THE INTERDEPENDENCE HYPOTHESIS:
EXPLORING THE EFFECTS ON ENGLISH WRITING FOLLOWING AN
EXPOSITORY WRITING COURSE IN ZULU

by

WENDY SUE RODSETH

submitted in part fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS WITH SPECIALISATION IN APPLIED LINGUISTICS

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: PROF EH HUBBARD

JANUARY 2005
ABSTRACT

This study explores Cummins’ interdependence hypothesis in the South African context. The design is experimental, involving Zulu primary language writing instruction to explore whether skills taught in Zulu composition classes transfer into English expository writing. The intervention and control groups were drawn from two ex-Model C high schools and the focus was on measuring use of coherence and cohesion in English essays. Quantitative findings showed, although the intervention group’s writing skills did not improve significantly, they did not decline. By contrast, the control group’s writing skills declined significantly. A more qualitative investigation of the corpus supports the statistical findings. However, because of the limitations of this study, more research is required into Cummins’ hypothesis, bilingual programmes and teaching academic writing skills in African languages. It is hoped that this research design will benefit future researchers investigate the current debate about the efficacy of bilingual and multilingual approaches to education.

Key terms
Interdependence hypothesis; Transference of writing skills; Expository writing; Coherence; Cohesion; Bilingualism and Multilingualism; Cognitive Academic Language Proficiency (CALP); Basic Interpersonal Communication Skills (BICS); Home Language Project.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the following people:

Prof. Hilton Hubbard, my supervisor, for the invaluable learning experience he provided, for the sharing of his great knowledge and understanding, his support, guidance and patience;

Vic, my husband, for his help, great expertise and unfailing enthusiasm for this research study;

The Home Language Project team: Margie Owen Smith for allowing the study to take place and for her support; Fikile Msibi and Colleen Moabelo for their great contribution in translating the workbook into Zulu, their teaching of the expository writing course, and for their warmth and cooperation at all times.

Molly Bill for her generous assistance and for allowing me access to her unpublished manuscript;

My children, Philippa, Alison and Mark for their patience, and my sister, Denise for her continued support over all these years.
ABSTRACT

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 STATEMENT OF PROBLEM

1.1.1 Research questions
1.1.2 Background considerations
1.1.3 Aims

1.2 PRELIMINARY PERSPECTIVE ON KEY CONCEPTS OF THE STUDY

1.2.1 The interdependence hypothesis
1.2.2 Basic interpersonal communication skills (BICS) and cognitive academic language proficiency (CALP)
1.2.3 Expository writing skills: coherence and cohesion
1.2.3(a) Coherence
1.2.3(b) Cohesion
1.2.4 Errors in conjunctive cohesion
1.2.5 The Home Language Project

1.3 RESEARCH FOCUS

1.3.1 The corpus
1.3.2 Hypotheses

1.4 STRUCTURE OF THE STUDY

CHAPTER 2: RESEARCH AND SOURCES: A SURVEY

2.0 INTRODUCTION

2.1 BILINGUAL EDUCATION AND COGNITIVE DEVELOPMENT

2.1.1 Opposing ideologies
2.1.2 Studies on the relationship between bilingualism and cognitive development
2.1.3 Bilingual programmes
2.1.3(a) Structured immersion
 (i) Additive bilingualism
 (ii) Late immersion bilingualism
2.1.3(b) Transitional bilingual education (TBE) 21
2.1.3(c) English as second language 21
2.1.3(d) English immersion 21

2.1.4 Bilingual education: models and hypotheses 22
2.1.4(a) Common underlying proficiency of bilingualism (CUP) 22
2.1.4(b) Interdependence hypothesis 23
2.1.4(c) Threshold hypothesis 23
2.1.4(d) Separate underlying proficiency model of bilingualism (SUP) 23

2.1.5 Research findings on the efficacy of bilingual education 24

2.2 SOCIOPOLITICAL BACKGROUND TO LANGUAGE
TEACHING AND APPLIED LINGUISTIC RESEARCH IN
SOUTH AFRICA 28

2.2.1 Sociopolitical background of language teaching in South Africa 28
2.2.2 Research on the language of learning and teaching (LOLT) 32
2.2.3 The Home Language Project 40

2.3 THE TEACHING AND LEARNING OF EXPOSITORY WRITING SKILLS 43

2.3.1 Expository writing: coherence and cohesion 43
2.3.1(a) Coherence 44
2.3.1(b) Cohesion 44

2.3.2 Problems with teaching and learning expository writing skills 45
2.3.3 Writing programmes 47
2.3.4 The Home Language writing programme: coherence and cohesion 52
2.3.4(a) Coherence 53
2.3.4(b) Cohesion 54

2.4 QUANTITATIVE STUDIES OF COHERENCE AND COHESION 54

2.5 ERROR ANALYSIS 60

2.6 CONCLUSION 62

CHAPTER 3: ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH PROCEDURES 63

3.0 INTRODUCTION 63

3.1 RESEARCH DESIGN 63
3.2  ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK 63

3.2.1  Coherence 63
3.2.2  Cohesion 65
3.2.3  Functional relations 66
3.2.4  Textual units 75
3.2.5  Error analysis 77

3.3  RESEARCH PROCEDURES 81

3.3.1  Subjects 81
3.3.2  Data collection 82
3.3.3  The intervention programme: materials and method 83

3.3.3.1  Materials (workbook) 83
3.3.3.1(a)  Coherence 84
3.3.3.1(b)  Cohesion 87

3.3.3.2  Method 88

3.3.4  Essay evaluation and analysis 89

3.3.5  Sample analyses 92
3.3.5.1  Pre-test 92
3.3.5.2  Post-test 98

3.4  CONCLUSION 103

CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH FINDINGS 104

4.0  INTRODUCTION 104

4.1  RESULTS 104

4.1.1  Statistical procedures 104
4.1.2  Results and interpretations 105

4.1.2.1  H1: Holistic coherence transfer hypothesis 105
4.1.2.2  H2: Conjunctive cohesion density hypothesis 107
4.1.2.3  H3: Functional relations density hypothesis 109

4.2  DISCUSSION 111

4.2.1  Aims and results 111

4.3  REVIEW 112
4.3.1  Holistic coherence rating findings 113
4.3.2  Interdependence hypothesis 113
4.3.3  Threats to the study 115