<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADA</td>
<td>Americans with Disabilities Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADEA</td>
<td>Age Discrimination in Employment Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIR</td>
<td>All India Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALJ</td>
<td>Administrative Law Judges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AP</td>
<td>Andhra Pradesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARB</td>
<td>Arbitration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bom.</td>
<td>Bombay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCEA</td>
<td>Basic Conditions of Employment Act of 1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCLR</td>
<td>Butterworths Constitutional Law Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BFOQ</td>
<td>Bona Fide Occupational Qualification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLLR</td>
<td>Butterworths Labour Law Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC</td>
<td>Constitutional Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCMA</td>
<td>Commission for Conciliation Mediation and Arbitration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFR</td>
<td>Code of Federal Regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cir.</td>
<td>Circuit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJ</td>
<td>Chief Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co.</td>
<td>Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRA</td>
<td>Civil Rights Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DBE</td>
<td>Disadvantaged Business Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEA</td>
<td>Employment Equity Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEOC</td>
<td>Equal Employment Opportunity Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EO</td>
<td>Executive Order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEPC</td>
<td>Fair Employment Practices Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GG</td>
<td>Government Gazette</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HNP</td>
<td>Hereinigde National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IC</td>
<td>Indian Constitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDRA</td>
<td>Intercultural Development Research Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILJ</td>
<td>Industrial Law Journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISC</td>
<td>Indian Supreme Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ker.</td>
<td>Kerala</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
USCA    United States: Code of America
US      United States
VEVRA   Vietnam Era Veterans Readjustment Act
VEVRAA  Vietnam Era Veterans’ Readjustment Assistance Act
VCT     Voluntary Counselling and Testing
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ACRONYMS</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## PART I
A HISTORY OF DISCRIMINATION — SETTING THE STAGE FOR PRESENT DAY AFFIRMATIVE ACTION MEASURES

### CHAPTER ONE  GENERAL INTRODUCTION
1.1 The Purpose of this Thesis.................................................. 2  
1.2 Why a Comparative Analysis................................................. 2  
1.3 The Chapters..................................................................... 3  

### CHAPTER TWO  A HISTORICAL BASIS FOR AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN SOUTH AFRICA
2.1 Introduction................................................................... 7  
2.2 South Africa — An Overview............................................. 8  
2.3 Historical Background.................................................... 9  
2.3.1 The Anglo-Boer War 1899 — 1902................................. 11  
2.3.2 World War II............................................................... 12  
2.3.3 Apartheid: 1948 — 1989............................................... 15  
2.3.4 The Consolidation of White Power................................. 18  
2.3.4.1 Legal Restrictions — An Overview......................... 18  
   (i) The Industrial Conciliation Act and the Mines and Works Act.................. 19  
   (ii) The Wage Act and the Public Services Act.............. 20
(iii) The Native Labour Regulation Act .................. 20
(iv) The Natives Land Act and the Bantu Authorities Act .................. 21
(v) The Native Urban Areas Act .................. 21
(vi) Bantu Building Workers Act .................. 22
(vii) Native Labour (Settlement of Disputes) Act .... 22
(viii) Bantu Education Act .................. 22

2.3.5 State Machinery and Apartheid .................. 23
2.3.6 Computers and Labour .................. 23

2.4 Repeal .................. 25
2.4.1 International Law and Apartheid .................. 25
2.4.2 Internal Changes .................. 27

2.5 Post Apartheid — pre 1994 .................. 29

CHAPTER THREE SETTING THE STAGE FOR AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

3.1 The USA — An Overview .................. 32
3.2 Slavery .................. 33
3.3 The Jim Crow System .................. 37
3.4 African Americans and Hispanic Americans .................. 37
3.5 Segregation in the Industries .................. 38
  3.5.1 The Construction Industry .................. 38
  3.5.2 The Textile Industry .................. 39
  3.5.3 The Tobacco Industry .................. 39
  3.5.4 The Pulp and Paper Industry .................. 39
    3.5.4.1 The Migration .................. 40
  3.5.5 The Automobile Industry .................. 40
  3.5.6 The Steel Industry .................. 40
  3.5.7 Government Employment .................. 41
  3.5.8 Organised Labour .................. 42
3.6 Time-line of Affirmative Action Milestones………………………... 42
3.7 Executive Orders………………………………………………………… 44
(i) President Theodore Roosevelt (1901-1909)…………………….. 44
(ii) Warren G Harding (1921-1923)………………………………... 44
(iii) Executive Orders 9980 and 9981……………………………… 45
(iv) Executive Order 10479……………………………………… 45
3.8 The Passing of Civil Rights Legislation……………………………. 46
(i) President J F Kennedy and Executive Order 10952…………….. 46
3.9 The Civil Rights Act………………………………………………... 48
(i) President Lyndon Johnson and Executive Order 11246……….. 48
(ii) President Richard Nixon and the Philadelphia Order…………… 51
(iii) President Gerald R Ford……………………………………….. 52
(iv) President Ronald Reagan………………………………………. 52
3.10 The Civil Rights Time Line —
Milestones in the Civil Rights Movement…………………………… 53
3.11 Summary of Important Judicial Events and Other
Important Dates in the History of Affirmative Action……………… 56

CHAPTER FOUR  A BRIEF HISTORY OF
DISCRIMINATION IN INDIA

4.1 The Republic of India — Overview………………………………... 64
4.2 Understanding Caste and the Caste System……………………….. 64
4.3 The Evolution of the Theories of Caste and Class………………….. 67
  4.3.1 Caste and Closure…………………………………………… 70
4.4 Origins of the Cast System…………………………………………. 72
  4.4.1 The Religious Theory of the Caste or
  Varna Systems………………………………………………… 72
  4.4.1.2 The Theory of Purity………………………………..  75
4.4.2 The Historical or Indo-European Theory of
the Caste System……………………………………………. 76
4.4.3 The British and India………………………………………... 79
5.10 Reservations for the Beneficiaries.............................................. 130
  5.10.1 Important Aspects of the Scheme of
       Reservation for SC’s and ST’s........................................... 132
     5.10.1.1 Concessions to the SC’s and ST’
             Applicants.......................................................... 133
     5.10.1.2 Fifty Percent Limit in Reservation to
             Apply to Current as well as Backlog
             Vacancies.............................................................. 134
     5.10.1.3 Public Sector Undertakings and Other
             Autonomous Bodies................................................. 134
  5.10.2 Important Aspects of the Scheme of Reservation
      for Other Backward Classes............................................ 134
  5.11 Reservations for Special Groups (Other than Women)................. 135
  5.12 The Problem of the Suitably Qualified Candidate in India.......... 138
  5.13 Tensions in the Caste System.............................................. 139
  5.14 Upward Mobility in India.................................................. 141
  5.15 Affirmative Action and the Quota System in India,
      the USA and SA........................................................ 142
  5.16 Affirmative Action vs Preferential Treatment.......................... 144
  5.17 Understanding the Importance of the Definitions....................... 145

PART III
THE REGULATION OF DISCRIMINATION AND
AFFIRMATIVE ACTION MEASURES

CHAPTER SIX THE REGULATION OF AFFIRMATIVE
ACTION AND DISCRIMINATION IN SA

6.1 Anti-Discrimination Legislation in SA....................................... 153
   6.1.1 The Labour Relations Act............................................. 154
   6.1.2 The Promotion of Equality and Prevention of
       Unfair Discrimination Act............................................. 155
6.1.3 The Basic Conditions of Employment Act ......................... 156
6.1.4 The Skills Development Act ...................................... 157
6.1.5 The Employment Equity Act ..................................... 157
6.2 Constitutional Provisions ............................................. 158
   6.2.1 A Constitutional Basis for the EEA ......................... 158
   6.2.2 The Constitution and Equality .............................. 159
   6.2.3 The Constitution and Affirmative Action ................... 160
6.3 Application of the EEA .............................................. 161
   6.3.1 Scope of the EEA ............................................... 162
      6.3.1.1 Designated Employers .................................. 162
      6.3.1.2 Temporary Employment Services ...................... 163
      6.3.1.3 Independent Contractors ............................... 163
      6.3.1.4 Other Groups ........................................... 164
   6.3.2 The Beneficiaries of Affirmative Action .................... 164
6.4 The Regulation of Unfair Discrimination by the EEA ............ 164
6.5 Barriers to Employment Equity .................................... 166
   6.5.1 Harassment .................................................... 167
   6.5.2 Medical and HIV Testing .................................... 170
   6.5.3 Psychological Testing ...................................... 172
6.6 The Regulation of Affirmative Action in the EEA ............... 173
   6.6.1 Duties of a Designated Employer ............................ 174
   6.6.2 The Consultation Requirement ............................... 175
   6.6.3 The Requirements for Conducting an Analysis ............. 175
   6.6.4 The Types of Information to Collect ...................... 175
   6.6.5 The Workforce Profile ..................................... 175
   6.6.6 Preparing the Employment Equity Plan ..................... 176
   6.6.7 Reporting .................................................... 180
   6.6.8 Compliance with the Act ................................... 181
6.7 Affirmative Action and the Suitably Qualified Candidate ....... 182
6.8 Defences against Claims of Discrimination ..................... 183
   6.8.1 The Inherent Requirements of a Job ....................... 184
7.4 Defences or Exceptions to Prohibitions on Discriminatory Conduct……………………………………………. 223
  7.4.1 Business Necessity…………………………………………. 223
  7.4.2 Bona Fide Occupational Qualification………………….. 225
  7.4.3 Affirmative Action………………………………………… 228
7.5 What is Discriminatory Treatment or Disparate Impact?……… 229
  7.5.1 Allocation of Proof…………………………………………. 232
    (a) Prima facie case………………………………………… 233
    (b) Business necessity……………………………………… 233
    (c) Alternative practice with lesser impact…………………. 233
7.6 Title VII Violations………………………………………………… 234
  7.6.1 Sexual Harassment Discrimination………………………… 234
  7.6.2 Race and Colour Discrimination…………………………… 236
  7.6.3 National Origin Discrimination…………………………….. 237
  7.6.4 Other Anti-Discrimination Provisions……………………. 238
7.7 Executive Order 11246; Title VII and the EEA Compared……… 239
  7.7.1 Policies and Practices……………………………………….. 242
7.8 Executive Order Affirmative Action Requirements……………… 243
  7.8.1 For Supply and Service Contractors………………………… 243
  7.8.2 For Construction Contractors……………………………….. 244
7.9 The EEOC’s Affirmative Action Guidelines…………………… 244
7.10 The EEOC’s Guidelines under Title VII of the CRA…………… 245
  7.10.1 Circumstances Calling for Affirmative Action……………… 248
  7.10.2 Reliance on the Guidelines as a Defence to a Title VII Charge…………………………………………….. 249
7.11 Analysis of the Anti-Discriminatory Provisions in SA and the USA…………………………………………….. 250
# CHAPTER EIGHT  THE REGULATION OF DISCRIMINATION AND AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN INDIA

8.1 The Constitution of India and Anti-Discrimination Principles ........................................... 255  
  8.1.2 Fundamental Rights .................................................... 258  
  8.1.3 Group Rights .......................................................... 262  
8.2 The Constitution and Positive Discrimination ......................................................... 264  
8.3 The Constitution and Reservations ................................................................. 264  
  8.3.1 Reservations in Education ............................................... 266  
8.4 Time Frame for Reservations ........................................................................... 267  
8.5 Analysing the Constitutional Provisions ......................................................... 268  
8.6 Other Legislative Protections ........................................................................... 270  
  8.6.1 The Protection of Civil Rights Act ................................................. 271  
  8.6.2 The Bonded Labour System Act .................................................. 272  
  8.6.3 The Employment of Manual Scavengers and Construction of Dry Latrines (Prohibition) Act ................................................................. 273  
  8.6.4 The Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Act ................................................................. 273  
8.7 Discrimination in the Workforce ........................................................................... 275  
  8.7.1 Invidious Discrimination ......................................................................... 275  
  8.7.2 Sexual Harassment in India ......................................................................... 276  
8.8 Analysis of Provisions in SA, the USA and India ................................................ 279
PART IV
THE CONSTITUTIONAL DIMENSION OF
AFFIRMATIVE ACTION MEASURES

CHAPTER NINE  THE CONSTITUTIONAL DIMENSIONS
OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN SA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Affirmative Action and the Equality Principle in SA</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>How the CC Justifies Affirmative Action</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Understanding the Relationship Between Equality and Discrimination</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1</td>
<td>The Meaning of Discrimination</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.2</td>
<td>Problems with Proving Discrimination</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>The Development of the South African Constitutional Equality Jurisprudence</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.1</td>
<td>Equality and Differentiation</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i)</td>
<td>Establishing differentiation with a rational connection to its aim</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii)</td>
<td>Establishing Unfair Discrimination</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii)</td>
<td>Is the unfair discrimination justified?</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Analysing the CC’s Approach to the Equality Jurisprudence</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER TEN  THE CONSTITUTIONAL DIMENSIONS OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN THE USA

10.1 Overview……………………………………………………………….  315
10.2 The Supreme Court Affirmative Action Cases………………………  316
10.2.1 The Bakke Case…………………………………………………  316
10.2.2 Fullilove v Klutznick……………………………………………  320
10.2.3 The Weber Decision……………………………………………  322
10.2.4 Affirmative Action and Layoffs — The Wygant and Stotts Decisions…………………………………………….  323
10.2.4.1 The Wygant Decision………………………………………  325
10.2.5 The Sheet Metal Workers Case……………………………  326
10.2.6 The Paradise Case……………………………………………  326
10.2.7 The Johnson v Santa Clara Case……………………………  328
10.3 Constitutional Turning Points — The Rehnquist Court and the CRA of 1991…………………………………………………….  328
10.3.1 The Croson Case………………………………………………  329
10.3.2 Attack on Affirmative Action in Court………………………..  330
10.3.2.1 Hopwood v University of Texas Law School ……………………  330
10.3.2.2 Affirmative Action Today……………………………  331
10.3.2.3 The Grutter Case……………………………………  333
10.4 Analysing the Supreme Courts Decisions………………………..  344

CHAPTER ELEVEN THE CONSTITUTIONAL DIMENSIONS OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN INDIA

11.1 The IC and the Equality Principle…………………………………..  341
11.1.2 Justifying Positive Discrimination under the IC…………………  344
11.1.2.1 Article 14 — The Right to Equality in General………………………………………………………  344
12.2.1 Achieving Equality in a Constitutional Manner —
What does this entail?........................................................... 399

12.3 Proving Discrimination............................................................... 402

12.4 Analysing the Effect of the US Jurisprudence on
Affirmative Action............................................................... 406
12.4.1 The Cost of Scepticism to Affirmative Action
in the USA............................................................... 408
12.4.2 The Trend Towards a Colour Blind Society in
US Jurisprudence............................................................... 410
12.4.3 The Effects of Ending Affirmative Action
Prematurely............................................................... 412

12.5 The Merit Principle and Equality............................................ 415
12.5.1 Quotas or Reservations and the Merit Principle............. 416
12.5.1.1 Skills Development............................................. 419
12.5.2 Problems with Reservations and Quotas..................... 420

12.6 The Creamy Layer Debate...................................................... 423
12.6.1 Group vs Individual Rights............................................. 433

12.7 The Constitution and Other Forms of Equality................. 436
12.7.1 The Advancement of Human Rights and
Freedoms — Equality and Socio-Economic Rights........... 436

12.8 Numerical Goals or Quotas? The Better Option............. 439

12.9 Why Legislative Measures Have Been a Failure
in India........................................................................... 444
12.9.1 When Must Affirmative Action End?............................. 449

12.10 The Governments Role in Ensuring Effective
Affirmative Action...................................................... 450
12.10.1 Enforcement and Monitoring...................................... 451

12.11 Affirmative Action — The Right Way and the Wrong Way... 451

12.12 Conclusion...................................................................... 456
PART VI

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS, JOURNALS, MEDIA REPORTS, PAPERS AND
THESES………………………………………………………………………… 460
CASE LAW……………………………………………………………………. 489
LIST OF STATUTES…………………………………………………………… 506
REGULATIONS, GUIDELINES AND CODES OF GOOD
PRACTICE…………………………………………………………………… 508
REPORTS AND DOCUMENTS…………………………………………… 510
LIST OF CHARTERS, DECLARATIONS AND
INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS……………………………………… 511
WEBSITES……………………………………………………………………. 513