

**MAXIMISING THE ECONOMIC RETURNS OF ROAD  
INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT**

by

**HUBERT JOYNT**

submitted in accordance with the requirements

for the degree of

**DOCTOR OF COMMERCE**

in the subject

**TRANSPORT ECONOMICS**

at the

**UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA**

**PROMOTOR: PROF M SHAHIA**

**JOINT PROMOTOR: PROF A BRITS**

NOVEMBER 2004

## SUMMARY

The aim of this study is to explore ways to maximise the economic returns of road infrastructure investment. In order to achieve this objective, the study was divided into five parts involving the following: analysing the nature of road infrastructure, determining the relationship between road infrastructure investment and economic development, considering aspects of economic modelling, developing a formula of road investment, and refocusing road investment practices.

In the first part the characteristics of road infrastructure are examined and the demand and supply approaches to road investment outlined. The focus is on the balanced approach versus the unbalanced approach to infrastructure investment. The second part analyses the causal relationship between road investment and economic development. Four components are highlighted, namely the investment component, the network-performance component, the transport economic component and the economic development component. The third part analyses the applicability of modelling techniques. In the fifth part, the formula of road investment and economic development is focused on four markets. Finally, it is argued that road infrastructure investment must be refocused.

The following was found:

Road infrastructure investment must be demand led. This is because of the characteristics of roads, namely their indivisibility, long gestation period, lumpiness and high cost.

Road infrastructure investment can only realise economic development if the four causality components are complied with simultaneously.

Input-output modelling is preferred in South Africa. The modelling strategy developed in this study is recommended for transport economic studies.

The probability of economic returns of road infrastructure investment is a function of the real estate market, the land development market, the urban economic market and the infrastructure market.

An agenda for reform in the road investment industry was also proposed.

The study clearly identifies the relationship between road infrastructure investment and economic development, and the proposed formula is an appropriate tool for a first-order priority system.

## **KEY TERMS**

Economic returns; Road infrastructure; Land development; Real estate; Urban economics; Economic development; Road investment; Economic modelling; Causality; Demand led; Priority system; Unbalanced approach; Nature of roads; Maximising returns; Decision making.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my gratitude to the following persons and institutions:

- Prof M Shahia, my promoter, for his advice and guidance
- Prof A Brits, for his continuous input and comments
- The University of South Africa (Department of Transport Economics and Logistics) and the National Department of Transport (Northern Centre of Development) for their financial assistance
- Ms ME Joubert from the Editorial Department of the University of South Africa for the linguistic editing
- The following colleagues at the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality who assisted me with modelling, typing, editing and technical matters:

Ms A Schoeman

Mr K Olivier

Mr M Babamia

Mr H Wehmeyer

Mr J van den Berg

(v)  
**INDEX**

	<b>PAGE</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION</b>	
1.1 BACKGROUND.....	1-1
1.2 ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK OF TRANSPORT AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT .....	1-3
1.2.1 Road infrastructure investment.....	1-6
1.2.2 Economic returns .....	1-8
1.3 HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE .....	1-10
1.4 PROBLEM STATEMENT .....	1-13
1.4.1 General.....	1-13
1.4.2 The problem.....	1-21
1.4.3 The goal of the study.....	1-24
1.5 IMPORTANCE OF AND REASON FOR STUDY .....	1-25
1.6 METHODOLOGY .....	1-27
1.6.1 Literature study .....	1-27
1.6.2 Empirical study .....	1-28
1.7 CHAPTER LAYOUT .....	1-28
<b>CHAPTER 2: THE NATURE OF ROAD INFRASTRUCTURE</b>	
2.1 INTRODUCTION .....	2-1
2.2 DEMAND AND SUPPLY CHARACTERISTICS OF ROAD INFRASTRUCTURE.....	2-2
2.2.1 Framework for analysing transport supply .....	2-4
2.2.2 Framework for analysing transport demand .....	2-8
2.3 THE DEMAND VERSUS SUPPLY APPROACH TO ROAD INFRASTRUCTURE PROVISION.....	2-13
2.3.1 The balanced growth doctrine .....	2-14
2.3.2 The unbalanced growth doctrine.....	2-20

2.4	ROADS AS ECONOMIC INFRASTRUCTURE.....	2-25
2.4.1	Characteristics of roads as economic infrastructure .....	2-28
2.4.2	Indivisibilities of infrastructure .....	2-32
2.5	THE EXTERNALITIES OF ROAD INFRASTRUCTURE .....	2-33
2.5.1	Technological externalities .....	2-35
2.5.2	Pecuniary externalities.....	2-36
2.5.3	Externalities and economic efficiency .....	2-37
2.6	SUMMARY.....	2-38
2.6.1	Demand and supply characteristics of road infrastructure .....	2-39
2.6.2	Demand versus supply approach to road infrastructure provision .....	2-40
2.6.3	Roads as economic infrastructure .....	2-41
2.6.4	The externalities of road infrastructure .....	2-41
2.7	CONCLUSION.....	2-42

### **CHAPTER 3: THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ROAD INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT**

3.1	INTRODUCTION .....	3-1
3.2	THE MEANING OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT.....	3-2
3.2.1	Economic growth and road infrastructure .....	3-4
3.2.2	Development and road infrastructure.....	3-6
3.2.3	Economic impacts .....	3-7
3.3	CAUSALITY BETWEEN ROAD INFRASTRUCTURE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT .....	3-10
3.4	THE INVESTMENT COMPONENT.....	3-14
3.4.1	Introduction .....	3-14
3.4.2	The type of investment .....	3-16
3.4.3	The magnitude of investment .....	3-20
3.4.4	The efficiency of investment.....	3-28
3.4.5	Implications for economic development .....	3-32

3.5	THE NETWORK PERFORMANCE COMPONENT .....	3-34
3.5.1	Accessibility and travel flows .....	3-35
3.5.2	Savings in vehicle operating costs .....	3-40
3.5.3	Network effectiveness .....	3-41
3.5.4	Interaction with other transport facilities .....	3-44
3.5.5	Implications for economic development .....	3-44
3.6	TRANSPORT ECONOMIC BEHAVIOUR .....	3-47
3.6.1	Locational and real effects .....	3-47
3.6.2	Social equity and the environment.....	3-52
3.6.3	Implications for economic development .....	3-56
3.7	THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMPONENT .....	3-59
3.7.1	The multiplier effect and road infrastructure investment.....	3-60
3.7.2	Employment creation.....	3-63
3.7.3	Urban market competition and economic development.....	3-63
3.7.4	Implications for economic development .....	3-65
3.8	SUMMARY.....	3-67
3.8.1	Economic impacts .....	3-67
3.8.2	The interrelationship between road infrastructure investment and economic development .....	3-68
3.8.3	The investment component .....	3-68
3.8.4	The network performance component .....	3-69
3.8.5	The transport economic behaviour component .....	3-70
3.8.6	The economic development component.....	3-70
3.9	CONCLUSION.....	3-71
 <b>CHAPTER 4: ECONOMIC MODELLING AND CASE STUDIES</b>		
4.1	INTRODUCTION .....	4-1
4.2	ECONOMIC MODELLING.....	4-2
4.3	MODELLING STRATEGY.....	4-4
4.3.1	Definition of study area .....	4-6
4.3.2	Market and real estate analysis .....	4-7
4.3.3	Impacts of road infrastructure improvements .....	4-8
4.3.4	Regional and business attraction impacts.....	4-8



4.3.5	Economic modelling and impact analysis .....	4-9
4.3.6	Economic impact checklist .....	4-9
4.4	INTERNATIONAL CASE STUDIES .....	4-12
4.4.1	Case study selection .....	4-12
4.4.2	An Australian approach.....	4-13
4.4.3	United Kingdom approaches.....	4-17
4.5	SOUTH AFRICAN CASE STUDIES .....	4-22
4.5.1	Proposed road K8.....	4-22
4.5.2	Proposed road K16.....	4-24
4.5.3	Mabopane-Centurion Development Corridor (MCDC): road PWV9..	4-26
4.6	FINDINGS AND COMPARISONS.....	4-28
4.6.1	Key findings .....	4-31
4.6.2	Comparisons .....	4-33
4.7	MODELLING ASSESSMENT .....	4-35
4.7.1	Input-output accounting models .....	4-35
4.7.2	General equilibrium simulation models .....	4-40
4.8	STUDY AND MODELLING APPROACH.....	4-43
4.9	SUMMARY .....	4-47
4.10	CONCLUSION.....	4-50
 <b>CHAPTER 5: THE FORMULA FOR ROAD INVESTMENT AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT</b>		
5.1	INTRODUCTION .....	5-1
5.2	INTERPRETATION OF THE ECONOMIC EFFECTS OF ROAD INVESTMENT .....	5-1
5.2.1	Urban economic market.....	5-5
5.2.2	Land development market .....	5-7
5.2.3	Real estate market .....	5-9
5.2.4	Road and other infrastructure market.....	5-11

5.3	FORMULATION OF THEORY AND PERFORMANCE INDICATORS .....	5-14
5.3.1	Explanation of formula .....	5-15
5.3.2	The urban economic market.....	5-19
5.3.3	The land development market.....	5-24
5.3.4	The real estate market.....	5-29
5.3.5	The road and other infrastructure market .....	5-33
5.4	APPLICATION OF FORMULA .....	5-37
5.4.1	Road K8 .....	5-39
5.4.2	The MCDC (road PWV9).....	5-48
5.4.3	Road K16.....	5-57
5.5	PRACTICAL APPLICATION.....	5-66
5.6	SUMMARY.....	5-71
5.8	CONCLUSION.....	5-75
 <b>CHAPTER 6: ROAD INVESTMENT: PRACTICES AND MAXIMISED ECONOMIC RETURNS</b>		
6-1	INTRODUCTION .....	6-1
6.2	ROAD INVESTMENT PRACTICES AND MAXIMISED ECONOMIC RETURNS.....	6-1
6.3	MAXIMISED ECONOMIC RETURNS: POLICY MAKING VERSUS INVESTMENT DECISIONS .....	6-5
6.3.1	Efficiency assessments of roads K8, K16 and PWV9.....	6-10
6.3.2	The effectiveness of the investment in roads K8, K16 and PWV9.....	6-11
6.3.3	The impacts of roads K8, K16 and PWV9 .....	6-12
6.4	REFOCUSING ROAD INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT .....	6-20
6.4.1	Creating greater efficiency in road infrastructure investment decisions .....	6-22
6.4.2	Rethinking road prioritisation.....	6-23
6.4.3	Depoliticising road infrastructure investment decisions .....	6-23
6.4.4	Institutional reforms .....	6-24
6.5	SUMMARY .....	6-25

6.6	CONCLUSION.....	6-27
<b>CHAPTER 7: FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION</b>		
7.1	INTRODUCTION .....	7-1
7.2	SUMMARY.....	7-2
7.2.1	The nature of road infrastructure.....	7-2
7.2.2	The relationship between road infrastructure investment and economic development .....	7-6
7.2.3	Economic modelling and case studies.....	7-11
7.2.4	The formula of road investment and economic development .....	7-14
7.2.5	Road investment practices and maximised economic returns .....	7-17
7.3	FINDINGS .....	7-20
7.3.1	Subgoal 1: To analyse the relationship between road infrastructure investment and economic development .....	7-21
7.3.2	Subgoal 2: To determine under what conditions road investment will maximise the economic returns of spatial locations .....	7-22
7.3.3	Subgoal 3: To develop a procedure to ensure that road investment proposals will maximise the economic returns associated with road investment .....	7-24
7.3.4	Subgoal 4: To develop a formula of road investment and economic development .....	7-26
7.3.5	Subgoal 5: To develop an understanding of the relationship between decision making, road investment practices and actual economic returns .....	7-26
7.4	CONCLUSIONS .....	7-28
7.5	RECOMMENDATIONS.....	7-30
7.6	FUTURE RESEARCH.....	7-31

**LIST OF FIGURES**

	<b>Page</b>
Figure 1.1: Framework for analysing the performance of the road transport sector .....	1-3
Figure 1.2: National outcomes triangle.....	1-4
Figure 1.3: Some factors influencing the development of transport systems and transport/development relationships .....	1-5
Figure 2.1: The basic approach to urban transport demand.....	2-9
Figure 2.2: Relation between social capital and directly productive activities	2-21
Figure 2.3: External diseconomies of traffic congestion.....	2-34
Figure 3.1: The basic causality paradigm of the relationships between transport infrastructure investment and economic development.....	3-13
Figure 3.2: Reserve capacity approach .....	3-30
Figure 3.3: Industrial location decisions .....	3-51
Figure 4.1: Study and modelling methodology .....	4-45
Figure 5.1: Road network and land-use cycle .....	5-2
Figure 5.2: Market flow sequence .....	5-5
Figure 5.3: Scoring for agglomeration economies.....	5-21
Figure 5.4: Scoring for the maturity of market.....	5-23
Figure 5.5: Scoring for development applications .....	5-26
Figure 5.6: Scoring for development activity.....	5-27
Figure 5.7: Scoring for illegal land uses .....	5-28
Figure 5.8: Changes in real estate demand.....	5-29
Figure 5.9: Scoring for real estate demand (10-year growth).....	5-30
Figure 5.10: Scoring for building plans .....	5-30

Figure 5.11: Scoring for industrial rental rates .....	5-31
Figure 5.12: Scoring for retail rental rates .....	5-31
Figure 5.13: Scoring for vacancy rates .....	5-32
Figure 5.14: Scoring for leakage or inflow .....	5-35
Figure 5.15: Scoring for reduction in transport cost.....	5-36
Figure 5.16: Illustration of necessary preconditions and relationships between road infrastructure investment and economic development .....	5-38
Figure 5.17: Increase in real estate demand for road K8 (2000 – 2010) .....	5-44
Figure 5.18: Increase in real estate demand for road PWV9 (2000 – 2010)...	5-53
Figure 5.19: Increase in real estate demand for road K16 (2000 – 2010) .....	5-61
Figure 6.1: The role of policy making in achieving economic growth .....	6-6
Figure 6.2: Relationship between inputs, outputs, outcomes and impacts of road projects .....	6-9

<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
Table 3.1: The net road capital stock in Australia and the USA .....	3-17
Table 3.2: Expenditure on new road construction (1988) .....	3-18
Table 3.3: Australian arterial road expenditures by type of expenditure (1992-1993) .....	3-19
Table 3.4: Reduction in market area as a function of reduced travel speed...	3-27
Table 3.5: Economic development implications of the investment component for road K8 .....	3-33
Table 3.6: Economic development implications of the investment component for road K16.....	3-33
Table 3.7: Economic development implications of the investment component for road PWV9.....	3-34
Table 3.8: Accessibility and travel flows for roads K8, K16 and PWV9 .....	3-39
Table 3.9: Travel time reductions for roads K8, K16 and PWV9.....	3-41
Table 3.10: Network efficiency for roads K8, K16 and PWV9 (morning peak hour, 2005) .....	3-43
Table 3.11: Economic development and network performance for road K8 .....	3-45
Table 3.12: Economic development and network performance for road K16 .....	3-46
Table 3.13: Economic development and network performance for road PWV9 .....	3-46
Table 3.14: Economic development and transport economic behaviour for road K8.....	3-58
Table 3.15: Economic development and transport economic behaviour for road K16.....	3-58
Table 3.16: Economic development and transport economic behaviour for road PWV9 .....	3-59

Table 3.17: The economic development component of road K8 .....	3-66
Table 3.18: The economic development component of road K16 .....	3-66
Table 3.19: The economic development component of road PWV9 .....	3-67
Table 4.1: Checklist for comparing case studies .....	4-28
Table 5.1: Scoring for business attraction .....	5-20
Table 5.2: Scoring for maturity of market.....	5-23
Table 5.3: Subcharacteristics of market exposure .....	5-24
Table 5.4: The urban economic market.....	5-24
Table 5.5 Subcharacteristics of development stimulus ....	5-25
Table 5.6: The land development market.....	5-28
Table 5.7: The real estate market .....	5-33
Table 5.8: Scoring for infrastructure provision .....	5-34
Table 5.9: Scoring for traffic demand.....	5-34
Table 5.10: Road and other infrastructure market .....	5-36
Table 5.11: Scoring of market exposure for road K8.....	5-40
Table 5.12: The urban economic market of road K8 .....	5-40
Table 5.13 Scoring of development stimulus for road K8 .....	5-41
Table 5.14: The land development market of road K8.....	5-43
Table 5.15: The real estate market of road K8 .....	5-46
Table 5.16: The road and other infrastructure market of road K8.....	5-47
Table 5.17: Scoring of market exposure for road PWV9 .....	5-50
Table 5.18: The urban economic market of road PWV9.....	5-50
Table 5.19 Scoring of development stimulus of road PWV9 .....	5-51

Table 5.20: The land development market of road PWV9.....	5-52
Table 5.21: The real estate market of road PWV9.....	5-54
Table 5.22: The road and other infrastructure market of road PWV9.....	5-56
Table 5.23: Scoring of market exposure for road K8 .....	5-58
Table 5.24: The urban economic market of road K16 .....	5-58
Table 5.25 Scoring of development stimulus of road K16 .....	5.59
Table 5.26: The land development market of road K16 .....	5.60
Table 5.27: The real estate market of road K16 .....	5.63
Table 5.28: The road and other infrastructure market of road K16 .....	5.64
Table 6.1: Road cost and jobs created (2005-2010).....	6-11
Table 6.2: Socioeconomic growth for roads K8, K16 and PWV9 .....	6-13
Table 6.3: Trend scenario for socioeconomic growth of road K8 (2005 – 2020) .....	6-18
Table 6.4: Trend scenario for socioeconomic growth of road K16 (2005 – 2020) .....	6-19
Table 6.5: Trend scenario for socioeconomic growth of road PWV9 (2005 – 2020) .....	6-19



<b>SCREENS</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
Screen 1: Event tree for economic returns .....	5-67
Screen 2: Economic returns: profiles for subcriteria.....	5-67
Screen 3: Land development: profiles for subcriteria .....	5-68
Screen 4: Real estate: profiles for subcriteria.....	5-68
Screen 5: Infrastructure: profiles for subcriteria .....	5-68
Screen 6: Urban economics: profiles for subcriteria.....	5-69
Screen 7: Economic returns and land development.....	5-69
Screen 8: Economic returns and real estate.....	5-70
Screen 9: Economic returns and infrastructure.....	5-70
Screen 10: Economic returns and urban economics .....	5-71
Graph 1: Modelling of the road network without roads K8, K16 and PWV9 (2005 traffic volumes).....	3-37
Graph 2: Modelling of the road network including road K8 (2005 traffic volumes).....	3-38
Graph 3: Modelling of the road network including road K16 (2005 traffic volumes).....	3-38
Graph 4: Modelling of the road network including road PWV9 (2005 traffic volumes).....	3-39
Plan 1: Location of the MCDC (road PWV9) .....	1-15
Plan 2: Location of road K8 .....	1-17
Plan 3: Location of road K16 .....	1-18

## **ANNEXURES**

Annexure A: Checklist for economic modelling

Annexure B: Levels of service

## **REFERENCES**

**ABBREVIATIONS**

Anon	Anonymous
CBD	Central business district
CSIR	Council for Scientific and Industrial Research
DBSA	Development Bank of South Africa
DETR	Department of Environment, Transport and Regions
DOT	Department of Transport
DPA	Directly productive activities
DTI	Department of Trade and Industry
ER	Economic returns
GDP	Gross domestic product
GGP	Gross geographic product
GNP	Gross national product
GPMC	Greater Pretoria Metropolitan Council
ICASS	Integrated corridor assessment system
IRR	Internal rate of return
LED	Local economic development
LOS	Level of service
MCA	Multi criteria analysis
MCDC	Mabopane Centurion Development Corridor
MOTE	Model of transport and the economy
MSA	Moving South Africa

NBI	National Business Initiative
NPV	Net present value
SA	South Africa
SC	Social capital
SDI	Spatial development initiatives
SMC	Social marginal cost
SMME	Small, medium and micro enterprises
TCC	Transport Coordinating Committee
TPS	Typology and priority system
UE	Urban-Econ
USA	United States of America