PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP IN THE PROVISION OF SECONDARY EDUCATION IN THE GABORONE CITY AREA OF BOTSWANA

by

KITSO NKAIWA SEDISA

Submitted in accordance with the requirements
for the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

PROMOTER: PROF E C STRÖH

JOINT PROMOTER: PROF D J BRYNARD

JUNE 2008

RECOGNITION AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

THESIS DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my wife Gomotsegang and our three children Neo, Tshepo and Kitso Junior, for their consistent moral support. Their patience and relentless encouragement made the completion of this research possible. Whereas this work represents a personal achievement, it is a special guidance to the rest of my family that with commitment and perseverance to ones personal goals, nothing is impossible.

DECLARATION

Student number: 410-504-4

I declare that **'Public-Private partnership in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area of Botswana'** is my own work and that all the resources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

....
SIGNATURE   DATE
(MR K N SEDISA)

SUMMARY

Public sector organisations are established in order to promote the quality of citizen's lives through the provision of public services. However, the demands for public services often outstrip the limited resources at the disposal of the public sector for the delivery of such services. Public-private partnerships (PPPs) are emerging as an important tool of public policy to deliver public infrastructure and the attendant services.

The main aim of this study is to establish the extent to which PPPs can be used to improve the quality of the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana. The study includes a conceptual analysis of the nature of the public services in general, and in particular, the nature and the provision of secondary education in Botswana with specific reference to the Gaborone City area. The study also includes a conceptual analysis of PPPs as gleaned from published literature. Various dimensions of PPPs are analysed and these include but are not limited to definitions, benefits, models and the antecedents for the successful implementation of PPPs. Among the various models that are analysed in the study, the design, build, operate and finance (DBOF) model is preferred for improving the quality of the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana.

In addition to the conceptual analysis, an empirical research study is undertaken in which the secondary school heads are the respondents to a structured questionnaire. The results of the empirical research support the conceptual analysis to the extent that in both cases, it is possible to improve the quality of the delivery of secondary education through PPPs. More secondary schools can be built and more facilities be made available to schools. Through the use of PPPs, most if not all learners can receive the entire secondary education programme, from junior to senior secondary education. Existing secondary schools can be modernised through PPPs. Ancillary services can be delivered by the organisations that have the necessary expertise. Certain antecedents

for the successful implementation of PPPs are necessary. Through PPPs, secondary schools can be made attractive and intellectually stimulating.

KEY TERMS

Public service

Public-private partnerships

Secondary education

Private sector

Quality of service

Public infrastructure

Customer satisfaction

Quality Schooling

Innovation

Socio-economic development

Risk transfer

Resources

Efficiency

Output specification

GLOSSARY

The following acronyms are used in this thesis:

AIDS	Acquired Immuno-Deficiency Syndrome
BGCSE	Botswana Government Certificate of Secondary Education
DBOF	Design, Build Operate and Finance
DBFOO	Design, Build, Finance, Own and Operate
DBFT	Design, Build, Finance and Transfer
DSE	Department of Secondary Education
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
HIV	Human Immuno-Deficiency Virus
ILO	International Labour Organisation
JC	Junior Certificate
MOE	Ministry of Education
NDP9	National Development Plan 9
PPPs	Public-Private Partnerships

RNPE   Revised National Policy on Education

UNESCO   United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

Vfm   Value for money

UK   United Kingdom

USA   United States of America

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1   INTRODUCTION

The central focus of this thesis is the public-private partnership in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana. The intent of this chapter is to set out the nature and scope of the thesis as well as to outline its structure. The background and rationale, which set the tone of the thesis, are presented in this chapter and so is the problem statement and the hypothesis. Moreover, key concepts are elucidated, albeit briefly, in this chapter but dealt with more elaborately in the rest of the thesis. The nature of the research and the concomitant research questions are also the subject of this chapter. Besides, the purpose and significance of the topic of the thesis are also presented in the chapter. Finally, the exposition of the chapters of the thesis is given as well.

1.2   BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE

There are currently 27 government senior secondary schools in the whole of Botswana and four of them are in the Gaborone area. In the same area, there are 19 government junior secondary schools which feed the aforementioned senior schools. There are also six private secondary schools in the area but these schools offer universal secondary education in tandem.   Although each of these private schools offers the entire spectrum of secondary education, they remain smaller than any of the four government senior secondary schools in the area in question. It should also be added that Gaborone is the capital city of Botswana and, according to the 2001 Population Census, its population was 186,007 people whilst that of the country was 1,680,863 (National Development Plan 2003:11).

In Botswana, there is adequate capacity in junior secondary schools to

accommodate all primary school leaving learners. However, the Government senior secondary schools have the capacity to absorb about 50 percent of the junior secondary school leavers which is in line with the prevailing policy of the Government of Botswana (Government Paper No. 2 of 1994:23). It is in this document where the *current* Botswana Education Policy is articulated following the report of the Presidential Commission on Education that was appointed in 1992. The other 50 percent of the junior secondary school leavers are expected to find places in vocational institutions which are likewise unable to absorb all the remaining learners. Most, if not all, parents would like their children to complete secondary education and not to stop after completing junior secondary education.

Senior secondary schools are unable to accommodate every junior secondary school leaver due to limited resources. The Government of Botswana has invariably attributed the restricted transition rate to, amongst other things, lack of adequate funds. Botswana, like many other developing countries, has experienced a succession of budget deficits since the 1998/99 financial year and at the same time the foreign reserves were said to be on the wane (Mmegi Monitor 2002:2). Budget deficits which have in recent years become a seemingly permanent feature of budget speeches in countries like Botswana suggest that the demand for resources outstrips available revenue. The worsening fiscal outlook could be viewed as a source of motivation for implementing the slogan of "working smarter and producing better results" (Lawton 1998:12). It is not uncommon to hear political leaders and senior government officials calling on the business community to improve its scope of activities and be more competitive internationally and at the same time suggesting that the government can only create an enabling environment. However, the government should also be seen to be improving in its operations because in the context of a national economy, the two sectors complement each other and, more importantly, they can work in partnership with each other. This is also true in the provision of secondary education.

The public is becoming more aware that the management of private

organisations is result-oriented so much so that such organisations achieve more with less resources. The general populace therefore expects public organisations to match their private counterparts in terms of performance, this is value for money and customer service (Popovich 1998:13). Taxes are a very important source of government revenue but to simply raise taxes is usually opposed and regarded as electorally imprudent. Besides, there is skepticism about the efficiency and effectiveness of the Government services giving rise to demands for value for money. In view of all this, public-private partnership in the delivery of a particular public service should be explored. Moore (1995: 21) has observed that "society needs value seeking imaginations (and associated technical skills) from its public sector executives no less than from its private sector managers." Both the public and the private sectors are very important to the wellbeing of any society.

Public-private partnership in the delivery of a public service, such as secondary education, has the potential of improving the quality of such a service. This is predicated on the view that public-private partnership "recognizes that both the public sector and the private sector have certain advantages relative to the other in the performance of specific tasks. By allowing each sector to do what it does best, public services and infrastructure can be provided in the most economically efficient manner" (Cowen 2004:31). Closely allied to this perception, Subramoney (2003:14) observed that "the structure of the African economies lends itself to strong public-private partnership and, properly managed, could prove a welcome boost to these economies." This partnership however, requires a major paradigm shift in Botswana in general and, in particular, in the provision of secondary education. This is because in Botswana, people are used to primary and secondary education being entirely the responsibility of the Government except for a few private schools. This state of affairs has been a source of problems related to limited resources.

1.3   PROBLEM STATEMENT AND HYPOTHESIS

The basic economic problem is also a topical one and pertains to providing for

unlimited public needs with limited means (Swart 1992:2). The Ministry of Education, like many other public organisations in Botswana, does not seem to meet public needs and expectations in terms of both infrastructure and service delivery. Junior secondary school leavers in the Gaborone area, like in the rest of the country, are jostling for limited spaces in the available senior secondary schools. In the end, only about 50 percent of them are accepted albeit in schools bedeviled with various problems (National Development Plan 2003:12).

Secondary schools are not properly maintained as many school buildings are in a state of disrepair and the responsibility for maintaining them lies with the Department of Buildings and Electrical Services in a different ministry. The Ministry of Education has no authority over such a department and requests for maintenance of buildings do not seem to be urgently attended to. The current (2007) Minister of Finance and Development Planning, Mr Gaolatlhe, lamented that some of the schools had been without maintenance work for as long as fifteen years. Indiscipline in these schools is rife and has contributed to the appalling state of school buildings, a concern that has often been raised by secondary school heads at their annual conferences.

The quality of education in Botswana is generally perceived to be low and secondary education is no exception and this is a topical issue in the country. Secondary school teachers, in particular, are ever complaining about poor conditions of service and, in the recent past, have boycotted classes on several occasions. Consequently, local teachers appear to be more demotivated than their expatriate counterparts (Botswana Guardian, 23 January 2004). However, most expatriate teachers whose contracts are coming to an end have not been renewed since 2004 and onwards in order to give way to the local teachers who have recently graduated (Teaching Service Management:2004). There may be sufficient justification for doing that but the result of substituting experienced teachers for inexperienced ones *en masse* can compromise the quality of education at least in the short run. In view of this, it does appear that the Government of Botswana is, on its own, struggling in the delivery of secondary education in the country. Relating to the aforementioned problem,

the following hypothesis will be investigated in this thesis:

"The quality of delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area can be improved by public–private partnership."

Anecdotal evidence shows that in Botswana, junior secondary schools classes have as many as 45 students and such classes are too big for teachers to handle. In particular, attention to individual students with learning difficulties is bound to be highly compromised in such large classes. Marking of tests and assignments then becomes an arduous task for teachers which can make them unable to provide timely feedback to the students. All of this does not enhance the quality of education delivered in these schools.

Essentially, the aim of the study is to establish whether the aforementioned hypothesis is true or not. Babbie (2004:64) views a hypothesis as a specified testable expectation about empirical reality that follows from a more general proposition. It is a statement, based on known facts, that is used as a basis for reasoning or investigation. As a basis for investigation, a hypothesis defines the locus and focus of an empirical research project. This hypothesis is intended to test the extent to which a public-private partnership can improve the quality of secondary education delivery in Botswana in general and, in particular, the Gaborone City area. In this area, as stated in paragraph 1.2, there are six relatively small privately owned secondary schools that are known to deliver high quality education and produce good results and also maintain better discipline. As a result, affluent families send their children to these schools instead of government schools. This includes people in senior government services. Such preference for private schools to government ones by top government officials suggests some measure of superiority of the private schools over the government ones. However, children from even the poorest families also deserve the best education more so if such education has the potential to break the cycle of poverty.

Consequently, many questions can be asked about the feasibility of public-

private partnerships in the provision of secondary education in Botswana in general and, in particular, in the Gaborone City area.

1.4   RESEARCH QUESTIONS

Many questions can be raised about public-private partnership service delivery. However, in view of the hypothesis articulated in paragraph 1.3 above, the following research questions will be addressed in this thesis:

- What is the distinction between the public sector and the private sector?
- What is the nature of a public-private partnership in the delivery of a public service?
- What is the relationship between the concept of public-private partnership and privatization/commercialisation?
- What is the prerequisite determining the success of public-private partnership in the delivery of secondary education?
- What can the public sector learn from the private sector in terms of delivery of service in general and secondary education in particular?
- To what extent can the concept of public-private partnership be applied in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana? What is the prerequisite determining the success of public-private partnership in the delivery of secondary education?
- What are the views of public and private secondary school heads on public-private partnership in the provision of secondary education in Botswana?
- What impact can a public-private partnership have on the general quality of secondary education in the Gaborone City area?
- What obstacles face public-private partnerships in the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area?
- To what extent is the private sector involved in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area?

These questions, to some extent, accentuate the purpose and the focus of the study. The purpose of the study and its significance are further elaborated

below together with its significance. general and, in particular, in the Gaborone City area.

1.5   PURPOSE AND SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

The intent is to investigate the extent to which public-private partnerships can be adopted in the provision of secondary education in Botswana, particularly in the Gaborone City area. In addition, it is the intent of the study to investigate the possible impact which public-private partnerships may have on the quality of secondary education in the aforementioned area as well as the extent to which the transition from junior secondary schools to senior ones can be increased beyond 50 percent. In particular, the study intends to discover whether or not more and better secondary schools can be build and managed at the least possible cost to the public sector.

Public-private partnerships are likely to emerge as a new and viable mode of enhanced public service delivery. Besides, public-private partnerships could constitute an additional dimension in public administration as a field of activity and Public Administration as an academic discipline. At least in Botswana, public-private partnerships are a new concept and without significant precedence but has the potential to considerably transform the public sector. Although the study is confined to a limited geographical area and one functional area, its outcome could have a profound application in the broader context of the public sector in Botswana and beyond the frontiers of the country. In particular, public-private partnerships can enhance the socio-economic development of the country as greater investment opportunities are likely to be created for the private sector whilst at the same time, offering public services of a higher quality.

Public-private partnerships can improve the quality of governance. If a

significant amount of public service delivery is shifted to the private sector then the Government of Botswana could focus more on its core business of governance and perhaps do it even better. There is need for a smaller and more efficient government. Public governance and delivery of service are both demanding so much so that if they are both left entirely to government none of them will be done adequately. In this regard, Drucker in Osborne and Gaebler (1992:31) observed that "any attempt to combine governing with 'doing' on a large scale, paralyzes the decision-making capacity. Any attempt to have decision-making organs actually 'do', also means very poor 'doing'. They are not equipped for it. They are not fundamentally concerned with it." It should, nevertheless be pointed out that some public services may not be appropriately delivered by the private sector but rather, by the public sector in spite of its limitations. Moreover, public-private partnerships could result in better public service delivery, better governance and a better standard of living for the general populace through high quality education.

Education has a significant bearing on the standard of living for the people in the global community in as far as it improves productivity through enhanced capability of the human capital. In the same vein, the International Labour Organisation (ILO) report (December 1996:98) observed that "economic growth and prosperity as well as sustainable development are directly related to human resource development. Education is key to it." If indeed public-private partnerships can lead to, among others, better education, then it would appear that this is the direction developing countries, including Botswana, should take and this is the focus of this study.

1.6   FOCUS AND FRAME OF REFERENCE

The primary focus as well as the aim of this study is to investigate the hypothesis that has been stated in paragraph 1.3, namely: "The quality of delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area can be improved by public-private partnerships."

In order to achieve the aim of the study, the following objectives of the study are structured as follows, namely:

- to provide an analysis of the similarities and differences of public and private sectors;
- to study the distinction between public administration and new public management (NPM);
- to provide a conceptual analysis of public-private partnerships (PPPs);
- to provide a suitable definition of PPP for this study;
- to describe the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana;
- to determine empirically the extent to which secondary education in the Gaborone City area can be delivered through PPPs;
- to determine empirically the perceptions of secondary school heads on the delivery of secondary education through PPPs; and
- to make proposals and conclusions that could guide the implementation of PPPs in the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area.

The aforementioned hypothesis, objectives of the study and the concomitant research questions set the parameters within which the possible interface between the public and the private sectors is investigated in the context of secondary education in Gaborone City area in Botswana. There are a few ancillary foci which are also addressed to enhance the accomplishment of the objectives of the study.

One of the ancillary foci is to establish the role the private sector can play in the partnership in question. In this context, the study aims beyond the process of tendering for say, the construction of classrooms or any other infrastructure. The intent being to delve into the intricacies of a true partnership "in which government works directly with private firms, in formal relationships, to jointly pursue common goals" (Feigenbaum, Henig & Hamnet 1999:8). However, this partnership can thrive where the necessary antecedents are properly in place.

The study also analyses some of the critical antecedents of successful public-private partnerships as well as the impediments thereof. It is important for these facts to be identified in order to inform the development of guidelines for such partnerships. Indeed "for the partnership between the public and the private sectors to survive it must be based on certain principles and practices" (Agere 2000:75). This is particularly important in an attempt to safeguard the public interest and to ensure that the partnership achieves its objectives.

Another ancillary focus of the study is to accentuate the fact that "the public sector is central to economic and social development, not as a direct provider of growth but as a partner, catalyst and facilitator" (Agere 2000:67). In this regard, the private sector with its prodigious resources, commercial dynamism, innovation and expertise can put up better quality infrastructure and services that provide value for money. In view of all this, the study hopes to demonstrate that a well designed public-private partnership is a recipe for socio-economic development for developing countries like Botswana. In particular, public-private partnerships can create business opportunities for the private sector through long-term contracts which have a positive impact on employment creation outside the public sector as observed by Dukwi (2003:8).

1.7   DESIGN AND RESEARCH METHOD OF STUDY

The research parameters are set by the title of the thesis as well as the hypothesis articulated in paragraph 1.3 above. The central concepts of the study are explored through a comprehensive review and analysis of the published literature. The objectives of the study and the attendant foci are addressed through a combination of analytical and empirical approaches.

In view of the approaches referred to above, primary and secondary data are used in the study, the latter accessed through literature on the subject in question. These included, among others, official documents and reports, newspapers, books and articles. Besides, knowledge based technologies such as the internet were used in the study. The primary data were gathered

through a survey questionnaire that was administered in the area in question. This was done among junior and senior secondary school heads. Since the private schools are also involved in the provision of secondary education in the geographical area of study, the questionnaire was also administered among the heads of private secondary schools. In addition, interviews were used to supplement the questionnaire and literature review. The interviews were to some extent structured but some open-ended and unstructured questions were allowed to creep into the interview schedule.

It should be stated that both the questionnaire and the interview were used to collect primary data on the views of the respondents with regard to the extent to which public-private partnerships can be applied in the provision of senior secondary education in Botswana.

1.8   TERMINOLOGICAL CLARIFICATION

In this thesis, certain concepts are crucial and have been used quite often so much so that it is necessary to elucidate them albeit in brief. The following are such concepts:

- **Commercialisation** is when a state department delivers a public service according to business principles (Brynard 1992:47);
- **Partnership** in this context refers to a relationship between two or more organisations over an extended period of time in which there exists an agreed mutual sharing of the resultant rewards and risks (Agere 2000:70).
- **Public-private partnership** is, for the purpose of this thesis, a collaboration between private enterprises and the government in which rewards, risks, resources and skills, are shared in undertakings that benefit each partner and the public (Osborne 2000:11).
  Quality public service refers to the provision of a service to a level that meets or exceeds the requirements of the people who are to be served (http://www.ppp.gov.ie). Emphasis should however, be placed on continuous improvement.

- **Governance** according to Agere (2000:66) is "the exercise of political, economic and administrative authority in the management of a country's affairs . . . comprises the complex mechanism, process, relationships and institutions through which citizens and groups articulate their interests, exercise their rights and obligations and mediate their differences."

- **Junior secondary education** in Botswana is the three years school programme immediately after primary school education. Successful completion of this programme entitles one to a Junior Certificate (J.C.).

- **O'level certificate** is a secondary education certificate offered by the University of Cambridge in England. It is one of the secondary school leaving certificates in that country and it is offered internationally. O'level Certificate has always been the senior secondary school leaving certificate in Botswana until four years ago when the Botswana General Certificate in Secondary Education was adopted.

- **Senior secondary education** in Botswana is the last two years of secondary education leading to Botswana General Certificate in Secondary Education. It is the equivalent of an O'level Certificate.

- **Privatisation** in a broad sense is the process of transferring a function, either in whole or in part, from the public sector to the private sector in which shares could be sold to the public on the basis of an enabling legislation (Feigenbaum, Hening & Hamnet 1999:1).

- **Service delivery** refers to the execution of public policy that is aimed at addressing predetermined needs of the community.

- **Government secondary education** refers to education that is offered in secondary schools that are run by government. On the other hand, private secondary education is education offered in secondary schools that are privately owned.

1.9   EXPOSITION OF CHAPTERS

The results of the study are presented in the form of chapters of the thesis as follows:

Chapter 1 as an introductory chapter outlines the structure of the thesis and its progression. It is the chapter in which this exposition of chapters is placed and it provides, among others, the hypothesis on which the thesis is based.

Chapter 2 presents the analysis of the public sector as well as the private sector and this is derived from the published literature. Various aspects of the public sector are presented as well as the goals and functions of government. The chapter further presents the distinction between the public and the private sectors with a view to identifying the strengths and weaknesses of each of them. All this will facilitate a focused analysis on public-private partnerships in the chapter that follows.

Chapter 3 analyses a conceptual framework for public-private partnerships in the delivery of public service in general. Various models of such partnership are presented as well as the antecedents of successful partnerships. Advantages and disadvantages of the said partnerships are analysed in this chapter.

In **chapter 4** the focus is on secondary education in Botswana. In particular, issues on demand for places and the quality of infrastructure are considered as well as the implications thereof on the quality of the delivery of education at this level.

The following chapter, **chapter 5** zeros in on the application of public-private partnerships in the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. The chapter identifies areas in which partnership is quite feasible notwithstanding possible resistance from some stakeholders due to paradigm paralysis in the provision of secondary education.

Chapter 6 focuses on research methodology used in collecting data. The chapter also analyses various research methods and instruments for collecting primary data. Principles of conducting research are outlined as well as the research process for the thesis. The development of data collecting instrument, piloting, and data collection are presented in this chapter. The nature and scope of the research are also the subject of this chapter.

Chapter 7 delves on empirical research and its findings. In particular, the chapter analyses the views of the research subjects on the aforementioned partnership.

Chapter 8 of the thesis is the concluding chapter and therefore consolidates the antecedent chapters. It provides conclusions that relate specifically to the hypothesis on which the thesis is founded. In particular, a summary, conclusions and some proposals are the subject of this concluding chapter.

1.10 CONCLUSION

A public-private partnership in the delivery of a public service has the potential to improve the quality of both infrastructure and service delivery. The purpose of the study is to investigate the extent to which public-private partnerships can be adopted in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana. This chapter has outlined the structure and scope of the thesis. In particular, the hypothesis on which the thesis is founded is presented in this chapter. This is also true of the purpose and significance of the study. The hypothesis together with the research questions and objectives of the study as well as the concomitant research method has also been presented in this chapter. Key concepts have been clarified briefly and are elaborated upon in chapter 2 of the conceptual overview. The second chapter focuses on the nature of the public and private sectors.

CHAPTER 2

THE NATURE OF THE PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SECTORS

2.1   INTRODUCTION

The main theme of this thesis is the use of a public-private partnership in the provision of secondary education and therefore it is necessary to analyse the two sectors in order to inform the argument for this partnership. The aim of this chapter, therefore, is to present an analysis of these sectors with a view to identifying their strengths and weaknesses as well as differences and similarities. The analysis enhances the understanding of the nature of these sectors. The chapter also presents two popular philosophies of public service provision, namely 'public interest of the welfare-maximising state' and 'private markets and public institutions'.   In addition, the comparison of public administration and new public management (NPM) is presented in the chapter. In order to inform the discussion on these two sectors the classical approach to organisation theory and management is presented in the chapter, albeit in brief.

2.2   ORGANISATION THEORY: THE CLASSICAL APPROACH

In order to appreciate the nature of the public and private sectors it might be instructive at the outset to explain the theory on the basis of which these sectors were structured. The contemporary structural manifestations of both the public and private organisations can be traced to the classical approach to organisation theory. Paradoxically, both the public and private sectors exhibit significant structural and managerial differentiation on the basis of which a partnership between the two organisations is advocated, in this thesis, for the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana.

The classical approach to organisation theory and management basically emerged at the beginning of the twentieth century and indeed at a time when

it was believed that any organisational goal could be achieved by scientific study and practical experience. In fact the approach "portrayed organisations as machines and those in them as mere parts which respond to the correct stimulus and whose actions are based on scientific principles" (Burnes 1996:26). Although several authors might have contributed to the classical approach, only three of these authors' views are presented here simply because they are commonly associated with this approach in the literature. These are Frederick Taylor's scientific management; Henri Fayol's principles of management; and Max Weber's bureaucracy. These theories were formulated almost at the same time and therefore independent of each other.

2.2.1 Taylor's scientific management

Taylor, an American engineer who later became a manager, was primarily pre-occupied with the design and analysis of individual tasks in an effort to enhance his organisational efficiency. This resulted from his two fundamental beliefs, namely that it was possible and desirable to establish, through scientific principles, 'one best way' of carrying out any task and that human beings were predisposed to seek maximum reward for minimum effort which he referred to as 'soldering' (Smit & Cronjé 1999:41). Taylor advocated the use of scientific management to replace the rule-of-thumb methods which he felt were a waste of time and therefore inefficient.

The scientific management approach was based on certain principles. Huczynski (1996:13) observed these principles as "first, the development of a science for each element of a person's work which would replace the old rule-of-thumb method. Second, the scientific selection, training and development of workers to replace the previous practice of their choosing their own work methods, and training themselves as best as they could . . ." The scientific management advocate the systematic derivation of organisational rules and regulations from the traditional knowledge of the workers. The application of ssuch rules and regulations would result in higher productivity and profit. Those in management positions would undertake a scientific selection and the

progressive development of workers after which they would be placed in jobs and be paid according to their contributions to the organisation (Dessler 2007:13). One perceived advantage of the scientific management approach over the rule-of-thumb methods is that employees' hard work, good will and ingenuity can be obtained practically and with absolute regularity (Shafritz & Hyde 1997:30). Taylor's approach culminated in a plethora of functions and departments whose vestiges are abundantly evident in contemporary organisations. However, the approach has numerous shortcomings which are not dealt with here. It is at this stage necessary to see how Taylor differed with Henri Fayol on management issues.

2.2.2 Fayol's principles

Henri Fayol, a French engineer who rose to eminence as the Chief Executive Officer for a mining company, focused on a variety of management principles most of which are still being followed in contemporary organisations. In particular, he was concerned with productivity at an organisational level rather than details of individual tasks as Taylor did. Fayol believed in management principles whose applicability was universal and therefore indifferent to the kind of organisation, private or public. These were regarded the primary responsibility of management to enact and in order to do so successfully the main duties to be performed were planning, organising, command, co-ordinate, and control (Burnes 1996:34). To Fayol, "planning called for the formation of objectives and an operating programme. Organising focused on the effective coordination of resources for attaining the set objectives. Commanding was the art of leading people. Coordinating the activities of groups to provide unity of action ensured a smoothly functioning organisation. Controlling involved seeing that everything was done according to the set plans" (Smit & Cronjé 1999:40). Clearly, Fayol's primary interest was the management of organisations and to guide the management process, he formulated fourteen principles most, if not all, of which are still applicable in contemporary organisations.

Although Fayol acknowledged that there was no limit to the principles of management, he identified the following fourteen principles (Mullins 1989: 202):

a)   **Division of work -** A reasonable devision of labour can induce specialisation both of which have the propensity to heighten the performance of an organisation. However, division of work has its own limits and these are known through experience and a sense of proportion.

b)   **Authority and responsibility** - Authority brings about responsibility. Sanctions are needed for good management and to encourage purposeful action. The personal integrity of the manager is important to prevent abuse of authority.

c)   **Discipline** - For an organisation to function effectively there must be discipline. It is a sign of respect for agreement between the organisation and its members. Where there is lack of discipline, managers must decide on the most appropriate form of sanction for a specific form of indiscipline.

d)   **Unity of command** - There must be only one superior who gives orders in an organisation. Where there are many superiors giving orders, authority is undermined and there is a threat to discipline, order and stability. There is also a high possibility of conflicts.

e)   **Unity of direction -** Where there is a group of activities with the same objective, only one head should be in charge for there to be unity of action, coordination and focusing of effort.

f)   **Subordination of individual and group interest to organisational interest** - Group or individual interests should be secondary to the interests of the organisation.

g)   **Remuneration of personnel -** Both the employee and the employer

should be happy about remuneration. The salary structure and payment policy can influence the performance of the organisation.

h) **Centralisation** - Every organisation practices some form of centralisation. How far centralisation is practiced varies from organisation to organisation.

i) **Scalar chain -** Organisational structure defines the order of superiority but must take cognizance of the need for initiative and urgent action at all levels.

j) **Order** – This includes both material and social order. In order to avoid loss of materials, each item should be kept at its prescribed place. For the sake of social order every appointed official should operate within the parameters of his/her office.

k) **Equity –** The humanistic values of equity and equality should be observed in dealing with the employees throughout the hierarchy of an organisation.

l) **Stability of tenure of personnel** – Whilst it is expected that people will change jobs, stability in personnel, particularly those in management positions, can contribute to the prosperity of an organisation.

m) **Initiative** – Successful organisations encourage and develop initiative whilst at the same time ensuring discipline and respect for authority.

n) ***Esprit de corps*** – The collective effort of employees is invariably superior to individualised effort. As the saying goes, the whole is more than the sum of its parts. This recognises the strengths of an organisation that derives from harmony and unity amongst its members.

The need to train and educate managers was perceived to be of critical

importance in enabling them to function effectively. It should therefore be evident that Fayol was one of the pioneers of organisation theory. However, as stated earlier these were not the only pioneers of such a theory. A German sociologist, Max Weber, was almost at the same time postulating his 'ideal type' bureaucracy.

2.2.3   Weber's bureaucracy

Weber described the characteristics of what he regarded the 'ideal type' bureaucracy – "a hierarchy of impersonal offices to which people were appointed based on their technical qualifications, that is, their ability to perform those specialised tasks required by the division of labour within the organisation, and through which they were subject to strict discipline and control" (Denhardt 1993:6). This theory of bureaucratic management emphasised the need for a strictly defined hierarchy that was to be governed by well articulated regulations and authority.

Weber was primarily concerned with social change particularly with the development of the Western civilisation from which he concluded that the rise of civilisation was but a matter of power and domination. Besides, he noted that "each social epoch was characterised by a different form of political rule, and that for a ruling elite to sustain its power and dominance, it was essential for it both to gain legitimacy and to develop an administrative apparatus to enforce and support its authority" (Burnes 1996:35). He had a lot of interest in the concept of authority and therefore examined its various forms.

Weber distinguished three bases of authority, namely rational-legal; traditional and charismatic authority. Rational-legal authority derived in the belief that people giving orders do so in accordance with legal rules and regulations. The traditional authority derived from the belief that people giving orders had traditionally done so. Whereas charismatic authority derived from the fact that a particular person giving orders has a magnetic personality (Huczynski 1996:11). However, Weber called the form of organisation built on rational-

legal authority 'ideal type bureaucracy.'

It was Weber who presented a description of how a hypothetical ideal organisation should be structured. In his view, the market economy demanded that the official business of public administration be discharged precisely, unambiguously, continuously, and as fast as possible (Felts & Jos, 2000:520). Weber was convinced that a purely bureaucratic type of administration had the capacity to attain the highest degree of efficiency and hence the most rational means of conducting mass administration.   He was of the view that bureaucracy and efficiency were intertwined or implied the same thing.   It should also be noted that Weber's model was premised on the establishment of legal mechanisms for the functioning of organisations that would work efficiently and effectively if its rules were adhered to. It would appear that the model implicitly suggested that public services could be delivered in a manner that is akin to a machine that could be given "instructions to obey commands and operate accordingly" (Lane 2001:19). Indeed this was perceived to be a perfect instrument of organisation and management as it was regarded technically most efficient (Nwabuzor & Mueller 1990:129).

The foregoing gives a background to organisation theory and management, from which the contemporary organisations, public and private, have developed. It is therefore, appropriate to present an analysis of the public sector.

2.3   ANALYSIS OF THE PUBLIC SECTOR

The public sector can be viewed as the totality of politically established and maintained organisations whose primary objective is the promotion of the general welfare of the populace.   These organisations fall within the parameters of government structures at local, regional, national and international level (Ströh & Van der Westhuizen 1994:9). The public sector is, in fact, that part of the national economy whose primary focus is the provision of collective goods and services.   Although some goods and services are

consumed by those who pay for them, most are non excludable in their consumption. This implies that although money is expended on the provision of services, non excludable goods and services do not require the consumers to make direct payment for their consumption because they are provided for through public funds (Savas 2000:56). However, the ultimate aim of the public sector is development. In particular, the public sector should, as its primary objective, aim at economic growth, sustainable development, and efficient and effective delivery of service to the public (Agere 2000:25).

It therefore follows from the above perspective that the primary motive of the public sector is service provision and not profit or maximisation thereof. In fact, this leads to one of the difficulties most, if not all, developing countries face, namely having to provide for unlimited public needs from limited means (Swart 1992:2). This is notwithstanding the fact that public services are, by and large, financed from taxes. However, due to inflation, it is increasingly becoming expensive and/or difficult to provide the same services and unfortunately the option of increasing taxes is the least preferred as it is not electorally prudent. In spite of these difficulties, the public sector is expected to meet multifaceted public needs which can be fulfilled through various forms of state in the same public sector. The public sector is a diverse and complex field of activity with a myriad of objectives which are embodied in basically three types of state, namely the guardian state, the productive state, and the redistributive state (Lane 1994:65). Each type of state pursues a different set of objectives that are not necessarily consistent with those of the other states.

Classification of the functions of the public sector or, to be more focused, government is presented differently by different authors. For example Musgrave and Musgrave (1989:6) presented the allocation function; the distribution function; and the stabilisation function. On the other hand, Hughes (1998:84) listed provision; subsidy; production; and regulation. Lane (1994:65) quoted the guardian state; the productive state; and the redistributive state. A closer inspection of these classifications reveals that they, by and large, capture more or less the same things. However, for the

purposes of this thesis, the latter classification is preferred because it is widely used in the published literature and it uses the concepts in the other classifications. The preferred classification is presented below.

2.3.1 Guardian state

The guardian state is predominantly concerned with law and order. In fact, the regulatory function of government is characteristic of the guardian state whose fundamental objective is the protection of its citizenry. In this regard, the regulatory policies "involve the imposition of restrictions or limitations on the behaviour of individuals and groups . . . the most extensive variety of regulatory policies, however, is that which deals with criminal behaviour against persons and property" (Anderson 1990:12). However, regulatory policies should go beyond this and include some civil rights policies in order to protect public interests. Such policies would inevitably encompass "constraints, duties and obligations on citizens and institutions" (Denhardt 1993:79). Being concerned with law and order, it would appear plausible to infer that from the guardian state's point of view the public sector's objectives are primarily accountability and legality.

2.3.1.1 Accountability

Accountability is one of the essential principles or normative factors that obtain in the public sector and indeed a prominent feature of the contemporary public administration. This is particularly so because the contemporary public is not docile and, more importantly, is to a large extent, aware of its rights and vocal about the same. Accountability is defined by Banki in Hanekom, Rowland and Bain (2004:178) as "a personal obligation, liability, or answerability of an official or employee to give his supervisor a desired report of the quantity and quality of action and decision in the performance of responsibilities, especially delegated." This definition captures at least two essential points. First, accountability in the public sector connotes a personal obligation to ensure that public resources are used efficiently and effectively to serve the public

interests. Secondly, accountability connotes answerability for one's actions or behaviour to higher authority, say the public. However, it may also be added that accountability could also refer to the extent to which a sense of duty is upheld by elected and appointed officials particularly those at the helm of public organisations. The concept should also apply to those entities which deliver public services on behalf of government. In this regard, "accountability is also a moral, professional, and ethical construct that results when public officials and contractors serve with a commitment to do the right things" (Osborne 2002:215). Those who serve the public should invariably take cognizance of the supremacy of its interest and that in the course of public service delivery there should be no room for personal interest at the expense of the public. In particular, actions and behaviour of those who perform public duty should be beyond reproach and clearly demonstrate a concern for the general welfare of the populace (Gildenhuys 1997:59). What needs to be understood is that public service is delivered at a cost which can be expressed in terms of financial expenditure from public funds. In this regard, accountability normally refers to the extent to which public funds have been expended on activities for which they were voted. However, this view is characteristic of the traditional approach to public administration, with emphasis on rules and predetermined goals, which has the propensity to stifle initiative and creativity in public service delivery.

Public service delivery should have a greater scope for creativity and initiative on the part of public managers. In such a case, it would be plausible to suggest that accountability should be viewed in terms of the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities of public service delivery. This view is related to that of Miller in Popovich (1998:131) when he argued that "the proper stewardship of public funds must emphasise the rigorous evaluation of the efficiency and effectiveness of operations and of the highest quality end product possible." The virtue of this view is that it focuses on the outcomes more than it does on means or procedures. To the public, however, what matters most are the outcomes i.e. the actual service provided. For example, if the best education can be provided at the least possible cost, the public will be happy regardless

of who actually delivered the service and how it was delivered. The kernel of accountability should therefore be efficiency and effectiveness of service delivery but, of course, the delivery should not be in violation of the moral values of the public. The emphasis is therefore on both ethical behaviour and professional competence. To some extent this suggests that actions of elected and appointed officials should be legal. However, as stated earlier, legality is another objective of the guardian state and it is elucidated below, albeit in brief.

2.3.1.2 Legality

Legality is another fundamental requirement in the operations of the entire society and the economy and it connotes adherences to the laws of the country or ramifications thereof. The laws of a country are primarily designed to, amongst others, protect the rights of individuals or collectivities thereof by regulating their behaviour. As a result, "legality is emphasised by groups who seek to protect collective rights by means of public policy" (Osborne 2002: 20). Adherence to laws and policies of a particular country enhances the scope of protection of the people. For example if people could stop stealing and killing each other, the public could feel safer and better protected. Legality therefore is a requirement that ensures that public functionaries operate within the parameters of public policy. It is of critical importance to respect the rule of law for the effective functioning of the society and economy because "the rule of law ensures that all institutions of the nation are subjected to the laws of the country, strict code of conduct, accountability and transparent procedures" (Agere 2000:95). However, the rule of law alone may not be adequate if both the law enforcement and the judiciary are suspect. In fact, these are of critical importance if both the society and the economy are to function effectively. It is commonly said that where crime is rife foreign investors are reluctant to invest their resources in the country in which case economic development could be compromised. It can be worse if the government is unpredictable and does not respect the rule of law. According to Reuters in Mmegi (22 December 2004) Zimbabwe's Minister of Finance Hebert Murerwa has appealed to local

private and foreign investors to help in the form of joint ventures with the Government to fund some $4 billion in infrastructure project. The appeal was motivated by the fact that "Government on its own cannot meet the increasing requirements for critical capital projects due to resource constraints and the growing demand for social services on the budget." This is quite in line with the problem stated in paragraph 1.3 above. Given the current state of the economy of Zimbabwe, the local private investors may not have such huge sums of money. Even if they have such resources they, together with the foreign investors, may be apprehensive about the security of their investment given the Government of Zimbabwe's seizure of white owned farms to settle the landless blacks in 2000. In particular, public-private partnerships can hardly be effective where the law enforcement, the judiciary and the government are unpredictable. The success of the private sector should depend to a great extent on the protection of property rights by the public sector which is a *sine quo non* for effective functioning of the market system.

2.3.2 Redistributive state

The redistributive states' fundamental objective is equity and its primary concern is poverty relief and/or prevention that is articulated in terms of transfer payments. It offers some form of social security in pursuit of social justice because the intent is "to redress to some degree the inequalities in wealth and income between citizens" (Hughes 1998:86). Social justice according to Rawl's theory is an approach "where the least well-off group in the society should be made as well-off as possible" (Young 1994:10). The redistributive process is therefore an attempt by the state to intervene on the side of the poor and the downtrodden with a view to enhancing their well-being and to create some alternatives for them. So the distributive policies are aimed at equity amongst the citizens of a country.

2.3.2.1 Equity

Equity is a contested concept that is fraught with variations in definition and it

is applied in a variety of situations using different measures. Young (1994: XII) has observed that "equity is a complex idea that resists simple formulations. It is strongly shaped by cultured values, by precedent, and by specific types of goods and burdens being distributed." This view seems to be predicated on the fact that every society has its own written or unwritten rules for sharing goods and burdens. In this context, equity denotes the extent to which the outcome of a distributive process in a society is in conformity with the legitimate expectations of the stakeholders. In a redistributive state, equity as noted earlier signifies redistribution that aims to reduce inequalities of income and wealth. However, the contemporary view of this concept should be broader than this to include a proper distribution of rights, opportunities, duties and obligations in a community. In this regard, Black's Law Dictionary in Gildenhuys (1997:224) has observed that "equity denotes the spirit and the habit of fairness and justice and right dealing which would regulate the intercourse of men with men - the rule of doing to all others as we desire them to do to us." This clearly defines the locus and focus of the concept which is very relevant to the contemporary society which has become more politicised and less patient with any form of inequality. Anecdotal evidence abounds to suggest that the public in Botswana is increasingly becoming aware of its rights and for example, people will demand similar pay for similar work, affirmative action, equal opportunities, education and other social amenities. All this is closely allied to the observation Young (1994: XII) made namely, that "equity is concerned with the proper distribution of resources, rights, duties, opportunities, and obligations in society at large." To conclude this section, it needs to be pointed out that government, as the custodian of collective rights and interests, engages in redistributive processes in an attempt to free the poor and the downtrodden members of the society from the shackles of deprivation and conditions of perpetual economic marginality. This is the kernel of the redistributive state which is complementary to the productive state discussed below.

2.3.3   Productive state

The productive state's primary concern is the provision of infrastructure and delivery of other goods and services.   In Botswana, the productive state currently manifests itself in the form of quasi-governmental institutions or public enterprises such as the Botswana Power Corporation, Botswana Telecommunication Corporation, Botswana Railways, Water Utilities, and Air Botswana.   Goods and services provided by these organisations are, by and large, private in nature and therefore "are sold to consumers and use is precluded if consumers are unwilling to pay" (Hughes 1998:88).   In most cases use is also precluded if consumers are willing to pay but unable to do so.   For example most, if not all, people would like to have electricity in their homes and they wish they could pay for it but because they do not have enough money they don't have power in their homes.   Public enterprises are government-owned organisations or production units that sell their products, goods and/or services, to the public and therefore being involved in the market processes.   In many developing countries public enterprises were first established by colonial powers with a view to facilitating economic development (Turner & Hulme 1997:176; Hughes 1998:113).   However, anecdotal evidence suggests that in Botswana these enterprises are still subjected to the whims and fancies of the political authority of the country.   As a result, the management of these enterprises is not entirely at liberty to decide on the nature and scope of their activities.   Being engaged in activities of a business nature, public enterprises' fundamental objective is efficiency in their productive activities.

2.3.3.1   Efficiency

This concept focuses on how actions are performed or carried out in organisations.   In particular, efficiency is a measure of the extent to which the expected output is achieved with the least possible inputs (Chase, Jacobs & Aquillano 2004:8).   An organisation can be said to be efficient and effective if it successfully meets the needs of its clientele at the least possible cost (Robbins

et al, 2001:15). Suffice it to state that effectiveness, which is a necessary complement of efficiency, is a measure of the success of an organisation in meeting the needs of its clientele. Public organisations should invariably aim at both efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of public services.

There are certain philosophies of public service delivery and it might be instructive to present an analysis of the two competing philosophies.

2.4 TWO COMPETING PHILOSOPHIES OF PUBLIC SERVICE PROVISION

There are various philosophies of public service provision. However, for the purposes of this thesis two competing philosophies are briefly discussed, namely the theory of the public interest of the welfare-maximising state and the competitive theory of private markets and public organisations. The choice of these two theories derives from the fact that the public sector in Botswana seems to be more inclined towards the former whilst the theme of this thesis advocates a shift towards the latter.

2.4.1 Public interest of the welfare-maximising state

The redistributive state has been briefly analysed above. However, the theory of the welfare-maximising state is a bigger picture that evolved from the redistributive process. Whereas the focus of the redistributive state is to reduce inequality in income and wealth by addressing the identified needs of the relatively indigent members of the society, the welfare state encompasses the entire society in various ways. It would appear that the welfare state is premised on the ideas of redistribution. According to Lane (2000:47), "a welfare state is a politico-economic regime where the state is active in the economy in various ways though without extensive ownership, which results in a mixed economy instead of a system of decentralized capitalism where markets prevail and there is less income distribution. The welfare state is active in public resource allocation, transfer payments and policies that

promote full employment." As implied above, the genesis of the welfare state was the need to enhance the well-being of the economically weak social groups such as the unemployed and those with low incomes by providing them with specific goods and services. However, all this ultimately covered everybody including the affluent members of the society. These goods and services relate to "income security, health, social housing, education, and the personal social services" (Lund 2002:1). For example, in Botswana education is currently free for all citizens from primary schools to senior secondary schools and this includes meals in schools, books and stationery regardless of whether parents are able to pay for all this or not. Medical care is provided at a nominal fee in all government health centres. Old pension fund is for all citizens who have reached the age of 65 years regardless of their economic status. Anecdotal evidence for these facts abounds. These services are, by and large, paid for by the state and therefore the market forces play a minimal role if any as far as the provision of these services is concerned. The virtue of providing these goods and services by the Government of Botswana is that social cohesion is likely to be enhanced. In line with this view, Lund (2002:124) argued that the welfare state was an integrative mechanism through which "all men should be able to live a life of dignity and culture with certain goods and services planned as far as possible to emphasise and strengthen not the class differences which divide but the common humanity which unites them." It would therefore appear that the intent is not only to reduce income and wealth inequalities but also inequality of status which could, at times, be more important than the latter because people want to be treated with dignity and respect regardless of their economic circumstances.

The theory of the public interest of the welfare-maximising state is also premised on the democratic election mechanism for government and the concomitant comprehensive mandate of the ruling party. Aspiring political parties promise the electorate that if elected into power, they will deal with various aspects of human life with a view to improving their standards of living. Once a political party has received the mandate to rule then the politically determined targets are internalised and pursued by public organisations

(Naschold & Otter 1996:14). Through the democratic election mechanism, it is quite possible to expand the scope of state activity because experience has shown that in Botswana political parties promise the electorate more and more services in their campaign. In a welfare state "the government accepts the responsibility for supplying more public services and means by which the minimum economic and social requirements for existence are guaranteed" (Gildenhuys 1997:10). In the next chapters, the extent of this responsibility on government for providing the ever expanding public services is questioned in preference for public-private partnerships in public service delivery.

It does appear that from the stand point of the receiving populace the welfare state is a welcome politico-economic regime whilst from the macro-economic point of view the cost of the welfare state can be colossal and in some economies it may not be sustainable in the long run. Lane (2000:48) observed that in the welfare state the public sector is predominantly "driven by equity considerations which can only be effectuated with a cost in terms of total output." However, it might be instructive to now briefly consider the theory that is more inclined towards market mechanism, namely the competitive theory of private markets and public organisations.

2.4.2 Private markets and public organisations

In order to enhance the understanding of the role the market can play in the delivery of public service, it is necessary to describe some of its essential features. A market must be understood to be any situation where potential buyers and sellers come into contact with one another. It has been observed that "most countries depend on market mechanism, rather than government controls, to allocate most goods, services, and factors of production" (Swart 1992:43). In actual fact, experience has shown that markets are, in most cases, very effective in the allocation of various products through the price mechanism. To this end, Gillis, Perkins, Roemer & Snodgrass (1992:102) have observed that "the market can allocate thousands of different products among consumers, according to their preferences, and thousands of productive inputs

among producers and get the maximum output from available inputs. These complex allocative tasks, if handled by the state, are an enormous government responsibility with attendant high costs for decision making and control." This is a sufficient justification for advocating the use of market forces in the delivery of public services. If indeed it is burdensome for government to shoulder the complex allocative tasks referred to above then it should be reasonable, for the purposes of this thesis, to argue for a public-private partnership in the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. This is because the private sector is a key participant in the market and its mettle should be tested against the intricacies of providing secondary education in the said area.

Public organisations are generally known to be sluggish and, to some extent rigid. However, markets are more flexible than governments and are therefore better able to adapt to changing circumstances. In addition, due to its dynamism and versatility, the market provides greater incentives for innovation and growth. Consequently, the market "encourages private economic power. Economic pluralism, in turn, is one element tending to encourage democratic government and individual liberties" (Gillis *et al* 1992:102). This view is supported on the grounds that economic pluralism has the propensity to enhance the general welfare of the populace which is the locus and focus of public administration. As stated earlier (see section 1.6), public administration should have a development connotation. This developmental orientation should invariably be people centred in order to make significant improvements in people's material and spiritual wellbeing.

Public organisations tend to rely on hierarchical structure, authority or, to some extent, on its coercive power to deliver some services. The private sector through the market forces fulfils a cooperation function as it has the capacity to bring individuals and groups willingly into contact with one another to experience a greater satisfaction of wants through this cooperation. These views have been clearly articulated by Klijn and Teisman in Osborne (2000:88) when they argued that "markets are forms of coordination in which individual,

autonomous parties achieve equilibrium through pricing mechanisms. Hierarchy gives the appearance of coordination in which command, control and legislation are important. In the private sector coordination takes place spontaneously, while hierarchy is usually associated with government agencies that coordinate through bureaucratic procedures." As a result, private sector organisations are more flexible and responsive to the needs of the people as compared to their counterparts in the public sector.

The competitive theory of private markets and public organisations advocates competition for the provision of public services. Not only do political parties compete for governance, but also the actual delivery of public services is competed for and therefore subjected to market forces. In this regard, public service delivery is not the sole responsibility of public organisations and both public and private organisations can compete for the delivery of a public service (Obsorne & Gaebler 1992:85). In some cases however, the competition for public service delivery can be left to the private enterprises so that the successful ones can work in partnership with public organisations. This state of affairs normally culminates in the scope of state activity being reduced and hence a recipe for a minimalist state (Naschold & Otter 1996:14) in which the size of the public sector is also reduced and allow the private sector to grow. Another dimension of marketisation of public service is the internationalised markets whereby the mechanisms of the markets are infused in the fabrics of the culture of public organisations. However, the argument here is for external markets with a view to supporting public-private partnership in the delivery of public service in general and secondary education in the Gaborone City area in particular. It would appear that the basic political choice and one of the topical issues confronting developing countries like Botswana is to choose between a welfare state and a predominantly market oriented society or strike a balance between these two philosophies of the provision of a public service.

It needs to be stated that the complexity of modern life compels the contemporary government to espouse the good attributes of the known

systems or philosophies of governance in pursuit of good quality of life for its citizenry. It could also be argued however, that due to the myriad and inconsistent objectives of the modern government, flexibility must be in-built in the style of governance to enable the optimal realization of the various public sector objectives as indicated in section 2.2 above. For example, a free-enterprise system must be adopted for the provision of infrastructure and delivery of other goods and services like senior secondary education whilst a social welfare approach should be adopted for transfer of payments and social security. At this stage, it should be emphasised that the free-enterprise system can provide an opportunity for public-private partnership to the extent outlined in chapter 3 and beyond the current practice in Botswana. This has the potential to strengthen the production sector of the economy. Closely related to this view, Agere (2000:86) observed that "the performance of the state and its failure to achieve its developmental promises cast serious doubt on its effectiveness to spearhead the production sector." This suggests that there should be a paradigm shift in public administration as a field of activity with emphasis on promoting the private sector and engaging the same in the advancement of both the economy and the social welfare of the people.

The preponderance of public administration principles and practices is being questioned in the following section in preference for public management. Public administration and the new management philosophy are briefly discussed and compared. This is motivated by, on the one hand, the fact that public administration as a field of activity is akin to what obtains in the public sector in Botswana. On the other hand, the new public management philosophy advocates management of the public sector in a manner that is similar, to a large extent, to the management of the private sector. The latter is in line with the theme of this thesis and this is the basic reason why it is being discussed here.

2.5 PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION VERSUS NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT

The intent is to juxtapose the traditional approach to public administration with

the emerging trend in public management. In particular, this section looks at how public organisations are actually run in these two schools of thought with a view to understanding which of these is likely to cope with the complexities of the modern public service.

2.5.1 Public administration

In order to inform a description of public administration, the concept of administration should first be illuminated.

2.5.1.1 Administration

Administration is mostly associated with the public sector. For example, Baxter (1991:99) argued that "more often the term is used as an informal reference to the machinery of executive government as a whole, or as a reference to the executive branch of government . . ." Mullins (1989:200) has observed that administration is associated more popularly with the public sector organisations and refers to the "highest level of management (top management) and to the functions of establishing the overall aims and formulating policy for the organisation as a whole." These two views on administration do not suggest what administration is except for its association with the public sector. The second view has attempted to suggest what administration entails but it is deficient in that administration entails more than establishing the overall aims and formulating policy for the organisation as a whole. It is suggested that administration is a feature of both public and private organisations. In this thesis, the generic view of administration is espoused. Ströh and Van der Westhuizen (1994:10) contended that "in terms of such view, it is recognised that administration comprises specific generic administrative functions/activities, namely policy determination and execution, organising, financing, personnel provision and utilisation, work procedures and methods, and control, and that all members of the institution are responsible for these." This suggests that administration is not just the province of top officials of an organisation but, instead, all members are involved though not to the same

degree. The most junior officials are the least involved whilst those at the pinacle of the organisation are the most involved. Administration is directed at the achievement of objectives by enabling the functional work of an organisation (private and public) to be performed. To this end, Adlem, Brynard and Mynhardt (1993:168) have argued that "administration does not refer to all the activities of all the members, nor to all the activities of a particular group of members, but only to specific activities of all the members whose work is directed towards the functional work of other members." It may be added that functions which constitute administration are regarded as generic because they are omnipresent in any goal-oriented institutionalised group activity. In this regard administration can be viewed as a means towards an end since it facilitates the performance of the functional work.

2.5.1.2 Concept of public administration

Various authors have written about the concept of Public Administration as a discipline and public administration as a field of activity in the public sector. The latter is the primary focus here. The definition of the concept of public administration as a field of activity can very well be influenced by ones interests. These could be in the form of ideological, moral or political views. However, Pauw and Wessels (1999:22) have defined public administration as "the organised, non-political, executive functions of the state." The functions are viewed broadly to encompass services, activities as well as public organisations as machinery of governance. The apolitical aspect of the definition derives from the conviction that impartial public service can not be rendered when elected officials are at the same time struggling for power which is characteristic of politics. However, Pauw and Wessels do not refute the obvious fact that public officials have a significant role to play in policy determination and implementation and that they translate political goals into action. The definition is a normative rather than an empirical perception of the concept influenced by the desire to have an impartial public service (Pauw & Wessels, 1999:23). The definition however does not reveal what the services and activities are which constitute functions.

From the analysis of administration it can be inferred that public administration is the totality of the generic administrative functions performed in the public sector. In this regard, Hanekom and Thornhill (1990:7) have viewed public administration as a concept that "consists of the functions of policy making, organisation, financing, staffing and the development of work procedures and control measures, which are performed in public institutions."

It might be instructive at this stage to highlight the distinction between Public Administration and public administration. The former, i.e. starting with capital letters, is an academic subject which belongs to the family of sciences concerned with human activities. It is therefore a social science but with a particular focus and locus which manifests itself in the activities of public organisations and other activities which have a bearing on the general welfare of the populace. As an academic subject it focuses on approaches, concepts and practices in the teaching of the subject and training of public officials. To this end, Kruger and Bernhardt (1993:184) view the focus of the subject as " the way in which people organize their activities in a government context to satisfy their needs for clothing, food and housing, and also their intellectual needs such as the search for knowledge and spiritual welfare." On the other hand public administration, i.e. beginning with small letters, is a field of activity which is directed towards the promotion of the general welfare of the society by accomplishing specific functional objectives (Ströh & Van der Westhuizen 1994:9). As a field of activity it manifests itself in public organisations but in a political and socio-economic context. It must be emphasized that although administration is a phenomenon of both public and private organisations, public administration is unique to the public sector because the functionaries are invariably constrained by specific and indispensable normative factors which are peculiar to the public sector. These factors are briefly discussed below.

2.5.1.3 Normative factors

These are the principles or guidelines that those who practice public administration are required to observe. These principles apply in the public sector although traces of some of them may be found in the private sector. Brynard and Hanekom (1993:170) have identified at least five such factors. In addition to these, there are other such factors that have been brought about by the advent of information technology in public organisations and a brief discussion thereof is included.

(a) Acknowledgement of constitutional supremacy

The functions performed under the auspices of public administration by the executive are defined and authorised by the constitution (Constitution of Botswana 1966). This means that officials must perform their functions within the limits set by the constitution as supreme law in Botswana.

(b) Public accountability and responsibility

When carrying out public functions the need for public accountability and responsibility should never be overlooked. Collection and expenditure of public funds should be beyond reproach and it should be expected that the legislative institution in a democracy will demand that those acting on its behalf do so in a responsible and accountable manner. In this regard, Normanton in Gildenhuys (1997:58) perceives accountability as "the obligation to expose activities and the results of such activities and to explain and justify them." This suggests that political office bearers and public officials should not act from base motives but rather in the public interest and without ulterior motives.

(c) Criterion of efficiency

The public sector's primary focus is the provision of services to the community whilst that of the private sector is to maximise profit. This suggests clearly that efficiency in the two sectors cannot be measured by the same criteria. The criteria for success for public organisations are not as easy to define as those for private ones because those for public institutions include social and market measures as well as political ones (Horton & Farnham 1999:27). They are also replete with values which are vulnerable to subjective judgement. Such values could include diligence, honesty, fairness and justness to everyone irrespective of their race, language, religious or political views (Hanekom & Thornhill 1990:20).

It should however, be argued that those involved in the public administrative process should take cognisance of the need for efficiency (and effectiveness) and endeavour to pursue optimal utilisation of resources and the achievement of optimal utility for the society.

(d) Requirements of administrative law

The administrative law is, from a general point of view, meant to regulate the relations of public organisations with private individuals and organisations as well as other public organisations. In particular, "it stipulates a set of common principles which are designed to promote the effective use of administrative power, to protect individuals and organisations from its misuse, to preserve a balance of fairness between public authorities and those with whom they interact, and to ensure the maintenance of the public interest" (Baxter 1991:3). This is necessary to ensure that political office bearers and public officials perform their functions without ulterior motives and in accordance with public expectations. In other words morality should be applied to the activities of these officials.

(e) Maintenance of democratic principles

Political office bearers and public officials operate within a particular political system. It is therefore incumbent upon these officials to function in accordance with the demands of such a system. For example, in a democratic system both political office bearers and public officials must take cognizance of democratic principles such as involving others in delivering their public functions because this is what is expected of them particularly by the electorate.

These normative factors account, in the main, for the difference between public administration and private administration. Public administration is viewed broadly enough to encompass the totality of administrative actions performed in the public sector with a view to promote the general welfare of the populace. The activities do not occur in vacuum but rather within a framework of a political process and manifest in the spheres of government authority such as legislative, executive and the judiciary. It may be added that public administration is undertaken within the parameters of specific government structures at various levels of government i.e. local, regional, national and international (Ströh & Van der Westhuizen 1994:9).

It can be realised from the foregoing that public administration is a complex undertaking characterised by a myriad of work processes which make the role of the public manager very prominent in the dispensation of the public service.

(f) Respect for personal information

The use of information technology in public institutions may involve keeping personnel records in information technology facilities and the use of such facilities must be beyond reproach. In particular, privacy of personal information must be respected and such information should be held and used only for the purposes for which it is legally intended. Personal information

should always be treated as confidential and should therefore remain secure and to be disclosed only to those who are meant to have access to it. Besides, changes to personal details without the consent of the owner must be avoided at all costs (Crawford 1997:216; Kearsley 1990:181).

2.5.1.4 Weaknesses of the public sector

Public organisations are generally structured in a manner that is reminiscent of the 'ideal type' bureaucracy. The Weberian model, also referred to as the classical approach, was adopted largely when countries set up their states after the World Wars and indeed this is a long time ago. However, there are still some noticeable traces of the Weberian model in contemporary public administration.

The 'ideal type' of bureaucracy was based on, amongst other things, rules and regulations to guide the public servants in the course of service delivery. In fact, most institutions are still organised around the Weberian model that is, "along hierarchical lines and managed with the same attention to power and regulation as they were years ago" (Denhardt 1993:6). It can be argued that the reliance on rules and regulations has evolved to a point where public organisations in countries like Botswana seem to suffer from overregulation which is seen, to some extent, to be counterproductive in that it has the propensity to sap morale and efficiency as it stifles innovation and promotes mediocrity. In this regard, Dilulio (1994:15) have observed that overregulation has led to "the emergence of overly rigid, bureaucratized personnel systems that can frustrate productive workers, protect unproductive ones, and – perhaps worse – seem incapable of distinguishing one from the other and rewarding effective performers to their desserts." This clearly suggests that civil servants with ingenuity can be frustrated because the structural set up and the functioning of public organisations can stifle creativity and initiative which can result in some of these people leaving the public sector.

A caveat is essential at this stage, namely that rules and regulations are

essential in as far as they preclude public officers from being perverted into instruments for actualising private gain at the expense of the populace. The human element also makes a contribution to the weakness of the public sector. Judging from media reports, it seems that in many countries the public sector is fraught with corrupt practices. Especially in Africa, it is not uncommon to hear of a former president, police chief or a serving minister being implicated in corrupt dealings. Rules and regulations therefore, are essential in pursuit of equity in the provision of goods and services to the public. In addition, "rules and regulations can serve as guidelines for solving routine problems and are effective co-ordination instruments to co-ordinate and control routine activities in the enterprise" (Kroon 1990:213). Most of these regulations could have been developed in response to specific political concerns. The concern is however, about excessive regulations which do not allow public employees to use their intelligence and initiative to try new possibilities to promote the delivery of the public service. The adherence to rules might have originally been conceived as a means to achieve public goals but has unfortunately become the goal itself.

The Weberian model culminated in an inclination towards structuring the conduct of public organisations in a fairly predictable manner. Besides, their employees have tenure of office and therefore are assured of continuity in the employ of government. As a result, there is not much incentive to protect their jobs and, consequently, put marginal effort in their work and this casts aspersion on leadership in public organisations. All this has far reaching implications for the productivity of public organisations at least in Botswana. In fact, the Government of Botswana has recognised this tendency and therefore recently introduced the Performance Management Systems (PMS) "to ensure that Government delivers the implementation of agreed policies effectively" (National Development Plan 2003:69). The PMS is an intervention that is aimed at committing employees to carefully identified and agreed objectives so that if individuals achieve objectives then their organizations will also achieve their objectives and therefore improve their performance. It is intended to enhance efficiency and effectiveness of the civil service with the ultimate view

of supporting continuous quality improvement in public service delivery. This clearly indicates that the Government of Botswana is concerned about the quality of service delivery in the country.

The other weakness of the public sector is its tendency to expand whilst not being able to deliver its mandate to the satisfaction of its clientele. Expansion of the public sector entails more of the scarce resources being expended on its operations. These views have been captured succinctly by Tuner and Hulme (1997:2) when they observed that "there is ample evidence of dysfunctional bureaucracies avidly devouring scarce resources but failing to produce anticipated outcomes." Scarce resources should not be put to waste especially where there are organisations that are capable of delivering such outcomes cost-effectively like those in the private sector.

Public services should be delivered within a quality assurance framework. In particular, there should be commitment to build in quality by those who deliver the services. Besides, there need to be a clear policy advocating employee involvement in continuous improvement of the quality of services their organisation provides and that public service delivery must be user driven with a deliberate effort to continuously satisfy the user. It should be argued that over and above the user, the public sector services should be driven by goals and values of the public and not regulations. In the contemporary global community it is imperative that public service delivery should be benchmarked against the best in the world and the opportunity be created for the user to provide continuous feedback on the quality of service received (Deming 1986:25). Essentially, this is what the new public management approach to the public sector advocates.

2.5.2   New public management (NPM)

In order to effectively deal with new public management one may have to first explain the concepts of management and public management and these are dealt with below.

2.5.2.1 Management

Management is a concept that can be defined in a variety of ways by different authors. However, Ströh (2001:7) has defined management "as a continuous and integrated process whereby certain individuals with authority ensure institutional goal-setting and optimum realisation of objectives." So the aim of management is to give direction in the institution and facilitate the optimal achievement of organisation goals by effectively and efficiently using resources at the disposal of the organisation. Management is recognised as an integrated process because those in management positions focus on a great variety of tasks and roles almost at the same time. These tasks and roles are essential for the successful operation of an organisation. It is also recognised that the process focuses on organisational goals or objectives and the optimum achievement thereof as a responsibility of those in management positions (Ströh & Van der Westhuizen 1994:12). All this clearly indicates the significant role that management in general plays in the success of any organisation be it in the public or private sector. Management being goal-oriented in an organisational context refers to the performance of specific functions by these in exalted positions in organisations.

2.5.2.2 Management functions

Various authors on management have come up with different groupings of tasks which are referred to as management functions. For example Uys (1994:19) has identified planning, organisation, leadership and control; Hersey and Blankchard (1993:6) have planning, organising, motivating, and controlling; Ströh (2001:8) classified management functions as leadership, planning, decision-making, organisation, and control. These classifications are indicative of the fact that management is quite broad and involving.

From these classifications it can be inferred that those in management positions have substantial authority to determine the nature and scope of the

44

activities of the organisation they inhabit. They can decide and plan, for example, the activities they wish to embark upon and therefore their creativity and initiatives can be brought to bear upon the dynamics of their organisations. It does follow from the previous paragraph that management is goal oriented and therefore those in management positions can decide on the goals to be pursued and make plans to accomplish such goals. Such management functions are briefly explained below.

(a) Planning

Planning is all about deciding on what should happen in the future. This view is motivated by a definition of the concept as formulated by Brynard in Bekker (1996:132) that "planning consists of those activities which are aimed at the formulation of a future course of action directed at the achievement of a certain goal or set of goals by optimal means." Planning involves setting goals and objectives for an organisation and therefore it is a means towards an end.

(b) Decision making

In an organisational context, making things happen the way they should depends to a large extent on the ability to make and implement the right decisions. Therefore decision making cuts across the spectrum of functions in an organisation and therefore represents its brain and nervous system (Graft 1993:344). It involves making a choice between alternatives in an attempt to deal with a situation for which the need for a solution is perceived. Ströh & Van der Westhuizen (1994:61) defined decision making "as a conscious choice of the most suitable alternative from among the identified solutions, but that such choice is dependent on and is the result of a process of activities which has, as its aim, the making of a choice." Decision making can be viewed as a process that begins with the understanding of the situation or problem and culminates in the knowledge of the action to be taken so that the subordinate workers can be led to undertake it.

(c)   Leadership

This entails leading or directing human resources of an organisation and motivating them to work productively. It is the utilisation of personnel to the fullest of their intellectual and physical abilities in order to optimally achieve predetermined goals and objectives of an organisation. Leadership is the ability to influence a group of people towards the accomplishment of goals (Robbins, Odendaal & Roodt 2003:242).

(d)   Controlling

Controlling is a regulatory task of management that is aimed at ensuring that things happen the way they should. In this context, management ensures that the organisation is on track in pursuit of its goals. This entails the monitoring of performance of an organisation or part thereof so that deviations from the set goals can be identified and, if need be, corrective measures instituted to bring the organisation back on track (Arnolds, Tamangani & van der Merwe 2001:153). Control can be viewed as a continuous process so that whenever errors occur they can be detected and rectified before a lot of waste can be incurred by an organisation.

In order for the management functions to be carried out effectively and efficiently, the public manager must be in possession of some specific skills. Some of these are considered below.

2.5.2.3 Management skills

It must be accepted that managers need various skills in order to cope with the demands of their multifarious tasks. Katz in Robbins *et al* (2003:6) has grouped these skills into three broad categories, namely technical skills, human skills, and conceptual skills.

(a) Technical skills

Technical skills refer to the category of skills which enables the manager to use resources and scientific knowledge and to apply techniques in order to accomplish the objectives of the organisation.   Technical skills require specialised knowledge or expertise which is normally acquired through training but sometimes on the job.

(b) Human skills

Human skills refer to the ability to work well with other people and achieve results through them. Like other categories, human skills can be broken down into specific skills. For example, communication, delegation and motivation are specific human skills. Many people in management positions are technically proficient yet they are deficient in this category of skills. It is therefore important that they acquire such skills may be through training.

(c) Conceptual skills

This is the cognitive capacity to perceive the organisation in its totality and the relationship between parts thereof. It includes the ability to understand how change in one unit will affect the other units. It also includes being able to understand the situation one wants to influence and the possible consequences thereof. These skills manifest themselves in managers being able to analyse and diagnose relatively complicated situations whilst at the same time being able to visualise the interrelationships of various units of an organisation.

2.5.2.4   Management context

It has been stated in one of the previous paragraphs that management manifests itself in an organisational context. This facet of the concept is looked at more closely in this paragraph.

Management can be viewed from at least two contexts, namely the private and/or the public sector. It should be stated that although there are some private organisations which are non-profit oriented, the focus here is on profit making private institutions because they make up the bulk of such organisations. On the other hand public organisations, except quasi-governmental ones which are not the focus of this discussion, are not concerned with profit but rather with service provision in order to maximise the general welfare of society. The public sector comprises many diverse organisations which are created by government to promote the general welfare of the society. These institutions are managed by public managers but are accountable to the legislative organisations which, in turn, are accountable to the electorate. This is the context in which public management manifests itself. Management in the private sector is predominantly market driven. To this end, Horton and Farnham (1999:29) observed that "private businesses, in short, must be both profitable and economically efficient to survive in the market place. The managerial function within them derives from these basic facts of economic life." All this suggests that the objectives and functions of public institutions differ from those of the private ones. This is also true of the environment in which these organisations operate. It could be argued that although institutions in the private sector are not specifically established for the purpose of implementing public policy, they contribute towards the implementation of public policy by complying with certain statutory requirements.

2.5.2.5 Concept new public management (NPM)

Some of the salient weaknesses of the public sector have been noted earlier in the chapter. The emergence of NPM should, by and large, be viewed as a political and organisational response to the shortcomings of the traditional mode of public service delivery. Hope and Choked (2000:26) observed that "the conceptualisation and the development of the NPM was based on the growing reality of government failure in efficient delivery of public service and

the enhancement of an environment conducive to sustainable development." Such failures could lead to stagnation, fiscal crises, and poor quality of public service. In fact, it is often argued that most, if not all, countries that currently follow the NPM route experienced economic and fiscal crisis with the traditional mode of public service delivery (Larbi@ www.unrisd.org2006). On the other hand, Rainer (1999:97) has argued that international experience shows that the main objective of NPM reform has predominantly been to overcome the current crisis in funding and public service delivery.

NPM is fundamentally concerned with cutting costs and generally increasing productivity through a variety of strategies that are essentially aimed at cultivating economic norms and efficiency values in the public sector. This reform paradigm relies, to a large extent, on the combination of microeconomic theory and managerialism (Christensen & Per Laegried 2001:79). The intention is to bring private sector economy, efficiency and effectiveness to the public sector by the introduction of private market principles and practices. In a way, NPM entails a "redefinition of the role and purpose of government and, concomitantly, the emerging importance of market and instrumental values in ordering our political and social affairs. The inevitable results of this trend … are that politics, at least ostensibly, is being mortgaged to economics" (Ventriss 2000:504). A new relationship between politics and economics is unleashed in which the latter is given more prominence in the public sector leading to a mixture of market incentives and political authority. The ultimate consequence of this mixture could be the reduction of the public sector by shedding those activities which are not part of its core business.

It has been implied above that NPM is a variety of strategies because it is not a single option but rather, a menu of choices. In actuality, NPM is a menu of public sector reform strategies from which governments can select some items and ignore others at a particular point in time. However, the chosen items have to be contextualised in terms of the circumstances prevailing in a particular country and these include, but not limited to, historical and cultural traditions, political dispensation, and economic conditions (Dempster, Freakly & Parry

2001:2; Turner 2002:1494). The NPM menu contains the principles that are embedded in the reform paradigm.

The principles and ideological aspects of NPM have been captured differently by different authors. For example, Pollitt in Balfour and Grubbs (2000:576) identified five key concepts that underlie NPM, namely:

(a)   Social progress through economically defined productivity;

(b)   Application of sophisticated technologies to improve productivity;

(c)   A labour force disciplined in accordance with the productivity ideal;

(d)   Management as the key player in achieving greater productivity; and

(e)   Managerial flexibility or the right to manage.

This classification focuses predominantly on productivity and recognises the critical role management can play in public organisations. On the other hand, Hood in Hughes (1998:61); Alistair (1999:1378) and Nolan (2001: XXV) have identified the following seven major features of NPM:

(a)   Hands-on professional management in the public sector which advocates devolution of powers to heads of department so that public managers can manage their departments. They become personally responsible for the results of their departments to the extent of losing their jobs if things go wrong.

(b)   Explicit standards and measures of performance. This places an emphasis on outcomes instead of outputs. In this case, departments are expected to develop performance indications in order to measure progress being made in pursuit of objectives. Performance measurement can also be used as a basis for rewarding employees or for improving against them.

(c)   Greater emphasis on output controls to be facilitated by means of performance and programme budgeting. This is a system in which funds are allocated on the basis of specific programmes of departments. In this case, costs are listed at programme level. This approach invariably

calls for better long term planning and strategic management so that resources are directed at expected outcomes.

(d) A shift to desegregation of units in the public sector in which large developments are split into smaller policy departments in order to enhance efficiency through 'one – stop shops'.

(e) A shift to grater competition in the provision of public service with a view to cutting costs by putting services to tender.

(f) A stress on private sector styles of management practice particularly with regard to flexibility in hiring, firing and rewards.

(g) Discipline and parsimony in resource use. Here the emphasis is on cost cutting with attention on the best use of available resources so that objectives can be achieved at the least possible cost.

The classification of principles of NPM by Hood appears more elaborate and, to a large extent, includes the classification by Pollitt. However, what does seem clear is that NPM advocates the transfer of private sector forms of governance and organisation from the private sector to the public sector. The result of which is, among others, the transformation of organisational identity of public organisations into a business – like identity in anticipation of increasing both efficiency and effectiveness of the public sector. In the same vein, Horton (2003:403) has suggested that NPM reflects "a transformation from a traditional bureaucratic system of public administration to a market-oriented results-driven system of public management." So market principles and practices are now preferred in the public sector domain.

The inclination towards private sector styles of management further implies greater emphasis on competition within the frontiers of the public sector. The NPM movement advocates high performance by public organisations in which the production of desired goods and/or services is at higher quantity and quality with fewer resources used whilst "productivity and quality improve continuously, from day to day, week to week, and year to year ..." (Osborne 1998:11). In particular, such organisations have a clear understanding of such missions from which specific outcomes are defined and pursued with a view to

achieving their missions. High performing organisations, within the NPM movement, place greater emphasis on "quality, value, customer satisfaction, and results rather than compliance with rules and regulations" (Popovich 1998:20). This does not however, suggest that rules and regulations in public organisations are not important. Certainly they are useful but what NPM theory is questioning is, among others, placing greater prominence on rules and regulations at the expense of quality and expeditious service provision to the populace. Rules and regulations should enhance, and not constrain, equity and the promotion of the general welfare of the public.

The intent is to advocate a departure from rigid control-oriented to more flexible and responsive service-oriented public organisations. The NPM movement can therefore be viewed as a form of rejection of the 'orthodox' Weberian theory of bureaucratic public organisations. The movement further advocates the substitution of competitive contracting for the outmoded form of public service delivery. The NPM approach was motivated by, among others, the fact that "governments were faced with declining real revenue but with political demands to maintain services at the same levels" (Hughes 1998:59). Notwithstanding this observation by Hughes, it can also be stated that whilst real revenue might be declining, the demand for more and better services is evident and one of the viable options in this regard could be the increase in productivity. However, the increase in productivity and continuous quality improvement in the delivery of public services is the kernel of the NPM movement and it is pursued through a two-pronged strategy. That is the improvement of performance in public organisations and the greater use of the private sector in the delivery of public goods and services. In particular, the intent is "to promote a dependable, efficient, competitive and open public procurement system for contracting out and contracting in intermediate goods and services; and, end monopoly or other protection for supplies" (Hughes 1998:60).

The NPM, by and large, adds a new dimension to public sector governance. It advocates contractualism in the public sector. It is however, noted that

contracting out is not necessarily a new concept in government circles but has been very limited. Experience in Botswana suggests that contractualism is limited to cleaning, short term catering and construction. However, NPM vastly extends the application of contracting out and it is used, on a much larger scale, in many kinds of infrastructure as well as in services such as education and health care (Lane 2000:7).

It should be noted however, that the application of market principles and business practices in public institutions has its limitations. Denhardt (1993:9) observed that managerialism can exacerbate the problem of excessive control and regulation and that "it is most vulnerable in its ethical content . . . In its most extreme technical application, managerialism embraces a variety of practices that are antithetical to those democratic principles that should guide work in the public sector." Felts and Jos (2000:520) decried the unfortunate features of NPM as they argued that "the speed and scale of both academic and institutional advance of the new public management is even more disconcerting since it represents a serious challenge to many of public administration's commitments to values other than efficiency, including equity, constitutional stewardship, public spiritedness, and citizenship." However, as stated earlier, managerialism – the application of market principles and business practices to the running of public institutions – can be most appropriate in the productive state of the public sector. This is the aspect of the public sector that should embrace some of the private sector approaches.

2.6   ANALYSIS OF THE PRIVATE SECTOR

The private sector is an important element in this thesis and therefore needs to be explained in some detail. It should be noted that the public and private sectors perform different, albeit interrelated roles in the establishment of a productive economy. As a result, there should be close co-operation between these sectors working jointly in the national interest (Porter 2003:14). In particular, these two sectors need each other and therefore should co-exist in a symbiotic manner.

2.6.1 Overview of the private sector

The private sector is not monolithic in nature since it is made up of organisations of different sizes, complexities and interests. For the purposes of this thesis, the private sector is regarded as the totality of organisations that are outside the public sector and engaged in activities for profit purposes (Osborne 2000:37). This delimitation is necessary because there are some organisations that fall outside the public sector yet they are of little, if any, relevance to the context of public-private partnerships in this thesis. The fundamental aim of the private sector is of a commercial nature and particularly the pursuit of profit or to take up a significant segment of the market. As a result, organisations in the private sector often face a daunting task of competition and the attendant risks which in turn serve as a source of motivation to work smarter and be more productive with a specific focus on satisfying the needs of the customers that are often in a state of flux. In line with this view, Smit and Cronjé (1999:72) observed that "the result of this competition is that the market mechanism . . . provides an incentive for higher productivity and encourages technological innovation." Such competition normally results in benefits to consumers and therefore should be encouraged to make inroads into the public sector if public service delivery is to be responsive and therefore beneficial to the needs of the community. One may consider the genesis of the private sector from human nature because the private organisations are owned by individuals.

2.6.2 Genesis of private organisations

Individuals have a variety of motives and the most relevant in this context is the economic motive. As rational beings, individuals' actions are guided by the desire for more of economic commodities than less, because they desire to maximize satisfaction (Swart 1992:2; Hughes 1998:66). In addition, greed seems to be inherent in human nature. As his conduct is guided by the economic motive, an individual will do everything in his power to amass wealth. Private organisations in pursuit of profit is nothing more than an individual or

individuals coming together to formerly and/or openly pursue their self interest in an organised manner. So the private sector organisation exists fundamentally to pursue self interest and engage in activities that are propelled by the economic motive of the shareholders and everything else is of secondary importance. However, private organisations' order of significance can at times be obscured by the fact that self interest is pursued through ostensibly serving the interests of other people, normally customers. In this regard, the private organisations appear to be focused on the interests of the customers and treat them with great respect in order to achieve the primary objective of pursuing the interests of the stakeholders. On the other hand, the private organisations can also be dangerous to other people or even customers if that is the way it can achieve maximum satisfaction/return on investment. This can be in the same manner as an individual who would go all the way to harm or even kill another person in order to rob him of his wealth.

An individual can engage in all sorts of things in order to amass wealth even illegally regardless of his position in society as stated earlier in the chapter. If individuals can do this certainly their organisations can do it as well. So private organisations in question can masquerade as humble and humane entities yet they can harbour ulterior motives. As a result, such organisations will seize any opportunity that comes their way in order to enrich the owners or stakeholders. This feature of private organisations is the least pronounced by such organisations. However, pursuing self-interest through sinister means may not be sustainable and therefore private organisations tend to be organised and managed in a manner that stand to yield the best possible results.

2.6.3 Distinguishing private organisations

Public and private organisations can be distinguished from each other in a variety of ways but it is easier to make such a distinction on the basis of finance and ownership of such organisations. Whereas public organisations are, by and large, owned and financed by the state, private organisations are "owned and financed by invididuals, partners, or shareholders in a joint stock

company" (Mullins 1989:63). As a result, losses or profits made by the private organisation are not communal and are therefore confined to a few individuals who own the organisation individually and/or collectively. In addition, a lot of information about private organisations is confined to the owners and the openness of such organisations is, to a large extent, limited (Perry & Rainey 1998:183). This is so partly because the organisation is neither accountable to the community nor acting as its agent.

2.6.4   Operations of the private sector

The private sector is believed to be superior to the public sector in terms of efficiency and effectiveness. It may therefore the instructive to analyse, albeit in brief some of the salient operations of the private sector in order to highlight its nature.

2.6.4.1   Marketing

The private sector is generally dynamic in its business undertakings partly because most organisations in this sector endeavour to continuously improve on the quality of their products, develop new ones and vigorously market such products. Most business organisations would like to market their products in order to enable people to know and develop interest in such products and hopefully purchase them. With bigger organisations, marketing may even go beyond the frontiers of their country in order to exploit the global markets and take advantages and benefits thereof. Such companies would seek advantages and benefits that exist internationally while at the same time taking cognizance of the complexities that may exist in the international markets. As Punnett and Ricks (1992:249) put it "companies that choose to go international or expand their international presence do so to gain from perceived benefits. They want also to minimise the risks to which they are exposed. The decision is made in the context of their particular internal and external environments. Very simply, internally, they consider strengths and weaknesses; externally, they consider opportunities and threats." So a private organisation can operate in the

international markets if the net effects of such actions are positive.

Marketing is a way value is created for people or customers. The need for such value could also be established before its creation and this could be done through some research. However, the creation of value or utility is invariably guided by the perception that the creator of such value will also benefit in the end. In this regard, Giglierano (2002:5) observed that marketing is "a process by which companies create value for customers and build strong customer relationships in order to capture value from customers in return." All this suggests that the purpose of marketing is broader than telling and selling to include exploring the market in order to discover unarticulated needs and uncover new and unserved opportunities. In this way managers can have a better vision of a broader set of customer needs and thereby identify potential new market opportunities (Best 2004:59). So in business marketing management's focus is on understanding the present as well as the prospective customer requirements. This enables the business organisation to create and deliver value to targeted market segments and customers (Anderson & Narus 2004:55). In this context, it could be argued that the private organisations are responsive to the needs of the people which they get to know through market research. All this further suggests that marketing not only leads to commercial dynamism but also innovation.

2.6.4.2   Innovation

The private sector is generally perceived to be innovative and often looking for better ways and means of doing things in order to enhance their productivity and sustain their relevance to the customers. Legge (1992:1) commented that "without innovation, sales of most products would grind to a near halt as nearly every potential customer became a satisfied actual one. Innovation gets the customers to put their hands back into their pockets." This could suggest that private organisations need to be innovative in order to stay alive. All this is achieved through, among others, the efforts of a corporate entrepreneur who is skilled in shifting economic resources from an area of low productivity to that

of higher productivity. In particular, the primary role of an entrepreneur is to optimally combine available resources to achieve the greatest possible output. Adelman and Marks (2004:8) noted that "the entrepreneur combines land, labour, and capital resources to produce a good or service that we value more than the sum of the individual parts." The private sector invariably conducts its affairs opportunistically perhaps in the same manner an individual would do. Commercial dynamism of the private sector derives in part from innovation and its responsiveness to the ever changing needs of the customers. The corporate entrepreneur remains important in this regard.   In this context, Kanter (1996:210) has noted that "corporate entrepreneurs are people who test limits and create new possibilities for organisational action by pushing and directing the innovation process. They push the creation of new production technology, or experiment with new, more humanly responsive work practices." Entrepreneurs are also engaged in developing and maintaining the organisation's corporate strategy which is "concerned with competing for customers, generating value from the resources and the underlying principle of the sustainable competitive advantages of those resources over rival companies" (Lynch 2003:7). In addition, corporate strategy will exhibit major goals and essential plans for achieving such goals in a manner that will succinctly define the business the organisation is in. It may be added that the private sector makes careful choices not only as to how to operate but also where to operate looking at the prospects for profitability.

The location from where a private company operates is not politically determined. Instead, the owners or shareholders determine the location by primarily considering market variables in such a manner as to enhance the chances for economic prosperity. In this context, Houlden (1990:12) observed that "whatever the size or complexity of the company, the core of company strategy concerns markets and products or services. It is about choosing: where and how to allocate resources to yield the greatest overall success." It should nevertheless be added that success in business organisation does not only depend on the aforementioned strategy. Success is possible where there is good strategy as well as good management practice on a day-to-day basis of

which the private sector is renowned for.

2.6.4.3 Private sector management

The private sector is renowned for management practices that surpass those of the public sector. This is notwithstanding the fact that the private sector was at some point as bureaucratic as the public sector (Hughes 1998: 67) but led in changes towards more flexible forms of management. Such forms of management are generally perceived to be better and more efficient than the hierarchical mode of public administration. In this context, Field and Peck (2003:495) observed that "in Australia, New Zealand and Canada, in common with much of Europe, policy makers are eager to make greater use of the private sector in the provision of public services. As in the UK, these changes are justified on the basis that the private sector is more efficient and more cost-effective." These are some of the virtues of the private sector which make it attractive to the public sector. Indeed the public sector needs some measure of efficiency and cost-effectiveness in order to improve the general welfare of the populace. Therefore, these private sector values need to be assimilated by the public sector.

2.6.5 Weaknesses of the private sector

Private businesses which constitute the private sector are owned by people. Consequently, the economic motive which seems inherent in the human nature should be expected to permeate these human-owned enterprises. In particular, the private sector is vigorously in pursuit of profit and, sometimes at the expense of the moral values of society. Crime in the human community is rife and in most cases it is driven by the economic motive. Experience seems to suggest that corruption is rife in the private sector and this could generate resistance against public-private partnerships in the delivery of public service and therefore the use of scarce public resources. If indeed corruption is rife in the private sector and the public is aware of that, then it will be difficult for the public to have faith in such a partnership. However, since the private sector

has numerous strengths, some of which are articulated above, the public-private partnerships should be encouraged together with a proper regulatory framework. In addition, public education in the use of such a partnership will be essential in enhancing public understanding and trust in the new dispensation.

2.7 CONCLUSION

It has been noted that the structure of the contemporary public institutions can be linked to the classical approach to organisation and management that extended from the late 19th century to the early 1920s. Some of the popular contributors to this approach are Fredrick Taylor who focused on increasing productivity of the worker, Henri Fayol whose interest was with the management process of large organisations, and Max Weber who was preoccupied with how organisations were structured. The primary objective of the public sector is the promotion of general welfare of the populace. However, there are various philosophies of public service provision and in this chapter, two of such philosophies have been presented. These are the theory of public interest of the welfare maximising state and the competitive theory of private markets and public institutions. The emergence and features of the NPM approach have also been briefly analysed. The private sector has been described as being driven by the market forces particularly the economic motive.

Having analysed the two sectors, it is now appropriate to consider the extent to which the two sectors could work collaboratively in the form of a partnership.

CHAPTER 3

A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK OF PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS

3.1   INTRODUCTION

The past few years have witnessed numerous reforms in the governance of the public sector and such reforms have been motivated by a number of factors. However, some of these factors border on low morale among public servants, low productivity in the public sector, ever increasing financial constraints and the citizen's lack of confidence in public service delivery. Besides, the global community is currently experiencing change that is continuously unfolding at a fast rate. Consequently, developing countries like Botswana need to be guided by the global trends whilst at the same time maintaining their uniqueness. One of the imperatives in the contemporary global community, as indicated earlier, is the use of public-private partnership (PPP) in public service delivery.

The aim of this chapter is to present a conceptual framework of public-private partnerships in the delivery of public service. Some definitions of PPP are presented and, in particular, the relationship between PPP and privatisation is elucidated. In order to do so, the concept of privatisation is also analysed. Various models of PPP are analysed in this chapter with a view to identifying one that is most suitable for the delivery of senior secondary education in the Gaborone City area if not in the entire country. Strengths and limitations of PPP are also analysed in the chapter and so are the antecedents of the successful implementation of PPPs.

3.2   PRIVATISATION OF STATE ENTERPRISE

Privatisation and PPP are inextricably linked and, in fact the latter is essentially one form of privatisation. PPP is a relatively new concept and perhaps not yet familiar to many people (Auger 2002:165). It is part of human nature to fear the unknown and therefore it is perceived prudent to link the unfamiliar

concept to the relatively known one in order to promote its acceptability in the public domain. However, privatisation is a controversial concept (Wettenhall 2007:396) and those averse to it may have difficulty in embracing its associates. But both in theory and in practice the two concepts are linked. Consequently, to have a better understanding of PPP, privatisation is first elucidated in the form of its definitions.

3.2.1 Definitions of privatisation

Privatisation can mean different things to different people. In normal conversation, privatisation seems to be confined to the process of selling state assets. However, Feigenbaum, Henig and Hamnet (1999:1) regard privatisation as the process that is aimed at shifting functions and/or responsibilities, in part or in whole, from the government to the private sector. On the other hand, Jackson and Price in Hughes (1998:116) have a broad view of privatisation in that, according to them, it encompasses "the sale of public assets; deregulation; opening up state monopolies to greater competition; contracting out; the private provision of public services; joint capital projects using public and private finance; and reducing subsidies or introducing user charges."   For the purposes of this thesis, a broader view of privatisation is espoused, namely that privatisation encapsulates a wide range of techniques that are aimed at promoting greater involvement of the private sector in what hitherto was the province of the public sector. Closely allied to this view, Auger in Osborne (2002:165) argued that privatisation in use today span a broad area that includes:-

(a) **Contracting -**   The government sets the standards but signs an agreement with a private provider, for-profit or not-for-profit, to provide goods or manage services. The state funds the provision of the services.

(b) **Voucher -** The government unit sets standards of service but individuals or groups can choose or select among producers available in

the open market. Like contracting, the government pays for the services.

(c) **Public-private partnerships -** The state conducts projects in cooperation with private providers.

(d) **Franchise** – The state gives monopoly privileges to a private producer to provide a service in a given geographical area and individual consumers decide if they wish to purchase the service.

(e) **Grants and subsidies** – The state agrees to partially support or subsidize a private group in order to provide a service.

(f) **Asset sale** - The state sells or cashes out its assets to private individuals, receiving a windfall gain and enlarging the tax base.

(g) **Volunteerism** – The state uses volunteers to provide public services.

(h) **Private donation** – The state relies on private sector resources for assistance in providing public services. Private providers may loan personnel, facilities, or equipment to government agencies.

Privatisation can be for a limited period of time or indefinite depending on the form it takes. Whereas assets sale can be viewed as an indefinite transfer of functions, PPP is more of a temporary transfer that is defined in contractual terms (Pongsiri 2002:489; Reeves 2003:166). Privatisation is, by and large, closely associated with the sale of public assets so much so that the two concepts are at times perceived to mean the same thing as demonstrated above. Once public assets are sold to the private sector, the government no longer has control over such assets whereas with PPPs "the government retains a level of control over the service and often assumes full control at a time agreed between the parties" (Blacke 2004:15). The distinction between PPP and asset sale and, by association, privatisation could mislead people to think that PPP is not a form of privatisation. However, in the case of PPP, it is the private sector that delivers the service and therefore such delivery is actually privatized (Savas 2000:65). It may be argued that other forms of privatisation such as PPPs came about, most likely, as a result of the success of the sale of public assets in some of the developed countries. Kett in Pongsiri (2002:488) argued in the same vein that "public asset sales and outsourcing, including

divestiture of state owned enterprises that occurred under the privatisation programmes, became a vehicle for enhancing the provision of public services in the free market economy." It would appear, therefore that privatisation is taking different shapes.

From the above exposition, it seems plausible to infer that PPP is indeed a form of privatisation and this should become clearer later in this chapter when the concept of PPP is analysed (see section 3.3).

For the purposes of this thesis, privatisation should be viewed in terms of any action that is aimed at subjecting the functions of government to the pressures of the commercial market forces. The nature and scope of the transfer of assets and/or functions account for the various techniques of privatisation. However, for now it might be instructive to analyse arguments about privatisation in general.

3.2.2 Privatisation policy drivers

Privatisation of state organisations is a topical issue that is often treated, in Botswana, in the context of the country's structural adjustment reform initiatives in an attempt to transform the economy to a more market-oriented system. It has been noted that "throughout the world it has become evident that many state enterprises have not only been inefficient and unproductive, but have been 'loss-makers', draining the state treasury of scarce financial resources by incurring deficits and requiring subsidies" (Prokopenko 1995:6). Privatisation can therefore be seen to be an attempt to reverse this state of affairs by not only attempting to increase the national economic efficiency but also trying to reduce budget deficits and generating more revenue.

Governments do not just privatise. They do so because of certain driving forces that apply individually or collectively (Taylor & Warrack 2002:81; Hughes 1998:116). Some of such forces or arguments for privatisation are analysed below, namely economic and ideological arguments and arguments for

management efficiency. There are nevertheless, some arguments against privatisation and they are also analysed in brief (see section 3.2.2.4).

3.2.2.1 Economic arguments

From an economic point of view, privatisation is a rationalisation process and a significant aspect of government policy that is aimed at reducing government spending without sacrificing the quality of service. It is also an aspect of government policy that is meant to bolster the private sector initiative and a market- oriented economy (Gildenhuys 1997: 41).

Transferring some government function to the private sector should ideally result in reduced cost of government spending (Jonker 2001:243; Taylor & Warrack 2002:88). The service will continue to be provided but at no or reduced financial cost to the government and thereby saving the taxpayers' money in the context of that particular service. If the organisation providing the service is not included in the national budget, then it can be expected that, *ceteris paribus*, the cost to government or budget deficit, where there has been one, will be reduced. Funds normally used for the performance of a privatised function could be saved or used to address other pressing social needs. The private sector performing a privatised function will normally do so on a commercial basis. This could result in an increased tax base and more revenue to government since the private organisation performing the function, which hitherto was performed by the public organisation, will be expected to pay tax (Savas 2000:240). It is nevertheless possible that some other effects of privatisation might counteract this benefit. For example, if privatisation can result in lay-offs, which is quite possible, then the tax that would have been collected from those leaving the organisation will be foregone which could reduce the gains from taxation (Gildenhuys 1997:41). Notwithstanding this possibility, it is also possible that those remaining in the employ of the organisation will be offered higher salaries and therefore expected to pay higher tax resulting in more revenue to government (Savas 2000:290).

In the event government has more revenue, say from the sales of some of its assets, taxes can be reduced especially when a budget surplus is anticipated. Reduction in taxation can motivate private investment and thus enhancing economic activity which could facilitate economic growth and employment creation. Increased government revenue and reduced cost of government spending could result in reductions in public sector borrowing requirement (Hughes 1998:116) and thereby improving the economic picture of a country. This can also attract foreign direct investment (FDI) and therefore creating more opportunities for the much needed economic growth. The economic argument for privatisation is succinctly presented by Turner and Hulme (1997:190) as they contend that "this divestiture of public enterprises fulfils the multiple functions of reducing expenditure, raising revenue and promoting the development of the private sector." In this regard, privatisation can be viewed as a mechanism to reduce budgetary constraints probably caused by the inefficiencies of the state organisations.

It can also be argued that privatisation can assist in creating opportunities for the expansion and/or development of the private sector. This is important in view of the fact that a well developed private sector has the capacity to propel economic growth hence often referred to as the engine of development and growth (Agere 2000:43; Kroukamp 2004:28). Public organisations are often constrained in their ability to fund the necessary capital expenditure due, in part, to budgetary limitations. This can inhibit creativity and innovation, and can limit the organisation's ability to be responsive to the public needs. However, privatisation can create a greater capacity for the organisation to obtain and maintain capital equipment as the private sector has an enhanced capacity to attract both domestic and foreign investment (Prokopenko 1995:10). For example, partnerships between domestic and foreign private organisations are very possible and the latter could well be replete with resources. Enabling the private capital and technology to flow into the country is a good thing to do because it creates an opportunity for the development and growth of the private sector in the country (Gillis *et al* 1992:288). From this point of view, privatisation can deliver the public sector organisations from

the burden of budgetary limitations and enhance their capacity to provide the necessary services to the general populace. However, arguments to the contrary are possible and some are analysed below (see section 3.2.2.4).

Privately owned organisations have a much greater incentive to be responsive to the needs of the consumers because of the profit motive (Savas 2000:240). As a result, they make an effort to discover and meet the needs of the consumers which they do by producing goods and services in quantities and qualities preferred by the consumers. They do all this at a profit and, in doing so, such organisations use scarce resources to the dictates of the public without being constrained by political pressure and problems associated with the overall public sector management. The priorities of the political leadership are normally different and at times in conflict with those of the effective commercial organisations. Essentially, privatisation substitutes market disciplines for political influence (Trafford & Proctor 2006:118). But, of course, control over privatised organisations by the government does not disappear completely as government is the custodian of the collective interest and therefore has a duty to protect the public against, among others, merciless private organisations.

Privatisation exposes the activities in question to market forces and competition. The virtue of competition is that it "provides powerful incentives to both produce and price efficiently in pursuit of gaining a greater market share and better financial performance" (Hughes 1998:117). In a related argument, Kikeri and Nellis (2004:106) have observed that "neoclassical economic theory . . . regards market structure and the degree of competition to be of equal or greater importance. Empirically, some analysts concluded that increased exposure to competition accounts for most of the positive changes seen in privatised firms." Where there is competition, consumers have the opportunity to purchase goods and services from the lowest-cost suppliers. In this regard, Bishop, Kay and Mayer (1995:5) argued that competition achieves productive efficiency by encouraging organisations to minimise costs. It also achieves allocative efficiency by bringing consumers' demands in line

with marginal costs of supply. To some extent, competition is a mechanism for maximising consumer benefits essentially by limiting or even eliminating monopoly. As long as other organisations are free to enter the market for the services provided by a privatised organisation rivalry between competitors will force prices to go down and quality of service to improve (Prokopenko 1995:10). The private markets are also significant to the national economy in that they have the capacity to satisfy both the producers and the consumers as they are able to efficiently allocate the scarce resources through competition. However, there are instances where the market fails to be effective in the performance of certain functions in which case the performance of such functions by government is justified (Musgrave & Musgrave 1989:42).

One of the main reasons to privatise a public sector organisation is to improve the economic efficiency within and without the organisation in question (Hughes 1998:118). Whether the privatised organisation remains a monopoly or not, the private sector organisations invariably endeavour to produce at the least possible costs. It should be expected that the management of the privatised organisation will make an effort to identify the unproductive units and/or processes of the organisation with a view to developing strategies to enhance their performance if such units can not be discarded.

Government policy is normally derived from an ideology that is held say by a ruling political party (Bernhardt 1993:52). The next privatisation policy driver to be analysed is ideology.

3.2.2.2   Ideological arguments

The political ideology can be a powerful imperative in determining the *modus operandi* in the public sector. In this context, political ideology can be viewed in terms of a bi-polar continuum with nationalisation at the one end and privatisation at the other end of the continuum (Taylor *et al* 2002:87). There is a school of thought that advocates all activities to be handled by the private sector in exception of defence, police, and the courts. To a large extent, this

view is motivated by the conviction that "nationalisation usually leads to inefficient and ineffective management of nationalised enterprises, resulting in unproductivity and substantial losses. It contributes to economic stagnation or even negative economic growth, with a shrinking tax base as the result" (Gildenhuys 1997:41). In this state of affairs, government has to use the tax payers' money to finance inefficiency, ineffectiveness and unproductivity which does not augur well for increased economic prosperity and the improvement of the general welfare of the populace.

The other school of thought corresponding to the other end of the continuum advocates public service delivery to be the sole prerogative of the government. In Africa, most countries at independence embraced the latter school of thought and this was predicated upon the perception that the private sector was invariably weak. In this regard, Agere (2000:67) noted that "when most of governments gained independence, it was assumed that the private sector, left to itself, would neither generate nor allocate investment resources optimally and that government would have to take the lead role in guiding the transformation of the economies."   Indeed at independence countries like Botswana had very few relatively educated people and they were mostly employed in the public sector making it superior to the private sector. In a way such a development paradigm was justified. However, the private sector developed over time to a point where it surpassed the public sector and became instrumental to economic growth and development.

Political ideologies on public service delivery can be located somewhere on the said continuum with the traditional approach being more inclined towards the school of thought that advocates service delivery by public institutions. However, the contemporary view of public service delivery espouses the participation of the private sector (Nisar 2007:155; Kelly 2000:133). To this end, in reference to the private sector participation in public service delivery, Osborne (2000:1) has observed that "the 1990s has seen the establishment of public policy across the world. Not only have they become to be seen as a cost-efficient and effective mechanism for the implementation of public policy

across a range of policy agendas, they have also been articulated as bringing significant benefits in their own right – particularly in terms of developing socially inclusive communities." However, in some developing countries like Botswana it would appear that PPPs have not been widely explored and perhaps only used to a very limited extent.

3.2.2.3 Managerial efficiency and privatisation

The managerial efficiency argument is predicated on the view that the private sector management principles and practices are inherently superior to those of the public sector (Scharle 2002:228). In line with this view, Taylor and Warrack in Osborne (2002:87) observed that despite the best of intentions, for various reasons decision-making in the public sector domain is slower and less certain to actually decide when compared with decision-making in the private sector. They further observed that "a further efficiency advantage of privatisation is that when government has fewer things to do, it has the opportunity to do each and all of them better." As argued in the previous chapter (see section 2.4.2), privatisation enables government to focus on its core business and hopefully to do it better and therefore enhancing the efficiency of the government (Taylor & Warrack 2002:88).

3.2.2.4 Arguments against privatisation

Some of the arguments against privatisation are incorporated under critique of PPPs (see section 3.3.8). However, from the literature review and public debates, it would seem plausible to infer that arguments against privatisation invariably revolve around economic related issues. Despite the positive economic assumptions associated with privatisation, there are those who are averse to it. The public in general does not take kindly to privatisation of public assets and in this regard, Kikeri and Nellis (2004:104) observed that "public opinion surveys from Western Europe, Latin America, South Asia, and Russia reveal that large and growing percentages of citizens view privatisation as a harmful policy . . . journalists in both developing and industrial countries often

portray privatisation in a negative light." This is a mouthful, indeed privatisation has often met some resistance particularly from unions and opposition political parties and facilitated by the private media.

The public is sometimes suspicious of the motives and practices of the private entrepreneurs and their organisations (Sullivan 1987:463). In addition, the public tends to suspect that the higher echelons of the public sector design privatisation programmes and policies to enrich themselves. They are suspected of being the ones who will ultimately benefit more at the expense of the public. There could also be public fears that in pursuit of the profit motive, the private organisation could eliminate unproductive services, provide inferior quality services in an attempt to maximise profits, and leave the poor unserved (Prokopenko 1995:28). In a way the public may feel they are losing, through privatisation, control over the quality and types of goods and services they may wish to be available to them. The public may also feel they have lost in that they may no longer identify themselves with the privatised organisation. They may actually lose the organisation and its control to few individuals who may not have the interest of the public at heart.

Some managers and workers in public organisations tend to be averse to privatisation and therefore resist it. It should be expected that privatisation will result in some form of restructuring which could lead to lay-offs and therefore some people losing their jobs or positions. As a result, public employees tend to oppose privatisation due to the fear of these challenges (Grimshaw 2002:483; Gildenhuys 1997:47). Such opposition can be so furious to the extent of turning into unrests or some strategy to derail it completely. Union leaders are aware of the profit motive of the private sector and that in its pursuit, the private sector organisation may introduce poor working conditions and wages in order to cut costs (Prokopenko 1995:29; Kikeri & Nellis 2004:105). It is also possible that the unions will oppose privatisation because of the fear that the private organisation may not accommodate unionization and therefore making employees lose their bargaining power (Savas 2000:284). In addition to employees and their unions, the opposition political

leaders and organised consumer groups may oppose privatisation on the grounds that, among others, services which were subsidized by the government may no longer be affordable by many people especially the poor. Successful and powerful business people who benefit from the existing state owned organisations may also oppose privatisation for fear of more open competition. Closely allied to this view, Wettenhall (2007:394) suggests that some big private sector organisations have huge political clout and, therefore, their influence can not be ignored in this context.

Privatisation can undermine democracy in service provision in that as the private organisations enter the public service domain, the latter loses its potential to become an area where democratic action is fostered. This inevitably culminates in limited, if any, opportunities for democratic decision making, deliberation, and consideration to accentuate the common good (Boyles 2005:17). Privatisation may actually be seen to connote transfer of the public power to the private interests.

Some of the arguments against privatisation include private monopolies which at times use their power to raise prices and/or cut services in pursuit of profits and this state of affairs can make consumers to suffer. This can happen if privatisation is not combined with deregulation to remove entry and exit barriers from the market and facilitate competition. On the other hand, resistance is sometimes due to lack of understanding which normally results from inadequate consultation.

Despite arguments against privatisation, if properly done the benefits outweigh the losses ensuing from privatisation. It is for this reason that the virtues of privatisation are acknowledged. In this context, the form of privatisation that is central to this thesis, namely public-private partnerships is now analysed.

3.3   PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP

It would appear that prior to the 21st century the philosophy of public governance was, by and large, increased dependence on the public sector and increased distrust of the private sector (McMurray 2006:239; Maserumule & Mathole 2006:220). These sectors were perceived to be so distinct from each other, so much so that their functions were also distinct with very little, if any, cooperation between them. As can be deduced from the analyses in the previous chapter, the private sector is predominantly preoccupied with customer satisfaction; return on investment; and risk/reward evaluation. On the other hand, the public sector is traditionally preoccupied with public service delivery which encompasses, among others, responsibility; accountability; and risk avoidance (Grimshaw & Lewis 2004:97; Scharle 2002:233). However, the development of the free market economy and the concomitant advancement of the private sector seem to have heralded closer cooperation between the public and the private sector. To this end, Pongsiri (2002:487) has argued that "as a result of the development of the free-market economy, most countries are engaged in radical changes, not only in their economic functions, but also in the characteristics and the respective roles of the state and the private sector. The traditional concepts of an autonomous private sector acting in pursuit of its own immediate goals, notably profit maximisation, and a public sector, with discretionary powers and multiple objectives that relate to the pursuit of long-term goals in the public interest, has been challenging . . . Presently, a concept of co-operation between public and private sector to form an inter-organisational partnership has been widely acceptable and will continue to flourish, especially in the countries where the privatisation process has been actively undertaken." Traditional public service providers seem to be constrained in their ability to improve the quality of delivery of services or even to maintain the current levels of service delivery. The participation of the private sector in the provision of public service is one option that needs consideration especially in the form of partnership with public organisations (Nisar 2007:148; Field & Peck 2003:495). It is therefore essential to develop a

clear understanding of what this burgeoning concept of public-private partnership is all about.

3.3.1 Definitions of public-private partnership

It is necessary at the outset to have a clear understanding of the central concept of this chapter, namely public-private partnership. The concept might be used in a variety of ways. For example, Glendinning in Field and Peck (2003: 496) observed that "the term is loosely used and there is no consensus definition." However, it is essential to have a clear understanding of a central concept or, at least, have a clear perspective on which the rest of the thesis is anchored. Partnership connotes an agreement to work together towards a common goal. Ellram in Agere (2000:70) has defined partnership as "an ongoing relationship between two organisations which involves a commitment over an extended time period, and a mutual sharing of the risks and rewards of the relationship." On his part, Stratton in Osborne (2000: 11) has viewed PPP "as collaboration among business, non-profit organisations and government in which risks, resources, and skills are shared in projects that benefit each partner as well as the community." Another view of PPP is "a partnership between the public and the private sector for the purpose of delivering a project or service that is traditionally provided by the public sector" (http://www.gov.ie 2005).

The Canadian Council for Public Private Partnership, in Akintoye, Beck and Hardcastle (2003:4), defines a PPP as "a co-operative venture between the public and private sectors, built on the expertise of each partner that best meets clearly defined public needs through the appropriate allocation of resources, risks and rewards." Perhaps the definition should have added that the co-operative venture extends over a long period of time. In this context, PPP demonstrates the willingness on the part of government to engage the private sector in a contractual arrangement that is based on something more substantive than short term and *ad hoc* relationships.

The Government of South Africa through its Treasury Regulation 16.1 (Gazette No. 25915, 16 January 2004) has defined PPP as "a commercial transaction between an organisation and a private party in terms of which the private party: (a) performs an organisational function on behalf of the organisation; and/or (b) acquires the use of state property for its own commercial purposes; and (c) assumes substantial financial, technical and operational function and/or use of state property; and (d) receives a benefit for performing the organisational function or from utilizing the state property, either by way of: (i) consideration to be paid by the organisation which derives from a revenue fund or, where the organisation is a national government business enterprise or a provincial government business enterprise, for the revenues of such organisation; or (ii) charges or fees to be collected by the private party from users or customers of a service provided to them; or (iii) a combination of such consideration and such charges or fees." From these definitions, a number of conclusions can be made about public-private partnerships, some of these are presented below.

3.3.2 Comments on definitions of PPP

The definitions presented above can lead to a number of conclusions about PPP, some of which are briefly presented here but explained further later on in the chapter. In the first instance, PPP can be seen as a different method of procuring public services by combining the best of the public and the private sector with an emphasis on value for money and delivery of quality services to the public. Secondly, PPP is a formal partnership between public sector organisations and the private sector. Through this arrangement, government works directly with the private sector to jointly pursue common goals that should benefit the general populace as well as the participating organisations.

A PPP is therefore an institutionalised form of co-operation between the public and private sector organisations. This co-operation involves a joint definition of specific targets and a clear allocation of responsibilities as well as the determination of areas of competence between the public and private sector

organisations in pursuit of common goals. The co-operation is an enduring and stable relationship between the partners. So the partnerships conceived in this context discount many one-off transactions between the private and public sector organisations even if such transactions are repeated over time. For example, the Department of Secondary Education in Botswana purchases text books for secondary school students from various publishing companies every year. This relationship falls outside the remit of PPPs considered in this thesis.

The partners share the risks and rewards of the partnership in proportion to their level of investment in the project being undertaken by the partnership. In these partnerships, there is some shared responsibility and, to some extent, authority in activities and outcomes thereof. From the definitions, it can further be inferred that there are basically three significant components of a public-private partnership, namely a public organisation, a private provider, and a partnership agreement that regulates the partnership. The private sector is however not monolithic in nature and therefore includes organisations with different motives and resources within and without the frontiers of a country. The partnership agreement will invariably culminate in a particular model of public-private partnership. Some of the important models are briefly explained later in this chapter (see section 3.3.5).

Moreover, PPP is a long term collaborative relationship between the organisations in the public and private sector. Such a relationship is often of a long term contractual nature and designed to last as long as up to 20 to 40 years or even longer. In this contractual arrangement, resources from the aforementioned organisations are pooled and the responsibilities shared so that the partners' efforts complement each other in developing public infrastructure and/or delivering improved public services. It must be emphasized that, in the main, PPPs are conceived of as providing asset-based public services, where assets could be in the form of infrastructure like school buildings or equipment such as computers.

According to the traditional procurement system, governments depended on their revenue to finance the development of public infrastructure and the delivery of the concomitant services (Pongsiri 2002:487; Hanss 2001:393). However, due to budgetary limitations in some countries governments have had recourse to PPPs in order to bring more private finance into the provision of public infrastructure and the attendant services (Blake 2004:15). This long term contractual relationship between the organisations in question is, among other things, designed to enhance the capacity of public service delivery so that more public infrastructure can be developed and improved and public services delivered. What normally happens in some PPP projects is that the government does not actually own the infrastructure instead, it contracts to purchase both the infrastructure and the concomitant services over time. By engaging the private sector through PPPs, the public sector incurs little or no upfront capital expenditure unlike in the traditional procurement approach where the government would be expected to meet large upfront capital funding (Grimsey 2002:2; Jones 2002:24; Blake200415).

PPPs are collaborative arrangements that are designed to facilitate the leveraging of any strengths or competitive advantage that may exist between partnering organisations so that they can obtain an increased amount of return for a given level of risk taken in the context of these partnerships (Gorrod 2004:10). Such return can be in monetary terms particularly for the private sector and it could be in the form of improved services to the public sector. A PPP can also be viewed as a form of a trust relationship in which each partner is, to a large extent, a principal in its own right and therefore does not have to refer to other sources of authority (Akintoye, Beck & Hardcastle 2003:6). The partnership is nevertheless facilitated by means of a contract which spells out the rules which govern the relationship and provide the partners with some assurance of the basic outcomes. For example, the private sector needs some assurance concerning returns on investment and/or risks taken.

From the definitions given above, it would appear that one of the enduring features of PPPs is the recognition of the need for commercial expertise in the

implementation of the political agenda which hitherto was the exclusive province of the public sector. Furthermore, new organisational arrangements for the implementation of public policy are emerging in which both the private sector and public organisations jointly deliver public services.

To shed more light on the concept of PPP, further analysis is undertaken below by way of explaining the nature of PPPs.

3.3.3 Nature of PPPs

In order to enhance the analysis of PPPs it is necessary to delve into the nature of these partnerships. The involvement of the private sector in the public sector domain is not a new phenomenon because governments have for a long time used the private sector to undertake public sector projects. In Botswana, anecdotal evidence suggests that some of the major infrastructure in the country was built by private contractors engaged by the Government. Under the traditional procurement system, for example, a school could be designed by one contractor, built by another and financed and managed by the Government. One fundamental characteristic of PPPs is that the development of infrastructure and the actual service provision are bundled together under a single long-term contract. This distinguishing feature of PPPs has been captured by Grimsey and Lewis (2004:96) when they observed that "with a PPP, the asset and service contracts are combined, and there is integration within a private sector party of all (or most of) the functions of design, building, financing, operating and maintenance of the facility in question, often in the form of a special purpose vehicle (SPV) created for a specific project." SPV is a private company or consortium established to deliver a specific PPP project.

In the second chapter of this thesis it has been explained that in many countries, especially the developing ones, governments are increasingly finding it difficult to meet the genuine expectations of the people in terms of public service delivery. It has also been implied in the first chapter (see section 1.2)

that some countries like Botswana had for years experienced budget deficits suggesting that public resources were finite and therefore did not meet the ever increasing and differentiated public needs. Indeed, in most cases in the past, public services were tailored to meet public needs that were uniform for a docile and less vocal society. Smith (2000:127) wrote "today people rightly expect public services to be tailored to their needs, delivered efficiently and to the highest standards. Governments can not afford to ignore these demands, and to meet them successfully and complete the public service modernisation process, the commercial, consumer-orientated management skills of the private sector have to be harnessed." Public-private partnerships are essentially meant to address these demands as they are involved in commercial activities whilst providing the necessary infrastructure and the concomitant public services.

Traditionally, the public sector relied on government revenue, mainly derived from taxation, to develop infrastructure and deliver public services (Grimsey & Lewis 2004:92; Hanss 2001:393). However, such revenue proved with time that it could not sustain the needs of the society. As a result, " governments in particular have embraced PPPs as an important mechanism for financing infrastructure and service without having to increase taxation or run budget deficits which would be politically unacceptable" (Blake 2004:15). This confirms the desire by governments to make up for their limitations by unlocking the much needed resources of the private sector. It further suggests that governments who require access to private sector resources acknowledge their shortcomings that are associated with the traditional *modus operandi* and the orientation of public managers.

Public sector managers mostly operate in an environment that is focused primarily on service delivery and this is likely to result in lack of commercial orientation on their part. This could lead to public sector projects being prune to cost and time overruns due to lack of business prudence in the public sector. Grimsey and Lewis (2004:92) reported on two recent studies conducted against the background of PPPs problems with conventional procurement systems, one by Flyvbjerg *et al* and the other by Mott MacDonald. The former examined 258

large transport infrastructure projects covering 20 countries in which conventional approaches to public procurement were used. MacDonald was commissioned by the United Kingdom (UK) Treasury to review the outcome of 50 large public procurement projects in the UK over the last 20 years. The findings of both studies are instructive as "for projects procured conventionally, time completion exceeded the estimated duration by 17%. In the case of capital expenditure, actual costs exceeded those estimated by 47% on average. For operating expenditure, actual exceeded estimated by average of 41%. A variety of reasons have been put forward to account for these findings. By far the most significant factor identified in the Mott MacDonald report was the inadequacy of the business case, which featured in 58% of projects with cost overruns." Examining the projects undertaken under PPPs, the report further states that "On average, the PPP/PFI projects came in under time (compared to 17% over time for others) and capital expenditure resulted in a 1% cost overrun on average relative to an average cost of 47% for traditional procurement projects." It is worth noting the breadth of these studies on the efficiency of the traditional procurement systems.

If these studies are anything to go by then it might be appropriate to infer that PPPs are superior to conventional procurement methods in terms of the outcomes they yield (Field & Peck 2003:495; Trafford & Proctor 2006:117). Although this might be convincing, it should be appreciated that PPPs are still evolving and therefore much research needs to be done in order to understand them better. It may therefore be too early to make any definite conclusions about the efficacy of such partnerships due in part to the paucity of academic research on PPPs (Mulder & Van Tulder 2004: 24). PPPs to a large extent will change the nature of the public sector, particularly government policies, as they have to be designed in such a manner that will enhance attempts to forge symbiotic relationships between the public sector objectives and those of the private sector. This is predicated on the conviction that "a cooperation between public sector enterprises and private sector businesses certainly offers plenty of opportunities to ensure that both partners can pursue their specific business objectives" (Hanss 2001:394). Such a relationship could also mean

that the role of the public sector and the concomitant political representatives should be redefined to accommodate the realities that unfold with the implementation of PPPs. In particular, the influence that the government used to have in the delivery of a particular service under conditions of exclusive public sector functionality will diminish to the extent that the private sector is involved in the delivery of the same service (Trafford & Proctor 2006:118). However, changes in the roles of public managers stand out clearly.

In the context of shifting roles of government coupled with advancing technologies, public managers should be expected to continuously explore ways and means of improving the quality of public service delivery especially because there are greater expectations for improved service delivery placed upon public organisations. In the context of PPPs, public managers are expected to play other numerous roles "including those of entrepreneur, facilitators, partner, and gatekeeper in establishing and maintaining relationships and upholding ethical standards" (Hansell & Flanagan 1999:9). All this seems to suggest that the use of PPPs may free public managers from certain functions that will be taken up by the private sector but new, and possibly unfamiliar, ones will emerge to which they must adapt. The impetus really is to deliver better services so that the public has a feeling that the tax it pays is indeed producing positive results. So the public managers must get out of their comfort zones and delve into unfamiliar but productive ways of serving people. A new mandarin must therefore emerge as a sequel to the advent of PPPs.

It is evident that PPPs are a multi-organisational approach to public service delivery in which the traditional culture of in-house public service provision is being down played in an attempt to be progressive and find the best ways to achieve desired public outcomes. However, the core values on which the public sector was founded are preserved and, in fact, should continue to guide reforms in public administration (Hood & McGarvey 2002:24). It would appear that the introduction of PPPs was motivated by the perception that the dynamics of the modern life required a dynamic and inventive kind of politics

coupled with a radical rethink about the state's capacity to cater for the populace. This view derives from the fact that the traditional procurement systems with some private sector contracts have at some point demonstrated to be unsatisfactory and replete with problems. In some cases, such contracts were characterized by problems which led to litigation. Smith (www.ncppp.org/resources/papers2004) observed that "litigation was often the result of the adversarial relationships between architect, engineer and builder. Owners were becoming increasingly distressed by having to act as referee between the parties, and cost overruns and schedule delays were becoming all too common. As a result, alternative delivery systems began to surface in the public sector." By resorting to PPPs, the adversarial relationships are eschewed and substituted for by collaborative and synergetic relationships between and amongst public and private sector organisations. In PPPs the functions of the partners are neither antagonistic nor identical but instead, they are designed in such a manner that they complement each other (Jamali 2004:416).

3.3.4 Components of PPPs

Essentially, PPPs can be viewed in terms of four broad components, namely the public sector, the private sector, members of the public and the partnership agreement. The public and private sectors have already been analysed in general terms in chapter two. However, in this section these sectors are revisited and analysed within the parameters of PPPs in order to enhance the broader analysis of the PPP concept.

The agreement between the public sector and the private organisation is very important in determining the success of any partnership between these sectors. In particular, the agreement should deal with what society expects from service providers and the commercial limits of such services (Hanss 2001:402). It is the agreement that glues the two sectors together in a harmonious, collaborative and synergetic relationship. In the partnership agreement, it is expected that the nature and scope of the activities of the partners will be defined as well as the limitations of each of these partners.

Besides, the agreement spells out what will ultimately be the legitimate expectations of each of the partners. In the event of disputes the agreement will serve as a reference point and a guiding document for decision-making. An agreement will naturally be in the form of a contract that spells out the expected conduct and/or obligations of each partner. In addition, the ground rules of the partnership are also spelt out, as part of the agreement, to ensure optimum cooperation between the public and private sector partners (Pongsiri 2002:489).

3.3.4.1 Public partner

A public partner is simply the public sector and this could be a city, town, local authority or any public sector organisation with a need for a particular facility and/or service and a need to access the resources of a private sector organisation in order to implement some public policy. Notwithstanding this state of affairs, the public sector has its own strengths and/or assets that it brings to bear upon the partnership. The public sector is an integral part of the governmental hierarchy which constitutes the legal authority in the execution of public policies in the country. It is therefore part of the function of the state to establish and maintain a sound legal-regulatory framework within which public and private activity can take place in an orderly manner. Policies to engage or not to engage the private sector in public service delivery are predominately determined and implemented by the public sector. The nature and scope of private sector involvement are determined at policy level by the public sector which is also the custodian of such policies (Norment@www.ncppp.org-2005). As the legal authority, the public partner should ensure that rules and/or policies that prevail under conditions of exclusive functionality by the public sector are reviewed and modified to facilitate the participation of the private sector. In particular, the public sector must create an environment in which the confidence of the private sector in participating in the socio-economic development of a nation can be enhanced. This could be achieved if democracy and the rule of law are respected and the separation of powers (*trias politica*) is genuinely put into practice (Agere 2000:

95). For the market to function effectively and foreign investors to invest in a country, property rights must be respected and enforced. In addition, there must be law and order to the extent of inducing confidence in potential investors.

Traditionally, the public sector relied and placed greater emphasis on strict adherence to rules and regulations in order to achieve its goals. However, PPPs are quite different in that they are output-driven and therefore services are specified as outputs. This perspective to PPPs has been captured by Reeves (2003:166) and noted that "the assets and services provided under PPP model are designed on the basis of output specification, as opposed to prescriptive input specification . . ." and this gives the asset and service providers room for creativity and innovation especially because payment to these providers is linked to the quality and timing of their delivery. The public sector formulates public policy and therefore defines what services need to be provided over a long period of time and these should ideally be articulated in terms of output specifications. It could be in the interest of all parties to establish or specify performance criteria but the public sector, in particular should be interested in a payment mechanism that is closely related to the performance standards that would have been specified.

The public sector has some expectations from the partnership. In particular, the public sector is motivated to provide services in partnership with the private sector because "the main rewards from partnering with the private sector are improvement of programme performance, cost-efficiencies, better service provisions, and appropriate allocation of risks and responsibilities" (Pongsiri 2002:489). The result of PPP is therefore better value for money which is achieved when there are significant improvements in the quality of service and its delivery to the taxpayers. This state of affairs is very likely to enhance public sector accountability to the electorate to the extent that they are happy with the public service. They are likely to feel that their money is properly used to serve their interest. Making the public feel good about service

provision may very well be the ambition of every government regardless of its political ideology.

3.3.4.2 Private partner

It has been stated that PPP projects include functions such as project design, construction, financing and operating the resultant facilities to provide public services. This means that such projects require multiple skills and/or expertise particularly from the private sector and hence the establishment of a special purpose vehicle (SPV) for the purpose of executing the project. It would be expected therefore that the private sector is not necessarily monolithic and could represent different companies brought together as one partner and the public sector organisation being the other partner. In concert with these views, Smith (www.nc.ppp.org/resources/papers2006) observed that "the private partner may be a single company, but more often it is a team of companies who have come together to executive the partnership. The team is usually tailored to cover all the disciplines and expertise necessary to deliver the partnership." The team may take any of the appropriate legal forms such as a special purpose vehicle or a joint venture (see section 3.3.5.5).

The private partner brings to the partnership a variety of strengths. In particular, the private sector is known to be replete with resources and has the capacity and/or skills with which to acquire more economic resources for productive activities. Capital goods are normally found in the private markets because they are predominantly manufactured by the private sector. It is also in the private sector where much of the new technology is developed (Scharle 2002:228; Kerr 2003:11). In addition, the multinational corporations, as part of the private sector, tend to facilitate the transfer of resources from one country to the other if there is business for them. The private sector is generally perceived to be dynamic and innovative so much so that the global technological development is, by and large, attributed to its creativity and dynamism. The environment in which the private sector functions seems to be amenable to managerial efficiency due mainly to the profit motive. All this has

made the private sector to be viewed as a repository of managerial efficiency, professional knowledge and advanced technology (Scharle 2002:228). These attributes of the private sector together with the entrepreneurial spirit it possesses makes it attractive and, indeed, a strong case for public-private partnerships in executing public policy (Nisar 2007:147).

Whereas the basic purpose of PPPs is to enhance the delivery of public services, the private partner is invariably pre-occupied with profit as the bottom line. It is inconceivable that the private partner will engage in a long-term project that does not run at a profit. In addition, if the public partner is interested in a sustainable partnership with the private sector, a deliberate effort must be made to make the partnership attractive to the private partner by enabling the latter to realize some profit otherwise the project will not be executed (Kerr 2003:11; Nisar 2007:148). In this regard, it would be instructive to know what the private partner would expect from the partnership. In this context, it has been observed that the private partner "expects to have a better investment potential, to make a reasonable profit, and to have more opportunities to expand its business interests. A good return on investment is definitely an essential consideration from the private partner perspective" (Jamali 2004:417). For all this to be possible, the private partner would further expect to function in an environment that will facilitate the accomplishment of its business objectives.

Elements of the environment that could be conducive to the private sector participating in the partnership with the public sector include those discussed under the public partner heading above. In addition, the private partner would expect support and protection of its interests by the state machinery. In particular, it should be expected that the private partner would content with the civil servants that are highly motivated and in support of the partnership to the extent of working cooperatively with the private sector employees. These employees would expect their counterparts in the civil service to be up to date and conversant with the intricacies of the project in hand and sufficient

knowledge and skills to realize synergy and success (Trafford & Proctor 2006:122).

For PPPs to be successful, the cooperation and support of the public is vital. To this end, members of the public should be regarded as an important component of PPPs.

3.3.4.3 Members of the public

The public receiving (or with the potential of receiving) services through PPPs constitute a significant part of the partnership arrangement. In particular, the public can break or make the partnership and therefore it is important for the public to be in a position to embrace the provision of public services through PPPs and be in a position to provide feedback on service delivery (Carley 2006:252). It may be added that people generally look to their government and the private organisations for enhancement of their well-being through employment creation and the provision of social services. On the other hand, the public elect political office-bearers some of whom form government. The elected cohort is therefore accountable to the public and as such public policy formulation and/or enactment should take cognizance of the will of the people (Anderson 1990:81; Bernhardt 1993:51).

3.3.4.4 PPP agreement

PPPs do not occur in a vacuum but rather in the context of agreements. An agreement will naturally be in the form of a contract that spells out the expected conduct and/or obligations of each partner (Kroukamp 2004:39; Nisar 2007:148; Grimsey & Lewis 2004:96). To a large extent the agreement should define the nature of the partnership and the commitments of each role player. In this regard, it would be expected that the agreement would glue together various elements of the partnership into a dynamic whole. In addition, as part of the agreement, the ground rules should be spelt out to ensure optimal cooperation. The significance of the PPPs agreement has been captured by

Houlden (1990:13) as he writes that "the collapse of partnerships is often due to lack of clear agreement beforehand on what each partner is going to contribute, for what purpose, and what benefit each is seeking; and to the consequent lack of a common bond strong enough to survive the difficulties and choices that will arise." Since PPPs are engaged in major projects, it should be assumed that the agreement will be complex so much so that each partner would engage legal experts when developing the PPP agreements.

3.3.5 Models of public-private partnership

PPP models vary and are often influenced by the parameters of the project including but not limited to the risk tolerance of the partners (Armistead & Pettigrew 2004:574). Such models are numerous and may be limited only by imagination. This view is closely in agreement with Smith (2004:4) when he contended that "there is no model of a standard public-private partnership. Each one is crafted as a stand alone partnership taking into account the parameters of the project, and more importantly, the risk tolerance of partners." However, for the purposes of this thesis the following models are considered: - Design, Build, Operate and Finance; Design, Build, Finance and Transfer; Design, Build, Finance, Own and Operate; Concession and Joint Venture. To a large extent the names of, amongst other things, the models are self explanatory but there is a need to analyse the implications of each model in terms of, amongst other things, the commitment of each partner.

3.3.5.1   Design, Build, Operate and Finance (DBOF)

As the name suggests, this is a partnership between the public sector and the private sector organisations for the design, construction, operation, and financing of public facilities or infrastructure. In this partnership, "the private sector contractor is responsible for designing, building, operating and financing the facility and recovers its costs solely out of payments from the public sector, which is dependant on their ability to meet the pre-approved output

specifications as part of the performance mechanism" (http://www.ppp.
gov.ie/2004) .

The facility is designed by the private partner on the basis of output specifications determined by the public sector (Grimsey & Lewis 2004:94; Smith 2000:129). The private partner is free to be innovative when designing the facility with a view to ensuring that costs at latter stages of the project are minimized. In particular, maintenance costs may be borne in mind when designing and constructing the facility, the intent being to ensure that such costs will be minimum in order to increase returns on investment. The facility can also be designed in such a way that it will serve various purposes so that it can be optimally used to generate more income. As implied above (see section 3.3.4.2), the private partner in this model needs to possess a wide range of expertise in order to complete the project cycle cost-effectively. For example, each of the functions of design, build, operate and finance could be performed by a different company all of which may be grouped together, as a special purpose vehicle, for the purposes of delivering the project. The operation of the facility may include facility management and other ancillary services (Akintoye, Beck & Hardcastle 2003:15). In this PPP model, the private partner assumes risks that are associated with the major functions of the project cycle such as design, build, operate and finance, which risks are briefly explained in section 3.3.7 below.

The partnership is for a specific period, normally 25 to 40 years (or longer), at the end of which the ownership of the facility transfers to the public sector (Coulson 2005:158). This necessitates the definition of the residual value of the facility to be made at the agreement stage.

3.3.5.2   Design, Build, Finance, and Transfer (DBFT)

This is basically a variation of the aforementioned model. In this case, the title transfers to the government when the construction of a facility is completed. The partnership is therefore limited to the construction of the facility; the

actual operation or the delivery of service through the facility is done by the public organisation. However, the link that remains between the contractor and the public organisation could be the recovery of the cost of construction and the contractor being responsible for the maintenance of the facility for the agreed period of time (Smith 2004:5).

The model does not optimally exploit the expertise of the private sector if the management of the facility is left to the public sector. The private sector is normally perceived to surpass the public sector in management practices and therefore letting a private organisation manage a public facility may allow for innovation and responsiveness to the needs of the service recipients (Blake 2004:15; Smith 2000:128). However, it may be justified for a facility to revert to the government if its operation entails the performance of a core function of government that can not be handled adequately by the private organisation for example, military facilities.

3.3.5.3   Design, Build, Finance, Own, and Operate (DBFOO)

This model differs from the other two models above in that "the private sector retains permanent ownership and operates the facility on contract" (http://www.privatisation.org/4/27/2005). In this partnership, the public sector simply purchases the services from the private partner. In other words this is service procurement and not an asset procurement arrangement because the asset will not, in terms of the contract, be transferred to the public sector. It may also be noted that the ownership of the plot on which the facility is built could be another variable to influence some of these models. However, for this particular model it would appear that the facility is better built on the private contractor's plot so that when the contract is terminated there will not be any government commitment in the facility. If it happens that the facility is on the public organisation's plot and the contract is terminated the private contractor may be constrained in using the facility for purposes that are against the wishes of the plot owner unless the agreement covers such use (Scharle 2002:232).

If the service to be provided under this arrangement is vital and required in perpetuity and payment assured by the public sector in the form of subvention then this becomes a fixed revenue steam. Both the market and payment are assured for decades and this could lead to some measure of complacency and lack of innovation and responsiveness to the changing needs of the people. However, this model seems to be more attuned to the construction and operation of discrete facilities such as water treatment plants (Coulson 2005:158).

3.3.5.4 Concession

A concession, in the PPP nexus, is similar to the DBOF model. The main difference is that in a concession, the service provider recoups the costs through direct user charges or a combination of user charging and government subvention (www.ppp.gov/2004). A concession is therefore more appropriate in projects which entail the sale of output directly to the consumers such as telecommunication facilities. The service provider in this arrangement retains the ownership of the facility while providing the requisite service. Under a concession, the service provider can be given the exclusive right to operate a facility and deliver the attendant service during the term of the contract but pays the public sector for that exclusive right. The service provider is normally obligated to invest in the improvement of the facility with the provision to pass the costs to the consumers. In some cases the tariffs charged by the concessionaires need to be regulated by the public sector so that the public is not exploited. It is also possible, in a concession, that the private organisation can take up an existing facility and renovate/improve and operate it in order to deliver the necessary public service and at the same time maintaining and repairing the facility for the duration of the contract. Concession contracts, just like other PPP contracts, have a long duration of up to 30 years or even longer (Akintoye *et al* 2003:12).

3.3.5.5 Joint venture

A joint venture is more of a PPP than other models discussed above because this model is an arrangement whereby the government and the private sector assume co-responsibility and co-ownership in an organisation. It entails the pooling of their resources and generating shared returns (Akintoye *et al* 2003:13; Nisar 2007:148). The returns are shared on the basis of the proportion of the investment each partner has made to the joint venture. The organisation in question is generally managed jointly by the government and the private sector but the day-to-day management is often the primary responsibility of the private partner (Trafford & Proctor 2006:117; Becker & Patterson 2005:126).

It would appear that whereas the kernel of PPPs is the transfer of risks from the public sector to the private sector, in a joint venture most of the risks are shared by the organisations from both sectors. A joint venture is a true partnership.

As stated earlier, there is no standard model of PPPs. However, whatever form partnerships take, they have some common attributes, namely "they are based on shared objectives between the parties concerned; they tend to involve an element of shared risk; and they exist to deliver publicly funded programmes or services" (Kelly 2000:132). To some extent, therefore, partners should have, at some point in the partnership, a common focus and, to some extent, a convergence of purpose.

3.3.5.6 PPP model for delivering secondary education

The model preferred, in this thesis, for the provision of secondary education in Botswana is the DBOF model. It is possible for different models to be applied in the provision of secondary education in different circumstances. As it has been noted above (see section 3.3.5.1) there is no standard model of PPPs and

therefore the emerging model for a particular project may be influenced by, among others, the nature and scope of the public service to be delivered.

Since the Government of Botswana will have to specify the expected educational outcomes, the private sector will be expected to use its expertise to design the facility that will optimally deliver such outcomes (Blake 2004:15). The design and construction functions to be undertaken by the private sector will not be a new development since most of the infrastructure in Botswana was designed and constructed by the private sector, albeit under the auspices of the Government (Botswana Government 2003:138). So a PPP model that has some of its features that are familiar to the public is more likely to be acceptable than the one that is completely new. One of the virtues of the model is that it allows the private sector to operate the facility as well as to maintain it. As it will be shown later (see section 5.3.2.1) in this thesis, the Government of Botswana secondary schools are poorly maintained due to lack of capacity to do regular maintenance and therefore PPPs, as a strategic tool to enhance the capacity of the public sector, should handle this task through the preferred model.

The need to enhance the nature and scope of secondary education in the Gaborone City area through PPPs derives from certain inadequacies in its provision and these inadequacies arise mainly because of budgetary constraints that the Government of Botswana often faces (Gaolatlhe 2001:26). As a result, it makes economic sense to let those who have the wherewithal, the private sector in this context, to finance the secondary education infrastructure services which the model advocates.

The demand for secondary education will always be there, at least in the foreseeable future, and therefore schools should not disappear. The DBOF model culminates in the transfer of infrastructure, school buildings in this case, to the government. The model also allows for the facility management to remain in the hands of the private sector whilst the core public service is delivered by the public sector. This means that once the ownership of the

facility transfers to the government on the expiry of the contract, facility management can still be left to the private sector and facilitated through the tendering process. Another advantage of the model in building and refurbishing schools is the incentive for the private sector to design and build in an innovative way in order to keep operating costs low (Lissauer 2000:144; Grimsey & Lewis 2004:98)

Schools should be maintained particularly those developed under the auspices of the public sector. If schools that have been developed under PPPs remain the property of the private sector, there is no assurance that the infrastructure will continue to be used as schools. Since education is one of the fundamental human rights (Osler 2003:37), it should not be left to whims and fancies of the private markets but rather, it should always be guided by public policy. The significance of this model in the provision of secondary education is that it ensures the continued availability of secondary school places for the posterity.

3.3.6 Purposes of PPPs

PPPs are fundamentally concerned with the improved quality of public service delivery and therefore the main purposes of PPPs revolve around the concept of quality. Whereas the concept of quality has a number of connotations, it would nevertheless be appropriate to analyse this concept within the context of public service delivery. The reason for this focus is that the essence of public service is the improvement of the general welfare of the populace. However, the underlying factor is quality service in the absence of which the improvement of the general welfare of the people can never realistically occur. What then is quality?

Hitchcock and Willard (2003:58) have argued that quality "involves delighting your customer and behaving responsibly with regard to your community and the environment." To some extent this is a static view of the concept and seems to suggest that once a customer is delighted then everything is fine. Indeed 'behaving responsibly with regard to your community and the

environment' is quite in order and that is what should be expected of public managers. However, a more dynamic view of the concept of 'quality' is preferred especially regarding its emphasis on perceptible and continuous improvement of service delivery. In this context, quality is viewed in terms of "having organisation members who are committed to continuous improvement in meeting or exceeding customer expectations" (Harvey & Brown 2001:362). In addition to the commitment of members of the organisation to continuous quality improvement, this view also advocates a culture with a strong commitment to improving quality in all organisational processes and practices. This further suggests that quality is multidimensional and to achieve it at the output level, quality must be in-built in all processes at all levels in the hierarchy of organisations (Parsons 1994:2). From the service point of view, quality should be viewed in terms of how well the service is delivered and to what extent the customer is made to feel good about the delivery of the service. Essentially, integrating quality measures in organisational processes entails empowering the workforce because these are the people who actually deliver the services, they must be trained and given the opportunity to make essential decisions which is not necessarily the culture of public organisations.

Having explained the concept of quality, it is now appropriate to link it with PPPs by analyzing concepts such as value for money; quality of public service delivery; innovative and creative approaches; harnessing resources; stimulation of financial assistance; reduction in scope of government; and risk management.

3.3.6.1 Achieve value for money (vfm)

One fundamental purpose of PPPs is the quest to achieve efficient and effective value for money for the taxpayers (Smith 2000:128; Blake 2004:15). Value for money, in the context of PPPs, can be attributed to the extent to which the delivery of service is of high quality, as judged by the public receiving the service, but delivered at the least possible cost. It should entail the delivery of service to the public at the right time and the right place. The determination of

vfm is normally facilitated by the use of an independent public sector comparator that lists in detail all costs that would have to be met if the infrastructure and the attendant services were procured directly by the public sector (Grimsey & Lewis 2002:5; Akintoye *et al* 2003:127). Value for money is expected to be achieved by the PPP being innovative and adaptive to the changing circumstances so that public services are continuously made relevant and up to date. In particular, it should be expected that value for money is achieved from the private partner innovation and skills in infrastructure design, construction techniques and operational practices (Grimsey & Lewis 2002:5). Under the PPP arrangement the public sector determines the requirements for the services to be delivered and provides them as output specifications. The latter then enables the competing bidders the opportunity to be creative and innovative with a view to finding solutions that may offer better value for money for the taxpayers. Value for money as a purpose of PPP therefore provides an opportunity for the delivery of improved public services and therefore improving the general welfare of the people.

3.3.6.2 PPPs enhance quality of public service delivery

If one could look at some public organisations through the lens of quality he/she would most probably notice a lot of waste of public resources that one never thought of. However, some of the weaknesses of the public sector have been noted in the previous chapter (see section 2.5.1.4) and it is therefore not necessary to repeat them here.   The point here is that public-private partnerships have the capacity to enhance quality of service delivery in the public sector. Klijn and Teisman in Osborne (2000:91) have argued that "the essence of public-private partnership thus is the creation of extra value because of the cooperation of public and private partners. This can be realised because costs are shared, economies of scale are achieved. A well-known example is that decision-making on infrastructure projects can be speeded up by cooperation between public and private partners." In the previous chapter, it was noted that one of the weaknesses of the public sector is its slow pace in doing things and if the partnership in question can help speed up things then

some quality would have been achieved. In pursuit of profit making it should be understandable that the private sector will normally want to conclude tasks expeditiously especially when payment is based on outcomes (Jonker 2001:262; Grimsey & Lewis 2004:92). A caveat is in order, namely that expeditious conclusion of tasks should not be at the expense of other features of quality which should never be compromised.

Governments being under pressure to provide quality services to the people should, to all intents and purposes, seek new synergetic forms of collaboration in order to fulfill their mandate and to satisfy the expectations and interests of the citizens within the limits of nature. PPP should therefore be one of the viable options. In fact, "by definition, the public sector is expected to attend to community interest, stewardship and solidarity. The private sector is thought to be creative and dynamic, possessing capital, managerial efficiency, professional knowledge and entrepreneurial spirit" (Scharle 2002:228). Once it becomes apparent that social demands can not be met from the available but nevertheless limited public resources, it only makes sense to optimally utilize the available skills and resources both within and without the frontiers of the public sector. The possibility of accessing resources from outside the country is not far fetched and it is considered and elaborated upon later in the chapter (see section 3.3.6.4).

For now the point is that quality in the delivery of public service can be enhanced by harnessing resources that are available in both the public and the private sectors so as to complement each other in an attempt to satisfy the citizens and improve their wellbeing. This can be achieved if PPPs are designed such that each partner focuses on matters for which it has both the expertise and the capacity.

3.3.6.3 Innovative and creative approaches

The PPP arrangement can facilitate creativity and innovation mainly due to its emphasis on outcomes instead of inputs as is the case with the traditional

public sector procurement system (Smith 2000:128). In this regard, the private sector bidders have the opportunity to be innovative and creative and therefore compete on the basis of their ability to demonstrate the capacity to provide optimal solutions to public sector problems and/or challenges. To this end, it can be said that PPPs provide an opportunity for creativity and innovation in the realm of the public sector. In addition, the public sector has, through PPPs, the capacity to develop integrated solutions because procurement is also integrated or broad enough to cover the major components of the entire programme (Akintoye, Beck & Hardcastle 2003:7) from design up to the stage of operating the facility. Through PPPs, a creative organisation can develop facilities that are designed to serve a variety of public needs and thereby reducing the costs to implement public programmes and therefore to improve the welfare of the people (Lissauer 2000:144).

3.3.6.4   Harnessing resources

One of the fundamental purposes of PPP is to enable the public sector to have access to economic resources of the private sector in a cooperative manner (Scharle 2002:232; Kerr 2003:11). Through this organisational arrangement, the private sector could also have access to some of the resources of the public sector but the emphasis is on accessing private sector resources with a view to improving the nature and scope of public service delivery. But for all this to happen, there must be an atmosphere of trust. Where there is lack of trust and cooperation between the public and private sectors in a partnership, it is conceivable that available resources could be used at cross-purposes with a net effect of inefficiency which could lead to economic stagnation if not deterioration. Although the main aim of PPP is to enable the public sector to benefit from the resources of the private sector and enhance the capacity to deliver services to the public, the private sector also benefits from such an arrangement. Closely allied to these views, Pongsiri (2002:489) argued that "public agencies and private organisations can seek mutual advantages in developing a strategic partnership, which is characterised by trust, openness, fairness, and mutual respect. For the public agency, the main rewards from

partnering with the private sector are improvement of programme performance, cost-efficiencies, better service provisions, and appropriate allocation of risks and responsibilities, whereas the private sector expects to have a better investment potential, to make a reasonable profit, and to have more opportunities to expand its business interests." A partnership that is properly constituted for a properly established project or programme can therefore yield results from which both the public and private sectors can benefit.

It is also possible for the partnership to make available resources that the public sector on its own would not be able to acquire. The private sector can make available different types of resources such as information, technology and expertise that the public sector may not immediately have. Such a variety of resources could facilitate the effective achievement of objectives that would otherwise not be possible if government opted to function on its own. Many governments in developing countries like Botswana do not have sufficient funds to undertake development projects whereas in the same countries the private sector either has the funds or can acquire them. In addition, the private sector in some other countries has the funds which can flow into the country in the form of foreign direct investment (FDI). On this issue of leverage of resources, McQuaid in Osborne (2000:20) observed that "partnerships allow a pooling of resources so that larger projects, or some aspects of a project can be tackled than is possible for an individual agency (or it allows the agency to devote some resources targeted at one policy to be released for use elsewhere)." To some extent this amounts to reducing the cost of public service delivery in that PPP enables the public sector to avoid major capital expenditure without necessarily avoiding the provision of the concomitant services.

If government creates greater and better opportunities for private sector investment within the framework of a free market system, then multinational corporations can possibly develop interest to invest in the country. Some of these corporations are wealthy and replete with resources of international

standards and since they compete at international level, it would be expected that their personnel are trained to a comparable level. In some cases, these corporations can bring with them resources and expertise that may not be available in the country. With appropriate labour policies in place the local labour force, or part thereof, can be assimilated into these corporations and acquire valuable skills and knowledge which will remain in the country should these corporations decide to leave the country at some point in time (Gillis, *et al* 1992:390). In addition, multinational corporations, compared to some of the developing countries, have even greater financial resources which can enable them to invest in large capital projects which may be extremely difficult, if not impossible, for a particular country to undertake. In line with these views, Hanss (2001:393) observed that "with the increasing globalisation of the financial markets, however, the capacity of the private sector has been fundamentally transformed. The turnover of major corporate groups nowadays is comparable with the gross national product of medium-sized industrial nations. Specialisation, mass production and, ultimately, a growing trend towards corporate concentration via mergers and acquisitions have all made the private sector increasingly powerful financially. This financial power makes large-scale investments possible today on a scale for which the government would formerly have had to bundle funding from various public sources." All this accentuates the strength of the private sector and its capacity to relieve the public sector, of the burden of resource constraints, by providing public infrastructure and the concomitant services.

If it is possible to reduce the cost of public service delivery and at the same time improve the quality of the service on a sustainable basis then it can be very possible to reach out to the poor and remote area dwellers and improve on their standard of living. This is the ideal that can be achieved by, amongst other things, harmonising public and private sectors' resources with the resultant synergetic effect and also allocating risks to the party that has the capacity to manage them.

In view of the foregoing, it would appear that another significant purpose of PPPs which relates to harnessing resources is the strengthening of the national economy by creating opportunities for more investment in the country (Priemus 2002:198). Instead of setting aside crucial public projects on account of budgetary constraints, the private sector is brought into the frame to invest in such projects, which are normally huge projects. This can therefore inject life into the national economy and stimulate economic activity resulting in job creation and improvement in the welfare of the nation or part thereof. A typical example of this scenario in Botswana is the diamond mining. After the discovery of diamonds in the country, by the private sector, the Government of Botswana had no capacity (skill, technology and knowledge) to mine the diamonds. However, through some form of partnership, with De Beers Mining Company, the economy of Botswana was fundamentally transformed. In fact, one may be justified to say that the economic success of Botswana is an offspring of PPP as it is heavily anchored on diamond mining.

As it is implied above, PPPs can enable government to access skills, technology and expertise from outside the country especially if projects are huge and appear lucrative enough to attract foreign investors from more advanced economies. This has the potential of transferring technology to the local organisations participating in PPP projects with a possibility of further transfer of skills and expertise to other local organisations not participating in such PPPs. All this could result in the country being technologically advanced and therefore being more able to deal with the many societal needs with a view to promoting the general welfare of the people.

3.3.6.5 Stimulate financial assistance

One subtle virtue of PPPs is to facilitate financial assistance from organisations like the World Bank and International Monetary Fund. Such organisations often link financial assistance to a change in the focus and orientation of government from direct involvement and intervention to a more facilitating role and/or partnerships with the private sector (Hughes 1998:51). Governments,

especially of developing countries are often expected to shift to an efficient and facilitative role and adopt principles and practices of market liberalisation and some form of privatisation (Jamali 2004:415). Such changes are advocated presumably because of the perception that the traditional method of public administration was no longer effective in addressing the ever increasing social needs.

3.3.6.6 Reduction in scope of government

PPPs have the potential of reducing the scope of government involvement in public life. If the delivery of some public services is shifted to the private sector then the government can focus on, and be more oriented to, its core function of governance (Taylor & Warrack 2002:87). This arrangement has the advantage of reducing the actual size of government culminating in a lean and possibly stronger government. The intent being that the public sector should ultimately be as small as possible but organised in a manner that is both efficient and effective in discharging its mandate. The ideal is to improve on policy making by ensuring that it is well coordinated and strategic in nature. In other words, the government should focus on strategic priorities and leave the task of operational management such as facility management to the private sector (Hood & McGarvey 2002:23). In addition, it is desirable that public service users remain the focus of attention so that services could be matched to their lives as closely as possible with a view to delivering high quality, efficient and effective public services (Trafford & Proctor 2006:118).

Reducing the size of the public sector may be advocated in tandem with the expansion of the private sector as its growth is likely to induce economic growth. In this context, the private sector is regarded as the engine of economic growth (Kroukamp 2004:38; Agere 2000:71). Besides, a huge public sector, particularly for developing countries like Botswana, can be expensive to manage yet it may not adequately respond to the needs of those it is designed to serve. It really does not make much sense to maintain an expensive but inconsequential public sector as it barely enhances the welfare of the people.

Since risk management is an essential aspect of PPPs, it is appropriate to explain the concept in order to enhance the analysis of PPPs.

3.3.7 Risk management

Risk management is a broad topic and therefore can not be adequately covered in this section of the chapter except to highlight its significance in PPPs. It has been stated several times in the chapter that PPPs are invariably engaged in major development projects which obviously involve huge sums of money. In addition, PPPs have been observed to be long term projects whose contracts can stretch up to thirty years (Coulson 2005:158). In this regard, it is clear that the nature and scope of PPPs involve a lot of risk management. In particular, PPPs are essentially concerned with the transfer of risk from the public sector to the private sector, the risk that is associated with major capital projects and/or the provision of service for a prolonged period of time (Nisar 2007:155; Nzimakwe 2006:51). This does not however, suggest that the public sector is entirely absolved from risk taking or the management thereof. In fact, the public sector retains some significant risks because in PPPs the public and private sectors share, among others, risks.

A risk is considered to be a threat or possibility that an event or action will adversely affect an organisation's ability to achieve its predetermined goals. In the same vein, Kerzner (2003:653) view a risk as "a measure of the probability and consequence of not achieving a defined project goal." On the other hand, risk management in the context of PPPs should be viewed to entail the identification and evaluation of situations that have a high propensity to compromise the nature and/or scope of goods or service delivery. The outcome of this process can "assist an institution to either direct resources to appropriate methods of controlling risk, take steps to avoid exposure to particular risks, or take reasoned decision to accept individual risks" (Crawford & Stein 2004:498). It is important that risks are managed effectively lest productivity or service to the people is compromised. So effort must be made

as far as possible to identify significant risks throughout the cycle of a PPP project and deal with them in a productive manner.

Risks vary in many ways but they must be known and understood as far as possible. For this reason, it might be of great help to establish a risk portfolio in which each significant risk and the analysis thereof are recorded in order to facilitate effective management of these risks. This can enhance the extent to which the needs of the society can be realized. To this end, Hood and McGarvey (2002:28) observed that "risk management is a field of activity seeking to eliminate, reduce and generally control pure risks and enhance the benefits." Risk management should therefore be seen to be in the interest of all partners in the PPP context. This is so because it is actually aimed at enhancing efficiency and effectiveness in public service delivery through a better approach to opportunities and threats that organisations have. This could result in better service to the people and better profit to the private sector. In this context, Carley (2006:252) argues for an integrated strategy and implementation of PPPs in the quest for sustained solutions so that physical investment could result in social and economic benefits.

The private sector puts a lot of money and effort in PPPs and therefore, it can be expected that a lot of risk is transferred from the public sector to the private sector. The latter assumes the bulk of the risk associated with the provision of infrastructure and the concomitant services. This transfer is predicated on the assumption that the private sector is on the whole replete with resources and expertise to professionally provide the aforementioned services. In addition, it is assumed that the private sector is more able to manage risks associated with capital projects. In concert with these views, Hood and McGarvey (2002:26) have contended that "the underlying rationale behind risk transfer is that risk should be allocated to the party that is best placed to manage it at the least cost." In PPPs, it only makes sense for the private sector to be allocated risks that it can manage well otherwise the logic behind these partnerships could be defied. However, the fact that the public sector retains some risks in PPPs does not necessarily imply that it has the capacity to manage them at the least

possible cost. Some risks are inextricably intertwined with the public sector so much so that they can not be transferred from the public organisations and possibly be managed at huge costs. For example, whereas the private sector is expected to deliver an infrastructure and the concomitant services in the PPP, the ultimate responsibility for the delivery of such services rests with the public organisations. Regardless of who is paid for the delivery of public services the government remains the custodian of the public interest and therefore, has a duty to ensure that the service is delivered and to minimize any risk to the community due to PPPs (Halachmi 2005:304; Savas 2000:65).

It follows that the focus of public sector risk management differs from that of the private sector at least as far as PPPs are concerned. Whereas the public sector views risk in terms of a threat to life and property, the private sector views risk in terms of a threat to profit making. In particular, the government can not entirely ignore public risks even where the private sector is the service provider and therefore managing its business related risks. When something drastic happens in a country, the elected officials feel the heat even if such officials were not involved in any capacity. In addition, some accusation will be levelled against them or the government even if it is a natural disaster like the December 2004 Tsunami that struck some Asian countries. So if the government engages the private sector in the delivery of public services they should never loose sight of their primary responsibility of protecting life and property. As a result, government officials must continuously pay attention to risk management. In this regard, it should be expected that risk management structures and processes of partnering organisations will be different. However, if the partnership is as mutual as it is expected, these structures and processes of partnering institutions need to be consistent or even complementary to each other lest public life and property are endangered (Halachmi 2005:304). Such differences and/or complementary of structures and processes necessitate the coordination of the efforts of the partners. From the overall partnerships' point of view, there is need for a more structured and coordinated approach to risk management.

Coordinated risk management, in PPPs, could ensure that significant risks are indeed effectively dealt with and in a collaborative manner. This has a potential to improve the operational and financial management of the partnerships in order to optimally implement public policies at the least possible cost. Again, this stands to benefit both public and private partners. Nevertheless, dealing with risks can be costly.

It needs to be stressed that the assumption of risks by the private sector is invariably accompanied by a commensurate reward which is normally in the form of money. The private sector's obsession with profit makes it to view risk as a commercial product that is priced. In this regard, Gorrod (2004:10) noted that "organisations focus on leveraging any strengths or competitive advantage they have in order to obtain the maximum amount of profit or return for a given level of risk; the higher the level of risk taken, the greater the expected profit or return." It follows that high risks could be highly priced by the private sector and this needs to be understood by all parties to the partnerships. However, in a properly constituted PPP, the costs of risks can and should be reduced for both the public and the private sectors and therefore, this should ideally be the aim of the partnering organisations.

PPP projects are normally complex, long term, and large scale in nature. As a result, there are certain risks that are associated with such projects and such risks vary and can be identified at various stages of the project cycle. Some of the risks associated with the PPP projects include the following:

(a) Market risks – changes in broad economic conditions can affect markets in general. For example, during the contract period prices may change beyond the anticipated levels making it more difficult to obtain certain facilities that may be critical in the provision of certain services. Alternatively, the financial structure of the project can over time cease to offer fair returns on investment leading to the possible collapse of the partnership in question. Market risks can therefore lead the private sector organisations to avoid PPPs that involve unfamiliar markets (Akintoye, Beck & Hardcastle 2003:45).

(b) Legislative changes – changes in law can affect the way some of the things in PPP arrangements are done which can also affect some of the contracts. It is also possible that change in government can affect some projects if, say the services provided through PPP arrangements are not quite in tune with the political persuasion of the new government (Firer, Ross, Westerfield & Jordan 2004:690).

(c) Technological obsolescence – it is quite possible that, over time, the technology that has been critical to the provision of a particular service becomes outdated. However, in line with the expectation that the quality of service provision must improve continuously, it becomes imperative that in such circumstances new technology be purchased. This could be expensive and even affect the entire contract or part thereof as some new technologies can make certain jobs redundant (Finnerty 1996:42).

(d) Specifications – in the case of asset-based public services delivered through PPPs, the private sector normally undertakes the design and construction of the asset in question. All this is done on the basis of output specifications determined by the public sector (Hurst & Reeves 2004:380). So the specifications need to be accurate if the actual standards of the clients are to be met and to fully satisfy the concomitant statutory requirements. The private sector must then design and construct the facility that will deliver the required services and adequately satisfy the client within the contracted time frame.

(e) Operating risks – this is related to the extent to which the facility will actually deliver services according to specifications but within the cost and other constraints of the contract. The service has to be available and conform to output specifications of the contract. This risk is normally transferred to the private sector. However, operational failure can be a risk to government as well in that there may be no services delivered in which case government may have to step in and address the situation (Grimsey & Lewis 2004:100).

(f) Asset risk – In some PPP arrangements, the government is to take possession of the asset on expiry of the contract and the asset should

meet the required conditions. However, the asset risk may eventuate if, say the asset design life or technical life proves shorter than anticipated. It is also possible that the asset will get it destroyed before is handed to the government, the force *majeure* risk (Finnerty 1996:49).

(g)   Construction risk - In a very complex project anything can go wrong during the construction stage. Anecdotal evidence suggests that many construction projects in Botswana experience problems that often culminate in cost and time overruns. It is also possible for design and construction to be based on inaccurate output specifications which could result in a facility that does not quite meet the actual requirements of the clients (Finnerty 1996:41).

(h)   Demand risk – As time goes on, people's taste and preferences change and this can influence their demand for certain services. In addition, as new substitutes for a particular service/product begin to flood the market, it is possible for people to switch on to the new products and therefore abandon the old ones. Demand risk is more pronounced in financially free-standing projects, which projects' costs are to be recovered entirely from charges to the end users. If the users desert the service/product then unless the organisation is innovative, as will be expected, its revenue flow is very likely to diminish in which case the costs may not be fully recovered (Coulson 2005:158; Akintoye et al 2003:46).

3.3.8 Critique of PPPs

The impression might have been created that PPPs are the panacea of the problems that bedevil public service delivery most probably because the focus so far in this chapter has been on the positive aspects of these partnerships. However, PPPs have their own problems or possible shortcomings that need to be put in perspective so that they are also known. After studying PPPs, Kelly (2000:134) acknowledged that "it is naïve to present PPPs as an elixir for the travails of the public services. Many of the problems ascribed to conventional public investment and service provisions plague any type of service provider –

regardless of sector, and gains from PPPs, can come at a price." It is most likely that the private sector believes that there is a lot of money in government and therefore private companies will endeavour to get as much as possible from the government and as such their charges are likely to be more inflated than would be the case with individual persons. This could be motivated by the desire to maximize profit coupled with the belief that the government has the money to pay such charges. The private sector's technological pre-eminence predisposes it to amass public funds within the PPP framework. To this end, Herbert (2005:1) observed that "instead of pulling together to promote national champions, government and business often argue and accuse. Many governments see business as a cash cow or an exploiter to be restrained, regulated and forced to seek political approvals." To some extent, this is an expression of lack of trust of the private sector by governments. It could also be an expression of fear that governments have had about the private sector.

From the foregoing, it can be inferred that PPPs are not necessarily of equal partners. With reference to PPPs, Benson in Coulson (2005:156) noted that "partnerships are seldom of equals, and can easily become instruments of oppression wherein a strong partner gains at the expense of weaker members." The powerful partner can dominate the partnership and if it is the private sector, it can be propelled by the profit motive and exploit the public partner. This is highly possible because the very reason why the private sector is attractive to the public sector is its strength over the latter. So the two sectors go into partnerships being unequal.

It has been noted that PPPs are polycentric organisational structures (Halachmi 2005:305) in that they involve a variety of organisations with distinct cultures and approach to work. These differences inevitably lead to complexities in decision-making and control. In fact, PPPs could lead to loss of decision-making autonomy on the part of the public sector and this could also compromise the values of public service-delivery on matters related to equity, access, participation and democracy (Pongsiri 2002:489). In this case, the

poor and the remote area dwellers could be the victims. This state of affairs is most likely to occur where the strength of the private partner is allowed to prevail over the public partner, unchecked.

Public sector employees are likely to be unhappy with these polycentric institutional structures and unions could protest against PPPs especially where such changes have not been properly managed. In particular, the unions are likely to resist the introduction of PPPs if they view them in the same light as privatisation in which public assets are sold to the private sector. As stated earlier in the chapter (see section 3.2.2.4), unions are invariably against privatisation and PPPs, being a form of privatisation, could be no exception. In the context of Botswana, anecdotal evidence seems to suggest that most of the major private companies are from outside the country or owned by foreigners. As a result, there are likely to be fears that PPPs will actually benefit foreigners at the expense of the citizens and in every country, this perception is likely to induce resistance to such partnerships. In this regard, PPPs could be resisted by the unions and the general populace.

The arguments for PPPs may have also given the impression that the private sector is synonymous with success, yet that is not always the case. Experience shows that many private sector organisations have not been successful so much so that some of them have had no option but to close down. This suggests that good management practices sometimes elude the private organisations and that these organisations should not be equated to success (Blake 2004:15).

It has been noted that PPPs are normally engaged in immense projects that stretch for up to 30 years. To a large extent, such projects can be difficult to manage and therefore most likely to deliver low quality outcomes. In particular, it is quite possible for the government to underestimate not only the cost of the project but also the revenue stream from the project and all this can affect the nature and scope of the project. It is also possible that PPPs may be poorly conceived and thereby applying them inappropriately. This

could be a recipe for disaster resulting in an unnecessary cost to the public (Blake 2004:15; Coulson 2005:155).

In most democratic societies, it is a constitutional requirement that government be based on the rule of law and not market-driven mechanisms (Riccucci 2001:172). As a result, PPPs could mark a departure from this premise in which case democratic values as well as the moral authority of the public sector could be lost to the private markets. For example, the public sector's capacity to ensure rectitude among the public even if the maintenance of such values could be costly has always been a priority (Raine & Willson 1995:35). Where public service is delivered by the private sector, it is quite possible that individuals' rights to such services will be curtailed. This observation was also made by Sullivan (1987:465) as he noted that "even when government retains responsibility, through funding or regulation, for provision, if service delivery or production is privatised, both clients and employees generally lose rights which they would have had were production kept in the public hands." Certainly this state of affairs does not augur well for the spirit of improving the general welfare of the populace.

Public and private sector organisations have different cultures and therefore to bring such organisations into a partnership may be easier said than done. Disparities in skills and training orientation of the employees of these organisations can make communication between organisations rather difficult which could also compromise cooperation. In addition, the culture of work in these organisations is different. Whereas employment in the private sector is, to a large extent, based on performance, this is not normally the case in the public sector which also has a high security of employment (Jamali 2004:418). It appears that public sector employees are aware that even with minimal effort in the workplace their jobs are secure and this has the propensity to induce a culture of laxity in the public sector.

PPPs, like privatisation that involves the sale of public assets, is vulnerable to corrupt practices and the public may view them as arrangements that are

designed to enrich those in exalted positions. This is particularly so because in many countries, especially in Africa, the tendering processes are generally perceived to be fraught with corrupt practices in which case PPPs may actually be a mechanism to enrich certain people at the expense of the public. Alternatively, it could be a mechanism to make the rich even richer since they may be the only ones who can meaningfully, by hook or by crook, participate in such partnerships. These are people who have money and own big companies or shares therein.

Although projects under PPPs are normally not reflected in the government's capital budget, PPPs involve some financial commitment on the part of government and this commitment may stretch for decades. The normal practice in government is to make financial commitments on a yearly basis. PPP arrangement actually means that even future governments will be tied to the PPP contract and the concomitant financial implications regardless of the circumstances prevailing at the time. Where such contracts are no longer in favour of government especially a new one, terminating them is normally at a huge cost which the government may not be able to meet (Glaister 1999:30; Blake 2004:15).

A PPP is a complex arrangement and to arrive at its solution can be time consuming and can cost huge sums of money. For example, in a South African context, Suryodipuro quoted by Bonorchis (2005:8) observed that huge costs derive from "identifying the problem, and then getting to understand the problem, learning the demographics of the area, understanding the needs now and into the future, investigating various solutions, choosing one, putting it out to tender, going through the proposals, evaluating them, selecting one, negotiating, agreeing on measures and more." This also means that to arrive at such a solution effectively and efficiently requires a team of professional consultants with diverse expertise including technical, legal and financial but comprehensive enough to ensure the conclusion of a PPP agreement. Such a team of professionals can not be expected to perform the job without asking for a heavy fee.

Notwithstanding the aforementioned criticisms of PPPs, it is maintained that a cogent argument can be advanced in favour of PPPs in the delivery of public services provided that the necessary antecedents can be identified and put in place. Some of the salient antecedents for the successful PPPs in the delivery of public services are discussed below.

3.4 ANTECEDENTS OF SUCCESSFUL PPPs

If properly structured in appropriate areas, PPPs can be beneficial to both the public and the private organisations taking part in the partnerships. However, it is of critical importance to have suitable conditions necessary for the successful implementation of PPPs such as rules and regulations; education and training; leadership; feedback system; transparency and accountability mechanisms; fairness and mutual trust; section of the right partner; feasibility study proper risk allocation; and clear output specifications. In the following paragraphs these conditions are analysed.

3.4.1 Rules and regulations

PPPs should be undertaken within the legal framework. Partnerships between organisations that are founded on entirely different principles necessitate a provision for continuous guidance in the form of rules and regulations that govern the operation of the partnership. Just like in a marriage, PPPs will occasionally experience conflicts and/or disputes and it is therefore necessary for the appropriate mechanisms to be in place to deal with such matters. It has been stated that PPPs are complex projects whose contracts can stretch from 25 to 30 years. In the course of the life of the contract certain issues that may have been unforeseen at the time the agreement was concluded may begin to unfold giving rise to conflicts and/or disputes. Coulson (2005:158) observed that "a complex project requires a consortium of interests to construct an asset and maintain it. Over a long period, the balance of power of these interests will change – indeed some of the partners' interests will largely

cease once construction is completed. In these circumstances, it is highly likely that, in some projects, the partners will fall out among themselves." Besides, PPPs are a complex undertaking which may elude the comprehension of the traditional mandarin and lack of understanding of important issues could result in disputes which may require the application of rules and regulations.

It is therefore of critical importance that, in promoting PPPs, rules and regulations be in place to safeguard the interests of both the public and private organisations. In particular, for the private sector to be engaged in the provision of infrastructure and public services for a prolonged period of time, there must be some assurance that their interests will be protected. Regulations are of critical importance in this regard because they provide "assurance to the private partner, that the regulatory system includes the protection from expropriation, arbitration of commercial disputes, respect for contract agreements, and legitimate recovery of costs and profit proportional to the risk undertaken" (Jamali 2005:419). However, a sound regulatory framework can also ensure that the partnership works efficiently and optimally utilizes those resources at the disposal of the partnership. In this way, the regulatory framework can also benefit the public partner especially when efficiency is enhanced and resources are optimally used (Pongsiri 2002:491). In actual fact, this is the kernel of PPPs.

Regulations can assist in ensuring that each partner fulfils his/her obligations. In the event of non-performance it should be clearly stated what steps are to be followed. Through the regulations partners should be well informed of possible action to be taken against them should they fail to meet their obligations. In this regard, Kroukamp (2004:38) has argued that "the success of, in particular, collaborative arrangements depends on all partners fulfilling their respective responsibilities including the responsibility to hold others to account and take corrective action when necessary." The regulation should even articulate the process to be followed when the partnership has to be terminated.

Regulations that are not properly conceived can impede the performance of the private sector. The point made in the previous chapter is maintained, namely that over regulation in the public sector tend to stifle innovation and creativity on the part of public managers. The same could happen to the private partners. In this regard, Pongsiri (2002:491) observed that "over-regulation and contractual safeguards can restrain economic growth and hinder the private sector's ability to remain competitive in the market. The greatest deterrent to private participation in public-private partnership is the regulatory environment and attitude." Whilst regulations are necessary, it is important that they are appropriately designed to enhance cooperation between the partnering organisations without stifling creativity and innovation.

Rules and regulations alone may not be adequate without appropriate structures to enforce them. In this regard, both the judiciary and the law enforcement agencies must be perceived to be sufficiently capable of enforcing such rules and regulations in such a way that both the private and public sector have the confidence of engaging in PPPs.

3.4.2 Education and training

The public needs to be educated on various facets of PPPs. People must understand a lot about PPPs before their implementation in order to enhance acceptability of the policy in question. In most cases, lack of understanding is a recipe for resisting change. Better understanding of public policy issues can lead to effective public participation in policy changes which is important in enhancing democracy.

There is a need for the public to understand what PPPs actually entail and this can be achieved through public education. Such education could help reduce suspicions and resistance in the implementation of PPPs. In addition to public education, there should be openness, trust and mutual support between various stakeholders to ensure that the objectives of partnering organisations are achieved. This is vital if the partnership is to be sustained otherwise its

collapse could be detrimental to the public whom the partnership is intended to serve.

Public managers and other personnel who are involved in the implementation of PPPs should be given sufficient training to enable them to have confidence and capacity to cope with the intricacies of these partnerships. In particular, the public sector employees should be trained to a level where they would understand their counterparts in the private sector in order to effectively protect the interest of the public sector. Policy makers sometimes lack indepth understanding of policy issues. In this context, it is necessary for them to be made to understand the concept of PPPs in order to make informed decisions and provide the necessary leadership.

3.4.3 Leadership

It is of vital importance for political and organisational leadership to support the PPPs initiative. In particular, political leadership should be seen by the public to be in support of PPPs and actually taking part in educating the public on such partnership initiatives (Carley 2006:255). Leadership is central to the success of PPPs in that all other antecedents for successful implementation of the initiative depend on leadership (Diamond 2006:279). The latter can make things happen in the sense that it controls the resources that are necessary for the implementation of the initiative. However, as stated earlier, education on the part of those in leadership positions is necessary for them to understand the concept well in order to play their roles meaningfully (Armistead & Pettigrew 2004:580; Carley 2006:255).

3.4.4 Feedback system

A feedback system needs to be established so that the public receiving services through PPP arrangement can provide the necessary information to the authorities in order for the necessary action to be taken (Carley 2006:252). In the event the public raises complaints about the quality of services then the authorities should make every effort to have the situation corrected. Ideally,

the PPP initiative should unfold within a quality assurance framework in which a monitoring mechanism and the feedback system are streamlined (Kroukamp 2004:38). The system should entail a clear indication of what is intended to be achieved through the PPP arrangement to enable the public to compare the delivered services with output specifications. The significance of such a feedback system has been noted by Grimsey and Lewis (2004:92) when they write that "a PPP structure also militates against 'ownership' of the appraisal system by one group and should provide for public scrutiny at a number of points . . ."

3.4.5 Transparency and accountability mechanisms

The public would occasionally want to obtain certain pieces of information from those delivering services and this should be made possible otherwise an opportunity for suspicion will have been established which could result in lack of trust in the PPPs. In addition, as part of transparency, it would be expected that critical decisions and policies that are made in relation to the functions of PPPs will be communicated to the stakeholders. In order to promote transparency, it would be necessary to have in place transparency rules which should be respected by the partnering organisations and enforced by the government. In addition to being transparent, PPPs need to be subjected to accountability mechanisms which should include clear roles and responsibilities for the organisations in a particular partnership. For these organisations to be held accountable for their performance there should be output specifications against which to gauge the performance of the PPPs. In this context, it has been argued that for PPPs to be successful there should be "output based specifications where services are specified as outputs and payment is linked to the quality and timing of their delivery" (Kroukamp 2004:38). The management structure must provide for authorities such as corporate boards to ensure that the public interest is protected. To this extent, it could be ideal to have an audit regime that has the capacity to cope with the intricacies of the PPP projects. The audit system could report to the corporate boards which should act as the custodian of public interest.

3.4.6 Fairness and mutual trust

One of the objectives of PPPs is to enable both public and private organisations to benefit from such partnerships. However, the success of these partnerships depends on, among other things, fairness and trust between the partnering organisations. In this context, Jamali (2004:417) noted that "Public agencies and private organisations . . . seek mutual advantages in developing a PPP, particularly when the latter is characterised by trust, openness, fairness and mutual respect." For this to happen, every effort must be made to preclude mutual suspicion and such effort could include sharing of essential information on the operations of the partnership. In addition, there must be an effort to correct the imbalance of power if it does exist between the partners. As long as there is imbalance of power, perceived or real, the weaker partner will occasionally be suspicious of the stronger one and this state of affairs has the propensity to disturb the partnership. The success or failure of PPPs depends, to some extent, on the relationship between the partners and therefore they should all know that when one partner fails then the entire partnership stands to fail (Trafford & Proctor 2006:119).

3.4.7 Selection of the right partner

Another antecedent of successful PPPs is the identification and selection of the right partner in terms of requisite skills and resources for a particular project. It is necessary for the public organisation to have a private partner with complementary strengths and commitment (Jamali 2004:421). In other words, it will not be very helpful for the public sector to engage the private organisation that lacks the capacity to meet the challenges of a particular project because this will be a recipe for inefficiency that could lead to cost overruns which PPPs are meant to avoid. Ideally, the right partner should have a good reputation in performing similar or related projects. However, in order to be able to identify the right partner, the nature and scope of the project must be clearly understood.

3.4.8 Feasibility study

Some form of a feasibility study will need to be conducted and each project carefully looked at in order to determine if it is ideal for a PPP arrangement (McColl 2001:14). It is necessary to conduct a thorough study to establish the viability of a PPP on a particular project because most PPPs are long term and complex undertakings and therefore they need to be very well understood by all parties before implementation. It is also vital that before the project can begin the private partner must be convinced that it will meet the demands of the project. As Pollitt in Mulder and Tulder (2004:24) observed, "both the choice of the projects and the initial conditions that have to be met strongly influence the success or failure of PPPs." So information, timeously and accurate, should be considered essential before and during the implementation of the project. The feasibility study should go to the extent of comparing public sector provision with that of the private sector in order to ensure that the public sector gets a cost-effective service (SAIIA 2005: 4).

Once a development project has been conceptualised the government must take the initiative to establish the local market demand for the project. Since PPPs are long term projects, it is essential that they are preceded by a rigorous study to demonstrate their suitability and/or viability. In particular, it is necessary to establish if the demand for the project is sufficient and sustainable on a long term basis. It is of critical importance that public officials undertake the necessary analysis and explore alternative ownership and investment scenarios to inform their decisions. The private partners normally do not participate in any project unless they have undertaken the appropriate analyses. So in most cases the private organisation enters into a project knowing whether a project is 'doable' while the government does not (Stainback 2000:23). It may also be advisable that only projects of scale and complexity where private sector involvement could yield better results should proceed along the PPP route.

3.4.9 Proper risk allocation

The kernel of PPPs is the allocation of risks to the organisation that is best able to manage it at the least cost (Hood & McGarvey 2002:26). Many risks in PPP projects are transferred to the private sector because of its ability to manage such risks. Allocating risks in this manner can facilitate the achievement of value for money for the taxpayers because of proper and effective management of project risks. Achievement of value for money can be realized due to the fact that the private sector investors put up their own capital, skills and experience enabling the public sector to get the benefit of commercial disciplines, innovations and efficiencies (Smith 2000:128). However, if the private sector were to assume all the risks of the projects, it would be too expensive and if the public sector were to do so it would probably fail, like it has in some cases in the past, to achieve its expected objectives primarily because of high construction costs, time overruns, and operational inefficiencies (Mustafa 1999:67).

3.4.10 Clear output specifications

Clear output based specifications that accurately outline government policy objectives are very critical to the effective realisation of government aims for a particular project. Output based specifications entail specifying services as outputs (Smith 2000:129; Kroukamp 2004:28). It is therefore essential that service delivery specifications are clearly and accurately communicated to various stakeholders particularly those contracted to deliver the services (Grimsey & Lewis 2002:6). So the government's output requirements must be clearly spelt out. The virtue of clarity in this regard is that it may enable people to know what is wanted and may encourage innovation among those bidding for the delivery of the services. Proper design and construction of the facility depend very much on the accuracy of the information on output requirements.

On the basis of output based specifications, the probability of successful delivery of public service can be enhanced by the development of an effective

payment mechanism. This could include a system where payment is linked to the availability of service, its quality and the timing of its delivery (Smith 2000:129). Linking payment to service delivery is likely to compel the organisation delivering the service to do so in accordance with the requirements lest the revenue stream is compromised, something that the private sector would not like to experience. If the payment mechanism is not consistent with government objectives for a particular project, Grimsey and Lewis (2002:257) are of the view that it is possible for the private partner to pursue a course of action that safeguards the revenue flow without necessarily meeting the public sector outcomes. This view is consistent with the profit motive which is the *raison d`être* of the private sector as conceived in section 2.6 above. All this is presented here to accentuate the need for clear output specifications and monitoring mechanisms to ensure compliance with the pre-determined outcomes (Kroukamp 2004:39).

3.5   CONCLUSION

In this chapter, the concept of PPP has been explained. In particular, PPP has been viewed as a cross-organisational group working together in pursuit of common goals which may have proved difficult for the public sector to achieve alone. PPP is viewed as some form of privatisation since the private sector actually delivers the service. The concept is primarily based on the believe that the private sector is the repository of technological prowess and therefore replete with resources which can enhance the delivery of public services.

Both public and private organisations enter the partnership because they expect it to be a stable and profitable relationship.   Whereas the public sector is looking forward to enhanced service delivery using some of the skills and financial resources of the private sector, the private sector expects to engage in long-term profitable contracts that can last up to 30 years.   PPPs are essentially characterised by risk transfer from the public sector to the private sector for which a commensurate reward is expected.   This transfer of risk is based on the understanding that the private sector is better placed to manage

risk when compared to the public sector. The private sector needs to benefit from such partnerships because it is highly unlikely that it will lock itself into a long-term service delivery that does not yield profit.   It may be stated that shared authority and responsibility, joint investment, sharing of liability/risk-taking and mutual benefit are essential features of PPPs.   The assets and services provided under the PPP model are designed on the basis of output specifications.   The PPP arrangement is not necessarily the panacea for the travails of the public sector because in itself there are problems which tend to militate against the purpose of these partnerships.   But if properly structured and the necessary antecedents of successful PPPs are in place such partners can yield better results than the traditional procurement system.

Now that the concept of PPP has been explained in some detail, it is appropriate to focus on education in general and secondary education in particular in the next chapter.

CHAPTER 4

SECONDARY EDUCATION

4.1   INTRODUCTION

This chapter focuses on formal education at secondary school level as implied in the title of this thesis, namely the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone city in Botswana. Formal education falls mainly within the purview of the public sector and this is particularly so with secondary education in Botswana. The success of every economy depends to a large extent on the skills and intelligence that its people possess. As a result, human resource development is a critical factor in the development of any economy and education is vital in this regard. Every level of a country's education system is important and therefore needs to be developed. This chapter focuses on secondary education in general but with specific focus on the provision of Botswana's secondary education particularly in the Gaborone City area. In dealing with the subject of this chapter, first education is analysed from a philosophical perspective in which three schools of thought in philosophy of education are explained. These are: idealism and education; realism and education; and pragmatism and education. Aims of education are presented in this chapter and these include aims of secondary education. The chapter also includes a special focus on secondary education with its various dimensions. The impact of education on the socio-economic landscape of a nation is also explained. The education system of Botswana is described and its secondary component is at the centre stage.

4.2   EDUCATION

It is important, at the beginning of this chapter, to present some definitions of the concept of education in order to give a background to the rest of the

thesis. Education is one of the contested concepts and therefore its definition is appropriate for clarification and in order to eliminate ambiguity in this thesis. It is also essential to consider the broad aims of education and this is also done in the chapter. Such will serve to expand the understanding of the concept of education.

4.2.1 Definition of education

Education in its basic form pre-supposes the existence of a child as the educand and an adult as an educator. Both the educator and educand exist in a pedagogic situation that is characterised by, among others, trust. In this context, education has been defined as a conscious, purposive intervention, through the effort of an adult, in the life of the child with a view to aiding the latter towards intellectual independence (Van Resberg, Kilian & Landman 1981:257). The intent of education is therefore to positively influence the child with a specific purpose of making changes of a significant value. From a philosophical point of view, Akinpelu (1981:30) noted that "for Plato the process of education is that of 'turning the eye of the soul from darkness to light' by which he meant leading a person from the dark cave of ignorance into the limelight of knowledge." Another definition of education has been given by Erasmus and Van Dyk (2003:2) as "the activities that provide knowledge, skills, and moral values that we will need in the ordinary course of life as education." In this context, education is not only concerned with intellectual development but rather with a person as a totality in order to produce well-rounded individuals. However, Barrow (1981:38) does not concur with this view and believes that education is purely cognitive in that it has to do with knowledge, understanding and perception and argues that "a person is educated if he has both the understanding and the capacity for discrimination."

This demonstrates that there are many views on education. These views will be expanded on later in the chapter. However, in order to influence a better understanding of the concept of education, it needs to be looked at from

various perspectives. In this regard, the concept is treated from a philosophical perspective and, albeit briefly from sociological and psychological perspectives.

4.3 SCHOOLS OF THOUGHT IN PHILOSOPHY OF EDUCATION

In order to enhance the understanding of education, the concept is further analysed from a philosophical point of view. In this context, views of some philosophers of education are presented. Authors in philosophy of education are many and varied in perspectives. As a result, it is not possible to capture all these varied perspectives in the limited space allocated to this section. To this end, the following schools of thought in philosophy of education have been selected for analysis: idealism and education, realism and education, pragmatism and education. The main reason for this selection is that it encompasses the most common and popular philosophical ideas on education. Since the concept of education has already been briefly defined, it is necessary to elucidate the concept philosophy before one can delve into philosophy of education.

4.3.1 Philosophy

Philosophy is generally believed to have been derived from two ancient Greek words, namely *philein* and *Sophia,* which when combined meant love or pursuit of wisdom or just love of knowledge which thrives on a penetrating search for truth (Lemmer & Badenhorst 1997:97). It has been observed that the distinguishing features of philosophy are logic, consistency, and systematic thinking aimed at reaching sound, coherent and consistent conclusions at every turn. In this regard, logical argument and or reasoning constitutes the kernel of philosophy (Akinpelu 1981:3). However, the scope of philosophy is broader than logical reasoning and also encompasses a concern with clarity of the language used. Both these aspects of philosophy have been succinctly captured by Barrow (1981:4) when he defined it as the "examination of logic and meaning." For his part, Peters in Hobson (1987:341) observes that "the distinctive function of philosophy is analysis, covering both the analysis of

concepts and of arguments, which may be called respectively linguistic and logical analysis." Quite clearly, the meanings attached to key terms in an argument determine the extent to which such an argument is logical. It is also important that the two sides to an argument share the same meanings lest they argue at cross purposes. So the meaning of words is an important aspect of philosophy.

From the foregoing, it should be clear that philosophy is concerned with the critical examination of intellectual claims on particular issues with a view to facilitating recognition of alternative ways of looking at such issues. This has the potential of culminating in better understanding of issues at hand. In addition, philosophy endeavours to develop sensitivity to the language that is used in the presentation of issues in order to enhance clarity and the understanding of the issues in question. All this is in line with the observations made by White (1991:494) that "philosophy is an active, intellectual enterprise dedicated to exploring the most fundamental questions of life."

4.3.2 Philosophy of education

From the exposition made above, it would be reasonable to imagine philosophy of education being concerned with the use of philosophy as a tool to critically examine the intricacies of education with a view to illuminating its fundamental elements. It is therefore a critical reflection and analysis of the education system that should culminate in a suggestion of an alternative system that should, in some respect, be better than the original one (Akinpelu 1981:5). The value of philosophy of education to educators could be that it enables them to look at ideas in education in much better ways. However, Ozmon and Craver (1999:2) have argued that "a philosophy of education becomes significant only when educators recognize the need to think clearly about what they are doing and to use what they are doing in the larger context of individual and social development." From this standpoint, philosophy of education should of necessity encapsulate human aspirations at both individual and societal levels because it is of value at both these levels as shall be seen later in this chapter.

But since education is a practical activity, it would seem plausible to assume that the aim of philosophy of education is to improve the education practice and ultimately humankind. This is predicated on the conviction that education and human life are closely linked and that if philosophy of education stands to guide solutions to education problems, it also stands to improve the quality of life as well (Adeyinke & Major 2006:55; Lemmer & Badenhorst 1997:106; White 1991:494).

Philosophy of education should also provide educators with the opportunity to understand why certain things in the provision of education are done the way they are done. But more importantly, it can provide educators with ways to critique the current practice and address the problems that bedevil the education system in question. This becomes possible especially when the educators are able to envision how things should be ideally, taking full cognisance of the circumstances prevailing in their societies. The latter should inevitably guide the education practice because it includes socio-economic, political, technological and cultural variables, the totality of which gives character to a particular society. In this context, Thayer-Bacon and Bacon (1998:2) have observed that "one of the basic tenets of this philosophy of education is that sociopolitical perspectives and cultural concerns are very much connected to and overlapping with epistemological and ethical issues. They are all interrelated and affect each other." If educators can reach this level of analysis and make it a habit to continuously have an in-depth analysis and reflection of their education systems, then they can be better placed to inform the education policy making process. In this regard, philosophy of education should motivate educators to engage, on a continuous basis, in some form of a dialectical quest for knowledge and the appropriateness of their education systems (Adeyinka & Major 2006:55).

4.3.2.1 Idealism and education

Idealism is one of the oldest schools of thought in philosophy and it advocates the supremacy of ideas in both the expression and interpretation of reality

within the frontiers of the universe. According to Plato, the ultimate reality of the universe is only intelligible and expressible in terms of ideas and not spatial matter (Akinpelu 1981:132). However, the existence of the material world is not entirely dismissed except that it cannot be trusted as the basis for truth that is perfect and external because it is "characterised by change, instability and uncertainty whereas some ideas are enduring" (Ozmon & Craver 1999:14). If truth is perfect, it can not be found in the material world because the latter is imperfect and ever changing. Idealism therefore, attempts to explain all existence in terms of mind and not matter. For idealists, reality is not physical but rather a construct of human mind, only minds and their ideas are real. Various philosophers have engaged themselves in work that gives a number of different perspectives to idealism but reaffirming the perceived centrality of the mind in a dynamic relation between the human soul and the world. However, the intent is not to analyse these works but rather to devote a bit of space on idealism and education.

Since, according to idealism, reality is in the form of ideas and resides in human consciousness, the educational implications should follow logically. The aims of education should therefore centre around the development of the mind but should include a special focus on everything else of lasting value and the search for true ideas. But because the search for truth depends on personal character, the aim of education is to facilitate the development of the individual personality and self-realisation of every individual child (Lemmer and Badenhorst 1997:106; Akinpelu 1981:134).

Idealist philosophy emphasizes the search for truth and that this can only be found in the conceptual world of ideas. In this context, the highest aim of education would be the conception of true ideas. The pre-eminence of mind over matter further suggests preference for abstract subjects such as mathematics and philosophy. Science is also preferred by idealists but to the extent that it helps students to be more speculative and be able to delve into abstract ideas. The emphasis on the mental aspects of human beings seems to have led idealists to be individualistic in their perception of education. In this

regard, education could be viewed more in terms of promoting self realisation. The emphasis on the spiritual qualities of human beings would suggest character development as a significant aim of education. What is intriguing is that the concern for the individual is still very evident in contemporary educational practices. In addition, character development seems to have also stood the test of time, even though its purpose might have changed overtime. For example, Currie (2005:B10) observed that "the goal of education was once to educate the Athenian statesman, then the renaissance gentleman, and more recently the responsible citizen." This suggests that the aims of education can actually change with time.

Idealists would prefer education that provides depth in studies so as to produce citizens who will be able to operate more on the basis of inner conviction than on rules. They also demonstrate proclivity for holistic approach to learning because it has the capacity to motivate a liberal attitude towards learning as opposed to specialised learning which can lead to perception of reality as disjointed entities. The preferred mode of instructional delivery for the idealists is the dialectic, which is the critical method of thinking since they have a penchant for the mind as the kernel of their philosophy. In addition to dialectic, idealists also believe in intuition and to this end, Ozmon and Craver (1997:34) noted that "most idealists advocate a conceptual method that includes both the dialectic and the intuitive approach to learning."

The idealists generally perceive the aim of education to go beyond the individual to encompass the society to which the individual belongs. In particular, that self-realisation of the individual will ultimately benefit the entire society. In this context, the aim of education is rather instrumental in that it seeks to produce an individual who should be able to effectively participate in the economic life of his or her society. However, such individuals must also understand their moral obligations and develop the willingness to fulfill them in society (White 1991:68). So education should benefit the individual and his society according to this school of thought and indeed this view is still relevant to date.

Idealism has emphasis on mental development and prefers education that provides depth in studies so as to produce citizens who are able to operate more on the basis of inner conviction (Adeyinka & Major 2006:75). As a result, it is of great relevance to the problem of study, namely inadequate places in secondary schools and low quality of education. Education up to primary schools or even junior secondary schools is not sufficient to produce citizens of the caliber conceived of by idealists. In order to reach the depth in studies to produce the kind of people implied above children must continue with their education beyond primary and junior secondary education.

4.3.2.2 Realism and education

Realism is, to a large extent, the opposite of idealism in that the former argues that knowledge is absolute and it exists by itself and as a reality independently of its knower or human mind (Akinpelu 1981:137). Similarly, Lemmer and Badenhorst (1997:108) observed that "realists insist that qualities of our experiences, (knowledge, facts) exist as independent realities of the external world; they are not abstract ideas." Things have real existence and therefore human knowledge is simply a process of discovery of such things. Whatever a person knows, actually existed before knowing it and therefore the world is not the construct of the human mind.

It has been noted that realists regard the world as existing independent of its knower and that what the sciences have discovered about it is true and real. The basic facts about the world that are discovered by the sciences demonstrate that the world is not a human construct and that knowledge about it or part thereof actually existed prior to knowing it. The process of knowing should therefore be viewed in terms of responses, by the mind, to external stimuli from the material world that make impressions upon it. In this regard, Ozmon and Craver (1997:60) observed that "for Locke, there are no such things as innate ideas. At birth, the mind is like a blank sheet of paper, a *tabula rasa*, on which ideas are imprinted. Thus all knowledge is acquired from

sources independent of the mind or as a result of reflection on data from independent sources." This shows that from realism's point of view all ideas are derived from experience signifying the significance of sensation and/or reflection.

From the brief exposition of the central themes of the philosophy of realism it would appear that the fundamental aim of education is to facilitate the achievement of knowledge of nature and to delve into the inmost workings of the universe. This is essential in order to enable the individual to reposition him or herself in accordance with the ultimate reality. In this context, Akinpelu (1981:139) perceived the aim of education as an attempt "to help the individual learner to form habits, dispositions and tendencies to search for the truth, to grasp it, enjoy it and use it in every aspect of his life. These truths are contained in his culture; they have been accumulated over the ages and contain the best of the wisdom of past generations." What seems to be evident is that from the realists' point of view the fundamental aim of education is two-fold, namely the transmission of specific cultural values from one generation to the other and secondly, to develop the willingness and capacity for the individual child to pursue further learning. These cultural values entail that which has been discovered and accumulated by the previous generations. However, the religiously oriented realists are generally agreed "that nature could be transcended by thinking and that individuals could venture into higher realms of thought" (Ozmon & Craver 1997:67). They regard this kind of transcending to be the fundamental aim of education. For their part, secular realists place greater prominence in the sensory material world with their proclivity for the scientific approach. This approach places considerable emphasis on the understanding of the material world and the control thereof by human beings to enhance their survival.

Moreover, education that is entirely obsessed with science and scientific methods at the expense of other forms of knowledge fails to acknowledge the actual human nature. There is no doubt that science and technology are very

crucial to the continued survival of mankind but other forms of knowledge are important in other aspects of human nature such as feelings and emotions.

4.3.2.3 Pragmatism and education

Pragmatism has its roots in Greek language meaning 'work.' It is a philosophy that can help people look for processes and activities that are most likely to produce desirable ends for human advancement. As a school of thought in philosophy, pragmatism argues that what is true is that which "works" (White1991:494). So what works can be taken to be the kernel of this philosophy. According to Lemmer and Badenhorst (1997:113) pragmatism is "a philosophy that defines truth and meaning of ideas according to their physical consequences and their practical value." Pragmatists will generally argue that truth is not some quality concealed in an external object waiting to be discovered. Truth, according to pragmatists, "is the idea that has been tested, verified and found effective in solving problems" (Akinpelu 1981:146).

Another significant aspect of the philosophy of pragmatism is epistemology, the theory of knowledge, which pragmatists place at the very center of their philosophy. They believe that knowledge is just human experience that has been processed and refined by intelligence. The latter can be viewed in terms of quality of thinking whose purpose is to effectively solve problems that confront a person in his or her living. According to Lemmer and Badenhorst (1997:114), the value of critical intelligence in all human conduct is one of the main themes of pragmatism. It needs to be noted that experience is acquired as man interacts with his environment in which there are living and non-living entities. According to Dewey as observed by Boyles (2005:50) a human being is a habit forming creature that is extensively saturated in his or her environment that is invariably social and his or her habit formation is a vehicle through which one becomes sensitive to and gains control of his or her environment.

From the pragmatists' point of view, education comes from experience but in order for this experience to be regarded as educative, it must make further and further experiences possible. In this context, Lemmer and Badenhorst (1997:115) observed that "pragmatists often say that the purpose of education is more education. Another possible generalisation of the aim of education which supports the idea of conservative experiences is that it gives the learner experience in experiencing." This could simply mean that experience at a particular point in time enables the learner to acquire meaning/value from the subsequent experiences.

The aim of education from the pragmatist standpoint is therefore the development of intelligence in order to enhance ones capacity to solve problems. This inference derives from the pragmatists' conviction that "knowledge comes through the processing of experience by intelligence using the problem solving method" (Akinpelu 1981:147). If education is all about the experience one acquires in his or her environment certainly education should be linked to ones culture because the culture in which a child grows constitutes a substantial part of his or her environment. So education, according to pragmatists, is a mental growth or the growth in ones intelligence resulting from his or her interaction with his or her environment. Pragmatists such as Dewey and Rorty regard education as a form of enculturation and socialisation (Winch and Gingell 1999: 181) but maintain the significance of ones interaction with the environment to the acquisition of knowledge. Education is therefore a necessity of life, it is an important part of life that each and every child must live. Ozmon and Craver (1997:150) observed that "cultures survive across time, Dewey pointed out, because education is the process by which a culture is transmitted form generation to generation, occurring by means of the communication of habits, activities, thoughts, and feelings form older to younger members of the culture. Without this, social life cannot survive; therefore education should not be looked on merely as schooling and the acquisition of academic subject matter but as part of life itself." This appears to be in concert with Peters' views as captured by Barrow (1981:26) that educating people is not the same as training them for employment or

socialising them or preparing them to meet the demands of the economy; and that education is "a deliberate attempt to initiate people into worthwhile knowledge for its own sake." Education is viewed purely in terms of intellectual development and not as everything else that is provided or takes place in tandem with the educative process. The emphasis is on individuals being educated within a framework of social beings in which they are recognised to have the capacity to take charge of their social affairs. As social beings, individuals should be allowed to freely interact with various social groups in their environment with particular focus on developing the potentials that young people may posses for future growth. In this regard, education is akin to an experimental enterprise which promotes a human spirit as well as a desire to explore problems that bedevil society with a view to finding solutions to such problems.

In this school of thought of philosophy, teachers and students are encouraged to view all knowledge as related to the extent that a cross disciplinary approach to curriculum is advocated in order to help students appreciate how things are related. In addition, the curriculum under pragmatism is expected to be activity oriented simply because, as implied above, action oriented education is preferred under this school of thought. This kind of curriculum also implies that education must be holistic so that the child in the educative process is viewed in terms of mental, physical, emotional, social and cultural factors because all these are essential for a well rounded individual. However, in a more technical sense, education is nothing else but intellectual development and therefore a lot of what is happening in schools is not educational in this sense. It can nonetheless be added that in pursuing education other purposes are also pursued perhaps as byproducts (Winch & Gingell 1999:180).

4.3.3 General overview of aims of education

Aims of education, whether implicit or explicit, are the embodiments of its perceived fundamental purposes which ultimately define the character of its mode of delivery. The latter would include the curriculum and the concomitant

instructional delivery and the evaluation thereof. Educational programmes in schools are actually meant to achieve the perceived aims of education. From the schools of thought in philosophy of education presented above, it is abundantly clear that aims of education can be many and varied even within the context of a particular society. The possibility of such aims being inconsistent with each other cannot be ruled out. However, a variety of aims of education can be compatible with each other but exist in some tension because of, among other things, limited resources. In Botswana for example, physical education is quickly gaining prominence in secondary schools yet the same schools do not have the necessary infrastructure to support the subject in question. Schools do not have gymnasia and there are no showers for students to wash after physical education. Teachers of other subjects complain when they meet students who have just returned from the physical education session.

From the idealists' point of view, mental development, character, and self-realisation are deemed the central aims of education. In their view, idealists believe that education should benefit the individual and the society. The realists believe that the aim of education is to achieve knowledge of nature, through the scientific methods, and the understanding of the workings of the universe. Knowledge of nature leads to the understanding of the material world. However, such knowledge is viewed as part of culture and therefore one of the aims of education is the transmission of culture from generation to generation. Individuals should acquire knowledge and understanding of the material world and gain control over it in order to enhance the continued survival of mankind. On their part, the pragmatists have the penchant for the development of intelligence with a specific purpose of enhancing the individuals' capacity to solve problems that are encountered in the course of human living. Enculturation and socialisation are but some of the aims of education that can be achieved through ones interaction with his or her environment (Hlebowitsh 2005:58; Akinpelu 1981:144).

In general, it is common course to view the aims of education, among other things, in terms of two broad categories, namely intrinsic and extrinsic aims of education and these form the subject of the next subparagraph.

4.3.3.1 Intrinsic and extrinsic aims

It might be instructive to consider aims of education in terms of two categories, namely intrinsic and extrinsic aims. Intrinsic aims are those educational achievements that are regarded valuable for their own sake irrespective of any other value they may have (Barrow 1981:39). Knowledge, for example would be regarded as valuable for its own sake with an inclination towards liberalism. But education is essentially the transmission of knowledge to the young people or the learners for more important reasons than just for its own sake. In this regard, although intrinsic aims are crucial in their own right, they are nevertheless held subordinate to the extrinsic ones which tend to be more inclined towards utilitarianism. Although education needs to be predominantly student–oriented, it must, of necessity, enhance his or her well-being and, at the very least, it must influence his or her outlook on the world. Education must somehow help individuals who undergo it and communities provide education for the good of the students (White 1991:23). From public administration's point of view, education like any other public service must be provided for well conceived purposes related to the improvement of the general welfare of the populace. It may be argued that both intrinsic and extrinsic aims should be pursued because they are not necessarily repugnant with each other though more weight should be given to the extrinsic ones for reasons given above. Closely allied to these views, Watson (2005:516) acknowledged that "most observers recognise that education systems have multiple goals, many of which go beyond the transmission of cognitive knowledge, such as the development of relevant employment skills and attitudes that facilitate civic engagement." For such civic engagement to be more meaningful, education being provided needs to be of acceptable quality and relevance to the society and the development thereof.

Since human capital is the kernel of economic development and education makes a significant contribution thereto, it is necessary to explain the relationship between education and economic development.

4.3.3.2 Economic development

It can be argued that a country's human resources are of critical importance in determining the nature and rate of socio-economic development in the long run (Smith 1993:27). Education can be viewed as a form of investment in human capital, which refers to mental and physical ability often acquired through education, training and, to some extent, health care (Singh 2003:84). Essentially, education has a significant role to play in enhancing the quality of the labour force and, ultimately, its productivity. Increasing the productivity of the labour force in a country can contribute immensely to economic development of the country as more goods and services of higher quality can be produced from fewer resources. So developing people through, among others, education is very important because people are the ultimate resources of a country and human capital remains one of the fundamental determinants of economic growth. If a country is to become a competitive nation, it should increase its education levels and standards in order to produce citizens who are capable of producing goods and services which can compete well with the best in the global community. In this context, the education system should build human capacity at all educational levels and create programmes that aim to improve school quality management, school efficiency and school effectiveness (Erasmus & Van Dyk 2003:9). The virtue of effective and efficient schools is that they can offer good education and enable the new generation of children to acquire skills and values that are commensurate with the desired economic development.

Human capital can attract FDI in that multinational corporations tend to prefer investing in a country that has a skilled labour force. This is because the corporations tend to find it more expensive to bring along their trained labour force into the host country and maintain them there. With a skilled labour force

already in existent in the host country, expenditure can also be minimal in training. Human capital can also be an important determinant of economic development in that if people are developed, they tend to be motivated, rather than resistant, to the diffusion of new technologies in the economy (Singh 2003:85). Educated people tend to have the mental agility to adapt to new technologies and adequately cease emerging opportunities. Such a reception of new technologies in the economy can serve as a catalyst for further economic development.

It may be added that for education to play its critical part in the country's economic development, the education system must be responsive to the demands of the industry and produce people with relevant skills and orientation to the world of work. Such people must also be trainable so that as new demands emerge people could easily be made to adapt to new circumstances.

Education, through its contribution to human capital, influences economic development which can in turn improve the quality of life of the society. It is therefore essential to expand on the role education can play in the improvement of the quality of life of the society.

4.3.3.3 Improvement of quality of life

Education is vital to quality of life of society even outside the economic sphere. An educated society is more amenable and receptive to, among others, public education on say, potential hazards such as those related to health. For example, the more educated sections of the society tend to have lower rates of HIV/AIDS infection. Related to this view, Fourie and Schönteich (2002:25) observed that "while the prevalence of HIV is widely spread among all sectors of the population in developing countries, more educated people with higher incomes are in a better position to learn about the epidemic and alter their behaviour to avoid infection." In addition, Nhamo and Nhamo (2006:317) have demonstrated a strong correlation between education and improved child care,

improved nutrition, lower fertility and lower child morbidity and mortality all of which do contribute towards improved quality of life.

The demand for education is high in contemporary societies. Part of the reason for such a demand is that people believe that education creates opportunities for social mobility by enhancing both the status and income opportunities for those who have received it. This is why parents are very keen to have their children well educated. However, the Government of Botswana has adopted a more dynamic and utilitarian aim of education. In its view, education "promotes economic development, political stability, cultural advancement, national unity and the overall quality of life . . . education must offer individuals a life-long opportunity to develop themselves and to make their country competitive internationally. Ultimately, the aim of education must be to prepare individuals for life" (White Paper No. 2, 1994:3). In addition, Botswana's Vision 2016 (1997:28) is anchored on several pillars one of which is that "Botswana should be a well educated and informed nation." If these ideals can be achieved then the country could be *en route* to success but unfortunately this appears very remote. Many children are made to leave the education system before they could optimally benefit from it and before they could acquire the necessary skills to make their country competitive internationally. In this regard, Botswana can not be a well educated and informed nation by 2016 unless the education strategy is improved. These points are elaborated under secondary education in Botswana below (see section 4.5).

As implied above, education and income are related. In particular, the correlation between education and income both at individual and societal levels is not far fetched and can reasonably be argued. Gillis *et al* (1992:219) have observed that "although not all high school graduates, for example, earn more than all who completed only primary school, the majority does, and on average their earnings are much higher." It is further observed that illiteracy is rife in the very poorest countries and diminishes steadily as one goes up the income scale (*ibid* p219). Although this observation was made just over a decade ago,

its veracity to date is not hard to establish. This is true in a majority of cases but there are exceptional cases where the relatively educated are the relatively poor. In the SADC region, one can argue for example that Zimbabwe is a relatively educated society but poorer than Botswana. However, as implied earlier, it should be noted that economic prosperity can enhance the quality of education by enabling the necessary resources available to be used to the advancement of the provision of education.

The provision of education requires a lot of resources and this is exacerbated by the fact that invariably there is a very high demand for education at all levels. In some cases, the demand for education exceeds its supply despite the fact that in many countries like Botswana the education sector takes the largest portion of the annual budget. In this regard, Boswaen (2004:18) observed that Botswana was rapidly increasing its skills base by committing a significant portion of the national budget to education. He further observed that "we have high Gross Domestic Product (GDP) spending on education of up to 30 percent. It is one of the highest in the world." However, governments are under enormous pressure to cut on public spending whilst at the same time increasing outputs and quality thereof (Marsh 2003:54).

It is also necessary to note that in order to improve the quality of life or the general welfare of the people it is important to have a large pool of human resources from which competent policy makers can emerge and education is critical in this regard. As a result, the education system should, as much as possible, foster critical thinking and develop people with skills that could facilitate the determination of sound and rational public policy goals (Walingo 2006:317) and the efficient and effective implementation thereof.

The role of education is not limited to the aforementioned issues. Education is also a means through which the posterity is expeditiously made to fit into its society. It facilitates the socialisation of the posterity.

4.3.3.4 Socialisation

Socialisation is a process of enabling an emerging generation of children to learn and internalize the rights and wrongs, values and roles of the society into which it is born (Ballantine 1989:26). So during the process of socialisation, children are prepared for meaningful participation in their society and therefore are taught how to fulfill the expectations that society has upon them. The formal schooling is therefore an organised way to expedite the process of socialisation, the intent being to provide children with the core knowledge that holds their community together. It is through education that a new generation of children is enabled to assimilate knowledge, values and skills that will sustain the uniqueness and identity of their community within the limits of nature (Hlebowitsh 2005:58).

The aims of education as articulated above seem to suggest that education is not a luxury but a necessity for both the individual and the wider society. However, for the new generation of children to participate meaningfully in the socio-economic development of their country they need the kind of education that will enable them to shoulder this task. In this regard, it is necessary to provide the posterity with good quality education that covers the entire secondary school education.

4.4 EDUCATION AT SECONDARY SCHOOL LEVEL

It might be instructive to conceptualise education at secondary school level in the context of its recipients. These are normally children in the age range of about thirteen to about twenty years. This age range is commonly referred to as adolescent period, which are basically years of transition from childhood to adulthood. According to Villaverde (2003:23), "adolescence is a time of potential change and transformation, great discovery, challenge and risk. There is a constant struggle between intimacy and independence." It is also a period in which there are numerous bodily changes such as physical, cognitive, psychological, physiological and other changes. These also take place at a time

the child is in transition from primary or lower schools to higher ones, and therefore a time when children are faced with stultifying forces of change. Given this scenario, the central concerns of secondary schools should be to adequately support learners to enable them to cope with this welter of changes and optimise their learning opportunities. What is even more important is that schooling at this stage is crucial so as to capture the curiosity of the adolescents and give them proper guidance to adulthood. This is particularly important if Hall's view of adolescence as the pinnacle of human development and Piaget's view that adolescence signifies the height of cognitive ability (Villaverde 2003:23) is anything to go by. All this further suggests that failure to attend school at the adolescent stage could be a serious loss to the individual as this is the stage where the youth formulate their visions and possibilities for their future.

Secondary education serves a variety of purposes of which at least three can be identified. Firstly, secondary education serves as a bridge between primary and higher or tertiary education, a bridge that some never cross and a bridge that only a few in Botswana cross. Secondly, it prepares mostly adolescents for the world of work and thirdly, like any other level of education, facilitates further personal development and further serves as an agent for socialising children into their society (Brown 1981:50; Ornstein & Hunkins 1993:235). Regardless of the system of education, not all secondary school leavers proceed to some university. Some take up vocational training in technical colleges whilst others seek employment. The secondary education should therefore reflect these broad goals and prepare learners to pursue their interests as dictated by their aptitudes within the framework of a specific curriculum package. The secondary school curriculum should therefore be crafted in such a manner as to accommodate different interests and aptitudes of the learners and therefore it remains critical to the quality of education. Consequently, some analysis of secondary education curriculum is presented below.

4.4.1 Secondary education curriculum

Secondary education curriculum should be designed in such a manner as to help individual learners to develop their full potential and realize their rightful place in society. In a very narrow sense the word curriculum refers to the totality of subjects offered in a school such as a secondary one or it could refer to the subject taught throughout the entire school programme. In a more technical sense, curriculum means much more than this. Viewed as a document used in schools, a curriculum encompasses the following (Lemmer & Badenhorst 1997:260):

(a) Aims, goals and objectives of learning content;
(b) Content or learning experiences;
(c) Teaching methods and media; and
(d) Methods of evaluation.

Designing the curriculum is therefore a matter of arranging these elements into a systematic document that will be used to guide both the teacher and the learners. A curriculum can also be viewed in terms of the totality of activities taking place within the organisational framework of a school, deliberately designed or encouraged with a view to promoting individual student's intellectual, personal, social and physical development (Abosi & Murangi 1996:183). If indeed education is strictly intellectual development, then clearly the school curriculum offers more than the aims of education perhaps in the same manner as schooling offer more than intellectual development. So both schooling and the school curriculum are all encompassing with intellectual development being part thereof. It can therefore be argued that the school curriculum, if it is meant to translate educational aims into school activities, focuses on various aspects of the individual perhaps in an effort to produce well rounded citizens. If this is the case, then the school curriculum should have multiple realities embedded in it. If indeed secondary education serves such divergent purposes as preparation for employment for some learners and preparation for higher education for others, then the school curriculum content

ought to be balanced between general education and vocational education, between a global context and a local context. The significance of the global context derives from the fact that the contemporary societies are invariably linked together by means of information technology which has metaphorically reduced the distances between such societies. However, all this should not compromise the focus on personal development and the appreciation of cultural diversity that characterise the contemporary societies (UNESCO 2002:12). From the standpoint of employment preparation, it should be reasonable to expect the curriculum developers to appreciate the need for the youth to understand how industry can generate national wealth and create an opportunity for them to understand the national economy and the activities that contribute to the national wealth (Corson 1991:33). The youth need to be business minded and this could be stimulated by a school curriculum that highlights the virtues of commerce and information technology provided these are appreciated by curriculum developers. It needs to be stated that the development of a curriculum is largely influenced by the perspectives held by the developers. In particular, the schools of thought in philosophy of education do inform the curriculum developers especially their aims of education. Once the curriculum has been developed, it should give clear indications of the expected learning outcomes that must be commensurate with curriculum coverage. So, in the final analysis the school curriculum is some kind of a plan for the translation of educational aims into school activities (Wench and Gingell 1999:53). A curriculum is therefore a document of prescriptive intent which, instead of describing what actually goes on in schools, prescribes what should or will be taking place in schools.

Education and, by extension, a school curriculum are to a large extent linked to the culture of a society both historically and in prospect. Whereas education has been observed to be a transfer of culture from generation to generation, a school curriculum is also an expression of what a society is intended to be in future. For example, in Botswana, currently there is a lot of emphasis on Information Technology (IT) skills and, as a result the focus of the education system is shifting towards the teaching of such skills in schools with a view to

enhancing technological fluency and developing an IT culture. One can imagine that the Government of Botswana believes in the value of IT skills both at the individual and national level and hence its emphasis in the secondary school curriculum. This future orientation of the school curriculum is of critical importance in that it is through a well articulated school curriculum that a particular nation can choose a strategic route to achieve a competitive edge in the contemporary global society. A school curriculum can therefore be used to facilitate, among others, social change and if a society has to undergo social transformation, it is in schools that one has to start.

A school curriculum is also meant to display some elements of conservatism in that there are some parts of culture that are so critical to the identity of a particular society so much so that they need to be conserved at all costs and therefore be transferred from generation to generation (Hlebowitsh 2005:7). An essential component of culture that needs to be preserved for the posterity and national identity includes language. It can therefore be safely assumed that any nation undertaking a major transformation of its education system will preserve the essential components of its culture such as its language. If education is the repository of culture and has to be transmitted from generation to generation then the curriculum must be firmly grounded in the diversity of the population. This is essential if the mainstream culture of people is to be preserved and transmitted to the posterity.

The provision of secondary school education is not limited to the delivery of the curriculum. The provision of education can also serve as a vehicle through which some other social policies are delivered. Consequently, secondary education is viewed as part of social policy and what all this means is explained in the following section.

4.4.2 Secondary education as part of social policy

The multiple realities exhibited by both the school curriculum and school activities over and above the intellectual development could be attributed to

the fact that the provision of education is inextricably intertwined with the implementation of social policy. This view is reminiscent of the approach to the design of educational programmes advocated by Stoddard in Miller (1991:219) that aims "to design a system of education that will help individuals develop their full potential and realise their worth to society, while at the same time drastically reduce crime, teenage pregnancy, drug abuse, and suicide." The youth most of whom are secondary learners, seem most vulnerable to most of these eventualities and therefore secondary education should play a pivotal role in helping the youth cope with the complexities of their time. Anecdotal evidence abounds to suggest that amongst school activities there are those related to health and feeding, those related to social skills and a host of other activities that do not have a direct bearing on intellectual development of any individual learner but certainly being of great value to every learner. So the multiple, albeit divergent, activities in a school set up are designed to facilitate and expedite the growth and development of the learners from a holistic point of view.

Education is part of the broader social policy and, through it some of the social needs of individuals and those of the society are addressed. Although education is primarily concerned with intellectual development, its provision in the formal school set up is invariably linked to other social services that are meant to enhance social justice, social equity and promote democracy (Boyles 2005:14). For example, in Botswana until 2005, primary up to secondary education has been free in the sense that parents were not paying for it if their children attended government schools. In addition, all learners were provided with books and meals at school. Learners whose parents could not afford to buy them school uniforms were/are provided with it by district councils. It is quite possible that many other countries are providing these services to the learners at no cost to the parents primarily to enhance social equity. This is meant to enable children from poor families to have access to education and some of the amenities that support the learning process. With these arrangements in place, it can be inferred that, to a very large extent, the socio-economic background of any child cannot be easily noticed within the frontiers

146

of a school. All this, it would appear, is aimed at equal access to education and hopefully, equitable and optimal educational outcomes for children from varying socio-economic backgrounds. The point that is being made is that education is being used to achieve social goals, and often social change (Finch 1984:2). In this context, it may be argued that if government wants to change the society, schools might be the most appropriate targets for change. Alternatively, education can be used as a vehicle for social reconstruction.

Moreover for education, in general and secondary education in particular, to achieve its intended purpose its quality should not be suspect. Consequently, the section that follows focuses on the quality of secondary education.

4.4.3 Quality of secondary education

The benefits that accrue to those receiving education can be viewed in terms of both quality and quantity of the schooling that these individuals are subjected to. The issue of quality of education is very important if education is to serve the purpose for which it is intended. Quality of education has a lot to do with the extent to which the set educational targets are accomplished, central to which could be the acquisition of knowledge and development of skills. Closely related to this view, Chapman, Weidman, Cohen and Mercer (2005:516) noted that, "for the most part, education systems are defined to be of higher quality when students demonstrate higher levels of achievement. Improving quality, in the views of many, involves taking action that increases the amount students learn." Provided of course that what students learn is in concert with the generally accepted goals of education and therefore promoting socially accepted values.

Education quality can also be viewed in terms of the discrepancy between the clientele's perceptions of the offered education and their expectations about schools which offer such education. But quality is not just limited to the perceptions of the clientele and to this end, Parsons (1994:5) identified three

dimensions of quality to encompass client quality, professional quality, and management quality and defined them as follows:

(a) Client quality refers to what customers (learners and parents) and clients (employers and community) want from service;

(b) Professional quality refers to the extent to which service delivery meets needs as defined by professionals in terms of techniques and procedures that are regarded necessary to meet the needs of the clients; and

(c) Management quality is concerned with the most efficient and effective use of resources within the limits defined by higher authority.

To view quality of education from various standpoints is reminiscent of treating quality in a holistic manner with everyone being committed to the improvement of all aspects of the organisation's functioning. To this end, Dale and Cooper in Burnes (1996:172) viewed this approach as Total Quality Management (TQM) and defined it as "an organisation-wide effort to improve quality through changes in structure, practices, systems and above all, attitudes." However, quality is not a static phenomenon and therefore should be treated as a dynamic concept in which continuous improvement of the delivery of secondary education remains a constant focus that is benchmarked against the best in the world.

Education at all levels needs to be delivered within a quality assurance framework in which the necessary requirements for quality are defined and deliberately pursued. It is nonetheless very important for quality at secondary school to be more pronounced because for some learners secondary education marks the end of their formal schooling. So this level of education, in some cases, is the last opportunity to correct the shortcomings of the lower levels of education. Anecdotal evidence abounds to suggest that some learners catch up late in their educational terrain. As stated earlier in this chapter (see section 4.4), secondary education prepares learners for tertiary education and therefore good secondary education becomes a good foundation for tertiary

education. In fact, quality in the provision of secondary education, like any other level of education, is beneficial to its recipients and the public at large.

Education is crucial to both the individual and the society at large (Levin 2000:6). As a result, it should be accessible to all those who qualify and need it. In addition to quality, the provision of secondary education must be informed by the requirements of access and equity which are elucidated below.

4.4.4 Access and equity in secondary education

Access and equity are issues of great concern in the provision of secondary education. Access simply refers to opportunities available for a particular target group to attend school at an appropriate level. In order to explain the concept equity, it might be instructive first to explain the concept of equality and then distinguish it from equity. Malekela and Ndeki (2001:124) viewed equality to mean "the state of being proportionately represented numerically for all members of a class, ethnic group, race, sex." To some extent this refers to the fact that children from various backgrounds should not have their access to education limited by the same backgrounds. However, equality should go beyond access to encompass the probability that children from these various backgrounds will be sustained by the education system and conclude the educational programme defined for a particular level.

Once learners have gone through a defined educational programme for a particular level, another crucial dimension of equality emerges, namely the achievement of the defined or expected learning outcomes. Equality is deemed to exist if learners from various backgrounds are able to achieve the same learning outcomes as determined by the curriculum. However, the problem with this aspect of equality is that the extent to which learning outcomes are achieved can be influenced by many other variables. But if this aspect of equality can be achieved then the question that is related to yet another important dimension of the concept of quality is to what extent do children

who have acquired the same level of learning outcomes live similar lives after concluding a particular educational programme.

The expectation that those who have acquired the same level of learning outcomes should live relatively similar lives accentuates the utilitarian view of education. In this regard, education is expected to play a social equalising function by facilitating social mobility for those who happened to be coming from disadvantaged home backgrounds. So the provision of education should contribute towards the improvement of the welfare of the people.

Equity in the provision of education refers to the prevalence of justice according to natural laws, a system of education that is devoid of bias or favouritism but continuously treating every learner with reverence. But, both equality and equity are normative imperatives which, in actuality, are hard to establish in multicultural democracies or any other political system, as long as there still exists huge economic disparities between sections of the community. But of most significance is that the education system must play a significant role in trying to correct the socio-economic injustices that are deeply and inextricably rooted in economic disparity between various sections of the community as well as cultural differences between such communities (Gundara 2000:159). This is essential, particularly in pursuit of enhanced democracy and national unity.

The problem of equity and access to education is real. Graham-Brown (1991: 1) observed that "for many, there is no school. According to World Bank and UNESCO estimates, there are over 150 million children world wide between the ages of six and eleven who are not at school, few make it to secondary school." These observations seem to suggest that from a global point of view, there is no equity when it comes to access to education in general and secondary education in particular. But this is also likely to be true in some local contexts as it is the case in Botswana and this is explained in section 4.5.3 below.

The foregoing, section 4.4, presented an analysis of secondary education in general. In view of the aforementioned analysis, section 4.5 follows with a presentation of the analysis of secondary education in Botswana.

4.5   SECONDARY EDUCATION IN BOTSWANA

The education system of Botswana is grounded on the belief that education can facilitate the transformation of the country's economy from a traditional agro-based to an industrial economy that is consistent with technological and global changes (Botswana Government 2004:11). In many countries, Botswana inclusive, there is a distinction between primary and secondary education. However, in the education system of Botswana there is a further distinction between junior secondary and senior secondary education offered by equally differentiated schools as reflected in the Government Paper No. 2 of 1994 which is often referred to as the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE). These differentiated secondary schools are explained in sections 4.5.2 and 4.5.4 below. Both junior and senior secondary schools in Botswana operate under the authority of the Department of Secondary Education in the Ministry of Education (Botswana Government 2003:288).

There are basically four levels of education in Botswana, namely pre-primary, primary, secondary and tertiary education. Of these, pre-primary is the least developed and that is why the structure of the education system in Botswana is often referred to as 7:3:2. This refers to seven years of primary education, three years of junior secondary education and two years of senior secondary education (RNPE 1994:7). Every child in Botswana has access to ten years of basic education i.e. from primary school to the end of junior secondary education. According to Botswana National Development Plan (NDP) 9 (2003:272), "a 100% transition rate from primary education to junior secondary education has been achieved. This means that universal access to ten years of basic education is now possible." Beyond this level of basic education, access to senior secondary education has always been very limited and therefore not all junior secondary school completers proceed to senior

secondary schools (www.moe.gov.bw 2007). The question that may be asked could be whether those who do not proceed to senior secondary schools have acquired sufficient skills and knowledge to enable them to contribute meaningfully to the economic development of their country. As indicated below in section 4.5.3 a lot of learners have their schooling terminated at the end of junior secondary education at which stage most, if not all, of them are still very young to leave schools.

The broad purposes of secondary education have been briefly explained above (see section 4.4). These views on the purposes of secondary education accentuate its significance. In particular, it can be inferred that it is vital for every child to have secondary education and that its provision should be viewed in terms of serving the needs of the adolescents. In addition, every child has the right to education and therefore its provision ensures the fundamental rights of citizens. Closely related to this viewpoint, Osler (2003:38) has observed that "in various national and international legal instruments, the right to education is recognised as a universal fundamental right in society." It may be instructive to reflect on the provision of secondary education in Botswana and it might be more helpful to explain the evolution of secondary education in the country.

Secondary education in Botswana does not have a long history of success. According to Tlou and Campbell (1984:206), although there had been attempts to build secondary schools in Botswana, the first successful secondary school in Botswana was built in 1944 by the Catholic Church near Kgale. The second was built by the Bangwato tribe at Moeng and became operational in 1951 but was taken over by the Colonial Government in 1955. The only secondary school in Botswana that was built by the Colonial Government was Gaborone Secondary School in 1965 whilst independence was attained in 1966 (Molosiwa 1999:43).

The initial secondary schools in Botswana were, by and large, junior secondary schools and were community based in that they were initiated, built and managed by the communities (Tlou & Campbell 1984:205). Such schools were

therefore named (and still are) after the paramount chiefs of the respective communities. For example, some of the pre-independence secondary schools are Molefi Secondary School; Seepapitso Secondary School and Kgari Sechele Secondary School and these schools were all named after the paramount chiefs of the respective tribes. Although these schools were characterised by poor infrastructure and inadequate teaching facilities, they were a manifestation of self reliance and unity of purpose on the part of the communities. People relied on their limited resources to provide secondary education for their children (Tlou & Campbell 1984:207). As the economy of Botswana started to improve after independence, the Government sought to improve the provision of secondary education and therefore took over the community based secondary schools with a view to improving both the infrastructure and teaching facilities. Some of these schools were then upgraded to offer the entire secondary education (Form 1 up to Form 5).

Indeed the Government of Botswana managed to improve the aforementioned secondary schools. In addition, many more junior secondary schools and relatively fewer senior secondary schools were built in the country. To date (2007) there are 206 Botswana Government junior secondary schools and 27 senior secondary schools that are either owned or financed by the Government of Botswana (www.moe.gov.bw 2007). The development momentum of the education sector so far has been so huge so much so that the Government seems to have lost sight of the need to bring the communities along in this development process. The communities' role was then reduced or limited to identifying sites, through the Land Boards, for the Government to build secondary schools. In the process, one may argue, the Government lost the opportunity to sustain and/or improve on the communities' willingness and demonstrated commitment to play a critical role in the provision of secondary education. The Government of Botswana should have left the communities to continue managing their schools but provided enough technical and financial support to ensure improved provision of secondary education. This arrangement could probably have evolved into some form of partnerships

between the Government and the local communities in the provision of secondary education.

The current (2007) situation in Botswana is that the management of all public secondary schools (junior and senior) is the sole responsibility of the Government. Additional secondary schools, whenever they are built, are the sole responsibility of the Government. This state of affairs has placed enormous strain on the Government's budget resulting, for example, in limited places in senior secondary schools. As a result, it is necessary for the Government to have a number of sources of financial support in the quest to improve the provision and quality of secondary education in the country.

In order to further elucidate the nature and scope of the provision of secondary education in Botswana, the rest of section 4.5 will focus on cost recovery measures; junior secondary education; transition from junior to senior secondary schools; senior secondary education; and secondary school teachers in Botswana.

4.5.1 Cost recovery measures in secondary education in Botswana

In the education sector, one way of cost recovery or generating funds is charging school fees. However, in Botswana school fees were abolished in 1987 until 2005 for both primary and secondary education in public schools ostensibly to reduce the financial burden on parents (Ministry of Education 2006:1; RNPE 1994:9). But these fees may have not been a burden to all the parents. The Government of Botswana should have opted to assist parents who had difficulties in paying school fees in order to ensure that no child failed to go to school on account of lack of such fees. In other words, the more affluent parents and those who could afford to pay school fees should have been left to do so. It seems that the Government of Botswana did not foresee that in future it will be difficult to single handedly shoulder the cost of education and that reverting to school fees sometime in future will be a daunting task that will not be politically favourable to the ruling party. The virtue of school fees for

Botswana is that funds generated could enhance the Government's capacity to provide more and better educational facilities.

In 2006, the Government of Botswana re-introduced school fees in public secondary schools but not in primary schools (Ministry of Education 2006:5). However, the decision to re-introduce school fees was given a rather frigid reception by the civil society and the opposition politicians. The resistance was clearly noticeable to the extent that the Ministry of Education even castigated some secondary school heads for ostensibly sabotaging the cost recovery measures that the Government instituted in 2006 (Nkate 2006:4). It would appear that the Government of Botswana realised, during the period of no school fees, that abolition of school fees was not sustainable for an economy that was facing many challenges such as the HIV/AIDS pandemic. In addition, abolition of school fees actually reduced the Government's financial base and therefore stifled its capacity to cope with the ever increasing demand for educational services. As long as the population continues to grow the demand for educational services will most probably continue to increase as well. Notwithstanding the aforementioned constraint, the Government of Botswana has succeeded in building enough junior secondary schools in the country (Botswana Government 2003:272).

4.5.2 Junior secondary education in Botswana

The junior secondary education follows on seven years of primary schooling at the end of which pupils sit for school leaving examinations. According to Botswana NDP 9 (2003:272) a 100 percent transition rate from primary education to junior secondary education has been achieved. As a result, every primary school leaver can have a place in a junior secondary school in the country regardless of the achieved examination results. In this regard, the Government of Botswana has done very well to build enough junior secondary schools in the country. Primary and junior secondary education together is referred to as ten years of basic education in Botswana. This is primarily because the education that is offered at these levels offers learners the basic

skills and knowledge that are perceived to be desirable to everybody because they form the basis for further intellectual development. Further learning and/or training is therefore anchored on competencies acquired through basic education. In Botswana there are currently (2007) enough places for every child in both primary and junior secondary schools and every child is required to attend these schools. In other words, the transition rate from primary to junior secondary school is 100 percent.

The conceptual structural framework of the junior secondary school curriculum has been described (RNPE 1994:8) as a programme that has:

(a) vocational orientation of academic subjects;

(b) an increased number of practical subjects on offer;

(c) an emphasis on foundation skills applicable to work situations;

(d) a relation to the world of work by offering curricular and co-curricular activities that espouse the processes and organisation of production and demands of working life;

(e) a Career Guidance and Counselling component;

(f) a Basic Computer Awareness course to be taken by all students; and

(g) a co-curricular activity in the form of a sporting activity, club or hobby.

The curriculum conceptual framework has been translated into a junior secondary school curriculum and the below, table 4.1, shows the nature and scope of the resultant curriculum.

The junior secondary school curriculum is broad and table 4.1 above shows the nature and scope of the subjects offered at this level of education. Every learner takes a minimum of 10 subjects and a maximum of 11 subjects. In addition, each learner takes a minimum of 2 and a maximum of 3 optional subjects which further means that every student takes 8 core subjects. At the end of junior secondary education, students sit for junior certificate (JC) examinations. The results of these examinations determine who proceeds to the next level, namely senior secondary schools.

Table 4.1: Botswana junior secondary school curriculum

CORE	OPTIONAL	
	Practical	**General**
English	Business Studies	Music
Setswana	Home Economics	Physical Education
Mathematics		Religious Education
Integrated Science		Art
Social Studies		French
Agriculture		
Moral Education		
Design & Technology		

Adapted from a Report on the Evaluation of the Three year J.C. (junior certificate) programme (2002:14)

The description of the structural framework of Botswana junior secondary school curriculum indicates that every learner is required to take a Basic Computer Awareness course (see (f) above). This, as the name implies, is just an awareness course and therefore not intended for the learners to acquire the necessary IT skills, it is neither listed under the curriculum nor examinable (Curriculum Blueprint 2002:14; RNPE 1994:8). In this era that is dominated and/or driven by information technology, it is very necessary for learners to have acquired the basic IT skills by the time they complete their junior secondary education. It is therefore desirable to have computer studies as one of the core subjects in the junior certificate programme in Botswana. The ideal thing would be to have a well equipped computer laboratory in every junior secondary school in the country. However, the absence of this arrangement may be attributed to lack of adequate financial resources on the part of the Government of Botswana necessitating the involvement of the private sector in the provision of secondary education in the country.

The delivery of junior secondary school curriculum is compromised by a number of other factors. Firstly, the curriculum is clearly broad and it exposes learners to a wide range of disciplines. However, the problem with this broad curriculum is that there are many subjects on offer which compete for the limited space in the school time table. As a result, the subject content can only be dealt with at an introductory level. Since the subjects' content can not be treated in great detail, the ultimate consequence of this state of affairs is a watered down junior secondary education. Such a broad curriculum would have been fine if every student was to proceed to senior secondary education provided that at senior secondary level of education detailed treatment of the subject matter was undertaken. So the junior secondary learners who can not proceed to senior secondary schools end up with very little, if any, knowledge and skills that can hardly be of any use in this era of information age.

Inadequate use of information technology (IT) in the delivery of junior secondary curriculum also compromises the quality of education at this stage of secondary education. Anecdotal evidence suggests that this problem is exacerbated by lack of IT skills on the part of the teaching staff and this is a serious gap in the provision of secondary education in Botswana (Sedisa 2003:77). Information technology skills can bolster the teachers' capacity to motivate learners to acquire essential skills and assimilate more knowledge in and outside the classrooms. Learners seem to be attracted to computers and therefore delivering the curriculum around these facilities can enhance their desire to learn more and therefore improve the quality of education. It is therefore essential that secondary school teachers be assisted to acquire and use the necessary IT skills in their job. In particular, the pre-service training of junior secondary school teachers should be undertaken around the information technology so that they can develop the capacity to use the concomitant skills in the delivery of instruction.

The other factor that compromises the delivery of the junior secondary school curriculum in Botswana is the class sizes and/or unfavourable learner/teacher ratios. Junior secondary school classes in Botswana have up to 50 learners

(Botswana Government 2004:11) and such huge classes are often characterised by discipline problems and therefore difficult to teach. In addition, guidance that teachers would normally prefer to give to individual learners is also difficult to achieve if there are just too many learners in classes. All of this can very much contribute towards a low standard of education.

4.5.3 Transition from junior to senior secondary schools in Botswana

Whereas the transition from primary schools to junior secondary ones is 100 percent, the transition from junior secondary schools to senior secondary schools is far less and remains a saga of misfortunes. Access to senior secondary schools is very limited in Botswana primarily because there are inadequate numbers of senior secondary schools for the number of junior secondary school leavers at the end of each year which necessitates the involvement of the private sector in the provision of secondary education in the country. Sufficient access to places in Botswana senior secondary schools has always been a problem and in the absence of a better strategy the situation is most likely to continue as such for a long time. The picture has been put succinctly by Molosiwa (1999:115) when he observed that "admissions into senior secondary schools have been increased from 28 percent to 34 percent in 1997. In addition, unified secondary schools offering the full secondary programme from Form 1 to Form V will be constructed during NDP 8 in the remote areas of Botswana to increase access to senior secondary schools. A few more senior secondary schools will be constructed in the urban areas. Indicators are that 50% access to senior secondary schools will be achieved before the year 2003." It should be noted that the National Development Plan 8 (NDP 8) came to an end on 31 March 2004 and most of the aforementioned targets have, to date (2007), not been achieved. There are no Government unified secondary schools as yet but 50 percent access to senior secondary schools has been achieved.

According to the Department of Secondary Education (www.moe.gov.bw 2007), "At present the transition rate from junior schools to senior schools

stands at 50.8%." It further states that a total of 37 607 candidates sat the junior certificate examinations at the end of 2006 and this means that 18 503 learners could not proceed to senior secondary schools at the beginning of 2007. Notwithstanding this limited transition rate, the Government of Botswana has consistently put in a lot of money into the education sub-sector as exemplified by the following financial allocations:

(a)   In 2005, the Ministry of Education was allocated P4.28 billion which translates to 30 percent of the total ministerial allocation for the 2005/06 recurrent budget. The same ministry was allocated P400 million or 8 percent of the 2005/06 development budget (Botswana Government 2005:23).

(b)   In 2006, the Ministry of Education was allocated P4.52 billion representing 27 percent of the recurrent budget for 2006/07 financial year (Botswana Government 2006:24). The amount of P528 million or 9 percent of the development budget was allocated to the same ministry for the same financial year.

(c)   In 2007, the same ministry has been allocated P5.0 billion or 28.2 percent of the 2007/08 recurrent budget (Botswana Government 2007:25). In addition, P584 million has been allocated to the ministry for development purposes and this represents 8 percent of the development budget.

In spite of the limited transition from junior to senior secondary schools, the Government of Botswana Vision 2016 (1997:17) would actually like the transition to go up to 100 percent. This has also been echoed by President Mogae (2004:20) in his address to the nation of Botswana in 2004 when he accentuated the aspirations of his Government to educate every child up to the end of secondary education if resources permitted.

As stated earlier on in section 4.5, there are actually 206 junior secondary schools and 27 senior secondary schools in Botswana to date (2006). In fact according to the current policy on education as reflected in the National Development Plan 9 (2003:288), between 2004 and 2009, transition from

junior secondary schools to senior secondary schools is planned for 50 per cent. If half of the junior secondary school leavers do not have access to senior secondary schools then what are these children going to be doing instead? One can imagine that most of them will be idling and roaming the streets and this state of affairs could have far reaching socio-economic implications some of which are considered below.

According to the National Development Plan 9 (2003:288), 50 per cent translates to about 20 000 people who can not proceed to senior secondary schools annually. The Government of Botswana is aware that junior secondary school leavers are generally no longer employable as they hardly possess the skills that are required in the contemporary world of work. In this regard, it has been observed that the "Junior Certificate is devalued on the labour market and cannot now be accepted as minimum qualification for entry into many training institutions" (RNPE 1994:6). In this context, one junior secondary school head in Botswana remarked that the 3-year junior secondary school programme yielded a certificate that "has been overtaken by events as a school leaving certificate. Its purpose and value are now questionable. There is need to revisit its worth and decide whether it still serves the purpose it was initially meant to serve" (Botswana Government 2004:18). Indeed, the junior secondary school leavers are not well grounded in job related skills and experiences for them to enter the world of work. A similar observation was made by the Task Force (2004:18) that was set up to evaluate the 3-year junior certificate programme and noted that "Junior Certificate should therefore cease to be viewed as a certificate for securing employment and should remain a selection mechanism for channeling learners according to their aptitudinal preferences into senior secondary schools and tertiary sector." Referring to a similar situation in the USA about children who do not complete their secondary education, Orr (1987:1) argued that "... their economic and social opportunities have become increasingly bleak ... as business and trained work force." As implied earlier, people are the ultimate resources of their country, if not the global society, and therefore it does not make economic sense to put

such a large number of the youth to waste. The national output forgone due to the unemployment of such a large number of able bodied youth is colossal.

Junior secondary school learners are young people and the majority of them complete this level of education at the age of around 15 years. As a result, both the level of education and age disadvantage these young people when it comes to employment. Therefore, those who can not be maintained by the education system face a bleak future. Some of the negative effects of unemployment have been succinctly captured by Mohr and Rodgers (1993:315) when they observed that "society as a whole loses from unemployment because total output is below its potential level. The unemployed suffer as individuals, both from their income loss while unemployed and from the low level of self-esteem that long periods of unemployment cause. Substantial unemployment also generates (or creates conditions for) social unrest and political instability." It should be noted however, that the intention is not to suggest that higher education is a guarantee for employment. Experience has shown that there are many people who have higher than junior secondary education or even higher than senior secondary education, say degrees, who are desperately looking for a job. However, the point is that in general, the more one is educated the better his/her social and/or economic opportunities. In addition, education enhances their outlook to the world and enables them to deal with the challenges and opportunities of the contemporary world in a more meaningful way.

It could therefore be suggested that junior secondary education is no longer sufficient for one to cope with the intricacies of the modern life. Policy makers ought to realize that as the society changes and becomes more complex, basic education should not lag behind and therefore should also change and become more complex as well. This view should be reflected not only in the philosophy of education but also, and more importantly, in the structures and processes of secondary education delivery. In this regard, senior secondary education in its entirety should be part of basic education and be accessible to every juniour secondary school leaver (Mogae 2004:20). The provision of education is

162

obviously expensive and if government can not meet this expanded demand then engaging the private sector could be one of the possible options to be considered. This point is further developed in chapter five. It should nevertheless be stated here that learners whose formal education terminate at the end of the junior secondary school programme face a bleak future in Botswana if not in the contemporary global community. These people are only employable to a very limited extent and very few of them proceed to vocational training (Botswana Government 2004:18). Vocational training for people with inadequate basic education does not help them very much and hence the need for basic education to be inclusive of senior secondary education. Vocational training after senior secondary education can be more meaningful than when it is offered earlier as senior secondary education is most likely to provide learners with more knowledge and skills that could make a solid base for vocational training. People who undergo vocational training after completing senior secondary education stand a better chance of being employed in the existing enterprises. In addition, they can be self employed and even create job opportunities for others and therefore enhance economic activities which could lead to economic growth and hopefully improve the general welfare of the populace. A caveat may be in order at this stage, namely that the public sector should not develop systems and structures that can not be sustained due to limited resources. In this regard, optimal engagement of available resources is advocated and this includes resources at the disposal of the private sector in an attempt to have a well informed and educated nation on a sustainable basis.

If all junior certificate completers could proceed to senior secondary schools then an opportunity would have been created for the achievement of the aspirations of the Government of Botswana for a well informed and educated nation (Botswana Government 1997:5). However, once universal access to senior secondary education has been achieved, it will be important to ensure that senior secondary education in Botswana is of such a quality that those who have completed it could be regarded as well informed and educated.

4.5.4 Senior secondary education in Botswana

Senior secondary education is the last stage of secondary education in Botswana Government secondary schools and it stretches over 2 years at the end of which students sit for Botswana General Certificate of Secondary Education (BGCSE) examinations (Botswana Government 2002:1). It should be added however, that some private secondary schools offer programmes, albeit for a small number of learners, leading to higher certificates such as A' Levels and Higher International General Secondary Education. Such private secondary schools include Maruapula; Westwood; and Legae Academy in Gaborone.

The aim of senior secondary education in Botswana is, among others, to prepare students for the world of work, further education, lifelong learning and to further the all round development of individual learners (Botswana Government 1997:i). Senior secondary education therefore provides further opportunities for the youth to develop their potential. It is a period when new talents unfold and flourish while existing ones are nurtured. From an economic point of view, senior secondary education in Botswana is viewed as an essential means of attaining economic growth and development as the major national resource, the people, is developed (Curriculum Blueprint 2002:1).

The 2 years of senior secondary education include an examinations period and within the same period each learner takes a minimum of 8 subjects (Curriculum Blue Print 2002:6). These subjects are selected according to table 4.2 below. In addition to the core subjects, every learner is required to take a minimum of 1 subject from each of the Sciences and Humanities and Social Sciences Group; a minimum of 2 subjects from the Creative, Technical and Vocational Group; and 1 subject from the Enrichment Group. Table 2 also shows that the senior secondary school curriculum is varied to accommodate different interests and aptitudes. However, 2 years of senior secondary education appears to be inadequate. It would appear that 2 years actually translate to about one and a half years of actual teaching in view of the fact that there are 2 school

vacations of 3 weeks each in a year and about 4 weeks of final examinations. Taking into account the length of teaching time available and the number of subjects involved at this level of education one wonders whether the education system of Botswana produces people with the necessary and/or appropriate skills and depth in knowledge for the country to compete globally. A minimum of 8 subjects to be taught in less than 2 years suggests that learners are merely being introduced to the subjects and no reasonable depth can be expected to be achieved within this time frame. The quality of senior secondary education in Botswana, in other words, is compromised by the amount of time devoted to it.

Since senior secondary education in Botswana is the last phase of formal education for a significant number of the youth, the curriculum should facilitate the acquisition salable skills for those who will not proceed to higher education. These should be skills that will enable people who possess them to be attractive to the employers in the labour market. The provision of vocational programmes, at this level of education, should be such that the programmes actually prepare the students for immediate employment. Such level of preparation could also produce young people who are easily trainable to a high level of skills since they will be in possession of the necessary skills and knowledge on which to base further training. Learners who have been subjected to rigorous vocational education are likely to engage in some economic activity even if they are not employed by anybody. The vocationalisation of senior secondary education in Botswana is very important partly as a strategy to assist young people from disenchanted families to break out of the cycle of poverty and deliver them from the shackles of deprivation (Wiles & Bondi 1993:352).

Learners who successfully complete senior secondary education are placed in tertiary institutions in Botswana where there are very limited places. A large number of the senior secondary school completers are sent to universities in South Africa and a few are sent to universities in other countries. An unconfirmed report from the Ministry of Education suggests that Botswana

currently has about 4 000 learners enrolled in South African academic institutions. Furthermore, according to this unconfirmed report these universities in South African do not register learners from Botswana direct into degree programmes. Instead, some learners are registered for a bridging course for the first year whilst others are required to do matriculation in South Africa before they can enroll for a degree programme.

Table 4.2: Botswana senior secondary school curriculum

| CORE | OPTIONAL GROUPS | | | |
	Humanities and Social Sciences	Sciences	Creative, Technical and Vocational	Enrolment
English	History	Single Science	Design & Technology, Agriculture	Third Language
Setswana	Geography	Double Science	Art, Food & Nutrition	Physical Education
Mathematics	Social Studies	Physics	Computer Studies	Music
	Development Studies	Chemistry	Fashion & Fabrics	Religious Education
	Literature in English	Biology	Business Studies Home Economics	Moral Education
		Human & Social Biology		

Adapted from Botswana Curriculum Blue Print (2002:6)

This seems to suggest that the Botswana General Certificate of Secondary Education is of a lower standard as compared to its counterpart in South Africa. The relentless forces of globalisation dictate that for a country to be competitive in the global society its standard of education should be comparable to those of other countries. In addition, the amount of money that the Government of Botswana spends on the bridging courses and matriculation is a lot and could be used to expand the breadth and depth of secondary

education in the country to that which is comparable to the South African matriculation system.

In view of the foregoing, President Mogae (2007:3) has acknowledged that "... the Government of Botswana spends P280 million annually sponsoring Botswana students in tertiary institutions in South Africa." If of the 4 years each learner spends studying in South Africa, 1 year is devoted to correcting the limitations of the Botswana Secondary Education System, this in monetary terms translates to about one quarter of the total cost, which is about P70 million annually. Essentially, by sponsoring so many learners for bridging courses and matriculation in South Africa or any other country, the Government of Botswana is investing a lot of money in foreign education systems instead of investing it in the improvement of senior secondary education in the country. It does not make any economic sense to invest and create jobs in foreign countries when locally the demand for employment is colossal.

Given the school curriculum, *inter alia,* the quality of education depends to a very large extent on teachers and it might therefore be instructive to briefly analyse the circumstances under which teachers in Botswana secondary schools work.

4.5.5 Secondary school teachers in Botswana

The quality of education depends to a very large extent on the quality of instructional delivery by teachers and they remain the most significant tool for effecting learning (Marope & Chapman 1997:3). Where the school culture is mostly at variance with the home culture, it should be expected that the role of teachers would be more significant as they act as a bridge between these different cultures. In developing countries like Botswana where instructional materials are in acute shortage, the teachers' role becomes essentially that of the dominant provider of knowledge making them even more important or central in the educative process. This requires teachers to be very conversant

with the subject content that they have to teach learners (Dreyer & Duming 1983:88).

Secondary school teachers play another significant role, that of change agents. When changes are introduced in the education system in an attempt to improve the quality of education, teachers are often at the forefront in effecting such changes. They are therefore very important gatekeepers between policy interventions and the students' actual learning experiences (Cohen 1989:22). In this regard, teachers can break or make the education system.

In Botswana, secondary school teachers are employed by the Government through the Department of Teaching Service Management. Teachers are employed on the basis of their qualifications but paid on the basis of their levels of operation in accordance with a parallel progression policy that was implemented in 1994 (Botswana Government 1994:46). According to this policy, teachers in senior secondary schools progress to a salary scale higher than that of their counterparts in junior secondary schools. This means that two teachers with the same bachelors degree and graduated in the same year will after two years be on different salary scales if one is in a junior secondary and the other in a senior secondary school. But the choice of which teacher is posted to which school after graduating is solely made by the Department of Teaching Service Management. Those posted to junior secondary schools are very unhappy because their salary progression is very limited as compared to those in senior secondary schools and their status is also lower because they teach in junior secondary schools.

In 1998, the Government of Botswana, through Directive No. 36 of 1998, introduced a Scarce Skills policy that was intended to attract people with scarce skills into the public service (including the teaching profession). A scarce skill is perceived to be one whose demand exceeds by far its supply and that a person who possesses such a skill must have undergone rigorous training that extended over a long period of time. For secondary school teachers the policy

benefits those of Design and Technology; Agricultural Science; Mathematics and Science and they were placed on a higher salary scale than their counterparts in other disciplines. This policy has also divided teachers and the majority who have not benefited from it are strongly opposed to its implementation.

These policies have a significant bearing on the quality of education as they affect teachers' morale and level of motivation. Teachers are critical role players in the education system and therefore policies that affect them directly in their jobs need to be carefully considered with a view to motivating and retaining them. Anecdotal evidence abounds to suggest that experienced secondary school heads and teachers are leaving the teaching service, yet these are the people that the education system of Botswana requires to spearhead continuous improvement of the quality of secondary education.

Learners' indiscipline is another source of concern for secondary school teachers in Botswana. Learners threaten teachers, vandalise school property and generally cause chaos in Botswana secondary schools. For example, in the November 2006 seating of Parliament the Minister of Education, Mr Jacob Nkate, lamented that 10 secondary schools have had their hostels, science laboratories and other facilities burnt or vandalised in the past 5 years culminating in the net cost of damage done in these schools of P20 million. He further noted that the anti-social behaviour was even extended to beating up junior learners and school staff (Botswana Press Agency 2006:1). Evidently, the conditions under which secondary school teachers in Botswana function are not very conducive to the delivery and continuous improvement of quality secondary education.

4.6 CONCLUSION

The chapter has focused on philosophical aspects of education with three schools of thought in philosophy of education explained, namely idealism and education, realism and education and pragmatism and education. The kernel of

idealism is that it advocates the supremacy of ideas in both the expression and interpretation of reality. On the other hand, realism argues that knowledge is absolute and exists by itself independently of its knower. Knowledge is therefore not the construct of human mind according to realism. Pragmatism argues that what is true is that which works. The aims of education can be intrinsic or extrinsic. Intrinsic aims are those educational achievements that are regarded valuable for their own sake regardless of any other value they may have. Extrinsic aims are more utilitarian in that education is viewed as a means to achieve something more valuable to its recipients or the society at large. Education, as the repository of culture, is also viewed as a means of transmitting the norms, values, knowledge and skills that sustain the uniqueness and identity of the society. It is vital for economic development because of its critical role in human capital, which is the acquired mental and physical ability that enhances labour productivity which, in turn, can contribute to economic prosperity. Education can enhance one's social mobility in that it creates greater opportunity for better status and higher income. More importantly, a society that is educated tends to live a better life. Secondary education precedes primary education and therefore serves as a bridge between primary and tertiary education. In some cases, secondary education prepares mostly adolescents for the world of work but also facilitates personal development as the key to unlocking one's potential. Education is therefore important to everyone and should be accessible to all who require it. In particular, basic education should be redefined in Botswana to include the whole of secondary education and every child should receive it. The education system should endeavour to continuously improve its quality of delivery.

Notwithstanding the value of education referred to above, there are certain limitations in its provision in Botswana. Whereas a 100 percent transition rate from primary school education to junior secondary school education has been achieved, just over 50 percent of junior secondary school completers find places in senior secondary schools in Botswana. The Government of Botswana has consistently devoted about 8 percent of the development budget to the education sub-sector but has, until 2007, not been able to construct more

senior secondary schools in order to increase access to this level of education. The existing secondary schools have generally suffered from inadequate maintenance for a long time leaving some of the schools rather unsightly.

To advocate the improvement of both access and quality of secondary education, the next chapter focuses on the provision of secondary education through public-private partnerships albeit with specific focus on the Gaborone City area in Botswana.

CHAPTER 5

PROVISION OF SECONDARY EDUCATION THROUGH PPPs

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter has shown that secondary education is not necessarily accessible to all those who need it (see section 4.5). In particular, it has been shown that in Botswana senior secondary education is not accessible to all who need it and qualify for admission into senior secondary schools. One critical reason for lack of universalisation of the entire secondary education is limited financial resources on the part of the Government of Botswana. The intent and purpose of this chapter are to explore the feasibility of providing secondary education through public-private partnerships in the Gaborone City area of Botswana. In order to do this, the nature and structure of a contemporary secondary school in the country is analysed in order to establish those aspects of the provision of secondary education that can be handled through PPPs. The chapter also focuses on strategies to enhance the democratisation and universalisation of secondary education with a specific focus on the Gaborone City area through PPPs. Besides, the current picture as to the provision of secondary education in the area in question is highlighted together with the current thinking in the Government of Botswana as far as enhancing access to senior secondary education is concerned.

5.2 THRUST OF PPPs IN PROVISION OF SECONDARY EDUCATION

The previous chapter (see section 4.3.3) has demonstrated the values of education to the extent that everyone needs at least basic education which has been suggested that it should be redefined to include the entire secondary education system in Botswana. This is further motivated by the Basic Human Rights as promulgated by the United Nations especially the 1990 Jomtien Declaration that called for revitalised partnerships at all levels in order to achieve Education For All (EFA) (Galabawa & Agu 2001:1). Whereas the same Declaration does not articulate the nature and scope of the envisaged partnerships, it clearly accentuates the fact that nation states are, by

and large, unable to provide for basic education to every citizen yet education should be for everyone. It has also been noted earlier (see section 4.4) that secondary education provided a significant link between primary and higher education. However, such a crucial link was, in actuality, a missing link in the Education For All agenda and it is therefore suggested that all countries, including developed ones, should enlarge access possibilities at this level of education (UNESCO 2002:13).

In chapter three (see section 3.3.3), it has been observed that whereas governments in some countries like Botswana are unable to adequately provide some services, such as education, due to limited resources, the private sector is actually replete with such resources. Alternatively, the private sector is able to make available the much needed resources. As a result, the argument has been made for PPPs to bolster public service capacity in the provision of public services. An additional virtue of PPPs is the expansion of economic activity with the possibility of increased economic growth. Notwithstanding the likelihood of problems in engaging the private sector in the provision of public services, well managed PPPs can achieve synergy and improve quality in the delivery of public services. It is expected that PPPs can be effectively applied in the provision of secondary education especially in the Gaborone City area in Botswana with a view to improving the quality of its delivery. In order to facilitate the analysis of the provision of secondary education in the aforementioned area through PPPs, it is appropriate to first elucidate the nature of a secondary school in Botswana.

5.3 NATURE OF A SECONDARY SCHOOL

It has already been stated that the focus of the thesis is the application of PPPs in the provision of secondary education that is delivered in a formal secondary school set up. It is therefore essential to devote some space on elucidating the concept of school and a structural-functional analysis of a secondary school in Botswana.

5.3.1 School

A school, perhaps like the state and even the church, is a social structure that is made up of interrelated parts and has a clearly defined population, is distinct from its environment, has a complex network of social relationships and a unique culture (Hoy & Miskel 2005:22). In particular, a school is an institute for instruction whose basic function is the transmission of knowledge to the posterity (Ballantine 1989:138). The actual process of educating children actually starts at home and therefore a school is inevitably linked to the home or, alternatively, its task is an extension of the education delivered in the home. This is premised on the understanding that the home environment provides basic education to a certain point beyond which such an environment ceases to be effective in providing further education. In addition, there are certain types of knowledge that the home cannot transmit to the child effectively. The school therefore takes over where it is generally believed that it will be a waste of time to keep children and provide them with education in the home (Barrow 1981:34). For Miller (1991:359), a "school has been defined as the place where knowledge and facts are taught, where people are prepared for careers and to be useful citizens." However, experience has shown that a school does far more than this and therefore an appropriate definition should encompass other equally important functions of a school. Over and above intellect and vocation, health issues, social skills and physical development are also very important foci of a school. A school should therefore be viewed as a deliberately organised effort to facilitate the holistic development of the youth and other persons attending it. In addition, a school is an organisation where the youth (learners) can effectively explore creative possibilities and discover their potentials.

To further elucidate the concept of school, the next paragraphs under this section present an analysis of the functions of a school in relation to the learner, the social structure of a school, and the cost characteristics of a school.

5.3.1.1 Functions of a school in relation to the learner

It is essential to highlight the functions of a school from the learner's perspective especially in view of the need to educate him or her as a totality. In this regard, Castelyn, Sohnge and Steyn (1981:31) identified the following four broad functions of a school:

(a) Transmission of knowledge and skills (education of head and heart): The transmission of knowledge is an extremely important and specialised function of a school. The focus is on true knowledge delivered through educative teaching which culminates in deeper insight. This enables the learner to correlate facts, to analyse and synthesize, to differentiate between the essentials and the incidental, to make correct deductions and from relevant facts to arrive at the correct conclusions. In addition, the school provides an opportunity for the learner to acquire some basic but nevertheless important skills. Such skills give the learner an opportunity for creative self-expression and determination. Learners who tend to be unequal to knowledge-based instructional material have the opportunity to learn some vocational skills that could in future enhance their livelihood.

(b) Transmission of norms, ideals and attitudes (character building): In the course of educative teaching the learner's character is moulded by defining and transmitting norms, ideals and attitudes that are essential in the human community. Through other activities in school a child learns how to get along with others and develops the ability to distinguish between the good and the bad. So the school should enable a learner to cultivate good habits, to follow good examples and to love what is good and thus be inspired by it.

(c) Transmission of aesthetic and behavioural norms (good taste): It is part of the function of the school to teach children to appreciate and aspire to that which is beautiful. In addition, children should be taught norms of behaviour that are the criteria of good manners. All this should be guided by what prevails yet preferred in their community. However, in the event there is no direct instruction given in the school on these issues, the school environment should as far as possible be inspiring and should deserve to be imitated.

(d) Physical education and care: The physical aspect of the child should never be overlooked lest the other human aspects be compromised or in a way endangered. Whether included in the curriculum or offered through extra-curricular activities, the physical education actively and positively enhances the learner's health and physical development. The school should also take care of the welfare of the learners and therefore be kept clean with classrooms well ventilated.

The above exposition was meant to demonstrate the centrality of proper schooling in the lives of the young people. So a school is not only concerned with cognitive related tasks but also encompasses various tasks that are designed to enhance the holistic development of every learner. As a small society, a school is a microcosm of a larger community and so it presents learners with an opportunity to learn social skills such as how to get along with others. In addition, it has been observed by Levin (2001:9) that another significant public purpose of schooling is to provide common educational experiences with respect to curriculum, values, and political socialisation so that learners from various backgrounds could accept and support a common set of social, economic and political organisations. Another salient function of a school is to develop learners to a point where they can be of economic value to their societies (Lemmer 2000:51). In this regard, schools must facilitate the acquisition of skills that are relevant to enhancing national economic performance.

5.3.1.2 Social structure of a school

Schools in general exhibit both the common and diverse features. Each school is different from another in terms of, among other things, culture and rituals yet every school has certain features that are common to all of them. The structure of a school imbues it with its own peculiar identity that is different from other structures of society such as the home, church or even the state. Some of these structural features have been captured by Stone (1981:31) as he noted that schools:

(a) are social structures for the accelerated, planned and organised development (unfolding) of learners by means of tuition;

(b)   are guided by professionally trained educators who, like the pupils, form part of the schools structure;

(c)   have trained educators who have limitations and potential that are determined by what and how the pupils are;

(d)   function on the basis of the relevant culture;

(e)   are linked to other spheres of life, such as families, churches, and the state; and

(f)   are guided by certain distinguishable basic religious motives against a background of cultural and natural determining factors.

As stated earlier, the basic function of schools is knowledge transmission which is cognitive in nature. However, in the actual school environment teachers and learners are normally engaged in various activities that are not related to the cognitive development of the learners (Lemmer 2000:98). Such activities are nonetheless crucial either to the learners or the running of a school. For example, teachers spend time marking school registers, supervising learners' meals or attending to a learner's health or social problems. For all these to occur in tandem with education is understandable. After all education is part of a broader social policy and, through its provision, some of the social needs of individuals and those of the society are addressed. For example, the provision of school meals is to ensure that learners are not hungry whilst at school especially those from disadvantaged families who would otherwise be unable to have something to eat.

5.3.1.3 Cost characteristics of a school

A school, like any public or private organisation, operates at various costs. However, a school has certain cost characteristics that imbue it with its particular identity and some of these characteristics have been captured by Coombs and Hallak in Knight (1993:16) as follows:

(a)   Schools are generally non-profit making organisations and, in particular, government maintained schools are completely devoid of the profit motive so much so that even the profit measure does not exist. The significance of profit

177

in organisations that are orientated to it is that it provides a measure of efficiency of performance and makes it possible to estimate the relationship between inputs and outputs.

(b)   Schools are organisations that provide service and happen to perform both social and economic functions. Consequently, the measurement and costing of their output are difficult to undertake. It may be possible to estimate the cost of teaching learners to master certain skills but it is impossible to cost the school's efforts in promoting good citizenship or desirable social qualities.

(c)   School unit costs tend to rise when education becomes more technical and science-centred, when it deals with older learners, and when there is greater concern for quality.

(d)   Schools are labour-intensive so much so that a higher proportion of the cost is invariably being attributed to staff salaries. The conventional labour-intensive service industry invests in improved technology to reduce labour costs. However, when schools attempt to do this, they could increase learner/teacher ratio, and thereby increase class size, narrow the curriculum, and loosen social control.

(e)   School calendars lead to high costs. The traditional school day, school week and school year lead to a gross underutilisation of school premises. Effectively, in a year a typical classroom is not used for at least 12 weeks.

(f)   Schools are constrained by legislation, policies and attitudes that have often developed without consideration for costs, and yet considerably affect them.

A school does not exist in a vacuum, it is embedded in a vast and complex social, political and economic surround with which it continually interacts (Goodlad et al 2004:33). This contextual surround inevitably shapes the educational process that unfolds in schools. In very poor countries, for example, it is not uncommon to find classes as large as sixty students who are taught squatting on the floor (Graham-Brown 1991:1; Lemmer 2000:83). On the other hand, it is possible in the most affluent countries to find class sizes that are deliberately kept small in order to facilitate individual learners' attention by teachers who are also well trained and teaching in well furnished classrooms. Educational processes in these different economic environments are bound to be very different and the cost structure of

178

secondary schools in these environments is likely to be different as well. However, the contextual surround shapes the educational process in many and varied ways, the communist regime, for example, will have educational processes that are different from those in a democracy (Goodlad et al 2004:33). It can be expected that schools in these regimes will exhibit features of the national character or prevailing political ideology and be run on the basis of such ideologies. These differences may also have different cost implications. A school in a democracy will most probably be run on democratic principles and instill the same principles in the learners as part of the process of enculturation into a political democracy.

5.3.2 Structural – functional analysis of a secondary school in Botswana

The intent in this section is to present a description of the structure and functions of a secondary school in Botswana. All this is based on anecdotal evidence gleaned from over two decades of experience as a teacher and administrator (school head) in both junior and senior secondary schools in Botswana. The importance of this structural-functional analysis is that it will later in the chapter inform the argument for PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area of Botswana. In particular, the analysis will help in identifying aspects of the provision of secondary education that can be handled through the PPP arrangement. Although there are some differences between a junior and a senior secondary school in Botswana, the structural features that are deemed essential for this thesis are basically the same in these schools. As a result, a distinction between these levels of secondary school will not be emphasised in this section. It can also be stated that both junior and senior secondary schools have, to a large extent, similar functions in which case the application of PPP can be generalised for all these schools.

The delivery of formal secondary education is often facilitated by the school infrastructure which, in this context, is taken to be one of the components of the ideal secondary school in Botswana. However, in order to present a more comprehensive structural-functional analysis f a secondary school in Botswana, the following will also be analysed: classrooms, academic side of school, ancillary services, financing secondary education, and secondary school management.

5.3.2.1 School infrastructure

In Botswana, school buildings are the main infrastructure in a school and they are, by and large, provided by the Government of Botswana through the normal budgetary process. As a result, the building of secondary schools has to compete with other social needs for budgetary considerations and this view was also expressed by Lemmer and Badenhorst (1997:364) albeit in the context of South Africa. In view of the ever limited financial resources, the Government of Botswana is unable to build as many secondary schools as is necessary as stated by the Minister of Finance and Development Planning, Mr Baledzi Gaolathe, in his 2006/07 budget speech delivered in February 2006 over Radio Botswana. As stated in chapter one (see section 1.3) of this thesis, renovation of schools in Botswana has been a problem for a long time. The Minister of Finance and Development Planning noted in an address to Botswana Association of Local Authorities that in many districts school facilities were in a dilapidated state. He observed that "in some junior secondary schools there are reports of up to fifteen years backlog of maintenance of the facilities" (Botswana Daily News 2005:4). Radio Botswana reported in the 13:00 hours news bulletin of 30 March 2006 that heavy rains had on the previous day disrupted the functioning of Lehutshelo Junior Secondary School and that there were fears that some of the roofs appeared likely to collapse. It was further reported that the school head did not know when last the school was renovated since it was built in 1986. If the school head, as the custodian of the history of the school, is not aware when last the school was renovated and assuming that he has been at the school for a reasonable period of time, then it can also be assumed that since the school was built twenty years ago it has never been renovated.

Not only does renovation take such a long time before it can be done, even what ought to be an emergency situation like school toilets overflowing, it normally takes a long time to redress such a situation. This is reminiscent of a situation at Naledi Senior Secondary School where the author was the School Head from 1996 to 2000. The school toilets had started to overflow in 1995 and therefore emitting a strong and obnoxious smell and for a long time the situation could not be corrected. The

public in the neighbourhoods was forever agitated and developed a negative perception of the school. In addition, the health of both learners and staff was for such a long time at risk. Although the responsible people in the Department of Buildings and Mechanical Services in the Ministry of Works viewed the problem as complex, the general perception in the school attributed the delay to workmanship. The attitude/approach towards this situation by the department in question was therefore not appreciated by the school community which viewed such attitude as being against the welfare of the people. It was actually at cross purposes with the spirit of public administration which seeks to improve the general welfare of the people. The attitude actually contributed negatively towards the general welfare of the local community. The performance of the department actually fell short of supporting the values the school upheld, that of establishing and maintaining an environment that was conducive to positive learning experiences which learners could in future pride themselves in. School buildings and grounds that are not properly maintained can never be attractive to the learners and the public at large and therefore do not add value to public life.

The school toilets situation described above was solved when the school was being upgraded by the private contractors in 1997. It will probably be not appropriate to generalize from a particular case at Naledi Senior Secondary School but at least this demonstrates some of the weaknesses of in-house service provision in the public sector. Secondary school heads have for a long time lamented the status of maintenance of schools and often suggested outsourcing such services to the private sector in recognition of its expeditious delivery of service. This was confirmed by the Minister of Finance and Development Planning, Mr Gaolatlhe (2007:18) in his 2007/08 budget speech when he acknowledged that "for 2007/08 financial year, a provision of P45million has been made to clear the maintenance backlog of 22 schools. Overall, 71 community junior secondary schools have benefited from the maintenance backlog programme since 2003, leaving 134 schools still to be covered."

5.3.2.2 Classrooms

Facilities and instructional resources are adequately provided in Botswana secondary schools. However, maintenance of these facilities continues to be a problem as evidenced by many broken desks and chairs which are piled in schools and sometimes leading to shortages of the same facilities in classrooms (Gaolatlhe 2007:18). Cleaning of classrooms, just like toilets, is done by learners and this is part of school work they hate most and therefore put the least effort in it. As a result, classrooms just like toilets in Botswana Government secondary schools are not very clean. This state of affairs can, to some extent, compromise the quality of the learning environment and, to a large extent, the health of learners and teachers in schools. In Botswana, it is very cold in winter and very hot in summer and classrooms are not air-conditioned yet schools are open most of the time during these seasons. Inclement weather, especially in conditions referred to above, can seriously affect the quality of teaching and learning. This is often exacerbated by broken windows which take too long before they can be repaired. All this can contribute immensely to the quality of education that is rather wanting and hence the need to consider an alternative mode of delivery of secondary education, namely through PPPs.

5.3.2.3 Academic side of school

Once the school infrastructure is in place the academic issues can then be considered. First to be noted is that the curriculum is wholly centralized in Botswana and therefore remains the prerogative of the Government through the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation in the Ministry of Education (Molosiwa 1999:117). The department spells out, among other things, core subjects that every learner at a particular level and/or standard should do. It also spells out optional subjects from which learners can choose. In addition, the same department determines the content of each subject. Teachers are minimally involved in curriculum development because their involvement is limited to using the materials in classrooms and providing feedback to the department. This minimal involvement has been critisised by teachers as they often feel that their experience in dealing with the subject matter and the learners is not used meaningfully in the development of the

curriculum. Curriculum development is a continuous process of change and like many other changes, it requires the acceptance and support of key stakeholders. As a result, effective curriculum development requires a meaningful participation of, among others, teachers so that they may have ownership of the ensuing product.

Teachers are also centrally employed by the Ministry of Education through the Department of Teaching Service Management (TSM) (Botswana Government 2003:273; Abosi & Murangi 1995:136). The teaching force plays a critical role as they are agents of curriculum implementation and therefore remain central to the education system in Botswana. To be noted, in particular, is that the quality of instructional delivery is one of the most important determinants of the standard of education (Botswana Government 1994:2). It is therefore important to have teachers' commitment and motivation improved in order to enable them to discharge their critical role effectively. One way to achieve this could be to have teachers working in the environment that is modernised and therefore improved. All this can possibly be achieved through the application of PPPs in the delivery of secondary education.

Teachers have had a protracted argument with the Government of Botswana over what they perceive to be low salaries. Teachers' salaries in Botswana are actually not attractive and sometimes the reason attributed to this state of affairs is that teachers are too many and that the economy of the country cannot sustain high teachers' salaries. As for the numbers of teachers, it has been noted by the Government of Botswana that "this is a substantial resource, in terms of numbers, compared to the rest of civil service. Secondly, salaries for teachers in 1993/4 represent 45% of the Ministry of Education's recurrent budget making this resource also relatively expensive..."(Botswana Government 1994:4). Due to teachers' low salaries, among other things, the Ministry of Education has continued to receive a high proportion of ministerial recurrent budget, 30 percent in 2005, 27 percent in 2006, and 28.2 percent in 2007 as shown in section 4.5.3 above. As a result of low salaries, many teachers continue to leave the service for better pastures. This state of affairs inevitably deprives the education system of experienced and sometimes good quality teachers, some teachers engage in private businesses such as selling clothes during

school hours. All this has the propensity to compromise the quality of instructional delivery and, by association, the quality of education in the country.

Classes are usually big in secondary schools in Botswana, as big as 45 to 50 in junior secondary schools and around 40 in senior secondary schools (DSE 2005:3). In addition, classes are to a large extent of mixed ability. The numbers in classes are inhibiting in as far as individual attention of learners is concerned especially those individual learners who may seem unequal to instructional materials. However, such huge numbers are justified because the aim seems to be to admit as many learners as possible in secondary schools. But the point to be made is that the quality of teaching and learning can be improved if class sizes are kept relatively small. Not only can teachers attend to problems that individual learners may have but can also mark their written work in a manner that guides the learners in identifying and correcting their misconceptions. This is very important in as far as quality in the delivery of education is concerned. Large classes may be difficult to control in which case discipline problems may begin to unfold and thereby creating additional educational barriers. Large classes make the slow learners suffer most because the tendency in a classroom situation is to target the mode of instructional delivery to the mediocre learners. As a result, those at the extreme ends are not adequately provided for; the fast learners are not adequately challenged whilst the slow ones are overwhelmed by instruction which could be a recipe for discipline problems.

5.3.2.4 Ancillary services

There are various support services that are crucial to the proper functioning of secondary schools. Such services are nonetheless provided in-house by the schools. Some of the salient ancillary functions include the following:

(a)   Feeding of learners at school is very important because they spend a long time at school and, more importantly, many of them may not be able to have a decent meal if not supported by the school. The provision of meals at tea break and lunch to secondary school learners is the duty of the schools and is provided for in the schools budgetary allocations (Botswana Government

2003:278). It is therefore part of the school management. There is sufficient anecdotal evidence to suggest that feeding of secondary school learners is very expensive so much so that 31.7 percent of a school's recurrent budget is allocated to feeding (Botswana Government 2007:3). This state of affairs is made worse by the looting that takes place at the kitchens, in actual fact the Government of Botswana feeds both learners and some of the ancillary staff, especially those working in the school kitchens, which makes it even more costly to the Government. Supervising learners at meal times is done by teachers and they do not like it and do not have sufficient time for it. The private sector could very well handle this task; could cut down on costs; provide better supervision; and improve on efficiency to ensure profitability in food services (Scharle 2002:228).

(b)   Security service is also very important because there are many and expensive equipment in school buildings. As a result, schools are often the target of house breaking and theft especially at night and over the weekends and/or public holidays. At Naledi Senior Secondary School where the author was a school head from 1996 until 2000, there were four night watch men employed to provide security services at the school. Some of these men were alcoholic and often drunk at night whilst on duty and thus providing inadequate service (P/122/Tsum; P/116/Tau). Although electronic devices were used in some specialised rooms to enhance security, the weakness of security personnel compromised the entire security of the school property. In particular, the number of such night watchmen on duty at a time leaves much to be desired, one officer in a junior secondary school and two in a senior secondary school a night. Such numbers are inadequate given that school buildings are invariably spread over a wide area that can not be covered effectively by one or two people at night. The Government of Botswana has lost a lot of property through these arrangements and the situation causes a lot of stress to school heads.

(c)   Textbooks and stationary are also provided to students in secondary schools. Secondary schools have recently introduced tendering procedures for the purchase of textbooks and stationary and these procedures enhance transparency and accountability. However, these books are given to learners

without having to pay for them; they are also given exercise books and pens without paying for them (Gaolatlhe 2001:26). The cost of books and stationery is so high because learners see these things as being free and in abundance and therefore do not take care of them as they would have, had they been bought by their parents. The Government of Botswana adopted this policy in good faith to ensure that those who are capable of proceeding with their education should do so without being constrained by the economic situation of their families.

(d)   Reprographics is another service that warrants attention because it is so costly and subject to abuse. Photocopying is often used to rescue teachers who would otherwise not need it had they prepared themselves adequately in advance. Unnecessary photocopying is often done as a last minute arrangement, by unprepared teachers, in order to keep learners occupied with some reading which may not be quite relevant. In some cases staff uses the facilities to produce funeral programmes or to produce a dissertation for a friend or a relative and all this can not be seen to be good for the economy of the country.

(e)   Cleaning services are provided in two ways. Learners' classrooms, laboratories and ablutions are cleaned by learners whilst the rest are cleaned by school cleaners and grounds men. Cleaning by learners is supervised by teachers and both learners and teachers do not like it and should not be doing it.

(f)   Transport services are also provided in-house (Botswana Government 2003:288). What is worrisome though is that schools, by and large, do not have buses to transport learners yet they have to do so regularly. Buses are obtained from a central department, Central Transport Organisation, on loan basis and it is not always easy to get one when it is absolutely necessary to have one. What is even more shameful is that it is not uncommon to see learners being transported in open trucks and fatal accidents have not eluded school children in trucks.

5.3.2.5 Financing secondary education

A formal secondary school requires the availability of school infrastructure such as classroom facilities as well as equipment and furniture. The cost of all this is normally referred to as capital cost while the day to day cost of running an organisation such as a school would be referred to as recurrent cost (Knight 1993:22). In Botswana, these costs have been borne entirely by the Government until 2006 when some fees were introduced towards recurrent costs. A secondary school learner pays 5 percent of the cost of schooling per annum which in real terms are P300 and P450 for a junior and a senior secondary school learner respectively (Ministry of Education 2006:1-2). This suggests that the bulk of the cost of education in the country is still borne by the Government of Botswana. This seems to be in line with the observation made by Benson in Psacharopoulos (1987:423) when he argued that education consumed a significant amount of national resources in almost every country, ranging between six and ten percent of the gross national product. However, even with so much of the gross national product being spent on education it still remains inadequate in Botswana to cater for the educational needs of the youth especially at senior secondary school level. This has been acknowledged by the authorities when they contended that "there is a challenge to build senior secondary schools to match the number of community junior secondary schools, so that the goal of universal secondary level education can be achieved" (Botswana Vision 2016, 1997:17). Another indication of the difficulty in financing education at secondary school level is the pilot project of introducing double shift in Botswana secondary schools in 2006 (Department of Secondary Education 2005:3). In this arrangement, one group comes to school in the morning and the other around lunch time on a rotational basis. This demonstrates that the Government of Botswana wishes to have more secondary school places but due to budgetary constraints more schools can not be built (Gaolatlhe 2001:26). In fact, the Botswana Government (2003:278) admitted that "the responsibilities of the Ministry of Education have become very large." This is a sufficient justification that the Ministry of Education in Botswana needs to engage the private sector in some of its responsibilities.

5.3.2.6 Secondary school management in Botswana

Teachers are normally promoted because they are either good in the classroom or effective in other school activities and such promotions continue until one reaches the pinnacle of a school as a school head or principal. In other words, teachers can rise to the position of the school head and, in most cases, without appropriate management training and yet they are entrusted with multimillion Pula organisations (schools) to manage (Botswana Government 2003:289; Lemmer 2000:143). The fact that teachers are good at teaching is no guarantee that they will be good at school management. The point is not to suggest that teachers are not suitable to become school managers but rather to accentuate the fact that potential school heads need to be well grounded in management principles and practices if they are to manage their schools efficiently and effectively. School management can be complex and demanding and therefore for schools to be effective and efficient, heads of such schools and their senior staff need to be conversant with management principles but must also learn to manage better by studying the best practices in successful organisations (Everard & Morris 1990:xi). Such learning may take time but it is important particularly in an attempt to professionalise secondary school management in pursuit of improved performance and quality of secondary education. In order to achieve this, school heads need a good theoretical framework in management in order to guide their management practices. Education is expensive yet valuable to both the individual recipient and the society. It is a key to sustainable development and the enhancement of the welfare of the general populace. Consequently, education should not be left to chances and therefore those who manage it must be given the necessary training and support so that schools can optimally achieve their declared goals.

The structural-functional analysis of a secondary school in Botswana, as presented above, is a sufficient background to the analysis of the provision of secondary education through PPPs in the section that follows. In particular, the analysis that follows includes PPPs in education, secondary school infrastructure under PPPs, cost recovery, food services in secondary schools under PPPs, and management of secondary schools under PPPs.

5.4 PPPs IN PROVISION OF SECONDARY EDUCATION

It is perhaps the right point to return to the provision of secondary education through PPPs. It may sound strange to talk about PPPs in the provision of education in general yet, to a large extent, formal education that is provided by the state has invariably demanded the participation of parents in their private capacity. For example, parents have been paying school fees for their children and purchasing some of the essential school requirements like school uniform. In addition, the history of formal education points to the fact that private schools preceded public schools (Levin 2000:4). However, the private sector's participation in the provision of secondary education, as conceived in this chapter, extends the nature and scope of the involvement of the private participants beyond the previous boundaries, such as the supply of text books, stationery, food items and cleaning materials.

The need for the private sector to participate in the delivery of public education has been perceived in many countries. For example, from an American perspective, research studies and various national reports have advocated some form of partnership between schools and private organisations with a view to meeting the manifest personnel and material needs of schools (Jones & Maloy 1996:4). In addition, Akintoye *et al* (2003:12-14) have shown that PPPs are increasingly being used in the provision of education in Asia-Pacific, the United States of America (USA) and Europe, with the United Kingdom (UK) taking the lead. It will therefore be prudent for educators elsewhere in the global community to seek partners, outside the public sector, who have the capacity to respond to manifest needs of the education system. Whereas in Botswana PPPs, as defined in this thesis, are unprecedented in the delivery of secondary education, it would be prudent for the educators to take counsel from the aforementioned countries in pursuit of improved delivery of the education sub-sector in question.

The next paragraphs in this section present a general overview that leads to PPPs in education, secondary school infrastructure under PPPs, cost recovery strategy, food services in secondary schools under PPPs, and the management of secondary schools under PPPs.

5.4.1 General overview

Gaborone is the capital city of Botswana, a place where there is a high concentration of economic activities and a place where the private sector is also concentrated. The population of the area in question is the largest in the country and, by implication; the demand for secondary education is the highest in the area (Botswana Government 2003:17). The population is highly multicultural with foreigners and wealthy people preferring private English medium schools possibly for their quality of education (Weil 2002:59). However, the demand for secondary education exceeds its supply in terms of the number of places available in secondary schools in the area just like in many other areas in the country (DSE 2005:2).

It has been demonstrated in the previous chapter that education is so valuable, both to the individual and the society, that every child should receive access to it. As indicated in section 4.5 in the previous chapter, basic education in Botswana extends only up to junior secondary education. However, as societies advance in socio-economic terms, basic education needs to be redefined and expanded to cover the entire secondary education. It should nevertheless be acknowledged that maintaining the education system is rather expensive, so much so that it has proved difficult for the Government of Botswana to cope with the various demands in the provision of secondary education (Botswana Government 2003:279; Gaolatlhe 2005:2).

Provision of secondary education through the PPPs mode is deemed the possible solution to most of the problems referred to above. Chapter three has revealed that although the public sector in general does not seem to have adequate resources to provide or sufficiently address public needs, the private sector is replete with resources that can complement those available in the public sector (Hurst & Reeves 2004:380). The pooling of available resources in a cooperative manner in the form of PPPs can achieve synergy, bolster public service delivery and enhance the general welfare of the populace (Maserumule & Mathole 2006:226; Jamali 2004:416). In this context, PPPs in the provision of secondary education can enhance both access and the quality of secondary education which is crucial in view of the fact that by having

poor quality or limited access to secondary education, one is actually reinforcing social injustice, marginalization and pauperization (Oduaran & Bhola 2006:371).

It should therefore be instructive to show how PPPs in the provision of secondary education can enhance the two crucial aspects, namely access and quality. The next sections will, amongst others, focus on these issues.

5.4.2 PPPs in education

It should be noted at the outset that PPPs in the provision of secondary education, although it is increasingly being used in the provision of education in Asia-Pacific, the USA and Europe as indicated earlier, it is rare in many countries (Franklin, Block & Popkewitz 2003:171) and currently (2007) non-existent in Botswana at least in the manner PPPs are conceived in this thesis. In Botswana, education is, by and large, funded and managed by the Government of Botswana and in a manner that projects it as one of its core functions. In other words, the way education is provided through Government bureaucratic regulations has created a monopoly on schools and this has the propensity to hinder innovation and change (Weils 2002:45). However, Quiggen in Grimsey (2002:247) is of the view that there are no core functions of the public sector which can not be performed by the private sector and that core functions are often delivered in a manner that does not preclude the participation of the private sector. The private sector's involvement in Botswana secondary education has been limited to the supply of resources whenever needed by schools, for example, the supply of books and food items whenever these resources are depleted. This limited involvement falls outside the framework of PPPs as defined for the purposes of this thesis in section 3.3.1 above. Although relatively few learners in the Gaborone City area are enrolled in private secondary schools, both private and the Government of Botswana secondary schools are competing for many of the same learners yet they don't seem to realize that it can be to their mutual advantage to work collaboratively.

The structural-functional analysis (see section 5.3.2 above) of a typical Botswana Government maintained secondary school has abundantly shown that both access and quality of schooling need to be improved if Botswana is to be closer to being an

educated nation by 2016 (Botswana Government 1997:16). The economic success of the country will in future depend to a large extent on the existence of a well educated citizenry who can function and cope with the intricacies of a globalised and technologically driven economy. The advent of PPPs in the provision of secondary education is an educational reform initiative that is meant to address the twin imperatives of increased access and quality of secondary schooling. In addition, it is meant to embrace market policies of competition and choice in the distribution of educational services.

Competition has the capacity to enhance the quality of service delivery (Hurst & Reeves 2004:382). In particular, the extensive involvement of the private sector in the delivery of secondary education is consistent with the belief that PPPs can help deliver high quality education services and secure better value for money (Lissauer 2000:144). The private sector operates in a private market environment which is invariably characterised by competition which, by its very nature, forces the production of goods and services of high quality. In this context, Weil (2002:45) is of the view that "... educational excellence, efficiency, student achievement, and quality will emerge as a result of educational marketplace, not public schools." Competition in educational marketplaces could ensure that education service providers are more innovative, responsive and efficient (Kayes & Maranto 2006:130). In view of the foregoing, the use of PPPs in the delivery of secondary education services in the Gaborone City area is predicated on the conviction that educational standards can be raised by, among other things, a modernised school environment which seems possible through the participation of the private sector (Lissauer 2000:144). Essentially, the delivery of secondary education services through PPPs has the potential to offer value for money through harnessing the private sector innovation, and commercial and management expertise by involving the private sector more centrally in the provision of education related assets and services (Ireland 2004:2; Grimsey & Lewis 2002:249). All this can create an opportunity for the secondary school environment to be modernised and stimulating especially to the learners.

In chapter three (see section 3.3.5.6) a model of PPP that is preferred in the delivery of secondary education, namely Design, Build, Operate, and Finance (DBOF) has

been identified. According to this model the developed facilities, which in this context could be the school buildings, are handed over to the government or the appropriate public sector organisation at the end of the PPP contract. What is critical though about this model is that the facility management is left to the private sector and this management entails, among others, the maintenance of the facility. Essentially, the private partner shoulders the burden of risk over the term of the PPP contract and should ideally hand over to the government a well maintained facility at the end of the contract (Kerr 2003:11). Maintenance of school buildings in Botswana has been very inadequate for a long time (see section 5.3.2.1). It is therefore anticipated that secondary schools that have been built through this model of PPP, as well as those renovated and managed under the same model, will be properly maintained to the delight of both the learners and teachers which could immensely improve the quality of schooling and, by association, the quality of secondary education which is the central theme of this thesis.

Facility management is very important in DBOF projects because it enables the private sector to be innovative when designing and building facilities such as schools. This is so particularly because each stage of the project is treated in the context of the whole life cycle of the PPP project (Smith 2000:267). In this context, the private sector could be motivated to design and build strong structures using durable materials in order to reduce maintenance costs in future, when such costs remain the burden of the private sector. Whereas durable materials are likely to be expensive, the private partner is likely to be concerned with the balance between the cost of materials and that of maintenance. It might be noteworthy that for facility management to serve its intended or actual purpose, it needs to be well defined and incorporated into the output specifications by the public partner (Akintoye *et al* 2003:191; Jamali 2004:419). Facility management in the context of providing secondary education in, for example, the Gaborone City area should not be seen to mean running a school as such but should rather be understood in terms of managing the buildings, ensuring that they are available for classes. It should also include making sure that school buildings are clean, well maintained and secure. This inevitably raises the question of how then should schools under PPPs be run (see section 5.4.6 below).

Formal secondary education should be delivered in the context of a clearly established school infrastructure and therefore it might be instructive to delve into the issue of how such infrastructure can be developed and maintained under PPPs.

5.4.3 Secondary school infrastructure under PPPs

It has been noted above (see section 5.3.2.1) that the Government of Botswana can not build enough secondary schools in the country because of budgetary constraints. However, the private sector can be allowed, within the appropriate organisational framework, to build secondary schools using its resources and maintain the buildings for the entire contract period which will normally go up to between two and four decades (Akintoye *et al* 2003:15). With the expertise the private sector has and the contractual obligations of PPP arrangements, such buildings are most likely to be well built with a view to cutting down on maintenance costs in future. The advantages of PPPs in the provision of secondary education infrastructure are many and varied and some of them could be as follows (Nzimakwe 2006:55; Akintoye *et al* 2003:15; Kerr 2003:11):

(a)   More schools would be made available and therefore more learners can find places in these schools resulting in more people acquiring education even up to senior secondary level.

(b)   Many of the unemployed teachers in Gaborone and elsewhere in the country can get employment. Other employment opportunities for ancillary staff would also be made available. In a way, some idle resources would then be put to good use and enhance national economic performance.

(c)   The more the schools built through PPPs the more economic activities will be stimulated and therefore injected in the economy.

(d)   The quality of school buildings and the school environment could be made to look good, attractive and stimulating to learners and parents as well as the general public.

(e)   If the Government of Botswana had intended to build a school and had money for that, such money could be used to address other pressing social needs.

Every PPP project will need to be carefully assessed to ensure that it delivers the expected benefits (Kroukamp 2004:39). In particular, a well arranged PPP in the delivery of secondary education can improve the educational environment and accord the learners better education related experiences. It is assumed that PPPs can produce schools that are equipped with the latest facilities that are also appropriate for the educative purpose. For example, in Scotland PPPs are used in the delivery of education and one head teacher, Tom McDonald, was elated by the arrangement and said "what I have is second to none in facilities and ICT technology. I am delighted. It is a massive boost to the morale of children, of teachers, and it can only significantly improve attainment" (Kerr 2003:11). All this, together with the possibility of building more of such schools, constitutes the kernel of the argument for the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area through PPP model referred to above, namely DBOF. So the possibility of improving the quality of the delivery of secondary education in the area in question through PPPs is not farfetched, it is a possibility that can be turned into a reality.

The PPP model referred to above can also be applied in the renovation of existing secondary schools in the area in question and then letting the private sector assume their facility management. The advantage of this approach is that every secondary school in the Gaborone City area will end up being properly maintained and thus reducing the gap, if any, between the new secondary schools under PPPs and the existing ones in as far as appearance is concerned (Kerr 2003:12; Smith 2000:126). Once this is done, every secondary school learner will be attending a properly maintained school with the possibility of improving the quality of their schooling and the general ethos of the schools. The literature on the provision of secondary education through PPPs is still rare in Botswana. As a result, there is no research evidence that links the provision of secondary education through PPPs and learners'

educational attainment. It is nonetheless assumed that the positive general ethos of a school can contribute immensely to the educational attainment of students. A positive school environment can, *ceteris paribus*, spur both learners and teachers to greater efforts. Such greater efforts are a *sine qua non* for improved educational attainment (Tabulawa 2007:14).

What needs to be made clear is that PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area is actually considered to involve buying asset related services for schools from the private sector over a long period of time (Smith 2000:128; Fitzgerald & Melvin 2002:121). The aforementioned model can also include the provision of equipment relating to specific services in secondary schools such as computers or even buses to transport learners.

It should nevertheless be expected that there are some costs associated with the positive assumptions made above. But this should be expected because development rarely, if anything, comes without costs. Consequently, the private sector will have to recoup the funds expended on the construction of a school and even make a reasonable profit otherwise it may lack the incentive to participate in such partnerships (Hurst & Reeves 2004:382).

5.4.4 Cost recovery strategy

The partnership must enable the private partner to benefit from the school system in which it is involved lest the partnership collapses. As a result, the public partner must endeavour to have a strategy or processes in place to enable the private sector to recoup its costs and even to make some profit. The government could agree to pay a moderate fee (market related) on an annual basis to the private partner. In addition, the private partner could be allowed, through a proper agreement, to generate some income through the use of school facilities. But the net effect of this arrangement should be a reliable stream of revenue which is profitable to the private partner (Pongsiri 2002:489).

It has been noted earlier (see section 5.3.1.3) that in a year school buildings are not used a lot of the time (Akintoye *et al* 2003:13). An arrangement can therefore be made to enable the private partner to use the school facilities, when there are no classes, to raise some income, say renting them to the third party. There may be fears that facilities will not be ready or in order for the next school session. But if the facility management is in the hands of the private partner, the use of the facilities by the third party should not be a real problem as it will have to be part of the duties of the private partner to always have the facilities ready for the next session of the school. The success in generating income by the private partner may depend very much on the extent to which transparency and accountability mechanisms are put in place and adhered to.

The functioning of schools produces both private and public benefits in that education benefits the individual recipient as well as the society at large. There is therefore a strong justification for schools to be funded by government (Franklin *et al* 2004:178). However, in countries like Botswana which are not blessed with the wherewithal it is not possible to afford free education. As a result, some fees must be charged to the learners provided such fees are not inhibitive and that those who are unable to pay are catered for by the government so that there is no child who fails to attend school on account of lack of fees.

The funding part of government could be in the form of vouchers which are valid to any recognised school and redeemable at any of the public revenue offices. The virtue of educational vouchers is that they provide a certificate that parents can use to pay school fees for their children at any school that meets the established requirements (Levin 2000:4). In this way learners and their parents will be free to choose schools of their preferences and schools which are perceived to be good will attract more learners and collect more revenue. Freedom to choose schools by learners implies some form of competition between schools, competition for customers who in this context are learners. Competition can play a critical role in advancing the quality of schooling and,

by association, the quality of education. Every school will therefore be compelled to do the right things even better in order to attract learners and their parents. A school that fails in this regard will do so at its peril because it may become unpopular and could end up with fewer learners and therefore less income which every sound organisation should avoid. One of the reasons attributed to lack efficiency and effectiveness in the public sector is that the environment is often devoid of competition. So through PPPs every school that is run on the basis of this arrangement will have to strategically position itself and find a niche in the education market (Weil 2002:46; Levin 2000:15). Consequently, creativity and innovation will have to be some of the imperatives in the provision of secondary education in the area referred to above. Each school will have to continuously seek ways and means of improving various facets of its operations in an attempt to make inroads into the secondary education market in the area in question.

5.4.5 Food services in secondary schools under PPPs

In Botswana, secondary schools that are run by the Government are required to provide food services to the learners, a task that is handled by the school management. However, under PPPs, this task can very well be handled by the private sector (Smith 2000:129; John *et al* 2001:354). If meals are provided by qualified caterers, they are most likely to be of better quality and professionally prepared especially when the catering services are well defined and encapsulated in the contract agreement. In addition, the appropriate supervision by the owners of the private partner could cut down on the extra costs due to, among others, the looting of food items (see section 5.3.2.4 above). Providing learners with well prepared food adds value to the quality of schooling and could improve the health conditions of learners especially those who come from disadvantaged homes. Healthy learners are in a better position to optimally benefit from instructional delivery which could lead to better educational attainment.

In addition to regular meals, fast foods could be provided in the school cafeteria and some vending machines to provide soft drinks for both staff and learners to buy. In this context, a secondary school could be a reliable market for those who will be having the contract to sell the agreed food items. As a territory of impressionable consumers, a school represents one of the most strategically focused, captive and lucrative markets in society (Boyles 2005:1). However, a caveat should be in order at this point, namely that commercialism within the frontiers of secondary schools under PPPs should not be allowed to take precedence over the established core functions of schools. In other words, commercialism should be allowed to the extent that it supports the educative process and the established values of secondary schools.

Commercial activities in schools should by no means be in conflict with the established purposes of the schools. The school authorities should make it a point that they safeguard the interests of the learners and their parents by ensuring that those who do business on the school premises do not exploit learners. In this regard, issues related to prices should be regulated by a body comprising parents, teachers and other relevant stakeholders. It may also be desirable to have in place a mechanism that ensures that part of the profit that is realized in doing business in schools is ploughed back into the schools to improve the school environment (Lissauer 2000:145). Improving the school environment could also improve the quality of schooling and the education delivered by the schools. Besides, business ventures at schools will have to be limited so that the school environment remains, by and large, educational. Schools should not be allowed to be replete with billboards for advertisements but a reasonable amount of advertising should be allowed in schools (Boyles 2005:4). These could also be used as teaching aids in business related subjects. In addition, guiding learners to respond wisely to such advertisements could be educative and serve as a way of introducing children to the real life situations as advertisements are part of the modern life.

The successful implementation of PPPs in the delivery of secondary education requires, among other things, visionary leadership and the commitment of

other relevant stakeholders and the support of the general populace (Jamali 2004:419; Armistead & Pettigrew 2004:575). It is therefore necessary to consider the management of secondary schools under PPP arrangement.

5.4.6 Management of secondary schools under PPPs

There are at least two possible ways in which secondary schools under a PPP arrangement can be managed. One way is to leave the management of such schools to the Government of Botswana which is the current practice. The other way would be to let the private sector manage the schools (Wilson 1988:104; Smith 2000:127). It might be instructive to shed more light on these two possibilities and this is done below. The analysis will also include assessment of secondary schools under PPPs, secondary school curriculum under PPPs.

5.4.6.1 Secondary school management by the private sector

It has been suggested earlier (see section 5.4.3) that maintenance and the general management of infrastructure and major facilities should, under PPP arrangement, be left to the private sector. The argument, in this particular context, is that management of the entire school could be left to the private sector. This is also predicated on the understanding that, due to the profit motive, the private sector often tries to perform at its best in its management practice. In particular, the private sector management principles and practices could be brought to bear upon the delivery of secondary education and improve it. The assumption that schools run by the private sector could deliver better education derives from anecdotal evidence in Botswana where private secondary schools produce better academic results (Mmegi 2006:35; Levin 2000:18). In addition, Scheerens (1992:3) has observed that "from various Americans and Dutch studies it emerges that independent schools have higher levels of achievement on average." Referring to their study in the American context, Chubb and Moe in Weil (2002:59) have concluded that in comparison to the private schools, "... the academic quality of the public schools was unacceptably low."

From the UK's perspective, Lissauer (2000:145) is of the view that "Government policy encouraging private sector involvement in state schools demonstrates its conviction that independently managed schools will provide better outcomes than other maintained schools, given similar resources." Lissauer (ibid) further suggests that private sector management of schools can turn around underperforming schools. This may well suggests the superiority of private sector management skills to the public sector. On his part, Wilson (1988:104) observed that "successful school management depends on appointing a highly trained manager with the right background and approach for the community in which his (*or her*) school happens to be located." He (ibid) further asserted that whereas the head teachers might be able to create an appropriate school climate, most of them lack the requisite professional management skills. This is consistent with the views expressed by the Botswana Government (2003:289) that "one of the objectives for teacher education for NDP 9 is to upgrade management skills of heads of schools to ensure the effective management of the education system and maintenance of quality." This is a clear indication that the Government of Botswana has realised that school heads in the country are not sufficiently equipped with the necessary management skills.

If secondary schools were to be managed by the private sector, they are most likely to experience more innovative ideas especially when they are guided by declared output specifications to which they must conform (Smith 2000:126; Kroukamp 2004:28). Secondary schools in Botswana are generally wasteful (see section 5.3.2.4 above) and such wastage contributes to the huge cost of running the education system. On the other hand, the private sector is, by and large, sensitive to costs and if management of secondary schools in the area in question were to transfer to the private sector one would expect extensive cost cutting measures put in place (Weil 2002:8). The idea of public secondary schools being managed by the private sector is predicated on the assumption that someone who is well rounded in management principles and practices can successfully manage a variety of organisations including secondary schools (John, Water, Hack & Candoli 2001:64). Although such a person in this management position will be expected to have an appreciation of what the job of a teacher actually entails in order to give appropriate support, he or she does not need to have taught before (Wilson 1988:104). In this arrangement, the deputy

school heads could be qualified teachers who can provide instructional leadership whilst the headship is taken by a management guru.

What seems critical in managing secondary schools is actually managing human relations and providing teachers with the necessary support and/or resources all of which could be supported by a strategic plan (Everard & Morris 1990:4). Teachers are, to some extent, experts in their subject areas even though they occasionally require some guidance and in-service training to sharpen, among others, their pedagogic skills. As a result, good school management requires people who are dedicated to creating and maintaining the organisational ethos that encourages dedication to continuous quality improvement with a particular emphasis on academic achievement. From the parents' point of view, good school management is also a measure of the extent to which learners are protected and feel safe whilst at school. A person who is well grounded in management principles and practices can bring about a combination of the essential elements of good school management referred to above without being a qualified or certificated teacher and, possibly earn the respect of teachers, parents and learners (Lissauer 2000:145; Wilson 1988:104).

It is very critical to have these qualities in the management of public organisations such as schools if the quality of education delivered in secondary schools is to improve. It is generally accepted that schools are conservative yet they are inordinately expensive to run and therefore it makes sense to engage a school management style that is akin to that of the private sector in being creative and dynamic, possessing capital, managerial efficiency, professional knowledge and entrepreneurial spirit (Scharle 2002:228; Ireland 2004:2). Without compromising access and quality, the management of secondary schools should be guided by commercial principles and subjected to market forces.

The advantage of school management by the private sector is that management practices and principles that seem to make the private sector successful will now be availed to bear upon the delivery of secondary education services. Schools could have boards of trustees to keep an eye on major policy issues and practices. The government, as the custodian of the public interest, will have to be represented at

this level of school governance with a view to ensuring that at least minimum standards, as defined in the PPP agreement, are met (Franklin *et al* 2004:31). Other members of the board could be individuals from the corporate world especially corporate leaders who have extensive leadership experience that has been developed over time in challenging, competitive and ever changing environments. Through this arrangement, secondary schools and particularly their senior staff can benefit from the ideas and experience of such corporate leaders. Some corporate leaders are often well disposed towards leadership positions in the community with a view to fulfilling personal and career goals (Jasso 1996:72). Their talents, ideas, and experience can therefore be brought to bear upon the dynamics of secondary school management and therefore improve the quality of delivery of secondary education. In addition, the involvement of experienced corporate leaders in the provision of secondary education can make a contribution towards the professionalisation of secondary school management. This is important because the leadership of an organisation is responsible for ensuring that those whose duty is to deliver services they do so efficiently and effectively, are inspired to be loyal and empowered to make a meaningful contribution to the achievement of objectives (Ströh 2001:25).

The private sector tends to be more technologically driven than the public sector (Smith 2000:128). It is therefore possible that management of secondary schools by the private sector will be characterised by the proliferation of information and communication technologies (ICTs) in these schools. Indeed ICTs can make a meaningful contribution to the transformation of secondary education delivery in the Gaborone City area. Anecdotal evidence abounds to suggest that instructional delivery in Botswana secondary schools is invariably chalk and board and therefore not supported by ICTs (Botswana Government 2003: 284). Notwithstanding all this, the use of ICTs can improve the quality of delivery of instruction in secondary schools. To this end, Sayal (www.literacyonline.org/products2006) has observed that "recently developed intelligent computer-assisted instruction programmes are able to generate and solve problems, diagnose students' misconceptions, select appropriate teaching strategies and carry on dialogues with students based on in-depth studies by researchers on how people think, learn and solve problems." For his part, Eadie (2000:6) is of the view that ICT can play a powerful role in empowering learners to

engage in meaningful, challenging and enlightening tasks which can also lead to the acquisition of skills that will enable the learners to face the future with confidence. ICTs can also be used to enhance the quality of secondary school management. There are computer software programmes that are used in time tabling and school management with a view to improving the use of staff time, learner time and space (Sedisa 2003:46). The use of ICTs in this manner can significantly reduce costs whilst improving the delivery of educational services in secondary schools.

5.4.6.2 Assessment of secondary schools under PPPs

Assessment in education can be used for a variety of purposes (Wellington 2006:13). However, in this context, assessment is used as a monitoring mechanism in order to establish the extent to which predetermined output specifications are being achieved (Nata 2001:59). From the public sector's standpoint, this exercise is also necessary because payment of the private partner has to be linked to the quality of service that is being delivered.

Once a decision has been made to deliver a public service through PPPs, it becomes necessary to have a monitoring mechanism in place to ensure that the service is delivered in conformity with the established output specifications (Kroukamp 2004:39; Hurst & Reeves 2004:380). It should be expected, however, that the nature and scope of the monitoring mechanism will depend on the service to be delivered. In the context of secondary education being delivered through PPPs, proper monitoring of secondary schools is necessary to ensure that such schools operate and deliver educational outcomes that are commensurate with predetermined output specifications. Essentially, for PPPs to be successful in delivering secondary education there need to be some form of quality assurance framework to monitor and guide the operations of the secondary schools (Smith 2000:129; Jamali 2004:421). For the monitoring mechanism to be effective, the specified performance outputs need to be measurable in terms of both quality and quantity. However, it needs to be acknowledged that educational outcomes are not easily quantified and the quality of education is also difficult to assess (Peterson & Campbell 2001:35). It is nonetheless desirable that the delivery of education be guided by well articulated performance

indicators to measure the progress an organisation has made in pursuit of declared objectives (Hughes 1998:181). This could motivate the secondary schools in question to continuously pay attention and focus on their key deliverables in pursuit of their declared objectives. It is of critical importance that if secondary school management, or part thereof, is in the hands of the private sector the public sector, as a custodian of the public interest, should have a good knowledge of such schools' performance indicators in order to monitor their performance more objectively (Murphy 2002:62).

If educational services (or part thereof) are to be delivered through PPPs, it then becomes necessary for some performance assessment to be undertaken through PPPs as well. The reason for this is that none of the partners should feel unduly victimised in the event of adverse performance report. In addition, assessment through PPPs could facilitate cross fertilization of experiences and knowledge which can ultimately improve the overall performance of the partnerships. The PPPs dispensation in the provision of secondary education represents an essential transformation in the school culture and therefore the aim of assessment should be to ensure, among others, that the transformation takes effect. In PPPs, the private partner is often a consortium of companies with a diversity of expertise (Prokopenko 1995:22; Grimsey & Lewis 2004:96). Such diversity in the assessment process could add value to the provision of the service in question by being able to assess its provision from different professional standpoints. Such an assessment is likely to be comprehensive, all encompassing, and therefore likely to enhance the overall quality of the service delivery.

It is necessary for the private partner to have a self-assessment arrangement that is modeled on a quality assurance framework (French & Bell 1999:230). In addition, the Department of Secondary Education in the Gaborone City area would have the authority to assess such a framework and occasionally make spot checks to convince itself about the performance of the private partner. For example, the Home Economics personnel could occasionally make strategic spot checks on the cafeteria and even taste the food that is served to the learners. It would also be important for the service users, namely the learners to have a mechanism through which they could provide their views on the quality of service delivered so that such views could

make part of the overall assessment (Kroukamp 2004:39). Parents and learners should therefore have a channel through which they can communicate their views on the operations of the schools to the higher authorities. This is very important because learners and, by association, parents know a lot about what is going on in schools and therefore valuable information can be obtained from them. However, feedback from learners and parents will need to be treated with great care to avoid creating unnecessary conflict between staff and learners.

Moreover, the monitoring of secondary schools could be done at least in two additional ways, namely through the inspectorate and external examinations. The inspectorate could play a significant role in determining the extent to which individual schools conform to the established standards and, where necessary, provide an objective judgment of school improvement (Franklin *et al* 2004:31). In addition, the inspectorate could determine the extent to which resources are available and/or used appropriately. Of critical importance is therefore, for the inspectorate to establish the extent to which the delivery of instruction is commensurate with prescribed syllabus coverage so that corrective measures can be instituted where there are significant shortcomings. Alternatively, the inspectorate could offer guidance on how continuous improvement in the operations of schools can unfold, continuous improvement is the kernel of quality.

For the inspectorate to be effective in its role, it needs to be made up of individuals who are well versed in education and management practices so that they can not only critique schools but also guide them. It may be an advantage to have some inspectors appointed by the public sector and others by the private sector (Dean 1992:168).

Examinations that objectively test the acquisition and/or mastery of essential skills can also be used to establish the extent to which schools achieve the predetermined output specifications. Examination results can also be used to make a variety of decisions including impressions about the quality of education being delivered and identification of areas in teaching where improvements are most needed. Essentially,

examination results can constitute valuable feedback and therefore guide school development planning and/or the future direction of schools.

5.4.6.3 Secondary school curriculum under PPPs

Since many learners in developing countries like Botswana do not proceed beyond secondary education, secondary schools should, amongst other things, prepare the learners for the world of work (Lemmer 2000:74). In this regard, PPPs can play a significant role in the development and implementation of appropriate secondary school curriculum. Employers in industries often complain that school leavers lack the necessary skills for employment (Halsall & Cockett 1996:11). PPPs can provide the opportunity for the needs of the industry to be expressed in the secondary school curriculum. The private sector, being engaged in the delivery of secondary education can be more accessible and even more willing to participate in curriculum reforms creating an opportunity for an input from the world of work. In this regard, PPPs could facilitate the improvement of school-to-work transition by creating pathways that integrate education with workplace requirements (Harrison & Kessels 2004:13).

Through PPPs in secondary education, the private sector can be involved in an effort that is geared towards engaging industry in the development of learners' work readiness and enhancing their experience of both industry and commerce (Lissauer 2000:144). The private sector can also make an important contribution in the form of work experience placements for learners. Such a relationship between the secondary schools and the industry can be a powerful mechanism for facilitating the learners' acquisition of the necessary skills for the world of work.

The secondary school curriculum under PPPs should prescribe the minimum standard of education to be expected of every learner and this could constitute the common core learning and should comprise those things that are critical to the achievement of the central purposes of education (Boyles 2005:6; Barrow1981:111). These minimum standards could then be used to form the basis on which the performance of the schools can be compared. In general, however, the secondary school curriculum should be flexible enough to give room for creativity and innovation. According to

Hurst and Reeves (2004:383) and Grimsey (2002:251), creativity and innovation in public service delivery are some of the hallmarks of the PPP initiatives. In this context, the PPPs arrangement should be allowed to decide upon the nature and scope of their curricula over and above the core deliverables. This could also enhance competition between schools since beyond the core deliverables, each school could attempt to offer something that could be attractive to the clientele, something of some value to the learners as perceived by both the parents and learners themselves. In this regard, PPPs in the provision of secondary education can enable individual secondary schools to differentiate themselves from each other in responding to the demands of the education marketplace (Dempster, Freakley & Parry 2001:1).The mode of delivery of instruction could be left entirely to individual schools but all expected to achieve the specified outcomes (Murphy 2002:61). This could encourage innovation and creativity in instructional delivery.

In the process of participation in curriculum reforms, the private sector may better understand the requirements for effective and/or optimal implementation of the school curriculum which could inform their day-to-day decision-making. The private partner may be able to use its expertise to assist the public partner in determining the best possible ways of dealing with such curricula issues. In addition, the understanding of curriculum requirements could also inform the private sector in their future design, construction and/or renovation of secondary schools as the authorities will be innovative and be better able to relate all these processes to the actual curriculum implementation requirements. In this regard, the education infrastructure can be better suited for the requisite educational activities.

In Gaborone and its environs, there is the University of Botswana (the only university in the country in 2007) and two colleges of education, one in Molepolole and the other in Tlokweng. So secondary schools in the Gaborone City area could take advantage of their proximity to these tertiary institutions. The schools could work in some form of partnership with the relevant faculties in these institutions to the extent that senior academic staff members guide school development and the delivery of school programmes. The tertiary institutions could for example, run some courses for secondary school senior staff members on ways that schools could use to assess

quality and relevance of secondary education and improvement thereof. The tertiary institutions could also conduct some research on the needs for skills of secondary education completers in the labour market and/or tertiary institutions (www.literacyonline.org/products2006). The continued guidance of secondary schools by professors of, say education, can contribute towards the improvement of the quality of the delivery of secondary education. In turn, secondary schools could assist the tertiary institutions in their research endeavours and also place their students on teaching practice or any other practicum.

It should be noted, however, that the University of Botswana and the colleges of education are part of the public sector and therefore their partnership with other public sector organisations, namely secondary schools is outside the remit of PPPs as conceived in this thesis. However, these organisations have been included here to complement the PPP arrangement by taking care of the professional development of teachers in order to facilitate a holistic improvement of the provision of secondary education in the area in question.

5.4.6.4 Secondary school management by the public sector

The management of secondary schools under PPP arrangement can, alternatively, be left to the Ministry of Education through their usual school heads. In this way, the school will be run by people who are professionally qualified as teachers but have been promoted to exalted positions in the teaching profession. These are people who are conversant with the intricacies of running schools (Hlebowitsh 2005:7; Glatthorn, Boschee & Whitehead 2006:258). However, the view that the private sector has the best management practice is by no means questioned but that, in this particular context, the best management practice would be used as a benchmark in further developing the public sector school heads. In developing secondary school heads, a deliberate effort will have to be made in assisting them to acquire a variety of skills that are known to be highly regarded by some of the most successful private sector organisations.

The involvement of the private sector in secondary schools through the PPP arrangement inevitably reduces the workload of the school heads and their senior staff who constitute school management since the private sector will be providing infrastructure-related services (Grimsey 2002:247). As a result, the school management should have more time to focus on the core functions of their schools. In particular, they could focus on developing a school culture that is task oriented, supportive of initiatives and creativity within the framework of the broad essential functions of a school. Secondary schools should develop a strong academic and social culture whose core values can be imposed on students whilst at the same time enforcing work and behavioural demands (Wilson & Corcoran 1988:21).

It is possible that the public will not trust an arrangement whereby the entire management of the secondary schools is left to the private sector because generally the public suspects that the private sector organisations are all out to rip them off in pursuit of profit (Lissauer 2000:145). In some cases, PPPs are viewed as an attempt to maximise the private sector organisations' returns on their investment than enhancing the quality of life of the populace (Maserumule & Mathole 2006:227). If schools are run under the auspices of PPP, it may be essential for school management to be undertaken by the public sector to, among others, provide the necessary checks and balances to ensure accountability and transparency that are expected in the provision of public service through public resources (Kroukamp 2004:39; Jamali 2004:419).

It is feasible that whereas the facility management could remain with the private sector as suggested earlier (see section 5.4.3), the management of the core business of the secondary schools under PPP arrangement could be left to the school heads under the employ of the Ministry of Education. This arrangement could induce public support and confidence in the participation of the private sector in the provision of secondary education. Such school heads, as instructional leaders, have a broad understanding of the educative process and therefore should be better placed to guide teachers in the delivery of the curriculum. School heads, with their extensive experience in secondary schools, have a better conceptual framework not only for planning curriculum delivery but also staff development services (Herman & Herman

1994:65). Staff development should be viewed as an integral part of any effort that is geared towards the improvement of the quality of service they deliver.

5.5 CONCLUSION

A secondary school is a social structure that has been created for the purpose of delivery of instruction. However, a closer look at what a secondary school actually does reveals a number of broad functions that a secondary school performs, namely transmission of knowledge and skills; transmission of norms, ideals and attitudes; transmission of aesthetic and behavioural norms; and physical education and care. As a result, a secondary school has a specific structure that is designed to address the functions referred to above, which structure imbues it with its own peculiar identity.

It has been noted, that due to budgetary constraints, many developing countries like Botswana do not afford to build enough schools and provide secondary education of high quality due to, among others, limited resources. In view of the functions and the structure of a secondary school presented in this chapter, it has been argued that the quality of delivery of secondary education can be improved by means of applying PPPs in its delivery. In particular, PPPs can be used in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area because the population is higher and so is the demand for secondary education. Through PPPs, more schools can be built and access to secondary education can be increased substantially. DBOF which has been identified as the most appropriate PPP model for the delivery of secondary education in the area in question can be extended to the renovation/upgrading of the existing secondary schools in the same area or elsewhere in the country.

Facility management is an important element of the model and it ensures that at the end of the contract period the private partner hands a well maintained facility to the public sector partner. The Government of Botswana could issue educational vouchers to learners/parents which can be used in paying school fees or part thereof at any of the recognized secondary schools. The use of educational vouchers could enhance competition between schools with the possibility of improving the quality of secondary education delivery. Ancillary services such as food services, transport,

security and cleaning can be handled by the private sector whilst the core function of teaching is managed by the public sector partner. Whereas the possibility of management of the academic side of schools by the private sector has been acknowledged, management by the public sector of this aspect of secondary schools under PPPs seems to be more preferable for the Gaborone City area.

The case for the provision of secondary education through PPPs has been made. It is now appropriate to consider empirical research related issues with a view to undertaking some study on views that the secondary school administrators in the area in question may have on delivering secondary education through PPPs. As a result, the next chapter focuses on empirical research issues and processes. In addition, the chapter identifies the empirical research method(s) preferred for the study.

CHAPTER 6

RESEARCH METHODS

6.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter focuses on research concepts and methods that are pertinent to an empirical study on the theme of the thesis, namely the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana. The aim is to conduct an empirical study in order to collect and analyse data on the views of secondary school heads, in the area referred to above, on the extent to which PPPs can be used to improve the quality of the delivery of secondary education. As a result, the chapter presents various research methodological issues in order to identify a research method that is most appropriate for the study. In order to do this, the following research methods are analysed in the chapter: ethnography, grounded theory, action research and survey research. Data collecting instruments are also analysed in this chapter and these are: interviews, observation, and the use of questionnaires. In addition, a distinction is made, albeit briefly, between qualitative and quantitative research paradigms. The chapter also presents an outline of the actual empirical research process. In essence, the chapter aims at concluding the process of providing answers to the research questions presented in chapter 1 of this thesis (see section 1.4) by, among others, identifying the appropriate research method and developing the appropriate research instrument to collect the necessary data.

6.2 OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH IN SOCIAL SCIENCES

Research in general can be viewed as a systematic process of collecting, analysing, and interpreting data in order to enhance the understanding of the phenomenon that is being studied (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:2). Mouly in Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000:45) has viewed research as "the process of arriving at dependable solutions to problems through the planned and systematic

collection, analysis, and interpretation of data. It is a most important tool for advancing knowledge, for promoting progress, and for enabling man to relate more effectively to his environment, to accomplish his purposes, and to resolve his conflicts." All this explains what research is as well as its purposes. Consequently, in the management of public affairs, it is essential that once societal problems have been identified, they are dealt with in a meaningful way in order to improve the welfare of the society. But for this to happen such problems need to be investigated systematically in order to understand them well and only then can optimal solutions be feasible. The public sector is where, among others, social and economic values are located (Lawton 1998:10). Consequently, research in social sciences should yield products that have socio-economic benefits or potential thereof to the relevant communities. Alternatively, research in the social sciences, particularly in public administration, should be linked to national priorities such as socio-economic deliverables. In the context of this study, the empirical research should culminate in the enhanced understanding of the shortcomings of the provision of secondary education in the area in question. The study should further culminate in proposals as to how PPPs can be used to enhance the quality of the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area.

From an academic point of view, research is often conducted for the purposes of discovering new knowledge on a particular subject matter (Koshy 2005:3). In general, however, the purpose of conducting research is not just to amass data but rather to discover the correct answers to research questions through the application of systematic procedures (Berg 1989:6).

Undertaking empirical research in social sciences has its challenges. Most of these challenges stem from the fact that research in this area is, by and large, characterised by the participation of people as research subjects (Neuman 2007:48). People are, by their very nature, continuously thinking and interpreting the social world, which world the social scientist also wishes to interpret. Closely allied to this, Wilson (http://informationr.net/publ/papers 2006) observed that "people are engaged in an on-going process of making

sense of the world, in interaction with their fellows and we, as scientists, are seeking to make sense of their sense-making. In doing so we must inevitably make use of the same methods of interpretation as does the person in his or her common-sense world." In studying people in their natural settings as well as the circumstances in which they function, one of the challenges relates to issues of confidentiality and privacy that can not be ignored whilst undertaking research that has to have some measure of credibility. Another challenge in social research is that some people tend to be reluctant to disclose what they know or are doing, yet others tend not to tell the truth (Neuman 2007:7). However, there are certain approaches to research on human beings in their social settings which, to some extent, deal with some of these challenges.

For the purposes of this thesis, two approaches to research methodology can be identified, namely quantitative research and qualitative research and the distinction between the two may be instructive at this stage of the chapter. The distinction is nevertheless made in the context of social sciences because the thesis is undertaken within the framework of this field or broad discipline.

6.2.1 Quantitative research

In quantitative research the suffix 'quantity' connotes measurement which is, in essence, objective and quantifiable and this is the kernel of this approach to research (Bryman 2004:76). It should therefore follow that quantitative research is more oriented towards counts and measures of phenomena in question. Labuschagne (http://www.nova.edu/sss2006) has noted that quantitative research is "mainly concerned with the degree in which phenomena possess certain properties, states and characteristics, and the similarities, differences and causal relations that exist within and between these." This approach to research emphasises the measurement and analysis of causal relationships between variables within a value-free framework from the researcher's point of view (Neuman 2007:64; Denzin & Lincoln 1998:8). The essential element of analysis should therefore be numbers. As the approach is based on quantifying phenomena, it measures and uses statistical

aggregation of data as a way to arrive at generalisations. Measurement, in this context, must be objective, quantitative and statistically correct (http://uk.geocities.com.2007).

In social research, quantitative research can be in the form of questions, which questions are often structured such that the response options are determined in advance and a large number of respondents are involved since it is all about numbers and hard data. As a result, the use of questionnaires is largely associated with quantitative research (Wiersman & Jurs 2005:165).

The basic assumption of quantitative research within the frontiers of social sciences is that social facts have an objective reality and within this reality there are variables that can be identified and relationships between them be measured. Essentially, in quantitative research a few variables of interest are identified to form the axis around which the entire research process revolves but guided by a predetermined hypothesis. This further suggests that quantitative research tends to rely more on deductive reasoning and thus beginning with a hypothesis and progressing logically to conclusions (Bryman 2004:62). The research process is then aimed at determining the relationships between such variables for the purpose of explaining, predicting, and possibly generalization towards some theory. In the same vein, Leedy and Ormrod (2005:95) observed that "quantitative researchers seek explanations and predictions that will generalise to other persons and places. The intent is therefore to establish, confirm, or validate relationships and to develop generalisations that contribute to theory." In addition, the researcher in quantitative research is assumed to be detached from the research process and therefore from the social reality that is being investigated. The salient features of quantitative research can be summarised as follows (Neuman 2007:110; Gay, Mills & Airasian 2006:400):

(a)   Research revolves around a hypothesis.
(b)   It uses instruments to collect measurable data.

(c)   It strives for generalisations leading to prediction, explanation, and understanding.

(d)   Reasoning is logistic and deductive.

(e)   There is one reality and therefore its focus is concise and narrow.

(f)   Research methods are predetermined.

(g)   It is undertaken in a highly controlled setting which is experimental.

Quantitative research is basically objective and seeks explanatory laws.

6.2.2 Qualitative research

Qualitative research, on the other hand, is concerned with processes and meanings that are not extensively investigated or measured in terms of quantity, amount, intensity or frequency (Denzin & Lincoln 1998:8). So this research approach involves methods of data collection and analysis that do not have a quantitative orientation. Essentially, the focus of qualitative research is human experiences and situations, which do not lend themselves easily to quantitative measures (Maykut & Morehouse 1994:26). This research approach is relatively subjective compared to quantitative research since it has a lot to do with collecting, analysing, and interpreting data on what people actually say or do. It is premised on the assumption that reality is socially constructed and that there are multiple realities within which there are variables that are complex, interwoven, and difficult to measure (Denzin & Lincoln 1998:8). All this often leads to a broad and complex research focus and that is why qualitative research is multimethod in nature in order to capture various facets of the phenomenon being studied (Gay *et al* 2006:399). The researcher actually studies phenomena in their natural settings because qualitative research is not an experimental approach which involves a highly controlled setting that is reminiscent of quantitative research. Researchers following a qualitative approach tend to emphasise the socially constructed nature of reality, which reality is complex and multifaceted. The ultimate purpose of qualitative research is therefore to better understand such complex situations and this is often pursued in an exploratory manner. Consequently, the outcome

of qualitative research is not the generalisation of results, but rather to achieve a deeper understanding of experience from the perspectives of the human participants selected for the study (Maykut & Morehouse 1994:44).

Researchers following a qualitative approach are themselves instruments of data collection mainly because the collection of most of the qualitative research data is dependent on the actual involvement of the researcher in the form of interviews and observations (Gay *et al* 2006:399; Leedy & Ormrod 2005:96). The human or social world is complex and dynamic. As a result, Maykut and Morehouse (1994:26) are of the view that "a human-as-instrument is the only instrument which is flexible enough to capture the complexity, subtlety, and constantly changing situation which is the human experience." Education is interwoven into the social world that is complex and dynamic, which necessitate the study of its provision to be guided by factors referred to above.

In studying human phenomena in their natural settings, the qualitative researcher uses multiple methods in order to achieve an in-depth understanding of the phenomena in question. The researcher may also use a variety of empirical materials in addition to multiple methods. Such a combination makes the entire research process robust enough to facilitate the in-depth understanding of phenomena at hand (Denzin & Lincoln 1998:4). Notwithstanding the foregoing, it may be useful to summarise some of the essential features of qualitative research as follows (Neuman 2007:110; Stake 1995:48; Denzin & Lincoln 1998:4):

(a)   Participants are deliberately selected on the strength of being information rich because they have actually experienced the phenomena under study.

(b)   The intent is to understand the perceptions, experiences and the views of the participants.

(c)   The researcher is part of the process and is the primary data collection instrument.

(d)   Reality is socially constructed and it is what people perceive it to be. Moreover, there are multiple realities.

(e)   Qualitative research does not aim at generalisation but rather to develop a unique interpretation of a particular case. Data are subjective and the basic element of analysis is words or ideas.

(f)   Reasoning is dialectic and inductive.

(g)   It uses communication and observation in data collection.

(h)   The research process revolves around research questions.

In view of the features of qualitative research articulated above, it would appear that this mode of research can be very helpful in attempting to reconstruct social reality such as the education system or part thereof. The research problem and the concomitant research questions lend themselves to a qualitative research approach. However, although the two approaches appear to stand in stark contrast to each other, they can both be used in the same study (Neuman 2007:110). In this way the two approaches can be used to complement each other or to verify the results of each other. The essence of this complement is that the basic elements of analysis of these approaches, namely numbers and words can be combined to enhance the quality of the research output (http://uk.geocities.com.2007). The use of multiple data-collection instruments is treated in greater depth below (see section 6.6.4).

With the above overview in mind, it is now appropriate to focus on research methodology. This will extend to analysis of ethnography, grounded theory, action research, survey research, and the research methods preferred for the study.

6.3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

In research, methodology and methods are sometimes used interchangeably yet they are not synonymous. It is therefore necessary to clarify, at the outset, the distinction between these concepts in order to give a background to their usage henceforth. In the context of research, methods simply refer to the ways

in which data are systematically collected, interpreted and reported. Alternatively, methods should be viewed as the actual practice of research which entails procedures or strategies and techniques applied in the process of conducting a research especially data gathering (Hall & Hall 1996:29). These procedures and techniques are often demonstrated by specific research instruments such as interviews or the use of questionnaires.

On the other hand, methodology is broader than methods and yet more fundamental in that it lays philosophical groundwork for the latter. Essentially, methodology denotes the study of, or a theory of, the way that research methods are used in undertaking a scientific study (Dunne, Pryor & Yates 2005:163). It also entails, among others, the description and analysis of research methods and highlighting their resources as well as their limitations. In general, methodology denotes a myriad of the attributes of ways research data are systematically produced and processed into information. For Hall and Hall (1996:29), methodology should be seen as the philosophy or the general principles on which research is based. The aim of methodology is to describe and analyse research methods, highlighting their limitations and the scope of resources as well as their presuppositions and possible consequences. The study of methodology therefore, enhances the understanding of the process of scientific inquiry (Cohen, Manion & Morrison 2000:45). From the foregoing, one may observe that methodology is actually the science of methods and that its virtue is that it enables researchers to follow established practices and collect valuable data with a broader understanding of the processes involved.

As the distinction between methods and methodology has been briefly analysed above, it is now appropriate to present and analyse research methods referred to in the introduction to this chapter.

6.3.1 Ethnography

In ethnography, the focus of the researcher is to study in depth the entire group that shares a common culture and the group is studied in its natural

setting (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:137). Ethnography is a research method that requires the researcher to be the primary source of data as he or she is, to a large extent, immersed in the social world that is the subject of the study (Berg 1989:52). It is based almost entirely on field work in which the researcher is a participant among the subjects of a study for the duration of the study which can be several months or even years. In ethnography the intent is to observe the phenomenon as it occurs at the material time because this gives the researcher a more realistic view of the observed subjects. In addition, ethnography entails direct, first hand observation of daily behaviour of the research population with the researcher being a participant observer albeit striving to maintain a significant degree of objective detachment (http://www.answers.com/topic/ethnography2006). Participant observation is therefore a *sine qua non* of any ethnographic research.

Maanen in Berg (1989:53) contends that ethnography is a research method that "involves extensive field work of various types including participant observation, formal interviewing, document collecting, filming, recording, and so on." Viewed this way, ethnography can indeed be multimethod and therefore reminiscent of the explanation of qualitative research. In actuality, ethnography is a typical example of a qualitative approach to research (Wiersman & Jurs 2005:17; Gray & Mills 2006:401). Essentially, the foregoing suggests that the ethnographic research method entails an objective description and interpretation of phenomena in their natural setting but with a specific focus on more predictable patterns of human thought and behaviour (Bell 2005:17).

Ethnography is a research method that is quite appropriate in the study of educational practice (LeCompte, Millroy & Preissle 1992:63). The researcher, being a participant observer, is better placed to glean the nature and scope of the strengths and/or deficiencies of the provision of, in this context, secondary education in the Gaborone City area. Such deficiencies, if properly articulated, could form a strong motivation for the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education in order to enhance the quality thereof. This derives from

the view that PPPs can bolster the capacity of the public sector in the provision of essential services (Nzimakwe 2006:55; Scharle 2002:228).

It may be appropriate to acknowledge that ethnography as a research method has its limitations and/or challenges. The mere presence of a researcher from outside the social setting in question has the tendency to induce some behavioural deviations from the norm or some form of reactivity to the presence of a researcher/foreigner (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:220). This requires the researchers to be strategic in their approach and develop a good rapport with the subjects in order to reduce the possible falsification of research findings. In the course of ethnographic research, it is essential for the researcher to demonstrate some degree of reflexivity, which means that the researcher must be aware of him or herself throughout the study and how he or she can influence the results of the same study (Hall & Hall 1996:42) in order to act appropriately to reduce/avoid such influence. It should also be added that the researcher must take cognizance of the need to sustain a positive relationship with research subjects in order to continue with the study to its conclusion.

Fieldwork, as implied above is not the sole province of ethnography; grounded theory also subsists in field-based data as demonstrated in the following section.

6.3.2 Grounded theory

The primary outcome of the grounded theory study is a theory which must, nonetheless, conform to the prescribed categories of information in a theory, namely a central phenomenon, causal conditions, strategies, conditions and context, and consequences (http://www.computing.dcu.ie/~hruskin/ 2006). It is a kind of research method, strategy or approach that aims at deriving theory from a systematic analysis of data (Punch 1998:163). Essentially, the resultant theory is inductively derived from a study and it is actually 'grounded' in data that have been collected in the field and not from research literature as it is

often the case with a great many research paradigms that begin from a particular theoretical framework (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:140). Grounded theory is therefore an inductive discovery of theory that is derived from a systematic analysis and interpretation of field-based data. In this context, inductive discovery refers to a process of moving from the particular to the general whilst allowing the building up of cases and letting hypotheses and concepts to emerge (Corbetta 2003:57). In addition, the grounded theory entails the use of specific events or outcomes to arrive at a theoretical model about the entire population of which the subjects being studied are part of (Hall & Hall 1996:42).

As a qualitative research method, grounded theory is multimethod in nature. This seems to be justified by its penchant for investigating various processes and meanings that the human subjects being studied attach to their social world (Bell 2005:20). Consequently, data to be analysed should encompass the views and perspectives of the research population that is being studied and, more importantly, the method is meant to capture multifaceted social reality in its natural setting. To this end, Leedy and Ormrod (2005:140) are of the view that data collection is field-based and interviews typically play a major role in data collection, but observations, documents, and anything else of potential relevance to the research question may also be used in the study. In this context, the grounded theory study can be viewed as a problem-solving undertaking that is concerned primarily with understanding action from the perspective of human action.

According to Cohen *et al* (2007:491), the grounded theory study exhibit the following salient features:

(a)   Theory is emergent rather than predefined and tested.
(b)   Theory emerges from data rather than *vice versa*.
(c)   Theory generation is a consequence of, and partner to systematic data collection and analysis.
(d)   Patterns and theories are implicit in data, waiting to be discovered.

One of the challenges that are characteristic of a grounded theory is that the researcher is required to disregard, as much as possible, theoretical ideas in order to allow the analytic, substantive theory to emerge freely and objectively (Neuman 2007:64; Corbetta 2003:246). Notwithstanding this requirement, the method is still assumed to be systematic and to conform to specific steps in data analysis. In fact, grounded theory, as propounded by Glaser and Strauss, is regarded "as a general theory of scientific method concerned with the generation, elaboration, and validation of social science theory" (Haig @ http://www.ed.uiuc.edu.2006). So for them, grounded theory meets the accepted canons of undertaking a good scientific research which, in this context, refers to a rigorous and systematic collection, analysis, and interpretation of data leading to some results which, in this case, should be a theory.

Whereas the grounded theory study is perceived to conform to scientific research, Corbetta (2003:246) views the approach as problematic in that the researcher is likely to be overwhelmed by the chaotic multitude of stimuli to the extent that he or she may not be able to order them and choose an appropriate mode of interpretation. In addition, Hammersely in LeCompte *et al* (1992:391) argue that the link between the generated theory and data is not clear. It should, nonetheless, be borne in mind that as a field study, the researcher has the prerogative to select topics and questions to be asked. Theoretical sampling as used in the grounded theory study may also address some of these concerns. According to Punch (1998:167) theoretical sampling entails collecting and analysing a small sample after which the second set of data is collected but guided by emerging directions from the analysis of the first data. The process continues until new data do not exhibit new theoretical dimensions but confirming what has already been established and this is often referred to as theoretical saturation (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:140; Punch 1998:220).

Some kinds of research, like action research, are of immediate benefit to problems in local situations and this is analysed below.

6.3.3 Action research

Action research is a kind of applied research whose primary focus is to find a solution to a local problem often in a local setting (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:108). It is a process that entails the collection of data on the local situation and the analysis thereof with a view to gaining insight into weaknesses in order to guide subsequent action. However, Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000:226) regard action research as a powerful tool for change and improvement in a local setting.

Action research is included here for analysis because it is particularly suitable for school improvement and can be a powerful tool for individual teachers to improve the quality of their instructional delivery and, in turn, the quality of education. It is suitable for improving the quality of education regardless of whether it is provided exclusively by the government or through PPPs. In this context, Koshy (2005:1) observed that "the quality of educational experiences provided to children will depend on the ability of the teacher to stand back, question and reflect on his or her practice and continually strive to make the necessary changes." The assumption here is that the necessary educational infrastructure and facilities are available but this is often not the case especially in Botswana as demonstrated earlier (see section 4.5.3). So the benefit from the use of action research in secondary education can therefore be maximised if it is used in conjunction with the provision of education through PPPs to ensure that spaces and facilities are available to an increased number of learners.

Action research is systematic and focuses on planned change through a number of stages which may depend on the specific purpose for which it is applied. The most salient stages of action research include the following (French & Bell 1999:121; Roberts 1994:58; Cohen *et al* 2000:232):

(a)   Diagnosis of the situation which entails collecting, analysing, and interpreting data on the situation for which the need for some change is perceived. The intention here is to have a clear understanding of the situation in question.

(b)   Action planning is the stage that involves making decisions on what actions to take on the basis of the information gleaned from the previous stage. Priorities and the attendant objectives are carefully set so that the most important tasks are identified and given the necessary attention. It may be necessary to carefully workout processes, structures and techniques to be adopted to ensure the achievement of the objectives. At this stage success criteria may also be developed together with a plan for evaluation.

(c)   Action implementation is done in order to effect the necessary changes to improve the practice. It is the stage that actually leads to change. The planned success criteria are used to guide the new action.

(d)   Evaluation is undertaken in order to assess the effects of the new action. The stage entails observation, evaluation of processes and self-evaluation on the part of the practitioners. It should also entail a critical reflection on the effects of the new action in order to guide the next cycle of action research.

From the stages outlined above it should be clear that action research essentially serves a dual purpose of making action more effective and an attempt to build a body of scientific knowledge around the same action, which action includes mechanisms to solve problems and improve the situation in question (French & Bell 1999:130). Applied to education, action research can enable school staff to be reflective practitioners since they will be engaged, more often, in reflection and evaluation of their actions. Being continuously engaged in such reflections and evaluations of their actions school staff stand to gain a lot of insight into their areas of functionality which, in turn, could lead to the improvement of their actions. Improved understanding of one's practice, which is one of the salient aims of action research, is achieved primarily

because action research entails planning, acting, observing and reflecting more carefully, more systematically, and more rigorously than one normally does (Cohen, Manion & Morrison 2000:227). This can enhance understanding as well as professional development on the part of, among others, staff in secondary schools.

From the foregoing, it could be inferred that commitment to the use of action research can facilitate the practitioners' empowerment in their areas of functionality by achieving professional authority through professional development (Cohen *et al* 2000:233). The latter is enhanced by deep understanding of issues in one's professional field as a result of the aforementioned actions that characterise action research. All this could help practitioners like school staff to make informed decisions through such enhances in understanding (Koshy 2005:5). Being able to make informed decisions, school authorities could be in a better position to give a reasoned justification of their educational output as they can demonstrate how the evidence they have collected and the critical reflection they have done assisted them to achieve a developed, tested and critically-examined rationale for what they are engaged in (Cohen *et al* 2000:230).

In social sciences, surveys appear to be in common usage and, to some extent, seem to be implied in many other research methods including those presented above. It is therefore worth devoting a bit of space to survey research.

6.3.4 Survey research

Survey research in the context of social sciences is one of the most common areas of measurement. The survey technique in social research is viewed by Cobertta (2003:159) as "a technique of gathering information by questioning individuals, who are the object of the research and who belong to a representative sample, through a standardized questioning procedure, with the aim of studying the relationships among the variables." It entails acquiring data about people's characteristics, views, attitudes or even their previous

experiences. According to Leedy and Ormrod (2005:183), all this is often done by posing questions to some of the people under study and then tabulating and analysing their responses. Studying a sample of people in a survey research enables the researcher to know more about the larger population from which the sample was drawn. Corbetta (2003:118) emphasises the need to ask standardised questions to a representative sample that exhibits the characteristics of the entire population under study so that results can be generalised. Since questions are the most important mode of acquiring data, surveys can generally be divided into two broad categories, namely the use of questionnaires and interviews, both of which are analysed below (see sections 6.6.1 and 6.6.2 respectively). So in short, survey research in social sciences includes any measurement procedures in which people are asked questions that are most probably likely to reveal the essential aspects (http://www.socialresearchmethods.net/kb.survey2007) that are likely to characterise their population. One should also observe that it is generally accepted that survey research is a form of quantitative study that falls within the category of descriptive research (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:183). Allied to this view, Hall and Hall (1996:129) contend that the analysis of data from a questionnaire "deals primarily with survey information which can be counted and measured, summarised in terms of averages and percentages and displayed in graphs and tables." To a large extent, all this confirms the quantitative nature of survey research in which a questionnaire has both questions and answers being standardised. It should also be noted, however, that not every form of interview is associated with survey research; only structured or standardised interviews are associated with survey research; to the extent that the latter is viewed as a quantitative approach (May 2001:121).

The survey researcher's point of departure is a theoretical or applied research problem but culminates with empirical measurements and data analysis, and hence deductive approaches (Neuman 2007:168). As a quantitative research method, a survey begins with certain premises and then draws logical conclusions from them (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:96; Hall & Hall 1996:39).

Since survey research is anchored on the use of questionnaires and interviews which are analysed later in the chapter, there is not much need to go further with the analysis of survey research. Suffice it though to state that this research method has been included here for the same reason that it is based on the use of questionnaires and interviews which have also been used in the study for this thesis.

6.3.5 Research methods preferred for the study

A distinction has been made between quantitative and qualitative research (see sections 6.2.1 and 6.2.2). However, in this study both approaches have been followed and the combination is typified by the use of their data collection techniques. A survey questionnaire (see section 6.6.1) was used for the empirical research and the study relied more on it. The choice of a survey questionnaire was motivated by the fact that a well designed questionnaire is easier to use yet it can collect valuable information on views and perceptions of the respondents (Bell 2005:137). This is particularly so because the author is a full-time employee and therefore could not have enough time to conduct extensive interviews and make observations necessary to adequately cover the scope of the study. On the other hand, the use of telephone interviewing could be very expensive for the researcher especially when each and every school head in the area in question was to be extensively interviewed. Youngman in Fox, Goodey and Goulding (1995:40) made observations and arguments which guided the choice of a questionnaire as he contended that "questionnaires are probably the most common method of collecting information. They are cheap to administer, can be sent to a large number of subjects and provided they are well designed, are relatively easy to analyse." It must of course be acknowledged that designing an effective questionnaire can be a complex process and is more in the nature of art than a scientific exercise. It may involve juggling the pros and cons of a variety of questions and/or statements in an attempt to elicit the relevant responses (Nel *et al* 1994:98; Dunne *et al* 2005:44).

In addition to the use of questionnaires, interviewing (see section 6.6.2) was also used not only for the purposes of triangulation but also for the purposes of collecting more data from very few, but nevertheless strategic, individuals. These are the people who are in positions of authority and influence who would also be conversant with the policy direction of the Ministry of Education in Botswana.

The author has participated in the management of secondary schools as a school head, both junior and senior, for more than a decade in the Gaborone City area. Although he is no longer serving in the same capacity, he is still participating in the education system of Botswana in the area in question and two of his children are attending secondary schools in the same area. So participant observation (see section 6.6.3), which is the kernel of ethnographic research and participant observation, was to some extent used in this study.

Having analysed some of the research methods that have relevance to the study, it is appropriate to present an analysis of some of the features that characterise a good research exercise. These include validity and reliability of research methods and the consideration of ethical issues.

6.4 FEATURES OF GOOD RESEARCH

It can be argued that a good research exercise is the one that captures the correct data and culminates in the provision of correct answers to the questions that necessitated the research (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:33). In addition, it is generally accepted that a good research exercise should meet the requirements of reliability and validity provided the research is based on a correctly identified problem or issue. Essentially, reliability and validity of research methods are some of the salient features of a good research exercise or a scientific enquiry. These features are therefore analysed below.

6.4.1 Validity of research method

All kinds of research are undertaken for a specific purpose and it is therefore essential for one to know how much value to attach to the research findings and the extent to which the research method and the findings thereof are valid (Hall & Hall 1996:43). Validity of a research method is a measure of its accuracy, meaningfulness, and credibility. The concept of validity may be confined to the tools or instruments that are used in a research exercise, in which case the concept refers to the extent to which the tool/instrument actually measures what it purports to measure in conformity with established and/or acceptable practice (Bell 2005:65). For example, the use of a metre stick to measure the length of a table is quite acceptable and has validity. It is therefore of critical importance for the research process in general and the research instruments in particular to have validity if the ensuing results are to have some measure of credibility and acceptability especially in the research community (Neuman 2007:51). It is essential to have some verification strategies to ascertain the validity of a research method. All this suggests the need for a research method to have enough controls to ensure that the research conclusions are genuinely warranted by the research data (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:97).

The views on validity captured above exhibit the characteristics of a quantitative research exercise yet every research exercise, quantitative or qualitative, needs to have some degree of validity because invalid research is not worth it. From the qualitative research perspective, validity is viewed in terms of "the honesty, depth, richness and scope of the data achieved, the participants approached, the extent of triangulation and the disinterestedness or objectivity of the researcher"(Cohen *et al* 2000:105). All this is akin to the perception of the extent to which the research will lead to an in-depth understanding of the phenomenon in question as well as the understanding of the truth about the phenomenon. The concept of validity can further be explained in terms of both internal and external measures.

External validity is a consideration of the extent to which the research results and conclusions thereof can be generalised and be applicable to situations beyond the frontiers of the study (Punch 1998:30). For example, if this study has external validity, its findings should be applicable to the rest of Botswana and not just in the Gaborone City area. On the other hand, internal validity is a measure of the extent to which the research design and the concomitant data enable the researcher to arrive at acceptable conclusions about cause-and-effect as well as other relationships within the research data. Such conclusions and/or interpretations should be sustained by the research data and not some unintended or extraneous variables (Mertens 2005:120; Cohen *et al* 2000:107). The need for internal validity is more pronounced where the purpose of the study is to determine cause-and-effect relationships. This is necessary in order to avoid other possible explanations for the observed results (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:98). Internal validity ensures that changes observed in the dependent variable are attributed to the effect of the independent variable and not extraneous variables (Mertens 2005:120). The existence of internal validity could also enhance the credibility of the study and the concomitant results.

6.4.2 Reliability of research method

Reliability of a research method and/or data collecting instrument is a measure of the extent to which a procedure produces similar results under constant conditions on all occasions (Bell 2005:64). This may seem rather too ambitious a statement but in simple terms it means the consistency and trustworthiness of the results obtained when using a particular method. Reliability is particularly prominent in quantitative research but can also be applied in a valuable way in qualitative research. In this context, Silverman in Hall and Hall (1996:209) has argued that a reasonable degree of reliability can be achieved in qualitative research if each informant understands the questions in the same way and if answers can be coded without the possibility of uncertainty. It would therefore appear that it is vital to ensure clarity of questions especially interview questions and that there is a need for the interview schedule to be pre-tested and this is also true of a questionnaire. Pre-testing can enhance the reliability

of a research method particularly in qualitative approach and this can also enhance the value that can be attached to ensuing results. Pre-testing or piloting a research instrument is analysed in more detail below (see section 6.7.2.1). It should be added, however, that the quality of research can also be enhanced by taking cognizance of ethical issues when undertaking research in a human related field.

6.4.3 Ethical issues

Research undertaken in social sciences often uses human beings as research subjects. As a result, it is of critical importance for the researcher to take cognizance of ethical issues and concerns associated with the research that one intends to undertake (Neuman 2007:50). In the first place, research participants should be protected from any physical and psychological harm that may be occasioned by their participation in a research project. In this context, Leedy and Ormrod (2005:101) have noted that "participants should not risk losing life or limb, nor should they be subjected to unusual stress, embarrassment, or loss of self-esteem." However, if it is known that the participants are likely to experience some psychological discomfort, they should be made aware of this in advance of their participation.

It is also important to inform the research participants about the nature and scope of the research so that they can take informed decisions on whether to participate or not. They should also be made aware of the opportunity to withdraw from the study if they so desire so that they understand their participation to be voluntary. In addition, research participants need to be assured of confidentiality and anonymity (Berg 1989:138). The identities of the participants should not be disclosed by the researcher and, in particular, the nature of participation of each and every participant should remain confidential. The participants need to be given the assurance that the researcher will not violate the tenets of research ethics and this should not be viewed as a psychological gimmick designed to lure people into participating in the research project. Such assurances could motivate the research participants to give even

sensitive information or data which will otherwise not be disclosed and therefore enhancing the reliability of the research findings.

It is necessary for a researcher to know in advance the kind of data that he or she needs to collect. Such knowledge may help when it comes to deciding on the data-collection instruments and the concomitant mode of data analysis. The following section, therefore, explains the kind of data that were collected.

6.5   DATA TO BE COLLECTED

It might be instructive to explain the kind of data that were being sought in order to inform the analysis and/or the choice of the research method(s) for the study. This is because the required data and research methods are very much interdependent and therefore the selection of such methods should take into account the nature and scope of data that will be required to address the problem that necessitated the study. Chapters two up to five of this study concentrated on secondary data, which are data from published literature in the form of review thereof. The next stage is to focus on primary data, which data are derived from the source of investigation and are therefore closest to the reality that is being investigated. Leedy and Ormrod (2005:89) have observed that "the researcher's only perceptions of Truth are various layers of truth-revealing fact. In the layer closest to the Truth are primary data; these are often the most valid, the most illuminating, the most truth manifesting." However, the primary data may not be closest to the truth if the research instruments or processes do not actually lead to the correct data.

Clearly, the primary data being sought should be helpful in providing answers to research questions that are listed above (see section 1.4) and have not yet been answered at this stage of the thesis. It, therefore, follows that data to be collected should be related to the objective of the topic of this thesis, namely "the use of PPPs in providing secondary education in the Gaborone City area." As a result, data were collected in the following areas:

(a)   Opinions or attitudes: the judgments that the respondents had about the feasibility of applying PPPs in the provision of secondary education. In particular, data were collected on:

   (i)   the extent to which PPPs can be applied in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area;

   (ii)   the views of public and private secondary school heads on PPP in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area;

   (iii)   the impact that PPPs can have on the quality of secondary education in the Gaborone City area;

   (iv)   what the public sector can learn from the private sector in terms of delivery of service in general and secondary education in particular;

   (v)   the prerequisites that can determine the success of PPPs in the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area; and

   (vi)   the extent to which the private sector is involved in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area.

(b)   Preferences: the extent to which the respondents wished to maintain the status quo or to embrace the PPP route.

(c)   Awareness: whether the respondents were aware of the extent to which the provision of secondary education needed to be improved and measures that could be taken to improve it.

Since the nature and scope of data to be collected have been determined, it then becomes imperative to know what data collecting instruments to use to collect the same data. The researcher has several instruments for collecting empirical materials and the analysis of such instruments is made in the ensuing section. These instruments include the use of a questionnaire, interviewing, and observation which are all analysed below.

6.6   DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS

Primary data referred to above can be collected in various ways. It is generally accepted that primary data can be collected in at least three ways, namely

communication, observation, and by experiment (Nel, Radel & Loubser 1994:140). But since the study is skewed towards qualitative research, experimentation may not be appropriate. In this regard, interviews, observation and the use of a questionnaire may be a better classification of the research instruments that were eventually used in this particular study. In line with this classification, Labuschagne (http://www.nova.edu/sss 2006) has argued that "qualitative methods consist of three kinds of data collection: in-depth, open-ended interview; direct observation; and written documents, including such sources as open-ended written items on questionnaires and personal diaries." The instruments of a questionnaire, interviews, observations and multiple data collection are analysed below.

6.6.1 Questionnaire

In general, a questionnaire is a set of questions used in a research study and this can include an interview schedule which the interviewer uses to elicit information from the respondents, whether face to face or by telephone (Hall & Hall 1996:98). However, for the purposes of this thesis, a questionnaire is confined to a set of questions and/or statements to which the research subjects are to respond in order to provide data that are relevant or related to the research questions and overall research problem. In this context, Cox in Nel *et al* (1994:232) suggests that all questionnaires are designed to achieve three related goals, namely "to maximise the relevance and accuracy of the data collected; to maximise the participation and cooperation of target respondents; and to facilitate the collection and analysis of data." The use of a questionnaire is therefore predicated on the assumption that the respondents have information, ideas or attitudes on the subject of the researcher's interest. The intent therefore is to get all this as best as possible and with minimum distortion.

It is generally accepted that there are three ways of administering a questionnaire, namely the face-to-face interview; the telephone interview; and self-administered questionnaire (Cobertta 2003:142). However, due to the fact

that the self-administered questionnaire was used in the study, it forms the focus of this section whilst the analysis of interviewing as a data collection instrument is dealt with in the next section.

Questionnaires are normally linked to the production of quantitative data and statistical analysis and therefore tend to be associated with positivism and the application of natural scientific research methods (Dunne *et al* 2005:41). One of the subtle aims of most questionnaires is therefore measurement. However, depending on the nature and scope of the study a questionnaire can take any of three forms, namely structured, semi-structured and unstructured and the form a particular questionnaire assumes determines whether it is more quantitative or qualitative (Cohen *et al* 2007:320).

If the research population is very large, the questionnaire tends to be more structured, closed and numerical for ease of analysis. For a smaller research population the questionnaire can easily be less structured, more open, word-based and therefore more qualitative (Cohen *et al* 2007:247). A highly structured questionnaire on the other hand tends to be more quantitative because it generates frequency responses that can easily be subjected to statistical presentation and analysis. According to Oppenheim (1992:115), an additional virtue of a highly structured questionnaire is that it makes it possible to compare various groups within the research population.

Data to be collected for the study are summarised above (see section 6.4) and therefore questions and/or statements in the questionnaire had to cover the delimited area in order to remain focused on the essential aspects of the research problem. It should nonetheless be pointed out that sometimes a questionnaire and interviewing are closely linked when the former is used as the basis of the latter (Corbetta 2003:142; Hall & Hall 1996:101). However, for the purposes of clarification the two are treated separately.

6.6.2 Interviewing

Interviews may be used for various purposes. However, for the purposes of this study the focus is on the use of interviewing as a data collecting instrument. The objective of interviewing is therefore to stimulate and maintain an informative conversation with people who are believed to have knowledge and/or experiences that are relevant to the success of the research project (Bell 2005:157; Corbetta 2003:264). It is therefore meant to enable the collection of data that are related to the research questions and overall research problem (Leedy and Ormrod 2005:147). So interviewing is a research technique that facilitates basically two things, namely the process of seeking information and that of providing it. In this regard, Cannell and Kaln, quoted by Cohen and Manion (1995:271) have defined a research interview as "a two-person conversation initiated by the interviewer for the specific purpose of obtaining research relevant information, and focused by him on content specified by research objectives of systematic description, prediction, or explanation." But interview in research is not only limited to two-person conversation; it is possible to conduct a group interview in order to bring together different perspectives of the group members on the phenomenon in question. In addition, interview in research has multiple forms which may be conceptualised, according to Dunne *et al* (2005:28), in terms of or along the following continua:

Standardised --------- unstandardised

Individual -------------- group

Public   -------------- private (confidential)

The above continua demonstrate the context, conditions, and approach to conducting interviews. However, the type of research undertaken in a particular study may actually be described in terms of a position along one of the aforementioned continua.

It is common practice to interview individual people. However, sometimes it is necessary to have a group perspective on a particular research question in which case a group interview may be preferred (Bell 2005 :162). In research,

group interview can be conducted also to explore group norms and dynamics around issues of significance to the research topic (May 2001:125). One way to do this could be to ask questions for each group member to answer. Another way is to have a focus group in which members are deliberately encouraged to talk to each other on the research topic, they just focus on such a topic (Bell 2005:162). A focus group can be useful where a researcher does not have enough time to undertake individual interviews, it can also be helpful for individuals who are comfortable talking in a group context. In addition, a well guided focus group can raise salient issues and therefore enable the researcher the opportunity to penetrate the social world of the research participants and acquire an in-depth understanding of the population from which the group was derived.

Standardised interview entails the use of a formally structured interview schedule in the form of predetermined questions to which each and every interviewee is required to respond so that the responses can be comparable (Berg 1989:15). The interviewer only asks a set of standard questions and nothing else. In standardised interview, each participant is asked exactly the same questions so that the emerging differences in responses are regarded as substantive and therefore not attributed to the actual interview process (May 2001:121). The interviewer remains neutral to the extent that his or her role is confined to directing the respondents according to the interview schedule. This uniform structure of the interview makes it possible to compare responses of various interviews. The use of standardised interviews assumes absolute clarity on what needs to be uncovered in the course of the interview and that the questions have the same meaning and are equally understood by all the respondents so that their responses can be comparable. Clearly, these assumptions are not very consistent with reality because the more the respondents the more diverse is their understanding of the research questions. As a result, follow-up questions are necessary to enhance clarity and to be in the interest of credible research results.

Unstandardised interview is much more flexible than standardised interview and it is premised on the assumption that the researcher does not know in advance all the necessary questions that need to be asked (Punch 1998:176). It is also recognised that respondents may not attach the same meaning to like-worded questions and that further or follow-up questions may be necessary in some instances. In this context, Berg (1989:17) contends that "interviews must develop, adapt, and generate questions and follow-up probes appropriate to the given situation and the central purpose of the investigation." The interview becomes interactive and enables relevant and appropriate questions to arise from the process of interviewing. It also affords the interviewee the leeway to bring in his or her perspectives on the issues being raised. In other words, questions are completely open and the researcher uses a guide which lists topics to be covered (Hall & Hall 1996: 157). This arrangement gives respondents a greater opportunity to develop their responses in the direction of the research requirement. One shortcoming of an unstandardised interview is that if the interviewer is not skillful, the interview may easily digress into less significant issues leading to a waste of time and/or failure to get the necessary information. The necessity of skill in interviewing has been captured by Bell (2005:177) as she contends that "a skillful interviewer can follow up leads, probe responses, and investigate motives and feelings, which a questionnaire can never do." In this way, a researcher can obtain interview data that are comprehensive and relatively reliable.

It may be added that on the continuum of structured and unstructured interviews there is the possibility of a semi-structured interview which, to some extent, embraces the techniques of the aforementioned two extremes. In a semi-structured interview, questions are asked but the researcher is free to probe beyond the responses in the quest for clarifications and elaborations and thereby culminating in qualitative research data (May 2001:123). It would appear therefore, that semi-structured interviews are more realistic than the two extremes referred to above.

In this particular study, the interviews were conducted on an individual basis as opposed to a group interview. This was convenient because there were few interviewees who were from different positions of authority in the Department of Secondary Education. The interview exercise was semi-structured the enable the researcher to probe the interviewees for more information and their attitudes towards the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area.

In addition to requiring some skill, interviewing takes a lot of time to undertake and can therefore lead to very few people being interviewed due to lack of sufficient time. The technique is, to some extent, subjective and therefore the danger of bias can be very difficult, if not impossible, to eliminate. Bias may for example creep in when the interviewer prefers some responses to others. In general however, the rate of return of responses is higher with interviewing than with a questionnaire because in interviewing the researcher gets the data on the spot (Burns 1998:484). However, it should be acknowledged that both the interview and the questionnaire are not able to capture data on non-verbal human behaviour. Consequently, observation was also used as a data collection instrument in this study and constitutes the focus of the next section.

6.6.3 Observation

Observation in the context of research has been alluded to under qualitative research especially ethnography (see section 6.3) where the researcher is a participant observer. Observation is essentially the mainstay of data collection in ethnography but it can also be used in other qualitative methods. It can also be used in quantitative research that involves experiments (Punch 1998:185). Observation, as a data collection technique, can either be structured or unstructured (Bell 2005:185). However, in this particular study, observation was semi-structured to the extent that the researcher had specific issues on which to collect data. The observation schedule is appendix c.

Quantitative approaches are often highly structured and based on predetermined and detailed observation schedules. Punch (1998:185) is of the view that observation in social research can be highly structured without necessarily being converted to numbers. On the other hand, qualitative approaches to observation tend to be very much unstructured and therefore not based on predetermined schedules. In this case, behaviour is capture as a series of actions and events as they occur naturally (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:145; Punch 1998:185).

So observation in qualitative research is often deliberately unstructured in order to allow for free-flowing and natural events, processes and behaviour to be observed in their natural settings. This enables the collection of data that are closest to the truth about the phenomena being studied. Unstructured observation also enables the researcher some degree of flexibility so that he or she can change focus from one thing to the other as new and more pertinent events present themselves (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:145). It should be acknowledged that observation can also be highly structured in which case the researcher would know in advance what he or she is looking for and would have an observation schedule or categories prepared in advance (Cohen *et al* 2000:305). A semi-structured observation is possible and it entails the provision of an agenda of issues which are to be illuminated in the process of data collection. It can be assumed that one of the aspirations of any serious researcher is to cull accurate data about the phenomenon being studied and generate effective solutions to the problem that necessitated the study. This may be true of both qualitative and quantitative researchers. For example, it can be expected that a social scientist who can discover an effective solution to the problem of quality in the delivery of secondary education will celebrate the achievement, which will also be celebrated by the community in general as they are likely to benefit from such achievements.

However, the focus here is confined to participant observation, in qualitative research, as a data collection strategy. For the researcher, observation involves being present when events unfold so that he or she can experience them and

transform, at one point or another, the same experience or part thereof into useful information (Dunne *et al* 2005:55). The essence of the researcher's presence is to watch, listen or even to talk to the research subjects in order to collect data on naturally occurring, ordinary events in their natural settings and therefore closest to the truth. But observation as a data collecting technique may not be as easy as one might think because it can be both demanding and intricate. In this regard, May (2001:153) contends that "it is more plausible to argue that participant observation is the most personally demanding and analytically difficult method of social research to undertake. Depending on the aims of the study and the previous relationship of the researchers to those with whom they work, it requires them to spend a great deal of time in surroundings with which they may not be familiar; to secure and maintain relationships with whom they may have little personal affinity . . ." But observation remains an important technique of collecting data in qualitative research.

For the less experienced researcher, unstructured observation can be problematic especially when the novice is not certain about the important things to look for and this could result in a waste of time by recording less important things. Another disadvantage of unstructured observation is the so called Hawthorne effect, and this refers to the alteration of behaviour as a reaction to the presence of the researcher (Leedy & Ormrod 2005:98). All this can lead to inaccurate data and therefore wrong conclusions. A good research practice should be pursued because it minimises such inaccuracies and wrong conclusions. In this regard, it is of critical importance that research be guided by the principles of validity and reliability and satisfies the requirements thereof. In addition, to enhance the credibility of research, multiple data sources are often used in the same study, the analysis of which follows in the next section.

6.6.4 Use of multiple data collection instruments

It needs to be acknowledged that not all the data collection instruments referred to above are suitable in all situations. The nature and scope of the study will normally inform the choice of the mode of data collection to be used. However, in research practice, it is common to use multiple data collection instruments in the same research – as was indeed done in this particular study - and this practice is referred to as triangulation. According to Bell(2005:64), triangulation refers to "cross-checking the existence of certain phenomena and the veracity of individual accounts by gathering data from a number of informants and a number of sources and subsequently comparing and contrasting one account with another in order to produce as full and balanced a study as possible." All this seems to suggest that triangulation also strengthens the research design by using various methods to identify possible loopholes in the design. Identifying such loopholes enables the researcher an opportunity to improve the research method and adapt it to the realities of the research environment. It can also be a legitimate argument that it is very necessary to look at the same phenomenon from different angles so that the results of one method can confirm or challenge the results of the other (**http://bmj.bmjjournals.com/cgi2007**).

Another argument for using a variety of research strategies to examine the same phenomena is that the problems associated with one strategy may be compensated for by the strength of another (Hall & Hall 1996:44). In this regard, different research strategies complement each other and thereby strengthening the entire research process. For example, it is possible to undertake qualitative research to pave way for quantitative surveys.

The other reason for using multiple methods or strategies of data collection is that this can help the researcher to have multiple perspectives to the phenomena under study. According to Berg (1989:4), methods tend to impose certain perspectives on reality and yet each method reveals slightly different facets of the same symbolic reality. Consequently, each method may constitute

a different line of sight that is directed to the same reality. This means therefore that the more the number of useful methods used in the same study the more the number of perspectives the researcher may have leading to a better picture of the phenomena under study. Social reality is complex and multifaceted and hence the need for multiple perspectives in the quest for a better and holistic understanding of the same reality. The use of multiple sources of data is common in qualitative research and this is done with the hope that data from various sources will converge to illuminate the phenomena in question (Miller & Fredericks 1996:28).

Now that some research methodological issues have been analysed, it is appropriate to explain how the actual research process unfolded; that is, how the data that are articulated (see section 6.5 were actually collected).

6.7 RESEARCH PROCESS

The purpose of this section is to explain how the actual research for this thesis was undertaken. The research was undertaken to complement the literature review and analysis made in chapter five above on the provision of secondary education through PPPs in the Gaborone City area in Botswana. In particular, the research process shows the steps that were taken in an attempt to address the research questions.

6.7.1 Scope

Since the study was confined to the Gaborone City area, the research participants were also drawn from the same area and purposive sampling was used to identify the participants. Purposive sampling refers to careful selection, for inclusion in the study, of participants based on the possibility that each participant will enhance the variability of the sample (Maykut & Morehouse 1994:45). As a result, a total of twenty one Botswana Government secondary school heads in the Gaborone City area were identified to be the most appropriate participants in the study. Their choice was predicated on the

assumption that they were information rich with regard to the intricacies of the provision of secondary education and therefore suitable for the study. Secondary school heads in Botswana are at the forefront of the management of secondary schools.

Because of their positions, secondary school heads are the ones who experience most of the difficulties that are associated with the provision of secondary education in the country. They also prepare reports about their individual schools and communicate the same to the Ministry of Education. Secondary school heads are required to explain and defend Botswana Government policies on secondary education. In readiness for this daunting task, secondary school heads in Botswana become well versed in the realities of the provision of secondary education in the country and sometimes agonise over the shortcomings of the system. For example, junior secondary school heads find that a lot of their completing learners do not proceed to senior secondary schools where places are limited. Where facilities are limited it is the school heads that have to deal with the situation on the ground. In addition, school heads are also at the forefront of the implementation of educational policy changes. Therefore, any such policy changes will affect them somehow and hence the appropriateness to solicit their views on the possibility of delivering secondary education in their region through PPPs.

Permission to undertake research in secondary schools in the Gaborone City area was granted by the Department of Secondary Education. However, in pursuit of a more comprehensive study, the views of the mandarin at the helm of secondary education in Botswana were also sought on the extent to which PPPs can be applied in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. Whereas Botswana public secondary school heads were the key research participants, four private secondary school heads in the same area were also incorporated in the study through the use of the same questionnaire. The reason for including the private secondary school heads is to get their perspectives of the central issues of the thesis.

6.7.2 Data collection

A questionnaire was prepared for both the Botswana secondary school heads and the private secondary school heads (see appendix I). The questionnaire was designed to cover the research questions and the research problem in general. After developing the questionnaire, it was sent to friends to critique it so as to raise issues such as possible bias, lack of clarity and relevance. They recommended some modifications to some questions and statements and these were effected. After that the questionnaire was sent to the promoters to further critique it. Their recommendations to improve certain aspects of the questionnaire were fully implemented after which the questionnaire was then piloted. The main aim was to undertake a worthwhile and instructive study by using data collection instruments which have been critically examined with a view to collecting valid and reliable data. All this could enhance the credibility of the study and the findings thereof.

6.7.2.1 Piloting the questionnaire

The piloting of a data-collecting instrument is another important stage in a scientific enquiry. Piloting a data-collecting instrument, in this case the questionnaire, ensures that the instrument stands a good chance of achieving the objective of collecting data which have a reasonable degree of validity and reliability. The process of piloting a questionnaire also ensures that it is adapted to the realities of the research population by trying it several times and improving it where necessary. To this end, Oppenheim (1992:47) expressed the same sentiments as follows: "Questionnaires have to be composed and tried out, improved and then tried out again, often several times over, until we are certain that they can do the job for which they are needed." According to Bell (2005:147), it is necessary to pilot all data-collecting instruments to test how long it will take for the respondents to complete, to check for clarity of questions and instructions and to discard items that do not seem to yield useful data. Since the questionnaire may be the only contact between the researcher and the respondent, it is important that questions and

statements in the questionnaire are clear, transparent and devoid of ambiguity. The respondents may not have the opportunity to seek clarification from the researcher, yet the latter would like to sustain the interest of the former while completing the questionnaire.

It can therefore be inferred that however well designed a questionnaire may seem to be, it should always be piloted to ensure relevance, objectivity and effectiveness. In addition, piloting a data-collecting instrument seems to be a common practice in scientific studies.

The questionnaire was then given to five school heads in the Gaborone City area, two from senior secondary schools and three from junior secondary schools. In addition, one school head from each category of schools (not part of the five referred to above) was interviewed using the questionnaire as the interview schedule. The results of the pilot were analysed and the analysis thereof is presented in the next chapter. The purpose of the analysis of the pilot work was to check for the reasonableness of the whole exercise before the fully fledged data collection was undertaken.

6.7.2.2 Distribution of the questionnaire

Because the secondary schools under study are clustered within a short radius, the author visited each school to submit a letter and a questionnaire for the school heads to complete. This was meant to enhance the rate of return of the completed questionnaires. The school heads that were found at their schools were kindly requested to complete the questionnaire and agreed on a date for the researcher to come and collect the completed questionnaire. For those who were not around by the time the researcher was at their schools, both the covering letter and the questionnaire were left with the secretaries. Follow-ups were made through telephone calls to school heads that were not found by the researcher to ensure that they received the questionnaire and completed it.

The aforementioned procedures were followed for school heads of both public and private secondary schools in the Gaborone City area. Before re-visiting the schools to collect the completed questionnaires, each school head was first telephonically called to remind him or her that the researcher would be coming to collect the questionnaire. The above procedure coupled with the fact that the researcher was known to most of the school heads in the public secondary schools in the area in question was seen to be likely to enhance the rate of return of the completed questionnaires.

6.7.2.3 Interviewing Department of Secondary Education's officials

The Director of the Department of Secondary Education's and two of his subordinates were interviewed to solicit their views and/or attitudes towards the possibility of delivering secondary education through PPPs in the Gaborone City area. This covered the possibility of building new secondary schools through PPPs and renovating and maintaining existing ones under PPPs. The interview schedule for these officials is appendix II.

6.8 CONCLUSION

The chapter focused on research methodological issues and a distinction has been made between research methods and methodology. Methods refer to the actual ways in which data are collected, interpreted and reported whilst the latter refers to the study of, or a theory of, the way that methods are used. The two major approaches to research methodology in social science, namely quantitative research and qualitative research have been analysed in this chapter. Besides, both approaches have been followed in this study. In general, qualitative research focuses on how individuals and groups perceive and understand their social world and construct meaning from their experiences. It seeks an in-depth understanding of human behaviour and situations. On the other hand, quantitative research approach emphasises the measurement and analysis of causal relationships between predetermined variables. It involves the measurement and use of statistical aggregation of

data as a way to arrive at generalisations. Research methods covered in this chapter are ethnography, grounded theory, survey research, and action research. A survey research method has been followed in this study. The data collection instruments that have been analysed in the chapter are the questionnaire, interviewing and observation. The use of multiple data collection instruments, triangulation, and the benefit thereof has also been explained. It has been noted that data collection instruments need to be piloted to ensure that it serves the desired purpose. Questionnaires were used to collect data and interviewing was, albeit to a lesser extent, also used in this study. Observation as a data collection technique was also used in this study. Data collected are presented and analysed in the next chapter, which is chapter seven.

CHAPTER 7

EMPIRICAL RESEARCH DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

7.1 INTRODUCTION

Data collected may, on their own, be meaningless until they have been properly presented and systematically analysed in order to convert them into knowledge. Data analysis is a stage in an empirical research project where the researcher wants to make sense of what he or she has discovered. He or she analyses and interprets the collected data in order to determine their meaning and/or implications. The previous chapter presented a conceptual framework and a basis for undertaking an empirical research on the theme of this thesis. Consequently, the purpose of this chapter is to systematically present and analyse data collected on the extent to which PPPs can be used to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. In particular, the analysis is of data that were meant to address the research questions presented in chapter one (see section 1.4) of this thesis. The analysis will, among others, centre on the feasibility of applying PPPs in the provision of secondary education; the impact that PPPs can have on the quality of secondary education in the area of study; the benefits that can be realised from such PPPs; the antecedents for successful implementation of PPPs in the provision of secondary education; and the extent to which the private sector can be involved in the said PPPs. Data are presented in tables for ease of reference and interpretation.

7.2 EMPIRICAL RESEARCH DATA AND ANALYSIS

The empirical study was based on the use of a questionnaire to collect data from the secondary school heads; interviews on key people in the Department of Secondary Education; and observation on some aspects of the activities of

secondary schools in the area of study. As a result, the ensuing analysis covers data collected through these techniques, which analysis is presented below.

7.2.1 Data from questionnaire

As stated in the previous chapter (see section 6.7.1), a total of 25 secondary school heads were targeted for the study and, therefore, the same number of questionnaires was dispatched to these school heads. Consequently, the analysis is based on the 25 questionnaires that were received and found to be useful for the study. Besides, a pilot study was also conducted the results of which are presented below.

7.2.1.1 Pilot study

Five school heads were involved in a pilot study, two from senior and three from junior secondary schools in the Gaborone City area. All the questionnaires were received and analysed.

The school heads in the pilot group were aware of the concept of "PPPs" but were not certain about its application in the provision of education in other countries. They strongly agreed that every child should be educated up to senior secondary education and that there was a need to increase the number of senior secondary places and/or schools in the area of study. Four of the school heads agreed that private secondary education was better than that provided in the Government of Botswana secondary schools, the fifth school head disagreed. However, all of them agreed that people who have the means preferred to send their children to private secondary schools in the area. In addition, they all agreed that junior certificate, on its own was not adequate for one to meaningfully participate in the economic activities of the country.

They all strongly agreed that classes in secondary schools were too large to the extent that they compromised the quality of teacher/learner interaction and, by association, the quality of assistance given to individual learners especially

those with learning difficulties. All the five school heads strongly agreed that the cost of building secondary schools was colossal and that pooling the resources in both the public and private sectors, through PPPs, had the potential of widening access to secondary education especially at senior secondary level as more secondary schools could be built. Furthermore, they were of the view that PPPs could enable them to learn how the private sector conducts its business, three of them agreed that they could have their management efficiency enhanced, one did not agree with this view whilst the other one was neutral.

They all agreed that they needed a better understanding of the principles of PPPs and what it entail to provide secondary education through PPPs. However, they generally agreed that some regulatory mechanism and quality assurance framework should be in place to ensure the proper functioning of such PPPs. All of the school heads in the pilot group agreed that the support of the political leadership was necessary as well as the legislative framework to guide the implementation of PPPs in the public sector.

The pilot group strongly disagreed with the statement that the leadership of curriculum delivery should be taken up by the private sector. On the other hand, they strongly agreed that the management of secondary schools under PPP arrangement should be handled by the public sector through the current school headship system and not the private sector. They also strongly agreed that non-instructional services such as feeding the students; security; maintenance of schools; and the provision and maintenance of computers should be handled by the private sector.

The school heads in the pilot group were rather uncertain as to whether they preferred the status quo or the PPP route. Three of them were neutral, one agreed and the other one disagreed with the statement that "secondary education should be provided through PPPs." The five school heads in question strongly agreed that it took too long for maintenance work to be done in secondary schools. All of them were of the view that the private sector could

do a better job in the maintenance of secondary schools and that organisations thereof take a shorter time to complete projects when compared to those in the public sector. However, as indicated earlier, they all disagreed with the idea that the private sector should take over the management of secondary schools. Three of them agreed that the private sector organisations were not honest; one of them was neutral whilst the other one did not agree that the private sector organisations were not honest. However, they all agreed that with the appropriate monitoring mechanisms in place the private sector resources should be harnessed to enhance the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area.

Having undertaken the analysis of the pilot group, it is now appropriate to present and analyse data from the main empirical study. As a result, the next section analyses data on the views of the empirical research subjects on the feasibility of PPPs in the provision of secondary education. A brief presentation of biographical data however, is given first.

7.2.1.2 Biographical Data

Table 7.1: Secondary schools

Secondary School	Public Sector	Private Sector
Senior	4	-
Junior	17	-
Unified	-	4
Total	**21**	**4**

Table 7.2: Experience as school head

Experience as School Head School	Public Sector	Private Sector
Less than five years	5	3
Between five and ten years	8	1
More than ten years	8	-
Total	**21**	**4**

Table 7.3: Highest qualification

Highest Qualification	Public	Private Sector
Diploma	-	-
First Degree	15	1
Master Degree	6	3
Doctoral Degree	-	-
Total	**21**	**4**

From table 7.1 above, the private secondary schools are the only unified secondary schools in the study whilst/whereas in the public sector they are either junior or senior secondary schools.

7.2.1.3 Feasibility of PPPs in the provision of secondary education

The intent of this section was to establish the views of the secondary school heads in the Gaborone City area regarding the extent to which it was feasible to provide secondary education through PPPs. The study involved 21 public sector secondary school heads and 4 private sector secondary school heads and therefore, the analysis and presentation of findings are based on the views of each group respectively. Table 7.4 shows how the school heads in question reacted to various constructs under the theme.

The research population was generally of the view that the provision of secondary education, in the Gaborone City area, was inadequate. The participation of the private sector, in the form of PPPs, in the provision of secondary education in the same area was acceptable to the secondary school heads who participated in the study. As far as the public sector secondary school heads are concerned for example, collectively 95.2 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that there was a need for more senior secondary schools to be built in the area (A7), collectively 66.7 percent strongly agreed and agreed that it was very expensive to build secondary schools in Botswana (A9), and collectively 95.2 percent strongly agreed and agreed that

through the use of PPPs more secondary schools could be built in the area (A1).

Table 7.4: **Feasibility of applying PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone city (GC) area**

	Statement	Public Sector Secondary School Heads						Private Sector Secondary School Heads					
		SA	A	N	D	SD	Total	SA	A	N	D	SD	Total
A1	Through the effective use of PPPs more secondary schools can be built in the area	47.6	47.6	4.8	-	-	100	-	75	25	-	-	100
A2	The available spaces in senior secondary schools cannot accommodate all Junior Certificate (JC) leavers who have passed their examinations	47.6	28.6	-	14.3	9.5	100	75	25	-	-	-	100
A3	There is need for every junior secondary school leaver to proceed to senior secondary school	38.1	9.5	19.0	23.8	9.6	100	75	25	-	-	-	100
A4	The Government of Botswana currently (2007) does not have a plan for 100 percent transition from junior to senior secondary school	38.1	42.8	-	14.3	4.8	100	25	25	50	-	-	100
A5	A Junior Certificate is no more adequate, on its own, for one to meaningfully participate in the economy of Botswana	61.9	33.3	-	4.8	-	100	25	50	-	25	-	100
A6	Senior Secondary school completers can benefit more in vocational training than JC completers	76.2	14.2	-	4.8	4.8	100	25	75	-	-	-	100
A7	There is a need for more senior secondary schools to be built in the area	57.1	38.1	4.8	-	-	100	25	75	-	-	-	100
A8	The involvement of the private sector in the provision of secondary education can create tension between the participating personnel of the public and private organisations	-	23.8	9.5	38.1	28.6	100	25	25	25	25	-	100
A9	Secondary schools in Botswana are very expensive to build	14.3	52.4	28.6	4.8	-	100	25	50	25	-	-	100
A10	With proper administrative structures, the private sector resources can be used in the provision of secondary education	28.6	66.6	4.8	-	-	100	50	50	-	-	-	100
A11	PPPs can fuel corruption in the provision of secondary education	4.8	-	14.3	47.6	33.3	100	-	-	50	25	25	100

Entries in percentages

Key: SA = Strongly Agree;   A = Agree; N = Neutral;   D = Disagree   and
*   SD = Strongly Disagree*

256

As far as the private sector secondary school heads are concerned, collectively 100 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that there was a need for more senior secondary schools to be built in the area (A7), collectively 75 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that it was very expensive to build secondary schools in Botswana (A9), and 75 percent agreed that through effective use of PPPs more secondary schools could be built in the area (A1).

Notwithstanding the views of the respondents on the need for more secondary schools in the area, the Government of Botswana did not seem to have a plan for a 100 percent transition rate from junior to senior secondary school (A4). In all, 80.9 percent of the public sector school heads strongly agreed and agreed with statement A4. However, as for the private sector secondary school heads, collectively 50 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed with this statement whilst the other 50 percent of the respondents were neutral. Comparatively, the percentage of neutral private sector school heads is high which could be indicative of the lack of awareness of public sector policies and/or programmes by the respondents.

The need for more senior secondary schools in the Gaborone City area has also been highlighted by collectively 95.2 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary school heads and 75.0 percent of the private sector secondary school heads indicating that the Junior Certificate was no more adequate on its own for one to meaningfully participate in the economy of Botswana (A5). Education has been viewed as being important for, among others, personal development and for raising income levels for individuals (World Bank 2006:34, Adeyinka & Major 2006:10). Every learner should therefore be assisted through the education system to acquire skills and knowledge needed for one to advance in a modern, capital-intensive and technological economy (Turok 2008:20). It is therefore very significant for every learner to receive the education that can benefit him or her and be adequately equipped for life satisfaction. The need for every junior secondary school leaver to proceed to senior secondary school (A3) has been

acknowledged by the respondents. However, collectively only 47.6 percent of the respondents from the public sector school heads strongly agreed and agreed with the statement A3 whilst collectively only 33.3 percent disagreed and strongly disagreed with the same statement (A3). As far as the private sector secondary school heads are concerned, all of them (100%) strongly agreed and agreed with statement A3. One of those who did not support the universal senior secondary education made a comment to the effect that because of automatic promotion, there are some learners who could complete junior secondary education without having learnt enough to form the basis for senior secondary education. Such learners could not benefit from senior secondary education and could even be the sources of discipline problems.

There are certainly different opinions between public and private sector secondary school heads regarding statement A3. One reason for this difference could be that learners in the private sector secondary schools in question do not sit for Junior Certificate examinations before they are selected for senior classes; they just proceed from the beginning to the end of secondary education. On the other hand, the public sector has two distinct secondary schools and programmes; one to cater for junior and the other for senior secondary school learners (see section 4.5). It is therefore likely that the different opinions derive from the different systems of secondary education. Notwithstanding some measures of resentment for universal senior secondary education by some of the respondents, collectively 90.4 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools either agreed or strongly agreed that senior secondary school completers could benefit more in vocational training than the Junior Certificate completers (A6).

It should also be observed that the feasibility of applying PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area has been established with the research population. This is because collectively 95.2 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with statement A10 that "with proper administrative structures, the private sector resources can be used in the provision of secondary education."

As for the respondents from the private sector secondary schools, collectively 100 percent of them strongly agreed and agreed with statement A10. In addition, collectively 80.9 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly disagreed and disagreed that PPPs in the provision of secondary education could fuel corruption. As for the private sector secondary school heads, collectively 50 percent of the respondents either disagreed or strongly disagreed with statement A11 whist the other 50 percent of them were neutral. This seems contrary to the perception that, due to the profit motive, the private sector can take advantage of the public sector's limited business experience and asymmetries of information to advance its interests (Coulson 2005:156; Wettenhall 2007:392). On his part, Savas (2000:306) is of the view that "corruption can occur at the boundary between the public and private sector … well placed officials and wealthy families will use it to line their pockets." Neither did the respondents perceive PPPs as likely to create tension between the participating personnel of the public and private organisations as demonstrated by the responses to statement A8. In all, only 23.8 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools agreed with the statement (A8) whilst collectively 66.7 percent of them either disagreed or strongly disagreed that the PPP arrangement could create tension between employees of the participating sectors (A8). As far as the respondents from the private sector secondary schools are concerned, collectively 50 percent of them either agreed or strongly agreed with the statement A8 whilst 25 percent disagreed with it, another 25 percent remained neutral.

Notwithstanding the views of the respondents, a more serious scholarship suggests that PPPs may not function smoothly because of disparities in the aims, culture, language and perceived power (Coulson 2005:155). The functionality of PPPs may be further compromised by the fact that some big private partners tend to have enormous political clout to the extent that monitoring their performance becomes questionable (Wettenhall 2007:394). Ratanen, Kulmala, Lonnqvist and Kujansivu (2007:418) are of the view that, as far as performance measurement is concerned, public and private organisations are different. These are some of the factors that may cause tension between

the partnering organisations in PPPs and should be taken into consideration when developing and managing such partnerships.

Whereas the empirical research population generally believed that it is feasible to provide secondary education through PPPs, it would be more informative to have their views on the actual provision of secondary education through this arrangement. The analysis of these views follows in the next section.

7.2.1.4 Provision of secondary education through PPPs

In this section, the focus was on the extent to which PPPs could, from the secondary school heads' point of view, be used in the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. Table 7.5 presents data on this construct.

From the empirical research population's point of view, the Gaborone City area was suitable for the provision of secondary education through PPPs arrangement. In this regard, collectively 76.2 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools either agreed or strongly agreed that PPPs were suitable for the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area, only 4.8 percent disagreed whilst 19 percent of the respondents were neutral in this matter (B1). The respondents from the private sector secondary schools held almost similar views as 75 percent of them agreed with the same statement (B1) whilst the other 25 percent remained neutral. As for the demand for secondary education, collectively 95.2 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed that it was high in the area (B2) with the rest of them (4.8%) being neutral. The private sector school heads expressed almost the same opinion as all of them (100%) agreed with the statement (B2).

The presence of the private secondary schools in the Gaborone City area was acknowledged by the respondents. In this regard, collectively 52.4 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools either agreed or strongly agreed that there were many private secondary schools in the area

(B3), 14.4 percent of them were neutral whilst collectively 33.4 percent of them either disagreed or strongly disagreed that such schools were many in the area. As far as the private sector secondary school heads are concerned, 50 percent of them agreed with statement B3, 25 percent of them were neutral whilst the other 25 percent disagreed with this statement (B3).

Table 7.5:   Provision of secondary education in the GC area through PPPs

	Statement	Public Sector Secondary School Heads						Private Sector Secondary School Heads					
		SA	A	N	D	SD	Total	SA	A	N	D	SD	Total
B1	PPPs are suitable for the provision of secondary education in the GC area	14.3	61.9	19.0	4.8	-	100	-	75	25	-	-	100
B2	The demand for secondary education is high in the area	47.6	47.6	4.8	-	-	100	-	100	-	-	-	100
B3	There are many private secondary schools in the area	14.3	38.1	14.4	28.6	4.8	100	-	50	25	25	-	100
B4	The private secondary schools in the area produce better quality education than the Government secondary schools	28.6	47.6	14.2	4.8	4.8	100	25	75	-	-	-	100
B5	Top civil servants in the area prefer to send their children to private secondary schools	61.9	33.3	-	4.8	-	100	50	25	25	-	-	100
B6	As a school head in the area, you prefer a private secondary school to a Government secondary school for your child	28.6	38.1	9.4	19.0	4.8	100	75	-	25	-	-	100
B7	People, who can afford it, send their children to private secondary schools	52.4	47.6	-	-	-	100	50	50	-	-	-	100
B8	Many junior secondary school leavers in the area cannot find places in senior secondary schools	28.6	28.6	23.8	14.2	4.8	100	-	75	-	25	-	100
B9	Classes in secondary schools in the area are too big	61.9	14.3	9.5	14.3	-	100	50	-	50	-	-	100
B10	The quality of secondary education is compromised where class sizes are too big	57.1	38.1	-	4.8	-	100	50	50	-	-	-	100
B11	There are many private sector organisations which can participate in the building of more secondary schools under PPPs	28.6	57.1	14.3	-	-	100	-	50	25	25	-	100
B12	There is need to improve the provision of secondary education delivered by the Government secondary schools	47.6	42.8	9.5	-	-	100	25	75	-	-	-	100
B13	It is not necessary for the Government of Botswana to involve the private sector in the provision of secondary education in the area	4.8	9.5	4.7	28.6	52.4	100	-	-	-	100	-	100

Entries in percentages

Key: SA = Strongly Agree;   A = Agree; N = Neutral;   D = Disagree and
SD = Strongly Disagree

The majority of the respondents either agreed or strongly agreed that the private secondary schools in the area produced better quality education than

261

the Government of Botswana secondary schools (B4). To this extent, collectively 76.2 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with statement B4 and collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with the same statement. As a result, collectively 95.2 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed that top civil servants in the area preferred to send their children to private secondary schools and only 4.8 percent of them disagreed with the same statement (B5). As far as the respondents from the private sector secondary schools are concerned, collectively 75 percent of them either agreed or strongly agreed with statement B5 and the other 25 percent disagreed with the same statement. The secondary school heads in the Gaborone City area also preferred private secondary education to the extent that collectively 66.7 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with statement B6 whilst 75 percent of their counterparts in the private sector strongly agreed with the same statement. Furthermore, there is a convergence of opinion between the two groups of respondents regarding people who have the means and their preference for private secondary education for their children (B7). To this extent, all the respondents (100%) from both groups either agreed or strongly agreed that people, who can afford it, send their children to private secondary schools (B7). However, as indicated above collectively 66.7 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools preferred a private secondary school to a Botswana Government secondary school for their children (B6) whilst 75 percent of their counterparts in the private sector expressed the same preference. All this demonstrated, from this study's point of view, that the private secondary schools provided better quality education than their counterparts in the public sector.

The use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education was further justified in that collectively 57.2 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed that many junior secondary school leavers in the Gaborone City area could not find places in the

Government Senior Secondary Schools in the area (B8), 23.8 percent of them were neutral whilst collectively 19 percent of them either disagreed or strongly disagreed with the same statement. As far as the private sector respondents are concerned, 75 percent of them agreed with the statement (B8) whilst the remaining 25 percent disagreed with the same statement. The problems facing the provision of secondary education were further highlighted in terms of big classes in the public secondary schools in the area (B9). As far as the public sector secondary school heads are concerned, for example, collectively 76.2 percent of them strongly agreed and agreed that classes in Botswana secondary schools in the area were too big (B9) and collectively 95.2 percent of them either agreed or strongly agreed that such big classes compromised the quality of secondary education (B10). As for the respondents from the private sector secondary schools, 50 percent of them strongly agreed with statement B9 whilst the other 50 percent remained neutral. In addition, collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed that the quality of secondary education is compromised where class sizes are too big (B10).

Secondary school heads in the Gaborone City area generally agreed that there was a need to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education delivered by the Government of Botswana Secondary Schools (B12). Table 7.5, for example, shows that collectively 90.4 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed that there was a need to improve the provision of secondary education delivered by the Government of Botswana secondary schools (B12). Similarly, collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with the same statement (B12) which emphasizes the need to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education by the public sector in the area of study. The availability of the private sector organisations that can participate in the building of more secondary schools under PPPs (B11) has been recognized in this study. To this end, collectively 85.7 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed that there were many private sector organisations that could

participate in the aforementioned task (B11), the rest of the respondents (14.3%) were neutral. As for the respondents from the private sector secondary schools, 50 percent of them agreed with the statement B11, 25 percent of them were neutral and another 25 percent disagreed with the same statement. So the involvement of the private sector in the provision of secondary education was preferred by the secondary school heads in the Gaborone City area.

It should therefore be instructive to establish the views of the research population on the impact that PPPs could have on the quality of the provision of secondary education. The next section focuses on the analysis of these views.

7.2.1.5 Impact PPPs can have on the quality of secondary education

The proponents of PPPs in the delivery of public services presuppose that the arrangement could have a positive impact on the nature and scope of the delivery of the infrastructure and the concomitant services (Nzimakwe 2006:50; Savas 2000:249; Field &Peck 2003:495). This part of the empirical study focused on the views of the respondents on the possible impact that PPPs could have on the quality of the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. In the context of this empirical study, the research population generally agreed that PPPs could have a positive impact on the quality of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. In this context, colectively 71.4 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed that, through PPPs, every junior secondary school leaver could have an opportunity to proceed to senior secondary school whilst 75 percent of their counterparts in the private sector agreed with the statement C1. In addition, collectively 95.2 percent of the public sector respondents either agreed or strongly agreed that more facilities could be made available to secondary school education and 100 percent of their counterparts in the private sector agreed with this statement (C2).

The positive attitude of the respondents towards PPPs in the delivery of secondary education has further been highlighted by their disagreement with the statement that PPPs could lower the quality of the provision of secondary education (C3). As far as the public sector school heads are concerned, for example, collectively 89.1 percent of the respondents disagreed and strongly disagreed that PPPs could lower the quality of secondary education (C3), collectively 57.1 percent disagreed and strongly disagreed that PPPs were a recipe for conflict between public and private sector officials working in the same schools (C4) and collectively 71.4 percent disagreed and strongly disagreed that PPPs in the provision of secondary education can lead to the increase in the workload of school heads (C8).

Table 7.6   The impact that PPPs can have on the quality of secondary Education in the GC area

	Statement	Public Sector Secondary School Heads						Private Sector Secondary School Heads					
		SA	A	N	D	SD	Total	SA	A	N	D	SD	Total
C1	Every junior secondary school leaver could have an opportunity to proceed to senior secondary school	23.8	47.6	4.8	19.0	4.8	100	-	75	25	-	-	100
C2	More facilities can be made available to secondary school education	47.6	47.6	4.8	-	-	100	-	100	-	-	-	100
C3	PPPs can lower the quality of secondary education	-	4.8	14.3	42.8	38.1	100	-	-	25	75	-	100
C4	PPPs are a recipe for conflict between public and private sector officials working in the same schools	-	19.1	23.8	33.3	23.8	100	-	-	50	50	-	100
C5	Through PPPs, school heads can have more time devoted to the core functions of the schools	14.3	47.6	19.1	19.0	-	100	75	-	25	-	-	100
C6	The use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education can lead to clean and attractive school environments	28.6	38.1	23.8	9.5	-	100	25	50	-	25	-	100
C7	PPPs in the provision of secondary education can enhance the managerial efficiency of school heads	28.6	52.4	14.2	4.8	-	100	50	50	-	-	-	100
C8	PPPs in the provision of secondary education can lead to the increase of the workload of school heads	4.8	4.8	19.0	66.6	4.8	100	-	50	25	-	25	100

Entries in percentages

Key: SA = Strongly Agree;   A = Agree;   N = Neutral;   D = Disagree   and
SD = Strongly Disagree

As far as the private sector secondary school heads are concerned, 75 percent of them disagreed that PPPs can lower the quality of the provision of secondary

education (C3), 50 percent of the respondents disagreed that PPPs are a recipe for conflict between public and private sector officials working in the same schools (C4) whilst the other 50 percent remained neutral. However, whereas the majority of the public sector respondents (71.4%) did not agree that PPPs will increase the workload of secondary school heads, the private sector respondents have a different opinion to the extent that 50 percent of them agreed that PPPs in the provision of secondary education will increase the workload of school heads, 25 percent of them were neutral whilst the other 25 percent disagreed with the statement (C8). The difference of opinion in this construct could be attributed to differences in work experiences resulting from different work environments. The public sector secondary school in Botswana performs a lot of functions (see section 5.3.2.4), some of which can be performed by the private sector organisations and these functions are decided upon by the Government of Botswana. On the other hand, the private sector secondary schools decide on what functions to perform and/or what functions to outsource.

The respondents generally believed that the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education could benefit school heads. As far as the respondents from the public sector secondary schools are concerned, collectively 61.9 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that through PPPs, school heads could have more time to be devoted to the core functions of the schools (C5) and collectively 81 percent of them either agreed or strongly agreed that PPPs in the provision of secondary education can enhance the managerial efficiency of the school heads (C7). As far as the respondents from the private sector secondary school heads are concerned, 75 percent of them strongly agreed with the statement (C5) and collectively 75 percent of them either agreed or strongly agreed with the statement C7. All this emphasizes the benefits that secondary school heads can derive from the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education. In addition, the respondents agreed that the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education could lead to clean and attractive school environments (C6). To this end, collectively 66.7 percent of the respondents from the public sector strongly agreed and agreed with

statement C6 and collectively 75 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with the same statement emphasizing the value PPPs can add to the secondary school environments.

In chapter three (see section 3.3.6.4), it has been observed that one of the virtues of PPPs was that the public sector would be in a position to access, among others, the expertise of the private sector. The next section therefore, presents the analysis of the views of the empirical research population on what the public sector could learn from PPPs.

7.2.1.6 What the public sector can learn from PPPs

One of the basic assumptions in this section was that employees from the two sectors would work side by side in the delivery of secondary education through PPPs as conceived in this thesis (see section 5.4). The intent was therefore to establish whether, from the school heads' point of view, the public sector employees in the provision of secondary education can learn something from the private sector through the PPP arrangement referred to above. The results of the empirical study on this construct are presented in table 7.7 below. As the data indicate, the secondary school heads in the study agreed that there was something that the public sector employees could learn from the participation of the private sector through PPP arrangements. As far as the respondents from the public sector secondary schools are concerned, collectively 71.4 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that public secondary school staff, working hand in hand with the private sector staff, can learn to be more efficient (D1), collectively 90.4 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that secondary school heads can learn entrepreneurial skills (D2), collectively 71.4 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that public sector employees in secondary schools can learn the habits of handling customers well (D3) and collectively 90.4 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that public sector employees in secondary schools can learn the habits of avoiding wastage of resources (D4).

As far as the private sector secondary school heads are concerned, collectively 75 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that the public sector staff, working hand in hand with the private sector staff, can learn to be more efficient (D1), collectively 50 percent (another 50% being neutral) of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that secondary school heads can learn entrepreneurial skills (D2), and collectively 100 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that public sector employees in secondary schools can learn the habits of handling customers well (D3) and collectively 75 percent of the respondents agreed that public sector employees can learn the habits of avoiding wastage of resources (D4).

The research population generally did not agree that secondary school personnel can not learn anything from the private sector (D5). In this regard, collectively 85.7 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools and collectively 100 percent of their counterparts in the private sector disagreed and strongly disagreed that secondary school personnel employed by the Government of Botswana can not learn anything from the private sector (D5). All this demonstrates support for PPPs, in the delivery of secondary education, by the two groups of respondents. In addition, the two groups supported PPPs in the provision of secondary education to the extent that this arrangement enabled secondary schools to benefit from the commercial dynamism of the private sector (D6). As far as this construct is concerned, collectively 90.4 percent of the respondents from the public sector and collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the private sector strongly agreed and agreed that PPPs can enable the public sector secondary schools to benefit from the commercial dynamism of the private sector (D6).

The private sector is characterised by financial and commercial dynamism and therefore operate in a manner that enhances the profitability of organisations thereof (Savas 2000:240; Smith 2000:128). Such skills and orientation of the private sector could be of benefit to the public sector if the employees thereof can adopt the same attributes and apply them where possible and necessary in their areas of functionality. This view derives from the responses of the

subjects of the empirical study who, in general, believed that PPPs could enable the public sector employees to learn something worthwhile from their counterparts in the private sector.

Table 7.7: What the public sector can learn from the private sector in terms of delivery of service in general and secondary education in particular under PPPs

	Statement	Public Sector Secondary School Heads						Private Sector Secondary School Heads					
		SA	A	N	D	SD	Total	SA	A	N	D	SD	Total
D1	Government secondary school staff, working hand in hand with the private sector staff, can learn to be more efficient	38.1	33.3	9.5	14.3	4.8	100	25	50	25	-	-	100
D2	Secondary school heads can learn entrepreneurial skills	28.6	61.9	9.5	-	-	100	25	25	50	-	-	100
D3	Public sector employees in secondary schools can learn the habits of handling customers well	28.6	42.8	23.8	4.8	-	100	-	25	75	-	-	100
D4	The public sector employees can learn the habits of avoiding wastage of resources	57.1	33.3	9.6		-	100	-	75	25	-	-	100
D5	Secondary school personnel employed by the Government of Botswana cannot learn anything from the private partner	4.8	9.5	-	28.6	57.1	100	-	-	-	50	50	100
D6	PPPs can enable Government secondary schools to benefit from the commercial dynamism of the private sector	42.8	47.6	9.6	-	-	100	50	50	-	-	-	100

Entries in percentages

Key: SA = Strongly Agree;   A = Agree;   N = Neutral;   D = Disagree   and
SD = Strongly Disagree

To advocate the use of PPPs in the provision of certain public services presupposes the recognition of the antecedents for the successful implementation of such partnerships (Jonker 2001:259; Dukwi 2003:1). As a result, the section that follows analyses the views of the empirical research population on the antecedents for the successful implementation of PPPs in the provision of secondary education.

7.2.1.7 Antecedents for successful implementation of PPPs

In order for PPPs in the delivery of public services to be successful, certain conditions and/or guidelines must prevail in order to facilitate the functionality of such partnerships (Savas 2000:248; Jonker 2001:259; Kroukamp 2004:38). This section of the empirical study focused on the views of the secondary

school heads regarding the necessity or otherwise of certain factors in the successful implementation of PPPs. Data in table 7.8 below refer to the views of the empirical research subjects on the possible antecedents for the successful implementation of PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the area in question.

The respondents generally agreed that there was a need for certain conditions to prevail in order to facilitate the implementation of PPPs in the delivery of public services. As far as the respondents from the public sector secondary schools are concerned, collectively 100 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that there should be a legislative framework to facilitate the implementation of PPPs in the delivery of public services (E1), collectively 95.2 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that secondary school heads need to have a better understanding of the principles of PPPs in the provision of secondary education (E2), collectively 90.5 percent strongly agreed and agreed that there was a need for political leadership in support of PPPs in the country (E3) and collectively 100 percent strongly agreed and agreed that a regulatory mechanism needs to be in place to safeguard the interests of each partner (E5). As far as the secondary school heads from the private sector secondary schools are concerned, 50 percent of the respondents agreed that a legislative framework needs to be in place to facilitate the implementation of PPPs in the delivery of public services (E1), 75 percent agreed that secondary school heads need to have a better understanding of the principles of PPPs in the provision of secondary education (E2), 75 percent agreed that there was a need for political leadership in support of PPPs in the country (E3) and collectively 100 percent of the respondents agreed that a regulatory mechanism needs to be in place to safeguard the interests of each partner (E5).

Property rights, in the context of PPPs, are very important and their assurance is indispensable to the participation of the private sector and the success of public service delivery through this mode (Jamali 2005:419).

Table 7.8:   Antecedents for successful implementation of PPPs

Statement		Public Sector Secondary School Heads						Private Sector Secondary School Heads					
		SA	A	N	D	SD	Total	SA	A	N	D	SD	Total
E1	There should be a legislative framework to facilitate the implementation of PPPs in the delivery of public services	52.4	47.6	-	-	-	100	-	50	50	-	-	100
E2	Secondary school heads need to have a better understanding of the principles of PPPs in the provision of secondary education	66.6	28.6	4.8	-	-	100	-	75	25	-	-	100
E3	There is a need for political leadership in support of PPPs in the country	61.9	28.6	4.7	4.8	-	100	-	75	25	-	-	100
E4	Before the implementation of PPPs in the provision of secondary education the public needs to be convinced that such arrangements will benefit the learners	66.7	33.3	-	-	-	100	-	100	-	-	-	100
E5	A regulatory mechanism needs to be in place to safeguard the interests of each partner	71.4	28.6	-	-	-	100	-	100	-	-	-	100
E6	Both partners (public and private) need to be convinced that they will benefit from the partnerships	61.9	38.1	-	-	-	100	-	100	-	-	-	100
E7	There should be a high demand for secondary education in order for more schools to be built	28.6	52.4	9.5	9.5	-	100	25	50	25	-	-	100
E8	Parents must be willing to make some contributions towards the education of their children	80.9	19.1	-	-	-	100	50	50	-	-	-	100
E9	The judicial system must be perceived to be effective and impartial for property rights to be assured	61.9	33.3	4.8	-	-	100	-	100	-	-	-	100
E10	Law enforcement must be perceived to be uncorrupt-able in order to effectively deal with corrupt practices	66.7	33.3	-	-	-	100	50	50	-	-	-	100
E11	There should be some quality assurance framework with which to monitor and guide the operations of secondary schools under PPPs	71.4	28.6	-	-	-	100	75	25	-	-	-	100
E12	The private partner will have to make some profit if the partnerships are to be sustained	38.1	33.3	14.3	14.3	-	100	50	25	25	-	-	100

Entries in percentages

Key: SA = Strongly Agree;   A = Agree;   N = Neutral;   D = Disagree   and
*   SD = Strongly Disagree*

271

As far as the respondents from the public secondary schools are concerned, collectively 95.2 percent strongly agreed and agreed that the judicial system must be perceived to be effective and impartial for property rights to be assured (E9), collectively 100 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that law enforcement must be perceived to be incorruptible in order to effectively deal with corrupt practices (E10). As far as the respondents from the private sector secondary schools are concerned, 100 percent of them agreed that the judicial system must be perceived to be effective and impartial for property rights to be assured (E9) and collectively 100 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that law enforcement must be perceived to be incorruptible in order to effectively deal with corrupt practices (E10).

It is often considered important for the public to have confidence in the organisations that deliver public services. In the context of this study, the public needs to be convinced that PPPs in the provision of secondary education will indeed benefit the learners (E4) before they can embrace such arrangements. The respondents supported this view (E4) to the extent that collectively 100 percent of those from the public sector strongly agreed and agreed with this statement. Similarly, 100 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools agreed with the same statement (E4). It may also be added that those who advocate PPPs in the delivery of public services presuppose mutual benefit to the partners as a result of the partnership. This point has been supported by the research population to the extent that collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed that both partners (private and public) need to be convinced that they will benefit from the partnership (E6). Similarly, 100 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools agreed with the same statement (E6).

The private partner, in the context of this study, operates on the basis of the profit motive and, therefore, its benefit is contextualized in terms of, among others, its profit (Kerr 2003:11; Nisar 2007:150). Consequently, for PPPs to be

successful, the private sector will have to, among others, make some profit especially if the partnership is to be sustainable (E12). As far as the respondents from the public sector secondary schools are concerned, collectively 71.4 percent of them either agreed or strongly agreed that the private sector will have to make some profit and collectively 75 percent of their counterparts in the private sector either agreed or strongly agreed with the same statement (E12). But the anticipation for profit to be realistic, there should be sufficient demand for secondary education in the area in question for more schools to be built and therefore attract the participation of the private sector organisations (E7). This view (E7) is supported to the extent that collectively 81 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with statement E7 whilst collectively 75 percent of the respondents from the private sector strongly agreed and agreed with the same statement.

Moreover, for PPPs in the provision of secondary education to be successful, parents must be willing to make some contributions towards the education of their children (E8). This statement has been supported by all the respondents to the extent that, collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools and collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the private secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with this statement (E8). However, the respondents also supported the view that there should be some quality assurance framework with which to monitor and guide the operations of secondary schools under PPPs (E11). As far as this construct is concerned, collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the public sector and collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the private sector strongly agreed and agreed with statement E11.

Now that the views of the empirical research population on the antecedents for the successful implementation of PPPs have been analysed, it may be instructive to consider the extent to which the private sector could be involved in such partnerships. As a result, the following section analyses the results of the study on these views.

7.2.1.8 The extent of the private sector involvement in PPPs

Notwithstanding the fact that the ultimate responsibility in the public service provision rests with the government, PPPs entail, among others, shared responsibilities in the provision of public infrastructure and the concomitant services (Grimsey 2002:246; Field & Peck 2003:495). Consequently, the focus of this section was on the extent to which the private sector could effectively participate, through PPPs, in the delivery of secondary education in the geographical area of the study. This section therefore presents the views of the empirical study population on the aforementioned construct.

The involvement of the private sector in the provision of secondary education was not clearly recognized by the respondents from the public sector secondary schools to the extent that collectively 38.1 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector was already extensively involved in the provision of secondary education in the area and collectively 38.1 percent strongly disagreed and disagreed with the statement F1. However, as far as the respondents from the private secondary schools are concerned, collectively 75 percent strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector was already extensively involved in the provision of secondary education (F1). Clearly there is a difference of opinion between the two groups of respondents (public and private sectors). Such a difference could be attributed to the interpretation of the statement (F1) by the two groups. It is possible that the public sector secondary school heads interpreted the statement in terms of the involvement of the private sector organisations in the public sector secondary schools. On the other hand, the private sector secondary school heads are likely to have interpreted the statement (F1) in terms of the provision of secondary education by the private sector secondary schools.

The question of whether the private sector should be allowed to assume the leadership of the secondary school curriculum delivery under PPPs (F2) received mixed feelings. As far as the respondents from the public sector

secondary schools are concerned, collectively 33.3 percent strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector should be allowed to assume the leadership of curriculum delivery under PPPs (F2), collectively 42.9 percent strongly disagreed and disagreed with the same statement whilst 23.8 percent remained neutral. As for the respondents from the private sector, collectively 50 percent of them strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector should be allowed to assume leadership of curriculum delivery under PPPs (F2) whilst another 50 percent of them just disagreed with the same statement. The management of secondary schools under PPPs by the public sector secondary schools (F3) is also not well supported by the research population to the extent that collectively only 47.6 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with the same statement (F3), 28.5 percent were neutral and collectively 23.8 percent of them either strongly disagreed or disagreed with the statement F3. As for the respondents from the private sector secondary schools, 25 percent of them agreed, 50 percent remained neutral and 25 percent disagreed that the management of secondary under PPPs should remain under the government school heads (F3).

Notwithstanding the reservations on the involvement of the private sector expressed above, the research population generally supported the participation, through PPPs, of the private sector in the provision of secondary education. As far as the public sector secondary school heads are concerned for example, collectively 61.9 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector should build and maintain secondary schools under PPPs (F4), collectively 61.9 percent of them strongly agreed and agreed that existing secondary schools should be renovated and then maintained by the private sector under PPPs (F5), collectively 66.6 percent of them strongly agreed and agreed that cleaning of the entire secondary school should be handled by the private sector under PPPs (F6), collectively 57.1 percent strongly agreed and agreed that feeding of learners in the secondary schools can be handled better by the private sector (F7) and collectively 76.2 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that security of secondary schools under PPPs should be handled by the private sector (F9). As for the

private sector school heads, 50 percent of the respondents agreed that the private sector should build and maintain schools under PPPs (F4) whilst the other 50 percent remained neutral. The private sector secondary school heads also supported the participation of the private sector to the extent that 50 percent of the respondents agreed that existing secondary schools should be renovated and then maintained by the private sector under PPPs (F5), 50 percent agreed that the security of secondary schools under PPPs should be handled by the private sector (F9).

The support for the security of secondary schools to be handled by the private sector derives from the perception, especially of the public sector secondary school heads, that security in government (Botswana) secondary schools is very inadequate (F8) to the extent that collectively 81 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with the statement F8. Only 50 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary school heads agreed that security in government secondary schools was inadequate (F8), 25 percent are neutral whilst the other 25 percent strongly disagreed with the statement (F8). The responses of the private sector secondary school heads indicate uncertainty on their part presumably because they are not quite aware of what obtains in the Government secondary schools.

As for the provision and maintenance of computers in secondary schools under PPPs (F10 and F11), the respondents from the public sector secondary schools support the involvement of the private sector to the extent that collectively 61.9 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that the provision of computers in the secondary schools under PPPs should be left to the private sector (F10) and collectively 85.7 percent of them strongly agreed and agreed that the maintenance of computers in secondary schools under PPPs should be handled by the private sector (F11). As far as the respondents from the private sector secondary schools are concerned, collectively 100 percent of them strongly agreed and agreed that the maintenance of computers in secondary schools under PPPs should be handled by the private sector. However, as for

the provision of computers in secondary schools under PPPs, the respondents from the private sector secondary schools do not support it in that 50 percent of them strongly disagreed, 25 percent are neutral and only 25 percent of them agreed that the provision of computers in secondary schools under PPPs should be left to the private sector (F10).

Table 7.9: The extent to which the private sector can be involved in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone city area

	Statement	Public Sector Secondary School Heads						Private Sector Secondary School Heads					
		SA	A	N	D	SD	Total	SA	A	N	D	SD	Total
F1	The private sector is already extensively involved in the provision of secondary education in the area	4.8	33.3	23.8	23.8	14.3	100	25	50	-	25	-	100
F2	The private sector should be allowed to assume the leadership of curriculum delivery under PPPs	9.5	23.8	23.8	38.1	4.8	100	25	25	-	50	-	100
F3	The management of secondary schools under PPPs should remain under the Government school heads	14.3	33.3	28.5	4.8	19.0	100	-	25	50	25	-	100
F4	The private sector should build and maintain schools under PPPs	14.3	47.6	28.6	4.8	4.8	100	-	50	50	-	-	100
F5	Existing secondary schools should be renovated and then maintained by the private sector under PPPs	14.3	47.6	9.6	23.8	4.8	100	-	50	50	-	-	100
F6	Cleaning of the entire secondary school should be handled by the private sector under PPPs	33.3	33.3	14.4	19.0	-	100	-	50	50	-	-	100
F7	Feeding of learners in the secondary schools can be handled better by the private sector	42.8	14.3	19.0	14.2	9.5	100	-	100	-	-	-	100
F8	Security in Government secondary schools is very inadequate	52.4	28.6	-	4.8	14.2	100	-	50	-	-	-	100
F9	Security of secondary schools under PPPs should be handled by the private sector	52.4	23.8	9.5	9.5	4.8	100	-	100	-	-	-	100
F10	The provision of computers in secondary schools under PPPs should be left to the private sector	33.3	28.6	14.3	23.8	-	100	-	50	25	-	25	100
F11	The maintenance of computers in secondary schools should be handled by the private sector organisation under PPPs	47.6	38.1	9.5	4.8	-	100	-	75	25	-	-	100

Entries in percentages

Key: SA = Strongly Agree;   A = Agree; N = Neutral;   D = Disagree   and
SD = Strongly Disagree

To a large extent, the respondents believed that the ancillary services should be delivered by organisations that specialise in them in order to deliver quality

services. This, according to Fitzgerald and Melvin (2002:120), is a means of delivering effective support for the core business activities and it is associated with an effective and efficient response to the demands of a modern business environment.

It would also be informative to know what the secondary school heads preferred between PPPs and the status quo in the provision of secondary education. The analysis of such views is the focus of the section that follows.

7.2.1.9 Preference between PPPs and Status quo

The last section of the questionnaire sought to determine the views of the empirical research subjects on the extent of their preference between the provision of secondary education through PPPs and the maintenance of the status quo. Whereas the majority of the respondents did not support the view that secondary education should be provided through PPPs (G1), neither did they disagree with it. Only 35.4 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary schools did not agree with this view, 23.7 percent were neutral and collectively 42.9 percent either agreed or strongly agreed. From the private sector, only 50 percent of the respondents agreed that secondary education should be delivered through PPPs (G1) whilst the other 50 percent remained neutral. Collectively more respondents however, supported this view compared to those who did not support it which is significant. In addition, the statement that new secondary schools should be built through PPPs (G4) was well supported to the extent that collectively 76.2 percent of the respondents from the public sector strongly agreed and agreed with the statement while collectively 50 percent of the respondents from the private sector strongly agreed and agreed with statement G4, the rest of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools remained neutral.

One of the shortcomings of the public sector in Botswana is that it takes a long time for maintenance work to be undertaken in Government secondary schools (G5). In this regard, collectively 95.2 percent of the respondents from the public

sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with this statement (G5) whilst collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed with the same statement. In general the research population preferred PPPs to exclusive public sector functionality in the delivery of certain secondary school related services. As far as the public sector secondary school heads are concerned, collectively 81 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector can do better school maintenance work (G6), collectively 81 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector organisations take a shorter time to complete projects when compared to those in the public sector, and collectively 76.1 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that if PPPs can be introduced in the provision of secondary education more employment can be created in the Gaborone City area (G3). As far as the private sector secondary school heads are concerned, collectively 100 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector can do better school maintenance work (G6), 100 percent of the respondents agreed that the private sector organisations take a shorter time to complete projects when compared to those in the public sector and collectively 100 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that if PPPS can be introduced in the provision of secondary education more employment can be created in the Gaborone City area (G3).

Notwithstanding the preference for the private sector's delivery of certain services as expressed above, the research population is not equally decisive in its preference for the private sector to take over the management of secondary schools under PPPs arrangement (G7). In this regard, collectively only 47.6 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector organisations should take over the management of secondary schools under PPPs arrangement (G7), 23.8 percent of them are neutral whilst collectively 28.6 percent of the respondents either strongly disagreed or disagreed with the same statement (G7). As far as the private secondary school heads are concerned, collectively 50 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed that the private sector organisations

should take over the management of secondary schools under PPPs arrangement, 25 percent of them are neutral whilst the remaining 25 percent disagreed with the statement.

Table 7.10: Preference between the provision of secondary education by the Government of Botswana (current situation) and through PPPs

	Statement	Public Sector Secondary School Heads						Private Sector Secondary School Heads					
		SA	A	N	D	SD	Total	SA	A	N	D	SD	Total
G1	Secondary education should be delivered through PPPs	28.6	14.3	23.7	28.6	4.8	100	-	50	50	-	-	100
G2	The private sector organisations take a shorter time to complete projects when compared to those in the public sector	52.4	28.6	14.2	4.8	-	100	-	100	-	-	-	100
G3	If PPPs can be introduced in the provision of secondary education more employment can be created in the GC area	19.0	57.1	23.9	-	-	100	25	75	-	-	-	100
G4	New secondary schools should be built through PPPs	28.6	47.6	4.8	19.0	-	100	25	25	50	-	-	100
G5	It takes a long time for maintenance work to be undertaken in Government secondary schools	71.4	23.8	-	-	4.8	100	50	50	-	-	-	100
G6	The private sector can do a better school maintenance work	52.4	28.6	14.2	4.8	-	100	25	75	-	-	-	100
G7	The private sector organisations should take over the management of secondary school under PPPs arrangement	19.0	28.6	23.8	23.8	4.8	100	25	25	25	25	-	100
G8	Private organisations are not very honest entities to be entrusted with any aspect of the provision of secondary education in the area	4.8	4.8	33.3	33.3	23.8	100	25	25	25	25	-	100
G9	The private sector will normally want to exploit the public sector	4.8	19.0	23.8	38.1	14.3	100	-	-	25	25	50	100
G10	With the appropriate monitoring mechanisms in place, the private sector resources should be harnessed to enhance the provision of secondary education in the area	33.3	61.9	4.8	-	-	100	25	75	-	-	-	100

Entries in percentages

Key: SA = Strongly Agree;   A = Agree; N = Neutral;   D = Disagree   and
SD = Strongly Disagree

The respondents generally support the view that with the appropriate monitoring mechanisms in place, the private sector resources should be harnessed to enhance the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area (G10). To this extent, collectively 95.2 percent of the respondents from public sector either agreed or strongly agreed with the statement (G10) and collectively 100 percent of the respondents from the private sector secondary schools either strongly agreed or agreed with this view. The respondents did not quite believe that private sector organisations are not very honest entities to be entrusted with any aspects of the provision of secondary education (G8) to the extent that collectively 57.1 percent of the respondents from the public sector secondary school heads strongly disagreed and disagreed with the statement (G8), while 33.3 percent of them remained neutral. As far as the private sector secondary school heads are concerned, collectively 50 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed, 25 percent remained neutral whilst the other 25 percent disagreed with the statement G8. In addition, the empirical research population did not quite believe that the private sector organisations will normally want to exploit the public sector (G9). As far as the public sector secondary school heads are concerned for example, collectively 52.4 percent of the respondents strongly disagreed and disagreed that the private sector will normally want to exploit the public sector and 23.8 percent of them remained neutral whilst collectively only 23.8 percent of the respondents either agreed or strongly agreed with the statement (G9).

In general, the respondents have embraced the idea that secondary education can be delivered through PPP arrangements. Although the respondents did not overwhelmingly support the statement that secondary education should be delivered through PPPs (G1), their positive reaction in favour of secondary education through PPPs in statements G2 to G10 showed the contrary. The lack of overwhelming support for the statement G1 can, in view of their favourable support for secondary education through PPPs in the statement G2 to G10, probably be attributed to the "fear of the unknown" factor. The respondents' embracement of the idea that the provision of secondary education through

PPPs is reminiscent of the views expressed by Quiggin in Grimsey (2002:247) that there are no functions of the public sector that cannot be performed by the private sector.

In addition to the use of a questionnaire, observation, as a data collecting technique, was also used in this study and the analysis thereof follows in the next section.

7.2.2 Data from observation

This section presents the analysis of data from the observation exercise. In this context, observation entails watching schools in operation and, where possible, asking questions to clarify issues surrounding some school functions (leedy & Ormrod 2005:146) which for purposes of this study were but not limited to: feeding of learners; maintenance of school buildings; cleaning; and school furniture which constituted the observation schedule. In this exercise, five secondary schools were observed, namely two junior and two senior public secondary schools and a private secondary school all in the area of study.

7.2.2.1 Feeding of learners

All the five secondary schools observed provided the 1000 hours tea and 1300 hours lunch to their learners and the same schools had dining halls. However, learners in the junior public secondary schools were required to bring their cups, plates and cutlery to schools for feeding purposes. In the public senior secondary schools and the private secondary school, utensils referred to above were provided by the schools and therefore learners did not have to bring them to school.

Although the secondary schools observed had dining halls, learners in the public schools, junior and senior, took their meals alfresco albeit under the supervision of their teachers. It must be accepted that providing learners with something to eat whilst at school is a good thing but to require them to bring

utensils to school has the propensity to compromise the quality of their schooling. Feeding learners in the open air also compromises the quality of their schooling and could put their health at risk. On the other hand learners in the private secondary school took their food in the dining hall and in a decent manner.

7.2.2.2 School furniture

In the public secondary schools a lot of broken furniture, chairs and desks, which could be repaired and put to use was a common sight. Some of the furniture had actually lost its original colour due to prolonged exposure to inclement weather. In the private sector secondary schools observed, this state of affairs did not appear to exist at all. There was no evidence of wastage of furniture or its movement, by the learners, between lessons as it was found to be the case with the public sector secondary schools observed. The situation in public sector secondary schools seems to suggest that such furniture was not viewed, by the school management, as waste of public resources. In one of the junior secondary schools some learners were observed carrying chairs from one classroom to the other when changing lessons and this state of affairs seems to suggest that facility management was not the best in these schools, a situation that further compromised the quality of schooling. Warner and Kelly (1994:132) suggest the implementation of a value-adding facility management strategy in secondary schools, which strategy could include facility management by organisations that have the requisite skills and/or expertise. The need for such a strategy derives from the fact that furniture and equipment have a significant influence in educational outcomes and should therefore be given the necessary attention (Ray, Hack & Candoli 2001:288) in order to enhance the quality of the provision of, in this context, secondary education.

7.2.2.3 School cleaning

Learners in the public secondary schools, both junior and senior, cleaned their classrooms and other areas of the schools such as the school toilets. In the private secondary school under observation, these tasks were carried out by people employed to perform them. It can also be argued that engaging learners in tasks such as toilet cleaning could be some of the things that could make schooling in public secondary schools less attractive. One may argue that for learners to be required to perform these tasks is antiquated and unnecessarily conservative. Interestingly, one of the teachers made a comment to the effect that she hated seeing learners cleaning toilets and was very much against supervising such duties. She further stated that she did not think that there was any parent who would refuse to pay P5 per month for the school authorities to engage private cleaners or to employ some people to perform these tasks and deliver the learners from such mundane engagements. Such comments are in consonant with the central theme of this study, improving the quality of the provision of secondary education through the use of PPPs.

The public secondary schools' grounds appeared ordinary, dull and devoid of attempts to beautify them. In the private secondary schools there was evidently a deliberate commitment towards the beautification of the school grounds with trees planted and nicely shaped and scenic. All this could enhance the quality of the schools' atmosphere with some measure of aesthetic fulfillment which was not the case in the public secondary schools visited.

School buildings are critical in the provision of secondary education in Botswana but also in the creation of a positive school environment (Warner & Kelly 1994:132; Crampton & Thompson 2003:19). The maintenance of school buildings was part of the observation schedule the results of which follow in the next section.

7.2.2.4 Maintenance of school buildings

All four public secondary schools had experienced some expansion at least in terms of additional buildings. The new buildings have been built with face brick that was not used in the old ones and therefore there was a clear distinction between the new and old buildings. The new buildings looked good whilst the old ones looked even older and did not appear to have been renovated in the recent past. From the structural point of view, it appeared as if there were two secondary schools in one. It has been argued earlier (see section 5.4.3) that the use of PPPs could include renovating old school buildings so that they could also look better and, hopefully, be attractive to both learners and their parents. Improving the quality of school environment and its buildings could add value to the quality of schooling and, in this context, the quality of the provision of secondary education or the general ethos thereof (Grant & Littlejohn 2001:6). In a study conducted by Cash (Crampton & Thompson 2003:215), the performance of schools whose physical environment was rated 'substandard' was lower than that of schools whose physical environment was rated 'above standard'. This suggests the pedagogic value of the school environment and the extent to which the physical appearance of schools is likely to contribute towards the quality of schooling.

In some of the new buildings, some broken windows were noticeable but for how long they had been broken could not be established. However, it is possible that had the schools been operated under PPPs, and the facility management being handled by the private sector, such defects would have been attended to expeditiously especially if it was a requirement to do so.

The situation in the private sector secondary schools was quite different to the extent that the school buildings were found to be immaculate. In addition, to well maintained buildings, school grounds were also kept clean with trees nicely pruned and regularly watered as they were quite green and lively. The physical appearance of the private sector secondary schools gave the

impression that it was deliberately meant to be attractive in order to serve, among others, as a marketing tool.

What happens in and around the school buildings can affect the quality of the provision of secondary education. Whereas corporal punishment was not in the observation schedule, it was observed being applied on the learners and was noted for inclusion in the observation data primarily because of the possible impact it could have on the quality of schooling.

7.2.2.5 Corporal punishment

Corporal punishment is the use of force to inflict physical pain (Hyman 2007:819). This form of punishment was observed to be common in the public secondary schools in the Gaborone City area but was not observed in the private secondary schools. Asked why they were using corporal punishment, one junior secondary school head noted that it was permissible by law and it was the language a lot of the learners in secondary schools understood better. However, various studies on the effects of corporal punishment could not find support for the view that schools which applied it vigorously produced the best behaviour; on the contrary, schools which often vigorously used corporal punishment were found to be inundated with antisocial behaviour and vandalism (Docking 1980:230; Osler 2003:145). Whereas corporal punishment may be effective in temporarily suppressing antisocial behaviour, it does not teach better behaviour. It is often argued that eliminating corporal punishment does not increase misbehaviour in schools (Hyman 2007:820) particularly where a guidance and counseling progamme is in place.

Corporal punishment does not enhance the self esteem of the learners, one of the things that schools aim to achieve (Adeyinka & Major 2006:10; Lemmer 1999:3; Fields & Boesser 2002:12). Instead, it lowers the dignity and self esteem of the learners and induces some measure of violence in them (Loreman, Deppeler & Harvey 2005:204). Certainly, misbehaviour in schools is rife (Lemmer 1999:89) and, in some cases, punishment may have to be applied

but not necessarily corporal punishment because there are many other forms of punishment that can be used over and above guidance and counseling.

According to Modise (2008:2), a learner in one of the junior secondary schools in Botswana was, in 2007, given 5 lashes, together with many others, because of having been making noise during afternoon studies (see section 7.2.2.6 below). The punishment was so excessive to the extent that the learner in question still (2008) can not hold a pen with his right hand because it was still swollen between his index finger and the thumb. Molefe, Pansiri and Weeks (2007:13) observed that corporal punishment had, for a long time, been used in Botswana Government primary and secondary schools but with very limited monitoring of its use, often times it has been used indiscriminately. On the other hand, Hyman (2007:819) argues that injuries resulting from corporal punishment in schools could be extremely damaging physically and psychologically and therefore, does not find its value in schools. In actuality, the use of corporal punishment is no longer of any discernible value in the context of the provision of secondary education and therefore should be avoided at all costs in the school system. Its use compromises the quality of the provision of secondary education in Botswana (Modise 2008:2; Molefe *et al* 2007:13).

7.2.2.6 Afternoon studies

The Botswana Government secondary schools observed had their classes begin at around 0700 hours up to 1300 hours when they break for lunch. After lunch the schools' programme commences around 1430 hours, and this is afternoon studies where learners go to their classrooms and engage in independent studies or do assignments. Two to three teachers supervise the whole school during afternoon studies whilst the learners are by themselves in their classrooms. It was observed that learners did not take afternoon studies seriously as most of them were actually playing during the afternoon studies even though teachers on duty brandished sticks around classrooms. Very few, if any, learners benefited from the afternoon studies. At the end of afternoon

studies most learners go home whilst a few of them remain either for sporting activities or to clean classrooms and toilets. It has been noted earlier (see section 5.3.2.4) that learners in the Botswana Government secondary schools were provided with meals including lunch so that they could remain at school and continue with the afternoon school programme. It can be assumed that the purpose of providing lunch to secondary school learners and expecting them to be in school in the afternoons is predicated on the assumption that they will be engaged in some meaningful experiences that enhance their personal development (Pollitt & Bouckaert 1995:33). If learners do not benefit from the afternoon studies, or any other programme, then the psychological and financial costs of keeping learners in schools at the material time can be hardly justified. The management of secondary schools ought to take counsel from the fact that scarce public economic resources should be expended where it can justified that such an expenditure contributes meaningfully towards the improvement of the general welfare of the people (Gildenhuys 1997:57; Pillott & Bouckaert 1995:33; Try & Radnor 2007:658).

The results of the observation exercise seem to confirm that schools are, to a large extent, conservative organisations even though they exist and function within an ever changing environment. In particular, the results show that secondary schools in the Gaborone City area still function the old fashioned way such as cleaning of toilets by learners, the use of corporal punishment, and afternoon studies. Secondary schools continue to perform a myriad of functions some of which can be better handled by the private sector organisations with the requisite expertise. It was clear that feeding of learners, cleaning of schools, maintenance of school furniture and buildings were but some of the functions, in the public secondary schools, that greatly needed to be improved in the quest to enhance the quality of schooling for the learners.

The intention is not to cast aspersion on the secondary school afternoon programmes but rather to point out that such programmes should have clear goals and be frequently evaluated to ensure that they actually add value to the learners' experiences and justify the costs that are linked to such programmes

(Parson 1994:2; Hoy, Bayne-Jardine & Wood 2000:75). Afternoon school programmes should also be delivered within a quality assurance framework in order to enhance the benefits that learners could derive from such programmes (Pollitt Bouckaert 1995:33; Try & Radnor 2007:658). If this can be done, then it would be an addition to the improvement of the quality of the provision of secondary education.

As far as the private sector secondary schools are concerned, none of the four secondary schools observed have afternoon studies. Three of them have afternoon lessons whilst the fourth secondary school releases the learners at lunch time when the formal school programme comes to an end. Without going into the merits and demerits of each of the two arrangements, all the private sector secondary schools in the study do not waste time with afternoon studies in the manner explained in the context of the public sector secondary schools in Botswana.

It is commonly argued that one of the problems that often bedevil the public sector is the scarcity of resources, the availability of limited means to address identified unlimited social needs (Hagen & Linddle 2007:326; Try & Radnor 2007:658). It therefore makes very little, if any, economic sense to underutilise or even waste the scarce resources that are availed to the public sector organisations at the expense of the quality of delivery of services to the populace (Pollitt & Bouckaert 1995:33). This observation is in consonant with the views expressed by Box (2004:200) that public sector organisations were often wasteful and sometimes beyond citizen control. However, it is incumbent upon public sector managers to continuously and critically seek strategies to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of their organisations with a view to continuously improve the quality of public service delivery and act as agents of change (Ströh 2001:108; Hagen & Linddle 2007:330).

Over and above the observation exercise, interviews were also conducted to further illuminate the realities of the provision of secondary education in the

geographical area of study. The results of this exercise are presented and analysed below.

7.2.3 Data from interviews

The purpose of this section of the empirical study was to collect views from senior officials in the Department of Secondary Education in Botswana on the possibility of providing secondary education through PPPs especially in the Gaborone City area.

The perception of the senior officials referred to above was that the Junior Certificate curriculum was broad based and therefore provided a basis for a variety of further learning opportunities including vocational training. However, for learners who could neither go for vocational training nor proceed to senior secondary schools, the junior certificate is of very little benefit in terms of their meaningful participation in the economy of their country. The implication of this view is that as far as possible, all the junior secondary school leavers need to be engaged in some form of organised learning or training in order for them to be able to gainfully participate in the economy of their country. However, the officials admitted that currently (2008) a lot of these young people were not engaged because of inadequate places in both vocational and senior secondary schools. The Government of Botswana was said to be well disposed towards having every learner to attend school until the end of secondary education. Notwithstanding this disposition, the respondents contended that the Government of Botswana was not yet in a position to have enough places for every junior secondary school leaver in either vocational or senior secondary schools due to budgetary constraints. This limitation is not unique to Botswana but rather it is a common feature of the public sector in general albeit more pronounced in developing countries (Jonker 2001:261; Deakin 2002:137; Hanss 2001:394). The aforementioned limitation is part of the litany that has motivated the use of PPPs in the provision of public infrastructure and the concomitant services in general and secondary education in particular (Kerr 2003:11; Grimshaw 2002:476).

It was established that the Government of Botswana had plans to increase enrolment at senior secondary level but there were no plans for the universalisation of education at the same level. Plans to increase enrolment in secondary education in general and senior secondary schools in particular were said to include extending the double shift programme that the officers said was piloted in 2007. May be this arrangement will partly address the concern raised earlier (see section 5.3.1.3) that in a year school buildings were not being used for a lot of time. However innovative this strategy may seem to be, it also confirms the financial resource limitation just referred to above. If indeed the secondary school afternoon programme referred to earlier (see section 7.2.2.6) was well conceived, then the double shift will eliminate it and perhaps further compromise the quality of schooling. Instead of cutting on educational services due to resource constraints, it could be prudent to harness the prodigious private sector resources through PPP arrangement and provide more and better quality services to the public (Nisar 2007:147; Jamali 2004:416; Nzimakwe 2006:48).

The officials acknowledged that the concept of PPPs was new in Botswana to the extent that the Government was still trying to assimilate it into its structures and processes. It was also revealed that the Government of Botswana was planning to build a new university through PPPs and this has been confirmed by the Minister of Education Jacob Nkate (2007:5). It has also been noted that there was talk in the same Ministry about the possibility of using, where appropriate, PPPs in the provision of secondary education. The officials admitted that there were some functions in secondary schools that could be better performed by the private sector and the following were cited: maintenance, feeding of learners, security, cleaning, and counseling. They observed that these services were being delivered by people who are not qualified to do them and therefore were of low quality. Closely allied to these views, Warner and Kelly (1994:119) suggest that secondary schools perform many ancillary functions that were areas of increasingly specific expertise. This further suggests that such functions should be performed by organisations that

specialise in them so that they could be delivered in a truly value-adding framework.

7.3 LIMITATION OF THE EMPIRICAL STUDY

An important limitation of the empirical study was the fact that the concept of PPPs was still new to a lot of the subjects of the study. This is evidenced by a high percentage of respondents who were undecided on certain statements. For example, the responses to statements F3, F4 and G1 are classic examples of respondents being somewhat undecided in their opinion on the statements; "the management of secondary schools under PPPs should remain under the Government school heads", "the private sector should build and maintain schools under PPPs" and "secondary education should be delivered through PPPs" respectively. It is nevertheless hoped that the reliability and validity of the empirical research have not been compromised since the study did not delve into the intricacies of PPPs but the aspects thereof which were relevant to the more familiar issues of the management of secondary education in the Gaborone City area.

7.4 VALUE ASSESSMENT OF EMPIRICAL RESEARCH FINDINGS

It has been observed in chapter six (see section 6.2) that the purpose of a research exercise is, among others, to discover new knowledge and, in some cases, to provide solutions to problems that bedevil mankind. For the purpose of a research exercise to be achieved, its findings must be realistic and meaningful at least from the point of view of a research community. The purpose of this section, therefore, is to analyse the meaning of the empirical research findings with respect to the research problem and, to some extent, the concomitant research questions. The study revolved around the use of PPPs in the provision of public services with specific focus on secondary education in the Gaborone City area. Consequently, the value assessment is undertaken in the context of the research problem.

It should be noted, at the outset, that the study has confirmed that the research problem was genuine and realistic as it is evident in table 7.4 that collectively 100 percent of the respondents in the two groups strongly agreed and agreed that there was a need to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education in the public secondary schools in Botswana. The study is therefore justified especially if one takes into account the significance of education as demonstrated in chapter four (see section 4.4) where both personal and societal benefits are explained. In support of the need to improve the provision of secondary education several problems have been identified in Botswana secondary education subsystem.

One of the problems that the study has confirmed is that the number of secondary schools in the country is not enough especially at senior secondary school level and this has resulted in many junior secondary school leavers not being accepted in the available senior secondary schools. Notwithstanding this state of affairs, the research population has supported the view that every learner need to proceed with his or her education up to the end of senior secondary education. This view is predicated on the conviction of the research population that the Botswana Junior Certificate was no longer adequate, on its own, for one to meaningfully participate in the economy of the country. Consequently, the study has also supported the view that there was a need for more senior secondary schools to be built in the Gaborone City area in order to cope with the demand for education at this level which the research population felt was high.

The inadequacy of secondary schools has also resulted in big class sizes which the respondents viewed as compromising the quality of secondary education as teachers cannot give learners the necessary individual attention. All these issues need to be addressed in an attempt to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education.

Another problem, which has been confirmed by the empirical study, is that with the current system of delivery of secondary education, it takes too long, if it ever happens, for maintenance work to be undertaken in the existing

secondary schools. Poor school maintenance work can easily culminate in a school environment that does not sufficiently stimulate learning (Crampton & Thompson 2003:215). Such a school environment may not add much value to the learners' experiences and therefore compromise the quality of their schooling. The study further established that the quality of the provision of secondary education in the public sector secondary schools was lower than that of the private sector secondary schools in the same area. As a result, people who have the means tend to prefer sending their children to private secondary schools with the understanding that they will get better education. However, every child deserves the best possible education regardless of his or her family background hence the need to improve the quality of the provision of the public sector secondary school education where the majority of children attend including those from the disadvantaged families.

Learners in the public sector secondary schools in Botswana are still being used to clean the school including classrooms and toilets, which practice the study has found to be outdated and compromising the quality of schooling as well as the health of the learners. The other health related problem, which has also been confirmed by the study, is that learners' meals in the public sector secondary schools are provided in-house by people who do not specialize in the delivery of such services. The empirical study has also found that corporal punishment was still prevalent and legally provided for in the public sector secondary schools yet some other research has found that this form of punishment had the propensity to compromise the dignity of the learners and also induce violent tendencies in them (Loreman *et al* 2005:204; Adeyinka & Major 2006:10).

It should be noted that the aforementioned shortcomings have also been identified in chapter five (see section 5.3.2.4). Consequently, the concurrence between the conceptual analysis and the empirical research findings reaffirms the authenticity of the research problem as the kernel of the study.

It has been argued in chapters three and five (see sections 3.3.6.2 & 5.4.2) that PPPs can be used to bolster the public sector's capacity to enhance the quality of delivery of public services which, in this context, is the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. Whereas these views have been expressed by numerous authors for example (Smith 2000:128; Nzimakwe 2006:48; Nisar 2007:147), the respondents have, to a large extent, concurred with such sentiments. For examples, in table 7.4, the respondents have agreed that through effective use of PPPs more secondary schools can be built in the Gaborone City area; in table 7.6 it is shown that the respondents agreed that through the use of PPPs more facilities can be made available to secondary education and it is shown in table 7.10 that the respondents agreed that the private sector organisations can do better school maintenance work. All this can go a long way in advancing the quality of the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. It is even more critical that the private sector is engaged, through PPPs, in the provision of secondary education in the area because although the Government of Botswana would like to have a 100 percent transition rate from junior to senior secondary schools (see section 4.5.3), there are not enough public sector resources to achieve this transition rate. Consequently, the respondents agreed that there was no government plan or strategy to achieve this transition rate as shown in table 7.4 (A4).

The research findings clearly suggest that PPPs in the delivery of secondary education can have some positive impact on its quality. As a result of more facilities being made available through PPPs, more if not all, junior secondary school leavers could be admitted in senior secondary schools than before, a point that has been supported by the respondents. This is in consonant with the views expressed earlier (see section 3.3.6.2) that PPPs can enhance the scope and quality of public services. In addition, the empirical research findings point to the fact that with PPPs in the provision of secondary education, school heads can have more time to devote to strategic issues pertaining to the core functions of secondary schools. Focusing on more strategic issues by the secondary school heads could enhance the quality of the

management of such schools. Besides, the research population expressed the view that secondary school heads stand a chance to improve their managerial efficiency through PPPs. This is very important to the extent that the success of an organisation depends, to a large measure, on its dynamic and effective leadership (Burnes 1996:346)

The empirical study has further demonstrated that through PPPs in the delivery of secondary education, the public sector employees can learn, from the private sector employees, certain attributes that can enhance the quality of the delivery of educational services in the secondary schools in question. The respondents also agreed that the Government employees can learn to be efficient and, more importantly, the secondary school heads can also learn entrepreneurial skills and, in general, PPPs could enable the public sector secondary schools to benefit from the commercial dynamism of the private sector. As stated in chapter three (see section 3.3.4.2) the private sector organisations thrive on being responsive to the needs of their customers. Consequently, the quality of the delivery of secondary education can be improved significantly if the learners can be handled with respect even if they are not coping with the delivery of instructional material. Handling the learners with respect is likely to enhance their self confidence and emotional development which are some of the crucial manifestations of a sound educative process (Loreman *et al* 2005:204).

The additional value of PPPs that has been acknowledged by the research population is that embracing this arrangement could create investment opportunities for the private sector organisations as well as employment for the general public. If more secondary schools can be built, more teachers and ancillary staff can be employed to serve in these schools and therefore PPPs have the capacity to boost economic activities in addition to enhancing public service delivery.

The research population is generally in agreement with the idea that for PPPs in the delivery of public services to be successful certain conditions must exist,

which conditions are referred to earlier (see section 3.4) as the antecedents of successful PPPs. One of the characteristics of public services is that they are delivered within a national legislative framework (Farnham & Horton 1999:36). The respondents are in concurrence with the necessity of the legislative framework to facilitate the implementation of PPPs in the delivery of public services. In addition, the respondents are strongly convinced that there is a need for political leadership in support for PPPs in the country. This is quite in order given that the civil servants are accountable to political office bearers who, in a parliamentary democracy, are accountable to parliament (Lane 2005:43; Cloete 2006:69). The study has also supported the idea that a regulatory mechanism should be in place to safeguard the interests of the partners. Moreover, the study has also found that property rights need to be assured by effective and incorruptible law enforcement coupled with the existence of a judicial system that is perceived to be effective and impartial.

One of the most fundamental antecedents of successful PPPs is that both partners (public and private) need to be convinced that they will benefit from the partnerships (Wettenhall 2007:395; Becker & Patterson 2005:125) and this point has been supported by this study. In fact, none of the partners can be willing to participate in a partnership that is not beneficial in some way. Although the public sector partner will normally act as the custodian of the public interest, the general public will nonetheless need to be convinced that the learners will be better off with the new arrangement than with the status quo. This point has also been established in this study. In addition, the study has also supported the idea that there should be some quality assurance framework with which to guide and monitor the operations of secondary schools under PPPs. Such a framework could enhance the confidence that the public may have in the delivery of secondary education through PPPs.

The study has identified areas in the public sector secondary schools where private sector organisations can participate in PPP arrangements in an attempt to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education. The respondents supported the view that the private sector should build and

maintain new secondary schools under PPPs as well as renovating and maintaining the existing secondary schools under PPP arrangement. These views are very much in line with the problems identified in chapter five (see section 5.3.2.1) as well as the problems that are related to limited transition from junior to senior secondary schools (see section 4.5.3).

It may be added that other ancillary services such as security services, provision and maintenance of computers are viewed as functions that can be adequately handled by the private sector organisations that have the requisite expertise. However, the management of the secondary schools and the leadership of curriculum delivery under PPPs are preferred to be handled by the public sector. The respondents, in the context of the management of secondary schools and the curriculum delivery, demonstrate that they prefer the core functions of secondary schools to remain with the public sector which is very much consistent with the views expressed in chapter five (see section 5.4.6).

In general, the secondary school heads in the Gaborone City area concur with the view that PPPs can be used to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education. This conclusion derives from the responses of the respondents to the questionnaire in general and, in particular, to their responses to the statement G10. As far as the respondents from the public sector secondary school heads are concerned, for example, collectively 95.2 percent of them strongly agreed and agreed that with the appropriate monitoring mechanisms in place, the private sector resources should be harnessed to enhance the provision of secondary education in the area (G10). As far as the private sector secondary school heads are concerned, collectively 100 percent of the respondents strongly agreed and agreed with the statement G10.

7.5 CONCLUSION

This chapter presented the empirical research data and the analysis thereof, which data were on the views of both public and private secondary school heads in the Gaborone City area and the views of some of the officials of the Department of Secondary Education on the provision of secondary education through PPPs in the Gaborone City area. The analysis was of data collected using three different techniques, namely the use of a questionnaire, observation, and interviews. In general, the limitations of the Botswana public sector have been highlighted albeit in the context of the provision of secondary education. In addition, the need to improve the quality of the delivery of secondary education has been supported by the respondents. The study has confirmed that many junior secondary school leavers are not admitted to senior secondary schools due to limited spaces in such schools. Notwithstanding this state of affairs, the respondents agreed that junior certificate on its own was no longer adequate for one to advance in the modern, capital-intensive and technological economy, suggesting the need for every learner to proceed beyond this level of education.

Maintenance of the public sector secondary schools has been found to be taking too long to be performed leaving many secondary schools looking rather unsightly for a long time. Besides, many public sector secondary schools' environment has not been properly maintained and sometimes made worse by the piling of defective furniture which has not been repaired. On the same issues, the private sector secondary schools have been found to be far much better maintained with the schools' surroundings being attractive. Another problem that has been confirmed by the study is that class sizes are big in the public sector secondary schools and this state of affairs has the propensity to compromise the quality of education. The respondents expressed the opinion that the private sector secondary schools provide better education than their counterparts in the public sector to the extent that people with the wherewithal send their children to private secondary schools. The respondents also confirmed the view that in secondary schools there were certain functions that

could be better performed by the private sector such as school maintenance, feeding school learners, cleaning, and security. All this is sufficient testimony to the perceived need to improve the quality of the delivery of secondary education.

The study has shown that whereas in the private sector secondary schools observed corporal punishment was not used and there were no afternoon studies, these were all part of the culture in the public sector secondary schools in the study yet there is no evidence that they add value to the learners' experiences.

Consequent to these limitations, the secondary school heads in the study generally viewed PPPs as a viable solution to some of the problems that bedevil the provision of public services in general and secondary education in particular. The empirical research population generally agreed that the use of PPPs in the Gaborone City area can help overcome some of the problems experience in the delivery of secondary education. For example, more secondary schools can be built to enable more, if not all, junior secondary school leavers to proceed to senior secondary schools and to reduce class sizes; maintenance of secondary schools can be improved as well as the general appearance of the schools; feeding of learners can be handled by people with the requisite expertise and thereby improving the quality of catering services; the management of secondary schools can be improved and such schools could benefit from the commercial dynamism of the private sector; secondary school heads can have more time devote to the core functions of the schools.

According to the respondents, employees of the public sector working hand in hand with the private sector staff could learn to be more efficient, the habits of handling customers well and the habits of avoiding wastage of resources. In addition, the public sector school heads could learn entrepreneurial skills. It was also the view of the school heads that certain antecedents for successful implementation of PPPs in the delivery of secondary education were necessary

such as the legislative framework, effective judicial system and law enforcement, support of political leadership and parents and the demand for secondary education. The study has shown that there was a lot that could be done to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area and PPPs could be deployed to facilitate this improvement.

Now that the empirical and contextual studies have provided answers to the research questions in chapter one (see section 1.4), the next chapter draws the entire study to an end by presenting the summary, conclusions and proposals.

CHAPTER 8

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND PROPOSALS

8.1 INTRODUCTION

The value of any scientific study should be reflected in the conclusions and proposals it culminates in, and these must be contextualized in terms of the research problem and/or research questions on which the study was based. The purpose of this last chapter is therefore to draw the study to its end by presenting a summary, a number of conclusions, and proposals derived from both the literature review and the empirical research findings. All this revolves around the provision of secondary education, in the Gaborone City area, through PPPs. Before presenting conclusions and proposals, a summary of the study is made in this chapter.

8.2 SUMMARY

The fundamental purpose of the public sector and the concomitant public administration is to improve the quality of life of the citizens by the provision of the necessary public services (Maserumule & Mathole 2006:220). However, the public sector is often under attack for a number of perceived shortcomings. In this regard, Hughes (1998:9) observed that governments in some countries were too large and therefore utilizing the scarce resources, albeit inefficiently, such governments were too large because they were involved in just too many activities. In general, the public confidence in the ability of government to carry out numerous tasks in an efficient and responsive manner is on the wane, necessitating a change in the way government business is conducted (Shafritz & Hyde 1997: ix). Since resources at the disposal of government in many developing countries like Botswana are limited, some services are therefore either provided inadequately or not provided at all (Farlam 2005:12; Try & Randor 2007:655). Because of its massiveness in some countries, the public sector is perceived to be not so responsive to the needs of the people and

therefore compromising the general welfare of the populace (Van Niekerk; Van der Waldt & Jonker 2001:243). The private sector on the other hand has resources that can be harnessed to complement those of the public sector in the provision of public services (Kelly 2000:134; Scharle 2002:228). As a result, the focus of this thesis is the use of PPPs in the provision of public infrastructure services with specific reference to secondary education in the Gaborone City area of Botswana.

8.2.1 The study

National economies can, to a large extent, be characterised in terms of the public sector organisations, private sector, and the non-governmental organisations (Box 2004:33). Whereas the public sector's orientation is public service delivery that is politically driven within a specific social, cultural and economic environment, the private sector is predominantly profit driven and functions under the auspices of market forces (Maserumule & Mathole 2006:220; Box 2004:33). All this suggests that the values of these two sectors are incongruous with each other. However, the main focus of the study was to determine the extent to which these two sectors could be harmonised, by way of PPPs, in the quest to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana. In particular, the intent was to establish whether the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the area in question could increase access to secondary schools especially senior secondary schools but also improve the quality of secondary schooling in general. The study was particularly motivated by the fact that there were many children in the geographical area of study who could not continue their education until the end of secondary education due to inadequate places in senior secondary schools. In some cases, the standard of secondary education in Botswana was perceived to be low to the extent that students who complete senior secondary education, even with very good results, could not be admitted into degree programmes in some universities such as those in South Africa. In Botswana, secondary education is, to a large extent, provided in the context of the public sector (Botswana Government 2003:272).

It should be appropriate at this stage to summurise the essential features of the public sector. Consequently, the nature of the public sector as conceived in this thesis is summarised below.

8.2.2 Public sector

The public sector has been viewed, in this study, as the totality of organisations that are politically established and maintained with a view to promoting the quality of citizens' life through the provision of public services (Hughes 1998:7). The sector serves to determine and pursue, among others, social and economic goals with a view to developing economic conditions and social services for the citizens to promote the common good (Van Niekerk *et al* 2001:242). As a result, the public sector performs a variety of functions which are embodied in at least three types of state, namely the guardian state; the redistributive state; and the productive state (Lane 1994:65; Musgrave *et al* 1989:6). On the other hand, Scharle (2002:228) is of the view that the public sector plays a significant role of attending to public interest, stewardship, and solidarity. To a large extent however, the public sector pursues government objectives that derive from the needs, demands, and legitimate expectations of the society through the legislative, executive, and judicial spheres of government authority (Ströh & Van der Westhuizen 1994:9; Savas 2000:21). In performing their functions, public sector organisations often find themselves in a dilemma of increasing demands for improved public services and the scarcity of resources that are necessary to provide these services. In line with these views, Box (2004:187) observes that it seems there is always more to be done in the public sector than there are resources available. This state of affairs suggests that government on its own can not meet the legitimate public expectations for more and improved public services (Maserumule & Mathole 2006:220; Jonker 2001:256; Trafford & Proctor 2006:123).

The situation revealed above can be exacerbated by what is often perceived to be public sector employees' little incentive to be innovative, control costs or

deliver effective and efficient services (Kettl 2006:2). All this seems to arise due, in part, to inadequate or lack of methods of performance measurement and lack of competition in the delivery of public services (Brynard 1992:45; Savas 2000:248; Rosanne 2002:118). In this regard, competition through private markets and the concomitant organisations in partnerships with the public sector, are assumed to offer solutions to a lot of these problems. According to Jonker (2001:263), it is the introduction of competition that creates incentives for efficiency, innovation and entrepreneurship in the face of the potential for profit making. Further more, competition empowers the citizens as they have the power of choice which creates incentives for the delivery of high quality services (Kettl 2006:2). According to Oldfield in Nzimakwe (2006:50), governments need to use the PPP arrangement because public funding alone is inadequate for providing the required public infrastructure and services. All this reaffirms the need for the public sector but also highlights the fact that public service demands often outstrip public sector resources. In one of the previous chapters (see section 4.5.3), this point has been established in the context of the provision of secondary education in Botswana. It has also been established that although the Government of Botswana would like every child to be educated until the end of secondary education, a lot of learners are currently (2007) unable to proceed to the end of secondary education due to resource constraints (Mogae 2004:20).

As stated earlier (see section 8.2) the public sector has, in many countries grown massively often under the auspices of the social-democratic ideology of 'the public interest' which is closely associated with the welfare-maximising state (Naschold & Otter 1996:14). The continued growth of the public sector is likely to culminate in its failure to effectively and efficiently deliver its multiple and often conflicting roles (Hughes 1998:9; Try *et al* 2007:655). The other weakness of the public sector that has been noticed is the fact that in some cases, public managers lack the correct understanding of the desired outcomes of certain policy areas which often results in insufficient focus on the core elements of the actual service to be delivered (Kroukamp 2004:38; Kelly 2000:134).

Try et al (2007:655) have also acknowledged the complexity of the modern-day public sector programmes which have limited and finite resources coupled with unlimited demands and delivered within the confines of a myriad of internal rules and regulations. Besides, public sector organisations are subject to legislative oversight processes which are often politically driven (Perry & Rainey 1998:185). All this limits the creativity and the scope of innovation in the public sector which, in this context, is secondary education.

The aforementioned problems that seem to bedevil the public sector motivate the imperatives of its transformation in order to cope with the intricacies of the kaleidoscope of the public needs. It is therefore necessary for the public sector to be more efficient and customer oriented; more flexible, innovative, and responsive to the needs of the citizens (Van Niekerk *et al* 2001:243). It may also be added that the public sector organisations and their managers should provide services and policy outcomes that add value to the society and therefore promote the general welfare of the populace (Hood 1998:23). One option to deal with the aforementioned shortcomings of the contemporary public sector is to redefine its role and have lean governments that are focused on their core business of governance and increase the role of markets in public service delivery (Brynard 1992:46; Pongsiri 2002:487). For their part, Trafford and Proctor (2006:119) argue that a contemporary government should pursue a modernising agenda which aims to "ensure that policy making is coordinated and strategic in nature; ensure that public service users, not providers, are the focus of attention, by matching services closely to people's lives; and deliver high-quality, efficient public services." Consequently, the central theme of this thesis is based on the assumption that some of the shortcomings of the public sector can be alleviated by working collaboratively with the private sector organisations.

It is essential therefore to establish, in the form of a summary, the nature of the private sector organisations before the collaborative work referred to above

can be summarised. As a result, a summary of the essential features of private organisations follows in the next section.

8.2.3 Private sector organisations

Private sector organisations are established primarily to serve the interests of the shareholders. Consequently, the *raison d'être* for the operations of the private sector organisations is to make profit and therefore such organisations aim at maximising returns on their investment, expand their business, and make inroads into domestic and foreign markets (Kerr 2003:11; Nisar 2007:150). However, in a competitive commercial environment, the private sector organisations tend to be motivated to respect and take heed of the needs and wishes of their customers and endeavour to provide them more efficiently and effectively than their competitors (Van Niekerk *et al* 2001:270). In order to achieve their objectives, the private sector organisations have developed a culture, and amassed professional knowledge as well as entrepreneurial skills to enhance the capacity to deliver their mandate (Muller 2003:1120). Some of these organisations have acquired the necessary capital goods to enhance their productivity in order to heighten their returns on investment. It can therefore be inferred that, to the extent possible, the profit seeking private sector organisations will cease to operate if prospects for making profit are perceived to be non-existent (Kerr 2003:11; Wettenhall 2007:393).

The private sector organisations are normally at the forefront of technological development, characterised by commercial dynamism, and often imbued with entrepreneurial skills all of which can be used to enhance the provision of public services (Scharle 2002:228; Maserumule & Mathole 2006:220). In the context of PPPs, the private sector encompasses multinational corporations, major companies as well as small, medium and micro-enterprises (Nzimakwe 2006:49). One of the significant reasons for engaging multinational corporations is that they often bring into the host country the much needed foreign direct investment as well as the skills that may be lacking in the

country. The provision of public infrastructure and/or services normally requires a variety of skills and professions to be harnessed in pursuit of a common objective (Wettenhall 2007:394; Grimsey & Lewis 2004:96). As a result, the private sector in the context of PPPs is often a consortium of different organisations (Coulson 2005:155).

Notwithstanding the virtues of the private sector organisations articulated above, some of these organisations tend to be associated with graft. As a result, a cloud of public disillusionment pervades the private sector and the management thereof is often regarded as being more tolerant of reprehensible practices and procedures (Punch, Kolthoff, Van der Vijver & Van Vliet 1993:145). In addition, Scharle (2002:228) observes that organisations in the private sector are often resistant to disclosure of their operations and market strategies. Further more, these organisations are not required by law to have their operations subjected to public scrutiny in order to identify undesirable behaviour (Blake 2004:14). In addition, Scharle (2002:228) observes that organisations in the private sector, especially, financial organisations are resistant to disclosure of some of their essential business activities. It should nonetheless, be noted that the functions of the public sector complement those of the private sector and more importantly, they are meant to correct the imperfections of the market forces in the market driven economies. To this extent, Porter (2003:14) observes that whereas these two sectors play different roles, they should nevertheless cooperate and work jointly in the national interest with a view to creating a productive economy of the country.

The salient features of organisations in the public and private sectors have been summarised and it is now appropriate to present a summary of the partnership between the two sectors. The nature and scope of public-private partnerships espoused for this thesis is the subject of the next section.

8.2.4 Public-private partnerships

PPPs entail the use of private sector capital and expertise in the provision of public infrastructure and/or services through a legal contract in which the private sector works collaboratively with the public sector organisation (Nisar 2007:147; Pongsiri 2002:489). According to Nzimakwe (2006:51), PPPs "are partnerships between the public sector and the private sector for the purposes of designing, planning, financing, constructing and/or operating projects that would traditionally be regarded as falling within the remit of the public sector." In view of the mismatch between the increasing demands for improved public services and available resources at the disposal of government, it is prudent to consider alternative strategies for delivering and improving public services. In this regard, the use of PPPs in the provision of public services is considered one viable option that is actually used in many countries to provide improved public services in a cost effective and sustainable manner (Smith 2000:128; Nzimakwe 2006:48). In this context, a PPP refers to a contractual agreement between a public sector organisation and one or more organisations from the private sector in order to jointly provide public infrastructure and/or services and share the gains as well as the losses over a period of time (Becker & Patterson 2005:125). As far as the services in question are concerned, it may be inferred that organisations in the two sectors form partnerships where the alternative, namely competition in the delivery of the same services does not seem to yield as much benefit (Wettenhall 2007:395). McMurray (2006:240) attributes partnerships to the perception that they are the only feasible strategy to achieving aligned intra-organisational and shared inter-organisational goals.

The contractual agreement in PPPs spells out the obligations of each of the partners, the way benefits will be determined but also constitutes a mechanism to dispense with conflicts that may arise between the parties to the partnership in the course of the joint effort (Pongsiri 2002:489; Kroukamp 2004:39). The PPP contracts normally stretch for a long period of up to forty or more years (Coulson 2005:158). Perhaps such contracts are made long enough to ensure

the continued provision of public services and to enable the private partner to make profitable returns on investment especially where user charges are the source of the revenue stream for the private partner (Maserumule & Mathole 2006:224). Part of the revenue may come from the public partner in which case a longer contract period may imply a smaller financial commitment on the part of the public sector.

PPPs present an opportunity for public and private sector organisations to move away from adversarial relationship to cooperation (Pongsiri 2002:489; Maserumule & Mathole 2006:220). In this regard, McMurray (2006:239) suggests that such cooperation is stimulated by mutual perceptions of the limits of adversarial relationships and the virtues of co-ordination and cooperation in order to tackle a major and indivisible problem that is beyond the capacity of any one organisation to solve alone. One of the salient features of PPPs is that risks are allocated to the organisation that is better placed to manage them. However, from the private sector's point of view, risks are regarded to be commercial products to the extent that they are priced (Grimsey & Lewis 2002:249; Mustafa 1999:64). Quite often, PPPs entail shared responsibility for the provision of infrastructure and/or services with the private sector taking up most of the major risks for commensurate rewards (Hurst & Reeves 2004:382).

Another salient feature of PPPs is that governments want to attract private sector's economic resources, management skills and innovation to the provision of infrastructure services the purpose of which is to achieve and demonstrate value for money for expenditure by the public sector organisations (Mustafa 1999:64; Smith 2000:129). However, by adopting PPPs, it is argued (http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/uk2003) that governments also hope that the management skills and financial acumen of the private sector will create value for money for the taxpayers. So the ultimate aim of this arrangement is to bolster the public sector's capacity to efficiently and effectively deliver its mandate without major additional expenses. In addition, innovation and creativity of the private sector are brought to bear upon the provision of the

public service and thereby improving the scope and quality thereof. By engaging the private sector in the provision of the public infrastructure services, government creates investment opportunities for the private sector and therefore stimulates more economic activities which could lead to much needed job creation. In this way, more and better public services can be delivered without much need for government borrowing. Most governments seem to be committed to budget-control policy in an attempt to minimize the public sector borrowing requirement and PPPs in infrastructure and service provision has become viable option (Glaister 1999:30; Hughes 1998:120).

Whereas PPPs have been observed to have several advantages related to enhancing the nature and scope of the delivery of public services, they also have certain shortcomings that should not be overlooked. The private sector is invariably under the influence of the profit motive and often views the public sector as having plenty of money from which to benefit (Blake 2004:15). This state of affairs can easily constitute a fertile ground for unethical practice in pursuit of profit maximization. In addition, a PPP is to a large extent a commercial undertaking in which the private sector has superior expertise compared to the public sector (Wettenhall 2007:394; Scharle 2002:228). It is therefore possible that through asymmetry of information on the dynamics of the PPP projects a more informed partner, the private sector organisation, can benefit unfairly from the same projects (Coulson 2005:157; Maserumule *et al* 2006:225; Pongsiri 2002:489). Some critics (http://www.news.bbc.com.uk 2003) view PPPs as a way of mortgaging the future and that in the long run the cost of paying the private sector can be more than it would cost the public sector if it exclusively delivered the projects.

Notwithstanding the possible shortcomings of PPPs, there are some conditions that are indispensable to the successful implementation of these partnerships (Blake 2004:15). As long term contracts, PPPs require rules and regulations that safeguard the interests of both the public and private organisations in the partnerships (Pongsiri 2002:489; Jamali 2004:419). Such rules and regulations can also constitute some conflict resolution mechanisms for the partnerships.

For the PPP project to stand a chance of being successful, the private partner must be selected on merit and therefore should be in possession of the requisite skills to cost effectively and efficiently deliver the required service. There must be transparency in the operations of the partnerships coupled with effective monitoring mechanism which should include a feedback system for the service users (Kroukamp 2004:39). Related to this viewpoint, Carley (2006:252) argues for a better citizen participation in order to take advantage of the benefits of citizen feedback on service delivery but also to enhance the democratic process that is vital for the contemporary communities. In the same vein, Peterson and Campbell (2001:24) suggest that schools should create mechanisms to ensure parental involvement and interaction. It is also important for the organisations in the partnerships to have good working relationships and realize synergy with a view to ensuring that the government's objectives are optimally realized (Nzimakwe 2006:53). In addition, for a PPP project to be successful, it must be preceded by a study to demonstrate its feasibility as a project of this nature.

8.2.5 Secondary education

Education has been viewed as the process of transmitting knowledge, skills and values to the posterity with a view to producing well-rounded individuals (Erasmus & Van Dyk 2003:2; Lemmer 2000:51). However, there are several ways of conceptualizing 'education' as exemplified by various philosophies of education. Philosophy of education is a tool that is used to critically examine and make a reflection on the nature of education with a view to suggesting an alternative system of education or confirm the existing one (Akinpelu 1981:5; Adeyinka & Major 2006:55). It has nevertheless been observed that education has both extrinsic and intrinsic aims. However, from the standpoint of public administration the educational services, like other public services, are provided for well conceived purposes related to the enhancement of the general welfare of the populace. Whereas authors like Barrow (1981:38) suggest that education is purely cognitive in that it essentially has to do with the mind, enhancing understanding and the capacity to discriminate, the view on

education that is espoused in this thesis goes beyond the cognitive frontiers. Education is a process that is intended to reserate each individual child to the complete and responsible fulfillment of the purpose of being human (Schalkwyk 1982:6). So education, viewed in this way, takes place in the context of a school and the broad functions thereof. A school performs a variety of functions which can be grouped into four broad categories, namely the transmission of knowledge and skills; transmission of norms and attitudes (character building); transmission of aesthetic and behavioural norms (good taste); and physical education and care (Castelyn *et al* 1981:31; Lemmer 2000:51).

At a secondary school level, a more utilitarian perspective of education is preferred to the extent that it is held responsible for socio-economic development at two levels, namely at the individual level and at the national level (Watson 2005:516; Smith 1993:27). In this regard, a nation's most precious and most powerful resource is its people and therefore empowering them with education is a *sine qua non* for a productive national workforce (Tan Sri 2007:3). Education contributes significantly to the development of a creative and innovative national human capital which is pivotal to the nation's innovation and socio-economic development. It is through education that the posterity is assisted to acquire critical and creative thinking skills, which skills can enable individuals to come up with solutions to problems that bedevil their communities and also perform more complicated tasks which can have a strong impact on the development of humankind and/or the improvement of the general welfare of the populace (Lemmer 2000:52; Singh 2003:85). In view of the foregoing, it makes sense to devote national resources to improving the quality of the provision of education which in this context is secondary education. In line with these views, Lissauer (2004:143) argues that raising the levels of educational attainment is important for a country's socio-economic development.

People are a nation's indispensable resource that is readily available and willing to be developed and make a meaningful contribution to the socio-economic

development of their nation (Tan Sri 2007:4). Education enhances the quality of the labour force through its contribution to the human capital (Singh 2003:84). In order to realistically improve the performance of a contemporary organisation, it is imperative that the quality of its human resources is improved as well as the quality and efficacy of the interaction between employees and the modern technologies (Goestsch & Davis 2006:165). The diffusion of new technologies in a country can also be enhanced by the level and quality of its education, such technologies can be a catalyst for economic development. As a result, it does not make any economic sense not to develop and empower people through education so that they can contribute towards the improvement of their communities. It has been shown earlier (see section 4.5.3) that in Botswana about fifty percent of the junior secondary school leavers do not proceed to senior secondary schools due to limited places in these schools. Unfortunately, the junior secondary education on its own is inadequate so much so that those who terminate schooling at this stage can hardly be employed nor can they be considered to be educated enough to meaningfully participate in the economy of their country. So these people remain undeveloped and instead of being national assets they become national liabilities as they are less productive and because they are often not engaged, they can easily venture in all sorts of antisocial behaviours.

Secondary education is a bridge between primary education and tertiary education yet very few students cross this bridge to pursue tertiary education. As a result, secondary education needs to be robust enough to prepare students for some form of employment. In particular, the secondary school curriculum should facilitate the acquisition of skills and knowledge that can assist the school leavers to market themselves for possible employment. In view of the fact that junior secondary education in Botswana is inadequate in terms of developing those who attend it, universal basic education should be redefined to encompass senior secondary education. This will certainly require a lot more resources and hence a justification for the provision of secondary education through PPPs, a matter that is epitomised below.

8.2.6 Provision of secondary education through PPPs

Notwithstanding the value of secondary education referred to above (see section 8.2.5), many learners in developing countries like Botswana are not able to receive the kind of education that is appropriate for achieving the ideal goals of providing education as indicated earlier (see section 4.3.3). Due to the limited resources, Botswana Government is constrained in its delivery of, among others, secondary education so much so that only 50.8 percent of junior secondary school leavers were able to be accepted in senior secondary schools (see section 4.5.3). In addition, Botswana Government secondary schools are not properly maintained and learners are used in cleaning schools as well as the toilets which is rather unhealthy for the learners. The quality of schooling in Botswana Government secondary schools is also compromised by facilities that are either insufficient or poorly managed by the people who do not have the appropriate expertise. For example, catering facilities for feeding learners, security services, and provision and maintenance of school computers are some of the areas where people without the requisite skills function. In some cases, for example, cleaning of schools and feeding of learners, teachers are expected to supervise the learners and the former hate these duties and this could contribute towards the poor quality of schooling.

In view of the shortcomings that have been identified in the delivery of secondary education in Botswana in general, it has been established that PPPs can improve the quality of the delivery of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana. Furthermore, it is argued that PPPs are increasingly being used in many countries to deliver public services and thereby increasing the efficiency and effectiveness of the public sector (Nzimakwe 2006:48). In particular, it has been established that PPPs can be used to provide public infrastructure and the concomitant services (Hurst & Reeves 2004:379). In this context, it is submitted that secondary school infrastructure and some of the attendant services can be provided and managed through a PPP arrangement. The empirical evidence suggests that, through PPPs, more secondary schools

can be built and properly maintained resulting in a better secondary school environment. In addition, more facilities can be made available to secondary schools through PPPs and this can enhance the quality of the provision of secondary education. Ancillary services such as feeding learners, security, maintenance of secondary schools, and cleaning of schools can be handled, through PPPs arrangement, by the private sector partners with the relevant expertise. This arrangement, therefore, can enhance the quality of the delivery of these services and, as a result thereof, the quality of schooling. The empirical research has established that the secondary school heads in the Gaborone City area were well disposed towards the provision of secondary education through PPPs to the extent that the private sector concentrated on the areas where the public sector has been rather wanting. These views were also upheld by the mandarins in the Department of Secondary Education who viewed PPPs as a viable option towards the improvement of the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area in Botswana.

It has also been established that PPPs in the provision of secondary education can help in reducing the workload of, among others, school heads as they would be focusing on fewer tasks. This could give them the opportunity to devote their time to the core functions of the secondary schools and, therefore, improve the effectiveness of these schools and thereby improving the quality of the delivery of education at this level. In addition, more secondary schools that could be built through PPPs could lead to smaller class sizes with the possibility of making teachers more effective in their delivery of instruction as they would be dealing with a more manageable number of learners.

The empirical evidence has also established that PPPs can improve the quality of the delivery of secondary education to the extent that public sector employees in secondary schools can learn, through the PPPs arrangement, certain habits and/or skills that can enhance their efficiency and effectiveness. Such skills could include but are not limited to handling customers well, avoiding wastage of scarce resources and some entrepreneurial skills. All these improvements can create a positive secondary school atmosphere which could

influence the learners and their parents to be positive towards these schools and the delivery of secondary education. All this is likely to result in reduced secondary school vandalism and improved levels of educational attainment and therefore making secondary schools deliver their services more meaningfully.

The PPP model that has been identified for the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area is the design, build, operate and finance (DBOF). In this model, the private sector would perform the aforementioned functions culminating in the provision of secondary school infrastructure and some of the attendant services. The model could, therefore, address a lot of the problems related to resource constraints that face the public sector, say in Botswana. In addition to financing the provision of the infrastructure, the private sector could also undertake facility management thereby leaving the public sector to focus on its core functions. The bundling of the DBOF functions for the private sector could incentivise creativity and innovation that can improve the quality and reduce maintenance operational costs (Grimsey & Lewis 2004:98). At the end of the contract, the infrastructure will revert to the public sector, the arrangement that guarantees the continued provision of the educational services beyond the contract period (Savas 2000:244).

8.3 CONCLUSIONS.

The provision of public infrastructure and the concomitant services is a major concern to governments due to the role such services play in the governments' broader socio-economic objectives. However, organisations in the public sector continue to face increasing demands for more and better public services whilst, at the same time, experiencing financial difficulties in acquiring the necessary resources to deliver such services. In general, the most pronounced failure of government is in the means to accomplish identified goals and such means could be resources and/or processes that are essential in optimally achieving the identified ends. Botswana is not an exception to this state of affairs where resource limitations have impinged upon the nature and scope of the provision

of, amongst others, secondary education. As a result, the study has assisted in coming up with conclusions that follow.

(a) Whereas the public sector does not have adequate resources to meet the demands and legitimate expectations of the public, the private sector is able to acquire resources that can complement those of the public sector in the provision of public services. A well managed and coordinated complementarity of resources in these sectors can yield synergy in the delivery of public services, which complementarily can take, amongst others, the form of PPPs.

(b) It is possible and necessary to build more secondary schools in the Gaborone City area through PPPs and equally possible to transfer the existing ones into a PPP arrangement so that they can be transformed into modern and more effective secondary schools.

(c) Existing secondary schools in the Gaborone City area are inadequately maintained and it takes a very long time before any serious maintenance work could be undertaken leaving these schools unsightly for a long period of time. Emergency repairs are seldom expeditiously undertaken and all this compromises the general ethos of the schools in question. Secondary school heads are concerned about this state of affairs which also creates an opportunity for PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the area.

(d) The strategy for providing public secondary education in the Gaborone City area, perhaps like in the rest of the country, is inadequate. Whereas the quality of junior secondary education is low, many junior secondary school leavers can not find places in the existing senior secondary schools in the area in question. The quality of junior secondary education in Botswana has been overtaken by events so much so that school leavers at this stage can hardly be employed nor can they be considered educated. A junior certificate on its own is now of very little value and very inadequate in terms of providing opportunities for its holders to meaningfully participate in the economy of their country. In addition, most of these school leavers are still very young (around 15 years old) for them to leave formal education and be expected to venture in any economically meaningful activities.

(e) People who have sufficient financial resources take their children to private secondary schools in the area of study which accentuates the inferiority of public secondary education as compared to that provided in the private secondary schools. Raising the levels of educational standards is very important for a country's socio-economic development. The more educated the people and, by association, the labour force the more able they are to perform complex tasks that can contribute towards the promotion of the general welfare of the populace.

(f) The Government of Botswana is willing to educate every child up to the end of secondary education but the limiting factor is the financial resources at the disposal of the Government. As a result, many learners can not progress up to the end of secondary education and therefore most of them do not have the appropriate skills to assist them to participate productively in the economic activities of their country. The involvement of the private sector in the form of PPPs is predicated on the assumption that it will contribute towards widening access and raising educational standards.

(g) Secondary school heads feel unduly overburdened by functions that can be better performed by the private sector organisations. They also recognise and appreciate the efficiency of the private sector, relative to the public sector organisations, in handling some of the non-instructional functions such as maintenance of school buildings, catering services to mention just a few.

(h) It is possible for the Government of Botswana to increase access and the quality of secondary education without shouldering much of the risks associated with such increases by embracing PPPs. It is therefore necessary and possible to provide cost effective and high quality educational services in secondary schools in the Gaborone City area. Besides, the secondary school heads in the area were positive about PPPs in the provision of secondary education as they believed that the private sector organisations could do a better job in areas such as those referred to above (see section 8.3.7).

In view of the conclusions made above, a number of proposals can therefore be made and these follow in the next section.

8.4 PROPOSALS

Botswana should change her strategy for the provision of secondary education in the quest for an educated nation. Education is for everyone and every child in Botswana should go to school up to the end of secondary education and that senior secondary education should be viewed as part of basic education in the country. Notwithstanding this position, resources in Botswana, just like in many other developing countries in Africa, are inelastic whilst demands for services continue to increase in scope and complexity (Jonker 2001:245; Try *et al* 2007:655). The limitations of the secondary education system in Gaborone City area can be attributed to the fact that the demand for educational services outstrips available Government resources. In view of the foregoing, the following proposals are made:

8.4.1 Educate the political leadership of the country

The political leadership of the country should be assisted to have an understanding of the problems that bedevil the education system in general and secondary education in particular. PPPs encroach politically established and managed public organisations and therefore it is essential that the political leadership of the country is educated on the fundamentals of PPPs and be convinced about the virtues of these polycentric arrangements. The support of the political leadership is very critical but it should be driven by a sound understanding of the intricacies of such partnerships (Carley 2006:255). However, any significant changes in the administration and management of the public sector (or part thereof) need to be legal and therefore provided for in the legislation (Brynard 1992:46; Hughes 1998:153). Such a provision can be better made if the legislative authority has a clear understanding of the issues involved in the conceived changes. It may be added that there should be public education to change people's mindset so that they may be well disposed towards the participation of the private sector in the provision of public services in the form of PPPs. The public's meaningful participation is very crucial in ensuring optimal service delivery through PPPs (Nzimakwe 2006:48). In the

end, the public should have confidence in PPPs but should also know how to channel their feedback to the public sector authorities (Kroukamp 2004:39; Kerr 2003:11).

8.4.2 Embrace PPPs in the provision of secondary education

It has been shown that it is quite possible to engage the private sector, in the form of partnerships with the public sector, in order to expand the scope and improve the quality of the provision of secondary education. The Government of Botswana should therefore embrace PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. However, because of the reliability of the empirical research undertaken in this study, the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education can be extended to other places in the country. Through PPPs the Government should build more secondary schools to enable every learner to attend school up to the end of the secondary school system. In addition, the existing secondary schools in the Gaborone City area should be incorporated into the PPP arrangement in order to be face lifted and be properly maintained. The PPP model that is deemed appropriate for this purpose is DBOF so that at the end of the contract period all the secondary schools under PPPs revert to the public sector. During the course of the contract, facility management, feeding of students, security services, computer provision and maintenance, the maintenance of school buildings, cleaning services should be handled by the private sector. The core business of teaching and management thereof should remain with the public sector.

Junior Certificate examinations take a lot of time and if every student can progress up to the end of secondary education then these examinations should be replaced by continuous assessment. This could allow more time to be devoted to teaching and learning. The standard of secondary education in Botswana should be raised and benchmarked against the best secondary education in Africa and beyond.

It would therefore be necessary for PPPs to be established within a politically supported national framework, which proposal follows.

8.4.3 Establish PPPs national policy framework

PPPs can be employed in many public service areas and as such the Government of Botswana should endeavour to establish a national policy framework that will drive PPPs in the country's public service. Without such a policy framework, it would be very difficult to have efficient and effective PPPs. It is further proposed that the Government of Botswana should also establish a PPP unit to oversee PPP projects in the entire public sector. It might appear costly to establish such a unit but in the long run it should pay the dividends. Such a unit should be given a broad mandate of assessing the appropriateness of the conceived projects for PPP arrangement in terms of, amongst others, economic viability, affordability and appropriateness. There must also be a mechanism, embodied in the unit, to assist the public sector partner to ensure that the private sector organisations deliver the services according to output specifications (Reeves 2003:166; Kroukamp 2004:38) under the auspices of the regulatory framework.

8.4.4 Improve the secondary school curriculum

The improvement of secondary school curriculum in the context of PPPs could entail determining the skills that are required the industries so that they could also be incorporated into the curriculum. The participation of the private sector organisations in this exercise is paramount so that their requirements could be balanced with other curricula requirements. The secondary school curriculum should, therefore, be reviewed in order to embrace sufficient coverage of vocational skills. Each student should start with a wide range of subject areas and, with proper guidance and monitoring, should be allowed to drop those subjects which appear to be out of his or her reach. In the last two years of secondary education, learners should be allowed to choose 5 subjects (currently they choose up to 10) so that they can study each of the subjects

broadly and have a deeper understanding of the same subjects' content. Learners who demonstrate a flair for vocational subjects should be encouraged to specialise in such areas so that by the end of their schooling they would have acquired the necessary skills for some form of employment or further training leading to specialisation in the same subjects or related disciplines. This may encourage learners to pursue such progammes up to diploma or even degree level and enhance the skill base of the country.

An emphasis on vocational skills creates an opportunity for PPPs in the delivery of secondary school curriculum in the Gaborone City area. An arrangement can be made to engage people from the industry to impart some of their practical skills to the learners, which arrangement can motivate learners to take vocational subjects seriously. It also be possible for some learners to be attached, during school vacation, to the relevant private sector organisations in order to enhance their acquisition of the practical skills.

8.4.5 Train secondary school heads

Secondary school heads should be trained on PPPs and on how they should function in a new environment. It has been observed in the empirical study (see section 7.3) that PPPs was a relatively new concept to the Botswana Government secondary school heads. As a result, it is necessary for these school heads to be familiar with the intricacies of using PPPs in the delivery of public services in general and secondary education in particular. A better understanding of the principles and practices of PPPs can enable the secondary school heads to execute their duties meaningfully in a PPP environment. Such training could also help the secondary school heads to appreciate the virtues of PPPs which could make it easier for them to relate well with the private partners. In the course of implementing the use of PPPs in the delivery of secondary education, the secondary school heads are expected to be agents of change. As a result, training them on the nature of PPPs could enable them to lead the change in the desired direction.

The secondary school heads will be expected to guide their teachers and learners on how to function in a PPP environment and it is necessary for the said school heads to be comfortable in functioning in the PPP environment which can be achieved through training. However, the ultimate aim of training the secondary school heads should be to enhance their overall efficiency and effectiveness. Consequently, the secondary school heads should be well trained in school management principles and practices so that they can effectively lead in continuous overall quality improvement in their schools in order to improve the quality of delivery of secondary education. Such training for the school heads may induce self-confidence in them which is one of the essential characteristics in successful leadership (Ketelle 2005:4). This is critical in an attempt to transform secondary schools into high performance organisations that are inspired by a desire to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education to enable learners to optimally acquire knowledge, skills, and attitudes that are consistent with the demands of the complexities of the contemporary life. In this regard, the training of school heads should follow a competence approach which is often guided by the job outcomes (Erasmus, Loedolff, Mda & Nel 2006:10; Erasmus & Van Dyk 2003:180) with a view to cultivating competent and confident secondary school heads because, as Wilson (1988:102) noted, the quality of educational services depend largely on the quality of the people who staff such services.

8.4.6 Modernise secondary schools

The use of the resources and expertise of the private sector organisations, through PPP arrangement, can help modernise secondary schools in the Gaborone City area. The need to modernise these schools arise because secondary schools in Botswana, perhaps like in many other countries, are conservative organisations to the extent that they don't seem to differ much from what they were several decades ago yet they exist in an environment that is rapidly changing. Secondary schools should therefore be modernised and made interesting places for teaching and learning. Not only should the school environment be stimulating but also, the mode of instructional delivery should

be designed to stimulate creativity and encourage critical thinking skills. In particular, instructional delivery should be ICT driven and learner centred in order to enable every learner to optimally develop his or her potential. The ideal should therefore, be to have modern secondary schools that epitomize reverence for the education of the contemporary learners.

Through the DBOF model of PPPs, the private partner can be required, as part of the output specifications, to design and build modern secondary schools. The renovation of existing secondary schools, through PPPs, can also include the element of modernisation so that such schools can also look better and modern. It also possible that through PPPs the secondary school grounds can be made to look attractive through landscaping and planting of trees. Providing enough computers to secondary schools and properly training the teachers on how to effectively use ICT for administrative purposes and instructional delivery can be achieved through the PPP arrangement. All this can make significant contributions towards modernizing secondary schools in the Gaborone City area.

To transform the education system requires a mindset that is different from that which brought the same system to its current status (Randall 2004:88). It is therefore necessary to change the mindset of those who are responsible for the provision of educational services. In a fast evolving world the education system can not depend solely on old skills and mindset. It needs constant upgrading and updating, that is continuous improvement, in order to be relevant and successful. In general, the top civil servants must be on the lookout for new technology, ideas, and ways to continuously improve the delivery of public services and the general welfare of the populace (Cloete 2006:255).

8.4.7 Management of change

The provision of secondary education through PPPs, as advocated in this thesis, would constitute a major change in the delivery of education in the

Gaborone City area. But such changes have been viewed as complex, dynamic and often treacherous even for managers with a clout (Ströh 2001:113; Dessler 2007:206). All this seems to suggest the need for the application of the correct principles and practices of management of change. Those driving the change, namely change agents, need to be conversant with the intricacies of change management but should also understand the context in which the service in question is being delivered (Stewart & O'Donnell 2007:239) in order to better conceptualise the change process.

The change agents will need to have a good understanding of the nature and scope of the intended change and the benefits thereof, and indeed must be convinced of its necessity. The stakeholders such as the secondary school personnel and the public must be taken on board right from the beginning and be psychologically prepared to embrace the change initiative. Such a major change will need to be undertaken professionally and even facilitated by well experienced consultants (French & Bell 1999:257; Harvey & Brown 2001:96). In order to persuade the public, the Botswana Government officials should also use the success story of diamond mining in the country which, from the beginning to date, has been a classical example of successful PPPs (Akintoye *et al* 2003:16). It is, to a large extent, this particular PPP that has transformed the economy of the country and many people are aware of the role of diamonds in the economy of Botswana (Mogae 2007:13). So relating such a known success story with the new initiative is most likely to enhance the public support for the latter.

One of the reasons for the need to be very careful and tactful in pursuing the change referred to above is that schools seem to be rather ossified in their doctrines and traditional practices (Ströh 2001:114). In addition, the administrators and teachers seem 'locked' in the current educational procedures and structures which might have been effective in the past but have now become inadequate in many respects (Sedisa 1998:24). The advocated change is a major one and therefore requires a strategic adjustment in attitudes and management practices (Brynard 1992:44; Randall 2004:88)

especially on the part of the school heads because they will be the ones at the forefront of the change process.

8.5 CONCLUSION

This final chapter has presented a summary of the thesis in terms of the nature and scope of the study, and the public and private sector organisations. The salient points about secondary education have also been summarised in the chapter. The summary also includes how organisations in the two sectors (private and public) can work collaboratively, in terms of PPPs, in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. Several conclusions have been made from the study in support of the use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone City area. In addition, a number of proposals have been made as to how best to improve the quality of the provision of secondary education through PPPs arrangement.

PPPs are increasingly being used worldwide to enhance the effectiveness and efficiency of the public sector. Through the PPP arrangement, the private sector resources to complement the public sector resources in the delivery of public infrastructure and the concomitant services. Whereas developing countries like Botswana are often constrained in their efforts to provide even the most basic of the public services due to the limited resources at the disposal of government, PPPs have been found to be able to bolster the public sector capacity to deliver more and better public services on a cost effective and sustainable basis. In the context of this study, PPPs can be used by the Botswana Government to build more secondary schools and to provide better facilities for the improved delivery of secondary education. More secondary schools could mean that more, if not all, junior secondary school leavers could be accepted in senior secondary schools and receive an improved quality of secondary education without the Botswana Government having to stretch the national budget. It is therefore possible, through PPPs in the delivery of secondary education, for Botswana to have a more educated nation in the foreseeable future.

APPENDIX 1

Please kindly complete the questionnaire enclosed herewith. The questionnaire is for a doctoral study on the *"Provision of secondary education through public private partnerships (PPPs) in the Gaborone city area."*

The study is based on the concept of PPP as a contractual agreement between the public and private sectors for the purposes of designing, financing, constructing and/or operating projects and/or programmes that would traditionally be falling within the remit of the public sector.

Biographical details:	Please complete this section by placing a cross (X) where applicable.

Secondary school:	Senior	☐
	Junior	☐
	Unified	☐

Experience as school head:	Less than five years	☐
	Between five and ten years	☐
	More than ten years	☐

Highest qualification:	Diploma	☐
	First degree	☐
	Masters degree	☐
	Doctoral degree	☐

Please indicate your views on each of the statements below by placing a cross (X) in the appropriate column.

Key: SA= Strongly Agree; A= Agree; N= Neutral; D= Disagree: SD= Strongly Disagree

QUESTIONNAIRE

SECTION A: Feasibility of applying PPPs in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone city (GC) area

		SA	A	N	D	SD
A1	Through the effective use of PPPs more secondary schools can be built in the area					
A2	The available spaces in senior secondary schools cannot accommodate all Junior Certificate (JC) leavers who have passed their examinations					
A3	There is need for every junior secondary school leaver to proceed to senior secondary school					
A4	The Government of Botswana currently (2007) does not have a plan for 100 percent transition from junior to senior secondary school					
A5	A Junior Certificate is no more adequate, on its own, for one to meaningfully participate in the economy of Botswana					
A6	Senior Secondary school completers can benefit more in vocational training than JC completers					
A7	There is a need for more senior secondary schools to be built in the area					
A8	The involvement of the private sector in the provision of secondary education can create tension between the participating personnel of the public and private organisations					
A9	Secondary schools in Botswana are very expensive to build					
A10	With proper administrative structures, the private sector resources can be used in the provision of secondary education					
A11	PPPs can fuel corruption in the provision of secondary education					

Comments: ....

....

....

SECTION B: Provision of secondary education in the GC area through PPPs

		SA	A	N	D	SD
B1	PPPs are suitable for the provision of secondary education in the GC area					
B2	The demand for secondary education is high in the area					
B3	There are many private secondary schools in the area					
B4	The private secondary schools in the area produce better quality education than the Government secondary schools					
B5	Top civil servants in the area prefer to send their children to private secondary schools					
B6	As a school head in the area, you prefer a private secondary school to a Government secondary school for your child					
B7	People, who can afford it, send their children to private secondary schools					
B8	Many junior secondary school leavers in the area cannot find places in senior secondary schools					
B9	Classes in secondary schools in the area are too big					
B10	The quality of secondary education is compromised where class sizes are too big					
B11	There are many private sector organisations which can participate in the building of more secondary schools under PPPs					
B12	There is need to improve the provision of secondary education delivered by the Government secondary schools					
B13	It is not necessary for the Government of Botswana to involve the private sector in the provision of secondary education in the area					

Comments: ....

....

....

SECTION C: The Impact that PPPs can have on the quality of secondary Education in the GC area

		SA	A	N	D	SD
C1	Every junior secondary school leaver could have an opportunity to proceed to senior secondary school					
C2	More facilities can be made available to secondary school education					
C3	PPPs can lower the quality of secondary education					
C4	PPPs are a recipe for conflict between public and private sector officials working in the same schools					
C5	Through PPPs, school heads can have more time devoted to the core functions of the schools					
C6	The use of PPPs in the provision of secondary education can lead to clean and attractive school environments					
C7	PPPs in the provision of secondary education can enhance the managerial efficiency of school heads					
C8	PPPs in the provision of secondary education can lead to the increase of the workload of school heads					

Comments: ....

　　　　　　　..

　　　　　　　..

SECTION D: **What the public sector can learn from the private sector in terms of delivery of service in general and secondary education in particular under PPPs**

		SA	A	N	D	SD
D1	Government secondary school staff, working hand in hand with the private sector staff, can learn to be more efficient					
D2	Secondary school heads can learn entrepreneurial skills					
D3	Public sector employees in secondary schools can learn the habits of handling customers well					
D4	The public sector employees can learn the habits of avoiding wastage of resources					
D5	Secondary school personnel employed by the Government of Botswana cannot learn anything from the private partner					
D6	PPPs can enable Government secondary schools to benefit from the commercial dynamism of the private sector					

Comments: ....

....

....

SECTION E: Antecedents for successful implementation of PPPs

		SA	A	N	D	SD
E1	There should be a legislative framework to facilitate the implementation of PPPs in the delivery of public services					
E2	Secondary school heads need to have a better understanding of the principles of PPPs in the provision of secondary education					
E3	There is a need for political leadership in support of PPPs in the country					
E4	Before the implementation of PPPs in the provision of secondary education the public needs to be convinced that such arrangements will benefit the learners					
E5	A regulatory mechanism needs to be in place to safeguard the interests of each partner					
E6	Both partners (public and private) need to be convinced that they will benefit from the partnerships					
E7	There should be a high demand for secondary education in order for more schools to be built					
E8	Parents must be willing to make some contributions towards the education of their children					
E9	The judicial system must be perceived to be effective and impartial for property rights to be assured					
E10	Law enforcement must be perceived to be uncorrupt-able in order to effectively deal with corrupt practices					
E11	There should be some quality assurance framework with which to monitor and guide the operations of secondary schools under PPPs					
E12	The private partner will have to make some profit if the partnerships are to be sustained					

Comments: ....

....

....

SECTION F: **The extent to which the private sector can be involved in the provision of secondary education in the Gaborone city area**

		SA	A	N	D	SD
F1	The private sector is already extensively involved in the provision of secondary education in the area					
F2	The private sector should be allowed to assume the leadership of curriculum delivery under PPPs					
F3	The management of secondary schools under PPPs should remain under the Government school heads					
F4	The private sector should build and maintain schools under PPPs					
F5	Existing secondary schools should be renovated and then maintained by the private sector under PPPs					
F6	Cleaning of the entire secondary school should be handled by the private sector under PPPs					
F7	Feeding of learners in the secondary schools can be handled better by the private sector					
F8	Security in Government secondary schools is very inadequate					
F9	Security of secondary schools under PPPs should be handled by the private sector					
F10	The provision of computers in secondary schools under PPPs should be left to the private sector					
F11	The maintenance of computers in secondary schools should be handled by the private sector organisation under PPPs					

Comments: ....

....

....

SECTION G: Preference between the provision of secondary education by the Government of Botswana (current situation) and through PPPs

		SA	A	N	D	SD
G1	Secondary education should be delivered through PPPs					
G2	The private sector organisations take a shorter time to complete projects when compared to those in the public sector					
G3	If PPPs can be introduced in the provision of secondary education more employment can be created in the GC area					
G4	New secondary schools should be built through PPPs					
G5	It takes a long time for maintenance work to be undertaken in Government secondary schools					
G6	The private sector can do a better school maintenance work					
G7	The private sector organisations should take over the management of secondary school under PPPs arrangement					
G8	Private organisations are not very honest entities to be entrusted with any aspect of the provision of secondary education in the area					
G9	The private sector will normally want to exploit the public sector					
G10	With the appropriate monitoring mechanisms in place, the private sector resources should be harnessed to enhance the provision of secondary education in the area					

Comments: ....

....

....

APPENDIX II

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE FOR SENIOR GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS

1. How useful is the Botswana junior secondary school certificate for students who stop their education at this level?

2. Does the Government of Botswana have plans for 100% transition from junior to senior secondary schools?

3. How does the quality of senior secondary education in Botswana compare with that of the neigbouring countries?

4. Does the Government of Botswana have plans to engage the private sector, in the form of PPPs, to provide more infrastructure and facilities for secondary education?

5. How would you compare the quality of secondary education in Government secondary schools with that in private secondary schools in the Gaborone City area?

6. What functions in Botswana secondary schools do you believe can be better performed by the private sector?

APPENDIX III

UNISA | university of south africa

17 October 2007

To whom it may concern

Doctoral thesis: Mr KN Sedisa

Mr Sedisa is a student at Unisa and currently enrolled for a doctoral degree in Public Administration. As part of his doctoral thesis he is conducting empirical research on public-private partnership at secondary schools in the Gaborone city area of Botswana. His research method in this regard includes a questionnaire as well as interviewing of core staff members in the Education Department. To enable him to make a valuable contribution in the field of Public Administration, he depends on members of his target group to respond positively to this research project and provide him with the necessary information he requires.

Thank you for your cooperation.

Prof EC Ströh
Department of Public Administration and Management
Promoter

APPENDIX IV

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION

Telephone: (267) 301263
Fax: (267) 375899

Ref:

Republic of Botswana

Chief Education Officer
South Central Region
Department of Secondary Education
Private Bag 00343
Gaborone
Botswana

REO: 6/7 I (41)

30 August 2004

Mr K N Sedisa
University of Botswana
P/Bag 0022
GABORONE

Dear Sir

REQUEST FOR PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH

Your letter dated 23 August 2004 refers.

Permission for you to conduct research in secondary schools in Gaborone is granted. You are advised to present this letter to the School Head whenever you visit a school or attach a copy of the same to the questionnaire.

Thank you.

Yours faithfully

M E Masendu
for/CHIEF EDUCATION OFFICER – SOUTH CENTRAL REGION

/sn

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abosi, C.O. & Murangi, K.I. 1995. **Education in Botswana.**
     Gaborone: Macmillan.

Adelman, P.& Marks, A. 2004. **Entrepreneurial Finances: Finance for
     small business.**
New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Adeyinka, A.A. & Major, T.E. 2006. **Sample Philosophers and
     Philosophies of Education.**
Lagos: Educational Service International.

Adlem, W.L.J.; Roemer, M. & Mynhardt, H.P. 1993. **Public Administration:
     Study Guide for PBL 312 & PBA 311-3.**
     Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Agere, S. 2000. **The role of Management Development Institutions in
     Public Service Reform.**
       London: The Commonwealth Secretariat.

Aina, L.O. 2002. **Research in Information Services.**
     Ibadan: Stirlin-Horden Publishers.

Akinpelu, J.A. 1981. **An Introduction to Philosophy of Education.**
     Oxford: Macmillan Publishers Limited.

Akintoye, A.; Beck, M. & Hardcastle, C. 2003. **Public-Private Partnerships.**
     Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Alistair, H. 1999. The new public management and the new nursing: related
     by rhetoric? Some reflections on the policy process and nursing.
     Journal of Advanced Nursing, 29(6):1377-1385.

Anderson, J.C. & Narus, J.A. 2004. **Business Market Management.**
     New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Armistead, C. & Pettigrew, P. 2004. Effective partnerships: building a sub-
     regional network of reflective practitioners. **International Journal of
     Public Sector Management**, 17(7):571-585.

Auger, D.A. 2002. In Osborne, S.P. **Public Management.**
     London: Routledge.

Babbie, E. 2004. **The Practice of Social Research.**
     Belmont: Wadsworth.

Ballantine, J.H. 1989. **The Sociology of Education.**

New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Baldassarri, M. 1996. **Equity, Efficiency and Growth: The Future of the Welfare State.**
New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc.

Balfour, D.L. & Grubbs, J.W. 2000. Character, Corrosion and the Civil Servant: The human consequences of globalization and the New Public Management. **Administrative Theory and Praxis**, 22(3):570-584.

Barrow, R. 1981. **The Philosophy of Schooling.**
Hampshire: Macmillan Press Ltd.

Baxter. L. 1991. **Administrative Law.**
Cape Town: Juta & Co. Ltd.

Becker, F. & Patterson, V. 2005. Public-Private Partnerships. **Public Performance & Management Review**, 29(2):125-144.

Bekker, K. 1996. **Citizen participation in local government.**
Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Bell, G. 2004. Performance Leadership: Why is it important? **Management Today**, 20(8):18-19.

Bell, J. 2005. **Doing Your Research Project.**
London: Open University Press.

Berg, B.L. 1989. **Qualitative Research Methods for Social Sciences.**
Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Best, R. 2004. **Market-based Management.**
New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Bishop, M.; Kay, J. & Mayer, C. 1995. **Privatisation and economic performance.**
Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Black, P.A., Calitz ,E. & Steenekamp, T.J. 2006. **Public Economics.**
Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Blacke, N. 2004. Pros and Cons of Public-Private Partnerships. **Australian Nursing Journal,** 11(8):15-15.

Botswana Government. 1966. **Constitution of the Republic of Botswana.**

Botswana Government. 2003. **National Development Plan 9.**
Gaborone: Government Printer.

Botswana Government. 1997. **Vision 2016.**
    Gaborone: Government Printer.

Botswana Government. 1994. **Revised National Plan for Education.**
    Gaborone: Government Printer.

Botswana Government. 2002. **Curriculum Blueprint**.
    Gaborone: Government Printer.

Botswana Government. 2005. **National Budget.**

Botswana Government. 2006. **National Budget.**

Botswana Government. 2007**. National Budget.**

Box, R.C. 2004. **Public Administration and Society.**
    New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc.

Boyles, D.R. 2005. **Schools or Markets.**
    London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.

Bryman, A. 2004. **Social Research Methods.**
    Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Brynard, D.J. 1992. The Changing Public Sector: A new approach to public
    management. **Administratio Publica**, 4 (1):42-49.

Brynard, D.J. & Hanekom, S.X. 1993. Public Administration: Study Guide for
    HBEBEP-3.
    Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Burnes,B.1996. **Managing change.**
    London: Pitman Publishing.

Burns, R.B. 1998. **Introduction to Research Methods.**
    Australia: Longman.

Cadle, J. & Yeates, D. 2001. **Project Management for Information
    Systems.**
    Essex: Prentice Hall.

Carley, M. 2006. Partnership and Statutory local governance in a devolved
    Scotland. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**,
    19(3):250-260.

Chapman, D.W.; Weidman, J; Cohen, M. & Mercer, M.2005. The search for
    quality: A five country study of national strategies to improve

educational quality in central Asia. **International Journal of Educational Development**, 25(5):514-530.

Chase, R.B.; Jacobs, F.R. & Aquilano, N.J. 2004. **Operations Management.** New York: McGraw-Hill International.

Christensen, T. & Laegreid, P. 2001. New Public Management. **Public Management Review**, 3(1):73-94.

Clatworthy, M.A; Mellett, H.J. & Peel, M.J. 2000. Corporate governance under 'New Public Management.' **International Review**, 8(2):34-53.

Cloete, J.J.N. 2006. **South African Public Administration and Management.** Pretoria: J.L. van Schaik Publishers.

Clinchy, E. 2000. **Creating New Schools.** New York: Teachers College Press.

Cohen, L; Manion, L & Morrison, K. 2000. **Research Methods in Education.** London: Routledge Falmer.

Corbetta, P. 2003. **Social Research – theory and techniques.** London: Sage Publications.

Corkery, J.; Daddah, T.O.; O'Nuallain, C. & Land, T.1998. **Management of public sector reform.** Ohmsha: IOS Press.

Corson, D. 1991. **Education for Work.** Clevedon: Multilingual Matters Ltd.

Coulson, A. 2005. A plague on all your partnerships: theory and practice in regeneration. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 18(2):151-163.

Crampton, F.E. & Thompson, D.C. 2003. **Saving America's School Infrastructure.** Connecticut: Information Age Publishing.

Crawford, R. 1997. **Managing information technology in secondary schools.** New York: Routledge.

Crawford, M. & Stein, W. 2004. Risk Management in the UK local authorities: The effectiveness of current guidance and practice. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 17(6):498-512.

Crawford, M. & Stein, M. 2005. "Second order"change in UK local government: The case of risk management. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 18(5):414-423.

Cronjé, G.I. de; Du Toit. G.S.; Marais, A. de K. & Matlatla, M.D.C. 2003. **Introduction to Business Management.** Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Currie, B. 2008. **Sunday Times.** 6 January.

Deakin, N. 2002. Public-Private Partnerships. **Public Management Review**, 4(2):133-147.

Dean, J. 1992. **Inspecting and Advising: A Handbook for Inspectors, Advisors and Advisory Teachers**. London: Routledge.

Deming, W. 1986. **Out of the Crisis.** Boston: MIT Press.

Dempster, N.; Freakly, M. & Parry, L. 2001. The ethical Climate of public schooling under new public management. **International Journal of Leadership in Education**, 4(1):1-12.

Denhardt, R. 1993. **The pursuit of Significant Strategies for Management Success.** California: Wadsworth.

Denzin, N. & Lincoln, Y. 1998. **The Landscape of Qualitative Research.** London: Sage Publication.

Department of Secondary Education. 2005. Form 4 selection.

Dessler, G. & 2007. **Management: Principles and Practices for Tomorrow's Leaders.** Boston: Houghton Mufflin Company.

Detomasi, D. 2002. The New Public Management and Defense Departments: The Case of Canada. **Defense and Security Analysis**, 18(1):51-73.

Diamond, J. 2006. Au revoir to Partnership: What next? **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 19(3):278-286.

Dilulio, J.J. 1990. **Deregulating the Public Service.** Washington DC: The Brookings Institution.

Dreyer, H.J. & Duminy, P.A. 1983. **Education 2: A course in psychopedagogics.**

Cape Town: Maskew Miller Longman.

Dukwi, T. 2003. **Mmegi**. 9 April.
Dunne, M.; Pryor, I. & Yates, P. 2005. **Becoming a Researcher.**
　　　　Berkshire: Open University Press.

Ellis, L. 1994. **Research Methods in Social Sciences.**
　　　　Madison: Brown & Benchmark.

Erasmus, B.J. & Van Dyk, P.S. 2003. **Training Management in South Africa.**
　　　　Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Erasmus, B.J.; Loedolff, P.V.Z.; Mada, T. & Nel, P.S. 2006. **Managing training and development.**
　　　　Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Evan, W.M. 1993. **Organisation theory: Research and Design.**
　　　　New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.

Everard, B. & Morris, G. 1990. **Effective School Management.**
　　　　London: Paul Chapman Publishing Ltd.

Feigenbaum, H; Henig, J & Hamnett, C. 1999. **Shrinking the State.**
　　　　Cambridge: University Press.

Field, J.E. & Peck, E. 2003. Public-Private Partnership in Healthcare. **Health and Social Care in the Community**, 11(6):494-501.

Felts, A.A. & Jos, P.H. 2000. Time and Spcae. The origins and implications of the New Public Management. **Administrative Theory & Praxis**, 22(3):519-533.

Ferlie, E.; Ashburner, L.; Fitzgerald, L. & Pettigrew, A. 1996. **The New Public Management in Action.**
　　　　Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Finch, J. 1984. **Education as Society Policy.**
　　　　New York: Longman.

Firer, C.; Ross, S.A.; Westerfield, R.W. & Jodon, B.D. 2004. **Fundamentals of Corporate Finance.**
　　　　London: Prentice Hall.

Fitzgerald, E & Melvin, D. 2002. The UK Private finance initiative and Glasgow Schools. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 20(3):119-126.

Fourie, P. & Schönteich, M. 2002. Die, the beloved countries: human security and HIV/AIDS in Africa. **Politeia**, 21(2):6-30.

Fox, A.; Goodey, J. & Goulding, S. 1995. **Conducting Small-scale Investigations in Educational Management.**
London: Harper and Row.

Franklin, B.M.; Bloch, M.N. & Popkewitz, T.S. 2003. **Educational Partnership and the State.**
New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

French, W.L. & Bell, C.H. 1999. **Organisational Development.**
New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Flynn, N. 2002.   **Public Sector Management.**
London: Prentice Hall.

Galabawa, J.C.J. & Agu, A.O. 2001. Advocacy, Mobilisation and Partnership Building for Education and Literacy for all Tanzania: Moving from Rhetoric to Reality. **Widening Access to Education in Tanzania,** 1(21):1-13.

Gaolatlhe, B. 2005. Botswana Association of Local Government Authorities. **Botswana Daily News No. 113**.

Gay, L.R; Mills, G.E. & Airasian, P. 2006. **Educational Research.**
New Jersey: Pearson International.

Glaister, S. 1999. Past Abuses and future Uses of Private Finance and Public Private Partnerships in Transport. **Public Money and Management**, 1(3):29-36.

Gildenhuys, J.S.H. 1997. **Public Financial Management.**
Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Gillis, M.; Perkins, D.H.; Roemer, M. & Snodgrass, D.R. 1992. **Economics of Development.**
New York: W.W. Norton & Company, Inc.

Giglierano, V. 2002. **Business to Business Marketing.**
New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Glatthorn, A.A.; Boschee, F. & Whitehead, B.M. 2005. **Curriculum leadership: Development and Implementation.**
New York: Addison-Wesley.

Goetsch, L.D. & Davis, S.B. 2006. **Quality Management.**
New Jersey: Pearson International.

Goodlad, J.I.; Mautle-Bromley, C. & Goodlad, J.S. 2004. **Education for Everyone.**
San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Gorrod, M. 2004. **Risk Management Systems.**
Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.

Graft, R.L. 1993. **Organisation Theory and Design.**
St. Paul: West Publishing Company.

Graham-Brown, S. 1998. **Educational in developing world.**
New York: Longman.

Grant, T. & Littlejohn, G. 2001. **Teaching about climate change.**
New York: New Society Publishers.

Greenwood, J.D. & Levin, M 1998. **Introduction to Action Research.**
Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Grimsey, D. & Lewis, M. 2002. Accounting for Public Private Partnerships. **Accounting Forum**, 26(3):245-270.

Grimsey, D. & Lewis, M. 2004. The Governance of Contractual Relationships in Public-Private Partnerships. **Journal of Corporate Citizenship**, 1(15):91-108.

Grimshaw, D.; Vincent, S. & Willmott, H. 2002. Going privately: Partnership and outsourcing in UK public services. **Public Administration**, 80(3):475-501.

Gundara, J.S. 2000. **Interculturalism, Education and Inclusion.**
London: Paul Chapman.

Hagen, A.L. & Lindle, G.S. 2007. **Politics of linking schools and social services.**
Bristol: Falmer Press.

Halachmi, A. 2005. Governance and risk management: Challenges and public productivity. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 18(4):300-317.

Hall, D. & Hall, I. 1996. **Practical Social Research.**
London: Macmillan.

Halsall, C.R. & Cockett, M. 1996. **Education and Training 14-19: Chaos or Coherence.**
London: David Fulton Publishers.

Hanekom, S.X; Rowland, R.W. & Bain, E.G. 2004. **Key aspects of Public Administration.**
Johannesburg: Southern Book Publishers (Pty) Ltd.

Hanekom, S.X. & Thornhill, C. 1990. **The Function of the Public Administration.**
Durban: Butterworths.

Hanss, W.G. 2001. Overcoming Competitive disadvantages of public enterprises by public-private partnerships and their financing models. **Annals of Public and Cooperative Economics,** 72(3):393-411.

Harvey, D. & Brown, D. 2001.**An experiential approach to organisational development.**
New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Herman, J. & Herman, J. 1994. **Making change happen.**
Carlifornia: Corwin Press.

Hersey, P. & Blanchard, K. 1993. **Management of Organisational behaviour.**
New Jersey: Prentice-Hall International.

Hitchcock, D.E. & Willard, M. 2003. **The Business Guide to Sustainability: Practical strategies and tools for organisations**.
London: Sterling.

Hlebowitsh, P.S. 2005. **Designing the School Curriculum.**
Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Hobson, B. 1987. **Theories of Education.**
New York: John Wiley & Sons.

Hood, C. 1998. **The Art of the State: Culture, Rhetoric and Public Management.**
Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Hood, C. 1998. Regulation Inside government: Where New Public Management Meets the Audit Explosion. **Public Money and Management**, 6(3):61-68.

Hood, J. & Mc Garvey. 2002. Managing the Risks of Public-Private Partnerships: Scottish Local Government. **Policy Studies**, 23(1):21-35.

Hope, R.K. & Chikulo, B.C. 2000. **Corruption and Development in Africa.**
London: Palgrave.

Horton, S. & Farnham, D. 1999. **Public Administration in Britain.**
Hampshire: Macmillan Press Ltd.

Houlden, B. 1990. **Understanding Company Strategy.**
Oxford: Basil Blackwell Ltd.

Horton, S. & Farnham, D. 1999. **Public Management in Britain.**
Hampshire: Macmillan Press Ltd.

Horton, S. 2003. Participation and involvement – the democratization of new public management. **International Journal of Public Sector Management,**16(6):403-411.

Hoy, C.; Bayne-Jardine, C. & Wood, M. 2000. **Improving Quality in Education.**
London: Falmer Press.

Hoy, W.K. & Miskel, C.G. 1991. **Educational Administration.**
New York: Mc Graw-Hill, Inc.

Huczynsk, A.A. 1996. **Management Gurus.**
Kent: International Thomson Business Press.

Hughes, O. 1998. **Public Management and Administration.**
Hampshire: Palgrave.

Hurst, C. & Reeves, E. 2004. An economic analysis of Ireland's first public-private partnerships. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 17(5):379-388.

Hyman, I.A. 2007. Using Research to change Public Policy: Reflections on 20 Years of Effort to Eliminate Corporal Punishment in Schools. **Pediatrics**, 98(4):818-821.

International Institute of Administrative Sciences (IIAS) 1997. **Public Administration and Development.**
Brussels: 105 Press.

International Labour Organisation. 1996. Report on Education.

Ireland Government. 2004. Briefing on public-private partnership.

Jamali, D. 2004. Success and failure mechanisms of public private partnerships (PPPs) in developing countries. **International Journal of Public Sector Management,** 17(5):414-430.

Jasso, G. 1996. **Finding Corporate Resources.**
California: Corwin Press.

Johnson, G. 1986. **Research Methodology for Economists.**
New York: David Fulton Publishers.

Jones, D. 2002. PPPs in Australia: removing the government blinkers. **PFI Report**, 1(65):24-25.

Jones, L.B. & Maloy, R.W. 1988. **Partnership for Improving Schools.** Connecticut: Greenwood Press.

Jonker, A. 2001. In Van Niekerk, D.; Van der Waldt, G. & Jonker, A. **Governance, Politics, and Policy in South Africa.** Cape Town: Oxford.

Kanter, M.R. 1996. **The Change Masters.** London: Thomson Business Press.

Kayes, M.S. & Maranto, R. 2006. **A guide to charter schools.** Oxfort: Rowman & Littlefield Education.

Kearsley, G. 1990. **Computers for educational administrators.** Norwood: Ablex Publishing Corporation.

Kelly, G. 2000. Providing Public Services: How great a role for PPPs? **New Economy**, 7(3):132-137.

Kerr, A. 2003. Scottish PPPs. **Public Private Finance** No. 7(2): 11-11.

Kerzner, H. 2003. **Project Management.** New York: John Wiley & Sons.

Ketelle, D. 2005. Self-efficacy development in school leaders: An alternative paradigm AASA. **Journal of Scholarship and Practice**, 2(1).

Kettl, D.F. 2004. **Sharing power: public governance and private markets.** Washington: Brookings Institutions Press.

Kirk, J. & Miller, M.L. 1986. **Reliability and Validity in Qualitative Research.** Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.

Kikeri, S. & Nellis, J. 2004. **Privatisation in competitive sectors: the record to date.** Washington D.C.: World Bank.

Khoza, R. 2003. Corporate Governance: Integrated sustainability reporting a key principle. **Management Today**, 19(4):18-19.

Knight, B. 1993. **Financial Management for schools.** Oxford: Heinemann Educational.

Koller, P. & Armstrong, G. 2004. **Principles of Marketing.**
New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Koshy, V. 2005. **Action Research for Improving Practice.**
Thousand Oaks: Paul Chapman Publishing.

Kroon, J. 1990. **General Management.**
Pretoria: Haum.

Kroukamp, H. 2004. Guidelines Governing Public-private partnerships.
Management Today, 20(9):38-39.

Kroukamp, H. 2004.Public-Private Partnerships. **Management Today**,
20(8):28-29.

Kruger, H.B. & Bernhardt, Y. 1993. Public Administration: Study Guide for PBL
313-3.
Pretoria: South Africa.

Lane, J.E. 1994. State Transformation in South Africa: Implications for public
administration training and research. **Politeia**, 13(2):62-72.

Lane, J.E. 2000. **New Public Management.**
Canada: Routledge.

Larbi@www.unrisd.org 2006.

Lawton, A. 1998. **Ethical Management for the Public Service.**
Buckingham: Open University Press.

Leedy, P.D. & Ormrod, J.E. 2006. **Practical Research.**
New Jersey: Pearson Merrill Prentice Hall.

Legge, J. 1992. **The Competitive Edge.**
Australia: Allen & Union.

Lemmer, E. 2000. **Contemporary Education.**
Sandton: Longman.

Lemmer, E. & Badenhorst, D.C. 1997. **Introduction to Education for South
African Teachers.**
Cape Town: Juta & Co. Ltd.

Levin, H.M. 2000. The Public-Private Nexus in Education. **American
Behavoural Scientist**, 43(1):124-137.

Lissauer, R. 2000. Partnerships in education. **New Economy**, 7(3):143-147.

Loreman, T.; Deppeler, J. & Harvey, D. 2005. **Inclusive Education.**
London: Routledge Falmer.

Lund, B. 2002. **Understanding state welfare: Social justice or social exclusion?**
London: Sage Publishers.

Lynch, R. 2003. **Corporate Strategy.**
Essex: Pearson Prentice Halls.

Malekela, G.A. & Ndeki, A.S. 2001. Access and Equity in Basic Education in Tanzania. **Widening Access to Education in Tanzania**, 1(31):124-137.

Maloy, R.W. & Jones, B.L. 1988. **Partnerships for improving schools.**
New York: Greenwood Press.

Marope, P.T.M. & Chapman,D.W. 1997. **A Handbook of Research in Education Vol.1.**
Gaborone: Lentswe La Lesedi (Pty) Ltd.

Marsh, J. 2003. The Reinvention of Education Part 1. **Management Today**, 19(5):53-56.

Maserumule, M.H. & Mathole, B.M. 2006. Franchising as a public-private sector partnership variation in South Africa. **Politeia**, 25(3):219-234.

May, T. 2001. **Social Research (issues, methods and process).**
Buckingham: Open University Press.

Maykut, P. & Morehouse, R. 1994. **Beginning Qualitative Research.**
London: The Falmer Press.

Mbaakanyi, M. 2007. **Mmegi**. 17 October.

McColl, J.H. 2001. **Multivariate Probability.**
London: Arnold.

McMurray, R. 2006.From Partition to Partnership. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 19(3):238-249.

Mercer, T.L. 1991. **Strategic Planning for Public Managers.**
Westport: Pitman Publishing.

Mertens, D.M. 2005. **Research and Evaluation in Education and Psychology.**
London: Sage Publications.

Miles, B.M. & Huberman, M. 1994. **Qualitative Data Analysis.**
    London: Sage Publications.

Miller, R. 1991. **New Directions in Education.**
    Vermont: Holistic Education Press.

Miller, G.J. 1991. **Government Financial Management Theory.**
    New York: Marcel Dekker, Inc.

Miller, S.I. & Fredericks, M. 1996. **Quantitative Research Methods.**
    New York: Peter Lang.

Ministry of Education. 2006. Cost recovery measures.

Mmegi 2006. Double shift in secondary education. 23 March.

Modise, P. 2008. **Mmegi**, 20 February.

Mogae, F.G. 2007. Jwaneng Mine celebrates Silver Jubilee. **The Monitor**.17
    October.

Mogae, F.G. 2006. Address to the nation.

Mogae, F.G. 2000. Address to the nation.

Mohr, P. & Rodgers, C. 1993. **Macro-Economics.**
    Johannesburg: Lexicon Publishers.

Molefe, D.; Pansiri, O. & Weeks. 2007. **Monitor**, 22 October.

Molosiwa, T. 1999. **Botswana Handbook.**
    Gaborone: Government Printing.

Moore, M.H. 1996. **Creating Public Value: Strategic Management in
Government.**
    Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Moursund, D., Bielefedt, T.; Rucketts, D. & Underwood, S. 1995. **Effective
Practice Computer Technology in Education.**
    Thousands Oaks: International Society for Technology in Education.

Mulder, A. & Van Tulder, R. 2004. PPPs: Beneficial to Whom? **European
Business Forum**, 1(18):24-26.

Muller, M. 2003. Public-Private partnerships in Water: A South African
perspective on the global debate. **Journal of International
Development,** 15(1):1115-1125.

Mullins, L. 1989. **Management and Organisation Behaviour.**
London: Pitman Publishing.

Musgrave, R. A. & Musgrave, P.B. 1989. **Public Finance in Theory and Practice.**
Singapore: Mc Graw-Hill Book Company.

Murphy, T. 2002. **Charter Schools.**
New York: Nova Science Publishers.

Mustafa, A. 1999. Public-private partnership: An Alternative Institutional Model for implementing the Private Finance Initiative in the provision of transport infrastructure. **Journal of Project Finance**, 5(2):64-79.

Naschold, F. & Otter, C. 1996. **Public Sector Transformation: rethinking markets and hierarchies** i**n government.**
Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Nata, R. 2001. **Progress in Education Vol. 2.**
New York: Nova Science Publishers.

Nel, C. 2003. High impact on executive development. **Management Today**, 19(6):22-25.

Nel, P.A.; Randel, F.E. & Laubser, M. 1994. **Research in South African Market.**
Pretoria: University of south Africa.

Neuman, L.W. 2007. **Basic Social Research.**
Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.

Ngami Times, 2006. School Fees Crises, 17 – 24 November.

Nhamo, S. & Nhamo, G. 2006. Macroeconomics, (adult) education, and poverty eradication in Southern Africa. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 52(3-4):305-322.

Nicholson, R. 1989. **School Management.**
London: Palgrave.

Nisar, T.M. 2007. Value for money drivers in public private partnership schemes. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 20(2):147-156.

Nkate, J. 2006. **Botswana Daily News**. 29 November.

Norment@www.ncppp.org-2005

Nzimakwe, I.T. 2006. Public-Private Partnerships: Implications for development. **Africanus**, 36 (1):48-57.

Nwabuzor, E. & Mueller, M. 1990. **Introduction to Political Science for African Students.**
Basingstoke: Macmillan Education Ltd.

Oduaron, A. & Bhola, H. 2006. **Wildening Access to Education a Social Justice.**
Dordrecht: Springer.

O'donoghue, T. & Punch, K. 2005. **Quantitative Educational Research in Action.**
New York: Routledge Falmer.

Olser, A. 2000. **Citizenship and Democracy in Schools.**
Stoke: Trentham Books.

Oppenheim, A.A. 1992. **Questionnaire Design, Interviewing and Attitude Measurement.**
London: Ponter Publisher.

Orr, E.W. 1987. Twice as less: **Black English and the performance of black students in Mathematics and Science.**
New York: The International Clearinghouse.

Osborne, D. & Gaebler, T. 1992. **Re-inventing Government.**
New Delhi: Prentice-Hall.

Osborne, S.P. 2000. **Public-Private Partnerships.**
London: Routledge.

Osborne, S.P. 2002. **Public Management: Critical perspectives.**
London: Routledge.

Ornstein, A. & Hunkins, F. 1993. **Curriculum Foundations, Principles and Issues.**
Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Ozmon, H.A. & Craver, S. 1999. **Philosophical Foundation of Education.**
New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.

Parson, C. 1994. **Quality Improvement in Education.**
London: David Fulton Publishers.

Pauw, J.C. & Wessels, J.S. 1999. **Reflective Public Administration.**
Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Peterson, E.P. & Campbell, D.E. 2001. **Character, Vouchers and Public Education**
Washington DC: Brookings Institution Press.

Perry,J.L. & Rainey, H.G. 1998. Public-Private Distinction in Organisation Theory: A Critique and Research Strategy. **Academy of Management Review**, 13(3):182-200.

Petrie, H.G. 1995. **Professionalism, Partnership, and Power.**
New York: State University of New York Press.

Pieterse, N.J. 2001. **Development Theory.**
London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Pollitt, C. & Bouckaert, G. 1995. **Quality Improvement in European Public Services.**
London: Sage Publishers.

Pongsiri, N.2002. Regulations and Public-Private Partnerships. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 15(6):487-495.

Popovich, M.G. 1998. **Creating High Performance Government Organisations.**
San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Porter, M. 2003. Global competitive strategy: Affecting developing markets. **Management Today**, 19(7):14-15.

Priemus, H. 2002. Public-private partnerships for spatio-economic investment: A changing spatial planning approach in the Netherlands. **Planning Practice & Research**, 17(2):197:204.

Prokopenko, T. 1995. **Management for privatisation.**
Geneva: ILO.

Prosser, J. 1999. **School Culture.**
London: Paul Chapman.

Psacharopoulos, G. 1987. **Economics of Education: Research and Studies.**
Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Punch, K.F. 1998. **Introduction to Social Research.**
London: Sage Publications.

Punch, M.; Kolthoff, E.; Van der Vijver, K. & Van Vliet, B. 1993. **Coping with corruption in a boarderless world.**
Boston: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Punnet, B.T. & Ricks, D.A. 1992. **International Business.** California: PWS-Kent.

Raine, J.W. & Willson, M.J. 1995. New Public Management and Criminal Justice. **Public Money & Management**, 4(1):35-40.

Rainer, K. 1999. New Public Management and Management Education. **Australian Journal of Public Administration**, 58(3):97-101.

Randall, J. 2004. **Managing Change/Changing Managers.** London: Routledge.

Rantanen, H.; Kulmala, H.I.; Lönnqvist, A. & Kujansivu, P. 2007. Performance measurement systems in the Finish public sector. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 20(5):415-433.

Ray, J.R.; Hack,W.G. & Candoli, I.C. 2001. **School Business Administration.** Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Reeves, E.2003. Public-Private Partnerships in Ireland. **Public Money & Management**, 23(3):163-170.

Riccucci, N.M. 2001. The "Old" Public Management Versus the "New" Public Management: Where does Public Administration fit? **Public Administration Review**, 61(2):172-175.

Rice, M.F. 2007. Post-modern cultural competency framework for public administration and public service delivery. **Journal of International Public Sector Management**, 20(7):622-637.

Robbins, P.S. 1987. **Organisation Theory.** New Jersey: Prentice Hall International.

Robbins, S.P.; Odendaal, A. & Roodt, G. 2001. **Organisational Behaviour.** Pretoria: Pearson Education.

Roberts, E. **School development planning.** Gaborone: Government Printer.

Ryan, C. & Walsh, P. 2004. Collaboration of public sector agencies: Reporting and accountability challenges. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 17(7):621-631.

Savas, E.S. 2000. **Privatisation and Public-Private Partnerships.** New York: Catham House Publishers.

Sayal@ www.literacyonline.org.products 2006

Schachter, L.H. 1997. **Reinventing Government or Reinventing Ourselves.**
    Albany: State University of New York Press.

Scharle, P. 2002. PPP as a Social Game. **Innovation**, 15(3):227-252.

Scheerens, J. 1992. **Effective schooling: Research, theory and practice.**
    London: Cassell.

Sedisa, K.N. 1998. **The use of Information Technology in Improving Decision Making and Planning in the Management of Senior Secondary Schools in Botswana** (unpublished MPA dissertation).

Shafritz, J.M. & Hyde, A.C. 1997. **Classics of Public Administration.**
    Philadelphia: Harcourt Brace College Publishers.

Smit, P.J. & Cronje', G.J. 1999. **Management Principles: A contemporary South African Edition.**
    Kenwyn: Juta.

Smith, A. 2000. Delivering better public services. **New Economy**, 7(3):127-131.

Smith, R.J. 1994. **Strategic management and planning in the public sector.**
    Essex: Longman.

South Africa Government, Treasury Regulations 16.1, 2004.

Stainback, S. 2000. **Inclusion: A guide for educators.**
    Baltimore, MD: Paul H. Brookes.

Stake, R.E. 1995. **The art of case study research.**
    Thousand Oaks: Sage Publishers.

Stewart, J. & O'Donnell, M. 2007. Implementing change in a public agency. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 20(3):239-251.

Stone, H.J.S. 1981. **The Nature and Structure of the School.**
    Pretoria: ACADEMICA.

Ströh, E.C. 2001. **Public Administration: Study Guide for PUB301-E.**
    Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Ströh, E.C. & Van der Westhuizen, E.J.1994. **Public Administration: Study Guide for HOPBES-V.**
    Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Subramoney, S.2003. NEPAD: Putting Africa in its rightful economic place. **Management Today**, 19(8):14-15.

Sullivan, H.J. 1987. Privatisation of Public Services: A Growing Threat to Constitutional Rights. **Public Administration Review**, 47(6):461-467.

Swanepoel, B. 2005. **Human Resource Management.** Lansdowne: Juta

Swart, S.P.C. 1992. **Economics: Study guide for ECN100-F.** Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Tabulawa, R. 2007. **The Gazette**. 9 May.

Taylor, D.W. & Warrack, A.A. 2002. In Osborne, S.P. **Public Management.** London: Routledge.

Thayer-Bacon, B.J. & Bacon, C.S. 1988. **Philosophy Applied to Education.** Ohio: Prentice Hall.

Tlou, T. & Campbell, A. 1984. **History of Botswana.** Gaborone: Macmillan.

Trafford, S. & Proctor, T. 2006. Successful joint venture partnerships: public-private partnerships. **International Journal of Public Sector management**, 19(2):117-129.

Try, D. & Randor, Z. 2007. Developing an understanding of results-based management through public value theory. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 20(7):655-673.

Turner, M. 2002. Choosing items from the menu: new public management in South East Asia. **International Journal of Public Administration**, 25(12):1493-1512.

Turner, M. & Hulme, D. 1997. **Governance, Administration & Development.** New York: Palgrave Publishers Ltd.

UNESCO. 2002. **Interagency Consultative Group on Secondary Education and Youth Affairs.** Paris, 26-28 March.

Uys, F. 1994. **Public Administration: Study Guide for HPERSA-K.** Pretoria: South Africa.

Van Niekerk, D.; Van der Waldt, G. & Jonker, A. 2001. **Governance, Politics, and Policy in South Africa.** Cape Town: Oxford.

Van Resburg, J.J.C.; Kilian, C.J.G. & Landman, W.A. 1981. **Notes on Fundamental- Pedagogic concept- An Introductory Orientation.**
Pretoria: N.G. Kerkboekhandel Transvaal.

Van Schalkwyk, O.J. 1982. **Focus on the education system.**
Burban: Butterworths.

Ventriss, C. 2000. New Public Management: an examination of its influence on contemporary public affairs and its impact on shaping the intellectual agenda of the field. **Administrative Theory and Praxis**, 22(3):500-518.

Villaverde, L.E. 2003. **Secondary Schools: Reference Handbook.**
California: Santa Barbara.

Walingo, W. 2006.Education and development. **International Review of Education**, 52(3):286-295.

Walker, R. & Wiseman, M. 2003. **The welfare we want?**
Bristol: The Policy Press.

Weil, D. 2002. **School Vouchers and Privatisation.**
Colorado: ABC-CLIO's.

Wellington, J. 2006. **Secondary Education.**
London: Routledge.

Wettenhall, R. 2007. Actew AGL: a genuine public-private partnership**. International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 20(5):392-414.

Wiersman, W. & Jurs, S.G. 2005. **Research Methods in Education.**
Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.

White, J. 1991. **The Aims of Education Restated.**
London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Wiles, J. and Bondi, J. 1993. **Curriculum Development.**
New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.

Wilson, J.D. 1988. **Appraising Teaching Quality.**
London: Hodder & Stoughton.

Wilson. B.L. & Corcoran, T.B. 1988. **Successful Secondary Schools.**
London: Falmer Press.

Winch, C. & Gingell, J.1999. **Key concepts in the philosophy of education.**

London: Routledge.

World Bank. 2003. Education for All.

www.moe.gov.bw.2007

www.ncppp.org/resources2004

www.ncppp.org/resources/papers

www.privatisation.org-2005

Young, S. 2005. Outsourcing in Australian Health Sector: The interplay of economics and politics. **International Journal of Public Sector Management**, 18(1):25-36.

Young, P. 1994. **Equity in Theory and Practice.**
New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

TABLES