EDUCATIONAL POLICY IN A POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA: AN EXPLORATORY STUDY OF THE NEEDS OF THE INDIAN COMMUNITY

by

MOHAMED HOOSEN ABBAS RASOOL

submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF EDUCATION in the subject

COMPARATIVE EDUCATION at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: MRS J M SQUELCH

JOINT SUPERVISOR: PROF D C BADENHORST

SEPTEMBER 1994
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people have helped in the completion of this dissertation. It would be impossible to acknowledge all of them because some of the ideas which are contained in this study have grown out of discussions held over the years. In that sense, this dissertation owes much to persons who helped to synthesize the writer's views.

First among these, I would like to acknowledge my great debt to Mrs JM Squelch and Professor DC Badenhorst for their unstinting advice and guidance.

In addition, I record my sincere thanks and appreciation to the following persons:

* Dr Yusuf Karodia of the University of Durban-Westville.
* Mr Parma Naidoo of Springfield College of Education.
* Mr Neal Pillay of Avonford Secondary.
* Mr Habib Sheik for proof-reading.
* Mrs Kasturi Naicker for typing.
* The Khan family of Clare Estate.
* My family for their enduring patience throughout the period of this study.
SUMMARY

Recent events have brought about the realization that purposeful advancement in South Africa depends on wide-ranging educational reforms consistent with the demands of a complex multicultural society. This necessitates the development of theoretically-sound policies informed by, and grounded in, the specific historical and cultural milieu in which it is to be conceived. Within this context, a particular concern is that little is known about the educational needs of the Indian community at this juncture. This concern is also evinced by a multitude of interests within this minority group.

Although this investigation focuses on Indian responses to dominant policy orientations, it conceptualizes the South African education dynamics in its entirety and interrelatedness and not as a conglomerate of isolated parts. In sum, this dissertation endeavours to examine some critical concerns as it affects the provision of education for people of Indian origin in a post-apartheid South Africa.

TITLE OF DISSERTATION:

EDUCATION POLICY IN A POST-APARtheid SOUTH AFRICA: AN EXPLORATORY STUDY OF THE NEEDS OF THE INDIAN COMMUNITY

KEY TERMS:

Post-apartheid South Africa; Indian community; Minority group; Educational policy; Educational needs; Transformation; Financing education; Education governance; Curriculum; School integration; Language; Multicultural education
### ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACUMSA</td>
<td>A Curriculum Model for Education in South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AZAPO</td>
<td>Azanian Peoples' Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHED</td>
<td>Committee of Heads of Education Departments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNE</td>
<td>Christian National Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CP</td>
<td>Conservative Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEC</td>
<td>Department of Education and Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DET</td>
<td>Department of Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DNE</td>
<td>Department of National Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DP</td>
<td>Democratic Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERS</td>
<td>Education Renewal Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOA</td>
<td>House of Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOD</td>
<td>House of Delegates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOR</td>
<td>House of Representatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSRC</td>
<td>Human Sciences Research Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFP</td>
<td>Inkatha Freedom Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INSET</td>
<td>in-service education for teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NECC</td>
<td>National Education Co-ordinating Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEPI</td>
<td>National Education Policy Investigation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>non-governmental organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIC</td>
<td>Natal Indian Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NLP</td>
<td>National Language Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP</td>
<td>National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>Pan-Africanist Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRESET</td>
<td>pre-service education for teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRISESEC</td>
<td>Private Sector Education Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTS.A</td>
<td>Parent-Teacher-Student Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESA</td>
<td>Research in Education in South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADTU</td>
<td>South African Democratic Teachers' Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAIRR</td>
<td>South African Institute of Race Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TASA</td>
<td>Teachers' Association of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VET</td>
<td>vocational education and training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

EDUCATIONAL POLICY IN A POST-APARTEID SOUTH AFRICA: AN EXPLORATORY STUDY OF THE NEEDS OF THE INDIAN COMMUNITY

CHAPTER ONE

1. PROBLEM FORMULATION, AIM AND METHOD

1.1 PROBLEM IN EDUCATIONAL Provision FOR INDIANS IN A WIDER SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT
1.1.1 Christian-Nationalism
1.1.2 Liberalism
1.1.3 Liberation-Socialism
1.1.4 Position of the Indian community
1.1.5 Awareness of the problem
1.2 RESEARCH PROBLEM
1.3 AIMS OF THE INVESTIGATION
1.4 METHOD OF RESEARCH
1.4.1 Exploratory-descriptive study
1.4.2 Literature study
1.4.3 Semi-structured interviews
1.4.4 Informal group discussions
1.5 CHAPTER SUMMARIES
1.6 DEFINITION OF TERMS
1.7 SUMMARY

CHAPTER TWO

2. AN OVERVIEW OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF INDIAN EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

2.1 INTRODUCTION 21
2.2 HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF INDIAN EDUCATION 23
2.2.1 First period : emergence of policy (1860 - 1948) 23
2.2.2 Second period : periodization of policy (1948 - 1983) 29
2.2.3 Third period : changing aspects of reformism (1984 - 1990) 33
2.2.4 Fourth period: transitional context
(1990 onwards) 37
2.2.5 Appraisal 39
2.3 KEY POLICY ISSUES CONFRONTING THE INDIAN COMMUNITY IN SOUTH AFRICA 41
2.3.1 Transformation 41
2.3.1.1 Education system change 41
2.3.1.2 Theory of education system change 42
   a. Emergence of a state system 42
   b. Penetrability of the political centre 42
   c. Centralization and decentralization 42
   d. Interest groups in education 43
2.3.1.3 Education system change in South Africa 43
2.3.1.4 Bureaucratic change 44
2.3.1.5 Transitional challenges for the Indian community 45
2.3.2 Education governance 46
2.3.2.1 Apartheid context 46
2.3.2.2 Legitimacy 47
2.3.2.3 Centralization versus decentralization 48
2.3.2.4 Implications for the Indian community 50
2.3.3 Finance 52
2.3.3.1 Apartheid legacy 52
2.3.3.2 Economic realism 52
2.3.3.3 Growing demand for education 53
2.3.3.4 Cost-effective strategies 54
2.3.3.5 Sharing responsibility 55
2.3.3.6 Implications for the Indian community 56
2.3.4 Curriculum 57
2.3.4.1 Historical context 57
2.3.4.2 Democratic participation 57
2.3.4.3 Commonality and diversity 58
2.3.4.4 Centralization and decentralization 58
2.3.4.5 Assessment 59
2.3.4.6 Academic and technical education 59
2.3.4.7 Implications for the Indian community 59
2.3.5 Integration 60
2.3.5.1 Apartheid education 60
2.3.5.2 Transitional challenges 61
2.3.5.3 Cultural concerns 61
2.3.5.4 Educational standards 62
2.3.5.5 Admissions policy 63
2.3.5.6 Implications for the Indian community 63
2.3.6 Language 65
2.3.6.1 Elements of a new language policy 65
   a. Multilingualism 65
   b. Democratic consultation 65
   c. Research 65
CHAPTER THREE

3. KEY EDUCATIONAL POLICY OPTIONS FOR A POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA

3.1 INTRODUCTION

3.2 THE MAKING OF EDUCATIONAL POLICY

3.2.1 Defining "policy"

3.2.2 The policy process

3.2.2.1 Agenda-setting

3.2.2.2 Formulation

3.2.2.3 Adoption

3.2.2.4 Implementation

3.2.2.5 Evaluation

3.2.3 Stages of policy development

3.2.4 Policy analysis

3.2.5 Limitations of policy

3.2.6 Educational policy development in South Africa

3.3 POLICY OUTLOOKS OF THE MAJOR ROLE-PLAYERS IN EDUCATION

3.3.1 National Party

3.3.2 Democratic Party

3.3.3 Inkatha Freedom Party

3.3.4 African National Congress

3.3.5 National Education Policy Investigation

3.3.6 Conservative Party

3.3.7 The private sector

3.4 POLICY OPTIONS

3.4.1 Transformation

3.4.1.1 State initiatives

a. New education plan

b. Government proposals

c. KwaZulu-Natal region (as an example)

3.4.1.2 Reaction to state initiatives

a. African National Congress-National Education Co-ordinating Committee standpoint

b. Democratic Party, Inkatha Freedom Party and the private sector standpoint
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.4.1.3</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
<th>94</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2</td>
<td>Education governance</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.1</td>
<td>Education Renewal Strategy position</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.2</td>
<td>National Education Policy Investigation position</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The system perspective</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The school governance perspective</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.3</td>
<td>Political organizations and the private sector</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Democratic Party position</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Inkatha Freedom Party position</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>African National Congress position</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Conservative Party position</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Private sector position</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.4</td>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.1</td>
<td>Education Renewal Strategy position</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Compulsory education</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Management councils</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Funding</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.2</td>
<td>National Education Policy Investigation position</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Community-based approach</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Expansion and desegregation of schools</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Reduce state spending</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Equalize spending</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Subsidizing low-income neighbourhood schools</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f.</td>
<td>Subsidization formula</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.3</td>
<td>Political organizations</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.4</td>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4</td>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4.1</td>
<td>Education Renewal Strategy position</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4.2</td>
<td>National Education Policy Investigation position</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Curriculum decision-making</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.</td>
<td>Highly centralized curriculum decision-making</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii.</td>
<td>Highly decentralized curriculum decision-making</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii.</td>
<td>Combination of centralization and decentralization</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Core or differentiated curriculum</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.</td>
<td>A core curriculum</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii.</td>
<td>A differentiated curriculum</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii.</td>
<td>A combination of core and differentiation</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Structure of schooling</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4.3</td>
<td>Political organizations and the private sector</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>African National Congress proposal</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER FOUR

4. EDUCATIONAL NEEDS OF THE INDIAN COMMUNITY IN A POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA

4.1 INTRODUCTION

4.2 TRANSFORMATIONAL NEEDS

4.2.1 The need to establish a non-racial, unitary education system

4.2.2 The need for legitimacy

4.2.3 The need for an efficient and effective bureaucracy

4.3 EDUCATION GOVERNANCE NEEDS

4.3.1 The need for democratic participation in decision-making

4.3.2 The need for an appropriate system of school governance

4.4 FINANCE NEEDS

4.4.1 The need for free and compulsory education
CHAPTER FIVE

5. CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND THEMES
FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

5.1 INTRODUCTION
5.2 CONCLUSIONS
5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS
5.3.1 Equitable funding
5.3.2 Cost-effective and efficient bureaucracy
5.3.3 Community involvement
5.3.4 Transforming the curriculum
5.3.5 Promoting English
5.3.6 Developing policy capacity
5.4 THEMES FOR FURTHER RESEARCH
5.5 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY
5.6 SUMMARY
5.7 CONCLUDING REMARKS
5.8 REFERENCES

APPENDIX A
APPENDIX B
APPENDIX C
CHAPTER ONE

PROBLEM FORMULATION, AIM AND METHOD

1.1 PROBLEM IN EDUCATIONAL PROVISION FOR INDIANS IN A WIDER SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT

Major political developments have taken place in South Africa since 2 February 1990. These developments have led to the unbanning of political organizations, the release of political prisoners, the return of political exiles, the lifting of emergency restrictions and the removal of discriminatory legislation such as the Population Registration Act (1950), the Group Areas Act (1950) and the Separate Amenities Act (1953). The liberalization of the political process laid the basis for a negotiated constitutional settlement and culminated in the election of a new government on 27 April 1994. These developments in the political sphere have also affected the field of education.

Recent rationalization measures have resulted in, inter alia, the abolition of the administrations of the House of Assembly, House of Representatives and House of Delegates and the creation of the Education and Culture Service (ex-HOA, ex-HOR and ex-HOD) with effect from 1 April 1994 (Education & Culture Service 1994: 1). Another important development has been the publication of the ANC's draft discussion document, "A Policy Framework for Education and Training", which has been incorporated into the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) of the Government of National Unity.

At this stage, the investigator wishes to state that these recent rationalization measures and the aforementioned policy document, due to time constraints, have not been included in this study although they will, admittedly, have a significant impact on future educational developments. Research proper for this
dissertation was carried out between 1991 and March 1994.

Notwithstanding this, it is also the investigator's view that the ANC's policy proposal for education and training will take some time before being implemented and could, indeed, generate further such research.

The immediate challenge facing educational planners is the development of an education system in line with the demands of a post-apartheid society. This task has, in turn, necessitated a shift in educational thinking from policies centred around either opposition to, or the defence of, apartheid education, to a new focus, on different, often opposing, strategies of reconstruction intended or, at least, claimed to lead to one or another form of a democratic, non-racial education system (Wolpe 1991a : 1).

Until recently, education in South Africa was administered by fifteen different departments of education. Ten separate departments of education were found in the former "national states" and in territories which were given a form of "independence". African education outside the former "national states" was controlled by the Department of Education and Training. Education for the three remaining population groups, that is, White, Coloured and Indian was controlled by the respective Department of Education and Culture of the three Ministers' Councils in the House of Assembly, House of Representatives and House of Delegates. The Department of National Education dealt with general education policy for all race groups within the Republic of South Africa in respect of norms and standards for the financing of education, syllabuses, examinations and the certification of qualifications, salaries and conditions of employment of staff and for the professional registration of teachers. Other policy matters were dealt with at the so-called "own affairs" level of administration by the respective education departments (Mncwabe 1990 : 12 - 13). Currently, the personnel of the old education system are still legally in charge of their
respective departments until a new system is in place.

The multiplicity of departments has produced superstructural chaos; the growing machinery of state control has aggravated the problem of bureaucratization with its attendant evils of poor communication, wastage of funds, inefficiency, inflexibility and conservatism (Hofmeyr & Buckland 1992a: 26). Moreover, the fragmented management structure has served to alienate educational administrators from each other and prevented the implementation of a single national policy on any matter. Rather, the process of policy implementation itself has resulted in policy reformulation.

It is a given fact, without repeating the often quoted statistics, that the tricameral educational dispensation did not succeed in addressing the aspirations of the majority of South Africans. Numerous findings have revealed the unequal treatment of the different race groups in the distribution of education in terms of per capita expenditure, proportion of qualified teachers, teacher-pupil ratio, textbook provision, quality and quantity of buildings, equipment and sporting facilities, with the white system faring the best and the African system the worst (HSRC 1981: 209; Hartshorne 1990: 27 - 30; Pillay 1990: 30 - 47; Smit 1990: 5). The cumulative effect of this policy has been underdevelopment in every area of black education.

The former Nationalist government's response to the education crisis had been to effect reforms within the framework of the separate education structures. What happened was that in keeping with overall government strategy, concessions were made by the racially-defined education departments in the HOA, HOR and HOD to admit limited numbers of pupils from other race groups into its schools. The white-controlled education department presently has, for instance, four integration models in operation. Model A is a private school option; Model B is a state school with an open admissions policy; Model C (by far the most popular) is an open school with a state-aided option; and Model D is a school
comprising the majority of blacks but under the control of the white education authorities (Challenor 1992 : 7).

While the former Indian and Coloured education ministries supported mixed schools, they cited the budget as being responsible for the fact that little de facto integration had taken place. Under the tricameral system, Indian schools had to obtain permission from the HOD for the admittance of "non-Indian" pupils. The HOD's policy regarding the admission of these pupils had been:

* the character of the school shall not be prejudiced;
* accommodation and other facilities must be available after provision for Indian pupils have been made;
* the pupil shall reside within reasonable travelling distance;
* the medium of instruction is one of the two official languages;
* the course shall be acceptable to the parents;
* the pupil shall be easily assimilated into the relevant class (taking into account physical stature and educational level);
* the pupil shall not be two years older than the class average;
* no additional staff is required; and
* expenditure shall be met from annual allocations of the school concerned (Bot 1990 : 16).

At Coloured schools, once Coloured pupils in the area were admitted, further enrolments were entirely at the principal's discretion (SAIRR 1990 : 802).

The former government's reform initiative in this respect had drawn mixed reactions. Some saw it as a move away from segregated schooling and thus an attempt to destroy the "own affairs" mode of education. Others rejected it, albeit, for entirely different reasons. They regarded it as a calculated attempt, by means of
tokenism, to entrench ethnic divisions in the population and thus keep down the vast majority of black people. It can be argued that while these apparent reforms were not entirely "cosmetic" changes, they were implemented in a manner that left the roots of inequality unaffected.

Thus, at the time of writing, no comprehensive development strategy existed that could be identified as setting a likely or possible path to post-apartheid educational reconstruction. Whilst numerous conferences, workshops and forums were organized around the different facets of the shape of a future education system, the process of policy formulation was in a preparatory stage (Wolpe 1991a: 18).

It was in an atmosphere of ideological contestation that pressure was exerted on the major stakeholders in education to define policy for future development. Various interests were at stake and each was concerned to ensure that it was represented. This in itself is not a difficulty for one needs to encourage contestation about policy ideas to ensure that a range of options are made available to civil society. However, ideologies in South African education extend from survivalist, tribalist and power-bloc frameworks through to "right-way" ideologies and democratic, integrationist mind-sets (Coutts 1990b: 5). This points to a need for flexibility in the provision of education. Within this scope of ideologies, three major traditions dominate debate, namely, Christian-Nationalism, Liberalism and Liberation-Socialism.

Ashley (1989: 5) refers to conservative-nationalist, liberal and social emancipatory positions in education. Other writers have adopted a similar typology in analysing educational thought and practice. Christie (1985: 20 - 25) distinguishes between conservative, moderate and radical perspectives. Admittedly, other sub-categories may well exist. However, these three broad categories appear adequate in attempting a discussion on current social thought in education.
1.1.1 Christian-Nationalism

Christian-Nationalism, later applied to education to become Christian National Education, is that which enables the Afrikaner to protect that which he feels he has the right to - his culture, language and religion. At the same time, CNE recognizes the demand that non-Christians and non-Afrikaners have the right to protect that which they regard as essential to their well-being. In practice, however, the exclusive, deliberate emphasis by some Afrikaners for their own have led to criticisms that CNE is neither "Christian", nor "National", nor "Education" (Heyningen 1960 : 53).

This ideology, based on monocultural rationale, is designed to accommodate conservative communities who support the idea of differentiation in education on the basis of language, religion and life-style of a cultural group. The conservatives assert that differentiation on this basis is suitable for a multireligious, multicultural and multilingual society such as ours, since it acknowledges the right of every religious and cultural grouping to establish institutions to meet the specific needs of that particular group. Conservatives thus comprise of mainly, but not exclusively, right-wing Afrikaner elements in South Africa. Some parents in the Muslim and Jewish communities of South Africa have established private schools based on a monocultural model of schooling to meet their life-conceptual needs. Coutts (1991 : 2), however, cautions that the monocultural model must not provide a cloak for de facto racially-based schools if it hopes to find acceptance in a new dispensation.

In contrast to Christian-Nationalism, an ideology located at the centre of the political spectrum is that of Liberalism.

1.1.2 Liberalism

The second category, Liberalism, is in essence a belief in the importance of the individual as opposed to a collective entity,
whether the state or a mass of people. For liberals or moderates, as they are referred to in South Africa, the tolerance of diversity and equality of opportunity based on free-market principles are important characteristics of any social system. If society is constituted of individuals acting freely within the limits of the law, then education will produce thinking, questioning, problem-solving beings who are sensitive towards fellow citizens and recognize them as individuals with legitimate rights (Webber 1992: 20). From this tradition, the ideology of multiculturalism emanates and is viewed by some as a viable alternative in South Africa.

To the left of Liberalism is the ideology of Liberation-Socialism.

1.1.3 Liberation-Socialism

The third category, Liberation-Socialism or Social Emancipation, essentially seeks a fundamental change in the political and socio-economic systems according to socialist principles. Two broad groupings, the Charterists and non-Charterists, make up the radical left in education (Maphai 1990: 57). Although ideological differences at the political level exist between them, it does not imply corresponding differences in education policies (Ashley 1989: 34). The ANC and NECC are important representatives of the Charterist alignment, while PAC and AZAPO are leading members of the non-Charterist grouping. For the left-wing, the aims of education are inextricably linked with the struggle to transform society into a democracy. They propagate the notion of People’s Education. This ideology of education is visualized as the key to total human emancipation which, in turn, will stimulate the nation’s creativity, its critical faculties, and its ability to analyse, in order to prepare for full participation and decision-making in all social, political, economic, cultural and educational spheres of society (Brandt 1988: 8).
Professor Jakes Gerwel (1992 : 8), in a keynote address to the Broederstroom Conference, outlined the interconnected reasons for the lack of success of People’s Education:

The movement’s capacity to put structures of authority in place was poorly developed and its intellectuals were unable, in the time available and under conditions of repression, to produce new curricula .... People’s Education became an opposition movement based on the rejection of apartheid and was increasingly identified with the struggle which drew the youth out of the schools, through the school boycott, and into demonstrations on the streets.

Gerwel (1992 : 4) further concedes that the value of People’s Education was questioned after 2 February 1990 when the liberation movement was drawn into the negotiation process.

It is the investigator’s view that the ANC has appeared to adopt a more moderate ideological stance in education since its election victory in April 1994. Education policy statements emerging from the ANC in recent months have tended to lack the distinctive ideological lineage of the radical left which was so characteristic of this organization in the apartheid era. In the pursuit of national reconciliation, it has become necessary for the ANC to make compromises with its opponents in education as well as in other areas of life.

From the foregoing analysis of the ideological-educational debate, it is evident that a diversity of axiomatic viewpoints, cultural and political contexts, and educational contents and systems are reflected between different interests in South African education. These ideological divisions also reflect a potential for conflict in a new dispensation as different values and systems of ideas contest the role of schooling in society.

From experience, it is clear that the weakness of Christian-Nationalism has been to superimpose a single ideology or value
hindsight, it would seem that the way to achieve an inclusive nationhood would be to create conditions that allow people to make free choices in accordance with their particular needs. If South Africa’s diversity of ideologies, religions, ethnic groups and other categories are to be housed in an educational system of legitimacy, that system will have to be one which presents many options (Heese 1992b : 112). This implies that all stakeholders and interest groups in education need to be involved in drawing up the requirements and structure of a new system of provision, and the broadest possible consensus will have to be obtained.

The ideological debate has particular implications for the Indian community.

1.1.4 Position of the Indian community

From the preceding analysis, it is evident that the Indian minority features largely on the periphery in terms of its role in, and contribution to, the momentum of debate in education. In a broader context, much concern is being expressed by minorities in South Africa of the post-apartheid education dynamics and its implications for addressing the heterogeneous needs of our multicultural society.

A specific educational concern confronting the Indian community relates to the extent to which policy alternatives presented for post-apartheid development satisfies community needs. Emanating from this, debate has tended to revolve around the question of transformation in education. Issues such as "what should be transformed", "how", "by whom" and "to what" are receiving prominence in education circles within the community (Soobrayan 1991 : 7). Other pragmatic concerns include: schools unrest; declining standards; affirmative action; overcrowding; preservation of religious beliefs; and the general fears consistent with social change.
One effect of the process of negotiation is that the demands of minority constituencies become as legitimate as majority constituencies for the sake of consensus-building. Despite what may appear as obvious inequalities in power and the unfairness of the minority's demands, minority interests have to be taken seriously and accommodated by negotiated compromises if necessary. The bias in this dimension of minority politics is that minorities are disproportionately advantaged to enhance egalitarianism. A more pessimistic view is that, in the course of negotiations, minorities will become marginalized (Chetty 1993: 5). Therefore, the task of engaging mechanisms which would serve to formalize thinking and develop discourse around the educational needs of cultural minorities warrants consideration.

With reference to the Indian community, the task of identifying educational needs is complicated by two interrelated factors. First, Indians do not constitute a monolithic entity. In fact, of the four main racially defined population groups, Indians are the most diverse in terms of religion, language, class and political affiliation - especially as they make up a mere 2.6% of the population (Carrim 1993: 5). Furthermore, no one distinct ideological lineage exists which could justify a broad-based community sentiment. In this sense, the prevailing fragmentation of the community serves to reduce its collective input to debate. According to educationist, Dr Morgan Naidoo (1989: 110), the Indian community is unlikely to play a major role in determining educational policy for the future. However, this does not discount the possibility that members of this community are likely to make a contribution as individuals rather than as representatives of their community and in this way contribute to debate.

Second, the Indian community lacks credible leadership that can transcend the numerous factions and build a cohesive unit to participate meaningfully in the determination of its future. Indeed, the issue of who represents the Indian community is a terrain of contestation with implications for education. It is
not yet clear which political interest the majority of Indians subscribe to. Organizations to the left and centre of the political spectrum claim Indian patronage, yet this has not necessarily translated into visible support for them. It could be reasonably argued that no one political organization has been able to effectively consolidate its support base in the Indian community (Carrim 1993:5).

What is clear though, is that "Indian" political parties which participated in the tricameral system generally lacked legitimacy in the community (Docrat 1984:13). This was demonstrated in the 1984 and 1989 elections when voter turnout was 20.3% and 23.2% respectively (Bhamjee 1989:27). The credibility of the HOD's structure was further questioned after the James Commission of Inquiry investigated allegations of irregularity and corruption in Indian education. The findings revealed that mismanagement, nepotism and malpractices existed in Indian education (TASA 1988:1).

Given these complexities, it would be simplistic to assume that the educational needs of the Indian community could be reduced to a single set of agreed-upon realities. Nonetheless, this dissertation contends that it is, at least, possible to identify some clear indicators or broad tendencies in the stance of members of the Indian community towards particular educational issues.

In the final analysis, the principles, values, interests, needs and aspirations of social groups play an important role in determining which educational questions come to be defined as priority areas for investigation and policy-making. If educational policies are to advance the project of transformation in South Africa, they need to be informed by, and grounded in, the conjunctural and structural conditions of civil society - its demographic trends, economic constraints, cultural diversity and politics. This dissertation seeks to address this concern from the perspective of the Indian minority.
1.1.5 Awareness of the problem

The investigator teaches at a secondary school under the HOD education department. Since 1990, this department has admitted limited numbers of pupils from other race groups into its schools. This has resulted in increasing numbers of African pupils gaining admission to Indian schools. From informal discussions with fellow colleagues in the teaching profession, a number of problems in relation to school integration were identified. These include:

* difficulty in maintaining academic standards;
* linguistic problems;
* assisting pupils from disadvantaged or deprived socio-economic backgrounds;
* lack of parental support;
* poor teacher-pupil communication;
* lack of understanding and tolerance for cultural diversity; and
* instances of racial friction between pupils.

In addition, teachers expressed concern at the prospect of working in a multicultural classroom in view of their own inadequacy in the area of mixed schooling. Few have received training in the practicalities of managing cross-cultural situations and many face the idea of open schools with a sense of concern. These problems are exacerbated by the fact that, whereas education authorities have paid much attention to lay down elaborate regulations regarding admission of other race groups to HOD schools, they have provided little assistance to ensure or even aid integration. Integration is a complex process and likely to remain an issue for some time no matter what changes occur.

It is from the aforementioned considerations, together with the fact that Indians will be a minority cultural group in a new dispensation, that the investigator recognized the need to
address key policy issues relevant to the educational needs of the Indian community in a post-apartheid South Africa.

1.2 RESEARCH PROBLEM

In the context of educational policy options proposed for post­apartheid development in South Africa, what are the educational needs of the Indian community? In order to answer this, the following questions need to be addressed:

* What is the current position of Indian education in the wider education system?

* What policy options are proposed for educational reconstruction?

* What are the reactions of the Indian community to the various policy options?

* What is the role of the Indian community in the debate on educational transformation and reconstruction?

1.3 AIMS OF THE INVESTIGATION

The aims of this investigation are:

* To examine the current position of Indian education in the wider education system.

* To review policy options proposed by the major role-players for the reconstruction of the education system.

* To examine and evaluate the efficacy and adequacy of existing policy options.

* To identify the role of the Indian community in the debate on educational change.
* To determine the reactions of the Indian community to the various policy options proposed for post-apartheid educational development.

* To situate the subject of the dissertation, that is, the educational needs of the Indian community, within a theoretical framework derived from the investigation.

* To draw conclusions, make recommendations and suggest themes for further research in the context of the investigation.

1.4 METHOD OF RESEARCH

A study is carried out in order to gain insights into the theme under investigation with a view to making a contribution to policy development in South Africa. The following approaches are used:

1.4.1 Exploratory-descriptive study

The investigation is based on the exploratory-descriptive tradition which is particularly apt for the exploration of a relatively unknown research area or unstudied phenomenon (Mouton & Marais 1990: 43; Seaman 1987: 181).

This mode of research is designed to:

* obtain information about the current status of phenomena;
* gain new insights into phenomena;
* determine the nature of a specific situation as it exists; and
* develop priorities for future research (Mouton & Marais 1990: 43).

The seminal nature of the research implies that it is an initial investigation intended to explore, analyse and describe the educational needs of the Indian community in order to open to
debate its broad implications and significance for policy development in South Africa.

1.4.2 Literature study

The literature study is the main method of research used in the investigation and is undertaken in fulfilment of all the aims stated in paragraph 1.3. Here attention must be given to the particular function of the literature study.

It enables the investigator to:

* determine the extent to which research is developed in the field, as well as what remains to be learned;

* establish the context, nature and significance of the research problem;

* distinguish what is relevant or irrelevant to the study;

* identify different perspectives to the research problem; and

* interpret findings (Seaman & Verhonick 1982 : 87 - 88).

In this way, the literature study will give the investigator the insight he needs to convert his tentative research problem into a detailed, concise plan of action and render the findings of the research more meaningful.

1.4.3 Semi-structured interviews

Since a paucity of information on the educational needs of the Indian community in the current context exists, the literature study was supplemented by means of semi-structured interviews (cf Appendix A). This kind of interview is partially structured by a schedule of open-ended questions to elicit data that informants might not provide spontaneously (Reid & Smith 1981 : 211).
However, the interviewer is free to deviate from the schedule, so long as the material is covered by the conclusion of the interview (Seaman 1987 : 290).

In all, fourteen interviews were held with key informants who were assumed to possess a special knowledge of the educational concerns of the Indian community. Key informants included individuals in the education profession, community professionals in adjunct professions and businessmen drawn exclusively from the Indian community.

1.4.4 Informal group discussions

Three informal group discussions were held with teachers, pupils and parents respectively in order to fulfil the aims stated in paragraph 1.3.

1.5 CHAPTER SUMMARIES

Chapter one is designed to orientate the reader. An introduction to the problem and the aims of the investigation are given. These aspects are situated within the ambit of the research problem. The method of study is also explained.

Chapter two situates the study within the milieu in which it is concerned. This entails an overview of the historical development of Indian education in South Africa. In the second part, six key policy areas are delineated and discussed in a preliminary way.

Chapter three researches extant literature dealing with policy options for post-apartheid educational development in South Africa. Policy proposals of a range of organizations are exposed for discussion, analysis and evaluation.

In chapter four, a study is made of the educational needs of the Indian community. Information collected by means of a literature study, interviews and group discussions are presented according
to certain key themes.

In chapter five, conclusions are drawn and recommendations made in the context of the study. Finally, themes for further research are given.

1.6 DEFINITION OF TERMS

In this dissertation, the following definitions are used:

Black: refers collectively to all South Africans that were classified as Africans, Coloureds and Indians.

Civil society: the realm of public consent.

Conservatives: those who prefer the old established ways of doing things.

General affairs: matters concerning the entire population.

Indian community: South Africa’s Indian community is best seen as a racial group distinguished largely by physical criteria. They comprise various ethnic groups distinguished by cultural criteria (religion, language, customs and ancestry). There are established class divisions and ideological differences among them, but they lack a "class consciousness" - these divisions and differences are cut across by religious, linguistic and other cultural criteria. Therefore the heart of the South African Indian identity is not a specific geographic location, religious tradition, ethnic
belonging or shared language. Rather, it lies in a common racial identity and the inheritance of the heritage of an ancient civilization which originated in the Indian subcontinent and embraces all Indians, whatever their creed, language, ethnic or regional origins.

Moderates: not given to extremes in actions, views or expressions.

Monocultural education: an educational approach designed to accommodate discrete communities that insist on educating their pupils together with children of the same culture.

National states: territories in which black ethnic groupings developed and maintained themselves in autonomous units within their own homeland under apartheid.

New Right: the vision of the "New Right" refers to the monetary and social reforms instituted by Thatcher and Reagan, mainly centred around the radical restructuring of economies as a solution to what is perceived as long-term economic and political crises. The primary aim of the "New Right" policies is to cut the level of individual and collective consumption of the working class by cutting back on the percentage of profits allocated to private wages, trim the public expenditure allocations to social consumption in the fields of
social security, welfare, health and educational provision, and to seek to privatize such services, while, at the same time, making them more amenable to the specific needs of capitalist business.

Own affairs:

matters concerning a race group with regard to the retention of its identity and the upholding of its way of life and culture.

People’s Education:

an educational approach that enables one to understand the evils of the apartheid system and prepares one to participate in a non-racial democracy.

White:

refers collectively to all South Africans that were classified as white.

1.7 SUMMARY

Political developments in South Africa since 2 February 1990 have created conditions which necessitate the formulation of policies for national reconstruction. This also applies to the area of education. The former Nationalist government’s reform initiative in the sphere of education has drawn mixed reactions. This has resulted in greater pressure being placed on the major stakeholders in education to define policy. From an analysis of the ideological debate in education, it is evident that the Indian minority is located on the periphery.

With the limited opening of schools to all races, some of the complexities associated with racial integration have already emerged. In this context, concern is being expressed by minorities of the post-apartheid education dynamics and its implications for meeting the needs of our culturally diverse society.
In the light of these developments, a necessity exists to address the educational needs of the Indian community in relation to policy options put forward for future development.

In this dissertation, the position of Indian education is examined from an historical perspective (chapter two). A literature review of policy options for future educational development is undertaken (chapter three). Information collected from the investigation is presented for discussion, analysis and evaluation (chapter four). Finally, a conclusion of the findings, recommendations for educational provision and themes for further research are given (chapter five).
CHAPTER TWO

AN OVERVIEW OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF INDIAN EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

2.1 INTRODUCTION

An overview of the development of Indian education constitutes the main focus of this chapter. To achieve this, a brief historical analysis of the development of Indian education is provided in order to explain what has brought it to its present state. Second, some key issues which are likely to confront Indians in particular, and all South Africans in general, in the process of educational reconstruction are discussed.

Educational policy without an historically-informed theoretical basis runs the risk of merely perpetuating past practices (Cross 1992: 1). Nkomo (1992: 291), for instance, re-asserts the centrality of historically-informed inquiry in the conceptualization of educational thought:

_The future is embedded in the present as the present bears imprints of the past.... any project designed to contemplate a reconstruction of the future of education in a transformed South Africa must be grounded in a firm understanding of the genesis, evolution and the nature of the current educational arrangement and the crisis it has produced._

Indeed, great projects have failed because they did not take into account the realism informed by the intellectual commands of particular historical and contemporary circumstances (Cross 1992: 1). Only from such an understanding must then issue a clear vision of the sort of educational enterprise that will serve the broad interests of a democratically constituted society.

Although emphasis is placed on the educational development of Indians, the purpose is not to project the Indian community as
a separate entity with problems peculiar to itself, but merely to examine the issues which confront all South Africans from the perspective of this particular minority group.

Four distinct periods can be identified in the development of Indian education. In the first period (1860 - 1948), the dynamics of Indian education is located, initially, within the framework of British colonial expansion in the latter half of the 19th century in Southern Africa and, subsequently, in the policies of successive Union governments in South Africa until 1948. Segregation and inferior educational provision have been common traits in this period, although in hindsight these features seem benign in comparison to their zealous institutionalization after 1948.

The second period (1948 - 1983) coincided with the advent of the Afrikaner Nationalists to power in 1948. By this time, the groundwork for white hegemony was laid and the process of diluting the quality of Indian education had already been set into motion. This state of affairs provided an ideal opportunity to entrench and institutionalize segregated education to an unprecedented degree. Yet, despite the elements of segregation, inequality and repression, major changes and considerable expansion took place in Indian education - these contradictory changes have been as much about repression as reform and are examined briefly.

In the third part (1984 - 1990), state education policy emerged in the wake of the tricameral constitution. It was the revitalization of opposition to the apartheid system, the findings of the HSRC investigation into education, and the pressure from local business and the international community that forced the state to shift in a more progressive direction and remould educational policies towards achieving greater equalization of resources for all race groups. Black education in general, and Indian education in particular, continued to expand and improve in this period.
In the fourth period (1990 onwards), the contemporary position of education in South Africa is highlighted.

The second part of this chapter draws into focus key educational policy issues confronting the Indian community at this juncture. Six policy areas are delineated and discussed in a preliminary way. It should be stressed that this part of the chapter is not intended to provide definitive answers. It merely raises issues of concern and provides a framework for discourse in chapter three.

2.2 HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF INDIAN EDUCATION

2.2.1 First period: emergence of policy (1860 - 1948)

From the earliest days of schooling for Indian children, it is safe to assume that the primary concern of the British Colony of Natal during the latter half of the 19th century was that the indentured Indian should serve the purpose for which they were brought, that is, to provide manual labour. Initially, no provision was made for the education of children of indentured labourers in terms of indenture entered into by the contracting parties - the government of India, the British government and the colonial government of Natal (NITS 1950 : 9).

It was white missionary initiative that triggered the establishment of the first schools for Indians and sustained the development of Indian education in the decades that followed (Behr 1984 : 233). With this development, the colonists presumably hoped that Indian children, given a menial education, would be easily pressed into positions of servility and become efficient and pliant labourers. For a time, schools did help to make useful servants of them by teaching them the basics of their new master's language and providing them with a limited vocabulary that would be relevant to their role in the colonial order.
The role played by missionaries in the development of Indian education is controversial. Traditionalists take the view that the missions (Methodist, Anglicans and Roman Catholic) came to the rescue of the Indian people by establishing schools for the children of these new settlers (Behr 1984: 262; Henning 1989: 27; Kuppusami & Pillay 1978: 15). In 1915, there were 35 Indian schools in Natal of which only 4 were state schools. The remaining 31 schools were either established or supported by the missions (Henning 1989: 27).

Molteno (1984: 50 - 54), on the other hand, in examining the role played by missionaries in education during the late 19th century in Southern Africa, reveals the ambivalent nature of their task. Though the missionaries did not always share the interests which were paramount for the colonists, their efforts in providing schools contributed to weakening the "non-European" resistance to colonization and helped to establish them, once conquered, in their new place of subordination. Molteno (1984:54) further explains that the missionaries came to Southern Africa to preach the gospel and to dispel the darkness of the "heathen", but they taught elements of the same culture to which the white trader, magistrate, colonial official and farmer belonged.

These arguments, however, do not seek to underplay the significance or the good intentions of individuals who promoted the development of Indian education during the pioneer years, and it is not the intention of this dissertation to imply that the provision of education simply and unproblematically benefited the colonizer at all times with no cost involved. Rather, the intention is to demonstrate that schools were controlled by the colonizers and thus played an important role as reproductive mechanisms of assimilation in the colonial context.

The British Colonial Government of Natal established an Indian Immigration School Board in 1878 to undertake the responsibility of promoting Indian education. However, the effect was two-fold. First, by providing an inadequate and yet costly education, it
denied a significant proportion of the children of indentured labourers a decent education. And second, schooling became a key factor in the creation of an "elite" within the Indian community. For example, in 1877, Laws 15 and 16 were passed to promote primary and secondary education among Europeans in Natal. Indian children who conformed to the dress and habits of Europeans were allowed to attend European schools, and a few did. However, by 1905, this privilege was withdrawn and the foundations of segregated education were thus laid (Behr 1984 : 262).

So serious was the crisis in Indian education, that Indian resistance to schooling, primarily in the form of outright rejection or avoidance, was considerable throughout the 19th century. It has been estimated that about 1 581 children out of a population of well over 10 000 in 1894 were attending school (TASA 1985 : 5). As long as Indians were denied access to participate fully in the colonial economy, they perceived little benefit to be derived from schooling, and, at the same time, resisted sacrificing their children's labour.

The first decade of the 20th century then, was one of much difficulty and, like the closing years of the previous one, was characterized by a policy of hostility towards Indian immigration, settlement and progress. Nevertheless, a start had been made and the number of schools and pupils as well as state expenditure increased gradually.

Indian education, as carried out by the missionaries, became increasingly under the control of the government because Indians were affecting the economic and political life of the country. Molteno (1984 : 61) adds that black education in the first decade of the 20th century should be seen as part of a process whereby workers could be made, at least, minimally amenable to wage labour and increasingly tractable to the new demands of the workplace.
However, as in the case of other dispossessed groups in South Africa, while state policy may have limited the capacity of schooling to affect the individual's material prospects, it would appear to have provided, at least, a leadership element with certain linguistic and other cultural accoutrements useful in articulating the general grievances and demands of the people. Education exposed Indians to new and broader horizons and revealed to them what was wrong with the place to which they were subjected in society. For the first time in South Africa, the Indian voice was mobilized, articulated and heard. Individuals like Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi emerged, as well as lesser known leaders who spoke their minds, resisted, pleaded for redress, countered prejudices and planned strategies to defend as well as extend Indian rights (Bhana & Pachai 1984:75).

Mahatma Gandhi, as he is popularly known, was a London-based barrister who came to Natal in 1893 to practise law. After a few bitter experiences because he was Indian, he felt compelled to champion the struggle of the Indians in a movement of protest. Gandhi launched his passive resistance (satyagraha) campaign to secure greater political rights for Indians in South Africa in terms of immigration, trading rights, freedom of movement and residential rights (NITS 1950:20).

The demonstrations of civil disobedience led by Gandhi did much to publicize the cause of South African Indians and caused considerable tension between the government of India and the various governments of Transvaal and Natal from 1907 onwards. The subsequent jailing of Gandhi and many of his followers after his protest march across the Natal-Transvaal border with large numbers of women, children, striking miners and white sympathizers in 1913 culminated in a compromise agreement between Gandhi and Smuts in 1914 (NIC 1984:4).

Though the Gandhi-Smuts agreement of 1914 removed some restrictions against Indians, it was no more than a "breathing space" from which greater freedom had to flow (Bhana & Pachai 1984:111).
In education, there was little improvement in the facilities for Indians when union came in 1910. Nothing was done to implement the recommendations of a commission appointed in 1909 which drew attention to the disabilities under which the Indians of Natal were placed as regards education (Behr & MacMillan 1966 : 326). Within the provincial context, Indians attended segregated and under-funded schools, often run under a different set of regulations from white schools. The situation was made worse with the rapid growth of the Indian school population, from 9 155 in 1910 to 29 168 in 1941, which outstripped the growth of funds (Malherbe 1977 : 235). As a result, Indian education remained in a state of crisis.

In 1927, the poor state of Indian education prompted the government of India to negotiate with the South African government for better educational facilities for Indians.

The outcome was the Cape Town Agreement of 1927 between the Union government and the government of India. The Union government made a decisive shift when it agreed in principle, inter alia, that in the provision of education and other facilities, "the considerable number of Indians who remain part of the permanent population would not be allowed to lag behind other sections of the community" (Andrews 1927 : 345).

The issue of whether state policy towards Indian education was simply unconcern or deliberate was raised by historian, Hassim Seedat (1987 : 12), who drew the conclusion that it was the state which left, at least, two generations of the majority of Indian youth disadvantaged and threw them into the cheap labour market where their fathers were. Evidence to support this claim was produced as early as 1928 by Kailas Kichlu, an educationist from India, who had been sent by his government to assist in the Indian Education Inquiry Commission appointed after the Cape Town Agreement of 1927. Kichlu (1928 : 6), in a memorandum disclosed that, "so far from Indian education having been a burden on the finances of the province of Natal, the province was benefiting
Owing to the inability of the Natal Provincial Administration to meet its financial obligations to Indian education, and the resultant endemic shortage of school accommodation, gave rise to Indian initiative in providing for the educational upliftment of their children. It became general practice for the Indian community to erect school buildings on the strength of its own resources. In order to encourage this enterprise, the Natal Provincial Administration made a grant towards the cost of buildings which amounted to one third of the cost of erection. In 1943, this building grant was raised to 50% of the cost of erection (Ireland 1975 : 7). So eager were they for education that the number of schools built by the Indian community soon exceeded the numbers of mission and state schools. For example, by 1941, there were 17 state schools in comparison to 98 state-aided schools for Indians (Palmer 1957 : 106). This pattern of local community support for education, a unique feature of South African education, continued well into the 20th century, with money for sites and buildings coming largely from Indians themselves.

The progress made by the Indian community in the field of education prompted a well-known educationist, Malherbe (1978:v), to remark:

*... qualitatively it [Indian education] is further advanced than that of any other group in South Africa, apart from that of Whites ... it is not the result of their [Indian] education being in any way favoured by the government ... Indians have made considerable sacrifices ...*

In the second period (1948 - 1983), the advent of the National Party to power effectuated a major transformation of education policy and resulted in a determination to gain control over all educational institutions for blacks. Indian education was
subjected to both repressive as well as reformist elements during this period.

2.2.2 Second period: periodization of policy (1948 - 1983)

The establishment of Bantu, Coloured and Indian education after 1948 has generally been seen as embodying an entirely new policy to black schooling. Such an interpretation is misleading. First of all, it involves a distorted notion of the nature of schooling for blacks prior to the introduction of Bantu, Coloured and Indian education and overlooks what the National Party carried into black education from the education system it inherited from its predecessors. According to Rhoodie (1969 : 45), segregated systems were mere stages in the evolution of apartheid, the precursors of a synthesis of principles which only after 1948 crystallized into a comprehensively defined national policy for blacks.

Nonetheless, the National Party victory in 1948 launched an extraordinary determination to gain firm control over all educational institutions for blacks and to implement its Christian National Education principles formulated in 1939, thus giving concrete meaning to the Afrikaner ideology of white supremacy. CNE was refined as the ideological framework determining the education system for everyone. The two defining terms "Christian" and "National" took on very specific meanings. "Christian" was assumed as an opaque "spirit" founded on biblical instruction and operating within the realm of an unacknowledged western mode which was perceived as universal. "National" elevated the concept of ethnic and cultural identity in terms of racial division delineated by the ruling party, with the destiny of the Afrikaner nation seen as paramount. Nationhood, in fact, referred to the cultural heritage and ideologized version of history of the ruling party, whose task it was to define everyone else's nationhood (King 1992 : 2).
To give practical meaning to the principles, a more definitive statement referred to as "belied" was tabled in Parliament in 1948 and led, in 1950, to the appointment of the Eiselen Commission which formulated specific educational policies in the form of Bantu, Coloured and Indian education.

The promulgation of the Bantu Education Act of 1953, the Coloured Persons Education Act of 1963 and the Indian Education Act of 1965 provided four separate, hierarchically different schooling systems: "Bantu", "Coloured", "Indian" and "White" education. In sum, the aforementioned acts provided for the effective transfer of black education from the provincial authorities and missions to the respective ethnic departments of Native, Coloured and Indian Affairs (Act no. 47 of 1953; Act no. 47 of 1963; Act no. 65 of 1965).

With the passage of these acts, a major transformation of education was effectuated catapulting "laissez-faire" racial segregation into a systematic racial ideology that left no aspect of life untouched. Although the system of Bantu, Coloured and Indian education certainly perpetuated and extended the inferiority of previous black schooling, it was never intended as a simple denial of educational opportunities, but represented an attempt to allow for the political, social and economic development of different people in their own characteristic way.

The guiding principle of apartheid education policy came with a speech in the senate by the Minister of Native Affairs, Dr Verwoerd, on 7 June 1954. With specific reference to Bantu education, he explained that the intention was that it should have its roots entirely in the "Native areas" and in the "Native environment" and in the "Native community". The "Bantu" was to be guided to assist his/her community in all respects:
... it is of no avail for him to receive a training which has as its aim absorption in the European community .... Until now he has been subjected to a school system which drew him away from his own community and misled him by showing him the green pastures of European society in which he was not allowed to graze (Senate debates 1954: 2595 - 1622).

Nkomo (1992: 295) contends that although no such specific reference was made of Indians and Coloureds, it could safely be assumed, given South Africa’s racial system, their role and position was defined in similar terms, as can be evidenced in their concentrations in particular occupations.


Of particular significance was the unfair burden which the government placed on the "non-white" people, that is, the burden of providing for the education of their children. Out of the 281 Indian schools in Natal in 1966, only 51 were built by the education authorities on its own; 230 were built by the Indian community on a rand-for-rand basis. This dire economic sacrifice fell on a community whose per capita income in 1960 was R147, as compared with R925 for whites, who were not called upon to make additional contributions for the education of their children (Reddy 1991: 233).

Without exception, at all levels, the overwhelming bias in favour of the white group was maintained.

In the subsequent period (1965 to 1983), a clear periodization of policy initiatives with regard to Indian education is evident. From 1948 to 1965, a major feature was the repressionist strategies of the state, resulting in increasing inequalities in educational provision between blacks and whites, as discussed
earlier. The period after the passage of the Indian Education Act of 1965 was dominated largely by the reformist elements of state policy, that is, the expansion of schooling, administrative growth and the narrowing of differentials between the Indian and the white child. The National Party came to realize that the black nationalist movement was in the process of consolidating itself in the 1960s and to merely continue the repression of revolts and the suppression of political organizations could not, in the long run, suffice to save the segregationist structures of domination. It was in response to this condition that a new strategy for education began to take shape.

The takeover of Indian education by the Department of Indian Affairs saw the beginning of a new era of growth in the provision of education for Indians. Some of these developments included: free schooling up to matric; compulsory education between the ages of 7 and 15 years; rapid increase in per capita expenditure from R81 in 1969 to R871 in 1983; acceleration of school building programmes; provision of special education; and upgrading of teaching corps (Vos & Brits 1990: 112; Samuels 1985: 12; Naidoo 1989: 109).

While not wishing to diminish the significance of what has been put forward so far, it can be argued that the development of Bantu education in the 1950s, and the subsequent development of Coloured and Indian education in the 1960s, was part of a broader state policy to make education an essential mechanism for the reproduction of the social order.

Levy (1991: 14) states that the ethnic education acts were aimed, first, at the expansion of black education, but only to the levels necessary to meet labour requirements and, second, at the restructuring of the context of education in order to inculcate the values of CNE, thus socializing blacks to accept their subordination within the apartheid system.
In contrast, there is also the view that under apartheid blacks could develop in their "own areas" which they controlled. According to this view, the aim of apartheid was not so much to keep blacks in a subordinate position, but rather to encourage them to develop separately. From experience, it could be concluded that the idea of separate development proved impossible to achieve.

In the third period (1984 - 1990), Indian education continued to improve both quantitatively and qualitatively. However, the new tricameral arrangement was criticized by the Indian community as a major means of reinforcing apartheid education.

2.2.3 Third period: changing aspects of reformism (1984 - 1990)

Despite elements of segregation, inequality and authoritarianism which characterized Indian education, the expansion in the previous period had elements of reformism. Nevertheless, the specific conditions of white domination which enabled Indian education in particular, and black education in general, to play a predominantly reproductive role began to be eroded from the late 1970s onwards. It was the revitalization of opposition to the apartheid system in the wake of the implementation of the tricameral arrangement that posed a growing threat to the state in this period. The culminating challenge since the 1976 Soweto riots forced a renegotiation of the terms of the 1950s and 1960s educational settlement.

Throughout the 1980s, there was increasing pressure for reform, coming mainly from three sources. First, the international community was vociferous in its condemnation of apartheid and placed pressure on the South African government to change its policies. Second, the private business sector was critical of apartheid education and its inability to prepare the youth for a technologically advanced society. However, the most powerful challenge to the state came from the African, Coloured and Indian communities who were no longer prepared to accept discriminatory
practices. Given this pressure for reform, the state was compelled to review and reformulate its educational policies in order to make it more acceptable, at least, to sections of South Africans and also to the international community.

It should be noted that throughout the 1980s, differing policies in education, whether advanced by the government, private sector, or the national liberation movement, were premised upon the presupposition that education served to maintain the existing order or it was a mechanism for its transformation. Since, from this viewpoint, educational change was held to be the route to social change, it was necessary to ensure equal access to educational opportunity which, in turn, would provide a means of entry into skilled, well-paid and high status employment. Since equality in education can be sought and obtained, if gradually, within the existing social system, so it was said, the reform of this system can be engineered through the reform of education (Wolpe & Unterhalter 1991 : 8). In the 1980s, this view was pervasive in corporate thinking and was the key component of reformism as it emerged from the HSRC investigation into education in 1980-1981. This report gave support to, and was supported by, reformist elements within the government.

The HSRC (1981 : 33) recommended the following guiding principle to serve education in the De Lange Report:

*Equal opportunities for education, including equal standards in education, for every inhabitant, irrespective of race, colour, creed or sex, shall be the purposeful endeavour of the state.*

The government's response to the De Lange Report came in the form of the White Paper of 1983. In this, for the first time in the history of South Africa, the basic principle of equality of opportunity was accepted formally by the state, but subject to the maintenance of certain guiding principles, chief among which were that each population group was to have its own schools and
its own education authorities (South Africa 1983: 6). While the
government reaffirmed segregated education based on race, it made
an important shift in thinking. Whereas it previously stood for
"separate and unequal" in 1948, it now stood for "separate but
equal".

Despite dissatisfaction, the state went on to implement the
policy of "own" and "general" affairs in terms of the RSA
Constitution Act no. 110 of 1983. Education at all levels, where
it related solely to a specific group, was defined as an "own
affair" of the population group concerned and should take place
within the context of the particular group's own culture and
frame of reference. Matters which were not "own affairs" of a
population group were considered to be "general affairs".

In keeping with this policy, the government increased spending
on Indian education from R122,7 million in 1980 to R463,2 million
in 1988. The per capita expenditure on the Indian child increased
from R318 in 1980 to R1 980 in 1988. The corresponding figures
for the white child, however, were R1 021 to R3 982 and for the
African child, R87 to R582 during the same period (SAIRR 1989:
823). While these figures reveal a narrowing of differentials
between Indian and white, the goal of equality of provision for
all population groups was clearly not achieved.

Hartshorne (1992a: 336) believes that government policy in the
mid-1980s attempted to achieve two conflicting and ultimately
irreconcilable objectives typified in the terms "general affairs"
and "own affairs" and in the slogan "separate but equal". On the
one hand, to maintain its conservative support base the govern-
ment reinforced the segregated, ethnic nature of the education
system. On the other hand, to seek compromise with its oppo-
nents, it introduced the idea of "general affairs" and set up a
Department of National Education. The outcome of this was an
inherent instability in the education system and the emergence
of alternative education practices.
People's Education developed in the mid-1980s as a response to the liberation movement's overarching demand for a new education system. Apartheid education was seen as a form of social control and the struggle to implement People's Education contested that control in its attempts to transform education. The demands of the NECC's resolution on People's Education still stand and have been reiterated in resolutions at numerous conferences (NECC 1986:2):

*People's Education is an education that allows students, parents, teachers and workers to be mobilized into appropriate organizational structures which enable them to participate actively in the initiation and management of People's Education in all its forms.*

As discussed earlier, People's Education, in the course of time, lost its positive drive and reduced itself to a sort of negative movement which became synonymous with school boycotts, violence and high drop-out rates. The African student became the most vocal and militant sector of the progressive education movement in its battle to end apartheid. School boycotts in the townships were transformed into a leading sector of the national political struggle. Boycotts, stayaways and protests spread throughout 1985 and 1986 in proportions alarming to the international community. The state's response was to impose a state of emergency in 1985 (Zille 1987:4).

Throughout the 1980s, the Indian community expressed opposition to separate, inferior education and dissatisfaction with the administration of Indian education by the SAIC and later the HOD. This opposition was often expressed in the Gandhian tradition of passive resistance. The main thrust of opposition to apartheid education came from TASA, a body composed of teachers in Indian schools.

Controversy arose between TASA and the education authorities over: the black-listing of teachers; the dismissal of teachers; the promotion of teachers; and political interference into the
day-to-day matters of education (TASA 1984 : 1).

In 1984, TASA called for a judicial inquiry into alleged malpractices in Indian education. This call was repeated from time to time. In 1988, the James Commission of Inquiry, which was established to investigate allegations of irregularities in the administration of education, revealed that victimization and abuse of authority was rife in Indian education (TASA 1988 : 1).

The 1984 - 1990 period demonstrated that the legitimacy of Bantu, Coloured and Indian education was questionable. Most interest groups realized that changes in education would have to be part of a total social transformation. Oppositional forces also came to the realization that they would not be able to replace state authority with that of their own. The result was a stalemate in which neither the state nor the liberation movement were able to establish legitimate authority (Hartshorne 1992b : 6).

In the fourth period (1990 onwards), these and other developments compelled the state to take heed of the aspirations of the majority and to redirect attention into areas where it was most needed.

2.2.4 Fourth period : transitional context (1990 onwards)

The feature of the education terrain altered dramatically after 2 February 1990 as the process of repressive reformism, reminiscent of the Botharian era, was displaced by negotiations. In these conditions, the task of framing specific policies, previously neglected by the democratic movement, in all areas including education, which would spell the demise of apartheid and lead to the reconstruction of a new society, became a matter of urgency (Wolpe 1991b : 1).

According to Gerwel (1992 : 3), the imperatives of the negotiation process has had the effect of channeling the struggle to dismantle apartheid into the very institutions which constitute
the system. The goal of a rapid and total displacement of the existing institutions by a new, radically different social order has, of necessity, given way to a negotiated form of the separate education institutions from within (Gerwel 1992 : 3).

Discussions around the reconstruction of the education system tend to focus on two aspects: the elaboration of new policy to guide development in the medium- to long-term and the schools crisis in black communities in the short-term. Whatever the focus, three major obstacles face the new Government of National Unity: the backlogs to be addressed in terms of resources; the schools crisis; and the level of organization and relationships among the major stakeholders in education.

The present debate in education is about finding ways and means of moving from an apartheid education system to a transformed one that will not only be fair and just to all, but also redress the inequalities of the past.

The lack of legitimacy of the apartheid education structure has led to virtually every aspect of education being questioned and challenged.

Parents are demanding the right to participate meaningfully in the education of their children both in terms of the management of the system and the content of education.

The position of black teachers reflects more acutely the malaise which exists in the broader education system. Protests, strikes and chalkdowns have limited the possibility of establishing a working relationship between education authorities and teacher bodies - so vital for the successful management of the education system.

Overall, black schools have become sites of struggle where apartheid ideology has been challenged, where unintended consequences have set in, and, more significantly, a dialectical
process that has produced a critical consciousness has undermined the apartheid curriculum (Nkomo 1992 : 296).

2.2.5 Appraisal

From the foregoing analysis, it is evident that Indian education, as it has come to exist, emerged from a unique socio-historical and cultural context. The institutionalization of racial segregation in the first half of the 20th century, though it represents a turning point in the South African political process, cannot be isolated from the 19th century colonial legacy and culture of racism. The 19th century intellectual tradition and the ideas promoted by the Victorian civilizing mission created the environment for the development of a colonial culture dominated by racial prejudice (Cross 1992 : 135). This applied equally to the area of education.

The education system throughout the Union was fragmented in its structures and curricula into four separate, hierarchically different schooling systems. Bantu, Coloured and Indian education which, in parallel to White education, were apparently products of successive education acts published during the 1950s and 1960s, had in reality taken shape many years before.

Indians, like Africans and Coloureds, were segregated in order to minimize the potential threat they represented for the white working-class in the labour market and to conform to the patterns and needs of monopoly capital. Tactics of co-option were adopted to silence their growing resistance and this led to class polarization - a feature which continues to divide the Indian community as well as other communities.

While racial oppression was able to marginalize and channel some of the disenfranchised into the reserves of cheap and unskilled labour, it only served to stir the Indian to greater efforts in their educational endeavours. With vision and foresight, they made self-sacrifices in their quest to provide a decent education
for their children. The endemic shortage of resources gave rise to Indian initiative in providing education - regarded as one of the finest examples of self-help to an extent unparalleled in South African educational history (Malherbe 1977: 239). Despite considerable political and economic handicaps deliberately imposed by hostile governments, Indians managed to forge ahead by taking advantage of every opportunity to acquire education. This pattern of local community support for education continued well into the 20th century, with money for education coming from Indians themselves.

Although the material circumstances of Indian education improved considerably in the 1980s, apartheid education structures were consistently rejected by the community. In the present context, a major challenge confronting the various education departments is to transform themselves from apartheid structures to effective and efficient democratic structures. The establishment of a legitimate education authority is sine qua non to placing education on a sound footing.

The preceding section provided an historical overview of the development of Indian education. The aim was to provide a general background to the present context of the analysis of education.

In the following section, key policy issues are highlighted and commented on in a preliminary way. Six policy areas: transformation; governance; finance; curriculum; integration; and language are identified. This part is not intended to provide definitive solutions. It merely outlines a policy framework for critical discourse - to be utilized in chapter three. If the issues discussed provoke debate, dialogue or dissent, then the spirit of critical research would have been captured.
2.3 KEY POLICY ISSUES CONFRONTING THE INDIAN COMMUNITY IN SOUTH AFRICA

2.3.1 Transformation

2.3.1.1 Education system change

Before fundamental change of any system is undertaken, it is essential to have an understanding of the existing system: why it is as it is; what drives it; how it works; who makes decisions; what capacity for change lies within it; and so on.

In the words of Margaret Archer (1985: 3):

Once a given form of education exists, it exerts an influence on future educational change. Alternative education plans are, to some extent, reactions to it .... and change means dismantling, transforming, or in some way grappling with it.

Decisions have to be taken as to what parts of the present system can be used, what structures should continue, what human resources will still be needed, as well as what will have to be replaced immediately and what will have to be changed over a period of time. The notion of an immediate replacement of the existing system with a new, ideal one is false. The existing structures and vested interests, material constraints, the interplay of competing ideologies and the very process of negotiations will produce compromises between ideals and reality (Hofmeyr & Buckland 1992a: 19).

A key issue in any discussion on transformation in education is: how do education systems change?
2.3.1.2 Theory of education system change

Margaret Archer, a macro-sociologist, has undertaken a comparative investigation of education systems from which she has generated a theory of education system change. In Archer's terms, three issues are central to the process of education system change. These are: the emergence of a state system; the penetrability of the political centre; and the extent of centralization and decentralization in education (Archer 1979: 616).

a. Emergence of a state system

State systems develop as a result of two processes: substitution (replacing the supply of educational facilities which the dominant group has monopolized by new ones) and restriction (removing some of the facilities owned by the dominant group or preventing it from supplying these resources to education) (Archer 1984: 19).

b. Penetrability of the political centre

Archer (1979: 278) claims that patterns of educational change vary, depending on the nature of the polity controlling a centralized system. She distinguishes between three types of polity: impenetrable, semi-permeable and politically accessible. These are differentiated by the degree of political closure.

c. Centralization and decentralization

The main structural difference between education systems is the extent to which they are centralized or decentralized over time. Centralized and decentralized systems remain very different structurally, although a progressive segmentation and systematization develops side by side after the initial emergence of each type of system (Archer 1984: 20).
d. **Interest groups in education**

Archer (1979: 660) distinguishes between three broad interest groups in education: political elites, professional interests and external interest groups. The negotiating strength of these interest groups is influenced by their control over the key resources of power, wealth and expertise, their structured interests, organizational capacity, and ideology. Such negotiation can take the form of "political manipulation", whereby interest groups bring pressure on the political authorities, "external transactions", whereby external interest groups transact with the profession for additional resources, or "internal initiation", which involves the initiation of change by members of the teaching profession (Archer 1985: 67).

Consequently, Archer (1984: 2) states:

*Education is rarely, if ever, the practical realization of an ideal form of instruction as envisaged by a particular group. Instead, most of the time, most of the form education takes are the political products of power struggles. They bear the marks of concessions to allies and compromises with opponents.*

Archer's basic theory about education system change can be applied to South Africa.

2.3.1.3 **Education system change in South Africa**

If Archer's propositions about the nature of the political centre are applied to South African education, then it is clear that after the National Party acceded to power, the polity was impenetrable. The National Party imposed separate state systems of education on all race groups in terms of its policy of apartheid. Separate state systems of education were introduced for the African (1953), Coloured (1963) and Indian (1965) populations (Nkomo 1992: 310).
After the 1976 Soweto uprising, the polity became semi-penetrable. Government began to develop internal divisions and to succumb partially to pressures both internally and externally. The liberal universities and private schools expressed opposition to government policies and protected their autonomy against government's encroachment. As the impetus in black communities for participation and control over their education has grown, the locus of power has steadily shifted to these communities and effective government authority has broken down in many areas, particularly in African urban education (Hofmeyr & Buckland 1992b: 10).

A more accessible political centre in South Africa has developed since 27 April 1994. The new government retains the power to act but both its supporters and opponents have access to central policy-makers and can convey educational demands. The negotiating strength of key stakeholders in education will be crucial to the establishment of a new system of education.

To understand the dynamics of educational change, some perspective on the nature and politics of the bureaucracy is needed.

2.3.1.4 Bureaucratic change

A characteristic feature of the bureaucracy is that it is composed along ethnic lines, poorly co-ordinated and split by different political leanings (McLennan 1992: 3). In general, the education bureaucracy is characterized by a similar complexity, fragmentation and composition to that of the broader public service.

The white education department is most conservative, partly because it is subject to pressure group action from the Broederbond, white teacher bodies and parental organizations. Other departments such as the HOD have adopted a proactive approach to managing the transition. This seems to take two forms. First, there is an attempt to make the department effective, efficient
and politically neutral. Second, high-ranking bureaucrats improve their credibility by projecting a progressive and forward-looking policy outlook. This involves undertaking projects to deracialize the education department.

Meaningful bureaucratic change can only be considered in the light of a larger organizational change which has structural and systemic consequences. It is important to maintain a holistic, continuous process of change which occurs in tandem with shifts in the broader political, social and economic context (McLennan 1992: 4).

Fundamental changes within the education system pose particular challenges for the Indian community.

2.3.1.5 Transitional challenges for the Indian community

There is a notable concern among some cultural minorities in South Africa, including the Indian community, about the transition and the inherent fear of marginalization from the broader socio-political process. No doubt, the extent to which specific minority concerns will be addressed in a new education dispensation will depend critically on their ability to find the most effective point of influence in policy networks. This could take the form of pressure groups (lobbies) in large political organizations or simply adopting a "go it alone" approach.

As far as the Indian community is concerned, the contemporary situation is too fluid and complex to arrive at clear-cut conclusions about how Indians perceive the transformation in education. In addition, as discussed earlier, the Indian community does not constitute a homogeneous mass, unfractured by class, gender, religion and ideology. Neither do all members of the Indian community subscribe to an identical vision of a post-apartheid education system. As with other population groups, it is important to guard against the notion of a cohesive, monolithic Indian community.
To understand the sense in which Indians constitute a "community", it is necessary to come to terms with both the nature of the similarities and differences of groups within the community and how these change in different circumstances. It is only against the background of the history of Indians in this country, their complex composition, and their structural position in South African society, that their needs in education and their potential role in a post-apartheid education system can be located.

Although the Indian community does not have a single, unifying policy position in education, some common points of broad consensus exists. These include: concerns consistent with the minority syndrome; the desire to preserve cultural, religious and language rights in schools; fears of instability and violence; adverse effects of affirmative action; and redistributive education policies.

The dominant features of transformation are uncertainty and the ever possible danger that only certain groups within the population may benefit. Broad participation in the change process is desirable not only on the grounds of democracy, but for policies to be legitimated, it is essential that all those affected by it know why and how particular choices are made.

Intrinsically related to the issue of transformation of the education system is that of governance or control of education.

2.3.2 Education governance

2.3.2.1 Apartheid context

The apartheid system of education can best be described as a system of systems, linked together not by any broad educational vision, but rather by the structure and ideology of apartheid. While there has been a proliferation of structures from the regional level upwards, there are virtually no district level
structures of education governance. In black schools too, at local level, there are virtually no real decision-making structures. School-level structures are typically parent-teacher associations whose powers are advisory and whose activities centre around fund-raising.

Clearly, a fundamental issue for the governance debate is the question of legitimacy.

2.3.2.2  Legitimacy

When a system falls short of public expectations, it loses its recognition-worthiness; it loses the faith of the citizens in the ability of the entire system - the administrators, the planners, the politicians, indeed, the existing government and the party that serves it as a whole - to serve the common good (Muller 1992: 10 - 11).

Education must be receptive to the needs of its users. This requires that the system makes provision for various interest groups to be mobilized into appropriate organizational structures to facilitate participation in decision-making structures at all levels.

The parent community is, and must be, a key role-player in the governance process. Parents must be free to determine the type of educational service they desire. Apartheid ensured that parental choice was curtailed.

The educator plays a leading role in the educative process. It is increasingly being realized that the success of the education system ultimately depends on what happens in the classroom. To be effective, educators need to be given a degree of autonomy and influence in decision-making structures.

The role of the state as provider, manager and presenter of education is one most open to controversy in South Africa. The
state has a central role to play in the governance of education. This does not mean, however, that every aspect of education must be bureaucratically decided by some government department or the other. Within the framework of the state's role, there can be a great deal of freedom to plan, administer and manage education. Business, religious, labour and academic organizations should also be included in the governance process. Ideally, the democratization of education can best be achieved by creating a balance between the role of the state and other interests.

The creation of legitimate education governance structures based on a partnership between the state and other interest groups, and not on the co-option of these groups which render them powerless to influence decisions, is vital for the success of the future education system.

Another important issue in the governance debate is the question of centralization or decentralization of the education system.

2.3.2.3 Centralization versus decentralization

An issue frequently debated in the governance of education is whether the system should be centralized or decentralized. In reality, this dichotomy is not particularly helpful because most systems are a mixture of both. Nevertheless, the literature reveals a complex picture of the benefits and problems associated with both centralization and decentralization of the education system.
The debate itself is confused by the different meanings attached to these terms. Winkler (1989: 4) provides a working definition of centralization and decentralization to ground discussion on the issue:

*Centralization-decentralization can be viewed as a spectrum ranging from a unitary governmental system where the central government has most power or decision-making authority to a governmental system where local governments and community organizations exercise large amounts of power.*

Weiler (1990: 20) outlines standardization, equity and efficiency as three benefits of centralized control. Lauglo and McLean (1985: 31) add that centralized control is necessary for modernization and nation-building; while Cummings (1991: 11) contends that calls for centralized control stem from three impulses: national competitiveness, social stability and equality of access.

In a comprehensive review of arguments, Rondinelli (1987: 66) points to four criticisms of centralized control: a tendency to focus on macro-issues; lack of political accountability; a perception of entitlement to service; and stifling creativity.

Ironically, much of the rationale for decentralization point to the same arguments of efficiency and equity, but draw also on a cluster of often more philosophical or political considerations. Lauglo and McLean (1985: 50) identify three benefits of decentralization: administrative (the slow nature of centralized administration as opposed to innovative potential of local control); political (diffusion of conflict); and ideological (sensitivity to variance).
While the characterization of education systems as centralized or decentralized may be useful in theoretical analysis, in practice, the issue is not clear-cut. Levy (1966: 34) remarks:

*All societies are combinations of centralized and decentralized structures of action. The question is not whether a system should be centralized or decentralized, but which policy issue should be controlled at the centre and which issues are more effectively determined at other levels in the system.*

Thus the key issue for government is the optimal distribution of power and functions to the different levels in the system.

Other significant issues in the governance debate include: the tension between representative and participatory forms of democracy; the extent and nature of community control of schooling; the nature of the education bureaucracy; the influence of the broader constitution on education governance and the question of capacity-building, since it is clear that transformation of the current system of governance into a more accountable and legitimate one is not possible without the commitment of substantial resources to building capacity at the school, local and regional levels (NEPI 1993: 165 - 166).

Given these policy concerns, the Indian minority is confronted with particular challenges.

### 2.3.2.4 Implications for the Indian community

Given the increasing pluralization of South African society, it cannot be assumed that school bodies at local level in HOD schools will remain Indian or share, more or less, the same vision of a post-apartheid education system. On the other hand, given the socio-economic disparities between the different race groups, it can be argued that school communities in the formerly Indian residential areas will, for example, remain predominantly
Indian, at least, in the short-term.

What is clear is that the most effective way to arrive at an acceptable system of education governance would be to widen participation by shifting decision-making into the public domain where such processes can be subjected to contestation by civil society.

A task facing decision-makers is to work out mechanisms of democratic governance that would be able to address legitimate minority concerns without obfuscating the aspirations of the majority. In this context, the emphasis on participation, though often stated as a matter of principle, needs to be made clearer. Religious, cultural and language rights in education as well as rights of minority participation (commonly accepted in countries like Canada) need to be specified and activated through an educational Bill of Rights or Education Charter (Chetty 1993: 41). In terms of internationally acceptable norms, policy-makers should at various points in the policy process be compelled to open their activities to various constituencies, including cultural minorities.

A reconceptualization of the notion of control is necessary in order to begin to address the issue of democratizing the governance of schools.

This section did not attempt to articulate a model of governance for a new education system, but merely highlighted critical issues that need to be considered in arriving at such a model.

Another issue fundamental to educational reconstruction is that of financing education. Indeed, financial resources are the life-blood of the education system.
2.3.3 Finance

2.3.3.1 Apartheid legacy

In South Africa, education has been funded mainly by the government although the pattern of educational financing has been characterized by racial inequalities in terms of access to, and survival within, the education system, teacher quality and quantity, and the range of educational facilities available. In fact, the whole system is perpetuated with inequalities, so that whatever educational indicator is used, there is a hierarchy of provision and resources in which white children fare the best and blacks the worst. The development of a transformed education financing policy must consider the issues which are likely to act in determining the nature of the new education system.

Some of these issues are discussed below.

2.3.3.2 Economic realism

Pedagogic and didactic standards that may be envisaged for a new education dispensation in South Africa will not be easy to maintain if the economic environment is a deprived one, since the economic factor is a major component of any education system. Therefore any debate on a new education dispensation must take economic factors into consideration (Claassen 1992 : 106).

Economic growth is a necessary condition for the expansion and improvement of educational provision since it provides an expanded tax base. The South African economy has been in decline, as evidenced by a number of economic indicators. Between 1980 and 1987, the economic growth rate was a mere 1,3%. This situation was aggravated by a 2,13% population growth rate during the same period (King 1989 : 29). Government spending on education in South Africa (including the homelands) comprised 21% of the national budget in 1991-1992 and about 7,1% of the Gross National
Product (Landman 1992: 40; Donaldson 1992: 1). These figures are high by international standards and increasing it further would have adverse inflationary effects on the economy as a whole. In addition, increasing the education budget to higher levels is not feasible since other social services such as job creation, improved urban and rural infrastructure and direct poverty relief programmes also vie for public money alongside education.

It is argued that sufficient resources for education could be generated through a reallocation of the defence budget and apartheid-related spending. The Urban Foundation (1992: 26) refutes this claim on the grounds that a reduction in the defence budget will not give much leeway for education and amounts saved through dismantling the apartheid bureaucracy are unlikely to resolve the crisis. In fact, more manpower may be needed to administer a democratic and accountable system.

With constraints such as these, financial policy would have to operate within the boundaries of economic realism.

2.3.3.3 Growing demand for education

Educational provision over a basic education cycle is widely accepted as a fundamental human right. Most countries subscribe to the ideology of free and universal schooling, or at the very least, basic primary education. In South Africa, the need for, or right to, education is a powerful demand and is articulated in the Freedom Charter (1955):

*Education shall be free, compulsory, universal and equal for all children.*
Similar generalized views stem from the People’s Education movement with its emphasis, echoing the Freedom Charter, on the right of people to have access to education and training. For example, the NECC (1989 : 12) set out the following belief:

*Education is a basic human right. Schooling shall be free and compulsory for all children.*

Although there is no shortage in the literature of propositions, written at a level of generality, which emphasize the need for education, no explicit attempt is made to propose which educational needs should be given priority (Wolpe 1991b : 7). Nonetheless, there is an increasing social demand for education as rising enrolment levels at both primary and secondary levels for all racial groups reflect. The total number of primary and secondary pupils is expected to increase from 8,6 million in 1987 to 14 million by the year 2020 (Pillay 1991b : 99). This rising social demand for education implies substantial growth in the number of school places at both primary and secondary levels.

Demands for human resource development also stress the need to expand educational provision. Shortages of specific skills and the need for economic development are likely to stimulate an increase in the demand for places at institutions of higher education.

These factors are likely to create pressure for increased investment in education and compel the government to find innovative strategies for providing cost-effective education.

2.3.3.4 Cost-effective strategies

Clearly, the limited funds available for education should be spent as effectively as possible. This calls for a major overhaul of spending patterns since current spending patterns are cost-
ineffective (Claassen 1992: 107 - 108). The state is faced with a number of tasks in this respect.

The first of these has to do with the provision of schooling facilities. As a beginning, no classroom should be allowed to stand empty or be only partially utilized. Without the maximum use of all existing physical resources, it will not be possible to cope with the demand for compulsory schooling. Existing resources, however, will not be sufficient and a school building programme will have to be undertaken. But this will depend entirely on the availability of funds at a particular time.

Second, it is increasingly being realized that the quality of an education system depends primarily on what happens in the classroom (Claassen 1992: 108). Accordingly, more money should be channelled to where teaching and learning actually take place. Simultaneously, this would imply that bureaucratic spending higher than the level of principal would have to be scaled down. Maximum use would have to be made of the existing teaching corps and innovative methods will have to be devised, in terms of both in-service and pre-service education and training, to increase the number of teachers available to the schooling system.

In addition to this, efforts should be made towards fostering a partnership of shared responsibility for financing education.

2.3.3.5 Sharing responsibility

In many developing countries, recent years have seen a resurgence of interest in community supporting schemes. As well as contributing resources, it is sometimes argued, such schemes can also improve the impact of education. It is suggested that people who directly pay, at least, small amounts for education come to value it more highly than when it is handed out without any apparent cost (Pillay 1991b: 107).
However, privatization and related measures aimed at reducing state financing of education have been criticized in some quarters. It is argued that these measures will create low quality institutions and escalate racial and regional imbalances. Moreover, it is contended that the majority of South Africans cannot afford to pay school fees. Thus, community responsibility for financing education can be socially divisive as well as socially constructive.

Financing education has particular implications for the Indian community.

2.3.3.6 Implications for the Indian community

Given the prevailing economic scenario in South Africa, it is unlikely that the post-apartheid economy will be capable of generating sufficiently high growth rates in the short-term to enable the state to fund free, universal and high-quality education for all at the current level of expenditure on white education.

Presently, per capita expenditure for the Indian child is comparatively higher than their fellow African counterparts. The government may attempt to alleviate disparities by spreading the burden of educational financing to those who have the ability to pay. Indian parents will need to accept that under a majority government they cannot expect to receive disproportionate amounts of the education budget. This may entail the imposition of user fees that would make it possible for the state to redirect subsidies from the relatively well-off socio-economic groups to the poorest.

The increased social and economic demand for education, coupled with the economic crisis in South Africa, may mean that free and universal education at all levels is an unrealistic objective in the short-term for a post-apartheid government. All indications point to the need for developing a multi-pronged strategy to
ensure equality of access and survival within the education system.

Closely related to financing education in a new dispensation is the issue of developing a suitable curriculum policy.

2.3.4 Curriculum

2.3.4.1 Historical context

The structures and processes determining curriculum development emerge from a historical context in which education was dominated by the influence of segregationist policies and principles of Christian National Education. Thus the salient features in South African curriculum history are: racial determination of schooling; ideological bias in curriculum content; unequal provision of resources; and exclusionary decision-making structures (Christie 1992 :16).

Given this situation, some of the key curriculum issues that need to be addressed in the quest to create a non-racial, non-sexist, democratic South Africa are: democratic participation; commonality and diversity; centralization and decentralization; assessment; and academic and technical education. Each of these will be discussed below.

2.3.4.2 Democratic participation

One of the first challenges of the new system will be to open up curriculum decision-making to broader participation and public accountability. It will therefore be necessary to devise structures that allow for authentically democratic participation and which empower the people to monitor and check the power of both officialdom and of their elected representatives. Democratization of curriculum can be seen as ensuring that educational issues are defined as appropriate for public decision-making,
that is, curriculum issues should not be shrouded in a cloak of secrecy, but put forward in accessible forms as proposals for public scrutiny and debate.

South Africa's cultural diversity also poses particular challenges for policy-makers.

2.3.4.3 Commonality and diversity

While there are real differences of language, culture, religion and region, apartheid curriculum policy has used these to legitimate minority political power and enforce segregation, rather than come to terms with encouraging positive attitudes towards difference and diversity.

The commonality/diversity debate raises the following questions: how can cultural diversity be reflected in the curriculum; what is the place for institutions that wish to reflect particular perspectives of a cultural or religious minority; and how can the emergence of a national sense of citizenship be protected while giving diversity expression? To develop a common curriculum which addresses issues of diversity is a major policy challenge.

The centralization/decentralization debate has connections with every aspect of curriculum policy and hinges on whether state power is centralized or devolved to regional and local level within the education system.

2.3.4.4 Centralization and decentralization

Given the size of the national education enterprise, it could be reasonably assumed that devolution of power to regional and local level will take place. In this context, the implications of different decentralized units, practices and strategies need to be spelled out since dimensions of decentralization range from decisions on possible axes of decentralization to assessing the consequences of allowing varying degrees of choice on admission.
policies. The balance needed is between a strong central policy to promote core democratic values and decentralized structures to facilitate participation and accountability. A combination of centralized and decentralized policies should be informed by principles built into the overall framework.

2.3.4.5 Assessment

Curriculum policy includes decisions about examinations, but examinations can also subvert the curriculum when teaching and learning become examination-driven. In South Africa, examinations play an important role in determining access to opportunities, and social and financial mobility. Existing curriculum practice has been inadequate in developing alternative assessment strategies. There are different interests who have different expectations of an examination system. Many of these issues may be worked out later, but they should not be left unaddressed.

2.3.4.6 Academic and technical education

Since the HSRC Report (1981), commentators have complained about the academic bias of the curriculum. On the one hand, it is argued that education should produce learning situations that reflect the needs of commerce and industry. On the other hand, it is asserted that the preparation for a place in the world of work should not become the raison d'etre of the education system. It may be necessary to reconcile these contradictions by placing both approaches within overall development strategies.

The issue of developing a suitable curriculum policy has particular implications for the Indian community.

2.3.4.7 Implications for the Indian community

Traditionally, Indian parents have not been involved in curriculum decision-making. The challenges of democratization and of the
recognition of cultural, linguistic and regional differences suggest the need for appropriate grassroots participation in decision-making. Besides the cultural component, there seems to be a variety of other constituencies that could claim a legitimate interest in curriculum issues: teachers, parents, students, employers, trade unions, professional organizations and religious groupings.

In a democracy, curriculum needs to reflect the multicultural character of society, to fairly represent the contributions of all cultures, and to promote the formation of a national democratic culture. However, curriculum should go beyond the mere juxtaposition of cultural practices (Nkomo 1992: 305). It should also reflect the structural, social class, economic, political and racial factors operating in the wider plural society as well as the power and control exercised by dominant groups over access to social rewards and economic resources (Bullivant 1986: 42).

Finally, it is important not to overstate the curriculum dimension, since its impact will be determined by the nature of political, economic and social changes in the transition. Curriculum change is more a reflector than a generator of wider social change. Any effort in the direction of curriculum change should be collaborative, requiring the skills and reflecting the needs of all South Africans.

A policy area closely related to curriculum is that of racial integration.

2.3.5 Integration

2.3.5.1 Apartheid education

Discrimination, segregation and subordination of blacks have a long history in South African education, but separatist practices hardened into apartheid ideology with the accession to power of the National Party in 1948 and the subsequent passing of the
Bantu Education Act (1953), Coloured Persons Education Act (1963) and Indian Education Act (1965).

In recent years, educational segregation has been relaxed at schools, which can now enrol pupils of all races. Concessions by the HOA, HOR and HOD education departments to admit children of all races subject to strict provisos are further adjustments to the principle of segregated education. The establishment of a legitimate government is expected to lead to the creation of a single education authority, bringing an end to decades of enforced segregation and, in the process, presenting particular challenges for interest groups in education.

2.3.5.2 Transitional challenges

Whereas much energy in the past has been devoted to desegregation for both ideological and pragmatic reasons, comparatively little attention has been paid to the complexities of school integration. While elaborate regulations have been laid down regarding admission of pupils of all races to schools, no assistance has been provided to ensure or even aid successful integration. This underlines an important issue: that integration should not be seen as an end in itself. The success of integration in the short-term, at least, will depend on the extent to which educational authorities address the following transitional problems associated with integration.

2.3.5.3 Cultural concerns

Ideological or cultural concerns may be difficult to address as they often have to do with the maintenance of group identity and the perceived role the school plays in nurturing this. Whereas cultural or religious expression is accepted in schools worldwide, the coincidence of culture, race and privilege has made this a controversial issue in South Africa (Bot 1992: 63).
However, more and more commentators are beginning to see the lives of individuals as reflecting a personal mix of two cultures. In the first instance, a universal pattern characterized by agrarian, industrial and informational revolutions is common to all mankind. At the same time, the individual and the group to which he or she belongs, will live in accordance with particular tenets of faith, use a language, and have a lifestyle which is peculiar to that specific group (Badenhorst 1992:91-92).

If schools are to be free to reflect the value structure, beliefs and lifestyles of a particular group, while teaching the knowledge, skills and values which are required to function within the family of man, then clearly schools require the freedom to be able to choose, instil and pursue particular value systems (Badenhorst 1992: 92). The answer thus lies in allowing choice in education. In this respect, numerous benefits can be gained from multicultural education, including the promotion of intercultural tolerance and acceptance of other groups.

Another educational concern is the possible impact of integration on the educational standards of an institution. When institutions desegregate, it often means a mix of educationally advantaged and disadvantaged pupils.

2.3.5.4 Educational standards

Whereas in most countries, integration involves ethnic or foreign minorities, in South Africa the reverse is the case, compounded by the fact that the majority of African pupils are often disadvantaged. Integration therefore inevitably gives rise to concern about how well these pupils will cope, as well as how, under these circumstances, the schools will maintain their present standards. Undoubtedly, the important factor will be how integration is managed.

The issue of finding an appropriate admissions policy is pivotal to the success of integration. A future admissions policy will
need to address underlying inequalities and focus attention on how best to accommodate vast numbers of presently disadvantaged pupils in need of a quality education.

2.3.5.5  Admissions policy

Most HOD schools admit limited numbers of "non-Indian" pupils, subject to financial considerations and the academic ability of these applicants. HOD schools have turned down many African applicants on the basis of academic ability, and the fact that such entrance criteria do not apply to Indian children has been criticized.

Clearly, a more acceptable admission policy, taking into account educational concerns, including background variables of pupils, cultural bias and socio-economic background of parents, will have to be devised to accommodate the legitimate aspirations of all South Africans.

The question of school integration poses particular challenges for the Indian minority which, in all fairness, has received a relatively privileged education - closest to white education at the apex of the pyramid in recent years.

School integration thus has implications for the Indian community.

2.3.5.6  Implications for the Indian community

The Indian community has generally been positive and open to the idea of integrated education (Naidoo 1989 : 123). The HOD's admission policy (cf paragraph 1.1) has been strongly criticized by Indian parents on the grounds that it perpetuates segregation and does not cater for parental input.

However, if there is a perceived drop in standards, overcrowding or the composition of the school population changes dramatically,
then the strength of opposition to integration will need to be anticipated and addressed. It is important to foresee these problems and respond accordingly.

In view of the cultural, language and political differences in South Africa, one can conclude that any rigid, centrally-determined policy is likely to meet with opposition (Bot 1992 : 65). The answer lies in allowing choice by the users of education. Moreover, the idea which seems to be gaining the most support in countries with diverse cultural, language and ethnic groups is the identification of common needs and values, and that these are complemented by content which responds to different cultural, religious and regional needs (Bot 1992 : 72). Again, a flexible system of schooling in which users of education are allowed to determine their educational requirements to a greater degree may foresee these problems and respond appropriately.

What is clear is that innovative approaches will have to be worked out to provide a better quality education for all. Perhaps the most positive result of integration and the establishment of a single education authority is the increasing realization that the education crisis affects not just the African population, but the future of our country as a whole. More importantly, all stakeholders will need to be involved in drawing up the requirements of a new education system. Strategies need to be developed to ensure that a varied choice is made available to different school communities.

Finally, the issue of language policy in a new education dispensation needs to be addressed.
2.3.6 Language

2.3.6.1 Elements of a new language policy

a. Multilingualism

South Africa is a multilingual society and a language policy should therefore foster multilingualism. All languages spoken in South Africa should be encouraged to flourish, taking into account economic, technical and logistical constraints that invariably limit the implementation of policy. This policy should apply equally to the field of education.

Another important consideration is that of democratic consultation.

b. Democratic consultation

No policy, however well-motivated, will succeed if the people's voices are not heard. Extensive consultation from grassroots upward must lay the basis for policy formulation so that people understand the complexities and realities that inform final decisions. Some are sceptical of "bottom up" planning, arguing that it is cumbersome and time-consuming. Yet this approach to planning is necessary if language education policies are to be acceptable to, and enjoy the support of, the majority of South Africans (National Language Project 1992: 14).

Central to the development of a new language policy is research.

c. Research

Policy should be preceded by research. Little is known, outside official accounts, of the languages spoken and attitudes to languages in the country. We need to know about the geographical and social distribution of each language, in which domain
particular languages are used and people's attitudes to these languages. Such research will lead to an understanding of the socio-linguistic profile of the country or locale on which the research is being conducted.

The development of a new language policy has particular implications for education.

2.3.6.2 Implications of a new language policy for education

The implications of a new language policy for education are far-reaching. A number of elements which will require intervention or support from higher levels of planning are listed below:

* Educational material will need to be reconceptualized.
* The examination system will need to be more flexible.
* The broader school community will need to co-operate in order to make the policy work.
* Through pre-service and in-service training of teachers, it will be possible to facilitate a match between the linguistic needs of students and the language abilities of teachers.
* Existing support services may have to adapt their curricula and strategies in order to facilitate implementation of policy in schools.

The development of a new language policy poses particular challenges for the Indian community.

2.3.6.3 Implications for the Indian community

In schools controlled by the HOD, where a majority of pupils classified as Indian are enrolled, the medium of instruction is
English. The other official language, Afrikaans, has to be taught as a second language from the first to the last year of school - a total of twelve years for pupils completing their schooling. Indian vernacular languages are offered as optional subjects.

From the researcher's observations, it would seem that there is consensus in the Indian community that English should constitute the main medium of instruction in schools attended by its children. However, a general concern expressed by Indian parents relates to the extent to which Indian vernacular languages will be promoted as school subjects in a new education dispensation. State education policy under apartheid had the effect of encouraging the development of these languages at school level. This concern needs to be addressed to ensure that provision for learning Indian vernacular languages (as optional school subjects) exist in a new education dispensation.

An essential precondition for language planning is that of consultation with the users of a language policy. Language planners need to be informed of attitudes, practices and effects of policy occurring on the ground. In this regard, the input of interest groups on what is the most suitable language education policy for specific regions or localities is essential. By the same token, representatives of interest groups could take back to their constituencies a broader understanding of some of the factors that might affect their particular spheres of interest.

In the following section, a summary of the chapter is provided.

2.4 SUMMARY

Two overarching themes provide the basis for this chapter. The first attempts to place the development of Indian education in its proper perspective by considering the wider educational system in which it took root. Four periods can be distinguished in the development of Indian education. The first period (1860 - 1948) was characterized by the effects of colonialism and the
subsequent policies of successive Union governments on Indian education. The principal feature in this period was one of neglect and indifference towards Indians. The second period (1948-1983) was overshadowed by the Nationalist policy of apartheid which aimed at providing separate opportunities for blacks and whites in all spheres of life. The contradictory effect of this policy on Indian education was also analysed. The third period (1984-1990) was dominated by state-activated reformism in the wake of the De Lange Report. The pressure for reform forced the state to redefine education policy to appease, at least, some sections of the population. In the fourth period (1990 onwards), the current crisis in education was highlighted.

The second theme examines some of the key issues likely to be confronted in the process of transformation in South African education. From preliminary discussions, six key policy areas—transformation, education governance, finance, curriculum, integration and language were identified. The purpose was to raise, in a tentative way, some of the issues which are likely to be confronted in the reconstruction of the education system. Such issues will arise whether new policies aim to reform the education system or to reconstruct it radically. The primary purpose of this chapter was to develop a framework for discussing specific policies relevant to the restructuring of education in South Africa.
3.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter situated this study within the socio-historical milieu in which it is located. This entailed a brief résumé of the historical development of Indian education in South Africa. Following from this, key policy issues likely to be confronted in the process of transformation were discussed in a preliminary way. The purpose was to establish a theoretical framework to guide discussion in this chapter.

Chapter three proposes to analytically explore a range of policy options relevant to the restructuring of schooling in South Africa. The literature review ranges from conservative (right) to radical (left) policy positions of mainly, but not exclusively, political organizations and endeavours to examine and analyse the degree of commonality or divergence that exists between them. No value judgements are implied by the use of labels, that is, right or left.

Policy proposals of political organizations across the spectrum are elicited and exposed for investigation. These include the policy positions of the Conservative Party (CP), Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP), National Party (NP), Democratic Party (DP) and African National Congress (ANC). The Education Renewal Strategy (ERS) and National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) documents for the transformation of the education system are also examined.

The reasons advanced for the choice of the aforementioned political organizations are:
it was necessary to choose organizations which offered sufficient researchable information;

these organizations provide, at least, a degree of literature, physical and personnel resource which allows for documentation of details on their respective policies;

they have identified, with the exception of the Conservative Party, the inadequacies of the present education dispensation;

they recognize the need, again with the exception of the Conservative Party, for change in the South African education structure and, in turn, propose to embark on such change; and

they represent the mainstream of socio-political thought among South Africans.

Besides the above criteria, another important reason advanced for the choice of the aforementioned organizations is the belief that they will, in some way, determine, define and demarcate the contours of a post-apartheid settlement, including the area of education.

Seeing that the concept "educational policy" is by definition problematic and could encompass almost anything remotely concerned with education, the investigator has seen fit to delimit the vast array of educational concerns into six broad policy areas or categories:

- transformation;
- education governance;
- finance;
- curriculum;
- integration; and
- language.
These areas or categories are by no means exhaustive or inclusive of the total possible range of activities within them. They may also be seen to overlap one another; quite clearly, another researcher might set out a different collection of categories from these. In the context of the investigation, however, they do, in broad terms, cover the area of formal educational activities necessary for the study.

At the time of investigation (cf paragraph 1.1), the principal problem encountered in reviewing the literature was the difficulty of securing sufficient relevant information needed to undertake a comprehensive analysis of policy options in education. Clearly, a paucity of research in respect of future-oriented educational policies exists. Besides occasional educational policy discussion documents issued by some organizations, which border no more than on a level of generality and vagueness, an absence of comprehensive commentary exists. What is available in abundance though, are, on the one hand, broad characterizations of the goals of a new education system which merely provide a point of departure for policy formation and, on the other hand, general propositions that cannot be related to specific development strategies or translated into concrete, practical policies.

In view of these limitations, the investigation tended to shift to the examination of conference papers, journal publications, newspaper articles and discussion documents. In addition to the lack of literature available, other constraints also restricted the free-flow of information. These were:

* incomplete record-keeping of some organizations;

* a lack of co-operation by personnel responsible for education matters in some organizations;

* a refusal to make data readily accessible in some cases;
* official resistance and "red-tape" by some organizations;
* ill-informed personnel within organizations;
* poorly co-ordinated education desks;
* unavailability of information;
* a lack of clarity of educational concerns by some organizations; and
* insufficient attention paid to educational issues.

It should also be noted that the viewpoints of the Pan-Africanist Congress and Azanian Peoples' Organization have not been included in this study. These organizations have not had much to say about education and certainly have little influence on the current education debate.

Since information for each policy area comes from organizations which have done varying degrees of research in the subject area concerned, the amount of information available varies from one organization to another.

Notwithstanding these numerous constraints, which, for practical reasons, cannot be fully eliminated in the present period, if one recognizes the significance of these constraints and provides for its possible effects, it will provide further proof of the necessity of the literature review, however inconclusive it might be.

Numerous related reasons have been advanced for the present state of policy development or underdevelopment in South African education. Prior to 2 February 1990, there was little room for dialogue or debate on alternative educational policies between contending social forces. For the mass democratic movement, thinking crystallized around the idea of People's Education,
which, in essence, was an opposition movement to apartheid education. The politically repressive conditions and a constant battle for survival meant a lack of physical and intellectual space for formulating alternative policies. Moreover, the task of concretizing, more or less coherent, short and long-term policies, in the different spheres of life, which taken together, could be conceived of as constituting the actuality of a transformed society had, of necessity, to be largely postponed to the future (Wolpe 1991a:1).

For the most part, the government and corporate capital unilaterally formulated and implemented changes in education, backed by coercive armed intervention, ignoring the aspirations of the masses.

These circumstances may explain, partly, the formidable and complicated problems associated with the inadequate state of policy development in South African education. The unpredictability and dynamic nature of events will, as shown, necessarily limit, but cannot be allowed to preclude policy development for the future.

In an attempt to come to terms with the main aims of this chapter, that is, an exploratory analysis of policy options, it is necessary to acquire some understanding of the complex nature of policy analysis. In this context, an attempt is made to present some of the salient features of the policy process. It must be stressed that this should not be viewed as a general theory of the policy process, which it obviously is not, but rather as a means to organize and direct one's inquiry into the whole question of policy orientation. Following from this, some attention is devoted to a discussion of the policy outlooks of the major role-players in education. In the main part of the chapter, an exploratory analysis of policy options is undertaken. To conclude, a brief summary of the chapter is provided.
3.2 THE MAKING OF EDUCATIONAL POLICY

3.2.1 Defining "policy"

A conceptual grasp of the term "policy" is necessary in order to understand the gist of this chapter, that is, an analytical exploration of policy options in education. The literature of social science contains a multiplicity of definitions of the concept "policy". In spite of this, there is still no agreement on what "policy" is, how it should be studied, or even whether it is a legitimate concern of social scientists. Most definitions are based principally on the need to define the parameters of "policy" within specific social contexts. A few such definitions will be noted and their utility for analysis remarked upon.

Eyestone (in Anderson 1984:2), for instance, holds that "policy", broadly defined, is the relationship of a person, group or government unit to its environment. Such a definition may be adequate for ordinary discourse. However, it is so broad that it leaves one uncertain of its meaning. Since the concern of the investigation is with policy analysis, a more precise definition of "policy" is needed to structure our thinking and permit more effective communication.

Dye (1978:3) states that "policy" is whatever government (or groups) choose to do or not to do. The main strength of this definition is it implies that "policy" is concerned with change or with the preservation of the status quo. Its weakness lies in its inability to adequately recognize that there may be a difference between what policy-makers propose to do and what is actually done.

Rose (1969:x) has suggested that "policy" be considered a long series of more-or-less related activities and emphasizes their consequences for those concerned rather than with a discrete decision. Though somewhat ambiguous, Rose's definition, nonetheless, embodies a useful notion that "policy" is a course or
pattern of activity and not simply a decision to do something.

Another way of thinking about "policy" is to see it as the authoritative allocation through the political process, of values to groups or individuals in a society (Easton 1953: 129). This definition draws our attention to the centrality of power and control in the formulation of policy. This, in turn, requires us to consider not only whose values have become institutionalized, but also how these values have become institutionalized.

For the purpose of this discussion, it can be stated that "policy" is a proposed course of action of a person, group, or government within a given environment, providing obstacles and opportunities which the policy was proposed to utilize and overcome in an effort to reach a goal or realize an objective or a purpose (Friedrich 1963: 79). Hanekom (1987: 7-8) concurs that "policy" is a desired course of action or interaction which is to serve as a guideline in the allocation of resources necessary to realize societal goals and objectives. These definitions imply that coupled to the notion of policy as a course of action, is the requirement that policy is directed towards the accomplishment of some purpose or goal. In addition, it focuses attention on what is actually done as opposed to what is proposed or intended, and it differentiates a policy from a decision, as remarked earlier, which is essentially a choice among competing alternatives.

Thus policies are paths by which particular principles and objectives are to be realized. They specify the means to effect the transition from what exists to what is desired.

To understand the dynamic nature of "policy", it is necessary to identify the various stages of the policy process.
3.2.2 The policy process

The policy process refers to the various ways by which policy is actually formed. It should be stressed, there exists no single or universal model by which policy is made. Variations in the subject of policy will provide concomitant variations in the nature and technique of policy-making.

This should not, however, be taken to mean that each policy-making situation is unique and that it is impossible to develop generalizations on policy formation. Anderson (1984: 19) takes the view that given the complexity and diversity in policy processes, it is not possible to develop "grand theory". But a useful start can be made towards "theory-building" by seeking to generalize on such matters as to who is involved in policy formation, on what kinds of issues, under what conditions, in what ways, and to what extent.

The policy process is viewed as a sequential pattern of action involving a number of functional phases of activity that can be analytically distinguished, but not separated. The process itself is circular.

Badat (1991: 22) distinguishes five phases in the policy process. These are: agenda-setting; formulation; adoption; implementation; and evaluation.

Each of these phases is discussed below.

3.2.2.1 Agenda-setting

Social forces set agendas for policy-making. This entails the identification of problems and issues for which policy positions are required. It is directly linked to the availability of information pertaining to societal and community needs and the alternative methods of providing for these needs.
3.2.2.2  **Formulation**

Formulation is a process by which actual policies are devised by developing proposed courses of action with the help of appointed individuals and other sources of policy information such as interest groups. It can only take place if an authoritative selection and allocation of values is done by a body or forum authorized to do so.

3.2.2.3  **Adoption**

This is a formal procedure by which policies come to be adopted by organizations and institutions and involves a public statement of intentions of the policy-maker.

3.2.2.4  **Implementation**

Implementation is the mechanism by which policies are translated into practice.

3.2.2.5  **Evaluation**

Evaluation involves an assessment of the success or failure of policy using particular criteria. It may or may not lead to new agenda-setting and reformulation of policy.

In actuality, however, the policy process does not chronologically follow the sequence of activities discussed above. The sequential approach, nevertheless, helps to capture the flow of action and is subject to change. Additional steps can be introduced if experience indicates it is needed. The sequential approach is also not "culture-bound" or "subject-bound" and can be readily used to study diverse issues and various policy-making systems.
To understand the policy process in a broader sense, it is important to have some idea of the stages of policy development.

3.2.3 Stages of policy development

A distinction can be drawn in the stages of policy development between:

* Stage one
  The exploration of policy options.

* Stage two
  The choice of a particular set of policy positions by an individual, group or organization.

* Stage three
  The actual policies resulting from a compromise between different political organizations during negotiations.

In practice, these stages do not occur in a series or in isolation to each other. As the public policy debate gathers momentum, an interaction will be set up between all three stages. As policy options begin to be identified and interrogated (stage one), these processes will feed into the choices made by political parties (stage two). At the same time, the demands of political organizations will give focus to the exploration of policy options (stage one). Similarly, as negotiations continue, stage one and two will begin to influence existing state policies, while the negotiation process, in turn, will itself give direction to stages one and two.

To enable interest groups in education to sharpen their views about educational issues and participate more effectively in the education debate, it is necessary to have some understanding of the concept of policy analysis.
Policy analysis can be viewed as an attempt to measure the costs and benefits of various policy alternatives and to evaluate actual and proposed activities. It is an aid for elected and appointed policy-makers to make decisions (and thus eventually policy) that will be in the public interest (Goldwin 1980: 44). Furthermore, it is concerned with the conditions and structures that will enhance the efficiency of official actions (Lane 1982: 384 - 385). It attempts to provide policy-makers with neutral and objective advice pertaining to the best programme in terms of economy and efficiency (Jenkins-Smith 1982: 89). In addition, policy analysis is an aid to provide evidence for decisions already made or to determine whether existing programmes should be discontinued (Bozeman 1979: 267). However, policy, by its very nature, contains a number of limitations.

Limitations of policy

It should be noted that all policies are aimed at resolving societal problems. However, it is not possible for policy alone to resolve all such problems.

Dye (1978: 330 - 332) lists the limitations of policy, inter alia:

* it is not possible to define community needs in absolute terms;

* expectations of society generally exceed the capabilities of the authorities or resources available;

* a solution to a problem or providing for the needs of a specific group may increase the problems or needs of another group;
it is sometimes not possible to counteract certain phenomena in society;

people tend to adapt their behaviour to specific policies in such a manner that the aims of the policies become ineffective;

some community problems cannot be solved by a policy addressed to one area only; and

complete rationality in policy-making is non-existent because policy-makers usually try to respond to the demands of their constituencies.

Given this brief insight into the dynamics of policy, it is possible to draw some conclusions about the nature of educational policy development in South Africa.

3.2.6 Educational policy development in South Africa

South Africa does not have a tradition of active and systematic policy work sustained over a long period of time. The policy-making process is thus not well understood, partly, as a result of the highly centralized and authoritarian nature of public policy-making which has rendered the process opaque.

Until recently, there have been few policy research units. For the first time, English-speaking universities have established policy research institutes in education - these had previously been the preserve of Afrikaans universities. An Education Policy Unit at the University of the Witwatersrand and an Education Projects Unit at the University of Natal became closely associated with the National Education Co-ordinating Committee and began to investigate policy alternatives in specific areas like the financing of education, junior primary education, teacher training and other important policy areas.
This process in education is part of what Hofmeyr and Buckland (1992a: 50) have called "a wave of policy introspection" by the business sector, the churches, the government-supported media and a vast range of social organizations outside and inside of government. The result has been a growth in the number of individuals, departments and institutions dedicated to policy analysis - in universities, communities, corporations and foundations.

Although policy research can usefully inform the education debate, it must be stressed that policy learning will not of itself bring about policy change. The shape of the new system will depend critically on the nature of the existing system, and in the way in which a broad range of established and new interest groups negotiate with the state and one another within the context of a significantly changing social structure. There will be important continuities with the existing system and the struggle over change will centre around such issues as the governance of schooling, finance, curriculum and access to schooling. All these developments will be influenced by, and, in turn, will influence the ideological-political struggle over education, as different values and systems of ideas contest the role of schooling in society. Some attention is devoted to this in the following section by discussing the broad policy outlines of the major role-players in the education debate.

3.3 POLICY OUTLOOKS OF THE MAJOR ROLE-PLAYERS IN EDUCATION

3.3.1 National Party

National Party proposals for a new education system found expression in three major documents. The "Education Renewal Strategy : Discussion Document" was released by the CHED on 4 June 1991 (DNE 1991a) and "A Curriculum Model for Education in South Africa" was issued on 29 November 1991 (DNE 1991b). The final report, "Education Renewal Strategy : Management Solutions
for Education in South Africa" was released in November 1992 (DNE 1992). All three documents are, in part, political strategizing documents, "an input for the negotiations on a future constitutional dispensation for South Africa" (DNE 1991a : 26). They represent policy standpoints and propose short and medium-term solutions for the most important problems and issues in education. The policy standpoints in these reports provide a broad framework for the development of implementation plans for the renewal of education. The "new" National Party thinking departs with a radical proposal that "race" should not feature in structuring the provision of education and that "justice in educational opportunities must be ensured". It recommends that the future system should "visibly promote and express national unity", while allowing for "freedom of association and the accommodation of diversity" (DNE 1991a : 20).

3.3.2 Democratic Party

The Democratic Party's perspective on education is found in its policy document "Democratic Party : Education Policy" (Democratic Party 1990). The Democratic Party commits itself to bring about a new South African education system, by negotiation, which will contain the following precepts (Democratic Party 1990 : 1):

* destroying all forms of apartheid in the current education system;
* one education ministry;
* free and compulsory basic schooling for all; and
* freedom of choice.

Having said this, the weakness of the Democratic Party's education document is that it does not address issues in any degree of detail. The document merely provides general characterizations or propositions of what the Democratic Party envisages for education in a new dispensation.
3.3.3 Inkatha Freedom Party

The IFP, recently transformed from a Zulu cultural movement to a political party, has yet to release any sort of education proposal for a new education dispensation. Information gleaned from policy speeches, public statements and IFP publications all point to a capitalist economic system with a strong federal autonomy. In education, the IFP has not ventured beyond traditional mainstream liberalism. What is incontrovertible though, is that the IFP is an important regional force likely to play an important role within its sphere of influence.

3.3.4 African National Congress

Broadly speaking, the ANC educational perspective is based on the principles of the Freedom Charter (1955) which has as its goals:

* the replacement of all bodies of minority rule by democratic organs of government;

* equal rights for all;

* employment, housing and peace for all; and

* free, compulsory, universal and equal education for all children.

In its discussion paper on educational policy, the ANC (1991:11) states that the primary aim of educational policy should be to link the education system with the broad social goals of a democratic society in which there is political and social justice for all.

The programme embodied in the document "ANC Policy Guidelines for a Democratic South Africa" contain the following principles (ANC 1992b : 4) :
* educational policy shall be geared towards producing a new type of society dedicated to serve the interests and needs of the South African people as a whole;

* the ANC educational programme shall draw on the most advanced scientific knowledge of the people of South Africa and the world;

* education shall combat the division between mental and manual training and the artificial separation of the arts and sciences; and

* democratic practice shall prevail among students, teachers and the community in all educational activities.

At the end of March 1990, a workshop was held in Harare on the theme "Towards a language policy for a post-apartheid South Africa". The collection of Harare documents provides a consolidated ANC view of language policy. Subsequent to this, other documents dealing with the ANC view of education in a democratic South Africa were also published (cf paragraph 1.1).

3.3.5 National Education Policy Investigation

The National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) was a project of the National Education Co-ordinating Committee (NECC) conducted between December 1990 and August 1992. The object of this investigation was to interrogate policy options in all areas of education within a value framework derived from the ideals of the broad democratic movement.

The final report and summaries comprise twelve research areas, each covering a major educational sector, and "The Framework Report", which is a conceptual and historical analysis of the NEPI processes and products. The twelve research areas are: adult education; adult basic education; curriculum; early childhood educare; education planning, systems, and structure;
governance and administration; human resources development; language; library and information services; post-secondary education; support services and teacher education.

These reports do not constitute a model for a new education system, nor even a set of recommendations for a more equitable dispensation: the twelve sectoral reports are, in the first instance, an analysis of feasible options for the short-to-medium-term future. Different options favour different social and economic values, which are sometimes in tension or even direct conflict with one another.

NEPI (1993: vii) has tried to serve three principal functions:

* the provision of information and a lens to focus on the values which underpin specific policies;

* the stimulation of public debate on educational policy in all spheres of society; and

* the development of capacity for policy analysis.

The NEPI report is underpinned by five guiding principles drawn from the experiences and traditions of the mass democratic movement. These are: equality, non-racism, non-sexism, democracy and redress (NEPI 1993: 6).

3.3.6 Conservative Party

A unifying feature of all conservative forces in South Africa is a commitment to segregated education. One such political party is the Conservative Party. In keeping with the Conservative Party vision of an ethnic white Afrikaner state geographically seceded from South Africa, it is clear that it has little to offer to the current education debate. Moreover, since the referendum in 1992, its ability to influence the negotiating process has diminished even further. Nevertheless, it does represent one school of
thought in the ideological-educational spectrum (cf. paragraph 1.1.1).

3.3.7 The private sector

Recent positions of capital in South Africa are represented in the education initiatives of the newly created Private Sector Education Council (PRISEC), the Private Sector Initiative (PSI), the Urban Foundation (UF), the South African Chamber of Commerce (SACOB), and the Education Foundation (a breakaway body from the KwaZulu/Natal Education Indaba). In general terms, this position is expressed as a dual commitment to a non-racial, unitary national education system alongside a strong technical focus on education content.

Against the background of the broad policy outlines presented above, the policy proposals of each of the aforementioned organizations is discussed.

3.4 POLICY OPTIONS

In chapter two, six policy areas (transformation, education governance, finance, curriculum, integration and language) were delineated and their implications for the Indian community in a post-apartheid South Africa briefly remarked upon. This section attempts to produce an analysis of policy options in terms of the six aforementioned areas.

The decision to pursue policy analysis in this investigation, by broadening the terms of the discussion, by extending the issue of policy beyond a narrow circle of education expertise, and by viewing the policy process as a dialogue where it is legitimate to differ, it is hoped that the investigation will make a contribution to the way in which educational policy is understood and pursued in a non-racial society. This section then, aims to stimulate interest and debate, to inform the various processes in the domain of policy consideration, and to build policy
capacity. Policy option analysis is therefore the first step needed to bring more views, interests, and forces to bear upon the policy-making process and to encourage proactive debate and discussion.

In the following section, strategies for the transformation of the education system are discussed.

3.4.1 Transformation

This section focuses specifically on strategies for transforming the South African education system. To this end, proposals of policy participants were elicited.

As mentioned earlier (cf paragraph 1.1), research proper for this dissertation was completed in March 1994. Since then, far-reaching educational developments have taken place in South Africa. Although these new developments have not been included in this study, they will, no doubt, have a significant influence on the transformation of the education system.

In general, this particular area was under-researched, poorly provided for, and until recently, tended to operate for the most part out of the public eye. Visits to political organizations revealed that no well-developed body of knowledge dealing with how to implement educational reform in the transition exists. The National Party government initiative tended to dominate debate in the media, with other role-players dealing with transitional issues tangentially. This could imply that policy may be decided by a few policy-players who have developed coherent strategies for education system change.

Finally, this section is not intended as an exercise in "crystal ball-gazing" or prediction, but is an attempt to identify the main trajectories of change and the key uncertainties which could alter them.
3.4.1.1 State initiatives

a. New education plan

In 1993 the government revealed a new education plan to bring education under a single, non-racial ministry.

The State President at the time, F.W. de Klerk, announced (The Weekly Mail Education Review, 1 February 1993 : 1):

.... an 'expedient and streamlined' transitional administration, with a minister and accounting officer will be in place by 1 April 1993. It would co-ordinate provision of education on the road to non-racialism, preparing new legislation and managing the entire process of change.

This planned move has far-reaching consequences for education and will, particularly, affect the present unequal and race-based distribution of educational funding in South Africa. The proposed plan, however, gives rise to some important questions: how will the existing multiplicity of education departments be phased out and can we expect top-level posts in the civil service to be rationalized.

Senior National Party member, Jac Rabie, confirmed (in Challenor & Fabricius 1993 : 1):

.... the government is moving towards one education department with the idea of amalgamating White, Coloured and Indian own affairs with the African DET and the education departments of the six self-governing homelands, regardless of colour, race or creed.

To give substance to the government's new plan, a number of changes to the schooling system have been proposed.
b. Government proposals

Broadly speaking, some of the envisaged changes for formal education are (The Natal Mercury, 27 January 1993 : 1):

* a single education ministry should replace the 15 racially-based executive departments;

* the first nine years of schooling should be compulsory with the state funding 95% of the cost. The state would pay 75% of the last 3 years of schooling;

* three types of schools would continue to exist (state-funded schools administered directly by the government, private schools and state-aided schools under the control of a management council representing parents);

* equality in spending for all races - average pupil to teacher ratio will be brought to 35 : 1 in primary schools and 32 : 1 in high schools; and

* more relevancy in education with a system of vocational education and training linked to the existing formal education system with greater mobility between the different institutions.

c. KwaZulu-Natal region (as an example)

In a press report, the first details of a new plan for a non-racial KwaZulu-Natal education department were revealed (The Natal Mercury, 25 February 1993 : 1).

The proposals, drawn up by the KwaZulu-Natal Education Group, make provision for all personnel at present serving in the five education departments to be "absorbed" in a new regional system. The region’s 2,14 million school children would be embraced in the scheme. The head office would be in Durban and the region
would be divided into four sub-areas with their own headquarters in the city as well as Pietermaritzburg, Ulundi and Ladysmith. The working group consists of representatives of the five education authorities, the HOA, HOD, HOR, KwaZulu Education Department and the DET, at present operating in Natal (The Natal Mercury, 25 February 1993 : 1).

The five education authorities meeting under the aegis of the Natal Education Board proposed that (The Natal Mercury, 25 February 1993 : 1):

* overall control would be vested in a deputy director-general with each of the four areas under the control of an executive director of education with its own professional and administrative support staff;

* a total of 34 sub-offices would be established in the region; and

* personnel presently serving the five "own affairs" departments of education would be absorbed in a new regional system.

The former Minister of Education and Culture in the now-defunct HOD, Mrs Devagie Govender, added (The Natal Mercury, 25 February 1993 :1):

This model for a new regional system could also be used in other geographic regions. Until 31 March 1994 - the date set by President de Klerk for a new education system to be in place - this process of rearrangement and rationalization will gain momentum until a new dispensation for non-racial education is firmly in place.
The Minister of National Education at the time, Piet Marais, further stated (The Weekly Mail Education Review, 1 February 1993: 1):

*During the transition process, schools will be run just as at present in accordance with the current budget and under the present legislation. Standards will be maintained as the existing examination system, well-qualified personnel and departmental directives remain in place.*

Finally, Piet Marais, in the same article, maintains:

*The development of a new system need not wait for an interim government. But it would be irresponsible not to take the key stakeholders with us. We will have to be careful not to move away from the constitutional field. The ultimate objective is that the people must embrace the system as their own.*

The National Party government has come under criticism from a number of organizations for its proposed changes to education.

3.4.1.2 Reaction to state initiatives

At the time of writing, other organizations had yet to provide a clear and comprehensive transition strategy for education, though broad positions could be inferred from general policy statements and reactions to the aforesaid state initiatives.
The ANC (1992a:4), for example, admits:

*It is vital that the ANC develops a clear response to policies for transformation. This response must be aimed both at establishing a new and democratic political dispensation that replaces the racist and undemocratic apartheid constitution and addresses the legacy of apartheid in the broader socio-economic sphere.*

Generally, the ANC-NECC proposal for the reorientation and transformation of the education system must be interpreted in the context of a commitment to a broader set of education principles: non-racism and non-sexism in education; democracy and participation in education; and the development of a unitary education system.

Both the ANC and NECC have reacted ambivalently to the National Party government's education plan. Lindelwa Mabandla (The Natal Mercury, 27 January 1993:1), an ANC education spokesperson, welcomed the plan as it moved the process forward and was a realistic attempt to solve education problems.

The NECC general secretary, James Maseko (The Natal Mercury, 28 January 1993:3), also added his organization's approval to the new plan.

However, these two organizations warned against the early implementation of new education plans without proper consultations.

Contradicting an earlier ANC policy position, the ANC education head, Dr John Samuel (The Weekly Mail Education Review, 1 February 1993:1), stated:
We are happy that there has been a shift by government, but there is no way they can be the sole managers of the transitional process. We are not interested in rubber-stamping.

The NECC information officer, Desmond Thompson (The Weekly Mail, 29 January to 4 February 1993 : 5), also contradicted an earlier NECC statement:

We would have problems if the government tried to unilaterally implement changes ....

Both the ANC and NECC tend to display ambiguous attitudes towards the Nationalist government's reform proposal. Other organizations, on the other hand, are less critical of the government's reform proposal.

b. Democratic Party, Inkatha Freedom Party and the private sector standpoint

Roger Burrows (The Natal Mercury, 27 January 1993 : 1), Democratic Party education spokesperson, remarked:

The government proposal represents a major shift in thinking in education. However, a major area of concern is the lack of political will in striving to eliminate racial inequalities.

The IFP also responded moderately to the government's proposal, but stressed that there should be maximum devolution of control of education and that it should be provided within a federal structure, although some co-ordination must be provided by the state (The Natal Mercury, 27 January 1993 : 1).

The South African Chamber of Business (The Natal Mercury, 28 January 1993 : 3) took a similar view:
The government proposals are in line with original submissions by the private sector. This includes a single education department with appropriate powers and responsibilities at regional level, and the need for educational programmes that are relevant to both learners and employers.

The Conservative Party, on the other hand, dismissed the government's plan outright.

c. Conservative Party standpoint

The Conservative Party viewed the government's transitional strategy as a "recipe" for conflict. Conservative Party education spokesperson, Andrew Gerber (The Natal Mercury, 27 January 1993: 1) outlined his party's position:

.... the acceptance of a single education department would lead to total integration in education in South Africa. The CP rejects this and insists on CNE and mother-tongue instruction. We reject every attempt by the government to integrate.

Against the foregoing discussion, an evaluation of the policy area of transformation in education is undertaken.

3.4.1.3 Evaluation

This section provided a brief discussion of transitional developments in education from three sectors: political organizations, the private sector and the state. Since the task of restructuring the education system is still in progress, it is not possible to arrive at a conclusive evaluation of this policy area. However, as mentioned earlier (cf paragraph 3.4.1), a telling indictment against most policy-players at the time was their inability to provide proactive strategies to manage education system change.
Since 27 April 1994, there is a more definitive attempt emerging, in line with earlier government initiatives, to consolidate the race-based education structures into a unitary education system. A strategic management team has been appointed on an interim basis to manage the transition to a new education system. This team is working in consultation with the heads of the current departments to ensure continuity, plan and manage the rationalization of existing education departments into national and provincial departments (Sunday Tribune Herald, 12 June 1994: 4).

The next step would be the devolution of powers and functions to the provincial education departments.

Transforming the education system, however, involves much more than simply rationalizing the various education authorities. It requires a careful consideration of the governance structure that would be democratic both in the processes of policy formulation and implementation. Against this background, the following section explores options for a post-apartheid system of education governance.

3.4.2 Education governance

A racially-based system of governance has been the central feature of apartheid education. This racial fragmentation of governance structures has resulted in wastage of funds and restricted parental participation in decision-making, even where parents make substantial contributions to the capital and recurrent costs of local schooling.

Consistent demands have been for a unitary education system and democratic system of governance that facilitate participation of all legitimate interest groups in the decision-making process at all levels within the system.

Over the past few years, two major policy initiatives have emerged from different sectors of the education community. The
first was the state's "Education Renewal Strategy: Discussion Document" which was made public in 1990 after fourteen months of intensive research. This was followed by the HOA announcement of a series of new governance options (Clase Models) for white schools.

The response of the democratic movement came in the form of the NEPI governance options which were published in 1993.

Both initiatives are given special attention in this section.

3.4.2.1 Education Renewal Strategy position

The final report of the ERS entitled "Education Renewal Strategy: Management Solutions for Education in South Africa" is extensively discussed in this section.

In evaluating the present education model, the working group of the ERS (DNE 1992: 15) stated:

"... many South Africans view the present racially-based education system, as embodied in the independent education departments for each population group, as lacking in legitimacy. Others finding less fault with the idea of separateness, still have problems with the managerial effectiveness of the system."

This is not so much because the education system attempts to accommodate diversity in society, but rather because an unacceptable and educationally irrelevant basis for accommodating diversity, namely race, has been used in providing education instead of different bases arising naturally from society itself.

In designing a new model for the governance of education in South Africa, the ERS (DNE 1992: 17) listed the following core objectives:
equal opportunities;

the promotion of national unity;

the recognition and accommodation of language, cultural, religious and other legitimate interests;

the elimination of discrimination on the grounds of race, colour and gender;

the provision of personpower for national needs;

the forming of whole human beings; and

the sharing of responsibilities for the provision of education between the state and interested sectors, such as the parent community.

After considering the advantages and disadvantages of centralization and decentralization, the conclusion was reached that although certain central structures are necessary for the sake of the broad synchronization and integration of the education system and to ensure the necessary cohesion in the development of education, there is, however, also a need for a strong decentralized system in which original authority for the provision of education is vested in the lower authorities. Eventually a new education dispensation will therefore mean placing the authority levels encountered in a pyramidal pattern from the central to the local level in a certain relationship to each other. Educational functions have, consequently, to be allocated in accordance with the powers of every level of authority (DNE 1992: 23).

The proposal regarding the governance of education, containing a clear standpoint (2.3) for a single "central education authority", a network of "regional departments", and a commitment to the principle of "maximum functionally justifiable devolution of
decision-making power to the community or individual institution", is upheld throughout (DNE 1992: 23). In terms of this structure, it is proposed that the central education authority be given the responsibility "for policy on norms and standards in respect of crucial matters in education, and should be responsible for categories of institutions of a more national character which enjoy a very large degree of autonomy". It is further felt that political responsibility and accountability should be established at different levels and other functions relating to education "can fall under the jurisdiction of regional departments" (DNE 1992: 24).

The same standpoint (2.3) indicates that "various categories of public schools should be established and equitably funded and that "differences between these schools" should "relate to differences in levels of management autonomy" (DNE 1992: 24).

The report recommends that "schools wishing to co-operate in the provision of resources should organize themselves into some kind of regional, developmental or value-centered organizational grouping" (DNE 1992: 23-24).

It is clear that the state cannot, and should not, assume total and sole responsibility for education. Education is an exercise in partnership, in which a variety of interested parties such as the state, the organized teaching profession, parents and the broader community, industry and commerce, and other employment groups, as well as learners are involved (DNE 1992: 24).

The report thus recommends that "involvement of the community in school education can, inter alia, be obtained by the systematic establishment of management councils at schools, which, depending on the abilities and wishes of the school community concerned, could function according to different measures of management autonomy" (DNE 1992: 79).
Greater decision-making autonomy for the management councils will, according to the report, imply greater responsibility with regard to financial management for those councils; an aspect that will be discussed under finance in the next section.

Furthermore, the report states that the establishment of the so-called Model C schools within the DEC: HOA brought particularly important principles and experiences to the fore. The Model C initiative, according to the report, could be used as a basis for the establishment and effective functioning of management councils and the obtaining of community involvement at schools.

Finally, the report proposes that education authorities could embark on programmes to educate parent communities on the role and responsibilities of management councils at schools. Consideration could also be given to representation, by giving observer status to elected learners on management councils of secondary schools when certain matters come up for discussion, in cases where communities believe that there is a need for this (DNE 1992: 80).

In contrast, NEPI presents two perspectives on a possible system of school governance.

3.4.2.2 National Education Policy Investigation position

The Governance and Administration report of NEPI represents a compilation of research findings conducted by members of the Administration and Control subgroup and the Policy and Planning subgroup. It is an attempt to describe these findings in terms of two perspectives on a possible transformed governance system, within the framework of the NEPI principles (non-racism, non-sexism, democracy, a unitary system and redress). As a result, both have a great deal in common and are treated here as two perspectives on education governance rather than as separate options.
a. The system perspective

The system perspective takes as its starting point the need to change the whole system, and sees the administration and control of schools as part of the governance of education in general, which, in turn, constitutes part of the broader development strategy of society. This approach sees one important role of governance to be the accountable, equitable, and efficient control over the generation, distribution, and utilization of resources (physical, human and financial) (NEPI 1993:161).

The system perspective proposes that change to the system of governance will take place through a process of negotiation and suggests a set of principles to guide this process. In brief, these principles include:

* commitment to a network of core values;

* ensuring the widest possible participation of all constituencies without sacrificing efficiency;

* coherence and national unity;

* provision for both administrative and political accountability;

* the need to maintain coherence of a unitary national education system;

* differential participation, to allow a wide cross-section of groups to participate in policy formulation, while other more directly accountable groups are responsible for adoption and implementation; and

* provision of differentiated policy rights, and clear allocation of resources or resource-generation capacity to decision-making authorities (NEPI 1993:161).
A second set of principles suggests that the process of transition to a new governance structure should provide for continuity with the existing system, thus allowing a process of phased change.

The system perspective outlines a conceptual framework whereby the processes of policy formulation and consultation, adoption, implementation, and monitoring occur in four domains across the system. In addition to these four domains, the document proposes four levels of governance: national, regional, local and school. It is proposed that policy is formulated through consultation with statutory consultative bodies which are constituted on the basis of stakeholder participation. Such consultation would be a legal requirement before any legislation affecting policy is passed. The consultation structure is also seen to be a vehicle by which political authorities could access public opinion or, alternatively, through which organizations in civil society could lobby authorities on policy implementation issues (NEPI 1993: 161-162).

The adoption of policy, according to this perspective, is the responsibility of politically accountable authorities at each level (Minister of Education, regional authority, local authority, and school governing bodies), while the implementation of policy becomes the responsibility of the administrative machinery (national department of education, regional department of education, district education authority, and school management committee).

The approach incorporates a monitoring system with special responsibility for monitoring the setting and achievement of equity/quality targets and the provision of accurate, reliable data for planning and for lending coherence to the system. The monitoring system is a separate, slim administrative structure which reports directly to the National Assembly and also performs an ombudsperson function (NEPI 1993: 162).
The four-level structure proposed provides for short accountability cycles for policy and implementation issues. It also makes provision for a process of negotiated autonomy at the district level, so that the transfer of authority over certain issues is undertaken on a phased and negotiated basis. The approach also stresses the need for a clear definition of policy issues on which local discretion is granted at each level.

b. The school governance perspective

The second perspective examined in the report is the school governance perspective, which takes as its starting point the need for democratic and accountable participation of parents, teachers, and students in the governance of education at the level of the school. From this perspective, a framework of supporting institutions is proposed at each of four levels (NEPI 1993 : 162-163).

Essentially, the structure consists of a national single ministry responsible for education policy and planning, with all key decisions centralized at this level. Below this, a series of regional education boards are proposed. These boards are comprised of representatives from the next level down (school boards) plus representatives of mass-based organizations involved in education at the regional level, and the public officials involved in implementing the system (NEPI 1993 : 163).

At the local level, the perspective proposes that school boards be established, with control over a number of schools in a local district. The boards would consist of representatives from the PTSAs in the relevant district, plus representatives of mass-based organizations operating at local level. The PTSA is proposed as the governing council of the school, with authority over the school management executive, which, in turn, is responsible for the day-to-day management of the school (NEPI 1993 : 163).
In contrast to the system perspective, which envisages policy formulation taking place in the consultative councils, the school governance perspective recommends that policy formulation take place within the Ministry, with limited control over policy in the boards at regional, local and school level. The approach distinguishes between participation in these bodies in a management capacity and in a representative capacity, and seeks to integrate policy formulation, adoption and implementation within the boards.

In seeking to ensure transparency and accountability, the perspective envisages a number of policy forums between each level. These bodies would perform a monitoring and advisory function, but would not have executive authority. They would serve to link the different levels of governance to promote coherence of the system (NEPI 1993 : 163).

Both perspectives, in seeking to incorporate the NEPI principles into a governance system, propose consideration of a four-tier system with broad-based and effective participation. Both stress the need for a clear differentiation of powers and functions at the different levels, and both emphasize the need for monitoring to ensure the protection of equity, efficiency and quality. They agree on the important role of the state in redressing past imbalances and ensuring equity in the allocation of resources, as well as providing for capacity-building to ensure that all communities are able to participate actively in school governance. The two perspectives also agree on the need for a clear, unitary, national policy framework (NEPI 1993 : 163).

The perspectives differ more in the mechanisms advocated for achieving these goals than in the proposals themselves. The system perspective provides for interest group participation in a network of consultative councils, while the school governance perspective provides for participation of key social forces in the main policy bodies at each level (NEPI 1993 : 164).
Finally, the report suggests some immediate steps towards transition, including an Enabling Act ratified by the interim government. This Act should increase the power of a radically transformed DNE, and also increase co-operative agreement between existing departments at a regional level. Also suggested are a Committee of Director-Generals, with powers to enforce co-operation in terms of an agreed code of conduct, and the setting of target dates for submission of rationalization procedures for each region (NEPI 1993: 165).

The perspectives of political organizations and the private sector in relation to school governance policies are somewhat limited, as will be shown in the following section.

3.4.2.3 Political organizations and the private sector

At the time of writing, the positions of political organizations and the private sector in this domain had not been elaborated in sufficient detail to guide analysis of education policies. Generally, all tend to cohere around the two major initiatives, that is, the ERS and NEPI, favouring a shift towards decentralized/regionalized models in varying degrees.

a. Democratic Party position

The Democratic Party (1990: 1), in line with its federalist tendencies, commits itself to bring about a new South African education system, by negotiation, which will contain, amongst others, the following basic precepts:

One Education Ministry, with devolved regional (geographical) education departments. The central department should be responsible for broad policy matters, the distribution of finances from treasury to regions, the co-ordination of inter-regional activities, the creation and continuous assessment of a core curricula structure for the school levels, as well as the assessment of regions to ensure that overall policy directives are effected.
According to the Democratic Party (1990: 1), the education system must allow for the greatest possible devolution of executive decision-making to regional and school level consistent with national level co-ordination.

In an interview with Post (16-18 September 1992: 9), Roger Burrows, education spokesperson for the Democratic Party, confirmed his party's strong federal policy:

*We believe the regions of South Africa (borders of which should be agreed upon by all parties) should have executive administration of all schools within a region. When one realizes that there are already 11 million children at school in South Africa, then it is nonsense to believe that all should be run from one point.*

The IFP position, to some extent, bears resemblance to that of the Democratic Party.

*b. Inkatha Freedom Party position*

In an interview with V.T. Zulu (in Ebrahim 1992: 26), the then Deputy Minister of Education for KwaZulu, he stated:

*Regional administration within a central National Education Department would be best able to deal with local sensitivities. While a fully-devolved education system (where local authorities set policy) would be unmanageable, there should always be the option of opting out of the state system if a community cared to pay the costs.*

The ANC, on the other hand, attempts to find a middle ground between centralization and decentralization in relation to governance issues.
c. **African National Congress position**

According to the ANC (1991: 33), the democratization of the education system can best be achieved by creating a balance between the role of the central state and that of the regional and local authorities. While the central state should be responsible for financing education, the development of a national curriculum, and the development and maintenance of national standards, regional and local authorities should be responsible for the day-to-day administration and management of the education system (ANC 1991: 33).

Furthermore, the ANC (1992a: 14) believes that teachers, students and parents through their organizations should be represented in the decision-making structures at all levels of the education system.

The Conservative Party, in contrast, is committed to a policy of ethnic segregation.

d. **Conservative Party position**

The Conservative Party, in keeping with its policy of separate development for the different "nations" of South Africa, commits itself to a policy of ethnic separation in education.

In an interview, Dominee Andrew Gerber (Cross Times, June 1990: 19), Conservative Party education spokesperson, stated:

> *We stand for the division between the different peoples of South Africa, with each group being responsible for their own affairs. We will create different independent states, as they are at the moment, for the different black people and in their own states they will determine their own education policy. We would never accept one education department for the whole country.*
As in the case of the Conservative Party, the private sector has also not provided comprehensive policy proposals in this particular area of education.

\subsection*{Private sector position}

The private sector position in the area of governance has been limited. While the business sector has become increasingly involved in the peripheral aspects of the system, largely through its support of the NGO movement, the only significant private sector policy initiative with relevance for governance is the involvement of PRISEC in the ERS investigation.

This sector has established a number of organizations, including the South African Association of Independent Schools (SAAIS), but there has been no clear policy commitment with regard to governance. However, a general concern expressed by the private schools movement is the desire that any new governance structure should provide for the continued protection and support of schools in the independent sector.

Against this background, an evaluation of developments in the policy area of school governance is undertaken.

\subsection*{Evaluation}

There are some points of consensus between the ERS and NEPI over the issue of education governance. The former government was clearly committed to a philosophy of decentralization, as is evident with the release of the final ERS report. Essentially, the ERS calls for a three-tier control structure with limited powers at the centre, significant powers devolved to the regional level, and the maximum devolution of power to individual institutions. The regional departments have responsibility for most policy issues save those provided by the central authority. There is considerable commitment to devolution of power to school
or community, particularly the school management councils. The report proposes different degrees of autonomy to be granted to different schools, though this should not be primarily based on funding. While the report makes no mention of PTSAs, it does acknowledge the possibility of students at secondary schools having observer status on management councils. This position represents a major departure from previous policy and practice which was highly centralized.

NEPI, on the other hand, has not explicitly committed itself to a policy of educational decentralization, although the notion of community control may be consistent with the philosophy of decentralization. Both the system perspective and school governance perspective propose consideration of a four-tier system of governance: national, regional, local and school within a unitary education system with a single central ministry. They agree on the important role of the state in redressing past imbalances and ensuring equity in the allocation of resources, as well as in providing for capacity-building to ensure that all communities are able to participate actively in school governance. The perspectives differ more in the mechanisms advocated for achieving these goals than in the proposals themselves.

If one were to compare the two sets of principles in the ERS and NEPI report, it would not be difficult to notice that they are based on completely different assumptions. For one, the two initiatives have different starting points (the former technocratic in approach and implementation, whilst the latter has adopted an overtly political stance) and we can therefore assume that the underlying objectives for decentralization and the intended outcomes will be different.

However, we need to go beyond the stated objectives, to evaluate what the implications of these will be for effective governance of education. The main issue which needs to be addressed in terms of the ERS and NEPI options is whether decentralization does in
fact lead to community control of, or local participation in, education.

According to the ERS (DNE : 1992 : 21-22) :

*Meaningful decentralization in the form of original power at the second level of authority and a significant further devolution of power to lower authority and management levels are prerequisites for meaningful and responsible community involvement in education.*

The report (DNE 1992 : 22) further contends :

*... any form of decentralization must, at least, be accompanied by the devolution of financial accountability in education. History has shown that the centralization of financial accountability for education, while other responsibilities are decentralized, does not promote effective political responsibility for education on the decentralized levels.*

The rebuttal of this argument, in terms of NEPI, is that if one considers that "communities", as they are presently constituted, are a product of racial capitalism and apartheid laws such as the Group Areas Act, it is highly likely that "the devolution of responsibility to the local level" and "promotion of diversity" will ensure that inequalities along the lines of "race" and "class" not only persist, but that the values and interests of the dominant classes are safeguarded (Buckland, Kulati & Sayed 1992 : 6). Hence NEPI (1993 : 151) argues that such a policy may possibly provide more scope for community involvement, but will not, in the long run, transform the education system and overcome the historical legacies of apartheid education.

One of the major problems in understanding decentralization in education is the terminological confusion. One needs to ascertain whether the concept means the same thing within the ERS and NEPI discourse. For the ERS, the centralization/decentralization issue
tends to emphasize territorial demarcations and geographic regions as locus of control over education issues.

For NEPI, on the other hand, it is not whether the system should be "centralized" or "decentralized", but which policy issues should be controlled from the centre and which issues are more effectively determined at other levels in the system (Sayed 1992: 4).

From the preceding evaluation, it is evident that the best way to democratize education is not by wavering between centralized or decentralized modes of policy behaviour, but by rendering power visible and transparent. The net result of making power visible is that it can be challenged and struggled for. The most effective way to democratize education and to widen participation is by shifting the planning and implementation of education into the public domain where such processes can be subject to scrutiny by organizations, individuals, networks and social movements located in society.

In the following section, the key policy area of financing education in a post-apartheid South Africa is examined.

3.4.3 Finance

The previous chapter provided a context for debate on the issue of financing education in a post-apartheid South Africa. It was found that the increasing social and economic demand for education, coupled with a reduced education budget, necessitated that innovative strategies be found to address economic issues in education.

Financial resources are the life-blood of the education system. How they are allocated, according to what formula, can be a highly involved technical issue with many direct policy implications. Nevertheless, the options of finance hinge on whether resources should come from public monies via the state, or from
private monies raised institutionally or, in the case of student fees, bursaries and loans, by individuals, companies and families.

Generally speaking, the more public finance is maximized, the greater the opportunity for the state, or some other controlling body will be, to pursue equity, especially in the short-term. The more private finance is maximized, the more institutional autonomy is facilitated, which, in turn, opens the way for institutional differentiation. The policy question about financing, therefore, is how to maximize the possibility for development without compromising the principle of equity.

In the following section, the ERS position with regard to financing education is discussed.

3.4.3.1 Education Renewal Strategy position

a. Compulsory education

The ERS report recommends the removal of race as a consideration in structuring a new education model.

Standpoint (2.1) reads (DNE 1992: 16):

Race should not feature in structuring the provision of education in a future education system for South Africa and justice in the provision of educational opportunities must be ensured.

A crucial principle of the new model is that of compulsory education for all, up to a level to be determined by the authorities. In terms of this principle, the state will assume "primary financial responsibility" for at least nine years of general compulsory education. This period of compulsory education will therefore be financed by the state at the rate of approximately 95% (DNE 1992: ix).
Standpoint (18.3) reads (DNE 1992 : 83):

The government will have to introduce a generally applicable minimum period of compulsory school for which the state must assume primary financial responsibility. At the same time, those clients of the education system who are no longer of compulsory school-going age will have to bear an increasing share of the cost of education themselves.

Proposals for the creation of management councils are problematic since management members tend to lack the expertise for their new tasks.

b. Management councils

Greater decision-making autonomy for the management councils of schools will, within the framework of equal state financing of schools and irrespective of the level of autonomy, imply greater responsibility with regard to financial management for those councils. Councils could, for example, be responsible for budgeting for their schools and determining the amount that parents should contribute. Councils should, within the framework of a human rights charter and existing education policy, be able to determine the admissions policy of the school and, in consultation with the regional department concerned, to appoint, promote and retrench teachers in accordance with prescribed procedure. Councils could also be responsible for the management of all expenditure and purchases of schools (DNE 1992 : 80).

To decentralize the matters mentioned above in a meaningful way, the report states that management councils would have to be invested with a considerable degree of autonomy in regard to the handling of funds.
c. **Funding**

It is proposed that each school establishes a type A fund and a type B fund wherever possible.

The type A funds should be deposited funds provided by the state to enable the school, in accordance with its management model, to assume responsibility for its own financial management. Type B funds should be established for the purpose of managing all funds generated by the school itself. Specific contributions to type B funds should, if at all possible, qualify for some form of tax relief for donors (DNE 1992: 82).

An important theme underlying many of the recommendations is the need for rationalization and cost-effectiveness. This leads to recommendations about the optimum use of empty and under-utilized schools, and the use of more cost-effective norms for buildings.

By contrast, NEPI outlines a series of options for financing education.

3.4.3.2 **National Education Policy Investigation position**

NEPI's view of the financing of education in a new education system is found in its final report on "Education Planning, Systems and Structure" (NEPI 1993: 133-152). This report draws heavily on a working paper, "Reorganising the Education System - possibilities for the year 2000", submitted to NEPI by Andrew Donaldson (1992: 1-36), in which he outlined a strategy for achieving both a unification of the racially-divided education system and an equitable allocation of government subsidization. Both these documents are used interchangeably in this section.

Since a substantial increase in the education budget in real terms is not likely to be affordable, a redistribution within the budget will have to be sought to ameliorate structural
deficiencies within the South African education system. This will involve, firstly, shifts in education investment spending away from the high-maintenance suburban school infrastructure towards upgrading township and rural school facilities, and, secondly, shifts in current spending patterns (NEPI 1993 : 143).

The underlying concern, persistent throughout the NEPI initiative, is the question of the financial implications of deracialization for the education system. In other words, the emphasis is, for obvious reasons, on what happens within the formerly "White", and to some extent, the "Coloured" and "Indian" schools. Deracialization, in the context of NEPI, would mean more than the opening of schools to all. Rather, the critical issue is a new set of rules which will govern access to schools, which, for historical reasons, are better equipped, better staffed and generally better able to provide a good quality education.

Justice clearly demands that these "suburban" (privileged) schools, should not just be nominally "open", but should also be accessible to larger numbers of pupils. NEPI thus outlines several approaches for financing schooling.

a. Community-based approach

The first option put forward in the NEPI report is a "community-based approach" which would release schooling from state jurisdiction and encourage, with state grant funding in low-income areas, community initiatives aimed at education renewal. Local ventures have more flexibility than bureaucratic approaches to education development and can draw innovatively on local resources.

As in the case of the ERS proposal, if government reduces subsidization of schools, then it must yield responsibility for maintaining the solvency of the school enterprise to local school governing bodies. According to NEPI (1993 : 144), maximum decentralization is achieved when autonomous schools are
subsidized through an enrolment-based subsidy formula, subject to appropriate regulations and audit requirements. Moves in this direction will release departmental administrative, inspection, advisory and support services, formerly devoted to conserving the privileged school system, for deployment in township and rural school development. International assistance and NGOs could play useful roles here, but the redistributive potential of a transfer of the state’s educational administrative apparatus from managing suburban schools to upgrading township and rural education should be explored (NEPI 1993 : 144).

Even if suburban schools become largely self-managing, there will be important co-ordination functions to be fulfilled. Several forms of joint management or collaboration amongst schools might evolve. One is the loose affiliation of schools for information-sharing and lobbying purposes. Standardization of management agreements or constitutions, joint purchasing of supplies, agreements on personal renumeration, and common curricula might emerge. Local or regional collaboration or joint management models can also be described. Costs of services could be charged to schools, but the advantages of collaboration, nonetheless, might be considerable (NEPI 1993 : 144).

The involvement of parents and other local interests in the financing and management of schools should also be viewed as contributing to internal efficiency in school administration, both in providing local accountability and in bringing into school governance people with strong incentives to improve the quality of schooling. Partnerships between local school governing bodies and NGOs involved in school upgrading will need to be fostered. Government can support the involvement of private projects in school development through the provision of institutional resources (NEPI 1993 : 145).
b. Expansion and desegregation of schools

The second option would be to expand and desegregate suburban schools. The obvious advantage of this approach is that suburban schools would cease to be the preserve of the privileged. By both expanding enrolments and shifting an increased share of costs onto parents, considerable reductions in the per-pupil state subsidy to suburban schools might be achieved, releasing state resources for increased spending in township and rural schooling (NEPI 1993 : 143).

According to Donaldson (1992 : 14), the challenge in this approach is to rearrange school financing and rules of access in ways which ensure that those who can afford to pay for the privilege of attending suburban schools do so, while those who have the required abilities but lack the financial resources are also afforded access.

It could be argued that this approach will ensure the expansion of enrolment in suburban schools, but there will be additional costs incurred. Consumption of supplies and maintenance costs will increase, and additional teachers will typically be required for some subjects, for example, languages. Where school buildings are currently under-utilized, and where schools have been closed, staff will have to be hired and furniture and materials supplied for these facilities to be restored to use. At least, in the early years of deracialization, pupils coming from other schools may need specialized assistance for adjustment.

c. Reduce state spending

A third alternative would be to cut state spending on suburban schools. In wealthier neighbourhoods, higher school fees and other charges may substitute for state subsidies, but the privileged suburban school system may continue to remain white (NEPI 1993 : 143).
The three approaches to education spending discussed above are evolutionary in nature. NEPI also gives consideration to redistribute options for schooling.

d. **Equalize spending**

In the fourth option, the state might equalize its spending and prohibit fees or private contributions to schooling. Reforms of this kind point to a more fundamental policy dilemma. Although the goal of equalizing education opportunities would be served by enforcing equalization of school resources per capita, the consequential qualitative decay of the existing suburban and private school system would have undesirable political and economic effects. Progress towards equity in education entitlements needs to be balanced against preservation of existing good-quality schooling (NEPI 1993: 144).

e. **Subsidizing low-income neighbourhood schools**

The fifth and final option considered by NEPI and elaborated by Donaldson is that of subsidizing schools only in low-income neighbourhoods. In this approach, one might link the per-pupil subsidy to an index of relative need, such as local per capita income (NEPI 1993: 143). The challenge here would be to finance the enrichment of the quality of township and rural schooling, currently severely disadvantaged and in need of thorough renewal.

f. **Subsidization formula**

According to Donaldson (1992: 22), each of the five NEPI options discussed above should be linked to some type of subsidization formula for schools, irrespective of whether these schools are suburban, township or rural.

If the goal is equity in state subsidization of public schooling, then the simplest way of achieving this is through a "fixed per
capita subsidy" of state-aided and departmental schools, set at appropriate amounts for each school level. Amounts would be adjusted annually to reflect both inflation of costs and changing fiscal circumstances: with economic prosperity would come the capacity to increase the subsidy. The subsidy going to any school would depend on enrolment, which provides something of an incentive for schools to maintain competitive standards. It should be apparent that this approach would greatly reduce state subsidization in privileged (high-income) areas, but would allow schools in these areas to raise additional funds through fees and other levies. Responsibility for balancing revenue and spending rests with the school itself or with the local school authorities (Donaldson 1992: 22).

The most important advantage of this approach is that it "decentralizes" the initiatives which lie behind establishment and expansion of schools and other changes. As communities grow, they can establish the schools they need; the state undertakes to subsidize schools wherever children are enrolled and attending. It is also clear that such a formula encourages local school authorities to take an active interest in school affairs and administration (Donaldson 1992: 22).

The alternative to a formula based on per capita school subsidization is a system of incremental departmental budgeting in which the resources which go to any school depend essentially on the resources it obtained the previous year. From the perspective of government planners and treasury officials, this has the appearance of greater control and accountability, but it is clear that the bureaucratic costs of monitoring item-based school financing are considerable. It is difficult to achieve redistribution under such a system. Particularly when educational infrastructure is inadequate and resources are unequally distributed, the tendency is for most schools to remain congested, while elites with access to political influence ensure that better schools remain better funded (Donaldson 1992: 23).
That a single ministry responsible for national education would be more cost-effective than the fragmented system inherited from apartheid, is quite obvious. Yet, government expenditure patterns show that realizing greater cost-effectiveness will not happen automatically. When departments get larger, the proportional costs of management, inspection, accounting and control increase. This suggests that integrating township and rural schooling into the white education system would be too costly, because it is difficult to deal with such a massive expansion in numbers.

What followed was an attempt by NEPI to outline a strategy for achieving a more equitable allocation of government subsidization and a more disciplined and streamlined approach to education spending. This is, of course, dependent primarily on economic growth and not just a matter of changing figures on budget documents.

Political organizations, on the other hand, have yet to put forward elaborate guidelines for financing education in a new dispensation.

3.4.3.3 Political organizations

To date, policy initiatives in the financial provision of education on the part of political organizations and the private sector have been limited. Most, if not all, have not ventured beyond the practice of making general statements or proposing broad characterizations of what they envisage in a new education model.

For example, the Democratic Party (1990 : 2) calls for:

*Free and compulsory schooling in the pre-primary (fundamental) and primary phases. Schooling in the secondary phase should be funded in accordance with the financial ability of the state, taking into account the need to provide for scholarships, bursaries and loans to allow pupils with particular skills and aptitudes to continue their schooling.*
Roger Burrows (Post, 16-18 September 1992 : 9), Democratic Party education spokesperson, outlined his party's programme for reducing education costs:

* eliminate racial structuring of departments;
* reduce bureaucratic wastage;
* stop corruption of officials and politicians; and
* divert funds from the SADF to education.

The ANC, on the other hand, is committed to the provision of free and compulsory education up to the junior secondary level, that is, a minimum of ten years of education (seven years of primary and three years of junior secondary). It proposes that provision of free education to the senior secondary level should be progressively expanded pending the availability of funds (ANC 1992a: 33).

In the light of the above discussion, considerable research still needs to be undertaken by political organizations in the area of financing education. In the following section, an evaluation of this policy area is undertaken.

### 3.4.3.4 Evaluation

From the preceding analysis, it is evident that broad points of agreement have emerged in respect of financing education from the two major initiatives, the ERS and NEPI. These include:

* the creation of a unified national education department and a cost-effective education policy;

* the equalization of educational opportunity;

* the need to improve the quality of schooling in disadvantaged communities and maintain standards in privileged communities;
the need to broaden the range of state subsidization options and allow freedom of choice;

the need to improve access to institutions for pupils from disadvantaged communities; and

the need to give greater administrative and, wherever possible, financial responsibility to school communities.

However, significant disagreement or competing interpretations exist amongst key policy-players. These are:

the goal of "equity" and the meaning of "education equality" are understood in various ways with corresponding differing implications for education policy. Promoting equity through school education might be distinguished from the equity considerations that lie behind affirmative action in tertiary education;

the differences over the appropriate functions of central, regional and local authorities in the financing of education. Advocates of decentralization stress the advantages of local management and education choice, while arguments for a unitary education system emphasize the role of central government in ensuring equal access and redistribution of funding;

tension between sustaining academic excellence in the privileged schools and redistributing resources to the expanding, historically black schools;

competing views on the appropriate roles of government and private sources in financing and managing schools; and

conflict over what is referred to as "unilateral restructuring" of education or a closed bureaucratic affair and mass-based participation of all interests in education.
Also central to the education process is the issue of curriculum. A future curriculum will need to be developed in the broader political and socio-economic context of a post-apartheid society.

3.4.4 Curriculum

In the previous chapter, some attention was given to existing patterns of curriculum organization. It became evident that the structures and processes defining the South African curriculum emerge from a political history dominated by racial segregation and an education history embedded in the philosophy of Christian National Education. In addition, a number of key issues that need to be addressed in curriculum policy were discussed. These included: decision-making structures and processes; core curriculum and differentiation; commonality and diversity; assessment; and redress.

In this section, alternative curriculum models and positions on education which have curriculum implications will be analysed and evaluated thereby giving clarity to curriculum policy options in a post-apartheid South Africa.

3.4.4.1 Education Renewal Strategy position

While endorsing the principles of "equality of opportunity", "balance of commonality and diversity" and "freedom of choice", the ERS recognizes that the present education model does not measure up to this set of principles. Race, it argues, is not an acceptable basis for accommodating diversity. Instead, it recommends that race should not feature in structuring the provision of education in a future education model for South Africa and that justice and educational opportunities must be ensured (DNE 1991a : 21).
In its perspective, the ERS has recommended that (DNE 1991a: 22):

* the new education model should visibly promote and express national unity and freedom of association;

* adequate and satisfactory allowance should be made for the accommodation of diversity;

* together with the accommodation of diversity, allowance should have to be made for decentralized control to eliminate bureaucratic inertia and encourage community involvement; and

* the new education system must provide for the existence of a centralized education authority as well as departments of education, possibly regionally-based.

In addition, ACUMSA (DNE 1991b: vii) recommends a modified education structure of three years junior primary followed by four years senior primary, two years junior secondary and three years senior secondary. The first three education phases should have a more uniform core curriculum with emphasis on general formative education. In the senior secondary phase, subject packages can be constructed with a broad emphasis on either generally oriented or vocationally oriented or vocational education (DNE 1991b: 21).

By contrast, NEPI provides a series of policy options in relation to curriculum.

3.4.4.2 National Education Policy Investigation position

The Curriculum Models Group is a sub-group of the Curriculum Research Group which, in turn, is one of the 12 education areas investigated by NEPI. The specific brief of the Curriculum Models Group was to identify, examine and assess the major alternative models for curriculum and their implications. The investigation
of curriculum models was carried out within the framework of the five NEPI principles: non-racism; non-sexism; democracy; equality; and redress. In the final report of the NEPI investigation, a number of options along the spectrum of centralization and decentralization of curriculum decision-making, core and differentiated curriculum, and commonality and diversity were explored. What follows is a presentation of the NEPI options for curriculum decision-making.

a. Curriculum decision-making

In curriculum decision-making, the following options are offered (NEPI 1993: 107-110):

i. Highly centralized curriculum decision-making

* A standard curriculum would be developed centrally, with no regional or local variation.

* A national system of assessment and certification would further ensure standardization.

* Equity targets for the curriculum would be set and appraised centrally.

* Resources would be allocated centrally.

* Commissioning, approval, provision, and distribution of textbooks would take place centrally.

ii. Highly decentralized curriculum decision-making

* The curriculum would be developed at regional and local level, and school-based curriculum development would be encouraged.
There would be no standardized curriculum – the pattern of curriculum organization would be defined regionally and would be able to take different forms.

Regional assessment and certification would encourage curriculum diversity.

Equity targets would be set and appraised regionally.

Revenues from regional public authorities would supplement curriculum resources provided nationally.

Commissioning, approval, provision, and distribution of textbooks would take place regionally.

iii. Combination of centralization and decentralization

The curriculum would be developed both nationally and regionally. A national curriculum body would be responsible for setting overall curriculum policies and for developing guidelines and frameworks for a core curriculum. Regional bodies would develop these more fully into syllabuses and programmes of study. Local bodies such as teachers' centres could also participate in curriculum development under certain guidelines. Through this process, there would be a standardized national curriculum with regional variation.

National assessment would take place at one or more "exit points" (eg. Std. 10). Other assessments would take place at regional level.

Resources would be provided by the state at the central level, with guidelines and limits for resource supplementation at regional and local levels.

Strategies for redress could be developed and implemented centrally.
Procedures and guidelines for commissionary, selection, approval, and distribution of textbooks would take place centrally. Regional bodies would have the authority to operate within these guidelines.

While the description of curriculum decision-making structures as essentially "centralized" or "decentralized" may be useful in theory, in practice, all structures are combinations of both. Allied to this, is the issue of whether a core or differentiated curriculum would best serve the interests of society.

b. Core or differentiated curriculum

The following options are outlined in relation to core curriculum and differentiation (NEPI 1993: 109-111):

i. A core curriculum

* All students would follow the same national core curriculum for the compulsory and post-compulsory phases of schooling.

* The core curriculum would be defined centrally and disseminated through regional and local structures without alteration.

* Assessment at national or regional level could be used to encourage standardization.

ii. A differentiated curriculum

At the other end of the spectrum lies a highly differentiated curriculum. In an extreme form, students would be streamed according to ability and would follow different, probably modular-based, curricula to suit their different interests. This, according to the NEPI report (1993: 111), is not a fully feasible policy option in terms of either the NEPI guiding
principles or practical considerations of implementation.

**iii. A combination of core and differentiation**

A national core curriculum would be designed centrally. Regional bodies would then have the authority to design components of the curriculum to reflect local interests and local knowledge. This could be done in a number of ways:

* the national body could develop broad frameworks and guidelines which regional bodies then develop into more detailed syllabuses incorporating local interests;

* the national body could develop more core modules to which regional bodies add local components; and

* the national body could develop core modules to be studied by all students. Regional bodies could then develop supplementary models to accompany the core.

Another variation of this is to have the same core curriculum for all students at primary and middle-school level and to introduce differentiation at the senior secondary or post-compulsory level. At this level, a modular system could be implemented to introduce greater flexibility. Core components could be undertaken by all students, while modular courses allow for different choices of non-core subjects.

However, care would need to be exercised in the construction of core and non-core offerings to ensure that the curriculum did not run counter to equity goals. For example, no differentiation should be made in terms of gender or race, except for specific redress measures. Differentiation favouring specific "cultural" (read "racial") groups would also need to be guarded against. Decisions about the nature and range of subjects in the curriculum are appropriately taken once decisions about core and differentiation are made.
The issue of whether curriculum should emphasize the common or diverse is a major policy challenge. There is no simple solution, and it is likely that policies will take time to develop. When considering the above issue, some attention also needs to be given to the structure of the schooling system.

c. Structure of schooling

Reform of the structure of schooling is a critical aspect of good-quality basic education. Maintenance of the present structure of seven years primary and five years secondary schooling is one option to be considered. An alternative, according to NEPI (1993 : 145), would be the replacement of the present structure with a unitary, six-year primary school, and a three-year middle school offering a common, general education to all South African citizens, followed by differentiated education and training options after about age fifteen. At the root of the argument for a six-year primary school is the idea of basic education as an effective, good-quality foundation for further education. The middle school, which would mark a new beginning in secondary education, will offer considerable variety on a wide range of education and training options (NEPI 1993 : 145).

Various approaches to developing the supply of post-basic education and training are described by NEPI (1993 : 148-149). In the "German model", secondary education in preparation for higher education is limited to about a quarter of graduates from basic education, and most school-leavers go on to formal apprenticeships in a wide variety of career options. The advantages for this model are that a quality academic education is secured, and VET can be well-managed and appropriately targeted under the control of chambers of commerce and industry.

The "American model" is in favour of diversified high schools and post-secondary colleges, in which choice and diversity within educational institutions are maximized. Active "markets" for VET
programmes keep the system responsive to changing needs and priorities, but the running costs of diversified schools and colleges are high.

The "Asian model" gives emphasis to development of specialized secondary schools and colleges aimed at providing a broad curriculum with strong career orientations, often maintained through close links between colleges and commerce and industry.

A "Latin model" provides a well-developed non-formal VET which compensates for deficiencies in the formal and college systems (NEPI 1993 : 148-149).

A balanced education and training system in South Africa will probably involve elements of each of these models, but difficult choices will have to be made between emphasis on, and resources devoted to, secondary schools, post-secondary colleges, adult education, and university and technikon education.

Any new curriculum in South Africa will be built on the legacy of the old, and there will be points of continuity as well as points of departure. There is no blueprint for the future, no ideal curriculum for every time and place. What the NEPI report sets out are possible frameworks for change and negotiation in curriculum policy.

In the following section, curriculum policies of political organizations and the private sector are discussed.

3.4.4.3 Political organizations and the private sector

The different political organizations have been unable, thus far, to formulate comprehensive short-to long-term curriculum policies for educational development.
a. *African National Congress proposal*

The ANC documents make few references to curriculum specifically, though broad positions can be inferred from general statements on education. The curriculum discourse of this organization should be interpreted in the context of a commitment to a broader set of education principles: non-racism and non-sexism in education; democracy and participation in education; and the development of a unitary education system.

Curriculum objectives have been frequently articulated, even if seldom elaborated, by the ANC (1992a: 33):

*the democratic participation of parents, teachers and students in the decision-making structures at all levels of the education system;*

*the development of curriculum which is relevant to both the needs of the individual, as well as the social and economic needs of society; and*

*the elimination of race (non-racist) and sex (non-sexist) discrimination in the school curriculum.*

At the time of writing, the exact mechanism through which these and other objectives were to be achieved in the domain of curriculum was not elaborated. This criticism could also be levelled at the Democratic Party.
b. Democratic Party proposal

The Democratic Party education policy document falls short of addressing curriculum issues in any significant manner. However, it does mention (Democratic Party 1990: 3):

An assessment is required of the current curricula and syllabuses in almost all areas of skills. The Ministry of Education must commence a process of such reassessment, utilizing the broadest possible range of educationists in the South African community.

Like the Democratic Party, the private sector also lacks a clear approach to curriculum.

c. The private sector proposal

The private sector does not have a comprehensive curriculum model strategy for South African education. There is emerging, however, a pattern of curriculum organization expressed in the following proposals (PRISEC 1991: 2):

* a strong technical bias in the school curriculum;

* a strong matching of curriculum content with the requirements of the economic sector;

* a non-racial curriculum which is provided to all students within a unitary education system;

* an improved access to curriculum opportunities for all students; and

* a strong emphasis on improving the quality of curriculum in technology-related subjects such as science and mathematics.
This sector proposes a non-racist curriculum located within a unitary education system but is silent on sexism. Equality is the goal but little is concretely proposed about how this will be achieved outside of providing access to non-racial institutions. Redress is implicit in present funding priorities targeting black schools, and, with reference to curriculum, this support is phrased in terms of improving the quality of education and increasing access to opportunities.

The IFP, on the other hand, views curriculum from a predominantly cultural perspective.

d. Inkatha Freedom Party proposal

The IFP takes the view that Western education was introduced into black Africa without taking into consideration the black people's culture, history, or ethos. This type of education remained basically academic and foreign to African life, for it did not include the cultural-historical norms and values of the people to whom it was offered. Inkatha, in its capacity as the government of the former KwaZulu homeland, introduced ubuntu/botho as an additional school subject in all schools under the jurisdiction of the then KwaZulu Education Department. Ubuntu/botho refers to the human qualities that are acquired by an individual through personal enablement and moulding by voluntarily and intentionally accepting and internalizing human norms and values in terms of the culture and philosophical convictions of the people. It should be mentioned that the ideal of ubuntu/botho is a common spiritual ideal by which all black people south of the Sahara give meaning to life and reality - it is usually described as a (spiritual) foundation of all African societies (Mbongwe: 1992: 15).

Inkatha believes in an "open-ended" system of education for all cultural groups in South Africa as opposed to the idea of "own" system of education. While it is not ubuntu/botho to fail to honour, appreciate, preserve and enhance the dignity of human
beings and one's life values, it is equally not ubuntu/botho to segregate according to cultural differences. The education system of a united South Africa should prepare the child for life equipped with skills to tolerate, appreciate and prize the cultures and lifestyles of the Xhosas, Zulus, Afrikaners, Indians, Tswanas, Britons, Vendas, Tsongas, Sothos, Swazis and Coloureds, amongst others, in our heterogeneous diversity. This is the cultural-historical law of ubuntu/botho (Mbongwe 1992: 17-18).

The Conservative Party, in contrast, views curriculum from an Afrikaner Nationalist perspective.

e. Conservative Party proposal

One of the perspectives of the educational spectrum in South Africa is generally known as "Christelike volkseie onderwys", traditionally typified as "Christian National Education" (Heiberg 1992: 27-28). This concept derives from the unbreakable interrelationship between the realities of Bible, ethnos, ethnoculture, mother-tongue, education, teaching and educational management. These realities, and the way in which they are conceptualized, form the basis of this perspective.

According to this perspective, the Bible is the foundation of the Christian faith and way of life. Consequently, it is the basis of the Christian educational perspective and forms the foundation for the norms which are applied to the whole educative action. It provides a vision for the child, the meaning and aims of teaching and education, the teacher and his calling, the curriculum and its content, the management and control of the school and the respective roles of the partners in education. Education therefore cannot be neutral with regard to religion, since human beings and, hence, children are religious beings and are religiously aware. Christian parents have only one option for that base: the Bible as the Word of the Living God - this is not negotiable (Heiberg 1992: 28).
The second immutable truth on which Christian "volkseie" education is based, is the existence of the ethnos - in this specific case, the Afrikaner volk. The ethnos is consequently a real entity which is also not negotiable for Christian "volkseie" education.

Each particular ethnos creates its own particular culture. For this reason, the specific ethnic culture is a sine qua non for Christian "volkseie" education. There is no other way of steeping a child in a particular ethnic culture than via education. The cultural historical needs of the particular ethnus determine that the school should provide an optimal learning situation (Heiberg: 1992 : 30).

The school is in itself a sign that a particular ethnus or ethnic group wishes to continue that which it considers culturally viable. For this reason, a school can never transmit a universal culture to a pupil eventhough that which the child learns may have a universal aspect such as, for instance, in mathematics, science, art and economics. The whole didactic approach has an ethnospecific cultural style and a hidden curriculum which transforms it. Education must also propagate specific religious and cultural values by using specific subjects such as Bible education, mother-tongue instruction and the history of the ethnic group to transmit these values to children and to ensure their love for their own ethnic culture (Heiberg 1992 : 30).

In evaluating the different perspectives on curriculum issues, broad points of agreement as well as areas of difference have come to light.

3.4.4.4 Evaluation

A degree of convergence is reflected in the policy positions of the state, NEPI, private sector and most political organizations. Broadly speaking, areas of general agreement are:
* the recognition that the education system needs to be reshaped;

* the need for curriculum rationalization;

* the principle that general policy be decided centrally;

* the need to broaden the range and relevance of curriculum provision;

* the need to link education and training to economic planning;

* the need for participation of various groups in curriculum decision-making; and

* the need to incorporate principles of national reconciliation and embody a particular sensitivity to local needs.

However, there are substantial areas of difference. These include:

* different meanings attached to the principle of "equal opportunities";

* conceptions of the economy and manpower needs based on different views;

* diverging views on details of the school curriculum, structure, control and differentiated educational provision;

* disagreement about the appropriate structure and organization of VET;

* tension between sustaining academic excellence in the established institutions and redistribution of resources to the disadvantaged communities; and
competing views of the role of the state in curriculum development.

The ACUMSA proposal provides a useful starting point for negotiation over curriculum issues. ACUMSA recognizes that there should be participation in curriculum decision-making. The starting point for a national curriculum for a new society should be a set of principles and common ideals formulated by as broad a spectrum of interests and communities as possible.

There is also nothing intrinsically objectionable about introducing some vocational orientation into schools. After all, education is in some sense vocational in that it seeks to prepare children for adult life.

The model's emphasis on "general formative education" during the first nine years of school (primary plus junior secondary) is rational. While ACUMSA is also correct in pointing to the excessive university orientation of the present school curriculum, the proposed alternative is unlikely to overcome this.

It is, however, difficult to judge the state's new curriculum model, in part, as a result of considerable ambiguity around political terminology such as "diversity" or "cultural ways of life" or "specific demands and needs" and the institutional implications of such orientations. Although the phrase "specific demands and needs" appears several times in the document, there is no elaboration on what is envisaged by the "specific demands and needs", except to say that the learning process needs to accommodate different value orientations and approaches to education.

There is also some concern that the model is too preoccupied with meeting the needs of the "world of work" and, as such, tends to be narrowly instrumentalist. The degree of vocational orientation in the upper secondary cycle is potentially very high with students having the option of doing four vocational education
subjects (out of six) at grades 10 and 11. Similarly, the model proposes that vocational orientation receives attention in each subject from the early school years by emphasising the value of the content in terms of the world of work. In addition, an emphasis on "technological awareness", "economics of education", and "life education" can best be described as "work socialization".

A telling indictment against the state’s proposals is the absence of a commitment or strategy in ACUMSA to address the differences of history and context which have produced deep inequalities in the operational environments of the school curriculum. We need to recognize that the curriculum has resource implications (e.g. learning mathematics without a calculator, science with or without a laboratory). Consideration should be given to resourcing of curricula, to bridging programmes, and also to changing the mainstream curriculum in terms of the needs of redress.

In spite of these criticisms, ACUMSA provides a useful starting point to reconceptualize discussion or negotiation over the issue of curriculum policy in a post-apartheid context.

It is difficult to comment on the NEPI report, since it provides a range of policy options for the curriculum. Options analysis, by definition, compares the strengths and weaknesses of various policy options (as in the NEPI report) and is the clarifying stage of policy work leading to policy construction. The NEPI options should therefore not be taken to be blueprints for implementation from the perspective of the progressive education movement.

The policy proposals of political organizations are usually expressed in general terms, thereby avoiding the more difficult and concrete questions of resource and cost implications. None of the political organizations deal with these practicalities and constraints in any detail. Alternatives from the perspective of the private sector also lack fully developed strategies.
A crucial policy area closely related to curriculum is that of school integration. Although the process of school integration has been accelerated in recent years, this policy area presents a number of challenges for society.

3.4.5 Integration

Chapter two attempted to contextualize research directed towards the policy area of school integration. A central concern to emerge from the discussion was that much energy and effort has been devoted to deracializing schools, for both ideological and pragmatic reasons, yet comparatively little attention has been paid to integration. Hardly any assistance is provided by way of policy guidelines to ensure or even aid successful integration.

In this section, an attempt is made to determine attitudes to school integration and, wherever possible, examine proposals of the major role-players in this policy area. Brief attention is devoted to this section for two reasons. First, all major stakeholders in education, albeit the Conservative Party, endorse a move towards a non-racial education system. It would, however, be an oversimplification of the matter to expect all interests to evoke agreement on all aspects of school integration. Second, the issue of integration is a common theme explored in some detail in each policy area. For example, in the policy area of transformation, the shift towards a non-racial, unitary education system dominates debate. Finance focuses primarily on the deracialization of schools and its cost and other implications. The fundamental issue in the governance of education is the need to establish a control structure which would ensure democratic and accountable participation of parents, teachers, students, the state and other interest groups in education, irrespective of colour, creed, race or religion. The central concern of policy-players in the area of curriculum development is to formulate a policy which addresses cultural diversity within the principles of national reconciliation and, as part of this, embodies a particular sensitivity to race and other forms of discrimination.
In language policy too, the theme of national reconciliation within a non-racial democracy is recurrent.

3.4.5.1 Political organizations and education initiatives

a. Education Renewal Strategy view

The ERS report (DNE 1992 : 78) proposes that:

* race shall not feature in structuring the provision of education;

* the promotion of national unity be balanced by the accommodation of diversity on issues such as language, religion and culture;

* a central education authority as well as decentralized education departments be established; and

* a maximum devolution of authority to communities and individual institutions be accepted in principle.

These recommendations are explicitly linked to the announcement in early 1990 by the Department of Education and Culture (DEC): House of Assembly (HOA) to allow white parent communities to open schools to other race groups wherever desired. In the first instance, these "Clase Models" provided four options: schools could remain as full status quo state schools, or could elect by a majority vote of parents to either convert to private school status (Model A), remain as a state school but be granted the right to control admissions (Model B), convert to a state-aided status (Model C), or enrol a majority of black pupils but remain under the control of the white education department (Model D).

To ensure stability, 72% of a specific community must express itself in favour of a particular school model before such a model is approved by the white education authorities for the community.
This creates a situation by which the local school community itself determines the ethos and dominant culture of its schools. The ERS report has been criticized on a number of grounds. These will be dealt with under evaluation.

b. Democratic Party view

Roger Burrows (Post 16-18 September 1992 : 9), Democratic Party education spokesperson, affirms his party’s policy position:

*The access to all government-funded schools must be provided without discrimination and no educational institution in respect of government monies should be able to restrict admissions on the basis of non-education criteria. The protection of fundamental human rights and liberties, including freedom of speech, association, religion, language and culture must be foremost.*

The Democratic Party also emphasizes the right of parents to choose the kind of education they wish for their children. This implies a need for maximum possible devolution of power to regional and local levels (Democratic Party 1990 : 1). In this respect, the Inkatha Freedom Party view of school integration is not much different.

c. Inkatha Freedom Party view

Mbungwe (1992 : 14) synthesizes the Inkatha Freedom Party’s views on education, particularly those related to school integration:

*to establish an open, free, non-racial, equal opportunity, reconciled society with democratic safeguards for all people.*

The IFP sees no reason why children should not be integrated at school, as parents in the work situation integrate on a daily basis. However, integration should not be forced on schools by
law. It should be a natural process agreed upon through consensus by local parents of the individual schools, and should be accompanied by demonstrable movements towards integrating the various value systems and life patterns of the people in the neighbourhood of the individual schools. Abrupt and imposed integration at school when the communities are not ready, may lead to chaos and culture shock, with many young people becoming demoralized and unable to cope with change. School integration should also take into consideration the particular local realities (Mbonwe 1992 : 17-18).

Like the IFP, the principles of non-racialism and democracy are recurrent themes of the ANC view of school integration.

d. **African National Congress view**

The most important demand of the ANC is that of a unitary, non-racial, non-sexist, democratic education system which operates in the interests of all South Africans. The opening of all schools to all South Africans immediately, irrespective of sex, colour, race and culture has been, and still is, the "rallying cry" of this organization.

ANC education spokesperson, Blade Nzimande (1991 : 2), has the following to remark of integration:

> It is clear to the ANC that although the people of South Africa have different cultural backgrounds, these must be used to enhance the development of a national culture. This means that the people of South Africa can and should develop a new culture, one that is not informed by racial divisions but by national interests.

In contrast to mainstream thinking, the Conservative Party rejects the notion of racial integration outright.
e. **Conservative Party view**

The Conservative Party and other right-wing Afrikaner Nationalist groupings maintain that separate education for the different "nations" of South Africa should remain.

Conservative Party education spokesperson, Andrew Gerber (The Natal Mercury, 27 January 1993 : 1), had the following to remark of integrated schooling:

*.... the acceptance of a single education department would lead to total integration in education in South Africa. The CP rejects this and insists on Christian National Education and mother-tongue instruction.*

The Conservative Party insists on the maintenance of standards in white education, rejects privatization because the life-view of schools will be determined by those who finance them, and questions distance education because it would make CNE impossible in a heterogeneous population (The Citizen, 19 May 1990 : 8).

3.4.5.2 **Evaluation**

On the positive side, it has been acknowledged that the ERS represents the first public commitment by the education bureaucrats to a single system, not structured on the basis of race. However, the report has been criticized on the grounds of vagueness of its recommendations, a "technical" and "ahistorical" approach which results in a failure to deal adequately with issues of race, class and redress, and the open admission by key members of the committee that the report still provides for "autogenous" education. According to NEPI (1993 : 157), it is hard to avoid the conclusion that the ERS report emerged successfully from its development in the conservative white-dominated bureaucracy because it advocates a system of administration and control that could lead to the virtual perpetuation
of the existing system of privileged schools in privileged communities. The transfer of financial responsibility away from the central state to "clients" and the proposals for devolution of authority to schools, without any checks and balances or compensation mechanisms, permits the continuation of the massive inequalities which are the legacy of apartheid education. The arrangements which give parents control over admission policies, but which also incur considerable parental costs, may have the effect of opening the formerly white schools, but only well-off families can afford to pay the additional fees. Thus, even where schools are no longer racially exclusive, the system effectively excludes the children of rural, poor, and working-class parents from the best education facilities in the country (NEPI 1993:157).

Moreover, though seeming to address one of the basic demands, namely that of deracializing schools, the report falls far short of addressing the issue of redress.

The major weakness, however, was the non-consultative and non-representative manner in which the document was developed within the existing bureaucracy, and the desire by elements within the state to perpetuate existing inequalities. Above all, it demonstrates the need to establish more consultative and participatory policy development processes.

Once again the proposals of the progressive education movement are expressed in general terms, thereby avoiding the practicabilities and complexities associated with school integration. Whilst the NEPI initiative did make an attempt to address the cost implications of integration (under finance), the ideological and cultural concerns have not been substantially attended to. No research has been conducted on the possible impact of integration on the educational standards of an institution or attitudes of ethnic and language groups to school integration. This dissertation addresses these issues from the perspective of the Indian minority in South Africa.
If integration is seen as an end in itself, or is forced upon school communities, the weight of international experience points to the fact that problems lie ahead. Conversely, if integration is to be used as a successful tool for transformation, there needs to be consensus on its broader aims and a shared perception that integration is a means of achieving these aims.

In the final policy area under discussion, some attention is given to language issues in a post-apartheid South Africa.

3.4.6 Language

Chapter two provided a context for research directed at informing policy on multilingualism in South Africa. The principles and criteria which ought to underpin a new language policy were discussed and the expected implications of such a policy for education were outlined.

The aim of this section is to analyse and evaluate briefly the plethora of language policy and language-in-education policy options of the main policy-players in the language debate. It should be noted that language policy can be distinguished, but not separated, from language-in-education policy, and thus one should not be seen in isolation to the other. The former deals with language planning generally in all areas of life. The latter focuses primarily, if not exclusively, on the teaching of languages as subjects, the use of language as a medium of instruction, and the medium of school administration and school-community interaction.

After examining emerging policy options, it became evident that language and language-in-education issues have received comparatively greater attention than each of the other five policy areas already discussed. The consequent need for interest groups in language to know not only about the various positions of principle, but also to understand the negotiability of those positions, is leading to further changes in language and
language-in-education policy positions.

In the following section, the positions of key policy-players in the language debate are discussed.

3.4.6.1 Political and other organizations

a. National Party position

The National Party's position on language is informed by the larger strategies and power plays of Afrikaner Nationalist structures (eg. the Broederbond). The preservation of Afrikaans is clearly important to the National Party owing to the Afrikaner ideological constructs of language, culture and nation. This would allow the Afrikaner to maintain their own linguistic infrastructure within a post-apartheid dispensation. In other words, the National Party is seeking to protect the right to self-determination, or more precisely, to keep the self-determination right as a non-negotiable position in hand. The National Party, however, is not monolithic and there is a spectrum of options or strategies being articulated.

The spectrum of views ranges from (Ebrahim 1992 : 11):

* the status of Afrikaans must remain unchanged;

* Afrikaans could have a de facto diminished status but maintain de jure official status in a trilingual dispensation. This position, favoured by National Party elements in the HSRC, argues for the maintenance of the official language status of Afrikaans along with English, but allows for regions adopting a third (African) language as an official language.

The ANC, on the other hand, is more inclusive in its approach to language issues.
b. African National Congress position

More recently a mixed/transformational tradition has come to dominate the ANC debate. The original view of English as a liberatory language has yielded to a new principle of promoting the languages of the "grassroots", that is, the eleven principal South African languages (English, Afrikaans, Ndebele, Pedi, Sotho, Swati, Tsonga, Tswana, Venda, Xhosa and Zulu). The ANC is caught between needing political solutions to meet its electoral ambitions and intellectually sound solutions which will maintain its credibility as a progressive voice of the people.

Consequently, the ANC position is a complex one with competing and potentially contradictory and ambiguous elements. For example, the ANC policy guidelines at its National Conference (28-31 May 1992) listed the main principles of its language policy:

* the ANC policy will recognize, protect and develop all languages and ensure that all citizens will have access to all spheres of the nation's life;

* to overcome the practical problems of multilingualism, it will be possible to designate a single common language to be used for record purposes or for other special uses, either at the national level or in the regions. All major languages (the eleven principal South African languages listed earlier) should be equally available for such purposes;

* other languages spoken by South Africans - such as Portuguese, Italian, Greek, Tamil, Hindi, Gujarati, Hebrew, Urdu, Arabic and others, will be respected and promoted;

* all South Africans will be free to use any South African language of their choice in dealings with the state;
language services will be developed, such as the provision of interpreting and translation;

* all South Africans will have the right of educational access to the development of such linguistic skills, in languages of their choice, as are necessary for full participation in national, regional and local life; and

* ANC policy will further the development of all our languages, in all aspects of life, in order to engender respect for different languages and to prevent the use of any language or languages for the purpose of domination or division (ANC 1992b: 66).

The early jargon of empowerment and transformation has fused with more recent arguments on language rights. By viewing language from a cultural perspective, the ANC has found a politically-safe policy platform whereupon it can assume the role of democratic authority. This is manifested by its adoption of language rights to proactively promote African languages. A tension remains, however, over the question of language rights which go beyond cultural rights and which require a politically less popular functionalist approach to the language question.

The Democratic Party, on the other hand, has yet to put forward detailed policy proposals on language issues.

c. Democratic Party position

The Democratic Party has yet to produce a language policy for post-apartheid development. Despite this, all indications point to the promotion of English as a neutral language, but advocate the use of other languages as an aspect of cultural pluralism, consistent with its liberal heritage (Democratic Party 1992: 4).
d. National Language Project position

The National Language Project (NLP) maintains that multilingualism is an integral element of democracy, both ideologically and practically. Since 1986, the NLP has proposed that English should occupy the position of lingua franca until such time another South African language emerges to fulfil this function. Secondly, in tandem with the proposals to recognize English as the lingua franca, the NLP has argued that other South African languages be recognized at regional level as official regional languages. In doing so, the status of Afrikaans would be significantly altered.

According to the NLP Conference (3-6 April 1992), three integral elements should serve as a baseline for negotiating a viable language policy, namely:

* the primacy of English should be recognized and its role delineated;

* the value of maintaining the Afrikaans educational infrastructure, and its potential to be an access point to resources for many South Africans, should be accepted; and

* there should be a proactive policy for African languages that leaves the door open for lobby groups to use the constitution to advance the status of African languages (National Language Project 1992:10).

One of the NLP's inputs into the language debate has been the idea of regions adopting African languages as languages of administration, along with the national (i.e. central government) official languages. The intention behind the proposals was to structurally endorse the upgrading of the status of all African languages by introducing their obligatory usage in the bureaucracy.
The position of the Conservative Party in relation to language issues is in keeping with its earlier policy standpoints.

e. Conservative Party position

Judging from their parliamentary activities, it would appear that the Conservative Party would insist on either Afrikaans having an official status nationally or having a sole official status in a Boer Republic. Either way, the Conservative Party hopes to deliver the preservation of Afrikaans cultural and educational institutions to its constituencies (Ebrahim 1992 : 16).

From the foregoing discussion, broad policy positions of some of the major policy-players in the language debate are provided. The issue of language, however, concerns not only the use of language in an everyday context, but also the use of language as a medium of instruction in schools.

3.4.6.2 Language-in-education policies

Decisions about which language(s) should be used as medium of instruction in schools and other educational institutions are important not only for the success of education offered, but also because they have a "ripple effect" in society at large.

This section discusses briefly the policy options of ACUMSA and NEPI in respect of medium of instruction.

a. ACUMSA option

In terms of language policy, the ACUMSA document proposes that all learners should become familiar with at least three languages (Afrikaans, English and a regionally dominant African language) during the course of their schooling (DNE 1991b : 6). Different levels of language learning (basic, ordinary and advanced) are posited for different stages. There is some attempt at flexibil-
ity in that it is only from grades 5 - 7 that all three languages are compulsory subjects, while at the grade 12 level only one language is compulsory (DNE 1991b : 6). The major shift evident in ACUMSA is the abandonment of the hierarchy of "first" and "second" language. Room is also provided for optional language choices be they regional, mother-tongue or foreign.

NEPI, on the other hand, presents a number of language models for schooling.

b. National Education Policy Investigation options

Broadly speaking, there are two types of policy options:

* the child’s home language is used for the teaching of all subjects (except other languages) throughout schooling; and

* a language that is not the child’s home language is used as medium of instruction for all or part of the child’s schooling.

In the first type, pupils learn all subjects (except other languages) in the mother-tongue or home language throughout formal schooling (NEPI 1993 : 186).

There are several variations on the second type of policy option. Pupils may start schooling immediately in the second language (immersion model), or they may gradually move into it after an initial period in which the home language is the medium of instruction (delayed immersion model). Another model involves the use of both the first language (home language) and second language (non-indigenous language) throughout schooling (NEPI 1993 : 185-189).

The multilingual nature of South African society indicates that the issue of developing an appropriate language-in-education policy is an important one. Any option chosen could have either
an empowering or a disempowering effect on the child, depending on how that policy is implemented and how it relates to the broader language policy of the country.

Both points of agreement and difference exist in the policies of the major policy-players in the language debate, as will be shown in the evaluation that follows.

3.4.6.3 Evaluation

Broad agreement among the main interest groups in the language debate exists on some issues. These include:

* consensus about the need to recognize that South Africa is a multilingual country and that provision should be made to accommodate linguistic diversity;

* the belief that all languages should be respected and developed;

* an awareness that the status of African languages should be raised; and

* consensus on enshrining fundamental language rights in a Bill of Rights.

However, some disagreement appears to exist over the following:

* there is disagreement over the status of Afrikaans with the "Left" not establishing a clear position and the National Party and Conservative right-wing identifying this as a principal concern.

Most political organizations tend to view language issues as a political commodity for mass consumption, where no lobby previously existed. Thus, these organizations remain non-committal when asked to comment on language policy issues.
One of the main issues in language-in-education policy is the role of Afrikaans in schools in the future. No doubt, there is bound to be disagreement if Afrikaans is made compulsory as a language for all schools.

In an interview with Zubeida Desai (in Ebrahim 1992 : 25), ANC language researcher, on the ACUMSA proposal, she noted:

The ACUMSA proposal is unrealistic as it would clearly disadvantage speakers of African languages over speakers of Afrikaans and English. For example, if a child must pass Afrikaans in grades 5-7 to receive their school leaving certificate, it will mean that African language speakers and English language speakers will have to forgo choosing an African language in junior primary and focus on learning Afrikaans.

The fact that the DNE proposal would, by implication, undermine the use of African languages, also implies that it is not intended to be politically neutral.

V.T. Zulu (in Ebrahim 1992 : 26), the deputy Minister of Education for KwaZulu at the time, stated that the KwaZulu government (IFP) would distance itself from the ACUMSA proposal. He considered that Afrikaans should be offered as an optional language in that part of the country, but also stated that the medium of instruction is best worked out on a regional basis.

NEPI (1993 : 182) takes the view that options foregrounding English as the sole medium of instruction (even for those for whom it is not a home language) are likely to be popular but difficult to implement equitably throughout the country. Not only are there obvious differences between the demands made on home language and second language speakers, but there are also differences among second language speakers themselves because of the unequal availability of support and resources in different areas. In some environments there are more qualified teachers and better supplementary resources (such as neighbourhood use of the language, and access to books and television) than in others.
Rural areas are likely to have fewer of these resources than urban areas.

Studies have shown that second language medium of instruction is a serious obstacle to children in poorly resourced schools in areas where there is no reinforcement of skills in that language outside the school, and where teachers' proficiency is limited. These unfavourable conditions prevail in many South African schools. Furthermore, research into cognitive development suggests that initial literacy in the home language, followed by a switch to English-medium instruction, has a negative image because it was a model implemented by Bantu Education and its successors (NEPI 1993 : 182).

The most important lesson to be learned from a comparative study of policy options is that no model should be rejected out of hand. Models can work in most instances, given the right conditions. It is crucial that conditions necessary for success, and factors militating against the success of any option, should be identified and given weight when decisions are being made.

However, it is not enough to postulate alternative policies without, at least, some indication of how they are to be realized. There are two decisive considerations here. The first of these is the desirability of linking the learning of languages with immediate or eventual enhancement of life chances, specifically the improvement of the learners' chances of obtaining better employment. There is no doubt that this economic motive is important and often decisive in sustaining learners' perseverance.

The other important consideration is that of democratic consultation. No policy, however well motivated, can succeed if the people's voices are not heard. Extensive consultation from grassroots up must lay the basis of policy formulation, not only so that people are made to feel they are part of the process, but so that they understand the complexities, and realities that
inform final decisions. All policies should be promoted and executed in constant consultation with their immediate constituency - the learner - and with all other relevant constituencies and organizations. Should apparently irreconcilable contradictions arise, it must be debated in public and decided democratically.

Finally, though the policy options being mooted in South Africa are multi-pronged and sophisticated, one should still keep a critical eye on the process and anticipate that much of what is promised may not have sufficient political will behind it for the next government to carry through its implementation.

3.5 SUMMARY

Chapter three consists of three distinguishable parts. The first part outlines the salient features of the policy process. A multiplicity of competing definitions of the term "policy" is examined in order to grasp it more clearly. The policy-making process is also described. This process involves agenda-setting, formulation, adoption, implementation and evaluation. Following this, the three stages of policy development, that is, the exploration of policy options (stage one), the choice of a particular set of policy positions (stage two), and the actual policies resulting from a compromise between different political organizations during negotiations (stage three), are discussed. Some attention is also given to policy analysis and the limitations of policy. Finally, comments are made on educational policy developments in South Africa.

The second part of the chapter outlines the policy outlooks of the major policy-players in the education debate. In this context, policy proposals tend to be under-researched, incoherent and expressed in general terms thereby avoiding the more difficult questions of resource and cost implications.
In the third part, an analysis and evaluation of policy options is undertaken. This entails an examination of key policy concerns in terms of six areas - transformation, education governance, finance, curriculum, integration and language.

The policy area of transformation focuses specifically on strategies to effect a change from an apartheid education system to a unitary one. Events in this policy area are dominated by the former Nationalist government's attempts to restructure the education system into non-racial regional units.

Under education governance, the fundamental issue of decentralization and functions of the different levels in the education system is considered. Most policy-players tend to agree that decision-making should be nationally co-ordinated, with regional delivery systems articulated to national co-ordination by means of consultation and monitoring.

In contrast to the ERS proposal, NEPI considers a series of policy options for curriculum renewal. These are: decision-making structures and processes; core and differentiation; and commonality and diversity. Generally no detailed curriculum perspectives have emerged from political organizations and the private sector.

All policy areas considered in this chapter are firmly rooted in the principle of racial integration.

In comparison to other policy areas, language and language-in-education policies are relatively well-researched, in addition to a fairly widespread national debate on the issue. All emerging proposals agree that a coherent language policy based on a wide consensus is necessary to ensure quality formal education in a post-apartheid South Africa.
CHAPTER FOUR

EDUCATIONAL NEEDS OF THE INDIAN COMMUNITY IN A POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter outlined a range of policy options relevant to the restructuring of education in South Africa. Policy proposals of political organizations across the spectrum were discussed and exposed for investigation. Particular attention was given to the similarities and contrasts of the two major policy initiatives for the reconstruction of education in South Africa: the former government’s Education Renewal Strategy (ERS), and the NECC’s National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI).

In this chapter, a study is made of the educational needs of the Indian community in a post-apartheid South Africa. Consideration is also given to the role of this community in the process of education system change. Finally, broad tendencies in the stance of some informed members of this community towards the policy orientations analysed in the previous chapter are identified and discussed. Each of the aforementioned aspects is interrelated and thus dealt with holistically in the chapter.

A major problem encountered in the literature study was the difficulty of obtaining sufficient relevant information to undertake an in-depth analysis of the educational needs of the Indian community in a post-apartheid South Africa. A number of reasons could be advanced for this.

First, research publications in the post-February 1990 period have tended to focus on macro-education policy issues and the general political terms of the transition in education. How these and other developments relate to the particular needs of local communities at grassroots level, and how competing demands among
these communities for scarce resources should be resolved in terms of a scale of priorities, is weakly developed (Wolpe 1991b: 8).

Second, education is an area that is influenced by the dynamic socio-political context within which it is located. Given this circumstance, together with the changing political context in South Africa, what constitutes community needs in one situation may be radically different in another for the same group. Therefore, some social scientists tend to broach the issue of community concerns with a sense of trepidation (Karodia 1986: 100).

Third, the body primarily responsible for the provision of education for Indians (at the time of writing), the House of Delegates: Department of Education and Culture, does not have a well-endowed or established research tradition. The only regular publication of this department, Fiat Lux, which addressed educational issues at a community level, was terminated at the end of 1991 due to a shortage of funds. Since then, the line of communication between the state education department and the Indian community has been via the media. Documented information pertaining to the educational needs of the Indian community in the present context is therefore limited.

Fourth, historically, Indians have not been involved in determining a culturally appropriate educational delivery system for their children. The "say" of parents in the past has been confined to participation in now-defunct parent committees. Despite the trend towards greater community participation in education, parental involvement at all levels in the HOD's education structure is virtually non-existent. Therefore, documentation emanating from organized parent bodies, where they do exist, remains scarce.

Fifth, the majority of the teaching corps in the HOD are members of SADTU. This organization has also focused its energies largely
on national education policy concerns. How these relate to the needs of local communities on the ground, is given only cursory attention.

Sixth, perhaps one of the most important reasons, in the opinion of the investigator, for the lack of adequate researchable information pertaining to the contemporary educational needs of Indians, is the unwillingness of some social scientists in South Africa to confront centrally such controversial issues as race, ethnicity, culture and diversity. This situation may have been understandable, or even excusable, in the past because these issues were often conflated to provide a cloak for de facto racist dogma. However, if South Africans are to penetrate the racial divide and transcend the narrow boundaries of ethnocentrism, then, such controversial issues will have to be confronted, debated, and discussed openly in proper forums and through scholarly research.

Due to the aforementioned difficulties and the seminal nature of the research, the literature study was supplemented by interviews and group discussions with key informants who were assumed either to possess special knowledge of, or have an interest in, the educational needs of the Indian community in a post-apartheid South Africa.

The sample of informants were by no means representative of any section of the Indian community. However, even if the significance of these findings are open to dispute, they provide, at least, one possible set of indicators which policy-makers will have to deal with. In this sense, the comments of informants may be of value since little research has so far been conducted on the educational needs of the Indian community in a post-apartheid context.

Despite these limitations, there is emerging, at the political level, a greater willingness to grapple with the reality of cultural diversity more openly. For instance, in the run up to
the first democratic elections in South Africa, political parties gave separate attention to the Indian community when attempting to win the Indian vote.

In a report headlined, "Who will win the hearts and minds of Indians?", an ANC spokesperson (Sunday Tribune Herald, 12 January 1992 : 6) remarked:

*The ANC's strategic approach to mobilizing Indian support must take into account specific concerns of the community. These include: national fears consonant with a minority group syndrome; the community perception of itself as being sandwiched between apartheid colonialism and African Nationalism; fears of becoming targets of political violence; and uncertainty about basic human rights.*

In another article entitled, "ANC master-plan to woo Indian voters" (Sunday Times Extra, 6 June 1993 : 4), the ANC Southern Natal Regional Chairman, Jeff Radebe, gave the following assurances to the Indian community:

*ANC policy embodies a new South Africa for all its people. We will guarantee religious, language and cultural freedom to all people and Indians don't have to lose any sleep about security as well.*

To counter ANC inroads into the Indian community, the National Party also made concerted efforts to address minority concerns. According to Chotia (1993 : 19), the National Party strategy to win Indian support was located at two levels. First, the National Party addressed "bread and butter" issues in the community such as housing, education, welfare, health and property rights, and second, the National Party sought conciliatory proposals like the inclusion of "sunset" clauses which grant special privileges to minorities and ensures the survival of traditional values (Chotia 1993 : 19). Other political parties had also attempted to court the Indian vote.
The intractable political dilemma facing the Indian community has been governed by two factors. First, to what extent will traditional white opposition simply be replaced by African opposition to their group interests? In other words, just who is the opposition? The other concerns the inherent conservative nature of this community. Ironically, this was enhanced by some of the apartheid restrictions which acted as a unifying force to retain group identity (Magyar 1989: 188).

The political debate about the future of the Indian community is significant because it impacts directly on their choices in education. A correlation exists between party-political preferences and educational policy preferences. Political choices, in essence, reflect concomitant educational policy choices and conceptions of the future.

At this juncture, it should be noted that although emphasis is placed on the term "Indian", the idea is not to project the Indian community as some sort of separate entity encapsulated in its own unique problems and solutions. Neither does the dissertation assume that the Indian community is a homogeneous mass unfractured by class, gender, ideology or religion. Indeed, Magyar (1989: 178) states that of South Africa's cross-racial ideological spectrum, the Indian community has the widest representation and is subject to extreme fragmentation.

An important consequence of apartheid has been the separation of people into different groups based on racial criteria. In education, this found expression in the existence of racially-defined education structures for all South Africans. A major challenge for all is to confront the status quo in education. This implies that fundamental attitudinal shifts will have to be made by all communities located within these segregated sub-systems of education if we are to arrive at a more legitimate and acceptable education dispensation. It therefore becomes imperative to involve these communities from the multiplicity of ethnic education structures into the policy-making process. We need to
identify their concerns, aspirations and needs to inform policy. This dissertation is directed at identifying the needs, concerns and aspirations of one such community, namely the Indian community, with the intention of drawing this minority into the national education debate.

The previous chapter analysed and evaluated major policy options proposed for post-apartheid educational development in South Africa in terms of six policy areas – transformation, education governance, finance, curriculum, integration and language. This chapter identifies the educational needs of the Indian community in the context of the policy options discussed in chapter three.

Finally, cognizance should be taken of two matters in this chapter. First, the amount of information available for each of the aforementioned policy areas is relative to the level of concern expressed for it within the Indian community. And second, while each policy area is distinct, it cannot be separated from the others. A degree of overlap of information is thus inevitable to render the chapter complete.

Of particular concern to the Indian community is the extent to which their needs will be addressed during the transformation of the education system.

4.2 TRANSFORMATIONAL NEEDS

In chapter three, strategies for the transformation of the education system were discussed. It became evident that the government’s initiative of amalgamating the existing race-based education departments into new regional units under a single education ministry tended to dominate debate, with other role-players dealing with this issue tangentially (cf paragraph 3.4.1.1).
For the most part, it was learnt that the different political organizations have not been able, thus far, to elaborate development strategies to the extent, and in a manner, that can inform the formulation of policies for education and thus contribute to transformation. Instead, what is available are, on the one hand, critique of government initiatives and, on the other, general characterizations of the shape of the desired post-apartheid education system, which do no more than provide a point of departure for policy formation.

Therefore, in the absence of proactive strategies to manage education system change, it is difficult to determine what are the attitudes of the Indian community to this policy area.

A further limitation is the tendency in some quarters to view the South African Indian community as a monolithic group and provide general explanations for them. This view ignores the fact that of the four racially-defined population groups, Indians are the most heterogeneous in terms of religion, language, customs, ideological beliefs and class divisions - especially as they constitute a mere 2.6% of the country’s population (Carrim 1993 : 5). While there are significant generalizations that can be drawn about their attitudes to educational change, the pending changes impinge on different strata of Indians somewhat differently. In this sense, it is necessary to come to terms with both the nature of the similarities and differences of groups within the community and see how these change in different circumstances.

Ravi Joshi (1993 : interview), a Mathematics lecturer at the University of Zululand, elaborates:

*Most of us agree that change is necessary. But the shape and content of this change is conceptualized differently by individuals, depending on their personal agendas. There are sharp divisions over the goals and pace of transformation. We should be guarded against believing that all Indians have the same needs.*
Journalist, Farook Khan (1993 : interview) adds:

South Africa's Indian community is very conservative at one extreme, and cosmopolitan in outlook at the other. There is no absolute consensus on any issue in the Indian community.

Another problem encountered, which has implications for any discussion on transforming the education system, is the fact that individuals tend to view educational provision for Indians from two historically different perspectives. For some, Indian education, as it has come to exist, can simplistically be equated to African education. Idris Khammissa (1993 : interview), an educationist in the private sector, remarked:

... Indian children receive the same inferior educational provision like African and Coloured children ....

This politically motivated statement, no matter how flawed factually (white, Indian, Coloured and African pupils receive differential educational provision on a sliding scale respectively), is significant to the extent that it exposes one set of opinions amongst Indians in relation to educational provision. In contrast, others take a somewhat different view of the issue.

Ebrahim Ansur (1993 : interview), a former school superintendent, mentions:

The Indian community faces a real test. No matter how oppressed we may have been, the fact is that Indians have for the last thirty odd years been given a relatively privileged education at the expense of the masses. We are now in the invidious position of aligning ourselves to the cause of the oppressed and simultaneously preparing to accept that democracy will mean relinquishing past privileges.
The strength of Ansur's argument is that it recognizes that Indians have received a relatively better quality education than their African counterparts in the last three decades. Its weakness, however, lies in its failure to acknowledge that when Indians first came to Natal in 1860, they were in a more disadvantaged position politically, economically and educationally in comparison to the African. Yet, they succeeded to a large extent in overcoming the many limitations placed upon them by successive white governments. The reasons for Indian advancement in the field of education have already been discussed in chapter two and will not be elaborated here.

Journalist, Farook Khan (1993 : interview) further elaborates:

.... for some, change in education means the promise of equality and justice, and for others, it is a threat to standards, quality and excellence.

These contradictory comments generally illustrate the complex structural position of Indians in South African society. As a middle strata, Indians have been relatively deprived when compared to whites, and relatively privileged when compared to Africans. The disparity between the two national groups (Indians and Africans) in terms of overall expenditure on education, per capita expenditure, teacher-pupil ratio, teacher qualifications, distribution of pupils and academic attainments is well-documented in education discourse (Reddy 1991 : 231-236; Pillay 1990 : 31-38). As an example, in 1989, the Indian pupil's per capita expenditure as a percentage of white expenditure was 70,0%, while the corresponding figure for the African child was a mere 19% relative to white expenditure (Pillay 1990 : 31). Other educational indicators mentioned above also reflect similar disparities between the different race groups. Given these disparities, it would thus be accurate to state that equating educational provision for Indians with that of Africans is more a show of solidarity rather than a reflection of the factual position.
Nonetheless, varying perspectives (no matter how accurate or otherwise) within the Indian community to a whole range of educational issues exist, and impinge on different strata of Indians somewhat differently.

What is abundantly clear, is that since 2 February 1990 rapid socio-political developments have taken place in South Africa. With this change, complex power relations and the bases of legitimacy in education have also shifted as new and old cleavages have emerged along lines of party-political affiliations, ethnicity, culture, class and regionalism. For instance, it is no longer "the people" and the "apartheid state", in simplistic terms, that go to the negotiating table. Whether the issue be local government or the provision of textbooks, "the people" now take the form of constituencies, interest groups, lobbies and stakeholders. In the context of negotiations, this is significant because the demands of minorities become as legitimate as the majority for the sake of consensus-building. Despite what may appear to some as obvious inequalities in power and the unfairness of the minority’s demands, minority interests have to be taken seriously and accommodated by negotiating compromises, if it necessitates. A more pessimistic view is that, in the course of negotiations, minorities will become marginalized (Chetty 1993 : 5).

In sum, this section seeks to identify and interpret some of the educational needs of Indians in relation to transforming the education system. It throws light on the way some informed members of the community respond to educational change, to the present crisis, and to the future.

4.2.1. **The need to establish a non-racial, unitary education system**

With the exception of the right-wing fringe element of the political spectrum (cf paragraph 3.3.6), strong consensus exists among most interest groups in education on the need to establish a non-racial, unitary education system. The NEPI enterprise, for
instance, distilled five guiding principles (non-racism, non-sexism, democracy, a unitary system and redress) which permeate the entire domain of its policy consideration (NEPI 1993 : 6). In the ERS document (cf paragraph 3.3.1), the principles of democracy, non-racism and equal opportunities serve as a set of framing axes within which the investigation has taken place (DNE 1992 : 6). The Democratic Party (cf paragraph 3.3.2) emphasizes the need for a single education ministry and an immediate restructuring of the system. While the ANC (cf paragraph 3.3.4) has committed itself to the establishment of a unitary education system underpinned by the values of democracy, liberty, equality and justice for all citizens. In a national survey of public opinion on education, the HSRC (1992) found that most respondents agreed on the following: unity among all; race should not play a role in the provision of education; and democratic participation of all stakeholders in decision-making.

Within the Indian community too, there appears a general consensus on the need to establish a non-racial, unitary education system to meet the challenges of building a post-apartheid society. For instance, one of the central policy statements of TASA (1986 : 2), a body which formerly represented Indian teachers, was for an "open education system with a single ministry of education". SADTU (1993 : 6), presently representing most of the HOD teachers, has, since its inception, rallied stridently behind the call for a "unitary, non-racial, non-sexist, democratic education system". The HOD has also committed itself to merge into the new South Africa that is being evolved and pledged to share its resources and services to all regardless of race, colour and culture (The Daily News, 24 March 1990 : 2).

This trend is in keeping with literature emanating from educationists within the Indian community. For instance, Bagwandeen (1992a : 2) viewed the need to establish a single education ministry as the first policy issue that should be addressed. Reddy (1992 : 9) stated that the present educational structure must be changed to one which enjoys the acceptance and support
of the majority of the population. Naidoo (1989 : 110) found that the idea of a non-racial education system enjoys widespread support in the Indian community.

From an analysis of the documentation, it would appear that most political organizations and, at least, sections of the Indian community tend to endorse the idea of a unitary, non-racial education system for South Africa. In this context, there is no shortage of literature, written at a level of generality, which emphasizes the national need for creating such an education system – though relatively little is mentioned about the process of how this will be achieved.

The problem is, as this dissertation has pointed out earlier (cf paragraphs 3.4.1.3 and 4.2), general propositions and policy statements about the desired shape of the post-apartheid education system cannot be related to concrete developmental strategies. For instance, Badat (1991 : 17) states that oppositional movements to apartheid education need to make a transition from a discourse of "pure critique" to a discourse of "means". Chetty (1993 : 6) agrees that until recently, it was sufficient to rely on a litany of well-polished slogans - "we demand a democratic, non-racial, non-sexist, unified education system". While these slogans have more than proved their effectiveness by creating and mobilizing politically-charged communities that challenged state power and apartheid education, what it has not done is translate into policy (Chetty 1993 : 6). It is the contention of the dissertation that this criticism applies equally to the minority Indian community. Dr Yusuf Karodia (1993 : interview), a senior lecturer in Educational Management at the University of Durban-Westville, confirms this:

*We have to go beyond the rhetoric of the past and the rhetoric of the present which describes needs in the most general terms. Such rhetoric is not enough. What is needed is much greater clarity on policy objectives and the process of how these are to be achieved.*
Even where specific proposals for transforming the education system do exist, they are not presented in relation to any development strategy and therefore appear ad hoc. Ideally, what is required in the present context is the formulation of specific reconstructive options or implementation procedures to restructure the various separate education structures into a unitary system - an aspect neglected in the policy outlines of major political organizations until recently (cf paragraph 1.1). Admittedly, this process is complicated since the effective provision of education is contingent upon the parallel development of social and economic programmes, including a national strategy for the development of human resources, and the democratization of society.

Only in this context, it is possible to determine: whether particular proposals or strategies are based on accurate knowledge and acceptable principles; how proposals are going to be implemented (and by whom); and under what conditions can they be implemented successfully. Without such proposals, it is difficult to identify the needs of any one constituency or to judge what pre-conditions are likely to be required for successfully translating policy ideas into reality.

This leads to a related problem, one which encapsulates all other educational issues - the degree of legitimacy of the system. No social service can fulfil its mission if the people it sets out to serve have no faith in the service it provides. This unfortunately has been the case of the South African education system.

4.2.2 The need for legitimacy

Most educationists had agreed at the time that the segregated education system lacked legitimacy (Badat 1991: 26), was fundamentally undemocratic (Hartshorne 1992b: 10), and did not enjoy the support of the majority of its users (Nkomo 1992:317). The apartheid system of education, and its illegitimacy, was the chief target of political contestation at every level
through the years of resistance to apartheid education. Consistent demands of the democratic movement were for a unitary education system and democratic systems of governance that would facilitate the participation of all legitimate interest groups (cf paragraphs 3.3.4 and 3.3.5).

In the Indian community, the tricameral arrangement was rejected by a substantial majority of people (Docrat 1984: 13; Bhamjee 1989: 28; Magyar 1989: 179). Under apartheid, the House of Delegates: Department of Education and Culture had not found popular acceptance and was considered to be an appendage of apartheid, illegitimate and collaborationist (Carrim 1992: 9-10).

It was therefore on the issue of legitimacy that views of some Indian educationists contrasted most sharply with those of the former National Party government. For the latter, while acknowledging the illegitimacy of apartheid education, the problem was viewed as essentially one of efficiency. Consequently, the former government responded to the continuing public clamour around education by publishing managerial statements of intent like the ERS (Muller 1992: 11), on the one hand, and creating new structures like the Department of Education Co-ordination Committee to crisis-manage the system, on the other (cf paragraph 3.4.1.1).

In a critique of the ERS, Motala (1991a: 4) asserted that it was a product of an educational bureaucracy responsible for planning and giving effect to the very apartheid education system which we are faced with. Badat (1991: 23-24) endorsed this view when he stated that the ERS initiative had not taken the democratization of the policy-making process very far, since it was a managerial response to the education crisis. The values and ideology that informed the ERS were not necessarily shared by the majority of South Africans and thus it relegated significant mass constituencies to the status of passive observers (Badat 1991: 25).
Both Buckland et al (1992 : 1) and Bot (1991 : 3) supported Badat's view that the ERS was fundamentally flawed in that its working groups comprised senior specialists from the ranks of education appointed under the direction of the Committee of Heads of Education Departments which commissioned the initiative. It should also be noted that most education bodies in South Africa, including the NECC, did not make submissions to the ERS (Buckland et al 1992 : 2).

Informants questioned the legitimacy and authenticity of the Department of Education Co-ordination Committee (cf paragraph 3.4.1.1):

*Who created this committee? From whom will it take advice? To whom will it be accountable? How representative is it? What issues will it deal with* (Chandprakash Nankissor 1993 : interview).

*This step defies all logic ... yet another example of unilateral restructuring* (Dr Roshni Maharaj 1993 : interview).

*The community must be involved in decision-making at all levels* (Satha Moodley 1993 : interview).

Overall, both the literature and the responses emanating from interviews stressed the essential need for actively involving the various stakeholders, in particular, teachers, parents, workers, students, employers and the broader community in the decision-making processes of the education system. It is also the contention of this dissertation that only through responsive and participatory consultative processes, involving all the main stakeholders, working within an agreed framework of principles, will the education system achieve legitimacy.

As mentioned previously (cf paragraph 1.1), major changes have been set in motion in education following the installation of the Government of National Unity. These changes are aimed primarily at the creation of a non-racial, unitary education system. In this context, the earlier structure (the Department of Education
Co-ordination Committee) that was created to dismantle the apartheid education system has given way to a new structure (the Strategic Management Team) whose task is to perform, more or less, the same function. Given these developments, it can reasonably be assumed that the new education system will acquire the legitimacy which its predecessor lacked.

This section signalled a desire for the establishment of a legitimate education system. Legitimacy will also contribute to bureaucratic efficiency - an issue which is integral to the success of a new dispensation.

4.2.3 The need for an efficient and effective bureaucracy

Generally, a paucity of research on the nature, culture and ethos of the South African education bureaucracy exists, specifically, on its role during the transitional period and beyond (McLennan 1992: 1). Policy initiatives and proposals of the major education stakeholders give little consideration to the effect of the bureaucracy on educational developments, as is evident from a study of the policy area of transformation (cf paragraph 3.4.1).

Having mentioned this, the characteristics of the apartheid education bureaucracy are well-known: until recently, nineteen education departments, under fourteen different cabinets, implemented their own regulations in terms of twelve education acts; although most of the educators are women, the management of all departments is dominated by men (Hartshorne 1992b: 23); connectors between the various departments are limited with each competing for scarce resources (Hartshorne 1988: 4); and an authoritarian, "top-down" style of management, unresponsive to the needs of major sectors of South African society (Samuels 1987: 8).

Therefore it is not surprising that informants generally expressed strong criticism of the apartheid education bureau-
cracy. Opinions ranged from personal sympathy to outright rejection of bureaucratic practices:

*Bureaucrats are human like everyone else ... their actions are dictated to by the government of the day* (HOD Department Official 1993: confidential interview).

*The average South African is tired of paying for government corruption and wastage. Civil servants who steal public funds should be imprisoned and not be given golden handshakes* (Abdul Karrim 1993: interview).

*Crass bungling and myopic educational planning must not be allowed to flourish any further* (Dr Dowlat Bagwandeen 1993: interview).

*The education bureaucracy is bloated* (Idris Khammissa 1993: interview).

While these comments are subjective, personalized opinions of some Indians and may not necessarily be representative of the group as a whole, they, nevertheless, lend support to an important fact, that is, the South African education bureaucracy is cost-ineffective. McLennan (1992: 2) has estimated that for every seven teachers in the four main departments, there are three managers (including principals) and two administrators. Although there are 424 000 people in the employ of education departments and educational institutions in South Africa (constituting 37% of the total number of staff in the public sector), just over a quarter of the 424 000 are service and administrative staff (Hartshorne 1992b: 23). In financial terms, the Department of Economics at the University of Pretoria estimates that spending on positions higher than that of principal is as high as 29% of the education budget (Fokus in Claassen 1992: 108). Clearly, the limited funds available for education should be spent as effectively as possible. This calls for a major overhaul of spending patterns, particularly with reference to the education bureaucracy.
It is also increasingly being realized that the quality of an education system depends primarily on what happens in the classroom. In this sense, the success of an education system depends, to a large extent, on the attitude of the teacher. Perumal (1990: 246), in a study of bureaucracy and educative teaching in HOD schools, found that increased bureaucratization of schools perpetuated over-conformity, dependency, prescriptivity, lack of innovation and creativity. In contrast, schools which implemented fewer bureaucratic rules and procedures were shown to promote creativity, open communication, innovation, loyalty, efficiency, higher motivation and commitment (Perumal 1990: 246). Gounden and Dayaram (1986: 19), in a study of HOD teachers' attitudes towards school management, concluded that teachers expressed reservations about the lack of opportunities to participate in decision-making, poor interpersonal relationships with school management, low morale due to inflexible managerial attitudes, and top-down management styles in schools.

Accordingly, in the opinion of the investigator, more attention should be given to where teaching and learning take place. For a variety of reasons, such as unfavourable renumeration structures, stress and unprofessional treatment, many teachers opt for a quick way out of the classroom into management positions, or worse, for employment outside the education system leading to a loss in the state's investment in the training of teachers (Claassen 1992: 108). In this respect, it is calculated that a trainee teacher at a college of education costs the state R62 708 for four years training (The Pretoria News in Claassen 1992: 108). This economic investment in terms of effective teaching by a departing teacher is forfeited.

Understandably, bureaucrats are what they are because of the culture or "ecology" of the environment in which they work, the kind of state and government for which they work and policies it pursues, the kind of management style their departments practise, the degree of accountability to the public that is required and the measure of professional independence they have in relation
to the government of the day (Hartshorne 1992b: 11). Under apartheid, they were not able to act as independent professionals but as ideological advocates of government policy.

According to Morrow (1989: 13), large bureaucracies are a pervasive feature of modern societies:

*The more government is bureaucratized the less democratic it becomes; there is conflict or tension between the central ideals of democracy, and the power of bureaucracies in modern societies.*

Part of the reason for this, is that policies are laid down by politicians, but they are implemented by "civil servants." As implementation inevitably involves interpretation, these officials come to be vested with considerable discretionary powers, not least because they can claim to be implementing policy for which they are not responsible or accountable.

The solution is not to hope or expect that bureaucracies will disappear but rather find ways to curb the anti-democratic and cost-ineffective features of bureaucracy.

A major challenge confronting policy-makers is to ensure that the education bureaucracy is restructured to promote efficiency, eliminate wastage, and exercise responsibility in controlling state expenditure. Naidoo (1993: 19) contends that a way should be found to link employment in the civil service to effective and efficient service to all people and to ensure that labour standards are enshrined at both the individual and collective level.

McLennan (1992: 9) makes several recommendations in relation to transforming the education bureaucracy and broader civil service:

* target the most influential players (bureaucrats) in order to create an awareness of the need for change;
* develop new capacity through training programmes;

* alter public opinion of the bureaucracy by targeting the media; and

* encourage a new development orientated ethos, that is, to promote a responsive, accountable and proactive bureaucracy.

In addition, it is necessary to devise structures that empower the public to monitor and check the power of officialdom.

If our education system is to become efficient and democratic, this will also have to be reflected by changes in the composition and decision-making processes of its organizational structure. A challenge facing policy-makers is to broaden participation in the governance of the education system.

4.3 EDUCATION GOVERNANCE NEEDS

In chapter three, policy options of the two major education initiatives: the ERS and NEPI, for a system of governance was discussed (cf paragraphs 3.4.2.1 and 3.4.2.2). It was concluded that although both initiatives favour a unitary system of governance, in practice, this means different things to them. The ERS recommends a three-tier control structure with limited powers at the centre, significant powers devolved to the regional level, and maximum possible devolution of power to individual institutions (cf paragraph 3.4.2.1). In terms of the ERS principle of decentralization, different models providing for varying degrees of "management autonomy" are proposed. These include state-run, state-aided and state-financed schools. State-aided schools will operate, more or less, along the lines currently constituted as Model C schools.

In contrast, NEPI governance options (cf paragraph 3.4.2.2), in terms of the system and school governance perspective, explore the possibility of a four-tier control structure: central,
regional, local or district and institutional. Although a strong central state is envisaged to co-ordinate, regulate and intervene in all aspects of the system to ensure equity and integration, the commitment to the democratization of the system has led to proposals which give central, regional and local or district levels greater power than the institutional. Both proposals do not specify the nature of regional and local boundaries.

This section articulates the needs of some members of the Indian community in relation to education governance.

4.3.1 The need for democratic participation in decision-making

At the outset, it should be stressed that the majority of those interviewed, including academics working in the field of education, did not appear to possess a working knowledge of either the ERS or NEPI governance proposals for education. In most instances, informants, admittedly, showed little interest in the precise technical details for governance contained in the ERS or NEPI reports.

Dr Dowlat Bagwandeen's (1993: interview) comment, for example, was illustrative of the views of a number of informants:

"... it really does not matter whether education is controlled by a three-tier structure or four-tier structure. Our primary concern should be to enable all constituencies to feed their concerns into the decision-making process, encourage debate around setting priorities, and allowing for bargaining through which compromises are 'hammered' out.

Historically, Indians have not been actively and meaningfully involved in the education of their children except when making financial contributions. In state schools administered by the HOD, parents elect committees which have little say over substantive educational matters and merely function as advisory bodies in matters such as school uniforms and the collection of
voluntary school funds. In addition, teacher and student participation in decision-making is an area of contestation. Maharaj (1987: 13; 1989: 6; 1991: 20) endorses the views that parental involvement is confined to support tasks for fund-raising and excursions; an exceptionally low level of parental involvement exists; few schools reflect a serious consideration for home-school relationships; parents intervene only in times of crisis; educators are not clear about the role of parents; and an inability on the part of authorities to effect meaningful change exists.

It is in this context that informants articulated the need for democratic participation of all stakeholders in the decision-making processes of the education system:

The parent community must be represented at all levels in education (Ravi Joshi 1993: interview).

Appropriate structures for decision-making should be established - representing parents, teachers, students and others that have an interest in education. These structures should be statutorily entrenched with real powers vested in them (Yunus Ebrahim 1993: interview).

Decisions should be characterized by transparency, accountability and flexibility... (Dr Dowlat Bagwandeen 1993: interview).

Policy-making will only be successful if the control of education is democratic and the broader community is involved (Dr Roshni Maharaj 1993: interview).

Although the responses of informants tended to lack detail and a knowledge of policy documents, they reaffirm a fundamental principle contained in both the ERS and NEPI documents, that is, a commitment to a democratic system of education governance (cf paragraphs 3.4.2.1 and 3.4.2.2). The problem is that the principle of democracy is so generally stated in the interviews that it is open to differing interpretations. The responses also do not specify the type of democracy envisaged, except to say that a future system of education governance should be derived
from, and fit in with, the principle of democracy.

As regards education generally, the goal of democracy points in two distinct directions. First, it signifies the desire for a unitary legitimate state and a unitary legitimate education system which reflects and serves popular aspirations. This sense of educational democracy is sometimes called representative democracy (NEPI 1993 : 14).

Second, educational democracy also points to the popular desire for wider participation in educational affairs. This can take one of three forms. The strongest form is that of participation in decision-making, often called direct democracy. This form is most appropriate at local levels of participation, although the principle of direct democracy is partly served by means of partnership relations between key social actors at regional and national level. A second form of participation is consultation, where democracy means having one’s voice heard (though not necessarily listened to) by the decision-makers. A third, even weaker form, is that of simply being kept informed (NEPI 1993 : 14 - 15).

South Africa’s dilemma is that, given the heterogeneous nature of its society, if participation in decision-making takes place very widely, few decisions might be arrived at in education. In any event, it is simplistic to believe that national policy positions will emerge directly from base communities. A whole range of factors come into play at various moments in the policy-making process compelling policy-makers to shift positions and make compromises in the interests of their constituencies.

Clearly, one of the responsibilities of a democratically elected government will be to establish the procedures for bona fide negotiations around the governance of the education system. A need exists for clarity regarding the role of different interests within the education governing bodies and the role of these bodies at different levels within the education system. In other
words, the emphasis on democratic participation and consultation in decision-making, though often stated as a matter of form, needs to be clearly defined. The rights and powers of legitimate stakeholders in education need to be specified.

Since the introduction of the Model C option in schools administered by the HOA, debate in the Indian community has revolved around the viability of this option for governance in a new education dispensation. To this effect, the school management structure of the Model C schools has come under scrutiny by different interests within the Indian community.

4.3.2 The need for an appropriate system of school governance

Over the past few years a variety of systems of institutional governance for schools have emerged from several different sectors of the education community. Perhaps the most significant has been that of the state in the form of the Model C system of state-aided schools. This system, currently in operation in schools administered by the HOA, gives parents considerable powers in the management of schools. These powers include: prescribing compulsory school fees; determining admission policies; selecting staff and appointing additional staff who are paid from school funds; and selecting and purchasing resources (cf paragraph 3.4.3.1). To date, policy initiatives in governance on the part of the progressive education movement have been somewhat vague, although there is a growing interest in this issue. For them, the most important development has been the emergence of the PTSA movement, although there is little clarity concerning their actual powers and functions (NEPI 1993: 159).

As mentioned earlier (cf paragraph 4.3.1), the introduction of the Model C option in white education has encouraged debate in the Indian community over the feasibility of this option for future schooling. While some sections of the Indian community have criticized this option on a number of grounds, others have
yet to understand the workings of, and the rationale behind, the Model C option of school governance.

Dr John Samuel (in Garson 1993 : 5), head of the ANC education desk, criticized the Model C option on the grounds that it is fundamentally undemocratic:

*This particular aspect of provision was dealt with by an apartheid regime and was conceived within an apartheid framework. It was done less in the interests of the national interest, and more in the interests of white privilege. Consultation to transform state schools into the Model C system was done with parents, but not the broader community. A new system will have to be derived from a much more representative negotiated process.*

Samuel (1992 : 54) further adds:

*.... the wholesale selling off of national resources is a huge travesty of justice. Schools which were built, expanded and maintained with public funds have now suddenly become private property; they have been handed over to local communities which now take ownership of them.*

Finally, Samuel (1992 : 54) qualifies his earlier comment on the ownership of Model C schools by local communities:

*They (Model C schools) should have been handed over within the context of a more democratic educational system. If that had been done, then the notion of community ownership, participation, contribution and, indeed, governance would have made a lot of sense.*
Dr Yusuf Karodia (1993: interview) was particularly critical of the role of school management committees in furthering institutional racism:

*It makes good sense that if these bodies (school management committees) are empowered to determine admission policy for their respective schools, then they are also in a position to restrict the intake of black pupils by setting unreasonably high admission criteria whenever they feel the culture of the school is threatened.*

A more controversial view of the Model C system was given by Idris Khammissa (1993: interview):

*It gives parents greater financial responsibility without genuine decision-making power.*

In overall terms, a general rejection of the Model C system was evident in the responses of informants. While some criticisms were legitimate and warrant further discussion, others (cf Idris Khammissa) tended to show little theoretical understanding and analysis of this option. Rejection was also an important factor to emerge from the literature study.

According to Ralphs (1993: 4), the failure of the Model C option lies not so much in its capacity to alienate white parents and teachers as in its naive and dangerous attempt to isolate a small section of the population from the systematic nature of the education crisis in South Africa.

Metcalf (1991: 19) criticizes the Model C option on a number of grounds. Firstly, this model is fundamentally undemocratic in that it excludes the majority of parents from decisions about where their children may go to school and allow a minority to make decisions for a majority - a further disenfranchising of the disenfranchised. Secondly, the Model C option is perceived to be
182

wedded to an apartheid-style commitment to race and to Christian National Education. The fact that the "ethos" of the school must be retained; that schools are permitted to admit only a maximum of 49% of children classified as other than white; that different selection mechanisms, determined by the management committee, apply with respect to black and white children; and ethnocentric syllabi and school traditions are applied, all serve as a clearest demonstration of what the Nationalist government might mean by "distinctive community-based education", and of the way it envisages group rights to operate in a new South Africa (McCalf 1991: 20-21).

For example, many Model C schools have discriminatory admission policies, like racial quotas. They may also use more subtle means to exclude blacks by maintaining unreasonably high standards in English proficiency as an entrance requirement and insist that parents should be property owners or ratepayers, thus effectively barring the children of domestic workers or other labourers working in the school zonal area (Garson 1993: 5).

It is also contended that school management committees, far from expressing the wishes of parents as a whole, appear to function as a new administrative arm of the education department. In some quarters, little communication exists between management members and parents. Basic decisions about fees or admission policies are made without consulting parents and behind closed doors (Maurice 1993: 4). For Chetty (1993: 28), the management committee "has the hallmarks of a private corporation which is accountable to no one except those who run it". Evidence of this lies in the fact that no grievance procedure exists whereby Model C parents can express dissatisfaction with the governing bodies (Maurice 1993: 5).

In aggregate, the present pattern of establishing Model C schools is not quantitatively significant in terms of crisis of provision for schooling in South Africa. By the end of January 1991, a mere 0.08% of the African school-going population had been admitted
to these schools and would have constituted only approximately 0.6% of the pupil population in these schools (Metcalf 1991: 23).

On the positive side, it has been acknowledged that the Model C option represents the first public commitment by the education bureaucrats to a single system, not structured on the basis of race (NEPI 1993: 157). Despite widespread reservations, the NECC decided to intervene actively within the process of the implementaiton of this Clase Model as it was seen as a space which could be "used creatively in the struggle for a single, non-racial education system" (Carrim and Sayed 1991: 21).

For the first time, white parents have had to become more involved in education. School management committees gain a greater measure of autonomy, which gives them wide powers of decision-making (contrary to Khammissa's comment) with respect to the management and control of schools (DNE: HOA undated: 5; Chetty 1993: 26). These parent communities are acquiring new skills and accepting new responsibilities.

In sum, the Model C option should be understood in its political context for its significance to be appreciated. In the end, the process of political negotiations will determine the extent to which this model remains part of the educational resources of the country, and the extent to which it is removed from attempts to rationalize underprovision and overprovision of education.

An issue which is integrally related to all facets of education provision is that of finance. Financial resources are the nuclei of the education system. How money is allocated, according to what formula, and how much is allocated, are highly involved technical issues with far-reaching implications for all citizens of a country.
4.4 FINANCE NEEDS

The previous chapter explored policy options for financing schooling in a post-apartheid South Africa. The ERS (cf paragraph 3.4.3.1) emphasized greater autonomy for local communities; stressed the importance of compulsory education; supported in principle a subsidy formula; and envisaged an increased role for parents in education funding. By contrast, the NEPI options (cf paragraph 3.4.3.2) give consideration to redistribution in funding to disadvantaged school areas. The first option, a community-based approach, encourages the release of schooling from state jurisdiction to local communities. The second option proposes an expansion and desegregation of privileged schools. The third option calls for a reduction in state spending for privileged schools. A fourth option provides for a simple equalization of spending for all schools and the fifth option links per-pupil subsidy to an index of relative need based on per capita income. These options are not mutually exclusive to one another.

On the issue of free and compulsory education, there is convergence between the ERS and NEPI. The ERS commits the state to the provision of at least nine years of compulsory education for which the state would assume primary responsibility (DNE 1992: ix). NEPI has also proposed that the state take responsibility for nine or ten years of free and compulsory education (NEPI 1993: 146).

This section attempts to identify patterns of thinking in the Indian community in relation to future financial provision of education. Here, two issues should be noted. First, informants were generally not familiar with the precise technical details concerning the various financial options for schooling. And second, it is not possible in the context of this dissertation to explore the whole range of issues which encompass the policy area of finance.
For the most part, this section focused in a preliminary manner on two pertinent areas of concern which emerged from the interviews. These were: the need for free and compulsory education and the need for appropriate financial options for schooling.

4.4.1 The need for free and compulsory education

The fact that education in South Africa is characterized by quantitative and qualitative inequalities in terms of provision is well-documented and does not require further elaboration here. Suffice to say, this anomaly has given rise to a growing social and economic demand for free and compulsory education. Even within the Indian community, which to date has received a relatively privileged education, the idea of free and compulsory education is widely accepted as a fundamental human right.

The following comments are illustrative of informants' general support for free and compulsory education:

*Education up to standard ten should be given free of charge .... we pay taxes* (Parent 1993: group discussion).

*The new government cannot and must not abnegate its responsibility .... schooling should be free for all* (Dowlat Bugwandeen 1993: interview).

*It stands to reason that if free education is limited to nine or ten years, the majority of people will not be able to give their children a quality education* (Satha Moodley 1993: interview).

*If we are to improve the living standards of the masses .... free education is a must* (Teacher 1993: group discussion).

While the demand for free and compulsory education is a legitimate one and should be acknowledged, informants made no explicit attempt to propose how this could be achieved. In essence, responses showed a lack of understanding of the magnitude of the
task of providing free education up to matric level. Although the fast-growing school population and rising expectations are problems in themselves, the full extent of the problem can only be understood when considered in conjunction with the financial constraints of the South African economy.

The real growth rate of the South African economy (that is, growth after taking account of inflation) has been low, on average 1% to 2%, since the late 1970s. Since the population has been increasing at about 2.6% per year, per capita economic growth can be regarded as negative since 1982 (Pillay 1991b:100).

Given this economic situation, it is unlikely that the post-apartheid economy will be capable of generating sufficiently high growth rates, in the short-to medium-term, to enable the state to fund education for all at the current level of expenditure on white education (Pillay 1991b:101). For example, the ERS (DNE 1992 : 109) has found that if spending on education should constitute 6% of the GDP and a 1%, 2% or 3% annual economic growth is projected up to 2008, should the provision levels of education for the DEC : HOA be applied to all learners, the country will, even with a 3% annual economic growth rate, only be able to afford primary education by the year 2008.

In addition, the 21% of the national budget allocated to education in South African ranks among the highest in the world and increasing education expenditure any further would have adverse effects on the economy as a whole because other social services also compete for public funds (Claassen 1992 : 107; Landman 1992 : 40). Again, in the light of these constraints, the task of providing free and compulsory education should be viewed with a sense of economic realism.

Donaldson (1992 : 18) estimates that providing a good quality secondary education, calculated on 1990 figures, could amount to R1 410 in a low growth economy, R1 710 if growth is medium strength, and R2 070 if growth rates are high. For white and
Indian pupils, this would mean a drop in spending of between 50% and 66% (Donaldson 1992: 18). At primary level, he estimates between R990 and R1 450 being spent on each pupil, depending on how optimistic the scenario. This will mean an increase of about 33% for Africans, a drop in spending for Coloured pupils of 32%, for Indians and whites 51% and 66% respectively (Donaldson 1992: 18).

In the face of growing demand and economic austerity, it is thus unlikely that the South African state will be able to fund free high quality school education at all levels in the short-term, that is, not at least until the end of the century.

On the positive side, however, there are strengths in the existing education structure on which to build. One is that, although there is variation in access to schooling, South Africa enrols, on aggregate, over 90% of the school-age population. Therefore the country does not face a massive quantitative school expansion; there is scope for shifting resources into qualitative improvements in general schooling (NEPI 1993: 139). A second strength is that there is, at least, a basic infrastructure and expertise in place.

An issue closely related to free and compulsory education is that of providing good quality education. It is contended in some quarters that a unitary education system will facilitate the provision of a high standard of education at a significantly cheaper cost than that of the current fragmented system. Heese (1992a: 6) and Claassen (1992: 108) refute this, at least, in one particular area, that of educational excellence. It is increasingly being realized that quality education depends primarily on what happens in the classroom. No education system, no matter how grand its central design or educational structure, will succeed if its teachers do not teach properly (Heese 1992a: 7; Claassen 1992: 108). In this context, the words of a HOD department official (1993: confidential interview) are significant:
The responsibility of the child is to acquire knowledge. The responsibility of the teacher is to teach. This does not mean that they have no place in decision-making. It simply means that they must get their priorities right and make inputs positively rather than negatively.

Parents (1993: group discussion) also reflected similar concerns over factors that threaten the provision of quality education:

*How much longer are we going to let teachers use our children as platforms to voice their grievances?*

*Our children are used as pawns of power-hungry politicians who promise the earth and giving nothing.*

These comments generally reflect the concern by some in the Indian community over the continuing deterioration of the learning environment. Since 1990, teacher protests, stayaways, chalk-downs and strikes, a characteristic feature of African education, have led to an instability in the schooling system of Indian children. It is the view of this dissertation that stakeholders in education need to address the education crisis by means of a co-ordinated and multi-faceted series of campaigns and interventions legitimated in all-inclusive negotiating forums. In the final analysis, national planning needs to be tempered by the appreciation that the quality of learning is closely related to the enthusiasm, commitment and understanding of the average teacher (Lewin 1985: 132).

Clearly, the present methods of financing education will need to be reformed either by spreading the burden of costs to beneficiaries or reviewing priorities for state education spending. As the education system is restructured under a new constitution, a set of appropriate financing models for schools must evolve which fully reflect the partnership of all stakeholders and their respective responsibilities.
4.4.2 The need for appropriate financing arrangements for schooling

This section identifies the needs of the Indian community in relation to an appropriate system of financing schooling. These needs are viewed against the background of the Model C and NEPI options which are seen by some as possible alternatives for financing schooling in a new education dispensation.

4.4.2.1 The ERS option

The details regarding the functioning of the ERS option (cf paragraph 3.4.3.1), currently in operation in the form of Model C schools under the control of the DEC: HOA, have already been discussed. This section identifies the responses of some in the Indian community to this option.

Overall, some educationists in the Indian community have tended to reject the Model C option as a viable alternative for schooling in a post-apartheid South Africa.

Motala (1991a: 5) has argued that the ERS is generally "the hand of monopoly capital, of the New Right, of monetarism hidden under the disguise of privatization, deregulation and apartheid-reformed". Motala (1991a: 5) further draws a distinction between "effete reformism", which is essentially cosmetic in nature, and the "radical" transformation of society. For example, in a critique of the Model C option, he contends that while it purports to deracialize education, it, in effect, entrenches discrimination structurally in society (Motala 1991a: 4). Chetty (1993: 28) criticizes the Model C option on the grounds that it perpetuates the development of a class-based education system with children of the rich continuing to be the main beneficiaries. In a newspaper editorial (The Leader, 22 January 1993: 12), a "warning" was issued to the HOD to desist from introducing payment of school fees along Model C lines in its institutions or face the "wrath" of the Indian people:
Our community is saving the authorities millions of rands in capital expenditure in making our community-built schools available to the HOD department free of any rentals. All children attending the HOD schools are entitled to free and compulsory education, new to us, but which the white South Africans have enjoyed for many generations.

In general, informants endorsed the literature findings:

The Model C option is unsuitable for a third world country like South Africa .... beyond the free stage, education will be unaffordable to the majority of blacks (Abdul Karrim 1993 : interview).

The Model C schools make education less, not more, accessible to the millions of oppressed people (Ravi Joshi 1993 : interview).

Dr Yusuf Karodia (1993 : interview) added an international dimension to the problem:

We must be wary of 'neo-Thatcherist' and 'neo-Reaganist' moves by conservative elements in South Africa to privatize public assets, cut state expenditure and smash the organized labour movements.

Karodia is cautioning against the perceived "New Right" trend of privatization of schools which will not necessarily solve the financial dilemma of making good quality education available to the majority of South Africans (cf paragraph 1.6).

Admittedly, although many of the aforementioned responses emanating from members of the Indian community border on the level of generality and rhetoric and therefore cannot be related to specific reconstructive development strategies in education, they, however, underline certain structural deficiencies contained in the Model C option for future schooling. In this context, these responses are significant in that they highlight an essential need for a more acceptable financing arrangement for education.
Generally, the literature also reveals a number of weaknesses associated with the Model C option. First, a major flaw with the ERS proposals is its ahistoricity. The educational reality or problem has been treated as a demographic one, with little consideration for its socio-economic and political dimensions.

Second, in the Model C option, education is no longer a social good delivered by the state but a privatized commodity (Chetty 1993: 35). The recommendation that Management Councils should have decision-making autonomy over additional funding for their schools (the proposed type B funds) is clearly in line with the overall goals of the ERS of creating a "market" for educational services in South Africa where "clients" (parents and pupils) have the freedom to spend according to their preferences and abilities to pay. Indeed, the combination of "diversity", "decentralization" and "decision-making autonomy" being linked to greater financial responsibility in the South African context would mean that not only will schools remain segregated and unequal, but that schools in well-off areas will enjoy greater control by the community than the schools in disadvantaged areas (Buckland et al, 1992: 6).

Third, although seeming to address one of the basic demands, namely that of deracialization of education provision, the report falls short of addressing the issue of redressing the inequalities brought about by apartheid education. In other words, the proposals for financing do not in any way take into account the issue of equity, of how transferring of costs to school communities will affect the historically disadvantaged communities.

Fourth, there are indications that the ERS proposals are similar to the discourse of the New Right (cf paragraph 1.6) which developed in countries like the USA and Britain under the Reagan and Thatcher administrations. Parental participation, choice and opting out are key elements of this discourse put into practice through budget cuts to state agencies, indirect assistance to private education and a return to a new traditionalism in the
content of education. In terms of outcomes, the consequences are greater degrees of differentiation, stratification, inequality and fewer opportunities (Chetty 1993 : 39). The evidence from Britain and the USA also indicates that the policies of the New Right have had the effect of running down the public provision of education services for the majority of people - those who cannot afford to pay for the privilege (Kallaway 1988 : 519). Through the Model C system in South Africa, the state has already begun the process of withdrawal and deregulation of education provision and governance on the grounds of financial necessity.

In contrast, despite its shortcomings, the Model C option represents the first constructive attempt to deal practically, however inadequate, with the problems of educational provision in South Africa.

A positive feature of the Model C system is the increased involvement of parents in their children’s education, and thus a growing community participation. Schools and communities are beginning to work together to promote, utilize, fund and maintain school facilities.

Some governing bodies are already well-versed in financial matters of the school and are able to eliminate wastage and keep fees down enabling parents to get value for their money.

The Model C option also saves the state the expense of maintaining additional schools. The reduced subsidy given to these schools (by way of payment of salaries to staff) enables the state to redirect more funds to school communities where it is most needed.

Also, the admission of blacks to previously all-white schools enables them to obtain a better quality education than is available in the schools of the under-resourced DET.
Finally, it should be noted that qualitative differentiation of schools is a characteristic feature in all modern societies where socio-economic divisions exist. Generally, private and semi-private schools tend to provide a better quality education, for the few who can afford it, than the public school system. In any event, a fully state-controlled system of education is not necessarily an egalitarian one and the existence of private and semi-private schools are not a pre-condition for the emergence of an elite sector in society. In South Africa, the former Afrikaner ruling group was formed not by private schools, but by elite state schools. Indeed, the entire white state schooling system in the apartheid era was a privileged sector of the overall school system.

In response to the ERS proposals, NEPI outlined a series of financial options for schooling in a new education dispensation.

\subsection{The NEPI options}

The NEPI report does not constitute a model for a new education system, but rather an analysis of feasible options for the short-to medium-term future. Different options favour different social values and economic scenarios which are sometimes in conflict with one another. The various options explore the financing, regulation and control of schools on the assumption that total education spending will not be increased, but there will be equal per capita expenditure, and reallocations within the budget will provide starting points for improved quality and efficiency of schooling.

As discussed earlier, informants generally did not possess a working knowledge of the precise details of each NEPI policy option for financing schools. However, a few informants did respond to some of the more popular options contained in the report.
Responses to the first NEPI option, that is, community-based schooling, were similar in many respects to their criticisms of the Model C option. A typical response was:

Greater community control of schooling implies greater financial responsibility for local communities. The majority of South Africans will not be able to finance schooling in their communities in the present economic climate (Yunus Ebrahim 1993: interview).

Once again, responses like the above do little to contribute to meaningful debate because they show little theoretical understanding of the benefits of community-based schooling. As in the case of the Model C option, the money saved from granting community-based schools a reduced state subsidy could be used to offset the racial imbalances in terms of educational provision suffered by the historically disadvantaged school communities under apartheid. In addition, local community ventures have more flexibility than bureaucratic approaches to education development and can draw innovatively on local resources (NEPI 1993: 142), as discussed earlier. However, it should be borne in mind, an undue and unchecked transfer of schools to local communities in the South African context could have the effect of perpetuating existing inequalities in a new education dispensation.

The second NEPI option, that is, to expand and desegregate suburban school was generally received favourably by informants:

White, Coloured and Indian schools need to be 'filled' to maximum capacity. This will reduce the pressure placed on the new government to upgrade all schools in the African townships (Idris Khammissa 1993: interview).

A full desegregation of white and Indian schools will provide African pupils with quality education in the immediate short-term (Teacher 1993: group discussion).
These comments are in line with the underlying assumptions in the NEPI report. By expanding enrolments in suburban schools (white, Coloured and Indian schools) which are relatively well-resourced, additional state resources would become available for spending in township and rural schooling (NEPI 1993 : 143).

The NEPI options of linking per-pupil subsidy to an index of relative need, such as per capita income, and the simple equalization of school resources per capita also contain certain structural weaknesses. According to Ebrahim, Ansur (1993 : interview):

*Linking school fees according to earning capacity of parents will mean that the well-off will be forced to subsidize the education of the less well-off.*

Alternatively, the option of equalizing state spending for all will lead to a qualitative decay of existing suburban and private schools which would, in turn, have undesirable political and economic effects (NEPI 1993 : 144).

In the main, these responses to the various NEPI options are fragmentary and incomplete parts of other debates on financing education. In this sense, informants showed little understanding of various financial options proposed for schooling in a new education dispensation. This finding points to the need for education authorities to undertake the responsibility of educating local communities on the various options available in education and their roles and responsibilities in each. This could take the form of workshops or awareness programmes through the media to enable communities to deal adequately with the choices available to them in education.

What is clearly evident, is that the principal financial strategy of NEPI, that is, the redistribution of funds from privileged school communities (white, Coloured and Indian) to underprivi-
Leged school communities will imply that Indian parents will incur additional costs in providing education for their children.

In the final analysis, the question of an appropriate financing arrangement for schooling is complex - there are no simple solutions. Education planners face the twin challenge of restoring and maintaining good quality basic education and, at the same time, shifting substantial resources towards upgrading township and rural school facilities within the constraints of the national education budget.

The transformation of the education system for democratic ends will also involve a radical reconceptualization of the whole range of issues which encompass the policy area of curriculum. This will entail not only a rethinking of curriculum content, but also consideration of the decision-making structures of curriculum.

4.5 CURRICULUM NEEDS

Broadly defined, curriculum refers not only to the context, structure and process of teaching and learning that takes place in educational institutions, but also to the issue of control over, and access to, curriculum decision-making (King & Van den Berg 1991 : 2).

In this regard, both the ERS (cf paragraph 3.4.4.1) and NEPI (cf paragraph 3.4.4.2) consider issues such as content of learning, decision-making processes, progression or structure of schooling, assessment and resourcing, amongst others. For the most part, political and private sector organizations (cf paragraph 3.4.4.3) view curriculum from the dimension of curriculum content.

Given the broad nature of the concept "curriculum", it is not possible in the context of this dissertation to explore the educational needs of the Indian community in relation to all facets of curriculum. However, the interviews did bring into
focus two common concerns of members of this community. These are curriculum control and curriculum content. Related to this, is the issue of curriculum purposes – rephrased, in whose interests is the curriculum? At this juncture, it should be noted that informants were also not familiar with the precise technical details of the major curriculum initiatives (cf paragraph 3.4.4). Nonetheless, their responses reflect areas of agreement and disagreement with the broad principles of the major curriculum options discussed in the previous chapter.

4.5.1 The need for democratic curriculum control

The historical context which characterized curriculum development in South Africa was briefly remarked upon in chapter two (cf paragraph 2.3.4.1). During the apartheid era, curriculum development structures and processes in South Africa were: undemocratic; non-inclusive; bureaucratic; ideologically-laden to serve the interests of a racial minority; improverished in their understanding of curriculum and the dialectic between schooling and society, and rigidly subject-based inhibiting any holistic thinking about curriculum (King & Van den Berg 1991: 18 – 19).

This truncated approach to curriculum development was widely criticized in South African education circles (NEPI 1993: 104; Samuels 1987: 8). With specific reference to the Indian community, Balkissoon (1988: 19) observed:

_Historically, the Indian in this country has been told what to do, he has been told what is good or what is not good for him. The Indian Education Act of 1965 was drawn up by someone else - someone who knew what the aspirations of Indians were or, closer to the truth, what they ought to be._
As an example, the recent unsuccessful attempt by the HOD education authorities to introduce pupils to sex education in schools under its administration has provided a clear illustration of the adverse consequences of undemocratic curriculum practices:

We (parents) object strongly to the 'high-handed' manner in which the HOD tried to foist the idea of sex education onto our children .... the HOD is not renowned for its community mobilization skills (Parent 1993 : group discussion).

The idea of educating children about sex matters is a good one .... but this is only possible if it is done with the support of the community (Parent 1993 : group discussion).

The above comments emphasize the need to open up curriculum decision-making to broader participation and to appropriate public accountability. Bagwandeen (1986 : 17) reiterates this point:

The total involvement of the community in curriculum development to my mind is sine qua non for the adoption of a salutory and positive attitude to education generally. It is imperative that the community become full participants in curriculum planning and not merely tools for the implementation of predetermined educational policy.

Responses elicited from interviews followed the same line of argument:

Decision-making on curriculum issues must be undertaken on a democratic basis (Farouk Hoosen 1993 : interview).

Questions about what to teach are too important to be left to bureaucrats and politicians. It must be a culmination of collaborative efforts between the education department, local community and other interest groups (Chandprakash Nankissor 1993 : interview).
These comments are consistent with the broad policy principles contained in the major curriculum initiatives (cf paragraph 3.4.4), insofar as they emphasize the need to democratize the process of curriculum development. However, as in the case of the policy area of education governance, discourse emanating from the Indian community lacks adequate clarity in relation to how the curriculum decision-making process should be democratized. More specifically, the community needs to spell out the composition, task and operation of decision-making structures they would envisage in a democratic education system.

This criticism could also be extended to the ERS and NEPI initiatives. While both share the notion of democratic representation for key stakeholders in education at all levels (DNE 1992 : 15; NEPI 1993 : 154), it is unclear what this means in terms of decision-making and participation structures generally, and curriculum development procedures specifically. At the time of writing, the way in which a "single ministry" of education would be constituted in terms of its administrative structures was not defined, neither was the composition of regional and district structures. Without more specific information, it was difficult to understand how curriculum decision-making would operate. Put differently, it would be difficult for a particular community to decide what it wants if it does not know what is possible.

Another common assumption reflected in the responses of members of the Indian community is that grassroots participation in curriculum decision-making should prevail at all times. In this regard, it is acknowledged that mass participation in decision-making ensures that a particular policy enjoys legitimacy and thus increases its chances of being implemented with success. However, debate needs to be realistic about community participation in education.

Grassroots participation can be effected by a system of direct democracy but, given the numbers of people involved and the
complexity of modern societies, it is often unrealistic and impracticable for everybody to be involved in the taking of all decisions. In addition, it may not be advisable in the short-to medium-term to institute a curriculum decision-making structure that is heavily reliant on the engagement of the community for its realization. In the South African context, the majority of school communities do not have the skills, time or resources to participate meaningfully in decision-making in education. At the same time, this should not lead us to underestimate the ability and potential of local communities to play a proactive role in the education of their children.

Ebrahim Ansur (1993 : interview) views the problem of representation in a more realistic light.

*It is neither possible or desirable for every individual to exercise a direct influence in decision-making. The most logical thing to do would be to make inputs through democratically elected bodies which are mandated by its members....*

Ansur’s response, though quite general, invokes the notion of visibility of power. Even if, for practical reasons, direct democracy is not viable, we need to ensure that the exercise of power is visible and available for all to see in the way it operates. If we are able to clearly discern who is taking decisions, and on what basis of authority, then we have access to the practice of power (King & Van den Berg 1991 : 23). Once power is visible, it can be challenged.

Dr Yusuf Karodia (1993 : interview) suggests a way of identifying the specific curriculum needs of local communities on the ground:

*The local municipal authority, together with the local school body and the provincial education department should take responsibility for addressing the wants of the local community.... within the framework of national policy goals set by a national government.*
Added to this, King and Van den Berg (1991: 27) suggest that a series of principles of education, national guidelines and an Education Charter or educational Bill of Rights, arrived at after a form of national consultation and debate, could be enshrined in legislation to serve as criteria against which curriculum processes can be measured.

It is not possible to speculate here about all the structures that might or should be put in place in a future Ministry of Education. What is important for a society in transition is that it places greater emphasis on seeking to develop a quality curriculum. In attempting to achieve this, it needs to create appropriate structures and processes that embody the principles and practices of democracy.

In reflecting on curriculum, it is important to bear in mind that what ultimately matters, notwithstanding curriculum structures, dissemination procedures and the schooling infrastructure, is what is taught in classrooms. An analysis of the position of schooling in South Africa reveals that it is presently engaged in a struggle for relevance to the needs of the communities it serves.

4.5.2 The need for relevant education

It is generally accepted that the experiences offered to children in schools should be relevant and meaningful to their needs and to the self-actualization of their potentialities and aspirations. In the South African context, schools established by the government are currently experiencing a struggle for relevance to the ideals of the communities which they are supposed to serve.

As a consequence, both the ERS and NEPI place vocational and technical education high on their list of priorities (cf paragraph 3.4.4.1 and 3.4.4.2). On the other hand, political organizations view the issue of relevant education mainly from
an ideological perspective (cf paragraph 3.4.4.3). The Inkatha Freedom Party and Conservative Party view curriculum from a Zulu and an Afrikaner Nationalist perspective respectively. Other organizations such as the African National Congress, Democratic Party and National Party emphasize varying degrees of non-racialism and multiculturalism.

With specific reference to the Indian community, a close analysis of opinions on the subject of relevant education (literature is extremely limited) as well as a close scrutiny of events in South Africa during the last decade, reveal that the school’s struggle for relevance has two clear aspects. On the one hand, it is a culturally inappropriate curriculum that contributes to the school’s alienation from the community it serves. On the other hand, there is a demand for the vocationalization of the school curriculum. These two aspects, although addressed separately, are in actual fact intertwined and interrelated.

4.5.2.1 A culturally appropriate curriculum

A commonly held assumption, at least, by some in the Indian community, is that the content of the school curriculum is not culturally relevant to the needs of the Indian child because it is based on the ideals of Western culture. It is also asserted that the essential congruence between the cultural, social and religious values of the parents and school is being eroded. This discongruity between the parent community and school is reflected in the responses of informants:

_Most subjects are taught in school from a Eurocentric perspective .... the result is that the Indian child distances himself from everything with an Indian flavour because he regards it as old-fashioned (Teacher 1993 : group discussion)._ 

_... the Muslim pupil is continuously faced with the problem of reconciling the Western value system in education with his or her Islamic upbringing .... when this fails, the pupil’s well-being is threatened by the school (Idris Khammissa 1993 : interview)._
Christian National Education has ensured that our children (Indian) are estranged from their culture and religion (Teacher 1993: group discussion).

Ethnicity in South Africa cannot be wished away overnight, neither can cultural nor religious group identity be jettisoned. Culture, religion and education are linked and as long as there are people of different persuasions, it is imperative to recognize and respect their cultures and religions (Parent 1993: group discussion).

A common thread that appears to run through these comments is the need to deepen one's awareness of one's cultural heritage and, at the same time, recognize the reality of cultural diversity in education. This perspective is in keeping with international trends, including South Africa, whereby ethnic minorities are seeking ways to reassert their cultural identities. To this extent, the concerns of informants are significant.

However, a major shortcoming in most responses, as was mentioned previously (cf paragraph 4.5), was the inability of informants to address concretely the profound curriculum question concerning what the content of education should be in schools. A few exceptions do exist though, for example:

Disciplines such as languages, science and humanities are based on Western perspectives .... it should instead reorient itself to the conditions in South Africa (Teacher 1993: group discussion).

Why should children be forced to study foreigners like Shakespeare and Chaucer when they can derive more benefit from contemporary African and third world writers (Teacher 1993: group discussion)?

The European bias in the history syllabi is obvious .... more attention should be given to South African and African history (Yunus Ebrahim 1993: interview).

Again, although most of the above comments are fragmentary and incomplete parts of other debates, they highlight the need for changes to the content of curriculum, particularly the need for
culturally relevant content. The comment of Dr Yusuf Karodia (1993: interview) on this issue warrants some attention:

*The recognition of cultural, linguistic, religious and socio-economic differences suggest the need to devolve decision-making power to local communities.*

In this context, both the ERS and NEPI documents make provision for varying degrees of decentralized levels of authority through which diversity and specific needs can be accommodated (cf paragraphs 3.4.4.1 and 3.4.4.2).

Clearly, a need exists to sensitize curriculum content to the realities of a multicultural South African society. In a democratic dispensation, the school will have to cater for a culturally diverse population learning together in the same classroom and being exposed to the cultural influences of one another. A multicultural approach to schooling would imply initial reform of several factors, such as, school policy, curricula, instructional material, teaching strategies and assessment techniques.

According to Squelch (1991: 62 - 64), the following reforms are necessary to create and sustain a multicultural education environment:

* the formulation of clear school policy goals which recognize cultural diversity and ensure equal educational opportunities for all;

* reforming ethnocentric curricula to reflect the cultures and learning styles of children from diverse cultural backgrounds;

* selecting appropriate and relevant instructional material which reflects the culturally diverse nature of society;
ensuring that textbooks used provide a balanced and objective view;

utilizing teaching strategies appropriate to the needs of a multicultural classroom; and

using assessment techniques which are non-discriminatory.

Coutts (1990b: 6) mentions that since "ethnic additive" or "anti-racist" approaches alone have proved to be of limited value overseas, a whole-school approach is advocated. This means that multiculturalism must form an integral and continuous part of the whole curriculum throughout the child's schooling career.

Finally, it can be inferred from the responses of informants that their need for a culturally relevant education tends to be grounded in, and guided by, a simplistic and one-sided view of culture. In other words, culture is equated with a social group's heritage, that is, traditions, history, language, arts, religion, customs and values. In contrast, Bullivant (1986: 43) views culture as a form of ever-evolving "survival device" based on adaptive change that enables social groups to cope with the problems of living in a particular environment. In the South African context, this broader conception of culture will enable the school to enlighten the child as regards the transformation processes associated with enculturation and acculturation and teach them to employ the knowledge gained in various practical situations.

A related concern articulated by, at least, some members of the Indian community is for a vocationally relevant school education. It is argued that the present curriculum is too academically oriented and must, therefore, be made more vocationally oriented. Any policy-making process will have to consider this issue.
The South African schooling system has often been criticized for placing too much emphasis on preparing pupils for a university education at the expense of vocational education and training. The result of the emphasis on academic education has been that insufficient skilled workers and technicians have been trained to supply the manpower needs of the country. A shortage of more than 200,000 technically trained people is expected by the year 2000 (HOD 1992: 8).

It is against this background that the ERS and NEPI have proposed a restructuring of the schooling system in order to address the imbalances in the provision of technical and academic education. The ERS proposes three types of educational provision at the senior secondary phase: generally oriented education, vocationally oriented education, and vocational education (cf paragraph 3.4.4.1). NEPI, though less explicit, proposes that the principles which govern a state regulated system of technical and vocational education should include: a high level of general education; integrated academic and vocational curriculum; strategic but limited vocational diversification; and building bridges across fragmented modes of vocational education and training delivery (Chetty et al 1993: 52).

A major criticism levelled against the ERS model is that it is too preoccupied with meeting the needs of the labour market and, as such, tends to be narrowly focused. The degree of vocational orientation in the upper secondary phase (grades 10 and 11) is potentially high with pupils having the option of doing four vocational education subjects out of six. Bennell et al (1992: 14 - 15) argues that preparation for a place in the occupational structure should not become the raison d'etre of the education system. In short, schools should create learning situations that reflect the learning needs of their pupils and not merely those of commerce and industry.
A second criticism of the ERS is that at the junior secondary level, it is proposed that vocationally oriented optional subjects are intended for the potential school leaver at grade 9. Given the vocational-academic dichotomy in South Africa, it is often the least able pupils who are encouraged to do vocational optional courses, thus reinforcing the distinction between mental and manual labour (Bennell et al 1992: 15).

Motala (1991a: 6) criticizes the ERS proposals for not showing a wider understanding of the purposes of education other than its relevance to economic issues narrowly defined:

_In reality, it (the ERS) goes no further than recognizing capital's view of the matter, which is that education is dysfunctional to the economy because it has not produced the kinds of labour which are necessary for economic growth._

In contrast to Motala's view, it could be asserted that there is nothing intrinsically objectionable about introducing some vocational orientation in schools since education is, in some sense, vocational in that it prepares children for adult life. In addition, the ERS proposals do not constitute any significant component of occupational vocational training in schools.

It is the contention of this dissertation that the NEPI vocational education and training options, like the ERS, tend to be elaborated in isolation to the economic conditions and constraints of the country at a given time. The formulation of vocational education strategies will have to take cognizance of such issues as: the growth rate of the economy, the use of capital intensive and labour intensive technology, economic competitiveness and economic stability. Similarly, the cost of providing vocational and technical courses, which is considerably higher than academic courses, should be considered.
Given the highly technical nature of providing vocational education in schools, it is not surprising that informants were unable to give practical curriculum suggestions on what they envisage to be a workable strategy in this policy area. For the most part, informants merely stated the need for an education which is vocationally relevant. The following responses illustrate this:

*High school must give our children the skills to find employment after they complete matric* (Parent 1993: group discussion).

*School needs to focus more strongly on a career-oriented education .... this will prepare students for a career at a later stage* (Teacher 1993: group discussion).

*Subjects like Mathematics, Physical Science and Accounting need to become more functional .... pupils must be able to apply the knowledge gained from these subjects to the work situation* (Teacher 1993: group discussion).

These responses, although emphasizing the need for a more vocationally oriented education, are expressed in general terms, and thus do not contribute in any meaningful way to informed debate. In this context, a need exists for informants to acquire an understanding of the concept of vocational education and training so that they could express their needs more clearly and comprehensively in this policy area. It also reflects a need for more informed research to be conducted in the area of vocational education and training.

From the foregoing discussion, two broad approaches have emerged in the debate on vocational and technical education. On the one hand, it is argued that vocational and technical education in schools must serve directly to produce the technical skills required by the labour market. On the other hand, this view has been challenged on the grounds that high quality general academic skills are the essential basis on which technical skills must be developed in formal training contexts.
Implicit in the latter view is the contention that school-based vocational education is narrowly instrumentalist and philistine (Bennell et al. 1992: 12). A further criticism of the vocational approach is that it carries status differences since vocational education becomes socially inferior to academic education (Wolpe 1991b: 11).

Conversely, it is argued that under the present conditions, the need to redress the occupational inequalities generated by apartheid is more urgent than the provision of a rounded education. From this standpoint, the virtual exclusion of blacks from skilled occupations makes access to these occupations more urgent than the status distinctions entailed in vocational or academic differentiation (Wolpe 1991b: 11).

Motala (1991b: 23) reconciles the argument between these two seemingly contradictory approaches:

*We need to emphasize that the divide between education and training, and that between academic and vocational education can only be bridged by the provision of a sound general education.*

According to this approach, the provision of academic education is premised on the understanding that it better prepares individuals to adapt to the needs of a changing economy and society by sensitizing them in all school subjects to the world of work.

This section has identified two areas of concern in relation to curriculum needs. These are the need for a culturally and vocationally appropriate curriculum. Since no known empirical research has so far been done on this problem in the Indian community, the views of informants, in this instance, are of some value.

Curriculum change will also have to take into consideration the process of racial and cultural integration taking place in South
African society. Schools are increasingly compelled to cater for pupils from a variety of socio-economic and cultural backgrounds. The school will thus have to become relevant to a heterogeneous pupil population.

4.6 INTEGRATION NEEDS

Since 1990, attention has been devoted by various interest groups in education to the process of integrating schools. However, besides general policy statements endorsing a move towards a non-racial education system (cf paragraph 3.4.5), comparatively little attention has been given to the manner in which this process could be achieved successfully in the school situation. Policy documents often omit two important policy considerations in regard to school integration: the formulation of feasible admission policies for future schooling and the devising of teaching and learning strategies to combat racism in schools. From interviews, it was gathered that these two policy issues are a source of concern, at least, for some in the Indian community because the establishment of an acceptable education system may appear untenable in the absence of coherent admission and anti-racist policies.

4.6.1 The need for flexible admission policies

The introduction of a government policy known as the "Clase Models" has opened the way for limited desegregation of white schools where this is supported by a high percentage of parents at an individual school. The policy allows for the management committee of a school to propose to parents of that school any one of three new admission models, designated as A, B and C (cf paragraph 1.1). In order to pursue any one of these options, the regulations demand that there has to be an 80% participation in a poll for the results to be valid.

Of these, 90% have to be in favour of the proposals (i.e. 72% of individuals on the voter's roll have to vote in favour of the
proposal) in order for the school to apply to the Minister for permission to change its admission policy. For each of the three models, it is stipulated that the total number of white children have to be at least 51% of the whole, that the ethos of the school must not be altered, and that the school should adhere to the principles of Christian National Education (Metcalf 1991:17).

The introduction of these models has provoked criticism from various quarters (cf paragraph 4.3.2). One valid argument is that the "Clase Models" would enable only a fraction of the black schoolgoing population to get into white schools. For example, up to 1991, only 5 360 black pupils had entered white schools, less than 1% of the total white schoolgoers or less than 0,01% of African schoolgoers (Merrel 1991: 65).

Nothwithstanding these limitations, the Clase announcement was significant in that it also implied a change in policy within "Indian education" in South Africa. Since 1990, there has been a marked increase in "non-Indian" pupils gaining admission to HOD schools, and, more importantly, these "non-Indian" pupils are being admitted to all HOD schools (HOD 1992: 1). Having stated this, it is not as if there are no restrictions operating in the opening of HOD schools. The HOD has stipulated a number of conditions that ought to govern the way in which its schools may admit "non-Indian" pupils (cf paragraph 1.1). These conditions suggest that the integration process underway in HOD schools is more akin to the "Clase Models" in that they privilege one group of pupils over another and are overwhelmingly assimilationist in essence.

These restrictive admission practices prevalent in HOD schools have been criticized by educators employed in its education department. Two teachers (1993: group discussion) commented on the exclusionary nature of selection practices in some HOD schools:
Why are African pupils expected to write entry tests when Indian pupils are exempted from such tests?

Language and Mathematical tests administered to township (African) pupils are not standardized in any way .... they vary from school to school.

Another teacher (1993 : group discussion) criticized the personal racial prejudices of some principals:

Sometimes they (principals) limit (African) intake for fear of producing poor examination results which gives the school a poor image in the eyes of the department .... One year, we took in a large number of (African) pupils to prevent the school from being downgraded.

In contrast, a HOD education official (1993 : confidential interview), attempted to contextualize the problem of admitting African pupils into HOD schools:

You have to understand that schools (HOD) are still operating within the apartheid educational structure .... new legislation will have to be passed to work out a more just admission policy.

In its defence, the HOD (1992 : 1) also maintains that "the greatest single factor inhibiting the deracialization of schools is the budgetary allocation."

Eventhough many of the HOD schools do not follow official admission conditions to the letter, they are still unable to transcend the assimilationism that informs such conditions. This establishes the cultural ethos of the school, and the "non-Indian" pupil is expected to adapt to, and maybe adopt, the predominantly Indian culture of the school. In addition, the conditions for opening schools stipulated by the HOD are informed by, and exist within, the former apartheid constitution. Such conditions become legally necessary because the Indian Education
Act of 1965, at the time of writing, was still in force. As such, these conditions for opening schools are to ensure that the Act of 1965 is not transgressed in any way (Carrim 1992: 20). To this extent, the comments made by informants are significant in that they accentuate the need to develop more acceptable admission policies for schools.

In response to the question of what would constitute workable admission practices for schooling in a new dispensation, several distinct possibilities emerged from interviews. Although most informants accepted, as a fixed principle, that schools must be opened to all races, there was concern over ill-defined and unregulated admission policies.

Some informants called for a progressive phasing in of school integration. Yunus Ebrahim’s (1993: interview) response typified this pragmatic stance:

*It may be necessary to adopt a quota system at first to prevent an uncontrolled influx of black (African) pupils to our (Indian) schools .... when resources became available at a later stage, we could go for full integration.*

The comment of a teacher (1993: group discussion) reveals the contentious nature of laissez faire admission policies for schools:

*If too many African pupils are admitted to Indian schools, we must accept a decline in academic standards .... unless arrangements are made to give African pupils special academic support.*

Given the deprived learning histories of large segments of our school population, laissez faire admission policies are likely, as the commentators assert, to lead to tension between the needs
of the academically advantaged and socially disadvantaged school communities. From the perspective of the relatively privileged Indian community, the fear for a lowering of academic standards is, indeed, a real one and must be addressed.

It has been suggested that controlling integration, by applying some type of formula, will ensure a balance of ethnicities and a more secure learning environment (Coutts 1990a: 22), at least, in the short-term. However, in the South African context, this option is of limited application because of demographic trends and the likelihood of it being perceived as discriminatory. While, on the one hand, school communities are reluctant to lower what they see as worthwhile standards, on the other hand, this admission policy could mean that maintaining standards would result in few African pupils being admitted to historically privileged schools.

A more popular option is the use of admission tests to select applicants academically. In fact, most HOD schools, presently apply admission tests, ranging from language proficiency to mathematical ability, in order to ascertain the level of educational competency of pupils seeking admission from the DET and former homeland education departments. A teacher (1993: group discussion) made the following comment:

*Most children coming from the DET (to HOD schools) are unable to cope with the academic programme of our schools .... instead of wasting their (DET pupils) money and time, it is best to test them and pick those that are capable of coping ....*

Another teacher (1993: group discussion) made a similar comment:

*We are compelled to test (African) pupils .... our department (HOD) does not make provision for remedial classes to assist large numbers of pupils who cannot communicate in the school's medium of instruction.*
The central concern advanced in these responses is to determine whether prospective pupils fit into the school academically, thus ensuring the maintenance of existing standards. Furthermore, the financial difficulties of making remedial assistance available to large numbers of disadvantaged pupils, as mentioned in the latter's response, also has an undeniable logic.

However, this policy option has several drawbacks, including the subtle cultural bias of such tests, as often norms are based on culturally shaped aptitudes, interests and general knowledge of the most privileged group. In a situation of obvious structural inequality, admission tests may well be effective in sorting and selecting individuals, but they do not address the question of unequal starting points. By claiming equity of treatment in a situation where people do not have equal chances, the use of admission tests sidesteps initial inequalities without confronting political reasons for failure (Christie 1990: 134). Thus, they offer an individual response to a structural socio-political problem. A more general criticism of admission tests is that they contribute to academic elitism, as the best pupils are selected by the better quality schools (Bot 1992: 68).

In attempting to reconcile the strengths and weaknesses of the selection test approach, Coutts (1990b: 8) contends that the intensity of testing might be gradually relaxed as parent communities accommodate to the new intake, with an open policy being adopted in the longer term as a community school system evolves.

Overall, it can be deduced from the excerpts, that informants accept deracialization of schooling as an inevitable part of the broader political settlement. This is particularly true of the informants interviewed, although there may well be understandable divergencies within the broader Indian community which reflect cultural, religious, socio-economic and regional differences.
In addition to the admission policy options already discussed, Butler and Kriel (1991: 1 - 5) mention four other options which warrant consideration in a new dispensation. These are: selecting according to special interests (for example, religion, sport, music, art, etc.); operating on a first-come-first-serve basis; testing for potential rather than achievement; and basing selection on previous school reports and impressions gained from interviews with pupils and parents. There are valid arguments for and against each of these options.

From the investigator's general observations, consistency in dialogue and planning for the total integration of schools is generally lacking in the literature and views of informants.

From the foregoing discussion, it is thus clear that, at least in the short-term, the decentralization of decision-making in respect of admission policy may be the most realistic solution. In other words, for integration to succeed, it requires the support of those involved and must therefore be voluntary and flexible.

Butler and Kriel (1991: 6) further suggest that the development of any admission policy should be based on the following:

* avoid criteria which can be construed as racist;

* use criteria which are educationally justifiable;

* avoid criteria which are too detailed, particular or quantified, so as to allow for flexibility; and

* review criteria annually to accommodate changing circumstances.

The central challenge is to develop admission policies that address the structural inequalities which distort educational
provision in South Africa, and which requires years of effort to address.

While suitable admission policies can be expected to make better quality schooling available to a larger number of pupils, it will not in itself resolve the practical problems associated with racial integration. One such problem is that of racism in schools. This problem has already been experienced by institutions admitting pupils of different racial and cultural groups. Undoubtedly, an important factor will be how the problem of racism is handled at school level.

4.6.2 The need to combat racism

The need to positively accommodate pupils of different cultural heritages in the classroom has already been discussed (cf paragraph 4.5.2.1). This section gives specific consideration to the issue of combating racism - a concern expressed by a number of informants.

From group discussions with teachers and pupils, it became evident that the occurrence of racial prejudice is not uncommon to HOD schools. This tends to take a variety of forms.

On the question of inferential racism, one teacher (1993: group discussion) remarked:

> It is very disturbing to hear teachers (HOD) constantly refer to African pupils as 'those children' and Indian pupils as 'our children' during staff meetings .... even if it is done unconsciously.

Another teacher (1993: group discussion) was overtly racist:

> These children (African) are wasting their parent's money. They hardly ever show an interest in school-work ....
Instances of cultural racism abound. A typical pupil response (1993: group discussion) was:

I don’t mind having them (African pupils) in our school. But I can’t get along with them. They sing and dance in the class when the teacher is not around .... they keep to themselves.

A teacher (1993: group discussion) was acutely aware of the insidious and subtle nature of institutional racism:

We are fooling ourselves if we think we can eradicate racial prejudice by ignoring that it exists in school. We must be brave enough to teach children how apartheid has affected their lives and how it has alienated us from each other.

There was, for example, one informant (Bharat Kalidas 1993: interview), who took a different perspective on the problem of racism in schools:

School integration is a new thing in this country. Naturally, there are problems when kids mix for the first time. But, with time and effort things will get better.

It should be mentioned that the views quoted above are by no means representative of the majority of teachers and pupils in the Indian community. But they serve as an important polar position and provide, at least, one set of opinions in relation to the issue under study. The racist discourse of a number of informants is not simply a reflection of personal prejudice, though it may indeed be that. Neither is it the intention of the investigator to portray racism as a personal characteristic or prejudice. Obviously, these views are articulated by individuals, but more significant is the discourse through which these ideas gain their logic and their currency. More importantly, racism
must be understood as a systematic set of social practices which is not simply reducible to individuals. The accounts of inherent racial differences, of relations of racial inferiority and superiority, of racial stereotyping, show a pattern of racial discourse which is of the broader discursive patterns of hegemonic racism. This cannot be swept aside by the experience of being with small numbers of African pupils in predominantly Indian open schools. Overall, it would be accurate to state that informants' support of integration embraced a range of reservations within the rubric of general approval. However, it should be noted that an absence of commentary on the part of informants exists as to what strategies should be employed to combat racist practices at school level.

Given the historical context of education in South Africa, any future unitarian schooling system that is designed to accommodate different races and ethnic groups must, of necessity, reflect a non-racial or anti-racist philosophy. This idea is in line with educational policy shifts in several overseas countries which have subjected the liberal multicultural approach (that focuses on accommodating ethnicity by teaching about different cultures) to a powerful anti-racist movement that penetrates to social injustices based on racism and socio-economic class discrepancies (Coutts 1990b: 5). In other words, schooling in a multicultural society must not be confined to minimalist measures aimed merely at bolstering self-esteem and ethnic group identity by making reference to supposed lifestyles, histories and cultural traditions, but be positively anti-racist.

It is necessary to consider the policy implications of the research, bearing in mind the caution that has to be exercised in drawing conclusions from a restricted sample. It would appear that the formulation of policy statements taking a decidedly anti-racist stance at institutional level might be essential as a pre-requisite to deal with the question of racism in schools (cf paragraph 4.5.2.1). The limitation of schooling to address deep-seated racial animosities in the wider society must,
It is also disconcerting to find teachers complaining about the prospect of functioning in a fully racially integrated classroom in the foreseeable future in the light of their own inadequacies in dealing with the problem of racism in schools. Priority must be given to the development of pre-service and in-service teaching programmes which include active strategies to combat racism and thereby challenge the status quo. Coutts (1990a: 22) states that South African teachers will require a comprehensive vocabulary of skills and that considerable introspection will be needed if staff are to avoid ethnocentric perspectives. This will necessitate the formulation of instructional techniques that take into consideration the learning and relational styles of culturally different learners because these are basic to the development of both cognitive and affective skills (Cordova & Love 1987: 397).

Insofar as curriculum is concerned, a number of writers support the view that it should adopt a more explicit, anti-racist stance, rather than emphasizing the relatively superficial aspects of cultural difference such as ethnic food, dance, festive clothing or strange customs (Morrel 1991: 67; Bullivant 1986: 42; Carrington, Millward and Short 1986: 19). This implies that a need exists to analyse the structural, social class, economic, political and racist factors operating in the wider pluralist society, and the control exercised by its dominant groups over access to social rewards and economic resources.

To legitimize and actualize the anti-racist component of education, the local community must be involved in decision-making and be used as a laboratory for the provision of relevant learning experiences. This could be achieved in several ways.

Pillay (1991a: 7) recommends that a specially constituted human relations committee at each school could play a proactive role
and help address problems related to integration. This committee, which would consist of pupils, staff and parents of all races that the school represents, could address important areas of the school’s functioning through orientation of new admissions, assimilation of transfer pupils by means of planned induction programmes, and specially designed social events which would help to build sound race relations (Pillay 1991a: 7). Opportunities could also be created within the curriculum for resource persons from different race groups to visit a school, interact meaningfully, and be involved in both curricular and extra-curricular activities (Morrel 1991: 67; Pillay 1991a: 7; Cordova & Love 1987: 397).

In addition, appropriate assessment procedures must be devised using non-discriminatory techniques for assessing the learning potential of individual pupils. This necessitates multiple measures that take into account their previous experiences. These measures should be based on, and correlated with, information about an individual pupil’s family and community environment (Cordova & Love 1987: 397; Squelch 1991: 63).

Student services could also play a large part of any anti-racist school programme and constitute as much an investment as does the actual instructional programme. Such services developed on the basis of an anti-racist philosophy will do much to promote the learner’s self-concept and individual worth. Guidance and counselling services must expand, rather than limit, opportunities available to all pupils in order to provide positive evidence that the pupils’ backgrounds and the pupils as individuals are respected (Cordova & Love 1987: 397 - 398).

Finally, for anti-racist education to become the foundation for a new South African education system requires that it promotes the economic prospects of pupils as well as their cultural and social awareness. If the new education system cannot demonstrably improve their life chances, no matter how much the content of the
new education system improves, it will not gain their respect and co-operation.

The task of reconstructing a racially-divided education system will take place within the context of the dynamics of realignment currently in progress, and questions about language will often take centre stage. The pervasiveness of the language issue is clearly illustrated by the ways in which language impacts on pupil performance, work opportunities and social mobility. It is with this realization in mind that the investigator reviews the key issues confronting the Indian community in the language policy debate.

4.7 LANGUAGE NEEDS

In chapter three, a plethora of language policy and language education policy options are presented. Broadly, the South African language debate focuses on the status of English, Afrikaans and the nine indigenous African languages, namely, Ndebele, Pedi, Sotho, Swati, Tsonga, Tswana, Venda, Xhosa and Zulu. Various policy positions are taken on these languages by different interest groups in education. In terms of medium of instruction, ACUMSA proposes the acquaintance of all learners progressively with at least three languages (Afrikaans, English and a regional African language), though the issue of medium of instruction is not directly addressed (cf paragraph 3.4.6.2). NEPI, on the hand, discusses mother-tongue instruction and different levels of bilingualism throughout schooling (cf paragraph 3.4.6.2).

This section examines the language needs of the Indian community in the context of the language education debate in South Africa.

4.7.1 The need for English as a medium of instruction

For the Indian community, the choice of language or medium of instruction seems to be a "clear-cut" issue. Generally, the
literature reveals a strong preference for English as a medium of instruction (Bagwandeen 1992b : 23; Desai 1991 : 121; Mahipath 1992 : 26; HOD 1992 : 7). This preference is in line with the straight choice option proposed by NEPI (cf paragraph 3.4.6.2).

This finding is also consistent with comments elicited from interviews:

*English is a natural choice for Indian children - all South African Indians are brought up speaking English* (Farook Khan 1993 : interview).

*It can be taken for granted that the community (Indian) would want English as a sole medium of instruction* (Ebrahim Ansur 1993 : interview).

From responses like the above, it can be inferred that options foregrounding English as the sole or main medium of instruction are popular, at least, in sections of the Indian community.

On a wider level, the case for the promotion of English as lingua franca in South Africa is rational for a variety of reasons. For purely economic reasons, knowledge of English is integral to the expansion and increased sophistication of the South African economy regardless of the particular forms through which economic development will occur. For Mahipath (1992 : 26), many African languages lag behind in respect of art, science, literature and technology. The call for English to be promoted as a lingua franca is realistic because of its international significance and because it is bound to remain the key to power in South Africa for decades to come. In sum, English in South Africa is associated with accessibility to jobs, "modern life" and a higher standard of living.

Given the present dominant role of English in South African education, English may well be a majority choice in a new
education dispensation. If this assumption proves accurate, it is the contention of this dissertation that it is imperative that the task of improving access to English for the whole school population is addressed seriously.

It is found that one of the major problems besetting HOD schools in the transition is that of communication (HOD 1992: 19). Pupils who have not been instructed in English before their entry into English-medium schools find themselves at a distinct disadvantage. Not only is the teaching process affected, but the entire school curriculum becomes a problem of incomprehension (HOD 1992: 19).

The personal difficulties confronting teachers are reflected in the following responses:

*Teaching pupils who are not literate in English is frustrating .... we are not equipped to teach in this new situation* (Teacher 1993: group discussion).

*It is about time that the education department gives assistance to teachers in coping with second language English-speakers* (Teacher 1993: group discussion).

These comments are relevant in that they point to the realities confronting educators in a multilingual classroom. They also emphasize the need for devising ways to improve English usage, thus facilitating access for greater numbers of African pupils to quality schools in South Africa. At the very least, improving access to English in schooling terms means the creation of an enabling school environment for the acquisition of English. The influences needed to achieve this would include a teacher workforce whose own use of English is confident and competent. It also means that workable English language curricula, an emphasis on language across the curriculum, relevant and accessible textbooks and sound teaching methodologies need to be developed.
Language specialists in South Africa have given consideration to the possibilities for improving English competencies. King and Van den Berg (1992: 40) suggest the establishment of state-funded language institutes outside of the school which could offer language services ranging from maintenance of mother-tongue to new language acquisition for students. The main advantage would be that teacher resources could be shared at one centre by many schools thus allowing for a greater range of access to language tuition.

In order to foster positive attitudes towards multilingualism in general, Dr Yusuf Karodia (1993: interview) proposed that an African language (including Afrikaans), depending on the region, should be made compulsory at school level. This will have the effect of ensuring that pupils are well-grounded in the dominant language of the region.

Ideally, PRESET and INSET training for teachers of all subjects should also include a language element, so that language across the curriculum can begin to have an impact on the general level of education. Co-operation between tertiary teacher training institutions and schools is integral to the development of new teaching strategies for language acquisition (King and Van den Berg 1992: 41 - 42).

In the light of the above suggestions, it would appear that one priority for the transformation of education is a concerted drive on a national and regional level to address the improvement of English as a medium of instruction in a systematic way. This would include focusing on curriculum development, teacher training and support and materials development.

In many instances, a concern among Indian parents is that their children are unable to speak Indian vernacular languages thus leading to a loss of contact with traditional Indian culture.
4.7.2 The need to promote Indian vernacular languages

There is a view in some quarters of the Indian community that as South Africa moves towards a more open society, the prospect of erosion of Indian culture and languages will be further accelerated. Increasingly, Indian parents are becoming more assertive in insisting that Indian vernacular languages be promoted as choice subjects (as opposed to medium of instruction) in schools attended by their children. In a letter to the editor (Sunday Tribune Herald, 9 June 1991 : 4), one parent wrote:

It is fine to study Latin and fashionable to study French and German. Our children are now bilingual in the official languages, but in the process have forgotten their own tongue. How would the revival and reacquaintance with Indian languages be an impediment in the new South Africa?

Other parents (1993 : group discussion) remarked:

.... as South Africa is undergoing change, the crisis of identity is accentuated. The surest way of dealing with the identity crisis is by going back to our language, culture and religion.

The results of learning Indian languages can only be positive. It will give our community a sense of unity and a true appreciation of Indian music, culture and religion.

According to Farook Khan (1993 : interview), group identity cannot simply be wished away:

We cannot deny our heritage and the fact that we are Indians. We must come to realize that promoting our languages and culture has absolutely nothing to do with apartheid. It will merely enrich our diverse South African culture.
Essentially, these comments emphasize the need for the preservation and development of Indian vernacular languages as choice subjects in schools servicing Indian children. However, they fall short of seeking ways and opportunities to assist, support and enable the Indian community to activate and promote its languages in harmony with its needs, desires and aspirations.

Presently, a basic infrastructure for the promotion and advancement of Indian languages (Tamil, Telegu, Hindi, Gujerati, Urdu) as well as Arabic has been established by the HOD. Indian languages and Arabic are offered as optional, non-examination subjects in the school curriculum for primary schools pupils. At secondary level, pupils are offered these languages as examination subjects up to the matriculation level. The number of pupils taking Indian languages and Arabic increased from 36 112 in 1991 to 41 935 in 1992 and by the end of 1993, it is estimated that about 100 000 pupils will be studying these languages (HOD 1992 : 21). Six language experts from the different linguistic groups have been employed to help ensure the promotion of Indian languages and Arabic. These language promoters visit schools to establish new class units and to offer support services in respect of the various languages (HOD 1992 : 21). A major concern in the Indian community is whether these developments at school level will be further encouraged or impeded under a new administration.

At a community level, eleven Regional Cultural Councils throughout South Africa have been established to co-ordinate all cultural efforts for Indians on a regional basis. Community-based organizations which are constitutionally well-founded and are known to be genuine and positive in the promotion of Indian culture and languages are given financial grants by the HOD to undertake various projects (HOD 1992 : 22). Again, the key issue for the Indian community is the extent to which its language and cultural needs will be accommodated in a new constitutional dispensation.
Ideally, the right to linguistic choice should be enshrined in a Bill of Rights which should establish principles and mechanisms to ensure that there is an enforceable minimum floor of entitlements for all.

As a start, it is imperative that a nation’s language policy and, particularly, that of the school is clearly defined. The national language, the medium of instruction and the place of other languages in the curriculum must be decided as a matter of priority. It is anticipated that, in the South African context, English would constitute the national language for the role it is likely to play in nation-building as well as in international and commercial communication. Children in a future South Africa would, therefore, naturally want to complete their schooling through the medium of English. However, the curriculum will also have to make provision for local options in respect of second and third languages since there are a variety of indigenous and foreign languages used as a means of communication by sectors of South African society.

Finally, it may well be that while the transformation unfolds, an interim language policy, particularly in educational institutions, is adopted. This should take account of the realities of linguistic practices within the country, and operate within the context of many competing and contradictory views about what constitutes an appropriate language and language education policy.

Following from this, a summary of the chapter is provided.

4.8 SUMMARY

This chapter has attempted to come to terms with the educational needs of the Indian community by examining the way some of its members respond to the education crises, change, and to the future.
The investigation was, to an extent, restricted by the paucity of literature pertaining to the educational needs of Indians, particularly in view of 2 February 1990 political developments. A multiplicity of reasons was advanced for this. To countenance this limitation, the investigator was compelled to supplement the literature study with a series of interviews and group discussions with members of the Indian community who were assumed to have an interest in, or possess special knowledge of, the educational needs of this group. It is contended that even if the significance of these findings is open to dispute because of the restricted nature of the sample, it nonetheless represents, at least, one possible set of indicators which policy-makers will have to confront.

Following from this, the educational needs of the Indian community in the area of transformation are discussed. Particular concerns expressed related to the need to: establish a non-racial, unitary education system; to legitimize the education system; and to create an efficient bureaucracy.

Under governance, the emphasis fell on the need to establish meaningful decision-making structures and an appropriate system of school governance.

In the area of finance, the need for free and compulsory education appeared to be a popular demand for most informants. This, in effect, has implications for the framing of appropriate financing policies for schooling.

The main concerns expressed under curriculum related to the need to democratize curriculum structures and work towards the ideal of relevant education.

The category of school integration focused on the need to frame flexible admission policies and combat racial prejudice.

The highest degree of consensus among those interviewed appeared
to exist in the category of language education policy. Broad support was received for English as a medium of instruction and the promotion of Indian vernacular languages.

In chapter five, conclusions, recommendations and themes for further research arising from the investigation are presented.
CHAPTER FIVE

CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND THEMES
FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The preceding chapter explored in some detail the educational needs of the Indian community in the context of the major policy outlines presented for post-apartheid educational development. In this chapter, conclusions are drawn and recommendations made emanating from the body of the study. Furthermore, themes for further research are suggested. Finally, concluding remarks are presented with respect to the research problem.

5.2 CONCLUSIONS

In paragraph 1.1.4, it was stated that much concern is being expressed by minorities in South Africa of the post-apartheid education dynamics and its implications for addressing the heterogeneous needs of our multicultural society. In this context, a specific educational concern confronting the Indian community is the extent to which policy alternatives presented for post-apartheid development addresses community needs.

There is no doubt that education, as evident in chapter one, is one of the major areas of concern in our attempt to transform society and create an environment of stability within it. The South African media refer daily to problems besetting education in general and it is in the search of viable education alternatives that ideas have to be forged to accommodate the diverse needs of the country's heterogeneous population. Transformation brings with it the demand for changes in our educational emphases and, as a consequence, cultural groups face the challenge of functioning in a radically altered socio-political environment.
The task of identifying the educational needs of the Indian community is complex since Indians do not constitute a homogeneous entity. Therefore one has to be cautious not to reduce the educational needs of this group to a single set of agreed-upon realities (cf paragraph 4.2). Notwithstanding this, the dissertation has contended that it is possible to identify some clear indicators or broad tendencies in the stance of members of the Indian community to particular education issues.

In terms of the six policy areas delineated (cf paragraph 2.3) and the policy options outlined thereof (cf paragraph 3.3), crucial issues emerged which have implications for the Indian community in the post-apartheid era.

From the research, it is evident that a strong preference exists among members of the Indian community for free and compulsory education up to matric level - as is presently the case in HOD schools.

While it is acknowledged that free and compulsory education is a fundamental human right, the provision of such an education for all up to matric (twelve years of schooling) in the immediate-term, at least, from the perspectives of the ERS, NEPI and ANC (cf paragraph 3.4.3), is untenable.

Given the large pupil population and prevailing economic constraints, it is unlikely that the post-apartheid state will be able to fund twelve years of schooling at the present levels of expenditure on white or Indian education. In addition, the ANC (presently the ruling party) has already committed itself to the provision of free and compulsory education up to the junior secondary level, that is, ten years of education (cf paragraph 3.4.3.3).

Moreover, judging from the apparent interventionist stance of the new Government of National Unity, there is a strong likelihood that shifts in education investment spending will take place from
high-maintenance suburban schools (white, Coloured and Indian) towards upgrading township and rural school facilities. If such a redistributive option is in fact implemented, it will imply that a greater share of the cost of financing schooling will be transferred, in this context, to Indian parents, particularly if they wish to maintain existing standards in schools attended by their children. Clearly, there is a need for further research in the policy area of financing schools in a new education dispensation.

It is also evident from the research that members of the Indian community tend to perceive the education bureaucracy and bureaucrats in a negative manner (cf paragraph 4.2.3). This is understandable due to past practices of the education bureaucracy and broader civil service. Apart from this, the duplication of functions and staff and the resultant high cost of maintaining the bureaucracy has also contributed to a negative perception of it.

In the context of the democratization process, particular challenges confront the education bureaucracy. To this effect, a number of recommendations were made to ensure that the bureaucracy is restructured to promote efficiency, eliminate wastage and exercise responsibility in controlling public funds (cf paragraph 4.2.3).

In sum, a need exists for the education bureaucracy to adopt a democratic-professional approach (combine benefits of legitimate service with those of an efficient one) to public issues. Strategically, it is important to identify the sectors of the education bureaucracy which should be challenged and those more progressive sectors which could be used to facilitate positive educational change.

A policy area which impacts directly on all aspects of education is that of governance. In this context, the existing governance system was criticized for its failure to accommodate key
stakeholders in the governance process. The investigation also revealed that although advisory statutory bodies in the HOD exist, they have limited legitimacy and powers and represent a narrow group of interests (cf paragraph 4.2.1). However, all major policy options discussed (cf paragraph 3.4.2) indicated a move towards devolving decision-making powers to local or institutional governance bodies to secure their full participation in the governance of the education system.

Proposed new reforms aimed at greater stakeholder participation in education have far-reaching implications for the Indian minority. For the first time, Indian parents as part of non-racial parent communities will become involved meaningfully in the day-to-day running of schools, instead of merely raising funds for school activities in times of need. In addition, Indian parents will have to come to terms with the shift from managing schools as a crisis intervention strategy to managing schools as an everyday normality. A democratic system of education governance will enable minorities to address legitimate minority concerns such as religious, cultural and language rights as well as rights of participation in decision-making (cf paragraph 2.3.2.4).

However, increased decision-making authority will require that local school bodies acquire new skills in areas such as legal issues, management, parental involvement and strategic planning. In short, the whole idea of governance needs to be reconceptualized in order to begin to address the issue of democratizing the education system.

Closely related to the issue of governance is that of curriculum. From the research, it has emerged that curriculum policy in South Africa favours Western values and that ethnocentrism of these values is implicit in curriculum material, teacher attitudes and the material culture of the classroom. In addition, the need to promote stakeholder participation in curriculum decision-making, and not merely reduce stakeholders to mere functionaries whose
task is to carry out instructions specified by education authorities, is also emphasized.

Clearly, some form of participation in curriculum matters needs to be formalized through processes that are linked to the overall structures of the governance framework. Much will depend on the degree of regional and local autonomy allowed for in a new dispensation, not only in relation to administrative decision-making, but also in terms of control of resources and content.

A new curriculum policy that is culturally democratic, views cultural diversity as a valuable resource, includes a diversity of cultural elements in the learning programme and acquaints teachers with the different cultures of their students, will be best able to serve the interests of a multicultural society like South Africa. This necessitates close interaction between the various partners in education in order to achieve the provision of relevant learning experiences. Only then will all pupils, whatever their ethnic or cultural backgrounds, learn to respect and appreciate themselves and others.

Although a wide array of literature, as evidenced in chapter three, was utilized to undertake an analysis of policy options, other than the ERS and NEPI proposals, most do no more than provide broad, general characterizations of the shape of the desired post-apartheid education system. From the analysis, it would appear that most organizations proceed on the basis of ad hoc generalizations, subject to the vagaries of guesswork and speculation. Generally, it is agreed on all sides that large-scale resources will have to be invested in education and this should be accompanied by a process of equalization of provision and opportunity for the African people. But little has been said or written about the needs of other disadvantaged cultural groups within the black community. For example, no attempt has been made to address the needs of the Indian minority in a new education dispensation. It is clear that, in its present form, education policies are too generally stated to be subjected to in-depth
analysis. In this connection, there is considerable validity to address the concerns of particular groups, culturally defined or otherwise, in order to feed concerns into the national policy-making process.

At this juncture, it is important to recognize that the problems of policy development in South African education are a result of genuine difficulties which stand in the way of society and cannot be simply wished away. These occur at two levels. The first is political and the second is more educational, research-related. Previously banned organizations in the liberation movement after 2 February 1990 were drawn into the difficult situation of having to produce comprehensive policy discourse within a short period of time which can only possibly be the task of a government in power with all the necessary resources at its disposal. Incapability to produce or match the state has tended to be interpreted not in terms of contextual difficulties, but as an inability on the part of progressive organizations to produce the goods. By contrast, the National Party government was able to mobilize and harness the entire administrative staff and research apparatus of the state to provide the infrastructural support and backing required for devising education strategies (Chisholm 1992 : 3).

At the educational and research-related level, there are also objective difficulties in the way of formulating, through research, feasible policies and options for transformation. At the time of writing, political organizations and state education departments were still rooted in defensive postures and generally reluctant to make access to information easily available.

Finally, there are real dangers in the interregnum between the old and the new. Most of the education system could deteriorate, while sectional interests go on dominating the scene, preventing a common purpose from emerging as to the shape of the transformed education system. If minority groups such as the Indian community do not actively seek to find a common purpose, but stand outside in isolation from fear, prejudice or sheer apathy, it runs the
risk of becoming increasingly irrelevant to the process of change in South Africa.

In the following section, recommendations are made.

5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

In the context of the investigation, the following recommendations are offered:

5.3.1 Equitable funding

One of the characteristics of education in South Africa is that funding has been based on racial criteria. This has resulted in inequalities in the provision of education for the different race groups (cf paragraph 2.2.2).

The challenge of achieving equity in education expenditure is contingent upon the establishment of a legitimate education authority and reconstructing the system within approximately the present levels of expenditure. For these reasons, recommendations should focus primarily on the interim period.

It is recommended that a task team comprising a broad range of stakeholders be mandated to:

* devise a funding formula to reduce disparities in education funding and address the needs of the disadvantaged, irrespective of race;

* review all education expenditure and advise on areas in which greater efficiency and decreased spending could be achieved, without loss of quality and increased capacity; and

* investigate the rationalization and utilization of all educational facilities so as to ensure their full utilization.
5.3.2 Cost-effective and efficient bureaucracy

Education in South Africa is complex and highly bureaucratic. While some level of bureaucracy is both necessary and inevitable, it still needs to be cost-effective and efficient (cf paragraph 4.2.3).

To establish an effective and efficient bureaucracy, it is recommended that:

* the membership of all bodies acting within the state education departments or advisory to it become much more inclusive of all sectors of society;

* channels be created to strengthen public input into decision-making and the implementation of state policy;

* a code of conduct which prescribes behaviour suitable to the implementation of new policies specifically to combat nepotism, corruption and promote impartiality be drafted for education personnel within state education departments, and

* permanency of tenure by education personnel be set aside in cases where individuals are unable or unwilling to work under changed conditions.

5.3.3 Community involvement

The education system has been criticized for its failure to accommodate key stakeholders, particularly parents, in the decision-making process. From the research, it has also emerged that Indian parents were not fully aware of their role and responsibilities in the governance of education (cf paragraph 4.2.1).

It is therefore recommended that community-based participation in the governance of education at all levels be facilitated by
the establishment of appropriate structures and processes. The purpose for this is not expediency or fashion. It derives from the need to provide education consonant with the aspirations of communities in transition. Community participation, in addition, ensures that education would proceed against the suspicion of being irrelevant.

5.3.4 Transforming the curriculum

Curriculum development in South Africa, in terms of previous legislation, is non-inclusive, secretive, authoritarian and designed to serve narrow political interests (cf paragraph 2.3.4.1).

It is therefore recommended that:

* the curriculum be adapted towards accommodating the aspirations of diverse cultural groups in a multicultural schooling environment;

* a series of principles (eg. non-racism, non-sexism, democracy, national reconciliation, etc.) based on a recognition of cultural, linguistic and religious differences be put in place against which curriculum processes can be measured;

* channels be created at institutional level to enable local communities and education authorities to consult with each other and establish formulae to accommodate culturally diverse pupils in particular school zonal areas;

* cost-effective workshops and INSET courses should be planned on an ongoing basis to assist practising teachers in coping with the complexities of functioning in a multicultural schooling environment; and
culturally biased assessment techniques for the different phases of schooling be revised.

In this respect, teachers and curriculum specialists should take the initiative in producing appropriate curriculum material consistent with the demands of a society in transition.

5.3.5 Promoting English

From the research, it is evident that a range of language-related problems are being experienced as increasing numbers of pupils from the African schooling system gain admission to HOD schools. Problems such as unfamiliarity with instructions and poor academic results stem largely from the inability of these pupils to effectively utilize the English language medium (cf paragraph 1.1.5).

It is thus recommended that some kind of language research structure be created to:

* determine suitable language education policies in consultation with local communities in specific geographic areas;

* promote the usage of, and access to, English by devising suitable English second language programmes to assist schools;

* establish language support services for teachers at various teacher centres to better equip them to handle the difficulties of working with pupils from different linguistic backgrounds; and

* devise means for the sharing of language resources by many schools in a given locality.
5.3.6 Developing policy capacity

Historically, South Africa does not have a well-endowed research tradition sustained over a long period of time. Added to this, apathy and organizational weaknesses appear to be the chief issues that militate against policy development (cf. paragraph 3.1). However, there is a new interest in the field of policy development at the present time (cf paragraph 1.1).

Notwithstanding this, it is recommended that, as a pre-requisite, emphasis be placed on specifying and operationalizing democratic participation in the construction of policy. In addition, educational policy should be formulated alongside industrial, land, labour, health and housing policies, taking cognizance of the heterogeneous configuration of cultural elements in South Africa. Finally, priority should be given to upgrading administrative, research and management skills of personnel working in education interest organizations and state education departments.

5.4 THEMES FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

This dissertation explored the educational needs of the Indian community at a time when educational provision was solely provided for them by a particular department. These needs were viewed in terms of six broad policy areas - transformation, governance, finance, integration, curriculum and language. Therefore it was not possible to deal with any one policy area or issue at length. As the education system is transformed from a racially-divided to a unitary one, extensive research still needs to be undertaken in each of the aforementioned areas. For this reason, the following themes for further research are suggested.

Themes for research:

* The relationship between politics, policy and the education bureaucracy.
* Democratizing the education bureaucracy: strategies for change.

* Transforming the education bureaucracy: cost implications of structural change.

* State control versus deregulation: an analysis of education governance options.

* The problems and challenges of equalizing educational provision.

* The role of teacher support services in curriculum development.

* The development of academic support programmes for the teaching of English as a second language.

* The development of strategies to reorient existing education departments and their budgets to serve the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) of the Government of National Unity.

* A study of racism in schools with a view to providing anti-racist programmes.

* A study of feasible admission policy options in a new education dispensation.

* Strategies for upgrading the policy capacity of organizations involved in education.

* The relational styles of learners from culturally diverse backgrounds.

* The development of instructional techniques for a multicultural schooling environment.
The development of assessment instruments for culturally different learners.

5.5 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The principal limitation of the study is located within the proliferation of material that has become the focus of education and educational policy and which emerged at the conclusion of the research. Here what comes to mind particularly is the ANC's policy document entitled, "A Policy Framework for Education and Training". While it is acknowledged that this document and other recent developments will have a significant impact on education in the foreseeable future, they do not constitute the main focus in the pursuit of the objectives of the research project and, accordingly, for reasons already stated (cf paragraph 1.1), have been excluded from the study.

Another limitation is that the study is by no means representative of the Indian community. In this sense, it may have a low reliability but, hopefully, a high degree of validity is achieved by the research method used.

Finally, a paucity of literature exists in relation to the educational concerns of the Indian community in the present period.

5.6 SUMMARY

This chapter was concerned with drawing conclusions and making recommendations derived from the investigation. Various conclusions were drawn relating to the nature of policy development and the educational needs of the Indian community in South Africa. Recommendations were made appropriate to the development of educational policy in a post-apartheid South Africa. Finally, themes for further research were outlined and attention was drawn to the limitations of this dissertation.
CONCLUDING REMARKS

In the final analysis, it is the investigator’s view that the needs, concerns and aspirations of the Indian minority will become increasingly apparent as the country shifts towards majoritarianism. The investigator further holds that the recognition of, and respect for, the multicultural realities of our society, through policy, is vital to the effective development of a vast, untapped reservoir of human potential in South Africa. Educational upliftment and advancement of all South Africans, irrespective of race, colour or creed, must continue in the interests of the search for a more acceptable society.

ANC. 1992a. ANC policy guidelines for a democratic South Africa: draft discussion paper, 27 April.


CARRIM, Y. 1993. Of course Indians are anxious about the future. Sunday tribune herald, 19 September : 5.


CHOTIA, F. 1993 Roll over Gandhi: NP is chief among the Indians. The weekly mail, 26 March to 1 April : 19.


FREEDOM CHARTER. 1955.


JOSHI, R. 1993. Interview. Mathematics lecturer, University of Zululand (Umlazi campus), Durban.

KALIDAS, B. 1993. Interview. Teacher, Clayton Primary, Durban.


KARODIA, Y. 1993. Interview. Senior lecturer in Educational Management, University of Durban-Westville, Durban.


MAURICE, P. 1993. Model C schools muddle through. The weekly mail education review, April, 2(3) : 4-5.


SUNDAY TIMES EXTRA. 1993. ANC master-plan to woo Indian voters. 6 June: 4.


THE NATAL MERCURY. 1993. Teachers' union adds its approval. 28 January : 3.


The interview consists of six probe questions. New questions will emerge spontaneously from the interview depending on the informant's responses.

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

TRANSFORMATION

What are some of the present challenges facing the Indian community in the field of education?

EDUCATION GOVERNANCE

Are local communities given sufficient say in the decision-making processes of education?

FINANCE

Should parent communities pay school fees?

INTEGRATION

What problems, if any, do you foresee arising from the desegregation of schools?

CURRICULUM

What should the objectives of education be?

LANGUAGE

What changes, if any, should be made to the present language education policy of the state?
CONSENT

I hereby grant permission to the researcher to:

i. quote certain parts of my interview;

ii. interpret such parts in the light of the research project; and

iii. acknowledge information supplied by myself during the course of the interview.

Date of interview: ________________________________

Signed on __________________ at __________________

Interviewee: ________________________________

Researcher: ________________________________
If an interviewee wished to remain anonymous, the following consent form was used.

CONSENT

I hereby grant permission to the researcher to quote certain parts of my interview and interpret such parts in the light of the research project. In reply, the researcher has undertaken to maintain the confidentiality of my identity at all times.

Date of interview: ________________________________

Signed on ______________________ at ______________________

Interviewee: ________________________________

Researcher: ________________________________