“DISABLED IDENTITIES”: PASTORAL WORK WITH PEOPLE WHO ARE MOBILITY IMPAIRED

by

ALVEAN ILLINOIS JACOBS

submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF THEOLOGY

in the subject

PRACTICAL THEOLOGY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

PROMOTER: PROF J S DREYER

JOINT PROMOTER: DR. M E HESTENES
This thesis is about pastoral work with people who live with mobility impairment. The research address two main questions, namely “What are the implications of acquired mobility impairment for personal identity and collective identity?” and “How can we in Christian faith communities, through pastoral work, facilitate a sense of belonging and strengthen personal identity and collective identity for people who are mobility disadvantaged?”

This thesis therefore addresses the problem of identity. Thus, a theoretical analysis from literature sources is undertaken to explore theories about narrative identity in relation to personal identity and the importance of the metaphor “belonging” to bridge the gap of personal identity to collective identity. Consequently, religious identity is discussed in relation to the notion of multiple identities and the importance of collective identity to shaping personal identity.

The research questions are answered through a theoretical exploration of approaches to disability and qualitative, narrative empirical research is undertaken. A few people who are quadriplegic, a family member and an occupational therapist are interviewed and the recounting of their “stories” facilitated. The empirical research results in highlighting that the research participants’ “stories” discloses a link between bodily restrictions and social restrictions to mobility. This combination works together to make social interaction very difficult and clearly influenced the transition from pre-quadriplegia to post-quadriplegia. Analysing the “stories” told by the research participants allows for critical reflection on a preferred pastoral work praxis to people living with mobility impairment.

Narrative identity is linked with a theology of embrace and metaphors of “covenant” and “belonging” which expresses that faith communities should
imitate the embracing love and compassion of the Triune God who through the act of suffering included all humankind. It provides the foundation for a preferred pastoral work praxis of “embrace” which can be practised holistically and actively through integration with the other practices of faith communities to facilitate a sense of belonging to a collective identity.

**KEY TERMS:** People who are mobility impaired; identity; lack of social interaction; theology of embrace; narrative identity; holistic care; communal and contextual care; integrated practices; pastoral work praxis of embrace.
I declare that “DISABLED IDENTITIES”: PASTORAL WORK WITH PEOPLE WHO ARE MOBILITY IMPAIRED is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.
I dedicate this thesis to my family:

- To my mother Alvina Antonia Jacobs who died on the 6th August 2002 to go home to a well earned rest in a resurrected body.
- To my father David Stefanus Jacobs who died on the 23rd May 2001 to be with the Lord.
- To my three brothers and two sisters-in-law David, Frank and Cheryl, Clement and Michelle (Mickey).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost I am grateful to God for giving me the strength and perseverance to complete this thesis. Proverbs 3:5 “Trust in the Lord with all your heart and lean not to your own understanding...” encouraged me.

The completion of this thesis marks a time of personal academic growth. I am deeply grateful to a number of people who helped me in so many ways that encouraged me to keep persevering and in this time have contributed to my own inner growth and achievement. I would like to mention those who gave of their time for me.

My promoter, Professor Dreyer who gave consistent support, guidance, valuable criticism and with extreme patience helped me to grow in my learning experience. I appreciated and valued his encouragement and the memory of it will remain with me.

My joint promoter Doctor Hestenes who gave constructive criticism and support. I appreciate his contribution to my academic growth.

The librarians who were exceptionally helpful: Mrs N Thirion, since retired, who went out of her way to assist me over the years. Mrs E Nel who in the last year assisted me in every way possible.

My daily helper Martha Visser who assists me in the home and who was my
driver to the research participants home and between my home and the University. Without her this research could not have been finished. I appreciated her contribution that made it possible to complete this work.

My friends who helped me: Phil Malherbe and Barbara Bradley who diligently edited my work and for their encouragement; Dorette Burger who help with typing corrections; Albert Booyens and Kevin O’Reiley who were always so willing to help sort out computer problems; Jenny Charles who helped transcribe tape-recordings; my cousin Magda MaCaskill who helped with the tiring work of printing; Roy Charles who helped with the binding and final finish of the thesis; all my friends who prayed for me so consistently, especially those of the prayer group in Johannesburg, and my friends in Pretoria; special thanks to Clive and Cynthia Douglas for their interest and all their support. I am indebted to all of them.

Finally, as a tribute to my research participants, who endured and shared in my efforts to complete this study, a poem is dedicated to them. It was written by a person who is not disabled, but a motivational speech given by a quadriplegic changed this person’s direction in life.

Life is Worth Living   By Felix Gosher 24/04/2004

When I feel like I’m in the worst shoes,
The world is on my shoulders and the right to be happy is refused.
Everything I long for, is beyond my reach,
This negativity, is robbing, like a ravenous leech.
I’m so unhappy with who I am, on this massive earth,
Why did I actually come out and breathe, at my birth.

I have everything essential for an able life.
Yet I feel like slitting wrists with a razor sharp knife.
But then I walked into a silent class one day,
And witnessed something awesome, I had no words to say.
A man with less than half my physical ability and form,
Sat there with a smile, happy to have been born.
Most of his able life, had been permanently lost.
Yet he lifted his spirit and discovered hope, despite the great physical cost.
He has triumphed over all that has ever set him back,
Listening to him, made me question if there really is, anything he lacks.
For at the end of the day it's all about living,
This man has suffered reality, yet he's still always giving.
The special people who rise from the dark,
In a miserable being like me, inspire a spark.
For they are chosen from God above,
To live a life of strength and hope, on the wings of a dove.

And although they are 'different', they are one and the same,
They have feelings, emotions, and experience pain.
They are fighters and winners and Gladiators of Being,
Watching them succeed is inspirationally worth seeing.
To live the day to its fullest and appreciates its all,
Is to enjoy and honour, and answer God's call.
For if they, the special ones, can overcome strife,
I have no right to waste this precious thing, called life.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

### SUMMARY AND KEY WORDS

i

### DECLARATION

iii

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

iv

## CHAPTER ONE

**BECOMING PART OF ANOTHER’S NARRATIVE**

1.1 **INTRODUCTION** 1

1.2 **THE INTELLECTUAL PUZZLE** 5

1.3 **THE AIMS OF THIS STUDY** 10

1.4 **THE REASONS FOR THIS STUDY** 12

1.5 **THEOLOGICAL POSITIONING** 16

1.5.1 A practical theological position 16

1.5.2 Contextual and faith community-based theology 19

1.5.3 A theology of embrace 24

1.6 **THE RESEARCH POSITIONING: QUALITATIVE RESEARCH** 30

1.6.1 Practical theology and empirical research 31

1.6.2 Qualitative research design 32

1.6.2.1 *Sampling strategy* 35

1.6.2.2 *Participant observer* 36

1.6.2.3 *Narrative analysis process and reporting of results* 37

1.7 **THE PLAN OF THE STUDY** 38

1.8 **CONCLUSION** 42
CHAPTER TWO
NARRATIVE IDENTITY

2.1 INTRODUCTION 44
2.2 THEORY OF NARRATIVE AND SELF 45
2.3 NARRATIVE IDENTITY 48
2.3.1 The dimension of self and personal identity 49
2.3.1.1 Identity and language 49
2.3.1.2 The person as a basic particular 51
2.3.2 The dialectic of “selfhood” and “sameness” 57
2.3.3 Dialectic of “self” and “another” 61
2.3.4 The connection of temporal and relational dimensions 65
2.3.5 Collective identity 66
2.3.5.1 Narrative identity and meaning 66
2.3.5.2 Narrative identity and the ethical dimension of collective life 67
2.4 IDENTITIES IN A PLURALISED SOCIETY 70
2.4.1 Multiple identities 70
2.4.2 Religious identity 73
2.5 CONCLUSION 77

CHAPTER THREE
MOBILITY IMPAIRMENT

3.1 INTRODUCTION 78
3.2 WHAT DISABILITY IS ABOUT 78
3.2.1 National and international views on disability 81
3.2.2 A definition of disability 84
### CHAPTER FOUR

EXPERIENCES OF MOBILITY IMPAIRMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 THE METHODS OF THE EMPIRICAL STUDY</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 The research design</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Selection of research participants</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Participant observer</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Interviews and narrative generation</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5 Analysis of narratives</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6 Research participants' narrative report</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 SUMMARY OF THE PARTICIPANTS</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Demographic details</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Participant code name: Jeff</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Participant code name: Tess</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4 Participant code name: Reg</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5 Participants code names: Kit - daughter, Kel - mother</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5.1 Kel's story</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Background to Kel’s story</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) Course and time-related phases</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Development of Kel’s story</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) Course and time-related phases</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Course and time-related phases</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Course and time-related phases</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
iv) Financial loss and stress 189
v) Independence/independence/physical impairment barriers 190
c) Ending of Kel’s story up to beginning 2004 190
4.4 MAIN THEMES FROM PARTICIPANTS’ STORIES 193
4.4.1 Narrative of personal restrictions 194
4.4.1.1 Personal bodily restrictions 194
4.4.1.2 The personal restrictions of finances 196
4.4.2 Understanding of God 198
4.4.2.1 A relationship with God 198
4.4.2.2 The relationship with their faith communities and traditions 200
4.4.3 Social interaction of people who are mobility disadvantaged 206
4.4.3.1 Environmental barriers 206
4.4.3.2 Government policy’s influence on the economic situation 210
4.4.4 Socio-cultural oppression 213
4.4.4.1 Behaviour and attitude of family and significant others 213
4.4.4.2 Behaviour and attitude of the public 215
4.5 CONCLUSION 224

CHAPTER FIVE
A THEOLOGY OF EMBRACE: AN ALTERNATIVE NARRATIVE FOR PASTORAL WORK BY FAITH COMMUNITIES

5.1 INTRODUCTION 227
5.2 THE CHRISTIAN FAITH COMMUNITY IN RELATION TO PASTORAL WORK PRAXIS 229
5.2.1 The role of Christian spirituality 232
5.2.2 Christian caring
5.2.3 The major types of pastoral work praxis in faith communities
  5.2.3.1 Mutual care
  5.2.3.2 Pastoral care
  5.2.3.3 Pastoral counselling
  5.2.3.4 Pastoral therapy
5.2.4 An integrated pastoral work praxis
5.3 A THEORY OF PASTORAL WORK PRAXIS FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE MOBILITY IMPAIRED
  5.3.1 Pastoral work praxis: a drama of embrace
  5.3.2 Faith communities’ responsibility in the drama of embrace with people who live with mobility impairment
    5.3.2.1 A “communion of struggle”
      a) Critical reflection and resistance of internal faith communities’ structures of oppression
      b) Repentance by Christian faith communities
      c) Commitment to facilitate a sense of belonging
         i) Faith communities “being present” for “another
         ii) Remembering “stories” with the “different others”
         iii) Feedback of specific actions in faith communities
      d) Specific needs
         i) The need for a relationship with God
         ii) The need for social and religious interaction
         iii) Specific needs of homebound periods
5.4 SUMMARY OF THE STUDY
5.5 CONCLUSION

Figure 3.1 The interaction between a disease, individual and family members 137

Figure 3.2 An example of the interaction in the psychosocial development of tasks 138

Figure 4.1 Example of a question during an interview 161
Figure 4.2 Sample of questions flowing from first interview 162
Figure 4.3 Significant events associated with the unfolding narrative of mobility impairment 165
Figure 4.4 Framework of narrative plot in relation to mobility impairment 166
Figure 4.5 An example of one narrative plot 167
Figure 4.6 An example of the development of two of the narrative plots 167
Figure 4.7 An example of arranging and coding text 168
Figure 4.8 Illustration of demographic profiles of participants 172
Figure 5.1 An example of a negative overlapping in practical life 248
Figure 5.2 An example of a positive and preferable overlapping 249
Figure 5.3 An example of the interwoven actions of faith communities with pastoral work 250
Figure 5.4 Pastoral circle of praxis 277
Figure 5.5 Pastoral work praxis in cooperation with other practices in faith communities 278
Figure 5.6 Pastoral work praxis in the home by faith communities 294
Figure 5.7 An example of the external action of pastoral work to reach people who are physically disadvantaged 296
| APPENDIX A | 305 |
| APPENDIX B | 306 |
| APPENDIX C | 308 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | 309 |