THE DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION OF INTERVENTION PROGRAMMES FOR DISADVANTAGED SCHOOL BEGINNERS

by

ELLEN MOIPONE LENYAI

Submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF EDUCATION

in the discipline of

PSYCHOLOGY OF EDUCATION

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA
PROMOTER: PROF MW DE WITT

FEBRUARY 2006

Declaration

I declare that THE DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION OF INTERVENTION PROGRAMMES FOR DISADVANTAGED SCHOOL BEGINNERS is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

MRS EM LENYAI  
Student no 580-187-7
Acknowledgements

- This thesis is dedicated to my sons, Molefe and Thebe for their compassionate encouragement and inspiration during the years devoted to this study.

- To my sister, Seapei Noge, I am indebted not only for her expertise in the field of early childhood learning, but also for her tireless support throughout the period of this investigation.

- My thoughts also go to my mother, who, in her absence continued to inspire me.

- I am grateful to my promoter, Prof MW De Witt whose expert advice and guidance shaped this study. Above all, I thank the Almighty for granting me the wisdom and strength to complete this task.
Summary

The aim of this study was to investigate the design and implementation of early intervention programmes used for disadvantaged learners in South Africa. The focus was on the Grade R class since it has been introduced to prepare learners for formal schooling. The extent to which the programme could influence the learner's skills were investigated.

The design is defined in terms of the structure, goals, and content of the programme. The implementation strategy in this investigation is explained in broad terms to include ECD policies, delivery structures and modes, teacher preparedness and arrangements made at school level.

The investigation was conducted as a case study in disadvantaged school-based Grade R classes of the Gauteng province. It established that the design of the Grade R programme followed the constructivist approach by combining the developmental and behavioural approaches to teaching. The design was commendable with regard to its goals and its duration. However, concerns were raised with regard to the structure and content of the Learning Area Programmes. An alternative design is recommended.

The success of any programme depends to a large extent on implementation strategies used for delivery. This investigation established that policy formulation at national level followed international trends. Implementation power was devolved to the provincial departments in order to accommodate provincial diversity. However, structural deficits and undefined line functions were identified at provincial and district levels. The impact of this deficiency was evident in the Grade R classes.

Finally this study concluded that although learners showed developmental gains, this cannot be regarded as the influence of the Grade R teaching because this age group is still developing and the change could be ascribed to maturation. The learners did not acquire basic literacy skills. Their poor language and intellectual abilities remain extremely low.
KEY WORDS

disadvantaged learner; disadvantaged schools; Early Childhood Development; Early learning programmes; Foundation Phase; implementation strategy; intervention programmes; Learning Area; learning materials; learning outcome; literacy skills; practitioners; programme design; school readiness; SETT
## Table of contents

### CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTORY ORIENTATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 AWARENESS OF THE PROBLEM</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 DISSERTATION OF THE PROBLEM</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 THE AIM OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 EXPLANATION OF TERMS</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.1 Intervention programmes</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.2 Disadvantaged learners</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.3 “At risk” learners</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.4 Basic skills</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.5 School readiness</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.6 Early childhood</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.7 The Grade R class</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.8 Intellectual development</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.9 Language competence</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 RESEARCH DESIGN</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.1 The methods of research</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8.2 Research techniques</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9 DELIMITATION OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10 OUTLAY OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.11 CONCLUSION</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW ON INTERVENTION PROGRAMMES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 THE ORIGIN AND HISTORY OF EARLY INTERVENTION PROGRAMMES</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Early historical models</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.8.1.1 Intervention programmes in Kenya 55
2.8.1.2 Intervention programmes in other Sub-Saharan African countries 57
2.8.2 Intervention programmes in developing Asia 58
2.8.2.1 The Indian early childhood programmes 58
2.8.2.2 The Indonesian early childhood programmes 59
2.8.2.3 The Nepal early childhood programmes 59
2.8 3 Intervention programmes in Latin America 60
2.8.3.1 Early childhood programmes in Brazil 60
2.8.3.2 Early childhood programmes in Peru 61
2.8.3.3 Early childhood programmes in Colombia 61
2.8.3.4 Early childhood programmes in Chile 62
2.8.3.5 Early childhood programmes in Ecuador 62
2.9 CONCLUSION 63

CHAPTER 3: DISCOURSE ON POLICIES, THE DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION OF INTERVENTION PROGRAMMES FOR DISADVANTAGED SCHOOL BEGINNERS

3.1 INTRODUCTION 64
3.2 DEFINING THE CONCEPT “DISCOURSE” 64
3.3 DISCOURSE ON THE DESIGN OR EARLY CHILDHOOD PROGRAMMES 65
3.3.1 Problems associated with intervention programmes 65
3.3.2 Factors that influence programme success 68
3.4 DISCOURSE ON ECD POLICIES 69
3.4.1 Policy options 69
3.4.2 Policies to reduce poverty 69
3.4.2.1 Economic support through government taxes and transfers 70
3.5 DISCOURSE ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ECD POLICIES 71
3.5.1 The development of successful strategies 72
3.5.2 Promoting quality in policy making 73
3.5.3 The role of government in the implementation of programmes 75
3.6 DISCOURSE ON THE SCHOOLS AND ECD PRACTITIONERS AND TEACHERS 75
3.6.1 The role of the school 75
3.6.2 The role of ECD practitioners and teachers 76
3.7 DISCOURSE ON THE IMPORTANCE OF RESEARCH AND INTERVENTION PROGRAMMES 77
3.7.1 The role of research 77
3.7.2 Ways of promoting effective research 78
3.7.3 Factors that hamper good research 79
3.8 NEW CHALLENGES IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF INTERVENTION PROGRAMMES 79
3.8.1 Limited research in developing countries 80
3.8.2 Poor adaptation to new developments 81
3.8.3 Globalisation 81
3.8.4 Gender equity 81
3.9 CONCLUSION 82

CHAPTER 4: HISTORY AND CURRENT SITUATION OF EARLY INTERVENTION PROGRAMMES FOR DISADVANTAGED LEARNERS IN SOUTH AFRICA

4.1 INTRODUCTION 83
4.2 BACKGROUND TO THE PROVISION OF EARLY CHILDHOOD PROGRAMMES IN SOUTH AFRICA 84
4.2.1 The pre-phase: the beginning of ideological collapse and anti-authoritarianism 84
4.2.2 The first phase: uncertainty in the interim period 86
4.2.2.1 The National Education Policy Investigation 86
4.2.2.2 Recommended policies 87
4.2.3 Phase two: The role of national and provincial elections in determining a framework for education 89
4.2.3.1 The White Paper on Education and Training 89
4.2.3.2 The Interim Policy for Early Childhood Development 89
4.2.4 The third phase: The implementation of policies 92
4.2.4.1 The Early Childhood Development Pilot Project 92
4.2.4.2 The baseline research report on the ECD Pilot Project 92
4.2.4.3 The recommendations of the Pilot Project 93
4.2.4.4 The South African Sesame Street 94
4.2.4.5 Vuleka Radio Productions 95
4.2.4.6 The nationwide audit of ECD provisioning in South Africa 95
4.3 ECD PROVISIONING IN GAUTENG 97
4.3.1 Site typing in Gauteng 97
4.3.2 Learner profiles in Gauteng 97
4.4 SUMMARY OF ECD PROVISION IN GAUTENG 100
4.5 The Education White Paper 5 (May 2001) 101
4.5.1 The rationale for ECD programmes 101
4.5.2 Policy focus and proposal 102
4.6 WHITE PAPER 6 (JULY 2001) 103
4.7 INTERSECTORIAL COLLABORATION 103
4.8 THE ECD POLICY OF THE DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT 104
4.8.1 ECD provision 104
4.8.2 Minimum requirements 104
4.8.3 Training of ECD practitioners 104
4.8.4 Management and control of ECD centres 105
4.9 POLICY FRAMEWORK ON ORPHANS AND OTHER CHILDREN MADE VULNERABLE BY HIV AND AIDS IN SOUTH AFRICA 105
4.10 TSHWARAGANO KA BANA: AN INTEGRATED PLAN FOR ECD 105
4.10.1 The development of Tshwaragano Ka Bana- 106
4.10.2 Structural arrangements for implementation 107
4.11 CONCLUSION 110

CHAPTER 5: THE RESEARCH DESIGN

5.1 INTRODUCTION 112
5.2 The research design 113
5.3 INVESTIGATION IN PHASE 1 113
5.3.1 The research sample 114
5.3.1.1 Relevance to the research question 114
5.3.1.2 Representation 114
5.3.1.3 Variables in the research 115
5.3.1.4 The learners 115
5.3.2 Data collection procedures in Phase 1 116
5.3.3 The research technique in quantitative research 116
5.3.4 Background to the SETT 117
5.3.5 The aim of the SETT 117
5.3.6 The design of the SETT 117
5.3.7 Rationale of the SETT scales 118
5.3.8 The standardisation of the SETT 118
5.3.9 Measures to ensure reliability and validity in Phase 1 119
5.4 INVESTIGATION IN PHASE 2 120
5.4.1 The qualitative approach 120
5.4.2 The case study 121
5.4.3 Data collection procedures in Phase 2 123
5.4.4 Ethical considerations 123
5.4.5 Research techniques in qualitative research 125
5.4.5.1 Observation 125
5.4.5.2 The interview 127
5.4.5.3 The focus group 128
5.4.6 The development of categories and the coding system 129
5.5 RELIABILITY, VALIDITY AND TRUSTWORTHINESS OF RESULTS 130
5.5.1 Extensive literature review 130
5.5.2 Triangulation of methods 131
5.5.3 Discourse with experts 131
5.5.4 Member checking 131
5.6 CONCLUSION 131

CHAPTER 6: THE ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION OF RESEARCH FINDINGS

6.1 INTRODUCTION 133
6.2 BACKGROUND OF THE RESEARCH AREA 134
6.3 BACKGROUND TO THE SITUATION IN THE SCHOOLS 135
6.4 RESEARCH FINDINGS IN PHASE 1 136
6.4.1 An analysis of the research findings 136
6.4.2 A discussion of tables 6.2 to 6.6 140
6.4.3 An analysis of the findings in the research schools 141
6.4.4 An explanation of tables 6.7 to 6.10 144
6.5 RESEARCH FINDINGS OF THE QUALITATIVE INVESTIGATION IN PHASE 2 146
6.5.1 The findings of classroom observations 146
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

7.1 BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY 156
7.2 CONCLUSIONS ON PHASE 1 FINDINGS 157
7.2.1 The research question 158
7.3 CONCLUSIONS ON THE FINDINGS IN PHASE 2 160
7.3.1 Conclusion on the design of Grade R 160
7.3.2 Conclusion on the implementation strategy of Grade R 161
7.4 RECOMMENDATIONS 166
7.4.1 Recommendations on the design of Grade R programme 167
7.4.2 Explanation of the recommended Grade R design 168
7.4.2.1 Naming of the Learning Areas 168
7.4.2.2 The recommended number of Learning Areas 168
7.4.2.3 The recommended content of the Learning Areas 169
7.4.3 Recommendations on the implementation of the Grade R programme 171
7.4.3.1 Explanation of the Provincial Intersectoral Structure 175
7.4.3.2 Explanation of the District Intersectoral Structure 176
7.4.4 Recommendations for further research 177
7.5 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY 178
7.6 SUMMARY 179

REFERENCES 181
TABLES AND FIGURES

Table 4.1: The number of percentages of learners aged between birth and six years receiving early intervention in 1992  
Table 4.2: Site types in Gauteng  
Table 4.3: Registration of sites in Gauteng  
Table 4.4: Learners’ age and gender in Gauteng  
Table 4.5: Learners’ home languages and language of instruction in Gauteng  
Table 4.6: Educator qualifications by population group in Gauteng  
Table 4.7: The structure of Tshwaragano Ka Bana  
Table 6.1: Total number of learners tested per province  
Table 6.2: Test findings – Mpumalanga Province  
Table 6.3: Test findings – Limpopo Province  
Table 6.4: Test findings – Gauteng Province (Alexandra Township)  
Table 6.5: Test findings – North West Province  
Table 6.6: A summary of the four provinces  
Table 6.7: Test findings in School A  
Table 6.8: Test findings in School B  
Table 6.9: Test findings in School C  
Table 6.10: Test findings in School D  
Table 6.11: Summary of the test performance in the research schools  
Table 7.1: The implementation structure for the Grade R class in Gauteng  
Table 7.2: The recommended functional structure of the Provincial Intersectoral Body (PIB)  
Table 7.3: The recommended functional structure of the District Intersectoral Body (DIB)  
Figure 7.1(a): Existing structure of the Grade R programme  
Figure 7.1(b): Existing content of the three Learning Areas  
Figure 7.2(a): Recommended structure of the Grade R programme  
Figure 7.2(b): Recommended content of the four Learning Areas  
Figure 7.3  A schematic representation of the recommended implementation structure of school and centre-based ECD programmes

APPENDIX 1:  A LEARNER’S TEST PERFORMANCE AND EVALUATION SHEET

APPENDIX 2:  A CONDENSED GRADE R PROGRAMME
APPENDIX 3: AN EXAMPLE OF A LEARNER’S PROFILE
APPENDIX 4: AN EXAMPLE OF VERBATIM INTERVIEW RESPONSES
APPENDIX 5: AN EXAMPLE OF A VERBATIM FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION
APPENDIX 6: SUPPORTING MATERIALS FROM GRADE R CLASSES