THE GENDER STRAIGHTJACKET:
A QUALITATIVE INVESTIGATION OF A GROUP OF SOUTH AFRICAN
adolescent males' cognitive schemata for masculinity and
gender roles

by

JASON ROBERT BANTJES

submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

in the subject

PSYCHOLOGY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: DR P KRUGER

November 2004
ABSTRACT

A surge of “masculinity in crisis” discourse suggests that men are primarily responsible for lawlessness, social mayhem, violence and other forms of psycho- and socio-pathology. This crisis is attributed, in part, to hegemonic models of masculinity which restrict men to certain modes of behaviour and specific roles in society. This study investigates the content of a group of South African adolescent males’ cognitive schemata for masculinity and gender roles. A qualitative mode of enquiry was used to identify the beliefs held by participants about manhood and gender roles. The findings of this study affirm that a hegemonic model of masculinity exists in the sub-culture of South African society represented by the participants and suggests that hegemonic masculinity in South African is both restrictive and damaging to men and society.

Key terms:

Crisis in masculinity; Hegemonic masculinity; Gender roles; Adolescent males; Cognitive schemata; Beliefs; Gender differences; Gender discrimination; Interpersonal relationships; Gendered work; Emotional expression; Initiation; Male body; Sport and exercise; Father-son relationships; Sexual orientation.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my thanks to my supervisor, Dr P Kruger, for his considerable encouragement, constant guidance, genuine interest and wisdom. I am grateful for his constructive comments, support and mostly for prompting me to think more deeply about the concepts and issues which I encountered during the process of preparing this dissertation.

I am also truly grateful to Liz King for the time she spent proof reading this dissertation and for her constant support and encouragement, without which I would never have been able to submit this dissertation on time.

It is also appropriate to record my thanks to the 15 boys who consented to participate in this study. Their openness and honesty was most helpful as was their willingness to give of their time.

In addition, I would like to acknowledge with gratitude the help of Megan de Beyer whose work with me on this and other projects and whose friendship has profoundly influenced my thinking and helped me to achieve a greater level of consciousness, a better understanding of myself, and an appreciation for the complexities of psychological issues.
DECLARATION

I declare that, *The gender straightjacket: A qualitative investigation of a group of South African adolescent males’ cognitive schemata for masculinity and gender roles*, is my own work and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

Jason R Bantjes
Cape Town
November 2004
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Title page</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of contents</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 1: Introduction: Where have all the good men gone?** 1

**CHAPTER 2: Men - a population at risk** 5

- Introduction
- The status of men’s health
- Suicide among men
- Psychopathology in men
- Antisocial behaviour as a male phenomenon
- Men in the work place
- Men and relationships
- Male academic under-achievement
- Men and the spread of HIV
- Whose voice is being heard?
- Are men really worse off than women?
- Conclusion

**CHAPTER 3: Traditional psychological theories of masculinity** 19

- Introduction
- Gender, sex and sexual orientation
- Freud’s theory of masculinity
- Jung’s writings on masculinity
- Adler’s theory of masculinity
The concept of gender identity 28
The gender role theory of masculinity 30
Social construction theory of masculinity 31
Conclusion 32

CHAPTER 4: An evolutionary and neuro-physiological approach to masculinity 33

Introduction 33
Research in the past 30 years 33
Two sexes and evolution 34
Sexual selection - the evolution of the sexes 36
Testosterone’s role in the design and function of the human body 38
The role of testosterone in shaping behaviour 42
The role of social factors in influencing testosterone levels 44
Cortical influences over testosterone 44
Conclusion 45

CHAPTER 5: Studying masculinity within the framework of cognitive and evolutionary psychology 46

Introduction 46
The cognitive theory of emotional expression 47
The cognitive social theory of gender-role formation 49
The psychology of beliefs 50
An evolutionary psychology model of masculinity 51
Conclusion 54
Beliefs which imply that men and women relate differently
Beliefs which imply that work in South Africa is gendered
Beliefs expressed which imply that women are emotionally expressive and men are emotionally dishonest
Beliefs that imply no clearly defined points mark a boy’s entry into manhood
Beliefs which imply that to be a man is to give up being a child
Beliefs which imply that masculinity is constructed in the media
Beliefs which imply that masculinity has a distinctive physical appearance
Beliefs about love between men
Beliefs about a man’s role in the family
Beliefs about the relationship between a father and his son
Beliefs about what constitute masculine behaviour
Beliefs about masculinity and sport
Beliefs which imply that sexual activity and virility are measures of one’s masculinity
Conclusion

CHAPTER 9: Implications of the research findings

Introduction
Congruence of research findings with ideas reported in the literature
Interpreting beliefs about masculinity as perceptions of reality
Interpreting beliefs about masculinity as expressions of needs
Categorising beliefs about masculinity as adaptive or maladaptive
Interpreting beliefs about masculinity as restrictive rules
Promoting less restrictive models of masculinity
Limitations of this study
Conclusion

CHAPTER 10: Conclusion

References
Appendix A: interview schedule

Appendix B: Common themes identified from interview transcripts about masculinity and gender roles in South Africa

Appendix C: Common and shared beliefs express by participants about masculinity and gender roles