THE MISSIOLOGICAL DIMENSIONS OF AFRICAN ECCLESIOLOGY

by

SOLOMON ANDRIATSIMIALOMANANARIVO

submitted in accordance with the requirements
for the degree of

DOCTOR OF THEOLOGY

in the subject

MISSIOLOGY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

PROMOTER: Prof. W. A. SAAYMAN
JOINT PROMOTER: Prof. J. MBITI

NOVEMBER 2001
***************

0001947367
The growth of the Church in Africa, namely at numerical level, is tremendous. However, we notice that her impact on society and public life is not so visible as the growth is, since Christian values are embodied by Christians. Yet, the Church has huge human resources, pastors, missionaries, lay leaders and theologians. The challenge for the Church in Africa is to incarnate and inculturate these values and the living message of the Gospel.

In this thesis we question the co-operation between the Church and mission agencies, between native pastors and western missionaries. We notice that since 150 years, there has been a huge gap between these two entities. This is due to the fact that Theology and Missiology look like two lines that never meet. This situation leads us to revisit not only the current paradigm Church-Mission but also the current link between Theology and Missiology.

We propose the following theses:

1. Theology is mission-centred. The goal of Theology is to extend the Kingdom of God by the proclamation of the Gospel so that every nation (ethne) may be represented in the Kingdom, and by the communication of Christian values so that a new society or a new civilisation may emerge and may take over the current and corrupted society.

2. To explore the Biblical data on Church and Mission, the only ontological approach appears to be limited, therefore the functional approach must be added. The right question is not only "What the Church is" but also "For what the Church is"

3. The local Church is the representation of the Universal Church in a given location. This local church is culturally rooted. Cultural plurality is a sine qua non condition for the Universal Church.

4. The local Church is the basis of mission. The basic reflections on mission must take place within the local Church, at the grass root level. All human resources, from mission agencies and para-church organisation are accountable to the local Church.

5. The major themes of healing, liberation and identity are at the core of the Gospel. Theologians must articulate these themes in their discourse.

6. Co-operation between local Churches, or within a cluster of local Churches, gives opportunities to succeed in term of mission since no local Church can do mission alone.

Key terms:
Church, Mission, Typology of Churches, Typology of Missions, paradigm, Christian values, inculturation, humanisation, sanctification, ontological approach, functional approach, Ecclesiology, Missiology.
DEDICATION

To

Dr Alexandrine ANDRIA

for her love,

to

Zo Arinala, Hasy and Alexandre, Nathan, Oelina, Fanoela and Arifitia,

to

My mother, widow since December 6, 1999,

and to

My father, promoted to the celestial glory

Soli Deo Gloria
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronyms</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter One</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. Stating the subject</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. Motivations for the choice of the topic</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. Status of Missiology vis-à-vis Ecclesiology</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4. Missiology as a dimension of Ecclesiology</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5. Method and Division of Chapters</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6. Definitions of terms</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter Two</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MISSION IN AFRICA</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HISTORICAL APPROACH</strong></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Protestant Models of Mission</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1. Classical Missions</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1.1. A study case: The Société des Missions Evangéliques de Paris</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1.2. Analysis of Classical Missions</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2. Faith Missions</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2.1 History of Faith Missions</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2.2. Analysis of Faith Missions</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2. Catholic Models of Mission

2.2.1. Case study: Madagascar

2.2.2. Analysis of Catholic Model of Mission

2.3. African Initiated Mission

2.3.1. Christian Missionary Foundation (CMF)

2.3.2. Inter Senegal Mission (ISM)

2.3.3. Centre Universitaire de Missiologie (CUM)

2.3.4. Analysis of African Initiated Missions

2.4. Analysis of current models of mission in Africa

2.4.1. Impact on society

2.4.2. Missiological issues

2.4.3. Ecclesiological issues

Chapter Three

CHURCHES IN AFRICA

THEOLOGICAL APPROACH

Introduction

3.1. Classical typology of Churches

3.1.1. Mainline Protestant Churches

3.1.2. Evangelical Churches

3.1.3. Catholic Church

3.1.4. Independent Churches
3.1.5. Evaluative Comments

3.2. New Typology of Churches

3.2.1. Sacramental Churches

3.2.2. Liturgical Churches

3.2.3. Kerygmatic Churches

3.2.4. Charismatic Churches

3.2.5. Evaluative Comments

3.2.6. Para-Church Organisations

3.3. Analysis of Present Ecclesiologies and Conclusion

3.4. Toward a New Ecclesiology

3.4.1. Dulles's Ecclesiology

3.4.2. Bate's Ecclesiology

3.4.2.1. Concept of Inculturation

3.4.2.2. Inculturation and Local church

3.4.2.3. Inculturation and Mission

3.4.2.4. Local church and Mission

3.4.2.5. Missionary Church in Action

3.4.2.6. Personal evaluation: The validity of Bate's ecclesiology

3.4.3. Donovan's Ecclesiology

3.4.3.1. Donovan's criticism of western Missions

3.4.3.2. Donovan's perception of Mission and Church

3.4.3.3. Personal evaluation of Donovan's Ecclesiology
Chapter Four

AFRICAN ECCLESIOLOGY

4.1. Theology and Missiology

4.1.1. Theology

4.1.2. Missiology

4.2. Ecclesiology and Missiology

4.3. The Church

4.3.1. Identity

4.3.1.1. Essence

4.3.1.2. Constituency

4.3.2. Offices

4.3.2.1. Prophetic office

4.3.2.2. Sacerdotal office

4.3.2.3. Servanthood state

4.3.3. The mandate of the Church

4.4. Theology of Local church

4.4.1. Ontological dimension of the Local church

- Local church as the real representation of the Universal Church

- The consistency of the local church

4.4.2. Missiological dimension of the Local church
4.4.2.1. Local church as a matrix for inculturation: Outward work of the church 125
4.4.2.2. Local church as an instrument of humanisation: inward work of the church 129
4.4.2.3. Local church as an instrument of sanctification 131
4.4.3. Dialectic between the church as a matrix and the church as an instrument 132

4.5. The concept of Developing Church and Developed Church 135
4.5.1. The dynamic within the church 135
4.5.2. The concept of developing church 136
4.5.2.1. The call to maturity 138
4.5.2.2. Characteristics of a developing church 138
4.5.3. The concept of developed church 140
4.5.4. Relationships between churches 142

Chapter Five
CONCLUSION 144
5.1. Necessity of missiological reflection in context 144
5.2. The local church as a basis of mission 146
5.3. Interdependence between local churches 148

Bibliography 152
### ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AACC</td>
<td>All Africa Conference of Churches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIC</td>
<td>African Inland Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AICMB</td>
<td>African Inland Church Missionary Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIM</td>
<td>Africa Inland Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBU</td>
<td>Groupes Bibliques Universitaires</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBFMS</td>
<td>Conservative Baptist Foreign Mission Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBI</td>
<td>Conservative Baptist International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEVAA</td>
<td>Communauté Evangélique d'Actions Apostoliques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMF</td>
<td>Christian Missionary Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C&amp;MA</td>
<td>Christian and Missionary Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSSMN</td>
<td>Christian Student Social Movement of Nigeria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CUM</td>
<td>Centre Universitaire de Missiologie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWM</td>
<td>Council of World Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECWA</td>
<td>Evangelical Church of West Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS</td>
<td>Evangelical Mission Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMC</td>
<td>Fondation Missionnaire et Chrétienne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISM</td>
<td>Inter-Sénégal Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMS</td>
<td>London Missionary Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBCI</td>
<td>Mission Biblique de Côte d'Ivoire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIFES</td>
<td>Nigeria Fellowship of Evangelical Students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SIM: Soiété International Missionnaire
SMEP: Société des Missions Evangéliques de Paris
SPG: Society of Propagation of the Gospel
SVM: Students Volunteers Movement
UBS: United Bible Societies
WCC: World Council of Churches
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Soli Deo Gloria! I praise God who gave me the opportunity to write on the subject that has always been very dear to me. My question was: How can the message of God given to the Church change society and prepare for a new civilisation in which human creatures will indeed be really human?

I express my deep gratitude to Prof. W. Saayman for his permanent availability to help. He was a great encouragement for me when I doubted my capacities to do a doctoral programme in the outstanding UNISA. I am also very thankful to the staff of the Department of Missiology for their precious help.

My appreciation goes also to Prof. J. Mbiti for his highly academic critiques and for his love for Africa. I have never met him but I know him as one of the best theologians in the continent.

I am deeply indebted to the Faculté de Théologie Evangélique de l'Alliance Chrétienne in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire. This theological institution is a setting for the development of theological reflection at the highest level in the sub-region. It helps me to question myself and to grow theologically and spiritually.

Finally, I am grateful to the Communauté Chrétienne Malgache in Abidjan. Their moral and spiritual support is most valuable to me.
Chapter One

INTRODUCTION

1.1. Stating the subject

The Church is growing fast in Africa, at least numerically. According to some theological and ecclesiastical observers, it seems as if the centre of gravity of Christianity may indeed be moving from Europe to Africa. Andrew F. Walls describes the shift of Christianity from the North to Africa in terms of "African accession to the Christian faith in the twentieth century and recession from Christian faith in the modern western world". He says:

"It is widely recognised that there has occurred within the present century a demographic shift in the centre of the Christian world, which means that more than half of the world's Christians live in Africa... The Christianity typical of the twenty-first century will be shaped by the events and processes that take place in the southern continents, and above all by those that take place in Africa." [Walls 1998: 2]

However, there is still difference of opinion on the validity of the statistics used to draw such definitive conclusions as Walls is drawing here. Whatever the case may be, we should in any case be very careful not too easily and simply evaluate this rapid numerical growth positively. The impact of Christianity on society and public life still has to become more visible, for example. It is widely accepted that Rwanda is one of the most Christianised countries in Africa, yet this high percentage of "Christianisation" could not
prevent it from sinking into civil war. A Catholic bishop visiting this country just after the genocide wondered whether the water of baptism was not deep enough to swallow the sin of hatred. Some other countries (for example South Africa in the apartheid years) could be mentioned to illustrate the poor impact of African Christianity on public life in the continent. Speaking for God, in her prophetic role, the Church hardly reaches people and their leaders, and makes little significant change in society. The voice of the Church must be clearly different from that of non-Christian people in terms of ethics.

Some basic questions have been asked in regard to the poor impact on society: What kind of Gospel did the African hearers receive 100 or 150 years ago? What concept of mission did the missionaries have? Since the nineteen sixties, some issues have also been raised such as the problem of the appropriation of the Gospel as well as the models of mission which no longer fit the present situation because there are more and more indigenous leaders, hence greater human resources at local and national levels than in the past. It is clearly known that relationships between indigenous leaders and missionaries are not the best. Mostly, indigenous churches and mission agencies have no arena for discussion and sharing, therefore the malaise between church leaders and missionaries persists.

For some thinkers, the problem is basically missiological. Most mission agencies still use the nineteenth century missiology based on hierarchy of culture which Saayman calls “the assumption of western cultural and moral superiority” (Saayman 1998: 1). The “us and them” language is still widely used. We remember that the London Missionary Society’s motto was “Christianity, Commerce and Civilisation”. This implied that all Africans
needed to be “civilised”, which meant at that time “uplifted to enter western civilisation”. This hierarchy of culture seems to survive among missionaries today. Therefore, a significant barrier between indigenous leaders and missionaries is still alive. This reduces the impact of Christianity on society because indigenous leaders and missionaries cannot put together their resources and work towards the same goal.

We will focus our study on some countries in French speaking Africa for the following reasons: they share the same configuration of churches and missions; they have developed a common Christian culture to some extent, for at least sixty years; most of these churches belong presently to the same federations or associations of churches at regional and international levels; and I have a particular interest for French speaking Africa where I am from. Therefore, they may be considered case studies in this thesis.

The subject is formulated as follows: “The Missiological Dimensions of African Ecclesiology”. We intend to reflect on the possibility of an inculcated ecclesiology which would articulate the identity of the Church with her role in society in Africa.

1.2. Motivations for the choice of the topic

The choice of the topic is motivated by the following factors:

- The Church in Africa has huge human resources numerically, and therefore her impact on society can be more meaningful. The continent is politically and economically at a crucial turning point. The coming of democracy in many parts of Africa may help the Church be more proactive and get more involved in public life.
She must play a key role in the shaping of the future of the continent. History shows that Christianity has always been actively involved in the building up of a society. The present western civilisation has been shaped in some way by Christianity. The Church in Africa must thus take advantage of the advent of democracy to play the role that God has assigned to her.

- The coming of globalisation may have important influences in the continent, positively or negatively (Saayman 2001). This new economic order may marginalise Africa and may make it a mere ghetto in a global village where everyone would be prosperous except the Africans. The Church in Africa should address the issue of globalisation not only in economic terms but also as an existential issue. We know that Anglo-Saxon countries, especially England and the USA, have been significantly influenced by the so-called Protestant work ethic. This ethic arose from a complex of factors, among which was the Industrial Revolution. The first industrial revolution took place in England while the second was American. It is now accepted that present western culture is mainly shaped by these two revolutions arising within the larger context of the Enlightenment. In the same way, globalisation may become a unique opportunity to the Church in Africa to achieve her mandate in the continent and beyond by shaping the whole of society in a definitive way.

Therefore, we ask the following question: Has the Church in Africa misused the huge human resources at her disposal since the impact on society is not visible enough? We address the issue in ecclesiological terms. The poor impact of African Christianity will last
until the Church addresses the issue of her mandate in the light of Scripture and in relation to the African realities in political, social and religious areas. Thus, profound reflections on Mission and Church must be seriously engaged.

We assume that the problem is ecclesiological. The models of mission, the tensions between indigenous leaders and missionaries, between the younger Church and the older Church, and the crisis between the West and the Third World are all related to the current missiology. It is therefore important to analyse this missiology. This must lead us toward a new ecclesiology that has to address the above issues.

1.3. The status of Missiology vis-à-vis Ecclesiology

The second issue that must be considered is the status of missiology among other theological disciplines. As it is commonly known, the missiology used by most Mission Societies in the past was more a set of principles that missionaries should follow in the mission field than a real discourse on Mission. Most of these principles dealt with relationships that missionaries ought to develop with the indigenous peoples and which gave guidance on missionary activities. A discourse deals rather with its materials in a scientific and methodological approach, it must be coherent in its structure and presentation of truth. Saayman makes us understand that missiology is a recent science, unlike systematic theology or pastoral theology (Saayman 1998). He says that the New College of Edinburgh University opened the chair for “Evangelistic Theology” only in 1867. Yet, British and Continental European missionary societies started coming into being from around 1795 already! Some missiologists affirm that missiology has since
grown into an independent science. In this respect, it would be a science parallel to ecclesiology, one of the theological disciplines. In reality, however, theology and missiology seldom engage in serious debate and it seems as if theologians do not need missiologists and vice versa.

Although missiology is now considered a science, it needs to be clearly defined and situated vis-à-vis other disciplines. Most theological institutions consider missiology as a part of practical theology. In this sense, missiology has to do only with practice, and has nothing to do with ecclesiology. Therefore, it is really necessary for us to re-define missiology and to relate it to other theological disciplines, especially with ecclesiology.

1.4. Missiology as a dimension of Ecclesiology

As we have already stated, missiology is first of all a real discourse such as Christology or pneumatology, based on Revelation. This discourse is basically theological, using the contribution of anthropology and history. In this sense, missiology is more than a set of principles on “how to do mission”. It aims to communicate the thought of God on mission to the Church. David Bosch, among other African theologians, quoted by Shenk, rightly affirms that missiology is the mother of theology (Shenk 1996: 83). He would argue that Mission precedes Church. Therefore ecclesiology would be based on missiology, or it would be a dimension of missiology. In other words, mission is the starting point of any theological reflection. The strength of Bosch’s perspective lies in the

---

1. VERKUYL in Contemporary Missiology (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1978) presents the place of missiology in the landscape of theology from the nineteenth century. He points out in this document that for most theologians, missiology is a part of practical theology.
fact that Mission is a high priority not only for missiologists and missionaries but also for all theologians and Christians, and that missiology covers many theological disciplines, especially ecclesiology.

We propose however another perspective, although we totally agree with Bosch. Missiology, as a theology of Mission, can be regarded as a dimension of ecclesiology. For some missiologists, theology of Mission is just a part of missiology. Thus we must not reduce missiology to a mere discourse since it includes strategy, missionary activities, ethos and philosophy of Mission. But in this thesis, we will mainly focus on missiology as a discourse, which must be the basis of any missionary actions and Mission models. We define a discourse as a set of thoughts on a given topic, for example on Mission. This discourse must be reasonably formulated and its affirmations must be logically articulated. It must state in a comprehensive way what the Revelation says about Mission. Our goal is to insert missiology, as a theological discourse, into systematic theology, or more specifically into ecclesiology, for two reasons:

- The above definition leads us to assume that missiology may have the same nature and the same status as the theological disciplines within systematic theology.

- From a biblical perspective and according to history, Mission and Church are strongly linked to each other. Mission actually started when the Church was inaugurated on Pentecost Day, according to Acts 2, although "the Great Commission" was given before the birth of the Church. The disciples received the command to "make
disciples of all nations” (Matt 28:19) when Christ appeared to them. They started the missionary work only on Pentecost Day, with Peter’s preaching to Jewish people coming from various nations. Since then, apostles and deacons, individually or as a group, went everywhere to proclaim the Resurrected. But the first formal missionary work of the local church is described in Acts 13, when the Church of Antioch sent Paul and Barnabas as missionaries among nations.

We recognise that the issue is not so simple to deal with. For some theologians, Church and Mission have a chicken-and-egg relationship (Griffiths 1988: 1). But we can start with the idea that Mission can be considered as the Raison d’être of the Church, although the Church is the goal and fulfilment of Mission. We are aware of the fact that in the beginning of the 1900s, some theologians, as Verkuyl notices, attempted to insert missiology into systematic theology, but there was no significant result. According to Verkuyl, “it is difficult to put Missiology exclusively into any of the general categories. Missiology is involved with all the theological disciplines” (Verkuyl 1978: 8). Probably, they did not realise that not only was missiology an independent science but it also overlapped with many theological and practical disciplines.

1.5. Method and Division of Chapters

We believe that the Bible is the Word of God. In this sense, we follow the footprint of the Reformers. We adhere to the doctrine of inspiration as most Churches in Africa do. We search to understand what the Biblical authors communicated to their interlocutors at their time, and how we can apply their messages to the present situation in Africa.
Therefore, the Word of God will serve as a guide, a norm, a source of information, and the authority which controls our research. We will use the Humanities as important tools to help us know African realities that include present culture, religions, specific needs, socio-political concerns and struggles. In this perspective, we will use data collected from various local churches and Mission agencies. Furthermore, we will consider History as one of the pillars of Theology, since every Theology is elaborated within a given historical framework.

The study has three main parts: Missions in Africa, Churches in Africa and African Ecclesiology. Firstly, we will focus on Mission in Africa since the nineteenth century, in an historical perspective. This will lead us not only to know the origins of each type of Mission, its history and its contribution to the current picture of Christianity in Africa, but also to understand the missiology of each Church today. So we have to make the most of the data we have collected on various Mission agencies working in Côte d'Ivoire. We are particularly interested in three types: Protestant Missions (including Classical Missions and Faith Missions), Catholic Mission and African-initiated Missions. Most of these Missions have roots in the West. Therefore they have been more or less influenced by conferences held since 1910. We will analyse the landscape of Missions in Africa, describing their weakness and their strengths, and will determine what is positive and necessary for the Church in the African context today.

\[\text{In all three parts the focus will fall on the so-called historical mission or mainline churches, in contradistinction to the AICs. Where we speak of African-initiated mission, therefore, we refer to mission work initiated solely through the initiative of African members of mission/mainline churches. The reason for our}\]
The second part of the thesis will deal with current ecclesiologies, which we have observed in Churches in Africa. We will present two typologies of Churches in Africa today. The situation is complex since there are more and more African-initiated Churches and para-church organisations. We have to consider them and put them in the picture of Christianity in Africa. We will demonstrate that actual ecclesiologies observed within the Churches are merely a by-product of the western Missions which are perpetuating the nineteenth century paradigm.

Then we will try to understand the thoughts of three influential theologians: Avery Dulles, Stuart C. Bate and V. Donovan. Their ecclesiologies and missiologies may assist in the birth and growth a new African ecclesiology.

The last part will be mainly ecclesiological, dealing with the identity and mandate of the Church, studying the relation between the local church and the Mission. This will lead us to the missiological dimension of a new ecclesiology.

The goal of the thesis is to propose a new ecclesiology which would include missiology and which would be appropriate for African Christianity today.

1.6. Definitions of terms

- Church: The fellowship of the redeemed people, confessing Jesus Christ as Lord and Saviour, aiming to proclaim his resurrection until the consummation of ages. The Church choice is totally pragmatic: to properly analyze missiological dimensions of African ecclesiology in the AICs
is universal, she transcends cultures and political situations, but she is locally presented by local churches which are culturally shaped and conditioned. The term "Church" is also used to name denominations.

- church: the building where the People of God gather to worship. The term is also used to name local churches.

- Ecumenical: The word refers to Churches affiliated with the World Council of Churches and the All Africa Conference of Churches. The meaning is sociological rather than theological in the sense that the word refers to affiliation with an organisation rather than to a theological trend. Most mainline Protestant Churches in Africa are considered ecumenical. However we also use the term to denote the Mission of God that transcends denominations and cultures and that urges all the whole People of God to get involved in Mission.

- Ethnic group: A group of people in Africa, speaking the same language, living in the same area, and sharing the same culture and the same history.

- Mandate of the Church: The main task which the Lord assigns to the Church in the world. This task must be done by the consummation of ages. According to some theologians, the mandate of the Church is to glorify God and to proclaim the Good News. It is a twofold mandate. For others, the mandate is proclamation of the Good News and presence in society.

- Mission: It is the Missio Dei assigned by God to the Church, related to the mandate of the Church.

- mission: outreach organised by an organisation or a local church, often including would require a separate thesis.
evangelistic tasks of the local church in its immediate vicinity.

- **Mission agency/Missionary society**: Church or para-Church organisation sending missionaries.

- **Para-church organisation**: Christian organisation affiliated with no denomination or Church, aiming to help the Church achieve her mandate. A Mission agency is a para-church organisation if it is not affiliated with a particular Church.

- **Unreached people**: an ethnic group or a people with a very small rate of Christians, and to whom basic Christian values are unknown. According to this definition, there are unreached peoples not only in Africa or in Moslem countries but also in the West.
Chapter Two

MISSIONS IN AFRICA

HISTORICAL APPROACH

Introduction

The present chapter aims to describe the landscape of models of Mission, which exist in Africa today. We intend to present the history, the vision and the evolution of each model and to evaluate it theologically. Hence, we seek to understand how these models of Mission have produced the present Churches in Africa and their respective ecclesiology. For methodological reasons stated in the previous chapter, we will discuss examples especially from French speaking countries in Africa.

2.1. Protestant Models of Mission

2.1.1. Classical Missions:

Missionary societies initiated by non-Catholic European Churches in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries are called “Classical Missions” in this thesis (following Fiedler 1994). These Missions have a number of common characteristics:

- They were mainly denominational, sponsored by either the Anglican, the Scottish or the Continental Reformed Churches.

- They were represented at the International Missionary Conference held in Edinburgh in 1910.
- They were affiliated with the International Missionary Council until the World Council of Churches held its assembly in New Delhi in 1961, when the decision was made to integrate both organisations. They had official links with ecumenical organisations such as the World Council of Churches (WCC).

- They produced the first indigenous churches in the British, French and German colonies. These churches, which belonged to the same denomination as their mother churches, were called mainline churches because in most countries they represented official Protestant Christianity.

We are presenting first a French Missionary Society as a case study.

2.1.1.1 A case study: The Société des Missions Evangéliques de Paris (SMEP):

The Société des Missions Evangéliques de Paris could represent most classical Missions because it had most of the common characteristics that are defined above. It was sponsored by the Reformed Church of France and aimed at planting Reformed indigenous Churches in Africa, namely in Madagascar and Gabon. It produced mainline Churches in both these countries.

This French missionary society arrived in Africa early in the nineteenth century (Southern Africa). Like all contemporary missionary societies, the tended to follow the French colonial power. The Roman Catholic religion was predominant in the French colonies.

---

3 SMEP was also working in Lesotho. We are not considering that country as we limit our studies in this chapter to French speaking countries.
since Catholicism was the State religion of France until 1905\(^4\). At that time, the SMEP sought to demonstrate that there was a French Protestant presence both in Africa and in the Pacific islands through missionaries sent by the Reformed Church. We can mention three phases in the work of that missionary society in Africa:

- For the SMEP, the first phase started in 1900 when French missionaries came to Africa, specifically to Gabon and Madagascar. Their purpose was to plant churches and to implement welfare programmes in health and education. It is important to underline that through these programmes, the missionary society intended to civilise the indigenous people and to inculcate in them European values. French missionaries assumed the leadership of the newly born churches. They were pastors, technicians, medical doctors and teachers. One may call this first period the paternalistic phase, since the missionaries presented themselves as superior to and more mature than the indigenous converts.

- The second phase started in 1960 when most French colonies in Africa attained independence. A significant shift took place, as the Missionary Society handed over the leadership to the newly trained indigenous leaders. The policy of the SMEP had significantly changed. At the general assembly of the SMEP held in December 1960, the Chairman of the Mission, Pastor Marc Boëgner declared:

  “Our Missionaries will no longer be those who lead; they will be accountable to the national Church as the indigenous

\(^4\) The 1905 law voted by the French National Assembly separated the State from the Church. From then on, the Pope had no longer any power over the French government, which was called “laïque”. This law was valid for all French colonies in Africa at that time.
workers are... The Mission goes to a corner of the globe and preaches the Gospel only until a Church of Jesus Christ, committed to evangelising her own people, is established and has her own structure". [Boëgner 1960: 6,7]

This official declaration of Boëgner should be understood as a willingness to shift from the old paradigm born in the nineteenth century to the era of independence. Boëgner and other Western Church leaders urged indigenous leaders to take over from them in the leadership of the Church in Africa.

The third phase of the SMEP's work in Africa was the participation phase, when the SMEP became the Communauté Evangélique d'Actions Apostoliques (CEVAA). The CEVAA was a forum for fellowship and co-operation between the former Mission and the indigenous churches in Africa and in the Pacific. The former missionaries and Church leaders met regularly within this framework in order to design and implement joint programmes in various areas such as health, education, training and publications. One of the most significant characteristics of this new paradigm was the sharing of financial and human resources, in some areas. We can affirm that the CEVAA embodied a model of participation.

2.1.1.2. Analysis of Classical Missions:

---

5 The original text appeared as follows: «Nos missionnaires ne seront plus ceux qui dirigent, ils seront soumis comme tous les ouvriers de l'Eglise à ses autorités... La Mission n'annonce l'Evangile dans un coin du monde que pour qu'un jour une Eglise de Jésus-Christ, responsable de son destin et de l'évangélisation de son peuple soit instaurée ». 

---
The SMEP, which in 1971 became CEVAA, can be considered as an example of classical Mission. We could mention some others such as the British Society of the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG), the London Missionary Society (LMS) that became later the Council for World Mission (CWM), or the Basel Mission. Therefore, our comments on SMEP could be applicable to the others.

This paradigm of participation seems to be best suited for the African Church because it promotes co-operation between the West and the Third World. In this paradigm, the older Churches are able to co-operate with the younger ones and the fruit of such a co-operation is proven in tangible results in several areas in the life of the Church. However, some basic questions concerning Mission arose.

The theology of Mission is questioned. Very few new Churches have been planted since the 1960s although many ethnic groups remain unreached, especially in Gabon and Madagascar. The Church is growing numerically in the cities but she is totally absent in many rural areas. Patrick Johnstone testifies that thousands of villages [in Madagascar], with traditional beliefs, remain unchallenged by the Church (Johnstone 1993: 362), although the Protestant Church has been present in the country for more than 180 years6. Since 1960, the growth of the Protestant population on the island has been 3.6%. However, between 1861 and 1900, the Protestant Church grew from 5,000 to one million members (Johnstone 1993: 361). In Gabon, the situation is similar to that of Madagascar. Johnstone states that 38 out of 68 Gabonese ethnic groups remain unreached although
the Evangelical Church of Gabon is almost 100 years old (Johnstone 1993: 231). The example of these two countries speaks for most countries in Africa where Classical Missions had been present in missionary work for decades. May we conclude that the Church has lost interest in Mission?

As a result, the following questions must be asked: Has the theology of Mission changed since the 1960s? What is the aim of Missions today? What is the missiology of indigenous Churches? As long as these questions are not answered properly, we may assume that the Church lacks an appropriate theology of Mission.

As Gerald Anderson points out, this lack of interest in Mission is basically a theological matter (Anderson 1961: 4). In the 1960s, fifty years after the Edinburgh International Missionary Conference, integration was one of the main concerns of the theology of Mission. This brought significant changes and new structures but raised new theological issues. Anderson rightly raises a number of questions on this matter: What is the present Christian Mission? What is the attitude of the Church toward other religions? What is the aim of the Mission? As the Edinburgh theology has become obsolete, these questions will not be clearly answered until an appropriate theology of Mission emerges.

There is an apparent lack of interest in Mission. The above questions relate to the status of CEVAA. This organisation is neither a Church nor a Mission agency. It is simply an arena for collaboration. Theological thinking is not on its agenda. Therefore, CEVAA

---

6 The London Missionary Society came to the Island in 1818 while the SMEP arrived on the eve
cannot enable the indigenous Church to extend the Kingdom of God. Moreover, we must question the actual status and nature of the indigenous Church today. Is she Mission-oriented or is she just an institution co-operating with other institutions such as CEVAA? If the status and the nature of the Church is not clear for the indigenous leadership, the impact on society will be insignificant.

We conclude for this part that the problem is mainly ecclesiological. We stress that the ecclesiology inherited from the Reformed Church in France and brought by the SMEP to Africa either has changed or it was not missionary enough from the outset.

2.1.2. Faith Missions

The name “Faith Missions” is used to indicate a category of missionary societies, sharing a common history and common characteristics that we present as follows:

- William Carey (1761-1834) is considered the father of the modern Mission, followed by Hudson Taylor (1832-1905) and Charles Studd (1862-1931). They developed the idea of reaching the end of the earth with the Gospel. In this, they opposed classical Missions that went only to the British or French colonies at that time. The key command was “Go therefore and make disciples of all nations” (Matt 28:19).
Faith Missions claimed to be evangelical. In the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, they reacted strongly against theological liberalism and rationalism in Europe. Their theology was rooted in the Reformation Theology, the Awakening and Pietism. They had little contact with ecumenical bodies.

Their theology stresses individual aspects such as individual conversion or individual holiness (Fiedler: 1994, 320).

Unlike classical Missions that were denominational and sponsored by the European Churches, the Faith Missions were interdenominational and had no particular Churches behind them.

They aim to plant Bible-based Churches throughout Africa.

2.1.2.1. History of Faith Missions: We may also mention three phases in the history of Faith Missions in French colonies in Africa:

- The first phase started after World War I in former French colonies when most Missionary societies came to certain regions of Africa. The French-Swiss Mission Biblique en Côte d'Ivoire (MBCI) arrived in 1924, the World Evangelisation Crusade (WEC) of Charles Studd in 1924 while the Christian and Missionary Alliance (C&MA) reached the centre of the country in 1930. The top priority of those mission agencies, in Côte d'Ivoire as well as in other parts of Africa, was to evangelise, to plant evangelical Churches and to train
African leaders. Since then, many local churches have been planted in most parts of sub-Saharan Africa.

- The second phase started with the independence of indigenous Churches with newly trained leaders. The impact of Faith Missions in West Africa and East Africa was very strong in the sense that most Protestant Churches in the two sub-regions were planted by those Missions. For example, in Côte d'Ivoire, seven out of eight mainline Churches were created by Faith Missions (Johnstone 1993: 184). This second phase is mainly characterised by the existence of two parallel and independent entities: the indigenous church and the mission agency. Unlike the Classical Missions that disappeared once the churches were planted, Faith Missions continue to exist and to work alongside indigenous churches.

- The third phase is marked by the birth of African initiated missionary department within the Church, specifically in English speaking countries. We mention just two cases. The Evangelical Mission Society (EMS) is the Missionary arm of the Evangelical Churches of West Africa (ECWA) in Nigeria. EMS has its own structure and works outside the SIM/ECWA area. It aims to reach the 'heathen' and Islamic groups in Nigeria (Fiedler 1994: 372). We have also to mention the African Inland Church Missionary Board (AICMB) founded in 1959, as a joint effort between the African Inland Church (AIC) and the African Inland Mission (AIM). Fiedler points out the success of
this Mission agency in some parts of Kenya (Fiedler: 1994, 370). These African initiated Missions have been proved to be independent vis-à-vis their original Churches. The indigenous Churches planted by Faith Missions in French speaking Africa have not reached the third phase.

2.1.2.2. Analysis of Faith Missions

Faith Missions present three kinds of issues.

- Ecclesiological issues: The fact that the mission agency works alongside the indigenous church has neither Biblical nor theological basis. Missionary societies have often been compared to scaffoldings, which are to be removed when the Churches are established. Most Missions of this category are proving to be permanent scaffoldings! As a result, suspicion and malaise between the indigenous church and the Mission have developed. It appears that “Mission is [still] the foreigner’s affair and the Church for natives”, as Fiedler says (Fiedler 1994: 364). This implies that most indigenous churches have no missionary vision. They leave the missionary task to the Mission. In other words, the theology of integration proposed by WCC in New Delhi in 1961 has no impact on Faith Missions and evangelical Churches as well.

The nascent church has no clear ecclesiology because the Mission, which is interdenominational, had none to offer (Fiedler 1994: 320). The lack of appropriate ecclesiology appears at various levels: the view of the Church ministry is low, the Church order seems to be vague, her organisation is both Presbyterian and Episcopal;
and Mission is not on the agenda of the Church. In other words, a weak ecclesiology can produce neither a clear missionary vision nor an appropriate missiology.

In some churches, a missionary department has however been founded. In Nigeria, as already mentioned, ECWA has a Missionary department called Evangelical Missionary Society (EMS). In Kenya, the Africa Inland Church Missionary Board (AICMB) is supposed to be the missionary branch of AIC. But these missionary boards or departments tend to be independent from the Church. We then must question their status: Is the mission department the arm of the Church? Does it collaborate with the Church? Does it mobilise Church members for Mission? Or are they new missionary societies, living alongside the Church, with the risk to perpetuate the old paradigm created by western missionary societies?

Resource issues: Johnstone affirms that in 1993, there were 900 missionaries sent by 59 mission agencies in Côte d'Ivoire (Johnstone: 1993, 184). The figure seems to be high because very few churches in Côte d'Ivoire have 100 full time and well trained pastors. In spite of this great number of missionaries, there remain ten unreached ethnic groups. These groups are less than one per cent Christian. One of the serious consequences of this model of mission is the misuse of God's resources. Once again, the problem is mainly ecclesiological. If the churches in Côte d'Ivoire had a solid and comprehensive ecclesiology, they would manage intelligently human resources so that every ethnic group may hear the gospel.
- Collaboration issues: Most missionaries and indigenous workers devote themselves to urban evangelism, so, for example, the task of evangelising of rural areas is left to untrained Christians. A global strategy of mission is missing. This requires that missionaries and church leaders should co-operate.

It is worth noting that the two Protestant models of Mission have led to the "debilitating polarisation", as Saayman correctly calls it (1999: 1) between ecumenical churches, planted by classical Missions, and evangelical churches founded by Faith Missions in Africa. In fact, this polarisation between the two types of Protestant Church, historically originating in western Missions a century ago has weakened Christian witness in society. But it cannot be removed until each African Church/denomination has its own ecclesiology.

2.2. Catholic Models of Mission

2.2.1. Description

Unlike Protestant Churches, the Roman Catholic Church has a very long history of Mission although Catholic missiology is a relatively recent science. Within the Roman Catholic Church, we can distinguish four phases in the history of Mission. Each phase presents a paradigm.

- The first phase started with Pope Gregory the Great when he sent Augustine to the Kingdom of Kent to evangelise the "heathen" in 596 (Dawley 1977: 220). During the first centuries, "monastic orders made possible a new way of evangelisation", as Hunerman affirmed (1963: 49). It is important to stress that after the split of the Roman empire,
the Roman Catholic Church was almost paralysed because its organisation depended upon the structures developed by the empire. As a result, evangelism of new countries seemed to be a great challenge. When Augustine arrived in England in 596, he realised that an Irish order was already evangelising the country. Thus two missionary models were present in the island: the Roman model with Augustine as missionary sent by the Pope, and the Irish order model with Colomban. After many years of conflicts and discussions, the Pope imposed his authority on the Irish order. Then the monks became the precious tools in the Pope's hand to extend the Roman Catholic Church, not only in England but also all over the European continent. The Roman Catholic Church managed to develop co-operation between the Church and the orders in a significant symbiosis (Winter 1981: 180s). According to Winter, the mission paradigm of that period is the root of the co-operation between sodality and modality in the present Roman Catholic Church. The paradigm has also been an inspiration to evangelical Churches and para-Church movements in their partnership ventures in the twentieth century (Winter 1981: 186).

- The second phase of the history of Missions covered the period from the Middle Ages to the seventeenth century. In terms of Mission, this phase was characterised by a triumvirate consisting of the Pope, the heads of orders and the king. The Pope created in 1622 the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda Fide that was the main tool of Rome for missionary tasks. The orders, and especially the Jesuits during that period of history, were very committed to mission. For at least two centuries, the sixteenth and the seventeenth century, to the satisfaction of the Pope, the Jesuits had been most
active in many parts of the world. The king, especially the king of France, had double interest in Mission during that period. He aimed to conquer new colonies and to develop overseas trade.

Colonisation before the 1885 Berlin Conference\(^8\) was not well organised but it proved to be successful. Many trading points had been established on the route to India. This was a "precious" instrument for the development of slave and spice trades.

During that period, colonisation was coupled with Mission in the sense that missionaries travelled with the traders and aimed to evangelise regions around these trading stations. Most of them were Portuguese but French missionaries were also very active. It is particularly worth noting that many Huguenots travelled as traders rather than as missionaries. Protestant Churches in Europe had no missionary vision yet.

The case of Madagascar may also be considered when we study the Catholic model of Mission in Africa, especially since the seventeenth century, because that the situation of that country is similar to many others in Africa. For instance, Côte d'Ivoire and Benin would share the same experience with the Catholic Missions.

There was no missionary work in Madagascar until 1613 when the Jesuits reached the

\(^8\) At the Conference held in Berlin in 1885, the western countries such as France, England, Germany and Italy decided to «share» the non western world, especially the Continent of Africa. Since that date, colonisation has been better harmonised.
southern part of the Island, precisely the city of Tolagnaro (Mélanges 1996: 11). Those missionaries were chaplains on trade boats. After four years of hard work, they gave up and decided to leave the Island in 1617 and to go to Mozambique. For those Portuguese missionaries, their four-year experience in Tolagnaro was a total failure. Their description of that experience was negative and bitter:

"We found nobody, man or woman, noble or slave, who was interested in our preaching and who responded positively to our invitation to faith. Those peoples seemed to be more brut than wild animals. We have saved no innocent soul, but we have no hope to better succeed in future. If this was the situation, would it be yet necessary to send missionaries to this ungrateful soil?" [Mélanges 1996:11]

In 1648, the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda Fide of Rome decided to send the (French) Congrégation de Mission of Saint Vincent de Paul, also called Lazarists Congregation, to evangelise the Island. This new tentative Mission to Madagascar had been decided with the co-operation of Cardinal Richelieu (1586-1642), who was then a Minister of the Kingdom of France. But after thirty-six years of very hard work, the Lazarists Congregation decided to leave the Island, with a feeling of defeat. Philippe Chan-Mouine explained the reasons for that defeat. First, conflicts between Catholics and Huguenots gave a bad impression to the indigenous peoples. The Madagascan people could not understand why the white people were in conflict in the name of their religion.

---

9 The original quotation appears as follows: «Nous n’avons pas trouvé une seule personne, homme ou femme, noble ou esclave, qui ait prêté attention et ajouté foi à nos prédications, se montrant tous plus brutes que les bêtes sauvages... Nous n’avons pas sauvé la moindre petite âme innocente, mais nous n’avons aucun espoir de mieux réussir dans l’avenir... Si telle était la situation réelle, aurait-il été encore nécessaire d’envoyer des missionnaires sur cette terre ‘ingrate’ (sic)?"
The second reason was that most French governors lived in immorality among indigenous women. This did not help missionaries preach the Good News to the indigenous. We may also mention the rude climate that the Western people could not endure. They could not survive tropical diseases such as malaria. Most of them died one year after their arrival (Mélanges: 1996, 14). But Chan-Mouine thought that the main reason for the defeat was the local king's nationalism. Christianity appeared to him as a European religion, threatening not only his sovereignty but also the dignity of his people. Therefore, he did his best to prevent his subjects from adopting the new religion.

However, from our perspective, lack of appropriate missiology was the main reason for that defeat. We would like to mention two important failures due to a lack of appropriate missiology. Before the missionaries came to the Island, the Madagascan people used the Arabic letters. The missionaries decided to replace these with Latin characters. They then met two major problems. With Latin characters, they could neither translate nor incarnate some biblical concepts into the Madagascan culture. The Arabic letters fitted better in the Madagascan culture of that time. The second problem is that the missionaries translated only the catechism of the Roman Catholic Church, and not the Bible. Therefore, there was no real appropriation of the Good News.

---

10 Malagasy and Madagascan are the two words for the people of Madagascar. We prefer the second term because it has the same root as the country.

11 The linguistic problems due to the fact that the missionaries used the Latin letters was a real obstacle to the communication of the Gospel. But in the eighteenth century, significant progress has been made in linguistics. The Madagascan authorities decided officially to use Latin letters. So the Madagascan bible was translated written in Latin letters in 1835.
In most parts of Africa, especially in Basse Côte d'Ivoire in the 1630s, the situation was similar to that of Madagascar. In 1637, the Catholic missionaries experienced a significant defeat and decided to go back to France and to create the Société des Missions Africaines in Lyon. The main task of this newly born missionary society was to train candidates for missionary work in Africa so that they may be more effective on the mission field.

- The third phase of the history of Mission was marked by the development of congregations and orders in the nineteenth century. A number of those came to Africa, at the same time as the European colonial powers. Their goal was to bring "the light to the Dark Continent"*. Their Missionaries longed to bring to the African peoples not only the gospel, but also the European civilisation. In his encyclical Rerum Ecclesiae, Pius XI stressed that "no obstacle can prevent [the Church] from winning the peoples living in darkness to the light of the Gospel and to the beneficial effects of civilisation" (Pius XI 1926: 1).

To understand what most orders intended to achieve, we give the example of the Société des Missionnaires d'Afrique, one of the first orders coming to Africa. The Société des Missionnaires d'Afrique, commonly called "White Fathers", was founded by Lavigerie, the bishop of Algiers in 1868. This French missionary society aimed at "bringing the western civilisation to the miserable peoples of the centre of Africa", and at "making French domination accepted by the indigenous people" as the White Father Guebriant said (Guebriant 1931: 14). The White Fathers were deeply influenced by nineteenth century anthropology, which was based on the hierarchy of cultures. The Société des Missions Etrangères was the second
order to be mentioned. It had exactly the same vision as the former but claimed to be the most “French missionary society” (Guebriant 1931: 35).

During the third phase, a series of conflicts affected relationships between the Church and the Mission, between indigenous clergy and western missionaries. But in many parts of the world, there was a real symbiosis between the Church and Missions. However Rome did not leave the missionary work totally to orders. In his encyclical *Maximum Illud* (1919), Benedictus XI appeared as the father of missionary consciousness in modern times. He encouraged heads of Mission, bishops and their vicars to give high priority to Missions (Benedict 1919: 6). Among others, two strong recommendations emerged from the encyclical: to recruit and to train an indigenous clergy, and to develop the Clergy Missionary Union\(^{12}\). This organisation is the missionary structure within the Church. In *Maximum Illud*, Benedict XI intended to prepare the future of the indigenous Church, when foreign missionaries would go back to their respective countries.

Pius XI followed in the footprints of his predecessor. In his encyclical *Rerum Ecclesiae* (1926), he developed the same Missionary consciousness and emphasised the importance of promoting indigenous leadership in Missions. He gave high quality training to the indigenous personnel (Pius XI 1926: 1). He advocated excellence in terms of training. He pressed seminaries to include in their curricula sacred sciences as well as humanities (22).

\(^{12}\) In French: Union Missionnaire du Clergé.
Pius XII celebrated the 25th anniversary of *Rerum Ecclesiae* in publishing his encyclical *Evangelii Praecones* in 1951. He explained the tremendous progress of missionary work since 1926. In spite of wars and persecutions during that time, the number of Missions had increased from 400 to 600 (Pius XII 1951: 5); the Clergy Missionary Union had developed considerably. However, more missionaries were still needed. The strongest point in *Evangelii Praecones* seems to be the call upon lay people to get involved in Missions (: 31) through the Catholic Action. This new organisation was created in most particular Churches. Its goal was to include lay people in Missions.

- The fourth phase started with the decisions of Vatican Council II on Mission. The encyclical *Redemptoris Missio* written by John Paul II was the most important and official Catholic document on Mission in the post-Vatican Council II era. *Redemptoris Missio* insisted on the permanent value of the missionary concept. In his encyclical, John Paul II asked some basic questions in regard to modern Mission: Is Mission among non-Christians still relevant? Or has it to be replaced by inter-religious dialogue? What is the present meaning of “Universality of salvation”? (John Paul II *: 10). Since Vatican Council II, these questions have been regarded as valid, because in the post-Vatican time, the Roman Catholic Church put on her agenda ecumenism and openness to other religions as most important items. This seems to be paradoxical because John Paul II stressed the uniqueness of Christ and therefore underlined the necessity of evangelising those who do not know Christ. Indeed, ecumenism and the concept of universality of salvation do not exclude evangelism (: 93), because “the Church is the ordinary way to salvation, she possesses the fullness of means of
salvation” (*Ad Gentes*, n°7). The task remains immense. Vatican Council II identified many peoples and ethnic groups, which did not know Christ. No Christian grouping could embody faith among those people (54). Thus they must be evangelised.

Moreover, Vatican Council II considered that the society with an old Christian tradition [Europe] must be re-evangelised. Therefore, John Paul II called upon particular Churches and also upon all Christians to get involved in Missions. According to the Catholic ecclesiology, all Christians can and must evangelise, by virtue of their baptism. He also urged orders and congregations to contribute to the missionary work, whatever their visions are. They should be precious instruments of the Congregation of *Propaganda Fide* (*Ad Gentes*, n° 27).

2.2.2. Analysis of Catholic Model of Mission

We are particularly interested in the model of Mission proposed by Vatican Council II, through *Ad Gentes* and presented by John Paul II in his encyclical *Redemptoris Missio*. We recognise that the contribution of the Roman Catholic Church to modern missiology is essential because of her long tradition in Mission but also because of her rich experience with orders and other Churches over the last three decades. We note the three most important characteristics of the modern Catholic model of mission: ecumenism, inter-religious dialogue and partnership with all human and organisational resources.

The Roman Catholic Church believes that ecumenism is inseparable from Mission. Thus, dialogue and contact with other Churches and inter-Church organisations have been
initiated since the last ecumenical Council. We simply want to mention the very first meeting between Evangelicals and Catholics about "Church and Mission". That meeting was held in Jerusalem from 12 to 19 October 1997 (ERT, 1999). The two counterparts conversed about the nature of the Church and her Mission. By inviting evangelical theologians to dialogue, the Roman Catholic Church would like to include in her model of mission all human and organisational resources in order to reach the whole world with the gospel.

Inter-religious dialogues are also in her programme of Mission. Such dialogues help missionaries identify peoples and societies that are not in Christian traditions.

The third characteristic of the Catholic model is the proper use of all available resources for Mission: the Clergy Missionary Union as the arm of Rome within the particular Churches, the Catholic Action as the structure for lay people involved in Mission and all orders within each diocese.

The Catholic model of mission is based on a solid and coherent ecclesiology. As Mission is the raison d'être of the Church, it is clear that every missionary initiative is under the control of the Church. Every missionary order must be loyal to the hierarchy, especially to the bishop at local church level. The chapter "de Activitate Missionali Ecclesiae" of Vatican Council II is a real discourse of the Church in Mission.
However we note some ambiguities in the praxis of Mission within the Roman Catholic Church:

- The relationship between Church and Mission: It is clear that missionaries in a diocese should be submissive to the bishop. But how can missionaries be accountable to him if they have also to report to their supervisors? They face here an ecclesiological issue. In Catholic ecclesiology, Mission is included in the Church. This means that the head of the Mission, but not only missionaries, is submitted to the bishop of a particular Church.

- Rivalry between orders in the same territory: Pius XI in his encyclical *Rerum Ecclesiae* advised missionaries from various orders to co-operate, because he had noticed that each missionary society tended to be self-sufficient although the tasks remained immense in most regions.

- Relationship between indigenous clergy and missionaries in a diocese: In many parts of the world, indigenous clergy and missionaries have difficulties to co-operate, for a number of reasons. First missionaries have a higher standard of living than indigenous priests have. Then, the missionaries come to a diocese to implement the vision of their congregation and its founder rather than that of the bishop. Finally, they have difficulties to enter the host culture.
- Role of lay people in Mission: Vatican Council II recommended strongly the lay apostolate in its document *Apostolatu Laicorum*. We stress that, according to Catholic ecclesiology, lay people cannot fully participate in Church planting because they do not belong to the hierarchy and thus are not authorised to do any sacramental acts. Lay people in the Roman Catholic Church play a second-class role in the life of the Church and especially in missionary work.

- Proliferation of orders: It is noticed that new orders continue to settle in Africa. Very few of them are really concerned about Church planting, as essential part of Mission. Most are on the periphery of evangelistic work. There are more than 100 orders and congregations in Côte d'Ivoire, and yet, fifteen ethnic groups have no Church. Here we have exactly the same situation as in Protestant circles: perpetuation of the former paradigm.

2.3. African Initiated Missions

The big picture of Christianity in Africa includes Protestant Churches planted by Classical Missions, Catholic Churches established by Catholic Missions, African Churches planted African Initiated Missions and African Independent Churches. As already stated in chapter 1, we are not considering the African Independent Churches in this discussion for the following reasons:

1) The range of the African Independent Churches is so broad that it requires an entire, separate study,
2) Although they share some common characteristics among themselves, they are also in important respects very different from each other. So it would not be correct to put them all in one category.

Therefore the name "African Initiated Missions" does not refer to the African Independent Churches in this discussion. It refers rather to Missions that have been founded by African missionaries since the seventies and that share the following characteristics:

- They are founded by young African leaders. Most of those leaders were involved in evangelical student movements such as the Nigerian Fellowship of Evangelical Students (NIFES), the Christian Student Social Movement of Nigeria (CSSMN), the Student Christian Movements (SCM) or Groupes Bibliques Universitaires (GBU) in French speaking Africa. These student movements followed the example of the Student Voluntary Movement (SVM) in the United Kingdom by the end of the nineteenth century. According to Lowman (1983: 27), SVM was one of the first Mission agencies preparing students for Mission. Its watchword was "the evangelisation of the world in this generation". SVM provided hundreds of volunteers for Mission. Like SVM, some Christian student movements in Africa provide outstanding missionaries for the continent.

- These African Mission agencies are interdenominational, inter-African and international. Their leaders come from various denominations.
- They recruit mainly volunteers and tent makers.
- They are theologically charismatic or neo-Pentecostal
- Their vision is to plant churches among unreached peoples in their own country and beyond.
- These African Missions could be compared to Faith Missions because of the influence of SVM, Hudson Taylor and Charles Studd, but also because of the common characteristics they share with them. In this thesis, we will present briefly three African Initiated Missions: Christian Missionary Foundation (CMF), Inter Senegal Mission (ISM) and Centre Universitaire de Missiologie. All of them are in French speaking Africa.

2.3.1. Christian Missionary Foundation (CMF)

CMF was founded by Reuben Ezemadu in Ibadan in 1981. It comes from Christian Student Social Movement of Nigeria (CSSMN) background, as Fiedler (1994:377) explains. The motto of CMF was “Ministering the whole word to the whole man in the whole world” (ibid.). CMF was born during a conference organised by CSSMN when a speaker challenged Nigerian students to become missionaries. In 1993, there were about 240 Nigerian missionaries serving in West Africa. Fifty of them were sent by CMF.

The second phase of CMF’s life started with church planting in some West Africa countries, especially in French speaking countries. In 1988 its work began in Côte d’Ivoire
when Francesca Onochie\textsuperscript{13} came to Abidjan and started small prayer groups. Onochie was a young single lady, highly educated but without any financial support. But God provided sufficient support in giving her a part-time job as religion teacher in a protestant secondary school. The vision of the Ivorian CMF is to plant Churches among unreached peoples in Côte d'Ivoire. They have identified ten unreached ethnic groups in the country. The small groups prayed so that each ethnic group may be represented in the Kingdom.

In 1993 the Ivorian Mission agency sent its first Missionaries. In 1999 it had eleven missionaries and Church planters working as volunteers or tent makers in remote villages, living among villagers.

CMF develops partnership with local churches, other African Mission agencies such as Calvary Programme, and western Missionary societies.

### 2.3.2. Inter Senegal Mission (ISM)

ISM was founded by Senegalese leaders having the burden to bring the Gospel to the Wolof and the Serere peoples in Senegal\textsuperscript{14}. These two ethnic groups are mainly Moslem. The Mission statement of ISM is "to take the Good News of Jesus Christ into the unreached areas of Senegal in order to plant Churches that are autonomous, self-sufficient and self-reproducing" (ISM's Brochure). It concentrates its missionary work in two specific areas. The first is called "LTD triangle" limited by the three cities of Louga, Thiès and Diourbel. The second is

\textsuperscript{13} Information given by the National Director of CMF in Côte d'Ivoire

\textsuperscript{14} Information given by the National Director of CMF in Côte d'Ivoire
the “TDK triangle” limited by Thiès, Diourbel and Kaolak. These areas are mainly inhabited by Wolof and Serere and appear to be entirely Moslem. ISM has a holistic view of the Good News. Its approach to evangelism integrates the proclamation of the Gospel and the demonstration of love through ministries of compassion. These ministries include health programmes, promotion of literature in local languages and literacy.

The Senegalese Mission has seventeen paid full time missionaries. Fifteen of them are indigenous. Financial resources are insured by local churches and western Missions working in the country. It also received funds from overseas foundations, for a limited period. But ISM is not content to receive funds from abroad, it has a clear long-term fund-raising policy that will provide in five or ten years permanent financial resources generated within Senegal. In the long term, the leaders plan to invest in tourism and public transportation.

The three distinctive marks of ISM are: using national human and financial resources, working in very specific areas where no missionary work has ever been done, and developing partnership with western Mission agencies.

2.3.3. Centre Universitaire de Missiologie

The Centre Universitaire de Missiologie in Kinshasa, Democratic Republic of Congo, was founded by Nzash U Luméya in 1990. It is not only a theological institution offering a Master’s degree, but also a Mission agency sending African missionaries to unreached

---

Information given by the ISM’s Director
peoples and especially to pygmies in Central African forest zones.

The Mission statement of CUM is "to promote obedience to the Great Commission in a new paradigm". The founder of the centre was convinced that a new paradigm was really necessary to reach the peoples who have been neglected by the western missionary societies since their arrival in Africa one hundred years ago. From Luméya's perspective, this new paradigm must be based on a new theology. He strongly stresses that missiology is the backbone of theology. This means that all theological disciplines taught at CUM must lead to missionary consciousness and that every student is a potential missionary in Congo and beyond. In other words, the curriculum includes highly academic disciplines and practical assignments such as planting churches, evangelistic work among unreached peoples. CUM is demonstrating that academic requirements can be coupled with practical work on Mission fields.

Research on Mission is also a part of CUM's vision. In this perspective, the centre seeks to develop resources, publish journals and books on Mission. Its library will make available key books and journals to researchers and church leaders. In its programmes, CUM longs to develop partnership with local churches, Para-Church movements and existing Mission agencies. It organises seminars, workshops and conferences for local and national pastors and lay leaders. The annual December Conference on Mission is certainly one of the best known conferences organised by CUM for African leaders.

15 Information given by the President of CUM
2.3.4. Analysis of African Initiated Missions

These African initiated Missions demonstrate a model of Mission alongside Classical and Faith Missions models. The strength of the model demonstrated by these African Missions lies in their willingness to extend the Kingdom to the unreached, the ever neglected peoples in Africa. These peoples are found in rural areas, poor regions and Moslem countries. In this, they follow Hudson Taylor and Charles Studd's footprints. Our comments on the model demonstrated by African initiated Missions deal with the following issues:

- Mission resources: They demonstrate that Mission should be done by Africans first. They are the best missionaries for Africa. In Côte d'Ivoire, the eleven indigenous missionaries sent by CMF may plant more new Churches than 900 western missionaries can do. They also demonstrate that they can find sufficient financial resources within Africa.

- Training: The future of African Initiated Missions must lie in a solid theological reflection and a highly academic training given to the leaders. We note that most of these African Mission agencies, except CUM, do not assure theological education to their leaders and missionaries, although they have programmes of training for their volunteers and leaders. Surely, these programmes help candidates develop their skills and be efficient on the Mission field but for a short term. African Mission agencies need particularly a clear theological discourse which should sustain their actions and would model their missionaries. Without such a discourse, they will have no future.
- Co-operation: There is no co-operation between African Mission agencies. They do not know each other and thus they cannot co-operate especially in terms of research, theological thinking and training. CUM is an exception among these agencies since it gives priority to theological education. It may help other African agencies sharpen their missiological discourse and develop co-operation between them.

- Ecclesiological issues: These Missions are extending the Kingdom of God in planting new churches in remote places. But since they have no ecclesiastical tradition, they have to face ecclesiological issues. It is important to stress that they have no clear ecclesiology. The following questions must be posed to their leaders: What kind of church do the African Initiated Missions produce? What is the status of these churches vis-à-vis the agency, and vis-à-vis other existing churches?

In spite of their positive contribution to extending the Kingdom of God, since many churches will be planted in the years to come, the African Initiated Mission agencies may perpetuate the former paradigm. They are simply following in the Faith Missions' footsteps. Therefore, the churches that they will have planted will surely face the same problems as the evangelical churches. There is no model of church organisation or order, no clear vision for the church, and no solid theological discourse.

2.4. Analysis of current models of Mission in Africa
The last part of this chapter is devoted to overall analysis of the current models of Missions that we have in Africa: Protestant models, the Catholic model and African initiated models.

2.4.1. Impact on society:

We realise that the impact on unreached peoples is insignificant, in spite of the proliferation of Mission agencies and Catholic congregations. Yet, Africa is registering one of “the fastest Christian growth rates in the world” according to David Barrett in ANITEPAM (1999: No 23). Barrett’s statement may mislead us because growth in most countries is mainly in cities. Rural areas remain neglected, yet more than 80% of African populations are still rural.

We also note that the impact of Christianity on public life is weak. Most Christian values are ignored in African societies although Christianity has been present in Africa for about one hundred years. People cannot resist corruption and ethnicism in many African societies. These evils have produced civil wars and destruction in some “Christian” countries in Africa. We then conclude that most of these agencies and congregations have no vision for the unreached ethnic groups. From our perspective, this is a matter of missiology and theology.

2.4.2. Missiological issues

Most of the current models share a few common characteristics as we have said in the first part of the chapter. There are two parallel and independent bodies on the Mission
field: the indigenous church and the Mission agency, the particular Church or Diocese and the orders. The difference between these bodies is obvious. The lifestyle of missionaries is much higher than that of indigenous leaders. It is well known that the annual budget of a missionary can cover the budget of a number of indigenous leaders. Yet, the former does no more work in Mission than the latter. Eighty per cent of a western Mission agency budget goes to salaries of its missionaries.

We assume that these current models of Mission are mainly based on the world economic order. This order divides the world in two categories, the rich countries in the West and the poor countries in the rest. As Köhler says, the world is managed by an apartheid system. Köhler describes the global apartheid as follows:

"The global society is a mirror reflection of South African society [before 1994]; one can go a step further and say that global apartheid is even more severe than South African apartheid... [It] is a structure of world society which combines socio-economic and racial antagonism in which a minority of whites occupies the pole of influence, while a majority composed of other races occupies the pole of poverty" [Köhler 1992: 283-284].

Unfortunately, Mission agencies but also indigenous Churches cannot get rid of this world economic order.

The nineteenth century anthropology functions alongside the world economic order as a basis of current theology of Mission. This anthropology gives a lower status to indigenous peoples and develops a hierarchy of cultures. Consequently, missionaries have difficulties to consider their indigenous counterparts as equal partners. This creates a gap between

---

16 The example of C B International (Former CBFMS): Its Annual Ministry and Financial Report (undated) shows that $18,735,270 out of $25,273,837 go to salaries, benefits and support
them. To the former, a good missionary is the one who is faithful to missionary principles, philosophy and ethos. We can conclude that Christianity, which uses these models of Mission, failed to extend the Kingdom of God and influence the society positively.

Throughout the history of Mission, attempts to improve missiology have been made. The principle of ‘Partnership in obedience’ was proposed at the International Missionary Conference of Whitby in 1947 (Saayman 1999: 1). Missionaries on the Mission field had to be loyal and accountable to the indigenous Church that they work with. The decision on ‘Partnership in obedience’ was not really implemented. At the WCC Conference in New Delhi in 1961, ‘Integration principle’ was proposed to Mission agencies. The Mission was encouraged to integrate into the Church. Its workers would become Church workers. But that decision was rejected by most Mission agencies.

Vatican Council II devoted a significant part of its decisions to Mission in *Ad Gentes*. But we can maintain that the Roman Catholic Church has not really changed since the 1960s in terms of Mission.

At the African continent level, John Gatu proposed a *Moratorium* in the 1970s (Saayman: 1993). The All African Conference of Churches (AACC) adopted the *Moratorium* in 1975. John Gatu explained at many conferences held in the West as well as in Africa, that the *Moratorium* would give to Churches the opportunity to reconsider the current theology of programs. The expense of salaries represents 74% of the total expenses.
Mission and to get a new start. Unfortunately, the Moratorium has had no impact among Churches. The implementation of the decision on the Moratorium did not take place. For a number of Missions, namely Faith Missions, the Moratorium aims at rejecting missionaries. It disobeys "the Great Commission".

In his encyclical Redemptoris Missio, John Paul II insisted on the missionary task of the Church and the second evangelisation that she should undertake. But the Roman Catholic Church has not gained many new Churches since the publication of this encyclical.

We may therefore conclude that most decisions and recommendations made by those international conferences were not implemented. What may be the reasons for the failure of these various conferences on Mission?

The first reason is the lack of a solid theology of Mission. Decisions made at the various conferences on Mission had no solid and comprehensive theological ground. The real actors of Mission at the grass roots must be modelled by a theology before they can appropriate decisions on Mission and participate in the Mission programme.

The second reason is that the debates on Mission took place in an ivory tower between "specialists of Mission" rather than with real actors of Mission. There is a gap between thinkers and actors. We wonder whether African missiologists have ever spoken to the Christians at the grass root level.
The third reason for the failure has to do with the relationships between missionaries and indigenous leaders. In his article, Saayman (1999:5) invites all actors of Mission, missionaries and nationals to repent. For Saayman, metanoia appears as the best solution to the problems of Mission today in Africa. By metanoia, he means that Mission agencies initiated by the West and the African Church leaders must recognise their failure honestly and have the courage to make a new start for the glory of God. For Saayman, metanoia requires a radical change of mindset.

2.4.3. Ecclesiological Issues

The current missiology which appears as an independent science has filled the vacuum left by classical ecclesiologies. In fact, there are mainly two classical ecclesiologies inherited by most Christian Churches: the Reformation ecclesiology and the Catholic ecclesiology. The Reformation ecclesiology dealt with the nature of the Church, its government and officers, sacraments — mysterium, and the relationships with the State. There is no room for Mission. Consequently, the European Protestant Churches had no missionary vision until the nineteenth century.

The Catholic ecclesiology is not very different from the Reformation ecclesiology in terms of Mission. It is mainly based on Thomas Aquinas’ theology, the “Doctor of the Church”. His theology, and especially his ecclesiology, uses Aristotle’s approach. However, the Roman Catholic Church have been more missionary than Protestant Churches, thanks to congregations such as Jesus Company (or Jesuits). But those congregations have Mission strategies rather than a clear theology of Mission.
2.5. Conclusion for the Chapter

We have described the landscape of Missions working in Africa since 1900. Behind this landscape, we can read their respective missiologies that have brought some fruits on the Mission field in Africa. We conclude that most of these missiologies need to be revisited since they have failed in many areas of Church life. In the next chapter, we will describe the landscape of Churches existing in Africa. There is a tight link between the landscape of Missions and that of Churches and therefore a link between missiology and ecclesiology.
Part Two
Chapter Three

CHURCHES IN AFRICA
THEOLOGICAL APPROACH

Introduction

For the last three decades, the number of Christians in Africa has grown dramatically. So, for example, Christianity in Africa has been enriched with more than 10,000 African Independent Churches. Since the beginning of the 1990s, a significant number of African neo-Pentecostal Churches have also emerged\(^\text{17}\). In spite of these religious riches existing in historical mission churches as well as AICs, hundreds of ethnic groups remain unevangelised. There is no Church among these groups. This reality prompts one to ask how these riches can contribute to Mission so that most Africans may hear the Gospel? The present chapter considers this question in a theological perspective.

\(^{17}\) Two books can be mentioned on the growth of independent Churches in Africa: Buchanan 1995. Meeting the Future. Randburg: Knowledge Resources, and Asempa (Publisher) 1990. The Rise of Independent Churches. Accra: Asempa. The former describes and analyses the situation in South Africa while the latter is interested in the context in Ghana.
3.1. Classical typology of Churches

This section presents the main characteristics and the main distinctive marks of each type of Church in Africa at the level of doctrine as well as tradition.

Four major categories of Churches in Africa can be presented from the perspective of Mission18:

3.1.1. Mainline Protestant Churches

In our study, this category includes Anglican and most Protestant Churches. They have emerged from the missionary work performed by classical Missions. Although some of them have an Episcopal structure, most mainline Churches accept the universal priesthood. In this respect, there is no difference between clergy and lay people. Each member of the Church is responsible for his or her fellow-believer and has to present them to the throne of God as the priest did in the Old Testament. All of them, ordained or lay people, have free access to God. But a clear distinction must be made at ministry level. The minister must be distinguished from lay people because of his functions. This may lead to clericalism and may create a gap between minister and lay people.

Protestant clericalism emphasises the importance of ministry and therefore it may neglect the role of lay people in the church’s life. For some Protestant theologians, the twofold

---

18 As I am addressing the issue mainly from the perspective of churches active in mission in Africa south of the Sahara, I am not including any Orthodox churches in my typology.
task of the Church is “to glorify the Triune God” and “to proclaim his love to nations”\textsuperscript{19}. The minister must lead the People of God to this double mandate. Therefore, he is the key person in Church life and for her missionary work. He may encourage or discourage his people for missionary work.

The churches of this category may have a situation similar to that of the Roman Catholic Church in the sense that lay people are neither trained nor equipped for Mission. This may lead to ‘massification’ of the Church. As a result, the Churches of this category are not really keen on questioning themselves and changing to face a new era of Mission.

3.1.2. Evangelical Churches

Most Evangelical Churches have been founded by Faith Missions. Unlike the mainline Churches planted by European Churches such as the Church of England, the Church of Scotland or the Lutheran Church of Norway, the evangelical Churches have a weak ecclesiology mostly since they were created by interdenominational Mission agencies.

Universal priesthood is better experienced in this category than in mainline Protestant Churches. Lay people are better committed to Church life. But there is no model of order to follow since there is no ecclesiastical tradition. Hence, the Church may face two challenges in this area, either she is governed only by the Pastor without significant

\textsuperscript{19} The theological journal \textit{Perspectives Réformées} (no 1 & 2, 1982) gives an important survey on the \textit{raison d'être} of the Church and the centrality of the glory of God in Church life, according to Reformed Theology. \textit{Soli Deo Gloria} is the motto of Churches from the Reformation Tradition. It is also most helpful to read the issue no 1 & 2, 1981 on the Proclamation of the Gospel as a main mark of the Church.
collaboration of lay people, or she is dominated by a group of elites. In this way, the Church may swing from clericalism to elitism. In many cases, churches in this category are not able to have a long-range plan, especially in terms of mission.

3.1.3. Catholic Church

In many countries in Africa, especially the French speaking countries that I deal with in my thesis, the Roman Catholic Church is the largest and probably the most influential and most powerful. Her ecclesiology rests on the classical nota ecclesiae: one, holy, catholic and apostolic. The last two marks --catholicity and apostolicity-- seem to be the most dominant marks in the Church life.

Catholicity is not only geographical but also theological (Küng 1990: 125). As Dulles (1987:127) says, “Catholicity meant (sic) that the Church spread over the whole world, has the same creed, the same worship and the same system of law”. It means that the Roman Catholic Church possesses the whole truth and reveals it to all nations throughout history, from the beginning to the end.

“She (the Church) is Catholic because Christ is present in Her... The fullness of the Body of Christ united to her Head subsists in her, this implies that she receives from Him the fullness of the means of salvation: sound and complete confession of faith, sacramental and integral life, and ordained ministry in apostolic succession. The Church was Catholic, in a fundamental sense, on the day of Pentecost, and she will be always (Catholic) until Parousia.”20 [Librairie Editrice Vaticane 1992 : 183]

20 The original text reads as follows : « Elle est catholique parce qu’en elle le Christ est présent... En elle subsiste la plénitude du Corps du Christ uni à sa Tête, ce qui implique qu’elle recoive de Lui «la plénitude des moyens de salut» qu’Il a voulu : confession de foi droite et complète, vie
Although the Roman Catholic Church has been open to other Churches since Vatican Council II, and is willing to co-operate with them, this concept of catholicity could prevent her from co-operating with others in Mission and from contributing fully to *missio Dei*.

The theological concept of apostolicity deals with apostolic succession and the exclusive role of the Pope and bishops in terms of teaching and communicating the truth. Catholic ecclesiology gives to the *ecclesia docens* the power to teach the *ecclesia audiens*, and to proclaim the Kingdom of God to nations. In other words, without the blessings of the *ecclesia docens* -- the Pope and bishops --, no missionary task is valid, according to Catholic ecclesiology.

It is true that since Vatican Council II, the apostolate of lay people has been significantly developed. More and more lay people are involved in church life at the parish level, but they have no active role in Mission. Their role is limited to temporal realities as *Lumen Gentium* states it:

> “The calling of the laity consists in searching for the Kingdom of God, precisely through the management of temporal realities that they handle according to God.”

---

sacramentelle et intégrale et ministère ordonné dans la succession apostolique. L’Église était, en ce sens fondamental, catholique au jour de la Pentecôte, et elle le sera toujours jusqu’au jour de la Parousia”.

21 The original text reads as follows : «La vocation propre des laics consiste à chercher le règne de Dieu précisément à travers la gérance des choses temporelles qu’ils ordonnent selon Dieu (...).
Only the magisterium, through priests and orders, can communicate the truth and get involved in Mission. The African Synod held in Rome in 1994 expressed the opinion of African bishops on this issue as follows:

“The hierarchical, clerical, and institutional model of Church still dominates, and for many Christians, this model of Church minimises the active role of the laity and the African sense of community and participation of all believers.” [African Synod 1996: 17]

As a result, the Roman Catholic Church is getting older. She consists mainly of a majority of religious people rather than convinced Catholics. In this perspective, the Roman Catholic Church is opening the door to Christendom. The situation in many parts of Africa is similar to that of Latin America as Padilla describes it. Indeed, Padilla explains how Christendom has invaded Christian life in Latin America. He says:

“Placed at the service of Christendom, both Roman Catholicism and evangelical Protestantism (in Latin America) take the shape of popular religiosity. In this way, they turn Christianity into a popular religion that appeals to the masses, but they fail with regard to the purpose of the church derived from the Gospel --that of contributing from below toward the formation of a community of disciples of Christ who are the salt of the earth and the light of the world.” [Padilla 1999: 110]

The reason for this situation of Christendom is the fact that lay people are not really involved in the life of the Church. Padilla concludes that a new ecclesiology that
overcomes the current clerical model is urgently needed. This ecclesiology will consider the People of God as «a vast network of communities that include Christians, religious, priests, and bishops, without class distinction» (Boff quoted by Padilla 1999: 110).

The challenge for the Roman Catholic Church would be to count on lay people, at the grassroots and to give them appropriate training in Christian life, which consists of Bible-based ethics and proclamation of the Good News. But, her current ecclesiology may not allow this important change.

3.1.4. Independent Churches

Different from the African Independent Churches (AIC), the Churches of this category are relatively recent. Most of them were established in the 1980s at the initiative of African leaders. Their members came mainly from Protestant and Catholic Churches. The rapid growth of the Churches in this category can be explained by the coming of democracy in many parts of Africa. Indeed, the new era of democracy encourages free initiatives and gives freedom to people to organise their lives. Since these Churches are nascent, they have roots neither historically nor theologically. Their future cannot be predictable before some decades have passed. It is too soon to know if they are mission minded Churches.

22 We use this term to refer to newly born churches to the initiative of African leaders. In some countries, they are called Neopentecostal Churches (South Africa), and Revival Churches (Ghana). We exclude the African Churches that preach exclusively prosperity and blessings. We exclude also the African Independent Churches as we explained it in 2.3.
3.1.5. Evaluative comment

This landscape shows us that co-operation between these categories of Churches for missionary work is not easy since the ecclesiology of each Church does not allow such an enterprise. Therefore, the spiritual and religious riches, which Africa has, are not properly managed for Missio Dei. The best that each Church can do is to extend her empire and to make her denomination known to peoples to the end of the earth! This creates a situation of confusion because the people whom the Church is to evangelise see the label of the denomination rather than the person of Christ. It is true that many people come to Christ through the evangelistic efforts of these Churches. But these new converts have a low view of Mission and a narrow understanding of the work of God. In this way, the denomination-centred Mission will be perpetuated.

3.2. New typology of Churches

The classical typology shows that each category is isolated from others, for historical or theological reasons. Collaboration is therefore difficult. We propose another typology, which takes into account more recent developments such as the phenomenon of new churches proliferating. This new typology considers the daily life and practice of each church rather than official theology. It deals mainly with spirituality and with the way faith is expressed corporately rather than the content of faith.

3.2.1. Sacramental Churches

Sacraments are at the heart of the life of these Churches because they are considered means of salvation. The Church is perceived as the Primordial Sacrament of God and in
this perspective, celebration of sacraments, especially the Eucharist is her *raison d'être* to an important extent. Dulles comments on this as follows:

“In several Council documents, especially the Constitution on Liturgy, the sacramental worship of the Church is given a certain primacy over all other forms of Christian life.” [Dulles: 1987, 64]

In other words, through sacraments, the Church brings salvation to the People of God, forgives sins, and delivers from physical and spiritual sickness. This means that the Church without sacraments is not a Church. The life of the Church revolves around of the altar and stays within the sanctuary. Therefore, the contact with the outside is poor. The majority of the People of God have no role to play. They are not concerned about the mandate of the Church.

This category includes not only the Roman Catholic Church but also some Protestant Churches, especially the Lutheran Church, the Anglican Church and parts of the Reformed Churches. The latter are not necessarily sacramentalist but, in their circles, the sacraments of Baptism and Holy Communion become more important than Bible reading or preaching. In these Churches, lay people may preach but they are not allowed to administer the sacraments. Kayayan describes this incoherence seen in a few Reformed Churches as follows:

“The time has come to reconsider the important confusion and the incoherence that dominate the life of certain Reformed Churches. While a lay member of the Church is not allowed, or rarely, to administer sacraments — although Baptism and Holy Communion are subordinated to the Word — a non ordained is authorised to
deliver a sermon.” [Kayayan 1981: 19]

The altar or sanctuary is central to these churches, either as a matter of theological conviction or simple factual reality. Therefore, they have a low view for others, so they intentionally or subconsciously neglect Mission.

The challenge of this category of churches is to make sacraments an instrument of salvation in such a way that the People of God are committed to sharing the same grace and blessings with others.

3.2.2. Liturgical Churches

Liturgy, inherited from the mother church, is a distinctive mark of denominational identity for some Protestant Churches. It appears as an opportunity and a setting for worship, for celebration of faith and of God. For liturgical churches, liturgy seems to be an essential aspect of the Church's life. We need to state the difference between the Sacramental Churches and Liturgical Churches because for some theologians they are identical. Sacramental Churches underline the role of sacraments in the life of believers as a mean of grace whereas Liturgical Churches are interested in the form of worship that gives them a sense of belonging.

Liturgical Churches have a strong sense of history and of corporate identity. They have a

---

23 The French text reads as follows: "Il est temps de reconsiderer la grande confusion et l’incohérence qui domine dans certaines Eglises Réformées. Alors qu’on autorise pas, ou rarement, l’administration des Sacrements à un membre “laïc” – quoique Baptême et Sainte Cène
high view of their belonging to the Universal Church in the sense that they share the same liturgy with their sister churches abroad. To some extent, the Roman Catholic Church is liturgical since the celebration of sacraments is situated within the liturgy. But as we use it here, this category includes mainly Protestant Churches and a few Evangelical Churches.

The challenge for this category is to consider liturgy not as a goal of the Church, but as an opportunity for the People of God, ordained and lay people, to act together inside and outside the Church in order to fulfill the mandate.

3.2.3. Kerygmatic Churches

Kerygmatic Churches stress the importance of Scripture reading. *Sola Scriptura* is the main pillar of the teaching and the life of these churches. It is a legacy from the sixteenth century Reformation. By Scripture reading, they mean firstly preaching but also Bible exposition and Bible study. For them, "*praedicatio verbi est verbum Dei*", the preaching of the word is the Word of God. Hence, the pulpit is symbolically the main furniture of the temple, instead of the altar as in Sacramental Churches.

Kerygmatic Churches do not ignore the importance of liturgy or sacraments in the life of the Church, but they believe that the main office of the Church is to preach the Gospel in order to nurture the People of God and to proclaim the Good News to nations.

soient subordonnés à la Parole en général – on autorisera à quelqu’un de non-ordonné à prononcer le sermon..."
This category includes most Protestant Churches planted by Faith Mission agencies but also some Evangelical Churches such as Conservative denominations and Brethren/Assemblies types of Churches.

The strength of this category of Churches lies in their willingness to transform the written word into the audible Word of God addressed to nations, in missionary perspective. However, mission is not only proclamation, "the word must become flesh" as Dulles rightly says. Mission includes also active presence in the world and witness in deeds.

3.2.4. Charismatic Churches

In this thesis the term charismatic does not refer necessarily to a denomination or to a Christian trend. It rather refers to a given spirituality that we observe in some Christian circles. For charismatic Churches, spiritual experiences are fundamental to Church life. Without the power of the Holy Spirit, the Church is not able to achieve her mandate, which is "to witness to the end to the earth." Witnessing means preaching the whole Gospel, healing the sick, praying for Spirit baptism and for spiritual gifts that Christians must be equipped with. Performing miracles, delivering prophecies and promising blessings from God and victory over enemies are on the agenda of these churches.

In this thesis, the name charismatic Churches includes Pentecostal churches born in the 1900s, the Charismatic Churches emerging in the 1960s and Neo-Pentecostal Churches

24 Calvin and his disciples shared the conviction that the preaching faithful to Scripture is God's
emerging in the 1970s. Most of them are indigenous and African initiated Churches. They have a high view of evangelism. Crusades and evangelistic campaigns have a privileged space in their programmes. They are the strongest churches in terms of mission.

3.2.5. Evaluative Comment

Some remarks can be made concerning these categories of churches. Within each category, unity for missionary work remains to be a challenge in spite of common roots and characteristics that these Churches share, because the attachment to a denomination prevails over the quest for unity. The reason for this is that the legacy received from the former paradigm -- the paradigm of the nineteenth century -- proves to be an obstacle to unity. The more the church is rooted in history, the less she can rid herself of the baggage inherited from her mother church in the West. On the other hand, the recent Churches, which have no history, simply ignore the older ones. They refuse to co-operate with "dead churches" Nevertheless, the main reason for disunity is that each church has a better knowledge of her own inherited paradigm than the paradigm of early Christianity.

Nevertheless, these churches share some common characteristics. For example, the Sacramental Churches and Liturgical Churches are clerical. They have a strong sense of ordination and hierarchy. In this sense, their leaders can easily co-operate for the sake of the Gospel. Kerygmatic and Charismatic Churches share an interest in evangelism and mission. Sacramental and charismatic Churches have a centralised organisation. Liturgical word, as Kayayan explains it (1981: 17).
and Kerygmatic Churches consider themselves as Protestant denominations. This means that some of these churches can co-operate in various ways.

Moreover, African Churches have riches to share with each other and also to receive from each other. Sacramental Churches may share with other churches their sense of holiness of the sanctuary and by extension the holiness of the People of God with other churches. Liturgical Churches may help other churches understand the importance of history and the sense of belonging to the Universal Church. Kerygmatic Churches can encourage others to consider the centrality of Scripture and the priority of the preaching of the Word of God. Charismatic Churches can make Christians understand the reality of spiritual warfare today in Africa since evangelism and mission are basically a spiritual battle.

This new typology shows that no category is perfect. Therefore, each one of them has strengths and weaknesses either at organisational level, or at theological level. This typology also shows that co-operation between churches is possible because they share some common concerns, they have the same cultural context and face the same challenges.

3.2.6. Para-church organisations

Most ecclesiologies do not take into account the para-church organisations. Yet, they have contributed greatly to mission since World War II. For example, without the United Bible Societies (UBS), formerly British and Foreign Bible Societies, churches would have
had to evangelise without the Word of God. The Bible, or portions of it, has been translated into hundreds of African languages, thanks to UBS. According to Schaaf, 122 ethnic groups have the Bible in their mother tongues (Schaaf: 1992, 162). To some extent, the strength of the Church in Africa depends on para-church organisations. A few characteristics of para-church organisations must be mentioned. Historically, they are rooted in nineteenth century revivals and have inherited the missionary consciousness from the fathers of modern mission such as William Carey, Hudson Taylor and Charles Studd. In that sense, they belong to evangelical circles. Secondly, they are not affiliated to any churches and denominations. So, they claim to be inter-denominational and international. Finally, they focus their work on a particular area such as youth ministries, mission among Moslems, mission among the poor, Scripture distribution, mission through media, etc.

The question is what the status of para-church organisations vis-à-vis the Church should be. Ralph Winter's contribution to the debate on this issue is most helpful (Winter 1981). He has helped Church leaders reconsider their opinion on these organisations. Winter is inspired by the Roman Catholic Church’s structure and philosophy vis-à-vis orders and congregations. In many cases, Rome and the orders collaborate in excellent symbiosis.

According to some denominations, there is no Biblical basis for para-church organisations. Therefore, these denominations are not keen to legitimate their work. They simply tolerate them on the field of mission. For his part, Winter (1974) developed the concept of “modality” and “sodality”. He used also the metaphor of «warp and woof». A
local church is a modality while a para-church organisation is a sodality. In his discourse, he adopts a historical approach and starts with a rereading of the New Testament:

"He (Paul) was, true enough, sent out by the church in Antioch. But once way from Antioch he seemed very much on his own. The little team he formed was economically self-sufficient when occasion demanded... Paul's team may certainly be considered a structure [para-church structure]." [Winter 1981: 179]

Thus, he sees two structures of the Universal Church in the New Testament. In the Acts of the Apostles, Paul and his missionary team incarnated a sodality. It was a homogenous team, with the clear vision of planting churches. This sodality was accountable to the church in Antioch or in Jerusalem. He also rereads the history of the Church and notes that orders and congregations, as sodalities, have been working alongside the Roman Catholic Church. Winter has the merit of providing a theological and historical basis for para-church organisations.

Snyder takes part in the debate on the status of para-church structures. He affirms that denominations are also para-church structures since they have no Biblical basis just like any para-church structures. He says:

"There can be no question of finding a biblical pattern for denominational structures, or even for the detailed organisation of the local church, for the Bible is silent here. What we must do, therefore, is to look for general principles or insights which seem to be implied by the biblical description for the Church..." [Snyder 1983: 93]

On the other hand, he states that the difference between the Church and para-church
organisations is significant. According to him, the Church is God’s creation, God’s instrument for evangelisation and reconciliation. She is eternal and her goal is to glorify God, while para-church organisations are human initiatives, human instruments for evangelisation (Snyder 1974: 95). They are temporary and thus they have no eschatology. Their goal is to serve the Church.

We can conclude that there are three opinions vis-à-vis the para-church organisations: for some Churches, such organisations are not a part of the Universal Church. They are peripheral vis-à-vis the Church. According to Winter, para-church organisations are as legitimate as local churches are. From Snyder's perspective, the raison d'être of these organisations is only to serve the Church. They do not have the same theological status as the Church.

We note that whatever the discourse on para-church organisations is, a malaise between churches and such organisations persists. This malaise will not be cleared up until an appropriate ecclesiology is elaborated. This ecclesiology would take into account the role of these para-church organisations, and especially the mission agencies within the Church.

3.3. Analysis of Present Ecclesiologies and Conclusion

These categories of Churches are based on current ecclesiologies. The question is to know how relevant these ecclesiologies are to the African context. How do they help the Church meet the real needs of African peoples and achieve her mandate? In other words, where is the true Church?
The Catholic ecclesiology presents the four Notae Ecclesia: the Church as one, holy, catholic and apostolic. Her unity is characterised by "the subordination of the faithful to one and the same spiritual jurisdiction and to one and the same teaching magisterium" (Dulles: 1987, 127). This ecclesiology emphasises the unifying role of the magisterium. The holiness of the Church is related to the concept of sacrament. The catholicity of the Church is explained by Hans Küng as follows: "the Church is, must be and wants to be present everywhere and at any time" (Küng). She is essentially the same everywhere, and whatever the situation is. The mark of apostolicity legitimates the succession of pastors by Rome (Dulles: 1987, 128).

We conclude that none of these four marks of the Church, as interpreted by the Roman catholic Church, stresses the importance of the Mission of the Church. They rather deal with the identity of the Church and not with her mandate. Referring to Vatican Council II, just one paragraph out of seventy concerns Mission in the ecclesiology (Lumen Gentium, 17). Catholic ecclesiology has inherited this approach from the Hellenistic culture. Like Catholic ecclesiology, Catholic Christology is ontological and not functional. It is true that Vatican Council II devotes the decree "Ad Gentes" to Mission but it does it in such a way that missiology is independent from ecclesiology.

According to Reformation ecclesiology, the true Church preaches the Gospel correctly and administers the sacraments properly. Kuyper says that the two real marks of the Church are: Praedicatio verbi and administratio sacramenti. Calvin and some of his followers
shared the same conviction (Berkhof 1979: 576). We have here a functional ecclesiology, which stresses the twofold task of the Church, preaching and celebrating. However, this ecclesiology shows no evidence of the missionary work of the Church because one can say that the twofold task has to be achieved within the Church, during liturgy.

As we have already said, the African Initiated Mission agencies have missiology without ecclesiology. They have praxis without reflection. We doubt that the African Mission agencies have a future in the new era of Christianity in Africa, unless a new ecclesiology is born.

Beyond theological considerations, and beyond the fact that most of the present ecclesiologies have to be revisited, some important factors have influenced Churches.

- Domination of hierarchy: The Roman Catholic Church and a number of Protestant churches do not encourage the involvement of lay people in church life and especially in mission work, because the main actions must be decided by the hierarchy and implemented by people whom the same hierarchy designates. The members of these churches have a poor sense of personal responsibility for mission.

This issue concerns not only the Roman Catholic Church and some mainline Protestant Churches, but also nascent churches. As a matter of fact, some of these nascent churches are moving toward an Episcopal model, consciously or unconsciously. The senior pastor appears to be a bishop of the Church. One may
wonder whether they do not have a culture-based ecclesiology. Indeed, some African cultures have a high view of hierarchy. This is easily carried over into the Church. The tendency to have two kinds of members in the Church has no Biblical basis. All members are full members, and therefore must serve the Church in her mandate.

- Dictatorship of economic order: The world economic order prevails over Biblical criteria in terms of mission. The African Synod held in 1994 states this issue as follows:

"Instead of the African Church organising the sending of Missionary sons and daughters to other continents, this process has been largely ‘taken over’ by international Missionary societies that recruit candidates on their own without the necessary and the enriching relationship that should exist between the sending and the receiving local churches." [African Synod 1994: 16]

The dictatorship of the economic order is perpetuating the former paradigm. Yet, the African Churches have enough human resources to be able to take over the tasks performed by the western missionaries. Here, the economic situation prevails over theological considerations. In other words, whatever the ecclesiology is, the Church in Africa has to be submissive to the power of money and the West unless she accepts to face the challenge of economic trials.

- Ambiguous content of mission: Most churches may agree that mission is their main task, and that it consists in planting churches where no Christian witness exists. But there is no common understanding of the content of mission. For the Roman
Catholic Church, the aim of mission is to establish an eucharistic community (*Lumen gentium*, 17). Some Protestant Churches include social transformation and political involvement of the church in mission. For some Evangelical Churches, mission is merely evangelism. It is true that the Lausanne Covenant clearly stated that Mission must include evangelism and social actions. However, after almost thirty years, some Evangelical circles keep on reducing mission to mere evangelism.

Issues such as tribalism or ethnicism ignored: Most ecclesiologies have not developed reflections on the relationship between the local church and the Universal Church. The concept of universality is widely understood in its geographical and theological meanings. The challenge is to express locally this universality. Few ecclesiologies make it clear that the local church represents *locally* the Universal Church. The former has the riches, charisma, and blessings promised to the latter.

As a matter of fact, in many African countries, some local churches are mono-ethnic, thanks to the “Comity Agreement” concluded by missionary societies when they came to Africa. According to this agreement, each missionary society had to work within a particular zone of the country. Consequently, it planted new churches among one or two ethnic groups. The Comity Agreement encouraged tribalism and ethnicity in the sense that Christians stayed within a denomination and within a region of the country. For decades they had no contact with other Christians. Therefore that agreement

---

25 Declaration of Lausanne in 1974, article 5 reads: “... we affirm that evangelism and socio-political commitment are both Christian assignments. Both, they are the necessary expression of our doctrine of God and man, of love for the neighbour and of obedience to Christ”.
could not help local churches become missionary.

- Misunderstanding of the mandate of the Church: Once a new church is planted through missionary work, a basic question arises: What is the mandate of this Church? There are various responses to this question: For the Roman Catholic Church, the mandate is to celebrate the Eucharist. According to some protestant circles, the Church is called to glorify God and to celebrate faith. The Calvinist Churches such as the Presbyterian and Reformed Churches, but also the Anglican Churches, affirm that the Church is to preach the Gospel and to administer properly the Sacraments (Thirty Nine Articles of the Church of England: 19th article).

We therefore assume that a new ecclesiology is really needed in order to reach the unreached peoples, to plant new Churches so that all ethnic groups can be represented in the Kingdom of God and that the Church may have a visible impact in various areas of life in Africa. This new ecclesiology will address the above stated issues: the structure of the local church, the economic and human resources of the Church, the nature and the content of Mission, the concept of universality and the mandate of the Church.

3.4. Toward a New Ecclesiology

The present chapter has demonstrated that classical ecclesiologies –catholic and protestant— are obsolete. They did not help churches play fully their role and have a significant impact on society, especially in Africa. This leads us to think of the birth of a new ecclesiology.
Three outstanding theologians can lead us in our reflections in this perspective: A Dulles, SC Bate, and V. Donovan. Dulles is a western thinker, an influential theologian in the West as well as in Africa, in Catholic circles and beyond. Although he is loyal and faithful to Catholic dogmas and doctrines, he dares to propose new tracks for reflections on the Church. In this respect, he may lead us on new tracks for a new ecclesiology. Bate, for his part, is an African theologian, from a Roman Catholic religious order in South Africa. His writings deal mainly with methodology. But through his books, he appears as one of the heralds of new ecclesiology that take into account culture and mission. He develops the idea of inter-penetration between ecclesiology and missiology. His ideas may be applicable to most African contexts. V. Donovan is the third thinker whom we will consider in this section. He spent many decades in Tanzania as a Roman Catholic Catholic missionary. His experience among Masai people led him to revisit Catholic missiology – especially the Catholic policy of mission in East Africa, and to propose a Bible based ecclesiology which includes missiology.

These theologians can be considered as bridge builders to a new era of Christianity in Africa.

3.4.1. Dulles' Ecclesiology

3.4.1.1. Description

It is important to note the difference between the preceding section (3.3) and the present one. The preceding chapter on Typology of Churches deals with categories of churches.
It shows that each church expresses a predominant dimension of her life such as sacramental, liturgical, kerygmatic or charismatic. The other dimensions are less visible. The present chapter deals rather with models of Church which attempt to embody as far as possible all the various dimensions.

During the last three decades, a few theologians, especially in ecclesiology and missiology have adopted a typological approach. Orlando Costas (1974) appears to be one of the heralds of this approach. We can also mention David Bosch (1991) and Charles Kraft (1992). This approach is characterised by the use of concepts such as paradigm, model, pattern, metaphor or image. It was proved to be less conceptual and more expressive than classical approaches. Thus, it could speak to theologians as well as to ordinary Christians from various denominations and churches.

In this chapter, we have chosen Dulles' ecclesiology for study, for a number of reasons. Dulles speaks not only to the Roman Catholic Church and Catholic theologians, but also to Protestant ones. In referring constantly both to Catholic and non-Catholic thinkers, he breaks the walls that separate these thinkers and makes us understand that Missio Dei requires an ecumenical approach. He gives a new reading of classical data on the Church, from Scripture and Tradition, but also from ancient creeds and Councils up to Vatican Council II. Thus, he helps theologians have access to new perspectives for the Church today.

Dulles presents five models of Church. The first model is the Church as an Institution
characterised by the preponderant role that the magisterium plays, and the organisational stability that the hierarchy ensures, because "the Church of Christ could not perform in Mission without some stable organisational features" (Dulles 1987: 34). In this model, each Christian's role is to bring non-believers into the institution. The Church is also presented as a Mystical Communion, which has some equivalent features as the Body of Christ and the People of God have (1987: 33). This model emphasises the role of the Spirit within the Church and the goal of her members to lead men and women into the communion with the divine (1987: 58). The first two models maintain the balance between the human and the divine dimension of the Church. Then, Dulles presents the Church as a Sacrament, a sign of Christ and as such, she actualises salvation and the grace of God. The Church as a Sacrament is here perceived as being between Institution and Mystical Communion. The Church as a Herald is the fourth model that Dulles presents. This model highlights the priority of the Word of God and the proclamation of this word to non-believers. The evangelistic missionary thrust is most developed in this model (1987: 84). The Church as Servant is the last model in Dulles' presentation. In the perspective of servanthood, the Church has to serve the world and to foster brotherhood. She has to be dynamically present in the world.

In itself, each model is a theological discourse, more or less independent vis-à-vis the others. Dulles points out that no model is sufficient as an entire ecclesiology. He affirms also that the combination of the five models does not necessarily give a more sufficient ecclesiology, "since the Church is mystery, we are condemned to work with models", as he says (1987: 195).
Then he gives a number of criteria to test the validity or the correctness of each model. These criteria are: Basis in Scripture, Basis in Tradition, Capacity to give Church members a sense of their corporation and Mission, tendency to foster Christian values, correspondence with the religious experience, theological fruitfulness, and fruitfulness in enabling the Church members to relate to others (1987: 191-92).

In this typological approach, Dulles proposes to handle the dialectical relationship that exists between the true Church and the church, the Roman Catholic Church and the other Churches, the Church and the Kingdom. For Dulles, the Church is not perfectly one, holy, catholic and apostolic as it was stated in the creeds and classical ecclesiology. She must aspire to be more one, holy, catholic and apostolic: “It is Christ who calls the Church to actualise each one of these qualities” (Libraria Editrice Vaticane 1992: 178). To be more “apostolic” means to seek to embrace more and more people (Dulles 1987: 131). In this sense, the church will become the Church, with capital ‘C’. Dulles totally agrees with the declaration of Vatican Council II that «the true Church subsists in the Roman Catholic Church» (1987: 126). In fact, in the previous draft of the Constitution on Church, the term was “is”. The fact that this term was replaced by ‘subsists in’ shows that the Roman Catholic Church took a further step toward ecumenism. This leaves room for a plurality of churches and implies that the Church is made up of all churches (Lumen Gentium, 15). In eschatological perspective, Dulles makes us understand that the Church is moving toward perfection, to the New Jerusalem. “The foundation has been laid but the building is still incomplete,” he says (1987: 113). In other words, the coming of the
Kingdom will be the fulfilment of the Church (1987: 121). Dulles concludes his ecclesiology in saying that the five models he has proposed are not the only possible ones (1987: 195).

3.4.1.2. Personal evaluation: The validity of Dulles’ Ecclesiology

Dulles’ contribution to ecclesiological debates is most significant not only for the West but also for Africa. We note four points:

1. His ecclesiology is open to non Catholic traditions and to the future.

Dulles is proposing a global ecclesiology. He includes most Christian Churches in his field. He takes into account non-Catholic ecclesiologies presented by outstanding theologians such as R. Bultmann, J. Moltmann, J.A. Robinson, L. Newbigin and especially K. Barth. He refers to the Reformation theology as well as to the World Council of Churches declarations. We realise that he is not only a knowledgeable thinker but also a flexible theologian. His ecclesiology helps church leaders develop mutual understanding and better co-operation for the Kingdom. Dulles’ ecclesiology can be read by most theologians, and may be applicable to various denominations.

2. He seriously questions classical ecclesiologies –Catholic and Protestant:

His ecclesiology is less for the present situation than for the future as he invites theologians to modernisation of structure, ecumenical interplay, internal pluralism and voluntariness to achieve the Missio Dei. In doing so, he urges the Roman Catholic Church to demonstrate an overture to other Churches, to encourage laity to commit themselves to Mission, alongside religious and ordained leaders and to reconsider her understanding
of the four marks of the Church in the light of Scripture.

He questions the Protestant theologians regarding their various ecclesiologies. Indeed, there are a variety of ecclesiologies in Protestant circles. They understand the four marks of the Church differently. Dulles invites them to show unity among themselves through their thinking so that they may propose a common ecclesiology and make a step toward the Catholic theologians since the task is huge and no sole church can achieve it in time.

3. He affirms that the Church is made up of sinful men and women: she is marching to New Jerusalem where she will attain the fullness, in the eschaton. Incarnating the four marks of the Church – unity, holiness, catholicity and apostolicity - is the daily task for every community of God.

4. A solid link between the ontological dimension and the functional dimension is clearly established. His approach is mainly ontological. He is concerned about the nature of the Church. But it is also functional. Each model he presents refers to a special task of the Church. The tasks of the Church range from bringing non-believers into the institution to proclaiming the Word as a Herald. The evangelistic task of the Church and her dynamic presence in the world is firmly stated in these models.

We have however some comments to present on Dulles’ ecclesiology. We recognise that it is relatively new in its approach. Thus, it can bring new perspectives and new understanding of the Church to theologians. A typological approach seems to be valuable
even though it is somewhat limited and cannot understand, describe, and present the Church extensively.

His ecclesiology is inclusive and invites all denominations to reinterpret the basic theological data such as the marks or the attributes of the Church, the tasks before the Church, the future of the Church, and to understand that the Church is God's enterprise and not human one.

However, we are not fully satisfied with Dulles' ecclesiology:

- Firstly, we wonder whether the typological approach is appropriate because it proposes actually five ecclesiologies. It is quite difficult to relate these models to each other in such a way that we have one ecclesiological discourse. Dulles himself suggests that one begins with a model, and integrates into this model some elements of the four other models (1987: 196).

- Secondly, Dulles does not consider the evangelical wing of Protestantism in his study, probably because there are few documents written by evangelical theologians on the subject. Yet, in some parts of the world, evangelicalism is so dynamic that it cannot be simply ignored. For example, in French speaking West Africa, Protestantism is officially represented by evangelicals. Most Protestant Churches in this region have been planted by Faith Missions. Fiedler may help us understand the ecclesiology of the evangelical Churches as it exists and functions in everyday life. These Churches also accept the four marks of the Church. For them, unity must be expressed at

26 In Senegal and Côte d'Ivoire, there is only one mainline Protestant church—the Reformed Church of Senegal and the Protestant Methodist Church in Côte d'Ivoire, the others are all
individual level, *holiness* is experienced as power for service and holy living, *catholicity* aims at making the Church worldwide, including men, women, educated and uneducated persons, and *apostolicity* is linked to Mission as the main task of the Church (Fiedler 1994: 319).

- Thirdly, Dulles' ecclesiology is basically Roman Catholic, even though it is inclusive and quite open to other theological circles. It is mainly faithful to Vatican Council II, and especially to *Lumen Gentium* and *Ad Gentes*. The Roman Catholic Church remains the leading Church in *Missio Dei*. The other Churches have a secondary status and play a minor role in Mission.

### 3.4.2. Bate's Ecclesiology

Among South African theologians, Bate is surely one of the most concerned about the situation of the Church after the collapse of apartheid. Most mainline Churches have been declining drastically in number whereas the Independent Churches have been growing (Bate 1995: 15). He says:

“Between 1980 and 1990 in South Africa, the number of Christians belonging to mainline churches such as the Anglican, Methodist, Catholic and Dutch Reformed Church declined by 25 percent from 12.1 million to 9.1 million. During the same period the number of Christians belonging to those churches offering religious and faith healing increased by 23% from 5.6 million to 6.9 million” [Bate 1995: 15]

For his part, Buchanan affirms that most Protestant Churches in South Africa had lost evangelical, planted by Faith Missions. In Mali, Guinea and Burkina Faso, all churches are evangelical, planted by Faith Missions such as CMA, SIM, GMU etc.
20% to 36% of their members from 1980 to 1990 whereas Independent Churches were growing numerically at the rate of 111% during the same period (Buchanan 1995: 24-25). This situation led Bate to study seriously the success of Independent Churches, especially the "Coping-Healing Churches", as he calls them. He defines these Churches as "those which have emerged recently and which emphasise the healing ministry as one of the major dimensions of their total ministry" (Bate 1995: 28). These churches have "healing" as part of every service whereas others have a special "healing service" from time to time. The success of these churches led Bate to reconsider the current ecclesiology of the Roman Catholic Church and to open some tracks for new ecclesiologies which would fit well in African cultures and which would meet specific needs that have been ignored by some theologies and ecclesiologies. Healing appears to be one of the most important needs in South Africa. So, the decline of mainline churches in his country may be explained by the fact that their ecclesiologies, expressed in their worship services, give no room to this need.

3.4.2.1. Concept of Inculturation

Since the 1970s, the theology of inculturation has been developed firstly by Catholic theologians, and adopted by a few Protestant theologians. In 1974, the Third Synod of Bishops of Africa and Madagascar rejected the theology of adaptation that had been developed by Zairian theologians such as Mulago since the early 1960s27. The Conference recommended rather the theology of inculturation/incarnation. The Bishops said:

---

“... the Bishops of Africa and Madagascar consider as being completely out-of-date the so called theology of adaptation. Instead, they adopt the theology of incarnation. The young churches of Africa and Madagascar cannot refuse to face up to this basic demand. They accept the fact of theological pluralism within the unity of faith, and consequently they must encourage, by all means, African theological research” [AMECEA 1974: 2].

Bate applied the concept of inculturation to Church life in his country, saying: “Definitions and understandings of inculturation revolve around the dynamic relationship or interpretation of two elements: a religious one and a worldly one” (1995: 230). In the process of inculturation, the Church and local culture have to interpenetrate each other in order to create a new situation characterised by an inculturated Church and a transformed culture. This new situation produces new Christian values for society.

Bate wants to draw theologians’ attention to the cultural dimension of the Church and to affirm that this is fully in tune with Roman Catholic theology. Indeed, Pope John Paul II says in *Redemptoris Missio* that “through inculturation the Church becomes a more intelligible sign of what she is, and more effective instrument of Mission” (RM 52).

From Bate’s perspective, culture has three dimensions: communication at the epistemological level, humanisation at the ontological level and sanctification at the metaphysical level (Bate 1995: 224). Hence, inculturation aims at communicating the good news to people, humanising the world --for the realisation of man, and sanctifying man in his relationship with God.
3.4.2.2. Inculturation and local church

According to Bate, the local church is “the fullness of the Church in a place” (1995: 238) rather than a fragment of the Church, as it is usually believed. In this sense, she has to fulfil the mandate of the Church where she is. Although he insists on the fullness of the local church, he points out that she is also the expression of the unity of the Church. In this sense, he is entirely in accordance with Vatican Council II which states that “the multiplicity of local churches, unified in common effort, shows all the more resplendently the catholicity of the undivided Church” (*Lumen Gentium*, 23). “A local church is made up of . . . a particular part of mankind (sic), speaking a language, heirs of a cultural patrimony, a vision of the world, of an historical past, of a particular human substratum” (*Evangelii Nuntiandi*, 62). Therefore, a diocese as a local church or a particular Church in Roman Catholic terminology, ministered by a bishop is fully the Church. Bate strongly affirms the spiritual dimension of the local church as she is “a community of faith” (*Lumen Gentium*, 8), transcending all human boundaries and facing the challenge of differences. The originality of Bate’s thought lies in the cultural dimension of the local church, but also on her missionary nature. He says that “the Church is Missionary by its very nature and the manifestation of a Missionary dimension beyond itself is a further necessary sign that the definite point has been reached” (1995: 240). He adds “cultural unity is . . . a legitimate basis for describing a group of culturally similar dioceses as a local church” (1995: 240).

3.4.2.3. Inculturation and Mission

Bate strongly stresses that inculturation and Mission are unseparable. To some extent,
inculturation is mission. He says: "this Mission is carried out by bringing good news to the culture and in this sense, inculturation is evangelisation" (1995: 242). From Bate’s perspective, doing mission is planning to plant a local church in a culture. But the process of inculturation is long and difficult. At the end of this process, the encounter of the Church with the culture brings birth to new Christian values and attitudes. A local church becomes missionary when she is adequately inculturated.

Healing is one of the most important needs for South African peoples whatever their racial backgrounds are, as we have already said. For more than fifty years, these peoples have been profoundly hurt by the system. Hence, they need to be healed, not only physically but also emotionally, socially and spiritually.

Bate found an example of successful inculturation in these Coping-Healing Churches. They have de facto a “South African ecclesiology” focussed on people in their culture. These churches believe that they must go to people where they are, and meet their real needs. However, they do not ignore that conversion to Christ is an essential need of every people.

3.4.2.4. Local church and Mission

For many years, one of the main items on the agenda of missiologists has been the relationship between Church and Mission. Some missiologists conclude that Church and Mission have a chicken-and-egg relationship and that the Church is the goal and fulfilment of Mission. According to Bate, Mission is the raison d'être of the local church.
The goal of Mission is the emergence of the local church, which process has several steps (Bate 1995: 245). At the first step, the sending Church is called to Mission. She sends Christians to local culture seen as pagan; these Christians can be categorised as missionary-explorers. At the next step, missionaries arrive and evangelise, using the culture of the sending Church. At this stage, the church is planted and acculturation occurs. This leads to the emergence of local leaders and to an encounter of two cultures. Then comes the transition period when Christianity demonstrates greater openness to the local culture. The inculturation process is here more explicit and leads to the emergence of a local church. At the last step, the local church becomes fully missionary.

3.4.2.5. Missionary Church in action

Bate’s ecclesiology is based on Church in action. There is a solid link between the nature of the Church, characterised by the four marks: One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic, and the praxis of the Church through the goals of ministries and institutions, expressed by the categories: Martyria, Diakonia, Koinoina, Leitourgia and Keryagma (Bate 1995: 249). The Church is permanently in action within a context and through culture. Bate explains the process as follows:

“"The encounter of the Church, expressed as ministries and institutions, and context, expressed as needs occurring within a culture medium, allows the emergence of an inculturated ministry which, as praxis, returns both to the context, to become a new event or phenomenon within the context, as well as to the Church where it challenges the nature and praxis of the Church". [Bate 1995: 250]
The context may be cultural, social, or political. It may be also a series of events, situations and phenomena within culture, that people meet with joys, griefs, hopes or anguish. Concerning South Africa, the context was made of racial struggles, situation of injustice, and experience of grievances towards apartheid and its actors. Yet, although South Africa has got rid of apartheid since the early 1990s, most people still need to be healed. The main task of a Missionary Church is therefore to meet these people and to heal them by the Gospel.

Therefore, the local church must consider the healing ministry as an important part of her life in the context of South Africa. This ministry deals with physical sickness caused by organic factors; emotional sickness due to psychological cultural, or social factors; spiritual sickness produced by personal sins; and demonic sickness characterised by demonic possession (Bate 1995: 278).

Therapy varies according to the nature of sickness but also according to the type of the Church. It may be physical therapy, counselling, confession and reparation, or exorcism. But whatever the nature of sickness is, prayer and sacraments are used during healing services.

3.4.2.6. Personal Evaluation: the Validity of Bate’s Ecclesiology

Bate can contribute meaningfully to the building up of a new ecclesiology for Africa. He develops extensively an original theology of inculturation in the following areas:
1. Culture has a preponderant role in Church life and Mission.

Inculturation is in the process of mission from the beginning to the end. It deals with communication, humanisation and sanctification. It is worth noting that, in his theology of inculturation, Bate goes much further than most African theologians for whom inculturation aims only to communicate properly the good news or it deals only with liturgy, expression of faith within a culture. He demonstrates that inculturation relates to the transformation of the whole person within his/her culture, in his/her innermost being.

2. The local church is the matrix of the inculturation process.

The local church is the matrix of the inculturation process, the setting of transformation of people and values and the setting of appropriation of new values that have emerged from this process. According to Bate, the local church is not necessarily the diocese nor the particular Church in the Catholic terminology. It is a grouping of Christians celebrating Eucharist, holding a mass in a place. It may be a parish led by a priest. In this respect, the Church is fully present in the local church.

3. The nature of the Church and her praxis are not separable.

The very nature of the Church marked by the four notes: One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic, is triumphantly coupled with the goals expressed through martyria, diakonia, leiturgia, and kerygma, and through ministries and institutions. He underlines that ministries, institutions and religious orders are just tools of the Church. They must serve
the Church and live for the Church. Thus, Mission includes these goals and must be done by the local church within the receiving culture.

4. Ministries and institutions are daily tools of the Church for salvation.

In Bate's ecclesiology, salvation includes forgiveness and healing - physical, spiritual, emotional and social. In bringing salvation to people, these ministries and institutions aim at humanising them within their culture. Humanisation is complete when new Christian values within the culture have emerged and are adopted by the new community of faith.

5. The whole Church is involved in Mission.

The clergy is the leading group in missionary work. They have a key role at every worship service to communicate missionary consciousness to the People of God and to get them actually involved in Mission. According to Bate, every worship service (or mass) is an opportunity to do Mission and to urge for Mission. In other words, Mission takes place during every worship service, in the daily life of the Church, involving every member.

3.4.3. Donovan's Ecclesiology

Donovan is a catholic priest from the United States. He is above all known as a theologian interested in church and Mission. He has served for seventeen years as Missionary in Tanzania, among the Masai people. His experience among this people has lead him to question the present model of Mission in catholic circles, and to some extent

---

the ecclesiology of the Roman Catholic Church. He calls out the church concerning the task before her.

3.4.3.1. Donovan’s criticism of western Mission

Donovan firmly criticises the model of Mission that he has known in Tanzania:

- After a hundred years of missionary work, foreign missionaries are still on the mission field (1993: 36). Many congregations such as “the Holy Ghost Fathers and the White Fathers were well established in East Africa, but it is doubtful if the Church was”, he says (1993: 9). They did not intend to leave their compounds. According to Donovan, the idea of the mission compound has been one of the most static and paralysing ideas in the history of Christianity (1993: 100). The indigenous church cannot grow up properly alongside the Mission agency, and vis-à-vis the Mission compound.

- In the light of Scripture, missionary work has failed in East Africa. Donovan describes the evolution of missionary work in that part of Africa as follows: the missionary work started when Mission agencies bought slaves and christianised them. Later when the slave trade ended, they built schools with the funds sent by Propaganda Fide from Rome, assuming that they could have a new form of apostolate through catechism that would be taught in those schools. The third phase of the history of missionary work in East Africa was characterised by a new definition of missionary work. Now it was understood as aid to developing countries. “A new breed of missionaries [emerged] and appeared –behind the plough, laying pipes, digging wells…–a kind of ecclesiastical peace corps” (1993: 12). Donovan stresses then that from the beginning
of missionary work, conversion was out of the question. The Gospel of salvation was not on the agenda. He concludes his description as follows:

"There is no mistaking the fact that Missionary work is in a shamble. Born in slavery, disoriented by the school system, startled by independence, and smothered in nation building—Mission in East Africa has never had the chance to be true to itself" [Donovan 1993: 12]

Mission agencies have produced African churches that are merely carbon copies of western churches. These new churches incorporate "the western church's worst habits" and still wear a European face (1993: 177). A number of African church leaders repeat exactly what they have learned from missionaries in order to be respectable and to keep on receiving financial support from them (1993: 177). In West Africa, most African priests of the first generation of indigenous leaders speak their mother language with an American accent, simply for credibility and respectability towards Mission agencies. In this respect, the African church is perpetuating the former paradigm. She risks to commit again the same mistakes as the Mission did in the past.

As a result, the model of mission has established unadapted Christianity in Africa, and has planted churches that are made up of subservient and dependent people (1993: 9), existing alongside Mission agencies.
3.4.3.2. Donovan’s perception of Mission and church

Donovan’s struggle consists in bringing missionaries and Mission agencies back to Scripture in order to get them impregnated with a Biblical concept of Mission. He often refers to Paul’s model. In this perspective, he reminds them of the following considerations:

- **Evangelisation** is a process of bringing the Gospel to people where they are. Therefore, instead of staying in a Mission compound, missionaries are urged to move towards the people they must reach with the Gospel. It is a centrifugal task rather than a centripetal one.

- **Salvation** is a continuous and unbroken process, rather than a celebration of sacraments and church membership. Goodness and holiness are the beginning of salvation.

- **Distinction** between missionary work and pastoral work must be clearly made. Missionary work is finishable (in a particular area) while pastoral care is continuous and must be included in the African priest’s ministry.

- **Missionary work** aims to establish indigenous churches. The missionary must not stay one day longer than it is necessary (1993: 130). In this respect, Donovan refers to Paul’s model of Mission:

  “He [Paul] was the Mission—he and his companions—a mobile Mission, a temporary Mission in any one place, a team in motion and a movement towards the establishment, not of a Mission, but of an indigenous church, resulting as a response to his preaching of the Gospel.” [Donovan 1993: 10]
Missionary work must include literation since the People of God have to appropriate the Word, graphically.

A missionary is essentially a social martyr, cut off from his roots, destined to walk for ever. He is a stranger in a strange land.

The church is essentially missionary. Donovan explains this in the following terms:

"Mission is the meaning of the church. The church can exist only insofar as it is in Mission, insofar as it participates in the act of Christ, which is Mission. The church becomes the Mission, the living outreach of God to the world... The idea of church without Mission is an absurdity" [Hoekendijk quoted by Donovan 1993: 102]

He adds that the authentic church must be "apostolic" in the sense that she has "to witness to the same Jesus the apostles witnessed to" (1993: 67).

The church is a community of believers, much more than an institution, a community of priests "in the true sense of the word" (1993: 90). The priest, in the classical concept, is "a ministerial priest" as a servant and a sign of the unity of that community.

3.4.3.3. Personal Evaluation of Donovan’s views

Donovan’s approach is quite different from Dulles’ and Bate’s. In analysing and criticising the mechanism and system of current Missionary work, in a constructive way, he leads theologians, and to some extent church and Mission leaders, to a new paradigm of Mission and new perspectives for the church.
Donovan's reflections are strongly grounded on the teachings of the New Testament, especially on Paul's teachings and missionary experiences. For him, it is really necessary to re-read Scripture in order to revitalise the Church. This implies that the Church must get rid of some habits and traditions, but also some non biblical teachings although they are foundational in the Roman Catholic Church. In this respect, Donovan distances himself from declarations of Vatican Council II on the Church. He particularly denounces:

- **Sacramentalism**: He stresses that the proclamation of the Gospel to every culture is more important than any of the seven sacraments. It is prior to them as faith is prior to baptism. This means that the priest should not be imprisoned within liturgical and sacramental work. His first role is to proclaim the Gospel within the Church and beyond.

- **Clericalism**: It is an obstacle to the development of the community which is based on the "priesthood of all believers". Donovan notes that Catholics stress the first part of the phrase – priesthood - while Protestants emphasise the second part – believers. The former insists on the sacramental dimension of the Church, embodied by the priest whereas the latter is interested only in the faith dimension. The balance between the two dimensions helps the Church avoid clericalism and urges all believers to get involved in missionary work.

- **West-oriented African Church**: For many African Churches, the Church in the West was the model to follow. In fact, there was no alternative for them. They have rarely seen other models – for instance from Latin America or Asia – since they have always
been with Western Mission agencies. They have acquired some of the “worst qualities of those Churches: becoming static, satisfied, in-turned, immobile …” (1993: 179). These Churches will not be true Churches in Africa until “they clothe the soul of Christianity with the flesh and blood of Africa” (1993: 176). Here, Donovan joins Bate in his conception of the local church.

We conclude that Donovan makes us understand the necessity of a new ecclesiology that must give birth to a new missiology, as a theological discourse on Mission, and a new model of mission as a precious instrument of God to proclaim the Gospel to all nations, to communicate and inculcate Christian values in society, which should shape the African civilisation within globalisation. It is only at this cost that Africa may overtake the West in terms of Christianisation of society.

These three theologians may contribute significantly to the elaboration of an African ecclesiology which is based on Biblical Revelation, rooted in African cultures and which seeks to meet African needs at the spiritual, emotional, social and political levels. Dulles helps establish links between the being of the Church, through the five models, and her tasks in society. Bate, for his part, develops the concept of inculturation as a fundamental dimension of Mission, and the concept of local church as the matrix for inculturation to which all members are involved. Donovan’s contribution is missiological. He demonstrates that classical missiology is out-of-date and needs to revisited in the light of Scripture. He urges the Roman Catholic Church to come back to Scripture and elaborate a new ecclesiology that aims at reaching people for God.
These theologians are opening new possibilities for reflection on Mission and Church.
Chapter Four

AFRICAN ECCLESIOLOGY

Introduction

The two previous chapters give to us the landscape of Missions working in most countries in Africa, especially in French speaking countries such as Côte d'Ivoire, Gabon and Madagascar, and the landscape of churches. The former is the result of a missiology born in the nineteenth century and based on a western perception of Africa whereas the latter shows that most denominations have ecclesiologies without any missiological dimension. The present chapter seeks to elaborate a new ecclesiology which should be both biblically based and culturally rooted and which would be able to articulate the thought of God on the Church and her mandate in present times. This ecclesiology must answer the questions that we have raised in previous chapters and must respond to the needs of Churches and society in Africa today.

4.1 Theology and Missiology

As we have previously seen, there are, in many parts of Africa, two independent entities in the Mission field: the Church with her organisations and national leaders, and the Mission with its philosophy and missionaries. Most evangelical Churches and Faith Missions are still in this configuration after more than a century of missionary work. The situation in
the Roman Catholic Church is somewhat similar since in many places, the Mission agencies or congregations appear to be independent from the local church—the diocese, although they are constantly urged to be loyal to the bishop.

It is true that, in a few denominations, the Church has developed Mission consciousness. She has created a mission department and prepares to send missionaries. She needs however to develop a clear theology of Mission in order to avoid the risk of perpetuating the current model which has failed, as we have demonstrated previously. On the other hand, a number of Mission agencies have integrated with indigenous churches, their missionaries are now accountable to the church authorities. Those Mission agencies adopted the policy of integration recommended by the WCC Assembly in New Delhi in 1961. However, these missionaries have lost their initial vision of Mission—the passion for church planting, and for reaching the unreached peoples. They are now simply technicians, assisting the Church. As a result, many peoples remain neglected, many ethnic groups in Africa have no contact with the gospel and Christian values.

We notice that theology and missiology, as independent discourses, look like two lines that never meet. The current theology, namely ecclesiology, has produced the model of church that we have described previously whereas the current missiology has given birth to the current model of mission. In other words, theologians have a limited concern for mission while missiologists wonder whether theology is relevant for the Church and for the extension of the Kingdom.

This is the case of ECWA in Nigeria with EMS as missionary organisation.
In some theological arenas, no serious and profound reflection on Mission has been made since the Reformation. Most theological debates have revolved around Revelation, the Cross, the Church and the Second Coming of Jesus Christ. Very few confessions of faith have devoted articles to Mission and on the tasks of the Church in the world. The question is to know why the subject of Mission has been so neglected or absent from debates for centuries. This can be explained by the origin of theology. We may consider Origen the father, or forefather, of western theology. He used the Greek philosophy to understand and to express Christian faith. For him, Christianity is the true philosophy and the Christian is a philosopher. He examines the knowledge of the universe in the light of Christ, the Logos. Augustine, Thomas Aquinas and Calvin followed Origen’s footprint in their theological approaches and reflections.

We know that Hellenic philosophy is basically metaphysical and ontological. Therefore, it cannot help western theology to consider practical and ethical dimensions of biblical revelation in its research and reflections. The example of Calvin speaks clearly to us in this perspective. Calvin’s theology is basically biblical in the sense that its main content is the Word of God. But in his formulation, he is strongly influenced by Hellenic reasoning.

---

Footnotes:

30 CEVAA which took over SMEP and CWM which took over LMS
31 We may mention the best known in history: Confession of Augsburg (1530), the Confession of Westminster (1545-1546), Confessio Helvetia Posterior (1566), and The Thirty Nine Articles of the Church of England (1571). None of these confessions has an article on the Mission of the Church in the world.
32 It is worthwhile to note that all Christological debates from 325 in Nicea to 451 in Chalcedone are basically ontological.
and way of thinking. He deals more easily with ideas, dogmas and doctrines than with facts, ethics and Mission.

On the other hand, missiology which is a recent science, claims to be independent and to be broader than theology. It is perceived by a few missiologists as a science including a number of disciplines. According to Schleiermacher whom Verkuyl quoted, missiology is included in practical theology dealing with ethics, cultural responsibility and the notion of Mission. For Kuyper, missiology must be perceived as a didactic discipline. Bavinck suggests that missiology be considered as a diaconological discipline (Verkuyl 1978: 7). It is then clear that few theologians consider missiology as a real discourse with the same status as Christology or Pneumatology.

The independence of missiology vis-à-vis theology can also be explained as a new approach in the Enlightenment context from the seventeenth to nineteenth centuries. During that period, the Church was criticised by free thinkers and was considered as an obstacle to knowledge. The history of Galileo may justify the negative disposition of free thinkers and scholars towards the Church. Moreover, a significant number of theologians and church leaders were influenced by liberal theology. The missionary movement was born in that context. Its goal was to create new churches. Thus Christian missionary societies were created. From a theological perspective, those missionary societies had no ecclesiology. They had rather "missiology" that was interested in anthropology, strategies and missionary activities rather than in the theology of the Church.
Nowadays, this situation of separating theology from missiology is well illustrated by the curriculum of some theological institutions. In theological seminaries, missiology is included in practical disciplines. In others, the School of Mission exists alongside the School of Theology\textsuperscript{33}. This means that theological schools produce theologians without missionary vision and schools of Mission produce missionaries and missiologists without solid theological foundations.

4.1.1. Theology

It is crucial for us to come back to the definition of theology. The definition suggested by Tiénou seems to be appropriate. He says that, "theology is the reasoned statement of biblical revelation, in specific places and specific times, which makes possible the transmission of the Christian faith to future generations" (1990: 12). He adds that theology may be compared to the melody of a song, to which revelation provides the words. In this respect, theology is a human discourse that aims at articulating in specific places and specific times the Word of God in order to make God's thought known to people. Biblical revelation must constitute the substratum of this discourse.

To this definition we can add Barth's for whom theology is faith in search of understanding. It is a highly intellectual quest for truth. Barth emphasises here the scientific feature of theology, characterised by rigorous analysis, reliable results and

\textsuperscript{33} We may mention among others Fuller Theological Seminary in Pasadena, California, USA. This institution has two separate schools --the School of Theology and the School of Word Mission. In England, it is known that London Bible College produces pastors and theologians and All Nations Christian College produces missionaries.
coherent declarations.

These definitions have the following implications:

- One of the tasks of theology is to communicate properly the biblical revelation to future generations and to help the hearers of the gospel appropriate the Word of God. The illustration of melody in the definition denotes the artistic feature of theology. It means that theology must facilitate the appropriation of the gospel by hearers. Shenk affirms that “the task of theology is to faithfully translate the meaning of the biblical faith into the language of a particular age and particular people... to interpret and to clarify the proclamation” (Shenk 1973: 297). Fashole-Luke gives more precision in saying that African Christian theologies have the task “to translate the one faith of Jesus Christ to suit the tongue, style, genius, character and culture of African peoples” (Fashole-Luke 1974: 135-149). The missiological goal of theology is clearly stated here.

- Theology is elaborated in specific places and specific times. Therefore, it must take into account the contexts in which it is conceived and takes form. Hence, the more the contexts are seriously considered, the better theology articulates properly the Word of God and communicates it efficiently to people. In this task of articulation and communication, theology needs the assistance of Humanities such as Anthropology, Sociology and History. These sciences help it know the contexts and especially the culture. To communicate efficiently the Word of God means to cast the Word of God into the culture so that the targeted people appropriate it and live with
Theology is necessarily influenced and affected by the contexts. It must adopt the language, the world view and the reasoning used in the context. Therefore, it will be neither definitive nor universal. It is constantly provisional and dynamically inculturated. This provisional character makes it humble, and inculturation makes it efficient in its goal.

Theology is a tool for the Church to accomplish her tasks and to fulfill her mandate in the world, until the Lord comes again.

Theology has also the role to shape the mind of theologians and Christians. Inculturation in theology must lead to the making of a new mind in theologians and Christians.

4.1.2. Missiology

As we have already said, missiology is, in its strict meaning, a discourse on Mission\(^{\text{34}}\). In this respect, the definition of theology can be applied to missiology. Therefore, we can define missiology as a theological discourse, a reasoned statement on Mission. Its first task is to find in biblical revelation all data on Mission. It is an intellectual quest for biblical truth on Mission. These data must constitute the substratum of missiological discourse. Being a

\(^{\text{34}}\) For some missiologists, this definition would better fit with theology of Mission rather with missiology. In this thesis, we deal mainly with missiology as a discourse.
theological enterprise, it needs the contribution of Humanities as any theological discipline does. It particularly needs the contribution of Sociology, Cultural Anthropology and Science of Religion. We agree that missiology includes various branches such as history of Mission, method and strategies of Mission, and missionary activities. Some of these branches are included in practical theology and others in Church history. Therefore, we may affirm that missiology is firstly a scientific discourse. It has the same status as any other theological discipline.

These definitions may lead us to state that theology and missiology are not two lines that never meet but concentric circles, the bigger circle represents theology, as a global discourse including various chapters, the smaller circle represents missiology, as a discourse on Mission. This must not mislead us to assume that missiology is less important than theology, or that missiology is minimised. This simply means that missiology is basically a theological discourse focused on Mission. It must be the starting point for any theological enterprise and must be at the heart of any theological reflection.

4.2. Ecclesiology and missiology

We propose the following diagram N°1 to illustrate the status of missiology vis-à-vis theological doctrines.
The diagram shows that ecclesiology has two dimensions: the ontological dimension which deals with identity and the functional dimension which addresses the issues of the daily life of the Church. In her daily life, the Church responds to God’s call, and accomplishes faithfully and progressively her mandate, through her offices.

As a theological discipline, ecclesiology also has two steps in its tasks: collecting all the data on the Church in the biblical Revelation, and formulating these data in such a way that the thought of God on Church may be properly articulated, exposed, and transmitted to the People of God.

At the exegetical step, a new approach is needed since the classical (western) exegesis highly influenced by Greek categories and philosophy was not able to find out all data on Church and Mission in the biblical revelation. Its approach was mainly ontological and metaphysical. Shenk (1973:298) gives us a good illustration for this issue. The Sermon on
the Mount related in Matthew 5 to 7 might be considered as a starting point of Christianity in terms of teaching. He says: **"The Sermon on the Mount announces a new code of conduct without making explicit appeal to a certain set of beliefs. The overall thrust of the Sermon on the Mount is ethical"** (298). In his first preaching, Jesus was mainly concerned about ethics rather than doctrine or dogma. We may affirm that his approach was rather functional, because Jesus focused his teaching mainly on “how his disciples should act and live in society.” To some extent, the classical exegesis helped us to know what the Church is, and not what action the Church is called to.

At the formulation step, we propose two dimensions: the dimension of identity and the dimension of life of the Church. The dimension of identity deals with the status of the Church, her essence, her nature in the African context, and her constituency. It answers the question “What is the Church?” and “where is the Church?”. Since the era of creeds in the fourth century, these questions have been sufficiently answered. The present situation in the world and especially in Africa urges us to consider seriously the identity of the Church. We are not saying that the identity of the Church has changed since the fourth century and that we have now and here to give her a new one. This identity is the same from the birth of the Church to the consummation of ages, when the Church becomes fully the Kingdom of God. But we have to express it in a convenient language in the present socio-cultural context. This context is characterised by the following factors:

- The coming of the western model of democracy that encourages free initiatives in various areas of life, freedom to speak and to express one’s political opinion. One of
the direct fruits of democracy in Africa is surely the proliferation of new independent churches. Creating new churches is relatively easy. This imported democracy has influenced most denominations in a positive or negative way.

- The coming of post-modernism in the world and especially in Africa. Subjectivism and pluralism have been taking over rationalism and unity. The search for emotions and experiences has been taking over the search for objective truth and pure reason.

- Globalisation not only with its economic perspectives but also with its impact on the social structures. Without sustained and permanent efforts for producing new ideas, Africa will be marginalised by society and may become a ghetto in the global village.

The dimension of life deals with her raison d'etre. It answers the question “for what the Church lives.” This question has hardly been considered in most theological debates. Yet, it is of the greatest importance. Since the nineteen sixties, debates have been revolving around evangelisation and social actions as the main tasks of the Church. But they seemed rather like a false problem because we cannot justify why Christians in Africa had to choose either evangelisation or social actions. Those debates could at best confirm “the debilitating polarisation” between evangelicals and ecumenicals, as Saayman (1998: 1) puts it so rightly. The real problem in the African context is rather the insignificant impact of the Gospel on society. It is widely known that Christianity in Africa is growing fast, especially in urban areas. But this growth should be accompanied by significant impact on personal lives as well as on public life. Christianity has to transform life in Africa and
abroad, and to build a new civilisation that may ensure the well-being of peoples in Africa and in the world. We propose that the reflections on the raison d'être of the Church be made on ecclesiological terrain.

We conclude for this part that the identity of the Church is inseparable from her life and that her life is basically turned towards Mission.

We would propose three main chapters for ecclesiology:

- The identity of the Church:
- The three offices of the Church
- The double mandate of the Church

These chapters are tightly linked to each other, since they form a theological discourse. If the identity of the Church is not clearly defined, she cannot faithfully ensure her offices. On the other hand, she fulfils her mandate through her offices. This means that ecclesiology must be both ontological and functional.

4. 3. The Church

4.3.1. Identity:

4.3.1.1. Essence:

Classical ecclesiologies, inherited from ecclesiological debates in the fourth and fifth centuries, affirm the four marks of the true Church: Unity, holiness, catholicity and apostolicity. These marks serve to identify the Church. But the meaning of each mark
varies according to denominations. There is however a consensus that the Church does not possess these four marks once for all. She must rather nurture them continually. For instance, the Church has to tend to visible unity. She is holy in her essence but, she must tend to the fullness of holiness. She is catholic and apostolic in her essence but she must strive to be catholic and apostolic.

We must add that the goal of ecclesiology is not only to express the real and authentic identity of the Church, but also to demonstrate the relation between the identity and the tasks of the Church in the world. It is then necessary for us to understand that the four classical marks are foundational for the tasks of the Church in the world.

- Unity is fully the work of the Holy Spirit. But the People of God, and especially Church leaders, must work towards it. They have to make it visible “so that the world may believe that God has sent Jesus” (John 17:21). According to John, the credibility and the impact of mission lay in unity. Unity must be visible at any level of the life of the Church, especially at the local church level. The local church is made up of people from various backgrounds: racial, ethnic, social and denominational. She has members with various status --pastors, deacons, missionaries, lay people, para-church movement leaders. Each member has to be loyal to the local church, whatever his/her social status, or denominational background is, and to develop Christian fellowship. The local church provides the setting in which unity between members is developed and is well expressed. Uzukwu (1996: 66-69) compares the Church to the family in the African concept. The family is the best expression of unity in African
context. A family is unified by the same blood and the Church is unified by the blood of Jesus Christ. The main value in the family concept is relatedness. The Church-family is therefore characterised by solid relationships between her members, grounded on the work of Christ. Then she must build bridges across races and nations. Uzukwu presents the role of the Church in the perspectives of unity among her members and in the world, as follows:

"...If the nature and the Mission of the church-family are understood in terms of relatedness, as building bridges across races and nations, as a true "ministry of reconciliation", the relationship or communion between the churches of Africa and the West assumes new dimensions in order to defend the weak and create a new world order". [Uzukwu 1996: 73]

Uzukwu makes us understand that the unity of the Church is not only a matter of identity expressed among Christians but also a matter of Mission. She goes to the world and plays a key role in the process of reconciliation where peoples are divided because of race, tribe or political point of view. In doing so she prepares for an alternative society, a new world order.

Visible unity, between local churches and with other Christian structures such as denominations or para-church organisations in a region and beyond, must be permanently expressed since it is a requirement of Missio Dei. The Mission is God's because He targets the whole world, He is the main actor and the Church is the instrument.

- Holiness is the main distinctive sign of the Church in the world. She is unique because she is holy. In her nature, she is fundamentally different from any other institution in
the sense that she is holy and strives to be fully holy for the glory of God. Her holiness must be perceived as a sign of the holiness of God and must show that she belongs exclusively to Him. Hence, the world “sees” the holiness of God through the holiness of the Church and her members. It is of the greatest importance that holiness deals not only with good morality. It does not mean that the Church is totally free from sins. The holy Church is not a group of clean people, with a high standard of morality. She is a communion of people justified in Christ. She celebrates this justification in her daily life, through liturgy and celebration of sacraments, which remind people of the sacrifice made once for all by the Holy One, dead on the cross. It is then important to understand that the Church is holy because of the work of God and she expresses her holiness in celebrating justification. However, holiness should not lead to self-justification or self-satisfaction. It requires from the Church, which is a communion of believers, biblical ethics experienced in culture and communicated to the hearers of the Gospel. In other words, holiness implies struggles for ethics. As we saw previously, holiness is a mark to identify the Church, ethics rather should be understood as a set of values that she must demonstrate and communicate. She must prove through ethics based on holiness that an alternative society is possible and that she is able to change society. The missionary perspective of the Church is demonstrated here through her holiness.

- Catholicity, the third mark of the Church, refers to the presence of the Church everywhere, among all nations, in every culture and civilisation. This is possible only through pluralism. The Church, in her essence, is the same everywhere but she is
culturally different from place to place. We borrow from Kün the phrase "essence and face" to make the difference between the Universal Church and the local or national Church (Kün 1990: 11-24). The essence is the same everywhere but the face changes from place to place. In other words, the face is the local church inculturated in a place, living in society and among people to whom she brings the gospel and communicates Christian values. Catholicity is only possible in respect to the face of the Church.

- Apostolicity, as the fourth mark, helps the present Church to be rooted historically and theologically in the apostolic teachings and traditions. But the main characteristic of apostolicity is witness. For the New Testament, an apostle is an eyewitness of the resurrection of Jesus. He exposed "to the end of the earth" the truth whatever the cost is. It is vital for the Church to affirm that on the one hand, she is rooted in the teaching and traditions of the apostles, and on the other she must go to the end of the earth to embody the gospel. The missiological dimension of the Church is expressed also by this fourth mark.

By its essence, the Church at any level has the four marks of the true Church since she is not a human-made institution or organisation. She was built by the Lord (Matt 16:18). But in her praxis, she is not perfectly one, fully holy, entirely catholic and faithfully apostolic since she is made up of men and women who are not perfect. However she is

35 Kün uses the words essence and face to explain that the Catholic Church has the same essence, but her face may change throughout history. We rather apply the image of face to the local church.
really conscious of the fact that the four marks must be reached and that she has to fight her imperfection. She is willing to live fully the identity that the Lord gave to her and to reach the status of Kingdom of God. She continues her march to the Kingdom and is experiencing the dynamics produced by the tension between “already” and “not-yet.” She is already the Church of Christ in spite of her imperfection but she is not yet fully the Kingdom. The better she faithfully tends to walk towards the four marks, the better she can accomplish her mandate in the world.

We attempted to demonstrate that the ontology of the Church cannot be separated from her functions, and that the mandate of the Church must rest on a solid and clear ontology.

4.3.1.2. The constituency:

- *Imago Dei* in culture: each member of the Church has been transformed by the power of the Gospel within his/her culture. This transformation produced by the gospel is both punctual and progressive since it has a starting point and is at the same time a process within the culture. The transformation makes the Christian an icon of God in the sense that in meeting him or her, the society “sees” God, or has certain knowledge of Him. It is thus obvious that the status of the transformed man or woman is in some way for mission purposes.

- Pastors and lay people: all members of the Church are concerned about her life. They have the same status vis-à-vis God. They are all accountable to Him, especially with
regard to the effort to tend to the four marks, but also to the tasks of the Church in the world. It is however important to point out that Pastors although they have the same status as the other members, are in charge of the ministry. Here, we have to affirm the difference between the priesthood of all believers and the ministry of Pastors (or leaders). It is true that Scripture does not give any clear indications concerning the two groups of members: all believers in universal priesthood and pastors in ministries. Scripture proposes no Church order. Orders and organisations that the Church has had since the early era of Christianity, have been generally inspired from the Roman model of organisation.

We must stress that the members of the Church are concerned about the identity of the Church. Each one of them is called to develop unity and to build a true fellowship within the local church. He/she is called to be holy, to participate in church life so that she can demonstrate and experience catholicity and apostolicity. But each Christian has his/her degree of involvement in the church life, according to his/her maturity. Therefore, the Church has not once for all the four marks of the true Church.

4.3.2. Offices:

The Church has three offices in her daily life:

4.3.2.1. Prophetic office: The communication of truth within the Church and in the world is at the core of her daily life. This communication has two main aspects:

a) She preaches to society the gospel with power and authority. Jesus Christ is at the heart of the gospel. Her preaching must touch the heart and the conscience
of hearers, and must require responses from them\textsuperscript{36}.

b) She communicates to society Christian values that should be embodied in cultures. Jesus Christ presented the main Christian values\textsuperscript{37} in his Sermon on the Mount (Matt 5 to 7). These values must be exposed to society and inculturated in order that Christians and non Christians may appropriate them.

The prophetic voice of the Church should be heard further and further to the end of the earth. We must add that the prophetic office of the Church is grounded on her identity, and especially on her apostolicity. The Church cannot safeguard her prophetic office adequately if she is not apostolic.

4.3.2.2. Sacerdotal office: Following Jesus' footprint, the Church represents the nations before God, speaks for them and prays for them. She fulfils her sacerdotal role through liturgy and sacraments within the sanctuary but also in meeting people where they are. She has to reconcile them with themselves and with God. Liturgy aims at celebrating faith and proclaiming God's glory, but it is also an opportunity to meet with people who come to Church with specific needs or questions that society cannot answer. Bate considers liturgy as a privileged opportunity for the Church to ensure the sacerdotal office and to serve people. Liturgy may be held and organised outside the sanctuary, where people are, with a simplified form but the same goals.

\textsuperscript{36} We agree with the Reformers and their followers who distinguish preaching from any other presentation of the gospel, such as Bible expositions, Bible studies and devotions. Preaching the Word is the Word of God.

\textsuperscript{37} We can note some Christian values that we find in that sermon: integrity, compassion for the poor, holiness of marriage, chastity, monogamy, opposition to divorce etc.
The sacerdotal office that the Church has to provide is grounded in holiness. Only the Church which strives to be holy and to march to holiness can speak for the people, Christians and non-Christians, before God. Therefore, holiness is inseparable from priesthood.

- Servanthood office: The Church must be a servant of humanity just as Jesus was during his life on earth. But in serving humanity, she serves the Lord. The servanthood office requires that the Church be with the people that she serves. She has to share with them their concerns and struggles. His leaders and members live among peoples as they are in the world but not from the world (John 17:15-17). The presence of the Church in the world as servant must improve the life of people, socially, politically and spiritually.

Indeed, the three offices are assured through the daily life of the Church when she gathers as an assembly of believers, and when her members are scattered as individuals witnessing in society. The world must see that she is a prophet speaking from God to people, a priest speaking for people to God and a servant of God living among people.

We may point out that these three offices lead the Church to her mandate. They do not constitute a goal for the Church, instead they are the means that the Church uses to fulfil her mandate.
4.3.3. The mandate of the Church

The Church, as a community of believers, bearing in each one of her members the image of God, has a mandate to accomplish that God has assigned to her. This mandate is determined by the tasks to accomplish, the place where they must be accomplished and the time in which they must be accomplished. At the end of her mandate, the Church must report to the Lord to whom she belongs. We propose a twofold mandate.

- The first mandate was given to humankind when the work of creation was achieved.

   We read it in Genesis 1: 26:

   God said, “Let us make man in our image, in our likeness, and let them rule over the fish of the sea and the birds of the air, over the livestock, over all the earth, and over all the creatures that move along the ground.”

The Creator mandated the first couple, who represented humankind, to rule over all the creatures, that is to take care of His creation. We find here the start of a biblical anthropology that we have to consider in this study. The man associated with the woman, created in the image of God, is able to take charge of the maintenance and preservation of creation. The question is now to know whether this assignment is still valid or not, and whether it can be applied to the Church today. There is no indication in Scripture stating that this assignment is no longer valid. But because of sin that occurred in the history of humankind, described in Genesis 3, the image of God in human beings was altered. Therefore, he/she could no longer ensure faithfully the task assigned to him/her at
creation. We suggest that this assignment remains valid but it is transferred to the Church, which is the community of believers who bring in them the restored image of God. However, the Church is not the only agent in the maintenance and preservation of creation, she is the vanguard.

The first mandate urges the Church to commit herself to promoting the well being of society. Through her members, she must be actively present in society and shine so that society can see in her the presence of God. Our pluralistic society needs not only to hear of God but also to see and to experience His presence.

- The second mandate of the Church is found in Matthew 28:18:

> Then Jesus came to them and said, “All authority in heaven and on earth has been given to me. Therefore go and make disciples of all nations, baptising them in the name of the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit, and teaching them to obey everything I have commanded to you. And surely I am with you, to the very end of the age.”

We may read the second mandate in other parts of the gospels. We choose the formulation in Matthew 28 because it appears to us to be the most complete. Since we deal here with a mandate, we must pay attention to the actions that the Church must undertake. Therefore we have to consider seriously the three important verbs in this command: μαθητευσατε, βαπτιζοντες and διδασκοντες.

Μαθητευσατε is the main verb and thus the most important action. It refers to the
main task of the Church, that is to make disciples, or to make Christians. Jesus’ followers were called disciples until the event of first sending of missionaries to nations (Acts 13). It is true that conversion is the work of the Holy Spirit but the Church plays a key role in this. We come to conclude here that evangelisation is at the core of the mandate of the Church.

The goal of evangelisation is humanisation, that is restoration of the altered image of God in sinful man/woman. In her task of evangelising, the Church brings the gospel of grace that restores human dignity, and enhances human status vis-à-vis God. The man/woman in Christ becomes true human being, his/her mind is transformed, his/her ethics corrected, his/her role in society recovered. He/she becomes a person with a message for nations. This message is communicated through his/her verbal testimony and through his/her active presence in society. In other words, an evangelised person becomes a potential missionary. We add that evangelisation makes us understand that a human being is object of God’s love, he/she is the high priority of God in His project for the world and for the Kingdom.

The action of μαθητευείν implies βαπτίζειν and διδάσκειν. This means that those who become Christians must be baptised and taught. The verb βαπτίζειν shows the sacramental dimension of the mandate of the Church, while the verb διδάσκειν affirms the teaching role of the Church. We point out that as the last two verbs are in present participle form, they suggest that baptising and teaching are permanent actions in the life of Christians.

38 The equivalent of the great can be found in Mark 16.15.
Those who become Christians, when God has touched them through preaching, must be baptised and be considered full members of the Church. It is not our intention to enter the debates on the meaning of baptism, or on the theological value of sacraments. We would like simply to affirm that sacraments such as baptism are not separable from the mandate of the Church.

Those who become Christians must also be taught so that they can be spiritually and intellectually mature. The Church aims at equipping them with the knowledge of God and at helping them live correctly in modern society so that they may become instruments of evangelisation and potential missionaries.

We would like to suggest that the teaching role of the Church goes beyond the local church, that it is directed also to non-Christians. Πάντα τὰ εἴδη includes all ethnic groups, which are made up of Christians and non-Christians. In this sense, the second mandate consists also in giving instructions to society, communicating new values to society. From our understanding, the phrase οσα εντελωμην ομι (what I have ordered you) refers to the instructions and values that Jesus presented during His ministry and that He entrusted to His disciples. We can consider that His inaugural preaching on the Mount in Matthew 5,6 and 7 gave the keynote to these values. We then conclude that all ethnic groups may not become Christian but they can integrate Christian values that must be rooted in their culture and have impact in their life, and civilisation. We learn
from history that Christianity of modern times has modelled the present western society in the sense that Christian values have been inculturated in the West although secularisation and post-modernism have taken over modernism.

We may represent the twofold mandate of the Church by three concentric circles. The smaller circle represents the evangelisation that proclaims the person of Jesus Christ, the medium circle represents the communication of Christian values, and the largest circle represents the active presence of the Church.

---

**Diagram N°2**

---

4.4. **Theology of Local church**

4.4.1. **Ontological dimension of the local church**

The local church is a real representation of the Universal Church in a given space and time, and in a particular context. In this perspective, we question the validity of the theology that juxtaposes the Universal Church with the local church, the invisible Church with the visible Church, and the perfect Church with the imperfect Church.
In this perspective, the local church appropriates what God has promised to the Universal Church. She received from Him the command to proclaim the gospel, to teach and to baptise (Matt 28:19). She has the authority “to bind and to loose” on earth (Matt 16:19; 18:18). God grants her spiritual gifts, and human and financial resources. This means that, wherever a local church is planted, the Universal Church is really present and God is in action to extend His Kingdom through this Church.

The local church is the sign of God’s presence in a particular place, in society. It is however important to underline that God’s presence is not conditioned by the presence of a local church. God as the Creator of the universe transcends time and space, and is present everywhere. As a sign of God, the Church indicates to people where He is but she does not ‘bring’ Him to that place.

The local church is basically human, since she is made up of redeemed people who are indeed not perfect. She is struggling to please God in her daily life. She is called to reach the four marks of the Church, which are unity, holiness, catholicity and apostolicity. She is moving toward the Kingdom in the power of the Spirit.

The local church as the People of God in a given context gathers around the sanctuary the clergy, missionaries from abroad, para-church movement workers and lay Christians from various backgrounds. They have the same status before God although they are granted various charismata and expertise and are called for various ministries. They are members of the same local church and are assigned to serve Her.
In this perspective, the local church appears to be a crossroad for institutions, para-
church organisations, mission agencies and religious orders. Their workers or missionaries
sent by these respective organisations are accountable first to the Church and must be
loyal to her since they are fully members of that local church.

4.4.2. Missiological dimension of the local church

4.4.2.1. The local church as a matrix for inculturation—Internal tasks of the Church.

Inculturation is a process for the message and the messengers to enter the local
culture. The messengers must have the willingness first to leave their own culture,
that is to accept to be culturally mutilated. Then they have to know and to adopt
the way of thinking, to understand the worldview and specifically the concept of
human being, and to discover the needs in this culture. These needs may be social
justice, healing, peace, reconciliation, liberation from spiritual slavery or from
psychological bondage in relation with witchcraft practices, they need also daily
bread or forgiveness. From these needs, the following themes must be seriously
addressed in the message, especially in African cultures:

- Healing: It seems to be one of the most important themes to deal with. In some
cultural contexts, people go to church to be healed. As Saayman (2001) says, many
people become Christian because they are healed in the church. Sickness may be
understood as a result of dysfunctional relationships with ancestors, relatives
especially old persons or simply with nature. In this sense, healing must be
understood as a restoration of broken relationships. But whatever the interpretation of sickness, the gospel brings healing.

- Poverty: It may be perceived in some cultures as a result of a curse, linked to identity rather than as a result of a bad economic system. This perception of poverty may lead to a concept of well-being based on prosperity. In this perspective, the Church becomes a place where prosperity may be found. Some people believe that the church can find a job for them or can help them financially. The gospel can deal with poverty and bring well-being to people.

- Ethnicity: It is a problem of identity because it deals with origins. The issue of ethnicity has never been correctly addressed either in theological circles or in the political arena, especially in French speaking Africa. Yet, most of the conflicts that the Church in Africa are facing are related to ethnicity. The gospel must bring light to this issue.

In short, inculturation consists of knowing profoundly the hearers in their context, integrating their culture, and addressing their real needs and concerns.

As Bate explained it (Bate 1995: 234), the local church is the best framework for inculturation since she interacts regularly with the people, Christians and non-Christians coming with their needs, personal or community problems, but also with their dreams. Through liturgy, sacrament celebration and Scripture reading, the Church offers to people – members and visitors - a setting for transformation. This inculturation operates at three
levels: communication of the gospel, humanisation of people whose nature of God's creature has been affected by sin, and sanctification.

Communication of the gospel must take into account the local culture, or the hosting culture so that the message may be comprehensive, can respond to real questions that people ask and meet the needs they feel. But the gospel is not only information that needs to be communicated. It is the power of God to redeem the lost (Rom 1:16), to restore the icon of God in man/woman so that he/she may become really human, and can stand before God as a real partner and co-worker (I Cor 3:9). Hence, the gospel aims at transforming the innermost being of the hearers, it wants to touch their hearts, their souls and their conscience. Inculturation is at the core of the process of transformation by the gospel because culture is a part of the human identity. At the end of this process, which may be gradual and slow, they will be able to appropriate the gospel and to integrate in their lives new Christian values that will help them to make a difference in society. These Christian values include:

- Human dignity: The human being is a creature of God. He/she embodies the image of God in some way. Whatever the social position, racial background or history may be, that dignity must be respected and honoured. The Church as the servant of God is a tool for the restoration of human dignity wherever it is flouted. When human dignity as a Christian value is appropriated, all issues of identity, ethnicity and tribalism will be correctly addressed and transcended.

- Freedom from any alienation especially from the power of sins: The human dignity is tightly linked with freedom. Every human being must be set free from oppression,
segregation, and slavery. It is however important to point out that sin is the most dangerous enemy of freedom, and of human beings. The Church is called to bring to people the good news, which can set free from sin and from any spiritual slavery (John 8:36). When the value of liberty is appropriated by people, they will understand that all kinds of liberty, such as social, political and economic liberty lie in spiritual liberty. The Church must be the first place where liberty is actually experienced.

- Integrity: The society is dramatically corrupted at all levels. The Church appears to be the best institution to fight corruption and to propose an alternative society where integrity is a cardinal value. No human dignity can be respected where integrity is flouted. Proclaiming and protecting integrity leads to re-shaping the African society and preparing the birth of a new African civilisation, since civilisation starts with men and women who have a high view of human beings and of moral correctness.

- Holiness of marriage: Modern society is questioning the value of marriage. Every society is made up of families and family is based on marriage. The Church must develop a clear theology of marriage and must give orientation on the growing phenomenon of divorce, promiscuous sexuality and single-parent family.

- Contentment: Globalisation is entering every culture and is developing consumerism wherever it is possible. The African community, which has been harassed economically and has been becoming poorer and poorer for the last three decades, seems to be vulnerable to consumerism. The Christian value of contentment may help Christians and non Christians to live with what they have and not to live as the others live in other continents. Contentment can be a powerful tool to restrain the negative impact of globalisation on African peoples.
This list is not exhaustive. These above examples are most important in Africa as they deal with specific issues that are challenging African people on a daily basis. The Church must communicate these values to society so that the environment may be transformed and may become more human. It is worthwhile to note that communication means also education.

But the most important is the new way of thinking that has emerged from inculturation. Without a right way of thinking there will be difficulty in communicating correct values.

4.4.2.2. The local church is an instrument of humanisation – the Missionary task of the Church.

Humanisation is a global project of God for all nations and every people. Since the fall described in Genesis 3, the human race has been dramatically affected by sin in his/her innermost being. The environment has been significantly dehumanised.

The transformation of people in the matrix of inculturation is the inward daily task of the local church while humanisation can be considered her outward task. The humanisation takes place first within the Church among the attendees, but it goes beyond the sanctuary in order to reach the nations so that every tribe may be represented in the Kingdom. The local church goes where the people are.
As we have said earlier, humanisation consists in restoring the icon of God in man/woman to various degrees. In African culture, humanisation may be a spiritual battle that delivers a man or a woman from spiritual bondage. Some people had contacts with witchcraft or sorcery world. In this case, they need spiritual liberation that they can get within the local church with the help of the whole community. Others need psychological liberation because they were victims of social injustice or a political system such as apartheid, slave trade, dictatorial regime, or the current economic order. In these cases, humanisation consists in liberating them from psychological problems such as bitterness, hatred or pain. In any case, the gospel can set free (John 8:36), restore the icon of God. The liberated persons through humanisation will resemble Jesus Christ who is the true and perfect model of human being, the true icon of God (Col 1:15).

Then humanisation implies also the communication of new values to the host culture and the host environment. The object of humanisation is people, the hearers of the gospel but it has an impact on the environment, politically, socially, economically and ethically. A humanised environment helps people to live decently, to meet their own needs and to achieve their dreams.

These values are not new from the Biblical perspective but they are new for the hearers and especially for new converts to Christ. When they are inculturated, they can be integrated in the lives of new converts but also in the lives of other hearers. The latter may not become Christians but they may live in a new environment shaped by Christian values. These values will have an impact on all parts of their lives such as politics,
economics, justice, education, and ethics at individual and community levels. They will help them to live more humanly.

In the humanisation process, the fruit of preaching may be immediate and visible whereas the fruit of the communication of Christian values may takes time and requires patience and perseverance. It may take years or even decades until the whole society will adopt these values and have a new environment shaped by the gospel.

Coming back to Mt 28:19, we note that the command to the disciples reads: “to make disciples, instructing what Jesus has commanded and baptising them…” We may say that “instruction” concerns not only the disciples, the converted people but also those who are not. All nations should be instructed with what Jesus had commanded to his disciples.

4.4.2.3 The local church as an instrument of sanctification --Preparing Christians for missionary work.

Humanisation within and outside the Church is a permanent vocation. It aims at transforming people gradually so that they may recover the image of God in them, distorted by sin, in order to become real partners of God on earth. It will not end until the Kingdom comes. Sanctification, on the other hand, aims at equipping Christians so that they become effective agents of transformation in society, and instruments for Mission. Sanctification helps them to know the Master and to follow in His footsteps, to embody His life, His teaching and the values He communicated during His ministry on earth. The Holy Spirit and the Word of God are the main instruments of sanctification.
It is important to affirm that the local church is becoming missionary when her members are in the process of sanctification through the Spirit and the Word of God, when She produces potential missionaries that are willing to go beyond the boundaries of the Church and to plant new churches.

4.4.3. Dialectic between the Church as a matrix of inculturation and the Church as an instrument of humanisation.

The Church is at the same time a matrix of inculturation and an instrument of humanisation. But inculturation may be predominant when the Church is young. She focuses on inward tasks. When the Church becomes more mature, humanisation can be gradually predominant at the expense of inculturation. In this sense, inculturation and humanisation may be perceived as two steps in the life of a local church. But there is an overlap between the two steps. Thus, we must not separate the two permanent roles of the Church, i.e. inculturation and humanisation, although one role seems to be more visible than the other, according to the development of the Church.

This dialectic makes the Church permanently dynamic and helps her to move to her ultimate goal which is her status of eschatological body, transforming society, or preparing for an alternative society.

The diagram N°3 gives a view of the process that occurs in the life of a local church.
Step N°1:
Process of inculturation within the local church: the message and the messengers leave the culture C1 of the sending church and enter the culture C2 of the hearers. It is the time for understanding, discovering people, and listening to them.

Step N°2:
The messengers in culture C2 preach the good news to the hearers, communicate Christian values to them and to their environment. Some hearers become Christian in C2, others do not but they can appropriate the Christian values and can be shaped by these. Humanisation here has two degrees of impact:
1) The first degree is conversion when the hearers accept the good news and are transformed and liberated by the power of God. They may become full members of the local church.
2) The second degree of impact is on those who do not become Christian but who will
adopt Christian values in the environment that will be gradually shaped by the Christian message. The humanisation at this stage is slow but can be profound. At the end of the process of humanisation, the society will be sustained by durable and sure values.

Step N°3

This is the step of sanctification. By the work of God’s Word in the local church and the power of the Spirit, each member should grow in order to reach the stature of Christ who is the perfect icon of the invisible God (Col 1:15). The process of sanctification takes place through the daily life of the church.

At the same time the humanisation of society continues through the involvement of the local church in all areas of life. The local church must be proactive and committed to enhancing the quality of life in society, with the help of various ministries, para-church structures and mission agencies that are represented in this church.

It is important to underline that these steps are not strictly consecutive. There is an overlap between step 1 for inculturation, and step 2 for humanisation, since during inculturation, the process of humanisation within the church may take place. Besides, humanisation in step 2 may continue indefinitely through step 3 of sanctification.
4.5. Concept of Developing Church and Developed Church

4.5.1. The dynamic within the Church

In her eschatological life, the Church is called to grow and mature until the Kingdom comes, when she is fully and perfectly one, holy, catholic and apostolic. Presently, she has to demonstrate that she is the sign of the Kingdom and to make this Kingdom more and more visible to society and to the world. The growth of the Church depends upon three factors:

- The Spirit of God: The Church is created by God Himself (Matt 16:18). Therefore, she belongs exclusively to Him, and is totally submissive to His authority. The Spirit of God makes her different from any other institutions and religious groups such as Para-Church organisations.

- Scripture: Since the Church belongs to God, she must be nourished with His Word, which is the Scripture. Preaching, collective reading of Scripture through liturgy, Bible study must be at the core of her life.

- Host culture: As we said previously, the local church is a true representation of the Universal Church. She is the face of the Universal Church in a given place and time. She is modeled by the host culture. The cultural dimension of the local church reminds us that she is fully human.
The dynamic within the local church lies in these three factors. We must not separate them from each other because the Word without the Spirit of God has no power to transform or to help the Church to grow. It would be simply a text among others. On the other hand, without the cultural factor, the Church would never be a local church, a real representation of the Universal Church in a place, a full body of Christ in a context. The Church would be an alien structure in a place.

The dynamic within the local church helps her to move from the state of developing Church to the state of developed Church.

4.5.2. Developing Church

Many phrases have been used to name and to characterise the relationships that exist between the missionary society that sent missionaries and the planted or host Churches. Each paradigm has its own phrase:

- The paradigm of Mission Agency-Indigenous Church: As we said previously, this paradigm has produced two independent entities on the field: the Mission and the Church. This also leads to a dichotomy that separates missionaries from theologians who should work together for the Kingdom. This dichotomy has no biblical basis. Besides, this paradigm is now questionable because in many parts of the world, the so-called indigenous Churches are more mature than the Mission agencies which planted them many years ago. They may be called to send missionaries to the West in the near future. Moreover, the term “indigenous” is no more appropriate if the churches in the South
plan to evangelise the West, since it belongs to the vocabulary of the 19th century anthropology to which indigenous meant uncivilised. Therefore the phrase “indigenous Churches in Europe or in North America” would not be easily accepted.

- The paradigm of Older Church-Younger Church: It presents some advantages according to the International Missionary Council Meeting at Jerusalem in 1928. It developed mutual fellowship between older churches and younger churches. However, we believe that that paradigm presents a series of problems such as the danger of paternalism especially in the African context where older brothers have indefinite authority over younger brothers. We also notice that the so-called older Churches are not necessarily more mature. Nowadays, since the centre of gravity of Christianity has moved from the North to the South, the older churches in the North need helps from younger churches in the South. For his part, Todd notes that “Young Churches may not be precise enough because it seems to exclude Churches which may have been evangelised many years ago but still are in the process of growing to maturity” (Todd 1984: 179).

Therefore, we propose with Richard Todd (1984) the paradigm of “Developing Church and Developed Church”. We are aware of problems that may occur when we use these terms. Indeed, the terms “developing” and “developed” are more often used in socio-political arenas. They belong to the socio-political vocabulary. However, they seem to be clear and to be able to help us to understand the biblical concept of Church, as an agent of Mission and transformation, which is marching to the New Jerusalem.
4.5.2.1. The Church called to maturity

A developing church is a real church of God in a given place, called to reach a higher stage of her life and at the end the status of "the eschatological Church" as Todd names it (Todd 1984: 180). She has to demonstrate the four marks of the Church, which are unity, holiness, catholicity and apostolicity. She struggles to accomplish the mandate of the Church in her own context. She longs to preach the gospel so that people be converted to Christ and become new creatures, to communicate Christian values to Christian and non-Christian peoples in order to build a new society in a new civilisation.

4.5.2.2. Characteristics of a developing Church.

A developing church is a newly planted church. Although she is the full body of Christ, she is still at the beginning of the process of growth. She has the following characteristics:

- Being a newly planted church, she lacks well-trained native workers. Thus, she needs the assistance of non-native workers from Mission agencies; and Para-Church movements specialized in evangelism, Bible translation, outreach, youth training, ministerial training etc.

- She lacks ordained native pastors who can ensure pastoral tasks such as sacrament administration, liturgy leading, pastoral care and counselling, and who can guarantee sustainability.

- She is mainly in the inculturation process. She must identify the real and felt needs in the host culture. In most African cultures, poverty, identity and diseases seem to be the top concerns. As we said previously, in Africa poverty is more and more dramatic
and is sometime theologically interpreted as a sin or a fate; diseases such as AIDS and malaria tend to kill millions of people and thus pose an existential problem, especially when they are perceived as a result of curse from ancestors or from God; and ethnocentricity (a wrong understanding of identity) leads to civil wars. In the inculturation process, the Church leaders have to elaborate a relevant theology on the above needs and an accurate anthropology that can help African people to have a sane view of these mentioned concerns and to face their needs. Here we have two steps: identifying the needs and communicating new values through a relevant theology. The cost of inculturation may be high: cultural mutilation for workers and leaders from outside, painful changes for church attendees and patience for everybody. At the end of inculturation, the local church becomes a part of the host society, but as an agent of transformation or a builder of a new society. However, we must say that nobody can know when inculturation ends.

- She lacks human resources for mission. The local church is called to go to the ends of the earth, to make all nations disciples of Christ and to teach them what He commanded her. A developing church is a potentially missionary church which must become gradually an actual missionary church.

In short, a developing church is more a matrix of inculturation than a tool of humanisation although we cannot really separate the two aspects of her life on earth. In other words, in a developing church we note the predominance of the internal inculturation over the external humanisation.
4.5.3. The concept of developed Church

In a process of growth, a developing church must become a developed church. In terms of essence, a developed church is no different from a developing church. But she has reached a certain step of growth in her life. She has acquired some capacities to accomplish the mandate that God has given to her. Some criteria must be seen in a developed church:

- She has a good leadership and a good governance ensured by native workers, ordained pastors or priests and skilled lay leaders. They take over from non-native workers whose tasks are finished when the church becomes missionary. These non-native workers must move to another place to plant a new church or to help a developing church.

- The process of inculturation has reached a certain step or has been achieved. The church has her own liturgy and her own theology that sustains all aspects of her life, that has translated culturally the message of God so that it can be easily understood, applied in Christians' life and communicated to non-Christians.

- She progresses to the external work of humanisation. She is now able to go beyond her own boundary and preach the gospel that can transform the human being, restore in him/her the corrupted image of God destroyed by sin so that he/she becomes a child of God, and a real partner of Him. Through humanisation, the developed church aims also at building up a new society with Christian values in order to give Christians and non-Christians an environment where they can live decently. We note here various forms of the work of humanisation by the local church: Preaching,
communicating by words or by visible actions, witnessing and being actively and transformatively present in society.

- Through sanctification by the Word of God and His Spirit, she helps her members to grow in order to reach the stature of Christ who is the perfect model of human being and to become actually involved in the life of the Church.

- She has enough human resources for the work of mission or humanisation. Most members of the church have a missionary awareness and long to be committed to mission work beyond the church and the country. They have the vision for unreached ethnic groups in their country and abroad. Some of them will be sent as missionaries equipped with skills and expertise, others will give funds for mission but all of them will permanently pray for the extension of the Kingdom to the ends of the earth. In short, a developed church longs to plant new churches or to help a developing church.

- Being inculturated and with the vision of humanisation, she has to produce ideas for the church but also for society. She must develop in her members the culture of reflection and the culture of theologising. A developed church is to be self-theologising because if she does not think theologically, she is dying gradually. She could be an impressive institution and a wealthy church but she ceases to be a developed church.

- She has an appropriate philosophy of fund-raising and gives a good percentage of her revenue for mission. Her target is not only to be self-supporting for sustainability but also to support as many developing churches as possible.
4.5.4. Relationships between Churches

The local church is the first and principal agent of mission. She is fully the body of Christ in a given place and time. We agree with I. Bria when he says:

“An ecclesiological starting point for understanding the issues of unity and mission is the reality and integrity of the local church as being the full body of Christ and people of God in a given place, nourished by the word and sacrament, and living in communion with other local churches” [Bria *: 265]

From Bria's assertion, we note that mission is at the heart of the local church's life. She is fundamentally missionary. We note also that a given local church has to live in communion with other local churches, whatever their denominational backgrounds are. She has to develop a culture of co-operation with them.

For some reasons, a developed church may not have all the capacities to do mission, to send missionaries to remote places to plant new churches and to witness among unreached ethnic groups. The limitations that local churches may have can lead them to the project of creating a cluster of local churches in a given place, a city, a district or a region of the country. The concept of cluster for missionary tasks offers a number of advantages:

- The local churches in the cluster can share the riches they have: human resources, finances, expertise, and experience.
- The co-operation within the cluster demonstrates that without ecumenism, no church can do mission properly and efficiently since mission is Missio Dei.
- The co-operation within the cluster helps local churches to avoid isolationism or excessive independence. Local churches must live in interdependence with each other.
- The missionary is accountable to the cluster that sends him or her. In the present paradigm, accountability toward various denominations and disparate Churches is not possible. This easily leads to the phenomenon that may perhaps best be called “free-lancing missionaries and evangelists”.

- The developing church that receives a missionary can develop deep relationships with the cluster of developed churches. It is hoped that this developing church will become a developed church and will join the cluster in some years.

Having made my analysis of the present situation and landscape, and having spelled out my own theological understanding of an adequate mission-church relationship, I move to my final chapter in order to indicate certain guidelines to rectify the present unsatisfactory situation.
Chapter Five

CONCLUSION

The study of the "Missiological Dimensions of African Ecclesiology" leads us to the following concluding guidelines:

5.1. Necessity of missiological reflection in context

Missiological reflection has been on the agenda of missiologists since the early 1900s, especially in the United Kingdom and Continental Europe. Today, missiologists in the North continue producing ideas through colloquia and consultations. Many articles have been written and many books on mission have been published. However, some key issues have not been raised or sufficiently addressed. For instance, the nature of missiology and its position vis-à-vis the theological disciplines have not been significantly considered as a part of the debate.

In Africa, since 1955 when African priests studying in Brussels questioned the validity of Western theology for African Churches\(^{39}\), theological reflections have been developed, but the issue of mission has not been addressed. The interest was on some major themes such as adaptation in the 1960s, inculturation in 1974, contextualisation and Moratorium in the early 1970s. We agree that these themes are vital for theological reflection and for the future of the Church in Africa, but they were not examined in relation to mission.

\(^{39}\) A manifesto from those priests was published in 1955, with the title: "Quand les prêtres noirs s'interrogent". We translate this title as follows: "When Black Priests ask themselves".
This leads us to a permanent conflict between missiology and theology. In the present study we propose that missiology as a theology of mission be tightly linked with ecclesiology.

The history of theology since the Reformation in the 16th century shows us that theology has always been based or centred on a particular discipline, considered as the main discipline. We are particularly interested in three examples. Calvin’s theology is mainly theocentric. It is centred on theology of God. His key concept is the sovereignty of God. This means that we cannot understand Calvin’s theology unless we understand his theology of God’s sovereignty. “Soli Deo Gloria” is his slogan. We also know that Barth is Christo-centric. His whole theology is centred on "the event of Jesus". He reads and interprets Scripture in a Christological perspective. The last example we give is from Catholic theology. It is Church-based because ecclesiology is the foundation for all theological disciplines in Catholic perspective. All Catholic theological assertions must be interpreted and understood through ecclesiology.

These three types of theology have strengths and weaknesses. Their common weakness that we observe is the absence of missiological reflection. Nowhere in these types of theology missiology has a clear, autonomous position – it must be included as an afterthought. Therefore, we may suggest that theology be mission-centred, since the role of theology is to expose the thought of God in a reasonable way so that people may grasp it and appropriate it in their own culture. We should not forget that God’s main concern is about the lost and the unreached. “I have other sheep that are not of this sheep pen. I must bring them also. They too will listen to my voice, and there shall be one flock and one shepherd.” (John 10:16). The Diagram No 4 may explain our thought on theology of mission at the core of ecclesiology.
5.2. The local church as a basis of Mission

Our study leads us also to state that the local church is the only Bible-based mission agency that has an eschatological dimension. This means that Mission agencies, African Initiated Missions and Para-Church movements must refer and must be closely related and accountable to the local church. We explained in a previous chapter that Faith Missions failed in that they perpetuated the dichotomy between Church and Mission, that African Initiated Missions have no future because they have no ecclesiastical tradition or roots, nor a clear ecclesiology, and that para-church movements are limited in its actions because they minister mainly to homogenous groups such as students, medical workers, or specialise in a particular domain of mission. Therefore, they are advised to join the local church and to serve her faithfully. Thus we propose that the local church be the basis of mission.
If all the existing extra-ecclesial mission agencies are incorporated into the local church, it will have enough human resources for mission. We mention just three examples:

- Leaders: they will cover a whole range: ordained pastors or priests, missionaries and technicians sent by mission agencies or Para-church movements, and well-trained lay people. In including non-native missionaries, technicians and skilled lay people in leadership and ministry, the local church will avoid paralysing clericalism.

- Committed members: they are the visible fruits of humanisation and sanctification within the Church. They participate in the life of the Church according to their charismata and their expertise. They have grasped the vision of God for the Church. They are committed to mission. Some are potential missionaries, others are supporters and donors, and all of them are witnesses of Jesus Christ actively present in society.

- Visitors and new-comers: They may also participate in the life of the Church whatever the duration of their stay is. They must be considered as a part of the fellowship, and thus can receive as well as contribute blessings from God through the life of the church.

In her missionary perspective, the local church must be the setting for theological reflection. In other words, the People of God in the local church must set the agenda for and participate in theological reflection. They have the real questions to ask, the real needs to articulate, and the real challenges to face. They know their environment. They must be involved in the process of inculturation and humanisation. In other terms, real questions arise from the People of God in the local Christian community, rather than from (sometimes distant) theologians. They have to theologise in their own context. In so doing, they gradually appropriate the message of God, incarnate and embody the gospel in order to have a significant and durable impact on society. Hence, the Church will avoid some of the mistakes made by missiologists in the past. Those missiologists produced what they did not consume, since few of them actually went to the
mission field - in other words, they were producing an often context-less missiology. The People of God at the grass roots level consumed what they did not produce (one can say they had to import "spiritual food), since they simply had to implement the decisions made by foreign missiologists. This helps us understand why the Moratorium has never been implemented. The decision on the Moratorium had no impact on the Church because the people of God in their local communities did not participate in the debates on it. In other words, the reflection on Moratorium did not concern the people of God. The following diagram graphically illustrates how I view the relation between local church and mission agencies:

Diagram N° 5

5.3. Interdependence between local churches

The present economic order, which is based on a global apartheid (rich/poor), is inherited from the colonial powers coming to Africa more than a century ago. This order has been sustained by a colonial anthropology and cultural mindset that claimed the superiority of white people over others. The superiority is not only economic in the sense that the West is wealthier than the rest of the world, it is also cultural and perhaps ontological and genetic. That anthropology could not encourage equal co-operation and relation between the North and the South in terms of mission.
This economic order has influenced the churches in the North as well as in the South. Hence, the superiority complex has gained the upper hand in churches and missions and has greatly assisted in developing and sustaining the paradigm: Mission agencies-Indigenous Churches that we denounced in a previous chapter. The missiological discourse that produced that paradigm could not help mission agencies and missionaries to transcend that economic order. Therefore, we cannot hope that mature and equal co-operation will be possible between mission agencies and churches in Africa.

If the local church becomes a real basis of Mission, wherever she is, in the North or in Africa, there is a better chance that interdependence between local churches is possible in the near future. If we believe that all resources belong to God and that the message of God to the nations can transcend the unjust economic order, sharing resources between the people of God in their various local churches may become possible.

We state in this study that a wealthy church (in the sense of a denomination) is not necessarily a missionary church. She is wealthy because she is in the USA thanks to the present economic order. She would give to Africa, not because she wants to participate in the extension of the Kingdom or because she has the passion for the lost, but just because she has enough to give.

Therefore, we suggest rather co-operation between local churches within a country, a region and beyond. This kind of co-operation will encourage mutual interaction and exchanges of resources. Some churches have financial resources, others have human resources. The western churches, especially in Europe, have significant financial resources. Therefore, they may give to African churches that cannot even pay the salaries of their pastors. And some African churches, rich in human resources, may send workers to Europe. The project of co-operation between local
churches will bring some adequate solutions to crucial problems of lack of workers in Europe and lack of funds in Africa. Many well-trained African pastors in Europe are not encouraged to come back to Africa because their respective African churches are not able to financially support them. Most of them stay in the West and create African churches in cities like Brussels, Amsterdam, Paris, and London. These Churches are often numerically much bigger than the European churches in these cities. This phenomenon has no Biblical basis, nor sound theological foundation. It exists for economic reasons.

It is thus urgent that exchange of resources between local churches be encouraged. But no exchange will be possible without a sound theology of co-operation. This theology must transcend the present economic order and profit from globalisation that may help churches to go wherever they want to go for mission and to extend the Kingdom. The following diagram illustrates how I see this relationship developing:

*Diagram No. 6*

5.4 Six theses

In conclusion, I wish to encapsulate my main arguments in this study in the form of six concluding theses. I do not argue these theses any further, as I am convinced that they
flow logically from my analysis and reflection in the preceding pages. I am therefore not introducing any new arguments or material:

1. Theology is mission-centred, thus all theological disciplines are tightly linked with missiology and must contribute to the extension of the Kingdom in terms of reflection and action. The dichotomy between theology and missiology has no Biblical basis.

2. An ontological and a functional approach in ecclesiology are both necessary. Ecclesiology has to respond not only to the question "What is the Church?", but also to the question "What is the Church for?" This leads us to understand that Mission is the raison d'etre of the Church.

3. The local church is the representation of the Universal Church in a given location, and she is therefore the true locus of Mission. Hence, Mission agencies, African Initiated Missions and para-church movements have to become incorporated in her, and to participate in reflection and action. Paralysing clericalism can be overcome when most members, ordained and lay people are really committed to Mission.

4. The local church as the basis of mission is the setting for theological reflection and action of the People of God. The real issues for theological debates must come from the grass roots.

5. The issues of healing, liberation and identity must be addressed as major subjects in African ecclesiology. Theologians must articulate them properly with the message of God to all nations, and in the light of the gospel in order to present correctly the gospel and communicate efficiently Christian values.

6. The co-operation of local churches is vital for Mission since no church is self-sufficient for the following reasons:

   - Mission is basically ecumenical. It transcends denominationalism, ethnocentrism and nationalism.
The co-operation between churches can benefit from globalisation. In this sense, local churches are really agents of communication, transformation and humanisation within the new economic order.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Anderson G. H. (Editor)

Anderson G.H. and Strausky T.F. (Editors)

Asempa (Publishers)

Barres M.

Barrett D.

Bate S.C.

Bediako K.

Berkhof L.

Benedictus XV
1919. Épitre Apostolique Maximum Illud

Boëgner M.

Buchanan et al.

Calvin J.
Carson D.A.

Castro E.

Cheza M.

Conn H. M.

Costas O.E.

Daneel M.L.

Daneel M. L.

Donovan V.J.

Dowley T. et al (Editors)

Dulles A.

Dulles A.

Dulles A.
ERT

Fashole-Luke E.W
1994. "The Quest for African Theologies"

Fiedler K.

Griffiths M.

Guebriant

Hayes S.T.W.

Hiebert P.G.

Hiebert P.G.

Hill B.

Hoekendijk J.

Hunermann G.

ISM.
Inter-Senegal Mission Brochure printed in a limited number (without any other details).

John Paul II.
Johnstone P.

Ka Mâna

Karamaga A.

Kayayan
1981. "La prédication pourquoi faire?" in *Perspectives Réformées* (1 and 2)

Köhler G.

Kossi A. T.

Kraft C.

Küng H.
1990. *Qu'est-ce que l'Eglise?*. (Translated from German by Rochais and Evrard). Paris: Desclée de Brouwer.

Librarie Editrice Vaticane (Editions)

Lowman P.

Masuku T.

Meester P.

Mélanges (Editions)

Mofokeng T.A.

Molyneux K.G.

Muzorewa G.

Newbigin L.

Newbigin L.
1991. **Truth to tell, the Gospel as Public Truth.** Geneva: WCC.

Nthamburi Z.

Padilla R.

Padilla R.

Parker D. (Editor)
1999. "Evangelical and Catholic Converse about the Church and Mission" in **Evangelical Review of Theology** 23 (No 1, 11-13)

Pius XI
1926. Encyclical: **Rerum Ecclesiae**

Pius XII
1951. Encyclical: **Evangelii Praecones**


Saayman W.

Saayman W. (Editor)

Saayman W.
1993. “Missiology in the Theological Faculty: A View from South Africa” in Mission Studies 15 (no 29,*).

Saayman W.
1999. Missionary by its very nature: a time to take stock. (Unpublished)

Saayman W & Kritzinger K (Editors).

Saayman W.
2001. 'Ex Africa semper aliquid novi': subjective reflections on challenges to Christian Missions arising in Africa. (Unpublished)

Schaaf Y

Scott G.

Shenk W.

Snyder H.A.

Spindler M.

The African Synod
1996. **Documents, Reflections, Perspectives.** New York, Orbis.

Tiénou T.

Todd R. J.
1984. “From Concept of Missions to the Concept of Developing Churches: A Proposal” in *Missiology: An International Review,* XII, No 2, April, 1884.

Underhill M.M.

Uzukwu

Vatican Council II.

Verkuyl J.

Walls A.

Winter R.

Other Publications:

AMECEA:

ANITEPAM:

Synod Africain:
1994
Interviews:

Kashale D.: Sociologist, Director of FMC

Téhé C.: Student in missiology, former missionary in Congo

Barrett D.: Missiologist

Oliveira J.: ISM Director

Luméya N: Former Director of CUM, theologian