

DECLARATION

I declare that MORE THAN A PASSOVER: INCULTURATION IN THE SUPPER NARRATIVES OF THE NEW TESTAMENT is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

Fergus John King

ABSTRACT

This thesis examines whether the theological method currently known as inculturation was used in the Supper Narratives of the New Testament. A methodology is set up in which texts are examined against the backdrop of Graeco-Roman, Judaic and early Christian cultures. This methodology focusses on family resemblances and analogies, rather than genealogy or causal dependence to examine the links between text and context. It also avoids claims for orthodoxy dependent on claims about origins.

Engaging with the claims of writers from Schweitzer, through Jeremias and up to the present, three themes are identified: meals, sacrifice and eschatology. The manifestations of each are examined against the three cultural groups: Judaic, Graeco-Roman and early Christian.

The Supper Narratives (Mk 14:12-26, Matt. 26:17-30 and Luke 22:7-23 and 1 Cor 11:17-34) are then mapped against these themes. Analogies to the cultural groups are then traced.

This process leads to conclusions that the New Testament writers did use a methodology which can be identified as inculturation. It manifests itself particularly through patterns identified by anthropologists as *bricolage* and re-accentuation. A notable example is “sacrificialisation”, in which events and items are invested with a fresh sacrificial significance. Judaic concepts (e.g., covenant and Atonement) and rituals (e.g., sacramentals and Passover) dominate the interpretations of Jesus’ last meal with his disciples. This does not mean that inculturation only took place in relation to Jewish culture. Many of the concepts used (e.g., sacrifice and sacrament) share commonalities with Graeco-Roman thought which allows them to engage with such world-views. This process sees Judaic understandings used as correctives to Graeco-Roman thinking about sacraments. It also sees Jewish concepts used to address Graeco-Roman values, and give an added historical depth (*antiquitas*) to a comparatively recent event.

KEYWORDS

Inculturation*sacrifice*eschatology*ritual meals*

Second Temple Judaism*Graeco-Roman philosophy and religion*

New Testament Last Supper Narratives*

bricolage*re-accentuation* sacrificilisation* *symbolism*

sacramentalism

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1: Introduction.....	1
1.1. Preamble.....	1
1.2. A Less-Trod Path: The Text Itself as Evidence for Missionary Theology.....	1
1.2.1 Unity and Diversity: The Supper Narratives and the Synoptic Question.....	3
1.2.2 Reconstructing Ritual: The Problem With Texts (1): A Sense of Proportion..	4
1.2.3 Reconstructing Ritual: The Problem With Texts (2): Unity & Diversity.....	6
1.3. New Testament Scholarship: Methodological Issues.....	7
1.3.1. The “History Of Religion” Approach: Culture and Ideology.....	7
1.3.2. The “History Of Religion” Approach: Culture and Ideology.....	8
1.3.3. Ideological Assumptions (2): Interpreting Contexts.....	11
1.3.4. Studying without “Orthodoxy”: Family Resemblances & Re-accentuation.....	13
1.3.4.1. “Orthodoxy”.....	14
1.3.4.2. “Family Resemblances”.....	14
1.3.4.3. “Mapping” Family Resemblances.....	15
1.3.4.4. “Mapping” and Generalisations.....	15
1.3.4.5. Family Resemblances and Genealogy.....	16
1.3.4.6. Mapping without Genealogy: “Re-accentuation”.....	17
1.3.4.7. Mapping without “Genealogy”: <i>Bricolage</i>	18
1.3.5. Form Criticism & The Criterion of Dissimilarity.....	19
1.3.6. Redaction Criticism and the Relationship between Texts.....	20
1.3.7. Methodological Issues: A Summary.....	22
1.4. The Shape of This Thesis.....	22
1.4.1. Chapter 2: What is “Inculturation”?.....	22
1.4.2. Analysing the Context of the Supper Narratives.....	23
1.4.2.1. Chapter 3: Meal Traditions in the New Testament Period.....	24
1.4.2.2. Chapter 4: Body, Blood, Sacrifice and Communion.....	24
1.4.2.3. Chapter 5: Eschatology in the New Testament Period.....	24
1.4.3. Recapitulation.....	25
1.4.4. Detailed Analysis of the Supper Narratives.....	25
1.4.4.1. Chapter 6: Meal Traditions and the Supper Narratives.....	25
1.4.4.2. Chapter 7: Sayings and the Supper Narratives.....	25
1.4.4.3. Chapter 8: The Pauline “Lord’s Supper”.....	26
1.4.5. Chapter 9: Summary of Findings.....	26
Chapter 2: What Is “Inculturation”?.....	32
2.1. Introduction.....	32
2.2. “Culture”	33
2.2.1. “High” Culture.....	33
2.2.2. An Anthropological Definition: “Cultural Evolutionism”.....	33
2.2.3. Criticism of “Cultural Evolutionism”.....	34
2.2.4. Culture and Kultur.....	35
2.2.5. Beyond “High Culture”.....	36
2.2.6. “Culture” in the late 20 th Century	36
2.2.7. A Final Definition of “Culture”.....	40
2.3.Theology, Culture and Meaning.....	41
2.3.1. Faith.....	41
2.3.2. Interpretation.....	42
2.3.3. Gadamer: Understanding & The “Fusion of Horizons”.....	43

2.3.4. Bultmann: Interpreter and Process.....	44
2.3.5. Culture as the Foundation of Pre-understanding.....	44
2.3.6. The Role of Culture in Theological Discourse.....	45
2.3.7. Attitudes to Culture In Theology.....	45
2.3.8. One Theologian, One Attitude?.....	47
2.3.9. Conclusions.....	49
2.4. "Inculcation".....	49
2.4.1. Inculcation: Historical Precedents.....	49
2.4.2. Inculcation:	52
2.4.2.1. What's In A Name? : "Accommodation".....	52
2.4.2.2. What's In A Name? : "Contextualisation".....	53
2.4.2.3. What's In A Name? : "Incarnation".....	53
2.4.2.4. What's In A Name? : Inculcation.....	54
2.4.3. Criticisms of "Inculcation".....	54
2.4.4. Inculcation As A Two-Way Process.....	56
2.4.5. Inculcation & Intraculturation.....	57
2.4.6. Who Incultures?.....	58
2.4.7. Inculcation and Osmosis.....	59
2.4.8. What is Inculcated?.....	59
2.4.9. The Receiving Cultures of the Supper Narratives.....	62
2.4.9.1. The Context of 1 Cor.....	63
2.4.9.2. The Context of Mk.....	63
2.4.9.3. The Context of Matt.....	64
2.4.9.4. The Context of Luke.....	64
2.5. Inculcation: A Lukan Starting-Point?.....	65
Chapter 3: Meal Traditions In the New Testament Period.....	72
3.1. Introduction.....	72
3.1.1. Eating and Meals.....	72
3.2. Graeco-Roman Meals.....	73
3.2.1. The Greek <i>Symposium</i>	74
3.2.2. The Roman <i>Convivium</i>	75
3.2.3. The Literary Symposium Tradition.....	76
3.2.4. Eating Outside the Home: Guilds and Clubs.....	78
3.2.5. Meals in a Religious Context.....	79
3.2.6. "Eating with the Gods": <i>Theoxenia</i> and <i>Lectisternium</i>	80
3.2.7. Meals for Heroes and Meals for the Dead.....	81
3.2.8. Meals and Mystery Religions.....	82
3.2.8.1. The Eleusinian Mysteries.....	83
3.2.8.2. The Dionysiac Mysteries.....	84
3.2.8.3. The Mithraic Cult.....	85
3.2.8.4. Attis- Adonis.....	86
3.2.8.5. The Imperial Mysteries.....	86
3.2.9. Religious Meals at Corinth.....	86
3.2.9.1. Bookidis: Archaeological Evidence.....	87
3.2.9.2. "Idol-meats".....	87
3.2.9.3. Fotopoulos: Eating With Which Deity?.....	88
3.2.9.4. Kennedy: Meals for the Dead.....	88
3.2.10. Graeco-Roman meals: A Summary.....	89
3.3. Jewish Meals.....	90
3.3.1. Jewish Meal Practice: Not Unique.....	90
3.3.1.1. Overlaps with Graeco-Roman Practice.....	90
3.3.1.2. "Religious Meals".....	91
3.3.2. The Passover.....	91

3.3.2.1. Passover In The Pentateuch.....	92
3.3.2.2. The Deuteronomic Reforms.....	92
3.3.2.3. Passover in Second Temple Judaism.....	92
3.3.2.4. Passover in the 1 st Century CE.....	93
3.3.3. Jewish Festival Meals (<i>Qiddus</i>).....	94
3.3.4. Fellowship Meals (<i>Chaburah</i>).....	95
3.3.5. Tôdâ Meals.....	97
3.3.6. Qumran/Essene Meals.....	98
3.3.6.1. Sources for Qumran/Essene Meals.....	99
3.3.7. <i>Joseph & Aseneth</i>	104
3.3.7.1. The Meal in <i>Joseph & Aseneth</i>	104
3.3.7.2. Similarities to the Qumran/Essene Meal.....	105
3.3.7.3. The Meal as Heavenly Food.....	106
3.3.7.4. Differences from the Qumran/Essene Traditions.....	106
3.3.7.5. The <i>Therapeutai</i>	107
3.3.8. Jewish Meals: A Summary.....	108
 3.4. Early Christian Tradition	108
3.4.1. The Meals of Jesus.....	110
3.4.2. <i>Acts</i>	111
3.4.3. <i>1 Corinthians</i>	112
3.4.4. <i>The Didache</i>	113
3.4.3.1. Date & Provenance	114
3.4.3.2. Similarities to Jewish Meal Traditions.....	115
3.4.3.3. One Meal or Two?.....	115
3.4.3.4. The <i>Didache</i> and the New Testament.....	116
3.4.5. Feeding Miracles.....	117
3.4.6. Symbolic Prototypes.....	117
3.4.7. Early Christian Meals: A Summary.....	117
 3.5. Concluding Remarks.....	118
 Chapter 4: Body, Blood, Sacrifice and Communion.....	129
 4.1 Introduction.....	130
 4.2. Sacrifice: Jewish Understandings.....	130
4.2.1. Kinship & Political Sacrifices.....	130
4.2.2. <i>Selamim</i> (Communion Meals) & ‘Olah (Burnt Offerings).....	131
4.2.3. In Imitation of God: Sacrifice & Purity.....	132
4.2.4. The Atonement.....	133
4.2.4.1. The Scapegoat as Sacrifice.....	134
4.2.4.2. <i>Yom Kippur</i> in the Qumran/Essene Nexus.....	135
4.2.5. The Mechanics of Atonement.....	136
4.2.5.1. Expiation and Propitiation: The Right Terms?.....	136
4.2.5.2. Atonement as “Renewal”.....	136
4.2.5.3. Atonement: Repairing the Covenant.....	137
4.2.5.4. Repairing the Covenant: The Temple & Blood.....	138
4.2.5.5. Blood as Detergent.....	138
4.2.6. Beyond the Temple: Covenantal Purity in the Second Temple Period.....	140
4.2.6.1. ”Replacing” the Temple: Pharisaism.....	141
4.2.6.2. Beyond the Temple: the Qumran/Essene Nexus.....	142
4.2.6.3. Beyond the Temple: The Deaths of the Martyrs.....	142
4.2.7. Anamnesis: Sacrifice as “Remembering”.....	143
4.2.8. Sacrifice and Sacramentals.....	144
4.2.8.1. Spiritual Food.....	145
4.2.8.2. Is Spiritual Food Sacramental?.....	145
4.2.8.3. <i>Sacramentals</i> , not Sacraments.....	145
4.2.9. Sacrifice, “Spiritualisation” and “Sacrificialisation”.....	146

4.2.10. Jewish Understandings of Sacrifice: A Summary.....	148
4.3. Sacrifice: Graeco-Roman Understandings.....	148
4.3.1. Sacrifice and Holocaust.....	150
4.3.2. The Purposes of Sacrifice.....	151
4.3.3. Sacrifice as Communion.....	153
4.3.4. Sacrifice and the Mystery Religions.....	153
4.3.4.1. The Mysteries: Sarapis/Osiris/Isis.....	154
4.3.4.2. The Mysteries: Eleusis.....	135
4.3.4.3. The Mysteries: Dionysus/Bacchus.....	156
4.3.4.4. The Mysteries: Mithras.....	157
4.3.4.5. The Mysteries: Cybele.....	158
4.3.4.6. The Mysteries: Orphism.....	159
4.3.5. The Mysteries: Sacramental Rites?.....	160
4.3.6. The Greek “Scapegoat”.....	160
4.3.7. Meals for the Dead.....	161
4.3.8. Magic.....	162
4.3.9. A Summary of Graeco-Roman Sacrifice.....	164
4.4. Christian Understandings of Sacrifice.....	165
4.4.1. The “Sin Offering”.....	166
4.4.2. The Passover Sacrifice.....	166
4.4.3. The Letter to the Hebrews.....	167
4.4.3.1. The Atonement.....	168
4.4.3.2. Melchizedek.....	170
4.4.4. The Use of Blood.....	171
4.4.5. Manna.....	171
4.4.6. Sacramentals and <i>John</i>	172
4.4.7. Sacramentalism in Paul.....	175
4.4.8. A Christian Meal for the Dead?.....	176
4.4.9. <i>Anamnesis</i>	176
4.4.10. Idolatry.....	177
4.4.11. The <i>Didache</i> : Sacrifice and “Sacrificialisation”.....	179
4.4.12. The <i>Didache</i> and Eschatology.....	180
4.4.13. Sacrifice and Related Terms in Early Christianity: A Summary.....	181
4.5. Conclusion.....	181
Chapter 5: Eschatology in the New Testament Period.....	199
5.1 Introduction.....	199
5.2. Judaic Eschatology	200
5.2.1. National and Individual Hopes.....	200
5.2.2. The Presence of God.....	201
5.2.3. God and Messiah.....	202
5.2.4. “Life after Death”.....	203
5.2.5. National and Individual Hopes in the First Century CE.....	203
5.2.6. Eschatology: Prophecy & Apocalyptic.....	204
5.2.7. The Heavenly Feast.....	206
5.2.8. Manna.....	206
5.2.9. The Messianic Banquet.....	207
5.2.10. Eating with the Messiah: The Qumran/Essene Meal.....	208
5.2.11. Philo and Rabbinic Tradition.....	209
5.2.11. Judaic Eschatology: Concluding Remarks.....	209
5.3. Graeco-Roman Eschatology.....	210
5.3.1. Immortality.....	211
5.3.2. The Place of the Dead.....	211

5.3.3. Death and the Mysteries.....	212
5.3.3.1. Eleusis.....	212
5.3.3.2. Tammuz-Attis-Adonis.....	213
5.3.3.3. Osiris.....	213
5.3.3.4. Mithras.....	214
5.3.4. Death and the Philosophers.....	215
5.3.4.1. Body, Soul and Death.....	216
5.3.4.2. Death and Ethics.....	216
5.3.4.3. Death and Metaphysics.....	217
5.3.4.4. Stoic Views of Death.....	219
5.3.4.5. Epicurean Views of Death.....	221
5.3.5. Death and the Individual.....	223
5.3.6. Cults of the Dead.....	224
5.3.7. A Messianic Figure?.....	226
5.3.8. Life after Death: A Summary.....	226
 5.4. Early Christian Eschatology.....	227
5.4.1. Resurrection.....	227
5.4.2. The Kingdom of God.....	228
5.4.3. When Will the Kingdom Come?.....	229
5.4.4. "Thorough-going Eschatology".....	230
5.4.5. Realised Eschatology.....	231
5.4.6. The Kingdom: "Now" and "Not Yet".....	232
5.4.7. The Heavenly Meal.....	232
5.4.8. Miracles and the Heavenly Meal.....	233
5.4.9. Parables and the Heavenly Meal.....	235
5.4.10. Parables and the Ethics of the Heavenly Meal.....	236
5.4.11. Ethics, Eschatology and the Meal in the <i>Didache</i>	237
5.4.12. The Christian Meal in Heaven: A Summary.....	237
 5.5. Conclusions.....	238
 Recapitulation.....	252
 Chapter 6: Actions, Gestures and the Supper Narratives.....	255
6.1 Introduction.....	255
6.2. "This Tradition..."	256
6.2.1. Terminology.....	257
6.2.2. Transmission of Tradition in Graeco-Roman "Schools".....	257
6.2.3. Transmission in the Mystery Religions.....	258
6.2.4. Transmission and Paul.....	259
6.2.4.1. Direct and Remote Transmission.....	259
6.2.4.2. Transmission in <i>1 Corinthians</i>	261
6.2.4.3. Paul, Direct Transmission and Ἀποκάλυψις.....	261
6.2.4.4. The Case for Remote Transmission in <i>1 Corinthians</i> 11.....	262
6.3. The Date of The Meal.....	264
6.3.1. The Problem: The Variety of Dates in the Supper Narratives.....	264
6.3.2. The Calendars of Second Temple Judaism.....	264
6.3.3. Jaubert: A Synthesis of Calendars.....	265
6.3.4. Witherington and an "Illegal" Passover.....	266
6.3.5. O'Neill: Resolution of the Synoptic & Johannine Texts by Translation.....	267
6.3.6. Fitzmyer: A Passover Meal in <i>1 Corinthians</i> ?.....	269
6.3.7. Conclusion: No Firm Passover Date.....	271
6.4. The Location of the Meal.....	271

6.4.1. Capper: An Essene Connection?.....	272
6.4.2. The Upper Room.....	272
6.4.3. Essenes & Feast Days.....	273
6.4.4. An Essene Meal? The Need for Further Evidence.....	273
6.5. The Meal Setting.....	275
6.5.1. The Timing of The Meal.....	275
6.5.2. Posture: Lying Down to Eat.....	275
6.5.3. Jeremias: Reclining and The Passover Meal.....	276
6.5.4. Criticism of Jeremias' Claim.....	277
6.5.5. Conclusion: No Necessary Connection of Passover and Reclining.....	277
6.6. Actions with the Bread.....	278
6.6.1. The Cup Event: The Textual Accounts.....	278
6.6.2. What Kind of Bread?.....	278
6.6.3. Bread: A Sacrificial Food?.....	279
6.6.4. "One" Bread.....	280
6.6.5. Actions With the Bread: A Series of Events.....	281
6.6.5.1. The Sequence of Actions and the Feeding Miracles.....	281
6.6.5.2. The Sequence of Actions and the Qumran/Essene Nexus.....	283
6.6.6. The Significance of "Blessing/Thanksgiving".....	283
6.6.7. The Significance of "Breaking".....	284
6.6.8. The Role of Jesus.....	285
6.6.9. The Significance of "Sharing".....	286
6.7. Actions with the Cup.....	287
6.7.1. The Cup Event: Textual Accounts.....	287
6.7.2. The Lukan Version: A Textual Problem.....	268
6.7.3. The Cup(s) and the Passover.....	290
6.7.4. Sharing One Cup.....	291
6.7.5. Δεῖπνον in 1 Corinthians.....	292
6.7.6. A Full Meal or a Token Meal?.....	292
6.8. Conclusions.....	293
6.8.1. Judaic Resemblances.....	293
6.8.2. Graeco-Roman Resemblances.....	296
6.8.3. Early Christian Resemblances.....	297
6.8.4. An Unconsidered Action.....	299
Chapter 7: Sayings and the Supper Narratives.....	304
7.1. Introduction.....	304
7.2. The Bread/Body Sayings.....	305
7.2.1. "Body/Blood/Covenant": Different Emphases.....	306
7.2.2. "Body/Blood" and Cultus.....	307
7.2.3. The Meaning of 'Eotiv'.....	309
7.2.3.1. "Eating People is Wrong".....	310
7.2.4. Anamnesis.....	312
7.2.5. A Hellenistic Memorial Meal?.....	313
7.2.6. Hebraic Patterns of Memorial.....	314
7.2.7. Inculcation and the Body Sayings.....	315
7.3. The Cup/Blood Sayings.....	316
7.3.1. For Want of A Name.....	317
7.3.2. Cup/Wine Metonymy.....	317
7.3.3. Possible Sources for the Practice of "Drinking Blood".....	318
7.3.3.1. "Drinking Blood": A Universal Taboo?.....	318
7.3.3.2. How Did Drinking Blood become Acceptable Practice in Judaic Tradition?.....	319

7.3.3.3. "Drinking Blood": A Borrowing from the Mystery Religions?.....	320
7.3.3.4. Scurlock: Dionysiac Practice in Judaism.....	320
7.3.3.5. Evidence for Dionysiac Practice in Palestine.....	321
7.3.3.6. "Drinking Blood" in Judaism: A Fragment of Evidence.....	323
7.3.3.7. Blood As Symbol In The Old Testament.....	324
7.3.3.8. "Drinking Blood": An Eschatological Motif in the Old Testament..	324
7.3.3.9. 2 Samuel 23:17 and 1 Chronicles 11:19: A Davidic Precedent for "Drinking Blood"?.....	324
7.3.3.10.1 Samuel 21:2-7: Davidic Precedent For "Illicit" Practice.....	325
7.3.3.11. 1 Samuel 21:2-7: Associations with Melchizedek.....	326
7.3.3.12 "Licit" Precedent in the Jewish Cult?.....	327
7.3.3.13. <i>Imitatio Dei</i> : The Role of the Disciple.....	328
7.3.3.14. Conclusions.....	328
7.3.4. "Drinking Blood": The Date of the Controversy.....	329
7.3.5. Literalism and Symbolism.....	331
7.3.6. What Does Blood "Mean"?.....	333
7.3.6.1. Blood and Covenant.....	333
7.3.6.2. " <i>In my blood</i> ": Blood as Agent of the Covenant.....	335
7.3.6.3. "On Behalf Of" Whom?.....	335
7.3.7. Inculturation in the Cup/Blood Sayings.....	338
 7.4. Sayings About The Cup & The Kingdom.....	338
7.4.1. The Provenance of the Sayings.....	339
7.4.2. "The Fruit of the Vine".....	341
7.4.3. Did Jesus Drink the Cup?.....	341
7.4.4. The Cup and the Kingdom.....	342
7.4.4.1. The Cup: A Fulfilment of the Kingdom?.....	342
7.4.4.2. Criticism of the Fulfilment Theory.....	343
7.4.4.3. The Cup and the Coming of Jesus.....	343
7.4.4.4. Communion and Future Consummation.....	344
7.4.5. The Lukan Description of the Kingdom.....	344
7.4.6. Inculturation and the Kingdom Sayings.....	344
 7.5. <i>Lukan</i> Sayings About Service 1- Ranking.....	345
7.5.1. The Sayings: Echoes of the Essenes.....	345
7.5.2. The "Ransom" Logion.....	346
7.5.3. Table-Talk and The Symposium.....	347
7.5.4. Benefactors.....	348
7.5.5. Summary.....	348
 7.6. <i>Lukan</i> Sayings About Service 2- Revising Lifestyle.....	349
7.6.1. A Comparison with <i>Lk.</i> 10:4.....	349
 7.7. Sayings About "Betrayal".....	350
7.7.1. Danielou: A Reference to Qumran/Essene Practice?.....	350
7.7.2. The Common Dish: Criticism of the Qumran /Essene Proposal.....	351
7.7.3. Capper: An Economic Motive for Betrayal?.....	351
7.7.4. Betrayed by Whom?: The Role of Peter.....	352
7.7.5. The Betrayal of Jesus.....	353
7.7.6. Conclusion.....	353
 7.8. Sayings at the Supper: Conclusions.....	354
7.8.1. Inculturation: Judaic Contexts.....	354
7.8.2. Inculturation: Graeco-Roman Contexts.....	357
7.8.3. Inculturation: Early Christian Contexts	360
7.8.4. Methodological Considerations.....	362

CHAPTER 8: THE PAULINE “LORD’S SUPPER”.....	370
8.1. The “Lord’s Supper” in 1 Cor. 11.....	370
8.2. Phase 1- Setting the Scene: Divisions and Bad Habits.....	370
8.2.1. Economics and Status.....	373
8.2.2. Status: eating Wheat Bread?	375
8.3. Phase 2- The Corinthian Meal & Jesus’ Precedent.....	375
8.3.1. “Ιδίον - Whose Meal?.....	375
8.3.1.1. “Ιδίον and Κυριακὸν.....	376
8.3.1.2. Community and Household.....	376
8.3.1.3. “Ιδίον and Κοινά.....	377
8.3.2. Δεῖπνον :The Meal in Corinth.....	377
8.3.3. Pauline Reform: A Token Meal.....	377
8.3.4. A Token Meal: Back to Basics.....	378
8.3.5. Paul’s Reform: A Note on the Use of Culture in Theology.....	379
8.4. Phase 3 - Paul’s Interpretation of The Meal.....	381
8.4.1. “Proclaiming the Lord’s Death”.....	381
8.4.2. “Discerning <u>the Body</u> ”.....	382
8.4.2.1. The Body as “Community”.....	382
8.4.2.2. Christological Implications of the “Body”.....	385
8.4.2.3. The Mysteries: A Source for Christological Meaning?.....	386
8.4.2.4. Maccoby and the Mystery Religions.....	386
8.4.2.5. “Sacramentals”: A Source for Christological Meaning?.....	388
8.4.2.6. “Sacramentals” and Κοινωνία.....	389
8.4.2.7. “Sacramentals” and “Extension of Personality”.....	390
8.4.2.8. The Pauline “Body”: A Development of Judaic Thought.....	390
8.5. The Consequences of Eating the Pauline Supper.....	391
8.5.1. <i>Discerning the Body</i>	392
8.5.2. Eating, Judgement, Magic and Mysteries.....	393
8.5.3. Eating, Judgement and “Sacramentals”.....	394
8.5.3.1. Destruction.....	395
8.5.3.2. Judgement.....	396
8.6. Conclusions.....	397
CHAPTER 9: SUMMARY OF FINDINGS.....	402
9.1. Inculcation in the Supper Narratives- Yes!.....	402
9.2. The Supper Narratives and Judaic Elements.....	405
9.2.1. The Supper Narratives & the Passover.....	405
9.2.2. The Supper Narratives & The Temple Cult.....	406
9.2.3. The Supper Narratives & the Qumran/Essene Nexus.....	407
9.2.4. Sacramentalism.....	408
9.2.5. Final Evaluation of the Contribution of Judaic Practice to the Supper Narratives.....	409
9.3. The Supper Narratives and Graeco-Roman Elements.....	409
9.3.1. Ranking.....	410
9.3.2. Cult Meals.....	410
9.3.3. The Symposium Literary Tradition.....	411
9.3.4. The Supper Narratives & the Mysteries.....	411
9.3.5. The Supper Narratives & Hellenistic “Meals for the Dead”.....	412
9.3.6. The Supper Narratives and Magic.....	412
9.3.7. <u>Antiquitas</u>	412
9.3.8. Final Evaluation of the Contribution of Graeco-Roman Practice	

to the Supper Narratives.....	413
9.4. Early Christian Practice and the Supper Narratives.....	414
9.4.1. Sacrificial and Sacramental Significance.....	414
9.4.2. Eschatology.....	415
9.5. Overview.....	415
9.6. Does the Fact that Jewish Motifs are Prominent Damage The Case for “Inculturation”?.....	416
9.7. Implications Of These Findings.....	417
9.7.1. More than a Passover.....	417
9.7.2. Natural Theology.....	418
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	421

ABBREVIATIONS

AB	Anchor Bible
AHB	<i>The Ancient History Bulletin</i>
AJA	<i>American Journal of Archaeology</i>
AJP	<i>The American Journal of Philology</i>
AJSLL	<i>The American Journal of Semitic Languages and Literatures</i>
ANTC	Abingdon New Testament Commentaries
ATJ	<i>Africa Theological Journal</i>
AUP	Amsterdam University Press
BAGD	Bauer, W., Arndt, W.F., Gingrich, F.W., & Danker, F.W., <i>A Greek-English Lexicon of The New Testament and other Early Christian Literature</i> , Chicago: UCP, 1979
BBC	Blackwell Bible Commentaries
BNTC	Black's New Testament Commentaries
BTB	<i>Biblical Theology Bulletin</i>
BTF	<i>Bangalore Theological Forum</i>
CBC	Cambridge Bible Commentary
CBQ	<i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i>
CJ	<i>Classical Journal</i>
CP	<i>Classical Philology</i>
CQ	<i>The Classical Quarterly</i>
CRJ	<i>Christian Research Journal</i>
CT	<i>Christianity Today</i>
CTP	Central Tanganyika Press
CTQ	<i>Concordia Theological Quarterly</i>
CUP	Cambridge University Press
CoUP	Columbia University Press
DLT	Darton, Longman & Todd
DSD	<i>Dead Sea Discoveries</i>
DSS	Dead Sea Scrolls
EC	Epworth Commentaries
EKK	Evangelisch-Katholischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
ET	<i>Expository Times</i>
EUP	Edinburgh University Press
EvT	<i>Evangelische Theologie</i>
FN	<i>Filologia Neotestamentaria</i>

HR	<i>History of Religions</i>
HSCP	<i>Harvard Studies in Classical Philology</i>
HTR	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
HUCA	<i>Hebrew Union College Annual</i>
HUP	Harvard University Press
IBS	<i>Irish Biblical Studies</i>
ICC	<i>International Critical Commentary</i>
IJCT	<i>International Journal of the Classical Tradition</i>
IJSCC	<i>International Journal for the Study of the Christian Church</i>
JAM	<i>Journal of Asian Mission</i>
JAOS	<i>Journal of the American Oriental Society</i>
JBL	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
JBPC	J.B. Phillips' Commentaries
JGCJ	<i>Journal of Greco-Roman Christianity and Judaism</i>
JHC	<i>The Journal of Higher Criticism</i>
JHS	<i>Journal of Hellenistic Studies</i>
JPSA	Jewish Publication Society of America
JRPR	<i>The Journal of Religion and Psychical Research</i>
JRS	<i>The Journal of Roman Studies</i>
JSHJ	<i>Journal for the Study of the Historical Jesus</i>
JSJ	<i>Journal for the Study of Judaism</i>
JSNT	<i>Journal for the Study of the New Testament</i>
JSP	<i>Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha</i>
JSQ	<i>Jewish Studies Quarterly</i>
JTSe	Jewish Theological Seminary
JTS	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
JTSA	<i>Journal of Theology for Southern Africa</i>
LCL	Loeb Classical Library
LJRC	<i>Listening: Journal of Religion and Culture</i> ,
LSJ	Liddell, H.G., Scott, R., & Jones, S., <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> , Oxford: Clarendon, 1977 (repr)
LUP	Leuven University Press
LXX	The Septuagint (Rahlfs:1979)
MS	<i>Mission Studies</i>
MT	Masoretic Text
MUP	Manchester University Press
N-A 27	Nestle, E., & Aland, K., et al., <i>Novum Testamentum Graece</i> . 27th ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 1995
NAB	<i>New African Bible</i> , Nairobi: Paulines, 1999

NCB	New Century Bible Commentary
NICNT	The New International Commentary on the New Testament
NIGTC	The New International Greek Testament Commentary
NJB	<i>New Jerusalem Bible</i> , London: DLT, 1990
np	No pagination, usually when a document has been accessed electronically via a website/url
NRSV	<i>New Revised Standard Version</i> , Nashville: Nelson, 1990
NT	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NTS	<i>New Testament Studies</i>
NWSAJ	<i>National Women's Studies Association Journal</i>
OUP	Oxford University Press
PRS	<i>Perspectives in Religious Studies</i>
PSTJ	<i>Perkins School of Theology Journal</i>
PSUP	Pennsylvania State University Press
PTR	<i>The Princeton Theological Review</i>
PUP	Princeton University Press
RQ	<i>Restoration Quarterly</i>
RQu	<i>Revue de Qumran</i>
RRJ	<i>Review of Rabbinic Judaism</i>
RST	Religious Studies and Theology
SAP	Sheffield Academic Press
SCM	Student Christian Movement Press
SJOT	<i>Scandinavian Journal of the Old Testament</i>
SJT	<i>Scottish Journal of Theology</i>
SP	<i>Sacra Pagina</i>
SPCK	Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge
SR	<i>Social Research</i>
SUP	Stanford University Press
SVJ	<i>Stoic Voice Journal</i>
SWC	<i>Studies in World Christianity</i>
TAMUP	Texas A&M University Press
TAPA	<i>Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association</i>
TBC	Torch Bible Commentaries
TD	<i>Theology Digest</i>
TDNT	Kittel, G., & Freidrich, G., (ed.), <i>Theological Dictionary of the New Testament</i> (trans. G.W. Bromiley), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1964-76

<i>TG</i>	<i>Theological Gathering</i>
<i>TJ</i>	<i>Trinity Journal</i>
<i>TLZ</i>	<i>Theologische Zeitschrift</i>
<i>TM</i>	<i>Thinking Mission</i>
UBS 4	Aland, K., Metzger, B., et al., <i>The Greek New Testament</i> , 4th ed., New York: United Bible Societies, 1994
UCP	University of Chicago Press
UMP	University of Minnesota Press
VJTR	<i>Vidyajyoti Journal of Theological Reflection</i>
WBC	Word Bible Commentary
WJKP	Westminster John Knox Press

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There is a Kiswahili proverb, “*Mtu ni Watu*” (“A person is people”). John Donne was more poetic: “No man is an island”.

It thus seems appropriate to acknowledge the assistance of those who have assisted me in the preparation of this thesis. I record my thanks to them whilst requesting that any shortcomings be laid firmly at my own door.

Both the Ecclesiastical Insurance Group and the Lady Peel Trust assisted financially with the provision of grants in the early stages of this research. However, my parents, John and Prue King, have provided the bulk of the financial assistance for this work. I am in their debt for this as well as the blessings which their firm Scots priority on education have given. Without their help and support, I could never have achieved this much. My employers during much of the time of writing was the United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, and I must in particular record the support given to me by Dr Martin Heath and Canon Edgar Ruddock, who both had the generosity of vision to see that such studies enhanced my work with the Society.

A number of scholars from around the world have also assisted me in a variety of ways. At UNISA, I must record my thanks to my supervisors, Professors Petrus Grabbe and Eugene Botha: they have grappled with innumerable drafts thrust through the ether at them. Prof. Gous of the Old Testament Dept. was a considerate host on my visits to Pretoria. Professors Jonathan Draper, Gerald West, both of Kwazulu-Natal, and Prof. Jesse Mugambi of Nairobi, have, wittingly or unwittingly, provided a number of prompts in editorial work and conversation. A large debt must be acknowledged to the late Professor John O'Neill of Edinburgh University, who guided me through first degree studies in theology and my first forays into research. Two observations of his have been particularly influential with regard to this research. The first was that the New Testament cannot be read without some understanding of sacrifice. The second, given my enthusiasm as a classicist to explore how the gospel made inroads into Graeco-Roman culture, that this process must also include the same process in respect of Judaism. Even a casual reading of this work will reveal how both pieces of

advice have been key. He took a keen interest in this thesis until his sudden death in March 2003: I was constantly aware of his influence as I researched and wrote. He would probably have disagreed with many of my conclusions, but would always have had the dignity to respect these opinions. It is my great regret that he will never write me saying, “it’s good, but it’s wrong....”. Maybe, in a better place...

If he was my Elijah, his mantle fell upon the shoulders of Prof. Peter Balla of the Karoli Gaspar University in Budapest, who would become my Elisha. Like myself a protégé of Professor O’Neill, he has been unstinting in his reading and correction of my final draft manuscripts, and in pointing me to important German references. I cannot thank him enough for all his kindness.

A further round of thanks must go to the generations of staff and students at St. Mark’s College in Dar es Salaam, who did more than others to introduce me to the need and realities of inculturation in our seminars, lectures and tutorials. Without their company and gentle provocation, I might well have become an unreconstructed academic of the “northern guild” tradition. I must particularly record my thanks to Bishop Philip Baji and Fr. William Mndolwa for their friendship over the years.

Last, but definitely not least, I must record my thanks to Irene for her tireless support, and reminders that there is more to theology than the reading of books. Benjamin and Jacob have also been patient with their dad, and provided reminders that sometimes theological stories should be put aside for others.

Fergus King
Newcastle
December 2005