RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION PROCESSES IN THE JOHANNESBURG METROPOLITAN POLICE DEPARTMENT (JMPD)

by

Nkateko Samson Mashaba

submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

Master of Public Administration

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: Prof. SR Malefane

CO-SUPERVISOR: Prof. SB Kahn

May 2013
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the dissertation titled ‘Recruitment and selection processes in the Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department (JMPD)’ submitted for the degree of Master of Public Administration (MPA) in the Department of Public Administration at the University of South Africa is my own original work and has not previously been submitted to any other institution of higher education, I further declare that all sources cited or quoted are indicated and acknowledged by means of a comprehensive list of references.

__________________________________________
Signature Date
Nkateko Samson Mashaba
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I rest assured to successfully complete any project I start with God. All things are possible with HIM (God).

I acknowledge my supervisors Professors SR Malefane and SB Kahn for their guidance, encouragement and support throughout the years.

A special word of gratitude to:

- My wife Tembisa who supported and encouraged me throughout the study. Words cannot describe your continuous love and support throughout difficult times. I cannot imagine how difficult it would have been without your prayers and support.

- Director GPG Gerneke of the Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department for allowing me to conduct the study in his department.

- Superintendents MG Khoele, MJ Sebiloane and DD Machete for their assistance in distributing and collecting questionnaires.

- Mr Hasani Lawrence Ngonyama, Thandi Eunice Nyambi, Wendy Mbaile, Rutana Christine De Klerk, Christine Carol Noluthando Adams and Lorraine Maroudas for their continued support and prayers.
ABSTRACT

The high crime levels in South Africa necessitated the establishment of Metropolitan Police Departments in South Africa, a new phenomenon, starting with the Durban Metropolitan Police Department in March 2000, followed by the Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department (JMPD) in March 2001. Since their establishment, Metropolitan Police Departments have not escaped criticism that they are underperforming, specifically on their ability to reduce crime. The JMPD is not exempted from these criticisms, and doubts started mounting on its ability to sustain the City of Johannesburg’s (CoJ) objective of becoming a world class city by the year 2030.

Criticism by the public through the media necessitated research into their recruitment and selection processes in order to understand how these are undertaken. This would assist in improving the performance of police officers and the department as a unit. This research targeted police officers within the JMPD on operational and management levels as respondents with the objective to investigate and gather information pertaining to their perceptions on recruitment and selection within the department. A research questionnaire that focused on gathering information was developed and classified into four sections. Section A focused on biographical information of respondents, race, gender, occupational rank and number of years of experience in the JMPD. Section B gathered data on respondents’ perceptions on recruitment. Section C gathered data on selection processes, and Section D sought to gather information that is more general in nature.

It is evident from the findings of the biographical data in Section A that despite legislative requirements contained in the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998 that requires public institutions to be representative of race and gender, that progress in this regard is slow. The findings in Section B paint a picture that points to the discontent of police officers regarding the manner in which the recruitment and
selection processes are undertaken, and point to police officers within the JMPD being unfamiliar with the Talent Acquisition Policy (TAP, 2010). It was found that more than half of the respondents perceive that recruitment and selection within the JMPD does not consider skills and experience during selection, which could mean that the JMPD tolerate favouritism and nepotism, a situation which if not prudently attended to could lead to low employee morale and subsequently brain drain.

Last, the findings of general comments were dominated by references to the formal requirements that applicants need to acquire in order to be appointed either as sergeant or inspector. These skills include written, decision-making and communication and academic qualifications. Applicants with necessary skills can perform better as opposed to those that do not possess these skills. The research concludes by offering recommendations for each of the four sections of the research.
CHAPTER 1
GENERAL OVERVIEW

1.1 Introduction and background statement................................. 1
1.2 Problem statement.................................................................................. 3
1.3 Research scope and objectives............................................................... 4
1.4 Significance of the study......................................................................... 4
1.5 Terminology............................................................................................ 5
1.6 Research methodology............................................................................ 7
   1.6.1 Literature review.............................................................................. 7
   1.6.2 South African government legislation............................................. 7
   1.6.3 Empirical investigation................................................................. 7
1.7 Units of analysis and observation......................................................... 8
1.8 Layout of chapters................................................................................. 8

CHAPTER 2
THEORY OF RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION PROCESSES

2.1 Introduction............................................................................................ 10
2.2 The concept of ‘recruitment’................................................................. 10
2.3 Factors influencing the recruitment process....................................... 12
   2.3.1 Internal factors that affect recruitment......................................... 12
      2.3.1.1 Strategic plan................................................................. 12
      2.3.1.2 Policy and legislation..................................................... 13
   2.3.2 External factors that affect recruitment....................................... 14
      2.3.2.1 Labour market conditions.............................................. 14
      2.3.2.2 Government policy and legislation................................. 14
CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction........................................................................................................... 24
3.2 The Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department (JMPD)................................. 24
3.3 Recruitment and selection in the Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department............................................ 26
3.4 Research design..................................................................................................... 28
   3.4.1 Target sample and sampling procedure......................................................... 28
   3.4.2 Racial and gender composition of respondents............................................. 29
3.4.3 The number of years of experience of respondents ...... 29
3.5 Research methodology ................................................. 30
  3.5.1 The research questionnaire ....................................... 30
3.6 Adherence to ethical guidelines ................................... 31
3.7 Conclusion ..................................................................... 32

CHAPTER 4
THE FINDINGS OF THE RESEARCH

4.1 Introduction ...................................................................... 33
4.2 The findings of the research ........................................... 33
  4.2.1 Section A: Biographical data ........................................ 33
    4.2.1.1 Gender, race and ranks of respondents ............... 34
    4.2.1.2 The number of years of experience of respondents . 35
  4.2.2 Section B: Responses about the recruitment process .... 37
    4.2.2.1 Circularisation and advertisement of vacant posts. 38
    4.2.2.2 The CoJ’s Talent Acquisition Policy guidelines on the recruitment process ........................................ 38
    4.2.2.3 Adherence by the Human Resource Management department to the Talent Acquisition Policy guidelines ... 39
    4.2.2.4 Participation of labour organisations in the recruitment process ......................................................... 39
    4.2.2.5 Internal and external recruitment ......................... 39
    4.2.2.6 Transparency of the recruitment process ............. 40
    4.2.2.7 Pool of applicants from which the selection process can be made ..................................................... 40
  4.2.3 Section C: The selection process ................................. 41
  4.2.4 Section D: General questions .................................... 44
4.3 Conclusion ...................................................................... 47
CHAPTER 1
GENERAL OVERVIEW

1.1 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND STATEMENT

Changes in the South African political landscape, from being characterised by racially polarising apartheid policies to a democracy, heralded the adoption of, amongst others, the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996 (hereafter referred to as the Constitution) and the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998 (hereafter referred to as Employment Equity Act). The Constitution legislatively enshrines equal rights for all South Africans citizens, and the Employment Equity Act necessitated the implementation of affirmative action measures that forbid unfair discriminatory labour practices in the public and private sectors. These acts had a significant influence on recruitment and selection practices in both the public and private sectors.

The recruitment process is the first step in the employment process and its main purpose is to ensure that institutions employ applicants that meet the appointment and placement requirements. Applicants can be recruited using internal or external source (Singer, 1990:168). Regardless of the recruitment source utilised, applicants should adhere to all the requirements of the job that they apply for. Public sector institutions (in this case the JMPD) that administer protection services compete with other institutions and agencies for employees, examples of which include the South African Police Service (SAPS), South African National Defence Force (SANDF), South African Secret Services (SASS), National Intelligence Agency (NIA), other metropolitan police and traffic departments around the country as well as private security companies in and outside South Africa. Because of the competition amongst these institutions and agencies, it is necessary for human resources departments that usually engage in recruitment and selection processes to be capacitated with suitably qualified employees who will be able to identify and select the most suitable applicants.
Institutions that administer protection services have to ensure that they employ suitably qualified employees, especially in operational ranks such as sergeant and inspector, whose roles are mainly to undertake operational duties such as to patrol high crime areas and enforce by-laws and traffic regulations. This requirement is consistent with the constitutional obligation regarding public institutions, that they have to be developmental and career orientated and to institutionalise effective human resource management practices.

The White Paper on Human Resource Management in the South African Public Service (1997) brought in a new human resource management framework that emphasises the development of human resources for the successful delivery of quality services. This emphasises the need for public institutions at all spheres of government to attract competent employees and to place them in positions where they can improve service delivery. Cappelli (2008: 27-37) argues that competency becomes a focus when the complexity of the institution changes. This means that the ability of public institutions to deliver quality services is largely dependent on whether they are able to recruit and select competent job applicants. Similarly JMPD’s success in the reduction of crime levels depends on competent sergeants and inspectors. The promulgation of the White Paper on Human Resource Management in the Public Service, 1997 as compelling public institutions to conceptualise human resource practices that will be able the recruit and retain competent employees.

Recruitment and selections are two different processes that are important for the appointment of suitably qualified candidates. Because the two processes are interlinked, a successful recruitment process makes it easier to achieve success with the selection process. For the selection process to be successful, selectors should collect as much relevant information as possible about applicants, the same information that should be sought through the recruitment process. According to Marvin (2007:24), the success of any operation depends on the skills, abilities and competencies of employees appointed to undertake them. Recruitment and selection processes are deemed successful only if they lead to the appointment of competent candidates who will successfully execute their duties and keeping abreast of an ever changing environment proactively.
1.2 PROBLEMS STATEMENT

The establishment of municipal police departments is a fairly new phenomenon (Newman, Masuku & Gomomo, 2002:1) which in South Africa started in March 2000 with the Durban Metropolitan Police Services and the JMPD in March of 2001. There is limited research that is conducted to assess how they undertake their responsibilities, in particular, to reduce the levels of crime and to improve the safety and security of the communities in their municipal areas of jurisdiction. Public human resource management research, essentially the recruitment and selection processes, as the main dependent variables through which the performance of these institutions can be improved, is lacking (Tompkins, 1995:184). The JMPD is not an exception to the criticism that these institutions are underperforming, moreover on its ability to attain the CoJ’s objective of becoming the world class crime free city by the year 2030.

An introspective research, in which police officials in the JMPD are targeted as respondents, is necessary to understand the perceptions around which recruitment and selection processes are undertaken and as a way forward, to suggest and recommend ways through which perceptions, the way in which the respondents experience opportunities or challenges that surround them can be overcome. Such introspective research could also assist in increasing the morale (Cascio, 1991:175) of employees of the JMPD in performance pertaining to crime reduction and therefore, lower the amount of criticism levelled against the JMPD. The recruitment and selection processes, as in they are currently perceived to be, should not only be seen as ensuring that sufficient human resources are available, but also as the processes through which competent and skilled human resources, in which public institutions may invest, are acquired and appointed. The basis underlying the need for successful recruitment and selection processes is that such employees, after being acquired, would assist not only municipal police departments, but public institutions in general to meet performance expectations.
1.3 RESEARCH SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES

This study focuses on the recruitment and selection processes in the CoJ and special emphasis is placed on police officials at operational levels of constables, sergeants and inspectors within the JMPD. The objective is to investigate and to gather information about how police officials at both operational and management levels within the JMPD perceive the undertaking of the recruitment and selection processes. The following research objectives have been formulated for this research:

- to provide a theoretical discussion of the recruitment and selection processes,
- to determine how police officials at both operational and management levels in the JMPD perceive the undertaking of the recruitment and selection processes,
- to present the findings of how police officials in the JMPD perceive the undertaking of the recruitment and selection processes; and
- to suggest and recommend ways through which such perceptions and experiences can be overcome and resolved.

1.4 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

The increasing of public functions after the period of restructuring and the scarcity of employees necessitate intense recruitment (Andrews, 1994:95) and selection. Having the best recruitment and selection processes ensure that public institutions attract and retain competent employees and to project a positive image of an institution to outsiders. As Tompkins (1995:184) states, public sector institutions face increasing competition with each other and the private sector for qualified and competent applicants. Any public institution that, according to Beaumont (1993:57), is about to take part in recruitment and selection processes needs to conduct human resource forecasting, specifying job requirements and identify appropriate recruitment channels and selection criterion. This means that recruitment should be done in line with the overall plan to achieve pre-determined objectives. Rothwell and Kazanas (1994) as explained in Gerber, Nel and Van Wyk (1997:604-609) propose
that recruitment and selection processes should be linked to the overall strategy of public institutions.

Recruitment is an expensive process and should attract suitably qualified applicants to enable a conclusive selection process (Beardwell & Holden, 1995:208). Thus recruitment and selection processes should be aimed at appointing competent applicants, who in turn will assist to improve the performance of public institutions. It is common for institutions with competent employees to provide quality services.

The Constitution provides the legal framework for recruitment and selection by affording employees and job seekers equal protection against discrimination from employer or potential employers. The White Paper on Human Resource Management (1997) requires public institutions to be developmental and career orientated and to institutionalise effective human resource management practices. The Local Government Municipal Structures Act 32 of 1998 states that the vision of the South African government is to have democratic and developmental local governments in which municipalities execute their constitutional obligations to ensure quality municipal services, promote social and economic development and ensure a healthy environment in which all citizens can lead dignified lives. This can be achieved through the recruitment and selection of competent employees.

1.5 TERMINOLOGY

Terms that are frequently used throughout the dissertation are explained in this section:

Recruitment process
Recruitment is a process of attracting competent applicants to apply for vacant positions. It is a process that is undertaken by institutions to ensure that prospective applicants with specific attributes and qualifications are encouraged to apply for vacant positions (Carrell, Elbert, Hartfield, Grobler, Marx & Van der Westhuizen, 1997:138; Milcovich & Boudreau, 1991:217; Werther &Davis, 1996:182). In the context of this study, the concept refers to the process of attracting competent applicants to apply for vacant positions of sergeants and inspectors in the JMPD.
Selection process
Selection is the process by which the JMPD chooses from a pool of applicants, successful candidates as sergeants and inspectors. It is the process that commences after the recruitment process has been undertaken and which then leads to the appointment process (Erasmus, Swanepoel, Schenk, Van der Westhuizen & Wessels, 2005:233 and Cheminais, Bayat, Van der Waldt & Fox, 1998:137) of competent sergeants and inspectors, upon whom the responsibility to carry out operational duties (e.g. crime combating) is placed. Both the recruitment and selection processes are further expounded upon in Chapter 2.

Appointment process
The appointment process commences after both the recruitment and selection processes have been undertaken. In terms of the Penguin Pocket Dictionary (1990:35) the appointment process entails officially naming or deciding on whom to appoint for an office or position.

Appropriate
Oxford Advanced Learner’s Dictionary (200047) defines the term ‘appropriate’ as suitable, correct or correct for the particular work circumstance. In this study appropriate means achieving aims and goals that have been set out. In the context of this study it means attracting and selecting from a pool of applicants candidates with the right work competencies and skills that would enable the successful job applicants to contribute positively in the fight against crime levels. The right attributes and competencies in this instance refer to work experience and educational qualifications (Employment Equity Act, 1998).

Police sergeant
A sergeant is the second lowest police rank just above constable from the bottom up. Sergeants are non-commissioned police officers that supervise the work of constables in implementing crime prevention plans and strategies. In terms of the structural arrangements of the JMPD, they report deficiencies and achievements to senior management. The ranking structure of the JMPD is similar to that which was previously used by the South African Police Service (SAPS) before 1997. The only
differences is that the SAPS rank structure in police stations goes up to the rank of
director, whilst the JMPD, unlike in the case of SAPS police station, is headed by the
Chief of Police.

**Police inspector**
A police inspector is also a non-commissioned police officer and is the third lowest
police rank, above constable and the sergeant. Inspectors supervise the work of
constables and sergeants. It is in this position where a police officer assumes junior
management responsibilities.

### 1.6 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Both the literature review and empirical study form part of the research methodology
applied in this study, which are briefly explain in subsequent subsections.

#### 1.6.1 Literature review

Literature review, whose intention is to place this research in a historical and
associational perspective, will be conducted. A literature review of recent scholarly
work on the recruitment and selection processes forms an integral part of this
literature review. The literature review will include published scholarly articles, books
and other types of information relevant to the area of the research.

#### 1.6.2 South African government legislation

This study also makes use of South African government legislation on human
resource management, particularly the Constitution of 1996, Labour Relation Act 66
Management, of 1997.

#### 1.6.3 Empirical investigation

The research is qualitative in nature and makes use of research questionnaires as
data collection instruments. Respondents to these questionnaires are police officials
that interact at both operational and management levels in the JMPD.
1.7 UNITS OF ANALYSIS AND OBSERVATION

The unit of analysis that has been identified for this study is the recruitment and selection processes, whilst the unit of observation is current JMPD police officials that interact at operational and management levels.

1.8 LAYOUT OF CHAPTERS

This study is divided into five chapters, the focus of each is briefly explained below.

Chapter 1
The objective of chapter 1 is to give a general overview of the study, beginning with highlighting the problem statement from which the need to conduct the study stems, research scope and objectives as well as the significance of the study. This chapter also explains the key terms that are frequently used, the research methodology, units of analysis and observation and the layout of the chapters.

Chapter 2
The chapter deliberates on three main theoretical aspects, i.e. (1) recruitment process, (2) selection process and (3) the link between recruitment and selection processes and organisational performance and objectives.

Chapter 3
The chapter introduces the study area at which the research activities were carried out and explains both the research design and methodology.

Chapter 4
This chapter presents the findings of the data gathered through the use of a research questionnaire. This chapter lays the foundation for the concluding remarks and recommendations that are discussed in chapter 5.
Chapter 5
Following from the findings that are presented in chapter 4, this chapter provides concluding remarks and recommendations on how the recruitment and selection process can be improved, and in particular how perceptions around how the recruitment and selection processes are undertaken can be overcome and resolved upon.
CHAPTER 2
THEORY OF RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION PROCESSES

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The first chapter of this study explained the general overview and insight about recruitment and selection processes, especially the background around which it becomes a topical area requiring research. This orientation gave insight on a number of aspects, namely problem statement, aims and objectives of the research, scope of the research, research methodology, units of analysis and the method of data analysis. The chapter also presented the layout of the structural layout of the entire dissertation. The discussions in this chapter are consistent with the first objective in chapter 1 and contribute to the theory of recruitment and selection processes.

The main idea behind recognising the theory as of paramount importance is that it lays a foundation for understanding how the recruitment and selection processes in the study area can be improved. The chapter deliberates on three main theoretical aspects that focus on (1) the definition of recruitment, the factors that influence recruitment and recruitment sources; (2) the definition of selection, various stages of the selection process; and (3) the link between recruitment and selection processes and organisational performance and objectives. The crux of the discussions in this chapter is that if recruitment and selection processes are carried out effectively, public institutions are able to acquire competent employees, who in return enhance the public institution’s performance and its ability to attain its objectives.

2.2 THE CONCEPT OF ‘RECRUITMENT’

Researchers and practitioners from various academic disciplines and fields put forth a variety definitions and interpretations to the concept ‘recruitment’, and the result has been an abundance of diverse definitions. The manner in which the concept is defined influences quite extensively the nature of the policies and programmes that are designed by the public and private institutions. For the purpose of this research, its conceptual analysis emphasises how it is applied by the public sector institutions. Carrell, et al. (1997:138) define recruitment as the process of acquiring applicants who
are available and that meet the requirements of the advertised vacant positions. The process, according to them, is intended to ensure that applicants with specific educational qualifications, employment history and behavioural attributes are enticed to apply for vacant positions; the process after which managers are able to select and appoint from a pool of applicants those they deem as meeting all the requirements of the advertised vacant positions (Carrell et al., 1997:138).

The process, as defined by Andrews (1994:94), involves the discovery of applicants for actual or anticipated organisational activities (duties), and further, involves seeking out for, evaluating, obtaining new applicants against a pool of other applicants to fill positions. The entire process is intended to assist a public institution to achieve the mandate (goals and objectives) upon which it is founded. As argued by Foot and Hook (1996:53), the recruitment process is the first step of the appointment process and lays the foundation for the selection process. Erasmus et al. (2007:207) view recruitment as a human resource activity that is aimed at attracting sufficient job applicants with the potential, competencies and traits to fill job needs to ensure that the public institutions achieve their objectives.

According to Le Roux, Venter, Jansen Van Vuuren, Jacobs, Labuschagne, Kritzinger, Ferreira, De Beer and Hubner (1995:156), recruitment consists of those activities and attempts that are made on behalf of the public institution by managers, through which potential employees and suitable applicants are found and motivated to apply for vacant positions. This means that an advertisement is worded in such a way that it appeals to potential candidates not to miss the opportunity to apply for the advertised position. In Milkovich and Boudreau’s (1994:217) two main outcomes of the recruitment process are identifiable, the first outcome is that from the pool of applicants that would have applied, some will be selected and secondly some will not be selected. Werther and Davis (1996:182) and Cascio (1991:174), see it as a process that is aimed at acquiring specific skills that would enable a public institution to perform adequately. As they expound, the recruitment process marks the first step in the employment process. Not only does the process ensure that sufficient human resources are available, but ensures that institutions acquire the most competent applicants. The process, as they argue, begins with a clear specification of human resource needs and time frames within which such requirements should be met. The procedures that are followed during the recruitment process, according to Byars and
Rue (2000:150), are determined by the human resource planning process and performance requirements of the positions to be filled. Recruitment can be conducted if sufficient funds have been set aside. It is an expensive process that should be carried out by human resource specialist to avoid selecting incompetent candidates or candidates with skills not relevant for advertised positions.

2.3 FACTORS INFLUENCING THE RECRUITMENT PROCESS

The recruitment process, like other processes carried out in public institutions, is not conducted in a vacuum, but is influenced both positively and negatively by a multitude of influences whose sources can be found internally within the public institution and from sources from the external environment. The discussion in the subsequent section focuses on the influence of the internal factors on the recruitment process.

2.3.1 Internal factors that affect the recruitment process

Internal factors, sometimes referred to as ‘institutional’ factors, are factors that can be found internally within public institutions themselves. Managers in public institutions have control over internal factors. These factors include, but are not limited to, the public sector strategic plan, as well as policy and legislation. These factors have an influence over how public institutions set up their recruitment criteria and are briefly discussed in the following section.

2.3.1.1 Strategic plan

An institution’s strategic plan, which would normally outline its vision, is developed by managers in consultation with employees. The vision projects the future and gives direction, a framework for how the mission and objectives will be formulated. A vision is pursuit of excellence and guides managers in public institutions as to what type of employees are needed and the type of qualifications they should possess. The recruitment process of a public institution has to be consistent with a human resources plan, which is part of a public institution’s strategic plan. According to Cronje, Du Toit and Motlatla (2000:441), a human resource plan is an estimation of the quality and quantity of employees that will be needed by an institution in future. South African public institutions’ recruitment processes have to be consistent with the mission captured in the Human Resource Management Strategy that aims to
continually improve the lives of its citizens through a transformed, coherent, transparent, accountable and responsible public service. The strategy emphasises the need for recruitment processes that attract applicants from diverse backgrounds. These applicants should at the same time be competent, capable and committed to delivering services of high standards to citizens. To give effect to this vision, all public institutions are required to ensure that the recruitment processes they use enables them to achieve the goals specified in this strategy.

2.3.1.2 Policy and legislation

In addition to the strategic plan, the recruitment processes of public institutions in the South African public service are undertaken in compliance with policy and legislative Constitution, Employment Equity Act, Basic Conditions of Employment Act 75 of 1997 and the Labour Relations Act, have introduced a set of changes that requires an overhaul of procedures that are used by public institutions. How public institutions undertake recruitment, as part of the employment process, has also been affected. A few policy and legislative guidelines to which public institutions have to adhere require that recruitment policies be clear and understood by all stakeholders. Employees, including labour unions, must be consulted before deciding on policies to avoid possible strikes (Erasmus et al., 2005:213; Cushway, 1994:42).

These policy and legislative requirements require that recruitment processes be free of discrimination, on the basis of race, gender, colour, religion and disability (Uys, Van der Westhuizen, Nealer, Smith, Clapper, Rowland & Van Wyk, 1997:179; Hellriegel, Jackson, Slocum, Klopper, Louw and Oosthuizen, 2001).

The Employment Equity Act states that employers must take steps to promote equal opportunity by prohibiting unfair discrimination and making provision for the implementation of affirmative action measures to allow equal access to designated groups. It promotes affirmative action and targets designated groups such as people living with disabilities, women in general and blacks (Indian, Africans and Coloureds) who as a result of past neglect are underrepresented in the public institutions (Mitchell, 2002:123; Zelnic, 1996:18; McWhirter, 1996:8). The policy and legislative framework further aims to ensure that there is diversity, increased labour participation and that everyone, including employment seekers; have the right to fair labour practice (Cheminais et al., 1998:99). Despite internal factors, the external
environment within which public institutions operate influences the manner in which they undertake recruitment processes.

2.3.2 External factors that affect recruitment

Beyond institutional boundaries there exist numerous factors that may affect the recruitment process, either positively or negatively. The external factors, unlike internal factors, are external to institutional arrangements and therefore managers in public institutions have no control over them. These factors can be directly or indirectly linked to the failure or success of public institutions recruitment processes. They include, but are not limited to, labour market conditions, government policy and legislation and labour organisations, and their influence on recruitment processes and programmes of public institutions is described in subsequent subsection.

2.3.2.1 Labour market conditions

The type of labour market from which the public institutions recruit employees determines the costs of the recruitment process. Shortage of skills makes the recruitment process expensive as such skills’ demand is more than the supply. At the same time abundance of skills lowers the costs of recruitment as more candidates compete for few vacancies (Erasmus et al., 2005:209). If supply for employment seekers in a particular labour market is higher relative to available vacancies, then the price of labour will generally be cheaper. Similarly the price of labour will be higher when the supply of employment seekers is lower relative to available jobs. The influence of government policy and legislation on the recruitment process is discussed in the next subsection.

2.3.2.2 Government policy and legislation

Despite the labour market conditions, government policy and legislation has a major influence on how public institutions conduct recruitment processes. Section 9 of the Constitution affords equal rights to all citizens and outlaws unfair discrimination against any employee or employment seeker on grounds including but not limited to race, gender, religion and disability. In terms of the Public Service Act 103 of 1994 (hereafter referred to as the Public Service Act) recruitment processes must be fair. The Public Service Act requires that public institutions are guided by employment equity and affirmative action measures when conducting recruiting processes. The Act requires them to indicate on advertisements that applicants from previously
disadvantaged groups are welcome and that applications from these groups will receive preference. By requiring public institutions to publish this information, the Act gives them the opportunity to redress the past employment imbalances and to ensure representation in terms of race, gender and disability in public institutions. The following sub-section explains how labour organisations influence recruitment.

2.3.2.3 Labour organisations
Labour organisations, sometimes referred to as unions play an important role in the South African Public Sector. Their right to existence is entrenched in the Constitution and further defined in the Labour Relations Act.

Union members, as a result of this legislative support, participate in various activities that are carried out by public institutions, some of which include participating in recruitment policy-making structures (Nel, Werner, Haasbroek, Poisat, Sono & Schuiltz, 2009:224), consultative structures, for employment and work conditions in general. They also participate in and are consulted during recruitment and selection processes (Barney and Hesterly, 2006:125). The experience in most public institutions is that the participation of labour unions in these activities helps prevent favouritism and nepotism and helps in achieving inclusiveness in decision-making processes. Their participation also helps circumvent strikes and conflict and helps in improving employer-employee relationships. Because employees are represented in decision-making processes, they are able to take ownership of the future of public institutions.

2.4 SOURCES OF RECRUITMENT

Recruiters, whether in the public or private sector, have two main sources of recruitment to choose from, namely, internal and external sources of recruitment. These are explained in subsequent sections.

2.4.1 Internal sources of recruitment
Internal recruitment occurs when vacant positions are advertised internally. When a vacant position has been advertised internally it implies that only current employees of that institution are eligible to apply and are therefore encouraged to do so. This
form of recruitment implies applications from individuals who are not part of that institution will not receive attention, and therefore will be rejected automatically. This form of recruitment is cost effective and safer since the applicants are already known. However, a disadvantage of using internal recruitment is that it creates other vacancies that also have to be filled (Gomez-Majia et al., 2004:159; Singer, 1990:166). Three main sources of internal recruitment have been identified for discussion.

2.4.1.1 Referrals from current employees
Referrals from current employees (as result of word of mouth) can be used as an internal source of recruitment. In this instance, managers inform their current employees about existing vacancies to either sensitise or recommend potential employees (individuals that are not employed by a public institution) about such vacancies. Even though this form of recruitment is cheaper, it might not necessarily be able to attract a pool of applicants from which managers are able to compare between competencies. This is because employees might not be able to take into consideration factors such as race and gender (Overman, 1994:62) and the overall aspects of diversity that should be addressed through the recruitment process. According to Nel et al (2009:225), current employees tend to recommend candidates that are demographically similar. This could lead to unfair discrimination based on race, colour and gender, and therefore, opening public sector institutions to possible future litigation (Nel, 2002:278-279).

2.4.1.2 Former employees
By ‘former employees’ reference is made to employees who at some stage tendered their services to a public institution in question and who may over periods of time have acquired experience on how certain functions are performed. At the stage at which they are re-employed, these types of employees are not necessarily new since they left the institution with some form of experience and expertise. Their re-employment could bring back this much needed competency. Like current employees, former employees know how the institution functions and need less training than new applicants referred by current employees. Former employees could be those who were laid off during a period of recession, and as described by Nel et
al. (2009:226), they are safe to employ due to their experience and the loyalty with which they previously served the institution.

2.4.2 External sources of recruitment
External sources of recruitment refer to attracting applicants from outside public sector institutions to fill vacant positions. Like internal sources, they are useful to attracting competent applicants to apply for advertised positions in public institutions. The widely used external sources of recruitment include advertisements, employment agencies, educational institutions and vocational work, and are discussed in the next sections.

2.4.2.1 Advertisement
Advertisements are the most common form of external sources of recruitment. Institutions advertise vacant position on both electronic print and media to access a larger pool of applicants. As explained by Nel et al., (2009:226), an advertisement has communication as its basic underlying principle and it should be worded in a manner that triggers responses from job seekers. Recruiters should formulate the wording of advertisements in a manner that is not discriminatory. Advertisements are expensive but attract a larger pool of applicants than internal recruitment processes. It is, however, more difficult to evaluate external applicants than those that are already employed within the institution.

2.4.2.2 Employment agencies
Employment agencies, sometimes referred to as labour brokers, even though they can face criticism from labour unions in South Africa, tend to be fast and efficient in recruiting applicants for specialised positions. Public Institutions may use employment agencies if they elect not to conduct their own recruitment (or selection). Employment agencies advertise or keep databases of candidates who have provided curriculum vitae to them to seek employment for them. Like advertisement, employment agencies are expensive. Lord (1989) warns that employment agencies may cost as much as thirty five (35) percent of the employee’s first year salary.
2.4.2.3 Educational institutions
Managers of public institutions may visit educational institutions such as universities and colleges to attract top students, especially during their final years of study to apply for vacant positions. This method of recruitment is also referred to as campus recruiting and is one of the cheapest methods of recruitment. It introduces final year students to the institution. The recruiter normally makes a presentation to final year students and invites desirable students to visit public institutions exposing them to different areas within the institution (Nel et al., 2009:227).

2.4.2.4 Walk-ins
Walk-ins refer to situations in which employment seekers typically walk into public institutions with the hope that a vacancy for which they are suitable exists. It is an unusual source of recruitment, especially for public sector institutions, in which all vacant positions by law; have to be advertised before they are filled. Prospective employees sometimes fill in application forms and send them to the person in charge even though there is no vacancy advertised. According to Singer (1990:168) one third of employees get their first jobs in this manner. Although it is a cheaper way than paying for the costs of placing an advertisement in a national newspaper, it might only be suitable for routine types of work as opposed to the work that involves solving complex problems daily.

2.5 SELECTION
It became evident, whilst deliberating on the theory of recruitment, to identify its link with the selection process. The recruitment process makes the selection process easier. As noted in the introductory remarks, two main aspects are dealt with in this part. The first is a conceptual analysis of the concept selection and the second is about the various stages of the selection process.

2.5.1 The concept of ‘Selection’
Like recruitment, the selection process can be costly since it involves setting up selection panels and formulating the objectives against which all applications will be judged against. Another cost implication involved in the selection process, especially for public institutions, is that applicants have to be invited (either telephonically or by
post) to attend the interviews, the process after which they have to be reimbursed for the costs they incurred.

Wild, Wild, Han and Rammal (2007:548) define selection as the process of screening applicants with the greatest performance potential. The process focuses on competency and how an applicant can contribute to the success of the public institution. Amos, Ristow and Ristow (2004:35), as well as Mathis and Jackson (2006:226), define selection as the process of selecting the most suitable applicants. The process, according to them, is guided by predetermined selection criteria such as job descriptions, job specifications and job profiling and commences after the recruitment process has been completed.

Robbins, Odendaal and Roodt (2001:352) point out that the objective of the selection process is to match the applicants’ ability, knowledge, skills and experience with job requirements in a fair and legal manner. This means that selection panels, in their quest to select applicants with potential, must comply with legislative requirements and other measures introduced through legislation. In the South African context, these measures are encapsulated in legislations such as Employment Equity Act through which employers are expected to implement affirmative action measures to counteract a legacy of apartheid. Through this legislation, employers are expected to give preferential treatment to applicants from designated target groups (Tinarelli, 2000:60-85).

2.5.2 The Selection Process
The selection process consists of a series of steps that applicants (or applications) go through when competing for vacant positions. These steps may include initial screening, interviews, reference checks, employment tests and medical tests. These steps are discussed in the following sections of the chapter.

2.5.2.1 Initial screening
Initial screening, popularly known as short listing, is the first step after the recruitment process is completed and applications have been received. In this step all the applications that have been received by the due date are screened and those that do not correspond to the requirements stipulated in the advertisement are immediately eliminated in this step. As Cuming (1994:97) and Nel et al. (2009:242) caution,
members of selection panels have to be careful not to discriminate against applicants with potential. Their decisions should be guided by short-listing criteria that is developed against the job requirements stipulated in the advertisements. Furthermore, they need to ensure that enough time is set aside for short-listing and to ensure that the criteria through which they judge the application against conforms to the prescripts of the law (e.g. Employment Equity Act and the Basic Conditions of Employment Act, in the South African context).

2.5.2.2 Interviews

Interviews are the most commonly used selection technique (Redman & Wilkinson, 2001:31). With the use of interviews, managers of public institutions get an opportunity to meet the applicants directly. The interview also provides the applicants with an opportunity to also learn more about the public institution. The purpose of the selection interview is to gather as much information and to use such information to arrive at a selection decision (Redman & Wilkinson, 2001:31). During the interview, panel members (interviewers) normally pose questions to which the interviewee is expected to respond. Responses to the questions are often captured by means of scores as determined the interviewers. The applicant that obtains the highest score is recommended for appointment (Wilkinson, 2001:32). Because of its (interview) ambiguity, efforts must be made to ensure that all interviewees are being asked the same questions (Gomez-Majia et al., 2004:175).

2.5.2.3 Reference checks

Usually advertisements require that applicants provide the names and contact details of people who can serve as referees to them in case their applications are considered further. Reference checks are used to verify the information that is supplied by applicant and are usually done telephonically. Although most referees are reluctant to respond to certain questions (Mathis and Jackson, 2006:251), reference checks can be used to gather as much information that will be used in deciding whether to appoint or decline to appoint the applicants. McCormick and Ilgen (1987:195) caution that references are only useful if the referee had observed the applicant in a relevant situation (whilst performing their duties), and when the referee is capable of assessing the applicants’ performance and can express his or her opinion without being misinterpreted.
2.5.2.4 Selection tests

After being exposed to initial screening activities such as interviews and reference checks, applicants are often expected to undergo test(s) to determine if they are fit to perform the job, should they be appointed. Employment tests are in the South African context, illegal under the Employment Equity Act unless the tests have been scientifically proven to be reliable and valid, and can be applied fairly without bias to all employees (Kleynhans et al., 2006:100) or can be justified given the nature of the job. The most common example of the employment tests that applicants often undergo is a medical examination. Medical examination, also referred to as pre-placement medical testing, is conducted only where the applicants are required to use physical strength to successfully perform their duties. Applicants for police and defence force vacancies undergo a medical examination before they are recommended to commence with training (Kleynhans et al., 2006:100).

HIV/AIDS tests are not allowed without the applicant’s consent and, even if the applicants consent to such tests, the results of such tests cannot be used to discriminate against them (Employment Equity Act). Du Plessis (2005) advises employers to make it clear in the job advertisement that successful applicants may be expected to undergo a medical examination. The impact of recruitment and selection on performance is discussed in the next section.

2.6 THE IMPACT OF RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION ON PERFORMANCE

The background statement in chapter 1 emphasised the importance of both the recruitment and selection processes. The processes need to be undertaken with caution to ensure that public institutions get value for money from employees that they appoint. The challenge experienced by most South African public institutions is to deliver quality services to meet the needs of communities. These needs can be overcome using recruitment and selection processes that lead to the appointment of dedicated and skilled employees who can meaningfully contribute to the attainment of the objectives of public institutions (Rothwell & Kazanas, 1994). An institution’s strategy (vision and mission) determines the skills the human resources department should look for (Cheminais et al., 1998:137). Once a public institution has formulated its strategic plan and has decided on what its business is, its human resources
department has to estimate the quantity, quality and skills that employees should possess in order to achieve predetermined objectives. This means that human resources management activities should be designed, aligned and implemented to complement the overall strategy. This implies that the success of public institutions is dependent on whether its employees are skilled, and possess the required work attitude that would enable that public institution to achieve its objectives.

It is common knowledge that competent employees uphold a public institution’s competitive advantage over their rivals. Managers in public institutions must not perceive their employees as a means of production, but as partners that should be consulted and involved in making decisions that affect their work (Tompkins, 1995:15). According to Foot and Hook (1996:78), the primary aim of the recruitment and selection processes is to ensure that the best applicants are appointed into positions. This implies that the recruitment and selection processes can assist in predicting applicants’ future performance and the period the applicant will stay as an employee. As evidenced, human resources should be partners in strategic planning to determine the types of skills and competencies that are required to achieve objectives (Cascio, 1991:154-172). Erasmus et al. (2005:90) are of the opinion that human resource management can no longer be reduced to an administrative task performed by specialist groups applying centrally devised regulations, but is now concerned with development of human resource strategies aligned to organisational strategy and operational plans. In this manner, human resource is value adding and forms a critical part of the formulation of business objectives and strategies by recruiting the right quantity and quality of employees to achieve objectives.

Gomez-Mejia, Balkin and Cardy (1998:36-37) argue that for public institutions to be judged successful they have to evaluate how effectively they have used their human resources. The efficient utilisation of human resources can be measured among other factors, through their success in recruiting, selecting and eventually appointment of employees. From the discussion of the theory of the recruitment and selection processes, it is noticeable that the processes are aimed at achieving a ‘performance’ goal. The goal which managers of public institutions anticipate to achieve, as noted in this theoretical discussion, is to achieve the mandates bestowed upon institutions by legislation. This is to say that, should a public institution fail to acquire the right type of employees, their chances of performing to satisfy the needs
that are placed on them become bleak. According to French (1994:13), the reverse side of this means that if applicants with skills and competencies are appointed, institutions’ have a greater chance of increasing their performance and the ability to achieve their objectives than those whose employees are unskilled. In fact, institutions gain diversity of skills and as a result they acquire a competitive advantage over competitors.

2.7 CONCLUSION

The main intention of this chapter was to explain the theory of recruitment and selection. Through the discussions, it became evident that there is an abundance of research on recruitment and selection processes, mainly on how they are undertaken in both the public and private sectors. The development of this theory is insufficient in the discipline ‘public administration’. This happens despite an acknowledgement that how public and private sector institutions operate is different.

In view of the discussion in this chapter it can be concluded that the type of employees a public sector recruits and select to appoint determine its future success or failure. Recruitment and selection help in determining the destiny of a public institution. By recruiting and appointing competent applicants and correctly placing them in positions where they would best perform their duties could lead to the improvement of the overall productivity of public institutions. Recruitment and selection processes should be guided by public institutions’ strategies, missions and objectives to avoid appointing candidates with skills irrelevant for the attainment of objectives. However, it would be a waste of resources to recruit, select and appoint competent applicants and not retain them. The success of human resources departments is measured on their recruitment and retention of competent employees for improved service delivery.
CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The crux of the discussions in this chapter is that both recruitment and selection processes are not undertaken in a vacuum, but are influenced by changes in the legislation and other types of environments within which public institutions operate. Recruitment and selection criteria set by public institutions, are therefore, expected to conform to these environmental requirements. This chapter focuses on the research design and methodology, and recognises in particular the need to reflect briefly on the study area at which the activities were carried out. This focus is necessary to explain the context within which the research design and methodology and the concluding remarks upon which the study arrives at. Subsequent to the discussion of the study area, focus is placed respectively on the discussions of the research design and methodology. The Growth and Development Strategy of the CoJ identifies among its main priorities the reduction of high crime levels. In order to achieve this, the JMPD should appoint competent sergeants and inspectors. This study therefore focuses on the sergeants and inspector competencies.

3.2 THE JOHANNESBURG METROPOLITAN POLICE DEPARTMENT

The City of Johannesburg (CoJ) is the economic hub of South Africa. According to population census conducted in 2008, the city had 3.8 million residents and consisted of 22 departments and (fourteen) 14 municipal entities. It operates on a budget of R26 billion to fund projects that are intended to assist in the attainment of its 2030 long-term strategy of becoming a world-class city. Because of its economic strength, CoJ attracts people from other parts of South Africa and Southern African countries seeking employment opportunities and better living standards. According to De Jong and Fawcett (1981:43) people migrate not only for economic motives but also for other motives. The increasing crime rate in South African communities and African
countries could be another reason of people to migrating to the CoJ (Morris & Bouillon, 2001:9; Walker, 1990:177).

The Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department (JMPD) was established in March 2001 for the explicit purpose of reducing crime, in particular for creating an environment conducive for domestic and foreign investment. According to the City of Johannesburg’s System Application Product R/3 Human Resources (CoJ SAP H/3-HR), the JMPD during the year 2012 employed about two thousand (2000) police officers and one thousand two hundred (1200) support staff. The mandate of the JMPD is to coordinate and manages the CoJ’s crime prevention strategy which includes preventative policing and patrolling high risk crime areas, maintenance of an information management system (IMS), to share crime data with the South African Police Service (SAPS), to establish private security partnerships with community policing forums (CPFs) and to enforce municipal by-laws and traffic management regulations within the boundaries of its seven regions. The JMPD has a well-established Municipal Courts system to prosecute by-law and traffic offenders (Newman, Masuku & Gomomo, 2002:21).

The JMPD’s mandate is derived from the South African Police Service Act 83 of 1995. Figure 3.1 below illustrates the regions within which the JMPD operates.

Figure 3.1: Regions within which the Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department operate

Source: www.joburg.co.za (Regions)
As illustrated in Figure 3.1, the JMPD operates in seven regions, namely Region A (Diepsloot, Midrand and Ivory Park), B (Rosebank and Parktown), C (North Gate and Roodepoort), D (consisting mainly of parts of Soweto), E (Woodmead, Wynburg, Alexandra and Bruma), F (Johannesburg CBD) and G (Lenasia, Ennerdale and Orange Farm). In order to be able to fulfill its mandates, it employs police officials who occupy various police ranks in all its areas of policing. New police recruits are trained at its Academy and are expected to have undergone formal training in criminal law, community policing and police ethics before they are considered for full-time appointment. The entry requirements to this training academy are a school-leaving certificate (Grade 12), a valid driver’s licence, and like all public institutions within the country, applicants are expected to have no criminal record.

During the six months long period of training, trainees undergo basic training in firearms control, making arrests, accident reporting and presentation of evidence in the courts of justice. After they have successfully completed basic police training, trainees are deployed to SAPS police stations for a further six months training (probation) before being assigned to speciality sections of the JMPD. As part of their personal development and to assist them to carry out their tasks effectively, all police officers in the JMPD undergo an annual in-service training where they are briefed about amendments to Road Traffic and Police Acts. Those officers that are appointed in specialised units, (for example, equestrian, dog and accident units) undergo training in these respective specialities. The JMPD works in partnership with government departments such as the Department of Home Affairs to control immigration, with the CoJ’s Health Department to regulate and promote environmental cleanliness and to control illegal dumping, and with SAPS to promote safety and security.

3.3 RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION PROCESSES IN THE JMPD

Being a public institution whose mandate is to deliver a public function using public funds, the JMPD carries out its mandate as enshrined in various policy and legislative guidelines. Within the parameters of the legislative framework regulating the management and maintenance of human resources, the CoJ in 2010 developed
a Talent Acquisition Policy that is followed by all municipal departments in recruiting, selecting and retaining employees.

The Talent Acquisition policy of the CoJ mandates all municipal departments to recruit and fill vacant positions when there is a need to do so. The JMPD, as one of the COJ’s departments, uses the same policy in undertaking its recruitment and selection processes. The objective of the CoJ’s Talent Acquisition Policy is to:

- ensure substantive and procedural fairness during recruitment and selection processes;
- guide the recruitment, selection and appointment of applicants to positions in which they can perform satisfactorily;
- ensure that competent, suitably skilled and best possible applicants are placed so as to achieve the operational and strategic requirements of municipal departments;
- ensure fair and equitable treatment of internal and external applicants;
- ensure that all CoJ appointees are competent and have the potential to fulfil required performance outputs of respective job descriptions;
- ensure that all recruitment activities are handled according to best practice and professional guidelines;
- establish principles and procedures ensuring that CoJ complies with legislative principles in respect of employment equity and affirmative action; and
- ensure progressive and non-discriminatory recruitment and selection practices at all times.

Furthermore, the Talent Acquisition Policy emphasises the need to ensure that recruitment and selection processes are conducted in a professional, fair, objective, and transparent manner that does not discriminate to afford all applicants the opportunity to compete for vacant posts.

In this way, the Talent Acquisition Policy forbids unfair discrimination, either directly or indirectly, against any applicant or employee. Within the parameters of the Talent and Acquisition Policy, the JMPD recruits internally before considering external applicants. Vacant positions are circularised internally and if the internal applicants
do not meet the standard appointment requirements, vacancies are advertised externally. As indicated previously, it is however, a normal procedure to require that applicants must have no previous convictions or criminal records.

Where necessary and if budgeted for, the JMPD may in terms of its policies acquire the services of an approved recruitment agency that subscribes to the employment equity principles, to conduct recruitment and selection process on its behalf. However, after acquiring such services, measures are taken to ensure that such an entity conducts its activities to the expectations of the law, most notably, compliance to legislative requirements contained in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Basic Conditions of Employment Act, Labour Relations Act, and Employment Equity Act.

The Director of Human Resource Shares Services has powers to identify positions for headhunting or targeted recruitment agencies based on urgency and complexity of those positions. Headhunting is done only on skills that are deemed scarce or critical, most of which are senior positions. Headhunting and targeted recruitment, as provided for by policy guidelines, should only be used in conjunction with the normal advertising of vacancies. This means that a headhunted candidate should be encouraged to apply for the advertised position, whereafter the normal selection processes will take place (CoJ Talent Acquisition Policy, 2010).

3.4 RESEARCH DESIGN

3.4.1 Target sample and sampling procedure

A target sample of one hundred and sixty two (n=162) respondents from all ranks of the JMPD was selected from a total number of two thousand employees. The approach followed in selecting a research sample for this study was random sampling, through which all the employees were given an opportunity to be part of the research (Welman and Kruger, 2002:47). Measures were undertaken to ensure that the research sample consisted of respondents from all police ranks (constables, sergeants, inspectors, superintendents and chief superintendents) in the JMPD. The reason underlying targeting respondents at various police ranks was determined by
the nature of police work that they perform being different. As noted in chapter 1, constables, sergeants and inspectors perform operational duties, whilst superintendents and chief superintendents perform managerial duties. It is hoped that the data gathered from respondents performing operational and management duties would give a holistic perspective on how recruitment and selection practices can be improved in the study area.

3.4.2 Racial and gender composition of respondents

A representative sample of respondents was drawn from all racial groups (Blacks, Coloureds, Whites and Indians) and different gender groups (males and females) in the JMPD. The reason underlying considering the race and gender composition of respondents as important aspects of the study was informed by the notion that respondents from different race and gender groups that interact at different levels in a public institution are exposed to different conditions and therefore, their perceptions and responses are guided by those different experiences. All the information that has been gathered from this research sample is generalised to represent the entire population of the JMPD.

3.4.3 The number of years of experience of respondents

In addition to the race and gender of respondents, measures were also undertaken to ensure that the research sample was drawn from police officers whose number of years of experience in the JMPD differed. Consistent to respondents’ race and gender groups, the actual number of years of experience of respondents in a work environment influences their perceptions of how practices, most notably, recruitment and selection processes, are undertaken. A detailed discussion of the number of years of experience of respondents is presented as part of the findings of the research in chapter 4.
3.5 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research methodology that was used is quantitative and was augmented by the author’s experience that has been accumulated over a period of eight years of service in the JMPD. As explained in chapter 1, a research questionnaire that focused on gathering and classifying data into four main sections was developed and pretested for reliability.

3.5.1 The research questionnaire

As noted in the previous discussion, the research questionnaire collected and classified data into four main sections. Section A gathered data on respondents’ biographical information; their race, gender, occupational rank and number of years of experience in the JMPD.

Section B gathered data about how the respondents thought the recruitment process was undertaken and consisted of seven sub-items. These sub-items were about whether:

1) the Human Resources Management (HRM) Department circularises and advertises vacant positions;
2) the JMPD’s Talent Acquisition Policy provides guidelines on how the recruitment process should be undertaken;
3) the HRM department adheres to the Talent Acquisition Policy guidelines;
4) labour organisations participate in the recruitment process;
5) the JMPD recruits internally and externally;
6) the recruitment process is transparent; and
7) the recruitment process is able to develop a pool of applicants from which the selection process can be made.

Section C of the research questionnaire gathered data about how the respondents thought the selection process was undertaken and enquired on nine sub-items that are briefly described hereunder. The sub-items enquired on whether:

1. the recruitment and selection panels consists of the same individuals;
2. line managers form part of the selection panel;
3. a formal policing qualification is a prerequisite for appointment to sergeants and inspector positions;
4. positions in the JMPD require security screening before appointments are made;
5. a fair and consistent screening criterion is followed during the selection process;
6. a fair and consistent short-listing process has been developed and adhered to;
7. selection is based on competency relevant to specific vacant positions;
8. applicants are selected based on acquired skills and experiences; and
9. formal qualifications take precedence over experience when selecting applicants.

The data that was gathered through section D was open-ended in nature and respondents could raise issues that they though could be helpful in the improving the way in which the recruitment and selection processes are undertaken in the JMPD. As in the case with the sections A, B and C, the findings of the data gathered through section D are interpreted in chapter 4.

3.6 ADHERENCE TO ETHICAL GUIDELINES

Whilst carrying out the research activities, all the ethical considerations governing research management in the JMPD were adhered to. A request for special permission to conduct the study in the JMPD was requested and granted by senior management (see Annexure B). Respondents were assured of their anonymity and that all the information gathered from them will be strictly be used for the purpose of the study and that their names will be withheld and not disclosed to any other party, whether the management of the JMPD or any other party that might be interested in the information. The respondents were also accorded the necessary respect and sensitivity that they deserve. Their participation, as they were informed, was voluntary and they could decline responding to questions they did not wish to respond to.
3.7 CONCLUSION

The discussions in this chapter were consistent with both the objective to explain the research design and methodology and as described in chapter 1. The discussions in this chapter evolves along a firm theoretical framework of the recruitment and selection processes in chapter 2 as a basis from which to construct a research design and methodology, as well as a questionnaire. The research area – JMPD- and how the recruitment and selection processes are undertaken were introduced.

From this discussion it became evident that the JMPD as a municipal department of the CoJ has a specific mandate that it has to achieve using its human resources, namely the police officials at the different police ranks. The conclusion that can be drawn from such a discussion is that for the JMPD to perform satisfactorily in achieving its mandate, the recruitment and selection processes should be undertaken cautiously and conscientiously. This chapter also explained the research design and methodology, in particular the structure of the research questionnaire from which a structure of the discussions of the findings in the next chapter is set.
CHAPTER 4
THE FINDINGS OF THE RESEARCH

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The objective of the discussions in chapter 3 was to describe the research design and research methodology. As part of the research design, the chapter introduced the study area at which the research activities were carried out, and concomitant with the discussion of the research methodology, it explained the research instrument and the groups of respondents from whom the data was gathered. What is notable from chapter 3 is that the Talent Acquisition Policy (2010) appears to provide guidelines not only for the retention of employees, but also to the manner in which the JMPD and all other municipal departments carry out the recruitment and selection processes. This chapter explores whether the Talent Acquisition Policy is perceived as effective in achieving its objectives.

4.2 THE FINDINGS OF THE RESEARCH

The presentation of the findings follows the structure of the questionnaire (see Annexure A), sections A: biographical data of respondents, B: questionnaire items focusing on recruitment process, C: questionnaire items focusing on the selection process and D: that gathers data about general questions that respondents thought could assist in the bid to improve the manner in which the recruitment and selection processes are undertaken in the JMPD.

4.2.1 Section A: Biographical data

As explained in chapter 3, the research sample consisted of respondents from various gender and racial groups and who interacted at various police ranks in the JMPD.
4.2.1.1 Gender, race and ranks of respondents

As illustrated in Table 4.1, the majority of respondents (36.42%) were black male constables and the second highest majority (4.94%) of respondents were black male sergeants. In total, two respondents (1.23%) were each drawn from respondents in the ranks of black male inspectors, black male superintendents (middle managers) and black male chief superintendents. Approximately three respondents (1.85%) were black male deputy/directors (senior managers). Black female constables constituted 18.52% and black female sergeants 4.94% of the targeted respondents.

In addition to respondents drawn from the Black racial group, the research sample consisted of respondents drawn from the Coloured, White and Indian race groups. This measure was undertaken to ensure that the target sample was diverse, though it cannot be indicative of the actual racial profile of the JMPD. The target sample consisted of 4.94% coloured male constables, 2.47% coloured male sergeants, 2.47% coloured female constables and 0.62% of coloured female sergeants. As illustrated in Table 4.1 below, there were in total 2.47% Indian male constables that participated as respondents to this research. Furthermore, the research sample consisted of 6.17% white male constables, 4.32% white male sergeants, 0.62% white male inspectors, 0.62% white male superintendents, 0.62% white male chief superintendents, 1.85% white female constable and 2.47% white female sergeants.

The unfortunate situation that influenced the composition of the research sample is that despite the introduction of the Employment Equity Act and its legislative requirement to public institutions in general to apply affirmative action measures, the JMPD is still dominated by males. Gender and equity policies in these public institutions still exist on paper and the outcomes thereof have not yet been achieved (Blackmore, Thompson and Barty, 2006:311). Despite the introduction of these policies, women with the same attributes, capabilities and skills still find it difficult to access job opportunities in this sector.
4.2.1.2 The number of years of experience of respondents

In addition to the above three sub-items of the biographical data, the number of years of experience of respondents was considered as important. The respondents’ numbers of years of experience in the JMPD were classified into five main groups ranging between 1 - 3; 3 – 5; 5 – 8 and 10 years and more. As illustrated in Table 4.1 below, the majority of respondents (37.65%) had been in the service of the JMPD for ten years and more. The second and third highest groups of respondents were of respondents whose number of years of experience ranged between 5 – 8 (24.69%) and 3 – 5 (27.16%). all respondents have experience of more than a year as police officers. As illustrated in Table 4.1 the majority of respondents had gained extensive experience in the various roles of the JMPD as opposed to the minority of respondents (12.96%), who at the time of gathering data had only been with the JMPD for the number of years not exceeding three years.

The information in Table 4.1 can be interpreted as: N indicating the number of respondents per race, gender and rank;
% indicating Percentages;
< indicating less than;
Yrs indicating Years; and
Exp indicating Experience
## Table 4.1 Race, gender, rank and number of years of experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>&lt;1yr exp</th>
<th>1-3 yrs</th>
<th>3-5 yrs exp</th>
<th>5-8 yrs exp</th>
<th>10 &amp; more yrs exp</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Constable</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>36.42</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Sergeants</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4.94</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Inspector</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Superintendent</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Chief superintendent</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Deputy/Director</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.85</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Constables</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>18.52</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Sergeants</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4.94</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Constables</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4.94</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Sergeants</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Constables</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Sergeants</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Constables</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Constables</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6.17</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Sergeants</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4.32</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Inspectors</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Superintendent</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Chief superintendent</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Constables</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.85</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Sergeants</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2.2 Section B: Responses about the recruitment process

As explained in chapter 3, the focus on the recruitment process has been organised into seven questions that are listed in the first column of Table 4.2 below. Responses to these questions are classified into five categories from which respondents had to match their level of agreement, disagreement or uncertainty. Table 4.2 below illustrates the responses about the recruitment process.

Table 4.2: Responses about the recruitment process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Disagree %</th>
<th>Agree to a certain extent %</th>
<th>Agree %</th>
<th>Strongly Agree %</th>
<th>Uncertain %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6. The HRM department circularises and advertises all vacant positions in the JMPD</td>
<td>31.48</td>
<td>24.69</td>
<td>28.40</td>
<td>9.26</td>
<td>6.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The JMPD’s Talent Acquisition Policy provides guidelines on how the recruitment process should be undertaken (U6)</td>
<td>32.72</td>
<td>20.99</td>
<td>19.75</td>
<td>11.75</td>
<td>14.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The HRM department adheres to the guidelines of the Talent Acquisition Policy when conducting the recruitment process</td>
<td>30.04</td>
<td>25.93</td>
<td>14.81</td>
<td>8.64</td>
<td>13.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Labour organisations participate in the recruitment (U7) process to ensure fairness and transparency</td>
<td>32.10</td>
<td>32.72</td>
<td>17.90</td>
<td>6.17</td>
<td>11.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. The JMPD recruits internally and externally</td>
<td>15.43</td>
<td>14.81</td>
<td>16.05</td>
<td>38.90</td>
<td>14.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. All aspects of the recruitment process (U8) are transparent</td>
<td>45.06</td>
<td>19.75</td>
<td>14.20</td>
<td>11.11</td>
<td>9.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. The recruitment process results in a pool from which applicants can be selected</td>
<td>31.48</td>
<td>17.28</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>22.84</td>
<td>11.73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Responses to each of the seven sub-items illustrated in Table 4.2 above are explained separately in subsequent sections.
4.2.2.1 Circularisation and advertisement of vacant positions

The major intention of this question was to check whether the perceptions of the police personnel could be consistent with the provisions of the CoJ’s Talent Acquisition Policy. It makes provision that vacancies shall be circularised and distributed within the CoJ in such a manner as to bring them to the attention of a wide pool of potential employees. In cases where such vacancies cannot be filled from within, they have to be advertised externally. As illustrated in Table 4.2, the majority of respondents (31.48%) disagreed, thus implying that vacant positions are not circularised and advertised. The second highest majority of respondents (28.40%) agreed that vacant positions are circularised and advertised, whilst the third (24.69%) highest group consisted of respondents who could only agree to a certain extent that vacant positions are indeed circularised and advertised. In addition to those that agreed, the second lowest majority, (9.26%) agreed strongly that vacant positions are advertised whilst a small fraction (6.17%) of respondents were uncertain.

4.2.2.2 The City of Johannesburg’s TAP guidelines on the recruitment process

The TAP, as noted in chapter 3, is a policy framework that guides how the JMPD undertakes the recruitment process. The manner in which the policy guidelines are communicated is important in contributing towards attempts to reduce misunderstanding between the employer, stakeholders such as labour organisations and employees in general. Gathering data about the respondents’ knowledge of the TAP’s guidelines on how the recruitment process should be undertaken could be helpful in understanding whether policies are communicated regularly or not. It could also be helpful in ascertaining whether employees that are at the lowest echelons of the public institution stay informed. The majority of participants (32.72%) disagree that the Talent Acquisition Policy provides guidelines on recruitment, 20.99% agree to a certain extent, 19.75% agree, 11.75% strongly agree whilst 14.81% are uncertain.
4.2.2.3 Adherence by the Human Resource Management department to the Talent Acquisition Policy guidelines

In gathering data about knowledge of the TAP’s guidelines on the recruitment process, respondents were asked to reveal their experiences on whether they perceived the HRM department as adhering to these guidelines or not. As illustrated in Table 4.2, the majority of respondents (37.04%) disagreed with the statement that the HRM adheres to the TAP’s guidelines on the recruitment process. The second highest majority of respondents (25.93%) agreed to a certain extent, whilst the second lowest number (14.81%) of them agreed. 8.64% strongly agree and 13.58% are uncertain on whether the HRM department adhered to the TAP guidelines or not.

4.2.2.4 Participation of labour organisations in the recruitment process

In terms of the theory that has been discussed in chapter 3, labour organisations, as stakeholders in most public institutions, play an important role in the development and consultation of policies. Their participation in the implementation of employment policies helps to avoid favouritism, corruption and nepotism and if they are consulted, managers are able to avoid strikes that may end up costly. As illustrated in Table 4.2, most respondents (32.10%) disagree that organised labour participates in the recruitment process in the JMPD, 32.72% agree to a certain extent, 17.90% agree, 6.16 strongly agree, 11.11% are uncertain.

4.2.2.5 Internal and external recruitment

As noted in the findings of whether vacant positions are circularised and advertised, the TAP provides that vacant positions that could not be filled using internal recruitment sources should be advertised externally. Whilst responding to this item, the majority of respondents (38.90%) strongly agree that the JMPD uses both internal and external sources of recruitment, 16.05% agree, 14.81% agree to a certain extent whilst 15.43% disagree. Respondents expressed a mixed and
confusing reaction as an institution can hire employees either internally and externally.

4.2.2.6 Transparency of the recruitment process

Transparency refers to a process where institutional labour needs are openly discussed, and where there is consensus on procedures to follow to acquire labour, as opposed to just a few key players making decisions that should be the concern of many. With regard to all aspects of recruitment and selection being transparent, 45.06% disagree, 19.75% agree to a certain extent, 14.20% agree, 11.11% strongly agree and the rest (9.88%) are uncertain. Transparent recruitment and selection is important as it could be a factor in lessening labour unrest especially when labour organisations are involved.

4.2.2.7 Pool of applicants from which the selection process can be made

As a result of advertisements being accessible to quite a proportionate number of job seekers, it is seldom that public institutions receive a small number of applications. Depending on the nature of the job and the sector in which the vacant position is advertised, public institutions often receive thousands of job applications from which they are able to select applicants that best meet the requirements of the advertised job. In response to the question on the recruitment process resulting in a pool from which applicants can be selected, a majority (31.48%) disagree, implying that there is hardly an adequate pool from which to select. 17.28% agree to a certain extent, which suggests that respondents doubt that the recruitment process really ensures a pool from which competent applicants can be selected. However, a combined percentage of 39.51 (16.67% agree and 22.84% strongly agree) are of the opinion that recruitment results in a pool from which competent applicants can be selected, whilst 11.73% are uncertain.
4.2.3 Section C: The selection process

The previous section discussed respondents' views on recruitment. This section aims to present and discuss participants' views on the selection process in the JMPD.

Table 4.3 Respondents' views on the selection process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Strongly disagree %</th>
<th>Disagree %</th>
<th>Strongly agree %</th>
<th>Agree %</th>
<th>Uncertain %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13. The same recruitment panel comprises the selection panel</td>
<td>24.69</td>
<td>14.20</td>
<td>16.05</td>
<td>16.05</td>
<td>29.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Line managers (superintendents and chief superintendents) form part of the selection panel</td>
<td>16.05</td>
<td>17.28</td>
<td>19.75</td>
<td>23.46</td>
<td>23.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. A formal qualification in policing is a prerequisite to be appointed as sergeant and inspector</td>
<td>43.83</td>
<td>9.26</td>
<td>13.58</td>
<td>15.43</td>
<td>17.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Positions (U15) in the JMPD require security screening before appointment</td>
<td>19.75</td>
<td>17.28</td>
<td>23.46</td>
<td>20.99</td>
<td>18.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. A fair and consistent screening criterion (18) is followed during the selection process</td>
<td>41.36</td>
<td>19.75</td>
<td>13.58</td>
<td>12.35</td>
<td>12.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. A fair and consistent short-listing process has been developed and adhered to</td>
<td>41.98</td>
<td>21.60</td>
<td>13.58</td>
<td>13.58</td>
<td>9.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Selection is based on competency relevant to specific vacant position</td>
<td>45.68</td>
<td>14.20</td>
<td>14.81</td>
<td>16.05</td>
<td>9.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Applicants are selected based on skills and experience</td>
<td>54.94</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>9.88</td>
<td>10.49</td>
<td>8.02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With regard to selections (statements 13-21) respondents' opinion on selection is as follows:
Table 4.3 reflects 24.69% of respondents strongly disagree that the same interview panel comprise the selection panel, 14.20% disagree, 16.05% strongly agree, 16.05% agree and of the respondents, 29.01% are uncertain. The policy states that members of the interview panel, except the observers (who do not score), take part in the final decision making stage and are responsible for selecting applicants and making final recommendations.

In response to the statement (14) on line managers participating in selection, 16.05% strongly disagree that superintendents and chief superintendents take part in selection, 17.28% disagree, 19.75% strongly agree, 23.46% agree whilst 23.46% are uncertain. It is common practice for the CoJ to use line managers as selectors, although this is not a requirement. Line managers are experienced and know what is required of an applicant to be appointed sergeant or inspector.

A majority (43.83%) strongly disagree that formal qualification is prerequisite to be appointed sergeant or inspector, 9.26% disagree, 13.58% strongly agree, 15.43% agree whereas 17.90% are uncertain. The policy states that applicants shall be suitably qualified for a job within the city as a result of the combination of two or more of the appropriate qualification, prior learning, relevant experience and capacity to acquire within a reasonable time (at most six months) the ability to do the job. Setting formal qualification as a priority to be appointed on positions could provide the employees with the opportunity for personal and career growth within the institution.

Despite the fact that positions in the JMPD, Emergency Services (EMS) and certain categories within Finance require security screening in terms of the policy, 19.75% of the respondents strongly disagree that positions in the JMPD require security screening, 17.28% disagree, 23.46% strongly agree, 20.99% agree whilst 18.52% are uncertain. This further illustrates that over half (55.55%), of the total of those who strongly disagree, disagree and are uncertain are not aware of the important content of the policy. According to the policy no one should be appointed in the JMPD without security clearance if the policy is adhered to, therefore ensuring that only law abiding citizens are appointed as police officers.
Respondents expressed mixed reactions with regards to the fair and consistent screening followed during selection (statement 17). A majority of respondents (41.36%) strongly disagree that a fair and consistent screening criterion is followed, 19.75% disagree, 13.58% of the respondents is of the opinion that a fair and consistent screening criterion is followed during the selection process, 12.35% agree and 12.96% is uncertain. It is important for a police department to screen applicants to ensure that criminals are not employed as police officers. It could save money that could have been spent sifting through volumes of applications forms for applicants with criminal records.

Despite the fact that statements 17 and 18 are similar, respondents have different opinions on both statements. Table 4.3 shows that 41.98% (strongly disagree), believe that the JMPD has not developed and adhered to a fair and consistent shortlisting process. As indicated by Robbins, Odendaal and Roodt (2003: 352), selection aims at complying with legal requirements of ensuring fairness, objectivity and consistency. A further 19.75% of respondents disagree that the JMPD has a fair and consistent shortlisting process, 13.58% strongly agree that there is a fair and consistent shortlisting process, another 13.58% agree while 9.26% is uncertain. There can never be transparency without a fair and consistent shortlisting process adhered to, hence the study’s objective of determining the effectiveness of recruitment and selection within the JMPD.

With regard to selection based on competency relevant to specific job positions, 45.68% of respondents strongly disagree, 14.20% disagree, 14.81% strongly agree that that applicants are selected based on their competencies, 16.05% agree while 9.26% are uncertain. Matching competency with specific job requirements could assist in improving work performance of candidates. This could determine the link between recruitment and selection and organisational performance.

More than half of the respondents (54.94%) strongly disagree that the JMPD selects applicants based on their skills and experience. A further 16.67% disagree, 9.88% strongly agree, 10.49% agree and 8.02% uncertain. Sometimes selectors overlook applicants with no formal qualifications even though they are
experienced. Experienced applicants have spent a long period of time doing the job and are therefore also qualified. Experience is needed especially in crime fighting. In terms of the CoJ recruitment policy an applicant shall be suitably qualified for appointment based on appropriate qualifications, prior learning, relevant experience and the ability to acquire within a reasonable period of time (six months), the ability to do the job.

A majority (46.91%) strongly disagree with the statement that formal qualifications take precedence over experience when selecting applicants, 9.88% disagree, 13.58% strongly agree, 12.96% agree and 16.67% are uncertain. The media and the community complain of poor services citing lack of relevant qualifications and experience as the reason thereof.

4.2.4 Section D: General questions

The previous section discussed selection. This section discusses general questions on recruitment and selection. Respondents’ opinions are captured in Table 4.4 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Always %</th>
<th>Often %</th>
<th>Sometimes %</th>
<th>Seldom %</th>
<th>Never %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22. Recruiting and selecting experienced and skilled personnel would assist the JMPD in its quest to reduce high crime levels</td>
<td>45.68</td>
<td>5.55</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>15.43</td>
<td>16.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Management would appoint skilled and highly qualified applicants than them as sergeants and inspectors</td>
<td>14.20</td>
<td>13.58</td>
<td>17.90</td>
<td>11.11</td>
<td>43.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Would you be comfortable reporting to a senior less qualified than you?</td>
<td>12.34</td>
<td>9.26</td>
<td>13.58</td>
<td>9.88</td>
<td>54.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Writing and communication skills are important to be appointed as sergeant or inspector</td>
<td>37.04</td>
<td>4.32</td>
<td>21.60</td>
<td>9.88</td>
<td>27.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. To what extent is decision-making skills required from applicants?</td>
<td>28.39</td>
<td>9.88</td>
<td>24.07</td>
<td>7.41</td>
<td>30.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As illustrated in Table 4.4 a majority of respondents (45.68%) are of the opinion that recruiting and selecting experienced and skilled personnel would assist the JMPD in its quest to reduce high crime levels, 5.55% believe recruiting and selecting experienced and skilled personnel would often assist in reducing high crime levels, 16.67% are of the view that it would sometimes assist, 15.43% indicated that experienced and skilled personnel would seldom assist in crime reduction. It is surprising that 16.67% of police officers say that recruiting experienced and skilled personnel will never assist in crime reduction despite the fact that, commonly, organisations with experienced and skilled personnel succeed compared to those with inexperienced and unqualified staff. It is clear from the literature that competent employees are important as Topkins (1995: 184) notes that public and private institutions compete with each other for qualified and competent applicants. This competition is for the appointment of competent applicants to improve organisational work performance.

A majority of participants (43.21%) is of the opinion that the JMPD management will never appoint more skilled and experienced applicant than them (management). This could mean that the JMPD is not serious in its quest to match the right skills with the right job positions. However, 14.20% believe management will always appoint more experienced and skilled personnel than them (management), 13.58% believe that management will often appoint experienced applicants as sergeants or inspectors, 17.90% is of the view that management will sometimes appoint experienced and skilled applicants than them whilst 11.11% is of opinion that experienced and skilled applicants are seldom appointed as sergeants and inspectors. Selectors can sometimes overlook experienced and skilled applicants for fear of being undermined by applicants (especially if selectors are internal employees). Selectors should appoint applicants considering the overall objective of the organisation and not be concerned with personal interest.

Table 4.4 shows that a majority of applicants (54.94%) are uncomfortable reporting to a senior less qualified than them, 9.88% believe they would seldom report to a less qualified senior than them, 13.58% are of the opinion they would sometimes be comfortable working under a less qualified, 9.26% would often be
comfortable reporting to a less qualified senior and 12.34% would always be comfortable reporting to a senior less qualified senior. The CoJ Talent Acquisition Policy states that an applicant is qualified as a result of two or more of an appropriate qualification, prior learning to acknowledge recognition of prior learning (RPL), relevant experience and the capacity acquire knowledge within a reasonable period of time (six months). Some employees may not possess formal qualification but experienced in their jobs. A less qualified applicant can be appointed to comply with the Employment Equity requirements. It is clear from the results that it is or will be difficult to form competent teams with these kind of employees in the JMPD. It seems like new employees will be accepted if they are equal or more qualified than the current employees.

With regard to the importance of writing and communication skills to be appointment as sergeant or inspector, 37.04% view writing and communication skills as always important for appointment as sergeant or inspector, 4.32% view writing and communication skills as often important, 21.60% are of the opinion that the skills are sometimes important whilst 27.16% are of the opinion that writing and communication skills are never important to be appointed as sergeant or inspector. Sergeants and inspectors should be able to relay clear and unambiguous messages to subordinates. These skills (writing and communication) are important as sergeants and inspectors are junior supervisors and have therefore, commenced management.

On the issue of decision-making skills, 28.39% indicated that decision-making skills is always required when sergeant and inspectors are appointed. The majority of the participants (30.25%) however believe that a decision-making skill is never required despite the fact that sergeants and inspectors are in the forefront in crime prevention. These officers should be able to make quick and correct decisions to counter criminals who use sophisticated methods in committing crime. Failure to make swift decisions could result in loss of life by the community and fellow officers. A further 27.07% consider decision-making as only required sometimes, 7.41% view decision-making as seldom required.
4.3 CONCLUSION

The outcome of data collection and analysis was presented in this chapter. It suggests that the JMPD has experienced police officers considering the fact that this metro police department is relatively new. With all participants having three or more years' experience, it would be expected that the JMPD should be able to reduce high crime levels. However research has shown that the South African labour market is characterised by poor skills in general. In view of the discussion above it can be concluded that the JMPD is also adversely affected by poor skills of its police officers in its quest to reduce high crime levels.
CHAPTER 5
CONCLUDING REMARKS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

As explained in chapter 1, the overall research objective underpinning the need to conduct this study was to investigate and gather information about how police officials at both operational and management levels with the JMPD perceived the undertaking of the recruitment and selection processes. In particular, this chapter is consistent with the study objective ‘to suggest and recommend ways through which the challenges experienced whilst undertaking the recruitment and selection processes in the JMPD can be overcome and resolved’. As a way of putting this research into a theoretical context, the literature review of recruitment and selection processes was considered as a point of departure (chapter 2) upon which all the discussions could be based. Of note from the discussions in chapter 2 was that the recruitment and selection processes are not undertaken in a vacuum, but that they are linked to both the individual and institution’s performance and the ability of the institution to achieve its objectives.

As noted in the discussion of the research design and methodology in chapter 3, the research activities were carried out at the JMPD, the police department of the CoJ. The target sample was drawn from a population of police officials from both operational and management levels, from whom valuable opinions about the undertaking of recruitment and selection processes were gathered. What makes their opinions essential is that they are based on experience that has been acquired over long periods of service within the JMPD, and as a result such experiences can be helpful in the consideration of how to improve the manner in which the recruitment and selection processes are undertaken. The concluding remarks and recommendations that are discussed in this chapter are based on the findings that were presented in chapter 4.
5.2 CONCLUDING REMARKS

As outlined in the introductory remarks, if both the recruitment and selection processes are undertaken as intended, they enhance the likelihood of a public institution, in this case the JMPD, to achieve its objectives. The findings that are discussed in chapter 4 indicate that there is progress that has been made in providing guidance regarding how the recruitment and selection processes should be undertaken. Evidence of this progress is notable from the adoption of the Talent Acquisition Policy (2010), that not only guides how municipal departments, including the JMPD, should undertake the recruitment processes, but that also integrates the recruitment and selection processes with other employment processes, especially retention strategy. However, despite this progress, the findings also point to concerns about the overall undertaking of the recruitment and selection processes for which solutions need to be sought.

In terms of the findings about the recruitment process (section B), the opinions of the police officers point to discontent about how the recruitment and selection process is undertaken and lack of familiarity with the Talent Acquisition Policy. Amongst the research items that point to these, are police officers’ opinions and experiences about the circularisation and advertisement of vacant positions, the Talent Acquisition Policy’s guidelines over recruitment, adherence to such guidelines, and the participation of labour organisations in the recruitment process. Also pertinent is whether the JMPD recruited internally or externally, as well as opinions about whether the recruitment process was transparent and whether the recruitment and selection processes resulted in a pool of applicants from which selection could be made. Recommendations that are seen in the light of being able to resolve the negativities relating to the recruitment process are later proposed in this chapter.

In addition to the findings about the recruitment process, respondents’ opinions on nine selection process related sub-items necessitated the proposition of recommendations. The views of the majority of respondents were characterised by disagreement and uncertainty, especially on items about the composition of
the selection panels, consistency of the procedures that are applied during the selection process as well as the requirements for appointment to positions of sergeant and inspector. The findings present a picture in which the selection process is perceived as inconsistent, procedurally unfair, opaque and deviating from the provisions of the Talent Acquisition Policy. It is disturbing to note that more than half of the respondents perceive recruitment and selection panels within the JMPD as not considering skills and experience during the selection process. These views have a potential of leading to low employee morale and consequently brain drain, as a result of employees being unable to foresee career growth, if not prudently attended to.

These findings could also mean that within the JMPD favouritism and nepotism are widely tolerated practices during the selection process. The findings could further mean that experienced and skilled applicants are not being considered despite meeting requirements, the impact of which might be disastrous on the JMPD’s performance and its ability to retain police officers and deal effectively with crime.

Additionally, the findings on the general comments gave insight on how the undertaking of the recruitment and selection processes could be improved. Though the intention was to gather information that was general in nature, much of the comments were about formal requirements, such as work experience, skills and academic qualifications that applicants to positions of sergeant or inspector need to possess. The findings of the general comments, like in the case of those of the recruitment and selection process, necessitated the proposal of recommendations through which identified negativities could be resolved.

5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

The concluding remarks that have been discussed above necessitate that certain actions to resolve identified negativities be undertaken. These recommendations are put forward as proposals through which the undertaking of the recruitment and selection process can be improved in the JMPD. These recommendations
are derived from concluding remarks relating to sections A, B and C respectively. Because all respondents had been within the service of the JMPD for more than a year as police officers, it can be assumed that orientation or induction programmes could have raised some level of awareness and functional information about the TAP, in particular its guidelines for both the recruitment and selection processes.

5.3.1 The recruitment process

By having the majority of respondents (31.48%) disagreeing to the statement that vacant positions are circularised and advertised raises a concern and paints a picture that the JMPD does not comply with the TAP requirements. These findings necessitate that corrective measures are undertaken to ensure that all vacant positions are indeed circularised internally and advertised to avoid dissatisfactions from applicants who could claim to have been disadvantaged from applying to be considered for vacant positions. As part of these measures, managers within the JMPD need to ensure that all employees, including those that work on a shift basis, are made aware and encouraged to apply for the vacant positions for which they meet the requirements. A special internal audit function needs to be set, to ensure that during the recruitment process, all TAP requirements, including those that relate to the recruitment process, are complied with.

In addition to the concern about the circularisation and advertisement of vacant positions, the TAP’s guidelines on how the recruitment process should be undertaken appeared as not adequately communicated, therefore creating a room for lack of knowledge and uncertainties by employees about the TAP. The lack of knowledge about the policy guidelines could result in, as mentioned earlier, internal dissatisfactions, especially when potential applicants miss the opportunity to apply for promotions for which they meet the requirements. Those who lack knowledge could think that their colleagues are favoured over them. It is recommended that the JMPD arranges policy workshops on a regular basis to create awareness not only of the TAP, but all other policies that relate to the
recruitment and employment processes. Understanding the policy guidelines could ensure that employees know how policies influence their work and employment conditions, especially their career progression within the JMPD structure.

It is a cause for concern that the majority of respondents (30.04%) disagreed that the HRM department adheres to the guidelines of the TAP when conducting the recruitment process. The findings on this item relate to and give a clue about why the majority of respondents disagreed that labour organisations participate in the recruitment process and that not all the aspects of the recruitment process are transparent. Ideally, the recruitment process should involve all key players in order to be perceived as complying with the guidelines of the TAP. Adherence to these guidelines would also enhance the likelihood of it being perceived as fair and transparent. The best way of resolving this is to ensure that labour organisations are represented in recruitment panels. Participation of labour organisations in the recruitment panels would ensure that there is transparency in how certain decisions are reached. Their participation would not only ensure that recruitment panels are representative in their composition, but that the process is fair and that it is in the best interest of the JMPD. This would also ensure that the composition of the selection panels is representative and therefore unbiased. Additionally, as stakeholder in the JMPD, labour organisations' participation in the recruitment process, though only as observers, could ensure that applicants are appointed on merit. Their involvement may also assist in building a healthy working environment and in mitigating the risk of labour strikes.

As discussed in chapter 4, public institutions seldom attract a small pool of applicants. Despite the fact that public institutions attract thousands of applicants, the majority of respondents (31.48%), disagree that the JMPD’s recruitment results in a pool of applicants from which selection can be made. This could have been influenced by the fact that most employees, as hinted to earlier, do not apply for vacant positions because they regard the recruitment process as lacking in transparency. It is therefore recommended that the JMPD keeps a database of skilled and experienced applicants who did not succeed in previous recruitment drives so that they can be encouraged to apply should similar vacancies exist.
Keeping a database of potential applicants could be helpful in reducing advertisement costs.

5.3.2 The selection process

As in the case of the discussions of the findings about the recruitment process, concerns about the selection process, that equally needs attention of the managers within the JMPD, were raised. Proposals on how these concerns can be overcome are put forth in the following discussion.

Consistent with the majority of respondents who lacked knowledge of the TAP, it appeared that a large number of respondents were not aware of how the selection panel is constituted and whether line managers participate in the selection panels. Again, as per the recommendations on how to improve employees' knowledge of the TAP, it is important that workshops whose aim is to communicate policies be conducted to enable employees to acquire functional information about the policies and how such policies affect their relationship with the employer (CoJ). Despite improving employees’ knowledge, the workshops would strengthen employee-employer relationships.

From the findings that were discussed in chapter 4 and the concluding remarks that were explained earlier in this chapter, the majority of respondents disagreed that during the selection process, managers in the JMPD take formal policing qualifications into consideration and that a fair and consistent screening and short-listing process are followed. They furthermore disagreed that the selection of applicants for vacant sergeant and inspector positions is based on competency, skills and experience. The possibility exists that these negativities may relate to the lack of transparency when undertaking selection activities. To circumvent these negativities, managers in the JMPD need to ensure that transparency is upheld. In terms of responding to negativities about JMPD’s adherence to requirements for positions, employees need to be made aware that the selection process is not based on a single requirement, but a combination of requirements, examples of which may be prior learning, relevant experience or
even the ability to acquire in a reasonable period of time such requirements. Despite this, employees would also need to be encouraged to study to keep abreast with the new ways of combating crime. In order to forbid a risk of employing criminals, security clearance should strictly become a requirement and measures should be undertaken to ensure that all applicants go through the security clearance before being finally selected. Furthermore, managers within the JMPD, need to ensure that the short-listing procedure does not discriminate on the basis of among other things race, gender and sexual orientation. Again, participation of labour organisations in selection panels is important to ensure that procedures are carried out consistently and that there is procedural fairness. These measures would not only assist in ensuring that the process is fair and objective, but that applicants are selected on the basis of merit, which would likely improve the JMPD’s performance in reducing crime.

5.4 General comments

From the discussion of the findings in chapter 4, the respondents’ general comments could be classified into five categories. These categories were dominated by the formal requirements that applicants need to have acquired to be appointed as either sergeants or inspectors in the JMPD. Without focusing separately on each of these sub-items, general proposals are put forward as recommendations that can assist in resolving the negativities emanating from these general comments.

The reason that emphasises the need to ensure that applicants meet the requirements of vacant positions has been outlined in the literature review in chapter 2. As noted in these discussions, applicants with the necessary skills, of which may be writing, communication and decision-making and academic qualifications, can perform much better in the workplace as opposed to those that do not possess these requirements. The work performance of employees that possess these requirements, as discussed in chapter 2, can also boost the performance of institutions in which they tender their service to. Therefore, the situation in which proportionate numbers of respondents are of the view that
recruiting and selecting skilled and experienced applicants will never help the JMPD in reducing crime and those who are of the opinion that managers within the JMPD will not appoint applicants that are more skilled and qualified that them, are negative in nature and depict a picture in which a large number of employees in the JMPD perceive formal requirements as not being consistently required. In addition, writing, communication and decision-making form part of the daily tasks of police officers at all levels and therefore, it is also disturbing to notice situations in which a proportionate number of respondents are of the view that such requirements are not necessary to be appointed to either a sergeant or inspector position.

These general comments necessitate that certain actions are undertaken to resolve them. Measures need to be undertaken to ensure that employees are assured of a strict and consistent recruitment and selection procedure in which all the job requirements are taken into considerations. The perceptions of employees appearing as a ‘threat’, as a result of being more qualified and experienced than managers, needs to be resolved. As part of these measures, employees need to be ensured that the formal requirements that are listed in each advertisement form part of a selection criteria. Ensuring that the recruitment and selection processes are widely accepted as being fair, managers need to ensure that they are transparent as well. It also appeared that quite a number of respondents held negative perceptions whose source might not necessarily be about how the recruitment and selection processes are undertaken. In order to resolve this, counselling should also be arranged to clear these negative perceptions.

In order to curb the incidents in which managers may be threatened by applicants that are more qualified and experienced than them, measures to ensure that their confidence is boosted needs to be thought of. Short courses designed to complement their years of experience in the JMPD is one best alternative that may be explored. Despite focusing on the confidence of managers, there were also a proportionate number of respondents (54.94%) who mentioned that they will not feel comfortable reporting to a senior that is less qualified than them.

From these general comments, it appears that respondents value educational
qualifications as being the most important amongst the formal requirements. This could lead to a situation where police officers compete among themselves instead of concentrating on their roles in fighting crime. It is recommended that the JMPD starts conducting workshops where not only police officers but the entire staff are made aware of the importance of other forms of requirements specified in the TAP, e.g. writing, communication and decision-making skills.

Consistent with the need for police officers to have acquire a formal qualification, writing and communication skills, by nature of their duties, sergeants and inspectors are sometimes confronted by situations in which they have to make quick and appropriate decisions, especially on crime scenes. For this reason, the response in which a proportionate number of respondents (30.25%) indicated that decision-making is never a requirement to be appointed to a vacant position of sergeant or inspector is worrying. Lack of decision-making skills by sergeants and inspectors may lead to lives being endangered. Measures need to be undertaken to ensure that, not only decision-making skills, but all formal and recommended requirements for vacant positions of sergeants and inspectors are communicated and that consistency during the short-listing process is maintained. The condition in which respondents experience decision-making skills as being a formal requirement and others not, may paint a picture that the JMPD is not consistent. In view of this finding, it is recommended that managers in the JMPD introduce refresher courses that would create awareness of the changing roles of police officers in the JMPD and the impact such changes places on the skills required to successfully reduce crime.
LIST OF REFERENCES


Davids, I., Theron, F. Maphunye, K.J. 2005. *Participatory Development in South*


Administration, 43(3.1): 385-395.


ANNEXURES
ANNEXURE A: RESEARCH QUESTIONNAIRE

SECTION A: BIOGRAPHICAL DATA OF RESPONDENTS

Questions asked in this section (A) are for statistical data only and will not be utilised for any other reason. Please answer the questions below by marking an appropriate box with an “X”.

1. What is your gender?
   - Male
   - Female

2. What is your race?
   - Black
   - Coloured
   - Indian
   - White
   - Other

3. What is your designation?
   - Constable MPO
   - Sergeant
   - Inspector
   - Superintendent
   - Chief Superintendent
   - Deputy Director/Director

4. How long have you been employed in the JMPD?
   - Less than a year
   - 1-3 years
   - 3-5 years
   - 5-8 years
   - 10 years and more

5. In which department are you working?
   - Accident investigation
   - Communication
   - Lipco
   - Internal affairs
   - Academy
SECTION B: THE RECRUITMENT PROCESS

6. Please indicate the extent to which you agree with the statements below by marking the appropriate box with “X” where:
1= Not at all   2= to a certain extent   3= agree   4= strongly agree   5= Uncertain

a. The human resource department circularises and advertises all vacant positions in the JMPD.

b. The JMPD’s Talent Acquisition Policy provides guidelines for the recruitment process.

c. The Human Resource Management department adheres to the Talent Acquisition Policy.

d. Labour organisations participate in the recruitment process to ensure fairness and transparency.

e. All aspects of the recruitment process are transparent.

f. Recruitment and selection in the JMPD lead to the appointment of competent sergeants and inspectors.

SECTION C: THE SELECTION PROCESS

7. Please rate the following statements by marking an appropriate box with a “X”
1=Strongly disagree   2=disagree   3=strongly agree   4=agree   5= uncertain

a. The same recruitment panel is involved in selection.
b. Line management (superintendents and chief superintendents) sit in selection panel.

1 2 3 4 5

c. A formal policing qualification is prerequisite to be appointed sergeant or inspector.

1 2 3 4 5

d. Positions in the JMPD require security screening before appointment.

1 2 3 4 5

e. A fair and consistent screening criterion is followed during the selection process.

1 2 3 4 5

f. A fair and consistent shortlisting process has been developed and adhered to.

1 2 3 4 5

g. Selection is based on competency relevant to specific job position.

1 2 3 4 5

h. Candidates are selected based on skills and experience.

1 2 3 4 5

g. Formal qualifications take precedence over experience when selecting candidates.

1 2 3 4 5

SECTION D: GENERAL QUESTIONS

8. Please rate the following statement on a scale of 1 to 5 by marking the appropriate box with “X” where:
   1= always  2 = often  3= sometimes  4= seldom  5 = never

a. Recruiting and selecting experienced and skilled personnel would assist the JMPD in its quest to reduce high crime levels.

1 2 3 4 5

b. Recruitment commences without detailed job description.

1 2 3 4 5
c. Management would appoint skilled and highly qualified candidates than them as sergeants and inspectors.

   1 2 3 4 5

d. Would you be comfortable reporting to a senior less qualification than you?

   1 2 3 4 5

e. Written and communication skills are important for appointment as sergeant or inspector?

   1 2 3 4 5

f. To what extent is decision making skills required from candidates?

   1 2 3 4 5
ANNEXURE B: LETTER REQUESTING PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH