THE RIGHT TO MEANINGFUL AND INFORMED PARTICIPATION IN THE CRIMINAL PROCESS

by

FAWZIA CASSIM

submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF LAWS

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

PROMOTER: PROF JJ JOUBERT

NOVEMBER 2003
I declare that **THE RIGHT TO MEANINGFUL AND INFORMED PARTICIPATION IN THE CRIMINAL PROCESS** is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

.................................................. ..................................................
SIGNATURE DATE
(Miss F Cassim)

**SUMMARY**

The composite right to meaningful and informed participation in the criminal process
comprises the right to information, the right to understand, the right to be prepared, the right to be present, the right to confrontation and the right to present one's case. The sub-rights are not of an overarching nature such as the right to legal representation and the right of access to the law. The various rights are grouped together because they show some connection with the ability of the suspect or the accused to participate in the criminal proceedings as a legal subject, and not as an object of the proceedings as in primitive times. These rights ensure that the accused will not participate in the criminal process from an unfavourable position. The heading "meaningful and informed participation" is therefore a collective term for these rights. These sub-rights form part of the comprehensive right to a fair trial.

The thesis examines aspects of the position of the accused in South Africa and in foreign jurisdictions such as the United States of America, Canada, New Zealand, Australia, Germany, the United Kingdom and Islamic systems. International instruments such as the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and decisions of the United Nations Human Rights Committee are also considered. The thesis first considers the historical perspective of the accused in primitive times when he was regarded as an object of the criminal proceedings, to the present time when he is regarded as a subject of the proceedings. The study on foreign jurisdictions reveals that for the most part, our law is in line with the law of other countries. The study also demonstrates that the various rights are not absolute. In exceptional circumstances, some diminution of the accused's rights is necessary to protect the interests of society. Nevertheless, the courts should act cautiously and not allow the exceptions to overtake the rule. The judiciary should strive to find a better balance between the constitutional rights of the accused and the interests of society. To this end, the judicial system must be objective yet vigilant.

Key terms: rights of accused; meaningful; informed; participation; fair trial; legal subject; maintaining proper balance; interests of society; role of courts; comparative law

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In loving memory of my beloved parents, who encouraged my siblings and I to
engage in further education.

And to my promoter, Professor JJ Joubert, for his encouragement, moral support and constructive criticism over the past four years.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART ONE

Chapter 1: The right to meaningful and informed participation in the
2.3 The practical results of isolating and analysing the composite right .......................... 38
2.4 Conclusion ................................................................................................................. 38

PART THREE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 3: The key words: “Participation”, “Meaningful” and “Informed”</th>
<th>41</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction ................................................................................. 41</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 “Participation” ........................................................................... 41</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 “Meaningful” ............................................................................... 43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 “Informed” ................................................................................... 43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Conclusion ..................................................................................... 44</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PART FOUR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 4: An overview of the various sub-rights</th>
<th>46</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1 The context .......................................................... 46</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 5: The right to information</th>
<th>51</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction .......................................................... 51</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 An accused’s access to information during the pre-trial stage</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Summons ............................................................................. 54</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 Written notice ....................................................................... 55</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3 Indictment and charge sheet .............................................. 56</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3.1 The request for further particulars .................................... 63</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3.2 Amendment of charge sheet/indictment ............................... 66</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4 Arrest ....................................................................................... 69</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.5 Entry of premises for purpose of interrogation ..................... 73</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.6 Search and seizure .............................................................. 74</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.7 Statement to police officer ................................................... 77</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Police docket privilege .......................................................... 78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Position before the Constitution: The Steyn era ....................... 78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2 The issue of inconsistent statements and the prosecution’s duty ... 81</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3 Right of access to information in the Constitution .................. 85</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3.1 The pre-Shabalala interpretation ......................................... 85</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.3.3.2 The Shabalala decision and the right to a fair trial  

5.3.4 Right of access to information in the Final Constitution  

5.3.5 Current Position: Promotion of Access to Information Act 2 of 2000  

5.3.6 Access to information in foreign jurisdictions  

5.3.6.1 Canada  

5.3.6.2 United States of America  

5.3.6.3 United Kingdom  

5.3.6.3.1 The position before 1996  

5.3.6.3.2 Position in terms of the Criminal Procedure and Investigations Act 1996 (CPIA)  

5.3.6.4 Germany  

5.3.6.5 The decisions of International Instruments  

5.3.6.6 New Zealand  

5.3.6.7 Australia  

5.3.6.8 Islamic law  

5.4 The accused’s right to be informed of the reason for detention  

5.5 The accused’s right to be informed of the right to legal representation  

5.6 The right to be informed of the right to remain silent  

5.7 Conclusion  

Chapter 6: The right to understand  

6.1 Introduction  

6.2 The accused’s competency to stand trial  

6.3 The accused’s right to an interpreter  

6.4 The right to be tried in the language that one understands  

6.5 Conclusion  

Chapter 7: The right to be prepared for one’s trial  

7.1 Introduction  

7.2 The implications of the right to be prepared  

7.3 The right to have adequate time to prepare a defence  

7.4 The right to have adequate facilities to prepare a defence
9.3 Exceptions to the right to confrontation ........................................ 284
9.3.1 Section 170A of the Act ....................................................... 284
9.3.1.1 Reason for introduction of section 170A ............................... 284
9.3.1.2 Section 170A: The rights of child witnesses versus the accused’s right to confrontation ........................................ 285
9.3.1.3 The effect of section 158 on section 170A of the Act ............. 298
9.3.2 Section 171 of the Criminal Procedure Act .......................... 300
9.3.3 Hearsay evidence .............................................................. 304
9.4 Conclusion ................................................................................. 306

Chapter 10: The right to present one’s case ....................................... 311
10.1 Introduction ............................................................................... 311
10.2 The right to cross-examination ................................................ 312
10.2.1 The right to cross-examine state witnesses ............................... 313
10.2.2 The rights of an undefended accused ...................................... 319
10.2.3 The right to cross-examine witnesses for the defence ............. 321
10.2.4 The right to recall witnesses for cross-examination ............... 322
10.2.5 Limitations on the right to cross-examination ......................... 323
10.2.5.1 Face-to-face cross-examination ....................................... 327
10.2.5.2 Hearsay evidence ......................................................... 341
10.2.5.2.1 The common law position .......................................... 341
10.2.5.2.2 The statutory position ................................................ 341
10.2.5.2.3 The constitutional position .......................................... 345
10.2.5.3 Expert documentary evidence ......................................... 354
10.3 The right to address the court on evidence to be adduced .......... 356
10.4 The right to give and adduce evidence ....................................... 356
10.4.1 The accused’s right to call witnesses ..................................... 356
10.4.2 The accused’s rights in terms of section 151 of the Act .......... 365
10.4.3 The accused’s right to compulsory process .............................. 367
10.4.4 Limitations on the right to give and adduce evidence ............ 372
10.4.5 The rights of the co-accused ................................................. 375
10.4.6 The right to recall and re-examine witnesses ......................... 377
10.5 The right to address the court at the conclusion of the evidence .. 379
10.6 The right to address the court on sentence ................................ 382
PART FIVE

Conclusion and recommendations

Chapter 11: Conclusion ................................................ 390

11.1 Introduction .................................................... 390
11.2 Survey of various sub-rights and foreign jurisdictions .......... 392
11.3 Recommendations ............................................. 406

Bibliography .............................................................. 412

Commission Reports .................................................... 438

Table of cases .......................................................... 439

Table of South African Statutes and Statutory Instruments ....... 466

Table of Foreign Reports, Statutes and Statutory Instruments ...... 467

Subject Register ........................................................ 470