

THE GENDER STRAIGHTJACKET:
A QUALITATIVE INVESTIGATION OF A GROUP OF SOUTH AFRICAN
ADOLESCENT MALES' COGNITIVE SCHEMATA FOR MASCULINITY AND
GENDER ROLES

by

JASON ROBERT BANTJES

submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

in the subject

PSYCHOLOGY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: DR P KRUGER

November 2004

ABSTRACT

A surge of “masculinity in crisis” discourse suggests that men are primarily responsible for lawlessness, social mayhem, violence and other forms of psycho- and socio-pathology. This crisis is attributed, in part, to hegemonic models of masculinity which restrict men to certain modes of behaviour and specific roles in society. This study investigates the content of a group of South African adolescent males’ cognitive schemata for masculinity and gender roles. A qualitative mode of enquiry was used to identify the beliefs held by participants about manhood and gender roles. The findings of this study affirm that a hegemonic model of masculinity exists in the sub-culture of South African society represented by the participants and suggests that hegemonic masculinity in South African is both restrictive and damaging to men and society.

Key terms:

Crisis in masculinity; Hegemonic masculinity; Gender roles; Adolescent males; Cognitive schemata; Beliefs; Gender differences; Gender discrimination; Interpersonal relationships; Gendered work; Emotional expression; Initiation; Male body; Sport and exercise; Father-son relationships; Sexual orientation.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my thanks to my supervisor, Dr P Kruger, for his considerable encouragement, constant guidance, genuine interest and wisdom. I am grateful for his constructive comments, support and mostly for prompting me to think more deeply about the concepts and issues which I encountered during the process of preparing this dissertation.

I am also truly grateful to Liz King for the time she spent proof reading this dissertation and for her constant support and encouragement, without which I would never have been able to submit this dissertation on time.

It is also appropriate to record my thanks to the 15 boys who consented to participate in this study. Their openness and honesty was most helpful as was their willingness to give of their time.

In addition, I would like to acknowledge with gratitude the help of Megan de Beyer whose work with me on this and other projects and whose friendship has profoundly influenced my thinking and helped me to achieve a greater level of consciousness, a better understanding of myself, and an appreciation for the complexities of psychological issues.

DECLARATION

I declare that, *The gender straightjacket: A qualitative investigation of a group of South African adolescent males' cognitive schemata for masculinity and gender roles*, is my own work and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

Jason R Bantjes

Cape Town

November 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title page	i
Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Declaration	v
Table of contents	vi
CHAPTER 1: Introduction: Where have all the good men gone?	1
CHAPTER 2: Men - a population at risk	5
Introduction	5
The status of men's health	5
Suicide among men	7
Psychopathology in men	8
Antisocial behaviour as a male phenomenon	9
Men in the work place	11
Men and relationships	12
Male academic under-achievement	12
Men and the spread of HIV	15
Whose voice is being heard?	16
Are men really worse off than women?	16
Conclusion	18
CHAPTER 3: Traditional psychological theories of masculinity	19
Introduction	19
Gender, sex and sexual orientation	19
Freud's theory of masculinity	20
Jung's writings on masculinity	24
Adler's theory of masculinity	27

The concept of gender identity	28
The gender role theory of masculinity	30
Social construction theory of masculinity	31
Conclusion	32

**CHAPTER 4: An evolutionary and neuro-physiological approach to
masculinity** **33**

Introduction	33
Research in the past 30 years	33
Two sexes and evolution	34
Sexual selection - the evolution of the sexes	36
Testosterone's role in the design and function of the human body	38
The role of testosterone in shaping behaviour	42
The role of social factors in influencing testosterone levels	44
Cortical influences over testosterone	44
Conclusion	45

**CHAPTER 5: Studying masculinity within the framework of cognitive
and evolutionary psychology** **46**

Introduction	46
The cognitive theory of emotional expression	47
The cognitive social theory of gender-role formation	49
The psychology of beliefs	50
An evolutionary psychology model of masculinity	51
Conclusion	54

CHAPTER 6: Growing up male: Common understandings and shared beliefs about masculinity in our society	56
Introduction	56
Man and his internal world of feelings	57
No one is born a man	62
Behaviours that define masculinity	63
Men are heroic and action orientated	67
Men and their moms and dads	68
Man and his penis	69
Men, their bodies, exercise and sport	71
A man's value is in his work	73
Conclusion	76
CHAPTER 7: Research design and implementation	77
Introduction	77
Aims of this study	78
Participants	78
Measurements	78
Procedure for data collection	79
Data analysis	81
Minimising research bias	82
Ethical issues	83
The age, socio-economic status and cultural background of participants	84
Implementation of the project	85
Conclusion	88
CHAPTER 8: Research findings	89
Introduction	89
Beliefs about gender differences	90
Beliefs about sexism and gender discrimination	95
Beliefs which imply that men and women think differently	97

Beliefs which imply that men and women relate differently	99
Beliefs which imply that work in South Africa is gendered	101
Beliefs expressed which imply that women are emotionally expressive and men are emotionally dishonest	103
Beliefs that imply no clearly defined points mark a boy's entry into manhood	106
Beliefs which imply that to be a man is to give up being a child	107
Beliefs which imply that masculinity is constructed in the media	108
Beliefs which imply that masculinity has a distinctive physical appearance	109
Beliefs about love between men	113
Beliefs about a man's role in the family	116
Beliefs about the relationship between a father and his son	120
Beliefs about what constitute masculine behaviour	125
Beliefs about masculinity and sport	130
Beliefs which imply that sexual activity and virility are measures of one's masculinity	133
Conclusion	136
CHAPTER 9: Implications of the research findings	138
Introduction	138
Congruence of research findings with ideas reported in the literature	139
Interpreting beliefs about masculinity as perceptions of reality	140
Interpreting beliefs about masculinity as expressions of needs	141
Categorising beliefs about masculinity as adaptive or maladaptive	142
Interpreting beliefs about masculinity as restrictive rules	143
Promoting less restrictive models of masculinity	145
Limitations of this study	155
Conclusion	157
CHAPTER 10: Conclusion	159
References	162

Appendix A: interview schedule	169
Appendix B: Common themes identified from interview transcripts about masculinity and gender roles in South Africa	172
Appendix C: Common and shared beliefs express by participants about masculinity and gender roles	173