THERAPEUTIC GUIDELINES FOR COUNSELLORS WHO SUPPORT THE RETAINED CHILD: A GESTALT APPROACH

by

ILSE SCHRÖDER

submitted in part fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF DIACONIOLOGY (DIRECTION: PLAY THERAPY)

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: DR C H M BLOEM

NOVEMBER 2005
DECLARATION

Student number:  3512-999-9

I declare that THERAPEUTIC GUIDELINES FOR COUNSELLORS WHO SUPPORT THE RETAINED CHILD: A GESTALT APPROACH is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

____________________     ____________________
SIGNATURE        DATE
(Mrs I Schröder)
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The researcher would like to express her sincere appreciation and gratitude towards the following people and institutions for their support in the completion of this dissertation:

The Heavenly Father who gave me the courage to follow this journey.

To the loves of my life, Roland and Hannah. Without their love and constant support I would never have started this journey. I am so grateful for their presence in my life. Thank you Roland for your immense support and unwavering faith in me.

Dr Retha Bloem, my supervisor, whose knowledge and enthusiasm always left me in awe. It was an immense privilege to work under her guidance and expertise. She is not only a phenomenal mentor, but also an exceptional person.

My parents, Esbra and Doreen, for all their love, support and countless prayers. Thank you mom for the many phone calls of encouragement.

Dr Hannie Schoeman who planted the first seed in my mind of the wonder of working with children.

The staff at the Centre for Play Therapy at The Huguenot College for their assistance in guiding me on the path of growth. A special thank you to Carlien van Wyk for her interest and guidance.

Anneen Fourie, librarian at The Huguenot College Library, for her patience and assistance.
EXPLANATION OF TERMINOLOGY USED

In context of the study:

(i)  the terms learner / person / organism refer to the child;

(ii) the male reference form of “he”, “him” and “himself” was used to avoid clumsy writing style and without any sexual discrimination or preference;

(iii) because of the researcher’s traditional Western perspective she may have conveyed a stronger and more subjective writing style in favour of her Western culture;

(iv) the term educational professional refers to any professional person working or rendering services to the child in the educational environment.
SUMMARY

THERAPEUTIC GUIDELINES FOR COUNSELLORS WHO SUPPORT THE RETAINED CHILD: A GESTALT APPROACH

BY

ILSE SCHRÖDER
MASTER OF DIACONIOLOGY
(DIRECTION: PLAY THERAPY)

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA
SUPERVISOR: DR C H M BLOEM
NOVEMBER 2005

The research was directed at developing guidelines for counsellors who work with retained middle childhood learners. The supposition of the study was that retained middle childhood learners require support in accepting the retention.

For the purpose of this study a qualitative research approach with an exploratory and descriptive nature was used. The intervention research model of Rothman and Thomas (1994) was applied. A combination of Gestalt philosophical principles, existing literature and semi-structured interviews with educators, educational psychologists and middle childhood learners with experience of grade retention were used to develop guidelines.

The researcher concluded that retained middle childhood learners require support in the process of accepting the grade retention. Counsellors who work with retained middle childhood learners lack knowledge on how to support the retained child. Guidelines for counsellors who work with retained middle childhood learners were developed to successfully address the lack of knowledge in the field.
KEY TERMS

GRADE RETENTION

RETAINED

GESTALT APPROACH

GESTALT THERAPY

THERAPEUTIC SUPPORT

MIDDLE CHILDHOOD

SCHOOL EXPERIENCE

COUNSELLOR

EDUCATOR
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 1

**PHASE 1: PROBLEM ANALYSIS AND PROJECT PLANNING**

**INTRODUCTORY ORIENTATION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 MOTIVATION FOR THE CHOICE OF SUBJECT</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1 Personal motivation</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 Professional motivation</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 PROBLEM FORMULATION</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 AIM AND OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.1 Aim</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.2 Objectives</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 RESEARCH QUESTION</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 RESEARCH APPROACH</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 TYPE OF RESEARCH</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 RESEARCH STRATEGY</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9 RESEARCH AND WORK PROCEDURE</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.1 Phase 1: Problem analysis and project planning</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.1.1 Step 1: Identifying and involving clients</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.1.1.1</td>
<td>Description of the universe and population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.1.1.2</td>
<td>Description of the sample and sampling technique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.1.2</td>
<td>Step 2: Gaining entry to and cooperation from settings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.1.3</td>
<td>Step 3: Identifying concerns of the population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.1.4</td>
<td>Step 4: Analysing concerns or problems identified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.1.5</td>
<td>Step 5: Setting goals and objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.2</td>
<td>Phase 2: Information gathering and synthesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.2.1</td>
<td>Step 1: Using existing sources of information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.2.2</td>
<td>Step 2: Studying natural examples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.2.3</td>
<td>Step 3: Identifying functional elements of successful models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.3</td>
<td>Phase 3: Design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.3.1</td>
<td>Step 1: Designing an observational system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.3.2</td>
<td>Step 2: Specifying procedural elements of the intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9.4</td>
<td>Phase 4: Early development and pilot testing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>VALIDITY OF THE STUDY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.1</td>
<td>Consultation with experts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>ETHICAL ASPECTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>DEFINITIONS OF TERMS AND KEY CONCEPTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.12.1</td>
<td>Retained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.12.2</td>
<td>Counsellor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.12.3</td>
<td>Middle childhood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.12.4</td>
<td>Gestalt Therapeutic Approach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 2
PHASE 2: INFORMATION GATHERING AND SYNTHESIS
THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE ON THE GESTALT THERAPEUTIC APPROACH

2.1 INTRODUCTION

2.2 DEFINING GESTALT AS AN APPROACH TO COUNSELLING
2.2.1 The philosophy of Gestalt therapy with children

2.3 THEORETICAL PRINCIPLES UNDERLYING THE GESTALT APPROACH TO COUNSELLING
2.3.1 Holistic approach
2.3.2 Field theory
   2.3.2.1 Principle of figure and ground
   2.3.2.2 Satisfying the needs
2.3.3 Phenomenological perspective

2.4 GESTALT APPROACH TO HUMAN NATURE
2.4.1 Healthy functioning
2.4.2 Disturbed functioning
   2.4.2.1 Five layers of neurosis

2.5 THERAPEUTIC GOALS AND THEORETICAL CONCEPTS OF GESTALT THEORY
2.5.1 Awareness
2.5.2 Organismic self-regulation
2.5.3 Integration
2.5.4 Polarities 40
2.5.5 Contact 40
   2.5.5.1 Contact boundary and contact styles 41
2.5.6 Experiment 43

2.6 UNIQUE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CHILD WITHIN GESTALT THERAPY 44
   2.6.1 Sense of self 44
   2.6.2 Emotional expression 45

2.7 CONCLUSION 45

CHAPTER 3
PHASE 2: INFORMATION GATHERING AND SYNTHESIS
MIDDLE CHILDHOOD DYNAMICS AND THE IMPACT OF THE CHILD’S SCHOOL EXPERIENCE FOR FUTURE DEVELOPMENT

3.1 INTRODUCTION 47

3.2 THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES THAT INFLUENCED THE VIEW OF MIDDLE CHILDHOOD DEVELOPMENT 48

3.3 COGNITIVE DEVELOPMENT DURING MIDDLE CHILDHOOD 49
   3.3.1 Thought patterns within the concrete operational stage 49

3.4 PERSONALITY DEVELOPMENT DURING MIDDLE CHILDHOOD 51
   3.4.1 Psychosocial crisis during middle childhood 52
   3.4.2 The development of the self-concept during middle childhood 54
   3.4.3 The development of the self-esteem during middle childhood 55
      3.4.3.1 Self-efficacy 56
   3.4.4 Emotional development as part of personality construction during middle childhood 57
4.3 EMPIRICAL RESULTS

4.3.1 Discussion of interviews with retained middle childhood learners

4.3.1.1 Category 1: The child's emotional experience of being retained

4.3.1.2 Category 2: Positive self-esteem is linked to a sense of achievement

4.3.2 Discussion of interviews with educational professionals (educators and educational psychologists)

4.3.2.1 Category 3: Educational professionals perceive grade retention as less socially stigmatizing for younger children

4.3.2.2 Category 4: Educational professionals support the reasons for grade retention, but warn that it can be a waste of time if not planned correctly

4.3.2.3 Category 5: Educational professionals perceive grade retention as an emotional experience for the child

4.3.2.4 Category 6: Educational professionals emphasize the importance of support for the retained child and the conveying of specific messages

4.3.2.5 Category 7: The parents of the retained child experience the retention emotionally and lack knowledge on how to support the child

4.3.2.6 Category 8: Educational professionals suggest that the other children in the retained child’s class and school should be educated about the value of grade retention

4.3.2.7 Category 9: Educational professionals must be aware of their own emotional experience of grade retention and the responsibility it holds for them
4.3.2.8 Category 10: The retained child and his parents must be informed early on of the possibility of grade retention

4.3.2.9 Category 11: The retained child should be supported from a multi-disciplinary approach

4.3.2.10 Category 12: Planning for the specific needs of the retained child during the retention year is essential

4.3.2.11 Category 13: The retained child should be valued in totality and in the context of his field

4.3.2.12 Category 14: A caring environment in the classroom and in the school should set the standard for support of the retained child

4.3.2.13 Category 15: The retained child should experience a sense of belonging

4.3.2.14 Category 16: Educators lack knowledge on how to support the retained child

4.3.2.15 Category 17: Placing the retained child with the same educator as the year before can be beneficial to both educator and child

4.4 CONCLUSION

CHAPTER 5
PHASE 4: EARLY DEVELOPMENT
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

5.2 AIM AND OBJECTIVES

5.2.1 Chapter 1: Introductory orientation

5.2.1.1 Summary of the chapter
5.2.1.2 Conclusions as to whether the aim and objectives of the study have been achieved 111
5.2.1.2.1 Achieving the aim 111
5.2.1.2.2 Achieving the objectives 112
5.2.1.3 Conclusions regarding the research question 112
5.2.1.4 Recommendation regarding the way the problem was addressed 113

5.2.2 Chapter 2: Theoretical perspective on the Gestalt therapeutic approach 113
5.2.2.1 Summary of the chapter 113
5.2.2.2 Conclusion 114
5.2.2.3 Recommendation from chapter 2 114

5.2.3 Chapter 3: Middle childhood dynamics and the impact of the child’s school experience for future development 114
5.2.3.1 Summary of the chapter 114
5.2.3.2 Conclusion 115
5.2.3.3 Recommendation from chapter 3 115

5.2.4 Chapter 4: Discussion of empirical results through data analysis and interpretation 115
5.2.4.1 Summary of the chapter 115
5.2.4.2 Conclusions regarding the method of data analysis and interpretation followed 116

5.3 CONCLUSIONS REGARDING THE CATEGORIES OF ANALYSIS FOR THIS STUDY 116

5.4 RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING GUIDELINES FOR SUPPORTING THE RETAINED MIDDLE CHILDHOOD LEARNER 117

5.5 SHORTCOMINGS OF THIS STUDY AND RECOMMENDATIONS 126

5.6 FURTHER RESEARCH 126

5.7 CONCLUDING STATEMENT 127
APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1  TELEPHONIC CONSENT  137
APPENDIX 2  DRAWING FROM THE INTERVIEW WITH C1  138
APPENDIX 3  DRAWING FROM THE INTERVIEW WITH C2  139
APPENDIX 4  DRAWING FROM THE INTERVIEW WITH C3  140
APPENDIX 5  EXAMPLE OF TRANSCRIPTION
SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW WITH P1  141