

**TOWARDS THE EFFECTIVE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EXPANDED PUBLIC  
WORKS PROGRAMME IN SOUTH AFRICAN MUNICIPALITIES: A CASE STUDY  
OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY**

by

**LUCAS MOETI**

submitted in accordance with the requirements for  
the degree of

**MASTER OF ARTS**

in the subject

**DEVELOPMENT STUDIES**

at the

**UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA**

**SUPERVISOR: DR SYLVIA KAYE**

**NOVEMBER 2013**

**STATEMENT**

I declare that "TOWARDS THE EFFECTIVE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EXPANDED PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAMME IN SOUTH AFRICAN MUNICIPALITIES: A CASE STUDY OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY" is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

---

SIGNATURE  
(MR L MOETI)

---

DATE

## **DEDICATION**

**THIS STUDY IS DEDICATED TO THE FOLLOWING PERSONS FROM WHOM I  
DRAW STRENGTH AND INSPIRATION:**

- My Father, Buti Ernest Moeti
- My Mother, Makate Rebecca Moeti

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACRONYM	MEANING
ANC	African National Congress
CBD	Central Business District
CJMM	City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality
CLO	Community Liaison Officer
COGTA	Department of Cooperative Governance & Traditional Affairs
CPE	Chantiers de Plein Emploi
CPR	Chantiers Populaires de Reboisement
CRIMP	Central Region Infrastructure Maintenance Program
CTMM	City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality
DG's	Director Generals
DFID-CARE	Department of International Development-Cooperative for Assistance and Relief
DPW	Department of Public Works
DORA	Division of Revenue Act
ECD	Early Childhood Development
EPWP	Extended Public Works Programme
EIIP	Employment Intensive Infrastructure Programme
FTE	Full Time Equivalent
FFC	Financial and Fiscal Commission
HCBC	Home Community Based Care
HSRC	Human Science Research Council
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPM	Indigent Policy Management
KZN	KwaZulu-Natal
LED	Local Economic Development
MAYCO	Mayoral Committee
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MFMA	Municipal Finance Management Act
MIS	Management Information System
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organizations
NPC	National Planning Commission
NPOs	Non Profit Organizations
NSF	National Skills Fund
PWP	Public Works Programme
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
RMP	Rural Maintenance Programme
SDBIP	Service Delivery & Budget Implementation Plan
SPWP	Special Public Works Programme
Stats SA	Statistics South Africa
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
US	United States

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to extend my gratitude to the following individuals who played a major role in the completion of this study:

- My supervisor, Dr Sylvia Kaye for her guidance, understanding, support, and inspiration.
- My brother, Elias Mabuse Moeti who inspired me and my siblings to believe in the importance of education.
- My Father, Buti Ernest Moeti for making me realize the value of education at an early age.
- My Mother, Makate Rebecca Moeti for all the sacrifices she made for me, and interest and concern she has shown in me completing this study.
- My deepest appreciation goes to the CTMM Senior Manager who agreed to be interviewed for this study.
- An appreciation also goes to all the CTMM officials (EPWP champions) who responded to the questionnaires.
- My sincere appreciation goes to all the CTMM EPWP project participants from Garakuwa and Mabopane. I appreciate their time and honesty in responding to the questionnaires.
- My deepest and sincere appreciation to my girlfriend Mpho, for her support, encouragement, and belief in my capabilities to complete this study.
- My daughter Kgomotso Reabetswe, you inspired me to complete this study.

## **SUMMARY**

The Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP) is a government programme targeted at unemployed individuals. Public entities at the national, provincial and municipal level implement the EPWP. The City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality (CTMM) is one of the entities implementing the EPWP at the local level. This study investigated the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM with a view to understand the current implementation approach. The CTMM has been unable to achieve their EPWP annual targets since 2009. The CTMM experienced the lack of attaining targets mainly in relation to persons with disabilities (2%), and indigents (50%). Other challenges include the lack of training EPWP participants in specialized skills; the unsustainable nature of the EPWP projects; and un-approval of the draft EPWP policy. This study proposes interventions with regard to the coordination of the EPWP, improved monitoring of projects, training, indigent criteria, and approval of the EPWP policy within the CTMM.

**KEY WORDS:** Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP); City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality (CTMM); Unemployment; EPWP Projects, Effective Implementation; Development; Exit Opportunities; Indigent policy; Persons with disabilities; EPWP participants.

## Table of Contents

<b>STATEMENT</b> .....	i
<b>DEDICATION</b> .....	ii
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b> .....	iii
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b> .....	iv
<b>SUMMARY</b> .....	v
<b>KEYWORDS</b> .....	vi
<b>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1. Introduction.....	1
1.2. Motivation of the Study.....	3
1.3. Problem Statement .....	4
1.4. Objectives of this study .....	7
1.5. Explanation of research design and methodology .....	8
1.6. Outline of this study .....	9
1.7. Summary .....	10
<b>CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW/THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK.....</b>	<b>11</b>
2.1. Introduction.....	11
2.2. Definition of key concepts .....	11
2.2.1. Unemployment.....	11
2.2.2. Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP) and Related Programmes .....	13
2.2.3. Metropolitan Municipalities.....	15
2.3. Literature review and discussion/theoretical discussion and Explanation .....	16
2.3.1. Context of unemployment in South Africa .....	16
2.3.3. South African literature review on EPWP .....	25
2.3.4. South Africa as a Developmental State .....	30
2.4. Conclusion.....	31
<b>CHAPTER 3: EPWP IMPLEMENTATION IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY</b> .....	<b>33</b>
3.1. Introduction.....	33



3.2.	Background to the City of Tshwane .....	33
3.3.	EPWP implementation process.....	36
3.3.1.	EPWP policy/guideline/plan.....	36
3.3.2.	EPWP & Indigent Policy .....	41
3.3.3.	City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality (CJMM) EPWP: Similarities and or Differences with the CTMM EPWP .....	46
3.4.	Current EPWP performance.....	51
3.4.1.	Performance targets and achievements.....	51
3.4.2.	Challenges encountered in achieving targets.....	52
3.5.	Conclusions.....	53
<b>CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY .....</b>		<b>54</b>
4.1.	Introduction.....	54
4.2.	Conceptualization, definitions, key variables .....	54
4.3.	Issues of measurement .....	55
4.4.	Sample design, size and sampling methods.....	58
4.5.	Data collection methods.....	59
4.6.	Data capturing and editing .....	61
4.7.	Data analysis.....	61
4.8.	Shortcomings and errors.....	63
4.9.	Ethical considerations.....	67
4.10.	Conclusion.....	68
<b>CHAPTER 5: RESULTS – PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION .....</b>		<b>69</b>
5.1.	Introduction.....	69
5.2.	Sample profiles .....	69
5.3.	Results .....	70
5.3.1	Results and Analysis of the response from the interview - CTMM senior manager.....	71
5.3.2	Results and Analysis of the responses from the questionnaires - CTMM departmental EPWP champions .....	76

5.3.3	Results and Analysis of the responses from the questionnaires – EPWP project beneficiaries .....	86
5.3.4	Responses from project employers (contractors) .....	94
5.4.	Conclusions.....	94
<b>CHAPTER 6: SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>		<b>96</b>
6.1.	Summary .....	96
6.2.	Discussion .....	96
6.2.1.	Reflections on the research problem.....	96
6.2.2.	Reflections on the objectives of the study .....	97
6.3.	Interpretation of results in terms of literature or theory.....	98
6.4.	Recommendations .....	100
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY .....</b>		<b>106</b>
<b>TABLES</b>		
Table 2.1: Unemployment rate by age, percentage (2002-2010).....		17
Table 2.2: A comparative assessment of the scale of the PWP.....		22
Table 3.1: CTMM population and economic activity .....		36
Table 3.2: COGTAs national framework for municipal indigent policies.....		42
Table 3.3: CTMM EPWP phase 2 targets.....		51
Table 3.4: CTMM EPWP performance per financial year.....		52
<b>FIGURES</b>		
Figure 3.1: CTMM regional breakdown.....		34
Figure 5.1: Participants at work in one of the roads and transport project in Garankuwa.....		83
Figure 5.2: Participants at work in one of the roads and transport project in Mabopane.....		84
<b>APPENDICES</b>		
APPENDIX A: Interview schedule for CTMM senior manager.....		115

APPENDIX B: Questionnaire for CTMM EPWP champions..... 117  
APPENDIX C: Questionnaire for CTMM EPWP participants..... 121

## **CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION**

### **1.1. Introduction**

The City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality (CTMM), like other municipalities in South Africa has the responsibility of creating work opportunities for its citizens. Some of the temporary work opportunities are created in partnership with other spheres of government and private entities. Within government, and the municipality in particular there are various programmes that are targeted towards unemployed individuals. These programmes include the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) and the Community Work Programme (CWP).

The CTMM has been implementing the EPWP since 2009. Through the EPWP, the municipality has managed to create work opportunities for the unemployed individuals, amongst them youth, the disabled and indigents. However, the CTMM has not been able to meet its work opportunities targets (CTMM, 2010-12). This inability to achieve targets may be one of the reasons that may lead to the ineffective implementation of the EPWP programme leading to the creation of lower than expected work opportunities.

At the national level, the EPWP was conceived by the South African government in 2003. Prior to this period the majority of the population was excluded from economic participation, and were poorly skilled despite large investments in education since 1994. As a response to these conditions, government initiated the EPWP (Levy Institute, 2009: 2). The EPWP is a national programme covering all spheres of government and state owned enterprises. The ultimate goal of the EPWP has been to contribute to governments' efforts of creating employment opportunities that require minimal technical skills and are short-term, labour intensive, temporary jobs. An important component of the programme is the skills development and training offered to beneficiaries. The process is aimed at ensuring that beneficiaries use the skills acquired to enter into longer-term employment after working on any EPWP project (McCord, 2005).

One million jobs have been targeted in phase 1 of the programme (DPW, 2009: 137). These jobs would be derived from four prioritised sectors with the capacity to create labour intensive opportunities, i.e. Infrastructure; Economic; Environment and

Culture; and Social sectors. This phase of the programme began in April 2004 and ended in March 2009. Over 1, 6 million opportunities were created in this phase surpassing the targeted one million, thus achieving 145% against the target. Phase 2 began in April 2009. It is envisaged that in this phase approximately 4, 5 million jobs will be created. Ultimately, government expects that these efforts will enable a process whereby net job opportunities exceed the number of new entrants into the labour market. Categories prioritised as beneficiaries to the programme are women, youth and persons with disabilities (Department of Public Works, 2009: 110).

These efforts by government are however not without challenges. The first challenge relates to how to mobilize national, provincial and local government bodies to achieve the set targets in a synchronized manner, given the constitutional autonomy of these three spheres. Furthermore, there is a need to overcome the tendency for the EPWP to be regarded as the Department of Public Works (DPW) programme rather than as a programme of government. Secondly, the tendency for people to view unemployment as a responsibility of somebody else remains a challenge. There are also government officials who still hold the view that their main task is that of implementing infrastructure programmes and not to alleviate unemployment (Parliament Portfolio Committee on Public Works, 2004: 2).

Thirdly, the widely held view that labour intensive projects are more difficult to manage, take longer, are more costly, and result in inferior quality products must be addressed (African National Congress, 2007). Lastly, the in-equalization of the incentive grant is also a major challenge. Metropolitan municipalities have the capacity to spend their capital allocations to meet EPWP targets and claim later from the incentive grant, whereas poor municipalities have lower capital budgets and seldom meet EPWP targets. This unintended unequal distribution of funds through the incentive grant poses a serious challenge in enabling all categories of municipalities to fulfil their job creation mandate (Parliament Portfolio Committee on Public Works, 2004: 2).

The DPW as the custodian and national coordinator of the EPWP has an unenviable task of addressing the challenges mentioned above. The overall coordinating role of the DPW can be summarised as follows:

- Creating a supportive and enabling environment for the implementation of EPWP projects;
- Coordinating activities of different public bodies so that wherever possible they are aligned;
- Facilitating learning between public bodies on the implementation of public works projects and programmes;
- Monitoring, evaluating and reporting on the EPWP; and
- Assisting with the identification of opportunities to implement EPWP projects (DPW, 2004: 1).

The DPW also coordinates the infrastructure sector. The other three sectors are coordinated through their lead departments, i.e. social sector (Department of Social Development), economic sector (Department of Trade & Industry), and environmental sector (Department of Environmental Affairs). The EPWP Director Generals (DGs) steering committee receives progress reports and addresses bottlenecks in the implementation process. This committee also comprises of a representative from the Presidency (DPW, 2004: 20).

## **1.2. Motivation of the Study**

The diagnostic report of the National Planning Commission identified the persistence of poverty, unemployment and inequality as the key challenges that South Africa needs to overcome (The Presidency, 2014: 18). By August 2013, the official unemployment rate rose to 25.6%, while the broader rate of unemployment rose to 36.8%. The median rate of unemployment for a municipality ranked 90<sup>th</sup> out of 179 is 42% for people aged 15 to 34. For the worst quarter of municipalities, youth unemployment is 52% or higher (Daily Maverick, 2013: 2).

The Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) is one of the main strategies aimed at alleviating poverty, reducing unemployment and contributing towards the development of our country. Within the CTMM, EPWP has been implemented since 2009. However, the CTMM has been unable to meet its annual targets especially in relation to indigents, and people with disabilities. This has led to the CTMM creating less than desired EPWP work opportunities thereby being unable to make a dent in the creation of new temporary work opportunities for the unskilled citizenry.

Although some studies for example, the study by Moyo (2013) on EPWP exit opportunities; and a study by Mothapo (2011) on the impact of the EPWP in alleviating poverty for participants in the Mpumalanga province have been conducted, they mainly deal with gaps in the programme; accelerating its overall impact; and strategies on how to enhance employability of participants. These studies do not provide a considerable focus on how entities such as municipalities can at their level better and effectively implement the EPWP.

This study will not only contextualize EPWP implementation at the municipal level, but also contribute towards assisting municipalities on how to improve their systems currently in place for effective implementation, thereby contributing positively towards national efforts of creating jobs for the unskilled.

In short, the study will broadly contribute towards literature as far as EPWP and job creation are concerned. In particular, the study is important as it will:

- Highlight key challenges encountered by the CTMM in the implementation of EPWP in South Africa;
- Assist the CTMM and other metropolitan municipalities by recommending an effective EPWP implementation approach;
- Recommend an implementation approach that will ultimately benefit EPWP beneficiaries, as municipalities will take note of the socio-economic impact of EPWP on beneficiaries, and the importance of sustaining EPWP projects.

### **1.3. Problem Statement**

Provinces and municipalities serve as the primary implementing agents of the EPWP by utilizing the infrastructure development allocations such as the Municipal Infrastructure Grant (through the Division of Revenue Act), and other budgets in social services (DPW, 2005: 13). By their nature, provinces and municipalities follow the same institutional arrangements as those established at the national level particularly in the implementation of EPWP.

In metropolitan municipalities such as the Cities of Johannesburg and Tshwane, an organizational structure with roles and responsibilities typically consists of an EPWP steering committee, sector coordinators, learnership coordinators, utility or municipal

agencies, and regional directors. However, at the core of implementing EPWP within a municipality is the incorporation of EPWP targets within the municipality's infrastructure and Integrated Development Plans (City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality, 2004).

Based on the available data the City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality (CJMM) in particular, had in the first phase of implementing EPWP set a target of creating 150 000 jobs by the end of 2009. This target was exceeded as the city created 153 835 employment opportunities by the end of phase 1. In phase 2 of the programme, the city aims to continue creating more work opportunities (additional 150 000) and thus making meaningful contribution towards the 2014 vision (South African LED Network, 2010: 1).

On the other hand, despite the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality (CTMM) having an almost similar institutional arrangement as the CJMM, it has not achieved its targets in phase 1 of the programme due to the following:

- The city's participation in phase 1 of the programme was to a limited extent and not visible;
- Few departments participated in the programme; and
- No measurable targets were set for each department, this resulted in departments not being measured (CTMM, 2009: 4).

The lack of clearly defined targets in particular meant that the CTMM could not even benchmark its performance against any measurable instrument. In the financial year 08/09 the CTMM created over 4 000 job opportunities, in 09/10, 9 000 jobs were made available. In essence the CTMM has created approximately 15 000 EPWP opportunities in the phase 1 of the programme. Of these, less than 2% of opportunities were created for people with disabilities. By June 2011, the CTMM had employed 0% of persons with disabilities (CTMM, 2011). For phase 1 of the EPWP, the DPW required that in all EPWP opportunities created by public bodies, at least 40% be for women, 30% youth and 2% for persons with disabilities (DPW, 2009: 15).

In addition, the 50% *CTMM Indigent Policy Directive* was also not fulfilled as less than 1 900 indigents were employed in EPWP projects (CTMM, 2010). In 2011, the CTMM created approximately 604 opportunities for indigents (CTMM, 2011). The



CTMM approved its Indigent Policy in 2009, which was reviewed in 2012. The Policy requires that at least 50% of all EPWP opportunities should benefit indigents as part of the Indigent Exit Strategy.

The phase 1 EPWP performance of the CTMM did not meet the set targets. The CTMM creates almost all (75%) of its EPWP opportunities from its allocated capital budget, which is used to finance service delivery infrastructure projects. On any given financial year, a service delivery department such as Water & Sanitation within the CTMM, has an average budget of over R500 million to spend on the implementation of capital projects ranging from the construction of a Waste Water Treatment facility to installation of water supply pipelines. On average, the Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Plan (SDBIP) indicates that the CTMM allocates a budget of R3, 3 billion in a financial year, for the implementation of capital projects through service delivery departments such as Roads & Transport, Housing & Human Settlements, Water & Sanitation, and Electricity (CTMM, 2012).

Given the above financial resources of the CTMM, one would expect that the city would create more than average EPWP opportunities for its unemployed and destitute citizenry. The lack of meeting EPWP targets by the CTMM is of concern as additional potential beneficiaries could have been given an opportunity to earn an income and skills which are critical in poverty alleviation.

In phase 2 (2009-2014) of the EPWP, the CTMM has set measurable targets. The CTMM envisages creating 375 000 job opportunities in the next five years (2011/12-2015/2016). In the previous financial year of 2010/11, the city was unable to meet its performance threshold of achieving 2 795 Full Time Equivalent (FTE). The FTE refers to one person year of employment. One person year is equivalent to 230 person days of work. Person years of employment is equal to the total number of person days of employment created for targeted labour during the year divided by 230. For task rated workers, tasks completed should be used as a proxy for 8 hours of work per day (DPW, 2009: 20). The city achieved 1 000 FTEs, thus not meeting the minimum performance threshold of 1 855 FTEs. As a result, the city lost R8, 35 million in revenue (in the form of incentive grant) as the FTE target was not met (CTMM, 2011: 2).

For the financial year 2011/12, the city aimed to create 38 000 work opportunities. Based on the data below, it is evident that the city was unable to meet its target:

- Quarter 1 (July-September 2011) target of 2 500 was achieved (actual: 5 033);
- Quarter 2 (October-December 2011) target of 6 000 new opportunities was not achieved. Actual: 1 789 new opportunities ;
- Quarter 3 (January-March 2012) target of 12 000 new opportunities was not achieved.  
Actual: 3 945 new opportunities; and
- Quarter 4 (April-June 2012) target of 17 500 new opportunities was not achieved;  
Actual: 8 234 new opportunities;
- From quarter 1 to quarter 4, the city had a target of 38 000 and only managed to create a total of 19 001 opportunities. This accounts for 50% achievement against an annual target of 38 000 (CTMM, 2012: 2).

Clearly, the CTMM was unable to effectively meet its EPWP performance targets thus compromising the access to the incentive grant<sup>1</sup> and its contribution to employment creation for its citizens. This inability may point to the ineffectiveness of the current institutional arrangement, the lack of prioritization of the EPWP, and the role of individual departments' contribution to achieving their set targets.

It is on this basis that this study seeks to investigate an effective approach in the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM. It should be noted that this study seeks not to 'reinvent the wheel' but rather it intends to propose an effective approach taking into account the institutional arrangement and systems currently in place.

#### **1.4. Objectives of this study**

The aim of the study is to investigate the implementation of EPWP in South African metropolitan municipalities with a particular focus on the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. The research objectives can be summarised as follows:

---

<sup>1</sup> Incentive paid to public bodies to incentivise job creation. The incentive is paid per quantum of employment created for the EPWP target group and can be measured in person-days of work or full time equivalent jobs (Business Trust, 2009: 3)

- a) Provide an outline of the EPWP in Tshwane dealing with factors such as its origin, the social context of unemployment, inequality, poverty etc.
- b) Investigate the challenges inhibiting the achievement of EPWP targets within the CTMM. In this regard an assessment with a particular focus will be undertaken on the following key elements:
  - Institutional arrangement
  - EPWP targets as per the DPW EPWP requirements (40% women, 30% youth, 2% people with disabilities)
  - EPWP targets as per the CTMM Indigent Policy (50% of all EPWP opportunities created should benefit CTMM indigents)
- c) Propose an effective approach in the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM, taking into account the institutional arrangement currently in place.
- d) Highlight key challenges encountered by metropolitan municipalities in the implementation of the EPWP in South Africa.

### **1.5. Explanation of research design and methodology**

Yin (2003) indicates that the types of case study research design include *exploratory*, *explanatory*, and *descriptive*. In this study, the research design is explanatory. The study asks the question, why is the CTMM unable to create EPWP work opportunities that will lead to the meeting of targets particularly in relation to youth, women, the disabled persons, and indigents. Therefore, this study seeks to explain the causes of this ineffectiveness in the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM, and propose an effective approach that will enable the CTMM to meet its EPWP job creation targets.

Hancock et al (2006) asserts that explanatory designs seek to establish cause and effect relationships. Their primary purpose is to determine how events occur and which ones may influence particular outcomes.

Both qualitative and quantitative research methodologies are used in this study. An interview schedule was used to conduct an interview with the CTMM senior manager. However, the study incorporates some elements of quantitative research method. The EPWP champions in the CTMM departments implementing the EPWP, and the participants in the selected EPWP infrastructure projects were requested to

complete questionnaires. A case study approach was used in this study. The CTMM is the single case studied.

Mouton (2002:38) states that there are numerous examples where researchers combine techniques that are usually accepted as quantitative and qualitative. For instance, one may find the researcher who uses probability sampling techniques in conjunction with in depth interviewing or basic descriptive statistics in analyzing qualitative data. Many researchers would argue that the use of multiple methods and techniques is actually one of the best ways to improve the quality of research.

### **1.6. Outline of this study**

The dissertation consists of 6 chapters, structured as follows:

**Chapter 1:** Introduction. The chapter covers motivation of the EPWP study, the problem statement, objectives of the study and the explanation of research design and methodology.

**Chapter 2:** Literature Review/Theoretical Framework. The chapter contextualizes the EPWP by focusing on key concepts and definitions such as unemployment, metropolitan municipalities, impact of the EPWP, the developmental state debate in South Africa, implementation and evaluation of the Public Works Programmes (PWP's) internationally, and EPWP implementation in South Africa.

**Chapter 3:** EPWP Implementation in the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. In this chapter background of the CTMM and the EPWP implementation process is outlined. The chapter further undertakes document review process on the implementation of the EPWP in the City of Johannesburg with a view to highlight similarities or difference in relation to the CTMM. Lastly, the current EPWP performance challenges within the CTMM are highlighted.

**Chapter 4:** Research Design and Methodology. In this chapter the sampling design and methods, and the nature of the research methodology are discussed in detail. In addition, the data collection methods, data capturing and editing, data analysis and data shortcomings and errors are detailed.

**Chapter 5:** Results – Presentation and Discussion. The chapter presents and discusses the sample profiles, and the findings that were collected from the sample profiles, and conclusions to be drawn from the results.

**Chapter 6:** Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations. The results are summarised and discussed/interpreted in terms of the literature or theory.

### **1.7. Summary**

This chapter covered five elements. These are the motivation of the study, problem statement, objectives of this study, explanation of research design and methodology, and the outline of the study. The next chapter will contextualise the EPWP within the broader unemployment and developmental debate. Most importantly, the chapter will also discuss the theoretical perspectives of the EPWP within the international and South African context.

## **CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW/THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK**

### **2.1. Introduction**

Boote et al (2005: 1) defines literature review as an evaluative report of studies found in the literature related to a selected area. The review should describe, summarize, evaluate and clarify this literature. It should give a theoretical basis for the research and help determine the nature of the research.

In addition, Boote et al (2005:1) indicates the basic purpose of literature review as to:

- Provide a context for the research;
- Justify the research;
- Ensure the research hasn't been done before (or that it is not just a "replication study");
- Show where the research fits into the existing body of knowledge;
- Enable the researcher to learn from previous theory on the subject;
- Illustrate how the subject has been studied previously;
- Highlight flaws in previous research;
- Outline gaps in previous research;
- Show that the work is adding to the understanding and knowledge of the field; and
- Help refine, refocus or even change the topic.

In this study the literature review will not only seek to contextualize the research, but also illustrate how the subject has been studied previously. In addition, the study will also ensure that the research is not a replica of previous studies on the subject.

### **2.2. Definition of key concepts**

#### **2.2.1. Unemployment**

The International Labour Organization (ILO) defines unemployment as characterised by all persons over a specific age who during the reference period were:

- a) Without work - were not in paid employment or self-employed;
- b) Currently available for work - were available for paid employment or self-employment during the reference period; and

- c) Seeking work - had taken specific steps in a specified reference period to seek paid employment or self-employment (International Labour Organization, 1982: 10).

In South Africa, there are two main definitions of unemployment .i.e. Narrow and Broad definitions. According to Brynard (2011: 68), the narrow definition counts as unemployed all jobless persons who want work and searched for work in the recent past (typically, in the four weeks prior to the household survey visit). These people are typically referred to as the 'searching unemployed'. The broad definition drops the search criterion and counts as unemployed all jobless persons who report that they want work even if they did not search in the reference period. In other words, the broad definition includes both the searching and the non-searching unemployed. The official Statistical agency (Statistics South Africa) adopted the narrow concept as its official definition of unemployment in 1998.

The Human Science Research Council (1985) indicates that most definitions of unemployment require that a person not only wants to work but also actively looks for it. The Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) argues that this ignores the discouraged work seekers who may want to work at the going wage, but has given up looking because she/he perceives the possibility of getting it to be very slim.

Mafiri (2002: 11) notes that there are four different types of unemployment .i.e. Cyclical, Frictional, Seasonal, and Structural unemployment. He argues that in South Africa the unemployment is structural as it is not sensitive to changes in aggregate demand. Hence, structural unemployment exists when the economy is at full employment.

Chadha (1994: 23) also supports this view and indicates that even during periods of high economic growth rates, job creation does not increase enough to absorb those already unemployed or those looking to enter the job market. Also, this might be an indication of a skills mismatch between the skills of those seeking work and the skills required by potential employers. Chadha (1994) further asserts that rapid growth of the labour force, the use of capital or skill intensive technology and an inflexible

labour market are some of the reasons contributing towards the high unemployment rate in South Africa.

Banerjee *et al* (2008) emphasizes that due to the structural nature of unemployment it is unlikely to improve in the future without policy interventions. The EPWP is one of the policy interventions introduced to contribute positively towards government endeavours of reducing the levels of unemployment.

### **2.2.2. Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP) and Related Programmes**

The EPWP is one of many socio-economic policy interventions that the government of South Africa has introduced to employ the unemployed and largely unskilled individuals. However, the EPWP has precursors and is not the only development programme of its kind. Other development programmes aimed at absorbing the unemployed individuals and enabling cash transfers to the poor include the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) which was in operation between 1994 and 1999, and the Special Poverty Relief Allocation which commenced from 1999 and ended in 2004 (Lieuw-Kie-Song, 2009: 6).

Another government programme which provides an employment safety net is the Community Work Programme (CWP). The CWP was started in late 2007 as a pilot project. The CWP is an area-based programme intended to be ongoing and this allows it to target the poorest areas where market-based jobs are unlikely to come any time soon. 'Work' is decided in Ward Committees or local development fora; the CWP is multi-sectoral and contributes to public/community goods and services. The start-up scale is 1,000 participants per site (Philip, 2009: 2).

Although the CWP is rooted in communities, it is part of the EPWP and complements the other components. The CWP aims to supplement existing livelihood strategies such as the EPWP without disrupting or displacing them (Phillip, 2009: 3). As a result of initial performance during the 2007 pilot phase, the CWP was accepted in 2008 as a new element within the second phase of the EPWP, and provisionally located within its new 'non state' sector (Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, 2010: 2).



At its core, the EPWP's main objective is to provide income and training to enable people to move into other work (exit) through provision of infrastructure and services. The EPWP uses Special Employment Framework to distinguish from public service and other formal employment: maximum duration of employment, allowance for lower wages, training entitlement, and no unemployment insurance. The no special budgets: additions to existing budgets and conditional intergovernmental mechanisms and mobilization for provincial and municipal government to use their own budgets as well:

- a) Employment creation to be mainstreamed in core function of government, not a parallel/ peripheral function;
- b) Limit establishment of separate/ parallel institutions for implementation; and
- c) Focus on maintaining productivity and limit risk of make work-programmes (Lieuw-Kie-Song, 2009: 6).

It is important to note that the EPWP's design impact is not separate from the Millennium Development Goals (MDG) related investments. Firstly, its conditional infrastructure grants are meant for basic infrastructure, as well as education and health facilities (MDG 2, 4, 5). Secondly, the Early Childhood Development (ECD) and Home Community Based Care (HCBC) activities contribute to health, education and gender equity objectives of the MDG's (MDG 2,3,4,5 & 6). Lastly, the environmental sector programmes promote environmental sustainability - MDG 7 (Lieuw-Kie-Song, 2009: 10).

Key lessons learnt from the first phase of the EPWP include:

- a) Combining work creation and training for exit strategies was extremely difficult, especially at a large scale;
- b) Technical support and capacity building critical: requires a long term view and strong financial and institutional commitment;
- c) Better delineation between work in formal public sector versus work in EPWP required as tensions likely to increase as programme gets bigger;
- d) Performance varied widely between public bodies; and
- e) Self-targeting (low wages) generally works in reaching target groups (Lieuw-Kie-Song, 2009: 20).

### **2.2.3. Metropolitan Municipalities**

The South African governmental administration system has three spheres of government, which are interdependent and interrelated but have autonomy and different levels of power. The three spheres are National, Provincial and Local government. The local government system is divided into three categories. Category A municipalities refers to Metropolitan municipalities, which are characterised by bigger cities and towns. Category B municipalities are local municipalities, and Category C municipalities are district municipalities which typically consist of between 4-7 local municipalities (White Paper on Local Government, 1998: 50).

The City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality (CTMM) is classified as a Category A municipality. The 1998 White Paper on Local Government indicates that in any system of metropolitan government, it is envisaged that the Metropolitan Council would fulfill the following key roles:

- a) City-wide spatial integration and socially inclusive development;
- b) The promotion of equity, social justice and economic prosperity;
- c) The promotion of local democracy; and
- d) The provision of affordable and efficient services.

The CTMM, like any other metropolitan municipality in South Africa, is expected to adapt to new ways of delivering services to citizens. These include being accountable for the quality and standards of services delivered, monitoring areas of improving services and being innovative on the way services are delivered to its users. In addition, municipalities are required to foster participatory democracy in the process of delivering services and adhere to the *Batho Pele* principles (White Paper, 1997: 16).

The 'promotion of equity, social justice, and economic prosperity' is one of the main responsibilities of metropolitan municipalities. The municipalities can fulfil this function in several ways, .i.e., through corporatization, partnerships with community-based organizations and non-governmental organizations, contracting out, leases and concessions (public-private partnerships), and transfers of ownership (White Paper on Local Government, 1998: 75).

With regard to the finances, metropolitan municipalities are required to adhere to the Municipal Finance Management Act (MFMA) and the Division of Revenue Act (DORA) guides how municipalities spend their revenue and grant allocations. Most of the revenue generated by municipalities is derived from utility services offered to users (electricity, water, sanitation) and property rates. The revenue generated by metropolitan municipalities is used mainly for operational purposes and in capital projects. Within the CTMM, the EPWP is largely funded from the capital budget. This stems from the fact that given that the capital projects are labour intensive in nature, and they have the potential to absorb workers with lower levels of skill (CTMM, 2012).

### **2.3. Literature review and discussion/theoretical discussion and Explanation**

#### **2.3.1. Context of unemployment in South Africa**

The National Planning Commissions Diagnostic Review report (NPC) describes the high rates of unemployment and underemployment as characterised by 'large proportion of out-of-school youth and adults that are not working. Those in low income households who are working support many dependants and earn little relative to the cost of living. This is a central contributor to widespread poverty. Inactivity of broad sections of society reduces our potential for economic expansion' (NPC, 2011:9).

**Table 2.1: *Unemployment rate*<sup>2</sup> by age, percentage 2002–2010 (NPC Diagnostic Review Report, 2011)**

<b>Age cohort</b>	<b>2002</b>	<b>2004</b>	<b>2006</b>	<b>2008</b>	<b>2010</b>
15 – 24	55.9	51.8	50.2	46.6	51.3
25 – 34	34.1	29.8	28.5	26.2	29.1
35 – 44	21.0	18.2	18.2	16.6	17.8
45 – 54	16.1	11.9	12.4	9.3	12.4
55 – 65	10.0	7.2	6.9	6.5	7.3
<b>Total</b>	<b>30.4</b>	<b>26.2</b>	<b>25.5</b>	<b>23.2</b>	<b>25.4</b>

Source: NPC Diagnostic Review Report, 2011: 11

In the first quarter of 2012, the unemployment rate in South Africa was reported at 25.2%. As shown in the above table, from 2002 until 2008, South Africa's Unemployment Rate averaged 26.38%. However, the rate reached an historical high of 31.20% in March of 2003 and a record low of 23% in September of 2007 (Statistics South Africa, 2012).

Statistics South Africa's (Stats SA) 2013 Quarterly Labour Force Survey (quarter 2) indicates that the highest levels of unemployment (14, 0 million) were experienced in quarter 4 of 2008. Stats SA further notes that during the post-recession phase employment was observed at its lowest level in quarter 3 of 2010 where the number of employed persons declined to 12, 9 million. Also between quarter 3 of the year 2010 and quarter 2 of 2013 total employment increased by 746 000. In addition, in quarter 2 of 2013 13, 7 million persons were employed; a 100 000 job increase compared to quarter 1 of 2013, and an increase of 274 000 persons compared to the same period last year (Statistics South Africa, 2013: 5).

Although South Africa has been able to create some jobs post the 2008 global economic recession, the impact of unemployment on black South African remains resolute in comparison to whites. Cronje (2013: 1) observes that by 2012, 29% of black South Africans were unemployed. Black people were therefore five times more

<sup>2</sup> The *unemployment rate* can be defined as the number of people actively looking for a job divided by the labour force. Changes in unemployment depend mostly on inflows made up of non-employed people starting to look for jobs, of employed people who lose their jobs and look for new ones and of people who stop looking for employment.

The *labour force* is defined as the number of people employed plus the number unemployed but seeking work. The non-labour force includes those who are not looking for work, those who are institutionalised and those serving in the military (www.tradingeconomics.com)

likely to be unemployed. Cronje (2013: 1) further mentions the following facts, which point to the fact that whites continue to benefit more than blacks:

- a) The proportion of white South Africans living in poverty declined from approximately 2% in 1994 to less than 1% in 2012;
- b) The poverty figures for black South Africans were significantly higher, having declined from about 50% in 1994 to 45% by 2012;
- c) Whites have seen their education profile improve rapidly since apartheid ended and are today four times more likely to be in higher education than their black compatriots, who receive an appallingly poor standard of schooling; and
- d) Employment equity and empowerment policies have not driven whites into unemployment or poverty on a significant scale. Whites resident in South Africa are more likely to be employed than residents of the world's leading economies.

With regard to the causes of unemployment, the Financial and Fiscal Commission (2013: 24-25) indicates that:

...high unemployment is a sign of domestic industries' inability to compete with either the high-tech or the low-wage countries. Another is trade and technologies: new technologies and globalization can explain the massive restructuring of South African industries and consequent job losses. Other debates point to the skills mismatch, to insufficient aggregate demand or to the overly generous social policies that negatively affect employment.

In dealing with the relatively high unemployment rates and the inequalities the NPC notes that:

Achieving full employment is a multi-faceted and complex objective. South Africa would have to achieve several objectives simultaneously. We have to grow low-skilled employment, mainly because the bulk of the unemployed are poorly skilled. The public sector can play an important role in creating such jobs, but the big and necessary adjustment lies in changing the economic incentives in the private sector to use more labour. We have to upgrade our economic and industrial infrastructure to support the needs of the existing

economy, promote growth in newer, more labour-absorbing and knowledge-intensive sectors and improve the resource efficiency of our economy. Thirdly, we have to raise productivity through better education and training, better and less onerous regulation, more competitive pricing and an improved logistics system (NPC, 2011: 13).

### **2.3.2. International literature review on Public Works Programmes (PWP's)**

Public Works Programmes (PWPs) can serve as one of an array of interventions that can be used to deal with the high unemployment rate in a country such as South Africa. According to McCord (2007: 13), PWPs are implemented in a range of contexts, which may be generalized into two broad labour market situations; i) acute, short term falls in labour demand or livelihoods disruption (resulting from for example drought, flood, financial crisis, or recession), and (ii) chronic high levels of under- or un-employment and poverty. PWP have differing institutional implications, while sharing common ground in terms of the provision of employment with some form of social protection objective.

Internationally, four types of PWPs are commonly used with each adopting a different conceptualisation of public works, while sharing common ground in terms of the provision of employment with some form of social protection objective. These four types are; i) PWPs offering short-term employment, ii) those promoting labour intensification of government infrastructure spending, iii) large scale government employment programmes which tend offer some form of employment guarantee, and (iv) programmes which enhance employability (McCord, 2007: 13).

- Those *PWPs that offer short-term employment* are applied primarily in the infrastructure sector as a response to labour market disruption. Their intention is to increase, temporarily, aggregate employment, while providing a basic income for consumption smoothing during the period of labour market disruption. These programmes tend to offer basic 'risk coping' or 'protective' social protection. Indonesia's *Padat Karya* programme is an example of this approach;

- *Programmes which promote the labour intensification of infrastructure expenditure* attempt to promote aggregate employment, and tend to focus less on the social protection impact of the additional employment offered, which is assumed to accrue to workers as a direct outcome of employment provided and indirectly as a result of the productive value of assets created. In these programmes social protection objectives are secondary to the creation of additional employment during the creation of assets. These programmes are almost exclusively initiated in the infrastructure sector, and would be exemplified by the ILO's international Employment Intensive Infrastructure Programme (EIIP). These programmes also confer basic short term 'risk coping' or 'protective' social protection benefits, which terminates at the point of programme completion;
- *Large-scale government employment programmes* are a response to chronic or sustained levels of elevated unemployment, and entail large increases in government expenditure on direct employment programmes, with the objective of promoting aggregate employment on a sustained basis. Employment may be created in any sector, and may be provided either directly by government, or indirectly through private sector employers or civil society. The US New Deal programmes of the 1930s typify this approach; and
- Finally, there is a *PWP* approach that focuses on *promoting the 'employability' of workers*, through the provision of skills formation and workplace experience. Such programmes are implemented when the key constraint to employment is lack of skills rather than lack of employment opportunities per se. These programmes have primarily been adopted in the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), at times of frictional unemployment, i.e. when the fundamental problem has been skills shortages in the labour pool. This type of programme assumes that sufficient numbers of jobs are available for the unemployed if they are adequately retrained and supported, and is associated with a political concern to encourage the unemployed to take up available work opportunities rather than to provide them with unemployment benefits. This approach is typified by the US set of 'Workfare' programmes, and the Irish Community Employment Programme (McCord, 2007: 13).

The Business Trust (2011: 9) also observes that in other cases, conceptually, public works programmes are designed to generate longer-term supplementary income for vulnerable people whose other incomes are very low and volatile, often by offering them work opportunities in periods of cyclical unemployment, e.g. during the slack agricultural season. The purpose of programmes in these cases is to relieve income poverty and to smooth intra-seasonal consumption, by providing insurance against the effects of job insecurity and temporary livelihood impairment. The best-known programme of this kind is the Employment Guarantee Scheme in the Indian State of Maharashtra, which has been in continuous operation since the 1970s.

The Business Trust further indicates that there is no simple basis for assessing the success of public works programmes because of the multiplicity of their objectives. In general, however, they are expected to:

- Bring effective assistance to their target populations, with little leakage to unintended beneficiaries;
- Complete necessary projects of real and lasting value to the local economy and community; and
- Be cost-effective in creating and maintaining assets and/or as channels for distributing targeted welfare benefits.

Assistance is either targeted through self-selection (when the individual decides to apply for work through a public works programme by registering or applying for work on a project), administrative selection (when an administrative process is used to select participants e.g. a local government council chooses who the beneficiaries will be from a community) or rationing where all unemployed individuals are allocated a number of days of work per year (ESAU, 2004).

However, McCord (2007: 35) argues that there have been employment benefits that different countries accrued from PWPs as demonstrated below:



**Table 2.2: A Comparative Assessment of the Scale of the PWP**

	Total number of PWP jobs/annum	Total number of person years/annum	Total Labour Force	Jobs as % labour force	Person years as % labour force	Programme cost as % GDP
<b>INDONESIA: PK (1998/99)</b>	1,481,481	181,818	92,000,000	1.6%	0.20%	0.20
<b>INDIA: NREGP** (2006/7)</b>	21,200,000	4,109,091	427,000,000	5.0%	0.96%	0.30
<b>INDIA: NREGP*** (2008/9 estimate)</b>				15%	3	1.0
<b>IRELAND: CEP (90s)</b>	41,000	n/a	1,400,000	2.9%	n/a	0.18
<b>ETHIOPIA: PSNP (2006/7)</b>	1,500,000	n/a	31,000,000	4.8%	n/a	2.00
<b>SENEGAL: AGETIP (2004)</b>	21,000	n/a	4,500,000	0.5%	n/a	0.80
<b>USA: NEW DEAL PROGRAMMES (1933-1940 average)</b>	n/a	n/a	53,000,000	3.4-8.9%	n/a	3.9
<b>JEFES: ARGENTINA*** *(2003)</b>	2,210,000	n/a	17,000,000	13.0%	n/a	0.90

*Source: McCord, 2007: 35*

In addition, Kostzer (2008) and Tcherneva and Wray (2005a) assert that one of the benefits with PWPs is that they can be speedily phased in, and they are cost effective. Argentina's experience with the Jefes programme in 2001, showed that national employment that are federally funded can be implemented within a short space of time and administered at the local level with the participation of Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs).

Tcherneva and Wray (2005b) further point out that unemployment is typically associated with the depreciation of skills, motivation and work habits. By employing those who might not have been employed and by offering training and education, PWPs can help to maintain or even appreciate human capital.

The Jefes programme included an option for participants to work or participate in education or training activities for 4-6 hours a day (no less than 20 hours a week) in exchange for the payment (Del Ninno et al, 2009: 8).

Generally, PWPs may include training as a core component in addition to the income transfer, to encourage workers to acquire more permanent employment or become self-employed. The additional requirements attached to the workers may include saving some of their wage earnings, learning technical skills and eventually obtain a credit at the going rate of interest, and begin an activity. However, cross-country experience is rather limited on this component (Del Ninno et al, 2009: 8).

A few programs have training components to direct women towards self-employment. In Bangladesh, the Rural Maintenance Program (RPM) requires the women participating in the program to attend income generating and skills program. In addition, they must save part of their wage on a regular basis. The strategy is to create new micro entrepreneurs with adequate skills training and seed capital from the forced savings. A similar program was started in 1999 in the central region of Malawi, the Central Region Infrastructure Maintenance Program (CRIMP), a Department of International Development-Cooperative for Assistance and Relief Everywhere (DFID-CARE) program which employed 1600 poor women in the maintenance of roads (Del Ninno et al, 2009: 8).

In Africa, PWPs have been implemented since the 1960s in parts of North Africa. Tunisia, Morocco and Algeria experimented with such programmes. In Tunisia, the Tunisian works programme, known as Worksites to Combat Underdevelopment was carried out with 80 per cent of the cost being borne by Tunisian authorities and the remaining 20 per cent in the form of food aid from the United States. The employment created was equivalent to an annual average of 20.7 days per head of Tunisia's labour force (Thwala, 2001: 3).

Morocco implemented a programme known as the National Promotion in 1961, with the main aim being to enhance opportunities for the rural unemployed in productive work; and slowing down the rural exodus and associated problems with rural populations in the development process. The importance of this programme was confirmed by its mention in the constitution of 7 December, and subsequently by the

creation in 1975 of the High Council of National Promotion Plan. According to one estimate, the programme provided employment for 85 000 workers per month during the peak season and increased the Growth National Product (GNP) by 3, 6 percent (Jara, 1971).

In Algeria, the publicly-sponsored works programme, known as Worksites for Full Employment (Chantiers de Plein Emploi (CPE)) began operating in 1962 as a relief operation. It soon acquired a strong development orientation to maximise employment in a project of economic interest, namely reforestation work to fight the severe erosion problem. (Jara, 1971). In 1965, the Peoples Worksites Reforestation (Chantiers Populaires de Reboisement (CPR)) was created as a statutory body attached to the Forestry Division of the Ministry of Agriculture and Agrarian Reform. Since then, the World Food Programme has provided assistance and the scope of projects have been increased to include land reclamation and other infrastructural works.

**Evaluation:** Despite their valuable contribution to employment-generation, many of these earlier experiments in employment-intensive public works in Africa suffered from one or more of the shortcomings noted below (Barker, 1986; Abedian and Standish, 1986; United Nations UNDP and ILO, 1987, Ligthelm and Van Niekerk, 1986, McCutcheon, 1990, 1994, 2001; McCutcheon and Taylor-Parkins, 2003; and Thwala, 2001: 5):

- The ad-hoc nature of schemes, lacking spatial focus and often without any links to national rural development and infrastructural planning systems;
- Makeshift administrative arrangements and failure to inject sufficient managerial and engineering skills and technical competence into project selection and execution, as well as choice of technology, resulting in poor project planning, programming and manpower management;
- Lack of balance between centralisation and effective involvement of local administrations and popular bodies in crucial programme decisions, planning and implementation;
- Failure to adjust programme operation and intensity to seasonal labour demand for agricultural operations;
- Lack of precision about target groups and programming on the basis of inadequate information about beneficiary groups;

- Lack of adequate and sustained political commitment and allocation of public funds for the programmes;
- Inadequate post-project maintenance arrangements; and inadequate emphasis on, and arrangements for, reporting cost-benefit studies and general performance evaluation.

### **2.3.3. South African literature review on EPWP**

The EPWP is characterised by short-term employment, labour intensification<sup>3</sup> of infrastructure provision, government employment programmes, and skills development. Furthermore, the work conditions during work experience are governed by the Code of Good Practise for Special Public Works Programmes (SPWP). In order to facilitate greater employability on the EPWP, the employers may set rates of pay locally at self-targeting, to avoid attracting workers away from more permanent employment. The employers' obligation to UIF payments is also reduced. In addition, employers make task-based payments for labour intensive works (DPW Presentation, 2004: 15).

With regard to skills development, the EPWP provides opportunities beyond the skills acquired on the job to prepare participants for longer-term employment, self-employment or further education and training. For example, youth employed as manual labourers in a labour intensive road projects, may be offered training in unrelated building skill such as bricklaying, if there is a demand for such skills in the labour market. The number of average training days varies from 10 days in the environmental sector to 30 days for those participating in the social activities. As far as possible, all training must result in some type of accreditation certificate (Del Ninno, 2009: 8).

However, McCord et al (2007: 5) argues that the skills transferred during participants' brief period of EPWP employment are not consistent with the skills required in the economy, since the limited period of training included in most EPWP

---

<sup>3</sup> Bentall (1999:219) defines labour intensive as an 'approach where labour is the dominant resource for carrying out works, and where the share of the total project cost spent on labour is high (typically 25 – 60%)'.

*Labour intensification* in the construction sector offers an opportunity to generate employment without additional demands on the fiscus, by 'fundamentally changing the way in which publicly funded infrastructure is built so that employment and skills transfer are maximised for the unemployed' (McCutcheon, 1995, p.23).

employment opportunities, prohibits the acquisition of the artisanal and other skills in short supply. For these reasons the employment impact of the EPWP training component is likely to be limited, resulting primarily in substitution rather than significant increases in aggregate employment.

Hemson (2008: 1) argues that based on his analysis, it is clear that the EPWP succeeded in phase 1 by:

- Reaching the target of 1 million work opportunities;
- The targeted proportion of work opportunities for women and youth (although not for the disabled) has been reached; and
- In getting departments to take EPWP seriously by allocating funding to Public Works.

However, the EPWP falls short in five other important ways:

- *Decent work*: minimum standards for length of a job are not being reached;
- *Training*: only 19% of training targeted has been met;
- *Actual spending*: only 59% of the funds allocated over 3 years have been spent;
- *Wages*: overheads and other costs are rising while wages are static; and
- *Earnings*: earnings per job are declining over time (Hemson, 2008: 2).

Betcherman et al (2004:13) argues that in evaluating the impact of the EPWP the major difficulty facing the analyst is that of attempting to determine the counterfactual .i.e. to answer the question of what would have happened if the participant had not taken part in a programme (to the participant and in the economy more generally). The central point of this argument is that real net effects of programmes cannot be established by tracking participants' post-programme experience.

Contrary to Betcherman et al, McCord (2004: 54-59) found that there was a real measurable impact on the participants of two EPWP programmes undertaken in both KwaZulu-Natal (Zibambele), and Limpopo (Gundo Lashu programme). The main findings in her comparative study between the two EPWP programmes are that:

### *Use of Income*

- 65% of KZN households reported that their material assets had improved (e.g. clothing, cooking utensils, furniture), compared to 27% in Limpopo; and
- 64% of KZN households reported an improved financial situation since starting to work on PWP, compared to 26% in Limpopo.

### *Nutritional Impact*

- KwaZulu-Natal households frequently reducing the size of children's meals due to lack of money fell from 53% to 1%;
- The figures for Limpopo are 14% and 7% respectively;
- The KZN programme had significant positive impact on the nutritional status of participating households;
- The impact of the Limpopo programme was marginal, starting from a much lower base (lower levels of nutritional poverty);

### *Educational Impact*

- Regular school participation of children in KZN households rose from 66% to 86%;
- The main reason children were out of school previously was hunger and lack of money to pay school fees;
- Regular school participation of children in Gundo Lashu households rose from 83% to 92%; and
- The impact of the Limpopo programme was marginal, starting from a much higher base.

### *Psychosocial Impact*

- Participation in community activities without shame;
- Clothing, feeding children; and
- Performance of burial rites.

In summary, McCord (2004:61) found that neither programme significantly reduced headcount poverty. Training, skills transfer and experience were not sufficient to impact on labour market performance. The short-term nature of the EPWP does not permit the accumulation of surplus for investment in income earning activity. In general, impacts were less significant in Limpopo and were not expected to have a sustained impact.

The Bushbuckridge municipality's EPWP study revealed that there was economic and social impact on the participants. From the economic perspective, the EPWP has enabled the participants to earn an income and being able to fulfil the basic needs such as food, shelter and school fees for the kids. In addition, the researcher also observed that the income earned enabled participants to buy televisions and radios. Furthermore, the level of social capital in the communities where the EPWP projects are located had improved. Social networks, norms and mutual trust among the community members had improved because of the pro EPWP project beneficiaries, who were receiving wages which enabled them to join community investment clubs (STOKVELS) and burial clubs to help one another pay for funerals of the dead (Mothapo, 2011: 53).

In the eThekweni municipality's Vukuphile EPWP contractor learnership programme, Mayombe (2009: 82) found out that of those who were unemployed (47%) and expecting to get jobs after the eThekweni Vukuphile 1 learnership programme, 17.6% (3 out of 17) of them owned construction companies able to tender. Another 11.8% (2 out of 17) were immediately employed; one 5.9% was employed after 3 months and another one (5.9%) was employed after 5 months. The remaining 5.9% (one out of 17) was finally employed after a year. In general, in this learnership programme, 87.5% of the respondents previously unemployed had found employment after 6 months.

Within the Zululand District Municipality it was found that the beneficiaries in one (Phongola) of the five local municipalities .i.e. Dumbe, Ulundi, Abaqulusi, Nongoma, and Phongola in the district, had sustainable EPWP employment (1 year or longer). This represented only 9.42% of the total beneficiaries initially employed in the EPWP projects. 90.58% of the beneficiaries had worked on the EPWP projects for an average period of 6 months, which meant that they were temporary jobs and not

sustainable. With regard to training of beneficiaries and skills gained, only 46.97% respondents received training and 53.04% did not receive training. This low rate of training amongst respondents may have the effect that the jobs that created were not sustainable and they were unable to have an exit strategy from the Expanded Public Works Programme. One of the possible exit strategies would be for the workers to use the skills gained during training to get permanent employment or open their own businesses (Khanyile, 2008: 80-86).

Magebula study of the Madibeng<sup>4</sup> (2006: 124) local municipality's water reticulation EPWP projects (installation of pipes, site clearance and earthworks), revealed that women labourers displayed more interest in the work than the men. They expressed a lot of excitement over the opportunity to work and they were intrigued by performing work that is traditionally reserved for men.

With regard to the effectiveness of the EPWPs in enhancing employability once exiting the programme, Moyo (2013: 52) conducted a study in the North West Province (Modimola Village) which revealed that:

- Once the participants exited the EPWP projects they were employed on, the employment opportunities in implementation areas disappeared. However, this finding should be viewed within the nature and design of the EPWP projects .i.e. EPWPs are an emergency and a poverty-alleviation programme not meant to provide long-term employment opportunities to the unskilled poor; and
- While the training provided in the Modimola Integrated EPWPs was useful to beneficiaries, it did not enhance their employability once they exited the projects.

In general, McCord (2004: 65) proposes the following key design features for EPWP to have the desired outcomes:

- Consider maintenance, or employment on multiple construction programmes for increased impact;
- Target poorest if the programme wants impact on poverty;

---

<sup>4</sup> Local municipality falling within the Bojanala district of the North West province



- Target youth if the programme wants impact on labour market performance – if training is linked with employment potential;
- Coordinate with other developmental initiatives to promote savings, micro-enterprise and informal employment; and
- Longer-term PWP employment offers greater chance of sustained poverty reduction.

#### **2.3.4. South Africa as a Developmental State**

Padayachee (as cited in Mapungubwe, 2011:1), argues that in ‘South Africa, precisely because of the pedestrian nature of our economic growth, and the sluggish progress in reducing poverty and inequality, that the concept of a developmental state has captured the imagination of decision makers across the various sectors of society’.

Consequently, in its 52<sup>nd</sup> National Conference in Polokwane, the African National Congress (ANC) pledged to build the developmental state that will play a central and strategic role by ‘directly investing in underdeveloped areas and directing private sector investment’, and will play a critical role in addressing the problems of ‘high unemployment, poverty and inequality’ (ANC, 2007b: 19), as well as ‘accelerate economic growth’ and address the ‘skewed patterns of ownership and production’ (2007b:17).

The ANC’s conference resolutions link the imperatives for economic growth with addressing the social challenges. Accordingly the resolutions state that ‘Whilst acting effectively to promote growth, efficiency and productivity it (the developmental state) must be equally effective in addressing the social conditions of the masses of our people and realising economic progress for the poor’ (ANC, 2007b: 18), including through the creation for decent work. The resolutions recognise that a democratic developmental state in South Africa has to be undergirded by the principles of democratic governance (Edigheji, 2010: 2-3).

In achieving the ideals of a developmental state, Gumede (2009:4) argues that the ‘East Asian developmental states shared some common approaches. These states he points out that they have ‘major preoccupation to ensure sustained economic growth and development on the back of high rates of accumulation, industrialisation

and structural change'. The development state directly and actively influenced the direction, pace and goals of development, rather than leaving it to uncoordinated market forces or an 'invisible hand' to allocate resources in the economy.

Gumede (2011: 2) further argues that South Africa is currently not a developmental state, but a developmental state in the making. He indicates that South Africa has not been a very effective state, owing to its technical and implementation state capacity. Also, the state has only recently adopted long term development planning, whereas its various planning instruments had in the past focused on medium term planning.

Van Dijk and Croucamp (2007: 666) point out that perhaps the greatest impediment to the implementation of a developmental state in South Africa, is the robust societal urge (also embodied in legislation and entrenched in the Constitution, 1996) of South Africa's local communities to participate and determine policy and policy outcomes. This they say is a reflection on the social as well as institutional memory (the connective tissue of the continued resistance), which, perhaps, somewhat ironically, was conceived in the liberationist political realm.

The South African Catholics Bishops (2007) observes that South Africa already has certain characteristics of the developmental state, but these need to be broadened: government needs to expand the provision of social grants to those who are unable to support themselves and their dependents; it should work in collaboration with the private sector to create jobs; there is a need to expand further the public works programme, and to provide free basic education, free under-five healthcare, free water and a universal basic electricity supply.

This view is further supported by Gumede (2011: 28) in his assertion that for South Africa to be a fully-fledged developmental state it has to have the capacities and systems that will ensure that human development is further improved.

#### **2.4. Conclusion**

Based on the review above, it is clear that the literature does not contain sufficient information on how the EPWP has been implemented 'effectively' in metropolitan municipalities. However, there are several cases of the EPWP implementation in district and local municipalities. This limitation or gap in the literature gives an

opportunity for this study to investigate how the EPWP is implemented in a metropolitan municipality, and contribute towards literature by proposing an effective implementation approach. This also provides an opportunity to contribute towards more understanding on the subject, particularly in relation to metropolitan municipalities.

Furthermore, it is clear from the literature that the EPWP projects do have socio-economic impact on the beneficiaries. However, in most cases the impact is short-term and thereby compromising sustained accumulation of surplus of investment in income earning activity. Gender is also key in the EPWP projects. Women tend to show more enthusiasm at the opportunity of being employed in traditionally male-dominated labour intensive EPWP projects. Therefore, the EPWP programme needs to be designed in a way that places sustainability at the core of its operations and at the same time targeting mainly youth and women beneficiaries, for impact purpose.

In addition, for South Africa, it is prudent that given the chronic unemployment and inequality we learn how other countries such as the East Asian countries have used the developmental state model in dealing with their socio-economic challenges. The developmental state debate is of importance as this study seeks to propose a model that will assist in dealing effectively with chronic unemployment through the EPWP, within an organ of state i.e. CTMM.

## **CHAPTER 3: EPWP IMPLEMENTATION IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY**

### **3.1. Introduction**

This chapter gives background to the CTMM in relation to the area, population, economic activity and its regional composition. The CTMM EPWP policy, which guides the implementation approach, is discussed. The CTMM's Indigent policy is also discussed to assess the adherence thereof. In addition, the current EPWP performance targets and achievements are also outlined. General challenges which inhibit optimal performance in achieving the EPWP targets are summarised. Most importantly, the chapter makes document review of the EPWP within the City of Johannesburg (CJMM). Thereafter, the similarities and differences/gaps between the CTMM and CJMM are identified and discussed.

### **3.2. Background to the City of Tshwane**

As indicated in the previous chapter, the CTMM is a Category A municipality. The CTMM is the largest municipality in the country and the third largest in the world in terms of land mass. The available land in the city provides opportunities for certain sectors of the economy such as agriculture to thrive. However, the vastness of the city also presents challenges such as sprawl which leads to inefficient infrastructure provision which could have an impact on the provision of services to the citizens (CTMM, 2013: 9)

With regard to the population size, the CTMM has a population of approximately 2, 9 million people which translates to 911 536 households according to the 2011 census. This translates to 3.1% population growth per annum for the period between 2001 and 2011. The majority of the population of the city is made up of young people aged between 30 and 39 years with the majority of the population falling within the working age group (CTMM, 2013: 10).

The CTMM's 2, 9 million people are located within the city's seven regions. In terms of population per region, the Census 2011 recorded that Region 1 has the highest population followed by Region 6 and 3 respectively. Region 7 and Region 5 have the lowest population as shown in the diagram below.

**Figure 3.1: CTMM Regional Breakdown**



*Source: CTMM, 2013: 10*

The economic activity within the CTMM can be summarised as follows:

- a) **Region 1** is located on the north western part of the city. The region is characterized by relatively low levels of education, high unemployment, very low incomes and poor living standards. In addition to this, the proximity of Limpopo to the North-west means that the region is a recipient of migrant labourers thus making the region a “transitional zone” for the first wave of urbanization. Little economic activity can be found in the region;
- b) **Region 2** is in the northern part of the city. Its spatial form is a representation of historic land use and settlement policies which hinders on development in some instances. Some of the land in the region is under tribal authority management. The infrastructure landscape of the region varies with the northern parts of the region lacking infrastructure to support development;
- c) **Region 3** - The inner city core is located in this region and the Central Business District (CBD) is the largest job opportunity zone in the City of Tshwane (CTMM) however, decentralisation of nodes continues to cause an exodus of commercial activity to areas outside the CBD and thus leaving the city susceptible to urban decay. The region is generally well provided for in

terms of service infrastructure however, investment in terms of bulk infrastructure needs to be provided to ensure security of service.

- d) **Region 4** - The region is strategically located along the border of Johannesburg and has progressively developed further towards the south. Although the region is well serviced regarding infrastructure, the existing infrastructure requires upgrading and maintenance to meet the current and future needs of the region e.g. medium density residential developments;
- e) **Region 5** is in the north eastern parts of the city and has two towns i.e. Rayton and Cullinan. The region is largely rural in character with a concentration tourism and agricultural activity found in the area. Currently, significant service backlogs exist in the region and the provision of infrastructure and services should take into consideration the character of the region;
- f) **Region 6** is a hub for retail and commercial activity in the city. The region's character is divided into the northern part, which is less developed with fewer economic opportunities compared to the southern parts of the region, which continues to develop at a rapid pace, attraction high-end retail and offices to the area. The region is well serviced in terms of municipal infrastructure however the current growth in the region means that upgrades and maintenance of the infrastructure may be required; and
- g) **Region 7** forms the eastern most part of the city and is comparable in size to region 5. Region 7 consists of a large rural component and includes areas such as Bronkhorstpruit and Ekandustia Industrial area. The region is the gateway to Gauteng from Mpumalanga via the Maputo corridor (CTMM, 2013: 65).

The CTMM situational analysis with specific reference to population and economic activity can be summarised as follows:

**Table 3.1: CTMM Population and Economic Activity**

	2001	2010	2011
<b>Demographics</b>			
Population	2 142 322		2 921 488
Households	606 025		911 536
Average Household Size	3.3		3.0
Gender male vs. female (ratio)	1:098		1:0.99
<b>Economy and Employment</b>			
Unemployment	31,6	24,2	-
Gini coefficient	0.615	0.607	-
Human Development Index	0.703	0.669	-
<b>Access to Basic Services</b>			
Piped water inside dwelling (%)	46.9		64.2
Flush toilet connected to sewerage (%)	68.4		76.6
Refuse Removal (%)	75.2		80.7
Electricity for lighting (%)	79.2		88.6

*Source: CTMM, 2013:17*

### **3.3. EPWP implementation process**

#### **3.3.1. EPWP policy/guideline/plan**

During the 2<sup>nd</sup> EPWP municipal summit, several resolutions were made by the provincial government and municipalities, led by the DPW. The summit resolved that:

- a) Progress has been made in the development of municipal EPWP policy endorsed by Councils at local, district and metro level – and resolved that all municipalities will develop and endorse policy on EPWP by June 2012;
- b) Municipalities will ensure that their Integrated Development Plans (IDP) prioritize the EPWP approach and methodology in their projects in order to optimize the creation of work opportunities;
- c) Municipalities will optimize their budgets to deliver on the EPWP across all sectors, and will use labour intensive methods in the delivery of projects in order to promote the creation of work opportunities;
- d) The Summit noted the progress made by three provinces in establishing District forums, and encouraged all other provinces to establish District Forums;

- e) From the side of the Department of Public Works, the Summit said we should provide intensified, focused Technical Support across all EPWP sectors to optimize the implementation of EPWP;
- f) The Summit supported the review of the integrated incentive models. This is clear: we don't want to put roadblocks and speed humps in the way of job creation;
- g) There needs to be strengthened relationships between, Non Profit Organizations (NPOs) and municipalities to enhance implementation of the Non-State Sector;
- h) Municipalities undertook to intensify reporting on work opportunities created on projects implemented. This is important because it makes public bodies accountable, it helps us to monitor and evaluate what is going on – and ultimately to improve delivery; and
- i) At a very practical level, the DPW will continue to develop and make available implementation manuals on EPWP (DPW, 2011: 2).

All of the above-mentioned resolutions are necessary to ensure synergy, coordination, and a seamless approach in the implementation of the EPWP in municipalities. However, key to the adherence of the indicated resolutions is a need to develop an EPWP policy that would guide municipalities in the execution of this important mandate. Fox and Meyer (1995:107) define policy as “authoritative statements made by legitimate public institutions about the way in which they propose to deal with policy problems.” Of importance is the fact that policy can never be static. It should always relate to current issues in society (for example, the continuous process of change, transformation and globalization which are taking place in South Africa since 1994). It should constantly be adapted to match the impact of environmental variables and influencing factors.

At the national level, the DPW has developed the EPWP municipal policy and implementation framework. The main objective of the policy framework is to guide municipalities in the implementation of the EPWP. The policy further goes on to recognize specific challenges that are similar across public bodies implementing the EPWP .i.e. Commitment of political and administrative leadership; Capacity in terms of designing projects labour-intensively; Capacity in terms of reporting;



Dedicated coordination capacity within the municipality; Low incentive draw-down; and Achievement of longer duration of work opportunities and FTE targets (DPW, 2012: 7).

The CTMM states that for the 'EPWP to be effective the Programme needs to be incorporated in all activities of the Municipality. This will require that every project as per the IDP will promote EPWP principles and re-structure project activities to facilitate and create greater employment opportunities per unit of expenditure, where possible' (CTMM, 2012: 7).

The EPWP policy is therefore prepared for the entire CTMM with the intention to close the identified gaps and challenges on the implementation of EPWP, strengthen the existing interventions and introduce new ones. These challenges include:

- Capacity in terms of designing projects labour-intensively;
- Institutionalization of EPWP within CTMM;
- Capacity in terms of reporting;
- Dedicated coordination capacity within the Municipality; and
- Achievement of longer duration of work opportunities targets (CTMM, 2012: 7).

In dealing with the identified challenges, the CTMM EPWP policy states its objectives as to address three main elements:

- *Mainstreaming the implementation of the EPWP by:*
  - Adopting the EPWP as an approved delivery strategy for project implementation by including EPWP guidelines and principles;
  - Implementing the Programme in all EPWP sectors;
  - Addressing under reporting on the EPWP;
  - Developing skills within communities through the provision of training, with the emphasis on accredited programmes;
  - Entrenching the EPWP methodology to all IDP projects, where applicable; and
  - Re-engineering the planning, designing and implementing of projects in line with EPWP (CTMM, 2012: 8)

- *Institutionalising the Programme by:*
  - Guiding on the EPWP Governance Structures within the Municipality;
  - Clarifying the role of each Department in terms of EPWP;
  - Informing all Departments within CTMM on how their functions should contribute towards achieving the EPWP objectives; and
  - Securing ownership from all Departments to lead on the implementation of the EPWP, with the support from the Department of Economic Development within the Municipality (CTMM, 2012: 8).
- *Guiding the implementation of the Programme by:*
  - Providing guidance on employment conditions, skills development and enterprise development;
  - Promoting the adaptation of supply chain and procurement policies in line with EPWP;
  - Maximising the percentage of the annual total budget spent and retained within local communities through employing and capacitating local labour and small businesses; and
  - Defining key performance indicators to monitor, evaluate and report all EPWP initiatives (CTMM, 2012: 9).

Amongst other important elements, the CTMM EPWP policy indicates that the municipality will adhere to the phase 2 targets .i.e. 55% women, 30% youth and 2% of persons with disability (CTMM, 2012: 25). This policy intention by the municipality should be encouraged. In ensuring that these plans become a reality, the CTMM aims to use sound social facilitation process, and ensure that the municipality beneficiaries' recruitment is supported by the Provincial Coordinating Department and/or Sector Lead Department in the Province (CTMM, 2012).

Most importantly, with regard to the training of beneficiaries the CTMM indicates that training of beneficiaries will be provided through the project budget or through the National Skills Fund (NSF) from the Department of Higher Education and Training in partnership with the National Department of Public Works. Workers will be paid a daily allowance/stipend by the contractor (included in the project cost) whilst attending training. However, without a training plan accompanied by budget

commitments from departments within the CTMM, the municipality may not sufficiently achieve their set training objective (CTMM, 2012).

The DPW (2008: 8) EPWP training manual warns that 'without training the impact of the programme on the lives of beneficiaries will be limited, as will the long term contribution to meeting the country's skills shortages. All EPWP projects must therefore include training of beneficiaries, as required by the Code of Good Practice for Employment under SPWP. Most of the activities in the EPWP are done on a project basis and the training for beneficiaries is therefore directly related to the skills needs of the projects on which people are employed. However, it is also intended that workers exiting from EPWP work opportunities are more marketable in the labour market than when they entered the work opportunity'.

**Evaluation:** The CTMM EPWP policy has all the elements of an effective policy .i.e. it is not static (reviewed annually), has set objectives, aims to socially and economically influence beneficiaries. However, the effectiveness of the policy will ultimately be determined by meeting the DPW quotas for targeted beneficiaries (55% women, 40% youth, 2% persons with disabilities). In the previous year (2011/12) the CTMM has fairly been adhering to the DPW phase 1 target with regard to women and youth, with the exception of persons with disabilities.

The DPW required that 2% of persons with disabilities should form part of the total EPWP opportunities created in phase 1. The CTMM created a total of 19 001 opportunities of which only 7 went to persons with disabilities. This accounts for 0,03%. One of the obvious difficulties is given the labour intensive nature of most of the EPWP projects (such as digging of a trench) these tasks require able-bodied individuals, as they are physically demanding. This therefore requires the CTMM to be creative in ensuring that certain tasks within EPWP projects are prioritised for persons with disabilities. EPWP projects funded from operational budget such as the administration of housing allocations is one example of a project that is not necessarily physically demanding.

Lastly, the effectiveness of the EPWP CTMM policy will also be determined against the objectives that the EPWP has to fulfil .i.e. Draw significant numbers of the unemployed into productive work to enable them to earn an income; Provide

unemployed people with education and skills; Make an effort to assist beneficiaries of the EPWP to either set up their own business/ service or become employed once they exit the programme; Utilise public sector budgets to alleviate unemployment; and to create social and economic infrastructure and provide social services as a means of meeting basic needs.

### **3.3.2. EPWP & Indigent Policy**

Section 27 of the South African Constitution Act, 1996 (Act 108 of 1996) indicates:

1. Everyone has a right to access to-
  - Sufficient food and water; and
  - Social security, including if they are unable to support themselves and their dependants, appropriate social assistance
2. The state must take reasonable legislative and other measures, within its available resources, to achieve the progressive realization of these rights (Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996: 8).

The Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs' (COGTA) National Framework for Municipal Indigent Policies broadly defines Indigent as anyone who does not have access to the following services:

- Sufficient water;
- Basic sanitation;
- Refuse removal in denser settlements;
- Environmental health;
- Basic energy;
- Health care;
- Housing; and
- Food and clothing (COGTA, 2012: 17).

From the municipal perspective COGTA's National Framework for Municipal Indigent Policies defines the municipal role in providing for indigents as follows:

**Table 3.2: COGTA's National Framework for Municipal Indigent Policies**

<b>Goods or service</b>	<b>Role of local government</b>
Sufficient water	Local government responsibility
Basic sanitation	Local government responsibility
Refuse removal	This is a local government responsibility and becomes increasingly important as settlement densities increase
Environmental health	This falls under the function 'municipal health' which is a local government responsibility but the importance of environmental health from the point of view of indigents has been considerably watered down through the definitions applied by the National Department of Health which imply that environmental health is primarily a regulatory function
Basic energy	The Constitution does not deal with energy explicitly but electricity reticulation is identified as a municipal function
Health care	This is now a provincial responsibility as the definition of municipal health has been taken to exclude primary health care
Housing	Housing is a provincial responsibility. However, local government has a role to play in planning, land development and implementing projects. From an indigent point of view, access to land for housing, with secure tenure, is a critically important matter. Further, essential services such as water supply and sanitation are often delivered as part of a housing package. Therefore, considerable attention is placed on housing and land in this policy
Food & clothing	Not the responsibility of local government. As noted above this is dealt with through welfare grants distributed at national scale

*Source: COGTA, 2012:14*

The CTMM defines an Indigent Household 'as any household of which the members are South African citizens/permanent resident and municipal tenants as defined in the policy that due to a number of economic and social factors are unable to pay for municipal services' (CTMM, 2012; 14).

The CTMM EPWP policy states that the EPWP beneficiaries must be:

- South African citizens with a valid bar-coded Identity Document;
- Residents of designated area where project is being implemented;
- Persons from indigent households; and
- Households with no income and priority given to one individual per household (CTMM, 2012: 25).

By implication persons from indigent households are beneficiaries of the EPWP. It should be noted that the CTMM Indigent Policy places emphasis on registered households, as it states its purpose as 'to ensure that registered indigent households have access to a basic of municipal services'. The policy further indicates that for households to be registered as indigents they should meet all of the following criteria:

- a) The gross monthly income of all the members of the household does not exceed the joint amount of two state old age pensions excluding child support grant and foster care grant;
- b) The applicant as well as any other members of the household does not own other fixed property than the one in which they reside;
- c) The person/applicant applying on behalf of a household must be eighteen (18) years or older, except if the child is appointed executorship by a court of law;
- d) The person/applicant applying on behalf of a household must reside at that property except when a guardian applies on behalf of a child headed household;
- e) The person/applicant should be the registered owner, municipal tenant or an occupant of the North West Housing Corporation or CTMM property as defined in this policy except when a guardian applies on behalf of a child headed household;
- f) The person/applicant must be a South African citizen;
- g) A child from a child headed household who is eighteen (18) years and older may apply to have the household registered as indigent ; and
- h) The person/applicant applying must have a services account with the City of Tshwane (CTMM, 2012: 17).

The above mentioned criteria operates within the policy directive of the CTMM which indicates that at least 50% of all the participants in the EPWP programme should be drawn from the indigent register. Unfortunately, as indicated earlier the CTMM has been unable to meet this mandate in previous years of implementing the programme. In the financial year 2009/10 4 000 EPWP job opportunities were created, and less than 1900 indigents were participants. Furthermore, in the financial year 2010/11 9 000 EPWP job opportunities were created of which 604 opportunities were for persons drawn from the indigent register (CTMM, 2011).

Even further, there are several issues that complicate the attainment of the 50% directive based on the above mentioned indigent register criteria and other factors:

- a) The Indigent Policy Management (IPM) division of the CTMM indicated that in recruiting the indigents for the EPWP Vat Alles (environmental cleaning programme) there were challenges as some target areas such as Rayton, Bronkhortspruit, and Sunnyside as 'these areas have few or no registered indigents'. This fact implies that persons who qualify to be indigents may not be registered in the CTMM indigent register (CTMM, 2012: 1).
- b) In Region 2 areas such as Suurman, Majaneng, Mashemong, and Dilopye are earmarked to be formalized and proclaimed and also have very few to no registered indigents in the area' (CTMM, 2012: 1).
- c) 'Areas such as Hebron and previously fell outside off the City of Tshwane' (CTMM, 2012: 1).
- d) The CTMM water and sanitation department indicated the location in which the projects take place as one of the challenge .i.e. 'Most of our capital projects are located in the northern parts of Tshwane Region 2, which most of it is not formalised and these people do not have utility accounts which is a requirement to register as an indigent. In actual fact the people that are employed in these projects are indigents and are not in the indigent register. If you consider that a project located in the Marokolong, Ramotse and Portion 9 area would primarily have a labour force from the areas mentioned and ward councillors together with the appointed Community Liaison Officer (CLO) would be involved in the provision of lists with beneficiaries that are indigents

and these people would then be considered for employment' (CTMM, 2012: 1).

- e) 'Community Unrest: There were cases where Community Liaison Officers were threatened with violence because communities feel that everyone must be given the same opportunities of employment in the projects. These threats are not only directed to the CLO and also people would often come to site and threaten to stop projects' (CTMM, 2012: 1).
- f) The CTMM roads and transport department asserts that within a family, 'only the home owner is registered as an indigent which exclude the rest of the family members' (CTMM, 2012: 1).
- g) The CTMM housing department indicates that 'people appointed are from the relevant informal settlement where services are rendered, therefore they cannot use the indigent list as the community does not allow people to come from the outside' (CTMM, 2011: 1).

**Evaluation:** Clearly, the CTMM has been unable to adhere to the directive that indicates that 50% of all EPWP beneficiaries recruited should be sourced from the indigent register. As indicated above, one of the main inhibiting factor relates to the lack of the CTMM capacity to register all persons qualifying as indigents especially those residing in informal areas. On the other hand, the community members also have a responsibility to come forward and be registered. In this regard, the CTMM has to ensure that there is information dissemination to areas hardest hit with high unemployment rates. The fact that a person to be registered as an indigent should be a home owner also excludes other members of the family who may qualify as indigents albeit policies have limited objectives.

Generally, the criteria contained in this indigent policy does not facilitate the employment and registration of indigents, rather it places several unnecessary limitations that may discourage adherence by councillors, and contractors in employing potential EPWP participants. These then 'allows' councillors, and contractors to seek other ways of employing individuals into the EPWP projects. For instance councillors may propose lists of community members who are indigents but do not qualify to be registered as per the indigent registration policy's stringent criteria. Contractors may bring their own labourers from other areas to work in their



projects, of which may conflict with the employment of community members in which the projects take place.

Some of the immediate solutions indicated by the CTMM in meeting the 50% directive include the recruitment from neighboring areas (within each of the seven Regions) where indigent households reside. In addition, the ward councilor and the local community may provide lists of unemployed residents from the affected areas (CTMM, 2012: 1).

The following section 3.3.3 would provide a detailed description on the implementation of the EPWP within the City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality (CJMM). The CJMM's approach in implementing the EPWP will be compared with that of the CTMM. The differences in the EPWP approaches between both municipalities will also be highlighted. The EPWP approach of the CJMM was chosen over that of other metropolitan municipalities for the following reasons. Firstly, the CJMM surpassed its phase 1 EPWP target. Secondly, the CJMM is located within the Gauteng province. Lastly, the CJMM has an almost similar EPWP implementation approach in comparison to that of the CTMM. The CJMM EPWP approach will assist in identifying gaps within that of the CTMM, and the findings will contribute towards the overall recommendations in this study.

### **3.3.3. City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality (CJMM) EPWP: Similarities and or Differences with the CTMM EPWP**

“In the first phase of the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) that ended in 2009, the city created 153 835 work opportunities, exceeding the 150 000 target it had set. EPWP is a priority for the city, and all departments and Municipal-Owned Entities are required to focus on projects that can deliver more opportunities for employment” (City Press, 2011:1).

The first phase achievement was through the adoption of the EPWP policy in 2004, which was implemented from 2005 onwards. The policy is applied across all city entities, companies and departments. It is driven by specially appointed EPWP champions in each sector, and all sectors are required to target the unskilled and unemployed through labour intensive projects (CJMM, 2008: 3).

The main objectives of the CJMM policy are described as follows:

- To create short term jobs for the unemployed within local communities through inter alia the implementation of labor-intensive infrastructure projects;
- To develop skills within communities through on-the-job and/or accredited training of workers and thereby developing sustainable capacity within communities;
- To capacitate SMME's and emerging contractors within local communities by facilitating the transfer of sustainable technical, managerial and financial skills through an appropriate Learnership Programme; and
- To maximise the percentage of the CJMM's annual total budget spent and retained within local communities by promoting the procurement of goods and services from local manufacturers, suppliers and service providers (CJMM, 2004: 1).

In short, the focus of the EPWP policy is to alleviate poverty by utilising public sector budgets to draw significant numbers of the unemployed into productive work whilst enabling these workers to gain skills. The policy includes the operations of all the City of Johannesburg's Municipal Owned Entities (MOEs). In ensuring that the EPWP policy adopted lives up to the set objectives, CJMM established a dedicated unit to coordinate, monitor and evaluate progress in the implementation of EPWP projects. The unit is located in the department of economic development. An EPWP steering committee has been established which is responsible for the overall EPWP coordination within the city. The steering committee is chaired by the executive director of economic development and representatives from all the city departments and MOEs attend monthly meetings (CJMM, 2004: 1).

In addition, each department and MOE has appointed a dedicated EPWP champion to assist the steering committee in selecting suitable projects for inclusion in the city's EPWP and learnership programmes. The champions are responsible for ensuring that the planning, design and contract administration of labour-intensive work is carried out by consultants who have completed the necessary skills training. Lastly the champions must monitor and report on the implementation of EPWP projects (CJMM, 2004: 1).

The CJMM department of economic development believes that job creation, training and development go hand in hand. In the current EPWP phase, the CJMM is focusing on the creation of learnerships, skills development and programmes in recognition of prior learning. As a result, as part of its EPWP the CJMM launched the Job Skills Development Placement Programme. The programme targeted unemployed matriculants, graduates and ex-convicts. The participants will gain skills and training in plumbing, bricklaying, mining, information and communications technology, the arts, manufacturing and logistics (CJMM, 2004: 1).

One of the important elements within the CJMM EPWP implementation model is the identification and creation of flagship projects that will drive the EPWP. The projects are:

- a) **Operation Gcin'amanzi** – the main aim of the project was to upgrade dilapidated infrastructure water infrastructure;
- b) **I-Jozi Ihlomile** – an HIV/Aids awareness programme that encourages community involvement. Through the campaign, volunteers – especially women and young school leavers – are trained to visit homes, informal settlements and hostels to provide educational information about testing and health support services;
- c) **Lufhereng** – the project was conceived by It was conceived and initiated by the City of Johannesburg and the Gauteng department of local government and housing as a large scale, mixed income, mixed type and mixed tenure housing development. Once complete, it is expected to yield 24 000 houses, with schools, clinics, sports fields and recreational amenities making up a sustainable community; and
- d) **Orlando Ekhaya** – It will transform Orlando Power Station and its cooling towers into a sought-after destination for investment, business and tourism. Costing more than R1-billion, the development is expected to be a captivating mix of retail, office, residential, entertainment and recreation spaces (CJMM, 2004: 4).

Some of the key success factors indicated as having enabled the CJMM towards achieving their EPWP programme targets include:

- a) EPWP fitted in with the rest of the programmes for the City of Johannesburg, rather than being seen as a stand-alone project;
- b) The target that had been set by the City of Johannesburg was 150 000 jobs, and this was an internal target, not one agreed upon with DPW;
- c) Reports were submitted monthly to the municipal manager. EPWP had been turned into a “cultural practice” at the City of Johannesburg;
- d) There was no specific budget allocation; instead, every capital budget that was approved by Council was treated as an EPWP project; and
- e) There was strong political will, at mayoral level, for the implementation of EPWP (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2011: 4).

However, like the CTMM the CJMM had one main challenge in the implementation of the EPWP .i.e. ‘The only challenge that could be mentioned was that it was difficult to create opportunities for people with disabilities’ (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2011: 4).

One of the key observations between the CTMM and the CJMM is the fact that the CJMM EPWP policy was finalised in 2004 whereas the CTMM started the process of developing an EPWP policy and implementation framework by 2009. The CTMM only had a draft EPWP policy in 2012. In its current format the CTMM EPWP policy has not been approved by the council. Clearly, the CTMM is moving slowly in the process of approving the EPWP policy and enforcement thereof. This may lead to inconsistent implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM by different stakeholders.

Although the CTMM like the CJMM sets its own annual and term targets, the CTMM is unable to meet its own internal targets and sets moderate targets with no substantial performance between the various financial years. For instance, a target of 38 000 was set for the financial year 2010/11 but only achieved 19 001. In the financial year 2012/13 the CTMM set a target of 20 000 and achieved 20 385. The target is moderate considering that the term target for the CTMM is 375 000, and the over 1000 opportunities added in the 2012/13 financial year does not make a considerable contribution to the term target.

The EPWP within the CTMM is largely a stand-alone programme and unlike the CJMM, it is not fitted with the other municipal programmes. The programme is coordinated from a newly established unit which coordinates the implementation of the programme within central departments and regions.

The programme is largely dependent on budget allocated for capital projects. The operational budgets which is considerable, is not largely the focus. The CTMM could do more to skill EPWP participants as learners using the operational budgets. To a limited extent the EPWP participants in the CTMM benefit mostly from operational budget spent on mass participation programmes and other cultural programmes aimed at commemorating national heroes such as Solomon Mahlangu, who was a student leader from Mamelodi.

The operational budget spent on maintaining buildings could also be a perfect way of transferring skills to unskilled young EPWP participants. For instance, for jobs such as the painting of municipal buildings young EPWP participants can gain skills on how to paint, although the paintings are not done on every single day. The municipality has to find creative ways on how to involve and benefit EPWP participants from other programmes funded from the operational budget.

Positively, the CTMM has similarities in terms of the institutional arrangement .i.e. Mayors politically lead the implementation of EPWP; City Managers administratively lead the implementation of the EPWP; and each central department/region/agency has an EPWP champion. The main difference between both metros is that the CJMM has a tried and tested implementation model in comparison with the CTMM. The CTMM is only now (2012) starting to set up and test its EPWP institutional model as per the implementation policy. Therefore, the CTMM may not necessarily be expected to perform at the level at which the CJMM is currently performing. However, given that the CTMM sets its own internal EPWP targets one would expect that the targets should be met, as capacity issues and bottlenecks should have been taken into account during the target setting process.

Another key noticeable feature about the CJMM is that in its institutional arrangement agencies such as City Parks play an active role in the implementation of the EPWP within the environmental sector. City Parks also has its own

implementation policy or guideline tailor made for the sector and based on the broader CJMM EPWP policy. In contrast the CTMM Environmental Management Services department which is supposed to lead the CTMM with regard to EPWP implementation within the environmental sector does not have its own tailor made policy and rather follows rather than actively leading. As a result, the CTMM departments ‘wait’ for direction from the EPWP coordination unit rather than creatively and innovatively being proactive on how to maximise opportunities. This trend can sadly be observed even within other CTMM central departments implementing EPWP.

### 3.4. Current EPWP performance

#### 3.4.1. Performance targets and achievements

The CTMM EPWP policy indicates that the set minimum EPWP work opportunities are ‘in line with the Protocol Agreement<sup>5</sup> signed between the Executive Mayor and the Minister of Public Works’. However, Departments and Sectors may set targets above these minimum according to the availability of projects and budgets. These targets will be reviewed annually depending on the availability of budget’ (CTMM, 2012: 23).

**Table 3.3: CTMM EPWP phase 2 work opportunities targets**

Financial Year	Work Opportunities (WO)			
	Infrastructure Sector	Environment and Culture Sector	Social Sector	TOTAL
2009/10	5992	312	36	6340
2010/11	6831	336	44	7211
2011/12	8789	432	61	9282
2012/13	11425	594	59	12078
2013/14	14381	811	117	15308
<b>Total</b>	<b>47418</b>	<b>2485</b>	<b>344</b>	<b>50247</b>

Source: CTMM, 2012: 24

It should be noted that the annual target to be achieved is pronounced by the Mayor and the City Manager ensures that the targets are adhered to. The CTMM EPWP unit ensures that the annual targets are broken down into monthly and quarterly

<sup>5</sup> Establishes an agreed framework for cooperation and coordination between the DPW and the CTMM to confirm the Municipalities’ agreement and commitment to achieving the targeted number of Full time equivalent work opportunities.

targets for departments/regions/agencies to achieve. As indicated earlier, the CTMM sets its own targets which are usually higher from those allocated to the municipality by both the province and the DPW. However, given the fact that the CTMM is a metropolitan municipality with considerable number of capital and operational projects with budgets one cannot expect less of the municipality from a performance perspective.

Encouragingly, the Executive Mayor of the CTMM has set a term target of 375 000 which is essentially to be achieved during the EPWP phase 2 period (2009-2014). The achievement of the term target is translated into annual targets. This implies that for instance if the CTMM has set an annual target of 38 000 work opportunities and it is not achieved, the unachieved work opportunities are deferred to the following years making it impossible for the achievement of targets in any financial year.

The CTMM has in the previous financial years been unable to achieve its EPWP targets with the exception of the 2012/13 financial year. The table below gives the breakdown of the CTMM EPWP performance per financial year:

**Table 3.4: CTMM EPWP performance per financial year**

Financial Year	Target	Performance
09/10	-	9 000
10/11	30 179	11 000
11/12	38 000	19 001
12/13	20 000	20 386

*Source: CTMM, 2012*

### **3.4.2. Challenges encountered in achieving targets**

The lack of achieving targets by the CTMM is attributed to the following challenges that were highlighted by central departments as contained in the 2011/12 financial year annual report:

- a) Planning processes not completed on time to implement in the financial year (Capital projects);
- b) Some projects not labour intensive;
- c) Implementation of EPWP not prioritised on maintenance projects;
- d) Budget constraints;

- e) Standardisation of daily wages; and
- f) Reprioritisation of projects (CTMM, 2012: 4).

### **3.5. Conclusions**

This chapter provided the context to the CTMM and its implementation of the EPWP. Key to the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM is the EPWP policy, Indigent policy and adherence to the DPW beneficiary targets in relation to women, youths and persons with disabilities. The CTMM still needs to approve its draft EPWP policy that is important in guiding all stakeholders towards a common goal and enforcing adherence thereof. Document review on the implementation of the EPWP within the CJMM contributed towards contextualising and shedding the light on what the CTMM still needs to do to further meet their EPWP internal targets. Despite some different noticeable approaches to the EPWP implementation both the CTMM and the CJMM faced a similar challenge of not meeting targets with regard to persons with disabilities participating in the EPWP.



## CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

### 4.1. Introduction

In this chapter, key definitions and variables are discussed. In addition, issues of measurement, sample size and design, sampling methods, data collection methods, data capturing and editing, ethical considerations, shortcomings and errors and data analysis methods that the researcher used are discussed in detail.

### 4.2. Conceptualization, definitions, key variables

Although the case study design was undertaken, elements of both quantitative and qualitative study design were used. According to Yin (1994) the case study design must have five components: the research question(s), its propositions, its unit(s) of analysis, a determination of how the data are linked to the propositions and criteria to interpret the findings. Yin concluded that operationally defining the unit of analysis assists with replication and efforts at case comparison.

Mouton and Marais (as cited in Terre Blanche and Durrheim, 2004:33) state that the aim of a research design is to plan and structure a given research project in such a manner that the eventual validity of the research findings is maximized.

With regard to the selection of a case study, Johansson (2003:8) indicates that the case might be given and studied with an intrinsic interest in the case. In such a case the researcher has no interest in generalising his or her findings. The researcher focuses on understanding the case. If the findings are generalised, it is done by audiences through “naturalistic generalisation”.

A case study research methodology was followed in this research. The CTMM was the single case studied. Yin (2003) asserts that it is important to be clear that the purpose of the single case study is to expand and generate theory or ‘analytical generalisation’ as opposed to proving theory or ‘statistical generalisation’. This assertion maintains the role of case study research as an exploratory tool. If a collective model of case studies is used then the scope for generalisation increases (Yin, 2003; Stake, 1995, 2003).

Halonen (2009:76) argues that a case study approach is often a good choice when theory and understanding are not well developed. This fits well with my chosen

methodology as upon review of literature, there was an indication that only related studies on EPWP and job creation have been undertaken particularly in district and local municipalities, and not widely in metropolitan municipalities especially on the effective implementation of EPWP. This provides an opportunity to contribute to the theory and more understanding on the subject, particularly in relation to metropolitan municipalities.

Halonen (2009) further indicates that generally a case can be an organization, a person, incident, series of incidents, process, physical unit or an occasion. Benbasat et al (1987: 371) introduced 11 characteristics that define case studies. They include:

- Phenomenon is examined in a natural setting;
- One or few entities are examined;
- No experimental controls or manipulation are involved;
- The researcher may not indicate the set of dependent and independent variables upfront; and
- The complexity of the unit is studied intensively.

Eisenhardt (1989) understands a case study as a research strategy focusing on understanding the dynamics present within a single setting. He found that case studies combine data collection methods such as archives, interviews, questionnaires and observations.

### **4.3. Issues of measurement**

The researcher ensured that there was consistency in the questionnaires sent to both the EPWP departmental champions and beneficiaries. Respondents were sent questionnaires that were proofread and edited for consistent and better results. The researcher piloted the research instrument with 2 EPWP champions and 5 beneficiaries. The interview schedule was also sent to the CTMM senior manager for his inputs and advises prior to its finalization. Although, there were no major changes in the design and content of the questionnaires and the interview schedule, the importance of piloting the research instruments cannot be overemphasized in ensuring reliable measurement. Piloting ensured that the internal validity of the study is also improved, .i.e., discarded all unnecessary and ambiguous questions, assessed whether each question gives an adequate range of responses, checked

that all questions were answered, asked the subjects for feedback to identify ambiguities and difficult questions, administered the questionnaire to pilot subjects in exactly the same way as it will be administered in the main study (Gilbert, 2001: 2).

Miller (2012:1) indicates that reliability is defined as the extent to which a questionnaire, test, observation or any measurement procedure produces the same results on repeated trials. In short, it is the stability or consistency of scores over time or across raters. Saunders et al (2009:156) agrees, but goes on further to indicate that reliability is the extent to which data collection techniques or analysis procedures will yield consistent findings.

In this study, the researcher developed questionnaires based on the reviewed theoretical framework and the need to make additional findings on the subject matter. The data collected by the researcher confirmed the main theoretical aspects of the research, but also found additional new information in relation to the CTMM EPWP implementation. The additional findings are consistent with the research design as the CTMM was the only case study and this is what the researcher expected as the study seeks to explain the EPWP implementation challenges within the CTMM.

Easterby-Smith et al (2008:109) asserts that the reliability of the data/findings can be assessed by posing the following three questions:

- Will the measures yield the same results on other occasions?
- Will similar observations be reached by other observers?
- Is there transparency in how sense was made from the raw data?

With regard to the reliability in relation to the interview schedule, Robson (2002) asserts that introducing a high level of structure to the interview schedule will lessen threats to reliability. He indicates that there are four threats that may affect reliability of the interview schedule, .i.e. subject or participant error, subject or participant bias, observer error, and observer bias. In this study, the interview schedule was highly structured, and piloted upon prior to finalization and data collection.

Miller (2012: 3) defines Validity as the extent to which the instrument measures what it purports to measure. There are many different types of validity, including: *content*

*validity, face validity, criterion-related validity (or predictive validity), construct validity, factorial validity, concurrent validity, convergent validity and divergent (or discriminant validity).*

Gibbert et al (2010:12) indicates that there are several methods that can be put in place to increase internal validity:

- First, case study researchers should formulate a clear research framework, which demonstrates that variable x leads to outcome y, and that y was not caused spuriously by a third variable z. Practically speaking, according to Yin, one way to ensure internal validity is to assess whether the research framework for a given case study was explicitly derived from the literature: the issue here is whether authors provide diagrams or verbal descriptions of the relationships between variables and outcomes;
- Second, through pattern matching, researchers should compare empirically observed patterns with either predicted ones or patterns established in previous studies and in different contexts. Here, authors are encouraged to compare and discuss relationships between their own data and previous research; and
- As a third method, theory triangulation enables a researcher to verify findings by adopting multiple perspectives (Yin, 1994). In this case, authors are encouraged to report different theoretical lenses and bodies of literature used, either as research frameworks to guide data gathering and analysis, or as means to interpret findings (Gibbert et al, 2010: 12).

In this study, the main method followed to increase internal validity was triangulation. Data was triangulated amongst three sources .i.e. document review, theoretical data and participant observation. Questionnaires and the interview schedule were used to gather and measure what was intended to .i.e. the views of project participants, EPWP champions and the senior manager in relation to the challenges inhibiting effective implementation of the EPWP and what measures should be put in place to improve the status quo.

#### **4.4. Sample design, size and sampling methods**

The sample design followed in this study is non-probability purposive sampling. EPWP project beneficiaries were purposefully chosen from 3 infrastructure projects. The projects had a mixture of beneficiaries who had been on the projects for a period of between 1-8 months. Project 1 had 13 beneficiaries, project 2 (11 beneficiaries), and project 3 (14 beneficiaries). Lists containing the profiles of the project beneficiaries were obtained from the contractors in each project. The researcher needed to purposefully ensure the selection of males, females, youths, and persons with disabilities from each project. The age of beneficiaries was also used as a selection criteria, to ensure where possible a balanced age distribution. The amount of beneficiaries selected as per the mentioned categories amounted to 27. However, it became clear that given the labour intensive nature of infrastructure projects, the number of male beneficiaries exceeded those in other gender categories.

The sample size of beneficiaries from the three infrastructure projects combined was 27. There was no need to employ any sampling tool as all of the 27 beneficiaries formed the complete sample size. The researcher was satisfied with the mixture of individuals (age, gender) who formed the sample.

With regard to the selection of EPWP champions, no sampling methods and tools were required as there are currently 10 departments each with 1 EPWP champion. All of the 10 champions formed the complete sample size, and were the only respondents in their respective departments. The same applies to the CTMM senior manager who was the only respondent interviewed. The senior manager had been in the forefront of implementing the EPWP since 2009.

Currently, the final CTMM 2012/13 Incentive Agreement project list shows that 123 projects have been earmarked to create 28 583 across all the EPWP sectors in the financial year 2012/13. Of these, the infrastructure sector accounts for 18 096 of the opportunities earmarked. On average, the EPWP projects within the CTMM run for the duration of 8 months any given financial year, particularly EPWP infrastructure projects (CTMM, 2012).

Huysamen (as cited by Brynard & Hanekom, 1997) state that if the population is relatively homogeneous, a smaller sample may be sufficient. Brynard and Hanekom

(1997:18) argue that sample size does not only depend on heterogeneity or the larger the sample required to obtain a high level of validity. Blumberg (2005:213) mentions the following principles that influences sample size.

- The greater the dispersion or variances within the population, the larger the sample must be to provide estimation precision;
- The greater the desired precision of the estimate, the larger the sample must be;
- The narrower the interval range, the larger the sample must be;
- The higher the confidence level in the estimate, the larger the sample must be;
- The greater the number of sub-groups of interest within a sample, the greater the sample size must be, as each sub-group must meet minimum sample size requirements; and
- If the calculated sample size exceeds 5 percent of the population, sample size may be reduced without sacrificing precision.

Furthermore, sampling is based on two premises. One is that there is enough similarity among the elements in a population and that a few of these elements will adequately represent the characteristics of the total population. The second premise is that while some elements in a sample underestimate a population value, others overestimate this value.

The process of purposefully sampling beneficiaries assisted in establishing the challenges they currently face working in EPWP projects from the beneficiary perspective, and what solutions do they propose moving forward. Their inputs in this research are important as the effective implementation approach should address current issues faced by stakeholders in the value chain .i.e. implementers (municipal officials), and beneficiaries (women, youth, men, indigents and people with disabilities).

#### **4.5. Data collection methods**

A questionnaire was designed and sent to the CTMM officials coordinating the implementation of EPWP (EPWP Champions) within the respective departments that

are currently implementing the EPWP. Currently, there are 10 departments implementing EPWP across the CTMM. They are Corporate & Shared Services, Agriculture & Environmental Management, Economic Development, Roads & Transport, Electricity, Water & Sanitation, Health & Social Development, Housing & Human Settlements, Sports Recreation Arts & Culture, and Office of the Executive Mayor & City Manager (CTMM, 2012).

The questionnaires for both the EPWP project beneficiaries and departmental champions were self-administered. In each of the three projects the beneficiaries were congregated in each of the project site and briefed on the study, its intentions, expectations, and completion of the questionnaire. The researcher randomly handed out the questionnaires to each of the beneficiaries. Each questionnaire contained a unique number for tracking purposes. After the voluntary completion of the questionnaires, the researcher collected all the finalised questionnaires.

For departmental champions, the researcher physically hand delivered the questionnaires to all the identified respondents. Thereafter, the researcher collected the completed questionnaires. The questionnaires also contained a unique tracking number for retrieval purposes.

In addition, the questionnaires for both the EPWP champions (*refer to Appendix B*) and beneficiaries (*refer to Annexure C*) contained both closed and open-ended questions. Closed ended questions were particularly used to confirm what is contained in the literature. Whereas open-ended questions assisted in gathering the perspectives of the respondents that would add to or confirm what literature review asserts about the subject matter.

A face to face interview was also conducted with a Senior Manager responsible for coordinating EPWP within CTMM. An interview schedule (*refer to Appendix A*) was used as a primary method of collecting data from the CTMM senior manager. The said senior manager has been coordinating EPWP within the CTMM from its inception 4 years ago.

Mouton (2002: 38) states that there are numerous examples where researchers combine techniques that are usually accepted as quantitative and qualitative. For instance, one may find the researcher who uses probability sampling techniques in

conjunction with in depth interviewing or basic descriptive statistics in analyzing qualitative data. Many researchers would argue that the use of multiple methods and techniques is actually one of the best ways to improve the quality of research.

Stake (1998: 10) points out that crucial to case study research are not the methods of investigation, but that the object of study is a case: “As a form of research, case study is defined by interest in individual cases, not by the methods of inquiry used”.

#### **4.6. Data capturing and editing**

The interview schedule was used to collect data. During the process a recorder was used to capture the information. Thereafter, a transcript of the recording was written. In ensuring that the transcript data is consistent with the recorded data, the researcher had to rewind the tape-recorder for data consistency with the information captured on every page of the transcript. The transcript was proofread and edited while listening to the tape recorded information.

With regard to questionnaires, after data was collected, the information was captured in a tabular format using themes e.g. Broad understanding of the EPWP, Beneficiary Profile. The different responses were captured as they appeared on the questionnaires. Each questionnaire had a number attached. The questionnaire numbers represented each beneficiary. This corresponded with the allocated number from 1-27 (27 beneficiaries completed questionnaires). The researcher had to compare data captured in a tabular with each of the questionnaire corresponding to each of the numbers. There were no many data errors in the questionnaires. This was because during the data collection phase, the researcher was present on site and could be asked questions relating to the completion of the questionnaires. As a result, respondents followed instructions that were verbally given by the researcher or were indicated on each section or question contained in the questionnaire.

#### **4.7. Data analysis**

In this study participant questionnaires, interview schedule, and documentation review were used as primary methods of data collection. Data was gathered during the process of reviewing EPWP documentation from the CJMM EPWP. In addition, 1 CTMM senior manager was interviewed whereas CTMM EPWP champions, and beneficiaries were sent questionnaires. The questionnaire and interview schedule in



particular were used to assist the researcher to gain insight into the experiences of respondents in relation to EPWP implementation within the CTMM, and inform decision on the future EPWP approach that will enable the CTMM to meet its job creation targets. Yin (1994) indicates that in case studies, data collection should be treated as a design issue that will enhance the construct and internal validity of the study, as well as the external validity and reliability.

In relation to data triangulation in case study research, Denzin (as cited in Tellis, 1997) identified four types of triangulation: Data source triangulation, when the researcher looks for the data to remain the same in different contexts; Investigator triangulation, when several investigators examine the same phenomenon; Theory triangulation, when investigators with different viewpoints interpret the same results; and methodological triangulation, when one approach is followed by another, to increase confidence in the interpretation.

In this study, data source triangulation was followed. The importance of the reliability of the data gathered, particularly in this instance where the researcher is also a staff member at the CTMM, is of utmost importance. To this end, the researcher ensured that evidence provided is corroborated by at least 3 sources (for example participant questionnaires, theoretical data and documentary evidence) which provides validity to the research in terms of triangulation (Trochim, 2002; Welman & Kruger, 2001; Winegardner, date unknown).

With regard to the analysis of data collected, Miles and Huberman (as cited in 1994) proposes one set of comprehensive analytic manipulations as follows:

- Putting information into different arrays;
- Making a matrix of categories and placing the evidence within such categories;
- Creating data displays—flowcharts and other graphics—for examining the data;
- Tabulating the frequency of different events;
- Examining the complexity of such tabulations and their relationships by calculating  
Second - order numbers such as means and variances; and

- Putting information in chronological order or using some other temporal scheme.

In this study, data was analysed thematically or as per the main categories from questions contained in the questionnaire. The method utilised for analysing data gathered during the current study was predominantly interpretational. The researcher considered the information presented and organized it thematically. The themes or categories which the researcher used to analyse data are a combination of established categories often utilized in discussing EPWP/PWP.

#### **4.8. Shortcomings and errors**

During the review of literature on EPWP, it became clear that studies that were conducted on the subject matter were in the main around EPWP's ability to create jobs, EPWP role in local economic development, and EPWP in district and local municipalities, and EPWP evaluation. There was insufficient literature specifically on research conducted on how metropolitan municipalities are effectively implementing EPWP and challenges they face. Rather some studies on EPWP tended to focus on one element/sector of the EPWP in relation to metropolitan municipalities e.g. working for water programme in the City of Cape Town. In addition, the researcher struggled with finding journal articles, or specific books on the topic. Most EPWP journal articles were not focusing on the effective implementation of EPWP in metropolitan municipalities. This therefore limited the researcher to using other sources of information, mainly the internet as a primary research tool, and other written documentation. However, this limitation presented the researcher with an opportunity to contribute to the topic from a particular angle which has not been sufficiently written about, and thus contribute significantly to future research on the topic.

Researchers often make the case that external validity or generalizability in a single case study is a limitation. Saunders et al (2009:158) asserts that 'a concern the researcher may have in the design of research is the extent to which the research results are generalizable: that is, whether your findings may be equally applicable to other research settings, such as other organizations. This may be a particular worry if you are conducting case study research in one organization, or a small number of organizations. It may also be important if the organization is markedly 'different' in

some way. In such cases the purpose of your research will not be to produce a theory that is generalizable to all populations. Your task will be simply to try to explain what is going on in your particular research setting. It may be that you want to test the robustness of your conclusions by exposing them to other research settings in a follow-up study. In short, as long as you do not claim that your results, conclusions or theory can be generalized, there is no problem'.

Mcleod (2008: 3) agrees and indicates that 'because a case study deals with only one person/event/group we can never be sure whether conclusions drawn from this particular case apply elsewhere. The results of the study are not generalizable because we can never know whether the case we have investigated is representative of the wider body of "similar" instances'.

In this study, the intention was not to generalize the findings to all metropolitan municipalities implementing EPWP in South Africa, but rather to highlight challenges they face in particular using the CTMM as a case study. Therefore, the findings of this study are for the CTMM and only applicable to the municipality. However, data generated by the study will shed the light on how to effectively implement the EPWP in metropolitan municipalities with similar settings e.g. institutional arrangement, capacity to implement the EPWP, existence of capital projects etc.

Another limitation as pointed out by McMillan and Schumacher (2006:211) is that data collection by means of questionnaires also pose a number of possible limitations namely that there could be biased or ambiguous items, the rate of response by the participants may be slow, it could prove difficult to score open-ended items and there may be the inability to probe and clarify any responses that were recorded. In this study, the researcher was able to pilot test the questionnaires. This assisted in eliminating potential errors and limitations. It provided the researcher with the opportunity to prior to their use in the main study, clarify and shorten questions, eliminate unnecessary ambiguities, and be in control of response timeframes.

In relation to errors, Sica (2005:1-3) indicates that there are two broad types of error can affect scientific investigations and distort measurements: random and systematic

error. Because it is not feasible to study an entire population, a sample of the population is chosen. The study sample, however, may not accurately reflect the full spectrum of characteristics found in the target population. Random sampling error can then result and reflects variability or chance variation that may occur from sample to sample. Bias is a form of systematic error, and there are innumerable causes. The causes of bias can be related to the manner in which study subjects are chosen, the method in which study variables are collected or measured, the attitudes or preferences of an investigator, and the lack of control of confounding variables (a distortion of observed associations by additional, sometimes not readily apparent, variables). An unbiased study is considered to be valid—that is, the study results are, on average, correct.

In this study, issues of bias were taken into account throughout the different stages. In particular, the research design was designed taking into account the possibilities of bias and efforts were made to minimize it. Pannucci et al (2010: 4) indicates that selection bias may occur during the identification of the study population. The ideal study population is clearly defined, accessible, reliable, and at increased risk to develop the outcome of interest. When a study population is identified, selection bias occurs when the criteria used to recruit and enroll subjects into separate study cohorts are inherently different. This can be a particular problem with case-control and retrospective cohort studies where exposure and outcome have already occurred at the time individuals are selected for study inclusion.

The following factors assisted the researcher to minimize selection bias:

- a) At the initial stages of the research, the researcher was not aware of the specific projects, project sites, and project beneficiaries to be visited. Therefore there was no prior exposure or contact to beneficiaries, projects and the sites visited during data collection phase. Minimal contact with 2 EPWP champions, and 5 project beneficiaries took place only during the questionnaire piloting stage
- b) No specific criterion was used to select beneficiaries, and sites. Except that projects should be infrastructure projects that have been running for a specific period of time, and that beneficiaries should be EPWP participants currently

working in those projects. As a result, no gender or age specific criterion was used.

Another type of error that can influence the outcome of the research is the interviewer bias. Pannucci et al (2010: 4) asserts that interviewer bias refers to a systematic difference between how information is solicited, recorded, or interpreted. Interviewer bias is more likely when outcome is known to interviewer. He further suggests that interviewer bias can be minimized or eliminated if the interviewer is blinded to the outcome of interest or if the outcome of interest has not yet occurred.

In this study, the researcher was not aware or predisposed to the data and information that the CTMM senior manager was going to indicate. The only knowledge that the researcher knew prior to the interview was that the CTMM senior manager had knowledge of the EPWP that the researcher does not have and would not have access to without conducting an interview. It should be highlighted that the said senior manager started the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM prior to the researcher being employed within the CTMM. The lack of knowledge on the outcome of the interview and the interview data assisted in minimizing interviewer bias.

Measurement error is another type of error generated by the measurement process itself, and represents the difference between the information generated and the information wanted by the researcher. Trochim (2006: 1) highlighted 5 measures that a researcher could employ to reduce measurement errors:

- i. Pilot test your instruments, getting feedback from your respondents regarding how easy or hard the measure was and information about how the testing environment affected their performance;
- ii. Second, if you are gathering measures using people to collect the data (as interviewers or observers) you should make sure you train them thoroughly so that they aren't inadvertently introducing error;
- iii. Third, when you collect the data for your study you should double-check the data thoroughly. All data entry for computer analysis should be

"double-punched" and verified. This means that you enter the data twice, the second time having your data entry machine check that you are typing the exact same data you did the first time;

- iv. Fourth, you can use statistical procedures to adjust for measurement error. These range from rather simple formulas you can apply directly to your data to very complex modelling procedures for modelling the error and its effects; and
- v. Finally, one of the best things you can do to deal with measurement errors, especially systematic errors, is to use multiple measures of the same construct. Especially if the different measures do not share the same systematic errors, you will be able to triangulate across the multiple measures and get a more accurate sense of what's going on.

In reducing the measurement errors, the researcher pilot tested the research instruments .i.e. the questionnaire for both the beneficiaries and EPWP champions, and the interview schedule was consulted upon prior to finalization. As indicated in the data capturing section, data collected was double-checked thoroughly per questionnaire. The transcript written from the recorded interview was also thoroughly checked. Triangulation of data amongst various sources i.e. document review, theoretical data, and participant observation was also undertaken.

#### **4.9. Ethical considerations**

In this study, the following ethical considerations were taken into account by the researcher:

- The participation of respondents in the study was voluntary. The decision to take part in a study remained the choice of the respondents. The respondents were given the option to withdraw from the study at any time.
- Respondents were given the assurance that their responses will remain anonymous and that the information they provide will be treated as confidential at all times.

#### **4.10. Conclusion**

In this chapter, elements of the research design and methodology were addressed. They include key variables, issues of measurement, sample design and sampling methods, data collection methods, data capturing and editing, data analysis and shortcomings and errors. Most importantly, the chapter highlighted the fact that a case study design methodology was followed using both qualitative and quantitative data gathering research instruments.

The following chapter discusses the results and key findings in detail.

## CHAPTER 5: RESULTS – PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION

### 5.1. Introduction

This chapter presents and discusses the results gathered. The chapter will also profile the respondents including the interviewee. The profiling of respondents puts into context the characteristics of the sample giving credibility to the results gathered.

### 5.2. Sample profiles

- **CTMM senior manager** – started the process of implementing the EPWP within the CTMM in 2009. Amongst other duties, the senior manager was tasked with coordinating the implementation of the EPWP within CTMM departments, especially service delivery departments .i.e. Water & Sanitation, Roads & Transport, and Electricity. The process included setting and finalizing targets for all departments implementing EPWP, in line with the CTMM annual target and the Executive Mayors’ term target.

The senior manager was also tasked with dealing with challenges faced by departments in meeting targets. In this regard, the senior manager was also responsible for tabling recovery plans for the CTMM on how targets were to be met by departments. Most importantly, the senior manager was responsible for monthly, quarterly and annual reporting on the progress made on the implementation of the EPWP. The reports were compiled for the Mayoral Committee (MAYCO) to deliberate on and make recommendations.

- **Departmental EPWP Champions** – The champions are representatives of EPWP for their respective departments. They also serve as project managers of various projects which fall within the EPWP. They coordinate the overall implementation of the EPWP in different projects within their departments. They are responsible for the compilation of monthly, quarterly and annual reports on behalf of their departments.

Besides reporting they are also involved in the process of finalizing targets for their departments. They are also proactive in raising challenges or in cases wherein targets that were planned may not be met. They serve on the CTMM



EPWP steering committee. In addition, based on the data collected, 4 out of 7 departmental EPWP champions have been representing departments for a period of between 3-4 years or older. 3 of the EPWP champions have been representing their departments for a period of less than 3 years.

- **EPWP Projects beneficiaries** – The respondents were sampled from 3 different infrastructure projects, in different locations in the north of Pretoria .i.e. Garankuwa, and Mabopane townships located in Region 1 of the CTMM. Data gathered from 27 respondents revealed the following profile of participants sampled:

The research reveals the following characteristics about the sample profile of EPWP project beneficiaries:

- a) The majority (20) of the respondents are between the ages of 21-45 years of age;
- b) There are 20 male respondents as compared to 7 females;
- c) All (27) respondents have no disability; and
- d) Most (14) of the respondents did not have matric (less than matric qualification).

### **5.3. Results**

The results are presented in three parts. The first sub-section focuses on the interview conducted with the senior manager within the CTMM. The intention of the interview was to gather data that would shed the light on the history of the EPWP in the CTMM, the political and administrative support of the EPWP within the CTMM, and the comparison between when the EPWP was firstly introduced in the CTMM compared to now. Therefore, the researcher sought to find information that would indicate how is the EPWP viewed by the management of the CTMM. The interview schedule consists of 23 close-ended questions.

The second sub-section presents the data gathered from the CTMM EPWP champions. 7 of the 10 departments responded. Despite the researcher's efforts to ensure that all departments responded to the questionnaire, it should be noted that the process was voluntary. The questionnaire was designed in such a way that it

fully gathers data on the experiences of the respondents in the implementation of the EPWP. The questionnaire has a total of 15 questions ranging from their broad understanding of the EPWP, challenges with the current implementation approach, concerns raised by participants in their EPWP projects, and suggested interventions to deal with the current challenges. 6 of the 15 questions in the questionnaire were open-ended. The intention was to give the respondents an opportunity to express themselves based on their experiences without unnecessary limitations.

The last sub-section profiles and presents data on the experiences of the participants in 3 of the CTMM EPWP projects. The researcher designed 13 close-ended questions based on the literature review and theoretical framework. This approach enabled the researcher to confirm data found in the theoretical framework but also to discover additional data.

### **5.3.1 Results and Analysis of the response from the interview - CTMM senior manager**

The data from the interview was captured exactly as it was with a view to not distort the facts. The main aim of conducting the interview was to capture the views of the senior manager on the EPWP, as part of the CTMM management. Although the views of the Senior Manager are not representative of all of the CTMM management, the Senior Manager was part of decisions taken by the CTMM management on the EPWP and had direct access to additional information and varying perspectives.

The interpretation thereof (data) will be based on quoted and actual responses from the Senior Manager rather than the researcher rewriting the responses in his own words, and presenting that information as actual responses. The writing of the responses by the researcher's own words will do injustice to the valuable factual information that could get lost during the rewriting process. The researcher would only analyse the actual responses against the theoretical framework and the objectives of this research study.

#### **a) General understanding of EPWP**

- **Description of EPWP objectives** – *‘Basically EPWP is intended to absorb the unemployed individuals into temporary formal work, and also to skill the participants for them to have exit opportunities later when the project ends’.*

- **Meeting of objectives by the EPWP Programme at the national level –** *‘Yes because we are already in phase 2 of the programme, even though it may need some structural or policy refinements in certain instances of its design, the fact is that the programme achieved the targets set in phase 1 of the programme. So yes in that sense the programme is meeting its objectives’.*
- **Interventions that can improve the EPWP programme at the national level -** *‘Obviously we would like the programme to absorb more individuals than it is the case now, but government operates within certain budgetary constraints, hence we have targets. The government can do more to minimize obstacles which might prevent entities to meet their targets. The interventions may be policy related interventions that can make the programme to function better’.*

#### **b) Initial EPWP implementation within the CTMM**

- **Introduction of the EPWP within the CTMM –** *‘Around 2009 that’s when we started the process of implementing the EPWP within the city’.*
- **Buy-in by CTMM departments when EPWP was first introduced –** *‘Yes there was, but it was at a slow pace. We should remember that the programme was being introduced for the first time within the city so many individual departments were unsure as the programme was never tested before in the city, it had to be implemented at a fast pace. And you can imagine having to implement something that you are still learning about, it’s very difficult because you don’t have the base to start from’.*
- **Departments which embraced the EPWP when it was initially introduced within the CTMM –** *‘Service delivery departments such as Roads & Transport department were amongst the first to want to deal with this new programme. You should remember that early when the programme started the focus was mainly on infrastructure projects which usually have the labour intensive element within them. Fortunately, service delivery departments are usually*

*better placed to create more opportunities than other sectors as they have capital projects within them’.*

- **EPWP buy-in from the CTMM political leadership** – *‘Yes there was because remember mayors scorecards have job creation element within them. And the EPWP had the status of being a government wide presidential programme. Therefore every political leader was aware and those in public entities such as our municipality had to champion the programme and report on it’.*
- **Decisions on the setting of targets** – *‘Well, the political leaders would propose targets, but the presidency through the Public works department set targets for public entities. Political leaders had a task of ensuring that the targets were met or exceeded. However, internally departments did not have measurable targets’.*
- **Realistic nature of targets allocated to departments** – *‘Yes, they were realistic because they were allocated to the city, and one would assume that the allocation took into account the capacity of our city. So from that point of view they were’.*
- **Challenges and lessons learnt from implementing the EPWP within the CTMM** – *‘Like I indicated earlier when the programme was introduced in the city, there was a little element of uncertainty as to what the programme was all about, so the lack of experience of the city on the programme was in itself a major challenge. Well with regard to the lessons learnt, I guess the city learned that in programmes of this nature there is no opportunity to pilot at a small scale. Targets are allocated and have to be met regardless of internal challenges or unpreparedness’.*

### **c) Current implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM**

- **Current implementation approach entails** – *‘Well the mayor is the political champion, the City Manager is the administrative champion who should ensure that the targets pronounced upon by the mayor become a reality. Luckily there is currently an EPWP division with a sole mandate of ensuring*

*that departments and regions do their fair share in terms of achieving their targets. The division is also involved with departments in a collective effort of setting up targets. Beneficiaries are the responsibility of the individual departments at the project level, and ultimately the city. Departments manage beneficiaries in accordance with the DPW stipulations and EPWP ministerial determinations’.*

- **Comparison between the current implementation approach and when EPWP was introduced within the CTMM** – *‘Initially you could not even say that there was an implementation approach as the programme was still new and processes on how the programme was to be implemented were still initiated internally. So there is no comparison as the city was finding its footing then. The current approach is more clearer compared to the initial approach’.*
- **CTMM departments currently participating in the EPWP** – *‘There are ten departments’.*
- **Support of the EPWP by the CTMM leadership** – *‘Yes of course, there is no choice on the matter. Job creation is a priority for our government, so any programme seeking to create jobs is supported, prioritised and encouraged’.*
- **Decision on the EPWP annual and term targets** – *‘The executive mayor as the political head and leader for the city pronounces on term targets’.*
- **Potential of EPWP departments to perform meet and perform above their current target** – *‘Yes, of course we would welcome that’.*
- **Realistic nature of current EPWP targets** – *‘Yes they are realistic simply because the departments are consulted in the process of setting targets. So the targets are not imposed but proposed (based on their annual projects and approved budgets), negotiated, and finalized. So in that sense they are realistic’.*

**d) Proposed interventions for the CTMM to perform better on EPWP**

- **How should the CTMM leadership intervene to enable departments to perform above average with regard to EPWP targets?** – *‘The EPWP*

*division should firstly identify the general challenges that prevent departments from meeting targets. The leadership should only intervene when issues raised are beyond the capacity or mandate of the EPWP division such as when there is a need to introduce adjustment to the EPWP policy or guidelines, or deal with departments that are not cooperating’.*

- **What can individual departments do in the immediate to perform above average?** – *‘Firstly they should strive to achieve targets negotiated with them, then we can think of surpassing targets. Department also have to be proactive in finding ways of surpassing their targets rather than wait for the EPWP division to guide them. As long as they do so within the city’s EPWP policy framework, departments should be encouraged to be innovative to maximize opportunities’.*
- **How do you think the CTMM is performing in comparison with other metros?** – *‘I think we are getting there, once we achieve our annual targets then we can look forward to surpassing and then excelling. I know that CJMM surpassed their phase 1 target, Ekurhuleni is still struggling with achieving their moderate targets. Like us they started at a low base so it may take time for them to be where they want to be .i.e. surpassing annual targets, and not setting moderate targets that can be easily achieved. Look, as metros we should be all surpassing our targets given the capacity, budget and projects we have’.*
- **What lessons should be learned from other metros implementing EPWP?** – *‘From CJMM we can learn that targets can be surpassed if everyone is supportive of the programme and look for opportunities in every project whether capital or operational’.*

From the above interview, it is clear that at a general level, the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM has improved from when it was initially introduced. Most importantly, an implementation approach does exist. Some of the information indicated above (on the implementation of the EPWP) is confirmed in Chapter 4. However, the optimism on the prospects of the CTMM meeting its annual EPWP is

clear. There is also factual acknowledgement of the fact that the CTMM is not performing at the same level as the CJMM, and should be doing more.

Also notable, the interview cites the lack of pro-activeness by CTMM departments as one of the main elements that limit departments from achieving their targets. However, departments will need strategic and hands on support from the EPWP division, and from each other. Clearly, the political and administrative leadership has been there from the initial stages of implementing the programme to date. Departmental support also means that various departments from within the CTMM would share their experiences with a view to assist each other in dealing with various obstacles towards efficiently implementing the EPWP.

### **5.3.2 Results and Analysis of the responses from the questionnaires - CTMM departmental EPWP champions**

#### **a) Broad understanding of the EPWP, and its benefits**

All of the 7 respondents indicated that they understand the EPWP as a government programme to create work opportunities. In addition, the 7 respondents also listed the key general benefits of the EPWP as creation of employment, skilling of the unskilled and earning of an income by the poor.

#### **b) Understanding of how the EPWP is implemented in the CTMM**

The results show that all of the 7 EPWP champions viewed the individual departments as playing a key role in the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM. Only two of the 7 respondents also indicated the 'EPWP division's role in determining targets for departments' as a key feature in the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM.

#### **c) Challenges in the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM**

The respondents were requested to respond to this question in an open ended format. This approach was meant to enable individual EPWP departmental champions to raise issues they perceived as challenges in the efficient

implementation of the EPWP. As a result the following challenges were raised individually by each respondent:

- **Respondent 1:** *'The EPWP office does not communicate with the organizational performance office, therefore there is an element of reporting the same information to various stakeholders'*.
- **Respondent 2:** *'The approach in terms of targeting is based on the project budget which does not necessarily give a correct indication of how many work opportunities can be created. Targets should be based on the number of labour intensive activities within the contract'*.
- **Respondent 3:** *'Awareness, branding city and their depots, criteria of employment involving other political parties, youth agencies and disadvantaged people; and training on all projects'*.
- **Respondent 4:** *'Appointed contractor does not have buy in in the programme; EPWP is a small part of your daily functions; and no budget for uniforms/identifications'*.
- **Respondent 5:** *'Standard EPWP conditions contained in tender documents are not sufficient to enforce proper EPWP principles in order to create the required amount of jobs and especially to ensure maximum sub-contracting'*.
- **Respondent 6:** *'Departments are running the programme on an individual approach'*.
- **Respondent 7:** *'There is a need for improved coordination of the EPWP within the city to encourage better results'*.

From the above responses on the challenges faced by the EPWP champions in the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM, it is clear that the common identified challenge is around the approach that the CTMM is taking to implement the EPWP. Meaning that, EPWP champions within the CTMM are dissatisfied with the current implementation approach. All of the identified challenges clearly call for a need to totally overhaul the current implementation approach or improve it into an effective and efficient approach. However, as a researcher one should ask as to whether



there is currently a platform for all EPWP stakeholders including EPWP champions to voice their concerns without judgement but with a view to improve the current system. It should be noted that it is only in 2012 that the new EPWP division was formed within the CTMM. Also, that the CTMM 2012 EPWP is still in its draft format, and has not been approved. Without an approved and clear policy guideline, the CTMM cannot address the current challenges as the policy is a roadmap and a blueprint towards efficient implementation.

**d) Proposed EPWP implementation approach in contrast with the current approach**

- **Respondent 1:** *'EPWP unit providing more support, coordination and guidance; Spin off or incentive derived from the programme being beneficial to the contributing departments in order to encourage and reward participation in the programme.'*
- **Respondent 2:** *'All EPWP processes to be standardized for all Tshwane projects; Logistical support from the Tshwane EPWP will also assist .e.g. data capturing, creation of standardized templates and IT systems etc.'*
- **Respondent 3:** *'Tender must stipulate the rules of EPWP.'*
- **Respondent 4:** *'The programme need to be advertised not only to external stakeholders but within the CTMM departments, each department together with its projects should be branded, there should be transparency with the incentive grant to encourage stakeholders involved in the EPWP, addition of projects with longer periods not only 3 months but from 3 months to 2 or 3 years, and the wage paid should not be minimum but close to maximum.'*
- **Respondent 5:** *'Better consultation and technical support by the EPWP division, and targets that are better aligned to the identified labour intensive activities within contracts.'*
- **Respondent 6:** *'Better communication between the lead departments implementing EPWP.'*

- **Respondent 7:** *'Realistic targets and better support'*.

Currently the CTMM receives logistical support from the Independent Development Trust (IDT). The IDT avails data capturers that are currently deployed in major departments implementing the EPWP within the CTMM. These departments include Environmental Management, Water & Sanitation, Roads & Transport, Electricity and Housing. The data capturers' main function is to capture information on the performance of a department on the EPWP. The information of different EPWP projects and their respective beneficiaries is updated every month on the Management Information System (MIS). Therefore there is currently logistical support, although not in all departments implementing EPWP within the CTMM. In addition, monthly and quarterly reporting templates are currently standardized for all departments implementing EPWP within the CTMM.

With regard to the proposed intervention that the *'tender must stipulate the rules of EPWP'*. Currently, the CTMM has plans to include the EPWP compliance or element as part of the specifications in the tendering process. Clearly, once the CTMM tenders stipulate the rules of the EPWP this will guide contractors as to what the expectations are with regard to ensuring that the EPWP objectives are met through the projects that they have been awarded. However, the mere fact that the EPWP policy is still in its draft format, this may be the cause of the current lack of rules of EPWP in the tenders advertised. The EPWP policy is supposed to consider all stakeholders in the value chain and guide each including contractors.

On the issue of the incentive grant, the CTMM, like other municipalities, receives 40% of their allocated incentive grant up front; thereafter the remaining (60%) is paid after the municipality meets its FTE targets. Currently, once the allocation of the incentive grant is made to the CTMM the municipality internally invites proposals from departments on how they intend spending the grant once received. Thereafter, projects with the strong element of labour intensive activity are prioritised, shortlisted and final decision is taken. Therefore, the current process is transparent even though there is a need for improvement with regard to involving departments when final decision is taken, although the discretion rests with the EPWP division.

### **e) Training programme for EPWP participants**

Four of the seven respondents indicated that their departments have a training programme for beneficiaries. The respondents indicated that the training programme in their specific departments entailed training of students in artisanship from N3-N6 for 12 months, maintenance of buildings, and that contracts require the contractor to give the accredited training to participants in labour intensive systems and techniques. 3 of the 7 respondents indicated that they do not have a training programme in their respective departments due to the following reasons:

- The structuring of the tenders not being specific and enabling to support and enforce the training of participants by service providers;
- Duration of some projects on average last for a period of 6 months. This short duration of the project is too short for proper training of skills to take place; and
- Lack of capacity within departments.

### **f) General benefits for participants in a departments' EPWP project**

- **Respondent 1:** *'Provides temporary income for unemployed community members; some individuals are permanently employed by main contractors; and there is limited skills transfer and employment experience'.*
- **Respondent 2:** *'Employment brings back the dignity of participants'.*
- **Respondent 3:** *'Accredited training, life skills training, and entrance to the formal labour sector'.*
- **Respondent 4:** *'Job opportunities and income for longer periods'.*
- **Respondent 5:** *'Artisan students may become qualified technicians and may be absorbed permanently by the CTMM'.*
- **Respondent 6:** *'Participants have an opportunity to earn a living'.*
- **Respondent 7:** *'Better standards of living'.*

Most notably from the above responses is the opportunity for participants in the EPWP projects within the CTMM to be absorbed once they complete their artisan training. This highlights the fact that the importance of training in EPWP projects cannot be underestimated in ensuring that participants exit EPWP projects and gain permanent employment. Also, the psychosocial benefit .i.e. employment brings back dignity to the participants, correlates with the theoretical findings in this research which indicated that there was psychosocial impact on some of the participants in the EPWP projects of Limpopo and KZN. Lastly, as indicated on the responses above one of the main objectives of the EPWP is to enable participants to gain employment experience and skills to permanently enter the formal labour market.

**g) Challenges raised by participants in EPWP projects**

- **Respondent 1:** *'Lack of long term job creation; limited skills transfer due to short construction periods; and limited income period'.*
- **Respondent 2:** *'Stipend too little to cover their needs; no one to take care of their children while they are at work; and participants expect permanent positions'.*
- **Respondent 3:** *'Late payment by contractors; and work interruptions to work due to community unrest'.*
- **Respondent 4:** *'Departments within the CTMM pay different daily wage rates which are not standardized or consistent across all departments'.*
- **Respondent 5:** *'Late payment'.*
- **Respondent 6:** *'Unhappy with the labour rotation in the skills development programme'.*
- **Respondent 7:** *'Need two pair of protective working clothing rather than one, for changing purposes'.*

Some of the above challenges have been confirmed by the data collected directly from the beneficiaries in this research .i.e. the late payment of wages, and lack of long term job creation. In addition, it is factual that the daily wage rates for the CTMM

in the year 2011/2012 were not standard across all departments implementing EPWP. For instance, the SRAC department within the CTMM paid beneficiaries non standardized daily rates per project e.g. H.M Pitje project number 710692 daily wage rate (R101.75 per day/July 2012); Mabopane Library project number 710104 daily wage rate (R80-165 per day). The Electricity division paid beneficiaries a daily wage rate of between R100 to R399 in different projects (CTMM, 2012).

Although, the non-standardization of wages in one municipality may seem unfair it is not an illegal thing to do. The DPW Expanded Public Works Programme II Progress Report to Parliament points out that that 'R60 was the minimum, and that the EPWP allowed beneficiaries to be paid from R60 to R150 daily'. It was important for the entities involved to engage with communities to establish an appropriate wage for the particular work involved, and for this reason, there would be variances' (DPW, 2011: 5). Generally, within the CTMM infrastructure departments such as Water & Sanitation and Electricity tend to pay more daily wage rate as compared to social and environmental sector departments.

The fact that some beneficiaries raised concerns about the care of their children while they are at work should not be taken lightly. Given that the EPWP projects are temporary, this may discourage participants to send their children to day care centres within their communities. This is one of the negative social impacts of not having permanent or long-term employment.

In addition, the beneficiaries need to have at least two pairs of protective clothing cannot be underestimated. Given that participants wear their protective attire every day of the week during working hours, it is important to have another pair for obvious hygienic reasons. Having two pair of working attire will also prevent participants from wearing their own attire which may not have EPWP branding. Participants within the CTMM EPWP projects are allocated working boots, overall, and helmets for infrastructure related projects. However, in Environmental cleaning projects additional items such as cleaning equipment are allocated. The following pictures below shows some of the EPWP participants at work, and wearing protective attire.



Figure 5.1: Participants at work in one of the Roads and Transport projects in Garankuwa



Figure 5.2: Participants at work in one of the Roads and Transport projects in Mabopane

**h) Departmental debriefings with contractors on EPWP, and the frequency of monitoring (field visits) EPWP projects by departments**

4 of the 7 departments indicated that they do meet with contractors and discuss EPWP related issues. Only 3 of the 7 departments are not currently engaged in this process.

With regard to the frequency of monitoring EPWP projects, all 7 departments indicated that they do field visits and monitor projects every month. However,

participants surveyed in this research indicated that they have not seen anyone from the CTMM or the DPW visiting their projects. They further indicated that the researcher was in fact the only person from the CTMM or the DPW to have visited their projects. The participants also indicated that although there were structures within their projects such as the CLO, they felt that there are cases wherein the CLOs are not helpful in resolving the issues they have with the contractor. In this case, they would have wished that the CTMM officials and project managers could be visible and accessible.

**i) Main challenge that you are currently experiencing in your EPWP projects**

The respondents indicated the following as key challenges they currently are experiencing in their EPWP projects:

- Training;
- Lack of EPWP branded attire; and
- Late payment of wages.

**j) Suggested interventions to deal with the current challenges**

4 of the 7 respondents indicated that key interventions that can be introduced by the CTMM as:

- Focused, targeted and relevant training; and
- Amendment of the current implementation approach.

Only 3 of the 7 respondents regarded 'improved and visible monitoring of projects', as key to ensuring that the CTMM deals with the current challenges.

Additional interventions raised include:

- Streamlining of supply chain management processes; and
- Management of interdependencies, and implementation could maximize EPWP benefits within the CTMM.



### **5.3.3 Results and Analysis of the responses from the questionnaires – EPWP project beneficiaries**

All of the 3 EPWP projects from which beneficiaries were sampled from were infrastructure projects. The three projects were from the roads and transport department of the CTMM. One project was a road maintenance project, whereas the other two were storm-water pipe fitting projects. 100% of the respondents sampled in each of the three projects responded to the questionnaires. There was no withdrawal from the completion of the questionnaire by any of the respondents.

#### **a) Employment History**

The results show that in terms of whether the beneficiaries have been employed before they worked on their respective EPWP projects or not, 23 respondents indicated that they have worked before as compare to 4 who did not. The respondents who worked before joining the EPWP projects account for 89% of the total. This finding is important as it sheds the light on the calibre of participants joining EPWP projects. The finding also indicates that:

- *Contractors may prefer individuals who have practical experience and a certain level of skill.* Although contractors bring along a core group of skilled individuals to work on a particular infrastructure project, they are encouraged to work with and mentor EPWP participants to enable the transfer of skills between them. Having practical experience is vital to the project as it may imply that the participants have certain knowledge on how for example to make pipe fitment. And this is also important to contractors as it means that the project timeframes may be met as participants would not need to be trained first before they can start working. However, these important points do not exempt contractors from employing individuals who have not worked before.

It should be remembered that the main aim of the EPWP is to provide poverty and income relief through temporary work for the unemployed to carry out socially useful activities at the EPWP. The main aim of the EPWP implies that contractors should not necessarily prefer individuals who have worked before and are currently unemployed; however at a practical level any project with

timeframes may prefer the unemployed individuals who have certain level of skill or practical experience to avoid lengthier timeframes which would escalate costs. This may also be to the disadvantage of those who are unemployed and have no practical experience or level of skill.

The mere fact that those who have never worked before account for 11% of the total shows that the contractors of the EPWP projects sampled may be preferring participants with certain level of skill or practical experience as compared to those who have never entered the labour market before and have no skill. This trend may also point to the fact that the same people performing activities requiring lower level of skill (e.g. digging a trench) within the sectors such as construction are employed over and over again to the detriment of those without the lower level skills or construction sector experience.

- *Contractors may prefer individuals who worked within the construction sector before joining the EPWP projects.* Practically it would make sense for contractors to prefer individuals who have relevant construction sector skills. As indicated above, training individuals who have no skill as compared to those who have, may interfere with project timeframes and project budget. However, it is the duty of all stakeholders involved within the value chain, especially the CTMM as the custodian of projects to ensure that every person (provided they meet EPWP criteria to participate) seeking employment is accommodated within the EPWP projects, and invest in certified sector related training for participants.

**b) Was Employment temporary or permanent, prior to joining EPWP projects?**

The data gathered from questionnaires indicates that 22 (82%) respondents were in temporary employment prior to their participation in the current EPWP projects. 5 (18%) of the respondents were in permanent employment. This finding is important as it links to the structural nature of unemployment in South Africa. It is argued that during high economic growth rates the economy may not be able to absorb all of the

unemployed. This may also indicate a skills mismatch between what the labour market demands and the skills the unemployed have to offer (Chadha, 1994: 23). The temporary employment of participants prior to them joining EPWP may indicate the following:

- Were involved in temporary work requiring minimal/lower level skills.
- They do not have the necessary skills to sell for permanent work. The labour market may not be currently requiring their level of skill for permanent employment.
- As a result, the EPWP projects serve as 'employer of last resort'.

Also, the 18% of the respondents who indicated that they were in permanent employment prior to them joining the EPWP projects may indicate the following:

- Their skills are no longer relevant to enable them to work permanently.
- They may have had lower level skills which can be sold in retail sector, construction, and manufacturing sector.

### **c) EPWP projects that beneficiaries participated in prior to the current project**

The results collected through the questionnaire show that for the majority of the respondents (21) the EPWP project that they are currently participating in, it was their first EPWP project to be involved in. This result is significant as it shows that most participants in the sampled projects have never participated in other EPWP projects before. New entrants into EPWP projects are an indication that additional individuals who have previously not had an opportunity to be employed and earn an income can now benefit.

The data also show that for 4 of the respondents, the current EPWP project was their second one to participate in. In addition, only 2 respondents indicated that they have previously worked on two other EPWP projects.

#### **d) Period on current EPWP project**

The majority of the respondents (17) have been on the current EPWP project for a period of 1-3 months. This accounts for 63% of the respondents. The 1-3 months projects are new projects which commenced with the CTMM financial year which began on the 1<sup>st</sup> July 2013.

18% (5) of the respondents indicated that they have been on the current projects for 3-6 months. An additional 18% (5) of the respondents have been on their current projects for a period of 6-8 months.

#### **e) Skills gained by participants on the current EPWP projects**

Most (10) of the respondents indicated that they have gained both technical skills and generic skills in their current projects. Specific technical skills that can be easily gained such as pipe fitting and plumbing. Generic skills related to mandatory health & safety training, and communication skills.

33% (9) of the respondents indicate that they have gained only technical skills since joining their projects. The remaining 29 % (8) of the respondents gained only generic skills.

The importance of training and skills development on EPWP projects is one of the key elements which forms part of the country's broader skills development strategy. The DPWP (2008:10) acknowledges that the issue of training and skills development has its own challenges. One notable challenge is that many EPWP projects are by their nature short term or too small to enable effective integration of training and work for all beneficiaries. However, training of beneficiaries should take place as it is intended to equip workers so that they exit from the EPWP work opportunity with skills which assist them to be more employable in the labour market.

#### **f) Impact of EPWP projects on the lives of EPWP participants**

All of the 27 respondents indicated that their participation in EPWP projects has improved their lives.

- *Use of income (buying food, clothes, furniture)* – 23 (86%) of the respondents indicated that their participation in the EPWP projects has had an impact on their lives as they can currently earn an income. The respondents use their income to buy food, clothing for themselves and their school going children and can afford to buy furniture during the duration of the project. It should be noted that besides earning an income, assets (material assets) accumulation such as furniture is regarded as one of the main elements in the fight against poverty.
- *Nutritional (eating food that could not be afforded before)* – 18 (67%) of the respondents regarded the fact that they can now afford to buy food that they could not before, as the main impact that the project has had on their lives. This finding is of high importance and cannot be underestimated. Nutrition has a direct link with poverty. Malnutrition is an impediment to productivity, economic growth and poverty eradication. It is estimated that 32% of the global burden of disease would be removed by eliminating malnutrition, including micronutrient deficiency (DBSA, 2008:4). In addition studies have also shown that poor nutrition affects the ability of children to learn: Studies have shown that stunted children (children who are short for their age) are less likely to enroll in schools, and if they enroll, are more likely to drop out (UNESCO EFA, 2006: 111).
- *Educational (children attending school than previously)* – More than half (14) of the respondents indicated that education is the foremost benefit that their participation in the project has enabled. Poverty and education are interrelated. Poor people are often unable to obtain access to an adequate education, and without an adequate education people are often constrained to a life of poverty (Van der berg, 2008:9). The work of Sen (1992, 2001) also indicates that inadequate education could in itself be considered as a form of poverty in many societies.
- *Psychosocial (clothing, feeding children and participating in community activities)* – 55% of the respondents indicated that they have experienced

psychosocial impact since participating in the EPWP projects. Sen (1992, 2001) indicates that poverty is not merely a lack of financial resources but also a limitation of choices. Accordingly, poverty, in its wider view, should be seen as a range of constraints on the freedom to fully participate in society.

**g) Challenges currently experienced by beneficiaries in their projects**

- **Training** – 23 (86%) of the respondents indicated that the lack of accredited training was the main challenge that they face in their specific projects. The main concern they had is that without unaccredited training no employer will recognize their skills even though they have practical experience. Another point that should be considered from the contractors perspective is that uniform training of beneficiaries in a project may be difficult as participants do not necessarily have the same level of qualification, skills and experience. However, the training of project participants is in most cases within the CTMM part of the tender conditions for potential contractors. Therefore, contractors have prior knowledge and can therefore plan for training accordingly.

The absence of accredited training limits the potential of EPWP participants to access other exit opportunities within the labour market, once they leave the programme. The DPW (2013: 10) asserts that training is essential for a project as skilled labourers will ensure efficient and effective implementation of a project. In addition, training is also important as an exit strategy as beneficiaries will be able to make explicit choices about the occupation/ trade that they wish to enter and the nature of education and training that they will require. Moreover, further learning and training enables beneficiaries to attain recognized qualifications.

- **Working conditions** – Generally the data shows that the majority of the respondents (59.6%) were satisfied with their working conditions. Only 39.4% (11) of the respondents were dissatisfied with the working conditions they find themselves in. In general, respondents indicated that contractors generally ensured that they adhered to basic conditions of employment. The Ministerial Determinations on Special Public Works Programmes indicates that

'employers must take all reasonable steps to ensure that the working environment is healthy and safe' (Department of Labour, 2002: 10).

- **Lack of EPWP branded working attire** – 5 (18%) of the respondents were dissatisfied with their working attire. However, 22 (82%) of the respondents were satisfied with their working attire. The DPW requires public bodies such as the CTMM to ensure that EPWP project participants wear branded clothing for safety, visibility and consistency. Moreover, the branding of EPWP projects, and working attire such as overalls and helmets ensures that the community is made aware of the EPWP programme.
- **Late payment of wages** – The majority (66%) of the beneficiaries did not regard late payment as an issue. They were satisfied with the frequency of payment of their wages. The beneficiaries indicated that they were paid per fortnight and their wages were calculated on an hourly rate per day. The remaining 34% were dissatisfied with the payment of wages. In this regard, the beneficiaries raised several issues related to the payment of wages.
- *Some beneficiaries indicated that they were not paid for overtime.* They had worked for 9 hours but only received wages for 8 hours. The Department of Labour (2002: 5) Ministerial Determination on SPWP states that 'An employer may not set tasks or hours of work that require a worker to work for more than 8 hours on any day'.

The Ministerial Determination on SPWP further goes on to state that 'the provisions of the Basic Conditions of Employment Act do not apply to public works programmes' .i.e. overtime rate. However, the policy further goes on to state that 'An employer and worker may agree that a worker will work four days per week. The worker may then work up to ten hours per day'. The policy also states that 'A task-rated worker may not work more than a total of 55 hours in any week to complete the tasks allocated (based on a 40-hour week) to that worker'.

From this policy the researcher can safely conclude that the workers could have worked for 9 hours provided there was an agreement with the employer. Based on the policy, it is also not illegal for employees to work for more than 8 hours but the main issue is the communication of payment arrangements to employees prior to them working for additional hours. It is therefore upon the employers, in this case the contractors to clearly detail the working arrangement to their employees so that there is no doubt and suspicion by the other party, that wages for additional hours are not factored into the total pay.

- *Wages paid to some beneficiaries were inconsistent and fluctuated.* The beneficiaries alleged that their wages fluctuated even if all their fellow workers worked for the same number of hours and days. The official explanation from the contractor was that the beneficiaries were paid the equivalent of 3 days wages upfront hence in some cases the wages fluctuated or were inconsistent.
- **Other general concerns raised by beneficiaries**
  - Some respondents indicated that they would prefer that their payslips be given prior to them receiving their wages.
  - Generally respondents alleged that the DPW and the CTMM does not do monitoring or site visits in projects that they are currently working in. In fact they indicated that the researcher was the first person from the CTMM that they have interacted with.
  - Some beneficiaries signed a 20 month contract but have been informed by the contractor that the contract started in May and will end in December 2013, of which according to them the period does not amount to the 20 months that they signed for.
  - One Community Liaison Officer<sup>6</sup> (CLO) complained that he did not have a copy of the tender for the current project. The CLO indicated that this impedes on his ability to challenge the contractor on several issues that affect the community and project beneficiaries. Amongst other things the tender copy

---

<sup>6</sup> The CLO is a member of the targeted community, recommended by the ward committee and appointed by the contractor to assist in the selection of local labour and is guided by the municipality's approved CLO policy on Infrastructure projects (Ethekewini Municipality, 2006: 4)



indicates the project time frames, and budget for the project, and other commitments.

- In one of the projects, the CLO indicated that the EPWP consultant for the project was not helpful in escalating complaints raised by the beneficiaries and the CLO.

#### **5.3.4 Responses from project employers (contractors)**

Generally, the project employers were welcoming and friendly to the researcher and indicated that the study will assist in elevating some of the issues experienced mainly by project beneficiaries.

Upon interacting with the project employers on some of the issues raised by project beneficiaries, the following were the responses that were generally highlighted:

- With regard to *inconsistent and fluctuating wages* the project employers indicated that the beneficiaries were paid the equivalent of 3 days wages upfront hence in some cases the wages fluctuated or were inconsistent.
- On *training and development* for beneficiaries, the project employers indicated that they are not in a position to offer additional training to beneficiaries beyond the practical skills gained through beneficiaries' participation in the project.
- The project employers acknowledged that there is no *monitoring* of the projects from an EPWP perspective by both the CTMM and the DPW. However, the project employers indicated there was an EPWP consultant in each of the project who served as a link between the CTMM and the projects on all EPWP issues.
- With regard to the *duration of the contract* signed with EPWP beneficiaries, the project employers indicated that project timeframes may change based on the earlier completion of various tasks and activities.

#### **5.4. Conclusions**

In this chapter, information was presented based on findings from the research done on the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM. The research was mainly in the form of documentary evidence, interview and questionnaires. A section on the interview with the Senior Manager within the CTMM was covered with a view to get a

perspective of the EPWP from the CTMM management. This was followed by a section on the experiences of the EPWP champions on the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM. This was based on themes that emerged from the research. Finally, a section containing data on the profile and experiences of the participants working in the CTMM EPWP projects was presented. These three sections highlighted important data which will assist in recommending an effective implementation approach for the CTMM.

## **CHAPTER 6: SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **6.1. Summary**

This chapter draws conclusions based on the research results and the theoretical framework. The research investigated the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM. Most importantly, based on the findings from the investigation this chapter also makes recommendations on the effective implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM.

- *Summary of the study*

This study sought to investigate the challenges that the CTMM is facing in ensuring that the EPWP implementation within the municipality is improved. A qualitative/quantitative case study design was followed. This allowed for the use of various methods of data gathering. 27 beneficiaries from 3 EPWP projects within the CTMM were sampled. Seven of the 10 EPWP champions within the CTMM responded to the questionnaire. One senior manager within the CTMM was interviewed in this study.

Although, the CTMM started from a low base in terms of the targets set at the initial stages of the EPWP implementation, the city is still currently unable to meet its internal EPWP targets. Some of the key challenges raised by the CTMM EPWP champions include lack of a targeted and focused EPWP training programme, and late payment of wages. EPWP project participants within the CTMM raised issues such as lack of monitoring (project site visits) by the CTMM and DPW officials, fluctuation of wages, and training as some of the challenges encountered.

### **6.2. Discussion**

#### **6.2.1. Reflections on the research problem**

The CTMM has had challenges in the implementation of the EPWP. Since 2009 the municipality has been unable to meet its annual EPWP targets. Moreover, not only has the CTMM failed to meet its annual target, but also targets set for persons with disabilities and indigents (see chapter 1, section 1.3).

This study investigated the nature of these challenges by focusing on how the CTMM implements its EPWP (see chapter 3). Some of the issues that contributed

towards the presence of the challenges experienced by the CTMM can be internally addressed. The departments highlighted their individual challenges such as community unrests, and the influence of councillors on the compilation of lists and the processes concerned with the recruitment of EPWP participants in communities as some of the reasons for not meeting indigent targets (see chapter 3, section 3.3.2). The failure to meet EPWP targets particularly in relation to persons with disabilities and indigents implies that the CTMM is unable to include vulnerable groups in the economic participation processes.

### **6.2.2. Reflections on the objectives of the study**

In determining whether this study met its objectives, this section provides a brief discussion. The objectives of the study have been articulated in the following manner:

**Objective 1:** *Provide an outline of the EPWP in Tshwane dealing with factors such as its origin, the social context of unemployment, inequality, poverty etc.* Chapter 3 detailed the CTMM economic and social background. The chapter further outlined in detail the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM.

**Objective 2:** *Investigate the challenges inhibiting the achievement of EPWP targets within the CTMM.* Chapters 1 and 3 listed the challenges experienced by the CTMM in achieving the EPWP targets. Some of the challenges revolved around the criteria used in the CTMM indigent policy to define individuals as indigent. The lack of clearly defined measurable targets, and participation by few departments in phase 1 of the EPWP in the CTMM were some of the challenges which inhibited the municipality from meeting EPWP targets. The unapproved draft EPWP policy also serves as a challenge for the CTMM. This implies that departments and stakeholders do not currently have an 'approved' blueprint which can be used as a credible guideline in implementing the EPWP.

**Objective 3:** *Propose an effective approach in the implementation of the EPWP within the CTMM, taking into account the institutional arrangement currently in place.* Chapter 6 will make recommendations with a view of assisting the CTMM in effectively implementing the EPWP.

**Objective 4:** *Highlight key challenges encountered by metropolitan municipalities in the implementation of the EPWP in South Africa.* Chapter 1 highlighted some of the challenges faced by public bodies including metropolitan municipalities. They include the in-equalization of the incentive grant, and the fact that some of the capital projects are highly technical and require advanced technical skills thereby implying that only minimal labour can be used to the detriment of employing additional poor unemployed individuals.

### **6.3. Interpretation of results in terms of literature or theory**

The study revealed key findings which can be interpreted in terms of literature or theory:

- **Impact of EPWP projects on participants:** This study revealed that there was impact on the participants in the CTMM EPWP projects. All of the 27 participants sampled in this study indicated that there was impact in their lives. 23 out of 27 (86%) respondents indicated that the *Use of income (buying food, clothes, furniture)* was the impact they experienced. 18 of the 27 (67%) respondents indicated that there was *Nutritional (eating food that could not be afforded before)* impact in their lives. 14 out of 27 (51.8%) of the respondents indicated that they experienced *Educational (children attending school than previously)* impact; and 55% of the respondents indicated that there was *Psychosocial (clothing, feeding children and participating in community activities)* impact in their lives.

McCord (2004) found that there was a real measurable impact on the participants of two EPWP programmes undertaken in both KwaZulu-Natal (Zibambele), and Limpopo (Gundo Lashu programme). The above findings are in line with the results of a study conducted by McCord (2004), in which there was a real measurable impact on the participants of two EPWP programmes undertaken in both KwaZulu-Natal (Zibambele), and Limpopo (Gundo Lashu programme). Impact was in terms of the ability of participants to have buying power they did not have before. Participants were able to earn and use an income, they could afford food they could not previously afford, they could take their children to school and pay for their fees, and they were

also able to participate in activities within their communities (psychosocial) than previously.

One of the key additional finding in relation to the impact on EPWP projects in this research is that most beneficiaries experienced impact within 1-3 month of participating in the programme. 63% of the participants sampled in this research experienced impact within the first three months of participating in the EPWP projects. The remaining 37% of the participants only experienced impact during 3-8 months in the projects. This finding is significant as it indicates that although most EPWP projects are criticised for not being sustainable, impact on the majority of participants is immediate from the time they earn an income they could not previously earn. This finding will contribute significantly in enhancing theory or literature, especially in relation to the impact on participants of EPWP projects.

- **Training and skills in enhancing employability of participants:** This study revealed that most (10) of the respondents indicated that they have gained both technical skills and generic skills in their current projects. 33% (9) of the respondents indicate that they have gained only technical skills since joining their projects. The remaining 29 % (8) of the respondents gained only generic skills.

Reviewed literature indicate that the skills transferred during participants' brief period of EPWP employment are not consistent with the skills required in the economy, since the limited period of training included in most EPWP employment opportunities, prohibits the acquisition of the artisanal and other skills in short supply. For these reasons the employment impact of the EPWP training component is likely to be limited, resulting primarily in substitution rather than significant increases in aggregate employment (McCord et al, 2007: 5).

The researcher concurs that training offered to participants in the EPWP projects of the CTMM might not assist participants when looking for exit opportunities after brief employment in these projects. This is the case

especially given that the skills acquired by most of the respondents (10) were basic technical and general skills that are not specialised. The current South African economy requires specialised skills such as artisanship and those in short supply rather than general skills gained in EPWP projects. Therefore there is a need for imparting EPWP participants with specialized skills that are aligned with the demands in the labour market to enhance their employability.

- **Lack of sustainability in EPWP projects:** One of the key findings in this study was the lack of sustainability or long term prospects of EPWP projects within the CTMM. This concern was indicated by EPWP participants to one of the EPWP champions who responded to the questionnaire in this study.

Literature indicates that by design EPWP projects are meant to temporarily relieve the unemployed. McCord (2004:61) indicates that the short term nature of the EPWP does not permit the accumulation of surplus for investment in income earning activity. In general, impacts were less significant in Limpopo and were not expected to have a sustained impact. Like the EPWP the Indonesian PWP programme .i.e. Padat Karya is a clear example of this approach. The Padat Karya's intention is to temporarily increase aggregate employment, while providing a basic income for consumption smoothing during the period of labour market disruption. These programmes also tend to offer basic 'risk coping' or 'protective' social protection.

The criticism of the EPWP projects in terms of their sustainability is justified, although that's the nature of PWPs such as the EPWP. From a participant point of view, the short term nature of EPWP projects affects their ability to have long term plans as their income is short term. This also affects their ability to accumulate assets and to make investments.

#### **6.4. Recommendations**

The main intention of the study was to investigate the challenges that the CTMM is experiencing in implementing the EPWP, and recommend an effective implementation approach.

The recommendations are based on key findings with regard to the following:

- Results from the data gathered from the CTMM Senior manager, CTMM EPWP champions, and CTMM EPWP project participants;
- Positive elements within the CTMM EPWP implementation model;
- Challenges that the CTMM is experiencing in implementing the EPWP;
- Experiences of the CJMM in implementing the EPWP; and
- Theory on experiences in the implementation of PWP's internationally and in the African continent.

### **Recommendation 1: Approval of the draft EPWP Policy by the CTMM**

This research revealed that the CTMM has a draft EPWP policy that was initiated in 2012. The research also revealed that the CJMM already had an approved EPWP policy/framework by 2004. The delay in the approval of the EPWP policy by the CTMM may be a sign of complacency and lack of urgency on such an important milestone in the implementation of the EPWP. The EPWP policy is meant to guide all stakeholders involved in the value chain in implementing the EPWP. Stakeholders from senior management, departmental project managers, beneficiaries and external organizations associated with the EPWP need guidance in implementing the programme.

The CJMM is experiencing the benefits of meeting and even surpassing their targets. One of the key reasons is the fact that their EPWP policy was approved immediately when government started with the implementation of the EPWP in 2004. This afforded the municipality with an opportunity to refine their policy over the years to the point whereby every stakeholder has a buy in in the programme.

Therefore, the delays and inability of the CTMM to approve the EPWP policy will pose challenges as buy in may not be secured from both internal and external stakeholders. Securing buy in from all stakeholders involved means that everyone is committed to their responsibilities, thereby improving efficiency in the process.



## **Recommendation 2: Monitoring of EPWP projects**

The EPWP participants sampled in this study revealed that they have never seen or interacted with officials from the CTMM. This includes projects managers from the CTMM or DPW. This fact concerned the participants as to them it appeared as if the contractor has all the power to control all processes even though they are fully aware that the CTMM is the custodian of the project. Moreover, participants also felt that there are no mechanisms and proper channels for them to raise their genuine concerns relating to the late payments, and queries related to wages.

Although the CTMM has an EPWP consultant on the projects the participants indicated that they have never even had contact with the consultant. The CLO also pointed out that the grievances and concerns which the participants had raised were not addressed by the contractor or the EPWP consultant. According to participants, there seems to be a distance between themselves and individuals tasked with ensuring that their grievances are addressed. This is not helpful to the CTMM efforts of efficiently implementing the EPWP as the main stakeholder .i.e. participants feel aggrieved and that mechanisms to address their issues are not clarified.

It should be noted that this research also revealed that all of the 7 EPWP champions indicate that their departments do monitoring of projects on a monthly basis. The idea is theoretically acceptable, however from a participant point of view visibility of CTMM officials in some of the EPWP projects is key in giving credibility to the EPWP process. Therefore, the CTMM departments may theoretically plan to monitor EPWP projects but in reality from the participants point is view it is not taking place. It is therefore recommended that the CTMM make effort to improve their monitoring processes by adhering to their monthly visits of EPWP projects, especially given that this gives credibility to the EPWP projects as far as participants are concerned.

## **Recommendation 3: Coordination of EPWP**

Although the CTMM has established a stand-alone EPWP division tasked with coordinating the implementation of the EPWP city wide, there is a need to improve on the process. In the CJMM there are steering committees that oversee and assist departments with the coordination of the EPWP projects. These steering committees are as per the four EPWP sectors. Theoretically, the CTMM has plans to emulate the

same process as the CJMM as indicated within the draft EPWP policy of 2012. However, currently the CTMM does not have steering committees that are functioning and effectively assist departments in the EPWP coordinating process.

The effective coordination of the EPWP is crucial as it enable entities such as the CTMM to be aware of the role each stakeholder plays in the value chain. Some of the EPWP champions indicated that they regard the coordination of the EPWP within the CTMM as a key challenge faced in the implementation process. The coordinating role also implies that the CTMM EPWP division should be highly proactive in leading, guiding and addressing key concerns raised by departments.

Some of the key steps that the CTMM should take in ensuring that there is proper coordination of the EPWP include: Addressing support issues within the CTMM especially in relation to the reporting process; Ensure the functioning of the EPWP steering committees in four sectors; Allow for a forum in which departments raise their concerns, and sharing of best practises; Awareness of the role each stakeholder plays in the value chain including the contractor and EPWP consultant; Improve on the monitoring of EPWP projects (field visits); Encourage departments implementing the EPWP to be innovative on how they can increase their targets within the limits of the EPWP policy framework.

#### **Recommendation 4: Ensure that all projects within the CTMM are EPWP**

Currently, the bulk of the EPWP opportunities from within the CTMM are created from the capital budget. One of the key elements within the CJMM is the fact that they look for the creation of opportunities in any of the projects they finance from the operational and capital budget. Therefore, there is a need to shift the mind-set within the CTMM if EPWP targets are to be met and surpassed. Departments should seek to involve unemployed individuals especially in operational projects that have to do with the maintenance of buildings, stadiums, libraries, and other amenities. By so doing, the CTMM would not only increase their targets but also enable participants to acquire specialized skills that can be used later in the labour market, after exiting the programme.

### **Recommendation 5: Review the Indigent Criteria**

As indicated earlier in this study, the CTMM Indigent policy requires departments to at least allocate 50% of all the opportunities created in a financial year to indigents. The CTMM has to date been unable to meet the target. Besides all the other reasons given by departments, one of the main limitations is the criteria used in categorizing individuals as indigents. Although it's a given that every policy should have limitations as policies operate within budget constraints, the CTMM indigent policy criteria should be revised to be inclusive and reach more vulnerable individuals.

The fact that the Indigent Policy criteria only allows for one person within the household, who has a service account to be registered as an indigent disadvantages all the other members in a household. Although in most cases the person who has the service account is the owner of the house and a bread winner, there is no guarantee that the individual will take care of the other household members once registered as an indigent or earns an income from participating in the EPWP projects. Therefore, it is recommended that the CTMM find ways of accommodating all the other household members in registering as indigents to safeguard against excluding genuine members of a household who qualify as indigents.

The above limitation of the Indigent Policy criteria also leads to other challenges. For instance, other family members qualifying as indigents but cannot be registered as indigents due to the above criteria may genuinely be frustrated and cause community unrest that may delay the implementation of EPWP projects. This was clearly reported as one of the main challenges by the water and sanitation department in their pursuit to ensuring that they meet the 50% indigent target in their projects.

### **Recommendation 6: Encourage creativity in including persons with disabilities in EPWP**

As indicated in this study, the CTMM has not been able to meet the 2% target set by the DPW, of including persons with disabilities in their EPWP projects. Although the CTMM has not articulated reasons in this regard, there are several factors that may lead to this occurrence. Firstly, the nature of infrastructure projects is such that they require manual labour to complete tasks. As a result, departments within the CTMM

may be struggling with how they should involve persons with disabilities in infrastructure projects.

It is recommended that the CTMM find ways and be creative in including persons with disabilities in projects that do not require manual labour but are operational and EPWP. For instance housing administration and allocation projects within the housing department may be suitable as they require minimal labour and are not highly labour intensive. All departments should be innovative and find creative ways of involving persons with disabilities especially in activities funded from the operational budget. It is said that, society is judged by how it treats its weak and vulnerable citizens.

### **Recommendation 7: Creation of exit opportunities**

Although by their design EPWP projects are short term and temporary, the CTMM should create exit opportunities for participants who exit EPWP projects. One of the main findings in this research was that beneficiaries were unhappy with the short term nature of the EPWP projects within the CTMM. This may indicate that the participants lack information on the policy design of the EPWP projects. Therefore, the CTMM should share information on the EPWP policy design issues to educate the participants on the nature of EPWP projects.

Most importantly, the CTMM should create exit opportunities for EPWP participants exiting the programme. This can be done in several ways. Firstly, the municipality can link the training offered to participants within the EPWP projects, with current or future job opportunities which the CTMM has or plans to create. Secondly, the CTMM can enter into an understanding with external companies requiring individuals who have received certified training in fields such as plumbing, pipe fitting, bricklaying and other general construction industry specialities. This will ensure that participants exiting the CTMM EPWP projects are at least connected to medium to long term jobs which will enable them to earn an income, and can also accumulate assets which are important in the fight against poverty.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abedian, I, & Standish, B. 1986. Public Works Programme in South Africa: Coming to Terms with Reality, *Development Southern Africa Journal*, 3 (2): 181-198

African National Congress. 2007. *ANC 52<sup>nd</sup> National Conference 2007: Resolutions*. Available:  
<http://www.anc.org.za/ancdocs/history/conf/conference52/resolutions.pdf>

African National Congress Parliamentary Caucus. 2012. *Debate on Budget Vote of Public Works*. Available: <http://www.anc.org.za/caucus/show.php?ID=2597>

Barker, F. 1986. South Africa's Special Employment Programme of R600 million. *Development Southern Africa*, 3 (2): 167-179.

Benbasat, I, Goldstein D, & Mead, M. 1987. The Case Research Strategy in Studies of Information Systems. *MIS Quarterly*. 11(3): 369-386

Berkowitz, P. 2013. SA's Unemployment Rates Rise to Near-Record Levels. *Daily Maverick*. Available: <http://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2013-08-02-sas-unemployment-rates-rise-to-near-record-levels/>

Banerjee, A, Galiani, S, Levinsohn, J, McLaren Z, & Woolard I. 2008. "Why has Unemployment Risen in the New South Africa?" *Economics of Transition*, 16(4): pp. 715-740. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Bentall, P, Beuch A, & De Veen, J. 1999. Employment-Intensive Infrastructure Programmes: Capacity Building for Contracting in the Construction Sector. Cited in: Thwala, W. 2007. *Evaluation of Public Works Employment Creation Programmes and Projects in South Africa: Thirty Years of Learning*. Department of Construction Management and Quantity Surveying. University of Johannesburg,

Betcherman, G, Olivas, K, & Dar, A.2004. 'Impacts of Active Labor Market Programs: New Evidence from Evaluations with Particular Attention to Developing and Transition Countries', *Social Protection Discussion Paper Series no. 0402*. World Bank. Washington. Available:  
<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/SP-Discussion-papers/Labor-Market-DP/0402.pdf>

Blumberg, B. 2005. *Business Research Methods*. Berkshire. McGraw- Hill.

Boote, D.N. & Beile, P. 2005. Scholars Before Researchers: On the Centrality of the Dissertation Literature Review in Research Preparation. *Educational Researcher* 34/6, 3-15. Available:  
[http://library.queensu.ca/webedu/grad/Purpose\\_of\\_the\\_Literature\\_Review.pdf](http://library.queensu.ca/webedu/grad/Purpose_of_the_Literature_Review.pdf)

Brynard, P.A & Hanekom, S.X. 1997. *Introduction to Research in Public Administration and Related Academic Disciplines*. J.L Van Schaik Publishers. Pretoria.

Business Trust. 2011. *Private Support for Public Works: An Account of a Five Year Partnership (2005-2010)*. Available: <http://www.epwsp.co.za/>

Chadha, B. 1994. *Disequilibrium in the Labour Market in South Africa*. IMF Working Paper. Washington: International Monetary Fund

City of Johannesburg. 2004. *Expanded Public Works Programme Policy and Implementation Framework*. Development Planning, Transportation and Environment

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2009. *Report on EPWP for the City of Tshwane*. Council Item 27. Department of Public Works and Infrastructure Development: Mayoral Committee Cluster Infrastructure Development

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2012. *EPWP Performance Annual Report: Quarter 1 to Quarter 4*. Service Delivery Coordination Division

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2010/11. *Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Plan (SDBIP)*. Organizational Performance Management Unit

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2013/14. *Integrated Development Plan*. Office of the City Manager

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2011/12. *Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Plan (SDBIP)*. Organizational Performance Management Unit

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2012/13. *Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Plan (SDBIP)*. Organizational Performance Management Unit

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2012. *Draft Expanded Public Works Programme Policy*. Department of Economic Development

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2011. *EPWP June Monthly Report*. Service Delivery Coordination Unit

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2009/10. *EPWP Annual Report*. Service Delivery Coordination Unit

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2010/11. *EPWP Annual Report*. Service Delivery Coordination Unit

City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. 2011/12. *EPWP Annual Report*. Service Delivery Coordination Unit

Cronje, F. 2013. *The 1994 Transition Liberated Black South Africans from Oppression, But Also Liberated Whites*. South African Institute of Race Relations. Available: <http://www.sairr.org.za/media/articles-authored-by-the-institute/w-h-ither-the-whites-city-press-19th-may-2013>

Department of Cooperative Governance & Traditional Affairs. 2012. *Municipal Indigent Policy National Framework*. Available: [www.cogta.gov.za/.../740](http://www.cogta.gov.za/.../740)

Department of Cooperative Governance & Traditional Affairs. 2010. *Output 3: Community Work Programme Commission 3*. Technical Implementation Forum on Outcome 9: "A Responsive, Accountable, Effective and Efficient Local Government System". Available: [www.cogta.gov.za/.../733-output-3-implementation-of-the-community-work-programme](http://www.cogta.gov.za/.../733-output-3-implementation-of-the-community-work-programme)

Department of Labour. 2002. *Basic Conditions of Employment Act, 1997. Ministerial Determinations: Special Public Works Programmes*. Government Gazette No. 23045

Department of Public Works. 2004. *The Coordinating Role of the Department of Public Works in the Expanded Public Works Programme*. First Draft. 1-20

Department of Public Works. 2005. *Implementing the EPWP in the Infrastructure Sector*. Available: [www.epwp.gov.za/Downloads/infrastructure\\_presentation.ppt](http://www.epwp.gov.za/Downloads/infrastructure_presentation.ppt)

Department of Public Works. 2009. *EPWP Five Year Report*. Available: <http://www.epwp.gov.za/index.asp?c=Downloads>

Department of Public Works. 2011. *Speech by the Minister of Public Works: 2<sup>nd</sup> EPWP Municipal Summit*. Available: <http://www.publicworks.gov.za/PDFs/Speeches/Deputy%20Minister/EPWP%20Summit%20closing%20remarks.pdf>

Department of Public Works. 2011. *Parliamentary Monitoring Group EPWP Phase II Progress Report. Parliamentary Monitoring Group*. Available: <http://www.pmg.org.za/report/20110621-department-public-works-expanded-public-works-programme-ii>

Department of Public Service and Administration. 1998. *White Paper on Local Government*. Available: <http://www.info.gov.za/view/DownloadFileAction?id=108131>

Department of Public Service and Administration. 1997. *White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery (Batho Pele White Paper)*. Government Gazette No 18340

Del Ninno, C, Subbarao, K, & Milazzo, A. 2009. *How to Make Public Works Work: A Review of the Experiences*. Social Protection & Labor. The World Bank. Available: <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/SP-Discussion-papers/Safety-Nets-DP/0905.pdf>

De Vaus, D. 2001. *Research Design in Social Research*. London: SAGE.

Economic and Statistics Analysis Unit (ESAU). 2004. Cited in: Business Trust. 2011. *Private Support for Public Works: An Account of a Five Year Partnership (2005-2010)*. Page 9. Available: <http://www.epwsp.co.za/>

Edigheji, O. 2010. *Constructing a Democratic Developmental State in South Africa: Potentials and Challenges*. HSRC Press. Available: <http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/cpsi/unpan039020.pdf>

Eisenhardt, K. 1989. Building theories from case study research. *The academic Management Review*. 14(4): 532-550

Easterby-Smith, M, Thorpe, R, & Jackson, P. 2008. Management Research: An Introduction. Cited in: Saunders, M, Lewis, P, and Thornhill, A. 2009. *Research Methods for Business Students (5<sup>th</sup> Edition)*. Pearson Education Limited. England

Financial and Fiscal Commission. 2013. *Technical Report: Annual Submission on the Division of Revenue 2013/14*. Midrand: FFC. Available: [www.ffc.co.za/.../332-chapter-1-perspectives-and-prospects-](http://www.ffc.co.za/.../332-chapter-1-perspectives-and-prospects-)

Gilbert, N. 2001. *Social Research Update*. Issue no 35. University of Surrey. Available: <http://sru.soc.surrey.ac.uk/SRU35.html>

Gibbert, M, Ruigrok, W. (2010). *The "What" and "How" of Case Study Rigor: Three Strategies Based on Published Research. What passes as a rigorous case study?* SAGE Publications Inc. Available: [orm.sagepub.com/content/early/2010/02/01/1094428109351319](http://orm.sagepub.com/content/early/2010/02/01/1094428109351319)

Greenaway, L. 2011. *Using Case Study in Research – How to Tell a Good Story*. Evaluation and Professional Development Services. <http://www.evaluationservices.co.uk/46/Using-case-study-research-How-to-tell-039good039-story/>

Gumede, W. 2009. *Delivering the Democratic Developmental State in South Africa*. Development Planning Division. Working Paper Series No.9, DBSA: Midrand.

Gumede, W. 2011. *South Africa as a Developmental State in the Making*. Available: [www.vusigumedethinkers.com/.../JULY%202011/...](http://www.vusigumedethinkers.com/.../JULY%202011/...)

Halonen, R. 2009. Practise-Related Research Methods as Part of Scientific Information Systems Research. *Indian Journal of Science & Technology*. 2 (5): 76

Hemson, D. 2008. Expanded Public Works Programme: Hope for the unemployed? Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC). Available: <http://www.hsrc.ac.za/en/review/september-2008/policy-works#sthash.f8QMgg2a.dpuf>

Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC).1985. *Labour Market Participation and Unemployment*. Cited in: Mafiri, M. 2002. *Socio Economic Impact of Unemployment in South Africa*. University of Pretoria Available: <http://upetd.up.ac.za/thesis/available/etd-08162004-135251/unrestricted/01dissertation.pdf>

International Labour Organization (ILO). 1982. *Resolutions Concerning Economically Active Population, Employment, Unemployment and*



*Underemployment*. 13<sup>th</sup> International Conference of Labour Statisticians. Available: <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/stat/res/index.htm>

Jara, R. 1971. Labour Mobilisation and Economic Development: The Moroccan Experience. Cited in: Thwala, W. 2001. A Critical Evaluation of Large-Scale Development Projects and Programmes in South Africa 1980-1994, *Unpublished Msc Thesis*. School of Civil and Environment Engineering. University of the Witwatersrand

Johansson, R. 2003. *Case Study Methodology: A Key Note Speech at the International Conference "Methodologies in Housing Research"*. Royal Institute of Technology. Sweden

Khanyile, B. 2008. A Case Study of the Impact of Expanded Public Works Programme on Job Creation in the Zululand District municipality. *MBA Dissertation*. University of KwaZulu-Natal

Klein, K, & Myers, M. 1999. A Set of Principles for Conducting and Evaluating Interpretative Field Studies in Information Systems. Cited in: Halonen, R. 2009. Practice-related research methods as part of scientific information systems research. *Indian Journal of Science & Technology*, 2 (5): 76

Kostzer, D. 2008. *'Argentina: A Case Study on the Plan Jefes de Hogar Desocupados, or the Employment*. Available: [http://ideas.repec.org/p/lev/wrkpap/wp\\_534.html](http://ideas.repec.org/p/lev/wrkpap/wp_534.html)

Lieuw-Kie-Song, M. 2009. *The South African Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) 2004-2014*. Levy Institute Available: [http://www.levyinstitute.org/pubs/conf\\_june09/conf\\_june09\\_files/presentations/Session1b\\_Maikel\\_Lieuw-Kie-Song.pdf](http://www.levyinstitute.org/pubs/conf_june09/conf_june09_files/presentations/Session1b_Maikel_Lieuw-Kie-Song.pdf)

Ligthelm, A & Van Niekerk, K. 1990. Unemployment: The Role of the Public Sector in Increasing the Labour Absorption Capacity of the South African Economy, *Development Southern Africa Journal*, 7(4): 629-641.

Mafiri, M. 2002. *Socio Economic Impact of Unemployment in South Africa*. University of Pretoria

Magebula, M. 2006. Evaluation of Labour Intensive Construction Projects in Madibeng Municipality, North West Province, South Africa. *MSc in Engineering Project Report*. University of Witwatersrand. Available: <http://wiredspace.wits.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10539/4756/9502404N%20Project%20report.pdf?sequence=1>

Mayombe, C. 2009. An Evaluation of the Implementation of Construction Learnerships in the Expanded Public Works Programme: A case study of Ethekwini Vuk'Uphile 1. *Master of Social Science in Policy and Development Studies Dissertation*. Available: MAYOMBE

McCutcheon, R. 1994. *Principles of Labour-Intensive Construction and Experience Elsewhere in Sub-Saharan South Africa: The Implications for South Africa*. Proceedings of the 16th Annual Transportation Convention, University of Pretoria.

McCutcheon, R. 1995. "Employment Creation in Public Works", *Habitat International*, 19 (3)

McCutcheon, R. 2001. Employment Generation in Public Works: Recent South African Experience, *Construction, Management and Economics Journal*, 19: 275-284

McCutcheon, R, & Taylor-Parkins, F. 2003. *Employment and High Standard Infrastructure*. WORK Research Centre for Employment Creation in Construction. Johannesburg, University of the Witwatersrand.

McCord, A. 2004. *Public Works and Overcoming Underdevelopment in South Africa*. UNDP, HSRC & DBSA conference on overcoming under-development in South Africa's Second economy. Available:  
<http://www.saldru.uct.ac.za/pwp/conference%20papers/McCord%20EPWP%20Critique%20DBSA%202004%20.pdf>

McCord, A. 2005. *Economic Constraints to the Performance of the EPWP*. Department for Public Service and Administration. Available:  
[http://www.saldru.uct.ac.za/home/index.php?option=com\\_docman/Itemid,37/gid,293/task,doc\\_view/](http://www.saldru.uct.ac.za/home/index.php?option=com_docman/Itemid,37/gid,293/task,doc_view/)

McCord, A. 2007. *EPWP Mid-Term Review. Component 1: International PWP Comparative Study*. Available:  
[http://www.btrust.org.za/library/uploads/documents/4\\_EPWSP\\_International%20PWP%20Comparative%20study\\_%20McCord\\_Sept%202007.pdf](http://www.btrust.org.za/library/uploads/documents/4_EPWSP_International%20PWP%20Comparative%20study_%20McCord_Sept%202007.pdf)

McLeod, S. 2008. *Case Study Method in Psychology – Simply Psychology*. Available: <http://www.simplypsychology.org/case-study.html>

McMillan, J.H. and Schumacher, S. 2006. *Research in Education: Evidence-Based Enquiry (6th Edition)*. USA: Pearson Education

Miles, M. B. & Huberman, A. M. 1994. *Qualitative Data Analysis (2nd Edition)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage

Miller, M.J. 2012. *Reliability and Validity*. Graduate Research Methods. Western International University. Available:  
[http://michaeljmillerphd.com/res500\\_lecturenotes/reliability\\_and\\_validity.pdf](http://michaeljmillerphd.com/res500_lecturenotes/reliability_and_validity.pdf)

Mothapo, M.F. 2011. *The Impact of the Expanded Public Works Programmes on Poverty Alleviation in the Bushbuckridge Municipality in the Mpumalanga Province*. University of Limpopo. Available:  
[http://ul.netd.ac.za/bitstream/10386/716/1/mothapomf\\_MDEV\\_.pdf](http://ul.netd.ac.za/bitstream/10386/716/1/mothapomf_MDEV_.pdf)

Mouton, J. 2002. *Understanding Social Research*. Van Schaik Publishers. Pretoria

Mouton, J, & Marais, H. 1990. Basic Concepts in the methodology of the Social Sciences. Cited in: Terre- Blanche, M, & Durrheim, K. 2006. *Research in Practice: Applied Methods for the Social Science*. University of Cape Town Press

Moyo, M. 2013. *How Effective is EPWP Employment in Enhancing the Employability of Participants Once they Exit these Programmes? The Case of the Modimola Integrated Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP), North West Province*. University of the Witwatersrand. Available:  
[http://wiredspace.wits.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10539/12993/MA%20Thesis\\_Final%20Submission\\_18%20June\\_2013.pdf?sequence=1](http://wiredspace.wits.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10539/12993/MA%20Thesis_Final%20Submission_18%20June_2013.pdf?sequence=1)

National Planning Commission. 2011. *NPC Diagnostic Overview*. The Presidency of the Republic of South Africa. Available:  
[www.info.gov.za/view/DownloadFileAction?id=147192](http://www.info.gov.za/view/DownloadFileAction?id=147192)

Padayachee, A. 2011. South Africa: The Path Towards a Developmental State. Cited in: Mapungubwe, 2011. *SANPAD Thematic Conference on the Developmental State*. Available:  
[www.mistra.org.za/noteworthy1.asp?ID=83&MediaCat...](http://www.mistra.org.za/noteworthy1.asp?ID=83&MediaCat...)

Pannucci, C, J. 2010. *Identifying and Avoiding Bias in Research*. Available:  
[www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov>Journal](http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/Journal)

Parliament Portfolio Committee on Public Works. 2004. *Report to the Portfolio Committee on Public Works*. Available:  
<http://www.pmg.org.za/docs/2005/comreports/050317pcpworksreport2.htm>

Philip, K. 2009. *The Community Work Programme in South Africa*. Levy Institute. Available:  
[http://www.levyinstitute.org/pubs/conf\\_june09/conf\\_june09\\_files/presentations/Session5b\\_Philip.pdf](http://www.levyinstitute.org/pubs/conf_june09/conf_june09_files/presentations/Session5b_Philip.pdf)

Robson, C. 2002. *Real World Research (2nd Edition)*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Saunders, M, Lewis, P, & Thornhill, A. 2009. *Research Methods for Business Students (5<sup>th</sup> Edition)*. Pearson Education Limited. England

Sen, A.1992. *Inequality Reexamined*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Sen, A.2001. *Development As Freedom*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Sica, G, T. 2006. *Bias in Research Studies - The INCLIN Trust*. Available:  
[www.inclitrust.org/.../file/Bias%20in%20Research%20Studies.pdf](http://www.inclitrust.org/.../file/Bias%20in%20Research%20Studies.pdf)

South African LED Network. 2010. *City of Jo'burg Exceeds EPWP Targets*. South African Local Government Association. Available:  
<http://ledResearch.co.za/simplenews/newsflash/2011/03/city-joburg-exceeds-epwp-targets>

South African Catholics Bishops' Conference. 2007. South Africa as a Development State. *Briefing Paper 178*. Available: <http://www.cplo.org.za/site/>

Statistics South Africa. 2012. Unemployment First Quarter Figures. Available: [www.statssa.gov.za/keyindicators/keyindicators.asp](http://www.statssa.gov.za/keyindicators/keyindicators.asp)

Stake, R. 1995. *The Art of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage

Statistics South Africa. 2013. *Quarterly Labour Force Survey (Q2:2013)*. Available: <http://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/P0211/P02112ndQuarter2013.pdf>

Stake, R. 1998. "Case Studies" in: Norman Denzin & Yvonna Lincoln. (eds.): *Strategies of Qualitative Inquiry*. Thousand Oaks. London. New Delhi: Sage

Stake, R. 2003. Case Studies (134-164) in Denzin, N.K. & Lincoln, Y. (eds) (2003). *Strategies of Qualitative Inquiry (2<sup>nd</sup> Edition)*. London: Sage

Tcherneva, P, & Wray, R. 2005a. *Employer of Last Resort: A case Study of Argentina's Jefes Program*. Available: [www.cfeps.org/pubs/wp-pdf/wp41-tcherneva-wray-all.pdf](http://www.cfeps.org/pubs/wp-pdf/wp41-tcherneva-wray-all.pdf)

Tcherneva, P, & Wray, R. 2005b. Is Jefes de Hogar an Employer of Last Resort Program? An Assessment of Argentina's Ability the Promise of Full Employment and Price Stability. Available: [http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=1009618](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1009618)

Tellis, W. 1997. Application of a Case Study Methodology. *The Qualitative Report*, 3(2). Available: (<http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR3-3/tellis2.html>)

The Presidency. 2014. *Twenty Year Review South Africa 1994-2014*. The Presidency, Republic of South Africa. Available: <http://www.google.co.za/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&frm=1&source=web&cd=2&ved=0CC4QFjAB&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.thepresidency-dpme.gov.za%2Fnews%2FDocuments%2F20%2520Year%2520Review.pdf&ei=eQp7U5GELamf7Abyk4HQBA&usq=AFQjCNGbS0G3Hvn0MFTfLurROMkmzPY0eQ&bvm=bv.67229260,d.ZGU>

Thwala, W.D. 2001. *A Critical Evaluation of Large-Scale Development Projects and Programmes in South Africa 1980-1994*. Unpublished Msc Thesis. School of Civil and Environment Engineering. University of the Witwatersrand. Available: [www.ideas-int.org/documents/Document.cfm?docID=114](http://www.ideas-int.org/documents/Document.cfm?docID=114)

Trochim, W. 2002. *Qualitative Validity (On-Line)*. Available: <http://trochim.human.cornell.edu/kb/qualval.htm>.

Trochim, W. 2006. *Research Methods Knowledge Base*. Available: <http://www.socialresearchmethods.net/kb/samprn.php>

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and International Labour Organisation (ILO). 1987. *Nineth Joint Meeting for Support to Special Public Works*

*Programmes (SPWP)*. Available:  
[www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/recon/.../lbt\\_sourcebook.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/recon/.../lbt_sourcebook.pdf)

Van Dijk, H.G, & Croucamp, P.A. 2007. The Social Origins of the Developmental State: Reflections in South Africa and its Local Sphere of Government: *Journal of Public Administration*, 42 (7). Available:  
[http://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/4463/VanDijk\\_Social%282007%29.pdf?sequence=1](http://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/4463/VanDijk_Social%282007%29.pdf?sequence=1)

Van Der Berg, S. 2008. *Poverty and Education. The International Academy of Education (IAE) and the International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP)*. Available: [www.iiep.unesco.org](http://www.iiep.unesco.org)

Welman, J.C. and Kruger, S.J. 2001. *Research Methodology (2nd edition)*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press Southern Africa.

Winegardner, K.E. (Date not available). *The Case Study Method of Scholarly Research*. Available: [https://cpub.brown.edu:8543/cpubsh/Raymond Hyatt-SO0105SO2/materialadd2.pdf](https://cpub.brown.edu:8543/cpubsh/Raymond_Hyatt-SO0105SO2/materialadd2.pdf).

Yin, R. 1994. *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. Thousand Oaks. London. New Delhi: Sage

Yin, R. 2003. *Case Study Research: Design and Methods (3<sup>rd</sup> Edition)*. Thousand Oaks. London. New Delhi: Sage

## APPENDICES

### APPENDIX A: Interview Schedule for CTMM Senior Manager

#### EPWP Implementation within the CTMM

##### I. Opening

- A. Establish Rapport
- B. Purpose
- C. Motivation
- D. Timeline

##### II. Body

- A. (Topic) General Background on EPWP (National Level)
  - 1. What is your understanding of EPWP?
    - a. Please describe what EPWP is intended to achieve
    - b. Do you think that EPWP is currently meeting its intended goals?
    - c. If not, please elaborate
    - d. What should be the interventions for making EPWP work
  - B. (Topic) EPWP implementation within the City of Tshwane (CTMM)
    - 2. How was EPWP initially implemented within the City of Tshwane (CTMM)
      - a. When was EPWP introduced within the CTMM?
      - b. Was there buy in from CTMM departments? If not please elaborate
      - c. Which departments embraced the implementation of EPWP?
      - d. Was there political buy in from the CTMM's political leadership? If not please elaborate
      - e. Who decided on the setting of targets?
      - f. Were the targets realistic? If not please elaborate
      - g. What were the challenges and lessons learned?
    - 3. How is EPWP currently implemented within the City of Tshwane (CTMM)
      - a. What does the current implementation approach entail?
      - b. How is the current approach different from when EPWP started within the CTMM?
      - c. How many departments currently participate in the programme?
      - d. Is the CTMM's leadership supportive of the programme?
      - e. Who decides on the annual and term targets of the EPWP within the CTMM?
      - f. Do you think departments could do more to achieve their targets?
      - g. Are the current targets realistic for departments to achieve?
  - C. (Topic) Proposed Interventions for EPWP within the CTMM
    - 4. What is required to enable the CTMM to surpass their current targets?

- a. How should the CTMM leadership intervene to enable departments to perform above average with regard to EPWP targets?
- b. What can individual departments do in the immediate to perform above average?
- c. How do you think the CTMM is performing in comparison with other metros?
- d. What lessons should be learned from other metros implementing EPWP?
- e. In general, what other interventions/approaches do you propose for the CTMM to surpass its EPWP targets?

### **III. Closing**

#### **A. Summary**

B. (Maintain Rapport) I appreciate the time you took for this interview. Is there anything else you think would be helpful for me to know so that I can include in my study?

C. (Action to be taken) I should have all the information I need. Would it be alright to call you at your office if I have any more questions? Thanks again

## APPENDIX B: Questionnaire for CTMM EPWP Champions

### QUESTIONNAIRE ON THE EXPERIENCES OF DEPARTMENTAL CHAMPIONS IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF EPWP PROJECTS WITHIN THE CITY OF TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY

Respond to the following questions by putting an X on the relevant box in the right hand column that corresponds with your experiences (More than one category can be selected). In cases wherein you are requested to fill in the information in sentence format, kindly do so.

#### 1. BROAD UNDERSTANDING OF EPWP

Government programme to create work opportunities	
Skills programme	
Programme for the poor	
Safety Net programme	
If Other, please state:	

#### 2. PERCEIVED GENERAL EPWP BENEFITS FOR THE CITY AND SOUTH AFRICA

Creation of employment	
Skilling of the unskilled	
Earning of income by the poor	
Gaining of work experience by youth, woman, the disabled	
If Other, please state:	

#### 3. HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN THE CHAMPION FOR YOUR DEPARTMENT

Less than 3 yrs	
3-4 years	

#### 4. YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF HOW THE PROGRAMME IS IMPLEMENTED IN THE CITY

Individual Departments play a key role	
EPWP division determines targets for departments	
Office of the executive mayor determines term target	



5. LIST ANY CHALLENGES IN THE CITY'S IMPLEMENTATION APPROACH  
(sentence format)


6. HOW WOULD YOU LIKE TO SEE EPWP BEING IMPLEMENTED IN THE CITY IN CONTRAST TO THE CURRENT APPROACH (sentence format)


7. DOES YOUR DEPARTMENT HAVE A TRAINING PROGRAMME FOR EPWP PARTICIPANTS

Yes	
No	

8. If Yes, kindly indicate what it entails


9. If No, kindly indicate what in your opinion prevents this


10. LIST BENEFITS FOR PARTICIPANTS IN YOUR DEPARTMENT'S EPWP PROJECTS


11. ANY CHALLENGES REPORTED BY PARTICIPANTS IN YOUR EPWP PROJECTS? If yes, kindly list below


12. DOES YOUR DEPARTMENT DO DEBRIEFINGS WITH CONTRACTORS (THOSE WORKING ON PROJECTS HAVING EPWP BENEFICIARIES) ON EPWP

YES	
NO	

13. PLEASE INDICATE THE FREQUENCY OF MONITORING (FIELD VISITS) EPWP PROJECTS BY YOUR DEPARTMENT

Weekly	
Monthly	
None	

14. WHICH IS THE MAIN CHALLENGE THAT YOU ARE CURRENTLY EXPERIENCING IN YOUR EPWP PROJECTS

Training	
Working conditions	
Lack of EPWP branded working attire	
Nonpayment of wages on time	
Any other? Please state:	

## 15. SUGGESTED INTERVENTION TO DEAL WITH CHALLENGES

Focused, targeted & relevant training	
Amend the current implementation approach	
Creation of related sustainable projects	
Improvement/increase on daily wage	
Improved and visible monitoring of projects	
Any other? Please state:	

---

GENERAL COMMENTS:

---

---

---

---

## APPENDIX C: Questionnaire for CTMM EPWP Participants

### QUESTIONNAIRE ON THE PROFILE AND EXPERIENCES OF BENEFICIARIES PARTICIPATING IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY PROGRAMME

Respond to the following questions by putting an X on the relevant box in the right hand column that corresponds with your particulars

#### 1. QUALIFICATIONS

No formal qualification	
Matric	
Less than matric	
FET and higher	

#### 2. AGE

Less than 20 yrs	
21-25 yrs	
26-30 yrs	
31-35 yrs	
36-40 yrs	
41-45 yrs	
46-50 yrs	
51-56 yrs	
57 yrs and above	

#### 3. GENDER

Male	
Female	

#### 4. DISABILITY

Disabled	
No disability	

#### 5. HAVE YOU BEEN EMPLOYED BEFORE

Yes	
No	

#### 6. WAS EMPLOYMENT TEMPORARY OR PERMANENT

Temporary	
Permanent	

7. EPWP PROJECTS PARTICIPATED IN

1 project	
2 projects	
3 or more projects	

8. PERIOD ON CURRENT EPWP PROJECT

1-3 Months	
3-6 Months	
6-8 Months	

9. SKILLS GAINED ON EPWP PROJECT/S

Technical skills (e.g. pipe fitting, plumbing)	
Generic skills (e.g. communication, health & safety)	
None	

10. HAS YOUR PARTICIPATION ON THE PROJECT IMPROVED YOUR LIFE

YES	
NO	

11. IN WHICH WAYS HAS YOUR PARTICIPATION ON THE PROJECT IMPROVED YOUR LIFE (Can choose more than one option)

Use of income (buying clothes, furniture)	
Nutritional (eating food that could not be afforded before)	
Educational (children attending school than previously)	
Psychosocial (clothing, feeding children, participating in community activities)	

12. WHAT CHALLENGES ARE YOU CURRENTLY EXPERIENCING IN THE PROJECT

Training	
----------	--

Working conditions	
Lack of EPWP branded working attire	
Nonpayment of wages on time	
Any other? Please state:	

### 13. SUGGESTED INTERVENTION TO DEAL WITH CHALLENGES

Focused, targeted & relevant training	
Creation of related sustainable projects	
Improvement/increase on daily wage	
Improved and visible monitoring of projects	
Any other? Please state:	

---

COMMENTS:

---