

**GENDER RESPONSIVE BUDGETING IN A LARGE METROPOLITAN
AREA IN SOUTH AFRICA**

by

MAXWEL MAKHANGALA MASEKO

submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree

MASTER OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

At the

University of South Africa

Supervisor: Prof G Ferreira

Co-supervisor: Dr M Reddy

KEYWORDS

The keywords of this study as defined in section 1.8 of Chapter 1 of this study are as follows;

Budget, Gender Responsive Budgeting, Gender Equality, Gender Mainstreaming, Municipality, Metropolitan Municipality, Integrated Development Plan, Government, Service Delivery

ABSTRACT

South Africa started the Women's Budget Initiative in 1995 as part of its commitment to meeting its gender equality objectives and gender mainstreaming. However, in later years, research has found that government Gender Responsive Budgeting or GRB initiatives in South Africa are either dormant or dead. There is a range of reasons for this and some of them are not directly related to gender budgets or even gender. Research has shown that perhaps the greatest weakness is the lack of advocacy.

From the review of existing literature, it is clear that there is a need for strong alliances between key stakeholders, which are Parliament, non-governmental organisations, academics, United Nations and the media to sustain the momentum of the gender budget process. Capacity building and training are also important for budget officers, civil society, national and local parliamentarians, given the low level of skilled financial personnel in municipalities. The availability of adequate sex-disaggregated data is an important success factor for municipalities so that they can deliver services equitably to their communities.

This research is exploratory in nature and focuses on assessing GRB in one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. It also reviewed the 2012/13 Integrated Development Plan through a focus on health, housing infrastructure, safety and security and education. These are some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of the poor and are good quality of life indicators for men, women, boys and girls.

The research method that has been used in this research is both qualitative and quantitative. This study has found that there is no clear co-coordinated plan for the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality. The lack of resources is also seen as the main challenge to GRB in this metropolitan municipality.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
Title	
Declaration	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of abbreviations	iv
Keywords	v
Abstract	vi
Table of contents	vii
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background and rationale	1
1.2.1 The study area	7
1.3 Problem statement	8
1.4 Aim and objective of the study	10
1.5 Research questions	11
1.6 Research method	12
1.7 Demarcation of the study	17
1.8 Terminology	18
1.9 Overview of chapters	20
1.10 Referencing	22
1.11 Permission for the study	22
1.12 Summary	22
CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW: GRB	
2.1 Introduction	24
2.2 Contextualisation of GRB	24
2.2.1 Gender budgeting country experiences	38
2.2.1.1 GRB in Australia	39
2.2.1.2 GRB in Tanzania	41

2.2.1.3	GRB in Brazil	43
2.2.1.4	GRB in India	44
2.2.1.5	GRB in China	46
2.2.1.6	GRB in South Africa	48
2.3	Role of the United Nations in GRB	51
2.4	Summary	55

CHAPTER 3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1	Introduction	56
3.2	Research design	56
3.3	Data sources	58
3.4	Data collection techniques	62
3.5	Sampling methods	67
3.6	Data analysis and interpretation	69
3.7	Limitations of the study	73
3.8	Ethical considerations	74
3.9	Summary	75

CHAPTER 4. RESEARCH ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

4.1	Introduction	77
4.2	Review of the research process	77
4.3	Response rate of the survey	80
4.4	Data analysis and findings	82
4.4.1	GRB in the study area	83
4.4.1.1	Metropolitan municipality 2012/13 budget overview	89
4.4.1.1.1	Revenue	92
4.4.1.1.2	Spending on utility services in this metropolitan municipality	93
4.4.1.1.3	The capital budget	94
4.4.1.2	Analysis of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP	97
4.4.2	GRB in health, housing, safety and security in this metropolitan municipality	103

4.4.3	Responses to the researcher's interview questions	105
4.4.4	GRB in education	119
4.5	Summary	125

CHAPTER 5. SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1	Introduction	130
5.2	Summary of this study	130
5.3	Discussion of data and findings of this study	133
5.4	Recommendations	143
5.5.	Suggestions for further research	147
5.6	Conclusion	148

LIST OF REFERENCES		149
---------------------------	--	-----

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	UN support for GRB by countries	53
Table 4.1	Group one sample composition	80
Table 4.2	The metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	85
Table 4.3	The 2012/13 budget numbers at a glance	89
Table 4.4	Breakdown of the 2012/13 municipal operating budget	90
Table 4.5	Year-on- year spending and growth in staff costs from the 2011/12 to 2012/13 financial year in this metropolitan municipality	91
Table 4.6	2012/13 revenue categories of this metropolitan municipality	93
Table 4.7	Operating expenditure for 2012/13 by vote	94
Table 4.8	Year-on-year increase from the 2011/12 budget to the 2012/13 capital funding sources	95
Table 4.9	Major capital projects for 2012/13	95
Table 4.10	Population of this metropolitan municipality from the last two recorded censuses in 2001 and 2011	104

Table 4.11	Metropolitan municipality population and households in 2011	104
Table 4.12	Changes in this metropolitan municipality's population groups between 2001 and 2011	105
Table 4.13	How GRB strengthens the role of marginalised communities in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality?	106
Table 4.14	Role of stakeholders in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	107
Table 4.15	Relevance of GRB programme in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	108
Table 4.16	Level of community participation in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	109
Table 4.17	How the priorities of men, women, boys and girls were identified in this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget	110
Table 4.18	Challenges/difficulties of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	112
Table 4.19	Implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	113
Table 4.20	Training of this metropolitan municipality's officials on GRB	114
Table 4.21	Individual opinion on the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	115
Table 4.22	Finalisation of the gender equality process in this metropolitan municipality	116
Table 4.23	How this metropolitan municipality is addressing unacceptable levels of gender inequality	117
Table 4.24	Cost effectiveness of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	118
Table 4.25	The metropolitan municipality's records of gender disaggregated data for budgeting purposes	118
Table 4.26	Overview of enrolment in public higher education institutions: 2011	123

Table 5.1	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for women in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137
Table 5.2	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for men in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
Title	
Declaration	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of abbreviations	iv
Keywords	v
Abstract	vi
Table of contents	vii
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background and rationale	1
1.2.1 The study area	7
1.3 Problem statement	8
1.4 Aim and objective of the study	10
1.5 Research questions	11
1.6 Research method	12
1.7 Demarcation of the study	17
1.8 Terminology	18
1.9 Overview of chapters	20
1.10 Referencing	22
1.11 Permission for the study	22
1.12 Summary	22
CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW: GRB	
2.1 Introduction	24
2.2 Contextualisation of GRB	24
2.2.1 Gender budgeting country experiences	38
2.2.1.1 GRB in Australia	39
2.2.1.2 GRB in Tanzania	41

2.2.1.3	GRB in Brazil	43
2.2.1.4	GRB in India	44
2.2.1.5	GRB in China	46
2.2.1.6	GRB in South Africa	48
2.3	Role of the United Nations in GRB	51
2.4	Summary	55

CHAPTER 3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1	Introduction	56
3.2	Research design	56
3.3	Data sources	58
3.4	Data collection techniques	62
3.5	Sampling methods	67
3.6	Data analysis and interpretation	69
3.7	Limitations of the study	73
3.8	Ethical considerations	74
3.9	Summary	75

CHAPTER 4. RESEARCH ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

4.1	Introduction	77
4.2	Review of the research process	77
4.3	Response rate of the survey	80
4.4	Data analysis and findings	82
4.4.1	GRB in the study area	83
4.4.1.1	Metropolitan municipality 2012/13 budget overview	89
4.4.1.1.1	Revenue	92
4.4.1.1.2	Spending on utility services in this metropolitan municipality	93
4.4.1.1.3	The capital budget	94
4.4.1.2	Analysis of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP	97
4.4.2	GRB in health, housing, safety and security in this metropolitan municipality	103

4.4.3	Responses to the researcher's interview questions	105
4.4.4	GRB in education	119
4.5	Summary	125

CHAPTER 5. SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1	Introduction	130
5.2	Summary of this study	130
5.3	Discussion of data and findings of this study	133
5.4	Recommendations	143
5.5.	Suggestions for further research	147
5.6	Conclusion	148

LIST OF REFERENCES		149
---------------------------	--	-----

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	UN support for GRB by countries	53
Table 4.1	Group one sample composition	80
Table 4.2	The metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	85
Table 4.3	The 2012/13 budget numbers at a glance	89
Table 4.4	Breakdown of the 2012/13 municipal operating budget	90
Table 4.5	Year-on- year spending and growth in staff costs from the 2011/12 to 2012/13 financial year in this metropolitan municipality	91
Table 4.6	2012/13 revenue categories of this metropolitan municipality	93
Table 4.7	Operating expenditure for 2012/13 by vote	94
Table 4.8	Year-on-year increase from the 2011/12 budget to the 2012/13 capital funding sources	95
Table 4.9	Major capital projects for 2012/13	95
Table 4.10	Population of this metropolitan municipality from the last two recorded censuses in 2001 and 2011	104

Table 4.11	Metropolitan municipality population and households in 2011	104
Table 4.12	Changes in this metropolitan municipality's population groups between 2001 and 2011	105
Table 4.13	How GRB strengthens the role of marginalised communities in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality?	106
Table 4.14	Role of stakeholders in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	107
Table 4.15	Relevance of GRB programme in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	108
Table 4.16	Level of community participation in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	109
Table 4.17	How the priorities of men, women, boys and girls were identified in this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget	110
Table 4.18	Challenges/difficulties of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	112
Table 4.19	Implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	113
Table 4.20	Training of this metropolitan municipality's officials on GRB	114
Table 4.21	Individual opinion on the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	115
Table 4.22	Finalisation of the gender equality process in this metropolitan municipality	116
Table 4.23	How this metropolitan municipality is addressing unacceptable levels of gender inequality	117
Table 4.24	Cost effectiveness of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	118
Table 4.25	The metropolitan municipality's records of gender disaggregated data for budgeting purposes	118
Table 4.26	Overview of enrolment in public higher education institutions: 2011	123

Table 5.1	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for women in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137
Table 5.2	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for men in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137

ABSTRACT

South Africa started the Women's Budget Initiative in 1995 as part of its commitment to meeting its gender equality objectives and gender mainstreaming. However, in later years, research has found that government Gender Responsive Budgeting or GRB initiatives in South Africa are either dormant or dead. There is a range of reasons for this and some of them are not directly related to gender budgets or even gender. Research has shown that perhaps the greatest weakness is the lack of advocacy.

From the review of existing literature, it is clear that there is a need for strong alliances between key stakeholders, which are Parliament, non-governmental organisations, academics, United Nations and the media to sustain the momentum of the gender budget process. Capacity building and training are also important for budget officers, civil society, national and local parliamentarians, given the low level of skilled financial personnel in municipalities. The availability of adequate sex-disaggregated data is an important success factor for municipalities so that they can deliver services equitably to their communities.

This research is exploratory in nature and focuses on assessing GRB in one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. It also reviewed the 2012/13 Integrated Development Plan through a focus on health, housing infrastructure, safety and security and education. These are some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of the poor and are good quality of life indicators for men, women, boys and girls.

The research method that has been used in this research is both qualitative and quantitative. This study has found that there is no clear co-coordinated plan for the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality. The lack of resources is also seen as the main challenge to GRB in this metropolitan municipality.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
Title	
Declaration	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of abbreviations	iv
Keywords	v
Abstract	vi
Table of contents	vii
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background and rationale	1
1.2.1 The study area	7
1.3 Problem statement	8
1.4 Aim and objective of the study	10
1.5 Research questions	11
1.6 Research method	12
1.7 Demarcation of the study	17
1.8 Terminology	18
1.9 Overview of chapters	20
1.10 Referencing	22
1.11 Permission for the study	22
1.12 Summary	22
CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW: GRB	
2.1 Introduction	24
2.2 Contextualisation of GRB	24
2.2.1 Gender budgeting country experiences	38
2.2.1.1 GRB in Australia	39
2.2.1.2 GRB in Tanzania	41

2.2.1.3	GRB in Brazil	43
2.2.1.4	GRB in India	44
2.2.1.5	GRB in China	46
2.2.1.6	GRB in South Africa	48
2.3	Role of the United Nations in GRB	51
2.4	Summary	55

CHAPTER 3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1	Introduction	56
3.2	Research design	56
3.3	Data sources	58
3.4	Data collection techniques	62
3.5	Sampling methods	67
3.6	Data analysis and interpretation	69
3.7	Limitations of the study	73
3.8	Ethical considerations	74
3.9	Summary	75

CHAPTER 4. RESEARCH ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

4.1	Introduction	77
4.2	Review of the research process	77
4.3	Response rate of the survey	80
4.4	Data analysis and findings	82
4.4.1	GRB in the study area	83
4.4.1.1	Metropolitan municipality 2012/13 budget overview	89
4.4.1.1.1	Revenue	92
4.4.1.1.2	Spending on utility services in this metropolitan municipality	93
4.4.1.1.3	The capital budget	94
4.4.1.2	Analysis of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP	97
4.4.2	GRB in health, housing, safety and security in this metropolitan municipality	103

4.4.3	Responses to the researcher's interview questions	105
4.4.4	GRB in education	119
4.5	Summary	125

CHAPTER 5. SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1	Introduction	130
5.2	Summary of this study	130
5.3	Discussion of data and findings of this study	133
5.4	Recommendations	143
5.5.	Suggestions for further research	147
5.6	Conclusion	148

LIST OF REFERENCES		149
---------------------------	--	-----

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	UN support for GRB by countries	53
Table 4.1	Group one sample composition	80
Table 4.2	The metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	85
Table 4.3	The 2012/13 budget numbers at a glance	89
Table 4.4	Breakdown of the 2012/13 municipal operating budget	90
Table 4.5	Year-on- year spending and growth in staff costs from the 2011/12 to 2012/13 financial year in this metropolitan municipality	91
Table 4.6	2012/13 revenue categories of this metropolitan municipality	93
Table 4.7	Operating expenditure for 2012/13 by vote	94
Table 4.8	Year-on-year increase from the 2011/12 budget to the 2012/13 capital funding sources	95
Table 4.9	Major capital projects for 2012/13	95
Table 4.10	Population of this metropolitan municipality from the last two recorded censuses in 2001 and 2011	104

Table 4.11	Metropolitan municipality population and households in 2011	104
Table 4.12	Changes in this metropolitan municipality's population groups between 2001 and 2011	105
Table 4.13	How GRB strengthens the role of marginalised communities in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality?	106
Table 4.14	Role of stakeholders in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	107
Table 4.15	Relevance of GRB programme in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	108
Table 4.16	Level of community participation in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	109
Table 4.17	How the priorities of men, women, boys and girls were identified in this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget	110
Table 4.18	Challenges/difficulties of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	112
Table 4.19	Implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	113
Table 4.20	Training of this metropolitan municipality's officials on GRB	114
Table 4.21	Individual opinion on the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	115
Table 4.22	Finalisation of the gender equality process in this metropolitan municipality	116
Table 4.23	How this metropolitan municipality is addressing unacceptable levels of gender inequality	117
Table 4.24	Cost effectiveness of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	118
Table 4.25	The metropolitan municipality's records of gender disaggregated data for budgeting purposes	118
Table 4.26	Overview of enrolment in public higher education institutions: 2011	123

Table 5.1	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for women in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137
Table 5.2	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for men in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would first like to thank God Almighty for giving me the strength and wisdom to complete this project. I was able to complete this study with great enthusiasm and much vigour even when the going started getting tough. Compiling this mini-dissertation would not have become a reality if it was not for the kind support and encouragement of the people close to me.

My full appreciation goes to my parents, for making it possible for me to be where I am today and for supporting me all these years. Again, thank you to everyone who has had a great influence in my life thus far.

My special thanks goes to my supervisors Professor Gera Ferreira and Dr Michael Reddy, for shaping my thinking and giving direction when it mattered most. Your immense knowledge on the subject left me in awe most of the time. Your role in editing and ensuring that my work conforms with UNISA's technical requirements is appreciated.

I would also like to acknowledge the metropolitan municipality that is the focus of this study, especially the office of the city manager. Thank you for granting me permission to conduct my research within your metropolitan municipality.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
Title	
Declaration	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of abbreviations	iv
Table of contents	v
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background and rationale	1
1.2.1 The study area	7
1.3 Problem statement	8
1.4 Aim and objective of the study	10
1.5 Research questions	11
1.6 Research method	12
1.7 Demarcation of the study	17
1.8 Terminology	18
1.9 Overview of chapters	20
1.10 Referencing	22
1.11 Permission for the study	22
1.12 Summary	22
CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW: GRB	
2.1 Introduction	24
2.2 Contextualisation of GRB	24
2.2.1 Gender budgeting country experiences	38
2.2.1.1 GRB in Australia	39
2.2.1.2 GRB in Tanzania	42
2.2.1.3 GRB in Brazil	43
2.2.1.4 GRB in India	44

KEYWORDS

The keywords of this study as defined in section 1.8 of Chapter 1 of this study are as follows;

Budget, Gender Responsive Budgeting, Gender Equality, Gender Mainstreaming, Municipality, Metropolitan Municipality, Integrated Development Plan, Government, Service Delivery

KEYWORDS

The keywords of this study as defined in section 1.8 of Chapter 1 of this study are as follows;

Budget, Gender Responsive Budgeting, Gender Equality, Gender Mainstreaming, Municipality, Metropolitan Municipality, Integrated Development Plan, Government, Service Delivery

ABSTRACT

South Africa started the Women's Budget Initiative in 1995 as part of its commitment to meeting its gender equality objectives and gender mainstreaming. However, in later years, research has found that government Gender Responsive Budgeting or GRB initiatives in South Africa are either dormant or dead. There is a range of reasons for this and some of them are not directly related to gender budgets or even gender. Research has shown that perhaps the greatest weakness is the lack of advocacy.

From the review of existing literature, it is clear that there is a need for strong alliances between key stakeholders, which are Parliament, non-governmental organisations, academics, United Nations and the media to sustain the momentum of the gender budget process. Capacity building and training are also important for budget officers, civil society, national and local parliamentarians, given the low level of skilled financial personnel in municipalities. The availability of adequate sex-disaggregated data is an important success factor for municipalities so that they can deliver services equitably to their communities.

This research is exploratory in nature and focuses on assessing GRB in one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. It also reviewed the 2012/13 Integrated Development Plan through a focus on health, housing infrastructure, safety and security and education. These are some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of the poor and are good quality of life indicators for men, women, boys and girls.

The research method that has been used in this research is both qualitative and quantitative. This study has found that there is no clear co-coordinated plan for the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality. The lack of resources is also seen as the main challenge to GRB in this metropolitan municipality.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
Title	
Declaration	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of abbreviations	iv
Keywords	v
Abstract	vi
Table of contents	vii
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background and rationale	1
1.2.1 The study area	7
1.3 Problem statement	8
1.4 Aim and objective of the study	10
1.5 Research questions	11
1.6 Research method	12
1.7 Demarcation of the study	17
1.8 Terminology	18
1.9 Overview of chapters	20
1.10 Referencing	22
1.11 Permission for the study	22
1.12 Summary	22
CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW: GRB	
2.1 Introduction	24
2.2 Contextualisation of GRB	24
2.2.1 Gender budgeting country experiences	38
2.2.1.1 GRB in Australia	39
2.2.1.2 GRB in Tanzania	41

2.2.1.3	GRB in Brazil	43
2.2.1.4	GRB in India	44
2.2.1.5	GRB in China	46
2.2.1.6	GRB in South Africa	48
2.3	Role of the United Nations in GRB	51
2.4	Summary	55

CHAPTER 3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1	Introduction	56
3.2	Research design	56
3.3	Data sources	58
3.4	Data collection techniques	62
3.5	Sampling methods	67
3.6	Data analysis and interpretation	69
3.7	Limitations of the study	73
3.8	Ethical considerations	74
3.9	Summary	75

CHAPTER 4. RESEARCH ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

4.1	Introduction	77
4.2	Review of the research process	77
4.3	Response rate of the survey	80
4.4	Data analysis and findings	82
4.4.1	GRB in the study area	83
4.4.1.1	Metropolitan municipality 2012/13 budget overview	89
4.4.1.1.1	Revenue	92
4.4.1.1.2	Spending on utility services in this metropolitan municipality	93
4.4.1.1.3	The capital budget	94
4.4.1.2	Analysis of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP	97
4.4.2	GRB in health, housing, safety and security in this metropolitan municipality	103

4.4.3	Responses to the researcher's interview questions	105
4.4.4	GRB in education	119
4.5	Summary	125

CHAPTER 5. SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1	Introduction	130
5.2	Summary of this study	130
5.3	Discussion of data and findings of this study	133
5.4	Recommendations	143
5.5.	Suggestions for further research	147
5.6	Conclusion	148

LIST OF REFERENCES		149
---------------------------	--	-----

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	UN support for GRB by countries	53
Table 4.1	Group one sample composition	80
Table 4.2	The metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	85
Table 4.3	The 2012/13 budget numbers at a glance	89
Table 4.4	Breakdown of the 2012/13 municipal operating budget	90
Table 4.5	Year-on- year spending and growth in staff costs from the 2011/12 to 2012/13 financial year in this metropolitan municipality	91
Table 4.6	2012/13 revenue categories of this metropolitan municipality	93
Table 4.7	Operating expenditure for 2012/13 by vote	94
Table 4.8	Year-on-year increase from the 2011/12 budget to the 2012/13 capital funding sources	95
Table 4.9	Major capital projects for 2012/13	95
Table 4.10	Population of this metropolitan municipality from the last two recorded censuses in 2001 and 2011	104

Table 4.11	Metropolitan municipality population and households in 2011	104
Table 4.12	Changes in this metropolitan municipality's population groups between 2001 and 2011	105
Table 4.13	How GRB strengthens the role of marginalised communities in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality?	106
Table 4.14	Role of stakeholders in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	107
Table 4.15	Relevance of GRB programme in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	108
Table 4.16	Level of community participation in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	109
Table 4.17	How the priorities of men, women, boys and girls were identified in this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget	110
Table 4.18	Challenges/difficulties of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	112
Table 4.19	Implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	113
Table 4.20	Training of this metropolitan municipality's officials on GRB	114
Table 4.21	Individual opinion on the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	115
Table 4.22	Finalisation of the gender equality process in this metropolitan municipality	116
Table 4.23	How this metropolitan municipality is addressing unacceptable levels of gender inequality	117
Table 4.24	Cost effectiveness of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	118
Table 4.25	The metropolitan municipality's records of gender disaggregated data for budgeting purposes	118
Table 4.26	Overview of enrolment in public higher education institutions: 2011	123

Table 5.1	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for women in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137
Table 5.2	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for men in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137

ABSTRACT

South Africa started the Women's Budget Initiative in 1995 as part of its commitment to meeting its gender equality objectives and gender mainstreaming. However, in later years, research has found that government Gender Responsive Budgeting or GRB initiatives in South Africa are either dormant or dead. There is a range of reasons for this and some of them are not directly related to gender budgets or even gender. Research has shown that perhaps the greatest weakness is the lack of advocacy.

From the review of existing literature, it is clear that there is a need for strong alliances between key stakeholders, which are Parliament, non-governmental organisations, academics, United Nations and the media to sustain the momentum of the gender budget process. Capacity building and training are also important for budget officers, civil society, national and local parliamentarians, given the low level of skilled financial personnel in municipalities. The availability of adequate sex-disaggregated data is an important success factor for municipalities so that they can deliver services equitably to their communities.

This research is exploratory in nature and focuses on assessing GRB in one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. It also reviewed the 2012/13 Integrated Development Plan through a focus on health, housing infrastructure, safety and security and education. These are some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of the poor and are good quality of life indicators for men, women, boys and girls.

The research method that has been used in this research is both qualitative and quantitative. This study has found that there is no clear co-coordinated plan for the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality. The lack of resources is also seen as the main challenge to GRB in this metropolitan municipality.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
Title	
Declaration	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of abbreviations	iv
Keywords	v
Abstract	vi
Table of contents	vii
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background and rationale	1
1.2.1 The study area	7
1.3 Problem statement	8
1.4 Aim and objective of the study	10
1.5 Research questions	11
1.6 Research method	12
1.7 Demarcation of the study	17
1.8 Terminology	18
1.9 Overview of chapters	20
1.10 Referencing	22
1.11 Permission for the study	22
1.12 Summary	22
CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW: GRB	
2.1 Introduction	24
2.2 Contextualisation of GRB	24
2.2.1 Gender budgeting country experiences	38
2.2.1.1 GRB in Australia	39
2.2.1.2 GRB in Tanzania	41

2.2.1.3	GRB in Brazil	43
2.2.1.4	GRB in India	44
2.2.1.5	GRB in China	46
2.2.1.6	GRB in South Africa	48
2.3	Role of the United Nations in GRB	51
2.4	Summary	55

CHAPTER 3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1	Introduction	56
3.2	Research design	56
3.3	Data sources	58
3.4	Data collection techniques	62
3.5	Sampling methods	67
3.6	Data analysis and interpretation	69
3.7	Limitations of the study	73
3.8	Ethical considerations	74
3.9	Summary	75

CHAPTER 4. RESEARCH ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

4.1	Introduction	77
4.2	Review of the research process	77
4.3	Response rate of the survey	80
4.4	Data analysis and findings	82
4.4.1	GRB in the study area	83
4.4.1.1	Metropolitan municipality 2012/13 budget overview	89
4.4.1.1.1	Revenue	92
4.4.1.1.2	Spending on utility services in this metropolitan municipality	93
4.4.1.1.3	The capital budget	94
4.4.1.2	Analysis of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP	97
4.4.2	GRB in health, housing, safety and security in this metropolitan municipality	103

4.4.3	Responses to the researcher's interview questions	105
4.4.4	GRB in education	119
4.5	Summary	125

CHAPTER 5. SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1	Introduction	130
5.2	Summary of this study	130
5.3	Discussion of data and findings of this study	133
5.4	Recommendations	143
5.5.	Suggestions for further research	147
5.6	Conclusion	148

LIST OF REFERENCES		149
---------------------------	--	-----

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	UN support for GRB by countries	53
Table 4.1	Group one sample composition	80
Table 4.2	The metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	85
Table 4.3	The 2012/13 budget numbers at a glance	89
Table 4.4	Breakdown of the 2012/13 municipal operating budget	90
Table 4.5	Year-on- year spending and growth in staff costs from the 2011/12 to 2012/13 financial year in this metropolitan municipality	91
Table 4.6	2012/13 revenue categories of this metropolitan municipality	93
Table 4.7	Operating expenditure for 2012/13 by vote	94
Table 4.8	Year-on-year increase from the 2011/12 budget to the 2012/13 capital funding sources	95
Table 4.9	Major capital projects for 2012/13	95
Table 4.10	Population of this metropolitan municipality from the last two recorded censuses in 2001 and 2011	104

Table 4.11	Metropolitan municipality population and households in 2011	104
Table 4.12	Changes in this metropolitan municipality's population groups between 2001 and 2011	105
Table 4.13	How GRB strengthens the role of marginalised communities in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality?	106
Table 4.14	Role of stakeholders in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	107
Table 4.15	Relevance of GRB programme in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	108
Table 4.16	Level of community participation in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	109
Table 4.17	How the priorities of men, women, boys and girls were identified in this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget	110
Table 4.18	Challenges/difficulties of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	112
Table 4.19	Implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	113
Table 4.20	Training of this metropolitan municipality's officials on GRB	114
Table 4.21	Individual opinion on the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	115
Table 4.22	Finalisation of the gender equality process in this metropolitan municipality	116
Table 4.23	How this metropolitan municipality is addressing unacceptable levels of gender inequality	117
Table 4.24	Cost effectiveness of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	118
Table 4.25	The metropolitan municipality's records of gender disaggregated data for budgeting purposes	118
Table 4.26	Overview of enrolment in public higher education institutions: 2011	123

Table 5.1	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for women in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137
Table 5.2	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for men in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	137

2.2.1.5	GRB in China	46
2.2.1.6	GRB in South Africa	49
2.3	Role of the United Nations in GRB	51
2.4	Summary	55

CHAPTER 3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1	Introduction	56
3.2	Research design	56
3.3	Data sources	58
3.4	Data collection techniques	62
3.5	Sampling methods	67
3.6	Data analysis and interpretation	69
3.7	Limitations of the study	72
3.8	Ethical considerations	74
3.9	Summary	75

CHAPTER 4. RESEARCH ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

4.1	Introduction	76
4.2	Review of the research process	76
4.3	Response rate of the survey	79
4.4	Data analysis and findings	81
4.4.1	GRB in the study area	82
4.4.1.1	Metropolitan municipality 2012/13 budget overview	88
4.4.1.1.1	Revenue	91
4.4.1.1.2	Spending on utility services in this metropolitan municipality	92
4.4.1.1.3	The capital budget	93
4.4.1.2	Analysis of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP	95
4.4.2	GRB in health, housing, safety and security in this metropolitan municipality	102
4.4.3	Responses to the researcher's interview questions	104
4.4.4	GRB in education	118

4.5	Summary	124
-----	---------	-----

CHAPTER 5. SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1	Introduction	129
5.2	Summary of this study	129
5.3	Discussion of data and findings of this study	132
5.4	Recommendations	142
5.5.	Suggestions for further research	146
5.6	Conclusion	147

LIST OF REFERENCES	148
---------------------------	------------

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	UN support for GRB by countries	53
Table 4.1	Group one sample composition	79
Table 4.2	The metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	84
Table 4.3	The 2012/13 budget numbers at a glance	88
Table 4.4	Breakdown of the 2012/13 municipal operating budget	89
Table 4.5	Year-on- year spending and growth in staff costs from the 2011/12 to 2012/13 financial year in this metropolitan municipality	90
Table 4.6	2012/13 revenue categories of this metropolitan municipality	92
Table 4.7	Operating expenditure for 2012/13 by vote	93
Table 4.8	Year-on-year increase from the 2011/12 budget to the 2012/13 capital funding sources	94
Table 4.9	Major capital projects for 2012/13	94
Table 4.10	Population of this metropolitan municipality from the last two recorded censuses in 2001 and 2011	103
Table 4.11	Metropolitan municipality population and	

	households in 2011	103
Table 4.12	Changes in this metropolitan municipality's population groups between 2001 and 2011	104
Table 4.13	How GRB strengthens the role of marginalised communities in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality?	105
Table 4.14	Role of stakeholders in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	106
Table 4.15	Relevance of GRB programme in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	107
Table 4.16	Level of community participation in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality	108
Table 4.17	How the priorities of men, women, boys and girls were identified in this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget	109
Table 4.18	Challenges/difficulties of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	111
Table 4.19	Implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	112
Table 4.20	Training of this metropolitan municipality's officials on GRB	113
Table 4.21	Individual opinion on the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	114
Table 4.22	Finalisation of the gender equality process in this metropolitan municipality	115
Table 4.23	How this metropolitan municipality is addressing Unacceptable levels of gender inequality	116
Table 4.24	Cost effectiveness of GRB in this metropolitan municipality	117
Table 4.25	The metropolitan municipality's records of gender Disaggregated data for budgeting purposes	117
Table 4.26	Overview of enrolment in public higher education institutions: 2011	122

Table 5.1	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for women in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	136
Table 5.2	This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for men in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)	136

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The study focuses on assessing gender responsive budgeting (GRB) in one of South Africa's largest urban metropolitan municipalities. In particular, it reviews the metropolitan municipality's budget for the 2012/13 financial year and the Integrated Development Plan (IDP) covering the same period with the aim of showing the extent of their gender sensitivity/responsiveness or lack thereof. The 2012/13 financial year was selected because it is the most current and completed financial cycle in the metropolitan municipality at the time of writing this dissertation. It also provides a general overview of priority spending areas by the metropolitan municipality.

The introductory chapter provides a background and rationale for the study. The problem statement, aims and objectives as well as the approach to the study are also provided. The research questions, research method employed and the manner in which information was gathered are explained. Since the study is subject to limitations, the demarcation of this study is set out briefly. A concise description of the terms frequently used in the study is given in order to avoid misinterpretation. An overview of the chapters contained in the dissertation is provided, including a conclusion of the information contained in this chapter.

1.2 BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE

Public institutions in South Africa render services to the public and the extent to which they do this is of importance to the public and administrators alike. Public institutions need to spend public funds appropriately to achieve success. Budlender (2012:8) states that GRB was first implemented at the national level in 1995 in South Africa, a year after the country's first democratic elections that brought an end to the apartheid era. More than two

decades later, it is still work in progress, particularly at local level and national level where it started.

The GRB concept is, to a large part, guided by the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996, hereafter referred to as the Constitution of 1996. Chapter 13 of the Constitution of 1996 calls on all public managers, particularly the executive, to distribute money fairly and equitably in all communities. This means that government spending should benefit all groups of citizens making up its people. Prior to 1994, not all the citizens of the country benefited equitably from the public budget, therefore government is faced with the challenge of redressing these past inequalities. One of the ways of responding to this challenge is to include previously disadvantaged groups such as men, women, boys and girls in the budget. More importantly, it is stated in Chapter 2 on the Bill of Rights Section in the Constitution of 1996, on equality, that the State may not unfairly discriminate directly or indirectly against anyone in one or more grounds mentioned, including gender.

The focus of this study assesses how GRB affects men, women, boys and girls in one of South Africa's largest urban metropolitan municipalities. It compares and contrasts the breakdown of spending for a number of services such as housing, health, safety and security and education. Housing, health, safety and security and education have been chosen because they are some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of marginalised groups and, as such, are good quality of life indicators (Budlender, 2012: 304). According to Budlender (2012: 304), these variables are also listed in this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP as some of the main priority areas after consultation with residents. The aim of the study is to pinpoint if any inequalities exist and if so, how these are being addressed through budgeting.

It is worth noting that providing education is a broader function or competence of the Western Cape Provincial Government (WCPG) where this metropolitan municipality is based. Details of why education has been selected will be explained in section 4.2 of Chapter 4 of this study. The study also looks at the

existing policies and strategies that the metropolitan municipality implements in its quest to achieve equality and gender representativity in its budget process.

According to Budlender (2012: 17), initially GRB was focused nationally in South Africa on poverty, HIV and Aids and gender-based violence because these areas were politically controversial after the first democratic elections in 1994. In 2000, the WCPG started its own internal GRB initiative. The process involved training on the importance of gender budgeting, for male and female middle-to- high-level civil servants through a series of workshops. The process was re-started in 2007 when the African National Congress (ANC) was in power in this region and continued after the Democratic Alliance (DA) came into power in 2009. The DA has, until the end of the 2012/13 budget, provided suggestions on how GRB can be expanded (City of Cape Town Budget, 2012/13).

Gender responsive budgets take their own form. Budlender and Sharp (1998: 12), argue that it is important to recognise that such budgets are not separate budgets for men, women, boys and girls. Instead they are attempts to break down or disaggregate the government's mainstream budget according to its impacts on men, women, boys and girls. It is important for municipalities in South Africa to realise that the needs of men, women, boys and girls are different, and unless the policies of municipalities factor this, they will not be gender responsive and, therefore, not serve the interests of the people (Budlender and Sharp, 1998: 12).

Local government is the sphere of government that is closest to communities (Education and Training Unit for Democracy and Development, 2012: 1). According to the Constitution of 1996, all South Africans are entitled to basic services provided by municipalities such as water, housing, health, nutrition and social services. These can make a significant contribution towards moving marginalised groups out of poverty. The 2012/13 IDP in the metropolitan municipality chosen for this study includes a city-wide strategic urbanization plan, where the focus is on critical areas such as health, housing

and safety and security. The metropolitan municipality's residents, for instance, need to benefit from health provision, housing allocation and protection from abuse and crime. In a bid to integrate a metropolitan municipality divided by apartheid and achieve equity in service delivery and resource distribution including land, water and wealth to disadvantaged communities, the metropolitan municipality making up the study area adopted its first IDP in the early 2000's. It is a plan that spells out key development and spending areas for a five year period in line with the amount of time that a political party or parties are expected to govern the metropolitan municipality (City of Cape Town Integrated Development Plan, 2003/04). The metropolitan municipality further recognises that it is bound by the Local Government Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000 to manage a plan for development. This includes the allocation of services, not only to concentrate on the provision of fundamental municipal services, but also to eradicate poverty, boost local economic development, create employment and promote the process of reconstruction and development.

According to the Financial and Fiscal Commission (2012: 309), the metropolitan municipality that is the focus of this study is a large urban area with a high population density and many centres of economic activity. Rapid urbanization has been experienced since South Africa's first democratic election in 1994, resulting in the metropolitan municipality's population almost doubling to 3, 7 million (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 309). The Councillor Handbook of the metropolitan municipality (2013: 1) also states that more than 220 councillors and 25 000 staff are in its employment to ensure effective service delivery.

A draft policy on women's empowerment and gender equality in the metropolitan municipality is in the process of being adopted. This is part of ongoing plans to boost the understanding by officials of the subject so they can be able to apply it in their budgeting and planning processes (Draft Women and Empowerment and Gender Equality Policy, 2014). The main purpose of this draft policy framework is to establish a clear vision and a set of mainstreaming guidelines for the metropolitan municipality in the development

of services, policies, procedures and practices based on equality among men, women, boys and girls. It also suggests the development of specific interventions to meet the practical and strategic needs of women in order to ensure their empowerment is a step towards gender equality (Draft Women and Empowerment and Gender Equality Policy, 2014). The draft policy process is still at the public participation stage.

According to Denhardt and Denhardt (2011: 50), public participation is crucial for the success of government policies in any democratic state such as South Africa. It is through high levels of public engagement that governments are likely to achieve the best political outcomes, which reflect the broad judgements of the people as a whole or the considered judgements of specific groups and, in this case all men, women, boys and girls living in this metropolitan municipality. Public participation is also a necessary consultative process in which citizens provide feedback to government, and government actively engages them in policy-making.

Without a clear policy on women's empowerment and gender equality, the metropolitan municipality that is the focus of this study, is faced with a number of challenges, such as the lack of trained budget officers in gender-mainstreaming, GRB and planning and a policy framework to guide the implementation of GRB. Lack of gender mainstreaming means officials cannot properly assess the implications for men and women on their planned actions and policies. This study seeks to correct these challenges with the aim of persuading the metropolitan municipality to put gender equality issues high on its municipal agenda. An empowerment policy is crucial because it suggests the development of specific interventions to meet practical and strategic needs of men, women, boys and girls in order to ensure their empowerment, as a step towards gender equality (Draft Women and Empowerment and Gender Equality Policy, 2014).

After working as a journalist for the past five years in the geographic area where the metropolitan municipality being studied is based, the researcher has become familiar with the challenges faced by people who often find

themselves excluded in the budgeting processes. Men, women, boys and girls are often excluded through the lack of political participation and job opportunities. Poor service delivery is a major issue for many municipalities across South Africa. According to Hewu (1999: 182), the challenge for the metropolitan municipality's GRB initiative also remains its ever changing population patterns. Migrant labour has led to new settlements arising. Population growth, resulting from people moving into the metropolitan municipality, perceived as a wealthy area, requires increased service delivery, upgrading of infrastructure, and subsidies for poorer areas and households. Latest statistics show that in 2011 the population of the metropolitan municipality was 3 740 025, an increase of 29.3% since 2001, and the number of households was 1 068 572, an increase of 37.5% since 2001 (City of Cape Town Census, 2011). Further, the composition of the population has changed significantly. For example, the Black population increased by 58%, the Coloured population by 14%, the Asian population by 25% and the White population group rose by 8%. The population of the metropolitan municipality in terms of age groups remains predominantly in the 25 – 64 years group. The young Black and Coloured age cohorts and older White and Asian age cohorts in 2011 have implications for service delivery needs, planning and implementation (City of Cape Town Census, 2011).

This study attempts to find out if and how key decision makers, such as senior managers and political principals, have been trained in gender mainstreaming and GRB. Training on GRB at local level can involve various elements, such as helping decision makers to commence with a gender budget research project and explore how they can use GRB budgeting in their daily work. It is important that officials gain an understanding of gender relations, the division of labour between men and women and who has access and control over resources. It is also important that they are made to understand how men and women, for instance, contribute to the local economy, what participatory processes must be used by men and women and what barriers exist for participation (Plato Training and Consulting, 2014: 1).

The study further analyses the metropolitan municipality's current draft gender policy which is still at public participation stage. It also recommends a plan of action to possibly guide departments across the metropolitan municipality. The study may also benefit officials and stakeholders in the metropolitan municipality by contributing towards their further understanding of the importance of GRB.

The implementation of GRB requires adequate financial resources. According to Pauw, Woods, Van der Linde, Fourie and Visser (2015: 303), most municipalities in South Africa collect their revenue from rates, service charges, grants and subsidies. The metropolitan area where the study is taking place can be used as an example of one such metropolitan municipality. It is also one of the most viable municipalities in the country, often receiving clean audits. This means that the metropolitan municipality is constantly practicing sound financial management (Auditor-General, 2011). The metropolitan municipality received its seventh unqualified audit for good financial management from the Auditor-General in 2011. In addition, Moody's International 2013, a global ratings agency, confirmed this metropolitan municipality's good credit rating, which means that it is also paying off its debt to creditors well (Moody's Investor Service, 2013). This metropolitan municipality is, therefore, a good example to show how GRB could function. With a sound financial shape and a favourable credit rating, the city should be able to lead its residents onto the path to a better future.

Public spending in South Africa's municipalities is guided by the Municipal Finance Management Act 56 of 2003 and requires public managers to possess basic financial management skills to assist them with preparing public budgets, tendering, procuring goods and services and safe guarding assets (Auditor-General, 2011).

1.2.1 THE STUDY AREA

According to Budlender (2012: 309), the metropolitan municipality where the study is taking place is one of the biggest metropolitan areas in South Africa

and is located in the Western Cape Province. The metropolitan municipality is categorised as a Category A municipality under Section 155 (1) (b) of the Constitution of 1996. It is a large urban area with a high population density and many centres of economic activity. In 2011, (section 1.2 above), the population of the metropolitan municipality was 3 740 025 (City of Cape Town Census, 2011). Like most municipalities around South Africa, it has violent service delivery related protests which may point to a weakness in implementing some policies. Budlender (2012: 309) also argues that services such as housing, health, safety and security and education are priorities for the metropolitan municipality as set out in the 2012/13 IDP. The IDP document formulates a city-wide strategic urbanization plan where the focus is to create communities with access to good quality public spaces and services. Given the challenges of rapid urbanisation and high population growth, the metropolitan municipality experiences challenges in distributing some of the services mentioned above.

According to the International Labour Organisation's (ILO) GRB Overview Report (2012: 6), GRB initiatives may help to bridge persistent inequalities between men, women, boys and girls. Thus far, since the concept of GRB was first introduced in Australia around 1984, GRB initiatives have not been successfully applied to mainstream budgets (Sharp and Broomhill, 2002: 17). Instead they have tended to concentrate on allocations targeting, for instance, women and girls, which comprise a very small portion of national budgets. Regular assessment of gender budgeting is necessary to adjust budgets to ensure equality of access by women and men to public sector expenditures and for meeting their social needs (Norwegian Ministry of Children and Equality, 2007: 2).

1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT

Although the South African government has shown commitment to gender equality through various policies and legislative measures, such as the creation of the Ministry on Women, Children and Persons with Disabilities in 2009, such policies and legislative measures still remain weak and under-

resourced. One of the biggest challenges for the government is the implementation of its programmes aimed at addressing inequalities between men, women, boys and girls at local government level (Keller, 2002: 15).

According to Hicks (2012: 2), key building blocks towards attaining gender equality have also been made through intensive lobbying and there have been several anti-discriminatory laws promulgated, such as the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998, the Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act 4 of 2000, the Domestic Violence Act 116 of 1998, the Recognition of Customary Marriages Act 120 of 1998 and the establishment of Equality Courts at every magistrate's court in 2000 to hear cases of discrimination. While the Constitution provides the foundation for gender equality with human rights as its basis, access to equality, justice, and freedom from discrimination still remain a pipe dream for the majority of people, particularly women. There are unacceptably high levels of gender-based violence against men, women, boys and girls in schools, families and communities (Hicks, 2012: 2).

According to Keller (2002: 15), South Africa is a signatory to important conventions meant to advance women and realise gender equality. The country has also committed itself to the GRB process through its membership to many international organisations, such as the ILO (ILO, 2012: 14). In 1995 the South African government ratified the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women with no reservations. South Africa also adopted the Beijing Platform for Action in 1995 and prioritised five areas of concern that the country would focus on: women and violence, poverty, health, education and economic empowerment. Keller (2002: 15) also argues that the government has moved to ensure it complies with domestic and international obligations with regard to ensuring gender equality in political representation. The 2008 SADEC Protocol on Gender and Development requires a 50/50 representation of women in political leadership by 2015. Since 2004, women's representation in the South African Parliament has steadily increased from an initial 27% to 45% attained during the 2009

national and provincial elections. Despite these commitments, unacceptable gender inequalities remain in the country.

Budlender (2012: 310) states that GRB is limited in the metropolitan municipality where this study is being conducted due to issues such as delays in the finalisation of a gender equality policy. This has resulted in senior management shifting responsibility and accountability for gender equality to lower-level officials. The draft policy on gender equality is still at public participation stage, meaning that the metropolitan municipality is still gathering input from the public on their views and concerns about the policy. Due to this problem, GRB is poorly understood by city employees, as a result, gender-mainstreaming and GRB are taking place very slowly. It would be critical for this study to establish whether there are enough trained officials in the metropolitan municipality to implement gender equality and whether women empowerment is one of the core businesses of this metropolitan municipality.

In view of the background provided above, the researcher is asking the question:

“To what extent is the metropolitan municipality, where this study is being conducted, making provision for GRB?”.

1.4 AIM AND OBJECTIVE OF THE STUDY

The aim of the study is to explore the extent of compliance with GRB in one of South Africa’s largest urban municipalities. In particular, it reviewed the metropolitan municipality’s budget for the 2012/13 financial year and the IDP covering the same period, with the aim of showing the extent of their gender sensitivity/responsiveness or lack thereof. The study explored this by examining the following objectives, namely to:

- determine what the existing literature says about GRB.
- investigate to what extent the residents of the metropolitan municipality, especially women, are aware of their democratic rights to request that their interests be included in the metropolitan

municipality's budget and also to explore how they experience GRB in general.

- explore to what extent the municipal officials and the public understand how to manage their interaction in this regard. This exercise would help address inequalities in spending, and to investigate whether it is the training of officials in GRB policies or encouraging authorities to spend more on such policies, that can make a difference in the lives of women.
- determine how the IDP and variables such as health, housing, safety and security and education can be addressed to bring about GRB.

Section 1.5 below deals with the research questions of the study.

1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

In keeping with the objectives mentioned in 1.4 above, the study deals with the following research questions which could lead to the possible solution to the problem statement:

- What does the existing literature review in Chapter 2 of this dissertation say about GRB in general, and more specifically in this metropolitan municipality in South Africa?
- To what extent are residents of this metropolitan municipality, including men, women, boys and girls, aware of their democratic rights to request that their interests be included in the city's budget and how best can existing problems be resolved?
- To what extent do officials and the public understand how to manage their interactions so that they can address inequalities in spending, brought about by factors, such as the past apartheid system in South Africa?
- How is this metropolitan municipality handling inequalities in the specified variables such as housing, health, safety and security and education?

The research method of the study is discussed in section 1.6 below.

1.6 RESEARCH METHOD

In assessing gender responsiveness in the metropolitan municipality, the study first reviewed the 2012/2013 budget which clearly shows how much has been spent during this period on projects that advance the course of men, women, boys and girls. It also reviewed the 2012/13 IDP. IDPs are crucial documents that provide insights into the strategic goals and detailed action or implementation plans of municipalities (Budlender, 2012: 304). An IDP is also an excellent instrument to determine a particular metropolitan municipality's commitment to the empowerment of men, women, boys and girls. It is also an excellent instrument to determine gender equality because the local budget is a tool that provides resources to the IDP (Budlender, 2012: 304). Therefore, if the IDP and its underlying sector plans are not gender sensitive/responsive, the underlying budget is unlikely to be gender sensitive/responsive.

The study assessed gender sensitivity/responsiveness in the metropolitan municipality through a focus on health, housing infrastructure, safety and security and education. According to Hicks (2012: 4), these chosen variables constitute the greatest obstacles to the attainment of equality for women and men and their enjoyment of constitutional rights. Hicks (2012: 4) argues that these are some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of the poor and are good quality of life indicators. Fifty-percent of South Africa's population is poor and women in rural areas make up a large part of poor households (Keller, 2002: 19). One challenge is that local government is the most resource-poor of the three spheres of government, the other two being national and provincial government, and the rural local government structure receives about two per cent of the national government budget. Furthermore, the variables mentioned above are listed in this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP as some of its main priority areas for development for the financial period.

The metropolitan municipality where this study is being conducted was selected because of various factors. As discussed in section 1.2 above, the metropolitan municipality has a mix of people of colour, such as Blacks, Coloureds, Whites and Asians making up its population. In 2011, there were 1 444 939 Black people living in the city, 1 585 286 Coloured, 585 831 White, 51 786 Asian and 72 184 from other groups (City of Cape Town 2011 Census). Further, the population gender distribution of males and females has largely remained the same, with more females than males. In 2011, the percentage of females of the total population declined slightly from 52% in 2001 to 51% in 2010. The number of males increased slightly as a percentage of the total from 48% in 2001 to close to 49% in 2011 (City of Cape Town 2011 Census).

Interviews were conducted with the senior officials who work with the portfolios of health, housing and safety and security and education in this metropolitan municipality. The following documents were used, namely, the metropolitan municipality's draft gender equality policy document, the metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget, 2012/13 IDP, political speeches which are in the public domain, residents of this metropolitan municipality and various civic organization statements. Details of the research method are explained in the paragraph below and, more comprehensively, in Chapter 3 of this study.

The research method for this study is both qualitative and quantitative. According to Mouton (2001: 161), the qualitative approach involves the use of predominantly qualitative research methods to describe and evaluate the performance of programmes in their natural settings, focusing on the process of implementation rather than on quantifiable outcomes. Mouton (2001:194) also argues that researchers using the qualitative method tend to keep field notes as they participate in the fieldwork. The strengths of the qualitative paradigm are that it studies people in terms of their own definitions of the world, it gives an insider's perspective, focuses on the subjective experience of individuals, and is sensitive to the contexts in which people interact with one another.

For the qualitative method, this study rests on two main sources. The primary research was done by way of various face-to-face/telephone and e-mail questionnaires with senior municipal officials responsible for health, housing and safety and security. The education portfolio is a broader function or competence of the WCPG and the researcher relied on documents in the public domain for analysis. Interviews were also conducted with residents of this metropolitan municipality, in particular community leaders. The researcher conducted 18 interviews, apart from the literature review, to supplement any gaps that may be created in the study. The officials and organisations identified in this paragraph constituted the sample of the study. The breakdown of the interviews is explained in detail in section 4.3 of Chapter 4 in this study.

Secondary sources, such as civil society groups and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) as well as participant observation in natural field-settings were also consulted. Two of the main NGOs include Section 27 and the Treatment Action Campaign and two of the main civic organisations include the South African National NGO Coalition and the Greater Cape Town Civic Alliance. The study also depended on existing literature in the form of published books, written formal reports/research reports, political speeches, news clippings from newspapers, radio, television and the internet. Civil society and NGOs are crucial because they work with communities on the ground and are better placed to represent their needs. The study also analysed policy documents and Acts, White Papers and Budget documents for the chosen metropolitan municipality drawn up and prepared by the Women's' Empowerment and Gender Equality Programme of 2012.

Interviews were based on a mixture of open-ended and closed-ended questions to enable the researcher to get a proper feel of the conversation. According to McBurney (1994: 194), an open-ended question permits the respondents to answer in their own words. It enables them to answer more completely and to reveal the reasoning behind their answers. Using open-ended questions makes it more likely that the researcher will discover something that he/she had not anticipated. Regarding close-ended questions,

McBurney (1994: 194) argues that they tend to limit the respondents to alternatives determined in advance by the researcher. Closed ended-questions are easier to code and analyse and there are fewer off-the-wall responses. The alternatives are presented to the respondents so they do not have to think as hard. The researcher mixed these two types of questions and respondents were offered the opportunity to expand on the answers to a closed-ended question. This permitted the data to be coded and analysed easily, and gave some insights into the reasons the respondents chose the alternative they did.

Interviews did not last longer than 30 minutes at a time. These were audio-taped, where permission was granted by the respondents. The researcher was aware that some of the participants could be biased in their answers in an attempt to paint a favourable picture for their cause. In such a scenario, the researcher applied his best judgement to arrive at a fair conclusion.

Since the budgeting process involves numbers, the researcher also used the quantitative research method to analyse and compare what the metropolitan municipality spent on the mentioned priority areas of housing, health, safety and security and education in the 2012/13 financial period as reflected in the IDP. A large part of the focus was on the spending on capital budgets to address inequalities. According to Mouton (2001: 108), numeric data are usually well structured and easy to capture, although not as rich in meaning as textual data.

Telephone interviews were used for comparative reasons, including observations from the literature at hand. The telephone is rapidly increasing in popularity as a method of collecting data (McBurney, 1994: 20). The main advantage of the telephone is the low cost and a higher response rate. Telephone interviews can also be done rapidly without the researcher and the respondents travelling to many locations for face-to-face interviews or to mail survey questionnaires (McBurney, 1994: 201).

Quantitative research methods are favoured for measuring and analysing data. They also allow the researcher to summarise vast sources of information and facilitate comparisons across categories and over time. Furthermore, personal bias can be avoided by researchers keeping a distance from participating subjects and employing subjects unknown to them (Kruger, 2003: 18).

In the human sciences, one can gather data using existing instrumentation or design his or her own (Mouton, 2001: 100). While existing instruments have certain advantages, such as saving in time and costs, they can be complicated because some scales and questionnaires are copyrighted and may require approval and payment of a fee before they are used. This study relied on the researcher's own designed set of questions. However, the researcher was aware of limiting factors that are endemic in this approach, such as asking double-barrelled questions, not getting the order of questions correctly, asking leading questions and using vague and/or ambiguous terms. The researcher minimised these problems by using best-judgement and exercising quality control.

The researcher also chose to keep track of fieldwork as a form of quality control. Ultimately, all fieldwork culminates in the analysis and interpretation of some set of data, be it qualitative or quantitative (Mouton, 2001: 108). Analysis involves breaking up the data into various manageable themes to establish whether there are any patterns or trends that can be identified or isolated. Interpretation, Mouton (2001: 108) further argues, involves the synthesis of one's data into larger coherent wholes. The researcher was aware of some limiting errors in this stage of the research such as incomplete answers to questions and omissions of critical statistics and sought to avoid or minimize these at all stages of the research. According to Rubin and Rubin (1995: 226), data analysis begins while the interviews are still underway. The preliminary analysis will tell the researcher how to design his/her questions to focus on the subject matter as he/she continues interviewing. He/she will begin a finer analysis once the interviews are complete.

According to the ILO (2012: 14), an assessment of GRB in a metropolitan municipality, such as the one where this study took place and the impact of the budget on men, women, boys and girls, entailed using certain tools. These tools must identify budget priorities and track the impact of policy on gender equality. The assessment of GRB in the metropolitan municipality firstly involved a numerical description of the representation of men, women, boys and girls in services such as health, housing, safety and security and education. Secondly, it involved a numerical description of how the services are distributed in relation to men, women, boys and girls. If men, women, boys and girls obtain precisely equal shares of resources, a survey of representation and resources would give the same information on the distribution of resources. Lastly, the assessment involved a discussion and assessment of the state of gender equality with health, housing, safety and security and education (Norwegian Ministry of Children and Equality, 2007).

1.7 DEMARCATION OF THE STUDY

It has already been stated in section 1.1 of this study that this research focused on assessing GRB in one of South Africa's largest metropolitan areas. In particular, it reviewed the metropolitan municipality's budget for the 2012/13 financial year and the IDP covering the same period, with the aim of showing the extent of their gender sensitivity or lack thereof. The 2012/13 financial year was selected because it is the most current completed financial cycle in the organisation at the time of writing the dissertation. It also provided a general overview of priority spending areas by the metropolitan municipality.

The study also highlighted the capital projects that have been identified by the city as crucial in addressing the phenomenon of gender equality. It also evaluated the amount of spending that has been allocated to these projects. This study further evaluated the operating budget accompanying these projects, with the aim of identifying any possible gaps in spending.

According to Budlender (2012: 309), the metropolitan municipality where this study took place is one of the biggest metropolitan areas in South Africa and

is located in the Western Cape Province (WCP). It is a large urban area with a high population density and many centres of economic activity. The research focused on a comparison of service provision between men, women, boys and girls. Budlender (2012: 309) argues that a lot of inequalities are still being felt among the predominantly black and coloured populations. These groups are some of the worst affected by racial segregation brought about by the apartheid system (Budlender, 2012: 309). Men, women, boys and girls from both ethnic groups were sampled equally in the study for a balanced assessment.

1.8 TERMINOLOGY

A concise definition of the terms to be used in this thesis is detailed below;

(a) A **budget** is more than an accounting or financial exercise. It is a plan authorising the buying and production of public goods and services for the people within a particular political context. That political context is a field where the legislature and the political and administrative executive authorities interact (Pauw, Woods, Van der Linde, Fourie and Visser, 2015: 78). In this study, a budget refers to a financial plan for work done by the government to benefit its people at the local government level for a specified period. It provides an estimate of revenue and expenditure and authorizes them.

(b) **Gender responsive budgeting** is government planning, programming and budgeting that contributes to the advancement of gender equality and the fulfillment of people's rights. It entails identifying and reflecting needed interventions to address gender gaps in sector and local government policies, plans and budgets (United Nations, 2014). In this study, GRB is a means to determine the effect of government revenue and expenditure policies on women, men, boys and girls.

(c) **Gender equality** means that men, women, boys and girls have the same opportunities, rights and duties in all areas of life. They have equal rights to exercise influence, share responsibilities and burdens and to recognize or

realise the rewards for effort (Norwegian Ministry of Children and Equality, 2007). In this study, gender equality refers to the view that men, women, boys and girls should receive equal treatment and not be discriminated against based on their gender.

(d) **Gender-mainstreaming** means that GRB should be introduced into the core of government operations. It provides a practical opportunity for all spheres of government to develop skills for applying gender tools in their programmes (Dlulisa, 2013: 3). Gender mainstreaming refers to the government process of assessing the different implications for men, women, boys and girls of any planned policy action in one of South Africa's largest municipalities, including legislation and programmes at the local government level.

(e) **Municipality** is an administrative entity composed of a clearly defined territory, and its population and commonly denotes a city. It is that municipality which shares its municipal executive and legislative authority in its area with a District Municipality within whose area it falls and which is described in Section 155 (1) (b) of the Constitution of 1996. In this study, municipality refers to the metropolitan municipal area where this study is taking place. It is a Category A municipality characterised by factors such as a high population density, an intense movement of people, goods and services and multiple business districts.

(f) **Metropolitan Municipality** is a municipality which executes all the functions of local government for a city or conurbation. It is categorised as a Category A municipality under Section 155 (1) (b) of the Constitution of 1996. Further, for a municipality to have Category A status, it must be characterised by factors such as a high population density, an intense movement of people, goods and services and multiple business districts. In this study, metropolitan municipality refers to the metropolitan municipal area where this study is taking place.

(g) **Integrated Development Plan** is the principal strategic planning instrument which guides and informs all planning and development as well as all decisions with regard to planning, management and development in a municipality (Pauw, Woods, Van der Linde, Fourie and Visser, 2015: 279). In this study, it refers to a plan for how the metropolitan municipality will spend its budget in the 2012/13 financial year, on what, and where. It is a plan to help the metropolitan municipality set its budget priorities.

(h) **Government** refers to the structures and institutions of government and of those public organizations formally charged with setting policy and delivering services (Denhardt and Denhardt, 2011: 86). In this study, it refers to a body that has the authority to make and the power to enforce laws. It also refers to a system by which the selected metropolitan municipality is governed.

(i) **Service delivery** refers to a governing authority's activities to meet the basic requirements in the community. This includes the provision of water, electricity and sanitation, (Department of Provincial and Local Government, 2001: 6). In this study, service delivery refers to the implementation of laws and the actual provision of services to communities of the selected metropolitan municipality.

1.9 OVERVIEW OF CHAPTERS

The following chapters form part of this research:

Chapter 1 forms the introductory chapter. It includes the background and rationale for the study in order to provide context, the motivation, the problem statement, objective and approach to the study, research problems encountered and an explanation of the approach to the study. The demarcation of the period of study and scope of the research are also briefly mentioned. The gathering of information and the research methods are explained and specific key concepts used in the text are briefly listed. A concise description of the terms to be frequently used in the study is given in order to avoid misinterpretation and ambiguity.

Chapter 2 provides a literature review of the argument on this phenomenon/issue. It provides the reader with a theory base, a survey of published works that pertain to this study and an analysis of the work. It provides a critical, factual overview of the argument of what has gone on before. The importance of GRB is also analysed as a policy issue. The meaning of the concept of gender responsive budgeting is also investigated in more detail. The context of GRB is examined and its dimensions are identified and described, including its origins. A few examples of country experiences with GRB were explored to locate GRB in context. Countries such as Australia, Tanzania and United Kingdom were analysed and may provide comparable examples to the South African situation. This chapter explains the prerequisites for gender responsive budgeting. The South African constitutional obligations for equality are explained as well as the statutory provisions, which call for the establishment of GRB. Prerequisites which can be utilized in order to pursue and realize effective GRB are identified and analysed. This is done in order to establish a framework which can serve as a useful basis for investigating the problems inherent in the absence of GRB in the selected metropolitan municipality. It looks at the actors in GRB.

Chapter 3 presents a discussion on the research methodology. Both the qualitative and quantitative methods used are explained, including their strengths and justification regarding why they were used. The types of data collection methods used are also explained as well as the justification for their choice. The researcher further explains how the data was interpreted and detailed the problems and limitations that he anticipated in the research.

In **Chapter 4**, the research analysis and findings from the interviews are presented and interpreted in light of the information obtained in the preceding chapters, leading to the conclusions and recommendations in the next chapter.

Finally, **Chapter 5** provides a summary of this study. Conclusions and recommendations were drawn based on the findings of the study. Possible recommendations were also made, which may encourage the support and

practice of gender responsive budgeting. Possible research projects that could emanate from this research are also suggested.

Finally, the sources consulted are listed in the list of references.

1.10 REFERENCING

In this study, three types of references are used on the Harvard method of referencing:

Firstly, it may be necessary, according to Barclay (2009: 11), to refer to other sources from which information was taken (source references). Secondly, it may be necessary to refer to earlier or later sections of my own text (cross reference) and thirdly, it may be necessary to give additional explanations to supplement the information in the text (content reference).

The sources consulted are listed alphabetically. A list of abbreviations used in this chapter has been provided at the start of the research.

Finally, the findings, concluding remarks and recommendations are presented logically.

1.11 PERMISSION FOR THE STUDY

The researcher applied for and was granted ethical clearance to conduct the study by the Ethical Committee in the Department of the Public Administration and Management at the University of South Africa (UNISA). Details of how the researcher went about applying for ethical clearance are explained in section 3.8 of Chapter 3 of the study.

1.12 SUMMARY

This study focuses on assessing GRB in one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. Chapter 1 dealt with the background to the study, problem

statement, aim and objectives of the study and research questions. It also focused on research methodology, terminology and the proposed chapters. In Chapter 2, the dissertation focuses on a detailed analysis of the literature review of the study.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW: GRB

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this chapter is to set the present research within the context of other research that has been done on GRB. In other words, it provides an overview of previous research on the subject from various sources. This chapter also introduces the conceptual and contextual framework for the study that comprises the main focus of the research described in this mini-dissertation. The literature study is based on local (South African) and international literature on the subject of study.

The contextualisation of GRB, past, present or future, is mentioned in the literature review, together with practice examples of how GRB is working or has worked in countries such as Australia, Tanzania, Brazil, India, China and South Africa. Previous findings from other relevant studies are also highlighted.

This chapter is divided into two sections. In the first section, the contextualisation of GRB is discussed, the research is placed in a historical context and the importance of GRB is explained. The researcher distinguishes between what has been done and what needs to be done. The second section discusses other country experiences in respect of GRB and the lessons that South Africa can learn from them. This chapter concludes with a summary of what has been discussed in this chapter.

2.2 CONTEXTUALISATION OF GRB

The goal of GRB is to promote equality between men, women, boys and girls by influencing the budgeting process (Sharp, 2003: 3). According to Budlender (1998: 4), gender budget initiatives in South Africa started in 1995, almost immediately after the country's first democratic elections. The first

democratic elections were held on 27 April 1994. The effort did not propose a separate budget for women, but an examination of the entire government budget to determine its differential impact on men, women, boys and girls. Budlender (1998: 4) argues that GRB also seeks to raise awareness of the effects that budgets have on men, women, boys and girls and hold governments accountable for their commitments to gender equality. As already discussed in section 1.3 of Chapter 1, South Africa has committed itself to the GRB process through its membership to many international organisations, such as the ILO (ILO, 2012: 14).

The Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing 1995, has been hailed as one of the most important milestones towards the advancement of women's issues around the world. According to Stotsky (2007: 12), since then there has been a significant amount of research into gender budgeting. The Beijing conference also propelled many governments to affirm their commitment to gender equality and to use their budgets to translate their gender equality commitments into fiscal commitments (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 303). Despite efforts to formulate GRBs, many countries, including South Africa, still have gender-blind budgets. The reasons for this, Stotsky (2007: 12) argues, include ignorance, gender-biased culture, a lack of gender budgeting expertise and limited gender-disaggregated data. Such data are gathered and broken down by gender in order to aid comparison. Since South Africa is a member of the ILO post 1994, gender equality is a key operational objective that must be achieved to fulfill 'the decent work agenda' (ILO, 2012: 3).

The challenges of achieving effective GRB in present day South Africa also include limited financial resources for municipalities. Many South African municipalities, particularly the smaller ones, are struggling financially. There appears to be no solid financial control mechanisms laid down to enable effective service delivery to some communities, especially the needy (National Treasury, 2013: 1). Service delivery challenges are also often exacerbated by human resource issues, ranging from the difficulty to recruit suitably qualified and experienced professionals to unstructured or weak disciplinary

procedures. However, in some instances, there were several attempts to address the lack of experience and skills, mainly in the form of assistance through the deployment of technical personnel from the private sector (Van der Mescht and Van Jaarsveld, 2014). Many municipalities have also received qualified reports due to a lack of proper financial management skills and poor rates and taxes collection management systems. Qualified reports are issued by an auditor when he/she encounters one of two types of situations which do not meet set and generally accepted accounting principles, however the rest of the financial statements are fairly presented (Auditor General, 2014).

Gender budget analysts, such as the well-known South African academic and researcher, Debbie Budlender, argue that there is not enough money to finance women and gender programmes, such as reproductive health, gender-based violence or HIV/Aids programmes (Gender Responsive Budgeting, 2006:11). Money is an important policy tool for government and without it government cannot successfully implement its policies or programmes, regardless of how good they are (Gender Responsive Budgeting, 2006: 11). Despite the fact that not much is expected to have changed since the introduction of GRB in South Africa in 1995, effective financial management can still assist municipalities to transform their local areas into better places to live and work in, thus contributing towards meeting the goals of GRB (Education Training Unit, 2013).

Due to the lack of proper GRB policies, not enough attention is given to the impact of allocated resources. As a result, this serves to perpetuate gender biases in South Africa, even though national and local government budgets do offer the potential to transform gender inequalities. As discussed in section 1.2 of Chapter 1, a draft policy on women's empowerment and gender equality in the metropolitan municipality under consideration is still in the process of being adopted. This policy is crucial because it elevates the prioritisation of women empowerment (Minister Lulu Xingwana, 2014). According to Budlender and Sharp (1998: 10), a good gender policy requires understanding both its impact and how it might be better designed to achieve outcomes which meet the needs of men, women, boys and girls.

GRB is an important tool for achieving gender equality and the empowerment of men, women, boys and girls in the developing world and South Africa is no exception. GRB is not about 50% male: 50% female, because 50: 50 is “equal” but is sometimes not equitable. GRB is about determining where the needs of men, women, boys and girls are the same and where they differ. Where needs are different, allocations should be different (Gender Responsive Budgeting, 2006 :11). For instance, health is an area in which male and female needs often differ. Both males and females suffer from influenza, malaria, and tuberculosis, although the economic and social implications of these diseases may differ according to gender. In addition, women tend to have greater reproductive health needs than men. Women also tend to use health services more often than men, both for themselves and in their roles as carers for other members of the household. This means that 50:50 in terms of health funds reaching men and women probably implies a bias against women.

According to the Financial and Fiscal Commission (2012: 301), GRB is a means by which the government can turn its gender-equality commitments into reality. The South African government, post 1994, adopted a number of measures that include antidiscrimination legislation and affirmative policies to correct imbalances created by the apartheid government. These measures are not meant to formulate separate budgets for women but to promote budgetary processes that are sensitive to the different needs of men, women, boys and girls. Some of these measures and pieces of legislation include the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998, the Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act 4 of 2000 and the much-talked about Broad Based Black Economic Empowerment programme of 2003 (Hicks, 2012: 2).

GRB recognizes that traditional budgeting systems failed, in most instances, to recognize the contribution of women to the national fiscus and seeks to correct this (Country Corruption Assessment Report, 2003: 1). In trying to redress this, GRB raises awareness of impact of budgets on gender issues. This implies that a particular issue, such as dealing with violence against

women, has become important enough to become part of a regular agenda. GRB awareness can mean that governments could be made accountable for their equality commitments through budget action and could assist in the introduction of a gender-sensitive formulation in budgets to meet women's pressing needs (Overview of Gender-Responsive Budget Initiative, 2014: 17). Some GRB initiatives, for instance, claim to have had a positive impact on policy and budgets through:

- **Increases in budget allocations** - in Mexico in 2012, the initiative led by Fundar and Equidad de Género, resulted in increased allocations to reproductive health (Mexican Government, 2012).

- **Changes in the distribution of benefits among beneficiaries** - in the United Kingdom in 2013, the UK Women's Budget Group influenced tax policy by convincing the government to grant the Child Tax Credit to the main caregiver, as opposed to the main breadwinner (Overview of Gender-Responsive Budget Initiative, 2014).

- **Introduction of new policy and funding** - in South Africa in 1998, the government introduced the child support grant and increased its allocations to the Department of Trade and Industry to promote small, medium and micro-enterprises (UNICEF, 1998).

In South Africa, issues of accountability, fairness and trust are even more important at the local sphere of government, given the perceived high levels of corruption in government in general. There is a need for local authorities to regain the trust of the electorate by ensuring that everyone (men, women, boys and girls) has a fair share of the slice of the budget (Country Corruption Assessment Report, 2003: 1).

Budlender (2012: 301) states that given the poverty profile in South Africa, any attempt to target public resources at the poor must confront gender-related issues head-on. Figures released by Statistics South Africa in 2014 show that while 4 million people are living in poverty in South Africa, the three main spheres of government namely, the national, local and provincial governments, still have a huge role to play in helping the country to meet its

millennium development goal of eliminating poverty and reducing inequality by the year 2030 (Statistics SA, 2014). Credit is also given to the South African government for its social grant system, which has been hailed as one of its most important pieces of legislation to reduce poverty affecting men, women, boys and girls across all of South Africa's ethnic groups (Millennium Development Goals Report, 2013). For instance, the number of beneficiaries of social grants in South Africa grew from 2 million in 1994 to over 16 million in 2013. Of these, an estimated 11 million are child support grant beneficiaries (Department of Social Development, 2013).

According to Budlender and Woolard (2012: 28), social grants can address inequality which is one of the main aims of GRB. They also argue that the poor are amongst the most affected by inequality and grants are an important source of income for poor households and could reduce poverty. Existing evidence indicates that the grant system, in its totality, reduces income inequality. South Africa's grant system includes three types of child grants alongside several adult grants (Department of Social Development, 2014). The three types of grants are the Child Support Grant, Care Dependency Grant and Foster Child Grant.

The **Child Support Grant** is the main poverty-oriented child grant (Millennium Development Goals Report, 2013). It is available to all primary caregivers, who pass a simple means test that is set at 10 times the value of the grant. The **Care Dependency Grant** is provided to caregivers of severely disabled children on the basis that these caregivers will have limited opportunity to earn money given the intensive care needs of these children. The **Foster Child Grant** is provided to foster parents of children who are placed in foster care because they are considered by the courts to be in need of care and protection in terms of the Children's Act 38 of 2005 (section 150).

While gender budgeting gained momentum at national level in South Africa in the mid-1990s, it remains a concern whether there is enough political will to translate gender commitments into fiscal commitments at local level. According to Budlender (2012: 301), this is where gender disparities in basic

services provision are most glaring. Service delivery protests for basic needs such as housing, health, safety and security and education are common in most municipalities across the country, including in the metropolitan municipality where this study took place. Addressing shortages of housing, health, safety and security and education is important because these are considered as some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of communities, particularly the poor, and as such are good quality of life indicators (Budlender 2012: 304). After consultation with residents, these variables are also listed in the selected metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP as some of the main priority areas.

The Department of Women, Children and People with Disabilities in 2014 called for gender responsive budgeting to be used as a tool for reducing inequality and advancing the empowerment of men, women, boys and girls. The department argues that experience has shown that budgets, in general, have been instrumental in perpetuating gender biases globally. The department says governments, for instance, do not spend enough to support developmental programmes for men, women, boys and girls in housing, health, safety and security and education. To correct this, in early 2012, the department under the leadership of Minister Lulu Xingwana, launched the Women and Budgeting Initiative in partnership with the private sector. It aimed to reflect on the budget process and economic frameworks and how these could promote the development and implementation of policies to empower men, women, boys and girls. The initiative argued that government should allocate resources in a way that considers differential burdens borne and advantages enjoyed by women and men and try to balance these.

Xingwana also argued that notwithstanding the number of actions that have been taken by the South African government since 1994 to uphold gender equality, the levels of poverty, inequality and unemployment are still high. According to The Women's Charter for Effective Equality (1994), women in the new South Africa are marginalised and discriminated against in terms of economic opportunities, access to land, credit and finance. Xingwana argued that the process of developing the Women Empowerment and Gender

Equality Bill is at an advanced stage. The Bill would help enforce compliance in both the government and private sector (Department of Women, Children and People with Disabilities, 2014).

Some of the changes aimed at women empowerment, in particular, are evident in that women in South Africa today occupy influential positions in government and play an important role in decision-making processes, such as the recently appointed Speaker in the National Assembly, Baleka Mbete.

According to Elson and Sharp (2010: 524-525), gender-responsive budgeting has contributed to the introduction of the child support grant in South Africa, given to the primary caregivers of young children from poor households. Elson and Sharp (2010: 424) also argue that the South African Women's Budget Initiative successfully made the case for paraffin, a basic necessity for poor women, to be zero rated for Value Added Tax. As part of its commitment to women's issues, the South African government also celebrates women's month in August of every year.

In his 2014 State-Of-The-Nation-Address, South African President Jacob Zuma said his government was committed to ensuring the safety of women and children by introducing a number of measures to make their communities safer. These included reopening the Family Violence, Child Protection and the Sexual Offences Units against abuse as well as the Sexual Offences Courts. The aim of the Sexual Offences Courts is to address the growing challenge of sexual offences in the country, particularly against vulnerable groups. The courts also feature a screening process to identify cases that fall within the sexual offences category, a special room where victims will testify, a private waiting room for adult witnesses, a private waiting room for child witnesses and victim support services (SA to Reinstate, 2013).

President Zuma also pledged to work closely with non-governmental organisations to promote the rights of men, women, boys and girls. He also reiterated the ANC government's commitment to helping all municipalities to address huge housing backlogs and increase access for poorer communities

to services such as water, sanitation, electricity, education, health, safety and security. According to Corner and Repucci (2009: 10), because governments are obligated to provide services equally to all citizens, a gender-sensitive approach to service delivery is essential.

President Zuma identified that one of the main obstacles to efficient service delivery in South Africa was the lack of qualified and experienced personnel at local government level. There is a general concern by the Presidency, as reflected in the 2014 State-Of-The-Nation-Address, about the violence that accompanies service delivery protests around the country. The South African government also acknowledges that the strengthening of existing forums on people participation is critical to ensure the further development of all communities. The fight against corruption has been singled out as one of the areas that need urgent attention because government believes that in the past, the scourge has contributed to the provision of poor services to South African communities at large.

According to the Economic Commission of Africa (2001: 31), one of the major problems regarding the implementation of the GRB is the incapacity of those expected to incorporate gender into their budget submissions. Most of these officials have little or no background in gender studies and practices and development. Resistance to the concept of gender equality as an important variable in long-term structural transformations is also apparent. Gender equality is an emotive subject for many people. This study will later highlight the progress made by this metropolitan municipality in training and educating officials in GRB since it was first established in 1995.

Only 40% of South Africa's high ranking officials, such as municipal managers and their chief financial officers have the skills they need to do their jobs (City Press, 2014). The City Press report also argues that a 2014 municipal audit has found that out of 30 municipalities in the WCP, only 16 had qualified municipal managers and 14 had qualified chief financial officers. This lack of skills has a direct bearing on service delivery in these municipalities and implications for how officials view GRB. Some officials have been accused of

failing to complete courses relevant to their jobs like the critical certificate in municipal financial management (City Press, 2014). The purpose of a qualification in municipal financial management is to enable participants to apply strategic level financial management competencies to ensure effective, efficient and economical utilisation of public funds and resources at the local government sphere (South African Qualifications Authority, 2014). The qualification also enables learners to develop competencies to manage strategic planning and budgeting processes, financial management processes and internal control, auditing and reporting processes.

The role played by NGOs and civil society groups in GRB cannot be ignored. According to Briones and Valdez (2002:17), these groups must be lauded for their expertise in conducting research on the subject, producing analysis and mobilizing government to support gender equality programmes. A network of support from the academe and other government agencies is crucial in developing this field. In Chapter 4, this study will reflect on whether all the role players are collaborating to develop GRB. Briones and Valdez (2002: 17) also argue that it will reflect whether there is practical engagement on the subject amongst officials in the selected metropolitan municipality, the NGO's, government agencies and civil society groups that are partners in the initiative. When GRB was introduced in South Africa, it targeted officials at national level and then later local authorities. Twenty years into democracy, it was interesting to see whether enough councillors have been trained to recognize the importance of the GRB phenomenon. The scenario on the training of councillors in 2012/13 is discussed in detail in Table 4.20 in Chapter 4 of this study.

Citizen participation is important for GRB and ensuring that budgetary commitments are solid, accountable and represent the views and wishes of men, women, boys and girls. According to Shah (2006: 75), participatory budgeting has been advanced by budget practitioners and academics as an important tool for inclusive and accountable governance and has been implemented in various forms in many developing countries around the world. According to Licha (2004: 329), citizen participation in planning and budgeting

has become an indicator of good governance in municipalities and is part of a larger process of decentralization. Licha (2004: 329) also argues that as part of the decentralization process, citizen participation and democracy appear as important pillars of governance with less social exclusion, greater accommodation, and improvement of quality of life conditions.

GRB aims to address the issue of social exclusion and improve the lives of all groups in a community. Licha (2004: 329) argues that demands for more active citizen participation and fiscal decentralization were influenced more by the fact that centralized governments have not been successful in providing adequate living standards with equity for their populations. A centralized government means that one body makes all the important decisions for the nation or state and handles all responsibilities. It is best for smaller nations that do not have much territory to control and therefore must keep everything tight and concentrated (Ask.com, 2014: 1). A decentralized government is one that spreads responsibilities out to different bodies, such as provinces and government agencies, so they can make important decisions. It is best for countries that reign over a large territory and cannot effectively control it all with just one body (Ask.com, 2014: 1).

According to Lichi (2004: 10), participatory budgeting is important and useful in promoting GRB because citizen participation in the context of fiscal decentralization could greatly enhance the development effectiveness of public funds and promote social equity. Moreover, democracy at the community sphere has achieved significant progress in the presence of citizen participation. Lichi (2004: 10) also argues that participatory budgeting creates the conditions needed for citizens to construct the public realm, a process that takes place through the culture and practice of deliberation. Participatory social management fosters deliberation and decision-making that enables citizens to attain influence in guiding public policies.

Participation in GRB might ensure that the issues of all social groups, rich and poor, such as men, women, boys and girls, are included in national priority programmes and enforce non-discrimination on the grounds of gender. It

might also help to build a gender focus in the formulation and implementation of municipal development plans, incorporate a gender-perspective in national budgeting processes amongst others. It might also empower women who have long been regarded as one of the marginalised groups in society (Promoting Women's Participation and Gender Responsive Budgeting, 2014). This study points out how far the selected metropolitan municipality is engaging its citizens, using the participatory process, whether citizens know their rights in terms of participation and how are they are being encouraged to participate in the budgeting process by the officials in charge.

In 2012, a World Bank report on poverty named South Africa as one of the most unequal societies in the world, despite the fact that the achievement of equality is one of the core founding values of the country's Constitution of 1996. Focussing on inequality of opportunities, the report stated that, on the one hand, the potential for economic growth had been held back by industrial concentration, skills shortages, labour market rigidities and chronically low savings and investment rates. On the other hand, economic growth was highly unevenly distributed, perpetuating inequality and economic exclusion. Other factors that can impact on poverty and equality also include limited access to quality basic services, such as health care, housing, safety and security and education. The report established that in terms of these criteria, white children had enormous advantages compared to black children. 83% of the white children studied came from two-parent households with relatively small families. They lived overwhelmingly in urban areas and had access to good education and health services. By contrast, only 30% of black children came from double-parent families. In poorer communities and in rural areas, most had several siblings. 859 000 were double orphans and 98,000 lived in child-headed households. The majority of black children living in rural areas, informal settlements and/or townships did not have access to decent schools and healthcare (World Bank, 2012).

The above scenario is a GRB issue because it shows that the highly unequal domestic circumstances continue to play a disproportionate role in South African children's access to some of the basic opportunities (South Africa

Overview, 2014). While opportunities, like school attendance and access to telecommunications, are on par with the universal levels among South African children, other opportunities, such as health insurance, access to safe water and improved sanitation, adequate space without overcrowding, and finishing primary school, are highly inadequate and unequally distributed among children with different circumstances. GRB seeks to address these inequalities by improving efficiency and ensuring that expenditure benefits those who need it most, improving monitoring by knowing who government services are reaching and reporting on progress with national and international gender commitments amongst others.

At the same time, important progress is being made in improving the conditions under which the poorest segments of the population live. State programmes, such as the increased accessibility of the child-support grant and the Reconstruction and Development Programme which started in 1994, are already having a marked effect on improving the basic living conditions of the poorest segments of the population. The South African government has set itself a target of 2015 to achieve its Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), which include eradicating extreme poverty and hunger and improving access to service delivery for all its citizens (Millennium Development Goals, 2014). MDGs on primary education, gender, several health indicators and environmental sustainability are likely to be achieved. Social grants expenditure and the number of beneficiaries have quadrupled since 1994. Social insurance programs, including state old-age pensions, child support grants, conditional grants for school feeding and early childhood development and disability grants, currently cover around 16 million people and, at 3.5% of the Gross Domestic Product, are more than twice the median spending among developing economies. These programs, managed by the South Africa Social Security Agency, are well targeted and provide income relief for the poor (South Africa Overview, 2014).

The long-term solution to the problems of poverty and inequality lies in vastly improving the country's education and training system, in creating jobs and in ensuring rapid and sustainable economic growth (South African Institute of

Race Relations, 2014). It would also be important to address the underlying social problems, as identified by the World Bank report mentioned above. These are precisely the factors that have been diagnosed and addressed by South Africa's National Planning Commission in its National Development Plan following its appointment in May 2010. The challenge will be to ensure that government successfully implements the National Development Plan of 2010. If it can do so, perhaps it can make meaningful progress in reducing poverty and inequality and thus achieve the vision of the Constitution.

From the literature review above, it is clear that gender studies are still a new and growing phenomenon. Therefore, more needs to be done to fill the gaps that have been left by other researchers. However, the review of existing literature alone is not enough to get a clear picture of fulfilling the objectives of this study. It is important to source other information from elsewhere to overcome shortfalls. The poor documentation of day-to-day activities of local authorities greatly limits this study, therefore, it is important to look at other possible literature sources. Making reference to the Constitution has, for example, provided the context under which gender responsive budgeting should take place and also the guidelines that politicians and administrators need to apply to ensure that the rights of all citizens are met.

This study makes reference to three recent studies in the field of GRB. Firstly, Budlender looked at South Africa's experience in GRB in 2012 and found that despite the relatively large number of GRB-related initiatives in this country, there is a widespread feeling that political intervention is still lacking in many municipalities (Budlender, 2012: 10). Due to a lack of understanding of the GRB concept, senior management has also been shifting responsibility and accountability for gender equality to lower-level officials. Secondly, a study done by Parveen in Bangladesh in 2010, focussing on GRB in the country's health sector, showed that bureaucratic red tape and lack of understanding of the GRB concept and documented data on the concept, almost threatened to delay her study and compromise the quality of interviews (Parveen, 2010: 10). Thirdly, in 1998/9 Hewu reviewed the South African situation in terms of GRB. The review showed that local government officials committed themselves to

building democratic and economically viable municipalities that would serve all groups such as Blacks, Coloureds and Whites fairly (Hewu, 1998/9). This study differs from the above mentioned research studies in that it focuses on GRB in one of South Africa's largest metropolitan areas.

2.2.1 Gender budgeting country experiences

According to Budlender and Sharp (1998: 20), GRB initiatives, in about 100 countries are led by government, some by parliamentarians, civil society and donors. The scope, duration and activities taken by these groups differ widely and so does the understanding of GRB (International Labour Organisation, 2012). In South Africa, the GRB movement can learn from the examples of many countries where the concept has been established, countries such as Australia, Tanzania, Brazil, India and China. According to Sharp and Broomhill (2002: 17), Australia, for instance, was one of the first few countries in the world where GRB was established. Sharp and Broomhill argue that GRB was established in Australia around 1984. This was done as a tool for mainstreaming gender into economic and social policy.

GRB also aims to analyse the gender-differentiated impact of revenue-raising policies and the allocation of domestic resources and official development assistance. To get a broader feel of how the GRB concept has been received around the world, it would be important to look at other countries that are South Africa's trading partners in the BRICS economic grouping. BRICS is an association of five major emerging economies made up of Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa (Mehta, 2017). The BRICS members are all developing or newly industrialised countries. They are distinguished by their large, fast-growing economies and significant influence on regional and global affairs. As of 2014, the five BRICS countries represented almost 3 billion people, which is 40% of the world population, with a combined nominal gross domestic product of US\$16.039 trillion. The BRICS nations in 2014 represented 18 percent of the world economy (Mehta, 2017).

Organisations such as the United Nations (UN) have also played an important role in spearheading initiatives on GRB, with a sharp focus on women's rights (United Nations Women, 2011). The role of the UN in this regard will be discussed later in section 2.3 of this chapter.

Co-operation with other countries is important for the advancement of GRB in South Africa (The Presidency, 2011). For instance, in 2011, the India-Brazil-South Africa Women's Forum resolution was signed in New Delhi. The resolution was jointly signed by Women and Child Development Minister Krishna Tirath from India, her South African counterpart Lulama Xingwana and Maria do Carmo Godinho Delgado, secretary of evaluation of policies and economic autonomy of women of Brazil. The resolution stated that the three countries were committed to recognising the key role of government, with the support of civil society, to accelerate all efforts towards achieving gender equality and the empowerment of women. It also acknowledges the forum's shared commitment to various global conventions on the rights of women and girls (The Presidency, 2011).

Furthermore, the resolution recommends the following:

- To end violence against women and girls;
- To work towards the economic empowerment of women, especially rural and marginalised women; and
- To promote gender responsive budgeting and equitable development.

The GRB situation in the selected countries of Australia, Tanzania, Brazil, India, China and South Africa is discussed briefly in 2.2.1.1 below:

2.2.1.1 GRB in Australia

Sharp and Broomhill (2002: 17) argue that Australia was the first country to implement GRB around 1984. This was done as a tool for mainstreaming gender into economic and social policy. In Australia, the focus of the Women's Budget Statements has been on responding to the concerns of women as a political constituency, with progress towards gender equality being the agreed. The Australia Women's Budget (1984-1996), which was a

government-led initiative, brought about a significant increase in spending in areas of importance to women. For example, between 1985 and 1996, federal assistance to families with children rose by 27% while assistance to the aged rose by 24%. There was also a five-fold increase in child care places for working women. The department responsible for women's affairs was able to identify in advance what areas were likely to be cut and argue against those cuts.

According to Reina (2010: 8), the Australian GRB initiative emphasized that all government expenditure needed to be assessed regarding its impact on both men and women. This approach, called the 'total budget approach', divided budgets for government programmes into three main areas namely:

- Expenditure especially targeted for women and girls in the community;
- Expenditure for promoting gender equality in the governmental workplace;
- and
- General (non-gender targeted) expenditure.

The total budget approach revealed that in Australia, the proportion of government budgets committed to women and girls in the community was very small, usually less than one percent of the total amount spent. This budget approach increased attention on the analysis of general budgets, which can have significant impacts on gender issues compared to budgets targeted specifically for women. The total budget approach was subsequently adopted by the Australian state governments and as part of the Commonwealth Secretariat's gender budget pilots. The initiative was driven by bureaucrats and feminist lobby groups. It focussed on the expenditure side of the budget, but paid little attention to the gender implications of the revenue component (Reina, 2010: 8).

Furthermore, based on the total budget approach, new frameworks were developed in other countries which were variations of the Australian approach (UNIFEM, 2000: 110). For example, the international NGO, Oxfam, adapted the approach to the gender budget analysis of the education sector (Oxfam,

2005). The implementation of 'women's budget' programmes generated a number of benefits within Australia. As Sawer (1999: 38) demonstrates, they succeeded in raising awareness of the impacts that budgets have on groups and individuals by using sex-disaggregated data. In addition, Sharp and Broomhill (2002: 17) found that through this activity, gender issues were included in mainstream policy. In the mid-1990s, the focus of government budget analysis in Australia shifted to 'gender' as a category of analysis, rather than 'women' (Sharp and Broomhill, 2002: 17).

The Australian initiative fizzled out in the 1990s due to economic restructuring but later made a comeback due to the involvement of civil society. It inspired many other initiatives worldwide (Cagatay, Keklik, Lal, and Lang, 2000).

According to Budlender (2001: 5), the Australian Women's Budgets were initially situated inside government. They were coordinated by the women's machinery (which would today be called gender machinery, or gender management system), but required significant work to be done by all other ministries. In their heyday, the Australian Women's Budget statements were thick documents – the Commonwealth (national) document averaged 300 pages. The documents were thick because they included a comprehensive statement from each ministry and department as to the implications of their expenditure (and sometimes revenue) for women and men. The statements were prepared according to standardised formats that were used in devising the approach as suggested in the Commonwealth document (Budlender and Sharp, 1998: 17). However, more standardised formats are the preferred approach for bureaucratic work, and these formats ensured that sector officials knew what questions to ask. As a result, the Women's Budget statements have been criticised for being only a reporting or accountability mechanisms and thus having no impact on policy.

2.2.1.2 GRB in Tanzania

In Tanzania, the GRB initiative is led by non-governmental organisations. According to Budlender (1998: 13), the initiative was initially focussed on

health and education in 1997, the two key sectors deemed critical by poor women, men, boys and girls. The initiative is supported by the Ministry of Finance and the Planning Commission. According to Reina (2010: 8), the Tanzanian Gender Networking Programme (TGNP) has worked hard since 1997, when the GRB initiative first began, to build alliances which have led to a great deal of trust between government and non-governmental players. The TGNP drew inspiration from both Australia and South Africa. Reina further argues that it now acts as an ongoing consultant to the Ministry of Finance in the area of GRB. It is credited with spearheading one of the most successful civil society initiatives, as part of an NGO coalition. For three years, from 1997 to 1999, TGNP traced the process of national planning and resource allocation, assessing its impacts on women and men, youth and the elderly. In 1999, the Ministry of Finance hired TGNP to develop the capacity of officials to carry out gender analysis within six budget areas, including Health, Education, Water, Agriculture, Community Development and Local Government. The analysis found that half of the maternal and child health projects between 1989 and 1996 were dependent on bilateral donors and international organizations.

According to Mallya (2014: 7), TGNP started its work by engaging in women's empowerment/human rights advocacy, through the promotion of social transformation and gender equity and equality. It also focussed on animation and action oriented participatory research, coalition building and networking, outreach, policy analysis and advocacy, collective action, capacity building, information generation and dissemination. TGNP's main activities focus on gender training, feminist information, activism, lobbying and advocacy and analysing gender research (Mallya, 2014: 7). Mallya further argues that to help it better its GRB work in Tanzania, TGNP is currently undergoing extensive transformation within its own programmes to allow for more feminists oriented approaches and outcomes. The organisation says it wants to ensure a strong focus on issues such as water, energy, agriculture, health and HIV&AIDS in the near future to meet its GRB goals (Mallya, 2014: 7).

2.2.1.3 GRB in Brazil

According to Budlender (2001: 10), Agende, a Brazilian NGO, has worked on policy and budgets with the central and federal government in the country, focusing on the ministries of Justice, Health and Work and Employment. The methodology which government uses to formulate the budget has changed over the life of the project. This has added to the usual challenges of budget analysis and has resulted in a special focus on process issues. Agende has not focused specifically on gender, but has raised gender-related issues in the course of its policy and budget analysis.

The United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM) has also been instrumental in developing GRB in Brazil, which is one of South Africa's important trading partners in the BRICS group of countries (BRICS, 2014). Brazil remains South Africa's largest trading partner in Latin America and trade between the two countries is growing. According to Renato and Rubem (2011: 4), trade between the two countries in 2011 stood at 769 million US dollars. South Africa's top five exports to Brazil include coal, precious metals, plastics, aluminium and car engines. The top five imports from Brazil include vehicles, meat, sweets, confectionaries, machinery and ore (BRICS, 2014).

To illustrate GRB in Brazil, the Associação Cultural de Mulheres Negras (ACMUN) is an organisation of women of African descent in Porto Alegre (UNIFEM, 2005). ACMUN has put a lot of energy in mobilising around improved and non-discriminatory access to health services (UNIFEM, 2005). As part of these activities, ACMUN conducted a survey to find out more about the links between access to health services, HIV/AIDS and violence against women in the late 1990's. The survey confirmed that Afro-descendant women had poor access to health services during the time. There were two health systems available to people living in the community. The better system was very expensive and thus unaffordable for most of the Afro-descendant women. Many health professionals also lacked sensitivity and respect in their treatment of Afro-descendant women. More generally, the professionals often tended to humiliate poor people (UNIFEM, 2005). Despite previous attempts by NGOs to educate the health professionals about services such as

HIV/AIDS, gender equality and women's rights, they were not sufficiently sensitive to the needs of black women. After completing the survey, ACMUN formed a health network in the early 2000's, which brings together women's groups and groups of HIV-positive people. The network plans to use the survey results and recommendations in advocating for better local and national policies on health services, HIV/AIDS prevention and violence against women (UNIFEM, 2005).

2.2.1.4 GRB in India

According to Cagatay, Keklik, Lal and Lang (2000: 207), civil society in India began evaluating state budgets through the lens of poor men, women, boys and girls in the early 1980's, although Australia is regarded as a pioneer in the field of GRB. The guiding principle for GRB in India, they argue, was that the budget process should be participatory, accountable and transparent. Civil society was a strong player in driving the GRB process.

According to Jhamb, Mishra and Sinha (2013: 35), the brutal attack and gang rape of a young girl in Delhi on 16 December 2012 fuelled widespread agitations and foregrounded the issue of increasing violence against women in the country. It also provided the much needed impetus to the issue in the policy domain, with the government taking several noteworthy steps in this direction. This included the passage of a stringent anti rape law, which is the Criminal Law (Amendment) Bill, 2013 and a law on sexual harassment at the workplace. Even the Union Budget 2013-14 put women's security and safety on the centre stage. While these policy pronouncements remain extremely significant, they alone will not suffice. Further, it is difficult to conceive of any public policy that can be carried out without financial resources. It is equally difficult to conceive of any state action designed to create and facilitate an economic, social and political environment conducive to the enjoyment, exercise and realisation of women's rights that can be undertaken without funds from the national coffer. Jhamb, Mishra and Sinha (2013: 35) argue that all promises on gender equality and women's empowerment will remain elusive until and unless emboldened by financial commitments. In their

conclusion they argue that despite the steps towards GRB, the budgetary allocations for promoting gender equality and women's empowerment show a decline in India.

According to the Concept and Definition of Gender Budgeting (2014) document, the government of India is also a signatory to a number of international treaties on GRB. It also convened a few international meetings in the late 1990's that had the potential of transforming the lives of men, women, boys and girls. The following are among the international commitments to which the government of India is party:

- The Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination against Women, which the Government of India signed in 1980.
- The World Conference on Human Rights in Vienna (1993) asserted that women's rights are human rights.
- The International Conference on Population Development in Cairo (1994) placed women's rights and health at the centre of population and development strategies.
- At the Fourth World Conference of Women in Beijing (1995), governments declared determination to advance the goals of equality, development and peace for all women everywhere, in the interest of all humanity.
- In the 1995 Commonwealth Plan of Action on Gender and Development, governments declared their vision of a world in which women and have equal rights and opportunities in all stages of their lives.

The reality, in India, is that women, particularly, continue to face disparities in access to and control over resources. These disparities are reflected in indicators of health, nutrition, literacy, education and skills levels among others. There are a number of factors that prevent women and girls, mostly, from gaining access to their rightful share of public resources, goods and services. These include infant mortality, child labour, HIV/AIDS, prostitution,

sexual abuse and begging (Concept and Definition of Gender Budgeting, 2014).

The United Nations has also played an important role in the development of GRB in India, as with many other countries around the world, such as South Africa (UNIFEM, 2005). In India, several years of sustained advocacy and partnerships between the Department of Women and Children, UNIFEM and other women's organisations, have encouraged the national government to affirm the importance of gender budgeting. UNIFEM has also argued that this was initially done through the inclusion of a gender budget statement in the 2003 Union Budget and through official studies of the issue. In 2005, the Finance Minister of India committed to moving forward on implementation. Twenty-one national ministries in the country have now set up gender-budgeting cells. For the fiscal year 2005–2006, 18 departments rolled out detailed specifications of allocations and targets benefiting women. At the state level, in West Bengal, UNIFEM supported the organisation Sachetana to prepare a gender budgeting manual that the group has used to train over 1,000 women councillors in local governments. In Karnataka, another Indian state, elected women representatives in the city of Mysore used gender budgeting to prevent a proposed budget cut targeting women's programs. They ended up securing a 56% increase in funding instead, and started advocacy for more transparent public information in the future (UNIFEM, 2005)

2.2.1.5 GRB in China

China was the host of the Fourth World Conference on Women held in Beijing in 1995. South Africa is a signatory to this conference which was an action for women's equality, development and peace (UN Women, 1995). All governments attending the conference agreed to among others:

- Advance the goals of equality, development and peace for all women everywhere, in the interest of all humanity.
- Acknowledge the voices of all women everywhere, and take note of the diversity of women and their roles and circumstances.

- Honour the women who paved the way and inspired hope for change among the youth in the world.
- Recognize that the status of women has advanced in some important respects in the past decade, but that progress has been uneven; inequalities between women and men have persisted and major obstacles remain, with serious consequences for the well-being of all people.
- Recognize that this situation is exacerbated by the increasing poverty that is affecting the lives of the majority of the world's people, in particular, women and children, with origins in both the national and international domains.
- Address constraints and obstacles affecting women empowerment.
- Uphold equal rights and inherent human dignity of women and men and other purposes and principles enshrined in the Charter of the United Nations Act of 1945, to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights of 1948 and other international human rights instruments, in particular the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women of 1979 and the Convention on the Rights of the Child of 1989, as well as the Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women of 1993 and the Declaration on the Right to Development of 1986.
- Ensure the full implementation of the human rights of women and of the girl child as an inalienable, integral and indivisible part of all human rights and fundamental freedoms.

With a population of 1.354 billion in 2013, China was home to more than 18% of the world's people. 45% of Chinese citizens resided in urban centres. (World Population Statistics, 2013). In terms of GRB, public finance and governance reform efforts have been accompanied by some initial steps towards GRB. These activities have taken the form of research and training and have involved significant input from international agencies such as the United Nations (UNIFEM, 2005). Central to the promotion of gender equality in China is the National Working Committee on Women and Children established in 1992 to lead the implementation of the Program for the Development of Chinese Women. The committee is also responsible for providing training on gender issues to strengthen gender analysis and planning (UNIFEM, 2005).

The National Working Committee on Children and Women (NWCCW) is positioned in the political party structure within the All-China Women's Federation (ACWF), a quasi-governmental agency which dates back from 1949. It is mandated to represent and promote women's rights and interests and broadly, gender equality. According to Howell (2003: 191), the federation is well placed for advocacy on policy-making issues while noting that the reliance on personal connections limits its success. The work of women's organisations is underpinned by an extensive legal system. Howell argues that the legal system is underpinned by the 1982 Constitution and the 1992 Law on the Protection of the Rights and Interests of Women. Both the Constitution and the Law were amended in 2005 to include issues such as a national policy addressing gender equality and the promotion of women's empowerment (Howell, 2003: 191).

The assistance provided by international agencies has been important in raising awareness of gender responsive budgeting in China (Howell, 2003: 191). In 2007, the United Nations Development Programme supported the General Office of the NWCCW and the ACWF to undertake a seminar on gender responsive budgeting (Nandy, 2007: 4). As part of the AusAID funded China Australia Governance Program 2005-10, there has been some work done involving the ACWF to demonstrate how gender could be mainstreamed. Advancing gender responsive budgeting is consistent with China's broader efforts to improve accountability and public finance reform. The central government has undertaken steps towards fiscal reforms with the aim of improving expenditure management and making the budget more accountable and transparent (International Development Research Centre 2009: 4).

2.2.1.6 GRB in South Africa

South Africa started the Women's Budget Initiative in 1995. According to Budlender (2012: 303), the initiative was first spearheaded by NGOs,

academics and a group of parliamentarians. It used research to lobby for gender-sensitive policy changes. Initially the focus was on the gender sensitivity of the national budget, but in later years, the focus has shifted to local government.

South Africa's Department of Women, Children and People with Disabilities (2014) has suggested that political parties could be forced to have a 50-50 gender representation in local councils after the local government elections in 2016. The proposed legislation seeks to ensure 50-50 gender parity in decision making structures in both the private and public sectors, so that men, women, boys and girls benefit equally from government services. In 2014, the legislation was still being discussed by the Women, Children and People with Disabilities Portfolio Committee. However, it is likely to be rejected by opposition parties such as the main opposition Democratic Alliance, which currently does not apply the 50% gender representation rule. The Democratic Alliance says the Bill would interfere with citizens' right to choose their representatives (Department of Women, Children and People with Disabilities, 2014). Such a move poses a further setback for GRB initiatives.

According to Briones and Valdez (2002: 17-19), there are three aspects of gender budget analysis in South Africa:

- (i) gender-specific expenditures,
- (ii) expenditures which promote gender equity within the public service,
- (iii) mainstream expenditures.

Gender-specific expenditures consist of monies allocated for programmes and policies that are specifically targeted on gender lines. These are usually easily identifiable amounts. Briones and Valdez argue that for South Africa, gender budgets of this kind include the Department of Welfare's economic empowerment programme for unemployed mothers with children under five years and the staff, operating and programme costs. Expenditures which promote gender equity within the public service are amounts allocated to affirmative action and other programmes which promote 'representativity' within the public service. The expenditures are measured not only in the equal numbers of men and women employed but also equal representation in top

level management and decision-making posts across different occupations, and equitable pay and conditions of service (Briones and Valdez, 2002: 17-19). They argue that mainstream expenditures are the remaining expenditures not covered by the above categories, but are spent on sectors where more beneficiaries are women.

According to Budlender (2001: 22), GRB government initiatives in South Africa are either dormant or dead. There is a range of reasons for this and some of them are not directly related to gender budgets or even gender. However, one of the more direct reasons has been the departure of supportive key players from government such as Pregs Govender, who has been instrumental in setting up the initiative. Budlender also argues that perhaps the greatest weakness is the lack of advocacy. One reason for the lack of advocacy may be that research on GRB does not spell out clearly enough the key issues that could form the basis of such advocacy. Another could be attributed to a general weakness in civil society in finding ways of influencing policy from outside. Budlender also argues that since 1994, GRB has become quite a well-known concept in South Africa, and this development could be key in ensuring its future application in drawing up municipal budgets (Budlender, 2001: 22).

From the review of existing literature, it is clear that country experiences of gender budgeting provide important lessons, such as the need for strong alliances between key stakeholders which are Parliament, NGOs, academics, UNIFEM and the media, to sustain the momentum of the gender budget process (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 304). Capacity building and training are also important for budget officers, civil society, national and local parliamentarians, given the low level of skilled financial personnel in municipalities. The availability of adequate sex-disaggregated data is an important success factor for municipalities so that they can deliver services equitably to their communities.

2.3 Role of the United Nations in GRB

South Africa was one of the 51 original founding members of the UN, which came into existence on 24 October 1945. Since its inception, the membership of the organisation has grown to more than 190 States (UNIFEM, 2006). The United Nations supported initiatives on GRB in over 20 countries, including South Africa, in the early 2000s (UNIFEM, 2006). This support facilitated a growing momentum among governments, civil society and parliamentarians to engage in budget policy-making at national and local spheres from a gender perspective. Further, at the forefront of this initiative is an organisation called the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM). It provides financial and technical assistance to innovative programmes and strategies that promote women's rights, political participation and economic security. UNIFEM works in partnership with UN organisations, governments and non-governmental organisations and networks to promote gender equality. UNIFEM further argues that it links women's issues and concerns to national, regional and global agendas by fostering collaboration and offering technical expertise on gender mainstreaming and women's empowerment strategies.

According to UNIFEM (2006), working in close partnership with women's organisations and scholars, the UN has helped pioneer cutting-edge work on GRB that is being picked up by both local and national governments. Advocacy and training for government officials, parliamentarians and women's groups, the development of budget analysis tools and wide sharing of knowledge on what works have helped the concept to catch on, resulting in changes in a number of countries. In 2006, the Budgeting for Reproductive Rights resource pack was produced under a United Nations Population Fund or UNFPA/UNIFEM Strategic Partnership aimed at developing a Coordinated Approach for Effective Technical Assistance to GRB. This partnership is intended to build the capacity of the UNFPA's country support teams to provide support in using the GRB approach to in-country partners. As discussed above, the partnership draws largely on UNIFEM's experience in supporting GRB initiatives in over 20 countries since 2000 (UNIFEM, 2006). GRB encompasses a broad range of possible activities. The types of activities for which country partners request support are also very diverse. Thus, it is not possible to provide simple recipes for either the country partners or for

UNFPA's country support teams (CSTs). The purpose of this resource pack is to provide relevant knowledge that may facilitate mainstreaming gender-responsive approaches into reproductive health, on one hand, and the inclusion of specific aspects of gender inequality and disadvantage into national policy frameworks, on the other hand (UNIFEM, 2006).

According to UNIFEM (2006), overall, its initiative with UNFPA aims to:

- Expose CSTs to the range of GRB tools and activities available and how these relate to different development situations.
- Provide CSTs with basic materials on different aspects of relevance to GRB as well as references to further reading on each aspect.
- Provide a smaller group of CST members with practical experience in a workshop setting on how to respond to the different requests of countries.

Another UN organisation, UN Women, is a leading supporter of efforts towards ensuring that national planning, budgeting and monitoring and evaluation processes incorporate a gender perspective (UN Women, 2011). Former South African-Deputy President, Phumzile Mlambo-Ngcuka is its current Executive Director, perhaps further cementing South Africa's commitment to GRB.

UN Women's GRB programmes at cross regional, regional and country level have made significant contribution towards this by building political support, developing technical resources and capacity, generating good practices for improving women's access to services and increasing accountability to gender equality. The programmes have also launched partnerships with UN agencies and other development partners and resulted in increased support for GRB around the world. GRB initiatives supported by UN Women are continuously cited at high level policy forums and have been instrumental in building alliances with strategic stakeholders including the European Commission, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, UN agencies and the Commonwealth Secretariat among others (UN Women, 2011).

The UN Women's approach to GRB has also focused on introducing strategic and sustainable changes into budgetary processes. This approach has been pursued by assisting governments to introduce measures for incorporating gender into their public finance management systems, and building the capacity of planning and budgeting officers to apply GRB with a view to ensure that budget policies and outcomes are gender-responsive. This approach also emphasizes the importance of bringing gender equality advocates, parliamentarians and other stakeholders into the budgeting process (UN Women, 2011).

As at end of 2011, UN Women is supporting GRB work in 65 countries at national and/or local levels (UN Women, 2011). The support of countries has been divided according to continents in Table 2.1 below:

Table 2.1 UN support for GRB by countries

AFRICA	ASIA PACIFIC/ ARAB STATES	CENTRAL/ EASTERN EUROPE	COMMONWEALTH OF INDEPENDENT STATES	LATIN AMERICA/ CARRIBEAN
Rwanda	Morocco	Albania	Amenia	Ecuador
Senegal	Egypt	Bosnia	Kyrgyzstan	Bolivia
Tanzania	Palestine	Herzegovina	Moldova	Peru
Uganda	India	FYR Macedonia		Venezuela
Kenya	Indonesia	Serbia		Haiti
Mozambique	Afghanistan			Costa Rica
Sierra Leone	Nepal			Honduras
Cameroon	Pakistan			Mexico
Burundi	Vietnam			Nicaragua
DRC	Timor Leste			El Salvador
Central Africa Republic	PNG			Argentina
South Africa				Brazil

Source: UN Women: 2011

The GRB portfolio of UN Women includes programmes that forged partnerships with other UN agencies or multi-lateral agencies to articulate sector or issue-specific GRB application in line with the respective mandates, for example, employment with ILO, reproductive health with UNFPA, local governance and decentralization with the United Nations Capital Development Fund (UN Women, 2011).

UN Women has also sought to build strategic partnerships with think tanks and academic institutions as well as individuals to support the expansion of the technical aspects of GRB through collaboration with national universities such as Cheikh Anta Diop University in Senegal, Eduardo Mondlane University in Mozambique, and the Academy of Economic Studies in Moldova (UN Women, 2011). UN Women has also opened channels to dialogue with institutions such as the World Bank, International Monetary Fund and regional development banks, as well as the Inter-Parliamentary Union, the African Union and the Commonwealth Secretariat (UN Women, 2011).

UN Women started their engagements in global and regional advocacy towards GRB as early as 2001, when UN Women collaborated with the Government of Belgium as President of the European Union, the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development and the Nordic Council, to hold an international conference on GRB. This conference endorsed the vision of implementing gender-responsive budget initiatives in all countries by 2015 (Brussels Conference Communique, 2001). In 2002 and 2005, Finance Ministers of the Commonwealth committed to integrating gender in their respective budget formulation processes and to establish institutional mechanisms within their countries to monitor progress on implementing GRB (UN Women, 2011).

UN Women advocacy efforts have focused on linking the aid effectiveness agenda with the far-reaching commitments that countries have made to advance gender equality and women's empowerment. As a result, GRB is increasingly recognized as a critical tool in the process of monitoring accountability for the aid effectiveness agenda to women. UN Women has made a substantive contribution to the understanding of GRB by developing a number of cutting edge knowledge products increasingly cited and considered as standard setting resources on GRB. UN Women also maintains the only website exclusively devoted to GRB. The portal launched in 2001, is widely used by practitioners and represents a comprehensive database of GRB country initiatives and relevant resources. UN Women also facilitates a

process for knowledge sharing among developing countries such as South Africa, through study tours, translation and dissemination of various knowledge products (UN Women, 2011).

2.3 SUMMARY

The literature study is based on local (South African) and international literature on the subject of study. It dealt with the work that has been covered by various scholars in the study and tried to show the gap that currently exists in the knowledge and practice of the GRB concept, whether at national or local sphere. One such gap in the practice of GRB is the absence of up-to-date sex-disaggregated data in countries such as South Africa, which is essential for GRB. Based on the review of the literature, the gap in the knowledge of GRB, which is the subject of this study, has not been studied. Chapter 3 of this dissertation will focus on the research methodology. The contextualisation of GRB discussed in Chapter 2 focussed on the milestones towards the advancement of women's issues around the world. It further reflected on the practice of GRB based on country experiences, and the lessons that South Africa could learn from them were highlighted. Countries that form the BRICS trading bloc of nations, namely Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa, were discussed, as well as Australia and Tanzania, which are hailed as the few countries where GRB started. The role of the UN in developing and spearheading GRB was also discussed.

CHAPTER 3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The aim of the study is to explore the extent of the compliance to GRB of one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. The purpose of this chapter is to present the philosophical assumptions underpinning this research and to introduce the research strategy and the empirical techniques applied. The chapter defines the scope and limitations of the research design, and places the research amongst existing research techniques of GRB.

This chapter describes the research methodology of this study, explains the sample selection and describes the procedure used in designing the instrument and collecting the data. It also provides an explanation of the statistical procedures used to analyse the data.

Ethical considerations have been made involving human participants taking part in the research. The research questions are discussed and the summary of this chapter is provided.

3.2 RESEARCH DESIGN

Since 1994, GRB initiatives have caught the attention of the gender and development community (Budlender and Hewitt, 2002: 8). In the year 2014, there were over fifty countries in the world where there were gender budget initiatives of some kind or another (Budlender and Hewitt, 2002: 8). Many of these initiatives have stemmed from the Commonwealth Secretariat's initiative, which is aimed at challenging the gender neutrality of macroeconomic policy and piloting the integration of gender issues into the budgetary policy framework of the Commonwealth countries since 1996 (Commonwealth Secretariat, 2014).

In assessing gender responsiveness in the metropolitan municipality under review, this study reviewed its 2012/13 budget. Evidence and data from the 2012/13 budget clearly shows how much was spent during this period on projects that advanced the course of men, women, boys and girls. It also reviewed the metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP. The importance of

IDP's in GRB has been explained in section 1.2 of Chapter 1 of this study. Budlender (2012: 304) argues that an IDP is an excellent way to check a particular metropolitan municipality's commitment to women empowerment and gender equality as the local budget aims to provide resources for the IDP. Therefore, Budlender (2012: 304) concludes that if the IDP and its underlying sector plans are not gender sensitive, the underlying budget is unlikely to be gender sensitive.

This study, therefore, assesses gender responsiveness in the metropolitan municipality under review through a focus on health, housing infrastructure, safety and security and education. According to Hicks (2012: 4), these variables constitute the greatest obstacles to the attainment of equality for men, women, boys, girls and their enjoyment of constitutional rights. Hicks (2012: 4), argues that health, housing, safety and security and education are some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of the poor and are good quality of life indicators. These variables are also listed in the metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP, as some of its main priority areas for development for this financial period.

The mayor of this metropolitan municipality called for an urgent review of national government's funding model for municipalities in 2014. She attributed challenges faced by the metropolitan municipality in delivering adequate services, such as housing and education, to static or dwindling rates bases (City of Cape Town, 2014). In addition, the mayor also argued that the metropolitan municipality was often forced to transfer costs to already over-burdened consumers and residents, which actions are not sustainable for development in the long-term (City of Cape Town, 2014).

This metropolitan municipality was selected because of various factors as explained in section 1.2 of Chapter 1. According to Budlender (2012: 304), this metropolitan municipality has a good mix of people of colour such as Blacks, Coloureds, Whites, Asian and other groups making up its population. In 2011, there were 1 444 939 Black people living in this metropolitan municipality, 1 585 286 Coloured, 585 831 White, 51 786 Asian and 72 184

from other groups (South Africa 2011 Census). Budlender (2012: 304) contends that the population gender distribution of males and females has largely remained the same, with there being more females than males in this metropolitan municipality. Of the total population in this metropolitan municipality, the percentage of the female population declined slightly from 52% in 2001 to 51% in 2010. The number of males increased slightly as a percentage of the total from 48% in 2001 to close to 49% in 2011. Coloured females remained the highest percentage of the population in this metropolitan municipality (South Africa 2011 Census). The information above has also been included to express a descriptive survey method used to assess GRB in this metropolitan municipality.

3.3 DATA SOURCES

For the purposes of this study, interviews and data sourcing on GRB in this metropolitan municipality were split into three groups. The data sources were mentioned in section 1.6 of Chapter 1 of this study. Firstly, the researcher sent e-mail questionnaires to senior municipal officials, who work with the portfolios of health, housing, safety and security. According to Johnson (2014: 114), e-mail questionnaires are inexpensive, easy to analyse and fill out. They also ensure rapid completion and it is relatively easy to compare data using this method. Vogt and Haeffele (2012: 42), support this view and state that e-mailing is rapidly expanding. They also maintain that e-mail responses do not have to be transcribed, thus saving time and money for the researcher. E-mailing is also a good way to clear up any misunderstandings that may arise from other modes of interviews, such as ordinary mail because it is faster. E-mails can reach large numbers of people and respondents can take surveys at their convenience and assume anonymity (Nishishiba, Jones, and Kraner 2014: 100). Secondly, the researcher consulted the metropolitan municipality's draft gender equality policy document titled "The Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality Draft Policy: 2014". The document establishes a clear vision and sets out mainstreaming guidelines for the development of services, policies, procedures and practices, based on equality between men, women, boys and girls in this metropolitan

municipality. The draft gender equality policy suggests the development of specific interventions to meet the practical and strategic needs of these groups, in order to ensure their equitable empowerment (Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality Draft Policy, 2014).

The municipal officials and their designations have not been revealed in this mini-dissertation, as per the agreement with the researcher to keep their identities anonymous. In addition, the researcher consulted other sources such as this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget and 2012/13 IDP, official documents such as the draft policy above and political speeches, which are in the public domain.

All 18 interviews in this study, whether face-to-face, telephonic or e-mail questionnaires, were based on a mixture of open-ended and closed-ended questions, so that the researcher could get a proper feel of the conversation. According to McBurney (1994: 194), an open-ended question permits the respondents to answer in their own words. It enables them to answer more completely and to reveal the reasoning behind their answers. Using open-ended questions makes it more likely that the researcher will discover something that he/she may not have anticipated (McBurney 1994: 194). According to O'Sullivan, Rassel and Berner (2008: 216), researchers ask open-ended questions for various reasons, including the fact that they help the researcher identify a range of possible responses, avoid biases that a list of responses would introduce, yield rich detailed comments, give respondents a chance to elaborate on their answers and finally, respondents can more easily answer some questions with a few words rather than by selecting an answer from a long list of possible responses. However, according to Davies and Hughes (2014: 128), open-ended questions must be kept to a minimum, particularly in e-mail interviews because they may invite lengthy written responses. Davies and Hughes (2014: 128) also argue that long responses are problematic when one subjects them to quantitative analysis which also forms part of this study. The quantitative analysis method is explained later in this chapter.

According to McBurney (1994: 194), closed-ended questions limit the respondents to alternatives determined in advance by the researcher. Closed ended-questions are easier to code and analyse and there are fewer off-the-wall responses. McBurney (1994: 194) also argues that the alternatives are presented to the respondents so they do not have to think as hard. Respondents, where possible, are offered the opportunity to expand on their answers to a closed-ended question. Furthermore, McBurney (1994: 194) argues that this permits the data to be coded and analysed easily, while giving some insights into the reasons why the respondents chose the alternative they did. To minimize misinterpretation of responses and inadequate or inaccurate response lists, close-ended questions should be carefully pre-tested (O'Sullivan and Rassel and Berner, 2008: 216). They argue that the decision whether to choose an open-ended question over a closed-ended questions depends on the type of information needed, who is supplying the information, the data collection method and the time available for completing the study.

Thirteen questions were posed to six participants in the first group of interviewees using the email questionnaire. Questionnaires were e-mailed to two senior municipal officials each in the health and housing portfolios. One each was sent to a senior official in the safety and security portfolio and the employment equity directorate. The employment equity directorate deals with implementing the metropolitan municipality's gender policy. The officials were given a month and a half (six weeks) to go through the questions and respond. This was done to allow the researcher enough time to capture and analyse the data before final submission of the dissertation. The researcher received permission from the metropolitan municipality to proceed with the research, under certain conditions set for him. The researcher is aware of the biasness of some participants when it comes to answering their questions in an attempt to paint a favourable picture to their cause. The results of the research were scientifically analysed using both the qualitative and quantitative methods as explained in sections 1.6 of Chapter 1 and 4.4 of Chapter 4.

Another thirteen questions were posed to each of the six participants in the second group of interviewees using a mixture of telephone and face to face-interviews. This group was made up of residents of the chosen metropolitan municipality. At the time of writing this dissertation, the last population count in 2011 in the metropolitan municipality showed that it had 3, 740 025 residents (City of Cape Town Census, 2011). The advantages of using this method have already been discussed in section 1.6 of Chapter 1 of this study and in more detail section 3.4 below. Eight randomly selected communities, representing the diverse ethnic groups in this metropolitan municipality, were chosen using the stratified model. According to O'Sullivan, Rassel and Berner (2008: 216), the stratified random sampling method ensures that a sample adequately represents selected groups in a population. Analysts use stratified sampling if a group with a particular interest is a relatively small proportion of the population, or if they plan to compare groups. O'Sullivan, Rassel and Berner (2008: 216) also argue that a stratified random sample divides or classifies the population into strata or groups on the basis of common characteristics, such as sex, race or whatever other common characteristics being investigated. This type of sampling was chosen because it is good for making comparisons.

The third group of interviews were conducted with members of NGO's and civic organisations also using a mixture of telephone and face-to-face interviews. Thirteen questions were posed to each of the six participants representing these organisations. The advantages of using this method have already been discussed in section 1.6 of Chapter 1 of this study and in more detail in section 3.4 below. This metropolitan municipality chosen for this study has many NGO's and civil society organisations operating within its borders. Two of the main NGOs are namely Section 27 and the Treatment Action Campaign, and two of the main civic organisations are the South African National NGO Coalition and the Greater Cape Town Civic Alliance.

3.4 DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUES

As mentioned in section 1.5 of Chapter 1, the study deals with the following research questions:

- What does the existing literature review in Chapter 2 of this dissertation say about GRB in general, and more specifically in this metropolitan municipality in South Africa?
- To what extent are residents of this metropolitan municipality, especially women, aware of their democratic rights to request that their interests be included in the city's budget and how best can existing problems be resolved?
- To what extent do officials and the public understand how to manage their interactions, so that they can address inequalities in spending, brought about by factors such as the past apartheid system in South Africa?
- How is this metropolitan municipality handling inequalities in the specified variables such as housing, health, safety and security and education?

According to O'Sullivan, Rassel and Berner (2008: 203), the data collection strategy is integral to implementing a research plan. How a researcher contacts potential subjects and obtains data from them may determine the success of a project. O'Sullivan, Rassel and Berner (2008: 203) also argue that mail, telephone, internet or face-to-face interviews each has strengths and weaknesses. No one characteristic, with the possible exception of cost, automatically recommends one survey collection method over another. The researcher needs to consider the study and its population and choose the data collection method best suited to meet the study's objectives (O'Sullivan, Rassel and Berner, 2008: 203).

It has been discussed in sections 1.6 of Chapter 1 and 3.3 *supra* that the research method that has been used in this dissertation is both qualitative and quantitative. The research approach follows the method of triangulation, which is the use of several research methods or kinds of data to examine the same phenomenon (Vogt, Gardner and Haeffele, 2012: 354). They state that it is a

good idea to use triangulation when the researcher seeks to capture the detail and depth in his/her research. This means that the more information a researcher can bring to the table, the greater the probability of developing key themes and patterns in his/her research. Furthermore, they state that triangulation allows the researcher to follow-up with participants and to elicit their feedback at almost any stage of the research process, to test their evidence, codes, analysis, findings and implications or conclusions. Data triangulation validates one's data and research by cross verifying the same information. This triangulation of data strengthens one's research because the data has enhanced credibility and validity (Write.com, 2014).

According Holtzhausen (2001: 1), by not relying on a single method, researchers can be more confident of their research results, due to increased reliability and validity. Holtzhausen (2001: 1) argues that by following a multi-method research approach, such as triangulation, a more complete, holistic and contextual portrayal of the units under study can be captured. Triangulation is seen by the researcher not only as a tool, but also a solution in a complex world to provide valid and reliable data, especially in the qualitative research approach. According to Clark and Creswell (2008: 115), triangulation provides researchers with several important opportunities, because it allows researchers to be more confident with their results. It can also stimulate the creation of new ways of capturing a problem, to balance with conventional data collection methods.

According to Mouton (2001: 161), the qualitative approach involves the use of predominantly qualitative research methods to describe and evaluate the performance of programmes in their natural settings, focussing on the process of implementation rather than on quantifiable outcomes. Mouton (2001: 194) argues that researchers using the qualitative method tend to keep field notes as they participate in the fieldwork. The strengths of the qualitative paradigm are that it studies people in terms of their own definitions of the world, gives an insider's perspective, focuses on the subjective experience of individuals and is sensitive to the contexts in which people interact with one another (Mouton, 2001: 194). According to Creswell (2003: 179), qualitative inquiry

employs different knowledge claims, strategies of inquiry and methods of data collection and analysis. Qualitative procedures rely on text and image data. Creswell (2003: 181) argues that qualitative research takes place in a natural setting, for example a home or office. This enables the researcher to be highly involved in the actual experiences of the participants. Researchers using this method look for the involvement of their participants in data collection and seek to build rapport and credibility with the individuals in the study. Creswell (2003: 181) goes on to state that the actual methods of data collection, traditionally based on open-ended interviews, interviews and documents, include a vast array of other sources such as emails, sound and the web.

Regarding the use of the qualitative method, this study is premised on three main sources. The primary research was done by way of various face-to-face and email interviews. The interviews were done with various senior municipal officials and stakeholders that work closely within communities in this metropolitan municipality. The interviewees are made up of residents, NGO's and civic organisations, depending on their preferred method of communication and also considering their availability. The researcher conducted 18 such interviews, apart from the literature review in Chapter 2. The literature review supplements any gaps that may be created as a result of the research. Official documents, such as the Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality Draft Policy of 2014 and political speeches were consulted.

According to Mouton (2001: 108), numeric data are usually well structured and easy to capture, although not as rich in meaning as textual data. Quantitative research methods are favoured for measuring and analyzing data. Mouton (2001: 108) argues that these research methods allow the researcher to summarise vast sources of information and facilitate comparisons across categories as well as over time. Personal bias can be avoided through researchers keeping a distance from participating subjects and employing subjects unknown to them (Kruger, 2003: 18). According to Johnson (2014: 98), quantitative research is defined by its highly structured approach to data collection. Structured data collection means that data will be

collected in exactly the same way every time. This method is preferred, as is the case in this study, when there is a need to report numbers.

Since the budgeting process involves numbers, the researcher used the quantitative research method to analyse and compare what the metropolitan municipality spent on the mentioned priority areas of housing, health, safety and security and education in its 2012/13 budget and the IDP for the same period. A large part of the focus is on the spending on capital budgets to address inequalities. According to Hewu (1999: 187), in 1996, this metropolitan municipality launched a communications programme called the 'people's budget' just before the local government elections. It focused on encouraging communities to participate in the budgetary process, both in identifying their needs and in having the administration account to them for how their money is spent. Residents were given more of a say in identifying big projects which the metropolitan municipality had to prioritise in its IDP. These projects, which included developing infrastructure and the housing programme, were funded by the capital budget. This metropolitan municipality has continued to use this method of allocation in latter years (City of Cape Town Budget 2012/13). It is also a long held belief by organisations such as the UN that community participation and more investment in capital projects at local government level is crucial to addressing inequalities between men, women, boys and girls (Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality Draft Policy, 2014).

In the human sciences, one can gather data either by using existing instrumentation or designing his or her own instrumentation (Mouton, 2001: 100). While existing instruments have certain advantages such as saving in time and costs, they can be complicated because, for example, some scales and questionnaires are copyrighted and may require approval and payment of a fee before they can be used.

Since the researcher is using available data in the form of municipal documents, such as the 2012/13 IDP and political speeches, it is important to reflect on how to handle available data. According to Johnson (2014: 101), if the researcher is lucky, the data they need have already been collected, as a

result, they do secondary analysis. The researcher will need to do a number of checks before deciding to use data gathered by someone else. They will need to verify that the data are actually what they need and consider whether the data are current enough. If not, the data may serve as a comparison point but new data would have to be gathered as well (Johnson, 2014: 101). It is for this reason that the researcher is also relying on the interviews with various senior municipal officials and NGOs to collect fresh data. E-mail questionnaires and telephone interviews were also used in collecting data for this research. The benefits of email questionnaires have already been discussed earlier in sections 1.6 of Chapter 1 and 3.3 above. According to McBurney (1994: 201), the telephone has rapidly increased in popularity as a method of data collection for research purposes because of the low costs associated with this method and a higher response rate. Telephone interviews can also be done without the researcher and the respondents travelling to many locations for face-to-face interviews (McBurney, 1994: 201).

Telephone interviews for all three groups of respondents lasted no longer than 30 minutes at a time. Interviewees were requested via e-mail/telephone by the researcher to take part in the study. E-mail surveys work best with educated respondents, who are used to working with forms (O'Sullivan, Rassel, and Berner, 2008: 204). The respondents, for example, senior municipal officials, will not be intimidated by open-ended questions where they have to express their ideas in their own words. O'Sullivan, Rassel, and Berner (2008: 204) maintain that the survey can be squeezed into the respondent's schedule.

The researcher persuaded the interviewees to take part in the study by explaining the importance of the study and the value that their participation might bring to the study area in general, and the way GRB is viewed and applied in this metropolitan municipality. For the interviewees, the benefits of taking part in research are immense such as contributing to the body of knowledge on the subject as well as improving its content (Arthritis Research, UK, 2014).

For the first group of interviewees, written consent from the city manager in this metropolitan municipality was sought and granted. The e-mail details and telephone numbers of the relevant officials are also available on the relevant website. For the second group, contact numbers were obtained via a face-to-face meeting the researcher had with the relevant officials at a Section 27 conference for NGOs held in Observatory, Cape Town in August 2014. Contact numbers for the relevant NGOs/civic organisations in the third group of interviewees were obtained in the same way as in group two. All interviews were conducted by the researcher in Cape Town.

3.5 SAMPLING METHODS

Scientific sampling is critical in research (O'Sullivan, Rassel and Berner 2008: 133). Sampling allows researchers to draw sample units from a population in order to generalize from the sampled units which they study. They argue that properly drawn samples allow researchers to also generalise the measures of characteristics from a sample to a large population. Scientific sampling is popular in survey research such as in this study. According to Johnson (2014: 160), sampling can either be random or non-random. The choice of whether to use random or non-random sampling depends on the intention of the research and the circumstances. Random samples are used when the population is too large to be included in the study and the researcher needs to draw a general conclusion about that population. The researcher in this study chose this method because it minimizes bias and allows him to make meaningful generalisations about the larger population (Johnson, 2014: 161).

According to McBurney (1994: 202), research differs in value according to how respondents are sampled. The researcher in this study chose the stratified sampling method for all the three groups of interviewees discussed above (see section 3.3 of Chapter 3). The researcher wanted to have control over who he chose as part of the sample. As discussed earlier, stratified random sampling ensures that a sample adequately represents selected groups in a population. Analysts use stratified sampling if a group of particular interest is a relatively small proportion of the population, or if they plan to

compare groups (O'Sullivan, Rassel and Berner, 2008: 216). Stratified sampling works well with this study because categories such as sex, age and race of the sample play a big part in making comparisons for GRB between the various groups making up the metropolitan municipality.

McBurney (1994: 202) also argues that most researchers require at least a 50 percent return rate before they consider a survey representative. He states that the stratified random sampling method works well if a researcher is surveying a population that has identifiable subgroups that are likely to differ markedly in their responses. Obtaining a stratified sample can improve the accuracy of results of a survey.

Stratified random sampling is also useful if, on occasion, the researcher wants certain groups to be included in a study (Beins, 2009: 127). Theoretically, this form of sampling is appropriate for virtually any variable whether by age, gender, education, political affiliation or geographical location (Beins, 2009: 127). According to Beins (2009: 108), relying on a restricted population may save time and money. Accordingly, the application of proportionate stratified random sampling generates more accurate primary data compared to disproportionate sampling. The application of the proportionate stratified random sampling involves determining the sample size in each stratum in a proportionate manner to the entire population. Contrary, in disproportionate stratified random sampling, numbers of subjects recruited from each stratum do not have to be proportionate to the total size of the population (Beins, 2009: 127). This study, therefore, used the disproportionate random sampling method.

Choosing larger groups to make up the sample size of the study would be time consuming and make it difficult to convince all of them to participate in the study. It is often difficult to know just the right number or amount to sample if the research is exploratory and open-ended. According to Delamont (1997: 70), sample size formula for qualitative variable and quantities are different. The researcher needs to decide how much error to allow using the margin of

error method or the confidence level method. However, the more data one collects, often the messier it will be to decode it (Delamont, 1997: 70).

The chosen metropolitan municipality has over 22 000 employees. Two senior departmental employees were sampled in each of the health, housing and safety and security portfolios to give an outlook of GRB happening in this metropolitan municipality. The education portfolio was excluded because the provision of this service lies with the Western Cape Department of Education and not with this metropolitan municipality. There are 3, 740 025 residents living within this metropolitan municipality (South Africa 2011 Census). The residents include men, women, boys and girls. The stratified sampling method will ensure that there is an equal chance that everyone is represented. Six residents were sampled for purposes of this study.

The officials making up groups one and three of the sample are experts in their field and are involved within their communities and the metropolitan municipality either as partners, staff members or stakeholders. The people making up group two are residents who live in the various communities and are assumed to have a first-hand experience of the challenges posed by shortages or lack of housing, education, safety and security and health services.

3.6 DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

Ultimately, all fieldwork culminates in the analysis and interpretation of some set of data be it qualitative or quantitative (Mouton, 2001: 108). Analysis involves breaking up the data into various manageable themes, to establish whether there are any patterns or trends that can be identified or isolated in order to identify emerging themes and/or patterns in the data (Mouton, 2001: 108).

According to Budlender (1998: 1), gender budget analysis is based on an understanding that budgets should follow policy rather than vice versa and in turn, policy should reflect the 'gendered' situation in the society. Budlender

(1998: 1) also argues that the GRB initiative worldwide has accepted the reality that governments do not have infinite resources. Thus, whenever proposing that more resources be allocated to gender-sensitive programmes and policies, a gender budget analysis tries, simultaneously, to point out where savings can be achieved.

In respect of the methodology, the dissertation notes that GRB does not propose a separate budget for men, women, boys and girls. Rather, the exercise examines the 2012/13 budget of the metropolitan municipality in order to determine its differential impact on men, women, boys and girls (Budlender and Sharp 1998: 58). Accordingly these authors also state that expenditure analysis will cover three aspects namely; gender-specific expenditures, expenditures which promote gender equity within the public service, and all other mainstream expenditures.

GRB analysis in the South African context has been informed by mostly the Australian experience in gender budget analysis (Sharp and Broomhill, 1998: 17). In particular, the South African approach to GRB analysis adopted the framework proposed by Rhonda Sharp, an Australian economist, who assisted both federal and state governments in the early years of developing the concept around 1984. Sharp and Broomhill (1998: 17) argue that a gender-aware budget statement is an accountability report by government in relation to its gender equity objectives. Sharp and Broomhill (1998: 17) propose that a gender budget analysis incorporate the three aspects mentioned above. The three categories, as identified by Sharp and Broomhill (1998: 17), are discussed below:

(a) **Gender-specific expenditures** consist of monies allocated for programmes and policies that are specifically targeted at gender lines. In this category, for example, one would look at women's health programmes, domestic counselling for men and special programmes for women with young children.

(b) **Expenditures which promote gender equity within the public service** consist of monies allocated to specific issues, such as affirmative action and other programmes, which promote what, in South Africa, is termed greater "representativity" within the public service. Equity here would mean not only equal numbers of women and men employed, but also equal representation within management and decision-making posts, equal representation across different occupations, and equitable pay and conditions of service. In South Africa, the concern would be with race, as well as gender, equity. The objective of such expenditures is, firstly, justice for the women and men employed and secondly, a service which is more sensitive to the diversity of the population served.

(c) **Mainstream expenditures** consist of the remaining expenditures not covered by the first two categories. These are general budget expenditures, which make goods or services available to the whole community, but which are assessed for their gender impact. For example, who are the users of primary health care and who receives agriculture support services?. According to Budlender and Sharp (1998: 58), evidence suggests that the vast majority, or more than 99-percent of government expenditure, falls into this category. While some governments have targeted programmes for women and men in categories (a) and (b), these are small in relation to the total government budget and are often designed to fulfil a short term need.

According to Budlender (1998: 2), the assessment of each variable should begin with a description of the gender situation in the metropolitan municipality within a particular sector. This mini-dissertation explains the current gender, race and other patterns within the sector, as well as particular relevance of the services concerned with men, women, boys and girls. Policies and legislation that support GRB in South Africa have already been explained. Analysis of the metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget is expected to reveal the extent to which it meets the requirements of the GRB policies.

According to Mouton (2001:108), data interpretation involves the synthesis of one's data into larger coherent wholes. The researcher in this study is aware of some limiting errors at this stage of the research, such as incomplete answers to questions and omissions of critical statistics, and he will seek to avoid or to minimize these at all stages of the research. One of the ways to minimize these errors in a scientific study is through selecting the correct question types for questionnaires and telephonic interviews. The researcher also needs to craft his/her questions carefully. Care should also be taken to categorize and/or group questions in an appropriate manner (Fluid Surveys: 2014). According to Rubin and Rubin (1995: 226), data analysis begins while the interviews are still underway. The researcher in this study has followed the same pattern.

According to the ILO (2012: 14), an assessment of GRB and the impact of the budget on men, women, boys and girls entail using certain tools, such as data and indicators, to identify budget priorities and tracking the impact of policy and budgets on gender equality. The assessment of GRB in this metropolitan municipality involved a numerical description of the representation men, women, boys and girls in services, such as health, water and sanitation, safety and security and housing. Distribution of funds by gender was studied. It also involved the numerical description of how the services are distributed in relation to men, women, boys and girls. If all these gender groups obtain precisely equal shares of resources, a survey of representation and resources gave the same information on the distribution of resources. The assessment of GRB in this metropolitan municipality further involved a discussion and examination of the state of gender equality within each of the identified services above (Norwegian Ministry of Children and Equality, 2007).

3.7 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The limitations of the study are those characteristics of design or methodology that impacted or influenced the interpretation of the findings from the research (USC Libraries, 2014). Some examples of the limitations related to this study's

methodology and research process are described and discussed concisely below.

It was necessary to identify individuals most likely to be familiar with GRB work. The researcher sought to interview individuals whom he identified as being best suited to contribute to GRB in this metropolitan municipality. However, in some instances he settled for specific officials suggested by this metropolitan municipality.

The researcher encountered difficulties in getting some selected individuals to co-operate, particularly with regards to answering the email questions on time. They promised to return to the researcher at a specified time but never did. Other individuals simply declined to be interviewed and passed queries on to others. Statements from interviewees and triangulation across interviews and documents uncovered some problems with the abilities of interviewees to recall events accurately. Even though the evaluation covered a short period, namely the 2012/13 financial year, interviewees were, at times, unable to remember specific events. In analysing the data, the researcher aimed to employ a three-step process: synthesize, triangulate, and compare against stated objectives. In some cases it was possible to complete all three of these steps. However, in other cases, it was challenging to confirm details of specific events or relationships mentioned by an interviewee and/or in a document through another source.

The researcher further encountered some form of red tape from this metropolitan municipality, with regard to using its original name in this study. Given the time constraints of this study and a need for progress, the researcher was left with no choice but to agree to a condition of removing the metropolitan municipality's name in the research. In future it might help for senior officials in the metropolitan municipality to grant researchers the right to use its name, particularly in cases where most of the information and documents being analysed are in the public domain. This metropolitan municipality has been hailed as one of the better performing ones around South Africa, as is evident in many a clean audit that it has received (Auditor

General, 2014). By using this metropolitan municipality's original name, it would give hope and would encourage the same amount of dedication from other municipalities around the country.

This study is limited by time constraints. Collection of data took more than the stipulated time, due to the busy schedule of the respondents. To collect data from some people in the civil service is not always easy, as was evident in this study.

3.8 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

According to Beins (2009: 36), research activity may not be ethically troublesome and the researcher needs to avoid crossing the line into the realm of unethical behaviour. Amongst the most important practical issues the researcher is faced with are those issues associated with informed consent. That means that the researcher needs to make sure that the participants know what they are going to do and understand the nature of the research. Beins (2009: 36) also argues that researchers have to ensure that they provide a debriefing session in which they inform participants of any deception involved in the research and make sure that they eliminate any potential sources of negative feelings by the participants. Researchers have a duty to protect the anonymity and confidentiality of their research participants.

In addition, as part of the requirements of the Masters Programme in Public Administration, the candidate was required to fill in an ethical clearance application with UNISA. The form includes details about how the research will be conducted and declarations about who it will affect. The form facilitates informed consent by communicating with participants in a language that they can understand, for example English, which is one of the main languages of communication in the Western Cape Province of South Africa, where the chosen metropolitan municipality is based. The consent form was adapted to fit the circumstances of the study, particularly because the researcher would be using both the qualitative and quantitative methodologies.

The researcher indicated to participants that their names will be held in confidence. The researcher also assured the participants that the data will be for his use and that of his supervisors and other UNISA academics, evaluating the study. Care was taken to ensure that anonymity is provided to the fullest extent possible in law. The data will be kept confidential for the duration of the study. On completion of the dissertation, it will be retained for a further six months and then destroyed. Results will be presented in the dissertation and will be seen by the supervisor and the relevant examiners. The dissertation may be read by future students on the course.

The researcher would also like to state that there were no costs associated with this research method. He carried out the study himself as part of the partial fulfillment of the Master of Public Administration Programme with the UNISA. Justice and fairness in the research process have been ensured using the ethical clearance.

3.9 SUMMARY

This chapter looked at the research methodology of this study. The aim of the study was to explore the extent of the compliance with the GRB process in one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. It also looked at the research design. This study assessed the metropolitan municipality's gender responsiveness through a focus on health, housing infrastructure, safety and security and education. The research method that has been used in this research is both qualitative and quantitative. The research method follows the method of triangulation. In addition, e-mail questionnaires and telephone interviews were used in collecting data for this research. This chapter provided an explanation of the statistical procedures used to analyse the data. The limitations of the study were also discussed. Ethical considerations have been made, in respect of the involvement of human participants taking part in the research. Chapter 4 will look at the research analysis.

CHAPTER 4

RESEARCH ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

In this chapter, the response rate of the survey, research analysis and findings from the interviews are presented, leading to the conclusions and recommendations in chapter five. The data was collected and processed in response to the problem statement and research questions posed in sections 1.3 and 1.5 of Chapter 1 respectively. Data obtained from the review of this large metropolitan area's budget for the 2012/13 financial year and its IDP, covering the same period, are analysed and presented. The researcher then reflects on the analysis and findings of other documents relevant to this study, such as the relevant gender equality documents and information sourced from political speeches.

4.2 REVIEW OF THE RESEARCH PROCESS

As discussed in section 3.3 of Chapter 3, by the year 2014, there were over fifty (50) countries in the world where there were gender budget initiatives of some kind or another. South Africa is one of these countries. A review of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget will show how much was spent, during this period, on projects that advance the course of men, women, boys and girls. In addition, a review of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP will provide insights into its strategic goals and the detailed action or implementation plan for its projects. The research design in Chapter 3, section 3.2, states that an IDP is an excellent way to test a particular metropolitan municipality's commitment to women empowerment and gender equality, as the local budget aims to provide resources to the IDP.

The research area was selected because of its a good mix of people of colour such as Blacks, Coloureds, Whites, Asian and other groups making up its

population (see sections 1.2 and 1.6 of Chapter 1). The data sources are split into three groups for the purposes of this study (see section 3.3 of Chapter 3). The researcher consulted the metropolitan municipality's draft gender equality policy document, titled "The Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality Draft Policy: 2014". The interviews are based on a mixture of open-ended and closed-ended questions (see section 3.3 of Chapter 3). Permission to carry out the study was sought from and granted by this metropolitan municipality for the researcher to conduct the study. The research method that has been used in this mini-dissertation is both qualitative and quantitative. The research method follows the method of triangulation, which is the use of several research methods or kinds of data to examine the same phenomenon. The researcher also used the stratified random sampling method.

The researcher sent e-mail questionnaires to senior municipal officials working in the health, housing safety and security directorates. GRB in the education directorate is discussed separately in section 4.4.4 of this chapter. The provision of education is not the main function of this metropolitan municipality but that of the WCPG. However, this metropolitan municipality plays a critical role in supporting education as part of its mission statement. Education is critical to this study and to GRB because it is one of the key measures of how well governments and municipalities are doing to address their levels of poverty.

The researcher is aware of the limitations of this study and an entire sub topic on the limitations was devoted in section 3.7 of Chapter 3. Careful consideration was made regarding ethical clearance. As this study involves human participants, the researcher took care to ensure that the participants understood the nature of the study and how it might or might not affect them. It is also a requirement of the Masters Programme in Public Administration at the Department of Public Administration and Management at UNISA that the candidate must obtain ethical clearance. This process was completed and approved by the Ethical Committee in the Department of Public Administration and Management.

This study seeks to answer the following key question:

“To what extent is the metropolitan municipality, where this study is taking place, making provisions for GRB?”.

The review of the literature, pertaining to the South African context of GRB, shows that although the government has shown commitment to gender equality through, for instance, various policies and legislative measures such as the creation of the Ministry on Women, Children and Persons with Disabilities in 2009, gender structures in government still remain weak and under-resourced. The biggest challenge is the implementation of the national government’s programmes, aimed at addressing inequalities between men, women, boys and girls at local government level. The existence of unacceptably high levels of violence against women, as seen through the review of existing literature in section 2.2 of Chapter 2, is still a concern. South Africa is a signatory to important conventions, meant to advance and realise gender equality, particularly involving women. This metropolitan municipality has been slow in finalising its gender equality policy even though gender mainstreaming is taking place. This study explores the extent of compliance with GRB in one of South Africa’s largest urban municipalities. It deals with the following research questions, which could lead to possible solutions to the problem statement in section 1.3 of Chapter 1:

- What does the existing literature review in Chapter 2 of this dissertation say about GRB in general, and more specifically in this metropolitan municipality in South Africa?
- To what extent are residents of the metropolitan municipality, especially women, aware of their democratic rights to request that their interests be included in the city’s budget and how best can existing problems be resolved?
- To what extent do officials and the public understand how to manage their interactions so that they can address inequalities in spending, brought about by factors, such as the past apartheid system in South Africa?

- How is this metropolitan municipality handling inequalities in the specified variables such as housing, health, safety and security and education?

The response rate of the survey is discussed in section 4.3 below.

4.3 RESPONSE RATE OF THE SURVEY

The researcher conducted a total of eighteen interviews from the three groups of respondents, namely municipal officials, residents and non-governmental organisations/civic organisations. Group one of the interviews covered the response rate of municipal officials from the housing, health and safety and security directorates from this large metropolitan area. These directorates were chosen because the services they provide are some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of marginalised groups and, as such, are good quality of life indicators. The researcher sent an e-mail questionnaire to this metropolitan municipality's employment equity directorate. The same questionnaire was e-mailed to senior municipal officials in each of the health, housing and safety and security directorates. As part of an agreement to carry out research in this metropolitan municipality, it was agreed between the municipal manager and the researcher that the employment equity directorate would facilitate communication between the researcher and senior officials in the health, housing and safety and security directorates. A total of six respondents made up this group of respondents, as depicted in Table 4.1 below.

Table 4.1 Group one sample composition

Directorate	Participants	Yes/No response
Employment Equity	1	Yes
Health	2	Yes
Housing	2	Yes
Safety and Security	1	Yes
Total	6	4

Source: Data from the field study

The respondents in group one of the e-mail interviews were given a month and a half (six weeks) to go through the questions and respond. This was done to give the researcher enough time to capture and analyse the data before final submission of the dissertation. All six of the senior officials in the sampled directorates responded to the e-mail questions on time. The response rate in group one represents a 100% response rate. The Division of Instructional Innovation and Assessment at the University of Texas (2008: 1) argues that a response rate of between 30% and 40% is average for electronically completed questions. This view is shared by Gillham (2000: 48) who argues that, if the response rate is less than 30%, the value and validity of the method and results are in question. It is, therefore, reasonable to conclude that a satisfactory response rate for e-mail questions should be at least 30%. In this study, this target was met with an overall 100% response rate. However, the senior municipal officials did not answer all the thirteen questions posed to them as is demonstrated in section 4.4.2 below. The analysis of how each one of them responded and the findings based on their specific responses will be discussed in section 4.4.2 below. The response of the employment equity directorate in this metropolitan municipality is critical in this study, because of the role played by the directorate in the implementation of important legislation such as the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998 and the Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act 4 of 2000.

Group two of the interviews covered the response rate of the six residents of this metropolitan municipality that were sampled. Group three covered the response rate of NGOs/civic organisations. Both groups were asked a total of thirteen questions each relating to their experiences with GRB. Both groups were given a month and a half (six weeks) to respond, for the same reasons stated in the paragraph above. The researcher used a mixture of face-to-face and telephone interviews. Eight randomly selected communities, representing the diverse ethnic groups in this metropolitan municipality, were chosen. The stratified random sampling model was used for group two of the interviews. Six residents were chosen randomly from each of the Black, Coloured, White, Asian and other groups making up this metropolitan municipality's population.

Group three interviews with the NGOs/civic organisations, were also done using face-to-face interviews. Six interviews were conducted with this group.

The researcher received an overall 100% response from those sampled in both group two and three of the interviews. However, like in the interviews for group one above, not all the questions presented to respondents in group two and three were answered. An explanation for and a discussion of this, will follow in section 4.4.2 of this chapter. The face-to-face questions were posed to respondents at a conference on gender issues in Cape Town organized by the NGO Section 27 in August 2014. The response to the telephone interviews was good. The analysis and findings on each of the questions posed to group two and three respondents will be discussed in section 4.4.2 of this chapter.

4.4 DATA ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

It has already been argued in section 3.6 of Chapter 3 that gender budget analysis is based on an understanding that budgets should follow policy rather than vice versa and in turn, policy should reflect the 'gendered' situation in the society (Budlender, 1998:1). Further, it was argued that the GRB initiative worldwide has accepted the reality that governments do not have infinite resources. The budget is, therefore, one of the most important policy tools of government because, without the money, the government cannot implement any of its policies successfully (Parveen, 2010: 34). GRB seeks to ensure that the health, housing, safety and security and education needs and interests of men, women, boys and girls are addressed in government budgets. In this way, GRB plans to redress inequalities and to promote the economic, social and political rights of all groups within a society or community (Gender Responsive Budgeting, 2014).

In the research analysis, the researcher started by presenting and then discussing the raw data that he found in each of the variables under study, such as health, housing and safety and security and education. In this analysis, the researcher was guided by the methodology. As a reminder to the

reader, the research method that has been used in this dissertation is mixed as it is both qualitative and quantitative. The research method follows the method of triangulation.

Below is a breakdown of the researcher's analysis and findings on GRB in the study, with a focus on health, housing, and safety and security in this metropolitan municipality. The analysis on education, for reasons stated in section 4.2 above, is derived from the literature review of this study.

4.4.1 GRB in the study area

This metropolitan municipality is in the process of adopting a formal gender-mainstreaming approach as will be illustrated later in this section. This process is driven by the Employment Equity Directorate. During the interview process, a senior official in the gender and diversity department, which falls under the Employment Equity Directorate, provided information which shows what is being done internally in this metropolitan municipality to educate, raise awareness and monitor the implementation of its Employment Equity Plan. The metropolitan municipality's plan is underpinned by the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998, which aims to achieve equity in the workplace for persons from designated groups and to ensure that these people are equitably represented in all occupational categories and levels in the workforce (Corporate Services Department, 2015). However, the official did not answer all the e-mail questions posed to her on GRB. The questions were based on a mixture of open-ended and closed-ended questions. The questions the official failed to answer are listed below.

- In your opinion, is GRB successful in this metropolitan municipality?
- Has the programme strengthened the role of marginalized groups in the budget process?
- What role do stakeholders play in the implementation of GRB?
- What is the relevance of the GRB programme within the broader budgeting process?
- Are you satisfied with the level of community participation in the budget process?

- Are the metropolitan municipality's officials adequately trained in GRB?

In her response, the official said her department's focus was only on internal matters pertaining to employment equity and not GRB. In the literature review in section 2.2 of Chapter 2, this study has found that to initiate the GRB process, this metropolitan municipality uses Western Cape demographics in its recruitment and selection processes. The senior gender and diversity official interviewed is of the view that to achieve equality, particularly between men and women, this metropolitan municipality must start with an internal focus of who it appoints to fill particular senior positions in the various departments and directorates. It is hoped that through appointing more women in senior positions, for instance, they will be able to conscientise others below them about uplifting women's rights in their communities. From the standpoint contained in the official's response, it becomes evident that the GRB process in this metropolitan municipality is still not well co-ordinated. It is also unclear who is spearheading the GRB process.

When asked about the challenges faced by the gender and diversity department, in achieving its equity targets, the official responded by saying that finding the right people, both men and women, to balance key positions in terms of the sexes, was still a challenge. She said the Human Resource Department is responsible for the recruitment and appointment of staff. Training needs and priorities are identified by each directorate and the training budget is allocated accordingly. Directorates such as housing, health, safety and security are encouraged, through their internal processes, to fast track the training and development of women. Table 4.2 below illustrates this metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile as at June 2013.

Table 4.2 The metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile 2012/13 (As at June 2013)

Occupational Levels	Male				Female				Foreign Nationals		Total
	B	C	I	W	B	C	I	W	Male	Female	
Top management	1	3		5	2			2			13
Senior management	6	17		26	4	5		4			62
Qualified/Experienced specialists/middle management	129	521	23	676	76	202	9	214	18	8	1876
Skilled technical and academically qualified workers, junior management, supervisors, foremen and superintendents	692	2669	25	886	737	1277	14	493	36	11	6840
Semi-skilled and discretionary decision-making	1356	3643	14	321	1032	1971	18	364	6	9	8734
Unskilled and defined decision-making	2057	3662	3	40	559	799	3	3	15		7141
Total permanent	4241	10515	65	1954	2410	4254	44	1080	75	28	24666
Temporary employees	202	328	2	35	245	205	2	29	5	3	1056
Grand Total	4443	10843	67	1989	2655	4459	46	1109	80	31	25722

B=Black, C=Coloured, I=Indian, W=White

Source: City of Cape Town Council Overview: 2012/13.

Regarding the question of who is responsible for implementing GRB in this metropolitan municipality, the senior official in the gender and diversity department said that directorates are responsible for planning, budgeting and implementing programmes that fall within their functional mandate. The official further responded that the Employment Equity Directorate was not aware of a corporate training initiative on GRB in this metropolitan municipality. In the contextualisation of GRB in section 2.2 of Chapter 2, the Economic Commission of Africa (2001: 31) argued that one of the major problems regarding the implementation of the GRB, is the incapacity of those expected to incorporate gender into their budget submissions. The commission says if officials have little or no background in gender studies and practices and development, the implementation of GRB will be affected negatively.

The senior official in the gender and diversity department has acknowledged that a number of officials are being trained in gender mainstreaming, and this includes the GRB component. The enquiry regarding whether city officials

were adequately trained on GRB did not fully state what exactly those GRB components are.

On being asked when this metropolitan municipality would finalise the gender equality process, the senior official in the gender and diversity department stated that the process was still ongoing, and progress on the achievement of numerical gender targets was assessed by the Employment Equity Department on a quarterly basis. The WCPG, in which this metropolitan municipality is located, started its own internal GRB initiative in 2000. In section 1.2 of Chapter 1, it is explained that when the process started it involved the training of government officials on the importance of gender budgeting (City of Cape Town Budget, 2012/13). The first ever city-wide policy on women empowerment and gender equality in this metropolitan municipality started to take shape in August 2004. It was the brainchild of one of the first women in South Africa to head a large metropolitan council, the then Executive Mayor, Nomaindia Mfeketo (City Aims for Gender Equality, 2004). Many years later, the draft policy process is still at the public participation stage (Draft Women and Empowerment and Gender Equality Policy, 2014). Perhaps the finalization of the process has been affected by a change-over of the metropolitan municipality's administration from the ANC to the Democratic Alliance (DA) in 2009. The ANC was unseated in the local government election of 22 April 2009.

Without a clear policy on women's empowerment and gender equality, this metropolitan municipality is faced with a number of challenges, such as the lack of trained budget officers in gender-mainstreaming, GRB and planning and a policy to guide the implementation of GRB (Draft Women and Empowerment and Gender Equality Policy, 2014). It is unclear when this process of drawing up a gender policy will be completed.

At the time of its inception, the women's empowerment and gender initiative focused on setting targets for the number of tenders awarded to women-owned and managed contractors in this metropolitan municipality and the inclusion of women in crucial decision-making and service delivery structures

(City Aims for Gender Equality, 2004:1). The initiative also proposed a housing policy, which included the needs of women fleeing their homes as a result of domestic abuse. As part of the GRB initiative, this metropolitan municipality recognises that service delivery cannot happen in a gender-neutral manner. For example, street lighting is not just the illumination of a street. For women and children it represents possible safety from violence, rape and abuse.

This metropolitan municipality was, at the time of writing this dissertation, also implementing a diversity management and city-men-for-change programme. The aim of the programme is to develop diversity management skills for officials in various departments, to enable them to implement employment equity efficiently and fairly (Employment Equity Directorate, 2015). The programme is aligned to the IDP pillar of an inclusive city (Diversity Management, 2014: 1). An inclusive city is one where everyone has a stake in the future and enjoys a sense of belonging (City of Cape Town Budget, 2012/13: 19). As discussed earlier, the IDP is a crucial document for planning for the allocation of resources within this metropolitan municipality's five-year spending cycle and GRB is highlighted in this document as one key deliverable. The programme, it is hoped, will teach employees, in this metropolitan municipality, to tolerate people of different groups and backgrounds, so that their needs may form part of the crucial budgeting process. The city-men-for-change project is designed to help men to change their attitudes and behaviour about gender stereotypes. It is a sub-project of the gender equality programme (Diversity Management, 2014: 1).

The senior official in the gender and diversity department was also asked what this metropolitan municipality was doing, in the absence of a final gender equality programme, to address the unacceptable levels of gender inequality. Her response was that internally this metropolitan municipality was making progress by adopting the following:

- appointing more females staff at senior management level;
- appointing female staff in historically male dominated career streams;
- hosting ongoing gender sensitivity education and awareness sessions;

- identifying and eliminating barriers that prevent the advancement of women; and
- hosting annual awards ceremonies to recognise departmental achievements aligned to this metropolitan municipality's women strategy.

A review of the literature in section 2.2 of Chapter 2 has revealed that at, an institutional level, this metropolitan municipality has also shown a commitment to GRB, by appointing officials who operate across departments and who form part of its Gender Task Team. Members of this team submit reports on internal processes, they also support service managers to mainstream gender issues (Draft Policy on Women's Empowerment, 2014).

It is a long considered view, in South Africa and beyond, that the rights of women and their interests have, for the most part, fallen behind those of men (Gender Responsive Budgeting, 2006: 11). In section 2.2 of Chapter 2 of this study, it has been stated that the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing in 1995 was one of the most important milestones towards the advancement of women's issues around the world. It propelled many governments to affirm their commitment to gender equality and to use their budgets to translate their gender equality commitments into fiscal commitments (Stotsky, 2007: 12).

This study has also found that there are challenges in the internal environment of this metropolitan municipality, despite a well-meaning Employment Equity Programme. These have been discussed in the paragraphs above.

The review of literature reveals that to further deal with inequality, this metropolitan municipality devised a Social Development Strategy in 2012. The aim of the strategy was to provide a comprehensive local framework that clearly states the nature, scope, extent and level of social services. The strategy also formed the basis for the development of appropriate norms and standards of service delivery, to uplift all its communities (Social Development Strategy, 2011: 5). This strategy sought to strengthen and develop social

cohesion and inclusion, integrate social infrastructure, assist vulnerable groups and create social safety nets as well as develop sustainable communities. The strategy document acknowledges, similar to the GRB experience, that its success would largely depend on how well partnerships and collaborative efforts were cemented amongst this metropolitan municipality, its stakeholders, NGOs, community based organisations and other spheres of government. The key social challenges identified under the social development strategy would inform the budgeting process and this metropolitan municipality's IDP.

4.4.1.1 Metropolitan municipality 2012/13 budget overview

In the 2012/13 financial period this metropolitan municipality's budget stood at R30 289-million (City of Cape Town Budget, 2012/13: 2). 80,4% or R24 3621-million of the budget represented the operating budget, which was for the day-to-day running of this metropolitan municipality, and 19,6% or R5 927-million represented the capital budget, which went towards municipal assets. From this budget analysis it is clear that the operating budget is significantly higher than the capital budget. A breakdown of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget is illustrated in Table 4.3 below.

Table 4.3 The 2012/13 budget numbers at a glance

Expenditure type	Amount in rands (thousands)	Percentage
Operating expenditure	24 362-million	80,4
Capital Expenditure	5 927-million	19,6
Total	30 289-million	100

Source: City of Cape Town Budget, 2012/13

Employee costs, such as salaries, remain the most prominent cost driver in the 2012/13 financial year operating budget, comprising more than 30% of the total operating budgetary allocation. The reason for the high operating expenditure is due to increases in several municipal expenditure components. The components include the remuneration of employees and councillors, debt impairment, asset impairment, finance charges, bulk purchases, contracted services, transfers and grants and other expenditures. The breakdown of the

amount of money allocated to these expenditures is illustrated in Table 4.4 below.

Table 4.4 Breakdown of the 2012/13 municipal operating budget

Category	Amount in rands (thousands)	Percentage
Employee remuneration	7 777 521	31,92
Councillor remuneration	122 384	0,50
Debt impairment	991 026	4,06
Asset impairment	1 444 096	5,92
Finance charges	768 508	3,15
Bulk purchases	6 441 273	26,43
Contracted services	2 579 846	10,58
Transfers and grants	50 606	0,20
Other expenditures	4 187 164	17,18
Total	24 362 425	100

Source: City of Cape Town Budget, 2012/13

Staff costs in health, housing and safety and security rose year-on-year from 2011/12 to 2012/13 by 9,72%, 14,70% and 8,63%. The growth was not significant when compared with staff costs for other services offered by this metropolitan municipality. This could possibly mean that this metropolitan municipality is prioritising the appointment of staff in other departments and directorates instead of the critical areas of health, housing and safety and security. Table 4.5 below shows the year-on-year spending of this metropolitan municipality on staff costs in the various departments and directorates. The amounts in brackets in the table indicate a decrease in spending.

Table 4.5 Year-on- year spending and growth in staff costs from the 2011/12 to 2012/13 financial year in this metropolitan municipality

R Thousand	2011/12 Budget	2012/13 Budget	Percentage increase year-on-year
Community services	721 866	784 183	8,63
Corporate services	844 467	904 547	7,11
Economic and social development	315 617	330 566	4,74
Finance	516 444	550 059	6,51
Health	455 899	500 201	9,72
Human settlements	243 880	279 738	14,70
Deputy city manager	215 891	278 668	29,08
Office of the city manager	16 071	15 091	(6,10)
Rates and other	30 546	-	-
Safety and security	1 033 803	1 163 246	12,52
Social Development	26 131	32 346	23,79
Transport, stormwater, roads	429 559	499 560	16,30
Events, Tourism, Marketing	60 217	66 697	10,76
Utility services	2 181 258	2 372 617	8,77
Total staff costs	7 091 648	7 777 521	9,67

Source: City of Cape Town Budget 2012/13

In its executive summary of the 2012/13 budget, this metropolitan municipality states that its budget is far more than an analysis of anticipated financial income and expenditure for the financial year. Rather, it represents the means by which the metropolitan municipality will realise its vision for its people. This means that while the budget is the primary method by which this metropolitan municipality allocates its available and future financial resources to ensure that they give effect to its IDP, it has the more important role of helping residents to realise the types of futures they desire. The literature review in section 2.2 of Chapter 2 clearly spells out that one of the goals of GRB is to encourage budgets which include the needs of everyone, including men,

women, boys and girls. The IDP is a critical document in planning for the needs of men, women, boys and girls. Based on this evidence, the researcher can conclude that there is an alignment between the metropolitan municipality's intent to adhere to GRB and the literature review in Chapter 2.

4.4.1.1.1 Revenue

Capital spending for health in the 2012/13 budget was R27,4-million. Over R600-million was budgeted to improve human settlements and other housing projects, and an amount of over R1-billion was set aside for public safety. The spending on public safety represented 6% of the operating budget (Jooste, 2012: 25). The housing backlog in this metropolitan municipality is estimated at over 500 000 (City of Cape Town Budget 2012/13). It would appear from this capital spending that such a high allocation of the budget for housing was in line with the metropolitan municipality's GRB needs.

Revenue collection is a critical means for municipalities to finance their operations and major projects. Unlimited resources would mean that this metropolitan municipality could be in a position to meet the needs of its residents, requiring housing, health, safety and security and also meet its GRB obligations, adequately. In the 2012/13 financial period, the operating revenue of this metropolitan municipality increased from R21 981-million the previous year to R23 902-million in the period under review. This represents an 8,74 % increase and it is mainly due to:

- An increase on 'transfers recognised – operating' in respect of a national equitable share from R970 million in 2011/12 to R1 084 million in 2012/13, and public transport infrastructure and systems grant allocations, from R340 million in 2011/12 to R506 million in 2012/13.
- Projected organic growth and tariff increases on property rates and service charges (water, electricity and refuse).
- The reduction in service charges.

The 2012/13 revenue categories of this metropolitan municipality are illustrated in Table 4.6 below.

Table 4.6 2012/13 revenue categories of this metropolitan municipality

Category	Amount in rands (thousands)	Percentage
Property rates tax	5 030 753	21,04
Rates penalties	93 546	0,39
Electricity charges	8 971 405	37,53
Water charges	2 106 357	8,81
Sanitation charges	1 127 122	4,71
Refuse charges	896 924	3,75
Charges other	237 231	0,99
Rental facilities	278 754	11,63
Interest: external investments	244 439	1,02
Interest: outstanding debtors	236 797	0,99
Fines	160 917	0,67
Licenses and permits	33 121	0,13
Agency services	115 993	0,48
Transfers recognized	2 325 525	9,72
Other revenue	1 973 772	8,25
Gains of disposal of PPE	69 000	0,28
Total	23 901 656	100

Source: City of Cape Town Budget 2012/13.

4.4.1.1.2 Spending on utility services in this metropolitan municipality

In his analysis of the 2012/13 budget for this metropolitan municipality, Jooste (2012: 27) argued that when one looks at operating expenditure by vote, it is clear that more than half of the budget is being spent on utilities by the Utility Services Directorate. Critical municipal services, such as safety and security, human settlements and social and early childhood development, are competing with spending for utility services. In South Africa, government budgets often consider three years - the current budgets, and projections for the two following years for planning purposes (Jooste, 2012: 2). His illustration of the Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework to show the rise in spending for utility services is shown in Table 4.7 below. The focus period of this study is highlighted in the table.

Table 4.7 Operating expenditure for 2012/13 by vote

Budget period	Percentage of amount spent year-on-year by utility services directorate
2008/09	48,6
2009/10	48,3
2010/11	51,6
2011/12	51,5
2012/13	50,9
2013/14	53,6
2014/15	56,3

Source: Jooste 2012

In the 2012/13 financial year, which is the focus period of this study, the utility services directorate spent 50,9%. Jooste argues that the amount spent by the Utility Services Directorate has been increasing materially year-on-year. With this increase, Jooste suggests that these increases are possibly meant to address gender imbalances between men, women, boys and girls as opposed to year-on-year increases in the prices of goods and services. He argues that this conclusion can be drawn based on the fact that this metropolitan municipality's residents are invited, every financial year, to make submissions on how they want to see authorities spend its money. The success of the public participation process in this metropolitan municipality is discussed in detail later in Table 4.16.

4.4.1.1.3 The capital budget

The capital budget in the 2012/13 financial year stood at R5 927-million. There was an overall year-on-year growth of 16,4% from the R5 090-million spent in the previous financial year. This growth was, in part, due to increased allocations made by the national and the provincial spheres of government for the human settlements, utility services and the transport, roads and stormwater votes. Table 4.8 below illustrates the year-on-year increases in the capital budget allocations, from 2011/12 to 2012/13. It is important to note again that in South Africa, budget projections often reflect spending in the previous financial year and the current financial year, to enable municipal

officials to identify where and how money is being allocated, to possibly prevent wastage.

Table 4.8 Year-on-year increase from the 2011/12 budget to the 2012/13 capital funding sources

Amount in rands (thousands)	2011/12 Budget	2012/13 Budget	Increase/ (Decrease)
Capital grants and donations	2 715 359	3 334 829	619 470
Capital replacement reserve	970 872	808 169	(162 703)
External financing fund	1 357 386	1 765 377	407 991
Revenue	46 250	18 236	(28 014)
Total	5 089 867	5 926 611	836 744

Source: City of Cape Town Budget 2012/13.

Improving this metropolitan municipality's human settlement was one of the major capital expenditure projects for the 2012/13 financial year as illustrated in Table 4.9 below. Housing is one of the variables that this study is focusing on. Furthermore, as discussed in section 1.2 of Chapter 1 of this study, housing is one of the good quality of life indicators.

Table 4.9 Major capital projects for 2012/13

Major capital projects	Amount in rands
Utility services	2 241 million
Transport, roads and stormwater	2 336 million
Human settlements	604 million

Source: City of Cape Town Budget 2012/13.

Out of the total budget of R604-million for human settlements in its 2012/13 budget, this metropolitan municipality planned to upgrade rental units and hostels for poor communities to the amount of R281-million. A further R28-million was allocated for land acquisition for future housing; R35-million was allocated for the construction of outer cavity walls for some housing flats; R11,5-million was set aside to build a new housing project called the Pelican Park Phase 1 Housing Project; R25,3-million was allocated to the building of the Scottsdene Housing Project, and finally R17,2-million was allocated to the

Hangberg Housing Project. The areas earmarked for new housing projects are some of the most disadvantaged in this metropolitan municipality in terms of lack of housing and municipal services such as electricity and water supply. Other plans for housing in the 2012/13 financial year included the upgrade of rental units and hostels as well as land acquisition for future housing (Jooste, 2012: 6).

The budget increases in the 2012/13 financial year, as they affect health, housing, safety and security, which are the focus of GRB in this mini-dissertation, will be discussed in detail in section 4.4.2 below.

4.4.1.2 Analysis of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP

It has already been stated, in previous chapters, that the IDP is a crucial five-year plan that provides insights into the strategic goals and detailed action or implementation plan for municipalities. This IDP document serves a further purpose of testing and checking a particular metropolitan municipality's commitment to women empowerment and gender equality, given that the local budget aims to provide resources for the implementation of the IDP.

The 2012/13 IDP identifies five key pillars of this metropolitan municipality's IDP. According to Jooste (2012: 9), they are:

- *The opportunity city*. The core focus of the opportunity city is the creation of an economically enabling environment, in which investments can grow and jobs created.
- *The safe city*. Safety is a broader issue that goes beyond policing. Over the next five years this metropolitan municipality will continue to dedicate resources and programmes to ensure the maximum effectiveness of the various components of safety provision.
- *The caring city*. In order to be a world class city, this metropolitan municipality must be welcoming and make residents feel at home. They should always feel that their government is doing everything it can to provide for them so that they can truly access opportunities. The needs of all groups will be catered for, all residents will be provided with amenities they need,

such as parks, libraries and sports and recreational facilities, The metropolitan municipality will continue to create integrated human settlements, build houses, extend services to backyarder communities, provide primary health care and review the provision of services to informal settlements.

- *The inclusive city.* An inclusive society is one where everyone belongs and has a stake in the future. The various areas of this metropolitan municipality need to be connected to one another and people living in this metropolitan municipality should be able to move freely. Free movement is possible through an integrated transport programme. People in the city cannot be economically excluded and the city will allocate resources to address the backlog of community facilities in under-developed areas.

- *The well-run city.* Citizens need to know that their government works for them, is accountable to them and answers to them at all times. Governments manage public resources and, as such, must be scrutinised in public to ensure responsible management. In all programmes, the strict monitoring will be rigorously adhered to in order to ensure that the needs of constant service delivery are being met.

This metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP prioritised health problems, such as tuberculosis and HIV, as they affect men, women, boys and girls. The IDP states that clinic health services are the responsibility of the Western Cape Health Department, as stated in the National Health Act 61 of 2003. However, the Constitution of 1996 makes provision for these services to be assigned to local government via mutual agreement. This metropolitan municipality, therefore, continues to render health services under a service-level agreement with the Western Cape Health Department. A review of this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP shows that services at health centres include women and child health services as well as preventative, promotional and curative services such as family planning, immunisation and treating sick children under 13-years of age. Men, women, boys, girls and other groups are still also benefiting from programmes to test and treat HIV/Aids and other sexually transmitted diseases, tuberculosis and substance abuse. Condom distribution in communities is also taking place.

On the issue of housing, this metropolitan municipality did not have a housing policy by late 1997. The lack of a policy resulted in poor management of the housing stock and poor recording of new housing delivery (Hewu, 1999: 206). In 2015, the housing backlog has increased substantially. The housing backlog is estimated to be at 500 000 (Housing in South Africa, 2015: 1). Rapid urbanisation experienced since South Africa's first democratic election in 1994 resulted in this metropolitan municipality's population almost doubling to 3,7 million. Rapid urbanization has also been blamed for the increasing housing backlog (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 309). According to Hewu (1999: 182), migrant labour still poses a challenge for this metropolitan municipality's GRB initiative. Hewu argues that migrant labour has led to new settlements sprouting everywhere. In its 2012/13 IDP review, this metropolitan municipality stated that it remained committed to ensuring the implementation of an effective housing programme, based on the five pillars of its 'future' discussed above.

In its 2012/13 IDP, this metropolitan municipality remained committed to creating new human settlements rather than merely providing low-cost housing. People registered on the housing database would be managed in terms of a housing policy which, according to the 2012/13 IDP review, is fair and transparent. The review shows that the number of people seeking homes in the R150 000 – R350 000 price range has been growing steadily since South Africa's first democratic elections in 1994. This metropolitan municipality recognised that people in this income bracket were a priority, in terms of supplying houses, so that it could sustain its residential housing market.

The upgrading of informal settlements and the extension of municipal services to backyarder communities was also identified as a key investment area for this metropolitan municipality in its 2012/13 IDP. This metropolitan municipality is seeking to improve sanitation services in these areas as part of its ten-year housing plan and address other service backlogs. In her State of the Province address on the 20th of June 2014, the then Premier of the WCP, the Honourable Premier Helen Zille, emphasized that housing provision still

remained the biggest challenge for her government. She acknowledged that municipalities within the province needed the support of the provincial government to deal with these challenges.

Regarding safety and security, police crime statistics for this metropolitan municipality for the 2012/13 financial year show that there was an increase in the murder rate of 12.8% from 2 580 in 2012/13 to 2 909 in 2013/14. The murder rate increased from 43.7 per 100 000 people in 2012/13 to 48.3 per 100 000 people in 2013/2014 (Western Cape Crime Overview, 2013/14). According to the National Victim Survey (2012), women in particular did not feel safe walking alone in their own areas during both the day and night. Only 30.3% felt safe in their own areas during the day, and just over a quarter (26.2%) felt safe in their areas at night.

The fear of crime in the WCP, where this metropolitan municipality is located, has also extended to drug abuse (Western Cape Crime Overview, 2012/13: 1). In the 2013/14 financial year, the province maintained its number one position, recording 33% (85,463) of the national drug-related crime. The fear of crime in this province is not new. According to Spinks (2001: 23), in 1990, a new form of 'urban terror' engulfed South Africa, and this metropolitan municipality in particular, in the form of gangsterism and vigilantism.

Not much has changed in South Africa since the 1990s. In 2012/13, for instance, many people were still afraid of crime, particularly at night, in mostly black and coloured areas (Western Cape Crime Overview, 2012/13). Further, black people explained their fear of crime to factors such as African immigrants. Whites and other groups explained their fear as a euphemism for fear of blacks. All groups in this metropolitan municipality are depending on its officials to protect them. The past history of segregation brought about by the apartheid system, Spinks (2001: 23) argues, resulted in the failure of blacks, whites and coloureds to trust one another.

In 2014, a few years after the study period, this metropolitan municipality acknowledged that levels of violence against women and children within its

boundaries were still high. A dedicated vice squad was budgeted for to specifically focus on combating crimes such as human trafficking and prostitution (City Wide Gender Forum, 2014: 1). Education programmes known as 'Good Touch, Bad Touch' were introduced at schools, and school resource officers were assigned to certain schools on a permanent basis. They were trained to assist and provide general guidance to teachers, learners and their parents. Furthermore, this metropolitan municipality adopted a zero tolerance approach to sexual harassment in the work place by enforcing and abiding by the Code of Good Practice in the handling of Sexual Harassment Case: Notice 1367 of 1998 (City Wide Gender Forum, 2014: 1).

The City Wide Gender Forum argues that political leaders in this metropolitan municipality have, since 2014, committed themselves to increasing the participation of men, women, boys and girls in decision-making processes, to promote their empowerment. Community participation, as discussed in previous chapters, is critical in ensuring that the budget process is GRB compliant. Metro police officers, a few years after the study period (2014), were still receiving training in the implementation of the Domestic Violence Act 116 of 1998. This Act provides victims of abuse with specialised recourse mechanisms, such as the accessing of interdicts.

In its 2012/13 IDP, this metropolitan municipality identified various core objectives and programmes for this period and beyond. According to Jooste (2001: 112), the safety and security directorate planned to expand its staff and capital resources in the policing departments and emergency services to ensure improved services to all communities. The introduction of what is called a school resource officer programme, which is meant to provide guidance on the sexual abuse of children, is already being implemented in impoverished communities, including efforts to expand their neighbourhood watch assistance programmes. As part of meeting its GRB objectives, this metropolitan municipality also seeks to strengthen the capacity of its communities to respond to emergency situations. Metro police officers, as discussed above, are being trained to implement the Domestic Violence Act 116 of 1998.

The 2012/13 IDP also identified plans to increase its efficiency, through information and technology driven policing. For example, the directorate started running a successful messaging system with the media during this time, where officials and journalists shared information about crime and fires which engulfed the Cape. It would seem that the response rate from the officials has been prompt. In 2012/13, further efforts have been made to replace and/ or get additional radios and equipment used in crime fighting and fire-fighting, the installation of CCTV cameras on major highways, including the central business district. The replacement and sourcing of additional crime fighting vehicles and fire-fighting equipment are on the cards moving forward (Jooste, 2012: 112).

The then Premier of the WCP, the Honourable Helen Zille, also emphasized the provincial government's commitment to crime prevention in her June 2014 State of the Province address mentioned above. Her government pledged to end crime through the deployment of the 2014 Urban Upgrade Programme to increase living standards in the various townships in the province. The gesture was in recognition of the partnerships that are needed between local authorities and provincial leaders to ensure increased safety and security for their communities. The provincial safety department had complained that crimes, such as gangsterism and drug related incidents, had been on the rise since the police's gang and drug unit had been disbanded in 2003. In recognition of the serious challenge confronting the province and in line with its overall oversight role, the office of the Premier established a Western Cape Police Ombudsman to investigate police corruption and abuse of power (The Western Cape Story, 2009-2014: 16).

Calls had been made by stakeholders in this metropolitan municipality, such as various community leaders and NGOs, to President Jacob Zuma, asking him to act urgently, by deploying the defence force in this metropolitan municipality to help fight gang violence in its various communities. The calls were not heeded. Honourable Zille further added that the police force in this metropolitan municipality was understaffed and under resourced. The challenges of the policing issue were evident/ documented in a Commission

of Inquiry Report into policing in one of its biggest townships in 2012. The report spoke of a breakdown in relationships between the police and the community, and the fact that the community did not trust the men and women, who were entrusted with protecting them. The independent Commission of Inquiry had been established by the Premier of the Western Cape through a Proclamation, on the 24th of August 2012, to investigate allegations of police inefficiency.

Communities in this metropolitan municipality did not sit idle. Various programmes have been implemented to address safety and security concerns of residents. There are five Thuthuzela Centres in the Western Cape, where victims of sexual violence receive medical and emotional support to prepare them for the court processes (Thuthuzela Care Centres Cape Town, 2014: 2). These one-stop centres have been introduced as a critical part of South Africa's anti-rape strategy, aimed at reducing secondary trauma for the victims, improving conviction rates and reducing the time to finalise cases. Two dedicated sexual offences courts were established in 2010 when the programme was implemented. The Thuthuzela project is led by the National Prosecution Authority's Sexual Offences and Community Affairs Unit. The unit has been working to develop the best practices and policies to eradicate victimisation of women and children in areas of sexual offences, maintenance, child justice and domestic violence (Thuthuzela Care Centres Cape Town, 2014: 2). The Thuthuzela Care Centres are operational in public hospitals in communities where the incident of rape is particularly high. They are staffed by prosecutors, social workers, investigating officers, magistrates, health professionals, NGOs and the police.

As it will be demonstrated in Tables 4.16 and 4.17 later in this chapter, the group of residents and NGOs interviewed as part of the public participation process in GRB, complained that some community services such as Thuthuzela Care Centres, are located far away from the people they are meant to serve. The training of staff to run the centres was sometimes inadequate and trauma centres were not adequately staffed. They also raised the issue of the language barrier between officials at the centres and general

members of the community, which often made it difficult for them to understand one another. A call was made to authorities in this metropolitan municipality, to assist and support the existence of these centres, by ensuring the continuous assessment of their work. The shortage of police and the breakdown of the relationship between them and community members in one of this metropolitan municipality's biggest townships were highlighted as a hindrance to the fight against crime. The issue of the child support grant not reaching all deserving children in communities in this metropolitan municipality was also highlighted as a major concern.

4.4.2 GRB in health, housing, safety and security in this metropolitan municipality

The rights of South Africans to health, housing, safety and security and education are guaranteed under the Constitution of 1996. More importantly, Chapter 2 on the Bill of Rights Section on equality in the Constitution of 1996 clearly states that the State may not unfairly discriminate directly or indirectly against anyone in one or more grounds, including gender.

The ever-expanding population poses a huge challenge to this metropolitan municipality's health, housing and safety and security budget (State of the Province Speech, 2014: 22). In section 1.2 of Chapter 1, the researcher has explained that poor service delivery is a major issue for many municipalities across South Africa. The challenge for this metropolitan municipality's GRB initiative, in particular, remains its ever changing population patterns (Hewu, 1999:182). Population growth, resulting from people moving in to this metropolitan municipality, because it is perceived as a wealthy area, requires increased service delivery, upgrading of infrastructure, subsidies for poorer areas and households. Latest statistics show that in 2011, the population of this metropolitan municipality was 3 740 025, an increase of 29,3% since 2001. The number of households was 1 068 572, an increase of 37,5% since 2001. The composition of the population has also changed. For example, the Black population increased by 58%, the Coloured population by 14%, the Asian population by 25% and the White population rose by 8% (City of Cape

Town Census, 2011). The age profile remains predominantly in the 25 – 64 years group. The young Black and Coloured age cohorts and older White and Asian age cohorts in 2011 have implications for service delivery needs, planning and implementation. The provision of health services is also one of those key challenges for this metropolitan municipality as a result of the shifting demographics and the age profile (City of Cape Town Census, 2011).

Table 4.10 Population of this metropolitan municipality from the last two recorded censuses in 2001 and 2011

Population	2001 Census	2011 Census
Western Cape	4 524 334	5 822 734
This metropolitan municipality	2 893 249	3 740 026

Source: City of Cape Town Census 2011

The increase in the population numbers between 2001 and 2011 is clearly illustrated in Table 4.10 above. This has implications for this metropolitan municipality's budgeting process and service provision. Table 4.11 below, illustrates the population as well as the average household size in 2011. This also has implications for budgeting, service provision and the IDP.

Table 4.11 Metropolitan municipality population and households in 2011

This metropolitan municipality	2011
Population	3 740 025
Household	1 068 572
Average household size	3,50

Source: City of Cape Town Census 2011

Table 4.12 Changes in this metropolitan municipality's population groups between 2001 and 2011

Metropolitan municipality population group	2001 census	2011 census	Percentage change in 10 years
Black	916 584	1 444 939	57,6
Coloured	1 392 594	1 585 286	13,8
Asian	41 516	51 786	24,7
White	542 555	585 831	8,0
Other	0	72 184	0
Total	2 893 249	3 740 026	29,3

Source: City of Cape Town Census 2011

From the information above, in the ten year period from 2001 to 2011, the population of this metropolitan municipality increased by 29%. The composition of the population also changed. These statistics, in Table 4.12 above, are also crucial in the preparation of budgets and planning of GRB in this metropolitan municipality.

This metropolitan municipality listed the provision of health, housing and safety and security services as one of its key priority areas in 2012/13 IDP. The IDP document is critical because it formulates a city-wide strategic urbanization plan where the focus is to create communities with access to good quality public spaces and services such as health, housing and safety and security. Given the challenges of rapid urbanization and high population growth, this metropolitan municipality experiences great challenges in distributing health, housing and safety and security services.

4.4.3 Responses to the researcher's interview questions

Eighteen interviews were conducted. Each e-mail sent out to senior officials in the health, housing and safety and security directorates (Group 1), via this metropolitan municipality's Employment Equity Directorate, contained thirteen questions. The same number of questions was also posed to six members of the public (Group 2) during face-to-face interviews in August 2014 and via telephone interviews. As explained in the beginning of this chapter, the

researcher posed the questions during a gender conference held in Cape Town, organised by the NGO Section 27. The same thirteen questions were asked of members of the NGOs (Group 3), such as Section 27, during the same conference. The responses of the three groups of interviewees will be discussed below.

1. Can GRB strengthen the role of marginalised communities in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality?

Table 4.13 How GRB strengthens the role of marginalised communities in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage Participation to the question	Possible answer yes/no
Municipal officials	3	16,6	Yes
Members of the public	3	16,6	Yes
NGOs	4	22,2	Yes
Non response to the question	8	44,4	n/a
Total	18	100	

Source: Data generated from field study

Table 4.13 shows that 55,4% of respondents from the three main groups of respondents agreed that GRB could strengthen the role of marginalised communities in this metropolitan municipality. The other 44,4% did not share their thoughts on this matter, for reasons unknown to the researcher. A response from a senior official in the health directorate, however, points out that GRB is not being completely implemented in this metropolitan municipality. As a start, efforts are being made by the directorates of health, housing, safety and security to encourage gender representativity within the ranks of their senior staff members. It is hoped that, as has been illustrated in section 4.4.1, that through the hiring of more women in senior positions, for instance, conscientisation of others below them, about the upliftment of women's rights in their communities, will result. In section 2.2 of Chapter 2,

the discussion pointed out that the goal of GRB is to promote equality between men, women, boys and girls, through influencing the budgeting process (Sharp 2003: 3). South Africa has committed to the GRB process through its membership to many international organizations such as the ILO.

2. *What role do stakeholders play in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality?*

Table 4.14 Role of stakeholders in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	3	16,6
Members of the public	10	55,5
NGOs	4	22,2
Non response to the question	1	5,5
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

Table 4.14 shows that the role played by stakeholders in the GRB process in this metropolitan municipality cannot be underestimated. More than 90% of the respondents in all the groups stated that stakeholders play a critical role in the implementation of GRB. Stakeholders could be various organisations, ward committees and sub-councils. Their input is important to ensure that the budget process caters for the needs of all communities, including men, women, boys and girls. In its response, this metropolitan municipality's safety and security directorate states that a very high level of gender representativity is found in ward committees and sub-councils. The role of NGO's, for instance, can be to raise awareness about the lack of services such as health, housing, safety and security. NGOs work mainly on raising awareness, advocacy, capacity building and issues of development (Parveen, 2010: 56).

NGOs and the residents raised a number of issues and concerns that they would like to see addressed more closely by the metropolitan municipality's budget, when contacted telephonically as well as in the face-to-face interviews. This goes to illustrate the importance of the involvement of stakeholders in the budgeting process. Issues that they are battling with in their communities, such as high maternal mortality, rising crime, lack of housing or slow delivery of housing and rising crime due to drug abuse and gangsterism, and poor distribution of the child support grant, were highlighted.

According to Briones and Valdez (2002: 17), NGOs and civil society organizations must be lauded for their expertise in conducting research on the subject, producing analysis and mobilizing government to support gender equality programmes. A network of support from the academe and other government agencies is also crucial in developing this field.

3. What is the relevance of the GRB programme within the broader budgeting process?

Table 4.15 Relevance of GRB programme in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	2	11,1
Members of the public	2	11,1
NGOs	4	22,2
Non response to the question	10	55,5
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

Table 4.15 shows that 44,4% of respondents have an understanding of the role played by GRB in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality. The knowledge and understanding of GRB in budgeting is important for the

metropolitan municipality to solve the problem of gender-blind budgets. A review of the literature in section 2.2 of Chapter 2 shows that, despite efforts to formulate GRBs, many countries, including South Africa, still have gender-blind budgets. The reasons for this, Stotsky (2007: 12) argues, include ignorance, gender-biased culture, a lack of gender budgeting expertise and limited gender-disaggregated data. Around 55,5% of respondents referred this question to other directorates which were not part of this study.

4. Are you satisfied with the level of community participation in the budget process?

Table 4.16 Level of community participation in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	3	16,6
Members of the public	10	55,5
NGOs	4	22,2
Non response to the question	1	5,5
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

Table 4.16 shows that over 94% of respondents are satisfied with the level of community/citizen participation in the budgeting process. Community/citizen participation ensures that budgetary commitments are solid, accountable and represent the views and wishes of men, women, boys and girls (Shah 2006: 75).

In South Africa, issues of accountability, fairness and trust are even more important at the local sphere, given the perceived high levels of corruption in government in general. There is a need for local authorities to regain the trust of the electorate by ensuring that everyone has a fair share in the slice of the

budget (Country Corruption Assessment Report, 2003). In section 2.2 of Chapter 2 of this study, it was stated that citizen participation in planning and budgeting is an indicator of good governance in municipalities as well as part of a larger process of decentralization (Licha 2004: 329). This metropolitan municipality implements a process whereby its budget for each financial year is sent out to various stakeholders and members of the public for comment before the final budget is adopted by council. The process is called the budget review process.

In his foreword for the 2012/13 IDP, the city manager of this metropolitan municipality stated that the metropolitan municipality also uses an array of communication channels, from newspapers to radio, public meetings, the web and social media to get feedback on its spending plans from communities and other stakeholders such as NGOs. The information collected forms the vision, services and the metropolitan municipality's five-year plan, for its residents. The city manager maintains that residents are given an opportunity to suggest the actions they feel would be most effective in making this metropolitan municipality a well-run one, safe and inclusive metropolitan municipality.

5. How were the priorities of men, women, boys and girls identified in the 2012/13 Budget?

Table 4.17 How the priorities of men, women, boys and girls were identified in this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	4	22,2
Members of the public	10	55,5
NGOs	4	22,4
Non response to the question	0	0
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

Table 4.17 shows that 100% of respondents agree that the priorities of men, women, boys and girls in the 2012/13 budget were identified through the public participation process. Another key role for the IDP is to develop a plan that spells out key development and spending areas for a five year period, in line with the amount of time that a political party or parties are expected to govern a metropolitan municipality (City of Cape Town Integrated Development Plan, 2003/04). The 2012/13 IDP, in this metropolitan municipality, includes a city-wide strategic urbanization plan, as already discussed elsewhere in this chapter.

The then Honourable Premier Helen Zille, in her State of the Province address, reflected in the fact that her government had received 1 096 complaints, from members of the public and other stakeholders, regarding health services in the Western Cape between August 2012 and January 2014. The complaints ranged from poor service delivery at government hospitals to poor infrastructure and management. The 2012/13 financial year, which is the focus of this study, falls within this period. In response to the complaints, the provincial government in 2014 committed R3.3-billion to build new health facilities and upgrade existing clinics and hospitals (The Western Cape Story, 2009-2014: 14).

6. *What are the challenges/ difficulties of the GRB programme and how have these been addressed?*

Table 4.18 Challenges/difficulties of GRB in this metropolitan municipality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents responses to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	3	16,6
Members of the public	10	55,5
NGOs	4	22,2
Non response to the question	1	5,5
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

The lack of resources was stated as the main challenge to the GRB programme in this metropolitan municipality. Table 4.18 shows that 94,3% of the respondents agree that financial resources are a hindrance to the successful implementation of GRB. As already discussed in section 2.2 of Chapter 2, many South African municipalities, particularly the smaller ones, are struggling financially. There appears to be no solid financial control mechanisms laid down to enable the effective delivery of services to some communities, especially the needy ones (National Treasury, 2013). Service delivery challenges are also often exacerbated by human resource issues, ranging from difficulties in the recruitment of suitably qualified and experienced professionals to unstructured or weak disciplinary procedures (Van der Mescht and Van Jaarsveld, 2014). Furthermore, there is not enough money to finance women and gender programmes such as reproductive health and gender-based violence programmes or HIV/Aids programmes (Gender Responsive Budgeting, 2006: 11).

7. *Who is responsible for implementing GRB in this metropolitan municipality?*

Table 4.19 Implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	4	22,2
Members of the public	0	0
NGOs	2	11,1
Non response to the question	10	55,5
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

A senior official in the gender and diversity department previously stated in section 4.4.1 of this chapter, that all directorates and departments are responsible for planning, budgeting and implementing programmes that fall within their functional mandate. This shows that there is no clear co-ordinated plan for GRB. 33,4% of the respondents in Table 14.19 agreed that there is not clear, co-ordinated plan for GRB.

8. *Are municipal official adequately trained on GRB?*

Table 4.20 Training of this metropolitan municipality's officials on GRB

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	2	11,1
Members of the public	0	0
NGOs	4	22,2
Non response to the question	12	66,6
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

The metropolitan municipality's Employment Equity Directorate has stated that it is not aware of any corporate-wide training initiatives in GRB, although a number of officials have been trained in gender mainstreaming, which includes the GRB component. Most of the respondents in Group 2 and 3, as indicated in Table 4.20, referred this researcher to this metropolitan municipality for an answer to this question. Only the Employment Equity and the Health Directorates provided an answer. The housing as well as the safety and security directorate referred the researcher to the Mayoral Committee for Finance. From the response above, it is clear that the corporate-wide training of officials on GRB is not taking place.

Adequate training of municipal officials on GRB is crucial. According to the Economic Commission of Africa (2001: 31), one of the major problems regarding the implementation of the GRB is the incapacity of those expected to incorporate gender into their budget submissions. Most of these officers have little or no background in gender studies, practices and development. Resistance to the concept of gender equality as an important variable in long-term structural transformations is also apparent. Gender equality is an emotive subject for many people (Economic Commission of Africa, 2001).

9. *In your opinion, is the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality successful?*

Table 4.21 Individual opinion on the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question	Yes/no
Municipal officials	3	16,6	Yes
Members of the public	6	33,3	No
NGOs	2	11,1	Yes
Non response to the question	7	38,8	
Total	18	100	

Source: Data generated from field study

Table 4.21 shows that only 27,7% of respondents agreed that the implementation of GRB in this metropolitan municipality is successful. 33,3% of respondents, which constituted members of the public, disagreed. Close to 39% of respondents chose not to give a response to this question.

10. When will the gender equality process in this metropolitan municipality be finalised?

Table 4.22 Finalisation of the gender equality process in this metropolitan municipality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	4	22,2
Members of the public	0	0
NGOs	0	0
Non response to the question	14	77,7
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

An attempt to answer the question in Table 4.22 was only made by the municipal officials (Group 1). The Employment Equity Directorate stated that the process for finalising the gender equity process in this metropolitan municipality was still ongoing. This fact was also discussed in detail in previous chapters. It has also been pointed out previously that the WCP, where this metropolitan municipality is located, started its own internal GRB initiative in 2000, although not much progress has been achieved. It was stated in section 1.2 of Chapter 1, that when the gender equality process was initiated, government officials were trained on the importance of gender budgeting (City of Cape Town Budget, 2012/13). The first ever city-wide policy on women empowerment and gender equality for this metropolitan municipality started to take shape in August 2004 (City Aims for Gender Equality, 2004).

11. What is this metropolitan municipality doing to address unacceptable levels of gender inequality?

Table 4.23 How this metropolitan municipality is addressing unacceptable levels of gender inequality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	4	22,2
Members of the public	0	0
NGOs	0	0
Non response to the question	14	77,7
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

Only 22,2% of respondents answered the question, as shown in Table 4.23. The Employment Equity Department stated that the metropolitan municipality was making progress in addressing unacceptable levels of gender inequality by adopting the following:

- appointing more females staff at senior management levels
- appointing female staff in historically male dominated career streams
- hosting ongoing gender sensitivity education and awareness sessions
- identifying and eliminating barriers that prevent the advancement of women; and
- hosting annual awards ceremonies to recognise departmental achievements aligned to this metropolitan municipality's women strategy.

A review of the literature in section 2.2 of Chapter 2 has also shown that at an institutional level, this metropolitan municipality has demonstrated a commitment to GRB, by appointing officials who operate across departments and who form part of its Gender Task Team. Members of this team report on internal processes and they also support service managers to mainstream gender issues.

12. Is the GRB programme cost effective for this metropolitan municipality?

Table 4.24 Cost effectiveness of GRB in this metropolitan municipality

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents	Percentage	Yes/No
Municipal officials	2	11,1	Yes
Members of the public	10	55,5	No
NGOs	4	22,2	No
Non response to the question	2	11,1	
Total	18	100	

Source: Data generated from field study

Table 4.24 shows that only 11,1% of respondents agreed that the GRB programme is cost effective for this metropolitan municipality. 77,7% of the respondents (see highlighted sections of the table) were made up of members of the public and NGOs who did not agree. The issue of strained and limited financial resources for municipalities has been discussed earlier in Table 4.17.

13. Does this metropolitan municipality keep updated gender disaggregated data for budgeting purposes?

Table 4.25 The metropolitan municipality's records of gender disaggregated data for budgeting purposes

Group of Respondents	Number of respondents to the question	Percentage participation to the question
Municipal officials	0	0
Members of the public	0	0
NGOs	0	0
Non response to the question	18	100
Total	18	100

Source: Data generated from field study

Table 4.25 shows that this metropolitan municipality does not keep gender disaggregated data. None of the respondents answered this question. The keeping of gender disaggregated data is crucial for GRB. According to Stotsky (2007: 12), the reason many countries still have gender-blind budgets is because of the absence of or availability of limited gender-disaggregated data. Such data are gathered and broken down by gender in order to aid comparison for men, women, boys and girls.

The analysis of the thirteen research questions above is further proof that this metropolitan municipality requires innovative thinking (see questions 6, 7, 8, 9 and 12 above). It also needs to form strong partnerships with the private sector (see questions 6, 7 and 11 above) to meet some of its GRB goals. Private partnerships are needed to raise funding for its GRB programmes. It is worth mentioning again that GRB budgets are not stand alone budgets as authors such as Budlender have argued previously. They say the GRB message is that unless the necessary resources are allocated, gender sensitive policies and programmes will not succeed in any metropolitan municipality.

4.4.4 GRB in education

Although the provision of education to its communities is not one of this metropolitan municipality's main focus areas, this provision is still considered as one of the priority support areas (City of Cape Town Budget 2012/13). High levels of education in this metropolitan municipality are also seen as one of the key areas to deal with GRB and ending poverty. As part of its mandate to build a caring and inclusive city in section 4.4.1.2 of this chapter, the metropolitan municipality states that it will cater for the needs of all residents by building libraries, sports and recreational facilities to support the development of all its communities. It is for this reason that education is included in this study.

According to Lo and Alami (2011: 4), access to education is a basic human right enshrined in a number of international, regional and national

agreements. In South Africa, this basic human right is enshrined in the Constitution of 1996. However, there are still many problems in this area. In her 2014 article titled 'Pursuing the Right to Education', author Margaret Stride writes that while learners, mainly in poor communities, may be enrolled at schools and their names present on registers, diverse conditions exist on the ground which inhibit and prevent attendance of school such as lack of transport for remotely located schools, or having to traverse dangerous terrain (Cape Times, 2014). There is concern that a large number of learners are still barred from attending school because of the lack of proper documentation to enrol. Some schools are targeted by criminals, who vandalise property and infrastructure causing learners to stay home for weeks on end, while the problem is being fixed. To address this problem, the South African Minister of Basic Education has been compelled to publish binding national norms and standards for school infrastructure. The norms have been described as architectural norms and planning norms (Department of Basic Education, 2015: 1). Architectural norms guide design, including the minimum and maximum number of learners in a classroom. Planning norms comprise key aspects, which should be taken into account when planning for the provision of the physical teaching and learning environment (Department of Basic Education, 2015: 1)

In the 2012/13 financial year, the WCPG set its education budget at R3, 077-billion (2012 Budget Highlight, 2012: 1). The focus of the spending was on strengthening initiatives to improve literacy and numeracy in primary schools, the number and quality of matric passes, the reduction of the number of under-performing schools, the provision for every child from Grades 1 to 12 with a textbook in every subject; and provide quality Grade R programmes at public schools. In her State of the Province address that has already been referred to, the Honourable Premier Helen Zille indicated that in 2010, her government released a strategic plan to improve the quality of education of men, women, boys and girls and other groups by 2019. Progress in this regard was being made. The WCPG was still on a mission to improve language and mathematics skills in previously disadvantaged areas, such as the townships; the number of and quality of passes in the national senior

certificate; to reduce the number of under-performing schools and increase the retention rate at schools across the province (Premier's State of the Province Speech, 2014: 18). This metropolitan municipality, according to its 2012/13 IDP, was also working with the Western Cape Education Department to help underfunded schools. There were concerns that unused grounds in some schools expose them to illegal dumping, invasion and security issues.

Through South Africa's commitment to gender equality and meeting its millennium development goals, of halving poverty by the year 2030, significant progress is being made towards achieving universal primary education and improving education opportunities for men, women, boys and girls at all levels (Human Development Report, 2010). Enrolments have increased faster for girls than for boys over the past few decades and both primary and secondary school completion rates have improved more rapidly for girls (Human Development Report, 2010). The then Premier of the Western Cape, the Honourable Helen Zille, indicated that the bulk of the education budget, which stood at R52, 121-billion, would continue to be spent on underprivileged learners in a bid to correct some of the inequality and imbalances brought about by the apartheid system. Measures were being put in place to provide food to poor schools in the Western Cape Province and in this metropolitan municipality. For instance, the WCPG increased the amount allocated to its school feeding scheme by more than 100% from R112-million in 2009 to R260-million in 2013 (The Western Cape Story, 2009-2014: 10). It was noted by the Premier that schools continued to underperform due to weak school governing bodies which sometimes lacked critical skills in leadership, management, finance and discipline. The provincial government has now adopted a system to advertise the elections of school governing bodies in local media with the aim of attracting volunteers who possessed the necessary skills mentioned above (The Western Cape Story, 2009-2014: 10).

Since the issue of crime in the WCP affects all groups, be they men, women, boys and girls, the provincial government was on a drive to strengthen security at schools, particularly those affected by drug abuse and gangsterism. The government was working with the South African Police

Service and civil society organisations to improve safety in schools. It is also clear in the Premier's 2012 State of the Province Speech that efforts were being made to make learner materials available at all schools on time to maintain a high standard of education for all learners. The WCPG introduced rigorous competency testing for markers in the matric examinations, so that they could compete favourably with those of other countries in the world. The WCP is the only province in South Africa to conduct internationally benchmarked language and mathematics testing in Grades 3, 6 and 9 (The Western Cape Story, 2009-2014: 10). To ensure the involvement and inclusion of all groups such as men, women, boys and girls in the learning process, the WCPG has added another 216 no-fee schools to the 673 schools that were already in the no-fee schools programme. No-fee schools are schools where learners are exempted from paying any fees (Basic Education Department, 2015). In meeting the needs of all communities, the number of underperforming schools was reduced from 85 in 2009 to 23 in 2013 (The Western Cape Story, 2009-2014: 10).

According to Lo and Alami (2011: 4), the UN recognises that in developing countries, like South Africa, inequality in education still exists with many girls and women still unable to enrol or complete their schooling. Performance, regarding education outcomes is lower in poverty stricken communities. The experience of girls in schools also deserves attention with some of them falling pregnant early and being sexual harassed by those who are meant to protect them. In addressing this, the WCPG improved the retention rate of learners, who dropped out of school before matric, from 36,9% in 2009 to 52,1% in 2013 (The Western Cape Story, 2009-2014: 10).

Findings from the poverty trends report in South Africa, released in 2014, show a strong link between increased levels of education and decreased levels of poverty (Statistics South Africa, 2014). A better education clearly opens a door to better economic prospects. A matric certificate is the only recognised school leaving qualification in South Africa and is a pre-requisite for further study and acceptance into organisations such as the Defense Force or the South African Police Services. However, education alone cannot

eradicate poverty, rather, education coupled with greater job opportunities in the economy will be the roadmap out of poverty (Statistics South Africa, 2014: 1).

In 1998 in South Africa, men predominated at colleges where technical subjects were taught. Overall, women outnumbered men at universities (Budlender, 1998: 6). In 2011, the majority of students enrolled in public higher education institutions or universities were still female and Black, Coloured and Indian/Asian. The university enrolments in 2011 are illustrated in Table 4.26 below.

Table 4.26 Overview of enrolment in public higher education institutions: 2011

Institution	Headcount Student Enrolment			Female Students as Proportion of Headcount Total (%)	
	Contact	Distance	Total	Contact	Distance
Cape Peninsula University of Technology	32479	27	32506	53	59
University of Cape Town	25301	0	25301	52	n/a
Central University of Technology, Free State	12363	281	12644	47	72
Durban University of Technology		0	24840	50	n/a
University of Fort Hare	11144	0	11144	57	n/a
University of Free State	26796	4790	31586	59	6
University of Johannesburg	50528	0	50528	55	n/a
University of KwaZulu-Natal	35514	6248	41762	57	71
University of Limpopo	20504	0	20504	54	n/a
Nelson Mandela	24358	1898	26256	52	75

University of Technology					
North West University	31663	24978	56641	59	75
University of Pretoria	44745	13383	58128	55	72
Rhodes University	7278	0	7278	59	n/a
University of South Africa	13	328851	328864	77	61
University of Stellenbosch	27266	0	27266	51	n/a
Tshwane University of Technology	49025	1050	50075	52	47
University of Venda	10342	0	10342	54	n/a
Vaal University of Technology	21861	0	21861	46	n/a
Walter Sisulu University	27029	0	27029	57	n/a
University of Western Cape	18764	0	18764	60	n/a
University of Witwatersrand	29004	0	29004	54	n/a
University of Zululand	15592	0	15592	65	n/a
Mangosuthu University of Technology	10286	0	10286	51	n/a
Total/Average	556695	381506	938210	54	63

Contact = Contact Learning and Distance = Distance Learning

Source: Statistics of Post-School Education and Training in South Africa: 2011

Men generally predominate in areas which are more expensive in terms of state allocations and which are increasingly favoured in education and science and technology such as engineering. There are still severe race inequalities. Many students of colour still struggle to access formal education at institutions of higher learning due to limited government funding in the National Student Financial Aid Scheme (Statistics on Post-School Education and Training, 2011: 1). Moreover, many students and their families do not

have the requisite funds at the time that they start studying (Statistics on Post-School Education and Training, 2011: 1).

Adult Education and Training (AET) is offered in public and private adult learning centres, which are located mainly in townships and rural areas of South Africa (Statistics on Post-School Education and Training, 2011). The majority of public adult learning centres utilise schools for the provision of adult education and training programmes. The provision of adult education and training in the country is regulated through the Adult Education and Training Act 52 of 2000. AET Centres offer programmes to both adults, as well as out-of-school youth, and in the main, culminates in the General Education and Training Certificate qualification, an equivalent to the National Qualifications Framework level 1 and the Senior Certificate or Grade 12 (Statistics on Post-School Education and Training, 2011).

During the interview process for this research, various community leaders and some NGOs complained about on-going incidents of sexual assaults at school involving boys and girls. The NGOs stated that girls were still being sexually assaulted, in some cases by their male teachers and fellow male learners. According to the NGOs featured in this research, boys were the victims of sexual assaults in the home often by people known to them. The NGOs, in particular, expressed frustration at the lack of gender disaggregated data nationally and provincially as this made it difficult for them to determine what was allocated and what was spent in municipalities. Certain respondents indicated that they were not sure if officials in this metropolitan municipality understood the allocation of money, in terms of needs and mandates.

4.5 SUMMARY

Data was analysed to establish the gender responsiveness in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality. The findings from the various respondents in this study were presented, including an analysis of important municipal documents, such as the 2012/13 budgets and the IDP for the same period. The researcher reflected on political speeches made around this

period, to highlight how this metropolitan municipality was addressing inequalities in health, housing and safety and security.

The researcher received a 100% response rate from all the three groups of respondents interviewed. However, not all of them answered all of the thirteen questions posed to them. The reasons for the failure to respond were varied. In the key findings, the researcher found that some GRB is taking place in this metropolitan municipality and it is adopting a formal gender-mainstreaming approach. At an institutional level, this metropolitan municipality has shown commitment to GRB, by raising awareness and monitoring the implementation of its Employment Equity Plan. It has also appointed officials, who operate across departments, to form part of its Gender Task Team. There is a conscious effort in this metropolitan municipality to include gender in the recruitment and selection of senior officials. It is hoped that more appointments of women in key positions will spearhead efforts to address inequalities and uplift women's rights. However, it is not a given that all women will necessarily push the GRB agenda. The metropolitan municipality looks at specific attributes, such as a woman's past work and career aspirations, to make an informed decision during job interviews.

The study has found that there are challenges in the internal environment of this metropolitan municipality, despite a well-meaning Employment Equity Programme. This metropolitan municipality is struggling to achieve its gender targets. There is no clear co-coordinated plan for the implementation of GRB, with many departments and directorates remaining to implement their own programmes. It is clear that the gender equality programme is far from over. A number of officials are being trained in gender mainstreaming, which includes the GRB component. A draft policy on women's empowerment and gender equality is in the process of being adopted. At the time of writing this dissertation, it was still at the public participation stage.

It is encouraging for the researcher to note that a Social Development Strategy is in place and that clearly states the nature, scope, extent and level

of social services for men, women, boys and girls. The key social challenges identified under the strategy will inform the budgeting process and the IDP.

In its mission statement, this metropolitan municipality seeks to uphold the rights of all its residents by striving to provide adequate health, housing, safety and security as guaranteed in the Constitution of 1996. Efforts are being made by this metropolitan municipality to improve health care and services at public clinics to address serious diseases, such as HIV/Aids and tuberculosis. There are, however, concerns from some communities about the negative attitude of some staff members at public clinics. The issues of urbanisation, migrant labour and a growing population pose a challenge to the provision of services, particularly in housing, health care and safety and security.

This study has also found that this metropolitan municipality is aware of GRB and efforts are being made to build a more inclusive city that encourages participation by its people, in various programmes. The provincial government is stepping in where it can to assist this metropolitan municipality in providing critical services such as housing and education. It was acknowledged that the provision of adequate housing to poor communities to address inequalities would take a long time, due to the increasing housing backlog. The housing backlog in the WCP is estimated at 500 000 (2012/13 IDP). However, there are plans to improve the situation, using this metropolitan municipality's ten-year housing plan.

The vandalising of schools is a big concern. Drug abuse and gangsterism are affecting the safety and security of the community and the rights of children to a good education. The experiences of girls in schools call for attention, with some of them falling pregnant at a young age and others being sexually harassed or both. This metropolitan municipality has acknowledged that levels of violence against women and children within its boundaries are unacceptably high. This metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP committed to expanding its staff and capital resources in the policing departments and emergency services, to ensure improved services to all communities.

Stakeholders working with this metropolitan municipality have expressed concern about the existence of racial divides between Blacks and Whites. This is evident in how the two groups seem not to 'trust' each other.

Metro police are receiving training to deal with sexual cases and domestic violence. This metropolitan municipality has committed to training more officers and supporting neighbourhood watches at the municipal and the provincial levels. Efforts are being made to root out corruption in the police force, blamed for some of the increases in certain crimes, such as drug abuse and gangsterism. The establishment of Thuthuzela Centres aimed at improving conviction rates for sexual crimes and support victims has been applauded. However, there is a concern that these centres are located far from the people and communities they are supposed to serve. Residents of this metropolitan municipality seem to clearly know what they want and expect from their leaders. The NGOs and civil society organisations operating in this metropolitan municipality have a voice, and are vocal about their concerns.

The key findings of the individual questions from the respondents are summarised as follows:

The three types of respondents in this study agreed that GRB could strengthen the role of marginalised communities in this metropolitan municipality. More than 90% of the respondents, in all the groups, agreed that stakeholders play a critical role in the implementation of GRB. While the respondents have an understating of GRB, many countries around the world, including South Africa, still have gender-blind budgets. The respondents were satisfied with the level of community participation in the budgeting process and in the 2012/13 financial year, the priorities of men, women, boys and girls were identified through the public participation process.

The lack of resources is seen as the main challenge to GRB in this metropolitan municipality. All directorates and departments are responsible for planning, budgeting and implementing programmes that fall within their functional mandates. There is no clear co-ordinated plan for GRB and the

metropolitan municipality is not aware of any corporate-wide training initiative in GRB. It is unclear when the gender equality process will be finalised. This metropolitan municipality does not keep gender disaggregated data; keeping such information is crucial for GRB.

In Chapter 5 of this study, conclusions and recommendations will be made to advance gender equality, including possible interventions by this metropolitan municipality and other stakeholders to achieve this aim.

CHAPTER 5

SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter provides the summary, recommendations, suggestions for further research and the conclusion derived from the findings of this study. This study focused on assessing GRB in one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. In particular, the study reviewed this metropolitan municipality's budget for the 2012/13 financial year and the IDP covering the same period with the aim of showing the extent of their gender sensitivity/responsiveness or lack thereof.

The findings from both the literature review and the empirical investigation on GRB are also discussed. The implications of the findings and the resultant recommendations, which may encourage the support and greater practice of GRB in this metropolitan municipality, are explained. The recommendations made in this chapter were based on the purpose of this study. Recommendations for further research on GRB in this metropolitan municipality are also made. The approach to research and the research methodology utilized, namely, the qualitative and quantitative methods of gathering data, enabled the development of a holistic picture of GRB in this metropolitan municipality. The conclusion, therefore, together with the aims and objectives of this study, as well as all the results, are informed by the research methodology. The aim of this study was to explore the extent of the compliance to GRB by one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. The bibliography is given at the end.

5.2 SUMMARY OF THIS STUDY

A brief summary of the research project is presented in this chapter. In view of the background provided by the problem statement in section 1.3 of Chapter 1, this study is asking the main research question: **"To what extent is the**

metropolitan municipality where this study is taking place making provision for GRB?”. The answer to this question is provided later in section 5.3 of this chapter.

The aim of the study was to explore the extent of compliance to GRB by one of South Africa's largest urban metropolitan municipalities. This metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget together with its IDP for the same period, were reviewed with the aim of showing the extent of their gender sensitivity/responsiveness. This was done by examining the following objectives, as stated in section 1.4 of Chapter 1, namely to:

- determine what the existing literature says about GRB.
- investigate to what extent the residents of the metropolitan municipality, especially women, are aware of their democratic rights to request that their interests be included in the metropolitan municipality's budget and also explore how they experience GRB in general.
- explore to what extent the metropolitan municipality officials and the public understand how to manage their interaction in this regard. This exercise would help address the inequalities in spending, and to investigate whether it is the training of officials in GRB policies or encouraging authorities to spend more on such policies, that can make a difference in the lives of men, women, boys and girls.
- determine how the IDP and variables such as health, housing, safety and security and education can be addressed to bring about GRB.

The extent to which this study met each of the objectives stated above is discussed in detail in section 5.3 below.

The empirical investigation was triggered by the growing importance of the principles of accountability, gender equality and human rights in government budgeting processes (Reina, 2010: 5) and in the Constitution of 1996. Chapter 13 of the Constitution of 1996 calls on all public managers, particularly the executive, to distribute money fairly and equitably in all

communities. This means that government spending should benefit all groups making up its people. GRB is one of the ways to ensure that all groups benefit, as they should, from the budgeting process (Reina, 2010: 5).

According to Sharp and Broomhill (2002: 25), GRB is useful for increasing the efficiency of government budgets by allowing better informed financial resource allocations. They also argue that GRB increases the effectiveness of policies and programmes by providing a way to assess whether the stated objectives have been achieved. Gender equity has always been an important rationale for policy makers to undertake GRB, as GRB can contribute to more equitable budget allocations (Reina, 2010: 9).

The empirical research was limited to the study area.

Chapter 1 is the introductory chapter detailing the background and rationale of the study. The chapter deals with all aspects of the dissertation, such as the description of the study area, the problem statement, its aim and objective, research questions, research method, demarcation of the study, terminology, as well as an overview of all the chapters and the referencing process.

Chapter 2 focused on the literature review on GRB. This chapter discussed the contextualisation of GRB, various countries' experiences in gender budgeting and the role of the UN in the GRB discourse. It is in this chapter that the importance of the Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing 1995, was highlighted, as regards its catapulting a significant amount of research into gender budgeting. The Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing 1995 propelled many governments to affirm their commitment to gender equality and to use their budgets to translate their gender equality commitments into fiscal commitments (Financial and Fiscal Commission 2012: 303). Despite the growing research into GRB, more still needs to be done to fill the gaps that still exist in research in this field. GRB country experiences were drawn, in this research, from countries such as Australia, Tanzania, Brazil, India, China and South Africa. Organisations such as the

United Nations have also played an important role in spearheading initiatives on GRB, with a sharp focus on women's rights.

Chapter 3 described the research methodology and design of the research project. It further described the population and sample that were employed to collect the empirical data. Both the qualitative and quantitative methods used were explained, including their strengths and justification for their use. The types of data collection methods used were explained and the reasons for their choice were indicated. The researcher also explained how the data was interpreted and the problems and limitations that had been anticipated in the study.

Chapter 4 was dedicated to the analysis of the research. The findings from the interviews were presented and interpreted in light of the theoretical information obtained in the preceding chapters, leading to the, summary, discussion, recommendations and conclusion in Chapter 5.

Chapter 5 recommends areas for further research to be undertaken in this field.

5.3 DISCUSSION OF DATA AND FINDINGS OF THIS STUDY

Data in this study was analysed to establish the gender responsiveness of the budgeting process in one of South Africa's largest urban metropolitan municipalities, using the key/leading indicators for poverty, which are housing, health, safety and security and education.

In terms of the main question asked in the problem statement in section 1.3 of Chapter 1, this study found that this metropolitan municipality is still in the process of adopting a formal gender-mainstreaming approach to GRB. The adoption process is driven by the Employment Equity Directorate in this metropolitan municipality. Internally, this metropolitan municipality uses Western Cape demographics in its recruitment and selection processes. It is hoped that through the hiring of more women in senior positions, they will be

able to conscientise staff below them about the upliftment of women's rights in their communities. However, attracting the right people, both men and women, to balance key positions in terms of the gender remains a challenge. Various departments are expected to develop their own plans and guidelines for addressing GRB and inequality issues. This process is not coordinated throughout this metropolitan municipality; it is done on an ad-hoc basis.

This metropolitan municipality has a gender task team that is responsible for training officials in various departments, and directorates to be sensitive/responsive about issues of gender equality. It is important at this stage of the research to distinguish between gender equality and another closely related term in gender studies; gender equity (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 307). An understanding of the differences or similarities between these terms is critical for the successful implementation of GRB programmes in a metropolitan municipality such as this one where the study is taking place (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 307). The differences between gender equality and gender equity are explained below.

Gender equality refers to the existence of equal conditions for men and women in realising their full human rights and potential, whereby they contribute equally to political, economic, social as well as cultural development and benefit equally from the results (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 307). **Gender equity** is the fair and just distribution of opportunities and resources between men, women, boys and girls (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 307). In line with the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998, the equity process simply focuses in workplace recruitment of women. The results of this study show that the metropolitan municipality is complying with legislation in terms of "playing the numbers game" (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 307). It is not clear to the researcher, based on the interviews, whether officials in the metropolitan municipality understand the difference between the two terms above.

This study satisfied each of the four objectives listed in sections 1.4 of Chapter 1 and 5.2 of this chapter. Details of how the study satisfied the objectives are explained below:

- **Determine what the existing literature discussed in section 2.2 of Chapter 2 says about GRB.**

Despite efforts to formulate GRBs, many countries, including South Africa, still have gender-blind budgets. The reasons for this, Stotsky (2007:12) argues, include ignorance, gender-biased culture, a lack of gender budgeting expertise and limited gender-disaggregated data. Since South Africa is a member of the ILO post 1994, gender equality is a key operational objective that must be achieved to fulfill 'the decent work agenda' (ILO, 2012:3).

Many South African municipalities, particularly the smaller ones, are struggling financially. There appears to be no solid financial control mechanisms laid down to enable the effective delivery of services to communities, especially the needy (National Treasury, 2013). Service delivery challenges are often exacerbated by human resource issues, ranging from the difficulty in recruiting suitably qualified and experienced professionals to weak or unstructured implementation. However, there have been attempts to address the lack of experience and skills shortage in municipalities through the deployment of technical personnel from the private sector (Van der Mescht and Van Jaarsveld, 2014). Many municipalities have received qualified reports due to a lack of proper financial management skills and poor rates, taxes and revenue collection management systems (Auditor General, 2014). Qualified reports are issued by an auditor when he/she encounters one of two types of material circumstances that do not meet the set and generally accepted accounting principles, even if the rest of the financial statements are fairly presented (Auditor General, 2014).

Gender budget analysts, such as the well-known South African academic and researcher, Debbie Budlender, argue that there is not enough money to finance women and gender programmes such as reproductive health and

gender-based violence programmes or HIV/Aids programmes (Gender Responsive Budgeting, 2006:11). Money is an important policy tool for government and without it government cannot successfully implement their policies or programmes, regardless of how good these may be.

Due to a lack of proper GRB policies, not enough attention is given to the impact of allocated resources. The unfortunate consequence is the perpetuation of gender biases in South Africa, yet budgets offer a potential route to transform gender inequalities. A GRB policy is crucial because it elevates the prioritisation of women empowerment (Minister Lulu Xingwana, 2014).

While gender budgeting gained momentum at the national sphere of government in South Africa in the mid-1990s, it still remains a concern whether there is enough political will to translate gender commitments into fiscal commitments at the local sphere. According to Budlender (2012: 301), this is where gender disparities in basic services provision are more pronounced. Service delivery protests for basic needs such as housing, health, safety and security and education are common in most municipalities across the country, including this metropolitan municipality. Addressing shortages of housing, health, safety concerns and education is important because these are known to be some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of communities, particularly the poor, and as such are good quality of life indicators (Budlender 2012: 304). Furthermore, these service delivery challenges identified by Budlender above are also applicable in this metropolitan municipality.

According to Elson and Sharp (2010: 524-525), GRB has contributed to the introduction of the child support grant in South Africa, given to the primary caregivers of young children from poor households. According to Budlender and Woolard (2012: 28), social grants can assist in addressing inequality. This is one of the main aims of GRB. They argue that the poor are amongst the most affected by inequality, therefore, grants are an important source of income for poor households as they could also reduce poverty.

Some of the changes aimed at women empowerment, in particular, are evident in that women in South Africa today occupy influential positions in government and play an important role in decision-making processes, such as the recently appointed Speaker in the National Assembly, Baleka Mbete. In this metropolitan municipality, there appears to be a commitment to GRB by including gender in the recruitment and selection of senior officials. It is hoped that more appointments of women in key positions will spearhead efforts to redress inequalities. However, this metropolitan municipality still struggles with meeting gender targets, despite a well-meaning Employment Equity programme. As seen in Table 5.1 and Table 5.2 below, in the 2012/13 financial year women occupied 17 top and senior management positions compared to men who occupied 58 top and senior management positions.

Table 5.1 This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for women in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)

Occupational Levels	Female				Total
	B	C	I	W	
Top management	2			2	4
Senior management	4	5		4	13
Total					17

B=Black, C=Coloured, I=Indian, W=White

Source: City of Cape Town Council Overview: 2012/13

Table 5.2 This metropolitan municipality's employment equity profile for men in top management in 2012/13 (As at June 2013)

Occupational Levels	Male				Total
	B	C	I	W	
Top management	1	3		5	9
Senior management	6	17		26	49
Total					58

B=Black, C=Coloured, I=Indian, W=White

Source: City of Cape Town Council Overview: 2012/13

An argument was made in section 4.3.1 of Chapter 4 that, it is hoped that the appointment of more women in senior positions would create awareness about issues affecting them. The Employment Equity Programme and this metropolitan municipality's Women Empowerment Strategy (WES) seek to address its gender needs with the hope that if you start from the 'inside' it will then be easier to deal with the 'outside'. The WES allows for the creation of

gender forums in each directorate of this metropolitan municipality, accompanied by gender-sensitivity training, diversity management and general GRB awareness.

In his 2014 State-Of-The-Nation-Address, the South African President Jacob Zuma said his government was committed to ensuring the safety of women and children, by introducing a number of measures to make their communities safer. These include reopening the Family Violence, Child Protection and Sexual Offences Units Against Abuse as well as Sexual Offences Courts. The aim of the sexual offences courts is to address the growing challenge of sexual offences in the country, particularly against vulnerable groups, particularly women and children (SA to Reinstate, 2013). This metropolitan municipality adopted a Social Development Strategy for Vulnerable Groups in 2012. Chapter 3 of this strategy aims to 'support the most vulnerable community members through enhancing their access to services'. The services include reorienting service delivery, providing free primary health care, facilitating access to housing opportunities and focusing on early childhood development (City Wide Gender Forum, 2014). This metropolitan municipality maintains that it considers women and girls to be vulnerable as they often face higher rates of victimisation and abuse, as well as the fact that they tend to be over-represented among the poor (City Wide Gender Forum, 2014).

The role played by NGOs and civil society groups in GRB cannot be ignored. According to Briones and Valdez (2002:17), these groups must be lauded for their expertise in conducting research on the subject, producing analysis and mobilizing government to support gender equality programmes. A network of support from the academe and other government agencies is also crucial in developing this field further.

Continued citizen participation is important for GRB and ensuring that budgetary commitments are solid, accountable and represent the views and wishes of men, women, boys and girls (Shah 2006: 75). This metropolitan municipality has a special Public Participation Unit, which coordinates the

public participation processes for all its policies and strategies. The unit facilitates communication with interested organisations and communities and provides for people with special needs wanting to participate in decision-making.

In terms of GRB, this metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 budget and IDP reflect its key policy decisions and priorities for spending. These documents also determine rates increases and indicate where money will be spent, and on which programmes and services. A draft budget, for example, can be viewed at all public libraries and it is open for comment after it is tabled at Council in March each year. In the 2012/13 financial year, a process was underway in this metropolitan municipality to increase the reach of its public consultation processes around the budget.

In addition, this study found that while management of the various directorates in this metropolitan municipality are aware of GRB and efforts are being made to build a more inclusive city, that encourages participation from its people in various programmes, there are still challenges. For example, there is no clear co-coordinated plan for the implementation of GRB, as a result many departments and directorates implement their own individual and uncoordinated programmes. The drawing up of the Gender Equality Programme is also not yet complete.

- **Investigate to what extent the residents of the metropolitan municipality, especially women, are aware of their democratic rights to request that their interests be included in the metropolitan municipality's budget and also to explore how they experience GRB.**

Community/citizen participation, as discussed in Table 4.15 of Chapter 4 ensures that budgetary commitments are solid, accountable and represent the views and wishes of men, women, boys and girls (Shah 2006: 75). Most of the respondents, during data collection, said they were happy with the level of

community/citizen participation in the budgeting process in this metropolitan municipality.

This metropolitan municipality upholds the view shared by Licha (2004: 329) in section 2.2 of Chapter 2, that citizen participation in planning and budgeting, is an indicator of good governance and constitutes a larger process of decentralization. As previously discussed in section 2.2 of Chapter 2, this metropolitan municipality has a special Public Participation Unit which coordinates the public participation process for all its policies and strategies. The unit facilitates communication with interested organisations and communities and provides for people with special needs wanting to participate in decision-making.

- **Explore to what extent the metropolitan municipality officials and the public understands how to manage their interaction, so they can address inequalities in spending and to investigate whether it is the training of officials in GRB policies or encouraging authorities to spend more on such policies that can make a difference in the lives of women.**

Internally, in this metropolitan municipality, GRB appears to be taking place in an ad-hoc manner. Citizen participation is taking place, as discussed in the paragraph above. In Table 4.19 of Chapter 4, this metropolitan municipality's Employment Equity Directorate indicated that it is not aware of any corporate training initiative in GRB although a number of officials had been trained in gender mainstreaming, including GRB component. Respondents, who were officials in this metropolitan municipality, seemed reluctant to take responsibility for GRB not answering clearly to questions about the training of officials in GRB policies. The researcher concluded, from the evidence presented in Table 4.19, that the corporate training for officials on GRB was not taking place.

Section 2.1 of Chapter 2 of this study clearly states that it is crucial that officials are trained by experts in the field of GRB, so that their skills,

understanding and sensitivity/responsiveness are enhanced and sharpened. According to the Economic Commission of Africa (2001: 31), one of the major problems regarding the implementation of the GRB, is the incapacity of those expected to incorporate gender into their budget submissions

- **Determine how variables such as health, housing, safety and security and education can be addressed to bring about GRB.**

In section 4.3.2 of Chapter 4, the researcher presented the argument that the rights of South Africans to health, housing, safety and security and education are guaranteed under the Constitution of 1996. The variables of health, housing, safety and security and education are critical because they are some of the key variables used to measure a country or community's levels of poverty. The ever expanding population in this metropolitan municipality, due to factors such as urbanisation, is a challenge when attempting to address its health, housing, safety and security and education needs. Poor service delivery is a major issue for many municipalities across South Africa.

It has already been stated in section 4.4.1.2 of Chapter 4, that the IDP is a crucial five-year plan that provides insights into the strategic goals and detailed actions or implementation plan for municipalities. The IDP document provides an excellent way to test/asses a particular metropolitan municipality's commitment to women empowerment and gender equality as the local budget aims to provide resources to the IDP.

The 2012/13 IDP identifies five key pillars of this metropolitan municipality's IDP. According to Jooste (2012: 9), they are:

- *The opportunity city*. The core focus of the opportunity city is the creation of an economically enabling environment, in which investments can grow and jobs created.
- *The safe city*. Safety is a broader issue that goes beyond policing. Over the next five years this metropolitan municipality will continue to dedicate resources and programmes to ensure the maximum effectiveness of the various components of safety provision.

- *The caring city.* In order to be a world class city, this metropolitan municipality must be welcoming and make residents feel at home. They should always feel that their government is doing everything it can to provide for them so that they can truly access opportunities. The needs of all groups will be catered for, all residents will be provided with amenities they need, such as parks, libraries and sports and recreational facilities, The metropolitan municipality will continue to create integrated human settlements, build houses, extend services to backyarder communities, provide primary health care and review the provision of services to informal settlements.

- *The inclusive city.* An inclusive society is one where everyone belongs and has a stake in the future. The various areas of this metropolitan municipality need to be connected to one another in order to allow people to move freely and connect with one another. The need for an integrated transport programme is critical. This metropolitan municipality aims allocate resources equitable to address the backlog of service delivery such as housing, health, safety and security and education in under-developed areas.

- *The well-run city.* Citizens need to know that their government works for them, is accountable to them and answers to them at all times. Governments manage public resources and, as such, must be scrutinised in public to ensure responsible management. In all programmes, the strict monitoring will be rigorously adhered to in order to ensure that the needs of constant service delivery are being met.

This metropolitan municipality's 2012/13 IDP prioritised health problems, such as tuberculosis and HIV, as they affect men, women, boys and girls. Regarding housing in this metropolitan municipality, the lack of a housing policy in 1997 resulted in poor management of the housing stock and poor recording of new housing delivery (Hewu, 1999: 206). In 2015, the housing backlog in this metropolitan municipality was estimated to be at 500 000 (Housing in South Africa, 2015: 1). Regarding safety and security, in June 2014 a number of directorates undertook to extend efforts to create a city in which women and children were safe, equal and able to reach their full potential (City Wide Gender Forum, 2014: 1). Although the provision of education to communities is not one of this metropolitan municipality's main

focus areas, this metropolitan municipality still considers it as one of the priority support areas (City of Cape Town Budget 2012/13).

5.4 RECOMMENDATIONS

The implementation of GRB is an important measure to monitor budgetary equity and to increase the gender responsiveness of government budgets (Reina, 2010: 15).

The African continent experienced different magnitudes of impact as a consequence of the 2008 global financial crisis, for example. Although the continent was not the most affected by the financial crisis of 2008, several countries introduced economic stimulus packages, and increased expenditure in the social sector to make their budgets more geared towards GRB (Reina, 2010: 15). In South Africa, many black people, following decades of apartheid, are still stuck in poverty. Inequality brought about by apartheid has also widened; so have unemployment and crime (Zini, 2008: 1).

The challenges of GRB identified are common in countries practicing this phenomenon (Paarven, 2010: 68). With this in mind, the following recommendations are made regarding GRB in this metropolitan municipality:

Recommendation 1

Priority needs to be given to gender equity in budget allocations, rather than budget size, because the costs required for gender mainstreaming are usually not included in national plans and government budgets (Grown, Bahadur, Hanbury and Elson, 2006: 20). Furthermore, the consistent training of key decision makers in gender mainstreaming and GRB is needed.

Recommendation 2

Policy objectives are clearly stated in budget speeches of this metropolitan municipality. However, more rules and regulations relating to GRB are

required. There is a strong rationale to integrate GRB within financial management reforms. It provides better information for policymaking, and ensures better and more equitable budgeting (Centre of Excellence in Finance, 2016).

Recommendation 3

GRB training is not adequate in this metropolitan municipality. Political commitment is stated through the national development strategy. The scope for training on GRB needs to be extended. Political leadership on GRB needs to be enhanced. Training is inevitable for disseminating the idea among related officers for proper implementation of GRB (Parveen, 2010: 61).

Regular and consistent training workshops need to be undertaken in this metropolitan municipality, with the aim of expanding capacity building regarding GRB. This could provide a first step towards inserting the gender perspective while managing scarce financial resources. It is recommended that GRB training is extended to implementers and budget officers to equip them in tracking expenditure appropriately. It is noted that this metropolitan municipality devotes a fair amount of money to women events, such as Women's Month and the 16 Days of Activism against Women and Child Abuse (Financial and Fiscal Commission, 2012: 307). However, these are just events and they do not necessarily improve the lives of women or lead to substantive equality.

Recommendation 4

Gender disaggregated data, which is one of the key performance indicators, is not available. As a result, there is no reporting on it. In this study on GRB, the Financial and Fiscal Commission (2012: 310) found that gender mainstreaming is poorly understood, with the result that mainstreaming and GRB are not taking place. This research found that not much has changed since the concept was introduced in South Africa in the late 1990's. This metropolitan municipality needs to train key decision makers in gender

mainstreaming and GRB to ensure that data is disaggregated and the data needed is easily accessible.

According to Budlender and Sharp (1998: 74), gender disaggregated data is also crucial for budget analysis. Without gender-sensitive statistics, any attempts to implement GRB would be akin to planning without facts. There's a need for this metropolitan municipality to ensure continuous collection of data in this regard.

Recommendation 5

The best condition for a sustainable GRB initiative is a process of dialogue between the government and NGOs. This will ensure that a synergy occurs between the aims, expertise and capabilities of each group. It also enhances the accountability, efficiency and effectiveness of GRB initiatives (Parveen, 2010: 62). The change of the mindset in this metropolitan municipality's senior officials and NGO staff is critical in promoting the sensitization of junior staff in gender issues. A level of cooperation needs to be expanded between government and NGOs and other community-based organisations. A common platform of understanding needs to be created by all groups involved.

Recommendation 6

Resource allocation in this metropolitan municipality does not meet the need and demand for GRB projects. Meeting the MDGs, goals of the health, housing, safety and security policies depends highly on allocation of resources, use of funds, and reprioritization of allocations.

Recommendation 7

As the respondents suggested, monitoring and evaluation of initiatives, through the selection of targets and indicators to assess budgetary inputs and outputs and their impacts on men, women, boys and girls, need to be strengthened over time.

Recommendation 8

This metropolitan municipality has still not finalised its draft gender policy and a plan of action that guides departments and directorates across the metropolitan municipality. It is recommended that this process be accelerated, in order to help ensure and guide municipal officials and stakeholders in the implementation of the GRB initiative.

Recommendation 9

During the interview process for this research, officials indicated that some GRB is taking place, albeit in an ad hoc manner. However, this metropolitan municipality needs to develop a monitoring and evaluation system that supports gender-responsive reporting across all departments.

Recommendation 10

In this metropolitan municipality, the Human Resource Department is responsible for the recruitment and appointment of staff. Directorates such as housing, health and safety and security are encouraged to improve their recruitment procedures to attract people, especially senior male or female candidates that are passionate about redressing social inequalities in the various communities.

Sensitivity to issues of GRB and empowerment is important in the recruitment process as being a woman does not necessarily mean that one is passionate about the subject. There are a number of men who are as sensitive as some women activists in this area. Therefore, the attraction and appointment processes must not be simplistic.

Recommendation 11

The five-year IDP needs to be constantly updated and revisited by city authorities, so that they can better plan, manage and implement their actions.

Phenomena such as changing population patterns and urbanisation mean that officials need to gather fresh data on an on-going basis, so they can better plan for the provision of health, housing, safety and security and education. However, they still need to consider factors such as time, money, availability of skills and the general viability of carrying out such an exercise all the time. IDP's should make an allowance for factors such as changing political patterns and urbanization.

5.5 SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

This study aimed to explore the extent of the compliance to GRB in one of South Africa's largest urban municipalities. It focused on variables, such as health, housing, safety and security and education, which are considered to be some of the most important indicators in addressing poverty and inequality. These areas were chosen because they are some of the well-known variables to ease the plight of marginalised groups and, as such, are good quality of life indicators (Budlender 2012: 304).

The following recommendations are suggested for further research:

Research in GRB be extended to include more sectors and departments in national government in general, such as education and agriculture. This would assist them in further fulfilling their commitments in economic development and poverty reduction. Government would also better monitor and evaluate the gender impacts of policies and programmes. Having more government departments adopt GRB would also be beneficial for the generalization of the factors affecting the implementation of GRB.

The Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing 1995 propelled many governments to affirm their commitment to gender equality and to use their budgets to translate their gender equality commitments into fiscal commitments (Financial and Fiscal Commission 2012: 303). Despite the growing research into GRB, more needs to be done to fill the gaps that have been left by other researchers. For example, there needs to be further

research and updated data on how men, women, boys and girls pay for and use services such as health, housing, safety and security and education. The availability of such information may allow municipalities to plan more carefully for the provision of these services.

Research be extended to develop a guide book for all municipalities on GRB. This may help communities and their councillors to better define their own needs in their respective communities.

Further research on how much NGO's contribute to service delivery in municipalities. Unlike many other developing countries, South Africa does not include these amounts when reporting on its budget (Budlender, 1998: 55).

5.6 CONCLUSION

The aim and objectives of this research study have been met as they have been outlined (paragraph 5.3 Discussion of this study). GRB is a comparatively new area. There is no blue print for applying it and GRB is also not the end. It is only a means for achieving gender equality. The challenges identified are common for the countries practicing GRB (Parveen, 2010: 68). The challenges encountered in the field can be addressed through coordinated efforts of all the related actors. Donors and NGOs are potential actors, who can enrich the endeavour taken by the South African government. However, the lack of political will and proper legislation in South Africa are threatening to impede the work and progress made by some activists of GRB. In this chapter, a summary of the research project has been given. The discussion on GRB and the recommendations for this metropolitan municipality were also presented.

LIST OF REFERENCES

Arthritis Research. 2014. *Self-Help and Daily Living: Taking Part in Research*. UK. Available at www.arthritisresearchuk.org (Accessed 26 January 2017).

Auditor General South Africa. 2011. Available at www.capetown.gov.za/.../CityreceivesawardfromAuditorGeneralforitscleanaudit.aspx (Accessed 12 April 2014).

Barclay, D. J. 2009. *Strategic Planning and Budgeting in the Mining Qualifications Authority (MQA)*. University of South Africa.

Beins, B. C. 2009. *Research Methods: A Tool For Life*. 2nd Edition. Pearson. New York.

Briones, L.M. and Valdez, G.O. 2002. *Institutionalizing Gender-Responsive Budgeting in the Phillipines: The Beginning*. University of the Phillipines.

Budlender, D. 1998. *The South African Women's Budget Initiative*. Cape Town, South Africa.

Budlender, D. 2001. *Review of Gender Budget Initiatives*. Community Agency for Social Enquiry. Cape Town, South Africa.

Budlender, D. 1998. *The South African Women's Initiative: Background Paper no2*. Community Agency for Social Enquiry. Cape Town, South Africa.

Budlender, D. 1998. *The South African Women's Budget Initiative, presented as Background Paper No. 2, Meeting on Women and Political Participation: 21st Century Challenges*. United Nations Development, New York.

Budlender, D. and Sharp, R. 1998. *How To Do A Gender-Sensitive Budget Analysis: Contemporary Research and Practice*, Australian Agency for

International Development. Canberra and the Commonwealth Secretariat. London.

Budlender, D. and Woolard, I. 2012. *Income Inequality and Social Grants: Ensuring Social Assistance for Children in Need. South African Child Gauge*. University of Cape Town, South Africa.

Budlender, D. 2012. *South Africa's Experience in Gender-Responsive Budgeting*. UN Women Southern African Regional Office, SADC.

Brussels Conference Communique. 2001. Available at http://www.gender-budgets.org/index.php?option=com_contentview=articleid=195 (Accessed 7 April 2016).

Cagatay, N, Keklik, M, Lal, R. and Lang, J. 2000. *Budgets as if People Mattered: Democratizing Macroeconomic Policies*. UN World Conference, Beijing.

Centre of Excellence in Finance. 2016. *Excellent Opportunity to Discuss Increasing Importance of Gender Responsive Budgeting*. Ukraine. Available at <http://www.cef-see.org/excellent-opportunity-to-discuss-increasing-importance-of-gender-responsive-budgeting-2016-03-21> (Accessed 20 May 2016).

City Aims For Gender Equality. 2004. Available at <http://www.capetown.gov.za> (Accessed 5 May 2015).

City of Cape Town Budget. 2012/13. Available at <http://www.capetown.gov.za> (Accessed 12 April 2014).

City of Cape Town Budget. 2012/13 to 2014/15. Available at <http://www.capetown.gov.za> (Accesses 6 May 2015).

City of Cape Town Budget. 2012/13 to 2014/15. Available at https://www.capetown.gov.za/en/Budget/Documents/T4IB03577_Budget_web_small.pdf (Accesses 6 May 2015).

City of Cape Town 2011 Census. Trends and Change–10 Years: Census 2001-Census 2011. Available at http://www.capetown.gov.za/en/stats/Documents/2011Census/2011_Census_Cape_Town_Profile_Change_from_2001-2011.pdf (Accessed 12 April 2014).

City of Cape Town Council Overview. 2011/12. Available at http://www.capetown.gov.za/en/stats/CityReports/Documents/CoCT_Councillor_handbook_v3.pdf (Accessed 11 May 2015).

City of Cape Town Councillor Handbook. Available at www.capetown.gov.za/.../CityReports/.../CoCT_Councillor_handbook_v3.pdf (Accessed 13 April 2014).

City of Cape Town Integrated Development Plan 2003/04. Available at <https://www.capetown.gov.za/en/IDP/Pages/pREVIOUSIDPs.aspx> (Accessed 13 April 2014).

City of Cape Town IDP. 2012/13. Review. Five-Year Plan for the City 2012 - 2017. Available at www.capetown.gov.za (Accessed 1 August 2016).

City of Cape Town. 2014. Mayor Calls for Review of Local Government Model Following SONA. Available at www.capetown.gov.za (Accessed 19 June 2014).

City Wide Gender Forum Calls For An End To Violence Against Women and Children. 2014. Available at <https://www.capetown.gov.za/en/mayor/CorporateServices/Pages/CityWideGenderForumcallsagainstwomen.aspx> (Accessed 5 May 2014).

City Press. 2014. *Are Our Municipal Bosses Qualified?*. City Press. 23 February 2014.

Clark, V. L. P. and Creswell, J. W. 2008. *The Mixed Methods Reader*. Lincoln. SAGE Publications. University of Nebraska.

Commonwealth Secretariat. 2014. Gender and Economic Development. Available at <http://secretariat.thecommonwealth.org/Internal/190683/190810/250635/250669/genderandeconomicdevelopment> (Accessed 19 June 2014).

Concept and Definition of Gender Budgeting. 2014. Available at <http://wcd.nic.in/gbhb/Linkhandbookchap.pdf> (Accessed 2 August 2014).

Corner, L. and Repucci, S. 2009. *A User's Guide to Measuring Gender-Sensitive Basic Service Delivery*. United Nations Development Fund for Women, New York.

Corporate Services Department. 2015. *Employment Equity*. Available at <https://www.capetown.gov.za/en/mayor/CorporateServices/Pages/CorporateServicesDepartments1204-9370.aspx> (Accessed 8 August 2015).

Country Corruption Assessment Report, South Africa. 2003. United Nations and Department of Public Service and Administration. Available at <http://www.westerncape.gov.za/text/2004/4/sacorruptionassessmentreport2003.pdf> (Accessed 8 May 2014).

Creswell, J. W. 2003. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches*. 2nd Edition. Sage Publications. London.

Davies, M. and Hughes, N. 2014. *Doing a Successful Research Project: Using Qualitative or Quantitative Methods*. Palgrave MacMillan. United Kingdom.

Delamont, S., Atkinson, P, & Parry, O. 1997. *Supervising the PHD*. Open University Press. Buckingham.

Department of Basic Education, 2015. No 36837. Available at <http://www.education.gov.za/LinkClick.aspxfileticket=fJ2BPEDF6AmU3Dtabid=188mid=1756> (Accessed 9 August 2015).

Department of Women, Children and People with Disabilities. 2014. Available at www.southafrica.info (Accessed 11 February 2014).

Department of Social Development Department. 2013. Minister's speech at the occasion of the inauguration of the advisory committee on the future payment of grants in South Africa. Available at <http://www.dsd.gov.za> (Accessed 24 September 2014).

Denhardt, J.V. & Denhardt, R. B. 2011. *The New Public Service: Serving, Not Steering*. Third Edition. M.E. Sharpe. New York.

Diversity Management. 2014. *Internal Project Showcase: World Design Capital*. Cape Town. Available at <http://www.capetown.gov.za> (Accessed 5 May 2015).

Dlulisa, L. 2013. *Gender Responsive Budgeting IMFO Women in Local Government Seminar ELICC*. South African Local Government Association.

Draft Policy Discussion Document. 2012. *Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality*. Available at http://www.academia.edu/9005679/The_implementation_of_gender_equality_policies_in_achieving_millennium_development_goal_three_in_the_Sedibeng_District_Municipality (Accessed 8 August 2015).

Draft Women and Empowerment and Gender Equality Policy. 2014. Available at http://www.westerncape.gov.za/your_gov/33/documents/policie/D (Accessed 13 April 2014).

Economic Commission of Africa. 2001. *Compendium of Best Practices on Gender Mainstreaming, Engendering National Budgets: The Case of Tanzania*. Available at: <http://www.uneca.org>. (Accessed 8 MAY 2014).

Education and Training Unit for Democracy and Development. 2012. *Understanding Local Government*. Available <http://www.etu.org.za/toolbox/docs/localgov/webundrstdlocgov.html> (Accessed 12 April 2014).

Education Training Unit. 2013. Available at www.onesocietyinitiative.org (Accessed 13 June 2013).

Elson, D. and Sharp, R. 2010. *Gender Responsive Budgeting and Women's Poverty, Concepts, Research, Policy*. Cheltenham, UK.

Financial and Fiscal Commission. 2012. *Assessing Gender Responsive Budgeting in Local Government*. Available at www.ffc.co.za/.../277-chapter-10-assessin (Accessed 12 April 2014).

Fluid Surveys. 2014. *Maximize Response and Minimize Bias with the Proper Survey Structure*. Available at fluidsurveys.com/university/maximize-response-rates-minimize-bias-proper-survey-struture (Accessed 17 May 2016).

Gender Responsive Budgeting. 2014. United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women. Available at <http://www.gender-budgets.org/> (Accessed 28 July 2014).

Gender Responsive Budgeting and Women's Reproductive Rights: A Resource Pack. 2006. United Nations Development Fund for Women. New York. Available at http://www.afghangendercafe.org/Uploads/686_filename_gender_eng.pdf (Accessed 28 July 2014).

Gillham, B. 2000. *The Research Interview*. Bloomsbury Publishing. London and New York.

Govender, P. 1996. 'Foreword'. In Budlender, D. *The Women's Budget*. IDASA, Cape Town.

Grown, C., Bahadur, C., Handbury, J. and Elson, D. 2006. *The Financial Requirements of Achieving Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment*. The Levy Economics Institute of Bard College working paper, no 467. Available at http://www.levy.org/pubs/wp_467.pdf (Accessed 15 July 2015).

Haseen, E. 2008. *South Africa and the Global Economic Crisis*. Available at <http://www.hivos.net/Knowledge-Programme2/Projects/Beyond-economics/South-Africa-and-the-global-economic-crisis> (Accessed 16 July 2015).

Hewu, X. 1999. (ed) Budlender, D. *The Fourth Women's Budget, Women's Budget Initiative*. IDASA, Cape Town.

Hicks, J. 2012. *Commission for Gender Equality: Gender Equity in South Africa: Progress and Challenges*. Commission for Gender Equality. Braamfontein.

Holtzhausen, S. 2001. *Triangulation as a powerful tool to strengthen the qualitative research design: The Resource-based Learning Career Preparation Programme (RBLCPP) as a case study*. Lancaster University. United Kingdom.

Housing in South Africa. 2015. Cape Chameleon. Available at <http://www.capechameleon.co.za/printed-issue/issue-13/human-rights3/> (Accessed 13 January 2016).

Howell, J. 2003. *Women's Organizations and Civil Society in China Making a Difference*. International Feminist Journal of Politics 5.

Human Development Report. 2010. *The Real Wealth of Nations: Pathways to Human Development*. 20th Anniversary Edition. Available at <http://hdr.undp.org/en/reports/global/hdr2010/chapters/> (Accessed 5 May 2015).

Hussey, J. and R. Hussey. 1997. *Business Research: A Practical Guide for Undergraduate and Postgraduate Students*. Macmillan. London.

Independent Commission of Inquiry. 2012. Premier of the Western Cape. Available at <http://www.khayelitshacommission.org.za> (Accessed 26 August 2014).

International Development Research Centre. 2009. China Public Budget Reform Program – Phase II. IDRC. http://www.idrc.ca/en/ev-134121-201-1-DO_TOPIC.html (Accessed 22 October 2016).

International Labour Organisation. 2014. *Overview of Gender-Responsive Budget Initiatives*. Bureau for Gender Equality. Available at www.ilo.org/dyn/.../OverviewoGRBInitiative.doc (Accessed 15 April 2014).

Jhamb, B. Mishra, Y. and Sinha, N. 2013. *The Paradox of Gender Responsive Budgeting. Perspectives*. UN Women's Office for India.

Johnson, G. 2014. *Research Methods for Public Administrators*. 3rd Edition. M.E. Sharpe. New York.

Jooste, F. 2012. *City Draft Budget 2012/13: Preliminary Analysis*. Version 3. Ndifuna Ukwazi: Dare To Know. Cape Town, South Africa.

Keller, B. 2002: *Mainstreaming Gender Equality*. Sida. Stockholm.

Kruger, D. J. 2003. *Integrating Quantitative and Qualitative Methods in Community Research*. *The Community Psychologist*. ISSN: 0090-4392, 36: 18-19. United States.

Licha, S. 2004. *Citizens in Charge: Managing Local Budgets in East Asia and Latin America*. Inter-American Development Bank. Washington, D.C.

Lo, F.A. and Alami N. 2011. *Budgeting to End Gender Inequalities in the Education Sector*. UN Women, New York.

Mallya, U. 2014. *Tanzania Gender Networking Programme: A Case Study for Gender Budgeting In Tanzania*. Initiative for Transforming and Mainstreaming Gender into National Planning and Budgeting Processes and Macro-Economic Policies in Tanzania.

McBurney, D. H. 1994. *Research Methods*. Third Edition. University of Pittsburgh: Brooks/ Cole Publishing Company. California.

Mehta, V. 2017. *What is BRICS?*. Available at <https://www.quora.com> (Accessed 26 January 2017).

Mexican Government. 2012. *Mexican Government Prioritizes Youth Sexual and Reproductive Health*. Available at <https://www.ippfwhr.org/en/blog/mexican-government-prioritizes-youth-sexual-and-reproductive-health> (Accessed 24 September 2014).

Minister Lulu Xingwana. 2014. *National Assembly Debate on Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill*. Available at <http://www.gov.za/speeches/view.phpsid=44087> (Accessed 16 June 2014).

Millennium Development Goals. 2013. Country Report. Available at http://beta2.statssa.gov.za/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/MDGR_Report_2013_Final.pdf. (Accessed 9 May 2014).

Millennium Development Goals. 2014. South Africa. Index Mundi. Available at http://www.indexmundi.com/south_africa/millennium-development-goals.html (Accessed 2 August 2014).

Moody's Investor Service. 2013. *Moody's Disclosures on Credit Ratings of City of Cape Town*. Available at https://www.moodys.com/research/Moodys-Disclosures-on-Credit-Ratings-of-City-of-Cape-Town--PR_288971 (Accessed 15 April 2014).

Mouton, J. 2001. *How to Succeed In Your Master's and Doctoral Studies: A South African Guide and Resource Book*. Van Schaik Publishers. Pretoria.

Nandy, S. 2007. *Opening remarks: Gender Responsive Budgeting Seminar*, Beijing. UNDP. Available at www.undp.org (Accessed 2 August 2014).

National Victim Survey. 2012. Statistics South Africa.

Nishishiba, M. Jones, M. and Kraner, M. 2014. *Research Methods and Statistics for Public and Non-Profit Administrators: A Practical Guide*. SAGE. Los Angeles.

Norwegian Ministry of Children and Equality. 2007. *Guide to Gender Equality Assessment and Discussion in Ministry Budgets Propositions*, Government Administration Services.

Office on the Status of Women. 2012. Available at www.dwcpcd.gov.za (Accessed 6 June 2013).

O'Sullivan, E. and Rassel, G. and Berner, M. 2008. *Research Methods for Public Administrators*. 5th Edition. Pearson Longman. New York.

Overview of Gender-Responsive Budget Initiatives. 2014. *A Discussion Paper for ILO Staff on the Relevance of Gender-Responsive Budget Initiatives in Promoting Gender Equality in Decent Work Country Programmes*. Bureau for Gender Equality, ILO. Available at <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/gender/docs/RES/498/F1229023063/OverviewofGRBInitiatives.doc> (Accessed 30 July 2014).

Oxfam. 2005. *Gender Responsive Budgeting in Education: Education and Gender Equality Series*. London, Oxfam. Available at [http://www.unescobkk.org/fileadmin/user_upload/epr/MTEF/04Financial_Planning/01Budgeting_Process/040115001OxfamGB20\(2007\).pdf](http://www.unescobkk.org/fileadmin/user_upload/epr/MTEF/04Financial_Planning/01Budgeting_Process/040115001OxfamGB20(2007).pdf) (Accessed 2 August 2014).

Pauw, J. C., Van der Linde, G. J. A., Fourie, D. & Visser, C.B. 2015, *Managing Public Money*, 3RD Edition. Pearson. Cape Town.

Parveen, B. 2010. *Gender Responsive Budgeting in Bangladesh: An Assessment of Challenges and Opportunities in Health Sector*. MA Thesis, North South University.

Plato Training and Consulting. 2014. *Gender Budgeting for NGO's*. Available at <http://www.platotrainingandconsulting.com/gender-budgeting-for-ngos/> (Accessed 16 April 2014).

Promoting Women's Participation and Gender Responsive Budgeting. 2014. Nicaragua, From Rhetoric to Reality. MDG Achievement Fund. Available <http://www.mdgfund.org/program/rhetoricrealitypromotingwomensparticipationandgenderresponsivebudgeting>. (Accessed 2 August 2014).

Reina, I. 2010. *Gender Responsive Budgeting in Education - Advocacy Brief*. UNESCO, Bangkok.

Renato, B. and Rubem, C. 2011. *Trade amongst BRICS: Still a Bumping Road from a Brazilian Perspective*. Available at <http://sistemas.mre.gov.br/> (Accessed 1 August 2016).

Republic of South Africa. *Treasury Report 2013*. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. 1996. *Bill of Rights, Constitution of the Republic of South Africa*. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. 1996. *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa*. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. 2013. *Department of Provincial and Local Government*. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. *Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998*. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. *Municipal Finance Management Act 56 of 2003*. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. *Local Government Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000*. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Rubin, H.J. & Rubin, I.S. 1995. *Qualitative Interviewing: The Art of Hearing Data*. Sage. London.

SA To Reinstate Sexual Offences Courts. 2013. SouthAfrica.info. Available at <http://www.southafrica.info/services/court-070813.htm> (Accessed 13 June 2014).

Sawer, M. 1999. *The Watchers within: Women and the Australian State Women, Public Policy and the State*. South Yarra. MacMillan. Australia.

SA: Statement by the National Treasury, on Local Government Revenue and Expenditure. 2014. Polity.Org. Available at <http://www.polity.org.za/article/sa-statement-by-the-national-treasury-on-local-government-revenue-and-expenditure-03060213-2013-06-03> (Accessed 16 June 2014).

Shah, A. 2006. *Participatory Budgeting*, The World Bank, Washington D. C. Available at: <http://www.worldbank.org>. (Accessed 10 June 2012).

Sharp, R. & Broomhill, R. 1998. *Government Budgets and Women: Shaking the foundations*. Policy Makers and Policy Shakers Sydney: Allen and Unwin.

Sharp, R. & Broomhill, R. 2002. *Budgeting for Equality. The Australian Experience*, Feminist Economics Volume 8, Issue 1.

Sharp, 2003. *Budgeting For Equity: Gender Budget Initiatives within a Framework of Performance Oriented Budgeting*. UNIFEM, New York.

South Africa 2011 Census. *Trends and Change—10 Years: Census 2001-Census 2011*. Available at http://www.capetown.gov.za/en/stats/Documents/2011Census/2011_Census_Cape_Town_Profile_Change_from_2001-2011.pdf (Accessed April 2014).

South African Institute of Race Relations. 2014. *Living Conditions and Communication*. Available at <http://irr.org.za/> (Accessed 17 June 2014).

South African Qualifications Authority. 2014. *Certificate: Municipal Financial Management*. Available at <http://regqs.sqa.org.za/showQualification.phpid=48965> (Accessed 8 June 2014).

Spinks, C. 2001. *A New Apartheid?: Urban Spatiality, Fear of Crime and Segregation in South Africa*. Working Paper Series. The London School of Economics.

State of the Nation Address. 2014. Pretoria: Government Printer. (Accessed 13 February 2014).

State of the Province Address. 2014. Speech by Helen Zille: Premier of the Western Cape. Western Cape Provincial Legislature. (Accessed 5 May 2015).

Statistics on Post-School Education and Training. 2011. Available on <http://www.saqqa.org.za/docs/papers/2013/stats2011.pdf> (Accessed 12 August 2015).

Statistics South Africa. 2014. *The South Africa I know. The Home I understand. Education a Road Map Out of Poverty?*. Available at <http://beta2.statssa.gov.za/>. (Accessed 9 May 2014).

Statistics South Africa. 2014. *Poverty Trends*. Available at <http://beta2.statssa.gov.za/?p=2566> (Accessed 5 MAY 2015).

Stride, M. 2014. Pursuing the Right to Education. July 18. Cape Times (Accessed 5 May 2015).

Stotsky, J.G. 2007. *Budgeting with Women in Mind, Finance and Development*. Available at www.imf.org (Accessed 1 August 2016).

Social Development Strategy. 2011. Available at <http://www.cityofcapetown.gov.za> (Accessed 5 May 2015).

South Africa Overview. 2014. World Bank. Available at <http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/southafrica/overview> (Accessed 2 August 2014).

The Division of Instructional Innovation and Assessment. 2008. University of Texas. United States.

The Western Cape Story. 2009 -2014. A Record of Delivery for All. Democratic Alliance. Available at www.da.org.za (Accessed 23 October 2016).

Thuthuzela Care Centres Cape Town. 2014. Available at <http://www.npa.gov.za/UploadedFiles/THUTHUZELABrochureNew.pdf> (Accessed 1 July 2014).

The Presidency: India-Brazil-South Africa (IBSA) Dialogue Forum. 2011. Republic of South Africa. Available at <http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/pebble.aspx?id=5053> (Accessed 5 August 2014).

The South African Child Support Grant Impact Assessment. 2014. UNICEF. Available at http://www.unicef.org/southafrica/SAF_resources_csg2012sum.pdf (Accessed 24 September 2014).

United Nations. Gender Responsive Budgeting. Available at: <http://www.gender-budgets.org/> (Accessed 1 June 2012).

UNIFEM. 2000. *Progress of the World's Women: A New Biennial Report.* New York, UNIFEM. Available at http://www.unifem.org/materials/item_detail.phpProductID=9 (Accessed 2 August 2014).

UNIFEM. 2005. *Progress Report on Enhancing Human Security Through Gender Equality in the Context of HIV/AIDS.* UNIFEM. (Accessed 2 August 2014).

UN Women. 1995. *Fourth World Conference on Women. United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women.* Available at <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/beijingdeclaration.html> (Accessed 2 August 2014).

UN Women. 2011. *Gender Responsive Budgeting. United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women. UN.* New York. Available at http://www.gender-budgets.org/index.php?option=com_contentview=articleid=15Itemid=187 (Accessed 5 August 2014).

USC Libraries. 2014. *Limitations of the Study – Organising Your Social Sciences Research Paper*. Available at <http://libguides.usc.edu/content.php?id=83009&sid=616083>

Van der Mescht, J and Van Jaarsveld, M. 2014. Addressing Operations and Maintenance Challenges in Smaller Municipalities. Aurecon. Infrastructure News and Service Delivery. Available at <http://www.infrastructurene.ws/2013/03/11/challenges-in-smaller-municipalities> (Accessed 16 June 2014).

Vogt, W. P. and Gardner, D.C. and Haeffele, L.M. 2012: *When To Use What Research Design*. The Guilford Press. New York.

What Is The Difference Between A Centralized Government And A Decentralized Government?. 2014. Available at <https://answers.yahoo.com/question/index?qid=20080205031914AADScp4> (Accessed 2 August 2014).

Western Cape Crime Overview. *2012/13 Analysis of Crime Statistics as Released by the South African Police Service on 19 September 2014*. Western Cape Department of Community Safety. Available at www.westerncape.gov.za (Accessed 1 August 2016).

Western Cape Government. 2012. *Budget Highlights*. Available at https://www.westerncape.gov.za/other/2012/3/2012_wc_provincial_budget_highlights.pdf (Accessed 11 May 2015).

Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality Draft Policy. *A Draft Policy Discussion Document for the City of Cape Town*. 2014. Available at http://www.westerncape.gov.za/text/2004/8/draft_gender_policy_updated_july_04.pdf (Accessed 1 August 2016).

World Bank. 2012. *South Africa Is One Of The Most Unequal Societies In The World*. Global Education Magazine. International Day for the Eradication of

Poverty. Available at www.globaleducationmagazine.com. (Accessed 9 May 2014).

World Population Statistics. 2013. *China Population 2013*. Available at <http://www.worldpopulationstatistics.com/china-population-2013> (Accessed 27 July 2016).

Women's Charter for Effective Equality. 1994. African National Congress. South Africa's National Liberation Movement. Available at <http://www.anc.org.za/show.phpid=233> (Accessed 30 July 2014).

Write.com. 2014. Data Triangulation: How the Triangulation of Data Strengthens Your Research. Available at <http://www.write.com/writing-guides/research-writing/research-process/data-triangulation-how-the-triangulation-of-data-strengthens-your-research> (Accessed 1 May 2014).

Zini, M. 2008. *The Impact of the Financial Crisis on South Africa*. Available at <http://blogs.worldbank.org/african/the-impact-of-the-financial-crisis-on-south-africa> (Accessed 15 July 2015).