THE EDUCATIONAL IMPACT OF TEACHERS' ORGANISATIONS (1925 - 1992) ON THE INDIAN COMMUNITY IN SOUTH AFRICA

by

GABRIEL SOMASUNDRAM MUNSAMY

submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF EDUCATION in the subject

HISTORY OF EDUCATION

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

PROMOTER: PROFESSOR I A COETZER

JUNE 1999

*************
"I declare that THE EDUCATIONAL IMPACT OF TEACHERS' ORGANISATIONS (1925 - 1992) ON THE INDIAN COMMUNITY IN SOUTH AFRICA is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references".

GABRIEL SOMASUNDRAM MUNSAMY
for His Holy Spirit,
for His inspiration and strength...
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My appreciation is extended to the following people for assisting me to complete the thesis:

Professor I.A. Coetzer for his motivating guidance and for "steering" my work in the right direction.

The late Professor S.A. Naicker for pointing out the weaknesses of functionalism and the interesting and penetrating approaches of Marxism and Neo-Marxism.

The Personnel at the Documentation Centre, University of Durban-Westville for providing the valuable primary source material.

Mrs V. Rajman for checking the use of language in the thesis.
SUMMARY

The investigation contributes to a broader understanding of the hegemonic role of teacher organisations and their relation to the dominant structures in society. It also contributes to educational theory since it extends the traditional assertion of an individual teacher who acts as an agent of capitalism and who serves to foster the interests of the State, to teachers who operate through an organisation which becomes more powerful in articulating this hegemony.

The historic evidence shows that for much of the period under investigation these teacher organisations have either endorsed, or else have failed to challenge in significant ways, the use of education by the State to ramify the ideology and practice of apartheid. In addition these organisations have had no power to compel action from political and educational authorities. Decades of compliance with State policy, or unwillingness to forcefully articulate the obvious injustices of that policy, have inevitably led to a position whereby established teacher bodies became inward looking. Ultimately, these teacher bodies could not offer a fundamental critique of the apartheid education system and therefore could not empower their members to transform society as they worked within a structural-functional and liberal framework.

However, the research also shows that teachers as a collective group became capable of resisting dominant ideologies, especially during the post-1984 period. Progressive teacher organisations, fuelled by the labour movement and African nationalism convicted many conservative teacher bodies to eschew ethnicity and agitate for a unified, democratic non-racial, non-sexist State with a single Ministry of Education. This period saw an escalation in the struggles of resistance by teacher organisations against a newly established Tri-cameral parliamentary system. These empowered members effectively resisted the increasing bureaucratisation and political interference in education through which the State sought to control teachers. The study offers a new way of perceiving teacher organisations as they become involved in long term struggles of transformation which incorporates the reconstruction of a post-apartheid society.

Key terms:

Teacher organisations; resistance; hegemony; functionalism; liberalism; capitalism; Marxism; Neo-Marxism; reproduction; accommodation.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER ONE

Introduction ........................................ 1

1.1. Significance of the Investigation .............. 1

1.2. The Aims of the Study .......................... 2

1.3. Selection and formulation of the Problem ...... 3

1.4. Formulation of the Hypothesis .................. 6

1.5. Source Review .................................. 7

1.6. Delimitation of Research ...................... 8

## CHAPTER TWO

*Historical Research Methods in Education* ........ 10

2.1. Research Paradigms ............................ 10

2.1.1. Marxism ..................................... 11

2.1.2. Neo-Marxism ................................ 17

2.2. Methodology .................................... 21

## CHAPTER THREE

*Theoretical Perspectives: Teacher Organisations* .. 25

3.1. Introduction .................................... 25

3.2. The Class Location of Teachers ................ 27
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>The Dilemma of Professionalism and Unionism</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Reproduction Theory</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Resistance Theory</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Resume</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER FOUR

Theoretical Perspectives: The Indian Community

4.1. Introduction                                      | 50   |
4.2. The Indian as a Labour Commodity                 | 50   |
4.3. The Indenture System                              | 52   |
4.4. Resistance to Capital                             | 56   |
4.5. National Liberation versus Class Struggle        | 63   |
4.6. The Effect of Culture on Class Consciousness      | 67   |
4.6.1. Introduction                                    | 67   |
4.6.2. The Myth of Community                           | 69   |
4.7. Resume                                            | 77   |

CHAPTER FIVE

1925 - 1958: A Period of Contradiction: Early Signs of Reproduction and Resistance

5.1. Introduction                                      | 80   |
5.2. The Emergence of Teacher Organisations            | 80   |
5.2.1. The Failure to Unionise                         | 80   |
5.2.2. The Rise of the Natal Indian Teachers Society (NITS) | 82   |
5.3. The Contribution of NITS to Middle Class          |      |
5.4. The Hegemony of Capitalism

5.4.1. A Segregated Education System

5.4.2. A Working Class Ethos

5.5. The Contradiction of Socialism: The Influence of the Labour Movement on Teacher Organisations

5.5.1. The Emergence of the Labour Movement

5.5.2. The Radicalisation of Teacher Organisations

5.5.3. The Influence of the Labour Movement on the Natal Indian Teachers’ Society

5.5.4. The Struggle over Salaries

5.5.5. The Issue of Gender

5.5.6. The Suppression and Decline of the Labour Movement

5.5.7. The Impact of Capitalism on Teacher Unity

5.6. Resume

CHAPTER SIX

1961 - 1982: The Period of Hegemony

6.1. Introduction

6.2. The Relationship Between Apartheid and Capitalism and its Effect on Teacher Organisations

6.3. The Consolidation of Hegemony

6.3.1. The Creation of Ethnic Structures
6.3.2. The Hegemony of Education .................................. 170
6.3.3. The Group Areas Act ........................................... 187
6.3.4. The Family as a Hegemonic Unit ............................. 189
6.4. The Effects of Hegemony .......................................... 192
6.4.1. People as Labour Commodity .................................. 192
6.4.2. The Effect of Hegemony on the Youth ...................... 201
6.4.3. Counter Hegemonic Strategies of Resistance: The School Boycotts ........................................ 216
6.5. The Hegemony of the Curriculum ................................ 223
6.5.1. Introduction ..................................................... 223
6.5.2. Cultural Reproduction .......................................... 224
6.5.3. The Fragmentation of the Curriculum ...................... 230
6.5.4. Struggling for Relevance in the Curriculum ............ 236
6.5.5. Methods of Curriculum Delivery ............................ 242
6.6. The Ideology of Professionalism ................................. 248
6.7. Resume .............................................................. 263

CHAPTER SEVEN


7.1. Introduction .......................................................... 270
7.2. Struggles of Resistance .............................................. 271
7.2.1. The Radicalisation of Teacher Organisations: Resistance to Apartheid ........................................ 271
7.2.2. Resistance against the Bureaucratisation of Education ........................................ 284
7.3. Struggles for Transformation .................. 303
  7.3.1. Conditions promoting Transformation ........ 303
  7.3.2. The Alternative Discourse of People’s Education .. 306
  7.3.3. The Transformation of Teacher Organisations .. 312
  7.3.4. Transforming the Status of Women Teachers .... 320
  7.4. Resume ....................................... 323

CHAPTER EIGHT

Conclusion .......................................... 328
  8.1. Theoretical Issues ................................ 328
  8.2. The Reproduction Thesis ............................. 330
  8.3. The Resistance-Transformation Antithesis ............ 340
  8.4. Significance of the Research for Educational Theory ................ 351
  8.5. Related Areas of Research .......................... 356

Bibliography ........................................... 358

1. Primary Sources ..................................... 358
  1.1. Published Primary Sources .......................... 358
  1.1.1. Official Publications ............................ 358
  1.1.1.1. Reports ..................................... 358
  1.1.1.2. Journals ..................................... 358
1.1.1.3. Notices ........................................... 358

1.1.2. Non-Official Publications ....................... 358

1.1.2.1. Educational Brochures ......................... 358
1.1.2.2. Newspapers and Related Publications ......... 359
1.1.2.3. Periodicals and Journals ....................... 360

1.2. Unpublished Primary Sources ....................... 364

1.2.1. Non-Official Sources ............................ 364

1.2.1.1. Reports ........................................ 364
1.2.1.2. Speeches ...................................... 364
1.2.1.3. Correspondence ................................. 364
1.2.1.4. Minutes ........................................ 365
1.2.1.5. Memoranda ...................................... 365
1.2.1.6. Pamphlets ...................................... 365
1.2.1.7. Bulletins ...................................... 366

2. Secondary Sources .................................... 366

2.1. General Literature .................................. 366

Annexures ................................................ 379

Annexure A: TASA Archives: Summary of Contents ...... 379
LIST OF TABLES

TABLE I: TABLE SHOWING THE PROPORTION OF EACH POPULATION GROUP EMPLOYED AS UNSKILLED AND SEMI-SKILLED LABOURERS AS A PERCENTAGE OF THE TOTAL LABOUR FORCE .......... 195

TABLE II: TABLE SHOWING THE PASS RATES OF WHITES AND INDIAN PUPILS IN THE NATAL SENIOR CERTIFICATE EXAMINATIONS FOR THE YEARS 1959 TO 1967 .......... 199
List of Abbreviations

AEM - African Education Movement
ANC - African National Congress
ANCYL - African National Congress Youth League
APROESA - Association of Professional Officers of Education of the Republic of South Africa
CATU - Cape African Teachers' Union
CCPM - Co-ordinating Council for Professional Matters
DEC - Department of Education and Culture
CPSA - Communist Party of South Africa
DIA - Department of Indian Affairs
NAPTOSA - National Professional Teachers’ Organisation of South Africa
NATU - Natal African Teachers’ Union
NED - Natal Education Department
NIA - Natal Indian Association
NIC - Natal Indian Congress
NITS - Natal Indian Teachers’ Society
NP - National Party
NPA - Natal Provincial Administration
NTU - Natal Teachers’ Union
PAC - Pan Africanist Congress
PTA - Parent-Teacher Association
PTL - Progressive Teachers’ League
PTSA - Parent-Teacher-Student-Associations
PTU - Progressive Teachers’ Union
SACTU - South African Congress of Trade Unions
SADTU - South African Democratic Teachers’ Union
SAPTA - South African Federation of Teachers’ Association
SAIC - South African Indian Congress
SAITA - South African Indian Teachers’ Association
SASO - South African Student Organisation
STAC - Soweto Teachers’ Action Committee
TASA - Teachers’ Association of South Africa
TATA - Transvaal African Teachers’ Association
TIC - Transvaal Indian Congress
TITFA - Transvaal Indian Teachers’ Association
TUATA - Transvaal United African Teachers’ Association
WECTU - Western Cape Teachers’ Union
CHAPTER ONE

Introduction

1.1. Significance of the Investigation

According to the traditional functionalist argument, education plays an important part in the development and progress of society (McKay 1995: 29-32). However, for Marxist writers, like Weiler (1995: 24) education also serves as a terrain of struggle. Education for the State and the bourgeoisie is often used as a vehicle to promote their ideology and values. Bowles and Gintis (1988: 18) maintain that education for the capitalist serves to create a subservient labour force made up of the proletariat.

Teacher organisations are inextricably interwoven into the fabric of education of a country and as such they have the potential to wield considerable influence on education. The importance of this investigation lies in the careful scrutiny of the role that teacher organisations play in reproducing and resisting dominant ideologies of the ruling class and the State.

The research will attempt to ensure a better understanding of teacher bodies in their response to the numerous crises
in South African education. Against this background the researcher, inter alia, seeks to determine whether teacher organisations offered significant resistance towards an education system which was rooted in a repressive socio-economic and political system.

Prominent researchers such as Bowles and Gintis (1988: 17-18) have written much about the reproduction and resistance of dominant ideologies in schools, however little is known about the role that teacher organisations play in this process. This critical and analytical study will attempt to address this void.

This study will also expose the role of teacher organisations, not only as agents of ideology or counter-ideology, but also in social transformation and emancipation.

The investigation is also important in that it will promote the extension of knowledge in the field of teacher organisations and it would also point to other related areas of research.

1.2. The Aims of the Study

The main aim of this study is to critically analyse and evaluate the impact of teacher organisations on
education in the Indian community of South Africa during the period 1925 to 1992. It will have to be determined, from historico-educational data and trends whether the various teacher organisations such as The Natal Indian Teachers' Society (NITS), The South African Indian Teachers' Association (SAITA) and The Teachers' Association of South Africa (TASA) reproduced the hegemony of the State and of capitalism or effectively engaged themselves in struggles of resistance.

A critical examination of the influence of teachers' organisations on aspects of education such as the curriculum, educational policy, teacher unity, teacher autonomy and school accommodation will be conducted in order to achieve the above-mentioned aim.

The researcher also aims to critically examine the possible contribution which this study can make to understanding the nature of teacher organisations.

1.3. Selection and Formulation of the Problem

Teacher organisations are important institutions of society. However, the question arises as to whether they can influence education for the upliftment of society. Are teacher organisations capable of initiating and sustaining change for social transformation and emancipation? Or are
they elitist institutions which unconsciously or consciously reproduce the values of the dominant ruling group, thus maintaining and promoting the hegemony of the State?

Carlson (1988: 168) declares that many parents and teachers feel that contemporary teacher organisations simply reproduce the ideology of the State. These teacher bodies have aligned themselves too closely with the State and are therefore not in a position to question the State's policies and objectives for education. In this regard, Reeves (1994: 89-94) and Gallie (1998: 26) cite the South African Democratic Teachers' Union (SADTU) which has uncritically accepted and promoted the State's outcomes-based education (OBE) plan. SADTU has also been accused of conforming to the State's economic policies, particularly, the Growth, Equity and Redistribution Plan (GEAR) without analysing its impact on education or on the social welfare of the people (Mabe 1998: 12; Mbana 1998: 14). Similarly, Moll (1991: 41) asserts that the National Professional Teachers' Organisation of South Africa (NAPTOSA) has been accused of maintaining and promoting elitist values of the bourgeoisie while at the same time ignoring the needs of the proletarian class. For instance NAPTOSA has been frequently criticised for emphasising choir recitals for pupils rather than focusing on the democratic empowerment
of teachers and pupils (see par 6.2.).

In order to evaluate the above problematic issues the researcher has chosen teacher organisations that operated within the Indian community. These organisations have had a long and illuminating history. This has led to a wealth of primary source documents which lend themselves to historical research. The first teachers' organisation for Indian teachers was established in 1925, namely, The Natal Indian Teachers' Society (NITS). Thereafter in 1967 the South African Indian Teachers' Association (SAITA) was formed. In 1979 the title, South African Indian Teachers' Association (SAITA) was changed to the Teachers' Association of South Africa (TASA). In 1992, TASA which catered mainly for Indian teachers finally dissolved so that the non-racial SADTU could be established (A Review of Indian Education and the Organised Profession 1992: 24; 56-57). In order to prevent a parochial investigation, reference will also be made to teacher organisations that operated outside the Indian community, which nevertheless influenced Indian education. The principle of focusing on Indian based teacher bodies is not in dispute. The problem arises when there is a tendency to isolate these teacher organisations in a tight compartment without addressing their relationship to the broader educational edifice. It must be conceded that the intricate and detailed relationship between teacher organisations and the State,
capitalism and the community can only reveal itself if the investigation focuses on a few teacher organisations like the NITS and TASA. However this does not exclude references to other prolific teacher bodies, such as the Cape African Teachers’ Union (CATU) and the Transvaal United African Teachers’ Association (TUATA).

1.4. Formulation of the Hypothesis

The researcher posits the hypothesis that the various teacher organisations such as NITS, SAITA and TASA have made a significant and positive impact on education in the Indian community of South Africa. In order to accept, reject or modify the stated hypothesis, the role of these teacher organisations will be evaluated either in their role as reproducer of values of the dominant groups or as an institution which offered resistance by establishing a counter-culture. The researcher contends that if these teacher organisations simply reproduced the dominant culture, then they may be judged to have had a negative impact on education. However, if the prevailing trend is of a culture of resistance against a repressive socio-economic and political system then it would imply that the teacher organisations had a positive impact on education.
1.5. Source Review

In February 1992 when TASA dissolved, it donated all its records to the Documentation Centre of the University of Durban-Westville for preservation. The Archives of TASA is not only the largest collection, but is also the most important private collection in the history of South African education. The bulk of the material is unpublished and covers almost every aspect of education (see annexure A).

Information from primary sources constituted a significant part of the thesis. The primary source material is mainly made up of reports, minutes of meetings, newspaper articles, brochures, memoranda, speeches, journals, bulletins and correspondence. Material obtained from secondary sources was consulted for chapters one to seven, while the related literature was reviewed for chapters one to three. Much of the secondary material is obtained from the works of the traditional and "standard" works of Marxist and neo-Marxist researchers, such as Gramsci, Bowles and Gintis, Poulantzas and Wright, especially from the 1980's onwards. This period is significant as it witnessed a flourishing of excellent writings in the structural school of thought. Also, lately, there seems to be a dearth of pure Marxist writings on the Indian community in South Africa. Even foremost writers such as
Freund have diluted the issue of class by focusing more on ethnicity as a source of change and resistance. Traditional Indian researchers on "Indian" history in South Africa, such as Bhana pay very little attention to Marxist interpretations, an understatement in their works and of "Indian history" itself. Significant journals such as the South African Labour Bulletin offer little serious discourse, save for the writings of Hyslop, and they are restricted to a kind of popular rhetoric. Nevertheless, these limitations are made up by the excellent Marxist leanings of writers such as Beall and North-Coombes.

1.6. Delimitation of Research

Chapter one introduces the thesis by presenting a discussion of the following: the significance of the investigation; the aims of the study; the selection and formulation of the problem; the delimitation of research and the review of source material.

Chapter two discusses the research paradigms and the research method which was used in this investigation, while chapter three and four offer theoretical perspectives. These chapters analyse the concepts of teacher organisations and the Indian community from Marxist and neo-Marxist perspectives. A rigorous, critical analysis of the impact of teacher organisations on education is given
in chapters five, six and seven which cover the periods 1925 -1958; 1961 - 1982 and 1984 - 1992 respectively.

The study is concluded in chapter eight.
CHAPTER TWO

Historical Research Methods in Education

The development of the education crisis in South Africa between 1976 and 1980 appears to have had the effect of committing many social scientists to a more serious approach to the study of education in South Africa. This is expressed through the attempt to review the traditional schools of thought, and redirect the theory and history of South African education. The outstanding feature of this development is the emergence of a new generation of educationists and historians of education with a viewpoint that is opposed to the liberal and conservative traditions. Chisholm & Randall (1983: 104) argue that this new approach differs from the traditional approach in both its content and in the way it attempts to understand the present through analysis and understanding of the past.

2.1. Research Paradigms

Individual statements and even isolated generalisations are inadequate if we wish to understand and explain social phenomena. In order to reach a higher level of generality, we need to combine statements into more complex kinds of conceptual frameworks (Hodysh 1984: 108). The researcher has employed a conceptual framework which stresses a
sociological base for the description and evaluation of events. The use of sociological concepts is significant as they not only guide the description but also the evaluation of events. Eventually, even conceptual frameworks merge to form very broad theoretical paradigms or research traditions. Thomas Kuhn coined the term "paradigm" to refer to established research traditions in a particular discipline. In this sense a paradigm in the social sciences includes the accepted theories, bodies of research and methodologies in a particular tradition such as Marxism and neo-Marxism (Mouton 1996: 203). In this investigation, the researcher has used an eclectic paradigm combining Marxism with neo-Marxism. This offers a more balanced approach between the structuralist and culturalist traditions.

2.1.1. Marxism

Marxism as a paradigm is relevant for this investigation. Currently, not only is there polarisation of social classes internationally which is caused, inter alia, through a global recession, but in Southern Africa, countries such as Lesotho and Zimbabwe have recently demonstrated the resurgence of class consciousness, arising from unstable social situations. The relevance of Marxism to the study of problematic issues in South Africa is becoming increasingly more applicable as the historic struggles over
racial issues may become predominantly replaced by class based issues. Cross (1992: 35) shows that even those education theorists in South Africa, who paid heed to social class, ultimately conflated race and class. Thus, for example education authorities were seen as uniform and the class divisions within them were given little or no recognition. In countries or social formations where race is not an obfuscatory factor, research highlighting the pertinence of social class in explaining varying educational achievement at school is well established. The general neglect of this literature in the South African context appears to rest on the premise that it is not relevant in South Africa since racial structuring of the educational system was the primary reason for differential educational achievement. The failure to take cognisance of social class and capitalist social relations severely limits our ability to understand differential educational attainment.

Moore (1995: 17) points out that Marxism, which is also referred to as dialectical or historical materialism, begins its analysis of society as a whole and then works down to the individual's perceptions. Marx (Moore 1995: 18) claimed that all societies are controlled by those who own the industrial and commercial enterprises. This dominant group also referred to as the bourgeoisie use their power to create a society to their own advantage.
Eventually, the culture and beliefs of the society as well as the economic system come to reflect their values. The bourgeoisie who are the owners of the means of production, employ workers, the proletariat who having no capital of their own, sell their labour to the bourgeoisie. Marx (Moore 1995: 18) also noted the existence of two other social groups, namely the petit-bourgeoisie and the lumpen proletariat. The petit-bourgeoisie are the owners of small units of capital, such as shops or small businesses, while the lumpen proletariat are a fringe group of socially undesirable working-class criminals and deviants. A crisis is inevitable and actually occurs when the proletariat becomes aware of its common exploited position and develops a class consciousness. In a capitalistic economy a class conflict occurs between the bourgeoisie and the proletariat and takes the form of strikes, high crime rate, school drop-out and political dissent. Thus, if the bourgeoisie exploits the proletariat, then why does the latter continue to accept its exploited position? Marx (Moore 1995: 66) explains this with the concept of false consciousness. The bourgeoisie has control of the media, religion and the education system and it is therefore able to provide the proletariat with a constant flow of information which distorts reality so that the proletariat fails to realise its common exploited position.
Most Marxist writers point out that the State is composed and controlled by the owners of capital. Poulantzas (1973: 13) suggests that a State which obviously reflects the interests of capital will be counter-productive. He claims that the State is relatively autonomous of the ruling class but that it still has the same "infrastructure", that is the dominant values and institutions that were originally created to benefit the ruling class or the bourgeoisie.

Giroux (1983a: 257) asserts that Marx's concept of reproduction has been one of the major organising ideas informing socialist theories of education. Many educators and researchers, like Paulo Freire (1987: 41-52) have given the concept of reproduction a central place in developing a critique of conservative and liberal views on schooling. Moreover, they have used it as the theoretical foundation for developing a critical science of education. Giroux (1983a: 258) is of the view that reproduction theory and its various explanations of the role and function of education have been invaluable in contributing to a broader understanding of the political nature of schooling and its relation to the dominant society. Proponents of Marxist thought in education, like Bowles and Gintis (1988: 17) have argued that the social relations of the school, reproduce the social relations of economic life. They highlight the failure of educational reform to
alter socio-economic and educational inequalities. Bowles and Gintis contend that the causes for this persistent failure of reform lie in the constraints that the capitalist economy imposes on the educational system. Theorists like Christie and Collins (1984: 169) and later supported by McKay (1995: 39) argue that the Marxist model of education, that is, the economic-reproductive model is directly relevant to the South African historic and present situation. These researchers argue, for instance, that the separate Bantu, Coloured and Indian Education systems which were introduced from 1950 onwards could be seen to be geared towards the reproduction of labour as required by capitalism (see par 5.4.1.).

In continuing to relate Marxist theory to the South African scenario, Mouton (1996: 26) and McKay (1995: 34) criticise the alternative theory of functionalism by stating that the latter exposes schools as places where pupils learn valuable societal norms and skills, which are independent of class, race and gender discrimination. Functionalism is also criticised for representing education as being apolitical, that is not affected by politics. The functionalist view of education defines students as products of socialisation. In terms of this view, any form of student conflict or resistance can only be explained as a function of faulty socialisation, the causes of which Giroux (1983b: 24) indicates usually lie in institutions
outside of the school or in the perception of the individual as a deviant. The school appears to exist harmoniously beyond the imperatives and influence of class and power. Giroux (1983b: 25) argues that functionalist educational theorists, like Durkeim and Parsons have failed to recognise the complexity of relations between schools and the larger society. Issues of power, domination and struggle do not feature in their analyses. Carter (1990: 96) adds that traditional education theory is dominated by psychological theories of learning and structural-functionalism, neither of which appears to suggest anything of significance which would contribute to the elimination of inequalities in schools. Blackledge and Hunt (1985: 107) conclude that these kinds of criticisms, have contributed to the rejection of functionalism as the dominant theory in the sociology of education and have allowed other approaches, such as Marxism to become more commanding.

However, Silver (1983: 251) suggests that Marxism is not able to explain all social phenomena. The idea that people do make history has been neglected by the Marxist school of thought. Indeed, human subjects generally "disappear" amidst a theory that leaves no room for moments of self-creation, mediation, and resistance. Marxism portrays "people...as experiencing oppression, as having their expectations demobilised, as being disadvantaged at school,
and being ignored and imposed upon in a variety of ways" (1983b: 252). Giroux (1983a: 259) contends that by ignoring the contradictions and struggles that exist in society, Marxist theory not only dissolves human agency, it unknowingly provide a rationale for not examining the role of teachers and pupils in concrete settings. Moore (1995: 34) declares that unfortunately, the economic-reproductive model has failed to capture the complexity of the relationship between schools and such other institutions as the workplace and the family. Within its grimly mechanistic and overtly determined model of socialisation there appears little room for developing a theory of schooling that takes seriously the notions of culture, resistance, and mediation. Even where contradictions and mediations are mentioned, they generally disappear under the crushing weight of capitalist domination.

2.1.2. Neo-Marxism

Neo-Marxists stress that the dominant traditional approach, which presents education or schooling as an independent field of enquiry, divorced from the wider political, social and economic context within which policies are formulated, is no longer acceptable. Further, the attempt merely to describe the development of educational policy, without at the same time trying to problematise either the process of education or the historical context of which it forms part,
is also criticised (Kallaway 1984: 01; 05).

Neo-Marxists argue that any objective analysis of an education system must be accomplished with the use of the concept of political economy, particularly in periods of rapid social change or crisis (Webster 1977: 193). Kallaway (1984: 01; 05) explains the appeal of neo-Marxism in terms of the necessity to study education in its social, economic and political context. Shapiro's (1981: 99-109) contribution to this school of thought is her attempt to theorise conflict in education. She does so by arguing that there is a contradiction between the function of education and the knowledge that is provided through it. However, Chisholm and Sole (1981: 115) were concerned that this historical and mechanistic account of education paid little heed to class struggle as a fundamental feature of a stratified society. They urged, instead that researchers should make a concrete analysis of the way in which educational institutions in South Africa have mediated complex class and social struggles. They also called for recognition of the possibilities of "ideologies of the exploited" which would point to a transformation of the socio-economic political system (see par 7.3.).

Neo-Marxists argue that the liberal school of thought poses educational problems as questions of manpower planning,
producing technical solutions, rather than the political and economic solutions that are required. They maintain that beneath this apolitical formulation of the problem, lies the assumption that the removal of the more backward features of apartheid would lead to the emergence of a liberal capitalist democracy (see par 5.3.). This approach, they argue, will lead to notions of equality of opportunity but not to equal education. Kallaway (1984: 15) interprets liberalism as a strategy which is designed to change and modify social conditions that have become widely regarded as unjust and unacceptable while at the same time serving to strengthen and perpetuate essential power relations of a capitalistic society. In addition neo-Marxists criticise the liberal school for treating educational development as a neutral and independent process. It is presented as a process of natural and unproblematic growth, rather than as the outcome of a complex historical process in which each new development is contested by the interested parties. Conflicts over the form and the content of educational policies are masked and struggles between the various interested parties are hidden. The liberal tradition of educational research "hides a belief in some simple history of educational progress, a history with no costs and no ambiguities" (Kallaway 1984: 04-05).
While aspects of critical educational theory, such as neo-marxism, can be utilised in the construction of a feminist pedagogy, critical theorists have failed to recognise that women’s studies is, in fact, an example of what they themselves are attempting to develop: transformative practice. Women’s studies are directed at an "intellectual consciousness raising" which can be conceptualised as counter-hegemonic work (Taylor 1995: 14).

Fox (1985: 06) believes that feminist research attempts to put the social construction of gender at the centre of one’s inquiry. Feminist researchers see gender as a basic organising principle which profoundly shapes the concrete conditions of our lives. Feminism is, among other things, a form of attention, a lens that brings into focus particular questions. Lather (1995: 294-295) adds that through the questions that feminism poses and the absences it locates, feminism argues for the centrality of gender in the shaping of consciousness, skills and institutions as well as in the distribution of power and privilege. The overt ideological goal of feminist research in the human sciences is to correct both the invisibility and the distortion of female experience in ways relevant to ending women’s unequal social position. This entails the substantive task of making gender a fundamental category for our understanding of the social order ‘to see the world, from women’s place in it’. According to Weiler
feminist pedagogy is grounded upon visions of social transformation and it asserts the existence of oppression in people's material conditions of existence and as part of consciousness. Weiler (1995: 25) believes that sexism as a system of oppression must be considered as seriously as class oppression.

2.2. Methodology

The investigation into the problem of teacher organisations and their possible role in social transformation takes History as a point of departure. Marx (Elster 1986: 182) points out that History is nothing but the succession of separate generations, each of which uses the materials, the capital funds, the productive forces handed down to it by all preceding generations, and thus continues the traditional activity in completely changed circumstances with a completely changed activity. Kallaway (1983: 162-163) maintains that History of Education only takes on explanatory values when linked to the mainstream of contemporary ideological discourse, even if "the past being dealt with is remote in time". It is not the temporal remoteness that gives history its explanatory relevance, but the way in which concepts and perspectives can be applied to data. The perspectives thus elucidated throw focus of contemporary thinking onto aspects of past human activity and in turn help researchers to obtain fresh
insights into current practices. The researcher therefore arranges his/her material in ways that are meaningful to his/her contemporaries in the intellectual milieu of his time, place and ideological perspective. This elucidates aspects of the past, but more importantly it does ideological work in the present by indicating certain perspectives and discrediting others. Callinicos (1989: 52) suggests that the new, class based interpretation of history differs from liberal, anti-apartheid history in that it aims to reach a wider, popular audience of workers to whom it claims to be accountable. Most of it makes no attempt to be "neutral". It is openly partisan, aiming to empower its readers with knowledge and analytical skills. While it criticises the integrationist approach of liberalism; in its historical materialism and class analysis it calls for non-racialism, emphasising at the same time conflict and collective struggles. Unlike the liberal analysis of apartheid, the radical Marxist perspective rejects "conventional wisdom" that apartheid was dysfunctional and proceeds to draw inextricable links between apartheid policies and the progress of capitalism (see par 6.2.). Further it eschews "mindless empiricism", preferring to take what is "usable" and makes frequent references to contemporary struggles in its interpretation of the past.

In this investigation the researcher has used the
"historical method" which involves the following steps: selection and formulation of the problem (see par 1.3.); formulation of hypothesis (see par 1.4.); collection of data (see par 1.5.); criticism and interpretation of data, and report of findings (Koul 1993: 390).

To determine the authenticity of the primary sources of information, external criticism is applied, while internal criticism is used to evaluate the meaning and trustworthiness of statements within the documents (Venter & Van Heerden 1989: 114-116). The researcher must evaluate the data, a process generally referred to as historical criticism. The central role of the researcher is the interpretation of the data in light of historical criticism. Each fact and supposition is carefully weighed and added to the case leading to the research conclusion. The researcher also evaluates the extent to which causality can be inferred and generalisation is justified. There is no control group so one can never be sure if one event caused another. The best that can be done is to establish a plausible connection between cause and effect (Anderson 1990: 117-118). Sarup (1979: 136) suggests that a philosophy of internal relations is also a useful mode of analysis. Such a philosophy suggests that "we do not go back in history to posit first causes and sequential chains but view historical developments as temporal relations having dialectical ties". Silver (1983: 245) points out
that good historical investigation is concerned with a "close and detailed description and analysis, firmly set in time and place, and with continuity, change, crisis and transformation".
CHAPTER THREE

Theoretical Perspectives: Teacher Organisations

3.1. Introduction

Heyderbrand (1983: 78) points out that teacher organisations are associations of teachers grouped together around the pursuit of specific goals. Through association, teachers are able to achieve for themselves or for others objectives beyond those they could achieve individually. According to Rainey & Milward (1983: 131) the existence of organisations is considered to be an aspect of the division of labour in society. Organisations are sub-units of the wider social structure, carrying out tasks that are required by or acceptable to a wider population. This means that they must, in their operations, stay within the overall legal and value framework of the larger society, though, as with any other unit in the social division of labour, there will be some social values with which they will come into conflict, which they will contest, and which they will help to change. Van Niekerk (1992: 229) points out that in order for teacher organisations to have a positive impact on education they should have both the responsibility and the desire to contribute to and be involved in the "broad" educational field.
Steyn (1985: 80) notes that the concept "teacher organisations" includes teacher associations and their federations or unions. Teacher organisations operate with a voluntary membership. Most of them are formally organised and have some form of infra-structure which enables them to carry out their functions. Vilardo (1992: 01) points to the historic position of teacher organisations in South Africa. Vilardo (1992: 02) argues that established teacher organisations are those that have their origins before the Soweto Uprising of 1976 and that have historically sought for and received recognition from the State as the legitimate representative of teachers. Hence these teacher bodies are also referred to as "recognised" teachers organisations (see par 6.3.1.). On the contrary, the concept "emergent" teacher organisations apply to those organisations which emerged in the 1980's as part of the broad democratic movement and strongly identified themselves with the politics of the African National Congress (ANC). These organisations are also referred to as "progressive" teachers' organisations, due to their close identification with the democratic movement and because they involved themselves in political struggles against the apartheid State (see par 6.6.).

Reeves (1994: 90) maintains that universally and especially in South Africa, there is intense debate as to whether teacher organisations should constitute themselves
as professional associations or as trade unions. A further dilemma arises as to whether professional associations and teacher trade unions respond in the same manner towards educational matters. In order to answer the above problematic circumstances it becomes necessary to first establish the location of the teacher in the social spectrum. This is relevant to the development of a theory of teacher organisations.

3.2. The Class Location of Teachers

Attempting to determine the position of teachers along the social class spectrum is not only significant but problematic. It is important in that it can point out why teachers decide to join certain professionally oriented teacher bodies rather than union-based teacher organisations or vice versa. Also, the socio-economic character of teachers as a result of their class location can at the same time reveal the nature of teacher organisations.

The question of whether teachers are workers in the same sense as industrial workers is relevant. On one hand, they are reliant on wages for their subsistence and some theorists, such as Moore (1995: 51) and Wright (1976: 05-08 argue) that, therefore, they are simply part of the working class. On the other hand, teachers like the petty
bourgeoisie have far more control over their work than industrial or ordinary clerical workers. They also enjoy generally better wages and work conditions, and are generally seen as professionals with some social status. Also, teachers do not work for capitalist employers and are not directly subordinated to the needs of capital like workers in capitalist enterprises. On this basis, Hope and Goldthorpe (1987: 36) contend that teachers should be seen as occupying a middle class or "petty bourgeoisie" position.

Moore (1995: 86) points out that Marxist theorists argue that the teachers' objective class location is dependent upon the process of surplus value of production. They contend that a new class which is referred to as the new petit bourgeoisie, the new middle class or the professional-managerial class was organised in the late or monopoly capitalism stage which began near the turn of the twentieth century. This is concurrent with the consolidation of industry and the growth of the State as a central legitimating agency. The new petit bourgeoisie, for Marxists, is defined as an intermediary class between the two great camps in capitalist society, namely, labour and capital. Carlson (1988: 159-160) asserts that, generally, the new petit bourgeoisie collective political function is to supervise the appropriation of surplus value in the production process, help extract more surplus value
from labour, and indoctrinate workers, or future workers with values, such as discipline and respect for authority which are essential to the appropriation process. Included in this class, among others are shop-floor supervisors, managers, efficiency experts, accountants, clerical workers, engineers, bureaucratic planners, technicians and teachers. Teachers supervise discipline (see par 6.4.2.) and indoctrinate "future workers" in the service of capital (see par 5.4.2.). Members of this class serve as agents of the interests of capitalism and do not add anything directly of value to what is produced by human labour, hence their work cannot be considered to be "productive". Instead, along with management and capital, they live off the surplus value which is created by labour. Marx (Cole 1988: 14) did not foresee the emergence, within capitalism, of a massive middle class that would mediate between the extremes and seek to create a stable social order. Walker (1979: 19) and Wright (1976: 05-08) suggest that the fact that a person is fulfilling the teaching function puts him or her in a relationship which perpetuates elitism, paternalism, the control of knowledge and the corresponding passivity and resentment which constitutes significant class barriers between teachers and working class children (see par 6.5.2.). Reeves (1994: 67) points out that during the apartheid era in South Africa, the notion of teachers belonging to a middle class was reinforced by the State.
This was important for the transmission of the ideology of apartheid by stable, conformist middle class teachers who were essential for the maintenance of the apartheid State. The idea that teachers could identify with working-class aspirations was intelligently manipulated and rejected by the State.

Wright's (1978: 13) analysis of social class, reveals that this middle class is in a contradictory position in society. Moore (1995: 92) points to this tension by suggesting that, recently, middle class occupations are becoming increasingly proletarianised. The status and esteem of white-collar employment has been reduced as their relative income advantages have been eroded. Clerical staff are no longer rated alongside managerial levels and do not identify with their superiors as they did previously. The lifestyle and sense of identity of such workers is becoming indistinguishable from those of manual workers. Reeves (1994: 91) contends that, likewise, teachers who traditionally occupied marginal middle class positions are increasingly becoming proletarianised, whereby their status is relegated to that of the worker. In South Africa, with the dismantling of apartheid, there was no need for the State to purposefully sustain a middle class. Hence, this factor, together with low salaries and poor work conditions explains why many teachers increasingly identify with the working class. Marx
(Elster 1986: 184) predicted that capitalist society would eventually be torn apart by the conflict between a greedy bourgeoisie and a vast, rebellious proletariat. With the middle class in apparent decline and with the extremes diverging further from each other, one can conclude that this Marxist vision fits the future of many countries.

Walby (1989: 26) argues that attempting to locate male and female teachers together within a class model is misguided. She argues instead that completely separate categories are needed for men and women, as she takes the view that the idea of 'class' implies some form of common position shared by both genders, and this cannot be accepted as an accurate understanding of the position of women. Feminist theorists like Delphy (1984: 14) have rejected all such attempts at classification based on occupations, on the grounds that they reflect patriarchal relationships which exclude the crucial area of women's experience. Feminists contend that women are oppressed mainly because of their gender. In South Africa many women were doubly oppressed as a result of their gender and their historic racial position.
3.3. The Dilemma of Professionalism and Unionism

Worldwide, teachers are faced with the choice of either joining a professional association or a union-based movement. On what basis do teachers choose between these two types of organisations?

Reeves (1994: 90) shows that generally trade unions and professional associations have been viewed as quite separate and distinct entities. Trade unions traditionally have dominated industrial relations because they define their role predominantly by seeking higher wages. This course is normally pursued by threats of industrial action. Trade unions are seen as the protectors of the interests of the working class, while professional associations are viewed as helping and protecting the interests of all society.

According to the functionalist argument of Talcott and Parsons (Moore 1995: 200-210), professional associations develop because they deal with people who are particularly vulnerable to exploitation. Professional associations form in order to create and maintain the highest possible standards. This functionalist approach then lists a number of traits of professional bodies. The more of these traits a occupation possesses, the greater the likelihood of it
being classified as a profession. These traits, amongst others, include a systematic body of theory, the public's acceptance of the exclusive right of the profession to deal in their area of expertise, and a strict code of ethics. Reeves (1994: 93) points out that Marxist critics of this functionalist approach argue that professionalism is maintained by restricting entry into the profession, by specialist examinations and by creating the impression that all members of the profession are equally competent. Also, the professions prevent outsiders from investigating its affairs by disciplining its own members. Furthermore, through a monopoly of the service it provides and by a complex body of theory the profession is able to mystify its techniques, so that it seems impenetrable to an outsider (see par 6.6.).

Moore (1995: 95) argues that the modern development of the professions comes from the growth of the State in its various forms. In particular, professions such as social work, teaching, nursing and local government positions created new posts in areas of technical expertise. These posts were not necessarily managerial, but involved judgements and a level of responsibility that at the same time could not be classified as clerical. Furthermore, these professions are often underpaid, subject to the authority and bureaucracy of the State and generally have lower status. Consequently, the new professions occupy a
marginal position in comparison to the established professions of law and medicine.

Thembela (1985: 101) points out that the teacher who sees herself or himself as a middle class professional, operates from a narrow conservative base. This teacher will be a good classroom teacher who is well grounded in the specifics of teaching, namely, the subject matter, educational psychology, methodology and educational technology. The function of these teachers is to perpetuate the status quo through their competent technicist expertise (see par 6.5.5.). On the other hand, Carlson (1988: 163) points out that the teacher who views himself or herself as a worker and part of the working class struggle perceives that education is not politically and economically neutral, but it is an active supporter and a faithful reflector of the unequal and unjust status quo in society. Bowles and Gintis (1988: 18) contend that these proletarianised teachers strongly point out that radical transformation of the school must depend upon prior or accompanying radical transformation of society in which it is embedded (see par 7.3.1.).

According to Reeves (1994: 90) the concept of proletarianisation suggests an increasing identification of teachers with working class discontentment and political interests. Not only does proletarianisation link teachers'
occupational interests with a broad working class movement, it also, and more directly, links their interest to certain fundamental changes in the schools. For Carlson (1988: 164) proletarianisation also implies opposition to further bureaucratisation and centralisation of decision-making in the schools, to dominant management ideologies, to an objectified curriculum with more standardised testing, and to the general educational trends that all act to de-skill and relegate teachers to a subordinate position (see par 7.2.2.).

Hyslop (1986: 90-91) maintains that the kind of organisation teachers develop depends on whether the interests they share with workers come to the fore, or whether their aspirations are similar to the ideals of the middle class. When teachers realise that by linking up with workers' movements can be a successful strategy for improving their economic position and addressing their grievances, then it can lead to the development of a teacher organisation based along the lines of a trade union. On the other hand, where the aspirations of the middle class dominate, the result is likely to be the development of a "professional" organisation. Here, teachers will put forward claims to better working conditions based on the argument that they ought to be rewarded for their specialised knowledge and qualifications. These teachers will ignore political and
social issues and make their claims according to their professional status (see par 6.6.). However, Moore (1995: 212) argues that the latter is a doomed strategy because teachers are gradually losing control of their work conditions as they are subjected to the negative impact of a depressed global economy, and as a result they are gradually losing the status they once enjoyed. Hyslop (1990: 94) points out that the largely ignored public sector and the failure of a number of existing "professional" organisations to serve the needs of their members, has created a major opportunity today for the emergence of militant teacher unions. However, Hyslop and Moore fail to realise that while the dominant interests of capital still predominates, middle class professional organisations may flourish. These organisations are required to promote capitalistic values such as consumerism, that is, the mass consumption of capital goods, sustaining loyal middle class consumers and entrenching a disciplined workforce. This explains the prevalence and dominance of professional based teachers' organisations such the National Education Association (NEA) in the United States of America and the National Professional Teachers' Organisation of South Africa (NAPTOSA).
3.4. **Reproduction Theory**

McKay (1995: 35) declares that the education system is an integral element in the reproduction of the prevailing class structure of society. What role do teacher organisations play in perpetuating class and power relations of economic life in a capitalist society?

Modern Marxists, such as Gramsci (Moore 1995: 97) point out that the bourgeoisie not only control the means of physical production, namely, factories and raw materials but also the means of mental production, including schools, the media and cultural organisations. They are thus in a position to control and manipulate social attitudes which prevent the proletariat from developing a "class consciousness". One way of accomplishing this is by creating a value system or hegemony which permeates society with the assurance that there is no such thing as class differentiation in society.

Gramsci’s (Hall 1981: 30; Cross 1992: 178) concept of hegemony argues that a hegemonic cultural order operates by incorporating the subordinate class in institutions and organisations that support the social authority of the dominant class. Subordination is secured when the dominant class succeeds in imposing its hegemony by weakening, destroying, displacing or incorporating alternative
institutions of resistance founded by subordinate classes. The dominant culture represents itself as the norm and tries to define and contain all other cultures within its inclusive range. Hegemonic cultures, however, are seldom free to reproduce and amend themselves without contradiction and resistance. Giroux (1983a: 276) suggests that the footing on which hegemony moves and functions has to shift ground in order to accommodate the changing nature of historical circumstances and the complex demands and critical actions of human beings.

The study of organisations which nurtures the ideological world within a country is important for understanding how the dominant culture is integrated in society. For Gramsci (Cross 1992: 178), cultural institutions and organisations which help in the dissemination of culture include schools, religious bodies, media, teacher bodies and private educational institutions which are complementary to the State system. Gramsci (Giroux 1983a: 276) divides the State into two specific realms, namely political society and civil society. Political society refers to the state apparatuses of administration, law and other coercive institutions whose primary, though not exclusive, function is based on the logic of force and repression. Civil society refers to those public and private institutions, like teacher organisations, that rely upon meanings, symbols and ideas to universalise ruling-
class ideologies, while simultaneously shaping and limiting oppositional discourse and practice.

Parkin (1971: 63) develops the notion of hegemony in an interesting way. He points to religion, education and media as the channels through which ruling-class values are transmitted through society. Ideology, in this conception, is all-embracing, finding expression in and through all the political, religious, legal and educational institutions of a society, penetrating into the very existence the actions which individuals perform in these institutions (see par 8.5.). Institutions which are set up in society, like teacher organisations can be "controlled" or manipulated by the State or the dominant classes and groups in order to influence and shape the way people think. Sole (1983: 69) points out that even when organisations are not expressly focused on ideological issues, they can still affect the consciousness of its members, as ideology does not only exist in the realm of ideas but also has a material reality. All forms of consciousness imply activities as well as ideas. According to Althusser (1972: 246) and Fluxman (1987: 161) all ideological state apparatuses (ISA), such as the school, family, church and even teacher organisations can contribute to the same result, namely, the reproduction of the relations of production or capitalist relations of exploitation.
Bowles and Gintis (1988: 17) assert that education in advanced capitalism actually reproduces social inequality, rather than attenuating it. It acts more as a force for repressing personal development than fostering it. The critical problem in the articulation of schooling with advanced capitalism lies in the undemocratic structure of control over the process of production. The capitalist enterprise is not characterised by civil liberties, democratic participation, or guaranteed rights. Instead, it is characterised by rights vested in property and the control of the production process by capitalists and managerial personnel rather than in people. This gives rise to a class structure which is quite inimical to democratic principles. Bowles and Gintis (1988: 18) propose that the major objective of capital, in its interventions into the formation and evolution of the educational system, was precisely the preparation of students to be future workers on the various levels in the hierarchy of capitalist production.

Retsinas (1982: 362) and Sarup (1979: 140), both contend that the teacher is also a worker whose "products" are, in a sense, his pupils, but in the situation in which he works and what he does merely affirms their character as capitalist "products". The teacher then is a producer. The social relations of the pupil and teacher are thus internally related. There may be an inherent contradiction
here, because a teacher is not only a producer but is also an employee of those who wish to reproduce an unequal society.

Carlson (1988: 164) points out that as a collective group, teachers who act as bureaucratic professionals and possess a minimal sense of class consciousness perceive themselves to be educational technicians rather than sharing major class or cultural interests with their pupils. Thus, these teacher organisations have the ability to inculcate and reproduce the hegemony of the dominant classes and the State. Webster (1977: 194) shows that in order to impose a permanent economic and social order in South Africa after colonial conquest, a new educational system had to be developed. In order to play their part in sustaining and reproducing the system, a bureaucratic elite, which included teachers were drawn from the ranks of the colonised, and had to be educated and indoctrinated into the culture of the colonisers.

3.5. Resistance Theory

If teachers as a collective and as individuals are understood to be agents of capitalism and the State, and as perpetuating inequality, they are also recognised more sympathetically as victims of exploitation and oppression within a hierarchical, bureaucratically organised education
Lewis (1990: 215) maintains that an organisation is a prerequisite for oppressed people to bring about a change in their situation. The character of that organisation will seriously affect both the course of social struggles and their eventual outcomes. Organisations which take into account the needs of the working class may be in a position to influence the course of events and can play a leading role in the process of political change and social transformation. Organisations established by teachers as workers have a specific importance in that they represent specifically worker's interest dealing with issues of immediate concern to the membership and resisting the dictates of capital. These organisations are potentially highly democratic and participatory in character since their major source of leverage lies in the mobilisation of their membership.

Carlson (1988: 166) points out that the class cultural theory is relevant to understanding the practices and beliefs of teacher organisations as they perform their roles in schools, both as they resist their treatment as functionaries of the State, and also as they participate in, or acquiesce to, existing relations and ideologies in the education system. In sketching out the basis for a class cultural theory for teacher organisations, two sets
of concepts are widely used in cultural studies. These concepts are penetrations and limitations, and resistances and accommodations. Resistances are corresponding behavioral responses that challenge the pre-determined definition of the situation. For example in the industrial sphere, production line stoppages, and other forms of worker resistance represent attempts to sabotage and subvert the official production goals, or make the work situation more tolerable, or gain some informal control of work. For Cohen (1971: 42) the most common formal method of resistance is strike action. According to Carlson (1988: 166) the notions of penetrations and resistances imply a largely untapped strength and resiliency among oppressed groups as they engage in a form of "guerilla warfare" against the institutional authority and work processes that most visibly upset them. The other side of the picture is that ideological penetrations are typically limited in important ways that stop short of seriously challenging the status quo. Carlson (1988: 167) notes that the term "limitations" is used to designate those "blocks, diversions, and ideological effects which confuse and impede the full development and expression of working class discontents". Thus, they promote an accommodation with the system, in which resistance is kept largely circumscribed and defensive, aimed at gaining a measure of protection and freedom within dominant structures.
Cross (1992: 158-159) contributes to the theory of resistance by making a distinction between the concepts of struggles of resistance and struggles of transformation. The concept of struggles of resistance refers to oppositional practices that challenge control and power in school relations by focusing on immediate issues such as democratic representative councils, free textbooks, better equipment and school conditions. The main strategy is dominated by immediate or short-term fulfillment of the expressed demands or needs. The concept of struggles of transformation embody medium and long-term goals, which are directed in some way at the relations of production and reproduction imposed by the historic apartheid system and a capitalist economy. Political struggles for transformation transcend the purely narrow nature of the struggles of resistance to incorporate the need for reconstruction, which is a fundamental factor for emancipation. Generally, struggles for transformation involve a struggle over global demands. It is not suggested however that no relationship exists between the two levels of struggles and their expression by teachers' organisations in South Africa. In South Africa, the education struggles of transformation, like struggles of resistance, are rooted in the material and ideological conditions in which people find themselves, and these conditions, with their associated contradictions, had their birthplace at the heart of the apartheid education system.
Carnoy & Levin (1985: 47) argue that teachers are not just producers of dominant class conceptions but also reflect social demands. Attempts by the capitalist State to reproduce the relations of production and the class division of labour are confronted by teacher movements which demand more public resources and more say in how these resources are to be used in the education system. Moll (1991: 38) and Apple (1988: 121) declare that universally, there is evidence that teachers have sought with limited success to expand the scope of bargaining beyond the wage package, into the sacrosanct realm of education management. Teacher unions now demand for membership on school advisory committees, involvement in establishing student disciplinary procedures, a voice in textbook selection, participation in the formulation of in-service training programs, input into teacher evaluation and involvement in the adoption of new school programs.

Apple (1988: 124) indicates that more often than not, the educational system is not an instrument of the capitalist class, but it is the product of conflict between the dominant and the dominated. The struggle in the production sector, for example, affects the school, just as it conditions all ideological State apparatuses (ISA). The educational system is itself the political arena in which schools are caught up in social conflict. Education is the
result of contradictions and the source of new contradictions. It is an arena of conflict over the production of knowledge, ideology, and employment, a place where social movements, like teacher organisations try to meet their needs and capital attempts to reproduce its hegemony. Laclau and Mouffe (1985: 192) maintain that the responsible teacher bodies will thus use education to negate ruling class ideology where they are restrictive, repressive or inhibiting and see it as a duty to equip pupils and teachers as effectively as possible in order that they become competent to challenge, expose and counter ruling class aims and practices in the confines of the school, in the wider community and in the broad workers' movement.

Enslin (1980: 02) shows how the State and the dominant classes counter-argue that action taken by teacher organisations with a view to ensuring improved conditions for teachers and thereby improved schooling for pupils is unprofessional action. Such an argument, it seems, is repeatedly used and exploited by the State to limit and dissuade teachers from taking action, while doing little to improve their plight.

The trade union movement for teachers emerge out of their objective class location as workers who contest on-going
efforts at further proletarianisation, simultaneously linking up with the broad working class. Carlson (1988: 167) notes that teachers have risen to considerable strength and influence within the labour movement, especially in America, over the past three decades. However, labour historians and theorists have been both divided and ambivalent over the question of the political potential of the labour movement. Banks (1970: 48) points out that trade unions work well as centres of resistance against the encroachments of capital, but they fail generally from limiting themselves to a "guerilla war" against the effects of the existing system, instead of simultaneously trying to change it. The labour theorist Wright Mills (Carlson 1988: 168), argues that rather than forming a power block independent of corporate and State interests, labour leaders have been co-opted into the "power elite". This rings true especially in South Africa where high ranking officials from SADTU now serve as Ministers and officials of the State (Vadi 1998: 08; Hindle 1998: 24). Carlson (1988: 168) adds that rank and file union membership is often treated as narrowly economistic in its interests and as lacking in wider class allegiances.
3.6. **Resume**

Teachers who identify themselves as middle class, petty bourgeoisie, may tend to subscribe to the philosophy of professional associations. While teachers who find themselves becoming increasingly proletarianised as a result of their diminishing status may identify with worker movements. This also explains why a teacher's class position is not static but is subject to change, that is a movement from upper to lower middle class and even to working class.

The researcher suggests that in theory teacher organisations which organise themselves along professional lines, have a greater potential of reproducing the ideology of the dominant classes, the State and capitalism. Ultimately, these values are introjected into the classroom and condition pupils into adopting them. Thus, these organisations perpetuate inequality and injustices in the education system and in society. For instance, in South Africa, the State through political parties such as the Democratic Party (DP) articulates the dictates of the business community by lobbying for a smaller allocation of the budget towards social services and education. Their argument is that since more than 90 percent of the education budget is used for the salaries of teachers, then offering a minimal increase in salaries in the future is
quite justified (Election Manifesto of the Democratic Party, 1994). The State also argues for a more cost effective education system, by organising and restructuring education along the lines of business. This is all attempted under the guise of the ideology of efficiency. Teacher organisations, especially professional teacher bodies have come to echo these arguments without penetrating their ideological roots. Teachers’ who view themselves as workers and part of the working class have a strong potential to contest on-going efforts at further proletarianisation. As a collective group, these teachers through their struggles of resistance and struggles of transformation have the potential to resist the dictates of capital, State bureaucracy and repression, and the elitism, inequality and injustices promoted by the bourgeoisie. Teacher organisations have also operated in the Indian community of South Africa and have sought to influence the education of this group. However, before attempting to analyse the role of these organisations in the light of the above, it becomes imperative to establish the identity of the Indian community in South Africa.
CHAPTER FOUR

Theoretical Perspectives: The Indian Community

4.1. Introduction

In order to determine whether teacher organisations reproduced or resisted the ideologies of the ruling classes, as well as the State and capitalism, it becomes necessary, to first, establish a general historical background of the Indian community with a particular reference to the Indian working class. Thus, by analysing the roots of the Indian community, it becomes paramount to focus on the pre-industrial economy of Natal, as it might offer the researcher signs of early worker resistance or acquiescence; trends which may be reflected in the workings of teacher organisations.

4.2. The Indian as a Labour Commodity

Freund (1995: 01) views the issue of labour as inseparable from the onset and extension of European colonialism throughout the world. In South Africa labour was necessary in order to extract the minerals, to grow the crops, to transport the raw materials and to work the harbours in a way that would make the colonial system profitable and self-sustaining. Beall (1991: 90)
contends that the indigenous people of Natal were difficult to conquer and to put to labour without subjecting them to intense coercion. Moreover they often retained a capacity for resistance, or flight into the interior of Natal. Hence the need to import labour became necessary.

As early as February 1855 numerous merchants and agriculturalists insisted on the need for vigorous measures to remedy the great depression in commerce and agriculture. They recommended that imported Indian labour might serve these needs. For Marx (North-Coombes 1991: 16-17) this migrant labour was not only inherent in the colonial system but served as the "light infantry" of capital; a reserve army which could be deployed at will to serve the needs of expanding commodity production. Migration was necessary for the national and global extensions of capitalism. In echoing the need for labour one prominent agriculturalist stated: "Indian immigration is deemed more essential to our prosperity than ever. The Indian’s presence will...be a benefit to the European inasmuch the enlarged production and increased prosperity he will create must give wider scope for the employment of our own skilled countrymen" (Brookes & Webb 1979: 83).

Arkin (1989: 44) concludes that the arrival of Indians in South Africa on 16 November 1860 was part of a strategy of international colonialism which sought to use cheap labour
to extract raw materials from the colonised lands of Natal. Brookes & Webb (1979: 86) show that the sugar farmers were delighted to receive Indian labour but neither the farmers nor the State seemed to realise the sociological implications of the new venture, nor did they show human compassion and understanding toward the immigrants who were mainly regarded as labour commodities. North-Coombes (1991: 16-17) points out that under capitalism labour power itself became commoditised and acquired an internationally circulated character. Overseas emigration from India was thus linked to British colonialism and capitalism which disturbed and eroded agrarian relations while boosting population growth in rural areas in conditions of economic depression. Denied the alternative of industrial employment, the rural poor faced famine and pestilence. For many, overseas emigration proved a viable alternative. Arkin (1989: 44) notes that during the entire period of indentured immigration to Natal, which was spread over 50 years from late 1860 to 1911, approximately 152,184 Indian people arrived in Natal.

4.3. The Indenture System

According to North-Coombes (1991: 39) the bourgeoisie used an oppressive indenture system in order to extract the maximum work from the Indian labourers at a minimum cost.
Beall (1991: 91) notes that although indentured labourers offered themselves for employment on a contract basis, it was the plantation owners who had the upper hand in negotiating the contract, not with the workers themselves but with the British Government in India. Thus, although indentured immigrants attested to their contracts, they had no rights over their terms of employment. Having been brought to the site of agrarian production in the colony of Natal, Indians became a captive labour force. They were bound to their contract for a period of five years and were deprived of a regularly negotiated wage, reasonable hours of work and a private life. In addition, they had no control over whether the terms of their contract would be upheld. They had inadequate legal protection and representation and they were denied the right to organise or to exercise their bargaining power to ameliorate their situation.

Freund (1992: 07-08) shows that as their contracts expired, a few Indians were able to escape the indenture system by hawking, that is, selling fruit, vegetables and flowers on the streets from carts, or by setting up small shops. A few also obtained white collar jobs in the civil service. Most of the "free" Indians could only survive through wage labour as they had no land, and being new workers, they had not been trained in industrial skills. The State used relatively high taxes to force Indians into
wage labour. All "free" Indians were compelled to pay a three pound tax every year because they were not indentured labourers (see par 4.4). For poor people, this was a heavy burden and the result was that thousands of destitute families were forced back into indentured labour. The relationship between the wages paid by the farm owners and the rate of tax was to ensure a constant supply of labour. Callinicos (1987: 157) points out that by 1913, more than 62 percent of the entire indentured Indian workforce were still working on the sugar plantations under harsh working conditions, because they could not find suitable alternative employment.

Swan (1991: 121) argues that oppressive layers of formal and informal controls were used by the bourgeoisie to prevent workers from organising effective protest action against the oppressive indenture system. Informal controls refer to the unsympathetic attitude of employers and State officials towards Indian labourers and the use of palliatives, such as alcohol and gambling, even when these detracted from the workers productivity. Beall & North-Coombes (1983: 64) and Bradford (1990: 81) cite examples of formal controls, such as the authority vested in the manager, the system of task work, reduction of wages for sickness or unlawful absence from work. Any politically active worker who tried to organise others in his compound was immediately transferred elsewhere - the
final divisive mechanism. Thus the workforce was atomised by law. North-Coombes (1991: 43) argues that the phasing out of the indenture system had more to do with internal dissolution of the system in the context of a crisis in the world economy than to the resistance from workers.

Under the indenture system, women workers were subject to greater exploitation than men, which inevitably created a cheapness of labour. Consequently, indentured women were the lowest paid workers in the colony of Natal during the existence of the indenture system. This oppression was experienced in the workplace where women were increasingly subjected to physical and sexual abuse (Beall 1991: 106; Freund 1995: 36). Their powerlessness derived from a system of labour regimentation and control which characterised the indentured labour force as a whole. In addition to this core of immobility, women were also subjected to another set of restrictions which inhibited their ability to escape the rigours of a forced labour system. First, women's role in the labour process was one which precluded them from complex tasks which would have enabled them to acquire the skills or experience, necessary for bargaining with their employers over their work conditions. Second, cultural constructs prevented Indian women from acquiring an education when the latter became a possibility for Indian male children. These factors together with biological constraints such as responsibility
for childbearing, reduced their potential for finding alternative forms of employment. Therefore, the only route out of indenture for the majority of women was either through repatriation or through marriage or dependence on an employed male partner (Brookes & Webb 1979: 86). Thus women were oppressed not only as workers but as women in a society which was becoming increasingly racially and gender intolerant.

4.4. Resistance to Capital

The tension between capital and labour is well recorded. For the Indians this struggle became intensified when they arrived in South Africa.

Swan (1991: 128) declares that during the period 1860 to 1911 the incidence of collective action in agriculture was extremely low. There were few short-lived strikes and these were generally concerned with specific gross abuses of the contract. Accommodation by workers far outweighed resistance. Beall & North-Coombes (1983: 68) point out that the resistance offered by Indian workers to the oppressive and capitalistic indenture labour system was limited to withdrawal of labour through absenteeism, malingering, or desertion. Destruction of plantation property, brawls and fistfights offered other outlets for the accumulated frustrations of an oppressive, degrading
existence.

Indian workers were subjected to a repressive network of controls which severely restricted organised resistance (Padayachee et al. 1985: 01). In addition, Newby (1979: 34) maintains that these agricultural workers who are known as the 'traditional deferential' were aware of the existence of a ruling class and regarded their rule as proper and legitimate. However, Swan (1985: 65) insists that culturally, resistance was expressed in forms reflecting Indian archetypes of great antiquity, which made a long-term connection to labour resistance in twentieth century South Africa implausible at this stage.

Swan (1991: 129) further argues that more time was needed for indentured workers who were only a few years removed from the pre-industrial Indian countryside to adapt to the nature and style of their protest to suit the exactions of an advanced industrial society. There was a tendency at this stage for pre-industrial protest to be spontaneous, unstructured, and to possess minimum organisation. The difficulty of organisation and collective mobilisation among workers was intensified by the constraints on the freedom of movement of indentured Indians (Swan 1991: 129). Swan (1982: 44) asserts that political organisations such as the Natal Indian Congress (NIC) focussed more on the needs of the Indian merchant class and
had little contact with indentured workers. Furthermore, these political organisations were largely out of touch with worker problems, and made no attempt to mobilise these workers towards collective action. Beall & North-Coombes (1983: 48) add that the grievances and demands of the indentured labourers were of little relevance to the Indian merchant class.

Swan (1985: 65) declares that whilst indentured labour was a vital short-term necessity for the capitalist sugar companies, in the long term it proved to be an obvious anachronism from the point of view of White workers. Whites protested at the importation of skilled Indian workers on the indenture system; an importation that threatened to undercut the wages of White workers. Beall & North-Coombes (1983: 64) show that subsequently, a three pound residence tax was imposed on all Indians who were no longer bound by contract to the sugar farmers. The purpose of this tax was not to raise revenue, but to force Indians to return to India or to extend their contracts with the farmers. This ensured that the labour needs of the capitalist employers could continue to be met whilst at the same time, efforts towards the repatriation of Indians could be demonstrated to White workers. Swan (1985: 65-66) points out that in October and November of 1913, more than 20 000 Indian workers in Natal went on strike in protest against the imposition of the tax. The leader of
the strike was an Indian, British-trained lawyer named Mohandas K. Gandhi, who had been active in South Africa for a number of years. His famous Satyagraha or passive resistance form of struggle was to defy unjust laws, without violence and involved large numbers of people. The strike also spread to the south, to the 15 000 Indian workers on the sugar plantations. It was a spontaneous development which caused great alarm among the sugar companies, plantation owners as well as White workers in general. The fear that indentured workers would unite with African workers for support resulted in panic and police brutality. In the most serious clash between strikers and the police, a number of Indian workers were shot dead and many were injured. Castle's and Kosack's analysis indicates that this repressive State strategy was mainly intended to break the solidarity of the working class (Moore 1995: 91).

However, the above does not address the question of why the workers lacked even a rudimentary labour organisation, or why they responded to a strike call issued by Gandhi. Swan (1991: 130) points out that the leaders of pre-industrial popular protest came from outside as well as within the protestors own ranks, and that in the former case it was usual to find the labourers responding to the direction or believed direction of a leader from a higher social group. Gandhi himself provided this sort of legitimacy. The
workers drew on both their incomplete knowledge of the politics of the South African Indian elite, and popular forms of Indian culture, to portray this leader in a fashion that, reminiscent of upsurges of pre-industrial protest in Europe, was often millenarian. While Gandhi's role was influential, it was not central in the sense that the Indian resistance movement for the entire period was not controlled by him.

The work of Swan (1985: 65-66), Beall (1991: 102) and North-Coombes (1991: 33) makes it clear that the strike, to an important extent, was against the capitalists of Natal and it intended to protest against the deteriorating material conditions under which Indians lived and worked. Callinicos (1987: 95-96) notes that in April 1914, a commission which was appointed to investigate the causes of the strike recommended the abolition of the tax and brought about a settlement with Gandhi's passive resistance movement. For the Indian workers in South Africa, the struggle to survive continued. While the removal of the tax eased their burden of poverty, low wages in agricultural employment forced more Indian families to venture to the urban job market.

During 1914 to 1919 the former indentured workers and their descendents migrated from agricultural plantations to industrial and service occupations in the urban centres.
North-Coombes (1991: 61) shows that while six out of ten Indians were engaged in agricultural activities in 1911, there were nearly eight out of ten in non-agricultural employment forty years later. African labour was employed on an expanding scale on the sugar plantations. Many Indians were drawn to urban areas by the relatively higher wages prevailing in non-agricultural sectors of the economy, although they were to discover equally deplorable living and housing conditions and encounter the uncertainty of unemployment. Over several decades, this continuous movement out of agriculture was to lead to the formation of a sizeable urban proletariat of Indian origin, which was entirely dependent on the sale of its labour power for continued survival (North-Coombes 1991: 66). While the 1913 strike represented the first major collective action undertaken by Indian workers in Natal, for Callinicos (1987: 157), however, the strike itself did not precipitate the formation of trade unions. Beall & North-Coombes (1983: 67) and Freund (1995: 23) point out that upward social mobility was difficult for the Indian working class. Capital was needed to set up in petty-bourgeois occupations and various skills had to be acquired to obtain more profitable kinds of employment. Further, there was often legal restrictions such as licences, which had to be overcome. For example, the Income and Land Assessment Act of 1908 penalised Indian tenant farmers on White owned land. For Padayachee et al. (1985: 27) the dwindling
employment opportunities in the tertiary sector, and the fall in Indian employment in the primary sector, that is agriculture and coal mining, could only have increased further the pressures towards full proletarianisation. The late 1920's were a period of industrial militancy for the African working class. Increasing numbers of Africans went on strike as compared to other race groups. However, it was after the Great Depression in the early 1930's, following rapid urbanisation and their absorption into industrial employment that increasing numbers of Indians formed or joined trade unions. Low pay and the constant threat of unemployment contributed to the general instability of the lives of these workers. Padayachee et al (1985: 20; 40) declare that by the late 1930's and 1940's these factors led to the emergence of a largely industrially based Indian working class movement either through Indian or non-racial trade union organisations. Marie (1986: 58) shows that Indian organisers, such as G. Ponen and H.A. Naidoo worked hard to overcome rivalry between African and Indian workers for jobs, and to promote working class solidarity.

Indians were mainly wage earners. Ninety-six percent of Indians who were engaged in the manufacturing industry in the greater Durban area in 1952 to 1953 were wage earners as opposed to 1.8 percent who were proprietors, while 2.2 percent occupied managerial positions (Padayachee et al
1985: 36). Hence a large percentage of the Indian population fell in the category of the working class.

4.5. National Liberation versus Class Struggle

To effectively resist the dictates of capitalism, a strong working class consciousness must develop. Cross (1992: 46) shows that early Marxist activists tended to downplay the racial aspects of the South African Society and its struggles and instead focused on the class nature of the conflict. They viewed national liberation as a class struggle, with the aim of establishing a non-racial class ideology, which would link the working class across racial boundaries in a common struggle against capitalism.

In emphasising the class struggle as the major determinant of political change, Marxist theory conceives of racial discrimination and exploitation as an aspect of class relations. However, Westergaard & Resler (1976: 53) point out that the application of this theory in its pure form to specific situations of racial conflict, especially in South Africa, raises serious difficulties. There were not only a failure in solidarity between workers of different race, but it was often workers of the dominant race who demanded the most extreme forms of racial discrimination. Moreover, members of the subordinate race, were generally so economically differentiated that they did
not constitute a unified working class.

Kuper (1974: 281) points out that White and Black workers performed the same function in the process of production in the workplace, but various factors obscured, inhibited or distorted their perception of common interests and of the reality of the class struggle. These factors included, inter alia, racial and cultural diversities, racial and national cleavages, absorption of the White workers in the ruling elite, effects of labour migration and prejudice against Blacks, namely Africans, Indians and Coloureds. In attempting some reconciliation of Marxist theory with the failure in solidarity between workers of different race, Simons & Simons (1969: 24) suggest that interracial class solidarity in the Marxist sense exists as a potential in South Africa (see par 8.4.) and that the specified conditions for this solidarity could only be realised if workers of different colour groups were allowed freedom of association. Early in the twentieth century White workers actually acquired a class consciousness, but the great body of White workers moved into the politics of White domination. White workers became an aristocracy of labour as a result of their privileged political position. White workers used their political position to enforce racial discrimination, racial segregation, protected employment, and monopoly of many skilled occupations. However, Simons & Simons (1969: 25) also point out that freedom of
association by itself would not have fortified worker class consciousness across the colour line. At the very least, political equality would have been a further condition.

Bhana (1994: 03-05) declares that in the political discourse that followed after 1900 in Natal and the rest of South Africa, even the broad distinction of class among Indians gradually disappeared. Race and radicalisation were becoming fundamental organising principles of politics in South Africa; a process by which groups were defined and redefined to serve the needs of the dominant group. By 1910 the leaders of the NIC played an important role by creating a new political identity for the culturally and ethnically diverse groups that came from India. The colonial rulers helped to shape the identity of immigrants by treating them as an undifferentiated mass. The presence of Africans and Whites helped to define cultural and racial boundaries. Freund (1995: 51) declares that even the militants linked to the Communist Party of South Africa (CPSA) and the NIC, later abandoned the ideal of working class unity for a more ethnic or Indian-centred type of politics. A passive resistance campaign, led by the radicalised NIC, focused on issues of racial discrimination which were not particular to workers or the working class, but stressed the united interests of all Indians. Writers such as Swan (1985: 111) and Padayachee et al (1985: 29) see this type of movement as being successful in
constructing an identity of ethnic resistance as opposed to a class or worker one. Freund (1995: 32) contends that even the diversified, but to some extent interrelated economy in the 1920's was serviced by an extremely diversified work-force, whose history militated against its acquiring a common sense of itself as a class and strongly lent itself to the trappings of ethnic identity. Bhana (1994: 07) points out that generally, Indians began to show a cultural and ethnic unity in its political dealings with the White authorities.

Freund (1992: 14) notes that the continued dream of militant trade unionists was to break through the racial barriers. This was the real challenge, but unfortunately it met with little success. The implication of this failure was that workers turned to struggles which were mainly concerned with national politics as there were no solutions to their problems on the union front (Freund 1992: 14). Padayachee et al (1985: 27) provide an excellent account on how this way of thinking was fuelled by weak shopfloor organisation. As a result the political leadership moved largely away from work-related issues. The firing of workers for their participation in strikes, such as the strikes of 1950 and 1953 further discouraged the class project.
In April 1994, the first general election based on universal franchise in South Africa revealed that the National Party received most of the Indian vote, from the populous working class areas such as Chatsworth and Phoenix, while one quarter of the Indian vote, comprising of the younger, more educated middle-class Indians voted for the ANC. Working class Indians became more concerned about securing employment opportunities than with general political issues which were articulated by the ANC (Freund 1995: 90). This clearly suggests that class was important in determining the Indian vote. Hence the class argument is still prevalent and while it may not surface overtly, the researcher contends that it is located in the historic, present and future 'subconscious' of the Indian community. Class consciousness emerged in a very diluted form, smothered under the guise of national liberation and ethnic resistance.

4.6. The Effect of Culture on Class Consciousness

4.6.1. Introduction

Cross (1992: 184) strongly argues that culture is not a neutral concept, but is a historically and ideologically constituted concept which is often used by the dominant class to legitimise hegemony over or control the subordinate classes. Hall (1981: 13-17) shows that the
concept of culture in South Africa emerged from social 
anthropology and provided an alternative to both biological 
determinism and universal humanism. It rejected 
assimilation as an anti-cultural development, yet it 
permitted 'racial upliftment' and ethno-cultural identity. 
This concept of culture became part of the legitimising 
ideology of segregation and served the political ends of 
the ruling classes.

While culture can be conceived as a uniting force binding 
social groups or classes together, Cross (1992: 184) 
points out that it is also a divisive element, reflecting 
the complexity of societies. Culture was used as an 
effective ideology by the ruling class in South Africa to 
keep races separate by re-asserting the collective 
principle of racial identity through systematic legislation 
and penal sanctions (Kuper 1974: 167). The State 
exploited cultural differences by justifying low wages 
under a "civilised" labour policy; by restricting 
competition in commerce and by segregating residential 
areas (Kuper 1974: 149). Through its emphasis on 
cultural differences the State was able to dilute and 
inhibit working class consciousness.
4.6.2. The Myth of Community

There is frequently a sentimental association of the idea of community with homogeneity and total, organic harmony. Swan (1990: 183) points out that the designation, "Indian community in South Africa" was derived from the classification by the State of all emigrants from the subcontinent as Indians. This designation marks a population, not only with a diverse culture with deep historical roots, but also a differentiated class structure. However, for Freund (1995: 76) community relations invariably embrace conflict and inequality. Freund (1995: 77) suggests that in reality the early Indian community consisted of networks of family linked together through a myriad of economic connections.

Indians did coalesce into an ethnic group despite internal differences. Indian culture became ethnicised. However, Freund (1995: 08) points out that within this ethnicity, different and conflicting cultures and classes developed.

Initially, the primary class division in the Indian community was between those of passenger and indentured origin. Meer (1969: 10) notes that while "indentured" immigrants were bound by contract to the sugar companies, passenger Indians came to South Africa at their own cost and at the time enjoyed the same citizenship rights as
Whites. Both Klein (1990: 04) and Meer (1969: 10) show that generally, passenger Indians came from a higher standard of living in India than did the indentured; they wore better clothing, experienced a higher degree of vernacular education, and enjoyed better nutrition. The passenger Indians kept up their links with their ancestral home by constant communication in writing and in person and preserved their exclusiveness by marrying within their caste. On the other hand, the indentured were huddled together in cramped living facilities without consideration for caste, and they were rarely united into families. Unlike the passenger Indians, the indentured community had little leisure time to honour their cultural traditions. The merchant class was vital as providers of credit, shelter and employment for the indentured. Freund (1995: 38) claims that this relationship with the indentured population was exploited at times.

In addition to the obvious class differences between the two categories of immigrants, Brookes & Webb (1979: 260) point to cultural, linguistic, and religious differences. Among the immigrants from the southern part of India were Tamil and Telegu speakers; and those who came from the northern and western areas spoke Bhojpuri and Gujarati respectively. They represented Hinduism, Islam and, in much smaller numbers, Christianity. Mesthrie (1991: 16) declares that cultural change encompassed a dramatic
decline in vernacular languages, especially among the working class Indians.

India was overwhelmingly subject to the system of castes and subcastes; and the immigrants who came to South Africa brought with them this aspect of their cultural legacy. Kuper (1960: 117) declares that of the three aspects of social organisation, namely, religion, family structure and caste system, the third has undergone drastic change under South African conditions. Urbanisation has encouraged and accelerated the pace of education. Moreover, the juxtaposition of different religions and different castes, together with the atmosphere of a European-dominated society, has done much to blur the caste distinctions and to alter well established social customs. Caste among the younger people does not have the same prominence as it had among their elders. Furthermore the issue of class has blurred the distinctions by caste as one may be higher in the socio-economic scale while belonging to a lower caste.

Bhana (1997: 05) attempts to further shatter the belief of the Indian community as a homogenous, harmonious group. He contends that the Indians in Natal were an extremely heterogeneous group and this was reflected in the organisations that they created for themselves in order to fulfil their basic needs of identity and sub-group cohesion. Swan (1990: 183) maintains that the elite
class created and nurtured many social and religious organisations that celebrated their narrow cultural traditions which were imported from India. Organisations that developed were diverse and sought to exclude others in the community. Klein (1990: 09) demonstrates that Indians of indentured origin showed a stronger tendency than Indians of a passenger origin to associate with groups without regard to religion, linguistic origin, or caste.

Bhana (1997: 139) contends that by the 1970's and 1980's, all classes of Indians had experienced upward social and economic mobility. A professional elite had emerged (see par 6.6.). Klein (1990: 10) further argues that as the Indian community grew more westernised, particularly in the period after 1950 some of these highly educated professionals took an active role in maintaining the rich variety of Indian cultural traditions through associations honouring particular ethnic sentiments. Bhana (1997: 138) contends that these organisations had a strong "Indianness" to them, both in their activities and in their membership.

Swan (1990: 184) argues that the major political organisations, such as the NIC were initially created to protect vested commercial interests and were controlled by the wealthy merchants. The membership of these political organisations consisted overwhelmingly of the commercial elite. The class cohesion of the elite was reinforced by
their common cultural background, just as their distance from the working class was reinforced by profound cultural differences. These early political organisations did not seek a radical transformation of the social order.

Segregation was the operating principle in the policy towards the Indians who were becoming increasingly urbanised. While the NIC resisted racial segregation for Indians and insisted on equality of treatment and access to resources and opportunities, it did so under a policy of polite protest. The NIC leaders, most of whom were businessmen with politically moderate views, developed a strategy which used the mediation of a diplomatic representative of the Government of India. This strategy reassured Whites about their unchallenged political hegemony (Bhana 1994: 06). The NIC leaders sought to create political unity over the "Indianness" of their constituents. Even though the process of assimilation among first and second generations was changing the identity of the Indians, they remained as culturally diverse as in the early period. The NIC as a political and secular organisation was aware of this, and adopted an inclusive strategy by which to accommodate their diversity. The NIC carefully created a coalition of cultural and religious organisations by co-opting their leaders onto the executive of these bodies (Bhana 1994: 07). Freund (1995: 51) questions whether it was possible to build up
a movement that resisted racial divisions in the work place and which had a strong class character. After many years in which repression and relative prosperity had seemed to marginalise radical political activity, a revival of the NIC in 1971 seemed to herald renewed attempts to galvanise working-class opinion, partly around new issues that focused on economic pressures in the municipality-owned townships, such as Chatsworth.

Working-class Indians feared job losses and discrimination by Africans. During the 1980's when the anti-apartheid opposition became radicalised, some members, effectively, took the NIC to task for having abandoned working-class politics in favour of an ethnic tag. Critics argue that leaders of the NIC had betrayed the masses of the Indian population, by losing interest in class issues (Marie 1986: 121).

Anderson (1971: 145) has argued that the family structure which is influenced by cultural tradition also has an effect on class consciousness. Brookes & Webb (1979: 86) note that prior to industrialisation, the extended family formed the typically Indian working-class living unit. It consisted of the entire family, typically of a large number of children plus parents and grandparents living together or in close proximity. The Indian family worked as a unit either in agriculture, or in domestic
industry. Goode (1983: 41), among others, has argued that the effect of capitalism was to break up this family network, and to replace it with an uncritical consumer-orientated nuclear family. Goode (1983: 42) suggests that industrialisation exerted a number of points of pressure on the extended family. Firstly, modern society needed a workforce which was prepared to move to wherever its labour was required, and this geographical mobility had inevitably weakened kinship ties. In addition, the State had taken over many of the family's functions, such as education and health, thus undermining the practical usefulness of the kinship network. Furthermore, industrialisation had brought higher prospects of social mobility, and the chance for a family member to move into a better social class than his or her relatives. This led to family tensions as its members now belonged to different social classes. Also, extended family had traditionally provided continuity, with fathers passing on their skills and crafts to their sons, but modern industry generates specialisation, and complex skills, so that it is less likely a son will follow his fathers trade. In arguing a case for the extended family Anderson (1971: 146) contends that the extended family operated like a surrogate welfare state, as a mutual aid network which provided multiple income, cost sharing, childcare, protection of the old and sick, and a way of securing jobs for relatives by 'speaking up' for them. Anderson (1971: 151) concludes
that the difficulties that the working-class experienced during the early phase of industrialisation created a practical need for the extended family. Anderson (1971:159) also contends that a really strong effective and non-calculative commitment to the kinship network and traditional community solidarity can only develop when capitalism diminishes.

It is admitted that there is a lack of unified consciousness, a fragmentation facilitated by cultural constructs. Naidoo (1991:143) contends that the State in collusion with capital had ensured that the goal of intra-community solidarity with a view to resistance had been frustrated. Class consciousness was not only diluted by the national liberation struggle but also because of a complex cultural diversity within the Indian community. Bonacich (1980:212) concludes that this cultural diversity which encompasses traditions, customs and beliefs play a significant role in reducing the Indians' identification with working class aspirations.
4.7. Resume

Marxism views the use of cheap labour as a strategy of international and local capitalism, which intended to extract and process raw materials for a high profit. For the Natal economy, indenturing Indian immigrants was a decisive step in the effective implantation of profitable capitalist activities. In order to accomplish their goals, capitalists resorted to a harsh indenture system of labour. The Indian came to be regarded as a labour commodity, to be exploited for profit while his social needs, such as the provision of housing and education were largely ignored. For the Marxist-feminist Indian women under indentured contract were the most exploited and oppressed amongst the population of the colony.

Political consciousness was limited in the indentured population due to conditions of oppression, isolation and exclusion from the mainstream of Indian political activity. The workers' own pre-industrial ideology was in itself a barrier to the more militant or widespread forms of struggle which could have forced improvements in the system. Neither did the political Ghandian ideologies, such as passive resistance help, as it called for reform while at the same time it upheld the conservative moral autonomy of the State and the bourgeoisie.
Capitalists ensured the supply of cheap labour by imposing a system of taxation. However, capitalism did not go unchallenged. There were flickers of organised resistance even as early as 1913. The researcher contends that this was just not resistance to the overt oppressive indentured system but an unconscious struggle between labour and an exploitative capitalist system. This challenge by labour was met by the intensified efforts of the State and capitalism to break the possibility of a strong, unified working class. Against this repressive background it was difficult for a unified class consciousness to develop.

Attempting to demystify the concept of "Indian community" reveals that it is not altogether homogeneous as defined by the State, but reflects a diversity in class, religion and organisations. While these differences played a significant role in their own perception of their identity, they also reinforced conservatism and created an inward-looking ethnic community who saw themselves increasingly as "Indians". This limited inter-racial class consciousness could possibly offer us reasons as to why teacher organisations possibly served mainly the elite and transmitted elite values while ignoring the needs of the working class.

The researcher suggests that a true class struggle or resistance against capitalism could not emerge due to lack
of inter-racial working class solidarity, weak trade union organisation, and the firing of workers which served as a deterrent to participate in militant protest. National liberation became the paramount struggle even for the hardlined CPSA. For the Indian community the dialectic between national liberation and class struggle seemed to resolve itself in ethnic resistance. Ethnic resistance, became the organising principle as the community struggled against the injustices which it faced. The Indian community began to speak only for itself.

This was the background against which teacher organisations were formed and operated. Could these trends be mirrored in how teacher organisations influenced education in the Indian community? Did these teacher bodies adopt the conservative attitude of the political organisations such as the NIC, only serving the vested interests of the wealthy and the elite to the detriment of the working class? Were the leadership and members of teacher organisations like the merchant class? Did these collective groups of teachers reflect the class struggle and working class aspirations in their ideological consciousness and material reality?
CHAPTER FIVE

1925 - 1958: A Period of Contradiction: Early Signs of Reproduction and Resistance

5.1. Introduction

The year 1925 marks the establishment of the first permanent teacher organisation in the Indian community. Freund (1995: 83) shows that up till the 1950's the policy of the State insisted on labelling Indians as aliens who could never be assimilated into South African society and emphasis was placed on making repatriation to India attractive to the surviving ex-indentured workers and their children. This was the precarious background in which teacher organisations sought to influence education in the Indian community.

5.2. The Emergence of Teacher Organisations

5.2.1. The Failure to Unionise

Freund (1995: 47) points out that Indian workers began to organise into unions during the World War I period, in the very period when White workers in South Africa engaged in militant strike action in industries and in the mining sector. However, the organisation of these unions had a strong ethnic character and even the strikes emerged as
strikes by only Indians. A central figure in the union movement for Indians was the radical B.L.E. Sigamoney who helped create the Indian Workers Union (IWU) in 1917. Sigamoney also made contact with sympathetic White trade-unionists and through them, linked the IWU with the International Socialist League (ISL), an antecedent of the CPSA. Born in Durban, he was a key figure in the popularisation of socialism among the Indian working class. Sigamoney pointed out that the organisation of Indian workers was necessary in order to promote Indian employment; it was a response to Indian exclusion and to the absolute preference of most White employers for White workers. In 1918, records show that Sigamoney also influenced and chaired the formation of an ad hoc committee to represent teachers at a function, where an Inspector of Education, Mr Cecil Ballance was honoured, in appreciation of his long and devoted service to Indian education. However, this Committee failed to materialise into an organised body for teachers (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 32).

Freund (1995: 48) indicates that an emerging middle class of professional teachers would not have taken to the socialist, working class leanings offered by Sigamoney (see par 3.2). Swan (1991: 121) points out that the harsh control measures of the bourgeoisie towards indentured labour, together with a passive Ghandian
protest, were still strongly prevalent in the psyche of the urbanised Indian population. Giroux (1983b: 264) suggests that the State proceeds to destroy all alternative forms of organisation which attempts to establish a difference at the level of the national social formation or which attempts to establish any form of international solidarity along class lines. Davenport (1992: 272) argues to the contrary by suggesting that the ISL, through a lack of organisation, had failed to build up any meaningful contact with the Black masses during this period. Thus the first significant movement towards potentially effective teacher empowerment failed to materialise.

5.2.2. The Rise of the Natal Indian Teachers Society

\textit{(NITS)}

Gradually, a small but not insignificant number of descendants of the indentured population moved into middle class occupational roles, forming an educated middle class. Many entrepreneurs started their own business and they proved to be skilled despite racial discrimination, while increasing numbers were employed as teachers in the education sector (Klein 1990: 04; Hey 1962: 30).

In 1925 a teachers' reception committee was formed with the sole purpose of organising celebrations for school children
on the occasion of the visit of his Royal Highness, the Prince of Wales. Two teachers, A. Rai and T.M. Naicker were chosen among six Indian representatives to be present at the official welcome. This elite event brought teachers into close contact with each other. Subsequently, teachers felt that a permanent teachers' body was required to serve the interests of Indian teachers and of Indian education. This concern resulted in the immediate formation of the Natal Indian Teachers' Society (NITS) (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 32). Swan (1985: 11) and Bhana (1997: 19) both declare that it was vital for the Indian middle class to appease the British monarchy as it would not only have secured better social conditions for the middle class in the short term, but it would have assured their prized citizenship in South Africa for the future. Swan (1985: 12) thus shows that the NITS did not initially emerge to resist the dictates of capitalism, foster working class consciousness or subvert racial segregation but it was founded to satisfy middle class or elitist values. Thus NITS reinforced the idea that the teacher held a superior position in the occupational structure and in society.

As an organisation the NITS not only advanced middle class values, but it also promoted ethnic polarisation. Of the various dimensions of ethnic solidarity, the one Bonacich (1980: 213) emphasises is the existence of voluntary associations, like the NITS which conduct and control
"internal" affairs. The formation of, and involvement in, intra ethnic organisations indicate that feelings are alive and that the ethnic community is organised to pursue its goals. Middle class Indians of passenger descent were far closer to the ethnically exclusive end of the continuum in their combined associational memberships than were middle class Indians of indentured descent. Thus, Bonacich (1980: 213) argues that in the pursuit to establish middle class values the NITS also reinforced ethnicity. This is evident in the numerous activities of the NITS which was mainly Indian orientated. In 1929 a Ladies' Auxiliary of the NITS became active in promoting Indian music, while in the 1930's many officials of the NITS enthusiastically elevated the conservative Indian Boy Scouts and Indian Girl Guide movements. The NITS also promoted sports solely for the Indian community by forming numerous bodies such as the Natal Indian Sports Association. Middle class values became blended with ethnicity.

Moodley (1980: 234) seems to defend organisations such as the NITS by claiming that these affective aspects of ethnicity, such as religion, music, customs and traditions formed part of the construction of a womblike structure to act as a bulwark against a hostile social environment. For Kuper (1960: 34) the sense of belonging to an association, the giving of "affection" and the seeking of
it in return is the core of ethnic relationships. Like Moodley, Kuper (1960: 35) shows how ethnic associations, such as the NITS have served vital material and identity needs for the Indian community in response to the community's exclusion from the State's power and services. However, Freund (1995: 53) contends that ethnic identity is complex and it cannot only be created from the outside by the State. Indeed, it is invariably moulded from within and asserted in work, school and through organisations in robust and positive ways. According to Freund (1995: 55), Indians in South Africa, have, in other words, been discriminated against and exploited through emphasis on ethnic categories.

5.3. The Contribution of NITS to Middle Class Ideology

Cross (1992: 58) declares that generally, educational thought of the 1920's and 1930's reflected the prevailing elitism and politics of the petty bourgeoisie. Educationists mediated the dominant colonial conceptions, particularly those propagated by the liberal, moderate establishments.

One of the major successes of professional bodies such as the NITS was in translating the possessive individualist and free market ideologies of capitalism into the language of experience, moral imperative, and liberalism. This was
done through its appropriation of populism and the language of democracy. Hall (1983: 25) notes that moderate populism propagates the themes that have had a particularly important history, like those of self interest, competitive individualism, and antistatism. Progressive elements such as concern for fairness and justice for the people are taken out of their original context and connected to the imperatives of profitability and accumulation. These are typified by statements by the NITS such as "We are hard working and deserving; they are immoral, or simply uncaring State bureaucrats" (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 06). Christie (1986: 24-25) has shown that moderates like the NITS reinterpreted the very meaning of inequality and recast the meanings of achieving it. These moderates had repackaged the earlier themes, infusing them with new political meaning and linking them to other key elements of middle class ideology.

The NITS strongly advanced the ideology of liberalism. These liberal perceptions were also strengthened by former missionaries and Christian educators, who preached that all human beings were born equal. They also propagated universal concepts of peace, love, justice, equality and the common brotherhood of all, as well as obedience to authority, tolerance, patience and sacrifice for those who suffered injustice and oppression. It was against this background, that it was ideologically very difficult for
the middle class Indian teacher to accept Marxist ideas. Thus, it is not surprising that passive action such as resolutions, constitutional and peaceful propaganda, deputations and petitions were employed for the achievement of its goals (Diamond Jubilee Brochure 1987: 15).

However, this passive spirit of liberalism was not effective enough in bringing about change in the political and educational areas. Cooppan (1955: 10) defends this argument when he states that the request for an increase in the funding of school accommodation was turned down due to the passive and co-operative spirit shown by the NITS towards the Natal Provincial Administration (NPA). The NPA also gave no indication that they were willing to build the required minimum of five schools per annum. The Society seemed to be conditioned by the misguided liberal assumption that the State was a neutral, administrative structure that operated in the interests of the general will of its people.

The NITS worked within the framework of the contemporary social order, and although they protested against discrimination of the unequal funding of education, they protested from an elite rather than from a working class or oppressed racial position. Indeed, in the first few decades of its existence, their political rhetoric was loaded with references to the distinction between themselves and the Indian underclasses. They not only
accepted the inequalities between merchant class and the working class, but legitimised them by offsetting the commercial elite as the "respectable members of the Indian community" (Swan 1990: 184). In the editorial of the Silver Jubilee Brochure (1950: 02), A.D. Lazarus, the President of NITS notes that the lack of discipline shown by working class parents over their children had strongly contributed to the "decline in the moral fibre of the community". In analysing the underlying cause for this distinction among social classes, Bonacich (1980: 213) suggests that organisations with a strong component of Indians of passenger descent will be prone to making social class distinctions. Freund (1991: 429) points out that Indian teachers not only strongly identified themselves with political organisations such as the NIC and Transvaal Indian Congress (TIC) but also with the commercial elite. Many teachers belonged to a family network which owned commercial enterprises.

Swan (1982: 270) asserts that for much of the period until 1940, Indian politics in South Africa, was dominated by moderate organisations such as the NIC and the TIC. Early Indian politics in Natal and the Transvaal were crucially shaped by the social and economic stratification of the Indian population, and that these policies were dominated by merchants and traders and later western educated white collar workers who sought to maintain their
relatively privileged position in the economic hierarchy. Swan (1990: 182) argues that these organisations paid little heed to the underclasses, unless as an opportunistic ploy to safeguard merchant interests. Given the generalised anti-Indian hostility which had begun to escalate from 1885 (see par 4.4.), the commercial elite fought stubbornly to protect their commercial interests by attempting to distinguish and distance themselves from the working class Indians. The politics of these organisations did not attempt to unify the Indian community, but were directed specifically towards attaining White recognition of the fundamental differences between the two major social groups in the Indian community, namely, merchants and workers.

The record reveals that the NITS did not actively challenge and resist the hegemony of the State. The Society seemed to be more preoccupied with parochial matters such as securing school accommodation and struggling for better salaries for its teachers (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 36-39). The record suggests that the Society's parochial attitude could have been strongly influenced by the moderate NIC and TIC. The Secretary of the TIC, S. Nana (1933-1943) in a functionalist argument cautioned the NITS when he stated: "Above all devote your energies to the development of education and social service - they are even more important than the political struggle" (UDW
Documentation Centre 1440/8071. Bhana (1997: 34) displays a whole host of adverse legislation which the Society could have strongly contested. Political issues such as the revoking of trade licences, immigration restrictions, and general segregation were predominant in the 1920's. After the emergence of the Pact government in 1924, the State appeared deliberately intent on making it clear to the Indians, through racist legislation, that their lives would be made intolerable if they chose to remain in South Africa. Bhana (1997: 35) points to two bills, in particular, namely the Class Areas Bill of 1924 and the Areas Reservation Bill of 1925 which threatened residential and trade segregation of Indians. The Colour Bar Act of 1926 also affected Indians adversely as it excluded them from most categories of skilled and semi-skilled work in the mines. On the local and provincial levels too, discriminatory laws rapidly made their appearance. Natal, for example, took away the municipal franchise from Indians in 1924.

This parochial interest is typically amplified by Lazarus when he points out that the main cause of illiteracy, juvenile delinquency, and vagrancy was the lack of school accommodation and facilities for Indian children. He adds that to seek recriminations against the State would not help to resolve the social and education problems (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 02). Shapiro (1981: 105) asserts
that this liberal analysis of education has tended, largely, to focus on facilities and figures. Thus, Lazarus largely ignored the root causes of the problems as being political, anti-Indianism or oppressive legislation, but he categorically states that "a strong determination from every quarter to raise more schools" will bring about a solution (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 02).

Swan (1990: 187) suggests that since education was central to the elite Indians' social and political aspirations, leaders of NITS were amongst the community's most noted intellectuals and as mentioned the Society was at the heart of the Indian bourgeoisie attempts to delineate its identity, interests and goals. Thus, the way in which the NITS operated as an organisation and its relationship with the wider society were mediated through its broad philosophy of education and its perception of the social role of the teacher.

The Society attached an aura of sanctity to teaching. It described teaching as the noblest of professions. Education became essential for social mobility. In its attempt to deflect discontent and depoliticise social distress from especially the working class, the NITS portrayed the teacher and the teaching profession as the main custodian of the welfare and morality of the Indian community (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 10). Larson
(Dougherty 1980: 162) considers this view as a typical functionalist argument, whereby professions see themselves acting as bulwarks against the moral disorder of society and as engines of peaceful social change (see par 6.6.). Moore (1995: 108) argues that this functionalist ideology, whereby the responsibility of promoting education was fanatically defended by teacher organisations and parents ensured that they would make sacrifices to ensure the survival of their children and ultimately the community. However, Moore (1995: 109) points out that this middle class fixation on "defending the provision of education" also had the effect of making it difficult for the NITS to effectively resist the harsh legislation of the State through possible industrial strike action.

Thus by allocating education a superior status in an 'inferior' political climate the Society was largely responsible for reinforcing the liberal myth of social mobility. Shapiro (1981: 105) explains that the myth of social mobility asserts that any pupil can achieve success with the greatest effort, and, conversely, those pupils who did not achieve success had only themselves to blame. This myth served as an ideological element which shifted the emphasis of inequality from structures to individuals. It suggests that the changes needed are at the level of the individual and transforms what are objective structural chances of social mobility, such as educational facilities
and qualified teachers, into internalised subjective expectations. A working class child does not usually "expect" to become a professional. It is assumed that this is a free choice, and that if he or she wanted to become a doctor or lawyer, the educational system would provide him or her with the same opportunity for acquiring the necessary qualifications as it provides for White middle class children. However, this egalitarian objective is based on the false assumption that in a class stratified society there can be equality of opportunity in the schools. This liberal viewpoint does not recognise that the very form of education (see par 5.4.1.), circumvents such lack of credibility and serves to integrate the child into the hierarchical, authoritarian structure of a typical work situation in an industrial society. Among the Indian working class in South Africa, the ideology that education was the key to a better life became firmly entrenched through the intervention of professionally orientated teacher organisations like the NITS.

The South African State also played a vital role in limiting any resistance offered by NITS by promoting an accommodationist approach. For Gramsci (Giroux 1983a: 275) the State purposefully promotes this harmonious relationship with which the ruling class not only justifies and maintains its dominance, but manages to win the active consent of those over whom it rules. Cross (1992: 14)
contends that the Society operated within the pre-existing oppressive system and did not challenge the system as it knew the chances of rejecting the system successfully were limited or hopeless. They, therefore, favoured the accommodationist policy advocated by liberalism as realistic and more in line with their petty bourgeoisie interests.

This consensus approach is typified by the President of the Society, G.V. Naidoo, who stated in 1935 that he was pleased to see advances in Indian education. He attributed this progress in education solely to the work of the Department of Education (UDW Documentation Centre 1401/8950). Later, Lazarus shows immense gratitude to the NPA for their considerable contribution to Indian education, by stating: "It goes without saying that, without the financial support of the Administration and the sympathy and vision of the many respected officers charged with the management and administration of education the successful progress of Indian education would come to a halt" (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 03).

Althusser (1972: 241) shows that ideology has a material existence in the design and layout of schools. This material aspect of ideology is clearly seen, for example, in the architecture of school buildings, with their separate rooms, offices, and recreational areas, each
positing and reinforcing an aspect of the social division of labour. Space is arranged accordingly for the administrative staff, teachers, secretaries, and students within the school building. On a number of occasions the Society, particularly, praised the design of new school buildings without critically commenting on its ideological implications (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 04).

Moore (1995: 21) points out that the absolute face of power, which all authoritarian societies seek, is the manipulation of wishes. Here the subordinate group's demands are manipulated so that they actually want what is in the dominant group's interests. This hegemony or false consciousness, is the most powerful and invisible form of power. In the 1940's instead of protesting for the erection of more schools, the NITS agreed with the NPA to establish a platoon school system for Indian children (Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 16). In this system the school day was divided into two sessions, namely, morning sessions and afternoon sessions. Each session had its own number of pupils, own staff and even its own principal, operating on the same premises. Both groups received a minimum of four hours instruction daily. While this platoon system provided schooling for thousands of children, it was a retrogressive step in Indian education. The NITS failed to realise the implications of such a cheap, poor quality platoon school system. A principal of
a platoon school, later reported to the Director of Education that parents tried everything possible to obtain admission for their children in the morning school, hence a disproportionate large number of pupils applied for the morning school instead of the afternoon school. Also, the lives of the children were endangered, because the traffic was particularly heavy at peak hours and that for children who lived some distance away from school it became dark before they reached home during the winter months (Bechoo 1961: 13).

The State also limited dissent by making promises for increased funding of education. Inspite of undertakings for greater provision of educational facilities which were given under the Cape Town Agreement of 1927 by the State, Indian Education still remained in a precarious position (A Review of Indian Education and the Organised Profession 1992: 09). Lazarus (1966b: 20) supports this notion by showing that in the 1930's less than half of the children in the primary school range were at school, so that while thousands of children received just enough education to render them semi-literate, there were thousands more who grew up in complete illiteracy and ignorance in the absence of formal education.

While the NITS perceived itself to be a professional body and functioned to promote the ideology of professionalism
among teachers, in reality its resources and activities were not directed towards this task. At best the Society was successful in motivating teachers to improve their qualifications from the "inferior" Indian Teachers' Senior Certificate to a university teaching degree which was attainable from 1931 onwards. The Society had not yet articulated the ideology of professionalism (see par 6.6.) (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 16).

5.4. The Hegemony of Capitalism

5.4.1. A Segregated Education System

Cross & Chisholm (1990: 47-48) asserts that by the 1920's, the ideas of "scientific racism" and social Darwinism which constituted the bases of segregationist ideology in South Africa, were reformulated to accommodate the concept of culture (see par 4.6.1.). The revised concept rejected assimilation as an anti-cultural development yet it permitted racial upliftment and ethnocultural identity. As a consequence, education aims and structures had to be redefined according to ethnic and cultural diversity. The accompanying ideological shifts were initially reflected by severe criticisms of mission education. The most common criticisms charged the Victorian concept of mission education of attempting to civilise and raise Blacks on the shoulders of the White man
in a westernised environment and for educating them to participate in an economic and social life from which they were barred.

However, while culture was used as a basis for racial segregationist ideology, it does not explain the need for such ideology. Marks & Trapido (1990: 08) point to the inherent nature of capitalism, with its expanding mining and industrial sectors. The policy of racial segregation as an all-embracing strategy was assumed and reconstituted as a necessary ideological base for capitalist development in South Africa.

The roots of segregation took hold as early as 1894. During the debate of an Education Bill the attitude of some Whites towards Indian Education was reflected in a speech made by the Minister of Education: If you educate the Indian and he competes with the children of the White people, and passes them, then you cannot keep those higher offices closed against him. He is brought up beyond labour; he is in a sphere in which he has no occupation; he is an educated man - you are breeding at public expense a lot of agitators who want their rights... (Lazarus 1966a: 23).

Cross (1992: 148) argues that the class struggle in the gold fields, where the White working class claimed rights on the grounds of colour, together with the increasing threat from the poverty-stricken Whites determined a racially inspired response by the State and by capital. Tactics of co-option were adopted to silence the growing
militancy of White labour, and this led to class polarisation, with White workers gradually manifesting a racial identity with dominant forces. Thus the State supported Whites in their competition with Blacks for both skilled and unskilled positions. Destitute Whites were given the better positions in the labour market. Blacks, including Indians and Coloureds, were segregated in order to minimise the potential threat they presented for Whites in the labour market. They had to also conform to the pattern and needs of capital accumulation.

Cross (1992: 148) declares that in the course of the first two decades of the 20th century, the ideology of segregation was successfully extended to the field of education. The education system throughout the Union of South Africa was fragmented in its structures into four separate, hierarchically different schooling systems, namely, Bantu, Indian and Coloured and White education. Segregated curricula were established, which would eventually preserve and promote cultural differences, enhance 'national', and 'racial' identities, shape the ethnic consciousness of minority groups such as Coloureds and Indians and prevent interracial class solidarity.

Marks and Trapido (1990: 07) asserts that within this segregated framework, Black education functioned to satisfy the capitalistic need for more productive cheap, Black
unskilled labour, while simultaneously safeguarding the monopoly of the White working class in the skilled and semi-skilled labour market. Thus, Blacks were not only compelled to submit to an inferior form of education designed to fit them into subordinate positions in the racially organised division of labour, but they had to conform to the developing forms of domination. Cross (1992: 59) points out that the White working class were nurtured with higher levels of academic knowledge and skills which enabled them to be upwardly mobile, while the Blacks were provided with only those skills that could turn them into a more productive labour force. The State's educational strategy of concentrating the curriculum for Black schools on industrial or manual training appealed to the educational thinking of the NITS.

The Society increasingly emphasised the need for industrial and technical education. Under the guise of an ethnic argument the Society contended that technical training was essential to bring out the latent abilities of Indians who were natural craftsmen. Subsequently, the Society suggested that schools should also offer its facilities for technical training (UDW Documentation Centre 1440/8071). In 1929 representations which were made by the NITS to the Minister of Education and the Principal of the Natal Technical College, led to the introduction of Technical Education for the Indian community. An Indian Technical
Education Committee comprising members from the Society and the NIC continued with negotiations over the need for technical education. In 1939 the Committee led a successful deputation to the Department of Education to upgrade the education of Indian boys under sixteen years who had not passed standard four but desired to further their education in the technical field (UDW Documentation Centre 1401/8950). Shapiro (1981: 105) contends that instead of promoting education which encouraged critical reflection on social issues, the NITS focused on technicist education which mirrored the needs of the dominant class for maintaining, ideologically, the material subordination of the masses.

Marks & Trapido (1990: 07) notes that through segregated structures, the White working class was increasingly incorporated into a White State both politically and ideologically in order to mute conflict between capital and labour, as well as to reduce social and cultural conflict between Afrikaans-speakers and English-speakers. Swan (1982: 45) further shows that the doctrine of segregation did not only satisfy the needs of the mining industry, but it also provided opportunities for those Africans concerned to restore 'traditional' authority, and for those ethnicised middle class professional Indians anxious to protect themselves against being reduced to the status of Africans. Marks & Trapido (1990: 08) point that for the
ruling class segregation was an attractive solution to the problems posed by a developing capitalist economy, a modernising State and the social dislocation caused by war. In particular, it was able to deal with the rapid proletarianisation of poor Whites and poor Blacks with its increased possibilities of competition, conflict and unified class struggle. Segregated education structures became a more effective and necessary mechanism of social control and stability than repressive State institutions.

The record reveals that the NITS offered no significant resistance to the overall policy of segregation, but under the guise of liberalism it politely petitioned the State for a unified education system. The Society demanded the recognition of individuals based on civilisation rather than race and expressed the desire to transcend repressive policies that allowed no expression of Indian grievances (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 14). Cross (1992: 45) contends that given the pre-existing political and economic constraints, liberalism appeared to be the most realistic and attractive political strategy for the Indian intelligentsia.

5.4.2. A Working Class Ethos

Sarup (1979: 161) declares that the underlying logic of
the State is vested in its role of performing the task of establishing the conditions for the accumulation of capital. In other words, the State has the task of meeting the basic needs of capital by providing, for instance, the necessary flow of workers, knowledge, skills and values for the reproduction of labour power. The NITS echoed these needs of the State and capitalism by mainly promoting and sustaining a working class ethos.

The Society felt that educational policy should correspond with economic policy, and provide the necessary vocational and technical training to all those who could profit by such training. For the Society, equal educational opportunity was intimately related to the economic welfare of the individual and the nation. Therefore, the Society maintained that the equalisation of educational opportunities should receive maximum priority in order to enable the economically disadvantaged section of the population to compete with the more economically advanced group (Cooppan 1958: 11).

The supply of workers for industries, businesses and even agriculture became the dominating motive among the leadership of the Society. This emphasis on vocationalism signified a drastic shift among the executive of NITS from their contradictory elitist position. At its annual conferences the Society made a direct appeal to the South
African industrialists and businessmen to employ Indian labour. It maintained that racial discrimination and profitability were mutually repelling ideas (Diamond Jubilee Brochure 1985: 06). In substantiating the above viewpoint, in 1935 the leader of the Society, G.V. Naidoo remarked: *We Indians are for the most part either agriculturalists or artisans, and to these occupations, generations of our children will return when they leave school. Yet how many of them with our present facilities can go back to their fathers in the fields and teach them how to profitably increase the yield per acre of ground, or how best to make a chair or any other article. These factors I feel ought to become more a part of the consciousness of every teacher* (UDW Documentation Centre 1401/8950). The Society urged the Natal Education Department (NED) to provide facilities for instruction and training in agriculture for Indian students (UDW, Documentation Centre 1401/8952). In July 1936, the Society readily acknowledged and accepted the introduction of the subject Agricultural Science into the curriculum for Indians (UDW Documentation Centre 1401/8995).

The Society unusually devoted much of its time and resources towards an annual Arts and Crafts Exhibition in its quest to satisfy the needs of the capitalistic motive. While the exhibition, superficially, exposed the artistic talent in the Indian community and promoted the development of skills among pupils, it unconsciously and falsely, in a significant way afforded a high status to manual work. Indian youth became socialised into accepting manual work and craftwork as the norm in their future careers (UDW
Documentation Centre 1440/8071). Bowles & Gintis (1988: 23) point out that these educators draw on the literature and philosophy of industrial production to mould educational thought into forms favourable to the needs of capital accumulation and reproduction of the subservient position of workers.

Even in its perennial desire to establish school accommodation, the Society resorted to an argument that increased facilities would empower the working class. The Indian Education Committee (see par 5.5.3.), which the NITS was aligned to, claimed that the lack of educational facilities for Indian children had a very serious bearing upon their chances of earning a decent livelihood, of obtaining and retaining employment, and upon industrial efficiency (Lalla 1957: 15-16). The Society pointed out that if the Indian community was to maintain and extend its supply of workers, then denying pupils education would not help achieve this objective. While the Society openly admitted that both primary and secondary educational facilities were important, the Society prolonged the case for secondary education (Lalla 1955: 03). The Society empathised with the State, that a dramatic increase in education facilities would have meant a rapid increase in the literacy rate thus increasing the numbers in the elite and middle class groups and this would have contradicted the expectations of capitalists who wanted a large working
class. Hence the case for the full provision of schools for secondary education, were withheld for as long as possible, well after the 1950's (Diamond Jubilee Brochure 1985: 23).

In its desire for a better education for Indians, the Society equated the quality of education with capitalistic economic growth. The Indian Education Committee urged the NPA to take a more serious view of the education of Indian youth. The Committee pointed out that against the ageing White population of Natal it was the youthful Indians who were going to provide the manpower needs for the industrial development of Natal. Hence, for the Committee investment in the education of Indian youth was an investment in the economic development of Natal. The Society contended that both Indians and Whites would stand to benefit from this economic development (Lalla 1957: 15-16). In a way the Society became seriously concerned about racial conflict and racial discrimination, not because it was an oppressive ideology against the Black masses, but because it served as an obstacle to the economic empowerment of Indians. Thus it is easy to understand why the Society spoke out against legislation which stifled worker empowerment. It showed its dissent at the educational requirements of the Apprenticeship Act, under which the prejudices of White employers were used to block the acquisition of prized craftskills by Indians.
Freund (1995: 46) suggests that as a result of the Apprenticeship Act, Indians were rarely able to secure apprenticeships. In this regard Freund (1995: 47) cites the case of an Indian building contractor who was unable to register his own workers as apprentices in the late 1920's. The NITS strongly identified with the State's policies which were firmly committed to maintaining the underlying economic and ideological structures of capitalist society. In particular the Society favoured the creation and sustenance of an Indian working class (UDW Documentation Centre 1440/8071).

5.5. The Contradiction of Socialism: The Influence of the Labour Movement on Teacher Organisations

5.5.1. The Emergence of the Labour Movement

The basic underlying contradiction of a capitalist economy is that the accumulation of capital and the widening of capitalist control over production actually undermine the reproduction of the capitalist order by inevitably creating a growing proletariat. Padayachee et al (1985: 40; 47) show that it was from these ranks of mainly semi-skilled and unskilled proletarianised workers, that the new industrial unions emerged in the 1930's and 1940's. An
important factor which contributed to the growth of trade unions was the extremely inadequate wage rates which were paid to these unskilled workers.

Cross (1992: 143) also points out that as in many other processes of industrialisation, the industrial revolution in South Africa was not only an economic process but also a social and political process. Cross (1992: 144) maintains that as society became integrated, new alliances and solidarities, which cut across especially traditional African tribal divisions, began to emerge. This process gave birth to African nationalism which in turn gave impetus to the radicalisation of the labour movement during this period.

Ginwala (1974: 414) suggests that in the Indian community, political thought also influenced the labour movement. By 1939, dissatisfaction with the conservative Indian politics of the time, resulted in a new and radical offshoot of the NIC, the Natal Indian Association (NIA), which was formed under the influence of the CPSA. The NIA contended that mass struggle was the only effective weapon to combat the repressive measures of the State. Ginwala (1974: 416) asserts that the NIA's greatest radical influence was its promotion of working class consciousness. Marie (1986: 64) shows that a reciprocal process occurred where trade unionists who were dissatisfied with the aims
and methods of political organisations, such as the NIC, entered the political arena and sought to influence events there. Marie (1986: 65) adds that many of the key trade unionists of this time were also members of political organisations, like the NIA.

Freire & Shor (1987: 112) suggest that the issue of working class empowerment involves how this class through its own experiences and its own construction of culture, engages itself in getting political power. This makes empowerment more than an individual or psychological event. It points to a political process by the dominated classes who seek their own freedom from domination, a long historical process where education is one of the terrains on which this battle is fought. Davenport (1992: 337) suggests that the growth of the labour movement was also fuelled due to the rejection by the working class of a separate educational system for Black people. It was a resistance to a differential syllabus for Blacks, designed to prepare them for their special place in society, and to the emphasis on the use of the vernacular medium so as to anchor the Black child in his or her own culture. Workers also rejected the special emphasis placed on manual training, which provided an avenue for Black employment in a White-controlled economy (see par 5.4.1.).

For the Indian community, socio-economic problems such as
unemployment and poverty were significant factors in arousing worker consciousness and in effecting a drift towards unionism. The 1941 annual report of the Protector of Indian immigrants, noted that the number of unemployed amongst the Indian population was large and there were many cases of destitution amongst them. Unemployment among the pupils who left school was also becoming an increasing problem (Report of the Protector of Indian Immigrants, 1941). Padayachee et al (1985: 43) direct us to the enormity of this problem, by indicating that in 1944, 70 percent of Indians in Durban lived below the poverty line compared with 5 percent of Whites and 25 percent of Africans.

Ginwala (1974: 415) shows that by the late 1930's the CPSA had demonstrated a considerable influence amongst the Indian working class of Natal, especially in the techniques of trade union organisation. Marie (1986: 83-84) cites prominent union activists, such as R.D. Naidu, H.A. Naidoo and M.I. Timol who had been strongly influenced by the CPSA. R.D. Naidu, for instance joined the CPSA in 1939 and subsequently became more involved in union activity by organising picket lines and serving on strike committees.

However, Padayachee et al (1985: 150) argue that full actualization of working class consciousness did not materialise because Indians had just entered industrial
occupations after emerging from a background of indentured labour, without the benefit of a long standing trade union or a working class tradition. They were poorly educated, largely illiterate, and carried with them traditional and religious beliefs (cf par 4.4.). Freund (1995: 60) claims that at the same time, Indian politicians sought to turn workers into political clients through the normalisation of ethnic identity, even though this identity was presented in terms of an anti-State and radical discourse. Radical petty bourgeoisie activists convinced trade unionists that militant anti-racist protest which concentrated on issues such as residential segregation rather than class issues, was the way forward. The radicalised NIA was the umbrella under which this strategy operated. Freund (1995: 61) also, admits that Indian workers at times benefitted from effective intervention in their struggles by the Indian High Commission and the NIC, under the rubric of support in the provision of jobs for Indians. The radicals were also reluctant to make enemies of the Indian bourgeoisie whom they felt could be brought into agreement on major issues. These radicals realised that the Indian elite, with resources, were potentially valuable and were therefore not to be disregarded. However, Padayachee et al (1985: 156) concede to the idea that there was indeed a distinct shift in the predominantly accommodationist, merchant-dominated class politics of the pre-1935 period to more militant, aggressive and less
accommodationist politics of the post-1935 period.

5.5.2. The Radicalisation of Teacher Organisations

Middle class politics has an unshakable tendency to follow the ebb and flow of the struggle between the two fundamental classes of the bourgeoisie and the workers in capitalistic society. Vilardo (1992: 03) points out that not surprisingly, then, the late 1930's and 1940's have been identified as a period of uncharacteristic radicalism on the part of Black teachers.

Vilardo (1992: 04) argues that this radicalisation of teachers corresponded with an intensification of the class struggle which was brought on by major transformations in South African class relations during this period. Stadler (1987: 59) suggests that the spectacular growth of the manufacturing sector contributed to unprecedented levels of urbanisation and proletarianisation, and was accompanied by a resurgence in trade unionism and a wave of working class militancy which were centred around the issues of housing, transportation, and schooling. One teacher in the 1940's attributed teacher radicalism to the fact that teachers "worked closely with the trade unions" on educational and community matters and therefore could not escape the issues of class and politics. Hyslop (1986: 92) notes that the rise of urban working class struggles began during the
1940's, and the new political idea of African nationalist activism which was reflected in the rise of the African National Congress Youth League (ANCYL), began to have a fundamental effect in changing teacher politics. During this period many teachers who entered the profession, became influenced by the ANCYL, and they subsequently sought to change the identity of teacher organisations.

Hyslop (1986: 93) notes that in the Transvaal this radicalism was reflected from 1949 onwards when the leadership of the Transvaal African Teachers' Association (TATA) became dominated by a group of urban radicals, such as Zeph Mothopeng who later became a Pan Africanist Congress (PAC) leader. During the same year, when the Eiselen Commission report, which laid down the blueprint for segregated education was published, the radicalised TATA leaders perceived the report's political implications and launched an energetic campaign of meetings across the province to denounce Eiselen's recommendations.

Freund (1995: 51) contends that simultaneous with this phase of industrialisation there occurred a revolution in Indian political life in Natal. Between 1939 and 1945 young radical members challenged the leadership of the NIC in a complex series of manoeuvres that Swan (1990: 182) has called a "continuous process of amalgamation, dissolution and re-amalgamation". Swan (1990: 204)
points to the pivotal role of the Indian middle class, petty bourgeoisie, in the process of radicalisation in the late 1930’s and 1940’s. Their temporary realignment of loyalties away from big traders and towards the Indian working class proved to be crucially important, as their intervention made possible the partial realisation of the potential of radical ideology. In a stimulating but brief discussion, Swan (1990: 182-184) notes that this process of radicalisation was accompanied by the rise of professional people, of more modest class backgrounds, antagonistic to the merchant class which had assumed political leadership and monopolised it in pursuing narrow business interests of their own (see par 5.3.). The key figures in this process were members of the CPSA. Paradoxically, while radicalisation was powerfully influenced by nationalist politics in India, and in the early phase was actually called the National Bloc in tribute to this influence, it represented a deeper engagement with, and commitment to, assimilation into South African society. Swan (1990: 183) follows Ginwala (1974: 414) in recognising the importance of radical trade unionism in changing the nature of Indian politics and influencing the Indian middle class towards radicalisation during this period.

With South Africa’s entry into World War II in 1939, there was a sharp rise in living costs, and teachers, among
others, were seriously affected by the resulting high inflation. A split within the ranks of the Indian teaching fraternity was inevitable when only teachers in State employ were considered for a cost-of-living allowance to off-set or contain, to some degree, the high degree of inflation in the economy of the country. Teachers who were employed at State-Aided schools were denied this allowance. About 45 percent of these teachers received a meagre five pounds per month. They were also denied sick leave and long leave privileges, and were excluded from the benefits of a provident fund or pension scheme. Thus amidst this radicalised atmosphere and a stagnating economy, it becomes easy to understand the emergence of teacher unions (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 38).

The need for a separate organisation for teachers in State-Aided schools was further stimulated by the ineffective representations of the professionally orientated NITS for teachers in these schools. This ineffectiveness was also the result of the great disparity in the status, salaries and conditions of service between the two groups of teachers. This suggests that it would have been easier for the teachers in State-Aided schools to identify with the labour movement than teachers in State schools who were relatively better paid and enjoyed better conditions of work.
On 20 February 1941, at a meeting of the Executive Committee of the NITS, S. Panday expressed the desire for a new approach to redress the peculiar grievances of the teachers in State-Aided schools. This was followed by a special general meeting of the Society, at which Panday advocated the formation of a trade union as a separate mouth-piece of teachers in State-Aided schools (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 38). The proposal that teachers at State-Aided schools should break away from the NITS to form a workers Union also gained increasing support at Branch level. This apparatus of decentralised decision-making gave impetus to the proposition for unionism among teachers. In the Pietermaritzburg Branch, D.R. Singh who led the dissident group, chaired many meetings which were attended by supporters of unionism. Subsequently, in 1942, the Natal Teachers' Union (NTU) was formed.

Notwithstanding the fact that there was meaningful rapport between the members of the Union and of the Society, and much support from NITS for the union movement, the existence of two groups had unconsciously created tension between the two groups of teachers, resulting in the weakening of solidarity among teachers (Golden Jubilee Brochure 1979: 16). Nevertheless, under the guidance of a radicalised leadership the NTU began to challenge the status quo. I.C. Meer who served as the Secretary of the NTU was a bright and energetic man and was a member of the NIC as well as the CPSA. Members like him played an
important role in shaping the NTU towards a radical direction. Meer, who studied as a law student with Nelson Mandela at the University of Witwatersrand was noted as a radical student and later, used his legal and editorial skills to promote the national liberation movement. Bhana (1997: 63) even suggests that the alliance of the NIC and ANC which came to fruition in the early 1950’s was at least in part attributable to the vision articulated by Meer (see par 5.5.6.).

Under this radical leadership, the first step taken by the Union was the submission of its demands to the school managers and the NPA for improved salary scales and conditions of service. However, the NPA refused to recognise the NTU and this created a climate for confrontation. Not unexpectedly, the strongly motivated and militant NTU challenged the NPA to define the status of the State-Aided school teacher. Owing to the failure on the part of the school managers and the NPA to meet the Union’s demands, the Union then applied to the Minister of Labour for a Conciliation Board hearing in terms of the Industrial Conciliation Act of 1924. Pampallis (1991: 123) maintains that this Act established a set of bureaucratic structures and procedures which were aimed at settling disputes and preventing strikes by workers (see par 5.5.7.). The application by the NTU had far reaching effects. The Divisional Inspector of Labour, representing
the Minister of Labour, informed the Union of the difficulty in granting a hearing owing to uncertainty as to who were the responsible employers of the teachers in State-Aided schools. The NPA fearing an impending strike action by teachers then decided to take over as employer of State-Aided school teachers. Sarup (1979: 162) sees the role of the State in these processes as an ideological one, as its power had been used to promote stability and order, needed for the development of capitalism. However, Sarup (1979: 159) notes the State only intervenes when poverty and insecurity become serious so as to threaten the social order. Marie (1986: 73) views this action of the State as intending to dilute any arguments for revolutionary action from the working class. Thus ended the long struggle for the removal of disparities in the salary and conditions of service between the two groups of teachers (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 38).

5.5.3. The Influence of the Labour Movement on the Natal Indian Teachers’ Society

As a result of a radicalised labour movement, greater worker consciousness and the breakaway formation of the NTU there was a simultaneous increase in the intensity over which the NITS fought its struggles. However, like in the pre-1935 period, these struggles still remained parochial, as they were confined to issues of free education, the
acquisition of more schools and the remuneration of teachers.

As a result of prolonged and intense negotiations on the part of the Society, a scheme for the gradual extension of free education was put into operation by the NPA in 1942. Consequently, all children up to and including standard seven received free tuition. The Society also acknowledged the intention of the Department of Education to extend free education to standard ten. However, pupils still had to provide their own textbooks. The Society campaigned vigorously for the provision of free textbooks and stationery for all children. Later, the Department of Education eventually agreed to provide textbooks and stationery to indigent children, albeit in State schools only. The remission of fees in Indian schools therefore denoted a definite degree of progress by the Society in its efforts to procure free education for the Indian child. One important result of the remission of fees was a lengthening of the school life expectancy of the Indian child which, up to 1942, was low (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 34).

On 15 September 1951 in a somewhat socialistic move, NITS together with labour represented by the South African Trade and Labour Council pioneered the founding of the Natal Indian School Building Trust Fund (NISBTF).
The Trust appealed to the Indian community of Natal for funds to alleviate the crisis situation in education. The appeal was also directed to Indian teachers who were asked to give up one or more of their annual increments in favour of the Trust. Pupils at schools were encouraged to buy building fund stamps and this proved a popular and successful venture. By the mid-1950's the Society had contributed 20,000 pounds to assist the school building programme. The Director of Education, L.J.T. Biebuyck (1962: 42-43) commented on the significance of the Trust fund, declared:

...if it had not been for these contributions and the resultant growth in the number of State-Aided Indian schools, we should never have been able to advance as far as we have done in reducing to such small proportions the number of children unable to secure admissions to schools.

Whereas in the earlier period the provision of schools was in opposition to the needs of capitalism (of par 5.4.2.), Sarup (1979: 163) argues that as the nature of tasks in the industries became more complex, it was in the interests of capitalism to acquire greater numbers of skilled workers. Illiteracy became incompatible to the needs of capitalism. Hence, providing more schools so that children could acquire the necessary attitudes and skills which would allow them to become the next generation of workers was in accordance with the needs of capital. In a defiant disposition the Society now openly blamed the State for the social degradation of the Indian masses by refusing to provide them with educational facilities (Silver Jubilee
In 1953 the Indian Education Committee, consisting of the NITS and the radicalised NIC was established in order to deal with the urgent problem of school accommodation. Upon its inception, the Committee met the NPA and the Director of Education and persuaded them to draw up a definite plan to accommodate all Indian children in suitable schools within five years (Cooppan 1955: 10). Many pupils in the six to seven year age group were refused admission to schools. The Committee advised that this age group should be given priority so as to stabilise the system and to prepare the ground for compulsory education (Cooppan 1955: 10). This plan envisaged the admission of only six and seven year old children into the normal school at the beginning of each year and the transfer of the older children to platoon schools (Lalla 1957: 15-16). After considerable thought this "age-priorities" plan was accepted by the Department of Education (Pather 1958: 25).

5.5.4. The Struggle over Salaries

On 1 July 1936 in his address to the Society’s eleventh annual conference G.V. Naidoo declared that since 1929 the salary of Indian teachers had only been once revised. Naidoo noted that the status of the Indian teacher had
been consistently reduced by low salaries. He pointed that about 30 percent of teachers were earning only five pounds a month without the prospect of even a meagre increase. Naidoo also contended that many of the teachers were the breadwinners of large extended families (UDW Documentation Centre 1440/8071; TASA News, April 1981: 06). While Naidoo uses a functionalist argument to justify higher salaries for teachers, that is, higher salaries promote a stable family, Carlson (1988: 161) on the other hand, suggests the rationale for low salaries by suggesting that an important aim of capital is to proletarianise workers, that is, to 'cheapen' the cost of their labour. By lowering the skill requirements necessary for work, management is able to buy more labour at a cheaper rate on the market by drawing from among the large pool of workers. Because members of the new middle class were paid employees, along with actual productive workers, they were susceptible to this same logic of proletarianisation.

In June 1943 Lazarus met with Douglas Mitchell, the Administrator of Natal to discuss the issue of parity of salaries. In a militant tone Lazarus stated: I am now, with respect, going to ask a plain blunt question and would appreciate a plain blunt answer... Does this Executive Council of Natal concede to the Indian teacher equality of salary with his European counterpart, all other things being equal? (TASA News, April 1981: 06). Mitchell, with undue vehemence banging the table and raising his voice, responded: "Never! Never! will this
Administration make such a concession". In protest the Society's delegation withdrew from the discussions (TASA News, April 1981: 06).

On 30 June 1943, in a radical move twenty qualified teachers tendered their resignations to the Department of Education because of the inadequate salaries. The teachers indicated that they were no longer prepared to serve under an educational administration whose attitude towards teachers was expressed in its resolution that it would not make "any further alterations to the salaries of Indian teachers". A report in the Leader pointed out that the struggle of the Sastri teachers was the struggle of all Indian teachers and that the Indian community should support the teachers who had tendered their resignations (Leader, 13 May 1944). However, with diplomatic negotiations the Society was able to convince the teachers to withdraw their tendered resignations. The NITS urgently requested the NED to introduce scales of salaries which would give teachers a decent living wage (UDW Documentation Centre 1440/8071). In 1944 the Beardmore Commission was appointed by the State to enquire and make recommendations on the remuneration and conditions of service of White, Coloured and Indian Teachers. The Society was one of the teacher organisations that presented evidence to the commission. Consequently, salaries for teachers were revised in 1945. However, the increase for
Indian teachers was 70 percent of the increase given to White teachers. In June 1947 the Society requested a meeting with the NPA but was unsuccessful. The intense struggle for parity in salary continued with regular representations made by Lazarus to the Director of Education (TASA News, April 1981: 06).

In an effort to gain community support and broaden the struggle for increased salaries, Lazarus also sought to influence the media. The intensity of this influence is reflected in an article which appeared in the Indian Opinion on 5 May 1944. The editor of the Indian based newspaper, commented that if teachers were to impart education and were to follow their calling honestly and sincerely then they had to be satisfied. The editor added that teachers had to be in a position to solely concentrate on teaching alone and not have to seek other avenues to cover the deficit in the household budget. The article claimed that if their energy was divided, then teachers could not do justice to the very responsible work entrusted to them. The article concluded that the Indian teachers' claim for better salaries was quite reasonable and the NPA should consider it favourably in the interests of education (Indian Opinion, 5 May 1944).
5.5.5. The Issue of Gender

Freund (1995: 47) points out that before the depression education was a panacea for economic mobility for only very few poor Indian boys, let alone girls. Woods (1954: 80) notes that prior to the 1940's Indian women had fared particularly badly, half of them having received no education at all. Wolpe (1988: 135) contends that in a patriarchal society the experience of girls in schools is quite irrelevant. Their apparent failure to achieve is attributed to the operation of a patriarchal and hierarchical school organisation system. Not only did limited educational funding and a lack of schools contribute to an insignificant number of girls attending schools, but Tunmer (1970: 106) suggests that the patriarchal attitude of the extended Indian family also contributed to this problem. Tunmer (1970: 107), supported by Goode (1983: 42) maintains that Indian parents purposely kept girls away from schools in order to prevent the disintegration of the extended family unit. The co-education of girls would have facilitated marital relations which would have ultimately promoted a nuclear family unit (see par 4.6.2.).

Wolpe (1988: 136) argues that it was also in the interest of capitalism to keep girls out of schools. The role of the family in the transmission of sets of ideologies is not
only appropriate to the maintenance of a capitalist system but also to the shackling of women to the home so as to perpetuate their conditions of inequality. The family plays a major role in preparing the young for economic and social roles. Like the education system, the family generates and transmits patterns of consciousness and the hierarchical division of labour. Wolpe (1988: 133) claims that the family's impact on the reproduction of the sexual division of labour is distinctly greater than of the educational system. Women adopt this ideology and normally embrace their self-concepts as household workers. This is transmitted to children through sex-role stereotyping of boys and girls. According to Bowles and Gintis (1976: 200) both boys and girls are affected by the ideological inputs they receive but differently, that is, ideological formations are derived from the family situation for girls, but for boys from their schooling.

In a radicalised climate the Society displayed a revolution in attitude towards the education of Indian girls. The Society became deeply concerned about the unsatisfactory position of the education of Indian girls. It noted that there was much prejudice shown by Indian parents who were not eager to send their daughters to co-educational schools. Also, many Indian girls left after completing standards three and four (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 33). The Society was of the opinion that the school fees
was too high and beyond the means of an average Indian parent and that the NPA be requested to effect a substantial reduction in the rate of school fees. Later, the Society became successful in reducing the school fees for girls and it believed that this would encourage Indian parents to send their daughters in increasing numbers to schools (UDW Documentation Centre 1401/8949). The members of the executive of the Society also agreed that a well organised campaign be made for increasing the enrolment of girls in schools (UDW Documentation Centre 1401/8949).

In the 1940's and 1950's the Society organised several events to raise funds to promote various careers for Indian girls. The Director of Education, C.M. Booysen, remarked that he was glad to see that the NITS had interested itself in encouraging Indian girls to pursue careers (Naidoo 1951a: 14). The Society also voiced its concern for the menial jobs that Indian women performed. Padayachee et al (1985: 40) show that from the 1950's onwards increasing numbers of Indian women were employed in semi-skilled and unskilled jobs in factories in the greater Durban area. Wolpe (1988: 134) contends that the role of women in the labour force is prescribed through their gender, family formation and class position. Women are destined to remain in their lower earning jobs because they are women. The workplace is the site of dominance of men over women, women
do more menial jobs, earn less money, are almost invariably dominated by men by their subordinate positions and have a greater propensity for being removed to the 'reserve army', that is, unemployed labour.

Many Indian parents chose to send their daughters to a school for girls, rather than to a co-educational school. One of the arguments that was advanced by the Society in favour of co-education was that relationships between boys and girls could occur more naturally. One member of the Society argued: "co-education is based on innate elements of human personality, and social intercourse between boys and girls is freed from unnatural restraints. Co-education is an apprenticeship in collaboration in later life" (Ramphal 1955: 06). The issue of co-education not only created debate and conflict in the Indian community, but this tension was also reflected within the leadership of NITS. Some of the Society's leaders cautioned that it would be unwise for the educational authorities to prescribe a policy of co-education for the Indian community "whose folkways and mores may be unsympathetic to the spirit of it". The Society contended that such a policy could do serious harm by retarding the post-primary education of Indian girls through the reluctance of parents to send their daughters to co-educational high schools. The Society pointed out that such damage would be tragic since it would be difficult, if not impossible, to measure
the extent (Ramphal 1955: 08).

By the late 1950's, Tunmer (1970: 106) notes a change in the attitude of the Indian community towards the education of Indian girls. This was evident from the fact that there was not only an increase in the numbers of girls attending high schools but also that they attended co-educational institutions. The number of girls that enrolled in schools had improved so drastically that there was a lack of accommodation at some schools for girls. Of the 37 secondary schools in Natal, 30 were co-educational and there were 5489 girls enrolled. Although parity had not been achieved between the sexes in the high schools it was on the verge of being attained in the primary schools. The total enrolments of boys and girls in primary schools in 1967 was 61 867 and 57 504 respectively (Pillay 1967: 180-181).

The Society also began to reflect the gender issue in its own organisational structure, albeit to a limited extent. Prior to the 1940's, women were represented as a totally separate unit in the NITS organisation, such as the Ladies Auxiliary. However, by the mid-1940's women like, S.M. Lawrence became involved in significant decision-making processes by serving on the executive council of the NITS (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 32).
5.5.6. The Suppression and Decline of the Labour Movement

The researcher contends that by examining the conditions which were responsible for the suppression and decline of the labour movement, the reasons for the premature demise of the NTU in 1943 would be revealed. At the same time it would also explain the parochial concern of the NITS which failed to broaden its area of struggle by tackling class based issues and displayed ineffective resistance in the political arena.

Padayachee et al (1985: 37; 60) point out that on the labour front many of the industries in which Indian workers were organised, especially in the 1930's and 1940's were characterised by a preponderance of small firms each with a small labour force, a factor which militated against effective class organisation and cohesiveness. For the NTU a small membership of 450 limited its ability to conscientise and empower colleagues on union matters (Silver Jubilee Brochure 1950: 17). Marie (1986: 74) adds that the failure to establish the basis for greater worker participation in union affairs and to develop a shop-floor leadership at an early and crucial stage of unionisation partly explains why many unions collapsed.

Marie (1986: 70) notes that towards the end of 1942 a number of serious strikes occurred in the Transvaal and in
Natal. The adverse consequences of the strikes in the rubber industry, for instance, was the firing of thirteen key Indian union members, the hiring of African labour instead of relatively radical Indian labour (see par 5.5.7.), and the collapse of the Natal Rubber Workers' Union (NRWIU). These counter measures not only stifled non-racial unionism, but also prevented the growth of unions. Thus the response by the employers to this working class resistance created the conditions that led to hostility between Indian and African workers. Having been displaced by African workers, the tendency among Indian workers, thereafter, was towards inward looking trade unions keenly aware of the necessity of protecting selected industries for Indian employment. On the other hand African workers, especially after the downturn in economic activity after the Second World war, began to see the expansion of employment and upward mobility in certain industries and occupations as being blocked by Indian workers. Padayachee et al. (1985: 121-122) argue that these tendencies were complemented and reinforced by the increasing attention that even the radical Indian trade union leadership began to show to the political struggles being waged by the Indian political organisations and the unusual preoccupation of the CPSA with ensuring that working class action did not disrupt the war efforts.
Freund (1995: 57) points out that in the context of the Passive Resistance campaign, initiated by the ANC and supported by the NIC, another such strike took place on 6 June 1953. This campaign, partly inspired by non-violent, anti-colonial resistance in India, was intended to utilise the strike as a means of undermining the authority and legitimacy of the State. It was an important stage in the formation of an anti-apartheid movement and it superficially presented the possibility of non-racial unity in resistance. However, some 300 Indian workers who took part were fined and thrown out of their homes by the State. According to Lambert (Lambert in Freund 1995: 58) these bitter experiences for Indian workers and their families decisively turned Indian workers against political strikes. The idea that the future for Indian workers lay in a common anti-apartheid struggle with the ANC, was abandoned in favour of passivity (cf par 4.4.).

Davenport (1992: 333) notes that on 1 March 1950, the Minister of Justice C.R. Swart introduced a Suppression of Communism Bill in parliament which was designed to grant the Minister very wide powers to deal with communism. This was one of a series of measures over the next few years which, on the plea of national security, ignored the principles of civil liberty on which the public law of South Africa was theoretically grounded. On 20 June 1950, the Parliament of South Africa passed the Suppression of
Communism Act which made the CPSA unlawful and empowered the Minister of Justice to also declare any similar organisations unlawful. It also enabled the Minister to name the office bearers and active supporters of such bodies, and to prohibit named persons from taking part in their activities. He also restricted the movements of certain leaders and prohibited any gatherings which were likely to further the ends of communism. The Act defined communism to mean not only Marxist-Leninism, but also any related form of this doctrine which sought to establish the dictatorship of the proletariat, or to bring about any political, industrial, social or economic change within the South African State by the promotion of disturbances or disorder, or by encouraging hostility between Whites and Non-Whites.

Riley (1991: 20-21) shows that trade unions were among the first groups to be affected by the Suppression of the Communist Act. Marie (1986: 75) points out that from 1950 onwards many capable and energetic local trade unionists, such as G. Ponen, M.P. Naicker and G.G. Naidoo left the country and went into exile overseas. Marie (1986: 76) describes these unionists as the "uncompromising opponents of the repressive policies of the State".
Hyslop (1986: 93) declares that State repression also had a direct impact on teachers. In 1952, Zeph Mothopeng and other radical leaders were fired from their teaching jobs; a clear case of victimisation. This resulted in a well organised school boycott movement in Orlando in the Transvaal. TATA mobilised broad support from teachers for the affected teachers, but brutal police action eventually defeated the boycott, and in 1953 TATA fearing further State reprisals dropped its young radical leaders from the organisation (see par 5.5.2.).

Marie (1986: 76) declares that as a result many unions became dominated by more moderate leadership which followed the path of least resistance, whereby they did not dare to utter a provoking statement or pursue any line of action which might have led to their arrest or listing as enemies of the State. Tunmer (1970: 112) declares that within the Indian community the most determined protest against State repression came from the South African Indian Congress, (SAIC). However, from 1956 onwards many of its leaders had either been arrested or banned under the Communist Act, which resulted in the SAIC losing most of its power. This created a vacuum for the emergence of the conservative South African Indian Organisation (SAIO) which hoped to save as much as possible for Indians through discussion and compromise where necessary. Freund (1995: 77) asserts that the Indian working class was now
gradually becoming incorporated into those structures of South African mid-twentieth-century capitalism which was acknowledged as legitimate by the State and the bourgeoisie world.

According to Cross (1992: 60) the intensification of State repression and the promulgation of the Communism Act did not go without resistance and necessitated a common strategy between the ANC, the ANCYL, the South African Congress of Trade Unions (SACTU) and the CPSA. For this purpose a joint Planning Council was established in May 1950. In the struggle for national freedom, this Council called for active boycotts, strikes, civil disobedience and non-co-operation with the State. Together, all these developments resulted in a favourable atmosphere for the emergence of a defiance campaign of 1953 to 1955.

5.5.7. The Impact of Capitalism on Teacher Unity

The issue of achieving a true non-racial teacher unity was not paramount in the struggles of both the NITS and the NTU. In spite of the NTU being affiliated to a trade union, it did not link up its struggles with the broad working class movement and thus it could not widen its parameters of concern to include non-racial teacher unity (see par 5.5.2.). While Bonacich's (1980: 212)
suggestion that Indian-centred ethnicism could have played a significant role in preventing teacher unity holds true, it does not explain why unity could not be achieved in the comparatively militant period of the 1940’s. In attempting to solve this problematic dilemma, Freund (1995: 51) points to the prevailing capitalistic system for creating tension between the different racial groups. Freund (1995: 52) contends that the teachers’ attempts to form a non-racial collective group was constrained by capital’s determined efforts to impede racial unity and prevent a unified class consciousness from developing in the broader society of South Africa.

Ginwala (1974: 390) points particularly to the earlier Industrial Conciliation Act of 1924 (see par 5.5.2.) and the Wage Act of 1925. The former Act led to an increase in union activity and organisations as Indians saw these acts as opportunities for entering into negotiations with employers in order to improve their wages and working conditions. However, mainly separate Indian unions rather than non-racial unions were formed, partly because many White trade unions refused to accept Indian workers as members. Moore (1995: 108) points out that instead of racial disharmony being a special problem that can be remedied independently of the wider society, the Marxist approach takes the view that along with many other social problems, such as the position of women and continuance of
poverty, racial disharmony is intimately bound up with the economic and social relations of capitalist society. Marx (Marx in Moore 1995: 109) contends that the ruling class creates divisions within the working class to prevent them from not only seeking better conditions and higher wages but it also effectively hinders workers from forming a unified class consciousness.

Marie (1986: 69) notes that with the revival of the economy, during the 1930's and during the years of the second World War, the African presence in the work-force of Durban, increased dramatically. Moreover, Africans began to lay claim to domiciliary rights in the city where previously they had formed an overwhelmingly male transient population. Indian militancy was powered by the pressure that this imposed on Indian workers who were caught between White racism and the African's attempts to secure urban jobs and space.

Adhikari (1993: 68) argues that by stipulating minimum wages in several key industries, the 1925 Wage Act, robbed Indian labour of its one significant advantage over White workers, namely, the ability to undercut the wages of White workers. Freund (1995: 52) contends that Indians were excluded from a job, if the Wage Board could guarantee a relatively high wage for the job. However, the Wage Board could at times come to the rescue of the Indian against the
competition of "low-wage" Africans. Another related difference was the relatively more favourable legal position of the Indian worker compared to the African in terms of the right to organise and to strike. This encouraged the Indians to form effective trade unions on their own, or with Coloureds. African membership could only be registered informally or through parallel sections that had no legal right to strike. For capital, this created a long term temptation to take on non-unionised African workers. As with Whites before them (see par 5.4.1.), Indians were attracted to militancy in response to this threat, precisely because of their structural vulnerability. Furthermore, Indian workers were identified with Communist party activities and more generally with challenges to bosses in the workplace. Many Indian workers were fired by their employers for striking and were replaced with cheaper African labour. Favouring African workers over Indian workers had a real strategic logic for capitalism.

Freund (1995: 53) contends that the fear of African competition persisted throughout the 1930's and 1940's among Indian workers, despite their industrial militancy.

Freund (1992: 13) suggests that these antagonistic feelings between African and Indian labourers permeated the social fabric of both communities. Davenport (1992: 333)
shows that this tension sparked off an incident which triggered the Durban riots of 1949. Hundred and forty two people were killed and over a thousand more injured, after an African youth struck an Indian shop assistant, whose employer in turn beat and inflicted injury on the youth near a crowded bus terminus. The riots exposed the serious tension, which escalated into loosely organised attacks on Indian residential property over a wide area. Also, commercial exploitation by Indian businessmen, who were also disadvantaged through racial discrimination, had provoked African immigrants with even less access to property, market opportunities and jobs.

Edwards and Nuttall (1990:02) have identified the riots as part of a process whereby thousands of these African newcomers to Durban were struggling to seize space in the city. These Africans became irritated at the racism displayed by Indians and at the same time were squeezed by a rapidly shifting economy. Davenport (1992:334) points out that inspite of the riots being a tragic episode, the Black leaders like A.W. Champion, A.B. Zuma, and G.M. Naicker and Y. Dadoo on the Indian side were able to end the conflict between the respective communities. In a new atmosphere the African and Indian began to work cautiously together on a basis of non-violent, non-cooperation with the authorities. This led to the launching of a joint Defiance Campaign in 1952.
Cross (1992: 60) claims that despite capitalism's attempts to create tension between the races, from the mid-1940's onwards, Africans, Coloureds, Indians and progressive Whites developed their ideas towards issues of common concern, particularly the issue of active resistance to apartheid oppression and the struggle for national liberation. Simons & Simons (1969: 10) have claimed that at this point the class struggle had merged with the struggle for national liberation. Members of the CPSA became active in promoting the Congress alliance between the ANC, the SAIC and the South African Coloured People's Organisation in 1954.

It was in this co-operative atmosphere that the idea of teacher unity which was envisaged by the former President of the Society, B.D. Lalla in the militant mid-1940's finally became a reality on 1 November 1958. Ironically, the creation of the South African Federation of Teachers' Association (SAFTA) did not reflect the full racial spectrum, but was limited to Indian and Coloured membership. While Indian membership was drawn from the NITS and the Transvaal Indian Teachers' Association (TITA), the Coloured teachers came from across the four main provinces of South Africa (A Review of Indian Education and the Organised Profession 1992: 09).
Nicholls (1974: 63) strongly suggests that the racial tension created between the African and Indian communities strongly influenced the NITS to unite into a federally constituted teachers' body with Coloured teachers instead of a truly non-racial teacher union. Reeves (1994: 92) argues that a federation of this kind simply entrenched the racial divisions by allowing individual teacher organisations to continue to exist. While SAFTA sought to reach its fraternal African and White teachers with a view to affiliation, it was limited to attending each others conferences and workshops with no real racial integration at its executive level of organisation. Inspite of this serious shortcoming SAFTA was able to give direction in the two communities that it served by increasing the powerbase of teacher organisations. It was able to promote greater teacher unity by influencing the NITS to merge with TITA to form the South African Indian Teachers' Association (SAITA); while in the Coloured community SAFTA was instrumental in uniting the five Coloured teachers' organisations to form the Union of Teachers' Association of South Africa (UTASA).

Nicholls (1974: 64) shows that under a climate of State repression, SAFTA began to devote much of its resources and activities to the development of professionalism among teachers. In so doing, SAFTA consciously ignored the
political and class struggles which were prevalent in South African society. It began to articulate the new and emerging middle class ideology of professionalism (see par 6.6.).
5.6. Resume

The period 1925 to 1958 is depicted by the dialectic of capitalism and socialism; reproduction and resistance; labour and capital.

The tension between the ideologies of capitalism and socialism is strongly reflected during the period of emergence of teacher organisations. The NITS repudiated the idea of becoming incorporated into any socialistic organisation, and at the same time resisted the influence of socialist leaders like, B.L.E. Sigamoney. Against the threat of repatriation of Indians to their mother country, the NITS sought to secure a social and physical infrastructure which would fortify their presence in South Africa. In order to accomplish this task, the Society reinforced ethnicity by engaging itself in cultural activities which were mainly Indian-centred and simultaneously promoted and reinforced middle class values.

The Society advocated middle class liberalism, which was required to support the free market ideology of capitalism. It was this idea of liberalism that conditioned the Society's relationship with the State. Thus, in order to accomplish its goals, the Society resorted to passive action, incorporating such strategies as the adoption of resolutions and peaceful deputations by its leadership.
Together, with the State, the Society promoted a false consciousness, a feeling of normality, a sense of trustworthiness in the State. Hence the Society did not actively challenge the oppressive legislation of the State and the basic capitalist relations of production which sought to entrench the dominance of the White worker. It began to work from an elitist perspective within the framework of the pre-existing social order. In its identification with contemporary Indian politics, which in turn was strongly conditioned by the Indian commercial elite, the NITS subtly distinguished itself from the Indian working class. It was this accommodating and harmonious relationship with the broader community and the State that influenced the NITS to pursue matters of a parochial nature.

During the pre-1935 period, the leadership of NITS relied on a liberal analysis of education which affirmed the notion that acquiring more school accommodation and greater education funding would solve the problems in the political sphere. In its portrayal of the teacher as the moral guardian of the Indian community and in its attempt to promote the idea that education was the key to a better life, amidst discriminatory political legislation, the Society viewed the concept of education from a middle class elitist perspective.
The NITS reinforced the capitalist need for a segregated education system by emphasising the need for technical and industrial training. The origins of segregation in South Africa have been related primarily to the material conditions at the beginning of the 20th century, specifically the attempts to impose a cheap labour policy which would allow capitalists to wrest vast quantities of unskilled and cheap labour from the Black population. Through its creation of a worker ethos, the Society unconsciously fulfilled this desire of capitalism for a large working class.

The post 1935 period marks an ideological shift from an accommodating capitalistic middle class position to a more militant, socialist labour-centred perspective. This ambivalent and dialectic situation placed the middle class teacher in an objectively contradictory position, torn between an identification with capital and with labour.

Industrialisation, urbanisation, the general instability of economic and social conditions, and the influence from political organisations such as the CPSA led directly to the formation of working class labour organisations which would express directly the demands and even the aspirations, however tentative, of this class. Teacher organisations also fell under the influence of the labour
movement. Militant teacher unions did not only emerge in the African community, but through the breakaway of the radical NTU from the NITS, unionism among teachers made its presence felt in the Indian community. Spurred by a militant leadership and the influence of the CPSA, the NTU quickly and effectively won its struggle for better salaries and conditions of service for its members. This heightened consciousness of its members and the Society's alignment with workers also moved the NITS into more intense struggles over issues of school accommodation, salaries and gender related matters.

However, the labour movement did not go unchallenged by the State and capital. For instance the State instituted oppressive legislation such as The Suppression of Communism Act of 1950 to limit union activity. Also, the failure to establish the foundations and traditions of generalised democratic structures in the unions, the absence of a disciplined shop-floor leadership, the lack of adequate worker education programmes, the ease with which union actions and strategies were infused with the middle class politics of Indian political organisations and the ill-defined politics of the CPSA were among the factors which together acted, limited, constrained and repressed the development of a full working class consciousness. Ultimately, these factors led to the dramatic decrease in union activity, which in turn created the conditions for
the demise of the NTU. Capitalism’s determined efforts to create hostility and tension between Africans and Indians in the workplace indirectly curtailed teachers from seeking unity across the racial spectrum. The tension was so great that even when Africans and Indians came together under the co-operative spirit of a joint defiance campaign, against the repressive policies of the State, non-racial teacher unity did not emerge, but was limited to the creation of the professionally orientated, SAFTA, consisting mostly of Coloureds and Indians.

Thus far, the investigation reveals that prior to 1935 the NITS showed signs of reproducing the capitalistic order. However, in the post 1935 period through the influence of labour, the Society and the NTU began to actively resist the dictates of the State and of capitalism.
6.1. Introduction

Sarup (1979: 170) points out that changes in the structure of education are historically associated with changes in the social organisation of production in industries. The fact that changes in the structure of industrial production have preceded parallel changes in schooling, establishes a strong prima facie case for the causal importance of economic structure as a major determinant of change in the educational structure. Sarup (1979: 172) contends that the tension between the accumulation of capital and the reproduction of the capitalist relations of production is the force behind educational change. Padayachee et al. (1985: 40) substantiate this Marxist position by asserting that the structural change in the South African economy after the Second World War was marked by the rapid growth of the manufacturing sector. Pampallis (1991: 231) notes that from 1961 onwards production expanded and foreign capital flowed into the country as profits soared. Padayachee et al. (1985: 40) maintain that this created the basis for an increase in the employment of factory or production workers. Simultaneous with this change in the economy,
there was a change in the labour process, which involved the splitting up of more complex operations, requiring highly skilled manpower into a number of relatively simple tasks undertaken by semi-skilled operatives. It was as semi-skilled operators, in the rapidly expanding secondary industry sector, that large numbers of Indians found employment.

Nkomo (1990: 01) points out that when the National Party (NP) gained power in 1948, it brought about a qualitative change in every aspect of life in South Africa. Through oppressive legislation, such as the Population Registration Act, the Group Areas Act, the Immorality Act and the creation of ethnic structures such as the Department of Indian Affairs (DIA) in 1961, the NP institutionalised a more rigid and comprehensive system of racial domination. Nkomo (1990: 04) substantiates Sarup's contention that changes in the structure of the economy precedes changes in the education structure by suggesting that the burgeoning industrial sector needed a servile workforce, which was to be supplied by the new education system. Nkomo (1990: 02) points to the education domain, where segregated and inferior schooling was legislated for Africans in 1953, Coloureds in 1963 and Indians in 1965. This provided an ideological cornerstone for the social segregation, economic exploitation and political oppression of these groups, calibrated according to their location on the
racial hierarchical system. On the other hand, Nkomo (1990: 03) asserts that White education in South Africa had been exclusive and enjoyed the major share of the resources allocated by the State.

6.2. The Relationship Between Apartheid and Capitalism and its Effect on Teacher Organisations

In attempting to analyse the impact of teacher organisations from the 1960's onwards it is imperative to make a reference to the contemporary political economy which was deeply rooted in the complex relationship between apartheid and capitalism. Peiris (1979: 101) outlines the Marxist case that where the wealth of a society is unequally distributed, the State is not neutral but is an active agent in maintaining the wealth gap. Peiris (1979: 102) suggests that the State is used as a weapon in the hands of the privileged classes for maintaining social advantages.

Davenport (1992: 485) asserts that despite the State's appeals to the merits of free enterprise, it had always played a leading role in the South African economy. Johnstone (1970: 125) suggests that the State's policy of apartheid had a strong economic dimension. Davenport (1992: 486) argues that the relation between capitalistic development, apartheid policies and the core structure of
the status of the White ruling class were essentially collaborative, so that quite contrary to the prevailing liberal thesis, that capitalistic economic forces would eventually destroy apartheid, the White ruling class was continually reinforced by economic development.

Johnstone (1970: 126) saw the growing urbanisation and the upward occupational mobility of Blacks in industry, not as proof of the failure of apartheid, but merely as signs of an artful attempt by the State to maximise economic development both for the sake of White prosperity and for the material protection of White supremacy. Apartheid policy was designed to restrict Black opportunity by ensuring that Blacks were unable to make use of their industrial bargaining power either through education, or through the accumulation of wealth. The apartheid system in South Africa was designed primarily to assist the capitalist mode of production more than to protect the interests of the White race, though the interests of this group happened to coincide with the interests of South African capitalism.

Thus, for Johnstone (1979: 124-130), the failure and lack of concern on the part of the protagonists of apartheid to achieve a permanent separation of the races in practice was relatively immaterial. Johnstone (1979: 131) claims that apartheid was not intended to perform this function, but to
ensure, if necessary by the controlled bending of its own rules, that industry could remain in White ownership and continue to produce under conditions of industrial peace. Johnstone (1979: 140) asserts that industrial prosperity in South Africa was attributable to Black labour which was cheapened through the calculated impoverishment of the African reserves and the rural areas. The South African economy corresponded closely to the Leninist model of an imperialistic economic system, with the exploiter class located partly in South African business, in overseas bodies which financed South African economic development, and in the White workers whose privileged position in the economy gave them a parasitic relationship between apartheid and economic growth (see par 5.4.1.).

Legassick (1974: 271) has cogently argued that whereas the earlier policy of segregation (see par 5.4.1.) was an attempt to apply a system of controlled labour to mining and farming, apartheid was the application of a cheap "forced" labour policy to secondary industry. Legassick (1974: 272) argues that manufacturing required the recruitment of semi-skilled operatives for factory employment on a large scale. Many industrialists advocated a State-sponsored policy for the settlement of Black workers in townships, like Soweto and Chatsworth, with houses and basic amenities. While other industrialists who enjoyed the support of the White working class,
advocated the intensification of Black labour migrancy to the outlying areas which later resulted in the creation of the Bantustans or Black homelands, such as Ciskei or Venda. Legassick (1974: 272) adds that the NP derived support from mining and farming interests. The former was traditionally dependent on convict labour, while the latter was satisfied with increased control, on urban influx, which kept in check the drain of labour from the farms. Pampallis (1991: 229) shows explicitly the relationship between capital and the State when he argues that with the onset of the armed struggle by the ANC and the resultant outflow of capital from South Africa, the capitalistic monopoly of Anglo American, headed by Harry Oppenheimer sold General Mining to the Sanlam group because he saw the development of Afrikaner monopoly capital as a means of bringing about closer ties between the State and big business.

Nkomo (1990: 03) declares that in order to control labour for efficient industrial production and to suppress resistance from the national liberation movement the State resorted to repressive tactics, such as the passing of the General Laws Amendment Act in 1963 which empowered police to detain any person for a period of ninety days. Pampallis (1991: 226) shows that hundreds of detentions followed and the national liberation movement lost many of its leaders and rank and file members through torture and
death, or through long term prison sentences.

Hyslop (1986: 93-94) shows that State repression also influenced the way in which teacher organisations operated. Hyslop (1986: 93) points out that with the annihilation of radical opposition by the State during the early 1960's, striking changes took place within teacher groups. Teachers' hopes for short term political change receded. For instance, the conservative Transvaal United African Teachers' Association (TUATA) underwent a rapid expansion in its membership. The TUATA leadership shrewdly set out to organise women teachers who were deemed to be more conservative, and sought to some extent address their problems. TUATA also mounted a diverse programme of social and cultural activities in order to attract membership. Throughout the 1960's districts organised sports, ballroom dancing, plays and tours; but the most important of these activities were music competitions which involved teachers and pupils in choral singing (see par 1.3.). These competitions actually became the main focus of TUATA's activity. Hyslop, (1990: 108) argues that despite its numbers, TUATA was averse to any form of confrontation with the State, and showed itself quite unable to defend its members against victimisation. In 1965, the School Board of Witbank arbitrarily dismissed five politically active teachers, but the Association took no effective action to defend them.
In 1967, the Chairman of the Orlando branch of TUATA made the following critique of the Association: The prerequisite of the Association is that it should safeguard the interests of the teacher against the employer. If the Association can do this, much can be gained. At the moment it does not give the teacher the assurance that under its wing he can carry out his duties without fear. All it does is organise music competitions (Hyslop 1990: 108).

Hyslop fails to comment on the significance of the expansion of teacher organisations and their obsession with cultural activities. Peiris (1979: 103) points out that these teacher organisations which were recognised by the State, constituted mostly of upwardly mobile, middle class members. These members intentionally emphasised the cultural upliftment of their insular communities, whilst little attention was given to effective resistance against the oppression by the State regime. Hyslop ignores the notion that the proliferation and growth of organisations is in keeping with capitalism's aspirations, whereby members are conditioned as conformist middle class consumers, and more importantly, as creators and sustainers of stability against the background of the armed struggle and the harsh repression by the State.
6.3. The Consolidation of Hegemony

6.3.1. The Creation of Ethnic Structures

Bhana (1994: 09) argues that the State's insistence that South Africa was to be organised around racialised categories led to the creation of the DIA in 1961. In 1968 the South African Indian Council (SAIC) of co-opted Indians was established to administer to the needs of the Indian community. In particular, this patronage by the SAIC ensured the successful co-option among middle class Indians. In the early 1960's, Lazarus (1961: 06) shows that the NITS did not object to the creation of the DIA, but like the SAIC believed that its existence would fortify the Indians' citizenship in South Africa and at the same time secure the material benefits for the community. Tunmer (1970: 114) also suggests that the notion of middle class professional Indians being the "initiators and directors" of services for their own people was obviously tempting. Alternatively, it also implied that Indians had to abandon any claims to decision-making in national affairs. In this regard, in 1963, the Minister of Indian affairs announced that the political rights of Indians would be solely limited to self-government within their own community.
Ireland (1970: 270) points out that while the formation of the SAIC had the support of the Indian middle class, it did not go unchallenged. The NIC, for instance, resisted this racialisation through non-co-operation and instead espoused multi-racialism as it sought to rise beyond the "Indianness of its own supporters". Marie (1986: 89) shows that the Congress actively rejected bodies such as the SAIC as useless and as another attempt to divide the people of South Africa. By the early 1970's the support for the SAIC gradually diminished within the Indian community because of the Council's failure to soften the effects of oppressive legislation such as the Group Areas Act (see par 6.3.4.).

Inspite of resistance from the NIC, NITS did not contest the State's policy of segregated education. The State decided that the control and administration of education for Indians would be transferred to the DIA. Prior to the promulgation of the Indian Education Act of 1965, the State assured the Indian community, particularly the organised teaching profession, that its proposed dispensation would benefit education especially in the administration and practice of education. Also, it was necessary for the State to influence the Indian community to accept the transfer of education from the NPA to the DIA. In this regard in May 1964 at a meeting in Newcastle, P.R.T. Nel, a
Chief Planner for education, informed the representatives from NITS and TITA that several aspects of education were about to change the face of both Indian education and the organised teaching profession. In order to promote the idea, both NITS and TITA were promised representation on several committees of the Department of Education, which would cater for salaries of teachers, teacher training, libraries, syllabi, and the promotion of teachers. Among the other matters discussed and which were to have serious implications for the organised teaching profession, were the procedures for the promotion of teachers, the need for differentiated education, the introduction of school committees, and compulsory and free education for pupils (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 18). In essence the State's promise of introducing these "material benefits" into the education system strongly appealed to the professional middle class members of NITS and TITA. This accommodationist strategy severely limited any potential, active resistance against the introduction of separate education which was to be organised along racial and ethnic lines.

Moodley (1962: 11) points out that there were some members on the Executive Council of the NITS who adopted a contradictory stance by disputing the transfer of control and administration of Indian education. They maintained that education should be left in the control of the NPA.
These members felt that the entire educational structure for Indian education had evolved, due to the high standards and efforts of the NPA, with which the Indian community and the Society had worked in close collaboration over many decades. The dissenting group reasoned that the transfer of education would remove both the most experienced and qualified personnel who were required to manage the provision of education. Also, from a capitalistic point of view the Society argued that the Indian community, under the administration of the NPA, had invested a large amount of money into its education and therefore it had a vested interest in both its structure and content. The Society pointed out that in these circumstances, the Indian community was not eager to divest itself either of its investment or its direct interest in the education of its children. The members therefore stated that they were apprehensive that education which was constitutionally and traditionally the concern and responsibility of the NPA should be made a "pawn in a political game".

Moodley (1962: 13) shows that in order to retain power, the Director of NED, W.G. McConkey, agreed with these agitators. In his argument he appealed to the idea that the Indian people had been an integral part of the economy of Natal for over a hundred years. Consequently, he claimed that the Indians had since been caught up in the same processes of urbanisation and industrialisation as
their fellow citizens of other races. McConkey maintained that Indians were an integral part of the population of Natal and therefore their education should also remain the responsibility and the privilege of the NPA.

In order to reduce further tension among members of the NITS over the issue of the transfer of education, the Minister of Indian Education, W. Maree gave his assurance in an interview with the Society on 1 October 1964, that there would be no lowering of standards when the control of education was transferred. The Minister offered several guarantees which included the following: recognition and continued acceptance of the Society as the sole negotiating body for Indian teachers in Natal; the Society would be allowed to continue to make its contribution to Indian educational development; the introduction of a relevant curriculum; the immediate provision of facilities for the full introduction of Afrikaans into the school curriculum; religious instruction would not be allowed in schools except by common consent and agreement of all parties concerned; the expansion of the school building programme to eliminate the platoon school system (see par 5.3.); the introduction of compulsory education; the appointment and promotion of teachers would be given to an impartial body and Indian teachers would be allowed to serve in leadership capacities on civic and social welfare organisations (Daily News, 2 October 1964). These new
material improvements presented by the State convinced the Executive Council of the NITS to support the impending transfer of education (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 20).

Lazarus (1964: 06-07) contended that the Indian community looked to teachers to take the lead in securing the best education conditions for Indian children. In this functionalist and parochial argument, Lazarus averred that the Society would continue to play the role that it had played over the years in the best interests of the education of Indian children. While there were many members of the Society who disagreed with the new system of educational control and administration, a large part of the grassroots membership, also felt that the Society should not lose the opportunity to safeguard the education of Indian children. These members maintained that it could use the new education structure to improve and develop Indian education. They claimed that such an opportunity would be lost if the Society stubbornly opposed and divorced itself from the impending transfer of education (University of Durban-Westville Documentation Centre, Durban. Teachers' Letter in response to the Transfer of Education. 22 March 1964). Peiris (1979: 104) suggests that the NITS failed to penetrate the hegemonic ideology of the State as it was obscured by the promise of material benefits which directly appealed to this professional
middle class.

In 1966 the State re-affirmed its commitment to the transfer of Indian education. The Prime Minister of South Africa, B.J. Vorster (1966: 163), declared that he believed in the policy of separate development not only as a philosophy, but also as the only practical solution in the interest of everyone to eliminate friction and to do justice to every population group as well as every member thereof. In May 1966, the Minister of Indian Affairs, A.E. Trollip (1966: 02) conveyed his appreciation to the Society for its realistic appraisal of the good intentions of the State to co-ordinate and consolidate all education for Indians under the jurisdiction of the DIA. In attempting to explain this accommodationist strategy by teacher organisations, like the NITS, cognisance must be taken of the influence of broader social, political and economic circumstances.

Hyslop (1986: 92) points out that African, Indian and Coloured teachers quickly shifted, from a position of principled and militant opposition (see par 5.5.3.), to passive collaboration with the State. Hyslop (1986: 93) attributes this failure of resistance to the following reasons: the inability of the NIC and ANC to organise the "lumpen urban youth sub-culture" (see par 2.1.1.) and the success of Black Education in meeting the demand for mass
education. Vilardo (1992: 07) believes that the most significant reason was the failure of the ANC school boycott campaign of the 1950's to provide a viable counter-hegemonic alternative to Black Education (see par 7.3.2.).

Lodge (1983: 128) points out that these "boycotts often involved the renunciation of power". The nearest the ANC came to an alternative proactive educational policy was through its creation of the African Education Movement (AEM), but attempts to establish and sustain a parallel educational structure proved impossible in the face of State repression and limited resources. The AEM failed because it attempted to establish a counter-hegemonic educational project outside of the existing structures of education (cf par 7.3.2.). Vilardo (1992: 09) contends that another viable explanation for the failure of popular resistance to hegemonic education is to be found in the defeat of the organised working class. While the 1930's and 1940's witnessed the unparalleled growth of trade unionism, the defeat of the workers' strikes as well as repressive political and labour legislation sent the trade union movement into a precipitous decline. This retreat of the organised working class in the face of concerted State repression left the middle class, and especially teachers, vulnerable to State coercion and co-option.
Hyslop (1990: 95) suggests that the conservative turn of many teachers was rooted in a fear of State retribution against politically active teachers. Given the limited opportunities available to teachers under apartheid, the threat of sacking for political "misconduct", and the certain proletarianisation of teaching was enough to persuade many middle class teachers to avoid conflict with the State. It also dissuaded many of these teachers from joining the potentially militant organisations. Indeed, the threat of State repression and especially proletarianisation were awesome disincentives for teachers to get involved in protest politics at a time when the working class was disorganised and in retreat.

Hyslop (1984: 97) argues that in its attempt to gain legitimacy among parents and to strengthen its authority, the State instituted quasi-democratic school committees and school boards. On the one hand there was a concerted effort to weaken the professional autonomy of teachers evident in a repressive supervision system (see par 7.2.2.), but on the other hand there were new promotional opportunities for loyal and accommodating teachers.

Hartshorne (1992: 300) shows that teacher organisations in the African community also avoided any significant resistance against the State over controversial political issues, but channelled their energies towards the promotion
of cultural activities. At the beginning of the 1960's, the Cape African Teachers' Union (CATU) seemed destined for collapse. The Union's 1962-1963 report stated, bluntly, that the Union had no funds and as a result it would have to dissolve. In 1966 Peteni became the CATU's regional organiser in the Eastern Cape, and under his leadership a crowded program of social events, receptions, rugby and netball matches, choir competitions, beauty competitions and amateur dramatics was launched. This period saw a rapid growth of membership in the Port Elizabeth area which surprisingly had been a stronghold of the ANC since the 1950's and a centre of radical political activity.

Hyslop, (1990: 109) points out that the fact that CATU, with its political acquiescence and bland program of cultural activity could establish itself in the Port Elizabeth area, reflected the depth of the defeat of the nationalist liberation movement in the area. Teachers who were previously pressured by the force of popular militancy into siding with the mass movement, were now free to pursue their "professional" interests. The CATU leadership went out of their way to assure the authorities that they would never follow a politicised path. C.N. Lekalake told the 1967 conference in his presidential address: "...to those higher officers of the Department of Bantu Education we say thank you, and promise solemnly as we did in 1953 that it
shall not happen again. Never again will the work of many years be reduced to shambles as it was in the late forties and early fifties".

Hyslop (1990:110) argues that when Peteni had risen to the Presidency of CATU in 1968, he upheld the African petty-bourgeoisie as the creators of stability in an urban environment which was dominated by disruption, which according to Peteni was caused by the movement of the youth from the rural to the urban areas. For Peteni, the severing of ties between young Africans and their tribal homes upset their traditional orderliness and their respect for law and custom. The ranks of antisocial urbanised Africans grew at an alarming rate. While Peteni criticises the State’s policies of the development of Bantustans and population removals for "upsetting the balance and stability" of the African way of life, he does not explore the notion that the forced movement of people was necessary for providing labour to the capitalists in the industrialised urban areas of South Africa. Peteni re-affirmed the notion of non-involvement in politics and in the class struggle, and strongly asserted that dedication to the "professional" life was the best path for the teacher. Hyslop (1990:111) contends that the pattern of anti-social behaviour changed slowly as the urban community became more permanent and more settled. More schools and churches were built and many
families, increasingly, assimilated western culture. Hyslop does not explore the role of this middle class family structure as reproducers of the ideology of the State and capitalism (see par 6.3.5.), nor does he examine the concept of assimilation as the adoption of capitalistic bourgeoisie ideology.

Vilardo (1992: 08) points out that in the early 1970's, with the re-emergence and mobilisation of Black radical political organisations, teacher organisations showed an inability to link with these movements in order to resist State hegemony. During 1972 the Black Consciousness student group, the South African Student Organisation (SASO), subjected the teaching profession to a stern critique for its lack of political militancy. In a magazine editorial, TUATA responded that they were not going to prejudice themselves and their goals in order to please SASO's generals by being militant. Teacher organisations, like SAITA were infuriated by the criticisms of radicals who felt that they were collaborators of the State and saw these attacks as undermining their status and that of the educational system. Teachers' began to increasingly find that their apolitical, professional approach had placed them in a position where they could not attack apartheid education without undermining their own social status (see par 6.6.). Teacher organisations responded in a distant and cautious manner to the student
upheavals of 1976. However, SASO was able to provoke a considerable radicalisation of a segment of teachers, which manifested in mass resignations of teachers in Soweto. SASO also stimulated the formation of the Soweto Teachers' Action Committee (STAC) as a campaigning, anti-apartheid education body.

Hyslop (1990: 113) notes that it was unfortunate that STAC did not develop into an alternative teachers' organisation which would have effectively resisted State policies, but instead it chose to channel its energies into providing tutoring services for teachers. The established or State recognised teacher organisations, such as SAITA and TUATA came to be seen by this newly politicised section of teachers as accommodationists who operated within the prevailing political system rather than opposing it. Despite these criticisms the established teacher bodies remained on their old apolitical course and as a result they were gradually losing their position as the dominant teachers' organisation. Hyslop (1990: 112) also ascribes this trend as a result of teachers becoming a key group for recruitment by industry into clerical and junior managerial positions. In addition many teachers focussed their hopes on personal career advancement rather than better teacher organisations.
Bhana (1994: 10) declares that the apartheid State appeared confident about the successful implementation of its hegemonic ideology. Leading political organisations, such as the CPSA and the ANC had been banned and Bantustans had been created to further reinforce the segregation amongst the races. The State also sought to legitimise its apartheid structures which it hoped to create by obtaining the endorsement of the Black middle class (see par 7.1.). In this regard the NIC feared that a growing body of middle class Indians enjoying material benefits could easily be co-opted to support these State structures.

Cross & Chisholm (1990: 60) maintain that in the late 1970’s, the South African State which was represented by the military and capitalism embarked on what it considered to be an ambitious programme of reform to contain the multilayered economic, political and ideological crisis which it faced. Pampallis (1991: 246) points out that the economic boom of the 1960’s and the 1970’s had given rise to new economic problems where industries needed larger markets in order to continue expanding, but the poverty of the people, the result of national oppression and the low wages of Black workers meant that the domestic market was small. South Africa’s export market could not be developed fully or openly because of international political hostility towards the policy of apartheid. The global economic recession, the massive rise in the price of
imported oil, the sharp drop in the gold price ensured an economic recession which was to continue until the end of the decade, thus affecting people's living standards and fuelling their resistance. Cross & Chisholm (1990: 61) show that a political strategy of co-option of key middle sectors within the Black community was encouraged in mainly urban centres in the areas of labour, health, welfare, housing and education. Limited concessions were to be made available to State officials, teachers and small businessmen.

6.3.2. The Hegemony of Education

Freund (1995: 84) avers that after 1960, the State changed its policies fairly dramatically, after conceding that the Indians constituted a permanent portion of the South African population. Beall (1991: 93) ascribes this "concession" to capitalism's need for especially semi-skilled workers to meet the requirements of increasing industrialisation. One of the consequences of rescinding the repatriation policy was the investment in large working-class townships around Durban and other centres where Indians lived.

However, Freund (1995: 26) notes that the propaganda of the State made it clear that certain sectors of Indians still represented an unhealthy element in the population.
There were too many Indians in competition with White businessmen and too many radical Indian workers who threatened the stability of capitalism. The State needed an idealised social order of nurses, policemen, skilled craftsmen, manufacturers and teachers who could be accommodated into the burgeoning South African economy. In this regard the State’s propaganda machine churned out publications, such as the *Fiat Lux*, which was aimed at the middle class Indian population. It contained articles which showed the continual improvement in the material quality of life of Indians who subscribed to the ideology of the State. Hence, the State sought to manipulate and control civil servants such as the police, nurses and teachers. The State also turned to education to impose its hegemony and to satisfy the aspirations of capitalism. Cross & Chisholm (1990: 67) point out that Black education restructured the conditions of social reproduction of the Black semi-skilled workers, entrenched colour consciousness, and constructed national consciousness on the basis of ethnicity.

In a seemingly ambivalent reference to the contemporary repressive political economy, Lazarus (1960: 04) pointed out in retrospect, that the history of the Indian people had more often been one of pain than of pleasure, because as a group they had been sorely tried and discriminated against by fellow White South Africans. Lazarus (1960:
05) added that it was not his purpose to dwell unduly upon this more sordid aspect of life and human relationships, but he declared that one could not evade this background when examining any issue affecting the Indian people, be it of housing, of political aspiration and status, of educational advancement or of fruitful employment opportunity. Lazarus (1961: 06) contended that the Society would not be carrying its duty if it did not critically examine new trends in education and inform its members about contemporary affairs. Lazarus noted that Indian teachers did not share in the decision-making process in education, especially on the national level. The researcher ascribes this somewhat contradictory and radical articulation to the influence of the radical labour movement in the 1940's (see par 5.5.3.) and to the inspiration of the Black civil rights movement in the United States of America where Lazarus obtained his Doctorate at Yale university (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 33).

Other leaders of the Society also considered the manner in which the policy of apartheid affected the education of the Indian in South Africa. In addressing the annual conference of 1962, R.G. Pillay (1962: 08-09; 11) pointed out that in a plural society no particular race or ethnic group should take unto itself the sole right of determining the educational policy for the other racial groups. He
contended that in South Africa the educational policies had been arrived at both in a democratic and in an authoritarian manner. Educational policies for the White group had evolved democratically as there had been a fair measure of consultation with the European public. However, educational policies for Blacks had been determined with little or no consultation with the people for whom it was planned. He asserted that educational policy in a multi-racial society should work towards the elimination of differences between these different groups. Pillay called for a determined effort on the part of the State to equalise the qualifications, status, conditions of service and scales of salary for teachers.

Cross (1992: 42) attributes this radicalism to the notion that the political vacuum created by the banning of political leaders of all persuasions in the 1960's had the effect of widening participation in the debates by the different sections of the middle class, including those not affiliated to any political organisation. This democratisation of thought, played a crucial role in creating a spirit of self-criticism within and beyond the resistance and liberation movements. It made possible the achievement of relatively higher levels of ideological and theoretical sophistication among Black intellectuals. Cross (1992: 59) points out that throughout the African continent, the post-World War II era marked the transition
from pro-nationalism to militant nationalism and struggles for national liberation. This influence was felt in South Africa too where there was an increasing radicalisation of the Black middle-class which was met by the banning of political organisations in the 1960's. An outstanding feature of this nationalism was its anti-liberal spirit in contrast to the reformism and moderation of the 1920's and 1930's. Cross (1992: 60) declares that for the Black middle class education was regarded as a means to ensure the realisation of an effective democracy. The strategies for achieving this ideal included the implementation of free and compulsory education for all children and mass-based adult education.

However, Cross (1992: 59) also suggests that enlightened leaders, like Lazarus and Pillay did not engage their members in active criticisms or influence them to actively challenge the status quo of the State regime, but their rhetoric was limited to the higher levels of the executive council of the NITS. While Cross (1992: 43) attributes this trend to the leadership’s identification with the conformist middle class, Pampallis (1991: 231) ascribes this constrained capacity of leadership to influence membership to the strong repressive tactics of the State.

Naidoo (1962: 14-18) cites the case of Lazarus, who on 15 October 1962, appeared before a Board of Inquiry in Durban.
to answer charges of misconduct which were brought against him by the NED. The Department alleged that on 6 July 1961 Lazarus disregarded a law of the Department of Education at the annual conference of the NITS. The law stated that when a teacher delivered a speech in public he had to be cautious when making statements which could embarrass the Department of Education or which could be construed as criticism of the Department’s education policy. The second count alleged that Lazarus made statements which were prejudicial to the efficiency of the Department of Education. The third count was that he criticised his superior officers in the Society's The Teachers' Journal. The fourth count was that he criticised his superior officers, in the Indian based newspaper, The Leader. Finally Lazarus was accused of permitting the Anglo-American journal, Optima, to publish an article which contained statements which were deemed to be "politically charged". Lazarus denied all the charges.

Naidoo (1962: 15) points out that the Department of Education alleged that Lazarus was guilty of misconduct because he did not approve of the system that was used for the admission of pupils to secondary schools. A "merit list" system was introduced by the Department for the admission of pupils to Indian secondary schools in the Durban area. A committee consisting of Inspectors, Principals and Grantees of State-Aided schools gained
control over the allocation of pupils to the various high schools in accordance with a "merit list" which was prepared by the Department of Education. However, Lazarus indicated his unwillingness to serve on the committee. His main objection was that there was no need for the committee as the admission of pupils was a prerogative of the Principal. Lazarus felt that the prestige of the Principal had been lowered because he did not have control over the admissions of pupils at his school. Lazarus stated: "...a presidential address tries to air the feelings of the society's executive and members when all the teachers got together and could discuss them. The teachers could then instruct the Society's executive to take action" (Naidoo 1962: 14-18; Diamond Fields Advertiser, 18 October 1962).

A.D. Lazarus was found guilty on three of the five charges of misconduct that was brought against him by the Department of Education and as a result he faced the possibility of being discharged from the teaching service (Natal Mercury, 17 November 1962). The Board of Inquiry found Lazarus guilty on the second count, but not guilty on the first, which alleged that his address embarrassed the Administration and criticised its educational policy. The Board found Lazarus guilty on count three for publishing his address in the Teachers' Journal. He was also found guilty on count four because of the publication of his address in the newspaper, Leader. On count five Lazarus
was acquitted. This charge alleged that he took an active part in political matters by contributing an article to the journal, *Optima* (*Natal Daily News, 16 November 1962*). Lazarus was punitively transferred from Sastri College to the Loram High School in Durban. The notification of the transfer effectively limited any dissent and stifled political expression within the teaching fraternity (*The Graphic, 13 June 1963*).

Resistance by teachers' was also drastically reduced as they could not serve on political and cultural bodies which would have provided a platform for them to actively resist the repressive policies of the State. Nowbath (1961a: 07) justifies this argument by pointing to a case where a teacher who was an official of a local civic association, complained of the chaotic and impoverished condition of the transport system that served the area in which he lived. The NED was informed of the teacher's complaint and the teacher concerned was instructed not to interfere in the affairs of the civic body.

The Director of Education contended that the first duty of a teacher was to the child who was under his control. Therefore, it was only proper that no teacher should, by his public activities, earn the disfavour of parents (*NED, Report of the Director of Education, 1962*). The Society argued that the Director oversimplified the issue. The
Society pointed out that Indian teachers had played an important part in the social welfare of the Indian community and many of them were represented on welfare bodies. According to the terms that were set by the Director it had become possible for teachers to be excluded from all community activities (Nowbath 1961b: 29). The Director declared that he had no objection to teachers taking an active part in the affairs of the community in which they lived, provided their activities remained completely impartial and that they did not become involved in controversial matters. The Director contended that if the community was divided on any issue, it was expected that teachers would maintain their impartiality by withdrawing from further participation (NED, Report of the Director of Education. 1962).

The absence of members of teacher organisations on strategic decision-making bodies in the community robbed them of the ability to affect any meaningful change for the Indian community. Nair (1973: 22) shows that this powerlessness was articulated in 1973, by L.F. Sangaran, the Chairman of the Lenasia Branch of the SAITA. Sangaran maintained that as the Association was officially recognised by the State and represented the greater majority of the teachers who were employed by the DIA, its views should have therefore been respected and taken into consideration when education policies were determined.
Sangaran also argued that the Association's representations to the State should have been given the consideration it rightfully deserved, otherwise, the Chairman questioned: "What is the value of its statutory recognition?"

This ineffectiveness on the part of SAITA was also shown in 1975, when the Association sent a telegram to the Prime Minister of South Africa, B.J. Vorster, indicating its opposition to the transfer and control of Indian education to the SAIC until the latter was fully elected by the Indian community and after they had had full consultations with the organised teaching profession. At a meeting with the Minister of Indian Affairs, the Association was informed that the State was ready to delegate to the Executive Committee of the SAIC the authority which was vested in the Minister of Indian Affairs in terms of the Indian Education Act of 1965. Subsequently, the Association released a statement to the press expressing concern and disappointment because the Minister refused to advise the Association of the details regarding the authority over education which was delegated to him by the Executive Committee of SAIC. While the Association considered itself entitled to the information concerning the delegation of authority by virtue of its interest in the education of the Indian community it lacked the capacity to procure the necessary information, and was unable to stop the delegation of authority to the Executive
Committee of the SAIC (Minutes of a meeting between the Minister of Indian Affairs, the Director of Indian Education and the General Purposes Committee of SAITA, Durban, 01:11:1975).

Reeves (94:69) suggests that this sense of powerlessness, together with harsh police repression against 20,000 students who marched through Soweto in protest against the imposition of Afrikaans and the ensuing violence against education structures, affected the established teacher organisations and their role in education. These traditionally conservative teacher bodies viewed State structures far more critically and began to distance themselves from them. They refused to negotiate with State created structures or did so under protest.

This radicalised atmosphere spurred the new leader of SAITA, P.C. Samuels (1976:05) to react with arguments of a counter-hegemonic nature. Samuels commented on the difficult task teachers faced in the classroom as the Department of Education restricted their ability to freely express themselves. Samuels (1976:06) declared that the teacher could never refer to the conflicts and struggles in contemporary society, without incurring the wrath of the Department of Education which frequently accused teachers of politically indoctrinating school children. In a radical expression Samuels questioned:
...to what extent can the economics teacher discuss land tenure and the restrictions it imposes upon the progress of his people; to speak nothing of mass removals? To what extent can the Civics teacher honestly justify his community's non-participation in fully fledged municipal councils or in Parliament? Is it sufficient for him to tell the child that certain things are for Whites only and quickly pass on so that his anxious and his sensitive mind might not be taxed too much? To what extent can the teacher-counsellor justify the schools children must attend, the places they must live in, the signs in parks and other public places, the restrictions relating to work opportunities and the discriminatory salaries they will earn in later life?

Sarup (1979: 138) justifies the above viewpoint when she states that schools actually operated in this way, that schooling had become anti-educational and anti-social. Despite the claim by the State that education should be non-political, schools indoctrinated the child into the acceptance of the prevailing political system. Schooling became a form of indoctrination to fit children passively into the acceptance of an apartheid ideology.

Unlike Lazarus, Samuels (1976: 03) makes a direct and explicit reference to the prevailing political economy by stating that the progress the Indian community hoped to achieve, in education in South Africa, depended entirely upon the progress made in the social, political and economic system of South Africa. Samuels contended that meaningful change in the broader structures of society would bring about meaningful education. This was the first occasion when SAITA truly conceded that a democratic education system could only emerge through the creation of
a democratic political order. Subsequently, the Association demonstrated a more bold approach in its criticisms of the apartheid regime.

Naidoo (1976: 06) shows for instance, that at its yearly conferences SAITA emphasised the glaring inequalities in the financial provision for the education of children. In 1976 the Association pointed out that rather than narrowing, the gap was widening as evidenced by the fact that during in the 1953-1954 period, the State spent seven times more on educating a White child than it did on an African child. In 1974-1975, the disparity had widened to between eighteen times or in monetary terms R 671 on the White child and R 38 on the African pupil. The per capita expenditure on the Indian and the Coloured child fell between these two extremes. The Association urged the State to remove the racial discrimination, in determining the per capita expenditure on education and called for a common amount to be allocated to every school going child. The Association pointed out the disparities in calculating the per capita cost of education for the White and the non-White pupil, for instance, White education was still under the control of the provinces and was financed by the central Government. Each province was therefore expected to determine costs of education which included all capital expenditure items. However, in the case of non-White education which was controlled by the central Government
the school building programme and certain other items of capital expenditure such as payment for water and lights were not included (Saita News, November 1976). In TASA's 1979 conference which explored the theme Educational Evaluation - Patterns and Purpose, a more critical emphasis was placed on the unequal and inadequate facilities which plagued education in the Black community. The stark inequality which resulted from racial separatism was emphasised by the speakers during the conference (TASA News, July 1979).

While it is conceded that the leadership of SAITA viewed the social, economic and political system more critically, this discriminating ethos was counteracted by the State's co-option strategy of Black teachers at grass-roots level. However, unlike Indian teachers during this period, Reeves (1994: 70) demonstrates that many African teachers became politically conscientised and were actively engaged in protest action against the State.

Pampallis (1991: 282) attempts to explain this trend by suggesting that the State's Total Strategy was aimed to win allies for the regime by encouraging the emergence of an urban Black middle class with considerable higher incomes and standards of living than the majority of the proletariat. According to Prime Minister P.W. Botha, 'free enterprise' in South Africa was facing a 'total onslaught'
from a Marxist threat. In order to defend itself, the State had to put into effect a strategy to deal with the crisis on all fronts, namely ideological, political, economic and military. As a result of various reforms, the State argued that the Black middle class would be given a stake in the system and be drawn away from revolutionary activity. The State hoped that it would win support for the capitalist system from this group (cf 5.3.), and that its members would have a moderating influence on the liberation movement. Pampallis (1991: 283) shows that during the early 1980's, the State abolished racially discriminatory salary scales for professionals, such as teachers and nurses. The State also adopted a meritocratic ideology. It instituted the Merit Award which was granted to teachers who performed exceptionally well in the teaching-learning situation. The award could be considered to be an hegemonic tactic of the State as it diverted attention away from radicalised political activity and "forced" the teacher to focus on his parochial teaching activity. In addition Naidoo (1979: 10) contends that the merit award system was geared to perpetuate favouritism and dishonesty and made teachers "suspicious" of their colleagues. Thus the idea that middle class teachers could identify with radical political activity or attempting to link up with the proletariat was effectively stifled by the State.
Evans (1992: 82) points out that the State's framing of reforms in scientific technical terms, together with the "promise of equal opportunity" appealed to the Black middle class. In 1980 Prime Minister, P.W. Botha assembled the De Lange Commission to formulate solutions to the educational crisis "within a reformed framework of equality and opportunity" which would be free as possible from the stigma of discriminatory apartheid schooling, without, however, abolishing the fundamental structure of segregated education. The intention of the Commission's report was to de-politicise racial disparities by absolving apartheid policies from any culpability in the crises that confronted the State in the 1980's. To this end it presented racial differentials in South Africa as the natural outcomes of a market economy. For example, the Commission recorded its task not to eliminate the consequences of apartheid education but, in tones normally associated with a welfare approach, to reducing the differences in the quality of education between communities. No reference was made to the State's policy of "enforced ethnicity", that is, the compulsory classification of Blacks into official ethnic groups by the apartheid State. Nor did the report acknowledge that Blacks had been quite systematically obstructed from improving their economic position by racial policies that forcibly confined them to the lower rungs of the occupational and economic ladder. Instead, South Africa was portrayed in the report as a benevolent State
pursuing what appeared to be welfare policies for Blacks. The report therefore contended that the role of the State should be confined to developing the correct technical programmes to remove "bottle necks in the labour market" while simultaneously "upgrading" Blacks.

Nasson (1990: 150) argues that the goal of the proposed reforms was to restructure the correspondence between educational "output" and market "demands" in ways that elevated the material conditions of select strata within each ethnic group. In this scheme the emphasis shifted from the State's control on racial groups to the opportunity for "enhanced individual mobility". As Nasson (1990: 170) writes occupational mobility, as well as social rewards and material privileges could then be seen as being linked primarily to successful educational achievement rather than racial inequality (cf 5.3.).

Pampallis (1991: 284) argues that as a result of this co-option strategy under the banner of "equal but separate", the grass-roots membership of teacher organisations such as TASA and the African Teachers' Association of South Africa (ATASA) did not articulate the notion of democratisation which refers to the fundamental re-organisation of the State to permit free and unrestricted political mobilisation in the contest to win control over the State. Nor did they defend Black demands which extended well
beyond the mere elimination of formal racial restrictions in a unitary State. These demands included an immediate transition to a one-person-one-vote system, programmes to drastically redistribute both income and capital assets from Whites to Blacks, and ongoing welfare programmes to rapidly eliminate the socio-economic imbalances created by more than a century of racial domination. TASA like in the earlier period of 1925 to 1958 acceded to the idea of liberalism which was coincidentally the National Party's programme, confined to policy changes that gradually reduced formal restrictions on the rights associated with mobilisation or free expression and an increasing allocation of resources, but stopped short of transforming the balance of power in society (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 32). Pampallis (1991: 284) asserts that the State remained committed to constitutional gerrymandering to conceal White privilege, and manipulated "free-market" discourse to legitimise racial inequalities. Liberalisation was designed precisely to forestall democratisation.

6.3.4. The Group Areas Act

Freund (1995: 64) describes the forced removal of the majority of Indians from their pre-existing homes into State-owned accommodation, in the townships, as the "greatest event in the post-war history of the Indian
population of Durban". For the Indian the process was one that reminded them of their vulnerability to the power structure, defined in racial terms, of the city and the country, and one that would alienate them further from that power structure. At the same time, the creation of legally constituted Indian group areas would have a major role to play in shaping economic structures in Durban, and in the development of cultural, social and political consciousness.

Legassick (1974: 272) again highlights the connection between capitalism and apartheid by expressing the idea that the group areas policy was a form of labour control and was functional to capital. Freund (1995: 64) points out that to the industrialists, the periphery of Durban represented desperately needed level ground for industrial expansion. Favourable areas for expansion, such as the land at the southern end of the Durban Bay, were densely and inconveniently occupied by Indian shack dwellers. Freund (1995: 66) argues that to some extent, the conservative leadership amongst the Indian bourgeoisie abandoned any real struggle against removal of the Indian proletariat and instead tried to ensure more favourable terms and arrangements (Freund 1995: 64). The 1963 conference of the NITS highlighted certain problems which arose out of the implementation of the Group Areas Act instead of protesting against the principle of the Act.
The Society argued that while there was a rapid transfer of members of the Indian Community to new townships, like Merebank and Chatsworth, there were insufficient schools and facilities (Lazarus 1963: 18).

Butler - Adam & Venter (1987: 03) indicate that the forced removals had an even more dramatic impact on the life of the extended Indian family. The patriarchal extended family, which had previously occupied a home which had linked up rooms in a mushroom shack or tin-and-iron construction was no longer compatible with the new houses in the townships. The State was in fact quite explicit in promoting construction that suited the commuter-worker who lived directly on wages and in small, nuclear family structures. Freund (1995: 86) suggests that the nuclear family became the key site of material and ideological life (see par 6.3.5.). There was a growing self-definition in terms of consumerism, whereby the family became the seat for possession of material goods such as cars which were needed for the long journey to work from the outlying townships, like Chatsworth and Phoenix.

6.3.5. The Family as a Hegemonic Unit

In its many conferences and publications, the NITS propagated the idea that the integrity of the family was essential for the socio-economic advancement of the Indian
community. The Society articulated the view that the employment of the youth was necessary in order to combat the social evils of poverty, unemployment and juvenile delinquency, as well as to prevent the disintegration of the family unit. The Society reinforced the functionalist belief of the family as the creators of stability and orderliness in society without reflecting on the family as an hegemonic unit of the State and capitalism (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 34-35).

In attempting to explain the high degree of accommodation by teachers to the prevailing economic and political system, Goode (1983: 43) points to the role of the family. The family is first and foremost a unit of social control and socialises members into an acquiescent political position by compensating workers for the strain and unpleasantness of work. Peiris (1979: 115) maintains that the family is seen as a compensatory agency which offers comfort and esteem to the worker who returns from a factory or office where he has no control or satisfaction. The family is then a haven from pointless, frustrating work, and therefore controls tensions in a way which keeps the workforce quiescent.

The family also acts as a mechanism for constraining independent thought and regulates capitalistic ideology. Peiris (1979: 114) argues that the dominant ideas in
society are transmitted by the ruling class through the family. In this way, the ruling class in South Africa were able to socialise the majority of Blacks into accepting an ideology that justified the status quo even though they were grossly disadvantaged under it. Peiris (1979: 115) states that the primary agent of socialisation is the family, even when it is located in the working class, as the family absorbs and transmits some of the fundamental political norms promoted by the dominant class. Easton and Hess (1979: 58) state that the family discourages an interest in politics while simultaneously seeking to socialise the young to accept the political and economic system to which it has accommodated itself. The family outlaws from the consciousness of their members any alternative political and economic possibilities that transcend the existing structures.

Feminists contend that in a family unit, it is a very unequal exploitation which occurs, and that it is usually women who are more disadvantaged than men. Freund (1991: 429) points out that during the 1960's, industrial expansion, propelled a rapidly increasing proportion of younger women to work. This represented a new family strategy, that of maximising the accumulation of capital for a nuclear family but it was also connected to some degree to a weakening of family life, and an individuation of the woman's economic role and her relation to capital.
The movement of working class women to wage dependent work became the norm by the end of 1970. Orthodox feminist Marxists like Benston (1972: 15) identify the amount of unpaid work which women do as wives and mothers, and the advantages which this entails for capitalism. She administers the household and often all its finances. Kuper (1960: 97) has described the Indian mother and wife as one who "leads by withdrawing, rules by submitting and, above all, creates by receiving". Benston (1972: 16) argues that capitalism also benefits because the wage of the male pays for that of two workers and their off-spring. Hence, the full costs of reproducing labour are therefore shifted from the employer to the private family. In addition Benston (1972: 16) points out that capitalism uses the ideology of the family as a mechanism to control workers from disrupting productivity, for fear of losing jobs and harming the economic stability of the family.

6.4. The Effects of Hegemony

6.4.1. People as Labour Commodity

Bowles and Gintis (1988: 20) emphasise the correspondence between relations of authority and subordination in the classroom and the workplace. They maintain that the ability of the education system to reproduce the
consciousness of workers lies in a correspondence between school structure and class structure. This suggests that the correspondence between the social relations of schooling and work, accounts for the ability of the educational system to produce an amenable and fragmented labour force. Thus the lowest levels of the hierarchy in industry emphasise the following of rules, middle levels - dependability and the capacity to operate without direct and continuous supervision; higher levels - the internalisation of the norms of the enterprise.

Bowles and Gintis (1988: 21) stress the distinction between the controller and the controlled in the workplace and the way in which this corresponds with a similar distinction in the classroom. The form in which classroom teaching takes place emphasises discipline, punctuality, acceptance of authority and individual accountability, all of which are highly suitable skills to bring to a job in a factory. While Carlson (1988: 158-173) criticises Bowles and Gintis thesis for overstressing the smoothness of this correspondence principle, he points out that there is certainly a link between the school and the workplace, between changes in the economy and the educational system. This correspondence is reflected in both the form and content of the education received by children at school (see par 6.3.).
Nkomo & Mokate (1990: 403) relate the correspondence principle to the situation in South Africa, by maintaining that the way in which Black labour power had been developed and utilised in South Africa was a reflection of the ideology practiced in the country. The educational system had been effectively used to perpetuate a racial division of labour, which had resulted in Whites dominating the skilled sector of the labour market, while the oppressed groups largely occupied semi-skilled positions and performed the most menial jobs. As the economy grew in the 1960's and the early 1970's, African, Coloured and Indian labour was still considered to be abundant cheap labour. In the 1980's the division of labour based on race still relegated the majority of the three racial groups to the unskilled and semi-skilled sector of the economy. For Nkomo & Mokate (1990: 403) these inequalities were the basis of the ideology of racism and the exploitation of the Blacks in South Africa.

Freund (1995: 78) asserts that although opportunities became accessible for Indian workers in various branches of industry as well as in other sectors of the economy, the key areas for expansion were limited and lay in the textile and clothing industries. Some sectors of the economy in Durban were not as open to Indian advancement, for instance, Dunlop, which remained a major employer, avoided employing Indian workers into the 1980's. It was
particularly around some parts of the consumer-goods industries that the Indian working class in Durban found abundant job opportunities.

Freund (1995: 79) shows that male workers from the Indian minority were concentrated in relatively few industries, primarily distribution and catering, transport and manufacturing. On the other hand, Indian female members were overrepresented in health services and manufacturing. Many industrialists considered the "Indian worker to be particularly suited to work demanding initiative and quick thinking, especially process-minding, while the African worker showed more aptitude for routine repetitive work" (Freund 1995: 79).

Sadie (1971: 234) suggests that this relegation of a large section of the Indian community to semi-skilled and unskilled jobs led to poverty and its associated problems (see table I).

Table I: Table Showing the Proportion of each Population Group employed as Unskilled and Semi-skilled Labourers as a Percentage of the Total Labour Force

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1960 (%)</th>
<th>1970 (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>4,2</td>
<td>3,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>68,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>49,4</td>
<td>44,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>15,3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Sadie 1971: 234)
Marxists, like Poulantzas (1973: 56) points out that poverty exists because wealth exists. In a capitalist economy the aim of the bourgeoisie, that is, the owners of industry is to maximise profit, and wealth is created by the difference between labour and raw material costs, and the selling price of a product. As labour costs form such a significant proportion of the total bill, there is constant pressure to keep wages at the lowest possible level. The poor represent the group at the bottom of the earnings scale, who provide the base rate against which other income groups measure their own earnings. Obviously, the lower the rate paid to those at the bottom, the lower the general wage level. Consequently it is in the interests of the owners of industry to keep the lowest groups poorly paid. Second, the workforce must be given a strong incentive to work, and for this reason unemployment and low social security benefits are both necessary. A moderately high level of unemployment is regularly present in capitalist societies, both because of the nature of production which experiences alternative recessions and booms, and also because it provides an alternative workforce prepared to displace the jobs of workers who price themselves out of the market. The awareness that there are others who would be prepared to take over these jobs helps keep the workforce disciplined and ready to accept low wages. For Poulantzas, (1973: 56) poverty is
endemic to capitalism, and any welfare system is primarily a means of appeasing and controlling the working class.

Marxists criticise the welfare system on the grounds that it is a smokescreen, concealing the fact that there is no fundamental shift of power away from the very rich. The idea of welfare was adopted by the ruling class as a means of preventing revolutionary change. So by allowing a small degree of redistribution, but generally leaving ownership and wealth in the hands of a few, capitalism remains intact, and ensures the loyalty of the workforce. Records show that during the 1961 to 1982 period, teacher organisations collected and donated huge sums of money to charities, such as the Durban Indian Child Welfare Society, instead of actively protesting against the State’s discriminatory labour laws, teachers channelled their energies into organising fund raising events to support these welfare institutions (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 18).

Moore (1995: 38) explores the relationship between the high failure rates in school and the labour needs of capitalistic society. Moore (1995: 38) contends that capital expects schools to produce a sufficient quota of failures for employment in unskilled and semi-skilled jobs. Nkomo (1990: 01) points out that since the early 1960's a State controlled national system of labour bureaus were
introduced to monitor and control the supply and
distribution of Black labour. Bridgemohan (1961: 40-41)
shows, however, that this notion is ignored by the Chairman
of the Pinetown Branch of the NITS when he attempted to
explain the dismal results of the Standard Six Certificate
Examinations of 1960. Instead the Chairman pointed out
that a major contributory factor for the poor results was
the inability on the part of the pupils to express
themselves clearly and precisely, especially in the English
examination papers. Another criticism was that teachers
placed too great an emphasis on the quantity rather than on
the quality of work.

In the 1967 Natal Senior Certificate Examination 66 percent
of the Indian candidates failed. This high incidence of
failure caused such a great alarm in the Indian community
that SAITA sent a memorandum to the Director of Education,
P.W. Prinsloo, which outlined its support of the Indian
community's request for a public inquiry into the high
failure rate (Memorandum submitted by the NITS to The
Director of Indian Education, 1968).

The Association argued that despite the generous
contributions made by the Department of Indian education
towards the provision and upgrading of educational
facilities, the results of Indian pupils were not pleasing
(see par 6.3.1.). The Association maintained that unless
there was a full scale scientific inquiry into the performance of Indian matriculants, neither it, nor the Department of Indian Education would contribute to any worthwhile solution (Leader, 16 February 1968). The Association believed that such an inquiry would also serve to acquaint the parents and the community with the truth which in turn would also enable them to make a contribution towards solving the problem (The Natal Witness, 22 January 1968).

**TABLE II: Table Showing the Pass Rates of White and Indian Pupils in the Natal Senior Certificate Examinations for the Years 1959 to 1967.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Indian</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1959</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1962</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1966</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Lazarus 1968: 16)

The above table shows that the results of White pupils were consistently at the 80 percent level, while in contrast the results of Indian pupils showed a sharp decline after 1961. The Association postulated the following reasons for this
discrepancy: the study of Latin which was a compulsory secondary language; the adverse effect of the platoon school system (see par 5.3.); abnormally high teacher-pupil ratios in the classrooms; lack of suitably qualified teachers, especially university graduates; poor home conditions of Indian children which included overcrowding, poor nutrition, poor facilities for study and problems created by the mandatory movement of the Indian people under the Group Areas Act (see par 6.3.3.). The Association pointed out that considerable emotional strain had been imposed on high school students when their families had been uprooted from their long established homes (Lazarus 1968: 15).

The Association published various articles in its Teachers' Journal in order to clarify the causes for the high failure rate. Many of these articles focused on the culturally disadvantaged child. The aim of these articles was to indicate some of the main trends of thought and research on the psychology of disadvantaged children and to comment particularly on the research findings and hypotheses which had the most direct implications for practical solutions. Through these journal articles the Association pointed out that there was a high proportion of school failure, school drop-outs, reading and learning disabilities, as well as life adjustment problems among children who came from socially impoverished circumstances. Children from poor
environments came to school with a qualitatively different preparation for the classroom. The author noted that these children had different kinds of socialising experiences when compared to those children who came from normal middle class homes. The Association declared that teachers should be prepared to reconsider some of their ideas in the light of educational philosophy and new findings about learning that this problem required (Smilansky & Smilansky 1968: 26-27; Jensen 1968: 05-19). While research of this type had important implications for teaching in the classroom, a major shortcoming was that it ignored the broader economic and political causes of the impoverished circumstances of the disadvantaged child.

In order to limit dissent within the Indian community and the organised teaching profession, the Department of Education immediately intensified its efforts to remedy the situation and the following steps inter alia were taken: an extended and diversified curriculum was offered at high schools and facilities were made available for their implementation; the number of subjects offered was increased to include both academic, practical and vocational courses to cater for children of diverse abilities and aptitudes; pupils who intended to pursue their studies at university were encouraged to take the Advanced Grade course, while others were advised to take the Ordinary Grade. Various steps were taken to improve
the quality of instruction. Special orientation courses and seminars were instituted for in-service teachers in the official languages as well as in Mathematics, Science and other subjects to enable them to obtain the necessary guidance in their teaching methods. Teachers who were qualified to teach examination subjects on the secondary level were judiciously placed to ensure that their efficiency and capabilities could be most profitably utilised. This resulted in an overall improvement in the quality of instruction that was imparted. The Inspectorate made frequent visits to high schools and special attention was given to guiding and advising principals and teachers. The Department also instituted a correspondence and vacation course to enable the teachers who were inadequately qualified to improve their professional qualifications. The Director of Education pointed out that the above measures resulted in an increase in the number of candidates who passed the matriculation examination. However, not surprisingly the Director indicated that he did not expect a spectacular improvement in the matriculation results of 1968 as there were still quite a number of candidates who qualified for the Ordinary Grade but wrote the examination on the Standard Grade (Prinsloo 1969a: 26).
6.4.2. The Effect of Hegemony on the Youth

In the early 1960's the NITS noted that the traditional discipline which controlled the individual, his family life and society was experiencing a breakdown. Moodley (1963b:02) shows that the Society became alarmed at the social problems that were arising in the new Indian townships, created under the Group Areas Act (see par 6.3.3.). There appeared to be a lack of recreational facilities such as parks, gardens, playing fields, club-houses and community centres. The Society's investigations showed that although the amenities had been planned, the building of houses had taken priority over the erection of recreation facilities.

In the above circumstances the Society requested its members to play a major role in providing the social services that were required to combat the growth of delinquency and crime in these areas. The Society called for the establishment of youth societies and clubs which catered for sports, literacy and cultural activities. The Society believed that by simply building these facilities and providing social activities anti-social tendencies which were becoming ingrained in the youth of the new townships would be reduced. From a functionalist point of view the Society, also appealed to the family as a unit of effective socialisation to improve the discipline of school
children ( Natal Mercury, 13 June 1962 ). However, the Society failed to acknowledge the hegemony of the State and capitalism or the class distinction in society as a cause for discipline problems.

In order to combat the endemic problem of discipline in the community and in the schools, many teachers and principals resorted to the creation of an authoritarian ethos. The Society became concerned about the increase in the administration of corporal punishment by some headmasters and teachers. Lazarus, declared that punishment of a vicious nature was often inflicted for the most trivial of reasons. Lazarus contended that the Society could not afford to protect any member who was caught flouting the law by advertising his authority on the end of a cane. Lazarus was so incensed by the issue of corporal punishment that he stated: "My humanity, my sense of decency as well as my respect for my charge have all rebelled when I have heard these things and I am impelled therefore to draw attention to these petty tyrannies in our schools" ( University of Durban-Westville Documentation Centre, Durban. Letter: Corporal Punishment. 13 October 1963 ). Lazarus ( 1968: 15 ) added that no law allowed the Principal or teacher with the authority to treat children in an inhumane manner ( Leader, 17 January 1964 ). Consequently, SAITA requested the Director of Education to appoint welfare officers to assist both teachers and pupils
to solve disciplinary problems. Thus, this superficial action shows the inability of the Association to penetrate the root of the discipline problem and connect it to the hegemony of the State.

Bowles and Gintis (1988: 20) maintain that for the State, discipline is a necessary condition for the maintenance of the continued operation of the school. While schools employed a range of instruments to combat indiscipline and required that all members of the institution be subjected to control, they have always had to use disciplinary measures which have altered with changing social conditions. Wolpe (1988: 150) points out that during the 1960's, the State, for instance, emphasised the examination system (see par 6.4.1.) as one of the major instruments of disciplinary control. This caused many pupils to resist schooling which was manifested in the high rate of drop-outs, and absenteeism and failure in the examinations.

In 1969 the President of SAITA, R.S. Naidoo (1969: 06) expressed his concern to members about the high drop-out rate in schools before children were equipped, or mature enough, for some gainful occupation. An intake of approximately 16 000 at the junior primary level was reduced by a progressive 84 percent drop-out rate to 2600 pupils in standard ten. In a bid to stabilise the community, Naidoo made a passionate plea to parents to keep
their children at school for as long as possible. Naidoo maintained that if Indian children were to be equipped for better jobs and if they were to achieve higher standards of living, then the drop-out rate among pupils should be significantly decreased. By 1971 the Association noted that there was such an accelerated drop-out rate among Indian pupils, that over ninety percent of the school population did not proceed beyond the junior secondary level (Naidoo 1971: 29).

Not surprisingly, a penetrating analysis of the problems youth experienced came from outside SAITA. During this period, B.A. Naidoo (1969: 16; 18), a social welfare officer of the South African National Council for Child Welfare explored the relationship between socio-economic factors and problems associated with the youth. Naidoo pointed out that a high proportion of school failures, school drop-outs, reading and learning disabilities, as well as life adjustment problems especially among children who came from the lower economic and social strata should be of special interest to Indian education. Unlike the accommodating members of SAITA, Naidoo claimed that the significance of these studies for education was that these children were not only intellectually disadvantaged, but in addition the effectiveness of the school as a major institution for socialisation was diminished. In so doing Naidoo discounts functionalism by suggesting that the
school was an ineffective unit of socialisation. Naidoo maintained that consequently, the same segment of the population contributed disproportionately to the problem of school delinquency. Naidoo suggested the following course of action in order to solve the problem of juvenile delinquency: the need for research by teachers and academics on aspects that related to the education of disadvantaged Indian children; the need for teacher training courses to make special reference to the characteristics of disadvantaged children; practical methods by which their needs and problems could be met by the adoption of suitable teaching techniques and the need for teachers to organise in-service courses on the disadvantaged child. While Naidoo does not examine why the school fails to operate as an effective unit of socialisation, he strongly believed that the above course of action could reduce the high incidence of drop-outs and failures and as a result the incidence of school delinquency would decrease.

Nevertheless, analysis of society from external bodies such as the above strongly influenced the executive of SAITA to change its perception about the problems experienced by the youth. The Natal Regional Welfare Board arranged a one-day conference on The Role of the Social Welfare Agencies in Resettled Communities. One of the four papers presented at the conference was prepared by the President of SAITA, R.S.
Naidoo. In this noteworthy paper he examined, *The Social Consequences of Resettlement on Children*, an aspect which even he acknowledges had not been the subject of any research up to that time. Naidoo’s (1970b: 32-36) address contained pertinent questions and suggestions which were of vital concern to teachers who were appointed to schools in resettled areas under the Group Areas Act (see par 6.3.3.). Naidoo argued that as the population moved out from the residential areas, schools were closed and children had to travel long distances to other schools. This had a negative impact on the education of the children. Pupils were adversely affected due to the uncertainty and the indefinite prospect of moving. Homes also became neglected. Transport services which were no longer economically viable were curtailed or abandoned completely. This increased the burden of the parents who were, mainly, from low income groups. Where money was not available for transport, books and uniforms, children were stopped from school, first the girls and thereafter the boys. Being unprepared, these young people entered a labour market which provided an insufficient number of jobs. Sometimes families were allocated homes during the course of the year. If the family had to move to a new settlement such as Chatsworth then admission to school had to be sought at schools in the midst of a year when children were preparing for external examinations. While school accommodation was no longer a problem, adjustment to
new surroundings and new schools had taken its toll and resulted in high failure rate, high absentee rates, and high school drop-out rates. Naidoo called for a careful study of the problem to be made with a view to planning for the future and assisting the disadvantaged children. He believed that this matter should engage the attention of the leaders of the Indian community. However, Naidoo sees the Group Areas Act as the sole cause of the problems and he failed to fit the Act into the overall strategy of capitalism or the hegemony of the State.

In 1971 R.S. Naidoo (1971: 29) pointed to evidence of increasing rebellion in the classroom. Wolpe (1988: 150) argues that class factors are important in analysing the problems associated with the youth. Middle class pupils are most likely to take their schooling seriously in that they will do their homework diligently and aim to obtain the best symbols in the examinations. Willis (1977: 81) places the oppositional school culture in the context of working-class culture which youths share with their parents and the institutional structure of the school. He argues that the forms of opposition within the school are shaped by the contradictory pressures between the school and working class values. The whole point of the capitalistic system is to achieve and legitimise working-class failure. The study by Willis (1977: 37) shows that working-class boys, aware of their failure, cope with the boredom and
irrelevance of school to their lives, by 'mucking about'. This behavior guarantees their failure. However, these very skills they have learned to get through school also prepare them for their "dead-end employment" as adults.

Wolpe (1988: 151) suggests that rebelliousness by girls may exhibit itself in the way in which they dress to school and in the classroom, girls may be more quiet and less physically active than boys, but they nevertheless resist school lessons. It is important to remember that although working-class youth are rebelling against society, they may not be fully aware that this is the real cause of their problems, so their rebellion can be described as inarticulate, in the sense that they are aware of oppression, but not through any political awareness. Rather than through traditional political activities, they show their resistance through the styles of clothes they wear and the type of music they listen to. However, Naidoo (1990: 122) attributes the major cause of pupil resistance to the hegemony of the State by pointing to the prevalent authoritarian apartheid education system that was dispensed to children under the guise of Christian National Education and which bred psychological dehumanisation. Pupils tended to internalise and resist some of these authoritarian practices that reigned supreme in the teaching environment (see par 6.5.5.).
R.S. Naidoo (1971: 30) also cautioned the Indian community about the high rates of crime. In the 1960's delinquent cultures ranged from more organised and established gangsterism to sporadic youth street gangs rooted in the breakdown of the family or parental support and the inaccessibility of economic opportunities. Freund (1995: 85) shows that during the 1960's the youth turned to the formation of gangs in the newly established townships in the absence of the extended family networks in which social life had previously flourished (cf 5.5.5.). Wolpe's (1980: 04) analysis of youth culture shows that contrary to European capitalist countries, capital in Third World countries appeared to have conserved pre-capitalist productive units such as the tribal group, family farm and respective social relations, which prevented the proliferation of delinquent subcultures. So long as pre-capitalist modes of production survived, they restricted the re-composition of class relationships and re-absorbed part of the labour force, including unemployed youth, thrown off by capital. Hence, they provided re-integration of unemployed youth into traditional relationships that prevented the proliferation of delinquent behaviour. This re-integration into communal relationships exerted traditional controls that supported lawful behaviour and impeded the alienation of the youth and the development of their particular subcultures. As such, youth subcultures were absorbed into family cultures without being able to
develop an autonomous expression. In addition Freund (1995: 85) states that resources were poor and it took a long time for schools to be erected, for health facilities to be built and for neighbourhood ties to form. The built environment lacked attractive public spaces. The illegal liquor outlet replaced the community-supportive shebeen. Crime became a significant factor, particularly in the working-class communities like Phoenix. Naidoo (1971: 30) contended that due to poverty and the ever present struggle with the cost of living both parents were at work and young children were left to fend for themselves for the best part of twelve hours daily. Consequently, there was no proper supervision of children at home and with a lack of compulsory education, these factors resulted in absenteeism, truancy and juvenile criminal activity which occurred on an unprecedented scale. While, both Freund and Naidoo correctly point to the lack of resources and to poverty as the causes of crime, they fail to extend their explanations to the Marxist notion of crime which argues that in a capitalist society, success is measured in terms of ownership and possession of status symbols. For Marxists, greed is, therefore, the very basis of capitalist society. For the children of the dominant White group who had access to skilled jobs, success was virtually guaranteed and greed was seen by them as a positive wealth-creating activity. For those who were economically disadvantaged, crime was one of the ways in which they,
Moore (1995: 42) suggests that Marxist theories of crime and juvenile delinquency promote the idea that capitalist societies exist for the benefit of the owners of capital. Marxist approaches to crime consider the four central elements of ideology, law construction, law enforcement and criminal values as a reflection of capitalism's values. The point of departure for Marxist analysis is capitalism's construction of an ideology, whereby the values people hold are manipulated by the ruling class. What is defined as crime is a result of the values which ruling classes have imposed upon society, the law reflects and upholds these values. Laws are enforced to limit workers' rights or control the activities of youth in inner city areas, who pose a threat to the expansion of capitalistic markets.

This deficiency to find the causes of the problems of the youth in the overall strategy of the State and capitalism is explored by researchers such as Wolpe (1980: 03) and Hall (1981: 34-43) who devoted much of their attention to the concept of articulation and the dissolution - conservation thesis. Wolpe (1980: 03) points out that this thesis assumes that where capitalism develops by its means of articulation with non-capitalist modes, the mode of political domination and the content of legitimating ideologies assume racial, ethnic and cultural forms. Hall
(1981: 35) suggests that the social formation itself can be analysed as an articulated hierarchy of different social elements. Depending on the nature of this articulation, capitalist forces can undermine the domestic sector, driving peasants into urban slums as under-employed labourers, who breed working-class and lumpen cultures (see par 2.1.1.), while promoting a small bureaucratic elite pursuing typical colonial middle-class cultures (see par 6.6.). A good example were the symbols and culture around nightclubs, casinos, hotels and resorts that became the centres for crime, corruption and bribery in the 1960's. Here colonial behaviour was copied.

Why were the gangs formed and what held them together? How could they be identified against their proletarian background? These fundamental questions have been addressed by Bonner (1988: 395) and Glaser (1989: 02) and, in particular, by Pinnock in his important study on street gangs in Cape Town. Pinnock (1984: 99) develops an interesting argument which can be generalised to the past and to the rest of the country. For Pinnock (1984: 99) ganging is primarily a 'survival technique' in response to the socio-economic system which reproduces poverty. With the Group Areas relocations, the poor were sealed off in single-class townships 'with no one to buy their labour or products' with no access to income opportunities. Only gang orientated lifestyles could offer
them a substitute for what society had failed to give. They represented an attempt to resolve the contradictions which remain unresolved in the parent culture, such as unemployment and poverty, or to retrieve some of the socially cohesive elements destroyed in their parent culture, such as family care and the solidarities of the traditional neighbourhood destroyed by the Group Areas Act. Bonner (1988: 396) also argues that the principal factors in the breeding of juvenile delinquents and youth gangs in the 1950's were the shortage of schools, the absence of employment opportunities for youth, the grinding poverty of Black urban life, and the general instability of family life.

Humphries (1984: 03) argues that given the particular nature of South African racial capitalism and its harsh social and economic conditions, youth culture emerged predominantly as street gang culture. With the expansion of the secondary school system, demographic pressures and the development of new forms of ideological and political socialisation, by the Black Consciousness Movements such as SASO in the late 1960's and early 1970's and particularly the Soweto uprising in 1976 and its subsequent consequences, the emerging street gang culture was increasingly brought into schools. Schools became a melting-pot where cultures inherited from the past rural experience, street gang culture and new cultural forms were
combined and processed to forge a wider, national youth resistance culture. Factors such as school size, overcrowded classes, the inadequate facilities and the increasing drop-out rate became catalysts which fuelled the process of resistance and turned schools into "youth shopfloors". Contradictions generated in the making of this culture and the increasing State repression resulted in the crisis of youth resistance culture from the early 1980's onwards (see par 6.4.3.).

6.4.3. Counter Hegemonic Strategies of Resistance: The School Boycotts

The 1976 Soweto uprising proved a decisive turning point in the development of the liberation struggle. Pamphilis (1991: 264) shows that from that time resistance spread to all parts of the country, and became more efficiently organised. It took a variety of forms and drew into activity all sectors of the Black Population as well as a steadily increasing proportion of pupils in Coloured and Indian schools.

Naidoo (1991: 154) notes that in 1981 the State planned elaborate nationwide celebrations to commemorate the twentieth anniversary of the founding of the Republic of South Africa. This led to national protests by the anti-apartheid organisations, such as the United Democratic
Front (UDF). The 1981 anti-Republic Day campaigns witnessed sporadic, unco-ordinated school boycotts in many communities. The most severe repressive action occurred in the Indian schools, when the Director of Indian Education, G. Krog expelled 500 students for participating in the boycotts. The failure of the 1981 anti-Republic day boycotts to engage the majority of students in the region, together with the subsequent victimisation of activists had an adverse effect on future high school resistance among Indian students.

On 20 May 1981 an urgent meeting between the representatives of the TASA and the Director of Indian Education was convened to address the plight of the affected pupils. The Association contended that the pupils boycotted their classes so that they could draw attention to the political problems in the country. However, the Association strongly felt that this was not the function of pupils. The discussions between the Director and the Association came to a halt when the Director indicated that he would proceed with his decision to expel the pupils (Minutes of the meeting between the TASA and the Director of Indian Education (Durban), 20:05:81); Natal Mercury, 18 June 1981: 01). Nair (1981a: 29) shows that on three subsequent occasions P.C. Samuels, together with an interim committee of parents and pupils, met with the Director in order to resolve the issue of the pupils' impending
expulsion. Nair (1982: 28) points out that in an interview with the Minister of Education, the Association's representatives expressed concern for the serious plight of these pupils who were not allowed to attend school and a plea was made to the Minister to re-consider his decision. However, the Minister was not prepared to consider the re-admission of these pupils. Although the campaign for reinstatement of students raised the awareness of those parents whose children had been expelled, by and large, the majority of students and parents were intimidated by the State. The message was loud and clear; boycott and risk expulsion!

The Association maintained that the procedure which was laid down by the Department of Education for the expulsion of pupils be reviewed as it removed discretion from the principals who were best suited to deal effectively and humanely with pupils that expressed dissent through absenteeism from the classroom. Furthermore, the Association resolved that the Department give urgent attention to the creation of circumstances which would enable a responsible leadership of pupils to develop. However, the Association did not define the specifics of these circumstances (Nair 1981b: 33).

While TASA met with the authorities, concerned parents and community leaders, in order to resolve the issue of "pupil
unrest", it considered the examination of the entire phenomenon of "pupil unrest" in an atmosphere free of charged emotion to be of vital importance to the interests of education. It was for this purpose that a one-day mini-conference was convened by the Association in September 1981. The planned programme allowed Samuels to present an overview of the crisis situation in schools. The following papers were delivered at the conference: The History of Boycotts; the Socio-Psychological Implications of School Boycotts; A Study of the Psychological effect of Boycotts, Suspensions and Expulsions; The Role of a Teacher Association in Boycotts (Nair 1982: 27). However, these papers gave insights into the school boycott phenomenon from a psychological perspective and did not consider the economic and political contexts in which pupil unrest arose. These papers attempted to analyse the behaviour of youth from a functionalist point of view which is confirmed by Brake (1980: 41) who contends that youth normlessness, restlessness and anti-social behaviour arises when disruption of the social order occurs and the collective social order and collective conscience, fails to control individual aspirations. Under these circumstances Brake (1980: 42) argues that the youth develop forms of behaviour characterised by psychological imbalance, instability, conformity, escapist fantasy and violence. Youth culture is thus explained in terms of youth insecurity, uncertainty, purposelessness, aimlessness, excitability, alienation and confusion.
However, from a Marxist perspective Humphries (1984: 04) and Corrigan (1985: 06) have convincingly demonstrated that much of the behaviour of working class youth which is conventionally stigmatised as anti-social can alternatively be conceptualised as resistance to social contradictions such as unemployment and the poverty experienced in capitalist societies, and to some extent, can be viewed as an indictment of oppressive institutions. Thus, both researchers blame schooling for manufacturing delinquency. Cross (1992: 79) affirms this point of view when he states that the boycott of schools by working class youth could be viewed as rational adaptations to harsh and uncertain living and working conditions imposed by capitalist exploitation.

While teachers accepted the dominant values of capitalism, or its hegemony, even when they were exposed to injustices, they were unlikely to do much about it, because Moore (1995: 111) believes they were restrained by the middle class fixation on their careers, home mortgages, and family commitments. Moore (1995: 112) believes that youth have few of these commitments, and are therefore able to express their resentment and opposition to capitalism. The form of opposition can vary depending upon specific historical circumstances, but one form of opposition is through youth cultures, which allow them to express, perhaps to themselves, their rejection of the system which
provides most working-class youth with a bleak future. Working-class youth culture tends to challenge the status quo and provide a real solution to their bleak future, and perhaps an alternative to the system that oppresses them.

For Naidoo (1991: 151), the boycott represented the first mass action taken by youth from all the oppressed communities in Durban. In most African townships the school boycotts resulted in a boost to the Congress of South African Students (COSAS), the student movement at high school level. In some Indian and Coloured areas youth organisations began to take root. The genesis and the development of these youth organisations followed various paths and were influenced by many factors such as the politicising effect of the boycotts and religious influences. At the same time, teacher organisations particularly from the Indian community, felt that Indian and Coloured youth were not ready for a highly politicised organisation as COSAS. Naidoo (1991: 152) examines the case of a particular body, namely, Helping Hands, to illustrate this point. Following the school boycotts, students at Chatsworth High became frustrated with their inability to engage in active resistance against the State. The students then chose to engage in a relief campaign to aid drought victims in rural areas of KwaZulu Natal. The major stimulus was the desire to identify with the plight of African people whom they perceived as facing a
predicament significantly more serious than their own. The student leaders accepted that there were issues that required attention within their immediate constituency but identification with the African community was in itself perceived as being more political and hence more attractive. Various fund-raising activities were organised for charity. However when the principal refused to allow the funds to be donated to the KwaZulu Drought Fund, the students formed the Helping Hands organisation, outside the control of the school authorities in order to continue the campaign. Thus the intransigence of a conservative school principal, a member of TASA, became the catalyst in the formation of Helping Hands. This organisation went on to produce many committed activists who openly defied the apartheid regime.

Naidoo (1991: 153) argues that such a transition from student issues to political questions was slower among Indian and Coloured youth than among African youth. This was partly due to the higher levels of repression faced by African youth, which, in some cases, accelerated political conscientisation. During the boycotts some measure of co-ordination across the racial divide was achieved through the Natal Schools Action Committee, a hastily formed coalition of tertiary and secondary school representatives. This was one of the first attempts at non-racial youth co-ordination. However, on 17 August 1981 this unity was
undermined by a visit of an Indian and Coloured delegation to the Minister of Internal Affairs to present a list of educational demands for all South Africans. Samuels and the Secretary General, D. Nair, represented TASA (Minutes of the National Council of the TASA at this meeting (Durban), 12:09:81). Naidoo (1991:152) points out that neither the delegation nor the demands presented had been sanctioned properly by the Natal Schools Action committee. The failure to consolidate the Committee weakened future student and youth struggles in the region. Another shortcoming was the minimal participation of unemployed youth, workers and parents in the protests.

6.5. The Hegemony of the Curriculum

6.5.1. Introduction

Gramsci (Sarup 1979:172) emphasises the notion that class domination is exercised not only through the physical coercion by the State apparatus, but also through the education system, especially in advanced capitalist countries where education plays a prominent role in civil society. In particular this ideological hegemony occurs when the dominant class uses the curriculum to transmit their beliefs, values and cultural traditions, thus
perpetuating the existing order. Sarup (1979: 173) adds that the educational system via the curriculum plays a significant role in preparing individuals for the world of alienated and stratified work relationships, where the reproduction of the social relations of production in the workplace depends on the reproduction of consciousness by schools.

6.5.2. Cultural Reproduction

Bourdieu's (Giroux 1983a: 267) theory of cultural reproduction begins with the assumption that divided societies like South Africa and the ideological and material configurations on which they rested was partially mediated and reproduced through what he calls "symbolic violence". This "symbolic violence" is waged by the dominant class in order to impose a definition of the social world that is consistent with their interests. Culture becomes the mediating link between ruling-class interests in everyday life whereby it functions to portray the economic and political interests of the dominant classes, not as arbitrary and historically contingent, but as necessary and as a natural element of the social order.

Freire & Shor (1987: 123) point out that the educational environment is "symbolically violent" because it is based on manipulation and subordination. It openly declares
itself democratic while actually constructing and reproducing inequality. The curriculum is presented as normative, neutral and benevolent, whilst adjusting most pupils to subordinate positions in society. It is symbolic because it is in the very order of things, an environment of rules, tests, punishments, requirements, correction, remediation, and the use of standardised English which ordains the authorities as the ones in charge.

The concepts of culture and cultural capital are central to Bourdieu’s (1993: 32) analysis of how the mechanisms of cultural production function within schools. He argues that the culture transmitted by the school is related to the various cultures that make up the wider society since it confirms the culture of the ruling classes while simultaneously discrediting the cultures of other groups. The notion of cultural capital points to the different sets of linguistic and cultural competencies that individuals inherit by way of their family’s class location. A child inherits from his or her family those sets of meanings, qualities of style, modes of thinking, and types of dispositions that are assigned a certain social value and status in accordance with the dominant class label as the most valued cultural capital. They tend to legitimise certain forms of knowledge, ways of speaking, and ways of relating to the world that capitalise on the type of familiarity and skills that only certain pupils have
received from their family backgrounds and class relations. Pupils whose families have only a tenuous connection to the dominant cultural capital are at a distinct disadvantage.

By linking power and culture, Giroux (1983a: 268) provides insights into how the hegemonic curriculum works in schools, exposing the political interests underlying the selection and distribution of those bodies of knowledge that are given top priority. These bodies of knowledge not only legitimise the interests and values of the dominant classes, but they also have the effect of marginalising or disconfirming other kinds of knowledge, particularly knowledge important to feminists and the working class. For example, working class pupils often find themselves subjected to a school curriculum in which the distinction between high status knowledge and low status knowledge is organised around the difference between theoretical and practical subjects. Courses that deal with practical subjects, whether they be Industrial Arts or Home Economics, are seen as marginal and inferior.

Wolpe (1988: 152) affirms the above notion that the knowledge base which constitutes the curriculum is intricately tied in with class and power relations of the society. Pupils who pursue an academic curriculum are more likely to find a pathway into higher paid occupations than those in the non-academic streams. Girls who pursue
academic curricula may gain access to higher paid occupations, although their scope is limited because of the structure of the labour market, the absence of women's power in it and the overall domination of women particularly in terms of the division of labour both at the work place and in the home. Giroux (1983a: 268) suggests that working-class knowledge and culture are often placed in competition with what the school legitimates as dominant culture and knowledge.

Raidoo (1966: 16) shows that many members of NITS reflected these trends in their articulation of the curriculum in the classroom. He points out these members emphasised academic subjects to the detriment of practical subjects (cf 5.4.2.). Bonacich (1980: 215) attempts to explain this trend by suggesting that academic subjects appealed more to the Indian middle-class teachers than practical orientated subjects. These teachers believed that there was a greater chance of effective social mobility for their pupils if they were taught academic orientated subjects. In 1966 the NITS gained representation on a number of subject committees that were set up by the DIA. Through these committees the reciprocal relationship between the State and NITS promoted an elitist curriculum which strongly appealed to the Indian middle class. Naidoo (1969: 05) shows that of the eleven subject societies that were established by SAITA in July
1969 only eight, catering mainly for academic subjects, functioned actively. These subject societies made little reference to concepts that related to the working class, nor did they reflect the importance of women in the curriculum. Ultimately, working class knowledge and culture are seen not as different and equal, but as different and inferior. Carter (1990: 97) shows that by valorising mental labour and disqualifying manual labour, the hegemonic curriculum functioned to exclude and devalue working class history and culture. This has the effect of not only discounting teachers' identification with the worker movement, but it also prevents a working class consciousness from developing.

Thus, for Giroux (1983a: 268) education not only legitimises the dominant cultural capital through the hierarchically arranged bodies of school knowledge in the hegemonic curriculum, but also rewards pupils who use the linguistic style of the ruling class. The record reveals that the many branches of SAITA advanced this idea of cultural capital in a practical way by organising elaborate speech contests for pupils. The Association even went to the extent to hire special tutors from England on an annual basis to train both teachers and pupils in the finer aspects of delivering speeches (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 22). Certain linguistic styles, along with body postures and the social relations they reinforce
act as identifiable forms of cultural capital that either reveal or betray a pupil's social background. Giroux (1983a: 269) maintains that in effect, certain linguistic practices and modes of discourse become privileged by being treated as natural when in fact they are the speech habits of dominant classes and thus serve to perpetuate cultural privileges.

In essence the Association viewed the curriculum as supporting and maintaining a stable society. Evidence of the Association's plea for sustaining and promoting these middle class values is reflected in the following statement made by the chairman of the Pietermaritzburg branch, who stated: The youth of today will be the leaders of tomorrow and bring the change in the community to which we must adapt. Guidance is essential to assist young men and women who identify with and take up community responsibilities (SAITA, Golden Jubilee Souvenir Brochure 1979: 19).

In attempting to explain the significance of the above, Carter (1990: 96) contends that a central concern of structural-functionalism is with the transmission of social norms and values. The major proponent of this ideology within the Indian community, namely SAITA, claimed that the school should provide a valuable contribution to the public well-being by training pupils to become good citizens, to acquire the knowledge and learning skills needed by society and to perform necessary social and communication skills in order to participate effectively in society. From this vantage point, belief systems and basic values in the
curriculum are not challenged. Structural elements, including socio-economic and political arrangements, remained form to the status quo, rather than empowering teachers and pupils by providing them with skills that allow for personal critical reflection on social life and an ability to penetrate the hegemony of the dominant class. Freire & Shor (1987:110) assert that the development of critical reflection by teachers and pupils is absolutely fundamental for the radical transformation of society. Their curiosity and their critical perception of reality, are fundamental for social transformation (see par 6.5.5.).

6.5.3. The Fragmentation of the Curriculum

Naidoo (1989:112) notes that a four-phase system of differentiated education was introduced in 1973 in Indian schools, while a system of subject differentiation was implemented in the early 1980's.

The NITS promotion of a differentiated curriculum can be traced back to 1963 when Lazarus (1963:18) claimed that one of the major reasons for the high failure rate among pupils was that the secondary course was the same for all pupils regardless of their aptitudes and abilities. Lazarus (1963:18) stated that the limited range of subjects in the curriculum called for the introduction of a
curriculum which would take into account the pupils aptitude as well as the needs of the community. However, the issue of a differentiated curriculum aroused tension within the Society.

Moodley (1963: 02) points out that while the executive of the NITS expressed strong arguments in favour of differentiated education, some members of the Society were critical of the labelling that was implicit in the streaming process. They averred that such labelling affected the motivation of the pupil and consequently the pupil was not encouraged to perform at his best. These members felt that it was the duty of the teacher to put more effort in teaching such pupils and to raise them to the required standards. There was also the fear that very few children from working class homes would be grouped in the "A" stream. The Society subsequently directed a sub-committee to investigate the problem. It expected that the presentation of a paper on this issue and the ensuing discussion would resolve some of the tensions that were experienced on the issue of streaming. While the sub-committee considered the differentiated education system as imperative in order to stabilise the pass rates, it failed to question the broader implications of a differentiated system of education.
In 1972 in an uncritical response to the new system R.S. Naidoo (1972: 05; 10) stated: "...we teachers have to adjust ourselves to the demands of differentiated education. We are conscious of our new responsibility..."

In 1973 when the system of differentiated education was introduced, the Association readily accepted it. However, Nair (1973: 25) shows that many members did express their reservations about the manner of its implementation. These members were concerned that important and essential areas such as school buildings, specialist facilities, equipment, and the supply of specialist teachers had not been sufficiently provided.

Bowles & Gintis (1976: 13) present the argument that the school's purpose of dividing knowledge into unrelated subjects, such as Mathematics, History and English, amongst others, is to prepare pupils for the fragmentation of employment in later life, where jobs are broken into component elements in such a way that the actual process of work becomes pointless and fragmented to the individual worker. This division of labour arises in society due to class divisions in society. Bowles & Gintis (1976: 11) further point out that a process of alienation appears wherever the division of labour is the operative principle of economic organisation. According to Marx (Omi and Winant 1986: 208), the process of alienation arises out of this division of labour. The greater the division of
labour, the smaller is the task assigned to each individual. This is one way in which the increasing pressure towards subject specialisation or a differentiated curriculum in a school can be understood.

For Shapiro (1981: 106) the basic assumption behind the policy of a differentiated curriculum was that the class structure was immutable in a highly stratified racial oligarchy such as in South Africa. This assumption was fuelled by the cyclic effect of providing an education which trained people according to their "opportunities in life". This concept of differentiated curricula used the expected future to match child and curriculum and presumed the problematic notion that Black working class children had restricted futures. By accepting this without question and providing a limited education to match that restricted future the differential curricula ensured the continuation of the cycle. While Black education had served to further racial inequality, Shapiro (1981: 107) emphasises the fact that the State had been more concerned with maintaining the specific form of capitalist domination than in maintaining irrational racial inequality.

Shapiro (1981: 108) argues that the system of differentiated education was used to reproduce both a mass of cheap labour power, and a necessary, but limited, supply of more skilled, and hence, more expensive labour.
Althusser (1972: 246) describes how portions of scholastically adapted youth were ejected at various stages into the appropriate sectors of production. Each group of pupils ejected en route were practically provided with the ideology which suited the role they had to fulfil in a stratified society.

Shapiro (1981: 108) points out that the significance of Black education was not so much in its ideological content, nor in the limited skills which it imparted, but in the very fact that it was different. Differentiated education was thus a convenient way of distributing people among various occupations and the varying degrees of wealth, power and privilege that were associated with these occupations. The system of differentiated education ensured an over-supply of minimally skilled people whose position at the bottom of the hierarchical occupation pyramid could be justified in educational terms and whose abundant numbers ensured a docile and cheap labour force for capital. Teacher organisations, like SAITA used the liberal assumption that economic inequality between the races would eventually be overcome by mass education. Thus, for the Association the solution to the problem was not in questioning the economic system, but in allowing more of the poor Blacks to occupy middle class positions through improved education (A Review of Indian Education and the Organised Profession 1992: 20).
Hussein's (1976: 15) argument, however, makes the point, that the role of education in ultimately providing a middle class status for more than a small minority of the working class was strictly limited within the capitalist system. Hussein (1976: 15) asserts that education alone could change nothing and he avers that even if the differentiated education system was removed, as long as the labour market remained structurally differentiated by race, changes in the education system would have been insignificant.

Under the De Lange reforms (see par 6.3.2.) the principle of pupil streaming at all levels was to eliminate "wastage". Evans (1992: 82) notes that the report endorsed "differentiation... according to the grade of difficulty," and canalisation of individuals into appropriate directions that best suited their individual abilities and the needs of the country. Evans (1992: 82) declares that the De Lange recommendations to "equalise" Black education were tailored towards producing certain skills commensurate with the needs of industry. Proposed measures such as the expansion of technical, vocational, and industrial training, for example, addressed the shortage of skilled labour in the industry. However, the report also attempted to endorse improvements in Black education by couching the case for reform in the neutral, "scientific" language of rational planning in a market economy. Nasson (1990: 167) contends that the De Lange
reforms delivered an education system structured by social privilege and unequal income distribution. Middle-class communities enjoyed selective access to partially subsidised formal secondary schooling, while poor working-class children were shunted into heavily subsidised, narrow vocational and technical training, financed directly by market interests. The overwhelming mass of the Black working class pupils began to experience a contraction in the length of formal education. Nasson (1990: 167) concludes that streaming actually reproduced and enlarged the divisions, hierarchies, and inequalities of the occupational order.

6.5.4. Struggling for Relevance in the Curriculum

The record reveals that as a counter-hegemonic strategy, NITS did pursue the idea of a relevant curriculum. As early as 1962 a member captures the attitude of the Society on this issue. In a letter addressed to the Society the member commented: Why teach a History that would develop destructive nationalism than progressive internationalism? Formulate a History syllabus that highlights the brilliant episodes and the great heroes of the various nations, and show the overall growth of the nation instead of the sordid details of intrigue and opportunism (University of Durban-Westville Documentation Centre, Durban. Letter on Multi-Racial Education. 15 October 1962).
In the same year, R.G. Pillay (1962: 08) stated that an appraisal of History textbooks was urgently needed and he called for a new orientation in the writing of History textbooks which would reflect for instance the growing sense of interdependence among communities. In 1970 R.S. Naidoo (1970a: 06) claimed that the history textbook was largely about the stories of other people. He questioned: "Have we not contributed to the prosperity of this land"? Naidoo noted that the history textbook only briefly mentioned the arrival of the Indians to South Africa in 1860. It also highlighted the chronological sequence of all the laws that affected the Indian in South Africa. By 1970 no Indian South African had qualified for even a passing mention in history textbooks, with the notable exception of Mahatma Gandhi. While the Association acknowledged that the education department had introduced in the syllabus, famous South African heroes such as the Padvattan brothers who saved about 180 lives during the 1918 Umgeni floods, it was disappointed that this account could not be found in any published History textbook. In 1976 R.S. Naidoo (1976: 19) declared that an urgent review of textbooks was necessary, especially in subjects like History where the Indian community had suffered through omission, half-truths and inaccuracies. He noted that these matters perpetuated attitudes of prejudice and encouraged disrespect. He called on teachers of History and the History Society of the Association to take active
steps to ensure that these misconceptions were corrected.

Chisholm (1981: 134) demonstrates that South African history textbooks, have particularly shown how dominant minority attitudes, found expression in certain interpretations and phraseology, which were responsible for the creation of those attitudes which characterised, underpinned and sustained the status quo. The textbook was not only erroneous but distorted whole sections of history. Consequently, the history that was taught to the Black child, thus denied his existence. For instance, the heroism of Black resistance to the oppression shown by the State is hardly chartered. The implications of this are two fold. On the one hand, by denying Blacks a history, the State intended to prevent the growth of a national class consciousness and to significantly reduce any desire for a radical alternative. On the other hand, the kind of history which had as its purpose, the glorification of the status quo and the denigration of reformist and revolutionary movements and their protagonists, must of necessity, invite reflection on its objectivity, the desirability thereof and the role of the teacher in this kind of history (see par 6.5.5.).

Freire & Shor (1987: 137) point out that the official curriculum is very imposing. The traditional textbooks establish powerful norms which intimidate teachers,
discouraging them from "doing something different". The result is either a bookish academic curriculum or a dehumanizing vocational program. Either curriculum is presented as a value-free system where conceptual analysis does not make contact with the real world of pupils. The official curriculum also has a strong bias to empiricise and to abstract. Where a subject does describe some part of reality in detail, it doesn't offer pupils a critical unveiling of its politics. Where a course does offer conceptual frameworks, these concepts are abstract, that is, so far removed from reality that they keep the pupils unarmed in challenging their culture. Morris (1986: 23) points out that in South Africa many teachers within the established teacher organisations conformed with the official interpretation that was demanded by the State, and therefore any attempt at making certain evidence available to the pupils in exciting ways which could challenge thought, was extremely limited. Thus teachers were constrained from helping the pupils to develop historical skills and critical thought which included the ability to recognise bias and propaganda, to question evidence and to understand how history is constructed; how there can be variety of interpretations and how to distinguish between them.

Sarup (1979: 140) points out that arguments concerning an irrelevant curriculum should not be confined to textbooks,
but should also consider a broader view of education. Sarup (1979: 141-142) introduces the notion that the curriculum becomes irrelevant to pupils when education is viewed as a mode of production and the school becomes a factory where pupils are seen both as workers and as commodities to be produced. Within the school the pupil is seen as a labour resource. Here the pupil exchanges the product of his labour for "objects" such as house points, grades or certificates which are metaphors for wages which he will earn later in productive employment. On leaving school the pupil exchanges these products for different occupations that have already been graded in relation to qualification, status and salary. Thus, the pupil's activity in school is an expression of activity in society. Many pupils find the curriculum to be irrelevant because they were not given the opportunity to acquire these "objects". In this process pupils are transformed into products, commodities to be sold on the market. Pupils are categorised only in terms of certain characteristics that ideal pupils should possess such as interest, discipline, ability and intelligence.

The unsuccessful attempts by the NITS and SAITA to achieve a relevant curriculum was due to its parochial request for the curriculum to be Indian-centred instead of multicultural. Even when it was able to gain representation on the South African Council for Education (SACE), the
foremost advisory body on educational policy, including school curricula, the Association was powerless to secure a relevant curriculum, as the SACE was later shown to be ineffective in influencing State policy (Samuels 1984: 07-08). The researcher contends that in this hegemonic period NITS and SAITA also failed to rectify the strong gender bias against females in the curriculum (A Review of Indian Education and the Organised Profession 1992: 27).

Joseph (1988: 178) declares that the curriculum in patriarchal capitalist society of South Africa neglected the history of women's experiences. Instead the curriculum operated from a male centred perspective. Wolpe (1988: 149) suggests that even when the curriculum considered women, it portrayed motherhood as the main goal for women. It legitimised the specific exploitation of women, by showing that it was natural for them to be employed in housework, part-time jobs, and through the idea that women were not regarded as the main supporters or essential contributors to the family income. The hegemonic curriculum perpetuated the ideology of women as docile and subservient in society with limited occupational opportunities.

Spender (Moore 1995: 161) suggests that the curriculum consistently ignored the contribution of women to the advancement of knowledge such as in the area of scientific research. Kelly (Moore 1995: 161) sees the gender issue
in the classroom as a microcosm of the wider patriarchal society. Kelly claims that in the study of science lessons, boys dominate the classes by insisting on performing the experiment, by shouting out answers to teachers and generally taking control. This male behaviour, allied to the fact that the majority of books were illustrated by male figures, made science a male dominated subject and irrelevant to many girls. Deem (Moore 1995: 161) indicates that teachers, are also influenced by the values of the wider society and import these values into the classroom. Deem noted in her study that interaction in the classroom is built around these values. For example, only boys were asked to help lift things. Textbooks in primary schools were often gender biased, with males being the more dominant characters. Wolpe (1988: 153) also points to the hidden curriculum which through its operation, messages relating to gender differences specifically of an ideological nature are directly or indirectly transmitted.

6.5.5. Methods of Curriculum Delivery

Freire & Shor (1987: 76) argue that the public schooling system mandates a curriculum which socialises each new generation into the values of private enterprise. Education is thus a complicated and indirect agency through which corporate interests are promoted in the public
sector. In order to obtain these outcomes, the State not only imposes mechanical curricula, but attempts to control the role of teachers and pupils in the classroom. The inequality and hierarchy in capitalistic society simply produces a curriculum that is compatible with control from above. This chain of authority ends in a passive, "transfer pedagogy" that dominates schools.

For a large part of the 1960's and 1970's, NITS and SAITA turned their attention to professional activities (see par 6.6.). Much of these activities involved training teachers in the methods of curriculum delivery. However, many of these workshops on methods still centred around the transfer of knowledge approach. The workshops also emphasised techniques rather than a critical contact with reality. This prevented the political analysis of the forces that constructed the curricula (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 18).

Wolpe (1988: 154) attempts to explain this trend by pointing out that creativity in pedagogy is related to creativity in politics. The authoritarian political regime prevented the freedom needed for creativity, and creativity is needed for effective learning. Schools were set up as delivery systems to market official ideas and hence did not develop critical thinking. Knowledge was produced in a place remotely from the pupils who were only requested
to memorise what the teacher taught. The teacher became a specialist in transferring knowledge. This transfer-of-knowledge approach was the most suitable pedagogy for sustaining elite authority. Wolpe (1988: 155) contends that for the State education became much more controllable if the teacher followed the standard curriculum and if the pupils acted as if only the teacher's words were important.

Freire & Shor (1987: 76) assert that if the teachers or pupils exercised their power to remake knowledge in the classroom, then they would be asserting their power to remake society. The structure of official knowledge is also the structure of social authority. This explains why the didactic lecture predominated as the educational form for containing teachers and pupils inside the official consensus. The lecture-based, passive curriculum is not simply poor pedagogical practice, but it is the teaching model compatible with promoting the dominant authority in society and with disempowering pupils. Reeves (1994: 115) contends that during the apartheid years, the social relations of the classroom became "alienating and silencing". The cold distance between pupils and the teacher kept them far from the study material. Professionals left politics to the official policy makers at the top. These falsely neutral curricula trained teachers and pupils to observe things without judging, to see the world from the official consensus, to carry out
orders without questioning, as if society was stable and immutable.

Even when teacher organisations workshopped new instructional technologies and programmed instructional materials in the 1970's (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 32), Carlson (1988: 161) argues that these had the effect of de-skilling teachers in the traditional craft skills of teaching, that is, knowledge of the subject matter and pedagogic knowledge of the learning process. Teachers became re-skilled by these new instructional technologies and acted more as supervisors of a predetermined classroom production process, or classroom managers. Their job was reduced to keeping pupils on the task, disciplining those pupils who disrupted the "production" process and keeping track of "production records" primarily through administering and recording test data. Teachers began to control children more and instruct them less.

Reeves (1994: 116) points out that conservative teacher organisations in the 1960's had imposed on pupils the idea of careerism. Such a repressive, business-oriented milieu made pupils resist experimental and innovative pedagogy. Expecting a job after traditional education was not a problem for the official curriculum nor for teachers who utilised the transfer of knowledge approach. It was normal
for traditional classrooms to respond to the pupils' preoccupation with getting a job. This was a very concrete and realistic expectation which easily fitted into the regular way of schooling. Wolpe (1988: 154) points out that many members of the established teacher organisations agreed with the status quo, including the racially structured job market the pupils had to enter. In this regard Freire & Shor (1987: 54) make a distinction between educators by pointing out that the traditional educator and the democratic educator both have to be competent in their ability to educate pupils, providing them with skills needed for jobs. But the traditionalist does it with an ideology concerned with the preservation of the establishment. While the liberating or democratic educator will try to be efficient in training, and in forming the pupils scientifically and technically he or she will try to unveil the ideology enveloped in the very expectations of the pupils. The traditional educator offers technical training in a way that strengthens the hold of dominant ideology on pupil consciousness. Training does not reveal the politics of doing such work. The liberatory teacher does not mystify his subject matter, but poses critical questions while teaching.

Sarup (1979: 169) notes that these teacher organisations which favoured the stricter educational methods reflected their own work-experiences and their submission to
authority. Bowles and Gintis (1988: 17) also contend that overworked teachers led to an authoritarian ethos, with an emphasis on rote learning and a high premium on obedience and punctuality, rather than on creativity and independence, and that these values were compatible with the needs of capitalism. However unintended these particular consequences of the education system were, they nevertheless, fitted well with the major part of the workforce demands of mining, industries and agriculture.

Bowles and Gintis (1976: 13) point out that the acceptance of authority was a basic requirement for increased productivity in the workplace. Successful job performance by members required the workers to follow rules and obey authority. These teachers inculcated these values into the subjects that they taught in the school. Bowles and Gintis (1976: 14) suggest that the prime purpose of these values was to produce a willing, subservient workforce, one that would continue to help to benefit the profit-making enterprises of the ruling class and at the same time not challenge their dominance of society. In particular, these researchers pointed that the low marks at school were related to creativity, aggressiveness and independence, while high grades were related to perseverance, consistency, dependability and punctuality. In other words the higher grades were not awarded for intelligence and creativity, but for conformity.
6.6. The Ideology of Professionalism

Marx (Moore 1995: 21) contends that with the control of the media, religion and the education system, the bourgeoisie is able to provide the proletariat with a constant flow of information which distorts reality so that the proletariat fails to realise its common exploited position. Freire & Shor (1987: 45) maintain that this exploitation requires the ruling groups to invent myths and explanations in order to mask domination and present it as something else.

Giroux (1983a: 280) focuses on the relationship between power and knowledge, but specifically on how the State exercises and imposes its hegemony through the production of 'truth and knowledge' about education. Giroux (1983a: 280) argues for example, that the production of dominant ideologies in education is to be found not only in the high-status knowledge and social relations sanctioned by the State bureaucracy, but more importantly, in the reproduction of the mental-manual division (see par 6.5.2.). He asserts that the State appropriates, trains, and legitimates "intellectuals" or professionals who serve as experts in the production and conception of school knowledge. Behind this facade of credentialised expertise of professionalism lies the major feature of dominant ideology, namely the separation of knowledge from power.
Poulantzas (1973: 60) states, that the knowledge-power relationship finds expression in particular techniques of the exercise of power devices inscribed in the texture of the State, whereby the popular masses are permanently kept at a distance from the centres of decision-making. These comprise a series of rituals and styles of speech by professionals, as well as structural modes of formulating and tackling problems, whereby these professionals monopolise knowledge in such a way that the popular masses are effectively excluded.

Carlson (1988: 168) raises fundamental issues about the social and political role of professionals. He contends that professionalism is an aspect of teachers’ collective occupational culture that shows signs of accommodating tendencies. As a legitimating ideology, professionalism has its roots in the development of the new middle class (see par 3.2). It has always been in the interests of dominant groups to promote among the public the belief that this intermediary stratum of workers, which actually serves the needs of capital and the State, is politically neutral or disinterested. The traditional professional values of service to the community such as highly specialised or esoteric knowledge, and technical expertise all become useful in legitimating the role of this new middle class.
Shapiro (1981: 102) contends that the winning of co-operation of these professionals by the State has both an ideological and an economic dimension. It is this assent which ensures that professional ideologists will be available for various positions in the occupational hierarchy, and that they will fill those positions without complaint or disruption. The State ensures that the middle class reaps a number of material concessions such as promotions and the obtaining of awards for outstanding service (see par 6.3.2.). Carlson (1988: 169) points out that professionalism, in effect, removes conflicts and disputes from the overtly political realm, where the class nature of the conflict is more easily revealed. Dougherty (1980: 160) questions the very legitimacy of professional authority and privilege. He denies that professions truly have knowledge that is more valid than that of their clients and he argues that professional services are a sophisticated and insidious form of social control.

Wolpe (1988: 162) suggests that the way in which the State secured co-operation of teachers was through the articulation of a professional ideology which designated the role of teachers and principals as "professional managers" and "management experts". According to Wolpe (1988: 162) the established teacher organisations strongly identified themselves with this type of ideology. Reeves (1994: 62) adds that this ideology was well
received by the leadership and membership of NITS and SAITA because it played upon their middle class aspirations. Wolpe (1988: 162) suggests that these established teacher organisations had purposely turned to the ideology of professionalism in order to depoliticise the conflict over racially separate education structures and at the same time it legitimised their continued participation in these besieged structures of apartheid education. Carlson (1988: 168) points out that professionalism ensures that school policy, administration and practice are kept out of politics. Specifically, the professionalisation of teaching is used to reassure the public that those who direct children's educational experience apply the latest knowledge from the "science of education" to tailor instruction to each child's special needs. Carlson (1988: 168) adds that it is in the interests of the State to promote such a professional ideology among teachers as well as the public, so that the idealism of teachers' would be tapped and they would not seriously question the role of the schools in perpetuating social and economic inequality.

Althusser (1972: 246) argues that the reproduction of professional ideologists entails the reproduction of skills and knowledge and their submission to the ruling ideology. It is this process which is achieved by the capitalist education system, within the educational ideological apparatus. Shapiro (1981: 99) points out that in a
capitalist society, education functions not only to reproduce skills, but also to reproduce "submission to the rules of the established order", and it does this through the ideology of professionalism. Althusser (1972: 246) contends that individuals are practically provided with the ideology which suits the role they have to fulfil in class based society, be it the role of the exploited; of the agent of repression or of the professional ideologist. All ideology has the function of constituting individuals as subjects, that is, it interpellates individuals as subjects. These subjects are inserted into practices governed by the ideological State apparatuses, whereby they "recognise" the existing state of affairs. In this way the capitalist State ensures that the capitalist social formation reproduces itself.

While functionalism views professions to be peer controlled bodies, whose members are motivated by ideals of social service and loyalty to the profession (see par 3.3.), Larson (Dougherty 1980: 160) argues that professions serve as crucial supports for the class relations of advanced capitalism and are therefore not critical of their social role within this system. Larson (Dougherty 1980: 160) points to two principal ways in which the professions support the class relations of advanced capitalism. One is by reinforcing relations of authority within bureaucratic hierarchies, while the other is by obscuring real class
divisions in society. The professions reinforce bureaucratic hierarchies partly through their connection with advanced education. By tying entry into their ranks to the possession of educational credentials, the professions have contributed greatly to the development of a strong association between educational and economic outcomes. Differences in educational level thus becomes the major justification for differences in occupational placement, job stability, income, and power. Singh (1983: 30) justifies the above when he shows that TASA represented itself on the selection committees for prospective teachers at the colleges of education. He shows that the Association stipulated criteria which were distinctly academically orientated for the admission of these students.

Enslin (1980: 02) points out that the professions also reinforce bureaucratic hierarchies by fostering attitudes that are useful in the control of labour. By inculcating codes of proper behaviour, professionalism makes predictable the actions of those in positions that require a high degree of autonomy. Vilardo (1992: 17) shows that the code of conduct of established teacher organisations played an important role during the outbreaks of political unrest, by disciplining teachers and confining their activities to the parameters set by professionalism. Bepathram (1956: 10) points out that the code of conduct
of the NITS was used to maintain high moral standards and integrity among its members. The code also strongly inculcated in its members the need to respect the educational authorities, without harsh criticism. For the State, the code of conduct was an important way in which it could influence the teacher to perform his or her duty in accordance with the highest ideals without encountering any dissent (University of Durban-Westville Documentation Centre, Durban. Letter: Outcome of Interview from the Director of Education. 25 November 1963). Wright (1976:26) believes that by fanning concern for prestige and privilege, relative to similarly placed workers, the code of conduct undermined the possibility that teachers would organise or align themselves with the worker movement. By fostering individualism and specialisation, it exaggerated the power of narrowly defined occupations. By stressing science and objectivity, it excluded concern about the social and political consequences of the member's action.

Dougherty (1980:163) maintains that the professions had to organise a monopoly over professional services by channelling diffuse consumer demands into a demand for one distinct form of those services. Common standards had to be created over the form professional services should take, what needs they should meet, and who should provide them. Furthermore, public fears that monopoly would lead to abuse had to be allayed by presenting monopoly as fair and safe,
and even necessary. The channeling of consumer demand required that a distinctive professional commodity be created, State action be secured to drive out competing commodities, established professionals be induced to join the professional project, and the public be persuaded to seek professional services. In this regard, Reeves (1994: 70-73) points to the harsh repressive action taken by the State against the newly emergent or progressive teachers organisations in the 1970's and 1980's, such as the National Education Union of South Africa (NEUSA), the Progressive Teachers' Union (PTU) and the Western Cape Teachers' Union (WECTU).

Dougherty (1980: 165) argues that law, medicine and teaching faced an immediate problem in their attempt to create a professional commodity or, in other words, to standardise their services. Unlike engineers, lawyers, doctors and teachers do not produce tangible products and thus their services cannot be regulated through controls placed on products such as building codes. Larson (Dougherty 1980: 161) argues that the answer lay in standardising not the products but the producers, the professionals themselves. The producers of a distinct service or commodity would be distinguished from others by requiring them to possess a distinctive kind of knowledge. This negotiation of "cognitive exclusiveness" meant that the profession had to develop a uniform body of knowledge.
and a monopoly of instruction in that knowledge. Both NITS and SAITA played a significant role in promoting this "cognitive exclusiveness" through its professional development programmes. However much of these programmes conditioned teachers to the idea that professionalism should be separated from contemporary controversial political and socio-economic issues (TASA. Tenth Anniversary Brochure of the Co-ordinating Council for Professional Matters 1983: 03-15). Samuels (1984: 08) justifies this constrained function of professionalism, when he states that the patterns of professional activities enhanced the quality of teachers work in the classroom.

The promotion of the ideology of professionalism was further stimulated when Samuels (1976: 05) introduced an amendment to the Association's constitution which allowed for the establishment of a Co-ordinating Council for Professional Matters (CCPM). Nair (1973: 22) points out that the Council became the catalyst for significantly increasing the number of professional development programmes, by directing the work of the various subject societies. The Council determined the quality of textbooks, examined techniques of teaching, researched the field of learning, published various subject bulletins and motivated teachers by means of lectures, discussions and exposure to various teaching media (TASA. Tenth Anniversary Brochure of the CCPM 1983: 02). In 1975
Samuel's gave further impetus to professionalism when he initiated a major reconstruction of the Association's organisational structure. This reconstruction was aimed at the creation of a portfolio system of governance. Together with other portfolio's, the creation of the portfolio of Vice President for Professional Matters significantly increased the number of professional activities of the Association (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 20).

The analysis of the activities of the Association's subject societies reveals an apolitical, parochial type of professionalism. Freire & Shor (1987: 174) explore this dimension by contending that there is a strong ideological dimension to this question of challenging and transforming the consciousness of teachers. The dominant ideology makes its presence in the classroom partly felt by trying to convince the teacher to be neutral in order to respect the pupils. Freire & Shor (1987: 175) believe that this kind of neutrality shows a false respect for pupils. On the contrary, the more the teacher "says nothing about agreeing or not agreeing out of respect for the others, the more he leaves the dominant ideology in place". In particular the English society strongly demonstrated this idea of apolitical, uncritical professionalism. For instance, in April 1974, the English Society held a major conference on communication. However, the conference failed to place the subject English or the theme of communication within the
contemporary political and socio-economic struggles of South Africa. Instead it chose to stress the need for proper language and promoted an active awareness of the need for the preservation and propagation of the English language. It also urged pupils to develop an extensive vocabulary for effective communication (Saita News, July 1974; TASA. Tenth Anniversary Brochure of the CCPM 1983: 05).

Freire & Shor (1987: 71-73) contend that language is an ideological issue, related to social classes, where the identity and power of each class is expressed in its language. The English society promoted language from an elitist perspective. By emphasising the rules of English, they increased the members and pupils domination by elitist ideology which was inserted into these rules. Freire & Shor (1987: 71-73) believe that an adverse effect of this elitist ideology was that it established difficult criteria of language for pupils from working class backgrounds to achieve. While these established teacher organisations promoted the standard usage of English among its members, they did not expose the ideological assumptions within the English language. Freire & Shor (1987: 73) maintain that the latter is an important requirement for the empowerment of its members to transform society.

Even the publications of the subject societies were
used by the leadership to foster professional solidarity amongst its members and to propagate their ideas about the role of education and the teacher in society. At the same time, these publications acculturated its members to a conformist middle class ethos. On commenting on the purpose of the NITS Journal to the educational authorities, the editor stated: "...there has been no intention on our part...to rouse public indignation about socio-economic conditions" (UDW Documentation Centre, Durban. Letter: "Agitators". 25 October 1962).

The branch meetings of NITS and SAITA helped in socialising and promoting interpersonal contact, and at the same time fostered professional solidarity and an elite consciousness amongst the members. Carlson (1988: 167) suggests that active participation of members in these meetings promotes group cohesion and affirms group identity. Carlson (1988: 168) also adds that these meetings promotes an ideology of separatism, thus binding the petty bourgeoisie together, both socially and politically. The annual conference also conditioned members to a capitalistic ethic. At the NITS conference of 1964, C.J. Saunders, the managing director of the Tongaat Sugar Company appealed to the members to provide an apolitical education programme to the Indian community. In 1968, I.G. Halliday, a leading industrialist and director of companies asserted that the professional status of teachers was largely dependent on
the maintenance of a stable economy. Thus, these conferences covertly conditioned teachers into passivity, limiting any resistance from members on the political front (A Review of Indian Education and the Organised Profession 1992: 22).

The segregation of education also resulted in a set of racially differentiated teacher organisations. Consequently, there was very little contact among teacher organisations across the racial divide. Even when teachers came to work together at grass roots level, it was on an ad hoc basis. Their activities were restricted to professionally orientated workshops, lectures, seminars and conferences (TASA Tenth Anniversary Brochure of the Co-ordinating Council for Professional Matters 1983: 06). The idea of fostering professionalism, instead of uniting to contest the dictates of political oppression by the State, spurred the teacher unity movement in Natal. In November 1976, SAITA convened a meeting which saw the birth of the Joint Council of Teachers in Natal (JOCOTAN). Constituent members of the Council were The Natal African Teachers Union (NATU), The Natalse Onderwysersunie (NO), The Society of Natal Teachers (SONAT) and The Natal Teachers' Society (NTS) (SAITA, Golden Jubilee Souvenir Brochure 1979: 32). Whilst there were no structures or a constitution to govern activities of JOCOTAN (Katha 1983: 27), the members met regularly and

In contradiction to the above, Carlson (1988: 169) asserts that once teachers take seriously professional ideals of having specialised skills which they can provide in service to the pupil and the community, then professionalism can be turned against the continuation of oppressive structures and practices in education, and teachers' discontents are less easily contained. The re-appropriation of professionalism by teachers, provides a reservoir of sentiment that to some extent potentially aligns teachers occupational interests with transformative change in the schools. For these reasons, Carlson (1988: 170) believes that it seems shortsighted for Marxism to treat professionalism as exclusively as a legitimating ideology. However, by its emphasis on the professional growth of its members through subject societies, publications, conferences and seminars, the established teacher organisations failed to develop any characteristics of militancy. Freire & Shor (1987: 50) contend that the notion of a militant teacher organisation does not only refer to professional growth only, but involves an individual and a social transformation. The militant or
critical teacher organisation examines its practice, not accepting itself as finished, but re-inventing itself as it re-invents society (see par 7.3.).

Dougherty (1980: 164) concludes that this widespread choice of professionalisation, rather than unionisation, as a strategy of collective advancement had given teachers the appearance of being essentially middle class and had weakened their potential for merging with a broadly based working class movement.
6.7. Resume

The diversification of the economy during the 1960's warranted a parallel change in the nature of the education system. Segregated and inferior education for Blacks became institutionalised in order to provide a subservient, unskilled and semi-skilled workforce. The State used the policy of apartheid to foster capitalistic development and to promote its hegemony. It resorted to repressive tactics to control and suppress the national liberation movement and potential teacher militancy. This strategy created conservative and insular teacher organisations, whose conformist middle class members became fixated on the cultural upliftment of their communities. Hence the promotion of culture by these collective bodies of teachers reinforced the State's strategy of keeping the different races apart. In order to consolidate its domination, the State created ethnic structures such as the DIA. Thus, throughout the 1960's, these State-aligned teacher organisations not only failed to penetrate State ideology, but remained and worked within the parameters established by apartheid.

Established teacher organisations were incapable of articulating a fundamental critique of this apartheid system, instead they continued to articulate for greater control by Blacks over separate educational structures.
This accommodationist ideology is strongly reflected in the uncritical acceptance of the education department within the DIA. Whilst other bodies such as the NIC resisted these structures, it did not provoke any attacks by the NITS. Lazarus believed that accommodating the apartheid system would fortify Indian citizenship and secure material benefits which would satisfy the aspirations of middle class teachers and the community. These collective bodies of teachers articulated very little or ineffective resistance to attract the attention of the State, or initiate or force through reform. Even when some members agitated over the transfer and control of education from the NPA to the DIA, their criticisms were diplomatically phrased, and centred on elevating the efficiency and high standards of the NPA, rather than denouncing the discriminatory, apartheid education system. Any reference to the political implications of the apartheid system were assiduously avoided. Teacher organisations did not significantly contest specific polices, such as the Group Areas Act, which inevitably led to the predominance of the nuclear family, a site for material consumerism which fuelled the aspirations of the middle class. The family also acted as a hegemonic unit which served to socialise teachers into an acquiescent political position.

The failure of resistance by teacher organisations was not only limited by State repression, but also to the inability
of radical groups such as the NIC and the ANC to conscientise and organise teachers, the proletariat and the oppressed into a united body. Furthermore, the success of Black education in meeting the demands of a growing Black middle class and the lack of a counter-hegemonic alternative to Black education discouraged teachers from effectively resisting the policies of the State. Conservative teacher organisations, such as TUATA and CATU argued that the social upheavals in South Africa was not due to political struggles but to natural forces such as urbanisation. By the 1970's, the established teacher organisations still remained aloof from the broader political struggles, with very insignificant numbers of teachers aligning themselves with the liberation movement in order to contest State hegemony.

The tension in the broader society also caused an ambivalent and contradictory position within the leadership of teacher organisations. For instance, Lazarus and Pillay of NITS, demonstrate this idea. In contradiction to their earlier pronouncements, they later concede to the existence of an unjust and discriminatory political system and its negative influence on education. However, the radical and rhetorical ideas of this enlightened leadership did not filter down to the membership due to the repressive tactics of the State and to the contradictory tension which was caused by the aspirations of a conformist middle class.
Lazarus, in particular was effectively silenced through a punitive transfer for criticising the education policies of the State. Both the leadership and the members became incapacitated to act against the apartheid State.

Under a radicalised atmosphere in the post-1976 era, Samuels directly and explicitly expressed strong reservations of the political economy and conceded that a democratic political order should precede a democratic education system. However, this sense of radicalism was not reflected by the largely middle class corps of teachers who favoured the notion of liberalism over democracy. Under the State's co-option strategy, a meritocratic ideology which constituted merit awards, promotions and relatively better salaries seemed to appeal to these teachers. Consequently, these incentives had the effect of diverting their attention away from teacher militancy. Furthermore, teacher organisations did not create formal structures to politically conscientise members, nor did they identify with the pupil struggles in the early 1980's to actively challenge the State.

Teacher organisations were unable to articulate or effect changes in the racially structured labour market where Blacks were relegated to poorly paid unskilled and semi-skilled positions. Nor did they significantly challenge the system of differentiated education which was used to
provide for a racialised workforce. In a dismal attempt to address the root causes of the resultant poverty, teacher organisations contributed large sums of money to charities. Much of their ineffectiveness in resistance stems from their dependence on a functionalist analysis of problematic issues. For instance, in attempting to explain the high failure rate among pupils, teachers pointed to a deficiency within pupils themselves without reflecting on the correspondence between school and the hegemony of capitalism. Also, in accounting for the discipline problems associated with the youth, the Society emphasised the need for recreation facilities, and stressed that the family was an important avenue for the effective socialisation of the youth.

Teacher organisations promoted an irrelevant curriculum that did not reflect working class aspirations or enhance the importance of women. Instead teacher organisations subscribed to the idea that the curriculum should be used to transmit middle class social norms and values for a stable and conformist society. In an authoritarian climate the transfer method of delivering the curriculum became the norm. Much of these trends have their source in an apolitical, uncritical professionalism which covertly conditioned members, while it simultaneously undermined their ability to merge with the broad working class movement.
Through a mystified professional ideology which encompassed a code of conduct, the promotion of a scientific cognitive exclusiveness, the activities of subject societies, its publications and conferences, many of its members became conditioned into a middle class ethos, serving as agents of the State and capitalism. At the same time professional ideology legitimated and secured the co-operation of teachers with the State. Professionalism legitimated the claim of service to society, incorporating ideals of community bonds and responsibilities. This allowed the teaching profession to claim that, while their rewards were privately appropriated, their services were put to the good of the community. Professionalism also promoted an image of the teacher to fit middle class aspirations, a romantic notion of the "true teacher" as a dedicated, self-sacrificing being who was above the base material concerns of ordinary persons. Professionalism promoted a sense of false consciousness, that is, against the background of political strife and oppressive State brutality, society was stable and was progressing orderly. Through, professionalism, teacher organisations not only produced excellent teachers, but also excellent technocrats and functionaries of the State who remained aloof from the broader political struggles.

Thus, within the reproductive model, the ideology of State and of capitalism is clearly reflected in the functioning
of teacher organisations during the period 1961 to 1982. The State's requirements of a docile and compliant teacher who would maintain the status quo was met by teacher organisations which incorporated these teachers into middle class ideology by subscribing to meritocracy, professionalism, cultural development and their calculated lack of dissent to the creation of apartheid structures.
CHAPTER SEVEN


7.1. Introduction

Riley (1991: 187) declares that an important element of the State's Total Strategy (see par 6.3.2.) was the implementation of a new constitution towards the end of 1983. This gave limited powers to the Coloured and Indian people in an attempt to divide them from the Africans who remained excluded from all political power at the national level. The new constitution created a parliament with three separate chambers, one each for Whites, Coloured and Indians. Naidoo (1991: 145) points out that this new constitution failed to win the support of the majority of the Coloured and Indian people, who staged a massive boycott of the first election which was held on 22 August 1984. The State, however, implemented the new structures in the hope of winning support from the Indian and Coloured communities.

Pampallis (1991: 268) contends that opposition to the Tri-cameral system began to take the shape of an insurrectionary movement. This was expressed in two ways, firstly, by the rejection, in Black townships, of the organs of local and central government and, secondly, by
the creation of rudimentary centres of people's power in street committees, people's courts, people's education (see par 7.3.2.), organisation of workers in industries and in sectors such as health, non-formal education and social work. Davenport (1992: 429) suggests that resistance to the Tri-cameral system proved a decisive turning point in the development of the liberation struggle. Since 1984 resistance spread to all parts of the country and became increasingly organised. It took a variety of forms and drew into activity all sectors of the Black population as well as a growing proportion of middle class Indians and Whites. According to Wolpe (1995: 16) the most striking feature of this new growth of resistance was the re-emergence of the ANC as the unrivalled leader of the struggle for national liberation. The influence of Black Consciousness ideology diminished and a non-racial ideology based on the ideas of the Freedom Charter of the ANC became incorporated into the fabric of society, even within the established teacher organisations.

7.2. Struggles of Resistance

7.2.1. The Radicalisation of Teacher Organisations: Resistance to Apartheid

Black & Stanwix (1987: 49) argue that the radicalisation of the politics of Black teachers in the 1980's occurred in
a political and economic context similar to that of the 1940's. The economy was in crisis with chronic unemployment and inflation, while the racial division of labour had become an impediment to capital accumulation by creating a severe skill shortage. Hyslop (1990: 111) maintains that the system of Black education became a target of criticism by liberals as the business sector increasingly identified it as an obstacle in enabling Blacks to become a skilled workforce. This economic crisis was also manifested in a political crisis of unprecedented proportions. Beginning with spontaneous strikes in Durban in the early 1980's, the apartheid State experienced a continuous wave of labour unrest and community protest which posed a serious challenge to White supremacy.

Hyslop (1986: 95) suggests that by 1984 there was a serious chance of displacing the professional type of teacher organisations from their dominant position. Hyslop (1986: 95-96) explains that a combination of factors contributed to this new teacher militancy. The contemporary mass struggles renewed working class pressure on teachers for an alliance. Secondly, the collapse of the educational system confronted teachers with basic questions regarding their political role. It also brought them into conflict with the State bureaucracy. The restructuring of the education system subjected teachers to ever tighter control over their work by officialdom (see par 7.2.2.).
Finally, the combination of an economic crisis and the fact that there was a far larger pool of people with post school qualifications, reduced the opportunities for teachers to adopt a personal strategy of advancement by obtaining a better paid career.

According to Hyslop (1990: 111) the enormous semi-insurrectionary political upheavals of the 1980's caused a change in the political alignments among teachers. Some younger and more radical sections of teachers became active in the newly formed mass movements, like the United Democratic Front (UDF) and militant teacher organisations such as NEUSA. NEUSA which was a small organisation of relatively politicised teachers sought mainly to protect victimised teachers. Hartshorne (1992: 313) declares that these teachers had difficulties in reconciling their ideals and consciences with what they felt to be ambiguities on the part of the established or recognised teacher organisations, that is, a too conservative and accommodating approach to the State and too slow progress towards democratic, non-racial education. Hyslop (1990: 112) shows that in a number of urban centres, local teachers with a similar orientation grew up. Freund (1995: 85) asserts that teacher organisations that served the Indian community did not escape from this realignment in teacher politics. Moll (1989: 21) points out that the State's attempt to win support in the Indian community
through the implementation of the Tri-cameral system also served to radicalise the established teacher organisations, like TASA. The Association pointed to the inability of the State's reforms to address the crisis situation in education and to effect meaningful changes. TASA also became vehemently opposed to the structural violence and repression on which these reforms rested.

Samuels (1986: 09) argued that reforms in education reflected the political strategy of the State, namely, the "separate but equal" ethos framed in a refurbished apartheid philosophy of "own affairs" or multi-culturalism. For Samuels (1986: 09) multi-culturalism in education meant that whereas those classified as White, Indian and Coloured would have control over their own education departments, African education would still fall under the control of the central cabinet, as would the allocation of overall resources. Therefore, in 1986 TASA called upon the State to establish a single Ministry of Education for all South Africans. The idea of a unitary system of education featured at many of the Association's meetings, held at branch, regional and national levels. The Association was also of the opinion that any deliberations about a single education department in a country without a democratic constitution, was meaningless (Samuels 1987: 09).
In 1989 Samuels (1989: 07) re-affirmed TASA's total rejection of the apartheid inspired Tri-cameral system of government and demanded the immediate abolition of this system and its replacement by a non-racial and just order. Pillay (1990b: 20) points out that in 1990, the Association's leadership called on all the relevant political parties who were involved in political negotiations at that stage, to accord priority status to education with an emphasis on the establishment of a single ministry of education for all South Africans. In 1991, P. Naicker (1991b: 07), President of TASA warned of a growing community anxiety and anger which threatened to explode in an intense backlash. Naicker once again requested the State to immediately dismantle the various department's of education and to establish a single Ministry of Education.

Spiegel and Boonzaier (1988: 56) note that against the background of State repression and resistance from progressive teacher organisations, some of the more conservative teacher bodies, still abstained from political involvement or continued to support the more hesitant ATASA organisations like TUATA and CATU. Kallaway (1984: 25) asserts that these established teacher organisations articulated the State's argument that in the contemporary crisis "the national interest" of the country had to be defined in economic terms. These teachers felt that the
country's international economic competitiveness and sustained economic growth should be equated with political stability, and the preservation of the status quo. National interest was seen in terms of capitalist efficiency and profitability. Thus, Kallaway (1984: 26) shows that the "needs" of capitalism exercised a significant influence on the policy of these teacher organisations, and it directly effected the policies that were advanced by them in the face of the educational crisis. Policy became structurally weighted towards capitalist solutions. For these teachers, political instability was not good for economic growth. Vilardo (1992: 21) believes that these teachers still defended the meritocratic petty bourgeois concern for promotional opportunities and other material incentives (see 6.3.2.). While these appeals were not insignificant, in a context where parents, teachers and students were agitating for the democratic restructuring of education, these demands seemed parochial.

Nkomo & Mokate (1990: 405) also show that these established teacher organisations were guided by self-interest. They subscribed to the human capital theory which argued that greater investment in Black education would result in a more educated population, with higher earnings, and greater economic opportunities. However both these researchers point out that investing in the education
of Blacks would not have changed the economic status of the oppressed masses. The logic of the system had to change as well and it had to undergo a structural transformation. Furthermore, Nkomo & Mokate (1990: 407) point out that the human capital theory neglected an important aspect of the economy, namely, demand. Investment in human capital can only bear fruits, if there is a demand for skills. Without the necessary demand being generated, increased education of Blacks would have only led to a redistribution of the existing pool of jobs among those in the labour force.

However, according to Moll (1989: 21) these conservative teacher organisations were not immune to student pressure and the militant mood of the community, and by 1986 they also began to experience a radicalisation. Hyslop (1990: 113) points out that it was the People's Education initiative (see par 7.3.2.), launched in late 1985, that largely succeeded in overcoming these tensions and divisions between the established and progressive teacher organisations. Moreover, it accomplished the important feat of bringing the established teacher organisations onto the side of popular opposition for the first time. For instance, Moll (1989: 21) suggests that intense student and community pressure lay behind ATASA's decision to participate in the National Education Co-ordinating Committee (NECC) and to withdraw from the structures
of the Department of Education and Training (DET) in 1986. TASA also underlined its shift in political orientation by withdrawing its representatives from education bodies of the State, such as the SACE and the Research Committee for Education Structures (RECES) (Govind 1989: 20), and from the various subject committees in 1988 (TASA, A Review of Indian Education and the Organised Profession. 1992: 30). Vilardo (1992: 15) maintains that by 1988 almost every organisation of the teaching profession stood, at least formally, on the side of the popular opposition movements. This change represented the revival of a powerful tradition of teacher resistance which had been dormant for a long time.

Reeves (1994: 72) notes that before 1984, teachers had generally tended to see schools as almost separate from the community, but by the mid-1980’s, teachers began to draw the links between politics and the socio-economic conditions of the schools and the communities around them. Teachers increasingly realised that they could not serve the community and at the same time work against the community’s interests. More teachers began to agree that in order to be good educators, they had to understand the political context in which they were working.

Reeves (1994: 73) points out that by the mid-1980’s, many teachers had become politicised by participating in protest
action against the apartheid regime. In this regard, TASA established a Political Education Committee which organised workshops to focus on the Association’s policies and principles with a view to conscientising its grassroots membership. Bhana (1994: 10) shows that operational bodies, like the Political Education Committee increasingly identified TASA as being part of the struggle among Blacks who were oppressed as opposed to the majority of Whites, who were not. Hence, Indians became "Blacks". "Black" became a code for people seeking liberation. Indians increasingly accepted this definition of themselves that went beyond their ancestral and ethnic origins. This Political Education Committee held many meetings and disseminated literature on the contemporary political struggles. This empowered teachers to make a positive contribution to the process of change and liberation. For instance, members became active in calling for sports boycotts by engaging themselves against international and national sporting events involving South African teams. The Committee was also effective in mobilising teachers in the Eastern Cape Branch to participate in a march to express solidarity with initiatives aimed at resolving the crisis in Black education (TASA, A Review of Indian Education and the Organised Profession. 1992: 36).

Reeves (1994: 56) also suggests that teachers were influenced towards militancy due to the culture of
violence. Pampallis (1994: 55) cites the case of Matthew Goniwe, an acting principal in a secondary school in Cradock, to highlight the severity of State repression. As an organiser for the UDF, Goniwe attempted to mobilise the local civic organisation against the State, which resulted in him being punitively transferred to a remote school. In response the community initiated a consumer boycott of White controlled capitalist enterprises which was to last for 15 months. In July 1985, Goniwe's charred and mutilated body was discovered outside Port Elizabeth. This horrifying account of State brutality was echoed in different parts of the country as the liberation struggle spread.

Also, Reeves (1994: 72) believes that this violence which was meted out by the repressive State apparatus, against pupils and students, caused many of the conservative teachers to identify with these students in their struggle. Naidoo (1990: 130) asserts that a significant proportion of Black teachers became supportive of students, albeit to varying degrees, as student action increased in intensity into the mid-1980's.

Bundy (1985: 302) identifies three factors that may have fuelled the militant political action of youth during this period. A self-conscious generational unit with its own counter ideology; the demographic pressure determined by
the large proportion of youth in the total population; and
the over-production of intellectuals with no or little
opportunity of employment. Exacerbating this situation
were also the constraints imposed by the nature of the
South African educational system, namely the glaring
defects of Black education and the issue of unemployment
class approach suggests that the increasing alienation from
the prevailing economic, political and social structure
produced a wide variety of cultural responses amongst
Black urban youth. The most dramatic manifestation of
working-class youth resistance was the school boycott.
This form of pupil protest was a collective response to the
schooling system, characterised by demonstrations and
meetings to enlist both the support of pupils in
neighbouring schools and to gain parental sympathy, as well
as to encourage solidarity. Resistance also involved the
widespread use of pickets, street marches and
demonstrations, stone throwing, cultural activities and
programmes of political awareness including forms of
alternative education (see par 7.2.3.).

Nasson (1990: 148) argues that the anger of rebellious
students was being increasingly directed not just against
inferior standards, understaffed schools, equipment
shortages, and overcrowded classrooms, but against the
apartheid and capitalist social order as a whole. Thus,
the institutional relations of the school provided the terrain for increasing numbers of young people to contest the very legitimacy of the capitalist market order.

Reeves (1994: 74) points out that while teacher militancy was sparked by the harsh repression faced by the youth, it was also fuelled by the tension between youth militancy and teacher conservatism. Hyslop (1990: 112) has noted that the inability of established teacher organisations to adequately respond to the student struggles in 1976 and the carnage that followed marked the beginning of their decline. While the student protests of 1976 vented a generally felt hostility towards Black Education and "the system", the next round of protests in the 1980's began to target teachers as "representatives of White autocracy and agents of oppression".

Vilardo (1992: 18) maintains that the mobilisation of the youth centred on the demand for democratically elected student representative councils, a demand that struck to the heart of an authoritarian education structure and represented an embryonic attempt to undermine that structure. During the school boycotts of the 1980's, students began to "challenge teachers to show where they stood". Teachers increasingly became targets of student anger. For example, TUATA reported that in the Western Cape many teachers chose to stay away from schools during
the boycotts out of fear of being attacked by students. The Natal African Teachers' Union (NATU) complained that during school strikes, teachers were not only disparaged, and their dignity and authority tarnished, but they were also molested and assaulted by students. Throughout the eighties, teachers and principals were physically assaulted and their property destroyed. Freire (1988: 57) suggests that these school boycotts and the rising militancy of the youth has served as a control on over compliant teachers. School boycotts transformed the nature of teacher-student relations, by temporarily reversing the power relations in the school. Reeves (1994: 74) concludes that this tension between the youth and teachers forced many teachers towards the direction of militancy.

According to Pampallis (1991: 268) the growth of new and powerful militant trade unions, such as the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU), which were independent of the conservative White controlled Trade Union Council of South Africa (TUCSA) also facilitated the militancy of teachers. Building on earlier democratic trade union traditions, these new unions emphasised the direct democratic participation of rank-and-file workers in the decisions of the union, and close consultation between the leadership and the members during negotiations. Pampallis (1991: 269) suggests that these trends in the labour unions also influenced the dynamics of organisation
within teacher bodies. For instance, under the leadership of Samuels, TASA experienced a major restructuring, allowing for the creation of ten regional councils which made the organisation more accessible to the members at grassroots level (TASA, Diamond Jubilee Brochure. 1987: 21).

7.2.2. **Resistance against the Bureaucratisation of Education**

Pampallis (1991: 268) points out that since the State discovered that its co-option strategy did not work (see par 6.3.1.), it began to place increasing trust in the parallel strategy of repressive measures. In the face of strong resistance from the liberation movement, the State began to use the hegemonic actors within the Tri-cameral system to maintain stability in the various communities. In this regard the State saw schools as important bases to control. Thus by 1988 the majority of the teachers became subjected to the control of a large number of State bureaucrats. Joseph (1988: 182) maintains that the State used bureaucracy as an oppressive ideology, whereby it sought to dominate and subordinate militant teachers towards passivity and compliance. Rainy & Milward (1983: 137) support this notion, that bureaucracy was a way for the State to exercise authority in society when its own traditional authority was no longer effective.
Evans (1992:82) also traces the source of bureaucratisation to the De Lange report (see par 6.3.2.), which advocated a top-down managerial approach in the administration of education. The State strongly believed that this approach would silence the voice of the opposition to its reforms. The De Lange recommendations focused on "educational politics rather than the politics of education". It showed an overriding and exclusive concern with educational values and pedagogic and curricular processes which reinforced the State's claim to an independent and apolitical education reform policy. Critical political questions about the structure, control and popular accountability of schooling and its relationship to unequal educational outcomes were replaced by questions about modes of decision-making, management, and administration of education.

Nasson (1990:153) points out that within this perspective, a core element that was identified was a "technocratic rhetoric of efficiency and rationalisation" (cf 3.6.). This rested on the assumption that the technocratic mode of rationality was the only valid and scientific one and that it was therefore not ideological. On this basis, the report contended that education could be constituted as a science. Efficient corporate management based on the rational procedures of technological control systems was seen not only as the best response to the chaos
of conflicting interests and contradictions within the educational arena, but as the way to create and implant an education which was bound to be beneficial. The De Lange report believed that "scientific" criteria of rational planning and controlled expansion would reconcile and harmonise the interests of parents and children, and that the construction of effective programs of "quality" education and training would meet the distributional needs for an efficient and productive education.

Sarup (1979: 159) contends that developing management methods such as the above is one of the ways in which capitalists attempt to increase the unit of capital. This method of work study analyses it on behalf of those who manage it, rather than those who perform it. Management has no other purpose than to extract maximum labour for the capitalist. Scientific management prescribes the actual mode of performance of every activity, the control and dictation of each step of the process.

Reeves (1994: 39) argues that in the 1980's teachers were becoming increasingly deskilled as more of the curriculum, pedagogy, and evaluation became specialised and standardised. In addition, the proletarianisation of teaching resulted in teachers' working conditions, control, and autonomy becoming worse. Carlson (1988: 161) argues that as a system, proletarianisation is related to the aim
of capital, namely to gain even more complete control of the labour process. This has been achieved primarily through the rationalisation and standardisation of work tasks which allowed management to dictate each step in the work process, along with new bureaucratic rules and procedures to which workers are held accountable.

Braverman (Carlson 1988: 162) argues that these new forms of scientific management and bureaucratic control have had the effect of deskill ing workers in complex knowledge and re-skilling them as followers of a routine work format. De-skilled workers consequently suffer from job routinisation and close supervision, and they lack avenues for advancement within the job hierarchy. In order to increase efficiency this scientific management approach entailed the breaking up of the teaching activity into component actions so as to "improve" and speed up these separate actions. The aim was to impose greater management control and at the same time to increase "productivity". The results of this were to relegate greater control of the work process to the State. Thus, this did not only limit teacher militancy, but teachers lost their ability to make demands for better rates of pay on their claims to be skilled. Also, it meant that management could determine the pace of work. Reeves (1994: 41) suggests these trends were strongly evident among most White teachers who were completely caught up in performing their bureaucratic
functions. As functionaries of the system these teachers remained virtually untouched by the broader political struggles as they did not challenge the legitimacy of the State or the education departments. However, Reeves (1994: 40) points out that the increasing proletarianisation of teachers and the bureaucratisation of education did not go uncontested, but resulted in accompanying ideological tensions between the State and especially Black teacher organisations, which became increasingly visible towards the latter half of the 1980’s.

In the first half of 1985, Samuels (1985a: 09) addressed and conducted seventeen symposia for teachers and management personnel at schools with the hope of counteracting emerging bureaucratisation in the education system. At these Branch meetings, small groups of teachers held discussions which analysed aspects of the system of educational practice and discussed ways in which meaningful change could be undertaken so that the quality of education could be maximised. Silvermann (1970: 84) considers the significance of these workshops, as they encouraged teachers to assume responsibility, to participate in decision-making and to join a "tightly-knit cohesive work group". Similarly, Sofer (1978: 236) argues for the encouragement of workgroup formation, as it allows teachers to exert at least some influence on the overall objectives and decisions of the organisation as well as to be
influenced by them. Sofer (1978: 237) argues that these trends were most likely to be effective in non-bureaucratic structures, where reliance is not placed solely on the economic motive of "buying a person's time" and using control and authority as the organising and co-ordinating principle of the organisation. In accordance with this optimistic position Silvermann (1970: 84) argues that such a structure would be compatible with both human satisfaction and organisational efficiency.

From these discussions that emanated from the workshops, TASA made recommendations to the Executive Director of Education and Culture. The recommendations contended that subject advisors should evaluate the quality of education against the wide framework of divergent but acceptable educational theories. Furthermore, the Association believed that they should do this free of personal preferences which had a deleterious effect on the enthusiasm and morale of the qualified and highly experienced teacher (Jaggernath 1985: 44).

Earnest (1989: 16) states that in 1988, during the workshops on Human Resources Evaluation, which was conducted by TASA, it was revealed by the grassroots membership that democratic leadership did not exist in many schools. Teachers were neither consulted nor was there any negotiation between teachers and management staff
on educational issues. Pillay (1988: 27) shows that TASA was made aware of the abnormal procedures that were used by Superintendents and some members of the management staff in schools, such as, prescribing to teachers how they should teach. Narain (1989: 13) notes that in some schools there existed a very rigid hierarchical system with absolute control and authority vested in the management staff. At the base of such a hierarchy were the teachers who were largely responsible for the practical and successful implementation of the activities at the school.

Bowles & Gintis (1976: 38) argue that schools which are governed by a hierarchy of authority, of Principals, subject advisors, Heads of Department and supervisors actually foster inefficiency because the ideas and creative potential of teachers are stultified by the bureaucracy. Why should the State promote a system of work that was simply inefficient? Bowles and Gintis (1976: 38) answer that owners must divide and rule a workforce, even at the cost of inefficiency, if the power balance is to be maintained. The Association was especially concerned about the continued prescription of teaching methods by superintendents in the subject of English (Pillay 1988: 29). Consequently, TASA requested the Department of Education and Culture (DEC) to recognise the rights of teachers to use teaching strategies that were best suited to their styles, and more importantly, meaningful to the
pupils they taught, notwithstanding the fact that these teaching strategies could have been innovative in some or all aspects (Pillay 1988: 27). The Director maintained that Superintendents of English subscribed fully to the educationally accepted principles, that the respective English syllabi determined the philosophy and principles of the subject and that the requirements of the syllabus also indicated, to a large extent, the broad methodological approaches to be used. The Director pointed out that the Superintendents, together with the English Subject Committee had the task of determining how the basic premises and principles of the syllabus could best be accommodated in the planning of an effective teaching programme for English (Kotiah 1990: 50).

At the grassroots level of TASA, members felt that prescription stifled their democratic rights, individuality and creativity. It promoted domination and authoritarianism and it also had a detrimental effect on interpersonal relationships which resulted in a certain degree of tension and animosity among staff members (Saman 1988: 17). Merton (Sofer 1978: 236-237) considers this typical of bureaucratisation, whereby, rather than concentrating on problem-solving the organisation is characterised by conflict and frustration. Furthermore, staff members generally became reserved and rarely voiced their opinions on controversial matters (Saman 1988: 17).
Freire & Shor (1987: 78) point out that teachers became socialised into a mechanical way of educating year after year and that this process silenced and alienated teachers.

In 1988 Samuels (1988b: 08) pointed to the lack of a warm, supportive and trustful climate in many schools. This caused many teachers to focus their attention on the expectations of their superiors rather than on the needs of pupils. Freire & Shor (1987: 49) believe that these teachers lose hope in such moments where there is no solution and they become mentally bureaucratised, they lose creativity, they fall into excuses and they ultimately become mechanistic. This is the bureaucratisation of the mind.

Heyderbrand (1983: 105) maintains that while bureaucratic forms of organisation are typically handicapped by formal regulations and fixed hierarchical mechanisms of decision-making it therefore has neither the responsiveness nor the flexibility to react quickly to new problems and critical events. Debureaucratisation, such as dehierarchisation, on the other hand, takes the form of dismantling various elements of bureaucracy. Dehierarchisation suggests a decentralisation of tasks or the diffusion and lateral distribution of authority among specialised functions and among self-contained tasks, projects, teams and sub-units. Dehierarchisation often occurs because of an increased
complexity of tasks and an increased knowledge of that complexity. Thus rigid hierarchical command and career lines tend to be replaced by a loosely organised network of lateral relationships.

As early as 1975, TASA attempted to debureaucratise its own organisational structure by the creation of the portfolio system of administration (see par 6.6.). Connacher (1989: 06) also points to signs of dehierarchisation within the Association by stating that in August 1988, the Association's Co-ordinating Council for Professional Matters set up a task team to investigate different management styles of school administrators, and the effect of these styles on staff development and the professional growth of teachers.

Samuels (1988a: 14) also cites the example of the Association's Research Bureau which was delegated with the task of investigating the work conditions of teachers. The General Purposes Committee of the Association could not find a satisfactory way of dealing with the numerous complaints that it had received from teachers about their general conditions of work and about the prescriptive nature of supervision in particular. The Research Bureau concluded that most teachers operated under conditions of severe stress. This was a matter for concern, and the Bureau subsequently called for action to be taken to ease
the stress-levels of teachers and to afford them a greater degree of job satisfaction.

This significant finding of the Bureau is reflected in Blauner's (Sofer 1978: 330) conception of alienation whereby many teachers experienced self-estrangement. The teaching activity was not experienced as something which contributed in an affirmative manner to personal identity and self-hood, but instead became damaging to self-esteem. For many teachers the teaching experience became restricted to satisfying their economic needs. Rather than enjoying fulfillment, these teachers experienced a monotonous work routine. TASA's Vice President for Teacher Welfare, R. Brijraj (1991: 48-49), points out that in 1988 five militant teachers of the Stanger Branch of TASA were charged for misconduct by the State after they published an article, titled, The Joys and Frustrations of Teaching in which they exposed the high degree of dissatisfaction among teachers. The State claimed that the publication was critical of the administration in the House of Delegates. During the trial in the Durban Magistrate's court, the Magistrate J.H. Booysen found, two of the teachers, K.P. Hira and P. Naidu guilty of misconduct as a result of their involvement in writing the article. The Association later appealed against Booysen's conviction of the two teachers in the Appeal Court which found that the two teachers did not contravene the Indians Education Act and therefore
ordered the previous finding to be set aside (Post, 10-13 June 1992: 03; Sunday Times Extra, 28 June 1992: 02).

Govind (1989: 21) notes that in August 1988 representatives of TASA and the Association of Professional Officers of Education of the Republic of South Africa (APROESA) met under tense conditions to discuss the issue of prescription in education. TASA pointed out that the tendency towards prescription had deprived the teacher of his role as chief decision-maker in the classroom. APROESA contended that the subject advisors did not prescribe in detail as to how the learning process should be conducted, or the manner of administration in schools. These subject advisors added that the Department had stipulated broad parameters within which teachers were free to innovate and that subject advisors provided guidance only when it was apparent that there was need for it. However, Laski (Sofer 1978: 237) contends that concentration of power in the hands of officials can jeopardise the liberties of individuals. Large organisations like the Department of Education became the preserve of oligarchies of specialists. These bureaucrats were anxious to secure a reputation for accuracy and insisted on rehearsing every possible criticism by the public. Merton (Sofer 1978: 238) considers that bureaucratic organisations are likely to have "red tape", formalism, and rigid rules and he suggests that there is a tendency in these bureaucracies
for goals to become displaced by procedures and rituals. Merton (Sofer 1978: 239) states that the system can easily breed overconformity, timidity, conservatism and "technicism", that is, a tendency to retreat to the mechanics of one's job without adequate regard to whether these are suited to the problem at hand. Discipline of teachers became emphasised, with great importance placed on the prescription of teachers performing the tasks as requested, irrespective of whether it was right. These specialists became narrow-minded and developed ways of not perceiving circumstances that did not fit easily with their preprogrammed behaviour. Pillay (1989: 27) shows that the Association urged the DEC to review the "top-down" decision-making process which was prevalent in the administration of the day-to-day practice in schools. Instead, the Association proposed a pattern of peer group decision-making with the following basic principles: the choice of subjects that were taught; the methodology that each teacher employed in his work; standards and grades that each teacher would like to have taught; the decision about co-curricular and extra-curricular duties and peer group professional development programmes.

The alienation and powerlessness of teachers was also reinforced by the interference of politicians in their attempts to further bureaucratise and control education. Reeves (1994: 43; 54) reports that political interference
became endemic in the entire education system. Black teachers in the DET reported that compliant underqualified teachers were promoted to top positions by politicians, in spite of an abundance of qualified and experienced teachers. This same trend was experienced by Coloured teachers, whereby the Labour Party tried to manipulate teachers in order to gain control of the community. However, Vilardo (1992: 16) shows that this interference did not go unchallenged. WECTU conducted several 'hands off our teachers' campaigns' through mass meetings and marches, while the PTU attacked the education policies of the House of Representatives and the autocratic leadership of inspectors and principals.

In September 1989, Naicker, issued a firm warning by pointing out that teachers would no longer tolerate the meddling by politicians in the affairs of teachers. Naicker warned the State that the Association would cautiously monitor the management of education and would take action against any form of unprofessional conduct or irregular action by those in authority (TASA News, September/October 1989: 01).

To this effect the Association submitted a memorandum to the James Commission of Inquiry. It concerned the alleged involvement of members in the Ministers' Council of the House of Delegates in certain irregularities which
included, amongst others, the conduct of officials which was motivated by personal considerations other than the interests of education and the refusal to promote those teachers who were worthy of promotion because of their political affiliations. In the memorandum, the Secretary General of TASA, S.T. Jaggernath wrote: "Today, Indian Education is plagued by mismanagement, abuse and misuse of political power, gross inefficiency, favouritism, malpractices and nepotism". The evidence in the memorandum strongly supported the allegations made by the Association on the question of victimisation and abuse of power. A number of cases were submitted to the Commission which showed the victimisation and harassment of teachers and management staff at certain schools (Memorandum submitted by S.T. Jaggernath, Secretary - General of TASA to the James Commission of Inquiry 1988). The Commission concluded that these politicians had abused their positions of authority and were therefore not fit to hold office (Kotiah 1990: 50).

TASA also protested strongly against the spate of public announcements by the Minister of Education and Culture concerning corporal punishment, the establishment of a teacher welfare body and the transfer of teachers. The Association considered these pronouncements as a direct political interference in the control and administration of education (Naicker 1990: 08). The Association maintained
that the Minister, who was a political appointee had interfered in the administration and control of Education and consequently undermined the authority of the Chief Executive Director, officials and school principals in the Department of education and Culture (Kotiah 1990: 51).

In spite of the Association’s protests the Minister continued to make public utterances on matters that related to the control and administration of education. These were often in conflict with the viewpoints that were conveyed to the Association by the Executive Director of the DEC. Naicker (1991a: 07) points out that during the 1991 budget debate in the House of Delegates, politicians were united in their attack against teachers instead of focusing on the political causes of educational problems, namely, the inability of the Minister’s Council of the House of Delegates to secure the necessary funding to maintain education at an acceptable level. It was evident from the charges made against teachers that K. Rajoo, Minister of Education and Culture, in the House of Delegates, was determined on forcing teachers into a situation of confrontation. This was evident from his threat to exclude, from a promotion list, teachers who refused to be seen by superintendents, and to subsequently terminate their service after three warnings.
The State also sought to force teachers into compliance by using autocratic evaluation procedures. In response, teachers held a "sit-in" at the M.L. Sultan Stanger Secondary school. This was followed by a protest meeting which was organised by the Stanger Branch of TASA, which in turn led to a national protest meeting in Durban on 18 May 1990. The Association called on the DEC to stop superintendents from visiting the schools for the purpose of conducting evaluations until such time that an acceptable evaluation system was implemented for all teachers (Naicker 1990: 9). At a meeting on 19 May 1990 the National Council of the Association mobilised its membership to march to the offices of the Chief Executive Director of the DEC to present their grievances on the evaluation system. On 1 June 1990, 5000 teachers participated in this march to the offices of the Chief Executive Director (Kotiah 1991: 52). Consequently, at a meeting with the Association on 6 June 1990, the Chief Executive Director, A.K. Singh, agreed to stop sending the superintendents to schools to evaluate teachers. This condition was to remain until the Association submitted proposals for an interim procedure for the evaluation of teachers (Naicker 1990: 9).

By 1991, the State continued with its plan to further bureaucratise education and proletarianise teachers into compliance and to draw teachers away from militancy towards
conformity. To this effect the State introduced a R73 million "cutback" in education spending for Indian schools. Subsequently, Circular No. 2 of 1991 was issued by the DEC on 3 January 1991. It notified all Indian schools to reduce teaching posts and increase teaching time and teacher-pupil ratios (Daily News, 8 February 1991: 02).

Naicker (1991a: 08) points out that other areas were also effected or threatened, namely, the withdrawal of monetary allocations for library resources at schools; the withdrawal of transport subsidies for schools; the failure to provide substitute teachers for teachers who went on leave; the possible introduction of early retirement for educators without provision for suitable replacements; little or no prospect of employment in 1991 for 150 newly-qualified teachers; failure to assure locos tenentes whose services were to be terminated at the end of 1991, about their renewal of their tenure.

Naicker (1991a: 08) warned that the failure to curtail "cut-backs" would lead to the intensification of problems in education. The Association also voiced its protest against the Minister of Indian education, K. Rajoo, for ignoring the "cutbacks" in education during the debate on the education budget, in the House of Delegates, on 23 May 1991. Naicker stated: "This, neither TASA nor the Indian community will tolerate". TASA will mobilise the community to safeguard and protect quality education in whatever way
is deemed necessary" ( Post, 29-01 May-June 1991: 17 ). The Association vehemently rejected Circular No. 2 of 1991 and it subsequently called teachers to stage a week-long sit-in at their schools during the first week of February 1991 ( Sunday Tribune Herald, 9 February 1992: 02 ).

On 7 February 1991 officials of the Association met with the Acting Chief Executive Director of Indian Education, M. Pillay, to normalize this situation. The Department agreed to "defer" the implementation of the circular until further negotiations had taken place between the Association and itself. On 15 February 1991, the Association together with other bodies, such as the Association of School Education Committees ( ASEC ), led a protest march of 15 000 people to Durban City Hall to affirm its disapproval against the cutbacks in education. The Association threatened to mobilise its members, once again, if the Department did not repeal the circular ( Pamphlet issued by TASA, 8 February 1991 ).

The Department subsequently withdrew Circular No. 2 of 1991 ( Daily News, 8 February 1991: 02 ). The success of this campaign is largely due to the linking of the Association with community based organisations such as ASEC and the Education Crisis Co-ordinating Committee ( ECCC ). Reeves ( 1994: 74 ) argues that these bodies did not only swell the ranks of militant teachers, but effectively
demonstrated that teacher organisations could also influence the communities to contest the apartheid State.

7.3. **Struggles for Transformation**

7.3.1. **Conditions promoting Transformation**

According to Pampallis (1991: 298) by 1985 the South African economy continued to stagnate and the average income for the whole population actually decreased. This resulted in greater poverty for many, which in turn helped increase political instability. While South Africa's small internal market and its poorly trained labour force and the results of decades of Black oppression were at the root of its economic problems, they were made more serious by other factors. Large scale State expenditures on the South African Defence Force, police and other repressive mechanisms, as well as the cost of financing the inefficient and often corrupt Bantustan administrations, resulted in the diversion of funds from investment in education and other vital economic and social areas.

Riley (1991: 102) shows that, particularly from the mid-1980's the success of the international anti-apartheid movement resulted in the escalation of economic sanctions, adding to South Africa's problems. Trade sanctions were imposed by the European community and by the United States
of America. A number of overseas companies withdrew their investments from South Africa and the reluctance of these companies to invest new capital in South Africa because of the pressure of the anti-apartheid movement deepened the crisis. This led sectors of private capital and even certain circles within the NP to consider political solutions that went beyond the framework of apartheid. In September 1985 business leaders like Gavin Relly of the Anglo-American Corporation, led a delegation of businessmen to Lusaka for talks with exiled ANC leaders.

Davenport (1992: 486) however, argues that while President Botha articulated the need for reform, he could not take the leap from repression and confrontation to dialogue with the ANC and effect real social change. It was left to President F.W. De Klerk to create a climate conducive to negotiations. Starting in September 1989, a large number of demonstrations were allowed at which ANC and SACP symbols were prominently displayed. Prominent political prisoners such as Walter Sisulu were released. Subsequently, these leaders addressed huge rallies throughout the country. In February 1990, De Klerk announced the unbanning of the ANC, SACP and the PAC together with 58 other organisations. He also announced the easing of the State of Emergency, including the partial lifting of press restrictions. On 11 February 1990 Nelson Mandela, the most potent symbol of the South African
liberation struggle was released after 27 years of captivity.

The political atmosphere of the country was being transformed as the mass democratic movement and the leadership of the liberation struggle sought to incorporate the middle class in its struggle against the State. At a landmark TASA conference in 1990, Govan Mbeki (1990:04) a member of the national executive committee of the ANC cautioned teachers that there should be no undeclared campaign of passive resistance waged in opposition to change. He pointed out that teachers should not position themselves in such a manner that they marginalised themselves from the forces of political and social transformation in the country. At the same conference, Naicker (1990a:08) the leader of TASA gave a critical analysis of society and placed education in the contemporary political and socio-economic framework. In this militant speech Naicker (1990a:09), acknowledges that TASA would actively respond to the deliberate exclusion of Black people from the mainstream of education, as well as the intentional cultural annihilation perpetrated by Whites on Black people, for the purposes of political subjugation and socio-economic domination.

The Political Education Committee of TASA also played a significant role in conscientising members at this crucial stage. The Committee argued that education had been
serving the interest of racial capitalism and had been segregated and unequal in order to ensure that the existing relations of White domination and Black subservience were maintained. The Committee also attacked the De Lange report as part of the modernisation of apartheid. By adopting a Marxist argument, it even went further to question the role of schools in class formation and called for the concept of schooling to be revised as it maintained that schooling should not legitimate certain forms of labour over others in a democratic society. It called for schools to promote a balance between mental and manual labour without placing value on one at the expense of the other (Meseleku 1990: 10). Fluxman (1987: 163) considers this opposition to the extension of the capitalist structures into education as not insignificant. Freire & Shor (1987: 35) assert that the transformation of education is not just a question of changing teaching methods and techniques, but also involves a criticism of capitalistic society that transcends the sub-system of education.

7.3.2. The Alternative Discourse of People’s Education

Cross (1992: 160) maintains that from 1985 onwards the liberation movement did not only resist the State regime, but were actively engaged in struggles of transformation which assumed the form of new ideas, new
structures, processes and movements. People's Education is a general concept that has been used to refer to this kind of initiative in education. Levin (1988: 01) argues that People's Education was a set of initiatives representing a radical departure from apartheid education. It was aimed at expending a counter-hegemonic culture to lay the foundations of a new education system to cater for the majority's interests in a free, democratic and united South Africa. It's educational projects were based on the concept of education, power and democracy as an interconnected unity.

Evans (1992: 89) points out that students, workers and teacher organisations began to draw from and contribute to an emerging and common tradition of resistance, providing an affirmation of group identity and solidarity of purpose. The emergence of People's Education drew together many of the intellectual and political strands flourishing at that time. It also widened the traditional Marxist focus on the narrow issue of destroying capitalist social relations as a necessary pre-condition for democracy. Freire & Shor (1987: 125) maintain that initiatives like People's Education was an attempt not only to create a counter culture to counter the dominant culture, but also to articulate a new set of values. It opened possibilities of creating new forms of consciousness to transcend the situation of domination. The widespread disorder in
schools meant that apartheid education was resisted by many pupils (see par 6.4.3.). Passivity or aggression was thus developed in society through the pupil's institutional experiences. This alienation could not be solved by more passive pedagogy or by tougher authority. It required a counter-alienation pedagogy, one that was creative and critical, and which considered the subjective needs of pupils.

Evans (1992: 86) argues that People's Education marked a qualitative transformation of the educational struggle as it moved from "protest to challenge". Whereas the student boycotts of the early eighties symbolically rejected apartheid education by withdrawing from its institutions, Peoples Education began to articulate, at least rhetorically, a hegemonic alternative to apartheid education. It did so by challenging the legitimacy of the education structure through the struggle for Parent-Teacher-Student-Associations (PTSA's) on which the workers and community leaders would be represented to participate in the functioning of the educational system.

Reeves (1994: 106) shows that teacher organisations articulated the notion of People's Education by not only striving to transform educational structures on a theoretical level, but actively engaged themselves to change the pre-existing State controlled educational
structures. In 1991 TASA dismissed the Parent-Teacher Association (PTA) model which was promulgated by the State for establishment at Indian schools as a futile attempt at diverting the community from its democratic aspirations. The Association, mockingly, described the PTA as the former school Education Committee in disguise (see par 6.3.1.). It maintained that the problem with the PTA was that students were excluded from participation in any, meaningful, decision-making process, and teachers were inadequately represented on this body. Furthermore, the PTA had been foisted on the Indian community in a unilateral and arbitrary fashion without any consultation with the key components of the school community, namely, parents, teachers and students (TASA News, August 1991: 07). Consequently, in the August 1991 edition of TASA News the Association proposed constitutional guidelines for the establishment of new PTSA's in schools (TASA News, August 1991: 07).

Vilardo (1992: 20) argues that the struggle for control over the education structures directly threatened many members of established teacher organisations, especially those who held positions of authority. Teachers in the emerging progressive teacher organisations came to play a leading role in challenging apartheid education through the development of an alternative curriculum and the defiance of existing educational structures, a defiance that
frequently brought them into conflict with principals and inspectors.

Reeves (1994: 83) points out that under the State of Emergency the issue of People's Education was dangerous as the State restricted any efforts to popularise the concept. However, in spite of this constraint, teacher organisations, such as the Progressive Teachers' League (PTL), held workshops to introduce the concept of People's Education. These workshops showed teachers that new methods and new content were possible. As Levin, Moll and Narsing (1991: 37) have correctly observed, the People's Education campaign was revolutionary not because it attempted to establish only alternative curricula but because it also attempted to establish a counter-hegemonic power within schools.

Reeves (1994: 85) shows that in keeping with the concept of People's Education, teacher organisations rejected class, gender, race and ethnic divisions in both the theory and practice of educational institutions, and favoured the commissioning of textbooks produced by "progressive" academics as well as by activists in trade unions and rejected rote learning in favour of techniques that challenged the creativity of students. Teacher organisations began to question the separation of educational institutions from the oppressed communities;
the elitist assumptions implicit in credential processes that separated "experts" from ordinary members; cognitive myths such as the difficulty of natural science subjects; the sheer irrelevance of a substantial part of social research to the majority of the country's oppressed; the assumption of learner passivity in the curriculum and the separation of Black culture from the educational process.

Pillay (1990a: 01) shows that the relevance of the school curriculum came under the scrutiny by TASA in 1989. TASA drew attention to the inadequacies in the pre-existing curriculum and made a positive contribution to the development of a curriculum relevant to the needs of a changing society. The Association pointed out that schooling for South Africa's masses had been characterised by struggle and resistance and it was this broad struggle of the people against oppression which should have been reflected in the curriculum. TASA appealed for the introduction of people's history which was essentially anti-apartheid history, written explicitly to counter the racist and elitist stereotypes that had characterised the history propagated by the State. It was popular history in that it deliberately sought to bring the Black working class into the mainstream of South African history, and at the same time it was written primarily for a readership drawn from those classes. People's history was, therefore, the history of the ordinary people, the oppressed and the
exploited masses.

Joseph (1988: 176) points to the significance of People's history when he states that teacher organisations became conscientised by an inclusive history of Blacks, women of all groups, and the history of working-class people, which helped to shatter the prevailing and dominant myths that inhibited these organisations from acting more decisively for social change and the creation of a more just society and viable future for all (see par 7.3.3.).

7.3.3. The Transformation of Teacher Organisations

Teacher unity was part of the liberation and transformation process and through unity, teachers made a decisive impact on freedom, social justice and peace. However, Wright (1990: 47) asserts that the imposition of the State of Emergency in July 1985 made it difficult for progressive teachers to build a national organisation, and as a result the growth of the progressive teacher movement tended to be decentralised and poorly co-ordinated. Progressive teacher organisations often emerged in an individual Black township within each racial community rather than being established on a regional, national basis or non-racial basis. For example, the PTL which organised in the Indian Township of Lenasia, outside of Johannesburg, emerged at the same time that the PTU was formed in the neighbouring township of
Eldorado Park. Vilardo (1992: 01) points out that teachers also failed to achieve unity because of fundamental differences of opinion on key issues between the established and progressive teacher organisations. The recognised teacher organisations, such as the Cape Teachers' Professional Association (CTPA) preferred professionalism over trade unionism and demanded that the new teacher body should have a federal rather than a unitary structure. It also objected to the "charterist spirit" adopted by progressive teacher bodies which strongly identified with the Freedom Charter of the ANC.

Reeves (1994: 71) argues that despite these difficulties all progressive teacher organisations were united by a common commitment to non-racialism, non-collaboration with the State, and the quest for a unitary and democratic education system. They also shared a similar support base of young politicised teachers, many of whom were students during the Soweto Uprising of 1976. Unlike their counterparts within the established teacher organisations, very few members of progressive teacher organisations occupied positions of authority within the education structure. Vilardo (1992: 22) points out that by 1989 all mainstream Black teacher organisations had, at least rhetorically, moved significantly to the left of the political spectrum under the prodding pressure of young militant teachers. The need to identify with the struggles
of community was frequently cited as a major reason for the increasing radicalisation of the established teacher organisations which gave impetus to the teacher unity process.

According to Gardiner (1982: 127) militant teacher organisations such as NEUSA directed the more conservative teacher organisations towards teacher unity. NEUSA was unambiguous in its view that teacher organisations had to unite in order to lead members in a campaign for a non-racial education system for all in a society based on political and economic justice. It believed that such a campaign should link all teachers who shared educational and social concerns and could only be undertaken as part of a broader movement in South Africa to shed apartheid and to establish a non-racial democracy.

Teacher organisations that served the pre-dominantly Indian community were also influenced by the leadership of the ANC to merge into a non-racial teacher's union. Govan Mbeki (1990: 04) cautions the leadership of TASA when he states that the Association needed to look carefully and critically at the question of whether there was a need to continue with ethnic, professional orientated organisations. Mbeki made it clear that the ANC was keenly interested in progressing, as rapidly as possible, to create a united, democratic teacher organisation. Mbeki
declared:

When TASA takes this step, it will set an important example which should make a significant impact on the Indian community as a whole. The Indian teacher would then be defined as a teacher, without the racial label and would demonstrate that the rest of the Indian community can and should seek to define themselves as South Africans, without a racial label (Mbeki 1990: 03).

Mbeki (1990: 03) asserted that TASA would therefore play a conscious role of nation-building. He contended that in order to develop this capacity to transform teacher organisations as well as, education and society, teachers had to rectify the distortions of society by working closely with the ANC.

Mbeki (1990: 05) also called on the "experienced" leadership of TASA and its increasing political confidence to stimulate the transformation process. Naicker (1990a: 07) points to this efficient organisational ability of TASA by declaring that the Association provided secretarial services to the National Teacher Unity Forum (NTUF), the precursor of SADTU. The Association played a major role in the teacher-unity initiatives by formulating an effective programme of action towards the ideal of a single unitary structure for all teachers in South Africa. Naicker was elected to serve on an interim working committee whose tasks were to set up a national office to co-ordinate the teacher-unity programme, to prepare a draft constitution and a time-table for the actualization of the teacher-unity programme.
The labour movement also stimulated the transformation of teacher organisations. Naidoo (1991: 148) shows that with the demise of the conservative Trade Union Council of South Africa in 1986, many Indian workers joined the radical COSATU. Reeves (1994: 84) argues that this radical organisation had a strong influence on teacher organisations. Black teachers, for instance, under the KwaZulu Department of Education turned to the National Education, Health and Allied Workers Union (NEHAWU), an affiliate of COSATU. Many teachers were mobilised and became aware of the value of belonging to an union-based organisation which would readily address their grievances.

In addressing TASA's 1990 conference, Govender (1990: 11), a COSATU education officer, believed that there was a need for teacher organisations, such as TASA to examine their respective roles with the objective of constituting themselves into a united body in preparation for a post-apartheid South Africa. Hartshorne (1992: 318) shows that during 1987 COSATU intensified its plea for teacher unity. J. Naidoo, the General Secretary of COSATU declared: "...the impatience of the trade union movement with the slowness of progress was clear to see...what is needed is a national union of teachers based on the democratic principles and policies of the worker movement". Naidoo pointed out that teachers had a critical role to
play in the struggle for an alternate education system, but they were paralysed by the lack of any democratic national organisation with a clear programme of action. Hyslop (1986: 96) argues that by unionising, teachers can gain effective representation of their interest. For Hyslop the aspiration to gain "professional" status was a "blind alley" as it cut off teachers from other sectors of the community and could not attain even its own narrow aims (see par 6.6.). The labour movement had an interest in encouraging teachers to view themselves as wage earners, having a common interest, with the working class.

Hyslop (1986: 97) declared that the ideas and forms of organisation of the working class movement influenced teachers to participate in the struggle for social transformation. Thus, teachers were urged by COSATU to see their organisations as trade unions, and to seek affiliation to labour movement bodies. The task was to unite South African teachers in a single democratic and non-racial trade union, firmly linked to the labour movement. Naicker (1990b: 06) declared that teacher organisations should defend the teacher' rights as workers. He believed that as workers, teachers should enjoy all trade union rights guaranteed by international labour standards, including the right to organise, to elect their representatives and to draw up their constitutions without interference from the State. Naicker (1990b: 07)
contended that teacher organisations should be able to engage in strike action, required for the defence of their work conditions. He called for an alliance to be formed with trade union movement and the organised teaching profession.

Pillay (1990b: 21) shows that throughout 1990 teacher organisations embarked on a campaign to popularise the launch of SADTU. After nine arduous national meetings between the various teacher organisations, consensus was reached on a unity agreement and on 6 October 1990 in Johannesburg SADTU was established. Reeves (1994: 86) argues that not all teacher organisations wanted to join SADTU when it was formed. Some expressed reservations about the political aims of SADTU and its dependence on strike action as a form of resistance, whilst others opposed SADTU's unitary structure, believing a federal structure was preferable. SADTU believed that a federal structure would still have the effect of perpetuating racial divisions. Thurlow (1992: 38) points out that in August 1991, the federally structured NAPTOSA was established. Twelve teacher organisations, such as the Natal Teachers Society (NTS), TUATA and the Transvaal Teachers Association (TTA), representative of all Afrikaans-speaking and English-speaking teachers and a significant part of Black African teachers committed themselves to the development of a professionally oriented,
politically non-aligned body.

On the surface the tension between professionalism and unionism seemed to be resolved with the formation of SADTU, espousing unionism and NAPTOSA which promoted professionalism. However deeper analysis reveals that this national tension was also reflected within teacher organisations themselves. Despite TASA's new stance (see par 7.1.) some members did not agree with the creation of a unionised organisation (Sunday Tribune Herald, 9 February 1992). Hyslop (1990: 113) contends that these teachers were still influenced towards an apolitical position by a middle class meritocratic ideology which offered considerable improvement in their salaries and conditions of service which the State had granted, and by their "allegiance to professionalism" instead of engaging themselves in the contemporary political struggles. Bonacich's (1980: 214) assertion that Indians still wanted to retain their cultural ethnic identity also partly explains this dissent by a significant part of Indian teachers within SADTU.
7.3.4. Transforming the Status of Women Teachers

Vilardo (1992: 15) contends that the insecurity in tenure and low status of women teachers was reflected in the insignificant participation of women in the leadership of recognised teacher organisations. Reeves (1994: 80) notes that the progressive teacher organisations have had great difficulty in mobilising primary school teachers, a fact that again suggests the importance of patriarchal ideology to both the organisation of teachers in schools and within teacher organisations themselves.

Narsi (1990: 16), a teacher representing the grass-roots membership of TASA, defends this point of view by stating that while the Association had taken up a number of discriminatory practices against women teachers, it did not reflect the gender issue in its own organisational structure. Narsi (1990: 17) claims that not a single woman was part of the National Executive Committee of TASA, and only three women out of a total of 70 members were represented on the Association's National Council. Narsi believes an important implication of this absence of women at important decision-making levels handicapped the struggle of women. The perspectives and concerns of almost half of the teaching fraternity were overlooked by the policy makers as women were not actively involved in determining the strategy and tactics of TASA.
In analysing the status of women teachers at the TASA conference of 1990, Narsi (1990: 16) points to the oppressed and subservient position of women. Narsi contended that not only did race and national oppression mediate women's oppression, but even more fundamentally social class stratified both their objective and subjective conditions of their existence. Narsi exposed the ideology of patriarchy by pointing to legislated discrimination against women teachers such as lower salaries, lack of housing subsidies for married women teachers, disparity in the pension fund contribution and unpaid maternity leave and the domination of promotion posts by males. Narsi also reveals the subtle forms of discrimination prevalent in schools where the division of labour was often based on stereotypic gender roles, such as the association of women with domesticity, like cooking or sewing. Tasks that were regarded as being intellectual and creative, namely management, organisation and planning were not easily available to women. The sexual division of labour was also reinforced by teachers in the classroom. For instance boys were placed in charge of the maintenance of the classroom while girls were allocated clerical duties. The subject choices for boys and girls tended to reinforce sex roles in the adult world, where boys were encouraged to choose Woodwork and Industrial Arts, while girls were seen to be compatible with Home economics and Typing. Textbooks were also criticised for omitting the struggles for freedom and
justice by assertive women who could have provided encouragement as role models. Narsi (1990:16) contended that these practices perpetuated sexual stereotyping among children who later completed the cycle of gender oppression when they left school. A significant feature of the conference was that it identified 13 positive actions that could be initiated to eradicate discrimination at home, school and in society.

According to Narsi (1991:49) the gender issue that was raised at this conference transformed the organisational structure of TASA by influencing the leadership to create an additional post of Vice President for Women’s Matters in 1990. Also, the significance of this conference was that it conscientised the women teachers to a deeper understanding of the nature of their oppression and infused in them a growing resolve to challenge it at every level.
The period under investigation reveals a significant shift in the attitude of the established teacher organisations towards the oppressive State regime. It was marked by a growing sense of radicalism of teachers which not only fuelled their resistance against the State, but offered teacher organisations the ability to transform themselves, as well as education and society. Radicalisation offered the collective body of teachers a united concern for dismantling apartheid.

The radicalism of teachers was spurred by the establishment of the Tri-cameral parliament. This restructuring of the political system raised the awareness of teachers to the injustices that this system bred. Nepotism, corruption, the compromising of the autonomy of teachers and political interference in education made it clear to teachers that in order to effectively resist these injustices they had to involve themselves as a collective group and link with the extra-parliamentary opposition. Radicalisation of teacher organisations also involved the penetration of State and capitalistic ideology by purposefully conscientising middle class members and psychologically incorporating them into the community struggles and the national liberation struggle.
The conscientising of members did not occur on an ad hoc basis, but through the creation of specific structures within teacher organisations, like the Political Education Committee of TASA. These structures offered a site of organised ideas and action where teachers could consciously reconstruct themselves and society. Consequently, resistance was no longer limited to rhetoric, like in the earlier periods but demonstrated clear and defined behavioural responses, which included sit-ins, protest meetings on local and national levels, dissemination of radical literature, protest marches, the withholding of labour, supporting commissions of inquiry and sport boycotts. Teachers were also confronted by State institutionalised violence which was meted out against the militant youth, who in turn provoked moderately inclined teachers towards radicalism.

The State did not allow the radicalisation of teachers to continue uncontested. It sought to control and incorporate militant teachers into its hegemony by bureaucratising education through the De Lange proposals and also by proletarianising the work of teachers through reduced funding. However, through seminars and workshops, teacher organisations empowered teachers to challenge bureaucracy at the level of management and the prescription of curricula and teaching methods. As an anti-bureaucratic trend, teacher bodies reflected democratic practices
through the dehierarchisation of its own organisational structures. This restructuring which was mirrored in the trade union movement made teacher bodies more accessible to the membership.

Teacher organisations demonstrated their ability to transform themselves and education. The release of the leaders of the liberation struggle, together with the easing of the laws curbing freedom of speech, set the climate for transformation. While transformation embodied long term goals it also included the notion of reconstruction of a post-apartheid society. Hence, teacher bodies articulated the concept of People's Education, encompassing a new set of values to counter the ideology of the State and to set up a counter hegemonic power in schools. Teachers were not only restricted to transforming the curricula in order to reflect the struggles of the people, but also sought to change structures of management within the education system.

Teacher bodies also transformed their organisational structures to accommodate the perspectives of women teachers. These new structures conscientised women teachers into the nature of their oppression and gave them a growing resolve to challenge this oppression at every level. Furthermore, teacher bodies also sought to transform themselves through the teacher unity process.
These teachers aimed to increase working class consciousness by changing the nature of their organisation into a union based movement.

They viewed an united teacher movement as autonomous from the official control and believed that this would give them more freedom to act for social and political change. Influenced by the ANC, COSATU, militant teacher organisations, such as NEUSA and its own radical members, teacher organisations merged to form SADTU. These teachers saw themselves as workers and believed that a union based movement was important for oppressed people to transform their situation and have a decisive impact on freedom and social justice.

The transformation of teacher organisations did not go without tension or contradiction. While many established teacher organisations became radicalised, amidst the political and educational crises, some still supported capitalism's concern for stability and order which was needed for effective economic growth. This tension did not disappear, but re-surfaced to find expression in the contradictions of professionalism and unionism; class distinctions between workers and the middle class, a federally structured teacher body and a teacher organisation with a unitary structure. While it seems that this tension was resolved with the formation of NAPTOSA, it
is still felt within teacher bodies themselves, like SADTU, whereby members still adhere to the middle class aspirations of professionalism and at the same time question the need for transformation.
CHAPTER EIGHT

Conclusion

8.1. Theoretical Issues

The difficulty of researching the educational impact of teacher organisations in a class stratified society is obfuscated by racial and ethnic issues. The issue of ethnicity, particularly within the Indian community adds to this problem. Inspite of the multi-racial and even the non-racial rhetoric used by the leadership of cultural and political bodies within the Indian community their activities were narrowly Indian-focused and their mental constructs were culture specific. Ethnicity became even more pronounced during the period of apartheid. While the research has attempted to find a theoretical relationship between economic structure and educational development to fit the historical evidence, political factors have intervened between economic structures and educational outcomes in complex and contradictory ways. Thus researchers should take note that the place of race as a traditional analytical tool for understanding, especially the struggles of teachers should not be emphasised at the expense of other factors such as class and gender as this inevitably leads to reductionism, that is, giving primacy to one factor over another. Ultimately, this leads to an
oversimplification of the complex cultural reality in South Africa.

The investigation reveals that teacher organisations have for the most part of their existence, namely from 1925 to 1935 and from 1961 to 1982 played a significant role in reproducing the ideology of the State and of capitalism. It was only during the protracted 1935-1958 period and the post-1984 period that teacher bodies engaged themselves in actively resisting the hegemony of the State and sought to transform education. Hence the researcher concludes that teacher organisations have had a negative impact on the education of the Indian community (see par 1.4.). While these teacher bodies, like NITS and SAITA were able to secure material benefits, such as school accommodation and increased funding for the education of the Indian community, they could not transform the broader political and socio-economic context in which these improvements were made. On the contrary these teacher organisations became successful in reinforcing the values associated with ethnicism in the consciousness of its members and the Indian community. It was also instrumental in creating a conforming middle class who defended and subscribed to State ideology. Foremost educational theorists and researchers, like Hyslop downplay the class struggle in favour of a racial struggle. They disregard the potential of teacher organisations to adopt and transmit the
ideologies of the dominant classes. Even when they do focus on class-based issues, scant regard is given to central issues in education such as the curriculum or the ideology of professionalism. While researchers, like Hyslop have acknowledged the existence of conservatism within teacher bodies, they do not examine why these teacher bodies become conservative and at the same time they fail to analyse the relationship between teacher organisations and the State and capitalism. Consequently, this cliched concept of conservatism appears unrelated to educational theory. The reproduction thesis attempts to overcome this deficiency.

8.2. The Reproduction Thesis

Teacher organisations acted as elitist institutions reproducing the hegemony of the dominant groups. These institutions were manipulated by the State in order to influence and shape the ideas and actions of teachers. Thus these collective groups of teachers played a significant role in distorting reality by helping the bourgeoisie to instil a false consciousness so that the proletariat across the racial divide failed to realise their common exploited position. Teacher organisations accomplished this task by embracing a conservative model of society, with its emphasis on conformity and control of deviance among the youth. They worked within the
traditional conceptual framework of structural-functionalism which ensured very little or insignificant deviance from the norms of the State and the ruling class (see par 2.1.1.). These teacher bodies conditioned its members to behave in ways appropriate to maintain society in a state of equilibrium. NITS portrayed the family as creators of stability and order and as important agents of the socialisation of the youth (see par 6.4.3; 6.4.2.). Thus, it accommodated the State's desire for the creation of a stable social order. It viewed society as unproblematic where conflicts were masked and struggles within were hidden. It accommodated itself to oppressive legislation such as the Group Areas Act without significantly contesting and placing the Act within the total hegemonic strategy of capitalism and the State.

Instead it argued for more schools in these racially segregated townships (see par 6.3.4; 6.4.2.). It indoctrinated its members and pupils as future workers with values, such as discipline and respect for authority in the service of capital. In their quest to satisfy the aspirations of the merchant class, moderate political bodies such as the NIC and TIC influenced NITS to focus on securing school accommodation as they believed that this was the best strategy for achieving social equilibrium (see par 5.3).
The NITS portrayed the teacher as a custodian of welfare and morality in the Indian community. It mystified and sanctified the teaching profession. The Society held itself responsible for the successful education of the youth. It did not allow political tensions to disrupt the smooth functioning of education within the community (see par 5.3). Teacher organisations used professionalism to promote an image of the teacher to fit middle class aspirations, that of a true leader who was a dedicated self-sacrificing being and who was above the base material concerns of ordinary people. Against a background of political strife, society was depicted as stable and education progressed in an orderly fashion. Inevitably teachers became conditioned to remain aloof from the broader political struggles in South Africa. Members also met capital’s aspirations as a conforming strata of middle class consumers and as creators of stability against the background of an armed struggle (see par 6.2.).

The above trends were not limited to the Indian community or to a few teacher organisations but they were reflected within established teacher bodies across the racial divide. Evidence for this assertion is offered by Peteni, the leader of CATU, who maintained that the political upheavals in the South African society were due to natural urbanisation process, leading to the severing of tribal ties in rural areas (see par 6.3.1.). Hence the
generalised argument that teacher organisations have a powerful ability to reproduce dominant ideologies in society becomes easier to accept.

In order to show that it was on the side of equality, justice and freedom, teacher organisations frequently articulated the values of liberalism. The various social forces within teacher bodies concentrated their energy on restructuring material conditions, a process often regarded as a purely technical process. Economic and social plans which included education emphasised expansion and its quantitative aspects. Within this apolitical framework, the NITS argued for more schools and more funding for education without agitating for the removal of unjust laws (see par 2.2.1; 5.4.2.). Thus, it reinforced the liberal myth of social mobility by agitating for more resources in education and at the same time it accommodated itself to an oppressive and discriminatory regime (see par 5.3.). These values of liberalism were strengthened by Christian education which influenced the leadership towards passivity and compliance. The Society became conditioned by the liberal assumption that the State was a neutral and benevolent structure (see par 5.3.). It defended the aspirations of the merchant class by reinforcing the polarisation of the Indian bourgeoisie and the working class (see par 5.3.). While the NITS did not significantly contest the segregation of education during
the 1925 to 1958 period, it did maintain that racial discrimination and profitability were mutually repelling ideas (see par 5.4.2). Under this ideology of liberalism it politely petitioned the State for a non-discriminatory unified education system. Its petition did not argue that segregated education was based on an oppressive ideology against the Black masses, but it contended that the fragmented education system was an obstacle to the economic empowerment of Indians (see par 5.4.1.). However, in the 1970's it modified this liberal assumption by contending that inequality in society could be overcome by mass education, which would allow more Blacks to occupy middle class positions (see par 6.3.3.). Amidst the struggles by progressive teacher organisations, during the 1984-1992 period, some established teacher bodies continued to appeal to the "national interest", whereby, political stability was seen as an important prerequisite for the country's economic growth.

The Indian community became an important source of labour for capitalist structures in the pre-industrial (see par 4.2.) and industrial phases (see par 6.1; 6.4.1). NITS reinforced this need of capitalism for a cheap, Black labour force. It emphasised technical and industrial training (see par 5.4.1.) and through it's focus on craftwork and manual work, members and the youth were unconsciously socialised into low paid unskilled and semi-
skilled jobs (see par 5.4.2; 6.4.1.). The resultant poverty was treated by NITS from a welfare perspective, instead of protesting against discriminatory labour laws (see par 6.4.1.). It failed to see crime and delinquency in schools and in society as a response to a racially structured labour market (see par 6.4.2.). In arguing against the high drop-out rate as well as failure and learning disability among the youth, the Society failed to consider the broader economic and political causes for the impoverished circumstances of the disadvantaged child and working class youth and their resistance to school as an authoritarian apartheid structure (see par 6.4.1.).

Teacher organisations like SAITA uncritically accepted the differentiated education system. To some extent, there was disagreement and tension among members within SAITA about the system, but it was limited to the need for an adequate infrastructure to cope with the differentiated education system. SAITA failed to articulate the notion that differentiated education was a system to provide a mass of cheap Black labour power and limited skilled labour (see par 6.3.3.). This tension among members also surfaced during the transfer of education to the DIA (see par 6.3.1.) and it is explained by the contradictory class position of teachers. The ideological inconsistencies and contradictory behaviour of the petty bourgeoisie was reflected in their ideology and behaviour. It was neither an uncompromising resistance nor dramatic
ambiguity. This was the price of survival in a contradictory world.

Teacher organisations sustained and reinforced middle class and elitist values. Even in its inception, the NITS is shown to be appeasing the British monarchy (see par 5.2.2.). The ideology of competition, individualism and self-interest was important for the transmission of the ideology of apartheid and the rejection of a counterculture of working class aspirations. Under the De Lange recommendations the State not only sought to depoliticise inequality in education by introducing reforms, but used a meritocratic ideology to incorporate the middle class into its hegemony, by offering better salaries, promotion opportunities and awards for outstanding service. These middle class teachers were distracted from revolutionary activity and the State also used these teachers to exert a moderating influence on the national liberation movement. Consequently, these teachers failed to penetrate hegemonic ideology as it was obscured by the material benefits offered by the State (see par 5.3; 6.3.1; 6.3.2.).

In order to subdue unrest within the labour force and protect the interests of capitalism, the State resorted to oppressive legislation and brutal repression. This repressive climate caused teacher organisations, like NITS, TUATA and CATU (see par 6.2; 6.3.1.) to focus on the
enrichment of culture within their segregated communities (see par 6.2.). The NITS did not argue for a national South African culture, but permitted racial upliftment and ethno-cultural identity (see par 4.6.1.). The Society agreed with the establishment of the DIA and its separate education structures. It empathised with the State's emphasis on ethnic polarisation as it prevented them from being reduced to the status of the African. The Society's emphasis on Indian-centred activities reinforced the State's ideology of racial discrimination on the basis of cultural differences (see par 5.2.2.). A segregated curriculum promoted cultural differences, shaping ethnic consciousness and prevented class solidarity from forming across the racial divide (see par 5.4.1.). Cultural reproduction did not only occur through the emphasis on cultural activities but through the promotion of an elitist perspective of the curriculum by a collective group of teachers. Teacher organisations marginalised working class values and upheld middle class values by valorising academic subjects and disqualifying practical subjects (see par 6.3.2; 6.4.3.). These teachers used the curriculum to transmit the norms and values of the State. Within this functionalistic framework SAITA exploited the curriculum to condition the youth to acquire social and communication skills which would enable them to conform and participate in an apartheid society. The curriculum did not empower teachers and pupils for personal and critical
reflection of social life. Nor did it empower them to penetrate the hegemony of the dominant class which was a fundamental requirement for the radical transformation of apartheid society (see par 6.3.2.). Instead the hegemonic curriculum perpetuated the capitalistic ideology of women as docile and subservient in a patriarchal society with limited occupational opportunities (see par 6.3.4; 5.5.5.). Many attempts by NITS and SAITA to achieve a relevant curriculum was unsuccessful due to their parochial request for the curriculum to be Indian-centred instead of multi-cultural (see par 6.3.4.). These teacher organisations promoted traditional pedagogical techniques encompassing the transfer-of-knowledge approach which strengthened the hold of dominant ideology on pupil consciousness and sustained an elitist and an authoritarian ethos. By marketing the official ideas of State authority these teachers failed to consider how knowledge was both consumed and produced in school settings. Consequently, they failed to plan curricula democratically and to teach in emancipatory ways. Thus the ideas of critical reflection, social responsibility and the ability of teachers and pupils to change the apartheid system did not materialise (see par 6.3.5.).

Established teacher organisations turned to professionalism in order to depoliticise the crisis in education. The ideology of professionalism offered the mechanism whereby
teacher organisations were able to indoctrinate its members into compliance and conformity. Professionalism shows signs of accommodating tendencies as it legitimised the aspirations of the middle class and it served the needs of capital and the State by securing the co-operation of teachers. Against the hegemony of the State, professional ideologists occupied positions in the apartheid education structure without complaint or disruption. Professionalism supported capitalism by reinforcing bureaucratic hierarchies and by obscuring class division in society. It mystified the techniques of teaching and "controlled" members by a code of ethics and a monopoly over knowledge. In this regard the State used legislation and repressive mechanisms to stifle the emergent or progressive teacher organisations while at the same time it allowed the established teacher organisations to monopolise the professional service. Through its subject societies, publications, meetings and conferences, these professional bodies not only promoted a kind of "cognitive exclusiveness" which conditioned teachers to the idea that professionals should be separated from contemporary controversial political and socio-economic issues, but it also effectively acculturated members to a middle class ethos. Even teacher unity was fostered by a parochial perspective of professionalism. Ultimately professionalism was incapable of articulating a fundamental critique of the apartheid education system and could not empower members to
transform society (see par 6.6.). In so doing it effectively excluded the notion that teacher bodies could link up with the labour movement.

8.3. The Resistance-Transformation Antithesis

While a large part of the analysis reveals that teacher organisations acted as powerful agents of the State and of capitalism, it also shows that teachers as a collective group were capable of resisting these dominant ideologies. However, initially much of this resistance was limited as it failed to penetrate hegemonic ideology. Teacher organisations reacted to circumstances rather than initiating changes in educational policy.

This ineffective resistance stems from the suppression and decline of the labour movement in the 1940's and 1950's through oppressive legislation, such as the Suppression of Communism Act. This Act also led to the dismissal of teachers for political misconduct (see par 5.5.6.). In the 1960's the accommodationist strategy of teacher organisations was fuelled by an inability of the liberation organisations such as the NIC and the ANC to organise teachers and their failure to offer a counter hegemonic alternative to apartheid education (see par 6.3.1.). Furthermore teacher bodies failed to link up with youth struggles. Instead they sought to undermine youth bodies
like COSAS as it struggled against apartheid education (see par 6.4.3.).

While enlightened leaders of teacher organisations, like A.D. Lazarus resisted the authoritarian ethos prevailing in the classroom by denouncing corporal punishment (see par 6.4.2.), they limited their resistance to rhetoric, and did not actively engage membership against State repression. Lazarus, who criticised the State was effectively silenced by being punitively transferred. The State also prevented teachers from serving on cultural or political bodies in order to limit dissent and stifle political expression (see par 6.3.2.). This passive approach which considers the role of human agency in the process of change has proved inadequate. Resistance was not only stifled by State repression but also because teachers did not respond to leaders like Lazarus and Pillay, like workers did to Gandhi (see par 4.4.). Teachers had already achieved middle class status and they were relatively well off in society. They failed to create a counter-hegemonic culture because many of the leaders of the teacher bodies held positions of authority in schools and also principals did not want to relinquish the control of education to militant teachers (see par 4.4.).

Effective resistance was also impeded because teacher bodies failed to organise themselves into unions.
Consequently, teacher organisations adopted a Ghandian ethic of passive resistance encompassing resolutions, polite lobbying, petitions and deputations (see par 4.7; 5.3.). The ability of teachers to offer a common front across the racial spectrum against the dictates of the State was severely curtailed by an oppressive capitalist system. Industrialists hired passive African workers over militant Indian workers. The resultant tension between workers led to social instability during the late 1940's. This racial tension was also felt between the racially divided teacher organisations. Hence, in 1958 Indian and Coloured teacher bodies merged to form SAFTA. This organisation offered very little resistance to State oppression because it focussed on professional activities and by being federally organised, it entrenched racial divisions (see par 5.5.7.).

The researcher has traced the failure of women's resistance to the regimented indenture system in which women were relegated to simple tasks. This oppression was located in the "historic collective subconsciousness" of the Indian community and it continuously manifested itself in the period under investigation (see par 4.3.).

By placing emphasis on cultural differences, teacher bodies effectively diluted a unified working class consciousness (see par 4.6.1; 4.6.2.). The NITS focused on the
merchant class or the bourgeoisie class and ignored workers' grievances. Thus, it destroyed any potential unity with Black workers (see par 4.4.). It reinforced a stratified class structure so that no uniform working class consciousness could form. Even when focusing on issues of racial discrimination bodies such as the NIC offered resistance from an ethnic or Indian-centred perspective (see par 4.5.). The CPSA also diluted its class struggle by turning to polite protests and to resistance on the political front.

The historic evidence shows that these teacher organisations have either endorsed, or else have failed to challenge in significant ways, the use of education by the State to ramify the ideology and practice of apartheid. In addition these organisations had no power to compel action from political and educational authorities. Decades of compliance with State policy, or unwillingness to forcefully articulate the obvious injustices of that policy, have inevitably led to a position where established or teacher organisations became inward looking, ineffective in acting decisively on behalf of their members. These teacher organisations also lacked a sufficient dynamic relationship with the communities they served, having no significant voice in decisions for which their members were held responsible, and no capacity to advance the educational interests of South African society as a whole.
Although there was no complete actualisation of working class consciousness, there was a significant shift during the pre-1935 period in the merchant dominated class politics to a more militant and less accommodationist politics of the post-1935 period (see par 5.5.1.). While teacher organisations involved themselves in struggles during the 1935-1958 period, these struggles became more intense during the post-1984 period. Professionally orientated teacher bodies could not serve the needs of a more radicalised segment of teachers. Hence these teachers formed and joined militant teacher organisations. Due to the ineffective representation by the NITS, teacher bodies, like the NTU emerged in the 1940's to represent teachers grievances of inadequate salaries and depressed conditions of service (see par 5.5.2.). This militancy was fuelled by the labour movement which in turn was spurred by African nationalism, unemployment, poverty and the influence of the CPSA. Also the rejection of a separate and inferior education system by the working class gave impetus to this movement.

In the post-1935 period, radicalised teachers like I.C. Meer challenged the status quo, albeit, over the narrow concern of salaries and confronted the NPA with strike action (see par 5.5.2.). In a radicalised climate the NITS joined with labour and the NIC to agitate for
compulsory and free education, and increased funding of the school building programme (see par 5.5.2.). When the Society felt that they were no longer making progress in discussions about parity of salaries with the NPA, they withdrew its representatives. In a defiant form of resistance a number of teachers resigned in protest against inadequate salaries (see par 5.5.4.).

While in the 1961 - 1982 period teacher organisations like the NITS and SAITA struggled as Indian teachers, for narrow material conditions, in the post-1984 period TASA eschewed this ethnicity and agitated for a unified, democratic non-racial, non-sexist State with a single Ministry of Education. This period saw an escalation in the struggles of the liberation movement against a newly established Tricameral system. These contemporary mass struggles renewed working class pressure on teachers for an alliance with labour. Teachers began to identify with the youth in their struggles against the apartheid and capitalist social order. This intensified radicalism was also gradually expressed by the established teacher organisations when they realised that they were powerless to challenge State hegemony.

This sense of militancy was amplified when teacher organisations withdrew from State structures such as the SACE and the subject committees of the Department of
Education. Progressive teacher bodies such as TASA created structures to politically conscientise members. These teacher organisations believed that their members had to be conscientised to transcend their material conditions by raising their consciousness, that is, by making them aware of the cultural and racial barriers that prevented them from effectively contesting the hegemony of the State (see par 7.2.1.). A significant number of Indian teachers came to eschew ethnicity by perceiving themselves as Blacks and being part of the oppressed. As a result of this militancy, teacher organisations became more politically conscientised and sought to enhance interracial working class solidarity. As a precursor to this movement TASA significantly stimulated the teacher-unity process through its efficient organisation. It's leadership promoted a culture of national reconstruction and successfully attained a coherent compromise out of a diversity of conflicting interests (see par 7.3.3.).

The empowered members effectively resisted the increasing bureaucratisation of education through which the State sought to control teachers. TASA counteracted this bureaucracy by conscientising members through workshops. It resisted the prescription of teaching methods by State officials and contested the rigid hierarchical system which alienated teachers. Teacher organisations like WECTU, the PTU and TASA resisted political interference in the
administration and control of education. These members engaged themselves in active resistance, such as sit-in’s, against the autocratic evaluation procedures of teachers and linked with community-based organisations in protest marches to resist the apartheid regime (see par 7.2.2.).

The radicalised climate of the post-1935 period allowed teacher organisations to address the gender issue. NITS became successful in reducing the school fees for girls and in promoting various careers for girls (see par 5.5.5.). Even within the organisation, NITS allowed women, to a limited extent, to serve on its executive committee. However, by and large, the struggles of women teachers were handicapped by insufficient representation on important decision-making levels in education structures and within organisations. Consequently, the decisions and perspectives of women were not taken into account. In the post-1984 period progressive teacher bodies transformed their organisation to cater for the perspective of women teachers. These structures conscientised women teachers to a deeper understanding of the nature of their oppression and inspired in them a growing resolve to challenge it at every level.

Leaders, like Samuels were no longer ambivalent in their rhetoric, but they criticised the policies of the State and emphasised that meaningful change in education must be
preceded by a democratic political system (see par 6.3.2.). Teachers had solved their contradictory class position by moving away from their middle class positions to join worker movements. This move partly reinforced the Marxist argument that tension in society between the bourgeoisie and a rebellious proletariat would possibly culminate in the dismantling of capitalism and would lead to the establishment of a social democracy (see par 3.2.). The advantage of this proletarianised social class position of the teacher implies opposition to further bureaucratisation and centralization of decision-making in education.

While the struggles of resistance focused on short-term solutions to the crises in education, teacher organisations also engaged themselves in long term struggles for transformation which incorporated the reconstruction of a post-apartheid society (see par 3.5.). A stagnating economy and the resultant poverty and political instability contributed to the transformation process. It was also the unbanning of political prisoners and the lifting of the State of Emergency and press restrictions which gave impetus to this process. Leaders of the liberation movement sought to incorporate the middle class in its struggles for political and social transformation. Structures within teacher organisations also conscientised members and positioned them for transformation (see par
7.3.1. ).

Transformation encompassed new ideas, structures, processes and movements. In particular, teacher organisations developed a counter-hegemonic ideology for the exploited, namely, People’s Education (see par 2.1.1.). This was a more viable strategy which contested the State’s hegemony within existing structures of education, and it was this strategy that set the People’s Education campaign of the mid-1980’s apart from the school boycotts and alternative educational projects of the 1950’s (see par 6.3.1.). People’s Education was set to transform apartheid education by creating a counter-hegemonic culture with a new set of values and new forms of consciousness to transcend the situation of the domination (see par 7.3.2.). For teacher organisations, the adoption of People’s Education marked a qualitative transformation of the education struggle as it moved from protest to challenge. Teacher bodies called for the curriculum to reflect the broad struggle of people. By politicising the educational experience in the classroom teacher organisations empowered the teacher and pupils to transform society. These teachers realised that society could not be changed by the number of speeches they delivered.
It is doubtful whether long term reforms by teacher organisations would work in a society which is governed by the institutions of corporate capitalism. Reforms are hardly possible in a society where there is a rigid pattern of dominance and subordinancy and where alienated work is the rule. Thus, the researcher advocates a workers' democracy in which individuals have the right and obligation to structure their work-lives through direct participatory control. It is suggested that educators should press for the democratisation of schools by working towards a system of participatory power, where work processes are self-initiated and controlled by the workers themselves. They should attempt to undermine the correspondence between the social relations of education and the social relations of production in capitalist economic life, that is, to undermine the capacity of the system to perpetuate inequality.

The struggle to liberate education and the struggle to democratised economic life are inextricably related, but institutional change can only be the culmination of the coordinated activity of social classes. It is admitted that there is a lack of unified consciousness, a fragmentation facilitated by racial, sexual and socio-economic antagonisms. This problem can be overcome only by offering an alternative discourse in which disparate objectives of different groups are simultaneously met. Though the over-
riding objective must be the ultimate dismantling of the capitalist system, teacher organisations must recognise that the preparatory phase of a revolutionary movement involves working in, and through, existing capitalist institutions. Teacher organisations which have a dream for the transformation or the reconstruction of society have the task of denouncing and working against the reproduction of the dominant ideology.

8.4. Significance of the Research for Educational Theory

Reproduction theory has been invaluable in contributing to a broader understanding of the hegemonic role of teacher organisations and their relation to the dominant society. The investigation significantly contributes to radical educational theory in that it extends the traditional assertion that an individual teacher acts as an agent of capitalism and serves to foster the interests of the State to teachers in an organised or collective context where they become more powerful in articulating this hegemony. In this investigation reproduction theory has offered a foundation for developing a critical science of education, in particular, it has brought teachers acting as a collective group into sharp focus.

The research points to a need for an introspection by the leadership and members of teacher organisations. It calls
for teacher bodies to critically scrutinise their relationship with the State, and the values that they seek to defend. The new role of transformation suggests that teacher bodies should question whether they want teachers to conform to prescribed patterns of thought and action. Or whether they prepared to liberate teachers so that they could perform their work in open, democratic, creative institutions that will encourage learners to become independent, critical and responsible citizens? Are teachers just to become servants and employees of another kind of State, a different kind of ideology, or are they to be allowed to function as free people in a truly democratic society?

In particular, the research directs us to the ineffectiveness of teacher bodies that are organised along professional lines to bring about socio-economic and political change. The expression of an apolitical professionalism, together with their failure to link with the worker movement partly accounts for this ineffectiveness. Due to the indeterminacy of position of teachers on the social hierarchy, a class struggle waged by teacher organisations at the ideological levels can decide the extent to which those teachers in contradictory locations will join with the working class in a socialistic movement. A significant proportion of "professional" teachers can be drawn towards unionism as they begin to
realise the limits of a strategy of professionalisation. These teachers are particularly predisposed to take the path of unionisation as they increasingly become subordinated to administrators and other professionals with equal or superior claims of expertise. The development of the vision of a socialist alternative requires a revolutionary transformation to aid the daily struggles of the working class people. It must be mentioned that while socialism is not an event, it is a process where the aim is not mere re-orientation of political power but a transformation of social life.

There is however a danger that teacher organisations which align themselves too closely with the State will become ineffective as they "dilute" their members grievances with the State. Also, in courting the middle class or petty bourgeoisie, with its distinct interests and goals, teacher unions can fall prey to opportunism which can weaken the loyalty of its working-class base. Teacher organisations are warned that the failure to come to terms with the objectively antagonistic relationship between the professional managerial class and the working class will ultimately result in a socialist movement that fails to attract working class supporters or in the domination of its members by the professional managerial class.
The above theory on teacher organisations assists us to explain many contemporary problematic issues in education. For instance, many teachers have resigned from teacher unions like SADTU and have joined professional orientated bodies such as NAPTOSA. This dissatisfaction with SADTU occurs because teachers identify themselves with the aspirations of the middle class. Indian teachers, in particular, are not only drawn towards professional bodies because of petty bourgeoisie interests, but are tied to a strong ethnic consciousness which is grounded in conservatism. Currently there is evidence of a polarisation of society caused by the emergence of an African elite which is sustained by an elite system of private schooling, while a mass-based public schooling system serves mainly the working class. Thus the above theory on teacher organisations may play an important part in explaining the role teacher bodies play in reinforcing this dichotomy of unequal education. One must also note that the contemporary issue of rationalisation and redeployment of teachers has not being adequately addressed by teacher organisations. These bodies have aligned themselves to the State’s policy of achieving equity in the distribution of teachers in all schools throughout the country. However, teacher organisations, like SADTU have failed to realise that capitalism had developed and sustained industrialisation in the urban areas while the urban periphery and rural areas remained in an impoverished
state with limited resources and a poor infrastructure.

Teacher unions would surely be the best channel for such expertise as they offer a new dimension, namely, their ability to transform society through new ideas. The professional form of representation of teachers lacks the assertiveness necessary to enable teachers to act appropriately, as experts, in the face of socio-economic and political crises. Monopolies of knowledge must be eliminated, for they can become the basis of privilege, if not domination, in socialist as well as in capitalist society. New ways must be devised to prevent experts from converting superior knowledge and greater responsibility into privilege and unchecked power.

Teacher organisations would do well to remember that education goes far beyond the confines of the classroom. It is through teacher organisations that we can and should proclaim our common humanity and humanise society. We should ensure that education is not abused to become a hegemony which contributes to polarisation, misunderstanding, intolerance, and conflict. It should be a tool, rather to build a society of trust, of co-operation and of growth.
8.5. Related Areas of Research

While the researcher has significantly discussed women as an exploited group, gender has to be the basic organising principle surrounding research work. In this investigation the task is made difficult by the complexity of variables such as ethnicity, race, a stratified society, and the intricate relationship between State and capitalism. Feminists, argue that a separate category should be used for analysis and they should not be subjected to "class" as an analytical category. It is conceded that teachers occupy more than an objective class location and they must be understood in more than class cultural terms. They assume other identifications and participate in other forms of struggle that have political significance. Gender identities and struggles, in particular, have historical roots and dynamics in teaching that cannot be conflated to the influence of class. Teachers' domination as workers in the school bureaucracy has been co-extensive with their domination as women. Hence, further research on teacher organisations should focus on gender as an analytical category.

The above theory of reproduction has not given enough attention to the issues of how domination penetrates the structure of the personality. There is little concern
with the often contradictory relation between understanding and action. Part of this solution to the problem may lie in uncovering the genesis and operation of those socially constructed needs that tie people to larger structures of domination. Radical theory has shown a tendency to ignore the question of needs and desires in favour of issues that centre around ideology and consciousness. A critical psychology is needed that points to the way in which domination reproduces itself in the psyche of human beings. There is a need to understand how dominating ideologies prevent many-sided needs from developing in the oppressed. Without a theory of critical psychology researchers have no way of understanding the grip and force of alienating social structures as they manifest themselves in the aspects of everyday life of educators.
Bibliography

1. Primary Sources

1.1. Published Primary Sources

1.1.1. Official Publications

1.1.1.1. Reports

Natal Education Department, Report of the Director of Education. 1962.

Natal Provincial Department, Report of the Protector of Indian Immigrants. 1941.

1.1.1.2. Journals


1.1.1.3. Notices


1.1.2. Non-Official Publications

1.1.2.1. Educational Brochures


1.1.2.2. Newspapers and Related Publications

Diamond Fields Advertiser, 18 October 1962.


Graphic, 13 June 1963.

Indian Opinion, 5 May 1944.

Leader, 13 May 1944.

Leader, 17 January 1964.

Leader, 16 February 1968.


Natal Mercury, 17 November 1962.

Natal Mercury, 13 June 1962.

Natal Mercury, 18 June 1981.


Post, 29-01 May-June 1991.

Post, 10-13 June 1992.


TASA News, April 1981.

1.1.2.3. Periodicals and Journals


1.2. Unpublished Primary Sources

1.2.1. Non-Official Sources

1.2.1.1. Reports


1.2.1.2. Speeches


1.2.1.3. Correspondence

University of Durban-Westville Documentation Centre, Durban. Letter on Multi-Racial Education. 15 October 1962.


University of Durban-Westville Documentation Centre, Durban. Letter: Outcome of Interview from the Director of Education. 25 November 1963.

University of Durban-Westville Documentation Centre, Durban. Teachers' Letter in response to the Transfer of Education. 22 March 1964.

1.2.1.4. Minutes

Minutes of a meeting between the Minister of Indian Affairs, the Director of Indian Education and the General Purposes Committee of the South African Indian Teachers' Association (Durban), 01:11:1975.

Minutes of a meeting between the Teachers' Association of South Africa and the Director of Indian Education (Durban), 20:05:1981.

Minutes of the National Council of the Teachers' Association of South Africa and the Director of Indian Education (Durban), 12:09:1981.

1.2.1.5. Memoranda

Memorandum submitted by the NITS to the Director of Indian Education, 1968.


1.2.1.6. Pamphlets

Pamphlet issued by the Teachers Association of South Africa (TASA), 8 February 1991.
1.2.1.7. Bulletins


2. Secondary Sources

2.1. General Literature


Enslin, P. 1980. Do we Need professional Associations or Unions for Teachers? Perspectives in Education. Vol 4 (no 1): 01-03.


TASA ARCHIVES: SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

60/- General - NITS, SAITA, TASA, early Minute books, historical, Building Trust, NITS Investments, AGM's, Constitution etc.

61/- Regional Councils (10 areas)

62/- Branch Societies (37 branches)

63/- Portfolios of Officers of the Association

64/- Member Welfare (Complaints, Housing, Loans, Retirements, Pensions, Grading, Lawsuits, Salaries, Promotions, Leave, Benefit Funds etc.

65/- Correspondence with State Departments

66/- Membership (Recruitments, Subscriptions, Retirement, Mortality etc.)

67/- Communication (G P O)

68/- Conferences

69/- Research, Investigations, Questionnaires, etc.

70/- Organs of TASA, Executive/National Council/General Purposes

71/- Publications: Silver, Golden, Diamond Jubilee

72/- Other Organisations, including School Grantees' Association

73/- Departmental Committees on which Association is represented

74/- Finances (Audits, Petty Cash, Claims, Salaries, Pensions, Loans, Bursaries)

75/- Other Teacher Organisations

76/- Co-ordinating Council for Professional Matters

77/- Subject Societies

78/- Office Equipment

79/- Employees of TASA

80/- Community Organisations

81/- Travel

82/- Booksellers

83/- Void

84/- Insurance

85/- Essays

86/- Tertiary Institutions, Universities, Technikons, etc.

87/- Media, (60 Scrap books, Press statements etc. 1946 - 1991)

88/- Irregularities, Exam leakages, Boycotts etc. 1980's

89/- Relief Funds, 1980's

90/- Photographs

91/- Non-TASA material, N E D circulars and handbooks, Government Reports, Education Acts, etc.

92/- Portraits of former TASA presidents.
N I TS / S A I TA / T A S A / G E N E R A L

60/1. N I TA L INDIAN TEACHERS' SOCIETY (NITS) 1925 - 67, BULLETINS.
60/1/2. N I TS MINUTE BOOKS 1932 - 1953.
60/2. SOUTH AFRICAN INDIAN TEACHERS' ASSOC. 1967 - 1979. (SAIT A)
60/4. N I T A L INDIAN SCHOOL BUILDING TRUST (1948-1976) See 72/-, 80/-. 
60/5. TRANSVAAL INDIAN TEACHERS' ASSOC. (TITA) and other early Societies.
60/6. RESEARCH and THESES on the Society. See also 71/-.
60/7. Past Filing Systems.
60/9. VOID.
60/11. Coat of Arms.
60/12. Legal Matters, see 64/3 and 87/-. 
60/13. Premises and Buildings.
60/14. ANNUAL GENERAL MEETINGS.
60/15. SPECIAL GENERAL MEETINGS.
60/16. MEMORANDA & SPECIAL REPORTS.
60/17. CONSTITUTION.
60/18. Code of ETHICS.
60/19. BIOGRAPHIES.
60/20. DISSOLUTION.

This section follows TASA's own sub-division and is one of the few sections where such a variety of material has been grouped together.

Some of the above sections are incomplete and further information must be sought elsewhere in the collection.