THE DUTY TO PROSECUTE AND THE STATUS OF AMNESTIES GRANTED FOR GROSS AND SYSTEMATIC HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW: TOWARDS A BALANCED APPROACH MODEL

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Part I: Research Question, Terminology and Historical Analysis ........................................... 1

Chapter One: Research Question, Nature and Scope of the Problem ................................. 1

1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1
1.2. Nature and Scope of the Problem .......................................................................... 2 - 11
1.3. Purpose of, and Rationale for, the Study .............................................................. 11 - 12
1.4. Existing and/or On-Going Research on Amnesty .................................................. 13 - 18
1.5. Limitations of the Study ......................................................................................... 18 - 19
1.6. Outline of Chapters ............................................................................................... 19 - 20

Chapter Two: Conceptual Clarifications and the Meaning of Amnesty ......................... 21

2. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 21 - 22
2.1. The Meaning of Amnesty ....................................................................................... 22 - 24
2.2. Concepts Associated with Amnesty ......................................................................... 24
2.2.1. Amnesty and Impunity ...................................................................................... 24 - 26
2.2.2. Amnesty and Statute of Limitations .................................................................. 26 - 27
2.2.3. Amnesty and Pardon ......................................................................................... 27 - 35
2.2.4. A Working Definition of Amnesty ................................................................. 35 - 36
2.3. Typology of Amnesty Laws .................................................................................... 36 - 37
2.3.1. Amnesty for Political Offences ......................................................................... 37 - 39
2.3.2. Amnesty for the Returning Exiles ................................................................. 39 - 40
2.3.3. Amnesty as a Component of the Pre-Transitional Negotiation Process .......... 40 - 41
2.3.4. Amnesty for the Neutralisation, Demilitarization, Disarmament and Reintegration of Armed Opposition Groups .......................................................... 41 - 45
2.3.5. Amnesty for Military Related Offences .......................................................... 45 - 46
2.3.6. Self-Assumed/ Auto-Amnesties ......................................................................... 46 - 48
2.4. The Characterisation of Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations .......... 48 - 52
2.4.1. Elements of Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations ....................... 52 - 53
2.5. Bridging the Gap between Human Rights and Humanitarian Law .................... 53 - 56
2.6. Conclusion .............................................................................................................. 56 - 58

Chapter Three: The Origin and Historical Development of Amnesty from Antiquity to the Modern Era ................................................. 59

3.1. Introduction ............................................................................................................. 59
3.2. The Origin of Amnesty in Antiquity ...................................................................... 59 - 61
3.3. The Roots of Amnesty in Biblical Times ............................................................... 61 - 62
3.4. The Development of Amnesty in the Hellenic Civilisation .................................. 62
3.4.1. War and Peace in the Homeric and Mycenean Era ....................................... 62 - 65
3.4.2. Amnesty during the Period of the Arhonship ............................................... 65 - 66
3.4.3. The Solonic Amnesty ....................................................................................... 66 - 67
3.4.4. The Persian and Peloponnesian Wars 490 - 421 BC .................................. 67 - 68
3.4.5. The Battle of Aegospotami 405 BC ............................................................... 68 - 69
3.4.6. Amnesty and the Reconciliation Agreement of 403/402 B.C. ......................69 - 71
3.4.7. The Amnesty of Alexander the Great .........................................................71-72
3.4.8. Conclusion on the Evolution of Athenian Amnesties ................................. 72 - 73
3.5. The Development of Amnesty in Other Ancient Civilisations ......................... 73
3.5.1. Amnesty in the Chinese Civilisation ............................................................. 73 - 75
3.5.2. Amnesty in the African Civilisation .............................................................. 76 - 80
3.6. The Development of Amnesty through the Writings of Qualified Scholars of International Law ................................................................. 80 - 84
3.7. The Relationship between Amnesty and State Sovereignty: The Development of Amnesty in Peace Treaties from Westphalia to Evian ......84 - 89
3.7.1. Amnesty in Treaties Signed between the Indian Tribes and the Government of United States of America ......................................................... 89 - 91
3.7.2. The Anglo-Boer War (1899 – 1902) ............................................................ 91 - 96
3.8. The Decline of Amnesty during the Post-First World War and Post-Second World War Period ................................................................................. 96 - 98
3.9. Amnesty as a Tool for Peacemaking during and after the Cold War ............98 - 104
3.10. Conclusion ................................................................................................ 104 - 106

Part II: The Duty to Prosecute Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations and the Status of Amnesties in International Law ..................................................107

Chapter Four: Rethinking the Efficacy of Amnesty as a Tool for Peace and National Reconciliation in Transitional Democracies: Towards a Balanced Approach Model .............................................. 107

4.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................107 - 108
4.2. The Interface between Amnesty and Justice .............................................. 109 - 110
4.3. Tensions Raised by Amnesty and Justice .................................................. 110 - 113
4.4. Traditional Approaches to the Reconciliation of Amnesty and Justice .......... 113
4.4.1. Idealist Approach ....................................................................................... 113 - 119
4.4.2. Realist Approach ...................................................................................... 119 - 128
4.5. Re-Assessment of the Idealist and Realist Approaches to Amnesty and Justice 129
4.5.1. The Changing Nature of Contemporary Armed Conflicts ....................... 129
4.5.2. Restorative Justice as an Expression of Political Elitism ......................... 130 - 131
4.5.3. Prosecutions as one Aspect of a Larger Scheme of Possible Interventions 131 - 133
4.5.4. Practical Realities Facing a State Emerging from Past Atrocities .......... 133 -136
4.6. Constituent Elements of the Balanced Approach Model ...........................136 -137
4.6.2. Amnesty must be Proportional and Rationally Connected to the Peace Process. ..................................................................................138 - 140
4.6.3. Prosecution shall be Pursued if it is in the Interests of Justice to do so......140-141
4.6.4. A State Granting a General Amnesty must demonstrate a Commitment to Fulfil Human Rights and other International Law Obligations ..........141 - 142
4.5. Conclusion ................................................................................................ 142 - 144

Chapter Five: The Duty to Prosecute and the Limitation of State Powers to Grant Amnesty in Treaty Law and Customary International Law .............................. 145

5.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................145 - 151
5.2. Amnesty in General International Human Rights Treaties ........................ 151 - 152
5.2.1. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights ...................... 152 - 157
5.2.2. The Inter-American Convention on Human Rights ................................. 158 - 160
5.2.3. The African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights ................................ 160 - 163
5.2.4. The Constitutive Act of the African Union ........................................ 163 - 165
5.2.5. The AU Peer Review Mechanism and the Balanced Approach Model Compared .................................................. 165 - 169
5.2.6. Conclusion on General Human Rights Instruments ........................... 169 - 170
5.3. Amnesty in Specific Human Rights Instruments .................................... 170 - 172
5.3.1. The Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide .............................................................................................................. 172 - 174
5.3.2. The Convention on the Non-Applicability of Statutory Limitation to War Crimes and Crimes against Humanity ........................................................................ 174 - 177
5.3.3. The Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid ........................................................................................................... 177 - 180
5.3.4. The Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment .............................................................................. 180 - 184
5.4. Amnesty in Humanitarian Law Instruments ............................................ 185
5.4.1. The Four Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949 ............................ 185 - 186
5.4.2. A Critique of Article 6(5) of the 1977 Additional Protocol II ............... 187 - 191
5.5. Amnesty in other International Law Instruments ..................................... 191
5.5.1. The Rome Statute and the Amnesty Debate ........................................ 191 - 197
5.6. Amnesty and Customary International Law .......................................... 197 - 198
5.6.1. State Practice under Customary International Law ............................ 198 - 201
5.6.2. Opinio Juris under Customary International Law ............................ 201 - 203
5.7. Conclusion ......................................................................................... 203 - 206


6.1. Introduction ...................................................................................... 207 - 208
6.2. The History of the United Nations in the Development of the Jurisprudence on Amnesties ................................................................. 208 - 210
6.3. The Practice of the Principal Organs of the United Nations ................. 210
6.3.1. The United Nations Security Council ............................................. 210 - 218
6.3.2. The United Nations General Assembly .......................................... 218 - 222
6.3.3. The United Nations Economic and Social Council ......................... 222 - 227
6.3.4. The International Court of Justice .................................................. 227 - 230
6.3.5. The United Nations Secretary-General .......................................... 230 - 232
6.4. Specialised Agencies of the United Nations ........................................ 232
6.4.1. The United Nations International Law Commission ...................... 232 - 234
6.4.2. The United Nations International Criminal Tribunals for the former Yugoslavia and Rwanda ................................................................. 235 - 237
6.4.3. The Interim United Nations Civilian Administration in East Timor .... 237 - 240
6.4.4. The Office of the United Nations Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children in Armed Conflicts .................................................... 240 - 241
6.5. Conclusion ...................................................................................... 241 - 243
Part III: The Balanced Approach Model in Practice: A Comparative Study of two African Conflicts ........................................................................................................... 244

Chapter Seven: In Search of Justice and Social Reconstruction: Amnesty and the Duty to Prosecute in Sierra Leone ................................................................. 244

7.1. Historical Background to the Conflict in Sierra Leone............................... 244 - 247
7.2. Peace at all Costs? Amnesty and the Abidjan Peace Accord .................... 247 - 249
7.3. Amnesty and the ECOWAS Six-Month Plan for Sierra Leone ............... 249 - 253
7.4. The Amnesty Provision in the Lomé Peace Agreement and the Reaction of the International Community ............................................................... 254 - 255
7.4.1. The Constitutionality of the Amnesty Provision .................................... 256 - 257
7.4.2. Amnesty and the Pursuit of Political Objectives ................................... 257 - 258
7.4.3. The International Law Status of the Amnesty Provision ....................... 258 - 261
7.4.4. The Response of the United Nations to the Amnesty in the Lomé Agreement ................................................................................................. 261 - 265
7.5. The Special Court and the Question of Resources ..................................... 265 - 267
7.6. Amnesty and the Jurisdiction of the Special Court for Sierra Leone .......... 267 - 270
7.7. Reparations and the Reconciliation Function of the Sierra Leone Truth and Reconciliation Commission ............................................................ 270 - 273
7.8. The Balanced Approach Model in the Special Court and the TRC: is Amnesty Still an Option? ................................................................. 273 - 275
7.9. Conclusion .................................................................................................. 275 - 276

Chapter Eight: A Ten-Year Review of South Africa’s Amnesty Process: Towards a Template for the Balanced Approach Model ...................................................... 277

8.1. Introduction .................................................................................................. 277 - 279
8.2. The History and Early Genesis of the Amnesty Process in South Africa .. 279 - 281
8.3. The 1990 and 1992 Indemnity Legislation ................................................ 281 - 284
8.4. The ANC and its Human Rights Abuses .................................................... 284 - 286
8.5. The Kempton Park Constitutional Deal and the Basis for the Granting of Amnesty ................................................................................................ 286 - 289
8.6.1. Objectives of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) ............ 291 - 292
8.6.2. The Human Rights Violations Committee ............................................... 292 - 293
8.6.3. Victims and the Procedure of the Reparations and Rehabilitation Committee ................................................................. 293 - 295
8.6.4. Do Victims have a Right to Reparations under the Act? ....................... 295 - 297
8.6.5. Perpetrators and the Amnesty Procedure ................................................. 298 - 300
8.7. The Constitutionality of the Amnesty Provisions ...................................... 300 - 304
8.7.1. The Meaning of the Word “Amnesty” as Used in the Postamble ............ 304 - 306
8.7.2. Amnesty and International Law ............................................................... 306 - 308
8.9. Reparations as a *Quid Pro Quo* for the Granting of Amnesty .................. 312 - 316
8.10. Corporate Amnesty or Amnesty through the Back-Door of the Presidential Pardon? .......................................................................................... 316 - 319
8.11. The Extraterritorial Application of Amnesty for Apartheid Related Crimes ................................................................. 319 - 326
8.12. Conclusion .................................................................................................. 326 - 328
Chapter Nine: Conclusions and Recommendations ........................................... 329

9.1. Introduction ................................................................................................ 329 - 330
9.2. Conclusions ............................................................................................... 330 - 336
9.3. Recommendations ..................................................................................... 336 - 340
9.5. Guidelines Regarding Amnesties Granted for Gross and Systematic Human Rights Violations in International Law ........................................... 349 - 355
9.6. Conclusion: Commentary on the Guidelines ............................................. 355 - 358

Bibliography ........................................................................................................ 359 - 396

Appendix A: Natal Amnesty Proclamation of 12 March 1903 ....................... 397 - 398

Appendix B: Agreement for Granting Temporary Immunity for Armed Conflict Related Crimes in Burundi and between the Transitional Government of Burundi and the CNDD-FDD, Pretoria, South Africa, 2 November 2003 .......................................................... 399 - 403

Appendix C: Amnesty Public Notice by the Administrator of the Coalition Provisional Authority in Iraq, Paul Bremer III of 19 December 2004 ................................................................. 404

Appendix D: Amnesty Law No. 2 for 2004 Passed by the Iraqi Transitional Government of Prime Minister, Iyad Allawi on 7 August 2004 ................................................................. 405 - 406
**List of Abbreviations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APRM</td>
<td>African Peer Review Mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AU</td>
<td>African Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCLR</td>
<td><em>Butterworths Constitutional Law Reports</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC</td>
<td>Constitutional Court of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cf.</td>
<td>Compare with</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chp(s)</td>
<td>Chapter/Chapters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTS</td>
<td><em>Consolidated Treaty Series</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.g.</td>
<td>for example</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ed./eds.</td>
<td>editor/editors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>et al.</em></td>
<td>*et alia/*and others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>etc.</td>
<td><em>etcetera</em>, and the rest, and so on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>et seq.</em></td>
<td><em>et sequential</em>/and the following (pages)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FC</td>
<td>Final Constitution of South Africa Act 108 of 1996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GA</td>
<td>General Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HL</td>
<td>Humanitarian Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.e.</td>
<td><em>id est</em>/that is (to say)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Id.</em></td>
<td><em>idem</em>, immediately above (the same author)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ibid.</em></td>
<td><em>ibidem</em>, in the same place (immediately preceding footnote)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ff.</td>
<td>following pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IC</td>
<td>Interim Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 200 of 1993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>International Criminal Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILM</td>
<td><em>International Legal Materials</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>non-governmental organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEPAD</td>
<td>The New Partnership for Africa’s Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1 Titles of journals have been cited in full throughout the text.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NP</td>
<td>National Party of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>para/paras</td>
<td>paragraph/ paragraphs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>supra</td>
<td>above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRC</td>
<td>Truth and Reconciliation Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>trans.</td>
<td>Translated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNTS</td>
<td>United Nations Treaty Series</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNTAET</td>
<td>United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vol./vols.</td>
<td>volume/volumes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>