsened in 2005 because “jobs were shed by the hundreds of thousands

---


27 Trevor Manuel was the minister of finance in South Africa from 1995 - 2008.
rather than created“ (Wray 2001: 40). Part of the reason, suggests Hirsch (2005: 105-106), lay in the Asian, Russian and Brazilian crises in 1997 and 1998 which eroded confidence in developing markets (see also Szirmai 2015: 591 – 599). The unemployment rate in terms of the strict definition (this refers to the exact number of unemployed people actively looking for a job) was then 26% up from 17% in 1995. On the expanded definition (which included all those discouraged workers not actively seeking jobs) it was 40%, up from 27% in 1995 (Hirsch 2005: 170).

Despite protests from organised labour, with the issue of unemployment of the masses at the core, the rate of economic growth was accelerated, rising from 2.7% in 2001 to 4.9% in 2004 (Survey 2008/09:92, OECD 2007:487-488). Accordingly, the government acknowledged that this was an unbalanced growth because the economy failed to create significant employment for the poor, leading to incidents of violent protests as well as aggravated crime and unemployment (Aregbeshola 2010: 2). Nevertheless, the government did not abandon growth-focused policies. To correct this imbalance, the Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative-South Africa (ASGISA) was announced in August 2005. A year later ASGISA was operational, with the intention of helping the State attain its core objectives of halving poverty and unemployment by 2014 (Jeffery 2010:255). Although these objectives have remained elusive, the government launched the New Growth Path in 2012: another growth-focused strategy to accelerate the creation of employment and alleviate poverty. Nonetheless, the country is still experiencing a high proportion of unemployment and poverty. From the above, it is clear that economic growth remained a dominant feature of the South African economy from 1994 to 2012. The country realised steady but unbalanced growth which has bred massive unemployment, especially in peripheral townships such as H and S.

2.2.2.1.2 Meeting Basic Human Needs (BHN) as an approach

At the core of this approach is the argument that we need increased wealth, not as an end in itself, but in order to provide better health, better welfare, a better environment, a fairer way of life for the people (Szirmai 2015: 5; Manuel 1998; Rogers 1992: 98). The BHN approach was pioneered by Streeten et al (1981), Stewart (1985) and the International Labour Organisation (1977). Its argument is sketched as follows:

\[ \text{Development intervention} \rightarrow \text{Economic growth} \rightarrow \text{“Better lives” (health, social welfare, environmental)} \]
Green (1979) summarised one widely agreed list which centres on five clusters of BHN: 1) personal consumer goods: food, clothing and shelter as the minimum required to sustain life; 2) general access to minimum physical and social services, such as a good water supply, sanitation, preventive and curative medicine, energy for light, cooking, heating or cooling. It is argued that education is also a minimum social service; 3) productive employment of individuals, families or communal units, yielding high enough output and fairly distributed rewards so that they may both contribute to and benefit from the supply of goods and services; 4) physical, human and technological infrastructure and capacity necessary to provide goods and services and 5) the opportunity to take part in decisions about social and economic policies and about the ways these policies are carried out. However, scholars such as Chambers (1983), Rogers (1992) and Stewart (1985) argue that there is no general consensus of on these needs because some people's basic needs might be regarded by others as being relative.

Due to constraints alluded to in the previous section, the RDP in South Africa is now largely a BHN intervention coupled with infrastructure development. However, it is apparent that this “welfare economics” approach to development does not appear to come to grips with the problem of welfare in any effective manner. One of the reasons could be that “over the last 16 years the state has struggled with structural challenges that require socio-economic and institutional change” (The Presidency 2008). This is why “there is a renewed interest in the idea of developmental state. Current interest also reflects a broader shift in thinking about the economic functions of the state following the global financial crisis” (Turok 2010: 497). Basic human needs might come to mean “minimum physical needs” which is problematic (Rogers 1992: 100). A project aimed at meeting BHN will do little to promote self-reliance unless careful steps are taken to avoid dependency. One of the biggest dangers of a BHN approach is that it might lead development intervention to reach a plateau. Chambers elaborates further on this point of view:

It is sometimes felt that once development has met these basic needs, there is no further call for development. Meeting identified needs could be taken as the end of the process; development thus becomes a terminal concept. But development by definition is never-ending, a continued pattern directing change towards particular goals which the people increasingly set and undertake for themselves. It is difficult to see how people can come to meet their own needs, set their own goals, control their own development from a programme of BHN (Chambers 1983: 146).

Chambers is right in what he states above. The South African experience is an example: it seems as if the RDP (which was essentially a BHN programme) process has unearthed many
other community needs such as (the need for) community organisation, networking, advocacy and lobbying which are crucial for directing change towards particular development goals. This process is never ending. Additionally, the pioneers of the BHN approach still argue that BHN is not centred on the possessions of commodities. It was rather concerned with providing all human beings, particularly the poor and deprived, with opportunities for a full life (Streeten et al 1981). Sadly, the BHN approach we have come to experience in South Africa largely concerns material goods, while its implementers, mainly government officials, behave as if all basic human needs of a particular community are met as soon as infrastructural projects are successfully completed in that community. In this thesis, the BHN approach is supported only in so far as it is a strategic step in the continuum of development aiming at liberation and transformation.

2.2.2.2 Exclusion-based approaches

These approaches emerged together with the liberation and emancipation ideologies of the 1970s and 1980s. The key argument is that subjects of development should no longer be viewed as deprived, in need of some form of outside assistance, but as oppressed, excluded from the sources of power (Goulet 1975; Nerfin 1977; Nyerere 1974). For so long, they have been dependent on others for their survival and wellbeing while they were still oppressed, disempowered and excluded from contributing meaningfully to their own development. Thus, change agents are encouraged to advocate and opt for counter exclusion strategies which promote meaningful participation such as self-reliance, liberation and empowerment for participation in this approach.

2.2.2.2.1 Self-reliance (not dependency)

Self-reliance (not dependency) was certainly perceived as an ideal way of thinking about development since it attempted to reinterpret all concepts, including modernisation. It argued that community members should not ask others to build in one community what can be seen in the West but rather build what is appropriate to one's own community, its past and current traditions. Self-reliance is focussed on reversing the ills caused by dependency. Korten (1990: 120) argues, “…the more substantial need is to insure the access of the poor to the fishing grounds and markets that local elites control”.

According to Goulet (1975: 4) self-reliance enables less developed communities to use, as they feel appropriate, the help and resources of the developed communities. The notion of validation of indigenous knowledge systems which are pro development emerged with the concept of self-reliance. This in turn led to a
development of a subfield of study known as “Appropriate Technology” (AT) in development studies. Within the self-reliance framework AT is expected to maximise the use of local materials and knowledge for improving community welfare and local economic development. To achieve this, community institutions such as churches and religious organisations, educational, economic, administrative and political have to be regarded as assets for self-reliant development geared towards liberation.

2.2.2.2 Liberation (not oppression)

In tandem with self-reliance, liberation (not oppression) became a central goal in the development movement. It is assumed that liberation from oppressing powers of socioeconomic, political and ideological ideas will on the one hand “trigger” development in poor communities and on the other enhance self-reliance (see HDR 2007/8: 24). However, a liberation-focused strategy was and is resisted by the powerful and rich elite within those communities. The elite who benefit from a dependency relationship stand in the way of progress towards self-reliance in order to protect their selfish interest, especially now in the era of globalisation. Liberation-focused development is perceived as a threat to the elite because it is a process of assisting the oppressed to take action for themselves. I return to this argument later in discussing the politics of international development. Self-reliant and liberated communities are supposed to be empowered to participate fully in their development. As HDR (2007/8:24) rightly states, development is “about expanding people’s real choice and substantive freedoms – the capabilities – that enable them to lead lives that they value”.

Structural change is therefore an imperative for long-lasting development (Szirmai 2015: 5). Since existing systems tend to be hostile towards, rather than supportive of, such initiatives [i.e. change policies for liberation], “it is essential that such systems be changed” (Korten 1990: 120). This requires strategic interventions which foster empowerment for participation.

2.2.2.3 Empowerment for participation

Empowerment for participation in development addresses the issue of marginalisation and enhances ownership. Human development is therefore a process of enhancing those human capabilities (see HDR 2000) necessary for empowerment, which leads to active participation (Szirmai 2015: 6). It is argued that some of the main causes of underdevelopment still remain marginalisation and disempowerment. These should be addressed by empowering and enabling the participation of the poor so that they are able critically to engage the structures and systems
of power in ways that lead to true and meaningful development. Nyerere (1967), through the Arusha Declaration of Tanzania’s ANU Party Guidelines, contended that development means both the elimination of oppression, exploitation, enslavement and humiliation and the promotion of independence and human dignity. From experience, I have observed that when communities achieve independence (i.e. self-reliance) and realise their human dignity, they become emancipated and actively participate in their development.

In summary, the two approaches evaluated thus far, i.e. the BHN and the exclusion-based approach to development, shed light on different ways of considering and undertaking development. The former is rooted in the modernisation ideology and is the most commonly used one in the developing world, including South Africa (specifically Tshwane) as earlier highlighted. However, it has an intrinsic weakness in that it starts with “what people need”. The emphasis on the need puts communities on a course which suggests that “their saviour” and solutions have to come from somewhere else. This emphasis on need paralyses local creativity and imagination to the point where communities are made to believe that there is very little hope for development unless an outsider comes to their rescue. Another fundamental weakness of the BHN approach is overemphasis on people’s needs to the detriment of the needs of non-humans in a particular environment. Drawing from Warmback’s oikotheology, Van Schalkwyk (2008: 9) rightly points out [that] “sustainable human communities can only develop when we recognise that we are dependent on the survival of the earth’s ecosystems for our own survival”. Thus, in this thesis, I endorse meeting BHN in the continuum of socioeconomic development as far as this is done in harmony with the ecosystem. In short, I promote meeting those needs within the oikos (God’s rules for the economy) framework. In this sense, I advocate for an economy “which provides us with a reasonably comfortable life style while operating in harmony with the natural world” (see 1.7.5 and Wood 1992: 1).

The latter promotes self-reliance, emancipation, participation and empowerment. The use of AT and indigenous knowledge, for example, is crucial for coming up with local, thought-through solutions to local problems or challenges for development. Yet, as argued in the foregoing, all these (self-reliance, emancipation, participation and empowerment) should be achieved as far as is possible in harmony with everyone and everything including the natural world (cf. Suderman 1998: 17)

Each one of these two approaches plays an important role in the process of development. O’Gorman’s categorisation and Korten’s generations of development presented earlier in this
chapter refer. They are not to be considered in isolation but are able to work effectively if integrated in practice because each does not defeat the purpose of the other’s approach. For the sake of harmony, I contend in this thesis that grassroots institutions such as the churches could champion the causes of sustainable LED as being inspired by the principles of God’s economy which, in my opinion, integrate all the facets or generations of development in harmony with the oikos rules. The assets-based approach, promoted by Kretzman and McKnight (1993), attempts to integrate elements of BHN while it enhances participation at the same time.

2.2.2.3 Assets-based approach

According to Kretzmann and McKnight (1993), this approach to development is a path toward finding and mobilising a community’s assets. It insists on beginning with a clear commitment to discovering a community’s capacities and assets, offering an alternative to the needs approach which is commonly used in development circles.

This alternative path promotes the development of policies and activities based on the capacities, skills and assets of the poor and their neighbourhoods. The assumption is that even the poorest neighbourhood is a place where individuals and organizations represent resources upon which to rebuild (...) that the key to neighbourhood regeneration, then, is to locate all the available local assets, to begin connecting them with one another in ways that multiply their power and effectiveness, and to begin harnessing those local institutions that are not yet available for local development purposes (Kretzmann & McKnight 1993: 1).

This approach applies three interrelated principles: 1) start with what is present in the community, 2) be internally focussed by necessity and 3) be relationship-driven in outlook. These principles make this approach sound and stable because considered together, they enhance the possibility on one hand of an endogenous and self-reliant development which takes seriously the opportunities and the challenges of a local community with its assets and, on the other, of building and rebuilding the relationships between and among local residents, local associations and local institutions (Kretzmann & McKnight 1993: 14).

This thesis is in agreement with the capacity and assets based approach in the sense that the process of development has to start with what is present within communities. This does not mean ignoring the prevailing globalisation agenda and its demands. Rather, it should strategically be internally focussed in the global market. It has to be strong on relationship building and rebuilding within the locality – its residents, its associations and its institutions.
False dichotomies (physical and spiritual, religious and secular, etc.) inherited with modernity fall away as different sectors are related and share a common purpose, that is, working for the welfare of the city of Tshwane (S & H). An asset based LED, especially its practical process, is discussed in more detail later in various sections of this thesis. For the moment, it is important to say that the genius of the asset based approach lies in taking human and non-human beings as the most important assets for development in any community. In this sense, I argue in this thesis for an asset based LED which relies on human, social, natural and any other capital for its effective functioning. This is to say: real development is about developing humans to be liberated and transformed in harmony with nature so that they can contribute to their own sustainable ongoing development. Further, I contend that this sustainable ongoing development is only achievable within a framework which complies with the oikos (God’s rules for the economy). Furthermore, I concur with the view expressed in The Oxford Declaration on Christian Faith and Economics that this sustainable asset, based ongoing development, has to prevent “human aggression toward creation which stems from a false understanding of creation and the human role in it” (1990: clause 4). Essentially, this declaration calls the church (Christians and church ministries) to point out the challenges of “selfish individualism which neglects human community and rigid collectivism which stifles human freedom” (1990: clause 4). The problem with these expressions of two opposite ideologies (i.e. selfish individualism and rigid collectivism) is that they “have a view of the world with humanity at the centre which reduces material creation to mere instruments” (1990: clause 4). Hence, in this thesis I argue for a sustainable asset based LED approach which could promote both community (humans and non-humans in harmony) and freedom (i.e. a human development approach).

2.2.2.4 Human Development approach

Alkire (2010) discussed Human Development: definitions, critiques and related concepts such as the Millennium Development Goals, human rights, human security, happiness, inequality, economic development and environmental sustainability in her Human Development Research Paper 2010/01. She highlights that the notion at the root of the Human Development (HD) approach is “people are the real wealth of nations” (Alkire 2010: 12) and “people must be at the centre of all development” (Human Development Report 1990: iii). The contents of most of
these Human Development Reports\textsuperscript{28} suggest that the basic objective of development is to enable all people to flourish in varied and creative ways. But in the haste to create economic growth and financial wealth, this is often, and remarkably, overlooked in practice. Human development makes the centrality of people explicit. I submit that HD takes seriously what Adam Smith articulated when he argued that "No society can surely be flourishing and happy, of which the far greater part of the members are poor and miserable" (Smith 1863).

Thus, HD contains three components: capabilities, process freedoms and principles of justice. According to Alkire (2010), it is not a case of one size fits all; it is flexible and responsive and offers people more opportunities while fostering their ability to shape their own lives and advancing justice across society, both at present and in the future. This is clearly articulated in the definition\textsuperscript{29} below.

Human development aims to enlarge people’s freedoms to do and be what they value and have reason to value. In practice, HD also empowers people to engage actively in the development of our shared planet. It is people-centred. At all levels of development, HD focuses on essential freedoms: enabling people to lead long and healthy lives, to acquire knowledge, to be able to enjoy a decent standard of living and to shape their own lives. Many people have these freedoms in and of themselves; they are also powerful means to other opportunities.

HD also encompasses other worthwhile freedoms associated with human well-being in both developing and industrial nations. The emphasis and particularities vary but often include secure, safe and meaningful livelihoods; caring and dignified relationships; protection against crime and violence; artistic, cultural and spiritual activities; participation in political and community activities; self-respect; and emotional well-being.

HD is development by the people, of the people and for the people, since they, both poor and rich, as individuals and in groups, create human development. Thus, HD can be said to empower people to be responsible and innovative actors. Because it views them not as passive victims but as entrepreneurs and active agents, it assists them to help themselves.

\textsuperscript{28} A Human Development Report has been published each year by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) since its inception in 1990. The UNDP undertook to produce an annual report on the human dimension of development. The 1990 report was the first such effort. The reports are prepared by a team of experts from the UNDP and by a panel of consultants.

\textsuperscript{29} This definition draws on a summary written by Alkire (2010: 2-3) in structure and wording.
HD sets priorities among goals using several principles at the same time. Commonly used principles include poverty reduction, equity, efficiency, voice and participation, sustainability, respect for human rights and fostering the common good:

Human development is multidimensional and its components are interconnected. Thus analyses and policies to advance human development take a holistic view. They identify how powerful means such as economic growth best advance human development across time. They clarify the sequence and type of investments that expand key capabilities most effectively. And they engage in periodic public debate about values and priorities. (Alkire 2010: 2-3)

In comparison with the other approaches discussed earlier, HD as explained and defined above comprises elements of needs-based, exclusion-based and assets-based approaches. HD speaks and seeks to address needs, deals with issues related to exclusion and exploitation and aims at empowering people by enlarging their capabilities in all spheres of life. Its comprehensiveness and holistic nature befit the kind of LED being promoted in this thesis for Tshwane (S & H), because it has the well-being of people always in mind, but in a sustainable, creative and liberating manner. With reference to economic growth, HD went beyond income and growth to cover the full flourishing of all human capabilities. In the words of the HDR (1996: 49) it emphasised the “importance of putting people – their needs, their aspirations, their choices and their opportunities – at the centre of the development effort” in harmony with nature.

This new approach, introduced 25 years ago, for advancing human wellbeing within the “limits of nature’ concurs with our argument in this thesis. The United Nations Development Programme (2015) summarises: the dimensions of Human Development are twofold i.e. **directly enhancing human abilities** (by fostering long and healthy life, knowledge and decent standard of living) and **creating conditions for human development** (by fostering participation in political and community life, environmental sustainability, human security and rights and gender equality). Of importance in this approach is the combination of development and sustainability together. This is a very important shift in the sense that care of the environment is taken into account in the development project. Development plus sustainability in the local economy of Tshwane (S & H) is what I argue for in this research. This is attainable only if **oikos** rules and the principles for sustainable communities highlighted by Woods (1992) and Gardner

---

(2003) are adhered to and applied. These principles (see also 1.7.5) are in tandem with these rules, and include:

- everything connects: the biosphere is a single entity
- beauty: encouraging creativity in the way we live and produce our "bread"
- choosing an economy i.e., evaluating the performance of the economy in terms of the long-term well-being of both human and other-than-human beings living in it
- the economy as an organic process: it is not only influenced from the outside, but in the first place must be formed from the inside, through the actions of each one of us, to the benefit of all within a local economic system, especially the vulnerable and marginalised
- work: an economy based on sound work ethics and aimed at job creation brings about self-worth and self-development to people
- Co-operation: co-operation would be emphasised over competition.

The church in Tshwane (S & H), I argue in this thesis, is an asset which could play a vital role in fostering this type of LED in keeping with the principles of sustainable communities tabled here.

I will return to these principles to measure development in Tshwane (S & H) later in the text.

2.2.3 Measuring development and poverty reduction

According to Davids et al (2005:38-45), the following prevailing measures could be distinguished at the end of the 20th century in South Africa and elsewhere in the world: 1) The income perspective; 2) The basic needs perspective; 3) The social exclusion perspective; 4) The sustainable livelihoods perspective and 5) the human development perspective. Each one of these perspectives measures a particular view of poverty; however, some overlap and contain elements of the other, but still have a distinctive emphasis.

- The *income perspective* describes poverty in terms of lack of household income and individual income. It uses absolute measures as indicators (Jones 1999: 11) such as poverty in terms of extent and extreme and absolute poverty. It refers to extreme deprivation where the basic needs for survival cannot be met by a household (Sachs
2005: 20): these communities are unable to feed, clothe and shelter themselves and consequently risk death (Burkey 1996: 3-4). Communities in extreme and absolute poverty are referred to as the poorest of the poor and are incapable of meeting their basic needs by themselves, the most critical symptom of which is malnutrition (Harrison 1993). They experience chronic hunger, lack rudimentary shelter, lack potable drinking water and sanitation, are unable to access health care and cannot afford education for some or all of their children (Serr 2004). With this perspective, relative poverty is spoken of as referring to matters of uneven appropriate distribution of goods and opportunities, unequal quality of life, limited social participation; citizenship and empowerment.

- The basic needs perspective describes poverty as the absence of access to basic services or means to meet basic needs and the inability to attain a minimum standard of living (Jones 1999: 9). It is assumed that problems of poverty will be solved by provision of facilities or services. It is also presumed that if services exist, all poor people will have equal access, whereas the reality is different. In South Africa for example, some communities might receive acceptable municipal services but these are still beyond the reach of the majority of the population due to poverty and unemployment. A neighbourhood with electricity is no guarantee that each household in that neighbourhood will have decent access to electricity. A basic needs perspective easily disregards the fact that poverty is usually a series of interlinked difficulties (Jones 1999: 10). I have observed in my practice that basic needs approaches are most effective if they are designed by, with and for the poor.

- The social exclusion perspective measures poverty in terms of exclusion from benefiting or enjoying the general prosperity of society (Davids et al 2005). According to Collins English Dictionary (2011), social exclusion is the failure of society to provide certain individuals and groups with those rights and benefits normally available to its members, such as employment, adequate housing, health care, education and training and so forth. It is also the process through which individuals or groups are wholly or partially excluded from full participation in the society in which they live. Exploitation, domination, oppression and alienation are regarded as the main causes of exclusion (Davids et al 2005: 40). Indicators of exclusion emphasise political, social and economic components as well as gender and environmental components of poverty and equality. This exclusion is manifested through different forms of poverty:
Poverty of understanding (due to poor education, lack of access to good education, lack of recognition of innate knowledge, skills, wisdom and resources), Poverty of participation (due to social, economic, political exclusion or isolation, marginalisation and discrimination), Poverty of idleness/recreation (ensues from the necessity to work constantly to survive, little free time or relaxation that results in peace of mind), Poverty of creation (due to lack of opportunity/choice to work, produce, design and invent), Poverty of identity (due to imposition of alien values, loss of language, customs, lack of social rhythms, forced migrations and exile), Poverty of freedom (due to lack of security/protection, income, rights, self-determination, legal protection, etc and Poverty of transcendence or spirituality (their spirituality is not recognised or it is ridiculed and they are prevented from public worship. (Davids et al 2005: 42)

- The sustainable livelihoods perspective regards poverty as multi-dimensional. According to De Haan et al (2002: 1) sustainable livelihoods place households and their members at the centre and focus on households as livelihoods. This perspective highlights considerations such as that all poor people are not impoverished in the same way but that poverty differs from place to place and person to person. This perspective focuses on the assets and strengths and the vulnerability of people in coping with hardship and maintaining the quality of life they have achieved. It is people-centred and builds on the available assets or capital (human, natural, social and political, physical and financial capital) and requires that policy makers and practitioners pursue the betterment of human welfare in consistent with the sustainable use of the environment (see World Commission on Environment and Development, 1987).

- The human or people centred perspective\(^3\) in the measurement of poverty emphasises a holistic understanding of poverty that reflects the collective and individual perceptions and experiences of the poor. It interprets poverty as “all that holds people back” from a full human life, or the extent to which human needs to live a long and healthy life are unmet. It includes the absence or limitations of choice in meeting human needs, e.g. access to education, upholding of human rights and the security of political and social freedoms (Hope & Timmel 1995; Davids et al 2005: 40).

From the foregoing, it is apparent that a holistic understanding of poverty is therefore crucial and essential in development in order to deal with the “human face” (Louw 2007: 267) suffering from

\(^3\) The human or people centred perspective in the measurement of poverty is not the same as the human development approach that I discussed earlier. This one here is an instrument, a tool used in the measurement of poverty.
a deprivation trap. The fact is that poverty never occurs in isolation; it is rather an interactive system of material poverty, physical weakness, isolation, vulnerability and powerlessness (Chambers 1983: 103-139). It is on the one hand oppression and a culture of silence (poor are oppressed by the more powerful and their own limited knowledge and poverty) (Freire 1972: 133-134) and on the other, unmet fundamental needs of subsistence, protection and affection which if extended beyond a threshold, could generate further pathologies (Max-Neef et al.1989: 21; see also Hope & Timmel 1984 (1): 87).

Measuring development and poverty reduction is a recommended practice in public, governmental and non-governmental services for planning and evaluation (Szirmai 2015: 12). However, I contend that instruments used are often singular (i.e. attending to a particular issue) and their findings are generalisations which are inadequate to indicate the complexity of poverty. For example, there are many reasons for the persistence of poverty in townships of Tshwane in the midst of economic growth which a particular instrument will not necessarily measure. In Tshwane, economic growth is linked to good market opportunities (such as car manufacturing) from which the poor remain disconnected although the government, through taxation, makes the connection via sound nutrition, health and adequate education, and the like. An instrument measuring poverty in Tshwane might reach the general conclusion that the city is realising a steady economic growth although a sizeable number of people are still living in poverty. These generalisations should be avoided and due attention accorded to individual local circumstances for an accurate understanding of poverty per people category. Hence, the need for an alternative LED for Tshwane which will address the specific issues present in this context with specific measurement instruments appropriate for the city and not a “one size fits all” development programme and measures.

Further, it is obvious that poverty is a “diverse and dynamic concept (…) there is no universal definition” for it (Jansen et al. 2015:151). Hence, there is a variety of economic and social indicators commonly used by development practitioners and scholars to define poverty. Economic indicators used to define poverty include: Gross Domestic Product (GDP) (Mohr 2004: 1), Poverty lines (International Poverty Line or the Poverty Datum Line) (Sachs 2005: 20), Minimum Living Level (MLL), Supplementary Living Level (SLL), Household Subsistence Level (HSL), Household Effective Level (HEL), Poverty Gap (Kaul & Thomaseli-Moschovitis 1999: 20) and the Gini Coefficient (Mohr 2004: 172).
However, according to Wilson & Ramphele (1989: 16) findings about research on poverty have come to stress the importance of understanding well-being and its absence in terms beyond monetary ones, especially income (cf. Louw 2007: 282). In short, they advocate for the need to use social indicators in defining poverty. In the same vein, the World University Service (1982) realised that the economic growth of nations has been associated with far-reaching changes in their social and political structures. Consequently, since then a shift from a narrow economic concept of development to a broader recognition that development is concerned with people has taken place. The HDRs’ (from 1990-2010 discussed under 2.1.2.4) contribution to this broader understanding is appreciated in the purpose of this study. In response to these findings the United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD) developed 19 core development indicators which combine economic and social indicators, the most used among these social indicators being the Human Development Index (HDI) and Human Poverty Index (HPI) (cf. Louw 2007: 283) This development led to an awareness of the interdependence of different disciplines, such as economics, social policy, political processes and technological progress, in a development project (Alkire 2010: 60).

The HDI was crafted by UNDP (Murray 1991: 5) and “was created to emphasize that people and their capabilities should be the ultimate criteria for assessing the development of a country, not economic growth alone” (UNDP 2015)\(^\text{32}\). The UNDP (2015) further explains:

> The Human Development Index (HDI) is a summary measure of average achievement in key dimensions of human development: a long and healthy life, being knowledgeable and have a decent standard of living. The HDI is the geometric mean of normalized indices for each of the three dimensions.

- The health dimension: assessed by life expectancy at birth component of the HDI, is calculated using a minimum value of 20 years and maximum value of 85 years
- The education component of the HDI is measured by mean of years of schooling for adults aged 25 years and expected years of schooling for children of school entering age
- The standard of living dimension is measured by gross national income per capita. The goalpost for minimum income is $100 (PPP) and the maximum is $75,000 (PPP).

The Human Poverty Index (HPI) (UNDP 2015) is used by the United Nations to indicate the standard of living in a specific country. It was first launched in 1990. It measures:

---

\(^{32}\) United Nations Development Programme, 2015. Human Development Index
http://hdr.undp.org/en/content/human-development-index-hdi
• The amount of deprivation people experience in different countries

• According to the measurements of deprivation, countries are then ranked according to their HPI. Every year the UN publishes a list of them, which rank these according to their HPI. This list shows which countries have the highest to lowest standards of living

• Factors which are taken into consideration when ranking countries, include: The probability at birth of not surviving to age 60, people lacking functional literacy skills, long-term unemployment and population below 50% of median income.

Further, in an attempt to emancipate beneficiaries of development, participatory descriptions of poverty became commonly used. It is assumed that beneficiaries are more knowledgeable in defining what poverty is because they are affected by it daily. Participatory definitions of poverty include approaches such as Sustainable Livelihoods (SL) (Chambers & Conway 1991), Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) (Booth et al. 1999: 49-59), Participatory Action Research (PAR), Participatory Learning and Action (PLA) and poverty hearings. While it is unfortunately beyond the scope of this thesis to delve more deeply into economic and social indicators, it suffices to say, as articulated above, that development and poverty are complex phenomena. I submit therefore that they should not be taken lightly as has become common practice in some government, non-governmental and civil society circles.

In the light of the above discussions pertaining to poverty eradication and instruments of measurement and the complex reality and understanding of poverty, I argue in this research for the need for a “Glocal” development process which is at the same time well informed of global issues and pitfalls related to international development trends and also deeply rooted in the local context. This rootedness should run deeper into local culture, history, economy, politics, community aspirations, priorities, etcetera. As for this applied study, I argue that the township church in Tshwane (S & H) should lead towards the development on one hand of an urban mission strategy, which may facilitate economic processes that are well informed of global issues / debates, pitfalls and complexity of development and poverty. And on the other hand, she ought to lead towards imagining and fostering the way for economic processes to occur which are deeply rooted in local contexts: culturally, historically, economically and politically. In the following discussions, I have elected to highlight some of these global issues.
2.2.4 Topical debates and issues related to development

On the international scene, issues such as the political economy of global development, post-development and the critique of development (Stewart 2007) and the “fiction” nature of development (Bhavnani, Foran, Kurian & Munshi (eds.) 2009) are considered. On the national scene, issues, which are in many ways intertwined with those on the global scale, such as adaptation of development initiatives to sustainability, ecology and climate change and different national development programmes and policies (i.e. RDP and GEAR) are also briefly considered in this discussion because they have a bearing on the topic of this study. This thesis considers local economic development of Tshwane at a time when many fierce debates about development are taking place in the global and national arenas. This thesis takes into account the researcher’s awareness of, and is informed by, these debates, as it articulates its positions.

2.2.4.1 Political economy of global development

The global interlinking of economics and politics and its effect on development is a complex reality which is being continually studied (cf. Szirmai 2015: 41 – 69). The points for the debate in the political economy of global development include items such as 1) development of the Western type as the pattern; 2) subscription to a global collective agenda and 3) redistribution of wealth through trickle-down effects. Since 1945 it has been assumed that low-income countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America could “develop” to become wealthy and democratic, aspiring to the values and lifestyle of the “developed” West. Initially, and as discussed under the section on measurement of poverty, development was measured by economic growth, i.e. growth of GDP\(^{33}\). In the 1970s this understanding of measurement of development was broadened to include “basic needs” (access to food, health, education, clean water) and the human development index, although measured and presented in a different way from how the GDP would be.

In the 1990s, the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) introduced the ‘Human Development Index’ (HDI), which focuses on three measurable aspects of quality of life: living a

\(^{33}\) Gross Domestic Product (GDP) is the monetary value of all the finished goods and services produced within a country’s borders in a specific time period. Though GDP is usually calculated on an annual basis, it can be calculated on a quarterly basis as well. GDP includes all private and public consumption, government outlays, investments and exports minus imports that occur within a defined territory. Put simply, GDP is a broad measurement of a nation’s overall economic activity. (see http://www.investopedia.com/terms/g/gdp.asp#ixzz3m5obE7D5)
long and healthy life, being educated, and having a decent standard of living. ‘Human development is first and foremost about allowing people to lead the kind of life they choose – and providing them with the tools and opportunities to make those choices. (Schluter 2006: 5)

It is apparent that the political economy of global development is modernistic, thus befitting the progress school of thought. This implies therefore that to be considered “developed” a country or community should be wealthy (reporting a high GDP), meet the basic needs of its population and have a good HDI. Most governments today support an even wider set of objectives such as the eight “Millennium Development Goals” (MDGs) (World Bank 2002, Szirmai 2015: 8). The MDGs aim at: ending poverty and hunger, universal primary school education, promoting gender equality, child health, maternal health, combating HIV & AIDS, environmental sustainability and global partnership. The International Monetary Fund (IMF) which is the main financier of this global development focuses on the broad goal of reducing poverty, suggesting that all developing economies need more rapid and sustained rates of growth that will in turn promote large-scale and lasting poverty reduction and rising living standards for all (Krueger 2004). However, we have already discussed that this economic growth model of development which assumes that a growth in GDP will benefit the poor through a trickle-down effect is not appropriate in most parts of the third world. There is “no royal road, no one principle that should solve all normative economic problems” (Sen 1996: 61), because development is a contextual practice and contexts are as varied as there are local cultures and traditions. This does not suggest that there is no need for global development goals such as the MDGs which give focus and strategic direction. The point is rather that while communities may rally behind global goals they will do better if their local contexts are at the forefront all of the time. The local context has to provide them with as much freedom as necessary to develop interventions appropriate to local needs. I concur with Sen (1991: 15) where freedom is regarded as both the means and the end of development (see also Meier & Stiglitz 2001: 506). He evaluates development in terms of “personal functioning and capability” (Sen 1999: 87-110). “Functioning” is what a person manages to do or be. Goods can enable functioning but are distinct from it. Sen emphasises the importance of cultural liberty (so that individuals are not constrained by their social or religious heritage), and political choice (democratic government), alongside the opportunities made available by greater access to income and education.

While the global development agenda is coordinated by organisations such as the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), much development thinking should also now be focused on political outcomes. According to the growth report of The Commission on Growth
and Development (2008:19), democracy is apparently one of the acclaimed outcomes associated with economic growth. Further, within the context of political economy for global development claims were made in this report (2008:19) that sustained growth is important for reasons such as 1) an increased capacity to provide a path out of poverty; 2) the promotion of human development; 3) the creation of options for individuals and societies; 4) encouraging political pluralism and providing a stable base for the consolidation of democracy and 5) support economic growth models. Furthermore, claims were also made that economic growth is the key ingredient in effecting political and social liberalisation in the Third World (Friedman 2005). Yet, contends Mangayi (2014: 3), “We have not seen these claims materialise in meaningful ways for the communities on the outskirts of Tshwane (…) Grass roots communities are paying the price as a result of these growth-focused policies adopted by South Africa”. Thus, though on one hand this thesis acknowledges the global interlinking of economics and politics and its impacts on development, on the other, it objects to the notion that democracy always results in economic growth because it results in public accountability (as stipulated in the said report, 2008: 19). I am aware that this school of thought is well accepted in South Africa; the current ruling party (the African National Congress) and factions of its allied partners such as the Confederation of South African Trade Unions and the South African Communist Party initially supported this view. Unfortunately, this research finding (Chapter 6) reveals that there have been abuses and undemocratic governance structures emerging in the City of Tshwane (S & H) regardless of the fact that the post-apartheid city of Tshwane has experienced some measure of economic growth. Therefore, in my opinion, one cannot conclude that there is a clear correlation between democracy which could lead to social cohesion and economic growth. . Duchrow (2014: 5) concurs with this view when he states: “democracy and social cohesion is in principle not possible in a capitalist civilisation”.

This view and its assumptions are contested in many quarters of civil society by strategists and scholars in the South and North: “There is a growing body of alternative views of development among scholars and strategists disenchanted by the neoliberal agenda or the exclusively materialist conception of development” (Doorman 1998, Sachs 1992a, Greider 1997; Rucht 2006 cited by Dalton 2013: 171) as related to the political economy of global development. As a result, I contend in this research that a growing appreciation for locality and its assets as the base for development has to be reckoned with. Scholars such as Opschoor (cited by Dalton 2013: 171) argue that “attention must be given to the role of culture and of the need for a global ethics in the light of the mutual impingement of the local and global”. Sen’s capability framework
contributed in bringing values to the centre stage of development (Dalton 2013: 171). Of importance, as related to the interplay of local and global, is that the human development approach spelt out by Sen, considers the “capabilities of communities in terms of their own development, assesses the strategic resources available to the community and designs policies or procedures on the basis of capability” (Dalton 2013: 171; see also Alkire 2010).

With regard to the global South situation (of poverty and inequality) in the context of global economy of development, a development approach which takes the capabilities of communities seriously, resonates with the aspirations and aims of sustainable development in the South. Among capabilities that communities possess, religion is increasingly being recognised as a major contributor to international development (Dalton 2013: 158, Deneulin & Rakodi 2011:45-54). Deneulin and Rakodi (2011: 45) point out that “in 1980 (…) when international policy defined development largely in terms of economic growth (…) religion was neglected in the academic field of development studies” However, this is “not to say that religion’s significance in the processes of long-term political, economic, and social change was unrecognized in analysis and practice” (Deneulin & Rakodi 2011: 45). There is evidence of literature that dealt with “how religion becomes instrumental in carrying out developmental goals” (Dalton 2013: 158). This implies, I argue, that religious organisations such as the Church and its ministries have assets that could be instrumental in carrying out local economic developmental goals in our context in Tshwane (S & H). An ethical value-based development agenda is needed.

This led development thinkers and grassroots practitioners from different walks of life to start calling for a review of values and roles of international NGOs, donor communities such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund and multinationals that are in many ways instruments of political economy for global development, which leave a negative impact on the global South. Issues to be reviewed include the roles of international NGOs in the global political economy, an examination of security and insecurity in current global dynamics which hampers development, the global political economy and its negative impact on development, as well as the state and governance issues in the current context.

Of importance with regard to the global political economy is the fact that globalisation is the mechanism which sustains its operationalisation. Global financial institutions such as the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund and multinationals have reshaped their roles so as to facilitate this globalisation processes in local markets. In this context, Linden says;
…globalisation is marked by the growing dominance of the finance sector in global economics, aptly dubbed the ‘financialisation’ of economic life, the rapid increase in the velocity and complexity of transactions in different forms of money, coupled with reduced cost of communication. This results in stock markets increasingly determining economic stability and growth (Linden 2003: 56).

In relation to development, even local economic development projects, this means that the contentious and complex roles of superpower nations, such as the United States of America, international financial institutions and multinationals, become the dominant political actors as regards development everywhere in the world (Linden 2003: 76). South Africa in general and the City of Tshwane (S & H), in particular, are no exception. With reference to our context, Terreblanche (2002: 421) affirms that the English corporates succeeded in convincing the Afrikaner-controlled corporate sector as well as the National Party and the African National Party governments of the alleged virtues of a neo-liberal and globalised approach. Further, it meant that local assets for LED such as neighbourhoods with active churches and neighbourhood organisations who work toward the constructive development of their communities are most likely marginalised and overlooked in this globalised approach closely linked to markets.

Bakker and Gill (2003) interpret and explain a number of concrete links between local, national, regional and global dimensions of the restructuring of capital. They (2003: 4) interrogate key aspects of intensified globalisation, many of which are overlooked or downplayed by other approaches, particularly those premised on the narrow ontology of states and markets. Following an ontological and theoretical reflection they explored sets of interrelated questions and themes, principally related to the governance of production/social reproduction and the conditions for human security. These issues are related to a world order context where the power of capital has been globally extended and where certain powers of the state are being reinforced and re-focused, to promote both greater national security and greater security for capital in more liberalised frameworks of global accumulation. Consequently, the focus on global accumulation led, as stated in Chapter 1, section 7.6.2, to economic restructuring with spatial influences both nationally and within communities. With reference to Tshwane (S & H), the local economy suffered from systemic disinvestment in the Babelegi and GaRankuwa industrial hubs. “The absence of local markets meant not only lost services but also lost income” (Blakely 1994: 24); this has been the fate of the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal
in Tshwane, since the global market forces affect vulnerable markets of the emerging economies. This has led to the persisting economic crisis.

For Stubbs and Underhill (eds.) (1999) gave a synopsis of the economy by highlighting that the Asian economic crisis, the Russian economic crisis, deepening European integration, the wildly fluctuating stock markets around the world, and rapid changes in technology all signal that the unprecedented change in the global economic that characterised the 1990s will continue. These changes have affected the way a variety of state and non-state actors respond to the force of globalisation in the changing global economy. The fact is, Phillips’ (ed.) (2005: 1-19) introduction argues, International Political Economy (IPE) remains entrenched in a narrow set of theoretical, conceptual and empirical foundations derived from the experiences of the advanced industrialised democracies. In the 2005 volume, Phillips brings together specially commissioned chapters written by leading authorities in each key area of debate. They provide a systematic examination and critique of contemporary IPE, and put forward a new agenda for a truly "global" political economy.

It is evident from the foregoing that local economic projects of the emerging economies such as Tshwane’s are vulnerable in the face of global market forces. Local assets for LED are marginalised and rendered uncompetitive in the pursuit of alignment to the imperatives of the neo-liberal and global market agenda. Instruments of this agenda such as multinationals, international non-governmental organisations and institutions are reshaped and restructured in ways that enable them to promote privatised global accumulation of growth, to the detriment of local economies. Unfortunately, as Terreblanche (2002: 437) contends, “this form of ‘restructuring’ does not resolve the ‘deep-seated structural crisis’ and the unequal distribution of economic powers, but augments them instead”. A rethinking of development in the South is therefore necessary.

Prabhakar (2003) identifies ways in which the South is dominated and excluded in global processes of trade, employment, ownership of capital and financial flows. He concludes by suggesting that one of the methods to counteract global trends is involvement through economic and political strategies to stimulate South – South interactions and more local reliance. Since this thesis takes the issues raised by those thinkers into account, it subscribes, as stated earlier, to a “glocal” development agenda for Tshwane (S&H) befitting a human development approach in harmony with nature. This agenda has to be informed about the roles (positive and negative) of international NGOs operating in Tshwane and other global and local powers in development
in Tshwane. It additionally needs to be informed of the global dynamics which hamper or might hamper LED in the city and to be able to opt for a favourable position within partnerships with others. With reference to the above, in order to serve God and its communities the township church in Tshwane (S&H) needs to wrestle with the issues in action-reflection praxis. The church has to think beyond relief and welfare and conventional community development, so as to foster sustainable systems development and social movements for social justice. Hence, this thesis argues that the church must mobilise all its assets for this transformation which will lead to sustainable LED compliant with the oikos principles.

It is therefore of capital importance to be aware of the interlinks of global economic structures and philosophies and their specific effects on a local development plan before we begin to imagine ways of fostering local reliance at the community level. The interlinks go deeper than the obvious; institutions of global governance such as the World Trade Organisation (WTO), the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund (IMF) are instruments used to implement policies and dictate the course of global development efforts. Tabb (2005: 50-51) finds that these institutions serve the interests of elite global classes; more significantly, he illustrates how domestic elites in countries of the South buy into the strategies of the dominant global elites and compete with these strategies to some extent. He also discusses the influence of “justice movements” challenging these elite strategies.

In my opinion this largely describes the case concerning our development agenda in South Africa in general and in Tshwane in particular; we have embraced economic growth policies and progress goals of the dominant global and local elites without profoundly reflecting on our own complex socioeconomic, historical and political context. (See Terreblanche 2002: 426-438 and section 3.3.16 later in this thesis.) The adoption of GEAR in 1996 for example paved the way for the adoption of growth strategies which placed more emphasis on economic growth policies to steer South Africa’s integration into the global market. According to Allister Sparks34 (1997) GEAR is an unvarnished free-market programme, directly in line with the neo-liberal agenda known as the “Washington Consensus” which is a combination of relaxed exchange rates, privatisation, fiscal discipline and collaboration with the private sector to produce export driven growth. As a result, “local structures and community-based forums which were put in place to

34 Allister Haddon Sparks (born 10 March 1933 in Cathcart, Eastern Cape) is a South African writer, journalist and political commentator. He was the editor of The Rand Daily Mail when it broke Muldergate, the story of how the apartheid government secretly funded information projects. [Accessed on 11 February 2016 from www.bdlive.co.za/opinion/staffprofiles/2012/08/15/allister-sparks...
drive LED became moribund and puppets with no real mind and drive of their own” (Nel 2010: 53). I therefore argue that in the South African context in general and particularly in Tshwane’s there is a need for local justice movements that are rooted in the context and with the muscle to challenge these strategies. I submit that these local structures, community-based forums and local institutions need to be revived and organised into credible local justice movements. In our case, the township church should be one of the players in such a cause because she knows and is acquainted with the issues of poverty and survival on the periphery.

From the above, it is clear that the global links between economics and politics and their effects on development are complex. The emphasis on economic growth, modernisation based on the West and trickle-down economic benefits has unfortunately not led the masses of poor communities out of poverty. Therefore, I contend that a comprehensive and holistic development agenda aimed at human development should be opted for rather than any other narrow agenda. Also, given the fact that a growth-focussed strategy of development has failed in many ways to alleviate poverty and socioeconomic inequality, some development scholars are calling for a post-development strategy. I will discuss their point of view in the following section.

2.2.4.2 Post-development and its critique of development

Post-development has emerged from the disillusionment of many in the global South at the lack of progress of communities and nations resulting from the combined forces of capitalism and development. The mainstream development enterprise is seen as the handmaid of capitalism, giving poor communities a softer entry to the market economy and patching up some of the damage caused by this economy. (Stewart 2007: 4)

Post-development is a fundamentalist and radical rejection of the whole of the development notion – its institutions, language and objectives. It is “a critical reaction to the impasse of development theory and policy” which “starts out from a simple realisation: that attaining a middle-class life style for the majority of the world’s population is impossible” (Pieterse in Stewart 2007: 4, Bhavnani et al 2009: 3). In an article, Pieterse expressed four fundamental dilemmas concerning the concept of development i.e. problematising poverty, regarding development as equal to westernisation, placing technological progress over human development and development as an ideological discourse (Pieterse 2000: 175-191). Many development thinkers such as Pieterse (1998) and Korten (1990) who have raised concerns over the concept of development call for alternative development.
There has also been strong rejection of alternative development as a concept. Rejecting it, Esteva enquired who would want to mask the stench of “Development’ with “Alternative Development” as a deodorant (Esteva in Pieterse 1998: 365). In the post-development camp there are many who support the traditional and local ways of life lived at grassroots level (Stewart 2007: 4). This thesis also punts the opinion that traditional and local ways of life will certainly foster indigenous development if integrated accordingly in harmony with the rest of creation. For me, an African notion of development for the African City of Tshwane is important for the purpose of rootedness. This rootedness should emanate from indigenous knowledge, traditions and culture that foster endogenous and sustainable LED. Within the LED perspective, voices calling for alternative development make an important point which Stewart has expressed succinctly:

An alternative development approach would be more likely to support grassroots mobilisation in order to reach new goals, such as women’s emancipation, ending poverty and creating new community structures that will counter environmental decline (...) while alternative development aims to devise more sensitive, empowering and ecologically sound ways of doing development, post-development is more concerned with unmasking the whole development discourse, and showing how ideas such as development, progress, poverty and equality are all deeply compromised by their links to the failed project of development (Stewart 2007: 5).

The post-development school of thought critiques the development concept (Sachs 1992b: 4) and portrays its various facets as destructive. Illich calls it a “revolt against the human condition” (Illich 1992: 94):

According to this school of thought, development is a tool of westernization, and also a denial of the diverse resources and options of excluded majorities. The development dictionary does not go significantly into what courses of action should be followed instead of development (Stewart 2007: 5).

Post-development perspectives scrutinise the narrow rationalist thinking upon which mainstream development – its institutions and practitioners – rely. The points of contention between the two schools of thought (i.e. post-development and alternative development) could be clearly linked to philosophical and rational differences in understanding realities in each camp. Post-development rejects the current development agenda because of its ineffectiveness in meeting the needs of communities in a broad, consistent and equitable way, thus declaring it unfit and irrelevant. Contrastingly, alternative development attempts to suggest alternatives
within the said agenda in a manner which mobilises local resources, knowledge and assets towards building sustainable communities.

The philosophical basis for the failure of development is this rationalist approach founded on a belief in a uni-linear notion of progress and the conviction that the Third World is deficient in both knowledge and information (...). The struggles “between global capital and biotechnology interests, on the one hand, and local communities and organisations, on the other, constitute the most advanced stage in which the meanings over development and post-development are being fought over” (Bhavnani et al 2009: 4, cf. Escobar 1995).

A call for alternative development in the post-development camp is rooted in “the vernacular world”: this consists of the “economic and cultural resources present in indigenous societies and traditions unharmed by development” (Stewart 2007: 5). I am in agreement with the position of alternative development in as far as mobilising local resources, knowledge and assets towards building sustainable communities in Tshwane (S & H) goes, as this promotes an endogenous and sustainable LED for Tshwane. The contextual rootedness of LED portrayed in this thesis is certainly going to offer an alternative to the current system, which is in many ways growth oriented and externally focussed. In the case of this thesis, the key task will be to unearth and identify these local assets, resources, traditions etcetera which are necessary for the articulation of a viable alternative economic development in Tshwane (S & H). This alternative will be based on discovering the potential of local assets, and the township church in particular, for LED goals. With reference to human development, this alternative will place people at the centre of its entire development agenda. People, especially marginalised people’s freedom, choices and capabilities, will not be overlooked in the pursuit of economic growth in harmony with the ecosystem.

Furthermore, I submit that calls for the adoption of alternative development within the post-development debate are justified to some extent because of the persistence of poverty, especially in the Third World. The same issues such as marginalisation, vulnerability and socioeconomic inequalities have remained on the development agenda of the Third World for over three decades without substantial resolution of those issues. Of course, there are contextually valid reasons why development has remained elusive in the Third World and this has led people to perceive the development project as a utopia and a fiction. This is what is leading to the call to stop being obsessed with a utopia that will never arrive, instead of thinking of the quality of life at present. Is development a fiction and a utopia? This question is considered in what follows.

92
2.2.4.3 Development can be fictional and utopian

The link between the civilizing mission of colonialism and the modernization project of development is rarely discussed within mainstream publications on development. As a result, much of conventional development is founded upon a set of fictional narratives that overlook many of its exploitative practices – fictions which might suggest some reasons for its failure for the people of the Third World. (Bhavnani et al 2009: 2)

In the midst of the sad reality of socioeconomic inequality prevailing 20 years after independence in the margins of Tshwane, especially Hammanskraal and Soshanguve, one could in some ways affirm claims that the notion of development is a utopia. One cannot disregard the fact that there is discontentment and disappointment at the grassroots and in the marginal communities of the Third World, including South Africa, with regard to the development project. However, I do not consider this as a reason to permanently discard the concept of development. Instead, contributions from assets based and human development approaches discussed earlier could inspire us to formulate a viable and sustainable alternative to the current system. This study attempts to demonstrate the way in which it is a struggle for the poorest and most marginalised communities to access development and its resources. While the researcher acknowledges development has been taking place in Tshwane (S & H), especially infrastructural development, yet the plight of many people is worsened by poverty and misery. Access to meaningful and sustainable development is a struggle that is at the same time cultural, political and ideological (Keefe-Feldman 2006). In the case of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, regardless of infrastructural development communities still struggle to gain access to life-sustaining basic goods such as water, land, employment and the like. Consequently for Soshanguve and Hammanskraal and the CoT priorities for LED have to be reframed as human rights issues. I concur with Conca that these struggles have moved “from ‘public good to human Rights’ issues (Conca 2006: 215). In this way, new concepts of development – from below, democratically engaged, and seeking empowerment by those most affected – are constantly bubbling up (Bhavnani et al 2009: 3). My theoretical viewpoint is that these new concepts will be alternatives to the current system. This is one of the reasons this thesis aims at being a catalyst for the emergence of alternatives to the current system in Tshwane (S & H). In the same vein, this study has chosen to work with communities from the margins in Tshwane, those communities that are usually negatively affected by the development project led by the elites. I work with communities from the bottom-up in the hope of facilitating
the emergence of a LED programme which is authentic to Tshwane (S & H). This, I envisage, will contribute to a new understanding and practice of development from the bottom -up for this area.

**2.2.4.4 The current development trend is unsustainable**

The unsustainability of the current development trend is of grave concern to thinkers, including Anand P (2007; Anand S & Sen 1996) and advocates of sustainable development who are committed to seeing real transformation in the lives of the poor and the marginalised in harmony with nature (cf. Szirmai 2015: 7 – 8). Many efforts within the current trend are prone to failure unless the modus operandi is carefully reconsidered. The UNESCO World Conference on Education for Sustainable Development highlights what is happening at the grassroots, as recorded in the statement below.

> Despite unprecedented economic growth in the 20th century, persistent poverty and inequality still affect too many people, especially those who are most vulnerable. Conflicts continue to draw attention to the need for building a culture of peace. The global financial and economic crises highlight the risks of unsustainable economic development models and practices based on short-term gains. The food crisis and world hunger are an increasingly serious issue. Unsustainable production and consumption patterns are creating ecological impacts that compromise the options of current and future generations and the sustainability of life on earth, as climate change is showing. (UNESCO World Conference on Education for Sustainable Development held in Bonn 2009, Clause 1)

A number of conferences and studies (WCED 1987, UNRISD 1992, UNESCO 2009, Kyoto Protocol and COP 17 to name but a few) affirm that development is not only about a blind pursuit of economic growth and human material prosperity, but also has to improve and sustain the society as a whole. Human communities should not merely be occupants of the earth, nor just users of it, but, like good caretakers, “they must hand it down improved to subsequent generations” (Marx 1906 in Peet & Watts 1996: 3). The report *Our Common Future*, published in 1987 by the World Commission on Environment and Development (WCED), lucidly spelt out the meaning of sustainable development. This document alluded to earlier, is also known as the Brundtland Report, after its president. The definition given in the said Report is “development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their needs” (WCED 1987: 5).
This Report, Baker et al. (eds.) (1997: 3) argued, elaborates that the concept provides a framework for the integration of environmental policies and development strategies, thus countering the perception that environmental protection can only be achieved at the expense of economic development.

The Brundtland Report, other studies and recent writings on socioeconomic development point to the need to rethink factors of development such as its purpose and goals, its philosophy and strategy, the role of different players and their impact. There are certainly international and national works but not enough local studies (in this case, of Tshwane) which provide insights into and guidelines on how to build sustainable economies and especially the role different local stakeholders should play in the process. This is the reason why this study involved the local church in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal to actively participate towards the goal of building a sustainable LED in Tshwane.

Admittedly, the state has a key role to play in the shift to sustainable development: “This role arises, in part, because the market mechanism generates environmental problems, including the negative externalities of pollution, the subordination of weak interests that cannot be expressed in terms of money, and failure to supply collective goods, such as a healthy and safe environment” (Baker et al 1997: 18). It has been noted that:

At the national level, governments have limited responsibilities in relation to the implementation of policies that are directly relevant to tackling the promotion of sustainable development. Thus, a shift to sustainable development requires not only an increased role for central government, but also an enhancement of the involvement of sub-national levels of government in environmental management. (Baker et al 1997: 18)

Local authorities perform a particularly important role in the shift to sustainable development, given their areas of legal competence:

They manage ambient environmental quality, apply tools for modifying behaviour, shape land use planning, stimulate economic development, deal with waste disposal, transport, urban renewal, and the provision of education, health, housing and welfare services. (Baker et al 1997: 20)

Furthermore, negative consequences of economic growth stipulated above by UNESCO as well as by many other development agencies working in the Third World suggest the need to promote Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) as a vital ingredient for fostering
sustainability. The ESD is slowly being embraced by stakeholders and critics of the dominant development paradigm. Because, as UNESCO elaborates in the following lines,

ESD helps societies to address different priorities and issues *inter alia* water, energy, climate change, disaster and risk reduction, loss of biodiversity, food crises, health risks, social vulnerability and insecurity. It is critical for the development of new economic thinking. ESD contributes to creating resilient, healthy and sustainable societies through a systemic and integrated approach. It brings new relevance, quality, meaning and purpose to education and training systems. It involves formal, non-formal and informal education contexts, and all sectors of society in a lifelong learning process.

ESD emphasizes creative and critical approaches, long-term thinking, innovation and empowerment for dealing with uncertainty, and for solving complex problems. ESD highlights the interdependence of environment, economy, society, and cultural diversity from local to global levels, and takes account of past, present and future. (UNESCO Conference on ESD 2009, Clauses 7& 9)

Struggling urban areas, i.e. marginal communities, such as townships in South Africa, are particularly affected by unsustainable development which in turn leads to unsustainable local economies. This research agrees with the ESD roles as spelt out in the previous lines in so far as it contributes to the creation of resilient, healthy and sustainable communities through a systemic and integrated approach on the one hand while on the other, concurring with its emphasis in opting for creative and critical approaches, long term thinking, innovation and empowerment. All these will be possible within an interdependent relational framework of environment, economic, religion, society and cultural diversity from local to global levels in a given historical context. This is the type of education which is needed in Tshwane (S & H) because the current system is rooted in a capitalist one has contributed to propagating further socioeconomic inequalities. This could be because of its single focus on progress and economic growth. Thus, I argue in this thesis for a sustainable LED based on the *oikos* which could facilitate the development of an interdependent relational framework of environment, economic, society and cultural assets, consistent with the principles pertaining to sustainable societies formulated earlier in section 1.7.5 in Chapter 1 of this thesis.
The United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP) suggests that it is crucial to boost urban sustainability and resilience:

The issue of sustainability of cities has to do with both the environmental quality within cities that city residents have to live with, and the environmental changes caused by cities outside of their borders. Today neither aspect is particularly sustainable, especially in developing countries. The key to sustainability lies in the concept of ‘green cities’ or ‘eco cities’ which differ from conventional cities in that they are more compact, have a vital mix of land uses within their boundaries, provide many different low-energy transportation opportunities, and produce some of their own renewable energy. Such cities would provide their citizens with a high level of environmental quality and liveability, and have a lower environmental footprint outside their borders. (UNEP 2012: 56)

The concept of a “Green city” or “Eco city” is spoken about in the 2010 Integrated Development Plan of the CoT as an ideal. This demonstrates by itself that some leaders of the City of Tshwane have good intentions, but there is still a need to foster a collective will for this concept to be realised in different communities of the city. This is where I believe the church, being an institution which embraces all people, could play a pivotal role in mobilising its resources and in fostering the promotion of eco-theology and its values.

2.2.5 Understanding LED in relation to development discourse: A synthesis

Having been in critical dialogue with the development discourse in the foregoing, I argued for an alternative approach to LED which, according to Blakely (1994:50) attempts to steer economic development activities towards local disadvantaged residents i.e. the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal in the City of Tshwane. I recognised therefore that LED is a process which involves:

- The formation of new institutions
- The development of alternative industries
• The improvement of the capacity of existing employers to produce better products
• The identification of new markets
• The transfer of knowledge
• and the nurturing of new firms and enterprises.

Blakely (1994: 52) further explains that the primary goal of LED is “to increase the number and variety of job opportunities available to local people”. The success of LED depends obviously on the mobilisation of its assets: neighbourhoods with active churches and neighbourhood organisations who work towards the constructive rebuilding of their community. These assets act as beacons to developers and investors. Partners in LED include local government, community institutions and the private sector (section 1.7.4 in Chapter 1). As indicated, this thesis therefore focussed on six community-active churches in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal in the City of Tshwane and investigated the role/s these churches could play towards LED in the City of Tshwane (S & H). I end this section with a brief exploration of LED in relation to key points of the discourse on development such as LED in relation to different facets of development, to philosophies and approaches of development, LED and poverty eradication and LED and sustainable development.

2.2.5.1 LED in relation to different facets of development

I argued for multifaceted, integrated and holistic LED processes given the fact that various communities in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal in Tshwane are at different levels in the continuum of development.

a) Relief and welfare (i.e. band-aid) is needed for the most destitute people such as orphan-led households, poor unemployed communities, indigents and the disabled and elderly who fall outside the pension system.

b) Community development (i.e. ladder and catch-up), expanded on below:

Being aware of the fact that “…local power structures are maintained by protective national and international systems against which even the strongest organisations are relatively powerless” (Korten 1990: 120), I argued that LED has to be a catalyst for community development geared to build the capacity of communities of the townships of Tshwane to lead self-reliant lives and
develop skills (i.e. HRD) that yield employability. In short, through HRD, LED is poised to develop the economic resource value of communities within Tshwane (S & H) so that the economic system will provide the needed opportunities for gainful employment (cf. Korten 1990: 119).

Further, by paying attention to the warning to beware of the fact that HRD could be “dehumanising, a dressed-up form of one set of people using another set of people for their own ends” (Rogers 1992:95) and be “little more than lip service to self-reliance and, in fact, build long-term dependence on the assisting organisation” (Korten 1990: 119), I argued that LED will intentionally mobilise its assets and partners for buy-in and support. Its assets (such as neighbourhoods with active churches and neighbourhood organisations who work towards the constructive development of their community) and partners (i.e. local government, community institutions and the private sector) are called to participate so that LED reaches its primary goal which is “to increase the number and variety of job opportunities available to local people” (Blakely 1994: 52).

Therefore, HRD is an important ingredient because a well trained and equipped labour force is important for LED going forward in Tshwane (S & H) in an integrated and holistic manner, to eradicate poverty and unemployment on the one hand and on the other foster self-reliance. With reference to the present reality in Tshwane (S & H) the well equipped and trained people from these townships are to be given the job opportunities emanating from the government infrastructure development programme and the RDP.

c) Address basic human needs developmentally

In my opinion, LED will have to meet BHN developmentally, i.e. leading to substantial socio-economic liberation and transformation. These needs were described earlier under section 2.1.2.1.2.

d) Sustainable systems development through advocacy and lobbying (i.e. a “beehive”)

My opinion is that issues related to institutional and policy constraints that hamper the implementation of pro-poor sustainable LED must be addressed through advocacy and lobby groups in public and private spheres in Tshwane. LED assets (such as active churches and
organisations who work towards the constructive development of their townships) and partners (i.e. local government, community institutions and the private sector) have to form strategic partnerships for advocacy, lobbying and critical engagement so that the poor and marginalised benefit “at the economic table” of the city. They must opt for counter exclusion strategies which promote meaningful systemic participation to ensure self-reliance, liberation and empowerment of the ordinary citizens of Tshwane (S & H).

e) Participation in social movements and global change

LED in Tshwane (S & H), through churches, community organisations and partners must be mobilised to link national and global networks that promote social and economic justice in harmony with the earth.

2.2.5.2 LED in relation to philosophies and approaches of development

I argued for:

- A bottom-up approach informed by a growing awareness of the local and regional area as the best place for development

- A “Glocal” development process which, is in the same time well informed of global issues and pitfalls related to international development trends and in the same time deeply rooted in the local context

- The emphasis is on the “development of pro-poor LED interventions” (Rogerson 2003: 55) and balanced economic growth within the current system. Poverty eradication and employment must be at the centre of LED interventions.

2.2.5.3 LED in relation to poverty eradication

I argued that it is necessary to:

- Address the current massive unemployment especially in peripheral townships such as Hammanskraal and Soshanguve.
• Be aware that the point is rather that while communities might rally behind global goals, they will do better if their local contexts are to the fore all the time. The local context has to provide them with the freedom to develop interventions appropriate to local needs.

• Work towards insureing “the access of the poor to the fishing grounds and markets that local elites control” (Korten 1990: 120).

• Generate resources to meet basic human needs developmentally and sustainably in Tshwane (S & H)

• Maximise the use of local materials and knowledge for improving community welfare and local economic development

• Protect the local economy from systemic disinvestment, “the absence of local markets meant not only lost services but also lost income” (Blackely 1994:24).

2.2.5.4 Asset based sustainable LED

In this thesis, my “informed” argument leans toward:

• LED in Tshwane (S & H) which is achieved in harmony with everyone and everything including the natural world (cf. Suderman 1998: 17). It pursues growth which respects limits to environmental resources.

• For the sake of harmony, grassroots institutions such as the churches could champion the causes of sustainability within LED as being inspired by the principles of God’s economy which, for me, integrate all the facets or generations of development in harmony with the oikos rules. In practice, asset based sustainable LED has to prevent “human aggression toward creation which stems from a false understanding of creation and the human role in it” (The Oxford Declaration on Christian Faith and Economics 1990: clause 4).

• This is an alternative path which promotes the development of policies and activities based on the capacities, skills and assets of the poor and their neighbourhoods within the limits of the earth. It could promote the wellbeig of community (humans and non-humans in harmony) and freedoms.
This approach applies three interrelated principles: 1) start with what is present in the community (taking human and non-human beings as the most important assets for development in any community), 2) be internally focussed by necessity (this does not mean ignoring the prevailing globalisation agenda and its demands; rather, it should strategically be internally focussed in the global market). and 3) relationship-driven in its outlook (it has to be strong on relationship building and rebuilding within the locality – its residents, its associations, its institutions and its environment).

Asset based sustainable LED should work toward meeting basic human needs in the continuum of socioeconomic development as far as this is in harmony with the ecosystem. In short, the oikos is the preferred framework which informs meeting those basic human needs. In this sense, I advocate for an economy "which provides us with a reasonably comfortable life style while operating in harmony with the natural world" (see 1.7.5 and Wood 1992: 1).

2.2.5.5. LED, the township church and mission

The next chapter features a summary of extremely lengthy discussions concerning the church, development and mission so as to inform and enrich this thesis' argument. For the moment, it suffices to point out that those active churches (i.e. churches that work towards the constructive development of their communities) within a neighbourhood are among key LED assets. As stated earlier, I argue that the township churches in particular must be discovered as assets towards LED in Tshwane (S & H). These churches have vital roles to play. So far, in relation to the literature covered in this chapter, I have hinted that these churches could perform a variety of roles in support of LED in Tshwane (S & H) such as:

- Playing a vital role in fostering the type of LED which is in keeping with the principles of sustainable communities (see 1.7.5) and a scriptural base for oikos (1.8.3.1.3)
- Fostering thinking beyond relief and welfare and conventional community development to sustainable systems development and social movements for social justice
- Promoting a holistic understanding of poverty which is crucial and essential in development in order to deal with the “human face” (cf. Louw 2007: 267) as related to nature
Advocating that such systems (embedded in inequality and exploitation) be changed (Korten 1990: 120) to benefit and protect the weak members of the oikos.

Speaking against certain powers of the state which are being reinforced and re-focused to promote both greater national security, and greater security for capital in more liberalised frameworks of global accumulation to the detriment of the poor and the earth.

Fostering a growing appreciation for locality and its assets as the base for development: “Attention must be given to the role of culture and of the need for a global ethics in the light of the mutual impingement of the local and global” (Dalton 2013: 171)

Promoting a developmental approach which takes the capabilities of communities seriously, in line with the aspirations and aims of sustainable communities in the city. Amongst the capabilities that communities possess, religion is increasingly being recognised as a major contributor to international development (Dalton 2013: 158, Deneulin & Rakodi 2011:45-54) as well as national and local development.

Ensuring that LED is not only supposed to promote human development within the limits of nature but that it is also grounded in the values of oikos; unlike the prevailing approach which used to focus only on economic growth.

Mobilising all township churches’ assets for transformation which will lead to sustainable LED compliant with the oikos principles.

Facilitating the revival of local structures, community-based forums and local institutions to become credible local justice movements. In our case, the township church should be one of the players in such a cause because she knows and is acquainted with the issues of poverty and survival in the periphery.

Facilitating the realisation of a sustainable LED based on the oikos and the development of an interdependent relational framework of environment, economic, society and cultural assets consistent with the principles pertaining sustainable societies formulated earlier in point 1.7.5 in Chapter 1 of this thesis.


2.3 Conclusion of chapter

Although the notion of development has been in circulation for six decades, it is still a current topic and will remain so for some time to come. In this section, I highlighted the complexity of the development concept, approaches, purpose and goals of development, development measurement instruments, and topical debates. In my arguments I have shown the relevance of the different debates considered in this research in relation to LED.

The following chapter deals with the church, mission and development. Drawing from the understanding of development gained in this chapter, attempts will be made to discuss how the church in mission with God has been and still is involved in development. Some of the issues discussed in this chapter will be revisited from a Christian missiological and theological perspective.
Chapter three

THE CHURCH, MISSION AND DEVELOPMENT

3.1 Introduction

In Chapter 2, the discourse focussed on the broad issues of development, facets of development, approaches and debates related to development; certain suggestions have been made with regard to where this study positions itself.

3.2 Church and Development project

3.2.1 Common overall goal in society

Ter Haar (2011: 5) states:

Religion and development have more in common than is normally apparent. At the foundation, both are visions of how the world may be transformed. From a religious perspective, the transformation of individuals, or inner transformation, is deemed a necessary condition for transforming society and the world as a whole. From the professional development perspective, on the other hand, it is primarily the external environment, or the arrangements made for the provision of material resources, that constitutes the site of transformation.

I agree with Ter Haar to the extent that when a Christian/church development perspective is integrated within the professional development perspective it results in “integral development” – "a conceptual area where these two fields merge” (Ter Haar 2011: 5).

Yet, from the outset, I acknowledge that the recent history of the church and its ministries’ involvement in development do not reflect the same level of sophistication that professional development institutions do. However, this does not mean that the church has not been helping the poor and the marginalised. Le Roux (2004: 55) for example, states how the church, particularly the Evangelicals in the days of the Wesley's’ 18th century England, was at the forefront of both evangelism and work among the poor. There was “no longer an attempt to do
good works as a means of pleasing God, and thus earning favour, but the effects of knowing God and a sense of having received justification now result in a release of social service as gratitude”. Mandryk (2010: 7) attests that there is “Church’s increasing understanding that Christ’s kingdom can and must transform every aspect of life and community”. Later, I elaborate on the church’s perspective on ministry to the poor. For now it suffices to state that generally, the church has indeed been involved mainly doing relief work, but not typically in cooperation or strategic partnerships with other players in the development field. Nonetheless, as stated by Marshall and Van Saanen, the work of the church overlaps with that of other organisations (see Ter Haar 2011). They write:

Religious voices, topics, and institutions were largely absent from the agenda and work of secular development and financial institutions over much of their history. Of course, faith-based groups often overlapped with secular nongovernmental, national, and international organisations in their respective work to advance social and economic development (Marshall & Van Saanen 2007: 1)

Belshaw attests to the fact that, more or less a decade ago, the paradigm shift in the debate on development is favouring the role of Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) including faith-based organisations as recipients and implementers of development assistance (Belshaw 2006: 157). He further states that there has been, since the publication of a three volume study by the World Bank (The Voices of the Poor) an increased awareness by the main development agencies – international donors and aid-receiving governments – of the potentially enhanced roles of faith-based organisations in pro-poor development. Other studies conducted by Belshaw et al (2001:8-11) and Marshall & Keough (2004: 1-12) on specific types of development activities carried out by Faith Based Organisations (FBOs) and Commission for Africa Report (2005)

36 Belshaw, DGR, Calderisi, R., Sugden, C (2001) discuss the principles and practicalities of a partnership, covering a broad range of development topics such as women and assets, children and youth, education and health, HIV & AIDS, governance, leadership and corruption, enterprise, debt and economic growth and conflict prevention and post-conflict reconstruction.
37 Marshall, K. and Keough, L. (2004) contend that “Where faith and development institutions have combined their efforts and work to common ends, remarkable results have been achieved. The experience suggests two conclusions: first, that the engagement of faith communities in the fight against poverty is vital to success in achieving the Millennium Development Goals; and second, that there is great scope for new and different forms of partnership that work to the respective strengths of the different communities. Yet these efforts are too little known and the lessons, good and bad, have engendered too little reflection” (p xii).
38 The Commission for Africa was set up by Tony Blair in early 2004. The Commission consisted of seventeen members, nine of which were from Africa, all working in their individual and personal capacities. The Commission published its report “Our Common Interest” on 11 March 2005. It recognised
also contributed to raising awareness about the potential of and advantages of working with FBOs. In Tshwane, for example, there is now a noticeable involvement of the ecclesia in development in partnership with government and international funders such as United States Aid. This is the case with the HIV and AIDS project implemented from 2009 – 2011 by the consortium made up of Tshwane Leadership Foundation, Deeds of Love Ministries, Lefika la Botshabelo, Pretoria Community Ministries and PEN. Further, global ecclesial movements such as the World Council of Churches (WCC) and Micah Network and individual Christians in different denominations have increasingly become convinced about the contribution that the Christian theological and church sector could make to the ideal of meaningful development (Swart 2006: i).

3.2.2 The church has social and spiritual capital useful for socioeconomic development

With particular reference to South Africa, Swart (2012: 65-94) traces the religious discourse on social development in South Africa by religious institutional bodies, such as the Ecumenical Foundation of Southern Africa, the National Religious Association for Social Development and National Religious Leaders Forum. He highlights [that] these “organisations should be seen as highly strategic for the religious sector in South Africa” (2012: 66) as related to social development. The consultative processes of these organisations for example brought an awareness that in South Africa “development had to be understood in the spirit of the liberation struggle against apartheid and colonisation” (cf. Swart 2012: 68). For churches, this meant a revisiting of their role in development project in South Africa.

Of importance is the recognition of the church as an important player among others in the reconstruction and development of South Africa. Admittedly, the success of the social development project is dependent on collaborative efforts of “inter-sectoral partnerships in social development” on the ground. In relation to the church and religious institutions, the key element for effective inter-sectoral partnerships is the social capital which they bring to the partnership. Such capital “refers essentially to the importance of ‘social partnerships’ and ‘social networks’ as the building blocks of society” (Swart 2012: 75). By their nature, churches and other religious

that everyone would benefit from – and has a role in creating – a strong and prosperous Africa. It put forward a coherent package of measures to achieve this goal. Many of its recommendations were taken forward by the G8 when they met in Gleneagles in July 2005 and in other major African and international commitments made in 2005. http://www.commissionforafrica.info/2005-report
organisations are rich in social and spiritual capital\textsuperscript{39} which are assets for addressing issues of poverty and other social ills and challenges developmentally. Ter Haar (2011: 5) points out, “for most people in the developing world, religion is part of ‘the vision of the good life’”. Therefore, with reference to South Africa Swart (2010: 325) for instance states, “churches and other faith-based organisations should be regarded as most strategic in contributing to the challenge of moral regeneration and reaching the South African population at large”. In relation to research done in the Western Cape communities, Swart (2010: 326) perceives churches as offering a stock of social capital for promoting social development in that province.

There is also increased interest in a wide range of development topics, including the role of the church and the state in modernising societies, the role of the church in the global economy, the role of religion and the values in educational curricula, religion in conflict and peace-making, the church and sustainable communities, and so forth (See Duchrow & Hinkelammert 2012, Casanova 2001, Nelson, Palonsky & McCarthy 2007 & Smock 2010). There is also an increasing interest from individual theologians and missiologists\textsuperscript{40} (such as de Gruchy, Villa Vicencio and Mugambi), particularly those from the Third World, where severe poverty and marginalisation are daily realities, to find ways of bridging the “…worlds of development and faith”. Such faith based development work fits within the ambit of liberation/contextual theologies which naturally emerge from critical social analysis. Insights of scholars such as Gustavo

\footnote{Spiritual capital is a concept that involves the quantification of the value to individuals, groups and society of spiritual inspiration and practice. Proponents liken it to other forms of capital, including material (or financial) capital, intellectual capital and social capital. The management consultant and philosopher, Danah Zohar, defines it broadly as the value of personal, social or cultural beliefs and meanings that stimulate creativity, encourage moral behaviour and motivate individuals. It is often connected to the related concept of spiritual intelligence. See more at: \url{http://www.spiritual-capital.org/what-is-spiritual-capital-2/#sthash.ybEQ9CkC.dpuf}}

Gutiérrez\textsuperscript{41} and Leonardo Boff\textsuperscript{42} pertaining to Liberation Theology have had a profound influence on faith-based development work. In the South the churches' involvement in liberation struggles “from the bottom-up” also resulted, among others, in community development, conscientisation and human development in relation to self and social liberation. Grassroots resource people and institutions became and still are vital instruments for development and liberation.

This thesis is one such example. It seeks to articulate a vision of local economic development from the “bottom-up”. It sees, on one hand, the township church as being in a position to contribute to ideal and meaningful local economic development in Tshwane (S&H) while on the other, it regards the township church as providing a bridge between the world of economic development and faith. The church can therefore complement and enrich development by bringing in another perspective as discussed here. But as Marshall and van Saneen (2007: 2) point out, in the eyes of some development agencies, FBOs are treated “as subsets of NGOs and civil society; in some quarters they are explicitly excluded” - most likely because of the limitations of FBOs. Nürnberg (1999: 372) names these:

1. a spiritual concept of salvation which neglects social concerns
2. a traditional orientation which looks backward into the past rather than forward into the future
3. an inflexible orthodoxy which spiritualises human needs and offers stereotyped spiritual recipes
4. a hierarchical, often authoritarian leadership structure
5. a lack of social-analytical skills

\textsuperscript{41} In his book: \textit{A Theology of Liberation: History, Politics, Salvation} (1971), Gutiérrez explains his notion of Christian poverty as an act of loving solidarity with the poor as well as a liberatory protest against poverty. According to Gutiérrez true “liberation” has three main dimensions: First, it involves political and social liberation, the elimination of the immediate causes of poverty and injustice. Second, liberation involves the emancipation of the poor, the marginalised, the downtrodden and the oppressed from all “those things that limit their capacity to develop themselves freely and in dignity”. Third, liberation theology involves liberation from selfishness and sin, a re-establishment of a relationship with God and with other people. For an extensive overview on the scholarly contributions by Gutiérrez refer to http://liberationtheology.org/people-organizations/gustavo-gutierrez/

\textsuperscript{42} In tandem with Gutiérrez, Boff is deeply committed to reflections related to themes such as salvation and liberation, base communities and liberation, when theology listens to the poor and those with a marginalised existence. See http://liberationtheology.org/people-organizations/leonardo-boff/ for an extensive overview of Boff’s contributions.
6. a tendency to withdraw into cosy and homogenous in-groups which shun challenges and conflicts

7. an atmosphere which does not attract the youth, the men – and women – in their prime or leading intellectuals.

In my work with churches in southern Africa I also observed the above including: a greater emphasis on doing welfare and charity to the detriment of development, a lack of understanding of socioeconomic and political issues and studies and a paucity of self-critical reflection. These limitations must be understood, analysed and addressed so that the religious sector can become a significant partner in development projects. With reference to South Africa, Swart (2010: 27) also recognises some of these limitations and suggests that the religious sector will only gain credibility as one of the significant drivers of social change if “it becomes a rigorous exponent itself of the social development paradigm on the level of actual implementation and empowerment”. Swart’s suggestion is a call which amounts to some sort of “reformation” given the fact that, as Ter Haar (2011: 5) writes, “many secular people find it hard to think about religion in positive terms, as something that can help build human societies rather than contribute to their destruction”. This perception about religious or faith-based organisations will only be changed if they become instruments of hope and restoration in the communities.

With reference to the church, Nürnberger suggests a solution.

What will make the church relevant in economic and ecological terms is the awareness that (...) development is derived from its peculiar vision and therefore part of its mission. Other prerequisites such as openness, social concern, service, an empowering leadership and the acquisition of skills follow from that. (Nürnberger 1999: 372)

In this thesis an attempt is made to contribute towards this redress so that the township church in Tshwane (S& H) in particular, is aware of these limitations and learns to become a role player in socioeconomic development. I concur with Swart (2010: 326) and Nürnberger (1999: 371) when they state that if the church’s social and spiritual forms of capital are strategically mobilised they are crucial assets for social development. I am therefore convinced that the church’s inputs will add value to the overall social development project.
3.2.3 Biblical impulses and scope of the church’s involvement in development

Impulses for the church’s involvement in development come from biblical narratives such as:

- Management of God’s resources: Genesis 1, Micah, James
- Care of the poor: Isaiah 58 and Matthew 25
- Shalom / wholeness: Jeremiah 29: 7 and Rev 21: 3-6
- Reconnecting everything in heaven and on earth: Ephesians 1: 10b

Biblical characters are used metaphorically in development:

- A metaphor for development process: Joseph
- A metaphor for redevelopment: Nehemiah
- A metaphor for being communities of resistance: the Prophets
- A metaphor for God’s alternative communities: Jesus
- and a metaphor for different conversions: Peter

The biblical concept of God’s *Oikos* vision (God’s economy) which this research has embraced also provides insights on how the church and its members have to be involved in holistic economic development. These impulses and scope for the church’s involvement in development are aptly summed up by Grigg (1984: 81) in Figure 3.1.
Figure 3.1 impulses and scope of the church’s involvement in integral development

Source: Viv Grigg (1984: 81)

As may be observed, there are various biblical impulses that motivate the church on mission with God to do integral development work or integral mission. Building on Grigg’s summary, I add the prevention of environmental degradation as a major theme together with those on the outer side of the figure, because I believe the church cannot consider development as a project without at the same time considering the earth. Among other theological concepts that encourage the church to be involved in development, I include God’s presence with the poor, incarnation, witness in the public sphere, transformation, liberation and Christian social ethics.

3.2.4 God’s presence with the poor and in development

God’s presence with the poor has shaped contextual theologies of mission and development. This is particularly important on the one hand because humanity bears God’s image and on the other because of God’s incarnational presence in Christ. With reference to humanity created in God’s image, the intimate relationship between God and humanity becomes clear already in
Genesis 1, as God says, “Let us create...” God’s presence with humanity is expressed here for the first time. Von Rad elaborates;

That, his presence with humanity is something unique and special is expressed in the fact that humanity was created in his image. Important is the affirmation that this is not a spiritual or intellectual resemblance only. The whole person - physically, emotionally, spiritually and intellectually - is created in God’s image (Von Rad 1972: 58; see also Van Selms 1967: 36-37)

In undertaking development, the church has become aware that God created us in God’s image with a specific purpose. We are created to be co-workers of God, co-builders of the new city and of a new humanity (cf. Van Selms 1967: 38-9) and a new earth. As people created in God’s image we are emblems of God, and God’s representatives on earth (Von Rad 1972: 59-60). We are shadows of God, meaning that wherever we are, God is. We are mirrors of God, reflecting the image of God through our being (Van Selms 1967: 36). We can also say that creation is a mirror of God.

In relation to God’s incarnational presence in Christ, we can declare that the Christian life is about “becoming fully human” (De Gruchy 1986: 75). In this perspective, one is not interested in a Christ who only offers eternal life, but in a Christ who recognises and sweats and bleeds with the victims of oppression (Bosch 1991: 513). The incarnation of Christ models to us what humanity should be concerned with. Christ shows us to be God’s image on earth, being fully human, and how – through being fully human – we can actually make God’s presence known. We can only be fully human if we fully identify with God’s reflection in ourselves – God’s presence in creation – the rest of the oikos on which we depend for life. Incarnation means identifying with humanity – also incarnation in the “rest” of God’s body, the earth. It also means identifying with humanity’s weakness, suffering and pain (De Gruchy 1986: 71). The theological notion of God’s presence with the poor influences the church’s involvement in mission and development as does the notion of incarnation.

### 3.2.5 Incarnation and development

God’s revelation in history is a narrative to which we fuse our own story. By so doing, we learn to make sense of our lives as a coherent narrative (Adeney 1999: 65). Therefore, development designed after God’s model of incarnation is more than working, even working hard. It is about giving recognition to and sweating and bleeding with the victims of oppression.
Incarnation as a model stands in opposition to modernisation which has shaped development praxis in our time and provided us with sets of values and attitudes that create social distance between the haves and have-nots, thus further dehumanising those on the margins. Incarnation befits God’s option for the poor and becomes a vehicle for the demonstration of the love of God to communities.

Incarnational models of development, such as the Tshwane Leadership Foundation in Tshwane for example, demonstrate that it is possible to work with the poor in a dignified manner. LED in Tshwane (S & H) could be modelled after incarnation (incarnation and creation) (see McFague 1993) in order to facilitate the shared prosperity that the oikos promotes. McFague’s model of the “Body of God” insightfully integrates incarnation and creation. This is elaborated on later under 3.3.2.1. Further, development modelled after incarnation will have an impact on public spheres of life of the city.

3.2.6 Public theology and development

In Biblical times BCE, the causes of poverty included wars (which increased food prices and resulted in the starvation of communities: 2 Kings 6: 28) , concentration of wealth in the hands of a few rich people, who lived in luxury and oppressed the poor (Hos. 12: 7-8, Amos 2: 7-8, 4: 1-7, 11; 8: 4-60, Mic. 2: 1-2), rulers who no longer held the land in trust for the welfare of the people but rather used their power to enrich and glorify themselves, perverting the entire economic system in the process), as well as natural disasters such as droughts, floods, and the like. Jumping forward to contemporary times, we still face some of the issues in Tshwane (S & H) to a great degree. That is why this research is aiming at sensitising the church on the periphery to become involved in LED in order to address poverty in the CoT (S & H). The intention is to mobilise the church to participate in public affairs and embrace a public theology which is consistent with the teachings of Jesus of Nazareth.

Public theology deals with the church in its focus on the world. This is the missionary or diaconal aspect of the church (Heitink 1993: 278) where Christ is mediated in the world. Basic themes for such public theology include faith and ethics, public language, solidarity with the poor, holistic, integrated and communal action, education and value systems. The church’s involvement in mission and development has to discern how to strategically engage the public sphere of policy and governance so that the interests of the poor are protected. In this endeavour, the
involvement of the church in development should lead to transformation and liberation (cf. de Gruchy 2007, see also Stackhouse 1987).

3.2.7 Transformation and liberation in relation to development

As I have illustrated in Chapter 2, a development effort which does not aim for liberation and transformation is problematic and short-sighted. Liberation and transformation are now closely associated with the concept of development. This new understanding has become widely accepted in church, Christian NGOs and missiological circles, such as the WCC, Tear Fund and World Vision to name but a few. Van Schalkwyk (1996: 47-49) speaks about the gradual shift from development-as-modernisation to development-as-transformation. This study has positioned itself over against modernisation and an economic-growth-only approach. O’Gorman, referred to earlier in the discussion on the different facets of development in Chapter 2, suggests that the chief goal of development and social change is to transform structures of oppression and to build a world of justice and dignity for all humans.

Transformation without liberation is futile. The traditional development approach needs to be replaced by a more radical one, calling for fundamental and radical change to the status quo that oppresses and excludes some people and groups (cf. De Beer 1998). This radical approach has to be taken for the purpose of liberation and should deal with dismantling or abolishing negative structures, prejudices and legislation that exploit some to the benefit of others. Moreover, the power imbalances between groups of people – or the hierarchies – which keep some people out of a prosperous centre of the economy and again draw others into the centre, should be dealt with. Further, the different placements of people in the centre-periphery diagram of development, based on people’s social status in terms of political, economic, social, class and gender factors, have to be overcome through a “liberational” development agenda. For example, in order for a development project in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal with the aims of transformation and liberation to be relevant, it must tackle issues of gender inequality which force women to be excluded from meaningful economic opportunities.

Development as liberation has been embraced by international social movements, including the WCC and the Evangelical World Alliance. These movements, for example, called for the dismantling of economic policies which enslave poor and marginalised communities (such as women) in the Southern hemisphere and the promotion of green energy and sustainable development.
Within the perspective of church, mission and development, liberation resonates with the tenets of the gospel and Human Development approach which speaks of holistic development in most spheres. A great deal still has to be achieved with regard to the ecological sphere. The township church in South Africa, being by default a church with the poor, has no option but to stand in solidarity with the poor by working for their liberation from structures and systems that dehumanise them and deprive them of their basic human rights and opportunities. This is why the church, following in the footsteps of the biblical prophets, is called to assume a prophetic role where she has to speak against injustice and the exploitation of the poor (Amos 8: 4-5, Isaiah 5: 7-8 and Amos 8: 6, 2: 6-8, Lev. 27: 2-9, Isaiah 3: 13-14, Mic. 2: 1-2, Jer. 22: 1-5). The question is, does the church indeed stand with the poor or is she just inwardly looking?

In addition to the prophetic role that the church is expected to assume, the church has received a divine calling to “do justice, love mercy and walk humbly with the Almighty God” Micah 6: 8) on the one hand while on the other, “she has to tell the story that can transform poverty to bounty, she has a set of principles, a development ethic that creates a fertile soil of development” (Miller 2000: 22).

3.2.8 Development may be linked to Christian social ethics

Generally, development aims at improving and sustaining the wellbeing of communities. Christian ethics is at the centre of faith-based development – although it relates to the value system of alternative development approaches. This can be closely related to the aim at the heart of Christian social ethics.

Embedded in this aim is the concern with “what ought to be”, which is at the heart of social ethics. Development from the church’s perspective cannot escape the issue of ethical considerations, specifically Christian social ethics. Gill explains:

(…) social ethics is concerned with what ought to be – with the values and norms against which the past and present are to be judged. While social ethics has a task distinctive from those of social history and social science, it cannot be successful in this endeavour without an ongoing interaction with these related fields. (Gill 2006: 627)

In the face of the socioeconomic injustice, marginalisation and poverty that affect communities of the CoT (S & H) for example, our development effort must aim to restore what ought to be, i.e. equity, prosperity and bounty for all, including women, while highlighting what was and what the situation in the CoT (S & H) really is. This thesis aimed at facilitating a process which will
hopefully lead to a realisation of what ought to be the case in Tshwane (S & H) in terms of LED. For this reason, we (the researcher and researched community) engaged in reflection, using the Biblical and theological concept, Oikos, as a hermeneutic framework to serve the communities of Tshwane (S & H) by imagining alternative LED models. Of course, this will be kept in creative tension between social histories (what was) and social science (what is). In the chapter entitled, “Christian Leadership in Another Country: Contributing to an Ethical Development Agenda in South Africa Today”, De Gruchy with Willem Ellis (2008: 10 - 15) acknowledges on the one hand that the South African development terrain has changed in the post-apartheid era. On the other, he affirms that those leaders and theologians who are interested in tackling the ethical concerns of the new development context have significant resources to start with, while at the same time they must know that there are some impediments. Among these resources, de Gruchy identified four:

In the first place, there is the passion and commitment to engage with wider society (...), the context may have changed, and our challenges quite different, but the desire of the previous generation to make a difference and their willingness to speak truth to power (...) is something we receive with gratitude from our predecessors.

Secondly, we will do well to remember that (...) the Church in South Africa has a history of seeking to build up.

The third general source that could contribute to Christian ethical reflection on development issues is one that theologians in particular need to pay greater attention to. This is the wisdom and capacity of lay Christians who are working in a wide range of significant disciplines such as economics, politics, development, public health, philosophy, anthropology and agriculture.

The fourth and final source (...) is resources that are shared with us outside South Africa, including the wider pan-African experience and the ecumenical movement (De Gruchy 2008: 11 – 13).

De Gruchy further highlighted four other factors we need to recognise as impediments to social development engagement:

The first obstacle is the loss of a generation of leadership. This generation emerged in the struggle against apartheid, and guided the Christian community through some of its darkest days.

The second, and more awkward is the pressure on the white male (heirs of much of the experience and generated knowledge in a wide range of academic disciplines) to relinquish this privilege. The point here is (...) to be creatively attentive to the impact that these are having on
building the next generation of leaders who are able to offer Christian ethical reflection on development concerns in an interdisciplinary way.

A third impediment is to be found in the rise of tide of secularisation within South African society, and with it the imposed consensus that if religion is to survive it may only do so in the ‘private’ realm.

A final factor which could impede our engagement with theological and ethical reflection around development is the ever-present temptation to be seduced by those who have power: the state or the private sector. (De Gruchy 2008: 14 – 15)

The models we seek to set in place in the CoT must pay heed to voices of wisdom such as de Gruchy’s and conform to the just, good and right orders of creation (see Genesis 1 & 2). By implication, the creation story is central to Christian social ethics for development. Against the backdrop of this narrative, other biblical themes that are related to development, such as the Fall, law and justice, the kingdom of God and the alternative community, to name but a few, are surveyed below.

3.2.8.1. The Fall, development and social ethics

Steward observed, “when sin entered the world all the relationships were affected and thus ‘sunk’” (Steward 1994: 14). The Fall indicates that evil originates in rebellion against God and disobedience to God’s command. Evil is manifested in accusation, division, and the domination of one human being over another (Adam and Eve, Cain and Abel) and corruption of the earth. Gill expounds:

Cain’s departure from the presence of God in favour of building his own city and society (Genesis 4) and subsequent revelation concerning the city (Babel/ Babylon, Nineveh, etc.) completes this initial description of social evil. Its essential characteristics are pride, disobedience to God, accusation, division, domination, exploitation, violence, and the will to power. (Gill 2006: 630)

The social evil in turn corrupts social structures and forces. This was aptly expressed by Bosch when he highlighted that sin “is not only in human hearts but also in social structures” (Bosch 1991: 34; see also Gill 2006: 630).

In the light of the above, a Christian perspective on development, in its embedded aim to promote co-humanity, works to restrain social evil by combating evil and injustice wherever
these might be in society. The preferred approaches to development aim at what ought to be as it was in the beginning. They are about “reversing the consequences of the fall” (Steward 1994:14)

3.2.8.2 Law, justice and development

The pursuit of justice is one of the important goals of development, from what a Christian perspective ought to be, as was discussed earlier. In relation to development and social ethics, justice is concerned with kindness and righteous acts to benefit the oppressed and poor.

According to Gill (2006: 631), “biblical justice is more than fairness and equality. It is revealed to be a redress of grievances for the benefit of the oppressed”. In an era in which injustice and marginalisation are common practices, Christian development seeks to give voice to the biblical concept of justice as embedded in God’s economy, the oikos, used in this research. In God’s economy, prosperity is shared and redistributed equitably (Isaiah 58 and Amos 5 refer). Christian integral development should be the catalyst of this sharing and redistribution and should see it as a kingdom mandate to do so.

3.2.8.3 The Kingdom of God and development

Gill (2006: 631) contends, “The church is (or is supposed to be) the primary exemplar of the kingdom of God, which is in tension with the kingdom of this world” The kingdom of God is marked by caritas (love for God) while the kingdom of this world is marked by cupiditas (love for self). Development influences the church to stop reflecting a “miniature” Jesus which merely consists of getting people saved and then letting them stand inside the door of the kingdom, calling others to salvation. This problem is explained by Cope:

We do not know how to think about God’s political agenda. We don’t know what the gospel has to say about building our lives and communities economically. We don’t know how to keep our marriages together. We don’t have time for secular activities like arts. We huddle in the foyer of God’s mansion and try to define ourselves there because our lives have less and less to do with the outside world (Cope 2006: 41 – 42).

What Cope states above is unfortunately the sad reality of most parts of the history of the church and is still prevalent today in some church communities. This is marked by the tendency to seek refuge from the world we live in, rather than engaging with it. To correct this mind-set in my church community, I was convinced that a biblical understanding of the kingdom of God is a place to start in educating the church. Kingdom theology has more to it than salvation of souls.
Development is therefore strategic in providing a bridge for the church to become involved in building and transforming lives and communities.

In my experience, we (i.e. our team in the Baptist Church) needed to travel around the country to assert the fact that the kingdom is bigger than the church and that a contextual, holistic approach to ministry / mission is most suited for transformation and liberation. We organised workshops dealing with what God says about government, education, economics, family, the arts, communication, science, environment and the church. It became obvious that the God of the kingdom was the “God of all things” (Cope 2006: 42). It is therefore important to understand the rules of God’s economy for the household of God, the oikos. Russell (1987: 25) speaks of all households being linked together in God’s oikos which is in essence the kingdom of God. In this household, all members live and prosper in freedom, as Russell (1987: 26) emphasises.

Consequently the notion of God’s economy is central to this study. To speak of it is to speak of the “rules that God has established for our household, the world in which people live, work, struggle, flourish and die” (The Oikos Journey 2006: 24). A kingdom theology for development befits God’s economy. It simply means that a Christian development ministry should function according to the said rules in order to advance the causes of the kingdom. This way the church will not be ashamed of the gospel because it is relevant to all human beings’ needs and the issues we face today (cf. Cope 2006: 42 and Romans 1: 16). Development work done by the church is a gospel witness to the world we live in today. In my experience, the said witness is lived out as an alternative by a group of like-minded and value-based individuals. The functions of this alternative community are described here.

3.2.9 Church as an alternative Christian community for development

The formation of an alternative Christian community plays an important role in implementing Christian development. “The primary alternative community is the church (both its local and broader senses)” (Gill 2006: 634). Intentionally Christian businesses, schools, political groups, and other associations are other means by which a Christian development strategy may be employed. Gill elaborates on the significance of an alternative Christian community:

Alternative Christian communities have fivefold-significance for the implementation of social concern.
First, the community is an essential context for moral deliberation and discernment. The individual gifts and abilities of members of the community combine to discern the best possible responses to the complex issues and dilemmas of contemporary society.

Second, the very existence of the community (with its ultimate commitment to Jesus Christ) contributes to the health of society by opening up the social order. Totalitarian, monistic tendencies are held in check by the existence of alternative communities in society.

Third, the Christian community furnishes society with an example of “another way” of dealing with various social problems (leadership patterns, welfare activities, and so on).

Fourth, the community can function as a laboratory in which various reforms can be tested, refined, and demonstrated.

Fifth, the community prepares and assists individuals who go out from the community into the various structures and situations in the broader society. It is a resource not only for discernment but for social action. (Gill 2006: 634 – 635)

Development work by the church has aimed, amongst other things, to point to alternatives resulting from processes of discernment which should hopefully lead to “another way” of dealing with complex socioeconomic issues facing humanity today. Church development work becomes a laboratory which prepares and assists individuals to engage structures and the broader society towards social transformation. This is one place where this thesis concurs with Forrester (1997): that theology is not the preserve of the private domain. As I stated earlier, development work provides a bridge for the church to witness in the public domain. This agrees with the notion of “the church with others” (Bosch 1991: 368 - 368), “the church which shares in secular problems of ordinary human life, not dominating, but helping and serving” (Bonhoeffer 1971: 382f). In essence, the church which shares in secular problems of society should come up with positive alternatives to issues such as economic injustice, poverty, marginalisation, so on and so forth.

Based on their resources and assets as discussed earlier under Christian development social ethics, local expressions of the church are beginning to reflect on the current economic situation riddled with inequalities and are somehow attempting to formulate alternatives based on their local experience. Admittedly, the church and its ministries are not schooled in the technical aspects of economic analysis but “do reserve the right to make a statement about the current situation, which is based first and foremost on the reality of our Christian faith, on the basis of
the moral inclination – and more specifically that sense of social justice – that we believe this faith instils in us” (Swarts et al 2010: 260).

Helping and serving communities through development work gives the church opportunities to participate in social, political and economic issues. In relation to government, Cope encourages participation as she sees it mirrored in the life of Jesus.

Jesus understood that government had a role in His Father’s kingdom. He was disciple by the Old Testament and He disciple with the Old Testament. Jesus understood that He was the King of kings and that His message was a message of salvation and a message of political justice. (Cope 2006: 48) [sic]

In essence, through development work the Church steps out to live her faith in public spheres. Yet, she brings in a definitive perspective in the implementation of the development project.

3.3 Church perspective on development

In Chapter 2 (section 2.1) I drew attention to the complexity surrounding development and underlined that a narrow understanding is no longer in resonance with the understanding of many sectors and praxes. A church perspective on development is not necessarily in opposition to the understanding highlighted in Chapter 2, but it does start off with a different mind-set. The church believes in the care and empowerment of the poor and the marginalised, yet her vision is beyond material prosperity and modernity. Grant expands:

Being inspired by biblical narratives the church is not inclined to believe that if there is in place the right projects, with the right support systems, with enough resources, and with the appropriate management efficiencies, all poverty and marginalization would be solved. Not even if awareness could be raised, consciousness heightened, and is able to enlist governmental approval; it is not possible to end the blight of lack around the globe. (Grant in Miller 2000: iii)

Grant’s view is realistic, not pessimistic. In essence, he recognises on one hand the complexity of social reality and the brokenness of human nature. On the other he acknowledges that a holistic spiritual healing in society, including development, can only be achieved if we embrace a spirituality which is God-centred. This complexity could be related at the same time to spiritual, environmental, political as well as socioeconomic issues. Thus, any task towards social change including development necessitates a well thought out holistic and integrated approach. Schluter elucidates:
The biblical emphasis is on the quality of social (and spiritual), political, and economic (and environmental) relationships, which may be summarised as ‘relational well-being’ (RWB). Therefore, national aspirations should not focus primarily on levels or distribution of income, nor on individual freedom and choice. Rather, Christians should re-examine policy and project goals in both high-income and low-income societies from a relational perspective, to tackle relational deprivation as well as material poverty. How we (Christians) get involved says a lot about our spirituality. There is a need for a spirituality of development which is sound with Scripture and facilitates development in communities. (Schluter 2006: 2)

As argued earlier, the church possesses social and spiritual capitals, which, if sufficiently mobilised, could contribute towards restoring these relationships to enhance the well-being and welfare of human and non-human beings on earth.

From the foregoing, I wish to recapitulate the following issues: 1) the importance of balanced relationships; 2) the importance of biblical narratives for development; 3) doing the right thing; 4) the role of the Christian community; 5) spirituality of development and 6) the understanding of poverty. These are important links in the theological and practical involvement of the church in development.

### 3.3.1 Relational deprivation as the main cause of lack of development

Broken relationships are one of the core reasons which lead creation to suffering and misery. The Creator intended creatures to enjoy harmony and remain in relation to or connection with the rest of the creation in their different spheres. Cope has identified seven “spheres of society” that are interlinked i.e. family (home), church (religion), education, media (electronic and printed), celebration (arts, entertainment and sports), economy (research and development, production, sales and service, i.e. commerce) and government (all branches) (Cope 2006: 7). Steward (1994) speaks of three connections, i.e. God connects both with humanity and the earth, humanity connects with God and the earth, the Earth connects with God and humanity. Myers (1999: 27) distinguished four fundamental relationships, as explained later in the discourse on theology of development. For the present, I want to state that if any one of these connections is broken there is relational deprivation of some sort which affects all other relationships, including economic ones.

When the church is involved in development, it aims to restore these connections and to reverse relational deprivation in all spheres of society. In my view, the biggest challenge which hinders
progress is the dichotomised worldview (i.e. sacred vs secular or spiritual vs material) which is prevalent in society today. In many regards, this worldview is still ubiquitous because of the churches’ “spiritual concept of salvation which neglects social concerns and has an inflexible orthodoxy which spiritualises human needs and offers stereotyped spiritual recipes” (Nürnberger 1999: 371). Therefore, wherever and whenever these concepts of spiritual salvation and spiritualisation of human needs are operational, the church distances itself from real contextual issues in communities. To avoid this from happening, I argue that the church can become a “church with others” and a “bridge between the worlds of faith and development”. This way it will enhance its contribution towards social change. Given the complex reality of poverty, lack of development and socioeconomic inequalities in South Africa I contend that the Christian church has an inescapable responsibility and calling to become involved in development; thus, coming to be one of the active partners with other sectors in social development.

Notably, it has been realised that “no single sector can alleviate poverty on its own (....). Hence, appropriate interventions for poor people include such diverse sectors as economic development, health, education, agriculture, spiritual formation, etc.” (Corbett & Fikkert 2009: 13). In short, underdevelopment or lack of development is a result of dysfunctional relationships in society and also between these different sectors.

The church or the Christian community correlates this dysfunction with the Fall in Genesis 3. This correlation makes the Church perspective on development a profoundly theological and missiological issue. In Christian theology the Fall is better understood in relation to creation and redemption. With reference to sustainability and the broader development project, Bookless (2007: 45) speaks of the “creation-fall-redemption paradigm”. When these three themes are considered together, this paradigm gives us a “classic Christian analysis of both the human condition and the state of the planet” in that 1) God made a good world, 2) human moral failure causes a breakdown in the relationships between God, people and all creation, 3) God in Christ provides hope for humanity and for the whole material creation.

In relation to sustainability Bookless (2007: 47) offers helpful insights when he remarks: the “Christian paradigm of a world created good, spoiled by humanity, but redeemed by God in Christ offers a hope wider than human activity and that also compels human beings to respond in hopeful action. Because of Christ we have hope for the world, and can live and act hopefully”. Theologically / missiologically it is understood that the churches’ involvement in development is a hopeful action aimed at salvation / restoration of all relationships in creation. This is the task of
integral mission by the church. Hence, a lack of development which manifests itself in broken relations that yield to poverty, for example, deserves theological consideration because “the problem (of poverty) goes well beyond the material dimension, so the solutions must go beyond the material as well” (Corbett & Fikkert 2009: 54). Poverty is a result of broken relations between God and people, between people and the earth and between people and people. Therefore in essence, the church’s involvement in development as hopeful action seeks to build and restore communities holistically so that there are harmonious relationships all around. Where these exist all sectors prosper, as implied in the Bible (see Genesis 1-2).

Although the Bible is not a textbook on development, particularly LED, it does provide valuable insights into the nature of human beings, of history, of culture, and of God, to point us in the right direction. Remarkably significant in the church’s perspective on development is the place of Biblical narratives in comparison to the philosophies and approaches of development discussed in Chapter 2. The Bible should inspire development work by the church because dealing with issues related to well-being of human beings and the rest of creation is crucial to God.

Myers (1999: 27) argues that “in order to diagnose the disease of poverty correctly, we must consider the fundamental nature of reality, starting with the Creator of that reality”. In his view, before the Fall, God established four foundational relationships for each person: a relationship with God, with self, with others, and with the rest of creation as illustrated in Figure 2. In essence, Myers points to Genesis, at the beginning of creation, as the starting point for a theology of development.
Fig: 3.2 shows the interconnectedness of the four foundational relationships

According to Corbett and Fikkert (2009), the four key relationships draw attention to the fact that human beings have multifaceted connections that are supposed to sustain life on earth. This implies that poverty alleviation and, LED in particular, should be multifaceted as well. Therefore, we are required to remember that humans are spiritual, social, psychological and physical beings, so that our poverty alleviation efforts will be more holistic in their design and execution. Furthermore, the four relationships are to be seen as the building blocks of all human activity on earth; thus the effects of the Fall (cf. Genesis 3) are manifested in the economic (including the environment), social, religious, and political systems that humans have created throughout history. Hence, Christian leaders and thinkers committed to holistic spirituality of development and mission often wrestle with the question which pertains to the purpose of development. Is the church in a position to redefine and re-appropriate a social spirituality from scripture and from the rich heritage of the church which promotes the church’s community participation?

One such thinker is Suderman who points out that the Bible gives hints as regards the beginning and the end of the biblical witness:
The Bible begins in Eden and ends in the New Jerusalem. Both the origin and the destination of the biblical witness point toward the same realities: harmony among human beings, harmony between the human and nature, harmony between the human and God, harmony between nature and God, ecological harmony, psychological harmony, sexual harmony, cultural harmony, the abundance of peace, the absence of suffering, the absence of evils, the absence of tears and sadness, the purpose is life in abundance. (Suderman 1998: 17)

Campolo adds; “it began in the Garden (place of harmony), it will end in the City (shalom will be the mark of this city)” (Verbatim, 11 July 2003, South African Christian Leaders Assembly II at Pretoria Show Grounds).

From the above, I agree that on the one hand these four relationships are building blocks of all human activity. They provide crucial insights into the order, interdependent nature and harmony of the created reality. On the other hand, these relationships suggest that a holistic and an integrated process of development are most appropriate when one is working for transformation and liberation. Nevertheless, there is still a challenge for many Christians involved in development work to embrace a holistic and integrated praxis in a systematic and consistent manner for various reasons. I would argue that commitment to such a praxis is a matter of choice and befits the aims of transformative action. By no means do I suggest that this is easy.

Reflecting on the Letlhabile Baptist project experience in Hammanskraal (South Africa) in 1990s, Lowe and Mangayi (1999: 35 – 36) identified a number of factors that were conducive to sustained application of a praxis of this nature. Among other things, they singled out the participation of open-minded Christians holding a broad view of mission and ministry, relationships and associations with other like-minded groups as fundamental; the optimum use of resources (stewardship); the incorporation of interdependent and complementary processes such as welfare and charity (feeding schemes and clinic), socioeconomic empowerment (i.e. agricultural projects, self-help, adult basic education and literacy and home industry projects) and spiritual formation (i.e. Bible studies, evangelism and pastoral care). In this project, it was necessary to work in partnership with Agricor (the government’s agricultural extension office at the time) for our agricultural programme. The self-help programme was developed with the technical assistance of another FBO known at the time as Tumelong Mission. The adult basic education and literacy programme was a joint operation between the local Baptist church and the North-West Department of Education. Home industries, specifically knitting and sewing, were sponsored by individual volunteers from churches in the city of Pretoria. Of importance is the fact that in this project all welfare and charity and community development activities
mentioned here were integrated with spiritual inputs. For example, a food garden activity started with a bible study which reflected on how to care organically for the earth so that it will remain fertile. A bible study on work as an integral part of home industries activities is another example. In short, at this centre, charity and development ministries as well as spiritual ministries were interwoven and as a result, development happened concurrently with spiritual formation and vice versa. This project thrived because of its strategic relations with sectors such as agriculture, health and education. According to them (Lowe and Mangayi 1999), these abovementioned factors sustained the application of a holistic and integrated praxis at Letlhabile as long as they were kept in place.

To my knowledge, a holistic and integrated praxis framework works when we perceive reality as a whole and not as compartments. The theological concept "Oikos" adopted in this thesis reinforces this notion of wholeness in terms of life, work, economy, prosperity etcetera. I elaborate on this concept later in the text.

From empirical observation, I argued in this thesis that there is fundamental relational deprivation as well as material and economic poverty in Tshwane. The suburbia and other affluent parts of the city are strategically connected and in close relation with centres of power, factors which continue to trigger the expansion of their economic growth while the periphery, which is mainly made up of townships and informal settlements, starves from the lack of meaningful relations essential for survival and development. This is where the church, with membership scattered across different spheres of influence and power, could help in ways that facilitate the participation of the poor thus maximising access to activities and opportunities.

The church on mission with God, should not only facilitate social inclusion by nurturing the relational well-being concept, it ought also to be involved in social development as a matter of spirituality. With reference to the city, this is what Kritzinger (2014: 1) called a “concrete spirituality” that connects God’s presence directly with people’s daily struggles to be human in the city. Such a spirituality “needs to be concrete in the sense of not being abstract and theoretical, but also in the sense of being at home in the hard pavement realities of a South African city” (Kritzinger 2014: 1). As discussed later, for me social development gives

43 Relational deprivation as defined by Amartya Sen (2000) refers to social exclusion: the exclusion of the poor from participation and access to opportunities and activities. See Sen, A. (2000). Social exclusion: Concept, application, and scrutiny from atmire.com
expression to that spirituality; the latter again, inevitably, moves one to be involved in social development.

From a missiological perspective, concrete spirituality motivates one to point out forms of poverty and vulnerability, social injustices, power imbalances, gender inequality and the like in which we are called to recognise the suffering Christ. Therefore, we are called to act hopefully so that restoration and collective wellbeing is realised. As a result, concrete spirituality reinforces the notion of doing and living out a Bible-based comprehensive and integral mission. It is anchored in the theology of solidarity with the poor in meaningful ways (Miguez 1979: 261). It is about magnifying God’s presence with the poor. It is a matter of faith in the public sphere and of doing justice.

Some of the stepping stones towards a theology of LED are addressed below.

3.3.2. Towards a theology of development (particularly LED)

Although the church’s development praxis makes use of the same variety of facets and approaches discussed in Chapter 2 (2.1.1 & 2.1.2) it receives its mandate from the Bible and theological teachings.

In my professional experience and praxis in post-apartheid South Africa, I receive inspiration from the creation story (i.e. God created everything good, in perfect harmony and as a result all forms of life prospered. Therefore, I must work towards maintaining and restoring harmony and bounty), clues from the liberation story (i.e. God works to set humans and all creation free from all forms of oppression. Like God, I must work towards setting the oppressed free, seeking clues for the reconstruction story (i.e. God rebuilt, God is making all things new. Therefore, I must co-work with God who is rebuilding) and clues from the “promised land” story (i.e. God set the oppressed free to inherit a land flowing with milk and honey and work for them to erect a city free of misery, sickness, etcetera. There is still work for me to do so that communities enjoy a foretaste of the Promised Land). These clues have been very helpful to me in sketching my personal theology of development as an urban missiologist in South Africa.

Insights from the Oikos Journey (2006) have enlightened me further to see that these paradigms fit together in the oikos concept. Engaging with the biblical framework of the Oikos
Journey, De Gruchy (2007: 2) recognises that these four paradigms are important and should be integrated and interrelated in regard to the African context. For instance, he points out that:

Our reality in Africa suggests that we cannot separate between Liberation or Creation paradigms...Because of colonialism, the liberation struggle is about the Land – and land is part of God's creation. So to struggle for the land means both paying attention to questions of freedom and liberation, and questions of creation and ecology. To take back the land is one thing. To look after it for the next generations is another. The Oikos Journey is interested in both. (De Gruchy 2007: 2).

In this thesis, the oikos root metaphor is used as the framework for a theology of LED in Tshwane (S & H). In this framework, issues related to creation, liberation, reconstruction or rebuilding and working to produce and distribute the bounty of the land are viewed in terms of this image.

Echoing the sentiment of Newbigin (1986), Bosch points out that “we live in a world in which millions of people enjoy a standard of material wealth that few kings and queens could match then” (Bosch 1991: 435) [in Biblical times]. In the meantime, the majority is living in perpetual poverty and misery. Fortunately, in 1968 at the Catholic Bishops of Latin America’s conference held at Medellin 44, Columbia Liberation Theology was launched into mainstream Catholic thinking. This led to the articulation, in 1979 at Puebla 45 in Mexico, of the concept of God’s “preferential option for the poor” (see Gutierrez 1973; Gutierrez & Muller 2015; Le Roux 2011: 17) which points out that at the centre of the Judeo-Christian tradition is the principle that God in a special way is on the side of the poor.

---

44 The praxis endorsed at Medellin included struggle for fulfilment of basic human needs, for jobs, food, clothing, shelter, education, health-care, trade unions and for participation in decision-making in all areas that affect people’s lives. Conditions in which basic human rights—both civil liberties and socio-economic rights—were denied to the masses, were denounced as social sin. Structures of oppression and injustice were unmasked and denounced in the name of the Gospel. And in the ensuing interplay between faith and public policy developmentalist theories and policies were rejected because they left existing political, economic, land-ownership and trade-related structures intact, to the benefit of the wealthy and powerful and at the expense of the poor and powerless. Instead, what was opted for is best described as liberation, i.e., persons at all levels—including personal, social, national—becoming the subjects of their own history and controlling their own resources and political and economic destinies as collaborators and not as the passive objects of other people's decisions and quest for ever-increasing profit.

45 In Puebla, despite its hesitations and ambiguities, the struggle continued the thrust of Medellin. It articulated the preferential option for the poor as a task for the church in Latin America and for the universal church in full awareness of the radical implications of this axiom for the church and for global politics and economics.
For me this was and still is indeed a voice of conscience which confronts the church to rethink its ministry to the poor and the marginalised. Increasingly, we have come to accept that Christian mission is confronted by poverty and economic injustice in particular, and calls for mission strategies that are relevant to today, yet also faithful to the Christian message. In the same vein, Le Roux concurs that the most pressing challenge which faces the church in mission is the growing threat of poverty on a world-wide scale (Le Roux 2011: 60). With reference to Africa, Botha (2008: 49) highlighted the African tragedy. He listed the needs and dangers of Africa such as poverty and famine, disease, war and civil war, violent crime, corruption, despotic rule, ignorance, illiteracy and natural disaster.

Issues of sustainability must also be added to this list. With all these contextual issues facing Christian mission it is necessary, in the words of Wright (2010: 26 – 27), that we embrace a theology of mission which perceives (1) the whole world as the goal of God’s mission; (2) the whole world as the arena of God’s mission; (3) and that the scope of mission includes the whole of creation – including nonhuman beings. As stated in chapter one (1.7.7), it simply means that God’s mission of love (Missio Dei) is more comprehensive than has traditionally been the case where the focus was on evangelism, especially in the evangelical sector.

With reference to this study, the above point implies a demonstration of love at the heart of the missionary God in economic and social terms and ecological terms. The oikos concept is an important factor in the theology of LED that I present in this thesis. I discuss this concept in relation to economy in the sections that follow, where I draw attention to the Oikos and eco-theology, the ecological crisis, as well as to how we can address the crisis (the planetary agenda) in ways which could lead to the collective well-being of all inhabitants of the planet.

3.3.2.1. Oikos, Eco-theology or ecological worldview and LED

Building on the oikos concept, Conradie (2006: 13 – 14) places the ecological worldview in perspective. He starts by defining the parameters of the latter, clarifying that:

The word “environment” does not only refer to the world of non-human nature but also includes the following aspects:

- The biophysical environment, including water, air, soil, plants and animals
- The built environment, including houses, offices, urban planning
- The social environment, including civil society, communities and local neighbourhoods
The breadth and complexity of the environment or oikos is considerable. Further, Conradie points out: “It is helpful to observe how these biophysical, social, economic and political aspects of the environment are related to one another in multiple ways” (p14). The church, particularly the ecumenical movement, has captured “this interrelatedness of the political quest for democracy, the economic quest for justice and development, the social quest for reconciliation and peace and the ecological quest for sustainability in the call for ‘Justice, Peace and the Integrity of Creation’”(p14). Thus, with particular reference to South Africa, he urges us “to counter a popular perception that environment issues boil down to nature conservation” (p14). In my observation, government officials are particularly prone to this perception. The City of Tshwane, for example, gives priority to conserving the Botanical Garden in Pretoria East and the game reserve in Hammanskraal yet neglects to alleviate pollution and deforestation. Thus, I contend that any attempt towards LED in Tshwane should consider the environment in its entirety for its effectiveness.

Therefore, I concur with Conradie (2006: 15) that

There is the need to locate environmental concerns within the mainstream of economic activities (industry, commerce, agriculture, fisheries, forestry, mining, services, etc.). The environmental impact of each of these sectors of the economy needs to be assessed (…) Environmental concerns should be related to people’s living conditions.

As a result, I argue against the anthropocentric focus of development which has been prevalent in the development sector. The deficiency of most of the approaches to development discussed in chapter 2 is rooted in anthropocentrism. For instance, the establishment of new social housing settlements in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal meant clearing all vegetation and other communities of non-human beings for the sake of the human habitat. Very little has been done to care for and sustain the earth.

This anthropocentric focus must be abandoned in order to embrace the planetary agenda which is broader, and has in view the collective wellbeing of human as well as nonhuman beings of the Oikos. The fact is, states Conradie (2006: 15), “our own bodies form part of the environment in
which we live. We are living in the earth and form part of the earth”. The Greek metaphor of oikos, expresses a concern for the well-being of all forms of life in this single household. One of the outcomes of this thesis will, hopefully, be a broader acceptance of the oikos framework for understanding God and our work. Hence, relational deprivation and disconnections are detrimental and counter-productive for the shared prosperity and well-being of all forms of life in the oikos.

Drawing from the foregoing, I argue that specifically in economic development we should rather be working for the collective well-being of society using “appropriate laws or rules (nomoi) for the household, the art of administering the global household” (Conradie 2006: 15, see also McFague 2001 on rules for planetary living). Thus, within the oikos as a framework for economic development, knowing the intricate ways in which ecosystems interact to ensure the functioning of the biosphere (that is, ecology) is of paramount importance. We do not “manipulate” the biosphere; we work in harmony with it as we go about the business of the economy. Further, economic development activity is an “ecojustice” issue which “captures the need for a comprehensive sense of justice which can respond to both economic injustice and ecological degradation”. In short, economic development activity should aim to encourage both human and non-human beings in sharing the prosperity and wealth of the oikos.

Thanks to the various discourses within the WCC the church’s perspective on oikos in relation to well-being as “it is primarily concerned with the health of all forms of life in this one household” (Conradie 2006: 17) was broadened biblically. Conradie (2006: 16 - 17) and others such as Rasmussen (1994) and Raiser (1997) emphasise the following observations that have emerged in what may now be called an “oikos”-theology:

1. It compels us to be “ecumenics”, that is treating the inhabitants of the household as a single family, human and nonhuman together, and fostering the unity of that family (see Raiser 1997: 49). Rasmussen (1994: 118) contends that the notion of the whole household of God may serve as a theological root metaphor for the health of all forms of life in this planet. In this thesis, it served as a metaphor for LED in Tshwane. I envision a life-given local economy and local household / oikos understanding of holistic and sustainable LED.

2. It has been employed for an anthropology of stewardship (the oikonomos) or one of being “at home on earth” (Conradie 2005 & Conradie 2006: 6-7, 26-40)
3. It has also been employed as a soteriology and an ecclesiology focussing on the way of becoming members of the household of God (Eph. 2: 19-22) (Meeks 1989: 33 – 36)

4. An eschatology expressing the hope that the home which we as humans inhabit (the earth) will indeed become God’s home (Conradie 2000 / 2005)

5. A pastoral theology toward the edification of the household (oikodome) (see Muller-Fahrenholz 1995: 109) and an ethics of eco-justice (see WCC document: Justice, Peace and Creation 2005)


8. Christians understand themselves to be members of the “household of God” (Eph. 2: 19-22), while Christian communities live from the conviction that the whole household (oikos) belongs to GOD and has to answer to God’s economy (Conradie 2006: 16)

The observations presented in the foregoing are pertinent for this research. They helped me to refrain from a narrow, anthropocentric perspective of development. I concur with Conradie (2006: 17) that the notion of the household of God makes us able to integrate a variety of concerns for the well-being of the whole planet:

- The integrity of the biosphysical foundations of this house (the earth’s biosphere)
- The economic management of the household’s affairs
- The need for peace and reconciliation amidst ethnic, religious and domestic violence within this single household
- A concern for issues of health and education
- The place of women and children within this household, and the imbalances in power relationships between men and women as part of the causal roots for a lack of sustainable and human-centred development specifically in Tshwane (S & H). An ecumenical sense of unity not only of the church, but also of the human community as a whole and of all of God’s creation, the whole inhabited world (oikoumene) (see also Raiser 1997: 49).
Of great importance regarding the household of God (οικός) as a root metaphor for ecological theology is recognition and restoration of relations between human and nonhuman inhabitants of the planet. The strength of the οικός lies in the fact that “although the earth does not provide a home for all yet, the yearning of Christian hope is that all God’s creatures will find a lasting home in God’s household” (Conradie 2006: 17). In this thesis, I recognised that there are a great number of human and nonhuman beings in Tshwane (S & H) that do not feel at home in this city because of poverty, marginalisation and abuse. I, nonetheless, see in this metaphor as giving hope that, with consensus and concerted effort, the churches could work towards a LED which provides all creatures with a lasting home in Tshwane. It could mean integrating the different concerns (such as welfare and relief, development, participation in social movements, etc.) for their well-being.

However, contends Conradie (2006: 17), the household of God as a root metaphor for ecological theology displays certain limitations:

- It can easily be employed to serve the interests of patriarchs, possessive parents, the propagation of preconceived “family values”, the restriction of slaves, women and children to the private sphere, or the domestication of emancipatory struggles (see Meeks 1989: 8)
- We must remember that many a dictator has tried to portray himself as a “family man”
- In pluralist industrial societies the influence of the household is often restricted to the sphere of private or to recreation after hours.
- The use of the οικός metaphor may therefore (...).reinforce the marginalisation and privatisation of Christian witness in society.
- If anything, the earth is portrayed in the creation narratives in Genesis not as a house but rather as an active empowering agent which brings forth life

Building on the foregoing, I submit that the theology of LED I argue for should take notice of the shortcomings of the οικός and guard against falling into these. It is therefore imperative that we “reform” the way we think, see and talk about the environment and its “usefulness”. We can start by recognising that our survival in any sphere of life on earth depends also on the state of the earth.
Conradie (2006: 18) suggests: “All theological disciplines may facilitate reflection on the challenge posed by the environmental degradation” and its impact on the economy and vice versa. I go even further to suggest, as did McFague (1993), that all disciplines have an inescapable responsibility to carry out these reflections so that they inform the prospect of “hopeful action”. This thesis for example has attempted to “discern” what is going on in the local economy of Tshwane (S & H) from a multi-disciplinary perspective, engaging in critical dialogue development studies, ecclesiological praxes, missiology and local economic development (see Chapter 6: narrative findings).

For the purpose of reflection McFague (1993: 17) suggests the model of the Body. The vulnerability of certain bodies – those of living organic beings – and those of women and children – in the face of hierarchical and violent systems of power and the use of people and nature are central to this model. She contends that “[t]he model of the body includes all life forms; indeed, all matter on our planet (as well as in the entire universe)” and continues:

The body model gives us both an ecological and a justice context for theology, for it involves a planetary perspective while focussing on the most basic needs of human beings, the model of the universe as God’s body also suggests both anthropology and a theology – a way of seeing our proper place as inspired bodies within the larger body, within the scheme of things, and a way of seeing both the immanence and the transcendence of God – God as the inspired body of the whole universe.. (McFague 1993: 22)

As Van Schalkwyk (2012: 100-101) writes, “the predominant approach to welfare and development is still anthropocentric, which is to the detriment of both human communities and ecosystems”; she (2012: 99) advocates

for faith communities to ground their understanding of welfare and wellbeing (SHALOM) in a deep connection with the ecology, and in an experience of the presence of God there, so as to broaden and deepen their practice of welfare and development to encompass the wellbeing of the whole community of living beings

In this thesis, I concur with Van Schalkwyk as I have argued above. In essence, by using the oikos as the hermeneutic key this thesis sought to articulate a position beyond “the limited understanding of welfare and development inherited of the historical church’s engagement with the poor as accomplices of economic and political forces of capitalism” (Van Schalkwyk 2012: 101, see also Swart 2006: 11 -29). Thus, I set out to understand the role of township churches and LED within a sustainable framework (see 1.7.5) “so as to bring social regeneration and
economic wealth into balance with ecological systems” (Van Schalkwyk 2012: 102). This is an imperative, given the current ecological crisis.

3.3.2.2. Ecological crisis and mission

According to Bookless (2008: 97), mission that excludes the non-human creation stems from a biblically deficient understanding of God’s mission for humanity: therefore, instead of placing all the emphasis on the Matthew 28 passage, Christians should also consider the Great Commission as being contained in Gen. 1: 26 – 28 where humans are called to be God’s representatives and stewards in serving and preserving non-human creation. Admittedly, God created the world and pronounced it "very good" (Genesis 1:31). However, because of the fall and the resulting curse, creation "groans in travail" (Romans 8:22). The thoughtlessness, greed, and violence of sinful human beings have damaged God’s good creation and produced a variety of ecological problems and conflicts. When we abuse and pollute creation, as we are doing in many instances, we are poor stewards and invite disaster in both local and global eco-systems.

Ecological / environmental degradation is one of the biggest threats we face on this planet. As McFague (1993: 2) states, “While the threat of nuclear extinction has not disappeared, a new one has emerged: ecological degradation”. The magnitude of the crisis requires that all sectors of the economy, all spheres of life and all disciplines, including missiology / theology, contribute solutions that could alleviate the crisis. It was, therefore, imperative for the present researcher to bear this in mind. Thus the type of LED that I argued for is one that should not aggravate the crisis. McFague (1993: 3–7) elaborates on the magnitude of the environmental degradation crisis and explains its gravity as summarised in the following points:

1. Ecological deterioration is sufficiently gradual that it can appear imperceptible – we become used to it rather than announcing destruction… At most, we treat the problem like a bad cold that will eventually go away if we make a few minor life-style changes, such as recycling (…). Profound life-style changes (…) are highly unpopular. Human beings are the perpetrators of the

Environmental degradation is basically anything and everything that deviates from a natural process or structure. In other words, degradation of the environment is either: significant damage to, or a complete loss of an environmental process or structure. Most people associate environmental degradation with environmental pollution. But it encompasses a much broader area than just pollution and touches upon all realms of life - air, water and land. (http://www.tropical-rainforest-animals.com/environmental-degradation.html accessed 25 November 2015) [Emphases are in original.]
ecological crisis. As a result, life on this planet is diminishing; both in variety and in quality, and we human beings, some more than others, are to blame (p3) Given the imbalances of power and exploitation of the poor, women, children and nature, development work has to foster liberation of these categories.

2. Deterioration does not affect us equally: it affects people along class, race and gender lines (McFague 1993: 4 & 5)

- Ecological deterioration hits the poor, the weak, and the vulnerable. ...those who feel the impact the most are the least responsible for it, and those most responsible are the least impacted

- As more of the earth becomes desert, water scarcer, air more polluted, food less plentiful, the lines between the “haves” and the “have nots” will become even more sharply drawn

- ...those with power will do what is necessary to insure their own piece of the disappearing pie

- If we refuse to moderate this life-style (of middle class westerner), we participate in systemic injustice, demanding an excessive piece of the pie

- The full truth is that we cannot live without the plants and animals and the ecosystem that support us all. The ecological issue is a people issue and a justice issue, for the ecology, the environment, the home that we share is a finite one

- We humans are not the only ones who deserve a fair share, but we are among those who do and, in addition, “might makes right”

- The issue of justice and fair sharing is a central one as we consider theology from an ecological context.

3. There is no formula for planetary well-being. Ecology, most simply, means planetary “house rules”, knowledge of and obedience to the ways of living appropriately in our home, the earth (McFague 1993: 6-7)

- We do not know enough, we may never know enough, to prevent the ecological decay all around us
One of the most critical house rules we must learn is that we are not lords over the planet....we are an intimate and integral part of what we want to know: planetary knowledge is self-knowledge.

The most important ecological knowledge we can have (…) is rather how we can adjust our desires and needs to what appear to be the house rules (…) that is a lifestyle that actually promotes planetary well-being.

In such a situation, restraint, doing less, pulling back, may be the better part of wisdom.

Therefore, humans should assume an “attitude of humility rather than control, and realise that we are one species in a world.....learn more about our house rules. At that; we should do less harm” (McFague 1993: 7).

In a nutshell, the state of the ecological crisis can no longer be ignored; climate change and related issues are a result of our poor stewardship. Consequently, resources which sustain life in the planet are disappearing fast. Further, the United Nations\footnote{https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/index.php?menu=1300} highlights the magnitude of the problem in terms of occurrence of desertification, land degradation and drought, ecological disasters, climate change, deforestation, pollution of the atmosphere, destruction of biodiversity and ecosystems, etcetera. The crisis, in all its different manifestations, threatens the livelihood of humans and nonhuman beings of the planet. The poor are the most affected. For these reasons, building on the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) the United Nations have recently launched\footnote{The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and Sustainable Development Goals were launched at the United Nations Climate Change Conference (COP.21 – CMP11) that took place from 30 November to 11 December 2015. The motto of the conference was: “Time for Global Action for People and the Planet”. http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/} a global initiative, The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the Sustainable Development Goals, to mobilise and coordinate support for action. In a sense sustainability concerns have been mainstreamed in the development project. These goals are: 1) No poverty, 2) Zero Hunger, 3) Good health and wellbeing, 4) Quality education, 5) Gender equality, 6) Clean water and sanitation, 7) Affordable and clean energy, 8) Decent work and economic growth, 9) Industry, innovation and infrastructure, 10) Reduce inequality, 11) Sustainable cities and communities, 12) Responsible consumption and production, 13) Climate...
action, 14) Life below water, 15) Life on land, 16) Peace, justice and strong institutions and 17) Partnerships for the goals.

I contend therefore that as we go forward, mobilising for global action towards sustainable development, we should not forget that creation has integrity. This action should not be anthropocentric.

### 3.3.2.3 Creation’s integrity and local economic development

Recognising that creation has integrity leads us to learn something about the Creator. In a sense, it is turning to God for wisdom about life abundant on earth. Reflecting on the heart of Christian faith, its teaching about God, creatures, and Christ, Douglas Hall articulates a critical and creative response to contemporary culture. With particular reference to the integrity of creation and humanity and calling, he (1993: 309) writes: “To turn to God (theocentrism)” was simultaneously “to turn toward God’s beloved world (geocentrism)” What Hall says here is also applicable to our context in the sense that God and God’s beloved world are inseparable regardless of wherever one finds himself / herself.

What is the integrity of creation? McDaniel (1990: 165) explains:

> The integrity of creation” refers to “the value of all creatures in themselves, for one another, and for God, and their interconnectedness in a diverse whole that has unique value for God. To forget the integrity of creation is to forget that the earth itself is a splendid whole. [Italics are in original]

It is important therefore to have “an understanding of things in their integrity, knowing them the way they are with all else, accounting for them in ways true to where they are tending, is elementary for any ethic” (Rasmussen 1996: 98). The choice of a right kind of economy, for instance in Tshwane, and the role that churches could play towards establishing this economy should bear in mind that creation has integrity. The choice and economic roles of inhabitants of the earth should not violate this.


1. It describes the integral functioning of endless natural transactions throughout the biosphere and even the geosphere. ...the behaviours of one domain are integrated with those of others. These exchanges and cycles in their totality are integrated. They have an integrity all together. Earth is a dynamic but closed system. (pp 99 -100) [emphasis is on original]
2. Integrity of creation refers to nature’s restless self-organising dynamism: sometimes the changing relationships are harmonious, sometimes symbiotic, sometimes predatory, sometimes a mix of these. Destruction is certainly part of nature’s creative process (p100)

3. The integrity of creation also refers to earth’s treasures as a one-time endowment. The planet is self-renewing in ways seen and unseen. This totality is immensely rich, varied and dynamic. …the conclusion of many religious communities is that earth is a commonwealth – the world a great farm in which we are all but tenants, an oikos we are to till and tend but not own (p 102)

4. The integrity of creation is related to another dimension, the integral relation of social and environmental justice. ….Earth as oikos – a vast world house – is a shared home. ….both poverty and affluence threaten and degrade basic life-support systems, albeit in wildly different degree. ….the integrity of creation has a social aspect which we recognise as peace with justice, and an ecological aspect which we recognise in the self-renewing, sustainable character of natural ecosystems (cf. WCC 1990: 18) (p 103)

5. The integrity of creation also names a divine source and a certain intrinsic dignity. (…) all creatures, including humanity, are ‘good’ in God’s sight. ….Nature bears traces of the divine. …moreover, it is not we who “integrate” creation. Its integrity is prior to our concern, prior to our participation” (cf. WCC 1989: 3) (p105)

6. The integrity of creation carries more than the common conviction of Judaism, Christianity, and Islam about the interior goodness of creation as God’s. ….it also carries the specific ethical freight of its religious content. …creation is the gathering of “independently good expressions of the divine love”. This means respect for the other kind as differentiated other. … More deeply, the integrity of creation here means being-with as creation’s own way of being. (p106)

In short, as it pertains to the application of these six meanings, one issue is very clear, Rasmussen (1996: 107) summarises: the “‘integrity of creation’ carries moral freight of this kind. It resists our natural anthropocentrism from the inside out. We are all symbionts. Evolution is the history of an extended family”.

With particular reference to LED in Tshwane (S & H) and building on the foregoing I contend that:

1. LED in Tshwane (S & H) should recognise and respect the boundaries and integrated patterns intrinsic to the integrity of creation. It has to abide by the fundamental law of nature: “human activities must stay within the bounds of nature” (Nash 1994: 6)
2. Since the oikos is one, a household for all, “….all economies are “inextricably integrated, completely contained, wholly dependent sub-systems of the eco-sphere” (Rees & Wackernagel 1994: 365). Therefore, LED in Tshwane (S & H) being part of the whole has to integrate itself as a sub-system with the rest of the other economies.

3. It must be borne in mind that the communities of Tshwane, including townships of S and Hl, are tenants with the rest of other dwellers of the earth.

4. Our economy is dependent on other economies that are part of the oikos. We will do better to set broader economic goals, which aim at shared prosperity of human and nonhuman beings of communities.

5. The economic activity should bring communities out of poverty and at same time prohibit affluence which threatens and degrades basic life support systems.

Having discussed the theology of the oikos and gained an understanding about the crisis and the integrity of creation, it is time to discuss practical ways of responding through praxis.

3.3.2.4. Participation in the planetary agenda: practical considerations

McFague (1993) contends that the participation of everybody in the planetary agenda is crucial in addressing the crisis. She points out that:

1) One of the ways to deal with ecological despair….is to refuse the role of victim, to become active, to participate in the vocation of the planetary agenda. In different ways each of us has a calling, is being summoned, to put our talents, passion, and insights into planetary well-being (p8)

2) The planetary agenda involves everything and everyone ….because we now know that all things, all beings and processes on the planet, are interrelated, and that the well-being of each is connected to the well-being of the whole (p8)

3) The planetary agenda calls us ….to think about “everything that is”….narrow, parochial agendas concerned with “me and my kind”….are seen to be against reality (p8)

4) We cannot save ourselves (and our kind) alone if salvation means the health and well-being of the planet and all its creatures, not merely the transformation of certain privileged individuals to another existence in another world (p9)
5) The planetary agenda is concerned with the well-being of the diverse, rich plenitude of beings, human and nonhuman, that inhabit the planet, not just for the present and near future but.....for as long as we can imagine (p9)

6) The planetary agenda ...is what we must undertake, given the interconnections and interrelations that we now understand to be the nature of reality (Refer to WCC document: peace, justice, and the integrity of creation" (p9)

7) The planetary agenda involves each of us in and through the concrete activities of our daily lives. The planetary agenda is a universal vocation, a calling to put our gifts, time, and energies into some small aspect of planetary well-being (p10)

8) This vocation has two features: universality (everyone is called) and particularity (each called to a concrete, specific task). The agenda ....is too large a task for any field of expertise or any group of people (p10)

9) The issue before us is not only one of knowledge...but also one of behaviour (p10)

10) All the daily activities of all people can and should become part of the planetary agenda (p10)

11) The issue is not what is done but how it is done. ...Most ways by which people earn their livelihood can be done from a narrower or broader (parochial or planetary) perspective; each of these areas needs to say how it might fit into the broader perspective (p 11)

12) The universal vocation of planetary well-being must coincide with our daily breadwinning activities. ... we cannot redress the ecological decay that has already taken place with marches....we must, rather, change the way business, law, plumbing, child raising, government, education, medicine.......and theology are carried on, from the parochial, narrow, short-term view to the planetary, wide, long-term perspective (p11)

13) The planet is not deteriorating because of what we do in our free time or on weekends; its problems come from the center, not the periphery of our lives, from how we understand the main functions of our society and how we conduct those functions (p11)

14) The change to an ecological worldview must take hold of the grassroots level. The new worldview must also permeate all dimensions of our common life: our vote, our buying power.......Political and economic arenas are the most critical ones since the agenda in question is earth wide (p11)

15) ...no one field of expertise or effort, let alone any person or group of people, has the preeminent or only voice. We do not need a monologue or even a dialogue, but a roundtable discussion in which all speakers are equal (p12)
16) What we need to know about ourselves and our planet cannot come from experts alone but must include the lived experience of people from sexes, many races, etc. (p 12)

It is apparent from the agenda before us that this is, in the words of COP 21, the “time for global action for people and planet”. This has to be done in harmony with the environment. In relation to LED in Tshwane, this means carefully putting in place a sustainable local economy which functions for the wellbeing and welfare of both human and nonhuman beings of Tshwane (S & H).

3.3.2.5. Oikos and economy

Rasmussen (1996) provides a comprehensive approach to issues of social cohesion and ecological concern, synthesising insights from religion, ethics and environmental sciences in a single vision for creating a sustainable community of the Earth. With a primary focus on environmental ethics, he brings together insights from diverse sources on the state of the environment – and on what can be done, now, to halt the degradation of life. He starts off by pointing out that the “earth is the only life-form in the universe …All things belong to an all-inclusive form upon which the life of each depends. Humankind and other kind are fitted together in an undeniable, if precarious and sometimes mean unity of life and death” (p90). As argued earlier, this implies that the anthropocentric focus of development which has been prevalent in the world as well as in the City of Tshwane must be abandoned for the sake of collective wellbeing and shared prosperity of all the inhabitants of the earth. The “basic ecumenical task is to help life not only survive but thrive together indefinitely; that is, it means sustainability” (p90).

So, in our case while we work towards LED in Tshwane (S & H), sustainability must always be borne in mind. Understanding the concept of oikos and the integrity of creation are important in the pursuit of sustainable local economies such as Tshwane’s (S & H). Again, drawing from principles for sustainable communities as discussed in 1.7.5, this economy has to be an organic process. According to Woods (1992: 7), it must be seen as a system of organic functions which is not influenced from the outside, but in the first place must be formed from the inside, through the actions of each one of us, to the benefit of all within a local economic system – especially the vulnerable and marginalised. Our main concern “should be those who suffer economically because of events beyond their control, and who need assistance in regaining their equilibrium”. (Woods 1992: 7)
Building on Bell’s directions for society and culture, Rasmussen (1996: 91) adds: “Oikos offered the social vision for society and culture. Oikos – earth as vast but single household of life – means the capacity for survival, that is, sustainable habitat”. For Raiser (1991: 84 – 91) “the earth is curved, well-wrapped, a closed sphere, an oikos. But the boundaries are those of life itself and what life requires to stay in place”

From the foregoing, it is clear that economic development activity or any other activity for that matter, carried out without harmony with the rules of our “household” will end up exacerbating the ecological crisis. Failure to obey the rules of the household causes distress to the earth, as we are currently experiencing. According to Rasmussen (1996: 92) reasons for this distress are associated with three moves away from oikos economics:

1) Nature is considered as having interchangeable parts and being machinelike, rather than organic and communitarian

2) The propensity to generate affluence by expanding to new worlds until the globalised West became a full “planetary wave.”

3) The shift in economic attention from the household and its community to the firm or corporation. The household seeks to maximise the quality of life and benefits of its members. Corporations’ and firms’ measures of success are maximised profits and market share. The aggregation of corporations’ and firms’ interests has very little to do with the interests of even their own geographical area, however, and represent the interests of those who own, control, and decide about capital. Firms and corporations’ perspectives are potentially global; attachment and loyalty to households and communities run a very poor second, third, or fourth.

I agree with Rasmussen’s (1996: 92) view that these three moves “all revise radically the inherent eco-economics of oikos” which has a negative impact on the integrity of creation. As

49 In his book: The cultural Contradictions of Capitalism (1976), Daniel Bell sought direction for society and culture. He “argues that the unbounded drive of modern capitalism undermines the moral foundations of the original Protestant ethic that ushered in capitalism itself. Bell offers a bracing perspective on contemporary Western society, from the end of the Cold War to the rise and fall of postmodernism, revealing the crucial cultural fault lines we face as the twenty first century approaches.

50 Guy Benney: “Gaia’: The Globalisation Temptation”, in Global Ecology: A New Arena of Political Conflict, ed.Wolfgang Sachs (London: Zed Books, 1993), 181 – 82). In this contribution Benney and other scholars examine the contradictions inherent in the fashionable notion of sustainable development. They explore the emerging conflicts over the distribution of environmental risks between North and South. And they warn that “global ecology” seen in a managerial perspective, may degenerate into an effort to redesign and manage Nature in order to keep economic growth going in the face of a rising tide of resource plunder and pollution.

They launch a critical debate in order to clarify the issues involves and what might constitute appropriate action.

145
we are witnessing, this affects issues such as economic growth which does not necessarily lead to equitable and sustainable development. Korten (1991-92) argues: “economic growth does not equal development. Rather, sustainable development is "sustainable improvement in human well-being" (p.184). The problem is that "Growth-centered development is itself inherently unsustainable" (p169). He adds; "only a radical transformation of thought, policies, and institutions will allow us to avoid a social and ecological breakdown" (p.160). Therefore, I am of the view that this transformation will only begin to take place if we come to understand ecology.

Rasmussen 1996: 93 explains:

‘Ecology’ means knowing, from inside, the interrelated dynamics that make up the total life of the household and the requirements for living together. This is to respect creation’s integrity and live in accord with it. Oikos members are themselves oikeioi, household dwellers. Their tasks together comprise what the Apostle Paul calls simply ‘the mutual up building of community’.

According to Raiser (1991: 102-11) “building up community includes all that belongs to oikodome.... oikodome is the continual up building of the oikos as a whole”. This is what Rasmussen (1996: 93) refers to as “global citizenship and earth patriotism, with all the attendant duties of ‘choosing life’ (Deut.30:19) and living in accord with the choice”. Nevertheless, it is important to note that “the attention to global stewardship, oikodome, never loses its focus on the particular community at hand and its wellbeing. The global does not substitute the local”. (Rasmussen 1996: 93)

This point resonates with this thesis to the extent to which the researcher argues that if the oikos concept is the base of the economic life of South Africa it is possible for the local economy (such as that of Tshwane (S & H)) to thrive in the midst of a global economic agenda embraced

---

51 Korten provides a review of several institutional publications, and a couple of conceptual writings regarding the needs and prospects for sustainable development (pp.157-169). Articulating the seminal contribution of each, and its shortcomings, Korten then moves to a conceptualisation of fundamental theoretical and institutional changes that approaching sustainability requires. Rejecting outright the equation of economic growth with development, Korten argues that sustainable development is "sustainable improvement in human well-being – not economic growth" (p.184). Finally, Korten contends that mainstream economic theory is built upon a faulty assumption -- that the world is "empty" and that a more ecological frontier exists. He holds that the theory collapses in the light of actual ecological limits, where man-made capital cannot be substituted for, but depends upon, natural capital. In his view, truly sustainable development will require that the global economy undergo fundamental changes such that it should be based upon systems of decentralised and locally accountable economies, transnational sharing of useful information technologies, and a democratic global movement to decentralise and localise transnational capital. (See Korten, David C. 1991-92. "Sustainable Development: A Review Essay." World Policy Journal (Winter): 157-190. http://public.wsu.edu/~susdev/Korten91-2.html accessed 26 November 2015.
by the national government. Local economy and its entities need not become moribund as is now the case (see Mangayi 2014a)\textsuperscript{52.}

Unfortunately, as Rasmussen (1996: 94) points out, “Oikos is at odds with the particular kind of globalism of the present globalised economy, even an ecologically sensitised global economy” as it has been articulated in the current 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and Sustainable Development Goals. Such global thinking has disregard for local community loyalties and needs and by virtue of globalism itself, oversimplifies, often with cruel results (Korten 1991-92). In our context, these results include poverty, marginalisation and deprivation of many human and non-human beings who should be primary beneficiaries of the economy.

The Oikos concept therefore inspires us to act both locally and globally for an alternative vision of the economy. Berry (1993: 19 – 20)\textsuperscript{53} articulates the same view by stating “one cannot do something except locally, in a small place”. In relation to oikos and in agreement with Rasmussen (1996: 96) I contend that LED in Tshwane (S & H) should make at home in their townships “people who have been rendered strangers in their own land as globalising intruders from elsewhere decide how to shape their earth space, their habitat, their oikos”. Further, an oikos- compliant local economy gives communities an experience of belonging somewhere special where they can settle as this place sustains them or their families “back home” (Rasmussen 1996: 96).

Such an economy would be unlike the current economic system, accompanying development and modernisation which have produced inequality, abuse and marginalisation of many human and non-human dwellers of the earth. According to Berger et al. (1974)\textsuperscript{54}, this is partly because

\textsuperscript{52} Reflecting on the City of Tshwane’s economy, in terms of its priorities and strategies, Mangayi points out that it is to the detriment of local communities that Tshwane’s economy has become a replica of the national economy which is essentially growth-focused and structured to service the global market. He contends that the church, drawing from theological/missiological resources and hermeneutic insights on biblical texts, such as Luke 16:19–31, and on the concept of God’s economy, can steer an alternative vision for the economy of the City of Tshwane. (See Mangayi, L.C., 2014, ‘Mission as local economic development in the City of Tshwane: Towards fostering a grass roots, “glocal” alternative vision, with specific reference to Luke 16:19–31’, HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies 70(3), Art. #2744, 9 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts.v70i3.2744

\textsuperscript{53} Berry contends that community, a “locally understood interdependence of local people, local culture, local economy, and local nature,” bound by trust and affection, is “being destroyed by the desires and ambitions of both private and public life which for want of the intervention of community interests, are also destroying one another.” (Wendel Berry, 1993. Sex, Economy, Freedom and Community. New York: Pantheon. 19-20)

\textsuperscript{54} Berger describes how the modern world is bereft of an overarching socio-political-religious framework such as existed in the Middle Ages. Instead of religious and moral ideals guiding our lives, we are governed and controlled by economic and bureaucratic principals---a sad decline in the fabric and
the modern world is bereft of an overarching socio-political-religious framework such as existed in the Middle Ages. Instead of religious and moral ideals guiding our lives, we are governed and controlled by economic and bureaucratic principals, resulting in a sad decline in the fabric and cohesion of social life.

This is the reason that in this thesis, the oikos is regarded as an important hermeneutic key. It offers a socio-political religious framework to reflect on the economic development beyond economic growth. As Mangayi (2014a: 7) notes, the oikos points to the fact that “God’s view of economic activity differs from our common understanding, in that everything is connected, which will ultimately lead to everybody and everything flourishing, and not perishing as we are currently experiencing in some aspects in the City of Tshwane”.

From the foregoing, it is notable that the oikos concept is a base on which to build sustainable communities. In the same vein, Rasmussen (1996: 97) comments [that] “the ancient picture of earth (oikos as a single household of life) serves its purpose as a basic approach to sustainability itself, one that has a positive vision for earth, even earth as a closed and crowded sphere”. Drawing from Martin Luther King Jr, Rasmussen (1996: 97) suggests that we develop the “kind of ecological thinking needed to take up this task of working for sustainability as our own”. We can do so only if we start by recognising that creation has integrity. Then, our activities on earth, even LED, should be carried out within the limits of nature and in support of creation’s integrity.

3.3.2.6 Sustainability, Church and LED

Cobb (1992) argues that reflections on ecological issues inevitably raise religious questions as well. Admittedly, traditional Christian teaching to "subdue" the earth has contributed to the mindset responsible for the crisis we are facing today. But Christianity could also contribute to the discussion on how to keep the planet from ecological disaster. For one thing, this religion can keep ecological issues closely tied to those of social justice – a necessity for a sustainable society. I suggest that the starting point within a sustainable framework requires that we reject, cohesion of social life. http://www.amazon.com/Homeless-Mind-Modernization-Peter-Berger/dp/0394719948

55 Martin Luther King Jr also alluded to this under the title "the World House" in the book: Where Do We Go from here? Chaos or Community (Boston: Beacon, 1968), p 167.
as Van Schalkwyk (2012: 103) put it, the “othering” of nature and the various views that nature is something outside of the human cultural and socio-economic activities”. This “othering” has negatively impacted on the welfare and wellbeing of ourselves, of our human communities, and of the total earth ecology or oikos (see also Rasmussen 1996, McFague 1993: 22). From now onwards, “the oikos discourse is of immediate relevance to the search for sustainable economics and communities in the face of global capitalism and its impact on the environment” (Van Schalkwyk 2012: 104).

Christianity in particular can also make clear the need for individual change of heart (conversion) that is a prerequisite to real social and economic change and to acknowledging that the earth has limits. In this regard, Cobb (1992: 19) notes:

> Perhaps for affluent Christians the deepest level of response to the awareness of limits is the recognition that we cannot free ourselves from guilt. We are caught in a destructive system, and we find that even our will to refuse to identify with that system is mixed with the desire to enjoy its fruits.

Christians’ desire to enjoy the fruits of the current exploitative system is often “camouflaged” within what Cobb (1992: 99) regards as a biblically unjustifiable anthropocentrism. Instead Cobb (1992: 99) contends urgently:

> It is past time for us as Christians to repudiate the anthropocentrism that is often practiced by us and in our name. The world needs our leadership, not only in acknowledging that nature is our context but also in appreciating the intrinsic value of this nature.

This means respecting and appreciating the integrity of creation, the whole “household of God” or oikos. This appreciation enables us to understand that poverty in its multi-dimensional forms is the ultimate evil, when any inhabitant of the oikos is plunged into poverty by the actions of other inhabitants of it.

Hence, with the oikos as the framework for the present research, firstly, I assert that we should not neglect the true goods of the natural world provided by God for the false benefits of consumerism that destroy our communities. Secondly, we should mitigate against the destruction of relationships with people for relationships with things. Thirdly, we stand against the creation of economic structures whose whole focus is the breakdown of communities, focused as they are on amassing material wealth for individuals rather than wellbeing for communities.
Cobb’s (1992) insights and those of others, such as McFague (1993), Rasmussen (1996), Conradie (2006) and Raiser (1987) cited earlier on, are very helpful in envisioning some concrete “hopeful action”. They present a deep understanding of the interrelation of social justice, ecojustice and environmental sustainability and global economics that some of us in the church and faith based communities are beginning to understand only now.

Cobb (1992) in particular, makes a call for Christians in the developed world to understand how the structures they are implicitly and explicitly supporting, such as agriculture dominated by agribusinesses, households based on consumption, “development” in the Third World, the spread of “free” trade (which he demonstrates is generally more exploitative than liberative), are damaging to themselves, to those they purport to serve, and to God. He thus calls for Christians to join with both the environmental and global justice movements, not only to learn from others already engaged in the work Christians should be taking on by default, but also to provide a perspective that can add spiritual depth and, most of all, hope: “Where revolutionary (i.e. culturally radical rather than say Marxist class struggle) structural change is possible, its support is an option for Christians.” (p 23)

Given the current globalised context, I would argue that culturally radical change to economic structures is possible in local communities. In relation to this thesis, these are two of the townships in the City of Tshwane. Because, as articulated by Cobb (1992: 48),

> Only as local communities regain basic control over their own economies can there be health in human community and an effective community of people within the larger environment of living things. Further, it is only by this radical decentralization that dependence on exhaustible supplies of energy can be overcome.

Based on this, I have therefore opted to focus on LED in Tshwane (S & H) and specifically the role/s that the township church could play in this process. The church, being an organised sub-entity within these townships, could be rediscovered as an asset (with social and spiritual capitals) towards sustainable LED. In the process she could, to use the words of Van Schalkwyk, (2012: 114) facilitate “our connection with nature, loving nature (ecophilia), and through loving nature, understanding the wisdom of nature (ecosophia) – the wisdom of the functioning of living beings and ecosystems.” Then, our economic activity will be carried out in ways which allow us to “produce our bread” and at the same time care for nature so that it is able to keep on providing for future generations of human and other nonhuman beings in Tshwane.
In working towards sustainable LED, the needs for the survival of at-risk human communities such as women and children living in squalor in townships, must be met without delay but in balance with the earth. Admittedly, given the fact that townships are challenged by poverty, the ecology of these townships is being destroyed and the livelihoods of the poor are further threatened (cf. Van Schalkwyk 2008: 7). The church, among other institutions, could facilitate solutions to address both poverty and ecological degradation in a sustainable manner.

With particular reference to the role of the church in South Africa, Warmback (2007: 101) argues for an ecological theology “extended to incorporate the relationship of human beings to the environment, particularly their access to the life-sustaining resources of the earth”. Further, he adds that

The church, by its very nature, and through its experience of struggle has particular resources that it can offer society to help sustain the resources of the environment and eradicate poverty. It has gifts of community, reconciliation, healing and justice (...) it can contribute towards the restoration of damaged lives as well as disfigured environments. (p107).

In agreement with Warmback, Van Schalkwyk (2008: 10) declares that

Warmback’s oikotheology is a sobering reminder that we will have to look for solutions for the real economic and societal problems in this country (South Africa) in other places than in mainstream economic approaches. We will have to go back to respecting and living with the earth, in order to find long term solutions.

This is a process which entails rebuilding the “web of life damaged by hierarchical, anthropocentric and profit-driven actions, by industrial and economic actions which override and finally destroy the web of life” (Van Schalkwyk 2008: 21 – 22). This thesis has attempted to contribute to such a process.

3.3.3 Economic paradigm based on oikos

Under 2.1.5, within the broader discourse of development I argued for an alternative approach to LED which is a bottom-up approach, a “glocal” development process placing an emphasis is the development of pro-poor interventions. The focus must fall on poverty eradication through massive employment creation at local level, ensuring access of the poor into the economy,
generating local resources and knowledge to meet needs of communities developmentally and protect the local economy. Further, I explicitly argued for an asset based sustainable LED.

Building on 2.1.5, the following discussion attempts to sketch a paradigm for this sustainable LED. The oikos Biblical framework is important in this respect.

3.3.3.1 Oikos Biblical framework

As can be noticed, the theology of development, specifically of LED, proposed in 3.3.2 above, stands on two pillars i.e. social justice and eco-justice. This theology is inspired by the oikos concept. Essentially, I argued that the realisation of both social justice and eco-justice results in sustainable communities. Further, building on the oikos, I now want to turn my attention to an economic paradigm.

Although the Bible is not a conventional book on the economy (Mott and Sider 2000: 50), it provides norms for thinking about economic issues as I have done in this thesis in relation to the oikos as a root metaphor. From this metaphor, issues of social justice (specifically economic justice) and eco-justice are perceived as interdependent and interwoven. Thus, even if “It is true that there is no biblical passage with a detailed systematic treatise on the nature of economic justice (...) throughout the Bible, we find materials, commands, laws, proverbs, parables, stories, theological propositions that relate to the key normative issues that economic decisions involve” (Mott & Sider 2000: 50). For this thesis, the oikos Biblical framework provides those insights. As stated by Wright (1984) and Sider (1997), economic thinking combines three components, i.e. normative beliefs, empirical analysis and a political philosophy. Therefore, argue Mott and Sider,

Christians, like everyone else, require a political philosophy or ideology. But they dare not adopt an ideology uncritically or they risk violating their most basic confession that Jesus is Lord of all – including economic and political systems. That means that Christian truth must determine the shape of a Christian’s ideology.

A Christian must construct his or her political philosophy by combining the most accurate, factual analysis that is available with normative Christian truths. (Mott and Sider 2000: 50)

In this thesis, the oikos concept serves the purpose of what Mott and Sider articulate. The Oikos Journey (2006: 16 -19) network conducted a factual analysis of the South African economy with
normative Christian truths which reflect the nature of God’s economy. In this thesis, I constructed a biblical paradigm on LED by looking carefully at all the relevant canonical texts from Genesis to Revelation. At the same time, I agree with Mott and Sider that “a literal, mechanical application may neither fit our different settings nor even address many of our urgent questions (...) we must apply the biblical framework paradigmatically, allowing the biblical worldview, principles, and norms to provide the normative framework for shaping economic life today” (Mott & Sider 2000: 51). The paradigm should be applied according to the spirit of the biblical view, rather than according to the letter of it.

As stated in Chapter 1, the oikos Biblical framework includes texts such as Psalms 24: 1, Genesis 2: 15 & Genesis 3: 17, Exodus 20: 8 -10a & Leviticus 25: 8-17, Isaiah 58 & Amos 5, Exodus 20: 3 & Matthew 6: 24, Matthew 19: 16-22 and Deuteronomy 5: 33, see also 25: 13-16 and 30: 16-18. A brief theological reflection on these texts is now carried out in relation to economy. The reflection takes different exegetical issues pertaining to these texts such as interpretation, authorship, contentions and different views of the records into account if and where they have a bearing on the economic paradigm.

3.3.3.1.1 Psalms 24: 1 - the earth is full of grace and love

Psalms 24: 1 reads: “The earth is the Lord’s and everything in it, the world, and all who live in it" (NIV)

The theology of creation confirms God as Creator ex nihilo and points to the following: 1) God is the source of all that is, 2) Creatures are dependent yet real and good and 3) God creates in freedom and with purpose. McKim (2006: 119) states, “…in creation and in God’s continuing sustaining and providing for creation, he is working out his ultimate purposes for humanity and the world” Although the Fall (Genesis 3) corrupted creation, God’s final purpose is creating “new heavens and a new earth” (Isaiah 65:17, cf. 66:22, 2 Peter 3:13; Revelation 21:1). Through this final purpose God expresses love for the world. From a public theology perspective, Koopman argues, the evidence of this love is depicted in:

…the acts of creation, sustenance, care, election, and calling of God the Father/Mother/Parent; in the acts of reconciliation, salvation, and liberation of God the Son; and in the acts of renewal, fulfilment, and perfection of God the Spirit. This triune work establishes, confirms and actualises the dignity and worth of all humans and of the rest of creation. (Koopman 2010:23)
According to Blaising and Harding (2008: 185) Psalms 24:1 conveys that the earth is “…the Lord’s, not ours”. Therefore, it is “the foolish person that counts as his own possession that which never actually belongs to him, seemingly ignorant in his greed that the earth is the Lord’s, and the fullness thereof, for God is king of all the earth”. Further, Blaising and Harding (2008: 185) add, “…it is the passion of having that gives people a false title of lordship over that which can never belong to them”. Rather, a wise attitude towards the earth should be similar to that stated in Ecclesiastes 1:4, “Generations come and generations go, but the earth remains forever” (NIV): “The earth abides forever, ministering to every generation…But people …in their excessive vanity think that they are its lords, that they, now born, now dying, rule that which remains continually” (Blaising and Harding 2008: 185). Therefore, it should be borne in mind that the earth is full of grace and love, ministering to every generation of human and nonhuman beings who inhabit it.

**Psalms 24:1 in relation to sustainable LED paradigm**

Any economic activity on earth should start by recognising that the “earth” (i.e. environment or oikos) is a commonwealth. As emphasised, the life and future of both human and nonhuman beings depend on it. Therefore, the economic activity should be compliant with the planetary agenda in choice, shape, focus and purpose. It should contribute towards building sustainable communities.

With reference to the piece of the earth where Soshanguve and Hammanskraal are located, efforts should be made to respect, care and protect environmental degradation as we embark on any developmental activity. Consideration should be given to reduce pollution, to plant trees especially indigenous trees and plants, prevent erosion, conserve natural and game reserves, develop eco-friendly human settlements, opt for organic agricultural and farming methods, protect streams of water, and so on. In short, we know principle 1 of sustainable communities states “everything connects”, that is, “the earth and its biosphere is a single entity” (see Woods 1992:4) Therefore, we should undertake our economic development in ways which restore and maintain harmony in the “garden”. We are to till and keep it so it feeds us all in this generation and in many generations to come.

**3.3.3.1.2 Genesis 2:15 & Genesis 3:17 - Labour is both a blessing and a curse**

Gen 2:15: “And the LORD God took the man, and put him into the Garden of Eden to dress it and to keep it”. and Gen 3:17: “And to Adam he said, "Because you have listened to the voice
As Hamilton (2005: 23) indicates, “Chapter 1 (of Genesis) is concerned with the world, while Chapter 2 is concerned with a garden; one is cosmic, the other localised”. We should take note that God’s concerns with these two spheres (i.e. cosmic and localised) are not mutually exclusive. They are both equally important. For Hamilton (2005: 23), “God’s relationship to the world is in his capacity as *Elohim*, while his relationship to a couple in a garden is in his capacity as *Yahweh Elohim*; the first suggests his majesty and transcendence, the second his intimacy and involvement with his creation”.

Theological contents of Genesis 1-2 that teach about humankind speak of God who created humans in God’s own “image” and “likeness”. On this note Hamilton (2005: 28) writes: “it is plain to see that humankind is set apart from the rest of creation”. Also, there is affirmation that “humankind was created to “subdue” and “have dominion” over the earth and over living creatures of the sea, land and, air. However, Hamilton (2005: 28-29) clarifies:

> Dominion over is used (…) in the Old Testament, normally to denote human relationships: a master over a hired servant (Lev. 25: 43); chief officers over laborers (I Kings 5: 16); a king over his subjects (Ps. 72:8); the rule of one nation over another (Lev. 26: 17). Several of these passages (e.g. Lev. 25:43, Ezek. 34:4) suggest that dominion is to be exercised with care and responsibility. Nothing destructive or exploitative is permissible.

Just as the sun is mandated to “rule the day”, and the moon to “rule the night” (Gen. 1:16), no concept of indiscriminate or manipulative action is included there. In the same way humankind is mandated to rule or have dominion over the rest of creation. Further, although “human beings are unique, they alone bear God’s image (…) and they alone subdue”. Yet, “human beings are not autonomous, but they live under a divine law” (Hamilton 2005: 29). The divine law, continues Hamilton (2005: 29), represents the “boundaries for the people whom God puts in the garden. As long as one lives in ways that honour God, one remains in the garden. But defiance of the boundaries set by God means expulsion from the garden”.

Hamilton (2005: 30) writes: “in the garden the man has a dual responsibility: to cultivate and keep the soil (Gen. 2:15 RSV) and abstain from eating of ‘the tree of the knowledge of good and evil’” (Gen. 2:17). It is therefore clear that in the Garden of Eden “God placed limits on human freedom” (Hamilton 2005: 31). In this thesis, I will dwell only on the former responsibility, that is, to cultivate and keep the soil. According to Utley (2010):

155
Work was humankind’s task before the fall and not a result of sin. The term “cultivates” means “to serve” while “keep” is “to protect” [sic]. This is part of the responsibility of human dominion. We are to be stewards, not exploiters, of the resources of this planet.

Further, The Oxford Declaration on Christian Faith and Economics (1990)\(^5\) explains:

Work (in the modern world) involves all those activities done, not for their own sake, but to satisfy human needs. Work belongs to the very purpose for which God originally made human beings.

Clauses 14 & 15 of this declaration expand on work’s intrinsic value and how Christians have to apply their various gifts through their service or work. But there is also alienation in work. Clause 20 of this declaration (1990) stipulates:

Sin makes work an ambiguous reality. It is both a noble expression of human creation in the image of God, and, because of the curse, a painful testimony to human estrangement from God. Whether human beings are tilling the soil in agrarian societies, or operating high-tech machinery in information societies, they work under the shadow of death, and experience struggle and frustration in work (Genesis 3:17-19).

As a result, today people are treated in their work as mere means, workers merely as costs or labour inputs (cf. Clause 21 of The Oxford Declaration on Christian Faith and Economics 1990).

In addition,

Discrimination in work continues to oppress people, especially women and marginalised groups. Because of race and gender, people are often pushed into a narrow range of occupations which are often underpaid, offer little status or security, and provide few promotional opportunities and fringe benefits (Clause 23 of The Oxford Declaration on Christian Faith and Economics 1990).

Further,

For most people work is an arduous good. Many workers suffer greatly under the burden of work. In some situations people work long hours for low pay, working conditions are appalling, contracts are non-existent, sexual harassment occurs, trade union representation is not allowed; health and safety regulations are flouted. These things occur throughout the world whatever the

---

\(^5\) This Oxford Declaration on Christian Faith and Economics of January 1990 was issued jointly by over one hundred theologians and economists, ethicists and development practitioners, church leaders and business managers who came from various parts of the world.
economic system (Clause 24 of The Oxford Declaration on Christian Faith and Economics 1990)

**Genesis 2:15 & Genesis 3:17 in relation to LED**

Principle 2 of building sustainable communities encourages creativity in the way we live and produce our bread, and principle 5 the creation of meaningful work as the cornerstone of any economy (see 1.7.5). Given these facts, LED should:

1. Encourage, sponsor and facilitate the creation of jobs for all inhabitants of working age, this should be done in harmony with the environment

2. These jobs should not be destructive or exploitative to humans and nonhuman beings

3. These jobs should allow communities to produce their bread in harmony with the rest of creation. It means going about our work in a way which is sustainable to the environment

4. Work should become an opportunity to serve self, others and the environment. Therefore greed, selfish interest, manipulation and abuse are to be forsaken

5. Workers should be seen as contributors and participants to the economics of the oikos, worthy of equally enjoying the bounty produced through labour on the earth. Fair and decent wages should be paid to workers

6. Work has to enhance the dignity of workers, communities and the environment. Work should not become a burden or an arduous good. Humanity is “called” to work

7. Work should be free of discrimination, oppression, marginalisation, exploitation, etc.

8. Work should be properly and equitably regulated in terms of hours of work, hours of rest, safety at work, contractual arrangements, etc.

**3.3.3.1.3 Exodus 20:8-10a & Leviticus 25:2-7 - Sabbath is the fundamental rule of God’s economy**

Ex 20:8-10a say: "Remember the Sabbath day, to keep it holy. Six days you shall labour, and do all your work; but the seventh day is a Sabbath to the LORD your God; in it you shall not do
any work, you, or your son, or your daughter, your manservant, or your maidservant, or your cattle, or the sojourner who is within your gates” (RSV).

Utley (2010: 89) explains: Sabbath means “rest” or “cessation of activity.” Its usage as a day of worship starts with Gen. 2:2-3, where YHWH uses his rest as a pattern for animals (cf. Exod. 23:12) and humankind (humans need a regular schedule of work, rest, and worship). The first specialised use of this day by Israel was in Exod. 16:25-26, related to the gathering of manna. It then becomes part of “the Ten Words” (cf. Exod. 20:8-11; Deut. 5:12-15). Instructions regarding the Sabbath are repeated throughout the Pentateuch; see also Ex 31:14-15; Le 19:3, 30; 26:2; De 5:12.

With reference to Lev. 25: 1-7 the Sabbath is extended to the land. As Hamilton (2005: 27) notes, “The climax of creation is the Sabbath (Gen. 2:1-3)”. However, it should be understood that “God’s rest on this day is not to renew his strength after combat with turbulent forces of evil”. Thus, Sabbath is the fundamental rule of God’s economy – it is for rest. The day’s purpose is to provide rest for God after a week’s work of creation. Rest supersedes the act of creation. There is silence before creation, before God speaks. After creation there is silence again. This silence God has sanctified (Gen. 2:3).

Clause 28 of the said declaration (1990) put it this way:

> The sequence of work and rest that we see in God's activity is a pattern for human beings (...).
> The Sabbath erects a fence around human productive activity and serves to protect both human and non-human creation. Human beings have, therefore, both a right and an obligation to rest.

**Exodus 20:8-10a & Leviticus 25:2-7 in relation to LED**

Drawing from principle 3 of sustainable communities (1.7.5) which suggests that a good economy’s performance is evaluated in terms of the long-term wellbeing of both human and other-than human beings living in it, LED should ensure that work is interrupted by rest. I suggest the following:

1. Workers are entitled to one day’s rest per week
2. Human and nonhuman beings are entitled to regular rest
3. Workers must not exchange nor be coerced to exchange this rest to get income
4. Legislation about rest must be reinforced and applied across different classes of humans and the rest of the environment

5. The economy must ensure that good and decent wages are paid to the poor and vulnerable groups who are by default forced to work non-stop for survival. This will prevent enslavement by work.

3.3.3.1.4 Isaiah 58 & Amos 5: Shared prosperity is the goal of God’s economy

The socioeconomic and political background of these texts is summarised by Mangayi and Ngcobo (2015: 3) as follows:

Isaiah, together with other eighth century BCE prophets such as Amos, Hosea and Micah lived at a time when idolatry was ripe in Israel (Hs 2:16; 4:12–14; 4:17 and 13:2). Utley (2010:29) states that it was a time of economic prosperity and military expansion for both Israel and Judah (see also Webb 1997:20) However, this prosperity was beneficial only to the wealthy class. The poor were exploited and abused. It was that moment when ‘the buck and the gun’ (Utley 2010:29) became idols! The wealthy class benefited greatly at the expense of the poor as a result of long and prosperous reigns of Jeroboam II (786–746 BCE) in the North and Uzziah (783–742 BCE) in the South. According to Beyer (2007:30) the Assyrians’ conquest of Syria, the absence of conflict between Israel and Judah, and taxation and exploitation of trade routes in addition to the use of dishonest means such as the bribery of the judiciary and the falsification of commercial weights, contributed also to the prosperity of the wealthy class.

The power dynamics and injustices highlighted in the foregoing paragraph made the life of the poor and marginalised miserable. Against this backdrop, Isaiah’s message was one of radical universal monotheism and a redemptive plan for all creation, with chapters 56–66 depicting the future Messianic kingdom of peace – “the grand finale of God’s restoration” (Beyer 2007:229–242). In addition, Amos denounces the wealthy people’s exploitation of the poor.

In Isaiah 58; the prophet calls for true fasting. In the face of the injustice, abuse and marginalisation of the poor that took place in Israel at the time of Isaiah, Israel’s religion drifted into superstition and self-righteousness. As a result, it became a “hollow thing, lacking integrity and power” (Webb 1997: 226) even though Israel carried on having “wrong fasting” (v1-5). Webb (1997: 226) expounds: the kind of fasting that truly pleases God (v6-12) is accompanied by genuine repentance, especially turning away from exploitation and quarrelling (3b, 4a, 6). It is
to “adopt a lifestyle in which self-indulgence and greed are totally given up and replaced by generosity towards the poor (v7). This is the kind of fasting that pleases God and leads to his blessing being released”. In short, “the only repentance that counts with God is the sort that can be seen in the way we live, especially in how we treat other people (see Luke. 3:7-14)”.

In this chapter, Isaiah warns all Israelites who desire the good things God promised and even reinforce their petitions with fasting, that they cannot expect to be heard until they change the way they are living. Thus, they should remember the Sabbath and do justice (Isaiah 56: 1-2). According to Webb (1997: 227):

> The call for true Sabbath observance, like the call for true fasting, is a call for changed heart and life (...). There is no shortcut to joy and victory (v14); they come through repentance, and a willingness to live God’s way (see Deut. 32:13)

In the same vein, Amos Chapter 5 links faith and life inseparably. He denounces the wealthy people’s exploitation of the poor. Israel was falsely trusting in: 1). her religion (4:4-5; 5:21-23), 2). Her economic prosperity (6:1ff) and 3) Her military power (2:14-16; 6:1b, 13). In this chapter, Amos announces that there is “no salvation” for Israel without “repentance” (v 4-7). He also announces threats (v 10-13), exhortations (v 14-15), and impending punishment (v16-17), the Day of YHWH (v18-20) and inveighs against formalism in religion (v21-27).

With reference to exhortations (v14-15), Amos called Israel to remember, highlights Utley (2010: 73), “that biblical faith has two foci: personal relationship and deeds of love” (cf. Eph. 2:8-10 and I John 3:23). Amos admonishes Israel to “seek good.” Isaiah uses the same verb to adjure God’s people to seek justice (cf. Isa. 1:17) in the face of all the socioeconomic injustice that prevailed in Israel. Further, Utley (2010:73) contends “that for Amos there is no distinction between the secular and the sacred, between the heart and the hand (cf. Micah 6:8). God’s people must reflect God’s character!” They are to establish justice in the gates (v15). The term “establish” has the connotation of specific, purposeful action (e.g., Hos. 2:3). God’s faithful people must determine in their hearts and minds that justice, fairness, and integrity will prevail in their sphere of influence so that poverty is eradicated. Failing to do so, they will suffer the impending punishment, given the fact that, argues Clause 32 of The Oxford Declaration on Christian Faith and Economics (1990),

> Poverty was not part of God’s original creation, nor will poverty be part of God’s restored creation when Christ returns. Involuntary poverty in all its forms and manifestations is a result of the Fall and its consequences. Shared prosperity is the goal of God’s economy.
Therefore, Sweeney (2000: 194) submits, Israel was to heed the prophet’s call to people to change their ways, seek YHWH, and thereby avoid the punishment that would otherwise overtake them.

**Isaiah 58 & Amos 5 in relation to LED**

As stated in 1.7.5 the economy must be perceived first as a system of organic functions formed from the inside through the actions of each one of us, to benefit all within a local system – especially the vulnerable and marginalised. Woods (1992: 7) suggests that our concern should be for those who suffer economically because of events beyond their control, and who need assistance in regaining their economic equilibrium. Building on this, I suggest the following so that shared prosperity is achieved:

1. The vulnerable and marginalised, those who suffer economically beyond their control, receive a sizable portion of the economic pie
2. Equitable means of redistribution of income and wealth to be enforced upon all sectors of the economy
3. Set in place trickle-up economic mechanisms by creating many more decent and sustainable jobs in the local economy through home industries, self-employment, and etcetera.
4. Ensure equitable levels of wellbeing and welfare for all inhabitants of the environment
5. Ensure that all basic needs of all communities are met (i.e. food, shelter, education, protection, health and sanitation, etc.).

3.3.3.1.5 *Exodus 20: 3 & Matthew 6: 24 - We cannot serve both God and Mammon*

Ex 20:3: "You shall have no other gods before me" and Mt 6:24: "No one can serve two masters; for either he will hate the one and love the other, or he will be devoted to the one and despise the other. You cannot serve God and mammon" (RSV)

“You shall have no other gods before me” is the primary commandment. Hamilton (2005: 190) comments, the force of the expression “before me” most likely means “in addition to me”. The temptation of Israel (and with us) is not so much to abandon serving God in order to serve other
gods, but to worship other gods in addition to the Lord. (See also Deut 5:7; 6:14; 2Ki 17:35; Jer. 25:6; 35:15) One of the idols that humanity tends to worship is wealth (called mammon in Mat. 6: 24). Douglas et al (1962: 775) explain: “mammon is a transliteration of Aramaic *mamona*. It means simply wealth or profit, but Christ sees in it an egocentric covetousness which claims man’s heart and thereby estranges him from God”. St Jerome (2008: 90) qualifies the key message of Mat. 6: 24 by arguing that: “Christ did not say: he who has riches, but he who serves riches. For he who is a slave of riches guards his riches, like a slave, but the one who has shaken off his yoke of slavery distributes them, like a master”.

**Exodus 20: 3 & Matthew 6: 24 in relation to LED**

LED should not make economic growth (accumulation of wealth) as its main focus as is currently the case. Rather, it must:

1. Prohibit a blind pursuit of profit and wealth accumulation practices that harm human and nonhuman inhabitants of the given locality
2. Ensure that any excess wealth accumulated should be invested towards the improvement of the lives of those who suffer economically and are marginalised. This should be done in ways which empower them to become self-reliant economic contributors and not dependent on the systems
3. Ensure that the wellbeing and welfare of communities dictate the economic agenda of the country
4. Ensure that corporations and firms become servants of the local economy first; and not of the market
5. Ensure that all sectors work with the sole purpose of serving communities (humans and nonhumans) in a sustainable manner.

**3.3.3.1.6 Matthew 19: 16-22: God’s economy is a matter of discipleship**

Mt 19:16: “And behold, one came up to him, saying, ‘Teacher, what good deed must I do, to have eternal life?’ 17 And he said to him, ‘Why do you ask me about what is good? One there is who is good. If you would enter life, keep the commandments.’ 18 He said to him, ‘Which?’ And Jesus said, ‘You shall not kill, you shall not commit adultery, you shall not steal, you shall
not bear false witness, 19 Honour your father and mother, and, you shall love your neighbour as yourself.’ 20 The young man said to him, "All these I have observed; what do I still lack?’ 21 Jesus said to him, ‘If you would be perfect, go, sell what you possess and give to the poor, and you will have treasure in heaven; and come, follow me. 22 When the young man heard this he went away sorrowful; for he had great possessions.” (RSV)

About this text, St Jerome (2008: 219 – 220) points out: 1) the young man did not ask with the expectation of a learner but as a tempter: (v16); 2) when the Lord says to him: “if you want to enter into life, keep the commands, he is dishonest and asks once again: What are the commands? It is as though (…) the Lord Jesus could command things contrary to God (v17 – 19)”; 3) he is lying. He had not fulfilled what is recorded among the commandments: “You shall love your neighbour as yourself”; that is why he went away sad when he hears: “Go, sell what you have and give it to the poor” since he had many possessions (v 20); 4) no perfection is possible unless, after wealth has been despised, one follows the saviour (v21) and 5) he went away sad, for he had many possessions; this is the sadness that leads to death.

Hale (1996: 270) comments: “the young man lacks love for God and love for neighbour. He could have shown his love for God by giving up that which he loved most, his possessions”. However, it must be noted that “Jesus did not say that if the young man sold all his possessions he would automatically receive eternal life”. Essentially, Jesus was not giving the man a new law to follow. Jesus does not tell everyone to sell their possessions. But he knew that love of possessions was preventing this young man from giving his life to God. “When we love anything more than God, we must give it up, we must sell it” (Hale 1996: 270).

**Matthew 19: 16-22 in relation to LED**

This “me and my things” mentality, with associated false prestige and a sense of success, has made many of us blind to the needs of our neighbours. In fact, in our practices and greed we tend to “snatch” even the little that is in their hands from the poor and powerless. A sustainable LED should focus on the organic nature of the local economy and social cooperation would be emphasised over competition (see principle 6 on sustainable communities on 1.7.5). Thus,

1. LED structures must be designed in such a way that those who have far beyond what they need give away the excess to benefit the poor so that everybody prospers but not in a manner which foster dependency.
2. Wealth has to serve communities in the given locality just as the earth serves all its inhabitants.

3.3.3.1.7 Deuteronomy 5: 33 - We are called to live long in the land.

Deut. 5:33: You shall walk in all the way which the LORD your God has commanded you, that you may live and that it may go well with you, and that you may live long in the land which you shall possess. (RSV)

From Deut. 4: 41-11: 32, it is clear that Moses's main instruction to the Israelites is to be careful in the future so that they may live in the land God is going to give them. The theme of life takes centre stage in the discourse. As Hamilton (2005: 360) puts it, “the faithful adherent of God’s laws will not die, but will have prolonged life”. The Decalogue given in Exodus is recited again in Deuteronomy to remind Israelites that “there are many generations, but only one law” (Hamilton 2005: 392). The law sets the boundaries, the ethical code by which Israelites had to live by in the “garden” where God will put them. They are called to walk in all the ways God commanded them. Utley (2010: 96) elucidates, in this context “walk” means “lifestyle”. In other words, “Biblical faith is not only laws to be kept, it is a daily lifestyle: 24 hours a day, 7 days-a-week relationship to God by faith. This faith must issue in a godly life”. As a result, it “may go well with you” which denotes, literally, “pleasing” or “good.” It is often used to describe the Promised Land (cf. 1:25, 25; 3:25; 4:21, 22, etc.). The verb describes the good life God promises for covenant obedience (cf. 15:16; 19:13).

Deuteronomy 5: 33 in relation to LED

LED should not support nor comply with an economic system that “kills” people as they are enslaved by work, profit and the market. Rather, it should be designed to support those who are sick, weak and injured because of the inherent injustice of the current system, focussed on economic growth. Thus, LED should function to prevent the “unnatural” death of many poor and marginalised people whose lives are cut short by the system.
3.4. Conclusion of chapter

The discourse in this chapter focussed on how, why and what the church contributes as it participates in a development project. The church’s perspective on development was presented with a particular emphasis on the *oikos* concept as the hermeneutic key chosen for this study. The *oikos* was discussed in relation to LED, sustainability and the economic paradigm. A theology of LED was sketched. The position of this thesis was articulated in much detail in the text. In conclusion, I emphasise the following:

**On church and other development agents**

It was acknowledged that the development work of faith-based groups often overlapped with secular nongovernmental, national, and international organisations. It was also noted that there is an increased awareness by the main development agencies of the potentially enhanced roles of faith-based organisations in pro-poor development.

**On the church as an asset with social and spiritual capital**

It was indicated that in the eyes of some development agencies FBOs are treated “as subsets of NGOs and civil society; in some quarters they are explicitly excluded”, most likely because of their limitations which could be summarised as being inward looking and a lack of skills for socioeconomic engagement.

In this thesis I acknowledged limitations and advocated that the township church in particular should become a role player in socioeconomic development.

**On biblical impulses and scope of the church’s involvement in development**

It was recognised that there are various impulses that motivate the church on mission to do integral development work or integral mission. Theological concepts such as God’s presence with the poor, incarnation, witness in the public sphere, transformation and liberation and Christian social ethics were discussed.

The models we seek to put in place in Tshwane (S & H) have to conform to the just, good and right orders of creation (see Genesis 1 & 2) where sharing and prosperity for all are the ultimate outcome. Christian integral development should be the catalyst of this sharing and redistribution and the church should see it as a kingdom mandate to do so.
Development is therefore strategic in providing a bridge for the church to become involved in building and transforming lives and communities. The church, as an alternative community, is expected to live out the rules of God’s economy by showing “what ought to be”. This way the church will not be ashamed of the gospel because it is relevant to all human’s needs and the issues we face today (cf Cope 2006: 42 and Romans 1: 16). This is one of the reasons why this thesis agrees with Forrester (1997) that theology is not the preserve of the private domain. Development work provides a bridge for the church to witness in the public domain.

On church perspective on development

The following was discussed: 1) the importance of balanced relationships; 2) the importance of biblical narratives for development; 3) doing the right thing; 4) the role of the Christian community; 5) spirituality of development and 6) the understanding of poverty. These issues are important links in the theological and practical involvement of the church in development.

On towards a theology of development (particularly LED)

It was indicated that the oikos root metaphor is useful as the framework for a theology of LED in Tshwane (S & H), in which issues related to creation, liberation, reconstruction or rebuilding and working to produce and distribute the bounty of the land are dealt with.

It was also acknowledged that the current ecological crisis is impacting the economy negatively. The poor are the most affected. This crisis has been mostly caused by the prevailing anthropocentric focus of development in the current neoliberal capitalistic system.

On an economic paradigm based on oikos

Based on the oikos Biblical framework together with principles of sustainable communities, I highlighted the following:

- It is important to work or do our development in ways which restore and maintain harmony in the “garden”. We are to till and keep it so that it feeds us all in this generation and many generations to come.

- It is important to apply principle 2 of building sustainable communities which encourages creativity in the way we live and produce our bread, and principle 5 about the creation of meaningful work as the cornerstone of any economy.
• It is important to draw from principle 3 of sustainable communities which suggests that a good economy’s performance is evaluated in terms of the long-term wellbeing of both human and other-than human beings living in it, and not by abstract measures such as the growth rate of the GDP. LED should also ensure that work is interrupted by rest.

• LED should not make economic growth (accumulation of wealth) its main focus as is currently the case

• LED should inspire a rethinking of one of the prevailing challenges in society which is individualism combined with materialism. A sustainable LED should focus on the organic nature of the local economy and society; cooperation would be emphasised over competition (see principle 6 on sustainable communities on 1.7.5).

• LED should not support nor comply with an economic system that kills people. Rather, it has to support those who are sick, weak and injured because of the inherent injustice of the current economic system. Thus, LED should work to prevent the unnatural death of many poor and marginalised people whose lives are cut short by the system.

The contextual background of this study is discussed in the next chapter.
Chapter 4

A PERSPECTIVE ON THE CITY OF TSHWANE (SOSHANGUVE & HAMMANSKRAAL)

4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents a historical, social, economic, political and physical background to this research. This is necessary as it helps to discern the will of God particularly for the church in struggling urban areas of the city. This context has to be taken seriously in the process of facilitating and envisioning a viable, biblical, relevant and contemporary urban ecclesiology committed to the church’s participation to humanity’s wellbeing in general and LED in particular.

I definitely concur with Low that the “city today shapes the people’s humanity and determines human wellbeing” (Low 2004: 24). Further, drawing from the work of Cox (1966) concerning the “secular age”57, he states that during the past three decades the “secular city” of Cox developed into the “global village”. However, urban areas such as S and H in the CoT for instance find themselves being citizens of this global village, yet not in a position to draw substantial benefit from it. Simply, because in most cases people in these communities see themselves as powerless in the face of globalisation such as the market and neo-liberal capitalist system and as a result they are marginalised by city centres of power (see 2.1.2.1.1.5 & 3.3.1 and 3.3.2.1).

With the exception of the benefits of communication and digital connectivity, which some township people enjoy, the majority is suffering and worse as their local economies are unable to shield them from these forces of globalisation (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6).

Consequently, both shape and style in these peri-urban communities is being determined by “globalisation as a process of moulding human beings into new species of human community” (Louw 2004: 25). For this study, this implies that I need to discuss and describe the City of Tshwane (S & H)’s context being aware of both the background and the impact of globalisation on this new CoT (S & H).

---

57 In his book entitled: ‘The Secular City: Secularisation and urbanisation in theological perspective’, Harvey Cox (1966) defines the city more in qualitative terms as a condition of life. He defines the city as “a structure of common life in which diversity and the disintegration of friction are paramount” (1966: 4). For Cox the process of urbanisation is mostly a qualitative event. Further, he points that central to our mentality in this “secular age” is that we understand our era to be different from what came before, and better or it could be worse. We have moved beyond the religious stage of human history into our present secular stage.
What follows is a description of the context, reflecting particularly on urbanisation, economy, physical and social space, powers and systems. Particular attention is paid to S and H as related to the objectives of this research. This is because it is necessary to continue to enter the reality of these townships for seeking understanding and learning to show how mission could be done in the African city of Tshwane (S & H) with reference to discovering the township churches as assets towards LED.

Two factors are helpful in discussing the CoT: 1) it is a known space marked by borders and recognised by officials within the province of Gauteng in South Africa, Figure 1.1 is a map on page 27 in Chapter 1. It will be noted that Soshanguve is located in the north-west and Hammanskraal in the north-east and 2) the CoT is a city which has some of its newer residential areas still being upgraded to city standards.

According to a Caxton Limited’s publication (n.d), 16 November 1855 is Pretoria’s ‘birthday’. This event took place, according to Terreblanche, during “the period of the Great Trek of Afrikaner frontier farmers who left the Cape in a series of treks and established their own states north of the Orange River” (Terreblanche 2002: 219). Later in the text I discuss the economic reasons which were associated with the Great Trek and the implications for the economy of Pretoria at that point in history.

In its early years the little town grew very slowly and it was only on 1 May 1860 that Pretoria actually became the seat of the government. On 28 February 1864, the white residents of Pretoria were called together for a public meeting to discuss municipal matters. After the meeting a proclamation was issued to the effect that they had decided to establish a municipality. The process of city development and urbanisation started thereafter (Caxton Limited n.d.).

4.2. Physical space and Population

4.2.1. Physical space

With the incorporation of Metsweding District Municipality into the Metropolitan City of Tshwane, the present area of the CoT is approximately 6 368 km². For the purpose of this research, my focus is just the CoT municipality, and specifically, the given townships.
According to IDP (2011-2016), the CoT’s nature areas and assets include, in addition to designated residential areas, 13 nature reserves, 10 bird sanctuaries, 25 swimming pool facilities, 9 recreational resorts, 4 camping and caravan parks, 2 animal farms, 12 nature areas, 5 mountains and ridges, 118 km of approximately 1400 km river systems and catchment areas (5 within 5 different types of veld) (City of Tshwane IDP 2011-2016). The research area of this thesis is located in two separate regions i.e. Region 1 and Region 2 of the CoT. Specifically, Soshanguve is located in region 1 and Hammanskraal in Region 2 as illustrated earlier. Key features of each one of the regions are described in the following passages.

In region 1 where Soshanguve is located, there are informal settlements and low income residential areas as well as the industrial areas of Rosslyn; a high dependency on public transport and the service infrastructure being under pressure, are some of the salient features identified by the city. On the other hand, in region 2, where Hammanskraal is located, one finds the Bon Accord Dam, rural areas, informal settlements and the Tswaing nature reserve while Wonderboom nature reserve and Wonderboom airport are important features of the region. However, similar to region 1, the service infrastructure is also under pressure.

From the above, it is of importance to acknowledge that these features present the city both with challenges and opportunities in terms of LED. Informal settlements, low income residential areas and a service infrastructure under strain are currently common challenges in S as well as in H. The natural areas of these townships are also under threat. For example, the informal settlement dwellers around Tswaing Nature Reserve fetch fire-wood from the reserve in addition to using the reserve as a dumping site. Further, many of these low income residential areas do not have adequate refuse removal services, resulting in people throwing trash on the streets and on vacant community spaces.

It is obvious that established city areas are prospering while peripheral areas such as townships continue to struggle. The development project of the city and its objectives, articulated through the Smart City programme and the 2011 – 2016 Integrated Development Plan, are still to be realised in an equitable manner. As matters currently stand, townships of S and H are not substantially benefitting from the wealth of the city in a direct and tangible way. Simply put, one part of the city (the smaller, comprising suburbia and the central business district) is prospering while the other (the bigger, consisting of townships and informal settlements) is being further plunged into poverty. Inequality of income is a case in point. Seekings (2007: 8) points out that this “worsened after 1994, including in the early 2000s”. With reference to Hammanskraal, the
University of Pretoria Law Clinic\textsuperscript{58} states, “Illiteracy and poverty are often endemic to these areas, resulting in people not being able to gain access to equitable justice”. As stated later in this chapter, the current features of the local economy of Tshwane continue to perpetuate socioeconomic inequality in the city. At the root of this is the neo-liberal and free market forces that are at play in the system and which are manifest in the socioeconomic inequality between the rich and the poor.

It is therefore inevitable that LED projects in these townships have an obligation to address this inequality. The township churches should have a stake in these projects. Drawing on the rich heritage and history of the church in the struggle era, the township churches are to stand up against injustice so that distributive justice, generous care of the weak and shared prosperity become inalienable goals of LED in Tshwane.

Further, I regard the industrial area of Rosslyn and the high dependency on public transport as opportunities that could enhance LED in S in terms of business opportunities. Essential features such as Bon Accord Dam, rural areas, Tswaing nature reserve, Wonderboom nature reserve and Wonderboom Airport in region 2 are assets that have potential to boost LED in H. Possibilities for LED may include tourism, resort and hospitality, food farming and so forth. The people of Tshwane and community structures / networks, including religious communities, are also opportunities that could enhance LED in Tshwane. When contemplating these possibilities, the township churches of S & H could provide a platform for the voices of the poor and the weak who are suffering yet not heard as result of the current LED practice. Contrary to what I observe happening today, church-led LED has to acknowledge that township populations have vast unfulfilled needs, and has to mobilise township economy by promoting its productive potential as well as mobilise township labour to work in the township. In this way, the growth of unemployment experienced in townships, which has paralysed their economy, may be curbed.

4.2.2. Population

Glimpses of life in early Pretoria (i.e. before the arrival of the colonisers) are difficult to substantiate because of the limited historical heritage and accounts at our disposal. Nevertheless, geologically-minded collectors hold the view that Pretoria, with a pellucid river

(the Apies) meandering from one range of hills, down to and through another, must have been the ‘paradise for the original inhabitants of the area’ (Engelbrecht 1955: 31). Yet, it is sad that “what had been the history of the men who lived and died in this (Apies) valley for centuries and thousands of years before is difficult to know. No written records exist and the only guide for a historical recollection is Native tradition and the genealogies of their chiefs” (Engelbrecht 1955: 61); hence, one cannot state categorically who the real first inhabitants of this great valley were from the perspective of written records.

However, the first known inhabitants of Pretoria were the Ndebele, who had broken off from the main body of Nguni people in Kwa-Zulu Natal. By far the largest number of Bantu people now settled in Pretoria are the SePedi or northern Sotho-speaking. The northern Sothos were undoubtedly established in considerable numbers in the lower Apies Valley, before the first Voortrekkers reached it. The Tsonga, coming from the north-east, and the Venda from the north, are on the whole relatively recent arrivals in Pretoria (Engelbrecht 1955: 62 – 70). Engelbrecht is correct in his view that if one looks at the current ethnic make-up of the city, including that of the townships of S & H, in each one of these townships one will find, in various proportions, Nguni people, Sotho, Tsonga and Venda peoples.

I do contend, however, that the ethnic diversity described by Engelbrecht, together with the presence of whites, Asians and coloured communities in Tshwane displays a pluralistic character which is a common occurrence in the cities of the world. This is also manifested in terms of different religions and forms of spirituality, culture and traditions, races and values co-existing. I specifically attempt to describe the religious and Christian diversity of the city in Chapter 5.

In the early history of the CoT, the following African townships and settlements are distinguished: Marabastad⁵⁹ (established in 1905); Bantule⁶⁰ (established after Marabastad); ⁵⁹ Marabastad: Maraba was a petty chief or important person among the original Bantu inhabitants of the Apies Valley. This is the oldest township in Pretoria, established in 1905 as an area set apart as the location for the exclusive occupation of local people not living on the premises of their employers. In SA, the term ‘natives’ can perhaps be acceptable written with an Uppercase N – but do be aware, because of the apartheid history, an innocent or neutral descriptive term like ‘natives’ might be a trigger word in SA as it was used as a derogatory term for Black people. Suggest ‘local people/inhabitants’, ‘indigenous people’, and so on as appropriate, instead. ⁶⁰ Bantule – the second oldest location. It was situated West-Northwest of Marabastad on the slopes of the Daspoort Range of hills, about a mile away. (Currently, this is where Tswane University of Technology is now located.) It consisted of two sections: 1) A village portion in which natives could build their own homes, known as Hove’s Ground and 2) A location portion in which 298 municipal houses had
Atteridgeville or Pelindaba\textsuperscript{61} (established in 1939), Vlakfontein or Mamelodi\textsuperscript{62} (established in 1945) and Lady Selborne\textsuperscript{63} (established in 1923). Pretoria and townships have been on a continuous demographic and spatial expansion. The population of the city is scattered all over, with the highest density of people to be found within the previously disadvantaged areas, such as Atteridgeville, Mamelodi, Olievenhoutbosch, Soshanguve, Hammanskraal, GaRankuwa in the CoT. The map represented in Figure 4.1 below indicates areas with high density.

\textsuperscript{61}Atteridgeville or Pelindaba - situated six miles to the West of Church Square. It was established in 1939.

\textsuperscript{62}Vlakfontein (Mamelodi) – is situated 12 miles to the East of Pretoria. Permission for the purchase of this farm for location purposes was granted on 10\textsuperscript{th} September, 1945.

\textsuperscript{63}Lady Selborne – This was the largest settlement of Natives in Pretoria. It was not a location, but a residential area approved by the Minister of Native Affairs in 1923, and was 300 morgen in extent.
As may be observed in Figure 4.1 above, S and H are amongst those areas with high population density. As pointed out earlier, these are also areas that are severely challenged by poverty, are less urbanised and in need of a sustainable LED. Detailed information on racial proportion, age and gender, marital status and highest education attained should be considered before a transformative praxis is envisaged. That information is accessible on the City of Tshwane website i.e. www.tshwane.gov.za.

In the CoT there are also a growing number of people from Francophone and Lusophone Africa, Eastern Europe and even the Far East. Refugees from Rwanda, Burundi, Sudan, Somalia and Ethiopians come to the CoT, hoping to find refuge and a new beginning in life. Many Somalis in particular have settled in townships of H and S and are involved in small businesses as tuck-
shop owners. A major proportion of these communities live in the inner city area of Tshwane. Some, such as Mozambicans, Zimbabweans, Somalis and Pakistanis, are increasingly settling in peripheral townships to pursue business interests and also for cheap and affordable accommodation, yet are living in poor conditions (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6).

Detailed facts such as the level of urbanisation, household goods and access to the internet, property tenure status and source of water, toilet facilities and refuse removal are important as they afford an overall indication about the people’s living conditions in the CoT. These facts are also important for deepening our description and analysis of the context regarding social conditions of communities in Tshwane in relation to reconstructing a meaningful and sustainable LED in the city (S & H). Since LED is process-oriented, the current living conditions of the people are where one should start from in the process of forming new institutions, developing alternative industries, improving the capacity of existing employers and so forth, towards a LED model which will benefit all communities.

A summary on statistics concerning community living conditions highlights that:

- 92.3% of the city is urbanised
- The majority of the population is aware of living in the age of the information explosion and about 42% have access to the internet
- More than 60% of the population possess property tenure
- 90.6% of the population enjoy access to clean water
- 76.6% of the population have access to flush toilets connected to a proper sewerage system
- 80% of the population benefit from a refuse removal system provided by the local locality.

These items point to the fact that the city is certainly becoming a different one in comparison to that pre–1994, thanks to different development interventions facilitated by the City. Yet, as the narrative accounts in Chapter 6 will reveal, as well as the many service delivery protests in the CoT, township communities including those of S and H have demonstrated their dissatisfaction

---

64 Statistics South Africa (2011)
about the quality of services received (see SABC News\textsuperscript{65}, Saturday 15 September 2012 and Eye Witness News\textsuperscript{66}). This poor quality service has a negative effect on livelihoods as well as LED in S and H.

With reference to this thesis, I consider that the church, and in particular, the township churches, must learn to immerse themselves by trying to understand the root causes of these issues in order to facilitate transformation. Further, I have specifically argued that the township churches, being assets, must formulate a contextual theological articulation which could inspire ministerial praxis geared towards LED in the peri-urban areas of the city. The expectations for congregations must develop enough to seize these opportunities for creative transformational urban ministry.

On the other hand, it is evident from the discussion of living conditions that 7.7\% of the city area is not urbanised, and this is where the highest concentrations of informal settlements are found and where the majority of the poor and marginalised live. Some of these informal settlements are located on the outskirts of S and H in the north-west and north-east of the city. Over 30\% of the population also does not have property tenure; these are probably people who rent in the backyards of township dwellers. It could also include people who live in informal settlements and in areas still to be declared formal settlements. Furthermore, the condition of 20\% of households in informal settlements north-east and north-west of the city that do not have access to flush toilets connected to proper sewerage must be attended to in order to avoid the spread of communicable diseases. This is a threat to people’s lives and health; these are likely the poor in the most densely populated areas of the CoT.

The statistics also reveal that 20\% of the population do not benefit from proper refuse removal systems. This situation tends to lead to pollution and thus is a threat to sustainable urban management. Therefore, I argue that township churches of S & H would contribute to LED in Tshwane if they position themselves to deal with the issues raised here above. This points to the fact that context, including physical space, has to preoccupy the township churches for the purpose of LED.

4.3 Urbanisation and Development of the CoT

\textsuperscript{65} SABC News (http://www.sabc.co.za/news/a/ea46b5804cb97f808ee0ceacdd4a6481/Soshanguve-service-delivery-protest-turns-violent-20121509 accessed 24 February 2015)

In this context,

Urbanization means a structure of common life in which diversity and disintegration of tradition are paramount. It means a type of impersonality in which functional relationships multiply. It means a degree of tolerance and anonymity replaces traditional moral sanctions and long-term acquaintanceships (Cox 1966: 4).

For this study, Cox’s explanation of urbanisation confirmed two assumptions. First, urbanisation in South Africa has disrupted the natural course of tradition of indigenous ethnic people as they have been obliged to adapt to a new way of life in the city. Secondly, in the process of urbanisation these ethnic groups have been required to change their traditional norms and values so as to adapt to their new circumstances. It is therefore important, in this study, to trace in history community experiences which hopefully will shed light towards understanding the contemporary CoT (S & H).

4.3.1. A historical development perspective

I recognised from the outset that it would be crucial, and simultaneously a huge challenge and a problem, to narrate the history of an African city. This is because those histories are written from specific cultural perspectives. While there is evidence of urban civilisations going back many centuries in the world outside of what is known as the western world (i.e. in Africa, India, China, and so on), yet “historians present us with exclusive histories, not accounting for urban cultures which came out of Africa, Asia and South America” (De Beer 1998: 37).

In South Africa, cities were largely developed as colonial cities with functions other than merely industry. Some cities became seats of the legislature (i.e. Cape Town), seats of administration (i.e. Pretoria), seats of the judiciary (i.e. Bloemfontein) and some others seats of business and industry (i.e. Durban and Johannesburg). In short, the histories of South African cities took different directions depending especially on their main economic and functional activities. Increases in population of these cities were also influenced by the main activities embraced in the latter. This pattern could be traced back to the time of the Mfecane dispersion of the Bantu at the beginning of the 19th century (Giliomee & Mbenga, 2007:125, 127). Unfortunately, the Bantu people themselves have failed to document their history in significant ways. Therefore, the history of the CoT told in this thesis falls short in having a first-hand African imprint.
Verster (2000: 17) contends that urbanisation is regarded as the dominant economic, political, cultural, social and moral force, which led Robert Vaughan67 to proclaim in 1843: “Our age is the age of great cities”. Vaughan’s prediction is now reality in South Africa. South Africa’s largest cities such as Johannesburg, Cape Town, and Durban date back to the colonial era, being founded by colonists/settlers of Dutch and English origin as were others like such as Port Elizabeth, Pretoria (Tshwane) and East London. The Tshwane metropole, for example, was intentionally designed in a way which was consistent with the dominant groups of that time but now is part of the larger megacity / city conglomerate in Gauteng.

The design of these cities reflects the economic (and social and political) concerns of a white ruling class within an economic system that was developed to gain the most profit out of cheap labour – capitalism. The cheapest labour was black, and it was cheaper still to have only men on e.g. the mining properties, not their families. That meant that under colonists and later under apartheid rulers, cities were not meant for black people but for whites only. (Venter 1998: 3-4)

The maps of these cities show development restraints on urban development: Tomlinson particularly noted the segregated nature of these areas (Tomlinson 1988: 493). In the same vein, Kotze and Donaldson (1998: 467) argued that residential segregation was incorporated in urban planning policies. They stated: “Beginning in the 1950s, a planning process of rezoning took place to reorganise society, with the aim of creating a race and space division. Only in 1986, when the policy of Influx Control was abolished, was the permanence of blacks in South African cities accepted in principle”

The CoT was not exempt from this segregated development. Under apartheid rule, the spatial development of the CoT and urbanisation followed the same pattern as described by Venter, Tomlinson and others above.

Van Jaarsveld (1985: 48-56) in particular refers to three structures and patterns relative to the South African city including Pretoria: the Segregation City, Apartheid City and Separate City. The Segregation City existed in the era before 1948. Black people moved into the cities but lived in recognised black residential areas: “In 1930 there were 30 000 to 40 000 black people in

and around Pretoria, but only 8 663 lived in recognised black residential areas” (Van Jaarsveld 1985: 53) while the rest lived in urban slums. The Apartheid City was introduced by the government of the National Party after 1948. In this period, relocation and forced removals of black people took place and urban slums were cleared. Areas such as Marabastad and Lady Selborne were affected in Pretoria. The Group Areas Act of 1950 entrenched the apartheid city on the law books. As Van Jaarsveld comments, “The central cities were characterised by western-American structures while the black cities (i.e. townships) were typical Third World cities” (1985: 51). In the 1950s the government went a step further with the implementation of territorial separation. Urbanisation was encouraged in the former “homelands” away from the “white” cities in the hope it would discourage the influx into white areas. De Beer (1998: 47) explains,

The separate city included apartheid structures and white domination, black townships and informal settlements, a black transport system, and industrial areas closer to townships. Its whole development envisaged the concentration of black people in their own cities in the “homelands”.

Further, with reference to urbanisation, Brand (1983: 45) indicated that the percentage of the South African population resident in urban areas rose from 25% in 1921 to 50% in 1980, with the white sections of the population having reached an urbanised percentage of 91% followed by the Asian at 89% and the black at 37%. An interesting feature of the South African process of urbanisation at that time was that the degree of urbanisation differed considerably between the different population groups in the country. At present, we experience a massive stream of urbanisation of black people in post-apartheid South Africa. Of significance is the discrepancy that exists in urbanised black areas. For example, Johannesburg drew larger numbers of black (mine) workers in an earlier part of its history than Cape Town, which was “zoned” as a city where coloured labourers were preferred, right up until 1986. Obviously, the increased growth of the black population of cities became more rapid after 1986 after the influx control measures were lifted, and then again after 1994. Nevertheless, the fact remains; in the last three or four decades, we have been experiencing a rapid growth in all the urban centres of South Africa. The World Bank\(^{68}\) reports that the urban population density (people per sq km) in South Africa has grown from 29 in 1990 to 36.2 in 2000 and to 41.2 in 2010. Urban population growth (annual %) in South Africa was last measured at 2.13 in 2010.

There is a discrepancy in the degree of urbanisation between black townships and suburbs in the CoT. Southern, eastern and western suburbs (which used to be mainly for white and Asian sections of the population) have reached an urbanisation ceiling while northern townships (such as Mabopane, GaRankuwa, Pienaars River, Hammanskraal, Soshanguve, Winterveld and Tswaing, where the majority of the black section of the population live) are less urbanised but their rate of urbanisation is escalating. This is one of the chief reasons why Father Mkhatshwa\textsuperscript{69} described Tshwane as a tale of two cities: one is a world class, affluent city and the other a city plagued by poverty. These northern townships except for Soshanguve formed part of one of the former “homelands”, Bophuthatswana, created by the apartheid government for black people, in this instance, the Batswana. To correct this imbalance and inequality, the current administration is increasingly investing resources towards infrastructural development and urbanisation of northern townships as described later in this study.

It is therefore impossible to discuss the historical development of South African cities, including the CoT, without narrating a tale of two cities. De Beer (1998: 41-42) distinguishes 3 intertwined forces that determined South Africa’s urbanology i.e. the Apartheid policy, the so-called “Push and Pull” factors\textsuperscript{70} of migration and political changes (such as abolition of laws that restricted movements of people in the new South Africa and black people in the political leadership of the city). These forces are embodied in the tale of two cities as shown in the history of the CoT and as told in the following sections.

\subsection*{4.3.2 Tshwane: urbanisation and city development}

Kruger relates the social, political and economic developments of The CoT in four epochs i.e. as an imperial city (1900 -1924), a white South African city (1924-1948), a triumphant city (1948 -1976) and a beleaguered city (1976 -1994) (Kruger 2003: 167-258). Although it was not the intention that this thesis examine the more distant past, certain highlights of the historical

\textsuperscript{69} Mayor Father Smangaliso Mkhatshwa: Tshwane - Africa's capital city of excellence.prospering in a safe and healthy environment. \url{http://www.worldmayor.com/manifestos05/tshwane_05.html} accessed 21/12/2015.

\textsuperscript{70} Economic, social and physical reasons which influence people to emigrate can usually be classified into push and pull factors. Economic reasons which act as pull factors include more jobs, better jobs, higher wages and the promise of a “better life”. Economic push factors tend to be the exact reversal of the pull factors i.e. over-population, few jobs and low wages. This lack of economic opportunity tends to motivate people to look for their futures outside the area of their origin. Social reasons tend to involve forced migration. Principles of religious tolerance could be considered as a pull factor while intolerance towards a certain cultural group and active religious persecution may be considered as social push factors. Physical pull factors may include attractive environments, such as mountains, the seaside and warm climates. Natural disasters mostly constitute a physical push factor. See \url{http://www.tutor2u.net/geography/reference/the-push-pull-factors-of-migration} on 21 Dec. 2015.
background as far as urbanisation and associated issues are concerned will help to give this study some contextual perspective. The latter is vital for continuous social analysis and for meaningful reflection that are prerequisites for action. Kruger’s epochs are used to demarcate the narration of the history of the CoT.

**During the Imperial city period (1900-1924),** building on initial steps taken in 1860 and 1864, as stated earlier, the CoT “received municipal status in 1902” (Kruger 2003: 168). This occurred after the Treaty of Vereeniging was signed in Pretoria on 31 May 1902 to mark the end of the Anglo-Boer War. The following year, the city could elect its first town council. The process of urbanisation began almost simultaneously with the granting of municipal status which led to a steady population growth – as many impoverished Afrikaners and Africans from rural areas as well as a large number of immigrants (mainly from Britain and other European countries such as Belgium and the Netherlands) streamed into town in search of a livelihood.

An increase in numbers of people (...) came with increases in the functions of the town. When the Transvaal became self-governing in 1907, Pretoria became its capital. This step launched a period of rapid development, which took on additional momentum when, on 31 May 1910, Pretoria became the administrative capital of the newly established Union of South Africa (Kruger 2003: 68).

The city continued to increase in numbers, especially of civil and military personnel, which in turn were accompanied by increases in the functions [administrative, political and the like] of the town (Kruger 2003: 168). The enhanced status of the town was accompanied by increased economic growth and diversification and urbanisation.

But this urbanisation was mainly shaped and influenced by the political interests of white settlers. Kruger explains in an effort by politicians in power to maintain a delicate balance between Afrikaner and British interests, an entirely different and crude, approach was followed with regard to Africans (cf. Kruger 2003: 170). This became apparent when the Union was formed in 1910 on the explicit premise that Africans would not be equal partners in it: “The educated Africans, who had put their hopes on Britain to allow them entry into a common society and access to gradually widening parliamentary democracy, felt betrayed” (Kruger 2003: 170).

As Friedman states: “Pretoria Town Council was concerned at the time to create an orderly urban environment which hinged, to a large extent, on a compliant and orderly work-force” (Friedman 1994: 10). What followed was the formulation of and struggles to implement
repressive political and administrative measures that set the city on the path of implementing segregation. Friedman explained that the conflicts between “the Pretoria Town Council, central government and the local African population were pivotal to the creation of an urban African policy” (Friedman 1994: 9). In the same vein, Kruger elaborates, “these repressive political measures, expressive of social attitudes of rejection of any form of integration on the side of the town’s white citizens, must be understood in the conditions of the local economic conditions of the time” (Kruger 2003: 170). Which conditions, adds Kruger, in 1908 influenced the adoption of a policy of replacing unskilled African labour in order to protect the whites, especially Afrikaner poor whites / labour class whites who were obliged to leave the farms and come to the cities after the devastation of the Anglo-Boer war and previous occurrences like the Rinderpest of the 1890’s. Friedman adds that the initial development of an urban African population in Pretoria took place within the context of limited local industry (Friedman 1994: 13) and that this provides a key contrast with most locations and townships which developed on the Witwatersrand and which were influenced by mining and manufacturing.

From the above, it is clear that the segregated urbanisation policy of the city was not only based on political grounds but was also informed by economic interests. This had severely negative consequences for the vulnerable African people at the time. The marks of this policy are still with us today: “Single African women eked out a living between washing, beer brewing and prostitution” (Friedman 1994: 73). As could be imagined, when the African women joined the men and made their dwelling in Pretoria the urbanised population took on a more permanent character, and the need for housing and educational and medical facilities increased. Bozzoli and Delius pointed out “that urban dwellers, as well as industrialists and planners, gave shape to the configurations of family and community which emerged in the cities” (Bozzoli & Delius 1990: 31). However, this was not the case with all South African cities. In those such as Cape Town, black people did not play a predominant role in the configuration of the cities, as this function was in the hands of white local and national rulers. In the CoT, the configuration which emerged in the city, segregated urbanisation was planned and implemented by the white authorities.

This segregated urbanisation proceeded in transforming the spatial outlook of the city according to the image of the dominant white population. The spatial transformation of Pretoria became fully aligned with the philosophy of White Integrationism71. Dignified buildings in a Classical-

---

71 According to Kruger (2003: 112 – 116), white integrationism was a type of philosophy which called on all sections of the white population to cooperate in the building up of the South African nation. It was clear
Renaissance style were erected in the white area e.g. the Railway Station on Paul Kruger Street, the General Post Office on Church Square, the Old Arts Building of the University of Pretoria, Pretoria Boys High School, the Transvaal Museum in Paul Kruger Street, and so on (Kruger 2003: 172). As the power of decision lay with the whites, who defined the African presence in town as a labour reservoir, the struggle for the dominance of the space of Pretoria continued. The area of the town and its surrounds were divided by the local (White) authorities along racial lines. White suburbs sprawled out from the centre, especially eastwards, because of the decline of the value of property in the west as a result of the tannery (Kruger 2003: 173).

Lastly, the urbanisation of the city followed two opposing forces known as “Push and Pull” factors of migration. On the one hand, the economic forces drew Africans from the rural areas that could no longer sustain them, towards and into the white-dominated urban areas. The pull factors began with the early mining industry needing black workers from rural areas. Something of a push factor occurred as a result of the earlier loss of African people’s land to the hands of the white settlers, and later on the Land Acts of 1913 and 1936 which made it even less viable for African people to live on their ancestral land (see Report on Native Economic Commission 1932: 10, clauses 65 & 66)\textsuperscript{72}. On the other hand those white-dominated urban areas refused to integrate them politically and socially. In this case, these forces had a racist base. Kruger sums this up in the paragraph below.

In the early decades the Pretoria town council continued the policy that had been developed in the days of the South African Republic (ZAR) to settle Africans in what were known as ‘locations’. Through the decades, as the areas of business and white residence expanded, blacks were continually moved out to the edges of the town – near enough to be available for the labour requirements of the white town, far enough not to be part of official society. Within six months of the occupation of Pretoria in June 1900, the first new African township (Marabastad) under British rule was established (Kruger 2003: 174).

At the close of this period, influenced by the Natives (Urban Areas) Act of 1923, fully fledged separatist thinking took charge; urban areas were regarded as created by whites for whites; therefore the pass system (known as the Dompas System) was implemented. This led to Africans not having rights of ownership of land in white urban areas and local authorities controlling the influx of Africans into urban areas (as per the Stallard Commission which was

that “nation” was narrowly understood to consist of white people only in those years. Hence, areas to be properly urbanised were the white ones only.

appointed in 1921). Clear areas of jurisdiction were established with the Natives (Urban Areas) Act which placed the control and the administration of urban Africans firmly in the hands of local government (Friedman 1994: 2).

Urbanisation and city development continued during the **White South African city period (1924-1948)** on the basis of the Stallard Commission of 1921 which laid down principles that were to guide African urbanisation for the next thirty years. In the 1930s there was a great movement of white South Africans from rural areas to urban centres. The largest part of the twentieth century was characterised, however, by a government policy which controlled black urbanisation (De Beer 1998: 40). According to the Urban Foundation (1990: 1) it was the official belief of the government that the cities were for white people and that black people were only to be regarded as temporary “sojourners” in the city, since they belonged to rural “reserves”. As Magubane states, this commission concluded that: “the native should only be allowed to enter urban areas which are essentially the white man’s creation when he is willing to enter and minister to the needs of the white man, and should depart there from when he ceases so to minister” (Magubane 1979: 25).

Although the apartheid policy and earlier policies on territorial segregation hindered black urbanisation, they were not able to prevent it altogether.

The physical distance between white and black was a fact and a norm and Pretoria city increasingly became a South African white city. The number of new residential areas for blacks could not match that of the period 1900-1924, although a few, such as Innesdal, were established on the periphery of the city (Kruger 2003: 189). But, according to Malan (1996) the living conditions of blacks in all the locations were appalling, crime was rife and family life was seriously disrupted. The pattern of human settlement adopted by the city in the 1930s led to the establishment of the township of Atteridgeville, which according to Kruger, was the first constructed, controlled and administered location in Pretoria (Kruger 2003: 190). Atteridgeville became thereafter a “re-settler home” for people who were forced to leave Marabastad and Bantule and the Lady Selborne. This brought further in its wake, states Kruger, a huge process of resettlement that would become a hallmark of Pretoria’s spatial reorientation over the next decades (Kruger 2003: 190). However, the process and pattern of resettlement of Pretoria’s inhabitants throughout the century was ambivalent in the extreme. It was intended to improve the living conditions of the inhabitants of slum areas. But the primary reason was that the people of colour had to be removed physically, even if this invariably meant the destruction of existing
social networks, together with the loss of unique cultural expressions (Smuts, kerkpieel III. SI; sa).

The growth of South Africa’s towns and cities was not achieved without enormous human cost and they quickly acquired a bad reputation. The spectres of overcrowding, exploitation, crime, poverty, a sense of “human entrapment” and illiteracy which haunt major cities the world over were also experienced in South Africa (Leatt 1983: 65). The rapid growth of South Africa’s towns and cities has, as Welsh has shown, evoked ambivalent responses from the Afrikaner and African; they quickly acquired a reputation for being evil and undesirable places (Welsh 1971: 202). Welsh, quoting Jabavu, writes [a] “similar ambivalence toward the city can be discerned among Africans. (..) Tengo Jabavu described how towns were seen as having a ‘contaminating influence’” (Jabavu 1969 cited in Welsh 1971: 202).

Writing on African adjustment to urbanisation, M'timkulu says:

(...)The urban African is a little bewildered. He makes every effort to adjust himself to urban living and to accept a western way of life; but he finds that there is strong authoritative pressure to obstruct such change. ...in fact it seems that authority is not anxious to assist him in making adjustments from rural to urban living. He is thus uncertain and not sure of his goals (M'timkulu in Welsh 1971: 219).

M'timkulu’s expressed sentiments do certainly confirm the sense of human entrapment that the African population of Pretoria also experienced. Regardless, in 1947, the Pretoria city council completed the layout of a second large African township, this time to the east, and started erecting houses. This was Vlakfontein, which in 1962, would become Mamelodi (Kruger 2003: 191).

During 1948 – 1976, Pretoria was set and established in ways that led Kruger to call it a “Triumphant city” (Kruger 2003: 205). Pretoria and other urban areas would retain their officially white character by defining Africans as migratory labourers who would not possess the same social and political rights as whites. For Africans in urban areas separate residential areas would be provided. The influx of further Africans into urban areas would be strictly controlled. Although South Africa’s black workers represented a growing urban working class which contributed substantially to the development and prosperity of the city, they were excluded from full participation in policies and decisions that impact on Pretoria and townships. In this sense,
the story of Tshwane has from the start been “a tale of two cities”: Pretoria and Atteridgeville – Mamelodi and other townships.

The urbanisation and spatial development of these townships was substandard compared to that which was taking place in Pretoria and suburbs. For an example, the size of stands and houses in the townships is half the size of a normal stand or house in the suburb. This was part of the grand scheme of apartheid. By the “middle 1960s the organisation of Pretoria into racial pockets was largely completed” (Kruger 2003: 213). Africans who were already in town would live in the townships sufficiently separated from white urban areas and others should stay in the homelands (Bantustans) created for them.

The Bantustans were intended to be sufficiently separated from the white urban areas to continue the perception among whites that the masses of Africans were not officially part of their urban space, but, on the other hand, were close enough to serve as reservoirs for the urban need for African labour. In addition to this perception, the division between white and non-white largely coincided with the division between economically privileged and economically unprivileged (Kruger 2003: 206). Separate development was the norm and the modus operandi in Tshwane, as captured by Kruger in the following citation:

In the vicinity of Pretoria, a homeland was created for the Tswana to the north and west of the city in 1961. From 1972 it was known as Bophuthatswana. For the Ndebele a similar homeland was created to the north-east of the city (KwaNdebele, 1981). The new industrial areas of Rosslyn and Hammanskraal and the new town of GaRankuwa were established in the early 1960s in the Tswana border area north-west of Pretoria. Mabopane was established in 1969. In the late 1970s the town of Soshanguve was established just east of Mabopane – but inside ‘white South Africa’ to accommodate those Africans who resisted taking on Bophuthatswana citizenship which had been a prerequisite for owning property by the government (Kruger 2003: 206)

The townships of Hammanskraal and Soshanguve were created in the 1960s and 1970s respectively. The former was in the homeland of Bophuthatswana and the latter inside “white South Africa”. In my understanding, this was all part of the grand plan to fulfil two aims: 1) to keep Africans out of the city and to enlarge the social and economic distance between blacks and whites. In order to achieve this, it was essential for the industrial plants to be established on the border area and 2) these industries in the border area would be secondary in nature and geared to service the needs of “white South Africa”.

186
Overall, the urbanisation pattern carried on reinforcing the tale of two cities. The townships on the periphery started becoming “catchment” areas for Africans who came from the north and who were not allowed to live in the city because it was a white region. Initially, when these people could not find shelters in townships, they resorted to building shelters on the periphery of formal townships or in areas not too far to the city in the hope of being close to employment opportunities. As stated earlier, this phenomenon increased drastically after 1986 when the influx control measurements were lifted. This resulted in a steady development of squatter and informal settlements in and around these townships. Stinkwater and Winterveld are examples of such settlements, which have been recently given the status of townships and formal residential areas.

From 1976 to 1994, South Africa was experiencing political turmoil and uncertainty. According to Kruger (2003) Pretoria was, in his words, a “Beleaguered city”. It was only in the 1980s that official policy would start to reflect the realisation that Africans were part and parcel of the city. African populations in homeland reserves living on the periphery of the city could no longer be contained. It was also realised that forced removal and resettlement would not necessarily keep “white South Africa” free of blacks. According to Platsky and Walker (1985: n.d), it has been estimated that between 1960 and 1982 approximately three and a half million people were forcibly removed and resettled.

Although Pretoria in this period maintained the image of a town of civil servants, its power to control the African influx to the city became increasingly weakened both inside by voices of change and outside by increased political sanctions and isolation. Kruger states that by the mid-1980s the breakdown of apartheid in the city had become apparent. The actual number of blacks present in Pretoria on any given day vastly exceeded the number of local black residents. Hundreds of thousands commuted to and from the city from the black satellite cities and adjacent black territories [and further as far as Groblersdal] rising very early to sell their labour in Pretoria and arriving home late at night (Kruger 2003: 238). This is still a common occurrence today.

From 1994 to date, the imperatives of the “New South Africa” coupled with the newly acquired constitutional democracy have set all the major cities in South Africa and the rest of the country on an irreversible transformation path. This transformation path has had profound effects on urbanisation and spatial development in the city of Tshwane. As the previous system of twin
cities, one white and one black, was abolished, the process of social transformation, envisaged by the ANC, reached an advanced stage. For the purpose of reconstructing South Africa’s cities, Ma Bin and Smit state: “urban planning is now being reformulated as a primary instrument for remaking South Africa, much as it has been several times before albeit under different political conditions” (Ma Bin & Smit 1997: 193).

In 1999, it was announced that Pretoria would become part of one of six metropolitan megacities in South Africa, each with a single administration, budget and system services. The new metropolitan megacity would include thirteen previously separate municipalities stretching from Centurion in the south, to Temba and Hammanskraal in the north east. The incorporation of these municipalities into Pretoria also included a great number of informal settlements in need of urbanisation. In July 2000 it was decided that the name of the megacity would be Tshwane, a name commonly used by speakers of African languages for the area, while Pretoria would remain the name of the old geographical area. In December 2000 the new name came into effect and the first mayor of the city, the Roman Catholic priest, Father Smangaliso Mkhatshwa, took office.

From the short overview of urbanisation history of the CoT presented above, it should be evident that Leatt accurately argued that “the twinning of our cities expresses the problems of ‘modernity’ and the problems of structural, social, political and economic injustice” (Leatt 1983: 60). With reference to the City of Tshwane, it is apparent that parts of the city that used to be in white areas are modern while those that used to be in black areas are less modern and still suffer economic injustice. As a result, what Simone said as she reflected on urbanisation in Africa is also true about Tshwane: that “many Africans are urban residents, but that they are not truly urbanised” (Simone 2005: 2). It is vital therefore (to use the words of Simone) “to build a new urban infrastructure with the very bodies and life stories of city residents” (Simone 2005: 3).

With reference to the CoT (S & H), this means (as this research has done) facilitating processes whereby residents of these townships are called to discern and analyse their socioeconomic, political and historical backgrounds and those of their settlements in order to envisage concrete transformative actions going forward. That is why, in this research we worked with narratives of the people of these townships as basis for building a new infrastructure with the lives of these semi-urbanised African people. The intention of this research is to contribute towards the building of strong communities, both as social and economic hubs which are better integrated.
into the main social and economic heart or centre of the CoT. In order to do so, this project perceives the role of socially active faith communities as being at the heart of such socioeconomic development. Hence, I have argued that faith communities such as township churches are to be rediscovered as assets towards local economic development in Tshwane.

Further, in this thesis I acknowledged that the “scars” of the history of the CoT are still present with us to this day. For instance, in order to deal with the problems emanating from the separation of the twins of the CoT (the white centre and the black townships), i.e. uneven development, problems of structural, social, political and economic injustice, the township churches of S & H involved in this research are to engage on an ongoing pastoral reflexive praxis in terms of contributing towards the social and economic development and strengthening of specific S and H communities. Thus, the participation of the churches as assets toward LED in Tshwane has an inescapable obligation to promote the embodiment of the values and principles of God’s economy in policies and practice. These churches should facilitate processes for distributive justice, equity in terms of access to productive resources and generous care for those who cannot care for themselves. Furthermore, I argue that these roles are to be carried out systematically, as they address the past and the current situation.

4.3.3 Current state of affairs of the CoT

According to Statistics South Africa\(^73\), the CoT has a population of 2,921,488 of which 23.2% are young (0-14), 71.9% are of working age, and 4.9% are elderly (+65). The Dependency rate\(^74\) is 39%. The Sex ratio\(^75\) is 99%. The growth rate has been at 3.1% (2001 – 2011). The population density is 464 persons per square kilometre. The general unemployment rate is 24.2% while the youth unemployment rate is 32.6%. In terms of education, statistics reveal that the no schooling population (i.e.uneducated) age 20+ comprises 4.2%; that with higher education (post-matric) age 20+ is 23.4%; whereas that with matric aged 20+ is 34%. Statistics

---


\(^74\) The dependency ratio measures the % of dependent people (not of working age) / number of people of working age (economically active). The real (or effective) dependency ratio considers the ratio of economically active workers compared to inactive. The effective dependency ratio does not just take into account the age profile, but whether people are economically active or not (http://www.economicshelp.org/blog/glossary/dependency-ratio/ accessed 4 February 2015)

\(^75\) Sex ratio: the proportional distribution of the sexes in a population aggregate, expressed as the number of males per 100 females (http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/sex+ratio Accessed 4 February 2015).
show there are 911,536 households in the CoT; the average household size is 3 people while female headed households amount to 35.8%. Eighty point seven percent (80.7%) of dwellings are formal. Fifty two percent (52%) of housing is owned/ being paid off by residents. Seventy six point six percent (76.6%) of houses have flush toilets connected to sewerage. Eighty point seven percent (80.7%) of these households receive weekly refuse removal services while 64.2% of the households have piped water inside their dwellings and 88.6% use electricity for lighting.

From the foregoing, I make the following preliminary remarks concerning the current state of affairs in the CoT: 1) the young people (0 – 14) comprise nearly a quarter (¼) of the whole population of the CoT; they cannot be ignored any longer but deserve to be nurtured and protected against all sorts of evil, 2) A thirty nine percent (39%) dependency rate signifies a huge burden for the working class and this has to be addressed, 3) the unemployment rate is unacceptably high and this deserves a decisive intervention by all stakeholders, including the church/faith communities, and 4) 4.2% of people age 20+ who have received no schooling is an unacceptably high proportion. Furthermore, the percentage of the 20+ young people who have had schooling but did not reach matric is much too high; literacy training (preferably functional literacy) is one of the options to address this situation. In the following sections I highlight S & H’s details.

4.3.3.1 Soshanguve\textsuperscript{76} in the CoT

Soshanguve is located in Region 1 (highlighted in red colour), in the map in Figure 4.2 below.

\textsuperscript{76} Soshanguve is a township situated about 25 km north of Pretoria. It was established in 1974 on land to be incorporated into a Bantustan bordering on Mabopane in Bophuthatswana, for Sotho, Shangaan, Nguni and Venda people (thus the name) who were resettled from Atteridgeville and Mamelodi. Initially Soshanguve was known as Mabopane East before the Bophuthatswana Bantustan became an independent State in 1977. During 1977 Mabopane West became known as Mabopane and fell under the control of Bophuthatswana homeland while Mabopane East became known as Soshanguve which fell under the Northern Transvaal administration.
According to the CoT’s 2011–2016 Integrated Development Plan (IDP) (2011: 28), Soshanguve is located in Region 1. This region covers 528 km² and has an estimated population size of 622 993 living in 154 673 households. Politically and administratively it is structured into 28 community wards i.e. 2, 4, 9, 11, 12, 19, 20, 21, 22, 24, 25, 26, 27, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 39, 88, 89, 90, 94 and 98. Region 1 includes various settlements: Soshanguve, GaRankuwa, Mabopane, Winterveld, Theresa Park, Nina Park, Amandasig, Karen Park, Rosslyn, The Orchards, Kopanong, Klipkruisfontein, and Hebron. Particular features of Region 1 include informal settlements, low income residential areas, the industrial areas of Rosslyn, a high dependency on public transport and service infrastructure under pressure.

Statistics South Africa Census 2011\(^\text{77}\) revealed that in terms of racial make-up, Soshanguve is made up of Black African (99.2%), Coloured (0.3%), Indian/ Asian (0.1%), White (0.1%) and others (0.4%). In terms of first languages spoken, it features Northern Sotho (28.2%), Setswana (16.7%), Tsonga (15.1%), Zulu (13.6%) and others (26.5%). It includes the following sub-areas: “Chris Hani (less formal), Klipfontein, Plastic View (less formal), Soshanguve Blocks (A, AA, BB, CC, DD, F, FF, G, GG, H, HH (less formal), IA, JJ, K, KK, LL, M, MM, NN, NNME1, P, PP1, PP2, PP3, R, S) as well as Soshanguve East extensions (3, 4, 5, and 8) and Soshanguve extensions (13, H ext. 1, L ext. 1 and M ext. 1)”.

4.3.3.1.1 Soshanguve upgrades

One of the key upgrades implemented for the benefit of both Soshanguve and Mabopane communities is the improvement of Mabopane Station\(^\text{78}\) and low-income housing in the new sections of the township. Mabopane is located to the west of Soshanguve.

The station “has been identified as one of the 'Urban Cores'\(^\text{79}\) that need to be developed into a real city centre” (CoT, Urban Design Framework for Mabopane Station 2008: 2). The main

---


\(^{78}\) Mabopane Station is an important train/taxi/bus station which services the north western part of the CoT including Soshanguve. It is also a significant business district for the area. Hence, the City’s intention to develop it further into a sustainable, functional and accessible urban core (see CoT 2008. Urban Design Framework for Mabopane Station).

\(^{79}\) In terms of the City Strategy and Municipal Spatial Development Framework, urban cores have been identified in mostly previously disadvantaged areas. Urban cores have been identified as the strategic areas where the City should concentrate capital expenditure.
purpose is to improve current facilities for public transport, formal business and informal trading facilities. Up until 2007, the Mabopane / Soshanguve core was developed mostly in terms of formal retail development. Further major upgrades accomplished from 2009 include renovation and enlargement of the station, public transport, informal trade, recreation, ablution and other community facilities, such as the Metro Police, customer care etc. (CoT Urban Design Framework for Mabopane Station 2008: 3).

Soshanguve accommodates a third of the city’s population who fall within low-income brackets; it has experienced housing upgrades in terms of low-income settlements (subsidised housing and informal settlements) being allocated to the poor and the unemployed. The Tshwane Regional Spatial Development Framework for Region 1 (2012: 33) explains that “the northern parts have limited economic activity and almost no formal employment opportunities. The majority of the employed work in the Central Business District in the city and the Rosslyn industrial area” which is situated in the southern parts of Region 1. The main employer at Rosslyn is the automotive cluster which according to Tshwane Regional Development Framework for Region 1 “is an important employment node on a metropolitan scale, and identified as one of the Blue IQ projects in the city” (Tshwane Regional Spatial Development Framework for Region 1 2012: 33).

4.3.3.1.2 Land use patterns

Land use patterns include single residential stands, retail, commercial and industrial (the map in Figure 4.2 refers). It is also necessary to note that “there is limited private sector investment in the northern sections of the region and the northern parts experience backlogs in infrastructure provision” (Tshwane Regional Spatial Development Framework for Region 1 2012: 33). The Tswaing crater, which is a national heritage site and nature reserve, is located in the northern part of the region.

4.3.3.1.3 Transport

The residents of the northern part are “dependent on public transport, which is of a low standard within the region due to poor operational conditions resulting in capacity problems” (Tshwane Regional Spatial Development Framework for Region 1 2012: 17). Hence, the CoT (Tshwane Regional Spatial Development Framework for Region 1 2012: 20) is working towards inter-
connecting all areas in Tshwane by means of a good and efficient public transport system. Two systems have been proposed and are currently being upgraded that could serve as the basis of a public transport system: rail and the IRPTN/Bus Rapid Transit System.

4.3.3.1.4 Soshanguve: Current assets which could be used for LED

Without giving an elaborate account here, Soshanguve has many assets necessary for sustaining LED. Using the categories developed by Kretzmann and McKnight (1993: 7), the following assets may be distinguished in Soshanguve: local institutions (businesses, schools, parks, hospitals and clinics, community colleges and libraries), Citizens’ Associations (churches, block clubs and cultural groups) and gifts of individuals or human capital (income, artists, youth, elderly and labelled people).

4.3.3.2 Hammanskraal in the CoT

Hammanskraal is located in Region 2 (highlighted in red colour); see the map in Figure 4.3 below.

80 Hammanskraal is a small township situated about 46 km north-east of Pretoria. The initial town was named after Hamman, a cattleman who, to protect his livestock from predators, set up a stockade here. The new township demarcation includes locations such as Kekana Gardens, Mandela Village, Ramotse, Marokolong, Kanana, Temba, Unit D, Maubane, Majaneng, Bosplaas and other nearby villages.
According to the CoT’s 2011 – 2016 IDP (2011: 27 – 28), Hammanskraal is located in Region 2 of the CoT. This region covers a surface of 1 062km² and houses an estimated population of 408 276 living in 115 882 households. Politically and administratively, it is structured into 12 community wards i.e. 5, 8, 13, 14, 49, 50, 73, 74, 75, 76, 95 and 96. Hammanskraal area is situated between the national freeway (N1) to the east while to the west is the Mabopane freeway (PWV9), approximately 30km north of the central business district (CBD) of the City of Tshwane

Region 2 also includes the following settlements: Hammanskraal, Temba, Montana, Anlin, Dooringpoort, Sinoville, Onderstepoort, Stinkwater, Dilopye, Suurman, Majaneng, Mashemong and Walmannsthal agricultural holdings.

Physical features of Region 2 include Bon Accord Dam, rural areas, urban neighbourhoods and peri-urban townships, informal settlements, Wonderboom Nature Reserve and Wonderboom Airport. These settlements and towns are at various stages of formalisation and their service infrastructure is under pressure.

With regard to the population, the Local Spatial Development Framework (LSDF) (2008: 3), states:

- Number of people: approximately 240 000 in 2008
- Expected growth rate of 7.4% per annum in the period of 2005-2010
- There is an almost equal split between the male and female population in terms of numbers, with almost half of them aged 24 or below
- Just over half the population have only primary school level education or lower
- A low skills base and therefore a high unemployment rate (i.e. 50.3%) are prevalent.

Statistics South Africa Census 2011 revealed that in terms of racial make-up, Hammanskraal comprised black African (98.3%), Coloured (0.3%), Indian/Asian (0.3%), White (0.4%) and
others (0.7%). In terms of first languages spoken, they include Northern Sotho (18.1%), Setswana (46.2%), Tsonga (14.7%), Sotho (4.3%) and others (16.7%).

Looking at these facts, it is clear that there is a great need for local economic development and community- and youth-based projects and programmes that will go towards creating employment opportunities. Further, LSDF (2008: 2) explains:

The City of Tshwane (CoT) inherited the concerned towns and settlements from the former Temba Tribal Representative Council (TTRC) and was formerly referred to as Hammanskraal and the Cross Border Area. Much of the land on which these settlements exist is under traditional authority and many of the developments took place in an ad-hoc way without any formal overall planning being done for the area (...). In March 2004 the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality initiated Phase 1 (Status Quo report) of the process required to compile a Regional Development Framework for the area. This was followed by the Status Quo Report for the Hammanskraal and Cross- Border Area which was compiled and submitted during 2005.

Hence, according to 2008 LSDF, the city is working hard to formalise the towns and settlements of:

- Ramotse
- Marokolong
- Mandela Village
- Hammanskraal
- Hammanskraal West
- Temba
- Dilopye
- Suurman
• Mashemong
• Majaneng
• Stinkwater and Nuwe Eersterus
• Babelegi industrial area.

4.3.3.2.1 Hammanskraal upgrades

According to the LSDF (2008: 1-5), stipulated strategic objectives in line with the 5 year strategic plan include: to provide basic services and develop infrastructure, build safer, viable and sustainable communities, encourage economic growth and development, and provide caring and effective government. The anticipated desired outcome is harmonious and optimal development of the concerned settlements named above.

To date, some settlements are still in the process of being upgraded to municipal status. Property tenure, sanitation and infrastructure development are some of the issues with which the city authorities are dealing. According to News24.com, Kgositso Ramokgopa, the current Executive Mayor of the CoT, handed over more than 2000 title deeds to residents of Kekana Gardens location on 5th October 2013. The handing over of title deeds is “another step towards (...) total emancipation and economic freedom” It is worth noting that property tenure is not seen in isolation but as part of economic freedom strategy and as a remedy of past injustice.

In addition to Kekana Gardens, Hammanskraal, Babelegi Industrial Area, Kudube, Kudube Unit 10 and Stinkwater are the only proclaimed townships. Because large parts of Hammanskraal area are not formalised there are also no records of many of the properties. This makes it very difficult to implement a proper Land Use management system for the area. The issue of township formalisation and establishments is thus a matter of urgency: Properties cannot be transferred to individuals in a township that has not yet been proclaimed. One unfortunate result of the delay of the formalisation of settlements is that several informal settlements have sprung up. Another challenge lies in the fact that a significant portion of the land is administered and held in trust by the Tribal Authority of the area. Yet, the land is owned by the Department of Land Affairs and the CoT is the service provider. This is a legal issue that will have to be resolved.

4.3.3.2.2. **Land use patterns**

These range from single residential stands to industrial, retail and commercial ones. Although services exist in the area, there is still a considerable need for upgrading and provision in areas that have only some or no services, particularly with regard to water and sanitation. There is a significant backlog with regards to community facilities such as clinics, libraries and orphanages. Existing facilities are not spatially well-distributed.

4.3.3.2.3. **Transport**

Travelling is essentially by means of public transport facilities or by foot. At present there is no formal extensive road network in place for the study area. Main routes into the study area are via the N1 and Route K97, known as the old Pretoria-Warmbaths Road. The railway line between Pretoria and Hammanskraal running north-south through the region currently carries only long distance passengers, but could be regarded as a resource of the region and could be upgraded in future to allow for more effective regional public transport. This rail link is owned and operated by Spoornet. At present there is no commuter rail service operating from the Far North Eastern Region (FNER) area into the southern portion of Tshwane.

4.3.3.2.4. **Hammanskraal: Current assets which could be used for LED**

The LSDF proposes two new urban nodes in Stinkwater and Temba central. Kudube Unit 4 is an existing node that was also subject to haphazard formalisation and which will need to be redesigned so as to make it an attractive space to move in whether by vehicle or foot. Five areas of significance have also been identified. These are localities that are integral to the population’s economic and or social well-being: Tswaing Village, Babelegi Industrial Area, proposed sites for (the proposed) Ventsope Cultural Village on remainder 6 of the farm Stinkwater and (the proposed) Moshate Cultural Village in Majaneng as well as proposed Cemeteries and Agricultural Areas.
Using the categories developed by Kretzmann and McKnight (1993: 7) and in addition to these nodes mentioned above, the following assets could be identified in Hammanskraal: local institutions (businesses, schools, parks, hospitals, community colleges and libraries), citizens associations (churches, block clubs and cultural groups) and gifts of individuals or human capital (income, artists, youth, elderly and labelled people). If strategically used, these assets are essential pillars for LED, which could lead to collective wellbeing in the communities of Hammanskraal.

4.3.3.3 The church in these townships: general remarks

A detailed discussion of the church in these townships is undertaken in the next chapter. For now, it suffices to say that in view of the features and assets that both these townships possess, as presented in this chapter, it is most likely that township churches could play a catalytic role in facilitating the realisation of some viable solutions that could lead to a LED which promotes sharing and equality in the CoT. This is even more the case, given the fact highlighted in the CoT IDP (2011: 78) that:

The majority of developments occur within the eastern, central and southern parts of the CoT, (...) however the highest densities of people do not occur in these areas. The highest density of people is in the northern area (north east and north west) where the least development currently takes place. It is however true that this area is currently the area within the CoT that receives the highest number of new investment in infrastructure and services. It is foreseen that the availability of infrastructure in the northern area will in future open up the area for development.

As portrayed in the maps, both Soshanguve and Hammanskraal are located on the northern edge of the city with a high population density where the least development currently takes place. These two townships are also areas that have infrastructure and social facilities problems (CoT IDP 2011: 69) (CoT IDP 2011: 79). These shortages of development, infrastructure and facilities remain significant challenges and handicaps for progress. Consequently, community organisations and institutions, such as churches located in these areas, are affected by these challenges, but the latter also offer major opportunities for integrated holistic ministry.

Therefore, I have argued that the township churches of these communities need to study the causes of this urban explosion (high density) in terms of quantity (numbers and categories) and quality (cultures and sub-cultures). Obtaining factual knowledge of the context will give these
churches insights for praxis. Further, for the sake of these churches’ participation in LED, they are compelled to analyse the impact that high density, low quality housing in some areas, lack of infrastructure and social facilities has on the poor and the vulnerable in these communities. It is also important for the churches to identify how these communities in need cope or do not cope in this situation.

For example, to adopt the goals of God’s economy stated in this research, such as shared prosperity and living a long life in the land, will certainly inspire the township churches to promote LED depending on how they understand it and on their skills to implement LED that may benefit all communities. I contend that it is very important that the churches should equip themselves to assist communities to implement LED. It is also crucial for these churches involved in this research to comprehend the political and administrative structures in the city before they become involved. I go on to describe the governance, power and administrative structures of the CoT later in the text.

Furthermore, it is also of importance to acknowledge that these two townships were and still are catchment centres for the people who come from the previous homelands up north and west of the (then) Transvaal, now known as Gauteng. This high density issue discussed earlier could also be associated with the illegal immigrants who live in these townships. With particular reference to Soshanguve, Dumba and Chirisa state:

There are also extensions of the area, these are Soshanguve extension G, GG, H, I and extension 4 and 5, where most non-locals reside in squatter settlements. Although Soshanguve from the outset was meant for the multi-ethnic groups in South Africa, it has become one of the major harbours for regional (Southern African) nationals, specifically those in the bracket of illicit migration (Dumba & Chirisa 2010: 2)

This situation is similar to the Hammanskraal localities such as Kanana, Mandela Village and Kekana Gardens. The challenge associated with this is that illegal immigrants are not easily counted because of lack of documentation, yet they participate informally in the local economy by, amongst other things, selling cheap labour and informal trading as pointed out by the research participants’ narrative in Chapter 6. It is therefore worth noting that a good prospect for LED in Tswana (S & H) should not exclude the immigrants who are already contributing to the economy. Rather, their capabilities, probably positive attitudes towards hard work and their willingness to contribute to economic activities could be used to advance the goals of the local
economy of Tshwane. This does not imply a view that South African citizens do not have capabilities or do not contribute to economic activities. What it does imply is that as long as immigrants contribute positively to the economy, this is a gain for the CoT and the rest of the nation. They should however be properly documented by the relevant authority.

Further, the discourse above in relation to urbanisation of the CoT is important for the praxis of churches and faith communities. It is for this reason that in this thesis the pastoral praxis cycle was adopted as the framework to provide guidance to churches, not only in terms of understanding current urban experiences and actions but also in terms of analysing these described experiences in the context of social reality. The oikos as the hermeneutic key assisted us as a group to reflect on our analysis of the S & H communities, on the understanding of the churches on the type of LED to be promoted in the CoT (S & H) and on the way in which they may be able to do so.

4.4. Economy

4.4.1. A brief historical overview of the economy of Tshwane

Notably, the “establishment of local government took place within a pre-industrialised economy” (Friedman 1994: 46). The developments of the features of this economy are explained below.

The nature of Pretoria’s local economy with its lack of a grounded industrial base, together with the existence of a permanent African population since the nineteenth century determined the direction of urban policy. The absence of mining capital prompted a focus on the social concerns for segregation, while the settled African population could not be ignored and the creation of municipal regulations and a coherent policy could not be postponed. Thus, African urban policy was carved out of the specificity of urban conditions and the patterns of urbanisation that prevailed in Pretoria (Friedman 1994: 108).

From the outset, Pretoria’s local economy was faced with the challenges and the opportunities to put in place an inclusive or an exclusive economic system. The choice for an exclusive system, which apparently was influenced by a scarcity of resources (especially mineral) and by needs of survival and a better quality of life for white people, bred a racist and segregated system. Apparently, these motivations were behind the efforts to “uplift” the poor whites. This segregated system influenced the process of urbanisation as it was outlined in the previous section. It also influenced the path for later industrial development of the city. In the following
sections, I will use Kruger’s historical epochs (i.e. Imperial city (1900 – 1924), White South African city (1924 – 1948), Triumphal city (1948 – 1976) and Beleaguered city (1976 – 1994), described earlier, so as to present the economic development in a chronological order. In addition to Kruger’s epochs, I add pre-1900 and post-1994 sections as this will give a somewhat more complete picture of the economic development in the CoT.

4.4.1.1 Economy in the pre-1900 period

Terreblanche (2002: 219 – 238) refers to this period as the systemic period of the two Boer republics marked by inter alia, the Great Trek, the establishment by Afrikaners of semi-independent and vulnerable power constellations in the Transorangia; slave raiding in the Transvaal especially and the rise of an African tenantry. Without presenting an elaborate discussion of the prevalent issues prevalent of that period, it is essential to draw attention to the view of Terreblanche [that the] “Voortrekkers did not experience serious problems in depriving the different African tribes of large parts of their land” Terreblanche (2002: 219) in their journeys. Thereafter, inordinate energy and resources were spent to “mould Africans into a useful and manageable labour force” (Terreblanche 2002: 219) although they at first resisted these attempts. Once subdued, they were reduced to a wage-earning group of adults. Young children who were “raided” were “booked in” with white families and worked for them until they reached adulthood, when they started to receive meagre wages. This brought about the extreme subjugation of black people by Voortrekkers in the Transvaal to serve the colonisers. The same modus operandi was used in Pretoria by the Voortrekkers.

Hence, pre-1900, Pretoria was initially a city created to serve the Voortrekkers’ own commercial, military and administrative interests. As stated above, this also meant disregarding the tribal and ethnic rights of domain of the local inhabitants who once lived in this area. Terreblanche (2002: 220 – 221) a combination of economic, labour, ideological and political considerations played an important role in the reasons for the Great Trek, its central causes were undoubtedly economic – to find new land for the Voortrekkers’ economic independence. Another reason was the Dutch farmers’ rebellion against the abolition of slavery and the measures brought into place by the British colonial government to regulate and improve the Dutch farmers’ treatment of their slaves/ex-slaves/workers. Therefore, as the Voortrekkers settled in Pretoria, all development and progress was centred on protecting their economic interests.
According to Caxton Ltd (s.a), Pretoria became an important transport centre when the first train steamed into Pretoria Station on 1 January 1893. Tradition has it that the first industry in Pretoria was ivory, where it brought much prosperity. In 1866, Pretoria was the forwarding station for ivory between Zoutpansberg and Durban. The second attempt at industrialisation took place during the British occupation, when Dr Lyle opened a brewery in the peri-urban area of Trevenna.

In the early days, some other initial industries included the Transvaal Argus newspaper (established in 1864), the Government Printing Works\(^\text{82}\) (founded in 1888), Pretoria Portland Cement (established in 1892), Kirkness Brickfields (established in 1890), Van Erkom’s cigar, cigarette and snuff factory (established in 1890), and G.W. Shilling’s cold drink factory (established in 1885). The discovery of gold in the eastern Transvaal brought about rapid expansion in Pretoria; in 1899 the following industries were established: one blacksmith, one cold drink factory, one bookbinder, one brewer, three filling cabinet makers, one gunsmith, three steam saw mills, a gin distiller and a wagon builder (Caxton Ltd s.a: 43 – 45).

As described above, the city that was designed and developed pre-1900 was to be “white”. It must therefore be understood that these early industrial developments achieved in this period were not intended to directly benefit the non-white population. Maynard Swanson\(^\text{83}\) articulated this when he said the underlying question concerning this development was “one of the overall social control: how to organise society to provide for the mutual access of black labourers and white employers in the coming industrial age without having to pay the heavy social costs of urbanisation or losing the dominance of white over black” (Swanson 1968: 31). It can thus be stated that a system immersed in inequality started to develop from this period onwards.

4.4.1.2. Economy during the Imperial city period (1900 – 1924)

Against the backdrop of separate development and the existence of an unequal system serving the colonising powers’ own interests which started to take shape in the 19\textsuperscript{th} century, more industries were established during the imperial city period at the beginning of the 20\textsuperscript{th} century. With regard to the broader socioeconomic and political background of the imperial period, Terreblanche (2002: 239) recorded,


\(^{83}\) Maynard W. Swanson. 1968. The urban origins of Separate Development. Race, X
During this period various political units – controlled by the British, Afrikaners, and Independent African tribes – were united into the Union of South Africa under the effective political control of whites. During the same period a mining and agricultural revolution took place in the northern provinces. This period was not only one of state-building, during which white political domination was consolidated, but also one in which the state – on behalf of foreign-owned mining corporations – built an institutional and physical infrastructure of white supremacy. At the same time, it created a racially based socio-economic and labour structure aimed at supplying foreign corporations and white farmers with a cheap and docile labour force. Consequently, a symbiotic relationship developed between white political domination and racial capitalism that endured until 1990s.

Thus, Pretoria shaped its economy by opting for liberal capitalism, racial segregation and white supremacy. The Native Affairs Department of the time legitimised these ideologies by developing “repressive African labour patterns on behalf of white employers and by convincing an important elite core of Africans that segregation was a ‘reformist’ policy applied in the interests of the African community”. “This,” writes Rich (1996) cited in Terreblanche (2002: 284), “enabled the white-controlled state to carry on with its business as if Africans belonged to another ‘country’ or another realm”. Hence, it must be understood that the few examples of economic enterprises named hereunder concern the economy of “white” Pretoria.

Some examples of factories established during this period included the diamond mining industry which became a major contributor to the economy in 1902 with the establishment of the Cullinan Group of Companies. Other industries included Western Brickfields in 1903. The first factory in Pretoria West was erected in 1909 when the Union Soap Works was started there (Caxton Ltd s.a: 47). In 1914, a few industries were established there; among them, were factories for wagon building, structural engineers, brick and tile makers, cement producers, tobacco processing, another brewery, ink manufacture, soap works and cold drinks. Other industries that came somewhat later include the Pretoria Mint established in 1923.

The nature and shape of these factories clearly show that the imperial city of Pretoria steadily developed its industrial capacity, which at that period could give the colonial powers a decent standard of life compared to that of the Black inhabitants. It is also evident that substantial infrastructure development started to take place during this era. The economic momentum generated in this period was rolled over to the next period by further consolidation as discussed in the following section.
4.4.1.3. Economy during the White South African city period (1924 – 1948)

Pretoria’s (significant) industrial development essentially commenced with the establishment of the South African Iron and Steel Industrial Corp (ISCOR)\(^{84}\) in 1928. Generally, this period coincides with the proclamation of urban areas under section 5 of the Urban Areas Act No 21 of 1923 which on one hand placed the town authority under obligation to provide decent housing for natives living in urban areas and on the other marked the beginning of urbanisation for natives. According to the Report of (the) Natives Economic Commission of 1930 - 1932\(^{85}\) (1932: 62) the increase of the urban native population during this period was fuelled by two reasons: 1) the elimination of existing Native slums and the prevention of the formation of new Native slums and 2) residential segregation of Natives. The seemingly improved conditions of natives who were allowed to live in urban areas enticed many Africans to come to the city to seek employment in these industries in the city.

However, as the Report of Natives Economic Commission (1932: 63) continues, the implications of the Anti-Slums provision of the Act gave any urban local authority the power to restrict the entry of natives into urban areas because it was argued an unlimited influx of them would be an unbearable burden on the urban local authority. Therefore, “natives who came to towns to look for work must obtain a permit to do so. Natives who cannot find work within the time allowed them may be required to leave the area” (Report of (the) Natives Economic Commission 1932: 62).

However, on the positive side, this Urban Act paved the way for the establishment of native’s towns (which later become known as townships) around cities of South Africa with somewhat improved housing. With reference to Pretoria, the Act placed the Town Council under obligation to build or allow natives to build houses and community facilities in the three native locations of

\(^{84}\) South African Iron and Steel Industrial Corp (ISCOR) now trades as ArcelorMittal South Africa. ArcelorMittal South Africa has been in existence since 1928 when the company, then called Iscor, with its first works in Pretoria, was founded as a statutory parastatal organisation. The objectives of establishing the company were to produce iron and a range of steel and to create employment opportunities. The first steel was tapped from the open-hearth furnace at the Pretoria Works on 4 April 1934. Wartime needs for steel and the local manufacture of numerous necessities brought about a sharp increase in demand which necessitated the expansion of the company. In 1942 the Iscor Company was established to meet the increasing demand for steel in South Africa.

\(^{85}\) Union of South Africa. 1932. Report of Natives Economic Commission of 1930 – 1932. Pretoria: Government Printers. This Commission was appointed by His Excellency, the Governor-General of the Union of South Africa on 9th June 1930 to inquire and report on the economic conditions of Natives in large towns of the Union.
that time i.e. Schoolplaats, Marabas and Bantule (see Report of (the) Natives Economic Commission 1932: 71). From an economic perspective, this also meant that the sixteen native traders in Marabas and four in Bantule (Report of Natives Economic Commission 1932: 71) could, relatively speaking, do business among their people at ease.

As the city gained increased administrative and political status, printing and the news industry became a necessity. The Transvaal Argus newspaper, which was initially established in 1864, was further developed to service the needs of a growing population of Pretoria. Thereafter, the Government Printing Works founded in 1888, expanded its operation. In addition, the Centre for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR)\textsuperscript{86} was established in 1945 for the purpose of boosting technological and military capacity.

Regardless of these economic and industrial advances, as pointed out by Lucas’ addendum to the Report of Natives Economic Commission of 1930 – 1932 (1932: 183), “in many respects the natives have advanced, but owing to a number of circumstances which are pointed out in the Report their economic position is now as a rule very poor”. This simply emphasises that the persistent history of socioeconomic and political inequality prevented the Africans from benefitting substantially from the economy of the city of Pretoria.

\textbf{4.4.1.4. Economy during the Triumphal city period (1948 – 1976)}

According to Terreblanche (2002: 333 – 343), discriminatory practices and legislation which became an integral part of the South African society from the 18\textsuperscript{th} century consisting of racist ideologies of Social Darwinism\textsuperscript{87} and segregationism\textsuperscript{88} reached their climax in this period. Of importance is the fact that racist and discriminatory legislation and job reservation was put in place to protect “poor whites” against competition from the coloured and African poor. With reference to economic opportunities, this merely meant the market in favour of the whites.

\textsuperscript{86} The CSIR is one of the leading scientific and technology research, development and implementation organisations in Africa. Constituted by an Act of Parliament in 1945 as a science council, the CSIR undertakes directed and multidisciplinary research, technological innovation as well as industrial and scientific development to improve the quality of life of the country’s people. It was crucial when the old South African Defence Force needed to develop its own weapons during the apartheid era.

\textsuperscript{87} Social Darwinism: a 19\textsuperscript{th}-century theory, inspired by Darwinism, by which the social order is accounted for as the product of natural selection of those persons best suited to existing living conditions and in accord with which a position of laissez-faire is advocated (http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/social+Darwinism accessed 10 February 2015).

\textsuperscript{88} Segregationism: a political orientation favouring political or racial segregation (http://www.audioenglish.org/dictionary/segregationism.htm accessed 10 February 2015)
This period is marked by the rise of the National Party (NP) to power, which formally installed the apartheid regime. Terreblanche (2002: 333 – 335) elaborates:

- In 1948 the NP began to entrench racial discrimination in a far more comprehensive and systematic way.

- When the NP came to power, it was obsessed with the dangers of racial swamping and racial mixing. To address these alleged dangers of black swamping, the NP embarked on a “politicisation of racism” and on the restructuring of the entire society along racial lines (Bonner et al 1993 cited in Terreblanche 2002: 334).

- Consequently, NP placed a plethora of segregationist and discriminatory laws on the statute books (i.e. Mixed Marriages Act\(^ {89}\) (1949), Immorality Amendment Act\(^ {90}\) (1950), Population Registration Act\(^ {91}\) (1950), Group Areas Act\(^ {92}\), Black Education Act\(^ {93}\) (1953), Extension of University Education Act\(^ {94}\) (1959), Separate Representation of Voters Act\(^ {95}\) (1951), Reservation of Separate Amenities Act\(^ {96}\) (1953), Black Building Workers Act\(^ {97}\).)

All these law enacted by the NP had serious socioeconomic impacts on the city of Pretoria. Multi-dimensional inequality, exclusion and marginalisation of groups along racial lines became the norm and a way of life. In a sense, “white Pretoria” had nothing to do with “black Pretoria”. The former was developed, technologically advanced and resourceful while the latter was less developed, technologically behind and less resourced. The centre of economic and political power was “white Pretoria” while the periphery was “black Pretoria”. The peripheral townships of H and S were/are part of ‘black Pretoria’.

---

89 Mixed Marriages Act: put in place to maintain racial purity
90 Immorality Amendment Act: was introduced to forbid marriages between black and white people as well as sexual relations between whites and blacks.
91 Population Registration Act: required people to be identified and registered from birth as members of one of the four racial groups i.e. white, black, coloured and Indian.
92 Group Areas Act: provided for areas to be declared for the exclusive use of one particular racial group.
93 Black Education Act: formalised the segregation of black education, and laid the foundations for ’Bantu Education’.
94 Extension of University Education Act: empowered the minister to designate colleges for specified African ethnic groups.
95 Separate Representation of Voters Act: removed coloured people from the common voters’ roll.
96 Reservation of Separate Amenities Act: allowed for public facilities and transport to be reserved for particular race groups.
97 Black Building Workers Act: this Act prohibited blacks from performing skilled work in the building industry in white urban areas.
A short reflection carried out by South African History.org.za on the implications of three of these laws, with particular reference to Pretoria, pointed out that:

1) Both the Mixed Marriages Act and Immorality Amendment Act not only brought humiliation and suffering to thousands of families who were broken up and declared unlawful, but also allowed police to snoop on people’s private lives.

2) In Pretoria, Group Areas Act led to the demarcation of separate residential areas for Whites, Indians, Coloureds and Africans. People were moved from Lady Selborne, the city centre and Marabastad to Laudium, Eersterus, Mamelodi, Atteridgeville and Hammanskraal. Indian traders were also moved out of the centre of Pretoria. All of these townships and suburbs were situated at a distance from the city centre, which made it difficult for people to reach their places of work. At this point, the government had not implemented any transport system that would cater for the needs of these townships residents.

3) In terms of segregated schooling, the Bantu Education Act (1953) allowed the government to fully control Black education. Black schools had to offer instruction in mother tongues and in Afrikaans, not in English, and the subjects offered were different from those offered in White schools. In Pretoria, this act affected the Atteridgeville, Mamelodi, Hammanskraal and GaRankuwa areas. In various later studies, it was said that these laws were eventually responsible for the militancy that grew out of the schools, especially in the townships in the Transvaal.

Of note, with reference to further economic and industrial milestones in Pretoria, Datsun-Nissan and BMW were established later in the 1970s at Rosslyn in the proximity of GaRankuwa and Soshanguve – close enough to obtain cheap unskilled labour. The location of these automotive plants on the northern outskirts of the city served the purpose of segregation in that Africans remained outside “white Pretoria”. The city continued building on much of the industrial development which took place between 1865 – 1965, which Leatt described as the golden century of development, the period when the appropriate infrastructure necessary for

99 Nissan South Africa was established in the late 1970s. The manufacturing plant was built in the 1980s.
this expansion grew and South Africa became the most industrialised country on the African continent (Leatt 1983: 65).

There was also the establishment of the Armaments Corporation of South Africa (Armscor) in 1948 and further development of the work of CSIR. A further factor that influenced the economy of that period was the sale of weapons and ammunition (for use in war against opponents of the government) manufactured by Armscor. Kruger (2003: 207) points to this reality: “during and after the World War II Pretoria benefited greatly as a result of Iscor’s increased production for the South African war effort, which spawned a large number of secondary industries in the city”.

In the main, the city remained a town of civil servants, its economy and employment structure characterised by concentration on the tertiary sector of the economy between 1976 -1994 (Kruger 2003: 231) and motor manufacturing. Focus on the tertiary sector meant that the majority of less educated and unskilled blacks from townships of Pretoria had no access to employment in the city. This exclusion further aggravated the plague of poverty and inequality as it affected communities in townships. Segregation and exclusion were further embodied in all structures of society in the Republic of South Africa.

4.4.1.5. Economy during the Beleaguered city period (1976 – 1994)

The socioeconomic and political context and mood during this period is marked by tension, revolt and protest. Notably, the apartheid regime (building on legislative restructuring of the

---

101 During the Second World War (1939 - 1945) more advanced weaponry and equipment were manufactured locally by South African companies under the auspices of Dr HJ van der Bijl, the Director-General of War Supplies. However, this was just for the duration of the War. In October 1948 an Advisory Committee on Union Defence Force Equipment Requirements was appointed. This date may therefore be regarded as the beginning of the Armaments Corporation of South Africa (Armscor) as it is known today. With the change of government in 1994, government spending priorities changed from defence to social upliftment, and by the end of 1997 the defence budget had been reduced to about 1.6% of the gross domestic product. In anticipation of these changes, Armscor drew up a three-point plan, which included converting the defence industry from a manufacturer of military products alone to a manufacturer of civilian products as well. As the Act in terms of which Armscor had been set up prohibited it or any of its subsidiaries from manufacturing civilian products or competing with the private sector, this plan resulted in Armscor splitting into two separate entities. On 1 April 1992 a new company, Denel (Pty) Ltd, was established under the Minister of Public Enterprises. Armscor has since focussed its energies towards programme management and acquisition, whilst Denel is a major supplier of manufactured products and systems (http://www.armscor.co.za/About/History.asp accessed 11 February 2015).

102 The tertiary sector of the economy is the service industry. This sector provides services to the general population and to businesses. Activities associated with this sector include retail and wholesale sales, transportation and distribution, entertainment (movies, television, radio, music, theatre, etc.), restaurants, clerical services, media, tourism, insurance, banking, healthcare, and law. (http://geography.about.com/od/urbaneconomicgeography/a/sectorseconomy.htm accessed 11 February 2015)
previous period) passed more laws (such as installation of the Bantu Affairs Administration Board which was later replaced by community councils after 1977) to perpetuate local separation and inequalities. As a result, South African cities developed along even more unequal social, spatial and economic lines (Amtaika 2013: 76). This was further reinforced by the installation of a separate local authority for each racial group. With specific reference to the economic situation, this period experienced stagflation\textsuperscript{103} which was exacerbated by the black labour revolt\textsuperscript{104} caused by the liberation struggle.

In the wake of popular resistance which was sparked by the 1976 Soweto Uprising, the apartheid regime attempted further reforms which culminated in the establishment of Black Local Authorities in 1983. However, these Authorities lacked legitimacy in addition to lacking substantial sources of revenues (due mainly to community boycotts) and were considered “sell-outs” since they were perceived as partners of the white controlled government (Amtaika 2013: 76). With reference to Pretoria, these Black Local Authorities responsible for social and economic development of townships such as S and H had no substantial resources and no legitimate power. As a result, while the “white Pretoria” and its communities prospered economically, these townships were further plunged into poverty because local economies of townships were paralysed by the consumer boycotts and protests.

Causes and reasons which trigged these protests were multi-faceted and a combination of, amongst other things: townships’ residents struggles to reclaim the townships in terms of use – values, township residents’ discontent with the built environment, discontent emanating from failure of local councils and councillors to fulfil their election promises in addition to allegations of corruption and mismanagement of funds. Additionally, rents increased and civil disobedience increased against local authorities who were perceived as puppets of the apartheid regime.

By means of political mobilisation led by liberation movements and structures operative in the townships of the Pretoria – Witwatersrand – Vaal Triangle area in that period, these protests spilt over to schools, youth associations, resident associations, cultural associations, faith and religious associations and the like. In a township such as Hammanskraal, which was under the

\textsuperscript{103} Stagflation is an economic condition in which rising prices, high unemployment and little or no economic growth are present (see Procter, P. 1995, Cambridge International Dictionary of English, Guides to meaning, 1\textsuperscript{st} edition, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)

\textsuperscript{104} In the 1970s, black labour ceased to be docile, cheap, and easily exploitable, so that the white employer class lost one of the pillars of its colonial plundering. The non-availability of exploitable black labour from the 1970s onwards created an accumulating crisis for the corporate and farming sectors (Terreblanche 2002: 420)
jurisdiction of the repressive homeland of Bophuthatswana with Lucas Mangope as the leader, political mobilisation took place underground until it surfaced in the form of violence, looting and destruction of property and infrastructure when the “New South Africa” was being negotiated from 1990 – 1993. During this period, economic activities in townships of S and H were erratic and volatile. Shopping malls such as Kudube in Hammanskraal and Central City in Mabopane / Soshanguve were burnt down, as were municipal facilities. All this meant further setbacks to and paralysis of the economies of these townships so that unemployment soared to great proportions.

The foregoing discussion highlights the economic life of the CoT in historical perspective from pre – 1900 to 1994. Significantly, this perspective shows that the economy of Pretoria has developed mainly in a segregated and unequal fashion for nearly a century. This economy, influenced by socio-political motives and systems, has mainly worked in favour of the white sector of the population of the city. This situation was supported by various policies and structures put in place to promote a segregated, discriminatory and unequal system which reached its climax during the reign of the apartheid regime in South Africa. As a result, local institutions, citizens’ associations including churches and individuals situated particularly in black townships suffered negative consequences of this weak and unstable economy physically, psychologically, socially, etcetera, as this research shows in the narrative accounts tabled in Chapter 6.

Post-1994, eradication of this legacy of a segregated and unequal economic system became, as described below, one of the priorities for the new city of Pretoria, now known as the City of Tshwane, as well as for the province and the country.

4.4.1.6. Economy in the post-1994 period

South Africa has a rich but complex history. From a socioeconomic and political perspective, Terreblanche (2002) says it is “a history of inequality”. As has been discussed, unequal power structures, segregation and racial discrimination with human rights violations were a norm in the South African society for far too long. As Terreblanche (2002: xv) states,

Unfortunately, unequal power relations and unequal socio-economic outcomes have remained defining characteristics of the post-apartheid period. Despite our transition to an inclusive democracy, old forms of inequality have been perpetuated and some entrenched more deeply than ever before.
Hence, since 1994 the new democratic government, in an attempt to eradicate this situation, launched a number of policies, ranging from the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP), to Growth Employment and Redistribution (GEAR), to present government surpluses which according to government’s claims are “a continuity of policy from the Freedom Charter” (Dikeni 2012: 41). Lodge (1996: 1) considers the purpose of the RDP was “to guard against an emphasis on growth alone, as this would worsen inequality and maintain mass poverty which in turn would stifle further growth”. It was therefore committed to what Terreblanche (2002: 438) calls “fundamental restructuring”. However, Jeffery (2010: 242) argues that: “… there were many constraints on the successes of the RDP, such as incompetent public service managers, racially-tinged pessimism, a massive budget deficit and an enormous deficit in education, training, and experience of black South Africans”. As a result, the RDP only succeeded in contributing towards infrastructural development and social housing but failed to eradicate deep-seated socioeconomic inequalities in South Africa.

Influenced largely by neo-liberal democratic capitalism, the “fundamental restructuring” to which the new government committed itself in the RDP was neglected (Jeffrey 2010: 243, Terreblanche 2002: 438). The government adopted growth-focussed policies; chief among these was GEAR, based on the premises, writes Terreblanche (2002: 426 – 438), that: 1) South Africa has a high economic growth potential, 2) integration into the benign global economy will enhance economic growth, 3) a high economic growth rate will unlock the labour-absorptive capacity of the economy, 4) the benefits of a high economic growth rate will “trickle down” to the poor and 5) the restructuring of the economy should be entrusted to market-led economic growth.

Unfortunately, as has been established by many scholars and thinkers (Kotze 2004, The Oikos study group 2006:17), “it is the post-apartheid South African government’s adoption of a neoliberal macro-economic policy, encapsulated in GEAR and subsequent growth-focused policies to steer the country’s integration into the global market economy, that is today identified by many critical commentators as being at the heart of the country’s social problems”. After reflection on the growth-focused policies adopted post-1994, Turok (2008 cited in Dikeni 2012: 41), based on the outcomes of the African National Conference which took place in Polokwane in 2007, pointed out that “the conference documents conceded, inequality has increased,
violating the principle of the Freedom Charter that ‘The People Shall Share in the Country’s Wealth’.

Reasons for this persistent inequality stem from a variety of sets of deeply interlinked and interconnected socioeconomic, political and historical issues which still form part of the apartheid legacy. Terreblanche (2002: 30 – 44) distinguishes four poverty traps (i.e. social distortions and destructive dynamics) introduced by apartheid which continue to reproduce and augment poverty and perpetuate inequality. These are: 1) high and rising levels of unemployment in a sluggish economy, 2) deeply institutionalised inequalities in the distribution of socio-economic power, property and opportunities, and the persistence of racist prejudices, 3) disrupted social structures and the syndrome of chronic community poverty and 4) the mutually reinforcing dynamics between violence, criminality and ill health on the one hand, and pauperisation on the other. These four poverty traps form part of the reality of contemporary cities such as the CoT, especially in townships such as S and H (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6).

In order to eradicate these four traps of the apartheid legacy, all three spheres of government in South Africa working in tandem introduced several laws in addition to neo-liberal growth-focused policies for the purpose of laying the foundation for a non-racial and equitable society where all sectors of the population will prosper. The problem with this is the fact that all spheres of the economy are exposed to and are at the mercy of capitalists under the guise of a “free market”. With regard to the corporate sector, according to Terreblanche (2002: 422) it came under “the growing ideological and political influence of Anglo-Americanisation of not only the South African economy, but also the modern part of South African society”. Consequently, “the economic system changed from one of colonial and racial capitalism to a neo-liberal, first-world, capitalist enclave that is disengaging itself from a large part of the black labour force” (Terreblanche 2002: 422).

These capitalists have neither the will nor genuine interest to eradicate deep-seated issues of socioeconomic inequality and marginalisation in South Africa. For their benefit, according to Terreblanche, they have succeeded in “creating a new symbiotic relationship between the mainly white corporate elite and the black governing elite in which the former is very much the senior partner and the latter very much the junior and dependent partner” (Terreblanche 2002: 423). This coalition has facilitated the adoption of a neo-liberal agenda and has greatly
weakened all three spheres of government in pursuing a comprehensive agenda for socioeconomic and political transformation.

Simply put, by the mere fact that the local economy of the CoT for instance is a replica of the national and provincial economy in shape and policy focus, it will keep on reproducing inequality and marginalisation as is the case elsewhere in the country. This implies that the legacy of apartheid has hindered the integration of the peripheral sector into the mainstream of economic activity and has embraced the tendency to maintain a “capitalist white-controlled economic enclave in a sea of black poverty” (Terreblanche 2002: 427, see also Mhone 2000).

This has been the experience of the townships of S and H in northern regions of the CoT. As long as there is in place a new legislative framework entrenched in the neo-liberal and free market philosophy, local economies of these regions of the city have failed to integrate into the mainstream of economic activity of the city. A case in point is the automobile industry (i.e. BMW and Nissan) with plants in the southern parts of Region 1; these are first world factories which operate in isolation from the local economy of Region 1. Since these factories no longer use labour intensive technology (perhaps for the purpose of maximising profit and adopting modern technology for efficiency), this industry fails to assist in eradicating unemployment in that region in any substantial manner. Therefore, this industry has remained an enclave in the sea of black poverty in Region 1.

The foregoing has shown that the economy of the post-apartheid CoT is being influenced by the neo-liberal and free market philosophy that the South African government adopted since 1994. As a result, this economy is falling to uproot and eradicate the legacy of apartheid. Instead, it has created a symbiotic relationship which is failing to deal with socioeconomic inequalities in a decisive manner.

4.5. Current Features of the Local Economy of Tshwane

4.5.1 Broader policy background

Due to concerns that arose at the African National Congress (ANC) conference at Polokwane about the ineffectiveness of neo-liberal policies adopted by the South African government in eradicating inequality, “the masses of the people want development to be extended to them and to experience it where they are” (Dikeni 2012: 41). Also, given the fact that ordinary citizens are not sharing in the country’s wealth, all spheres of government in South Africa embraced the
concept of a Developmental State. Turok (2008 cited in Dikeni 2012: 42) explains the role of such a State which emerged at this ANC conference.

...Debating the role of the State in socio-economic development, the seminar highlighted the importance of provincial and local government and the need for appropriate capacity for planning and implementation. Rural development remains a major hurdle for the creation of a Development State: rural people have no “voice”, and a vision for rural areas is sorely needed. The discontinuity between first and second economy, which has its origins in the apartheid era, needs to be bridged and government programs need to be fast-tracked.

Although there was no clear articulation of the concept of this type of State at the said ANC conference, it was evident that provincial and local government and rural development should be key elements of this concept. The role of the State in socio-economic transformation is essential in this process. According to Levine (2008 cited in Dikeni 2012: 44),

The achievements of a Developmental State must ultimately be measured by their capacity to promote shared, sustainable employment-generating development and growth in an environment that respects and nurtures democracy and democratic institutions. In South Africa, the Development State must be measured against the legacy of apartheid, which entails immense material deprivation, racialised poverty, racial segregation, a huge unequal race-based division of land, wealth and income, and legalised, institutionalised, violent and systematic racial discrimination in all walks of life.

In other words, at a local government level such as the CoT, the local authority is the agent of development mandated to eradicate the legacy of apartheid. Further, Amtaika (2013: 106) says,

The sustainability of democracy depends on the levels of economic development of individuals in a society….Democratic principles should be utilized in nurturing appropriate political conditions and environments for socio-economic development, and equitable distribution of resources among individuals in society. Local governments are well positioned to play this role due to their proximity to the citizens.

This led the South African government to entrust LED to local government as in the case of the CoT. Rogerson has studied and researched LED policy and practice in South Africa since the birth of New South Africa in 1994. He states that “LED is a salient public policy issue in South Africa” (Rogerson 2011: 149) to ensure socio-economic development and equitable distribution of resources among individuals in society.

Of course, LED policy and practice have gone through a number of restructurings, adaptations and adjustments since 1994. In support of this point, I reference Nel and Rogerson (2005a)
who write; that under the 2000 Local Government Municipal Systems Act, several key LED functions and responsibilities were legislated, and Integrated Development Planning was made a compulsory activity for local governments. Central to these functions and responsibilities is making socio-economic development the goal of local government. This entails among other factors the efficient and effective rendering of services to citizens, and their commitment and participation in decision making (Amtaika 2013: 46 – 47). Further, under the directives of this Local Municipal Systems Act, “South African local authorities became the wardens of economic growth in their jurisdictions” (Toerien 2005: 1) as they have the mandate to meet the material needs as well as provide good and healthy standards of living for their communities. In short, they are responsible for “dispensing social justice equitably through the provision of basic services” (Amtaika 2013: 47). Yet, recent experiences in the CoT with service delivery protests in townships of S and H suggest that the city is failing in achieving its chief goal for LED, most probably because due processes are not followed.

Appropriate process in relation to LED practice is supposed to be bottom-up, contrary to what used to take place during apartheid and is still happening today (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6 & Chapter 7). This is supposed to be a deliberate and intentional move from the government with the aim of bringing government to the people and to fast track economic development in order to deal with economic inequality at grassroots. Means used to achieve this may include promotion of local economies; creating an environment conducive to investment and promotion of small and medium-sized enterprises for the poor. These methods are contained in the policy documents of the CoT such as the 2011 – 2016 IDP, but have had little impact on driving substantial socioeconomic transformation which benefits peripheral township economies such as those of S and H (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6 & Chapter 7).

LED was promoted and still is being, and has emerged as a central aspect of policy and planning for both urban and rural reconstruction (Nel and Humphreys 1999; Rogerson 2006a; Xuza 2007; Human et al. 2008). In addition, according to Rogerson (2000) the new emphasis accorded to LED promotion was inseparable from a need to accommodate the forces of globalisation in order to ensure South Africa’s re-entry into the global economy, making the country attractive to international investors and to enhance the role of the private sector. In South Africa’s leading cities, the mainstream LED practice has been dominated by market-led approaches that have been increasingly geared towards achieving competitiveness and
sustainable high economic growth rates (see Nel and Rogerson 2005a). Further, in order to facilitate this, the creation of a sound governance environment provides the essential starting point for undertaking such forms of LED practice (see Department of Cooperative Governance 2009).

The discussion above provides a broader policy background for the economy of the CoT as it currently stands. It is therefore necessary to note that the African CoT’s economy is “configured” to suit the global village’s imperatives while it attempts to meet local needs. This reinforces what I stated earlier, according to Rogerson (2006a); the restructuring plans of South Africa’s major centres highlight the issue of positioning the city in the global economy and of sectoral targeting to build, through targeted support, a competitive advantage in the international economy. This has had an impact on the “genetic” make-up of the local economy as reflected in the current Integrated Development Programme (IDP) of the city.

4.5.2. CoT and Smart City strategy

The current IDP (2011-2016) acknowledged that the CoT space economy has, for a long time, been propelled by the heavy industrial development in the areas of manufacturing. However, the Gauteng Employment, Growth and Development Strategy (GEGDS) indicated that the province should re-align the economic sector away from traditional heavy industry input markets and low value-added production towards sophisticated, high value-added production, such as information technology, telecommunications equipment, research and development and biomedical industries as well as the development of the finance and business service sector with specific emphasis on financial services and technology, auxiliary business services and technology, corporate head office location and business tourism. In short, this economic structural re-alignment concerns reducing dependency on the first (i.e. agriculture and mining) and second (i.e. heavy manufacturing) sectors and further developing the third sector of the economy which is a service industry. Because, as Rodrik\(^\text{105}\) (2008: 772) explains, high unemployment and low growth are both ultimately the result of the shrinkage of the non-mineral

\(^{105}\) Rodrik, D. 2008. Understanding South Africa’s economic puzzles. *Economics of Transition Volume 16(4) 2008, 769–797*. He says that econometric analysis identifies the decline in the relative profitability of manufacturing in the 1990s as the most important contributor to the lack of vitality in that sector.
tradable sector since the early-1990s. The weakness in particular of export-oriented manufacturing has deprived South Africa from growth opportunities that other countries (such as Malaysia) have been able to avail themselves of. Malaysia was able to pull an increasing share of its workforce into manufacturing (the sector with the highest labour productivity in the economy) while in South Africa manufacturing lost ground to the tertiary sector. This is most likely the reason the CoT has yielded to this call for re-alignment extended by the province by investing more and more resources in the tertiary sector in the areas of information technology, telecommunication, transportation, etc. As a result, the city lost its labour absorptive capacity because industries in the tertiary sector require specialised and professional skills which the majority of the people in the CoT, particularly those from S and H townships, simply do not possess.

Tshwane, with an economy of the size of R 233 billion,\textsuperscript{106} is a very important player in the province. In addition to being the national centre for research and learning with four universities and the headquarters of CSIR, also the National Research Fund and the Human Sciences Research Council, the CoT plays an important role in the economy of the Gauteng Province, featuring a strong manufacturing sector (particularly the automotive industry and metal production) and tertiary sector. In relation to LED, these large-scale manufacturing industries operating in a capitalistic neo-liberal framework provide relatively few employment opportunities to poor and low-skilled communities of the CoT. The reason for this being that technology has been modernised, making it far less labour intensive. However, some of these large-scale industries, such as BMW and Nissan situated near northern regions of the CoT where the proletariat\textsuperscript{107} live, are involved in social investment by means of community development projects. Yet, I observe that these projects are not carried out in a way which promotes the building of the local economy from within. Instead, they take the shape and nature of hand-outs, creating more dependency. Consequently, no real sharing of wealth and prosperity is taking place.

\textsuperscript{106} \url{www.sacities.net/workwith/tshwane} accessed on 2013/01/04
\textsuperscript{107} Proletariat means the class of people who do unskilled jobs in industry and own little or no property (see \url{http://www.oxforddictionary.com/} accessed on 24 November 2015)
The CoT registered remarkable economic performance as highlighted by its Gross Value Added (GVA) of R157 billion and GVA growth rate of 5.9% in 2007. The GVA has not changed significantly since 2008; despite the global economic recession it remained at 6% in the 2009/10 financial year\textsuperscript{108}. The automotive industry is a major factor in this growth rate.

Notwithstanding the importance of the automotive industry, the City has started to transform its economy in terms of the Smart City\textsuperscript{109} programme which is geared to creating sustainable economic development and high quality of life by excelling in multiple key areas. An initiative to support the said programme to the value of R4 million was implemented during 2009/10\textsuperscript{110}. The goal of this programme is to facilitate the implementation of projects that stimulate economic development. Of importance for the CoT are dwellings, shopping spaces, Bus Rapid Transport, ICT, health facility upgrades, revitalisation of township economy and a safer environment.

4.5.2.1. Dwelling houses and shopping space

In line with the above, the CoT took the lead in recording the highest value amongst metros in general for building plans passed for 2009, contributing 38.1% to the total of R27 185.2 million reported for Gauteng. The largest contributions for residential building plans passed were recorded for dwelling-houses (25, 8%) and flats and townhouses\textsuperscript{111} (8, 3%). In relation to S and H, the bulk of dwelling houses are social housing known as “RDP houses” built for the poor in the new sections of these townships (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6).

The largest contributors as regards non-residential building plans passed were recorded for shopping space (11, 4% of 1 million of the total value of such plans), industrial and warehouse space (9, 6%) and office and banking space (8, 1%) in Gauteng. In comparison with other cities in Gauteng, CoT was one of the main contributors to shopping space (R2 366, 9 million). This is evident in Region 1 (Soshanguve) and Region 2 (Hammanskraal) of the CoT where about five

\textsuperscript{108} See Draft Report 2009/10 of the CoT.
\textsuperscript{109} Smart City: is a developed urban area that creates sustainable economic development and a high quality of life by excelling in multiple key areas: economy, mobility, environment, people, living, and government. This can be done through strong human capital, social capital, and/or ICT infrastructure (Read more: http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/smart-city.html#ixzz3S5LBNd accessed 18 February 2015)
\textsuperscript{110} See Draft Annual Report 2009/10 of the CoT.
\textsuperscript{111} See http://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/P50413/P504132009.pdf. accessed on 2013/01/04.
and three shopping malls were built in 2012 - 2014 respectively (see also narrative accounts in Chapter 6).

4.5.2.2. Bus Rapid Transport (BRT)

Considering that the road network for Gauteng’s city regions has to cope with an annual traffic increase rate of 7% (City of Tshwane 2014: 26), with 1.8 million new motorists and thousands of new vehicles registered every year\textsuperscript{112}, more drivers mean more cars so that more congestion ultimately affects the quality of life of residents negatively; hence the CoT has made a commitment through the Tshwane Bus Rapid Transport system to help accommodate the masses and the implementation of a transport plan by the City (City of Tshwane 2014: 26 – 27).

BRT is designed to integrate walking and cycling and to minimise the roadway traffic impact on the productivity of government and business in the city. It is also intended to reduce the amounts of time and money that commuters spend travelling to and from work. According to Statistics South Africa (2007), the 2005/2006 Household Income and Expenditure survey shows that transport was second only to expenses related to basic needs such as housing, food, electricity and water for most families. In the same vein, Dimitrov (2010: 728)’s research (based on six townships of Tshwane including Soshanguve) on “the effects of social exclusion and transport costs in South Africa” finds,

Participants described transport as very expensive relative to their income. A single journey from areas such as Soshanguve is between R16 to R20 for an average trip to central Pretoria. Worse still, the cost of transport has to be juggled with other household bills and child care if you are in work. For the unemployed it is difficult to afford to search for work or to send their children to school. Those on social grants described these as so inadequate that they cannot afford to eat properly.

Therefore, the BRT intention to reduce costs and time of transport is commendable and has certainly brought relief in the life of the poor who live in the city and rely on public transport. But for poorer people of S and H who already suffer multi-dimensional exclusion (i.e. geographically, socially and economically) their plight remains the same because this service is not extended to

\textsuperscript{112} National Association of Automobile Manufacturers of South Africa highlighted for example that total number of cars sold for January to April 2015 was 204 471 (\url{http://www.naamsa.co.za/flash/total.html} accessed 4th May 2016)
them in any meaningful way. As a result, BRT will contribute substantially to the economy of the city centre and suburbia but less so for peripheral areas such as S and H. This will further perpetuate the tale of two cities. Thus, in order to cause BRT to benefit the local economy of townships, it is advisable for instance that the bus route of 13 km long which extends from Akasia, via Doreen Road past Rosslyn and terminating at Kopanong Metrorail Station in Soshanguve, be extended further to populous areas of Soshanguve. In this way, it will benefit more underprivileged communities.

4.5.2.3. Information and Communication Technology

The City of Tshwane (2014: 6) states: “In partnership with Project Isizwe, the CoT provides free Wi-Fi in open public spaces and more than 200 previously disadvantaged schools”. In these public spaces and schools, community members are now able to surf the internet at no cost. Wi-Fi was launched in November 2013, benefiting users including the Tshwane University of Technology’ Soshanguve campus, the University of Pretoria’s main campus in Hatfield, Tshwane North College in Arcadia, Church Square in the inner city, Mamelodi community hall and Setlalentoa High School in Ga-Rankuwa. There are least 1 million learners in approximately 213 schools in Soshanguve, Mamelodi and Atteridgeville who are being provided with free Wi-Fi in Tshwane. Further roll-outs are being envisaged to cover clinics, more schools, parks, sport clubs and other public spaces with the aim of servicing at least 3 million users by 2015. Councillor Ramokgopa, as Executive Mayor of the CoT, declares “the roll-out is part of the City’s plan to embrace digital technology, with a core focus to harness the power of internet for education, economic development and social inclusion” (City of Tshwane 2014: 7).

113 The inception phase runs from Nana Sita Street, past University Road to the suburbs of Arcadia and Hatfield, looping back to University Road. Once, the simultaneous construction of lines 1 and 2 are completed, Line 1 would run from the central business district (CBD) to Rainbow Junction and on to Kopanong, with line 2 to split from the inception phase at Jorissen Street, moving into Lynnwood Road, the Atterbury area and on to Mamelodi. The project was due to employ 11 000 people at the height of construction. Ridership for the inception phase was likely to ramp up to around 10 000 passengers a day... while the entire system was expected to carry around 127 000 people a day upon completion. (http://www.polity.org.za/article/tshwane-metro-unveils-first-station-in-its-a-re-yeng-bus-rapid-system-2013-03-19 accessed 18 February 2015).

114 http://www.areyengtshwane.co.za/SitePages/Project%20Timelines.aspx accessed 20 February 2015
4.5.2.4. Health care

According to the Gauteng Department of Health\textsuperscript{115}, there are 67 medical clinics in Tshwane, of which 9 are in the Hammanskraal area: Dilopye, Eersterust, Kekanastad, Ramotse, Refentse, Suurman, Temba including Jubilee Hospital and Kekana Gardens Mobile and 9 in Soshanguve area: Block JJ, Block P, Block X, Maria Ranho in Block L, Soshanguve 2, Boikutsong, Block TT, Soshanguve Community Health Centre and Soshanguve Mobile).

Additionally, of importance, according to the CoT’s 2011 – 2016 IDP (2011: 77) with regard to H and S, is the upgrade that was carried out on some clinics such as Majaneng and Dilopye in Hammanskraal and Motobatse clinic in Soshanguve to meet the growing health demand in those townships. The CoT has also built new clinics at Block P and Block JJ in Soshanguve.

Further, advanced medical care referrals from these clinics in S and H are provided for by hospitals\textsuperscript{116} i.e. Dr George Mukhari Academic Hospital in GaRankuwa, the Steve Biko Academic Hospital in Pretoria and Kalafong Hospital in Pretoria West. There are also District hospitals such as Pretoria West, Jubilee Hospital (Hammanskraal), Odi Hospital (Odi settlement near Mabopane) and Tshwane District Hospital. Dental health care for communities of S and H is supplied by Medunsa (now Sefako Makgatho Health Sciences University) and Pretoria Hospitals. Specialised mental health rehabilitation for communities of S and H is furnished by Weskoppies (Pretoria West), Tshwane Rehabilitation Centre (Pretoria) and Cullinan Rehabilitation Centre.

With reference to providing dedicated, specialised and integrated HIV & AIDS prevention and treatment, the CoT contains about 272 medical facilities\textsuperscript{117} including contracted private doctors. These facilities provide male circumcision, tuberculosis screening and treatment and anti-retroviral treatment in the CoT of which 3 and 2 facilities are situated in S and H respectively.

While it is commendable to see that the townships of S and H have public primary health care (clinics), secondary health care (district hospitals) and tertiary health care facilities (regional and academic hospitals) not too distant, relatively speaking, this does not guarantee access to good health care. Access to a secondary health care facility usually takes at least four weeks while

\textsuperscript{116} see http://www.health.gpg.gov.za/Pages/Hospital.aspx accessed 23 February 2015
\textsuperscript{117} http://www.healthsites.org.za/clinics/gauteng/city-tshwane/soshanguve.html accessed 23 February 2015
access to a tertiary health care facility for advanced care can take three to six months or even more. These hospitals are notably crowded since they serve the needs of poor and underprivileged township communities, many of whose members are children, women, the elderly and the unemployed. Worse still, public health care facilities are prone to experience medicine shortages which increases the likelihood of a patient dying in a hospital bed due to lack of treatment. In addition, these already impoverished persons have the burden of finding transport means to reach the hospitals. At Soshanguve in particular, Mahlangu\textsuperscript{118} of the South African Health News Service reports that communities are fortunate to have benefited from a private hospital (Bothsilu Private Hospital) since October 2014 (see also the narrative findings in Chapter 6).

4.5.2.5. Revitalization of township economy\textsuperscript{119}

Since July 2014, the Provincial, and the City’s, authorities have embarked on a campaign geared to revitalise the township economy in townships of Gauteng. They met with communities of Soshanguve on 21 July 2014. City of Tshwane (2014: 18) explains that the campaign aimed: 1) to generate ideas on how small businesses could create jobs for unemployed people, generate wealth and bring about improved quality of life in townships, and 2) to inspire and contribute to a mind-set change amongst people residing in townships. There is an urgent need to develop strategies that focus on value-add industries in the townships. This may include up-scaling of home industries and prioritising funding.

Furthermore, Ramokgopa (City of Tshwane 2014: 19) outlined the steps that the CoT has taken to boost local business. These include: 1) tackling the problem of nyaope (which he perceives as a manifestation of a broader economic problem), 2) mall developments (while they are welcome, these are destroying small businesses), 3) giving out title deeds to shops that have been leasing from the city for generations and 4) rejuvenating vacant industrial sites and making them available to small businesses. Furthermore, Ramokgopa (City of Tshwane 2014: 19) calls on people of townships to do the following: 1) sell things that they produce (there are thousands

\textsuperscript{118} http://www.health-e.org.za/2013/08/26/new-private-hospital-soshanguve/ accessed 23 February 2015
\textsuperscript{119} According to Lebogang Maile (Gauteng Member of Executive Council (MEC) for Economic Development), a township economy refers to all township activities by community-based enterprises aimed at meeting the needs of the township residents. They range from street vending, taverns, minibuses, spaza shops, burial societies, stokvels, hair salons, plumbing, panel-beating, home-based care, including activities such as cooking, shopping, child-minding to taking care of the sick and the aged (City of Tshwane 2014: 18).
of ways to produce new quality items that meet the needs of communities i.e. bread, milk, toilet paper, and furniture), 2) mobilise township buying power to improve incomes and investment in productive activities (the township economy must be built on the strength of township communities whose collective buying power runs into billions of rand and includes, for instance, money in burial societies, stokvels, workers' funds, such as pensions and social grants) and 3) organise and cooperate to boost the township economy (better organised, different community-based businesses, cooperatives and other businesses in townships to collaborate economically among themselves).

The thought of revitalising the township economy is praiseworthy because it suggests building the local economy of townships from the inside-out by recognising and mobilising local economic assets present in these townships. Yet, unless the causes of socioeconomic, political and historic imbalances are radically addressed, township economy stands very little chance to succeed in the global economy. Evidence of this is the paralysed industrial sites of GaRankuwa, Soshanguve and Babelegi (Hammanskraal) which were “squeezed” out of business when South Africa adopted the growth-focused policies of the neo-liberal capitalist and free market system.

4.5.2.6. Safer environment

As is the case with other metropolitan cities in the country the CoT regularly enforces by-laws in order to keep the city safe. According to the City of Tshwane (2014: 24-25) since August 2012, through “Operation I Can”, the authorities have carried out clean-up campaigns in some city suburbs such as Sunnyside, the city centre, Hatfield and Arcadia and targeted areas of townships. This project is an interdepartmental (including Police Service, Home Affairs, Sunnyside Cluster and Liquor Officers) intervention which focusses on arresting illegal immigrants, the removal of illegal advertising, illegal structures on Council-owned road reserves, illegal and informal trade activities, illegal public and private transport activities, illegal electricity connections, water use and spillage and the illegal occupation of Council-owned properties. Also attended to are broken streetlights, traffic lights, damaged street signage and potholes and overall cleaning of the area. As a result, in these areas of the city, “crime has been reduced, and businesses operating illegally and municipal buildings that were turned into homesteads have been closed. Street lights were fixed, illegal advertising posters were removed, Closed Circuit
Television Cameras were reinstalled, illegal electrical connections were disconnected and removed and illegal restaurants were closed” (City of Tshwane 2014: 25).

While a safer environment promotes the wellbeing of citizens in the city, some of the above actions such as removal of informal street traders proved to be detrimental to the survival of unemployed people from townships such as S and H who depend on this for their livelihood. Moreover, although through these clean-up campaigns the city centre and surroundings were made safer, criminal elements resorted to targeting the township working class who live in townships (see narrative findings in Chapter 6). It is therefore inconsistent to provide a safer environment in the city centre and surroundings while neglecting the peripheral townships such as S and H as the CoT has done. The problem with this is that deprived people who are the majority of the residents of these townships, are confronted by ongoing reality of becoming poorer. They are furthermore more vulnerable to crime than the “suburbs” and the “Pretoria” part of Tshwane as confirmed by the narrative accounts detailed in Chapter 6. Historically, there are more crimes in these areas than in ‘wealthier suburbs’. As we shall see, narrative accounts in Chapter 6 link this criminality to poverty and desperation and this further perpetuates the tale of two cities.

From the above, it is worth noting that the pillars used in the CoT’ Smart City strategy point towards a positive contribution to the economic development of the city. This mainly applies to the structured economy of the city centre and the southern and eastern regions of the city. While the city has benefited and will continue to do so in terms of revenues and become wealthier, I doubt whether townships such as S and H will benefit a great deal from these ventures if the economy continues on its present trajectory. It is also necessary to note the efforts of the city to facilitate the building of malls, residential, corporate offices, upgrade health facilities and facilitate access to Wi-Fi and the like, in townships of S and H. But I still contend that the peripheral communities such as S and H have not yet benefited in a meaningful way from this wealth. The reality is that there is a scarcity of economic opportunities for the majority of township residents. The unemployed are found everywhere in the communities, yet there are no viable endeavours by the CoT to create sustainable employment opportunities. Given the fact that, as stated in Chapter 3, the dominant economic system in the city is anthropocentric and remains focussed on pursuing economic growth, the economic imbalances remain a reality
in townships. Therefore, I argue once again that economic development activity should aim to make both human and nonhuman beings share the prosperity and wealth of the oikos. Local people for instance may benefit more from, e.g., greening of the city initiatives – tree planting in open spaces and developing of parks; development of food gardens in communal or city owned areas; developing of small scale farming – through factors such as enhancing individual households’ ability to cope with drought and global climate change by equipping houses with water harvesting tanks, planting trees, etcetera. These pointers towards a local green economy will require some investment but may then not be too expensive, and will complement the big capital investments made by the city.

Regardless of the fact that evidence of expansion in the number of new shopping malls and dwelling houses is apparent in the north east and north west of the CoT, the current employment status and household income show that there are far too many people who are unemployed and have no income for survival, despite these households possessing houses.

The few who are benefiting, such as students and learners (who have access to Wi-Fi at Tshwane University of Technology Soshanguve campus and at schools), township residents who work in the city and have access to BRT, township residents who work in a safer environment in the city etcetera are but a tiny minority in comparison. Of course, this minority who benefit only contribute indirectly to the local economies of S and H.

4.5.3. Key economic information

4.5.3.1. Employment and unemployment situation

With regard to employment, according to the Statistics South Africa\textsuperscript{120} report there are 1,079,273 people employed, 345,356 unemployed, 64,095 discouraged work seekers and 612,750 not economically active.

4.5.3.2. Income

Fourteen percent of the population have no income. 2% of the population record an income per year in the range of R1 – R 4,800 4.2% have an income of R4, 801 – R9, 600 per annum; 10.6% report an income of R9, 601 – R19, 600 per year; 15.5% have an income of R19, 601 –

\textsuperscript{120} \url{http://statssa.gov.za/?page.jd=1021&id=city-of-tshwane-municipality}. Accessed 29 October 2013
R38, 200; 13.3% one of R38, 201 – R76, 400; 11.3% an income of R76, 401 – R153, 800; 11.3% an income of R153, 801 – R307, 600; 9.3% an income of R307, 601 – R614, 400; 4.5% record an income of R614, 401 – R1, 228,800; 1.2% an income of R1, 228,801 – R2, 457,600 (Statistics South Africa 2011).

The high unemployment rate and unequal distribution of income reflected above provide both opportunities and challenges for mission work focussed on LED. Within the framework of the economic biblical paradigm presented in Chapter 3; I argued that distributive justice, equity and generous care of the weak and poor have to be applied in order to bring remedy to this inequality. These figures also point out to some extent that on their own the intervening mechanisms of government such taxation and the like cannot significantly reverse inequality in the CoT, thus leading to the central argument of this research: that the church in the periphery (township) has to reposition herself in such a way which as to mobilise her assets for the purpose of LED in the CoT in general and specifically in S and H. The assets to be mobilised include everything which could be used to maximise LED opportunities in the city (S & H). For example, the church could open its facilities to communities for economic empowerment. It might also mobilise skilled volunteers from its membership, scattered across spheres of influence in society, to assist in empowering the poor to identify economic opportunities in their locality. The church could embrace and implement the green local development I have suggested in the section above. This is in keeping with the central concept of the thesis that locally based economic development is more likely to be successful, as pointed out earlier on.

Thus it is vital to understand the powers and systems of the city in order to imagine possibilities which benefit LED.

4.6. Political and Administrative powers and systems

As stated previously, in 1902 Pretoria was granted municipal status (Friedman 1994: 45). Administrative and political powers and systems evolved simultaneously with increased roles and functions of the city as the seat of government and an important poor white component (Friedman 1994: 104). Practically this meant that municipal jobs and any other significant jobs in the Pretoria jurisdiction were, until 1980s, reserved for white South Africans and their interests.

After 1994, as soon as the apartheid system and all its laws and regulations which created the twin city of white and black were abolished, all spheres of government went through social, political and structural transformation as mandated by the constitution of the New South Africa.
In 1999, further transformation was effected when the city became one of the six megacities of South Africa. The powers, functions and systems were further overhauled including a name change – it is as if the city went through a rebirth. According to the Constitution of South Africa, 1996 (Act 108 of 1996), a municipality must structure and manage its administrative, budgeting and planning processes to accord priority to the basic needs of the community, and to promote the social and economic development of the latter. Tshwane and other metropolitan cities in the country were established following the directives of this Act; yet each city still has to set its priorities.

With the backlog of services and conditions of previously disadvantaged communities in the greater Tshwane in mind, the CoT’s new strategic objectives include: 1) to provide basic services, roads and storm water, 2) to encourage economic growth and development and job creation, 3) develop sustainable communities with clean, healthy and safe environments and integrated social services, 4) foster participative democracy and *Batho Pele* (meaning people first), 5) promotion of sound governance, 6) ensuring financial sustainability and 7) seeing to organisational development and transformation (see CoT 2011-2016 IDP).

Its powers and functions comprise: 1) city planning, 2) building roads and storm water, 3) water and sanitation, 4) electricity, 5) agriculture and environmental management, 6) health and social development, 7) sports and recreation, arts and culture, 8) housing and sustainable human settlements, 9) community safety, 10) disaster management / fire and rescue services, 11) economic development and 12) Information and communication technology and customer care (see CoT 2011-2016 IDP).

From the vantage point of these strategic visions of powers and functions, it is apparent that the new democratic government, through the CoT, has worthy intentions about reversing the injustices of the past in order to build an inclusive metropolitan city. While tangible development and transformation achievements (such as freedom of choice, association, speech and movement, implementation of Affirmative Action policies, non-racist public service, infrastructure development, and so forth) can be observed in many spheres of the CoT including in pockets in the north-west and north-east areas of the city, yet much still has to be done for these areas to be on a par with the east and south areas of the city. Also, considering the reality of the many service delivery problems experienced in the past few years, especially in townships, the mood of communities is not at all positive, specifically about service delivery. The narrative accounts in Chapter 6 of this research highlight the fact that communities of Hammanskraal, for example,
go without water for days. The mono-phase electricity supplied in the area is not powerful enough; as a result small businesses suffer losses. The quality of infrastructure delivered is another issue of concern and discontentment in communities. Further, the nepotism, abuse and corruption surrounding government tenders in relation to the Public Works Extended Programme which creates temporary employment for communities are other issues of great discontent (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6). In short, the transformation agenda is compromised.

Under the leadership of the Executive Mayor, the council is mandated to oversee the implementation of these objectives and of transformation. The council consists of 210 councillors\textsuperscript{121}, 105 of whom are ward councillors and 105 of whom are proportional representative councillors. The members of the mayoral committee, who provide political leadership, also form part of the council.

With reference to political leadership structures; the city is governed by an Executive Mayoral Committee (Mayco) system which reports to the Municipal Council and whose duties and responsibilities are defined as being to ensure proper decision making and allocation of funds. The Council must adhere to the Protocol of Corporate Governance in the Public Sector (1997) and a host of relevant directive legislation (CoT 2011 – 2016 IDP 2011: 23). Furthermore, the following decision making structures exist within the various Councils:

- Municipal Council
- Executive Mayor and Mayoral Committee
- Portfolio Committees, including Section 80 Committees and Section 79 Committees
- Officials with delegated powers.

However, these authorities now function in a much more complex environment than that of their predecessors. Simone (2005: 5) sums up this point:

(...) new local authorities are overwhelmed by the degree of technical frameworks to which they must adhere. Even those frameworks require a broad range of community consultations as part of integrated development planning; there are few resources and capacities, and little willingness,
to engage in the kinds of broad based interactions that might generate both a more comprehensive knowledge of local realities and an ability to work in collaboration.

The point made by Simone ties in with my first-hand experience of my interaction with local authorities in Hammanskraal; I sensed that there is little willingness to engage in broad-based strategic interventions that could generate both a comprehensive knowledge of local realities and an ability to work in collaboration with community institutions such as the township churches. This has led local authorities to focus on narrow and disconnected development project which target basic human needs but go no further. As a result many community members have stopped being actively engaged in community consultation meetings under because of the suspicion that local authorities are not open enough to embrace the community development agenda (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6). However, the fact remains that a large numbers of urban residents in the CoT no longer have access to either “traditional” or modern” modalities of social reproduction. As has been emphasised, the church is one of the key institutions which may have the ability to facilitate a process whereby a sense of belonging emerges and to establish a place where economic opportunities and dreams are realised in the CoT. Hence this research regards the church as a vital asset towards LED in the CoT.

With reference to the administrative structures, the city is led by a city or municipal manager assisted by departmental heads. According to the CoT 2011 – 2016 IDP (2011: 25) the municipality consists of the following departments:

- Finance
- City planning and economic development
- Public works and infrastructure development
- Social development
- Agriculture and environmental management
- Housing and human settlements
- Transport and roads
- Corporate and shared services
- Sport, recreation, arts and culture
- Community safety.

Each one of these departments is overseen by a Strategic Executive Director.

This administration is sub-structured into regions for the purpose of service delivery and monitoring of implementation. The CoT contains 5 regions in total, excluding 3 regions of the Kungwini Local Municipality, but for the purpose of this research I have made reference to just two regions i.e. Region 1 (where Soshanguve Township is located) and Region 2 (where Hammanskraal area is located) (see CoT 2011 – 2016 IDP (2011: 26)). Each region has a regional office and is managed by a Regional Executive Director. The Regions are also in the process of establishing formal structures for consultation and interaction with ward councillors, ward committees and stakeholders, such as city improvement districts; tertiary institutions; business and government and with churches.

For the purpose of this study, I consider that in terms of engaging powers and systems the regional managers and structures are the most accessible structure with which the churches can engage. Furthermore, in terms of a representative of the local government, the local ward councillor is the closest individual that the church has to contend with. I also argue that the township churches of S & H have, first, through critical engagement with governance powers and systems to come to an understanding on how the exercise of power affects them and their ministries. Secondly, they need to understand the broad framework of dynamics of the CoT, how it is developing and where it is going in terms of LED. Thirdly, once understanding is gained, the township churches of S & H are to position themselves in becoming sources of power or becoming assets that affect the lives of communities and people in a transformative way. Narrative accounts of research findings in Chapters 6 and 7 will point out in laypersons' terms how these churches could play strategic roles in the process of LED in the communities.

Once again, the oikos concept provides insights for a church's critical engagement with governance powers and systems so that contributions from a biblical economic paradigm could be integrated in the development of LED in the city. It is also worth noting that there are other changes that have occurred in the CoT which I have not discussed in great detail. These include:

1) The fact that black cities of S & H have not necessarily changed at all in terms of racial make-up. Yet, there has been a flight of young black middle class people to the suburbia; this has weakened the potential leadership in the townships and that of LED.
2) As stated earlier, there have been dramatic demographic changes in that S & H townships have become catchments for the large numbers of people relocating in the CoT. These changes have certainly brought about major social changes in these communities. This is the case with immigrants who are found in these townships.

3) Townships’ life and culture remain different to those of the suburbia, even in post-apartheid South Africa.

The township churches engaged in LED will have to take all these changes into consideration.

4.7. Conclusion of Chapter 4

The CoT has developed from a pre-industrial area with an almost rural past to a modern city in some of its parts. The urbanisation and city development process was uneven, which led to the creation of a twin-city: one part developed and the other underdeveloped. The phenomenon of a twin-city is still a reality in some ways. The new CoT is increasingly dealing with the inequalities it inherited and forging a way towards rebuilding the city as an integrated community. Current governance powers and systems need to be restructured in a way that should promote an integrated development of the city and racial integration.

In this chapter I have shown that the socioeconomic, political, historical and physical context of the city provides us with both opportunities and challenges for the city, particularly for S and H. The opportunities have to be maximised while challenges; even those emanating from the segregated racial past; must be systematically addressed so that all communities of Tshwane, especially townships of S and H that lag behind, will prosper. In this research, the church in these townships is considered as an asset towards LED in Tshwane.

In the next chapter, I discuss a perspective on the church in Tshwane (S & H) in relation to LED.
Chapter five

A PERSPECTIVE ON THE CHURCH IN SOSHANGUVE AND HAMMANSKRAAL IN RELATION TO LED

5.1 Introduction

Having described the contextual background in Chapter 4, this chapter tells a brief story of the township church from the perspectives of the six local churches: Bethel Revival Church (Block GG, Soshanguve), Body of Christ Ministry (Lepengville/ Hammanskraal), Hammanskraal Gospel Centre and its affiliates (Kanana / Hammanskraal), Evangelical Lutheran Church (1250 Block H, Soshanguve), Uniting Reformed Church (1107 Block H, Soshanguve) and Letlhabile Baptist Church (Refentse/ Hammanskraal) that took part in this research. This perspective is presented against the backdrop of the CoT being a tale of two cities (the one developed and resource-rich, the other less developed and under-resourced). Churches that participated in the research include three “daughter” churches that are the historical products of mainline, colonial missionary churches. They are: Uniting Reformed Church in South Africa (Soshanguve), Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa (Soshanguve) and Letlhabile Baptist church while the other three are independent African initiated, of a Charismatic/Pentecostal type. Two among these are connected to international networks such as Revival Centre International Network\textsuperscript{122} (i.e. Bethel Revival Centre), and Church of the Nations\textsuperscript{123} (i.e. Hammanskraal Gospel Centre).

In Chapter 1, I stated that churches on the periphery experience the economic imbalances in various negative ways. This was based firstly on my observations that many churches planted in struggling urban areas do not attain financial sustainability. Secondly, I have also observed that with the exception of a few, most of these churches’ members are poor and unemployed, so that their numerical growth does not translate into financial viability, resulting in ultimately being dependent on outside assistance for their survival. Thirdly, I have also observed that these churches can achieve self-governing status and some degree of self-propagation, but are hardly self-sustaining as I pointed out above. Lastly, since South Africans, as it is with the other Africans, are migrating to the city at an increasing rate it is most likely that churches in

\textsuperscript{122} http://www.revivalcentral.com/Affiliates.html
\textsuperscript{123} http://cotn.org/
Peripheral urban areas are growing rapidly in numbers. These churches will require economic engines to sustain them.

For these reasons and for "fit-for-purpose" logic, this chapter presents a perspective on the church's presence in Tshwane (S & H) in terms of its “situatedness” within communities and its ethos of service. With regard to situatedness, ecclesiastical characteristics, faith and culture, power / weaknesses and blind spots of the churches (both mainline and African Initiated Churches) have been highlighted. With reference to their ethos of service, contemporary relevance, if at all, and characteristics of churches and their potential for community building are discussed. In order to gather information related to churches’ mission orientations and praxes, a grid provided by Kritzinger (2008) was followed; questions pertaining to agency, contextual understanding, ecclesial scrutiny, interpreting the tradition, discernment for action, reflexivity and spirituality were put to church leaders. The purpose was to establish, albeit generally, the types of ecclesia one finds in S and H in such a way that its assets and resources are appraised as stipulated in the hypothesis. That is, the church can be re-positioned or re-discovered as an asset which can be used to form strong community structures in local communities, which can again be used as a basis for community development and LED.

Before proceeding to furnish the current perspective on the church situatedness in Tshwane, it was deemed necessary to provide a brief and general historical background of the church in South Africa with particular reference to Tshwane (S & H).

5.2 A general historical background of the church in South Africa

According to Mark Shaw (2006: 520 – 525), the history of Christianity in South Africa was dominated by the divided white expatriates from the very earliest days.

This led to the emergence of three distinct expressions of Christianity in the nineteenth century. The first expression was the Afrikaner Christianity and the Dutch Reformed Church. A second expression of South African Church life in nineteenth century was that of “missionary Christianity” .... A third expression of South African Christianity was that of the social gospel championed by people like the Anglican bishop John Colenso and John Jabavu. The third expression would become a major force in the years following South Africa’s Sharpeville Massacre in 1960 (Shaw 2006: 523).
In more or less the same vein, Kevin Roy (2000) tells the story of the church in South Africa as three periods i.e. the Dutch Period, the British Period and the Modern Period. In order to understand the development of this history of the church, it is worth noting, according to David Chidester (1992), that during nineteenth century colonialism, conquest and commerce were intertwined with an aggressive Christian mission to Southern Africa. However, as he states,

Christian involvement in the region can be traced back to the visits of the Portuguese explorer Bartholomew Dias in 1488. A more permanent Christian presence began with the establishment of a refreshment station by the Dutch East India Company at the Cape in 1652 and the Company rule over the Cape Colony until 1795. (Chidester 1992: 35)

Roy and Kruger make the same point as Chidester: that 1652 marked the beginning of the Dutch period. In the “first 150 years of this period the Dutch Reformed Church (the only church permitted in the Cape) increased from one congregation to seven” (Roy 2000: 10, cf. Kruger 2003: 127). Regardless of slow progress, Roy further explains:

The faith spread from the Dutch speaking community to a few of the indigenous Khoikhoi people, some of the slaves who had been imported to the Cape, and to most of those mixed parentage (who were to become the so-called coloured community). (…) Towards the latter part of this first period, the Moravian and Lutheran churches laid their first foundations, not without some resistance from the Dutch civil and ecclesiastical authorities. (Roy 2000: 10)

The British period (1800 – 1910) started towards the end of the eighteenth century when the British took control of the Cape during the Napoleonic wars. During the following century the British were to extend their control from the Cape to cover the whole area that is known as South Africa today (Roy 2000: 11).

Significant immigration throughout this period resulted in the planting of virtually all the denominations existing in Britain at that time: Anglicans, Methodists, Roman Catholics, Presbyterians, Congregationalists, and Baptists, together with some small bodies (…).

It is not surprising, then, that during the nineteenth century many missionary societies entered South Africa with the aim of gathering converts from the indigenous African peoples. These included the London Missionary Society, the Moravians, the Wesleyan Missionary Society, the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions and various Lutheran and Reformed missionary societies. Missionaries from Britain, America, Germany, France, Switzerland, Norway, Sweden and other parts of the world all converged on South Africa (…) Catholic missionaries,
too, from many lands came to South Africa to extend their church. All took advantage of the fairly liberal policy of the British administration governing such activities (…).

As a result of considerable immigration and missionary work during the nineteenth century, the church saw significant growth, both in numbers and the complexity of its makeup. In addition to the original Dutch Reformed Church (virtually the sole representative of Christianity for more than a century) there were now also Anglicans, Methodists, Congregationalists, Presbyterians, Baptists, Lutherans, Roman Catholics, as well as smaller groups such as Quakers and the Salvation Army. Further divisions, resulting in two Anglican churches, three Dutch Reformed churches, several Lutheran churches etc. complicated the ecclesiastical scene even more. But that was not all. Conflict and tensions between the indigenous African people and the politically and economically dominant white people inevitably affected church relations. The closing decades of the nineteenth century saw groups of African Christians separating from mission established and controlled churches to form African initiated churches wholly controlled by Africans. This small trickle was to become a mighty flood in the twentieth century (Roy 2000: 11-12).

Chidester adds that the expansion of Christian missions was “obviously an international enterprise, but it was the British blend of political, commercial, and religious interests that established the framework for Christian missions and conversions (Chidester 1992: 36). Undeniably, most of the mainline churches carry a western heritage, yet they have remained fragmented.

Despite the fragmented witness to the kingdom of God by South African Christianity, this region entered the twentieth century as one of the most Christianised regions in all Africa. Yet, white domination of the church would eventually spawn a vigorous movement of “Ethiopianism” – separatist churches that demanded respect from the Westerner and a greater share of church leadership (Shaw 2006: 523).

What Roy refers to as the Modern period stretches from 1910 – 1994. He sees the historical 1994 democratic elections as the dividing line which marked the transition from white minority rule (bringing to a close more than three centuries of white ascendency) to black majority rule (Roy 2000: 12).

This period has seen the most extraordinary growth and diversification of the church in all its history. Four significant factors can be singled out as having had a profound impact on the development of modern South African Christianity: (1) the Pentecostal movement and the
ongoing Charismatic movements following it (2) the rapid growth of the African instituted churches (3) the ecumenical movement, touching most of the mainline churches and (4) the growing struggle for equal social and political rights for all people. (Roy 2000: 12)

This research has engaged with S and H churches in Tshwane after 1994. Based on the foregoing, this research concurs that the churches in S and H are today still diversified, and some are still deeply rooted in the culture of their European forefathers. Details about the development of the church in Tshwane in terms of nature, identity and characteristics are discussed in the section below.

5.3 The Church in Tshwane: Nature, Identity and Characteristics

“Like many other South African towns, Pretoria started as a Reformed parish” (Kruger 2003: 129) in 1896. This happened in the 19th century, an era characterised by political, economic and religious conquests. Kruger adds that “much of the subsequent religious history of Pretoria can only be understood in the context of the peculiar intertwining of religion and politics during and after the Great Trek” (Kruger 2003: 29). The Great Trek, which saw Afrikaners leaving the Cape Colony in their thousands, took place between 1835 and 1854. He further adds, “in the religious history of most of nineteenth century Pretoria, the church as reconstituted in the Transvaal (commonly known as the Hervormde Kerk), played the dominant religious role. The roots of this church lie deep in Transvaal Voortrekker history” (Kruger 2003: 130). “In the Transvaal and Orange Free State, Dutch Reformed churches received support from the governments of the Boer Republics. Close alignments between church and state continued in the Union of South Africa, particularly between the Dutch Reformed Church and the National Party government that come to power in 1948” (Chidester 1992: xiv –xv). Christian affiliation was closely associated with state policies and development of the economy, specifically in Tshwane economic history. One of the roles the church played in relation to the pre-1900 economy was, in Tshwane as well as in the rest of the country, “to mould Africans into a useful and manageable labour force” (Terreblanche 2002: 219). Hence, religious development in Tshwane was subservient to creating a city which would initially serve the Voortrekkers’ own commercial, military and administrative interests as discussed in Chapter 3, point 3.3.1.1. As a result, a church of the white community in the city of Pretoria was bound to be a different church to that of the black community on the periphery of the city in terms of affiliation, resources, power and privileges.
Increases in Christian affiliation coincided with the dramatic structural changes in South African society that followed the discovery of diamonds in 1867 and gold in 1886. Exploiting those mineral resources, an emergent industrial capitalism demanded an exploitable supply of labour to serve white-controlled interests in mining, industry, and the new, expanding urban centres of South Africa. Christian churches were directly implicated in that process of social and economic change (Chidester 1992: 74).

However, the churches played an ambivalent role as further explained by Chidester.

First, for black Christians who had internalised the missionary ‘gospel of work’, the Protestant values of discipline, labour, and personal advancement provided one set of motivations for entering into wage labour in white-controlled farming, industry, mining, domestic service, or public service occupations. (...) Second, Christian churches operated in the city as one amongst a number of systems of social control designed to adapt black workers to the demands of urban life. A new type of urban mission emerged that was directed toward producing disciplined, obedient, and docile workers who would serve white-controlled economic interests. Although church pronouncements sometimes protested the harsh and inhumane exploitation of black workers, churches were more often aligned with capital interests in creating and controlling a stable supply of labour (Chidester 1992: 74 – 75).

With reference to Tshwane, I submit that this meant that missionary churches such as Dutch Reformed, Lutheran and others that worked among black African communities on the outskirts of the city focussed on evangelisation and on teaching morality. Yet, they did very little to address systemic injustices as described in Chapter 3. I therefore argue that the missionary agendas of these churches were subservient to the political agenda of the colonists. As a result, the “white” church in the city was privileged and the “black” church in the townships marginalised.

From the above, it suffices to say that up to the 1950s, the dominant church in Pretoria was the Dutch Reformed Church as was the case elsewhere in the country. Other Protestant churches from Europe also grew in number, riding on structural changes in South Africa society and industrial capitalism. However, these churches were closely aligned to the industrial capitalist imperatives and ended up serving white-controlled interests in all sectors of society. This “cooperation among religion, government and industrial capitalism was reinforced by the findings of the South African Native Affairs Commission (1903 – 5) that outlined racial and labour relations in the political dispensation” (Chidester 1992: 89), which point of view, the Methodist Church among others endorsed, as summed up in the following lines by Cochrane:
The Native is, we firmly believe, one of the best assets this country possesses.(…) We need him to assist us to develop its vast resources, and he will help us, if we allow him, to make it a country in which an ever-increasing number of Europeans will live in comfort (Cochrane 1987: 63, 114).

This is why, I argue, these churches failed in those years to develop an authentic mission agenda geared towards liberation and transformation. This legacy is still very present in many of the Protestant churches operating in the City of Tshwane (S and H). For example, up until the late 1990s white missionary churches such as the Baptists in Tshwane hand-picked black church leaders who, in their view were Baptistic and loyalist, to serve in various portfolios of church planting and development in and around Tshwane sponsored by the white churches. Although operational inputs were sought from black leaders, the agenda, strategy and resources were in the hands of the white churches. Consequently, most of these black Baptist churches planted with resources from the white Baptist churches developed a dependent attitude. This stance is detrimental to their involvement in LED in Tshwane (S and H) especially when one considers the patronising of the theology of these black Baptist churches in the townships.

Among the Protestant churches from Europe present in Tshwane, we can distinguish two types i.e. **churches speaking Afrikaans (previously Dutch) and English-speaking churches**. However, the distinction between English-speaking and Afrikaans-speaking churches is ironic in the contemporary South Africa as the growing numbers of South African Christians are people who speak African languages. For example, a Baptist church in Hammanskraal would function entirely in SeTswana, not in English, while a Uniting Reformed Church in Soshanguve would function in IsiZulu rather than in Afrikaans.

Churches that could be classified among Afrikaans-speaking churches in Tshwane are Dutch Reformed churches; English-speaking churches include the Roman Catholic Church, the Anglican Church, Methodist Church, the Congregationalist Church, the Presbyterian Church, the Baptists and Lutherans. Admittedly, these churches came to function alongside each other and contribute to a particular way of life (culture) in Tshwane. These Afrikaans and English speaking churches planted daughter churches all over South Africa. There are also Pentecostals, Independent Churches and African Initiated Churches that are accompanied by their own theologies and function in any language they choose to. With particular reference to the Uniting Reformed Church in South Africa, historically a daughter church of the Dutch Reformed Church, Tshaka argues that this church is not a typical black church. For him, “A black church is one
which insists in taking the lived experiences of black people seriously in theological reflection” (2015: 3). Tshaka’s argument speaks essentially about “the disconnect” which exists in many cases between the theology of this missionary daughter church and concrete black community realities wherever it is located in the country.

While I concur with Tshaka to some extent, I however consider that this situation is not unique to the Uniting Reformed Church in South Africa. I observed that black Baptist churches in membership with the Baptist Union of South Africa for example are still caught up in that situation. I struggled in 1990s to formulate an appropriate contextual theology for the church I pastored in Hammanskraal, north of Tshwane. I realised that the problem is rooted in theological formation and articulation of my faith community which is rooted in the British culture. Regardless of the fact that we could use vernacular languages in preaching and worship, we practiced our theology using westerners’ lenses and resources. This challenge is further discussed below.

5.4 Faith and Culture in relation to churches in Tshwane (S & H)

Building on the discourse of the previous sections and in keeping with South African apartheid past, it is apparent that the Church and faith in Pretoria evolved along language, customs, race and class lines, even if congregations were from the same denomination. These differences were often interpreted in religious terms under the general notions of “Christian civilization”. The Dutch Reformed Church separated out people it referred to as “heathens” (Chidester 1992: 90). Villa-Vicencio124 and Spoelstra125 affirm Chidester’s point in the confession of the “Dopper” church of 1860:

We did not learn in the Word of God that we had to allow them to share in the same social rights. Given the nations which surround us here, such a policy will lead to the political downfall of whites and the corruption of blacks. Thus we consider it imperative for both us and them that they keep their religion separate and that their spiritual needs be met in a special way (Spoelstra 1963: 61; see also Villa-Vicencio 1988: 27).

The view of the Dopper, all the Afrikaans Reformed Churches and especially the Dutch Reformed Church, played a significant role in the doctrine of Apartheid as it played itself out in

---


Tshwane. The churches of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal planted by European missionaries for example did not enjoy equality with their mother-churches in the suburbia of Tshwane. Their spiritual needs were met in a “special way” through mission outreaches. Even though, according to Kruger, a core of Africans who had longstanding exposure to Christianity settled in Pretoria from the very beginning, they were not allowed to become members of any one of the Reformed Churches (Kruger 2003: 157). They could only become members of the “daughter churches”. This meant in my experience\textsuperscript{126} that the daughter churches did not develop to a place where they are regarded as equals to the mother churches. As a result, there are still two streams in Tshwane among missionary churches, invisible in some cases, in any given denomination: one white and one black. The black stream is located in the townships and the white stream in the suburbia. I also noticed that the theologies of these two streams differ slightly in these denominations. This could be observed in different ways of worship in singing and dancing, prayer, fellowship, funerals and responding to community needs.

With particular reference to class, historically,

English-speaking churches were dependent for their support on mining capital and foreign funding from Britain. The Dutch Reformed Church, however, depended upon rural, agricultural capital, at least until the 1920s when it aligned itself with a new coalition under the political leadership of J.B Hertzog that linked farming capital, manufacturing capital, and white workers to assume greater national control over the economy.

Pressing black issues of the period – the dispossession of land, migrant labour, and endemic poverty – were not directly addressed by Protestant churches (Chidester 1992: 95).

Chidester echoes James Cochrane (1987:152) who describes the complicity of the churches in reinforcing the notion of classes when he refers to the words of Anglican Bishop Alan Gibson: “It may be God’s will that most of them should always remain labourers, herd men, domestic servants, and the like, and that only a few should come to the front” (Cochrane 1987: 152).

Certainly, Alan Gibson’s thinking was embedded in many colonial churches in the 19\textsuperscript{th} century. Some African Christians opposed such teachings and beliefs and started African Instituted (or

\textsuperscript{126} I was a church planter at Stinkwater from 1992 – 2002, where our work was referred to as “Stinkwater Baptist Mission”. This work was an outreach of Pretoria Central Baptist Church and was overseen by the chairperson of the Missions Council. Stinkwater Baptist Mission was not afforded the opportunity to engage as an equal to Pretoria Central Baptist Church.
Independent Churches. With reference to Tshwane, Mangena Mokone broke ties with the Methodist church to form a new African church – adopting the name Ethiopian Church in 1892. This, in my view, was more for the purpose of independence and autonomy in matters of faith. Indeed, “one of the very few areas where blacks could achieve independence from white control and dominance was church life” (Roy 2000: 99)

Kruger supplies the background to the resignation of Mokone from the Methodist church in Pretoria.

Amongst other things, Mokone objected to the fact that Africans in the ministry had an inferior status compared to their white colleagues: they had to work under the supervision of whites often much younger than themselves; they received a much lower salary than their white colleagues and no allowances; they were excluded from the district meeting (Kruger 2003: 159; see also Roy 2000: 102).

This kind of church split is a reality in the Church the world over, but South Africa has experienced this fragmentation of the Christian church to a peculiar degree. Roy (2000: 100) gives a list of possible historical reasons for so many blacks separating from white instituted churches:

1. The relatively large immigration of Europeans into the area and the subsequent loss of land, power and status by the black people led to deep, underlying resentment of black people towards whites

2. The close association of Christianity, the church and missionaries with the white colonial community led to profound tensions within the African soul between a positive interest in the gospel and a negative reaction to the bearers of the gospel

---

127 The term African Instituted Churches is a broad umbrella covering a wide range of churches from those very close to mainline or Pentecostal denominations to those more deeply influenced by African traditional religious customs (Roy 2000: 127).

128 Mangena Mokone (born in 1851), by birth a royal Pedi from Sekhukhuneland, converted to Methodism when working in Durban as a domestic servant. He was stationed in Pretoria from the early 1880s, first as a teacher and local preacher. Then, in 1887, he was ordained into ministry and thus became a “native assistant missionary”. He is the founder of the Ethiopian Mission Church which was recognised by the ZAR government in 1896 (see Sundkler 1964: 341).
3. Attitudes of paternalism and the lack of a positive appreciation of African culture were all too prevalent among many missionaries leading to frustration and discontent among many black members of missionary instituted churches.

4. Excessive caution hindered the development and ordination of indigenous leadership in the church.

5. Many Africans desired an African church that would fully reflect African culture and incorporate African traditional religious practices, a church initiated and governed by Africans.

6. The arrival in South Africa of many different missionary societies and denominations, not always working in close cooperation, provided for the African people a model of a divided Christianity.

7. African society itself had a tradition of aspiring leaders breaking away from established chiefs to form a new tribe. Such patterns were transformed to the ecclesiastical realm all too easily.

In South Africa and particularly in Tshwane (S & H), there are a variety of African Independent Churches of different historical backgrounds, sizes and shapes. In my observation the most prominent groups in these townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal are the Zion Christian Church (founded by Eugenas Lekganyane in 1924-25), the Saint John Apostolic Faith Mission (founded by Christina Ma Nku in 1950) and the International Pentecostal Church (founded by Frederick Modise in 1962) to name but a few. Taken together, the African Instituted Churches are spiritual homes for some 10 000 0000 people (Roy 2000: 137) – an important ecclesiastical formation in South Africa. Daneel (1987: 9) contends, “these churches …may indeed be seen as the fifth major church type, after the Eastern Orthodox churches, the Roman Catholic Church, the Protestant Reformation, and the Pentecostal churches” (see also Anderson 1992).

In the context of this research, the ecclesiastical formations discussed above still bear the legacy of a class system. These churches in the townships minister to people in the margins and lack the financial resources to sustain their work as was spelt out in Chapter 1 of this thesis.

There is also another group of churches which is present in South Africa in general and in Tshwane (S & H) in particular. These are the Pentecostal129 and Charismatic130 churches.

---

129 According to Stanley M Burgess, Gary B McGee and Patrick H Alexander (Eds) (1988), historians often trace the origins of Pentecostalism to a revival that began on January 1901 at Charles Parham’s Bethel School in Topeka, Kansas. They also claim that early Pentecostalism was often associated with
Pentecostalism and the charismatic movement are two of the spiritual movements that profoundly influenced Christian churches throughout the world in the 20th century. The Pentecostal movement began in 1901 while the charismatic movement developed several decades later (Burgess, McGee and Alexander 1988: 1). They have both given “birth to a whole new range of Christian denominations” (Roy 2000: 109).

With reference to South Africa, Roy associates the beginning of Pentecostalism with the prisoner-of-war camps just after the South African war as well as the widespread revival of religious feeling and new movements of Christian spirituality which entered South Africa from the USA in the first decade of the 20th century (see also Anderson 2001: 95). Remarkable religious awakenings occurred in these camps that deeply influenced the lives of many individual prisoners and had an impact on the subsequent religious and social history of South Africa (Roy 2000: 111). He adds, “so many prisoners returned home in 1902 with renewed faith” (Roy 2000: 112).

With particular reference to Pretoria, Kruger speaks of the beginning of Pentecostalism in Tshwane at a time of great tensions which marked the first two decades of the 20th century.

Rapid social change involving power relations and socio-economic conditions and class structures after the Anglo-Boer War, general social anomy and the arrival of large numbers of immigrants from abroad, alternative forms of Christianity gained a fairly firm foothold in the town during this period (1900-1924) (Kruger 2003: 182, see also Hofmeyr & Pillay (eds.) 1994: 191).

One of these alternative forms of Christianity was Pentecostalism. As was the case in the USA, it attracts membership from those in the margins. Kruger explains;

By and large the local membership of the new Pentecostal churches were drawn from Afrikaans-speaking folk from lower socio-economic classes who were alienated from both government and from established Reformed Christianity, which was largely middle class in its orientation. These churches identified with the poor sections of Afrikaner society (Kruger 2003: 182).

---

130 The Charismatic renewal represents a trans-denominational movement of Christians (both independent and denominational) who emphasise a “life in the Spirit” and the importance of exercising extraordinary gifts of the Spirit, including but not limited to glossolalia, in private prayer and in public worship (cf. Burgess, McGee and Alexander 1988:4).
They also identified with the poor African sections of the population: “It was a missionary enterprise to blacks, and in early days Afrikaners and Africans shared a religious enthusiasm. Yet, these churches would in decades to come also succumb to the pressure of race in local society” (Kruger 2003: 182).

According to Roy (2000: 190), the first wave of this movement resulted in the formation of what are now called the classical Pentecostal churches (e.g. the Assemblies of God, the Apostolic Faith Mission, and the Full Gospel Church of God). In the late 1950s and early 1960s a second wave of Pentecostal phenomena occurred in Anglican, Lutheran, Presbyterian, Reformed, Baptist and Methodist churches. People testified to being baptised in the Holy Spirit, speaking in tongues and healing. This neo-Pentecostal or charismatic renewal gained even greater momentum after 1967, when it began to spread rapidly in the Roman Catholic Church.

Other churches that arrived in Pretoria during 1924 included the Seventh Day Adventist Church and the Jehovah’s Witnesses131 (Kruger 2003: 183).

Due to the diverse and complex ecclesial history in Tshwane, I have chosen to focus the description of the present day reality merely on the churches that participated in this research. In an attempt to catch glimpses of the mission orientations and praxes of these churches I interviewed church leaders as stated in 1.8.3.2.2. I used the same guiding questions as those developed by Kritzinger (2008), which aided me to obtain information on agency, contextual understanding, ecclesial scrutiny, interpreting the tradition, discernment for action, reflexivity and spirituality. Findings of these interviews are presented in this text. However, what I report below are impressions of the five church leaders who participated in these interviews; I acknowledge that this small number places severe limitations on making valid observations and deductions. Nevertheless, I gained certain ideas from these interviews which enhanced my understanding about the orientations and praxes of these churches.

5.5 Participant church leaders’ insights on their churches’ praxes

5.5.1 Uniting Reformed Church in South Africa (URCSA) – Soshanguve Congregation

This congregation of the Uniting Reformed Church is situated at 1107 Block H, Soshanguve. The Church head office for the Northern Synod is at Sinodale Dienssentrum in Mamelodi, Tsamaya Street (formerly Stormvoelweg BZ1), Mamelodi (see URCSA 2012 Yearbook\(^{132}\)). It is a missionary church. According to the Minutes of the Sixth General Synod of URCSA 2012\(^{133}\) (2012: 3) in which the 2010 – 2016 Strategic Plan is tabled, the URCSA came into being on 14 April 1994 from two of the four members of the Dutch Reformed Church Family of Churches (i.e., the Dutch Reformed Church in Africa (DRCA) and the Dutch Reformed Mission Church (DRMC)). In terms of skin colour the URCSA was formed by the union of the black and coloured churches. The run-up to this union finds its origins in the decisions of 1978 where the reunification of the Dutch Reformed Church family was then stated as the ideal. The URCSA is an organised and a structured institution spread across the country.

Structurally, the denomination consists of congregations (communities of believers) with church councils being the legal persons, presbyteries (groupings of congregations that meet once a year), regional synods (groupings of congregations within previously determined regional boundaries and meeting at least once every three years) and a general synod (national meeting of the church, meeting every four years). The denomination (nationally) consists of 483 793 confessing members and 683 congregations.

However, The Northern Synod church boundaries span four Provinces: Gauteng, North West, Mpumalanga and Limpopo. This Synod is divided into 18 Presbyteries, consisting of 134 congregations.

With specific reference to the Northern Synod\(^{134}\) it has 134 congregations, of which Soshanguve is one of them. The stipulated vision of URCSA is:

“Dynamic in unity, reconciliation and justice”.

Its mission statement is:


“To affect the renewal of creation through the proclamation and the witness of the Kingdom of God as co-workers and followers of Christ”.

Strategic goals expressed include the edification and extension of the church, promotion and extension of Church unity, effective ecumenical and partnership relations, programme for civil and social responsibility and effective communication, resourcing (see Minutes of the Sixth General Synod of URCSA 2012: 4).

Given the fact that URCSA is made up of historically disadvantaged groups, challenges with regard to resources for ministry are realities. Hence, the Sixth General Synod of 2012 resolved that URCSA must deal with the problems it faces by seeking solutions that are owned and developed by URCSA. The Synod stipulates that their “own internal fundraising methods should be found if self-reliance would be maintained within URCSA congregations” (Minutes of the Sixth General Synod of URCSA 2012: 5). Further, the Sixth General Synod of 2012 of URCSA (2012: 40 – 49) urges local congregations to adopt and implement the Integrated Ministry model as the approach to ministry in their respective contexts. Three core ministries are recommended to congregations i.e. Proclamation and Worship, Congregational Ministries and Service and Witness.

The foregoing has provided a brief historical development of URCSA, its vision and ministry model. Of importance is that most of its congregations, including Soshanguve, comprise previously disadvantaged groups who are still suffering from the legacy of apartheid as described in Chapter 3. Also, in comparison with its mother denomination, URCSA evidences many weaknesses and very limited resources for ministry. Chief among these and in relation to this research are: limited physical structures (buildings), inadequate finances, weak administration, inadequate networks, a shortage of ministers, vacant congregations, insufficient formation centres, inadequate responsible stewardship, weak prophetic (advocacy) voices, staff shortages, inadequate focus on youth, inability to utilise the expertise of members and inadequate guiding of a variety of spiritualities (see Minutes of the Sixth General Synod of URCSA 2012: 14 – 15).

I observed that some of these weaknesses are present in the Soshanguve congregation. For example, there is very limited building infrastructure on site such as dedicated class rooms for Christian instruction. The main meeting venue (the sanctuary) is inadequate to accommodate

---

135 The Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats analysis done by URCSA list 22 weaknesses but for this research I selected to highlight only 13 which were relevant for this study from this list.
concurrent meetings when needed. This has negative implications for ministries to different church members. This also means that it is difficult for this congregation to make its facility available to strategic community ministries such as skills development training centres and youth community development that are much needed in the area. In addition, I was told that one pastor for example is involved in a “tent and chair” hire business to supplement his stipend, which points to the inadequate financial situation this congregation is faced with. This situation also means that the congregation is unable to render service and witness to weak and vulnerable members of the church and community in meaningful ways (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6). Because, whatever they generate as income will, in all fairness, go to meet the needs of their pastors first. The remainder will most likely be allocated to pastoral ministries.

Regardless of these challenges, I have observed that the congregation has structured its ministries along the Integrated Ministry model as it seeks to reach-out and minister to its members and to the community at large.

Using the praxis matrix developed by Kritzinger (2008), the table below, Table 5.1 critically examines and presents what this congregation is doing in mission on the ground. The views presented in this table were collected on 17 November 2014 during a personal interview with one of the pastors of the church.

Table 5.1. Uniting Reformed Soshanguve Parish’s praxis matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Uniting Reformed Church/ Soshanguve</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agency:</strong> the power relations prevailing between them? How do these factors influence their approach? Who are their “interlocutors”, who help “set their agenda” and determine their priorities? How do all these factors shape their approach?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• **Contextual understanding**: What are the social, political, economic, cultural factors that influence the society within which they are working and witnessing? How do the change agents analyse that specific context? How do they “read the signs of the times?” How do these factors shape their approach?

Crime associated with poverty, social ills especially juvenile delinquency, poor health among the poor and the unemployment affect Soshanguve. The ministry structures of the church attempt to understand these issues and inform the church so that activities could be planned in response. They intend to formulate a collective vision to address these factors.

• **Ecclesial scrutiny**: What were the practices of churches and Christians in the past in that particular community? Did it give the church(es) a good or a bad name in the community? Do churches have positions of power and privilege or influential public contacts? What are the physical and institutional structures of the churches and how are they utilised in or for the community at large? What are their leadership patterns and structures? How do these factors shape their approach?

The church has limited resources; therefore it does not share much with communities in need. It appears standing at a distance from people in dire need. It has not yet come to a place where it can use the people of influence it has in its membership for community ministry.

The church has limited building facilities, the sanctuary being the only facility made available for community use. The church is registered as a non-profit organisation and has ministry programmes for youth, men and women. Under the oversight of the pastoral team these different ministries carry out outreach, Christian education and evangelism in the community.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Interpreting the tradition:</strong> How do the change agents (re)interpret the Bible and their theological tradition in the light of the questions raised by the previous three dimensions? Is there a unique formulation of the Christian message that is arising in this context? How do these theological insights shape their approach?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In its preaching, the church seeks to be relevant to contemporary issues it faces in their community. As a result members are learning to read the Bible for insights that help them address issues in their community. The integrated ministry model being encouraged by URCSA is very helpful for this church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discernment for action:</strong> What kind of concrete faith projects or organisations are they involved in, particularly in relation to the community at large? What kind of plans are they making to embody their theological insights in the community? How broad is the theological agenda and how does it actually shape their actions?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food parcels to orphans and the aged in crisis. The church is registered as a non-profit organisation. It is involved through its members in civic organisations such as neighbourhood watch. They follow the theological agenda of their denomination in terms of ministry i.e. integrated ministry model.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reflexivity:</strong> Do the change agents consistently and honestly reflect on the impact and results of their work in the community? Do they learn from their experiences? How does this shape their approach in the community? Does this reflection lead to renewed and deepened agency, contextual understanding, interpretation of the tradition, spirituality and planning?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different ministries of the church submit their reflections and plans of action to the parish leadership during quarterly meetings. These reflections assist the leadership team to adapt their approach and correct mistakes done in the past. These reflections help the church in terms of coming up with strategies and actions that could be relevant in their community.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Leaders are encouraging all ministries to embody an integrated and holistic spirituality. Not all structures of the church have attained this as many members tend to focus only on outreach and evangelism. As a result, the church is slow in getting the whole congregation to respond to issues that affect the community.

5.5.2 Evangelical Lutheran Church – Soshanguve

This congregation of the Evangelical Lutheran Church is situated on 1250 Block H, Soshanguve. It is a missionary church, its historical background being linked to Lutheranism in South Africa.

Garaba and Zarvedinos (2014: 5) write that Lutheranism in South Africa developed from two main sources. Firstly, from the work of Lutheran missionaries that ultimately led to the establishment of indigenous Lutheran churches and, secondly, from Lutheran settler congregations of German and Scandinavian background that also evolved into independent Lutheran churches (cf. Wittenberg cited in Garaba & Zarvedinos; Florin 1967:93). A total of ten different “Lutheran” mission societies engaged in mission work in Southern Africa. Five stemmed from Germany, four from Scandinavia and one from America (Scriba 1997 cited in Garaba & Zarvedinos 2014: 6).
Evangelistic outreaches by missionaries led to the establishment of a number of indigenous churches, one of which is the Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa (ELCSA) to which the Soshanguve congregation belongs. Lutheran settler congregations, as was the norm during the colonial period and during apartheid, had their own separate congregations with their members being the European settlers. The Lutheran settler congregations benefited from white privileges of that time while Lutheran indigenous congregations were resource-less and depended on the generosity of missionary societies.

According to Garaba and Zarvedinos (2014: 7-8) the first missionaries of the Berlin Mission Society (BMS) arrived in 1834 and established a mission station at Bethany in the Orange River Sovereignty. With the expansion of the British Cape Colony to the east and the establishment of the Colony of Natal, mission work was started among the Tswana, the Xhosa and the Zulu peoples. The first mission station in Natal was established at Emmaus in 1847 and another in Christianenburg in 1854. In 1860 the BMS started conducting mission work in the then “South African Republic” (Transvaal) which became the main mission field for the BMS, centred at Botshabelo. Soshanguve (formerly Mabopane East) was in the jurisdiction of the then Transvaal. By 1955, the BMS was ministering to black congregants at over 73 mission stations in the Transvaal.

Yet, in conformity with both “the socio-political realities of colonial society and the wish to preserve the German culture and language on foreign soil, there thus developed, out of the work of the Lutheran missionaries, two sets of congregations, one black and one white” (Winkler 1989 cited in Garaba & Zarvedinos 2014: 9). With reference to the City of Tshwane, the black Lutheran congregations (i.e. Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa (ELCSA)) are located in townships such as Soshanguve and Hammanskraal on the periphery (with little resources) of the city (with few resources) while the white Lutheran congregations are located in town, in the suburbia with many resources. Of importance is the fact that the socioeconomic, historic and political realities of these twin churches are different and are rooted within the apartheid and colonial legacy, even today under the democratic dispensation. The following paragraphs will briefly explain the historic and current trajectory of the ELCSA for the purpose of placing the Soshanguve congregation in perspective.
The ELCSA has 580 000 members and (since 1976), has been in fellowship with the Lutheran World Fellowship, with the All Africa Conferences of Churches, the Lutheran Communion in Southern Africa and the World Council of Churches. ELCSA came into being on the 18th December 1975 at Tlhabane, Rustenburg during the constituting Assembly which took place on the 15th to the 20th December 1975. Four Regional Churches (Cape/Orange, South Eastern, Northern and Western) merged to form ELCSA. This congregation is situated in the Western Diocese of ELCSA. Each one of these regions is now known as a Diocese. However, ELCSA still sees itself as divided into white and black churches and looks forward to the day when all the Lutheran Churches in South Africa will be constituted into one Lutheran Church.

Structurally, ELCSA is divided into congregations, parishes, circuits, dioceses and church, with the General Assembly as its highest body. It has links with missionary agencies and organisations here and abroad who have given both their moral and financial support to the continuation of the work of ELCSA in fulfilling its mission, that is, to glorify and praise the name of the Triune God. Driven and inspired by the Lutheran Doctrine of Justification by Grace through Faith in the Crucified and Risen Lord Jesus Christ ELCSA seeks to (1) Proclaim the crucified and risen Christ, (2) Bring the gospel to all people through preaching and teaching the word of God and through administering the Sacraments, (3) Be a witness of Jesus Christ as servant to the world by word and deed in faith, love and hope, (4) Work towards the realisation of the oneness of the Body of Christ, (5) Actively support ecumenical movements and be prepared to co-operate with other Churches for the extension of the Kingdom of God, provided such co-operation does not violate the confessional basis of the Church, (6) Advocate for justice, peace and reconciliation for the people of God, (7) Liberate people from socio-economic depriving and self-rejection and (8) Empower the individual and church to spiritual growth and prosperity (see www.elcsa.org.za).

ELCSA, with a vision to affect communities and increase membership to 5 million by 2017, subscribes to the following values: integrity, honesty, love, commitment, service and transparency

Using the praxis matrix developed by Kritzinger (2008), the table below, Table 5.2 critically examines and presents what this congregation is doing in mission on the ground. The views

presented in this table were collected on 04 May 2015 during a personal interview with a representative of the church who was assigned to participate in this research.

Table 5.2 Evangelical Lutheran Church Soshanguve Parish’s praxis matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Evangelical Lutheran Church Soshanguve</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agency:</strong> the power relations prevailing between them? How do these factors influence their approach? Who are their “interlocutors”, who help “set their agenda” and determine their priorities? How do all these factors shape their approach?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The interlocutors are the community as a whole. The Parish council sets the agenda. The pastor in charge together with his ministry team determines priorities. The church engages the community mainly through preaching as its members are expected to live out a Christian witness in the community. This is in line with the vision and mission of this church which stipulates: to live like Christ and to be exemplary in the world.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Contextual understanding:** What are the social, political, economic, cultural factors that influence the society within which they are working and witnessing? How do the change agents analyse that specific context? How do they “read the signs of the times?” How do these factors shape their approach? |
| Poverty, unemployment, crime and vulnerability are daily realities. The church interacts with the community to establish needs and opportunities for service. In this interaction, the members speak about Christ’s love and that salvation is holistic. Hence, the approach is based on finding opportunities to “do good” no matter what. |
- **Ecclesial scrutiny**: What were the practices of churches and Christians in the past in that particular community? Did it give the church(es) a good or a bad name in the community? Do churches have positions of power and privilege or influential public contacts? What are the physical and institutional structures of the churches and how are they utilised in or for the community at large? What are their leadership patterns and structures? How do these factors shape their approach?

  In the past the church used to be silent about socioeconomic inequalities. Most of the time the church used to pay lip-service to contextual issues. The church’s reputation was neither good nor bad. This church has members who are high profile politicians in the city such as the current Member of the Mayoral Committee of health and social development. The church has building infrastructure which is made available to the diaconate ministry (social ministry). Institutionally, the church is a registered non-profit organisation yet it is not efficient in tackling pertinent community issues. The church’s approach focusses on touching the thoughts and emotions of community through preaching and sometimes modelling what it means to be your “brother’s keeper”.

- **Interpreting the tradition**: How do the change agents (re)interpret the Bible and their theological tradition in the light of the questions raised by the previous three dimensions? Is there a unique formulation of the Christian message that is arising in this context? How do these theological insights shape their approach?

  The change agents re-emphasise what the Bible teaches by attempting to present Jesus to the community in concrete ways. This leads to demonstrating what humanity should be in Christ’s likeness.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Discernment for action:</strong> What kind of concrete faith projects or organisations are they involved in, particularly in relation to the community at large? What kind of plans are they making to embody their theological insights in the community? How broad is the theological agenda and how does it actually shape their actions?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Through its diaconate ministry, this church adopts communities in need such as orphans and old aged people. The church serves these communities by administering relief as well as psychosocial and spiritual support. This diaconate ministry provides a platform for all members of the church to participate (collective involvement is encouraged) believing that members are theologically compelled to minister as far as possible to these communities in the name of Jesus.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Reflexivity:</strong> Do the change agents consistently and honestly reflect on the impact and results of their work in the community? Do they learn from their experiences? How does this shape their approach in the community? Does this reflection lead to renewed and deepened agency, contextual understanding, interpretation of the tradition, spirituality and planning?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strategic reflections happen at the episcopal level to assess the ministries and practices of all member churches of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa. At the parish, reflections are done on a weekly basis. These reflections are carried out in relation to the parish’s priorities and highlight new challenges and opportunities in the context for ministry. They also give insights for renewal or change of approach to fit with the needs of the community.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Spirituality:</strong> What type(s) of spirituality is/are practised by the change agents? What is the dominant spirituality among them? Is this a source of inspiration and encouragement to the group? How do these factors of spirituality shape their approach?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Share the space with the community through events, fellowship and regular interaction – be active participants in community issues. The church finds encouragement and inspiration by being involved in the community. One such example is providing hospitality to refugees.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.5.3 Bethel Revival Church – Soshanguve

Bethel Revival Church is situated in Block GG, Soshanguve. The leadership of this church was uncomfortable about granting me a personal interview for the purpose of collecting information related to their ministry. After numerous attempts, I decided not to attempt to contact him any longer. Thankfully, his church was represented at focus group sessions.

5.5.4 Letlhabile Baptist Church – Refentse / Hammanskraal

Letlhabile Baptist church is situated in Refentse (formerly Stinkwater) in Hammanskraal, stand number 958 Mokone Block. This local congregation has been a member of the Baptist Union of South Africa (BUSA) and the Baptist Northern Association since 1999.

Baptists came to South Africa with the 1820 Settlers; the first Baptist church was established in the Salem/Kariega area near Grahamstown. German settlers arriving about 1859 also included a few Baptists and soon there was a flourishing German Baptist church in the area between Stutterheim and Berlin in the Eastern Cape. German and English Baptists combined to form the Baptist Union (BU) in 1877.138

This new church was established mainly to minister to European Baptist settlers in Southern Africa, not to indigenous people. The "separate development mentality" was prevalent within BUSA during its formation. Scheepers (2008: 2-3) names the following factors for this mentality:

(i) British colonialism certainly influenced the formation and initial development of BUSA. The cultural divide between "colonial whites" and "emerging blacks" who were accustomed to a social separation between the two groups was certainly a factor. Likewise the manner in which Europeans perceived the Bantu in the 1870's

(ii) The Missions philosophy prevalent in Europe and America round about 1877 was to form native, indigenous churches that would be "self-governing, self-supporting and self-propagating". The motto of the South African Baptist Mission Society (SABMS) was "the evangelisation of the Bantu by the Bantu". It was felt the young churches arising out of mission work would be

138 See http://www.baptistunion.org.za/
independent and not dependent upon or controlled by mother bodies that helped to establish them. It is thus not surprising that BUSA through the SABMS followed the same policy.

(iii) The British Baptist ministers who came to South Africa prior to and following the arrival of the 1820 Settlers came with the express purpose to minister to the British immigrants in the Cape and British Kaffraria. Missions to the Bantu were not necessarily a part of their agenda. (…) it was the German Baptists and not the British who were key factors in the establishment of the SABMS.

(iv) The new SABMS was based upon the British model which saw the Missions Society as an entirely separate entity from the Union, but in close association with it.

The unjust policy of apartheid, which was implemented and enforced by the South African Nationalist Government from 1948 to the early nineties, cemented and added the "cherry on the top" of the separate development and ultimate separation between BUSA and the Baptist Convention. It provided the ideal context for continued British colonial thinking and practice with regard to the Bantu.

The current mission statement of the BU as accepted at Assembly in Kimberley, 2003 declares:

Under the Lordship of Christ we exist as a multi-cultural fellowship of interdependent churches, functioning in territorial associations, to impact this generation with the Gospel. (BU Handbook 2013 – 2014: 3)

Against this backdrop in the foregoing, Letlhabile Baptist church’s current ministries should be put in perspective. According to Chris Parnell (1995)\textsuperscript{139}, the spade work for what is now known as Letlhabile Baptist Church was carried out in the nineteen eighties, when the heart of a Scottish Baptist doctor (Dr Harrower) at Jubilee Hospital was touched by the need of these people who seemed to be the most deprived and overlooked community in the whole area of Stinkwater in Hammanskraal. The people of Pretoria Central Baptist Church were also moved, and founded the Stinkwater Mission. They sorted logistical issues at the school, provided accommodation and help for a clinic from Jubilee Hospital; sank boreholes; erected buildings; started teaching vegetable, hen and egg production, sewing and knitting; and they preached Christ. They make up monthly parcels of food for elderly people and run a soup kitchen.

\textsuperscript{139} See \url{http://www.cmf.org.uk/publications/content.asp?context=article&id=2389} accessed 12 January 2014.
From 1992-2002, Stinkwater Mission grew into an established Baptist church, known as Letlhabile, boasting a multi-faceted community development centre to serve the local community and Hammanskraal at large. From 2003, Letlhabile’s community ministry was reshaped to focus on issues related to orphans and vulnerable children.

Using the praxis matrix developed by Kritzinger (2008), the table below, Table 5.3 critically examines and presents what this congregation is doing in mission on the ground. The views presented in this table were collected on 04 May 2015 during a personal interview with the pastor in charge (Rev Christiaan Rustof) of the church.

Table 5.3: Letlhabile Baptist Church’s praxis matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Letlhabile Baptist Church/ Hammanskraal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agency:</strong> the power relations prevailing between them? How do these factors influence their approach? Who are their “interlocutors”, who help “set their agenda” and determine their priorities? How do all these factors shape their approach?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This church is currently going through restructuring and repositioning. Church and community members are the interlocutors. The agenda and priorities for ministry are set-up by the pastor. The focus is on spiritual formation of members who will in turn work holistically in community. Challenge: Old members expecting to relive past glories and “fame” of this church in the community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Contextual understanding:</strong> What are the social, political, economic, cultural factors that influence the society within which they are working and witnessing? How do the change agents analyse that specific context? How do they “read the signs of the times?” How do these factors shape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The church understands that this community is in transition from a rural situation to a semi-township. There are many old people living with their grandchildren in this old section of Refentse (previously known as Stinkwater). Young residents live there mainly on a temporary basis. And leave their children with grandparents. Through dialogue and building relationships for the purpose of service the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>their approach?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Ecclesial scrutiny**: What were the practices of churches and Christians in the past in that particular community? Did it give the church(es) a good or a bad name in the community? Do churches have positions of power and privilege or influential public contacts? What are the physical and institutional structures of the churches and how are they utilised in or for the community at large? What are their leadership patterns and structures? How do these factors shape their approach?

The church has benefitted the community in the past a great deal through its ministry of community development and adult education. As a result there are a number of community projects and organisations that were initiated by community members who received training at Lethlabile. The community still expects Lethlabile to do more now even though it has very limited resources and capacity to do so. The physical assets of the church still serve the community: host youth activities, sewing classes etc. Baptist leadership patterns (congregational church government) are applied. The crèche employs three women from the community. The pastor is thinking of new projects such as a Christian private school to service the community.

- **Interpreting the tradition**: How do the change agents (re)interpret the Bible and their theological tradition in the light of the questions raised by the previous three dimensions? Is there a unique formulation of the Christian message that is arising in this context? How do these theological insights shape their approach?

Their focus is on outreach even though some members are reluctant to reach out. They are currently investing in building members through theological and biblical foundation in the word of God. In partnerships with community institutions such as schools, the pastor is involved with ministry to children in schools and working with community members in need for collective good. He is learning how to apply the scripture to contextual issues that affect
Discernment for action: What kind of concrete faith projects or organisations are they involved in, particularly in relation to the community at large? What kind of plans are they making to embody their theological insights in the community? How broad is the theological agenda and how does it actually shape their actions?

The church is currently involved in a crèche and ministry to school children, especially the orphans and vulnerable children. They also facilitate the community sewing class. The pastor is praying and dreaming about establishing a Christian value-based educational institution as a long term project. In the short term, they envisage starting a basic computer literacy class. All these are part of the continuation of the community development approach which has been for years the ethos of the congregation.

Reflexivity: Do the change agents consistently and honestly reflect on the impact and results of their work in the community? Do they learn from their experiences? How does this shape their approach in the community? Does this reflection lead to renewed and deepened agency, contextual understanding, interpretation of the tradition, spirituality and planning?

Ongoing reflections are done by the leadership about expectations of community members in relation to this church. Lessons learned include: mass evangelism is outdated for this community; the context is in transition (current community needs must be serviced). Develop a strategy to continue to mobilise all believers about ministry in the community. The church must change its approach in terms of initiating new things as related to the context.
• **Spirituality:** What type(s) of spirituality is/are practised by the change agents? What is the dominant spirituality among them? Is this a source of inspiration and encouragement to the group? How do these factors of spirituality shape their approach? Focused on spirituality to be lived out in the community on concrete ways in relation to the context. The church is like a training ground for members but they have to make a positive impact in the community by considering everything they do, in the market place and in church, as opportunity to live out their faith in God. They believe that true spirituality is lived out in the community in concrete ways.

### 5.5.5 Hammanskraal Gospel Centre – Kanana / Hammanskraal

Two brief personal interviews conducted with Rev Aristorica Phiri on 13 December 2013 and 04 May 2015 are summarised in what follows.

Hammanskraal Gospel Centre, situated about 43 km to the north of Pretoria, is what one would refer to as a Charismatic fellowship. It is presently being pastored by Reverend Aristarico Phiri, a Zambian, and two eldership couples: Mr. and Mrs. S. Mkandla and Drs Peter and Carol Bombal.

The history of the church goes back to the 1980’s when the fellowship used to be a Methodist church; later it became an Assemblies of God Church, which must have been in the early 1990’s. In 1995, the present pastor, Rev. Aristarico Phiri, arrived from Zambia on a personal mission. Unbeknown to Pastor Phiri, God had planned already that his visit would end up a pastoral appointment to the then, small gathering of the saints (approximately 13 people) that were at the time meeting at the Youth with a Mission base in Renstown in Hammanskraal.

As soon as Pastor Phiri took over the pastorate of the church from Mr. Edmund Pohl and his wife Marrietta Pohl, the church began to pick up growth as it attracted more black people from the surrounding community of Mandela Village, Renstown and Temba. By 1996, the church was already looking for ways to extend and expand its meeting place. The YWAM classrooms were no longer enough to contain their numbers. Hence the pastor searched for a tent. He found two 10 x 5 metres each, and joined them together so they at least had a bigger room for the people who were coming. This seemed to suffice until their Sunday school started to “burst at the
seams”. The facilities at the nursery school were made available to the church to use. The latter began to flourish at that time. In 1997, it joined Church of the Nations (COTN). It was in the same year that the hired tents proved inadequate again; one COTN church gave them a much bigger tent, 20 x 10 m. The church continued to experience growth and numbers grew to 350 adults, not counting children.

The finances of the church were very unsatisfactory in 1996. The bank balance when pastor Phiri took over the church was R93.00. His first remuneration was R750.00. However, the finances began to improve, especially when the congregation stopped depending on the generosity of well-wishers. In 2001 it approached Mr Douglas Rens about purchasing a plot of land for the church. Mr. Rens (now deceased) was very gracious to them. He sold them Portion 6 of Farm 3 which is in Kanana. The land covers an area of 4.3289 hectares.

**Vision for the area of land in possession:**

The vision is to use the premises to provide for the needs of the community, such as a Christian school, a trauma counselling centre, a skills development centre for young people and possibly a refuge for homeless children. In preparation for the future, the leadership has currently embarked on a training programme for leaders through establishment of an “In –House Bible School”. Today, the Hammanskraal Gospel Centre is a well-known name.

Using the praxis matrix developed by Kritzinger (2008), the table below, Table 5.4 critically examines and presents what this congregation is doing in mission on the ground. The views presented in Table 5.4 were collected on 04 May 2015, during a personal interview with the pastor in charge (Rev Aristorica Phiri) of the church.

Table 5.4: Hammanskraal Gospel Centre’s praxis matrix.
**Hammanskraal Gospel Centre/Hammanskraal**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency: the power relations prevailing between them? How do these factors influence their approach? Who are their “interlocutors”, who help “set their agenda” and determine their priorities? How do all these factors shape their approach?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The church is in friendship with the community. The interlocutors are community members, the dialogue centres around and about the needs of the community. The church leadership sets up the agenda which is embraced by the members of the church. Priorities are determined by community needs. These needs must be met holistically. The approach of the church is based on the fact that the needs of the people have not changed (see Luke 4:18-19) since the time of Christ.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contextual understanding: What are the social, political, economic, cultural factors that influence the society within which they are working and witnessing? How do the change agents analyse that specific context? How do they “read the signs of the times?” How do these factors shape their approach?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The change agents live in the context and are aware of the social issues in the context. The people need to be involved in their situation. People are “conscientised” to participate in addressing the socioeconomic issues that affect them. The church as an agent of change looks into the context by assessing needs, analysing the context (studying the community) on a regular basis. This community is affected by unemployment, poverty, single parenting, drugs and youth delinquency. The envisaged project is meant to address some of these issues.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ecclesial scrutiny:</strong> What were the practices of churches and Christians in the past in that particular community? Did it give the church (es) a good or a bad name in the community? Do churches have positions of power and privilege or influential public contacts? What are the physical and institutional structures of the churches and how are they utilised in or for the community at large? What are their leadership patterns and structures? How do these factors shape their approach?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interpreting the tradition:</strong> How do the change agents (re)interpret the Bible and their theological tradition in the light of the questions raised by the previous three dimensions? Is there a unique formulation of the Christian message that is arising in this context? How do these theological insights shape their approach?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
then wrestling to find out what actions the Bible instructs in relation to those needs.

- **Discernment for action:** What kind of concrete faith projects or organisations are they involved in, particularly in relation to the community at large? What kind of plans are they making to embody their theological insights in the community? How broad is the theological agenda and how does it actually shape their actions?

  Currently, the church has a theological agenda which seeks to influence the community and other Christian leaders in the area with good teaching. The elements of this teaching include a combination of theory and demonstration in the immediate context. Through this agenda, it articulates a practical collective vision for transformation in the area. They Members have started with a community gardening and skills development centre.

- **Reflexivity:** Do the change agents consistently and honestly reflect on the impact and results of their work in the community? Do they learn from their experiences? How does this shape their approach in the community? Does this reflection lead to renewed and deepened agency, contextual understanding, interpretation of the tradition, spirituality and planning?

  The church is always learning: reflections are firstly shared with elders and deacons and secondly with the members and other partner ministries in the community at large. Lessons are shared with the aim of community transformation. These reflections are also focussed on how to maximise the current assets of the church and appreciate the involvement of others for the purpose of collective vision.
• **Spirituality:** What type(s) of spirituality is/are practised by the change agents? What is the dominant spirituality among them? Is this a source of inspiration and encouragement to the group? How do these factors of spirituality shape their approach?

The church strives to affect the lives of others in concrete ways because members believe the church must represent Christ by life. Words on their own cannot be a true reflection of Christ. Spirituality has to do with character formation and this is a hard process. Cell group setting is used as a platform for fostering and modelling spirituality. Prayer group ministry is to increase the momentum of spirituality in the church.

### 5.5.6 The Body of Christ Ministry – Lepengville / Hammanskraal

The Body of Christ Ministry was founded in 1990 and is led by its founder, Pastor John Megala. The church is located at 492 Block DD Lepengville in Hammanskraal. The Founder is a bivocational minister with basic theological training. He works during the day for Tshwane municipality in region 2 in the maintenance department. The ministry of this church is fourfold: fellowship, equipping the saints, Bible school for lay leaders and care for the aged. The mission of this church is: building the body of Christ for service. This group of believers is an AIC, in that it is born out of the vision and effort of an African leader with no ties to mainline church mission agencies. It is a Bible believing church, Charismatic/Pentecostal in its outlook and practices.

Using the praxis matrix developed by Kritzinger (2008), Table 5.5. below critically examines and present what this congregation is doing in mission on the ground The views presented in this table below were collected on 05 May 2015 during a personal interview with pastor John Megala, referred to as the bishop and founder of the church.

**Table 5.5: Body of Christ/Hammanskraal’s praxis matrix**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the church</th>
<th>The Body of Christ/Hammanskraal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agency:</strong> the power relations prevailing between them? How do these factors influence their approach? Who are their “interlocutors”, who help “set their agenda” and determine their priorities? How do all these factors shape their approach?</td>
<td>The church members and leadership are in an ongoing dialogue. The agenda and priorities are set by the founder and the “top nine council” in line with the vision of the church. Their main interlocutors are church and community members (especially the needy such as children and old aged).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Contextual understanding:</strong> What are the social, political, economic, cultural factors that influence the society within which they are working and witnessing? How do the change agents analyse that specific context? How do they “read the signs of the times?” How do these factors shape their approach?</td>
<td>Unemployment and vulnerability of communities at risk, such as children and aged people, are issues that are real in the context of this church. For this church, poverty and lack of jobs due to the closure of Babelegi industrial hub is one of the main reasons for the misery of the people in Hammanskraal. The leadership, in collective under a fellowship called “Imbizo ya madoda” is planning to register as a public benefit organisation for the purpose of addressing these socioeconomic issues.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ecclesial scrutiny:</strong> What were the practices of churches and Christians in the past in that particular community? Did it give the church(es) a good or a bad name in the community? Do churches have positions of power and privilege or influential public contacts? What are the physical and institutional structures of the churches and how</td>
<td>The church has a building facility which is made available to the aged three days a week for an income generation project (craft, knitting and sewing). Institutionally, it is a non-profit organisation, structured as follows: Bishop and founder (visionary), top nine council (overseeing function), board (executive function) and membership. Thanks to its community work and to the network of the Bishop (who works for the municipality) the church has a good reputation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
are they utilised in or for the community at large? What are their leadership patterns and structures? How do these factors shape their approach?

in the community and it is respected.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Interpreting the tradition:</strong> How do the change agents (re)interpret the Bible and their theological tradition in the light of the questions raised by the previous three dimensions? Is there a unique formulation of the Christian message that is arising in this context? How do these theological insights shape their approach?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>This church is learning to connect the Bible message with issues in their context. In the process, it learns how to make use of its own resources to develop its ministry to the community. The book of Nehemiah is being used as a framework for reconstruction and transformation in the approach to ministry in the community.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Discernment for action:</strong> What kind of concrete faith projects or organisations are they involved in, particularly in relation to the community at large? What kind of plans are they making to embody their theological insights in the community? How broad is the theological agenda and how does it actually shape their actions?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Leaders believe that the word of God inspires concrete action. They are currently facilitating the income generation project of old aged people. They are in the process of writing a business plan for community ministry as part of the “Imbizo ya madoda” consortium. This is an ecumenical cooperation in nature made up of five Christian independent churches in the area of Hammanskraal and Soshanguve.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- **Reflexivity**: Do the change agents consistently and honestly reflect on the impact and results of their work in the community? Do they learn from their experiences? How does this shape their approach in the community? Does this reflection lead to renewed and deepened understanding, interpretation of the tradition, spirituality and planning?

The Body of Christ does its own reflection as a church. Collective reflections as fraternals are seldom done in Hammanskraal as local churches seem to be individualistic and divided by doctrines.

The Bishop and top nine council members meet regularly to assess and reflect on the impact of their ministry in their community. Lessons learnt assist them to adjust or adapt their approach.

As a result of these reflections, Body of Christ prays regularly about the contextual issues they face in their community.

- **Spirituality**: What type(s) of spirituality is/are practised by the change agents? What is the dominant spirituality among them? Is this a source of inspiration and encouragement to the group? How do these factors of spirituality shape their approach?

As inspired by God, the Creator, Body of Christ strives to live out as Christians among the people of the community in practical visible ways. In the process they form relationships with the community and model ethical behaviours.

### 5.6 Synthesis of the church leaders’ views/interpretations on praxis matrixes of their churches

A synthesis of the church leaders’ views on praxis matrixes of these churches reveals the following:
1) With regard to agency, it is evident that power relations in these churches are hierarchical, with considerable power being in the hands of top governance structures (such as the parish council, pastor and elders, founder and top nine council). The interlocutors of these churches are first their own members (ministry leaders and congregants) then the community. The power relations and interlocutors have influenced the approach of these churches to adopt for example an Integrated Ministry Model in the case of URCSA Soshanguve, “preaching to affect lives” in the case of ELCSA Soshanguve, “focus on spiritual formation” at Letlabile Baptist, “friendship with community and Luke 4:18-19” as a framework for Hammanskraal Gospel Centre and fostering an ongoing dialogue with community and church members in the case of the Body of Christ Ministry.

2) These churches can “read” contextual issues as they experience them in their areas. They mentioned crime associated with poverty (as expressed by three churches), social ills (as expressed by two churches), poor health, unemployment (as expressed by three churches), vulnerability of at-risk individuals such as children and old people (as expressed by two churches), instability associated with community in transition, and old women burdened with child care. According to these churches, it is clear that unemployment and crime associated with poverty are the most pressing issues in Hammanskraal and Soshanguve. These are followed by social ills and the vulnerability of at-risk individuals.

Generally, the praxis matrixes reveal that change agents from these churches analyse these issues in their interaction, through dialogue, with communities as they try to build relationships with the community at large. These issues are shaping the approach of these churches, among others, to formulate a collective vision for action (as expressed by two churches), preach Christ’s love and highlight that salvation has holistic implications (as expressed by two churches), “conscientisation” of the church and community about their needs and outreach through children’s ministry.

3) With reference to ecclesial scrutiny, the praxis matrixes show:
1) some churches did relief and community development (as expressed by three church leaders)

2) it was acknowledged that in the past these churches were mostly silent and stood at a distance from community issues (as expressed by two churches), only paying lip-service to these issues

3) through their members these churches have influential public contacts and have good rapport with government officials

4) all these churches have building facilities of some sort which are made available to community ministry

5) institutionally, they are structured and registered with government as non-profit organisations (as expressed by four churches) and public benefit organisation (as expressed by one church)

6) the leadership patterns of these churches include the parish model (as expressed by two churches), congregational model (expressed by one church) and the neo-Pentecostal model consisting of a founder/visionary surrounded by a few elders (as expressed by two churches)

7) these factors shaped the approach of these churches in various ways: pastoral and leadership teams guide and provide oversight and vision for community ministry (as expressed by all the churches), preaching to enhance spiritual formation and to ignite community transformation (as expressed by three churches). All these church leaders expressed that a holistic and integrated approach is preferable.

4) Church leaders’ views on the praxis matrixes about interpreting tradition hint at a number of issues:

1) Change agents attempt to read the Bible and re-emphasise biblical teachings in relation to concrete needs in the community for the purpose of presenting a “holistic gospel” (as expressed by three churches) and emphasis on building theological and biblical foundations through sound doctrines with the hope
that community transformation will ensue from these teachings (as expressed by two churches).

2) Although these churches did not exhibit unique interpretation of the Bible as related to their contexts, they assert that biblical insights help them to address community issues which aim at enhancing humanity holistically (as expressed by three churches) also sound Bible-based teaching will lead to spiritual formation which will eventually lead to community transformation (as expressed by two churches)

3) Theological insights which are shaping the approach of these churches include integrated and holistic framework for ministry (as expressed by three churches), preaching and teaching for transformation (as expressed by two churches) and the Book of Nehemiah as a framework for reconstruction and transformation (as expressed by one church).

5) The praxis matrixes, based on the views of these church leaders, show that these churches are involved in different faith projects in their areas: food parcels (as expressed by two churches), collaborating with local civic organisations, adopting communities in need such as orphans, refugees and elderly people (as expressed by two churches), provide psychosocial and spiritual support to vulnerable communities (as expressed by three churches), ministry to children at-risk (as expressed by one church), empowerment through education (as expressed by two churches), facilitating income generating projects (expressed by two churches) and participating in an ecumenical cooperation for economic development (as expressed by one church). Based on the views of the church leaders, the praxis matrixes also show that these churches plan to be consistent in presenting the gospel in an integrated holistic manner in their contexts through practical community projects. Although they are not involved in big scale holistic faith projects, these churches visualise community service as an ongoing witness which could open-up possibilities for collective vision and ecumenical cooperation (as expressed by three churches).
6) Further, based on the views of the church leaders the praxis matrixes show that these churches reflect on the impacts and results of their ministries in communities on a regular basis and that these activities are mainly performed by their leaders individually or collectively. Lessons learned through these reflections have given them insights to correct mistakes and highlight new opportunities and challenges (as expressed by three churches) and overcome individualistic tendencies (as expressed by two churches). These reflections shape the approach of these churches in terms of seeking to be relevant to communities (as expressed by three churches) and explore new things (as expressed by two churches). The impact of reflections on praxis meant that ministry strategies are informed by the lessons learned (as expressed by three churches) and that the context has to be considered seriously (as expressed by two churches).

7) Finally, based on the views of the church leaders, the praxis matrixes reveal that these churches aspire to practise an integrated holistic spirituality which allows for a concomitant expression of word and deed as lived out in community. Yet, the dominant spirituality among them and their agents of change still leans more on the word and less on involvement in community issues. Nevertheless, they found inspiration and encouragement from their ministries that seek to form bridges through community services. Although they are slow to opt for concrete spirituality, they believe that focussing on the word of God is at the core of spirituality; it will yield to forms of spirituality that will impact communities for the better and foster ethical behaviours.

In relation to LED, the views expressed by church leaders on the praxis matrixes of these churches confirm, as earlier stated in Chapter 1, sections 1.7.2 and 1.7.8, show that these peripheral churches possess important assets such as physical and institutional structures, spiritual and moral foundations, access to deprived grassroots at-risk communities, contacts with public offices, cross-cultural relationships and predisposition to care for the poor. These assets can be further mobilised to generate vision, motivation and responsibility for a public theology in such a way that township churches become visible strategic participants in LED in Tshwane, even though they might have some weaknesses in their mission orientations.
5.7 Participant church leaders’ insights on their churches’ mission orientations

As stated under section 5.5, what I present here are impressions/views/interpretations of the five churches’ leaders who participated in these interviews. Their views are not enough for me to make valid observations and deductions. Nevertheless, from the findings of these interviews I gained some ideas which enhanced my understanding about the orientations and praxes of these churches.

Having presented and described the churches that participated in this research according to the views of church leaders using Kritzinger’s praxis matrix in the previous section, I undertook an analysis of their strengths, weaknesses and blind spots to establish their mission orientations. The insights presented by Roozen, McKinney and Carroll (1984:87) about the four different “mission orientations” that a religious community could have in society are used to further analyse these congregations. Kritzinger elaborates,

They (i.e. Roozen, McKinney and Carroll) look at how the worldview of a community (the question whether it is this-worldly or other-worldly in orientation) combines with the boundary-making activities of that community (the question whether they are membership-centred or publicly proactive) to produce four mission orientations, which they call a civic, sanctuary, activist and evangelistic orientation (Kritzinger 2013: 37).140

I applied these insights to help me establish whether the mission orientations of these churches would be suitable for LED or not. The four mission orientations are described in the following diagram:

**Boundary-making**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>This-worldly</strong></th>
<th><strong>Membership-centred</strong></th>
<th><strong>Publicly proactive</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Civic orientation</strong></td>
<td><strong>Activist orientation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Affirm existing social structures</td>
<td>• Stress justice and a critical posture to existing social structures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Stress civil harmony and avoidance of conflict</td>
<td>• Openness to involvement of</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

140 Kritzinger, JNJ, 2013. Integrated Theological Praxis, “Capstone” module, University of South Africa: Pretoria
Each church will now be scrutinised using these four mission orientations. Thereafter, together the strengths, weaknesses and blind spots of these churches will be discussed in relation to LED.

Based on the praxis matrix of the URCSA Soshanguve described by the church leader, we could establish that this church’s focus is on one hand this-worldly in that it interacts with the community on an ongoing basis. To some extent, its mission focus includes both elements of being member-centred (i.e. it encourages members to do community outreach which hints at civic orientation) and publicly proactive in that, through its integrated ministry model, it stresses justice and openness to involvement of its members in faith projects which suggests activist orientation. On the other hand, in the mix of these two focusses (members-centred and publicly proactive), this church also has an other-worldly perspective through its evangelistic orientation as they it carries out Christian education and evangelism in the community.
From the praxis of the ELCSA Soshanguve church described by the church leader, we could establish that this church’s focus has elements of both this-worldly and other-worldly perspectives. In relation to a this-worldly perspective, its members are expected to live as Christian witnesses in the community on moral issues and affirm social structures such as civic associations in its civic orientation. In its activist orientation, this church, through its diaconate ministry, is openly involved in social action such as adopting communities in need and providing psychosocial and spiritual support. In relation to an other-worldly perspective and with reference to its evangelistic orientation, this church attempts to present the gospel of Jesus for salvation.

Based on the current praxis matrix of Letlhabile Baptist church described by the leader we could establish that this church’s focus combines elements of this-worldly as well as other-worldly perspectives. In relation to the former perspective, through spiritual formation based on theological and biblical foundation in the word, this church expects its members to make decisions on moral issues by being informed by the Bible and to affirm existing social structures in its civic orientation. In its activist orientation, this church is involved in addressing challenges faced by children and the burden of old women in relation to child care. With reference to an other-worldly perspective, this church emphasises children’s evangelistic outreaches in primary schools of the community as part of its evangelistic orientation.

From the Hammanskraal Gospel Centre’s praxis matrix we could establish that this church’s focus is also a combination of this-worldly as well as other-worldly perspectives. In relation to the first perspective and within its civic orientation, this church affirms existing social structures such as other non-profit organisations while through its in-house Bible School, it focusses on character formation and training of Christian leaders of the area so that they make their own decisions on moral and social issues. With reference to its activist orientation, this church assesses and “studies” community needs in order to influence a practical vision for transformation in the area. In relation to an other-worldly perspective, this church has an openness to the Holy Spirit and emphasises evangelistic outreaches as one of the goals of its in-house Bible School.

Finally, the Body of Christ’s praxis matrix described by the church leader portrays that this church, although it proclaims the Bible, leans more towards a this-worldly perspective. In this regard, this church both civic and activist orientations. With regard to civic orientation, this church’s members are expected to live out as Christians among the people of the community in practical ways as models for ethical behaviours. In relation to activist orientation, this church is
involved in an income generating project for the elderly and is also participating in a local ecumenical cooperation for economic development. Its activist orientation is inspired by the Book of Nehemiah which leaders have adopted as a framework for reconstruction and transformation.

From the foregoing, it is clear that most of these churches, as described by church leaders, evidence both this-worldly and other-worldly perspectives of mission. In essence, they are witnesses for Christ in this world while they also point to the world to come. All these churches contain elements of civic orientation of mission in them, especially in relation to expectations that their members will live in communities as moral and ethical individuals. All these churches also display elements of activist orientation of mission as all of them are involved in various faith projects, albeit small initiatives, in their communities. Four of the five churches exhibit elements of evangelistic orientation of mission in terms of evangelistic outreaches aimed at conversion. Together, the mission orientations of these churches, as described by the church leaders, confirmed that these churches already possess certain assets which could prove to be building blocks for LED. These include their apparent activist orientation manifested in the faith projects in which they are currently engaged. Some elements, such as cooperation and affirmation of social structures in the civic orientation of these churches, could also prove to be assets for building sustainable societies that uphold God’s economy and rules, the oikos.

I would argue that all four elements (the this-worldly and other-worldly worldview and activist and civic orientations) of the congregations could contribute to upholding the household of God’s economic rules for a healthy spiritual-psychological-community activist organism to exist in the social ecology of society. All these would be necessary, and in a very special way the spiritual, – otherworldly aspects, which are the “life” and “breath” of a faith organisation in this world, do function more on the interaction of these elements in establishing the oikos. Generally, the practical expression of these local churches combines both the facilitation of persons’ connection with God’s resources for spiritual and eternal life and an expression in the social realm, mainly through community projects. This is good for a starting point but not enough to bring about LED, which is sustainable and equitable in the CoT (S & H). Nonetheless, they need to build on this by intentionally becoming activists of the planetary agenda described in Chapter 3 (section 3.3.2.4). The contributions of these congregations towards LED in Tshwane (S & H) should lead communities “to go back to respecting and living with the earth, in order to find long term solutions” (Van Schalkwyk 2008: 10) to the socioeconomic deprivations these communities currently face.
This following section offers an evaluation of the strengths, weaknesses and blind spots of these churches’ mission orientations in relation to LED.

5.8. Strengths, weaknesses and blind spots of the churches’ mission orientation

The historical background, the nature and identity of the church, praxis matrixes and mission orientations of the participant churches taken together drew attention to certain strengths, weaknesses and blind spots of the churches in this city in relation to LED. Before proceeding I reiterate that I based my observations and comments on the views of the church leaders who participated in this research and on the historical information about these churches.

5.8.1 Strengths

With reference to strengths emanating from historical realms, generally it must be acknowledged that events occurring after 1994 have paved the way for multidimensional reconciliation and healing in the country, including LED as a sector. Yet, as could be noticed in the praxis matrixes of these churches, they have not advanced any significant reconciliation and healing cause. The selective elements of mission orientations point to this fact as discussed under the heading of “weaknesses”. The fact that these churches have taken first steps in their activist orientations should be seen as a strength and the physical and human assets dedicated to this activism should be added here. Future efforts could be built upon these first steps in faith projects or hopeful actions. The rich heritage of the church’s involvement in social activism in this country and the world over is also a strength which could inspire these churches, especially the missionary initiated churches, to draw from their “own wells”.

These churches boast assets which constitute valuable strengths, such as spiritual and moral foundations, access to the most deprived grassroots communities in Tshwane (S & H), members in government and cross-cultural relationships. They also possess physical facilities such as pieces of land and building facilities, which are crucial for LED in addition to being located in areas with an impoverished physical infrastructure (roads, access to water, electricity and public facilities such as schools, clinics and community halls) (see Chapter 4, points 4.3.3.1 & 4.3.3.2). Unfortunately, these churches still have to devise ways of maximising these assets for LED in Tshwane (S & H).
In relation to the *oikos*, the strengths of these churches must be used in ways which respect the integrity of creation, the “whole household of God” (see section 3.3.2.6). With the integrity of creation in mind, these strengths should enable the churches to engage in “hopeful actions” which are “liberating”.

### 5.8.2 Weaknesses

Generally, the fragmentation of the church in the CoT (S& H) is a major weakness, rendering it very difficult to carry out collective action. Although post 1994 we have witnessed reconciliation of many denominations that used to be divided on racial lines, it is premature to conclude that the fragmentation of the church in South Africa in general and in Tshwane in particular is reversed. Roy elaborates;

The spirit of reconciliation manifested in gatherings such as that at Rustenburg as well as in the country as a whole, has led to a growing movement of unity between some churches. The three ‘daughter’ churches of the DRC (originally established for the Coloured, Black and Indian communities) joined together in 1994 as the Uniting Reformed Church. This new denomination was engaged in unity discussions with the ‘mother’ DRC in 1999. Despite some difficulties over the adoption of a new confession, both bodies expressed a commitment to the goal of unity. The various branches of the Apostolic Faith Mission, also ethnically based, came together in what was celebrated as the ‘The great Pentecostal reconciliation.’ The predominantly white Baptist Union and the black Baptist Convention both pledged themselves in 1998 to engage in discussions towards a merger of the two bodies. The Presbyterian Church of Southern Africa and the Reformed Presbyterian Church in Southern Africa took formal decisions at their respective General Assemblies, held in 1998, to unite (Roy 2000: 200 – 201).

Nevertheless, the fragmentation of the church in South Africa is further manifested in the number of new and separate church denominations that have surfaced post 1994, especially those being initiated by African leaders who have no affiliation with mainline churches.

---

141 Rustenburg Consultation of the Dutch Reformed family of churches that took place in 1994 to discuss the question about unity between the ‘sister’ churches amongst the Afrikaners and unification between the DRC and URSCA (see also [http://repository.up.ac.za/xmlui/bitstream/handle/2263/28959/Complete.pdf?sequence=8&isAllowed=y](http://repository.up.ac.za/xmlui/bitstream/handle/2263/28959/Complete.pdf?sequence=8&isAllowed=y) accessed 19 February 2016.)
This fragmentation of the Body of Christ is a vivid reality in townships of S and H and represents a significant weakness. Two of the research participating churches have no formal links with established denominations while the other three are daughter churches of so called mainline churches, the Soshanguve Uniting Reformed Church, the Soshanguve Evangelical Lutheran Church and Letlhabele Baptist Church, yet they enjoy little meaningful fellowship with their resource-rich mother churches. Here I refer to the type of multidimensional fellowship which builds the capacity of daughter churches in addressing issues of their context, such as LED. The church has failed to be a multidimensional Koinonia\textsuperscript{142} (koinonia relationships denote that God, the church and the world all live and move and have their being in a series of constructive relationships), which constitutes a major weakness. The multidimensional koinonia is also essential for the household of God (oikos) which thrives where recognition and restoration of relations between human and nonhuman inhabitants of the planet exist. In other words, the household of God requires that there is multidimensional koinonia. If there were such a koinonia, for example, resources of wealthy Baptist, Lutheran and Reformed churches in the suburbs of the CoT could be available to these churches in the townships for LED initiatives aimed at creating employment and self-reliance. Instead, these churches in suburbia, if involved in community development initiatives of township churches at all, tend to promote relief and charity as used to be the case with Letlhabele Baptist in the 1990s. Consequently, informal and formal processes for community development spend their energies superficially on symptoms while root causes of economic inequalities that breed poverty, unemployment and injustice remain unaddressed. Expending energy and resources on symptoms constitutes an overriding weakness for the churches that participated in this research, as indicated in their praxis matrixes.

While it is good to provide child care relief for elderly people at Refentse as is the case with Letlhabele Baptist, the systemic economic issues that force young parents to leave their children to be raised by grandparents remain unchallenged, and will continue for generations to come. It is worthwhile to have an income generating project as in the case of the Body of Christ Ministry in Lepengville, but as long as issues pertaining to the promotion of local goods are not

\textsuperscript{142} I owe this insight to Theresa F. Latini in her book entitled The Church and the Crisis of Community. A practical Theology of Small Group Ministry. 2011. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans Publishing Co. P75 -97. Latini uses multidimensional Koinonia to denote multidimensional union and communion of the greatest possible intimacy and integrity. This koinonia constitutes the being of God, the church, all humanity, even the cosmos. It defines the identity of the church and orders all its practice. Koinonia is multidimensional when it comprises five interlocking relationships: (1) the Koinonia of the Trinity; (2) the Koinonia of the Incarnate Son, Jesus Christ; (3) the koinonia between Christ and the church; (4) the koinonia among church members; and (5) the koinonia between the church and the world.
addressed, this initiative will be under constant threat. Adopting of at-risk communities such as orphans and the aged as in the case of the Lutheran Church in Soshanguve is important but this initiative would be strengthened should socioeconomic and political issues that breed vulnerability, marginalisation and exclusion also be addressed. In short, focussing solely on relief and charity is a weakness for these churches located in context of need in the CoT (S & H).

In relation to these participating churches I deduce that the church has failed to be the embodiment of multidimensional *Koinonia* because she endeavours internally to do pastoral care, Christian education, worship and stewardship; while neglecting her “ultimate outward purpose which is to be on mission with God to the world “(cf. Bosch 1991). The “local church is – or ought to be – a family, a local expression of the worldwide family of God, whose members regard, love, and treat one another as brothers and sisters” (Stott 2003: 82). I argue therefore that by its very nature, the church is born, lives and ministers in the spirit of *koinonia*. Further, *koinonia* resonates with the precepts of ecology. McFague’s model of the Body, “which includes all life forms: indeed, all matter on our planet (as well as in the entire universe)” (McFague 1997: 17) and which “gives us both an ecological and a justice context for theology” (McFague 1997: 22) can only take shape where *koinonia* prevails. Thus public worship is the encounter with the risen Redeemer with his people, evangelism is calling human beings to recognise the Saviour, publishing God’s law is proclaiming his lordship; Christian nurture is feeding his lambs and disciplining his flock; ministering to people’s needs is continuing the work of the Great Physician. All these acts of mission are performed or supposed to be in fellowship with God, the church and the world (i.e. *koinonia*).

Pieterse’s distinctions of the church as an organism and the church as an organisation (Pieterse 1993: 158) discussed in Chapter 1 is helpful in clarifying the different functions of the church on mission with God, i.e. pastoral and social functions. The former help the church to be in fellowship with God and its members, while the latter aid the church to be in fellowship with the world. The social functions are important to facilitate the necessary impact of the pastoral functions. These two sets of functions are integrally related to each other. My evaluation of these churches’ functions reveals an imbalance in that they attach more weight to pastoral ones and less to social functions. This is a significant blind spot which has to be addressed so that these township churches can become assets of substance for LED in Tshwane (S & H).
5.8.3 Blind spots

Having discussed the strengths and weaknesses of these churches’ mission orientations and praxes, this section points out certain blind spots, in other words, subjects about which these churches seem to be ignorant or biased. These include, amongst others: majoring on member-centred pastoral functions, the church being a divided church, a lack of synergy between the clergy and laity, a mismatch between programmes and resources and the local context not being taken seriously.

5.8.3.1 Focus only on member-centred pastoral functions

I observed that these churches are more comfortable with pastoral functions which benefit their congregants but cannot position themselves to shepherd entire communities where they are located. This is so because they seem to be weak in integrating the pastoral as well as social functions. As a result, these churches are unable to live in fellowship and solidarity with the poor, regardless of the fact that they are located amidst the poor. Consequently, 1) the image and identity of the church is blurred and perceived as a self-centred institution, and 2) her assets (see Chapter 1) do not serve to transform and liberate society. In relation to the struggling parts of Tshwane such as Pretoria Central and the townships, Rabe and Lombaard are accurate in their remarks [that] “the needs in poor communities demand attention from religious sources, in fact overwhelmingly the resources available to clergy” (Rabe and Lombaard 2011(2): 243). With particular reference to churches in S and H, the reality captured by Rabe and Lombard calls for multidimensional koinonia where sharing of resources takes place for the collective good of communities, which is currently lacking.

On one hand the oikos concept is helpful in addressing this shortage on the part of the church and clergy in Tshwane in particular whereas on the other, it reinforces the notion of multidimensional Koinonia. The oikos views every sector of society as interrelated in God’s economy. Thus “the rules that God has established for our household, the world in which people live, work, struggle, flourish and die” (The Oikos Journey 2006: 24) should be the rules of ministry in order for the church to fulfil both her pastoral and social functions.
5.8.3.2 A divided church

A divided church is both a weakness and a blind spot; the fragmentation of the church into class lends itself to the church in the centre having little concern for the church on the periphery and vice versa.

The class system is apparent for instance in the way that two congregations of the same church community choose to carry out both pastoral and social functions among people on the margins of the city for example. This, I argue, emanates from the manner in which one church perceives the reality of society in terms of the class strata it belongs to. In my past experience as the denominational national leader of a development and compassionate ministry, I have seen churches from poverty-stricken areas such as townships being keener to initiate self-help projects – small community projects geared to meeting immediate basic needs – for survival. Their counterparts in the suburbia, if they wish to address issues of poverty, opt to do so in an environment where risk is substantially reduced and through partnerships with resourceful entities. It is clear that township churches are associated with lower socio-economic sectors of the population whose main preoccupation is survival to meet basic needs. The suburban churches are associated with higher socio-economic sectors of the population whose emphasis is on strategic partnerships.

The oikos concept is also helpful here in that it perceives the whole household of God as one: all the inhabitants of this household are in an interdependent relationship for survival and prosperity. Division in the church must be addressed by fostering this notion of interdependence as in the oikos.

5.8.3.3 Lack of synergy between the clergy and laity

As could be observed in the praxis matrixes of three participant churches (i.e. Letlhabile, Hammanskraal Gospel Centre and the Body of Christ), as described by the church leaders, directives and initiatives for eventual community ministry come from the elders and clergy in a somewhat disjointed manner. The clergy has the say which drives the process as its members claim to speak on behalf of their congregations. The laity is expected to implement initiatives of which they were not part, from conception. This lack of cooperation results in a poor prognosis for an eventual community ministry. The fact that these churches continue to hold on to the concept of clergy versus laity as far as ministry in the community is concerned constitutes a
significant blind spot. This, further, plays itself out in visualising some ministries such as preaching and teaching the gospel, undertaken by the clergy, as sacred and diaconal ministries, but when performed by the laity, as non-sacred. Worse still, clergy ministries are allocated a budget while the diakonia ministries have to do with donations.

Here again we could learn from the household rules of God where all inhabitants contribute to the livelihood of the whole creation in harmony with the rest of the inhabitants: “…no one field of expertise or effort, let alone any person or group of people, has the preeminent or only voice” (McFague 1993: 12). The church could learn from this to foster synergy and cooperation in its ranks for collective wellbeing.

5.8.3.4 Mismatch between programmes and resources

The mismatch between programmes and resources is another blind spot observed in relation to these churches. For instance, three participant churches (i.e. URCSA, ELCSA and Letlhabile Baptist) own well fenced property with borehole water in the yard, yet none of them have initiated a viable agricultural project, which has the potential to become a small business in those contexts. Further, all these churches possess building facilities of considerable decency yet the use of these facilities is not maximised. With the exception of Letlhabile, these facilities remain locked 3 – 4 days a week.

This mismatch could be also related to a lack of strategic vision for local transformation, which seems to be the case for these participant churches. A strong aspect is that churches so often do not realise how much they in a real sense, in God’s economy, are / should be part of the greater earth – oikos – of good and how they should both use and take care of the earth and her resources.

5.8.3.5 The local context not being taken seriously

Another obvious blind spot of these churches is neglecting to take community issues seriously in their respective contexts, even though they are aware of these (see 4.5 & 4.6). Being aware is not the same as being engaged in facilitating solutions to community challenges. The praxes of these churches seem to suggest that these churches are hesitant to step into the public community space as catalysts of change. As a result, none of them has a public contextual praxis which could foster social justice in the face of unemployment and socioeconomic injustice.
prevalent in their immediate contexts. It appears as if these churches are not adequately being “people who represent God to the world” (Wright 2010: 114-127) and they are not adequately building the church-household as part of the societal household, in oikos terms.

Together, these blind spots and weaknesses negative impact on the churches’ relevancy in these contexts.

5.9. Contemporary relevance and Ministry

Given the socioeconomic, historical and political context of injustice and poverty that are realities in townships, as discussed in Chapter 3, including the weaknesses and blind spots associated with the churches as described by the church leaders who participated in this research, the issue of ministry relevance is an important one. I surmise that the contexts of S and H will greatly benefit from churches that think: 1) beyond dependency by developing their own economic engines to sustain them, 2) beyond charity by initiating socioeconomic and agricultural, long term sustainable development programmes that restore the livelihood of the oikos, 3) beyond escapist theologies by stepping into the public community space to develop public contextual theologies for social justice, 4) beyond clergy versus laity restraints by developing an integrated shared ministry which mobilises all assets of the church and community for collective wellbeing and 5) beyond despair by drawing and applying biblical frameworks for the economy such as the oikos.

However, looking at the praxes of these churches as described by the church leaders, they are deficient in these five considerations. As a result, they fail to become relevant in their community, except in pastoral functions.

Further, contemporary relevance and ministry of the township churches could be framed, among others, around four biblical themes discussed in Chapter 4 i.e.: 1) God’s preferential option for the poor, 2) God acts in history to pull down the mighty and the rich, 3) economic justice and 4) biblical understanding of wealth. Later, in Chapters 8 & 9, these themes are discussed in relation to the hermeneutic key for this research, that is, the oikos or God’s rules for the economy. They are briefly described hereunder while assuming that when these themes are considered by the participant churches, this will make them relevant in their immediate contexts.
5.9.1 God’s preferential option for the poor

Inspiration for this theme may be drawn from the book of Exodus and the incarnation, the main thought being the fact God acted because he saw the plight of the oppressed. He acted in history to lift up the poor. These churches have to start opting for the poor. This commitment for the poor has to derive from the “God of our faith” (Gutierrez 1988: 14) who is the God who cares for the poor (Sider 1990: 46-63, Linthicum 1991: 90-94).

In relation to Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, these churches will become relevant if they opt for poor people by working in such ways that those local institutions, citizen associations and gifts of individuals are reformed for the benefit of the poor who are trapped in poverty and unemployment in these townships.

5.9.2 God acts in history to pull down the mighty and the rich

Inspiration for this theme could be drawn from James 5: 1 and the Magnificat, with an understanding that being weak is not “bad”. Other scriptures such as: Jeremiah 5, Isaiah 3, Amos, Jeremiah 22, Matthew. 25 speak about God who acted for the benefit of the weak. This issue has also to deal with the issue of social sin manifested in structural injustice (see Amos 2, Psalms 94: 20, Isaiah 10 and Amos 5). Hence, to be relevant, these township churches cannot withdraw from city spaces where powerful people are at work, but they need to become witnesses in order to defeat power in its evil forms and co-work with God for the wellbeing of all people in the CoT (S & H) and the rest of creation.

For these churches in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, this means dealing with issues of justice, specifically with systems of social production, distribution, possession, and consumption (Brueggemann 1994: 175).

5.9.3 Economic justice

God’s rules for the economy (the oikos) provide insights for economic justice. Key issues such as land (as a fundamental basic capital) and regulations about protection of the poor as instructed in Sabbatical restitution, Jubilee law and “practical, social and very down-to-earth” holiness described in Leviticus 19 should be at the centre of the economy.

143 Italics in original
With particular reference to these churches in S and H, working or advocating for economic generosity, economic justice in employment rights, social compassion to the weak, neighbourly attitudes and behaviours and commercial honesty in all trading transactions, while including ecological long-term sustainability as a justice issue, to name but a few, will enable them to address issues that matter in those townships.

5.9.4 Biblical understanding of wealth

God’s economic rules are concerned with the material wealth of communities as well as God's concern for the poor. In God’s economy, the emphasis is on shared wealth which ultimately leads to shared prosperity. The biblical understanding of wealth goes beyond the “assumption that for poor people only material things matter” (McKibben 2007: 218).

5.10. Resources and potential for community building

Regardless of the weaknesses, blind spots and difficulties of these township churches, it is apparent that they have the basic resources and potential for community building. It requires creative imagination to discern how to become agents of God’s good news of the kingdom in the townships of S and H. Fundamentally, this process includes vertical and horizontal commitment embodied in God's good news of the kingdom. With reference to horizontal commitment, contextual issues related to economy, walking with the poor, lived biblical faith, social capital (mobilising the social capital from below and from the top) should be considered for the purpose of socioeconomic justice and transformation. On the other hand, the vertical commitment will enable these churches to continue to proclaim the good news of the kingdom of God in Jesus' name within their congregations and in public spheres of communities’ lives.

Other available resources they could tap into, which could inspire these churches to work for community building, include mission documents such as: Together Towards Life of the World Council of Churches (2013), Evangelii Gaudium written by Pope Francis (2013), the 2010 Lausanne Declaration of the World Evangelical Fellowship (2010), Micah Challenge (2004) and the holistic model of Christian Community Development Association (2009). These resources provide frameworks, Bible-based rationales and insights to Christian Communities for involvement in addressing poverty and socioeconomic injustice in the world today. These resources could indeed be helpful to local townships of Tshwane (S & H) determined to work for transformation. Further, Christians, members of these churches who are engaged in politics,
should be mobilised to promote a biblically balanced view of the principles of the good news of the kingdom of God in the public sphere. In addition to teaching such a view, local pastors and preachers have the responsibility of providing contextual preaching geared to build communities. However, as these churches mobilise their resources and potential for community building they must guard themselves against political groups who will always try to co-opt the church into their agenda.

With specific reference to the economy, these township churches must highlight the fact that there is a prevailing injustice embedded into the current economic system. Therefore, the churches are required to advocate for the need for the right kinds of programmes to redistribute wealth, i.e. to place an emphasis on sharing which complies with God’s rules of the economy. These churches must work, in partnership with other role players, for the empowerment of the poor to reach the point where they own the capital needed for their own development. In short, these churches are called to mobilise all their assets, resources and potential to ignite and drive socioeconomic change within and in the public sphere of the life of the communities of S and H. Lastly, it must be borne in mind that economic injustice/justice issues can only be dealt with successfully within a long-term ecological sustainability as a justice issue framework. The oikos concept could inspire the churches to work both for social justice and ecological justice; thus they could become real beacons of hope in S and H.

5.11. Conclusion of chapter

In this chapter, it was highlighted that based on historical development, the churches in S and H are still diversified; indeed, some are deeply rooted in the culture of their European forefathers.

In terms of nature, identity and characteristics of the churches in Tshwane, this chapter pointed to “the disconnect” which exists in many cases between the theological approach of congregations and concrete community realities wherever they are located. This could be rooted in the theological formation of their leaders. Regardless of the fact that they are able to use vernacular languages in preaching and worship, their theology still uses westerners’ lenses and resources.

With reference to faith and culture, this chapter has shown that the Church in Tshwane evolved along language, customs, race and class lines, even if congregations were from the same denomination. As a result, the “twin cities” effect highlighted in Chapter 4 manifests itself also in
the church, where for example a missionary initiated congregation in the township will not be treated as equal to its sister congregation in the city. The missionary initiated churches of S and H that participated in this research, for example, did not enjoy equality with their mother-churches in the suburbia of Tshwane. Their spiritual needs were met in a “special way” (i.e. different way) through mission outreaches.

As a result, in any given denomination, in Tshwane, especially among missionary churches there are still two streams, invisible in some cases, one white and one black. The black stream is located mainly in the townships and the white in suburbia. There is also a noticeable difference in the theological approach of these two streams. This is observed in the different ways of worship, prayer, fellowship, funerals and responding to community needs.

In the context of this research, the ecclesiastical formations discussed still bear the legacy of a class system rooted in the Apartheid past. Churches in the suburbia of Tshwane that benefited are wealthy and comfortable while those in townships, with Africans in the majority, still struggle to survive. The latter minister to people on the margins and lack financial resources to sustain their work; as a result, most of their leaders are self-supporting. Their counterparts in the suburbia are well resourced and minister to middle class communities. Yet, there is little multidimensional koinonia happening between them.

In relation to LED, the praxis matrixes of these township churches as described by the church leaders confirm that these peripheral churches have important assets such as physical and institutional structures, spiritual and moral foundations and access to deprived grassroots and at-risk communities, contacts with public offices, cross-cultural relationships and a predisposition to care for the poor. These assets can be further mobilised to generate vision, motivation and responsibility for a public theology in such a way that township churches become relevant and visible strategic participants in LED in Tshwane even though they might have some weaknesses and blind spots in their mission orientations.

Therefore, this chapter suggested the consideration of four biblical themes, amongst others, which could steer these churches into becoming relevant in township’s economy: 1) God’s preferential option for the poor, 2) God acts in history to pull down the mighty and the rich, 3) economic justice and 4) biblical understanding of wealth.

The next chapter provides narrative accounts about LED in Tshwane (S & H) as perceived and experienced by these communities.
Chapter six

NARRATIVE ACCOUNTS OF LED IN CoT FROM SEPARATE FOCUS GROUPS

Building on insights gained in chapters 4 and 5 concerning contextual socioeconomic, political and historical analyses as well as praxis matrixes and mission orientations of the churches as described by the church leaders, this chapter concentrates on the narrative accounts of participants in relation to LED in the City of Tshwane (S & H). Focus group discussions, referred to here as mini-consultations, were used to facilitate this conversation. The planning and implementation of these mini-consultations were carried out as explained in Chapter 1 (see 1.8.3.1).

6.1 Introduction

6.1.1 Development of instrument and data collection

I have adapted the practical methodology outlined by Holland and Henriot (1983: 95 -105) on undertaking social analysis. With research participants, the approach followed included six phases which loosely concur with the phases of the commonly known Pastoral Cycle: insertion, analysis, theological reflection and planning for action. I also adapted the same questions developed by Holland and Henriot (1983) to guide the social analysis. In this way the whole process was coherent and structured. In total we held three focus group sessions, referred to here as mini-consultations; these were facilitated by means of a narrative method. The latter complements the experiential / insertion-based pastoral cycle in that it “orients itself toward understanding human complexity, especially in those cases where the many variables that contribute to human life cannot be controlled” (Josselson 2010: 870) as is the case with LED experience in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal.

The aim of the mini-consultations was to conduct qualitative research, hearing the stories and experiences of selected local church leaders, community members and local business representatives across the City of Tshwane, particularly as these related to Soshanguve (S) and
Hammanskraal (H) townships. The focus group sessions were partly structured, thus allowing for flexibility within the framework. Most of the questions were open ended, providing participants ample opportunity to explain what was happening in the area of LED as it impacted the people of the townships and the church. Questions were also designed to elicit responses related to various approaches presently applied, and what the joint group recommended as an appropriate way forward (see 1.8.3.1.3).

A covering letter (Appendix D) was prepared in advance and was sent to the main leader of each participating local church. With regard to community members and local business representatives this letter was distributed directly to each of them. Subsequently, they (leaders of local churches, community members and businessmen) were contacted and focus group meetings were set for the dates agreed upon. A “pilot” focus group was conducted at the beginning of field research to ascertain the suitability of the questions schedule, after which some minor adjustments were made to the focus group questions.

The focus group sessions were conducted in English. The participants are individuals who speak English competently; however they were also given freedom to express themselves in a vernacular if necessary to provide anecdotal or proverb type inputs in conversations. Sessions were divided into three mini-consultations (i.e. 1 separately for each group and 2 joint consultations). In this chapter, I focus on mini-consultation 1. It is worthwhile noting that equal participation in the group was allowed for youth and women, and that they could express their specific views throughout.

The focus group participants included some pastors of the participating churches and leaders of ministries (men’s ministries, women’s ministries, youth ministries and pastoral ministries) in their local churches and leaders in the community and in the local business sector. Unfortunately, for various reasons including ministry commitments some of the senior pastors of these churches could not attend all of the sessions. Such was the case with the leaders of Bethel, Evangelical Lutheran and the Uniting Reformed Church.

The selection of participating leaders was based on their experience, ministry role and insights related to LED in townships such as S and H. Put together, the focus group participants shared
stories and experiences pertaining to LED from various perspectives, i.e. socioeconomic and historical, ecclesiastical, political and administrative, as well as from the gender perspective.

With particular reference to gender perspectives, the women participated actively, sharing specific perspectives from their experiences as women, homemakers, employed/unemployed, and clarified that they are affected by many of the same economic forces that hold back so many youth and men, but in a specific way, as they often also bear a double burden as homemakers and caretakers of family members as well as having to be breadwinners. My observations in S and H’s new settlements are similar to research findings which have established that

Women and girls are disproportionately affected by the poor living conditions of urban slums and the substandard housing as they spend more time in the home and community caring for their families. Women’s health and security is a major issue in urban informal settlements as they are exposed to poor sanitation conditions, security risks, increased sexual violence, and the impact of disasters such as floods and fire outbreaks (UNFPA State of World Population 2015: 34).

These participants and the communities they represent live and experience LED positively or negatively on a daily basis in their contexts. These lived experiences and shared stories enabled us to understand the realities and the impact of LED on the townships of S and H and on the church. Through this narrative approach we aimed for an in-depth exploration of the meanings people assign to their experiences (Josselson 2010: 870) in relation to LED.

The average duration of the sessions was approximately 120 minutes excluding tea and lunch breaks. Each focus group participant agreed to having their input recorded and to my quoting any part of the focus group accounts freely in this thesis. They also gave consent to be named after each input given. Participants’ inputs were communicated clearly and precisely by respecting the richness of their contributions and by telling their stories fluently and accurately. The researcher’s syntheses of inputs feature after each phase to highlight the meaning and the importance of the findings.

---

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781412961288.n259
6.1.2 Data display/presentation

I have chosen to present the data thematically. I have used the key focus group questions as an appropriate framework, and include many of the answers given by the participants to relevant questions. What is recorded here constitutes the second step of the qualitative data analysis process. In the first step I listened repeatedly to the digitally recorded focus group accounts then transcribed the material and stored it in my computer. After that, I selected and reduced the information gleaned into categories appropriate for this thesis, with particular attention to the research question and sub-questions and hypothesis presented in Chapter 1. Therefore, not every answer given by the participant is recorded here, neither is every comment or example included.

However, “reports of narrative research privilege the words of the participants, in what Clifford Geertz calls ‘thick description,’ and present both some of the raw data of the text as well as the analysis” (Josselson 2010: 872). Hence, the inclusion of many instances of unaltered verbatim quotations in this text. The purpose in including such quotations within the main constructs was, as the matter of this enquiry, to deepen understanding; to give participants a voice, and to enhance readability (Corden & Sainsbury 2006: 11).

In reporting the findings I used textual representation of excerpts from transcripts of the narrative account alongside my own interpretation and commentary on those excerpts. Sharing the participant’s words in the context of this participatory research approach is important because the group interview (focus group) is a process of joint production of meaning. Typically, “a fairly long excerpt from the transcript (…) is offered to the reader, and the researcher’s narrative then attempts to unpick the meaning, within the theme of the research” (Corden & Sainsbury 2006: 11). In addition, I used indentation techniques or embedded phrases and sentences within their own prose in the presentation of the narrative accounts (Corden & Sainsbury 2006: 19).

I have, however, been thorough in recording the data and in “keeping the voice of participants alive” which I consider to be relevant to the research problem. There is much here which serves to answer my central research question and sub-questions, going some way towards proving this thesis’ hypothesis and also having a bearing on potential future studies related to this topic.

---

6.2 Mini-consultation one

This mini-consultation was divided into two sessions: the first focused on phase one (insertion) and the second session on phase two (description). Mini-consultation 1 was conducted once in Stinkwater for the Hammanskraal group on 11th January 2014 from 9:30 – 13:30 and once in Winterveld for the Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 from 11:30 – 15:30 (See 1.8.3.1.1). The lists of participants are recorded in the appendixes.

Tea, cold drinks and water were available during the entire session so that participants could help themselves whenever they needed to.

This mini-consultation included two sessions.

6.2.1 FIRST SESSION

Phase one – Insertion

I began the social analysis using the focus group method with certain theological presuppositions. I informed the groups that I possess values and biases that come from the Bible, my faith and the tradition of my church community. I also told them I would use a specific hermeneutic key to these faith resources, namely the oikos concept. I explained to them how I understand the concept of LED in this research; the hypothesis and central research question (see Chapter 1). The topic was then introduced by a quote from The Oikos Journey (2006:22-23):

From the outset, I explained the central concept of Oikos as household (and translated it into SePedi as diphutelwane tsa motse) so that people could identify it with their concept of household, home, economy. Secondly; I told the group about the document The Oikos Journey, and gave them the background information on this document and where it came from. I did this to acknowledge – in front of the group – the history of this document of which I and the groups would depend on so heavily in these sessions and highlighted in particular where it comes from, and how it sets an example to this project.
Churchgoers feel that the sphere of economics lies outside their competence. Even though Jesus spoke more about money than he did about prayer, we continue to propagate the error that the Christian faith does not deal with economics, but only with 'spiritual' matters. Yet we can and must think theologically about economics.

Together, we need to gather the necessary biblical and theological resources to engage the Tshwane (S & H) economics from the perspective of the *oikos* concept, which can further be explained as “God’s economy”. This theological concept, *oikos*, formed our values and hermeneutical lens through which we looked at the Tshwane economy and LED. Drawing from the document *The Oikos Journey: a theological reflection on the economic crisis in South Africa* written by “The Oikos Study Group” of the Diakonia Council of Churches (2006: 23), we focused on a Greek word in the New Testament i.e. “*oikos*” which was defined earlier in section 1.8.3.1.2.

We used the scriptural base outlined by *The Oikos Journey* (2006: 25 – 30) for a Bible study of “God’s economy” mentioned earlier in section 1.8.3.1.2. This Bible study gave contents and meaning to our understanding of the term *oikos* as well as giving us some quite concretely described values which guided us through these focus group sessions and the rest of the study.

In our focus groups, we started off by wrestling with the following questions:

**Question 1 (with the Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)**

The profile of the participants as summarised in Table 6.1 below, provides an idea of the interlocutors of this focus group.

It was with the help of Revs Christian Rustof (Letlhabele Baptist Church), Aristocrina Phiri (Hammanskraal Gospel Centre) and Pastor Megala (Body of Christ) that I was able to gather this group together to participate in the research. I had the impression that this group got along

---

147 Stinkwater is a semi-rural area with self-built houses and newly developed RDP homes. It was formalised into a township nearly three years ago. At Stinkwater, although water reticulation was done in some parts, residents say there is an irregular water supply and they have no choice but to buy water from those with *dipitsi*, or traditional boreholes. Most people suffer because of unemployment. Residents say their reliance on unclean water sources has led to a rise in diarrhoea cases among the area’s children. (See [http://www.health-e.org.za/2014/02/12/tshwane-residents-forced-buy-unclean-water/](http://www.health-e.org.za/2014/02/12/tshwane-residents-forced-buy-unclean-water/) accessed on 24 February 2016). Much of this mentioned already
very well with each other and engaged intensely with the issues related to the local economy. Although some participants did not participate much verbally, through their body language such as nodding of their heads, they signalled to me that they were in agreement with the accounts given by their peers. This group was also very animated, especially on issues related to “tenderpreneurs”.

As a moderator / facilitator of the group discussion I complied with the processes stated under section 1.8.3.1.2 in Chapter 1, and from time to time I invited participation from members who seemed a bit reticent to speak.

Table 6.1: Focus group participants of Hammanskraal group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Name &amp; Surname</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Economic occupation</th>
<th>Affiliation/ ministry</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Harry Golele</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Tuck-shopkeeper</td>
<td>LBC (yp)</td>
<td>36-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>B Ndhlovu</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>LBC (md)</td>
<td>46-50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Nelly Makena</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Employed (ICT)</td>
<td>LBC (yd)</td>
<td>26-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Vusi Dlamini</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Tuck-shopkeeper</td>
<td>BoC (yd)</td>
<td>31-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>George Matjeke</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Small businessman owner</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>36-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Hezekiel Moeti</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>HGC (yd)</td>
<td>31-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Joel Khomo</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>BoC (md)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Christian Rustof</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>LBC (sp)</td>
<td>36-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Rustof</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Preschool teacher</td>
<td>LBC (wd)</td>
<td>31-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Aristorica Phiri</td>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>HGC (sp)</td>
<td>51-55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Gladys Phiri</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Informal trade</td>
<td>HGC wd)</td>
<td>46-50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What does the term “economy” mean for ordinary church people in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal? How do they see it operating (functioning) and how do they participate in its operation?

Research participant groups raised a number of points which they believe are associated with “economy”. Ms Makena of the Hammanskraal group said that the word implies that we should grow (Makena, 11 January 2014). Messrs Dlamini, Golele and Matjeke agreed with her. It is also about education for the children and for everyone especially for the elderly because most of our people are not educated (Mr Dlamini, 11 January 2014). Further, we are talking about infrastructure development (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014), and growth in terms of wealth, employment and education (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014). Most importantly, it is associated with sharing wealth and economy as a means for further social development (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

How do they see it operating (functioning) and how do they participate in its operation? (Sub-question)

With reference to how they (church people) participate in the economic operation, various participants said the following: I don’t see the church contributing anything because the church is not invited; political parties are the ones benefitting (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014). The
church does not know (Mr Dlamini, 11 January 2014) about the community development plans hence the church is not involved (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014). Mr Matjeke strongly feels that the churches are the “lost dogs” in the economy of Tshwane. You will find the church being harassed by the same CoT … So the church, we are not involved in the economy of Tshwane (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014). Nonetheless, some participants stated that as the church, we would like to be involved because it is the church that builds the community. The church is the one that builds good families. Good families contribute to good villages (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014). In support of this, Ndlovu said; if the church does not build good families, we will have criminals (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014). Further, Mr Golele submitted that we as members of the church if we can share the wealth, share the knowledge, gain education we think we can develop our economy (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014) as we work together to develop our area (Mss Makena, 11 January 2014).

Question 1 (with the Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 at Winterveldt)

The profile of the participants, as summarised below in Table 6.2 gives one an idea of the interlocutors of this focus group.

Table 6.2: Focus group participants of Soshanguve group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Name &amp; Surname</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Economic occupation</th>
<th>Affiliation/ministry</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Stanley Mokone</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Pastor of youth</td>
<td>ELCSAs (yp)</td>
<td>25-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Patricia Mashigo</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Street vendor</td>
<td>BRC (wd)</td>
<td>36-40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

148 ‘Lost dogs’: local expression to mean people who are marginalised in a system.
149 Winterveldt is an informal settlement, north of Pretoria. Infrastructure-wise, it is currently being upgraded to ensure this neglected community is transformed into a sustainable human settlement. Winterveldt had been neglected for decades because of apartheid spatial development plans. "It is one of the areas that have been kept at the periphery of what is generally regarded as development and progress. Consequently, decay and rot became synonymous with this settlement," said the former Premier of Gauteng Nomvula Mokonyane (http://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/winterveldt-set-major-revamp accessed 24 February 2016).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First Name</th>
<th>Last Name</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Church</th>
<th>Age Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Tiny Chauke</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>URCSAs (wd)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Charmaine Masase</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>URCSAs (yd)</td>
<td>25-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>L A Masenya</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>URCSAs (md)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Johnny Ndlovana</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Small businessman owner</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>30-34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Lydia Maswangani</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Pensioner</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>&gt;65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Winnie Mathebula</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>25-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>A M Madibane</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>BRC (md)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>I Chimuti</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>ELCSAs (md)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:
- ELCSAs (Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa - Soshanguve)
- BRC (Bethel Revival Centre)
- URCSAs (Uniting Reformed Church in South Africa - Soshanguve)
- Md (men’s department)
- Wd (women’s department)
- Yd (youth department)
- Yp (youth pastor)

What does the term “economy” mean for ordinary church people in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal? How do they see it operating (functioning) and how do they participate in its operation?

The Soshanguve group said:
Economy is about management of resources and wealth. It is about people sharing probably ideas on how to lead decent life in general. They stated that when we speak about economic issues at church level, it is probably # 1 about management, #2 about employment, #3 about seeing people grow in church financially (because the church can’t run without finances) (The whole group, 12 January 2014).

One participant stated that for him economy for ordinary people means growth in church financially (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014).

How do they see it operating (functioning) and how do they participate in its operation? (Sub-question)

With reference to the operation of the economy and how the church people could participate, firstly participants highlighted issues which they believe hamper the operation. Ms Masase feels that in Soshanguve; we don’t manage our resources and wealth in a good manner... We don’t have a good management of resources and wealth in Soshanguve. Everything is like “broken” (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014). Hence, as a church we will have to come together (to assist the affected) (Mr Ndlovana, 12 January 2014).

According to Rev Mokone and Mr Ndlovana (12 January 2016),

The main issue of economy affecting the youth is unemployment. It seems as if young people are not interested in the details pertaining to economy (as long as their basic needs are met).

So, continued Rev Mokone,

Young adults who are employed and people who work are still finding their way in life. The youth is not partaking in economic issues but only on things that are benefitting us which are mostly social gatherings (Rev. Mokone, 12 January 2014).

Secondly, with reference to operations, Rev Mokone said:

Economy is like a cycle. It is the money which must circulate. For that money to circulate, one needs to share the money. How do we share the money? For an example in the Jewish community, it is said that you don’t have to go and support other people; you have to support the Jews before we can take that money overseas. That is how the economy functions. The point I
am making is that the same R10 we have to use it until we benefit from it (to the maximum) (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014).

Question 2 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

What are the church’s basic beliefs and primary values in relation to the Biblical understanding of *oikos* and “God’s economy - as this relates to the economy of Tshwane (S & H) and of society?

Participants from Hammanskraal mentioned, among the church’s basic beliefs and primary values in relation to *oikos*, **sharing; non-discrimination, loyalty to service, care for the weak, working together for common good, consultation and no favouritism** (the whole group, 11 January 2014). The group reached the consensus that these values are fundamental in ministry. Participants see these values as crucial for the economy in order to achieve collective wellbeing, yet deplore the fact they are missing in the current economic system. Mr Matjeke stated, “there is no sharing. The sharing, biblical ethics beliefs of the church are not practiced. It has to start with sharing of employment, sharing also of information” (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014). Ms Makena continued, “the first value of a Christian is to be loyal and have the ability to share and be a helping hand” (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014). Mr Dlamini said, “if the oikos is about discipleship, it means to share whatever we have” (Mr Dlamini, 11 January 2014).

In opposition to non-discrimination and non-favouritism, Mr Matjeke argued, “there is too much discrimination when it comes to allocation” (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014) [of economic resources]. He continued,

> We are suffering in the hands of local officers; when they say there is a project you will find that they tell you need to have a membership of a certain political party to be employed which to me is not right. The biggest parties that rule the project are the one that bring their people in (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

Hence, loyalty to good service, care of the weak and working for the common good are compromised and neglected. In this regard, Mr Golele remarked,
We, the church we can work together on economic matters. There are many things that we can achieve as the church together on economic ground as a testimony to the world. If all churches can work together we can build something that is much better economically (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014)

[The Sabbath for instance will not be observed]. In the same vein, Ms Makena said, “don’t just employ people and misuse them without giving them a break” and Mr Ndlovu added, “people of Tshwane (including the church) if they can sit down to discuss economic growth (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014) [there will be a way forward].

Question 2 (with Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 at Winterveld)

What are the church’s basic beliefs and primary values in relation to the Biblical understanding of oikos and “God’s economy” - as this relates to the economy of Tshwane (S & H) and of society?

Participants from Soshanguve acknowledged that the current economic situation pushes people to work like slaves. They value rest and the Sabbath as concepts that have to be applicable and practical, but Rev Mokone contended, “now we are working on a Sunday which is wrong because life is pushing us to do so” (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014). Mr Ndlovana added, “it is pushing us to work even on Sunday. It goes back to the economy; if you are working on Sunday it doesn’t mean you want to work on Sunday. You have to work even on Sunday so that you can put food on the table. Now the economy that we are facing as individuals and churches is very difficult” (Mr Ndlovana, 12 January 2014). Rev Mokone added a cautionary note, saying “when we are working on Sunday we are hindering something. Hence, I am saying we should be careful about the Sabbath day” (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014).

Participants also acknowledged that “long and better life in the land’ has to be the aim of the economy but currently it is not being attained” (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014). Rev Mokone and Mr Ndlovana agreed with Ms Masase on this point. They also raised issues which they see as counterproductive to the practice of the church’s beliefs and primary values of Biblical understanding of oikos and God’s economy; in this regard Rev Mokone made mention of the following:
Currently we are serving the material god. We don’t share. We have a lot of labour brokers; people are ‘exploiting people’s energy’. You go to BMW, you have been hired by ‘Amagency’ [i.e. local term for private employment agents who facilitate work placements for job-seekers] BMW pays you R10 000. I take the whole R6000 because I got you employment. However I am sitting in an office, watching you slaving throughout the month. Is that fair? For people in this situation, labour is not a blessing because, a blessing is something which is from God to you and fully received by you. Earth is full of grace and love – currently we are unable to love. And there is no grace however the grace of God is there. God’s grace is full but we don’t use it (apply it) when we are dealing with economy (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014).

Question 3 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

How are these values foundational for the church’s praxis, which has a smaller or larger impact on the local economy and LED?

Generally, both groups acknowledged that these values are indeed foundational for the church’s praxis and have a positive impact on the local economy and LED. Yet, the current problem is that these values are not considered in our economy. They desire that the church should encourage policy makers and communities to apply these guiding principles and rules in the CoT’s economy. Participants from Hammanskraal (11 January 2014) in particular pointed out that “the important value for the economy is basically about serving, serving communities for collective wellbeing. Thus, all sectors of the community can prosper together and to have peace”. However, the grassroots reality in Hammanskraal is different because these values are not followed. Mr Matjeke said;

Leaders that have been chosen to lead are there for enriching themselves. They are not there to serve the CoT but to fill their pockets and their bank accounts with money and also to do nepotism. The rich are the ones who get tenders; there is no sharing (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

Mr Golele added, “in the Bible we know that God says that we must share… Maybe sometime we will get a better economy” (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014). For participants from
Hammanskraal perceive the church as a vital contributor towards having a value-based and balanced LED in the CoT. To substantiate this, Ms Makena declared,

The church plays a very important fundamental role in the economy. The church teaches us to be kind to humanity. Once you are equipped with the knowledge of being human to people you won’t oppress people…If you get more money you will never misuse it, you will remember the community and knowing that you can’t serve both God and money (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014)

However, Mr Ndlovu counter-argued, saying, “even if we have knowledge of all these God’s rules; we can’t really contribute much because there is something wrong in the way people see the church” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014). “It does not make a difference, even if,” stated Mr Matjeke, “there are politicians who have come from the ranks of the church who now serve in government, you will find that when they are chosen to leadership positions they don’t consider the church” (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014). These Christian politicians end up serving their own self-interest rather than that of communities.

Question 3 (with Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 at Winterveld)

How are these values foundational for the church’s praxis, which has a smaller or larger impact on the local economy and LED?

Participants from Soshanguve also acknowledged that these values are foundational for the church's praxis towards LED. Mrs Mashigo pointed out: by the mere fact that… “Gods rules are always good…. People will share resources with the needy people if they obey his rules” (Mrs Mashigo, 12 January 2014). Ms Masase stressed that although values are good guiding principles and rules...

It goes by a person’s heart whether you follow the rules or not. As it is we don’t share and end-up praising money more and don’t value anything anymore except for money. So we should go back to ‘recalculate’, analyse and see where we are going as people of this generation. We are living in a bad society where we look at ourselves. ‘ke inzindaba zako’ [meaning ‘that is your problem’]. We have lost our ways. We have lost our culture. So these values are good on paper so at the end of the day if I choose not to follow them there is nowhere we are going (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014).
Of crucial concern, Rev Mokone said, “if we (the church) have these documented rules [in the Bible] why are we finding it difficult to put them into practice?” (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014). The group agreed that this is an important question which deserves to be wrestled with as the church learns to be a witness in the community.

**Question 4 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)**

**What is currently happening to the people of Tshwane (specifically Hammanskraal and Soshanguve) in terms of the broader and the local economy? What do you notice about our economic situation here today?**

Participants from Hammanskraal said, “…the economy is falling down” (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014) “…the people are suffering” (Ms Makena and Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014) [which amounts] “…to oppression. They build you an RDP house incomplete” (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014). “Most people aren’t working; they are unemployed so it is so sad” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014). Mr Ndlovu continued, “…if there is no project, the people here from S & H they are suffering: the children are going to suffer, they will not go to school, and there will be no transport money….food is not going to be there” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014). “There is”, added Mr Dlamini, “…a high rate of teenage pregnancy and alcohol and drug issues among the youth” (Dlamini, 11 January 2014). “Of serious concern”, Mr Golele highlighted,

*The problem is that we people lack information. There are many things happening in projects, some of us we don’t know about the project, about the building of toilets or any other project. Our municipality doesn’t supply us with information. Although we have community meetings, they can’t tell about the money, somewhere they close for us not to have the full picture. (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014)*

The fact of being kept in the dark and ignorant, [has led people to] “no longer want to go to those meetings because of empty promises. They feel they are using them to become stepping stones” (Mr Dlamini, 11 January 2014) for a politician’s personal political career.

**What do you notice about our economic situation here today? (Sub-question)**

While participants acknowledged that there is definitely a positive development with regard to infrastructure in Hammanskraal, yet Mr Matjeke commented,

*Corruption and bribery are also other problems here in Tshwane as a result the qualities of infrastructures are compromised. They cannot put the same tar road in Pretoria East*
as the one they put here; our electricity is of inferior quality. We don’t know whether it is the same process they are using in Pretoria East being applied here? Is it the same inspectors (government inspectors) who are inspecting government infrastructures coming here to inspect or the community inspects their own infrastructures? (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014)

Participants attempted to paint a picture about malpractice and adverse behaviours of individuals and companies that received tenders for infrastructure development in Hammanskraal. Bearing all these challenges in mind, Ms Makena said, “the situation is desperate” (Mss Makena, 11 January 2014). For a way forward, Mr Ndlovu, seconded by Ms Makena and Mr Matjeke suggested…

*We need to come together especially as churches. People who believe in God they taught them to be loyal, to respect one another, to be understanding and as much as we can be together all of us we can fight these things. The community and the people of the church must talk together; they must do something about this situation* (Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

**Question 4 (with Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 at Winterveld)**

What is currently happening to the people of Tshwane (specifically Hammanskraal and Soshanguve) in terms of the broader and the local economy? What do you notice about our economic situation here today?

In the same vein, participants from Soshanguve highlighted the following issues. Ms Masase commented,

*Everything is run by the municipality when you look at it, they don’t involve us as the community. We are full of hate and all things that are bad. Living the way we are is leading us underground. We find a lot of youth who are HIV+. We are fed lies on a daily basis that is the problem. We don’t help each other* (Mss Masase, 12 January 2014)

Agreeing with Ms Masase, Mrs Maswangani added, “Soshanguve is our place but it is not a good place in terms of security. The community as well as the police are helpless. That is why we have high crime. We see evil prospering before our very eyes and we can’t do anything about it” (Mrs Maswangani, 12 January 2014). Other factors associated with crime are drug and alcohol abuse in Soshanguve. Ms Masase observed, “it is like we are brought to know that in
the townships there is bad crime. We smoke nyaope\textsuperscript{150} (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014) while Mrs Maswangani further described the sad reality which affects young people negatively, when she said, “In Soshanguve we don’t have children anymore” (Mrs Maswangani, 12 January 2014). According to Mr Madibane (12 January 2014),

This is related to an increased involvement in sport bars. This also incites 13 years old children to hang out on the streets till late at nights. This was not the case before. These kids have become unruly and refuse to submit to their parents. They drink alcoholic beverages and stay on the streets in the night.

Specifically, this is due to “…availability of alcohol in township; illegal bottle store licensing and control which are matters that the government is failing to address” (Mr Ndlovana, 12 January 2014). Mrs Chauke, in support of what Mr Ndlovana said, told her story.

These days our children start drinking at a very early age. I have a 15 year old child at home. This child has even been dismissed from school, he drinks and misbehaves. They steal even from you as a parent; they steal the same money that you are supposed to use for provision. They use this stolen money to drink alcohol and to buy drugs. Our economy is very bad (Mrs Chauke, 12 January 2014)

Question 5 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

What are the people experiencing? What is happening to the poor of Tshwane (Hammanskraal and Soshanguve in particular)? What is happening to those who live on the margins or periphery of the city of Tshwane (S & H)?

Participants from Hammanskraal seemed to highlight a correlation between what is happening to the poor and corruption in public office. Mr Dlamini stated,

\begin{quote}
I think it is fraud and corruption that are causing all these things and the other thing I think is lack of knowledge…we don’t know all the systems nor the procedure to complain and report (Mr Dlamini, 11 January 2014).
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{150} Nyaope (also known as whoonga or wunga) is a highly addictive drug, dangerous and destructive drug, unique to South Africa. accessed on 7 January 2016 from http://www.health24.com/Lifestyle/Street-drugs/News/Street-drug-nyaope-classified-as-illegal-20140403
With reference to the youth Mr Ndlovu asserted, “…working age youth are not doing anything. They are in drugs” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

Also, it seems as if those who live on the margins are experiencing the ugly effect of corruption. Mr Ndlovu noted:

> Those people who need “tsotsos” [meaning ‘bribe’ in local slang] from the people who want the job are the ones who are destroying the people of Tshwane. And the inspectors who are compromising quality because they received bribe are the ones who are destroying the community (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

Furthermore, as intimated earlier the closure of factories at the industrial site of Babelegi has worsened the unemployment crisis in Hammanskraal. Ms Makena highlighted the fact, explaining, “those people who lost their jobs in the factories of Babelegi ....and all the retrenchments that took place led to oppression of the people, people were left starving. Starvation leads to crime” (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014). This job loss has a negative impact on the children of these people as Ms Makena pointed out:

> Their parents are not working and they have got nothing to eat. They rather come and break my shop¹⁵¹ and take whatever they need and money. People are desperate and are willing to do anything to survive because; there are no viable economic opportunities for them. (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014)

In the face of this desperate situation in which the people find themselves, participants from Hammanskraal felt that a collective action which involves the church would be able to begin to reverse the situation. Mr Golele remarked,

> I think if we the church and community can’t work together, the poor will remain the poorest. Because we can see our economy is failing. We lack many things like jobs, we lack so many things. If the church stays far, the community becomes poorest (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014).

Mr Ndlovu added, “I think if the people of the church and the community can sit together and fix those things we will be alright” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

In view of this multifaceted crisis affecting the local economy, Mr Dlamini regards it as a serious disease that must be quickly cured. According to him:

---

¹⁵¹ As a tuckshop owner, Ms Makena has suffered a number of break-ins by young people from destitute families in the community.
It needs a cure. I don’t know what kind of a cure. But I can quote from 2 Chronicles 7: 14; “...if my people who are called by my name will humble themselves and pray and seek my face and turn from their wicked ways, I will hear from heaven and will forgive their sins and heal their land” (Mr Dlamini, 11 January 2014).

In addition, for the purpose of dealing with unemployment and facilitating a process towards self-reliance, Ms Makena suggested:

There should be some small businesses starting so that we can assist these people. I believe the CoT can help them; maybe take them to school. The CoT can just help, even by developing some small businesses for them (Mss Makena, 11 January 2014).

Question 5 (with Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 at Winterveld)

What are the people experiencing? What is happening to the poor of Tshwane (Hammanskraal and Soshanguve in particular)? What is happening to those who live on the margins or periphery of the city of Tshwane (S & H)?

In Soshanguve, Mrs Maswangani explained that as a result of crime..."people are experiencing fear (you can’t get out at night to help someone in danger)” (Mrs Maswangani, 12 January 2014). Parents and grandparents suffer “emotional abuse” (Mr Ndlovana, 12 January 2014) and “young people resort to physical abuse towards their parents. Some of these young people behave as if they have dysfunctional minds” (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014). With reference to health facilities, Soshanguve has just primary health care clinics. The nearest public hospital is in GaRankuwa. Ms Masase exclaimed, “How come we don’t have a hospital in Soshanguve! They are now building a private hospital there, what about a government hospital. I have the right to good health but I don’t receive it” (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014). Participants agreed that infrastructural development of any magnitude only happens during a pre-election season.

Although the power lies with the people in a constitutional democracy such as South Africa’s, communities are unable to exercise their rights. Ms Masase said, “...we are to blame... by leaving the poor becoming poorest.” (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014). The situation is worsened by the fact that there is no public official who seems to care and take responsibility. Mr Ndlovana submitted,

There is on the web a facility where you can complain to the government or to the president. You go there and submit your complains but at the end of the day you don’t get any answer (Mr Ndlovana, 12 January 2014).
Finally, participants also wished [that] “maybe the church can help organise the community” (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014) [to address] “ignorance which is playing a big part in our locations everywhere” (Mr Ndlovana, 12 January 2014)

Question 6 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

In the light of the above: How would the participants at this stage describe LED, as it applies to their lived situations?

In relation to their lived situations, participants from Hammanskraal describe LED as follows: Ms Makena said;

First I would like to see our youth’s life first being improved; giving them opportunities especially job opportunity. Second, I want the churches to be noticed, to be given the opportunity to be involved in community development projects (Mss Makena, 11 January 2014).

Mr Ndlovu, while he concurred with Mss Makena that the church must be involved in providing solutions that will improve the socioeconomic situations of communities, said that for him, LED...

Is seeing this place of “Soshahama” [i.e. an acronym for Soshanguve and Hammanskraal] improved: schools development, roads improved, and all the people of Soshahama working together for better life. If there is anything not going right in this place, we must have a meeting and solve it immediately... everything in this place will be alright (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

Ms Makena explained that everything includes all sectors of societal life in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal and Mr Golele emphasised [that] “churches and communities should work together on matters pertaining the economy” (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014).

Question 6 (with Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 at Winterveld)

In the light of the above: How would the participants at this stage describe LED, as it applies to their lived situations?
Participants from Soshanguve describe LED as [having] “good health facilities” (Mrs Mashigo, 12 January 2014) and Ms Masase added

*Have more youth employed, get community involved in all the projects aimed at improving the livelihood in community and society, that there should be peace for everybody to feel free in the streets of the township and service delivery from the municipality* (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014).

My summary of the participants’ accounts of session 1 of mini-consultation 1 is as follows:

**Researcher’s synthesis of participant’s narrative at insertion phase (hints for an emerging story from both groups)**

From the inputs received by participants, I have generated six categories or topics which give one a glimpse into the local economic situation of Tshwane (S & H).

1. **People’s expectations about the economy**: growth, wealth, employment for all, education for all, infrastructure development, good management of resources, sharing ideas to develop decent lives, working class reaping the fruit of their labour, all sectors actively involved in the economy, good health facilities, holistic improvement of life, peace, security for all and adequate service delivery.

2. **Failure of the current economy**: politicians benefit more than other communities, everything is as if “broken”: no sharing, too much discrimination, poor people are suffering in the hands of government, favouritism, people work without rest, people work like slaves, serving the material “god”, better life is only attained by a few, economic situation has fallen down, corruption and bribery affect delivery of services, illegal trades are thriving

3. **Church’s beliefs and values**: build families and communities, share resources, work together with communities for collective good, non-discrimination, loyalty to service, care of the weak, consultation, non-favouritism, rest, live long and have better life on earth,

4. **Church’s praxis to be aimed at**: serve communities for collective wellbeing, prosper together, foster peace, share resources, teach and model kindness, service, no oppression, loyalty to communities, respect, working together to fight evil and talk together for a good cause. The church can help organise communities to address ignorance and poverty.
5. **Current economic system’s impact on the poor:** the poor are suffering a multi-faceted poverty (materially, economically and psychologically), they are affected by crime, poor health, marginalised from meaningful participation, the situation is desperate, poor are victims of fraud and corruption, kept ignorant, they are unemployed, are in drugs, starving, stealing for survival, have no viable economic opportunities, experience fear, emotional and physical abuse for failing to provide, dysfunctional minds, poor health, guilty of self-blame, not taken seriously by government officials.

6. **Failure of the church:** doesn’t contribute much in sharing its resources, stands at a distance, has not yet stepped up to a place of influence, fails to model Christian/Biblical economic values.

**6.2.2 SECOND SESSION**

**Phase two: description of LED situation**

In this session, participants and researcher took an “impressionistic” approach to the task of description. We (participants and researcher) started to gather facts and trends through storytelling, sharing of experiences and insights to enable us to get in touch with people’s experiences. We dealt with the following questions:

**Question 1 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January at Stinkwater)**

What do you observe is happening to the local economy of Tshwane (specifically Hammanskraal and Soshanguve)? What changes have occurred in the past fifteen years?

Participants recounted that a lot has happened in the past fifteen years in Hammanskraal.

Unanimously, with regard to infrastructure development, they named:

> new tar roads have been built, electrification of townships, new schools have been built, RDP houses have been built, flushing toilets and sanitation system upgrades, introduction of social
grants, water reticulation, installation of ‘projector’ lights in communities, educare centres have been built, new shopping malls and new clinics have been built.

Yet, they also argued, the quality of these infrastructures is compromised. For example, Mr Matjeke said, “…we have running water even though the quality of service is still poor because sometime you stay without running water” (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014). While the physical landscape of townships of the CoT bears witness to the changes which have happened and continue to take place in terms of infrastructure, Mr Matjeke remained sceptical about the quality. He clarified,

*When you look at the city from Pretoria you can see things have been changed. But my problem with what is happening here in Hammanskraal is the quality of everything…The quality is not guaranteed, I don’t know whether they comply with SABS [South African Bureau of Standards] when they do a tar road here or not. In everything, the quality of the things they do this side is very poor* (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

Although the quality of some of the infrastructure is poor, Ms Makena said, “we are happy about some improvements we have experienced” (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014). With reference to the youth, Mr Ndlovu stated that “…there is a lot of development going on which has benefited the youth. Some young people are being educated for free and some are starting to build businesses” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014) with the assistance of the Youth Fund. Nonetheless, although there are many improvements in some areas, Ms Makena pointed out, “there are those people who are still struggling and suffering who don’t even have water” (Mss Makena, 11 January 2014).

**Question 1 (with Soshanguve group on 11 January at Winterveld)**

*What do you observe is happening to the local economy of Tshwane (specifically Hammanskraal and Soshanguve)? What changes have occurred in the past fifteen years?*

The changes that happened in Hammanskraal in terms of infrastructure are more or less the same to the ones that have taken place in the new sections of Soshanguve. The old section of Soshanguve, since it was an established township pre-1994, had some basic infrastructure (such as water, sanitation, clinics and so forth) in place. However, these basic amenities have been upgraded and expanded in the past fifteen years to meet the needs of the ever growing township of Soshanguve. One of the participants of this research acknowledged [that]
We have street lights. Our government has started giving social grants to destitute children inclusively. There is improvement in the disbursement of old aged pension (+60 years) by introducing smart card which is free of bank charges (Mrs Maswangani, 12 January 2014).

To this, Mrs Mashigo added, “there are more than 5 malls built in and around Soshanguve in this period. We are not spending a lot of money for transport fares to do shopping which is better for our economy” (Mrs Mashigo, 12 January 2014). Mrs Maswangani added [that] “even our secondary roads in Soshanguve have been tarred” (Mrs Maswangani 12 January 2014). Ms Masase acknowledged, “disadvantaged kids now have access to education. At least the government guarantees free education to all till grade 10” (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014). Mrs Chauke furthermore added, “since 1994 the government started building ‘RDP’ houses for poor people who now live in the new sections on the outskirts of old sections, we also have electricity even in the shacks and we have telephone lines in the township” (Mrs Chauke, 12 January 2014).

Finally, the mood of these participants with regard to infrastructural changes that have happened seemed to be that of appreciation mixed with the realisation that there are also negative events occurring in the township. Mrs Maswangani put it this way:

We thank the government regardless of some bad things that are happening, there are nonetheless good things they implemented in this period. They are attempting to improve our lives even if it is not 100% correct. There is effort being done to steer us in a good direction (Mrs Maswangani, 12 January 2014).

Question 2 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January at Stinkwater)

What have been the most important events influencing the economy?

Among the most important events influencing the economy positively in Hammanskraal, participants named tenders, 2010 Soccer World Cup related businesses and the “Mandela factor”. Negatively, participants spoke about immigrants’ involvement in the local economy through small businesses. The immigrants now own and run most of the small shops in
Hammanskraal. Local South African businessmen and -women are unable to compete with these immigrants\(^{152}\) and have thus lost some business opportunities.

According to Mr Matjeke, local entrepreneurs who receive tenders from government have been influencing the economy. As he reported,

*The major thing which has boosted the economy (…) is this “tenderpreneur” thing. when a tender comes to Stinkwater you will find out five hundred youth are employed and then five hundred youth when they go to get R1000 each per week that money get back invested in local businesses. Even though they said that the unemployment rate is too high you could see that these tenders are providing temporary employment that is helping local economy even small businesses* (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

Also, although the Soccer World Cup is a thing of the past, some participants still see it as an event which has influenced the economy in a positive way. Ms Makena pointed out,

*People built Bed & Breakfast facilities, some motels, and people were selling stuffs, cars. So people managed to make a bit of money. At least businesses grew in 2010* (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014).

Mr Matjeke added:

*The World Cup made this tender business big. Some have created permanent employment. Permanent employment makes most businesses to be successful* (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

In the same vein, Mr Ndlovu agreed that there were some permanent job opportunities which have resulted from the World Cup:

\(^{152}\) The immigrants are organised in networks which enable them to buy stock in a group for a better price thus can afford to sell at a little less in comparison to South African local shop owners.

\(^{153}\) A tenderpreneur is a South African government official or politician who abuses their powers and influence to secure government tenders and contracts. “Tenderpreneur” is a portmanteau word of “tendering” and “entrepreneur”. Some commentators believe that this practice might give rise to a kleptocracy as a deviant mutation of a democracy if left unchecked. In this regard a kleptocracy is defined as the condition arising when a political elite manipulates the three arms of government with the intention of capturing resources that will enrich that elite. *The Star*, a South African newspaper describes a tenderpreneur as “someone politically well-connected who has got rich through the government tendering system” (http://www.iol.co.za/news/crime-courts, accessed 12 January 2015) (see also http://www.definitions.net/definition/tenderpreneur)
Gautrain [an integrated rail and bus transport system] has given some people from Hammanskraal permanent employment. Also the upgrade and extension of the stadiums created work opportunities in terms of maintenance (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

Unanimously, participants also regard former and late President Mandela [his vision and commitment to reconciliation and unity and his leadership during the transition] as having influenced the local economy positively. Mr Matjeke, in particular, commented,

The deceased and former president, the old man Mandela also contributed in the economy of South Africa a lot which helps Tshwane because through him a lot of investors were happy to come and invest in Tshwane and South Africa as a whole. Investors were coming in his name; he was not one person who was greedy and looking one side like Western Cape or Eastern Cape because he comes from there. He was generous to the whole South Africa helping the whole economy. So that is another thing that boosted the economy of Tshwane (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

While it is acknowledged that the good leadership of Mandela and the spirit of peace and reconciliation which prevailed during the Government of National Unity, created on one hand a solid foundation for the economy to prosper in that big companies in Tshwane such as the motorcar manufacturers like BMW and Nissan decided to stay, on the other hand, foreign citizens from Africa and the rest of the world began to arrive in the country in great numbers to experience freedom and explore personal interests in terms of employment and business. Sadly, some of these immigrants have steadily maximised their presence and opportunities in the local economy of cities such as Tshwane. Mr Matjeke spoke about this situation:

In Tshwane and all the provinces we have a lot of illegal immigrants who are denting the local economy. Let me give you an example about myself as a local businessman, I have grocery stores. We have had in Tshwane a lot of foreigners and aliens like Pakistanis who are messing around with the economy of South Africa. They are messing up the business because they come with fakes from Pakistan and Asia (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

Rev Rustof added, “people from ‘outside’ are now coming here because South Africa is starting to develop” (Rev Rustof, 11 January 2014) [in a democratic manner].

Question 2 (with Soshanguve group on 12 January at Winterveld)

What have been the most important events influencing the economy?
In Soshanguve, participants named a number of important events that have been influencing the economy. For Mrs Chauke,

*The abolition of Apartheid and installation of constitutional freedom for all and also the change of governments have influenced the economy* (Mrs Chauke, 12 January 2014).

Participants also acknowledged that the earning power of the black African people has improved in this new South Africa. Mr Chimuti put it this way,

*The building of more than five shopping malls in Soshanguve points to the fact that there has been economic growth in the past fifteen years. It points to the fact that people have money. The area is developing that is why businesses have decided to be near our doorsteps* (Mr Chimuti, 12 January 2014).

**Question 3 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)**

**How would we talk about the most dominant events we see in the economy of Tshwane (S & H) – how do these events affect the economy in Hammanskraal and Soshanguve?**

Ms Makena responded,

*Should be something which created jobs like the CoT recently employed this (past) December 2013 six thousand metro polices that are currently on training. The Metro government creating jobs is the most dominant event. Mainly jobs linked to security and law enforcement industry* (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014).

Certainly, events or infrastructures associated with the creation of jobs were viewed by participants as affecting the economy of Hammanskraal and Soshanguve. Rev Phiri added:

*Malls and shopping centres have created permanent jobs unlike tenders which are projects, they last 4 years, after that people are jobless again. The employment offered through these malls has boosted the economy* (Rev Phiri, 11 January 2014).

[This] "*job creation helps in eliminating crime in the community*” (Mrs Phiri, 11 January 2014). Furthermore, the Reconstruction and Development Plan, in terms of providing housing to the poor and developing or upgrading infrastructure, is perceived by participants as having a positive effect on the economy of Hammanskraal and Soshanguve. Mrs Phiri went on to say,
“Those contractors who are building RDP houses are creating jobs and are helping us in the development of the economy of Tshwane” (Mrs Phiri, 11 January 2014).

Furthermore, participants acknowledged that the existence of government’s schemes designed to assist the development of grassroots entrepreneurs and small businesses have started to affect the local economy positively. Mr Matjeke responded, saying,

*Tshwane is opening a way for Small Medium and Micro-enterprises (SMMEs) to get finance easy. We have seen a lot of young people opening businesses and succeeding. I am speaking about small businesses, tuck-shops, small bakeries and all these other businesses that the youth have opened. Tshwane has Skills Education Training Authorities also; all these other government department funds that we are not aware of, that we don’t know about which are helping a lot of young people. Department of Trade and Industry in Tshwane is also funding small businesses. Those initiatives are developing the economy. When I start a business and employ two people, it is minus two unemployed youth* (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014)

**Question 3 (with Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 at Winterveld)**

**How would we talk about the most dominant events we see in the economy of Tshwane (S & H) – how do these events affect the economy in Hammanskraal and Soshanguve?**

In Soshanguve, Mr Mokone said, [one will notice]

…that people prefer to ‘sit down, eat and chill’, have a nice time and enjoy themselves. *This shows that when people spend people earn* (Mr Mokone, 12 January 2014).

According to two participants, one of the most important things which has had a positive effect in the economy of Soshanguve is [that]:

*The middle class has been growing in a big way. And all of this is related to Affirmative Action policies that the government has put in place in terms of growing the economy. That is why we have an increasing number of people who can earn good salaries since racial salary scales have been abolished. All these changes have an effect in the economy* (Messrs Mokone and Madibane, 12 January 2014)
These “sit down, eat and chill” gatherings are symbolised by “excessive indulging in food, alcohol and clothes” (Mrs Mashigo, 12 January 2014). This proves that “some individuals in Soshanguve have a good earning power whether through legitimate means or not” (Mrs Mashigo, 12 January 2014). Also, I observed that there are now very beautiful and comfortable houses in some areas of Soshanguve which was not the case pre-1994. This development could be probably linked to freedom. Before things were controlled by an oppressive government. Now, there is not much restriction hence one can build a mansion for self.

Question 4 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

Who are the major and most powerful role players in Tshwane’s (S & H) economy? Who are the moderately powerful role players and who are the least powerful role players?

Among the major and most powerful role players, participants from Hammanskraal identified: the government and big businesses and the private sector (Ms Makena and Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014). With reference to big businesses and the private sector and in comparison to government, Mr Matjeke elaborated in the following manner,

Businesses and the private sector have had the most powerful influence in terms of the shift that has happened in government. In fact the government has realised that it cannot create the jobs it promised when they wanted our vote (…) you can see all those malls we are speaking about; they are not government malls but private malls. The only thing that the government is responsible for is tenders. But when getting to permanent jobs, private sectors are playing a very big role (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014)

Furthermore, with regard to government as one of the most powerful role players, Mr Khomo said;

I think when Mandela introduced new tax law (which was geared to fund social programmes) and also encouraged many poor people to start their own businesses. This is a powerful instrument of getting people out of misery (Khomo, 11 January 2014).

Among the moderately powerful role players, participants from Hammanskraal identified Small, Micro and Medium Enterprises (SMMEs). Ms Makena said, “the SMMEs are not the most powerful nor are they weak players, they are in the middle” (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014).
In the same vein, Mr Golele offered his opinion,

*When the government has realised that it cannot create the jobs...So they shifted their strategy for job creation indirectly through financing SMMEs* (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014).

With regard to the least powerful role players in the Tshwane (S & H) economy, Mr Ndlovu identified “rural communities” as being the least and weakest role players (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014), “because” continued Ms Makena, “*economically, these communities are depending on investors that is why they are weak*” (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014). Mr Matjeke added; his perspective:

*Peripheral communities on the outskirt of the city like Hammanskraal and Soshanguve are least powerful. Although this is not unique to the CoT, all black rural areas and townships are experiencing the very same thing. Even in old established townships such as Soshanguve, they get the same poor quality service. I think that goes back to corruption. We don’t know where to complain. The government sends investors but they are being bribed. We rural communities, you can voice your complaint alone, rural communities are the weakest. Church is number one of the weakest role players* (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

Ms Makena however, refuted the concept that the church is the weakest role player. To her, the church is one of the major role players. She explained:

*We can’t take the church for granted you know, the church is growing our humanity. The church is playing the very most important role. They just take it as a place where people can read the Bible and go home. They aren’t seeing potential in churches* (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014).

Disagreeing with Ms Makena, Mr Matjeke, while recognising that the church does play a significant role in growing humanity, submitted that this does not translate into major contributions to the economy. He contended,

*Growing humanity has added in terms of reducing crime, human beings can respect each other, can treat each other as human beings..... in general, but directly to the economy the church is the one which has lagged behind. In economy, no we are still left behind as a church* (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

In terms of the reasons which make particular communities weak and insignificant role players in the economy], the group also emphasised that corruption related to tender processes is resulting in poor quality service and in fact is making people who are on the margins of society, such as rural communities, the least powerful role players in the local economy.
Mr Moeti objected to the above, offering a slightly different perspective on the matter,

*Maybe it is not entirely corruption, maybe it is related to the way they bid for the tender. Those people might be bidding less so that they can win the tender. And then once they have to buy materials, they realise that the material is expensive. All in all they will be buying cheap stuff.* (Mr Moeti, 11 January 2014).

**Question 4 (with Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 at Winterveld)**

**Who are the major and most powerful role players in Tshwane’s (S & H) economy? Who are the moderately powerful role players and who are the least powerful role players?**

Participants from Soshanguve identified the most powerful, moderately powerful and least powerful roles in the economy of Tshwane, from their perspective.

Rev Mokone regarded

*Politicians, big business franchises, motorcar dealers, car manufacturers and land owners as most powerful, the working class as moderately powerful and poor people as least powerful.* (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014)

While Ms Masase considered [that] *white people are most dominant role players* (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014).

For Mrs Mashigo…

*…big businesses like Shoprite, Kentucky Fried Chicken, BMW and petrol companies and those who own properties in the area are also most powerful role players in the economy of Tshwane* (Mrs Mashigo, 12 January 2014).

With reference to how these role players are involved in the economy, Rev Mokone (12 January 2014) elaborated;

- *With regard to politicians, we should remember their posts are not advertised however, they are voted in. When you see their salaries you will realise their power. So those people have money, they spend as much as they could. If a person can purchase one car at a million rand, how much does she have? That is why I am saying politicians are powerful.*
The moderately powerful are the working class. People who are working they afford life. People buy whatever they can afford and do whatever with their salaries. They influence moderately so the economy.

People who are poor we call them ‘beggars’. They don’t chose whatever comes their way they face the challenge to overcome the situation. That is how I can define them.

Question 5 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

What are the major economic structures that determine how the city of Tshwane (S & H) organises its resources in terms of what to produce, distribute, exchange and consume? What influence does money have on our situation? Why?

Various matters were named by participants from Hammanskraal regarding what they considered as major economic structures in the CoT. Mrs Rustof remarked,

We have the Munitoria [municipal administrative office block] in Pretoria, where all the structures governing the affairs of the city sit. These different structures plan and coordinate different functions which determine what to produce distribute exchange and consume in the CoT (Mrs Rustof, 11 January 2014).

Mr Matjeke added:

I think the major structure that regulates redistribution is the South African Revenue Service (SARS). SARS plays a major role in the economy of Tshwane in terms of how much money Tshwane can have and distribute (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

Mr Moeti contributed to the discussion when he stated,

I don’t think that the government of Tshwane has control over what types of vehicles BMW and Nissan can make. The only control they have is via taxes on revenues and export – import duty fees (Mr Moeti, 11 January 2014).

With regard to fresh goods, “there is a market for fresh vegetables, meat, fruits, etc. Retailers from Hammanskraal and Soshanguve buy their stocks at this market” (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014).

When asked about the influence of money on their situation in Tshwane, some participants from Hammanskraal saw money as the pivot and as a major factor in the economy of the city. Ms
Makena said, “money influences our lives; socially and economically. You need money for everything. We can’t survive without money” (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014). Mr Ndlovu added, “without money everything is going to stop. So we need money in our situation” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014) in Tshwane (S & H).

Further, participants emphasised that money is at the centre of everything in the life of the city as well as in individual lives. It was also suggested that more and more money is needed for the continuous development project of the city. Mr Matjjeke, in particular, put it this way,

‘Money makes the world go round’. The rotation of money is what builds the economy. The more we need money, the more the government gets money. Basically money is what Tshwane needs. It is the money that we earn from our employment. It is money that we earn from our businesses. So it is the same money that will rotate. We need money (Mr Matjjeke, 11 January 2014)

**Question 5 (with Soshanguve group on 12 January 2014 at Winterveld)**

What are the major economic structures that determine how the city of Tshwane (S & H) organises its resources in terms of what to produce, distribute, exchange and consume?

What influence does money have on our situation? Why?

Participants from Soshanguve started off by recognising that the focus of the municipality in terms of further growth is placed on the north east and north-west regions of the city. Generally, participants also saw the political and administrative structure of the city as the one which has the most influence in terms of what to produce, distribute, exchange and consume. According to Mrs Chauke, “the political and administrative structure of the city through the Mayoral Committee plays these roles” (Mrs Chauke, 12 January 2014).

Yet Ms Masase (and Mr Ndlovana, Rev Mokone and Mrs Mashigo agreed) added,

*Big multinational businesses such as BMW and Nissan determine what to produce but the city receives revenues through taxation* (Masase, 12 January 2014).

The respondents also pointed out that there are also individuals and corporations who are powerful who can shape their city’s economy in terms of what to produce and consume. As Rev Mokone pointed out,
Take for instance, Cyril Ramaphosa\textsuperscript{154} who owns majority shares in McDonald, South Africa. Possibly we can say that individual has a lot of influence in the economy (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014).

The group acknowledged that the economic landscape of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal has been changed by the presence of these corporations. In Hammanskraal, one notices how the “old” Rens Town has changed. There are now fast food outlets such as Kentucky Fried Chicken, Nando’s and McDonalds. All these major fast food company corporations are big players and have changed the face and life of Hammanskraal – this shows that these corporations are indeed a powerful force. The situation is the same in Soshanguve.

Question 6 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

How does each group relate to the important economic events, and how do these affect them?

Participants from Hammanskraal acknowledged that there is an intrinsic link between these groups and that the way they respond to or are affected to important economic events is usually linked to their interests. Rev Phiri indicated,

\textit{They need each other. Government, big businesses, small businesses; let say it is a chain which you can’t break. Here is a big company, a big corporation – it is Albany Bakery. It can never bake bread, sell it and eat it. It needs a community, it needs a tuck shop. So we need each other. The big companies they produce, the middleman distributes, and me down there on the floor sells. The community comes and buys. It is one chain which cannot be broken} (Rev Phiri, 11 January 2014).

Mr Ndlovu added perspective to the discussion, stating, \textit{“it must be also borne in mind that the church is part of the community. It is not an isolated social structure”} (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

\textsuperscript{154} Ciryl Ramaphosa’s access to the fiscus and his investments are somewhat more extensive than what the participant stated here. This statement is also indicative of how limited the information is that the participants (may) have about the ‘powerful’ people/ businesses etc.
Question 6 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

How does each group relate to the important economic events, and how do these affect them?

Participants from Soshanguve highlighted the fact that the most powerful and moderately powerful groups tend to maximise the opportunities of the new economic situations to benefit them because they have resources. In Mr Madibane’s words,

they relate to the new important events in the economy by taking advantage even if they offer communities new conveniences such as shopping malls, fast food outlets, etc. (Mr Madibane, 12 January 2014).

Following on what Mr Madibane said, Rev Mokone expanded,

These important economic events should be understood within the context of the freedom people have today. People are “eating money” at our doorsteps. They brought shopping complexes at our doorsteps. Now we go around the corner to do our shopping; it doesn’t matter whether it is clothing or grocery (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014).

Nevertheless, Mss Masase remarked, [these big corporations]

are bringing everything closer to us; making things easier for us to do. You don’t need to use your own car these days to go to town to buy clothing. You might as well take a taxi (…) we benefit in a way. You go to a local mall; you spend less and come back with change (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014).

However, Rev Mokone interjected, pointing out that the majority of these township residents are poor and unemployed. He said,

My problem is one. For instance today is the 12th January, come the 1st of February people will be soliciting loans (…) we see them going to ‘loan sharks’. Why? These people get pay at the end

Eating money’: is an expression used in township slang to mean resourceful people are maximising the making of money.

The loan sharks in South Africa offer loans at extremely high interest rates, exceeding the limit set by the National Credit Regulator (NCR). They typically charge high fees as well. They charge interest per day rather than per week or per month, no matter how long the term of the loan is. They use a whole
of the month, and at the very same day they go to get loans from loan sharks? They must pay their debts to these shops with interest (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014).

Thus the observation was made that people are taken advantage of by the wealthy and powerful structures and individuals that benefit from the system.

**Question 7 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)**

**Are people suffering or prospering in Tshwane (S & H)? Explain in what ways?**

Building on previous questions, participants from Hammanskraal stated the following. Ms Makena said,

> It all depends on what you are doing. There are those who are suffering and there are those who are prospering and are successful. On one hand, we have people who went to school, studied and have better jobs; they are making it in this economy (Mss Makena, 11 January 2014).

Another view expressed was by Mrs Rustof,

> We have those who watch things happen. Those who let things happen; these are the most oppressed people. They are not doing anything (Mrs Rustof, 11 January 2014).

In the same vein, Mr Matjeke stated, *people who are suffering are a lot more in numbers than those who are prospering* (Mr Matjeke 11 January 2014). He went on to add,

> People who are surviving, who are prospering and those who are making it big are the ones who are in government. Politicians of the ANC are the ones who are prospering, starting from those who are at the top level in government to those who are down here at the local municipality in the villages. There are also those who are holding tenders, they are the one who are prospering (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

With reference to local businesses, Ms Makena told a story and observed,

> There are people who are struggling and suffering and they are even letting Somalis and Pakistanis to rent their business premises (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014).

range of illegal practices which make the cost of the loan excessive (accessed on 8 January 2016 from http://www.loansharks.co.za/ }
Mr Matjeke shares the same sentiment,

_We, small businessmen are not prospering - all business people who are depending on people to come and buy a loaf of bread is not prospering_ (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

According to Mr Golele, the reasons for the suffering of local businesses lie in the hands of government:

_Local business people are suffering because the government is not doing anything about the Pakistanis who have flooded our market. You will find that your little shop is surrounded by 10 Pakistanis, Ethiopians and Asians. And they are not selling original brands they are selling “fake” brands at a cheaper price. People who don’t know they think that small local businesses are making it_ (Mr Golele, 11 January 2014).

With reference to community, participants from Hammanskraal unanimously affirmed that the community (i.e. the ordinary citizens of Hammanskraal) is suffering at the hands of its political leaders because it has been made powerless due to lack of knowledge. Mr Matjeke (11 January 2014) expanded, by telling this story:

_Communities are suffering because you find that the very same prospering tenderpreneurs who are ANC members are abusing their employees by not paying them a full, agreed wage. I heard a story of workers who were supposed to be paid R1000 per week according to government rates. The entrepreneur ended-up paying them R600 each per week; he slashed R400 intentionally (not by mistake) from their wages. Workers were told the money deducted from their wages is for the people who facilitated the tender process for him. This is one of the things which are causing unhappiness among communities. Since local villagers don’t know how to voice their complaints, they resort to burn the tarred road_\(^{157}\). _That is how they strike. They will burn the house of the councillor because of poverty and service delivery. When you see protestations in Tshwane ....it is because people are being robbed. In most cases, there is a major main man who holds the tender and there are these small contractors. The money comes from the main man; sometimes he gives the correct amount of money to contractors for the job. They ‘don’t cut from their cake but they cut from the cake of the community’\(^{158}\)."

\(^{157}\) Research led by Adele Kirsten and Karl von Holdt in 2011 has confirmed that there is increase in instances of collective popular agency and violence which involve grievances about state actions or inactions, and community protests which frequently include an element of xenophobic attacks on foreign-owned businesses (see [http://www.csvr.org.za/docs/thesmokethatcalls.pdf](http://www.csvr.org.za/docs/thesmokethatcalls.pdf) accessed 4 July 2016)

\(^{158}\) ‘They don’t cut from their own cake but they cut from the cake of the community’: is an expression meaning that tenderpreneurs are prone to serve themselves from community project funds while they safeguard their own monetary possessions.
These politicians are prospering; you see them driving big cars and building big houses. Ordinary community is suffering. They are robbing the people especially those who are involved in tenderpreneurship. These poor employees don’t have a voice, the only way they can revolt is to stone the councillor’s house and burn the tarred road.

Question 7 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

Are people suffering or prospering in Tshwane (S & H)? Explain in what ways?

The story of Soshanguve is generally similar to that of Hammanskraal although Soshanguve was established as a formal township well over three decades ago. Pockets of people are prospering but the majority are suffering. It is observable that some sections of Soshanguve Township have good infrastructure and live in some measure of comfort whereas some others are still gravely lacking the same. In other words, there is an uneven infrastructural and spatial development pattern in Soshanguve. Mr Masenya aptly shared about this as he spoke about existing infrastructures in some blocks of Soshanguve,

For instance, Block H is prospering: you have street lights and sidewalks. People are getting employed by the government. There are a lot of structures (...). There is a community hall in block F and this hall is near Block H. In the whole of Soshanguve it is only Block H which has a public swimming pool… You also have recreational places however some of them need some development. …you also have a community hall in Block H (i.e. Vhalala). The local office of the ANC in Soshanguve is in Block H. You are our capital city, when we say Soshanguve we say Block H. Tshwane North College is in Block H. Students who study in Block L they sleep in Block H. You have all these food places; these people who grill chicken and people who sell alcohol they are in Block H. All these activities are happening in Block H. (Mr Masenya, 12 January 2014).

Question 8 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014)

How, and by what means, are people making a living and participating in the local economy? How do (some) people find a way to prosper?
In Hammanskraal, participants recounted how most people are making a living. Ms Makena said,

*Some people are employed. Those who are not employed do start small businesses (in the informal sector) and unfortunately we also have those who are sitting at home doing nothing* (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014).

Mr Ndlovu amplified this point,

*Those who are working don’t earn a better salary and can’t afford to live a better life. It is just struggling to live. Those who start their own businesses are disturbed by the Metro Police because they don’t have a licence to trade on the streets* (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

Ms Makena added,

*We got thugs as well (thugs who steal to survive). They also steal from those who are working, they snatch bags and possessions of those who come back from work at the bus stops especially month-ends* (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014).

According to Mr Ndlovu, “*it is because of unemployment that is why people are also resorting to stealing because they need money to live*” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014).

In Soshanguve, participants recounted a number of factors regarding how most people make a living and participate in the economy. As Mr Madibane remarked,

*Most of us survive by saving through stokvels. The women are very good with this; at the end of the year the money they have managed to save through these schemes help us to pay school fees for the children or start a small business* (Mr Madibane, 12 January 2014).

Mr Chimuti added,

*The lucky ones survive through their employment with the government or private companies although not everybody gets a good salary. Otherwise we are just struggling to survive. The elderly people get by with their grants* (Mr Chimuti, 12 January 2014).

Other people do find self-reliant means for survival. Mrs Mashigo explained:

*I sell atchar and sweets in my street to supplement our family income. I don’t make much but it helps us get by. Through these sales I buy bread for my children daily* (Mrs Mashigo, 12 January 2014).
Question 9 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

Where do they find the resources and assets, the values, the hopes and opportunities to make a living and to participate in the local economy?

According to the Hammanskraal group, people do locate and mobilise resources which can create opportunities for making a living and participating in the local economy. Mrs Phiri stated, “for those who are struggling and not working; it doesn’t mean that they are hopeless. They got role models to learn from” (Mrs Phiri, 11 January 2014).

Mr Dlamini reported:

*Some Hammanskraal young people (younger than 30 years) have accessed resources specifically from organisations such as the Youth Fund to assist them in developing plans for small business which they fund* (Mr Dlamini, 11 January 2014).

Ms Makena continued:

*For those who are above 30 years of age some do sell on the streets. But the problem, like in town we had street vendors in Van der Walt Street, they are no longer there – they were chased away by the Metro Police* (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014).

According to Mr Matjeke, this forced removal of vendors was associated with drug trafficking in the city centre. He indicated,

*It was alleged that the vendors (…) were pushing “nyaope” in the streets. Some of the streets are avoided because they are dirty and infested by nyaope users and dealers. This is happening right in town. There is a street called Brown Street it is where it is sold like sweets and bread* (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

Mr Khomo continued,

*That is why this last December (2013) in town; the crime rate was very high – people wanted money to buy things and alcohol. They were not working; the people involved in this crime were those vendors who were evacuated from the city centre. They were grabbing people’s wallets and everything (they could lay their hands on). In the banks, they will grab your bag; it is the very same vendors because they are no longer working there* (Mr Khomo, 11 January 2014).

This high crime rate, Mr Matjeke said, is also one of the reasons which influences the city to employ more police personnel. *There is a big problem in the CoT* (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).
The Soshanguve group highlighted issues such as: help from relatives, determination to find employment and getting a cash loan to start a business which will generate regular income. Mr Ndlovana responded:

After many disappointing attempts to find a regular employment, I decided to join the family business. With his retirement lump sum, my dad bought a Kombi and I help to manage this family business. It is just too hard to find a job these days if you are not politically connected (Mr Ndlovana, 12 January 2014).

Mrs Chauke, on the other hand exhorted her hearers:

You don’t have to give in looking for a job, one day is one day! That day, a favourable opportunity will be given to you. That was my experience; I kept knocking different doors for so long till I got the job (Mrs Chauke, 12 January 2014).

Ms Masase endorsed Mrs Chauke’s input, adding,

There are also small little loans that you get from banks with the help of your relative as a guardian for someone who is unemployed. The only problem is that loan repayment can drag for a long time (Mss Masase, 12 January 2014)

Question 10 (with Hammanskraal group on 11 January 2014 at Stinkwater)

In the light of the above: how do ordinary and poor people see their role and participation in the economy?

Although, participants came to understand that the economy is a very complex concept, Ms Makena said,

We all have to contribute towards growth. In whatever industry you are in you have to expand and excel to grow the economy, preferably by participating in small manufacturing industry (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014).

Further, Mr Matjeke contended that: ordinary people continue to sell labour in a dignified manner, free from abuse (Matjeke, 11 January 2014) [so that labour becomes a blessing].

With reference to the church’s role, the following matters were re-emphasised by the participants. Rev Phiri put forward the view [that] “…something must be done by the church so that we can be recognised by the government as an active role player in the economy” (Rev Phiri, 11 January 2014). There is admittedly no doubt that the church is contributing to maintain
the welfare of some communities in the city. However, Mr Matjeke suggested [that] “churches can start organisations like Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) specialised in addressing issues of local economic development” (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014).

Mr Ndlovu’s suggestion was [that] “…cooperation between church and government has to be reinvigorated” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014) so that the wellbeing of communities is placed at the centre of the task of the local economy.

With regard to the Soshanguve group, participants spoke about contribution to the economy as a universal responsibility for citizens in whatever sector they found themselves involved. Mr Masenya put it this way:

> Whether I am poor or rich, a worker in a farm or a street sweeper or even a big shot in a corporate I am playing a role in our economy. All of us are expected to contribute to the economy through our work. Whatever work you do which contributes towards improving the life in the community is a good contribution to the economy (Mr Masenya, 12 January 2014).

Mrs Maswangani added:

> With all these unemployed young people around our community, all the organisations must do something to create employment for them. Otherwise, poverty will get worse. Many of these young people depend on their grandparents’ pension for financial support (Mrs Maswangani, 12 January 2014).

**Question 11 (with Hammanskraal group on January 2014 at Stinkwater)**

**How do they understand their ability – or their inability – to participate in LED?**

With regard to people’s ability, participants unanimously responded,

> We need to try. We need to try to participate in LED. As we try we will discover whether we are able or not.

In the same vein, Mr Ndlovu asserted,

> If you sit down and do nothing, everything is not going to be okay. We must speak up and if things are like that (bad) and find out what needs to be done. We will come with new ideas and advices to help us reach our goal that is good life for all (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014)

With regard to the church, participants indicated,
The church has to bolster its ability to participate in LED. She must carry on and not to sit down and fold her hands.

Participants from Soshanguve felt that community members are able to participate to the economy when given an opportunity. Mrs Mashigo pointed out,

I am able to contribute to the economy with the little income I make from selling atchar and sweets on the street. The other women selling at taxi rank and bus stop are contributing to the economy. The government must stop harassing them by making it difficult for them with issues of licences (Mrs Mashigo, 12 January 2014)

In the same vein, Ms Masase added,

Most people of Soshanguve have the ability to contribute and participate in the economy but they are hindered to do so because there are no jobs available. Worse, many of can’t figure out how to create our own jobs, we wait for the government to assist us. It is so sad to see potential being wasted (Ms Masase, 12 January 2014).

The synthesis of all the inputs of participants at session 2 of mini-consultation 1 is presented below.

Researcher’s synthesis of participant’s narrative at description of LED phase (laypersons’ impressions from both groups) The inputs above could be grouped into seven categories or topics which give one a glimpse into the impressions of the research participants about the local economic situation.

1. Physical and social infrastructure improvement: improved physical infrastructure in townships, improved social welfare services and investment, some youth received assistance from the Youth Fund. These improvements have not only enhanced convenience and the quality of life in townships, but they seem also to have boosted the morale of township residents because of these improvements.

2. Failure of LED in these townships: many people are suffering and still struggling to survive, not enjoying the benefits of transformation, no protection for small local businesses and only a minority is prospering (i.e. employed and educated people, government officials, ANC politicians and business people who received tenders are doing so). The middle class growth has unfortunately not benefited the poor; Bond
(2014) ties this failure to the social contract the elite made on the ‘eve’ of the new South Africa. The majority do not earn better salaries and cannot afford to lead decent lives. Many people resort to illegal means such as crime, to make a living.

3. **Drivers of the economy:** positive drivers (include: tenders given to non-white communities, 2010 Soccer World Cup, Mandela factor, abolition of apartheid and installation of a constitutional democracy, improved earning power of black middle class, job creation, RDP, government policies, resources made available to some youth, powerful role players emerging from different sectors, political, and administrative structures focus on spatial development of resource-less neighbourhoods of the city, money influence on plans and processes and - negative drivers: involvement of illegal and unregulated immigrants in the local economy, poor communities made weaker by corruption, dependence on outside investors and lack a voice to speak out against injustice, inability to exert control over the activities of powerful multi-national corporations and over-reliance on money for everything.

4. **Nature of economic relations:** positive relations: there is interdependence between different role players (such as the Government and big corporations as major/powerful role players, SMMEs and wealthy individuals as middle role players and ordinary people as lower group of role players) linked like a chain which cannot be broken, - negative relations (powerful role players maximise their opportunities to the detriment of the poor, poor communities are taken advantage of by the wealthy and powerful individuals and structures).

5. **Economic impacts on majority of the people:** Voiceless and powerless, suffering, oppressed, made powerless by keeping them ignorant about powers and systems governing the economy, suffer abuse in the hands of officials, robbed of decent wages, those with small businesses suffer because there is lack of protection by government, only a minority is prospering. Yet, there is a minority such as the middle class as well as those benefitting from their own initiatives, government youth funds and grants. This minority has positive feelings about the economy.

6. **Means, resources and assets for survival:** formal employment, start small and informal businesses, stokvels, social grants, help from a family relative, some resort to illegal and illegitimate means such as stealing to survive, survived by hoping that things
will improve one day, they have role models to look up to, some tap into government resources and some have trading skills.

7. **Impressions on participation**: communities are willing to contribute towards growth, continue to sell labour in a dignified manner, speak out when they are marginalised, find out what needs to be done to improve communities, come up with ideas to achieve good life for all and discover viable ways to participate. With reference to church’s participation: step out into the public sphere of life, continue to service the needs of the poor and the weak, form strategic and critical cooperation with government, start NGOs that will address economic issues and bolster its own ability to participate in LED.

### 6.3. Conclusion of this chapter

The participant’s narrative accounts which emerged during both sessions of mini-consultation 1 were presented in this chapter. During the first session, participants’ accounts revealed people’s expectations about the economy, failings of the latter, the church’s beliefs and values in relation to it, the church’s praxis aims in relation to it, the current economic system’s impact on the poor and the failure of the church as related to the economy. A detailed account of these inputs was presented in section 6.2.1.

Building on the first session, which dealt with insertion, in the second session, participants adopted an impressionistic approach to describe the economic situation of Tshwane (S & H). The accounts revealed: physical and social infrastructure improvement, failure of LED in these townships, positive and negative drivers of the economy of Tshwane (S & H), the positive and negative nature of economic relations in Tshwane (S & H), economic effects on the majority of the people in Tshwane (S & H), resources, assets and means for survival that residents of Tshwane (S & H) employ in the current economic situation and impressions on the way they participate in the economy. A detailed account of these inputs has been provided in section 6.2.2 above.

An in-depth and lengthy (and at times repetitive) analysis, reflection and a plan of action as a response to these issues are the focuses of the next chapter.
Chapter seven

NARRATIVE ACCOUNTS OF THE JOINT FOCUS GROUP ON LED IN CoT (S & H)

In Chapter 6, I presented the narrative accounts of the separate focus group discussions. This chapter is a continuation of these; however, the accounts in it stem from the joint group mini-consultations, ranging from the analysis phase to the way forward phase of the praxis cycle. Details concerning the development of instrument and data collection as well as for data display / presentation are the same as described in sections 6.1.1 and 6.1.2 respectively.

7.1. Second mini-consultation – Including two sessions

This mini-consultation was held with the joint group – including both the Soshanguve (S) and Hammanskraal (H) groups – and was divided into two sessions, i.e. analysis and conclusion of analysis. It took place in Hammanskraal at the Hammanskraal Gospel Centre church hall. Participants from Soshanguve were provided with transport. Other logistical arrangements such as meals and refreshments and venue were coordinated by Rev Phiri and his wife, the pastoral couple of the Hammanskraal Gospel Centre. 28 participants attended both sessions of the second mini-consultation.

7.1.1. FIRST SESSION

Phase three – analysis

In this meeting, I attempted to obtain a more complete picture of the Tshwane (S & H) economy by exploring its historical and structural relationships. Concurring with Holland and Henriot (1983: 98), I worked through a series of six questions about the history, structures, values, and direction of LED in Tshwane (S & H). The focus groups dealt with the following, where the profile of the participants as summarised in this table below (Table 7.1) provides information concerning the interlocutors of this focus group.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Name &amp; Surname</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Economic occupation</th>
<th>Affiliation/ministry</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Stanley Mokone</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Pastor of youth</td>
<td>ELCSAs (yp)</td>
<td>25 - 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Johnny Ndlovana</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Small business owner</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>30-34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Winnie Mathebula</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>25 - 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>I Chimuti</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>ELCSAs (md)</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>N.D Mashabane</td>
<td>Grade 12</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>ELCSAs</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>D. Mahlaza</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Casual employment</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>35 - 39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>G. Mokgotho</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Housewife</td>
<td>BoC (md)</td>
<td>46 - 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>L.B Bodiba</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>LBC (wd)</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Maponya</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>URCSA</td>
<td>51 - 55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>F.M Motswene</td>
<td>Grade 9</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>46 - 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>B. Mkandla</td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>ELCSAs</td>
<td>25 - 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr</td>
<td>Carol Bombal</td>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>Retired MD</td>
<td>HGC</td>
<td>&gt;65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past.</td>
<td>John Megala</td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>Municipal worker</td>
<td>Boc (sp)</td>
<td>51 - 55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Hezekiel Moeti</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>HGC (yd)</td>
<td>31 - 35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>B. Ndlovu</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>LBC (md)</td>
<td>46 - 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Maureen Mead</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Missionary</td>
<td>YWAM</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>A.M Madibane</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>BRC (md)</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Nellie Makena</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Employed (ICT)</td>
<td>LBC (yd)</td>
<td>26 - 30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 7.1: Focus group participants for the joint group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr Joel Khomo</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>BoC (md)</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs Gladys Phiri</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Informal trade</td>
<td>HGC (wd)</td>
<td>46 - 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Aristorico Phiri</td>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>HGC (sp)</td>
<td>51 - 55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr George Matjeke</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Small businessman owner</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Christian Rustof</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>LBC (sp)</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs Patricia Mashigo</td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>Street vendor</td>
<td>BRC (wd)</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Vusi Dlamini</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Tuckshop keeper</td>
<td>BoC (yd)</td>
<td>31 - 35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Harry Golele</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Tuckshop keeper</td>
<td>LBC (yp)</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Grace Shibambo</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>HGC</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs M.N Ngobeni</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Question 1 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

How did Tshwane (S & H) economy come to this point? What brought it to this point?

Participants recounted, among other issues, stories related to the collapse of the industrial hubs which used to provide a livelihood to the people of the former homelands and also spoke about the post 1994 forces of political alignment, loyalties and patronage systems. Some also acknowledged the processes of the unification of administrative/social/financial systems, infrastructures and structures towards building a “New South Africa” according to the Constitution and the Freedom Charter.

With particular reference to Hammanskraal town, Rev Phiri (an immigrant) related:

*I found Hamanskraal being a very small place. I have seen it develop. I saw the local business men which was then a small group of men (mainly from Rens family); started to expand as they were. They build the Kopanong Mall; they build at the portion near the police station where they*
have now built the Jubilee Mall. It was basically coming from small business men who were actually expanding themselves. I know there has been also migration of other business men coming into the city as well (Rev Phiri, 14 February 2014).

Generally, participants pointed out that there are positive as well as negative factors which have played a role in bringing the economy of Tshwane to its current state of affairs. As Mr Matjeke observed,

*On the positive about Gauteng we see a greater development starting from our local villages at StinkWater, roads are been built, we see toilets being built; we see a lot of small job creation in terms of ‘tenderpreneurs’. But those are temporary. In terms of permanent job creation we see malls, big malls like Jubilee mall where by people got permanent jobs. When you look at our surrounding towns like Soshanguve you see again there is a lot of development in terms of plazas. You see economy is growing, and then Tshwane is doing something to create jobs on the positive side* (Mr Matjeke, 14 February 2014).

Jobs alluded to by Mr Matjeke include entry posts offered to hundreds of young people by the Metropolitan Police, the Public Works Extended Programme focussing on infrastructural development and the like.

Further, participants emphasised the discriminatory distribution of wealth practices whereby a few are wealthy and the majority are poor as a historical fact. Although there might be a degree of political change in the current system in terms of legislation pertaining to distribution of the wealth of the country, certain areas are still experiencing inequality as in the previous system. Mr Moeti put it this way:

*At least the struggles which people were going through … to get freedom and democracy…. have contributed in shaping up the political and economic structure of the country. Yet, the biggest problem which I think exists and has existed before (in the previous dispensation) is the distribution of country’s wealth to the citizens. Politically things might be doing well or things might be going on well, but in terms of the distribution of the country’s wealth and economic benefits to the citizens I think that’s where there is a problem. Even if there seems to be progress reported in different angles or in different areas of the country or even in different areas of the economy. But, in reality; the way people find access to economic resources from the state that’s where we experience the difficulties and the hardships* (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

Furthermore on the negative side, research participants highlighted that the economic situation of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal is not healthy. According to Mrs Mead, *we have come to this point because many factories in Hammanskraal, Soshanguve and GaRankuwa closed
Mrs Ngobeni voiced the opinion, *I think it is because of corruption* (Mrs Ngobeni, 14 February 2014). Mrs Mead considered that the current economic situation is somehow associated with political discourses pre-1994 (Mrs Mead, 14 February 2014). Mr Matjeke narrated the situation in the following manner.

*The CoT; to be where it is today economically it is more due to political reason. The down fall of Bophuthatswana, and the new government taking over are political events. As a result; a lot of unemployment and a lot of liquidation of companies at industrial areas like Babelegi (Hammanskraal) and Garankuwa industrial centres also collapsed with the former Bophuthatswana. The current government had no power and had no immediate plan, whatsoever to rebuild what the former Bophuthatswana had for the people. Also they incorporated Hammanskraal and GaRankuwa which used to be part of North West to Gauteng thinking that we will get more jobs and more services in the hope that there will be another vibrant Babelegi and GaRankuwa but we still waiting until today* (Matjeke, 14 February 2014).

Participants further speculated that the marginalisation of Garankuwa and Babelegi industrial sites was intentional because they represented the legacies of the old regime. It was a necessary political process so that communities would stop hankering after the past associated with the former Bophuthatswana homeland. With reference to Hammanskraal, Mrs Mead commented, *although that was intentional, I see it only as a political intention; it really had nothing positive to do with the economy. The economy got destroyed, so whatever intention it was; it only had political connotations but no economic consideration. The poor of the poor are still on the streets without jobs* (Mrs Mead, 14 February 2014). However, Mrs Mashigo said, it is difficult to pin down one or two allegations which you are trying to put forth in terms of the economic downfall as due to political backgrounds (Mrs Mashigo, 14 February 2014).

For Mrs Ngobeni, reasons for the current state of economic affairs could be also be associated with failure by government to foster an ethical value-based practice:

*I think what brought us here is that we were taught not to share by the new government although we were given freedom to make money in whichever way that we can. Yet at the same time it became difficult to do some of the things on our own and started to depend too much on the*

---

159 Best (1971) explains: in order to reduce overconcentration in the four main metropolitan areas and to promote the internal economies of the Bantu Homelands, the South African government initiated various border industries schemes of guaranteed Bantu wage control, subsidised transport and tax holidays to encourage industrial locations in specified White towns adjacent to Bantu areas. (See Best, 1971, pp. 329-343.) Hammanskraal, Soshanguve and GaRankuwa had industrial sites as part of these schemes of the Apartheid government.
authorities. That is where corruption came in, where we had to buy jobs; where we had to sell nyaope, have freedom to sell liquor and things like that (Mrs Ngobeni, 14 February 2014).

Question 2 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

What are the major political structures that determine how the city of Tshwane (S & H) organises power? Who makes the most important decisions in Tshwane (S & H)? Why?

Mr Matjeke noted:

The governing political party which is the ANC is the one that call all the shots, minority parties they play a very small role. The community doesn’t play that much of a role because the law and the rules and regulations and all these are signed in parliament and we just need to obey them (Mr Matjeke, 14 February 2014).

Given the principle of proportional representation in effect in the Republic of South Africa it is obvious that it is the ruling party which has the most influence in determining the power that structures the economy. The ANC, as the major political party, leads the implementation of decisions that affect Tshwane. Hence, the perception of the participants is that the Mayor, being an ANC member, represents more the interests of the ANC than those of the city. Mr Moeti elaborates:

They have political powers which grant them access at least to have more or major influence in what happens. They are implementing their own vision (of the ruling party) and … they will have to make sure in their vision or in their plan to achieve their goals or objectives as a ruling party. They are using the power they have or the authority they have to run such kind of a programme (Moeti, 14 February 2014).

Mrs Ngobeni concurred with Mr Moeti and continued, arguing that the ruling party does not encounter any real opposition, not even from the Church. In her words:

I think the ruling party have more freedom to put things the way they want them, somehow because there was nobody to challenge them when they started. Christians, we were playing very far from them. We did not want to be involved while they are there choosing their party members to be our representatives. If we were involved … we could oppose them or show them another way.
Power is free for them to use it the way they want because we as a church we don’t want to be involved in our things. I think we are part of our municipality therefore we are part of everything. I’m a Christian and I’m using water too; but I’m not going to go to the meeting when issues related to water are being discussed. I’m going to church; close my eyes to pray while some people are discussing things that are going to benefit all of us in the community. So at the end of the day I’m standing there complaining, they have power. I’m the one who gave them power (Mrs Ngobeni, 14 February 2014).

Expounding on that thought, Rev Phiri spoke philosophically about the new structures and power functions in terms of a historical perspective. The dismantling of apartheid meant it was replaced by a new democratic and inclusive socioeconomic and political regime. The city of Tshwane, being mindful of past apartheid ills, attempts to transform situations in serving all residents of the city. He explained:

You destroyed apartheid. Now the destroying of apartheid cannot be left in a vacuum; it must be filled, that means another must take its place. So destruction follows with restructuring; hence the restructuring now of the city of Tshwane or the restructuring of the political arena that we have, the restructuring of the economies and everything is the results of having to want to deal with the old effects of apartheid. The removing or pushing aside of Babelegi for example like we are just saying and let’s restructure so that everything begins to bring in everybody else into one place is an intentional process….I think you cannot restructure anything until you destroyed that which was holding the people captive in the past (Rev Phiri, 14 February 2014).

In addition, participation, especially public participation by ecclesial structures, was highlighted as an essential process in this reconstruction phase. Mrs Phiri put it this way:

We are the ones who need the best necessities of the community where we are living and the society that we are living in. But we neglect to participate due to the very fact that we tend to be more spiritual and we are so difficult to be part of everyday things that are happening. I would like to see the church in this entire thing together. The role of the church; the relevance of the church in the community has to be seen in concrete ways (Mrs Phiri, 14 February 2014).

Question 3 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

What are the most important relationships of influence and power that people have in Tshwane (S & H)? Why?
Rev Mokone (14 February 2014) responded: *in Tshwane we have this tendency of regarding my family before other people. It is more so even among those who are in government. And those ordinary citizens who have any relative in government have power and influence within communities.* Ms Shibambo added:

> Most influence lies on the political parties especially the ruling one; let us say when you are not an ANC member you don't have much power to convince people. Let us take an example, us as educators; those who register with the South African Democratic Teacher's Union (which is an ally of the ANC) have more power whatever they say whether it is right or wrong people accept it. The people who survive these days are those who belong to the ruling party. That one is a fact and then, yeah; has influence and power (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014).

This simply means, in the words of Rev Mokone, that

> in order to have a beautiful and influential, powerful relation with government it’s for me to hold a certain card. However, this is contrary to our constitution which says I have a freedom to belong. It’s not fair for us to hold cards in order for us or for our voice to be heard (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014).

Mr Moeti regarded these relationships of influence as opportunistic and discriminatory. He remarked:

> Relationship of influence is associated with who need what from whom. For example, I'm a business person and I need a tender (...) so obviously I will have to relate with someone or to form a certain kind of relationship which will give influence for my business. I think at the core of this kind of relationships is looking for opportunities (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

With reference to the church, participants considered that although some of those leaders and people of influence belong to some sectors of the church, the church has very little influence on their lives. In fact, Ms Shibambo stated: *at the church we give them higher positions because of they have relationships of power. Sometimes they come to the church not living a Christian life but because of who they are (...) we respect them we honour them.* (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014). In relation to those individuals who are in active political positions Mr Moeti supported her:

> Some of them (...) come to church but carrying that kind of political status which will also determine the way the rest of church members will relate to them. Sadly, they will come as they
are and leave as they are and won't feel any influence from the church to challenge their status and positions (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

Hence, participants recognised that the church is not strategically positioned and does not know how to disciple its members who are leaders in the public sphere. They also stated that the church is to blame for this lost opportunity. Rev Phiri suggested that:

*The church should emulate the prophets of old such as Elijah who rebuked the idolatrous King Ahab (1 Kings 17: 1). King Ahab was scared of the prophet because he represented divine authority* (Rev Phiri, 14 February 2014).

The rest of the group agreed that the role of the church as a community of prophets should not be relegated to any other social organisation.

But, the fact remains, continued Mr Moeti (14 February 2014), *people who are perceived to have the power are the politicians. That’s how the nation looks at them and that’s how they actually look at themselves.* Ms Makena, in support of Mr Matjieke and Rev Phiri, said:

*Leaders are elected into position of power to represent the interests of South African communities who elected them into office. The electorate has the power to influence the course of actions regarding election or rejection of any political candidate. Hence, the electorate has the power to call political figures to account and report* (Ms Makena, 14 February 2014).

Therefore, in terms of the role of the church towards mission in a city such as Tshwane with a view to helping the communities to help themselves economically, the church needs to know and interrogate what is happening. Hence analysis is very important to identify who are holding power in a community, and why. Somehow, *people expect much from the church and rightly so because the church is where people can come and get healed, cared for, and talk and so on* (Mrs Phiri, 14 February 2014). Yet, *the church is failing to use that position of influence* (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014). Ms Shibambo added:

*It seems the church is not doing its work. The church and the people around us are struggling because of the lack of knowledge. When things happen we do not know how to attend to them because we do not have enough knowledge about politics. So we keep quiet and some of the people who are very strong they will end up doing things that we do not like. The church is relaxing. The Christians are happy when they experience the peace of God in the land and have forgotten the nation, the people of God. I think if the church would stand up and want God to act because the church relies on God. We don’t fight the fight; God is the one who fights for us. If the church can move up from that sweet place where they are and stand for the community and*
stand up in the government, it is then that things will happen and the right things will happen (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014).

Question 4 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

What are the major cultural resources of the people of Tshwane (specifically in S & H) in terms of

- Religion, culture and traditions?
- Traditional knowledge and skills?

Building on the foregoing, participants know that relationships of influence and power have been abused; they encounter challenges concerning how to relate and connect with leaders. Participants assert that the church needs to mobilise its assets in order to reverse the situation. Hence, it is very important for the church to connect with communities in meaningful ways. As Dr Carol Bombal emphasised: *it is necessary for the church to reach out to tell those people about salvation; about God who is our source of everything* (Dr Bombal, 14 February 2014). The point is *to use the Christian message highlighting people’s personal experiences of salvation to draw others to come know this Christ* (Mr Ndlovana, 14 February 2014).

Research participants also saw the need to draw from sound cultural resources that could be used to transform and improve the lives of communities in Tshwane. According to Mr Moeti, we need to *find out the different things which culture may be teaching people (…) to draw upon for building communities and these things could be imparted to children* (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014) for the future of communities. Among cultural resources needed for community building, Dr Bombal remarked: *I appreciate the close knitted-ness of the African society it doesn’t occur in the western world. But I feel sometimes they don’t use that to lead and teach the young people* (Dr Bombal, 14 February 2014).

Other participants agreed that the closeness of African families is a cultural asset which could be used as a successful breeding ground for reaching the younger generations, raising them in the way of the Lord and directing their path when they are still young. Unfortunately, it is not employed. The group reckoned that if it were, it would enhance the thought of caring for one
another in the community. Ms Shibambo said: *We’ll develop into a strong nation* (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014). Mr Ndlovana likewise remarked:

> If revalorised, the close knitted-ness will assist South Africa to develop into a strong nation which has good bonds. If we are close to one another (...) the notion of Ubuntu and its ethos will be embraced by all. If one is bleeding, all are bleeding. If one prospers, all prosper (Mr Ndlovana, 14 February 2014).

Yet, there are challenges which could undermine cultural resources. It must be noted that culture is dynamic and undergoes transformation each generation. Yet, effort is required to retain good cultural practices through adaptation. Mr Moeti highlighted some of the challenges with which culture is faced today:

> These days the value of culture and its role in the community is not really appreciated. Whatever resources culture might have to influence today’s life and to shape the future might just well be undermined because of how people feel about culture most of times these days. Many people think their culture is backward. It is also another challenge to bring to people senses the value of culture …because …of how people feel about their own culture sometimes you find out that they don’t really appreciate it (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

Nevertheless, there are sound cultural practices that have been retained, although adapted to suit current circumstances. In the words of Ms Makena, *see for example practices of mutual assistance through community burial societies, stokvels*, saving clubs and the like (Ms Makena, 14 February 2014). Hence, Mr Moeti suggested, *the most important thing is to bring to people’s senses the importance of culture and whatever resources culture might have at least to improve life* (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

Participants also considered other resources. Mr Moeti added: *we also have community contribution to support the family in need in the community such as funeral and disaster* (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014). In terms of traditional knowledge, as Mrs Phiri pointed out, communities know *farming and planting and selling of crops which can help* (Mrs Phiri, 14

---

160 According to the Beehive, a Durban based non-profit organisation funded by One Economy Corporation, stokvels or savings clubs have been around in South Africa and Africa for many years. They are a successful method for people to help motivate each other to save, and many are like social clubs where members also help each other in ways other than with money. Regular stokvel meetings have become a social highlight in many communities (see [http://durban.thebeehive.org/content/39/1344 accessed 12 January 2015](http://durban.thebeehive.org/content/39/1344 accessed 12 January 2015)).
February 2014). The rest of the group concurred that indigenous knowledge in agriculture can help people to produce their own food although the city is downsizing plots in areas (villages in Hammanskraal) which were formerly situated in Bophuthatswana homeland. The knowledge is still there although it is now only in the hands of a few old people and is not filtering down to the younger generation.

Further, some participants also saw training and preparing young people for manhood and womanhood as important resources. Traditionally, Mrs Ngobeni averred, initiation schools were meant to

Teach them skills that they need to have to become productive citizens. But now it has been under threat due to corrupted practices of some traditional practitioners. At the moment it’s just been neglected you just see kids grow unruly, unemployed; somehow we need to reach this group and the community to realise the potential that we need to draw upon and to be grown and developed (Mrs Ngobeni, 14 February 2014).

Furthermore, co-operative sharing with others in need, which is a traditional norm in African culture, could be used to strengthen possibilities for economic development. The co-operative as a concept used to be an African asset. Ordinary people come together to put their means together to try to do something. For instance, individuals may not command enough resources to establish a company on their own but together they can pool their resources, found a large firm and start servicing the needs of the people. Mr Ndlovu put this as follows:

Since we are used to sharing, we can share what we have to start businesses together. Now we have people coming from even afar other countries coming to serve us or starting businesses in our communities. Instead of us coming together and starting one big business, we find ourselves

\[161\] During the days of the Bophuthatswana homeland, families were given a sizeable plot to serve both for habitation and subsistence agriculture to grow income crops such as maize.

\[162\] However, initiation schools do exercise a negative influence in entrenching gender-based roles and prejudices. In these schools, for example, women are taught about various matters which may be helpful, but they are also taught that a woman should marry to be subservient to her husband, must be loyal to him while he has liberty to seek extra-marital affairs, etcetera. They are also taught to do most of the household chores and even garden work, although the property and land will not belong to them but to their husbands. Hence Fulata Mhano-Moyo, in her PhD completed in 2009, discussed how women in Malawi re-interpreted the roles of initiation schools for women so as to prepare them for a Christian, dignified life where they can claim their full humanity, in such a way that women’s empowerment contributes to the betterment of the whole community.

starting smaller “nyana” (that is Setswana for small) businesses and grow up competing among ourselves when we are actually expected to complement one another and come up with a big thing that will benefit the communities (Mr Ndlovu, 14 February 2014).

Contrary to these views, Rev Mokone contended:

That culture of sharing is dead. To me we’re just too modern and individualistic. For us to come together and build something as a black community within the Hamanskraal and Soshanguve, I think this is a concept of Indian people. For me to have my own tuck shop is a mentality of being greedy saying I want to achieve all and in short of time..... The co-operative system is fine if it can be implemented but the way it’s been implemented somewhere somehow it has some difficulties because it doesn’t reach people to a certain level where they can holistically reach understanding about as Ms Shibambo said it is because of lack of knowledge (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014).

Rev Phiri, supported by Mr Khomo, remarked:

The entrepreneurial spirit of foreign citizens in the townships provides us with models and lessons. Take for an example Mozambicans who come empty handed and find work for just 2-3 months. Once they got enough money they will start selling on the streets. They would sell vegetables or they would sell sweets, and before long they have tuck shops and so on. It shows that one doesn’t always need to have big amounts of money to become self-reliant (Rev Phiri, 14 February 2014).

It is also important to bear in mind, argued some participants, that South African citizens have different perceptions about themselves in comparison to other African citizens. These have implications for the way they work to build their lives. Rev Mokone put it this way:

We should remember that the way we brought up is different from the way other people whom are especially from other countries around us were brought up. All I know is people have taken my land by force or they took my land by force so I must fight them. Currently I’m in freedom what am I supposed to do? Instead of building or producing things that are supposed to sustain me I’m busy blaming people. Somehow you know there are a lot of influences in terms of South African people. They went through a lot which today need to be rectified and for us to rectify that is for us to sit them down and teach them. This is the mechanism which you can use in order to make South Africans to have another view on issues. The people who can do this have also seen it as an opportunity to “chow.”\(^\text{163}\)

\(^{163}\) “Chow” means to eat in township slang. In this sentence it refers to service providers who use the ignorance of the people as a means to generate income for their own survival.
Nevertheless, participants recognised that in countries like Mozambique, for instance, people will not necessarily go and apply and wait for government to give them a job. That is why there are so many artisans coming from Mozambique, handymen; they just need to know a trade in order to set up shop and start working. They are everywhere in the townships of Tshwane. People of this calibre they normally say no; there's nothing defeating me, what is it that you want me to do and I'll do it for you, that's the motto (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014). Perhaps the residents of townships of Hammanskraal and Soshanguve could learn from these foreign citizens (Mr Ndlovana, 14 February 2014). Some foreign citizens such as Mozambicans, Zimbabweans, Somalis and Pakistanis are increasingly settling in peripheral townships to pursue business interests and they have proven to be successful in these contexts, although in the midst of harsh economic conditions in the country. They are certainly an asset for LED.

Question 5 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

Most people have values about what is right and wrong, based on religious beliefs, cultural roots, family background, and laws, organisational or political organisations to which they belong. What do people of Tshwane (S & H) want or value most in life? Why? What are the acceptable and accepted ways that guide the aspirations and expectations that people have? Why?

In general Rev Mokone, Mr Ndlovu, Ms Shibambo and Mr Moeti (14 January 2014) responded that people of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal value money and education most. In comparing these two, participants valued money more than education. Hence they regard education mainly as a means to obtain money. As Rev Mokone remarked:

When I'm speaking for the age group (i.e. young adults) I'm from; for us we view education is somewhere I need to sit, learn and be able to interact in order for me to earn money. That's why I'm saying education is there, but the group I'm within values money more than anything (Mokone, 14 February 2014).
Others contended that: education is a key for everything (Mr Ndlovu, 14 February 2014). Ms Shibambo similarly observed: you see the youth ‘flooding’ to universities wanting to be more educated. Some of the learners want education; they want to be academically right, this shows that education is a priority (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014). Nevertheless, reiterated Mr Moeti: the thing that people value most is money. Education is co-valued because it is considered to be the stepping stone to great achievement in life that is a very good thing (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014). In the same vein, Pastor Megala agreed with the young people that people really value money; they are using education as a stepping stone for money (Pastor Megala, 14 February 2014).

Further, Mr Chimuti added that: even in the church you find that it’s all about money. The emphasis is on how you can be rich; that even when you are giving offering you give so that you can get million or thousands. So the church is valuing money (Mr Chimuti, 14 February 2014); as Pastor Megala observed, nowadays, if you don’t have money in church you don’t have status (Pastor Megala, 14 February 2014). He added: money in church circulates. When you are giving offerings we don’t give offerings because of offering we want to show off to the next person (Pastor Megala, 14 February 2014). This obsession with money is also evident in the attitude of people wanting a job or something that pays more even if they don’t have the qualifications required for it (Rev Rustof, 14 February 2014).

Ms Shibambo made the point that both education and money supplement and complement each other. When we talk of education, to be educated we want money to boost us, at the same time we become educated to get money. The two complements each other (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014).

There is also, as Dr Bombal pointed out, value in freedom. She said: I value freedom that we have, freedom to go where you want to seek a job, to travel where you want to and religious freedom (Dr Bombal, 14 February 2014). Mrs Mokgoto values prosperity most. She responded, prosperity to add on to that, it’s more than money (Mrs Mokgoto, 14 February 2014). Mrs Bodiba emphasised that I think we value life itself, because saying we value money; because of it we can improve our lives style. It helps us buy good food, good nutritious food so that we can be healthy (Mrs Bodiba, 14 February 2014). Ms Mathebula added we also value relationships (Ms
Mathebula, 14 February 2014). For Mr Ndlovana, *knowledge is most valued that is why people want to study* (Mr Ndlovana, 14 February 2014) and for Mr Moeti, *the land is most valued* (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

From the foregoing, participants highlighted freedom (of religion, of expression, of belonging and of movement), education and money as aspects most valued by the communities of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. They also value other factors, i.e. knowledge (which is linked to education), family (which is part of relationship), prosperity, life itself, peace and the land. It was also established that these objectives which participants said the communities of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal value most are regarded as positive in any tradition. Any society wants people to prosper, to have education and so on. Hence, there are acceptable and accepted ways that guide the aspiration and expectations that people nurture with regard to these objectives. Dr Bombal emphasised that *we actually base the acceptable on biblical value-based ethical standards* (Dr Bombal, 14 February 2014). It is important also to understand, submitted Mr Moeti, *that there are so many influencing factors which bring the knowledge of right and wrong to people. We should know to bring this to people’s attention.* (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

For example, in relation to money, prosperity and acquiring wealth, Mr Mashabane said: *I will start with money: have education and then you work; get a job and work. To get money when you work that’s how it comes and not doing it the other ways by robbing* (Mr Mashabane, 14 February 2014). Together *we prosper by contributing positively in other people’s lives* (Ms Makena, 14 February 2014). It was also significant that participants began to realise, in agreement with Ms Makena, that prosperity comes by contributing positively to other people’s lives. It is not necessarily about amassing assets for oneself. Rather, it is achieved when one invests in the lives of others. For this reason participants condemned illicit means of obtaining money. Rev Mokone provided an illustration to make a point about people who are contributing negatively.

> You sell alcohol in our community … and just say “ah u baba u Credo isdakwa lesi” (which means Mr Credo is a drunkard) … So you’re been killed by me who’s selling alcohol within the community. For me I see my business as a means of me sustaining my life and building a double storey house and everything like that. However, I’m killing people (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014).
In relation to education, Rev Mokone maintained: *I value knowledge; therefore I have to go to school* (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014). Ms Shibambo further indicated that one should *get educated and influence others to go to school to become educated* (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014). Expanding on this, Mr Moeti responded, *while people are being educated there must also be at least a plan to create jobs for people who are getting educated* (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

In relation to relationships, participants considered that within family, community organisations, religious bodies and public institutions, genuine relationships of mutual benefit should prevail for the sake of collective wellbeing. According to Rev Mokone this requires simplicity, accessibility and being approachable. He put it this way: *I value relationships, therefore I’m approachable and I can easily relate with other people* (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014).

Finally, in relation to freedom participants highlighted the fact that it does not amount to abuse or the freedom to embrace an unethical lifestyle. People have freedom in all spheres of life in South Africa so that they can do the right thing which does not hurt the next person. Hence, *freedom must be accompanied by accountability* (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014). Mr Ndlovana added: *I’m free but I account to others and I don’t infringe on their freedom or abuse my freedom in a selfish manner* (Mr Ndlovana, 14 February 2014).

**Question 6 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

**What are the sources of creativity and hope for the future in the present situation?**

In the religious context, Mr Moeti sees *prayer and faith towards God as the source of hope that regardless of the current situation, everything will be fine* (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014). For Mrs Ngobeni, *the history of the past in South Africa gives us hope regardless of what is happening now there is hope in the future and it will become better* (Mrs Ngobeni, 14 February 2014). According to Mr Moeti, the fact that we have various good institutions like schools and the more we see children being educated we have hope that in the future they can turn things around from their education, skills and experience (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).
Mr Khomo added: there are also strong family structures and some good leaders in our communities who inspire creativity and hope for the future in our townships (Mr Khomo, 14 February 2014). It gives us hope that parents are encouraging children to pursue good life; to make good decisions about life and such (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014). Ms Makena echoed this view:

> Good leadership of some individuals is carrying us now and gives us hope for the future. With the freedom and the good institution that we have in the CoT, we still have hope for the future. We bear in mind that one’s place of birth and residence (i.e. black townships) does not determine his future (Ms Makena, 14 February 2014).

Researcher’s synthesis of participants’ narratives during analysis of LED phases (historical and structural relationships):

1. **Historical reasons:**
   a) **positive:** some local business people are thriving in the new South Africa, migration of businesses to S & H has boosted the local economy, infrastructural development, tenders and creation of temporary employment, and private investments (shopping malls);
   b) **negative:** collapse of former homeland industrial hubs (Babelegi and Ga Rankuwa) which resulted in mass unemployment and led to paralysis of LED and liquidation of local companies, failure of the unification process of structures and systems towards making the “new South Africa” in consolidating the development agenda of areas which used to be parts of homelands (e.g. Hammanskraal), persistent discriminatory patterns of distribution of wealth, communities on the margins struggle to access meaningful economic opportunities, lack of a concrete plan to rebuild the collapsed industrial hubs, failure of government to foster ethical value based practices and behaviour in public office.

2. **Structures that drive LED:**
   a) **major driver:** the governing party (the African National Congress);
   b) **minor drivers:** local communities exert little influence, and the church.

164 I am, as a researcher, encouraged to hear that young women such as Ms Makena have high hopes for a better future based on the fact that there is now freedom and establishment of properly pro-poor institutions in South Africa. Yet, the latest research has shown that “many societies are characterised by deeply entrenched gender inequality and gender-based discrimination, in which women and girls have less power and status in their families and communities than men and boys. The inequality manifests itself in less access to education, economic and political resources and social networks” (UNFPA 2015: 38). This, therefore, requires LED in Tshwane to be sensitive and proactive to the gender aspect in ways which address these entrenched gender inequalities and gender-based discrimination, so that women and girls enjoy equal economic opportunities.
plays an insignificant role ("it tends to be more spiritual and fails to be relevant in concrete ways").

3. **The most important relationships of influence and power that people have in Tshwane (S & H) are**: family, having relatives in government and political affiliation with the ruling party (the relationships emanating from this affiliation have been described as opportunistic and discriminatory against non-members). It is noted that the masses, although power lies with them as the electorate, possess little knowledge of how to exercise their rights. The church has very little influence on the lives of its members who are also politicians since it is failing to use its position of influence and power to acquire deep knowledge on issues affecting communities and to interrogate what is happening.

4. **Cultural resources in terms of religion, culture and traditions include**: experiences of faith in God's sovereignty and providence and salvation, the Christian message, the close knit nature of African family structures, Ubuntu as a cultural framework and the existence of sound cultural practices such as mutual assistance through burial societies, stokvels, community contributions to support a person in need. Cultural resources in terms of traditional knowledge and skills include agricultural skills, initiation schools, cooperative ownership and sharing of resources and the entrepreneurial skills of foreign citizens in townships as models. However, the close networks of African communities are threatened by, amongst other factors, individualistic tendencies, the perception that culture is backward, lack of knowledge about cultural and traditional resources and negative perceptions about the identity, socioeconomic and political history of black South Africans.

5. **The following objectives are valued most by the people of S & H; reasons are provided in brackets**: 1) Money (it gives one power to realise dreams and meet needs. Hence people are obsessed with the pursuit of money; even some church sectors are guilty of this obsession), 2) Education and knowledge (viewed as a key for everything including acquiring wealth, money and status), 3) Freedom (of movement, of choice, of beliefs and of work), 4) Prosperity (viewed as being more than money), 5) Life (we value all these other values to improve life itself), 6) Relationships (which sustain life) and 7) Land (the basis for self and community development). However, there are acceptable and accepted ways, based on value based ethical standards, to realise these valued objectives. For example: to have money, one must work for it not by resorting to
illegitimate means. Collective prosperity is achieved by contributing positively in other people’s lives. If one values knowledge s/he must be educated. With regard to relationships, simplicity and interests in others should be maintained. Freedom does not amount to abuse or to embracing an unethical lifestyle. Rather, it is accompanied by accountability and does not infringe on the freedom of others.

6. **The sources of creativity and hope for the future in the present situation include:**
   1) Prayer and faith in God (as the source of hope that regardless of the current situation things will be fine), 2) History of South Africa, especially the victory over apartheid, gives communities hope for a better future, 3) The existence of worthwhile institutions such as schools gives communities hope that in the future the situation will improve, 4) Solid family structures with parents who encourage their children to make sensible choices in life give communities hope, 5) The existence of some worthy leaders in communities gives hope to communities and 6) Freedom and opportunities in the CoT give individuals hope by indirectly reinforcing the thought that “one’s place of birth and residence does not determine his / her future”.

7.1.2. SECOND SESSION

Phase four – Conclusion of analysis

In this phase, participants were able to discern the most important elements in Tshwane (S & H) economy. They reviewed the responses made to the six questions regarding the four analytical categories of the third phase (i.e. history, structures, values, direction) and identified the most basic causes which create the realities of the current situation of Tshwane’s (S & H) LED.

To uncover these basic causes, Holland and Henriot (1984: 101) suggests that we must first prioritise or rank within each analytical category (history, structures, values, direction) the most significant factors influencing the situation.

In the focus groups, we discussed questions such as:

Question 1 (with the joint group on 14 February at Hammanskraal)

Which one or two historical events most shaped the present local economy? (History)
With reference to Hammanskraal, Ms Shibambo reported: *business people closed down factories and returned to their homes overseas or relocated after 1997 and people lost jobs. Most people lost jobs and then they didn’t have money to survive* (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014). In agreement with Ms Shibambo, participants still perceive unemployment and loss of jobs in Hammanskraal to have had a serious negative impact on the economy of Tshwane. Dr Bombal added that *a lot of existing factory businesses also gone down because of theft, they are giving up because they are not making business* (Dr Bombal, 14 February 2014).

Other matters to consider include the growing number of young people on welfare grants. Ms Shibambo spoke of this issue especially in relation to the young girls who *thought that to have money it is better to have more children. There are more children and not enough resources in the family to support the children* (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014). There is also the issue of *tenders which supports temporarily [temporarily] the local economy* (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014).

Although participants recognised that the phenomenon of the “tenderpreneur” is one of the major events that have happened in the past 20 years it has also brought about challenges; as highlighted in Chapter 6, it was established that most tenderpreneurs are linked politically to the ruling party. This makes it very difficult for gifted, to say nothing of ordinary, entrepreneurs to obtain opportunities with government. As Mr Matjeke, supported by Ms Shibambo, pointed out, *the issue of tenders was not correctly handled; tenders were received by the people who had money* (Mr Matjeke, 14 February 2014) and not the impoverished ordinary population. All these factors drove a great many people into poverty; Dr Bombal contended that this has led to *strikes being involved in the economy* (Dr Bombal, 14 February 2014). There is also privatisation of companies and competition in the economy. For Ms Mathebula, *the few individual people who own enterprises are the few who benefit and compete in the economy forgetting the majority* (Ms Mathebula, 14 February 2014) who are still trapped in poverty.

**Question 2 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

*Which economic, political, social, and cultural factors (Structure) most determine the operation of the city of Tshwane’s (S & H) economic system?*
Unanimously, participants regarded the city’s political and economic structures with the Mayor and the ANC as being very influential in this process. The other stakeholders such as non-governmental and faith based organisations, social and cultural structures do not participate meaningfully here.

**Question 3 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

Which one or two values have the most impact on how people of Tshwane (S & H) act and thereby on the Tshwane (S & H) economy?

Bearing in mind the motto of the Local as well as National governments it could ideally be *batho pele (meaning People First)* (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014). Participants agreed that *batho pele* also goes hand in hand with delivery of service. *Batho pele* is linked to relationship and is rooted in Ubuntu for the purpose of collective community wellbeing. In building a new city and erasing the apartheid past of the CoT, *batho pele* is an important value to guide actions and plans. Unfortunately, according to Ms Mathebula, *money has the most impact on how people of Tshwane act* (Ms Mathebula, 14 February 2014).

Participants also raised issues that people value which would have the most impact but which are currently neglected, such as work and education which prepares for work. Ms Shibambo considered that *creating job opportunities (work for all)* (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014) would have the most impact on the local economy of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. This will imply, argued Mrs Bodiba: *giving communities a practical education. Practical education is about training people for vocations (skills). We need to create jobs so we need people with technical education* (Mrs Bodiba, 14 February 2014).

**Question 4 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

Which trends seem most likely for the future of LED in Tshwane (S & H)?
Research participants unanimously agreed [it should be about integration of all sectors and of all players of the economy. It is important that integration of all our economic players becomes the trend]. As an example, Ms Makena spoke:

*There is a model that they have tried out in Johannesburg; where informal traders in Yeoville have been given a market space, so they have stalls and sell there in the Central Business District. It’s much more regulated than the way it used to, but integrated in the business district* (Ms Makena, 14 February 2014).

When the "various elements have been prioritised, we needed to make a second effort at ranking and then drawing some conclusions" (Henriot 1983: 101). Our focus groups drew their conclusions by answering the following questions:

**Question 5 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

**What are the two or three basic causes (in terms of history; economic, political, social, and cultural structures); as well as values and trends most responsible for the current situation?**

Research participants named three factors: we value money more than people, while distorted relationships and privatisation have led the economy to the current situation. With regard to money, Rev Mokone made this point:

*We value money more than people. Hence, we have no other choice but to embrace an economy that maximise the making of money. We have no other choice but to become capitalistic. Because, that’s the only economic system that can make profit even to the point of killing people because they want to make money* (Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014).

On relationships Mr Moeti elaborated:
Relationships are both a good cause and a bad cause of what we’re going through in Tshwane (S & H). In a good sense racial boundaries are been reduced, we are (seemingly) functioning together as a city. In a bad way, corrupt relations with people in government (people are corrupt there) have bred further marginalisation of others. So it’s playing both ways – it is like a double edged sword (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

For Ms Shibambo, the pursuits of money together with distorted relationships enhanced individualistic privatisation. Private owners of companies and businesses wanting to over-maximise profits will naturally developed corrupt relationships with government officials for mutual benefit (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014).

Question 6 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

In whose interests do these basic causes operate?

Mrs Phiri emphasised that maximising profit (money making), privatisation and corrupt relationships benefit the rich and business people (Mrs Phiri, 14 February 2014) because, as Mr Ndlovu noted, they are the ones who can afford, in privatisation they are the ones who are buying the businesses, they are the one who are running the businesses (Mr Ndlovu, 14 February 2014). Ms Shibambo added:

Politicians and political elite are also benefiting. The political elite and the business folks have the money. The economic system is only benefiting a small number of people. The problem is we don’t know how to read those issues and make sure that we position ourselves to get the benefits. But it’s obvious just a minority, a tiny minority of people benefit of what is happening. So therefore even if they go on TV and say the economy of Tshwane has grown 5 %; what does that mean for me here in Kanana? (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014).

For Mr Moeti,

Things are still the same way they used to be and at the end of the day it doesn’t really matter; whatever language they are using to state those figures (statistics and economic indicators) we don’t see the positive effect in concrete ways on people’s lives. The other thing I wanted to say; somewhere somehow people also use relationships at least as the way to access a lot of riches personally as she stated relationships in a good way and a bad way (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).
Generally, research participants agreed that there are two issues associated with relationships in relation to tenderpreneurs (mainly private businesses): the abuse of relationships and the abuse of power. There are two classes of people, the political elite and those in business who have been benefiting so far from these changes communities have experienced in Tshwane. Hence, Rev Phiri pointed out,

*That the church needs to equip its members to be able to read and understand what is happening in the community as a result of the economic enterprise. This will assist the church to become involved in mission. The church needs more than the Bible if she is willing to get involved in helping communities to find solutions to their problems* (Rev Phiri, 14 February 2014).

**Question 7 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

What are those causes and conditions in terms of history, structure, values and trends, which create hope and opportunities for LED?

For Ms Mathebula, knowledge creates hope and opportunities for LED. She responded: *we can use knowledge and even have a trend of pursuing knowledge which will enable us to have a good viable local economic development* (Ms Mathebula, 14 February 2014). Ms Shibambo perceives the Christian faith as a powerful instrument which creates hope grounded on ethical, value based conduct in community. Hence, she advocated for *restoration of power to the Christians* (Ms Shibambo, 14 February 2014). However, some research participants emphasised the fact that *Christians fail to use the transforming power of the Holy Spirit given to them for discernment and ministry* (Rev Phiri, 14 February 2014) in the public sphere. Ms Makena also asserted that *many times the church lacks deep knowledge on real life issues that people face in the community. Therefore, she misses out on opportunity for ministry* (Ms Makena, 14 February 2014). With particular reference to the youth Mr Matjeke emphasised:

*As a church we are not playing a good or a major role in our youth life. The youth that were supposed to be part of the economy are now paralysed by drugs and the church doesn’t have any sort of rehabilitation for the youth* (Mr Matjeke, 14 February 2014).

Building on this point concerning the plight of youth, Dr Bombal observes a correlation between dysfunctionality at home and bad behaviours of youths in the community. For her,
We really need to start in the home. Something is wrong in the structure of the home which causes the child to want something from outside. And I think it is where we need to focus on, on the family. Children need to learn how to communicate with one another and I think that’s the key. I think a good structure starting in the home will assist in addressing this issue. These well-raised children will become real assets for local economic development (Dr Bombal, 14 February 2014).

The rest of the research participants concurred that the major issue in need of restoration is the role of the family, especially strengthening the latter in its formative functions. The group recognises for instance, that engineers are not produced in the universities. They are produced at home; likewise for medical doctors. When a child knows that in the safe environment of family she or he can pursue any career and have support, given sufficient resources that child will confidently go all the way through her or his studies.

Mrs Phiri emphasised a healthy environment where a child is taught the way to choose right, the way to express himself, the way to conduct himself in public, all those things will help them grow and will in turn strengthen the family and contribute to the economy of our city (Mrs Phiri, 14 February 2014). Dr Bombal added that we need:

To learn from the past how the family structure was taken care of. Families were community in themselves and ....and they created and used to improve things; they use to create space to love and care and communicate. Now we think money can replace all of these functions that family plays (Dr Bombal, 14 February 2014).

Further, Ms Mathebula commented:

Sometimes we tend to address the symptoms say for example; nowadays we are concerned about money. Parents are working themselves to death just to have this wealth. Then children are being neglected. But the most important thing is not those material things; children need the presence of the parents imparting those cultural and spiritual values in them (Mathebula, 14 February 2014).

Question 8 (with the joint group on 14 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

What are some of those causes and conditions in terms of history, structure, values and trends, which help people to make a sustainable living and form part of LED?
After revisiting some of the values they had named earlier such as freedom, life, knowledge and relationships, participants chose to discuss two of these (i.e. freedom and knowledge through education) in relation to sustaining a living in Tshwane (S & H). In order for knowledge to sustain a living, Mr Mashabane pointed out; one needs to put into action what you know (Mr Mashabane, 14 February 2014). Yet, he continued, this is the biggest challenge the government is faced with in this new dispensation. He put it in these words:

*being in slavery is even more easier than being in freedom because when you are in slavery you are doing things as told and maybe the plan is set up for you to do this or that. When you are in freedom you have to think what can I do; how can I come up with ideas and resources, how can I sustain this, what to do and so on. But when you are in slavery everything is done for you. You are told what to do* (Mr Mashabane, 14 February 2014)

Pastor Megala elaborated: putting into action what you know requires a plan (a development plan); communities are now free to plan in the New South Africa (Past Megala, 14 February 2014). Furthermore, he said, one of the reasons for people failing to put knowledge into practice is

> Although people are free they cannot function without being told do this, do that. Like somebody can sweep and leave the dirt there, they don't think you need to collect it and throw it away. It lies there for the whole week; you tell them sweep and they sweep, collect and throw away. That's what they want, that's what slavery had done to our people; they cannot think for themselves what to do (Pastor Megala, 14 February 2014).

For these reasons the group considered, and raised, the concern that freedom on paper has not really imparted freedom to many individuals in terms of sustaining a living in ways essential to LED in Tshwane (S & H). Mr Moeti responded:

*Freedom (in South Africa) seems to be the toughest challenge people have ever had in life. Because it comes with responsibility and accountability so at the end of the day freedom gives you access to exercise your own will. It is your choice to say no I will do it another day or I will do it maybe next year. I think at least we need educational empowerment and it also takes us back to the point Mrs Bodiba made about that practical education. So that people can live out of what they know and also know how to use what they know* (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014).

The rest of the research participants agreed that managing freedom (and its duties and responsibilities) and practical educations would assist the community to sustain a living and become active participants in LED in Tshwane. Another factor, continued Mr Moeti, is to know
what is happening in the community. It requires that we start observing what was happening in our community. That can also help us to engage with the community at the level of their needs which they have (Mr Moeti, 14 February 2014). The church can facilitate these roles if she manages to foster strategic relationships with the community.

Question 9 (with the joint group on 14 February at Hammanskraal)

How do Christians/members of churches make a living and form part of LED? How can one take the best examples and expand on them?

Participants stated that many members of churches in the townships try to make a living by selling or initiating a community project. Mr Matjeke told his personal story of how he started his small business, ranging from beginning by selling “sphatlo” (a quarter loaf of bread stuffed with potato fries, atchar (spicy mango pickles), French polony (cold meat) and eggs) at a local school to becoming an established local businessman who now owns two tuck shops in the community. It took him more than 15 years to arrive where he is. He emphasised:

You can start up a small business even if it means at the beginning you don’t have to employ anyone. You do it by yourself whilst you grow and make job creation. Even if it is two people that you employ, you have made a difference in South Africa or in Tshwane. In church you can start project of planting spinach and selling them that would also make a difference. It is like a drop of water in the sea, but a sea without a drop is less (Mr Matjeke, 14 February 2014).

Many church members make a living and form part of LED through formal employment, i.e. permanent, temporary or casual. Ms Makena elaborated on this by saying (while pointing at some members of the group):

She works in kindergarten, you work as a teacher, you work as a counsellor and career guidance at school, she works in business, she works for the church, medical professions, etc. We have legitimate works; we do work to contribute to the economy. That’s how we provide food for our families and build our wealth. Through our work we are taking part in improving the life, maybe some extending assistance in improving the lives of those around us, in our own family but it is better also to start thinking bigger or broader (Makena, 14 February 2014).
Ms Mkandla echoed this point: *some members work by volunteering their skills and knowledge by making themselves (as a resourceful person) accessible to a group of people in need in the community to teach them how to help themselves* (Ms Mkandla, 14 February 2014).

**Researcher’s synthesis of participants’ narratives in phase four: conclusion of analysis (most important issues and causes which create the realities of the current situation in S & H):**

1. **Basic historical events:** a) closing down of factories post 1994 and b) privatisation and tenders made available to previously disadvantaged business people in relation to Affirmative Action policies. Yet only a few historically disadvantaged people are benefiting, while most of the poor are dependent on grants. Old apartheid structures and divisions are still underlying the economy

2. **Structures:** political and economic structures, with the mayor and the ANC being very influential

3. **Values:** money is what most people value. Other things of value such as *batho pele*, education, and work are undermined even though their importance is acknowledged

4. **Trend for the future:** integration of all sectors and of all economic role players and better education to equip people for making a living, also in trades and handiwork

5. **Basic causes:** a) value money more than people, b) distorted (corrupt) socioeconomic and political relationships and c) privatisation

6. **Groups benefiting:** wealthy business people, politicians and the elite

7. **Causes and conditions which create hope and opportunities:** a) awareness and deep knowledge of real life issues affecting communities, b) historically, Christian faith was proven to be a powerful instrument for igniting hope, c) the formative roles of family which foster *batho pele*, *Ubuntu* and cultural values and knowledge.

8. **Causes and conditions that help people to make a living and contribute to LED:** a) translate knowledge into action, b) maximise the gains of freedom by leading self-reliant lives and c) knowledge of what is happening in the community
9. **Means employed by church/Christians to make a living and form part of LED:** a) selling and starting small businesses (e.g. Mr Matjeke’s story), b) starting community projects, c) taking up formal employment and volunteering services for a donation, d) assuming a more prophetic and justice seeking orientation.

It is clear, from the foregoing, that previous apartheid structures and divisions are still underlying the economy even though we are in the New South Africa. The trend for the future should be based on better education to equip people for making a living, in trades and handiwork as well. *Batho pele*, *Ubuntu* and other cultural values and knowledge are very important assets which create opportunities and hope for the people.

### 7.2. Third mini-consultation – including two sessions

This mini-consultation was held with the joint group – including both the Soshanguve and Hammanskraal groups – and was divided into two sessions i.e. theological reflection and the way forward. The first session was held on 15 February and the second on 17 February 2014. This mini-consultation took place in Hammanskraal at the Hammanskraal Gospel Centre hall. Participants from Soshanguve were provided with transport. Other logistical arrangements such as meals and refreshments and venue were coordinated by Rev Phiri and his wife, the pastoral couple of the Hammanskraal Gospel Centre. 28 participants attended the first session. The second session of this mini-consultation took place on Monday 17 February 2014. Since it was not possible to have all the participants present on Monday due to work commitments for some, it was agreed that 10 participants (i.e. five pastors (all men), one businessman, two young people and two women) representing six churches, communities and business people should attend the third mini-consultation. These 10 participants were available and were mandated to represent the rest. For preparation purposes, these representatives were provided with syntheses of all previous mini-consultations.

#### 7.2.1. FIRST SESSION

**Phase 5 - Theological reflection with the focus group**
Drawing from Holland and Henriot (1983: 104) the elements of scripture, questions and prayer were regarded as fundamental to theological reflection. I opened up by revisiting the basic causes of what had been summed-up in the analysis. The group prayed for light to discern the presence of the Spirit in the midst of the situation in (S & H), to hear the call and the message, and to be open to the lessons. As for specific questions for reflection, we discussed the following:

**Question 1 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

What consequences (negative and positive) does this situation have for building a Christian community response in Tshwane (S&H)?

Participants agreed that the church must move into a position to formulate a Christian community response to deal with the issues in the economy in Tshwane. Yet, they also realised that the values inherent in God’s economy rules will not easily be supported.

Dr Bombal thinks the value of Sabbath (i.e. rest as a fundamental principle) will not be supported if applied in the economy. The people want the money; they don’t want to rest (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014). Contrary to this, some research participants argued that there are some people who, for the sake of survival, can’t afford to rest though, if given a choice and a chance, they would like to do so. Mr Moeti expressed this as follows: other people are desperate or in dire need to get the money; regardless of the fact that they might have opportunity to rest, they are willing to sacrifice even their good health to get money (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014). However, explained Rev Phiri:

*Some people are not happy to sacrifice their good health but they are forced to do it because there is no other alternative in the system. Admittedly it is related to the way the system is structured, also because they’re in need. These people are aware that when you work for somebody you have limited rights* (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014).

Further, Mr Matjeke pointed out, we know in reality someday; somehow, somebody must work for somebody on the Sabbath day (i.e. day of rest). In reality the services are also needed on that day (Mr Matjeke, 15 February 2014).

But, continued Mr Matjeke,
There are some things that we can do as a church to improve the economy. Let’s say for an example we as a church can play our role in teaching the gospel of sharing, of sharing not only about wealth. Somebody will never give you his or her million but somebody can donate it to the church building project. The church can promote that kind of sharing. Collectively the Church of Tshwane can practice and teach that to the community. Sharing that way, we can win that one as a church (Mr Matjeke, 15 February 2014).

Nonetheless, stated Rev Phiri: the church needs to come to that place where the unity factor becomes a very important ingredient in order for us to affect our community. I see selfishness in the church myself (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014) – which stands in the way of cultivating a sharing culture. In support of Rev Phiri, Ms Mkandla observed:

The church itself lacks in terms of good relationships hence it cannot convincingly be a catalyst and a model for good relationship which can foster local economic development in the community. It fails to foster fellowship in its ranks. So, the best place to start is to rebuild relationship and fellowship (sharing resources and information) in the church first and together the church will stand up to tackle the economic issues affecting communities. It was also noted that economic issues affect all sectors of the church, thus a collective and ecumenical response must be envisaged (Ms Mkandla, 15 February 2014).

While many research participants agreed that unity in purpose and vision on the side of the church is the first step in addressing the economic issues, the church must first be united before it will be in a position to address current socioeconomic issues. Rev Mokone on the other hand, questioned where the church went wrong:

If we can be clear, the downfall of the apartheid was partly planned within the Church; the Church played a very big role in order for us to see freedom today. We know how powerful the Church can be. It simply says now we need to go back to be one body and say to Parliament you can’t be passing legislations which are not in line with the collective wellbeing of communities in South Africa. But, I’m saying for us to win this is for us to go back to the unity which the church had before the freedom. Maybe the question is what unity? How are we supposed to come together? Where are we now? (Rev Mokone, 15 February 2014).

Mr Chimuti highlighted that the weakness of the Church emanates from the fact that we are not united as the body of Christ. Hence, we Christians, we lose our values (Mr Chimuti, 15 February 2014). Mr Khomo was of the opinion that the Church has resources and assets needed to steer the socioeconomic situation to benefit all communities. He told a story of how sacrificial sharing is raising resources for churches to build or acquire facilities:
There was a church which needed a big church building structure (...) the leader went out to seek for donations (...) everywhere but he couldn’t get anything. And finally he realised that his church members have the potential to raise the money needed for the building project. So one day he called a young man who was smartly dressed to stand in front of the church congregation and asked him how much his clothes and shoes cost. Then he challenged all the members who do afford to buy decent clothing to pledge the amount their clothes are worth towards the building project. Simply put; by denying ourselves to dress up with expensive clothes financial resources were released to benefit the building project. Since then this church started sharing this way they have the resources needed for their ministry. I started to learn from this story that sharing is an important way in God’s view to meet our needs and those of communities. They did it through what we call pledging (Mr Khomo, 15 February 2014).

In agreement with Mr Khomo, Mr Moeti asserted: there is something that we can do together to try, to deal with the situation that we find ourselves in. There is hope that the church can still turn the situation around (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014) if we can share our resources for the good of communities. Hence, continued Mr Khomo:

We need to do analysis about what is it that the community need? What is it that the church can provide? Then we can match the need with the solution. In Education for an example there is a problem of mismatch i.e. people go to school; got trained but they can’t get work, because there is a problem of mismatch. If they knew what the government need is, they go to train for that need then they come back and get the right job available on the market. The church has educated members who can assist the young people in career path (Mr Khomo, 15 February 2014).

For Mr Matjeke, in order for the church to be able to construct a viable Christian response to the current situation she has to engage in politics. He expressed his view as follows:

I think what the church can also do is trying to engage herself in politics. I know the perception that politics and the church do not mix. We as the church we are saints we think like politic is a sin. Why? Because the world is playing dirty politics, dirty politics of corruption, dirty politics of selling tenders but we as a church we need to engage in politics because that’s the real world where we live in. And the reason that we are not making an impact is that when we go to politics, politicians already knew that we don’t have; (don’t take it wrong it is not an insult but that’s how politicians think us church people) brains to make money. They only need a pastor to come and pray and then after praying for the meeting they say thank you, you can go. You did your part as a pastor, when they’re going to speak about tenders, about how to run Tshwane and South Africa
the pastor is out. We are playing far from politicians; we think being a politician and a church, Christian is like water and oil like politics they don't mix (Mr Matjeke, 15 February 2014).

Rev Mokone feels that Christianity has become irrelevant because it has lost the appeal to influence decisions in South Africa:

Even though the South African Church is represented within Parliament with pastors serving in different commissions (...) they still take decisions that are contrary to the Christian ethos. How do they feel when they say a 12 year old girl can do abortion? The African Christian Democratic Party leader is a pastor but he doesn't stand up for what is right; for things which are disrupting life here currently (Rev Mokone, 15 February 2015).

For Rev Phiri:

The problem is still with the church; church is supposed to be a prophetic voice of the nation. We are good at quoting scriptures like you are the salt of the earth and the light of the world. But what influence is our quotation practically has on what is happening out on the ground, on the ground in the society? And I understand that society is the business society, society is the economic society, it is a political society, religious society; it is a whole spectrum of society that we’re looking for. What is our effect in those areas? What is our voice as a church? What prophetic voice do we have for business in them?

Because we are going to be used; just come and pray for me. Lay hands on me, give some water or anoint me with oil that’s all we can do, but we are not there for that; Jesus didn’t send us out for that, Jesus send us out to become influence. That means we must influence society and all its aspects, but are we doing that?

Even the people who are already in parliament; who are themselves running organisations, Christian organisations; when they stand in parliament to speak they are cold why because they are not a voice. So I think the church need to rise up and become a voice in its community. Then it will be a voice in the society and in all the different aspects of this business (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014).

Furthermore, Ms Shibambo linked the inability of the church to address community issues to the fact that the members of the Church who embrace politics are no longer in a position to critically
engage the political space. They cannot challenge the system any longer for fear of falling out of favour with the political structures of, mainly, the ruling party. She responded:

*I agree with what you are saying about the church. The scripture that I remember is Exodus when God says when you come into the land, you eat and you are full; you should not forget ... that is what happened with those people in parliament. At same time the Christians who are there they should not be afraid of being booed. What happened to the prophets of old, they were booed a lot by ungodly nations? I think it’s like both ways; we are going to be booed but still we need to stand up. Those people who are booing once were calling for prayer so forth, but now they found the freedom they are enjoying and they forgot* (Ms Shibambo, 15 February 2014).

Finally, Dr Bombal said: *It must be remembered that the church is part of the society but it has a divine mandate. This has serious implications for ministry* (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014). This includes, according to Mr Matjeke (15 February 2014), *fostering unity and raising its prophetic voice when the principles of God’s economy are neglected* as is currently the case in many spheres of society in Tshwane (S & H). As a result, the majority in society is suffering.

**Question 2 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

The oikos concept was explained and translated into SePedi including the purpose and background of The Oikos Journey document, as at the beginning of session 1 (see section 6.2.1 in Chapter 6).

We read the same scripture texts as in Chapter 6, which were used in The Oikos Journey to identify those principles and values which all together form the “blueprint” of “God’s economy”.

- Psalms 24: 1
- Genesis 2: 15 & Genesis 3: 17
- Exodus 20: 8-10a and Leviticus 25: 8-17
- Isaiah 58 & Amos 5
- Exodus 20: 3 and Matthew 6: 24
- Matthew 19: 16-22
o Deuteronomy 5: 33; also 25: 13-16 and 30: 16-18

Question 3 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

Which values of “God’s economy” would you identify here that are relevant for this discussion and historical context?

Drawing from Psalms 24: 1 research participants ascertained that although communities may be poor, in some cases they still have the land as an asset. The land is still able to sustain life, can still provide food if communities work on it. Ms Makena declared, I rejoice for the fact that the earth is full of grace and love. Regardless of all that is happening and sin that is so prevailing in the community God is still full of grace and love. He has not treated us according to what our sins deserve (Ms Makena, 15 February 2014). In addition, Mr Moeti said, we can also try to consider the fact that the earth is loaded with every possibility and all resources that we need at least to be capable to live and to sustain the kind of life which glorifies God and which will meet the needs of all people, all of us as people (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014).

Research participants also identified employment as one of the values of God’s economy. Dr Bombal pointed out: we can either think of labour as a job or we can think of it as a ministry. In the current situation where people need the money (and even are prepared to get any (work) position so we can get the money) it is unlikely for them to see it as a ministry in the community (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014). In support of Dr Bombal, Pastor Megala responded: it will make a huge difference if employment could be seen as a ministry. This will enhance the view of work as being in the service of humanity. Employment will become therefore an opportunity to serve (Pastor Megala, 15 February 2014).

Ms Shibambo recognised that observing the Sabbath day for rest is not respected by the majority because they cannot afford to. For her the reason was:

They are part of a particular company within an economic system that does not give them a chance to do anything else but to comply and do what they are doing. And yeah so, in that sense they might dream of resting but can’t (Ms Shibambo, 15 February 2014).

Further, Ms Mathebula noted that:
There are people in Tshwane who are trapped to serve money—who would even resort to illegal and sinful means—because of dire need. The church has to speak against the injustices built in the system which breed this kind of traps (Ms Mathebula, 15 February 2014).

Hence, Dr Bombal saw as paramount the value that, God’s economy is a matter of discipleship. Therefore we have responsibility when we have resources. Some of us need to be disciple on how to handle money in line with God’s economy rules (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014). The implication is that the church must teach beyond just offering and tithing as far as money is concerned. It has to include teaching on saving and investing of money. However, continued Dr Bombal: we can’t serve both God and Mammon (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014).

It must also be acknowledged that there are categories of people such as women who make ends meet and further contribute to improving community lives. Mrs Bodiba put it in this way:

I observe that it is the women who are home makers, it’s the women who will say ok let’s build a house, buy the furniture, they provide a home for the family …. It’s a woman with a little bit of salary that she gets will build herself a house when the man was working with a bigger salary failed even to build a house. It’s the woman in some cases who are supporting families (Mrs Bodiba, 15 February 2014).

Question 4 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

What are those political and socio-economic realities, which hinder and destroy the realisation of these values in Tshwane (S & H)?

Ms Mathebula stated that the current economic reality hinders and destroys the realisation of values such as the observance of the Sabbath for rest, which negatively impacts on health. She elaborated: because people are not resting, they are going to be stressed out, they are not giving God priority and their spiritual and physical life is going to be affected (Ms Mathebula, 15 February 2014). In the same vein, Mr Khomo continued: due to lack of rest people are suffering from physical exhaustion and depression. Families are affected by this and they are spiritually affected. So, it will hinder the economy in the long term (Mr Khomo, 15 February 2014).

For Dr Bombal, the political and socio-economic realities have prevented a shared prosperity from being realised in many communities of Tshwane (S & H). She further maintained: because
there is no shared prosperity community resorts to crime. There is an increase of the crime rate and illegitimate means for survival (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014). She told a story to highlight this point and how the churches can help.

I once pleaded with a woman in prostitution to consider changing her behaviour and trade. So she said to me I cannot stop my profession because I have to feed my kids. She had two kids and she said I have no one to provide for me. From that time we (my friend and I) got a vision to work with women in prostitution.

We took her and her two children in to our house and we started teaching her sewing skill and from there she started ministering to the prostitute women and teaching them how to sew. So that’s how I think the church would actually act in community with dire need (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014).

Drawing from this story, Rev Phiri argued:

that sharing must include an educational aspect. Those who are privileged to have an education have a responsibility to assist those who don’t have by means of providing information, sharing knowledge, sharing skills to build all the others. The church could be a catalyst for this type of sharing (Phiri, 15 February 2014).

Further, the rest of the participants speculated that the increases in crime rates, prostitution, the use of nyaope, of other drugs and HIV infection rates, could be associated with people’s poverty. If there was no social grant the entire community's economy would collapse. In some instances, people who have the buying power in communities are those who are receiving a social grant and or a pension.

Question 5 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

What is sin in this situation?

For Rev Phiri: love of money, oppressing people by denying them economic opportunities and not obeying Sabbath is sinful (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014). With reference to the current socio-economic and political realities Rev Mokone added: not sharing is sinful. Injustice is sinful. Not applying discipleship on economic matter is also a sin (Rev Mokone, 15 February 2104).
Further, Ms Mathebula averred:

> When we’re not applying these God’s rules we’re sinning against God. When they are not in place we are basically sinning by doing the opposite. As the church fails to disciple we are sinning because God’s economy is about discipleship. Remember the young ruler who came to Jesus and said “I have kept all the commandments but only failed on sharing his property, sharing of his assets, sharing to meet the needs of the poor”. So what did Christ say to him? He was short on this point (Mathebula, 15 February 2014).

In addition, Mr Khomo added, the church is failing because it is still a selfish organisation and inward looking (Mr Khomo, 15 February 2014).

**Question 6 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

**Which are the signs of “God’s economy” and the Oikos in this situation?**

Mrs Mashigo (15 February 2014) recognised that there are still residues of sharing and caring, taking care of the Sabbath and rest and the quality of life pointing to signs of God’s economy in our situation in Tshwane (S & H) that could be used, retrieved and revived. Yet, it is apparent that much still has to be done.

Where God’s economy rules and the oikos principles are functioning well, Mr Ndlovana (15 February 2014) noted: sharing will be there, prosperity will be there, blessings will be there instead of curses, and there will be long life in the land.

Mrs Ngobeni regards God’s economy and the oikos principles, with giving and sharing, as the axle which joins everything together. For her: giving feels very nice. The joy that fills your heart when you have given something to someone in need! I think that’s why we must give (Mrs Ngobeni, 15 February 2014). Therefore, Mr Moeti complemented her view: we should learn to share with the little things we have then at least we know when we have more then we have more to give (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014).
Rev Phiri is of the opinion that sharing is a taught behaviour and that people have many things that they can share. As he asserted:

*People have but they don’t know what to do with what they have; they don’t know how to organise what they have hence they don’t know how to share what they have. Then I think as a church we have a responsibility to disciple people in that area of God’s economy where they learn to share, they learn to give and learn the responsibility of what to do with that which they have* (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014).

In order for the church to achieve the above, Messrs Ndlovana and Matjeke also supported this view, emphasising that:

*The church has to start becoming creative in terms of engaging in the public sphere. Church structures are not necessarily going to neither become political nor join party politics but step into a place where they know what political, economic and administrative structures are thinking and what they’re going to do. The church should be able to evaluate and assess those thoughts and actions from a social policy perspective* (Mr Ndlovana, 15 February 2014).

**Question 7 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

**Which are the signs of hope and grace, which open up the situation in Tshwane (H&S) for the realisation of God’s economy and the *Oikos***?

Ms Mathebula thought of prayer as a sign of hope and grace in this respect when she argued, *prayer must be concretised by action – prayer in action should be promoted in the church community* (Ms Mathebula, 15 February 2014). Rev Mokone saw infrastructural development as signs of hope. According to him:

*Physical improvements of living conditions in terms of water reticulation, housing, and infrastructure development in general have a positive impact on the lives of people and do play a role on people’s health. Improvements on health and physical living conditions are some of those signs that are giving us hope. We can’t give up when good things are happening around us* (Mokone, 15 February 2014).

Pastor Megala acknowledged the availability of unpaid health care givers in marginalised communities of Tshwane (S & H) as a sign of hope and grace. In his words, *there are all these*
things like home based care and so forth. Health wise, some things are happening. This gives us hope (Pastor Megala, 15 February 2014). Ms Shibambo regarded the government educational plan to incorporate Grade R into mainstream education to provide more integration, as a sign of hope (Ms Shibambo, 15 February 2014).

Mr Khomo maintained:

> There is also hope because the government has good policies, in terms of dismantling inequality, dismantling those kinds of injustice in education and in health. However, the government is failing to implement them for collective wellbeing.

> It must also be acknowledged that if we have good people in government who have strong moral values and capacity we will see good change in government and also that will affect us in a positive way (Khomo, 15 February 2014).

However, as Mr Mashabane cautioned, good policies without enforcement will not bring the positive results. They need to be followed with enforcement, in other words certain regulations and rules must be put into place (Mr Mashabane, 15 February 2014). In support of Mr Mashabane, from her personal experience Ms Makena reported, I got the tender policy and procedures document, but it is not followed to the dot (Ms Makena, 15 February 2014). Mr Motswene added that enforcement and also supervising (monitoring) (Mr Motswene, 15 February 2014) would prove to be effective.

With reference to construction of new roads in the townships (S & H) for instance, Mr Matjeke contended the engineers are there to supervise and audit the road during and after construction for quality, but they get bribed to approve it (Mr Matjeke, 15 February 2014). Similarly, in Mr Madibane’s view it is the government official responsible for that project who is also wrong because in many cases it is he who chooses his brother for the job (Mr Madibane, 15 February 2014).

Finally, Mr Khomo observed that the church can work to restore hope and manifest grace in Tshwane: The church will have a vital ministry in community if it will make sure it scrutinises every government policy process, implementation and impact on the vulnerable and marginalised communities first and on other sectors of societies (Mr Khomo, 15 February 2014).

---

165 For about thirty three minutes the group engaged in a fierce discussion around corruption and nepotism in the city projects that are taking place in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal.
Question 8 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

What does salvation mean in this situation?

For Mr Moeti; it means seeing people living the life God has intended for them (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014). He elaborated:

_I mean experiencing life … being able to access whatever they have to meet their needs and such. So I think the life which God has intended them to live: Seeing that there is justice, there is peace …salvation can’t be salvation if people are not living the life God has intended for them to live. And I think salvation is like the liberty that we have and the freedom that we have so we can go live that life God has intended and planned for us._ (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014).

If we put it in the modern context of what one is experiencing in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, Rev Phiri noted that salvation is: supposed to meet the needs of the people; it is supposed to provide for the people and it is supposed to deliver the people from the hang-ups of life. In that sense I think I can back up what Mr Moeti is saying (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014).

In this understanding of salvation we want to mix theology with practice (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014). Ms Mathebula added: the effects of salvation might include helping the needy, sharing, implementing what we know and to be a blessing to others (Ms Mathebula, 15 February 2014).

For Mrs Bodiba, it means prosperity in every area of your life, first here on earth and then in heaven (Mrs Bodiba, 15 February 2014) one day. Building on Mrs Bodiba’s contribution, Rev Phiri remarked:

_Well there is nothing wrong in getting people to go to heaven but understand that they are here on earth. Salvation in heaven is coming; here is where the life I’m living is, if my needs are not being met here, who wants reward in heaven? I’m here first of all. Jesus said in this life you shall have this, then eternal life. So there are two parts to that; that means he is providing for my needs here and he is also going to provide my eternal needs up there._ (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014).

According to Dr Bombal, what is also important is to: think of God’s viewpoint on how our value system should be applying to our life here; how we see things here it’s not just here we are passing (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2015). Likewise, Ms Makena supported by Mr Matjeke submitted that: God meant communities to live and to live life to the full, there is no problem with eternal life in heaven but there is a problem with life here on earth (Ms Makena, 15 February
2014). Hence, Mr Moeti argued, most people ask a question like is this really the life which I came on earth for? That’s why I am saying salvation is the entrance to the life which God has intended for every human being (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014). Therefore, echoed Rev Mokone; a narrow understanding of salvation taught by some church communities are to be challenged (Rev Mokone, 15 February 2014). According to Mr Moeti; the problem is with man. Man from the church who has narrowed down salvation to spiritual realm only. We like to scare people of hell; the only thing we emphasise about salvation is getting saved, is about going to heaven because I don’t want to go to hell (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014)\(^{166}\).

This amounts, said Rev Phiri, to an abuse, abuse of grace in the sense that grace does not mean you lose the sense of responsibility in action (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014). It simply means that the church reads the Bible selectively as Dr Bombal put it when she said, members of the church should re-read texts such as Ephesians 2: 8 – 10 to learn about an integrated ministry approach (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014). Also, Mrs Mashigo contended, there is an abuse of grace because church members have not understood the message. Hence, there is a need to develop an understanding that salvation is holistic; it touches every sphere of life (Mrs Mashigo, 15 February 2014).

**Question 9 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

**What is the role of the church towards LED?**

Building on the answers given to previous questions in this section, Mrs Phiri declared that the church should start implementing the teaching of the Bible –such as the verses related to the oikos we have just read - in concrete ways by getting strategically involved in the community (Mrs Phiri, 15 February 2014). In essence, Rev Mokone added, the church should get involved to make the situation to be better (Rev Mokone, 15 February 2014). In the process of this engagement, Mr Moeti highlighted one of the issues which hinder the church from engaging in community as follows: The church always tries to be more spiritual, we tend to ignore socially related issues communities are facing and dealing with them. So I think that’s another issue. We know and read these verses but we don’t apply them in our context (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014).

Further, Mr Moeti continued,

\(^{166}\) I wish to point out that the androcentric language is from the participant (Mr Moeti) as captured here.
I mean there are real social and economic issues which are taking place around but we tend to focus more on prayer life, praise and worship expecting miracles instead of acting out our faith. There are real issues and challenges which we really need to pray for, go out and act. We can’t just pray and say God will do a miracle. So that’s another problem. We know we are trusting God but we need to know we have a role to play as well in keeping and maintaining the whole earth (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014).

Therefore, it is crucial that the church should not close her eyes to reality (Rev Rustof, 15 February 2014); in addition, we need to foster a type of spirituality which enables us to deal with real community issues in concrete ways (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014). Rev Rustof, in support of Rev Phiri, maintained that a concrete spirituality is needed in the context of the CoT. The church has to do something tangible to address the socioeconomic situation (Rev Rustof, 15 February 2014) which affects Tshwane’s (S & H) households. Metaphorically, Ms Mkandla put it this way: you go on your knees asking for a job from God while you are working hard to find one and you have got a curriculum vitae ready (Ms Mkandla, 15 February 2014).

Other research participants such as Ms Shibambo and Mr Moeti believe the church has a bigger catalytic role to play towards addressing the socioeconomic situation in Tshwane (S & H). For Ms Shibambo,

The role of the church is to take the lead ....in influencing actions to be taken in all these spheres. The church should take the lead towards transformation in the society. It takes the lead to let us see new things and to start dreaming about alternative vision of society (Ms Shibambo, 15 February 2014).

Mr Moeti added,

The church is like “the cement that is holding the society together”. So if it (church) starts cracking the whole society collapses. That’s why we have all these issues (corruption, injustices, greed, etc.) now because the church has failed to be cement-like institution amidst the economic crisis we are facing in the CoT (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014).

In addition, as Rev Phiri (15 February 2014) pointed out, the church’s role towards LED has to include the ‘concrete’ building of small local businesses and community projects.

---

167 I concur with Mr Moeti about the church being a cement-like institution. It brings into focus the mission agency and the Church’s response to issues of life, justice and co-existence. It is a recognition, which agrees with the Lausanne Movement, that “churches have a critical role to play strategically and on the ground” (Hildreth 2014: 6) and the urgent call “that we discern the hand of God in the massive rise of urbanisation in our time and respond to this fact by giving urgent strategic attention to urban mission” (Hildreth 2014: 7).
NOTE: Questions 10 and 11 were dealt with together

Question 10 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

Is it possible to put a Christian understanding of LED into practice? Is a Christian approach to LED appropriate to the situation in Tshwane (S & H)?

Question 11 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

What would such a Christian or “faith-based” practice of LED entail in terms of the example of one specific project? Define and describe some of its attributes, as it relates to the existing definition of LED used in Economics and Development Studies.

Mr Matjeke asserted that: it is possible to put a Christian understanding of LED in practice in Tshwane on a small scale- say on scale of a community project, a project which could have and portray the oikos values. It is possible to develop this as a model project (Mr Matjeke, 15 February 2014).

In terms of ideas for a model project two possibilities were tabled around two major issues currently in Tshwane and the rest of South Africa, i.e. HIV & AIDS and unemployment. First, Mrs Bodiba supported by Ms Makena and others suggested: one possibility could be a holistic HIV & AIDS community project (Mrs Bodiba, 15 February 2014). This project, continued Mrs Bodiba, will be using Christian values in the operation of that HIV/AIDS programme (Mrs Bodiba, 15 February 2014). As Ms Makena noted, one of the biggest attribute for this project will be compassion. The focus on compassion will enable this project to see communities in need as humans, we belong together in one household and not to see those people as cases but as real people in need of care, help and love (Ms Makena, 15 February 2014). Dr Bombal submitted that:

Compassion is an element of social justice. So it doesn’t only end by me feeling sorry for you and take your place in terms helping and empathising with you but I do more. I go miles with you to make sure you have food, you have security, you have peace, and you have friends, so I’m
restoring you into a state where you are seen as a human being again as a member of the household (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014).

Mr Moeti similarly emphasised:

One of the most important things in a project like this is instilling the message of hope in people. I mean sharing the Word of God and material resources with them, praying with them, talking to them that they are still people and God loves them. Salvation is still available for them if they are willing to accept Jesus (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014).

To this concept of sharing the Word of God, Pastor Megala added: give them some counselling. Give some hope that they will be fine especially when they are taking the treatment (Pastor Megala, 15 February 2015). Yet in the meantime, Mr Moeti noted as regards these people in need that it must be taught to them that sickness will only be affecting the body but spiritually the person can be healed inside and if the person is healed inside; the person can still live with the same sickness but having peace inside (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014).

This holistic HIV & AIDS project will also include food security and income generating elements. As Mr Khomo made clear, these patients will get their nutrition from the vegetable garden they maintain, they will sell the extras to generate money (disposable income)..... I think this will be an inter link to maximise the process of giving hope when they have something to live on (Mr Khomo, 15 February 2014).

Second, research participants asserted that it is possible to put a Christian understanding of LED into practice through a project which is geared to address unemployment. Mr Matjeke pointed out that unemployment go together with crime (Mr Matjeke, 15 February 2014). Similarly, drugs (especially drug trafficking) can also be one of the factors associated with unemployment (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014). Rev Phiri elaborated on the complexity associated with unemployment:

The root problem is economic injustice which manifests itself in unemployment. Unemployment is linked to poverty, teenage pregnancy and the like. Unemployment is one of the biggest challenges that we have. The church could start by addressing unemployment for the purpose of economic wellbeing (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014).
In relation to the economy, Mrs Bodiba considered that a project geared to address unemployment must start by focussing on the change of mind set. The main challenge is the change of mind set (Mrs Bodiba, 15 February 2014). In the face of the current unemployment, Rev Rustof said: how we think about the situation - whether we have resources or not to solve that problem – is about the mind-set (Rev Rustof, 15 February 2014).

In support of Mrs Bodiba, Ms Shibambo elaborated by means of an illustration:

The element of a mind-set should be dealt with first in the process of addressing the issue of unemployment. Let me explain, many of us when we talk about addressing unemployment it means going, taking a taxi going ... or going to town to go look for a job. Am I right? But do you know that you can start looking for employment right at your place, by changing your mind? So I don’t have a job, I’m not going to go.... town, but I’m going to create a job starting to dig in my yard. This attitude changes the whole view of work.

Probably you know how my place was when I was at Stinkwater, Makena would tell you we never bought vegetables, I never bought eggs, and I never bought onions the whole year. We produced all those things on our plot and start selling to people. Of course I needed a fence and all those other gardening things..., but the whole mind set must change first if we want to apply God’s values in dealing with unemployment. We need to know the earth is full of grace and full of love. God has given us the land. Let us try to do something (Ms Shibambo, 15 February 2014).

Further, the facilitator / researcher (15 February 2015) commented on this issue by telling an African story on wisdom which concerns the hidden treasure in the soil:

There was a farmer who was about to die. He called his children and he said to them I have a treasure and I don’t know where I put this treasure but I’m going to die. This treasure is buried under the ground in my field and the only way to find this treasure you must keep ploughing the ground and produce crops, and crops and you will find this treasure. But you have to work hard, the only thing I have left for you are these hoes and shovels and so on. As long as you to continue to plough the field you find the treasure. You will not go hungry and you will not be

---

168 This story is based on the poem known as “Le Laboureur et ses Enfants” witten by Jean de la Fontaine (1621 – 1695).
jobless. You will always be able to look after your families. Bye my children, he closed his eyes and died.

And these children in the hope of finding the treasure ploughed the land, grew crops sold crops; grew crops sold crops, grew crops sold crops until they became wealthy. There is treasure in the ground.

This story teaches that decent, consistent and sustainable work (employment) eradicates poverty. Participants should have this in mind for their envisaged project.

**Question 12 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

What may the role of ministers and the laity be in such an example, in faith-based LED?

Mrs Mashigo declared the central role should be:

_Educating and training people to change their mind set like Ms Shibambo pointed out. It can be one of the most critical roles they can start playing. They start with the Christians in the church, church members then they can tell them to do the same in the community_ (Mrs Mashigo, 15 February 2014).

Nonetheless, Dr Bombal highlighted that: _educating people for change (their mind set) is a big task. The church should mobilise the laity and clergy and all their resources to ensure success. This entails a wider ministry of discipleship which includes a change of mind set_ (Dr Bombal, 15 February 2014).

I concur that it requires “conscientisation” to achieve a change of mind-set. This has to be based on an education programme which empowers the masses for participation (see 2.1.2.2.3). With reference to this study, it will mean empowering and enabling participation of the poor, especially the most vulnerable such as women and girls, in these townships so that they can engage the structures and systems of power in ways that lead to true and meaningful development. The oikos biblical framework should inspire this education programme to embrace a holistic outlook.

**Question 13 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)**

What specific challenge does the values of “God’s economy” and the _Oikos_, as well as faith-based LED hold for the rest of the local economic sector?
Mr Moeti made the point that it cannot be that easy to engage the community. The community might be resistant to change in the beginning but at least it is just a matter of pushing and being strong (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014). This is the case mainly because, as stated by Mrs Mashigo, they are used to a particular pattern of life which is in the mindset. When you are bringing a new way of looking at reality, people and established institutions will resist that change (Mrs Mashigo, 15 February 2014). According to Mr Moeti, this resistance to change will also emanate from the fact that the church has been isolated from the community real issues (Mrs Moeti, 15 February 2014).

Question 14 (with the joint group on 15 February 2014 at Hammanskraal)

What more do we need to strengthen a Christian approach to LED? Think in terms of the specific example. How may such a Christian approach benefit from LED partners in the civil society, economic and government sector?

For church members, Mr Moeti maintained that what is needed is educational empowerment from the Christian point of view; this will help them to know what to do and how to engage ... the issues affecting them and the community at large (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014). In addition to this, Mr Mashabane responded, a Christian approach to LED should be communicated and promoted to other stakeholders; hence good communication skills (Mashabane, 15 February 2014) are needed. This means, continued Rev Rustof, that a good approach which should enable the church to communicate its plan of action within its structures and to other partners for socioeconomic development is needed (Rev Rustof, 15 February 2014). Mr Ndlovana added that in relation to other players like the NGO’s and the government sector, the church needs to develop strategic partnerships and networking for collective wellbeing (Mr Ndlovana, 15 February 2014).

Further, Rev Phiri indicated:
I think one of the things there is to do is to learn to communicate so that the NGO and others understand what you are doing and where you want to take it ... The government needs to understand what you are doing and where you are going with it; without the link of communication it’s impossible for them to know what you are doing. And you might not find the resources that you are looking for because you haven’t communicated anywhere. Resources are everywhere; the land is full with everything we are looking for. But if we don’t have right avenues of actually accessing that which is already there we will still be in the same place 20 years from now (Phiri, 15 February 2014).

Certainly, research participants agreed that there is a need for the church to establish a strong link with the government, and other partners. Mr Khomo averred:

*Now the role of faith-based organisations in development is increasingly being appreciated. Developments agents have realised that faith based organisations including the church do add value in the transformation process. Our HIV & AIDS project in Soshanguve and Winterveld for an example is partnership between faith-based organisations and the United States of America International development agency* (Mr Khomo, 15 February 2014).

Hence, Mr Ndlovana suggested, *we (church and faith-based organisations) can partner with the government so that our voice must be heard* (Mr Ndlovana, 15 February 2014). Therefore, according to Mr Moeti the church and faith-based organisations should be able to share our vision and plan for the community and other sectors of society (Mr Moeti, 15 February 2014).

**Question 15 (with the joint group on 15 February at Hammanskraal)**

**What spirituality is appropriate for Christian participation in LED?**

As stated earlier, Rev Phiri noted that *practical and concrete spirituality is most appropriate. By practical we mean taking seriously real life issues, so we are going to live out there by the spirit of Christ dealing with real matters, real issues affecting our communities* (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014).

According to Ms Mathebula, this spirituality *should enable the church to speak in corridors of power and if necessary emphasise that the government allocate budget for churches to*
implement socioeconomic projects for improving our communities in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal (Ms Mathebula, 15 February 2014). However, Rev Phiri said that it must be noted that the strategic positioning of the church will be vital whether or not the church can become a channel for social assistance in the CoT (Rev Phiri, 15 February 2014). Dr Bombal continued by telling the story of Jubilee Hospital which was established as a Baptist Mission Hospital in the 1960s as the only considerable medical facility in Moretele 1 at that time. This Hospital ended up forming strategic partnerships with government to the point where the latter paid the personnel, further developed the infrastructure and allowed a Christian value-based holistic healthcare service to be carried out for all patients. Although the hospital has become state owned, this work ethos has remained ever since.

Researcher’s synthesis of participants’ narrative at phase five: theological reflection (engaging elements of scripture in critical dialogue with causes and realities):

1. **Consequences for building a Christian response**: a) incited to formulate a viable response to LED situation, b) values (such as rest) inherent in God’s economy rules will not be supported, c) the church can seize the opportunity to mobilise its resources to teach and model sharing through an ecumenical response, d) the church’s history of struggle in South Africa is an asset, e) the church has to engage in political and public theology focussed on LED, f) the response has to be embedded in prophetic witness geared to the whole spectrum of society and g) church members active in different sectors could be mobilised to support this response.

2. **Oikos’ values / guiding principles**: a) the earth is full of grace and love (land is an asset which sustains life by meeting the needs of all beings), b) labour is sacred (it is ideal to see work as a ministry. Employment will therefore become an opportunity to serve), c) observe the Sabbath (an economic system that doesn’t give a chance to the majority to rest is undesirable), d) shared prosperity is the goal of God’s economy (injustices and inequality must be uprooted), e) we cannot serve both God and money (money is an instrument and should not become “a god” which enslaves communities, f) God’s economy is a matter of discipleship (communities are to be taught how to handle money in line with God’s economy principles) and g) called to live long in the land (a healthy economy creates an environment for people to live comfortable and peaceful lives).
3. **Realities which hinder the realisation of Oikos’ values:** a) current realities do not allow a person to rest enough, which affects their physical and mental health, b) there is no shared prosperity, c) there is socioeconomic inequality in S & H, d) social welfare grants are inadequate to meet the needs of indigents and their dependants.

4. **Sin in relation to LED:** a) love of money, b) oppressing people by denying them viable economic opportunities, c) not observing the Sabbath, d) not sharing, e) injustice, f) not applying discipleship on economic matters.

5. **Signs of God’s economy and the Oikos in this situation:** there are still residues of sharing and caring, taking care of the Sabbath and rest and the quality of life pointing to signs of God’s economy in our situation in Tshwane (S & H): a) meaningful sharing must be present, b) shared prosperity to be realised by all c) a measure of comfort to be evident in the lives of the majority, d) good health and long life for the majority.

6. **Signs of hope and grace which open up the situation for the Oikos:** a) prayer in action by church groups (prayer accompanied by concrete actions to address the situation), b) current infrastructure development (improvement of conditions of living and services), c) the existence of unpaid healthcare givers in communities, d) integration of the education system (e.g. pre-primary education into mainstream education), e) existence of sound policies aimed at addressing injustice and inequality, f) existence of sectors of the church which work for social justice.

7. **Meaning of salvation in this situation:** a) people living the life God intended for them to live, b) liberty and freedom that people have to live life to the full as God intended, c) supposed to meet the needs of the people, d) salvation must include healing the needy, e) salvation is not something in heaven which is coming (Jesus is providing for my needs here on earth and he is going to provide for my eternal needs in heaven), f) salvation should not be narrowed down to the spiritual realm only. It is holistic; it touches every sphere of life.

8. **Role of the church towards LED:** a) start by dealing with selfishness in the ranks of the church, b) be catalytic in the realisation of signs of God’s economy and the Oikos, c) implement the teachings of the Bible in concrete ways, d) become involved in addressing socioeconomic issues affecting communities, e) act out in faith, f) foster a
type of spirituality relevant for dealing real life issues in concrete ways, g) take the lead towards transformation in society, h) be like “cement” which holds the society together.

9. **Possibilities and examples of Christian based LED practice:** Two possibilities for specific projects (i.e. a holistic response to unemployment and a holistic response to HIV & AIDS) were mentioned by the participants. However, they favoured the first project: which will operate on a Christian value framework, to be geared to address the root problem which is economic injustice and its manifestation in the form of unemployment, poverty, crime, and the like. The purpose will be to achieve economic wellbeing of communities in S & H. This response will include processes addressing the perception of and mind-set about work, advocating for the unemployed, mobilising local resources and assets for the creation of employment, fostering self-reliance through micro projects on food security and on generating income, and fostering an ethos of hard work.

10. **Role/s of ministers and lay leaders (in relation to a holistic response to unemployment):** a) educate and train people to change their mind-set and perceptions about work, b) mobilise the laity and clergy and all the resources and assets of the church to support and implement this faith-based LED endeavour.

11. **Challenges offered by God’s economy and the Oikos vis-à-vis the rest of the economy:** a) it is not easy to persuade the community about this alternative approach, b) resistance to change because people are used to the current economic system, c) economic institutions of the current system will resist change and will undermine this alternative.

12. **Insights which could strengthen a Christian based LED approach:** a) educational empowerment for church members to know what to do and how to engage the issues affecting communities, b) good communication skills are needed in order to present this approach to other LED partners and stakeholders in ways which highlight the value added effect of this approach, c) develop strategic partnerships and networks, d) develop strong links with government

13. **Spirituality:** practical and concrete spirituality. This requires a strategic positioning of the church so that, together with other partners, it becomes a vital channel for socioeconomic transformation and assistance in these townships.
7.2.2. SECOND SESSION

Phase 6: The way forward (with the joint group on 17 February 2014 at Stinkwater)

At the beginning of this session, for thirty minutes we recapitulated all the summaries and highlights of previous sessions to confirm that all key discussion inputs had been captured. Going over all these summaries afforded participants the opportunities to refresh their memories about what had transpired in previous phases. We also briefly revisited the oikos biblical framework and the values of God’s economy to reinforce our understanding. During this last phase of the focus group, we prioritised some of the major lessons learned from reflection and noted the way forward in terms of action. The following questions guided us in doing so. This session took place on 17 February 2014 at Stinkwater and lasted in total two hours 15 minutes excluding the thirty minutes used for recapitulation. 10 participants (5 pastors (all men), 1 businessman, 2 young people and 2 women) representing six churches, communities and the businesspeople were involved in this phase. A meal and refreshments were served at the end.

Question 1 (with the joint group on 17 February 2014 at Stinkwater)

What plans of action can we envisage, in the light of the above rankings and conclusions, for specific initiatives /projects /programmes to get churches in Hammanskraal and Shoshanguve involved in LED?

As stated in the first session of mini-consultation three, the participants highlighted two possibilities for specific projects in this regard. For the purpose of focus in this session and due to time constraints the group chose to address the unemployment challenge over that of a holistic response to HIV & AIDS. Reasons for not choosing the latter were based on the fact that there is an ongoing discussion, concerning a comprehensive (preventive and treatment) approach, between the government and other stakeholders being envisaged for these northern townships in Tshwane. Furthermore, employment, the group argued, is central to LED. In addition, the group is of the opinion that unemployment is apparently receiving no viable remedial interventions in these townships. Therefore, the remainder of the discussion and inputs captured in the following lines are solely focussed on and related to a holistic strategy for a project on creating employment. Participants representing the churches in this research believe
that such an initiative is one of the best ways for churches in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal to become involved in LED.

In what follows participants give details for a plan regarding this initiative. The vision which emerged from them was to form some sort of a co-operative as a way of creating employment in the townships of SoShanguve and Hammanskraal. As Rev Rustof declared:

*We need to get the churches interested to form a co-operative. We need to ensure that our starting point in this process is to have clear objectives, goals and values. So that when we operate everyone will know the boundaries and the spelt out priorities or key programme areas of this initiative* (Rev Rustof, 17 February 2014).

Endorsing Rev Rustof’s inputs, Mr Matjeke added:

*It is about time for the church to work together so that we can have a voice on community issues. We need to stand together about social issues to the government and community. A group or collective action such as a co-operative geared to create employment in Tshwane (S & H) is needed* (Mr Matjeke, 17 February 2014).

While an ecumenical response to issues of social justice such as employment is ideal, yet Rev Phiri cautioned:

*We should clarify the whole notion of the separation of the church and the state. It is as if the government runs things on its own and has no spiritual voice. Because the church is silent, the government has not had direction given to it from the church. The king needed a prophet to prophesise the way forward for the nation (see the OT)* (Rev Phiri, 17 February 2014).

The prophetic witness of the church should be based on social analysis and on scripture as she steps out into the public sphere. He continued:

*As the church we need to come to government having done some research recognising the needs of the people which we want the government and the church to address. The church needs to do research about what is available around us. Again, we need to study what our infrastructure is like. What is available? What can we use which is there? For example there is land. What are the people doing about land? We have plenty of land lying idle in many places* (Phiri, 17 February 2014).
However, Rev Maponya highlighted dependency as a major stumbling block for the church. He explained:

There is a dependency syndrome. By dependency syndrome I mean we are at a point where society only looks to government to provide its needs without society getting involved to provide for its needs itself. The dependency syndrome is one of the main things which create a barrier for the creation of work (jobs), entrepreneurship, and the like. Our people are losing creativity; we are sitting back because after all at the end of the month I will be lining up for a grant. I am not against the fact that people get the grants. I am simply saying that those shouldn't become dependency pillars for society to progress through. Those grants may be a push towards the direction of creativity but when those become something that we depend upon then we have a sitting society that is not going anywhere. And the danger is that one day the resources that we are depending upon are going to be depleted (Rev Maponya, 17 February 2014).

It is therefore crucial for the initiative being suggested here to draw on local assets and capabilities. In this regard, Pastor Megala proposed:

Skills available in communities need to be identified. There is also a need for educating our people especially in the area of skills empowerment. Academic learning has done its part and done well: our minds are open, our brains have expanded, and knowledge has increased. But what about the physical skills that people can do which they don't need to go to the university to acquire them? I don't think one needs to go to the university to do farming. One doesn't need to go to the university to do carpentry, knitting, sewing and so forth. There are certain things that our communities need to be helped with to learn and to be empowered in (Pastor Megala, 17 February 2014).

With reference to churches Mrs Phiri pointed out:

Churches should stop being only theological institutions but also become practical. It is the practical aspect which I think over the years has been neglected by the church. Hence, I think the focus of the study that we need to be doing here is to find practical ways of improving how we are going to create those jobs. From a practical point of view: here are a people sitting in my congregation. 80% of them whom I expect to tithe don’t work. How am I going to approach that as a leader? What will I do with that? People don’t have where to go and work or they can’t even create the work or worse still they have a lazy syndrome. And the dependency syndrome as well has destroyed the whole creativity (Mrs Phiri, 17 February 2014).
Thus, this initiative will require strategic cooperation and collaboration for its success. In this regard Rev Mokone suggested: *The local church needs to address this issue as well as cooperating with other churches so that we will be able to harness our strength together and be able to find something that we can do together to help our people* (Rev Mokone, 17 February 2014).

Nevertheless, Rev Rustof added,

> This project should not be a copycat or a duplicate of some other models that have worked somewhere to be transplanted here. It should be a genuine action befitting our context in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. We must look at what we have … and make use of what is available in the community (Rev Rustof, 17 February 2014).

**Probing question:** We have consensus that we should study our context thoroughly (research). Will we rely on available existing research or do we start from scratch?

Mrs Mashigo answered: *Due to lack of resources, to start we will have to use current statistics that are available in terms of demographic and socioeconomic data in a particular township. During implementation we will continue to document data for ongoing and future reference* (Mrs Mashigo, 17 February 2014).

**Probing question:** who should benefit from this project?

Rev Rustof (17 February 2014) clarified that *We should include everybody in the communities who is unemployed regardless of their faith or denomination affiliation* while Mr Dlamini concurred: *We must also make sure that even the study and planning group has to be representative of almost every interest group that is available in that community. We might not get full representation but aim at that* (Mr Dlamini, 17 February 2014).

**Probing question:** how are we going to structure a co-operative of this nature in such a way that we have a buy-in from other churches beyond the six that participated in this research? What kind of structure should be put in place?
First and foremost, articulated Rev Phiri:

*There must be proper communication as what is the desired goal or vision. What do we want to achieve with this initiative? Who will benefit from this? The other person across the street will only buy-in to what he knows will benefit him. ‘Structure must house life’ not ‘life housing structure’: if people can see what the outcome of life would be people will house it. But if it is something that have some maybes and doubts in it people will tend to have snail pace or chameleon pace and not really move whole heartedly. Therefore, I think communication is crucial in all of this* (Rev Phiri, 17 February 2014).

Referring back to the beneficiaries of this project, Mr Matjeke (17 February 2014) suggested that:

*We should know our target before formulating this kind of structure (i.e. co-operative). This structure should suit the type of communities that we want to serve. It should be open up to embrace African Initiated churches and other faith groups (more like a Religious Forum for Job Creation in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal) in our townships. I see the government being in favour of the inclusion of all other religions in an initiative of this type* (Matjeke, 17 February 2014).

From the foregoing, it is clear that participants agree that a co-operative geared to create employment is an initiative that could specifically facilitate churches’ involvement in LED. Clear vision, objectives, goals and values of this initiative should be spelt out and communicated to communities and government to ensure buy-in. Also, it is emphasised that this initiative must be more than just ecumenical, to include other religious persuasions that exist in those communities even if there might be theological clashes.

**Probing questions:** will the Christian churches participating in this research be comfortable with an open religious forum of this sort? I know we will not have a problem in terms of people who benefit from this initiative so long as they are in need. But in terms of partners in that structure, are we going to be open to embrace all religious persuasions? The fact is there will be theological clashes. There will be surface issues that have divided the church and religious groups.

In this regard Rev Phiri stated:
Theology has always divided the church; love has always united the community. This initiative should be built on one fundamental value i.e. love. We love God and we love our neighbour as we love ourselves. We must get clues from the parable of the Good Samaritan in the Bible – we must adopt his type of theology. We must become blind to these superficial divisions. The walls (these are values) of the church have fallen down today and these; need to be lifted up again. Because we must understand that we wouldn’t be able to win this world for Jesus unless we begin to abandon some of the things we listed in previous sessions such as selfishness, self-centredness and the like (Rev Phiri, 17 February 2014).

Probing question: On theological issues we will not find common ground but on values such as love we will be able to find it. We are to intentionally meet the needs of communities in love as servants. We agree that love and servant-hood are the overarching values or root values for this initiative. Specifically, what values related to the oikos should we have clearly incorporated in this initiative and how?

Rev Phiri emphasised the oikos scriptures by pointing out that:

Jesus brought love and he served humankind in his environment. These two values (i.e. love and service) speak and could be expanded to the rest of the oikos values i.e. Psalms 24: 1 (pointing to the fact that the earth is full of grace and love), Genesis 2: 15 & Genesis 3: 17 (labour is both a blessing and a curse), Exodus 20: 8-10a and Leviticus 25: 8-17 (Sabbath is the fundamental rule of God's economy), Isaiah 58 & Amos 5 (Shared prosperity is the goal of God's economy), Exodus 20: 3 and Matthew 6: 24 (We cannot serve both God and Mammon), Matthew 19: 16-22 (God's economy is a matter of discipleship) and Deuteronomy 5: 33; also 25: 13-16 and 30: 16-18 (We are called to live long in the land) (Rev Phiri, 17 February 2014)

Further, Rev Mokone expanded:

These two overarching values are in tandem with the greatest commandment (i.e. love God and love your neighbour as you love yourself). Now God in his love, he has served us by giving us his Son and he has brought redemption to us. If we love one another we will also serve one another and bring redemption to each other. God has ministered reconciliation to us, we are taking the same reconciliation and we are ministering it to one another (Rev Mokone, 17 February 2014).
Probing question: It seems as if we are focussing on humans only, how do you apply love and servant-hood in relation to the earth?

Rev Maponya explained:

We are stewards of God’s earth. We know that the earth and all that is in it belong to God for the benefit of all creation. Thus, we will use the earth in such a way that it benefits not only humans but also other non-humans for the glory that he gave the world to us. As for the land; how we apply ourselves into it and how we take something out of it must ‘reward’ God for giving it away as well as benefiting us for having been good servants (Rev Maponya, 17 February 2014; emphasis his).

Confirming, on one hand, the notion that the values of love and service cut across the rest of the Oikos values and on the other the need to apply these two values, Mr Matjeke emphasised:

It should be made clear to all brothers and sisters from churches and other religious persuasions that this is a non-profit organisation. We are not coming together to enrich ourselves or even to earn profit. We might have running costs to pay yet it must be stressed that all that we are going to do we will do it out selfless-ness. It will be out of servant-hood to communities and to God. Because these days many people in our townships who claimed to initiate social development projects and get funding from government are no longer doing it for the love of the people or the benefit of the people. Hence (…) we are expected to be selfless, expected to be volunteers, and expected to give instead of gaining something (Mr Matjeke, 17 February 2014).

Question 2 (with the joint group on 17 February 2014 at Stinkwater)

What did we learn from this whole process? How does it change the way we think about the economy? How does it change the way we act and participate in LED?

Sub-question A: What did we learn from this whole process?

Participants expressed that they have learned a number of lessons as they went through this process. For example, Mr Matjeke (17 February 2014) realised that:

- It is time to stand-up and partner with the government to serve or say help the government see the need that is down here in our community. The government is up there and doesn’t have an eye here on the ground.
- We as a church are close to the ground. We see this poverty on the ground.

- We have to stand up as pastors and congregations in cooperation with the government to meet the needs of communities.

Probing question: The government claims to know what is happening down there because they have Ward Councillors at grassroots as its eyes and ears. Is this not enough?

Rev Phiri (17 February 2014) pointed out the following:

- We must bear in mind that the government is from the political party which won the election. So, they are selfishly there because of what they are going to gain in the next five years after being elected into office. Now that is far from the love we are talking about here. The councillor is so clever he knows that next year it is election he has started doing the roads. He is fixing the drainage system and all sorts of jobs. Why are they doing all these jobs? They have an agenda behind the scene and it is not love. The agenda is the gain that they will receive after this

- The biggest problem that we have as the church is we have left the government to run our communities. We give little spiritual inputs to the people to learn only how to pray. Learn how to have faith, God will provide for you. But we have not come to the place of facing and addressing community realities.

- Going through this process has given me a conviction that God has a calling for the church. The church has been given a major calling but we have underutilised our calling. We haven’t done even 10% of the calling God has given us. We have minimised it, we have lowered it to the pulpit.

In the same vein Rev Maponya added:

> I have also learned one major thing, that is, we can take the Book (Bible) and interpret it to the people. That is what Christianity is all about; let us turn the Book into life. Jesus said I am the bread that came from heaven (Rev Maponya, 17 February 2014).

Rev Rustof (17 February 2014) claimed to:

- Have gone through some sort of revival, a reformation of some kind. In the past when communities were neglected by the government the church went in those areas and begun to serve communities. Churches started schools and later the government took them over. This is some sort of revival for the ministry of the church in communities serving the needs of the people
have learned that the salvation preached by the church should not only be about saving people from hell to go to heaven but also to be able to address the immediate needs that people have. We must not overlook the struggles and needs that people are having here on earth. We must find out what could be done to address those needs.

Rev Mokone commented: This process has also helped me to become conscious of the assets (resources and skills) that we have as a church and as an individual and that I (We) must mobilise these assets to start something which will benefit me and the rest of the community (Rev Mokone, 17 February 2014).

Further, Mr Golele attested,

I have also learned through the entrepreneurial spirit of foreign nationals who live in our townships that there are many business opportunities in the local economy. They have introduced hardware stores, furniture stores in townships, etc. In the past, we went to town to buy things like hardware and furniture. I have realised that there are a lot of opportunities in our communities if you are creative and are determined to work hard (Mr Golele 17 February 2014).

In relation to local government’s involvement in social development, and building on a comment made by Rev Phiri early on, Mr Matjeke (17 February 2014) pointed out: The councillor’s eye is limited. He sees the party membership and the support he can get for his party. That is why it is high time for the government to realise that the church can play a major role in community building and development.

Further, in relation to the church’s involvement in social development, he has learned:

That the church needs to engage the government for the benefit of marginalised communities. The church can help the government to have an unbiased perspective on the needs of the people in communities. The church can help the councillors and other agents of government to see the blind spots in their LED interventions and programmes. It is therefore important that the church is mobilised (structurally in townships as forums or co-operatives) in order to channel the desires and wishes of the poor to government in critical dialogue (Mr Matjeke, 17 February 2014).

Still, in relation to the church’s roles Mrs Mashigo states that she

has learned that the church tends to undermine her role in society. As the church, we have crucial strategic and special roles to play in society. No other institutions can play these roles in society better than the church. These are: moral regeneration, prophetic witness in public offices and places, promotion of an ethical value based lifestyle and the like (Mrs Mashigo, 17 February 2014).
Pastor Megala added: *I have also learned that the church seems to be ignorant of its divine mandate and of its constitutional right and obligation in South Africa to be active participants in reconstruction and development of this nation* (Past Megala, 17 February 2014).

**Sub question B.** How does it change the way we think about the economy?

Rev Rustof responded that:

*In the past we thought that economy is only the responsibility of the State and corporate institutions (...) and those economic resources were only available to these big corporations and institutions. The focus of the people also used to be on what these big corporations are doing. But now, I know that instead of looking to these big companies, people must start looking at their own assets and local opportunities to come up with projects and local businesses which can improve their livelihoods. This is for me a shift which will help local economy. This implies also a shift from dependency on grants to self-help LED initiatives. It has pushed me to think that one or community can devise means for their own sustainable local economy* (Rev Rustof, 17 February 2014).

From personal experience, Mr Matjeke emphasised:

*It makes me realise that opportunities for economy exist also in my townships. Reality also reveals that most people who work far from their communities spend nearly 60% of the income is spent on transport. So opportunities in local economy will be beneficial for these people. As for the church, she has to stand up not only on economic matters but also on matters of legislation and policy in order to help facilitate LED* (Matjeke, 17 February 2014).

Rev Phiri expanded on the church role by averring that:

*The present day church must stop having a ‘vulture mentality’. The present day church is about the commercialisation of the gospel instead being a servant community. We have pastors out there who are outright vultures. They are not there because of the love of God in their hearts for God’s people. They are there to amass wealth for themselves. They have brought a political system in the church which is benefiting them just as we have a political system in the government which benefits certain individuals. That political system must be destroyed* (Rev Phiri, 17 February 2014).

**Sub question C.** How does it change the way we act and participate in LED?

According to Rev Rustof:
We must ensure that all people are served irrespective of race, religion and gender. The Good Samaritan parable stands out as a model to emulate as far as compassionate love is concerned. Fundamentally, it implies that we see all human beings in the image of God. The Good Samaritan embodies the Golden Rule (that is: do unto others what you want them to do unto you: empathy, seek the benefit of every person, value the dignity of another person and treat them with respect) (Rev Rustof, 17 February 2014).

For Ms Makena (17 February 2014), our participation in LED will make a huge difference if it is motivated by love for God and love for neighbour. Rev Phiri spoke of the gospel in relation to LED:

_The gospel must have an impact. The impact of the gospel is people changing for the better. Luke 4: 18 – 19 for an example is good news which has to change the status of the people. Therefore, we need to ‘read’ the contextual issues so that alternatives could be found. What we have learned has helped us to open our eyes so that the way we act will be different from the way we acted yesterday. It has helped us to ‘see’. This has implications on the way we preach henceforth bearing in mind that man’s development is holistic. The people want some hope (Rev Phiri, 17 February 2014)._ 

In terms of the gospel in relation to LED Rev Maponya asserted that:

_A minister has to focus his eyes properly on how he should give out the gospel to create hope in the people. People are discouraged and disheartened that is why they sit back and expect to be given. If we can start finding ways to help the people to stand on their own feet, the good news will become meaningful (Rev Maponya, 17 February 2014)._ 

Rev Phiri (17 February 2014) added: the gospel has to help change the people to become “fishers” instead of “eaters” of the fish then things will change. Finally, Mr Matjeke commented:

_I have realised that the government needs me. I have a role to play. I used to think that church, government and economy don’t mix. But after all these discussions, I realised that the government needs me and the church so that their work at grass roots would be successful (Mr Matjeke, 17 February 2014)._ 

**Researcher’s synthesis of participants’ narratives at phase six: the way forward**

In this final phase of the mini-consultations the participants proposed an action plan envisaged for a transformed praxis with LED as its focus. Due to logistical challenges and time constraints
as many participants were not available on 17 February 2014, only an intention/concept for action is given here. As agreed with the group, an elaborated plan of action will be developed as a post-doctorate research project when attempts will be made to translate, as stated in 1.5, some of the findings of this applied research into concrete actions.

1. Action plan envisaged

1.1. Specific initiatives /projects /programmes to get churches in Hammanskraal and Shoshanguve involved in LED:

- Two possibilities for specific projects (i.e. a holistic response to unemployment and a holistic response to HIV & AIDS) were mentioned by the participants.

- The group chose to address the unemployment challenge rather than a holistic response to HIV & AIDS.

- They envisaged a holistic strategy for a project on creating employment on a small scale through a model pilot project i.e. a holistic response to unemployment: It will operate on a Christian value framework, to be geared to address the root problem which is economic injustice and its manifestation in the form of unemployment, poverty, crime, etcetera. The purpose will be to achieve economic wellbeing of communities in S & H. This response will include processes addressing the perception and mind-set about work, advocating for the unemployed, mobilising local resources and assets for the creation of employment, fostering self-reliance through micro projects on food security and on generating income, as well as fostering an ethos of hard work.

1.1.1 Motivation and current state of affairs

The following insights could be highlighted from participants’ contribution:

- Employment, the group considered, is central to LED (see 1.7.4)

- The group is of the opinion that the unemployment issue is apparently attracting no viable remedial interventions in these townships

- The church is silent. The government runs matters on its own and has no spiritual voice
• Churches should stop being only theological institutions but also become practical.

• We need to find practical ways of improving lives of communities by creating jobs.

• People do not have anywhere to go and work or they cannot even create work or, worse still, they exhibit a lazy syndrome.

1.1.2 Dependency as a stumbling block

Participants are aware that in their context:

• Society only looks to government to provide its needs without getting involved to supply its needs itself.

• Dependency creates a barrier to the creation of work (jobs), entrepreneurship.

• As a result, people are losing creativity, sitting back, lining up for a grant.

• Grants should not become dependency pillars for society to progress through.

• Grants may be a push towards the direction of creativity.

• One day the resources that we are depending upon are going to be depleted.

1.2 Structure and process

Participants formulated the following principles:

• “Structure must house life” not vice versa.

• We must identify our target before formulating this kind of structure.

• The structure should suit the type of communities that we want to serve.

• Since the government is in favour of the inclusion of all other religions in an initiative of this type, churches interested should form a co-operative with churches (i.e. a company that is owned and managed by the people who work in it).

• The study and planning group has to be representative of almost every interest group in these communities.
Process: Initial implementation steps

These are as follows:

- The starting point in this process is to set clear objectives, goals and values. Boundaries and priorities or key programme areas of this initiative must be spelt out.

- Clarify the whole notion of the separation of the church and the state

1.3 Philosophy and approach to LED

These include the following principles:

- Beyond dependency

- Asset based: to draw on local assets and capabilities, while the skills available in communities need to be identified. The church will be expected to volunteer its assets and resources for this initiative almost free of charge

- It will be an ecumenical /religious response to issues of unemployment. The church to work together, stand together about social issues

- The prophetic witness: The king needed a prophet to prophesy the way forward for the nation (cf. Micah and Isaiah).

1.4 Ministries/activities/services

Issues to be addressed are the following:

- This response will include processes as stated in 1.2.

- The need for educating our people especially in the area of skills and economic empowerment needed for the creation of employment

- Examples of skills and economic empowerment prospects will include farming, carpentry, knitting, sewing, small business and the like. Jobs should be created based on these skills.

- The prophetic witness of the church should be inspired by social analysis, which will include advocacy.
1.5 Research based initiative to solve unemployment

Areas should encompass:

- Research recognising the needs of the people which we want the government and the church to address
- Research about what is available around us. We must look at what we have … and make use of what is available in the community. Study what our infrastructure is like. What can we use which is there
- This project should not be a copycat or a duplicate but a genuine action befitting our context in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal
- To start we will have to use current statistics and continue to document data for ongoing and future reference.

1.6. Beneficiaries:

They will be:

- Everybody in the communities who is unemployed regardless of their faith or denominational affiliation.

1.7. Participating churches, faith based organisations and partners

Principles to be applied will include:

- This initiative will require strategic cooperation and collaboration for its success.
- Co-operating with other churches and other faith based organisations, together to help our people
- The concept undergirding the initiative must be properly communicated to all stakeholders defining the desired goal or vision.

1.8 Theological impulses, values and ethos for this initiative

The following are to be kept in mind:
- Theology has always divided the church; love and service have always united the community.
- Jesus brought love and served humankind in his environment.
- This initiative should be built on two fundamental values, i.e. love and service.
- We must become blind to these superficial divisions. The walls (values) of the church have fallen down today and need to be lifted up again.
- Abandon selfishness, self-centredness and the like.

1.9. Values as related to the oikos in this initiative

It should be noted that:

- These two values (i.e. love and service) speak to, and could be expanded to, the rest of the oikos.
- These two overarching values are in tandem with the greatest commandment.
- One should act out of selfless-ness. This will be out of servant-hood to communities and to God.
- We are expected to be selfless, to be volunteers, and to give instead of gaining something.
- We should use the earth in such a way that it benefits not only humans but also other non-humans.
- We apply ourselves to it and the way in which we take something out of it must ‘thank’ God for giving it away as well as benefiting us for having been good servants.

7.3. Concluding Reflective Feedback

In this final process of the mini-consultations, participants were firstly asked to undertake reflection about what they had learned throughout these mini-consultations. Secondly, they were asked to reflect on how the fact of being involved in this research process had changed.
the way they think about the economy. Finally, on how the fact of being thus involved changes the way we should act and participate in LED.

This reflective feedback constitutes a summary and a conclusion of the focus group research field work.

Sub-question A: What did we learn from this whole process?

From participants’ inputs I highlight the following lessons:

- Partnerships with the government are necessary to serve communities in need
- The government is up there and doesn’t have an eye here on the ground
- We as a church are close to the ground. We see this poverty on the ground.
- We can take the Book (Bible) and interpret it to the people. Turn the Book into life. Jesus said I am the bread that came from heaven.
- We have gone through some sort of revival, a reformation of some kind. This is some sort of revival for the ministry of the church in communities serving the needs of the people
- We have learned that the salvation preached by the church should not only be about saving people from hell to go to heaven but also to be able to address the immediate needs that people have.
- We have learned not to overlook the struggles and needs that people are having here on earth. We should find out what could be done to address those needs.
- We have learned through the entrepreneurial spirit of foreign nationals who live in our townships that there are many business opportunities in the local economy.
- We have learned that the church seems to be ignorant of its divine mandate and of its constitutional right and obligation in South Africa to be an active participant in the reconstruction and development of this nation.

With reference local government’s involvement in social development, from participants’ inputs I highlight in their words:
• The government is from the political party which won the election. They are selfishly there because of what they are going to gain in the next five years after being elected into office. They have an agenda behind the scene and it is not love. The agenda is the gain that they will receive

• The eyesight of local government’s representative in the community, the councillor, is limited, biased and blurred. He sees the party membership and the support he can get for his party

• The government fails to realise that the church can play a major role in community building and development

With reference to church’s involvement in social development, from participants’ inputs I highlight that:

• The biggest problem that we have as the church is that we have left the government to run our communities. The church tends to undermine her role in society

• As the church, we have crucial strategic and special roles to play in society such as moral regeneration, prophetic witness in public offices and places, promotion of an ethical value based lifestyle and the like.

• As the church, we have to stand up not only on economic matters but also on matters of legislation and policy in order to help facilitate LED.

• As the church, we give little spiritual inputs into community issues

• As the church, we have not yet come to the place of facing and addressing community realities in a meaningful sustainable manner.

• Through this process we have been convicted that God has a calling for the church. We have underutilised our calling. We have minimised it, we have reduced it merely to the pulpit.

• The church needs to engage the government for the benefit of marginalised communities. We need to assist the government to have an unbiased perspective on the
needs of the people in communities. We need to help the councillors and other agents of
government to see the blind spots in their LED interventions and programmes

- The church must stop having a ‘vulture mentality’. The present day church is about the
commercialisation of the gospel instead being a servant community. Some pastors and
leaders of churches are not there because of the love of God in their hearts for God’s
people. They are there to amass wealth for themselves. They have brought a political
system in the church which is benefiting them just as we have a political system in the
government which benefits certain individuals. That political system must be destroyed.

Sub question B. How does it change the way we think about the economy?

Participants highlighted the following changes:

- This process has also helped me to become conscious of the assets (resources and
skills) that we have as a church and as an individual

- We must mobilise these assets to start something which will benefit me and the rest of
the community.

- We realised there are a lot of opportunities in our communities if you are creative and
are determined to work hard

- We used to think that economy is only the responsibility of the State and corporate
institutions (…) and economic resources were only available to these big corporations
and institutions. But now, we know that instead of looking to these big companies,
people must start looking at their own assets and local opportunities to come up with
projects and local businesses which can improve their livelihoods.

- Being locally-focussed is a shift which will help local economy. This implies also a shift
from dependency on grants to self-help sustainable LED initiatives.

Sub question C. How does it change the way we act and participate in LED?

Participants drew attention to the following:
Since, we realise that opportunities for economy exist also in our townships, individuals and community can devise means for their own sustainable local economy. Opportunities in local economy will be beneficial for the local communities.

We have to ensure that all people are served irrespective of race, religion and gender.

The Good Samaritan parable stands out as a model to emulate as far as compassionate love is concerned. The Good Samaritan parable implies that we see all human beings in the image of God. The Good Samaritan embodies the Golden Rule.

The impact of the gospel is people changing for the better. Luke 4: 18 – 19 for example is good news which has to change the status of the people. We need to ‘read’ the contextual issues so that alternatives can be found.

We should open our eyes so that the way we act will be different from the way we acted yesterday.

The way we preach henceforth should bear in mind that man’s development is holistic. The people want some hope. We should give out the gospel to create hope in the people. People are discouraged and disheartened that is why they sit back and expect to be given. If we can start finding ways to help the people to stand on their own feet, the good news will become meaningful. The gospel has to “help change people to become “fishers” instead of “eaters” of fish; then things will change.

We have realised that the government needs us. We have a role to play.

7.4. Conclusion of the Chapter

In this chapter, we heard stories and experiences of selected local church leaders, community members and local business people from the City of Tshwane (S & H) about local economic development. Many of these stories and experiences have provided answers to this research’s central question and sub questions tabled under 1.3. Moreover, in several ways they have also confirmed my hypothesis as stated under 1.4, that is, the church can be re-positioned or re-discovered as an asset which can be used to form strong community structures in local communities, which can again be used as a basis for community development and LED
Through the mini-consultations we were exposed to what is happening in the area of local economic development as it impacted on the people of the townships and the church. First hand experiences of community members and their impressions of LED have been highlighted in Chapter 6 during phases 1 and 2 of the consultations. Historical and structural relationships which impact on the economy, as well as the most important issues and causes which create the realities of the current situation, have been emphasised in this chapter during the discussion of phases 3 and 4 of the consultations. Theological reflections on these realities including the way forward have been highlighted during the description of phases 5 and 6 of the consultations.

Of importance is the fact that the narratives and experiences which emerged at these mini-consultations reveal and confirm a number of issues. In addition to what participants drew attention to in the reflective feedback above, the following findings should again be pointed out:

- That there are economic imbalances between the affluent parts of the city and the peripheral townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal (as stated in 1.2.4). Repercussions of this imbalance are seen in the deterioration of economic conditions in these townships. This confirms the persistence of the twin city concept described in Chapter 4.

- That these imbalances negatively affect the life and prospects of churches in these townships (as stated in 1.2.5 and Chapter 5).

- That the churches, even in these peripheral struggling areas, possess assets that could contribute towards community development and LED (as stated in 1.7.2). Thus, these churches are expected to be re-positioned and revisit their practical expression in these localities. They need to mobilise their assets for community building and development as stated under 5.8 in Chapter 5.

- That meaningful and sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H) will take place in joint partnerships with key institutions such as local government, community institutions including the churches and the private sector (see 1.7.4). Although the current economic system might not endorse God’s economy rules, they are helpful in facilitating a sound and sustainable LED in Tshwane. A local model could be developed based on these rules.
• That LED’s primary goal is to improve the livelihood of communities by increasing the number and the variety of jobs available to local people (see 1.7.4) in a sustainable manner. The narratives reveal that LED in Tshwane is failing in this regard. Thus, the choice of participants to initiate a co-operative business geared to create employment for the people (see 6.4.2) is one of the appropriate responses to the situation on the ground.

• That LED should be geared towards sustainable economy and not only concerned with a blind pursuit of economic growth.

In the next chapter, I will present the interview findings, based on similar questions to those of the focus groups or mini-consultations but in a simpler fashion.
Chapter Eight

INTERVIEW FINDINGS FROM SELECTED KEY EXPERIENCED PRACTITIONERS AND LEADERS

8.1 Introduction

8.1.1 Development of instrument and data collection

The aim of the interviews was to conduct qualitative research, hearing personally from selected leaders (from public office, ecclesial bodies and the non-profit sector) across the City of Tshwane, particularly as their views related to Soshanguve (S) and Hammanskraal (H) townships. The interviews were semi-structured, thus allowing flexibility within the framework. Most of the questions were open-ended, giving participants ample opportunity to explain what was happening in the area of LED as it impacted the people in the townships and the church. Questions were also designed to elicit responses related to various ministry approaches presently applied as well as each leader’s recommendations for an appropriate way forward.

A covering letter was prepared in advance and was distributed to the leaders (Appendix D refers). Subsequently, they were contacted and interviews were set up according to their availability. A “pilot” interview was conducted at the beginning of the field research to ascertain the suitability of the question schedule, after which some minor adjustments were made to the interview questions.

The interviews were conducted in English. The leaders\textsuperscript{169} are competent in speaking this language. The five leaders who were interviewed in the process were selected because of their experience, expertise and insights related to working with the disadvantaged in the City of Tshwane including townships such as Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. When collated, their responses provided various perspectives, insights and information pertaining to LED i.e. socioeconomic and historical, ecclesiastical, political and administrative. Moreover, four leaders interviewed were already involved in LED related ministries as overseers and managers, visionaries and practitioners. Through these ministries, they wrestle with the economic development possibilities and challenges of hundreds of individuals on a monthly basis. The

\textsuperscript{169} Refer to section 1.8.3.2, paragraph 4 for the names and experience of these leaders / experts who consented to participate in this research.
leader from the City oversees the local economic development strategy as related to the broader of social development agenda of the City and its implementation.

The average duration of the interviews was approximately 90 minutes. Each interviewee agreed to having their interview recorded and to my quoting any part of the interview freely in this thesis.

8.1.2 Data display/Presentation

The data is thematically presented and the key interview questions form an appropriate framework, including many of the answers given by the leaders to relevant questions. What is recorded here constitutes the second step of the qualitative data analysis process. As the first step, I repeatedly listened to the digitally recorded interviews and transcribed the material, then stored it in my computer. Following that, I selected and reduced the information gleaned into categories appropriate for this thesis, particularly the research question and sub-questions and hypothesis presented in Chapter 1. Therefore, not every answer given by the leaders is recorded here, neither is every comment or example included.

I have, however, been thorough in recording the data which I consider to be relevant to the research problem. There is a great deal here which serves to answer my central research question and sub-questions, going some way towards proving this study’s hypothesis, and also having a bearing on potential future studies related to this topic. I have attempted to present the key issues with reference to their frequency, intensity and urgency in view of leaders’ answers, thus highlighting patterns and commonalities. Discrepancies and apparent anomalies have also been noted.

Interviewees’ direct quotes are presented in italics, as in Chapters 6 and 7.

8.2 Interview findings per subthemes (as related to questions)

Summaries of interview findings are presented in this section. However, what I report here are the verbatim and therefore largely unedited inputs or contributions of the five leaders / practitioners who participated in these interviews. Given this small number I therefore acknowledge a shortfall when it comes to making valid observations and deductions. Nevertheless, the findings of these interviews complement some of the narrative findings.
presented in Chapter six. The findings have also helped to answer some of the research questions posed in Chapter one.

8.2.1 What do you notice about our situation in Tshwane (S & H) today? What are people experiencing in terms of the broader and local economy?

8.2.1.1 Interviewees’ contributions

From the city’s perspective, interview participant M (2 February 2015) noticed that:

- Communities are trying very hard to contribute to LED
- Although government’s responsibility is not so much to create jobs, it is creating an enabling environment for LED in these townships
- People are doing what they can with the little they have (skills and assets)
- They are trying to make ends meet by creating jobs for themselves and other members of the community
- And people need assistance in terms of empowerment.

With particular reference to LED in Soshanguve, Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) sees:

- Poverty all around the township
- Lack of jobs
- People committing crime for survival
- Unemployed youth falling prey to drug abuse and addiction.

In relation to Hammanskraal, Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) the following:

- Pre-1994 we had factories [in Hammanskraal], almost everybody was working even though the wages were not that much
- Most of these factories [have now] pulled out of the areas because they were so many strikes. The ANC was involved in these strikes; as a result it brought a lot of unemployment.
- Our government has developed what we call the spirit of dependency. Whatever they introduce is entrenched in dependency syndrome. Every time they don’t empower people to do it for
themselves. They always want to feed a weakness that is in people. Instead of solving community problems psychologically they come up with hand-out solutions. For instance, the issue of the child grants is not working. Actually it is a bad news. Young girls count their survival in terms of the number of children they give birth to. That has not worked well economically

- [When you look at] township services; unfortunately it is not shared economy. [Now] the economy is not benefiting all people. [It will] always benefit the ANC and pro-ANC individuals because like 97 – 99% of the people who are benefiting now from whatever development they are doing in township is ANC members

- Everybody who is not ANC is going down and down

- [There are] good ideologies and policies of economy [that have been brought about] but they are not implemented. They are just good statements, let say promises but they don’t come to fruition. We don’t see what is going on.

- Our economic policy is like a pie in the sky and the government they are copying wrong things from overseas

- [The government] makes people to depend on them a lot and they promise things to people. They don’t build independent individuals

- They [i.e. government] need everybody weak. I said this to somebody about RDP policy: it sounded a very good policy in terms of housing but it is not good. It is crippling us.

As a result, continues Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015):

- [People are so] discouraged. You deal with a lot of depression and worriedness.

- [Some] people lose their values [by resorting to unethical means of survival] because of they have to make a living in some way,

- People who are having some money abuse and corrupt some people in need… When somebody is hungry he becomes angry,

- A hungry person is a dangerous person. You can direct him to where you want him to as long as there is a promise that you will provide for his stomach. The poor are vulnerable.

Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015) noticed that;

170 Meaning being increasingly denied of economic opportunities and as a result their livelihood is being threatened. .
With particular reference to the church, what Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) perceives is a dichotomy between the church, its business and the economy. What people do on Monday seems to be unrelated to their actions on Sunday although the potential is there. He said, we have got all kinds of assets within the church. We have got human capital, people who are gifted in many ways. Actually, this is a source of my frustration.

He notices that:

- [it is a struggle for] our members to show willingness to do community development with their money; we have professionals, accountants, engineers, medical doctors and others in our membership
- They expect the Germans to give or to sponsor their ministry. The attitude is “let us tap to some other resources; there is money from the lotto and from the government” forgetting that “there is water, a deep well where we are”
- Pentecostal churches are doing much better than us. You see a lot of projects taking place at the churches’ premises. This may be related to the governance structure, they don’t have a heavy hierarchy [like us].
- [Pastors of missionary churches] don’t take responsibility and can easily stifle processes of community development even though the potential (with current assets) is great
- Missionary churches [can] raise funds, but it is for the needs of the church. It is not for the needs of the community nor individuals in need in the church.
- For full-time pastors of missionary churches, once they have preached, done Holy Communion, they have done their work!
- I don’t see the church doing much as related to economic development [as if the church business is not related to community needs]. Saayman exhorts in his book “being missionary, being
human\textsuperscript{171} that we should engage in a mission which is comprehensive just like Jesus did. Saayman says our mission work should be “humanising”. One of the things we can do as churches to “humanise” community is to facilitate economic development. Unfortunately, this is not happening.

- The church is busy with ‘heavenly matters’ yet it is not doing what [it] is called to according to its mission as stated in Luke 4. All that we do is pray and support people when they are bereaved. It is sad that the community seems to have toned down their expectations about the church’s roles and mission in society.

8.2.1.2 Synthesis

The economic situation of townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal as described by participants is unsatisfactory. Of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, four (i.e. 80%) noticed unemployment including youth unemployment in these contexts. Two leaders (i.e. 40%) noticed poverty and crime associated with poverty in these townships. Two leaders (i.e. 40%) highlighted dependency as being entrenched in these townships. Two others (40%) spoke of economic policies failing to transform life for the better in these townships. In addition to this, two leaders/practitioners (i.e. 40%) interviewed saw township local economies as being disconnected and at a disadvantaged position. Other factors noticed by leaders / practitioners interviewed include people trying hard to survive, the economy benefiting a few (most likely pro-ANC individuals) and people needing assistance.

With reference to the church, one of the leaders / practitioners (i.e. 20%) observed, with the exception of Pentecostal / Charismatic churches, dependency, disinterest in community development (even though the potential (with current assets) is great) and stifling of processes of community development. In short, the churches are generally not doing a great deal regarding economic development, but are just busy with “heavenly matters”.

All five leaders/practitioners (i.e. 100%) interviewed noticed that the economic situation in Tshwane is a desperate one and the people are experiencing an unpleasant and difficult time. As a result they are discouraged, depressed, worried and angry and some people do not live up to their values anymore, in order to survive.

8.2.2 How do you understand LED? Do you think that the government and private sector in Tshwane favours LED or not? Why?

8.2.2.1. Interviewees’ contributions

Interview participant M (2 February 2015) highlighted that LED recognises and acknowledges that:

- The need to have viable lower level of economic structures that could contribute towards broader economy
- LED is better positioned to address the issues of unemployment. It achieves this as it facilitates and gives economic opportunities to people in communities. The gains of LED improve and sustain the profile of the broader economy,
- CoT plays a critical role in assisting community-based entrepreneurs (small businesses). It has developed policies and put aside resources pertaining to supporting cooperatives. One of the flagship projects is Tshepo 1000 which, in partnership with the University of Pretoria, facilitates training and empowerment and funding of young people towards cooperative entrepreneurship.

Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) confirmed that:

- The government is trying to do LED in the townships. For an example, the government is helping with an agricultural project at Winterveld. But these initiatives are not properly monitored. Due to poverty people sell project tools to get money. The government has also sponsored a community poultry farm free of charge. There are so many opportunities but we are not using them.
- Foreigners have tapped into economic opportunities that exist in townships. [Foreign nationals are doing well regardless of the existence of big malls in townships]. Foreigners are making money. They don’t complain, they seize the opportunity and work for themselves. As a result they prosper.
- [Maybe] township residents are lazy and forever complaining about what the government must do for us.

Rev Mamatsinya continued regarding the church in the townships of (S & H) (6 October 2015):
The church is not doing the right thing by stressing too much about the heaven. Emphasis on heaven makes the church forget that we are to live here on earth as “salt of the earth” and “light of the world”. God gave us the material of this earth and not the material of heaven. This is a blessing; this is the mercy of the Lord yet we are experiencing poverty!

[The church should reckon that] we are not yet in heaven thus teach and encourage its members to be productive in their work. At the pulpits, we need to preach more about entrepreneurship so that we raise men and women keen to work with their hands.

People need to be taught about market place related matters where they are supposed to be “salt and light”.

The church must also change the way of doing church. The gospel is the same but we should change the way we communicate it to communities in need in our townships. If we need the community to understand the gospel we need to communicate it in their language bearing in mind that human beings have social needs, spiritual needs, material needs, biological needs and intellectual needs. [When I teach in church], I speak about spiritual things and practical things that I can do with my hands. This is the language which excites the community. The church fails to communicate this type of gospel

[In our Bible schools] we were not supposed to only learn the Bible. We were supposed to learn about agriculture, welding and all other practical works that are needed in communities.

Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) considered:

That the government, especially when they open Parliament they make these good policy speeches. These things don’t work. Government never sit down with the private sector. The private sector want to know what is in for them. The government never put that in black and white.

Government talk about LED performing; they use things like NGOs and projects that the NPO sector is doing as evidence. They forget that many people get involved in projects not because they want to meet the needs of the people but because they are hungry.

They never help to raise people who are pro-economic development to initiate businesses of their own.

Rev Mogwera continued (7 October 2015) [that] in Hammanskraal:

We have lots of empty factories [in Babelegi / Hammanskraal]. They [government] will do well taking people, train them by using established entrepreneurs and resource people to develop the
unemployed. They don’t do that. It is all being done by NGOs. That’s what they consider as doing LED. This is again reinforces dependency syndrome.

- They [government] are not developing people to think beyond dependency. In Hammanskraal during the apartheid we used to have some fields designated for agriculture in the villages. Those fields are no more; most of them have been developed into residential areas. They made tractors available and encourage people “to get food” from the mother earth. Those things are no longer talked about. But we talk about developing local economy; it is not going to happen!

- If Tshwane government has a key vision for LED, Hammanskraal should be their pilot project because we’ve got facilities. It is well located (far north of the city) at the feet of Tshwane with vast space and labour. They can experiment these LED projects here in Hammanskraal. But they come with good statements and use it for campaigns.

As a way forward for LED, Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) suggested:

- They [government] should identify young men and women who are willing to be involved in LED projects, then take them to in-service training and teach them how to run these economic initiatives. If the government wanted to do that they should have partnered with companies on the ground that are doing so. After they are well taught, they go and get this retired guy [or woman] who has worked in that sector for so many years to oversee the initiative. He [she] must teach these young men everything he [she] knows.

- And then they provide funds for them. This is better in comparison to putting money into Youth Fund or any other fund with no direction. Corruption plays some role into the current ineffectiveness, guys apply for some money, officials ask for a cut on the deal in order to facilitate the process.

Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015) is of the opinion that the government is trying. He says:

- The government has been organising seminars for people to write their business plans which can boost local economy.

- I wish the local government as well as the private sector working together to provide economic opportunities to local communities. Speak to the people about the help that they are able to offer to grow local businesses such as spaza shops.
Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) does not think the government is favouring LED. As he emphasises:

- [During apartheid] the expectation was that blacks are there to work for the white men. Now we have also come to internalise it. We have to work, even people who go to school. They go to school so that they can work. We cannot imagine that we go to school so that we can start a small industry.

- The government should be supporting this kind of thinking and those small industries.

    The government talks a lot about it; there are policies but no political will to implement those policies. I was excited when they established the department of Small and Medium Enterprises but since that department came into existence I don’t see what they are doing in terms of promoting and supporting small enterprises. So, the government is not doing much in terms of LED.

- In some instances, they stifle the development of local economy. Regulations which were made for people in comfort are supposed to be applicable to people in townships. Like, people who want to start some small businesses of their own in townships must abide to size of their property regulation. This regulation stipulates that a certain portion of the property should be dedicated for use of the business only otherwise the business will not be approved. Obviously, this kind of regulation is not favouring the development of local economy in townships.

- The private sector goes on as if it is business as usual. They will rather sponsor Kaiser Chiefs and Pirates [Soweto based Soccer teams] in the name of corporate social responsibility. If a company like Lonmin, could invest in the economy of Qunu where they draw labour by starting industry in that area so that when their workers retire or get retrenched they will find a better economy back home.

- And also the other problem is not ensuring that there is rural development to the extent that people keep on coming to big cities such as Johannesburg and Pretoria and overwhelm the infrastructure around here. In Gauteng, there is a crisis in hospitals. There is no rural development, no economic development which should have been done by the private sector. They have been drawing from the rural areas yet do nothing in return.

- In my view, government and the private sector are not doing enough. Even worse, beneficiaries of BEE who some of them are now billionaires don’t do really do much.
8.2.2.2. Synthesis

Of the five leaders/practitioners interviewed, three (i.e. 60%) understand and imply that LED is a mechanism and a way of working geared to create a viable lower level of economic structures that could contribute towards the broader economy. Therefore, LED is better positioned to address the issues of unemployment by facilitating and giving economic opportunities to people in communities. Although LED ultimately improves and sustains the profile of the broader economy, its focus is on growing local businesses and investing in the local economy.

Furthermore, of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, three (i.e. 60%) think that the government and the private sector favour LED. According to two leaders (i.e. 40%) the government does this to boost local businesses and entrepreneurs to improve the local economy. One leader (i.e. 20%) sees the private sector as being interested in LED through their Corporate Social Investment.

On the negative side, two leaders (i.e. 40%) say the government and the private sector do not favour LED. There is little substantial collaboration between government and the private sector as regards LED in the townships. One leader (i.e. 20%) emphasises that the government is not developing people to think beyond dependency on the one hand while on the other, there are municipal regulations (such as the size of the property which influences approval or disapproval of an application to conduct business) that stifle the development of the local economy. In addition, the private sector, including BEE beneficiaries, do not invest in tangible economic development initiatives in the townships; in other words they do very little.

8.2.3 Which economic policies have impacted and are impacting on Tshwane’s economy?

8.2.3.1 Interviewees’ contributions

Interview participant M (2 February 2015) highlighted that Tshwane’s economy is influenced by national government policies on poverty alleviation, supporting cooperatives and supporting small businesses.

I highlight the following items from Rev Mamatsinya’s (6 October 2015) insights:
• Privatisation of the economy and Affirmative Action policies. With regard to privatisation of the economy, he elaborated: the economy should be in the hands of the people through tenders to private entrepreneurs. The implementation of this policy suffers from lack of proper monitoring and control of resources entrusted to these individuals. This in turn led to mismanagement and corruption. [Privatisation was] supposed to be a tool for growing the economy and sharing the benefits across sectors of the society. Teaching, on how to manage the economy to the benefit of all, is therefore important. With regard to Affirmative Action as related to LED he noted: it is about ensuring the distribution of economic gains to previously disadvantaged community.

Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) saw the RDP and infrastructural development as policies which impacted Tshwane’s economy. He pointed out:

• Through RDP and Infrastructural development we have electricity and water in communities; some tarred streets and roads, RDP houses, community facilities, etc. I appreciate these physical improvements yet I don’t see them as an answer to our economic problems. For somebody who doesn’t have a property to come to own a RDP house is something exceptionally good.

• The RDP has not done much [to transform embedded structural injustices and inequalities]. The government doesn’t focus on developing our economic mind by changing our perception and changing our attitude. No, they just want to deliver and give things to us. That is our challenge. Our psychology of economy must change. We don’t teach people to do things for themselves. One man said “don’t think about what the government can do for you. Rather think in terms of what you can do for the government”. They don’t build people who will build the economy tomorrow. They don’t, they just give people fish every day. They don’t teach them how to fish.

• [As long as I expect to be given] my dignity will always be down. I will always feel “small”. I will not grow confidence in doing things. I will always be “subjected” and will do things [which might be contrary to my convictions] to please the givers.

From Rev Ngamlana’s inputs (20 October 2015), I singled out the following:

• The policy on tenders has impacted Tshwane in a positive way but the problem is that the government does not give a kick-start i.e. the seed funding to these local entrepreneurs.

• He suggested: the government must have an incentive such as the seed funding to kick start. It should be a revolving loan scheme.
• The problem especially with tenders is that the government disburses the funds to an entrepreneur without “strictly” holding him [her] accountable. [This is the case with entrepreneurs who were contracted by RDP to build houses for indigents]. For example; when the government started building RDP houses they didn’t put a strict policy in place which states that this house must not be sold nor rented out.

• Other policies are related to international economic transactions have affected and still are impacting Tshwane’s economy.

With regard to economic and international trade policies (free market and liberalisation) the government has allowed import of things from other countries. Where are the proudly made in South Africa products in the market? We fail to help the local people to produce the goods. This is what has killed the industrial area in Dimbaza in the Eastern Cape and many others such as Babelegi in Hammanskraal. This government made a mistake. They were supposed to support these hubs to continue because by doing so you empower the local people. Now, we complain about shacks and squatter camps, these are the people who come from places like Dimbaza. These people could have stayed in Dimbaza supposed the government have made sure that those factories are re-open.

Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) did not single out particular policies but spoke about them in a general way. He alluded to the regulations pertaining to restrictions on how one uses his house for small business. I draw attention to the following items from his input:

• These regulations were made for normal city areas [and are unsuitable for township residents]. For traders, they allocate places for them to trade but the process of getting trading permits is a mess for many people. They also have to pay for those permits, now when you have been given a small capital of R500 to start selling vegetables, that money does not cover money for permits and so on. Those regulations impose a burden on people instead of giving them incentive.

• BEE has benefited only a few; there has been no trickle down of economic benefits. These BEE beneficiaries could have helped grassroots women’s cooperatives for example. [The problem is] the rules that govern BEE are not holding them accountable. The intention [of economic empowerment] was so it can be broadened to others. But it has not done so, it has become only for self-enrichment, which is unfortunate.
8.2.3.2 Synthesis

Of the five leaders/practitioners interviewed, one (i.e. 20%) named national policies on poverty alleviation, supporting cooperatives and supporting small businesses as having had, and still having, a positive impact on the local economy of Tshwane (S & H). Two leaders (i.e. 40%) named privatisation of the economy, but also drew attention to the issue that these policies have not realised the intended goals of sharing and distributing the economic benefits across sectors of the society. Reasons for this result include lack of proper monitoring and accountability, which naturally resulted in corruption and mismanagement of resources.

One leader (i.e. 20%) identified the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) and infrastructural development as policies which impacted Tshwane’s economy. However, he added that RDP has never done much for those it was intended to help. While the physical living conditions of communities have changed for the better in certain respects, these government policies have done little to develop the economic mind-set of township communities. He submits: the government does not build people who will build the economy tomorrow. Rather, the government encourages dependency. Referring to this trend, one leader stated above it has a negative impact on one’s dignity.

One of the other leaders (i.e. 20%) spoke of international trade policies as policies which have reshaped the local economy. While these benefit large corporations, they do not assist the local people to compete. These policies failed to support and protect the local hubs. As a result, local communities suffer due to unemployment. Finally, one leader (i.e. 20%) highlighted that some municipal regulations regarding small businesses impose a burden on people instead of incentivising them. The examples above reflect respondents’ views that BEE has benefited just a few; there has been no trickle down of economic benefits.

8.2.4 What are the successes, the failures, the benefits and the disadvantages of these policies? Why?

8.2.4.1 Interviewees’ contributions

From interview participant M’s inputs (2 February 2015) I point out the following:

- M made the point that the intentions of policies are noble and good but the issue is with the implementation of these policies i.e. there is not enough budget allocated to implementation.
M also said that people who developed policies are not necessarily the same people who will implement them: **passion is lost in the process as people who developed these policies end up leaving the job and we get new people.**

In some instances, community groups come against, manipulate, delay and disrupt implementation of policies by coming up with new demands [community dynamics].

Notably, policy development process takes some time in terms of going back to communities to consult. **By the time you want to implement those policies are outdated. In addition, needs of the people are not fixated i.e. they are not cast in stones and are forever changing.** [You find that there are already gaps in given policies].

In terms of successes emanating from policies such as privatisation (through tenders) and Affirmative Action, Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) spoke of:

- **Improved lifestyle of some black people who got tenders**
- **Money which is changing hands in communities and it gets to hands of some previously disadvantaged people with skills and education**
- **Anyone regardless of race, gender, faith is free to participate in economic activities.**

With reference to failures, he said:

- **Tenders failed to create more jobs for the unemployed. We still rely on the government to create more jobs for the people**
- **Failures of these policies to create jobs have made communities to depend more on the government. This dependency has made people lazy and robs them of their creativity.**

The benefits of these policies are such that those who are creative and entrepreneurial have started businesses. The disadvantages lie in the fact in that a few people have accumulated money to the detriment of the masses. For Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) the following reasons explain this situation:

- **People lack economic education**
- **People don’t understand the economic policies that they endorsed through the government they have elected**
- **Communities fail to understand that they are the drivers of this economy**
- Government resources are available to those who take the initiative through start-up capital grants. For him, there are so many good policy directives intended to benefit communities in need but communities are not aware neither informed of these.

Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) reckoned social grant policies are helping the indigents. He pointed out: the aim of these grants is good but the results are not. On success, he acknowledged that a substantial number of poor families are surviving from the child grant. The medically disabled by dread disease[s] such as HIV/AIDS and tuberculosis are surviving thanks to the handicap grant. I don't a problem with these grants; it is good for the handicap[ped] to have some money to survive. However, he contended:

The child grant could have been organised differently in the sense that the mothers of these children could have been taught some skills while they help their children. They may be empowered to do a job, teach them that you need to work, train them and give them a skill which will enable them to live.

Rev Ngamlana’s responses (20 October 2015) highlighted the following:

- [The majority of township people don’t really understand these policies]. These policies must really be explained to people. The local and national governments must re-evaluate these policies in terms of impacts they have on the ground.

- [Policies have benefitted some people]. We have seen some people out of the townships come, grow and making money.

- The policies are fine [in words] but they are benefiting a few. Policies fail to teach about development say they help one person to start a business. Some of these entrepreneurs who benefited from these policies become very selfish. A guy will start a shop in section A and another in section C or has got 8 spaza shops!

- The government has managed to build “the middle class guy or lady”. When this guy or lady gets comfortable, he / she leave the township for the suburbia in a big house – that is a weakness.

- [Furthermore, he suggested that Affirmative Action and employment equity of some sort could be applied by local entrepreneurs and business people]. They should hire local people from the townships where they do businesses and not folks from outside the townships.

Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) pointed out:

- Other legislations, not necessarily economic, that used to stifle economic development have been changed for the better in the New South Africa; these are Group Areas Act (section 10) and
restriction of movement and trade. The collapse of pieces of apartheid government policies has helped to improve the situation. In the New South Africa people have some freedom to get involve in trade relatively easy unlike in the past. The environment is quite good; it allows people to start something on their own if one is determined.

- Those who start, I wish they could be given better skills in small business. If people were given better level of economic literacy and training I think they will do much better.

- The ministry of small micro and medium enterprises should provide support in this regard in terms of seed capital, training and mentoring. The major challenge is support through empowerment. Some who have started cooperatives for example need training on things such how to clarify individual roles, how to do books, etc.

- Another policy is the issue of land reform in that it could have helped black farmers to thrive but often post-settlement grant would be limited or non-existent. I wish people could be trained with basic agricultural skills so that people can use the soil they have to produce food. In Mabopane and Soshanguve for example, there are people who have big yards but do not grow any vegetables in the empty spaces available in their yards.

- We do have good policies such as land reform, although now it has been drastically changed to favour the elite. When it started, it was good for ordinary people who could become farmers. The only problem was that they were given R15 000 subsidy, the same amount that they give for a house. This amount was far too small for significant farming to be initiated. But since they increased the amount they excluded the poor, it only benefit the elite.

8.2.4.2 Synthesis

Of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, four (i.e. 80%) highlighted successes of different policies which govern or are associated with the local economy. Among the successes, leaders attested that the aims of the policies are sound, their intention noble. Some examples: there is an improved lifestyle for some black people who obtained tenders, money is changing hands in communities and it reaches the hands of some previously disadvantaged people with skills and education. And anyone, regardless of race, gender, faith is free to participate in economic activities. These policies have benefitted some people, especially the middle class through having access to more money. The collapse of certain aspects of the apartheid government’s policies has helped to improve the economic situation of some previously disadvantaged
people. There is now freedom to be involved in trade or business. The environment is beneficial; it allows people to start something to earn a living.

In relation to failures, of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, two (i.e. 40%) spoke about policies exhibiting gaps, of residents being outdated and manipulated by the powerful and communities not being in a position to understand them. Two leaders (i.e. 40%) asserted that these policies failed to create decent and permanent jobs for the masses; instead they made communities more dependent upon the government. The policies failed to ignite a developmental and small business spirit in communities.

With regard to benefits, two leaders (i.e. 40%) attested that some people, who are creative and entrepreneurial, started businesses and obtained support from the government. These are most likely those people who are educated and who understand these policies and know how to take advantage of them. They also assert that social security policies such as child and disability grants are helping the indigents.

However, three leaders (i.e. 60%) also drew attention to the issue of a number of disadvantages pertaining to some policies, such as: 1) a few people, particularly “tenderpreneurs”, have accumulated wealth at the expense of the masses, 2) entrepreneurs who benefited from these policies become very selfish, 3) the entrepreneurs then tend to leave the townships for suburbia for better living conditions and comfort, which is a weakness and 4) local people from the townships employment needs are overlooked. Furthermore, interviewees added that policies have failed to facilitate the acquisition of better business skills by communities. With reference to the land reform policy, the post-settlement grant is meagre and has been drastically changed to favour the wealthy elite. Thus, the poor are excluded.

8.2.5 What changes are necessary in terms of these policies and their implementation, to benefit LED?

8.2.5.1 Interviewees’ contributions

Interview participant M (2 February 2015) suggested:

- Fast tracking policy development and implementation. Immediately after developing a policy we need to come up with implementation plan which is “costed”. Delays occur in that we develop a
policy now and we come up with an implementation plan longer after the policy has been
developed. Then we get into costing much later.

- The private sector needs to play a very important role with regard to implementation (i.e. share
  expertise by giving inputs).

- Seek the buy-in of all stakeholders to ensure that the implementation is carried out in mutual
  understanding and responsibility. In order for Tshwane to guarantee buy-in of all stakeholders
  these policies have to be contextualised so that they speak to issues that are relevant in
  Tshwane and invite everybody’s commitment to implement.

For Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015): no changes are needed. People have the responsibility
to acquaint themselves with these policies and understand how they benefit them. They must
take an active role in LED, support is certain from the government.

With reference to social grants Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) suggested:

- There should be empowerment going hand in hand with these social grants. A skills development
  must be provided alongside the child grant to equip these young mothers for work. Then facilitate
  job placements for them.

- Policies should not make people dependent on the government. They should instead assist them
to become self-reliant.

In relation to tenders, according to Rev Ngamlana (20/10/2015):

- The government must ensure that local entrepreneurs empower their workers to grow in
  businesses. A guy must not remain a petrol attendant for 10 years! We can emulate what a white
  businessman did for a man who used to work for him as a petrol attendant for few years. This
  white businessman trained this guy to take courses in business marketing and the like, at the
  end he told this worker to go and start his own business by giving him seed-capital.

- The government should also aim to multiply the capacity and means of local entrepreneurs to
  expand business, develop others and employ local labour.

For Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) the following matters must be considered:

- When we develop or adjust policies; let us hear what the local people are saying so that these
  policies speak to context. We can’t write policies for Mamelodi and the same policies we expect
  them to work in Limpopo. Let people be innovative in their own context. Let us hear what works
  best for them. Some of these policies give the impression that there is no listening to the ground.
That is why we don’t have ownership of these policies. That is why they collapse. Something in which you have buy-in is likely to be sustained because people will end-up owning it.

- One of the mistakes done by the ANC is to copy or import policies from other countries. They ignore the local voices and aspirations in the process.

- The other is that when a policy or legislation is promulgated, people are invited to public hearings but people do not contribute meaningfully because what is captured in that policy doesn’t make sense in our context.

- Also, they are not using resources within the communities. Churches for an example could become schools where people are taught in simple ways about different policy options to think about before they are called upon to decide. Churches could be facilitating those empowerment processes but unfortunately the churches are not doing that. They only focus on spiritual ministries.

- Community organisations are largely left out in the policy development process. These organisations including churches know how to communicate in the simple language of the communities because they are part of them.

- The philosophy of RDP, which was people-driven development, has been forsaken since Thabo Mbeki’s presidency. Now, it has become politician-driven development.

- Yet, the largest NGO on the ground, that is the church, is watching by and is not claiming space to be involved. The other NGOs were claiming space and forced the government to consult them on policy issues. The churches allow themselves to be by-passed. Churches should be facilitating empowerment processes but unfortunately churches are not doing that.

8.2.5.2. Synthesis

Of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, one (i.e. 20%) said no changes are needed in the current policies because they are sound as they are. Rather, communities should acquaint themselves with these policies and decide how these benefit them. Then they must take an active role in LED, as support is almost certain from the government.

However, the other four leaders /practitioners (i.e. 80%) interviewed suggested the following changes:

1) Immediately after developing a policy we need to come up with an implementation plan which is “costed”, as stated by one leader
2) The private sector needs to share expertise by giving inputs, as stated by two leaders

3) To guarantee buy-in of all stakeholders these policies have to be contextualised, as stated by two leaders. The government should therefore not copy or import policies from other countries. They should not ignore the local voices and aspirations in the process

4) With reference to social security policies, one leader said empowerment should be going hand in hand with these social grants in ways which could facilitate job placements for the disadvantaged. In this way policy will not make people dependent on the government. Instead, it will assist them to become self-reliant

5) With reference to BEE policies, two leaders / practitioners suggested that the government must ensure that local entrepreneurs empower their workers to grow in businesses. This should include efforts to multiply the capacity and means of local entrepreneurs to expand business, develop others and employ local labour

6) One leader suggested that the people-driven development ethos which was part of the RDP during the former, late President Mandela’s administration, should guide policy development and implementation. This requires using resources within the communities. Local organisations including churches that know how to communicate in the simple language of the communities should become key interlocutors in this process. The largest NGO on the ground, the church, should be facilitating empowerment processes geared to educate communities on policies.

8.2.6 What changes have occurred in the economy in the past fifteen years? What have been the most important events and influences?

8.2.6.1 Interviewees’ contributions

Interview participant M (2 February 2015) highlighted the following changes and influences:

- Local communities don’t have [or have lost] a basis as it relates to financial resources.
- Changes in the broader political economy have caused local communities to suffer. These refer to decline of the currency value and many disruptions of local economy which led to huge rate of unemployment.
Many people in local communities are not so empowered to compete in the broader economy: they are not versatile enough in economic transactions, they lack structural support and skills to maximise the economic opportunities they have.

Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) named the following influences and changes:

- Our location has physically changed: new tarred roads, street names, lights, new educational institutions, shopping malls and improved public transport.

- New laws in the new South Africa gave the private sector freedom to invest in whatever sector and wherever they want to in the country. In the past, the black person was not allowed to own businesses of their own; they had to have a white guarantor to sponsor the initiative. Now, there is freedom enshrined in the constitution for anyone to be able “to stand on their own feet”.

- There is greed and corruption among these black people who have become wealthy in this democracy. This could be associated with the long economic deprivation that the black people suffered under apartheid. Further, these black political elites have not been properly trained to manage the public coffers. They steal to satisfy their needs and make sure that they must never become hungry and deprived again. They amass monetary possessions and wealth that will help them survive when they are no longer in public office. As a result they “snatch bread from the mouth of the poor and throw them further into misery”.

Then, he emphasised that:

- The church has an important role to play in forming and fostering ethical behaviour in communities and especially for people in governance positions.

- The church can also assist with spiritual guidance and prophetic witness. Yet, the church has to seek wisdom and understanding about how deep are the interconnections in relation to the socioeconomic and historical contexts of South Africa [which continue to breed inequality and injustice]

- Then, the church can formulate appropriate actions to remedy the situation.

Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) drew attention to the following:

- Now, we do have more black billionaires such as Cyril Ramaphosa and Tokyo Sexwale in the New South Africa. There are a few individuals that have really “come up”. But for most of these individuals we don’t know how they got to that kind of wealth
• It is obvious that the economy was [and still is] never [equitably] distributed. It is focussed to benefit certain individuals who are connected with power.

• Black middle class people are now driving “reasonable” looking cars. Black women driving, that shows something also. Many guys have managed to move into the suburbs and have their own homes.

• However, we are still crying that the people at the grassroots who need to feel the positive changes are still battling.

• The powerful still become richer. It is still the same system as it was in the past. The economy hasn’t changed hands; it has remained in the hands of the powerful. It is the same guys who get tender after tender, they don’t even rotate this.

• The people at grassroots are not empowered and are marginalised. I think something must be done in our educational system to provide solutions to these problems.

For Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015):

• With regard to legislative changes (i.e. abolition of discrimination and apartheid): the government has played a very important role towards positive change but I think they can still do more.

• With regard to liberalisation of the [retail] market: malls and multinationals such as KFC and McDonald have changed the township economic landscape. The government can also relook at the issue of building malls in the townships. Who runs them? Who owns them? At Katlehong for an example there is a string of shops standing empty, the owners have run out of business because of malls nearby. Who benefits? It is these big retailer groups such as Edgars, Shoprite, Pick n Pay, etc. not the local business community.

• The biggest influence has come about by opening the market to everybody who has interest to trade. Previously disadvantaged groups are free to participate in the economy. There are some groups who managed to develop a clientele and are beginning to export some goods to countries like Brazil and Russia.

• Yet in comparison, big businesses such as KFC, McDonald, Edgars, etc. are benefiting the most from these changes and influences because they have the infrastructure and resources to do so in the market economy.

Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) submitted the following views:
• To a certain extent there is freedom, it is just people don’t feel it to the maximum because they are less empowered and are not creating or maximising the opportunities that come their way. It is also related to what politicians do when they canvas for votes. Inadvertently, they encourage complacency. They encourage entitlement. That is a sad reality about us South Africans, we are entitled. I have no problem with grant for the indigents. Grant, while it takes people out of misery, it should not make people dependent for ever. People want free houses. What is wrong by giving people what we used to call “site and service”- where people build houses for themselves? I wish we could do conscientisation of the Frerean type, making people to vomit this internalised oppression that is making them to make peace with circumstances that are not satisfactory even though we could do something about it on our own. There is a lot of Black Consciousness that needs to be done in many of our communities.

• Rights as a black person should also include a possibility of doing something for me. Not expecting government to do all things for me even when I am able to do some on my own. In short, grant should become tools of empowerment and freedom. As churches, maybe we need to revisit the “Work ethic” which encourages people to work for self-reliance, work hard, to be frugal and save, etc.

8.2.6.2 Synthesis

Of the five leaders/practitioners interviewed, four (i.e. 80%) associated the changes which occurred in the economy dynamics of the global neoliberal political economy. They stressed that changes in the broader political economy led to huge rates of unemployment in South Africa (as stated by one leader). Owing to the alignment of the South African economy with global neoliberal political economic imperatives the economy remained in the hands of the powerful players and as a result the powerful have become richer (as highlighted by one leader). With regard to liberalisation of the retail market, multinationals and major retailer groups such as Edgars, Shoprite, Pick n Pay and so forth rather than the local business community, have benefitted the most, thus paralysing local economies (as stated by one leader).

Of the five leaders interviewed, three (i.e. 60%) alluded to the destabilisation of the local economy which has intensified the disempowerment of local communities. Local communities, in addition to not being empowered to compete at global market levels (as stated by two leaders) also do not have a strong base as regards financial resources. They lack structural support and skills to maximise the economic opportunities they possess (as stated by two leaders) which leads to their further economic marginalisation (as pointed out by one leader).
The current educational system does not equip these communities to provide solutions nor create or maximise the economic opportunities that come their way (as stated by one leader).

Reflecting on the changes in relation to the new legislative framework, three leaders (i.e. 60%) regarding new laws in South Africa as having positively impacted the economy. These give people freedom to invest (as stated by one leader). In the past, the black person was not allowed to own a business (as stated by one leader). After 1994, in an effort to ‘turn around’ and secure the new power base in South Africa, certain persons were of course given access to the fiscus. As a result; there are now more black millionaires and a few billionaires – i.e. Motsepe, Ramaphosa -, a few individuals that have really “come up”.

Conversely, there were others, such as the current Democratic Alliance contender for Mayor of Johannesburg, Herman Mashaba, who have achieved their wealth by selling Black Like Me products through their own entrepreneurial efforts and their ability to tap into the market through meeting a need. Many black people have managed to move into the suburbs and have their own homes (as highlighted by one leader). The abolition of discrimination and apartheid pieces of legislation has resulted in positive change in the economic realm (as stated by two leaders) but more still needs to be done (as emphasised by one leader). There are freedom and democracy, so that previously disadvantaged groups are free to participate in the economy (as stated by all five leaders); however, many such people do not experience this to the maximum (as articulated by one leader).

Speaking of negative changes that have occurred in the economy in the past fifteen years, of the five leaders interviewed three (i.e. 60%) highlighted a number of issues. 1) Greed and corruption of the people who benefited from Black Economic Empowerment and Affirmative Action and have become wealthy in this democracy (as stated by two leaders); 2) The political elite have not been properly trained to manage the public coffers nor held accountable. As a result, through their acts of corruption and mismanagement, they “snatch bread from the mouth of the poor and throw him [sic] further into misery” (as articulated by one leader); 3) The economic benefits are never distributed in an equitable manner. The system is focussed to benefit certain individuals who are connected with power. People at the grassroots who need to experience the positive changes are still battling (as expressed by two leaders); 4) demagogical election promises (i.e. we will give you “heaven” once elected) made by the ruling party encourage complacency. This feeds an attitude of entitlement (as highlighted by one leader) and lastly, 5) A “work ethic” which encourages people to work for self-reliance, work hard, to be frugal and save is disregarded (as stated by one leader).
Two leaders (i.e. 40%) interviewed spoke specifically on the positive changes that have occurred in the economy in the past fifteen years. Infrastructural development and social security were mentioned (stated by one leader). Grants for the indigents and pensioners were also mentioned. However, while grants may alleviate extreme misery, they should not make people dependent for ever but should become tools of empowerment and freedom (as highlighted by one leader). Therefore there is a need to conscientise people as Freire would have done, in terms of Black Consciousness for example (as articulated by one leader).

8.2.7 What influence do money and capital have in our situation in Tshwane (S & H)? Why? Who benefits from them?

8.2.7.1 Interviewees’ contributions

For interview participant M (2 February 2015):

- Money influences economic development in Tshwane.

- Local communities and small businesses have got ideas but have a problem with start-up capital. Notably, people don’t want to be in the situation they find themselves in. They need training to become competitive in the economic enterprise. A thorough training with regard to small business and support with start-up capital is needed. People also need teaching in terms of budgeting, marketing, even making the best out of what they have got and also infrastructure to assist them.

Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) pointed out: Money as capital in the hands of creative and hardworking citizens of Tshwane is a powerful instrument for LED.

I highlight the following inputs by Rev Mogwera’s (7 October 2015):

- Money influences our political life and decision making. Those who are economically and politically powerful are benefiting greatly. The African National Congress (ANC) makes sure that they channel money to ANC. The ANC never intended to empower all blacks. The ANC today wants to empower ANC members not blacks. That is negatively affecting our people. The ANC never planned to empower the real people on the ground. They don’t do grassroots economic development.

- Those that are richer benefit but most people are frustrated. Family life is frustrated.
If you don’t change your thinking money won’t solve your problem. So unfortunately, that way of thinking was left behind in LED and social policies being implemented by the government.

Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015) contended:

- The few who have opportunities in townships are making money but we need to put banking institutions in the townships. Currently, the people who make money in townships take it to town. Yet if the banks can be established in the townships local economic development in townships will benefit.

- Money is there in townships but it goes back or flights out of townships to town or other markets to benefit the powerful and rich. Because, our shops and industry in the townships have not been developed to the extent where they can retain the money and capital generated in townships.

Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) made these observations:

- There is this problem of worshipping the ‘material god’. Money is so important to the extent that people are not even patient to go through education. When one completes matric, he wants to make money. He cannot afford to go to university for another four years. Money is people’s priority. It is seen in our attitudes towards money; even people who used to be principled are no longer principled. People who use to say “I am prepared to die for the nation”, now they worship money. “We did not go on struggle to be poor”. It is also apparent among the political elite, they want money and they want it fast. Chikane in his book called it “masike ngoku”. The “ngoku” mentality is influenced by money. They are attracted by the money to the extent that we compromise other values and norms in our society.

- The level of corruption in the country is related to the love of the money.

- Even in the church, ministers abuse members for money and misappropriate church funds. We are role models of the people, we worship materialism and how then will people not be influenced by that? Therefore, people are increasingly loving money and don’t care about the nation. That is why people are angry. You cannot ask people to tighten their belts when you are not tightening yours. It happens among politicians, our pastors and others. Some pastors are very elitist, aiming for affluence and want to live far above the average church member.

8.2.7.2 Synthesis

All five of the leaders (i.e. 100%) interviewed acknowledged that money and capital exert a positive influence in the situation in Tshwane in different ways. Money as capital influences
economic development (as stated by one leader). Another declared that capital in the hands of creative and hardworking citizens of Tshwane is a powerful instrument for LED. Unfortunately, money and capital are scarce. Township communities and small businesses generate ideas but have difficulty obtaining start-up capital (as stated by one leader). Admittedly, training with regard to small business and support with start-up capital is needed (as articulated by one leader). Worse, the few people who make money in townships take it with them to economically strong suburbia (as highlighted by two leaders) thus leaving the township economy weaker.

Money also plays a negative role in the state of affairs in Tshwane as highlighted by two of the leaders (i.e. 40%) interviewed. It influences political life and decision making (as highlighted by one leader). The pursuit of money at all costs has had detrimental effects in the economy to the point where it has corrupted attitudes and ethics, since even people who used to be principled are no longer so (as stated by two leaders). The attraction of money has influenced political life and decision making in the city (as stated by one leader). This has also influenced some politicians to compromise other values and norms in our society, such as not serving people’s interests first (as articulated by one leader). There could be a relationship between corruption of avaricious politicians in South Africa and the greediness for money. However, it must be highlighted that not everyone who is preoccupied with money is also greedy.

Of the five leaders interviewed, two (i.e. 40%) said that economically and politically powerful people are benefiting greatly. While one leader held the view that even money generated in the townships by township people flows out of the said townships to town or other markets to benefit the powerful and rich, a second argues a political hand behind the current situation in Tshwane, stating that the African National Congress (ANC) never intended to empower all people. He goes on to say that the ANC of today wants to empower just ANC members, not all people. They do not involve themselves in grassroots economic development. Those that are richer benefit, but most people are frustrated (as expressed by one of the leaders).

8.2.8 Who makes the most important decisions in Tshwane (S & H)? Why? Who benefit from it?

8.2.8.1 Interviewees’ contributions
Interview participant M (2 February 2015) started by explaining the dynamics behind decision making and drew attention to:

- As local government and a municipality, we are supposed to come up with policies that will guide the people. We cannot decide for the people. Local government council is the one that will ensure that things are done in a way which does not disadvantaged [sic] communities. In a nutshell, the community itself will make the decisions and council will guide the municipality in terms of how things are supposed to be done

- Yet there are structures in those communities that are either self-appointed or they have been elected by community members that support or obstruct processes of decision making

- Since most of our people didn’t have opportunities to go to school, they are not in a position to understand the very policies as much as we take them to communities for consultation and public participation. They are dependent on some other people, either self-appointed leaders in communities or leaders that they have elected and those leaders will then call the shots for members of communities. The very same people elected or self-appointed within communities are the ones who are influencing decisions that are being taken. Even, when we take the policies for public participation, you will find that it is the very same people who will come up with inputs that will then lead to policies being taken in another direction which will benefit them.

Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) made the following contributions:

- The local government is the main decision maker even if sometimes it consults and seeks consensus with Ward structures in communities

- Sometimes the ward receives directives from the political mandate. These they can’t change it but comply with the imperatives of the political mandate

- Government structures end up benefiting more in comparison to what communities get in terms of outcomes from these decisions.

In answering the question, Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) said:

- The most important decisions are made by the government and the rich people

- People who are pro-government and the rich people benefit from these decisions

- Money dictates the course of things in community; the wealthy are making the decisions which influence policies (local, national and international), bilateral relations and governance. They make sure that these policies suit and benefit them
- But the people down there do not benefit substantially from these policies, bilateral relations and governance structures.

As Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015) asserted:

- The government is making policies from Cape Town which is so irrelevant with the township life [this is a major shortcoming]. Policies should speak or address the needs of the particular area.
- Failure due to this shortcoming makes these policies to end up benefiting the rich and powerful and further marginalise the poor.

From Prof Buffel's (17 November 2015) inputs, I highlight the following:

- He made the point that it is politicians in different levels of government who make the decisions. Civil servants and politicians influence many of the decisions simply because they want something in return. That is why corruption is ripe in government projects, even seemingly good ones; but, he elaborates, the process is influenced by politicians and their friends who want to gain something for facilitating processes. Politicians make things go the direction that benefit them.
- He went on to state that in any process they “hardly consult the community about buy-in”. Decisions are influenced mainly by people who see prospects of benefiting personally. He said: Gone is that thing of serving the community. This is what is fuelling anger in communities. “Dream deferred leads to explosion”.

8.2.8.2 Synthesis

Of the five leaders interviewed four (i.e. 80%) declared that the government (meaning different tiers of government) is the main decision maker, even if it sometimes consults. For them, the government makes the decisions. According to one leader the community itself and structures within these townships also have a say in the decision making processes within these communities. There are also the rich who influence the decisions which shape policies (local, national and international), bilateral relations and governance (as expressed by one leader).

Reasons related to the way decisions are made in Tshwane include a number of issues. Of the five leaders interviewed, one (i.e. 20%) said that this was due to the fact that people did not
have the opportunity to go to school and are therefore dependent upon some other people, either self-appointed leaders in communities or leaders that they have elected; those leaders will then “call the shots” for members of communities. These self-appointed or elected leaders within communities are the ones who are influencing decisions. Another leader (i.e. 20%) stated that the notion of serving the community has gone and that is what is fuelling anger in communities.

One leader went on to state that in her view, it was unfortunately, those same people (as described above) who come up with inputs who will then influence policy decisions being taken in another direction, to benefit themselves. Two leaders expressed the view that those people who are pro-government and the rich are those who manipulate these decisions to suit and benefit themselves. People at the grassroots level, especially the poor, will not benefit substantially and are further marginalised by these policies, bilateral relations and governance structures (as highlighted by two leaders).

8.2.9 What are the most important relationships of influence and power that people have? Why? Who benefits from it and who does not?

8.2.9.1 Interviewees’ contributions

Interview participant M (2 February 2015) remarked:

- There would be structures in communities that would influence and direct the way people are thinking. We have got democracy for people to decide which way and how do they want services to be rendered to themselves. But, it is unfortunate that in some instances, you find that people who know more and they are in communities, they would most of the time be pushing their own agendas at the expense of the entire community because most of the people might not even understand what the policies are and what is it that supposed to happen.

- The power lies with the people as the constitution dictates. When we even develop policies we don’t finalise them until we do public participation and public consultation. The aim with public participation and consultation is for the community to benefit and to really ensure that those policies serve the interests of the people.

Inputs from Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) point out:

- Family comes first for most people. [i.e. people see to it that they and their families benefit first and then the community]. This is the same for those who are in public office
• When different community structures work together as a team, this way the people benefit more because there will be accountability.

• Membership with stokvels and other community organisations that bring individuals together are important relationships towards economic survival.

• Communities see relationship with the church as important but they don’t necessarily listen to the church on matters affecting them because economically the church can’t help. [Failure of the church to convincingly proclaim the gospel in words and deeds caused the township church (of missionary origin) to be poor and unable to speak in the public political sphere]. The church feels inferior in society and living on hand-outs. Therefore, it cannot express genuinely its beliefs, its likes and dislikes and its local contextual theologies in fear of losing support from the white mother church. We were always begging.

Further, Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) indicates that:

• With particular reference to Soshanguve, some of the independent Pentecostal and Charismatic churches with financial resources in Soshanguve are still trapped in the old philosophy of ministry i.e. spiritual ministries (evangelism and deliverance) as the main focus and missions in communities are neglected.

• They are reluctant to be involved in missions instead they are inward looking as they want to use the church resources to benefit themselves. This mentality is still the same to that of the political black elite i.e. amass resources for self-interest first.

For Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015):

• Relationships with powerful people and structures are very important to people.

• Broadly speaking, our government bilateral relationships with certain countries and individuals are done because of money. Officials and the wealthy benefit from these deals, grassroots people do not.

• The group of people who control power and implementation of policies will not allow change which will affect them negatively. As a result, policies are manipulated in ways which inhibit radical socioeconomic transformation. There are business people in South Africa who know that for them to survive they need to take care of the ANC.

Rev Ngamlana’s (20 October 2015) responses highlighted the following areas:
- Stokvels, burial societies and saving clubs are very important networks of relations, locally created and maintained, which benefit the township people. They provide support, care and assistance when needed without complicated bureaucracy. For example, there is a group of twenty men in the East Rand who were retrenched from the mine. They formed a stokvel where one member is helped per year with a significant lump sum to set him for a business or investment in the stock market. This economic ingenuity of township people has fostered strong relationships of power and influence. Township people can make money. Time has come for the government to stop giving hand-outs.

- The church as a community has fostered important relationships in townships. Hence, it is expected of it to contextualise its theology. The poor wants to know how he/she can be helped to move away from my poverty so that he/she can be able to live with dignity as God intended.

Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) identified: political connections with councillors and politicians as being very important to people. People with ‘political connectivity’ are able to make things happen. Municipal services (such as acquisition of property, water reticulation, and so on) are expedited by people who are connected.

8.2.9.2 Synthesis

Of the five leaders interviewed, three (i.e. 60%) saw people-networks as the most important relationships of influence and power that people possess. Although power lies with the people, there are elected or self-appointed structures in communities that would influence and direct the way people are thinking (as indicated by two leaders). Family comes first for most people, the same for those who are in public office (as highlighted by one leader). Also people with political connectivity are able to make things happen (as expressed by two leaders).

Of the five leaders interviewed three (i.e. 60%) acknowledged that stokvels, burial societies and saving clubs are very important networks of relationships. They are locally created and maintained, which benefits the township people and are important relationships for economic survival. Using these financial vehicles, township people are able to make money and gain access to a certain amount of funding.

Two leaders (i.e. 40%) considered the church as an important community of influence. The church is an important community for people in the townships although they do not necessarily listen to it on matters affecting them as the church cannot help them economically (according to
one leader). Despite its lack of resources the church has an important relationship with those in the townships; it provides other support such as spiritual counselling, prayer support, etc. Failure of the church to convincingly proclaim the gospel in words and deeds has impoverished the township churches (especially ones of missionary origin) and rendered them unable to speak to the public political forum of these townships. One leader expressed this condition by saying that she (the church) is always begging.

There are Pentecostal and Charismatic churches in Soshanguve that do have financial resources, but they are still trapped in the old philosophy of ministry. Nonetheless, the church as a community has fostered important relationships in townships which could be useful for community development. Hence, it is expected of it to contextualise its theology (as highlighted by one leader).

With reference to beneficiaries of economic relationships, one leader (i.e. 20%) stated that though officials and the wealthy people benefit especially through economic deals, the grassroots people do not (as stated by one leader).

8.2.10. What are the most important traditions of the people? Why would you say so? How does this contribute to LED?

8.2.10.1 Interviewees' contributions

For Interview participant M (2 February 2015);

- Townships people are used to survive by local means; I think one could call it LED in the sense that they would have your stokvels, your societies like burial societies, society for this, society for that. For instance, the total amount saved in the society account is divided among members so that each one will get money for their children’s school fees and books or any other needs the family might have

- With regard to burial societies you will find that the people who are working in a household, each person will get a funeral cover from a burial society. The monthly contribution is not too much for one to come up with. Communities are now supporting the local funeral undertakers. That is another way of contributing to LED

- The other thing also which contributes to LED is where people have started their own businesses within communities such as selling “fat cakes” and the hawkers who are forever selling vegetables contribute to LED.
Rev Mamatsinya’s (6 October 2015) inputs include traditions such as:

- **Interdependent family relations to care for each other. These relations are naturally conditioned to help each other**

- **For example, during the ploughing season at the farm, if I don’t have money to hire a tractor to plough for me I will call on my neighbours to help plough for me free of charge. The only way I am expected to show my gratitude is to provide a meal and refreshments on the day**

- **When I will harvest, my family will have food and the excess will be sold. With this income, I pay school fees of my children or save it for the future**

Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) argued that:

- **We (Africans) are sharing people. If one man works he knows that he has an obligation to help an uncle somewhere. I have to help my brother. Most of us when we grew up, it were expected of us to help brothers to get education. After we assisted them they were expected to assist the other siblings. That is what has kept the people going and surviving in this economy. We share the bread; we share our homes and everything**

- **We have come to realise that if I fight for my own space, I will exclude so many people around me because the system never worked in our favour. We might have physical space as land but I don’t have economic space. We have to come together so that together we can do more. We make good out of a small thing. That is what helps us to be here today and contribute to the economy**

- **We also opt for a simple cheap way of life. We ate chicken feet and oval, Inkomasi (sour milk), chakalaka, mageu, mala mogodu for an example to survive.**

As Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015) mentioned:

- **“Help my neighbour” schemes [i.e. sharing resources to lift the neighbour out of poverty]**

- **Save money together in a group for short term investment, such as extending a home**

- **Buying non-perishables such as detergents together in bulk to last the whole year. This way they free their income to be applied to other investments. The government can help support these initiatives to advance the causes of LED in townships.**

According to Prof Buffel (17 November 2015):
• The fact that sometimes traditions are imprisoning us. One of these traditions is about giving family property as inheritance to the last born in the family. This last born may not be necessarily a responsible guy in the family. Another family tradition is about collective ownership of family assets, this collective ownership may stand in the way of a viable economic decision. Economic development is stifled in the process. Some of the traditional practices don’t necessarily help when it comes to economic decisions. They hold us back.

For an example, a man who used to be taxis owners died and was survived by his wife and young children. The Taxi association members were saying to his widow “we don’t want women in this business”. Therefore, you either appoint a man to run your business until you sons grow up or sell the taxis. Fortunately, this woman stood her ground and is now successfully running the business. The association members were saying to her only your sons can sit in the boardroom with us, not you.

8.2.10.2 Synthesis

Of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, four (i.e. 80%) highlighted traditions deemed important for personal and collective economic survival. These included notions such as “We (Africans) are sharing people”. “It is expected of us to help brothers to get education”. “After we assisted them they are expected to assist the other siblings”. “We share our homes and everything” (as stated by one leader) “and we are also expected to share resources to lift the neighbour out of poverty” (as explained by one leader). Further, “we foster interdependent relations in this way we care for each other, naturally help each other and call on my neighbours to help” (as expressed by one leader). According to one leader, this web of interdependence has assisted township Africans in their survival as they use stokvels and societies like burial societies – a society for this – a society for that, as well as small businesses.

Of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, one (i.e. 20%) highlighted that some traditions could have a negative impact on the economic survival of families, which he summed up by saying “Sometimes traditions are imprisoning us”.

With reference to reasons for the importance of these traditions, of the five leaders interviewed, four (i.e. 80%) highlighted a number of matters. These traditions have kept the people surviving by local means in this economy (as stated by two leaders). For collective survival for example, they save money together in a group to buy non-perishables in bulk. Through this, they use less of their disposable income so that it is freed up for other investments (as highlighted by one
leader). This is very important for them because the system has never worked in their favour. They come together so that together they can do more. One leader explained it by saying that they make good out of a small thing and opt for a simple and cheap way of life.

These traditions have contributed to the local economy in several ways. According to one leader, people have started their own small businesses within communities such as selling “fat cakes”. Some hawkers who are selling vegetables at the taxi ranks made money through these means and contribute to LED. The income generated assists with paying the educational fees of their children or being able to save for the future.

8.2.11. What do people want most in life in Tshwane (S & H)? Why?

8.2.11.1 Interviewees contributions

According to Interview participant M (2 February 2015) what people want most as related to LED is:

- To be acknowledged as small businesses contributing to the broader economy
- To get support which is of good quality i.e. start-up capital. To be trained on how to do marketing of their products. They need space to be assigned where they could operate from. They need to be channelled into the culture of business
- People don’t want to be dependent; it is about their dignity as people. I don’t think even if people are poor that they would want to be labelled as poor. That is why they started those things (such as stokvels, selling little things), holding on, to survive even though they are struggling.

Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) stated:

- People want money but they don’t want to make money. Don’t love money; love what you can do to make money. When people love money they steal from each other
- People want to get rich quick but don’t want to work hard or even create jobs for themselves. Rather, they wait for the government to provide jobs for them
- People in townships want to consume and hate to produce and manufacture. They don’t want to start anything, they don’t want to create. We want to be given all the time. People want things for free.
Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) named the following:

- **In Tshwane what people want most is employment.** People are unemployed and that is reality. One of the things the Government must give people is employment hubs in the townships. People can’t all drive to Pretoria to look for employment. They must develop business and employment hubs. They can start by reviving and rebuilding old hubs such as Babelegi, GaRankuwa and Mokwase for an example. Take for an instance the issue of xenophobia, the economic battle is at the heart of the attacks against other black Africans You go to towns you see businesses hiring foreign nationals because they are cheap labour. This makes people angry.

- **What people want in Tshwane is a “proper education” meaning an education system linked with practical vocational skills. Proper education is a catalyst for job creation.**

- **Everybody needs “bread and shelter”.** People who can find employment in their localities contribute to the local economy.

Rev Ngamlana’s (20 October 2015) response to the above questions was: the people want to know how to live and how to look after their families. They also want to educate their children. The church can play a vital role in these aspirations by teaching people self-reliance.

In response to this question, Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) submitted:

- **Different people want different things.** People want comfortable lives. The unemployed want decent jobs. The unfortunate part is if they don’t find jobs they don’t create some. Generally, African immigrants, when they come here if they don’t find jobs they create jobs. Instead of beating them up, we could learn a lot from them in terms of how they managed to come up with some ways of survival. We could also learn something about their resilience and tolerance to unbearable situations that they go through. We easily give up. We want things to be done for us, we are entitled!

- **There are also people who want comfort.** Some want luxury and a lot of money

- **There are those who want to live a normal life, crime free.** People want to have normal basic services without which people are dehumanised

- **People want this better life for all that is promised in the South African Constitution which is still elusive.** Now it is better life for some, especially those who are politically connected.

### 8.2.11.2. Synthesis
Of the five leaders/practitioners interviewed, four (i.e. 80%) stated that people want their basic needs to be met. Everybody needs “bread and shelter” (as stated by one leader) and according to one leader, they want to know how to live and how to look after their families. They also desire to educate their children (as expressed by one leader). People wish to live a normal, crime free life and to receive normal basic services without which people are dehumanised. They want this “better life for all” that is promised in the South African Constitution and in the ANC slogan as well which is still elusive (as articulated by one leader). Those who cannot live this normal life have expectations of support from the government and society at large (as pointed out by one leader).

In addition, of the five leaders/practitioners interviewed, three (i.e. 60%) pointed out that people wish to contribute meaningfully to the economy through active participation. Those who are involved in small businesses desire to be acknowledged as contributors to the economy. One leader stated that people do not want to be dependent; that is why they have started initiatives such as stokvels, selling little items on the corners of streets, holding on to survive. What people want most is employment; hence they look forward to the development of business and employment hubs (as highlighted by one leader). These hubs need people with practical vocational skills to become centres of economic opportunities. Therefore, a proper applied education (meaning an integrated practical education) has to be offered in the townships. This education is a catalyst for job creation in the localities. Thus, since the unemployed want decent jobs (as stated by one leader) the hubs will have to prioritise their needs. People who can find employment in their localities contribute to the local economy (as explained by one leader).

However, two leaders (i.e. 40%) placed emphasis on the fact that there are people who want possessions without effort. They desire money but not the effort of making it. They wish to get rich quickly, but do not want to work hard or even create jobs for themselves. Rather, they wait for the government to provide jobs for them. They prefer to consume rather than produce and manufacture (as stated by one leader). They would like things to be done for them; they feel entitled (as highlighted by one leader). According to one leader, it is important to learn from foreign nationals who are toiling in our townships; they do not easily give up.

8.2.12. What will things be like in ten years if the economy keeps going in the same way? Why?

8.2.12.1 Interviewees’ contributions
Interview participant M (2 February 2015) suggested:

that the basis of the broader economy lies in LED. If we don’t have well-structured ways of supporting and encouraging small businesses (as it is the case currently) I think we might end up having a whole nation which is dependent on the government for everything. If people are not able to afford to take their children to school even the broader economy would have a lack of well skilled people or workers. It is like a chain which has a ripple effect. I think the economy will collapse and further marginalise the poorest of the poor in Tshwane.

Charged with emotion, Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) exclaimed: *If there is no change, we will “eat each other”. The loitering, violent theft and associated crimes will worsen. Now in townships, people steal anything and can do anything to get money.*

Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) contended:

- There will be chaos. The economy is currently going down the drain
- A few benefit but the majority suffers. Our government does not have a convincing long term plan for massive job creation. They don’t forecast well. You have to invest on building the capacity of our young people. Take young people, provide them with training. Forget about the [current] BEE and AA models. Take the youth, train them through partnership overseas, let them gain knowledge and skills. After they qualify you bring them back with skills to fill crucial positions in industry. Take skilled people to affirm. We have so many faces today in higher offices of industries who have limited understanding of the industries they are leading. This is a big problem for Affirmative Action in this country.
- Our economy and its claimed benefits for the masses are theoretical and elusive. Somewhere somehow our education system needs to be revisited so that it becomes a tool for economic development. Education is not about a qualification but it should be about the person you have formed through this process, his [sic] usefulness to society.

Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015) stated: *there will be upheavals because the poor will like to grab from the rich. It will also worsen the socioeconomic inequalities. Most people will be economically marginalised. The few who have [possessions] will become crime targets as signs pointed out during the last xenophobic upheaval.*

For Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) whose fears relate to corruption and wasteful expenditure in public office:
• The way we mal-administer things; the reputation of the country is going to be further ruined. Already rating agencies have started lowering our ranking. Investors lose confidence in our country and are hesitant to invest in our economy. Remember the “Guptas scandal” which made South Africa look like a “banana republic”. Who is going to invest in a country like that?

• The inequality gap will keep on increasing. We are heading towards moral bankruptcy.

8.2.12.2 Synthesis

All five leaders / practitioners (i.e. 100%) interviewed spoke of catastrophe if the economy persists in the way it is currently going. The various views expressed by them included the following items: We might end up having a whole nation becoming dependent on the government for everything, the economy will collapse and further marginalise the poorest of the poor in Tshwane. We will “eat each other”. The loitering, violent theft and associated crimes will worsen. Now in townships, people will do anything to get money (as highlighted by one leader). There will be chaos. The economy is currently going down the drain. A few benefit, but the majority suffers. The economy’s claimed benefits for the masses have remained theoretical and elusive. There will be upheavals because the poor will attempt to grab from the rich. Most people will be economically marginalised. The few who have possessions will become crime targets. Finally, the economic reputation of the country is going to be further ruined with investors losing confidence in our country. The inequality gap will continue increasing and finally, we are heading towards moral bankruptcy.

Of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, three (i.e. 60%) gave their reasons for this situation: Policy makers and the government do not forecast well and have placed unskilled people (as part of the Affirmative Action policy) to steer economic development (as pointed out by one leader). Moreover, they do not have well-structured ways of supporting and encouraging small businesses as is the case currently (as pointed out by one leader). As a result, the entrenched socioeconomic inequalities (as stated by one leader) remain unaddressed.

8.2.13 What are the most important causes of the way the broader and the local economy is today? Why?

8.2.13.1 Interviewees’ contributions
Interview participant M (2 February 2015) spoke of:

- The disconnection: there has got to be a link, a well-thought link between local economy and the broader economy from the point of view that says that local economy has a very critical role to play into the broader economy
- The broader economy should not be seen as a stand-alone and local economy being seen as something to while away time
- As long as we don’t take care of LED and local communities to empower them to become self-sustaining I think that is going to cripple the broader economy
- Consequently, there will be huge demand toward the economy and also there will be huge demand to government ultimately

Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015) identified the following causes as contributory:

- People are lazy. A lazy person will be even lazy to feed himself
- People are not creative
- People don’t think how to make a good economic plan for themselves (see book authored by Napoleon Hill entitled: Think and grow rich)
- I see the church failing to “make people” to live life to the glory of God. This church [in the New South Africa] must be different to the one we have known. This church should talk about everything pertaining to life on earth and in heaven.

For Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) causes could be associated with:

- Level of education
- The way the government makes promises to people. People are waiting for something to happen. The government is like the messiah
- The way corruption is happening in the public office and business
- The way crime is tackled: criminals are not punished accordingly. People with money escape the hands of the law. Economic offences go unpunished and are overlooked: employers cheat employees of decent wages. If we want to build a strong economy we must be strict on economic offences. We must put in place laws and regulations that prevent abuse of people and resources
- Cut dependency so that people can start bringing bread by themselves.
Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015) was of the opinion that:

- When the new government took over, they really didn’t sit down to look at the economy and the direction it should take. They didn’t come out with very clear policies about how they are going to care for the poor, the middle class and so on. I don’t think that even the RDP was well thought out.

- Also the three tier political system we have in South Africa is cumbersome for the local economy. It causes unnecessary double budget which has a negative impact on our economic resources. The money is being wasted. For an example, Gauteng provincial structure could be reformed to become an administration to implement what has been passed as policies from the national government.

Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) contributed by offering the following views:

- There was a time when the economy was doing pretty well during Mandela’s term in office as president although interestingly the “cake was not shared equally with the people”

- There is a deviation to what the Freedom Charter stipulates i.e. South Africa belongs to all who live in it. Company like Lonmin, they made a lot of money when the economy was doing well. At the moment, because of low price they blame the strikes and the mine workers. But, had they done something that time where there was a boom in the different industries, I am sure the strikes could have been averted. Or at least the negative impacts that came in with the economic slow-down could have been minimised. Executive salaries kept on growing while the poor are being plunged deep into poverty (refer to the book on Executive salaries in SA) as a result this is breeding discontent among the people

- Most ordinary people have started losing confidence in the country except the BEE beneficiaries and the politically connected. We are slowly installing political and economic instability

- The economy is structured in such a way that those who are poor will be poor even in the future; there are of course few exceptions there and there. The economy is not structured in such a way that it narrows the inequality gap. The economic growth of past years have benefited only a few, there has not been equitable share of benefits. These neo-liberal policies favour the powerful, the rich, the politically connected but ordinary people are marginalised.
8.2.13.2 Synthesis

Of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, three (i.e. 60%) maintained that the most important causes for the situation in the economy today could be linked to issues of governance and leadership. The leaders in government examine the economy and the direction it should take. They did not devise very clear policies about how they are going to care for the poor, the middle class and so on. Even the RDP was not well thought out. In addition to this, the three tier political system in South Africa is cumbersome for the local economy. It has resulted in an unnecessary double expense and the money is being wasted (as stated by one leader).

What is more, said one leader, the way the government makes promises has led people to expect it to meet all their needs. Through this leaders have nurtured dependency associated with corruption. Being close to power, people with money escape the hands of the law. Economic offences go unpunished and are overlooked (as explained by one leader). Most ordinary people have therefore started losing confidence in the country except those who are BEE beneficiaries and the politically connected (as highlighted by one leader).

Of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, two (i.e. 40%) spoke of structural, systemic and ideological issues as important causes of the current economic situation. There is a disconnection between the local and the broader economy. The latter should not be perceived as a stand-alone while the local economy is merely regarded as not an important part of the economy. This has led to failing to take care of LED and local communities in ways that empower them to become self-sustaining (as remarked by one leader). It should be pointed out that in the neo-liberal economic system the economy is structured in such a way that those who are poor will be impoverished even in the future; with certain exceptions. For example, the economic growth of past years in South Africa has benefited just a few.

Of the five leaders / practitioners interviewed, one (i.e. 20%) highlighted issues pertaining to people as important causes of the current economic situation. With reference to Soshanguve one leader was critical of both the church and the people (see Rev Mamatsinya, 6 October 2015).

Finally, with reference to reasons for the current economic situation, three leaders (i.e. 60%) highlighted a number of issues (cf. Rev Mogwera, 7 October 2015; Rev Ngamalana, 20 October 2015; and Prof Buffel, 17 November 2015).
8.2.14. How, in summary, do you think LED should be taken forward to benefit especially the poor in Tshwane?

8.2.14.1 Interviewees’ contributions

For Interview participant M (2 February 2015) the following considerations are important:

- For jobs to be created LED has to be working. Government cannot create jobs. Government is supposed to create an enabling environment for LED to thrive in the sense that there have got structures and systems put in place to support, to maintain, to sustain and to even assist in terms of the linkage that I have just indicated between local economy (small business) and the broader economy in terms of how do they contribute moving forward

- Policies are in place. The question is how to implement them effectively so that they address the challenges that we have spoken about

- People are ready and people are willing as long as they can be also a budget put aside to assist and support them moving forward

- We need to start investing more into small business and LED so that we are in position to cover a bigger ground. Once, that has been done I think the rest will take care of itself.

According to Rev Mamatsinya (6 October 2015):

- It needs few people (tested with good working grassroots models from across the sectors of society) to drive this pro-poor LED in Tshwane (S & H)

- Stop thinking that we will convince communities with words. People are convinced when they see actions which make a difference. People who have facilitated these types of actions should lead us in LED. “Dilo di dirwa ke moto a di dirwe ke batho” (meaning outstanding things are done by an individual and not a group of people)

- Let us get the right people who are competent. For me competency is about three things: 1) knowledge, 2) wisdom and 3) experience. These three things make somebody competent and these are what to look for in the people who take LED forward in Tshwane to benefit the poor – people who are knowledgeable, wise and experienced in LED.

Rev Mogwera (7 October 2015) articulated the following suggestions:
The government should take the stakeholders (such as churches and their pastors, leaders in the community, business leaders and public institutions) and cast the vision of LED to them because we need to see things the same way.

Tackle youth unemployment: take people who have qualification to learner-ship programmes to empower them to become self-reliant. Take them to workplaces to develop entrepreneurship spirit and acquire practical skills of starting and running a business.

Government must put in place support structures in terms of business mentors and inspectors who will oversee the processes outlined here above.

Ensure that decent minimum wages are paid to workers: non-compliance must be prosecuted, punished and eradicated.

Create practical, vocational schools into the secondary education system in the townships. For these schools to succeed the government needs to reposition the nation’s economic priorities based on the local economy.

As a pastor, I believe our theological colleges need to be brought to the table. In theology, they have prepared me for heaven. It is time for churches to look at the economic side of life. Sometimes our [theological] teachings align with dependency, depending on God for everything. The church must change. Due to our theological focus on heaven, our people can’t compete effectively in the market place. Churches are supposed to be the key because they have people. So if the government can enlighten church leaders through educational workshops. They will start at looking at things differently i.e. balance the focus of ministry by preaching about heaven and at the same time addressing practical issues of unemployment, poverty, vulnerability, etc. which affect the communities where they are located. It is time to change the way ministry is done.

Right people in right position: this should not be based on political party loyalty or affiliation.

With reference to churches, he said:

- We need to encourage our young people to be involved in politics because “when the righteous are in power the society is in peace”
- Teach about having the correct attitude with regard to money
- Teach the church about the budget and to live within their means and save
- Start community projects geared to foster self-reliant development not charity
• The church must introduce different centres of educating people. If we continue on charity we will get the same results.

For the sake of LED, he contends [that] the government should orient:

• Community members to start projects that seek to address economic issues in townships and not dwell on charity and social services which feed dependency

• Get people from begging to become self-reliant. We can overcome the current impasse with an integrated LED plan in townships.

Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015) proposed:

• They (government and private sector) should empower community non-profit institutions such as churches. Because churches are communities where the poor are naturally accepted and assisted

• They should empower the local spaza shop owners (the engine of township economy)

• Our universities must have some practical non-degree courses on LED. These should be accessible to local grassroots business people.

According to Prof Buffel (17 November 2015):

• Those people who are responsible for policies and for creating the necessary environments for LED should develop some sensitivity to listen to community. Policies should not be imposed on people.

• A constituency-based legislature will be better because we will elect a specific person that we are sure of about his/her competency and loyalty to transformation. Unlike what happens now where political parties appoint our representatives.

• Policy makers must be held accountable; it seems as if they miss to read the “signs of the time”.

With reference to the church’s roles towards LED, he shared the following insights from a practical theology perspective:

• The church must wake up, it is sleeping instead of leading the agenda of transformation

• The church must change its mind-set. It should avoid the tendency that this is my business and that is not my business. My belief is that life in all its totality is the business of the church.
- I wish the church in South Africa could look back and remember where it comes from. It stood against apartheid, it came with a prophetic voice, and it got involved in liberation and so on. It made statements in public places.

- The church cannot get out of politics; politics is life and therefore a business of the church. Everything which happens in community is the business of the church even if politicians request of us to stick to the pulpit.

- The church has no other option but to get involved in issues of life. See the pattern of biblical prophetic ministry. Prophets spoke about life in its totality i.e. relationship with God and relationships with fellow human beings. We cannot see these two relationships as separated.

- We must know that the “acid test” of our call is to be involved where life happens. Life happens where people are suffering, crying, in pain …that is where we are needed. Therefore, we should get out of this complacency that we got liberation. Yes a partial liberation (political) but we should challenge the powers that be so that liberation in all its dimensions including liberation of the mind is achieved (see Steve Biko, Frans Fanon, etc.)

- We need to approach life holistically.

8.2.14.2 Synthesis

All the leaders interviewed (i.e. 100%) gave their inputs on how LED should be taken forward to benefit the poor. Two leaders spoke of strengthening structures, linkages and systems.

They should facilitate the implementation of policies effectively so that they address the challenges of poverty, unemployment and the like. Tackling youth unemployment for example, through learner-ships to develop an entrepreneurial spirit and acquisition of practical skills to start and run a business. It is therefore a prerequisite to start investing more into small business and LED (as expressed by one leader). Community members must also start projects that seek to address economic issues in townships and not dwell on charity and social services which feed on dependency. For this reason we can overcome the current impasse with an integrated LED plan in townships (as explained by one leader).

According to three leaders (i.e. 60%), in the future LED has to work with all stakeholders towards the realisation of LED which is equitable and prosperous for all (as stated by three leaders). With particular reference to human resources, the emphasis should be on finding the
right people who are competent (i.e. 1) knowledgeable, 2) wise and 3) experienced) to lead LED in Tshwane (S & H) (as highlighted by two leaders).

Focussing on the churches’ future roles towards LED, four leaders (i.e. 80%) identified a few pointers. The church has to encourage Christian young people to be involved in politics. The church must also give instruction about adopting the correct attitude with regard to money, as well as for instance, having a budget. The church has to start community projects geared to fostering self-reliant development, not charity and be a catalyst for educating people beyond dependency (as expressed by one leader).

The church, being the largest non-profit organisation in communities, must collaborate with the government and private sector to ensure that small businesses and savings clubs, including local spaza shops are empowered with skills and economic competency. Universities should be persuaded to make available some practical non-degree courses on LED. These should be accessible to local grassroots business people (as elaborated by one leader).

The church also needs to ‘conscientise’ policy makers and government to develop some sensitivity to listen to the community. Policies should not be imposed on people. Policy makers must be held accountable; it seems as if they miss to read the ‘signs of the time’ (as stated by one leader). Finally, the church has to lead the agenda of transformation. This requires the church to change its mind-set and to realise that life in all its totality is the business of the church. It has to look back and remember where it comes from. It stood against apartheid, it spoke with a prophetic voice and so on. As with the prophets of old, the church cannot avoid politics; politics is life and therefore part of the business of the church. The church has no other option but to become involved in issues of life. The church should remember that the “acid test" of its call is to be involved where life happens: when people are suffering, crying, in pain …that is where the church is needed so that liberation in all its dimensions including liberation of the mind is achieved. The church should therefore approach life holistically (as elaborated by one leader).

8.3. Conclusion of the Chapter

In this chapter, the leaders/practitioners and “experts” interviewed shared rich insights and information pertaining to LED in Tshwane (S & H) from various perspectives i.e. socioeconomic and historical, ecclesiastical, political and administrative. It is apparent that the findings of these
interviews complement and at some points amplify the narrative findings presented in Chapter 6. There is much here, as was also established in the previous chapter, which serves to answer my central research question and sub-questions, going some way towards proving this study’s hypothesis as well as having a bearing on potential future studies related to this topic.

The following key findings are highlighted:

- The economic situation of townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, as described by participants is unsatisfactory and desperate (see 8.2.1.2). Therefore, it is crucial that LED initiatives are undertaken to address the current massive unemployment on one hand and on the other generate resources to meet basic human needs developmentally and sustainably in Tshwane (S & H). Furthermore, these initiatives have to support those who are sick, weak and injured because of the inherent injustice of the current economic system. Focus group participants’ choice for a project to address unemployment holistically in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal is an appropriate response to the situation (see narrative accounts in Chapter 6)

- LED is understood (see 8.2.2.2) as a mechanism and a way of working geared to create viable local level economic structures. Therefore, LED is well positioned to address the issues of unemployment by facilitating and giving economic opportunities to people in communities. Sustainable LED is achieved when community organisations and institutions including churches, the government and the private sector work together in partnership. Yet, I contend, lobbying and advocacy still need to be performed to convince the government and private sector to increase their support towards LED

- For various reasons, socioeconomic and development policies have not all realised the intended goals of sharing and distributing the economic benefits across sectors of the society. Some resulted in limited success and did benefit communities while others have failed and have been a disadvantage to communities (see 8.2.3.2 & 8.2.4.2). It is therefore important to opt for a LED strategy which promotes the development of policies and activities based on the capacities, skills and assets of the poor and their neighbourhoods within the limits of the earth or oikos. It could promote the wellbeing of community (humans and non-humans in harmony) and freedoms
Due to the ineffectiveness and failures of many socioeconomic and development policies, some changes or “fine tuning” are necessary (see 8.2.5.2). It is therefore an imperative that there is critical engagement with policy makers for the purpose of enhancing, on the one hand, understanding of the issues embedded in these policies while, on the other, clarifying options and choices that will lead to a development in Tshwane (S&H) which is geared towards liberation and transformation.

Owing to various factors such as the alignment of the post-apartheid South African economy with global neoliberal political economic imperatives and the like, we have experienced positive as well as negative changes in the economy (see 8.2.6.2). Thus, it makes sense, as argued earlier, that Tshwane (S & H) LED has to be “glocal” by embracing and participating in broad-based and collective actions geared towards the realisation of the vision for healthy communities where services, infrastructures, institutions, leadership, vision, policies, organisations, communities, assets, agency and sustainable livelihoods are present in a practical way (see Porter 2000: 15-34) that benefits specific localities. In the future, it is also therefore crucial that a bottom-up approach, a ‘glocal’ development process with emphasis on developing pro-poor LED interventions and balanced economic growth within the system, be imagined.

Money and capital have exerted positive as well as negative influences in our situation in Tshwane in different ways (see 8.2.7.2). It is important that money and capital must work towards LED which benefits all communities in Tshwane.

In the main, the government (in different tiers) is the key decision maker on matters pertaining to the economy (see 8.2.8.2). LED in Tshwane will do better if it works towards directly enhancing human abilities (by fostering long and healthy life, knowledge and decent standard of living) and creating conditions for human development (by fostering participation in political and community life, environmental sustainability, human security and rights and gender equality).
• Networks of people, community organisations (such as stokvels, burial societies and saving clubs) and the church are very important networks of relationships and influence (see 8.2.9.2). Therefore, it is strategic that a sustainable asset based local economic development be the preferred option for Tshwane (S & H) in the future.

• In the main, sharing, interdependent relations and surviving by local means such as stokvels, societies, savings clubs are traditions deemed important for personal and collective economic survival (see 8.2.10.2). These practices, arising out of healthy traditions of mutual care and assistance, are assets useful for LED which should be maintained and promoted.

• What people want most is to live a normal life, i.e. their human basic needs are met, to be in a position to contribute meaningfully to the economy and to lead self-reliant lives (see 8.2.11.2). LED will do better to work towards meeting basic human needs in the continuum of socioeconomic development as far as it is done in harmony with the ecosystem (see also 1.7.5 and Wood 1992: 1).

• There will be a multi-dimensional catastrophe if the economy persists in the way it is currently going (see 8.2.12.2). Thus, from now on LED in Tshwane (S & H) should work to avert this.

• The most important causes for the state of the economy today could be linked to issues of governance and leadership, structural, systemic and ideological matters and matters pertaining to people such as ethics and behaviours (see 8.2.13.2). It is important therefore that LED support those who are sick, weak and injured and work to prevent the “unnatural” death of many poor and marginalised people and non-human beings whose lives are cut short by the system.
With reference to the government, private sector and the church, various suggestions were made to take LED forward to benefit the poor (see 8.2.14.2). It is essential that all the assets for LED in Tshwane (S & H) as described earlier should be mobilised as tools for social and economic justice in Tshwane.

In the next chapter I discuss and present a summary in relation to six categories used for analysis that emerged from mini-consultations and interviews.
Chapter Nine

DISCUSSION AND SUMMARY IN RELATION TO SIX CATEGORIES USED FOR ANALYSIS THAT EMERGED FROM MINI-CONSULTATIONS AND INTERVIEWS

9.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I build on the six aspects/categories that emerged from the focus group (phase 3): 1) reasons for the current\textsuperscript{172} economic situation in Tshwane; 2) socioeconomic and political structures which have led to this situation; 3) relationships of power and influence in this situation; 4) cultural resources of the people in terms of religion, culture and traditions and in terms of traditional knowledge, skills and values; 5) people’s aspirations and desires (ethics, values, behaviours, and so forth) and 6) sources of creativity and hope for the future in the present situation. These six categories form the basis of the discussion and evaluation.

Narrative findings are juxtaposed with those of the interviews and literature and vice versa for the purpose of gaining insights about LED in Tshwane from these different viewpoints. Attention is also drawn to the practical implications of this research with regard to theory and praxis. These insights are theologically reflected upon in the next chapter in relation to LED and the oikos concept with the aim of presenting a conceptual framework for a theology of LED in Tshwane (S & H).

9.2. Discussion, evaluation and conclusions of the findings as per themes

9.2.1. How did the Tshwane economy come to this point?

9.2.1.1. The situation and experiences of people in Tshwane (S & H) in relation to the broader and local economy

Narrative accounts at the insertion phase of mini-consultation one in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.1) bring the following points to light: that the poor are suffering from multi-faceted poverty

\textsuperscript{172} In this research, “current” refers to the period from 2010 to 2015 when economic inequalities and injustice have been exacerbated by mass unemployment and poverty, particularly in townships such as Soshanguve and Hammanskraal in Tshwane. It is also understood that this situation is not static and that the economy of Tshwane may be different in years to come.
(materially, economically and psychologically); that they are affected by crime and poor health; they are marginalised from meaningful participation in the economy; the situation is desperate; the poor are victims of fraud and corruption; they are kept in ignorance; they are unemployed; their localities are infested with drugs; many are subjected to starvation; their children are stealing for survival; they have no viable economic opportunities; they experience fear, emotional and physical abuse for failing to provide; some of their young people have dysfunctional minds; they are guilty of self-blame and not taken seriously by many government officials.

At the description phase of mini-consultation One as reported in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.2), the narrative accounts underline that people are voiceless and powerless; suffering; oppressed; made powerless by keeping them ignorant about powers and systems governing the economy; suffer abuse at the hands of officials; robbed of decent wages; those with small businesses suffer because there is lack of protection by government, with just a minority prospering. The prospering minority includes the middle class as well as those who are benefitting from their own initiatives and/or as recipients of government youth funds and grants. Just this minority feel positive about the economy in Tshwane (S & H).

The interview findings as reported in section 8.2.1.2 of Chapter 8 reveal that: 80% of leaders interviewed observed that there is unemployment including youth unemployment; 40% of leaders noticed poverty and crime associated with poverty; 40% highlighted dependency as being entrenched in these townships; 40% spoke of economic policies failing to transform life for the better in these townships; 40% interviewed saw township local economies as being disconnected and in a disadvantaged position while 100% of the leaders interviewed responded that the economic situation in Tshwane is desperate and the people are experiencing an unpleasant and difficult time. As a result they are discouraged, depressed, worried and angry.

These interview findings (section 8.2.1.2) concur with the narrative accounts in the mini-consultation One as reported on in Chapter 6 at insertion phase (6.2.1), particularly as regarding the economic situation of Tshwane (S & H) being desperate, which is compounded by a combination of unemployment, crime, the failure of economic policies to transform lives of the poor and township economies being at a disadvantage. Put bluntly, in the words of participants, Mr Golele (11 January 2014, 6.2.1) contended “we lack many things like jobs….we lack so many things” and as Ms Masase stated, “everything is like broken” (12 January 2014, 6.2.1). In
short, township “communities are suffering” (Matjeke, 11 January 2014) in the current economic situation (cf. 6.2.1).

The interview findings of Chapter 6 and Chapter 8 confirm what Kofi Annan stated in the Africa Progress Report (2012) about Africa in general: that disparities in basic life-chances – for health, education and participation in society – are preventing millions of Africans from realising their potential, holding back social and economic progress in the process. With reference to South African cities, Boraine et al. elaborate,

The economic fortunes of the cities are currently mixed. On the whole, no SACN\textsuperscript{173} city is doing particularly well at ensuring that all their residents have the means to earn a reasonable living (...). Following a long-term trend of a switch from primary and secondary industry to services, there has been a marked decline in employment amongst manual workers (Boraine et al. 2006: 266-268).

The findings confirm also international research findings that “there is no simple relationship between growth and poverty reduction” (Grant 2004: 38). The relationship which exists “is affected by inequality, by the limited availability of infrastructure and services, and by government activity” (Grant 2004: 51). Devas (2004: 35) adds to the conversation in saying [that] “Social exclusion, the vulnerability of the poor and their lack of voice remain and in some cases have become more severe”. The findings substantiate and support those of Devas, as pointed out by Mr Matjeke (11 January 2014): “these poor don’t have a voice; the only way they can revolt is to stone the councillor’s house and burn the tarred road” (section 6.2.2). The question to consider is what the implications for the livelihoods of the urban poor in these circumstances are.

Any attempt to address the situation of poor urban communities [has to] “learn how to broaden understanding of urban governance which will enable us to begin to trace the roles of the private sector, civil society and the various institutions of government at city level – and of the interactions between these actors – in determining what happens at city level” (Devas 2004: 35).

Therefore, as argued in Chapter 2 (see sections 2.1.1.2 & 2.1.5.3), LED initiatives to address the current massive unemployment situation and the resultant desperation as well as generation of resources to meet basic human needs sustainably in Tshwane (S & H) are

\textsuperscript{173} SACN (South African Cities Network). This study was based on the cities of Tshwane, Johannesburg, eThekweni, Cape Town, Buffalo City, Ekurhuleni, Mangaung, Nelson Mandela and Msunduzi.
urgently needed. Furthermore, these initiatives have to support those who are sick, weak and injured because of the inherent injustice of the current economic system. As for an appropriate approach, I concur with Nel’s view …

An integrated SL\textsuperscript{174}/ABCD\textsuperscript{175} approach and practice model provides a framework for the analysis of a community from which strategies and outcomes can be deducted for the development of the community. The integrated SL/ABCD practice model further emphasises that people, especially deprived members of the community, are central to the process and have to be involved from the beginning of the process. It is also apparent that the main focus should be on the assets and strengths of people rather than their problems and deficiencies (Nel 2015: 524, see also section 2.1.2.3 of this thesis).

Currently, the roles of the church and its ministries in Tshwane should be an embodiment of the notion of “solidarity with the poor” in concrete ways as stated in Chapter 3 (sections 3.2.3 to 3.2.8). In terms of praxis, it will be required of the church to work for social justice and government transparency as well as sustainable economics, which will make social justice more viable. The social justice agenda of the church has to be consistent in ensuring that suitable facets of development and poverty eradication approaches (cf. 2.2.1) are being carried out in the townships of S & H in relation to people-centred human development. This agenda should stand and speak against the intransigency of government which limits people-centred development, LED and sustainability in Tshwane (S & H).

9.2.1.2. Understanding of LED and whether or not the government and private sector in Tshwane favours LED

Narrative accounts at the insertion phase of mini-consultation One in Chapter 6 (i.e. section 6.2.1) reveal that participants understand LED to be about growth; wealth; employment for all; education for all; infrastructure development; good management of resources; sharing ideas to develop decent lives; the working class reaping the fruits of their labour; all sectors being actively involved in the economy; having good health facilities; the holistic improvement of life, peace and security for all as well as adequate service delivery.

The interview findings in sections 8.2.2.1 and 8.2.2.2 of Chapter 8 reveal that: 60% of leaders interviewed understand LED as a mechanism and a way of working, geared to creating a viable

\textsuperscript{174} SL stands for Sustainable Livelihoods
\textsuperscript{175} ABCD stands for Asset Based Community Development Approach
lower level of economic structures that could contribute towards the broader economy; 60% of leaders think that the government and the private sector favour LED and 40% consider that the government and the private sector do not favour LED.

These interview findings (i.e. 8.2.2.1 & 8.2.2.2) in particular confirm that LED, as discussed in Chapter One (see 1.7.4) is a process involving the formation of new institutions, the development of alternative industries, the improvement of the capacity of existing employers to produce better products, the identification of new markets, the transfer of knowledge and the nurturing of new firms and enterprises. The findings also indicate that lobbying and advocacy still need to be done to persuade the government and private sector to increase their support towards LED (see 8.2.2.1).

According to the narratives as reported in section 6.2.1 of Chapter 6, it is apparent that communities expect a great deal from LED but their expectations are yet to be realised even for those who are living in the country’s economic growth centre, such as the City of Tshwane.

“Some people are working….and unfortunately we also have those who are sitting at home doing nothing’ affirms Ms Makena (11 January 2014, see section 6.2.1). Parnell explains this situation:

Paradoxically, South Africa’s cities are the centre of the nation’s wealth but also of its most abject poverty. Without access to land or shelter, work or education the urban underclass must find resources to pay for basic services and costly rentals while they fight to survive in hostile social and environmental conditions (Parnell 2005: 21).

The city’s socioeconomic, administrative and political structures fall short in supporting and building LED as research elsewhere has shown:

All too often, the role of city government has been destructive towards the income opportunities of the poor. Demolitions, re-settlement in remote locations, repressive regulation of informal sector trading, and poor quality of services all increase the vulnerability of the poor and undermine their capacity to take hold of local livelihood opportunities (Grant 2004: 51)

Grant’s research findings resonate with some narrative accounts in this research: “…some (unemployed people) do sell on the streets. But the problem is, like in town we had street vendors in Van der Walt Street, they are no longer there – they were chased away by the Metro Police…” (Mr Ndlovu, 11 January 2014. See also 6.2.2).
The fact is that the focus of the economic growth models of the city is placed on some economic sectors as key sectors (such as infrastructure development and manufacturing), but the city downgrades the processes of other activities (such as social justice and concern for social issues). As a result, it is still failing to realise the ‘acclaimed trickle-down’ effects of the economy. Worse, income opportunities for the marginalised and poor in Tshwane (S & H) such as the street vendors, which should be supported, are obstructed. Through this income opportunity, these unemployed people (would) regain capacity to take hold of livelihood opportunities as Grant states above. However, the findings of this research established that, in the words of McKibben (2007: 14), “growth simply isn't enriching most of us” (McKibben 2007: 14). As the findings of this research reveal, in Tshwane (S & H) this may be the case because the government and the private sector have not sufficiently demonstrated a concern for social justice and the economic empowerment of poor people. It currently appears as if the government and the city actively opposed sustainable development which “advocates for increased human interactions in the areas of production, trade and commerce, and socio-cultural adaptations” (Kwasi et al. 2005: 466). For example, with reference to infrastructural development and housing programmes, the city relies solely on modern technology, which does not depend on large amounts of human labour capital; as a result, local labour input is marginalised.

In this regard, the church has to develop concrete models of LED in Tshwane (S & H). These would simultaneously facilitate and advocate for economic empowerment for the poor and form communities of resistance against the prevailing economic injustice in the city. Advocacy and engagement with the authorities should also address issues related to local government oppression of the poor through suppressing their (the latter’s) economic opportunities. Through this engagement, it is also required of the church to facilitate genuine dialogue between the authorities and the poor so that asset-based and people-centred human development strategies geared towards inclusive and sustainable economics can be put in place.

**9.2.1.3. Economic policies that have impacted and are impacting Tshwane’s economy**

On the one hand, the above findings of the research demonstrate that the City of Tshwane does often not act in the interest of sustainable development. On the other hand, in the context of the many changes that have taken place since South Africa became a democracy in 1994, narrative accounts at the description phase in mini-consultation One as reported in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.2) highlight certain policies and legislative frameworks as positive drivers of the economy. These accounts emphasised: tenders given to non-white communities (in the process of
privatisation of the economy; abolition of apartheid and installation of a constitutional democracy; the emergence of a black middle class and concurrent increased earnings; job creation and falling away of job restriction law; RDP programme, change-oriented government policies (mainly Affirmative Action); resources made available to some youth (to support young entrepreneurs); powerful role players emerging from different sectors; political and administrative structure focus on spatial development of resource-less neighbourhoods of the city (infrastructural development); money influence on plans and processes in terms of the city’s priorities.

The interview findings as reported in sections 8.2.3.1 and 8.2.3.2 of Chapter 8 disclosed the following: 20% of leaders interviewed named national policies on poverty alleviation, supporting cooperatives and supporting small businesses as having had and still having a positive impact; 20% of leaders named the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) and infrastructural development as policies which impacted Tshwane’s economy positively; 20% of leaders spoke of international trade policies, including free market and liberalisation, as policies which have reshaped the local economy—better as well as for worse. Concerning the government adopting policies related to free market and liberalisation, Rev Ngamlana (20 October 2015) explained, “the government has allowed import of things from other countries. Where are the proudly made in South Africa products in the market? We fail to help the local people to produce the goods. This is what has killed the industrial area in Dimbaza in the Eastern Cape and many others such as Babelegi in Hammanskraal (see 8.2.3.1), while 20% of leaders also highlighted that some municipal regulations regarding small businesses impose a burden on people.

These interview findings (i.e. 8.2.3.1 & 8.2.3.2) confirm that policies have had initial positive impacts on Tshwane’s economy (S & H) but they have not created, as stated in Chapter One (1.7.5), a ‘trickle-up’ effect, the spread of well-being from the bottom of the traditional economic pyramid to the upper layers of society, in the sense that these layers are the public and the shared dimension of a society’s economy (Woods 1992:4, see also 1.7.5). Bond (2014: 13) points to “neoliberal economic constraints on liberation” and argues

Democratic South Africa’s inheritance included an economy that proved not only difficult to manage, but also to understand, particularly in relation to financial turbulence and global integration; yet post-apartheid policy-makers drew all the wrong lessons from ‘international experience’ and hence prepared to amplify rather than correct apartheid capitalism’s main economic distortions.
This situation constitutes a major barrier for sustainable development; it results, as in the case of other BRICS countries, in “low incomes, impoverishment and social conflicts” (Phat 2012: 923).

It is essential therefore for the church praxis to opt for a LED path which promotes and advocates people-centred development by highlighting the government’s failure with regard to the development of policies and activities based on the capacities, skills and assets of the poor and their neighbourhoods, within the limits of the earth which is the household or oikos of the whole creation. It should claim that the wellbeing of the entire community – humans and nonhumans – has to be the ultimate goal of LED which will guarantee shared prosperity and long life for all the inhabitants of the community. The church will have to emphasise and teach that the wellbeing of people and the responsible care of / usage of nature and natural resources contributes to a long term sustainable economy where more independent LED can be based on natural resources such as soil and water that people have available or may gather. Thus, the church should also convey to the inhabitants of the community (humans and non-humans) the principle of coexisting in harmony where different freedoms (see section 2.1.5.4) are realised. In the current milieu, where people are dissatisfied about government’s suppression of LED opportunities, communities of S & H should be organised to claim their freedoms in relation to economic access, free trade and legitimate income generating activities in Tshwane (S & H). The church should therefore advocate that the government provides support and spaces where the poor could trade and earn an income without harassment and intimidation from the city’s law enforcement officers.

**9.2.1.4. Successes, failures, benefits, and disadvantages of these policies**

In preparation for his 2016 Budget Speech, Minister Gordhan (Minister of Finance) sought inputs from community members concerning the government performance on addressing South Africans’ basic needs. These members responded by saying that the government does well in the areas of tax administration and paying social grants. Tax administration ensures that government receives revenue needed for social security, infrastructure development programmes and others. Parnell’s research found the same in 2005.

Despite well-documented concerns about problematic implementation, it would be churlish to ignore the massive national and provincial government investment in housing and other urban infrastructure, or to ignore the positive impact of the deracialisation of the health, education and grant systems on the lives of the urban poor (Parnell 2005: 22).
Narrative accounts at the description phase of mini-consultation One as reported in Chapter 6 (i.e. 6.2.2) concur with Parnell and Gordhan and regard the following as successes and benefits: improved physical infrastructure in townships, improved social welfare services and investment, while some members of the youth received assistance from the Youth Fund. Additionally, tenders given to non-white communities improved earning power of black middle class and led to (some) job creation. “…these tenders are providing temporary employment that is helping local economy even small businesses…” [Accounted by the narratives of mini-consultation Two] (Mr Matjeke, 14 February 2014, cf. Rev Mokone, 14 February 2014, see also 7.1.2).

However, in their responses, community members pointed out to Minister Gordhan that the government has to stop corruption and wasteful management of country’s resources. Narrative accounts at the description phase of mini-consultation One as reported in Chapter 6 (i.e. 6.2.2) also concur with the broader community voices responding to Minister Gordhan and highlight the following as failures and disadvantages of current policies: poor communities made weaker by corruption; dependence on outside investors and the lack of a voice to speak out against injustice; the inability to exert control over the activities of powerful multi-national corporations and over-reliance on money for self-help initiatives. These failures and disadvantages support Bond’s (2014: 43) findings and the reasons behind them. He ties these failures to “social contracts” made by the elite which have caused “damage to the interests of poor and working class people (…) while neoliberal strategies were cemented around them”. As a result, there is “endemic economic suffering, the threat of job losses due to globalisation, the housing and land hunger, the ongoing deprivation associated with life in townships and rural areas (…)” (Bond 2014: 66).

The interview findings, as reported in sections 8.2.3.1 and 8.2.3.2, revealed that: 80% of leaders highlighted successes of different policies which govern or are associated with the local economy; 40% of leaders spoke about policies having gaps, being outdated and manipulated by the powerful while communities are not in a position to understand them; 40% of the leaders said these policies failed to create decent and permanent jobs; 40% of leaders attested that some people, who are creative and entrepreneurial, were able to start businesses and received
funding from the government while 60% of leaders also highlighted a number of disadvantages pertaining to certain policies.

These interview findings (i.e. from sections 8.2.3.1 & 8.2.3.2) agree with some of the content of the narrative findings presented in Chapter 6 (i.e. 6.2.2) especially concerning the successes, benefits, failures and disadvantages of certain policies as related to LED. Participants of mini-consultation One moreover highlighted that not all socioeconomic policies have benefited the marginalised communities. Mr Chimuti (12 January 2014) explains: “the lucky ones survive through their employment with the government or private companies although not everyone gets a good salary. Otherwise we are just struggling to survive. The elderly get by with their grants” (see 6.2.2).

Adding to my argument in Chapter 2 (section 2.1.6) and in Chapter 3 (section 3.2.6), it is therefore imperative that there is critical engagement with policy makers for the purpose of, on the one hand, enhancing an understanding of the issues embedded in these policies and, on the other, clarifying options and choices that will lead to a development in Tshwane (S&H) which is geared towards liberation and transformation.

In this endeavour the church in its praxis should advocate for the promotion of policies which work to the advantage and benefit of the poor and the weak – as long as they promote liberation and self-reliance – as well as advocating the abolition or total reformation of policies which are failing to benefit the masses of poor and destitute in Tshwane (S & H). With particular reference to the role of the church in South Africa towards furthering justice and reconciliation, Bowers du Toit and Nkomo (2014: 8) expand: “the charity and ‘ad hoc’ approaches employed by congregations in addressing poverty within South Africa, whilst well-meaning, do not acknowledge the structural nature of the system of poverty and inequality engendered by apartheid”. Changes and reformation of policies are urgently needed.

**9.2.1.5. Changes necessary in terms of these policies and their implementation to benefit LED**

Narrative accounts at the conclusion of the analysis phase in the second mini-consultation, as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.1.2) for example, suggest: integration of all sectors and of all economic role players as a future trend for LED in the City of Tshwane and maximisation of the gains of freedom towards helping people to lead self-reliant lives. This simply implies that LED,
as a result of the adequate input by all concerned role-players and as a joint venture, must materialise, and thereby meet, the expectations that narrative accounts highlighted at the insertion phase. These, assert participants, are “that we should grow …growth in terms of wealth, employment and education” (Ms Makena, 11 January 2014. See also 6.2.1). It is about “education for children and for everyone …because most of us are not educated” (Mr Dlamini, 11 January 2014. See also 6.2.1). Most importantly, it is about “sharing wealth and economy as means for further social development” adds Mr Ndlovu (11 January 2014. See also 6.2.1).

Interview findings as reported in sections 8.2.5.1 and 8.2.5.2 revealed: 20% of leaders interviewed responded that no changes are needed in the current policies whereas 80% interviewed suggested many changes to policies related to the improvement of the socioeconomic life of citizens of Tshwane (S & H). Leaders made the following suggestions: 1) to fast track policy development and implementation; 2) the private sector needs to share expertise by giving inputs; 3) policies have to be contextualised and 4) empowerment of indigents should go hand-in-hand with the social grants so that policies will not make people dependent upon the government. Instead, policies and practices should: assist indigent people to become self-reliant; multiply the capacity and means of local entrepreneurs to expand business; develop others and employ local labour; let people be innovative in their own context, not copying or importing policies from other countries nor ignoring the local voices and aspirations in the process – and involve the largest NGO on the ground, which is the church.

These interview findings (i.e. 8.2.5.1 & 8.2.5.2) indicate that current policies on socioeconomic development need fine-tuning or changes to suit the local contexts to address poverty, unemployment and inequality where they are supposed to be implemented. The call for changing policies confirmed, as stated in Chapter One (see 1.2.3), that there was deviation from these policies (such as the Reconstruction and Development Programme, Affirmative Action and so on) which were devised and set in motion in 1994 to ensure that priority was given to redressing the grossly unequal economic order inherited as part of the apartheid legacy. Unfortunately, as pointed out The Oikos Journey (2006: 17), these policies have given way to the world imperative for a market economy and have failed to address pressing local issues still prevalent in the South African economy. Based on the premises, writes Terreblanche (2002: 426 – 438), 1) South Africa has a high economic growth potential; 2) integration into a benign global economy will enhance economic growth; 3) a high economic growth rate will unlock the
labour-absorptive capacity of the economy; 4) the benefits of a high economic growth rate will “trickle down” to the poor and 5) the restructuring of the economy should be entrusted to market-led economic growth. However, the government played into the hands of global neo-liberal / neo-colonial economics and fiscal forces and, as a result, failed to pursue its radical socioeconomic agenda for a post-apartheid South Africa to the detriment of LED. This means, in the words of Bowers du Toit & Nkomo (2014: 2), “Socio-economic transformation has not taken place on a broad scale and this is no more evident than when one looks at unemployment statistics in South Africa. These statistics show that inequality is a result of the policies of apartheid”.

On these factors I base my argument that Tshwane (S & H) LED has to be “glocal”, by embracing and participating in broad-based and collective actions geared towards the realisation of the vision for healthy communities where services, infrastructures, institutions, leadership, vision, policies, organisations, communities, assets, agency and sustainable livelihoods are present in a practical way (Chapter 2, section 2.1.1.3, see also Porter 2000: 15-34) which benefits localities.

As hinted at earlier on in section 2.2.1.3, LED in Tshwane will become “glocal” by being at the same time part of the world community, which Deane-Drummond (2008: 19 - 20) refers to as “globality”, so that “there is a sense in which different countries and groups intersect with each other” (p19). Further, she adds: “globality allows for differences across cultural, social and political boundaries to be expressed and aired in a way that recognises human distinctiveness” (p20). Hence LED in Tshwane (S & H) should exhibit this globality inclination but not at the expense of the local economy. In its pursuit to improve its engagement in the global market scene, Tshwane therefore has an un-compromisable and unalienable responsibility to: 1) help the local people to produce the goods needed locally; 2) support local economic hubs such as Babelegi, GaRankuwa and Dimbaza to continue their economic activities geared towards meeting real needs of localities because by doing so they empower the local people and local economy and 3) facilitate the competitiveness of local communities through means such as policies and actions which are more beneficial to the local Tshwane population without allowing neoliberal world trends and government policies to “put a lid on” them or deplete the possibilities for LED. Currently, as noted, the government, the city and their policies are failing to sufficiently protect LED from the forces of global neoliberal economic systems.
One of the ways to improvement, as articulated by Breitenbach, is for policy makers and government:

To encourage entrepreneurs, the informal sector and small business, through offering, for example, low interest finance to empower community organisations and providing skills training. …the generation of new business activities in the local economy (...) remains the most important objective for any municipality. It could also be noted that no observable impact has been seen in the area of new business generation within CTMM [i.e. City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality] (Breitenbach.2006: 8).

In their praxes, the churches involved in this study (S & H) have to come into a place where they become knowledgeable about policy development and framework processes on one hand and on the other, become involved as the voice for alternative vision geared to fostering collective prosperity and multi-dimensional justice in these townships. Furthermore, these churches have to function in such a manner that the poor themselves become the agents and engine of transformation and liberation. Thus, “the role of the church; the relevance of the church in the community has to be seen in concrete ways” (Mrs Phiri, 14 February 2014. See section 7.1.1).

Research has shown that “success in addressing these deficits also depends on how urban poor groups are organized and whether they have representative organizations and federations to press for change and to work with local governments in ensuring universal provision” (Satterthwaite 2014: 54) of basic needs.

9.2.1.6 Changes which have occurred in the economy in the past fifteen years and the most important events and the influences behind them

Narrative accounts at the analysis phase of the second mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.1) highlight the following as positive changes: 1) some local business people are thriving in the new South Africa; 2) migration of businesses to S & H has boosted the local economy; 3) there has been infrastructural development, tenders and creation of temporary employment as well as 4) private investments (in shopping malls). For Moeti (14 February 2014), these positive changes are results of “the struggles which people were going through…to get freedom and democracy…[which] have contributed in shaping up the political and economic structure of the country” (section 7.1.1). Conversely, Ms Shibambo (14 February 2014) sadly highlighted [that] “the people who survive these days are those who belong to the ruling party” (section 7.1.1).
And as regards negative changes: 1) the collapse of industrial hubs of former homeland areas (of Babelegi and Ga Rankuwa) resulting in mass unemployment and leading to paralysis of LED in the surrounding areas and liquidation of local companies; 2) failure of the unification process of administrative structures and systems towards making the “new South Africa” in consolidating the development agenda of areas which used to be part of so-called homeland areas that were politically discarded after the regime change (e.g. Hammanskraal); 3) the persistent discriminatory pattern of distribution of wealth embedded in the prevailing neoliberal economic system which persists in marginalising the poor and the weak (sections 2.2.1.1.5 & 4.4.1.6); 4) communities on the margins struggle to access meaningful economic opportunities; 5) lack of a concrete plan to rebuild the collapsed industrial hubs; 6) failure of government to foster ethical value-based practice and behaviour in public office. In terms of basic historical events, the following were named: 1) closing down of factories post 1994 and 2) privatisation and tenders to previously disadvantaged business people in relation to Affirmative Action policies. Just a few historically disadvantaged people have benefitted, with most poor people remaining dependent on grants. With regard to this negative development of socioeconomic policies, Mr Moeti (14 February 2014) commented, “the biggest problem which ... exists and has existed before (in the previous dispensation) is the [unequal] distribution of country’s wealth to the citizens” (see 7.1.1). In other words, Mr Moeti is implying that the inequality of the previous dispensation continues to this day. As a result, the majority are still experiencing persistent poverty coupled with unemployment and economic marginalisation 22 years after the installation of a democratic South African government.

Using mechanisms such as globalisation, market economy, liberalisation and beliefs in the relentless drive for economic growth in the hands of multinational corporations, the neoliberal economic system, which subscribes to and is driven by profit, creates an artificial want in people to buy more and more (i.e. consumerism) and knows no borders in its economic activities (and can disinvest at any given time from one area to the next, with no consideration of the working class). As a result, it leaves the poor and marginalised more vulnerable as the system perpetuates inequalities and social stratification in a class-stratified society where the poor become poorer and the rich richer (cf. Kaglita 2013b: 10). With particular reference to Tshwane for example, global economic players such as auto manufacturers Nissan and BMW in Rosslyn can sell their goods anywhere in the world to maximise their profits yet demonstrate very little consideration towards the poor and their needs on their doorsteps in GaRankuwa. According to Terreblanche (2002: xv, 426 – 438) the unequal power structures, segregation and racial discrimination accompanied by human rights violations, which were the norm in the South African society during apartheid, have remained defining characteristics of the post-apartheid period. Despite our transition to an inclusive democracy, old forms of inequality have been perpetuated and some entrenched more deeply than ever before.
As reported in Chapter 8 (sections 8.2.3, 8.2.4 & 8.2.5) 80% of the leaders interviewed associated the changes which occurred in the economy with dynamics of global neoliberal political economy; with the key reason being a lack of protection for the local economy; 60% of leaders alluded to the destabilisation of the local economy which aggravated the disempowerment of local communities; 60% of leaders considered new laws, such as national policies on poverty alleviation supporting cooperatives and small business in South Africa, as having positively impacted the economy in terms of sustaining the livelihoods of certain households that have so far benefited from these policies; 60% of leaders highlighted a number of issues (i.e. greed and corruption of BEE and AA beneficiaries, political elites' mismanagement of public resources, unequal distribution of the country's wealth to citizens, demagogical election promises which have bred a spirit of entitlement and lack of a sound development work ethic) as related to negative changes while 40% of the leaders interviewed acknowledged the positive changes that have occurred in the economy in the past fifteen years, such as infrastructure development and social security.

These interview findings (sections 8.2.3, 8.2.4 & 8.2.5) concur with the conclusions (i.e. the country realised steady but unbalanced growth which has resulted in massive unemployment, especially in peripheral townships such as H and S) regarding the negative impact of growth-focused policies on the local economy presented in Chapter 2 (section 2.1.2.1.1.5). They also reinforce some of the narrative findings in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.2) pertaining to positive changes have been influenced by policies such as infrastructural development and social security.

Going forward, it is important that a bottom-up approach, a glocal development process, be imagined (cf. Chapter 2, section 2.1.52) for S & H and Tshwane as a whole. On the one hand this should be informed about the global development agenda and on the other it must promote endogenous and asset-based local development to maximise the benefits to local people – with emphasis on developing pro-poor LED interventions and balanced economic growth within the socioeconomic and administrative system. Grassroots communities of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal should be made aware that:

Continuing poverty and inequality are, rather, the product of the overall economic growth path, which has continued to be capital- and skill-intensive. Continued adherence to the growth path of the apartheid period inevitably results in continuing poverty in a context of massive unemployment, especially among the less skilled. The global context encourages inegalitarian
patterns of economic growth, but public policies also play an important part in the South African case (Seekings. 2007: 17-18)

In its praxis, the church has to model LED which empowers local economic actors to guide and implement the goals of LED in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. This implies facilitating education and the acquisition of resources, including natural resources and their usage, for instance.

9.2.2. Socioeconomic and political structures which have led to this situation

9.2.2.1. Most important causes of the way the broader and the local economy functions today

Narrative accounts at the conclusion of the analysis phase in the second mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.2) revealed that according to the interviewees’ perceptions, the basic causes are: 1) some people value money more than people; 2) distorted (corrupt) socioeconomic and political relationships and 3) privatisation.

The interview findings as reported in Chapter 8 (section 8.2.3) indicated: 60% of leaders interviewed considered that the reasons for the way the economy is today could be linked to issues of governance and leadership; 40% of leaders spoke of structural, systemic and ideological issues as important causes for the current economic situation whereas 20% of leaders spoke of lack of entrepreneurial and economic thinking on the part of township communities and dependency as important causes of the current economic situation.

These interview findings (i.e. 8.2.3) concur with the narrative findings presented in Chapter 6 (section 6.3.2) with reference to governance and leadership as well as structural, systemic and ideological issues as being leading causes for the current economic situation in Tshwane (S & H). Governance and leadership are important to the development of sustainable urban settlements as argued by Abrahams:

In order to achieve the goal of developing sustainable settlements, local authorities need to have a comprehensive understanding of the different social and economic dynamics operating within their area, to address developmental backlogs and to plan for future socio-economic requirements. It is for this reason that integrated development planning, of which local economic development is a key component, has become a distinct approach to try and achieve sustainable development within localities in South Africa (Abrahams 2003: 185, see also Rogerson 2011).
The City of Tshwane uses Integrated Development Planning as stated in Chapter 4 (section 4.5) to ensure, according to Amtaika (2013: 47), the “dispensing of social justice equitably through the provision of basic services” but narrative accounts in Chapter 6 reveal that the CoT has a long way to go in order to realise equitable social and economic justice; as a result there have been a number of community protests as stated in Chapter 4 (section 4.2.2). In the future, the stimulation and implementation of LED have to bring about support to those who are sick, weak and injured because of the inherent injustice of the current economic system which is focussed merely on economic growth. Thus, the implementation of LED should work to prevent the “unnatural” death of many poor and marginalised people whose lives are cut short by the system (cf. Chapter 3, section 3.4.)

The narrative accounts as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.2) agree also with Terreblanche (2002: 437) that privatisation, which is one of the instruments of the neo-liberal and global market agenda, has influenced the restructuring of our local economy but has not resolved “the ‘deep-seated structural crisis’ and the unequal distribution of economic powers, but augments them instead” (cf. Bond 2014: 66).

In its praxis, the church in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal has to embark on an ongoing socioeconomic analysis while using the pointers given in The Oikos Journey (2006), deriving clues from what The Oikos Journey team has done. This has to become one of the priorities in its missional praxis. With particular reference to the City of Tshwane, Mashau explains,

> A missional church seeks to encourage all members of the church (evangelists, educators, counsellors, environmentalists, business people, and advocates for social transformation in urban spaces, amongst others) to serve in all forms of mission engagement where God has called and placed them in this life (Mashau 2014: 4).

The church has therefore to empower itself to be in a position to carry out social analysis needed for action.

**9.2.2.2 The influence of money and capital in our situation in Tshwane (S & H)**

Narrative accounts at the conclusion of the analysis phase in the second mini-consultation, as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.2), highlighted the respondents’ view that money is the factor people value most in Tshwane (S & H). Other things of value such as Batho pele ethos (meaning people first), education and work are undervalued, even though their importance is acknowledged.
Concerning the influence of money and capital in our situation in Tshwane (S & H) the interview findings as reported in Chapter 8 (section 8.2.7) highlighted that: 100% of leaders interviewed acknowledged that money and capital have a positive influence in our situation in Tshwane in different ways, specifically as capital or income to facilitate economic development of some individuals (cf. Rev Mamatsinya 6 October 2015) and as a means to infrastructure development. However, 40% of leaders pointed out that money also has a negative influence (e.g. the ANC makes sure that it channels money to ANC members and excludes the rest of the population) in our situation in Tshwane as highlighted by two of the leaders (cf. Rev Mogwera, 7 October 2015 & Prof Buffel, 17 November 2015) while 40% of leaders declared that economically and politically powerful people are benefiting greatly.

These interview findings (section 8.2.7) chime with the narrative findings in Chapter 6 (see 6.2.2) especially on the influence of money in our situation in Tshwane (S & H) as a means to effect infrastructure development and economic empowerment of some individuals. Put bluntly, “You need money for everything. We can’t survive without money” contends Ms Makena (11 January 2014, see also 6.2.1) referring to (S & H) in Tshwane. However, it should be pointed out that money and capital must work towards LED in terms of enabling individuals, especially the poor, to lead economically self-reliant lives. In this way, all communities in Tshwane will benefit and not only the rich and the powerful as is currently the case. Currently, “Politicians of the ANC….and those who are holding tenders, they are the one who are prospering” (Mr Matjeke, 11 January 2014, see 6.2.2) (cf. Chapter 3, section 3.3.3.1.5). “The assumption that for poor people only material things matter” (McKibben 2007: 218) must be addressed in ways which promote holistic wellbeing as we consider a sustainable future for LED in Tshwane and the rest of the oikos in Tshwane (S & H). Since economic growth and wealth (i.e. more money and capital) have not overcome poverty in Tshwane (S & H), I concur with McKibben (2007: 45) when he says that “we need (...) a new utilitarianism. When More and Better shared a branch, we could kill two birds with one stone”. Currently, we have more (i.e. growth) which doesn’t translate to “better” lives in Tshwane (S & H).

The church’s praxis in this regard has to work towards behavioural changes in the economic realm which should promote modest and better lives. Eldridge is right in articulating that:

Development and economic growth involve changes in behaviour. These changes include the adoption of new behaviours and the disappearance of traditional behaviours, as well as
modifications to behaviours that continue. These behavioural changes take place at various levels – among individuals, households, communities, and in organizations. They occur in the public, private and third sectors (Eldridge. 2013: 20).

The church in Tshwane (S & H) should model and become an embodiment of behaviour change geared towards a modest and sustainable lifestyle.

9.2.2.3. **People / structures that make the most important decisions in Tshwane (S & H)**

Narrative accounts at the conclusion of the analysis phase in the second mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.2); spoke of political and economic structures with the Mayor and the ANC being very influential. Mr Moeti (14 February 2014) encapsulates this when he said “*people who are perceived to have the power are the politicians*” (see 7.1.2). Ms Shibambo (14 February 2014) clarified this when she stated: “*most influence lays on the political parties especially the ruling one; let us say when you are not an ANC member you don’t have much power to convince people*” (see 7.1.2). At the description phase in the first mini-consultation in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.2), they point to powerful role players emerging from different sectors, political and administrative structures.

The interview findings as reported in Chapter 8 (section 8.2.8) revealed that: 80% of leaders interviewed said the government (different tiers of government) is, in most cases, the unilateral key decision maker because it fails to consistently consult with local communities to be make them part of the decision making processes as required by the Local Government: Municipal planning and performance management regulations177 (see clause 13) have been in effect since 2001 yet 20% of leaders said that given the fact that people did not have opportunities to go to school, they are dependent on some other people (self-appointed or elected) in communities, who in turn end up influencing community decisions.

The interview findings (section 8.2.8) support the narrative findings in Chapter 6 (see 6.3.1.) with reference to structures that drive LED in Tshwane. They point to the fact that mechanisms of participatory democracy such as community consultations are not adhered to. The government is seen as the only key decision maker, which amounts to an anti-people centred development ethos. Ms Masase (12 January 2014) points this out: “*everything is run by the municipality when you look at it; they don’t involve us as the community*” (see 6.2.1).

Therefore, LED in Tshwane will achieve more if it works at directly enhancing human abilities (by open communication between government and residents, fostering long and healthy lives, knowledge and decent standards of living) and creating conditions for human development (by fostering participation in political and community life, environmental sustainability, human security and rights and gender equality) (cf. Chapter 2, section 2.1.2.4). Moving in this direction will resonate with the expectations voiced in narratives by the Hammanskraal group, i.e. “the important value for the economy is basically about serving, serving communities for collective wellbeing. Thus, all sectors of the community can prosper together and to have peace” (Participants from Hammanskraal, 11 January 2014, see 6.2.2).

The fact that most important decisions are taken by the government for the people, as these findings reveal, implies that governance and leadership structures contribute to the deprivation that communities of S and H are currently experiencing through the government’s non-communication, which keeps people ignorant. Mr Golele (11 January 2014) points to this: “our municipality doesn’t supply us with information. Although we have community meetings, they cannot tell us about the money, somewhere they close for us not to have the full picture” (see 6.2.2).

These findings therefore confirm other researchers’ findings which state that:

Of the multiple deprivations that most of the urban poor face, many of these deprivations have little or no direct link to income levels, while many relate much more to political systems and bureaucratic structures that are unwilling or unable to act effectively to address these deprivations (Elliot 2006: 204).

Tacoli (2012: 1) contends that “urban poverty is (...) avoidable; it is largely the result of the lack of proactive approaches by policymakers towards urban growth which, in contrast, is almost inevitable”.

Further, these findings buttress with the findings of the Human Development Report\(^\text{178}\) 2013 (cf. 2.1.2.4) in that:

Poor people on the fringes of society struggle to voice their concerns, and governments do not always evaluate whether services intended to reach everyone actually do. Social policy has to

---

\(^{178}\) Launched on 24 May 1990 in London, the first Human Development Report opened with a simply stated premise: “People are the real wealth of a nation and human development is all about enlarging their choices.” Since then, Human Development Reports have inspired the world towards human progress through groundbreaking research, new perspectives, data analysis and innovative policies. See http://hdr.undp.org/en/25-years accessed 13 July 2016.
promote inclusion—ensuring non-discrimination and equal treatment is critical for political and social stability—and provide basic social services, which can underpin long-term economic growth by supporting the emergence of a healthy, educated labour force (UNDP 2013: 7).

In their praxis, the churches involved in this study have to advocate for social policies which promote inclusion, equity in the provision of basic services, empowerment (i.e. improvement of capabilities), transformation (i.e. eradication of socioeconomic inequalities) and liberation (i.e. releasing communities from current multi-faceted deprivation). For the realisation of these social policies Ms Makena (11 January 2014) contends: “the church plays a very important and fundamental role in the economy. The church teaches us to be kind to humanity. Once you are equipped with the knowledge of being human to people you won’t oppress people...you will remember the community ...” (see 6.2.1).

9.2.3. Most important relationships of influence and power that people have in Tshwane in relation to LED.

At the description phase in the first mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.2), narrative accounts highlight as positive: 1) the existence of interdependent relations between government, community, businesses and corporations for the purpose of advancing the economy. The government regulates the economic enterprise, while corporations and businesses produce and the community consumes. Rev Phiri (11 January 2014) said these role-players “need each other”. They are linked “like a chain which cannot be broken” (see 6.2.2). I add that this chain remains fragile and for its stability to benefit all, this depends on the motives which led to the participation of these role-players.

And as negative relations the facts that: 1) powerful role players maximise their opportunities to the detriment of the poor “by taking [most economic] advantage even if they offer communities new conveniences such as shopping malls, etc.” (Mr Madibane, 12 January 2014, see 6.2.2); 2) poor communities are taken advantage of by the wealthy and powerful individuals and structures, the poor are paid low wages and are unable to live comfortably while the wealthy and powerful thrive and live more comfortably. As a result, Rev Mokone (12 January 2014, see 6.2.2) points out: “These people get pay at the end of the month, and at the very same day they go to get loans from loan sharks? They must pay their debts to these shops with interest”.

At the analysis phase, in the second mini-consultation, as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.1), participants highlighted the most important relationships of influence and power that people
have in Tshwane (S & H) as being: 1) family; 2) having relatives in government and 3) political affiliation with the ruling party (as noted, the relationships emanating from this affiliation have been described as opportunistic and discriminatory against non-members). Although power lies with the masses as the electorate, it was noted that they possess little knowledge concerning how to exercise their rights. Matjeke (11 January 2014) highlights the dilemma faced by the masses: “We don’t know where to complain … We [peripheral] communities; you can voice your complaint alone… [we] are the weakest” (see 6.2.2). Further, Ms Masase (12 January 2014) said, “…we are to blame… by leaving the poor becoming poorest” (see 6.2.2). Regardless of the fact that, “there is on the web a facility where you can complain to the government or to the president. You go there and submit your complains but at the end of the day you don’t get any answer” (Mr Ndlovana, 12 January 2014, see 6.2.2). In short, to these participants the government is inaccessible and this stifles democratic processes at grassroots.

From this stems the suggestion from some participants: “maybe the church can help organise the community” (Rev Mokone, 12 January 2014, see 6.2.1 and 6.2.2) [to address] “ignorance which is playing a big part in our locations everywhere” (Mr Ndlovana, 12 January 2014, see 6.2.2). Unfortunately, it seems as if the church in these townships has, or presumably perceives itself to have, very little influence even on the lives of its members who are also politicians. In other words, the church is failing in facilitating solutions to community challenges and using its position of influence and power to acquire deep knowledge on issues affecting communities and to interrogate what is occurring.

Interview findings as reported in Chapter 8 (section 8.2.9) indicated that: 60% of leaders interviewed perceived people networks (i.e. family, elected or self-appointed community structures and personal political connectivity), in contrast to government networks, as the most important relationships of influence and power that people have 60% of leaders acknowledged stokvels, burial societies and other saving clubs as very important networks of relations; 20% of leaders saw the church as an important relationship of influence for people in townships although the latter do not necessarily listen to the church on matters affecting them because economically the church cannot assist them; finally, 20% of leaders stated that while officials and the wealthy people benefit in economic deals, the grassroots people do not.

These interview findings (i.e. 8.2.9) concur with the narrative findings in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.2) pertaining to relationships of influence and powers (such as family and political
connectivity) and traditional cultural resources (such as stokvels, burial societies, etc.) as related to LED. Ms Makena contends, “practices of mutual assistance through community burial societies, stokvels, saving clubs and the like” (Ms Makena, 14 February 2014, see 7.1.1) are traditional resources which should be retained. These traditional cultural resources are assets to be mobilised for LED going forward in Tshwane (S & H) (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.2.5). A sustainable asset based LED is the preferred option for ordinary citizens in Tshwane (S & H) in the future (cf. Chapter 2, section 2.1.2.3). The current government’s priorities appear to be less focused on mobilising these traditional resources (assets) for LED.

International research found that in urban areas the universal provision of most of the services related to basic needs depends

…on the quality and capacity of local governments and on the extent and quality of their relationships with those who lack these services (…). Success in addressing these deficits also depends on how urban poor groups are organized and whether they have representative organizations and federations to press for change and to work with local governments in ensuring universal provision (Satterthwaite 2014: 54).

In its praxis, the church in Tshwane (S & H) has to recognise and make use of mechanisms and governance of local government towards mobilising these cultural resources and assets within these townships for LED purposes. It has to ensure that urban poor groups are organised and work with existing pro-poor organisations in these contexts for social and economic justice.

9.2.4. Cultural resources of the people in terms of religion, culture and traditions and in terms of traditional knowledge and skills and values.

Narrative accounts at the analysis phase in the second mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.1) that emphasise cultural resources in terms of religion, culture and traditions include: 1) experiences of faith in God’s sovereignty, providence and salvation; 2) the Christian message; 3) close knitted-ness of African family structures; 4) Ubuntu as a cultural framework and the existence of good cultural practices, such as mutual assistance through burial societies, stokvels, community contribution to support a person in need and saving clubs. Cultural resources in terms of traditional knowledge and skills include: 1) agricultural skills; 2) initiation

---

179 According to the Beehive, a Durban based non-profit organisation funded by One Economy Corporation, stokvels or savings clubs have been around in South Africa and Africa for many years. They are a successful method for people to help motivate each other to save, and many are like social clubs where members also help each other in ways other than with money. Regular stokvel meetings have become a social highlight in many communities (see http://durban.thebeehive.org/content/39/1344 accessed 12 January 2015).
schools; 3) co-operative ownership and 4) sharing of resources and entrepreneurial skills of foreign citizens in townships as models. However, the close-knittedness of African communities is threatened by, amongst others 1) individualistic tendencies; 2) the perception that culture is backward; 3) lack of knowledge about cultural and traditional resources and 4) negative perceptions about the identity, socioeconomic and political history of black South Africans.

Interview findings as reported in Chapter 8 (section 8.2.10) reveal that: 80% of leaders interviewed deemed traditions – especially mutual sharing of resources, collective saving and interdependent family relations – as important for personal and collective economic survival whereas 20% of leaders highlighted that some traditions – such as collective ownership of assets and gender biases – could have a negative impact on the economic survival of families. Prof Buffel (17 November 2015) points this out: “sometimes [some] traditions are imprisoning us”(see 8.2.10).

These interview findings (i.e. 8.2.10) support the narrative findings in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.2). As pointed out above, the good traditions are social and spiritual assets useful for LED, which should be maintained and promoted as economic engines of cities. It must, however, be noted that,

Cities concentrate poverty but, for many, they are the best hope of escaping it. Unfortunately, there is a tendency to plan against, rather than for, low-income urban residents. This does not exclude them from income-generating activities but makes it difficult for them to secure decent living conditions (Tacoli 2012: 1)

The ingenuity of poor and low-income urban residents in particular to generate income for economic survival is an asset still untapped by many structures. With reference to research conducted in North West Province, Nel (2015: 521) confirms,

Stokvels and burial societies were some of the ways in which people supported each other financially and emotionally. Spirituality, which is part of social capital, was very prominent in the community – for example, members of households were active in prayer meetings and church choirs.
According to a study by Mosoetsa (2011 cited in Nel 2015: 521) “the perceived or real failure of the state to deliver services has led to civil society playing a major role in the lives of households in community based organisations, namely stokvels and burial societies”.

In this regard the church’s praxis should find ways of integrating these traditional cultural resources as building blocks for LED intervention in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. These resources will have to be further nurtured to harness their potential to become pathways out of poverty in these contexts.

9.2.5. Important desires / wishes that people have in Tshwane (S & H)

Narrative accounts at the analysis phase in the second mini-consultation, as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.1), reveal that the following aspects are what the residents of S & H value most in life, as well as their reasons: 1) Money (it gives one power to realise dreams and meet needs. Hence people are obsessed with the pursuit of money; even some church sectors are guilty of this obsession); 2) Education and knowledge (viewed as a key for everything including acquiring wealth, money and status); 3) Freedom (of movement, of choice, of beliefs and of work); 4) Prosperity (viewed as being more than money. Ms Makena (14 February 2014) elaborates “prosperity comes by contributing positively to other people’s lives. It is not necessarily about amassing assets for oneself. Rather, it is achieved when one invests in the lives of others” (see 7.1.2); 5) Life (we value all these other things to improve life itself); 6) Relationships (which sustain life) and 7) Land (the basis for self and community development). However, there are acceptable and accepted ways, based on value based ethical standards, to bring about what residents of these townships value most. For example: to have money, you must work for it – not by resorting to illegitimate means. Collective prosperity is achieved by contributing positively in other people’s lives. If one values knowledge s/he must become educated. With regard to relationships, simplicity and interests in others should be maintained. Freedom does not amount to abuse or to embracing an unethical lifestyle. Rather, it is accompanied by accountability and does not infringe on the freedom of others. A summary of the analysis phase of the narrative accounts draws attention to the perception that people value money more than [other] people.

Interview findings as reported in Chapter 8 (section 8.2.11) disclose that: 80% of leaders interviewed stated that people want their basic needs to be met; 60% pointed out that people want to contribute meaningfully to the economy in general and to LED in particular while 40% of leaders highlighted that there are people who want to acquire things without effort.
These interview findings (i.e. 8.2.11) reinforce with the narrative findings in sections 6.2.1 and 6.2.2 of Chapter 6 (i.e. in that the economy has to lead as regards, or results in, growth; wealth; employment for all; education for all; infrastructure development; good management of resources; sharing ideas to develop decent lives; the working class reaping the fruit of their labour; all sectors actively involved in the economy; good health facilities; holistic improvement of life; peace; security for all and adequate service delivery) as they refer to people’s expectations about the economy in relation to basic human needs and as they refer to participation in LED.

Following on from the above, the researcher explored a practical sustainable livelihoods / local economy approach / programme as perhaps the best way to create LED in an oikos and alternative-to-capitalism economy. Going forward in Tshwane (S & H), LED will do better to work towards meeting basic human needs in the continuum of socioeconomic development in as far as this is carried out in harmony with the ecosystem. In an environment where drought and water shortages are regular occurrences, LED should assist households with the means to “harvest’ rain water and teach domestic ways of recycling of water for example. It should also facilitate access to soil and land to be used for local farming by setting up community gardening schemes – for instance each ward should have a designated piece of land for their vegetable gardens. LED could also involve people of S & H who live near Dinokeng, the Tswaing meteor crater and the like in ecological tourism which holds good prospects for self-employment.

There is also the issue of the dirty electricity – generated at the cost of the environment – that Tshwane depends upon and which is not equitably distribute to all in far-out areas; this should be addressed through LED by enabling communities to switch to eco-friendly homes and sustainable sources of energy such as solar and biogas\(^\text{180}\). Issues pertaining to pollution of the environment by industries in Rosslyn, Babelegi and GaRankuwa and by individuals and households (for example air pollution resulting from the usage of coal for cooking and pollution of the environment by non-biodegradable materials such as plastic, bones, metals, and the like) must be addressed in the pursuit of building sustainable economics and sustainable communities. These negative ecological realities must be attended to so that the potential for sustainable usage of ecological resources by the people of S & H is realised. In short, this entails that growth should be pursued within limits to environmental resources to prevent

“human aggression toward creation which stems from a false understanding of creation and the human role in it” (The Oxford Declaration on Christian Faith and Economics 1990: clause 4) and to install an economy “which provides us with a reasonably comfortable life style while operating in harmony with the natural world” (see 1.7.5 and Wood 1992: 1) (cf. sections 2.1.2.1.2., 2.1.5.4, see also Chapter 1, section 1.7.5 and Wood 1992: 1).

Bearing in mind, as the UNDP (2013: 2) contends, [that]

An essential part of human development is equity. Every person has the right to live a fulfilling life according to his or her own values and aspirations. No one should be doomed to a short life or a miserable one because he or she happens to be from the “wrong” class or country, the “wrong” ethnic group or race or the “wrong” sex. Inequality reduces the pace of human development and in some cases may even prevent it entirely.

The church’s praxis has to work intentionally towards the realisation of community’s aspirations and desires while being guided by ethics (i.e. the right thing to do) and values (i.e. guiding principles and beliefs). This means that the church’s praxis should be an ethical value-based economic response to the current impasse in terms of government-initiated LED and the creation of greater economic and social stability in South Africa amidst the ecological crisis.

**9.2.6. Sources of creativity and hope for the future in the present situation**

**9.2.6.1 What will things be like in ten years if the economy keeps going in the same way?**

Narrative accounts at insertion in the first mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.1) highlight the current failures: 1) politicians benefit more than other communities; 2) everything is “broken”; 3) no sharing; 4) too much discrimination; 5) poor people are suffering in the hands of government; 6) favouritism; 7) people work without rest; 8) people work like slaves serving the material “god”; 9) a better life is only attained by a few; 10) the economic situation has failed; 11) corruption and bribery affect delivery of services; illegal businesses, presumably drugs, are thriving. At the description phase narrative accounts highlight the negative drivers of the current situation: 1) involvement of illegal and unregulated immigrants in the local economy, 2) poor communities made weaker by corruption, 3) dependence on outside investors, 4) lacking a voice to speak out against injustice, 5) inability to exert control over the activities of powerful multi-national corporations and 6) over-reliance on money for everything.

In terms of what matters will be like in ten years if the economy remains on the same path, the interview findings as reported in Chapter 8 (section 8.2.12) reveal that: 100% of leaders
interviewed spoke of socioeconomic catastrophe if the economy persists in the way it is currently going, while 60% of leaders stated some of the reasons for this situation are associated with the fact that policy makers and the government do not forecast future trends well.

These interview findings (i.e. 8.2.12) confirm the narrative findings presented in Chapter 6 (sections 6.2.1 & 6.2.2) which spoke about the failure of LED in the townships and the negative impacts of the economy on the people. Thus, in the future LED in Tshwane should work to avert or prevent the economy – and the ecological system as the final “resource base” for the economy – from catastrophe.

De Beer & Swart (2014: 4) contend:

(...) cities are suffering a ‘tragedy of the commons’ in extreme ways. This is evident from crises related to governance by a few at the expense of the masses, ever-deepening economic disparities and exclusions, challenges related to urban environmental and waste management, and the privatisation and militarisation of public spaces. Individualism and privatised interests are expressions of this tragedy at the expense of the common or public good.

Further, the UNDP (2013: 7) stresses that:

Poor people on the fringes of society struggle to voice their concerns, and governments do not always evaluate whether services intended to reach everyone actually do. Social policy has to promote inclusion—ensuring non-discrimination and equal treatment is critical for political and social stability—and provide basic social services, which can underpin long-term economic growth by supporting the emergence of a healthy, educated labour force.

In its praxis, the church has to work for the realisation of social and economic justice – including ecojustice or within the framework of long term sustainability – for the benefit of the poor and of nature / natural resources. In this way, the church’s praxis will ignite hope through its actions (Bookless 2007: 47; see Chapter 3 section 3.3.1).

9.2.6.2 Suggestions on how LED should be taken forward to benefit particularly the poor in Tshwane

Narrative accounts at the description phase in the first mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.2) highlight means, resources and assets for survival to be used as building blocks for LED. According to participants, these are what have happened to date: 1) formal employment; 2) starting small and informal businesses; 3) surviving by hoping that things will
1. pray and faith in God (as the source of hope that regardless of the current situation things will be fine); 2) the history of South Africa, especially the victory over apartheid\(^\text{181}\), gives communities hope for a better future; 3) the existence of strong institutions like schools affords the latter hope that in the future the situation will improve; 4) strong family structures with parents who encourage their children to make wise choices in life provide communities hope; 5) the existence of some good leaders in communities, who genuinely facilitate the development of people, offers hope to communities and 6) freedom and opportunities in the CoT impart hope to individuals by indirectly reinforcing the thought that “one’s place of birth and residence does not determine her /his future”.

At the conclusion of the analysis phase in the second mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.2) the narrative accounts identify causes and conditions which create hope and opportunities: 1) awareness and deep knowledge of real life issues affecting communities; 2) historically, Christian faith was proven to be a powerful instrument for igniting hope; 3) the formative roles of family and causes and conditions that help people to make a living and contribute to LED by: a) translating knowledge into action; b) maximising the gains of freedom by leading self-reliant lives and c) having knowledge of what is happening in the community.

\(^{181}\) The apartheid enemy was clear – and that regime was imposed on the people of SA – thus defeating it brought a sense of strength and power which has been ‘sapped’ by the current government who was supposed to complete the liberation.
With reference to how LED should be taken forward to benefit the poor in particular, distributing it in Tshwane, the interview findings, as reported in Chapter 8, section 8.2.14, reveal that: 100% of leaders interviewed gave inputs as to how LED should be reshaped (contextualised) going forward to benefit the poor. These include putting in place structures and systems to support, maintain, sustain, mentor and even assist in terms of the linkage between local economy and the broader economy; implementation of policies to address the challenges of poverty, unemployment and the like; tackle youth unemployment; start investing more in small businesses and LED and move people from begging to becoming self-reliant. Sixty percent (60%) of leaders said that in future LED has to work with and for all stakeholders, such as churches and their pastors, leaders in the community, business leaders and public institutions, while 80% of leaders highlighted a few pointers on the churches’ roles towards LED in the future.

These interview findings (i.e. 8.2.14) buttress the narrative findings in Chapter 6 (section 6.3.2) in terms of a trend for the future of LED, that is, integration of all sectors and collaboration and partnerships with all stakeholders including transparent and pro-people governance. Going forward for the benefit of the poor, all the assets for LED (i.e. neighbourhoods with active churches and neighbourhood organisations who work toward the constructive development of their community, which act as beacons to developers and investors including partners in LED such as local government, community institutions and the private sector) should be mobilised as tools for social and economic justice in Tshwane.

De Beer & Swart (2014: 4) suggest we start by “reclaiming the commons”. The fact is that “over-consumption by the few – of environmental and material resources – is depleting common resources in ways that are fundamentally unsustainable”. Therefore, the Church and other institutions should work towards the making of an inclusive and just city.

The making of cities should not be regarded as the sole mandate of politicians, planners or technocrats, but it should be open to all people to imagine the notion of the ‘good city’ (De Beer & Swart 2014: 5).

Therefore, I concur with the 2013 Human Development Report that

An agenda for development transformation that promotes human development is thus multifaceted. It expands people’s assets by universalizing access to basic services. It improves the functioning of state and social institutions to promote equitable growth where the benefits are
widespread. It reduces bureaucratic and social constraints on economic action and social mobility. And it holds leadership accountable (UNDP 2013: 8).

9.2.6.3. The Church’s roles with regard to LED

At the insertion phase in the first mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 6 (section 6.2.1), narrative accounts highlighted the church’s beliefs and values: 1) build families and communities; 2) share resources; 3) work together with communities for collective good; 4) non-discrimination; 5) loyalty to serve communities; 6) care of the weak; 7) consultation; 8) non-favouritism; 9) promote rest; 10) work for living a long and better life on earth as well as the church’ s praxis that should be aimed at: 1) serving communities for collective wellbeing; 2) collective prosperity; 3) fostering peace; 4) sharing resources; 5) teaching and modelling kindness; service, no oppression and loyalty to communities; 6) modelling respect; 7) working together to fight evil and talking together for a good cause; 8) helping to organise communities to address ignorance and poverty.

At the conclusion of the analysis phase in the second mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.1.2), narrative accounts focused on means employed by church/Christians to make a living and form part of LED: 1) selling and starting small businesses (e.g. Matjeke’s story); 2) starting community projects which must use Tshwane’s (S & H) ecological wealth in ways which respect the integrity of creation; 3) taking up formal employment and volunteering services for a donation; and 4) assuming a more prophetic role and a justice seeking orientation.

Interview findings chime with the narrative accounts presented in Chapter 6 (sections 6.2.1, 6.3.2 & 6.4.1) with reference to how the church can contribute to LED in Tshwane (S & H). This simply amounts to the church fostering a concrete spirituality which reinforces the notion of doing and living out an oikos / household of God and Bible-based comprehensive and integral mission (cf. Chapter 3, section 3.3.1, and Kritzinger 2014: 1). It is anchored in the theology of solidarity with the poor in meaningful ways (Miguez 1979: 261). It is also about magnifying God’s presence with the poor – this also includes the neglected and ravaged ecology as the “new poor”. It is a matter of faith in the public sphere and of doing justice.

With particular reference to the work of faith based organisations (FBOs) in society in the United Kingdom, Chapman and Hamalainen (2011: 188) find that FBOs are involved for reasons of “‘helping others’, as a way of expressing identities, values and beliefs; ‘giving something back'
as a way of serving the community; ‘getting on’: acting out of self or organizational interests and seeking transformation”.

Yet, Chapman and Hamalainen (2011: 195) point out:

(…. there are concerns among faith groups that public funding regimes and pressures can lead some FBOs to behave in a more secular way; that is, to drift away from, downplay or compromise on faith-based beliefs, commitments, language and values because they are under-resourced, required to meet funding targets and conditions and/or face anxiety about not securing funding due to their religious connections.

The foregoing raises issues which are pertinent for many churches and religious groups since they may view a close cooperation with the state as potentially harmful to their autonomy on matters of faith and doctrine. It is therefore important, as narrative accounts (see Chapter 7, section 7.1) highlight, that churches intending to work in partnership with the state and vice versa, clarify vision, mission and impulses for their praxis.

In other words, state-faith relations would also benefit from better understanding by FBOs and citizens about how the state works its language, structures and agendas. Together, this suggests that secular agencies and partners need to be open to learning and understanding distinctive faith-based organizational needs, interests, language and ways of operating, and FBOs need to become better at articulating to secular agencies ‘what they are about, who they are, what they stand for and how they behave’ (member of a Christian faith-based charity) (Chapman and Hamalainen (2011: 196).

In its praxis, the church has to clarify and communicate its vision, mission, goals and objectives to all stakeholders taking part in this project of making the “good city”. It is important that the church’s faith, doctrine, convictions and distinctives have to be in the open.

9.3. Elements of churches’ oikos praxis towards LED

In the foregoing work, I drew some conclusions and highlighted the implications of the findings of this research for praxis, specifically the church’s transformed praxis in each theme discussed. For a transformed praxis, the interaction between current praxis (see Chapter 5), contextual demands and evidence, and critical reflection should result in transformed practical contextual
A brief recapitulation of praxis elements I highlighted in the foregoing suggests that the churches:

- Will be required to work for socioeconomic justice in harmony with the earth as a matter of priority
- Have to develop concrete models of LED in Tshwane (S & H) as facilitators and advocates of economic empowerment for the poor and as communities of resistance against the prevailing economic injustice in the city
- Must opt for a LED path which promotes the development of policies and activities based on the capacities, skills and assets of the poor and their neighbourhoods in a sustainable way
- Should work for the promotion of policies which substantially benefit the poor and the weak in ways that aim for liberation and self-reliance and sustainability, and on the other hand work for the banishment or reformation of policies which are failing to benefit the masses of poor and destitute in Tshwane (S & H)
- Have to arrive at a position where they become knowledgeable about policy development and framework and become one of the voices for an alternative vision geared at fostering collective prosperity and multi-dimensional justice and sustainability in these townships. Further, the churches have to work in such a way that the poor themselves become the agents and engine of transformation and liberation
- Must model LED which empowers local economic actors to take the lead in guiding and implementing the goals of sustainable LED in S and H
- Are obliged to embark on an ongoing socioeconomic analysis. This has to become one of the key elements in their missional praxes
- Must work towards behavioural change in the economic realm which should promote modesty, better lives for all human and other-than-human communities in the context of all the oikos values
• Have to advocate for sustainable social development policies which promote inclusion, equity in the provision of basic services, empowerment, transformation and liberation

• Are obliged to recognise and make use of the cultural resources and assets within these townships for LED purposes. They must ensure that urban poor groups are organised and work with existing pro-poor organisations in these contexts for social and economic justice as well as for eco-justice

• Should integrate the traditional cultural and religious resources as building blocks for LED intervention in S and H. These resources’ potential will have to be harnessed so that they contribute towards pathways out of poverty in these contexts.

• Should work intentionally towards the realisation of community’s aspirations and desires while being guided by ethics (i.e. the right thing to do) and values (i.e. guiding principles and beliefs). This means that the church’s praxis should be an ethical value-based economic response to the current impasse.

• Are required to work for the realisation of social justice and economic justice including ecojustice. This way, the church’s praxis will ignite hope through its actions of stewardship and care of the earth and of human communities. With reference to Tshwane, this implies being active in eco-care and eco-justice in ways which protect the unique and rich ecology of Tshwane and surrounds, consisting of nature reserves, game reserves, rivers and dams, the fauna and the flora, valleys and mountains, human settlements, agriculture, industries, economic activities, etc. in a sustainable manner for the benefits of all humans and nonhumans living in Tshwane.

• Should work towards the making of an inclusive and just city.

• Have to clarify and communicate vision, mission, goals and objectives to all stakeholders involved with in this project of making the “good city”. The Churches’ faith imperatives and doctrine, convictions and distinctives must be in the open.

Figure 9.1 below graphically sums up the different elements of praxis in relation to oikos which I discussed in the foregoing.
I contend that the praxis pointers enumerated above will certainly enable the township churches of S & H, in relation to LED, to participate in missio Dei, the Mission of God that God is carrying out in the world (Bosch 1991: 389, see also Montgomery 2012: 7). Thus, the theological articulation for the praxis that I suggest in this thesis has its foundation or source in missio Dei. I perceive missio Dei to be the central belief (theory) in Christian missiology which inspires me in the formulation of the framework which I propose in this study and which has also inspired notions discussed earlier such as: 1) the church being an instrument for mission service (see 1.7.1 and 1.7.7); 2) church with others (see 1.7.7) and 3) practical expression of the church (see 1.7.3).
Further, within the ambit of *missio Dei* and with reference to this study, I declare that a Christian missiological framework should, in my opinion, incorporate the “God-caused” existence of the “entire material universe” (cf. Heb. 11:3, see also Cairns 1998: 104) which reveals God’s divine presence, wisdom, love, care and might manifested in and around the entire universe as well as the place and roles of humankind, who depend on this material universe for life, as stewards and co-workers with God in the latter’s mission to the whole world. The framework I suggest in this study receives its impulse and inspiration from the *oikos* concept which has also helped me to understand the current empirical realities related to LED and suggest an alternative, then to sketch a vision for an economy capable of serving the whole community of life in Tshwane (S & H). The focal point of this missiological framework is the whole of creation or the whole household of God in God’s kingdom (cf. Grigg 1984: 82, McFague 1993).

9.4. Summary and preliminary understanding of the *oikos* as a vision for missiological praxis

In the course of this study, it has become apparent to me that the *oikos* guides us into the future (with a broad vision and theoretical concept) and also guides one back into the praxis useful for socioeconomic transformation in the CoT.

As indicated, the current socioeconomic development project of the CoT is anthropocentric and largely unsustainable, failing to facilitate profound transformation and liberation of communities and the development of ethical behaviours which promote collective wellbeing of all inhabitants of the *oikos*. Reflecting on anthropocentricity with reference to *botho / ubuntu* in the quest for the fullness of life, and the affirmation of the integrity of creation, wholeness and wellbeing, LenkaBula argues that

> What is needed is to articulate an ethics of life that is not built on the predominant belief in super-humans who dominate the earth and creation and who claim they are given dominion over creation. The dominant narrative in many instances is such that humanity relates to creation as something to be dominated, to be extracted from and which is only useful and valuable for economic gains and not necessarily for its own good, ethics, aesthetic, religious appeal or for the common good of all (LenkaBula 2008: 376).

In order to instil and affirm the notion that creation is for the common good of all, the *oikos* concept was used in this study as a hermeneutic key to help us understand the current
economic impasse in Tshwane (S & H) resulting mainly from the already noted anthropocentric and growth-focussed policies adopted by the city. In this study, this impasse is interpreted and manifested in a number of complex ways relative to economy, development, policy, history, theology and the like, as highlighted here:

9.4.1 Economic imbalances as manifested in the townships of S & H

Owing to various factors such as the alignment of the post-apartheid South African economy to global neoliberal political economic imperatives, new legislative frameworks and the like, township communities have experienced positive as well as negative changes in their economy (see 7.2.6.2).

Firstly, the empirical findings concurred with literature that: 1) marginal township communities lag behind the development goals of the city; 2) current economic restructuring and projects result in very uneven spatial effects; 3) there is an absence of local stable markets in townships and 4) there is loss of income (due to unemployment and retrenchment) and under-education and illiteracy of the people on the margins. In short, there is an economic imbalance between the centre and the peri-urban townships of S & H. Evidences of this imbalance include: the people of townships having considerable unfulfilled needs; township producers losing their markets; a diminishing of the productive potential of townships; township residents being obliged to sell labour to the city to obtain income while technical advances make the city less and less dependent on the factors of production offered by townships. This has led to greater unemployment. LED’s primary goal, which is to improve the livelihood of communities by increasing the number and the variety of jobs available to local people (see 1.7.4) in a sustainable manner, is not being achieved.

Secondly, the positive effects of current socioeconomic and infrastructural development drives of the city in terms of projects such as BRT, ICT, improved human settlements, and facilitation of development of business ventures in townships, health facilities improvement and revitalisation of township economy, have not necessarily led to shared prosperity for all and generous care for the vulnerable and poor. In the light of these and other negative features, the local economies of these townships have no chance; they are swallowed up by the big economic players who operate within these townships. Worse, local businesses and individuals in townships receive very little protection from the law enforcing authorities. As a result, crime has increased in the townships.
Thirdly, there exists some considerable distance and discrepancy between officials and communities about development needs because the city, although it consults, does not take the voice of the poor seriously when it undertakes development planning. Township residents feel they are in the dark about their own development priorities since the official development priorities of the city do not substantially meet most of the aspirations and expectations of communities of S & H.

Fourthly, LED initiatives are needed to address the current massive unemployment on one hand and to generate resources to meet basic human needs developmentally and sustainably in Tshwane (S & H) on the other. LED is better positioned to address the issues of unemployment by facilitating and giving economic opportunities to people in communities. But currently, it is failing to do so because of the reasons advanced in the foregoing discussion.

9.4.2. Economic imbalances as manifested in the township church of S & H

Firstly, there exists a “disconnect” in many cases between the theological/missiological approach of the congregations that participated in this study, for example, and concrete community realities wherever they are located. As a result, these churches in Tshwane (S & H) have not facilitated relevant solutions to issues of poverty, marginalisation and unemployment which affect most members of the community in these townships. Bowers du Toit and Nkomo (2014: 2) expand on this,

Several authors have argued over the past few years for the potential of the church within a South African context to bridge this gap [between the rich and the poor] due to factors such as public trust in religious institutions, the church’s historical role in social welfare and the significant amount contributed by the church to poverty alleviation (cf. Bowers Du Toit 2012:206– 208; Burger & Van Der Watt 2010:396; Erasmus 2012b:60).

Secondly, the ecclesiastical formations that participated in this research still bear the legacy of a class system rooted in the apartheid past (i.e. ministering to people on the margins and lacking financial resources to sustain their work; as a result, most of their leaders are self-supporting). Nevertheless, these peripheral churches possess important assets such as physical and institutional structures, spiritual and moral foundations and access to deprived grassroots and at-risk communities, contacts with public offices, cross-cultural relationships and a predisposition to care for the poor. These assets can be further mobilised to generate vision,
motivation and responsibility for a public theology in such a way that township churches become relevant and visible strategic participants in LED in Tshwane (S & H), even though they might still have some weaknesses and blind spots in their mission orientations.

9.4.3. Means of economic survival

People networks, community organisations (such as stokvels, burial societies and saving clubs) and the church are very important networks of relations and influence and survival (see 7.2.9.2) in the townships of S & H. Therefore, it is strategic that a sustainable asset based LED be the preferred option for Tshwane (S & H) going forward. Sharing, interdependent relations and surviving by local means such as those mentioned, are traditions deemed important for personal and collective economic survival (see 7.2.10.2). These sound traditions are assets useful for LED which should be maintained and promoted. Other assets for LED in Tshwane (S & H) (i.e. neighbourhoods with active churches and neighbourhood organisations who work toward the constructive development of their community, including earth resources (i.e. land, vegetation, trees, animals, insects, etcetera), should be mobilised in an integrated and sustainable manner as tools for social and economic justice and the collective welfare of the whole of creation in Tshwane (S & H) (cf. LenkaBula 2008: 2).

9.4.4. Social development, LED, oikos and oiko-missiology in the CoT (S & H)

In the foregoing discourse and against this backdrop, I have contended for an integrated and “glocal” approach to LED which should deal concurrently with issues of needs, exclusion and assets in ways that improve the collective wellbeing of communities in a sustainable manner. This sustainable asset-based LED aims to promote both human and non-human beings’ harmony with the environment and also their freedom from enslavement and entrapments of all sorts which affect humans (cf. Sen 1999) and nonhumans in the CoT (S & H).

With reference to the Christian missiological and theological perspective to socioeconomic development in the CoT (S & H) which has emerged so far in this study, the discourse is premised on the conviction that a development ethos based on the oikos concept has the potential to unlock possibilities for sustainable economic transformation in harmony with the oikos or God’s household. This missiological vision and model for praxis has, if embraced by people, the potential to empower them by enlarging their capabilities in all spheres of life, including the economy, in harmony with the environment. In essence it needs to be about building sustainable communities and sustainable economy in Tshwane (S & H) in order to
restore and maintain the organic nature of the local economy and society, one where cooperation would be emphasised over competition and exploitation (cf. 1.7.5).

_Botho or Ubuntu_ is significant here for personal, political, socioeconomic and ecological justice in African religious-cultural life. Hence, I concur with LenkaBula (2008: 375) who rightly contends that “interpretative frameworks in religious and theological studies that reduce _botho_ to human relations are unsatisfactory”. This has led to humans caring only for their own kind, thereby further destroying the capacity of the _oikos_ to continue being the household of all other inhabitants of the earth. As a result, the future of the earth and the possibility of building sustainable communities and sustainable economies are under threat unless there is conversion on the part of humans affecting how they go about their economic activities and their survival on the earth. This is why in this study, the _oikos_ concept is appropriate: it resonates with a _botho_ notion that goes beyond anthropocentricity and growth-focused policies in imagining an alternative sustainable “glocal” LED for Tshwane (S & H); (cf. LenkaBula (2008: 375 – 376). It opens possibilities for us to see, as LenkaBula (2008: 376) put it, “the ecological facets of _botho_ that are relevant for religious life and for the fullness of life for African people, especially in the context of 21st century struggles where ecological degradation is evident”. Consequently, in addition to _botho_ between humans being embodied in the means of survival mentioned in section 9.3.3, _botho_ has to be extended to all nonhuman beings of Tshwane (S & H) in our endeavour to realise collective wellbeing and particularly sustainable LED. We can reinforce _botho_ by also drawing insights from the indigenous African worldview which motivates the “African’s closeness to and consciousness to creation” (cf. Golo 2012: 350) and its inherent reverence for / respect of the whole community of life.

The _oikos_ also means sustaining the whole community of life in both S & H (cf. 4.3.3.1 & 4.3.3.2) – i.e. local institutions (businesses, schools, parks, hospitals and clinics, community colleges and libraries), Citizens’ Associations (churches, block clubs and cultural groups) and gifts possessed by individuals (income, artists, youth, elderly and labelled people). This also includes political and administrative structures; particular features of these townships as stated in sections 4.3.3.1 and 4.3.3.2. In short, conceptually it includes the whole topography, geography, geological constitution and ecosystems and within which the social and urban ecosystems of Tshwane are placed and on which social ecosystems inherently rely in terms of natural resources, i.e. water, soil, clean air, space, vegetation, shelter, animals, the beauty of the natural world, energy and minerals of Tshwane (S & H).
9.4.4.1. Urban theology/missiology’s vision for a sustainable future in Tshwane (S & H): A proposition

In the light of the above findings of this research project and within the perspective of the oikos vision and practical framework for action, this researcher has made the following proposition, in order to use the research results concretely in a programme for the foreseeable future of Tshwane (S & H). It guided him when he was working on the “praxis outcome chapter” of this thesis.

Using this oikos-based framework should result in a broadened missiological agenda in Tshwane (S & H) which forces the church and its members, missiologists and theologians (in partnership and collaboration with other discipline experts such as the CSIR, economists, sustainability scientists, development experts and town planners) to consider the ecological and social problems and opportunities of these townships in relation with each other in the search for a just and sustainable way of life in our society, as our Christian contribution to the manifestation of the household of God or oikos. In short, it is embracing and letting the planetary agenda\textsuperscript{182} (cf. 3.3.2.4) be infused in our vision for a sustainable future in Tshwane (S & H). Sustainability then becomes part of the DNA code of theology and missiology in the CoT (S & H). For example, one of the urban theologian’s visions for a sustainable future as part of this contribution ought to tackle the socioeconomic and spatial issues related to rapidly expanding areas of Tshwane. It should enquire how this expansion can be practicable in the use of the gift of natural resources on which all its inhabitants depend. How can these be employed wisely and sustainably in the “garden”\textsuperscript{183} which was originally ecologically diverse; housing indigenous plants and wildlife, agriculturally and minerally rich. The indigenous people tilled this garden for “bread” and for survival but in contrast the colonists through exploitation of this garden acquired wealth and prospered. This simply means that urban theologians / missiologists need to have a vision of Tshwane (S & H) as a city that makes full economical-ecological sense of their understanding of a sustainable future for individuals, households, neighbourhoods / community organisations and the whole of the environment under the Sovereign God, the Creator.

\textsuperscript{182} I owe this insight to Sallie McFague (1993) who refers to ways about how we can address the ecological crisis as planetary agenda. This notion includes lifestyle choices, means and strategies which could lead to the collective well-being of all inhabitants of the planet.

\textsuperscript{183} Metaphorically, the garden is the source of food and guarantees the subsistence of a household; from it the household generates income and acquires wealth.
Figure 9.2 below graphically illustrates, by means of a circular format, the different realms to be considered in designing a multi-layered, inter and multidisciplinary socioeconomic and theological vision for a sustainable future in Tshwane (S & H).

![Circular diagram illustrating realms to consider in designing a multi-layered socioeconomic and theological vision for a sustainable future in Tshwane (S & H).]

Fig. 9.2: Realms to consider in designing a multi-layered socioeconomic and theological vision of a sustainable future in Tshwane (S & H).

**N.B:** The interdependent interaction descending line starts from: God $\rightarrow$ environment $\rightarrow$ neighbourhood/community / church $\rightarrow$ Household $\rightarrow$ individual.

The interdependent interaction ascending line starts from: individual $\rightarrow$ household $\rightarrow$ community / Neighbourhood / church $\rightarrow$ environment $\rightarrow$ God.

### 9.4.4.2. Theological exploration on ecological wealth and the ecological basis of the economy of Tshwane

Drawing from the CSIR Natural Resources and the Environment Impact Strategy published in 2012\(^{184}\), I concur that the theological exploration must “recognise that the natural environment has far-reaching and important impacts on and consequences for water, health, economic growth (including the green economy and resource-based sectors such as agriculture, tourism,

---

forestry and mining), sustainable settlements, and spatial and rural development and safety (for example, from natural disasters)” (CSIR 2012: 2).

In addition to social organisations and human settlements, Tshwane (S & H) is rich in a number of natural resources useful for the inhabitants’ livelihood. Both Soshanguve and Hammanskraal boast land (in terms of individual stands and plots and vacant municipally owned land), small rivers; bush vegetation; parks, valleys and hills and are in close proximity to Wonderboom Nature Reserve, Soutpan meteor crater (or Tswaing in the SeTswana language), Bon Accord Dam and Dinokeng Game Reserve. These natural resources are used by a number of residents of S & H for their livelihood. Certain poor households in S and H rely on the bush to collect firewood for domestic use and sell some for income. Some rely on the river to do their washing. Some others, specifically the households along the Apies River in Hammanskraal, grow a number of vegetables for domestic use and sell the surplus to generate some income. There are also other residents of S & H who are allowed to fish in the Bon Accord Dam and Apies River during winter months. At the entrance of S from Pretoria on the Soshanguve / Mabopane highway, certain older people make use of the vacant municipal land to plant maize and pumpkin. Herbalists and traditional healers rely on this bush vegetation for roots and leaves used in their medicinal concoctions. In my observations, I also noticed an individual near Dinokeng game reserve who sells indigenous plants.

However, most residents of these townships rely on the modern economy and its diverse apparatus for their livelihood. This means, holding a formal position and drawing a salary / wage in order to survive. Considering the current unemployment situation in Tshwane (S & H), many people will be obliged to wait a long time before they can land a formal job. These residents have simply distanced themselves from tilling the land and only produce crops for their own family use. Admittedly, there are water scarcity and land limitations in these areas, but if there is the will, it is possible, in my experience in these townships, to grow sufficient vegetables and keep some hens for eggs for family consumption in one’s backyard. It is possible for a household to start breaking its dependency on the modern economy if its members are able to think differently, using their creativity on how to sustain their household livelihood by relying on the natural and other assets they have at their disposal in a sustainable way. It is inconceivable

---

185 The crater is called *Tswaing* in seTswana, the local language of the area, or Soutpan in Afrikaans. Both names mean Salt Pan and this derives from the lake of salty water that fills the centre. There is a museum adjacent to the crater. A path leads from the museum to the crater, along the rim, and down to the central lake. The crater is covered with indigenous trees and bushes, and attracts a variety of bird life ([http://www.hartrao.ac.za/other/tswaing/tswaing.html accessed 4 July 2016](http://www.hartrao.ac.za/other/tswaing/tswaing.html)).
that, if one has access to a piece of land, water and is physically healthy, one has to rely entirely on a shop for his / her food. In this study certain possibilities were explored with research participants and are tabled in Chapter 10.

There are also threats to the natural resources of S & H. Deforestation and destruction of natural vegetation on a regional and global level caused by the expansion of human settlements are correlated to heat waves we have been experiencing in Tshwane (Adeyemi et al. 2015). We therefore need to work for the restoration of Tshwane’s ecological wealth by embarking on re-forestation programmes to improve the situation. Pollution of the environment by plastics and non-biodegradable materials must also be prevented. Adopting organic farming methods will also assist in restoring the ecological wealth of Tshwane.

9.4.4.3. Oikos, Our local ecological wellbeing and urban theology

Wonderboom Nature Reserve\textsuperscript{186}, Bon Accord Dam\textsuperscript{187}, Dinokeng Game Reserve\textsuperscript{188}, Tswaing meteor crater, water courses, plants and animals and the rest of the environment in Tshwane (S & H) form part of the household of God in Tshwane and are intended for our local ecological wellbeing and also for economic and educational opportunities. Yet, most local community members of S & H live their lives without regard to the former. As a result, they do not care about planting trees and providing a vegetative cover for the soil around their houses, also pollute the environment with plastic and other non-biodegradable materials, and perpetrate a progressive invasion and destruction of local fauna and flora through expansion of urban settlements and the like.

\textsuperscript{186} Named after the wild fig (\textit{Ficus salicifolia}) \textit{Wonderboom}, for which the reserve is famous and which grows at the foot of the northern slopes of the Magalies Mountain range. At the foot of this same hill lie two adjacent archaeological sites - one an example of the Iron Age, and the other one of the best Stone Age sites in the area - the largest single collection of stone artifacts ever discovered in Africa was excavated here. The Wonderboom Nature Reserve is also the dwelling place of a number of small antelope, monkeys, dassies (‘rock hyrax’) and an array of birds (http://www.savenues.com/game-reserves/ga_wonderboom.htm accessed on 4 July 2016).

\textsuperscript{187} The Bon Accord Dam, situated at Bon Accord is a favorite venue for water sports. The suburb of Bon Accord is very accessible to the Wonderboom Airport. The area is known for its tropical climate, with lots of indigenous fauna and flora. Cycads are predominant features in this geographical area. http://www.wheretostay.co.za/town/bon-accord accessed on 4 July 2016. In addition, people come here to fish the carp and catfish which are sold along the roads.

\textsuperscript{188} The Dinokeng Game Reserve is the first free-roaming Big 5 residential game reserve in Gauteng – and probably in the world – adjacent to an urbanised area. It is a private/public initiative for which planning and development started in the early 2000’s. There is opportunity to view Elephant, Rhino (White), Buffalo, Giraffe, Kudu, Eland, Blue Wildebeest, Tsessebi, Red Hartebeest, Waterbuck, Zebra, Impala. Lynx, Jackal and Leopard to name but a few (http://www.dinokengreserve.co.za/ accessed on 4 July 2016)
It is therefore incumbent upon urban theology / missiology in these townships to include a holistic and integrated socioeconomic, ecological and spiritual agenda beyond the current anthropocentric development agenda. This urban theology agenda should be multi-disciplinary, encouraging interdependency and appropriate to address the issues pertaining life in these townships of S & H. It should ultimately lead communities to find creative and sustainable ways of creating work and generating income in relation to the ecological wealth of these locations. The poor and marginalised must have access to this wealth in contrast to the current scenario where only a few affluent people draw benefit and make money from the existing natural resources such as Dinokeng, Bon Accord Dam and Tswaing meteor crater. Based on the oikos concept, I contend for an urban theology agenda which should be life-giving for humans and nonhumans where all the inhabitants of Tshwane (S & H) enjoy wellbeing and prosperity. Hence, this agenda has to include opportunities for ecological education to the church in Tshwane (S & H) and community at large by highlighting the interdependent and belonging-together nature of the oikos.

9.4.4.4. Area biodiversity, economic and educational opportunities and theology

The type of theology to be promoted in these townships has to be contextual – one which wrestles with real issues of salvation in the contexts of S & H. This theology should teach local congregations on how to keep a spiritual project and a socioeconomic and ecological project of the church in balance. It is a theology which should endeavour at the same time for the up-keeping of the area’s biodiversity, creatively inspiring the search for economic opportunities by which local communities could survive. This is not a “dull theology”; on the contrary, it should enthusiastically engage the public arena of economics, politics, administration, education, civil society including the churches, in ways which show that the church involved in missio Dei has to embrace the whole of creation (i.e. oikos) as manifested in Tshwane (S & H).

9.5. Conclusion of this chapter

In this chapter, the emphasis was placed on gaining insights about LED in Tshwane from these different empirical viewpoints. Practical implications of this research for theory and praxis were also highlighted, including a summary and preliminary understanding of the oikos and oikos missiology praxis.
In the next chapter, I focus on bringing the various sources for reflection into play (cf. Chapter 3 and Chapter 6), applying them specifically to the information gathered through empirical work for the purpose of presenting a conceptual theological framework.
10.1 Introduction

Chapters 5, 6, 7 and 8 described the economic situation of Tshwane from the perspective held by church leaders and selected practitioners who participated in this research. My consistent application of the pastoral cycle led me towards identifying some pointers as to what the oikos-based church’s praxis could focus upon, on its road ahead towards a sensible contribution to sustainable LED (i.e. section 9.2). A summary and a preliminary understanding of the oikos and oikos missiology praxis, which emerged in relation to these findings, were presented in section 9.3.

In Chapter 3, the theoretical / conceptual relationship of the church, mission and development was historically and strategically explored, and certain suggestions have been made with regard to where this study positions itself. Theoretical discussions focussed on topics such as faith communities and development as well as the church’s perspective on development and an economic paradigm based on the oikos concept (sections 3.2 & 3.3). It was also acknowledged that the church’s involvement in integral development and mission has a broader scope (see also Fig. 3.1) including ecological concerns towards which people of faith may contribute through their work of social and ecological justice and sustainability, which are not being currently realised.

10.1.1 Unjust relationship between market economics and ecology result in poverty

Deane-Drummond (2008: 17 - 31) considers that the current complex relationship between market economics (especially in relation to the globalisation of markets and ecologically irresponsible over-consumption of energy and biotechnology) and environmental issues is not only a challenge for sustainability, but has also created, in contrast to the kingdom of God or God’s household where every being enjoys life and prosperity, a kingdom of world systems – or the empires of wealthy colonial / post-colonial nations that exploit nations in the South, the empire of global capitalism which destroys the sustainable ways in which many “indigenous” people lived and a contemporary understanding of sustainability, which threatens harmony in
the *oikos*. This web of relationships and associated issues are the basic causes of the ecological and economic crisis to which this study responds by contending that it is possible to have an urban theology/missiology vision for a sustainable future of LED in Tshwane (S & H); a vision of (ecological – economic) salvation and liberation which results in *Shalom* for the whole of creation.

In its involvement in *missio Dei*, the church should demonstrate God’s kingdom in the world by feeding the hungry, speaking up for the poor and needy, protecting widows, caring for orphans, visiting prisoners, clothing the destitute, giving to the poor, housing homeless people, looking after aliens and refugees as well as protecting all the other nonhuman beings who also inhabit the earth from human destruction so that there will be collective wellbeing and shared prosperity in the whole of creation. I will return to these different possibilities of the church’s involvement later where I will detail how the economy is supposed to work so that both human and nonhuman beings enjoy wellbeing and prosperity. For the moment, the more theoretical drafting of a theological / missiological *oikos* framework is the focus of this chapter.

At the theological reflection phase of the third mini-consultation, as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.2.1) the combined group was engaged in theological reflection on the following themes: 1) consequences for building a Christian response to LED, 2) *oikos* values as guiding principles for LED, 3) factors which might hinder the realisation of *oikos* values, 4) sin in relation to LED, 5) signs of God’s economy and the *oikos* in this situation, 6) signs of hope and grace which open up the situation for the *oikos*, 7) meaning of salvation in this situation, 8) role/s of the church towards LED, 9) possibilities and examples of Christian based LED practice, 10) role/s of ministers and lay leaders (in relation to a holistic response to unemployment), 11) challenges held by God’s economy and the *oikos* vis-à-vis the rest of the economy, 12) insights which could strengthen a Christian based LED approach and 13) spirituality.

The theoretical and theological discussion of Chapter 3 and the themes of the groups’ combined theological reflections as related to the economic paradigm based on *oikos* and the preliminary understanding of *oikos* and *oikos* missiology highlighted in section 9.3 are developed. I have brought the various sources for reflection into play, applying them specifically to the information gathered in the narrative accounts, including the joint group reflection. The sources which helped to inform the theological / missiological framework for an alternative LED and upon which I drew, are the Word of God, the social context (introduced in Chapter 4), ecclesial
tradition (introduced in Chapter 5), the development of the literature study in Chapter 2 and theological literature study in Chapter 3, both of which contribute to the exploration of the role of churches in sustainable LED within the context of the *oikos* concept (introduced in Chapters 2 & 3) and my personal life and background.

10.1.2. Christological basis for *Oikomissiology*

This section is the researcher’s own reflection on the insights gained, that leads to the emergence of a systematic theological / missiological framework for an *oikos*-based alternative LED for Tshwane (S & H). Before proceeding, it was necessary to map out the theological insights which I considered crucial in presenting a God-centred *oikomissiology* for Tshwane (S & H). Cairns (1998: 365, 366) contends that a systematic approach to theology should be thoroughly biblical and God-centred, and the Christological hermeneutical starting point should be adopted (cf. Shepherd 2009: 3). He also points out: “the Trinity is our starting point and Scripture our data” (p365). Further, he argues that a “systematic approach to theology finds its highest expression in the Christological method, because it starts off with the open acknowledgement of the light of the complete Biblical revelation – and of course that complete revelation is aglow with the centrality of the Redeemer and His work” (p366).

I concur with Shepherd’s (2009: 3) view that any Christian response to the “ecological crisis” and an account of Christian ecological and economic ethics must be grounded upon Christological and eschatological affirmations. Insights from Shepherd assisted me to make connections between Christology, eschatology and creation in my understanding of *oikomissiology*. Col. 1: 15-23 provides us with a vivid portrayal of these affirmations (cf. Shepherd 2009: 5):

15 He is the image of the invisible God, the first-born of all creation;

16 for in him all things were created, in heaven and on earth, visible and invisible, whether thrones or dominions or principalities or authorities--all things were created through him and for him.

17 He is before all things, and in him all things hold together.

18 He is the head of the body, the church; he is the beginning, the first-born from the dead, that in everything he might be pre-eminent.
19 For in him all the fullness of God was pleased to dwell,

20 and through him to reconcile to himself all things, whether on earth or in heaven, making peace by the blood of his cross.

21 And you, who once were estranged and hostile in mind, doing evil deeds,

22 he has now reconciled in his body of flesh by his death, in order to present you holy and blameless and irreproachable before him,

23 provided that you continue in the faith, stable and steadfast, not shifting from the hope of the gospel which you heard, which has been preached to every creature under heaven, and of which I, Paul, became a minister.

(Revised Standard Version Bible)

Based on this text, Shepherd (2009: 3 – 10) developed a Christological hermeneutic on creation focussed on the cosmic Christ as the theme expressed in four affirmations:

- **Christ is the Creator of all creation:**

  Such an understanding that ‘all things’ have been created through Christ has an important implication regarding the nature of creation. Earth, and life itself, is not therefore a random chance happening occurring in a meaningless cosmos. Rather, the whole of the cosmos is a planned and ordered marvel – a miraculous gift of love and joy stemming from the creative overflow of love shared between Father, Son and Spirit (p6)

- **Christ is the “Sustainer”**

  … Orthodox biblical Christianity asserts that Creation is other than God but still depends on God for its ongoing existence (p7)

- **Christ is the Telos / the Consummation of Creation**

  … In Christian thought, creation does not exist for humanity, but rather, creation is from Christ and is for Christ …. Creation therefore is not some obsolescent stage-backdrop from the early part of a drama that, once used, will be discarded, but rather is part and parcel of the whole salvation-drama. God is not in the business of destroying the world, but of perfecting it and bringing it to its fullness in Christ (p8 – 9).

- **Christ is the Reconciler**
Creation has a future! ...The cycle of death which seems part and parcel of creation has, in Christ, been triumphed over. For Paul this is the ‘hope held out in the gospel’ and accordingly is to be ‘proclaimed to every creature under heaven’ [Col 1:23]. For Paul, the gospel provides ecological hope! (p10).

These affirmations provided many insights for me to systematically construct my oikomissiology in that the ecological dimension consists of glorifying God, sustaining the whole of creation, engaging in salvific action which includes the whole of creation and co-working with Christ to restore harmony in relation (God – humanity – earth) in the here and now as well as eschatologically. Christology frames oikomissiology as central to the building and advancing of the kingdom here on earth as it is in heaven, so as to achieve shalom.

In his research, Warmback (2005: 168) noticed “that the church tended to respond to particular circumstances and challenges but did not have a systematic theology, or a common understanding of what is being aimed at, and that the important link between the environment and the economy was seldom dealt with”. This research’s findings concur with Warmback’s in terms of the church’s lack of a systematic theology which makes connections between the environment and the economy (see Chapters 5, 6, 7 and 8). The praxes and mission orientation of churches that participated in this research as presented in Chapter 5 (see 5.7) revealed that these churches have both evangelistic (i.e. calling individuals to repent and accept Christ in their lives) and activist (i.e. involvement in various faith projects in their communities) orientations. They also reveal that they hold this-worldly and other-worldly worldviews, which could contribute to upholding the household of God’s economic rules for a healthy sustainable economy and sustainable communities. However, they lack a systematic theological articulation of the relation between churches, the environment and LED in their communities.

There is therefore a need for a consistent “new” theology and missiology in this Christological method of searching for this “new theology”, which is in tandem with the missio Dei which, according to Bosch (1991: 370) affirms that mission is God’s sending forth to include the participation of the church in the divine mission. I concur with Bosch’s position in this study and call the church to participate in the divine mission in Tshwane (S & H) which includes LED from the perspective of the oikos concept. Missio Dei “reframed mission from being church-centric to becoming theocentric” (Niemandt 2012: 2). God-centred oikomissiology therefore resonates with such a Christological method and enables us to explore even the most extreme consequences of what a Christological theology would entail for the salvation and welfare of this earth and the whole cosmos. Thus, an ecologically understood missio Dei “stretches” even a
broad-minded Christological theology further and further, which would undoubtedly sustain the “new” church's revised and revived missiological engagement in sustainable economic activities. This was the goal of this chapter.

10.2 Towards oikomissiology, a “new” Church, and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

10.2.1 Getting started: Constructing oikomissiology

Warmback (2005: 172) contends that beyond the traditional theological resources (i.e. doctrines, influence and insights from pioneers of the faith) contemporary theologies (that is: ecofeminist, African and liberation theologies) can help us with different components in the construction of an oikotheology: Insights from ecofeminist theologies “which look at the position of women in relation to the environment, offer us useful resources to help us to see the interconnectedness of life and promote the empowerment of women” (Warmback 2005: 172; cf. Van Schalkwyk 2008 & 2012; see also Rakoczy 2004: 315 - 322). Moreover, insights from other South African oikos theologians such as Conradie, de Gruchy and The Oikos Journey network in addition to many people who work with these theologians’ writings aid in broadening faith-based welfare and community development work so as to include the wellbeing of the whole earth community – which is the fundamental aim of oikomissiology.

This study adds to these works and writings in reference to sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H). For example, in southern Africa where, according to Moyo (2014: 26) “the national level indicators of landholding inequality conceal the marginalisation of women in the ownership of and access to land, and consequently their limited control over the products and incomes from farming, due to discriminatory cultural practises of land allocation and inheritance which are shaped by the dominance of patriarchal systems of power” (cf. UNDP 2012: 124), oikomissiology must ensure that equity and access to land are guaranteed by drawing insights from disciplines such as social policy, development, human rights, economics and so forth.

Insights from African theology which make a connection between the context of poverty and the struggle for life are helpful in constructing an oikomissiology which promotes ubuntu in the quest for the fullness of life and the affirmation of the integrity of creation, wholeness and wellbeing, as LenkaBula (2008: 376) contends (see 9.4), and for the strengthening of community (Warmback 2005: 174). Van Schalkwyk (2012) also worked on wellbeing as ecological wellbeing, thereby addressing the limitations of faith communities’ involvement in development. Golo (2012: 350)
amplifies this: he adds that the view of salvation through Christ in African Christianity “is the redemption from ungodly and malevolent forces within creation which predispose the human being to acting contrary to the divine will through which the human being freed enjoys the glorious grace and love of God – including the blessing to a prosperous and wealthy life (mostly defined materially)”. This explains, according to Asante (1985: 289-293) the notion that the “African sees ontological relationships among all things. He does not see himself in isolation from the other creatures, nor does he see other creatures in isolation from him” (cf. Warmback 2005: 175, see also Visser & Bediako 2004: xvii and Pobee & Ositelu 1998: 28).

Further, insights from liberation theology are also helpful in oikomissiology. Boff (1997: 7-8) expressed a critique of some popular Christian theologies that are violent against the earth and unjust against the poor by pointing out that the logic which exploits classes and subjects peoples in furthering the interest of a few rich and powerful countries and individuals is the same as the logic that devastates the earth and plunders its wealth, showing no solidarity with the rest of humanity and future generations. Such logic is shattering to the fragile balance of the universe. It has broken humankind’s covenant of kinship with the earth and destroyed its sense of connectedness with all things. I concur with Warmback (2005: 175) that “the integration of ecological concerns into liberation theology offers particularly helpful resources for constructing an oikotheology”. I return to discussing liberation in relation to oikomissiology later, in section 10.2.8.

**10.2.1.1 The oikos metaphor**

As suggested in the previous chapter (see 9.3.4), the oikos metaphor provides us with insights for sustaining the whole community of life – an interdependent and interrelated web which signifies “botho” in the community of life. Thus, working with the whole community of life means that Christians need to broaden the missiological agenda of the church in Tshwane (S & H) beyond anthropocentric concerns so as to include all living beings and systems in Tshwane, which is part of this whole community of life. This all-inclusive nature of the oikos, as the household of God which consists of all living beings and living systems, and which concerns the wellbeing or shalom of all living beings, radically challenges theologians / missiologists to contribute to the vision for a sustainable future in Tshwane (S & H) based on social and ecological wealth and in the final instance, on the ecological foundation of the economy of Tshwane. This implies therefore that theology / missiology should not focus solely on spiritual and faith matters, but it should also contribute toward the realisation of sustainability in different
spheres of life in an integrated manner – environmental, social, economic and urban-territorial. It could also provide a new ambit and new scope for missiologists and practitioners, so as to take their understanding of mission beyond just the salvation of human beings towards a vision of the redemption and re-birth of the whole of creation (see Rom.8: 19-23).

For example, theology should speak against systems of the City of Tshwane which still contain non-sustainable elements, such as social or urban planning, spatial development, housing, etcetera, and should also contribute by searching for eco-friendly alternatives. In this advocacy, the theological voice should insist that the natural richness (i.e. rivers, land, dams, nature reserve, parks, and so forth) of Tshwane and its surrounding areas (cf. 9.3.4.2) have to be considered as an indispensable asset, in addition to social, spiritual and other ones, in the socioeconomic development process of Tshwane (S & H). In this way, the process of building a sustainable livelihood of households, communities and the entire city will be based on the assets which already exist in Tshwane (S & H), contrary to what is currently happening, where the natural resources of these townships are not integrated in the development project. As a result, most communities of these townships depend on the government and on outside investors to meet all their basic needs as reported in the description phase of the first mini-consultation (see 6.2.2), the way forward phase of the third mini-consultation (see 7.2.2) and in Chapter 8 (see 8.2.1.1)

Moreover, theology has to acquaint itself with insights from sustainability science about how to respond to sustainable development priorities of South Africa within complex human – environment relationships, which can also be understood in terms of transdisciplinary hermeneutics (cf. Burns & Weaver 2008: 10-12). In my opinion and as argued throughout this study, the oikos concept captures the complexity of human–environment relationships as interdependent, interrelated and belonging together. Humans are part of the environment and vice versa under God, the Creator. The “new” church and its theological enterprise, being inspired by God’s mission, goes in the Name of Christ – Creator – Sustainer – Telos – Reconciler – to seek the welfare and wellbeing of not only humans and but also the rest of the environment or oikos (cf. Col.1: 15-23).

10.2.1.2. The current economic situation and oikomissiology in Tshwane (S & H)

The current economic situation, including the development drive of the CoT (S & H) as reported in empirical findings (i.e. Chapters 6, 7 and 8) and as highlighted in literature (i.e. sections 2.2.2.1.1.5, 2.2.4.4, 4.4 & 4.5) of this research invites and calls for a Christian response – a
hopeful action (cf. Bookless 2007: 47; cf. section 3.3.1). *Missio Dei*, as highlighted above, inspires Christians to engage in hopeful action as being sent by God (cf. Genesis 45:7; Exodus 3:10; 1 Kings 19:15-18; Jeremiah 1:7; Luke 4:16-19; Matthew 10:5-8; Matthew 28:18-20; John 17:18; 20:21; Acts 13:1-3; 2 Corinthians 8:16-24 and so on). This action aims at a holistic salvation / restoration of all fundamental relations to ensure shared prosperity amongst all the inhabitants (humans and non-humans) of S and H. Warmback (2005: 166) contended that a systematic theology, which can make the connection between environmental concerns and economy, is needed. An *oikotheology* / missiology which are based on the *oikos* metaphor make this connection possible (cf. Warmback 2005: 166). The church is supposed to be an instrument of this *oikomissiology*. But first, the church must undergo radical transformation in ways which challenge its traditions so that it gives way to or allows itself to be reformed in order to be remade new and engaged in a “hopeful action” response. With reference to the challenges highlighted hereunder (i.e. section 10.2.1.3) this hopeful action response must be missiologically strong and compelling enough to empower churches in Tshwane (S & H) to critically engage with the incomplete and unsatisfactory effort of the CoT to implement LED. It must also be prophetic enough to enable the churches to be trailblazers for new approaches to LED.

**10.2.1.3 Challenges to anticipate in imagining a “new” Church, mission and LED agenda based on oikos in Tshwane (S & H)**

The process on this new road starts by re-imagining how the church can be involved in God’s mission in the struggling parts of the City of Tshwane, such as Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, in ways which lead to actions whereby whole communities of life flourish in harmony.

For these actions to have any significance, the church in Tshwane must accept and embrace the death of some of its traditions and practices, which could stand in the way of becoming a church that undertakes mission which includes an ecological dimension. A Christian response to the current economic situation is consequential – “allowing the voices of death” to be heard in

---

189 Warmback, in his doctoral thesis, is one of the main contributors to an *oiko-theology* in South Africa, but he collaborated closely with Steve de Gruchy and the team who workshoped the *oikos* and God’s economy before “The Oikos Journey” was finally written. Other South African theologians such as Ernest Conradie and Annalet van Schalkwyk, Sue Rakoczy, Albert Nolan, Russel Botman, to name but a few, have contributed to the development of the *oikos* Theology in South Africa. Their work and that of other international scholars such as Rasmussen, McFague, Deane-Drummond and others is the basis of the *oiko-theology* that, in relation to missiology, I develop in this chapter. I therefore find it appropriate to use the term *oikomissiology* throughout the rest of this thesis.
many aspects of church and faith based ministries. The consequences have a strong effect on methodology. This simply implies that the church, amidst economic injustice and deprivation in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, must consent to “die” (stop doing, or reform, some of the activities that currently preoccupy her life) in order to gain a “new lease on life”. Without this, I contend, it is impossible for these churches to become strategically connected to God’s mission (*missio Dei*) in a practical, effective way. The churches, for example, have to embrace knowledge instead of ignorance, empathy instead of apathy, intellectual creativity instead of intellectual captivity, and foster the ability to transcend the hopeless reality which surrounds them by offering a clear vision for holistic transformation and sustainability. In relation to this study, they have to refocus their mission orientations (cf. 5.7); their strengths (cf. 5.8.1) and their resources and potential for community building (cf. 5.10) so that they become, by their actions and ways of “doing church” in S & H, agents and prophets of holistic economic transformation and sustainability. However, there are consequences for any congregation that opts to embrace transformation and build sustainable communities.

The joint group’s narrative accounts in the third mini-consultation as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.2.1) highlighted some consequences for these churches which, in short, require these churches in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal to be active partisans in an *oikos* value-based, public-prophetic witness which formulates, models and facilitates viable solutions on how to deal with the issues affecting the local economy of Tshwane (S & H). This is admittedly a “new” road or a new mission direction for the church in Tshwane (S & H), at least for the churches that participated in this study, given what was highlighted regarding them in sections 5.8.2 and 5.8.3. It is clear that these churches and the church in Tshwane (S & H) should re-imagine their ways of “doing church” in those townships by mobilising and using their varieties of gifts and services (cf. 1 Cor. 12) to contribute towards the welfare and the common good of the whole of creation as wise and knowledgeable people, faith workers, healers, teachers, prophets, and so forth. All these gifts could be used to reverse the losses of the current ecological crisis and to rebuild LED.

There are a number of challenges to churches, in relation to the response of the ecological crisis, which have to be borne in mind. In his research, Warmback (2005: 168 – 198) amongst other issues, highlights the following: 1) the struggle to make the earth our home because of Christianity’s established “dualism of man and nature and insistence that it is God’s will that man exploit nature for his proper ends” (White 1967: 43, cf. Warmback 2005: 169), 2) Traditional theological resources on themes such as creation, covenant, Jesus and ecclesiastical traditions.
have tended to undervalue the ecological dimension of the environment, and in this respect contribute little towards the construction of an *oikotheology* (p170). Other challenges that Warmback mentions include: 1) interrogating hermeneutic traditions to embrace an eco-hermeneutics which will nurture an eco-friendly praxis, 2) an understanding of the place and role of humans in creation and 3) the absence of the notion of community as central to good economics. These are all challenges which obstruct the emergence of a sound *oikotheology*. In this study I articulate these challenges and others in the different discussions in this chapter, suggesting considerations pertaining to this “new church” consciously positioning herself to work with God for LED as well as ecological wellbeing in Tshwane (S & H).

This research project is not so much concerned with inventing a new church in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. I would instead contend that it deals more with “discovering” this “latent”

church whose members are supposed to be the agents of ecologically understood *missio Dei*. One needs to discern what God is already doing in Tshwane, what God has already given to Tshwane in terms of natural resources and how to co-work with God in God’s mission in the city. I agree with Mashau (2014: 3) that in the city, such as Tshwane, going “*missional, urban, public, virtual and educational* should be the missiological guidelines that underpin the engagement with the hills and valleys of Tshwane”. Later, I will use four of these guidelines i.e. missional, urban, public and educational in relation to the *oikos* concept (see 10.2.3, 10.2.5, 10.2.6 and 10.2.9) in the framework that I sketch herein.

10.2.2 *Shalom for the whole community as the aim of oikomissiology*

*Oikomissiology* aims at *shalom* for the whole community of life. *Shalom* may be described as the fullness of God’s salvation, which means peace in society, wellbeing, enough access to life’s needs and necessities, welfare, health, happiness, security, hope for the future and justice (cf. Van Schalkwyk 1999: 8). Chu Ilo (2011: 98) expands: “it involves justice amongst people [as well as all other living beings] as a result of integral development” and the breaking-off of all kinds of shackles as discussed in section 3.2.1.

Based on the *oikos*, the “new” church should work for *shalom* in ways which sustain the whole community of life (cf. 9.3.4.1 and 9.3.4.2) in Tshwane (S & H), adding to the project of building sustainable communities. Warmback (2005: 168) confirms “that eradicating poverty had a strong link to the environment in terms of producing food based on a wise use of the land” for

---

190 I am convinced that a caricature (in intrinsic quality or residual state) of this church exists but is not yet developed or manifest; it is hidden or concealed.
example. This implies that an ecologically understood missio Dei will certainly contribute to the realisation of shalom in Tshwane (S & H). Missio Dei and oikomissiology collaborate for shalom.

In relation to Soshanguve and Hammanskraal townships, this “new” church, as part of its involvement in missio Dei, has to ensure that sustainable urbanisation and LED programmes are prioritised so that these townships’ upgrades, land use patterns, transportation and current assets as discussed in sections 4.3.3.1 & 4.3.3.2 as well as the smart city strategy of the city discussed in section 4.5.2, are sustainably implemented to achieve collective wellbeing and shared prosperity in the city. The involvement of the church in Tshwane (S & H) in missio Dei should inescapably also be about care, protection and preservation of the earth.

10.2.3 Church’s assets for oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

All church assets (see section 3.2.2) should be intentionally employed towards the realisation of sustainable communities and sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H). The prevailing attitude, whereby the church’s assets are mobilised with an inward intention to benefit humans only, should be reformed and abandoned. The “new” church in Tshwane (S & H) and its ministries should ensure that all the assets it possesses (cf. section 5.8.1) are invested in giving, maintaining and propagating life holistically in such a manner as to benefit all the inhabitants of the oikos. Building on Nürnberger (1999: 372) and section 3.2.2, I contend that the “new” church’s engagement in this way will mean that it has to move beyond 1) a spiritual concept of salvation which neglects social and ecological concerns, 2) an inflexible orthodoxy which simply spiritualises human needs and neglects the needs of other inhabitants of the earth and offers stereotyped spiritual recipes and 3) a tendency to withdraw into cosy and homogenous in-groups which shun challenges and conflicts.

Rooted in the oikos concept, this “new” church in Tshwane (S & H) will develop a holistic concept of salvation which includes spiritual, social, political – on the local level – economic and ecological concerns. It should also include the needs of all the inhabitants of Tshwane (S & H) and their needs for living life to the full (cf. John 10:10) as God intended in harmony with the earth. Living life to the full as God intended is shalom. Moreover, it should act in the public sphere using all its assets as one of the viable co-workers with others such as sustainability scientists, sustainable development experts and practitioners and the like, to champion the vision of building sustainable communities and sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H).
10.2.4 Biblical impulses and the scope of the church’s involvement in *oikomissiology* and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

Biblical impulses and the scope of the church’s involvement in integral mission were discussed in section 3.2.3 (cf. Grigg 1984: 81). It was also acknowledged that other theological concepts / themes such as God’s presence with the poor (i.e. 3.2.4); incarnation (i.e. 3.2.5); witness in the public sphere (i.e. 3.2.6); transformation and liberation (i.e. 3.2.7); Christian social ethics (i.e. 3.2.8) and the church as an alternative community (i.e. 3.2.9) encourage the church to be involved in development. Nevertheless, there are difficulties and shortcomings whenever these impulses and concepts are embedded in anthropocentrism as has been the case with the development project of Tshwane (cf. 2.2.2.1). In *oikomissiology*, these themes are re-interpreted from the *oikos* perspective so that *shalom* is realised for the whole of creation.

Warmback (2005: 170 – 171) contended that themes such as creation, covenant, Jesus and ecclesiastical traditions need to be interrogated to provide a more comprehensive approach to the environment. In relation to creation he points out “that all has been created by God implies a sense of specialness, of sacredness. This helps us see the need to value and to preserve all aspects of our world” (p171). Therefore, “the tendency in theological thinking [which] has been to associate God's concern for the world only with human beings” (p171) must be abandoned so that a holistic *oikomissiology* could emerge. In relation to covenant, he argued that the “Noahic covenant is one that embraces more than the human community. God’s covenant in Genesis 9 is a covenant with *all* creation. This is helpful in showing God's strong concern for all elements of life; and helps re-inforce the lasting value of all of creation” (p171, cf. Romans 8). With reference to the Lord Jesus, he pointed out, “Jesus shows an intimacy and familiarity with a variety of God's creatures and also the processes of nature” (p171) – praying on the hills, teaching on the shores of the Sea of Galilee and on a mountainside. In short, Warmback (2005: 171) makes the point that “in his life and teaching Jesus expressed a strong concern for those who were poor. Yet his concern for people was not divorced from an interest in and relationship with the non-human world”. This is Jesus’ sense of an all-encompassing *Ubuntu* – the covenant of living in justice and peace with all of creation. The focus on anthropocentric progress and concerns alone is to the detriment of sustainability and its concerns for collective wellbeing and shared prosperity (i.e. *shalom*). Hence, I have contended for an *oikos*-based development and missiology, which has the potential to “usher in” sustainable LED plus sustainable communities by reinforcing partnership, interdependency and cooperation between all the inhabitants of the
A “new” or “renewed” church is needed for this project. The “new” church will advance the kingdom of God – or the household of God \textit{(oikos)} – to include ecology.

\textbf{10.2.4.1 Kingdom-advancing churches or Going missional and oikos}

More is required for these churches in Tshwane (S & H) than just being mission-minded churches\textsuperscript{191}. Kingdom-advancing churches are required for God’s mission (Miller & Allen 2008: 3; see 1.7.3). They work for the \textit{shalom} of the whole of society including its ecology. They are called to implement the “whole will of God” (Acts 20: 27; cf. Wright 2010: 24). They are also referred to as missional churches (McNeil 2009: xvi; Mashau 2014: 4). According to McNeal (2009: xvi) going missional requires of a person or a group to make three shifts, both in their thinking and in their behaviour: (1) from internal to external in terms of ministry focus; (2) from programme development to people development in terms of core activity; and (3) from church-based to kingdom-based in terms of leadership agenda (see also Mashau 2014: 4). Central to going missional or kingdom-advancing is the fact that the individual and the community of believers cannot be comfortable with a privatised spirituality which is “readily accepted in Africa as part of the church circle. That may explain the widespread dilemma that the church is growing strongly in Africa, but with little impact on the urgent questions of the continent, such as poverty, violence and corruption” (Van Niekerk 2014: 3) and including the environmental crisis (cf. Adeyemi et al. 2015).

Therefore, based on the above, an \textit{oikos}-based kingdom-advancing agenda is suitable for the church in Tshwane (S & H). Environmental aspects related to matters such as mining, agriculture, unpolluted water, redistribution of land and the like become theological / missiological issues that with which the churches in Tshwane have to wrestle in their involvement in \textit{missio Dei}. The \textit{oikos} metaphor provides us with awareness of how the ecological and social problems and opportunities of the CoT can operate in relation to each other in the search for a just and sustainable way of life in our society, including LED. In the quest for sustainable human settlement in Tshwane (S & H) which aims at equity and efficiency in resource allocation and utilisation of local organisations and institutions, the church has to

\textsuperscript{191} According to Mashau (2014: 3), mission-minded churches (1) are sensitive and considerate in as far as the agenda of mission is concerned, but still treat it as a peripheral activity of the church, (2) they normally collect money, pray for a missionary abroad, and expect reports from time to time so that they can continue to raise more funds for the missionary (foreign mission), (3) some of these churches always look for opportunities to appease their conscience for not taking matters of mission seriously by engaging in what we call chequebook mission, and (4) some of these churches will have what we call mission commissions in their midst – and encourage the spirit of engaging in one or many mission projects.
ensure that sustainable development is prioritised (cf. Huyssteen & Oranje 2008: 507). The whole community of life is integrated, including all natural resources, in the establishment of a sustainable human settlement. It should be recognised, suggest Huyssteen & Oranje (2008: 528), that “planning and sustainability [should] share the same aim which is to promote the sustainability of social-ecological systems”.

10.2.4.2 Covenant, kingdom advancing churches’ practical approach and oikomissiology

For the purpose of a Christian contribution to the manifestation of the household of God or kingdom of God, the church in Tshwane (S & H) has to become a lived out expression of what God’s economy could look like in this situation. In covenant with God, the churches in Tshwane (S & H) have to imagine a theology of mission befitting their immediate contexts as they “are commissioned to spread the blessing of Abraham” (Wright 2010: 72, cf. Genesis 12: 2) in their communities by also drawing on the ecological wealth and opportunities which exist in Tshwane. Kritzinger’s (2008) praxis matrix used earlier in Chapter 5 is an insightful resource which could enable the churches to take their contexts seriously. The praxis matrix is “a Missiological approach that discerns contextual priorities by consciously integrating the theology and practice of mission” (Kritzinger 2013a:37) as I have attempted to do in this research.

This approach should receive its life-giving “breath” and spirit (and wings) from the missio Dei and its “roots” in the oikos values, so as to lead the churches to contribute to sustainable LED which gives and sustains life, prosperity, and the like for all humans and non-humans of Tshwane (S & H). It implies that the church in Tshwane (S & H) has to embrace and participate in the planetary or oikos agenda192 tabled in section 3.3.2.4 (cf. McFague 1993: 8 – 12, see also Rasmussen 1996: 107) as part of its endeavour to incarnate God’s mission in these townships.

10.2.5 God’s presence with the poor, oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

---

192 I first came across the term planetary agenda in the work of Henderson (1984) and in relation to theology in the works of ecofeminist theologian McFague (1993) and eco-theologian Rasmussen (1996). This agenda is about to lay to rest the old economic formula which consists of inputs to production (incorrectly stated) as land, labour and capital. It instead promotes the future formula which is that of a minimum-entropy society where the inputs are capital, resources and knowledge. The output of this society will be healthy people, healthy bioregions on a peaceful, healthy, equitable, ecologically viable planet. This will not require any harder effort than the present striving to destroy. Pieces of the new planetary agenda are becoming evident everywhere in the world. Alternatives are emerging from the world’s ethnic and indigenous peoples, from subsistence cultures and traditional wisdom; from the world’s women and from the rising female principle (see Henderson, H. 1984: 64 – 70).
The theological concept of God’s presence with the poor which has shaped contextual theologies of mission and development was discussed in section 3.2.4; in relation to the oikos I argued that we can only be fully human if we completely identify with God’s reflection in ourselves – God’s presence in creation – the rest of the oikos on which we depend for life. Oikomissiology expands the notion of “poor” to include human and other living beings of the earth (cf. Boff 1997); it therefore includes the liberation of all other poor living beings of the household of God as discussed under 10.2.1.

10.2.6 Incarnation, oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

Development, including LED, designed after God’s model of incarnation is, among other features, about giving recognition to and sweating and bleeding with the victims of oppression (see section 3.2.5). Within the oikos framework, LED in Tshwane (S & H) could be modelled after incarnation and creation (see McFague 1993) in order to facilitate the shared prosperity that the oikos promotes. The church in Tshwane (S & H) should therefore initiate hopeful actions to address the misery of both human and nonhuman victims of oppression in the prevailing economic system so that sustainable development is realised. This incarnation has to be contextualised in the current urban setting of S & H.

10.2.6.1 Urban, LED and the oikos

The church is increasingly becoming urban; the mission focus can only become urban. In fact, “the milestone was passed around 2008 where over half the world’s population was [for the first time] urban” (Hildreth 2014: 3, see also Pier 2013). The City of Tshwane is 92.3% urbanised (Statistics South Africa 2011). The “arrival of people in a city often accelerates the growth of informal settlements” (Keith 2013: 4) as is being experienced on the outskirts of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. Adeyemi et al. (2015: 351 - 365) indicate that this urban sprawl in Tshwane has led to the conversion of natural lands into large human-made landscapes, i.e. an increase in impervious surfaces and a decrease in vegetation cover. These land cover changes are thought to have a correlation with the heat waves Tshwane experienced in 2013 and 2014.

Furthermore, it has been established that “the great 21st-century migration into cities will present both a great challenge for humanity and a significant opportunity for global economic growth” (Keith 2013: 2) and for mission. Therefore, as rightly articulated by The Cape Town Commitment of the Lausanne Movement: “cities ought to lie at the heart of any 21st century strategy for global mission” (Hildreth 2014: 2). Hence, it is illogical, as Mashau (2014: 4) put it,
to “imagine a church [in the city] that does not take seriously its calling to engage urban principalities and powers that harm or destroy people’s lives; such a church will never make any serious inroads in terms of impacting and transforming the community that it serves”. The church in the city has to learn from Apostle Paul, the urban evangelist and missionary, about doing mission to the metropolises (Bosch 1991: 129 – 131). This mission should go beyond anthropocentric concerns to include ecological concerns – i.e. oikomissiology.

Furthermore, the joint group’s reflection as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.2.1) suggests that for a viable Christian response to the current situation to emerge, the church in Tshwane (S & H) has to engage in political/public theology of mission focussed on sustainable LED, as well as that this response has to be embedded in prophetic witness geared to the entire spectrum of the whole household of God on this earth or oikos, including the rapidly expanding urban areas of Tshwane.

As Adeyemi et al. (2015) have pointed out, it is clear that the current expansions in Tshwane are not sensible in the way they use the natural resources on which all its inhabitants rely, wisely and sustainably. As an example, it is thought that Tshwane has experienced increased heat. If the trend continues, it might drastically affect agricultural production, animal and human health, rivers, vegetation, land, and so on. Therefore, I suggest the church in these rapidly expanded urban areas of Tshwane must offer a vision for a sustainable future based on the oikos to promote and support life, work, shared prosperity, nature conservation and human settlement in harmony with the earth. This suggestion is pertinent for a transformative oikomissiology in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. Social and ecclesial analyses as undertaken in this research (see Chapters 4 & 5) are therefore crucial lenses through which to “read” the public sphere. These analyses unearth insights, stories, opportunities, difficulties, and the like which are useful for strategy, as I experienced and learned in this research.

It is evident from the foregoing that a transformative urban oikomissiology agenda for LED in Tshwane (S & H) has to be broad and holistic enough to include issues of social193 and political194 ecology for example. Urban churches have to wrestle with analysis of complex public

---

193 Social ecology is preoccupied by the interactions within the social, institutional, and cultural contexts of people-environment relations that make-up well-being (see http://socialecology.uci.edu/core/what-social- ecology accessed 26 May 2016).

194 Political ecology analyses social forms and human organisation that interact with the environment. Political ecology encompasses the issues of the clash of individual interests and the potential for collusion that lie at the heart of political economy, and ecology’s concerns with our biological and physical
issues related to economy, anthropology, ecology, sociology, history, geography, development studies, education and the like as they endeavour to participate in *missio Dei* in Tshwane’s *oikos* (S & H). Given this complexity, prescriptions from uni-disciplinary research must be resisted (cf. Burns & Weaver 2008: 12). The focus, as it is in social ecology, should be on the centrality of context in understanding the different and persistent ills that Soshanguve and Hammanskraal are faced with, bearing in mind that these townships remain as particular communities despite the popular wisdom that the globalised world is now everywhere flat as I argued earlier (cf. 2.1.1.3 & 2.1.3).

10.2.7 Transformation and liberation in relation to *oikomissiology* and sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H)

In Tshwane (S & H) where vegetation cover and surface areas are becoming impoverished as a result of the conversion of natural lands into large man-made landscapes in terms of poorly planned human settlements (cf. Adeyemi et al. 2015), missiology / theology must admit that God’s creation is being stripped of its beauty, value and integrity. God’s presence in creation is therefore hurting because the natural resources are being rendered poor to meet the needs of humans. This discipline must also admit that the whole of creation is sacred and good (cf. Genesis 1 – 2) and that it is all part of God’s household.

The church in Tshwane (S & H) should therefore defend the human and nonhuman poor and advocate that the bounty of the earth has to be enjoyed sustainably or in harmony with the earth. For example, it must protect the Apies River from pollution and contamination and the nature reserve around the Tswaing meteor crater from deforestation and the like so that these natural resources continue to provide homes, materials and food to fauna, flora and humans. This could be one of the most practical ways the church could contribute in safeguarding life on the earth. Cundill and Fabricus (2008: 537 – 567) suggest co-management of ecosystems under resource-poor conditions: “Co-management of ecosystems relies on several stakeholders or organisations working together to manage natural assets” (p 537). The church in Tshwane (S & H) should be one of these organisations on the ground.

It was acknowledged that the chief goal of development and social change is to transform structures of oppression and to build a world of justice and dignity for all humans, while transformation without liberation is futile (see sections 2.2.2.2.2 & 3.2.7). In relation to the *oikos* environment and emphases on holistic analysis that connect with the more social and power-centred field of political economy (see [http://www.ejolt.org/2013/02/political-ecology/](http://www.ejolt.org/2013/02/political-ecology/) accessed 26 May 2016).
this goal has to go beyond the anthropocentric concern that preoccupied the prevailing development agenda to include the whole community of life in the oikos. Transformation and liberation should aim at transforming structures of oppression and building a world of justice and dignity for all the inhabitants of the oikos in a sustainable manner in Tshwane (S & H). The oikos values and goals and framework provide us with the clues on how this transformed and liberating LED will look when sustainability becomes the central goal of the economy. Butkus and Kolmes (2011: 171 – 172) state that key social and economic points which correspond with a vision for a sustainable future must include: 1) restraint in consumption, 2) efficiency in resource utilisation, 3) option for the poor and authentic development and 4) personal liberation and social-institutional transformation. These points dovetail with the oikos values.

10.2.7.1 The oikos framework goes against the prevailing anthropocentric concern

According to White (1967) Christianity in its Western form is the most anthropocentric religion the world has seen. The oikos framework goes against this prevailing anthropocentric focus of development in the current neoliberal capitalistic system and calls for a religious reformation of some sort. Oikomissiology will help us to correct this tendency by seeking to integrate and highlight interdependency as related to creation, liberation, reconstruction or rebuilding, and working to produce and distribute the bounty of the land to all its inhabitants. This causes it to stand out for me as a viable alternative value framework for missiology in Tshwane (S & H) because in this framework, a better holistic life for all inhabitants plus meaningful work plus optimal production plus rest plus shared prosperity are real possibilities without harming the ecosystem. Thus, oikomissiology motivates one to reform existing praxis frameworks used by churches, as discovered in Chapter 5 (section 5.6), which place more emphasis on the word and less on community involvement. Embracing the oikos values will amount to considering the death of many aspects of the current church’s praxis in order for this oikomissiology framework to emerge.

The joint group’s reflection on the oikos biblical framework as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.3) highlighted the values / goals which come from The Oikos Journey and which are in essence the goals of a sustainable LED which oikomissiology has to promote in Tshwane (S & H). These values and goals are revisited later in section 10.4. Nonetheless, Christian mission in general and, in particular, oikomissiology in relation to LED in Tshwane (S & H) has to seek to understand the urban challenge in this context. Unfortunately, as rightly pointed out by Hildreth:
Christian reflection on the urban challenge has often jumped far too quickly to the practice of mission within the city, and so has lacked adequate research and understanding of the nature of the urban context (Hildreth 2014: 3)

*Oikomissiology* corrects this shortcoming by giving Christian praxis hints for a broader reflection on the challenges facing peripheral townships such as S & H: this reflection has to bring into focus, in an integrated manner, issues pertaining to creation as a whole, liberation, reconstruction and rebuilding, and production and equitable distribution of the bounty of the land to all its inhabitants under the “Lordship of the Incarnate Christ”. The envisaged *oikomissiology* will help us to achieve that integration. In relation to the oikos concept, De Gruchy (2007: 2) regards liberation and creation as intertwined in the African context (see 3.3.2) and one may add that the oikos may help us to understand and broaden Ubuntu in good relations – “I am because we are” – between members of the whole creation (cf. LenkaBula 2008).

**10.2.7.2 Oikomissiology, the kingdom of God and the Incarnate Christ**

De Gruchy (2007: 7) contends:

> God’s incarnation in Jesus is a powerful proclamation of his continuing commitment to God’s economy of freedom. The Kingdom of God deepens and broadens the idea of the Promised Land so that it relates not just to a small geographic space in the Middle East, but to the earth as a whole. That is why Jesus taught us to pray, “Thy Kingdom come on earth …”

An alternative oikos-based economic model is inevitably transformative and kingdom-based in that it encompasses the whole household of God or the whole earth. Thus, the oikos is embedded in the call for integral theology of mission (cf. Wright 2010: 26 – 27; see also section 3.3.2). The whole of creation is embraced, including ecosystems like cities and the bushveld – bearing in mind that creation is at the heart of God, that God cares very deeply for the whole of creation and that God is both in creation and holding it. This is even more so, in a sense, for human beings which play such a special role as caregivers to ecology. It is likely therefore that the Creator has lavished human beings with extra love and attention – and salvation – so that they can learn how to take care of creation and save it from degradation. Because, as Butkus and Kolmes (2011: 165) contend, “eschatological redemption incorporates the hope of a new creation” (cf. Revelation 21:5, Isaiah 65:17). *Oikomissiology* can help us to start working in anticipation of this new creation in Tshwane (S & H).
*Missio Dei* resonates with the *oikos* paradigm (see section 3.3.2.2); God’s mission includes the whole of creation (cf. Bookless 2008: 97). The *oikos* paradigm provides us with the rules (*oikonomos*) which should govern God’s creation, the *oikos*. McFague’s metaphorical yet practical theology of the body of God speaks to this intricate maze between God’s mission and care of creation (cf. McFague 1993) whereby “God is incarnate in Jesus of Nazareth” (Butkus & Kolmes 2011: 156), as declares John 1:14. Therefore, Conradie (2010: 386) is in agreement when he contends that “all forms of missionary engagement should include an ecological dimension – as it would include a financial, gendered or developmental dimension”.

In Tshwane (S & H), participating in God’s mission focussed on LED is *ipso facto* concerned with taking care of creation. The church incarnate should be an example of the message of the incarnate Christ as far as taking care of creation is concerned. In relation to the purpose of Pentecost, Oswald Chambers (1992) contends in a devotional that “the purpose [of Pentecost] was to make them [disciples] the incarnation of what they preached so that that they would literally become God’s message in the flesh”\(^{195}\). *Oikomissiology* and the guidelines deriving from the *oikos* framework provide the township church in Tshwane (S & H) with hints on how to become such a message to these townships in matters of LED.

### 10.2.8 Oikomissiology, LED and Christian social ethics in Tshwane (S & H)

In section 3.2.8 it was acknowledged that development from the church’s perspective cannot escape the issue of ethical considerations in terms of working to restore “what ought to be”. In the presence of the current economy which breeds poverty and marginalisation of weaker members of society, including nonhumans, the *oikos* inspires us to embrace a Christian social ethic associated with LED, which should work towards “what ought to be”, that is harmony in our relationship with God – fellow humans – the rest of creation. Butkus and Kolmes (2011: 165) suggest that utilising an ecological hermeneutic and interpreting the biblical narrative through the lens of our ecological crisis is not only what ought to be done but also allows us to “reappropriate the ecological motif of God’s design for redemption”. This is one of the important contributions that *oikomissiology* makes to the theology of mission.

LED activity is profoundly an ethical issue as it relates to the use of natural resources. Work to produce bread should be performed sustainably. The bounty of the earth has to sustain all the

---

inhabitants of the earth. Christian social ethics viewed through an ecological lens should guide us to consider the right thing to do in relation to both economic and ecological concerns.

Other roles communities expect the church to play include upholding ethics and morals in relation to the oikos. With reference to corruption, Vorster writes:

> The church functions amongst the rich, the poor and the poorest of the poor. Christians have a first-hand knowledge of the social ills of societies. They function in all spheres of life – in government, civil society and informal societal structures. The churches are in an excellent position to raise awareness of the problem of corruption and its negative effects on society (Vorster 2012: 141)

Further, Vorster (2012: 140) argues, “the church should support all legal measures taken by the authorities to prevent corruption and should fulfil the role of a ‘watchdog’ and a whistle blower in their monitoring role of public administration and the administration of justice”. Vorster’s argument is pertinent, but I consider that some sectors of the church have to deal with their own selfishness and financial maladministration first before they can be considered as having moral authority. As participants stated in the narrative accounts (see section 7.1.1) the church has not succeeded in morally and spiritually influencing the members of the church in public offices. Nevertheless, Keller (2010: 158) argues: “believers have many of the criteria for a righteous and just life laid out in the Bible”. Vorster adds:

> Although it is not the task of churches to interfere in the sphere of the authority of government, the churches have a public role to play. Christians and the church are called as public witnesses (Smit, 2007:153; see also Koopman & Smit, 2007:269). As the people of God’s Kingdom, the main task of the church regarding social problems lies within the domain of ethics (Vorster 2012: 140)

Drawing from the oikos values, oikomissiology will help us to foster an ethical, value based response to the socio-economic-ecological concerns of Tshwane (S & H).

**10.2.9 Church as an alternative community, oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)**

It was discussed in section 3.2.9 that “the primary alternative community is the church (both in its local and broader senses)” (Gill 2006: 634). It was also pointed out that development work by the church has aimed, amongst other things, to point to alternatives resulting from processes of
discernment which should hopefully lead to “another way” of dealing with complex socioeconomic issues facing humanity today. I add that the church as an alternative community for oikos-based development in Tshwane (S & H) has to lead the way towards sustainability in the CoT (S & H), which appears to have opted for a development agenda that mainly prioritised economic growth and neoliberal–based modernity, failing to build sustainable communities and sustainable development. Oikomissiology will help the church in Tshwane (S &H) to bolster its identity as an alternative community which promotes sustainability through theological education and by insisting on repentance from sin associated with the current economic system of marginalisation, exploitation and exclusion.

10.3 Towards a new church’s perspective on development in Tshwane (S & H)

In section 3.3 it was emphasised that the church’s vision for development is beyond material prosperity and modernity and that any task towards social change, including development, necessitates a well thought out holistic and integrated approach. One of the considerations in a church’s perspective is on improving the quality of social (and spiritual), political and economic (and environmental) relationships. Oikomissiology, which has an intrinsic predisposition to restore and harmonise fundamental relations of life between God and humans and nature, where all inhabitants of the planet prosper, will help us to restore relations and ensure sustainable LED.

Employing the lens of oikomissiology, I propose that the LED agenda of Tshwane (S & H) be broadened to become a “sustainable way of good life for humanity and for our planet” which should permeate all spheres of life such as government, education, health, economy, science, industry, nutrition and agriculture. This is a perennial proposal aimed at realising sustainability as the fundamental goal in life. The church’s vision must focus on this goal.

10.3.1 Oikomissiology, relational restoration and LED Tshwane (S & H)

According to Butkus and Kolmes (2011: 4) “broken relationships – between human and human, human and earth, human and God” – are one of the causes of environmental crisis. In relation to the pursuit of ecojustice, they elaborate that central to “ecojustice is the emphasis on relationality: on the one hand with God (…), and on the other hand, with the natural world”. Oikomissiology as a framework will inspire individual Christians and the church to develop an attitude of relationality. Butkus and Kolmes (2011: 136) expand:
The gracefulness of persons who embody [relationality] is seen in their inclusive practice of justice for human beings and the wellbeing of their Earth and all its inhabitants, as well as in their capacity to see the intrinsic connection between social and ecological justice.

In short, oikomissiology will help us to realise both social and ecological justice in Tshwane (S & H) and in turn harmonise LED which should benefit all communities so that a sustainable, healthy life for humanity and for our planet is realised.

10.3.2 Oikomissiology, participation in the planetary agenda and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

The church, as the instrument of missio Dei, has a wide range of roles it is expected to play towards collective wellbeing and prosperity as discussed in section 3.2.3. This was affirmed in the literature and in the narrative accounts in Chapters 6 and 7, as pointed out by the joint group’s reflection. This, as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.3), suggests that the roles of the church towards LED are: 1) to implement the teaching of the Bible in concrete ways by becoming strategically involved in the communities for the purpose of LED, 2) becoming involved in addressing socioeconomic issues affecting communities, 3) acting out in faith, 4) fostering a type of spirituality which enable it to deal with real community issues in concrete ways (practical spirituality), 5) taking the lead towards transformation in society. It has to take the lead to see new things and to start dreaming about an alternative vision for society and 6) to be like “cement that is holding the society together” – a cohesive bulwark amidst the economic crisis we are facing in the CoT (S & H).

From the foregoing, I deduce that the church can foster virtue, rights and actions for common good in its praxis as a co-worker in missio Dei for holistic justice and collective wellbeing in Tshwane (S & H) in support of the planetary agenda. It should not uncritically adopt a socioeconomic and political agenda which breeds injustice, marginalisation of the inhabitants of the oikos. Rather, it should work and embody justice in the public sphere as well as in individuals in ways which model examples of Christian-based LED practice as practically described in Chapter 11 (section 11.2.2). Sandel (2009: 261) elaborates: “justice is not only about the right way to distribute things. It is also about the right way to value things”. Oikomissiology understands that creation has integrity and value. It is therefore best suited to help the church to integrate an earth perspective which is grounded in eco-justice principles\textsuperscript{196} in

\textsuperscript{196} There are six eco-justice principles which have significance in relation to interpretation of the Bible. I name them here without elaboration:

1. The Principle of Intrinsic Worth: The universe, Earth, and all its components have intrinsic worth/value.
reading the Bible, such as those developed by the Earth Bible project (cf. Deane-Drummond 2008: 89; see also Warmback 2005: 177 - 178). These principles are helpful in the construction of oikomissiology in Tshwane (S & H). Other eco-justice insights could also be accessed from resources developed by ecclesial bodies such as the Association of African Earthkeeping Churches (AAEC), Southern African Faith Communities Environmental Institute (SAFCEI), Third Lausanne Congress on World Evangelization, Evangelical Environmental Network, Catholic social teaching on creation care and the World Council of Churches.

In short, in order to achieve a sustainable life for humanity and for our planet, oikomissiology will be able to help the church and its members in Tshwane (S & H) to make sustainability mainstream in their mission praxis geared to LED. In a practical way and in view of the current ecological degradation, this also means participating in the planetary agenda (see 3.3.2.4): everybody everywhere has to participate for the wellbeing of the whole of creation, so as to contribute to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development – which is a global plan of action for people, planet and prosperity – on the one hand and on the other, to participate in missio Dei using tangible methods in Tshwane (S & H).

10.3.3 Role/s of ministers and lay leaders in the ecological and LED agenda of the churches in Tshwane (S & H)

10.3.3.1 Training

It was acknowledged and discussed in section 2.1.4.4 that the current development trend is unsustainable because associated with the market mechanism which generates environmental problems, including the negative externalities of pollution, the subordination of weak interests that cannot be expressed in terms of money, and failure to supply collective goods, such as a healthy and safe environment. It was also recognised that there is the need to promote Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) as a vital ingredient for fostering sustainability. Insights from oikomissiology will be infused into this training.

2. The Principle of Interconnectedness: Earth is a community of inter-connected living things that are mutually dependent on each other for life and survival.
3. The Principle of Voice: Earth is a living entity capable of raising its voice in celebration and against injustice.
4. The Principle of Purpose: The universe, Earth and all its components are a part of a dynamic cosmic design within which each piece has a place in the overall of that design.
5. The Principle of Mutual Custodianship: Earth is a balanced and diverse domain where responsible custodians can function as partners with, rather than rulers over, Earth to sustain its balance and a diverse Earth community.
The church in Tshwane (S & H) is therefore required to set-up informal, formal and lifelong training content based on ESD to help communities to address different priorities and issues such as water, energy, climate change and disaster and risk reduction, loss of biodiversity, food crises, health risks, social vulnerability and insecurity.

10.3.3.2 Role of ministers, lay leaders and ordinary church members

Bosch (1991: 472) elucidates: “lay persons are no longer just the scouts (…) [who] report to the ‘operational base’, they are the operational basis from which the *missio Dei* proceeds”. So, ministers and lay leaders including ordinary church members will have to share ministry which integrates all modes: *kerygma, diakonia, koinonia and liturgia* (see Kritzinger et al. 1994) in their mission to address unemployment and a lack of sustainable methods of making a living in Tshwane (S & H). The whole church is called to exercise love for its neighbour (Matthew 22:35 - 39) including nonhumans. Insights from Van Aarde (2008: 1226 – 1227) in relation to public theology are also helpful in discerning the roles of ministers and laity in the public sphere of LED. These roles could be located in the “fusion between public theology and contextual theology”. He further elaborates:

> The difference between ecclesial and contextual theology is mainly the fact that the one is practised from the perspectives of ecclesial doctrines and interests, whereas the other does theology on grassroots level to benefit the marginalized in society. Contextual theology still operates as though institutional religion is the agent of hope. Public theology, on the other hand, represents spirituality irrespective of the existence or the role of institutionalized religion (Van Aarde 2008: 1226-1227).

The roles of ministers and lay people will, at the same time, be inspired by the *oikos* concept, ecclesial doctrines and interests as they develop a contextual and public theology appropriate in their situations of the peripheral township economy and the absence of sustainable livelihoods. This will require reflexivity, discernment and adjustment in their praxis so that, as Moltmann (1975: 11)\(^\text{197}\) put it, the ministry “will be directed not only toward divine service in the church, but also toward divine service to the everyday life of the world”.

---

\(^{197}\) Jurgen Moltmann, a German theologian, was also one of the earliest eco-theologians in the ecumenical church. He has made significant contributions to a number of areas of Christian theology, including systematic theology, eschatology, ecclesiology, political theology, Christology, pneumatology, and the theology of creation. His two most famous works are *Theology of Hope* and *The Crucified God* (http://www.foxchristian.com/jurgen-moltmann/homepage.html)
According to the joint group’s reflection as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.2.1), the roles of ministers and the laity with reference to addressing unemployment include: 1) Drawing from a Christian value framework, educate and train people to change their mind-set and perception about work, starting with Christians in church who will in turn do likewise in the communities and 2) mobilising the laity and clergy and all the available resources and assets to support and implement this faith-based LED endeavour. As stated in the previous paragraph, these roles will require the churches in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal to reflect on and discern ways of developing a contextual and public oikomissiology appropriate to their contexts. In tandem with missio Dei, these roles should integrate the principles of sustainable economies (see 1.7.5), the planetary agenda (see 3.3.2.4) and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development concerns and goals (see 3.3.2.2).

10.3.4 Oikomissiology, sustainability and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

Sustainability should be the fundamental governing principle in oikomissiology in Tshwane (S & H) in order to attain a sustainable life for humanity and our planet. This is only possible when conscious economic and other socio-political activities on earth are inspired and governed by sustainability as the goal. It requires a re-arranging of our life as we have come to experience it by adopting an ecological and holistic worldview. For this goal, McFague (2001: 33) suggests an “ecological theology” – a theology which is not just for nature but for the entire cosmos with all its creatures, human and otherwise. Warmback (2005) refers to this as oikotheology and with particular reference to missiology I have called it oikomissiology in this study. This oikomissiology will help us in our participation in missio Dei and lead us to imagine the way forward into the future which could result in the realisation of a sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H).

Oikomissiology will also motivate the church to imagine a bottom-up approach; a “glocal” oikos-based LED process to be envisaged for this dream of a sustainable way of life for humanity and our planet in Tshwane (S & H). This dream is the confluence of insights in practical / praxis theology / missiology, developed by academically trained missiologists, but in this thesis especially to be realised by local well-resourced faith-based / church-based practitioners of LED who are well equipped in their praxis knowledge of oikomissiology. Insights from sustainability science, the principles of sustainable economy, the planetary agenda, LED, social ecology as
well as political ecology and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development⁹⁸ as related to Tshwane (S & H) and the National Development Plan⁹⁹ 2030 are useful in this dream. Theology / missiology cannot fulfil this dream alone; no single discipline or entity can on its own. It calls all sectors into a partnership and collaboration so that sustainability is embraced by all for our common future. The aims and goals of this dream are the same as those of the oikos values as encapsulated in section 10.2.2. The dream stimulates a profound and radical change to our current lifestyle:

For example, the whole city, which includes S & H, has to consider enhancing sustainability by opting for the following basic eco-friendly considerations:

1) Based on the research results of Adeyemi, A et al. (2015), we must restore the vegetative cover by getting each household to plant a tree and provide a vegetative cover for the soil portion they occupy. I suggest, in the interest of water conservation, that whatever trees are planted, are indigenous.

2) Transition from green to sustainable materials use (see Ampofo-Anti 2014) – for communities and individuals who are already green conscious.

3) Use and rely on solar and wind power to build cheaper conventional power stations (see Bischof-Niemz 2015)

4) Wright and Godfrey (2010) suggest we work together to improve environmental health through simple interventions such as:

   safe household water storage, better hygiene measures by providing toilets and maintaining efficient waste water removal, improved water resource management, the use of cleaner and safer fuels, increased safety of the built environment, more careful use of toxic substances in the home and workplace, reinforce environmental health

⁹⁸ 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development is a 17 goal plan of action for people, planet and prosperity. It also seeks to strengthen universal peace in larger freedom. It recognises that eradicating poverty in all its forms and dimensions, including extreme poverty, is the greatest global challenge and an indispensable requirement for sustainable development. A detailed elaboration can be accessed from (https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/21252030%20Agenda%20for%20Sustainable%20Development%20web.pdf)

⁹⁹ The National Development Plan 2030 South Africa aims to eliminate poverty and reduce inequality by 2030. According to the plan, South Africa can realise these goals by drawing on the energies of its people, growing an inclusive economy, building capabilities, enhancing the capacity of the state, and promoting leadership and partnerships throughout society. See http://www.gov.za/issues/national-development-plan-2030
strategy and policy to provide critically-needed direction, environmental health education to inform people of how best to interact with their environment and remain healthy.

5) Finding value in waste by identifying opportunities for growth in a secondary resources economy. Godfrey (2015: 4) elaborates:

The South African waste sector provides an opportunity to: 1) recover valuable materials to return back into a local manufacturing economy (strengthening the local economy), 2) create new jobs in an emerging secondary resources economy, 3) create job opportunities for low skilled, unemployed citizens through low barriers to entry, establish new enterprises, including co-operatives and SMMEs, and 4) stimulate a local Green Economy.

6) Building sustainably implies buildings should blend into the environment. Van Wyk (2007: 6) explains: “they should be multifunctional in use but ‘invisible’ to the passer-by. This includes economic, social, environmental, ecological and technological capital, as well as the building’s impact on the environment”.

The foregoing highlights that there are various broad issues to consider in a dream of building sustainable communities and economies. A practicable sustainable economy at household level (i.e. an urban homestead) and how the church could play a role to facilitate the realisation of this dream for a household, are explained in the next chapter.

10.4 Towards a new economic paradigm based on oikomissiology in Tshwane (S & H)

The biggest challenge for LED inspired by oikomissiology is to oppose the neo-classical economics logic which consists of pursuing the dream of a good life according entirely at the prescription of the economists. McFague (2001: 95) objects: “We, the people, have the right and the duty to decide what the good life is for us and our planet and then to ask the economists to devise ways of allocating scarce resources so as to bring about this good life”. At the core of the neo-classical economics logic, there are selfishness, greed and exclusion because there are a few powerful individuals and institutions that have the power to decide on the course of an economy. The excluded, marginalised and voiceless such as the poor, women and children, including nonhuman beings, are expected to abide by this decision.
A new economic paradigm should be based on the principles and values of the household of God which emerged from “The Oikos Journey” (cf. section 3.3.3). They are:

- The earth is full of grace and love. Land is an asset which sustains life, the kind of life which glorifies God and which meets the needs of all beings (Psalms 24: 1)

- Labour is sacred. It is both a blessing and a curse. It is ideal to see work as a ministry as this will enhance the perception of work as a service to humanity. Therefore, employment can become an opportunity to serve humanity and the rest of creation (Genesis 2: 15 & Genesis 3: 17)

- Observing the Sabbath is the fundamental rule in God’s economy. Hence, an economic system that does not give a chance to the majority to rest, without fear of losing the ability to sustain their livelihood and security, is to be reformed (Exodus 20: 8-10a & Leviticus 25: 8-17)

- Shared prosperity is the goal of God’s economy. Efforts have to be addressed to dealing with injustices and inequality (Isaiah 58 & Amos 5),

- We cannot serve both God and Mammon. Money is a necessity and should not become an idol which enslaves communities. Communities that are enslaved to money and even resort to illegal and sinful means and self-sacrifice because of dire need and desperation should be helped as a matter of urgency (Exodus 20: 3 & Matthew 6: 24)

- God’s economy is a matter of discipleship. There is a need to disciple communities on how to handle money in line with God’s economic rules (Matthew 19: 16 – 22)

- We are called to live long in the land. A good economy creates an environment for people to live comfortable and peaceful lives (Deuteronomy 5: 33, also 25: 13 – 16 and 30: 16 – 18).

In addressing the challenge, Christian mission in relation to LED in Tshwane (S & H) has to solve how to integrate the oikos values so that an alternative eco-friendly mission framework (i.e. oikomissiology) may emerge.

### 10.4.1 Oikos values as guiding principles and goals for building Tshwane economy
The values highlighted in the foregoing, which were exegetically discussed in relation to LED in section 3.3.3.1, are helpful for building a sustainable economic development model in Tshwane (S & H). *Oikomissiology* in Tshwane (S & H) has to be the embodiment of these values. This entails undertaking our economic development in ways which restore and maintain harmony in the “garden” of which geologically-minded collectors hold the view that Pretoria, with a pellucid river (the Apies) meandering from one range of hills, down to and through another, must have been the “paradise [garden] for the original inhabitants of the area” (Engelbrecht 1955: 31). The river, forests, savannah and bushveld, the hills and valleys, all in harmony, comprised the ecological wealth which sustained the garden – all the inhabitants strove and prospered together. The diversity-of-nature, indigenous plants and wildlife, agriculture, a mineral rich garden have been lost as a result of the anthropocentric focus in the LED. Human settlements have prevailed in their expansion and in adding to humans’ greed and insatiable pursuit for progress through their economic activities which have had a devastating impact on ecology and economy (cf. Deane-Drummond 2008: 20 – 21). The results have led to the impoverishment of the majority of the inhabitants and include the stripping of natural resources and of their potential to support life in Tshwane. Deane-Drummond (2008: 27) asserts: “Extreme poverty, social exclusion and environmental injustice appear in tandem in communities all over the world”. *Oikomissiology* is therefore important to inspire a rebuilding of eco-friendly asset-based livelihoods in Tshwane (S & H).

Based on the ecological wealth of the city, urban theologians / missiologists must therefore contribute to a vision of sustainable future for Tshwane which makes full economic – ecological sense: we are to

1) till and keep the garden so it feeds us all in this generation and in many generations to come

2) employ creativity in the way we live and produce our bread, and the creation of meaningful work

3) aim for the long-term wellbeing of both human and other-than human beings living in Tshwane *oikos* while LED should ensure that work is interrupted by rest

4) work to benefit all within a local system – especially the vulnerable and marginalised

5) ensure that all sectors work with the sole purpose of serving communities (humans and nonhumans) in a sustainable manner, not for accumulation of wealth
6) place the focus on the organic nature of the local economy where social cooperation would be emphasised over competition and

7) make sure that LED functions to promote the life of citizens of the Tshwane (S & H) within the oikos paradigm.

This paradigm will be built upon the current positive signs of God's economy and signs of hope and grace as described below.

10.4.2 Current signs of God’s economy and oikomissiology

According to the joint group mini-consultations as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.2.1) there are some signs of "God’s economy" and the oikos in these townships: 1) at present, there is limited meaningful sharing. Much work has to be done so that giving and sharing become the axle that joins everything together, 2) at present, limited shared prosperity is realised; therefore sharing – being a taught behaviour – should be promoted in all spheres of society in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, 3) a few people have more blessings than curses, 4) and some people are experiencing good health and long life in the land. Oikomissiology will help the church to play a catalytic role in the realisation of these signs to benefit all inhabitants of Tshwane (S & H).

These signs are like the first stones in the foundation of a building, hidden, yet crucial for the building of a sustainable economy in these townships. They are like the seeds of trees that, once sown in a fertile soil, will germinate and develop into trees which will bring blessings to whole communities. I hope that God is at work in re-building the economy of the townships in ways yet to be visible to all of us because God is present with the poor as pointed out earlier in Chapter 3 (section 3.2.4). This fact should motivate the church in Tshwane in general, and in particular, the churches that participated in this study to come up with “hopeful actions” geared towards LED-focused Christian mission in Tshwane (S & H). These actions will benefit from exposure to the work of Christian resource networks such as The Oikos Group, The Kairos Southern Africa, “People’s Budget Campaign” and others that have attempted to re-imagine the role of the church in economic justice in post-apartheid South Africa (cf. Vellem 2013b: 6).

Starting by addressing the shortcomings and weaknesses of the church highlighted in section 3.2.2 and that which was expressed by the churches’ leaders in sections 5.8.2 and 5.8.3, LED-focused Christian mission must first mobilise all its assets (i.e. social, physical and material and spiritual capitals) and all its strengths which are useful for socioeconomic development (cf. 3.2.2, 5.8.1). These assets and strengths should be then channelled to foster the development
of the signs of God’s economy currently present in the townships of S & H within the oikos paradigm so that a sustainable LED is realised. The oikomissiology behind the practice of LED argued in this study has to tackle issues, as pointed out by Vellem (2013b: 6), relative to the “discrepant relationship of theology and economics” which is ingrained in current church praxis. Among other things, the “worship of Mammon (money)” (cf. Kairos Southern Africa 2011) must be abandoned as articulated in this study and by Rasmussen (1996: 94), Vellem (2013b: 6-7), Deane-Drummond (2008: 20 – 21) (see also 3.3.2.6) so that sustainability and collective wellbeing of the whole of creation in Tshwane (S & H) become prominent in economic activity in these townships. The “othering” of nature and the various views which disrupt the harmony of interdependent relations in the oikos of these townships must also be reformed and abandoned (cf. Van Schalkwyk 2012: 103, see also 3.3.2.6).

I concur therefore with Vellem (2013b: 6) that it was an error to place our faith in “disembowelling economic and political heresies” to correct socioeconomic injustices in South Africa (cf. Boesak 2012). It has now been realised that trust in these heresies has resulted in further marginalisation of weak inhabitants (i.e. humans and non-humans) of South Africa.

Looking towards the future, Vellem (2013b: 7) suggests:

> As the church, our task is to unveil GOD in the [self-destruction] of the miserable, lest we betray the gospel of Jesus. Let us throw our lot in radical democracy, deepening liberal politics and social democracy theoretically and intellectually rather than turning our positions into a faith devoid of reason that dismembers the poor.

Vellem’s argument is one of the reasons, I contend, that oikomissiology holds potential for turning around the current misery, if we opt for God’s economy rules. The church will move forward in faith with reason, participating in missio Dei in Tshwane (S & H) within the oikos framework.

### 10.4.3 Signs of hope and grace which open up the situation for an oikos economy in Tshwane (S & H)

According to the joint group’s reflection, as reported in Chapter 7 (7.2.1), the signs of hope and grace that open up the situation in Tshwane (S & H) for the realisation of God’s economy and the oikos are: 1) prayer in action (prayer has to be accompanied with practical actions to address the situation), 2) current infrastructural development is seen as a sign of hope (a great deal still has to be done to ensure that this development is ecologically sensible in terms, for
example, of the sort of energy and the (non) dependence on coal as a source of energy, or the development of water infrastructure which will ensure long term water availability in a water scarce region), while improvements in their physical living conditions and services have a positive impact on people’s wellbeing provided quality is not compromised, 3) the existence of unpaid healthcare workers in marginalised communities of S & H is a sign of hope which contributes to people living long, 4) the integration of pre-primary education into mainstream education is a sign of hope, which will facilitate the development of knowledge, 5) the existence of sound LED and social welfare policies (focussed on dismantling and correcting injustice and inequality across sectors, if implemented faithfully, is a sign of hope), and 6) sectors of the church that continue to work for the restoration of hope have to ensure that the impact of policies on the weak and poor members of society are scrutinised and appropriate remedies suggested.

These signs reveal that God is already at work in various ways in the city and that the church has “to step even further into radical engagement with all the ills besetting society (...) Christians must make the sacrifices, take the risks and live out Christ’s love in the hard places” (Mandrick 2010: 760; cf. Niemandt 2010: 398). Yet, in the midst of the strong presence of signs of destruction such as despair and hopelessness, unemployment and marginalisation in these communities the signs of hope and grace expressed by the joint group are merely like little drops in the ocean of massive misery and poverty. This simply means radical work still has to be done by all sectors and disciplines including missiology / theology to address the issues which endlessly perpetuate poverty, marginalisation and unemployment in the townships of S and H, so that signs of hope will become palpable and tangible in these communities. Oikomissiology, if embraced by the church in Tshwane (S & H), provides us with the conceptual framework and insightful praxis to work for hope and life in these townships.

With regard to oikomissiology, I reiterate that grassroots community members, whose hope has been crushed and livelihood threatened by the prevailing economic system, should be the interlocutors to help us map the course for multidimensional justice in the townships of S & H. As Vellem (2015: 6) states, “there is a relationship between faith and economics” and faith is not required to comply with bad economic policies but question and critique them in order to contribute towards shalom (cf. The Oikos Journey 2006). As pointed out in Chapter 2 (see 2.1.2.1.1.5) the development of economic policies after the demise of apartheid in South Africa has led to unbalanced growth, which in turn has bred massive unemployment and poverty with a negative impact on ecological concerns, especially in peripheral townships such as S & H.
The church in these townships has to develop socio-theological praxes which should not imagine liberation without economic liberation (cf. Vellem 2015: 6) as well as ecological liberation that is supposed to protect and enhance human and ecological wellbeing in these townships.

According to Maluleke (2000: 193), one of the possible roles of theology in post-apartheid South Africa is interpreting and enhancing the agency of Africans in the light of cultural, religious and economic marginalisation. Maluleke (2000: 195) continues, “…it is a task which cannot be undertaken by African Christian Theology alone”. Theology, together with other disciplines, has to work in collaboration and partnership with other disciplines and sectors in facilitating “hopeful actions” in these townships as argued in 3.3.1 (cf. Bookless 2007: 47; see also Deane-Drummond 2008: 13 – 14; Butkus & Kolmes 2011). These actions have to be built upon the resiliency and creativity of the poor in those townships. In the same vein, Maluleke (2000: 201) attests: “in the midst of this tragedy, ordinary Africans are surviving…people find ways and means to survive … by diverse means ordinary Africans are finding ways to neutralize the stifling ‘hands’ of globalization and IMF policies”, as narrative and interview accounts also confirm (see 6.2.2, 7.1.2 and 8.2.1.1). Therefore, these township communities of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal are not just key interlocutors but also agents in the effort to realise multidimensional justice within the oikos paradigm suggested in this study.

The agents and their contexts are resourceful; this is a sign of hope. It will require the mission of the churches to base their transformative LED praxis on the resources and ecological wealth they have in the townships of Soshanguve & Hammanskraal (cf. 3.2.2) to support sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H). This is a new way of being a church for missionary churches, such as Baptist, URCSA and ELCSA, in these townships in that they need to begin to free themselves of dependency by building their congregations and their communities with their own resources or assets. The church in Tshwane (S & H) should go further by mobilising communities to take stock of their assets listed here, by the joint mini-consultation for example, and use these to “release” communities from the bondage of dependency. The township churches of S & H, as was the case with Polokwane Uniting Reformed Church of Southern Africa, must “choose their own path and their own means which lead to “autonomy and independence” (Kgatla & Saayman 2013: 6). Referring to the said Polokwane church experience, Kgatla & Saayman (2013: 7) confirm that: this ecclesial paradigm was centred on “the human community in a certain, specific place and with certain, specific needs, not on some faraway benevolent but unfamiliar font of
authority” [italics in the original]. This is the paradigm being advocated for in this study within the oikos framework – it was referred to as asset-based sustainable LED (cf. 2.1.5.4).

In relation to sectors of the church that continue to work for the restoration of hope, as pointed out above, the church should not only ensure that the impacts of policies on the weak and poor members of society are scrutinised and remedies suggested, but also has to foster transformation. With reference to a mission agenda in South Africa, Kgatla (2013: 220 - 221) argues: “transformation occurs when a new vision is continually created to interrogate existing assumptions, beliefs, patterns, and habits to bring about incremental change which will benefit the whole society”. In Tshwane (S & H), the church’s transformational agenda has to create a life-giving vision of shared prosperity which will benefit the whole oikos in Tshwane and continually interrogate the existing assumptions, beliefs, patterns, and habits which produce “skimpy” signs of hope and grace such as those shared by the joint mini-consultation group. The prevailing dark signs of destruction, despair, hopelessness and powerlessness in the townships of S & H must be addressed among others by the church, which is an instrument of hope in the world (cf. Bosch 1991: 3). Further, Kgatla (2013a: 221) contends, “it requires an intentional agenda of de-racialisation and a reconstruction of ‘damaged’ self-esteem that has deteriorated into black self-hatred and self-destruction”. It is only then that signs of hope which foster collective wellbeing will emerge in Tshwane (S & H). The oikomissiology presented in this study has the potential to usher in a “hopeful” sustainable LED vision which could restore hope and self-esteem and self-reliance to the said marginalised communities.

10.4.4 Realities which hinder the realisation of oikos’ economic values and goals in Tshwane (S & H)

The church’s perspective on oikos in relation to collective wellbeing or shalom is beginning to be understood, at least in some theological circles (see section 3.3.2.1), but the prevalent anthropocentrism in the current economic system is a major hindrance to its realisation. This is also reflected in the narrative accounts presented in this study. It means that more theological education, especially stressing the inter-connectedness between ecumenical – thus outward-directed – ecclesiology, economy and ecology, is needed before churches can understand and formulate their own oikomissiology, which compels us to be “ecumenics”, that is, treating the inhabitants of the household as a single family (cf. Raiser 1997: 49) in a life-given local economy and local household / oikos governed by an anthropology of stewardship (the
There are also many barriers which could prevent the realisation of such values and goals. More than a decade ago, Tim Chester presented at Micah Challenge a Framework Paper 1 entitled “Barriers to the embrace of integral mission”. Chester (2004: 4-11) highlighted the following barriers: 1) theological barriers (i.e. uncertain of mandate and commitment to evangelism alone), 2) cultural barriers (i.e. public-private split, consumerism and relativism), 3) institutional barriers (models of success, models of ministry, institutionalism and a maintenance mentality), 4) capacity barriers (i.e. lack of skills and confidence and lack of time), 5) relational barriers, 6) identity barriers (i.e. tradition, fear of compromise through collaboration, fear of compromise through contact with the poor and parochialism) and 7) spiritual barriers (i.e. prejudice and pride and apathy). These human-made barriers give birth to some social, economic and ecological realities, which will also hinder the realisation of values such as oikos in Tshwane even though conceptually, as shown above, the oikos has the potential to overcome these barriers.

Insights from eco-theology / oikotheology / oikomissiology are helpful to counter these counterproductive realities. In eco-theology, Conradie (2010: 387) points out that “questions about the relationship between ‘man and nature’ have been reformulated to focus on the place and vocation of the human species within the evolutionary history of the earth” (also see McFague 1993: 9 – 12, section 3.3.2.4 and McFague 2001: 105 -111). In relation to praxis, this consequently implies that “the ecological dimension of Christian mission touches upon each mode of Christian witness (marturia), including leitourgia, koinokia, kerygma and diakonia” (Conradie 2010:383). Thus, a holistic multidimensional approach is required when the ecological dimension of Christian mission (i.e. oikomissiology) based on LED is considered, as is the case in this study. The oikomissiology paradigm rooted in missio Dei provides the values and goals of such LED as I have shown later in Figure 10.2.

10.5. Oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)
Individualism and self-centredness are major stumbling blocks that have to be addressed in the process of constructing *oikomissiology* in Tshwane (S & H). With reference to North America, McFague (2001: 83) points out “that religion and politics have become less public and more private; as they have retreated by failing to provide alternative discourses or worldviews, the image of free individuals bound together by covenant and country has degenerated into a cult of individualism”. Further, the individualism and self-centredness embedded in the neo-classical economic worldview has led to consumerism which has negative impacts on the environment. *Oikomissiology* can contribute solutions to these challenges as it promotes interdependency, restoration of relationships, shared prosperity and the like for all the inhabitants of the earth, which is a household of God for the whole community of life.

### 10.5.1 Ecological crisis and mission in Tshwane (S & H) in relation to salvation and LED

Botkus and Kolmes (2011: 157) assert: “the place and the role of creation in the Christian vision of salvation is an extremely important aspect of ecotheology, especially in its effort to decentre the overly anthropocentric interpretation that the biblical view of salvation typically receives”. This “decentring” offers hints on how to imagine salvation in Christ in a holistic manner, touching all aspects of life in the *oikos* including LED. Insights from Verster (2015: 4 – 5) speak of a “Christology from below in terms of its implications for the deliverance of people in need [together with] Christology from above (…) offer[s] significant potential for a change in communities brought about by the living God”: God is present in Christ and involved in creation for its salvation, which must be extended to include an ecological dimension of salvation. “In Christ he is the one for others” (Verster 2015: 4-5) including the whole of creation.

A notion of a holistic salvation resonates with what the joint group’s reflection highlighted as reported in Chapter 7 (7.3). The group said salvation means: 1) seeing people living the life God has intended for them to live (experiencing life and being able to access whatever is needed to realise wellbeing), 2) salvation is like the liberty and freedom that people have to live life to the full as God intended. Salvation is the entrance to the life God intended for every human being, 3) salvation is supposed to meet the needs of the people, it is supposed to provide for them and it is supposed to deliver them from the hang-ups of life, 4) salvation might include helping the needy, sharing, implementing what we know and being a blessing to others, 5) salvation is not something in heaven which is coming. Jesus is providing for my needs here on earth and he is also going to provide for my eternal needs in heaven. It must be borne in mind that there is no problem with my eternal life in heaven but there is a problem with life here on earth and 6)
salvation should not be narrowed down to the spiritual realm only which is an abuse of God’s grace. Salvation is holistic; it touches every sphere of life.

Ecological concern should also become part of this theme of salvation in Christ in oikomissiology. Verster contends:

> Salvation must be regarded as total and radical, encompassing the future and the present. Christ looked at people in their humanity. Acknowledging the fullness of God in Christ, we should also acknowledge the radical salvation in him. The wounded Christ is the Christ of the people alongside the road; he is the Christ of those who have no abode. In Luke 23:26–43, Jesus, as the wounded one, faces his death …. that God alone is self-sufficient and that he calls us to life in interdependence with others, in order to be truly human (Verster 2015: 6).

This notion of salvation implies therefore that a Christian missiological framework’s aims should encompass the present and future realities of the world and its inhabitants. As a result, the church in mission with God proclaims and demonstrates the good news of the kingdom in the present and at the same time points to the future. Bosh (1991: 508) put it this way: “we need an eschatology for mission which is both future-directed and oriented to the here and now”.

I opt for an inclusive salvific notion which includes all the inhabitants of the oikos in the here and now and in the future. The role of the church requires therefore that it possesses an eschatology which “holds in creative and redemptive tension the already and the not yet” (Bosh 1991: 508) as related to LED in Tshwane (S & H) within the oikos framework.

In oikomissiology salvation is not narrowly understood as salvation of humans only. Rather, it includes the whole of creation because God’s redemptive goals include the whole of creation. Thus, as argued in 3.3.2.2, missio Dei is about salvation, restoring and sustaining of humans and non-human beings of S & H townships in the case of this study. Practically, our salvation message and efforts are deficient if they do not redeem the world from current ecological degradation as well as redeeming humans from whatever still entraps them so as they fail to enjoy the gift of life to the “full” in Christ (cf. Joh. 10: 10). Using the words of the World Communion of Reformed Churches, Niemandt (2012: 2) elucidates: “God’s mission is God’s purpose in Christ to renew [i.e. redeem, save, restore] the whole of creation”. The church is called to participate in God’s mission who encompasses the whole of creation or oikos including LED. Niemandt (2012: 3) elaborates: “God’s mission is directly related to the world and the church is an instrument privileged to participate in God’s mission of redemption and the recreation of humanity and the cosmos” (cf. Balia & Kim 2010: 25, 202). The oikos concept
gives us a framework on how to participate in God’s mission of redemption and the recreation of humanity and the cosmos in Tshwane (S & H) as related to LED. We must conceive an urban ecclesiology in the light of the oikos – which proclaims, in word and deed, salvation in Christ – in order to address the economic sins highlighted in section 9.3.4 and restore relational harmony in the Tshwane oikos (S & H).

In relation to ecology and Christology, Colossians 1: 15 – 20 point to the salvation or reconciliation of all things including the earth or oikos. Deane-Drummond (2008: 112) attests that the significance of Christ in an ecological context challenges exclusive anthropocentric interpretations of salvation in Christ. The fact that Christ as the divine Logos became incarnate in the flesh, affirms material being as important parts of the oikos (cf. Deane Drummond 2008: 112, De Gruchy 1986: 71, see also 3.2.5) in need of salvation. Harper and Metzger (2009: 81) amplify: “God comes to his creation not as a spirit to rescue humanity from a hopelessly cursed earth, but as part of creation itself”. Thus, both human and non-human beings are in need of salvation since the consequences of the fall affected the whole of creation so that there will be restoration of relational harmony and collective wellbeing in the oikos – this is what it means for creation to be set free (cf. Deane–Drummond 2008: 139). It has to result in making individuals, communities, and the cosmos as a whole living the life God intended for them to live by upholding both goodness and impartiality and inclusivity (cf. Harper & Metzger 2009: 80).

Working for harmony which yields to the salvation of the whole of creation in Tshwane (S & H) will require the church, as a privileged instrument in God’s mission, to become a practical kingdom-advancing institution which is contextual, incarnational, relational – i.e. in harmony with nature and in a spirit which respects creation’s integrity – in order to participate in the planetary agenda and sustainability goals (cf. 3.3.2.4, McFague 1993: 8 – 12). Creativity and imagination by the church in Tshwane (S & H) are needed for the way forward. This is one of the contributions this study is attempting to make in suggesting the oikos as a framework with potential to inspire “hopeful actions” that could facilitate such a salvation. The point, as stated earlier (cf. 3.3.2.4), in the words of McFague (1993: 9), is: “We cannot save ourselves (and our kind) alone if salvation means the health and well-being of the planet and all its creatures, not merely the transformation of certain privileged individuals to another existence in another world”. Harper & Metzger (2009: 80) expand: “the kingdom of God is about the redemption of not only the church, but also of the whole creation” or the oikos.
The oikos concept opens-up the “old” theology / missiology of salvation as related to LED by infusing it with insights from ecology such as an ecological worldview (cf. Conradie 2006: 13 – 14), creation’s integrity (cf. Rasmussen 1996: 99 – 107), practical considerations pertaining to the planetary agenda (cf. McFague 1993: 8 – 12) and sustainability (cf. Cobb 1992), discussed in Chapter 3 (see 3.3.2.1, 3.3.2.2, 3.3.2.3, 3.3.2.4, 3.3.2.5, 3.3.2.6 and 3.3.3). Thus, the mission of the church in Tshwane (S & H) has to proclaim salvation, in words and deeds, to restore and sustain the health and well-being of the planet and all its creatures (cf. McFague 1993: 9) in a “circle of sustainability” (McFague 2001:106). In this way the church, being rooted in a missiological / theological praxis regarding economy / ecology, will join hands with God in Christ who in his love is working to bring forth the “new earth and the new heaven” (cf. Isaiah 65: 17-25) which symbolises a transformed reality. Harper and Metzger (2009: 83) point out that the church has to work to “bring believers into increasing conformity to Christ now in anticipation of eschatological perfection …to bring nature into greater conformity with its glorious future”.

Going forward towards a praxis, which respects creation’s integrity in relation to salvation, insights from Deane-Drummond (2008: 180) must be taken into consideration, such as: 1) the good news of salvation or “the gospel needs to include the idea of ecological conversion, integrated into a conversion towards Christ and the message of the Gospel” and 2) determination to protect and care for the earth to include protecting it from anthropocentric evils. Sustainability concerns and goals such as those enumerated in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development for example should be mainstreamed in the mission praxis of the church in Tshwane (S & H) (cf. 3.3.2.2).

10.5.2 Repenting from sin in relation to LED and oikos

Oikomissiology can facilitate repentance from socioeconomic as well as ecological sin, which is mainly embedded in the neo-liberal economic system of exclusion, in the process of building a sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H). Theological education has to assist us in embracing, as Butkus and Kolmes (2011: 138 - 140) put it, “an interpretation of sin from an ecological point of view”. Reflecting on creation and the fall (cf. Genesis 1 – 3), Steward (1994: 14) concluded that: 1) the fall into sin was holistic, 2) sin affects the world holistically, 3) the devil seeks to usurp every part of our life and 4) we have got to face the problem and deal with it holistically. Nash (1991: 118) submits: “Sin literally defiles the land”. With particular reference to LED and oikos, I observed that sin is also bluntly manifested in egocentric self-interest. Vorster expands;
When self-interest is pursued to the detriment of other people, it becomes a morally negative attitude. Self-interest therefore becomes immoral when it leads to the exploitation of others. Abuses of public funds for own gains are immoral and illegal. It is more so when it concerns the needy (Vorster 2012: 138).

Humanity’s self-interest which violates creation’s integrity is also sinful. Butkus and Kolmes (2011: 139) contend that “our present ecological crisis is anthropogenic – driven by human activity”. Humanity is guilty of ecological sin, which has become institutionalised through subtle behaviours which culminate in the exclusion of other inhabitants of the oikos. These in turn are associated with social realities such as poverty, racism, and sexism and lack of social justice (cf. Butkus & Kolmes 2011: 139). In relation to Tshwane (S & H), the joint group’s reflection in this situation as reported in Chapter 7 (7.3) sees sin as: love of money, oppressing people by denying them economic opportunities, not observing the Sabbath, not sharing, injustice, not applying discipleship on economic matters. The church is also failing because it is a selfish organisation and inward looking in many instances.

There is therefore a need for an “ethical education – the way of the Lord as a model for God’s people” (Wright 2010: 88, cf. Micah 6: 8) to assist in creating a spiritual framework. According to Balia and Kim (2010: 25) such a spiritual framework should affirm human life, mutual respect and equality by working towards inner and mutual conversion, a just community, survival of God’s creation, as well as church growth (cf. Niemandt 2010: 399). In this study, the oikos is such a spiritual framework which aims at life, meaningful work, shared prosperity and rest while respecting creation’s integrity (cf. 1.8.3.1.3, 3.3.2.2, 3.3.2.3 and 3.3.3).

It is also crucial to address “a Christian spirituality of inwardness” (Jenson 2006:3) which makes the church examine its own selfish interest rather than end up proclaiming a privatised gospel. It fails to mobilise all its assets including the majority of its members for God’s mission work, which contradicts the view that the whole church is the agent of God’s mission (Wright 2010:28–30). In order to deal with sin as related to LED, the whole church is needed – that is, all God’s people in all their actions and occupations as God’s mission extends to the whole of creation (Van Niekerk 2014: 6).

Oikomissiology will help us to develop a vision of mission extending to the whole of creation which calls the church to support its members to be “missionaries” by becoming involved in rebuilding / re-integrating the fabric of their immediate and surrounding community and ecosystem. Consequently, the church will build up people who are equipped and who will have
the right values to build up the economy of God through the means and methods of LED; and
who will thus “clinch” a social / ecological “deal” which is holistic and for the benefit of all
community members, and which will reflect the economy of God and the oikos as completely as
possible. The church in Tshwane (S & H) could team up for example with organisations such as
Food and Trees For Africa to gain inspiration and to learn how to implement eco-enterprise
programmes for sustainable LED in their contexts.

10.5.3 Building an oikomissiology framework for LED so as to counteract the realities of
death in Tshwane (S&H)

10.5.3.1 Realities of death

The joint group’s reflection as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.2.1) spoke of the political and socio-
economic realities which could hinder and destroy the realisation of these values in Tshwane (S 
& H). These include: 1) the current economic realities which do not allow people to rest enough,
affecting their physical and mental health, 2) there is no shared prosperity, some people resort
to crime and illegitimate means in order to survive (e.g. crime, prostitution, drug addiction, HIV
and other activities that are associated with poverty in S & H), 3) there is socioeconomic
inequality in S & H and 4) people on welfare grants are in most cases bread-winners for
families. Hence, the grant income is not sufficient to provide a pathway out of poverty.

As a result, these people become perpetually dependent on grants. This dependency is one of
the barriers to be dismantled in order to usher in a sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H). These
present realities in Tshwane (S & H) are apparently rooted in the philosophy and structure of the
prevailing neoliberal economic system which, amongst other things, enslave the labour force, do
not share the bounty of the earth equitably and send the weak inhabitants to live on charity and
welfare. In its praxis and philosophy, oikomissiology has, on the one hand, as Pope Francis
(2013: 45-60) exhorts, to “say no to an economy of exclusion, no to the new idolatry of money,
no to a financial system which rules rather than serves and no to the inequality which spawns
violence”. And on the other, it must work in tandem with schools of thought, scholars and civil
society movements concerned with tackling economic injustice through advocacy for eco-

Thus, the township church of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal’s inputs towards LED must be
rooted in an alternative economic system inspired by the oikos and local assets. This alternative

http://www.trees.co.za
requires profound conversion and repentance from sin which keeps on breeding the “death” of many of the inhabitants of the household of God in these townships.

Different theological insights to consider towards building an *oikomissiology* framework for LED have been discussed in the foregoing. Figure 10.1 here below summarises these different insights.

![Theological insights for an alternative LED](image)

**Figure 10.1:** Theological insights for an alternative, *oikos*-inspired LED in Tshwane (S & H)
10.5.3.2 An ethical value-based oikomissiology framework / worldview for LED

Having discussed and suggested some praxis pointers in Chapter 9 and thereafter carried out theological and conceptual reflection on different themes that emerged from the empirical findings, I will now attempt to sketch a framework / worldview which I believe could contribute toward embracing an alternative LED based on the oikos. The figure 10.2 below captures the essence of the framework / worldview that I propose in this study for an alternative LED. I am convinced that this framework / worldview could inspire churches and ministries to build ethical value-based missiological praxes and programmes geared toward an alternative LED based on the oikos concept.

The framework / worldview is metaphorically represented as a tree (with roots, a trunk, branches and leaves). This tree represents individual churches in given communities. The figure also contains an image of the sun which metaphorically represents economic circumstances. As with the natural tree, the external part (made of trunk, branches and leaves) is visible to the people and the environment but the internal part (made of roots and source of nourishment), although vital to the sustainability and life of the tree, is invisible.

The framework / worldview highlights four components we need to consider when formulating a hopeful action to address issues related to LED.

External

- Economic circumstances, which include aspects such as physical and socioeconomic environment, community including church background and structure, available resources and challenges the community is facing.

- Programmes (hopeful action) would refer to the church’s reaction in and to these factors, both positive and negative as well as passive (i.e. withdrawal) or active (i.e. engaged).

Internal

---

202 I was first introduced to this figure /picture in 2006 when I attended a “Choose Life: A value-based response to HIV and AIDS” course developed by Hospivision under the leadership of Dr Andre de la Porte. In this course, this figure is used as a spiritual model for value-based behaviour change. See De la Porte, A (ed) 2006. “Choose Life”: A value-based response to HIV and AIDS, CB Powell Bible Institute, UNISA, Pretoria. I have used the same picture / figure but adapted it by changing the content to suit my purpose as related to this research.
• The heart and root systems symbolise the inner identity of the church. The Bible perceives the heart as the set of values, motives, driving forces, fears, desires, thoughts and emotions, as well as the source of creativity, courage, conviction, faith, hope and love. True change then, is based on a “change of heart”. Scripture is emphatic about the fact that only God can accomplish this (Jeremiah 31:31 – 33, Ezekiel 36:26). Oikos values, love, service and the like are considered to be at the heart of this framework.

• The source refers to that in which we ultimately find our security, identity and worth as Christian churches. In the face of extreme adversity and seemingly insurmountable obstacles, the source infuses churches and their ministries with meaning and purpose. It is the origin of principles, values and an ethical way of being. Missio Dei and the crucified incarnate Christ are considered as central sources that sustain and provide “nourishment” to this oikos-based framework / worldview in terms of values, beliefs, and thoughts, etcetera. Within the oikos framework / worldview we participate in missio Dei to work in such a way that life, harmony and shared prosperity are realised for all the inhabitants (humans and non-humans) of the oikos. As discussed in 3.3.2.1 these include: 1) the biophysical environment including water, air, soil, plants and animals, 2) the built environment, including houses, offices, urban planning, 3) the social environment, including civil society, communities and local neighbourhoods, 4) the economic environment, including the ownership of land, ownership of the means of production, access to capital and to employment opportunities, 5) the political environment, including systems of governance and rules for management and 6) the cultural environment, including customs, crafts, music, art, drama and dancing (cf. Conradie 2006: 13 – 14).

The ground from which we should participate in missio Dei as we seek to follow the Incarnate Christ is the oikos. As God loves and cares for the whole world (oikos) and gave Christ to redeem it (cf. Jn. 3: 16), like God we love and care for the oikos and should work for its wellbeing because ours depends on it. This is the missiology that the churches in Tshwane (S & H) have to embrace for their survival and wellbeing, that of their communities and that of the whole of creation. This oikos-based missiology or “oikomissiology” is broad, holistic, integrated and multidisciplinary. It does not alienate nor does it give priority to one form of life and neglect another. It considers issues of life from God, the Creator, in relation to the ecological worldview (see 3.3.2.1). It promotes involvement in mission, being fully aware that the world is facing an ecological crisis (see 3.3.2.2) which must be reversed. It presses for mission initiatives.
associated with economic life, even LED, to be carried out in harmony with the earth and by respecting creation’s integrity (see 3.3.2.3 and 3.3.2.5). Participation in *missio Dei* is also unapologetically about participation in the planetary agenda (see 3.3.2.4). So, as the township churches in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal embark on *oikomissiology* with God focussing on LED in their communities, sustainability has to be at the centre of their transformative praxes (see 3.3.2.6). In this way, the relational harmony and collective wellbeing of all inhabitants of the *oikos* are pursued as an integrated part of participating in *missio Dei*.

Further, I contend that this *oikomissiology* could be used to integrate the different elements of LED. It can be contextualised individually for each church. It has potential to provoke a change of behaviour in the churches’ members as well in their praxis and programmes. It requires therefore that ethical, value-based choices geared to promoting the collective wellbeing of all inhabitants of the *oikos* in Tshwane take centre-stage while LED is considered.

Figure 10.2: A proposed ethical value-based *oikomissiology* framework / worldview for LED
In a practical and real way the framework is supposed to work like this: in the face of economic circumstances which breed inequality, poverty, unemployment and the like, the church is called to carry out hopeful actions as part of God’s mission mandate. *Missio Dei* inspires and supplies goals, values, beliefs and thoughts (i.e. *oikos* values in this study) to the inner identity of the church about what and how God expects his church to react / act / engage when faced with circumstances such as these. These goals, values, beliefs and thoughts are then translated into praxes. The latter provide the *modus operandi* for implementing the programmes.

The praxes have to be grounded in the *oikos* so that the goals of God’s economy are realised, i.e. economic activity carried out in harmony with the earth, providing meaningful work to all communities, guaranteeing rest for all workers, shared prosperity, prohibiting blind pursuit of economic growth and accumulation of wealth and social cooperation emphasised over competition.

As argued above, sustainability should be at the core of these praxes and programmes. In essence, the focus and long-term goals of the *oikomissiology* framework I have argued for in this thesis have to be sustainability – of the earth and all its inhabitants. In my opinion, the role/s that the township church in Tshwane (S & H) could play towards LED is/are to embrace, opt and model the transformative praxis after God’s economy rules so that the whole *oikos* in Tshwane benefits as it lives life to the full (cf. Jn. 10: 10).

For a framework such as this to function effectively, the inner identity of the churches in these townships has to transform by embracing the values of God’s economy proposed here and reforming or dismantling whatever barriers still stand in the way. This implies dying to the old practices and anthropocentric stances of their theologies which operated in complicity with a system which has inevitably bred multi-dimensional injustice.

10.5.3.3 *Oikomissiology and responding to the current realities in Tshwane (S & H)*

In an attempt to address the current realities of “death” in Tshwane (S & H) as highlighted in narratives in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.2.1), also summarised above in section 10.5.3.1, and to contribute towards a vision for a sustainable future, the church must embrace *oikomissiology* as an ethical value-based framework, worldview, a praxis – with the aims of realising the goals and values of God’s economy in the *oikos* to become “God’s household of freedom” (Russel 1987) where “*shalom*, that is, the fullness of God’s salvation” (Van Schalkwyk 1999) is manifested in all spheres of life (cf. section 3.3.3). *Oikomissiology* will start to build on the emerging signs of
God’s economy as well as emerging signs of hope and grace highlighted above in sections 10.4.2 and 10.4.3 respectively. It will use the assets of the churches that participated in this research, highlighted in section 5.11, in relation to the ecological wealth that exists in and around these townships, highlighted in section 9.4.4.2, and theological resources to initiate interventions / programmes together with partners from many disciplines and organisations who work towards the realisation of a sustainable way of life for the world.

10.5.4 Spirituality, oikomissiology and LED in Tshwane (S & H)

A holistic spiritual healing in society, including LED, can only be achieved if we embrace a spirituality which is God-centred in concrete ways, one of which is to press the church to stand up for a caring economy that addresses the plight of the poor – human and nonhuman beings of the earth (cf. Vorster 2012: 144, see also section 3.3) in Tshwane (S & H). Oikomissiology will certainly help us to subscribe to a God-centred spirituality which inspires participation in the holistic salvific plan of God for the entire universe.

The joint group’s reflection as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. 7.3) also points out that the type of spirituality appropriate for an oikos-based LED is practical and concrete. This takes real life issues seriously as it is about doing justice (see Micah 6:8 and Isaiah 56:1). It should enable the church to speak to power structures and systems for the purpose of improving the lives of the communities of Tshwane (S & H). I submit that this requires a strategic positioning of the church so that, together with other partners, it becomes a vital channel for socioeconomic and ecological transformation and assistance in these townships. Therefore, I am in agreement with Vellem that: “Sola scriptura cannot be an ideological instrument that individualises and dichotomises the experience of millions from their struggles. The struggles of the marginalised, particularly their struggle for economic liberation ... are a matter of faith, sola fide!” (Vellem 2013: 4).

This faith will ultimately improve their lives and the rest of creation. In relation to the South African poor who have been alienated by the dominant class, Kgatla (2013a: 228) speaks of the spirituality of life which “seeks to empower those who are compelled to live in a reality that has been assigned to them by a dominant society. It resists any ‘quarantine’ imposed on them by the elite for their protection”. This is the type of spirituality to be promoted by the church in Tshwane (S & H) in order to facilitate the release of these townships which, by design and intention, are quarantined and excluded from having a substantial share in the economy. Insights from the oikos about interdependent relations, inclusivity and shared prosperity of all
inhabitants of the earth will certainly help the church (S & H), as a matter of faith and as inspired by *missio Dei*, to embody this spirituality of life in concrete ways (cf. 3.3.1). Thus concrete spirituality of life, I contend, necessitates the adoption of integrated modes of ministry where *kerygma, diakonia, koinonia* and liturgy converge to participate in a holistic plan of salvation to benefit the whole community of life on earth.

10.5.5 Public theology, LED and *oikomissiology* in Tshwane (S & H)

In South Africa, issues in the public sphere are hard and vertical differences between gender, class, history, economy, location and ecclesial as presented in Chapters 4 and 5 and ecological concerns. Responding to William Storrar’s public theology and with reference to socioeconomic difference, Maluleke (2011: 86) highlights:

… these are the differences between Lazarus with the dogs at the gate and the rich man living in luxury and happiness in the homestead. These differences will not be made to disappear by means of civility, courtesy and the portrayal of a benign public. These differences will not yield to poetry and metaphor. Something much more radical has to happen. I doubt if public theology has what it takes to deal with these differences.

Maluleke’s contention concurs with the contrasting socioeconomic situation in Tshwane presented in Chapters 4, 6 and 7 between the affluent communities – the middle class, BEE beneficiaries, politicians, business people, etc. – and the poor and marginalised who mostly live in townships such as Soshanguve and Hammanskraal (see 4.4, 6.2.1, 6.2.2, 7.1.1). I also concur with him, more particularly on the calling for a radical missiological/ theological praxis rooted in the context and capable of dealing with these socioeconomic differences. An *oikos*-based missiological framework and praxis would certainly begin to address these differences including ecological concerns. Key to this optimism on my part is the fact that the “othering” of nature and communities has no place in the *oikos* – we (human and non-human beings) belong together in the mother-earth. We are interdependent and should prosper together in the *oikos* (cf. Botkus & Kolmes 2011; McFague 1993; Conradie 2006; Rasmussen 1996; Deane-Drummond 2008). Bauckham (2011: 4) elucidates: humanity, bearer of the image of God, is fundamentally in community with other creatures (cf. Genesis 1). Public theology infused by ecological concern should start from this biblical standpoint for care of creation in the public sphere.

Wright (2010: 223) points out that in both Testaments, God is portrayed “as intensely interested in the public arena of human and economic life – interested, involved, in charge, and full of
plans for it”. He (2010: 223 – 228) further clarifies: “God created it” (see Genesis 1-2); “God audits it” (see Amos 5:12 – 15; Psalms 33:13 – 15; Amos 8:4 – 7; Jeremiah 7:9 -11); “God governs it” (see Genesis 50:19 – 20; Isaiah 19: 1 – 15; Ezekiel 26 – 28; Daniel 4), “God redeems it” (see Psalms 145:9; Isaiah 65:17 – 25; Colossians 1:16 – 20; Romans 8:19 – 21; 2 Peter 3: 13; Revelation 21:24 - 27). The whole of creation, the entire cosmos, is of interest to God, the Creator.

Thus, Abraham Kuyper203 contends: “The curse should no longer rest upon the world itself, but upon that which is sinful in it, and instead of monastic flight from the world the duty is now emphasized of serving God in the world, in every position in life”. This should rouse churches to work so that the glory of the kingdom of God is revealed all over the earth.

Kingdom-advancing churches are agents of mission serving God in the world (i.e. oikos). Niemandt (2010: 398) describes these churches “as congregations on a journey”. Drawing on the guide of the South African Partnership for Missional Churches, Niemandt (2010: 398) highlight the following about these advancing churches or missional churches: 1) they know that they live in the midst of a mission field, 2) they allow God’ s Spirit to work through them, and empower them, to take risks for the sake of the gospel, 3) they are learning more about God’s mission of redeeming, restoring, and reconciling the world through Jesus Christ, 4) they know their missional vocation, and are willing to act on it. For the sake of the gospel they are reaching out across boundaries and 5) they are a sign, and a preview, of the future that God intends for the whole world [or oikos].

The type of church Niemandt describes in the foregoing is suitable to journey with God into the complex realities of the world to demonstrate the love of God to the oikos. Oikomissiology as a framework is helpful in this regard for addressing the complex issues of economics and environmental justice which affect people’s personal lives as well as existing in the public sphere of Tshwane (S & H), as reported in the empirical findings (see Chapters 6, 7 and 8). Central to this oikomissiology will be the task of addressing the implications of current globalisation and consumerism for the whole earth and its ecology (cf. Deane-Drummond 2008: 17 – 31), in order to realise sustainability in Tshwane (S & H). In the process, oikomissiology will inspire church theology to incarnate “living with other creatures” (cf. Bauckham 2011), to

---

203 Abraham Kuyper was a Dutch politician, journalist, statesman and theologian. He founded the Anti-Revolutionary Party and was prime minister of the Netherlands between 1901 and 1905: http://www.azquotes.com/quote/356087, see also http://www.ccel.org/ccel/kuyper accessed 21 November 2015
develop a religious ethics which results in “earth-honouring faith” (cf. Rasmussen 2013), and “living faithfully in a fragile world” (Hartman 2011) by abandoning evil consumer habits so as to reduce the looming economic-ecological crisis. This is acting in hope inspired by an eschatological vision of the whole of creation. Dalton and Simmons (2010: vii) contend for an ecotheology which goes together with the practice of hope in that “hope can actively resist despair and effect concrete changes in how we conduct our lives”. *Oikomissiology* will also help us in addressing the weaknesses and blind-spots of the churches as expressed by leaders who participated in this study in Chapter 5 (i.e. 5.8.2 & 5.8.3).

Given the complexity of issues in Tshwane (S & H), a multi-disciplinary, interdisciplinary and even a transdisciplinary competence are required for the church to become involved in the public sphere on matters pertaining to sustainability (cf. Burns & Weaver 2008: 12). Lessons from my own personal journey indicate that Christian mission in the public sphere needs socially-concerned theologians / missiologists\(^{204}\) to drive the agenda. In any case, the socioeconomic and historical situation of the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal necessitates that mission practice becomes inescapably socially-concerned. I am not, for a second, suggesting neglect of, or less emphasis on, the proclamation of the gospel. On the contrary, I have learned in my experience that a sensitive and alert evangelist’s eyes become open to the socioeconomic and ecological needs of communities to whom she / he is called to preach which, if overlooked, could hinder people from experiencing holistic salvation and transformation in private and public spheres..

Going public will, therefore, involve “reclaiming the commons” (De Beer & Swart 2014: 4) so that they serve the common or public good including the environment. Thus, *oikomissiology* will contribute towards the “making of a good city” (De Beer & Swart 2014: 5) for both human and nonhuman beings. In relation to the City of Tshwane, Mashau (2014: 5) argues: “the call to go public is one that seeks to name and critically engage the principalities and powers (the powers that be) in the City of Tshwane”. Yet, many churches require educational empowerment to enable them to analyse the impact of powers and systems in their lives as well as in the lives of nonhuman communities of Tshwane (S & H).

\(^{204}\) In his site on social theology, John H Boer defines Social Theology as the systematic study of and preoccupation with issues of human welfare from the perspective of divine revelation. His thoughts are based on a body of literature from a tradition started by Abraham Kuyper; see [http://socialtheology.com/](http://socialtheology.com/) accessed 21 November 2015.
This educational empowerment has to bring these township churches to become real “black churches” as argued by Tshaka in relation to the Uniting Reformed Church of South Africa. He (2015: 3) contends: “A black church is one which insists in taking the lived experiences of black people seriously in theological reflection”. In my opinion, the township churches of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal could become this said “black church” if it is given some education empowerment or re-education – that type which will enable them to interrogate their very existence and purpose of ministry in the townships including their theology / missiology, from the point of view of their own black “experience” or even Black Consciousness in relation to their environment. Oikomissiology could facilitate a process of conscientisation for the church in Tshwane (S & H) to proclaim and demonstrate the message of life and love which includes ecological concerns. It will also help to contextualise urban public theology in Africa and particularly in Tshwane (S & H), which is lagging behind, in relation to the “specific, ever-changing, and ever-mounting urban challenges” – the signs of death – discussed earlier (cf. Swart & De Beer 2014: 4), including issues such as the economy, health, racism, xenophobia, sexism, crime, ecology, culture, faith and social identity, human dignity and human rights, just peace-building, globalisation and justice, and moral formation and public life (Koopman 2007a:189–196, 2007b:286–289).

10.5.6 Theological education and oikomissiology

Many aspects on practical education on the oikos and LED are included in Chapter 11.

Naidoo (2010: 347) contends: “the purpose of theological education is essentially the equipping of men and women for appropriate leadership and ministry within churches and associate institutions”. I agree with Naidoo (2010: 347) that “the theological curriculum, pedagogies of formation and of contextualisation are critical to producing quality Christian workers who are grounded in their pastoral identity and have the necessary skills to be relevant to their communities”. What is also urgently needed in relation to the church call for an ongoing imagination of a theological curriculum which facilitates both formation and intentional praxis is how the churches in South Africa, particularly those of Soshanguve & Hammanskraal, can learn to become truly missional (cf. Niemandt 2010: 398) and liberating, including an economic-ecological dimension in their praxis.

The researcher is a member of the project “Urban Public Theology”, which was initiated by the Institute for Urban Ministry but later expanded to include several academic departments and institutes at the University of Pretoria (UP) and University of South Africa (UNISA). The leading centres in this regard were the Centre for Contextual Ministry (UP) and the Research Institute for Theology and Religion (UNISA).
De Beer (2012: 251) states that urban South Africa presents us a wonderful opportunity for liberating theological education which necessitates that the educational aspect of mission in the city must encompass disciplinary, multi-disciplinary and even transdisciplinary features which can enable us to understand the complex urban South African reality. For example, LED as a sector and its impact on communities can only be fully understood as it relates to other sectors. Thus, the educational enterprise for mission in the city has to be aware of and incorporate insights from various disciplines to improve its praxis. The fact is that LED alone cannot produce a just society in Tshwane. When the *oikos* values are seen as goals for LED and they are applied they make the whole economic enterprise regain harmony – God, humans and non-humans – which results in sustainable communities. *Oikomissiology* can help us to begin our theological education with one of the faith assumptions that “the natural world – creation – is not self-sustaining but is sustained by the ongoing presence of God” (Butkus & Kolmes 2011: 169 – 170). Visions for a sustainable future of both humans and the natural world must be incorporated as part of a theological curriculum.

Therefore, theological / missiological urban education based on the *oikos* has to be holistic in its outlook and approach and should move the church from capacities (i.e. having training and skills) to capabilities (i.e. doing and applying learning to solve issues affecting their communities including ecological concerns). This education has to enable the church to “read the world” through the *oikos* lenses in order to pose the “hopeful actions” required for transformation and collective wellbeing of the *oikos* – or, in other words, a sustainable future. Capabilities as anticipated outcomes of this education must be rooted in God’s concern for social righteousness and justice (cf. Psalms 146:5 – 9; Proverbs 14:31; Proverbs 31:4 – 5; Job 31:13 – 15), including eco-justice.

In that these hopeful actions are neither neutral nor innocent, they ought to be intentional and ethically value-based. *Oikomissiology* will help assist us in revising the current theological education which is still in many ways anthropocentric. Individual and institutional repentance will be required in order to embrace an eco-friendly theological education.

### 10.6 Conclusion of chapter

This chapter focussed on presenting and discussing, reflectively and conceptually, the ecological dimension of the Christian mission which I have called: “*oikomissiology*”. The goal of
this *oikomissiology* is *shalom*, the aim or the outcome of the reign of God in the whole of creation. For this goal to be realised, all the church’s assets in Tshwane (S & H) together with those of other institutions, disciplines and natural resources must be mobilised. The scope of *oikomissiology* is the whole of creation and is, because of its scope, intrinsically inter-disciplinary and multi-disciplinary.

*Oikomissiology* receives its impulses from *missio Dei* infused by the *oikos* metaphor’s values and goals. It is a framework / worldview for analysis, description, reflection and planning for action which, in my opinion, releases from the traps of anthropocentrism the world, economics, the church and conventional Christian theology / missiology. When Christian theology / missiology is done through ecological lenses (i.e. *oikomissiology*) signs of “death” in the whole of creation – human and nonhuman beings – in Tshwane (S & H) will be conquered. Subsequently, multidimensional justice, life and collective wellbeing will become marks of LED in Tshwane.

The *missio Dei* and other theological concepts discussed in this chapter may have been understood in an anthropocentric manner, but the *oikos* concept challenges this misconception in missiology and broadens the “scope” of the *missio Dei* and these concepts to include the whole inhabited world (the *oikumene*) and the entire cosmos. This is the scope of the reign of God that the Psalmist has in mind when he declares that, even in the here and now, the creation declares the glory of God (Psalms 19). *Oikomissiology* embraces and re-interprets various socio-theological themes by infusing an ecological dimension as summarised in Figure 10.3 below.
Figure 10.3: Interconnectedness exists between oikomissiology and other socio-theological concepts

I admit that what I have presented is a sketch of oikomissiology in Tshwane (S & H) is untested, yet I am convinced that it could contribute towards an alternative LED praxis and framework in Tshwane. In the next chapter, I present a practical mission model based on oikos to address unemployment as one of the key LED issues in Tshwane (S & H).
Chapter Eleven

MISSION IN AN AFRICAN CITY: OIKOMISSIOLOGY’S INSIGHTS FOR REBUILDING LED IN TSHWANE (S & H) THROUGH AN INCARNATIONAL PRESENCE

11.1 Introduction

11.1.1 Overview

A sketch of my vision of oikomissiology was presented in Chapter 10; that shalom is its aim (cf. 10.2.2) and its praxis is asset-based (cf. 10.2.3). This was done with a view to achieving socioeconomic and ecological justice in Tshwane (S & H) in harmony with oikos; that in turn will lead to improved LED which should benefit all communities so that a sustainable way of ensuring a balanced holistic life for humanity and for our planet is realised.

In this final chapter; I offer a transformed mission model based on this oikomissiology with LED as its focus. The model centres on addressing unemployment as suggested by the joint focus group during the way forward phase in Chapter 7. I also draw inputs from interview findings (see Chapter 8). Amongst other things, I seek to make connections between the environment and the economy by means of this model. It is an attempt to integrate both evangelistic and activist mission orientations inspired by elements of this-worldly and other-worldly worldviews, which could contribute to upholding the household of God and God’s economic rules for a healthy sustainable economy and sustainable communities. Based on the oikos, through employment creation, the model is structured to realise common overall good or shalom in society. Church resources are taken into account as assets for realising oikomission (i.e. the practice of oikomissiology); a concrete /practical oikomissiology, which it is envisaged could result in creating employment so as to contribute to the emergence of an inclusive sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H).

This practical oikomissiology considers theological concepts and themes discussed in Chapter 10 to include ecological dimensions. In terms of this model, oikomissiology has to ensure that equity and access to land are guaranteed (see also Moyo 2014: 26) and that human beings’ involvement in the creation of employment does not lead them to consider themselves in isolation from the other creatures, nor that they see other creatures in isolation from them. Hence, integration of ecological concerns should be taken into account as communities of
Tshwane (S & H) seek to acquire liberation and empowerment in relation to LED. Therefore, these communities are expected to co-manage ecosystems and natural assets in the process of creating employment for themselves in their respective contexts. With a little imagination and creativity, there are numerous possibilities for creating employment in Tshwane (S & H) (see 10.2.6.2) which conforms to sustainability – profitable to both present and future generations of human and nonhuman populations of Tshwane (S & H).

11.1.2 Pointers for my *oikomission* model

Before proceeding further, I draw attention to the following pointers covered in previous chapters:

11.1.2.1 Assets of the local church which should be mobilised for the purpose of LED

In order for local churches to develop transformational ministry, which will rebuild the local economy, they need to mobilise and use all the available assets they have as highlighted in Chapters 1 (section 1.7.2), 3 (section 3.2.2) and 5 (section 5.6). This diverging radial below (i.e. Fig. 11. 1) depicts the different assets of the local church which were highlighted in these chapters and which should be mobilised for the purpose of LED.
In addition to these assets, we must include the ecological wealth and area biodiversity (see sections 9.4.4.2 – 9.4.4.4) of these townships and their vicinities as well as their potential for LED.

Going forward with the action envisaged by the group, these assets will be essential for building the model in such a way that temptations towards dependency are minimised from the outset. This action, metaphorically speaking, has to draw “water for refreshing and sustenance from its own well”. With reference to the churches that participated in this study, they will have to consciously transition toward self-reliance (cf. Schwartz 2007: 17). Addressing the Roman Catholic Church, Pope Francis (2013: 44) suggests “we need to distinguish clearly what might be a fruit of the kingdom from what runs counter to God’s plan. This involves not only recognizing and discerning spirits, but also – and this is decisive – choosing movements of the
spirit of good and rejecting those of the spirit of evil”. In the case of this study for example, competing around assets should be abandoned in order to integrate all these assets for a holistic, sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H) (cf. Nel 2015: 524).

11.1.2.2 Components of LED as related to the oikos concept and the ecological wealth of the area are necessary for building sustainable communities

In Chapters 3 and 5, I suggested that these assets are useful for building a sustainable LED in the struggling townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. The diverging radial below (i.e. Fig 11. 2) illustrates the different components of LED that I propose in this study as being related to the oikos concept, principles of building sustainable communities and empirical findings (cf. sections 1.7.5 and 3.4, Chapters 6, 7 and 8) and respecting the ecological wealth of the area (cf. section 9.4.4.2 – 9.4.4.4). In short, as Blakely and Leigh (2010: 7) contend, sustainability is a foundational goal in LED. This is what I believe the values of God’s economy rules, as embraced in this study, work towards.
11.1.2.3. An on-going pastoral cycle of action-reflection-action.

A new imagination based on praxis and theological reflection / conceptual insights gained through engagement with literature and empirical evidence have led me to propose a framework for an ethical, value-based LED in Tshwane, in Chapter 10. The discussions and reflections in Chapter 9 emerged from empirical accounts, contextual realities, literature and personal ministry praxis in South Africa. With inputs from research participants, the model that I suggest is a result of both an emerging praxis over many years of ministry in the townships of Tshwane and the principles that I have learned from the oikos concept as outlined in Chapter 5, which has
resulted in the construction of my oikomissiology in Chapter 10. As it is anticipated that this model will be implemented to realise one of the aims of this applied study, theological reflections on LED transformation will continue to be informed and the assumptions and principles advocated in this study might be questioned, adjusted, or affirmed. There will remain an ongoing pastoral cycle of action-reflection-action.

11.2. Elements of a transformed missional model and Praxis focussed on LED in Tshwane (S & H)

I will compress the praxis insights developed in Chapter 9 together with insights and articulation of my oikomissiology in Chapter 10 into seven foci as the backbone of this model.

11.2.1. A new commitment to the city with a mission agenda focussed on oikos-based LED

It has been argued throughout this thesis that a new commitment to the African city of Tshwane (S & H) as a place of mission focussed on oikos-based LED is needed. In Chapter 10, I pointed out that we need: 1) a “new missiology” and a “new church”, with a new commitment to the city in the face of the current situation (cf. section 10.2), 2) to refocus the biblical / theological impulses for community action by infusing them with an ecological dimension (cf. section 10.2), 3) to broaden the church’s perspective and involvement in socioeconomic development to include participation in the planetary agenda and sustainability (cf. 10.3), 4) to develop an oikos-based economic paradigm for Tshwane (S & H) by building on the current signs of God’s economy, facilitating the manifestation of signs of hope and grace and circumventing realities which hinder the realisation of this economy by choosing to operate in compliance with the oikos value framework (cf. 10.4) and 5) to address the current realities of death in the City of Tshwane (S & H). This requires action on going missional, urban, public and educational fronts.

Since 1980s, the city has, in general, increasingly become a frontier of mission (Greenway & Monsma 1989; Bakke 1997; Conn & Ortiz 2001; Conn & Ortiz 2010; Smith 2011; Hildreth 2014: 2). Cities are expanding explosively globally and locally, the extensive migration into them presenting both a major challenge for humanity and a significant opportunity for global economic growth (Keith 2013: 2) as well as for mission (see Smith 2011). With reference to South Africa, “the arrival of people in a city often accelerates the growth of informal settlements” (cf. Keith
2013: 4) as is the case with the City of Tshwane (see 4.3.2 & 4.3.3). These painful new urban truths are calls to those who can hear that mission has to be re-orientated towards these realities.

In Chapter 4 I have furthermore argued that cities such as Tshwane are not just centres of power, wealth, culture and employment. They are “also places that concentrate the poorest of the poor in an ever expanding sprawl of informal settlements” (Bulkily & Betsill 2013: 138). With particular reference to South Africa, it is therefore an imperative for the public missional presence of the church to include on its agenda socio-economic, ecological as well as political concerns in addition to the on-going moral issues which have preoccupied the church, such as abortion, homosexuality, pornography and so on (Kusmierz & Cochrane 2013: 66). Given the extent of challenges such as poverty, socioeconomic inequality and unemployment in Tshwane (cf. 4.3.3, 4.4 and 4.5), including exclusion, and the narratives of the communities of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, the church needs to take these seriously, if it is to be serious about its mission in Tshwane (S & H).

A greater challenge is also to be found within the church itself, which might require it to integrate its basic functions with the oikos concerns – and then the forms these combined functions and concerns take must adapt to the changing realities of the contemporary city (cf. Bakke 1997: 13 – 14; Hildreth 2014: 7) of Tshwane (S & H).

For the church to maintain its missional presence in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal and to develop creative models, it immediately faces another serious challenge: the financial aspect (cf. 1.2.5; Bakke 1997: 14). Creative ways will have to be found to fuel the economic engine of these townships and that of the church to sustain LED ministry financially. Local means of survival, which emerged in the empirical findings (see 6.2.1, 9.2.3, 9.2.4), have to be considered in these contexts (S & H) and should become engines of the local economy and of self-reliance for churches and communities in these townships. Through cooperation and partnerships, the suburban church, community structures, denominational structures and other socioeconomic institutions should also be challenged with regard to this new commitment to the city.

Moreover, a commitment to the city with a mission focussed on oikos-based LED would imply the establishment of an incarnational presence of the body of Christ, particularly of the township
church (S & H) in this case. The township church (S & H) has to discover, develop and nurture a theology as big as the township (cf. Bakke 1997) and as big as the whole metro city as well as carry out actions of service and love that will credibly and visibly demonstrate its commitment. This new commitment will build on existing evangelism, spiritual formation and pastoral care and community ministries as identified in Chapter 5 (see 5.6 & 5.7) in relation to the oikos framework, and foster co-existence in townships in order for the church to share the whole gospel with the whole of creation in townships of S & H. This is the oikomissiology vision that was presented in Chapter 10.

Furthermore, a new commitment to the city with a mission focussed on oikos-based LED must be grounded in a new ethical value-based LED framework (cf. 10.4.3) as summarised in Figure 10.4. What is required is an alternative imagination, which defies the dominant growth-focussed LED policies, countering the negative perceptions about townships and their aspirations and working towards an asset-based sustainable LED compliant with the values of God’s economy (cf. 10.5).

**11.2.2. Establishing a value-based incarnational presence**

Rooted in a commitment to the city and aspiring to God’s economy values, the next step would be to establish an incarnational presence. The narrative accounts culminate in a proposal about an incarnational ministry in the form of a programme to address unemployment (cf. sections 7.3, 10.2.6 and 11.2.7). The importance of this type of programme was highlighted in previous chapters. The principle of the church as an alternative community for development was established in Chapter 3 (cf. 3.2.9). Following Christ in the city, particularly in townships, the church has to discover ways in which to incarnate itself, sweating and bleeding with – and giving recognition to – the victims of oppression (cf. 3.2.5). Such an incarnation should facilitate shared prosperity and the collective long-term wellbeing of the whole of creation that the oikos rules and values promote, as intended in relation to the action plan proposed by the joint group.

**11.2.2.1 Incarnational possibilities and examples**

Bedford-Strohm (2008: 145) points out: “the struggle to overcome poverty is an issue and a challenge for all people of goodwill. It needs competent expertise in economics, political science, psychology and education. Yet for good reasons it is a theological institution which
brings people with all these and other specialisms together”. *Oikomissiology* can pull these different proficiencies together for the purpose of building sustainable economies and communities where human and nonhuman beings could prosper in harmony with the earth.

The joint group’s reflection concurs with Bedford-Strohm’s view. They consider that it is possible to put an *oikos*-based Christian understanding of LED into practice in Tshwane (S & H) on a small scale through a model pilot project which would tap into the competent multi-disciplinary expertise of church members in Tshwane (S & H). It would be preferable that this project’s praxis would be a “public theology model …in that it affirms the public role of the church as an agent in civil society” (Bedford-Strohm 2008: 154) committed to work both for human and ecological wellbeing. The church has no other option but to let her light shine through good works (cf. Matthew 5: 16) in this way in Tshwane (S & H).

### 11.2.2.1.1 Possible interventions: options

The joint group’s reflection as reported in Chapter 7(i.e. 7.2.1) discussed two intervention options which could form the basis for an *oikos*-based Christian LED practice:

**1st option: a holistic response to HIV & AIDS in Tshwane (S & H):**

- To operate on an *oikos*-based Christian value framework

- The biggest attribute of this project will be compassion, which is an element of social justice; thus beneficiaries will be seen not as cases but as real, whole people in need of care, help and love

---

206 Bedford-Strohm (2008:146-154) presents four different models for political ethics in Christian theology which also represent different ways to put the option for the poor into practice: 1) The Charity Model (the charity model cannot be an appropriate model for this purpose), 2) The Fundamental Critical Model (this view sees the daily poverty and death of thousands of people as a direct consequence of global capitalism, and the military might of the leading world powers. The fundamental critical model does not help because it hinders the necessary debate about the economically most appropriate ways to develop an economy which guarantees a life in dignity for every human being, 3) The Political Advice model responds to a need which is regularly expressed by policymakers, who deal with concrete problems at specific times with specific needs. (…)Nevertheless the political advice model is not satisfactory either. It underestimates the importance of the value dimension in practical politics and 4) The Public Theology model which concurs with the Fundamental Critical and the Political Advice model in rejecting the claim of the Charity model that there is no role for Christian ethics and for the church in the political life. It clearly affirms the public role of the church as an agent in civil society.
- This intervention will integrate food security, psychosocial and spiritual support, advocacy, provide fellowship and offer community, treatment and economic empowerment.

2nd option: a holistic response to unemployment

- To operate on an oikos-based Christian value framework

- To be geared to address the root problem, which is economic injustice and its manifestation in the form of corruption; unemployment, poverty, crime and the like.

- The purpose will be to achieve the economic wellbeing of communities in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal

- This response will include processes addressing the perceptions and mind-set about work, advocating for the unemployed, mobilising local resources and assets for the creation of employment, fostering self-reliance through micro projects on food security and on generating income, as well as cultivate a strong work ethic.

After deliberation, as stated in section 7.2.1, the joint group prioritised the second option i.e. imagining a holistic response to addressing unemployment in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. Thus, the following comments are related to this second option.

11.2.2.1.1.1 Possibilities: A dream for LED in Tshwane (S & H) to address unemployment

11.2.2.1.1.1.1 At the household level

Most people who live in these townships who have back and front yards, whether they own the property or are just renting, fail to see what potential they have in owning or having access to some land. I suggest “urban homesteading” in each household: this will guarantee self-sufficiency, productive work, healthy food for the family, a balanced life and income. All this will be achieved in a sustainable way i.e. in harmony with the earth. The township church (S & H) could facilitate the realisation of this achievement.

---

Urban homesteading is about creating self-sufficiency in a sustainable fashion. It consists of ten elements: growing food, alternative energy sources, transportation, urban farm animals, waste solutions, water reclamation, living simply, do-it-yourself, home economics, developing neighbourhood and community (see [http://urbanhomestead.org/urban-homestead-elements/](http://urbanhomestead.org/urban-homestead-elements/) accessed 12 June 2016).
As indicated in sections 4.3.3.1 and 4.3.3.2 respectively, Soshanguve and Hammanskraal combined contain 270,555 households. Soshanguve alone accommodates a third of the city’s population who fall within low-income brackets. Many of the members of these households live in low-income residential areas allocated to the poor and the unemployed. Other assets which may be distinguished in Soshanguve include: local institutions (businesses, schools, parks, hospitals and clinics, community colleges and libraries), Citizens’ Associations (churches, block clubs and cultural groups) and gifts of individuals as in abilities (income, artists, youth, elderly and labelled people). Hammanskraal includes a number of peri-urban settlements and informal settlements. It also has a significant backlog with regard to community facilities such as clinics, libraries and orphanages, while existing facilities are not spatially well-distributed. There is a great need for LED and community- and youth-based projects and programmes that will go towards creating employment opportunities. The same assets as those distinguished in Soshanguve could also be identified in Hammanskraal although not in the same proportions.

It is possible to realise that a third (i.e. 90,185) of all the current numbers of households of these townships could become sites of LED in the shapes of urban homesteads by 2030. The six congregations that participated in this research and agreed to start an initiative to create employment as a means to eradicate poverty will facilitate this urban homestead model in these townships. These congregations will use their existing resources and assets towards this LED initiative. Together, they will annually facilitate the establishment of 6,442 urban homesteads. Figure 11.3 visually depicts an eco-friendly urban homestead, which comprises the following elements compatible to the contexts of S & H:

1. Chickens and duck pen for the production of eggs, poultry meat and manure for the garden. Indigenous breeds of this poultry stock are readily available in these townships. Poultry production instructors will need to be actively involved in an ongoing oikos-based training capacity.

2. Goats and rabbit pen for the production of red meat and manure for the compost. Goat farming is common in these townships. Rabbits are reared in the farms around S & H but will have to be introduced in these townships as a reliable source of meat. Small animal husbandry instructors will need to be also actively involved in an ongoing oikos-based training capacity.
3. Beekeeping for the production of honey. According to the Agricultural Research Council\(^\text{208}\) in Pretoria, the natural habitat of S & H is blessed with flower plants, especially the aloe, which is good for pollination and beekeeping. Beekeeping instructors from the Agricultural Research Council will need to be involved in an ongoing training capacity.

4. Organic vegetable gardens with different kinds of plants for food for humans and animals. The flowers of these vegetables will serve the bees. Agricultural extension officers will need to be involved in an ongoing training capacity.

5. Compost bin to facilitate natural decomposition of biodegradable materials to be ploughed back into the soil. Agricultural extension officers will need to be involved in an ongoing training capacity.

6. Fruit trees to provide fruits for human and animal consumption. The flowers of these trees will also serve bees. Agricultural extension officers will need to be involved in an ongoing training capacity.

7. Solar panel for an alternative energy source which is eco-friendly.

8. Harvest rain water and recycle water from domestic use for gardens, animal and human use.

9. Recycle bin for plastics, bottles and paper to foster a second economic industry and prevent pollution.

10. Plant trees and other vegetation to cover the soil of the homestead.

Initial seed capital fund must be sought from the relevant government departments for this homestead programme.

Anticipated results of this process are such that within three to six months after all implements have been gathered, the homestead could start producing vegetables, poultry, rabbits and earn residual income from sales of recyclable materials, yet people have to be taught how to run a small business – the food security issue will steadily be addressed and solved. One of the major challenges for these projects is a steady provision of water. If the provision of water is assured, 

\(^{208}\) http://www.arc.agric.za/arc-ppri/Pages/Insect%20Ecology/Poverty-Relief.aspx
within the first 12 months the homestead could start producing honey and goats; the fruit trees will on average start yielding fruits within two to three years – food for the household will no longer be an issue and possibilities for additional income will be maximised as surplus production is sold. An economic model such as this, based on the oikos concept, means that the household members prosper as they produce their own foods, eat healthily and generate income, while at the same time, the environment benefits. As the arrows in the collage (Figure 11.3) below show, the interdependence of relationships in this household benefits all inhabitants of this nuclear oikos.

In my opinion, this urban homestead model, when replicated all over the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal, would be the engine of LED at the grassroots, reinvigorated. The church in these townships has the assets and resources to facilitate this development as shown in Figure 11.4.
11.2.2.1.1.1.2. At the church level

As highlighted in sections 5.6, the churches that participated in this research, although located in peripheral and poverty-challenged areas, possess important assets such as physical and institutional structures, spiritual and moral foundations, and access to deprived grassroots at-risk communities, contact with public offices, cross-cultural relationships and predisposition to care for the poor. I illustrate how these assets could usefully develop, strengthen and mobilise vision, motivation and responsibility in tangible ways in the townships of S & H. By doing this, these churches will become visible strategic participants in LED in Tshwane. In terms of further building the urban homestead model described above, it requires of the church to consciously live true to oikomissiology as articulated in this study. In relation to an urban homestead, Figure 11.3 visually depicts the roles the church (S & H) could play towards achieving LED at the community level:

1. Through the training of local church leaders and members in the practical implementation of oikomissiology, the church will carry on proclaiming in words and deeds the message of salvation of the incarnate Christ. The message is infused with an ecological worldview, given the reality of the looming ecological crisis and threats to life. The church should be at the centre of the community to play these vital roles

2. The church premises should become a community multi-faceted facility which opens every day as needed

3. The grounds of the church must accommodate eco-friendly community projects

4. Some examples could include:
   - A recycling collection point: recyclable materials collected from households are stocked here. The church facilitates the sales of these materials
   - Demonstration of food gardens, fruit trees, goat and poultry farming are carried out in the church grounds. These demonstration units should be
collectively owned by community members and will serve the purpose of ongoing training and continuous education

- LED-related training sessions will take place on the church grounds. These will be facilitated by tapping into the human, social and spiritual capitals of the church and its networks

- The church should become a laboratory for eco-enterprise development in the community

- The church should adopt and promote eco-friendly programmes such as planting trees, use of alternative energy sources and the like.

In my experience at Stinkwater where we (the project team and I) were experimenting with some of the roles the church could play to stimulate LED, we discovered that the church had to go through a profound conversion in many aspects, such as teaching, discipleship and community ministries in order to reach the place where it offers this type of public pastoral care to entire communities. It becomes a “church unusual” – or a “new church” – which is exciting because it ministers to people on the margins in tangible ways. I am therefore of the opinion that when these six churches “catch hold” of the vision to resume these kind of roles faithfully and diligently, this will result in the church (S & H) and communities prospering by consciously becoming engines of LED.
Church leaders and their roles should also be infused with an ecological agenda in order for them to facilitate the transition to oikomissiology.

Examples of some other interventions to consider could include:

- **Household subsistence**: food security for the poor and the unemployed through local household eco-agriculture, eco-home industries, eco-household fish farming ponds along existing small rivers, household poultry pen, etc.

- **Go organic**: facilitate and promote the local production and consumption of organic foods, persuade the retail industry to invest in this programme by supporting these local organic industries, and so forth.

- **Re-imagine the creation of employment for the ordinary masses**: self-employment associated with natural resources (eco-tourism, tour guides, fishing (Bon Accord Dam), beekeeping, small commercial eco-farming (acquiring vacant municipal land on a long-term lease), a nursery for indigenous plants, recycling and producing eco-friendly products.

- **Re-imagine the viability of the economy of Tshwane with the poor in mind**: poor people to form community trusts so that they can own shares in public companies located in these townships, such as Wonderboom Nature Reserve, Tswaing meteor crater, Dinokeng Game Reserve and Wonderboom Airport.

- **Re-imagine ways of collecting and using water for industry and domestic use**: collect rain water, recycle domestic water for use in the garden, dig wells and regulate and protect underground water resources.

- **Re-imagine ways of generating energy away from polluting power stations and coal**: convert to solar energy and produce biogas for household consumption for example.

- **Re-imagine the content of educational programmes by infusing an ecological dimension all the way through**
• Lobby local and national government to obtain funding and policy support for such projects as viable and sustainable poverty eradication and marketing

• Finding partnership in groups such as Trees and Fruit for Africa, Habitat for Humanity\textsuperscript{209} and Farming God’s Way.\textsuperscript{210}

However, it must be borne in mind that in order to realise self-sufficient LED, these interventions need to engage many other levels of society and politics that are in the first place responsible for a lack of LED. These parties should be approached and challenged to support and to work towards sustainable LED and community development in the fullest sense, not only building RDP housing and paying social security grants. The interventions must therefore include an advocacy aspect which engages powers and systems for the purpose of sustainable LED.

The following examples, pertaining to ordinary people’s daily participation in the economy in order to support their livelihoods, could be considered:

• Re-imagine ways of subsidising travelling costs

• Maximise the creation of employment locally by restoring the capacities of industrial hubs such as Babelegi and GaRankuwa

• Lobby for the provision of public eco-friendly, reliable and efficient transport such as bicycles for local trips

• Protect and care for the hungry and at risk-communities such as unemployed women, children and youth, the elderly, the widows and the orphans

• Ensure functional literacy in ICT, for example, for all the working population.

11.2.3. Nurturing (keep and cultivate) community through incarnational presence

An incarnational presence will nurture the township church (S & H) by fostering an intentional practical collective vision rooted in \textit{missio Dei} and the \textit{oikos} on one hand while on the other, this presence is being sustained along with the nurturing of ecumenical solidarity and partnerships of the township church (S & H) for multi-dimensional justice, including eco-justice. It is therefore,

\textsuperscript{209} Habitat for Humanity in South Africa, see \url{www.habitat.org.za}
\textsuperscript{210} Farming God’s Way, see \url{www.farming-gods-way.org}
as portrayed in this study, important that the different sectors of the township church (S & H) remain in solidarity across denominational, cultural and ethnic lines, thus discovering unity in Christ afresh as inspired by the oikos concept. This is what the leaders of churches that participated in this study have committed to do. This solidarity and partnership befit the oikos concept in that we — “Lazarus types and Rich man types” — belong together as interdependent members of the oikos in Tshwane (S & H).

Additionally, the township church (S & H) needs to establish a relationship of solidarity with other communities in the township such as business, local government, community organisations, institutions and residents to work together for the collective wellbeing of the city. In line with its ethos of prophetic witness, the church in Tshwane (S & H) will remain in critical solidarity (cf. Kusmierz & Cochrane 2013: 69; see also 3.2.6), recognising that all these other communities and institutions are assets and part of the household of God under the lordship of Christ. They are therefore useful for the advancement of the kingdom of God (cf. 3.2.8.3, 10.2.8.3) in the public sphere of life in Tshwane (S & H) (cf. 10.2.7). The township church (S & H) has to recognise a link between faith and activism as crucial for the Church to fit into the world around us. Leffel (2007: xix) asserts: “this activism is done in the name of the gospel – as this is understood in the image of shalom: a world of peace, justice and reconciliation” (cf. Mangayi 2014b: 136) for the whole of creation or oikos.

11.2.4. Fostering a concrete spirituality of economic transformation, liberation and justice

In Chapter 7 (i.e. section 7.2.1) Rev. Phiri noted that practical and concrete spirituality is most appropriate. By practical we mean taking seriously real life issues, so we are going to live out there by the spirit of Christ dealing with real matters, real issues affecting our communities (Rev. Phiri, 15 February 2014) including that of ecology. Practitioners of this spirituality should ideally include the rank and file of the church in particular and of the society at large. In relation to the oikos, this spirituality will be central in inspiring practitioners to live together with the beauty of other species and with the mountain ranges and valleys of the Tshwane area, as well as with the fruits of the earth, in such a way that the life of the whole household of God prospers.

A concrete spirituality of economic transformation, liberation and justice, including eco-justice, is needed in Tshwane (S & H) (cf. 3.2.7, 3.3.2, 5.6) and will pave the way in connecting individual
and community lives with the life of the oikos. This again links up with an integrated, holistic spirituality which allows for a concomitant expression of word and deed as lived out in community. This spirituality has to go much further in mapping out a way of life which is connected to the “garden” of Tshwane’s ecological wealth to ensure social-ecological welfare and economic justice for all the inhabitants of Tshwane as well as inspiring political participation and accountability. The ultimate aim is to impact communities for the better and foster ethical behaviours in public as part of Christian public witness in Tshwane (S & H). Campolo (2008: 34) (while primarily addressing Americans) contends that practical acts of loving our neighbour transform us into personal expressions of the Christ we worship. He challenges all of us to recover the active nature of our faith and to let it infiltrate all aspects of our lives, including ecological concerns. For the fulfilment of this aim, concrete spirituality enables the church to position itself “in the middle, at the nexus, of the tension between ‘powerlessness and power’, it has a special responsibility towards those who are forced to the margins by the powers that be” (Kusmierz & Cochrane 2013: 83; see also Villa-Vicencio 1992: 30). In the same vein, Campolo (2008: 34 - 35) expands, “God has chosen to use the church to usher in the fullness of His presence in history, and the primary way through which the church changes the world is by commissioning its members to serve in each and every social institution” (see Eph.3:10; 6:12; Mt 13: 33; Mt 5:13; Am 5:24). The church in Tshwane (S & H) has to re-energise its members who are already in public office (see 5.6, point 3) to live out a value-based ethical life, as members of the household of God, in concrete ways as part of their spirituality. These members need to be commissioned or be publicly set aside by the church as its ministers in the public sphere.

In Tshwane (S & H) a concrete spirituality of economic transformation, liberation and justice needs to be missional, urban, public and educational, embracing all aspects of social life including ecological concerns so that the whole of creation has life to the full (cf. John 10:10) and prospers. Given the history of Tshwane (S & H) (cf. Chapters 4 and 5), this spirituality has to go as far as addressing matters related to Christian social ethics on matters of LED. Emmanuel Katangole furnishes insights on this, realising that “the challenge of Christian social ethics in Africa is to question even the cherished notions of progress, development, and democracy – notions that form the imaginative framework of thinking about the future of Africa” (Katangole 2010:14). That is why in this study, an interrogation of the current economic development system and strategy was carried out. As a result, it was realised that the current anthropocentric system is not serving the majority. Therefore, a sort of concrete spirituality
based on *oikos* has emerged and is suggested as the way forward in this study. This spirituality has to bring about a mind shift, in that Christians and the participants who participated in this research in particular, reach a place where, starting from their own homes, they live out an eco-friendly lifestyle in their communities so as to model and influence all sectors in Tshwane (S & H). In this spirituality Christians should address economic-ecological issues of Tshwane here and now in anticipation of the eschatological fulfilment of the “new earth”. This is done in such a way that Christians connect their spirituality in a holistic sense of living spiritually in God’s garden, God’s city and God’s household of Tshwane.

11.2.5. Discovering and practising an *oikomissiology* focussed on LED

In Chapter 3 (sections 3.3.2 & 3.3.3), different elements of a theology of LED and an economic paradigm, based on the *oikos*, were emphasised. The theology of LED which emerged stands out for me, because its goals go beyond anthropocentric concerns to include ecological concerns in ways which promote sustainability. Such a theology / missiology is in a creative interaction between theological / theoretical themes – like liberation, reconstruction or rebuilding and working to produce and distribute the bounty of the earth – and praxis and spirituality. A new commitment to the city, particularly an engagement with LED and concrete spirituality, needs to be translated into a theology of LED (cf. section 3.3.1) based on the *oikos* concept – that is the *oikomissiology* suggested in this study. *Oikomissiology* of LED needs to be translated into a transformed praxis, and such a transformed praxis will again inform our theology of LED – in a cycle of action-reflection-action.

Sections 3.3.3.1.1 – 3.3.3.1.7 draw attention to the different elements to be considered in the application of this theology in Tshwane (S & H) – it is a transformed praxis. In section 9.2.6.5 the church’s roles towards LED emanating from empirical research and literature towards a transformed praxis were already indicated (cf. sections 6.2.1, 6.3.2 & 6.4.1).

11.2.6. Proclaiming and sustaining life and *shalom* as central to *oikomissiology* focussed on LED in Tshwane (S & H)

The incarnational presence of the township church in Tshwane (S & H), being in solidarity with the city – particularly with the marginalised townships – has to be translated into visible actions for justice or *shalom* (social, economic and ecological) and wholeness in the public sphere (cf. sections 3.2.6, 3.2.8.2, and 10.2.1.2). In order for the church to proclaim and sustain life, it first
has to confront death in its heart emanating from ignorance, apathy, intellectual captivity and the inability to transcend the hopeless reality around it with clear vision and fatigue as it engages in the project of life. The voices of death must be allowed to confront the Church and its captivity, the Church and its complacency in the face of contestation (cf. De Beer 2008: 193). In short, the township church must confront death in all its forms in the townships by proclaiming and sustaining life, through LED in our case. It implies the township church (S & H) being able to exercise its faith in the realities of everyday life in these townships.

This life-giving faith should be real, ordered, focussed and at work in the important realities of life (cf. Chambers 1992, devotional for April 4) in the townships of S and H. This life-giving faith must confront the signs of death which still exist in these townships (cf. 4.3.3, 4.4, 4.5, Chapters 6, 7 and 8). One such sign is unemployment. The incarnational presence of the township church (S & H) should therefore become the channel for propagating the life-giving faith and shalom in the files and ranks of the community, church and its partners so that a holistic redemption is realised – as in Christ, the purpose of incarnation was redemption (cf. Chambers 1992, devotional for April 6; see also 2 Corinthians 5:21). I contend that in order for the church to become this instrument of redemption to the glory of God as far as LED in Tshwane (S & H) is concerned, the former has to learn to convincingly engage the powers that be in the city with an alternative strategy which could transform the current economy for the better. In this study, an alternative strategy, based on oikomissiology as a framework, is suggested.

Unfortunately, the church in Tshwane (S & H) has failed to suggest such a strategy and has even become unable to take advantage of opportunities for community public participation, such as the imbizo,211 which take place in these townships. Reflecting on Christianity and political engagement in post-Apartheid South Africa, Kumalo (2014: 226) contends,

In this newly democratic society, the churches have neither found a clear and coherent political theology, nor a strategy to engage political leaders. Neither has Christianity learnt how to take advantage of the culture of izimbizo to bring about social change. Instead mainstream Christianity has retreated to its denominational enclaves.

---

211 Kumalo (2014: 220) explains: the word imbizo refers to a public community gathering under the local leader. It derives from a Zulu word ukubiza, to call or summon. A similar event would be an Indaba: a grand community meeting often called by the king to address people on issues of a grave nature. The aim and objectives of an imbizo are (1) to promote interaction between those entrusted with the leadership of the community and ordinary citizens, (2) to provide a public space for people to raise their concerns and aspirations about their social, economic, and political situations, (3) to strategise on how to solve some of the challenges faced by the people at the local level, and (4) to allow authorities to report back to the community and for the community to keep officials accountable.
The “izimbizo” are cultural platforms where issues related to community development, progress in the community and the like are discussed and planned. For the sake of proclaiming and sustaining life in Tshwane (S & H), the church has a responsibility to take advantage of these platforms by infusing them with theological perspectives of development such as the oikos framework which aims at more than just material wellbeing in these townships. The church in Tshwane (S & H) does possess the resources and potential to use these platforms for rebuilding the local economy (see 5.10, 6.2.1) even though these platforms have become manipulated by the political elite as indicated in the narratives (see section 6.2.1). By participating in this way the church will also be saved from its egocentric, inward looking life by contributing and sharing its resources with society and getting involved by stepping up to a place of influence in these townships (S & H) to model Christian/Biblical economic values such as those conveyed by the oikos concept.

11.2.7. A holistic church initiative for oikomissiology focussed on LED in Tshwane (S & H).

A church-based initiative for LED needs to be embedded in a broader strategy for transformative urban missiology in Tshwane (S & H). In order to sustain the township church’s critical engagement in the LED sector in Tshwane (S & H), the different modes of ministry need to recognise and support this engagement (cf. 10.2.4.2, 10.3.2.2). This initiative will mobilise all the resources and potential that the church has for community building (cf. 5.10), as well as traditional and cultural assets (cf. 9.2.4, 7.1.1) and work towards restoring fundamental relations for life (cf. 3.3.1) which will engender long-term collective wellbeing in Tshwane (S & H).

This study has focussed on LED, within the broader context of a holistic model for urban mission based on the oikos concept. Greenway and Monsma (1989: 53) argue that a holistic model for urban mission includes conversion to Christ and discipleship, church planting and development, community ministry addressing human needs and a cosmic concern for all that God has created.

This study concurs with Greenway and Monsma and agrees that strategies for conversion to Christ and discipleship, church planting and church development, community ministry, as well as the broader ministry that addresses global and cosmic concerns, should be part of a holistic model. However, this study stretches these strategies to: 1) consider an ecological worldview
(cf. 3.3.2.1), 2) address the ecological crisis as related to the current anthropocentric economic activity (cf. 3.3.2.2), 3) safeguard creation’s integrity in the pursuit of economic interests (cf. 3.3.2.3), 4) investigate the practicalities related to participation in the holistic planetary agenda (cf. 3.3.2.4) and 5) emphasise sustainability, collective wellbeing or shalom and justice as the goals of an economy.

From the previous chapters and the foregoing, I deduce that in order for an authentic oikomissiology focussed on LED in an African city of Tshwane (S & H) to be realised, the township church (S & H) has to consider fourteen critical matters:

1). Developing a multi-disciplinary competence is required to address socioeconomic, political, ecological and historical legacies of injustice, discrimination and the like

2). Imagining new or creative ways of thinking about mission to enable the church to achieve a balance between the spiritual project and oikos-based LED project: There is therefore a need for the church to work with informed socially and ecologically-oriented theologians / missiologists able to integrate theory and praxis at all times

3). Putting in place an ongoing professional development of church leaders in oikomissiology with particular emphasis on LED

4). Using township church (S & H) facilities to become multi-purpose centres for the purpose of collective wellbeing of the whole of creation.

5). Facilitating processes for township communities to become participant citizens in oikos-based LED

6). Educating communities that the economy as a sector can only be fully understood as it is related to other sectors including ecology.

7). “Conscientising” communities that current LED strategy alone cannot produce a just society in Tshwane (S & H)

8). Promoting Affirmative Action in relation to an oikos-based LED in Tshwane. The fact is that if we expand current LED strategy without paying attention to inequality which reproduces an unequal LED we will continue to reproduce an unequal LED in Tshwane
9) Promoting an agenda for oikos-based LED justice in Tshwane (S & H) which speaks to affirmative distribution of economic resources by persuading the political power to intervene. This could include: legitimisation of the township economy (through the public and private sectors to subsidise the process), oikos-based LED education for entire communities (gathering insights from public, private and expert institutions). This education will move communities from capacity (training) to capabilities (doing and applying learning which leads to oikos-based LED) and will enable communities to read the world (around them)

10). Researching the reasons why churches and communities are failing to access and or use LED resources in Tshwane

11). Developing a sense of agency: the process could include ecological-economic empowerment (decent sustainable livelihoods) and social empowerment (township communities as active social agents for transformation)

12) Promoting ethical values to guide oikos-based LED which should inspire townships to choose LED together with the market society in harmony with nature (i.e. a humanistic and sustainability emphasis) and not LED for the market society as is currently the case.

13) Highlighting what oikos-based LED can / cannot do in Tshwane. An emphasis should be placed on LED which discourages greed and promotes sustainability in Tshwane

14). Approaching oikos-based LED education with some sociological insights and making it lifelong learning for the sustainability of the township communities of S & H.

These fourteen considerations enumerated above stand out for me as key insights I have gained in this research, which will certainly improve my theological / missiological praxis going forward in doing mission in an African city such as Tshwane (S & H). They are also, in my opinion, significant to the contribution this study makes to the discipline of urban missiology in the said African city.

The following material elucidates how I structured the joint group’s inputs about the action plan (i.e. a church-based initiative / programme) into an adapted generic, non-profit project concept document format for clarity. The theological framework for LED (i.e. oikos) chosen in this study is embedded in this format.
11.3 The action plan: A concept document for the proposed programme

I have arrived at the sketch action plan, which I present here, in conjunction with the joint group as part of the last session of mini-consultation three, reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.2.2). A professional action plan proposal will need to be written as a post-research exercise when the application of this research’s findings and recommendations will be considered by the research participants for the purpose of implementing this programme. Nevertheless, having this sketch action plan shows that; it is possible for this study to transition from providing theoretical / conceptual and abstract knowledge to carrying out practical and concrete transformative praxis and action which befit the nature and intention of this applied study (cf. 1.5).

11.3.1 Name of the programme: CALED (S & H)

The joint group suggested and envisaged a holistic strategy for a programme on creating employment on a small scale through a model pilot initiative, i.e. a holistic response to unemployment. Rev. Rustof (17 February 2014) points out, “we need to get the churches interested to form a co-operative”. Mr Matjeke (17 February 2016) adds: “A group or collective action such as a co-operative geared to create employment in Tshwane (S & H) is needed”. Through this ecumenical action, Rev. Mokone contends: “the local church needs to address this issue [i.e. unemployment] as well as co-operating with other churches so that we will be able to harness our strength together and be able to find something that we can do together to help our people”. I suggested that it might be called: “Christian Action for LED in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal (CALED (S & H))”. This is a working title at this stage; the actual name will be finalised later after wider consultations with other stakeholders in these townships have taken place.

11.3.2 Description of and rationale for the programme

Mr Matjeke (17 February 2016) asserts: “It is about time for the church to work together so that we can have a voice on community issues. We need to stand together about social issues to the government and community” (see section 7.2.2). Drawing from the joint group’s inputs, CALED (S & H) will seek to be an ecumenical urban ministry initiative which will initially involve the six
churches which participated in this research, and thereafter open up to other interested groups. It will operate on a Christian value framework (i.e. oikos) which will be geared to address the root problems: economic injustice, relational deprivation, anthropocentrism and their manifestation in the form of unemployment, poverty, crime and the like.

Drawing from discussion inputs of the joint focus group as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. section 7.2.2) which took place at Stinkwater on 17 February 2014, the purpose of this initiative will be to achieve the long-term and sustainable economic wellbeing of communities in S and H. CALED (S & H) will include: 1) processes for addressing the perception and mind-set about work, 2) advocating for the unemployed, 3) mobilising local resources and assets including ecological resources for the creation of employment (cf. Rev. Phiri, 17 February 2014), 4) fostering self-reliance through micro projects on food security, home industries and the like (cf. Rev. Maponya, 17 February 2016) and 5) generating income through small businesses, as well as fostering an ethos of hard work (cf. Pastor Megala, 17 February 2016). In short, Mrs Phiri (17 February 2016) elucidated the purpose of CALED when she said: “the focus of the study that we need to be doing here is to find practical ways of improving how we are going to create those jobs” in our communities.

11.3.3 Theological impulses, values and ethos for this initiative

As articulated in Chapter 10 (section 10.1, 10.2.1.1), the source of life for this project is missio Dei while the oikos, as the ground from which we participate in God’s mission or missio Dei, serves as the hermeneutic key. Participant church leaders’ insights on their churches’ mission orientations highlighted in Chapter 5 (sections 5.6 & 5.7) clearly indicate that these churches view themselves as partisans in God’s mission through the various activities that they are involved in.

With particular reference to this ecumenical programme, one of the joint group members summarises the overriding principles which should guide it, when he said:

*Theology has always divided the church; love has always united the community. This initiative should be built on one fundamental value i.e. love. We love God and we love our neighbour as we love ourselves. We must get clues from the parable of the Good Samaritan in the Bible – we must adopt his type of theology. We must become blind to these superficial theological divisions* (Rev. Phiri, 17 February 2014).

From this input, the joint group suggested the following as principles:
• Theology has always divided the church; love and service have always united the community. In addition to the oikos values, this initiative should also include two fundamental values, i.e. love and service, which the joint group perceived as cutting across the rest of the oikos values (cf. Mr Matjeke & Rev. Phiri, 17 February 2014).

• Jesus brought love and served humankind in his environment, and CALED (S & H) (cf. Rev. Phiri, 17 February 2014) must emulate this. According to Rev. Mokone; “These two overarching values are in tandem with the greatest commandment (i.e. love God and love your neighbour as you love yourself)” (Rev. Mokone, 17 February 2014).

• We must become blind to the superficial theological divisions; we should rather be inspired by the fact that the community ministry values that used to guide the church have fallen down today and they need to be lifted up or regained (cf. Rev. Phiri, 17 February 2014).

• Abandon selfishness, self-centredness and the like to foster interdependency, collaboration and partnership in order to achieve collective wellbeing as stated by Mr Matjeke (17 February 2014) and Rev. Phiri (17 February 2014).

The notion of love and service as two fundamental values to be considered together with the oikos values is pertinent because they reinforce the central beliefs embedded in the oikos framework such as interdependence, belonging together, serving one another and surviving together as human and nonhuman beings, inhabitants of the household of God. I believe that these two fundamental values are also taught and accepted in different Christian theological and other religious persuasions, such as Islam and Buddhism. My assumption is therefore that an oikos framework and values, majoring on “love the oikos and serve the oikos” have potential to unite the church in Tshwane (S & H) as well as other religions for the purpose of formulating a collective oikos-based action to address economic injustice and poverty in these townships. This assumption could be the focus of another study. This research applied the oikos concept solely to the Christian groups that participated in this study.

11.3.3.1 Values as related to the oikos in this initiative

Building on the theological principles obtained from research participants (i.e. Mr Matjeke, Rev. Mokone & Rev. Phiri) captured here above in relation to the oikos and the notion that love and service are overarching, foundational and cross-cutting to the rest of the oikos values, the joint group, as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. section 7.2.2) further contends that love and service
function in tandem with the greatest commandment (Matthew 22:36-40). Thus, it motivates one to act out of unselfishness. Therefore, through this programme the churches as disciples of Christ: 1) are to be servants to communities (humans and non-humans) and to God as emphasised by Rev. Maponya and Mr Matjeke (17 February 2014), 2) are expected to be selfless, to be volunteers, and to give instead of hoping to gain something as suggested by Mr Matjeke (17 February 2014) and 3) are to use the earth and other resources in such a way that it benefits not only humans but also other non-humans for their subsistence said Rev. Maponya (17 February 2016) and 4) are to apply themselves to the earth and the way in which we take something out of it must acknowledge God for giving it away as well as benefiting us for having been good servants, as suggested by Rev. Maponya (17 February 2014).

Therefore, I propose that CALED (S & H) give a practical expression to, and be an integrated embodiment of, oikos values and goals in its implementation as an alternative economic – ecological paradigm (cf. specifically Chapter 3, sections 3.3.3.1.1 – 3.3.3.1.7). Fundamental values of love and service extended to include an ecological dimension should be the cornerstone and backbone of CALED (S & H). Rev. Phiri (17 February 2014) emphasises: “Jesus brought love and he served humankind in his environment. These two values (i.e. love and service) speak and could be expanded to the rest of the oikos values”.

**Love should be the cornerstone of CALED (S & H) (cf. Matthew 22:37, 39)**

- Rev. Phiri (17 February 2014) declares: “This initiative should be built on one fundamental value i.e. love. We love God and we love our neighbour as we love ourselves” including nonhuman beings. An unselfish love to the whole of creation should be a core value for CALED (S & H). De la Porte & Mailula (2006: 72) explain, “An unselfish love is real love; it includes caring, respect and trust and excludes selfishness”. This caring love is in line with the golden rule of “Do unto others as you want them to do unto you” (Matthew 7:12).

- An unselfish love to the whole of creation in CALED (S & H) will implies: 1) a sensitivity to community needs including non-human communities, 2) respect for community ideas, values and beliefs, 3) holding honest and open communication about the community economy – ecology and 4) patience by allowing a mutually beneficial relationship to develop between humans and nonhuman beings as part of LED.
Service should be the backbone of CALED (S & H) (cf. John 13)

Rev. Mokone (17 February 2014) asserts: “If we love one another we will also serve one another and bring redemption to each other”.

- Serving others including creation will also serve one’s own best interests. Actively serving others means that one does things that support their personal choices and goals (cf. de la Porte & Mailula 2006: 74)
- Service is particularly important and powerful for those in leadership and authority. Churches as servant communities should focus on the development goals of all communities who are in their parish / locality
- Service as a value in this programme has to be 1) unconditional (cf. John 13), while 2) compassion should be the motivation for all service, 3) which should not be given with ulterior motives like recognition and the expectation of reward and 4) churches, as faith communities, exist to serve others. Each individual member must strive for the benefit and best interests of the whole community to achieve collective long-term wellbeing.

11.3.3.2 CALED (S & H)’s alignment with development objectives

The choice and motivation by the joint group to address unemployment are pertinent given contextual realities as highlighted in Chapter 4 (see section 4.3.3). Employment is central to sustainable LED (see 1.7.4, cf. Blakely and Leigh 2010). Minister Gordhan,212 drawing from the National Development Plan 2030, affirms “that employment creation has to be accelerated if growth is to be inclusive”. The joint group is also of the opinion that the unemployment issue is apparently not resulting in viable remedial interventions in these townships. In addition to this the group made the point that the church, in particular as one of the most important institutions at grassroots level, is silent (cf. 8.2.5.1, see also Prof Buffel, 17 November 2015). This programme, therefore, gives the church an opportunity to do something about unemployment in these townships. As it is, the government runs economic affairs without inputs from institutions such as churches and residents; consequently, the current LED strategy has not benefited from residents’ or churches’ social, spiritual and moral capital (cf. 3.2.2).

Thus, the churches that participated in this research are inspired to stop being just theological institutions; they must also become practical. They are therefore determined to find practical ways of improving lives of communities by creating jobs. The reality in these townships, stated Mrs Phiri (17 February 2014), is that “people do not have anywhere to go and work”. A possible reason for this attitude may be, as pointed out by Opp and Osgood (2013: 8), that “local economic development has grown even more complex and complicated as the broader economy (...) has shifted in response to globalisation, technological changes, immigration, and a general aging of the population”. Grassroots communities such as Soshanguve and Hammanskraal townships will need catalysts and hands-on professionals to assist them in positioning themselves in ways which will eventually benefit them economically. Mrs Phiri substantiates the need of catalysts, as reported in Chapter 7 (i.e. section 7.2.2), when she observes that “…worse still they [people] have a lazy syndrome. And the dependency syndrome as well has destroyed the whole creativity” (Mrs Phiri, 17 February 2014). This confirms that people of Tshwane (S & H) have not yet come to realise that they can create their own type of employment with assets such as land in their yard, by growing vegetables and keeping some hens for eggs and meat for example. CALED (S & H) should conscientise communities about this possibility. Pastor Megala (17 February 2014) for example, emphasises, 

...skills available in communities need to be identified ... There is also a need for educating our people especially in the area of skills empowerment ...skills that people can do which they don't need to go to the university to acquire them I don't think one needs to go to the university to do farming. One doesn't need to go to the university to do carpentry, knitting, sewing and so forth. There are certain things that our communities need to be helped with to learn and to be empowered in.

Further, interview findings perceive churches in these townships as possessing assets that have the potential to contribute towards the realisation of a just economy in Tshwane (cf. 7.4, 8.2.14). CALED (S & H) must build upon these assets for initiating asset-based development processes.

11.3.4 Project structure and management

Having discussed and established the need for an initiative such as CALED (S & H) including its guiding values and principles, the joint group was eager to explore possibilities regarding a structure as a matter of urgency. Mrs Phiri (17 February 2014) recommends: “churches should
stop being only theological institutions but also become practical. It is the practical aspect which I think over the years has been neglected by the church” (cf. section 7.2.2). An appropriate, practical structure is needed in order for the church in Tshwane (S & H) to respond to unemployment in a useful way. Rev. Phiri (17 February 2016) cautions: “Structure must house life’ not ‘life housing structure’: if people can [visualise] what the outcome of life would be people will [put in place a structure to realise that vision].”

From the various inputs made by the joint groups as reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.2.2) I highlight the following principles with regard to structure: 1) “Structure must house life” not vice versa, 2) it should be accessible to beneficiaries, 3) it should suit the type of communities that we want to serve and 4) it should comply with government’s requirements for inclusion of other religious groups such as African Initiated groups. Hence, the churches interested opted to form a co-operative (i.e. a company that is owned and managed by the people who work in it) in these townships. It was suggested that the six churches that participated in this research, represented by their leaders, will be founding members of this cooperative. Nevertheless, Mr Matjjeke (17 February 2016) emphasises: “this structure should suit the type of communities that we want to serve. It should be open to embrace African Initiated churches and other faith groups (be more like a Religious Forum for Job Creation in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal) in our townships”.

11.3.5 Beneficiaries / owners of CALED (S & H)

In terms of beneficiaries, Rev. Rustof (17 February 2014) clarified that “we should include everybody in the communities who is unemployed regardless of their faith or denomination affiliation” including race and gender. Indirect beneficiaries include all household members and society at large in Tshwane (S & H). Mr Dlamini (17 February 2014) suggests that “we must also make sure that even the study and planning group has to be representative of almost every interest group that is available in that community”. To sum up, it is evident that beneficiaries and owners of CALED (S & H) will be the unemployed and local churches will be facilitators and supporters of this initiative.
1.3.6 Methodology

11.3.6.1. Philosophy and development approach

Research participants drew attention to the following pointers in relation to philosophy and approach:

- Beyond dependency: Rev. Maponya (17 February 2016) contends:
  
  *There is a dependency syndrome… I mean we are at a point where society only looks to government to provide its needs without society getting involved to provide for its needs itself. The dependency syndrome is one of the main things which create a barrier for the creation of work (jobs), entrepreneurship, and the like…. And the danger is that one day the resources that we are depending upon are going to be depleted.*

The philosophy and approach of this programme should aim beyond dependency. Empirical findings highlighted in Chapters 6, 7 and 8 spoke of and recognised dependency as a major stumbling block for sustainable LED in the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal (cf. Schwartz 2007). As pointed out above, this dependency creates a barrier to the creation of work (jobs) and to the thriving of a spirit of entrepreneurship. Because of dependency, people are losing creativity, sitting back, lining up for a grant. Further, in relation to grants, Rev Maponya (17 February 2016) adds, these “shouldn’t become dependency pillars for society to progress through. Those grants may be a push towards the direction of creativity but when those become something that we depend upon then we have a sitting society that is not going anywhere” (cf. 7.2.1 & 7.2.2).

- Asset based and aimed at sustainability: Rev. Rustof (17 February 2014) declares: *it [initiative] should be a genuine action befitting our context in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. We must look at what we have … and make use of what is available in the community*” Therefore, the skills and capabilities available in communities need to be identified. The church will be expected to volunteer its assets and resources for this initiative almost free of charge. The local natural resources will be tapped into for the creation of jobs. The initiative should be in harmony with the earth (cf. sections 7.2.1 & 7.2.2)

- It will be an οἰκός-inspired ecumenical / religious response to issues of unemployment. Rev. Maponya (17 February 2014) asserts:
We are stewards of God’s earth. We know that the earth and all that is in it belong to God for the benefit of all creation. Thus, we will use the earth in such a way that it benefits not only humans but also other non-humans for the glory that he gave the world to us.

The church has to work and stand together about socioeconomic as well as ecological issues affecting the townships of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal.

- It will be a prophetic witness: Rev. Phiri (17 February 2014) suggest that “we should clarify the whole notion of the separation of the church and the state. It is as if the government runs things on its own and has no spiritual voice”. Further he amplifies: “As the church we need to come to government having done some research recognising the needs of the people which we want the government and the church to address” (Rev. Phiri, 17 February 2016).

11.3.6.2. Research based initiative to solve unemployment

As reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.2.2), the joint group was adamant that this programme should not be a “copycat” or a duplicate of any other, but a genuine action befitting the context of Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. Therefore, it is required that:

- Research identifies and confirms the needs of the people which we want the government and the church to address

- Research is undertaken into what is available around us (the six churches). We must look at what we have first and then make use of what is available in the community. Study what our infrastructure is like

- Research will start with current statistics and will continue to document data for ongoing and future reference

- The prophetic witness of the church should be inspired by ecological-socioeconomic analysis, which will include advocacy.

11.3.7 Partners

Initially, the six participating churches will be the founding partners of this cooperative. It is also understood that this initiative will require strategic cooperation and collaboration for its success.
Hence, co-operating with other churches, other faith-based organisations and institutions that work towards rebuilding local communities sustainably, will be essential. Potential new partners will be given the opportunity to work with the cooperative on condition that they have accepted the vision and the framework of this programme.

11.3.8 Phased Project Plan

As reported in Chapter 7 (section 7.2.2), the joint group suggested that the starting point in this process is to set clear objectives, goals and values. Boundaries and priorities or key programme areas of this initiative must be spelled out. Then, the whole notion of the separation of the church and the state needs to be clarified as it pertains to the functions of the church’s engagement in the public sphere.

A preliminary discussion about a phased programme plan took place at the last session of the mini-consultation which took place at Stinkwater on 17 February 2016 (see section 7.2.2). A sketch is presented below in Table 11.1, which summarises the processes to be undertaken. A detailed phased programme will be devised with the group as a post-research project once the concept of this cooperative has first been accepted by other key stakeholders from the participating churches.

Table 11.1: Key initial processes to be undertaken towards the establishment of this programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives and goals</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Dissemination of this research’s findings to congregations in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal</td>
<td>Short presentations to congregations, short summaries to different stakeholders.</td>
<td>Researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Conscientisation and mobilisation</td>
<td>Short presentations to congregations and to interested stakeholders. These will include animation, role playing and drama.</td>
<td>Researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Formalisation and Constituting meeting, election of Board</td>
<td>Delegated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Identification of resources in terms of kind of household, natural / physical resources and human capabilities</td>
<td>Inventory of assets, inventory of skills, resource people / institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 5. | Trial implementation and demonstrations inspired by adult education teaching techniques<sup>213</sup> | • Training and capacity building  
• Advocacy /lobbying  
• Some project examples include (cf. 11.2.2.1.1): food security (gardens and poultry), home industries (knitting and sewing, catering, jam making and baking), other small businesses (i.e. eco-tourism, beekeeping and the like). | Resource individuals, institutions and community members |
| 6. | Implementation | • On-the-job training and capacity building  
• Development and consolidation of food security projects | Resource individuals, institutions and community members |

It is obvious from the foregoing, particularly the philosophy, missiology and approach proposed for the programme, that this study has made participants realise that one of the key actions needed to address the economic situation in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal is creation of employment in a sustainable manner. It is also encouraging to notice that participants rely on their own local assets and local natural resources first before they will look elsewhere. They also emphasised ecumenical cooperation, research-based processes and perceived the proposed programme as a prophetic witness to the city (S & H). I hope that this initial inspiration or insight gained will be developed further within their congregations and interested parties, so as to guide the processes of formalisation, identification and mobilisation of resources and implementation.

11.4 Conclusion of the chapter

In this chapter, a model which embodies a transformed missional (i.e. oikomissiology) praxis for the African city of Tshwane (S & H) was the focal point of the discourse. It was established and argued that in order for this praxis to emerge the churches need to: 1) make a new commitment to the city focussed on oikos-based LED, 2) establish an incarnational presence – an initiative to create employment has been suggested and considered, 3) be involved in nurturing the community, 4) foster a concrete spirituality, 5) discover and practice a theology of LED, 6) proclaim and sustain life and 7) embrace a holistic model for LED.

A sketch of an action plan for a model programme – including the theological impulses, values, ethos, and alignment with development goals, philosophy and approach underpinning it – was presented. The development of a detailed action plan will be pursued by the group at a later
stage when ways of applying this research will be considered. That will be the post-formal research project; implementation phase which will also be recorded carefully.
Chapter Twelve

CONCLUSION OF THE STUDY: SUMMARY

Regardless of the fact that the economic situation of townships such as S and H seems hopeless, communities living in these townships are surviving in one way or another. This study set out to discover and explore the role/s that the township church, as an asset, could play towards LED in Tshwane (S & H) in relation to other community organisations and structures; roles which might lead to correcting different ills that affect the struggling peripheral urban communities of Tshwane (S & H). The study also sought to establish whether the church can be re-positioned or re-discovered as an asset, which could be utilised to form strong community structures in local communities, and consequently become a foundation for community development and LED. The general theoretical literature on this subject and specifically in the context of Tshwane / South Africa is insubstantial regarding several vital questions of the church’s missional involvement in the LED discourse. Hence this study sought to answer one of these questions: What role/s could the township church play towards LED in Tshwane, in particular, in S and H?

Narratives and interviews were the primary sources. These were supplemented by literature as well as field visits. In particular, narratives were used within the pastoral praxis cycle as a framework, while the oikos concept was the hermeneutic key.

12.1. The pastoral praxis cycle: A reflection

An adapted pastoral praxis cycle was suggested and applied as a contextual methodological framework for empirical research and for undertaking theology / missiology (cf. 1.8.2, Chapters 6 & 7). In aiming towards the goal of this study I opted for a narrative approach as I worked with grassroots church leaders representing six congregations. The pastoral praxis cycle was used together with mini-consultations (i.e. focus group discussions) as a tool for data collection, in an attempt to demonstrate a contextual approach to missiology and theology.
In conclusion, I would like to briefly reflect on the praxis cycle and its use in this study. It is not my intention to evaluate the praxis cycle in comparison with other methods, but rather to describe my own experience.

I found the praxis cycle to be very useful for doing missiology in the city, specifically in townships of S and H. It gave us (the researcher and participants) the opportunity to analyse the communities of S and H in a more disciplined and deliberate fashion. Holland and Henriot’s questions which were adapted for this study enhanced the structured manner in which we moved along with the process, from insertion to the pastoral action phase. The process of reflection entered into by the group gave me the opportunity to reflect on these questions, to integrate various sources and disciplines, and to move towards developing a transformational LED ministry praxis.

The ongoing character of the praxis cycle is also helpful in raising new questions and new problems, further insights to be explored from the interaction with the Bible, other models and praxes of ministry, while new lessons are learnt in the process. This is what emerged at the reflective feedback session during the last phase of the mini-consultations (see 7.3) as participants highlighted fresh lessons learned. These insights and lessons as well as the overall findings of this research are the basis for further analysis and reflection which will guide the actions of the proposed action programme suggested by the participants of the joint mini-consultation group.

During the research process I also observed that church leaders who participated had started to see the importance of social analysis for contextual reflection. Hence, their suggestion that the proposed action programme must be contextually appropriate and research-based (see 10.3.3.2 & 10.3.6.2). This is a significant turn-around, especially for participants from Pentecostal and conservative evangelical churches in the group who are inclined to start and finish with the Bible in theological reflections and were not exposed to a contextual approach to understanding theology.

Lastly, the praxis cycle was very useful because it opened the way for more disciplined theologising by the participants as we journeyed together from insertion to the action plan phase. It functioned effectively with these grassroots groups, guiding their reflections and their own growth from subjective experiences to an informed, responsible and life-giving praxis. Therefore, it befitted the type of participatory process used in this research. Another feature evinced when using the praxis cycle with these grassroots leaders is its effectiveness towards
developing local theologies and bringing socioeconomic challenges and the Word of God into
dialogue with one another. The Word was made flesh as participants reflected on their
socioeconomic realities in their contexts to the point where they realised that the Incarnate
Christ is prompting them to carry out a hopeful action (see Chapters 6 and 7).

12.2. The mini-consultations (focus group discussions) and interviews: A reflection

Both these data collection techniques operated satisfactorily without major hindrances for this
research in that they assisted with the collection of dense and important information needed to
sufficiently answer the research questions as evidenced in Chapters 6, 7 and 8.

The narrative approach opted for in the mini-consultations offered participants the freedom to
tell their stories and share their experiences in the way they know best. Thus, major ideologies
or concepts were spoken of in these stories in laypersons’ language. For the researcher, one
challenge was to integrate these voices, undiluted and unaltered in many instances, in a
responsible manner into the thesis. Another challenge was for the researcher / facilitator to
ensure equitable participation by all the participants during mini-consultation sessions.
Occasionally, I had to invite a contribution from some timid participants. Finally, the processes
of the mini-consultations were time consuming in terms of arranging logistics, administrative
tasks, coordination, empirical research fieldwork, data recording and analysis and the like.

With reference to the interviews, they functioned well. Interviewees were punctual and well
informed about issues related to the local economy in Tshwane (S & H). Their contributions
provided me with another perspective on issues during the discussion and evaluation carried
out in Chapter 9 and my conceptualisation of oikomissiology in Chapter 10. These contributions
culminated in the suggestion of the possibility of initiating a Christian Action for Local Economic
Development (CALED) (see Chapter 11).

12.3. The oikos concept as the hermeneutic key: A reflection

The oikos concept was very useful in unpacking the aims of a healthy economy as related to
Biblical mission theology. It provides one with mirrors to reflect upon our current economic
system: its biases, wrong emphases and shortfalls. Its close connection with theological
concepts such as the kingdom of God, care of the whole of creation and involvement of the
whole church in missio Dei was useful in reflecting on the roles that the township church could
play in Tshwane (S & H) and also in formulating a transformative ministry praxis and a Missiological framework (see Chapters 3, 5, 9 and 10).

The oikos concept also usefully assisted the participants in elucidating their understanding of the economy. Participants were able to evaluate the current economic system and its outputs using the oikos biblical framework as the yardstick. For the majority of them, it was the first time they had come across a holistic Bible-based concept of the economy such as the oikos. Yet, I felt in many instances that they did not sufficiently infuse and integrate their understanding of this concept into their insights about how the current Tshwane LED (S & H) should be improved or reformed. Nevertheless, the joint group’s insights, to add love and service as two overarching and universal values to the oikos values, signify that participants have started to imagine better ways of improving or reforming the current economic system in Tshwane (S & H). This implies that further education, perhaps in the form of a short learning programme, should be provided to as many church groups as possible so that this concept would be understood by many more people in the churches of S and H.

Challenges in relation to the application of the oikos framework for LED were acknowledged and highlighted in section 9.3.11 by the participants and in section 3.3.2.1 by scholars such as Conradie (2006).

12.4. Missiological and theoretical implications

Six implications are highlighted. Firstly, this study has emphasised that involvement in missio Dei includes also taking care of the oikos. This implies that a mission or social development focus on anthropocentric concerns alone falls far too short of what missio Dei entails, specifically as it pertains to integral development, including LED. Consequently, with reference to the church’s participation in missio Dei in Tshwane (S & H), ecological concerns have to be imparted together with all the other missional activities the church has deemed necessary to advance the kingdom of God in Tshwane (S & H) and to improve the wellbeing of communities. Hence, sustainability issues are to be given priority in Christian missiology and development projects. Chapters 9 and 10 are the culmination of the oikos –based theological / missiological contribution, referred to as oikomissiology, which emerged in this study. These two chapters propose a transformative ministry praxis for LED, theological insights for an alternative LED, an ethical value-based LED framework and elements of the praxis in relation to Tshwane (S & H). They also provide certain imperatives and guidelines which serve as broad principles for ministry in the townships of S and H. In Chapter 10, visual sketches of what this oikos-based
LED could look like at household level, and the roles that the church could play to realise this, are presented. The proposed action in Chapter 11 is highlighted to introduce how the participants had begun thinking about solutions to the economic challenges they face. The insights which emerged from this research will contribute to shaping the implementation of this proposed action.

Secondly, other theoretical implications include 1) discovering a theology and an economic paradigm based on oikos which promote the building of sustainable communities where work is done in ways which restore and maintain harmony in the “garden”, 2) creativity is encouraged in the way we live and produce our bread, 3) the creation of meaningful work as the cornerstone of any economy and 4) the evaluation of a good economy’s performance is carried out in terms of the long-term wellbeing of both human and other-than human beings living in it, and not by abstract measures such as the growth rate of the GDP; as the current anthropocentric economic system does. What is needed therefore is a rethinking of the current growth focussed economic system so as to allow the emergence of a sustainable LED that focusses on the organic nature of the local economy and society and where cooperation would be emphasised over competition.

Thirdly, the church is therefore called upon to develop concrete models of a sustainable LED in Tshwane (S & H) as facilitators and advocates of economic empowerment for the poor and as communities of resistance against the prevailing economic injustice in the city. It has to opt for a LED path which promotes the development of policies and activities based on the capacities, skills and assets of the poor and their neighbourhoods in a sustainable fashion. In order to do this, the church in Tshwane (S & H) must become knowledgeable about policy development and framework so that it becomes one of the voices for an alternative vision geared to fostering collective prosperity and multi-dimensional justice in these townships. Further, the churches have to work in such a manner that the poor themselves become the agents and drivers of economic transformation and liberation in Tshwane (S & H).

Fourthly, the church in Tshwane (S & H) can effectively facilitate this liberation only if it embarks on an ongoing socioeconomic analysis – a study of the ecology of the earth as it relates to the global human population’s social, political and economic activities and decision-making, in a time of global scale ecological disaster such as global warming. This would comprise one of the key elements in its missional praxis while it is striving towards behavioural change in the economic realm which should promote a modest standard of living, better lives for all and the
oikos values. It will also require the church in Tshwane (S & H) to advocate for sustainable social development policy which promotes inclusion, equity in the provision of basic services, empowerment, transformation and liberation. Furthermore, the church in Tshwane (S & H) is called to recognise and make use of the cultural resources and assets within these townships for LED purposes, ensuring that urban poor groups are organised and collaborate with existing pro-poor organisations in these contexts for social and economic justice, including eco-justice.

The fifth implication is that the traditional cultural and religious resources should be integrated as building blocks for LED intervention in S and H. The potential of these resources will have to be harnessed so that they contribute towards pathways out of poverty in these contexts. As the church in Tshwane (S & H) steps out to engage in political/public theology focussed on LED, it has to clarify and communicate its vision, mission, goals and objectives to all stakeholders involved in this project of making the “good city”. The Church’s faith imperatives and doctrine, convictions and distinctives being based on the oikos have to be proclaimed in the open during this prophetic witness geared to the whole spectrum of urban society in Tshwane (S & H). A multi-disciplinary competence is required of the church in Tshwane (S & H) in order to facilitate processes pertaining to new ways of thinking about mission in the public sphere, to enable the church to achieve a balance between the spiritual project and the LED project in Tshwane (S & H). The church has to tap into the competent multi-disciplinary expertise of church members in Tshwane (S & H). Empowerment through education or re-education of the church in Tshwane (S & H) is also needed, specifically of the type which will enable it to interrogate its very existence and the purpose of ministry in the townships, including its theology / missiology. In essence, this education must enable the church to “read the world” in order to perform the “hopeful actions” required for transformation and collective wellbeing of the oikos. Capabilities as anticipated outcomes of this education must be rooted in God’s concern for social righteousness and justice (cf. Psalms 146:5 – 9; Proverbs 14:31; Proverbs 31:4 – 5; Job 31:13 – 15) so that the church should not uncritically adopt a socioeconomic and political agenda which breeds injustice and marginalisation of the inhabitants of the oikos.

Finally, in order for the township church of S and H to drive an alternative economic system inspired by the oikos and local assets, there should be profound conversion and repentance, on the part of the church and larger society, from sin which keeps on breeding the “death” of many of the inhabitants of the household of God in these townships (cf. 9.3.3). Economic sins (such as love of money, oppressing people by denying them economic opportunities, not observing the Sabbath, not sharing, injustice, not applying discipleship in economic matters) must be
condemned and abandoned. The church is called to lead this conversion by abandoning its “Christian spirituality of inwardness” (Jenson 2006:3) prevailing in some church circles, which causes the church to foster merely its own selfish interest and end up proclaiming a privatised gospel. The church has to intentionally engage with “radical engagement with all the ills besetting society (…) Christians must make the sacrifices, take the risks and live out Christ’s love in the hard places” (Mandrick 2010: 760) so that the notion of salvation which encompasses not only the future but also the present realities of the world and its inhabitants will prevail. Living out Christ’s love in the public requires of the church to opt for a shared ministry which integrates all modes of ministry: kerygma, diakonia, koinonia and liturgia. This will also necessitate reflexivity and discernment and adjustment in its praxis so that the ministry will be directed both toward divine service in the church and divine service to the everyday life of the world.

12. 5 Praxis and policy implications

Different praxis implications and insights were discussed in Chapter 9 (sections 9.2.1 – 9.2.6 and Figure 9.1), Chapter 10 and Chapter 11. One particular category of socioeconomic development policies with theoretical underpinnings and great promise consisted of the growth-focussed policies such as GEAR and AsGISA, which the South African government hoped would rebuild and reshape the economy in keeping with the goals of national reconstruction and development (cf. Jeffery 2005: 245). However, evidence from several studies, including the Oikos study group (2006; Jeffery 2010; Wray 2001; Terreblanche 2002 and Aregbeshola 2010) as well as this study, seems to point to the fact that these policies are at the heart of the country’s, including that of the CoT’s (S & H), persistent socioeconomic problems.

This study has used empirical findings to demonstrate that the current economic system rooted in growth-focussed policies is not achieving the anticipated impact and that some changes or “fine tuning” are necessary (see 7.2.5.2). The theoretical arguments for this justification suggest the need for policy reviews by embracing and participating in broad-based and collective actions geared towards the realisation of the vision for healthy communities where services, infrastructure, institutions, leadership, development vision, policies, organisations, communities, assets, agency and sustainable livelihoods function in a practical manner (cf. Porter 2000: 15-34) that benefits localities. This study refers to this as a “glocal”, asset-based sustainable LED based on the oikos concept. In this “glocal” LED, the church of Tshwane (S & H) and its
ministries have an overwhelming responsibility in providing a platform for the voices of those who are most affected by the current socio-economic and political crisis facing the CoT. This responsibility requires the church in Tshwane (S & H) to: 1) make a new commitment to the city with a mission agenda focussed on LED, 2) establish a value-based incarnational presence, 3) nurture (keep and cultivate) community, 4) foster a concrete spirituality of economic transformation, liberation and justice, 5) discover and practise a theology of LED based on the oikos (i.e. oikomissiology) and 6) proclaim and sustain life within the township church (S & H) and the city at large.

12.6. Key empirical findings

The central empirical findings are chapter specific and were summarised within the respective empirical chapters, as follows: A perspective on the church in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal in relation to LED (Chapter 5 refers); Narrative accounts on LED in CoT from separate focus group discussion participants (Chapter 6 refers); Narrative accounts on LED in CoT (S & H) of the joint focus group (Chapter 7 refers) and Interview findings from selected key experienced practitioners and leaders (Chapter 8 refers). This section synthesises the empirical findings to answer the study’s main question and the hypothesis of this study.

a) Economic imbalances as manifested in the townships of S & H: Owing to various factors such as the alignment of the post-apartheid South African economy to global neoliberal political economic imperatives, new legislative frameworks, and the like, township communities have experienced positive as well as negative changes in the economy (see 7.2.6.2).

Firstly, the findings concur with the literature that: 1) marginal township communities lag behind the development goals of the city, 2) current economic restructuring and projects results in very uneven spatial effects – there is an absence of stable local markets in townships and 3) there is loss of income (due to unemployment and retrenchment) as well as under-education and illiteracy of the people on the margins. In short, there is an economic imbalance between the centre and the peri-urban areas and townships of S & H. Evidence of this imbalance includes the people of townships experiencing considerable kinds of unfulfilled needs; township producers losing their markets; a diminishing of the productive potential of townships; township residents being obliged to sell labour to the city to obtain income while technical advances make the city less and less dependent on the factors of production offered by townships. This has led to greater unemployment. LED, to improve the livelihood of communities by increasing the
number and the variety of jobs available to local people (see 1.7.4) in a sustainable manner, is not being achieved.

Secondly, the positive effects of current socioeconomic and infrastructural development drives of the city in terms of projects such as BRT, ICT, improved human settlements, and facilitation of development of business ventures in townships, upgrading of health facilities and the revitalisation of the township economy, have not necessarily led to shared prosperity for all and generous care for the vulnerable and poor. Township communities end up surviving on credit (thus becoming enslaved by debt) and falling prey to “loan-sharks” in communities in this current prevailing neo-liberal economic paradigm, driven by free market capitalism. The local economies of these townships have no chance; they are swallowed up by the economic players who operate in these townships. Worse, local businesses and individuals in townships receive very little protection from the government. As a result, crime has increased in the townships.

Thirdly, some considerable distance and discrepancy exists between the officials and communities as regards development needs because the city, although it consults, does not take the voice of the poor seriously. Township residents feel they are in the dark about the outcome of their own development priorities.

Fourthly, LED initiatives are needed to address the current massive level of unemployment on one hand and on the other, to generate resources to meet basic human needs developmentally and sustainably in Tshwane (S & H). LED is better positioned than national economic strategies to address the issues of unemployment by facilitating and giving economic opportunities to people in communities.

b) Economic imbalances as manifested in the township church of S & H: With particular reference to the church in Tshwane (S & H), firstly, there exists a “disconnect” in many cases between the theological approach adopted by congregations and concrete community realities, wherever they are located. As a result, the church in Tshwane (S & H) has not facilitated relevant solutions to issues of poverty, marginalisation and unemployment which affect most members of the community in these townships.

Secondly, the ecclesiastical formations that participated in this research still bear the legacy of a class system rooted in the Apartheid past (i.e. they minister to people on the margins but lack financial resources to sustain their work; as a result, most of their leaders are self-supporting).
Nevertheless, these peripheral churches possess important assets such as physical and institutional structures, spiritual and moral foundations and access to deprived grassroots and at-risk communities, contacts with public offices, cross-cultural relationships and a predisposition to care for the poor. These assets can be further mobilised to generate vision, motivation and responsibility for a public theology in such a way that township churches become relevant and visible strategic participants in LED in Tshwane (S & H), although they might have some weaknesses and blind spots in their mission orientations.

c) Means of survival: People networks, community organisations (such as stokvels, burial societies and saving clubs) and the church are extremely important networks of relations and influence (see 7.2.9.2) and survival. Therefore, going forward, it is strategic that a sustainable asset-based local economic development be the preferred option for Tshwane (S & H). Sharing, interdependent relations and surviving by local means such as stokvels, societies, savings clubs are traditions deemed important for personal and collective economic survival (see 7.2.10.2). These solid traditions are useful assets for LED which should be maintained and promoted. Other assets for LED in Tshwane (S & H) (i.e. neighbourhoods with active churches and neighbourhood organisations who work toward the constructive development of their community and which act as beacons for developers and investors, including partners in LED such as local government, community institutions and the private sector) should be mobilised as tools for social and economic justice in Tshwane.

d) What role/s could the township church play towards LED in Tshwane, in particular, in S and H?

d1) A catalytic role in the growth and sustained realisation of current signs of God’s economy and the oikos: empirical evidence demonstrates that at present: 1) limited meaningful sharing is happening, especially among family members and political affiliates, 2) limited shared prosperity is realised, 3) more blessings than curses are evident in the lives of just a few people, 4) although some people are experiencing good health and long life in the land (cf. 9.3.5). The church is expected to play a catalytic role in the growth and sustained realisation of current signs of God’s economy and the oikos. Much work has to be done to broaden the impact of these signs and to ensure that giving and sharing become the nexus that joins everything together. Therefore sharing, being a taught behaviour, should be promoted at all spheres of society in S & H.
d2) Promote alternative economic models based on the *oikos*:

Although the current economic system might not endorse God’s economy rules, they are helpful in facilitating a sound and sustainable LED in Tshwane. A local model could be developed based on these rules. The church in Tshwane (S & H) has to muster the courage to speak about and promote biblically-based that have the potential to make a difference in the public sphere. In the process, the church has to: 1) facilitate educational empowerment for church members to know what to do and how to engage the issues affecting communities, 2) develop effective communication skills in order to present this approach to other LED partners and stakeholders in ways which emphasise the value-added effect of this approach, 3) cultivate strategic partnerships and networks that will favour and support this approach and 4) develop strong links with government, which will be essential.

d3) Spirituality: the type of spirituality appropriate for this *oikos* – based approach to LED is practical and concrete. This spirituality takes real life issues as seriously as it does, seeing that justice is done (see Micah 6:8 and Isaiah 56:1). Embedded in this spirituality, the church in Tshwane (S & H) has to speak to power structures and systems for the purpose of improving the lives of communities of S & H, including their environment. For this to become a reality, the church will have to position itself strategically so that, together with other partners, it becomes a vital channel for socioeconomic transformation and assistance in these townships.

d4) A holistic model for LED-based on the *oikos* in Tshwane: A church-based initiative:

This initiative will mobilise all the resources and potential that the church possesses for community building (cf. 5.10), traditional and cultural assets (cf. 9.2.4, 7.1.1), and also work towards restoring fundamental relations for life (cf. 3.3.1) which will engender collective wellbeing. Thus, the choice of participants in the mini-consultation joint group to initiate a co-operative business geared to create employment for people (see 6.4.2) is one of the appropriate responses to the situation on the ground. The different modes of ministry need to recognise and support this engagement (cf. 9.3.10).

d5) Facilitate: facilitate the mobilisation of all the assets for LED in Tshwane (S & H) (i.e. neighbourhoods with active churches and neighbourhood organisations who work toward the constructive development of their community, which act as beacons to developers and investors including partners in LED, such as local government, community institutions and the private sector) as tools for social and economic justice in Tshwane.
Study’s Hypothesis: the hypothesis, which stated that the church (S & H) can be re-positioned or re-discovered as an asset that could be used to form strong community structures in local communities, and could again be used as a basis for community development and LED, has been confirmed. Empirical findings indicate that the churches, even in these peripheral struggling areas, possess assets that could contribute towards community development and LED (as stated in 1.7.2). Thus, these churches are called to be re-positioned and to revisit their practical expression in these localities. They need to mobilise their assets for community building and development as stated under 5.8 in Chapter 5. They, therefore, have a missiological / theological obligation to initiate LED ministries which should work to prevent the unnatural death of many poor and marginalised people and non-human beings whose lives are cut short by the system.

To sum up, the church and its ministries in the townships of S & H is a crucial asset for rebuilding communities and LED in these townships and is most likely one of the only credible institutions left there that is still close and accessible to the poor and marginalised and is able to play this crucial role (cf. 1.4). Most other institutions, such as local government and its apparatuses, businesses and educational, have been co-opted by the prevailing neo-liberal capitalist and globalisation agenda and have distanced themselves from the local realities in these townships. As a result, they have failed and some have even lost their ability to “usher in” shared prosperity and collective wellbeing in these townships. The church in Tshwane (S & H) is called to rise up to sufficiently meet the challenge, by mobilising all its assets and other assets and resources in the communities, so as to make a strong contribution towards the realisation of a positive vision of a balanced and sustainable economic growth and community wellbeing based on the oikos concept in South African cities, especially in Tshwane (S & H). The township church (S & H) has more responsibility, as part of its participation in missio Dei, with regard to LED in its areas because its members are strategically located in the midst of the poor and the weak. They are located where there is the greatest need in the CoT (S & H). This study, based on empirical evidence from church representatives who participated in this research, interviewees and insights from the oikos concept, has shown that the church in Tshwane (S & H) can step up to a place where it becomes an anchor institution for LED in these contexts.
Interests for future studies: This research has provided a great deal of insight; the voices from the grassroots have provided different perspectives on the economic realities faced by ordinary people and the church in Soshanguve and Hammanskraal. While the proposed action (i.e. creation of employment based on the *oikos* concept) envisaged by the research participants from local churches is a noble and appropriate response to the current economic crisis, the empirical findings together with insights gained from the literature study point to a number of future research interests. These could focus on questions such as:

- How effective and efficient the *oikomissiology* framework proposed in this study actually is in contributing to the realisation of sustainable communities and economies in Tshwane (S & H) in the short, medium and long term?
- What mechanisms should be put in place by the church in order to preserve, protect and facilitate the growth of the township economies in the face of a global market economy?
- How could cohesion and a common LED vision be facilitated in Tshwane (S & H)?
- What could be done to facilitate synergy between the theological (i.e. mission orientations) and praxes approaches of congregations, including their assets and concrete community needs, in order to work for the vision of sustainable LED?
- How should this researcher and religious leaders (who have made the shift to an ecological and holistic mind-set and who realise what the possible contribution of the church could be towards a more sustainable way of making a living), facilitate, train, equip and continue to motivate ordinary church and community members who are still not immersed in such a mind-set, or who have lost the traditional African holistic way of living, to understand and to become passionate about the need for long-term sustainability so as to give their children’s children a chance to live and thrive? How can such people be motivated to continue to find local sustainable ways of making a living, in the face of a consumerist and urban way of life?
BIBLIOGRAPHY


626


Google.com, 2011. Information on non-profit organisations data base in South Africa, viewed 12 July 2011, from https://www.google.com/fusiontables/DataSource?docid=1Rpb7O0l7QJg695t6oySJVFHi_HLo9q5nHlt_fl


Kretzman, J.P. & McKnight, J.L., 1993. *Building communities from the inside out: A path toward finding and mobilising community assets*. Midwestern University, Center for Urban Affairs and Policy research, Evanston, IL: ACTA Publications.


Louw, D.L., 2004. ‘Church within the city or city within the church? City as metaphor within a practical theological hermeneutics’. Scriptura, 85: 24-34.


Luther King, M., 1968. Where do we go from here? Chaos or community. Boston: Beacon


Rabe, M. & Lombaard, C., 2012. 'Give us this day our daily bread – Clergy’s lived religion in Pretoria Central areas'. Acta Theologica, 31 (2): 241 -263.


Smuts, M, Kerkspieel III, Sl: sa.


Tshaka, R.S., 2015. ‘The black church as the womb of black liberation theology? Why the Uniting Reformed Church in Southern Africa (URCSA) is not a genuine black church?’ *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 71(3), viewed 15 December 2015, Art. #2800, 10 pages, http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts.v71i3.2800


http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v36i1.1373


Woods, E., 1992. *If only things were different: A model for a sustainable society*. Victoria / Canada: Woodworks.


**Research Participants as primary sources**

Focus group discussions with participants (see Appendix A)

Interviews with experienced practitioners (see Appendix B)

Interviews with church leaders (see Appendix C)
APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: PROFILES OF FOCUS GROUP / MINI-CONSULTATION PARTICIPANTS

A.1. Focus group participants of Hammanskraal group

- Venue: Letlhabile Baptist Church
- Time: 09:30 – 13:30
- Date: 11 January 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Name &amp; Surname</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Economic occupation</th>
<th>Affiliation/ ministry</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Harry Golele</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Tuck-shopkeeper</td>
<td>LBC (yp)</td>
<td>36-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>B Ndlovu</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>LBC (md)</td>
<td>46-50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Nelly Makena</td>
<td>Post- Matric</td>
<td>Employed (ICT)</td>
<td>LBC (yd)</td>
<td>26-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Vusi Dlamini</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Tuck-shop keeper</td>
<td>BoC (yd)</td>
<td>31-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>George Matjake</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Small businessman owner</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>36-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Hezekiel Moeti</td>
<td>Post- Matric</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>HGC (yd)</td>
<td>31-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Joel Khomo</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>BoC (md)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Christian Rustof</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>LBC (sp)</td>
<td>36-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Rustof</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Preschool teacher</td>
<td>LBC (wd)</td>
<td>31-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Aristorica Phiri</td>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>HGC (sp)</td>
<td>51-55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Gladys Phiri</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Informal trade</td>
<td>HGC wd)</td>
<td>46-50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:
- LBC (Letlhabile Baptist Church)
- BoC (Body of Christ)
- HGC (Hammanskraal Gospel Centre)
A.2. Focus group participants of Soshanguve group

- **Venue:** Deeds of Love Centre / Winterveld near Soshanguve
- **Time:** 11:30 – 15:30
- **Date:** 12 January 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Name &amp; Surname</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Economic occupation</th>
<th>Affiliation/ministry</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Stanley Mokone</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Pastor of youth</td>
<td>ELCSAs (yp)</td>
<td>25-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Patricia Mashigo</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Street vendor</td>
<td>BRC (wd)</td>
<td>36-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Tiny Chauke</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>URCSAs (wd)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Charmaine Masase</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>URCSAs (yd)</td>
<td>25-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>L A Masenya</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>URCSAs (md)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Johnny Ndlovana</td>
<td>Post-Matric</td>
<td>Small businessman</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>30-34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Lydia Maswangan</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Pensioner</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>&gt;65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Winnie Mathebula</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>25-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>A M Madibane</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>BRC (md)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>I Chimuti</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>ELCSAs (md)</td>
<td>41-45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:

- ELCSAs (Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa - Soshanguve)
- BRC (Bethel Revival Centre)
- URCSAs (Uniting Reformed Church in South Africa - Soshanguve)
- Md (men’s department)
- Wd (women’s department)
- Yd (youth department)
- Yp (youth pastor)
A.3. Focus group participants of the joint group

**Venue:** Hammanskraal Gospel Centre, Kanana / Hammanskraal

**Time:**
- 12:00 – 17:00 (14 February 2014)
- 09:00 – 14:00 (15 February 2014)
- 15:00 – 17:00 (17 February 2014)

**Date:** 14 – 15, 17 February 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Name &amp; Surname</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Economic occupation</th>
<th>Affiliation/ministry</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Stanley Mokone</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Pastor of youth</td>
<td>ELCSAs (yp)</td>
<td>25 - 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Johnny Ndlovana</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Small business owner</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>30-34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Winnie Mathebula</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>25 - 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>I Chimutu</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>ELCSAs (md)</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>N.D Mashabane</td>
<td>Grade 12</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>ELCSAs ()</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>D. Mahlaza</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Casual employment</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>35 - 39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>G. Mokgoth</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Housewife</td>
<td>BoC (md)</td>
<td>46 - 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>L.B Bodiba</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>LBC (wd)</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Maponya</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>URCSA</td>
<td>51 - 55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>F.M Motswene</td>
<td>Grade 9</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>URCSAs</td>
<td>46 - 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>B. Mkandla</td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>ELCSAs</td>
<td>25 - 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr</td>
<td>Carol Bombal</td>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>Retired MD</td>
<td>HGC</td>
<td>&gt;65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past.</td>
<td>John Megala</td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>Municipal worker</td>
<td>Boc (sp)</td>
<td>51 - 55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Hezekiel Moeti</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>HGC (yd)</td>
<td>31 - 35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>B. Ndlovu</td>
<td>Grade 10</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>LBC (md)</td>
<td>46 - 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Maureen Mead</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Missionary</td>
<td>YWAM</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>A.M Madibane</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>BRC (md)</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms</td>
<td>Nellie Makena</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Employed (ICT)</td>
<td>LBC (yd)</td>
<td>26 - 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Joel Khomo</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Part-time employed</td>
<td>BoC (md)</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Gladys Phiri</td>
<td>Post-matric</td>
<td>Informal trade</td>
<td>HGC (wd)</td>
<td>46 - 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Aristorico Phiri</td>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>HGC (sp)</td>
<td>51 - 55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>George Matjeke</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Small businessman owner</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev</td>
<td>Christian Rustof</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Pastor of church</td>
<td>LBC (sp)</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs</td>
<td>Patricia Mashigo</td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>Street vendor</td>
<td>BRC (wd)</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr</td>
<td>Vusi Dlamini</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Tuckshop keeper</td>
<td>BoC (yd)</td>
<td>31 - 35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>Occupation</td>
<td>Qualification Level</td>
<td>Age Range</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Harry Golele</td>
<td>Matric cert.</td>
<td>Tuckshop keeper</td>
<td>LBC (yp)</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Grace Shibambo</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>HGC</td>
<td>41 - 45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs M.N Ngobeni</td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>36 - 40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX B: PROFILES OF INTERVIEWEES (EXPERIENCED PRACTITIONERS)

Expert and experienced practitioner interviewees included Ms M\textsuperscript{214} (City of Tshwane), Rev Reuben Mamatsinya (Love in Action empowerment ministries / Mabopane), Rev Philip Mogwera (Ebenhezer Bible Church and empowerment ministries), Rev George Ngamlana (former lecturer, Missions department / Baptist Union of South Africa) and Prof Buffel (former national executive member, Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa and scholar (practical theologian)).

- **Ms M**
  - Venue: Municipal offices / Sammy Marks Square / Pretoria Central
  - Time: 08:30 – 10:00
  - Date: 02 February 2015

She is one of the directors responsible for social and economic development in the City of Tshwane. She has a Master’s Degree in social development and more than ten years’ experience in public service.

- **Rev. Reuben Mamatsinya**
  - Venue: Love in Action office at Mabopane Central Baptist Church, Mabopane
  - Time: 09:00 – 11:00
  - Date: 06 October 2015

He used to be a fully accredited minister of the Baptist Union and has more 25 years’ experience in pastoral and community ministry. He is the founding pastor of Mabopane Central Baptist, founder of Jesus for Schools Ministry as well as founder of Love in Action ministries which care for abandoned and orphan children. In addition to providing a place of safety and feeding, Love in Action ministries includes skills development, small business, food gardens, commercial farming and educational support.

- **Rev Philip Mogwera**
  - Venue: Ebenezer Bible Centre, Temba / Hammanskraal

\textsuperscript{214} This interview participant opted to remain anonymous; I have therefore referred to this person as respondent M throughout the rest of this thesis.
Rev Mogwera is a graduate from Rhema Bible School and founding pastor of Ebenezer Bible Church in Hammanskraal. He has more than 20 years' experience in pastoral and community ministry which include economic empowerment and care of orphans.

- **Rev George Ngamlana**
  - Venue: Baptist House, Roodepoort / Johannesburg
  - Time: 10:30 – 12:00
  - Date: 20 October 2015

Rev Ngamlana is one of the prominent South African Baptist minister with vast experiences in denominational structures. He has served as Assistant General Secretary of the Union, President of the Union, Regional Ministry Coordinator, pastor, lecturer at Baptist theological institutions and missionary to Zambia. He also served as the leader of Kayamandi children's home and social welfare.

- **Prof. Buffel**
  - Venue: Theo van Wyk Building, University of South Africa
  - Time: 10:00 – 11:30
  - Date: 17 November 2015

Prof Buffel is an ordained minister of the Evangelical Lutheran Church of South Africa. He also served as the General Secretary of their denomination. He has worked in the non-governmental sector for many years focussing on social justice issues. He has also initiated small group businesses in one of the churches he has pastored in Gauteng.
APPENDIX C: PROFILES OF INTERVIEWEES (CHURCH LEADERS)

In relation to interviews focussed on local churches’ mission orientations and praxes, interviewees included:

Rev. Aristorica Phiri (Hammanskraal Gospel Centre)

- Venue: Hammanskraal Gospel Centre, Kanana / Hammanskraal
- Time: 10:30 – 11:30
- Date: 04 May 2015

Rev. Christian Rustof (Letlhabile Baptist Church)

- Venue: Letlhabile Baptist Church, Stinkwater / Hammanskraal
- Time: 08:00 – 09:00
- Date: 04 May 2015

Pastor Stanley Mokone (Youth pastor at Lutheran Church / Soshanguve Block L)

- Venue: Lutheran Seminary, Arcadia / Pretoria
- Time: 13:00 – 14:30
- Date: 04 May 2015

Rev. Maponya (Uniting Reformed Church of South Africa (URCSA) / Soshanguve)

- Venue: URCSA, Soshanguve Block L
- Time: 13:00 – 14:00
- Date: 17 November 2014

Pastor John Megala (Body of Christ Ministry / Lepengville-Hammanskraal).

- Venue: Municipal office, Temba / Hammanskraal
- Time: 09:30 – 10:30
- Date: 05 May 2015

With the exception of Pastor Megala (who has attained general education up to grade 12), three (Reverends Phiri, Rustof and Maponya) have received formal theological education, the minimum being three years post-secondary. Pastor Mokone is a student pastor and youth worker with secondary education plus two years theological training.
Mrs / Mr

Dear Mrs / Mr

Invitation to participate in a Doctoral research project

This is to recommend that Rev Credo Mangayi is allowed to invite you and two other officials of the City from Local Economic Development desk to participate in one round of interview meetings for his Doctoral research project. See the schedule in annexure. His thesis title is “Mission in an African City: Discovering the township church as an asset towards local economic development in Tshwane”.

Rev Mangayi is a committed and experienced community development worker and an informed theologian who is, by means of his Doctoral research project, studying what is happening in the economic arena of Tshwane and attempting to analyse the impact this has on ordinary township people and on the church. This research’s central question is “What role/s could the township church play toward local economic development in Tshwane (Soshanguve and Hammanskraal). In other words, what role/s could the church (which include specific ministries and faith based organisations) in relation to other community organisations and structures play towards local economic development that might lead to correcting different ills that affect struggling peripheral urban communities of Tshwane especially Soshanguve and Hammanskraal.

This is a practice-oriented theological research project which promises to make an important contribution to the way we understand mission and ministry. At the same time the participatory research approach (which aims to involve you and your colleagues to participate in finding answers to the research question) that Rev Mangayi is using in this project also promises to benefit a number of impoverished, peri-urban communities around Tshwane. See in annexure 2 a list of detailed aims of this research.
I therefore would like to request that you and the other colleagues will consider this request to participate in this important research project, and that you give Rev Mangayi the permission and cooperation to work with you in this regard.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Prof Annalet Van Schalkwyk
Supervisor
Discipline Leader: Missiology

vvschaa@unisa.ac.za
Office: 012-429 4685
APPENDIX E: INFORMED CONSENT FORM

I, the undersigned, hereby give consent that Rev L Mangayi, a Doctor of Theology student at the University of South Africa, may use the information that I supplied to him in an interview / focus group discussion for his doctoral thesis. I declare the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Do not agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. I have been informed by the researcher of the objectives of the intended research</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The researcher supplied to me his name, address and contact details as well as the details of his research supervisor</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. I was informed why I was selected as an informant for the research project</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. I give this consent willingly, under no coercion and without inducement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. I received satisfactory answers to any questions that I had about the research</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. I was informed of the estimated time that the interview would take</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. I retain the right to refrain from answering any questions posed by the researcher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. I agree that the interview may be recorded by means of an electronic device</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. I agree that the researcher may quote my views in his thesis and in any subsequent publications that may flow from it</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. I require that he should present to me (for my approval) the record that he made of the interview(s), before including it in his thesis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. I agree that he may refer to me by name when quoting my views in his thesis and possible subsequent publications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. I accept that he will store the record of my interview(s) safely and that he will destroy it no later than two years after his thesis has been accepted</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. I understand this information and its implications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. I understand that I may withdraw this consent at any time in writing, without needing to give reasons</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Full names: ..........................................................................................................................................

Place: .................................................................................................. Date: ..............................................

Signature: .................................................................................................
APPENDIX F: ETHICAL CLEARANCE LETTER (SCANNED COPY)

Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology College of Human Sciences

22 May 2013

Proposed title: Mission in an African city: discovering the township church as an asset towards local economic development in Tshwane

Principal investigator: Lukwikilu (Credo) Mangayi (st nr 33763186)

Reviewed and processed as: Class approval (see paragraph 10.7 of the UNISA. Guidelines for Ethics Review)

Approval status recommended by reviewers: Approved

The Higher Degrees Committee of the Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology in the College of Human Sciences at the University of South Africa has reviewed the proposal and considers the methodological, technical and ethical aspects of the proposal to be appropriate to the tasks proposed. Approval is hereby granted for Rev Mangayi to proceed with the study in strict accordance with the approved proposal and the ethics policy of the-University of South Africa.

In addition, the candidate should heed the following guidelines:

• To only start this research study after obtaining informed consent from the interviewees
• To carry out the research according to good research practice and in an ethical manner
• To maintain the confidentiality of all data collected from or about research participants, and maintain security procedures for the protection of privacy
• To notify the committee in writing immediately if any adverse event occurs.

Kind regards

Dr Zuze Banda
CoD: Dept Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology