

**THE DUTY TO PROSECUTE AND THE STATUS OF AMNESTIES GRANTED
FOR GROSS AND SYSTEMATIC HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS IN
INTERNATIONAL LAW: TOWARDS A BALANCED APPROACH MODEL**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Part I: Research Question, Terminology and Historical Analysis..... 1

Chapter One: Research Question, Nature and Scope of the Problem..... 1

1.	Introduction	1
1.2.	Nature and Scope of the Problem.....	2 - 11
1.3.	Purpose of, and Rationale for, the Study	11 - 12
1.4.	Existing and/or On-Going Research on Amnesty	13 - 18
1.5.	Limitations of the Study	18 - 19
1.6.	Outline of Chapters.....	19 - 20

Chapter Two: Conceptual Clarifications and the Meaning of Amnesty..... 21

2.	Introduction	21 - 22
2.1.	The Meaning of Amnesty	22 - 24
2.2.	Concepts Associated with Amnesty	24
2.2.1.	Amnesty and Impunity	24 - 26
2.2.2.	Amnesty and Statute of Limitations.....	26 -27
2.2.3.	Amnesty and Pardon.....	27 - 35
2.2.4.	A Working Definition of Amnesty.....	35 - 36
2.3.	Typology of Amnesty Laws	36 - 37
2.3.1.	Amnesty for Political Offences.....	37 - 39
2.3.2.	Amnesty for the Returning Exiles	39 - 40
2.3.3.	Amnesty as a Component of the Pre-Transitional Negotiation Process	40 - 41
2.3.4.	Amnesty for the Neutralisation, Demilitarization, Disarmament and Reintegration of Armed Opposition Groups	41 - 45
2.3.5.	Amnesty for Military Related Offences.....	45 - 46
2.3.6.	Self-Assumed/ Auto-Amnesties	46 - 48
2.4.	The Characterisation of Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations	48 - 52
2.4.1.	Elements of Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations	52 - 53
2.5.	Bridging the Gap between Human Rights and Humanitarian Law	53 - 56
2.6.	Conclusion.....	56 - 58

**Chapter Three: The Origin and Historical Development of Amnesty from
Antiquity to the Modern Era 59**

3.1.	Introduction	59
3.2.	The Origin of Amnesty in Antiquity	59 - 61
3.3.	The Roots of Amnesty in Biblical Times	61 - 62
3.4.	The Development of Amnesty in the Hellenic Civilisation	62
3.4.1.	War and Peace in the Homeric and Mycenaean Era	62 - 65
3.4.2.	Amnesty during the Period of the <i>Archonship</i>	65 - 66
3.4.3.	The Solonic Amnesty.....	66 - 67
3.4.4.	The Persian and Peloponnesian Wars 490 - 421 BC	67 - 68
3.4.5.	The Battle of <i>Aegospotami</i> 405 BC.....	68 - 69

3.4.6.	Amnesty and the Reconciliation Agreement of 403/402 B.C.	69 - 71
3.4.7.	The Amnesty of Alexander the Great	71-72
3.4.8.	Conclusion on the Evolution of Athenian Amnesties	72 - 73
3.5.	The Development of Amnesty in Other Ancient Civilisations	73
3.5.1.	Amnesty in the Chinese Civilisation	73 - 75
3.5.2.	Amnesty in the African Civilisation	76 - 80
3.6.	The Development of Amnesty through the Writings of Qualified Scholars of International Law	80 - 84
3.7.	The Relationship between Amnesty and State Sovereignty: The Development of Amnesty in Peace Treaties from Westphalia to Evian	84 - 89
3.7.1.	Amnesty in Treaties Signed between the Indian Tribes and the Government of United States of America	89 - 91
3.7.2.	The Anglo-Boer War (1899 – 1902)	91 - 96
3.8.	The Decline of Amnesty during the Post-First World War and Post-Second World War Period.....	96 - 98
3.9.	Amnesty as a Tool for Peacemaking during and after the Cold War	98 - 104
3.10.	Conclusion	104 - 106

Part II: The Duty to Prosecute Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations and the Status of Amnesties in International Law.....107

Chapter Four: Rethinking the Efficacy of Amnesty as a Tool for Peace and National Reconciliation in Transitional Democracies: Towards a Balanced Approach Model 107

4.1.	Introduction	107 - 108
4.2.	The Interface between Amnesty and Justice.....	109 - 110
4.3.	Tensions Raised by Amnesty and Justice	110 - 113
4.4.	Traditional Approaches to the Reconciliation of Amnesty and Justice	113
4.4.1.	Idealist Approach.....	113 - 119
4.4.2.	Realist Approach.....	119 - 128
4.5.	Re-Assessment of the Idealist and Realist Approaches to Amnesty and Justice	129
4.5.1.	The Changing Nature of Contemporary Armed Conflicts	129
4.5.2.	Restorative Justice as an Expression of Political Elitism.....	130 - 131
4.5.3.	Prosecutions as one Aspect of a Larger Scheme of Possible Interventions	131 -133
4.5.4.	Practical Realities Facing a State Emerging from Past Atrocities	133 -136
4.6.	Constituent Elements of the Balanced Approach Model	136 -137
4.6.1.	Amnesty as a Product of a Legitimate and Home-Grown Political Peace Process	137 - 138
4.6.2.	Amnesty must be Proportional and Rationally Connected to the Peace Process.	138 - 140
4.6.3.	Prosecution shall be Pursued if it is in the Interests of Justice to do so.....	140-141
4.6.4.	A State Granting a General Amnesty must demonstrate a Commitment to Fulfil Human Rights and other International Law Obligations.....	141 - 142
4.5.	Conclusion	142 - 144

Chapter Five: The Duty to Prosecute and the Limitation of State Powers to Grant Amnesty in Treaty Law and Customary International Law..... 145

5.1.	Introduction	145 - 151
5.2.	Amnesty in General International Human Rights Treaties	151 - 152
5.2.1.	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.....	152 - 157
5.2.2.	The Inter-American Convention on Human Rights	158 - 160

5.2.3.	The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights.....	160 - 163
5.2.4.	The Constitutive Act of the African Union.....	163 - 165
5.2.5.	The AU Peer Review Mechanism and the Balanced Approach Model Compared.....	165 - 169
5.2.6.	Conclusion on General Human Rights Instruments.....	169 - 170
5.3.	Amnesty in Specific Human Rights Instruments	170 - 172
5.3.1.	The Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide	172 - 174
5.3.2.	The Convention on the Non-Applicability of Statutory Limitation to War Crimes and Crimes against Humanity	174 - 177
5.3.3.	The Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid.	177-180
5.3.4.	The Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment	180 - 184
5.4.	Amnesty in Humanitarian Law Instruments	185
5.4.1.	The Four Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949	185 - 186
5.4.2.	A Critique of Article 6(5) of the 1977 Additional Protocol II	187 - 191
5.5.	Amnesty in other International Law Instruments	191
5.5.1.	The Rome Statute and the Amnesty Debate	191 - 197
5.6.	Amnesty and Customary International Law	197 - 198
5.6.1.	State Practice under Customary International Law	198 - 201
5.6.2.	<i>Opinio Juris</i> under Customary International Law	201 - 203
5.7.	Conclusion	203 - 206

**Chapter Six: The Practice of the United Nations in the Development of the
Jurisprudence on Amnesties Granted for Gross and Systematic Human Rights
Violations** 207

6.1.	Introduction	207 - 208
6.2.	The History of the United Nations in the Development of the Jurisprudence on Amnesties	208 - 210
6.3.	The Practice of the Principal Organs of the United Nations	210
6.3.1.	The United Nations Security Council	210 - 218
6.3.2.	The United Nations General Assembly	218 - 222
6.3.3.	The United Nations Economic and Social Council	222 - 227
6.3.4.	The International Court of Justice	227 - 230
6.3.5.	The United Nations Secretary-General	230 - 232
6.4.	Specialised Agencies of the United Nations	232
6.4.1.	The United Nations International Law Commission.....	232 - 234
6.4.2.	The United Nations International Criminal Tribunals for the former Yugoslavia and Rwanda.....	235 - 237
6.4.3.	The Interim United Nations Civilian Administration in East Timor.....	237 - 240
6.4.4.	The Office of the United Nations Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children in Armed Conflicts	240 - 241
6.5.	Conclusion	241 - 243

**Part III: The Balanced Approach Model in Practice: A Comparative Study
of two African Conflicts** 244

**Chapter Seven: In Search of Justice and Social Reconstruction: Amnesty and
the Duty to Prosecute in Sierra Leone** 244

7.1.	Historical Background to the Conflict in Sierra Leone.....	244 - 247
7.2.	Peace at all Costs? Amnesty and the Abidjan Peace Accord.	247 - 249
7.3.	Amnesty and the ECOWAS Six-Month Plan for Sierra Leone	249 - 253
7.4.	The Amnesty Provision in the Lomè Peace Agreement and the Reaction of the International Community	254 - 255
7.4.1.	The Constitutionality of the Amnesty Provision.	256 - 257
7.4.2.	Amnesty and the Pursuit of Political Objectives	257 - 258
7.4.3.	The International Law Status of the Amnesty Provision	258 - 261
7.4.4.	The Response of the United Nations to the Amnesty in the Lomè Agreement	261 - 265
7.5.	The Special Court and the Question of Resources	265 - 267
7.6.	Amnesty and the Jurisdiction of the Special Court for Sierra Leone	267 - 270
7.7.	Reparations and the Reconciliation Function of the Sierra Leone Truth and Reconciliation Commission	270 - 273
7.8.	The Balanced Approach Model in the Special Court and the TRC: is Amnesty Still an Option?	273 - 275
7.9.	Conclusion	275 - 276

**Chapter Eight: A Ten-Year Review of South Africa’s Amnesty Process:
Towards a Template for the Balanced Approach Model**..... 277

8.1.	Introduction	277 - 279
8.2.	The History and Early Genesis of the Amnesty Process in South Africa ..	279 - 281
8.3.	The 1990 and 1992 Indemnity Legislation	281 - 284
8.4.	The ANC and its Human Rights Abuses	284 - 286
8.5.	The Kempton Park Constitutional Deal and the Basis for the Granting of Amnesty	286 - 289
8.6.	The Constitutional Framework of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission and the Amnesty Process.....	289 - 291
8.6.1.	Objectives of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC)	291 - 292
8.6.2.	The Human Rights Violations Committee	292 - 293
8.6.3.	Victims and the Procedure of the Reparations and Rehabilitation Committee	293 - 295
8.6.4.	Do Victims have a Right to Reparations under the Act?	295 - 297
8.6.5.	Perpetrators and the Amnesty Procedure	298 - 300
8.7.	The Constitutionality of the Amnesty Provisions	300 - 304
8.7.1.	The Meaning of the Word “Amnesty” as Used in the Postamble.....	304 - 306
8.7.2.	Amnesty and International Law	306 - 308
8.8.	Amnesty and the Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission.	308 - 312
8.9.	Reparations as a <i>Quid Pro Quo</i> for the Granting of Amnesty	312 - 316
8.10.	Corporate Amnesty or Amnesty through the Back-Door of the Presidential Pardon?	316 - 319
8.11.	The Extraterritorial Application of Amnesty for Apartheid Related Crimes	319 - 326
8.12.	Conclusion	326 - 328

Chapter Nine: Conclusions and Recommendations	329
9.1. Introduction	329 - 330
9.2. Conclusions	330 - 336
9.3. Recommendations	336 - 340
9.4. A Protocol on Amnesty? The Case for Policy Guidelines on Amnesties Granted for Gross Human Rights Violations	340 - 349
9.5. Guidelines Regarding Amnesties Granted for Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations in International Law	349 - 355
9.6. Conclusion: Commentary on the Guidelines.....	355 - 358
 Bibliography	 359 - 396
 Appendix A: Natal Amnesty Proclamation of 12 March 1903	 397 - 398
 Appendix B: Agreement for Granting Temporary Immunity for Armed Conflict Related Crimes in Burundi and between the Transitional Government of Burundi and the CNDD-FDD, Pretoria, South Africa, 2 November 2003	 399 - 403
 Appendix C: Amnesty Public Notice by the Administrator of the Coalition Provisional Authority in Iraq, Paul Bremer III of 19 December 2004	 404
 Appendix D: Amnesty Law No. 2 for 2004 Passed by the Iraqi Transitional Government of Prime Minister, Iyad Allawi on 7 August 2004	 405 - 406

List of Abbreviations¹

ANC	African National Congress
APRM	African Peer Review Mechanism
AU	African Union
BCLR	<i>Butterworths Constitutional Law Reports</i>
CC	Constitutional Court of South Africa
<i>Cf.</i>	Compare with
chp(s)	Chapter/Chapters
CTS	<i>Consolidated Treaty Series</i>
e.g.	for example
ed./eds.	editor/editors
<i>et al.</i>	<i>et alia</i> /and others
etc.	<i>etcetera</i> , and the rest, and so on
<i>et seq.</i>	<i>et sequential</i> /and the following (pages)
FC	Final Constitution of South Africa Act 108 of 1996
GA	General Assembly
HL	Humanitarian Law
i.e.	<i>id est</i> / that is (to say)
<i>Id.</i>	<i>idem</i> , immediately above (the same author)
<i>Ibid.</i>	<i>ibidem</i> , in the same place (immediately preceding footnote)
ff.	following pages
IC	Interim Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 200 of 1993
ICC	International Criminal Court
ILM	<i>International Legal Materials</i>
NGO	non-governmental organisation
NEPAD	The New Partnership for Africa's Development

¹ Titles of journals have been cited in full throughout the text.

NP	National Party of South Africa
para/paras	paragraph/ paragraphs
<i>supra</i>	above
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
trans.	Translated
UN	United Nations
UNTS	<i>United Nations Treaty Series</i>
UNTAET	United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor
vo1./vols.	volume/volumes

