From policy to practice:
an evaluation of the Unisa National Professional Diploma in Education
from the perspective of social critical theory

by

Tony John Mays

submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of

Master of Education

in the subject

Didactics

at the

University of South Africa

Supervisor: Prof L J Van Niekerk

June 2004
Declaration

Student Number: 731-788-3

I declare that FROM POLICY TO PRACTICE: AN EVALUATION OF THE UNISA NATIONAL PROFESSIONAL DIPLOMA IN EDUCATION FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF SOCIAL CRITICAL THEORY is my own work and that all sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

..........................................................
Signature Date
(Mr T J Mays)
Acknowledgements

Much of the thinking that underpins this dissertation arises from my work with the South African Institute for Distance Education (Saide) through whom I have had the opportunity to engage with distance education providers and teacher developers from across South Africa and in neighbouring countries. Particular thanks are due for open access to the Saide Resource Centre and its custodian the ever helpful and indefatigable Jenny Louw. The wonderfully focussed and stocked resource centre was the source of many of the publications cited in the bibliography.

My thanks too to Prof LJ Van Niekerk who constantly pushed me to complete this dissertation and to gain the MEd. It is Prof Van Niekerk who has helped me to begin to move from beyond a fairly literal engagement with the potential of distance education for teacher development to begin to question the underlying assumptions and influences. Completing this dissertation has been a bit like climbing the foothills only to find mountains beyond. From the higher vantage point of the foothills, it is clear that in the new territory unfolding ‘here there be dragons’!

It is in the nature of this research project that the researcher needed to engage with many different people at Unisa. Thanks are due for their patience and commitment to answering my many questions and responding to my many suggestions and requests for information to: the 2003 NPDE team - Stephen Diphoko, Cheryl Ferreira, Geesje van den Berg, Henri Kriek, Vuyisile Msila, Elizabeth Nkambule, Bobo Segoe, Barbara Posthuma, Tumi Holomisa, Angeline Setlhako, Mark Van Heerden, “Vuyi” Molo; and also to: Martin Van Staden (Student Affairs), Chris Opperman and Alex Van Der Bank (Assignments), Kelvin Beckworth and Herman Van Rooyen (Examinations), Phoebe Van der Walt (Unisa Press), Elfriede Boshoff and Anneke Vincent (Computer Services), Herman Visser and Willem du Plessis (Management and Finance); Profs T V Mda, S Mothata, J Booyse (Faculty of Education).

Thanks also to those hundreds of Unisa NPDE students who have spoken to me over the past two years and in particular the 707 students who completed the evaluation form that is summarised in an appendix to this dissertation.
Table of contents

Chapter 1:
Introduction ............................................... 1

Chapter 2:
Social critical theory and the implications for teacher education at a
distance .................................................. 21

Chapter 3:
Learning and teaching and the Unisa NPDE ..................... 63

Chapter 4:
Logistics, management and costs for the Unisa NPDE .......... 165

Chapter 5: Conclusions and recommendations .................. 222

Bibliography and references .................................................. 239

Appendices .............................................. 251
## Detailed contents

### Chapter 1:

**Introduction**

- Context of the study .............................................................. 1
  - 1.1 Background to the NPDE ............................................. 2
  - 1.1.1 What is the NPDE? ........................................ 5
  - 1.1.2 Unisa’s response to the challenge set by the NPDE .... 6
  - 1.1.3 The form of the Unisa NPDE .................................... 7
  - 1.1.4 The current status of the Unisa NPDE ......................... 8
- Problem statement ..................................................... 9
  - 1.2.1 Curriculum issues ............................................... 9
  - 1.2.2 Delivery systems ............................................... 10
- Aims .............................................................. 10
- Motivation ......................................................... 10
  - 1.4.1 Providing information for decision-making .................... 12
  - 1.4.2 Adding to current body of knowledge ............................... 12
- Literature review ..................................................... 12
- Research method and design ............................................ 13
- Organisation of the dissertation .......................................... 19

### Chapter 2:

**Social critical theory and the implications for teacher education at a distance** 21

- What is the nature and purpose of education? ............................... 25
- How is education related to culture and to politics? ........................... 30
- Should education be centred on the individual, or organized for the benefit of society? ........................................................... 31
- Which takes priority in education, personal experience or received tradition? 29
- What do the answers to the above questions imply about the nature of knowledge and understanding? ............................. 33
- How do human beings in fact learn things anyway? ............................ 33
- What are the implications for distance education practice? .................. 42
  - 2.7.1 Revisiting the nature of distance education 49
  - 2.7.2 The centrality of learner support in distance education provision 55
- What are the implications for teacher education at a distance? .............. 57
- Conclusion ......................................................... 61

### Chapter 3:

**Learning and teaching and the Unisa NPDE** 63

- Curriculum as plan and practice ........................................... 63
  - 3.1.1 View of knowledge in the Unisa NPDE .......................... 78
  - 3.1.2 Understanding of curriculum .................................... 78
  - 3.1.3 A model (preferably circular and continuous) for how the curriculum is planned, implemented and reviewed .......................... 78
3.1.4 Who is involved in the process? .................................... 79
3.1.5 Opportunities for feedback from learners built into the review process .... 79
3.1.6 Opportunities for feedback from educators built into the review process ..... 80
3.1.7 Intended outcomes and how these were derived ....................... 80
3.1.8 Pedagogy to be employed ........................................ 80
3.1.9 Assessment practices and justification thereof .......................... 80
3.1.10 Resources (including learner support materials) to be used and how these are developed, costed, managed, distributed and reviewed ..................... 80
3.1.11 Relationship between fundamental, core and elective learning .......... 81
3.1.12 How the curriculum and materials development processes take cognisance of the underlying principles of the NQF ................................. 81
3.1.13 Balance between centralised and decentralised roles and responsibilities and management and control of decentralised provision. .................. 84
3.1.14 NPDE in practice .............................................. 84

3.2 Materials review ..................................................... 98
3.2.1 Orientation to programme, introductions, aims & learning outcomes .......... 106
3.2.2 Selection and coherence of content .................................. 108
3.2.3 Presentation of content ......................................... 108
3.2.4 View of knowledge and use of learners’ experience ...................... 110
3.2.5 Activities, feedback and assessment ................................ 111
3.2.6 Language ................................................... 113
3.2.7 Layout and accessibility......................................... 114

3.3 Assessment strategy ................................................. 116
3.3.1 Philosophical and epistemological underpinnings ....................... 117
3.3.2 The impact of OBE on assessment practice ........................... 122
3.3.3 The role of assessment in the Unisa NPDE ........................... 125
3.3.4 Examples of ways in which Unisa has sought to practise what it preaches with regard to assessment on the NPDE programme .................. 126
3.3.5 Portfolio assessment ........................................... 127
3.3.6 Ensuring rigour in the assessment process ............................ 135
3.3.7 Portfolio for RPL purposes ....................................... 144

3.4 RPL strategy ....................................................... 144
3.4.1 What exactly is meant by RPL? .................................... 145
3.4.2 What is RPL offered for? ........................................ 148
3.4.3 What evidence will be required and what processes need to be followed? ... 150
3.4.4 What are the implications for existing practice? ....................... 158
3.4.5 How does Unisa attempt to meet the challenge? ....................... 162

3.5 Portfolio development ................................................ 163

3.6 Tutor recruitment, training and development ................................ 163

3.7 Conclusion ........................................................ 164

Chapter 4: Logistics, management and costs for the Unisa NPDE ................. 165
4.1 Systems theory and rural contexts ..................................... 166
Chapter 5:
Conclusions and recommendations ............................................. 222
5.1 Is the programme conceptualized and designed in such a way that it addresses the real needs of the intended beneficiaries (the target group)? ...................... 223
5.2 Has the programme been properly (well) implemented (and managed)? ........ 224
5.3 Have the intended outcomes of the programme materialized? .................... 224
5.4 Were the programme outcomes obtained in the most cost-efficient manner? .... 230
5.5 Observations and recommendations ........................................... 230

Bibliography and references .................................................. 239

Appendix A: Student evaluation survey instrument .................................................. 251
Appendix B: Consolidated results of student survey ................................................ 253
Appendix C: Observation instrument ................................................... 268
Appendix D: Sample observation report ........................................... 270
Appendix E: Budget 2005 ................................................... 276
Diagrams

Figure 1: The learning spiral and key decision points within an expanding network of new understandings ............................................ 41

Figure 2: Open Learning ................................................ 48

Figure 3: Distance education - a continuum of provision ...................... 50
### Tables

**Table 1**: Principles of the NQF ................................. 3  
**Table 2**: Edusource: Un(der) qualified teachers by province, 2000 ............................. 5  
**Table 3**: Uses or purposes of evaluation studies ................................. 13  
**Table 4**: Comparison of old and new teaching paradigms .......................... 22  
**Table 5**: Analysis of educational decision-making ................................. 52  
**Table 6**: Curriculum paradigms ............................................. 66  
**Table 7**: Comparison between textbooks and self-instructional courses ........................ 99  
**Table 8**: Comparison between classroom talk and DE dialogue ........................... 100  
**Table 9**: Curriculum for Foundation Phase educators .............................. 103  
**Table 10**: Curriculum for Intermediate Phase educators .......................... 104  
**Table 11**: Curriculum for Senior Phase educators ........................................ 105  
**Table 12**: Perspectives on assessment choices ........................................ 117  
**Table 13**: Assessment paradigms ............................................. 124  
**Table 14**: Assessment grading ................................................. 134  
**Table 15**: Reflection on practice: example of an open-ended assessment task ........................ 135  
**Table 16**: Response to a case study/scenario ........................................... 137  
**Table 17**: Response to a newspaper article/real-life event etc. ............................ 139  
**Table 18**: Responsibilities of academic coordinators in 2004 .......................... 180  
**Table 19**: Summary of NPDE results for 2003 cohort as at 08 March 2003 ........................... 200  
**Table 20**: Suggested key objectives for the Unisa NPDE .................................. 232